

Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex

1. World Heritage Property Data

1.1 - Name of World Heritage property


Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex

1.2 - World Heritage property details

1.3 - Geographic information table

Name	Coordinates	Property (ha)	Buffer zone (ha)	Total (ha)	Inscription year
Area 1	54.979 / 49.056	?	?	0	2014
Area 2	54.967 / 49.059	?	?	0	2014
Total (ha)			0		

1.4 - Map(s)

Title	Date	Link to source
Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex - map of inscribed property	2014	

1.5 - Web and Social Media data of the property (if applicable)

Comment

The web-site of the World Heritage property: <https://vbolgar.ru>

2. Other Conventions/Programmes under which the World Heritage property is protected (if applicable)

2.1 - Records indicate that your World Heritage property (in whole or in part) is designated and/or protected under the Conventions/programmes shown in the prefilled table below. Please check and amend as necessary.

		The World Heritage property (in whole or in part) <u>is</u> designated and/or protected under this convention/programme	The World Heritage property (in whole or in part) <u>is not</u> designated and/or protected under this convention/programme
2.1.1	International Register of Cultural Property under Special Protection (1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict)		×
2.1.2	List of Cultural Property under Enhanced Protection (Second Protocol to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict)		×
2.1.3	The List of Wetlands of International Importance (The Ramsar List) (Convention on Wetlands of International Importance (Ramsar Convention))		×
2.1.4	World Network of Biosphere Reserves Man and the Biosphere (MAB) Programme		×
2.1.5	Global Geoparks Network UNESCO Global Geoparks		×

2.2 - Please provide comments on 2.1 if necessary

2.3 - Do your national authorities intend to request the granting of Enhanced Protection (if relevant) under the Second Protocol to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict for the World Heritage property in the next three years?

Not applicable

2.4 - Do your national authorities intend to designate whole or part of the World Heritage property for inclusion in the List of Wetlands of International Importance (The Ramsar List), if relevant, in the next three years?

Not applicable

2.5 - Do your national authorities intend to designate whole or part of the World Heritage property as a Man and Biosphere Reserve (if relevant) in the next three years?

Not applicable

2.6 - Do your national authorities intend to apply for whole or part of World Heritage property to be designated as a UNESCO Global Geopark (if relevant) in the next three years?

Not applicable

2.7 - Please indicate the level of cooperation at property level between designations under different Conventions/Programmes

2.7.1	1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict	
2.7.1	There is no contact with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	✕
2.7.2	The World Heritage Site Manager occasionally communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	The World Heritage Site Manager regularly communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	The World Heritage Site Manager also manages this designation/programme.	
2.7.2	Second Protocol to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict	
2.7.1	There is no contact with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	✕
2.7.2	The World Heritage Site Manager occasionally communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	The World Heritage Site Manager regularly communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	The World Heritage Site Manager also manages this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	Convention on Wetlands of International Importance (Ramsar Convention)	
2.7.1	There is no contact with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	✕
2.7.2	The World Heritage Site Manager occasionally communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	The World Heritage Site Manager regularly communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	The World Heritage Site Manager also manages this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	Man and the Biosphere (MAB) Programme	
2.7.1	There is no contact with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	✕
2.7.2	The World Heritage Site Manager occasionally communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	The World Heritage Site Manager regularly communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	The World Heritage Site Manager also manages this designation/programme.	
2.7.5	UNESCO Global Geoparks	
2.7.1	There is no contact with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	✕
2.7.2	The World Heritage Site Manager occasionally communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.3	The World Heritage Site Manager regularly communicates with the Focal Point(s) of this designation/programme.	
2.7.4	The World Heritage Site Manager also manages this designation/programme.	

2.8 - Please add any further comments on cooperation with the other designation(s)/programme(s)

2.9 - Are you aware of any elements associated with the World Heritage property that have been inscribed on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage?

No

2.10 - Please list any elements associated with the World Heritage property inscribed under the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of which you are aware

2.11 - Are you aware of any documentary heritage listed under the Memory of the World Programme associated with the World Heritage property?

No

2.12 - Please list any documentary heritage associated with the World Heritage property listed under the Memory of the World Programme of which you are aware.

3. Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

3.1 - Statement of Outstanding Universal Value for the property as adopted by the World Heritage Committee

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

Brief synthesis

The historical and archaeological site of Bolgar lies on the shores of the Volga River south of its confluence with the River Kama. It contains evidence of the medieval city of Bolgar, an early settlement of the civilization of Volga Bulgars, which existed between the 7th and the 15th centuries. Bolgar was also the first capital of the Golden Horde in the 13th century and remained an important trade centre in the time of the Kazan Khanate. The site preserves its spatial context with its historic moat and walls as well as its religious and civil structures, including a former mosque, a minaret and several mausoleums, bath houses, remains of a Khan's palace and shrine.

Bolgar represents the historical cultural exchanges and transformations of Eurasia over several centuries, which played a pivotal role in the formation of civilizations, customs and cultural traditions. The Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex provides remarkable evidence of historic continuity and cultural diversity, the mutual influences of cultural traditions in particular at the time of the Volga Bulgars, the Golden Horde, the Kazan Khanate and the Russian state. Also, Bolgar was always located at the crossroads of trade, and economic, cultural and political communications and illustrates the interaction of nomadic and urban cultures. The historical and archaeological complex of Bolgar is a symbolic reminder of the acceptance of Islam by the Volga-Bulgars in 922 AD and, to Tatar Muslims, remains sacred and a pilgrimage destination.

Criterion (ii): The historical and archaeological complex of Bolgar illustrates the exchange and re-integration of several subsequent cultural traditions and rulers and reflects these in influences on architecture, city-planning and landscape design. The property illustrates the cultural exchanges of Turkic, Finno-Ugric, Slavic and other traditions. Evidence of exchanges in architectural styles includes wooden constructions which emerged in the forest-rich region, the steppe component of Turkic language tribes, oriental influences connected with the adoption of Islam and European-Russian styles which dominated after it became part of the Russian state.

Criterion (vi): Bolgar remains a regional reference point for Tatar Muslims and likely other Muslim groups of the wider region in Eurasia. It carries associated religious and spiritual values which are illustrated predominantly during the annual pilgrimage season. Bolgar provides evidence of an early and northernmost Muslim enclave established in connection with the official acceptance of Islam by the Volga Bulgars as the state religion in 922 AD, which had a lasting impact on the cultural and architectural development of the wider geographical region.

Integrity

The historical and archaeological complex of Bolgar contains the complete area of layers of historic occupation by various consecutive civilizations on the upper plateau of the site and the outer ramparts of the city. It also integrates early parts of a Volga Bolgar settlement located in the northern lower level of the site and on the closest Volga island. The potential of large sectors of archaeological resources remains unknown so that the site retains strong potential for archaeological research

The integrity of the property has suffered adverse effects from development over the past 3 centuries and the State Party has committed to improving the situation by removing a tent village set up for pilgrims during the annual pilgrimage season from the centre of the property. Although it appears that the construction of new infrastructure on the site has reached its completion, more sensitive planning is needed in the case of any future interventions or visitor interpretation and prior Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA's) are absolutely necessary before any interventions can be approved by the World Heritage Centre in consultation with the Advisory Bodies.

Authenticity

The number of architectural and other interventions on site is substantial and has affected the authenticity of the overall complex and, in one instance, reduced the archaeological evidence providing testimony to the Volga Bolgar civilization. These also include past conservation activities at the property which included reconstructions and partial rebuilding works. In other places, restoration measures conducted were extensive, sometimes without clear justification and have reduced authenticity in material, substance, craftsmanship and setting.

On the other hand, the property's ramparts and moat remain fully authentic, as well as the large-scale archaeological areas yet to be researched and surveyed. In addition, the religious reference function of Bolgar to Tatar Muslims retains a high level of authenticity, in particular with regard to the location, spirit and feeling which have not been affected by the recent addition of religious structures, built in support of the religious values. Tatar Muslims continue to venerate Bolgar as the origin of Islam in this region, and conduct annual pilgrimages to the historical and archaeological complex.

Protection and management requirements

The monuments and archaeological remains within the property, including the so-called "Cathedral Mosque", Black Chamber, North and East Mausoleums, the Khan's Shrine, the Smaller Minaret and the Church of the Dormition, are registered as cultural heritage of national significance under the Federal Law on Properties of Cultural Heritage (Monuments of History and Culture) of Peoples of the Russian Federation (2002). In addition, the complete Bolgar State Historical and Architectural Cultural Preserve was placed on the List of Properties of Historic Importance based on the Edict of the President of the Russian Federation on the Confirmation of the Federal (all-Russia) Historical and Cultural Heritage List (1995). In 2013, the State Party adjusted the General Plan and Scheme of Bolgar Territorial Planning, which now stipulates that any significant changes in the buffer zone must get the permission of federal, regional and municipal executive bodies. It seems further understood that developments on site are only to be permitted in exceptional circumstances after approval from the UNESCO World Heritage Centre in consultation with the Advisory Bodies.

The Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex has its own management authority (site administration), which employs several academic heritage specialists in their respective fields. The administration is divided into four key sections dedicated to exhibitions and presentation, museum collections, research and public outreach as well as maintenance and security. The site administration reports via the Head Office for Conservation, Use, Promotion and Public Protection of Cultural Heritage to the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Tatarstan. The funding available to the administration is generous and should preferably be utilized for non-intrusive research and adequate conservation and consolidation measures, rather than the creation of constructions which might not respect the conditions of integrity and authenticity of the property.

At the time of submission of the revised nomination dossier for this property, primary directions for a management plan were established and a number of focus areas have been identified including the coordination and administration of the property, as well as the continued study, conservation and management of archaeological sites and materials. These directions indicated that future research would focus on important questions about the site's development and peculiarities of its formation and be based on non-destructive methods including technologies and methods used in natural sciences, aerial mapping and processing of space satellite information. The management plan needs to be finalized and be kept up-to-date to ensure the best possible management practices for the property.

3.2 - Please list the key attributes of Outstanding Universal Value of your property and give an assessment of their condition. As a guideline, it is suggested to focus on approximately five key attributes (no more than 15 overall).

	Brief identification of attribute	Preserved	Compromised	Seriously compromised	Lost
3.2.1	Archaeological remains of settlements	✗			
3.2.2	Unexcavated archaeological remains	✗			
3.2.3	Potential underwater remains	✗			
3.2.4	Historic stone and brick buildings	✗			

3.2.5	Ramparts and Moats	✕			
3.2.6					
3.2.7					
3.2.8					
3.2.9					
3.2.10					
3.2.11					
3.2.12					
3.2.13					
3.2.14					
3.2.15					

3.3 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

4. Factors Affecting the Property

4.1. Buildings and Development

4.1.1 - Housing

Relevant	✕ Not relevant
----------	----------------

4.1.2 - Commercial development

Relevant	✕ Not relevant
----------	----------------

4.1.3 - Industrial areas

Relevant	✕ Not relevant
----------	----------------

4.1.4 - Major visitor accommodation and associated infrastructure

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	🔥 Current	🔥 Potential	📍 Inside	📍 Outside	↘ Decreasing	→ Stable	↗ Increasing
🟢 Positive							
🔴 Negative ✕		✕		✕	↘		

4.1.5 - Interpretative and visitation facilities

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	🔥 Current	🔥 Potential	📍 Inside	📍 Outside	↘ Decreasing	→ Stable	↗ Increasing
🟢 Positive ✕	✕		✕		↘		
🔴 Negative							

4.1.6 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.1 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.2. Transportation Infrastructure

4.2.1 - Ground transport infrastructure

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	🔥 Current	🔥 Potential	📍 Inside	📍 Outside	↘ Decreasing	→ Stable	↗ Increasing
🟢 Positive ✕	✕		✕	✕		→	
🔴 Negative							

4.2.2 - Underground transport infrastructure

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.2.3 - Air transport infrastructure

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.2.4 - Marine transport infrastructure

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.2.5 - Effects arising from use of transportation infrastructure

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.2.6 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.2 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.3. Services Infrastructures

4.3.1 - Water infrastructure

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.3.2 - Renewable energy facilities

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.3.3 - Non-renewable energy facilities

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.3.4 - Localised utilities

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.3.5 - Major linear utilities

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant	<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
--	---------------------------------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.3.6 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.3 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.4. Pollution

4.4.1 - Pollution of marine waters

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.2 - Ground water pollution

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.3 - Surface water pollution

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.4 - Air pollution

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.5 - Solid waste

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.6 - Input of excess energy

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.4.7 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.4 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.5. Biological resource use/modification

4.5.1 - Fishing/collecting aquatic resources

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.2 - Aquaculture

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.3 - Land conversion

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.4 - Livestock farming/Grazing of domesticated animals

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.5 - Crop production

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.6 - Commercial wild plant collection

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.7 - Subsistence wild plant collection

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.8 - Commercial hunting

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.9 - Subsistence hunting

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.10 - Forestry/Wood production

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.5.11 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.5 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.6. Physical resource extraction

4.6.1 - Mining

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.6.2 - Quarrying

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.6.3 - Oil and gas

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.6.4 - Water (extraction)

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.6.5 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.6 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.7. Local conditions affecting physical fabric

4.7.1 - Wind

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant	<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
--	---------------------------------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing

Positive							
Negative							

4.7.2 - Relative humidity

Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative							

4.7.3 - Temperature

Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative							

4.7.4 - Radiation/Light

Relevant	Not relevant
----------	--------------

4.7.5 - Dust

Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative							

4.7.6 - Water (rain/water table)

Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative							

4.7.7 - Pests

Relevant	Not relevant
----------	--------------

4.7.8 - Micro-organisms

Relevant	Not relevant
----------	--------------

4.7.9 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.7 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.8. Social/Cultural uses of heritage

4.8.1 - Ritual/Spiritual/Religious and associative uses

Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	Current	Potential	Inside	Outside	Decreasing	Stable	Increasing
Positive							
Negative							

4.8.2 - Society's valuing of heritage

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			
 Negative							

4.8.3 - Indigenous hunting, gathering and collecting

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.8.4 - Changes in traditional ways of life and knowledge system

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.8.5 - Identity, social cohesion, changes in local population and community

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--




4.8.6 - Impacts of tourism/Visitation/Recreation

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			
 Negative							

4.8.7 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.8 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.9. Other human activities

4.9.1 - Illegal activities

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.9.2 - Deliberate destruction of heritage

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			<input type="checkbox"/> Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.9.3 - Military training

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.9.4 - War

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.9.5 - Terrorism

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--







4.9.6 - Civil unrest

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--









4.9.7 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.9 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.10. Climate change and severe weather events

4.10.1 - Storms

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.10.2 - Flooding

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.10.3 - Drought

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--


4.10.4 - Desertification

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.10.5 - Changes to oceanic waters

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.10.6 - Temperature change

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

4.10.7 - Other climate change impacts

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.10.8 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.10 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.11. Sudden ecological or geological events

4.11.1 - Volcanic eruption

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.11.2 - Earthquake















Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.11.3 - Tsunami/Tidal wave

Relevant	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Not relevant
----------	--

4.11.4 - Avalanche/Landslide


<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Relevant			Not relevant				
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		

Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative 							

4.11.5 - Erosion and siltation/Deposition

 Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative 							

4.11.6 - Fire (wildfire)

 Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive							
 Negative 							

4.11.7 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.11 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.12. Invasive/alien species or hyper-abundant species

4.12.1 - Translocated species

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.2 - Invasive/Alien terrestrial species

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.3 - Invasive/Alien freshwater species

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.4 - Invasive/Alien marine species

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.5 - Hyper-abundant species

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.6 - Modified genetic material

Relevant	 Not relevant
----------	--

4.12.7 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.12 are affecting the property either negatively or positively










4.13. Management and institutional factors

4.13.1 - Management system/Management plan

 Relevant				Not relevant			
	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive 							
 Negative							










4.13.2 - Legal framework

 Relevant				Not relevant			
--	--	--	--	--------------	--	--	--

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕	✕	✕	✕		→	
 Negative							










4.13.3 - Governance

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕	✕	✕	✕		→	
 Negative							










4.13.4 - Management activities

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕	✕	✕			→	
 Negative							










4.13.5 - Financial resources

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕	✕	✕	✕		→	
 Negative							










4.13.6 - Human resources

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕	✕	✕	✕		→	
 Negative							










4.13.7 - Low impact research/monitoring activities

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕		✕			→	
 Negative							

4.13.8 - High impact research/monitoring activities

✕ Relevant	Not relevant
------------	--------------

	Impact		Origin		Trend of impact		
Impact	 Current	 Potential	 Inside	 Outside	 Decreasing	 Stable	 Increasing
 Positive ✕	✕		✕	✕		→	
 Negative							

4.13.9 - Please comment as necessary on how the factors selected as relevant in 4.13 are affecting the property either negatively or positively

4.14. Other factor(s)

4.14.1 - Other factor(s)

4.15. Factors Summary Table

4.15.1 - Factors Summary Table

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.1 Buildings and Development						
4.1.4 Major visitor accommodation and associated infrastructure						
	⊖	🚩	🚩	🔄	🔄	➡
4.1.5 Interpretative and visitation facilities	⊕	🚩		🔄		➡
4.2 Transportation Infrastructure						
4.2.1 Ground transport infrastructure	⊕	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.3 Services Infrastructures						
4.3.5 Major linear utilities						
	⊖		🚩	🔄	🔄	➡
4.7 Local conditions affecting physical fabric						
4.7.1 Wind						
	⊖	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.7.2 Relative humidity						
	⊖	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.7.3 Temperature						
	⊖	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.7.5 Dust						
	⊖	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.7.6 Water (rain/water table)						
	⊖	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.8 Social/Cultural uses of heritage						
4.8.1 Ritual/Spiritual/Religious and associative uses	⊕	🚩		🔄		➡
4.8.2 Society's valuing of heritage	⊕	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.8.6 Impacts of tourism/Visitation/Recreation	⊕	🚩		🔄	🔄	➡
4.9 Other human activities						
4.9.1 Illegal activities						
	⊖		🚩	🔄	🔄	➡
4.9.2 Deliberate destruction of heritage						
	⊖		🚩	🔄	🔄	➡
4.10 Climate change and severe weather events						

4.10.1 Storms						
4.10.2 Flooding						
4.10.6 Temperature change						
4.11 Sudden ecological or geological events						
4.11.4 Avalanche/Landslide						
4.11.5 Erosion and siltation/Deposition						
4.11.6 Fire (wildfire)						
4.13 Management and institutional factors						
4.13.1 Management system/Management plan						
4.13.2 Legal framework						
4.13.3 Governance						
4.13.4 Management activities						
4.13.5 Financial resources						
4.13.6 Human resources						
4.13.7 Low impact research/monitoring activities						
4.13.8 High impact research/monitoring activities						
Legend Current Potential Negative Positive Inside Outside						




4.16. Assessment of current and potential positive and negative factors

4.16.1 - Assessment of current and potential negative and positive factors

4.1 Buildings and Development

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.1.4 Major visitor accommodation and associated infrastructure			
Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor			
	Restricted		
	Localised		
	Extensive		






	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
✕	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
✕	Decreasing
	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.1.5 Interpretative and visitation facilities						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
✕	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity

	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
✕	Decreasing
	Static
	Increasing

4.2 Transportation Infrastructure

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.2.1 Ground transport infrastructure	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
✕	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread






Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
✕	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major

Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources

Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
✕	Decreasing
	Static
	Increasing






4.3 Services Infrastructures

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.3.5 Major linear utilities	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
--	--





✕	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
✕	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
✕	Decreasing
	Static
	Increasing

4.7 Local conditions affecting physical fabric

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.7.1 Wind			
	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant

	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing





Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.7.2 Relative humidity			
	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread






Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major

Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing




Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.7.3 Temperature			
	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.7.5 Dust						
						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant

	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.7.6 Water (rain/water table)			
			



Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread

Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
✕	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going


Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major

Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

4.8 Social/Cultural uses of heritage






Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.8.1 Ritual/Spiritual/Religious and associative uses			

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor							
	Restricted						
	Localised						
	Extensive						
X	Widespread						
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact							
	One off or rare						
	Intermittent or sporadic						
	Frequent						
X	On-going						
Impact - Impact on the attributes							
	Insignificant						
	Minor						
	Significant						
X	Major						
Management response - Capacity of management to respond							
X	High capacity						
	Medium capacity						
	Low capacity						
	No capacity and / or resources						
Trend - Development over the last 6 years							
	Decreasing						
X	Static						
	Increasing						

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.8.2 Society's valuing of heritage						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor							
	Restricted						
	Localised						
	Extensive						
X	Widespread						
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact							
	One off or rare						
	Intermittent or sporadic						
	Frequent						
X	On-going						
Impact - Impact on the attributes							
	Insignificant						
	Minor						

	Significant
✕	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.8.6 Impacts of tourism/Visitation/Recreation	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
	Static
✕	Increasing

4.9 Other human activities

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
------	--------	--------	-------

4.9.1 Illegal activities							






Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Restricted
<input type="checkbox"/>	Localised
<input type="checkbox"/>	Extensive
<input type="checkbox"/>	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	One off or rare
<input type="checkbox"/>	Intermittent or sporadic
<input type="checkbox"/>	Frequent
<input type="checkbox"/>	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Insignificant
<input type="checkbox"/>	Minor
<input type="checkbox"/>	Significant
<input type="checkbox"/>	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	High capacity
<input type="checkbox"/>	Medium capacity
<input type="checkbox"/>	Low capacity
<input type="checkbox"/>	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
<input type="checkbox"/>	Decreasing
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Static
<input type="checkbox"/>	Increasing

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.9.2 Deliberate destruction of heritage						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Restricted
<input type="checkbox"/>	Localised
<input type="checkbox"/>	Extensive
<input type="checkbox"/>	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	One off or rare
<input type="checkbox"/>	Intermittent or sporadic
<input type="checkbox"/>	Frequent
<input type="checkbox"/>	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Insignificant

	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

4.10 Climate change and severe weather events

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.10.1 Storms			
	 	 	





Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
✕	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name		Impact			Origin		Trend
4.10.2 Flooding							
Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor							
	Restricted						
	Localised						
	Extensive						
	Widespread						
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact							
	One off or rare						
	Intermittent or sporadic						
	Frequent						
	On-going						
Impact - Impact on the attributes							
	Insignificant						
	Minor						
	Significant						
	Major						
Management response - Capacity of management to respond							
	High capacity						
	Medium capacity						
	Low capacity						
	No capacity and / or resources						
Trend - Development over the last 6 years							
	Decreasing						
	Static						
	Increasing						




Name		Impact			Origin		Trend
4.10.6 Temperature change							
Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor							
	Restricted						
	Localised						
	Extensive						
	Widespread						
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact							
	One off or rare						
	Intermittent or sporadic						
	Frequent						
	On-going						
Impact - Impact on the attributes							

✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing



4.11 Sudden ecological or geological events

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.11.4 Avalanche/Landslide						
						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
✕	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.11.5 Erosion and siltation/Deposition			
			





Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
✕	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.11.6 Fire (wildfire)			
			

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
✕	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
✕	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
	On-going







Impact - Impact on the attributes	
✕	Insignificant
	Minor
	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

4.13 Management and institutional factors

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.13.1 Management system/Management plan						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static

	Increasing
--	------------

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.2 Legal framework	  	 	







Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread

Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major

Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources

Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.3 Governance	  	 	







Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread

Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.4 Management activities	<div> <div>+</div> <div>🚧</div> <div>🚧</div> </div>	<div> <div>🏠</div> </div>	<div> <div>➡</div> </div>

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.5 Financial resources	  	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor

	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread

Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact

	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes





	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major

Management response - Capacity of management to respond

✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources

Trend - Development over the last 6 years

	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.6 Human resources	  	 	





Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor

	Restricted
	Localised
	Extensive
✕	Widespread






Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact

	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
	Frequent
✕	On-going

Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact			Origin		Trend
4.13.7 Low impact research/monitoring activities						

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
✕	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

Name	Impact	Origin	Trend
4.13.8 High impact research/monitoring activities	 	 	

Spatial scale - Area affected by the factor	
	Restricted
✕	Localised
	Extensive
	Widespread
Temporal scale - Occurrence of the impact	
	One off or rare
	Intermittent or sporadic
✕	Frequent
	On-going
Impact - Impact on the attributes	
	Insignificant
	Minor
✕	Significant
	Major
Management response - Capacity of management to respond	
✕	High capacity
	Medium capacity
	Low capacity
	No capacity and / or resources
Trend - Development over the last 6 years	
	Decreasing
✕	Static
	Increasing

4.17. Serial inscriptions (national or transnational)

4.17.1 - If your property is a serial inscription (national or transnational) please identify which components of the property are impacted by each factor

4.18. Prediction of the state of conservation at next cycle of Periodic Reporting.

4.18.1 - Please predict what the state of conservation of each attribute will be approximately 6 years from now (at the time of the next cycle of Periodic Reporting)

	Attribute	Preserved	Compromised	Seriously compromised	Lost
4.18.1.1	Archaeological remains of settlements	✕			
4.18.1.2	Unexcavated archaeological remains	✕			
4.18.1.3	Potential underwater remains	✕			
4.18.1.4	Historic stone and brick buildings	✕			
4.18.1.5	Ramparts and Moats	✕			

5. Protection and Management of the Property

5.1. Boundaries and Buffer Zones

5.1.1 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The boundaries are **adequate to maintain** the property's Outstanding Universal Value

5.1.2 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property known and recognised?

The boundaries **are known by both** the management authority and local communities/landowners

5.1.3 - Are the buffer zone(s) of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The buffer zones are **adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

5.1.4 - Are the boundaries of the buffer zones known and recognised?

The buffer zones of the World Heritage property **are known and recognised** by the management authority **but are not known** by local communities/landowners

5.1.5 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to boundaries and buffer zones of the World Heritage property

5.2. Protective Measures

5.2.1 - Protective designation (legal, regulatory, contractual, planning, institutional and/or traditional).

Comment

5.2.2 - Please list any legislation and other measures (regulatory -including spatial planning- contractual, institutional or traditional) not included in 5.2.1 and indicate the category

2002 / Federal Law on Cultural Heritage Properties of the Peoples of the Russian Federation from 25.06.2002 No.73-FZ / + /

2005 / Law of the Republic of Tatarstan on Cultural Heritage Properties in the Republic of Tatarstan from 1.04.2005 No.60-ZRT / + /

1960 / Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic (RSFSR) on Further Improvement of Protection of Monuments in the RSFSR from 30.08.1960 No.1327 / + /

1969 / Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Tatar Autonomous Soviet Socialist Republic (TASSR) on the Establishment of Bolgar Historical and Architectural Reserve from 14.04.1969 No.222 / + /

2014 / Decree of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan on Establishing Boundaries of the Territory of the Bolgar Settlement - the Capital of Bulgarian State Cultural Heritage Property of Federal Importance from 20.06.2014 No.429 / + /

5.2.3 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and/or regulation including spatial planning) adequate for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and/or Authenticity of the property?

The **legal framework** for maintaining of the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and/or Integrity of the World Heritage property provides an **adequate basis for effective management and protection**

5.2.4 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and/or regulation) adequate in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and/or Authenticity of the property?

An **adequate legal framework** in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and/or Integrity of the World Heritage property exists **but there are some deficiencies in implementation**

5.2.5 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and/or regulation) in the broader setting of the World Heritage property adequate for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and/or Authenticity of the property?

There is **no legal framework** for controlling use and activities in the broader setting of the World Heritage property

5.2.6 - Can the legal framework (i.e. legislation and/or regulation) be enforced?

There is **adequate capacity/resources** to enforce legislation and/or regulation in the World Heritage property

5.2.7 - Please provide a short summary of how the legislation, including spatial planning and other regulation, works in practice

The protection of property is carried out in accordance with the Federal Law No. 73-FZ at federal level and the Law of the Republic of Tatarstan No. 60-ZRT at regional level. The Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the Tatar ASSR No. 222 established the managing organization of the World Heritage site, Bolgar State Museum-Reserve. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan No. 429 defined the boundaries and land-use regimes for the territory of the property.

5.2.8 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations about the information related to the measures taken to protect the World Heritage property

5.3. Management System/Management Plan

5.3.1 - Please check the box which most closely match the character of the governance and management system of the property

Public management system joint regional/local

If 'Other', please specify

5.3.2 - Management System: Please indicate which of the various management tools listed below are used to help protect the property.

A statutory Management Plan or zoning plan for the property.

Governance mechanisms that foster and respect traditional practices, knowledge and uses of the property
Mechanisms to promote equal participation among and within groups, including different levels of authority, local communities, indigenous people, women and men, and other specific groups
A framework for inclusive economic development, including equal access and distribution of resources and opportunities arising from the protection of the property
A management plan
An annual work plan or business plan

5.3.3 - Please give a brief description of the management system currently in place at your property

The managing organization of the property is Bolgar State Museum-Reserve that also coordinates stakeholders at federal, regional and local levels. It is also responsible for involving the local community in the conservation and management of the property. Its activities are conducted based on Property Management Plan and annual activity plans. The first Property Management Plan for 2016-2021 was completed in 2023, the new Management Plan is under preparation.

5.3.4 - Management Documents

Comment

Management Plan of the Bolgar Historical and Archaeological Complex World Heritage Property for 2016-2021.

5.3.5 - Has any use been made of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape in developing policies and best practices for the protection of this property?

The 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape is **not relevant** to this property

5.3.6 - If the Historic Urban Landscape Recommendation has been used at this property, please describe briefly what has been done.

5.3.7 - Has any use been made of the Policy Document on the Impacts of Climate Change on World Heritage Properties at the property?

No use has been made of the World Heritage Policy for Climate Change

5.3.8 - If the Climate Change policy has been used, please briefly describe what has been done along with any research on the impacts of Climate Change on the property:

5.3.9 - Has any use been made of the Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties at the property ?

Some use has been made of the Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties

5.3.10 - If the Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties has been used, please briefly describe what has been done

The Strategy was used in the development of the section on risk preparedness of the Property Management Plan (2016-2021).

5.3.11 - Rate the coordination between the various levels of administration (i.e. national/federal; regional/provincial/state; local/municipal etc.) involved in the management of the World Heritage property

There is **adequate coordination** between all bodies/levels involved in the management of the property

5.3.12 - Is the management system/plan adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The management system/plan is **fully adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

5.3.13 - Is the management system being implemented?

The management system is being **fully implemented and monitored**

5.3.14 - Is there an annual work/action plan and is it being implemented?

An annual work/action plan **exists and all of its activities are being implemented and monitored**

5.3.15 - Does the management system include formal mechanisms and procedures that ensure participation and contribution of the following groups, living within or near the World Heritage property and/or buffer zone in management decisions that maintain the Outstanding Universal Value of the property?

		Not applicable	No mechanisms for participation	Some participation	Direct participation	Transformative participation in all relevant decision processes
5.3.15.1	Local communities				×	
5.3.15.2	Local authorities				×	
5.3.15.3	Landowners in the property and the buffer zone			×		
5.3.15.4	Indigenous peoples	×				
5.3.15.5	Women				×	
5.3.15.6	Other specific groups	×				
	If you selected, 'Other specific groups' please specify					

5.3.16 - Please rate the cooperation/relationship between the World Heritage property managers/coordinators/staff and the following groups

		Not applicable	Non-existent	Poor	Fair	Good
5.3.16.1	Local communities					✗
5.3.16.2	Local/Municipal authorities					✗
5.3.16.3	Indigenous peoples	✗				
5.3.16.4	Landowners					✗
5.3.16.5	Women					✗
5.3.16.6	Youth/Children					✗
5.3.16.7	Researchers					✗
5.3.16.8	Local Visitors/Tourists					✗
5.3.16.9	National/International tourists					✗
5.3.16.10	Tourism Industry					✗
5.3.16.11	Local businesses and industries					✗
5.3.16.12	NGOs					✗
5.3.16.13	Other specific groups	✗				
	If you selected 'Other specific groups', please specify					

5.3.17 - Please rate the extent to which the management system of your property contributes towards achieving the objectives of the World Heritage Committee's Policy for the Integration of a Sustainable Development Perspective into the Processes of the *World Heritage Convention*

		Not applicable	No contribution	Limited	Significant	Full achievement
5.3.17.1	The management system of the property contributes to gender equality					✗
5.3.17.2	The management system of the property provides ecosystem services/benefits to the local community (e.g. fresh air, water, food, medicinal plants)					✗
5.3.17.3	The management system of the property contributes to social inclusion and equity, improving opportunities for all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, ethnicity, origin, religion or economic or other status					✗
5.3.17.4	The management system of the property integrates a human rights-based approach					✗
5.3.17.5	The management system of the property contributes to fostering inclusive local economic development, and to enhancing livelihood					✗
5.3.17.6	The management system of the property contributes to conflict prevention, including respect for cultural diversity within and around the World Heritage property					✗

5.3.18 - Please provide further details on the ratings of the management system given in the table above

5.3.19 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to the management system/plan

6. Financial and Human Resources

6.1. Funding

6.1.1 - If your funding sources do not exactly fit those shown, put the relevant amounts against the funding type that most closely represents your situation, and use the comment box below to provide more details.

		Project costs	Running costs
6.1.1.1	Multilateral funding (GEF, World Bank, etc.)	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.2	Bilateral international funding	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.3	World Heritage Fund (International Assistance)	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.4	Contribution from other conventions and programmes	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.5	International donations (NGOs, foundations, etc.)	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.6	Governmental (national/federal)	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.7	Governmental (regional/provincial/state)	0 %	80 %

6.1.1.8	Governmental (local/municipal)	0 %	0 %
6.1.1.9	In-country donations (NGOs, foundations, etc.)	100 %	0 %
6.1.1.10	Individual visitor charges (e.g. entry, toilets, parking, camping fees, etc.)	0 %	18 %
6.1.1.11	Commercial activities (e.g. merchandising and catering, filming permit, concessions, etc.)	0 %	2 %
6.1.1.12	Other	0 %	0 %
		Total 100 %	Total 100 %

6.1.2 - Please comment here on any other aspects of funding sources not covered in the table above

6.1.3 - Is the current budget sufficient to manage the World Heritage property effectively?

The available **budget is adequate** for effective management of the World Heritage property

6.1.4 - Are the existing sources of funding secure and likely to remain so?

The existing sources of funding are **secure over both the medium- and long-term**

6.1.5 - Comments, conclusion, and/or recommendations related to finance and infrastructure

6.1.6 - Estimate the distribution of men and women involved in the management, conservation, interpretation of the World Heritage properties and the extent to which they are drawn from local communities.

		From local communities %	From elsewhere %
6.1.6.1	Men	55 %	85 %
6.1.6.2	Women	45 %	15 %
		Total 100 %	Total 100 %

6.1.7 - Are available human resources adequate to manage the World Heritage property?

Human resources are **adequate** for management needs

6.1.8 - Considering the management needs of the World Heritage property, please rate the availability of professionals in the following disciplines

Conservation	Fair
Environmental sustainability	Not available
Community participation and inclusion	Fair
Risk preparedness	Fair
Capacity development and education	Good
Administration	Good
Research and monitoring	Good
Awareness raising and public information/communication	Good
Marketing and promotion	Good
Interpretation	Fair
Visitor management/tourism	Good
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Good

6.1.9 - Please rate the availability of training opportunities for the management of the World Heritage property in the following disciplines

Conservation	Poor
Environmental sustainability	Not applicable
Community participation and inclusion	Poor
Risk preparedness	Poor
Capacity development and education	Good
Administration	Good
Research and monitoring	Good
Awareness raising and public information/communication	Good
Marketing and promotion	Good

Interpretation	Fair
Visitor management/tourism	Good
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Good

6.1.10 - Has any use been made of the World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Building at the property?

No use has been made of the World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Building

6.1.11 - If the World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Building has been used, please briefly describe what has been done.

6.1.12 - Are there site-specific capacity building plans or programmes that develop local expertise and that contribute to the transfer of skills for the conservation and management of the World Heritage property?

A **site-based** capacity building plan or programme is in place and fully implemented; **all technical skills are being transferred** to those managing the property locally

6.1.13 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to human resources, expertise and training

7. Scientific Studies and Research Projects

7.1 - Is there adequate knowledge (scientific or traditional) about the values and attributes of the World Heritage property to support planning, management and decision-making to ensure that Outstanding Universal Value is maintained?

Knowledge about the values and attributes of the World Heritage property is **adequate**

7.2 - Is there a planned programme of research at the property which is directed towards management needs and/or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value?

There is a **comprehensive, integrated programme** of research, which is relevant to management needs and/or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value

7.3 - Are results from research programmes publicly available and disseminated?

Research results **are shared** widely **with active outreach** to local communities and national and international audiences

7.4 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to scientific studies and research projects

8. Education, Information and Awareness Building

8.1 - Please rate the awareness and understanding of the existence and justification for inscription of the World Heritage property amongst the following groups

Local communities	Good
Local/municipal authorities	Good
Indigenous peoples	Not applicable
Landowners	Good
Women	Good
Youth/children	Good
Researchers	Good
Local visitors	Good
National/international tourists	Good
Tourism industry	Good
Local businesses and industries	Fair
NGOs	Poor
Other specific groups	Not applicable
If you selected 'Other specific groups', please describe	

8.2 - Does the property have a heritage education programme(s) for children and/or youth, that can contribute to a better understanding of heritage, promote diversity and foster intercultural dialogue?

There is a **planned and effective education and awareness programme** for children and youth that contributes to the protection of the World Heritage property

8.3 - Who are the target audiences for education and awareness programmes at your property?

Local communities
Local/municipal authorities
Landowners

Youth/children
Local Visitors
National/international tourists
Tourism industry
Local businesses and industries

8.4 - Please rate the adequacy of the following visitor facilities and services at the World Heritage property for education, information, interpretation and awareness building

Visitor centre	Good
Site museum	Good
Information booths	Good
Guided tours	Good
Trails/routes	Good
Printed information materials	Fair
Online (website, social media, etc.)	Fair
Transportation facilities	Good
Other	Not needed
If 'Other' is selected, please specify	

8.5 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to education, information and awareness building

9. Visitor Management

9.1 - Please provide estimated annual visitor numbers (including national and international visitors) since the last Periodic Report

595759 / 411491 / 199164 / 530319 / 521420 /

9.2 - What information sources are used to collect visitor statistics?

Entry tickets and registries

Visitor surveys

9.3 - What is the average length stay of a visitor to the World Heritage property?

One day (no overnight stay)

9.4 - Please provide the source of information

Entry tickets and registries

9.5 - What is the approximate average daily visitor expenditure? (Please provide an estimated monetary figure in USD)

0 / 20 / 4.5 / 9 / 0 / 10 /

9.6 - Please provide the source of information

Visitor surveys

9.7 - Does the management system/plan for the World Heritage property include a strategy with an action plan to manage visitors, tourism activity and its derived economic, socio-cultural and environmental impacts?

There is a planned and **effective strategy** to manage visitors, tourism activity and its derived impacts on the World Heritage property

9.8 - Please provide any comments relating to the answer provided above in question 9.7

9.9 - Is visitor use effectively managed to maintain the Outstanding Universal Value of the property?

Visitor use of the World Heritage property is **effectively managed** and **does not impact its Outstanding Universal Value**

9.10 - Is the effectiveness of tourism management regularly monitored?

Yes, using a different system

If a different system, please specify

The site management uses electronic tourism monitoring system approved by the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Tatarstan

9.11 - How does the tourism industry cooperate with the site management to improve visitor experiences and maintain the Outstanding Universal Value of the World Heritage property?

There is **good cooperation** between those responsible for the World Heritage property and the tourism industry **to present the Outstanding Universal Value and increase appreciation**

9.12 - How well is the information on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property presented and interpreted?

The Outstanding Universal Value of the property **is adequately presented and interpreted**

9.13 - At how many locations is the World Heritage emblem displayed at the property?

In **many locations** and **easily visible** to visitors

9.14 - How does visitor/tourism revenue (e.g. entry charges, permits) contribute to the management of the World Heritage property?

Fees are collected and make a **substantial contribution** to the management of the World Heritage property

9.15 - Are there locally driven sustainable tourism initiatives?

Yes

If 'Yes', please specify

There are few initiatives, to enlarge their number, the site management implements capacity-building projects tailored to this issue.

9.16 - Are the benefits of tourism shared with local communities?

Yes

If 'Yes', please specify

The site management pays taxes from tourism revenue to the municipal budget (about 10% of its budget is constituted by taxes from tourism)

9.17 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to visitation/tourism/public use of the World Heritage property**10. Monitoring****10.1 - Is there a monitoring programme at the property directed towards management needs and/or towards improving the understanding of the Outstanding Universal Value?**

There is a **comprehensive, integrated programme of monitoring**, which is relevant to management needs and/or improving understanding of the Outstanding Universal Value

10.2 - Is necessary information available in order to define key indicators for measuring the state of conservation and are they used in monitoring how the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is being maintained?

Information on the values of the World Heritage property is **adequate** and **key indicators have been defined** for measuring the state of conservation and **are being used in monitoring** of how the Outstanding Universal value of the property is being maintained

10.3 - Are key indicators defined and in place for the following principal aspects of the property?

	Extend of indicators	Not applicable	No indicators	Indicators have been defined but are not yet in use	Indicators are in place and in use since the last Periodic Reporting cycle
10.3.1	State of conservation				×
10.3.2	Effectiveness of the management system				×
10.3.3	Character of governance		×		
10.3.4	Appropriate synergy with other conservation designations	×			
10.3.5	Contribution to sustainable development			×	
10.3.6	Capacity development				×

10.4 - Please provide information on relevant key indicators adopted at the property**10.5 - Please rate the level of involvement in monitoring of the following groups:**

World Heritage managers/coordinators and staff	Good
Local/municipal authorities	Good
Local communities	Good
Indigenous peoples	Not applicable
Landowners	Good
Women	Good
Researchers	Good
Tourism industry	Fair
Local businesses and industry	Fair
NGOs	Poor
Other specific groups	Not applicable

If you selected 'Other specific groups', please specify

10.6 - Has the State Party implemented relevant recommendations arising from the World Heritage Committee?

Implementation is complete

10.7 - Please provide comments relevant to the implementation of recommendations from the World Heritage Committee.

The recommendations of the World Heritage Committee given when the site was inscribed into the World Heritage List (Decision 38 COM 8B.42) were fully implemented (see Decision 40 COM 7B.105).

10.8 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to Monitoring

11. Identification of Priority Management Needs

11.1 - Identification of Priority Management Needs

5.1	Boundaries and Buffer Zones		
5.1.4	The buffer zones of the World Heritage property are known and recognised by the management authority but are not known and recognized by local communities/landowners		✕
5.2	Protective Measures		
5.2.4	An adequate legal framework in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and/or Integrity of the World Heritage property exists but there are some deficiencies in implementation		✕
5.2.5	There is no legal framework for controlling use and activities in the broader setting of the World Heritage property and the buffer zone		✕
5.3	Management System/Management Plan		
5.3.7	No use has been made of the Policy Document on the Impacts of Climate Change on World Heritage Properties at the property		✕
5.3.9	Some use has been made of the Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties at the property		✕
6.1	Funding		
6.1.10	No use has been made of the World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Development at the World Heritage property		✕
Please select 0 more issues.			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Please save this question to reflect changes			

12. Summary and Conclusions

12.1. Summary - Factors affecting the Property

12.1.1 - Summary - Factors affecting the Property

4.7	Local conditions affecting physical fabric						
4.7.1	Wind	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
4.7.2	Relative humidity	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
4.7.3	Temperature	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none

4.7.5	Dust	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and leaning	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
4.7.6	Water (rain/water table)	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
4.10	Climate change and severe weather events						
4.10.1	Storms	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	None
4.10.2	Flooding	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	None
4.10.6	Temperature change	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	None
4.11	Sudden ecological or geological events						
4.11.4	Avalanche/Landslide	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.2 Unexcavated archaeological remains; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	Past landslides and areas with the potential for landslides are mapped and monitored closely. Archaeological slopes were stabilized.	regularly	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
4.11.5	Erosion and siltation/Deposition	Criterion (ii), the following attributes: 3.2.1 archaeological remains of settlements; 3.2.4 historic stone and brick buildings and 3.2.5 ramparts and moats	regular maintenance and minor repairs	regular monitoring of state of conservation	regularly	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	None

Summary - Factors affecting the Property **completed**

12.2. Summary - Management Needs

12.2.1 - Summary - Management Needs

5.1	Boundaries and Buffer Zones				
5.1.4	The buffer zones of the World Heritage property are known and recognised by the management authority but are not known and recognized by local communities/landowners	The knowledge and recognition of the buffer zone by local communities and landowners are improved	Until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve and stakeholders at local level	none

5.2	Protective Measures				
5.2.4	An adequate legal framework in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and/or Integrity of the World Heritage property exists but there are some deficiencies in implementation	The improved legal framework in the buffer zone will be approved	Until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve and stakeholders at local and regional levels	none
5.2.5	There is no legal framework for controlling use and activities in the broader setting of the World Heritage property and the buffer zone	The legal framework for controlling use and activities in the wider setting of the World Heritage property will be developed and approved.	Until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve and stakeholders at local and regional levels	none

5.3	Management System/Management Plan				
5.3.7	No use has been made of the Policy Document on the Impacts of Climate Change on World Heritage Properties at the property	The Policy Document on the Impacts of Climate Change on World Heritage Properties will be applied for the World Heritage property management.	until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none
5.3.9	Some use has been made of the Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties at the property	The Strategy for Reducing Risks from Disasters at World Heritage Properties will be applied for the World Heritage property management.	until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none

6.1	Funding				
6.1.7		?	?	?	none
6.1.10	No use has been made of the World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Development at the World Heritage property	The World Heritage Strategy for Capacity Development will be applied for the World Heritage property management	until 2028	Bolgar State Museum-Reserve	none

Summary - Management Needs completed

12.3. Conclusions on the State of Conservation of the Property

12.3.1 - Following the analysis undertaken for this report, what is the current state of Authenticity of the World Heritage property?

The Authenticity of the World Heritage property **has been preserved**

12.3.2 - Following the analysis undertaken for this report, what is the current state of Integrity of the World Heritage property?

The Integrity of the World Heritage property is **intact**

12.3.3 - Following the analysis undertaken for this report, what is the current state of the World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value has been **maintained**.

12.3.4 - What is the current state of the property's other values?

Other important cultural and/or natural values and the state of conservation of the World Heritage property are **intact**

12.3.5 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to the state of conservation of the property.

13. Impact of World Heritage Status

13.1 - Please rate the impacts of World Heritage status of the property in relation to the following areas

Conservation	Very positive
Research and monitoring	Very positive
Management effectiveness	Very positive
Quality of life for local communities and indigenous peoples	Very positive
Recognition	Very positive
Education	Very positive
Infrastructure development	Very positive
Funding for the property	Very positive
International cooperation	Very positive
Political support for conservation	Very positive
Legal/Policy framework	Very positive
Advocacy	Positive
Institutional coordination	Positive
Security	Very positive
Gender equality	Very positive
Provision of ecosystem services/ benefits to local communities	Not applicable
Social inclusion and equity, and improvement of opportunities for all, irrespective of age, sex, disability, ethnicity, origin, religion, or economic or other status	Very positive
Fostering inclusive local economic development and enhancing livelihood	Very positive
Contributing to conflict prevention, including respect for cultural diversity within and around heritage properties	Very positive
Other	Not applicable
If 'Other', please specify	

13.2 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to World Heritage status and its impacts

14. Good Practice in the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention

14.1 - Example of good practice in World Heritage protection, identification, conservation or management at the property level

The use of traditional materials and technologies in conservation work (since 2010).

14.2 - Define which topics are covered by this example of best practice at the property level

Sustainable Development
State of Conservation
Management
Governance
Capacity Building

15. Assessment of the Periodic Reporting Exercise

15.1. Relevance of Periodic Reporting

15.1.1 - Has the Periodic Reporting process improved the understanding of the following?

The <i>World Heritage Convention</i>
The concept of Outstanding Universal Value
The property's Outstanding Universal Value

The concept of Integrity and/or Authenticity
The property's Integrity and/or Authenticity
Management effectiveness to maintain the Outstanding Universal Value
Monitoring and reporting

15.1.2 - Please rate the follow-up to conclusions and recommendations from previous Periodic Reporting exercise by the following entities

State Party	Good
Site Managers	Good
UNESCO World Heritage Centre	Good
Advisory Bodies (ICOMOS, IUCN, ICCROM)	Good

15.2. Use of Data

15.2.1 - How do the authorities in charge of the property plan to use the data recorded from this cycle of Periodic Reporting?

Revision of priorities/strategies/policies for the protection, management and conservation of heritage
Update of management plans
Awareness raising

15.2.2 - Comments on use of data from the Cycle of Periodic Reporting

15.3. Timing and resources

15.3.1 - Entities involved in the filling out of this online questionnaire (tick as many boxes as applicable)

Governmental institutions responsible for cultural and natural heritage
Site Manager/Coordinator World Heritage property staff

15.3.2 - Has a gender balanced contribution and participation been considered in the filling out of this questionnaire?

Gender balance is explicitly considered and effectively implemented in the process.

15.3.3 - Were you given adequate time (i.e. roughly ten months) to gather necessary information and to fill in this questionnaire?

Yes

15.3.4 - Please estimate the time (working hours) needed to complete this questionnaire

16 / 12 / 4 /

15.3.5 - Did you mobilise any additional resources to fill out this questionnaire?

	Additional resources	No	Yes
15.3.5.1	Human resources	✗	
15.3.5.2	Financial resources for organizing consultation meetings/ training	✗	

15.4. Format and content of the Periodic Report

15.4.1 - How accessible was the information required to complete this questionnaire?

All required information was accessible.

15.4.2 - Was the questionnaire easy to use and clear to understand?

		Very Difficult	Difficult	Easy	Very easy
15.4.2.1	Ease of use of questionnaire				✗
15.4.2.2	Clarity of questions				✗

15.4.3 - Please provide suggestions for improvement of the Periodic Reporting questionnaire

15.5. Training and Guidance

15.5.1 - Please rate the level of support in terms of training and guidance from the following entities in completing this questionnaire

UNESCO World Heritage Centre	Good
UNESCO (other sectors/field offices)	Not applicable
UNESCO National Commission	Not applicable

ICOMOS International	Not applicable
IUCN International	Not applicable
ICCROM international/regional	Not applicable
ICOMOS national/regional	Not applicable
IUCN national/regional	Not applicable

15.5.2 - Please rate the level of support for completing the Periodic Reporting questionnaire from the following entities

UNESCO World Heritage Centre	Not applicable
State Party Representative (national Focal Point)	Good
UNESCO other sectors (e.g. field office)	Not applicable
National Commission for UNESCO	Not applicable
ICOMOS International	Not applicable
ICCROM International/regional	Not applicable
ICOMOS national/regional	Not applicable
IUCN national/regional	Not applicable
IUCN International	Not applicable

15.5.3 - Were the online training resources prepared by the World Heritage Centre regarding Periodic Reporting adequate for you to complete this questionnaire?

Yes

15.5.4 - If you found that the online training resources were not adequate, what changes would you like to see implemented?

15.6. Actions that will require formal consideration by the World Heritage Committee

15.6.1 - Summary of actions that will require formal consideration by the World Heritage Committee

No item were proposed for update

15.7. Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to the Assessment of the Periodic Reporting Exercise

15.7.1 - Comments, conclusions and/or recommendations related to the Assessment of the Periodic Reporting Exercise

15.7.2 - Thank you for having filled in all the questions. Please contact your National Focal Point for validation.