Zagori Cultural Landscape (Greece) No 1695

1 Basic information

Official name as proposed by the State Party Zagori Cultural Landscape

Location

Municipality of Zagori Regional Unit of Ioannina Region of Epirus Greece

Brief description

Zagori Cultural Landscape is located in the mountainous Epirus region of northwestern Greece. It consists of a rural landscape where small villages known as Zagorochoria or Zagori villages extend along the western slopes of the northern part of the Pindus mountain range. In this remote area characterised by a diversity of geological formations, flora, and fauna, these traditional settlements underwent a transformation influenced by remittances sent by expatriates to fund private and public infrastructure during the 18th and 19th centuries. A network of stone-arched bridges, stone cobbled paths, and stone staircases linking the villages in the present Municipality of Zagori formed a system that served as a political and social unit connecting the communities of the Voïdomatis River basin. These traditional villages, typically organised around a central square containing a plane tree and surrounded by sacred forests maintained by local communities, showcase a traditional architecture of limestone masonry and drystone cobbled pathways adapted to the mountain topography.

Category of property

In terms of categories of cultural property set out in Article I of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

In terms of the *Operational Guidelines* for the *Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (2021), paragraph 47, it has also been nominated as a *cultural landscape*.

[Note: the property is nominated as a mixed cultural and natural property. IUCN will assess the natural values, while ICOMOS assesses the cultural values.]

Included in the Tentative List

16 January 2014 as "Zagorochoria – North Pindos National Park"

Background

This is a new nomination.

Consultations and technical evaluation mission

Desk reviews have been provided by ICOMOS International Scientific Committees, members and independent experts.

An ICOMOS technical evaluation mission visited the nominated property from 3 to 8 October 2022. This mission was conducted jointly with IUCN.

Additional information received by ICOMOS

A joint letter with IUCN was sent to the State Party on 14 October 2022 requesting further information about communities' involvement, management, the UNESCO Global Geopark, boundaries, buffer zone, comparative analysis, state of conservation, factors affecting the nominated property, and maps.

Additional information was received from the State Party on 14 November 2022.

An Interim Report was provided to the State Party on 21 December 2022 summarising the issues identified by the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel. Further information was requested in the Interim Report, including boundaries, documentation, conservation, and protection.

Additional information was received from the State Party on 28 February 2023.

All additional information received has been incorporated into the relevant sections of this evaluation report.

Date of ICOMOS approval of this report 10 March 2023

2 Description of the nominated property

Note: The nomination dossier and additional information contain detailed descriptions of this property, its history and its state of conservation. Due to limitations on the length of evaluation reports, this report provides only a short summary of the most relevant aspects.

Description and history

Zagori Cultural Landscape is located in the Region of Epirus in northwestern Greece. It consists of a rural landscape where traditional settlements extend along the western slopes of the northern part of the Pindus mountain range. Zagori, a name of Slavic origin meaning "the place behind the mountain", is bordered by Mount Tymphi to the north and Mount Mitsikeli to the south, near the border between Greece and Albania. The nominated property covers a variety of geomorphological formations such as mountains, a gorge, and plains, with forest ecosystems and shrubland.

Challenging the steep slopes of this remote mountain region, small settlements known as *Zagorochoria* or Zagori villages formed a network that was consolidated in the 18th century. Established along the Voïdomatis River basin, the villages are connected by cobbled paths, stone-arched bridges, and steep stone staircases. According to

the State Party, these very small settlements underwent an urbanisation process that was influenced by outmigration remittances and benevolence sent by the diaspora of the region to fund private and public infrastructure here during the 18th and 19th centuries. This process generated a village system that functioned as a political and social unit.

The nominated property encompasses twenty of these villages in three municipal units of the present Municipality of Zagori: Central Zagori, Tymphi, and Pápigo. In Central Zagori, the nominated property includes the traditional villages of Arísti, Áno Pediná, Káto Pediná, Díkorfo, Dílofo, Elafótopos, Eláti, Monodéndri, Víkos, and Vítsa. In Tymphi, it includes the traditional villages of Fragádes, Kapésovo, Koukoúli, Kípoi, Negádes, Skamnéli, Tsepélovo, and Vradéto. And in Pápigo, it includes the traditional villages of Pápigo and Mikró Pápigo. These traditional villages have been protected since 1979 by means of a Presidential Decree.

The traditional villages are typically organised around a central square containing a plane tree. Each showcases drystone cobbled pathways adapted to the topography, and some are still surrounded by sacred forests maintained by local communities. The central square is dedicated to community life, and functions as a centre for social gatherings and religious events. Plane trees are surrounded by *lotzias*, circular, square or hexagonal ledges that create a protective space and serve for sitting. In the past, these seats were reserved for respected elders. Emblematic plane trees are still standing in Koukoúli, Áno Pediná, Monodéndri, Kapésovo, Vítsa, Vradéto, Kípoi, Dílofo, and Negádes.

The central squares also usually feature a church, a fountain or a cistern, and an *amelikó* built during Ottoman rule (mid-15th to early 19th centuries) to host visitors such as merchants and craftspeople. Those that have survived have been converted into community spaces, offices for cultural associations or hostels. Other important buildings located in the central square can include schools built in the 19th century and operated at the expense of their benefactors, and religious buildings such as monasteries.

Steep staircases are still maintained in Vradéto, Vítsa, Kípoi, and Koukoúli. Sacred forests hold spiritual meanings but are also managed to protect the settlements from landslides, rock falls or avalanches. Traditional houses and mansions funded by remittances are built of stone, two to three storeys high and with slate roofs. Some retain ornate wooden ceilings, painted reception areas, and crafted and painted wooden room partitions that reflect the financial status of the builder.

The nominated property has an area of 41,109 ha and a buffer zone of 58,046 ha.

Mount Tymphi and the Vikos gorge were used as temporary habitations by hunters during the Upper Paleolithic. The rock shelter at Klithi at the mouth of the Voïdomatis gorge presents traces of the habitation of this area 20,000 years ago, and burial findings in the plain of Áno Pediná and Káto Pediná establish human activity in the Late Bronze Age (1300-1100 BCE). Slavic tribes are believed to have inhabited the area in the 6th century CE, owing to the place names of Slavic origin.

Permanent residence of this area is recorded more concretely in the 14th century, when the villages of Zagori are first mentioned in documents. Remnants from the Byzantine period still standing include the Monastery of Agia Paraskevi in Monodéndri and the Agios Nikolaos in Elafótopos, both built in the 15th century. During Ottoman rule in the 17th century, Zagori became the *Koinon* (Commons) of Zagorisians, maintaining its autonomous status. The first systematic construction of churches and monasteries in the area started then, examples of which survive in Elafótopos, Káto Pediná, and Vítsa.

The rural landscape was formed by using controlled fires to clear forests to gain agricultural land, and by building drystone terraces at higher altitudes to grow crops, including wheat, barley, oats, rye, and corn. Threshing floors and thatched stone huts for hay storage are visible in Kató Pediná as a testimony to the production of cereals. Animal husbandry was undertaken in the larger area of the Pindus mountain range by nomadic Sarakatsani sheep and goat breeders who moved seasonally between mountains and plains: by Vlach (Aromanian) livestock breeders and muleteers active in the Balkan region who settled in eastern Zagori: and by local farmers who ran livestock farms and practiced agriculture in the villages. Zagorisians practiced transhumance, traveling in winter to lower lands outside the region, and in summer to pastures in the highlands.

The foodstuffs produced in the region were nevertheless insufficient, and food had to be imported. As a solution for this shortfall, Zagorisians practiced temporary migrations to obtain additional resources. Emigration started in the 12th century, but is recorded mostly after the 15th century. Male Zagorisians went to Romania, the Balkan countries, Central Europe, Russia, Asia Minor, and Constantinople to work as bakers, innkeepers, merchants, painters, and healers. The women, children, and elderly remained in the Zagori villages to continue livestock and farming activities. Beneficence and the institution of fraternities and associations developed amongst the diaspora, through which remittances and funding were sent back to Zagori to help build the villages' public infrastructure and to improve individual residences. In this context, the first large stone bridges were built in the mid-18th century.

By the 19th century, modernisation of the Ottoman Empire had resulted in the end of privileges for Zagori and an increase in taxes. From the end of the 19th century onwards, especially after the Balkan Wars (1912-1913) and the Greco-Turkish War (1919-1922), which isolated this region, Zagorisians migrated even farther, beyond the Atlantic or to Africa. During the Second World War, destructive attacks were carried out on some of the traditional villages of Zagori, razing many of them almost to the ground. With the consolidation of nation states in the 20th century, temporary migrations and the institutions of beneficence and remittances gradually faded and the population of Zagori declined, as did its farming and livestock-raising activities. Vikos-Aoos National Park was established around the Vikos gorge in 1973. Arable lands were categorised as forests and part of nature reserves because of increasing reforestation due to the general abandonment of agropastoral practices. In 2005, the North Pindus National Park was established in its current outline, connecting Vikos-Aoos and Pindus National Parks. At present, the protected area and traditional villages have become tourist attractions, and Zagorisians are increasingly occupied with providing services to visitors.

State of conservation

The state of conservation of the nominated property varies. Conservation measures have not been applied comprehensively, since different elements are under different ownership. ICOMOS considers that most of the selected twenty traditional villages are in a very good or good state of conservation. However, ICOMOS notes that the village of Skamnéli was burned down during the Balkan Wars and subsequently rebuilt. Based on this assessment, ICOMOS considers that Skamnéli should be included in the buffer zone rather than the nominated property.

Additional information on the state of conservation of the traditional villages that have been proposed as attributes was requested by ICOMOS in October 2022, including maps, plans, and photographs that could clarify how these villages have changed over time. In November 2022 the State Party provided aerial images and photographs that illustrate changes at the larger landscape level, where reforestation around the villages is evident.

In its interim report, ICOMOS requested further documentation on the structure and historical development of the villages during the 18th and 19th centuries, as well as documentation on the architectural typologies of the traditional buildings. In the additional information submitted in February 2023, the State Party provided brief sheets on each of the twenty villages proposed in the nominated property. ICOMOS noted that Skamnéli, Fragádes and Eláti have been totally or partially destroyed and reconstructed. In the case of Fragádes, the historical urban grid has been maintained, but in the case of Eláti, neither the historical urban grid nor the traditional houses typology are evident. Based on this information, ICOMOS considers that Eláti should also be included in the buffer zone.

Depopulation of the area during the second half of the 20th century resulted in the abandonment of several traditional agricultural activities, causing deterioration of the drystone agricultural heritage and changes in construction materials. Meadows and farms surrounding the traditional villages, including former farming terraces on slopes, are being overtaken by forests. Several conservation initiatives focused on rural heritage have been

implemented at the local, national, and European levels. Nevertheless, according to the State Party, the rural heritage needs protection and conservation.

The state of conservation of ecclesiastical monuments varies. Some religious buildings such as churches in Káto Pediná and Tsepélovo were affected by an earthquake in 2016. Restoration works and rescue interventions have been carried out for several of these religious monuments. Conservation interventions have also been undertaken for the mansions and stone bridges, though details on the dates of these interventions have not been provided by the State Party. In February 2023, the State Party provided architectural plans and photographs of fifteen houses located in six of the traditional villages of the nominated property, detailing their period of construction and interventions.

ICOMOS notes that even though some traditional houses and mansions have been maintained, systematic information about the traditional architecture in the villages needs to be assembled in order to establish a baseline for the conservation of the nominated property.

Based on the information provided by the State Party and the observations of the ICOMOS technical evaluation mission, ICOMOS considers that, overall, the state of conservation of the nominated property is fair.

Factors affecting the nominated property

Based on the information provided by the State Party and the observations of the ICOMOS technical evaluation mission, ICOMOS considers that the main factors affecting the nominated property are socio-cultural pressures, including depopulation and tourism development, and environmental pressures, including reforestation and climate change.

Regarding socio-cultural factors, the abandonment of traditional practices as a consequence of demographic changes is having an impact on the landscape, leading to reforestation. A general lack of youth involvement compounds the issue, as traditional knowledge and intangible cultural heritage practices are becoming increasingly vulnerable with the depopulation of the area. The lack of materials for the maintenance of traditional architecture is also concerning, since quarrying in the National Park, where the nominated property is located, is not permitted, and the availability of authentic traditional materials and relevant skills is decreasing.

In its Interim Report, ICOMOS requested further information regarding the strategy of the State Party to address the long-term continuance of traditional practices in order to ensure the sustainability of the traditional architecture and of the nominated property as a whole. ICOMOS also requested information about how many houses are permanently inhabited in each of the traditional villages, how many are vacant or abandoned, and how the State Party intends to address depopulation in the villages as regards preservation of the houses. In its response in February 2023, the State Party indicated that the Greek Ministry of Culture and Sports and the local authorities envisage the establishment of a local school of stone carving in one of the villages of Zagori. Furthermore, the State Party asserted that the materials needed to maintain the traditional architecture of Zagori are available in neighbouring areas. In addition, the State Party informed that the inhabitants of Zagori who migrated to bigger cities have not abandoned their houses, using them instead as holiday houses.

ICOMOS considers that it is of utmost importance to create a sustainability strategy for traditional masonry, and to address as well the impermanent occupation of the traditional houses of the nominated property in order to maintain the traditional villages over the long term.

Tourism has become the most important economic activity in the nominated property. At the village level, hydro and telephone lines and poles, informational and directional signage, and advertising boards affect their traditional character. Waste management is also an issue of concern. Increased tourism is having a negative impact on the traditional villages and the natural environment, especially in high seasons and in certain parts of the nominated property.

Natural reforestation in the mountains and in proximity to the villages increases their exposure to fire and wildfires. In the context of increasing temperatures and drought in summer caused by climate change, wildfires may have serious impacts on the landscape, the rural heritage, and the traditional villages. Furthermore, climate change is causing unpredictable and heavy rainfall that is leading to flooding, which may have negative impacts on the stone bridges that span the rivers.

ICOMOS considers that the state of conservation is fair, and that the factors affecting the nominated property are socio-cultural and environmental, particularly depopulation, tourist pressures, natural reforestation, and climate change.

3 Proposed justification for inscription

Proposed justification

The nominated property is considered by the State Party to be of Outstanding Universal Value as a cultural property for the following reasons:

- Zagori Cultural Landscape is of extreme importance for the region as a testimony to the temporary migratory travels and related beneficence traditions that had an impact on an agricultural landscape by enriching it with urban infrastructure and aesthetics evident in the traditional villages' stone bridges, cobbled paths, mansions, schools, religious monuments, and public squares.
- The exceptional architectural tradition of Zagori includes private residences as well as public buildings and infrastructure such as schools, religious

monuments, impressive stone bridges, and a network of cobbled paths and stone staircases.

• The cultural landscape encompasses a wide range of intangible cultural heritage and associations related to an agropastoral way of life, including transhumance, the art of drystone construction, and the upkeep of sacred forests. Ethnobotanical knowledge, hagiography, and fresco painting are some of the sciences and arts that developed in this area.

Based on the nomination dossier and the additional information, the key attributes of the nominated property are the traditional villages, their layouts, and their traditional limestone architecture, the traditional houses and mansions, the cobbled paths, the public infrastructure built between the 18th and 19th centuries such as schools as well as the religious monuments, and the connections between the traditional villages, namely the stone staircases and the stone bridges. Important attributes also include the rural drystone structures, the rural landscape setting, as well as the geological formations and topography of the nominated property and views to and from its wider setting. Key intangible attributes include traditional drystone building and stone masonry skills and techniques. Other intangible attributes include farming and livestock breeding, transhumance practices, traditional knowledge, sacred forest management, ethnobotanical knowledge and related plant cultivation, and the relationship of the communities with their natural environment.

ICOMOS does not consider that the nominated property falls under the category of cultural landscapes (see "Criteria under which inscription is proposed" below). ICOMOS therefore considers that the name of the nominated property should be changed to reflect better the cultural values of the property: "*Zagorochoria*, the traditional villages of Zagori".

Comparative analysis

The comparative analysis has been developed with a thematic approach based on protected areas and cultural landscapes, and a geo-cultural region focused on Europe, particularly southeastern Europe. It has examined properties in southeastern Europe inscribed on the World Heritage List or inserted in Tentative Lists, properties in Italy inscribed on the World Heritage List, and other properties in Europe inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Clear parameters for the comparative analysis have not been set out, the parameters being implicit rather than explicit. The main parameters appear to be uniqueness and elegance of the building complexes and infrastructure; the art of drystone construction; transhumant livestock breeding; sacred forests; natural beauty; geological value; and importance of the area for the preservation of biodiversity and cultural heritage. These parameters are not applied systematically to the compared properties.

The State Party focuses on comparisons with properties inscribed under natural criteria, and with cultural

landscapes located in Italy inscribed on the World Heritage List. It concludes that the nominated property stands out for its combination of natural and cultural attributes. These attributes are also present in several of the inscribed properties, but separately and not in combination, according to the State Party. ICOMOS observes that the comparative analysis has not focused on what specifically makes the nominated property and its proposed Outstanding Universal Value stand out when compared to the inscribed properties.

ICOMOS considers that the focus of the comparison could have been expanded to a global level, given that high-mountain agro-pastoralism is a global phenomenon. In addition, a temporal period of comparison has not been established, which is necessary to support the justification of criterion (iv) in particular.

ICOMOS also observes that comparisons with other areas within the same mountainous region of Greece and having similar attributes have not been included. Similarly, neither the particularity of the urban character of the nominated property, nor the sacred values assigned to the forests, have been adequately explored. Furthermore, the comparisons to transhumance practices and drystone walling do not highlight the potential exceptionality of the nominated property. Additionally, ICOMOS notes that the architectural aspect of the nominated property, and specifically the system of traditional villages proposed as attributes, have not been compared in detail with other similar villages in mountainous areas within Greece, the Mediterranean or southeastern Europe.

In October 2022, ICOMOS requested the State Party to expand the comparative analysis to include other areas with similar characteristics located in Greece and that are not included on the World Heritage List, as well as a more detailed analysis of other areas in the Mediterranean and southeastern Europe with similar architecture and traditional villages of the same period and/or style. The State Party provided additional information in November 2022, expanding the comparative analysis and highlighting that the characteristic of an ensemble of villages together with a dense network of stone paths and bridges is the main difference when compared to other mountainous areas in Greece. Most of these other areas have been affected by development, particularly in the islands and coastal areas, but also in cities of the Epirus region such as Arta and Ioannina.

The State Party also provided a more detailed analysis of the architectural elements, defining the typology of the mansions (*arhontika*) and determining the main stylistic influence to be Ottoman. The State Party further added that the nominated property stands out from other villages in Greece and in southeastern Europe because it is an ensemble composed of several villages and not a specific city, town or area within a city, as is the case with properties in the Balkan region such as Historic Centres of Berat and Gjirokastra (Albania, 2005, 2008, criteria (iii) and (iv)) and Natural and Cultural Heritage of the Ohrid region (Albania and North Macedonia, 1979, 1980, 2019, criteria (i), (iii), (iv) and (vii)), both of which also showcase an Ottoman architectural style similar to Zagori.

Furthermore, the State Party asserts that the state of conservation of the traditional villages of Zagori stands out in comparison to other villages with similar characteristics, due to the protection enabled by the remoteness of the mountainous area in which these villages are located.

Based on the additional information, ICOMOS considers that the nominated property stands out from similar properties in the same geo-cultural region due to its concentration of traditional villages and the level of their preservation, its vernacular architecture of traditional stone building, the stone bridges and stone paths connecting the villages, and the imposing natural setting in which the villages are found.

ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis justifies consideration of this property for the World Heritage List.

Criteria under which inscription is proposed

The property is nominated on the basis of cultural criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi) and natural criteria (vii), (viii) and (x). The comments below relate to the justification of the cultural criteria.

Criterion (iii): bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared;

This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the nominated property bears an exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition of migration, remittances, and benevolence that transformed the agropastoral rural character of the mountain landscape of Zagori into an urban space with public and private infrastructure development in the 18th and 19th centuries. The rural heritage combined with the urban aesthetics imported by the Zagorisian diaspora represent unique architectural expressions that highlight local materials and craftsmanship influenced by cosmopolitan styles of areas such as Central Europe, the Mediterranean, Asia Minor, Constantinople, and the Black Sea, where Zagorisians practiced temporary migrations.

ICOMOS considers that the influence of outmigration from rural areas is not unique to Zagori, and that investment through benevolence is a phenomenon that can be seen in other areas of the world. Furthermore, due to a lack of historical evidence, it is not possible to confirm how the territorial occupation evolved. The characteristics of the temporary migrations and the tangible impacts they had on the traditional villages of Zagori have not been demonstrated to be unique or exceptional, nor has compelling evidence been presented to demonstrate that the development of a cultural tradition of migration and benevolence whose impacts are exceptional has been preserved in the nominated property. ICOMOS considers that criterion (iii) has not been justified. Criterion (iv): be an outstanding example of a type of building, architectural or technological ensemble or landscape which illustrates (a) significant stage(s) in human history;

This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that there is an exceptional concentration of public infrastructure represented by squares, cobbled paths, stone staircases, and stone bridges combined with the development of a unique private architectural style and numerous and monumental religious buildings. These characterise Zagori as an outstanding example of an ensemble that expresses the coexistence of the rural character of a mountain area with an elaborate settlement pattern representative of the Enlightenment (18th-19th centuries).

ICOMOS notes the high concentration of stone-made public infrastructure in the nominated property which is adapted to the challenging mountain environment of Zagori. However, ICOMOS considers that sound historical evidence is needed to demonstrate that there was a process of transformation of the rural landscape to an urbanised environment, and furthermore, that this process is connected to and illustrates the Enlightenment as a significant stage in human history. In particular, additional historical evidence is needed to describe how the traditional villages evolved in the period between the 18th and 19th centuries, to consolidate and function as a system. ICOMOS considers that criterion (iv) has not been justified.

Criterion (vi): be directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs, with artistic and literary works of outstanding universal significance;

This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the nominated property bears associations with living traditions of transhumance, drystone building, sacred forest management, ethnobotanical knowledge, musical knowledge, festivals, and hagiography, as well as culinary traditions characteristic of Zagori.

ICOMOS considers that the living traditions of drystone building, transhumance, and sacred forests are not unique to the nominated property but are representative of a larger regional area. Some of these traditions have been recognised jointly with other European countries in an inscription of elements in the UNESCO Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity, however the comparative analysis has not demonstrated how these traditions are exceptionally represented in the nominated property. While ICOMOS considers that the living traditions in the nominated property potentially have regional significance, their Outstanding Universal Value has not been demonstrated. ICOMOS considers that criterion (vi) has not been justified.

Criterion (v): be an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, land-use, or sea-use which is representative of a culture (or cultures), or human interaction with the environment especially when it has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change;

The State Party did not propose this criterion in the nomination but did propose criterion (v) when the nominated property was included in the Tentative List. Based on the nomination dossier and additional information provided by the State Party in November 2022 and February 2023, and taking into consideration the reasoning used by the State Party to justify criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi), ICOMOS considers that the nominated property exhibits an exceptionally well-preserved traditional settlement pattern that goes back to the 18th century and that justifies criterion (v). ICOMOS considers that the Zagorochoria. traditional villages of Zagori, are an outstanding example of traditional human settlements where the characteristics of the stonework showcased in traditional buildings, stone bridges, stone paths, and stone staircases represent a distinctive culture developed in Zagori. The vernacular architecture, urban structure, and public infrastructure of the villages have been influenced by an exchange with other areas of the Balkan region, Central Europe, Russia, Asia Minor, and Constantinople, where Zagorisians practiced temporary migration. Zagorisians imported ideas and styles to their homeland and provided investments which enabled the development of this isolated area of the Pindus mountain range.

ICOMOS also considers that the *Zagorochoria* are representative of the common legacy of Byzantine and Ottoman vernacular architecture of the larger Balkan region. This style has become rare in the region, but is still reflected in the traditional stone architecture and traditional village layouts of Zagori. Furthermore, ICOMOS observes that these well-conserved traditional villages are vulnerable to the abandonment of traditional building practices, the development of tourism, and the transformation of their former agropastoral setting that is being retaken by forests, thus putting their conservation at risk. ICOMOS considers that criterion (v) has been justified.

ICOMOS considers that the nominated property meets criterion (v), but that criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi) have not been demonstrated.

The State Party has proposed the nominated property as a continuing cultural landscape based on the existence of an inter-relationship between culture and nature, specifically the agropastoral characteristics and transhumant practices once pursued within the nominated property representing an interaction between Sarakatsani, Vlach, and Zagorisian resident groups and the environment. However, the State Party has confirmed in the nomination dossier and in the additional information submitted in November 2022 that many of the Sarakatsani and Vlach residents who used to be nomadic and seminomadic have now settled permanently in Zagori villages and no longer practice transhumance or agropastoralism. The Zagorisians' practice of animal husbandry and agriculture is also greatly diminished, due in part to sociocultural changes and depopulation of the traditional villages.

ICOMOS considers that the processes, relationships, and dynamic functions that are essential to the cultural landscape's distinctive character are no longer maintained in a robust state. The material forms of its significant distinguishing features are diminished: many agricultural structures such as terraces and drystone walls have been abandoned, and much of what constitutes the agropastoral landscape – meadows and agricultural areas in particular – have been taken over by forests. Agropastoral practices no longer retain an active social role in contemporary society closely associated with the traditional way of life. The nominated property therefore does not fully meet the requirements of cultural landscapes.

ICOMOS does not consider that the nominated property falls under the category of cultural landscapes.

ICOMOS considers that the nominated property meets criterion (v), but that criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi) have not been demonstrated. ICOMOS does not consider that the nominated property falls under the category of cultural landscapes.

Integrity and authenticity

Integrity

The integrity of the nominated property is based on the cultural and natural elements that characterise the group of small traditional villages that underwent a transformation influenced by remittances sent by expatriates to fund private and public infrastructure during the 18th and 19th centuries. These elements include traditional architecture of limestone masonry, a network of stone-arched bridges, stone cobbled paths, and stone staircases linking the villages, and associated rural mountain landscape features. The setting and the mountain topography, as well as the relationship between these environmental aspects and the built environment, are also important attributes of the nominated property.

The nominated property must contain all the attributes necessary to convey the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. In this regard, ICOMOS observes that Skamnéli, one of the twenty villages, was burned down during the Balkan Wars of 1912-1913 and subsequently rebuilt. ICOMOS therefore considers that it should be part of the buffer zone along with the village of Eláti, and not included in the nominated property.

The dynamic functions and relationships between the architecture, the villages, and the landscape, as well as the rural heritage and the traditions associated with them (drystone walling, transhumance, sacred forests) are also necessary for the integrity of the nominated property. ICOMOS notes that in order to maintain these aspects, the State Party needs to address the progressive loss of

traditional activities, including stone building practices, availability of traditional materials, and livestock breeding.

Natural reforestation in the immediate setting of the traditional villages represents a threat to the integrity of the nominated property, increasing the exposure of these villages to potential fire or wildfires. This threat needs to be addressed.

Because of the necessity to reassess the boundaries of the nominated property in order to include the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti in the buffer zone, ICOMOS considers that the integrity of the nominated property has not been demonstrated at this stage.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the nominated property is based on the locations, settings, forms, and functions of the system of traditional villages, and the locations, settings, forms, designs, materials, and substance of the buildings and public infrastructure.

In additional information provided in February 2023, the State Party clarified that some of the villages, houses, and mansions had previously been destroyed and then reconstructed. The limited information available about these attributes has not allowed a comprehensive assessment of their authenticity.

A study of the traditional architecture of Zagori, which is mentioned but not included in the nomination dossier, is said to describe the volumes, forms, materials, colours, and construction methods. Traditions and techniques used for building these structures, particularly drystone building, are important attributes that need to be continued to ensure that the traditional villages preserve their authenticity. The State Party indicates that these traditions are being maintained and used for new construction in the traditional villages.

In October 2022, ICOMOS requested further information from the State Party regarding the traditional villages, including maps, plans, and photographs that could clarify how they have changed over time, in order to assess their authenticity. In November 2022, the State Party provided additional information in the form of aerial photographs of eight villages (Elafótopos, Áno Pediná, Koukoúli, Kapésovo, Negádes, Aristí, Dílofo, and Vítsa), comparing the period 1945-1960 with 2015-2016, and historic and recent photographs of eight villages (Dílofo, Kípoi, Koukoúli, Monodéndri, Negádes, Pápigo, Vítsa, and Tsepélovo), where reforestation as well as the villages' layouts are discernible.

Additional documentation about village structure and architectural plans was requested by ICOMOS in its Interim Report. In February 2023, the State Party reported that the historic urban fabric of eighteen of the twenty villages has survived, as well as the paths and bridges connecting them. However, some of the villages were destroyed during various 20th-century wars and

subsequently reconstructed. ICOMOS considers that the selection of traditional villages needs to be reassessed in the context of their authenticity and the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti should be included in the buffer zone. A detailed condition survey of the traditional villages and houses is also necessary to establish a baseline for conservation and management.

Even though most of the twenty traditional villages might meet the requirements of authenticity as defined by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, ICOMOS considers that the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti do not. ICOMOS therefore considers that the authenticity of the nominated property has not been demonstrated at this stage.

In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the conditions of integrity and authenticity of the nominated property have not been met at this stage.

Boundaries

The boundaries of the nominated property and the buffer zone are the administrative boundaries of communities and settlements which, according to the State Party, have been defined over the centuries. They are based on the Presidential Decree for Zagori (1979, amended 1995), a legal designation for the protection of traditional villages built before 1923. The nominated property corresponds to Zone "A" of this Decree and the buffer zone to Zone "B", which together coincide with the administrative limits of the Municipality of Zagori.

Forty-six (sometimes counted as forty-five in the documentation provided by the State Party) traditional settlements located in both Zone "A" and Zone "B" are said to form part of the nominated property, however only twenty are included within its boundaries. In October 2022, ICOMOS requested a clarification regarding the number of traditional villages located within the nominated property, and the rationale used to select those considered to be attributes. Furthermore, the village of Skamnéli, which is listed in Zone "A" of the Decree, appears outside of the nominated property in the maps provided with the nomination dossier, while the village of Dipótamo, listed in Zone "B" of the Decree, appears within the boundaries of the nominated property.

In additional information provided in November 2022, the State Party clarified that only those villages located in Zone "A" of the Decree are part of the nominated property, being the best-preserved traditional villages. The traditional villages located in Zone "B" are included in the buffer zone because they were burned during the Second World War and have therefore lost their original characteristics and material. There are twenty-six settlements in the buffer zone that are protected as traditional villages in Zone "B" of the Decree.

In its Interim Report, ICOMOS recommended that the maps be corrected, and that Skamnéli, having been burned down in 1912 (as clarified by the State Party in February 2023) be included in the buffer zone. The State

Party provided new maps in February 2023, showing the twenty villages of Zone "A" of the Decree as being within the nominated property. ICOMOS considers that the inclusion of Skamnéli and Eláti in the nominated property needs to be reassessed by the State Party in consideration of their authenticity and integrity.

The State Party indicates that the nominated property is located within North Pindus National Park. The rationale for delineating the area of the nominated property is not explained, beyond having adopted the municipal administrative boundaries that correspond to the Presidential Decree. ICOMOS requested in October 2022 that the State Party clarify the reasons for selecting only a part of the National Park as the nominated property, and to confirm that no potential attributes are located in other areas of the National Park. The State Party replied in November 2022 that other natural attributes could be found outside the boundaries of the nominated property, but potential cultural attributes could not.

ICOMOS considers that the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti should be included in the buffer zone and not in the nominated area.

Evaluation of the proposed justification for inscription

In summary, ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis justifies consideration of the nominated property for the World Heritage List. Criterion (v) has been met, but criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi) have not been demonstrated, nor have the conditions of integrity and authenticity been demonstrated at this stage. The inclusion of Skamnéli and Eláti within the nominated property needs to be reassessed. ICOMOS further considers that the nominated property does not fall under the category of cultural landscapes.

4 Conservation measures and monitoring

Documentation

The State Party informs that the documentation related to the nominated property is held in a number of repositories. The Archaeological Cadastre is a national inventory of immovable heritage. Managed centrally by the Directorate for the Administration of the National Archive of Monuments, it includes documentation on 129 monuments and 11 historical and archaeological sites within the wider Zagori region. The Municipality of Zagori, the Service of Modern Monuments and Technical Works of Epirus, North Ionian and West Macedonia, and the Ministry of Culture and Sports maintain a survey of the state of conservation of the forty-six traditional villages included in the Presidential Decree for Zagori. The ninety-three stone bridges have been studied and documented by the Service of Modern Monuments and Technical Works of Epirus, North Ionian and West Macedonia. Religious buildings and residences included in cultural heritage inventories at the national or regional level have also been surveyed and documented, as has the rural heritage. especially the drystone structures. The full scope of this documentation has not been described in the nomination dossier.

These inventories could provide an initial baseline for the conservation and management of the various elements of the nominated property. ICOMOS considers that it would be important to centralise this information in an accessible database, with the objective of facilitating the holistic conservation and management of the nominated property.

Conservation measures

At present, individual approaches are taken for the conservation measures that are applied to each of the different traditional villages, houses, mansions, stone bridges, religious monuments, and rural heritage structures. A global approach for the entire nominated property is required to ensure conservation of the interconnections between the different attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value.

The State Party indicates that conservation works are necessary for the rural heritage, which is in disuse, and that funding for such works is not sufficient. Noting that traditional craftsmanship is an important characteristic of the traditional villages, ICOMOS in its Interim Report requested further information on how traditional practices and crafts are being sustained today, and how they will be sustained in the future. ICOMOS also asked the State Party to clarify what conservation measures are in place for the traditional buildings, including their interiors, ICOMOS considers that the limestone masonry is particularly vulnerable to erosion and needs preventive measures. The State Party responded in February 2023. explaining that a stone carving school is being planned in the nominated property, and that both exteriors and interiors of the traditional buildings are being conserved according to the current legislation.

While ICOMOS considers that a stone carving school could help the maintenance of the traditional building techniques and skills, there is a need to develop a holistic approach to the conservation of the nominated property and to produce a comprehensive conservation plan that integrates all existing conservation measures and programmes for the attributes that support the proposed Outstanding Universal Value.

Monitoring

The State Party proposes a series of quantitative indicators to monitor the state of conservation of the attributes of the nominated property. The findings will be followed up by the different institutions in charge of the different heritage elements at different levels of government (national, regional, municipal). ICOMOS considers that a holistic approach to monitoring the nominated property that considers the interrelations between the attributes needs to be elaborated, and that qualitative indicators should be included. Furthermore, it is recommended to include indicators that measure the evolution of the factors affecting the nominated property. ICOMOS considers that a centralised system for data gathering and processing is necessary, and that it be fully accessible to the institutions responsible for conserving and managing the nominated property.

ICOMOS considers that there is a need for centralised baseline documentation for all the attributes. All the existing individual conservation measures should be integrated into a single comprehensive conservation plan for the nominated property. Appropriate conservation measures are also needed, notably regarding traditional craftsmanship and limestone masonry. The monitoring system needs to be framed in a holistic way and be centralised for easy access by the managing institutions. ICOMOS considers that it would be advisable that the monitoring system is adapted for easy integration of its outcomes into the Periodic Reporting questionnaire.

5 Protection and management

Legal protection

The nominated property is protected under Law 3028/2002 "On the Protection of Antiquities and Cultural Heritage in General", which is the primary legal mechanism for the protection of cultural heritage in Greece. The Law is enforced by the Ministry of Culture and Sports by means of the corresponding Regional Service. Local responsibility lies with the Ephorate of Antiquities of Ioannina and its specialized departments for Prehistoric-Classical Antiquities and Byzantine Antiquities, and the Service of Modern Monuments and Technical Works of Epirus, North Ionian and West Macedonia.

The Presidential Decree for Zagori (1979, amended 1995) covers the traditional villages built before 1923 and encompasses the entirety of the Municipality of Zagori, dividing it into Zone "A" and Zone "B" according to the state of conservation and authenticity of the traditional architecture in the villages. This Decree also defines an Urban Control Zone that determines special conditions and building restrictions. It covers both the nominated property and the buffer zone. The Decree is implemented by the Town Planning Department of the Municipality of Zagori, which is in charge of issuing construction permits with the advice of the Ministry of Culture and Sports' competent Regional Services.

In its Interim Report, ICOMOS requested clarifications regarding the scope of the Presidential Decree, whether all buildings within the listed traditional villages are under legal protection, and whether this protection includes the interiors of the traditional buildings. The State Party responded in February 2023, clarifying that all buildings are protected by law, including current and new constructions. Buildings that are classified as monuments are protected in their entirety, including their interiors.

The Service of Modern Monuments and Technical Works of Epirus, North Ionian and West Macedonia advises on conservation and rescue interventions, and the Local Councils of Monuments of Epirus are scientific bodies that advise on issues concerning all monuments in the region.

The Ministry of Environment and Energy covers Landscapes of Outstanding Natural Beauty, traditional villages, listed buildings, and other structures such as fountains, paths, and bridges. Other bodies concerned with the built environment of the nominated property are the Building Department of the Municipality of Ioannina, the Architectural Councils of the Region of Epirus, and the Councils of Urban Issues and Disputes and Central Council of Architecture, which are involved in advising and approving larger projects.

About ninety-three percent of the Municipality of Zagori is located within North Pindus National Park, which was established under Law 1650/1986 "On the Protection of the Environment". The management body of the National Park is responsible for administering and managing this protected area. A number of other laws protect the natural values of the nominated property, including its forests, biodiversity, natural habitats, wild fauna, and flora. Furthermore, several areas of the nominated property are included in the NATURA 2000 network of protected areas of the European Union. The Vikos-Aoos UNESCO Global Geopark was established in 2010 and extends beyond the nominated property. The coordinating bodies for this designation are the Development Organization EPIRUS SA, the Region of Epirus, the Geological and Mining Research Authority, and the municipalities of Zagori and Konitsa. The Forestry Department is in charge of enforcing the Forest Code (Legislative Decree 86/1969) and Law 998/1979 "On the Protection of Forests and Forest Areas in General in the Country", which applies to the nominated property.

In relation to the intangible cultural heritage of the nominated property, "transhumance" was inscribed in the national inventory of Intangible Cultural Heritage in 2017 and on the UNESCO Representative List of Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2019 as "Transhumance, the seasonal droving of livestock along migratory routes in the Mediterranean and the Alps", submitted jointly with Italy and Austria. The "Art of dry-stone walling, knowledge and techniques" was inscribed in the same UNESCO Representative List in 2018, submitted jointly with France, Switzerland, Spain, Italy, Croatia, Cyprus, and Slovenia. The sacred forests of the villages of Zagori have been inscribed in the national inventory of Intangible Cultural Heritage since 2014.

Management system

The nominated property has a highly complex management system involving all levels of government from national to regional to municipal, as well as a diversity of institutions in charge of enforcing laws to protect cultural and natural heritage. An Independent Department for the Management of the Cultural Landscape under the Municipality of Zagori has been proposed to implement the proposed management plan, assisted by a Committee for the Preservation and Promotion of the Cultural Landscape that includes the Municipality of Zagori, the Region of Epirus, the Ephorate of Antiquities of Ioannina, the Service of Modern Monuments and Technical Works of Epirus, North Ionian and West Macedonia, the Forestry Department, the management body of North Pindus National Park, and the Development Organization EPIRUS SA, which will function as the Technical Secretariat.

In October 2022, ICOMOS requested further information on the timeframe for the establishment of the Independent Department and the Committee, and on the stage at which this process currently stands. In additional information provided in November 2022, the State Party indicated that these entities will be established in the event of an inscription. ICOMOS observes that local communities are not included in the proposed Committee. It considers that a Committee that includes relevant rights-holders and stakeholders is necessary, due to the complexity of the nominated property and its ownership.

Furthermore, ICOMOS notes that different designations such as the National Park and the UNESCO Global Geopark need close coordination to achieve a harmonised management of the natural and cultural values of the nominated property. ICOMOS asked the State Party in October 2022 whether a coordination platform was planned between the UNESCO Global Geopark and the nominated property. In additional information submitted in November 2022, the State Party informed that both designations will be managed by the same organisations, namely, the Region of Epirus and the Municipality of Zagori.

An operating management plan does not yet exist but one has been proposed. It aims at harmonising all current land uses in the nominated property, including those related to agriculture, livestock raising, tourism, and forestry, with the objective of protecting the cultural and natural heritage of the nominated property. The proposed management plan intends to balance the protection of heritage, its utilisation, and the sustainable development of the area. The plan presents a "SWOT" (Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats) analysis, a strategic vision for the nominated property, and five principles that are broken down into a table of actions. ICOMOS considers that the proposed plan presents an exhaustive inventory of intentions for the nominated property, and that its implementation will require financial programming and a detailed timetable.

ICOMOS also considers that the proposed management plan needs to include a Local Master Plan based on a comprehensive conservation plan (including detailed studies of the built heritage) that addresses the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. In October 2022, ICOMOS requested further information regarding the approval of the proposed management plan and whether it would have a legal status. The State Party clarified in November 2022 that the proposed management plan is a binding document, that it was approved by both the Municipal Council of Zagori and the Regional Council of Epirus, and that it will be implemented in the event of an inscription. The Regional Spatial Framework of the Epirus Region (2018) deals with the management of cultural and natural heritage in the region, and applies to the nominated property. Zagori is defined as a traditional rural area with potential for tourism development.

The National Strategy for Climate Change Adaptation (2016) aims to strengthen the resilience of the country to climate change. In this context, the Regional Plan of the Region of Epirus for the Adaptation to Climate Change (2019) proposes measures that are applicable in the nominated property, especially referring to agriculture, livestock, and tourism.

ICOMOS notes that natural reforestation endangers the traditional villages located within the nominated property, particularly in light of recent wildfires across the Mediterranean. The management plan at present does not state protocols or actions that can recover the agropastoral landscape (managed forests, meadows, and agriculture) or mitigate fire hazards (both preventive and responsive mitigation). ICOMOS considers that a specific risk preparedness and disaster risk management strategy for the nominated property needs to be integrated into the proposed management plan. In this regard, the integration of traditional and local knowledge about sustainable land use techniques and disaster mitigation should be encouraged.

Based on the Presidential Decree, pre-approval and an Environmental Impact Study are required for new projects and renovations in the areas outside the traditional settlements, as well as approval by the Committee for Urban Planning and Architectural Control.

Visitor management

The nominated property has established visitor management strategies for the National Park and the UNESCO Global Geopark. ICOMOS notes that there is no central tourism office. Several points of information do exist, notably the information centres in the National Park and the Geopark. ICOMOS considers that a general interpretation centre for the nominated property would be useful to present the nominated property in a more holistic way. ICOMOS also notes that some visitor infrastructure (parking lots, for example) in the traditional villages need better planning in order to accommodate a possible increase in the number of visitors.

ICOMOS considers that a property-specific tourism strategy needs to be created. It should be based on a scientifically determined carrying capacity for the nominated property, and avoid negative impacts on the proposed Outstanding Universal Value created by tourism development and visitors. Furthermore, ICOMOS considers that it would be important to develop training for guides, and potentially hospitality training to reinforce capacities in the local population that could also lead to youth involvement.

Community involvement

According to the State Party, a participatory process was used in the preparation of the proposed management plan. In additional information provided in November 2022, the State Party clarified that the different cultural groups (the Sarakatsani and the Vlach) who are part of the community of residents of the traditional villages have been informed about the nomination process. Details on how these groups have been involved in the development of the proposed management plan and the interpretation of the nominated property were not provided. Nevertheless, the elected officials of the Municipal Council of Zagori and Regional Council of Epirus can be considered as representing the local communities.

Effectiveness of the protection and management of the nominated property

In summary, ICOMOS considers that the protection of the nominated property is comprehensive, including laws applying to natural, cultural, and intangible attributes. ICOMOS notes that many actors are involved, rendering the management system very complex. In that regard, ICOMOS considers it necessary to strengthen the management system by establishing a coordination platform involving all institutions and levels of implementation, including local communities, rightsholders, and other stakeholders. ICOMOS considers that in addition, the proposed management plan for the nominated property requires financial programming and a detailed timetable, a Local Master Plan based on a comprehensive conservation plan, as well as a property-specific tourism strategy. Furthermore, a specific risk preparedness and disaster risk management strategy for the nominated property needs to be integrated into the proposed management plan. In this regard, the integration of traditional and local knowledge about sustainable land use techniques and disaster mitigation should be encouraged.

6 Conclusion

Zagori Cultural Landscape is a testimony to the formation and decline of an agropastoral landscape that developed as a result of investments in private and public infrastructure made by its diaspora during the 18th and 19th centuries. This infrastructure included a network of stone-arched bridges, stone cobbled paths, and stone staircases that connected small rural settlements to form a political and social unit within this mountainous region. The *Zagorochoria* or Zagori villages are an exceptional example of a traditional settlement pattern that represents this distinctive culture. Combining natural and cultural elements, the settlements developed a tradition of limestone masonry that persists but is highly vulnerable to irreversible change due to socio-cultural and environmental pressures.

ICOMOS appreciates the work carried out by the State Party to prepare this nomination and to provide informative additional information. ICOMOS considers that none of the criteria proposed by the State Party have been demonstrated, but that the nominated property meets criterion (v), which was not proposed. However, some important aspects of the nomination require further attention.

ICOMOS considers that systematic information about the traditional architecture in the villages that are included in the nominated property needs to be assembled in order to establish a centralised documentation for all the individual attributes in order to create a baseline for conservation and management. The current collection of individual conservation measures should be integrated into a single comprehensive conservation plan for the whole nominated property. Issues have been identified regarding the integrity and authenticity of some traditional villages that are included within the nominated property and that would require a redefinition of the boundaries and buffer zone. In this regard, ICOMOS recommends including the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti in the buffer zone, rather than in the nominated property.

Concerning the category of the nominated property, ICOMOS considers that the requirements of cultural landscapes have not been fully met, since the processes, relationships, and dynamic functions that are essential to a cultural landscape and its distinctive character are no longer maintained in a robust state. The material forms of its significant distinguishing features such as terraces and drystone walls have largely been abandoned and many of the meadows and agricultural areas have been taken over by forests. Agropastoral practices have also diminished significantly.

The management system needs a coordination platform and mechanisms, given the numerous designations, institutions, and levels of implementation that overlap with the nominated property. The proposed management plan needs to include financial programming, a detailed timetable, and a Local Master Plan based on a comprehensive conservation plan. Considering the factors affecting the nominated property, particularly depopulation, tourist pressures, reforestation, and climate change, both a tourist strategy and a risk preparedness and disaster risk management strategy need to be included in the proposed management plan, as well as a sustainability strategy that addresses the continuity of traditional masonry and building techniques and skills, all of which are essential for the long-term maintenance and conservation of the traditional villages.

7 Recommendations

ICOMOS recommends that the World Heritage Committee adopts the following draft recommendations, noting that this will be harmonised as appropriate with the draft recommendations of IUCN regarding their evaluation of this mixed site nomination under the natural criteria and included in the working document WHC/23/45.COM/8B.

Recommendations with respect to inscription

ICOMOS recommends that the nomination of Zagori Cultural Landscape, Greece, be **referred back** to the State Party in order to allow it to:

- Consider including the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti in the buffer zone;
- Prepare documentation on the traditional villages and traditional buildings within the nominated property to create a baseline for the conservation and management of the property as a whole;
- Develop a comprehensive conservation plan that considers the stone-arched bridges, the historical paths and staircases, and the traditional villages in a holistic way;
- Develop a coordination platform and mechanisms for the management of the nominated property, taking into consideration other designations, institutions, and levels of implementation that overlap with the property;
- Include within the proposed management plan a financial programming, a detailed timetable, and a Local Master Plan based on a comprehensive conservation plan;
- Develop a mechanism and opportunities for local communities, rights-holders, and other stakeholders to participate in the management of the nominated property;
- Develop a risk preparedness and disaster risk management strategy;
- Develop a tourism strategy that takes into account the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the property, and determine scientifically its carrying capacity;
- Develop a sustainability strategy for the traditional masonry and building techniques and skills in order to maintain the traditional villages over the long term.

ICOMOS further considers that the name of the nominated property should be be changed to better reflect its cultural values: "*Zagorochoria*, the traditional villages of Zagori".



Revised map showing the boundaries of the nominated property (February 2023)