A. Introduction

1. The participants of the International Expert Meeting on Visual Integrity which took place from 6-9 March 2013 in Agra (India), appreciated the support of the government of the Indian authorities, in particular the Archaeological Survey of India and the State Government of Uttar Pradesh (Uttar Pradesh Tourism and Agra Municipal Corporation) for organizing and generously hosting this important event in association with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre.

2. The meeting was attended by 66 participants and experts from all regions of the world (from 20 countries), as well as by Representatives of IUCN, ICOMOS, ICCROM, the UNESCO World Heritage Centre and individual observers.

3. The meeting provided an opportunity for intense debates, based on documentation and case studies from different regions. The World Heritage Centre background document and the IUCN, ICCROM and ICOMOS statements have been included in the web-documentation of the Expert Meeting.

4. The meeting proceeded through plenary sessions and in-depth reflection through four thematic working groups:
   - Cities and urban context
   - Monuments and single buildings
   - Sites and archaeological sites
   - Cultural landscapes and natural sites

5. The meeting agreed on a series of conclusions and recommendations provided below.

B. Summary of key considerations from the meeting

6. The basis for management of World Heritage properties is the protection of their Outstanding Universal Value, which is agreed by the World Heritage Committee for each property inscribed on the World Heritage List and is specific to that property. The discussion focused on World Heritage properties which as such have acknowledged global iconic values (OUV) and a special relation to their local context.
7. Integrity and authenticity are qualifiers of Outstanding Universal Value, dealing respectively with wholeness and intactness of the site, and with the truth of the evidence for it.

8. The World Heritage properties with their defined boundaries embody intrinsic and extrinsic values related to cultural and/or natural context, geographical and/or historical influences and their visual outreach / view shed.

9. The conservation and protection of these properties in their integrity involves a diversity of stakeholders – community, institutional and professional, engaged in the management system.

10. The meeting recalled that the overall strategy for World Heritage protection should be long-term also within States Parties (country strategy)

11. The meeting took note of the proposed texts on integrity for cultural heritage prepared by the meeting in Al Ain (March, 1012) and encouraged that these should be shared more broadly for further reflection;

12. The meeting noted that the current OUGs have a well-defined general para on integrity, and specific paras on the integrity for natural heritage, whereas visual integrity is not specifically identified; however visual integrity is considered to be more an issue for the effective management at the site level;

C. Recommendations

The participants made the following recommendations to the World Heritage Committee, States Parties to the World Heritage Convention, the Advisory Bodies and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, as appropriate:

13. The meeting agreed that visual qualities are prevalent not only in the integrity of a property but also in its authenticity, protection and management and criteria. Therefore, it is better to refer to “visual impacts on the OUV of the property” instead of using the term impacts on Visual integrity.

14. In order to determine authenticity and/or integrity it is necessary to clearly define the criteria and values for which the property is being nominated and then define the attributes that carry those values. The qualities (including visual and others) of those attributes related to the values should then be clearly stated.

Nominations

15. Nomination Dossier should include:

a. Attributes contributing to the spatial and visual qualities as part of the properties’ intrinsic significance and OUV
b. Historically and culturally significant visual aspects, interconnectedness and influences contributing to the OUV of the property
c. Mechanisms for maintaining the integrity and authenticity of these as part of the management system for the property and its buffer zone
d. Measures to ensure that future developments will be compatible with the conservation of attributes and relationships supporting the property's OUV.

**Management and Tools**

16. States Parties are encouraged to explore ways to consider integrity and authenticity of visual qualities of the attributes and relationships in the management of existing World Heritage properties.

17. Protection of OUV should be ensured by carefully analysing impacts (positive or negative), while enhancing sustainable development and benefits for local communities; in this regard a holistic view is recommended in dealing with visual qualities and impacts.

18. The identification and the protection of key views, viewpoints, panoramas, and silhouettes should be included in management systems and nomination files, and should derive from the Outstanding Universal Value of each property.

19. Impact assessment is an important tool to avoid adverse visual impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value of each property. Assessment of the visual qualities of the property should be made at the time of nomination.

20. Tools for assessment of visual qualities and impact assessments should be integrated into spatial planning processes in order to assess development proposals, as far as possible within the legal system of each State Party, and to avoid negative visual impacts through damage to key views, viewpoints, panoramas, and silhouettes.

21. The meeting called on university networks to also engage in visual impact assessments; and World Heritage Centre to assist in sharing tools among different sites to identify best and efficient practice available.

22. Legibility of World Heritage Properties is important in order to improve public understanding of their Outstanding Universal Value, and this will influence the character of the site and the definition of its visual qualities.

**Communities**

23. A framework for stakeholder, including community consultation should be developed as part of the nomination and management processes for World Heritage properties to include considerations for visual quality related to a property's OUV.

**Guidance and Capacity Building**

24. Supplement existing manuals or prepare separate/supplementary guidance (to OGs) on different dimensions of integrity with examples on visual quality;
25. Request the WH Centre to create a separate web-page on integrity with links to best practice examples and tools used to assess and manage visual quality;

26. Build more capacity and awareness on visual qualities and impacts on them as a part of the overall World Heritage capacity building strategy, including through workshops and sharing of best practice;

Possible revisions to the text of the Operational Guidelines

27. The addition of the following footnote to the Operational Guidelines is recommended:

FOOTNOTE TO II.E – INTEGRITY AND AUTHENTICITY:
In order to determine authenticity and/or integrity it is necessary to clearly justify the criteria and values for which the property is being nominated and then identify the attributes that carry those values. The qualities (including visual and others) of those attributes related to the values should then be clearly stated. Limits or rules should then be included in the management system for the property to ensure the protection of the attributes of OUV, and monitoring should take place over time to ensure the protection. For more information on the application of the conditions of authenticity and integrity, see the relevant annexes to the Operational Guidelines and the resource manuals on nominations and management.

28. The meeting recommended addition of an Annex on Integrity and the revision of the existing Annex on Authenticity to take on board the concepts expressed in the above footnote.

29. The meeting recommended the replacement of the existing footnote to paragraph 89 with the footnote and annexes suggested above.
ANNEX I

International World Heritage Expert Meeting on Visual Integrity, Agra, UP, India
6 to 9 March 2013
Organised by: Archaeological Survey of India
Venue: Jaypee Hotel, Agra
Program

Wednesday, 6 March 2013
18.00-19.30 Opening Ceremony at Agra
   Inaugural Speech, Ministry of Culture, Govt of India
   Welcome on behalf of UNESCO by World Heritage Centre (WHC)
   Indian Perspective on Visual Integrity by Director General, ASI
   Cultural Programme and Dinner hosted by Uttar Pradesh, Tourism

Thursday, 7 March 2013
09.00-09.25 Registration of participants
09.25-9.35 Welcome by H E V S Oberoi, Personal Representative of India
09.35-11.15 Session 1: Introduction, Background and Results of previous works on Integrity
   Chair: Dr. Rössler, Deputy Director, World Heritage Centre
   Background to the meeting and introduction to the topic (Presented by Dr. Rössler)
   ICOMOS – Position Paper (Presented by Dr. Dinu Bumbaru)
   ICCROM – Position Paper (Presented by Mr. Joe King)
   IUCN – Position Paper by (Presented by Dr. V B Mathur)

11.15-11.30 Coffee Break
11.30-13.00 Session 02: Presentation of specific case studies from different regions and types of properties
   Individual monuments: (20 min)
   Cologne cathedral, Germany (Presented by Dr. Birgitta Ringbeck)
   Baroque churches of the Philippines (Presented by Rev. Fr. Alex Bautista)
   Mehmed Pasha Sokolović Bridge in Višegrad, Bosnia-Herzegovina (Presented by Mrs. Miljana Okilj)
   Sites: (20 min)
   Khmer World Heritage Sites: At the Crossroads of Conservation and Development, Cambodia (Presented by HE. Ambassador David Measketh)
   Cultural landscape and natural sites: (30min)
   Sacred Mijikenda Kaya Forests, Kenya (Presented by Ms. Linda Mboya)
   Wadi Al-Hitan, Whale Valley, Egypt (Presented by Mr. Md. Sameh Md. Antar)

13.00-14.30 Lunch Break
14.30-16.30 Session 03: Working Groups
   Working group A: City and Urban context
   Chair: H.E. Mrs. Sonia Sarmiento Gutierrez, Colombia
   Rapporteur: Mr King, ICCROM
   Additional Rapporteur: Dr. Shikha Jain, India
Working group B: Monuments and single buildings  
Chair: H. E. Flavio Mendez, Panama  
Rapporteur: Dr. Dina Bumbaru, ICOMOS  
Additional Rapporteur: Mr. Janhwij Sharma, India  

Working group C: Sites and archaeological sites  
Chair: H.E. Michael Worbs, Germany  
Rapporteur: Mr. Christopher Young  
Additional Rapporteur: Ms. Tara Sharma, India  

Working group D: Cultural landscapes and natural sites  
Chair: Mr. Rut Carek, Croatia  
Rapporteur: Dr. Mechthild Rossler  
Additional Rapporteur: Dr. V B Mathur, India  

16.30-17.00  
Coffee Break  

17.00-18.00  
Case studies from India  
Chair: Dr. B R Mani, Joint Director General, ASI  
Panel of Experts: Ms. Amita Baig [Taj], Prof. Vasawada [Ahmedabad on Tentative]  
Presenters: Mr. Janhwij Sharma, ASI and Dr. V B Mathur, WII  

19.00  
Dinner hosted by ASI  

Friday, 8 March 2013  
08.30-11.00  
Session 04: Continuation of the parallel working groups  

11.00-11.30  
Coffee break  

11.30-12.00  
Session 05: Continuation of the parallel working groups  

12.00-13.00  
Meeting of Rapporteurs for draft recommendations  
13.00-14.30  
Lunch Break  

14.30-18.30  
Draft Recommendations  

18.30-19.30  
Session 06: Closing session  
Speech by H. E. V S Oberoi, Permanent Representative of India to UNESCO  
Closing words by Dr. Mechthild Rossler, UNESCO  

20.00  
Dinner  

Saturday, 9 March 2013  
08.30-13.30  
Visit to Taj Mahal, Agra Fort and Visit to Fatehpur Sikri  
13.30-15.00  
Lunch at Fatehpur Sikri  
15.00  
Departure of Participants to Delhi
ANNEX II

Participants for the International World Heritage Experts Meeting on Visual Integrity
06th March- 09th March 2013

Ms. Nurwati ABDUL WAHAB, Malaysia
Department of National Heritage
(Ministry of Information Communication and Culture), Malaysia
Email: nurwati@heritage.gov.my

Rev. Fr. Alex BAUTISTA, Philippines
Group IV Nominated Expert
Consultant for Heritage Church Architecture for the Catholic Bishops’ Conference of the Philippines (CBCP), Philippines
Tel.: +639175761555;
Email: fr.alex2003@yahoo.com

Mr. Josko BELAMARIC, Croatia
Group II Nominated Observer
Head Institute of Art History – Cvito Fisković Center Kržiće 7 21 000 Split – Croatia Email: jbelamar@ipu.hr,
jbelamar@hotmail.com

Ms. Rut CAREK, Croatia
Head, Institute of Art History,
Email: Rut.Carek@min-kulture.hr

Ms. Adele CESI, Italy
Architect, Ministry of Cultural Heritage,
UNESCO World Heritage Bureau 27 Via del Collegio Romano Rome
Tel: +39 06 672 32234
Email: adele.lesi@beniculturali.it

Ms. Geneviève CHARROIS, Canada
Group I Nominated Observer
Cultural Expert, Canadian Delegation to the World Heritage Committee
Manager, Built Heritage Conservation Parks Canada 25 Eddy (25-5-P)
Gatineau Qc K1A OMS
Email: geneviève.charrois@pc.gc.ca

Ms. Elisa DE CABO DE LA VEGA, Spain
Group I Nominated Observer
Deputy Director for the Protection of Cultural Heritage
Tel: 0034 91 7017035
Email: elisa.decabo@med.es

Mr. Ion DE LA RIVA, Spain
Former Ambassador and Culture Expert
Email: i.delariva@find.org.in

Mr. Carlos FITZGERALD, Panama
Former Director of National Heritage Architecet
Manuel Trute, expert of the National Institute of Culture, Panama
Email: carlosfitzgerald@gmail.com

Mr. Paul GIACOBBI, France
Member of Parliament, Deputy Chairman of Foreign Affairs Commission, President of the Parliamentary friendship group France-India and expert on urban heritage Tel: +911242352779

Ms. Linda MBOYA, Kenya
Group Va Nominated Expert
Group V (a) - Kenya National Museums, Kenya
P.O. Box 78420-00500 Ngara Rd Nairobi, Kenya
Tel: (0)20 3742131
Email: danmik@museums.or.ke

H.E. David MEASKETH, Cambodia
Group IV Nominated Expert
Counsellor, Permanent Delegation of the Kingdom of Cambodia to UNESCO and Nodal Officer for the 37th session of the WHC to be held in Cambodia in June 2013 C/O Permanent Delegation of the Kingdom of Cambodia to UNESCO
Email: cambodia_unesco@yahoo.fr
measketh2@gmail.com
Mr. Mohammed SAMEH MOHAMMED ANTAR, Egypt
Group Vb Nominated Expert
Focal point for natural heritage, Director of the Department of Geology and Palaeontology, Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency
30 Misr Helwan Agricultural Road PO 11728, 7th floor, Maadi, Cairo, Egypt Email: wrpasahark@yahoo.com

Dr. Gabor SOOS, Hungary
Head of Division, Division of International Cooperation, Public Relations & World Heritage Affairs, National Office of Cultural Heritage, Budapest 1014 Tancsics u. 1 Tel: +36 303 779 594 Email: gabor.soos@koh.hu

H.E. Mr. Michael WORBS, Germany
Ambassador, Permanent Delegate of Germany 13-15 avenue Franklin Roosevelt 75008 Paris Tel: 01.53.83.46.63 Fax: 01.53.83.46.67
Email: info@unesco.diplo.de, dl.germany@unesco-delegations.org

H.E. Mr. Ali ZAINAL, Qatar
Ambassador, Permanent Delegate of Qatar 1, rue Miollis, 75732 Paris Cedex 15 Email: a.zainal.qa@unesco-delegations.org dl.india@unesco-delegations.org
Advisory Bodies of the World Heritage Convention

International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and the Restoration of Cultural Property (ICCROM)

Mr. Joseph KING, Italy
ICCROM, Rome Unit Director, Sites Unit
Tel: +39 06 585 53 313 Email: jk@iccrom.org

International Council of Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS)

Dr. Dinu BUMBARU, Canada
Foundation Heritage Montreal
100, rue Shebrooke Est- Bureau 0500
Montreal (Qc) CANADA H2X 1 C3
Mobile: + 1 514 581 34 68
Email: dbumbaru@gmail.com

International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN)

Dr. V.B. MATHUR (representing Prof. James Palmer for IUCN)
Dean, Wildlife Institute of India
Post Box No. 18, Chandrabani
Dehra Dun - 248 001
Tel: 91-135-640112 to 115
Fax: 91-135-640117
Email: wii@giisd01.vsnl.net.in

UNESCO World Heritage Centre

Dr. Mechtild ROSSLER, France
UNESCO World Heritage Centre,
Deputy Director (Programme)
Email: m.rossler@unesco.org
Host Country

H.E. Vinay Sheel OBEROI
Ambassador, Permanent Delegate of India
1, rue Miollis, 75732 Paris
Tel: (33-1) 45 68 29 88 I 87
Fax: (33-1) 47 34 51 88
Email: di.india@unesco.org

Ministry of Culture
Mr. Ravindra SINGH
Special Secretary (Culture)
318 C-Wing, Shastri Bhawan
Tel: 91-11-23388345,
Email: addisecy.culture@gmail.com

Indian Tourism Development Corporation
Mr. Niraj BACHKHETI
Vice President (Cons-HRD-SEL)
Tel: +91 11 24360343/26961844

Uttar Pradesh State Government
Mr. Manoj Kumar SINGH
Pr. Secretary (Land Reform and Water Resources)
C-13, Vinip Khand, Gomti Nagar,
Lucknow-226 010
Email: mks2973@yahoo.com

Mr. Ajay CHAUHAN
Vice Chairman, Agra Development Authority
Jaipur House, Agra
Tel: +91 0562 - 2811654

National Monument Authority
Prof. Himanshu Prabha RAY
Chairperson, National Monument Authority
National Monuments Authority
24, Tilak Marg,
New Delhi- 110001
Tel: +91 011-23380540
Email: chairperson.nma@gmail.com

Dr. Venu VASUDEVAN
Joint Secretary
332 C Wing Shastri Bhawan, New Delhi
Tel: 91-11-2338108,
Email: venuvasudevan1@gmail.com

Indian Tourism Development Corporation
Mr. Pradeep BHATNAGAR
Commissioner, Agra Div
Cantt., Agra
Mo: +91 9454417491

Mr. Sanjiv SARAN
Pr. Secretary (Tourism and Culture)
64, Taj Road, Agra-282001
Phone: +91-562-2226431/2233056
Fax: +91-562-2226431
Email: agrauptourism@gmail.com

INTACH
Mr. Navin PIPLANI
Principal Director, Centre for Conservation
Training & Capacity Building, INTACH
71, Lodi Estate, New Delhi 110 003
Ph: +91 11 24631818/2267/2269, 24692774,
24645482/1304,
Fax: +91 11 24611290
Email: intach@vsnl.net
ICOMOS, India
Ms. Tara SHARMA
Secretary
Email: tarasharma69@gmail.com

Dr. Rohit JIGYASU
President
(Interim Executive Com.)
Tel: +91 9818153839
Email: rohit.jigyasu@gmail.com

Expert on Nomination Dossier
Mr. A.R. RAMANATHAN
Consultant Architect
51, Nilgiri Apartment,
Alokananda
New Delhi-110019
Tel: +91 11 26341039, 26021998
Mo: +91 9810289203
Email: ar.ramanathan@gmail.com

CEPT, Ahmedabad
Prof. R. VASAVADA
Dean, Centre for Planning and Technology, Ahmedabad
Centre for Planning and Technology, Ahmedabad
120 Feet Ring Rd, University Area
Ahmedabad-380009, Gujarat
Tel: +91 079 2630 2452
Email: profrjvasavadac@cept.ac.in

Ministry of Urban Development
Shri. Ashok KHURANA
DG, CPWD
Tel: +91 011 23062556
Fax: +91 011 23061884

Sh. Vijay MOTWANI
ADG, CPWD
Tel: +91 011 23062284

Advisory Committee on World Heritage Matters [under the aegis of the Ministry of Culture, India]

Mr. Sujit BANERJEE
Chairman
Advisory Committee on World Heritage Matters
(under the aegis of the Ministry of Culture, India)
1st Floor, CSL, G Wing, Shastri Bhawan,
New Delhi 110001
Email: sujitbanerjee50@gmail.com

Ms. Amita BAIG
Member
Advisory Committee on World Heritage Matters
(under the aegis of the Ministry of Culture, India)
1st Floor, CSL, G Wing, Shastri Bhawan,
New Delhi 110001
Tel: +91 9810031820
Email: amitabaig@gmail.com

Dr. Shikha JAIN
Member Secretary
Advisory Committee on World Heritage Matters
(under the aegis of the Ministry of Culture, India)
1st Floor, CSL, G Wing, Shastri Bhawan,
New Delhi 110001
Tel: +91 9312876831
Email: ms.acwhm@gmail.com

Ms. Pakhee KUMAR
Heritage Management Professional
ACWHM Secretariat
1st Floor, CSL, G Wing, Shastri Bhawan,
New Delhi 110001
Email: pakhee.kumar@gmail.com
Archaeological Survey of India

Mr. Pravin SHRIVASTAVA
Director General
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel: +91 011 23013574, 23015954
Fax: +91 011 23019487
Email: directorgeneralasi@gmail.com

Dr. B.R. MANI
Addl. DG
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel/Fax: +91 011 23014821
Email: adg2.asi@gmail.com

Mr. Janhwi SHARMA
Director (Con/WH)
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel: +91 011 23013316
Email: whsection.asi@gmail.com

Mr. N. K. PATHAK
Superintendent Archaeologist, Agra
Tel: +91 0562 227261, 227262
Tel/Fax: +91 0562 227263
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Ms. Juthika PATANKAR
Addl. DG
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel: +91 011 23012058
Fax: +91 011 23014456
Email: adg1.asi@gmail.com

Mr. A.K. SINHA
Regional Director (North)
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel: +91 011 23018848
Email: rdnorth@gmail.com

Dr. Urmila SANT
Regional Director (East)
Archaeological Survey of India
Currency Building-I, B.B.D Bag
Kolkata-700001(W.B.)
Tel: +91 033-22622254
Email : rdeast.asi@gmail.com

Mr. Dillip Kumar KHAMARI
Superintendent Archaeologist, WH Section
Office of the Director General
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011
Tel: +91 011 23015283
Email: whsection.asi@gmail.com
Dr. Kanwar SINGH  
Asstt. Superintending Archaeologist, WH  
Section  
Office of the Director General  
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011  
Tel: +91 011 23015283  
Email: whssection.asi@gmail.com

Sh. P.S. SRIRAMAN  
Dy. Superintending Archaeologist, Agra  
Tel/Fax: +91 0562 2227261,2227262  
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Mr. P.L. MEENA  
Dy. Superintending Archaeologist, H.Q.  
Office of the Director General  
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011  
Tel: +91 011 23015283  
Email: whssection.asi@gmail.com

Ms. K.A. KABUI  
Asstt. Superintending Archaeologist, Agra  
Tel: +91 0562 2227261,2227262  
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Mrs S. MISRA  
Asstt. Archaeologist, Agra  
Tel: +91 0562 2227261,2227262  
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Sh. Arkhit PRADHAN  
Asstt. Archaeologist, Agra  
Tel: +91 0562 2227261,2227262  
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Sh. Munazzar ALI  
Conservation Asstt., Agra  
Tel: +91 0562 2227261,2227262  
Email: circleagr.asi@gmail.com

Ms. Radhika DHUMAL  
Consultant, ASI  
Office of the Director General  
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011  
Mo: +91 9899379770  
Email: architect.radhika@gmail.com

Ms. Tejaswani APHALE  
Consultant, ASI  
Office of the Director General  
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011  
Mo: +91 8447542260  
Email: tejas.aphale@gmail.com

Ms. Somi CHATTERJEE  
Consultant, ASI  
Office of the Director General  
Janpath, New Delhi - 110011  
Mo: +91 9818313519  
Email: ar_somichatterjee@yahoo.co.in