

45 COM

WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3 Paris, 8 September 2023 Original: English

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

INTERGOVERNMENTAL COMMITTEE FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

Extended forty-fifth session Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia 10-25 September 2023

Item 7B of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of properties inscribed on the of World Heritage List

Summary

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. The full reports of Reactive Monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language: http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/45COM/documents

All previous state of conservation reports will be available through the World Heritage State of conservation Information System at the following Web address: http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc

<u>Decision required</u>: The World Heritage Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

Note: For each section, the reports are presented in the English alphabetical order of States Parties

TABLE OF CONTENT

1.	WOR	ORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD TAGE COMMITTEE IN 2022	2
CUL	ΓURAL	PROPERTIES	2
	ASIA A	AND PACIFIC	2
	44.	Bagan (Myanmar) (C 1588)	2
II.		ORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE	
		LD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD TAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023	. 7
CUL	HER		
	HERI TURAL	TAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023	7
	HERI TURAL ASIA	TAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023	7 7 ing
	HERI FURAL ASIA A 167.	TAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023 PROPERTIES AND PACIFIC Sites of Japan's Meiji Industrial Revolution: Iron and Steel, Shipbuilding and Coal Mini	7 7 ing 7

I. REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE IN 2022

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

ASIA AND PACIFIC

44. Bagan (Myanmar) (C 1588)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2019

Criteria (iii)(iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger N/A

Previous Committee Decisions see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1588/documents/

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1588/assistance/

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

Factors identified at the time of inscription of the property:

- · Boundaries to be revised
- Tourism infrastructure developments
- · Possible expansion of Bagan Airport
- Illegal constructions

Illustrative material see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1588/

Current conservation issues

On 24 November 2021, a report on the state of conservation was submitted, which is available at http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1588/documents/ and provides updates on a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at the time of the inscription of the property (Baku, 2019), as follows:

- The Bagan National Coordinating Committee (BAGANCOM), the Mandalay Region Cultural Heritage Preservation Committee, the Steering Committee for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage in Bagan World Heritage Area and the Executive Committee and Cultural Sub-Committee on Cultural Heritage Preservation in Bagan World Heritage Area have been formally established;
- Administrative requirements for revisions to the boundaries of components 6 and 7 and to the buffer zone for component 4 have been completed, alongside the installation of boundary markers for the property and buffer zone (including removal of redundant markers associated with earlier designations);

- Research into Bagan's historical water management system continues;
- Progress towards the completion of the 'One Map' initiative has been made, including
 consolidation of records and maps into a single system, staff training, monument inventory and
 grading, verification of ownership and land management data, assessment of available geospatial
 data and development of site management systems;
- Progress has been made on the Archaeological Risk Map, which should be completed for the property, buffer zone and wider setting by 2025;
- The Bagan International Coordinating Committee (BICC) has adopted 'Requirements of International Organizations', which will be further elaborated by the Department of Archaeology and National Museum (DANM) into draft criteria for projects;
- The Building By-Law (2020) was adopted, establishing permit requirements for different types of buildings (including design, materials, area, uses, services and height limits) and requirements for signage;
- More than 90 Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) were completed between 2014 and 2021, along with HIA training. HIAs have been incorporated into the Cultural Heritage Regions Law (2019);
- A 'Bagan Hotel Strategy Scoping Study' was completed in 2020;
- Revisions to the Tourism Strategy are planned in light of the COVID-19 pandemic as part of the Myanmar Tourism Revitalization Roadmap (2021-2025);
- Activities to provide professional development to staff of BAGANCOM and other relevant institutions and communities continue, including consideration of a 'National Training Strategy' and 'National Conservation/Management Strategy for Cultural Heritage';
- Monitoring activities are carried out, including remote sensing recording and 3D scanning, which feed into the site management database systems;
- Collection of data for the Bagan Disaster Risk Management Strategy has commenced, with the support of the World Bank;
- The Bagan Agriculture Sector Strategy has been completed and the Bagan Agricultural Strategic Planning Committee established;
- Progress is reported with the removal of illegal buildings.

In January 2021, information was provided about road construction and tree planting within the property, in response to a request from the World Heritage Centre in October 2020. This information included an HIA and was the subject of an ICOMOS Technical Review in November 2021, which identified a range of concerns.

In May 2023, media reported that the property has been affected by tropical cyclone Mocha, which formed over the southern Bay of Bengal and notably hit Myanmar. At the time of writing this report, UNESCO is determining whether the cyclone or any follow-up actions may have caused potential negative impacts on the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), notably through the UNESCO Office in Bangkok and its antenna in Myanmar,

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

Progress is to be commended in implementing many of the Committee's recommendations made at the time of inscription in 2019. It is acknowledged that the conditions arising from the COVID-19 pandemic have been a significant factor, creating new challenges as well as slowing progress, particularly in relation to tourism management.

It is suggested that the Committee welcome the revisions to the Cultural Heritage Regions Law (2019) and the Building By-Law (2020), the formal establishment of BAGANCOM and other key coordinating entities in the management system, and the completion of the formal revisions to the boundaries and buffer zone that were recommended when the property was inscribed. However, the Advisory Bodies and World Heritage Centre consider that the key coordinating mechanisms are not yet fully operating as intended. BAGANCOM and other committees have been established but have not met regularly, and the Bagan ICC has been affected by the non-engagement of a number of cooperating countries. The Bagan ICC expert site visits have not been able to function as effectively as intended. The Integrated

Management Framework (IMF) is due for review in 2024, providing an opportunity to evaluate its effectiveness and strengthen its operations.

Planning for sustainable post-COVID-19 tourism management is critically important and should proceed now that the formal structures of governance are established. The Committee's recommendations concerning a Hotels Strategy, carrying capacity evaluation, Sustainable Tourism Strategy and liaison with tourism industry representatives should be given renewed priority.

The ongoing efforts regarding research, consolidation of data collection, professional development and site monitoring are noted, and continued work is encouraged. The timetable for completion of the Archaeological Risk Management Plan is also noted, although the rationale for the intention to excavate 140 newly identified mounds should be subject to the research strategies outlined in the IMF.

Noting that collaboration with universities and foundations in Myanmar and other countries has been effective in furthering important initiatives, the importance of agreements that ensure alignment with the IMF and encourage continued work to formalise the involvement of international collaborators and partners should be emphasised. Professional development for cultural heritage management should be further implemented, and efforts to inform and enhance awareness of cultural heritage management by working with religious bodies and the youth be commended.

The regular use of HIA is also commendable, although the November 2021 ICOMOS Technical Review identified some significant methodological shortcomings that should be urgently addressed, including the need to allow for sufficient time in advance of the commencement of works for the HIA to be conducted, while the options of taking mitigating actions or cancelling the works are still entirely feasible.

For the road project, the HIA was submitted following the completion of the project and the Technical Review identified concerns about damage to a heritage building and potential impacts on archaeological materials. The tree planting project was approximately half-completed before being halted upon receipt of the World Heritage Centre's correspondence. The Technical Review identified issues with the proximity of some plantings to heritage structures, the impacts on archaeological deposits, and the selection of non-native plant types, in clear contradiction to the Management Plan. ICOMOS also noted that the HIA had identified a range of impacts on the OUV of the property, but that the project was allowed to proceed without the required modifications or reconsideration.

Both projects indicate an apparent incompatibility with the policies outlined in the Management Plan, and thus raise questions regarding the effectiveness of the property's management system. It is suggested that additional capacity-building activities should be organised to deepen awareness of the provisions of the Management Plan among decision makers and ensure their appropriate implementation.

The Technical Review further identified concerns about the interpretation of 'reversibility' in relation to impacts on archaeological resources and advised that greater attention should be paid to potential impacts on the visual setting. These examples reinforce the importance of completing the Archaeological Risk mapping.

In relation to changes to the Bagan-Nyaung Oo Airport, the findings are considered inconclusive, particularly in relation to the construction and operation phases, suggesting the need for further HIA studies. Further development of HIA capacity is required so that the full range of impacts on the attributes of the property are considered, including, but not limited to, the impacts on archaeological resources, the condition of heritage structures and the visual setting.

Draft Decision: 45 COM 7B.44

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,
- 2. Recalling Decision 43 COM 8B.20, adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the significant efforts that have been made towards implementing the recommendations it made at the time of the property's inscription on the World Heritage List:

- 4. <u>Expresses its sympathy</u> to the people of Myanmar, who have been affected by a tropical cyclone in May 2023, <u>notes with concern</u> that the cyclone may have affected the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and <u>emphasizes</u> that a number of emergency assistance mechanisms are available under the Convention to assist, if needed:
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the revisions to the boundaries of components 6 and 7 and to the buffer zone of component 4, the installation of boundary markers for the property components and buffer zone, and the completion of the registration and grading of all monuments located in the property and its buffer zone;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the adoption of the Cultural Heritage Regions Law (2019), the Building By-Law (2020), and the formal establishment of the Bagan National Coordinating Committee (BAGANCOM) and other coordinating mechanisms for the management system, and <u>encourages</u> a review of the effectiveness and operations of the governance structures and the operation of the Integrated Management Framework as part of the planned 5-year review in 2024;
- 7. <u>Acknowledges</u> that progress in relation to some of the Committee's recommendations has been affected by recent and current conditions, including the COVID-19 pandemic, and that this has had a major impact on the operation of the governance arrangements, research planning and tourism;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the continuation of further progress with all actions identified at the time of inscription, and especially with:
 - Regular meetings of the Bagan International Coordinating Committee (BICC) and the development of formal agreements with all international missions working at Bagan,
 - b) The Bagan Sustainable Tourism Strategy, including post-COVID-19 considerations.
 - c) Develop the Bagan Hotel Strategy in consultation with ICOMOS and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre and based on the Bagan Hotel Strategy Scoping Study (2020), identifying zones within which hotels can be located and ensuring that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) are undertaken before any new hotel development or expansion is undertaken,
 - d) The Bagan Disaster Risk Management Strategy, ensuring that it is associated with the monitoring system and responsive to damages arising from identified pressures, such as weather events,
 - e) The Archaeological Risk Management Strategy for the property, buffer zone and wider setting,
 - f) Capacity-building and framework development for Impact Assessments, in conformity with the new Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage context, and conducting further HIA studies for the Bagan-Nyaung Oo Airport project once the planning stage is further advanced;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> the ongoing efforts regarding research, consolidation of data collection, professional development and site monitoring, and <u>also encourages</u> continued progress with the 'One Map' initiative, archaeological research and data collection, the development of a monitoring system based on inventories of the tangible and intangible attributes of Bagan, and the implementation of the Bagan Agriculture Sector Strategy;
- 10. <u>Notes</u> the conclusions and concerns identified in ICOMOS Technical Review of the road construction and tree planting program within the boundaries of the World Heritage property, and <u>requests</u>:

- an archaeological report on the ground disturbance caused by the recent road works and tree planting, in accordance with the ICOMOS Technical Review, including an analysis of taphonomy, soil profiles and any artefacts exposed by the works,
- a landscape study that characterizes the landscape during key historical phases to assist with the identification of appropriate tree species for future greening programmes;
- 11. <u>Reminds</u> the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for evaluation by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information on any ongoing and future works, including any restoration works for damage occurring within the property or its buffer zone that may affect the OUV of the property, along with any associated Impact Assessments, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the submission to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, of an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

II. REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

ASIA AND PACIFIC

167. Sites of Japan's Meiji Industrial Revolution: Iron and Steel, Shipbuilding and Coal Mining (Japan) (C 1484)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2015

Criteria (ii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger N/A

Previous Committee Decisions see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1484/documents/

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1484/assistance/

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Management systems / Management Plan (Lack of a detailed conservation work programme for Hashima Island; Need to develop a prioritised conservation work programme for the property and its component sites and an implementation programme) (issue resolved)
- Impacts of tourism / visitor / recreation (Visitor levels)
- Management activities; Human resources (Lack of a training programme for all staff and stakeholders responsible for the day-to-day management of each component) (issue resolved)
- Interpretative and visitation facilities; Management systems/Management Plan (Lack of an adequate interpretive strategy for the presentation of the property); Harmonised interpretation facilities required at each relevant component site
- Ground transport infrastructure (Road construction projects at Shuseikan and Mietsu Naval Dock) (issue resolved)
- Marine transport infrastructure (New anchorage facility at Miike Port) (issue resolved)
- Major visitor accommodation and associated infrastructure (Proposals for the upgrade or development of visitor facilities)

Illustrative material see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1484/

Current conservation issues

On 30 November 2022, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, as requested in Decision **44 COM 7B.30** (Fuzhou/online, 2021). The report can be found at https://whc.unesco.org/document/197355 and addresses the Committee's previous requests as follows:

- The State Party carries out interpretation in line with the 2017 Interpretation Strategy and its subsequent revisions, undertaken at the request of the World Heritage Committee since the time of inscription. The State Party considers that the current Interpretation Strategy provides a sound basis for interpreting the full history of the property and is working on harmonising interpretation at all component sites of the property, in line with the current displays of the Industrial Heritage Information Center (IHIC) established in Tokyo;
- The State Party indicates that extensive research about Koreans in Japan before, during and after World War II (WWII) is ongoing, as well as on the Japanese policy of requisition. The report highlights that, in order to be considered, historical documents and oral testimonies must be further verified:
- The IHIC will also play the role of an archive, especially for individual testimonies. Work in this regard is ongoing and the State Party of Japan will introduce new information into updated interpretation;
- The State Party highlights the harshness of mining environments for all workers at Meiji industrial sites:
- The State Party indicates that regular discussions are held at the national level, including with domestic and foreign experts and visitors at the IHIC, and that it will continue the dialogue it has been conducting to date with the governments of the concerned States Parties, including the Republic of Korea;
- The report also contains exhaustive information on the World Heritage Route created to incite visitors to visit several component sites, along with updates on Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) carried out at different component sites for projects that were not considered likely to affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in the Kagoshima, Miike, Nagasaki and Yawata areas.

The State Party's report focuses on the points raised in Decision **44 COM 7B.30**, especially paragraphs 6 and 7.

On 17 August 2023, the State Party sent a letter inviting the World Heritage Centre to visit the Industrial Heritage Information Centre in Tokyo where new interpretation measures have been taken subsequent to the submission of the State of Conservation Report and aiming to further implement the previous decisions of the World Heritage Committee. A mission of the Director of World Heritage took place on 24 August 2023.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The State Party has made significant efforts towards the on-site, off-site and digital interpretation of the sites, and it should be encouraged to further implement and periodically review the 2017 Interpretation Strategy. The statement made by the State Party at the time of inscription (see the Summary Records at https://whc.unesco.org/document/138489, p. 222) indicated a commitment to reflecting the "full history" of the property and its component sites, including outside of the 'OUV period' (1850-1910), which was echoed by the subsequent decisions of the World Heritage Committee.

It is noteworthy that, following the Committee's encouragements, the State Party has organised consultations with all stakeholders, including with the Republic of Korea. Bilateral meetings are taking place, that appeared to have resulted in some progress to date in view of continuing reflecting the full history of the property.

During the visit held in Tokyo and to the Industrial Heritage Information Centre on 24 August, the Director of World Heritage was able to acknowledge the implementation of the following new measures:

- 1) Establishment of a new section in "Zone 3" entitled "To remember the victims" within the Tokyo Industrial Heritage Information Centre. This new section includes:
 - A QR-code linked to the video of the 2015 World Heritage Committee decision, thus allowing direct access to statements made by both Japan and Korea at the time of the inscription of the site.
 - Illustration of the harsh conditions through the display of (i) "Monthly security reports" and (ii) "Security Logbooks" documenting the number of fatalities among Koreans who died at Hashima Coal Mine in war time.

- 2) QR code linked to the video of the 2015 World Heritage Committee is included in Zone 1 of the Tokyo Industrial Heritage Information Centre;
- 3) The State Party has informed that interpretation tools and information will be consolidated within all visitors' centres, and will ensure that:
 - QR-code is displayed in the 8 visitors centres, which covers all the 23 component parts of
 the site, thus allowing visitors to access the website of the IHIC and the video of the 2015
 World Heritage Committee; clarifying interlinkages between component parts, consistent
 with enhanced interpretation strategy;
- 4) Upgrading of the open stacks with extensive and diverse materials collected for research and analysis was visible. This includes:
 - A looping slideshow of introductory information about (i) fatalities inside the Hashima Coal Mine; (ii) Applications for Cremation Permit Issuance of workers from the Korean Peninsula.
 - Inclusion of a selection of 8 new books about the best practices in terms of interpretation strategy of heritage sites incorporated.

The State Party informed that "Application for Cremation Permit Issuance" will also be displayed if the original and authentic copy is provided.

5) Incorporation of artworks as a measure to shed light on harsh conditions and to remember the victims, which will be pursued via annual special exhibitions at the Industrial Heritage Information Centre.

Furthermore, the State Party informed of its commitment to continue enhancing the interpretation strategy of the site, in particular through research, data collection and verification, including regarding new testimonies. In this regard, dialogue with the Republic of Korea and other concerned parties will be continued. Furthermore, a series of talks involving international experts will be organized at the Tokyo Industrial Heritage Information Centre.

Concerning the HIAs commissioned by the State Party for several infrastructure projects, it is noted that proposed works were considered not to have any significant impact on the relevant component sites in the Kagoshima, Nagasaki and Yawata areas, which was also reflected in the ICOMOS technical reviews of October and December 2021. It is also noted that a prioritised implementation schedule for conservation works is in place, in line with the "Conservation Work Programmes and Implementation Programmes" for each component part, and especially that an alternative proposal will be developed for the "anchorage for small vessels" planned at Miike Port, in order to avoid any damage to the OUV of the property.

In conclusion, the State Party has invested significant efforts and resources into responding to the Committee's requests, and progressed in delivering on its commitments which should be recognized. These efforts should continue in order to further enhance the interpretation measures of the site.

Draft Decision: 45 COM 7B.167

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decisions **39 COM 8B.14**, **42 COM 7B.10** and **44 COM 7B.30**, adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the implementation by the State Party of the new set of measures as confirmed by the verification mission carried out by the World Heritage Centre;
- 4. <u>Considers</u> that the State Party has taken several additional steps in view of responding to the requests outlined in its Decision **44 COM 7B.30**;

- 5. <u>Acknowledges</u> the State Party's efforts in implementing the World Heritage Convention and <u>underlines</u> the importance for the State Party to continue the implementation of its commitments in order to enhance furthermore the overall interpretation strategy of the site;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue dialogue with the concerned State Parties as well as to conduct further research, data collection and verification, including regarding new testimonies to enhance the interpretation strategy of the site;
- 7. Requests the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any new measures that may be taken in the future with regards to the interpretation strategy of this site and to submit an update on the continued dialogue with the concerned State Parties, as well as on further measures to enhance the interpretation strategy of the site, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, by 1 December 2024.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

181. Venetian Works of Defence between 15th and 17th centuries: Stato da Terra – western Stato da Mar (Croatia, Italy, Montenegro) (C 1533)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2017

Criteria (iii) (iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger N/A

Previous Committee Decisions see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1533/documents/

International Assistance

Requests approved: 0

Total amount approved: USD 0

For details, see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1533/assistance/

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

NI/A

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Lack of management plans for each component
- Lack of a framework for Heritage Impact Assessment for development proposals
- Need to revise the buffer zones
- Intrusive and redundant elements within the serial components
- · Lack of a Tourism Carrying Capacity study and of visitor management plans
- Lack of a transnational values-based conservation strategy

Illustrative material see page https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1533/

Current conservation issues

On 30 November 2022, the States Parties submitted a joint report on the state of conservation of this serial transnational property, which is available at https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1533/documents. Progress on a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- Tourism related carrying capacity studies have been completed for all components. Several components have commenced drafting visitor management plans;
- Brief information and a map were provided for the planned extensions to the buffer zone for Peschiera del Garda. The definition of the buffer zone extension to Kotor is ongoing and arguments are presented to explain why an extension of the buffer zone for Zadar is not necessary;
- A common Local Management Plan format has been developed for application to all components, and a summary has been provided for the St. Nicholas Fortress in Šibenik has been provided. The Local Management Plan for the St. Nicholas Fortress in Šibenik includes a Visitor's Management Plan. In parallel, an Action Plan for visitor management was developed for the significant landscape Kanal-Luka. The Local Management Plans for Zadar, Kotor, Bergamo and Peschiera del Garda are in preparation;
- Major conservation projects are reported including at Bergamo, Peschiera del Garda and Šibenik, for which detailed documentation was provided related to the second phase of the reconstruction and renovation of the St. Nicholas Fortress;

- Various conservation and maintenance works in Zadar, Bergamo, Peschiera del Garda, and Palmanova are briefly described;
- The States Parties have initiated transnational research and values-based strategies for the conservation, promotion and interpretation of the property. A foundation of experts linked to the Municipal Council of Bergamo has been appointed by the International Coordination Group (ICG) to take charge of transnational research and scientific valorisation of the property. Several activities have been carried out in this area, such as the commissioning of a technological study by the Public Institution Nature of Šibenik-Knin County for the procurement of masonry units (bricks) shared between all the components through the ICG;
- The ICG meets regularly and is working on joint approaches to management planning, promotion and interpretation strategies for the serial property, including education programmes;
- The ICG is continuing to develop a shared approach and framework for Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), taking into account the *Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context*, released in 2022 by UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies;
- In Zadar, the project to remove 157 car parking spaces has been completed and transformed into 785 meters promenade;
- For Kotor, the States Parties advise that the development provisions of the approved Spatial Urban Plan will be implemented by requiring HIAs and that they will transmit the design proposals to the World Heritage Centre, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- Documentation provided for several projects identified in Decision 44 COM 7B.43, includes the
 renewal of the Citadela Bastion (Zadar), which is unlikely to proceed due to technical difficulties;
 the Ravnice Urban Plan/Gates of Zadar (Zadar buffer zone), which is at the conceptual stage and
 will be followed by an urban development plan and conservation study; Visitor Centre at Minerska
 Bay (Šibenik), which has already been confirmed; and redevelopment and rehabilitation of the
 aqueduct's piezometric tower and surrounding area in Palmanova;
- An HIA was underway for the Fara parking project in Bergamo. The HIA and the design plans were to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the end of February 2023.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The harmonised approach in managing the serial, transnational property should be acknowledged, and the States Parties encouraged to continue to work on these processes with the coordination of the ICG.

The completion of tourism-related carrying capacity studies for each component is welcomed. They will serve as useful baseline studies to inform the visitor management plans which are still under development. The States Parties should be encouraged to complete these plans as a matter of high priority.

Limited progress has been made to address the Committee's recommendations regarding the extensions of buffer zones. The proposed extension for Peschiera del Garda needs to be finalised and submitted as a minor boundary modification as soon as practicable. In 2019, the States Parties argued that the enlargement of the buffer zone for Zadar was not necessary, but no rationale was provided. In 2022, they argue that this is unnecessary in relation to the Ravnice Urban Plan/Gates of Zadar project located within the already existing buffer zone. However, the recommendation to extend the buffer zone at the time of the inscription arouse from various potential impacts on the visual integrity of the component part, in light of the potential impacts of nearby developments (Decision 41 COM 8B.21) and highlighted by the 2007 architectural competition which extended beyond the current buffer zone boundary. The States Parties report that the process of revising and enlarging the buffer zone in Kotor is ongoing.

The ICG put in place a common approach to developing the Local Management Plans, and progress has been made in the identification of attributes of individual components. A summary is provided for a combined Local Management Plan and Visitor Management Plan for St. Nicholas Fortress in Šibenik, which briefly mentions a range of significant future interventions, but provides insufficient insight into how these might impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property. The Action Plan for the Management of Visitors to the Significant Landscape in Šibenik is a substantial document for the natural protected area in which the St. Nicholas Fortress is located. However, it has not been provided in one of the working languages of the Committee (other than a translated Table of Contents), which makes it difficult to assess its relevance and attention to the requirements of World Heritage protection and

management. Brief information is also provided on the Local Management Plan for Zadar, Bergamo and Peschiera del Garda, where similar problems seem to be arising. Despite the reported progress, it is worrying to note that the development of local management plans, which are fundamental elements of the management system, has still not been completed. These plans would provide a values-based framework for future decision-making for each component, and States Parties should be strongly encouraged to finalise this task.

Progress related to transnational research and values-based strategies for the conservation, promotion and interpretation of the property are to be welcomed, and States Parties should be encouraged to develop, as a result of the research, a transnational values-based conservation strategy for the property. Despite the regular coordination work of the States Parties through meetings and the work undertaken by the ICG, the States Parties do not provide information on monitoring arrangements for the state of conservation and management of the serial property as a whole.

Concerning the Committee's recommendations on specific development projects in Decision 44 COM 7B.43, the provision of information on the project is appreciated, although the annexes to the report for the projects in Zadar have not been provided in one of the Committee's working languages (English or French), making it impossible to comment at this stage. Regarding the Citadela Bastion (Zadar) renovation project, it is noted that it is unlikely that the project will continue, but if there is a future plan for this site, it is recommended that the project material be provided for technical review by the Advisory Bodies at an early stage in its planning. With regard to the Ravnice Urban Plan/Gates of Zadar (Zadar buffer zone), it is noted that the project is at a conceptual stage, yet this is precisely the stage at which a HIA should be conducted, and the State Party of Croatia should be invited to submit relevant material in English or French for a technical review by the Advisory Bodies, before the planning stages are finalised. Regarding the Visitor Centre, coffee bar and sanitary facilities at Minerska Bay (Šibenik), the reports, which are only partly translated into one of the Committee's working languages, suggest that the projects have already been finalised and confirmed by the competent national authority without first being submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies. The redevelopment and rehabilitation of an area of Palmanova, including the reuse of the water tower, should be assessed through an HIA, and the design plans submitted together with the HIA report to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any irreversible decisions are taken.

For the planned car park project in Bergamo, the State Party of Italy is to be reminded of the Committee's previous request to submit the final design and other requested documents, including the HIA, to the World Heritage Centre before final decisions are made.

Each of these cases demonstrates the urgent need for the States Parties to put in place adequate measures to carry out HIAs for all changes and projects that potentially have an impact on the attributes and the OUV of the property, and to implement the procedure included in Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.

Draft Decision: 45 COM 7B.181

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decisions **41 COM 8B.21** and **44 COM 7B.43**, adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties on their support for the International Coordinating Group (ICG) and its ongoing and important efforts to establish coordinated reporting and processes for carrying capacity studies, local management plans, visitor management plans, transnational research, conservation and interpretation strategies;
- Notes the completion of the carrying capacity studies for each component and the progress made in relation to coordinated promotion and educational activities for the transnational property;

- 5. <u>Also notes</u> that information and documentation on the four projects identified in the Committee's previous decision have been provided, and <u>recommends</u> that more detailed project information and documentation as well as Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) focusing on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and the attributes that underpin it be submitted by the respective States Parties to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, prior to the implementation of:
 - a) the renewal of the Citadela Bastion project (Zadar), if it is planned to resume in the future,
 - b) the Ravnice Urban Plan project/Gates of Zadar,
 - c) the Visitor Centre at Minerska Bay (Šibenik),
 - d) the urban redevelopment and rehabilitation project of a section of Palmanova, including the water tower reuse proposal;
- 6. Reminds the State Party of Italy of its previous request to comply with the recommendations of ICOMOS concerning the Fara parking project and, in particular, to submit as a matter of urgency the HIA requested by the World Heritage Centre in a letter dated 8 January 2020 and to develop a comprehensive plan for parking infrastructure and traffic control to reduce traffic and to reduce or ration car parking opportunities in the Upper City of Bergamo for non-residents in this part of the town;
- 7. <u>Requests</u> the States Parties, individually and through the ICG, to continue to complete and finalise the work in progress on the Committee's previous requests, including:
 - a) Finalising, as an urgent priority, visitor management plans based on the completed carrying capacity studies;
 - b) Revising and enlarging the buffer zones as specified for the components of Zadar, Kotor and Peschiera del Garda, and submitting these as minor boundary modifications according to Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines;
 - c) Establishing, as an urgent priority, a common template for local conservation and management plans, based on the property's OUV and the identification of the attributes of each component, and finalise them for each component,
 - d) Developing values-based, transnational conservation, promotion and interpretation strategy for the whole property;
 - e) Finalising monitoring arrangements for the whole property;
 - f) Finalising, as an urgent priority, a coordinated and harmonised approach to HIA, based on the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage Context.
 - g) Ensuring that all future changes that may affect the OUV of the property are subject to formal HIA processes prior to their approval, including tourism infrastructure and restoration projects and other projects included in local management plans;
- 8. <u>Also reminds</u> the States Parties to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any major development project that may negatively impact the OUV of a property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a joint updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.