

UNESCO Expert Working Group
on the Preservation of Jam and Herat

ICCROM, Italy (Rome)

9-10 June 2008

RECOMMENDATIONS

Introductory Remarks:

The participants in the Second Expert Working Group note the importance of the participation of the Afghan Government representatives and congratulate UNESCO and the Afghan authorities for facilitating their presence at the current Working Group Meeting. The participants would also like to sincerely thank ICCROM for hosting the participants and providing all the necessary logistical support to realize a successful meeting.

Overall Issues:

The Participants of the Working Group;

1. Acknowledge efforts made by the Afghan authorities in recent years as well as the progress made by the international experts in their cooperation and technical assistance to the Afghan authorities for various sites in Herat and the World Heritage Site of Jam, and also thank the donor institutions and implementing agencies including UNESCO and the Agha Khan trust for Culture, and especially

- the Governments of Italy, Switzerland, Norway and others who have contributed to the implementation of the activities;
2. Recognize that all activities implemented at the Jam World Heritage site are to be officially approved by the Government of Afghanistan, in compliance with the World Heritage Convention;
 3. Encourage the Afghan authorities to continue inter-ministerial coordination as well as discussion and information-sharing between provincial and national authorities for the benefit of all tangible heritage in Afghanistan;
 4. Underline that the various ongoing projects in Herat are all inter-related and the need to ensure coordinated action among international experts, agencies and the relevant Afghan authorities at all levels;
 5. Underline the importance of the involvement of local people in any on-site activities, especially at the isolated site of Jam, in order to enhance employment and capacity development in the region;
 6. Recommend that documentation of all scientific activities undertaken on-site be made available to the Afghan authorities and UNESCO (Kabul office and WHC) for utilization in future activities; furthermore that selected important documentation be summarized and translated into Afghan languages;
 7. Thank all the donors that have contributed to conservation activities for the Jam site and for various sites in Herat and request UNESCO to make further efforts to raise and coordinate funds from existing and potential donors in order to continue the international technical cooperation for the activities prioritized by the Expert Working Group;

8. Acknowledge the proposed 2008/09 activities and programs by Afghan national institutions as well as the international experts. Certain proposed activities in either Herat or Ghor (Jam) could be subject to the prevailing security conditions and the approval/advice of designated security authorities;
9. Note that the recommended activities at the World Heritage property of Jam will be carried out compatibly with the available resources under the Italian and Swiss Funds-in-Trust to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, as well as under the budget of the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture (MoIC), and **in the order of priority assigned to them by the experts during the meeting. The most urgent activities should begin as soon as possible;**
10. Acknowledge the intention of the Afghan Government to pursue a nomination dossier for sites and areas yet to be determined in the city of Herat;

SITE OF JAM

I. River Defence Project

a) Monitoring of the hydrological situation of the site

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that monitoring of hydrometry, rainfall and snow fall, as well as gradient observations should be carried out regularly in order to gain precise information which would allow elaborating a risk-management proposal in the future, notably a system to forecast the potentially dangerous floods for the Minaret;

Underline that due to the difficulties (absence of energy supply, cost of the automatic instruments with solar supply, etc.) monitoring should be done through

the installation of a low tech system/cost-effective solution (simple instrument for hydrometric measurements with manual recording): that data should be collected regularly (daily or weekly) by hand by an expert from the MoIC/a technician who will be trained on the appropriate method. The few information obtained through this instrument could be increased once verified the presence of the other monitoring instruments in the basin area (Herat, Kabul, Bamiyan, and other) and, in the positive case, it would be desirable to acquire the available data so as to be able to define in the future a more detailed monitoring system. Furthermore a monitoring plan should be prepared by the hydrology engineer in order to start providing training on the basic monitoring to be carried out;

2. Note that high-tech systems through satellite telephone or with local data logger could be used in the future but are for the time being difficult to realize;

b) Completion of the emergency works carried out in winter 2007

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that a diaphragm be constructed under the retaining wall along the river(s) in order to prevent the erosion of the soil underneath the Minaret resulting from underwater currents. The typology of diaphragm (e.g. trench excavation or grouting the void between big blocks) and technical feasibility of this work (availability of equipment and safety concerns) must be investigated as soon as possible by a civil engineer from the Ministry of Public Works with the technical backstopping of Prof. Margottini (as necessary and required). This work should start as soon as possible, beginning with the smaller section downstream with respect to the monument and completed in manageable phases over the coming years; Furthermore, the works should always be carried out with the presence of archaeologists;

2. Consider that the 'river defence wall' could also be extended further up the Hari Rud in the future, pending archaeological monitoring/survey/excavation results;
3. Note that in case of deep erosion of the river defence wall, the stabilization of the river bed itself could be considered in the future;

II. Structure of the Minaret

a) Static and dynamic monitoring of the structure

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of the measurement as soon as possible of the Minaret's inclination to determine if any movement has taken place since 2006. This should be done by means of the EDM equipment provided through the project, under the supervision of an expert such as Mr. Tarcis Stevens. Additional measurements should be made through other methods/non-destructive installation, such as a pendulum and/or the GPS, to validate the results of the EDM equipment;

b) Geotechnical investigation and foundation investigation

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that a trench be excavated next to the Minaret to investigate the depth and conditions of the foundations, as well as of the soil. This should be dug on one of the sides of the Minaret with respect to the axis of inclination of the structure, under close archaeological supervision;
2. Endorse 6 geotechnical drillings to be carried out as a technique to investigate the nature and conditions of stress of the soils in the area adjacent to the Minaret - to

this aim, the potential interest of companies located in nearby countries (e.g. Iran) shall be explored;

3. Note that 4 more inclined drillings should be done to inspect the foundations. The latter work is to be performed under close supervision by an expert and is to be avoided if the monitoring of the Minaret has shown a progress of the leaning since 2006;
4. Recommend that in case monitoring of the Minaret indicates a progress in inclination since 2006, the situation should be reassessed as soon as possible by the Expert Group, (possibly through email consultation) in light of the information obtained through the above-mentioned inspection trench and geotechnical drillings;

c) Re-establishment of the wooden elements of the Minaret

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Endorse, under the condition of security, the re-installation of the wooden elements which existed in the structure of the Minaret, (e.g. to protect the steps), and which have been removed by looters;

d) Mechanical tests of the masonry

The participants of the Working Group;

2. Recommend further mechanical tests of the masonry conducted by means of flat-jacks (single and double) to find out the actual stress in the masonry and its constitutive relationship; these should be inserted at the level of the basement (where the stress is higher), on the internal side of the external wall which is under the most stress (i.e. towards the leaning of the Minaret). Another possibility

for testing the mechanical characteristics of the masonry would be on the facade which has not been restored, always at the basement level;

III - Documentation of the site

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Stress that priority should be given to a full documentation of the property inscribed on the WH list and its buffer zone, as well as on the Minaret;

a) Mapping

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Note the importance of proper mapping of the site and that the map available in the World Heritage nomination file should be improved by new and more precise topographic data, including the archaeological zones;

b) Assessment of the conservation situation of the Minaret

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of complete documentation of the site, as well as exact conservation assessment of the Minaret; a complete decay and damage assessment should therefore be undertaken by an architect as soon as possible for:
 - a. recording present different types and degrees of damages
 - b. monitoring ongoing processes of decay
 - c. documenting by an extended nomenclature as presented at this expert meeting
 - d. providing precise and complete working documents for future interventions

IV - General recommendations for the site of Jam

a) Site security

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the necessity of enhanced site protection by hiring more security guards trained on the preservation of historical sites to protect them against illicit excavations. In this regard, international cultural police institutions, such as for instance the Italian *Carabinieri per la tutela del patrimonio artistico*, could assist in the training activities for the Afghan police's activities aimed at the safeguarding of cultural properties in Jam and throughout the country;

b) On-the-job training and development of monitoring protocols

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Note that all activities implemented should provide an opportunity for 'on the job' training of technical staff from the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture, as well as workers from the Jam area. In addition to carrying out monitoring of the Minaret and training, the concerned international experts should also systematically develop protocols which would provide guidance to the Afghan team in charge of the property on the regular and long-term monitoring of the site. These protocols, part of the eventual Management Plan for the property requested by the World Heritage Committee, will identify the purpose of the monitoring, its methodology, the relevant indicators to be measured as well as the benchmark values of these measurements warranting specific remedial measures, which should also be described;
2. Recommend the development of a more comprehensive strategy for institutional capacity building in close cooperation with the Afghan authorities and institutions

such as ICCROM. This should be done as soon as possible using some of the resources available under the Italian FiT with UNESCO, by entrusting ICCROM to conduct a mission to Afghanistan and develop the Strategy in close consultation with the Afghan authorities, based on a preliminary assessment of their needs prepared by the MoIC in cooperation with the UNESCO Office in Kabul. The strategy will include detailed descriptions of specific capacity-building activities to be carried out, together with the corresponding budget estimates. These will be used by UNESCO and the Afghan MoIC to raise funds, possibly through a donor meeting. In drawing up the Capacity-Building Strategy, ICCROM will take into account the need to develop at first a basic institutional capacity within the MoIC so as to identify the core staff whom will receive, over the following years, more specific training on heritage management and conservation techniques.

3. Strongly endorse the participation of Afghan experts in international training courses as part of a long-term plan for institutional capacity building, such as those offered by ICCROM in Rome or in the Asia region (eg the Course being offered in Shanghai in collaboration with the World Heritage Institute for Training and Research for Asia and the Pacific, WHITR-AP).

SITE OF HERAT

I. General Issues

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Welcome and congratulate the Herat Governor on the declaration made during the meeting that the road through the Musallah complex had been closed with a view to its complete and definitive removal, and his further announcement that a national meeting in Herat would be scheduled for the near future so as to make

- concrete recommendations and to take necessary decisions and actions for the long-term preservation of the Old City and monuments of Herat;
2. Consider that this very important decision, together with the commitments made by the Governor in the Declaration he made at the Meeting as regard the strict and effective protection of the historic urban fabric of the Old City of Herat, shall provide a promising basis to develop a nomination for the inscription on the World Heritage List of a site to be identified in Herat.
 3. Request UNESCO to advise and assist on a possible World Heritage nomination dossier for the Old City and/or specific monuments of Herat. In this regard, the participants in the meeting encouraged the Afghan authorities to give consideration to the various options available to them for a World Heritage Nomination, ranging from a large sector of the historic city, encompassing monuments and residential/commercial buildings, to a reduced property concentrating on the complex of the Musallah and the Fifth Minaret;
 4. Acknowledge the necessity, in view of the current deteriorating situation of the historic character of the city, that international community assistance for preserving the Old City of Herat, including capacity building of national experts and public awareness raising activities, is crucial and should be actively pursued through existing UNESCO projects (Gawhar Shad and 5th Minaret) and further fundraising activities to be undertaken as soon as possible;

II. Musalla Complex and Gawhar Shad Mausoleum:

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of the permanent closure of the road through the Sultan Hussain Baiqara Madrasa as a positive step towards the re-integration of the

Gawhar Shad mausoleum within the Musalla Complex as a single, integrated site with a buffer zone;

2. Underline the importance of the permanent closure of the road as a measure to safeguard the archaeological remains of the Sultan Hussein Baiqara Madrasa;
3. Underline the importance of the road closure as a preventative conservation measure to protect the five standing Minarets (each with varying degrees of inclination) from the potentially damaging vibrations caused by heavy traffic in and around the area;
4. Stress the importance of the permanent closure and destruction of the road through the Sultan Hussein Baiqara Madrasa and in the vicinity of the Minarets and for an alternate route that protects the Minarets as a long-term solution to be designed and implemented by the Afghan authorities;
5. Recommend that the wall enclosing the area of the Minarets be reconstructed permanently so that the ban on traffic instituted by the Governor of Herat is respected and that both human and vehicular traffic is regulated in the area in order to protect the site;
6. Recommend that an expert be appointed by UNESCO to prepare a document for a long-term project, respecting the link between the Minarets and the Mausoleum, and taking therefore into account the whole archaeological area for the preservation of the site in a wider context, with a view to fund raising for its possible future implementation;
7. Request UNESCO to re-align specific activities within its ongoing project for the Gawhar Shad Mausoleum to take advantage of the permanent road closure and to support the Governor in his initiative to pursue reintegrating the site within a single Complex (this may mean re-establishing a boundary wall of the site,

extended archaeological survey or preparation of the project mentioned above, etc.);

8. Note the importance for the Gawhar Shad of conducting priority activities including re-roofing the cube to protect against water infiltration, cleaning of cupola and drum interior to eliminate redundant load on arches and vaults and to improve the documentation, scientific sampling of the cupola for a long-term intervention method, archaeological survey to establish the relationship between the mausoleum and the fifth minaret, replacing doors and windows and installing screens to enhance preservation, security and authenticity, cleaning of the interior to assess the conservation of stucco and mural-paintings, site interpretation/signage and awareness raising;
9. Underline the importance of including in all activities in the Gawhar Shad, Musalla Complex and in Herat in general of training and capacity building initiatives with the relevant Government Departments and Ministries;

III. Fifth Minaret:

1. Recommend the installation of anti-vandalism measures around the steel cables supporting the Minaret to reduce the risk of collapse from human interference;
2. Recommend that the hole in the structure of the Minaret be repaired;
3. Recommend the development of a project that addresses a long-term solution for the inclination of the Minaret, preceded by geotechnical and foundation investigations to verify potential aspects leading to the leaning of the structure;
4. Recommend the full documentation of the minaret, more specifically its architectural elements and decorations, in addition to the basically structural documentation achieved yet.

Enclosed:

Annex I: Agenda and participants list

Annex II: Ambassador Aziz's speech

Annex III: ICCROM's website page on the event

Annex IV: Picture of the participants from ICCROM's website page on the event