

45 COM

WHC/23/45.COM/19 Paris, 6 October 2023 Original: English / French

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

INTERGOVERNMENTAL COMMITTEE FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

Extended forty-fifth session Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia 10-25 September 2023

Decisions adopted
during the extended 45th session
of the World Heritage Committee
(Riyadh, 2023)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

OPENING SESSION

- 1. Opening session
- 2. Admission of Observers
- 3. Adoption of the Agenda and the Timetable
 - 3A. Adoption of the Agenda
 - 3B. Adoption of the Timetable

REPORTS

- 4. Report of the Rapporteur of the extended 44th session of the World Heritage Committee (Fuzhou/Online, 2021)
- 5. Reports of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies
 - 5A. Report of the World Heritage Centre on its activities and the implementation of the World Heritage Committee's decisions
 - 5B. Reports of the Advisory Bodies
 - 5C. Priority Africa: a Strategy for World Heritage
 - 5D. The World Heritage Convention and Sustainable Development
- 6. Follow-up to the World Heritage Capacity-Building Strategy and Progress report on the World Heritage-related category 2 centres

EXAMINATION OF THE STATE OF CONSERVATION

- 7. State of conservation of World Heritage properties
 - 7A. State of conservation of World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
 - 7B. State of conservation of World Heritage properties inscribed on the World Heritage List

ESTABLISHMENT OF THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST AND OF THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER

- 8. Nomination process
 - 8A. Tentative Lists submitted by States Parties as of 15 April 2023
 - 8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List
 - 8C. Update of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger
 - 8D. Clarifications of property boundaries and areas by States Parties
 - 8E. Review and approval of retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

GLOBAL STRATEGY FOR A REPRESENTATIVE, BALANCED AND CREDIBLE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

9. Global Strategy for a representative, balanced and credible World Heritage List

9A. Upstream Process

PERIODIC REPORTS

- Periodic Reports
 - 10A. Report on the results of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise in Asia-Pacific
 - 10B. Report on the results of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise in Latin America and the Caribbean
 - 10C. Follow-up on the implementation of the Action Plans for the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the Africa and Arab States regions
 - 10D. Progress report on the implementation of the Action Plans for the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the other regions
 - 10E. Progress report on the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the other regions

WORKING METHODS AND TOOLS

- 11. Follow-up to Recommendations of Evaluations and Audits on Working Methods and outcomes of the ad-hoc working group
- 12. Revision of the Operational Guidelines
- 13. 50th Anniversary of the World Heritage Convention

FINANCIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE ISSUES

- 14. International Assistance
- 15. Presentation of the final accounts of the World Heritage Fund for 2020-2021, Report on the execution of the budget for the biennium 2022-2023, Budget proposal of the World Heritage Fund under the biennium 2024-2025 and Follow up Decision **44 COM 14**

CLOSING SESSION

- 16. Other business
- 17. Election of the Chairperson, Vice-Chairpersons and Rapporteur of the 46th session of the World Heritage Committee
- 18. Provisional Agenda of the 46th session of the World Heritage Committee
- 19. Adoption of Decisions
- 20. Closing session

1. OPENING SESSION

2. ADMISSION OF OBSERVERS

Decision: 45 COM 2

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/2.Rev,
- 2. <u>Taking into consideration</u> Rule 8 (Observers) of the Rules of Procedure of the Committee,
- 3. <u>Authorizes</u> the participation in the extended 45th session, as observers, of the representatives of the international governmental organizations (IGOs), international non-governmental organizations (INGOs), non-governmental organizations (NGOs), permanent observer missions to UNESCO and non profit-making institutions in the fields covered by the Convention, listed in Part I of the present document.

3. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA AND THE TIMETABLE

3A. Adoption of the Agenda

Decision: 45 COM 3A

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/3A,
- 2. <u>Adopts</u> the Agenda contained in the above-mentioned document.

3B. Adoption of the Timetable

Decision: 45 COM 3B

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/3B,
- 2. Adopts the timetable contained in the above-mentioned document.

4. REPORT OF THE RAPPORTEUR OF THE EXTENDED 44TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE (FUZHOU/ONLINE, 2021)

Decision: 45 COM 4

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Takes note</u> of the report of the Rapporteur of the extended 44th session of the World Heritage Committee (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 5. REPORTS OF THE WORLD HERITAGE CENTRE AND THE ADVISORY BODIES
- 5A. Report of the World Heritage Centre on its activities and the implementation of the World Heritage Committee's decisions

Decision: 45 COM 5A

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/5A,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 5A** and **44 COM 5A** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> of the activities undertaken by the World Heritage Centre over the past year in pursuit of the Expected Result to ensure that "Tangible heritage identified, protected, monitored and sustainably managed by Member States, in particular through the effective implementation of the 1972 Convention";
- 4. <u>Takes note with concern</u> of the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic on World Heritage and commends the Secretariat for the responses to this extreme situation;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued efforts of the World Heritage Centre to collaborate and enhance synergies among UNESCO's Culture conventions and the Biodiversity-related conventions and programmes; and <u>reiterates its requests</u> to further strengthen this collaboration, such as done with the Convention on the International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES), including on the most critical issues of our times such as climate change and the loss of natural and cultural diversity;
- 6. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> of the activities undertaken by the World Heritage Centre on the assessment of climate change impacts on World Heritage and <u>invites</u> States Parties to support the Secretariat through additional voluntary contributions and technical expertise for the implementation of climate mitigation and adaptation actions within World Heritage properties;
- 7. Thanks all the States Parties that generously supported financially and/or in kind both the activities towards the implementation of the Convention, as well as the reinforcement of the human resources of the World Heritage Centre, and <u>invites</u> other States Parties to continue providing such support and increase it where possible;

- 8. Requests the World Heritage Centre to present a report on its activities based on the five Strategic Objectives set by the World Heritage Committee ('5Cs') under Item 5A, for examination at its 46th-session, and a result-based report on the Thematic Programmes under Item 5A, for examination at its 47th session;
- 9. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the activities carried out around the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape and <u>encourages</u> the Secretariat to regularly share updates on its implementation in support of the World Heritage Convention.

5B. Reports of the Advisory Bodies

Decision: 45 COM 5B

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/5B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 5B**, adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Mindful</u> of the efforts undertaken by the Advisory Bodies (ICCROM, ICOMOS and IUCN) to respond to the exceptional situation created by the COVID-19 pandemic as well as the efforts of ICOMOS to improve the geographical balance of its evaluation panels;
- 4. Reiterating the importance of transparency and publishing principles and criteria for selection of experts to missions, evaluations and panels, as well as strengthening efforts to enhance dialogue and provision of early advice to States Parties, and to achieve better regional representation and take into consideration the divergence of the expertise views based on profession, geographical and cultural perspectives,
- 5. Takes note with appreciation of the reports of the Advisory Bodies on their activities;
- 6. <u>Also takes note</u> with appreciation of the continued contributions of Advisory Bodies, including financial and in-kind contribution, to ensure the proper implementation of the decisions of the World Heritage Committee as well as the proper implementation of the World Heritage Convention,
- 7. <u>Further takes note</u> of the progress made as well as of the challenges and gaps identified by the Advisory Bodies in the framework of the implementation of the Convention, and the range of issues reported by the Advisory Bodies that continue to require action and attention.

5C. Priority Africa: a Strategy for World Heritage

Decision: 45 COM 5C

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/5C,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 5C** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021), in which the World Heritage Centre was requested to present a progress report on Priority Africa in line with the Medium-Term Strategy 2022-2029 and Programme and Budget for 2022-2025.
- 3. <u>Also recalling</u> Decisions **44 COM 10A**, and **44 COM 10B** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 4. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the continued efforts of the UNESCO Member States and the adoption of the Operational Strategy for Priority Africa 2022-2029, and in particular, its Flagship Programme 3 on "Fostering Cultural Heritage and Capacity Development", for the conservation and management of the unique biodiversity and rich cultural heritage of Africa that must be transmitted to future generations, in line with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the African Union's Agenda 2063;
- 5. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> for the activities undertaken by the World Heritage Centre along with UNESCO Field Offices, the Advisory Bodies, the African World Heritage Fund (AWHF), and other partners in developing the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa, and to all those involved in the consultation process and the working group;
- 6. <u>Endorses</u> the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa as an implementation plan of Main Objective 1 of Flagship Programme 3 of the Operational Strategy for Priority Africa 2022-2029 composed of three guiding principles, five pillars and seven priorities identified by the States Parties following a broader consultation process that involved African States Parties, national focal points, World Heritage site managers and experts;
- 7. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties to appropriate the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa in line with the Regional Action Plans into their national, subregional and regional heritage strategies, and aligned with the results of the reflections during the celebrations of the 50th Anniversary of the 1972 Convention in Yaoundé (Cameroon) ('Yaoundé Call to Action') and in Delphi (Greece) and <u>requests</u> the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, with the support of all partners to support States Parties in its implementation;
- 8. Thanks the Governments of China, Flanders (Belgium), France, Japan, the Netherlands, Norway, the Sultanate of Oman and the European Union for their financial support to implement activities that will contribute to meeting the targets of the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa and encourages other States Parties to contribute financially to its implementation;
- Recognizes that the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa needs to be fully funded and requests the Secretariat to fundraise resources required for the implementation of the Strategy;
- 10. <u>Calls upon</u> the entire international community, including the Group of Friends for Priority Africa, to provide support to African States Parties in the implementation of the Strategy

for World Heritage in Africa and of Flagship Programme 3, and to attain its targets, notably:

- a) to assist 12 African States Parties not yet represented on the World Heritage List in developing a nomination (see footnote 9 of the Strategy),
- b) to provide support to properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger in establishing a Desired state of conservation for their removal from this list (DSOCR),
- to increase the number of African heritage experts working in the World Heritage system and enhance the role of African universities to be involved in World Heritage processes,
- d) to operationalize the pan-African network of site managers,
- e) to develop projects on entrepreneurship and the use of new and innovative technologies,

and <u>welcomes</u> the commitment and support of the AWHF to assist the African States Parties to this end;

11. Requests the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with IUCN, ICOMOS, ICCROM, the UNESCO Chairs and UNESCO category 2 centres related to World Heritage and other capacity building partners, to implement the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa and the implementation of Main Objective 1 of Flagship Programme 3, and prepare a progress report towards this end in line with the Medium-Term Strategy 2022-2029 and Programme and Budget for 2022-2025 for examination by the Committee at its 46th session.

5D. The World Heritage Convention and Sustainable Development

Decision: 45 COM 5D

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/5D,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 5D** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021), as well as Resolution **20 GA 13** adopted by the General Assembly at its 20th session (UNESCO, 2015),
- 3. <u>Also recalling</u> Decision **35 COM 12E** that the World Heritage Committee specifically encourages the effective and equitable involvement and participation of indigenous peoples and local communities in decision-making, monitoring and evaluation of World Heritage properties and the respect of indigenous peoples' rights in nominating, managing and reporting on World Heritage properties in their own territories;
- 4. Recalls that the UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity (2001) designates that the defence of cultural diversity implies a commitment to human rights that is also included in the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), and also recalls the UNESCO Policy on Engaging with Indigenous Peoples that underlines UNESCO's commitment to promote the human rights-based approach in the implementation of its normative instruments including the 1972 Convention;

- 5. Welcomes the progress made so far in the development of tools to support the implementation of the "Policy Document for the integration of a sustainable development perspective into the processes of the World Heritage Convention" (WH-SDP) into activities of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, including through the World Heritage Leadership Programme at national and local levels and encourages States Parties to support their development and implementation in and around World Heritage properties, also welcomes the synergies evident in the consolidated report of the Third Member State Consultation on the implementation of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011 Recommendation), with the WH-SDP in view of advancing sustainable urban development and climate resilience in and around World Heritage properties in cities and settlements;
- 6. <u>Acknowledges</u> the importance of practical strategies and best practices to support the operationalization of the WH-SDP as well as capacity building for it, and <u>invites</u> States Parties to support the Secretariat's and the Advisory Bodies' efforts to gather, analyze, and share information on good practices and innovative solutions integrating heritage conservation with sustainable development;
- 7. Also takes note of the progress made towards the collection of quality data related to cultural and natural heritage in line with the MONDIACULT 2022 Declaration, including with the implementation of the UNESCO Culture 2030 Indicators to support evidence-based policies and actions in line with the 1972 World Heritage Convention;
- 8. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the collaboration of UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies with the International Indigenous Peoples Forum on World Heritage (IIPFWH), <u>welcomes</u> their intent to co-organise with UNESCO, working with the Advisory Bodies and other partners, in early 2024, an international expert workshop on the recognition and respect for the heritage values of indigenous peoples within the framework of the World Heritage Convention and <u>invites</u> States Parties to contribute financially towards this event and requests the Secretariat to include a report on it at its 46th session;
- 9. Requests the States Parties to implement the WH-SDP systematically in and around World Heritage properties, ensuring that sustainable development objectives are mainstreamed into their management plans and conservation actions for the World Heritage properties, and to integrate heritage conservation into national and local plans, policies, processes to advance sustainable development;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the World Heritage Centre to continue to pursue, within the available resources, the development of activities including policies, tools, guidance, and communication towards operationalising the WH-SDP supporting States Parties in its implementation while protecting the Outstanding Universal Value of World Heritage properties;
- 11. <u>Calls</u> on States Parties and other potential partners to contribute financially or through in-kind support to activities towards mainstreaming and operationalising the WH-SDP including the development of tools and guidance by the World Heritage Centre with the Advisory Bodies;
- 12. <u>Requests furthermore</u> the World Heritage Centre, in cooperation with the Advisory Bodies, to present a progress report in this regard at its 47th session.

6. FOLLOW-UP TO THE WORLD HERITAGE CAPACITY-BUILDING STRATEGY AND PROGRESS REPORT ON THE WORLD HERITAGE-RELATED CATEGORY 2 CENTRES

Decision: 45 COM 6

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/6,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 6** and **44 COM 6**, adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the progress made by the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, the Advisory Bodies, the States Parties, the category 2 centres under the auspices of UNESCO related to World Heritage, as well as the UNESCO Chairs with the implementation of the World Heritage Capacity-Building Strategy (WHCBS), and notably the efforts to maintain and adapt capacity-building activities during the global COVID-19 pandemic;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress made with the implementation of the regional and thematic capacity-building strategies and initiatives, the role of the regional category 2 centre in supporting the implementation of the Regional Action Plan for Africa (2021-2027) and <u>calls upon</u> States Parties and all concerned partners and stakeholders, including the Advisory Bodies (ICCROM, ICOMOS and IUCN), to support and follow up on the implementation of the strategies and initiatives developed for each regional and thematic area:
- 5. Thanks the Governments of Norway, the Republic of Korea, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia and Switzerland for the continued financial support they extended to the WHCBS and the World Heritage Leadership Programme, also thanks the States Parties of the People's Republic of China, Japan, the Netherlands, Belgium, Norway, France and the Sultanate of Oman for supporting World Heritage capacity-building activities, notably in the Africa region, and further thanks those States Parties who have contributed to the African World Heritage Fund, including Norway, South Africa, Uganda, Mauritius, Namibia, Germany, Burkina Faso, Azerbaijan, Serbia, France, United Arab Emirates and Rwanda;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties and other stakeholders to continue supporting the implementation of the WHCBS by providing financial support and/or reinforcing the human resources of the institutions involved;
- 7. Recalls that category 2 centres and UNESCO Chairs have the mandate of contributing to the implementation of the Organization's strategic priorities, programmes and global development agendas, notably through capacity building, welcomes the progress made by category 2 centres and UNESCO Chairs in the field of World Heritage, and encourages States Parties to make full use of the services and resources that category 2 centres and UNESCO Chairs provide, in a spirit of international cooperation;
- 8. <u>Commends</u> the organisation of the 8th Coordination Meeting of the World Heritage-related category 2 centres, hosted by the International Centre for the Interpretation and Presentation of World Heritage Sites (Republic of Korea), <u>takes note</u> of the "Sejong Declaration of Understanding and Cooperation among UNESCO Category 2 World Heritage Centres" adopted on this occasion, and <u>notes with thanks</u> that the Regional

- World Heritage Institute in Zacatecas (Mexico) has expressed its intention to organise the 9th edition of the Coordination Meeting;
- 9. <u>Expresses again its gratitude</u> to the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia for providing the financial support required to carry out the independent evaluation of the WHCBS;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> of the independent evaluation of the WHCBS, initiated through cooperation between UNESCO, ICCROM, IUCN and ICOMOS and carried out by the E.C.O. Institute for Ecology, and endorses its conclusions and recommendations;
- 11. <u>Welcomes</u> the involvement of an Evaluation Reference Group composed of interested Committee members, States Parties and other key capacity-building actors in the evaluation of the WHCBS and the development of guidelines for the planned update of this Strategy, and <u>thanks</u> the numerous States Parties that actively participated in the evaluation process at the site, national and (sub-)regional levels;
- 12. <u>Invites</u> all States Parties to provide dedicated voluntary contributions under the World Heritage Fund and/or extra-budgetary support to the World Heritage Centre for capacity building, since the Evaluation has further demonstrated the need to enhance capacity building and highlighted the lack of dedicated funding for capacity-building activities under the World Heritage Fund thus far;
- 13. Reiterates its appeal to States Parties to contribute financial resources for the update of the WHCBS through earmarked contributions to the World Heritage Fund or by providing extra-budgetary support to the World Heritage Centre and the World Heritage-related category 2 centres for this purpose;
- 14. Requests the World Heritage Centre, in cooperation with ICCROM, IUCN and ICOMOS, to develop a new World Heritage Capacity-Building Strategy for the decade 2025-2035, including clear priorities, strategic objectives, expected outputs and outcomes, relying on the outcomes of the independent evaluation of the WHCBS and the guidelines developed by the Evaluators for this purpose, and taking into account the results of the Periodic Reporting process, to be presented for review at its 47th session, if funding allows;
- 15. <u>Further requests</u> the World Heritage Centre and ICCROM to submit a progress report on the World Heritage-related capacity building activities and the revision of the WHCBS, for examination at its 46th session;
- 16. <u>Mindful</u> that contributions by category 2 centres to the implementation of the World Heritage Convention are not confined to capacity building, <u>finally requests</u> the category 2 centres to submit a progress report on all the activities concerning the implementation of the World Heritage Convention by the World Heritage-related category 2 centres, presented as a specific agenda item during the 46th session of the World Heritage Committee.

7. STATE OF CONSERVATION OF WORLD HERITAGE PROPERTIES

Decision: 45 COM 7.1

The World Heritage Committee,

Climate Action for World Heritage

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **40 COM 7** and **44 COM 7C** adopted at its 40th session (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Notes that the Panel of experts in relation to Decision **44 COM 7C** concerning climate change and World Heritage met by end of March 2022 and made recommendations on the amendments proposed by the Members of the World Heritage Committee and provided a report to the Open-ended Working Group of States Parties to the World Heritage Convention on Climate Change;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> that the Open-ended Working Group of States Parties to the World Heritage Convention on Climate Change has met seven times to discuss the proposed amendments and the recommendations of the Panel of experts;
- 5. <u>Recognizes</u> Climate Action for World Heritage as an important thematic area of work, thanks the Governments of Australia, Azerbaijan and the Netherlands for their generous financial support and <u>invites</u> States Parties to contribute towards this thematic area to enable the Secretariat to support activities related to the development of the updated Policy Document on Climate Action for World Heritage and its dissemination;
- 6. Recalls again Decision 41 COM 7 in which the Committee 'reiterate[d] the importance of States Parties undertaking the most ambitious implementation of the Paris Agreement adopted under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) by "holding the increase in the global average temperature to well below 2°C above pre-industrial levels and by pursuing efforts to limit the global average temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels, recognizing that this would significantly reduce the risks and impacts of climate change" ', again strongly urges all States Parties to undertake actions to address Climate Change under the Paris Agreement consistent with their common but differentiated responsibilities and respective capabilities, in the light of different national circumstances, that are fully consistent with their obligations within the World Heritage Convention to protect the Outstanding Universal Value of all World Heritage properties;

Improving the perception of the List of World Heritage in Danger

- 7. Recalling Decision 40 COM 7 adopted at its 40th session (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016),
- 8. Reaffirming the need to promote a better understanding of the implications and benefits of properties being inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger,
- Takes note with appreciation of the thorough study on the perceptions of the List of World Heritage in Danger, together with its recommendations that could form the basis of a communication strategy and <u>thanks</u> the State Party of Norway for its financial support;

- 10. <u>Expresses its gratitude</u> to all the stakeholders of the 1972 World Heritage Convention who have actively contributed to this study;
- 11. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the recommendations formulated in the study on possible approaches to reverse negative perceptions and to raise the profile of the List of World Heritage in Danger as a positive tool, enhancing understanding and highlighting its importance for the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of World Heritage properties and <u>requests</u> all stakeholders of the Convention to take them on-board and implement them at their level as soon as possible;

Enhancing dialogue among States Parties, Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre

- 12. <u>Recommends</u> that the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies ensure the following steps regarding the monitoring of state of conservation of the inscribed properties:
 - a) Whenever an expert mission takes place within the framework of the reactive monitoring process, the draft mission report will be shared, prior to its publication, with the concerned State Party to allow them to review the report and to propose corrections on any factual inaccuracies and comment on other critical issues and/or misunderstandings, and consultations will be held, if necessary, between the concerned State Party and relevant Advisory Body/ies;
 - b) Whenever an expert mission takes place within the framework of the reactive monitoring process and the inscription of the concerned property on the List of World Heritage in Danger is recommended in the mission report, consultations will be held between the concerned State Party and relevant Advisory Body/ies, and the State Party's view will be referred to in the mission report or in its annex in the event that the views of both parties do not converge in the consultations;
 - c) Whenever the inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger is proposed in a working document on state of conservation produced by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to be examined by the Committee, consultations will be held, within the available deadlines, prior to the distribution of the document, between the concerned State Party, relevant Advisory Body/ies and the World Heritage Centre, and the State Party's view will be referred to in the working document such as in its annex in the event that the views of the concerned parties do not converge;
- 13. <u>Recommends</u> that States Parties enhance dialogue among themselves regarding properties that are or may be proposed for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in particular cases in which causes of the danger are transboundary;
- 14. Recommends that the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies continue to work on knowledge sharing of best practice cases in which the property was removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger, and also encourage them to enhance providing capacity building for the States Parties who have properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 15. <u>Recommends</u> that the budget of the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies be adjusted in proportion with the additional workload generated by the additional dialogue and consultations as well as for capacity building for States Parties with properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7, 41 COM 7, 42 COM 7, 43 COM 7.2, and 44 COM 7.2 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Also recalling that all proposed major interventions in and around World Heritage properties should be subject to rigorous impact assessments, as outlined in Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and that both the proposals and the impact assessment-related documentation be submitted, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, before any intervention for new construction, demolition, modification, recovery or reconstruction commences or decisions made that cannot be reversed;

Emergency situations resulting from conflicts

- 4. <u>Expresses utmost concern</u> that conflicts (including armed conflict and civil unrest) continue to represent a major threat to World Heritage properties and remain one of the major reasons for the inscription of properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 5. Regrets the loss of human life and the degradation of humanitarian conditions resulting from the prevailing conflict situations in several countries, including threats to the personnel and local communities, as well as the continuing threats facing cultural and natural heritage in regions of armed conflict where there are significant concerns regarding security in and around World Heritage properties;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> protection and conservation efforts being undertaken by the concerned States Parties at World Heritage properties and that the States Parties are progressively proceeding with the development of corrective measures and the definition of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the properties from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) for some cultural properties following due process:
- 7. <u>Urges</u> again all parties associated with conflicts to ensure the protection of cultural and natural heritage, including to avoid their use for military purposes and <u>also urges</u> States Parties to fulfil their obligations under international law, including the 1954 Convention and its two Protocols, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, including of World Heritage properties and sites included in Tentative Lists;
- 8. Reiterates its utmost concern about the continuing threats of wildlife poaching and illegal trafficking of wildlife and timber products linked to impacts of armed conflict and organized crime, which is eroding the biodiversity and Outstanding Universal Value of World Heritage properties around the world, and <u>further urges</u> States Parties to take the necessary measures to curb this problem, including through the implementation of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES);
- 9. <u>Also reiterates its utmost concern</u> at the increase in illicit trafficking of cultural objects, resulting from armed conflicts, and <u>appeals</u> to all States Parties to cooperate in the fight against these threats, and for cultural heritage protection in general, including through

the ratification of the 1970 Convention and the 1954 Convention and its two Protocols, as well as the implementation of United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 (2015), 2253 (2015) and 2347 (2017), and the implementation of the UNESCO Recommendations on Museums and Collections (2015);

- 10. Welcomes the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies' continued actions in responding to emergencies and conflicts threatening cultural and natural heritage, including the Outstanding Universal Value, including through the Revive the Spirit of Mosul and the Li Beirut initiatives, the Heritage Emergency Fund (HEF) and the Rapid Response Facility (RRF) and also UNESCO actions in Ukraine and emergency programmes in Sudan, Syria, Yemen, Iraq, Libya, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Benin, Burkina Faso, Niger, Mali, Central African Republic, Palestine, and other countries;
- 11. <u>Reiterates its call</u> upon the international community to further support the safeguarding of the cultural and natural heritage of countries affected by conflict, through earmarked funds or through contributions to the UNESCO World Heritage Fund, HEF and RRF;

Recovery and Reconstruction

- 12. Recalls that reconstruction is justifiable only in exceptional circumstances, and should be based on thorough documentation, guided by conservation plans and policies that support the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and as outlined in Paragraph 86 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 13. <u>Takes note</u> of the various programmes initiated and implemented by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and other international partners to respond to the destruction of heritage through documentation, emergency response, recovery and reconstruction;
- 14. Welcomes the continued efforts by States Parties in responding to post-conflict and post-disaster recovery and reconstruction, including the various reconstruction projects nearing completion, as well as their positive social and community interlinkages and thanks France, Germany, Japan, Norway, the Republic of Korea, Spain, the Sultanate of Oman, the United Arab Emirates, the European Union, the International Alliance for the Protection of Heritage in Conflict Areas (ALIPH), the Heritage Emergency Fund and the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH) for their generous support, including for the reconstruction of the House of Wonder, an emblematic building in East Africa, in the Stone Town of Zanzibar, United Republic of Tanzania;
- 15. <u>Encourages</u> all State Parties to prepare comprehensive risk preparedness strategies and emergency response plans for World Heritage properties that are exposed to risk from natural disasters;
- 16. Requests States Parties to ensure the integrity of the OUV of World Heritage properties and that all recovery and reconstruction projects be guided by thorough and comprehensive recovery proposals, including plans and drawings, integrated and aligned with the needs of local communities and subject to rigorous impact assessments as noted in Paragraph 3 above;

Kunming-Montreal Global Biodiversity Framework

17. <u>Welcomes</u> the adoption of the Kunming-Montreal Global Biodiversity Framework (GBF) during the fifteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties (COP-15) to the Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) in December 2022 to set the global pathway to halt and

- reverse biodiversity loss by 2030, in line with the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development;
- 18. Requests the States Parties to fully harness the World Heritage Convention in supporting the goals and targets of the GBF, including through effective collaboration among convention focal points, and by integrating World Heritage-related objectives within their National Biodiversity Strategies and Action Plans (NBSAPs);
- 19. <u>Also requests</u> the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, to identify and develop coordinated actions on World Heritage and the GBF, including specific guidance on how the World Heritage Convention might contribute to the aims of the Joint Programme of Work on the Links between Biological and Cultural Diversity, subject to the availability of resources, and to integrate reporting on progress regarding contributions of World Heritage to the GBF under the Committee's item on Sustainable Development and <u>invites</u> States Parties to contribute financially for this purpose;

Urban pressure

- 20. <u>Notes</u> that pressures on historic urban areas arising from inappropriate urban development interventions and inadequate development controls, rapid and inadequately planned development, including large development projects, additions that are incompatible in their volume, tourism and transportation infrastructure, as well as the accumulated impact of incremental changes, have continued within numerous World Heritage properties and in their buffer zones and settings, and <u>considers</u> that these present significant potential and ascertained major threats to the Outstanding Universal Value of properties, including their integrity and authenticity, and increase their vulnerability to disasters, such as those resulting from climate change;
- 21. Also noting that the findings of the UNESCO Third Member State Consultation on the Implementation of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011 Recommendation) request States Parties to implement the 2011 Recommendation in urban World Heritage properties and, with technical assistance from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, to integrate it as a tool in the monitoring processes of the state of conservation, and the preparation and updating of management plans concerning nomination process for World Heritage properties in cities and settlements including with the support of the World Heritage Urban Heritage Atlas tool;
- 22. Recalls the essential contribution of local communities, and the importance of their participation in decision-making processes, as well as the need to support sustainable, compatible, and inclusive livelihoods for local communities and <u>further requests</u> States Parties to embed stakeholder engagement in management systems and processes, in line with Paragraph 12 of the Operational Guidelines, with the 2011 Recommendation and the Policy on the Integration of a Sustainable Development Perspective into the Processes of the World Heritage Convention (2015);
- 23. <u>Invites</u> all States Parties to establish governance mechanisms for urban heritage that support coordination and coherence across different sectors such as infrastructure, tourism, transport, and urban development to integrate heritage management into the plans and processes of the settlement and the region;
- 24. <u>Stresses</u> the importance of carrying out impact assessments to evaluate and thereby avoid or manage potential threats to the OUV of properties, including their authenticity and integrity, arising from new urban development projects in line with paragraph 3 above;

25. <u>Also emphasizes</u> the need to enhance resilience of World Heritage properties in urban areas vulnerable to climate change-related impacts, in line with the 2011 Recommendation and the outcomes of the activities of the UNESCO World Heritage Cities Programme;

Infrastructure development

- 26. <u>Notes with concern</u> the growing pressure of infrastructure development, such as extractive mining activities, dams, hydropower, transportation infrastructure, and the expansion of tourism infrastructure, on the Outstanding Universal Value of World Heritage properties;
- 27. Welcomes the commitment announced by the International Hydropower Association (IHA) that no new hydropower projects should be developed in World Heritage properties, and a duty of care pledge to implement high standards of performance and transparency for any hydropower projects outside of but affecting protected areas such as World Heritage properties;
- 28. <u>Strongly urges</u> all States Parties, development proponents and financiers to incorporate the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context into planning and decision-making processes to contribute to safeguarding the OUV of World Heritage properties, in line with Paragraph 3 above;
- 29. Requests all States Parties to:
 - a) Inform the World Heritage Centre of any planned developments located within a World Heritage property, its buffer zone or in its wider setting that may impact on its OUV, prior to making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - b) Ensure that the potential impacts of developments on the OUV are appropriately assessed, in line with Paragraph 3 above,
 - c) Ensure that no proposed developments proceed that would negatively impact on the OUV,
 - d) Ensure that no deliberate measures are taken, which might damage directly or indirectly the inscribed properties situated on the territory of other States Parties to the Convention, in conformity with Article 6 of the World Heritage Convention;

Corporate Sector and the World Heritage 'no-go' commitment

- 30. <u>Welcomes</u> the launch of the *UNESCO Guidance for the World Heritage 'No-Go' Commitment: Global standards for corporate sustainability* as a means to assist the corporate sector to develop or update their policies and strategies to safeguard World Heritage, and <u>thanks</u> the Government of Flanders (Belgium) for its financial support;
- 31. Requests the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, to continue its collaboration with the corporate sector in view of supporting the adoption and implementation of World Heritage safeguard policies, and <u>invites</u> companies and relevant organisations to develop and update their corporate sustainability policies in line with the UNESCO guidance, and lodge them with UNESCO:

Rights-based Issues

32. Recalling Article 5 of the Convention that each State Party shall adopt for each country a general policy, which aims to give the cultural and natural heritage a function in the life

- of the community, and the integration of the protection of that heritage into comprehensive planning programmes are means of ensuring effective protection, conservation and presentation of cultural and natural heritage,
- 33. <u>Also recalling</u> the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, and the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples,
- 34. <u>Further recalling</u> the various provisions of the Operational Guidelines that encourage States Parties to adopt a human rights-based approach to the nomination and subsequent effective management of inscribed World Heritage properties,
- 35. <u>Bearing in mind</u> that specific and significant spiritual meanings are mentioned to justify the Outstanding Universal Value of a large number of the World Heritage properties to be found in most countries around the world, <u>also recalling</u> a number of research studies and analyses of religious heritage and sacred sites carried out by the Advisory Bodies,
- 36. <u>Underlining</u> that living religious and sacred sites require specific approach and policies for protection and management that take into account their distinct spiritual nature, crucial to their Outstanding Universal Value, as a key factor in their conservation and that such policies cannot be sustainable without in-depth consultation with the appropriate stakeholders;
- 37. <u>Calls upon</u> all States Parties to ensure that human rights, including cultural rights, are protected as an integral part of the management of World Heritage properties by establishing equitable and participatory governance arrangements;
- 38. <u>Strongly condemns</u> all forms of human rights violations and abuses towards indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs), including any forced eviction;
- 39. Notes with utmost concern the reported cases of alleged human rights abuses towards IPLCs in and around World Heritage properties and therefore, strongly urges the States Parties concerned to urgently investigate the allegations and take appropriate actions to address their findings, following an equitably governed consultative process with the participation and decision making of all rightsholders and stakeholders;
- 40. Reminds States Parties of their obligations to ensure that the management of World Heritage properties follows a rights-based approach that includes full involvement of all rightsholders and stakeholders, in particular IPLCs, in line with the 2015 Policy on World Heritage and Sustainable Development, the UNESCO Policy on Engaging with Indigenous Peoples and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and international human rights standards;
- 41. Requests the Secretariat, with the Advisory Bodies, to enhance activities in the framework of the Initiative on Heritage of Religious Interest and to resume elaboration of the thematic paper proposing to the States Parties general guidance regarding the management of their cultural and natural heritage of religious interest, and in compliance with the national specificities, and invites the States Parties to provide voluntary contributions to this end;

Earth observation and spatial data for World Heritage conservation

42. <u>Welcomes</u> the development of the World Heritage Online Mapping Platform to provide a comprehensive, complete, accurate and geo-referenced dataset for the World Heritage properties that, in the pilot phase of the project, are in the Europe and North America

region, and thanks the Government of Flanders (Belgium) for the support provided to the pilot phase of the project;

- 43. <u>Also welcomes</u> the Urban Heritage Atlas platform and tool for geo-referenced cultural mapping of the attributes of urban heritage and <u>invites</u> States Parties to use the tool for better managing their World Heritage properties and <u>takes note with satisfaction</u> of the continued activities of the Urban Heritage Climate Observatory applying earth observation tools for World Heritage cities;
- 44. <u>Invites</u> States Parties to contribute to the above-mentioned platforms and tools with already available GIS data, complementary narrative and visual analysis, expertise, networks, and financial resources;
- 45. Reiterates its request to States Parties, the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, to strengthen collaborative partnerships with UNESCO Category 2 Centres and other relevant institutions with a view to furthering the necessary institutional and individual capacity needed to make full use of spatial data, Earth observation satellite technologies and analysis tools for the monitoring of the state of conservation of World Heritage properties.

7A. STATE OF CONSERVATION OF THE PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER

NATURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

1. Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras) (N 196)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.1

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.55** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the strengthening of indigenous territorial governance, and biodiversity conservation measures to restore the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and <u>notes with satisfaction</u> the ongoing inter-institutional efforts to address illegal activity in the property, including poaching and illegal settlement;
- 4. <u>Expresses concern</u> that the expected completion of the land titling process in the cultural zone of the Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve has been further delayed to 2022 and <u>urges</u> the State Party to complete the process within the newly proposed timeframe;

- 5. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's progress to achieve the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), however, <u>notes with concern</u> that many challenges remain, and <u>also urges</u> the State Party and its partners to ensure the corrective measures are expeditiously and fully implemented, through improved collaboration and resourcing;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to secure the necessary technical and financial resources required for the consultation processes, especially with indigenous and Afro-Honduran territorial councils, to submit a proposal for a Significant Boundary Modification as a crucial step towards achieving the DSOCR, and in particular to fully consider the archaeological heritage of the property and corresponding actors;
- 7. Regrets that the Patuca III Hydroelectric Power Plant (HPP) is already in operational testing without the current and potential impacts of the project on the OUV of the property having been thoroughly assessed through a Strategic Environmental Assessment;
- 8. Requests the State Party to urgently develop a study to identify and monitor any actual and potential impacts of the HPP on the OUV of the property, and to adopt an adaptive management approach, including through development and implementation of necessary measures to mitigate any adverse impacts on the OUV;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session in 2024:
- 10. <u>Decides</u> to retain Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 2. Islands and Protected Areas of the Gulf of California (Mexico) (N 1182ter)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.56</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Reiterates its utmost concern about the critical status of the vaquita, specifically recognized as part of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and endemic to the Gulf of California, and that illegal fishing of totoaba has continued in the Upper Gulf of California resulting in a threat of imminent extinction of the vaquita species;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the confirmation that the small and sole remaining population is still breeding, and that an extinction could still be avoided if the remaining animals can be fully protected and the illegal use of gill nets in the Zero Tolerance Area (ZTA) and the Lower Gulf area effectively enforced;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the measures taken to monitor the vaquita population in the property, and encourages the State Party to continue these efforts;

- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to implement the following corrective measures, developed by the State Party in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN:
 - Strengthen law enforcement efficiency through increased surveillance and inspection, continuing and further strengthening inter-institutional cooperation in this field.
 - b) Introduce the necessary legislative changes to increase the penalties foreseen for illegal traffic, capture, possession, import and export of wildlife species, parts and products considered, threatened, endangered or specially protected and/or regulated under the national law, or by international treaties adopted by the State Party; and strengthen criminal prosecution procedures,
 - c) Further strengthen detection and elimination of illegal and derelict fishing gear found in the Vaquita Refuge and the ZTA, in coordination with relevant stakeholders, fishing communities and cooperatives;
 - d) Effectively implement the permanent ban on the use of gill nets (including the sale, manufacturing, or possession of all gill nets on land and at sea) in the Vaquita Refuge and the entire distribution range of the species;
 - e) Pursue at the highest level of government, the necessary and urgent cooperation with the identified destination and transit countries involved in the illegal trade of totoaba swim bladders, through the implementation of the decisions made by Convention on International Trade of Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) and through other existing international mechanisms, such as INTERPOL;
 - f) Ensure the large scale roll out of alternative fishing gear systems which do not cause entanglement of vaquita and other protected species already developed by the National Aquaculture and Fishing Commission (CONAPESCA) / National Institute of Fisheries and Aquaculture (INAPESCA) in the Upper Gulf of California by providing appropriate incentives and accompanying measures; and develop and promote sustainable fisheries based on environmentally friendly fishing gear throughout the entire property;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the cooperation between the State Party with the relevant international institutions and States Parties to combat illegal trafficking of totoaba products, including within the framework of CITES, and <u>strongly recommends</u> that the State Party of Mexico, together with the States Parties of transit and destination countries, take urgent action in line with all CITES decisions to effectively address the illegal totoaba bladder trade;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> the continued surveillance and law enforcement efforts aimed at eliminating illegal fishing activities and illegal trafficking of totoaba products but <u>notes with concern</u> that illegal fishing activities continue and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to further strengthen these efforts based on a critical assessment of the efficiency of the current efforts on how to improve them;
- 9. <u>Further welcomes</u> the ongoing retrieval of abandoned fishing gear, including through collaboration with civil society organizations, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue these efforts alongside surveillance and law enforcement to ensure that the ZTA is completely free of gill nets;
- 10. <u>Noting</u> that alternative vaquita-safe fishing gear is already available for a number of fisheries, <u>requests</u> the State Party to expedite the production and deployment of alternative gear and provide information on the uptake of alternative gear across all fishing communities of the Upper Gulf of California;

- 11. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's efforts to develop the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) through ongoing dialogue with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to finalise and submit the DSOCR following the necessary consultations with key stakeholders, for adoption by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> the efforts of the State Party to evaluate the management effectiveness of the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to undertake targeted efforts address the management weaknesses, especially of the components currently evaluated as ineffective;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Islands and Protected Areas of the Gulf of California (Mexico) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

AFRICA

3. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic) (N 475)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.3

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7A.5** and **44 COM 7A.39** adopted respectively at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Recalling in particular its decision in 2019 to grant four years to the State Party to demonstrate whether it is possible to restore the integrity of the property and to collect additional data on the state of fauna to allow an assessment of whether regeneration of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) is still achievable,
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the significant progress made by the State Party and its partners in implementing the recommendations of the 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission and the decisions of the World Heritage Committee, in particular the reinforced surveillance within the delimited priority conservation area (hard core), efforts to better control transhumance, limit poaching and inventory the residual fauna of the property;
- 5. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the confirmation of the presence of a relict population of flagship species such as the savannah elephant, giraffe, lion, Derby eland and bongo, nurturing the hope that a regeneration of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) is still possible, and calls on the State Party and its partners to continue their efforts to monitor and secure the property;

- 6. <u>Noting</u> that a data collection campaign has been underway since December 2022 to carry out a faunal inventory of the property, <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to transmit updated data on the state of the fauna to the World Heritage Centre as soon as possible for review by IUCN;
- 7. Thanks the European Union, the United States Fish and Wildlife Service and the Lion Recovery Fund for their support in preserving the values of the property and in particular the Government of Norway for its significant funding through the World Heritage Centre, which has enabled monitoring and management operations in the property with the aim of avoiding the loss of its OUV, and encourages States Parties to the Convention and public and private donors to support the efforts of the State Party and the partner Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) for the effective management of the property and the implementation of the emergency plan;
- 8. <u>Notes with concern</u> the persistence of intensive poaching, illegal gold mining and international transhumance, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to strengthen control and law enforcement measures against these illegal activities and to continue advocacy for the implementation of existing regional agreements on the fight against poaching and other cross-border criminal activities, as well as those relating to peace, reconciliation and social cohesion;
- Also requests the State Party to assess the negative impacts caused by the various past and ongoing illegal activities, particularly in the priority conservation area, and to undertake the necessary restoration activities to allow the recovery of wildlife populations;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> of the confirmation of the suspension of petroleum exploration activities since 2012 and the State Party's proposal to organize a field mission including representatives of the Ministry of Geology and Mines to definitively clarify the situation of petroleum Block A and exploration Blocks I, II, III, and <u>again reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to avoid any petroleum and mining exploration activities within the boundaries of the property, in accordance with national legislation and the World Heritage status of the property;
- 11. <u>Notes with concern</u> the influx of illegal armed gold miners and the proliferation of extraction wells in the Gordil Nda corridor to the east of the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide detailed information on this threat and its potential impacts on the property;
- 12. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the decision to bypass the property from the south for the realization of the Ndélé-Birao National Road 8 rehabilitation project, and <u>requests</u> the State Party, with the support of its partners, to finalize the environmental and social impact assessment (ESIA) of the project in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, before approving the project, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 13. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to continue the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;

- 15. <u>Also decides</u> to retain Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park (Central African Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 4. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire/Guinea) (N 155bis)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7A.6** and **44 COM 7A.40** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties for their ongoing efforts under difficult circumstances to implement the corrective measures including joint transboundary surveillance patrols, funding to support management operations, anti-poaching activities, restoration of degraded areas, support for local communities, and development of a high-resolution map of the property, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to continue the implementation of all corrective measures including to strengthen ecological monitoring and finalize the management plans for the property;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the support by an increasing number of national and international partners to the conservation of the property, including UNESCO, USAID, GEF, EU and the World Bank and <u>encourages</u> the States Parties to build long term programmes with them and explore other funding opportunities for a sustainable maintenance of the ecological integrity of the property;
- 5. Recalls the importance of having a functional buffer zone (or an equivalent measure) around the property in Côte d'Ivoire, and reiterates its request to the State Party of Côte d'Ivoire to designate and formalize such an area following the procedures of the Operational Guidelines, and to strengthen the monitoring of community forests around the property, while ensuring that their management objectives are compatible with the management of the property:
- 6. Notes that the asphalting project of the Danané-Lola road was suspended in 2019 and the section crossing the buffer zone of the property in Guinea was moved further north, away from the property, and encourages the State Party to ensure that subsequent road projects in the landscape do not negatively impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property including the proposed Lola-Zoo-Côte d'Ivoire border road project financed by the African Development Bank;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> of the expiration of the environmental compliance certificate of Zali mining SA for the mining block immediately adjacent to the property and the information provided by the State Party of Guinea that the recommendations of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN on the draft Terms of Reference (ToR) were fully incorporated, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit the approved ToR to the World Heritage Centre;
- 8. Requests the State Party of Guinea to ensure that the Environmental and Social Impact Assessments (ESIA) for the proposed Nimba Iron Ore mining project by the Société des mines de fer de Guinée (SMFG) and the Zali Mining iron ore project:

- Are carried out in accordance with the highest international standards in line with the Guidance and Toolkit on Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and in close consultation with all key stakeholders,
- b) Identify fully and quantify the potential effects of the project on the OUV of the property, at each phase of its cycle, including construction and operation, taking into account the synergistic and collateral impacts also linked to on-site transformation of the ore and its transport, as well as the socio-economic changes to be expected.
- Are submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN before any decision to approve the projects, including any issuance of a certificate of environmental compliance;
- 9. Notes with appreciation the commitment of the State Party of Guinea not to authorize any mining activity within the property and to ensure mining activities in the vicinity must be compatible with the OUV of the property, but remains concerned about the proliferation of mining permits around the property, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party of Guinea not to grant any exploration or mining permits around the property without carrying out a strategic environmental assessment to assess the impacts, including synergistic and cumulative impacts of these projects, and submitting it for prior consideration to the World Heritage Centre and for examination by IUCN, and also to provide further clarification regarding the planned World Bank strategic assessment of all mining projects in Guinea, in relation to the OUV of the property;
- 10. Adopts the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), presented in 2021 by the States Parties as additional information to their 2020 State of conservation report, and requests furthermore the States Parties to ensure its refinement and implementation in collaboration with international experts and development partners, considering the recommendations of the workshops related to the DSOCR held in 2022 in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and in 2023 in Senegal;
- 11. Requests moreover the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 5. Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 136)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44COM 7A.41** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),

- 3. Welcomes the significant progress made by the Congolese Institute for the Conservation of Nature (ICCN) and the partner African Parks in close collaboration with the provincial political-administrative and military authorities and the local communities in the implementation of the corrective measures of the 2016 joint Reactive Monitoring mission and previous decisions of the World Heritage Committee, and encourages the State Party to pursue, with the support of its partners, its actions for the effective protection and management of the property;
- 4. Notes the results of the 2021 ecological monitoring, which show a temporary stabilization in the numbers of Kordofan giraffes and elephants and an increase in the population of hippopotamuses and buffaloes, but <u>recalls</u> that the populations remain very small compared to the situation at the time of the inscription of the property, <u>is concerned</u> about the high level of poaching for bushmeat for commercial and subsistence purposes in the hunting grounds and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to continue efforts to control poaching in order to promote optimal conditions for wildlife restoration, and to submit to the World Heritage Centre the strategy and the Action Plan for the conservation of giraffe in the property, for review by IUCN;
- 5. Reiterating its deepest concern about the probable extinction of the northern white rhinoceros subspecies within the property due to the absence of evidence of presence since 2008, notes the launching of the implementation of an introduction programme of white rhinoceros in the property with the translocation of a first group of 16 individuals of the subspecies of southern white rhinoceros in June 2023, and urges the State Party to:
 - a) Submit to the World Heritage Centre the risk assessment reports carried out in 2018 and 2021 on the introduction of southern white rhinoceros, as well as the indepth study carried out in accordance with IUCN's Guidelines, as soon as possible, for review by IUCN,
 - b) In collaboration with the World Heritage Centre, consult and take into consideration the advice of the African Rhino Specialist Group of the IUCN Species Survival Commission (SSC AfrRSG) prior to the implementation of any translocations of southern white rhinoceros to the property,
 - c) Implement rigorous long-term management of the risks that may be associated with the introduction of the southern white rhinoceros in the property, notably as concerns the security of the individuals, disease, competition with other herbivorous species, and veterinary considerations, to ensure the survival of translocated individuals in accordance with the advice of the IUCN SSC AfrRSG;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the validation of the business plan for the property which guides the management actions for the period 2022-2026 and <u>thanks</u> the European Union and USAID for their financial contribution for the implementation of the said plan;
- 7. Notes with concern the constraints related to the relocation of existing artisanal mining sites in hunting grounds and the limited progress in defining a Land Use Plan (LUP) and creating a functional buffer zone of 2km around the property, and reiterates its long-standing request to accelerate the finalization of the LUP and the creation of the buffer zone in line with the Park's sustainable development strategy, the 2019 ministerial decree prohibiting artisanal exploitation in the hunting areas, and the strategy for relocating refugee camps outside the Park;
- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the continuation of transboundary cooperation with South Sudan, as recommended by the Committee, with a view to establishing a bilateral cooperation framework for the enhanced management of the Garamba-Lantoto landscape and <u>again</u> invites the two States Parties to expedite the formalization of the Memorandum of

- Understanding in order to reduce illegal transborder activities such as poaching and trade in wildlife products;
- 9. Takes note of the information on the progress made by the State Party towards achieving the indicators as proposed by the 2016 mission and reiterates again its request to the State Party to finalize these indicators on the basis of the recent inventory data available, as well as the recommendations of the regional workshop on support for the process of removing natural properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in French-speaking African countries of June 2022 in Kinshasa, and to submit the final version of the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) to the World Heritage Centre, for adoption by the World Heritage Committee;
- 10. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to review the implementation of the corrective measures, and progress made to achieve the indicators as proposed by the 2016 mission, the present state of conservation of the property, the finalization of the DSOCR, as well as the status and proposed plans for the introduction of the southern white rhinoceros to replace the northern white rhinoceros, possibly extinct in the wild, as a key attribute of Outstanding Universal Value;
- 11. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above points, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 6. Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 137)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7A.48, 43 COM 7A.8, 44 COM 7A.43** and **44 COM 7A.46** adopted at its 42nd (Bahrain, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Deplores</u> the continued violence and further loss of life of protected area staff killed in the line of duty, and <u>offers its most sincere condolences</u> to their families and to all the staff of the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN);
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued improvement in the security situation and that the ongoing collaboration between the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN), the Armed Forces of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (FARDC) and local population and authorities has resulted in the removal of the majority of armed groups operating within and in the vicinity of the property;

- 5. <u>Notes with significant concern</u> the new and continuing allegations of serious human rights violations towards indigenous peoples and local communities (IPLCs) linked to law enforcement operations and <u>also takes note</u> of the findings of the "Commission of Inquiry into alleged violations by ICCN staff at Kahuzi-Biega National Park" set up by the State Party to investigate the raised issues;
- 6. Requests the State Party to implement all the recommendations of the report of the Commission of Inquiry, as well as any additional measures necessary to further ensure all conservation activities fully respect human rights and the rights of indigenous peoples and local communities, including by, but not limited to, establishing a national code of conduct for eco-guards and an effective and transparent grievance mechanism for human rights abuses, and by training all law enforcement staff on human rights issues, as well as ensuring an equitably governed consultative process with participation and decision making of all rightsholders and stakeholders, consistent with relevant international norms and the Policy on the Integration of a Sustainable Development Perspective into World Heritage Processes(2015);
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the reported progress on the implementation of the 2019 Bukavu Dialogue recommendations, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to accelerate the continued implementation of the Dialogue recommendations in full consultation with all relevant stakeholders;
- 8. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the continued progress towards achieving the corrective measures for the property including maintaining patrol coverage of the property and addressing artisanal mining and poaching, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to expeditiously implement all corrective measures as updated by the 2017 mission;
- 9. Recalling its concern regarding the increased pressure of encroachment on the property, notes with appreciation that a rehabilitation plan for the ecological corridor has been developed and requests the State Party to submit further details of the plan, and to ensure its implementation takes into consideration any impacts of encroachment on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and actions required to ensure the recovery and regeneration of natural vegetation, in consultation with all relevant stakeholders;
- 10. Recalling the importance of wildlife to the OUV of the property, remains concerned about the low populations of key wildlife species, in particular the population of Grauer's gorilla, compared to the time of inscription and reiterates its requests to the State Party to submit the results of the 2018 or more recent wildlife inventory to the World Heritage Centre, and to finalize, in cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, indicators for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) based on the draft proposed by the 2017 mission and on the wildlife data;
- 11. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to continue the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;
- 13. <u>Also decides</u> to retain Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

7. Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 718)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.7

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7A.9** and **44 COM 7A.43** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts undertaken by the State Party to further strengthen the surveillance of the property but <u>reiterates once more its concern</u> regarding the persistent insecurity in the region, which limits surveillance coverage and effective management of the property, <u>also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to implement all the corrective measures in order to restore the integrity of the property and <u>calls upon</u> donors to provide the necessary financial support;
- 4. Expresses its utmost concern about the continuous and increasing pressure from illegal mining in the property, including the emergence of semi-industrial mining operations approved by the mining regulatory authorities within the boundaries of the property, in contradiction to the protected area legislation, coupled with persistent insecurity, which results in large-scale deforestation and environmental damage, and also facilitates access to the property and attracts further migrants into the property leading to further illegal settlements, agricultural invasions, illegal logging and increased poaching pressure, and considers that the expansion of mining and associated illegal activities is jeopardizing the integrity of the property and therefore directly affecting its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 5. Recalls the commitments made by the State Party as part of the 2011 Kinshasa Declaration, in particular to enforce the conservation laws and mining code, which forbid any mining in protected areas in the Democratic Republic of the Congo and <u>urges</u> the State Party to urgently address the issues of illegal mining at the highest level, to revoke all mining permits attributed within the property, close all mining sites inside the property and access roads to them and initiate restoration activities in the degraded areas;
- 6. Regrets again that no information was provided on the updating of the Integrated Management Plan (PAG) for the property and the formalization of the Central Integral Conservation Zone and <u>urges again</u> the State Party to expedite these processes to integrate provisions relating to the different zones of the property, including the subsistence zones, the Central Integral Conservation Zone and forestry concessions for local communities, and ensure immediate implementation;
- 7. Notes again the intention to repopulate the okapi breeding station and also urges again the State Party to postpone any plans to capture okapi from the wild until the security situation is stable and to develop an integrated in-situ/ex-situ conservation strategy as part of the PAG for the long-term sustainability of okapi within the property, consulting best practice expert guidance, such as the IUCN Species Survival Commission (SSC) Giraffe and Okapi Specialist Group;
- 8. <u>Also welcomes</u> the continued efforts for the participatory demarcation process of the western boundary of the property including through the support provided by the World Heritage Centre with funding from the Government of Norway, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to finalize the full demarcation of the property boundaries:

- 9. Requests again the State Party to provide further details on:
 - a) The number of residents within the villages located inside the property in order to assess the impacts of population increases on land-use in the property,
 - b) The Spatial Monitoring and Reporting Tool (SMART) data to enable an assessment of the impact of illegal activities on the OUV of the property,
 - Data concerning progress accomplished with regard to the indicators defined in the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint UNESCO/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess its state of conservation, the status of increased threats and impacts from semi-industrial mining, implementation of the corrective measures, and the progress towards achieving the DSOCR;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;
- 13. <u>Also decides</u> to retain Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 8. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 136)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.45</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Deplores</u> the continued armed conflict and resulting further loss of life of protected area staff killed in the line of duty and of local communities, and <u>offers its most sincere condolences</u> to their families and to all the staff of the "Institut Congolais pour la Conservation de la Nature (ICCN)";
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress achieved by the State Party and partners in implementing some of the corrective measures despite the challenging security context in the region;
- 5. Expresses its utmost concern regarding the considerable deterioration of the security situation resulting in large parts of the property being in the area under the administration of armed groups and the park authorities having to abandon the gorilla sector, and reported increase in poaching, commends the actions taken by the park authorities to maintain the monitoring of gorilla populations through local community trackers and as well as continuing anti-poaching activities in the rest of the property and urges the State

Party to continue its efforts to protect the property in line with its commitments in the 2011 Kinshasa Declaration, including through the joint organization with UNESCO and its partners of a national workshop on heritage protection in conflict zones in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), as soon as possible;

- 6. <u>Notes with concern</u> the reported increase in deforestation for fuelwood around the camps for Internally Displaced People fleeing the armed conflict and <u>requests</u> the State Party, in collaboration with humanitarian relief organizations, to address the matter, such as by providing the camps with alternative fuel systems for cooking and heating;
- 7. Whilst reiterating its position that oil and gas exploration and exploitation is incompatible with World Heritage status, notes with utmost concern that the State Party has again included the oil blocks overlapping with the property in a new auction for oil and gas blocks, despite the repeated requests by the Committee to cancel existing petroleum concessions granted inside the property, and again strongly reiterates its request to the State Party not to allocate new concessions overlapping with the property and to cancel any existing concessions and to confirm its unequivocal commitment to prohibit new petroleum exploration and exploitation within the property;
- 8. Welcomes the increase of gorilla populations and that elephants are starting to return to the property from neighbouring Queen Elizabeth National Park (Uganda) reported in the latest State Party report, notes with concern that the current upsurge in poaching pressure linked to the insecurity poses a risk that these successes could be reversed, with the increased presence of armed groups impacting patrolling and monitoring of large mammals these species remain vulnerable and under threat by continuing poaching, and encourages the State Party to maintain its efforts to combat poaching as far as the security situation allows, and to submit, as soon as the conditions on the ground allow, the latest results of flagship species inventories, as well as the biological indicators for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) to be finalized in cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN:
- 9. Welcomes the reduction of the encroachment in the property from more than 20% in 2018 to 12% in 2021, recalls that restoring the territorial integrity of the property remains one of the most important challenges and a key requirement to move towards a removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger in the future and urges the State Party to ensure that local, provincial and national authorities cooperate with the park management to halt encroachment and take measures to recover and restore the encroached areas:
- 10. <u>Further notes with concern</u> the reported opening of a road and military infrastructure within the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that any infrastructure developments in or around the property, including hydropower projects and road developments, are assessed for their potential impacts, including cumulative impacts, on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to inform the World Heritage Centre of any new developments in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, prior to any activities being undertaken.
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to implement all corrective measures as updated by the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission and to continue the implementation of the sustainable development activities established in the framework of the Virunga Alliance;

- 12. Requests furthermore the State Party to invite a joint UNESCO/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as the security situation allows, to assess the impact of the renewed fighting in the property on its state of conservation, in particular in the central and gorilla sectors, the actions taken or planned for the cancellation of any oil block auctions overlapping with the property and the implementation of the corrective measures;
- 13. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the development of a 2021-2025 Development and Management Plan (PAG), and the proposed development of a strategy to secure financial autonomy for the property by 2026, and <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to submit the validated PAG to the World Heritage Centre for review;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 15. <u>Decides</u> to continue to apply the Reinforced Monitoring mechanism for the property;
- 16. <u>Also decides</u> to retain Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 9. General Decision on the World Heritage properties in the Democratic Republic of the Congo

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.46** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Regrets that the State Party did not submit a report on the implementation of this Decision, as requested by the Committee at its 44th extended session,
- 4. Notes with utmost concern the reports of alleged human rights abuses towards indigenous peoples and local communities during law enforcement operations and reiterates its requests to the State Party to take urgent measures to further strengthen efforts to address this issue, including by establishing and implementing a national code of conduct for eco-guards and a grievance mechanism for human rights abuses, and by training all staff on human rights issues as part of regular law enforcement training, as well as ensuring that management processes are founded on a rights-based approach that ensures full involvement of all stakeholders, in particular indigenous peoples and local communities, in line with relevant international norms, the 2015 Policy on World Heritage and Sustainable Development;
- 5. <u>While noting</u> the improved security situation in Salonga, Kahuzi-Biega and Garamba National Parks, <u>notes with concern</u> the continued security challenges in Okapi Wildlife Reserve and <u>expresses its utmost concern</u> about the situation in Virunga National Park,

which is again partly situated in the territory controlled by rebel groups and has been the scene of heavy fighting since 2022, resulting again in park staff being tragically killed in the line of duty, strongly condemns this violence once again, addresses its sincere condolences to the families of the victims and all staff of the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN) and urges the State Party to continue to strengthen the capacity of ICCN to continue to ensure the management of the properties in the current difficult security situation and to take all measures to restore peace and security in and around the properties;

- 6. While stressing the importance of ensuring a sustainable financing mechanism, also urges the State Party to ensure the sustainability of the "Okapi Fund for Conservation FOCON" as the Trust Fund for protected areas in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), encourages the donor community, to continue to provide adequate financial and technical support to effectively respond to the management needs of the DRC World Heritage properties;
- 7. <u>Strongly regrets</u> that the State Party has included in the public auction of oil blocks in 2022 two oil blocks overlapping with Virunga National Park, <u>notes with utmost concern</u> the semi-industrial mining activities in Okapi Wildlife Reserve, <u>reiterates its clear position</u> concerning the incompatibility of mining, oil exploration and exploitation with World Heritage status and <u>urges once again</u> the State Party to cancel all concessions for oil blocks and mining concessions that overlap with World Heritage properties;
- 8. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the proposal of UNESCO to organise with the State Party a national workshop in the DRC to discuss challenges and provide recommendations on how to ensure the management and protection of heritage in conflict zones;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a detailed report on the implementation of the Kinshasa Declaration, the security situation in the properties, the measures taken to address human rights abuses and the actions undertaken to cancel all oil exploration and exploitation and mining concessions that encroach on World Heritage properties, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

10. Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya) (N 801bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.10

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- Recalling Decisions 38 COM 7B.90, 39 COM 7B.4, 40 COM 7B.80, 42 COM 7B.92 and 44 COM 7A.47 adopted at its 38th (Saint-Petersburg, 2012), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the State Party's continued effort to manage and resource the property through the challenges of the COVID-19 pandemic, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to guarantee adequate and sustainable resourcing to protect the property and to develop an operation plan as well as a monitoring and evaluation system to implement the Management Plan focused on the preservation of the Outstanding Universal Value

- (OUV), and including a co-management system agreed with local communities on resource use:
- 4. Reiterates again its deep regret over the continued lack of a consolidated response by the States Parties of Kenya and Ethiopia to the Committee's past decisions and urges again the State Party of Ethiopia to provide an urgent update on all planned and current development projects in the Turkana Basin, which could negatively affect the property, and to submit the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the Kuraz Sugar Development Project, the Gibe IV (Koysha) dam under construction and the planned Gibe V dam for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. Recalling that a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) to assess the cumulative impacts from developments in the Omo-Turkana Basin is crucial to plan for the protection of the property's OUV and has been pending since 2014, also reiterates its request to the State Party of Kenya to convene as soon as possible, a workshop with participation from the State Party of Ethiopia, the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, to discuss the cumulative impacts of developments in the Omo-Turkana Basin on the property, including a realistic plan and timeframe for the SEA, to identify urgently needed mitigation measures and to finalize the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in consideration of the broader UNESCO DSOCR Strategy for Africa and thanks Norway for committing to financially support the process to develop the DSOCR for the property;
- 6. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> that failure to mitigate the cumulative impacts of the developments in the Omo-Turkana basin, combined with the pressures from poaching, livestock encroachment and illegal fishing could lead to an erosion and eventual loss of the OUV of the property;
- 7. Requests the State Party of Kenya to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, details regarding the progress in implementation of the Inter-Ministerial Committee on Omo River-Lake Turkana Basin, of the various state of conservation matters pertaining to the property, highlighting the challenges facing the implementation of the developed strategy;
- 8. Regrets that no update on the revision of the SEA for the Lamu Port-Southern Sudan-Ethiopia Transport (LAPSSET) Corridor Program is provided, and therefore reiterates its request to the State Party to complete as soon as possible the revised SEA, taking into account both individual and cumulative impacts that the Program and its projects may have on the OUV of the property, and that no further components of LAPSSET be implemented until the SEA is completed and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party of Kenya to provide an update on the progress in implementing all of the recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission, in particular to:
 - a) Develop a site-specific Biodiversity Action Plan to restore wildlife populations in the property back to levels present at the time of inscription of the property,
 - b) Conduct a comprehensive scientific study to assess the current impacts of grazing and develop a viable grazing pressure reduction strategy, based on grazing capacities, to address encroachment,
 - Establish a co-management system with local communities that stipulates clear regulations regarding use of resources in the property and potentially provides payment for environmental services to local communities;

- d) Establish a long-term monitoring system for the collection and analysis of hydrological and limnological data in Lake Turkana to assess the ecological changes to the lake system and the related impact on the OUV of the property,
- e) Develop a national overarching Master Plan for development in and adjacent to Lake Turkana to avoid any negative impacts on the lake system and OUV of the property,
- f) Create a buffer zone to the property, possibly covering the whole lake and other critical terrestrial areas with complementary legal and/or customary restrictions on its use and development;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 11. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.48** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued efforts made by the State Party to monitor, patrol and support conservation of the property during the COVID-19 pandemic;
- 4. <u>Notes with deep concern</u> that the deforestation rate in the property increased significantly to a record high of 0.07%, exceeding the 0.01% limit according to the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), the further loss of primary forest across all components of the property, and an increase in reports of illegal logging for precious wood species;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the efforts underway and planned to address forest loss through ecological monitoring activities and reforestation and <u>requests</u> the State Party to further strengthen its efforts in the fight against illegal logging and trade of rosewood, complemented with efforts to promote local sustainable development;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the planned renewal of Development and Management Plans for each of the six components of the property, which will assess the current situation regarding logging and mining and will inform future activities including the implementation of corrective measures and its five-year costed Action Plan, and which will lead to the production of an Integrated Management Plan (IMP), and therefore <u>strongly encourages</u> the State Party to ensure that a fully consultative process with relevant stakeholders, including local communities, is followed in the development of the Plans;

- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit the draft Development and Management Plans for the six components of the property and the draft IMP as soon as practicable to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN before their adoption;
- 8. While noting the reaffirmation of the zero-tolerance policy on the logging and export of rosewood and ebony, <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to find a lasting solution aimed at eliminating all stocks of precious woods and halting all illegal logging and trafficking of precious woods, including through the full implementation of the decisions of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) concerning ebony (Diospyros spp.), palisander and rosewood (Dalbergia spp.);
- 9. <u>Also welcomes</u> the reported activities to prepare an inventory and marking of the 'official controlled stockpiles' of seized logs and to valorise them on the national market, using the proceeds for restoration activities, but <u>recalls</u> that the official controlled stockpiles are quite small compared to the 'uncontrolled, but declared stockpiles' and the undeclared illegal stockpiles;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission in order to assess the progress made in the implementation of the corrective measures in achieving the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and to update the corrective measures and the timeline for their implementation in support of the eventual removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 11. <u>Final requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain the Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 12. Aïr and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger) (N 573)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.48** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Takes</u> note of the efforts made by the State Party to implement the corrective measures, and <u>requests</u> it to continue their implementation;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the finalization and quality of the 2022-2024 Development and Management Plan (PAG), and <u>requests</u> the State Party to urgently implement the actions detailed therein, and to provide clarifications concerning its financing, the partnership mentioned with a non-governmental organization and the link with the emergency surveillance plan as well as the strategy for the fight against invasive alien species (IAS);

- 5. <u>Thanks</u> the donors supporting the conservation of the property, in particular the Government of Norway for its support in the implementation of the PAG through the World Heritage Centre;
- Once again regrets that the report does not provide detailed information on poaching, illegal gold panning and excessive logging in and around the property, as well as on the actions implemented to combat these threats, and <u>reiterates its request</u> that the State Party provide maps showing the location of the main threats identified, as well as indications of their severity and extent, and of the control actions carried out, partially available in the PAG;
- 7. Notes with satisfaction the State Party's commitment to assign additional forestry officers and requests it to recruit sufficient staff and strengthen collaboration with the valley chiefs to ensure the effective management of the property and implement the PAG;
- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the proposed Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and <u>requests</u> the State Party to finalize it based on the recommendations of IUCN and to transmit it to the World Heritage Centre for adoption at the 46th session;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the actions taken to combat the proliferation of the *Prosopis juliflora* species and mitigate desertification, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide details on these actions and include them in the PAG for the property;
- 10. Reiterates its concern that some flagship species of the OUV remain highly threatened or endangered, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to develop a monitoring and recovery plan for the signature antelope species in consultation with the IUCN Species Survival Commission (SSC) Antelope Specialist Group and implement the actions detailed in the PAG:
- 11. While noting the assertion by the State Party that the exploration and exploitation permits for gold, uranium and oil are located more than 100 km from the property and have been subject to regulatory procedures and regular monitoring of operations by the competent authorities, reiterates its concern about the proliferation of exploration and exploitation permits, noting in particular the permits located at the south-eastern limit of the property. It thus requests the State Party to provide more information concerning the nature and status of these permits and to ensure that the impacts of exploitation projects on the OUV of the property are assessed within the framework of environmental and social impact assessments (ESIA), in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit on Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Aïr and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

13. Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal) (N 153)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.13

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.50</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the efforts made by the State Party to implement the corrective measures, notably those concerning the monitoring of certain key species for the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and the monitoring of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue the implementation of these measures as updated by the 2015 Reactive Monitoring mission, the various recommendations formulated by the workshops of November 2021, June 2022 and June 2023, in support of the implementation of corrective measures and the achievement of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);
- 4. Welcomes the considerable increase in the means of surveillance brought to the property and the decline of illegal gold mining among the recorded offences during the past three years, requests the State Party to provide precise additional data and maps showing the location of the main offences and threats identified, as well as information on their severity and extent, and on the actions taken to combat them, and reiterates its request to the State Party to take urgent measures to restore habitats degraded by illegal gold mining;
- 5. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the progressive improvement of the ecological monitoring system and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide precise data on the state of conservation and the population trends of all the species characteristic of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), notably the elephant and the lycaon, in critical situation within the property;
- 6. Reiterates its deep concern at the persistence of threats endangering the population of 15 threatened chimpanzees present in the impact zone of the Petowal Mining Company and <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue the annual ecological monitoring of this population and the implementation of actions to mitigate the impact of the main threats to the conservation of the species;
- 7. Welcomes the controls carried out in relation to mining pollution and the installation of water and soil testing equipment at the property, but <u>reiterates its utmost concern</u> over high concentrations of ammonium, manganese and sulphate in the groundwater, and iron and heavy metals in the surface waters of the Gambia River, and <u>further requests</u> that water analyses be continued, that additional microbiological analyses be carried out, and that urgent measures be taken to identify the cause of this pollution and to control it permanently;
- 8. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the identification and planning of the fight against the invasive species *Mimosa pigra* in three ponds of the property, but <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide additional information on the other invasive species throughout the property and to develop an associated control strategy;

- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the protection and restoration measures planned at the time of the closure of the Mansadala quarry but <u>reiterates once again its request</u> to the State Party to immediately close this quarry given its negative impact on the OUV of the property;
- 10. Noting that the financing for the Sambangalou dam has now been secured and that construction work is already underway, reiterates its concern about the potential impacts of the dam on the OUV of the property, notably on the hydrological regime of the Gambia River, downstream of the dam and on the distribution of large and medium-sized mammalian fauna, as indicated by the preliminary analysis of the complementary studies carried out on the environment and biodiversity of the Niokolo-Koba National Park and requests the State Party to provide, on the one hand, the Environmental and Social Action Plan (ESAP) from which the complementary studies were derived, and on the other, the report of the working group responsible for producing the synthesis of the various studies on the analysis of potential impacts and the proposal of selected compensation measures retained for examination by IUCN, to ensure that a full assessment of the potential impacts on OUV has been carried out in accordance with World Heritage impact assessments guidelines and best practices, and that the proposed mitigation measures, including any adjustments to project implementation, will effectively reduce these unavoidable residual impacts;
- 11. <u>Also expresses its concern</u> about the numerous major potential impacts highlighted by the ESIA of the Barrick Gold mining project on the OUV of the property and its peripheral zone, and <u>takes note</u> that the State Party has not provided an environmental approval for its launch;
- 12. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, to assess the state of conservation of the property, including with regard to the above issues, the implementation of the updated corrective measures and recommendations of the 2015 Reactive Monitoring mission, and the progress made in achieving the indicators of the DSOCR;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 14. Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 199bis)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- Recalling Decisions 31 COM 7B.3, 32 COM 7B.3, 33 COM 7B.8, 34 COM 7B.3, 35 COM 7B.6, 36 COM 8B.43, 37 COM 7B 7, 38 COM 7B.95, 39 COM 7A.14, 40 COM 7A.47, 41 COM 7A.17, 42 COM 7A.56, 43 COM 7A.16 and 44 COM 7A.51 adopted at its 31st (Christchurch, 2007), 32nd (Quebec City, 2008), 33rd (Seville, 2009), 34th (Brasilia, 2010), 35th (UNESCO, 2011), 36th (Saint-Petersburg, 2012), 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013),

- 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Also recalling</u> the Committee's clear position adopted in its Decision **40 COM 7**, that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with their World Heritage status,
- 4. <u>Further recalling</u> the commitment made by the State Party that led to the adoption of Decision **36 COM 8B.43**, to not undertake any development activities in the property without the Committee's approval,
- 5. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> the irreversible impact of the continued construction of the Julius Nyerere Hydropower Project (JNHPP) on the values and integrity which underpin the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property as it was inscribed on the World Heritage List;
- 6. Reiterates its concerns regarding the potential impacts of the proposed Kidunda dam project which may inundate part of the property, and requests the State Party not to proceed with any decision that would be difficult to reverse before the revised 2021 Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre and reviewed by IUCN;
- 7. Takes note of the State Party's commitment that the dormant Mkuju uranium mine, Kito1 oil and gas exploration, and oil exploration blocks outside the property, would be
 subject to a new ESIA process should they be considered in future, and also requests
 the State Party to ensure that any development that may impact on the OUV of the
 property is assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a
 World Heritage Context;
- 8. Expresses its utmost concern that the State Party has still not invited the World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, as requested by the Committee since 2018, and urges the State Party to invite this mission as a matter of utmost priority in order to re-establish dialogue on the various challenges, including but not limited to:
 - a) The status and implications of the ongoing construction of the Julius Nyerere Hydropower Project and associated infrastructure for the World Heritage status,
 - b) The status and reported recovery of the elephant population,
 - c) The renewed interest in the Kidunda dam and 2021 revised ESIA for this project,
 - d) The implications of the creation of Nyerere National Park in terms of legal status, governance and funding mechanisms,
 - e) The current status of the OUV of the property and to confirm whether the property continues to demonstrate the integrity and values which underpin the OUV as it was inscribed on the World Heritage List,
 - The future scenarios for the property including options to conserve the wider Selous-Niassa ecosystem;
- 9. <u>Expresses its sincere condolences</u> to the colleagues and families of individuals, including from the Tanzania National Parks Authority and Frankfurt Zoological Society, who were tragically killed and injured in a plane crash in the property;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;

11. <u>Decides</u> to retain Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

ASIA-PACIFIC

15. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) (N 1167)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.15

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.52** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Reiterates its ongoing concern regarding the persistent challenges to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, due to encroachment, the impacts of invasive species, and the prospect of road development, which have the potential to aggravate the decline of key species and the increasing ecological isolation of the property; and expresses its sincere regret that the State Party continues to engage in contemplating potential development activities, including road construction, and reiterates its call to the State Party to increase its efforts to implement the corrective measures in order to avoid gradual loss of OUV of the property over time;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> some positive actions undertaken by the State Party, including the development and implementation of ecosystem management and restoration plans, the strengthening of community engagement efforts, and the reaffirmed absence of mining concessions, mining exploration permits or new roads within the property;
- 5. Requests the State Party to provide further information on the Ministerial Decree on Coordination Team of Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (TRHS) Management, with specific reference to the resulting support to the management of the property;
- 6. Acknowledging that no decision has been taken for the proposed forest clearance within the property, and that a moratorium to prevent primary forest loss has been extended, notes with concern the reported continued forest loss within the property with a significantly lower rate, and urges the State Party to prioritize restoration activities in ecologically sensitive areas, wildlife corridors and roadsides;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide clarification and detailed information pertaining to the following:
 - a) Muara Situlen-Gelombang road that would reportedly cut 18 km through Gunung Leuser National Park (GLNP),

- b) Four hydropower dams (Soraya Dam, Jambo Aye Dam, Kluet Dam and Samarkilang Dam) and mining projects located within the Leuser Ecosystem in the vicinity of GLNP,
- c) The spatial plan under development for the Leuser Ecosystem;
- 8. <u>Also notes</u> the EIA findings for the Karo-Langkat road upgrade for which works have already been completed and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to ensure the full and timely implementation of the identified mitigation measures;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that the EIAs for the Sanggi-Bengkunat road upgrade and the Bukit Tapan-Sungai Penuh road widening projects are undergoing finalization, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to clarify the current status of these projects and submit the EIAs to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, ensuring that the EIAs are in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and include mitigation options that would result in minimal or no impact on the OUV of the property and retain the option not to proceed with the projects if this is not achievable:
- Requests moreover the State Party to provide details on the Trans-Sumatran Highway proposal in relation to the GLNP component of the property, including the proximity of roadworks to the national park and any assessment undertaken on potential impacts on the OUV of the property;
- 11. <u>Notes furthermore</u> that the new management plan of KSNP for 2020-2029 was finalized, and <u>invites</u> the State Party to submit this management plan in English, either in full or as a summary, to the World Heritage Centre;
- 12. Requests moreover the State Party to submit a detailed report on the implementation of the corrective measures, action plan and timeframe for their implementation, and encourages the State Party to continue the property boundary demarcation supported by the UNESCO/Netherlands Funds-in-Trust project, and to seek guidance from the World Heritage Centre, IUCN and the UNESCO Office in Jakarta to advance a proposal for a significant boundary modification;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. Notes with concern the persisting threats to the property and their potential impact on its OUV and decides to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism to the property to allow for a closer monitoring of its state of conservation;
- 15. <u>Decides</u> to retain Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

16. East Rennell (Solomon Islands) (N 854)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.16

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.53</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's continued efforts to implement the corrective measures and recommendations made by the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, yet <u>reiterates its concern</u> that limited progress has been made towards their effective implementation, and therefore <u>requests</u> the State Party to strengthen these efforts;
- 4. Reiterates once again its request to the State Party to adopt, as a matter of urgency, a new Cabinet Paper with the commitments and associated budgets of the respective ministries reflected in the budget allocation for the next fiscal year;
- 5. <u>Commends</u> the continued efforts by customary landowners, local communities of East Rennell and the Lake Tegano World Heritage Site Association (LTWHSA) to safeguard the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, <u>also reiterates its concern</u> that potential threats to the property's OUV arising from commercial logging and mining still exist, in the absence of an adequate legal protective mechanism for the property;
- 6. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to accelerate the pending finalization of the Management Plan and community dialogue on the Protected Areas Act 2010, including by exploring potential support from the Global Environment Facility (GEF-6)-funded project in this regard and <u>urges</u> all parties concerned to develop a workable long-term solution for the customary governance of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide a detailed update in its next progress report, <u>recalling its position</u> that the long term conservation of the property's OUV can only be secured with the full consent of the customary land owners and land users in full respect of their rights;
- 7. <u>Expresses</u> its utmost concern about the reported granting of bauxite mining exploration licenses possibly overlapping with the property, <u>recalling</u> its position that mining, including exploration, is considered incompatible with World Heritage status for natural sites, <u>appreciates</u> the clear position by the local communities against proposed bauxite mining exploration reportedly in the area bordering the property, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to unequivocally confirm that the mining project has been abandoned;
- 8. Also welcomes the cancellation of the commercial logging proposal and the proposed associated new road, and reminds the State Party to undertake a full Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for other planned developments, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, including for the upgrade of the existing road, to assess any potential impact on the property's OUV before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and to submit a copy of the EIA to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 9. <u>Regrets</u> that no information was provided on the previously reported mass mortality of flying foxes, and thus <u>also urges</u> the State Party to undertake a scientific investigation

- on this issue to identify causes and appropriate management interventions to safeguard this population as an important attribute of the property's OUV;
- 10. Notes the EIA conducted for the grounding of an industrial barge inside the property, and expresses concern regarding the extent of the damage to local coral reefs and the adverse socio-economic impacts on local communities, and thus calls upon the responsible company and licensee of SAPOR 2302 to adhere to the conclusions and recommendations of the EIA with regards to compensation for ecological, cultural and socio-economic impacts of the grounding;
- 11. Reiterates its great concern that local communities continue to face food insecurity, accelerated by the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic and climate change, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to address the issue as a matter of urgency, and <u>also calls upon the international community to provide urgent humanitarian support;</u>
- 12. Further welcomes the community and stakeholder consultations organized in April/May 2022 which identified priority actions for developing sustainable livelihoods in East Rennell, and the livelihood projects supported by the UNDP GEF Small Grants Programme and the UNESCO/Netherlands and UNESCO/Japan Funds-in-Trusts and the project jointly implemented by BirdLife International and local communities to study and mitigate the impacts of invasive rats, and encourages the State Party to continue mobilizing additional international support, including through the International Assistance mechanism under the World Heritage Fund, as well as climate change funding to conduct an integrated vulnerability assessment of the property;
- 13. <u>Further reiterates its concern</u> that achieving the full implementation of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) by 2025 will be challenging without significant international support, and <u>further calls upon</u> the international community to provide the State Party with the necessary support;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, including a progress report of the implementation of the recommendations made by the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 15. <u>Decides</u> to retain East Rennell (Solomon Islands) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

17. Everglades National Park (United States of America) (N 76)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.17

The World Heritage Committee,

1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.54** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress achieved in implementing the corrective measures, and <u>notes</u> <u>with satisfaction</u> that the Modified Water Deliveries (MWD), 'Canal-111 South Dade' (C-111), Everglades Construction Project, and the Combined Operational Plan (COP) are operational;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for continuing to implement restoration projects in order to achieve the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and <u>also notes with satisfaction</u> the additional funding commitments of almost USD 1.5 billion;
- 5. Also welcomes the positive trend for some of the DSOCR indicators, but notes with concern that almost two thirds of the sub-indicators still remain below the restoration targets needed to achieve the DSOCR, and therefore requests the State Party to continue to strengthen current restoration efforts, including the State of Florida's Restoration Strategies Project, and the Central Everglades Planning Project (CEPP) with the Everglades Agricultural Area (EAA) Reservoir project;
- 6. <u>Appreciates</u> the new legislation and additional resources for the management of invasive alien species (IAS), and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure a continued, long-term allocation of resources to control IAS within the property, and for the management strategy to emphasize prevention and early detection combined with rapid response measures;
- 7. Notes with concern the increasing impacts of climate change on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, including the climate change-induced shift of habitat of some species outside the property, and requests the State Party to strengthen current restoration efforts to increase the resilience of the property and to develop a climate change adaptation strategy for the property, building on adaptation and mitigation measures identified in the General Management Plan (GMP) and emerging climate change challenges including sea level rise;
- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the purchase of approximately 8,000 ha of land and drilling rights in the Everglades Protection Area to permanently prevent oil, gas and mineral exploration and extraction in this area;
- 9. Expresses its utmost concern about the reported adverse impact of the planned extension of the SR 836 / Dolphin Expressway on the Greater Everglades wetland ecosystem and urges the State Party to identify alternatives that do not negatively impact on the OUV of the property, and to assess potential impacts of any proposed development on the OUV in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context prior to making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, and to submit the assessment to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 10. Requests the State Party to work with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN to update the corrective measures, including a timeline for their implementation, and that the DSOCR be reassessed to take into account recent progress and challenges and to consider potential impacts on the OUV due to climate change and invasive species, and recalls that any changes to the corrective measures and the DSOCR should be reviewed by the Advisory Bodies and proposed to the Committee for approval;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the SR 836/Dolphin Expressway, and by

- **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Everglades National Park (United States of America) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

18. City of Potosi (Bolivia, Plurinational State of) (C 420)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.18

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.35** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Commends the State Party for its efforts to implement the previous Committee decisions and the set of corrective measures for achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) despite the difficult context at the national level;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the finalization, official approval and submission of the Integrated and Participatory Management Plan (IPMP) for the entire property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure its full implementation with adequate resources in place;
- 5. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to finalize the revised proposal of a Minor Boundary Modification for the establishment of the property's buffer zone, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the proposal to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies and approval by the World Heritage Committee, as per Paragraphs 163 and 164 of the Operational Guidelines, as soon as possible, and no later than **1 December 2023**;
- Regrets that no significant progress has been achieved to ensure the consolidation and enforcement of the legal framework and regulations related to the entire property and that no sufficient resources and mechanisms needed to address long-standing and serious concerns related to the property's productive mining heritage have been identified;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide sufficient human and financial resources to address the architectural and industrial heritage conservation challenges identified for the implementation of future projects at the historic centre;

- 8. <u>Express its concern</u> about the environmental impacts of mining concessions approved at the Kari Kari Lagoons, one important component of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure legal protection to this area and protect its integrity;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 10. <u>Decides</u> to retain City of Potosí (Bolivia (Plurinational State of)) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 19. Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama) (C 135)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.36** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Acknowledging the important contribution of the project funded by the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB) for the conservation and management of the property, takes note of the commitment expressed by the State Party to implement the full set of corrective measures;
- 4. Also takes note that the original timeframe to reach the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) is no longer suitable, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide regular updates to the World Heritage Centre on progress in the negotiation with the IADB to extend the loan until 2025, and to update the roadmap and timeframe for achieving the DSOCR;
- 5. <u>Further takes note</u> of the State Party's submission of a proposal for the establishment of a buffer zone for the property as a Minor Boundary Modification for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its current 45th session under Agenda Item 8;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the Community Development Plan of Portobelo, but <u>regrets</u> that little progress has been made in the elaboration of the new integral Management Plan for the serial property and its buffer zones, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to strengthen the efforts that would allow for the plan's completion in 2022 and to submit the document once finalised to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the works and projects to improve the quality of life of the residents of the town of Portobelo and the completion of the new Land Management Plan, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit the plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;

- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> the works and projects oriented towards the consolidation, conservation and restoration of the elements that make up the two components of the serial property and those related to the visitor centre and natural trails in San Lorenzo, and <u>notes</u> the State Party's submission of the documentation for these works and projects to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Welcomes furthermore</u> that steps to include Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) in World Heritage properties are in progress, and <u>requests furthermore</u> that a HIA for the visitor centre be carried out as soon as possible and the results submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies:
- 10. Requests moreover the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain the Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 20. Chan Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru) (C 366)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.37** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to implementing the Master Plan of the property and to providing the necessary funding for this purpose, and <u>appreciates</u> the continued research and monitoring activities of the Pan-American Conservation Centre for Earthen Heritage Sites (PCCEHS), as well as the implementation of a number of important conservation projects, public awareness and outreach activities;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its continued commitment to the implementation of the Committee's decisions and programme of corrective measures, as adopted in Decision **36 COM 7A.34**, with the aim of achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);
- 5. <u>Notes however with regret</u> that, although some progress has been made, two essential components of the programme of corrective measures have remained pending for several years, and <u>urges once again</u> the State Party to urgently take the necessary measures for enhanced coordination, commitment and a strict timeframe for:
 - a) the delimitation and regulations of the proposed buffer zone,
 - b) the implementation of the amended Law No. 28261 that would address the matter of illegal occupation;

- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 7. <u>Decides</u> to retain Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 21. Coro and its Port (Venezuela, Bolivarian Republic of) (C 658)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.38** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> of the restoration and conservation works undertaken in the property, in collaboration with the traditional mud artisan school;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the information submitted regarding the development of a Minor Boundary Modification for the establishment of the property's buffer zone, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the final proposal for such Minor Boundary Modification to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies and approval by the World Heritage Committee, as per Paragraphs 163 and 164 of the Operational Guidelines, as soon as it is available, also ensuring that the buffer zone is adequately reflected in the relevant legal framework and planning instruments for the property;
- 5. Takes note with concern that insufficient information was provided by the State Party regarding its progress towards addressing each of the 11 corrective measures adopted in Decision 38 COM 7A.23 to reach the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and of the delay reported on their implementation; and in this regard, reiterates its request to the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission report, providing guidance on the actions needed to effectively implement the complete set of corrective measures;
- 6. Regrets that the issue of vulnerability to flooding and water damage of the property has not yet been durably and comprehensibly solved, as the financial resources necessary to put in place a complete drainage system have not been identified;
- 7. <u>Expresses its great concern</u> that no updated outline or draft of the property's Management Plan has been submitted yet, and that insufficient progress is reported on the property's disaster risk preparedness, and therefore <u>further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit the draft Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as it is available;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property, which follows the mandatory format contained in Annex 13 of the Operational Guidelines and provides clear and complete information on all corrective measures adopted to reach the DSOCR.

and on the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;

9. <u>Decides</u> to retain Coro and its Port (Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

AFRICA

22. Old Towns of Djenné (Mali) (C 116rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.22

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.1** adopted at its 44th extended session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the efforts made by the State Party to maintain constant management and conservation of the property, as well as the mobilization and responsiveness of the local communities, both for the protection of the archaeological sites and for the ancient fabric of the town;
- 4. <u>Also appreciates</u> the measures taken at the four archaeological sites for their protection, monitoring and security against looting or illegal occupation, but <u>requests</u> the State Party to resolve the persistent problem of insufficient technical and financial means of the Cultural Mission of Djenné for the overall management and conservation needs of the property;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that the management and conservation plan of the property expired in 2022, and requests the State Party to submit the updated draft management plan to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Expresses its concern about the various observations made regarding the ancient fabric of the town, such as the lack of space, the use of houses for animal husbandry, the sealing of banco houses with cement and the collapse of abandoned houses, the disorderly use of unauthorized signs and the construction of solid houses, but welcomes the fact that the town of Djenné has mobilized its own funding to rehabilitate several monumental houses, promoting traditional and customary conservation mechanisms, and encourages the State Party to continue to raise awareness among all actors to maintain this momentum;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued work on the inventory of houses, with particular emphasis on abandoned houses, <u>notes</u> that the purpose of the inventory was to inform conservation and repair, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit a sample of the inventory and identify its scope;

- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to ensure that the rehabilitation and conservation work of the houses is recorded and documented, in particular with regard to the use of traditional methods and materials, as part of the authenticity of the property;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> that a guide for the maintenance of the houses will be drafted, that decorative modifications with 'modern' materials are forbidden, and that housing lots and social housing have been distributed to the most vulnerable;
- 10. Requests the State Party, in order to better appreciate in more detail all the information provided in its reports, to include, in future, more illustrations with photographs and other materials, especially as a reactive monitoring mission has still not been able to visit the property to assess its state of conservation and the progress made in the implementation of corrective measures:
- 11. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> that a programme of capacity building and remote and field assistance, supported by the World Heritage Fund, for the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) for each of the three Malian properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger, is being finalized;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Old Towns of Djenné (Mali) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

23. Timbuktu (Mali) (C 119rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.23

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7A.2** adopted at its 44th extended session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the continuity of the conservation, management and awareness-raising measures undertaken by traditional actors, notably the mosque management committees and the masons' guild in a still precarious security context;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the maintenance and rehabilitation work undertaken on various parts of the three mosques, notably the urgent interventions at the Djingareyber Mosque, such as the refurbishment of the façades and doors, and the interventions on the electrical installations, <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure that all the work is well documented with regard to demonstrating that traditional methods and materials bolster the authenticity of the property and requests the State Party to provide details on the work undertaken;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that climate change seems to have aggravated the supply of traditional construction material, and <u>reiterates its request</u> for the creation of plantations to guarantee a sustainable supply of appropriate building timber;

- 6. <u>Expresses its concern</u> over the continued silting of the mosques, which appears to be related to the silting of the Niger River due to deforestation and <u>urges</u> the State Party to consider appropriate strategic actions that could begin to address this problem at an appropriate regional level;
- 7. <u>Notes</u> that the management and conservation plan of the property expired in 2022 and requests the State Party to submit the updated draft management plan to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Recognizes that the State Party has paid increased attention to the importance of traditional conservation methods, by increasing the involvement of various stakeholders through exchange meetings or training workshops on the involvement of communities in the management of heritage, and requests the State Party to further strengthen these actions to ensure that the initiatives called for by traditional communities are coordinated with the Cultural Mission and respect the heritage rules preserving the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
- 9. <u>Also commends</u> the State Party for raising awareness, particularly among municipal and regional authorities, of the importance of heritage protection and management, including the establishment by the Governor of a working commission to enforce the town planning regulations, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to inform the Committee in more detail of the measures taken by this commission to improve enforcement of the regulations;
- 10. Reminds the State Party of the importance of not undertaking development projects around the mosques of Djingareyber, Sankore and Sidi Yayia, without prior studies of their potential impact on them, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to further promote the contribution of civil society to the promotion of heritage, and awareness-raising on social networks and among traditional communities;
- 12. Expresses its appreciation that a capacity-building programme with remote and on-site assistance, supported by the World Heritage Fund, for the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) for each of the three Malian properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger, is being finalized;
- 13. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to continue the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;
- 15. Decides to retain Timbuktu (Mali) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

24. Tomb of Askia (Mali) (C 1139)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.24

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.3</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Expresses its satisfaction that the "Project for the Rehabilitation of the Tomb of Askia", financed by the International Alliance for Protection of Heritage in Conflict Areas (ALIPH), has enabled a significant dynamic mobilization by the State Party and the local community for the effective conservation, management and promotion of the property through a series of measures on the property and its buffer zone, and strongly encourages the State Party to continue in this direction, while ensuring an acceleration of the implementation of the project to overcome the administrative delays encountered;
- 4. <u>Also appreciates</u> the establishment of a National Blue Shield Committee and for having succeeded in mobilizing additional funds for the documentation and development of the historic graves of the Necropolis from the African World Heritage Fund (AWHF), and reiterates its request to the State Party to coordinate with the different partners and donors the projects developed for the mobilization of funds, in order to ensure greater coherence between the actions and to foresee the establishment of a system of consultation between these partners for an effective follow-up;
- 5. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party for having informed it of its decision to abandon the project to develop car parks in front of the main gate of the property and behind the asphalt road;
- 6. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the plans to improve the visibility of the property by reducing the height of the enclosing wall;
- 7. Welcomes the efforts made also in the buffer zone, notably for a project to build low walls to fence off the buffer zone, invites however the State Party to submit more details, notably concerning signage and monitoring of urban planning standards to be applied, to the World Heritage Centre in order to better understand the contribution of the project to the preservation of the site;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> that the management and conservation plan of the property expired in 2022 and requests the State Party to submit the updated draft management plan to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that the 10 corrective measures are now all being implemented but <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure the durability of the technical and financial means for the sustainable conservation and management of the property;
- 10. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> that a capacity building and remote and field assistance programme, supported by the World Heritage Fund, for the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) for all three Malian properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger, is currently being finalized;

- 11. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to continue the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism for the property;
- 13. Decides to retain Tomb of Askia (Mali) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 25. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) (C 1022)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **35 COM 7A.17** and **44 COM 7A.4** adopted at its 35th session (UNESCO, 2011) and extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021) respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the reconstruction of the Mazibu Azaala Mpanga, the restoration of the Bujjabukala (gate house) and the close collaboration of the State Party with the World Heritage Centre, the UNESCO Regional Office in Nairobi and the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the strong commitment and engagement of the Government's national and local authorities, as well as the traditional management of the Buganda kingdom authorities, and the Kasubi local communities, as the custodians of sacred sites;
- 5. <u>Acknowledges</u> the continued financial commitment of the Government of Japan, through the Japanese Funds-in-Trust for the Preservation of the World Cultural Heritage, the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund (HEF) and the World Heritage Fund to the installation of a firefighting system for the tombs area of the property;
- 6. <u>Also acknowledges</u> the Government of Norway's financing of the World Heritage Centre project aiming at developing the guidelines by promoting the application of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) to safeguard heritage in African contexts, which took this property as a case study, <u>also welcomes</u> the efforts made towards re-evaluating the buffer zone boundary alignment, defining development guidelines for the buffer zone and aligning local planning regulations with the safeguarding, maintenance and transmission of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and the requirements of its protection and management, and <u>requests</u> to the State Party to:
 - a) Continue its efforts to establish an improved buffer zone alignment, complete guidelines for the buffer zone in collaboration with World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, guided by the approach of HUL, and submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Submit the amended local planning regulations that accommodate the guidelines for the buffer zone to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;

- 7. <u>Notes</u> the conclusions and recommendations of the 2023 joint UNESCO/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission and <u>strongly encourages</u> the State Party to implement these recommendations:
- 8. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to proceed with updating the Management Plan for the property aligned with HUL including to:
 - a) Update the Disaster Risk Management Plan into the existing Management Plan,
 - b) Align the Management Plan with the existing Master Plan,
 - c) Provide mechanisms to harmonize the Management Plan with the buffer zone guidelines currently under development,
 - d) Include a tourism management component in the Management Plan based on a thorough understanding of the carrying capacity of the property,
 - e) Translate the corrective measures defined for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSCOR) into management actions to be implemented continuously for the protection and management of the tangible and intangible attributes of the property;
- Also commends and congratulates the State Party, as well as the Buganda Kingdom and
 its partners for substantively completing the implementation of the corrective measures
 defined for achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property
 from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR);
- 10. <u>Decides</u> to remove the Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) from the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ARAB STATES

26. Abu Mena (Egypt) (C 90)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.26

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.5** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts undertaken towards improving the state of conservation of the property, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue its work on the corrective measures adopted at its 31st session (Christchurch, 2007);

- 4. <u>Notes</u> the invitation from the State Party for a World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property;
- 5. Requests that the Management Plan be revised in light of the ICOMOS Technical Review, with particular attention given to ensuring that conservation planning is completed, as well as developing plans for visitor management and sustainable development;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 7. <u>Decides</u> to retain Abu Mena (Egypt) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 27. Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq) (C 1130)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.6** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Taking into account Decision 45 COM 7A.30 on World Heritage properties in Iraq,
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the decision by the State Party to halt any further construction of Makhool Dam, given its potential impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure the permanent cancellation or relocation of the project;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the efforts of the State Party in providing an informative report, with indications on the damages incurred and planned conservation works at the property, as well as in seeking partnerships and support for documentation, protection and conservation;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the conclusions and recommendations of the 2022 joint World Heritage/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission and <u>requests</u> the State party to implement its recommendations, with particular regard to:
 - a) Preparation of an overall comprehensive conservation plan for the property in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Carrying out regular maintenance activities, following testing in a pilot area and monitoring over a certain period,
 - c) Submitting a detailed report on all planned and ongoing interventions carried out and their priority to the World Heritage Centre, noting that all interventions must be integrated into the comprehensive conservation plan for the property,

- d) Undertaking site protection measures, including the prevention of uncontrolled access, as well as installing a fence and proper signage that does not negatively impact the OUV of the property,
- e) Elaboration of a management system and preparation of a Management Plan that defines and protects the attributes of OUV;
- 7. Encourages the State Party to pursue consultations with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to prioritise urgent maintenance and stabilisation actions for damaged and deteriorated components, while recalling that emergency stabilisation work should only be undertaken in cases where collapse or further damage is imminent and according to the principle of minimal intervention, reiterates its request to the State Party that all interventions be addressed within the framework of the overall comprehensive conservation plan for the property, which should be prepared as a matter of priority;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to continue to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information on all future works that may have an impact on the OUV of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> the cooperation undertaken by the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS towards the development of the retrospective Statement of OUV for the property;
- Further requests the State Party to initiate the elaboration the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, and the necessary corrective measures, in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and advisory Bodies;
- 11. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Iraq as per the United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 of February 2015, 2253 of December 2015 and 2347 of March 2017;
- 12. <u>Calls again</u> on all Member States of UNESCO to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

28. Hatra (Iraq) (C 277rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.28

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.7** and **44 COM 7A.9** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Taking into account Decision 45 COM 7A.30 on the World Heritage properties of Iraq,
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the efforts undertaken to address the protection and conservation of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to the extent possible and to seek any needed further support;
- 5. Encourages the State Party to pursue urgent priority actions, and reminds the State Party that emergency stabilisation work should only be undertaken in cases where collapse or further damage is imminent and according to the principle of minimal intervention, and that remedial and repair work should be guided by a comprehensive conservation plan prepared in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, recalling the need to provide details of planned and ongoing projects to the World Heritage Centre for technical review by the Advisory Bodies prior to implementation, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission that visited the property in June 2023, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to implement the mission's recommendations, in particular addressing the following:
 - a) Carrying out investigations related to the water table,
 - b) Finalizing the conservation plan for the Temenos area on the basis of a detailed damage assessment of its monuments, and scientific analyses, after which pilot interventions, addressing natural deterioration phenomena, could be selected and monitored over time to assess the efficacy of any proposed action,
 - c) Elaborating a monitoring programme, coupled with a capacity building programme,
 - d) Carrying out an assessment of potential threats in the area situated between the inner and outer city walls, including potential illegal access and encroachment, and accordingly elaborate additional possible protection measures.
 - e) Initiating the preparation of a site management plan that takes into consideration requirements related to management and conservation, with a visitor management plan,
 - f) Elaborating a strategy and resources for documentation management;
- 7. Also takes note of the work carried out towards the elaboration of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of corrective measures, as well as the recommendations of the mission in this regard;
- 8. Adopts the following DSOCR and corrective measures:
 - a) DSOCR framework:

- (i) The removal of substantive threats arising from the conflict between 2014 and 2017,
- (ii) Improved site protection and accessibility of the site by the management team, with the reinstatement of site management facilities,
- (iii) Enhanced knowledge and skills with regard to conservation and management at the property,
- (iv) Threats to Hatra's archaeological heritage mitigated and damage incurred as a result of the conflict addressed,
- (v) Damage resulting from conflict repaired;
- b) Corrective measures:
 - (i) Reinstating the management of the property by the State Board of Antiquities and Heritage (SBAH) and ensuring its protection and accessibility for the local community and visitors,
 - (ii) Enhancing capacities of professional staff of SBAH in heritage conservation and management,
 - (iii) Undertaking site documentation, monitoring, and studies for adequate conservation and management,
 - (iv) Repair of damage resulting from conflict,
 - (v) Assessing risks at monuments indirectly impacted by the conflict and addressing vulnerabilities, including through assessment, studies and urgent stabilization;
- c) Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures:
 - The implementation of corrective measures should be completed within a period of one year;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit a boundary clarification to the World Heritage Centre, and consider the submission of a minor boundary modification proposal for the designation of a buffer zone, for added protection of the property, in line with paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. Reiterates its appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Iraq as per the United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 of February 2015, 2253 of December 2015 and 2347 of March 2017:
- 11. <u>Calls again</u> on all States Parties to support emergency safeguarding measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 12. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. Decides to retain Hatra (Iraq) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

29. Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq) (C 276 rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.29

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.8** and **44 COM 7A.9** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),
- 3. Taking into account Decision 45 COM 7A.30 on the World Heritage properties of Iraq,
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the information provided by the State Party and its efforts in alleviating threats to the property, but <u>reiterates its concern</u> about the lack of comprehensive and detailed information on the property's state of conservation;
- 5. <u>Expresses its deep concern</u> regarding the condition of the property, recent damage and its deteriorated state, arising from the impact of encroachment, urban sprawl and bulldozing activities, in addition to natural deterioration and weathering;
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to submit a comprehensive report on the damage incurred at the property, along with photographic documentation of all affected monuments, including a detailed report on the bulldozed areas and encroachments, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party that interventions be addressed within the framework of the overall assessment of damage and risks, and a comprehensive Conservation Plan be prepared in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and in the meantime, emergency stabilization and conservation work should adhere to the principle of minimal intervention and only be undertaken in critical cases where there is threat of further accelerated damage and collapse, and requests the State Party to proceed in accordance with the technical reviews undertaken for works being carried out in the Great Mosque, the Caliphal Palace, Al Hir, and the Bab al-'Amma, the proposed reconstruction project for the Great Mosque, and the possible construction of two primary schools within the buffer zone of the property;
- 8. Also requests the State Party to continue to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for evaluation by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information on all future works that may have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including Heritage Impact Assessments prepared in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context for any major projects, and to do so before making any decisions that will be difficult to reverse, and to refrain from undertaking the restoration or reconstruction of monuments prior to conducting detailed analyses and studies and to receiving outcomes from ensuing evaluation by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission that visited the property in June 2023, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to implement its recommendations and to pursue the development of a comprehensive conservation plan, the identification of corrective measures and the elaboration of a Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSCOR);

- Reiterates its appeal to all State Parties to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Iraq as per the United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 of February 2015, 2253 of December 2015 and 2347 of March 2017;
- 11. <u>Calls again</u> on States Parties to support emergency safeguarding measures including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 30. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of Iraq

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add 2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.9** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the reports provided by the State Party regarding the state of conservation of the properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger, and acknowledges with appreciation the efforts of the State Party and the international community to address conservation issues:
- 4. <u>Continues to express its appreciation</u> to the Director-General of UNESCO for the progress made towards rehabilitating and safeguarding cultural heritage in the Old City of Mosul, and for the expertise and resources mobilized so far within UNESCO's "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" flagship initiative, and also <u>expresses its appreciation</u> to the donors for their generous contributions towards this end;
- 5. Reiterates its request to the State Party to provide comprehensive and detailed assessment of the condition of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger to the fullest extent possible, including systematic photographic surveys, drawings, graphics, quantitative data and identification of potential risks, to safeguard damaged properties according to the principle of minimal intervention, and to refrain from undertaking conservation and restoration work until comprehensive conservation plans have been developed, in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Reminds the State Party about the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, information on any future plans for major restoration or new construction, or other projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;

- 7. Requests the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive monitoring mission to Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat), as outlined in Decision 45 COM 7A.27;
- 8. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Iraq as per the United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 of February 2015, 2253 of December 2015 and 2347 of March 2017:
- 9. <u>Continues to call</u> on all States Parties to provide technical and financial support to safeguarding efforts for Iraq's World Heritage and other cultural heritage sites, including through the "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" initiative, in order to implement short-, mediumand long-term measures;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the World Heritage Centre to present at its 46th session a report on the activities related to cultural heritage undertaken within the framework of the "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" initiative;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the properties and the implementation of the above.
- 31. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having considered</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4 and the Annex attached to this decision,
- 2. Recalling its previous decisions concerning the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls,
- 3. <u>Decides</u> that the status of the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls relating to the World Heritage List remains unchanged as reflected in Decisions **44 COM 7A.10** and **44 COM 8C.2** of its last session.

--

ANNEX

The World Heritage Committee

Extended 45th session of the Committee (45 COM)

Item 31: Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4,
- 2. Recalling the relevant provisions on the protection of cultural heritage including the four Geneva Conventions (1949), the Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict (1954) and its related protocols, the Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property (1970), the Convention for the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972), the New Delhi UNESCO Recommendation of 1956 concerning excavations undertaken in occupied territories, the inscription of the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls at the request of Jordan on the World Heritage List (1981) and on the List of World Heritage in Danger (1982) and related recommendations, resolutions and decisions of UNESCO,
- 3. Reaffirming that nothing in the present decision, which aims at the safeguarding of the authenticity, integrity and cultural heritage of the Old City of Jerusalem on both sides of its Walls, shall in any way affect the relevant United Nations resolutions and decisions, in particular the relevant Security Council resolutions on the legal status of Jerusalem, including United Nations Security Council resolution 2334 (2016),
- 4. <u>Also reaffirming</u> the importance of the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls for the three monotheistic religions,
- 5. Reminding that all legislative and administrative measures and actions taken by Israel, the occupying Power, which have altered or purport to alter the character and status of the Holy City of Jerusalem, and in particular the "basic law" on Jerusalem, are null and void and must be rescinded forthwith.
- Further recalling the 24 decisions of the Executive Board: 185 EX/Decision 14, 187 EX/Decision 11, 189 EX/Decision 8, 190 EX/Decision 13, 192 EX/Decision 11, 194 EX/Decision 5.D, 195 EX/Decision 9, 196 EX/Decision 26, 197 EX/Decision 32, 199 EX/Decision 19.1, 200 EX/Decision 25, 201 EX/Decision 30, 202 EX/Decision 38, 204 EX/Decision 25, 205 EX/Decision 28, 206 EX/Decision 32, 207 EX/Decision 38, 209 EX/Decision 24, 210 EX/Decision 36, 211 EX/Decision 33, 212 EX/Decision 43, 214 EX/Decision 22, 215 EX/Decision 36 and 216 EX/Decision 33, and the 11 decisions World Heritage Committee decisions: 34 COM 7A.20, 35 COM 7A.22, 36 COM 7A.23, 37 COM 7A.26, 38 COM 7A.4, 39 COM 7A.27, 40 COM 7A.13, 41 COM 7A.36, 42 COM 7A.21, 43 COM 7A.22 and 44 COM 7A.10,
- 7. Regrets the failure of the Israeli occupying authorities to cease the persistent excavations, tunnelling, works, projects and other illegal practices in East Jerusalem, particularly in and around the Old City of Jerusalem, which are illegal under international law and reiterates its request to Israel, the occupying Power, to prohibit all violations which are not in conformity with the provisions of the relevant UNESCO conventions, resolutions and decisions;
- 8. <u>Also regrets</u> the Israeli refusal to implement the UNESCO request to the Director-General to appoint a permanent representative to be stationed in East Jerusalem to report on a regular basis about all aspects covering the fields of competence of UNESCO in East Jerusalem, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the Director-General to appoint, as soon as possible, the above-mentioned representative;
- 9. <u>Stresses</u> again the urgent need to implement the UNESCO reactive monitoring mission to the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls, and <u>invites</u> the Director-General and the World

Heritage Centre, to exert all possible efforts, in line with their mandates and in conformity with the provisions of the relevant UNESCO conventions, decisions and resolutions, to ensure the prompt implementation of the mission and, in case of non-implementation, to propose possible effective measures to ensure its implementation;

10. <u>Decides</u> to retain the Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

32. Rachid Karami International Fair-Tripoli (Lebanon) (C 1702)

Property inscribed during the 18th extraordinary session of the World Heritage Committee (UNESCO, 2023). No reporting is required on this property at this session of the World Heritage Committee.

33. Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Libya) (C 190)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.33

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.11** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the efforts undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation of the property; and <u>requests</u> it to continue its efforts in this regard to the extent possible;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> that the Cyrene Grand Hotel project is halted, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to keep the Committee informed on the evolution of the situation at the property and to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, on any on-going and future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Further notes</u> the restoration works being carried out at the theatre in the Agora area, the Severan gate area, and the sanctuary of Apollo, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide detailed information in this regard, and to continue to consult with the World Heritage centre and ICOMOS with regard to conservation materials and techniques planned at the property before their application;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to provide updated information about the damage caused by pollution due to sewage disposal of Shahat city into Wadi Belghader and to seek the necessary technical and financial support to develop relevant mitigation measures;
- 7. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to initiate the process to develop a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired

- state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Requests furthermore the State Party, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, to develop a draft Retrospective Statement of OUV, for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
- 9. Requests moreover the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the elaboration of a Minor Boundary Modification proposal, and to submit it in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 10. <u>Strongly encourages</u> the State Party to pursue the development of the Management Plan for the property, and <u>invites</u> it to seek the necessary technical and financial support;
- 11. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the invitation from the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, and <u>also encourages</u> it to take place as soon as conditions permit;
- 12. <u>Continues to call</u> for an increased mobilization by the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 13. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property from Libya and engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict, as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and the 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 15. <u>Decides</u> to retain Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 34. Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Libya) (C 183)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.12** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the efforts undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation of the property; and <u>requests</u> it to continue its efforts in this regard to the extent possible and to seek the necessary funds as needed;

- 4. <u>Also notes with great concern</u> the alarming state of conservation of the Hunting Baths and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Pursue the development of a conservation strategy for the Hunting Baths, with urgent conservation measures aiming to preserve and protect the monument, and to seek the necessary technical and financial support in this regard,
 - b) Present the proposed conservation plan for the Hunting Baths to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies,
 - c) Continue to consult the Advisory Bodies with regard to restoration materials and techniques planned to be used at the Hunting Baths and the other archaeological remains at the property before their application;
- 5. <u>Further notes with concern</u> the issue of tidal flooding and continuous sea encroachment on the circus area and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to develop proposals with mitigation measures to address the issue and to present the proposals to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to initiate the development of a comprehensive Conservation Action Plan for the property, and to pursue the development of a Management Plan, while seeking the necessary technical and financial support in this regard;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to finalize the process of development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Requests furthermore the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the elaboration of a Minor Boundary Modification proposal, and to submit it in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 9. Requests moreover the State Party, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, to finalize the development of a draft Retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and to submit it for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
- 10. Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to keep the Committee informed on the evolution of the situation at the property and to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, on any on-going and future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Notes furthermore with appreciation</u> the invitation by the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to evaluate its state of conservation, to take place as soon as the conditions permit;
- 12. <u>Continues to call</u> for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:

- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 35. Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) (C 184)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.13** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the efforts undertaken by the State Party in securing projects and initiatives addressing a number of conservation issues and the improved presentation of the property;
- 4. Requests the State Party to continue its efforts in this regard, to keep the Committee informed on the evolution of the situation at the property and to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, on any ongoing and future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the outcomes of the damage assessment of the Roman Theatre and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to carry out further investigation, involving an experienced stone conservator and a local structural engineer to determine, with the site management and the Department of Antiquities, the areas for direct intervention and a sustainable monitoring and conservation strategy for the property;
- 6. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to continue to consult the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies with regard to restoration materials and techniques planned to be used at the Roman Theatre and the other archaeological remains at the property before their application;
- 7. Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to initiate the process to develop a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, to develop a draft Retrospective Statement of OUV, for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to continue the close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the elaboration of a Minor Boundary Modification proposal, and to submit it in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Continues to encourage</u> the State Party to pursue the development of a Management Plan for the property, and <u>invites</u> it to seek the necessary technical and financial support and allocate the resources required for its implementation;

- 11. <u>Continues to call</u> for an increased mobilization by the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 12. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the invitation by the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to evaluate its State of Conservation, and <u>encourages</u> it to take place as soon as conditions permit;
- 13. Requests moreover the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 36. Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) (C 362)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.14** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the important efforts made by the State Party to mobilize partners and undertake activities for the conservation of the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), particularly those directed towards the implementation of corrective measures for the achievement of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as adopted by the Committee at its previous session, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue its efforts in this regard;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to finalize the development of a management plan for the property, including a risk preparedness plan, taking into account the recommendations of ICOMOS' technical review;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the ongoing capacity-building activities and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to keep the Committee informed about the progress in this regard, including the implementation of the Visitor Centre project at the Alaally building;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the elaboration and submission of the Minor Boundary Modification proposal, following consultations with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies:
- 7. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the invitation from the State Party for the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS mission to be carried out as soon as conditions permit in order to assess the overall state of conservation of the property;

- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to regularly inform the Committee on the evolution of the situation at the property and any new measures undertaken to implement the corrective measures, as well as any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Continues to call</u> for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the corrective measures that have been identified:
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 37. Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Libya) (C 287)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.15** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Regrets that the State Party did not submit its report on the state of conservation of the property, as requested by the Committee at its extended 44th session;
- 4. <u>Urges again</u> the State Party to continue its efforts for the conservation of the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), in close coordination with local communities and civil society;
- 5. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to continue to pursue the elaboration of a Management Plan for the property, seek the necessary technical and financial support for its completion, and allocate the necessary resources for its implementation;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed about the evolution of the situation at the property and of any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, including the provision of detailed information on the rehabilitation of the fort at Alawenat, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Recalls</u> the need to invite the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property requested by the Committee, and <u>encourages</u> it to take place as soon as conditions permit;

- 8. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to initiate the process to develop a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 9. Requests the State Party, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, to develop a draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
- Continues to call for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 11. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property from Libya and engaging in the protection of cultural heritage in the context of armed conflict, as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and the 1970 Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property;
- 12. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 38. Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) (C 1565)

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having considered</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7A.28**, **43 COM 7A.29** and **44 COM 7A.16** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Decides</u> that the status of **Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town** relating to the World Heritage List remains unchanged as reflected in Decision **41 COM 8B.1** of the World Heritage Committee.

ANNEX

The World Heritage Committee

Extended 45th session of the Committee (45 COM)

- 1. <u>Having considered</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4,
- 2. Recalling Decision **41 COM 8B.1** adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017), which did not include a Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (SOUV), and <u>noting</u> that in compliance with Paragraph 154 of the Operational Guidelines, when deciding to inscribe a property on the World Heritage List, guided by the Advisory Bodies, the Committee adopts a SOUV for the property,
- 3. <u>Taking note</u> of a revised draft SOUV contained in the state of conservation report submitted by the State Party,
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the consultations held between experts from UNESCO, the State Party and the Advisory Bodies, as well as the ongoing exchanges, with regard to the revised draft SOUV, the draft Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and the related corrective measures, and <u>invites</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to finalize the above documents;
- 5. Decides to consider the examination of a draft SOUV for the property at its 46th session;
- 6. <u>Also takes note</u> of the Management and Conservation Plan (MCP) for the property and requests that once the SOUV for the property is adopted and the DSOCR is finalised, the MCP be amended in collaboration with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Deplores the ongoing Israeli excavations, works, construction of private roads for settlers and of a Wall inside the Old City of Al-Khalil/Hebron which are illegal under international law and harmfully affect the authenticity and integrity of the site, and the subsequent denial of freedom of movement and freedom of access to places of worship, and asks Israel, the Occupying Power, to end all violations which are not in conformity with the provisions of relevant UNESCO conventions, resolutions and decisions, and further takes note with concern of reports of works related to the electric elevator;
- 8. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the actions which are being taken to conserve significant attributes of the property;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information on current conservation and development projects, particularly projects which have potential adverse impact on heritage, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 11. <u>Also decides</u> to retain Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

39. Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines – Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Palestine) (C 1492)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.39

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.17** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou /online, 2021),
- Commends the State Party for its efforts to improve the state of conservation of the
 property and to implement the corrective measures to achieve the Desired state of
 conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
 (DSOCR), and in particular the restoration and the preparation of guidelines for the
 drystone walls and the rehabilitation of the watchtowers;
- 4. <u>Also commends</u> the State Party for having appointed a Site Manager for the property to work with the Steering and Site Management Committees, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit further detailed information on the membership, roles and tasks of these committees to the World Heritage Centre;
- 5. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue seeking the required funds to undertake the development of a sufficient sewage system as a priority;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to develop and implement the land-use plan and related bylaws to avoid uncontrolled urban growth within the property and its buffer zone, with the full involvement of the municipalities and local communities;
- 7. <u>Takes note with concern</u> of the reports of ongoing illegal constructions and other developments within the property and its buffer zone;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit the project documentation for the proposed bus parking lot and visitor interpretation centre to the World Heritage Centre before any final decision is taken and to continue to inform the World Heritage Centre of any proposed plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 10. <u>Decides</u> to retain Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Palestine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

40. Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 21)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.40

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.18** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
- 4. <u>Taking note</u> of the UNESCO Rapid Assessment mission carried out to the property in February 2023 following the devastating earthquake, <u>expresses great concerns</u> about the damage inflicted at the property, which poses additional challenges to recovery efforts:
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> that safety measures were implemented in the Old City to protect inhabitants from risks of collapse of damaged structures, as previously requested by the Committee, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to stabilize and consolidate the original fabric and architectural details, where possible, in preference to dismantling;
- 6. <u>Taking note</u> of the continued efforts towards the recovery of the property since December 2016, <u>reiterates its encouragement</u> to all stakeholders to continue their efforts, and <u>requests</u> that repair and reconstruction uses matching stone and that planning for reconstruction ensures the authenticity of design and materials,
- 7. Reminds the State Party of its obligation to submit information on major projects to the World Heritage Centre, in compliance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Also reminds</u> the State Party of the need to develop a Reconstruction and Recovery Master Plan and an updated Management Plan for the property, and <u>recommends</u> that these plans be developed in line with the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape and in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Calls again</u> on all States Parties to support the emergency safeguarding and recovery measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- Reiterates the need for the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out as soon as the situation allows, in order to proceed with a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;
- 11. <u>Invites</u> the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to facilitate the elaboration of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of corrective measures at the earliest opportunity;
- 12. <u>Noting</u> the previously reported issuance of a regulation for the creation of a buffer zone, <u>also reiterates its encouragement</u> to the State Party to submit a proposal for a minor boundary modification to the World Heritage Centre by **1 February 2024**, in accordance with Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines, for review by ICOMOS;

- 13. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 41. Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 22bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.41

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.19** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46**, on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
- 4. Recalling the previously reported extensive illegal excavations at the site, reiterates its call upon the international community to collaborate for the sharing of inventories and documentation that could facilitate the return of looted cultural property;
- 5. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue implementing emergency consolidation work at the property and to limit other restoration works until optimal restoration approaches have been determined;
- 6. Welcomes the project aimed at conducting the necessary studies for the rehabilitation of the Kalybe monument (Cradle of the King's Daughter) funded through the World Heritage Fund, and requests the State Party to revise the project report in line with the technical review by ICOMOS and re-submit it for further technical review, and also requests the State Party to submit detailed information about the proposed anastylosis project, including project documentation and a Heritage Impact Assessment prepared in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, in conformity with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines for review by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, prior to any final decision about the proposed works proceeding:
- 7. <u>Taking note</u> that the approval of the building code is progressing, <u>recalls</u> that the technical review also highlighted the need for the preparation of a site management plan and master plan, which are crucial to inform restoration decisions and ensure coordination among stakeholders and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to instigate these important projects as soon as circumstances allow;
- 8. <u>Calls again</u> on all States Parties to support emergency safeguarding and recovery measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- Reiterates the need for the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out as soon as the situation allows, in order to proceed with a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;

- 10. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to pursue the elaboration of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and a set of correctives measures, for potential examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 11. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 42. Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 20bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.42

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.20** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
- 4. Takes note of the restoration works carried out at the property, including major repair to the ancient city wall between Bab Touma and Bab al-Salam supported by the World Heritage Fund, and the adaptation of the Khan Suleiman Pasha to become a five-star hotel, and requests the State Party to submit further information about this project for review by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, and reminds the State Party to submit information on any proposal that may have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse and before any further works commence, along with Heritage Impact Assessments, in conformity with paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the work undertaken on infrastructure improvement, the provision of equipment and the response mechanisms in place to ensure efficiency in mitigating risks linked to electricity and sewage infrastructure in priority areas, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue implementing the risk mitigation strategy;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the opening of the educational centre for traditional crafts, the organization of training workshops on traditional building construction techniques, and the provision of traditional materials for all restoration works undertaken by the Directorate of the Old City:
- 7. <u>Notes</u> that a micro-finance loans system is being established for residential housing, and that restoration licenses have also been issued for buildings in residential areas;

- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> the enhanced cooperation of the national institutions in charge of the management of the property with local communities, NGOs and the University of Damascus;
- 9. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to continue to implement fully all of the recommendations of the 2016 UNESCO First Aid Support Meeting and the 2016 UNESCO Technical Assistance Workshop, and to submit an updated report on works related to the Ottoman Bank to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. Also takes note that a coordination mechanism, led by the Directorate of the Old City under the responsibility of the Governorate of Damascus, is operating efficiently at the site, and that management and protection activities are undertaken under the guidance of a Master Plan which is operational, though still under the process of being approved, requests the State Party to provide further information on how the digital transformation project and comprehensive development plan are linked with the overall Master Plan to ensure the long terms sustainable development of the City, and to inform the World Heritage Centre once the Master Plan is approved;
- 11. <u>Encourages again</u> the State Party to seek funding support for the elaboration of the Management Plan, which remains a crucial tool for the adequate long-term management of the property;
- 12. <u>Urges</u> all parties to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the attributes which support and convey the OUV of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;
- 13. <u>Calls upon</u> the international community to support the conservation of the property;
- 14. Commends the progress made by the State Party in the implementation of the corrective measures, aimed at achieving the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and <u>further encourages</u> it to continue implementing the corrective measures in accordance with the established timeframe, and to submit reports and evidence to the World Heritage Centre as the corrective measures are progressively being implemented;
- 15. Reiterates its request that the invited World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission be carried out as soon as the situation allows, in order to enable a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;
- 16. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 17. <u>Decides</u> to retain Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

43. Ancient villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1348)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.43

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.21** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,
- 4. <u>Expresses its great concern</u> about the situation at the property, in particular the ongoing presence of armed groups, the additional damage resulting from the February 2023 earthquake, and the lack of detailed information on damage incurred;
- Calls again on all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any action that could cause further damage to the property, including through its use for military or other purposes;
- 6. <u>Also calls again</u> on all States Parties to support emergency safeguarding and recovery measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- Reiterates the need for the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out as soon as the security situation allows, in order to proceed with a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 9. <u>Decides</u> to retain Ancient Villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

44. Crac des chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1229)

Decision: 45COM 7A.44

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.22** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,

- 4. <u>Expressing its concerns</u> about the additional damage at the property resulting from the February 2023 earthquake, <u>welcomes</u> the works planned in the framework of the Emergency Assistance request approved in March 2023, with the aim of addressing its impact at both castles;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the substantial progress made towards the recovery of both component sites of the property, due to efforts made for establishing strategic partnerships and seeking international support, notably through requests to the World Heritage Fund;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the works undertaken by the State Party, in the framework of the projects supported through International Assistance under the World Heritage Fund, and their contribution to improved management;
- 7. <u>Further welcomes</u> the progress made towards the implementation of the financial assistance request approved on 28 July 2021 to address the protection of the property's buffer zones, and in particular the submission of the Minor Boundary Modification proposal and the efforts made to mitigate risks of fire in the buffer zone of Qal'at Salah El-Din;
- 8. Also takes note of the works undertaken and proposed to the stables and counterscarp walls at Crac de Chevaliers, to address structural stability issues, and in view the scale of the proposed intervention and its potential effect on a major attribute of the property, which supports its OUV, requests the State Party to prepare a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.
- 9. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the works undertaken by the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS for the elaboration of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of correctives measures, and <u>adopts</u> the following DSOCR, corrective measures and timeframe:
 - a) Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR):
 - (i) Removal of substantive threats arising from the conflict that started in 2011,
 - (ii) Restoration of the deteriorated/compromised attributes, or at least evidence that the State Party has planned more appropriate restoration works and has initiated the process at both sites,
 - (iii) Reinstatement of the property's protection and management system with enhanced collaboration with the local community, in order to enhance the capacity to manage additional factors that threaten the integrity and authenticity of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
 - b) Corrective measures:
 - Implemented since 2013:
 - (i) Debris management and cleaning carried out at both sites,
 - (ii) Damage assessment and documentation carried out at both sites,
 - (iii) Cleaning of vegetation growth endangering the structures undertaken at both sites,
 - (iv) Emergency structural interventions and restoration work initiated at both sites.

- (v) Preparation of a Master plan for Crac des Chevaliers initiated,
- (vi) Illegal constructions identified within the buffer zones.
- Not yet implemented:
- (vii) Damaged structures at Crac des Chevaliers are restored. Those not yet restored should be at least planned appropriately,
- (viii) All emergency structural interventions are implemented at Qal'at Salah El-Din.
- (ix) Cooperation with the local community is strengthened for an enhanced protection at both component sites,
- (x) Challenges in the buffer zone are addressed, notably a damage assessment is carried out and emergency measures are defined in the buffer zone of Crac des Chevaliers and the boundaries of the buffer zone of Qal'at Salah El-Din are redefined,
- (xi) A study and consultations are carried out to set criteria and priorities for the removal of illegal constructions within the buffer zone of Crac des Chevaliers.
- Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures:
 The implementation of corrective measures should be completed within a period of three years;
- 10. <u>Calls upon</u> the international community to support the implementation of the above-mentioned corrective measures;
- 11. <u>Reiterates</u> the need for the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out as soon as the situation allows, in order to proceed with a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 45. Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 23bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.45

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7A.23** and **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> Decision **45 COM 7A.46** on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic,

- 4. Reiterates its concern regarding the extensive illegal excavations at the property, and calls upon the international community to collaborate in the sharing of inventories and documentation that could facilitate the return of looted objects;
- 5. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property coming from Syria as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 of February 2015, and, in engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017:
- 6. Welcomes the creation of an international scientific task force which sets a framework for technical support provided for the conservation and recovery of the property, the meetings organized thereafter to discuss the preliminary studies and excavation work undertaken at the Triumphal Arch, and the submission of the restoration project for technical review by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the approval of the International Assistance request for the first stage of work for the consolidation of the portico of the Temple of Bel, as well as the proposed preparation of a Conservation Management Plan for the property;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue to transmit detailed information on any major project within the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. Reiterating its concern that monuments at the property remain at serious risk of further damage, exacerbated by weathering and the lack of funding availability for emergency intervention, reiterates its request to the State Party to implement fully the recommendations of the 2019 UNESCO technical meeting and to continue to seek funding to support these activities;
- 10. <u>Commending</u> the efforts undertaken, including the restoration of Afqa Spring and other interventions, which contribute to the return of inhabitants and allow for the accommodation of experts and work teams, <u>calls again</u> on all States Parties to support emergency safeguarding and recovery measures, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 11. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the work instigated by the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies towards the elaboration of a set of corrective measures and the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and <u>encourages</u> them to finalize the proposal for examination by the Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Reiterates</u> the need for the invited joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out as soon as the situation allows, in order to proceed with a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property;
- 13. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. <u>Decides</u> to retain Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

46. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic

Decision: 45 COM 7A.46

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Taking note</u> of the reports provided by the State Party regarding the state of conservation of the six Syrian World Heritage properties and the sites included on the national Tentative List, <u>commends</u> the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) and all heritage professionals and local communities in Syria who are working on monitoring, protecting, and conserving cultural heritage, despite the prevailing challenges;
- 4. <u>Expresses its utmost concern</u> about the damage incurred, including additional damage resulting from the impacts of the 2023 earthquake, and the threats still facing several properties;
- 5. Continues to urge all parties associated with the situation in Syria to refrain from any action that would cause further damage to the country's cultural heritage, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, including preventing any damage that may result from targeting World Heritage properties, sites included in the national Tentative List and other cultural heritage sites;
- 6. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party and the international community to include recovery actions of cultural heritage properties within the overall humanitarian, security and peace building response, and support recovery plans that promote community participation, sustainability and inclusion, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party of the importance of affording priority to overall planning for recovery through Master Plans and Management Plans, to be developed in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, and in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the works initiated by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the elaboration of a set of corrective measures and the Desired state of conservation for the removal from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) of some of the Syrian properties;
- 8. Reiterates its appeal to all States Parties to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property coming from Syria as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 of February 2015, and, in engaging in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, and reiterates its suggestion to the State Party to consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;
- 9. Requests the State Party to pursue the systematic documentation of all damage incurred at World Heritage properties, whenever conditions allow, to implement all possible risk mitigation measures;

- 10. <u>Also reminds</u> the State Party about the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, information on any proposed major restoration or new construction project, including infrastructure development projects, that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;
- 11. Reiterates its call upon the international community to further support the safeguarding of Syrian cultural heritage through earmarked funds or through contributions to the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
- 12. <u>Also reiterates its call upon</u> the international and national cultural heritage professionals to unite for the safeguarding of Syria's cultural heritage, and to pursue their ongoing initiatives in coordination with UNESCO;
- 13. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the properties and the implementation of the above.

47. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.47

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.25** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Expresses its continuing concern that the Historic Town of Zabid has incurred irreversible damages and continues to be vulnerable to extreme weather conditions and security challenges, and continuing limited support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the efforts undertaken in capacity building, awareness raising, damage assessment, documentation and emergency interventions at the property, and <u>requests</u> that they continue in consultation with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Reiterates its previous requests</u> to the State Party to:
 - Submit information on major projects to the World Heritage Centre, in compliance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, for review by the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Elaborate proposals for a boundary clarification and a minor boundary modification in close coordination with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies, to be submitted in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - c) Consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;

- 6. <u>Commends</u> the outcomes of the first phase of the UNESCO/EU Cash for Work Project in Yemen, and the launch of the new EU-funded UNESCO Project 'Youth Employment through Culture and Heritage;
- 7. <u>Notes with concern</u> that current circumstances and lack of resources continue to prevent progress with the National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016-2020 and the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage;
- 8. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the processes required to enable the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, including the implementation of corrective measures, as soon as the situation in Yemen allows;
- 9. Continues to urge all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the OUV of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, especially sites on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and appeals to all States Parties to cooperate in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347;
- 10. <u>Reiterates its previous calls</u> to the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures;
- 11. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 48. Landmarks of the Ancient Kingdom of Saba, Marib (Yemen) (C 1700)

Property inscribed during the 18th extraordinary session of the World Heritage Committee (UNESCO, 2023). No reporting is required on this property at this session of the World Heritage Committee.

49. Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) (C 385)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.49

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.26** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the efforts undertaken in capacity building, awareness raising, damage assessment, documentation and emergency interventions at the property, and <u>requests</u> that they continue in consultation with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Expresses its continuing concern</u> that the Old City of Sana'a has incurred irreversible damages and continues to be vulnerable to extreme weather conditions and security challenges, and continuing limited support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
- 5. Urges the State Party to:
 - a) Submit information on all major projects to the World Heritage Centre, in compliance with paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines, for review before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, while recalling that major transformations, should be assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, as they could have a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property,
 - b) Pursue the elaboration of proposals for a boundary clarification and a minor boundary modification in close coordination with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies, to be submitted in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - c) Consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the outcomes of the first phase of the UNESCO/EU Cash for Work Project in Yemen, the launch of the new EU-funded UNESCO Project 'Youth Employment through Culture and Heritage, as well as the implementation of the Japan-funded project 'Building Climate-resilient Communities in Historic Cities in Yemen through Strengthened Disaster Risk Management and Awareness';
- 7. <u>Notes with concern</u> that current circumstances and lack of resources continue to prevent progress with the National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016-2020 and the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage;
- 8. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the processes required to enable the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, including the implementation of corrective measures, as soon as the situation in Yemen allows;
- 9. Continues to urge all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the OUV of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, especially sites on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and appeals to all States Parties to cooperate in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347;
- 10. <u>Reiterates its previous calls</u> to the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural

Heritage, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures;

- 11. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 12. <u>Decides</u> to retain Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 50. Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) (C 192)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.50

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7A.27** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the ongoing local and international efforts to protect and conserve the property, despite the very difficult conditions, and <u>takes note</u> of the conservation projects which have been completed;
- 4. <u>Expresses its continuing concern</u> about the damage caused to the property as a result of natural elements and the ongoing armed conflict, and that the property continues to be vulnerable, owing to the residual impact of previous flooding as well as the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
- 5. Reiterates its previous requests to the State Party to:
 - Submit information on all major projects, to the World Heritage Centre, in compliance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, for review by of the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Submit the report 'Conservation Status of Shibam Hadramout 2018-2019, Strategy for the Management of the Historic City of Shibam', as well as full details regarding the works undertaken at the Governmental Complex buildings, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - Elaborate proposals for a boundary clarification and a minor boundary modification in close coordination with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies, to be submitted in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - d) Consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the outcomes of the first phase of the UNESCO-EU Cash for Work project in Yemen, the launch of the new EU-funded UNESCO Project 'Youth Employment through Culture and Heritage in Yemen', as well as in the implementation of the Japan-

- funded project 'Building Climate-resilient Communities in Historic Cities in Yemen through Strengthened Disaster Risk Management and Awareness';
- 7. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the processes required to enable the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, including the implementation of corrective measures, as soon as the situation in Yemen allows;
- 8. Continues to urge all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the OUV of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, especially sites on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and appeals to all States Parties to cooperate in the protection of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347;
- 9. Reiterates its previous calls to the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures:
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

51. Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan) (C 208 rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.51

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.3,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7A.1**, **43 COM 7A.41** and **44 COM 7A.28** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Regrets that a state of conservation report was not submitted for the property;
- 4. <u>Express its deep concern</u> with regard to the current humanitarian situation in Afghanistan, the difficult situation of the education and cultural sectors, and the

- challenges faced by the national and international communities, including the United Nations system, in implementing technical assistance;
- 5. Notes that the UNESCO/Japan Funds-in-Trust project "Sustainable Management of the Bamiyan World Heritage property Preparing the removal of Bamiyan from the List of World Heritage in Danger", the UNESCO Korean Funds-in-Trust project "The Bamiyan Cultural Centre", the Italian Funds-in-Trust projects "Preservation and Promotion of the Bamiyan Valley through Culture-Oriented Sustainable Development" and "Local Community Empowerment and Preservation of Shahr-e Gholghola, the World Heritage site in Bamiyan" have contributed to some progress in achieving the Desired state of conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and requests that an updated report on these projects be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for technical review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Considering</u> the Strategic Framework for Afghanistan (UNSFA), <u>recommends</u> that activities be focused on assistance to achieve the DSOCR, including the operational activities, revision of the Action Plan and timeline, as well as documentation and research activities:
- 7. Requests that details of the technical assignments and work plan concerning the property, as well as the rapid assessment of the state of conservation of the property be shared with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and to ensure that the project be implemented in line with the corrective measures adopted in Decision 31 COM 7A.21;
- 8. Considering the prevailing situation in the country, also recommends that all stakeholders be informed about the technical requirements, as outlined by the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, on the mitigation of adverse effects of the reported commercial activities in front of the western Buddha niche, the construction of the road in Tepe Almas near Shahr-i-Gholghola, the proposed revision of the 'Bamiyan Energy Supply project', and the possible reinstalment of the "Old Bazaar" destroyed in the 1990s; and also requests to comply fully with the provisions of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines and not to take any decision that would be difficult to reverse before submitting detailed documentation to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies and obtaining the approval of the Committee;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> that the elements suggested by ICOMOS for the revision of the Strategic Master Plan be taken into consideration in order to ensure a more holistic management approach that valorises the site as a cultural landscape, promoting the involvement of local communities and addressing the necessary modification of the buffer zones, in order to address the issue of uncontrolled urban development within the Bamiyan Valley which would place threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and the associated cultural assets;
- 10. Takes note with concern of the reported incidents at the property, notably concerning the storage facilities for artefacts in September 2021, the nonprofessional excavation activities near the top part of the Western Buddhas niche in January 2022, and the possible use of lands for commercial activities in archaeologically sensitive areas, and urges to respect the provisions of the international treaties ratified by Afghanistan, such as the 1954 Convention, 1970 Convention and 1972 Convention, as well as the 2015 UNESCO Recommendations on the Museums and Collections, and further recommends to:
 - a) Ensure regular verification of the state of the storages and keep up proper inventories,

- b) Provide a report on the conservation status of all significant artefacts, including those housed at the Cultural Centre, following the assistance through UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund,
- c) Ensure the backfilling of the holes at the top of the Western Buddha niche,
- d) Closely monitor the commercial activities within the inscribed area and buffer zones.
- e) Carefully review the concept of reinstating the "Old Bazaar" destroyed in the 1990s at its original location, having regard to potential alternative locations, and appropriate design, materials, planning and management in place;
- 11. <u>Thanks</u> the international community for its support and urgent measures for the protection of cultural objects and cultural sites within the property;
- 12. <u>Reaffirms</u> its solidarity to the Afghan people, expresses again its strong commitment to safeguarding Afghanistan's heritage, and <u>reiterates</u> its call to all concerned to observe the humanitarian law and international instruments relating to heritage, so that all the diversity in heritage that constitutes an integral part of Afghanistan's history and culture can be preserved;
- 13. Requests moreover the submission to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, of an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 14. Decides to retain Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 52. Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) (C 211 rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.52

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.3,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7A.42** and **44 COM 7A.29** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Expresses its deep concern</u> regarding the current situation in Afghanistan in terms of humanitarian, educational and cultural environments, and the challenges faced by the national and international communities, including the United Nations system, in effectively preserving cultural heritage and implementing technical assistance activities;
- 4. <u>Notes with serious concern</u> the continued lack of sustainable human and financial resources and the alarming field situation, which, combined with natural disasters, have brought another layer of difficulties for the implementation of conservation work based upon the 2017 Conservation Action Plan (CAP) and the corrective measures adopted in 2007 by the Committee in Decision **31 COM 7A.20**;
- 5. Urges the State Party to seek the necessary means to implement the following:

- a) Installation of a monitoring instrument on the Minaret of Jam to measure its inclination.
- b) Emergency stabilization work for the wooden staircases to prevent further destabilization of the minaret's structure.
- c) Construction of a footbridge over the Hari Rud and the reconstruction of the site office at the property, in order to improve access to the property and site security,
- d) Completion of the emergency cleaning of sediment from the riverbeds and the implementation of preventive measures based on the local hydrogeological conditions and hydraulic engineering studies, including upstream gabion and retaining walls, tree planting, and monitoring of the height and flow of the Hari Rud and Jam Rud rivers.
- e) Permanent deployment of security personnel on the ground;
- 6. Recommends that technical assistance, including the assistance provided by the International Alliance for the Protection of Heritage in Conflict Areas (ALIPH), contribute to the implementation of the adopted corrective measures, in particular pursuing additional technical studies, identifying the most urgent and feasible actions in light of the current situation, and, to the extent possible, to benefitting the local communities;
- 7. Requests that the draft Conservation Plan elaborated under the ALIPH funded project be revised based on the ICOMOS review to produce an update of the CAP, which should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Regrets that the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone still remain to be precisely defined, and reiterates its request to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a proposal for a Minor Boundary Modification, taking into consideration the topographical map produced in 2012 to facilitate the delineation of these boundaries, in conformity with the CAP and in accordance with Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the allocation of necessary financial and human resources for the safeguarding of the property through relevant budget in order to address conservation issues at the property, including the proposal for a boundary modification, the establishment of the overall action plan for the CAP as well as capacity-building;
- 10. Reaffirms its solidarity with the Afghan people, expresses again its strong commitment to stand together in safeguarding Afghanistan's heritage, and reiterates its call to all concerned to observe the humanitarian law and international instruments relating to heritage, so that all the diversity of heritage, moveable or immoveable, that constitute an integral part of Afghanistan's culture can be preserved;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the international community to provide support to the Afghan people in preserving their heritage and cultural rights;
- 12. Requests furthermore the submission to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, of an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

53. Nan Madol: Ceremonial Centre of Eastern Micronesia (Micronesia (Federated States of)) (C 1503)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.53

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 7A.30</u> adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> that progress to establish an effective management and protection system for the property and address the urgent pressures and threats affecting its state of conservation has been delayed by border and travel restrictions caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, and <u>welcomes</u> the State Party's assurances that these can soon be addressed;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the information that funds will be provided by the US Department of State through its Ambassadors Fund for Cultural Preservation Large Grants Program to support a two-year implementation programme;
- 5. <u>Notes with concern</u> however that, despite the efforts of the State Party and its partners, the processes affecting the state of conservation of the property have yet to be effectively addressed:
- 6. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to continue its work on previously identified matters of high priority, including:
 - Continuing the implementation of the urgent vegetation management actions and clearing mangroves from the main canals, following the virtual training programmes,
 - b) Appointing and establishing a long-term commitment to the post of 'Property Manager',
 - c) Finalising and approving legislation LB392 to provide legal protection to the property and establish the Nan Madol Trust,
 - d) Finalising the Master Plan for the Sustainable Conservation of the Nan Madol World Heritage Site, the site Management Plan and the Sustainable Tourism Plan,
 - e) Establishing processes for Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) as part of the management system,
 - f) Submitting a draft Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their completion, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that work has commenced on the Nan Madol Visitor Centre with support from the Government of Japan, and in line with the findings of the ICOMOS Technical Review:
- 8. <u>Expresses concern</u> that the development of a proposed tourism resort on Nahnningi Island, within the buffer zone of the property has continued before an HIA was prepared, and that the issues raised in the 2019 ICOMOS Technical Review have yet to be addressed, and further reiterates its request that the State Party ensure that construction

is halted and that an HIA is realised, in conformity with the new Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage context, developed in collaboration between the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre, and provided to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before work resumes;

- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, in accordance with Paragraphs 172 and 118bis of the Operational Guidelines, detailed information on any proposed and ongoing projects, including HIAs carried out according to the aforementioned Guidance, for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to the approval and/or implementation of any project;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain Nan Madol: Ceremonial Centre of Eastern Micronesia (Micronesia (Federated States of)) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 54. Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan) (C 885)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.54

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7B.48, 41 COM 7A.57, 42 COM 7A.4 and 44 COM 7A.31 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively, and also recalling Decision 43 COM 7A.44 adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) session, in which the Committee decided "to allow the State Party two years to explore possible options for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination, and at the end of this period, to consider once again whether the property should be retained on the World Heritage List for a further period to allow time, if by then a clear direction of travel has been articulated, or to delete the property altogether", and that in exploring options, the State Party "should undertake further research and documentation and develop a restoration plan, in order to provide sufficient details to allow assessment of the potential for each option to justify [Outstanding Universal Value (OUV)], before any work is undertaken on a significant boundary modification in compliance with Paragraphs 165 and 166 of the Operational Guidelines or on a new nomination", and further encouraged the State Party to "request upstream support in relation to the potential for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination to justify OUV",
- 3. Notes the progress made by the State Party, in particular with comprehensive research supported by scientific documentation, analysis of historical sources, archival documents and satellite images as well as participatory research with the inhabitants of the mahallahs, acknowledges that the State Party has considered the two options suggested in Decision 43 COM 7A.44;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> the State Party's wish to explore an alternative option, as presented in the "Restoration Plan of Shakhrisyabz, Proposal for a Regeneration Strategy", which aims

to restore the monuments and their settings, re-landscape the central area where major demolition was undertaken to recreate urban spatial links and introduce aspects of Timurid garden design, and slightly extend the boundaries to include the whole line of defences;

- 5. <u>Further notes</u> that the proposed option as presented by the abovementioned "Restoration Plan of Shakhrisyabz" is not for a new nomination nor a significant boundary modification but rather for a minor boundary modification in line with the existing OUV, based on the assumption that OUV, including its authenticity and integrity, will be recovered if the option is successfully implemented;
- 6. Recalls that, in its previous decisions, the Committee noted that the demolitions within the city centre have permanently altered the relationship between the mahallas and between the monuments and the overall city structure, and considers that, on the basis of what has been submitted, such an approach cannot be said to deliver the integrity of an intact city, intact urban fabric, nor can it return the historic centre to its previous appearance, nor restore key aspects of Timurid planning, nor fully recover the attributes of OUV for which the property was inscribed;
- 7. Also recalls Decision 43 COM 7A.44 and the need to decide whether the property should be retained on the World Heritage List for a further period to allow time to explore an agreed, clear way forward or whether the property should be deleted from the World Heritage List, and also considers that the proposal submitted by the State Party deserves to be explored further and that the property should be retained on the World Heritage List at this stage;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to explore the submission of a significant boundary modification, in line with Paragraph 166 of the Operational Guidelines, to set out a new justification for criteria based on an OUV that would reflect a shift away from the integrity of an overall intact city and towards an ensemble of Timurid monuments, with the urban areas seen as their essential settings, but <u>notes</u> that, while such an approach would appear to be worth pursuing, it cannot be affirmed with certainty at this stage that such a proposed OUV could be justified:
- 9. <u>Strongly recommends</u> that the State Party engage in a specific consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS on procedural questions related to any submission;
- 10. <u>Welcomes</u> the detailed and thorough historical research and analytical work undertaken and <u>further considers</u> that this should provide a sound basis to define protection and management requirements for the property;
- 11. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to take the necessary time to define substantive proposals for the renovation of the monuments in the context of the development of detailed Conservation and Management Plans integrated with an overall Master Plan for the city in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), which should encompass urban planning regulations and architectural and urban design guidelines and take into account the comprehensive analysis of cultural legislations in Uzbekistan conducted with the support of the UNESCO/Netherlands Funds-in-Trust;
- 12. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to submit full details of urgent conservation projects, as well as the strategy for the conservation of the Ak Saray tiles, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any work commences;
- 13. <u>Also welcomes</u> the creation of the International Advisory Committee (IAC) for cultural World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan and the organisation of its first technical session

in July 2022, and <u>emphasizes</u> that such a mechanism with the support of its experts should advise the national authorities on the conservation of the cultural heritage properties and implementation of Committee decisions and previous mission recommendations;

- 14. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 15. <u>Decides</u> to retain Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

55. Historic Centre of Vienna (Austria) (C 1033)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.55

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add,
- Recalling Decisions 37 COM 7B.71, 39 COM 7B.94, 40 COM 7B.49, 41 COM 7B.42, 42 COM 7A.5, 43 COM 7A.45, and 44 COM 7A.32 adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the progress made in implementing many of the adopted corrective measures and previous Committee decisions, with the aim to enhance the management system of the property, in particular:
 - a) anchoring the World Heritage status of the property in the Viennese Building Code as the most important legal planning tool of the City of Vienna,
 - b) elaboration, adoption and publication of a new Management Plan for the property,
 - c) initial steps towards enhanced legal protection of World Heritage in Austria.
 - d) the forthcoming Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) for the Schwarzenberg Gardens and related recommendations for greater legal protection of historic gardens,
 - e) ongoing development of the roof cadastre;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue with the implementation of the adopted corrective measures in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, with a view to achieving the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), in accordance with the established timetable to which the State Party has proposed slight revisions;
- 5. <u>Accepts</u> the revised and updated Management Plan for the property, <u>notes</u> that the corrective measures adopted require that the efficacy of the Management Plan be proven

in practice through monitoring and evaluation over a period of five years, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that subsequent revisions address the matters raised in the 2022 ICOMOS technical review and to report on the proposed monitoring and evaluation process;

- 6. Reminds the State Party of the Committee's previous requests to submit final plans and designs for the Wien Museum to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Acknowledges the efforts by the State Party and many other institutions and organisations to mitigate the negative impact of the proposed Heumarkt Neu project through design amendments, and undertaking an HIA of the revised proposal using a methodology which is rigorous, authoritative, and compliant with the previous HIA, but notes that this process has not resulted in an outcome, which achieves the DSOCR, including the verification requirements of the corrective measures;
- 8. <u>Notes also</u> that redevelopment is possible on the Heumarkt Neu site, in order to achieve a project that does not adversely impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property necessarily involving a reduction, and <u>further acknowledges</u> the progress made by the State Party in developing a further revised scheme with a reduced height and volume;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that, in line with previous Committee decisions, as well as the DSOCR and its corrective measures for the property, the further revised scheme will need to be assessed using the methodology of previous HIAs and <u>notes furthermore</u> that the determination of height, floorspace and built form which would achieve the desired improvement, such that the proposed development would not adversely impact the OUV of the property, could be pursued through the modelling used to assess visual impact which informed the previous HIAs;
- 10. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 11. <u>Decides</u> to retain the Historic Centre of Vienna (Austria) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 56. Roşia Montană Mining Landscape (Romania) (C 1552rev)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7A.56

- 1. <u>Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2</u>,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.26** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the organisation of virtual online meetings to discuss the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property form the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) between the State Party representatives, ICOMOS and the

World Heritage Centre, in the absence of a Reactive Monitoring mission due to restrictions caused by the Covid-19 pandemic;

- 4. Adopts the DSOCR presented in Document WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2, including corrective measures, while noting the need to complete the timeframes for corrective measures relating to mining;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the difficult circumstances relating to the World Bank arbitration process between the mining company Gabriel Resources and the Romanian government that started in 2015 and is still ongoing, which means that the State Party considers that it cannot address the halting of approvals for mining permits at the property or develop planning controls that prevent further mining at the property, as requested by the Committee, until the outcome of the arbitration process is known;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to ensure adequate human and financial resources for management of the property;
- 7. <u>Also notes</u> the major programme that has been developed to conserve key religious and secular buildings that support the Outstanding Universal Value of the property as a means of ensuring sustainable use of the landscape by the community;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property, including information on progress made in implementing corrective measures, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session;
- 9. <u>Decides</u> to retain Roşia Montană Mining Landscape (Romania) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 57. Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Serbia) (C 724 bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7A.57

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Decides to adjourn the debate on this agenda item until its next ordinary session.
- 58. The Historic Centre of Odesa (Ukraine) (C 1703)

Property inscribed during the 18th extraordinary session of the World Heritage Committee (UNESCO, 2023). No reporting is required on this property at this session of the World Heritage Committee.

7B. (I) REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE IN 2022

NATURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

1. Pantanal Conservation Area (Brazil) (N 999)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.1

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.195** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Notes with concern</u> that severe drought has led to the most extensive fires ever recorded, affecting 32% of the wider Pantanal biome, including the property;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the immediate actions taken to suppress the fires and limit the damage to the biodiversity of the property, including recent efforts to prevent fires in the surrounding area from reaching the property in 2021;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the processes underway to acquire the necessary personnel, equipment, and materials to manage fires and, <u>noting</u> the potential for climate change to further exacerbate extreme weather conditions such as drought and resulting wildfires, <u>requests</u> the State Party to increase capacity in fire management, including prevention and mitigation measures:
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to assess the impacts of the wildfires on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to submit this assessment to the World Heritage Centre, when available;
- 7. <u>Encourages</u> continued efforts to conserve and recover biodiversity in the Pantanal biome, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to facilitate the recovery of fire-impacted fauna and flora that constitute part of the OUV across the entire property;
- 8. Recognizing the impacts of fires on a number of natural World Heritage properties, encourages again the State Party to exchange knowledge and best practices of fire management strategies in natural World Heritage properties with other States Parties facing similar threats;

- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 2. El Pinacate and Gran Desierto de Altar Biosphere Reserve (Mexico) (N 1410)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.2

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.114** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Regrets the construction of the border wall in the United States of America (USA) in spite of the request of the Committee in its Decision 44 COM 7B.14 to halt any further works and without prior submission to the World Heritage Centre of an assessment of the potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and expresses its concern that the border wall now extends along almost the entire boundary between the property and adjoining areas of Organ Pipe Cactus National Monument (OPCNM) and most of the Cabeza Prieto National Wildlife Refuge (CPNWR), with the exception of two mountainous areas;
- 4. Reiterates its view that the physical presence of the wall has clear negative impacts on the integrity of the property and wider ecological connectivity thereby blocking the movement of critical wildlife populations, such as the Sonoran Pronghorn, which constitute important attributes of the OUV of the property;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the States Parties of Mexico and the USA to provide clarification, including detailed maps, with regards to the exact composition of the wall structure along each section of the property's boundary and details on the mitigation measures taken to guarantee or restore connectivity;
- 6. While encouraging the ongoing transboundary collaboration between the States Parties of Mexico and the USA, in assessing and mitigating the impacts that the construction works and the border wall have already had on the OUV of the property and the commissioned study to evaluate the impacts of the border wall on mammal communities of the Sonoran Desert, requests the State Party of the USA, in line with Article 6.3 of the Convention, to develop, resource and implement in cooperation with the State Party of Mexico an urgent action plan to assess and mitigate impacts of the border wall to the property and restore the connectivity, through consultation with the IUCN Species Survival Commission/World Commission on Protected Areas, as appropriate, and to submit this as soon as possible and no later than 1 February 2024 to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties of Mexico and the USA to fast-track implementation of the Sonoran Pronghorn recovery plan and measures that avoid further depletion of scarce water resources:
- 8. <u>Considers</u> that if ecological connectivity is not restored to safeguard the viability of key populations, the property may meet the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;

- 9. Requests furthermore the States Parties of Mexico and the USA to continue closely monitoring the key species and use the findings to inform species' recovery plans and active management strategies to mitigate impacts;
- 10. Requests the State Party of Mexico, in coordination with the State Party of the USA, to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess the impacts of the border wall on the OUV of the property and the measures taken to guarantee the connectivity of the property with the adjacent wildlife dispersal areas:
- 11. Requests the State Party of Mexico to implement effective and sustained mitigation measures for the photovoltaic project, if approved, throughout the construction and operational phases of the project, which align with the management of the property, and adhere to the highest environmental standards, including measures to ensure the conservation of the important biodiversity in the wider landscape, which also supports the OUV of the property;
- 12. Requests moreover the State Party of Mexico, in cooperation with the State Party of the USA, to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, a report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

AFRICA

3. W-Arly-Pendjari Complex (Benin, Burkina Faso, Niger) (N 749bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.3

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.79** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Deplores</u> the new murderous attacks committed by armed groups in the property, and <u>expresses</u> its deepest condolences to the families of the victims, as well as to all the staff of the national administrations in charge of the management of the property;
- 4. Recognizing that the increase in the number of violent incidents linked to the presence of armed groups in the area of the property is a direct consequence of the dramatic deterioration in the security situation in the Sahel region, expresses its deepest concern that the increase in the number of attacks committed by armed groups in the area of the property has led to the evacuation of staff and the absence of field management in the Burkinabe and Nigerien components;
- 5. <u>Expresses its utmost concern</u> regarding the findings of the January 2022 reactive monitoring mission that the property is facing serious threats which could have detrimental

- effects on its essential characteristics, and that the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property is subject to potential danger in accordance with paragraphs 180 b)iii) and 180 b)iv) of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Notes also</u> that the mission confirms that the elements justifying the OUV of the property remain present in the Benin component, but that the information and documentation available in the Burkinabe and Niger components do not allow an assessment at this stage of the extent of the impact of the presence of armed groups and illegal activities on the elements justifying the OUV in these components, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to carry out aerial censuses on a regular basis using the same methodology allowing comparison of results and consequently the identification of wildlife population trends;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the States Parties, in collaboration with technical and financial partners, to implement the recommendations established by the 2022 reactive monitoring mission in order to strengthen the management and protection of the components of the OUV of the property and to reinforce dialogue and communication with all stakeholders in the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations;
- 8. Welcomes the efforts of the States Parties to address the security situation by strengthening the operational capacities of personnel, acquiring equipment, collecting and analyzing security information, reinforcing surveillance patrols and joint operations with the defense and security forces, and drawing up strategic framework and operational planning documents such as Priority Intervention Plans (PIPs) for the various components of the property, and urges the States Parties to pursue and strengthen these efforts, in particular through the implementation of PIPs and the recommendations of the second Council of Ministers of the three countries of 23 June 2023 in Benin in favour of joint efforts to secure and preserve the Transboundary Complex, with the support of the technical and financial partners involved;
- 9. Thanks the technical and financial partners who support the conservation of the property, notably through funding from the Government of Germany, the Adaptation Fund, the European Union and the Government of Norway, and appeals to the international community to further support the efforts of States Parties to ensure sustainable financing of the property, notably through the consolidation of the West African Savannah Foundation (WASF);
- 10. <u>Further notes</u> the progress made in implementing the provisions of the Tripartite Agreement on the Harmonized Management of Protected Areas of the W-Arly-Pendjari Transboundary Complex, and <u>further encourages</u> the States Parties to make available sufficient technical and financial resources for the proper functioning of the Executive Secretariat and the other governance bodies provided for therein;
- 11. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties for the adoption of a Climate Change Adaptation Plan (CCAP) for the W-Arly-Pendjari Complex and <u>further encourages</u> them to integrate the adaptation measures foreseen therein into the various strategic framework and operational planning documents of the property's protected areas, and to establish a multi-hazard early warning system for the property;
- 12. Notes the commitment of the State Party of Benin to carry out Environmental and Social Impact Assessments (ESIA) for the various infrastructure projects carried out and planned in the Beninese component of the property, and reiterates that all new projects must be subject to an ESIA prior to approval, including a specific assessment of potential negative impacts on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;

- 13. <u>Takes note</u> of the map of the boundaries of the buffer zone of the property at a scale of 1/50,000 submitted in response to Decisions **41 COM 8B.3** and **44 COM 7B.79**, <u>welcomes</u> the initiatives undertaken by the States Parties of Benin and Niger to modify the boundaries of the buffer zone of the property in order to strengthen its protection, and <u>further requests</u> the States Parties to submit a request for minor modifications to the boundaries to reflect these modifications by **1 February 2024** for consideration by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session:
- 14. <u>Further urges</u> the States Parties to strengthen dialogue and communication with all stakeholders in the implementation of the above recommendations, which could be supported through an emergency international assistance request to the World Heritage Fund and the "Initiative to Support the Sustainable Management of the W-Arly-Pendjari Complex" project funded by the Government of Norway, the first national technical consultation of which was held in Niger from 30 May to 1 June 2023, in preparation for national technical consultations in Burkina Faso and Benin, as well as the round table of technical and financial partners of the property;
- 15. Requests furthermore the States Parties to invite a new joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN reactive monitoring mission to address the shortcomings identified by the January 2022 mission, to assess the measures undertaken by the States Parties to restore security in the property and resume their management, and to determine whether the OUV is still subject to potential danger;
- 16. <u>Further requests</u> the States Parties to submit, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and on the steps taken to implement the above-mentioned recommendations, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including a possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

4. Okavango Delta (Botswana) (N 1432)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.4

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7B.78, 42 COM 7B.89 and 44 COM 7B.80 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- Welcomes the adoption of the Okavango Delta Management Plan 2021-2027, developed with International Assistance from the World Heritage Fund, and which addresses the past Committee requests on community concerns and the management of invasive alien species, and encourages the State Party to ensure sufficient financial and human resources for its implementation;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> progress made to rationalise the use of veterinary fences, including through the conduct of Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) in line with the Committee's decisions, and wastewater management, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue efforts to reduce the numbers of fences where possible to facilitate free movement of wildlife;

- 5. Whilst noting the results of the 2018 aerial wildlife survey that indicate an increase of many wildlife populations, expresses its concern over the reported increase in poaching, in particular of elephants and rhinos, and welcomes the survey conducted by the State Party in partnership with KAZA TFCA countries of Angola, Namibia, Zimbabwe and Zambia in 2022 as part of a three-year cycle which shows a healthy elephant population and a reduction in rhino poaching, and encourages the State Party to increase efforts to strengthen the efficiency of anti-poaching and address illegal trafficking of ivory and rhino horn, and invites the State Party to share the results of the aforementioned surveys as soon as possible with the World Heritage Centre;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that the threat of poaching and illegal wildlife trafficking also needs to be addressed in a regional context, with emphasis on preserving and restoring ecosystem connectivity, and <u>encourages</u> the relevant States Parties to further strengthen transboundary cooperation including through the Kavango-Zambezi Transfrontier Conservation Area (KAZATFCA) and to effectively implement their commitments under the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES);
- 7. <u>Notes with concern</u> the increasingly visible impacts of climate change resulting in environmental changes and reducing the hydrological flow, and <u>considers</u> that these changes could be further exacerbated by developments in the Cubango-Okavango River Basin (CORB), potentially impacting the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 8. <u>Also welcomes</u> the continuous cooperation between the States Parties of Botswana, Angola and Namibia through the Permanent Okavango River Basin Water Commission (OKACOM), the finalized guidelines on the implementation of the Southern African Development Community (SADC) Protocol on shared watercourses, and the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) for the CORB reported for completion in 2022, which can support decision-making amidst the development pressure expected to grow in the region, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit the documents to the World Heritage Centre as soon as they are available;
- 9. <u>Also encourages</u> the States Parties of Botswana, Angola and Namibia to continue their cooperation for the potential transboundary extension of the property to include key areas, which would contribute to a better protection of the OUV and in particular the integrity of the property;
- 10. Thanks the international community supporting the conservation of the property through the KAZA TFCA initiative, and also the Governments of Flanders (Belgium) and Norway for supporting the initiatives to enhance transboundary cooperation and community involvement through the World Heritage Centre;
- 11. Reiterates its utmost concern about the advancement of the oil and gas exploration activities, located outside the buffer zone, in the environmentally sensitive upstream areas of the Okavango Delta in northwestern Botswana and northeastern Namibia, that may pose significant risks to the interconnected water system and the ecosystem, and could hence affect the property's OUV;
- 12. Reiterates its request to the States Parties of Botswana, Angola and Namibia to ensure that petroleum exploration and other large-scale development projects with potential adverse impact on the OUV of the property are subject to rigorous and critical prior review, including through EIAs that correspond to international standards, including an assessment of social impacts and a review of potential impacts on the World Heritage property, in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;

- 13. <u>Urges</u> the State Party of Namibia to submit the EIA and the Environment Management Plan (EMP) for the on-going oil exploration activities in the CORB to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN without further delay;
- 14. <u>Further reiterates its position</u> that mineral exploration or exploitation is incompatible with World Heritage status, which is supported by the International Council of Mining and Metals' (ICMM) Position Statement of not undertaking such activities within World Heritage properties;
- 15. Requests moreover the State Party to ensure that the property's OUV is explicitly referred to in the decommissioning and rehabilitation programme for the borrow pits of the Okavango River Bridge to remedy any impact on the fragile wetland ecosystem, that ecological monitoring and management is included in the project EMP, and that all future projects with a potential negative impact on the property's OUV are subject to relevant impact assessments in accordance with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines;
- 16. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 5. Dja Faunal Reserve (Cameroon) (N 407)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.5

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- Recalling Decisions 33 COM 7B.1, 34 COM 7B.1, 35 COM 7B.1, 36 COM 7B.1, 40 COM 7B.79, 43 COM 7B.29 and 44 COM 7B.173 adopted respectively at its 33rd (Seville, 2009), 34th (Brasilia, 2010), 35th (UNESCO, 2011), 36th (Saint Petersburg, 2012), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions.
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the improvement of surveillance efforts, the continuation of ecological monitoring, the reinforcement of staff numbers and capacities, the rehabilitation of the infrastructure of the management team, the application of laws in terms of wildlife crime, raising awareness of local communities and the development of community-based alternatives to poaching, and <u>thanks</u> the donors who continue to support the conservation of the property, in particular the European Commission and the Government of Norway;
- 4. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that no incident related to the poaching of elephants, large herbivores and great apes has been recorded since 2020, and that the wildlife inventory carried out in 2021 indicates that the density of large mammals has stabilized since the last inventory carried out in 2018;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit the detailed wildlife inventory report to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN and to continue its surveillance and ecological monitoring efforts as well as the coordination of the interventions of the various stakeholders by strengthening the fight against poaching and the involvement of local communities in consultation meetings such as the Stakeholder Forum to improve the effectiveness of the management of the property;

- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the validation of the Development Plan (2020-2024) for the property and its peripheral zone, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to create a functional buffer zone for the property, in consultation with the local communities and the various entities involved, and which is in line with the recommendations of the International Advisory Council on Biosphere Reserves;
- 7. Welcomes the State Party's decision to convert the forest concession retroceded by the SUDCAM company into community forests, <u>requests</u> it to undertake all the actions required to establish a participatory management model for this area with the local communities while ensuring management that will ensure the conservation of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), including biodiversity and the protection of great ape populations, and <u>further reiterates its request</u> to ensure that SUDCAM continues to implement sustainable and responsible production standards for the rubber sector, including independent certification of the latex processing plant to meet international environmental standards;
- 8. Reiterates the importance of maintaining ecological continuity between the south-eastern part of the property with the other protected areas of the Tri-national Dja-Odzala-Minkébé Landscape (TRIDOM) in order to guarantee the long-term integrity of the property, and reminds the State Party of the need to ensure that this wider landscape is taken into account in strategic documents such as the Regional Land-use and Sustainable Development Scheme for the Southern and Eastern Territory (SRADDT), development plans, and Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMP) of private sector operators;
- Regrets that the SRADDT as well as the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) confirmed in Decision 40 COM 7B.79 are not yet finalized and urges the State Party to finalize these documents and submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Taking note</u> of the information that the mining project of the GEOVIC Company has not currently restarted, <u>welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to require a new Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before any decision relating to the project;
- 11. Also notes that no large-scale project is currently under way within the framework of the Integrated Development and Management Programme of the Dja mining loop and its adjacent border area (PADI-DJA) and reiterates that any new project must be subject to an ESIA before its approval, including a specific assessment of potential impacts on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 12. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to expedite the implementation of the recommendations of the UNESCO advisory missions to SUDCAM in 2019 and to the Mékin hydroelectric dam in 2020, and to provide detailed information on the measures taken to mitigate socioenvironmental impacts;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

6. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 280)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.6

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7A.40, 43 COM 7A.10 and 44 COM 7A.44 adopted respectively at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 43rd (Baku, 2019) sessions, and at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Warmly welcomes</u> the formalization of the co-management agreement between the Congolese Institute for the Conservation of Nature (ICCN) and the World Wide Fund for Nature (WWF) and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue the implementation of the decisions of the World Heritage Committee and recommendations made by the joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 4. Notes with appreciation the various measures taken in response to the findings of the Independent Review of Human Rights Violations by Eco-Guards, including the establishment of a functional complaints and appeals mechanism in response to Decision 44 COM 7A.46, and also requests the State Party to ensure and regularly evaluate the implementation of this mechanism and to ensure that the lessons learned are applied and disseminated to other World Heritage properties in the Democratic Republic of the Congo;
- 5. <u>Thanks</u> the technical and financial partners (European Union, USAID, KfW, Government of Norway through UNESCO) for their support in the management of the property, <u>recalls</u> the objective of achieving a surveillance rate of 80% of the property to effectively combat illegal activities and <u>urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Strengthen the human, technical and financial capacities dedicated to the fight against poaching, both in terms of staff and their training, and to accelerate the establishment of a funding mechanism for the implementation of all property management functions,
 - b) Intensify the collection of data on species present in the property to complement existing data on populations;
- 6. Welcomes the decision not to undertake an involuntary relocation of the Yaelima and Kitawala communities and urges the State Party to initiate as soon as possible, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, a constructive dialogue with these communities in accordance with Decision 40 COM 7A.40 in order to assess their socio-economic situation and develop an appropriate strategy relating to their presence in the property or their voluntary relocation and in accordance with the policies of the Convention and the appropriate international standards;
- 7. Notes with concern the auctioning approved by the Council of Ministers on 8 April 2022 of new oil concessions in the central basin and <u>deeply regrets</u> that the State Party has not yet cancelled the current oil concessions which overlap part of the property, and <u>therefore reiterates its long-standing request</u> to the State Party to cancel its current oil concessions, while not granting new concessions in the property and its periphery which could have negative and irreversible impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
- 8. <u>Recalls</u> that the creation of an operational forest continuum with a view to ensuring ecological functionality between the two blocks of the property remains a conservation priority and reiterates its request to the State Party to finalize as soon as possible the

- creation of forest concessions for local communities with a vocation for conservation, and to provide this space with a protection status and a simple management plan;
- 9. <u>Requests</u> that the participatory demarcation of the non-natural boundaries of the property be finalized as soon as possible;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 7. Kenya Lake System in the Great Rift Valley (Kenya) (N 1060rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.7

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 39 COM 7B.5, 41 COM 7B.21, 43 COM 7B.33 and 44 COM 7B.175 adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Expresses its utmost concern about the impacts of the continuous water level rise in all the lakes of the property, causing changes in the boundaries, pH and salinity of the lakes and resulting in adverse impacts on biodiversity, in particular the alarming decline of Lesser Flamingo population, a key attribute of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party of Kenya, with the support of Ethiopia and the United Republic of Tanzania, to undertake a joint survey to better understand changes within the Lesser Flamingo populations in the East African Rift and develop a Lesser Flamingo Action Plan for the region, in cooperation with the IUCN/SSC Flamingo Specialist Group;
- 5. Recalls that at the time of inscription, the World Heritage Committee in its Decision **35 COM 8B.6** encouraged the States Parties of Kenya and the United Republic of Tanzania, and other relevant States Parties, to cooperate regarding the effective conservation of Lake Natron and other lakes in the region, and to consider further potential serial extensions as part of a potential transnational serial World Heritage property;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> the results of the scoping report conducted by the multi-agency team on the impacts of the rising lake water levels, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to implement the study recommendations, including resurveying the riparian zones, beaconing the new boundaries, continued monitoring of the site, relocating or rehabilitating the sewage treatment plants near Lake Nakuru and other lakes, raising awareness on the impacts of climate change as well as establishing buffer zones while at the same time taking urgent actions, in close collaboration with local communities, to address deforestation and land degradation in the basin and especially in the Mau escarpment;
- 7. <u>Appreciates</u> the State Party's discussions with stakeholders towards securing a wildlife corridor between Lake Nakuru and Lake Naivasha using wayleaves and creating a task force, developing a concept note and a work plan, but <u>considers</u> that the site selection and design of the wildlife corridor should be based on an evaluation of relevant needs of specific

- species to allow the potential corridor to accommodate movement of each target species, and therefore <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide more information on this concept;
- 8. <u>Also notes</u> that a meeting was organized in 2020 in Naivasha to agree upon the coordination of the management of the three components of the property, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre a report of follow up actions made to implement its decisions:
- 9. <u>Further noting</u> that the rising lake levels affected the zonation scheme of the property, which will be reviewed once the lake levels subside, <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to develop and implement regulations to prohibit developments in close proximity to fragile areas and sensitive buffer zones of the property;
- 10. <u>Strongly regrets</u> that the State Party did not halt the Olkaria-Lessos-Kisumu power transmission project, which passes along Lake Elementaita, and has now been energized, notwithstanding concerns remain for the potential impact of the project on the OUV of the property, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to report on the status of the African-Eurasian Migratory Waterbirds (AEWA) mission including its recommendations if available, monitor bird mortalities along the powerline and to report on mitigation measures and their effectiveness to limit bird mortality;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 8. Djoudj National Bird Sanctuary (Senegal) (N 25)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.8

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.83** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Takes note of the conclusion of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN reactive monitoring mission that, in view of the considerable management efforts undertaken by the State Party and its partners, the conditions for a new inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger are not met, but the ecological integrity of the property remains threatened by water pollution, the proliferation of invasive species induced by agro-industrial projects located in the buffer zone and the vulnerability of local communities adjacent to the property, and that if the threats are not addressed urgently and quickly, the property could soon meet the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in accordance with paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 4. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the efforts made by the State Party and its partners to update the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, and the legal requirement for an Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) or a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) in accordance with international standards before any new agroindustrial installation likely to impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), however once

<u>again expresses its concern</u> about the persistence of the negative impacts of existing agricultural and agro-industrial projects on the OUV of the property;

- 5. Requests the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2022 mission, as follows:
 - a) Take urgently, by the end of 2023, all the necessary measures to finalize the construction of the evacuation channel and render effectively operational the polluted water drainage system planned to clean up the waters of the property as well as emergency proactive measures to address the source of pollution from agricultural developments near the property,
 - b) Following the efforts undertaken to restore the boundary of the property, initiate discussions with the stakeholders concerned to resolve the encroachments noted and restore the territorial integrity of the property,
 - c) Revise the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment and the Biodiversity Action Plan for the rice loop road construction project to specifically assess the potential impacts on the OUV of the property in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and that the revision includes alternatives and a no-project option, and that this be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, prior to any approval of the project, in order to ensure that its implementation will not have a negative impact on the OUV of the property,
 - d) Carry out discussions with UNESCO and IUCN as soon as possible to draw up a depollution plan for the DNBS, an action plan to solve the problems linked to the increasing salinization of the soil and progressive sedimentation, and to render operational the water quality monitoring system including the monitoring of heavy metals.
 - e) Elaborate and implement a development and management plan including actions and a substantial budget on the crucial issues of i) water management, ii) disaster risk management, iii) invasive plants and iv) ecological monitoring,
 - f) Maintain the level of vigilance regarding land use in the periphery of the DNBS and carefully monitor the impact of the bankruptcy of the largest agro-industrial unit located on the periphery of the DNBS in order to avoid an anarchic resettlement in the spaces that could be left vacant by the closure of "Compagnie Agricole de Saint-Louis (CASL)",
 - g) Ensure that no new rice plots can be allocated in the buffer zone of the property and that a noise pollution reduction plan can be drawn up and implemented as soon as possible to limit the impacts linked to the use of bird scaring guns,
 - h) Continue actions for the control and epidemiological surveillance of avian influenza in a coordinated manner throughout the Senegal River Delta, including the Diawling Park in Mauritania, until eradication of the epizootic is declared, and begin as soon as possible an analysis of the impact of avian influenza on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and implement the recommendations resulting from the study,
 - i) Strengthen epidemiological surveillance in the villages on the outskirts of the DNBS and the early warning system, through training in the recognition of HPAI [Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza] symptoms by breeders in the area,
 - j) Maintain in post for a reasonable period (at least three years) any Conservator appointed to be responsible for the property and appoint a director with the required qualifications to direct the Biological Research Station, and that this station report hierarchically to the DNBS Conservator who is solely responsible for the state of conservation of the property,

- Strengthen the management team with around ten additional trained and equipped agents and consider innovative mechanisms for the sustainable financing of the property,
- Reactivate the Management Committee to make the buffer zone of the property operational, governing it by means of a regulatory text which sets out its role, composition, mode of operation as well as a budget estimate necessary for its operation; this action should include the revitalization of the Inter-village Committees (IVC) and its related bodies (eco-guards and eco-guides);
- 6. <u>Thanks</u> all donors who continue to support the conservation of the property, in particular the Governments of Luxembourg and Norway for their financial support to improve the state of conservation of the property;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> of the limited funding to ensure the sustainable implementation of all management functions of the property and <u>also requests</u> the State Party, with the support of its partners, to continue its efforts towards the development of a sustainable financing system with a view to improving efficiency in the management of the property;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 9. iSimangaliso Wetland Park (South Africa) (N 914)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.9

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.176** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the report that the further clearing and burning of swamp forest for subsistence agriculture within the property has been halted, and the State Party support to communities through alternative means and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue the dialogue with communities to resolve the issue and to report on the progress of implementing the rehabilitation plan;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> the response by the State Party on the reports of alleged human rights violations against the Nibela Community, which remain under investigation, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue its dialogue with the communities living around the property in order to resolve outstanding issues, including to jointly identify solutions that conserve the property and address legitimate livelihood concerns;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to report on the provisions in the new Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for stakeholders, including communities, to be involved in the management of the property;
- 6. Reiterating its concern on the continued water stress in the Lake Sibaya ecosystem, <u>further requests</u> the State Party to maintain a moratorium on issuing licences for commercial

forestry, to address unauthorised commercial forestry plantations identified as a key source of water use stress within the watershed of Lake Sibaya, and to report on the hydrological and ecological conditions of Lake Sibaya system;

- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's plan to establish a buffer zone to the property in an effort to reduce water stress on Lake Sibaya and <u>recommends</u> that the consultation process consider the overall land use planning affecting the property's integrity;
- 8. Also notes the conclusion and recommendations of the report of the independent Panel of experts, tasked to review the impact of the January 2021 artificial breaching of the mouth of the St. Lucia Estuary and to develop guidelines for future management of the estuary so as to safeguard the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and urges the State Party to ensure that any intervention in the St. Lucia Estuary would be aligned with the Panel recommendations and subject to relevant Environmental Impact Assessments conducted in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, and further requests the State Party to revisit the recommendations of the GEF-funded study;
- 9. <u>Further noting</u> that the proposal to develop 20 tourism related projects within the property, which would be subject to relevant Environmental Impact Assessments conducted in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to assess the cumulative impacts of these tourism developments on the property's OUV including its conditions of integrity, provide evidence that justifies the compatibility of the developments with the overall sustainable tourism strategy for the property;
- 10. <u>Further welcomes</u> the State Party's commitment to ensure that adequate national level impact assessment for any extractive industry development proposal is conducted in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, and <u>furthermore requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Committee informed of any developments in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 10. Mosi-oa-Tunya / Victoria Falls (Zambia, Zimbabwe) (N 509)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.10

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **36 COM 7B.7**, **38 COM 7B.7** and **44 COM 7B.177** adopted at its 36th (Saint-Petersburg, 2012), 38th (Doha, 2014) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued cooperation between the two States Parties in strengthening the joint management of the transboundary property, and the continued efforts to undertake monitoring and control of invasive alien plant species;

- 4. Notes again with increasing concern the inevitable negative impacts of the proposed Batoka Gorge Hydro Electric Scheme (BGHES) on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property due to seasonal rising of water levels and partial disappearance of some swash in a portion of the gorges within the property, and requests the States Parties to implement the 2022 Reactive Monitoring mission recommendation to revise the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context to undertake a comprehensive geomorphological and/or geological assessment of the gorge environment that takes into account the property boundaries, and resubmit the revised ESIA to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN before making any decisions that may be difficult to reverse in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. Reiterates its concern over the increasing pressure from tourism infrastructure within and around the property, exacerbated by the absence of strategic planning and <u>also requests</u> the States Parties to prioritize the review and update the Joint Integrated Management Plan (JIMP) to ensure that necessary safeguards and thresholds are incorporated to mitigate against developmental pressures for the protection of the property's OUV and <u>further requests</u> the States Parties to adhere to the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that is difficult to reverse;
- 6. Regrets that the construction of the Mosi-oa-Tunya Livingstone Resort Hotel has concluded despite the Committee's request to halt further activities and urgently requests the State Party of Zambia to implement mitigatory measures integral to legal conditions of approval issued by Zambian Environmental Management Authority and contained in the Joint Management Plan (JIMP), the ESIA has been revised in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and a comprehensive Environmental and Social Management Plan has been developed and submitted together with impact assessments to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the States Parties to submit a request for a boundary modification in accordance with the Operational Guidelines to set the precise boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, aligned with past Committee Decisions and the property's Statement of OUV and including details of the internal zonation system and its rationale to protect the property and its OUV;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> that the first phase of the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) on the cumulative development and environmental pressure on the property has been undertaken, requests furthermore the States Parties to seek early inputs and technical guidance from IUCN in undertaking the second phase of the SEA and encourage the States Parties to submit an International Assistance request to that effect;
- 9. Reiterates its request to the States Parties to summarize how the findings of the analysis undertaken on the water flow, rainfall and upstream activity has informed management, and the measures subsequently taken to ensure water abstraction from the Zambezi River continues to be adapted in the face of climate change;
- 10. Requests moreover the States Parties to implement all other recommendations from the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, including to:
 - a) Ensure that tourism infrastructure development within the property and its buffer zone is consistent with the aim to enhance the protection of the OUV of the property and in line with the Joint Integrated Management Plan,
 - b) Harmonize the roles and responsibilities of the National Heritage Conservation Commission and the Department of national Parks and Wildlife for the management of the property in Zambia;

11. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session in 2024.

ARAB STATES

11. Banc d'Arguin National Park (Mauritania) (N 506)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.11

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.87** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the significant efforts made and <u>requests</u> it to pursue them, in particular by implementing the 2020-2024 Development and Management Plan, and by continuing to develop knowledge, monitoring and the fight against threats affecting the property;
- 4. <u>Considers</u> that climate change is a crucial issue for the distribution of species and ecosystems, particularly seagrasses, and therefore for the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and for the local populations, and <u>requests</u> the State Party:
 - a) To prioritize its prospective analysis on the potential impacts of climate change on the OUV and submit it to the World Heritage Centre,
 - b) That any consideration of the relocation of threatened villages be part of this reflection, in consultation with the communities concerned and not be carried out without their free, prior and informed consent and in accordance with the Convention and international standards;
- 5. <u>Noting</u> that the ecosystems of the property represent an important reservoir of blue carbon, <u>encourages</u> the State Party to explore the eligibility of the property for funds to adapt to the effects of climate change, and to share these experiences with other World Heritage properties:
- 6. <u>Considering</u> on the one hand the stagnation of selachian catches, and on the other hand the tenfold increase in fishing in the property since 1997, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to intensify the efforts undertaken to limit the catches of selachians in order to end this practice, and to carry out an analysis of the impact of increased fishing on the OUV of the property;
- 7. Also commends the State Party for the actions taken to oversee the development of Chami and limit its impact on the property, and in particular the relocation of the gold processing centre, and also requests it to continue the analyses on the heavy metal contaminations in the property, to sustainably manage waste at Chami and to provide information on the management of mining waste and other environmental aspects in the new gold processing centre;

- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts of the State Party to limit maritime risks and, in addition, <u>reiterates its</u> request to finalize the exploration of the technical feasibility of a possible designation of a Particularly Sensitive Sea Area, before submitting a final application to the International Maritime Organization;
- 9. <u>Also welcomes</u> the current abandonment of oil exploration in Oil Block C-19 and <u>further requests</u> information regarding the status of exploration activities in Block C-7;
- 10. <u>Considering</u> the concerns about the potential impacts of the offshore seismic campaign and the lack of significant consideration of the property in the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), <u>further requests</u> the State Party not to carry out any activity before revising the ESIA to assess potential impacts on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit it to the World Heritage Centre for evaluation by IUCN, and to take into account the recommendations of the management authority for the property;
- 11. Noting with concern the wind farm development project at the borders of the property (Nour Hydrogène Vert), urges the State Party to carry out an ESIA to assess the potential impacts on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, before any decision is taken;
- 12. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to continue monitoring the groundwater harnessed for the Tasiast mine and to finalize the strategic regional assessment of the hydrological system;
- 13. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that avian influenza has not had an impact on the property, <u>commends</u> the State Party for its efforts in the face of this threat and <u>further requests</u> it to continue the monitoring;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.

12. Socotra Archipelago (Yemen) (N 1263)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.12

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.100**, **43 COM 7B.1** and **44 COM 7B.88** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's on-going commitment to strengthen management measures in collaboration with international partners in spite of significant capacity constraints due to the challenging ongoing political instability and economic crisis in Yemen;
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> that on-going political instability and the economic crisis continue to impact the capacity for effective management of the property, and <u>calls on</u> the international

- community to support the State Party in its efforts to ensure the effective protection and management of the property;
- 5. Recalling the high level of endemism in the property and the potentially devastating impacts of Invasive Alien Species (IAS) on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), also welcomes the on-going activities under the UNEP-GEF programme to establish port quarantine measures and prepare a participatory IAS control strategy, and requests the State Party, in collaboration with relevant stakeholders, to urgently finalise such IAS control strategy and implement biosecurity measures to ensure the threat is effectively managed;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> that developments are reported to be mostly limited to urban development zones, that development in the buffer zone is regulated by environmental standards, and that these standards are being incorporated in the review and update of the Conservation Zoning Plan (CZP), and <u>also requests</u> that the CZP is finalised as a matter of priority and submitted to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> the report of impacts in some national parks or protected areas, <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide further information regarding these impacts in relation to the OUV, and to clarify how the initiation or update of protected areas management plans to address all sensitive biodiversity areas and sustain local natural resource use, would relate to the update of the CZP and the overall integrated management of the property;
- 8. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the adoption of a new Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) requirement for all developments on Socotra, and <u>urges</u> the State Party and all stakeholders involved in development projects to ensure that it is implemented in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, including to:
 - a) Ensure that any planned development is subject to a rigorous assessment of potential impacts on the OUV of the property, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse, and to halt any ongoing development and not proceed with any new development that could negatively impact the OUV;
 - b) Evaluate the potential impacts of existing infrastructure developments that have not undergone EIAs, in the context of the new regulations;
 - c) Ensure that appropriate environmental standards to regulate activities in the property and its buffer zone are incorporated into the updated CZP and that their enforcement is ensured;
- 9. Notes the positive actions that are being taken to address threats to the OUV of the property, however, reiterates its utmost concern about the potential impacts of those different threats, including uncontrolled development, unsustainable use of natural resources, climate change, plastic pollution, lack of sustainable funding and insufficient biosecurity measures to avoid the introduction of IAS, and considers that the cumulative effect of these factors could represent a potential danger to the OUV of the property;
- 10. Notes with concern the potential impact of an oil spill in January 2023 from an oil tanker stranded at the Delisha Nature Sanctuary since November 2019 on the OUV of the property, particularly its marine environment, requests furthermore the State Party to provide further information on the impacts of the spill on the OUV, including to conduct an assessment of the impacts on the marine ecosystem, to conduct a risk assessment on the vessel to avoid further spills, and to report on any response measures undertaken, with the support of Emergency Assistance provided through the World Heritage Fund;
- 11. <u>Reiterates its request</u> for the joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to be undertaken as soon as possible, to assess the current state of conservation of the property, in particular in relation to the above-mentioned threats, and to

- determine whether the property meets the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

13. Great Barrier Reef (Australia) (N 154)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.13

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7** and **44 COM 7B.90** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> that the property has suffered from four mass coral bleaching events since 2016, as a result of climate change, including an unprecedented event in 2022 occurring for the first time in a traditionally cooler La Niña period, and <u>appreciates</u> the efforts to control the Crown-of-Thorn Starfish outbreaks;
- 4. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's initial commencement of the implementation of the 2022 Reactive Monitoring mission recommendations, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to extend these efforts to fully implement all the recommendations of the mission, including, as a matter of utmost priority:
 - a) Identify priority areas of grazing land for gully repairs and associated restoration and remediation activities, and significantly scale up restoration activities,
 - b) Require proposed and in-progress dam developments to show clear alignment with water quality improvement for the Great Barrier Reef (GBR),
 - c) Increase significantly the scale and pace of adoption, monitoring and enforcement of best management practice in sugarcane and banana farming,
 - d) Prioritise the protection of remnant native vegetation across the GBR catchments,
 - e) Ensure Reef 2050 Water Quality Improvement Plan (WQIP) water quality targets, are sufficient and implemented to reverse the negative trend in water quality,
 - f) Review and strengthen the Reef 2050 Plan to include clear government commitments to reduce greenhouse emissions consistent with the efforts required to limit the global average temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial levels, to limit the impacts of climate change on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) (recommended by the March 2022 mission to be achieved by 31 December 2022),

- g) Ensure that the carbon and water quality related credit schemes being deployed in the GBR catchments deliver overall net benefits to the OUV of the property,
- h) Continue support for scientific research and increase financial resources to enable deployment of climate adaptation mechanisms,
- i) Accelerate the implementation of the Queensland Sustainable Fisheries Strategy,
- j) Phase out destructive gillnet fishing in the property;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's significantly increased actions in addressing climate change since the Reactive Monitoring mission, including through newly adopted legislation introducing progressive reduction targets for carbon emissions, and for the State Party's additional commitment to set successively more ambitious emission reduction targets in alignment with efforts to limit global temperature increase to 1.5°C above pre-industrial times, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to revise and strengthen the Reef 2050 Plan accordingly and in alignment with the mission recommendations;
- 6. Notes with serious concern the slow progress in achieving the water quality targets, in particular for fine sediment and dissolved inorganic nitrogen and also welcomes the State Party's commitment to enact, with immediate effect, a major shift in its water quality programmes with the aim to achieve the 2025 water quality targets and to finalize the revision of the WQIP and set new 2025-2030 water quality targets by June 2025, and further requests the State Party to ensure that the commitments are fully implemented and that the anticipated 2025-2030 water quality targets are sufficiently ambitious to reverse the negative trend in water quality;
- 7. <u>Further welcomes</u> the cancellation of the Urannah and Hells Gate dam projects due to their potential impact on the OUV of the property, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to require proposed and in-progress dam developments to show clear alignment with water quality improvement for the property as a condition for approval under relevant legislation, and ensure all proposed projects are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context:
- 8. Welcomes furthermore the State Party's commitments to, by December 2023, complete the implementation of the Queensland Sustainable Fisheries Strategy, establish a net free zone in the northern third of the property, introduce new legislation requiring independent data validation in commercial fisheries, and to ensure the property is gillnet free by June 2027 and the target maximum economic yield (60% biomass) is achieved by December 2027, and requests moreover the State Party to effectively implement the phase out of all gillnet fisheries in the property and ensure compliance with the mandatory independent data validation of vessels operating in the property introduced by the new legislation;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a progress report on the implementation of the commitments made, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session in 2024, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

14. The Sundarbans (Bangladesh) (N 798)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.14

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **38 COM 7B.64**, **41 COM 7B.25**, **43 COM 7B.3** and **44 COM 7B.91** adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 41st (Kraków, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's continued efforts towards enhancing the protection of the property and the progress in implementing the recommendations of the 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, undertaking effective conservation measures through planned forestation and <u>requests</u> to continue to implement the mission recommendations as agreed by the State Party and previous Committee decisions;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the national measures taken by the State Party on the Maitree Super Thermal Power Plant (MSTP) to avoid impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), in accordance with the Environmental Management Plan, and <u>further appreciates</u> the decision of the State Party to revise the Power System Master Plan (PSMP) to replace the second unit of the MSTP with solar PV power plant and subsequent cancellation of six other coal-fired power plants as part of Nationally Determined Contribution (NDC);
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the completion of the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) and the Strategic Environmental Management Plan (SEMP) for the South-West region of Bangladesh in 2021 and submission to the World Heritage Centre in 2023, and <u>further notes</u> the findings of the SEA that the scale of potential degradation of the OUV of the property through proposed development scenarios remains unknown, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - continue to implement the SEMP in order to avoid direct, indirect and cumulative impacts from developments in the South-West region over the next twenty years that are identified in the SEA,
 - b) submit the additional studies and data-gathering framework outlined in chapter 4.8 of the SEMP to the World Heritage Centre for review as soon as they are completed,
 - ensure that decision making regarding large-scale industrial development in the vicinity of the property is based on the provisions of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context in order to ensure the long-term protection of the OUV,
 - d) keep the World Heritage Centre informed of any major project that may impact the OUV in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Appreciates</u> the State Party for adopting the National Oil and Chemical Spill Contingency Plan (NOSCOP) 2020 during the difficult times of COVID-19, and <u>further appreciates</u> the State Party for implementing NOSCOP and developing Localized Contingency Plan to mitigate the possible impact in case of emergency;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> that the India-Bangladesh Joint Working Group and the India-Bangladesh Joint River Commission are important bilateral mechanisms to address trans-national matters, reiterates its request to the States Parties of Bangladesh and India to strengthen

- cooperative action for the eco-hydrology of the property and the adjoining Sundarbans National Park in India;
- 8. Acknowledges that continued sustainable development is a shared responsibility for all, and the State Party has the obligation to implement the relevant targets of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and therefore requests the State Party to use the SEMP as a basis for deciding on the large development projects and take adequate national measures to protect the OUV of the property;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the ongoing preparation of the new 2025-2035 Integrated Resource Management Plan (IRMP) for the Sundarbans and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to continue consultations with the communities:
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to engage with the World Heritage Centre on a regular basis and submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2025**, a progress report for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session, and a State of Conservation report by **1 February 2029**, for examination by the Committee at its 51st session.

15. Komodo National Park (Indonesia) (N 609)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.15

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.93** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Considers</u> that the identification of Komodo National Park (KNP) as one of five high-priority tourism destinations in Indonesia, the State Party's intention to shift away from mass tourism, and the development of an Integrated Tourism Master Plan for Komodo National Park and Labuan Bajo Flores (ITMP), present a positive opportunity to position the property as a leading sustainable tourism destination that ensures the protection and management of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 4. Noting however the planned expansion of tourism in KNP and the wider Labuan Bajo region, including a projected significant increase in visitor numbers and allocation of private concessions within the property, and noting with concern the 2020 Ministerial decree exempting tourism infrastructure within KNP from Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) requirements, notes with appreciation the State Party's confirmation that a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) and EIAs for individual projects will be undertaken, and also requests the State Party to:
 - Take a strategic and precautionary management approach to tourism development that is focused on sustainable high-quality visitor experience, as opposed to exclusivity.
 - b) Conduct an SEA of tourism development within the property and its wider setting prior to the approval of individual projects, including private tourism concessions, in line with the 2022 mission recommendation,

- c) Ensure that all proposed development projects are appropriately assessed for their potential impact on the OUV in line with the Guidance and Toolkit on Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, including undertaking consultations with relevant rightsholders and stakeholders prior to the approval and construction of a project,
- d) Ensure that no concessions or development projects are approved without an appropriate assessment and that no approval is issued for projects that would have a negative impact on the OUV;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the revision of the EIA for the Loh Buaya Resort (Rinca Island) and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to ensure proactive monitoring and management measures are in place, including through implementation of the Environmental Management Plan (EMP), to effectively protect and manage the OUV and avoid any potential future negative impacts that may result from increasing visitation, such as increased tourism pressure, especially on the Komodo dragon population;
- 6. Expresses concern about the changes to the zoning plan of the property that took place in 2012, which the World Heritage Centre was not informed of by the State Party and which resulted in the transformation of wilderness zones into utilization zones that allow for tourism development, and requests the State Party to review whether the current zoning and resulting tourism development is adequate to ensure the protection status and the OUV of the property and submit the results to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. Recalling that in 2021 the status of the Komodo dragon moved from Vulnerable to Endangered on the IUCN Red List due to the impact of climate change and habitat loss from ongoing human activities, notes with appreciation that monitoring activities report a stable population trend in KNP, and requests moreover the State Party to continue regular population monitoring and implement management measures that ensure the long-term protection of the species, especially in the context of tourism expansion;
- 8. <u>Noting with appreciation</u> the reported significant reduction in poaching and illegal fishing, reiterates its concern regarding the lack of operational equipment and technical capacity to manage the property's marine area, and reiterates its request for the State Party to urgently strengthen marine management and law enforcement capacities in the property, with a specific emphasis on controlling illegal fishing activities and boat anchoring, and to allocate a sufficient budget for marine research, monitoring, education and compliance with marine regulations;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, including to:
 - a) Provide training and capacity building to key stakeholders on impact assessment processes to support planning and decision-making for the protection and management of the property,
 - b) Ensure a proactive and strategic management approach to tourism development under the ITMP which includes an assessment of the carrying capacity for the property, prior to approving any major tourism developments,
 - c) Ensure the engagement of local communities in decision-making processes in line with international best-practice policies, including tourism development,
 - d) Finalize the ITMP to enable the State Party to provide best practice guidance to stakeholders for future tourism development that ensures the protection of OUV, support local livelihoods, and provide business and economic opportunities from conservation and includes actions to combat climate change,

- e) Implement the necessary management and monitoring measures to ensure the longterm protection of the Komodo dragon, its prey species, and important habitats, including to effectively plan, monitor and manage key pressures, such as poaching and the projected increase in tourism, including through the ITMP,
- f) Strengthen marine monitoring and management measures for the property, including ensuring the effective regulation of the liveaboard (LOB) and cruise tourism industry, establishing a systematic and transparent revenue capture mechanism to return income to the property, and incorporate a marine monitoring programme into the core management of the property,
- g) Explore the potential for utilizing the multi-stakeholder Komodo Biosphere Reserve Coordinating Forum as a mechanism to support the management of the World Heritage property,
- h) Clarify the boundaries of the property, and specifically the status of the three reserves (Wae Wuul Nature Reserve, the Mburak Forest, and the Mbeliling and Nggorang Protected Forests) located on Flores island, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre:
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 16. Lorentz National Park (Indonesia) (N 955)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.94** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Appreciates the activities undertaken to strengthen community engagement and the establishment of a Lorentz National Park Collaborative Management Forum, which has led to a revised national park management zonation and a Long-Term Development Plan for the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit both the revised zonation and the Development Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 4. Notes that a Special Use Zone under the property's new zoning plan is intended for community settlements that predated the creation of the park, but <u>also noting</u> that other projects are proposed in this zone, <u>reminds</u> the State Party that any development should firstly be compatible with the property's World Heritage status and secondly no development project planned within and around a World Heritage property should proceed without a prior assessment of potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Expresses its utmost concern</u> about the road developments in the property, in particular the two different parts of Trans-Papuan Highway, which are of significant length, the Enarotali-llaga-Mulia segment and the Habema-Kenyam segment, which will lead to fragmentation

of its habitats and could negatively impact its OUV, and <u>deeply regrets</u> that the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the former segment of the Trans-Papuan Highway was not submitted in one of the working languages of the Convention prior to construction, and furthermore appears not to have assessed the potential impacts of the development on the OUV of the property;

- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to submit a clear assessment of the cumulative impacts of road developments on the OUV of the property;
- 7. <u>Also notes</u> that Spatial Monitoring and Reporting Tool (SMART) patrols and biodiversity monitoring are being undertaken around the Habema-Kenyam Road, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to report on the mitigation and monitoring measures being implemented for the Enarotali-Ilaga-Mulia road, and for both segments to develop and submit to the World Heritage Centre, a clear action plan, including a timeline for the rehabilitation of all areas inside the property damaged by the road construction;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to provide details of the biodiversity monitoring plan that is being implemented across the property;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that the cause of the Nothofagus dieback is inconclusive, but that natural regeneration is occurring well even in disturbed habitats, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to seek international collaboration to further investigate and conclude on the causes of the Nothofagus dieback to inform long-term conservation planning;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to provide all of the above requested submissions in one of the working languages of the Convention;
- 11. Regrets that the overdue IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission continues to be postponed due to security concerns and reiterates its request to the State Party to invite the mission as soon as feasible to assess the state of road projects in the property, their impacts on the OUV and the effectiveness of the mitigation measures, the effectiveness of new zoning of the property to ensure the long-term conservation of the property's OUV, and any other threats that may concern the OUV of the property, including illegal fishing, logging and poaching, as previously raised by the Committee;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

17. Phoenix Islands Protected Area (Kiribati) (N 1325)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.17

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **34 COM 8B.2** and **39 COM 7B.14** adopted at its 34th (Brasília, 2010) and 39th (Bonn, 2015) sessions respectively,

- 3. Regrets that the State Party did not submit a report on the state of conservation of the property, as requested by the World Heritage Centre;
- 4. <u>Expresses its deep regret</u> that the State Party decided to lift the 2015 landmark closure of the property for commercial fisheries, and that the reversed fishing license designed to compensate foregone fishing revenue appears not to have sufficiently benefited the livelihoods of the people of Kiribati to ensure its sustainability;
- 5. <u>Also recalling</u> the importance to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of this property of maintaining sufficiently large no-take zones, <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that any management decision related to the property, such as removing the protection status of the no-take zone and allowing commercial fishing operations, is science-based and ensures the protection of the OUV of the property;
- 6. Expresses serious concern about the lack of details and clarity concerning the envisaged Marine Spatial Planning (MSP) Programme and other measures being developed by the State Party to replace the no-take zone, including details on the financial resources and technical arrangements that will ensure the ongoing protection of the property's OUV, and that commercial fishing activity within the property has already resumed, and therefore urgently requests the State Party to provide the following to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN:
 - a) The assessments, which were undertaken to forecast any impact on the OUV of the property as a result of the reported decision,
 - b) Maps indicating changes in protection under the envisaged MSP, including areas which will remain as no-take zones,
 - c) The measures it is taking and foreseen to monitor, survey and enforce sustainable best fishing practices within and outside of the no-take zones under the envisaged MSP:
- Calls upon the international community to refrain from any unsustainable fishing practices that could negatively impact on the OUV of the property and to assist the State Party with the necessary financial and technical support to assess the implications of removing the notake protection status;
- 8. <u>Expresses its utmost concern</u> that opening up the property to commercial fisheries has resulted in a significant weakening of the protection status of the property and <u>considers</u> that in case no urgent action is taken to ensure the effective protection of the OUV, the property might meet the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to review its state of conservation, assess the status and implications of any decision to change the no-take regime within the property, assess if the property might meet the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger and make recommendations on options to ensure that the property's OUV is safeguarded, whilst ensuring the sustainable use of the property's marine resources in such a way that serves the needs of the people of Kiribati;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

18. Landscapes of Dauria (Mongolia, Russian Federation) (N 1448rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.18

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 8B.6** and **44 COM 7B.187** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Regrets that the reports on the state of conservation of the property were submitted separately by each State Party, <u>recalls</u> that, for transboundary properties, States Parties should submit a joint report rather than individual reports on their national components, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties of Mongolia and the Russian Federation to submit a joint report in the future;
- 4. Reiterates its utmost concern about the potential negative impacts of the Onon-Ulz Dam, as demonstrated by the research conducted by the State Party of the Russian Federation, including important potential impacts on aquatic and semi-aquatic bird species and their habitats through a significant loss of water resources in the Ulz River and the Torey Lakes, as well as degradation of the quality of water used by local communities surrounding the property;
- 5. <u>Urges</u> the State Party of Mongolia to maintain the suspension of all activities associated with the project until an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) has been finalised in line with the new Guidance for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and, in consultation with the States Parties of the Russian Federation and China, to assess the potential impacts of the project on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, taking into account future climate scenarios and the potential for the project to compound the negative impacts of climate change, as well as the potential impacts on the World Heritage property of Lake Baikal, and to submit this assessment to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN;
- 6. Expresses concern about the reported approval of a gold mining prospecting licence by the Russian Federation in an area adjacent to the Mongolia component of the property, due to its importance as winter habitat of Mongolian Gazelle and several rare birds of prey as well as the significance of the associated lakes as refuges for aquatic fauna during prolonged droughts, and also urges the State Party of the Russian Federation not to go forward with the planned gold prospection activities;
- 7. Welcomes the cooperative censuses for aquatic and semi-aquatic birds and Mongolian Gazelles carried out by the States Parties within the framework of the China-Mongolia-Russia International Protected Area Agreement (DIPA), and encourages the States Parties to continue and strengthen transnational cooperation for the management and conservation of the property, including by implementing measures to ensure the preservation of the hydrological regime of transboundary watercourses that support the property's OUV, through comprehensive assessment and monitoring in the transboundary region, and to mitigate and adapt to the predicted impacts of climate change;
- 8. <u>Encourages again</u> the States Parties of Mongolia, the Russian Federation and China to consider the potential expansion of the property to cover additional areas of forest steppe and critical habitats, notably for migratory birds and the Mongolian Gazelle;

- 9. <u>Notes with concern</u> that the management plans for the Ugtam Nature Refuge and the Mongol Daguur Strictly Protected Area components of the property in Mongolia are still in the process of revision, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party of Mongolia to expedite their finalisation and to strengthen the resources and capacities available for the effective implementation of the updated management plans, once adopted;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the Committee at its 47th session.
- 19. Dong Phayayen-Khao Yai Forest Complex (Thailand) (N 590rev)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 7B.32** and **44 COM 7B.97** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Appreciates the continued commitment of the State Party to lead international cooperation and carry out activities within the property to address illegal logging and trade of Siamese Rosewood and other precious wood species, and strongly encourages the State Party to further strengthen this cooperation with the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) and bilaterally with Cambodia, particularly to retain momentum despite the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> that the State Party is considering the possible modification of some areas of Thap Lan National Park by revising its boundaries and <u>reminds</u> the State Party that a modification with the potential to have a significant impact on the extent of the property or affect its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) would require a significant boundary modification, in line with the Operational Guidelines:
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the 2019 amendment of the National Park Act and Wildlife Protection and Reservation Act, through which the State Party will accommodate local communities pursuing their livelihoods in a sustainable manner, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue close consultations with the communities and critically monitor the effects of the legislation for communities and conservation:
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> that the construction of all dams proposed within and adjacent to the property is suspended pending completion of a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) for the property and its river basin and, <u>recalling</u> its previously stated position that dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of properties are not compatible with World Heritage status, also requests the State Party to:
 - a) Seek early technical inputs from IUCN on the SEA,
 - b) Cancel plans for any construction of dams with reservoirs inside the property's boundaries, independent of the results of the SEA,
 - c) Ensure the suspension of dam proposals around the property remains in place until the final SEA has been reviewed by IUCN to assess any impact on the OUV;

- 7. Notes that the nationwide 2020-2022 Action Plan on the Protection of Protected Forest Areas and Forest Fire Control is being implemented at the property and includes Key Performance Indicators, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit revised indicators that demonstrate adequate means of verification to objectively and accurately measure the effectiveness of its implementation, in line with the recommendations of the 2016 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 8. Notes with concern that the budget for activities to protect Siamese Rosewood and other precious wood species within the property has been significantly reduced for the fiscal year 2022, requests furthermore the State Party to ensure that sufficient funds are allocated for the implementation of the 2020-2022 Action Plan for the continued protection of the property's OUV;
- 9. Requests moreover the State Party to provide an update on the resolution that was passed to halt the expansion of Highway 348 and on progress to seek an alternative to the expansion proposal;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

20. Ancient and Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and Other Regions of Europe (Albania, Austria, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czechia, France, Germany, Italy, North Macedonia, Poland, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Switzerland, Ukraine) (N 1133quater)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.20

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- Recalling decisions 37 COM 7B.26, 38 COM 7B.75, 39 COM 7B.19, 41 COM 7B.4, 41 COM 8B.7, 42 COM 7B.71, 43 COM 7B.13, 44 COM 7B.99 and 44 COM 8B.32 adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Notes with satisfaction that, further to relevant decisions, the joint Reactive Monitoring mission in 2014, the joint Advisory mission in 2018, and the modification of the boundaries of the component parts in Slovakia approved at its extended 44th session, the protection regime of the Slovak component parts is now in line with the requirements of the Operational Guidelines, thanks the State Party of Slovakia for its continuous work and cooperation to address these issues and requests the State Party of Slovakia to continue implementing any pending recommendations from the 2014 and 2018 missions, and to report on any new developments in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

- 4. <u>Notes with serious concern</u> that, in several buffer zones, it remains possible to conduct impactful forestry interventions such as shelterwood cuts and clear-cuts, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the States Parties of Italy and Spain to consider adapting intervention regimes to favour a natural transition towards more resilient natural beech forests, and the State Party of Germany to consider immediately banning any clear-cuts and significantly expanding the area of non-intervention in the buffer zone of the Grumsin component;
- 5. Welcomes the significant progress made by all States Parties in developing the "Guidance document on buffer zone management and buffer zone zonation" of the transnational property, and also requests the States Parties to finalise the document in line with the recommendations of the IUCN review, in order to ensure its effectiveness, in particular by developing a specific mechanism to ensure that areas of strict protection are significantly increased and that the use of interventions within the buffer zones is minimised beyond the minimum standard outlined in the Guidance document;
- 6. Commends the State Party of Ukraine for legislative changes ensuring that no logging and sanitary cuts are permitted in the buffer zones of the Ukrainian component parts, <u>also commends</u> the State Party of Romania for its plan to significantly expand to 75% the area subject to a non-intervention regime in Domogled Valea Cernei National Park and <u>further requests</u> the State Party of Romania to provide more details on the timeline to reach this target and the areas that shall benefit from the non-intervention regime in the future whilst ensuring that no impactful interventions take place in proximity of the respective component parts;
- 7. Welcomes that the potential widening and paving of a forest track crossing the property and its buffer zone (National Road 66A) in Romania has been temporarily put on hold, also notes that the State Party of Romania is working to identify the best option in order to safeguard the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and urges it to consider an appropriate alternative route to avoid any negative impacts on the OUV of the property;
- 8. Recalls its clear position that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with their World Heritage status, and requests moreover the State Party of Romania to provide the World Heritage Centre with detailed information on the Cerna-Belareca hydropower facility and to submit the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), undertaken in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, once available, to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, as required by Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines:
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that a forest fire affected a part of the Valle Infernale component in Italy, and requests moreover the State Party of Italy to detail the cause of the fire, the exact amount of old-growth forest affected, if any, and provide a map of the affected area;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> of the plans of the State Party of Belgium to undertake a Strategic Environmental Assessment and individual EIAs for the road upgrade programme located in the buffer zone of the property, and <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party of Belgium to ensure that these impact assessments are undertaken in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, before final decisions on the project are taken that would be difficult to reverse;
- 11. <u>Notes furthermore</u> the efforts of the State Party of Belgium to expand and consolidate the protected areas that comprise component parts of the property and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to pursue options towards a boundary modification that would enhance the OUV of the property consistent with the integrity requirements of the Operational Guidelines;

12. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a joint updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, including a response to the Committee's requests in Decision **44 COM 8B.32** to all States Parties concerned with this transnational serial property, and an update on the implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 joint Reactive Monitoring mission, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

21. Białowieża Forest (Belarus, Poland) (N 33ter)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.21

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.14** and **44 COM 7B.100** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Expresses its utmost concern regarding the construction by the State Party of Poland, without prior submission to the World Heritage Centre of an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) of the potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), of a border barrier between the Belarusian and Polish parts of the transboundary property, crossing some of the best preserved and most sensitive areas of the property, which will further affect the ecological connectivity and inevitably result in forest fragmentation, changes in the hydrological regime, increased spread of invasive species through the construction phase and degradation of important biotopes, and will severely affect animal movement across the property;
- 4. <u>Urges</u> the States Parties of Belarus and Poland to take adequate measures to address the impacts listed above and guarantee ecological connectivity across the border that allows wildlife movement and <u>considers</u> that, if such measures are not taken urgently, the property may meet the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. Requests the States Parties of Belarus and Poland to invite, as a matter of urgency, a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to:
 - Assess the impacts of the border barrier on the OUV of the property, including its integrity, ecological function and wildlife movement, which are vital to the viability of populations of key species,
 - Assess whether the animal crossings and breaks across watercourses put in place represent sufficient mitigation measures to maintain the OUV of the property, with regards to the movement of key species,
 - c) Review progress in the implementation of the recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission and previous Committee Decisions, including the various management documents recently developed, or under development, to establish their alignment with the conservation of the property's OUV:
- 6. <u>Notes furthermore with concern</u> that the reports submitted by the States Parties did not provide any details on the ongoing efforts to develop a Transboundary Integrated

- Management Plan, and <u>encourages</u> a transboundary cooperation for the conservation of the property;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress in updating the Management Plan (MP) of the Belarus area of the property, <u>also urges</u> the State Party of Belarus to adopt a legal ban on wolf hunting in the Belarusian area of the property, and to ensure that the relevant wildlife and forest management plans are updated, based on the updated MP and <u>requests</u> that the draft MP be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, before its final approval;
- 8. Also requests the State Party of Poland to finalise the overall MP for the Polish area of the property, taking into account IUCN's technical review of its outline and the recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission, ensuring the full participation of all stakeholders and rightsholders, drawing on international expertise as necessary, and reinforcing the protection of the OUV of the property as the central management objective, and to submit the draft MP to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN and prior to its final approval, and reiterates that the MP should guide the development of other management documents, including the new Forest Management Plans (FMP), to ensure that all plans are aligned with the protection of the OUV of the property;
- 9. <u>Notes also with concern</u> that the draft revised zoning plan by the State Party of Poland would result in a significant reduction in the partially protected zones and a consequent increase in the area foreseen for active forest management, and thus <u>further urges</u> the State Party of Poland to avoid decreasing the area excluded from active forest management, in line with the recommendation of the 2018 mission;
- 10. <u>Reiterates</u> the importance for the new FMPs to comply with the management prescriptions included in Decision 43 COM 7B.14, in line with the forestry management regime outlined at the time of the property's extension in 2014 and the subsequent recommendations of the 2018 mission, and <u>encourages again</u> the State Party of Poland to seek further advice from IUCN on the development of the new FMPs to ensure that these requirements are met, prior to their approval;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party of Poland to provide information on current traffic conditions on the Narewkowska road and reaffirm measures taken to minimize and manage any impacts resulting from traffic;
- 12. <u>Also welcomes</u> the efforts to restore the hydrological regime of the Narewka River and <u>encourages</u> the two States Parties to jointly implement plans to restore the natural flow of the river and to continue the rehabilitation of wetlands;
- 13. Requests furthermore the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property, on the implementation of the above and the recommendations of the 2018 mission, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

22. Wood Buffalo National Park (Canada) (N 256)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.22

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 7B.18**, **41 COM 7B.2**, **43 COM 7B.1** and **44 COM 7B.190** adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Notes with concern the conclusion of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission that the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property continues to face significant ascertained and potential threats, in particular as a result of changes in the hydrology of the Peace Athabasca Delta (PAD) exacerbated by the impacts of climate change and of the industrial developments around the property;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> that the State Party has developed and is implementing a structured Action Plan with the aim of reversing the current downward trends in some of the desired outcomes linked to the attributes of the OUV, and <u>notes</u> the conclusion of the 2022 mission that it is too early to assess how successful the Action Plan will be in restoring the OUV of the property, including the ecological integrity of the PAD;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in implementing parts of the Action Plan, including efforts to move towards co-management of the property with the indigenous rightsholders, the creation of additional protected areas to the south of the property, the measures taken to improve the conservation of the Roland Lake Bison herd, and the work on developing an Integrated Research and Monitoring Programme;
- 6. <u>Appreciates</u> the ongoing work to develop a hydrologic model to understand the flows required to deliver environmental benefits to the PAD, but <u>expresses concern</u> that a functional modelling platform, which can inform decision-making, will not be available before 2024 and that, to date, no operational strategy or protocol for implementing potential water releases or control structures that might be proposed based on the outcomes of the hydrologic model has been agreed;
- 7. Reiterates its utmost concern about the lack of progress in addressing the cumulative impacts of industrial developments around the property, the continued expansion of existing oil sands projects without full consideration of the potential impacts on the OUV of the property, the continued absence of an adequate risk assessment for large tailings ponds upstream of the property despite evidence of major risks, including seepage as well as proposals under consideration to allow the release of treated oil sands processed water (OSPW) into the Athabasca River;
- 8. Requests the State Party to implement all recommendations of the 2022 mission to further strengthen the Action Plan and its implementation, including to:
 - a) Strengthen efforts to transition to a genuine partnership with indigenous rightsholders in the governance and management of the property,
 - b) Complete hydrodynamic modelling and environmental flows assessment,

- c) Ensure that no further dam projects on the Peace River are approved, including the proposed Amisk Project, until sufficient evaluation tools are in place to evaluate impacts on the hydrology of the PAD,
- d) Urgently establish a sound decision-making mechanism for ecological flow releases,
- e) Decide, before 2026, on a set of concrete mitigation measures to correct the impacts of the W.A.C. Bennett Dam and other alterations to the hydrology of the PAD and agree on operational strategies and interjurisdictional protocols for the implementation of the adopted mitigation measures, together with a sufficient budget for their implementation,
- f) Conduct an independent systematic risk assessment of the tailings ponds of the Alberta Oil Sands region, with a focus on risks to the PAD, before the end of 2024,
- g) Re-evaluate and adapt collaborative, systematic, science-based monitoring of oil sands impacts on the Athabasca River and PAD to ensure sufficient parameters, sampling design, and protocols are employed to detect impacts,
- h) Develop, before 2026, a clear, consensus-based strategy consistent with precautionary principles for the reclamation of tailing ponds, including the treatment and disposal of OSPW, which guarantees protection of the water quality of the Athabasca River and the PAD and avoids any impact on the OUV of the property,
- i) Ensure that all major development projects in the PAD watershed, including all oil sands mining extension projects, are subject to federal impact assessments and specifically address potential impacts on the OUV of the property, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impacts Assessments in a World Heritage context,
- j) Ensure that all impact assessments of other projects in the larger landscape around the property that are not subject to federal impact assessment and that are under the responsibility of the Government of Alberta fully consider the OUV of the property and the concerns of indigenous rightsholders beyond the direct project footprint,
- k) Further strengthen the monitoring of flagship species, in particular the whooping crane and the wood Bison.
- Continue efforts to create a buffer zone under the World Heritage Convention around the property,
- m) Revise the 10-year Management Plan based on an agreed indigenous-led vision for a shared governance model for Wood Buffalo National Park and integrating strategies to address the key conservation concerns of the property,
- n) Further streamline the implementation of the Action Plan, including by improving interagency coordination, defining clear impact indicators, ensuring long-term and multiannual support and funding for capacity-building for indigenous rightsholders to enable full and effective participation, and ensuring that appropriate budget allocations are made for its implementation:
- 9. Also notes the recommendation of the mission not to inscribe the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger at this stage to allow more time to implement the Action Plan updated with the above recommendations and also notes that a new Reactive Monitoring mission in 2026 would allow to assess whether sufficient progress has been made to reverse the current downward trends and avert further degradation of the OUV of the property, and whether the property meets the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated Action Plan taking into account the recommendations of the 2022 mission;

- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the recommendations of the 2022 Reactive Monitoring mission, including the systematic risk assessment of the tailing ponds in the Alberta Oil Sands region, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 23. Wadden Sea (Denmark, Germany, Netherlands) (N 1314ter)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **33 COM 8B.4** and **38 COM 8B.13** adopted at its 33rd (Sevilla, 2009) and 38th (Doha, 2014) sessions respectively,
- 3. Welcomes the development of the 'Agenda for the Wadden Sea Region 2050' in 2021 and the adoption of the 'Single Integrated Management Plan' (SIMP) for the transboundary property in 2023 and strongly encourages the States Parties of Denmark, Germany and the Netherlands to adopt a precautionary and strategic approach to the management of the property, including to clarify longer-term projections based on the latest scientific climate change data for the Wadden Sea;
- 4. <u>Reiterates its position</u> that extractive activities are incompatible with World Heritage status, and <u>considers</u> that natural resource extraction below the property has the potential to adversely impact its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the confirmation by the State Party of the Netherlands that no new gas extraction permits will be issued in the Wadden Sea, but <u>notes with serious concern</u> the approval of a new salt extraction project and the ongoing consideration of a proposed gas development at Ternaard, in the vicinity of the property, which would extend extractive activities below the property;
- 6. Notes with further concern that, in the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) process, the State Party of the Netherlands has not undertaken a comprehensive assessment of the potential impacts of the proposed Ternaard gas extraction project on the OUV of the property when, based on information available, it would appear that the project has direct negative impacts on the OUV of the property, and therefore <u>urges</u> the State Party not to approve the project;
- 7. Requests the State Party of the Netherlands not to approve further extractive projects, in line with the precautionary principle, to assess whether adaptation of the 'hand on tap' monitoring mechanism is required to account for uncertainties linked to climate change, and to consider limiting or halting existing salt extraction activities, as required, to effectively maintain and protect the OUV;
- 8. Also notes with serious concern the Wintershall Dea's oil development, which is currently being considered by the State Party of Germany, and appears to be located inside the property, as well as the GEMS gas development located close to the boundary of the property;

- 9. Also urges the State Party of Germany not to proceed with any proposed oil exploration inside the property and to conduct a detailed EIA, including an assessment of potential impacts on the OUV of the property, for any oil or gas extraction project that may negatively impact the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 10. Further notes with serious concern the scientific advice from the Independent Scientific Advisory Body (ISAB) established by the State Party of the Netherlands that, as a result of salt mining, there is a reasonable probability that future sediment accretion will be insufficient to offset sea level rise and that the potential for subsidence of the seabed will be prolonged once the mining operation is stopped, and also considers that subsidence of the seabed, especially in the light of projected sea level rise as a result of climate change, could reduce the extent of the tidal flats, which are one of the main attributes of the property's OUV, and therefore directly result in a significant negative impact on the property's OUV;
- 11. <u>Further welcomes</u> the decision by the State Party of the Netherlands to carry out additional studies on the proposed routing to connect the planned offshore wind power installation to the mainland, through impact assessments specifically focused on the property's OUV and including an assessment of the impacts of the potential hydrogen production north of the Wadden Sea and the pipelines to be constructed for delivering the substance to the mainland, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit these assessments to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN prior to a final decision on the projects;
- 12. <u>Notes</u> the numerous existing and proposed wind energy projects in the vicinity of the property and <u>encourages</u> the States Parties to use the online Guidance for Wind Energy Projects in a World Heritage Context when planning and assessing their impacts and taking proactive measures for the protection and preservation of the property's OUV;
- 13. <u>Further notes</u> the multiple existing and/or proposed extraction and infrastructure developments within and around the property, and <u>further requests</u> the three States Parties to:
 - a) Provide to the World Heritage Centre and IUCN an overview of all existing and planned extractive activities within and around the property, with appropriate maps,
 - b) Conduct a joint Strategic Environmental Assessment to assess the cumulative impacts of these developments on the OUV of the property, in line with the key principles of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to continuing to permit individual projects on a case-by-case basis,
 - c) Authorise project proposals only if adequate assessments demonstrate that they will not have an adverse impact on the OUV of the property;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties of Denmark, Germany and the Netherlands to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

24. Lake Baikal (Russian Federation) (N 754)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.24

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **40 COM 7B.97** and **44 COM 7B.107** adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Urges again</u> the State Party to refrain from renewing legislative amendments which allow extending the water level variation beyond one metre due to potential negative impact on the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), until the impacts of all existing water use and management regulations on the OUV are fully assessed and the requirements for its protection are set, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit the ongoing impact study, which should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 4. Notes with utmost concern the numerous proposed and approved legal amendments, including those that would weaken the requirements for Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) and standards for allowable impacts on the Lake Baikal ecosystem along with levels of pollutants, and which would relax permissible activities, and recalls that it considers that the scale of the weakening of the regulatory provisions, at a time when the property's ecological conditions continue to deteriorate, is such that, if all the proposed changes proceed, the property would face potential danger in line with Paragraph 180(b) i) and iv) of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, no later than end of 2023, the overdue study to analyse and review the impact of legislative changes on the property, and use the findings of the study to strengthen the Law on the Protection of Lake Baikal, and again urges the State Party not to approve any changes that weaken the protection regime of the property;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the reported significant federal funding for research, conservation and sustainable development of the property as well as the measures to identify and demolish illegal buildings, prevent further illegal construction and improve waste and tourism management, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue these efforts to strengthen the protection of the property;
- 7. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to develop an Integrated Management Plan involving all Government entities and other stakeholders involved in the property, with a detailed land-use plan for the property, including management objectives, an implementation strategy and a monitoring plan with clear performance and environmental indicators;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide a complete list and details of all existing and planned development projects within Special Economic Zones (SEZs), within the property and its wider setting, and to ensure they are subject to rigorous EIAs in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to undertake a comprehensive assessment of the potential cumulative impacts of such multiple projects on the OUV of the property, including within the SEZs;

- 9. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to submit the EIA for the remediation of the former Baikalsk Pulp and Paper Mill (BPPM), along with the Master Plan for Baikalsk Municipality and the concept for the development of the former territory of BPPM to the World Heritage Centre, suspending implementation until the mission has provided recommendations to the State Party with regards to the project;
- 10. <u>Also welcomes</u> the reported improvements over the past five years in fire management and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to increase the efficacy and efficiency of such measures, accounting for the future impacts of climate change, and furthermore to expedite the proposed assessments of the impact of fires on forest and lake ecosystems;
- 11. Requests furthermore the State Party of Mongolia to clarify the status of the Regional Environmental Assessment (REA) process and to undertake this assessment as a matter of priority and requests moreover the States Parties of Mongolia and the Russian Federation to jointly develop, based on the findings of the REA, an assessment of the cumulative impacts of all existing and planned hydropower and water management projects on the OUV of the property, prior to approving any further individual projects and to guide the subsequent elaboration of EIAs for all such projects;
- 12. Takes note of the State Party's proposal to organize the postponed joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property after 25 November 2023, with the objective of reviewing the threat posed to the property by various legislative changes, the existing and proposed developments in the SEZs and the property, and the remediation plans for the former BPPM, as well as assessing the conditions of the property which may warrant its inclusion on the List of World Heritage in Danger, and requests the State Party to ensure that the mission programme includes an opportunity for meetings with the States Parties of the Russian Federation and Mongolia to allow the mission team to assess the full range of transboundary issues potentially affecting the hydrological and ecological conditions of the property;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 25. Natural System of Wrangel Island Reserve (Russian Federation) (N 1023rev)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decisions **42 COM 7B.77** and **43 COM 7B.17** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018) and 43rd (Baku, 2019) sessions respectively,
- 3. Regrets the lack of sufficient information provided by the State Party concerning the implementation of the recommendations of the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission, which makes it difficult to assess the state of conservation of the property, and urges the State

- Party to implement these recommendations and provide detailed information on the progress towards their implementation;
- 4. Requests the State Party to provide an update on the implementation of the 2020-2024 Management Plan for the property, together with a copy of its final version, and ensure the timely development of the next update;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide more information on the regulations to monitor the number of tourists visiting the property and to clarify whether a carrying capacity study, as recommended by the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission, has been completed;
- 6. <u>Also recalling</u> that the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission highlighted climate change as a critical threat to the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide the results of the reported on-going monitoring activities and develop adaptive measures to minimize any negative impacts of climate change on the OUV of the property;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the ongoing removal of garbage from Wrangel Island, but <u>reiterates its</u> request to the State Party to expedite the removal of all garbage and clean-up of associated contaminants, originally envisioned by 2023, and to report on the progress made;
- 8. Reiterates its concern that potential future hydrocarbon exploitation could still take place in the waters near the property, and recalls that a detailed Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), in line with IFC performance standards and with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, needs to be developed and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, before any extractive activities are permitted to proceed;
- 9. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> information from third parties that proposed legislative changes to the property would allow infrastructure development, hunting, groundwater extraction, transportation and changes to the hydrological regime and would result in a significant weakening of its protection status, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to confirm the status of the proposed legislation;
- Recalls that a significant weakening of the protection status of the property could create the conditions for its inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Also recalls</u> the conclusion of the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission, of which the Committee has already taken note, according to which the inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger could be justified if it is not proven that the military presence within the boundaries of the property does not constitute an ascertained danger to its OUV;
- 12. Requests moreover the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to address critical information gaps and review the implementation of the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission recommendations;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

26. Volcanoes of Kamchatka (Russian Federation) (N 765bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.26

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.109** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Reiterates its utmost concern that the boundaries of the South Kamchatka Nature Park (SKNP) have been modified at national level, thereby removing the legal protection of part of the property to facilitate inappropriate development alongside reports of a draft law which would allow the boundaries of federally protected areas to be changed to accommodate economic activities and recalls that such removal of the legal protection of part of the property constitutes a clear potential danger to the property as foreseen under Paragraph 180(b) (i) of the Operational Guidelines;
- 4. <u>Decides therefore</u> to deploy without any further delay the joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission initially scheduled in consultation with the State Party for March 2022 and then postponed;
- 5. <u>Considers</u> that the 'Three Volcanoes Park' project, as proposed, does not constitute a suitable approach for sustainable tourism development in the property and would jeopardize its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and <u>requests</u> the State Party not to proceed with the project, as proposed, in its current location and to finalize the Strategic Environmental Assessment to inform the Master Plan for Tourism Development, and submit these to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the presentation of an action plan to implement the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission and the progress achieved and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the remaining recommendations are implemented by the end of 2023, in particular the improvement of the zonation of the property, the creation of effective buffer zones around the components, and action to control and limit unsustainable tourism;
- 7. Welcomes the measures to clarify the functional zoning of the property as well as the ongoing efforts to establish a strictly protected area of federal significance Volcanoes of Kamchatka National Park on the basis of Klyuchevskoy and South Kamchatka Natural Parks component parts of the property in order to strengthen its legal protection status, as recommended by the 2019 mission and previous Committee decisions;
- 8. Notes with appreciation the plans declared by the State Party to also establish a buffer zone for the federally protected Volcanoes of Kamchatka National Park to ensure the integrity of the property as well as additional control of developments, tourist traffic and adequate security and invites the State Party to look into possibilities to extend the boundaries of the National Park to include the South Kamchatka Nature Park, including the Vilyuchinskaya and Zhirovaya Bays;
- 9. <u>Welcomes</u> the cancellation of the license for exploitation of a carbonate deposit near the South Kamchatka Nature Park, the proposed hydro-electric power station in the vicinity of the Kronotsky State Nature Reserve as well as the proposed construction of a fish channel to connect Kronotskove Lake with the sea:

10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

27. Western Caucasus (Russian Federation) (N 900)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.27

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **32 COM 7B.25**, **42 COM 7B.80**, **43 COM 7B.18** and **44 COM 7B.110** adopted at its 32nd (Quebec City, 2008), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Reiterates its deep concern that the construction of the Lagonaki Mountain Resort remains under consideration, with preparatory work underway, and the alleged planning of another ski resort within the property on Tabunnaya Mountain range, and requests the State Party to provide the World Heritage Centre with more details on both projects, indicating their exact location with respect to the inscribed property and explaining how this development is consistent with statements committing to no large-scale infrastructure development in the property;
- 4. Reiterates its position that the construction of large-scale infrastructure within the property, including on Lagonaki Plateau, would constitute a case for inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, and urges the State Party to confirm that no infrastructure is planned within the property as inscribed in 1999:
- 5. Recalls that the entire Lagonaki plateau was included in the property on the basis of the 1999 IUCN evaluation, which considered the area to be an essential element to express the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), in particular, for its rich biodiversity, especially its high carabid species diversity, and the fact that the area includes two thirds of the site's vascular plant species including many endemics and therefore also requests the State Party to confirm unequivocally that no economic development is possible or planned in the Lagonaki plateau;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party not to permit any construction of large-scale infrastructure in the Sochi Federal Wildlife Refuge and Sochi National Park immediately adjacent to the property given its potential impact on the OUV of the property, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to immediately halt the reported infrastructure projects until an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) is carried out in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and submitted to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN;
- 7. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to ensure that the legal regulations applying to all components of the property, in particular the Nature Parks and Nature Monuments managed by the Republic of Adygeya, are brought into line with the protection requirements of the Operational Guidelines;

- 8. Expresses its utmost concern over reports of a possible new draft law which would allow the boundaries of federally protected areas to be changed to accommodate economic activities and recalls that the legal protection status is an integral part of the OUV of the property and that the removal of the legal protection from parts of the property would constitute a clear case for inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. Notes the confirmation by the State Party that no further works have been undertaken on the road to Lunnaya Polyana, invites nevertheless the State Party to further clarify the status of this roadwork in response to third party information (based on satellite imagery) indicating that works are on-going, and recalls the importance of ensuring that all infrastructure facilities, even if deemed necessary for management and research purposes, have no negative impacts on the OUV and that an EIA should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre before any final decision is taken on this development, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 10. Expresses its utmost concern about the plans for the construction of a new highway and railway connecting North Caucasus to the Black Sea, including routes which would bisect the property, and <u>further urges</u> the State Party not to proceed with these developments, in line with the assurances provided at the time of inscription that no linear infrastructure projects such as highways or railways would be allowed within the property;
- 11. Reiterating its position that the construction of large-scale infrastructure within the property, including on Lagonaki plateau, would constitute a case for inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger, requests furthermore the State Party to define a strategic approach to tourism development which respects this position, including through the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) reported to be underway, by identifying suitable alternative locations for tourism infrastructure development outside the boundaries of the property, as well as appropriate mitigation measures to ensure that any tourism-related development in the vicinity of the property is consistent with the conservation of the property's OUV;
- 12. Reiterates the need to deploy the joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission as soon as feasible in order to assist the State Party in the evaluation of the state of conservation of the property, in particular the status of the envisaged infrastructure and road development projects inside and near the property, and their cumulative impacts and whether the property meets the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, as well as to assess other threats to the property including the scale of impacts from invasive alien species and the status and adequacy of the legal protection of the property;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

MIXED PROPERTIES

AFRICA

28. Ennedi Massif: Natural and Cultural Landscape (Chad) (C/N 1475)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.28

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 8B.15, 42 COM 7B.64, and 44 COM 7B.71 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Expresses concern</u> that once again the State Party has provided little information on the state of conservation of the property or on the actions taken to implement the requests of the Committee at the time of inscription and in subsequent decisions;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the actions of the State Party and its partner, the African Parks Network (APN), to strengthen the protection and management of the property, especially the efforts to put in place basic surveillance and resourcing for the property, undertaking field visits and ecological monitoring, implementing studies, and working with local communities who live in and around the property;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the initiation of archaeological and environmental anthropology studies on the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the initiated studies and others to the World Heritage Centre;
- 6. <u>Notes with further concern</u> however that several of its previous requests and recommendations, including those made at the time of inscription of the property, are yet to be addressed, and therefore urges the State Party to:
 - a) Strengthen the legal protection status of the property with a regime of protection adequate to the values of the property and meeting the protection requirements of the Convention.
 - b) Finalize a revised Management Plan to provide continuity of management and conservation for the whole property, which meets international standards and includes an operational implementation calendar for all steps needed to achieve this goal and, which clarifies how the responsibilities of the new management system will be integrated with the established traditional management systems. The Management Plan should clearly:
 - (i) Detail the measures foreseen to address the main potential threats and spell out management operations to conserve World Heritage values,
 - (ii) Include zonation which supports strict protection of the key areas for biodiversity,
 - (iii) Specify the institutional, staffing and budget regime to ensure effective management of the property,

- (iv) Guarantee the full participation of local communities and of their traditional authorities in the management of the property,
- c) Establish a detailed botanical inventory of the site, to identify all important refugia and areas for relict flora to further document the attributes of the property supporting criterion (ix),
- d) Develop cartographic documentation and mapping of the sites so far inventoried in order to have a baseline for protection, conservation and management purposes,
- e) Provide to the World Heritage Centre a detailed report on the extent of the damage and measures taken to rehabilitate the rock art sites affected by recent past vandalism:
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit the revised Management Plan and relevant updated legislation to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Reiterates its recommendation to the State Party to extend the northern boundaries of the property to include all attributes bearing the OUV, including the rock art sites, and <u>urges again</u> the State Party to consult with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before finalizing the proposal for the boundaries of the Natural and Cultural Reserve of Ennedi so as to guarantee that all important areas are included and that an appropriate buffer zone is foreseen, and to submit a request for boundary modification for examination by the World Heritage Committee;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to present more details on the status of biodiversity, including flagship species such as the relic crocodile population, as well as on the planned species reintroductions;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

29. Bandiagara Cliffs (Land of the Dogons) (Mali) (C/N 516)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.29

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.72** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the various measures taken by the State Party for the conservation of the heritage and the reconciliation and social cohesion of communities with the support of MINUSMA and other partners, and <u>requests</u> it to strengthen these measures;
- 4. Reiterates its great concern about the continuing very unstable security situation due to intra- and inter-community tensions and armed conflicts which are driving local populations to abandon villages and take refuge in more secure towns in the country, which affects conservation and management of the property, exacerbated by the COVID-19 health crisis,

- and <u>welcomes</u> the confirmation by the State Party of the slight improvement in the security situation and the gradual but very precarious return to peace;
- 5. <u>Taking note</u> of the State Party's claim that the cultural and natural values are still preserved, <u>expresses its great concern</u> that the integrity and authenticity of the property have been affected and <u>considers</u> that a return to peace and security is a necessary condition to avoid continued degradation of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 6. Notes with appreciation the intention to establish a multidisciplinary working group for the development of an emergency action plan as recommended by the 2019 mission, and requests the State Party to set it up as soon as possible in order to coordinate all community and government initiatives and to strengthen the traditional social, technical and economic practices that underpin the existence of this extensive and very fragile cultural landscape, and which are today under considerable threat;
- 7. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the operational launch of the "Reconstruction and Rehabilitation of the Built Heritage of Bandiagara" project, financed by the Alliance for the Protection of Heritage in Conflict Areas (ALIPH) that has already carried out the inventory and evaluation of the buildings and movable heritage objects affected in three villages, and has rehabilitated a large number of houses and granaries;
- 8. <u>Also notes with satisfaction</u> the various community actions that support and mobilize local communities in safeguarding their heritage, in particular those of the Association Dogon Initiative (ADI), and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue to support and back these initiatives financially;
- 9. Welcomes the launch of the Government programme for the reconstruction of built heritage, which also provides for infrastructure projects, as well as efforts to mobilize additional funds to intervene in various aspects of the heritage, tangible and intangible, and requests the State Party to provide more information on these different interventions as soon as possible and to take stock of the achievements in its future reports on the state of conservation of the property;
- 10. Welcomes the efforts of the State Party to organize the ritual ceremony of "Sigui" which only takes place every 60 years, and to initiate preparations for its celebration in 2027, including the identification of infrastructure needs, such as boreholes with a water supply system and the rehabilitation of degraded village camps; recognizing the great importance of this ceremony for the Dogon communities and the opportunity that the "Sigui" represents to strengthen and renew the identity of the communities within the property, strongly encourages the State Party to provide all measures favouring the safeguarding of this heritage, including in particular under the 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage;
- 11. <u>Expresses its concern</u> as regards the limits of the intervention capacities of the Cultural Mission and the insufficiency of human and financial resources which continue to weigh negatively on the effective management of the property, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to increase its efforts to further support the Cultural Mission;
- 12. <u>Notes</u> that the management and conservation plan for the property expires in 2022, and requests the State Party to submit the updated draft management plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 13. Requests the State Party to provide information regarding the state of the natural values of the property in order to allow a better analysis of the impact of the current situation on these values;

- 14. Reiterates its request to the State Party to invite, as soon as circumstances allow, a joint UNESCO/ICOMOS/IUCN reactive monitoring mission to the property to examine the state of conservation of the cultural and natural heritage and the overall management of the property in the context of the current security crisis;
- 15. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a progress report, and by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 30. Ngorongoro Conservation Area (United Republic of Tanzania) (C/N 39bis)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.171** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Expresses its deep concern</u> over the alleged human rights violations in and around the property as set out in the letters from the UN Special Procedures Branch of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, <u>reiterates</u> its unequivocal condemnation of any forced evictions, and <u>strongly requests</u> the State Party to continue to investigate and address all such allegations in relation to the property and its surroundings;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the dialogue between the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies to clarify the provisions in the Operational Guidelines and to recall the decisions taken by the World Heritage Committee regarding human rights-based approaches that embody the participation of a wide variety of stakeholders and rights-holders, including indigenous peoples and other interested parties and partners in the identification, nomination, management and protection processes of World Heritage properties;
- 5. Welcomes the State Party's confirmation that no forced relocations will be undertaken and that the State Party is implementing a Voluntary Relocation Plan including compensation measures for local communities, however, notes with concern that there is a lack of adequate response by the State Party to the UN letters and a lack of clarity as to how relocation is only being implemented on a voluntary basis and in ways that fully respect the participation and rights of communities, and also noting the 2023 African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights (ACHPR) mission concerns regarding community reports on this process, urges the State Party to provide details that:
 - a) Demonstrate that any voluntary relocation process is consistent with international good practices and applicable norms and standards, including the policies of the Convention and the principles of free, prior and informed consent,
 - b) Ensure a fair, just and equitably governed consultative process to find long-term, sustainable, interdisciplinary solutions to the competing requirements for conservation and other uses of the property,
 - c) Rebut the allegations of human rights violations within the property,

- d) Set out how it will respond to the recommendations of the ACHPR mission that relate to the property, once the final report is available;
- 6. Notes that the State Party considers that the Multiple Land Use Model (MLUM) no longer meets the needs of the property and has been reviewed, urges the State Party to submit the outcomes of this review to the World Heritage Centre together with details of what model options are now being considered and to consult with, and seek the advice of, the Advisory Bodies on options for potential emerging solutions to ensure they are based on the full consultation and participation of all stakeholders and rightsholders, including indigenous peoples, consistent with applicable norms and stands;
- 7. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the ongoing measures to address invasive species and the confirmation that no agricultural activities were observed in the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue to manage and control invasive species within the property;
- 8. Notes the current suspension of the upgrading of the Lodoare Gate to Golini main road through the property and also reiterates its request to the State Party to fully implement the 2017 mission recommendations concerning the road and submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, the action plan to manage road use, and the results of archaeological investigations and baseline ecological and environmental data before starting the upgrading works;
- 9. <u>Noting</u> the State Party's confirmation to undertake a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) in due time, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure the timely delivery of the SEA in order to evaluate the current and future impacts of developments across all sectors in the region, including the property and the wider Serengeti ecosystem so that the findings can inform management, and submit the SEA to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. <u>Further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to:
 - a) Provide an update on the implementation of all recommendations from the 2017 and 2019 missions and previous Committee decisions based on a revised work plan,
 - b) Provide an update on the development of Integrated policies and guidelines on tourism carrying capacity and monitoring framework,
 - c) Submit to the World Heritage Centre the feasibility study for the southern bypass route, including maps of the considered route options,
 - d) Fully implement the 2017 mission recommendations concerning the upgrading of the Lodoare Gate to Golini main road through the property and submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies the action plan to manage road use and the results of archaeological investigations and baseline ecological and environmental data before starting the upgrading works,
 - e) Define clearer conservation approaches for the Laetoli footprint site and for the overall archaeological landscape before any decisions are made on the presentation of the footprints or a museum building, and provide an update on progress made;
- 11. <u>Further notes</u> that the State Party invited the Advisory mission by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to the property to provide advice on the strategy to address the pressing conservation issues faced by the property while fully respecting human rights and relevant international norms:
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

ARAB STATES

31. The Ahwar of Southern Iraq: Refuge of Biodiversity and the Relict Landscape of the Mesopotamian Cities (Iraq) (C/N 1481)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.31

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.73** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the resumption of survey and maintenance work at Ur and Uruk, and <u>requests</u> the completion and subsequent implementation of conservation plans for all three of the cultural components before further excavations are undertaken and before tourism is encouraged;
- 4. Recalling that significant fluctuations in water flows may pose a major threat to the property and non-fulfilment of minimum water requirements could represent a potential danger to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, also welcomes the various water management measures taken to ensure the minimum water requirements of the natural components were met in 2020 and 2021, and also requests the State Party to urgently continue implementing management measures that demonstrate adequate flows to the property are ensured in the short and long-term as a matter of utmost priority;
- 5. <u>Encourages</u> the continued implementation of technical and scientific studies that inform the effective management of the property including the planned comprehensive hydrological environmental study of the marshes, ongoing monitoring and research collaborations, and the preparation of a basin-wide Strategic Environmental Assessment in line with the newGuidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 6. <u>Further welcomes</u> the ongoing joint technical transboundary cooperation between the States Parties of Iraq, the Islamic Republic of Iran, the Syrian Arab Republic and Türkiye for long-term sustainable transboundary water management measures, and <u>also requests</u> that transboundary cooperation remains a matter of utmost priority to ensure effective water management that is informed by science and that can guarantee minimum water supplies to sustain the OUV of the property in the long term;
- 7. Noting the concerns raised by the State Party regarding impacts, or potential impacts, of dam and irrigation projects upstream of the property that could further exacerbate water scarcity and negatively impact the OUV of the property, <u>further requests</u> States Parties located upstream of the property to inform the World Heritage Centre, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, of any existing and planned water-related developments that could impact on the OUV, in order to:
 - Ensure that such projects are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before any decision is taken to proceed,

- b) Undertake mitigation measures where negative impacts are identified, including through transboundary cooperation as required,
- c) Not to proceed with any development that would negatively impact the OUV of the property;
- 8. Requests furthermore the State Party to provide specific details of the protection status of the natural components designated as protected areas within the national framework, and of the amendments to the Wildlife Protection Law, to confirm that these ensure effective protection in line with the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Further welcomes</u> the actions taken to address illegal activities within the property, and requests moreover the State Party, as part of an integrated management approach, to continue strengthening its monitoring, legal protection, enforcement and management capacity to control illegal activities such as bird hunting and overfishing;
- 10. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to finalise, as a matter of priority, the preparation of an updated Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for the entire property and updated Management Plans for each component, and to submit drafts of the Management Plans to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 11. Recognising initial steps to regulate ecotourism in the property, also reiterates its request to the State Party to develop and implement an overall tourism plan for the whole property to regulate visitation, and to ensure visitor safety and sustainable tourism practices, infrastructure and facilities, and requests moreover the State Party to revise the Environmental Impact Assessment for the proposed tourist village project in the natural components in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, prior to proceeding with the proposed project;
- 12. <u>Further recalling</u> its significant concern over the continued vulnerability of the natural components of the property to oil and gas developments, <u>acknowledges</u> the State Party's continued commitment to ensure that oil activities outside the property do not cause harm to the property and do not encroach on its boundaries, as well as the reported monitoring of existing activities and remediation actions, and <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Ensure that any proposed extractive activities that may impact on the OUV are assessed for their potential impacts in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decisions to approve such projects, and not to approve any project that would have an adverse impact on the OUV.
 - b) Continue monitoring existing extractive activities in the vicinity of the property, report on any potential or actual impacts on OUV as previously requested, and immediately address any negative impacts and undertake remediation activities as required,
 - c) Provide an overview of oil and gas developments within or in the vicinity of the property, including the assessment of potential impacts on the OUV of the property in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context,
 - d) Extend its commitment to a permanent ban on all extractive industries, including oil and gas, within the property and ensuring no negative impacts on the OUV;
- 13. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to continue to meaningfully engage with local communities on a range of management issues, including matters concerning hunting and fishing, water usage, rights-based approaches to management and for the application of traditional ecological knowledge to any planned new constructions:

- 14. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> for the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to be undertaken as soon as possible;
- 15. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

32. Laponian Area (Sweden) (C/N 774)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.32

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision CONF 201 VIII.B adopted at its 20th session (Merida, 1996) by which the Committee "recommended that the Swedish authorities continue to work with local Sámi people", and Decision 37 COM 7 (Part III) adopted at its 37th session (Phnom Penh, 2013) which urges all States Parties and leading industry stakeholders to respect the International Council on Mining and Metals "No-go" commitment by not permitting extractive activities within World Heritage properties and by making every effort to ensure that extractive companies located in their territory cause no damage to World Heritage properties, in line with Article 6 of the Convention.
- 3. Expresses its utmost concern that the State Party approved an exploitation concession for the proposed Kallak mining development in the vicinity of the property, which could potentially impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property which is dependent on wider cultural practices of reindeer husbandry that are important to the integrity and authenticity of the property, and the attributes that underpin criteria (iii) and (v);
- 4. Notes the concerns raised by the UN Special Rapporteur on the rights of indigenous peoples and the UN Special Rapporteur on the issue of human rights obligations relating to the enjoyment of a safe, clean, healthy and sustainable environment on the failure to obtain the free, prior and informed consent of the Sámi for this project and the threats to the rights of the Sámi as indigenous people and to the protection of their environmental and cultural heritage rights, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Ensure that the practice of reindeer husbandry outside the boundaries of the property and directly related to reindeer husbandry within the property is adequately protected,
 - b) Ensure that any further consideration of the proposed Kallak mining development guarantees the free, prior and informed consent of the Sámi indigenous people, consistent with international legal obligations, including under the Convention;
- 5. <u>Considers</u> that the 2017 In-depth Impact Assessment (IDIA) commissioned by the mining company, which underpins the approval of the exploitation concession issued by the State Party in March 2022, does not adequately assess the potential impacts of the proposed project on the OUV of the property, and <u>deeply regrets</u> that the exploitation concession was

granted before the assessment was revised to address the issues raised in the 2021 joint ICOMOS/IUCN Technical Review of the IDIA;

- 6. Notes the requirement in the concession conditions to revise the IDIA prior to an application for a mining operation in the concession area, and requests the State Party to ensure that a revised integrated IDIA is completed to assess the potential impacts on the OUV of the property in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, specifically addressing the Statement of OUV for the property and the attributes which support it, and to submit the assessment to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to taking any decision regarding the potential issuing of a permit for a mining operation;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to ascertain the present condition of the property, the nature and extent of the threats to the property, to provide guidance on the IDIA revision process including the efficacy of the criteria defined for the evaluation of potential impacts of the proposed mining and ancillary activities, and to propose measures to facilitate the conservation of attributes which support the OUV of the property;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

33. National History Park – Citadel, Sans Souci, Ramiers (Haiti) (C 180)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.33

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.39** and **44 COM 7B.68** adopted at 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Also recalling</u> the numerous reports of the Advisory and Reactive Monitoring missions and their recommendations to the State Party on the conservation and management of the property;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that it has been difficult for the State Party to advance in the implementation of these recommendations due to the extremely complex internal circumstances and the COVID-19 pandemic and <u>commends</u> the State Party for the continued attention it has given to management and conservation actions as presented in its state of conservation report;

- 5. <u>Noting</u> that the preparation of essential tools for the good management and conservation of the property, such as the definition of the buffer zone and the finalization of the conservation and management plans, has considerably progressed and is underway, <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit a finalized version of these documents to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as soon as they become available;
- 6. <u>Appreciates</u> the information provided by the State Party that while it considers that improvement of the existing road through the park is an urgent necessity, an alternative solution to the RN003 east of the park (option 2) is still under consideration and <u>notes</u> that all the works related to the RN003 have been suspended for three years;
- 7. Reiterates its position that the road through the park (the so-called 'Park Road') should be exclusively for local use and access to the monuments, that the proposed mitigation measures associated with its proposed improvements cannot be seen to mitigate the adverse impacts which would pose an imminent danger to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and that a deviation of the RN003 around the park is an absolute necessity to preserve the OUV of the property;
- 8. <u>Considering</u> that all above matters are intimately linked and inseparable, also <u>requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to:
 - a) Advise the State Party on:
 - (i) The necessity and means to improve the section of the road through the park as a Park Road, in ways that mitigate the highly adverse impacts of the current proposals as identified by the Environmental and Heritage Impact Assessments that the State Party already has undertaken,
 - (ii) Ways of progressing as a matter of urgency the deviation of the RN003 to the east of the park (the so-called option 2),
 - b) Assess the reasons for delays in the finalization of essential tools for the good management and conservation of the property, such as the definition of the buffer zone and the finalization of the conservation and management plans;
- 9. Reiterates its request to the State Party to halt the construction of the RN003 within the limits of the property pending the development of other alternatives to be evaluated, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to confirm that the future route of the RN003 will not pass through the property as it would seriously affect its integrity and its OUV, and to inform the Committee as soon as possible if and when the necessary studies for defining the deviation outside the property will be made;
- 10. <u>Appreciates</u> the emergency actions the State Party is taking in response to the fire, which destroyed the Church of Milot in April 2020 and <u>requests</u> the State Party to keep the Committee informed of any further development and to submit conservation reports and restoration proposals to the World Heritage Centre for analysis by the Advisory Bodies;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

AFRICA

34. Royal Palaces of Abomey (Benin) (C 323bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.34

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.1** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party to have invited and facilitated the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property that took place in February/March 2022, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to start implementing the mission's recommendations with no delay;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's re-affirmation of its authority at the property and the continuing measures to address illegal development and encroachment of the property;
- 5. <u>Further welcomes</u> the State Party's ongoing commitment to revising the 2017 UNESCO-Benin Framework Agreement, which includes the proposal of a large-scale project for the "Strengthening, safeguarding and promoting the tangible and intangible, cultural and historical heritage of Benin", which would provide capacity-building for professionals to protect and promote the property, as well as technical and scientific support for the development of the new museum and the promotion of sustainable tourism;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that further urgently needed measures to improve governance and financial management, are envisaged, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party in particular to merge the management of the property and the museum to ensure that the conservation and presentation of the palaces, their history and symbolism, are reinforced by the museum project rather than being subordinated to it;
- 7. <u>Also notes</u> that an overall Risk and Disaster Management Plan for the property is foreseen for 2022 and that fire protection measures are being designed and will be implemented as part of the National Agency for Touristic Heritage (ANPT) programme for this year;
- 8. <u>Appreciates</u> that the State Party has planned, in the Restructured Draft Framework Agreement, to update the Management Plan in view of taking into consideration the measures identified for the security and safety of the property and the new museum within it:
- 9. Also welcomes the proposed modifications to the designs of the new museum as requested by the Committee to make it less dominant so that the Amazon court continues to be intelligible as a large ceremonial open space, and while acknowledging the unanimous understanding by all the local communities of Abomey that the Amazon court acts as a link between the different royal families supporting the unity and social cohesion of the communities, takes note of the confirmation by the 2022 Reactive Monitoring mission that despite a reduced depth of the occupation of the Amazon court, it would retain good legibility and circulation between the palaces and allow the continuation of the performance of traditional ceremonies by the local communities and the royal families;

- 10. Further notes that more information on the museum project is needed to avoid any negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and also requests that an integrated plan concerning the treatment of the surface of the Amazon court, the materials to be used, the functional links between the different spaces, the access to visitors, the scenario and the scenography of the exhibition, the cultural and scientific programming, as well as the detailed timetable of its implementation are developed and shared as soon as possible with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for consideration, including appropriate mitigation measures identified, before launching the construction works foreseen to be carried out in 2023 and 2024;
- 11. <u>Further welcomes</u> the link between the museum project as set out in the HIA, but <u>notes</u> that the proposed restoration project only covers four of the ten palaces that make up the property, and <u>regrets</u> that whereas considerable progress has been made over the past two years in developing the museum project, so far work has not started on the development of the urgently needed Recovery/Conservation Plan for the palaces that will address their highly vulnerable authenticity and integrity;
- 12. <u>Reiterates its requests</u> for the restoration project to cover all ten palaces in the property, not just the official palaces or those parts that might be accessible to the public;
- 13. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> for a specific Recovery/Conservation Plan to be developed for all ten palaces, and for a draft outline including a phased and feasible programme of restoration and conservation, based on adequate surveys and research so as to establish a baseline from which to measure progress, and for this draft to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before work commences;
- 14. <u>Notes with concern</u> that in advance of the Recovery/Conservation Plan being drafted it is stated that the ANPT will start a programme of rehabilitation work on four of the palaces in 2022, and <u>requests</u> therefore the State Party to accelerate the development of the outline of the Recovery/Conservation Plan including a phased approach for its approval by the World Heritage Committee;
- 15. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a progress report, and by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 35. Rock-Hewn Churches, Lalibela (Ethiopia) (C 18)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.105** and **44 COM 7B.118** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Acknowledges the information provided by the State Party, including the studies from the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) and Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), on the progress of preparations related to the Ethiopian-French bilateral Sustainable Lalibela project and the further elaboration of adapted design options for canopies proposed to cover all rock-hewn churches;

- 4. Welcomes the results of detailed investigations carried out under the French-Ethiopian bilateral programme in support of Lalibela to collect monitoring data and assess conservation efforts since the early 20th century for both sheltered and unsheltered churches and takes note of the recommendations of the ESIA and HIA regarding the current stage of the canopy sheltering proposal;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's conclusion that one of the viable solutions to protect these churches from adverse weathering and stone deterioration is to cover them with permanent shelters, in ways that mitigate the negative impacts of current shelters as perceived by the local community and visitors;
- 6. <u>Considers</u> that the ESIA and the HIA pointed out that not enough data has been collected yet to define conclusively a state of environmental equilibrium for each of the 11 churches, nor precisely what impact shelters might have, to support the idea of permanent shelters, and <u>requests</u> that a robust monitoring and maintenance regimen be developed on a partnership basis with the aim of involving local communities and implemented as soon as possible, and therefore <u>also considers</u> that the shelter option should continue to be an evolving solution that could be reconsidered and reassessed in the future on the basis of feedback from local communities and ongoing monitoring in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Further considers</u> that any new shelters should be introduced on a partnership basis with maintenance and conservation of the churches being an integral part of a people-centred approach to preservation implemented by the local community of clergy and laity;
- 8. Also takes note of the proposed innovative and sustainable approach to the design of new shelters using tied bamboo as a structure and requests the State Party to undertake further research needed based on data gained from small-size pilot tests as pointed out in the ESIA and HIA on the feasibility of the use of bamboo as a structural engineering element at such a scale, while also acknowledging that the provision of stabilizing anchors will be essential to mitigate the risks resulting from extreme uplift wind conditions;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party, in order to allow final validation of the options proposed, to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, before any decision to realize the solution is taken, the following:
 - a) Reports of additional studies recommended by the Scientific Committee (geotechnical, hydrological and other studies deemed necessary),
 - b) Results of additional research conducted on the feasibility of the use of bamboo as a structural engineering element at the required scale,
 - c) Detailed plans for the conservation measures required for each architectural group, including maintenance and monitoring measures,
 - d) The Final Preliminary Design of the canopy options for each architectural group including but not limited to the anchoring system, the water drainage system, the dismantling approach for the existing shelter, and the regular maintenance requirements for the existing and potential new shelter structures, keeping in mind that the canopies should be considered as a temporary conservation solution until more data is available for each group,
 - e) A comprehensive overview of the different components of the Ethiopian-French collaboration project including a draft timetable of planned implementation;
- 10. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue the dialogue with the French authorities, the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies on the emerging bi-lateral project, to support the development of an integrated conservation plan, with a people-centred approach to conservation and management, based on long-lasting sustainable partnerships with all stakeholders involved:

- 11. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to continue its efforts in the operationalization of the Local Advisory Committee, according to the Reserved Area regulation, and <u>further requests</u> the submission of a minor boundary modification that includes all management and planning provisions for the property;
- 12. <u>Further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, a Vision Statement on growth and development, in line with the 2015 Policy for the Integration of a Sustainable Development Perspective into the Processes of the World Heritage Convention, that respects the OUV of the property and underpins the revised Structure Plan of Lalibela and the Local Development Plan;
- 13. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the May 2022 UNESCO assessment mission to the site, organized by the World Heritage Centre following the end of the armed conflict and encourages the State Party to implement all the recommendations of this mission;
- 14. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 36. Island of Mozambique (Mozambique) (C 599)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.4** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Commends the State Party for its response to the impacts of Cyclone Gombe in March 2022, in particular by organizing a prompt assessment of the damages caused by the cyclone and by mobilizing support through both Emergency International Assistance and the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund (HEF) to undertake rehabilitation of traditional Swahili houses with on-site trainings of local communities and on Disaster Risk Management (DRM) for cultural heritage for local stakeholders, and to develop emergency preparedness and risk mitigation protocols for the property, but urges all stakeholders concerned to expedite implementation of these projects to avoid further delay;
- 4. <u>Further commends</u> the State Party to conduct rehabilitation of the hospital complex and the island's courthouse, also affected by the cyclone, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to report to the World Heritage Centre in due course on the progress made;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the relocation of services of some long-term vacant public buildings to the mainland for safety reasons, as well as of the efforts of some state institutions to establish public-private partnerships to ensure recovery of degraded buildings, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to seek technical assistance from the Advisory bodies in view of the possible adaptive reuse of these buildings, should major interventions on them be foreseen;
- 6. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party for having submitted the updating of the Conservation and Management Plan 2022-2027 that should be finalized once the recommendations provided by ICOMOS are incorporated, and <u>takes note with satisfaction</u> of the efforts to increase the staff and capacities of the Island of Mozambique Conservation Office (GACIM) to ensure effective implementation of the Plan;

- 7. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to pursue its efforts to strengthen GACIM's authority and technical capacities, notably by approving the proposed amendment of GACIM's statutes, and by reinforcing the cooperation between GACIM and the Municipality, on issues and activities related to the management and conservation of the property, and <u>commends</u> the State Party for the engaged efforts to recruit new staff;
- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the development of various tools to support the management and conservation of the property, and their availability to the local communities, building owners and stakeholders, notably the Conservation guidelines and the "Specific Rules for the Conservation of the Built Heritage of the Macuti Town", and <u>requests</u> that the Urban Structure Plan of the property be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, to fully completing the approval and ratification process;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> that a general survey of all the buildings in the Stone and Lime town includes an assessment of each building's state of conservation and establishes the current uses of these buildings which are residential, commercial, religious and tourist in nature, <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide more detailed information on this survey, and to extent the inventory to Macuti town, covering all the property;
- 10. <u>Further thanks</u> the State Party for the particular attention given to the involvement of the local communities, including through heritage education and awareness-raising actions, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure increased community involvement and consultation in particular in view of the development of an urban mobility plan aimed to decongest the island and reduce the demographic pressure;
- 11. <u>Further notes</u> that the State Party undertook the new buffer zone delimitation, and <u>requests</u> that it be submitted as a proposal for a Minor Boundary Modification to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, following the procedure set in Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 12. <u>Also notes</u> the proposal to construct a "Tourist complex in Goa Island", is still under examination, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party to ensure, should the project be approved, that no works be carried out, until information has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, pursuant to Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 13. <u>Further commends</u> the State Party on its actions in addressing threats from climate change induced storm surges, <u>also noting</u> the potential spatial and visual impacts of these structures, <u>further requests</u> the State Party to develop a long-term strategy for sea defense infrastructure, and to assess this through Visual and Heritage Impact Assessments, and submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 14. Welcomes further the State Party's plan to address impacts of climate change through the development of a strategy for sea defence infrastructure in view of incorporating it into the Disaster Risk Management Plan, reinforcing measures provided in the 2017 Local Plan for Adaptation to Climate Change is favourable, and reminds it to use the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context in view of ensuring the conduction regarding the Visual and Heritage Impact Assessments, and requests the State Party to submit the Disaster Risk Management Plan with the incorporated strategy to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory bodies.
- 15. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to continue to mobilize funds (e.g., through International Assistance) to address the community living conditions and the sanitation in Macuti town, following the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
- 16. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

37. Stone Town of Zanzibar (United Republic of Tanzania) (C 173rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.37

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **38 COM 7B.55**, **39 COM 7B.45**, **40 COM 7B.21**, **42 COM 7B.51** and **44 COM 7B.12** adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively.
- 3. Notes the completion in 2020 of the Stone Town Conservation and Heritage Management Plan (STCHMP), the implementation of the new management structure, and the State Party's commitment to implement legislative changes to align the legal system with the STCHMP, and requests the State Party to resubmit the final STCHMP to the World Heritage Centre following its amendment, including placing the protection and maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) central to the aims of the STCHMP, and embedding Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) as an essential component of the management system of the property;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for developing a new proposal for the Darajani Bazaar development and subjecting it to an HIA;
- 5. Notes the State Party's commitment to developing a master plan for the Malindi Port area, to be assessed through HIA and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, and also requests that the Malindi Port area redevelopment be conceptualised with a focus on local communities and the property to ensure its long-term sustainability;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies:
 - a) The documentation of the "Safe Mobility Program for Stone Town" and the reported 5-year implementation plan, and
 - b) Detailed documentation for the proposed Malindi Bus Stand, before any decisions on its implementation are made that may be hard to reverse;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party that the 2016 mitigation measures for the Mambo Msiige building be urgently implemented and also that the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission be implemented;
- 8. <u>Thanks</u> the Sultanate of Oman for its commitment to rehabilitating the House of Wonders and Palace Museum, and <u>also thanks</u> the World Monument Fund and Zamani Project Research Group for participating in the joint expert's mission following the partial collapse of the House of Wonder and the World Bank for its support for the property through the Boosting Inclusive Growth in Zanzibar programme;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's commitment to submit to the World Heritage Centre details for the reconstruction, restoration and reuse of the House of Wonders, the Palace Museum, the Bwawani Hotel and the Tippu Tip House, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to implement past Committee decisions in developing these plans;

- 10. Requests the State Party, specifically in regard to the House of Wonders, to submit the results of the requested research project to investigate the chronological history of the House of Wonders and its construction technologies through archival and on-site investigations to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 11. Recalling Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, requests moreover the State Party to engage in the rehabilitation of the House of Wonders and other projects and submit details of conservation approaches, contractual agreements, and designs and timelines for the rehabilitation of the House of Wonders to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies and feedback to enhance the proposal before any further contractual agreements for implementation are entered into;
- 12. <u>Acknowledges</u> the invitation by the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in 2023 and requests moreover that this mission takes place to assess the overall state of conservation of the property and in particular, progress with the implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, the efficacy of the rehabilitation of the House of Wonders, and the Tippu Tip House, and to evaluate the proposals for the Malindi Bus Stand and report on other aspects critical to the maintenance of the OUV of the property such as mobility, and conservation works;
- 13. <u>Expresses its concern</u> at the continued perilous state of conservation of this property as reflected in the disharmonious urban development and transformation;
- 14. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party, in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and other partners, to continue undertaking effective conservation measures towards improved management and governance of the property in addressing the prevailing urban developmental pressures;
- 15. <u>Reiterates its call</u> for increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party to implement the short- and medium-term measures to improve the state of conservation of the property;
- 16. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a report on the state of conservation of the property and on the steps taken to implement the above-mentioned recommendations, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value.

ARAB STATES

38. Historic Cairo (Egypt) (C 89)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.38

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.13** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made with the strengthening and operationalisation of the management system for the property through an increased allocation of resources and the inauguration of a Management Committee, which is tasked with delivering an integrated strategy for the preservation and urban regeneration of Historic Cairo;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the work being undertaken on the development of a combined Management and Conservation Plan (MCP), which will be submitted to the World Heritage Centre in due course for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. Acknowledges the considerable work being undertaken on developing revitalisation projects for several quarters as well as the 'Regeneration Projects for Historic Cairo' in the areas of Bab Zweila, Al-Hakim Mosque and Darb Al-Labbanah that aim to preserve and develop the built fabric and take into consideration local communities, but expresses concern that the Masjid al Hakim project appears to encompass extensive transformation of the urban fabric in some parts, including removal and complete reconstruction of entire blocks, and requests the State Party to confirm the status of these projects and submit full details, including appropriate Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs), to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before further work is undertaken;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> the succinct project details provided for the 'Development Strategy', with the proposed reconfiguration of public streets and traffic circulation, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide further details of the overall strategy and the specific projects, including mobility studies, and on how circulation relates to the wider context of the city of Cairo and to clarify the status of other planned road developments across the property as well as road widening proposals;
- 7. Also acknowledges the considerable progress made to complete Phases 1 and 2 of the overall Urban Regeneration Project for Historic Cairo (URHC), but regrets that no information was provided on the development of the third and vital stage of the URHC, that is, the Sustainable Development Plan with the approach of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), which was due for completion at the end of 2020, and further requests the State Party to clarify whether the information provided concerning the 'Development Strategy' refers to this key document and to provide an update on the completion date of this document that the Steering Committee will execute, ensuring the integration of the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property with its sustainable development, and to submit the plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. Reiterates its request to the State Party to ensure that no major projects relating to rehabilitation of neighbourhoods or improvements to roads are undertaken until the Sustainable Development Plan and MCP have been completed, reviewed and approved;
- 9. Takes note that the State Party has informed that the road built across the historic Northern and Southern Cairo cemeteries did not involve the demolition of any tombs or mausolea within the property, nevertheless, expresses concern about the recently reported damages and reiterates its request to the State Party to submit as a matter of urgency technical information on any major project at the property, or its buffer zone, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Also takes note</u> of the details provided in the legal framework with respect to the demolition of protected monuments, <u>considers</u> that it remains unclear how these relate to unregistered buildings or demolition permissions issued for safety reasons in the long term, and once all

- assessment and studies have been completed, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to provide the necessary clarification;
- 11. Reiterates its concern that the specific urban morphologies of different neighbourhoods, including their unprotected commonplace buildings that provide the historical and social context for listed buildings, appear to have no sufficient overall protection, and requests moreover the State Party to confirm that that this challenge will be addressed by the Sustainable Development Plan and MCP in terms of approaches to documentation, contribution to OUV, and rehabilitation of these neighbourhoods;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 39. Rabat, Modern Capital and Historic City: a Shared Heritage (Morocco) (C 1401)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.134** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes notes</u> that a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property took place in May 2022;
- 4. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> for the efforts undertaken by the State Party in addressing its previous recommendations and the recommendations of the 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission, particularly with regard to providing details of on-going and planned major restoration and development projects with related Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA), and for the standard of the HIA for the Government's General Secretariat Building;
- 5. Welcomes the significant steps taken towards an improved management and decision-making process for future restoration and development projects, and the updated governance structure that defines the role of each institution involved in the protection and conservation of the property and also appreciates the very high quality of restoration works in recent projects;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that information on planned projects which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property will be submitted to the World Heritage Centre in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. Also notes that a project to update the Management Plan has been launched and that this will include social and environmental aspects, recommends that the Plan incorporates the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, particularly in relation to the wider setting of the property, and requests the State Party to address how the revised plan will be integrated with the active Special Development Plans (Plans d'Aménagement Spécial PAS);

- 8. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to submit the updated Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies before its final adoption;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> that details of the project to restore the original Rabat-Ville Railway Station, be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, when available, in addition to precise details of the new technical solutions used to reinforce the dematerialization of the Mohammed VI Tower;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.
- 40. Gebel Barkal and the Sites of the Napatan Region (Sudan) (C 1073)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.17** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Expresses its great concern about the armed conflict that erupted in April 2023 and the ensuing instability, which has impacted communities and all sectors of society, and may further affect the management capabilities at the property, and <u>calls</u> on all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any action that could cause damage to the property;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its efforts to implement some of its Decisions and recommendations of the 2019 mission, despite significant challenges, and prior to the recent conflict of 2023:
- 5. Continues to express serious concern at the overall state of conservation of the property, which is seriously threatened by alarming levels of fabric degradation as a result of environmental factors, including heavy rainfall and potential flooding, absence of adequate controls, lack of appropriate maintenance, inadequate museum and storage facilities, lack of management planning, ineffective coordination of archaeological missions, absence of an integrated strategy for the conservation of newly-excavated archaeological features, urban encroachment and development projects, all of which are impacting negatively on the attributes, which support the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the works undertaken for the elaboration of a 5-year comprehensive action plan, as recommended by the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, to address the management structure, legal instruments, inventories, documentation, conservation, restoration, development, community involvement and tourism management;
- 7. Requests the State Party to give high priority to the conservation of already existing or current excavations and to ensure that no new archaeological excavations occur, unless a holistic approach is taken into consideration with conservation as a priority, and encourages the international archaeological missions to assist with the necessary conservation works, once conditions permit;

- 8. <u>Notes</u> that urgent measures are required at the property to reverse the alarming level of deterioration, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to implement all of the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission and the 2020 UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund mission as a matter of urgency, when feasible;
- 9. Reminds the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information of any future works that may affect the OUV of the property, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to continue its efforts with regard to defining the boundaries of the property, as a matter of urgency, and <u>also reminds</u> the State Party to submit a Minor Boundary Modification, with property delimitations of the buffer zone, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Calls</u> on the international community to continue to support the State Party's urgent protection and management work through financial and technical assistance;
- 12. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, a report on the state of conservation of the property and on the steps taken to implement the recommendations above mentioned, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

41. Jaipur City, Rajasthan (India) (C 1605)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.41

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision 43 COM 8B.16 adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made to improve the frameworks for legal protection and management of the property and the ongoing efforts to establish a detailed base plan and inventory of the property's attributes;
- 4. Notes that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) have been undertaken for a range of conservation, infrastructure and development projects and that the State Party has developed additional guidance for public projects to strengthen the effectiveness of its HIA processes, and encourages the State Party to update this guidance, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, developed in collaboration between the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre;

- 5. <u>Also notes</u> that there are several projects under consideration pending the completion of HIAs, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies:
 - a) Detailed information on the projects currently under consideration,
 - b) Information on the status of projects listed in the 2019 Advisory Body Evaluation report, such as the multi-storeyed car park at Chaugan stadium complex and the Jaleb Chowk Redevelopment projects, and
 - c) Information about any ongoing or planned works within the property or its buffer zone that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that the State Party has initiated work in response to its previous decision, and <u>encourages</u> continued progress on the following actions:
 - a) Develop and implement the Special Area Heritage Plan under the Jaipur Master Plan 2025 to enhance the state of conservation of the property with regard to development impacts, including those affecting the city wall and craft streets, in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL),
 - b) Complete the detailed base plan and inventory of the attributes of OUV,
 - c) Finalise the Architectural Control Guidelines and control over demolitions, following stakeholder and public consultations,
 - d) Continue to improve the monitoring system, ensuring that it provides adequate information about the state of conservation of the property,
 - e) Complete the draft interpretation strategy and tourism plans, including elements such as parking lots;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to strengthen the enforcement of the Jaipur Nagar Nigam Heritage (Walled City) Heritage Conservation and Protection Bylaws 2020 to improve the legal protection of the property and to enhance the technical and management capacity and human resources of the Heritage Cell within Jaipur Municipality;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 42. Mausoleum of Khoja Ahmed Yasawi (Kazakhstan) (C 1103)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.31** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued monitoring of the Mausoleum by the State Party's advisors, and <u>requests</u> that the recommendations of the February 2022 report by the International Institute of Central Asian Studies (IICAS) be implemented;

- 4. <u>Also requests</u> that the State Party provide an update report on the functioning and effect of the Scientific-Methodological Council constituted in 2019;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the extensive presentation, interpretation and awareness-raising programmes, the installation of interpretative signage in the buffer zone, and the investigations and stabilization of the archaeological remains located in the buffer zone, along with the State Party's commitment to monitor the new landscape interventions in the buffer zone for their potential impact on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to develop a full list of the attributes bearing the OUV and the contribution of the buffer zone and wider setting to the authenticity and integrity of the property, along with a complete framework of monitoring indicators, and to submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Acknowledges</u> the State Party's submission of Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) for seven projects in the property's buffer zone and setting, but <u>regrets</u> that six of these were only undertaken after the projects had been completed, and therefore can only be considered as post-project analysis documents;
- 8. Requests furthermore that no decision be made nor any implementation begin for the project 'Phase II of the Improvement of the Territory of the Azret-Sultan Reserve-Museum' until an improved HIA has been undertaken and conclusively shows that the project will not have any negative impact on the OUV of the property, and until full details of the project have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre and reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to request the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM to provide onsite training and capacity building on the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and assist it in improving its impact assessment practice;
- 10. Reminds the State Party to inform it in due course, via the World Heritage Centre, about any projects that may affect the property's OUV, with necessary documentation based on rigorous independent impact assessment procedures before they are approved or implemented, and before any irreversible decision is made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines and in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 11. <u>Notes</u> that the Turkestan Master Plan allows for construction heights in the protected view cones exceeding the 7-metre height limit previously requested by this Committee, and reiterates its request to the State Party that it ensure that the Master Plan:
 - a) Recognises the OUV of the property,
 - b) Includes the View Axis Protection Area that prohibits any new development within the area from exceeding the 7-metre height limit;
- 12. Requests moreover the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, the amended Master Plan, including high-resolution copies of the 'Historical and Architectural basic plan' and the 'Master plan with the marked visual access protection zone', along with the relevant written regulations and any other relevant documentation, in one of the working languages of the Convention;
- 13. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to finalise its revision of the Management Plan by extending its scope and including:
 - a) Clearly articulated attributes of OUV that need to be protected and managed, developed in cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Principles and operationalization measures for future development,
 - c) A Disaster Risk Management Plan,
 - d) A Visitor Management Plan for the property;

- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 43. Town of Luang Prabang (Lao People's Democratic Republic) (C 479bis)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.32** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the State Party's efforts to implement activities for preservation, education and monitoring, but <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit the Infrastructure Development Plan for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its final approval and implementation;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> the findings and recommendations of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, and the continuing efforts by the State Party to address those findings and <u>invites</u> the State Party to continue implementing all mission recommendations, and in particular to:
 - a) Address the preservation of attributes that support the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property by:
 - (i) Affording priority to the 142 remaining buildings, especially those entirely constructed of wood, as part of a contingency plan for cases of advance decay, including possible public allocations,
 - (ii) Ensuring access to affordable materials for construction and repair, as well as traditional conservation skills to sustain the authenticity of the property,
 - (iii) Pursuing the rehabilitation programme for wetlands and ponds, highly valued ecological attributes of OUV,
 - (iv) Considering public outreach projects to valorise intangible aspects that sustain the Town of Luang Prabang's urban fabric as a living entity,
 - b) Pursue its work updating the Luang Prabang Conservation Plan (PSMV), with technical and financial support by various partners by:
 - (i) Including the appropriate sub-categories such as 'Civil Buildings' and regularly updating GIS inventories of attributes of OUV and adding the contour levels of the embankments, water levels and depth soundings of the Mekong and Nam Khan Rivers, to enable chronological tracking,
 - (ii) Elaborating policies as part of the PSMV to embrace all elements that support the property's OUV (built heritage, natural, environmental and intangible attributes), and referring to the Sustainable Development Goals (SGDs), and the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape,

- (iii) Reflecting on authenticity as it is applicable to the Asian context, including reference to the Nara Document on Authenticity and the Hoi An Protocols,
- c) Address ongoing and future development initiatives to safeguard the full set of attributes of OUV through proactive planning efforts and a deeper understanding of the social, natural and cultural attributes of the property's OUV and their interconnection, and notably to:
 - (i) Prioritize the studies suggested by the 2019 Technical Review to inform the concept of future actions relating to the riverbank protection, and consider a hybrid system to suit different riverbank landscapes when applicable, in the interest of sustainable development,
 - (ii) Consider alternative approaches to the proposed replacement of the Nam Khan River Bridge in light of the ICOMOS technical review, and the option proposed by the Reactive Monitoring mission of a like-for-like replacement,
 - (iii) Establish and apply Urban Design Guidelines to preserve streetscapes and materials to be used in future development projects in and around the inscribed and buffer zones:
- 5. Recommends the State Party to continue its efforts in the HIA for the Luang Prabang Hydropower Project (LPHPP) and other future and similar projects so that they pose no threat to the World Heritage properties, their associated values or their environmental setting and notes that previous studies and the Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) were submitted in November 2021, December 2022 and January 2023, respectively;
- 6. <u>Also notes</u> that the State Party will further elaborate the proposed Mekong and Nam Khan Riverbank Protection project in accordance with the most-recent ICOMOS technical advice, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to further explore bio-engineered solutions which will ensure protection against disasters as well as maintaining attributes which support the OUV of the property;
- 7. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to strengthen governance and coordination mechanisms relating to the management of the property by:
 - a) Elaborating an Integrated Tourism Management Plan, in line with the World Heritage Sustainable Tourism guidelines and the ICOMOS International Charter for Cultural Heritage and other relevant guidelines, based on a carrying capacity study, to inform the measures to regulate tourism-related activities and infrastructure development, to prioritise the actions, including those to ensure safety and security of visitors (e.g., Mount Phousi),
 - b) Resuming the operationalisation of the Heritage Fund with the return of tourists and possible complementary financial support to assist necessary repair and maintenance works for the most significant traditional architecture,
 - c) Maintaining the former Luang Prabang World Heritage Office (LPWHO) under restructuring as the unified technical entity overlooking the various aspects of the management of the property with necessary human and financial reinforcement,
 - d) Strengthening the role of National and Provincial Committees for National Heritage to ensure the proactive and informed coordination for major development projects;
- 8. Requests the State Party to integrate the World Heritage Convention's principles within the broader context of territorial and developmental planning for World Heritage properties in Lao PDR, including for the properties' buffer zones and wider settings, and to widen the recognition of heritage-related impact assessments and of the obligations of States Parties

- to the Convention among national and international development stakeholders, to ensure the coherence of the management framework;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value.

44. Bagan (Myanmar) (C 1588)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.44

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,
- Recalling Decision 43 COM 8B.20 adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the significant efforts that have been made towards implementing the recommendations it made at the time of the property's inscription on the World Heritage List;
- 4. Expresses its sympathy to the people of Myanmar, who have been affected by a tropical cyclone in May 2023, notes with concern that the cyclone may have affected the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and emphasizes that a number of emergency assistance mechanisms are available under the Convention to assist, if needed;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the revisions to the boundaries of components 6 and 7 and to the buffer zone of component 4, the installation of boundary markers for the property components and buffer zone, and the completion of the registration and grading of all monuments located in the property and its buffer zone;
- 6. Welcomes the adoption of the Cultural Heritage Regions Law (2019), the Building By-Law (2020), and the formal establishment of the Bagan National Coordinating Committee (BAGANCOM) and other coordinating mechanisms for the management system, and encourages a review of the effectiveness and operations of the governance structures and the operation of the Integrated Management Framework as part of the planned 5-year review in 2024:
- 7. <u>Acknowledges</u> that progress in relation to some of the Committee's recommendations has been affected by recent and current conditions, including the COVID-19 pandemic, and that this has had a major impact on the operation of the governance arrangements, research planning and tourism;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the continuation of further progress with all actions identified at the time of inscription, and especially with:
 - a) Regular meetings of the Bagan International Coordinating Committee (BICC) and the development of formal agreements with all international missions working at Bagan,
 - b) The Bagan Sustainable Tourism Strategy, including post-COVID-19 considerations,

- c) Develop the Bagan Hotel Strategy in consultation with ICOMOS and the UNESCO World Heritage Centre and based on the Bagan Hotel Strategy Scoping Study (2020), identifying zones within which hotels can be located and ensuring that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) are undertaken before any new hotel development or expansion is undertaken.
- d) The Bagan Disaster Risk Management Strategy, ensuring that it is associated with the monitoring system and responsive to damages arising from identified pressures, such as weather events.
- e) The Archaeological Risk Management Strategy for the property, buffer zone and wider setting,
- f) Capacity-building and framework development for Impact Assessments, in conformity with the new Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage context, and conducting further HIA studies for the Bagan-Nyaung Oo Airport project once the planning stage is further advanced;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> the ongoing efforts regarding research, consolidation of data collection, professional development and site monitoring, and <u>also encourages</u> continued progress with the 'One Map' initiative, archaeological research and data collection, the development of a monitoring system based on inventories of the tangible and intangible attributes of Bagan, and the implementation of the Bagan Agriculture Sector Strategy;
- 10. <u>Notes</u> the conclusions and concerns identified in ICOMOS Technical Review of the road construction and tree planting program within the boundaries of the World Heritage property, and requests:
 - an archaeological report on the ground disturbance caused by the recent road works and tree planting, in accordance with the ICOMOS Technical Review, including an analysis of taphonomy, soil profiles and any artefacts exposed by the works,
 - a landscape study that characterizes the landscape during key historical phases to assist with the identification of appropriate tree species for future greening programmes;
- 11. Reminds the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for evaluation by the Advisory Bodies, detailed information on any ongoing and future works, including any restoration works for damage occurring within the property or its buffer zone that may affect the OUV of the property, along with any associated Impact Assessments, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the submission to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, of an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

45. Kathmandu Valley (Nepal) (C 121bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.45

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.33** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's continued efforts towards the recovery of the property following the 2015 Gorkha earthquake and the establishment of the International Scientific Committee for Kathmandu Valley (ISC-KV);
- 4. <u>Calls upon</u> the international community to continue supporting the State Party's recovery work through financial, technical or expert assistance, including support for local communities and their housing and social needs, and in particular to contribute the resources needed to enable the active participation of international experts in the newly-established ISC-KV:
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the submission of the revised Integrated Management Framework (IMF), which will be subject to a Technical Review by the Advisory Bodies and subsequently become part of the New Master Plan for Pashupati Protected Monument Zone, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the entirety of the New Master Plan document and the revised IMF to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to formal government approval;
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to update the Recovery Master Plan (RMP), including revisions to the six-year plan and timetable, and to establish RMPs for each Protective Monument Zone of the property that is in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to integrate the RMPs for each Protective Monument Zone of the property within the overall socio-economic revitalization programme for urban communities;
- 7. Recalls the conclusions and recommendations of the 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission, especially the mission's findings regarding adverse effects on the authenticity of the property and the focus on monuments at the expense of other attributes, with the resulting consequences for traditional urban housing and ancient settlements, and therefore reiterates its request that the State Party fully implement all of the Reactive Monitoring mission's recommendations and report on its progress;
- 8. Notes the information provided regarding the Patan Durbar Square Monument Zone sewer project, the Lal Baithak wing of the National Art Museum, Bhaktapur, and the proposed expansion of the Ring Road at Swayambhu, reminds the State Party of its previous request that the revised documentation of the Patan Durbar Square Monument Zone sewer project be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, and also reminds the State Party that details of these projects and any other major projects, including Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs), should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, in line with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. Requests the State Party to ensure that the draft procedures and format for HIAs in Nepal are reviewed to be consistent with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to being adopted;
- 10. Requests the State Party to adopt and implement the recommendations of the first ISC-KV from March 2023, and particularly the following overarching tasks and programmes:
 - a) Finalize post-disaster recovery phase,
 - b) Review and revise, if necessary, the Integrated Management Plan,
 - c) Review and revise, if necessary, the effectiveness of essential management procedures and tools,

- d) Establish a comprehensive information management system,
- e) Provide capacity strengthening and training,
- f) Establish regular ISC-KV and Coordinative Working Committee (CWC) meetings;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 46. Lumbini, the Birthplace of the Lord Buddha (Nepal) (C 666rev)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.148** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the finalization of the Integrated Management Framework (IMF) for the property and its adoption by the Government of Nepal, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to facilitate and provide the necessary resources for its swift implementation;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> advice from the State Party that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) will be completed for any proposed project that may have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the draft procedures and format for HIAs in Nepal are reviewed to be consistent with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context prior to being adopted, and <u>reiterates its request</u> that HIAs be carried out before any further work occurs within the property or in adjacent areas identified as having potential archaeological significance, and that these HIAs and relevant project documentation be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in conformity with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse;
- 5. <u>Further welcomes</u> advice from the State Party regarding the International Scientific Committee (ISC) established as part of the UNESCO/Japan Funds-in-Trust project for the protection and management of the Greater Lumbini Area, along with the State Party's expressed commitment to using this forum and other international and technical meetings to support holistic conservation of the property, its OUV and wider setting;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the conclusions and recommendations of the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, and <u>also urges</u> the State Party to instigate a programme for the progressive implementation of the mission recommendations, particularly with respect to:
 - a) Governance, site management, regulations and supporting documents,
 - b) Submission of information to the World Heritage Centre,
 - c) Interdisciplinary surveys and associated discussions regarding the Mayadevi shelter and improvements to facilities for pilgrims and visitors,

- d) Implementation of preventive measures to reduce any negative impact to the property and its OUV, the surrounding landscape and the environment from the Buddhist Meditation Hall, located within the Lumbini Kenzo Tange Master Plan Area;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to implement the recommendations of the March 2023 meeting of the ISC, particularly with respect to:
 - a) Declaration of the property as a Protected Monument Zone in accordance with the Ancient Monument Preservation Act 1956.
 - b) Sector strategies on: Archaeology, Local Development, Disaster Risk Management, Visitor Management, Environment and Buddhist Organisations, as outlined in the IMF,
 - c) A Visitor Management Plan/Physical Plan for the entire Sacred Garden of Lumbini,
 - d) Conservation and monitoring measures for the Mayadevi Temple Shelter,
 - e) Investigations, conservation and management of Tilaurakot-Kapilavastu and the Greater Lumbini area,
 - f) Sustainable development and tourism;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Committee informed about the updated details of the Lumbini World Peace City initiative and to prepare a comprehensive HIA as outlined above and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before implementation;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> the proposal to reduce industrial activity in the vicinity of the property, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to submit further information about this initiative to the World Heritage Centre;
- 10. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 47. Fort and Shalamar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan) (C 171)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.34** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the advice and the reports provided by the State Party regarding its response to the Committee's previous requests and the recommendations formulated by the 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, including the preparation of eight feasibility studies and the May 2022 'Inception Report', but <u>expresses</u> its regret that the State Party has not actively engaged with the World Heritage Centre nor with ICOMOS during this process as requested;

- 4. <u>Notes</u> that technically detailed information on the actions proposed by the State Party at the property is provided by the abovementioned reports, but <u>reiterates its request</u> that the outcomes of the feasibility studies and the 'Inception Report' for the implementation of the recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. Reiterates its previous request that the State Party work in close cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS to develop and implement mitigation measures and recommendations concerning all Orange Line Metro-related operations and future projects, in order to prevent any damage to the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the 'Lahore Fort Precincts and Buffer Zone Master Plan' following a Technical Review by ICOMOS;
- 7. <u>Notes</u> that additional restoration, conservation and/or adaptation projects have been undertaken at both component sites of the property, but <u>regrets</u> that the State Party has not provided sufficient technical information about these projects prior to their implementation to ensure the technical relevance of these works, contrary to the provisions of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines and of its requests in previous decisions;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre complete technical details of the interventions implemented in and around the Royal Kitchen, and proposals for the conservation of the Sheesh Mahal for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. Reminds the State Party that full details of all significant projects at the property, including Heritage Impact Assessments prepared in accordance with the new Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage Context, should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before a project is implemented or any irreversible decision is made, and that such projects should only proceed once positive feedback has been received from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess its overall state of conservation, evaluate the effect of recent works on its OUV, consider future technical proposals, and to assess the efficacy of the 'Inception Report', as well as actual progress accomplished in implementing the recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 11. Requests the State Party to prepare and submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, a separate study related to the possible boundary modification to include Badshahi Masjid, the Hazoori Bagh and the Sikh Funerary complex within the property boundaries, including a visual analysis and potential adjustments to the buffer zone of the Shalamar Gardens, and reiterates its request that the State Party submit to the World Heritage Centre a proposal for a boundary modification based on the outcomes of the aforementioned study, prepared in accordance with Paragraphs 163 to 165 of the Operational Guidelines and including the revision of the buffer zones, after having considered all appropriate social measures, especially if any action would involve the displacement of people residing in the neighbouring areas of the property;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

48. Royal Tombs of the Joseon Dynasty (Republic of Korea) (C 1319bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.48

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **33 COM 8B.15** adopted at its 33rd session (Seville, 2009),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts to fully implement its recommendations formulated at the time of inscription, and <u>commends</u> the State Party's continued efforts to establish a set of development standards for each of the 18 buffer zones;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) are currently underway to evaluate the impacts of housing development plans on the conservation of Changneung Royal Tomb in the Seooreung Cluster and the Taereung Cluster, and that the State Party has committed to submitting these to the World Heritage Centre upon completion, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the information provided by the State Party regarding the construction of apartment complexes by three private construction companies in the vicinity of the Jangneung cluster without prior consultation with the national authorities in charge of World Heritage conservation;
- 6. <u>Notes with concern</u> that pungsu (geomantic principles), which played a critical role in the selection of a site for a royal tomb and support the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), are impacted adversely by this housing construction;
- 7. <u>Notes with concern</u> that, in December 2021, the construction companies won an administrative lawsuit against the Cultural Heritage Administration's administrative order to halt construction, and that the State Party is still engaged in appeals of these decisions, having lost the first rulings in 2022;
- 8. Requests the State Party to provide regular updates to the World Heritage Centre on the outcomes of the discussion and legal procedures currently ongoing for the construction of high-rise projects in the buffer zones and settings of all components of this property;
- 9. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for creating a task force to come up with measures to prevent similar unauthorized development activities from happening again in buffer zones, as well as for having invited an Advisory mission to this property to seek advice on conservation of the property's OUV and mitigation measures, <u>requests</u> that the terms of the task force be extended to also include the landscape setting of the components of the property;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> of the outcomes of the Advisory mission, and especially its concerns that similar situations with recent, ongoing or planned developments located on the outer limits of the property's buffer zones and in the wider setting of the component sites are likely to be found at some of the other 15 tomb clusters and may represent significant, cumulative negative impacts on the property's ability to express the OUV for which it was inscribed;
- 11. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to strengthen information sharing with relevant government entities to ensure a more integral understanding of heritage regulations by local governments and members of the public, <u>recommends</u> that all relevant urban plans in the Republic of Korea integrate measures to fully safeguard World Heritage properties,

especially the properties' wider setting, in line with Paragraph 112 of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to revise the Special Act on Conservation, Management, and Utilization of World Heritage, with a view to incorporating impact assessments into the domestic heritage protection system;

- 12. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to fully implement the Advisory mission recommendations to safeguard the OUV of the property, in particular to:
 - a) Carry out a full review of potential, planned and existing development impacts at each component of the World Heritage property to establish the status of the erosion of OUV since inscription and an exhaustive mapping of key view cones from each components, especially those view cones that support the OUV of the property,
 - b) Take into full account the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context for the new HIA legislation and, upon adoption, widely disseminate materials about this legislation, including user-friendly materials adapted to the national system,
 - c) Establish Standing Advisory Committees that include community members and representatives of municipal governments to ensure input from local communities, advance warning of pending issues and concerns, such as proposed large-scale developments, and to promote regular, two-way dialogue;
- 13. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property with a view to thoroughly assessing the overall state of conservation of the property, the cumulative impacts of planned or ongoing housing and commercial developments, their existing and potential impacts on key view cones from the property, as well as any other factors affecting the property's OUV at all 18 component sites;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

49. Itchan Kala (Uzbekistan) (C 543)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.49

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.39** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the fact that the moratorium on demolition and rebuilding in Dishan Kala remains in place;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that the Project of Detailed Planning of Historical Centre of Khiva (PDP) is being revised to take its recommendations into account, but that the requested phased dialogue with the Advisory Bodies has not yet taken place, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to initiate such a dialogue as soon as possible;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the creation of the International Advisory Committee (IAC) for cultural World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan and the organisation of its first technical session in July

- 2022, and <u>emphasizes</u> that such a mechanism should continue, with the support of its experts, advising the national authorities on the conservation of cultural heritage properties and implementation of Committee decisions and previous missions' recommendations, as well as the recommendations of the July session of the IAC on Khiva;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the details provided on projects supported by the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), including the Integrated Cultural Heritage Framework (ICHF) to diversify tourist routes and activities, develop concept plans for infrastructure improvements in the city of Khiva, and assess links between infrastructure development and tourism growth, but <u>expresses concern</u> that these projects are being taken forward before the revised PDP is reviewed and approved by the Committee, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that full details of projects relating to the property or its immediate setting are submitted together with a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any commitments are made;
- 7. Further notes that the Management Plan is being revised and will be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, <u>also expresses concern</u> that, in the absence of an approved PDP and Management Plan, and without a functioning Property Management Unit and Property Manager, the property remains highly vulnerable in the context of the dynamic and fast-moving tourism and infrastructure projects supported by the EBRD, and <u>also urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Make progress with the PDP and Management Plans as soon as possible to set a framework for the development of EBRD-supported projects, so that they respect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and align with the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL),
 - b) Strengthen the management of the property by appointing a Property Manager and creating a Property Management Unit,
 - c) Submit the buffer zone for review by the Advisory Bodies and subsequent approval by the Committee, in line with Decision **40 COM 8B.42**;
- 8. <u>Also takes notes</u> of conservation problems relating to termite attacks on wooden beams, notably in the Friday Mosque and the Khan's Palace, and of the adverse impact of salinity in walls on ceramic tiles, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to develop, on the basis of expert advice, overall conservation approaches for both these issues that include preventative and reactive measures, before specific projects are defined and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. Reiterates its regret that the development of phase I of the Mevaston Hotel occurred before proposals and plans were approved and considers that the revised plans for phases I and II are acceptable provided certain detailed conditions are fulfilled, but maintains its view that this project cannot be taken as a model for development in areas of demolished mahallas;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 50. Samarkand Crossroad of Cultures (Uzbekistan) (C 603rev)

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.40** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made to address previously identified threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property through regulatory change, capacity building, preparation of additional guidance documents, proposed conservation works, the revision of the traffic scheme, which no longer includes any expansion of the main transport routes within the property and buffer zone, and the relocation of the proposed new astronomical complex outside of the property and its buffer zone;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the establishment of the International Advisory Committee (IAC) for World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan and <u>emphasizes</u> that such a mechanism should continue, with the support of its experts, advising the national authorities on the conservation of the cultural heritage properties and implementation of the World Heritage Committee decisions and previous missions' recommendations:
- 5. Notes that the State Party has prepared Urban Design Guidelines and submitted a Management Plan for the property, also notes that substantial revisions are required to incorporate the outcomes of the 2020 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission into the Management Plan and integrate the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) within the Master Plan,
- 6. Requests that the overall moratorium on demolition and new development remain until the integrated Master Plan for the city, the further revised Management Plan for the property and the Urban Design Guidelines are finalised, submitted to the World Heritage Centre and positively reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> the progress accomplished to date, <u>reiterates its previous request</u> to the State Party to fully implement the recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies and in accordance with the Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines:
 - Detailed project documentation for proposed works to Chorsu Trade Dome, Koshhovuz, Shah-i-Zinda, Gori Amir, Registan, Samarqand Sherdor, Tillaqori and the Ulugbek complex,
 - b) Details of proposed works to remove or modify the Imari building and to address the recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission regarding the Hilton Hotel,
 - c) The conservation plan and details of the proposed physical conservation programme for the Bibi Khanoum Ensemble and Mosque,
 - Revised Samarkand Hotel Concept Design, which address the recommendations of the ICOMOS technical review;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> the State Party's advice that it will submit a proposal for a minor boundary modification to adjust the buffer zone, in accordance with Paragraph 164 and Annex 11 of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>further requests</u> that the proposal follows the recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission and advice from the IAC, and aligns the buffer zone with the mahalla boundaries;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

51. Historic Centres of Berat and Gjirokastra (Albania) (C 569bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.51

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 7B.75**, **41 COM 7B.40**, **43 COM 7B.79** and **44 COM 7B.151** adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43th (Baku, 2019) and its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the progress made in improving the state of conservation of the property, as well as for providing financial stimulus to private owners to undertake conservation and maintenance work;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's commitment to upgrading urban regulations for both Berat and Gjirokastra and to developing an integrated urban conservation and development tool, and reiterates its request to the State Party to diversify its development plans for the property to stimulate a broad resilient economic basis for its future:
- 5. Notes with regret the failure of the State Party to fully implement the international assistance granted for the development of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for the property, in collaboration with governmental and civic sectors, despite Committee's previous decisions, urges the State Party to finalise the IMP as a matter of urgency, taking into account the comments and recommendations already made by the Advisory Bodies in the context of the international assistance project and requests the State Party to submit a pre-final draft to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Further notes with regret</u> the resumption of the construction of the Gjirokastra bypass road before the conclusions of the Reactive Monitoring mission of December 2021 were available and could be taken into account, and therefore <u>also requests</u> the State Party to urgently complete a full independent Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the Gjirokastra bypass road before its construction reaches a point where no significant mitigation would be possible, to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, and to ensure the implementation of the identified mitigation measures and the development of any necessary modifications to the road during the subsequent construction phase, where appropriate, to minimise impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 7. <u>Further notes</u> that the Gjirokastra bypass road is one of many development projects within/or in the setting of the property and neither the cumulative nor the individual impacts of all these development projects including of the Project for Integrated Urban and Tourism Development (PIUTD) on the OUV have been comprehensively assessed;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> the conclusions and recommendations of the 2021 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to implement these in full, and in particular the following key recommendations:

- a) HIAs should be a legal prerequisite for development projects and directly linked into the provisions of the regulations of both Berat and Gjirokastra,
- b) The IMP must have proper legal status allowing for its effective implementation,
- c) A comprehensive long-term development strategy for the property, including tourism management should be developed, with a focus on enhancing synergies of the World Heritage property with the intangible and natural heritage of its wider setting, and linked to the IMP.
- d) A HIA of the cumulative impacts of the PIUTD and other development projects on the OUV of the entire property and its setting should be conducted,
- e) The bypass road in Gjirokastra should be fully reflected in the mobility plan for Gjirokastra currently under development to ensure the impacts on the OUV are taken into account.
- f) A landscape study of the valley (Gjirokastra), including the historic evolution and its use over time as well as its relationship with the town morphology, should be conducted as part of the HIA of the bypass road or separately;
- 9. Also notes the submission of details for the restoration of the three footbridges over the Zerzebili River, requests furthermore the State Party, for all development projects that may affect the OUV of the property, to submit project details to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to any irreversible approval or decision, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and to commission, in accordance with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines, HIAs focusing on the property's OUV, to be carried out in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and recalls that these documents, or at least their executive summaries, should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre in one of the working languages of the Committee;
- 10. <u>Requests moreover</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to limit the occurrence of illegal construction activities in the property;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

52. Fertö / Neusiedlersee Cultural Landscape (Austria, Hungary) (C 772rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.52

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Welcomes</u> the States Parties' commitment to achieving the joint management of the property and <u>encourages</u> the States Parties to strengthen their dialogue to collaboratively address the complex issues affecting the transboundary lacustrine cultural landscape;
- 3. <u>Expresses its utmost concern</u> about the scale of the original Sopron Fertő Lake Resort, <u>welcomes</u> the decision to suspend the project but <u>notes</u> that any future project cannot be regarded solely as a rehabilitation project, and that its potential impacts on the Outstanding

- Universal Value (OUV) of the property will need to be assessed in cumulation with the existing tourism infrastructure along the entire lakeshore;
- 4. <u>Invites</u> the States Parties to consider suspending the planning and implementation of all tourism-related development projects along the lakeshore until an inventory of all existing and planned tourism facilities along the lakeshore has been jointly carried out and an assessment of cumulative adverse impacts on the property's attributes prepared;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the States Parties' invitation for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property, extended to the Secretariat of the Ramsar Convention, which will provide recommendations to the States Parties regarding tourism development projects, including the re-designed Sopron Fertő Lake Resort, water supply to the lake and wind turbines in the vicinity of the property;
- 6. Requests the States Parties to jointly develop a vision for the future of the property and lay down a shared strategy, including a strategy for tourism infrastructure and management, to ensure a sustainable and equitable use of the property compatible with its OUV;
- 7. Requests that the 'Criteria for Building in the World Heritage Site' developed by the Lake Neusiedl World Heritage Association be revised and the need for an impact assessment be based on the potential of developments to adversely impact the OUV of the property and its supporting attributes rather than on the size of proposals;
- 8. <u>Equally welcomes</u> the decision to suspend the implementation of the project of the Mosoni-Duna section of the Lébény-Hanyi Irrigation Canal thus giving the planned joint Advisory mission time to assess the proposal and make recommendations thereon;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> the progressive water shortage recorded at the lake, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to submit detailed documentation, including a transboundary Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), of the proposed project to divert waters from the Mosoni-Duna to feed the Seewinkel groundwater body and Fertő-Neusiedl Lake, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before a final decision is taken on this proposal;
- 10. <u>Also notes</u> the preparation of an HIA of the proposal to repower the wind farm site at Weiden am See, and <u>urges</u> the State Party of Austria to submit the outcomes of the HIA to the World Heritage Centre before any final decision is taken;
- 11. <u>Recalls</u> that, in a World Heritage context, HIAs should be carried out on the basis of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and that a more specialised tool, the Guidance for Wind Energy Projects in a World Heritage Context, is also available online;
- 12. Requests furthermore the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

53. Paris, Banks of the Seine (France) (C 600)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.53

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.46** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the efforts made to safeguard Notre-Dame de Paris Cathedral and for the successful completion of the security and consolidation work;
- 4. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party for the successful organization of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the compatibility of the modalities for the implementation of the restoration of the exterior of the Cathedral as well as the projects related to the liturgical layout and surroundings, as presented to the mission team, with the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and its attributes;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that the mission took place at a time when some decisions concerning the restoration of the Cathedral and its surroundings had already been taken, while other decisions, based on information that was not available at the time of the mission, were to follow in the coming months;
- 7. <u>Endorses</u> the recommendations of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission and <u>invites</u> the State Party to implement them, notably by submitting as soon as possible and in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines:
 - a) A clear timetable of the works planned and carried out for the reconstruction and restoration of the roofs, the restoration of the façades and the interiors, specifying the options for cleaning techniques and the justification for the choice of the expected result (particularly in relation to the historical frame of reference and any specific findings) and identifying the moments when key decisions will have to be taken concerning the restoration options and the actors involved.
 - b) The technical information about the restoration of the façade before the start of the works.
 - c) The outcome of the competitive process on the design of the Cathedral's surroundings and the final design of the liturgical arrangement,
 - d) A strategy for managing the public use of the Cathedral's surroundings from 2024 onwards, pending completion of the restoration work on the building,
 - e) The new finalized risk prevention and management plan;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre a progress report on the works since the submission of its last state of conservation report and the joint Advisory mission in March 2022, including detailed information on the progress of the reconstruction and restoration work on the Cathedral as well as the details of the project retained for the redevelopment of the surroundings of Notre-Dame and the planned timetable for its validation by the competent national bodies and its implementation;

- 9. <u>Welcomes</u> the development of a fire defence and safety project for Notre-Dame de Paris Cathedral;
- 10. Notes the need to create an integrated management plan for the "Paris, Banks of the Seine" property, while recognizing the systems in place and the complexity of the task, and recommends the creation of interim management plans specific to each component of the property, followed by an integrated management plan for the entire property;
- 11. <u>Also recommends</u> that the new risk prevention and management plan should form part of the integrated management plan for the property;
- 12. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to strengthen coordination with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in order to maintain a regular dialogue and ensure a clear understanding of the various restoration actions planned for the Cathedral, as well as other actions planned for the redevelopment of the Cathedral square and its surroundings and for the property as a whole;
- 13. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

54. Gelati Monastery (Georgia) (C 710bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.54

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.47** adopted at its 44th extended session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Commends the State Party on the efficiency with which it has attempted to address the deficiencies concerning the roofs installed in 2015-2018 in the Church of the Nativity of the Virgin and St George's Church and to prevent further decay of the historic murals, in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and through engagement of international experts, as well as on the timely organization and facilitation of a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission to provide recommendations on the way forward to address those deficiencies and other issues pertaining to the state of conservation of the property;
- 4. <u>Endorses</u> the recommendations of the 2022 Advisory mission to the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to follow them in its pursuit of the programme to redress the conservation challenges at the property and to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, documentation on further emergency interventions and longer-term conservation strategy and measures, as well as relevant technical material, prior to implementation;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> that redressing the conservation challenges at the property will require large financial resources over a long period, and <u>reiterates its call</u> for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including to enhance the capacity of Georgian experts whose increased involvement

- in the longer-term conservation efforts at Gelati is important for the sustainable conservation and management of the property;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> the submission of detailed expert reports to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, and the need to document all new interventions in detail, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Submit the holistic conservation programme, with plan and road map, and the updated Conservation Master Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies.
 - b) Submit designs and details of all new temporary and permanent roofing proposals to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies,
 - c) Continue engaging with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, either directly or through the submission of technical material for review,
 - d) Initiate a documentation programme that records the technical and process details of all interventions to the built fabric of the property;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to review and update the Management Plan for the property and to continue its efforts to develop indicators to monitor the state of conservation of the attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit the above to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to pursue a closer dialogue with different stakeholders about the protection measures taken at the property, including through the World Heritage Protection Council of Georgia at the National Agency for Cultural Heritage Preservation of Georgia;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to invite during 2024 a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess the conservation measures taken, the development and implementation of the holistic conservation programme, including Conservation Master Plan and roadmap, the updating of the Management Plan, the steps undertaken to improve the management system and its effectiveness, and the overall state of conservation of the property;
- 10. Requests moreover the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

55. Mathildenhöhe Darmstadt (Germany) (C 1614)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.55

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.18** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the positive steps undertaken by the State Party to resolve the issues raised by the Committee at the time of inscription;

- 4. Requests the State Party to provide updates on the implementation of its recommendations with regard to the following:
 - a) Developing a conservation management plan to guarantee a consistent conservation approach and strategy for all buildings of the property,
 - b) Strengthening the link between the private owners and conservation services,
 - c) Ensuring an appropriate balance between development and conservation activities in budget allocations,
 - d) Including in the interpretation and presentation of the different buildings of the property, the history of their conservation;
- 5. Reiterates its requests to the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre the new project developed for the relocation of the visitor centre, the amended Building Plan O32, and detailed information on the impact of vehicular traffic on sightlines to and from the property, including illustrative materials;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 56. Budapest, including the Banks of the Danube, the Buda Castle Quarter and Andrássy Avenue (Hungary) (C 400bis)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.49** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Welcomes the modifications and amendments concerning the World Heritage Design Guide, the Hungarian World Heritage Council and the World Heritage Complex Impact Assessment as well as plans to conduct Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) supplemented by a Visual Impact Assessments and requests the State Party to conduct HIAs in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context as a pre-requisite for all development projects within and around the World Heritage property and submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> the progress made regarding the development of the management plan and the development of the online platform 'Budapest World Heritage Attributes System' as an innovative tool to visualize attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and <u>welcomes</u> public consultations organised by the State Party during the preparation of the management plan;
- 5. Reiterates its request to the State Party to finalise the management plan as soon as possible, including details of the protective measures and regulatory regimes, and to submit the final draft of the plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption;

- 6. <u>Also acknowledges</u> the State Party's efforts to document and monitor the current state of conservation of the property, including by using a geospatial database, and <u>invites</u> the State Party to provide further information to the World Heritage Centre on the ways in which the planned rules for the protection and management of the OUV will align with the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. Regrets that all on-going and planned work on the National Hauszmann Programme (NHP) has not been halted as requested by the Committee, that no information has yet been provided that would allow a full understanding of the scope of the entire project or its full impact, and nor has a Conservation Plan been submitted;
- 8. <u>Considers</u> that the continuation of the NHP works has thus been negatively impacting the state of conservation of the property, with potential cumulative negative impacts on its OUV, including its authenticity and integrity, as noted in the last Committee decision;
- 9. Reiterates its request to the State Party to provide to the World Heritage Centre, as a matter of urgency, comprehensive information on the NHP to allow an understanding of the scope of the entire project;
- 10. <u>Reiterates its concern</u> that the works in the context of the NHP are still ongoing, that the state of conservation of the property has been negatively impacted by planned reconstruction and its full potential impacts; <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to consider halting all ongoing and planned works at the Buda Castle Quarter to allow dialogue on how the project might be modified;
- 11. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to re-start the online ICOMOS advisory assistance for the Buda Castle Quarter, originally initiated in January 2022, to allow the State Party to benefit from this process over an extended period of time and to allow meaningful collaboration on the NHP between the State Party, the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre based on full documentation on the entire project;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 57. Diyarbakır Fortress and Hevsel Gardens Cultural Landscape (Türkiye) (C 1488)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 8B.32, 41 COM 7B.50**, **43 COM 7B.90** and **44 COM 7B.56** adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Expresses its solidarity</u> with the State Party of Türkiye and its people for the devastating effects of the earthquakes that took place in February 2023, assures the State Party of the

- availability of the Convention assistance mechanism to support affected World Heritage properties and <u>invites</u> the State Party to call upon them;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the facilitation by the State Party of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as requested in its previous decisions, <u>notes</u> the conclusions and recommendations contained in its report, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to implement them, as appropriate;
- 5. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> to the State Party for the exemplary research and restoration approach to the works on the City Walls in recent years;
- 6. <u>Expresses its concern</u> that the State Party has not halted all projects that could affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to halt all projects that could affect the OUV of the property, including further demolitions and developments in its buffer zone;
- 7. <u>Also expresses its concern</u> about the changes brought about by the implementation of projects in the property and its buffer zone since its inscription, which have eroded its OUV, in particular:
 - a) In the functioning and morphology of the Hevsel Gardens, an integral part of the property and an essential attribute underpinning the property's OUV,
 - b) The implementation of construction, landscaping and infrastructural projects in immediate setting of the Ten-Eyed Bridge and the Tigris riverbanks, both within the property and its buffer zone,
 - c) The large-scale demolition, which has also led to a virtual destruction of the social relationship of the traditional local communities with the Hevsel Gardens and despite this being a fundamental relationship that contributed to the integrity of the World Heritage property at the time of inscription,
 - d) The construction of the Vehicle Road and Touristic Tour Route around the inner periphery of the City Walls;
- 8. Further reiterates its request to the State Party to:
 - a) Carry out independent Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) for urban design, landscape and infrastructural projects, as well as construction and restoration projects which may have an impact on the OUV of the property and its setting, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context,
 - b) Ensure that all projects are guided by suitable professional archaeological and conservation oversight, which should be fully integrated into all works to ensure good practice and effective outcomes,
 - Submit details of such projects and the associated HIAs to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to any decision on their implementation which may be difficult to reverse;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> that the Management Plan for the property is still not fully implemented and has resulted in a range of disparate projects, some of which have and continue to undermine the OUV of the property and <u>urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Fully review the management system of the property,
 - b) Examine whether current legislation and management regulations can effectively protect the property and its buffer zone,

- c) Revise the Management Plan and ensure the participation of local authorities, organisations and communities, including scientists and agricultural groups, in the management and decision-making processes,
- d) Submit the revised Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 58. Historic Areas of Istanbul (Türkiye) (C 356bis)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.31** and **44 COM 7B.58** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the maintenance and repair of Ottoman timber houses and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to provide information on how this relates to a long-term strategy for timber buildings within the property;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the inventory digitization and the systematic survey of the condition of structures by the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Directorate of Cultural Heritage Conservation, in providing a quantitative basis for urgent action on 'buildings at risk';
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the large number of infrastructure and other development/reconstruction/ restoration projects proposed at the property, and <u>regrets</u> that for all of these projects appropriate documentation was not submitted to the World Heritage Centre in a timely manner and that for a number of them no Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) was prepared despite the Committee's request in Decision **44 COM 7B.58**;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to develop a comprehensive roadmap, including short and long-term strategies covering all types of projects which may have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in close cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, before any irreversible decisions are taken, and to submit this road map to the World Heritage Centre by **1 February 2024**:
- 7. <u>Notes with concern</u> the third-party reports of damage and degradation at Hagia Sophia and <u>invites</u> the State Party to regularly share information with the World Heritage Centre on the measures taken to remedy this situation, on the visiting conditions in place since February 2021 and on its efforts to monitor the overall state of conservation of the property, and to take into account the recommendations from previous missions,

- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review details of the restoration works at Chora, indicating the level of progress, and to report on the progress in the development of a Master Plan for the Chora area;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to fully implement the recommendations of the UNESCO Advisory missions that took place in October 2020 and January/February 2021, taking into account the potential impact that changes at Hagia Sophia and Chora may have on the OUV of the property and to inform the World Heritage Centre of their status of implementation and of any plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property;
- 10. <u>Further notes</u> the submission of the HIA of the Kazliçeşme Marina project and <u>requests</u> the State Party to revise the project in line with the recommendations of the ICOMOS Technical Review, including three-dimensional modelling and preparation of a final HIA in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 11. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to undertake HIAs, as well as Tourism Environmental Impact Assessments for all large-scale projects, including the Yenikapi Cruise Port, the proposals for the development of the Fortress as a tourist attraction and international exhibition centre, as well as of works at the Grand Bazaar, with a view of mitigating, if not avoiding, their negative impact on the OUV of the property, and to submit these reports to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before irreversible decisions are taken;
- 12. <u>Notes with regret</u> that the Management Plan submitted by the State Party was officially adopted in 2018 without defining the attributes that convey the OUV of the property, and without submitting it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its formal adoption, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit a revised draft defining the attributes that convey the OUV of the property to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 13. <u>Further calls on</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, as soon as possible, in order to examine the overall state of conservation of the property and the level of implementation of previous Committee Decisions and recommendations from previous Advisory missions, to review and assess the different types of projects undertaken in and around the property for their possible impact on the property's OUV, and to consider progress with the development of a long-term strategy of timber buildings, and a strategic road map for projects;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property, in the format of submission included in Annex 13 of the Operational Guidelines, and on the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 59. Kyiv: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra (Ukraine) (C 527ter)

The World Heritage Committee,

1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.59** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Deplores</u> the war prevailing in Ukraine and the loss of human life;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its strong commitment to the protection of the World Heritage property 'Kyiv: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra', as well as the other World Heritage properties in Ukraine, and <u>expresses its utmost</u> concern at the increasing potential threats facing the property;
- 5. <u>Acknowledges</u> the efforts made by the State Party to implement the previous decisions of the Committee and the recommendations of the mission, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to finalise and submit, as soon as circumstances permit and prior to its formal adoption, the new Management Plan for the property to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the various actions implemented by UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies to assist Ukraine in the protection and safeguarding of the property and its cultural heritage more generally and <u>encourages</u> further assistance and support;
- 7. <u>Considers</u> that optimal conditions are no longer met to fully guarantee the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and that it is threatened by potential danger due to the war, in accordance with paragraphs 177 to 179 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Decides</u>, in conformity with Article 11.4 of the Convention and Paragraphs 177 to 179 of the Operational Guidelines, to inscribe Kyiv: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra (Ukraine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to prepare, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, a proposal for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of corrective measures along with a timeframe for their implementation, for adoption by the Committee at its 46th session:
- 10. <u>Calls upon</u> all parties to refrain from any action that would cause direct or indirect damage to the property and its buffer zone and wider setting, as well as to cultural heritage in Ukraine overall, in particular to its World Heritage properties and their buffer zones and wider settings, as well as sites included on the Tentative List of Ukraine, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, including Article 6 of the World Heritage Convention;
- 11. <u>Expresses its concern</u> that risk preparedness measures for the property are not yet sufficient in terms of analysis of potential vibrational impacts on building fabric of nearby missile strikes, and measures to address these impacts, and <u>strongly encourages</u> the State Party to give high priority to the development of an emergency preparedness and risk mitigation plan, taking full advantage of the support that the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies are able to provide through the support of Japan;
- 12. <u>Furthermore, invites</u> the State Party to continue taking all possible measures to protect its cultural and natural heritage threatened by the war, in particular its World Heritage properties, including their buffer zones and wider settings, and sites included in the Tentative List;
- 13. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the adopted and planned legislative amendments do not have a negative impact on the fulfilment of its obligations under the Convention

- concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage, and to submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before they are enacted;
- 14. <u>Also calls on</u> the international community to support the safeguarding of Ukraine's cultural and natural heritage and <u>launches an appeal</u> to the neighbouring countries and to the international community to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural properties coming from Ukraine;
- 15. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 60. L'viv the Ensemble of the Historic Centre (Ukraine) (C 865bis)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Deplores</u> the war prevailing in Ukraine and the loss of human life;
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its strong commitment to the protection of the World Heritage property 'L'viv the Ensemble of the Historic Centre', as well as the other World Heritage properties in Ukraine, and <u>expresses its utmost concern</u> at the increasing potential threats facing the property;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the various actions implemented by UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies to assist Ukraine in the protection and safeguarding of the property and its cultural heritage more generally and <u>encourages</u> further assistance and support;
- 5. <u>Considers</u> that optimal conditions are no longer met to fully guarantee the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and that it is threatened by potential danger due to the outbreak of the war, in accordance with paragraphs 177 to 179 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Decides</u>, in conformity with Article 11.4 of the Convention and Paragraphs 177 to 179 of the Operational Guidelines, to inscribe L'viv the Ensemble of the Historic Centre (Ukraine) on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to prepare, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, a proposal for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and a set of corrective measures along with a timeframe for their implementation, for adoption by the Committee at its 46th session:
- 8. <u>Calls upon</u> all Parties to refrain from any action that would cause direct or indirect damage to the property and its buffer zone and wider setting, as well as to cultural heritage in Ukraine overall, in particular to its World Heritage properties and their buffer zones and wider settings, as well as sites included on the Tentative List of Ukraine, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, including Article 6 of the World Heritage Convention;

- 9. <u>Expresses its concern</u> that risk preparedness measures for the property are not yet sufficient in terms of analysis of potential vibrational impacts on building fabric of nearby missile strikes, and measures to address these impacts, and <u>strongly encourages</u> the State Party to give high priority to the development of an emergency preparedness and risk mitigation plan, taking full advantage of the support that the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies are able to provide through the support of Japan;
- 10. <u>Furthermore, invites</u> the State Party to continue taking all possible measures to protect its cultural and natural heritage threatened by the war, in particular its World Heritage properties, including their buffer zones and wider settings, and sites included in the Tentative List;
- 11. Requests the State Party to ensure that the adopted and planned legislative amendments do not have a negative impact on the fulfilment of its obligations under the Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage, and to submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before they are enacted;
- 12. <u>Also calls</u> on the international community to support the safeguarding of Ukraine's cultural and natural heritage and <u>launches an appeal</u> to the neighbouring countries and to the international community to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property coming from Ukraine;
- 13. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.
- 61. Derwent Valley Mills (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1030)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Notes that development proposals in the buffer zone and the setting of the property have been approved against ICOMOS' advice that these projects would have a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and that development areas have been identified within the property boundaries in the Belper 2021 Neighbourhood Plan, which may have a similar impact on its OUV, and requests the State Party to:
 - Reconsider the approval of the Landmark project in Derby and not approve the implementation of the Amber Rock Resort, Bradshaw Way and Eagle Quarter proposals in their current form to avoid the negative impact they will have on the OUV of the property,
 - b) Halt the further execution of already approved projects that may have a negative impact of the OUV of the property but whose implementation has not yet commenced in the property, its buffer zone and setting and submit details of these projects to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;

- 3. Notes with concern the poor state of conservation of the large Belper Mills complex, one of the key attributes of the property, and that current proposals for the adaptive reuse of the complex would lead to an erosion of the OUV of the property and <u>urges</u> the State Party to define a rescue plan for the way forward with appropriate uses that support the property's OUV and to submit details of such a proposal to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any approvals are given that may be difficult to reverse;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> that the various local and regional authorities tasked with the management of the property are currently developing new local plans, but that these do not seem to be coordinated nor their potential impact on the OUV of the property assessed cumulatively, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure that, prior to their adoption, all new local plans and policies that affect the property, its buffer zone and its setting are assessed through integrated Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) in conformity with the Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage Context, that analyse their cumulative impacts on the OUV of the property, and that these HIAs are submitted to the World Heritage Centre in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the updating of the Management Plan for the property but <u>further notes with great concern</u> that the management system for the property is fragmented, that negative impacts can be accommodated within the national policy system leading to a cumulative erosion of the property's OUV, that the Management Plan does not have any legal jurisdiction and that consequently the requirements for HIAs for development proposals as outlined in the Operational Guidelines are not met;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to initiate a review of the management system of the property, with the aim of establishing a fully functioning management system that:
 - a) Guarantees the safeguarding and transmission of the OUV of the property,
 - b) Provides a management authority with the legal jurisdiction and agency to ensure the OUV of the property is safeguarded, also in coordinating the spatial and other plans of the various authorities with spatial mandates over the various sections of the property and its buffer zone and setting,
 - c) Provides legal status to the Management Plan of the property,
 - d) Provides a legal mandate for the execution of HIAs as prescribed by the Operational Guidelines in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, developed in collaboration between the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. Expresses concern that development pressures on the property, coupled with the inability of the management system to safeguard its OUV, are reaching such proportions that, if not addressed as a matter of urgency, ascertained or potential threat, as defined in paragraphs 179 and 180 of the Operational Guidelines, could be confirmed and strongly recommends to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission to the property to provide guidance on revising and strengthening the management system;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a report on the state of conservation of the property and on the steps taken to implement the recommendations mentioned above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad and urgent mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value.

62. Stonehenge, Avebury and Associated Sites (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 373bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.62

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 41 COM 7B.56, 42 COM 7B.32, 43 COM 7B.95, and 44 COM.7B.61 adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Notes further progress with the revised management and governance arrangements, the Trust Transition Project, the implementation of the Avebury 2015 Transport Strategy, the forthcoming setting study and proposed Supplementary Planning Documents and future boundary review of the property, and the World Heritage Site Condition Survey, and requests the State Party to submit the draft setting study and the World Heritage Site Condition Survey to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. Welcomes the conservation works on the Stonehenge lintels and interpretation installations at West Kennet Long Barrow, Silbury Hill, the Sanctuary and Windmill Hill, also notes that the temporary education centre at Stonehenge does not affect attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, but that a proposal for new educational facilities has been subject to a Technical Review by ICOMOS, and requests the State Party to take into account the resulting recommendations and to advise the World Heritage Centre of the response to the Technical Review findings;
- 5. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for inviting the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission to provide advice in the context of the redetermination of the Development Consent Order (DCO) of the proposed A303 road improvement scheme (Scheme) within the Stonehenge component of the property;
- 6. <u>Notes and endorses</u> the conclusions and recommendations of the 2022 Advisory mission, and urges the State Party to fully implement the mission's recommendations;
- 7. <u>Expresses profound regret</u> that the Scheme has been granted a DCO without having been modified in accordance with previous Committee decisions and the recommendations of the 2022 mission;
- 8. Reiterates its previous request that the State Party not proceed with the implementation of the Scheme for the section between Amesbury and Berwick Down in its current form, and considers that the minimum change required must include an extension of the underground section of the western approach (in tunnel and/or cut-and-cover) to at least the western boundary of the property, with the western portal relocated as far west as reasonably practical, thereby reducing the length of the cut-and-cover section and minimising the extent of archaeological resources which must be removed, and the implementation of a comprehensive archaeological salvage and mitigation programme, consistent with best practice standards and approaches;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that the approved A303 road improvement scheme within the Stonehenge component of the property retains substantial dual carriageway sections exposed in cuttings, particularly those at the western end of the Stonehenge component of the property and that, at the present time, the A303 road improvement scheme, as approved by the DCO,

constitutes a potential threat to the property, in conformity with Paragraph 179 of the Operational Guidelines, which, if implemented, would have deleterious impacts on the OUV of the property including its integrity, warranting inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger;

- 10. Taking note of the judicial review process following the DCO and the expected legal challenges, as well as the possibility that the proposed Scheme may be modified, requests the State Party to prepare a comprehensive information package on the proposed modifications to the Scheme conforming to the requests by the Committee in its decisions as well as in line with the recommendations of the 2022 Advisory mission, and to submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by 1 February 2024, and urges furthermore the State Party to consult with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, to ensure consistency in this regard and that all further decisions or actions to implement the Scheme in its current approved state are halted until the Committee has reviewed the comprehensive information package of proposed modifications at its 46th session;
- 11. Requests furthermore the State Party to prepare, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, a related set of corrective measures, which should include modifying the Scheme, consistent with the Committee's decisions and informed by the recommendations of the 2022 Advisory mission, to deliver the best available outcome for the OUV of the property, for examination by the Committee at its 46th session;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the absence of significant progress in modifying the Scheme consistent with the Committee's decisions and in accordance with the recommendations of the 2022 Advisory mission, would require a broad mobilization to preserve the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including the inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
- 63. The English Lake District (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 422rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.63

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision 41 COM 8B.30 adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts made by the State Party to address the recommendations adopted at the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List but <u>notes</u> that progress in the implementation of those recommendations is very slow;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the State Party's confirmation that no projects for a gondola/cable car at Whinlatter and a Geological Disposal Facility for hazardous waste within the property are currently being considered, <u>recommends</u> that no such project be considered in the future and <u>requests</u> that timely information and documentation on the possible redevelopment and expansion of the Whinlatter Centre of recreation be submitted to the World Heritage Centre before any decision is taken on the future of this facility;

- 5. <u>Welcomes furthermore</u> the information concerning the approval of the update of the revised joint World Heritage and National Park Management Plan;
- 6. Regrets that the planning consent for Honister Zip Wire was issued, despite objections of several preservation organisations and contrary to the advice contained in ICOMOS' Technical Review and encourages the State Party to pursue all possible ways to resolve this issue and to avoid the construction of this infrastructure;
- 7. Expresses concern at the lack of a clear strategy to address the vulnerability of the property's agro-pastoral traditions and <u>urges</u> the State Party to devise and implement, in consultation with the Lake District's farming communities, appropriate policies and adequately resourced funding schemes to support and compensate them for their heritage services in order to sustain in the medium to long term the key attributes of this landscape that underpin its integrity and authenticity;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> the growing imbalance between houses for residents and holiday homes, despite efforts to provide affordable housing for residents, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to establish measures that discourage the conversion of residential houses to second or holiday homes to guarantee affordable housing for residents and at the same time reduce urban development pressures on the landscape;
- 9. <u>Recommends</u> to the State Party to address the issue of excessive private vehicular traffic by enhancing the public transportation system within the property and discouraging access to the property by non-resident private vehicles;
- 10. <u>Also notes</u> the concerns raised in the ICOMOS Technical Reviews regarding the use of off-road motorised vehicles on green lanes within the property, <u>urges</u> the State Party to harness the already available instruments to prevent vehicular access to unsealed roads in highly sensitive and emblematic valleys, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure as a matter of urgency that systematic monitoring is carried out on all unsealed roads open to vehicular access to assess the status of this activity and its impacts on the tangible and intangible attributes of the property, as a basis for a comprehensive regulatory policy focused on safeguarding the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 11. Notes furthermore that the Cumbria Local Flood Risk Management Strategy, approved in 2022, makes no mention of World Heritage and, as a change of scale in the Natural Flood Management (NFM) projects is envisaged within the property, recommends the State Party to promptly set out an overall place-based strategic approach to demonstrate how both natural flood management and protection of the attributes of the OUV might be achieved;
- 12. <u>Welcomes</u> that an interpretation strategy for the property is under preparation and <u>requests</u> that this strategy be developed around the OUV of the property, finalised as soon as possible, submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, and used as a reference to determine, which tourism uses are compatible with sustaining the property's OUV;
- 13. Requests furthermore the State Party to suspend the approval process of the tourist attraction at Elterwater Quarry in Great Langdale, and any other such project proposals, and to reconsider it in light of its potential negative impacts on the attributes of Langdale underpinning the OUV of the property, until an OUV-based interpretation strategy is approved;
- 14. <u>Notes furthermore</u> the declining water quality of Lake Windermere caused by public and private sewage systems and land management practices, as well as by the impacts of climate change, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to tackle the sources

- of the lake's pollution through a multi-stakeholder approach including public, private and community partners and to secure its long-term funding;
- 15. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 7B. (II) REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST INITIALLY FORESEEN TO BE EXAMINED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE IN 2023

NATURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

64. Iguaçu National Park (Brazil) (N 355)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.64

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.112** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Regrets that no specific assessment of the impacts of the Baixo Iguaçu hydropower plant (HPP) on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property was submitted prior to construction and operation of the HPP, as requested by the Committee in its Decision 40 COM 7B.70 and takes note that impacts to the property were considered during the Environmental Impact Study process for the project and extensive conditions were imposed by the Chico Mendes Institute for Biodiversity Conservation (ICMBio) and the Environmental Institute of Paraná (IAP), and considers it essential to comply strictly with the conditions imposed;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the information provided that the dam is operating in accordance with the standards required under its licensing, according to monitoring results, however <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that monitoring programmes continue to provide up-to-date information to inform adaptive management of the HPP;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> that collaboration between the States Parties of Argentina and Brazil was reinitiated following the COVID-19 pandemic and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the two States Parties to develop of a comprehensive monitoring, assessment and action plan to identify

- and address potential negative impacts from the HPP on the OUV of the two contiguous properties of Iguaçu National Park and Iguazu National Park;
- 6. Expresses again grave concern regarding the potential legislative implication of the two Bills under consideration, which propose the reopening of the Colono Road, and which could, if approved, create the conditions to re-inscribe the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, and urges again the State Party to ensure the continued closure of Colono Road;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the Public Use Plan (PUP) and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to implement the strategy outlined in the Plan to ensure the sustainable use and development of tourism in the property;
- 8. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the results from the National Programme for Monitoring Biodiversity ('Monitora') programme in the property and the continued implementation of other programmes, including the Onças do Iguaçu project, Biodiversity Corridor Consolidation programme and the Natural Resource Protection programme;
- 9. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to collaborate with the State Party of Argentina and report on the outcomes of the recommendations of the 2015 Reactive Monitoring mission to:
 - a) Develop an action plan for joint patrolling activities and ensure that these activities are undertaken on a regular basis;
 - b) Establish a monitoring programme for key species within the property and, in cooperation with the Iguazu National Park, within the broader region;
- 10. Notes with concern the reported plans to further develop tourism in the property, including a proposed cable car project and also requests the State Party to ensure that all proposed projects will be subject to an Environmental Impact Assessment, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before a decision to implement them is made;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 65. Area de Conservación Guanacaste (Costa Rica) (N 928bis)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.24** and **44 COM 7B.196** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the confirmation that the authorization for the proposed Interoceanic Dry Canal project was not approved and the firm State Party position communicated in this regard, and that the property continues to remain off-limits to industrial development infrastructure;

- 4. Remains concerned that that the project proponent as well as other companies continue to promote the proposals for an interoceanic dry canal, including as part of a proposed Mega Pacific Terminal and coast-to-coast high-speed cargo train connection and <u>requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed about any further developments on these proposals;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the progress in the implementation of climate change adaptation programmes to protect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the State Party's confirmation that the proposed Santo Tomás hotel development will be subject to an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure the EIA is completed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to develop a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) before approving any further renewable energy projects in order to identify the best means to harmonise renewable energy initiatives and the conservation of the property's OUV, considering the multiple existing and proposed projects and development pressures near the property;
- 8. Regrets that measures to mitigate the effects of the Inter-American Highway and other roads have been limited, and reiterates its encouragement to the State Party to ensure the best possible management of all road infrastructure within and bordering the property and potentially impacting on the OUV of the property, including, but not limited to, the upgrading of Ecological National Route 918, the Inter-American Highway, and the exploration of the feasibility to improve National Road 4 as an alternative route;
- 9. <u>Also takes note</u> of the State Party's view that the management of the Bahía Santa Elena Marine Management Area requires consolidation as a precondition for submitting a Minor Boundary Modification (MBM) and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to submit the corresponding MBM once the necessary conditions to ensure the effective protection and management requirements are in place;
- 10. Also notes with appreciation that a particularly valuable area could be added to the conservation area and <u>reiterates its recommendation</u> to the State Party to consider the wider "protected block" for inclusion in the property in order to harmonise the boundary of the property with other existing management units across the terrestrial and marine environment through the procedure of an MBM;
- 11. Recalling Decision 44 COM 7.2 which reaffirmed the increasing importance of effective buffer zones to support the protection and management of OUV and building greater resilience of properties to external threats, also encourages the State Party to establish a buffer zone for both the marine and terrestrial units of the property in line with the recommendations by the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission building on the existing protection through the agro-landscape zones and regional conservation areas in place at the national level;
- 12. Acknowledging the continued human and financial capacity limitations, <u>also reiterates its</u> request to the State Party to fully implement all recommendations of the 2018 mission to the property and <u>further encourages</u> the continuation of the diversification of sources of conservation financing to further reduce the vulnerability to economic cycles;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

66. Talamanca Range-La Amistad Reserves / La Amistad National Park (Costa Rica, Panama) (N 205bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.66

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.25** and **44 COM 7B.197** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the States Parties' continued efforts to monitor and control illegal activities within the property, despite resource constraints, including through the establishment of new partnerships and projects;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the resumption of bilateral efforts following temporary border closure and Costa Rica's increasing involvement of indigenous peoples, and <u>encourages</u> continued engagement and meaningful indigenous participation in the management and governance of the transboundary property;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the upcoming finalization of the Management Plan for the Panamanian part of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party of Panama to complete the process of finalizing the Management Plan as soon as possible;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties on the completion and submission of an amended and approved version of the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA);
- 7. Recalling that any development of new hydropower projects prior to the finalization and adequate review of the SEA for the entire property would represent a danger to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, <u>further welcomes</u> that the construction project of the Changuinola II (CHAN II) dam has not been re-activated to date and <u>also notes</u> the State Party of Panama's reaffirmed commitment to its obligations under the Convention and its confirmation that, should re-activation of the project be considered again, prior consultations with the World Heritage Centre would be undertaken;
- 8. Also notes continued efforts by the State Party of Panama to monitor activities of the operating CHAN I and Bonyic dams, and reiterates its request to the State Party of Panama to continue these efforts to establish long-term monitoring programmes for the projects, and use the findings to design appropriate mitigation measures to ensure the OUV of the property is not negatively impacted;
- Recalling Decision 44 COM 7.2 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou /online, 2021), which reaffirmed the increasing importance of effective buffer zones to support the protection and management of the OUV and building greater resilience of properties to external threats, also encourages the States Parties to identify and establish a formal buffer zone for the property;

10. <u>Finally, requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

67. Galápagos Islands (Ecuador) (N 1bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.67

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.113** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the significant progress made by the State Party in addressing the longstanding issues facing the property and in implementing the recommendations of the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission, in particular the recent progress towards the operationalization of the Galápagos Biosecurity Agency (GBA);
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue the current biosecurity measures to control the entry and spread of invasive alien species throughout the property, including through the effective implementation of the 10-year Galápagos Invasive Species Management Plan;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the development of indicators and identification of threats related to attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to integrate these, in close collaboration with the relevant local institutions, into an updated version of the 2014 Management Plan for the property;
- 6. Reiterates its continued concern on the steady growth of tourism and commercial flights to the property and <u>urges</u> again the State Party to develop and implement a clear tourism strategy with a clear action plan with urgent measures to achieve the zero-growth model, including maintaining the moratorium on construction of new tourism projects and the limits on the number of flights, and to submit this strategy and action plan to the World Heritage Centre for review;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> that the majority of fishing vessels around the property are Ecuadorian flagged and registered with the Inter-American Tropical Tuna Commission and operate under strict regulatory control, and <u>further urges</u> the State Party to ensure compliance with regulations and to ensure the continued monitoring of any illegal or unregulated fishing vessels that may encroach on or operate at the peripheries of the property;
- 8. <u>Commends</u> the implementation of the new zoning system and the designation of the Hermandad Marine Reserve between the Galápagos Marine Reserve (GMR) and Cocos Island in Costa Rica and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue to strengthen regional collaboration with neighboring countries for a collective approach to reducing illegal, unregulated and unreported (IUU) fishing practices in the region;
- Also commends the States Parties of Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador and Panama for adopting a declaration on the sustainable management of the Eastern Tropical Pacific Marine Corridor (CMAR) and also encourages them to work towards the establishment of a

transboundary marine biosphere encompassing the World Heritage sites of Cocos Island National Park (Costa Rica), Galápagos Islands (Ecuador), Malpelo Fauna and Flora Sanctuary (Colombia) and the Coiba National Park and its Special Zone of Marine Protection (Panama);

10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

68. Monarch Butterfly Biosphere Reserve (Mexico) (N 1290)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.68

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.198** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the measures taken to ensure the maintenance of the ecological integrity of the property and restoration of degraded areas with the involvement of relevant government agencies and local communities;
- 4. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> that illegal logging activities in the property have increased, and <u>urges again</u> the State Party to significantly increase efforts to halt the illegal logging in the property as a matter of priority;
- 5. Regrets that a number of threats including illegal logging, bushfires and land clearing are persisting and increasing, and requests the State Party to take appropriate actions, including by fully implementing the recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, to ensure these threats do not impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in particular the below:
 - Ensure that inter-institutional efforts to detect and prevent illegal logging activities within the property are further strengthened in the longer-term and ensure reforestation activities are continued in areas of the property impacted by illegal logging,
 - b) Develop and implement additional surveillance programmes to halt deforestation in the buffer zone caused by the expansion of avocado production, and reclaim and restore the affected areas.
 - c) Continue programmes supporting involvement of local and indigenous communities in conservation activities and develop additional ways of providing alternative income for these communities:
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the confirmation by the State Party that no mining project has been authorized in the property or its buffer zone, however <u>also requests</u> the State Party to make a permanent commitment not to undertake any mining activity within the property, and to ensure that any such activities outside the property do not cause a negative impact on its

- OUV, including through impact assessment processes in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to finalize as soon as possible the "Monarch Butterfly Biosphere Reserve Management Program" and submit it to the World Heritage Centre and continue the implementation of its National Action Plan for the Conservation of the Monarch Butterfly;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the States Parties of Canada, Mexico and the United States of America to strengthen their actions to conserve the species in their territories, in particular through national-level protective legislation and minimizing the loss and restoring milkweed habitat, as well as through the trinational collaboration to provide adequate protection to the Monarch Butterfly and its habitat throughout its migratory corridor and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party of Mexico to report on these actions;
- 9. Also notes the consistent occurrence of colonies of Monarch Butterfly establishing themselves outside the boundaries of the property and again strongly encourages the State Party to develop a proposal for an extension of the property to ensure that areas consistently occupied by overwintering colonies of Monarch Butterfly outside the property are appropriately protected and to increase the potential of the property to effectively conserve its OUV under changing climatic conditions, and to provide an update on the progress of submitting a boundary modification in the next State of conservation report;
- 10. <u>Further notes</u> that adaptive measures were taken by the State Party to maintain an acceptable level of protection of the property during the COVID-19 pandemic and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to restore management capacity following the pandemic to meet the current challenges in safeguarding the ecological integrity of the property and the associated OUV, in particular those that have arisen due to the impacts of the pandemic on illegal logging;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 69. Coiba National Park and its Special Zone of Marine Protection (Panama) (N 1138rev)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.115** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the ongoing updating of the Management Plan for the property, <u>takes note</u> of the development of a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) for the property and its area of socioeconomic influence, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the draft SEA to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN, once it is available;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> however that rehabilitation works, including tourist accommodation, are planned within the property before the completion of the SEA, therefore recalls its request to suspend

the implementation of any new tourism infrastructure or other development projects within the property until the SEA has been completed and submitted to the World Heritage Centre, and <u>also requests</u> that rehabilitation works at Gambute prior to the finalization of the SEA are strictly limited to structures that are necessary for the functioning management of the property and are subject to an environmental and social impact assessment in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;

- 5. Appreciates the ongoing monitoring efforts to assess the conservation status of species which contribute to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to eradicate feral livestock from the property, and encourages the State Party and its partners to continue with the eradication of the domestic water buffalo (Bubalus bubalis) and to expand efforts to ensure the long-term ecological monitoring of species that constitute the of OUV the property;
- 6. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the significant progress in fishing regulations and the ongoing technical evaluation of the regulations, however <u>expresses concern</u> that several of the recommendations of the 2014 and 2016 missions are still not implemented, and <u>urges</u> again the State Party to further improve the fishing regulations for the Special Zone of Marine Protection (SZMP), in line with the recommendations of the missions, by:
 - Establishing additional no-take zones, including the Hannibal Bank Habitat Protection Zone, considering the significantly larger percentage of area covered by no-take zones within the Coiba National Park,
 - Reconsidering the current approach to commercial fishing within the SZMP in line with regulations in place for Coiba National Park, in order to further reduce pressures from fishing on the property;
- 7. Also appreciates the positive progress made in monitoring the compliance of fishing vessels with regulations through increased human and technological resources and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to continue with the modernization of its monitoring and surveillance equipment to prevent and sanction illegal activities throughout the property and its zone of influence:
- 8. <u>Also welcomes</u> the renewed interest of the State Party to invite an IUCN Advisory mission to the property to help further refine the fishing regulations and provide advice on their implementation and <u>further encourages</u> the State Party to continue consultations with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN to undertake the mission as soon as possible once conditions permit;
- 9. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties of Colombia, Costa Rica, Ecuador, and Panama for adopting a declaration on the sustainable management of the Eastern Tropical Pacific Marine Corridor (CMAR) and <u>encourages</u> them to work towards the establishment of a transboundary marine biosphere encompassing the World Heritage sites of Cocos Island National Park (Costa Rica), Galápagos Islands (Ecuador), Malpelo Fauna and Flora Sanctuary (Colombia) and the Coiba National Park and its Special Zone of Marine Protection (Panama);
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

70. Pitons Management Area (Saint Lucia) (N 1161)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.70

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.116** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> that funding has been secured to integrate the recommendations of the Limits of Acceptable Change (LAC) study into the legal and regulatory framework of Saint Lucia and requests the State Party to undertake the process to amend the Physical Planning and Development Act as soon as possible;
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> the reported development, in particular in Sugar Bay, which does not comply fully with the Policy Area Design Guidelines of the LAC and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure that these -and any other projects being considered for implementation- are fully compliant with the provisions of the LAC study;
- 5. Recalling the revision of the 2003 Management Plan for the property was planned for 2020, also requests the State Party to provide an update on the progress of the revision, submit the draft updated Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Noting</u> that exploratory drilling for geothermal energy sources has been agreed under the Renewable Energy Sector Development Project (RESDP), <u>urges</u> the State Party to confirm that exploratory drilling will not be undertaken in the property and to ensure that the property remains off-limits for any geothermal development activities in the future in line with previous Committee decisions:
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to ensure that any potential impacts from geothermal energy development activities outside the property are assessed through a comprehensive Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and that no such activities are approved that would threaten the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 8. <u>Also welcomes</u> that funding has been secured for the demarcation of the boundaries of the property, <u>encourages</u> it to complete the process, and <u>again urges</u> it to:
 - Formalise the status of the buffer zone of the World Heritage property as a 'formal buffer zone' through a Minor Boundary Modification, in conformity with Paragraphs 163 and 164 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - b) Clearly define the types of activities permitted in this buffer zone, ensuring their compatibility with the conservation of the property's OUV;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

71. Canaima National Park (Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)) (N 701)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.71

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.199** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou /online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the reported increase in the number of firefighters and rangers, as well as information on the surveillance of the property;
- 4. Notes with concern that it remains unclear whether the planned and existing mining operations within the National Strategic Development Zone "Arco Minero del Orinoco" (ZDENAMO) rights areas close to the property have been subject to impact assessments which fully assess the potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and requests the State Party to submit the territorial analysis and status of mining projects in this area to the World Heritage Centre, and to ensure that all proposed mining projects which could potentially impact on the OUV of the property are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide further information ahead of the requested Reactive Monitoring mission on the current extent and status of any illegal mining activities in the property to the World Heritage Centre;
- 6. Regrets that the State Party did not issue a new invitation for the Reactive Monitoring mission after its postponement for weather conditions and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to invite without further delay a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to:
 - Assess, including through on-the-ground visits where feasible, the degree to which the property's OUV, including its integrity, might have been affected by illegal mining activities.
 - b) Review the planned and ongoing legal mining activities in the parts of ZDENAMO located in the vicinity to the northern border of the property and assess whether they might result in any potential negative impacts on the OUV of the property and provide advice to the State Party in ensuring that assessment of possible impacts on the OUV of the property is integrated into existing national regulations for mining;
- 7. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit an official proposal for clarification of boundaries of the property within the framework of the Retrospective Inventory, according to Paragraphs 163-165 of the Operational Guidelines concerning Minor Boundary Modifications:
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

AFRICA

72. Sangha Trinational (Cameroon, Central African Republic, Congo) (N 1380rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.72

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44COM 7B.174** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts of the States Parties and their partners to improve the effectiveness of the management of the property by continuing to update the various management plans, harmonizing the wildlife census methodology throughout the property by 2025, acquiring equipment for ecological monitoring and surveillance of the property, recruiting and strengthening the capacities of eco-guards to combat wildlife crime effectively, and consolidating local collaboration and cross-border cooperation;
- 4. Welcomes the strengthening of consultations with indigenous peoples and local communities with a view to the recognition and respect of their rights and empowerment, as well as their involvement in the management of the property, and recalling again the concerns previously raised in the independent review initiated by WWF International, requests the States Parties to continue to address all concerns in accordance with relevant international standards, the World Heritage and Sustainable Development Policy, while taking into account the recommendations of the independent review, and to report on the implementation of the recommendations of the independent review in the next state of conservation report for the property;
- 5. <u>Noting</u> the decrease in elephant poaching cases, remains concerned by the persistence of poaching in the property and its periphery, despite the continued efforts of States Parties, <u>also requests</u> the States Parties to intensify monitoring efforts in order to better control illegal activities in the property, notably through cross-border cooperation;
- 6. Also noting the consensus reached on the planning of synchronized wildlife inventories as early as 2025 for an estimation of animal populations throughout the property, <u>further requests</u> the States Parties to continue their harmonization efforts in order to obtain accurate and comparable data at the scale of the property for all species characteristic of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the decision to cancel the mining exploration permit straddling the Central African component of the property, as well as the confirmation of the non-existence of mining and petroleum exploration or exploitation activities currently encroaching on the property, in line with the Committee's position that mining exploration and/or exploitation is incompatible with World Heritage status;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party of Congo to provide clarifications concerning the petroleum exploration permits around the property;
- 9. <u>Notes with concern</u> the various major infrastructure projects proposed around the property, in particular the Ouesso-Banqui-Ndjamena road project which will pass just to the south of

the property, and which could have a negative impact on its OUV, particularly its integrity, takes note of the Environmental and Social Impact Assessments (ESIA) submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, regrets that the potential impacts of these projects, and in particular the Pokola-Enyellé-Bétou-Gouga road section, on the OUV of the property, notably in its Congolese component, have not been addressed, and further requests the States Parties that the ESIA be revised to take into account the potential impacts of this project on the OUV of the property, in line with the orientations contained in the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before it is resubmitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;

- 10. <u>Also regrets</u> that the State Party of Cameroon has not provided a response to UNESCO's correspondence of 8 July 2021, in which the World Heritage Centre shared its concern in relation to the potential impact on the OUV of the property of the project to open a road in the property at the border between Congo and Cameroon, and <u>urges</u> the State Party of Cameroon to provide updated information on the status of this road project;
- 11. <u>Noting</u> the confirmation by the State Party of Cameroon that no new timber sales projects encroach on the buffer zone of the property in its Cameroonian part, <u>also urges</u> the State Party of Cameroon to avoid the development of any new concessions in the buffer zone that would have a negative impact on the OUV of the property and to continue to ensure that no timber sales concessions encroach on the property;
- 12. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the States Parties to ensure that ESIAs are carried out for all projects planned in and around the property in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and submitted to the World Heritage Committee prior to any project approval;
- 13. Recalling the commitment of the States Parties to define strategic guidelines to minimize the effects of logging on ecological connectivity, reiterates its request to the States Parties to promote certification that minimizes the impacts on biodiversity of all logging concessions in the buffer zone, and to the State Party of the Central African Republic the need to prioritize the certification of its two logging concessions in the buffer zone of the property in order to avoid any potential impact on the OUV of the property;
- 14. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties to continue to implement all the recommendations of the 2016 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 15. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

73. Simien National Park (Ethiopia) (N 9)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.73

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.81** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),

- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made by the State Party, with the support of its partners, in responding to past Committee decisions and the 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission recommendations, including the finalisation and implementation of the 2020-2030 General Management Plan (GMP), the monitoring protocols for Ethiopian wolf, Walia ibex and Gelada, and a fire management plan;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the confirmation that the GMP fully considers the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and that targets have been developed for species and to maintain the natural beauty and landscapes of the property, <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit a copy of the GMP to the World Heritage Centre, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure that the protection of the OUV of the property, under both criteria (vii) and (x), is fully taken into account in the implementation of the GMP;
- 5. While <u>also welcoming</u> the results of the monitoring of the Ethiopian wolf, which show populations are stable, <u>notes with concern</u> the recorded 13% decrease of the Walia ibex population and <u>requests</u> the State Party to conduct further research to identify the causes for this decline and take appropriate actions to address these;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to continue monitoring the Ethiopian wolf, Walia ibex and Gelada through a long-term approach that informs the ongoing protection and management of the species, seeking advice from the IUCN Species Survival Commission as needed;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> that no Tourism Management Plan was appended, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide clarification regarding the request to develop a Tourism Management Plan to guide the monitoring and management of proposed tourism developments and impacts from increased visitors:
- 8. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the cancellation of a number of lodge investment requests inside the property, however, <u>notes with significant concern</u> the continued construction of tourism infrastructure inside the property, and <u>urges again</u> the State Party not to continue these developments in their current locations before assessing the impacts of each project on the OUV, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit these Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) to the World Heritage Centre for review before taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse;
- 9. <u>Also recalling</u> the high impacts of the 2019 fires on the OUV of the property, <u>also welcomes</u> the implementation of a fire management strategy, however, <u>reiterates its request</u> for the State Party to provide further information on the affected area and impact on the OUV, to monitor the recovery of vegetation, and to submit the fire management strategy to the World Heritage Centre as soon as possible;
- Also takes note of the continued implementation of the Grazing Pressure Reduction Strategy and the resulting reduction in livestock grazing, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to continue addressing any grazing pressure;
- 11. <u>Appreciates</u> the continued support of the State Party and partners to support sustainable livelihoods of the relocated Gich community and other local communities, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party and partners to continue these efforts;
- 12. Also notes with appreciation the actions taken towards developing a proposal for a Significant Boundary Modification for the entire Simien Mountains National Park (SMNP) and the intention to simultaneously formalize the buffer zone for the property and harmonize the names of the SMNP and the property, and also requests the State Party to finalize this process, requesting technical advice from the World Heritage Centre and IUCN as needed;
- 13. <u>Noting</u> that progress is underway to complete the alternative road aiming at reducing disturbance of the existing main road in important afro-alpine habitats following further delays, <u>also urges again</u> the State Party to complete this project and to submit the EIA for the part of the new road crossing the SMNP to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN as soon as possible;

- 14. <u>Notes</u> that the realignment of the transmission line has been suspended until the current road construction project is completed and <u>further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to assess the visual and ecological impacts on the property, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit the EIA to the World Heritage Centre for review prior to the commencement of any activities;
- 15. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

74. Lake Malawi National Park (Malawi) (N 289)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.74

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 38 COM 7B.92, 42 COM 7B.93 and 44 COM 7B.82 adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the significant efforts made by the State Party, in partnership with several partners including local communities, to strengthen the management and protection of the property, including through enhanced operational, monitoring and research capacity, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure effective coordination of the activities to ensure their effectiveness and assure their contribution to the protection of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 4. <u>Noting</u> the findings of the 2022 mission that the property remains very vulnerable to human pressures, originating both within and beyond its boundaries, due to its small size and serial configuration, <u>also recalls its request</u> to the State Party to assess the feasibility of a potential extension, and to request International Assistance and technical support from the World Heritage Centre and IUCN for this work as required:
- 5. While acknowledging the necessity of providing clean and safe water to local communities, regrets that the Mangochi water supply project within the Nkhudzi Hills component of the property commenced without sufficient consideration to alternative locations, environmental safeguards and regard for stakeholder concerns raised at the proposal stage, and with apparent risks and ongoing potential to negatively affect the property's OUV, which may also impact the viability of the project;
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to ensure that all damage caused to date by the Mangochi water supply project is documented, and restored as fully as possible using best available practice that also avoids further deterioration, including through unnecessary tree cutting, siltation, introduction/expansion of invasive species and illegal resource harvest, and to implement independently verified mitigation measures as set out in the project's Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA);
- 7. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's commitment to ensure that all projects with potential to impact the property's OUV are subject to Environmental Impact Assessments

(EIAs) conducted in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, which should include the Monkey Bay-Cape Maclear Road project, also recalling that, for each project, it is essential that an EIA:

- a) Is completed before any final decisions are taken or construction works commence,
- b) Integrates all stakeholder consultations and allows sufficient time for meaningful participation, including by the World Heritage Centre and IUCN,
- Includes consideration for alternative options, allowing project details to be revised as necessary;
- 8. Reiterates its concern regarding the continuation of oil exploration activities in blocks 2 and 3 covering a large part of Lake Malawi, which pose a potentially severe risk to the lake ecosystem and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and also requests the State Party to clarify at the earliest opportunity on the status of the oil exploration licences and related EIAs within Lake Malawi, report on the outcome of the mining sector policy consultations, and to ensure that EIAs are developed in accordance with the highest international standards and in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN before any potential exploratory drilling is permitted to proceed;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to implement all of the recommendations from the 2022 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, and report on progress, including:
 - a) Resolve recommendations related to the Mangochi water supply project and the status of oil exploration as stated above;
 - b) Continue to encourage and support the local communities in the enclave villages,
 - c) Finalise demarcation of the property boundary, resolve illegal agricultural encroachment and address resource use in the property;
 - d) Improve agriculture and other land use practices in the headwaters of the river catchments;
 - e) Enhance ecological monitoring of the property and the lake, and ensure that nonnative species of fish (especially top-level predators) are not introduced into the lake or its catchment areas;
 - f) Strengthen the capacity of the Park and other institutions, including through enhanced inter-agency synergies and collaboration;
 - g) Continue to promote sustainable tourism initiatives, and further examine the feasibility of the extension of the property.
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

75. Rwenzori Mountains National Park (Uganda) (N 684)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.75

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.85** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued implementation of the 2016-2026 General Management Plan (GMP) for the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the attributes that constitute the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property are fully reflected in the next GMP:
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> the results of the 2021 animal census for elephants which indicate only seven individuals as now remaining in the property, and <u>urges again</u> the State Party to assess the viability of the remaining elephant population within the property and to develop an action plan for its conservation, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to explore potential options to improve the connectivity between the property and the overall Greater Virunga ecosystem, including by further strengthening the transboundary cooperation with Virunga National Park in the Democratic Republic of the Congo;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the confirmation by the State Party that no plans to proceed with the proposed cable car project are reported and, <u>also recalling</u> that the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission considered this project would impact both the scenic value of the property, as well as its fragile ecosystems and biodiversity, and if approved, would constitute a clear case of ascertained danger to the OUV, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines, requests again the State Party not to further pursue this project;
- 6. Notes with appreciation the confirmation that hydropower projects in the vicinity of the property have undergone an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), mitigation measures are implemented, and no detrimental activities are reported, however recalls the increasing number of hydropower projects in the vicinity of the property, and reiterates its request for the State Party to undertake a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) for the Rwenzori water catchment, including the property, to guide strategic level planning and to assess the indirect and cumulative impacts on the OUV arising from the existing and planned small scale run-of-river hydropower infrastructures and to ensure that EIAs for any future small scale hydropower development proposed in the catchment of the property, fully assess the potential impacts in relation to the OUV in line with the new Guidance and Toolkit on Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> that the Kilembe mine remains closed since the 1970s and that 2021 water samples confirm low mineral levels in all three rivers flowing out of the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to also report on the water quality of the groundwater;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to continue to implement the recommendations of the 2019 mission, in particular to:
 - Revise the Tourism Strategy for the property to ensure that it fully considers the protection of its OUV and prioritize low impact tourism activities that utilize existing infrastructures and facilities,

- b) Develop and implement a wildlife monitoring plan to ensure the regular monitoring of key wildlife species as recognized in the Statement of OUV for the property;
- 9. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the reconstruction of infrastructure following floods and landslides in 2020 and the finalisation of a Climate Change and Disaster Risk Management Plan for the property and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to implement the Plan to inform future disaster risk response, planning and management measures;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 76. Serengeti National Park (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 156)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **35 COM 7B.7**, **38 COM 7B.94**, **42 COM 7B.96** and **44 COM 7B.15** adopted at its 35th (UNESCO, 2011), 38th (Doha, 2014), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Expresses its continued concern about the proposed dam projects upstream of the property in the Mara River basin, which could have a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the Serengeti National Park and Kenya Lake System in the Great Rift Valley World Heritage properties;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the ongoing efforts by the States Parties of the United Republic of Tanzania and Kenya to develop a Joint Water Allocation Plan (JWAP) for the Mara River basin but <u>notes</u> with concern that no update is available on the status of all dam projects in the Mara River basin, in particular the different projects proposed in Kenya;
- 5. Reiterates its request to the States Parties of the United Republic of Tanzania and Kenya to submit to the World Heritage Centre as soon as possible, and before the requested Reactive Monitoring mission takes place, an update on the status of all dam projects proposed in the Mara River basin and <u>urges them again</u> not to make any decisions on infrastructure development that could affect the water flow into the Mara River before the JWAP is agreed and the impacts on the OUV of the property are thoroughly assessed;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the approval by the State Party to expand the Serengeti National Park to include the ecologically important Speke Gulf and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to submit a boundary modification to reflect this extension on the World Heritage property in line with the provisions in the Operational Guidelines as soon as the process of the extension under national law is completed;
- 7. Regrets that in spite of its previous request, the State Party did not submit the various documents requested in Decision **42 COM 7B.96** and <u>also urges again</u> the State Party to submit the following documents as soon as possible, and before the requested Reactive Monitoring mission:

- a) The approved 2014-2024 Management Plan for the property, including details of any changes to the zonation of the property,
- b) The Route Option Selection Report and the feasibility study and preliminary design, including a map of the proposed alignments,
- c) The Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) and the Comprehensive Transport and Trade System Development Master Plan;
- 8. While noting the confirmation that the State Party will maintain the northern road traversing the property as a gravel road under Tanzania National Parks (TANAPA) management, reiterates its request to the State Party to confirm its previous commitment to reserve the road mainly for tourism and administrative purposes (Decision 35 COM 7B.7) and to abandon the construction of the proposed northern highway (Decision 38 COM 7B.94);
- 9. Expresses concern about the reported construction of a golf course in the Ikoma Wildlife Management Area, adjacent to the property and a key main migration corridor for the wildebeest, and requests the State Party, given its potential impact on the OUV of the property, to pause the further development of this project until a full Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, is submitted to the World Heritage Centre and reviewed by IUCN, in line with the requirements of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Also notes with concern</u> that the increasing density of lodges, tented camps and other tourism infrastructure in the property and along the migration routes in the wider Serengeti ecosystem is increasingly likely to impact the wildebeest migration, one of the main attributes of the OUV;
- 11. <u>Further notes</u> that the State Party finally invited the requested joint Word Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission and <u>also requests</u> that the mission be undertaken as soon as possible to review the state of conservation of the property, including all the threats and issues cited above, as well as to assess the implementation of the previous Committee decisions and mission recommendations:
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

77. Mana Pools National Park, Sapi and Chewore Safari Areas (Zimbabwe) (N 302)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.77

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **38 COM 7B.97**, **40 COM 7B.84** and **44 COM 7B.178** adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued strengthening of anti-poaching measures, including joint operations with the State Party of Zambia, and with support from technical and financial partners;

- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the collaboration between the States Parties of Zambia and Zimbabwe to strengthen transboundary conservation and <u>encourages again</u> the States Parties to finalize the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) for the establishment of the Lower Zambezi-Mana Pools National Parks Trans-Frontier Conservation Area (TFCA);
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the gradual decline in elephant poaching following the strengthening of antipoaching measures, and <u>noting</u> that some elephants are crossing the Zambezi River into Zambia, <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure a coordinated approach with the State Party of Zambia for the effective transboundary protection and management of elephants;
- 6. Regrets that no update has been provided on the status of other key species that constitute the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and also requests the State Party to continue surveys and to submit the results to the World Heritage Centre once available;
- 7. <u>Acknowledges</u> the progress made towards the finalization of the General Management Plan and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to finalize and submit it to the World Heritage Centre:
- 8. <u>Noting</u> the continued suspension of commercial hunting in the Sapi Safari Area and the northern part of Chewore Safari Area, but <u>recalling</u> that the State Party previously also reported that the suspension applied to the area referred to as the buffer zone, <u>also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to clarify the status of this area, which has not yet been formally adopted by the Committee;
- 9. <u>Also notes</u> the translocation of 101 elephants to the Sapi Safari Area to increase the population, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to ensure anti-poaching efforts are sustained or enhanced and continue to be monitored, and that any potential future translocation projects are undertaken in accordance with international best practice including in line with the IUCN guidelines on translocations, to ensure a prior assessment of the suitability and risks before implementation;
- 10. While noting that no uncontrolled tourism development has taken place within the property, requests furthermore the State Party ensure that any activity that may have the potential to impact on the OUV of the property, including all proposed tourism infrastructure be subject to an impact assessment in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that is difficult to reverse:
- 11. <u>Notes with significant concern</u> the report that the State Party of Zambia has approved an open cast copper mine in the Lower Zambezi National Park (LZNP) without due consideration of the potential impact on the OUV of the property, <u>reiterates again its concern</u> regarding the potential serious impact of this project on the OUV and <u>urges once again</u> the State Party of Zambia not to proceed with the project;
- 12. Notes with concern the reported strong possibility that several copper and gold mining operations will be developed in LZNP and Chiawa Game Management Area (CGMA), which adjoin the property separated only by the Zambezi River, and requests with urgency that the State Party of Zambia to provide details of all proposed mining projects in LZNP and CGMA, and to ensure that any potential impacts on the OUV are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ARAB STATES

78. Sanganeb Marine National Park and Dungonab Bay – Mukkawar Island Marine National Park (Sudan) (N 262rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.78

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decisions **42 COM 7B.99** and **44 COM 7B.179** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018) and the extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions, respectively,
- 3. While noting that the formal adoption of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for the property was constrained by the unstable political situation and its full implementation by the lack of financial resources, welcomes the 80% implementation of the IMP by the Wildlife Conservation General Administration and its partners, and requests the State Party to update the IMP for a 5-year period, ensure its implementation, and secure adequate funding, as soon as possible;
- 4. Also recalling the reported activities of international dive operators causing damage to coral reefs, disturbance to wildlife, and negative impacts on visitor experience, also welcomes ecotourism guidelines for diving activities and permit requirements for dive operators in the property, takes note of steps taken towards developing a written code of conduct for diving operations in the property, and reiterates its request to the State Party to continue its efforts, including by:
 - a) Establishing a clear code of conduct for diving operations in the property,
 - b) Establishing effective communication with dive operators, both national and international, to raise awareness about the established rules and regulations and encourage best practice in line with international standards,
 - c) Establishing appropriate mechanisms, such as a licensing system, to avoid violations,
 - d) Ensuring regular patrolling to monitor any vessels operating within either component of the property;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the various marine research activities on mangroves, coral reefs, and sea turtles and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to use the findings to inform monitoring and management priorities for the property, including as part of the next IMP;
- 6. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> the various expert workshops held in 2021 and 2022, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to implement the expertise shared and to continue building the management capacity for the property through training and knowledge exchange opportunities;

- 7. <u>Recalls</u> that any proposed extensions of the property should follow the appropriate procedures for boundary modification and/or re-nomination as per the Operational Guidelines, and <u>further encourages</u> the State Party to seek technical advice from IUCN if required;
- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> that no formal permissions have been given for the development of a resort inside the boundaries of the property and <u>reminds</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre of any intention to undertake or authorize new constructions, which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and to ensure any potential impacts on the OUV are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

79. Gondwana Rainforests of Australia (Australia) (N 368bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.79

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.89** adopted at its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) session,
- 3. <u>Noting with appreciation</u> the State Party's continued collaborative efforts in post-fire monitoring and recovery actions, <u>expresses its utmost concern</u> about the negative impacts of the 2019-20 bushfires to the attributes of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), in particular species that are vulnerable to the impacts of fire;
- 4. <u>Also recalling</u> that the State Party initiated an immediate management response following the fires including assessment of impacts, planning and funding commitments to ensure long-term recovery, <u>takes note</u> that some recovery efforts have been delayed due to the recent flooding in the region, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue management actions to support the recovery of the property, including the monitoring of ongoing health and recovery of areas and species, as well as recovery actions and adaptive management strategies;
- 5. <u>Notes with concern</u> the impact of Myrtle rust (Austropuccinia psidii) across fire-affected areas of the property, <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue monitoring to address its impact on the property's OUV;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued efforts of the State Party to develop an understanding of projected changes resulting from climate change in relation to the property's OUV, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to utilise the knowledge and understanding gained through these processes to

- guide adaptive management strategies to strengthen the climate and disaster resilience of the property;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to continue implementing the recommendations of the Royal Commission into National Natural Disaster Arrangements in order to strengthen emergency management as well as climate and natural disaster risk reduction; and <u>also welcomes</u> the development of an updated climate variability assessment methodology and climate change toolkit for the World Heritage properties;
- 8. <u>Appreciates</u> the efforts of the State Party to share the lessons learned with other States Parties to the Convention facing similar threats, promoting knowledge exchange on fire management strategies at World Heritage properties;
- 9. Also noting the information that the approval process for the granting of a water mining license to extract water from the vicinity of Springbrook National Park is not completed, requests furthermore the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre once the Australian Government has received the proposal referral and determined whether the proposed activity will be subject to further impact assessment in relation to the property;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 80. Greater Blue Mountains Area (Australia) (N 917)

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.180** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Notes again its utmost concern regarding the impacts of the 2019-20 bushfires, which affected 71% of the property, welcomes the funding to support post-fire recovery of the property, and encourages the State Party to continue monitoring the ongoing health and recovery of areas and species impacted by the fires and to continue the recovery actions including invasive species and erosion control, fire management, and threatened species conservation activities, in particular noting that flooding has delayed some of these actions;
- 4. Requests the State Party to continue implementing the recommendations of the Royal Commission into National Natural Disaster Arrangements in order to strengthen emergency management in the property as well as climate and natural disaster risk reduction, also welcomes the development of an updated climate variability assessment methodology and climate change toolkit for the World Heritage properties;
- 5. <u>Appreciates</u> the efforts of the State Party to share the lessons learned with other States Parties to the Convention facing similar threats, promoting knowledge exchange on fire management strategies at World Heritage properties;

- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to implement the recommendations of the New South Wales (NSW) Government and independent inquiries into the floods and to continue efforts to understand impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and support the recovery of attributes of the property's OUV as well as its management function;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> that the raising of the Warragamba Dam wall would have inundated areas within the property, which would have affected directly its OUV, <u>further welcomes</u> the decision not to proceed with the project;
- 8. <u>Takes note</u> of the findings of the assessment of potential cumulative mining impacts to the property and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to use the findings to inform a strategic approach for the approval of future and management of current mining projects, which avoids cumulative impacts from mining on the property and considers all the recommendations made in IUCN technical review of the assessment;
- 9. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure that potential threats to the property from activities outside its boundaries, in particular mining activities, are fully considered in the development of the revised Greater Blue Mountains World Heritage Area Strategic Plan;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to fully assess the potential impacts of the Western Sydney International (Nancy-Bird Walton) Airport on the OUV of the property, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 81. Three Parallel Rivers of Yunnan Protected Area (China) (N 1083bis)

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **37 COM 7B.12, 43 COM 7B.5** and **44 COM 7B.182** adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its unequivocal commitment to strictly prohibit mineral extraction within the property and its buffer zone;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the further clarifications regarding the evolving governance and management framework for the complex serial property, including post-mining restoration, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue the implementation and monitoring of active and passive activities to ensure the ecological restoration of former mining sites in the property and its buffer zone:
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that discussions regarding the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) are ongoing, but <u>regrets</u> the limited tangible progress and <u>urges once more</u> the State Party to further improve and finalise the SEA, in line with international best practices and the

Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to ensure that the SEA includes an assessment of indirect and cumulative impacts of both the upstream and downstream catchments of Nujiang, Lancang and Jinsha Rivers, so that the results can inform management and decision making for future developments;

- 6. Reiterates its encouragement to the State Party to invite an IUCN Advisory mission to that effect:
- 7. Also recalling the recommendation of the 2013 mission to avoid the construction of transmission infrastructure within the property and its buffer zones and Decision 44 COM 7B.182 in which the State Party was requested to explore alternative options to the Dulong River power transmission line as proposed, expresses its utmost concern that the transmission line project, which crosses the Gaoligongshan National Nature Reserve component of the property and for which an Environmental Impact Assessment identified impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, has been completed and is operational, and also requests the State Party to urgently provide details of the alternative options it assessed, and the mitigating measures it took during construction and is now implementing to ensure the protection of the OUV during the operation of the transmission line:
- 8. <u>Further recalling</u> concerns expressed by the World Heritage Centre and IUCN over other power transmission projects crossing the property and its buffer zones confirmed by the State Party via letter in March 2019, including two ongoing projects in Deqin County 1) 'Sancha River first stage and second stage hydropower station transmission and transformation projects' and 2) '110KV Power Transmission and Transformation Construction Project', and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide updates on the status of these projects;
- 9. Notes with appreciation ongoing consultations about the Conservation Management Plan (CMP) involving various administrative levels, experts and the public, but <u>reiterates its request</u> to expedite the development of the CMP and Management Effectiveness Assessment (MEA) system in line with the recommendations of the 2013 mission, <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to submit the updated draft CMP to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to widen the scope of the possible IUCN Advisory mission so as to also encompass dialogue about the CMP and the evolving MEA system;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

82. Keoladeo National Park (India) (N 340)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.82

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.92** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).

- 3. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's continued efforts towards securing sufficient adequate water supply to the property, however <u>reiterates its utmost concern</u> that water supply in most years remains below the minimum level considered necessary for the ecological functioning of the property;
- 4. Regrets that the State Party did not submit the revised Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN prior to its finalization and approval as requested by the Committee, and takes note that the 2017-2027 Management Plan has been completed and was provided to the 2023 IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's continued efforts to address invasive alien species within the property, including priorities in the revised 2017-2027 Management Plan and a dedicated budget;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to implement the 2023 mission recommendations, including to:
 - a) Develop a clear list of attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) to inform the long-term monitoring, protection and management of the property,
 - b) Secure a long-term strategic solution to water supply, including by rapidly assessing the following to inform management priorities:
 - (i) Clarify water requirements for the property,
 - (ii) Consider water quality from different sources,
 - (iii) Ensure water release so that sufficient water reaches the property,
 - (iv) Clarify hydrological processes related to the property,
 - (v) Ensure no water is supplied from sewage treatment plants unless there is clear research evidence that the hydrological integrity of the property and its OUV will not be compromised.
 - c) Ensure the current status of the Siberian Crane is accurately reflected in the monitoring and management of the property,
 - d) Establish a scientifically-based monitoring programme based on the attributes that convey the OUV to inform management of the property, as follows:
 - (i) Review existing information as fully and analytically as possible,
 - (ii) Design a scientifically sound monitoring, analysis and reporting programme,
 - (iii) Consideration should be given to a wider ecological monitoring programme that would monitor ecosystem health, especially of the wetland,
 - e) Establish a long-term adaptive management strategy for invasive species,
 - f) Review the 2017-2027 Management Plan with an explicit focus on the management of the OUV of the property,
 - g) Ensure management planning and decision-making is focused specifically on the OUV of the property, including that planned activities explicitly and transparently contribute to its protection and management. In the short-term, reconsider whether the planned establishment of an ex-situ management programme for four species of mammal would be appropriate and the best use of resources given other urgent management priorities in the context of the OUV;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> that the development of a Zonal Master Plan for the Eco-Sensitive Zone around the property remains underway, and <u>again encourages</u> the State Party to consider formalizing the Eco-Sensitive Zone as a World Heritage buffer zone by submitting a

- proposal for a minor boundary modification, in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Also takes note</u> that the disposal of cattle carcasses near the property has been resolved;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

83. Manas Wildlife Sanctuary (India) (N 338)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.83

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **36 COM 7B.10**, **41 COM 8B.36**, **43 COM 7B.7** and **44 COM 7B.185** adopted at its 36th (Saint Petersburg, 2012), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the reported increase in the Indian rhinoceros population in the property, and notes with appreciation the upscaled efforts against poaching and the subsequent reduction in wildlife-related offences and the generation of baseline data for keynote species in Manas for the first time, with a view to institutionalising holistic and state-of-the-art wildlife monitoring, and requests the State Party to provide these baseline population data as part of its next report on the state of conservation of the property;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the ongoing efforts to mobilize additional funding for the conservation of the property, including through REDD+ carbon financing, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to report on how the carbon finance initiative benefits the property, so that lessons learnt could be shared widely, and <u>also welcomes</u> activities undertaken by the State Party aiming to benefit local communities, notably through the revitalization of Eco-Development Committees and eco-tourism initiatives;
- 5. <u>Notes with concern</u> that the impacts of agricultural encroachment on the property remain unresolved, and therefore <u>also requests</u> the State Party to continue ensuring that no further expansion of encroachment occurs within the property, while strengthening efforts to address the issue at a political level with due respect to the social, economic and cultural rights of indigenous peoples and local communities, and respecting all relevant international norms:
- 6. Notes that habitat management of the property is guided by the Manas Tiger Conservation Plan, but <u>regrets</u> that the State Party did not provide a clear update regarding the finalisation and implementation of an Action Plan for sustainable management of the grassland-woodland ecosystem, despite its earlier requests, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to provide an update on the implementation of the Action Plan on the ground, including on the implementation of control measures against the spread of invasive plant species, notably Chromolaena odorata and Mikania micrantha;

- 7. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> the continued transboundary cooperation between the States Parties of India and Bhutan at a field level and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to continue the reflection on the possible preparation of a revised proposal for the extension of the property and engage in dialogue with the State Party of Bhutan on a possible transboundary extension of the property, in line with the previous Committee decisions; let go of
- 8. Reiterates its serious concern about the potential impacts of the Mangdechhu hydroelectric project on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>noting</u> that this project is reported to have been jointly inaugurated by the Government of India and the Royal Government of Bhutan in August 2019, <u>deeply regrets</u> that neither State Party has provided any information about the project, nor its Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Environmental Management Plan (EMP) despite continued requests by the Committee since 2012:
- 9. <u>Urges again</u> the States Parties of India and Bhutan to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN, by **1 February 2024**:
 - a) A copy of the EIA for the Mangdechhu hydroelectric project, which should include an assessment of the project's impact on the property's OUV, including its integrity,
 - b) Details on the EMP and a report of its implementation, including confirmation of effective measures taken to ensure that any impact on the OUV is being avoided;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

84. Shiretoko (Japan) (N 1193)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.84

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 41 COM 7B.30, 43 COM 7B.10 and 44 COM 7B.186 adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Noting that effects of climate change are generating greater concern and that there is a lack of data to monitor climate change impacts, welcomes the planned development by 2024 of an adaptive management strategy that minimizes climate change-driven impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and reiterates its request for the State Party to submit the final strategy to the World Heritage Centre and to ensure that full support is provided for its implementation and the ongoing protection of the OUV of the property;
- 4. Also noting that Stellar sea lions, including their impacts on fisheries, have been managed in line with a Basic Management Policy and that research on population dynamics is underway, however reiterates its concern regarding the continued culling of sea lions in the continued absence of population data, and urges the State Party to continue to accelerate the development of a population dynamic model to inform the revision of the Basic Management Policy in 2024;

- 5. <u>Urges again</u> the State Party to reconsider, reduce or eliminate, if necessary, the current levels of culling of the Western Steller sea lion population, consulting the IUCN Species Survival Commission as required, and adopting a precautionary approach until accurate and comprehensive data on this subspecies become available;
- 6. <u>Taking note</u> of the Comprehensive Evaluation Report of the 2012-2021 Long-Term Monitoring Plan (LTMP) for the property, <u>expresses concern</u> regarding the reported decrease by half of some seabird populations since inscription and <u>recalls</u> that seabird populations are an important attribute of the OUV;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the planned revision of the LTMP by 2023 and that this will include biodiversity attributes under Criterion (x), and <u>reiterates its request</u> for the State Party to ensure that the attributes of the property's OUV are fully reflected in the LTMP to ensure aquatic biodiversity, specifically the salmonid species, seabirds and marine mammals, are all included and monitored, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the final revised LTMP to the World Heritage Centre;
- 8. <u>Also takes note</u> of the State Party's ongoing response to the 2019 mission recommendations, including the monitoring of biological variables, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to continue to:
 - a) Take measures to improve the representation of biological variables in river ecosystems, to enhance the current understanding of river restoration approaches and options,
 - b) Consider alternative methodologies to capture large wooden debris as a way to better balance river restoration needs with the fishery stakeholders' concerns,
 - c) Monitor the impacts of the riverbed path pilot project, especially in relation to erosion, fish passage and disturbance to the benthic habitat, and take prompt remedial actions in relation to any identified impacts, as necessary, based on comprehensive scientific understanding;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 85. Western Tien-Shan (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan) (N 1490)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.85

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2.
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.69** and **44 COM 7B.95** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the establishment of the joint Regional Committee for the management of the property, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to continue collaboration towards the joint management of the property, in particular to develop the transboundary integrated management plan for the property;

- 4. Expresses again its utmost concern at the excision of a substantial part of Sayram-Ugam National Nature Park in Kazakhstan from the property and its subsequent inclusion in the buffer zone, as these significant changes introduced to the zoning and protection regime of this protected area could affect the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), including its conditions of integrity, and recalling that the removal of the legal protection of a property may constitute potential danger to the property in line with Paragraph 180(b) (i) of the Operational Guidelines, also requests the State Party of Kazakhstan to provide further information on this boundary change at the national level, including detailed information on the legal protection status of the part which was moved to the buffer zone;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party of Uzbekistan to provide detailed information on the protection regime of the Bashkyzylsay and Maidantal components, including any changes from the time of inscription and how the governance arrangements, and corresponding management measures, ensure the effective protection of the OUV;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the States Parties to review and rationalize the boundaries of the components of the property and their buffer zones to ensure that they fully correspond to criterion (x), follow ecological principles and address connectivity, exclude areas originally included for their paleontological values while also considering the potential to meet criterion (ix), and to develop, as a matter of priority, a joint proposal for a significant boundary modification, in accordance with Paragraph 165 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. Also reiterates its requests to the States Parties to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the changes in the management regime of the above-mentioned components of the property in the Chatkal State Biosphere Reserve and Ugam-Chatkal State Biosphere Reserve in Uzbekistan and the Sayram-Ugam National Nature Park in Kazakhstan, to evaluate whether these changes represent a potential danger to the property's OUV and integrity and to verify whether any new threats to the components in Kyrgyzstan have emerged since inscription;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

86. Chitwan National Park (Nepal) (N 284)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.86

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.188** adopted at its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) session,
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the ongoing collaborative efforts to combat rhino poaching in the property, however, <u>expresses its continued concern</u> about the resurgence of rhino poaching and other recent deaths of rhinos reportedly linked to construction activities, <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide clarification on these reported incidents and to further strengthen measures within and around the property to prevent poaching;

- 4. <u>Noting</u> that the new alignment to locate the East-West Electrified Railroad outside the property is yet to be finalized, <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) of the proposed alignment which adequately assesses its potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, together with a detailed map, to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN when it is available and before finalizing a decision on the alternative route;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued suspension of the proposed road projects inside and adjacent to the property, including the construction of the proposed Terai Hulaki Highway, China-India Trade Link of Province 3 (now Bagmati Province) and Province 4 (now Gandaki Province), the Madi-Balmiki Ashram road and the Malekhu-Thori road, as well as upgrading of the section of the Thori-Madi-Bharatpur road located inside the property, and takes note that no decision has been made on the alignments of the proposed roads that would cross the property;
- 6. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party not to approve any road and railway developments passing through the property, as recommended by the 2016 IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, which would represent a potential danger to the OUV of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. Also noting the recent approval of the Wildlife Friendly Infrastructure Guidance by the Government of Nepal, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide further information regarding the proposed construction of "wildlife friendly infrastructures" inside the property, and to ensure that their potential impacts on the OUV are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to any decision that would be difficult to reverse;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit up-to-date maps of the property as inscribed in 1984 to the World Heritage Centre, as requested by the World Heritage Centre in its letter of October 2020, by **1 December 2023**;
- 9. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to seek further guidance from the World Heritage Centre and IUCN regarding the process of a boundary modification, and <u>urges again</u> the State Party to submit a boundary modification proposal in accordance with the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. Continues to note with concern the alleged human rights abuses related to Chitwan National Park raised in 2020, including as raised in the 2022 "Report of the Special Rapporteur on the rights of indigenous peoples, José Francisco Calí Tzay. Protected areas and indigenous peoples' rights: the obligations of States and international organizations", requests furthermore the State Party to ensure that any relocation of people and communities from within the property follows a human rights-based approach, and applying international best practices and applicable norms and standards;
- 11. Requests moreover the State Party to provide a response to the report of the Special Rapporteur by no later than **1 December 2023**, and to ensure all park operations are conducted in conformity with a best practice rights-based approach;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

87. Sagarmatha National Park (Nepal) (N 120)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.87

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.70** and **44 COM 7B.96** adopted at its 42nd (Bahrain, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> that the revision of the 2016-2020 Management Plan for the property is underway, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to finalize, as soon as possible, the revision to include the various pressures to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and to submit the revised Plan to the World Heritage Centre:
- 4. Also recalling concerns regarding the impacts of increasing visitor numbers on the property, welcomes the State Party's intention to include a tourism chapter in the revised Management Plan, however requests the State Party to provide an update on the planned development of a Tourism Management Plan and reiterates its request to the State Party to:
 - a) Undertake a visitor carrying capacity study to establish an appropriate carrying capacity for the property, especially during the peak season, and use the findings to inform the Tourism Management Plan,
 - b) Address how monitoring and regulation of tourism-related helicopter traffic within the property and the nationally designated buffer zones of the Park can be strengthened to reduce impacts,
 - c) Ensure that the Tourism Management Plan aligns with the revision of the Management Plan for the property;
- 5. <u>Further recalling</u> its concerns regarding the serious threats of the Kongde View Resort to the OUV, <u>takes note</u> of the activities to patrol, monitor and control any environmental impacts and illegal activities relating to the continued operation of the resort, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue these measures and finalise a detailed environmental plan to mitigate the impacts of the resort, submit this plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, and take any necessary measures to monitor its implementation;
- 6. Recalling furthermore the State Party's decision to request a revision of the draft Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the optical fibre project based on the comments provided by IUCN, further requests the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of progress and ensure the revised EIA is completed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. Recalling again the proposal in the 2016-2020 Management Plan to consider introducing zonation as a management instrument within the property and the distinction between a zonation scheme and a buffer zone, requests furthermore the State Party to develop a zonation system as part of the revision of the Management Plan, notably as a means of ensuring appropriate provisions for enclave villages located within the property;
- 8. <u>Appreciates</u> the ongoing engagement by the State Party to consult with local communities regarding the formalization of the nationally designated buffer zone of Sagarmatha National Park as a buffer zone to the property, and <u>encourages</u> it to continue the implementation of

the Management Plan which applies to the nationally designed buffer zone, possibly with the aim of formalizing a buffer zone, with the support of local people, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines; <u>also encourages</u> the World Heritage Centre to organise an online meeting with the State Party and the management authority of the property to allow IUCN to provide further guidance;

- 9. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the continued ban on firewood collection in the property, implementation of law enforcement, and planned interventions to reduce this activity and promote alternative energy, and <u>further encourages</u> the State Party to continue these measures and ensure their incorporation in the revised Management Plan;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> that the Himalayan musk deer poaching incidence occurred when surveillance was impacted by COVID-19 and that surveillance has since resumed, and <u>requests</u> moreover that antipoaching measures are continued and included in the revision of the Management Plan;
- 11. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> the commitment to monitor climate change impacts on biodiversity and the local community, and <u>futher reiterates its request</u> to develop a climate adaptation strategy, and integrate this into the revised Management Plan;
- 12. Notes with significant concern the confirmation by the State Party that construction of a hydropower project has been initiated in the Chaurikharka and Lukla areas without prior notification in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and without providing clarity on whether the potential impacts of the project on the OUV were assessed prior to approval in line with Paragraph 118bis, and considering the potential impact of the project on the OUV given its location in the vicinity of the property and within the nationally designated buffer zone,
- 13. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to halt the aforementioned hydropower project until the impact on the OUV has been determined, and to provide details including the type of hydropower project and associated developments, a map of its location in relation to the property, and the Initial Environmental Examination Report including any assessment of the project's potential impact on the property's OUV, as soon as possible and no later than **1 December 2023**, to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 14. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 88. Kaeng Krachan Forest Complex (Thailand) (N 1461rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.88

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 8B.5**, **40 COM 8B.11**, **43 COM 8B.5** and **44 COM 8B.7** adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,

- 3. Welcomes the State Party's firm commitment to transboundary conservation and reiterates its encouragement to the State Party to identify opportunities to collaborate with the State Party of Myanmar in transboundary conservation and management of the highly significant nature conservation values of the region, with a view to considering a future extension of the property;
- 4. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> to the State Party for having invited an IUCN Advisory mission to the property and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to implement the mission recommendations, including those aimed at ensuring compliance of the property with the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's evolving legal and policy framework applicable to national parks and wildlife sanctuaries and <u>requests</u> the State Party to enhance participatory management and governance arrangements enabled by the new legislation in place since 2019, through meaningful participation of local communities;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> the establishment of Protected Area Committees (PACs) in all units of the property which include community representatives and <u>welcomes</u> the appointment of an overarching PAC for the entire forest complex foreseen for the current fiscal year;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the focus of the State Party on engagement with the Ban Bang Kloy community and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue to work closely, and in full consultation, with the affected indigenous peoples and local communities to address the longstanding conflicts following a rights-based approach;
- 8. Expresses its utmost concern about a proposal to construct a dam within Mae Nam Phachi Wildlife Sanctuary adjacent to the property and in an area initially nominated as part of the property and key for its integrity, which is likely to negatively impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and may further amplify the difficult relationship with the local communities, and requests the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre about the status of the proposed project before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and to ensure that potential environmental and social impacts are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, including to consider a no-project option;
- 9. <u>Notes with concern</u> the unclear protection status of the Kui Buri Forest Reserve and the Army Reserve Zone, a critically important ecological corridor between the Kui Buri and Kaeng Krachan National Parks within the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre of the legal protection status and management system of this corridor, and to consolidate its protection status and management system building upon scenarios identified in the nomination dossier, including the possible inclusion into the Kui Buri National Park, in full consultation with all stakeholders and rightsholders;
- 10. <u>Noting</u> the absence of a formally inscribed buffer zone for the property, <u>requests</u> the State Party to determine and formalize a buffer zone tailored to the local situation around the property through the Minor Boundary Modification procedure as soon as possible;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

89. Ha Long Bay (Viet Nam) (N 672bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.89

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.98** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the continued progress in addressing the 2018 IUCN Advisory mission recommendations and the Committee requests, including a new Management Plan for the property, waste management, carrying capacity study, and initiating a sustainable tourism strategy;
- 4. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> progress to address sustainable tourism management including completion of a carrying capacity study and initiation of the Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that tourism development is based on carrying capacity and to finalise the strategy with the support of sustainable tourism experts as needed, for review by the World Heritage Centre and IUCN;
- 5. Also notes with appreciation various waste management measures including regulating wastewater treatment in cruise ships, closure of the largest open-pit coal mine in the Ha Long area, promotion of a "green" economic transition, and that water quality is within allowable national limits, however notes with concern that pollution remains an issue in the property and urges the State Party to continue and further strengthen measures, as necessary, including to implement the planned upgrade of wastewater treatment of attractions in Ha Long Bay and closure of industrial activities including coal mining and cement activities in the Ha Long area;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of a new 2021-2025 Management Plan for the property (vision to 2040), and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Provide clarification on how the planned "Master Plan for 2021-2030 (vision to 2050) to preserve and promote the value of Ha Long Bay's World Heritage site" relates to the Management Plan,
 - b) Ensure any processes to revise national, regional and site-level plans and regulations related to the management of the property are appropriately aligned and integrated and coordinated between the site management authorities and the Provincial and City People's Committees;
- 7. Reiterates its request for the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN, a map with a clear indication of the current boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, including details on the use and management regime within the buffer zone, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

90. Phong Nha-Ke Bang National Park (Viet Nam) (N 951bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.90

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.189** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued efforts of the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 4. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> ongoing measures to address invasive alien species (IAS) including a proposed project to assess the invasive plant Merremia boisiana, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to develop a clear strategy and action plan informed by the results of the pilot project that is sufficiently resourced to address the threat posed by the 14 previously reported invasive species identified within the property, and to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN, the strategy and action plan;
- 5. Takes note of the ongoing assessment of existing tourism operations and capacity of cave tourism within the property and wider province, also requests the State Party to ensure that any future planned tourism development is based on the carrying capacity of the property, and also reiterates its requests to the State Party to revise and update the 2010-2020 Sustainable Tourism Development Plan and its integration with other key management tools, to enhance governance based on the overarching principles of sustaining and preserving the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property by paying careful attention to the balance between tourism development and biodiversity conservation, as well as increased benefit sharing among stakeholders;
- 6. Also notes with appreciation the confirmation that no infrastructure projects will be approved in or near the caves within the property to avoid impacting the OUV, and that impact assessments will be conducted for construction projects and large-scale tourism projects likely to impact on the OUV, and <u>further requests</u> that all potential developments are assessed for their potential impact in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse:
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> management measures including to strengthen enforcement, limit encroachment, address poaching, and undertake wildlife surveys to identify high priority conservation areas, and <u>requests furthermore</u> that such measures be continued to inform priority management actions for the property, and to maintain sufficient staffing capacity to ensure the ongoing protection and management of the property;
- 8. <u>Further reiterates its request</u> that the State Party fully implement the recommendations of the 2018 mission, in particular by integrating and harmonizing the various management and conservation plans and tools under a concerted vision of governance;
- Further welcomes the continued cooperation with the State Party of the Lao People's Democratic Republic (PDR) for the conservation of biodiversity in the transboundary protected area, and continues to encourage the submission of a nomination for a transboundary significant boundary modification to extend the property and include Hin Nam No National Park (Lao PDR);

- 10. <u>Further notes with appreciation</u> the confirmation by the State Party that reported cattle grazing within the property is subsistence based and that management measures are in place to prevent negative impacts on the OUV, but <u>noting</u> its location in a strictly protected part of the property, <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to continue monitoring the grazing activities to prevent negative impacts on the property's OUV while ensuring that no illegal grazing occurs within the property;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

91. Pirin National Park (Bulgaria) (N 225bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.91

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.101** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to expedite the development of the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) to inform the new draft Management Plan, including a specific assessment of the proposed management objectives and zoning to ensure that it adequately considers and reflects the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, including potential impacts of development in areas located within the buffer zone, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 4. Reiterates its request to the State Party to develop the new draft Management Plan through public consultation with relevant stakeholders, including NGOs, to comprehensively address the threats identified by the 2018 IUCN Advisory mission, and to specify how the management priorities will help to maintain the OUV of the property, including the protection of its integrity, and to submit the draft Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN, prior to its adoption;
- 5. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure that, in accordance with the Operational Guidelines, any new project within the property, its buffer zone or its wider setting, which may have an impact on the OUV of the property, is reported to the World Heritage Centre, and that its potential impact is assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse:
- 6. <u>Urges again</u> the State Party to develop a long-term strategic approach to all plans and programmes for the property, its buffer zone and wider setting, which is agreed among all relevant stakeholders, including municipalities, and which ensures that any potential future

- development is harmonized, coordinated and consistent with regulations protecting the property's OUV, including its integrity, and with the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session
- 92. Gulf of Porto: Calanche of Piana, Gulf of Girolata, Scandola Reserve (France) (N 258)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.92

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **37 COM 7B.19** adopted at its 37th session (Phnom Penh, 2013),
- 3. Notes with concern that over-tourism is having an increasingly negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in particular on its biodiversity, due to the disturbance by motor vessels on the maritime front of the Scandola Nature Reserve (SNR) during the peak tourist season, resulting in poor nesting success of the resident population of ospreys, and to the serious impact of mooring of recreational boats on the Posidonia seagrass beds, the coralligenous reefs and the corbels of Lithophyllum algae, which represent attributes of the property's OUV;
- 4. Also notes with concern that, despite having acknowledged the threat of over-tourism, the State Party has still not addressed the issue and that a comprehensive Management Plan for the entire property, as requested in its previous Decision 37 COM 7B.19 has yet to be developed, and reiterates its request to the State Party to finalise the Management Plan as soon as possible, including a sustainable tourism strategy and a set of measures to address tourism pressure, and to submit the Plan for review by the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, prior to its adoption:
- 5. <u>Noting</u> the reported impacts of climate change on the property, <u>requests</u> the State Party to urgently implement the climate change monitoring and adaptation measures foreseen in the draft Management Plan, and to provide an updated and more detailed assessment of the impacts of climate change on the OUV;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the recent initiative to revise the 1975 Decree for the SNR and <u>urges</u> the State Party to base this revision on the best available scientific data, and to ensure that it includes adequate measures to address tourism pressure and limit visitation, and provides for the expansion of the National Reserve to include a larger marine component;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the State Party's ongoing efforts to create a regional marine nature reserve in the north-western maritime zone of the island, <u>considers</u> this should be complementary to the extension of the marine zone of the SNR and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to extend the property, to include the extension of the Reserve, through a boundary modification in line with the Operational Guidelines;

- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to take immediate and urgent measures in the meantime to regulate mooring and the number of vessels permitted in the maritime part of the SNR in order to reduce significantly the disturbance and impacts of mooring;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

93. Durmitor National Park (Montenegro) (N 100bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.93

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.104** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's decision to terminate the process of expanding ski infrastructure development in the property;
- 4. Recalls that an expansion of ski infrastructure developments inside the property would constitute an ascertained danger to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, in line with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines and requests the State Party to provide information confirming that existing ski infrastructure will remain within exactly the same limited area closely following the existing routes, not allowing for any expansion or extension, and that the ski lifts should be operated within the limits of the current capacity of the existing ski runs;
- 5. <u>Reiterates its request</u> not to pursue the construction of tourism infrastructure inside the property, and to develop a sustainable tourism management strategy for the property, which should be reflected in the updated Special Purpose Spatial Plan (SPSP);
- 6. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the submission of the Revised Protection Study (RPS) as well as the process of establishing a buffer zone for the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to fully consider the findings of the IUCN's review of the RPS and consult with the World Heritage Centre prior to adopting any legal change to the boundaries of the National Park or protection status of any area of the property;
- 7. Notes the multiple proposed hydroelectric power plant (HPP) projects downstream of the property and <u>further requests</u> the States Parties of Montenegro, Bosnia and Herzegovina, and Serbia to ensure the integrity of the property by maintaining the continuity of the river ecosystem and the continued presence of the Danube Salmon through an unimpeded river flow, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the States Parties to ensure that the potential impacts of proposed projects on the OUV of the property are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse, as follows:
 - the State Party of Bosnia and Herzegovina to confirm the status of the Buk Bijela HPP project and to ensure that potential impacts of the project on the OUV are assessed

- through an updated Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), in close consultation with the State Party of Montenegro,
- b) the States Parties of Bosnia and Herzegovina and Serbia to ensure that the potential impacts of all planned HPP projects in the upper Drina catchment on the OUV are assessed, including cumulative impacts, through a Strategic Environmental Assessment, in collaboration with the State Party of Montenegro,
- c) the State Party of Montenegro to ensure that potential impacts of the Komarnica HPP on the OUV are assessed during the evaluation of the EIA, with specific considerations for the implications of this project on the potential future extension of the property into the Dragišnica and Komarnica Nature Park, and not to approve the project if it would result in negative impacts on the OUV,
- d) the States Parties of Montenegro, Bosnia and Herzegovina and Serbia to communicate updated information and documentation on the above to the World Heritage Centre, for review by IUCN;
- 8. Requests moreover the State Party to continue to monitor any downstream impacts inside the property following the completion of the Smokovac-Mateševo section of the Bar-Boljare motorway, as well as the status of key species that are attributes of the OUV, in particular the Danube Salmon;
- 9. Requests moreover the State Party to apply strict environmental safeguard standards in order to carefully monitor, minimise and mitigate any potential impacts during construction and maintenance works of the Lastva Grbaljska-Pljevlja transmission line;
- Requests moreover the State Party to assess the potential impacts of the proposed lead and zinc mine on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

94. Central Sikhote-Alin (Russian Federation) (N 766bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.94

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.105** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the establishment of a Coordinating Council for the integrated management of the property and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure that the Council implements tasks proposed in the Joint Action Plan of the Integrated Management Plan that will enhance integrated management of the property, and to ensure representation from all component parts of the property;

- 4. Recalling previous concerns around the limited protection conveyed by the proposed buffer zone of the Bikin National Park and large-scale logging activities and the associated increase in forest roads along the boundaries of the Sikhote-Alin Strict Nature Reserve, requests to the State Party to:
 - a) Ensure that the process of designating an adequate buffer zone for the property is undertaken in a coordinated manner across all components,
 - b) Finalize the designation of an adequate formal buffer zone for the Bikin River Valley component, as already requested by Decision **42 COM 8B.9** and in line with the recommendations of the 2018 IUCN Evaluation,
 - c) Strengthen the regulation, in the Sikhote-Alin Strict Nature Reserve, of logging activities in the vicinity of the property beyond the buffer zone;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the progress in extending the boundaries of the Sikhote-Alin Strict Nature Reserve, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit a proposal through a Minor Boundary Modification procedure to reflect the extension in the inscribed property, as well as formally designate the buffer zones for the property under the Convention, in conformity with Paragraphs 163 and 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to develop and adopt a long-term vision to ensure the connectivity of Amur tiger habitat at the landscape level, through a range of strategies, including building enhanced connectivity with other protected areas, and investigating conservation connectivity strategies outside the formal protected area system;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to clarify the status of the eco-tourism strategy for the entire property, submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN when available, and ensure that it clearly defines the type of activities permitted and outlines how impacts of tourism and recreational use will be monitored and controlled across the entire property:
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for review by the World Heritage Centre and IUCN.

95. Golden Mountains of Altai (Russian Federation) (N 768rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.95

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 7B.75, 43 COM 7B.16** and **44 COM 7B.106** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Regrets again that the State Party did not provide sufficiently elaborated information on the different points raised by the Committee in its previous decisions;
- 4. Urges the State Party to provide detailed information on:
 - a) The exact alternative route of the proposed Altai gas pipeline and the current status of the pipeline project,

- b) The exact location of the proposed tourism infrastructure at Lake Teletskoye, including whether an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) has been undertaken for the development, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context,
- c) The status of current or proposed mining operations at the Brekchiya or Maly Kolychak deposits, including whether these have been subject to a full EIA, specifically assessing the potential impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property,
- d) The state of conservation of all components of the property: Belukha Mountain Nature Park, the Ukok Quiet Zone and the Lake Teletskoye buffer zone, in addition to the Katunsky State Nature Reserve and the Altaisky State Nature Reserve (ASNR);
- 5. <u>Appreciates</u> the ongoing work to extend the ASNR component to provide legal protective status over the entire Lake Teletskoye, however <u>reiterates its concern</u> that parts of the buffer zone of the Lake Teletskoye component of the property remain without legal protection in contradiction with the requirements of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to expedite this extension and to ensure that legal protection is also extended to the buffer zone of the Lake Teletskoye component of the property;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued efforts to improve transboundary cooperation with the States Parties of China, Kazakhstan and Mongolia and <u>encourages</u> the States Parties to explore the feasibility of a potential further extension of the property to also include components in China, Kazakhstan and Mongolia;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 96. Virgin Komi Forest (Russian Federation) (N 719)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.96

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **40 COM 7B.99, 42 COM 7B.78** and **44 COM 7B.108** adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Regrets the insufficient information provided to address previous requests of the Committee;
- 4. Reiterates its established position that mining exploration and exploitation are incompatible with World Heritage status and <u>again urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Unequivocally revoke the mining exploration and exploitation licenses granted for the Chudnoe gold deposit, as requested in its previous decisions,
 - b) Confirm there is no remaining mining equipment and infrastructure within the property;

- 5. Expresses its concern over reports of the proposal of a draft law, which would allow the boundaries of federally protected areas to be changed to accommodate economic activities such as mining, and requests the State Party to confirm that the boundaries of the Yugyd Va National Park component of the property will not be modified to facilitate mining and other economic activities;
- 6. Recalls that legal protection is an integral part of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties and that its removal would constitute a clear case for inscription of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in accordance to Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to clarify the legal status of the buffer zone of the Pechorallychsky State Nature Biosphere Reserve, which is part of the property, and to verify the reported logging activities and illegal waste disposal, by submitting relevant information to the World Heritage Centre and ensure that any activities undertaken in the property are consistent with the conservation of its OUV;
- 8. Reiterates its request to the State Party to develop a sustainable tourism management strategy for the entire property to ensure that tourism is effectively managed across all its components, including clear indicators for monitoring impacts associated with visitation access, and to report on the progress of measures outlined in the strategy;
- 9. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure that sufficient financial and human resources are available for the implementation of the Integrated Management Plan for the 2017-2031 period and to report on this in its next report;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

97. Doñana National Park (Spain) (N 685bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.97

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 37 COM 7B.27, 38 COM 7B.79, 39 COM 7B.26, 41 COM 7B.9, 43 COM 7B.20 and 44 COM 7B.191 adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts of the State Party to finalise, with the World Heritage Centre and IUCN, the Retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, as well as to start identifying monitoring indicators, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to report on the indicators in future state of conservation reports;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the State Party's continued efforts to reduce groundwater usage from the Doñana aquifer (Almonte-Marismas detritic aquifer), including through the implementation of various recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission, but <u>reiterates its</u>

<u>utmost concern</u> about the overexploitation of three of the water bodies despite such efforts, and therefore <u>requests</u> the State Party to fully implement all recommendations of the 2020 mission as a matter of urgency;

- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to confirm whether the Hydrological Plan for the Guadalquivir basin (2021-2027) has been approved, including details of the process of its development, recalling the Committee's previous request to present an updated Strategic Environmental Assessment for the Guadalquivir River Basin to ensure that it includes a specific chapter on the OUV of the property;
- 6. Also recalling the need to clarify the relationship between the hydrology and ecology of the area and defining the water requirements of the property to maintain its OUV, <u>urges</u> the State Party to expedite the development of an eco-hydrological model for the property, in line with the 2020 mission recommendations, in order to inform adaptive management of the property and actions to increase its resilience under climate change;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to develop a strategic plan that defines likely climate change-related impacts to the property, as well as adaptation and mitigation measures to address these impacts, including the extent to which a reduction in water consumption is required to conserve and protect the OUV of the property, in line with the 2020 mission recommendations:
- 8. <u>Noting</u> that fluctuations in ecosystem productivity are expected given the seasonal and annual variations in rainfall patterns, nevertheless, <u>expresses its utmost concern</u> about the decline in the number of waterbirds wintering in the property, which are important attributes of the property's OUV, and the fact that some key species are currently not breeding or being observed in the property due to prolonged drought and lack of surface water;
- 9. Expresses its utmost concern at the legislative changes proposed by the Parliament of Andalusia to legalise existing illegal wells and <u>urges</u> the State Party to fully implement the Special Management Plan of the Irrigation Zones located to the North of the Forest Crown of Doñana (PEOCFD) in its current form and to urgently close illegal wells, in accordance with its previous commitments;
- 10. <u>Considers</u> that a continued decline of the Doñana aquifer (Almonte-Marismas detritic aquifer), if not reversed through rapid and effective implementation of actions, including the recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission, to strengthen the resilience of the property and reduce the pressures on the OUV from the threat of climate change, could lead to adverse impact on the OUV of the property and create the conditions for inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger, in accordance with Paragraph 180 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. Recalling the need for great caution concerning the reopening of the former Aznalcóllar mine, <u>further urges</u> the State Party to ensure that systematic risk preparedness and emergency action plans take into account the protection and management needs of the property, and to submit these documents in one of the working languages of the Committee (English or French) to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN, as soon as they become available and before final or irreversible decisions are taken regarding the reopening of the mine;
- 12. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the plan to establish a buffer zone for the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit a proposal for a minor boundary modification to formalise a buffer zone for the property;

13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

98. Gough and Inaccessible Islands (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (N 740bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.98

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.192** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the implementation in 2021 of the house mouse (Mus musculus) eradication programme and the resulting temporarily improved breeding success of several flagship seabird species, as well as the prevention of collateral damage to non-target species;
- 4. Regrets, however, that the eradication of the house mouse population was unsuccessful, and notes with significant concern that the population of mice is rapidly increasing again, which is expected to significantly reduce the breeding success of seabirds and thus negatively impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and in particular criterion (x) in the future;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued commitment of the State Party and its partners to eradicate the house mouse from the island, which is vital for the protection of the property's OUV, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure that the independent review of the eradication programme's failure informs the development of a new phase of the programme for which funding is secured as soon as possible:
- Encourages the State Party to continue to share its experience on invasive alien species eradication and island ecosystem management practices, including the findings of the independent review, to promote knowledge exchange with other States Parties facing similar challenges;
- Also regrets that the eradication of the procumbent pearlwort (Sagina procumbens) is no longer considered possible and <u>requests</u> the State Party to conduct an analysis of the impacts of the procumbent pearlwort on endemic species of plants and associated invertebrates and to develop a long-term containment plan;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> that there is no imminent risk to the OUV of the property arising from the sunken fishing vessel and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue monitoring the situation for potential impacts;
- 9. Also requests the State Party to continue monitoring for any Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza (HPAI), and encourages the State Party to establish monitoring that would provide information on the current status of the OUV of the property;

10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2025**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

MIXED PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

99. Ancient Maya City and Protected Tropical Forests of Calakmul, Campeche (Mexico) (C/N 1061bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.99

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.78** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the extensive programme of actions the National Institute of Anthropology and History (INAH) has undertaken for the implementation of the management plan and conservation of the cultural resources of the property, such as the tunnels and frieze of Substructure IIC, among others;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the initiative of the National Commission of Protected Natural Areas (CONANP) to increase the federal protected areas to the north-east, the west and the north of the property and biosphere reserve and <u>urges</u> the State Party to consider previous recommendations from the Committee to include additional and relevant cultural sites within the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone, ensuring these processes follow a transparent consultative process with full and effective participation of all relevant stakeholders and rightsholders;
- 5. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the research and documentation focusing on the monumental complex that has been undertaken through LiDAR imagery and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue to strengthen documentation and monitoring procedures and keep the World Heritage Centre informed of further actions in this regard;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to undertake a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) to assess the strategic alignment and cumulative impacts of the Tren Maya project on the World Heritage properties located along the proposed route of the railway, and include an assessment of alternative options, in line with the principles of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. <u>Noting with appreciation</u> the research and documentation programme of INAH in the framework of the Tren Maya project, <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue the consultative process with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the project and to take

into account the recommendations in the technical reviews and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to urgently undertake an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) before proceeding with the project to assess the potential impacts on the OUV of the property, informed by the SEA, and undertaken in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit the EIA to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, alongside other relevant documentation as soon as they become available;

8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

100. Historic Sanctuary of Machu Picchu (Peru) (C/N 274)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.100

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- Recalling Decisions 37 COM 7B.35, 39 COM 7B.36, 41 COM 7B.36, 43 COM 7B.37 and 44 COM 7B.172 adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the advances in protection of the original surfaces, the initiation of the Video Surveillance System Project alongside improvements to visitation management and increased management capacity;
- 4. Notes the advances in the process of updating the Master Plan, the elaboration of Regulations for Sustainable Tourism Visits to the Llaqta of Machu Picchu, as well as the advance of the elaboration of the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the Chinchero International Airport Cusco, and reiterates its request to the State Party to ensure their development is effectively harmonized with existing strategies, visions, operational plans, regulations and sanction measures, and to ensure their effective implementation to protect and manage the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property; all of the abovementioned documents should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre once they are complete;
- 5. Requests the State Party to clarify the status of the Public Use Plan, supposed to have been finalized in 2022, including information on how this relates to the various documents and regulations mentioned above;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to confirm that the current number of visitors to the Llaqta has been decreased, in accordance with the study on carrying capacity, following the end of a temporary increase in admission capacity on 31 December 2022;
- 7. <u>Considers</u> that the admission capacity of the property should be directly related to the availability of sufficient human and material resources necessary to manage and control the flow of tourists, the adequate preparation and maintenance of the property, as well as the monitoring and mitigating actions in relation to natural erosion and geological stability at the

Llaqta and at the access routes and <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure that inter-institutional commitments within the Machu Picchu Management Unit (UGM) to comply with these conditions are upheld, and to address the pending issues in visitation management of the property;

- 8. <u>Takes note</u> that the information in the Annex 2.2 of the State Party report (Final Diagnóstico SHM-PANM), which mentions an increase in incidences of site invasion, looting and illegal changes of land use at the property, particularly along the entrance routes, and <u>further requests</u> the State party to the elaborate a report on this issue, including information on mitigating actions taken or planned, to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre;
- 9. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to ensure that any major infrastructure transport project, such as airports, railways, cable cars, tunnels and roads, are rigorously assessed, in line with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines, and with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to develop land use plans for the areas surrounding the property prior to the expected increase of tourism pressure caused by the construction of the Chinchero International Airport;
- 10. <u>Further reiterates its request</u> to undertake the Studies on Alternative Transportation to the Llaqta based on the established carrying capacity and OUV of the property, prior to any decisions regarding new transportation projects;
- 11. <u>Also welcomes</u> the information on the new Visitor Centre and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to finalise the HIA, through a consultative process involving relevant rights holders and stakeholders such as the local communities, and in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 12. <u>Also notes</u> that no further progress towards a proposal for a Machu Picchu-Choquequirao Biosphere Reserve was reported and <u>further encourages</u> the State Party to continue this process;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

AFRICA

101. Maloti-Drakensberg Park (Lesotho, South Africa) (C/N 985bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.101

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.170** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),

- 3. Appreciates the commitment by the State Party of South Africa to undertake Environmental Impact Assessments in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context for the proposed cableway in the immediate vicinity of the property and for the proposed oil and gas exploration within the anticipated buffer zone in South Africa, which could impact the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and requests the State Party of South Africa to ensure that their potential impacts on the OUV of the property are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit impact assessments to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before making any decisions that may be difficult to reverse, and to continue to keep the World Heritage Centre informed before any such pending decision to proceed is made, in accordance with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 4. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party of South Africa to provide more information on the mitigation measures put in place to avoid any negative impacts, in particular visual impacts, of the operation of the petrol filling station in the buffer zone of the property on the OUV;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the completion of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for the uKhahlamba Drakensberg component of the property in South Africa, which will be reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the States Parties to urgently complete and submit to the World Heritage Centre for review the revision of the Joint Management Plan of the property, taking on board the outcomes of the Conservation, Monitoring and Risk Assessment of Rock Art in Sehlabathebe National Park project, improving interpretation of rock art, and using it as an umbrella to harmonise the management system, and to report on its implementation;
- 7. <u>Takes note</u> of the approval of the Biodiversity Resources Management Bill by the National Assembly of Lesotho and <u>also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party of Lesotho to expedite finalization and to submit a copy to the World Heritage Centre;
- 8. Notes the process to propose a minor boundary modification to formalize the buffer zone to the south of the Sehlabathebe National Park in South Africa and <u>further requests</u> the States Parties to submit the fully completed maps, as advised by the World Heritage Centre, so that it can be transferred to the Advisory Bodies for evaluation;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ARAB STATES

102. Wadi Rum Protected Area (Jordan) (C/N 1377)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.102

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.74** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the ongoing review of the buffer zone provisions and regulations for eventual approval and publication in the official gazette and <u>requests</u> the State Party to finalise this process, and to submit these regulations to the World Heritage Centre, with the related landuse plan as a Minor Boundary Modification once available;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the publication of the "Instructions for regulating camping, touristic activities and events within Wadi Rum Protected Area" and the efforts undertaken to implement these instructions, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue informing the World Heritage Centre about their implementation and enforcement, including on how it is contributing to the sustainable management of the property;
- 5. <u>Acknowledging</u> that the completion of the Heritage and Environmental Impact Assessment (HEIA) of tourism activities in and around the property was delayed due to technical and financial constraints, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to finalise this process as soon as possible, in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit it to the World Heritage Centre once available, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Notes with concern the limited progress made in the finalisation of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP), and reiterates its request to the State Party to revise the IMP in accordance with the technical reviews provided by the Advisory Bodies, identifying targeted actions to be implemented, including those to address issues related to carrying capacity studies, zoning and regulations, and the inclusion of a comprehensive conservation strategy, and to ensure that the IMP provides references to legal measures and policies, and is backed by the necessary trained staff and financial resources, to enable the effective management of the property and its buffer zone, and to submit the final IMP to the World Heritage Centre once completed;
- 7. Also welcomes the progress on sanitation solutions for the Al Quwayrah and Disi districts, including for tourist camps (three pilot on-site sanitation units) and Wadi Rum village (proposed decentralised wastewater treatment outside the property), and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to monitor the three pilot projects and provide further detailed information on any proposed sanitation solutions, and to ensure that potential impacts of individual water management infrastructure are assessed in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and submitted to the World Heritage Centre before any decision to proceed;
- 8. <u>Continues to encourage</u> the State Party to complete the Geographic Information System (GIS) database for the entire property, integrating information on both cultural and natural heritage attributes, in order to facilitate monitoring and management of the property;
- 9. Requests moreover the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

103. Trang An Landscape Complex (Viet Nam) (C/N 1438bis)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.103

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 38 COM 8B.14, 40 COM 7B.67,42 COM 7B.62 and 44 COM 7B.76 adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively.
- 3. Welcomes the actions taken by the State Party in addressing the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission and Committee requests, including the implementation of the carrying capacity study for four of the six major tourism areas, tools enforcing the policies reconciling heritage preservation and development, a protocol on local development, establishment of the Advisory Science Commission, a zoning mapping and inventories, cooperation projects for the property at the international and national levels, and capacity building for management staff, and requests that these actions be monitored regularly by the State Party;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the revision of the Management Plan for the property, which contributes to enhancing the framework of the property management and valorising nature-culture connection, and <u>also requests</u> that the Plan be fully implemented following its adoption;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to complete the carrying capacity study for the remaining two tourism areas, and to ensure a proactive approach to monitoring and managing increasing tourism pressure following the COVID-19 pandemic, having particular regard to high visitor concentration during certain periods of the year and at particular parts of the property, with appropriate mitigation measures;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the State Party's efforts in engaging cooperation with public and private partners to increase livelihood and resilience of the local populations of Trang An, in particular in favour of female populations representing vital force in implementing social and economic activities, a model which could inspire other World Heritage properties;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

104. Natural and Cultural Heritage of the Ohrid region (Albania, North Macedonia) (C/N 99quater)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.104

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.7** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the joint efforts of the States Parties to develop a Strategic Recovery Plan for the property but calls on the States Parties to ensure the following:
 - a) The inclusion of an implementation timeframe, budget and prioritisation for each action in the Strategic Recovery Plan,
 - b) The extension to Albania of the implementation of actions envisaged only in North Macedonia but relevant to both States Parties,
 - c) Adequately staffed, resourced and mandated national teams to liaise and coordinate with all relevant institutions to guarantee the integration of the actions of the Strategic Recovery Plan into national policies and plans, as well as an inter-institutional effort to halt and reverse the threats and achieve the goals set out in the Strategic Recovery Plan;
- 4. <u>Urges</u> the States Parties to put in place immediate emergency measures to bring together all relevant actors to stop new threats and reverse existing threats before the Strategic Recovery Plan has been finalised, approved and begun to take effect;
- 5. <u>Notes with serious concern</u> the assessment made in Chapter 4 of the Strategic Recovery Plan regarding the vulnerability of the property and the negative factors affecting it and <u>urgently requests</u> that:
 - a) Amendments to Detailed Urban Plans and approval of Local Development Plans outside settlements be suspended until a Heritage Impact Assessment at the strategic level is carried out and demonstrates that the attributes underlying the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) are not adversely affected by these plans,
 - b) the General Urban Plans for Ohrid and Struga and the spatial planning instruments for non-built-up areas be elaborated as a matter of urgency and in full respect of the attributes underlying the OUV of the property;
- 6. Requests to the State Party of North Macedonia to submit to the World Heritage Centre, upon completion, the feasibility study for the Urban Plan for areas and buildings of State importance in the coastal belt of the Ohrid region for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the State Party of North Macedonia to finalise the proclamation of Studenčišča Marsh as a nature park and Lake Ohrid as a Monument of Nature, and to ensure that management measures conserve the key ecological processes and features which contribute to the property's OUV;

- 8. <u>Expresses its deepest concern</u> about the approval of the Drilon-Tushemisht Water Park project without the corresponding recommendations of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission having been implemented and <u>requests</u> the State Party of Albania to halt further implementation of the project and transmit to the World Heritage Centre the detailed documentation of the approved project, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Requests</u> the State Party of North Macedonia to provide to the World Heritage Centre detailed documentation of approved projects for the A2 Kichevo-Ohrid section of the highway for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- Also requests the States Parties to continue addressing the issue of illegal buildings and structures and to ensure that those already removed are not reinstated and that new illegal structures do not occur;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the States Parties to ensure systematic assessment of impacts of plans and projects, including but not limited to the project for the re-routing of the Sateska River and the plan for revised route for the railway Corridor VIII in its section between the North Macedonian and Albanian borders, on the attributes of OUV of the property according to the Guidance and Toolkit on Impact Assessments in World Heritage Context;
- 12. Regrets that, despite initial efforts by the States Parties to redress threats to the property, tangible outcomes are yet to be achieved and risk being undermined by ever-emerging threats and lack of a coherent vision shared by all actors to conserve the property's OUV and strongly urges the States Parties to implement immediate emergency measures to address existing threats and prevent emerging threats from negatively impacting the OUV of the property;
- 13. <u>Further requests</u> the States Parties to strengthen their transboundary coordination and cooperation in addressing the threats to the property by:
 - a) Enhancing reciprocal communication and coordination about plans and projects that may impact the attributes underlying the property's OUV,
 - b) Continuing improvements to the resourcing of the transboundary working group established for the preparation of the Strategic Recovery Plan with the mandate to support the operational implementation of the plan;
- 14. Requests the States Parties to invite, as a matter of urgency, a joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to examine the effective implementation of the immediate emergency measures, the level of mobilisation and coordination of all the stakeholders involved as well as the implementation of the recommendations of the 2020 mission and the repeated requests of the Committee, and to assess the overall state of conservation of the property;
- 15. Requests the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, a revised draft of the Strategic Recovery Plan and a joint updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilisation to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

LATIN AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

105. Quebrada de Humahuaca (Argentina) (C 1116)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.105

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.62** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- Takes note of the advances in the establishment of the updated Management Plan for the property and <u>urges</u> the State Party to finalize it and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts of the State Party to align methodologically the management of the "Quebrada Grande-Las Escaleras", segment of the Qhapac Nan, Andean roads system with the Quebrada de Humahuaca and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue these lines of action in the framework of the finalization of the updated Management Plan for the property;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that the finalization of the Disaster Risk Management Plan should be achieved by end 2023 and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit this Plan to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for review as soon as it is available;
- 6. Reiterates its request that a Heritage Impact Assessment and an Environmental Impact Assessment for the Jujuy-La Quiaca train project are urgently finalized according to the Guidance and toolkit for impact assessments in a World Heritage Context and submitted to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before works commence or any irreversible decision is made:
- 7. <u>Also reiterates</u> that the projects foreseen at the Rio Grande should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for technical review, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before works commence or any irreversible decision is made:
- 8. Acknowledges that the State Party has notified the availability of the government of the Jujuy province to invite the Reactive Monitoring mission to the property and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to urgently make the necessary arrangements for this mission, in order to assess its current state of conservation and the effectiveness of management mechanisms, and to evaluate the impact of the planned and ongoing projects on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 9. <u>Welcomes</u> the work of the State Party towards the establishment of parameters for the development of a sustainable tourism strategy and in the field of training of guards in charge of sites of cultural value, and encourages it to continue these lines of action;

- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 106. Qhapaq Ñan, Andean Road System (Argentina, Bolivia (Plurinational State of), Chile, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru) (C 1459)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.106

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.162** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the intention of the States Parties to proceed with a second phase of the 'Support to the reinforcement of the participative management structure of the Qhapaq Ñan project, in light of the good results from the first phase of the project;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties for their excellent coordination through the Pro Tempore Secretariat, in light of their participation in the third cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise and for their collaboration on all pending tasks, on the update of the International Management System, and ensuring the continuity of the management of the property:
- 5. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> of the update of the International Management System of the property, which foresees a common methodology for mandatory use for all components of the property, adapted to national conditions, based on the pillars of the Management Structure and the Management System Permanent Monitoring Matrix;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the development of version 2.0 of the Kamayuq mobile application and the testing of the AYLLU application with the inclusion of factors established for the third cycle of Periodic Reporting;
- 7. Also takes note with appreciation of the development and update of a number of technical documents based on the results of the international workshop on risk preparedness and disaster management held in October 2018, and encourages the States Parties to continue producing and updating documentation on risk preparedness and disaster management;
- 8. Expresses its satisfaction for the ongoing implementation of "Plan for the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage associated with the Qhapaq Ñan", for the inclusion of guidelines for the protection and monitoring of the tangible and intangible attributes of the property in the updated Management System, for the "Common Guidelines for the realization of Heritage Impact Assessments" (HIA), and for the development of a number of diverse projects and educational and outreach initiatives which demonstrates strong commitment to the conservation of the property;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> that an HIA related to the construction of International Airport of Chinchero Cusco, has been completed and is currently under review by the Project Management Office, <u>reiterates</u> that HIA's should be prepared and submitted before any projects are approved or works undertaken, expresses its serious concern that in the meantime works

- at the airport are progressing and <u>urgently requests</u> the State Party to submit the HIA to the World Heritage Centre and to the Advisory Bodies for technical review as soon as possible;
- 10. Requests the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

107. Tiwanaku: Spiritual and Political Centre of the Tiwanaku Culture (Bolivia (Plurinational State of)) (C 567rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.107

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.63** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to implement the decisions of the World Heritage Committee and the recommendations of the Advisory Bodies; as well as the assurance of the State Party that priority will be given to conservation actions over the opening of new excavation zones;
- 4. Requests the State Party to submit the Risk Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as soon as it becomes available;
- 5. <u>Appreciates</u> that the management authority of the property (CIAAAT) signed an agreement with the Military Geographic Institute (IGM) to confirm the boundaries of the World Heritage property and the buffer zone;
- 6. Reiterates, however, its concern that the actual arrangements for the zoning and control of the buffer zone do not guarantee its adequate protection and management, particularly in view of the urban pressure of the village of Tiwanaku and urges the State Party to:
 - a) Proceed as a matter of priority with the mapping of the boundaries of the property and the buffer zone by the IGM,
 - b) Define urban and rural zones and assess the implications of such designation on the conservation and management of the property and the buffer zone,
 - c) Strengthen, to the extent possible, the authority of CIAAAT over the buffer zone and proceed with the necessary arrangements with the municipality of Tiwanaku, to agree on the regulations for the use and control of the buffer zone,
 - d) Proceed urgently with the extension of the buffer zone and the submission of a formal Minor Boundary Modification request, as per Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 7. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> for the collaboration and communication with the local authorities and communities, the maintenance activities and the preparation of manuals and regulations for the adequate conservation and use of the property;

- 8. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to review the human and financial resources that will be required for the full implementation of the management and conservation plans and explore additional resources and international cooperation for this purpose;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

108. Brasilia (Brazil) (C 445)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.108

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.63** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Notes with satisfaction that the draft Preservation Plan for the Urban Ensemble of Brasilia (PPCUB), which was evaluated by IPHAN, reviewed by the State Department of Urban Development and Housing (SEDUH), and sent to a public hearing, will be submitted to the Legislative City Parliament of the Federal District for approval, and requests the State Party to submit the plan, together with IPHAN's technical opinion, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before its submission to the Legislative City Parliament;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that some progress has been made in the elaboration of the Management Plan, but <u>further notes with concern</u> that the foreseen timeframe has been altered, in part due to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to launch the participatory process and to establish the Working Group for the elaboration of the Management Plan;
- 5. Also notes with satisfaction that the projects which could jeopardise the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) have been halted until the PPCUB is approved and also requests the State Party to submit the documentation concerning those projects for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies at the earliest possible stage and for the procedures for a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to be included in the Management Plan;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> that new laws concerning the occupation of public and private areas have been passed over the last two years and in the case that new regulatory instruments are required, <u>further requests</u> the State Party to consider the provisions of the IPHAN Ordinance 166/2016 and the PPCUB;
- 7. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the heritage education activities carried out by IPHAN in the framework of the Cooperation Agreement with the Secretariat of Education of the Federal District:
- 8. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to fully implement the recommendations of the 2012 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission;

9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

109. Settlement and Artificial Mummification of the Chinchorro Culture in the Arica and Parinacota Region (Chile) (C 1634)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.109

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.48** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the official approval of the property's Management Plan (2020-2026), the improvements concerning site preparation, the advances in the resolution of property disputes, the awareness-raising and training activities carried out with members of the community, and the steps taken to make the management structure of the property more inclusive and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue with these efforts;
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> the reported growth of the illegal settlement in component 03, Desembocadura de Camarones, the impact on the edge of the southern terrace of component 03 through the installation of underground fibre optics, as well as the looting, animal activity and solid waste disposal in component 01, Faldeos del Morro, and <u>requests</u> information on the steps taken to avoid or mitigate future impacts;
- 5. Reminds the State Party of the importance of an integrated management plan and monitoring structure and requests information on their functioning;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the information on the non-compliance with current regulations by the poultry farms located in the Camarones River valley and <u>urges</u> the State Party to follow-up to solve the issue
- 7. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to advance the Arica Communal Regulatory Plan, as well as the process of amending the current legislation on cultural heritage (Law No. 17,288 on National Monuments) with elements of participatory processes and indigenous consultation and, explore the possibility of including the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) process in the regulatory and/or legislative framework of the property;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to provide updated information on the agreement and timetable required to relocate the illegal settlement in component 03, Desembocadura de Camarones, to a location outside of the buffer zone;
- 9. Further requests the State Party to provide the following information:
 - Updated topographical maps (with the new delimitations and buffer zones) which show the location of the archaeological sites and areas of potential interest (zonification),
 - b) The legal situation of component 03, Desembocadura de Camarones,

- c) The treatment of surface findings,
- d) The stabilization or backfilling of open archaeological excavations in component 03,
- e) The advances of the development of the new Regional Anthropological Museum;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

110. Churches of Chiloé (Chile) (C 971bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.110

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision 44 COM 7B.164 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress on the preparation of the "Comprehensive Plan for the Protection of the Churches Environments", and <u>requests</u> the State Party to complete the procedure for Achao, Rilan, Dalcahue, consider resuming Caguach for the submission of Minor Boundary Modifications to the proposed buffer zones and to submit "Intervention Guidelines" for all Typical Zones of the property for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the advances made to achieve the "Integrated Management Plan" (IMP), of the property, <u>notes with satisfaction</u> that the establishment or the "Cuidemos Chiloe Plan" is coordinated through an intra-ministerial committee and <u>urges</u> the State Party to complete the draft IMP and submit it for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before its approval;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the progress made by the State Party in conservation actions, as well as the conclusion of the "Inventory of Religious Imagery", the "Public Areas Program" and the "Small Towns Program" but <u>regrets</u> that the "Castro by-pass Project" still suffers delays for its completion and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to conclude its execution;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to conclude the "Risk Management Plan" and submit it for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before approval;
- 7. Regrets the lack of progress, since the 2013 Reactive monitoring mission, on mitigation measures and in the legal protection of the wider settings of the property, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to urgently submit effective mitigation measures, including the expansion of the Typical Zone, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, prior to their implementation;
- 8. <u>Considers</u> that in the absence of any mitigation measures for the shopping mall, the actual threats to its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) caused by its construction persist;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a progress report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation

of the above, particularly regarding the shopping mall in Castro, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

111. Historic Quarter of the Seaport City of Valparaíso (Chile) (C 959rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.111

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.165** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the continued support of the Inter-American Development Bank and of the timely implementation of the scheduled meetings and studies and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre complete information on the activities carried out in this framework:
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the establishment of the agreement between the municipality of Valparaíso and the Ministry of Cultures, the Arts and Heritage, <u>encourages</u> the State Party to concretely implement the agreement and <u>also requests</u> it to report to the World Heritage Centre on the results obtained in its framework;
- 5. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the creation of the "Municipal Corporation for Heritage Site Administration", with the mandate of promoting and strengthening public-private partnerships, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to report to the World Heritage Centre on the decisions and measures that will be taken by this "Municipal Corporation for Heritage Site Administration":
- 6. <u>Also takes note</u> of the third stage of the development of a technical platform for the risk management of the site, and that the start of the elaboration of the Risk Management Plan is foreseen in 2023, and <u>requests</u> that, once completed, the plan be submitted for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the further progress in the creation and provision of Regional Heritage Directorates under the National Cultural Heritage Service and <u>urges</u> the State Party to reinforce the technical office of the National Monuments Council;
- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> the new Paseo Barón project focusing on the creation of a public park that will enhance the social relation between the coast and the city, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to report to the World Heritage Centre on the excavation works expected to be launched in 2023 for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> the ongoing implementation of a programme of restoration and conservation of nine elevators and a number of historic buildings and <u>also urges</u> the State Party to accelerate, as a matter of urgent priority, the implementation of restoration and conservation activities, and to extend them to all the buildings of the property in need of urgent rehabilitation, also as a means to reverse the recognized depopulation trends in the site, in line with the recommendations of the World Heritage Centre Advisory mission of November 2022:

- 10. <u>Also notes</u> the abandonment of the previous Terminal 2 extension project and <u>furthermore requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for review, as soon as available, the complete information on the alternative project to be defined in 2023;
- 11. <u>Also commends</u> the State Party for the establishment of the agreement between the Municipality of Valparaíso and Valparaíso Port Company to ensure participation and synergy among the main stakeholders concerned by port accessibility and port-city interaction issues;
- 12. <u>Further commends</u> the State Party for having invited an Advisory mission of the World Heritage Centre, to facilitate institutions and civil society consultations on all matters linked to the conservation of the site and the implementation of the decisions of the Committee and <u>again requests</u> the State Party to fully implement the mission's recommendations;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

112. Port, Fortresses and Group of Monuments, Cartagena (Colombia) (C 285)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.112

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision 43 COM 7B.167 adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the measures undertaken for the implementation of the Special Management and Protection Plan (PEMP) for the Walled Enclosure and the Castle of San Felipe (PEMP-MURCA), and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue with these efforts;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the finalization of the PEMP for the Historic Urban Complex (PEMP-CH) and the PEMP for the Fortified Cultural Landscape of Cartagena de Indias (PEMP-FORT BAHIA), and <u>further welcomes</u> the articulation of these plans with other existing regulation but <u>regrets</u> that these documents have not been approved yet, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to approve these documents as a priority and enable their implementation;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit an up-to-date map of the property as inscribed in 1984 and, in accordance with paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines, a Minor Boundary Modification request to define the buffer zone(s);
- 6. <u>Welcomes moreover</u> the actions undertaken to address the impact of the Aquarela project on the Outstanding Universal Value, and also <u>urges</u> the State Party to continue the processes to resolve the outstanding legal actions, and <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre the proposals for the restitution of the public space;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

113. Precolumbian Chiefdom Settlements with Stone Spheres of the Diquís (Costa Rica) (C 1453)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.113

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.65** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for continuing the activities related to heritage education and participatory management mechanisms with youth, local communities and indigenous groups despite the restrictions derived from the COVID-19 pandemic, and <u>encourages</u> the continuation of these initiatives:
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> that the cooperative project with the University of Costa Rica for joint management activities with some of the communities near the sites could not be executed on the established timeframe and <u>requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed, should the project be resumed;
- 5. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> that the activities related to interpretation and signage of the property have continued and that four spheres located in the Finca 6 archaeological monument were restored;
- 6. Also takes note that the regulation of the buffer zone remains pending, and that the risk management plan is not finished yet, and also requests the State Party to reach an agreement among the relevant parties and stakeholders and to keep the World Heritage Centre informed about the outcomes of these projects;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> that the High-Level Commission to ensure the adequate protection of the property has met several times, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to reach the establishment of a consolidated and multidisciplinary management unit for the property;
- 8. <u>Further takes note</u> that the feasibility of the Southern International Airport project is still pending and that the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), to be conducted in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, has not yet been carried out, and <u>takes note furthermore</u> that the hydroelectrical project remains indefinitely suspended;
- 9. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of any changes in the status of these two projects, and to submit any relevant documentation and studies undertaken, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. Requests furthermore the State Party to provide further information on the nature, scale of the upgrading of the Palmar Sur regional airport located in close proximity to three of the property's archaeological sites, in order to determine any possible impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

114. Colonial City of Santo Domingo (Dominican Republic) (C 526)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.114

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.66** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- Welcomes the preparation of carrying capacity studies for the historic centre, and that the second phase of the Integral Program for Tourism and Urban Development of the Colonial City of Santo Domingo (PIDTUCCSD) has commenced and that it ensures a joint governance structure from the Ministry of Tourism (MITUR), the Ministry of Culture (MINC) and the National District Council (ADN);
- 4. <u>Considers</u> the strengthening of the National Directorate of Monumental Heritage (DNPM) and the Cultural Heritage and Historic Centre Directorate (DPCH) of high importance for the appropriate management of the property;
- 5. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> for the broad programme of activities undertaken by the national and local authorities during the 2019-2022 period and for the activities foreseen in the Action Plan 2022-2023;
- 6. Regrets the delays in the revision of the Law for Protection, Safeguarding and Development of Cultural Heritage, as well as of the submission of the Minor Boundary Modifications concerning the proposed buffer zone and <u>urges</u> the State Party to pay the highest possible priority to the matters;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress in the certification of sustainable tourism and carrying capacity studies and the implementation of a Medical Emergency Plan;
- 8. <u>Notes</u> that capacity building in risk management is underway and that the preparation of the Risk and Disaster Management Plan is foreseen, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed and submit the Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Also notes</u> that the reconstruction and restoration of the Hotel Frances and the restoration of the Santa Barbara Church and its surroundings have been completed, <u>regrets</u> that the Advisory Bodies did not have the opportunity to provide advice on these projects in due time and <u>reiterates its request</u> for additional information be provided regarding the conservation methods used in historic buildings within the property;
- 10. <u>Further notes</u> that the stabilization of the ruins of the Convent of San Francisco are being executed and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of further developments concerning the restoration and future use of the complex;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

115. City of Quito (Ecuador) (C 2)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.115

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.67** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Takes note of the efforts accomplished in the finalization of the management plan of the property (entitled Partial Plan for the Comprehensive Development of the Historic Centre PPDI-CHQ) and its harmonization, through the development of a Comprehensive Master Plan for the heritage in the Metropolitan District of Quito, with the Territorial Planning and Development Plan for the Metropolitan District of the City of Quito (PMDOT) and the Land Use and Management Plan; but expresses its regret that to date the PPDI-CHQ, has not yet been finalized, and urges the State Party to continue the harmonization process and to finalize, as soon as possible, both the PPDI-CHQ and the PMDOT and in view of their timely submission to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the draft of the new ordinance to replace Ordinance 260, which provides the legal framework for the implementation of the PPDI-CHQ and <u>recommends</u> to the State Party to consider the observations made in ICOMOS' technical review before proceeding with its formal approval;
- 5. Also takes note of the advances, regretfully limited by the COVID-19 pandemic, accomplished by the State Party in the update of the Disaster Risk Management Plan, and urges the State Party to finalize it, in light of the recommendations of ICOMOS' technical review of September 2020, and to submit this plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as possible;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the geotechnical monitoring processes carried out at the metro stations and tunnels, the complete stabilization within the acceptable settlement ranges established for the site, and the establishment of a programme to monitor the impact of the pedestrian flows and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue these lines of action and to also consider the signage around the metro station in order to limit its visual impact in the historic environment of the San Francisco Square;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.

116. Archaeological Site of Panamá Viejo and Historic District of Panamá (Panama) (C 790bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.116

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.168** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> that the State Party submitted a nomination dossier that would transform the sites into component parts of a serial property under the name of "Colonial Transisthmian Route of Panamá" to the World Heritage Centre;
- 4. Requests the State Party to provide reports on:
 - a) The status of all planned, ongoing or recently finalized construction projects,
 - b) The way these projects are affected by the new legal and planning framework,
 - c) Their (potential) impact on the newly defined values of the property components within the framework of the "Colonial Transisthmian Route of Panamá";
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> a detailed account of the state of conservation of the main elements of the two property components, with a clear definition of baseline data to which any changes can be compared and evaluated:
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to finalize the processes necessary to make new laws, plans (Decision **44 COM 7B.167**, paragraphs 7 a-d) and programmes operative and <u>further</u> requests a report on the advances;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

117. Historic Centre of Lima (Peru) (C 500bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.117

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.169** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- Welcomes the progress made by the State Party to address the recommendations of the Committee and the 2017 Advisory mission and <u>invites</u> the State Party to continue their implementation as well as those emanating from the Advisory mission of November 2022;

- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> that to date no appropriate Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) have been completed for major infrastructural works within the World Heritage property and its buffer zone, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to complete the HIAs for all components and submit these for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies once they become available, particularly regarding:
 - a) The High-Capacity Segregated Corridor (COSAC),
 - b) The Metro Lines 2 and 3,
 - c) The Linea Amarilla;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the creation of pedestrian areas and the resurfacing of street pavements and <u>recommends</u> the State Party to take the necessary measures to control traffic access and the use of empty lots for parking spaces;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the progress in the implementation of the Master Plan and <u>recommends</u> that a Socio-Economic Development Plan be developed to ensure the full and integrated implementation of all the dimensions of the Plan;
- 7. Reiterates its recommendation that an autonomous management authority be formally designated, <u>urges</u> the State Party to prepare a Management Plan that ensures the full participation of all relevant governmental institutions and civil society through the establishment of the Inter-ministerial Special Commission and working groups that are foreseen in the Master Plan and <u>stresses</u> that the appropriate communication with and participation of all stakeholders are necessary conditions for the successful recuperation and revitalization of the historical centre;
- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> the Special Landscape Project of the Rimac River, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit further plans and studies, including relevant HIAs, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as they become available;
- 9. <u>Notes</u> that a new project for a cable car on the Cerro Cristobal is being developed and requests the State Party to submit further plans and studies, including relevant HIAs, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as they become available;
- 10. Also notes that the execution of the project for the recuperation of the square of San Francisco has been halted and requests the State Party to review the project proposal in light of the recommendations of the Technical Review of March 2022 that endorses the removal of the fence that was erected in 1987 but expressed serious reservations about the reconstruction or reinterpretation of the fences that were demolished in 1871;
- 11. <u>Further notes</u> the submission of a minor boundary modification to adjust the delimitation of the World Heritage property and its buffer zone;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

118. Historical Centre of the City of Arequipa (Peru) (C 1016)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.118

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.69** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Noting</u> that a new Master Plan 2022-2032 has been prepared and is now in the approval process, <u>urges</u> the State Party to approve the Master Plan 2022-2032, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in case any modification would be introduced during the approval process of the Metropolitan Development Plan 2022-2042;
- 4. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed as soon as the Master Plan is approved and to provide information about the measures that will be taken to ensure its implementation, in particular the creation of an inter-institutional body and the provisions of human and financial resources, that will be made for its operations;
- 5. Reiterates the urgency to proceed with the submission of a minor boundary modification in accordance with Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines to formalise the boundaries of the property and its buffer zone;
- 6. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to conclude the declaration as national heritage of the Archaeological Landscape of the Lari-Lari-Los Tucos Ravine, the Archaeological Cultural Landscape of Toccrahuasi and Carmen Alto and the Cultural and Archaeological Landscape of the Chilina River Valley and Las Rocas Ecological Park;
- 7. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue its public awareness activities among local communities and residents;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to ensure the full implementation of the mitigation measures included in the 2017 Heritage Impact Assessment of the Chilina Bridge and the Via Troncal Interconectadora and the recommendations of the 2014 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to ensure the preservation of the future buffer zone;
- 9. <u>Welcomes</u> the decision to abandon the pedestrian circulation project at the Plaza Mayor and Salaverry-Malecón Socobaya Viaduct,
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2025**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

119. Historic Inner City of Paramaribo (Suriname) (C 940rev)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.119

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.70** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the designs of the Waterfornt of the property, revised in conformity with the recommendations of ICOMOS' technical reviews, and the launch of the Environmental and Social Impact Analysis (ESIA), which will inform the final design of the Waterfront, as well as the planning of a new Paramaribo Urban Rehabilitation Programme (PURP), with the Inter-American Development Bank to start in 2024, and <u>requests</u> that extensive information in its regard be submitted to the World heritage Centre as soon as possible;
- 4. Expresses its serious regret that no action has been taken concerning the extension of the boundaries of the property to include a 50-meter strip along the river, nor concerning the draft extension of the boundaries of the buffer zone, and urges the State Party to submit them as a Minor Boundary Modification in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 5. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> of the approval of the Historic Inner City of Paramaribo World Heritage City Management Plan 2020-2024 by the Council of Ministers and the initial budget provided for its implementation and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure its effective implementation and financial support;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the rehabilitation of some 15 public and private historic buildings demolished or otherwise destroyed by fire or decay, the reconstruction of the former National Assembly Building, the restoration of three government-owned buildings in line with suggestions of ICOMOS' technical reviews and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide full photographic or graphic documentation of the reconstructed National Assembly Building and restoration of Waterkant 30 and 32;
- 7. Equally welcomes the initiatives to raise awareness of the population and of owners on the importance of the buildings, as well as the initiatives to manage parking in the historic city center, and encourages the State Party to restore government-owned historic buildings still needing urgent rehabilitation, to take adequate legal measures with regard to illegal destruction of historic buildings, and to continue the public awareness-raising campaign;
- 8. <u>Appreciates</u> the review and revision of the legal framework of the Building Committee and the Monuments Commission in view of protecting the historic inner city and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as possible;
- 9. Notes that the proposed new Assembly Hall behind the recently reconstructed buildings at Henck Arronstraat 2-4 and 6 would pose an adverse and irreversible impact on the the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), recommends to the State Party to study alternative options, including the refurbishing of the present location at the Onafhankelijkheidsplein (Independence Square), and in case of any further development at the premises of Henck Arronstraat 2-4 and 6, to respect the earlier agreed Master Plan and the recommendations of previous technical reviews, and urges the State Party to undertake Heritage Impact

Assessments (HIAs), in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, on the housing of the National Assembly at its present or alternative locations and submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as they become available;

- 10. Also notes the technical reviews of four additional projects (two restoration projects, a new State Council building, the rehabilitation of the Palm Garden and the construction of a hotel at the Kleine Combeweg) undertaken by ICOMOS and requests furthermore the State Party to take the recommendations of these reviews into consideration, provide additional documentation as requested and enter into consultations with the Advisory Bodies as appropriate, and requests moreover that the State Party ensure that no permits are delivered or irreversible actions are taken in the meantime;
- 11. <u>Finally, requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

AFRICA

120. Sudanese style mosques in northern Côte d'Ivoire (Côte d'Ivoire) (C 1648)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.120

- 1. Having considered document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.33** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the initiatives undertaken and resources provided by the State Party to address the eight recommendations made by the Committee at the time of inscription, in particular the urgent work undertaken to stabilise mosques and reverse inappropriate interventions, the appointment of a property manager, the staffing of the management body, a training course for masons and a consultation process with local communities for the enlargement of property boundaries and buffer zones;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the national priority given to the conservation and sustainable development of the eight mosques and the longer-term aim to establish a guild of traditional masons to facilitate and perpetuate the transmission of traditional Sudanese building practices;
- 5. Notes the Action Plan 2023-2025 that has been developed to provide the framework for activities needed to reverse the decline of traditional conservation practices, strengthen protection, foster traditional practices and promote sustainable development, and also notes that the resources to deliver this Plan will be provided mainly by the State Party and partly by International Assistance, if approved;

- 6. <u>Further notes</u> the State Party's acknowledgement that much more needs to be done to address the Committee's requests and <u>urges</u> the State Party to maintain the necessary momentum to ensure the Action Plan can be delivered on time;
- 7. <u>Considers</u> that the sustainable functioning of the management systems and the development of Conservation Plans for the property and for each component mosque need to be given high priority for available funding;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit the revised Management Plan or other management tools to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Notes with concern</u> the impact of severe weather on three mosques and <u>requests</u> the State Party to develop weather monitoring indicators for all component sites and also a Risk Preparedness Strategy for such extreme events;
- 10. <u>Invites</u> the international community to consider providing further necessary support for the efficient implementation of the Committee's recommendations and to strengthen the sustainable development of the property;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

121. Historic Town of Grand-Bassam (Côte d'Ivoire) (C 1322rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.121

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.2** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party for having provided the report on the inventory of the immovable heritage of the historic town of Grand-Bassam and the Conservation and Management Plan for the property for a technical evaluation by the Advisory Bodies, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to integrate the observations of this evaluation when they become available;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the actions taken for the conservation, management and promotion of the property, including regular inspections of the site by the management body and the Town Hall of Grand-Bassam and the rehabilitation and restoration initiatives carried out on several heritage buildings, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue these efforts, notably by:
 - Updating the site intervention guide, a first edition of which was prepared by the CRAterre-ENSAG organization, to communicate architectural and urban prescriptions, particularly for private buildings,
 - b) Reinforcing measures to raise community awareness of the need to conserve and enhance the property as part of ongoing and future rehabilitation activities,
 - c) Further developing Public/Private Partnership (PPP) programmes and inform the World Heritage Centre of any major intervention on the built environment, in

- accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, in order to prevent any possible impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property,
- d) Improving the intervention capacities of the Executive Secretariat by strengthening its own financial and technical resources;
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the actions undertaken, such as the future domiciliation of the property's management body in the Officers' Mess and the creation of a museum of contemporary Ivorian art in the former Post and Customs House, and requests the State Party to broaden this approach by integrating the 2011 Recommendation concerning the Historic Urban Landscape into urban planning and into the management and promotion of the property;
- 6. <u>Reiterates</u> its thanks to the Government of Norway for its financial support for the implementation of a programme for the preservation of the property;
- 7. Expresses its concern at the fact that the work to open the mouth of the Comoé River as part of the project to safeguard and enhance the Cocody Bay and Ebrié Lagoon (PABC) is progressing without consultation between the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, the Advisory Bodies and the project managers to discuss the project's conformity with the prerogatives of the Convention, as requested by the Committee at its extended 44th session, and reiterates its request to the State Party to submit the PABC to the World Heritage Centre, as soon as possible, for review by the Advisory Bodies so that solutions can be found to adapt the approach to the recommendations provided in the report of the October 2019 emergency mission;
- 8. <u>Takes note</u> of the threats posed by the reported proliferation of aquatic plants in the lagoon water body, and <u>recommends</u> that the State Party, in particular, develop a plan for the control of invasive species and clean up the water body according to the severity of the proliferation on the maintenance of water quality;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

122. Asmara: A Modernist African City (Eritrea) (C 1550)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.122

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.117** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Acknowledges the progress made in finalising the detailed Urban Conservation Master Plan (UCMP) and the Asmara Planning and Technical Regulations (APTR) and encourages the State Party to continue its endeavours to designate the property as a protected area under the auspices of the Cultural and Natural Heritage Proclamation of 2015;

- 4. <u>Notes</u> the State Party's commitment to developing the UCMP using the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) approach and <u>welcomes</u> the proposal to develop the Integrated Historic Parameter (IHP) to ensure the protection of the property, promotion of socio-economic development for its resident, and enable sustainable urban development for its broader urban context and its geographic setting;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the clarification provided by the State Party on the roles and functions of the stakeholders and <u>requests</u> the State Party to improve the structure of the Asmara Heritage Project (AHP) to enhance its responsibilities to conserve, manage and promote the property but also to maintain its link with institutions dealing with cultural development and urban planning and development;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to continue working with the World Heritage Centre to develop the Local Economic Development Plan (LEDP) with a view to supporting the implementation of the UCMP and providing a mechanism to ensure a viable financial resource for sustainable conservation of the property;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to provide an update report on the state of conservation of the 14 historical buildings identified in 2018 as an initial priority conservation and restoration phase to the World Heritage Centre;
- 8. Reiterates its invitation to the State Party to seek international financial and technical support towards the preparation of detailed conservation proposals, including criteria, methods, and materials to be used for the conservation and restoration of the 14 historical buildings identified in 2018 and to submit such proposals to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue with the mobilisation, engagement and capacity building of stakeholders and rightsholders, also with regards to managing the historic urban landscape and to the physical conservation of the built attributes of the property;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

123. Aksum (Ethiopia) (C 15)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.123

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.4** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Expresses its deep concern</u> over reports of violence against civilians, looting of cultural artefacts and goods, as well as damage to structures in the property;
- 4. Also notes with relief that the conflict was formally declared ended in November 2022;

- 5. <u>Calls on</u> all parties who were party to the conflict, as well as the international community, to ensure the safeguarding of the property, assist in the return of cultural artefacts and goods to the property and protect its archaeological and built attributes;
- 6. Requests again, in light of various accounts of reports on looting, destruction and damage in the Tigray region, that the State Party:
 - Assesses in detail, and in close cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and the Secretariats of all relevant UNESCO Culture Conventions, the impact of the conflict on the cultural heritage of the region, and in particular on the conservation and management of the property,
 - b) Ensures the safeguarding of the property through protective measures,
 - c) Engages, where necessary, in undertaking an emergency response through targeted actions, including by creating a full inventory of cultural artefacts and goods of the property and their state of conservation;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to carry out a comprehensive assessment of the state of conservation of the property and identify measures needed to ensure the conservation management and protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, as soon as the security situation allows;
- 8. <u>Calls</u> for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through International Assistance, to implement the short- and medium-term measures to improve the state of conservation of the property;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, a report on the state of conservation of the property, including as requested in Decision **44 COM 7B.4** a state of conservation and damage assessment of the archaeological and built attributes of the property, an assessment of the damage to or loss of cultural artefacts and goods at the property, an update on progress on the implementation of past requests and on the steps taken to implement the recommendations above mentioned, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

124. Lower Valley of the Omo (Ethiopia) (C 17)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.124

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.4** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the ongoing work to develop maps of the Lower Valley of the Omo, to clarify a boundary for the World Heritage property and to propose a buffer zone and <u>notes</u> the support of a European Union-funded project and the involvement of the Ethiopian Geospatial Agency and Federal and Regional stakeholders;

- 4. <u>Recalls</u> the need for maps to be based on an assessment of fossil-bearing sediments, in order to more clearly define areas of potential archaeological importance, and the recommendations of the 2015 mission that management strategies should respect a visually coherent landscape with no development between visible outcrops and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit larger-scale maps for review by the Advisory Bodies, together with evidence from archaeological surveys upon which they are based and related protection and management proposals;
- 5. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for updating the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), including an associated community consultation on social and environmental impacts and benefits of the Kuraz Sugar Development Project (KSDP), and that this has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> that the State Party intends to update the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) developed in 2017 on the basis of the proposed boundary delineation, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the updated HIA for review once it is finalised;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to continue its dialogue with the State Party of Kenya to accelerate the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) process for assessing the potential impacts of the Gibe III dam and Kuraz project on the Lake Turkana basin including on the attributes of OUV of both the Lower Valley of the Omo (Ethiopia) and Lake Turkana (Kenya) properties, based on the established mechanism of Joint Technical Experts Panel, as requested by the Committee since 2012, and <u>thanks</u> the Government of Norway for its generous financial support for this SEA;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

125. Forts and Castles, Volta, Greater Accra, Central and Western Regions (Ghana) (C 34)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.125

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.5** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP), the quick action in rehabilitating the damage that occurred at the Fort at British Komenda, the conduction of consolidation works at Fort Amsterdam, and the State Party's commitment to provide details of the Elmina Iconic Project and the Fort Anthony project for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, before any decisions are made on their implementation, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party of the importance to ensure such consultation prior to all major interventions at the property's components, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the application of impact assessments as a tool to safeguard the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of this property, the project to delineate the boundaries

- and define buffer zones for the components of the property, and the survey of the structural condition of all components of the property;
- 5. <u>Further welcomes</u> the contribution of international partners, in particular the governments of the Netherlands and France, to the State Party's activities, notably for the rehabilitation of the Ussher Fort Slavery museum, the consolidation of Fort Amsterdam and the development of signage at the property's components;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to implement the IMP and <u>requests</u> that the State Party provide a report on the effect of this implementation in its next state of conservation report;
- 7. <u>Expresses its concern</u> at the continuing deterioration of the integrity of the components of the property, the continued reports of urban encroachment and inability of the State Party to halt projects that may damage the OUV of the property;
- 8. <u>Also expresses its concern</u> at the State Party's reports of its lack of resources to execute projects to improve the conservation and management of the property;
- 9. <u>Recalling</u> that international assistance could be considered to this effect, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Create a disaster risk management plan for the property,
 - b) Provide details of the establishment of the Heritage Fund, or other funding mechanisms for each Fort and Castle,
 - c) Consider the creation of a scientific and a technical committee to guide the conservation and maintenance of the property,
 - d) Urgently develop a plan for the stabilization and restoration of the attributes,
 - e) Implement impact assessment procedures in accordance with the provisions of the Operational Guidelines and general development authorizations in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context,
 - f) Develop a policy to manage urban encroachment,
 - g) Expedite the development of an inventory that contains documentation and information critical to the maintenance, restoration, and interpretation of the property;
- 10. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to urgently invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess the state of conservation of all the components of the property; the efficacy of the protection and management system; the impacts of development projects at the property's components, in particular those at Elmina, Jamestown, Old Ningo and Axim; the progress on the implementation of the IMP; the implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 and 2020 missions; the progress in the delineation and protection of buffer zones; and the progress on the structural survey and planning to implement urgent remedial structural actions;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to develop an overview of all projects being planned in the vicinity of all components of the property and submit this to the World Heritage Centre in advance of the requested Reactive Monitoring mission to the property:
- 12. <u>Calls</u> for increased mobilization of the international community to provide more financial and technical support to the State Party, including through International Assistance, to implement the short and medium-term measures to improve the state of conservation of the property;

13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

126. Lamu Old Town (Kenya) (C 1055)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.126

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.6** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue to implement all the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> the efforts made by the State Party to address conservation issues at the property including the inventorying of the state of conservation of the built fabric of the property and <u>requests</u> that the State Party continue to strengthen enforcement of building controls to halt the deterioration, unpermitted development and use of inappropriate materials;
- 5. Regrets that the revised Management Plan, which takes into account the Lamu Port Southern Sudan-Ethiopia Transport (LAPSSET) project has not yet been completed;
- 6. <u>Underlines</u> the utmost urgency of:
 - a) Completing the mapping and survey of the condition of buildings and streetscapes,
 - b) Completing the clarification of boundaries of the property and putting in place a larger buffer zone to include all of Lamu Island, parts of Manda Island, and relevant mangroves belts in the area, as requested by the Committee numerous times in the past,
 - c) Completing the Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) and other relevant Environmental and Heritage Impact Assessments (EIAs and HIAs) related to the LAPSSET project taking into account both individual and cumulative impacts that the project and all of its sub-projects may have on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of this property as well as on the Lake Turkana National Parks World Heritage property;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> that an updated clearly delineated map of the property and its enlarged buffer zone be submitted to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for comment prior to formally submitting it to the World Heritage Committee as a minor boundary modification in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines and before it is adopted into the national and county planning systems;
- 8. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to complete the above-mentioned projects as soon as possible and to submit them and the revised Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to their formal adoption;

- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the efforts to include stakeholders and community in activities related to sustainable tourism for the property, and the efforts towards re-establishing the Lamu Heritage Committee;
- 10. <u>Also takes note</u> of the initiatives to set up a core corporate social responsibility programme in collaboration with the LAPSSET Corridor Development Authority and the County Government, and <u>also urges</u> the State Party to establish the mechanisms to ensure that sufficient funds are available for conservation at the property and heritage related projects:
- 11. <u>Further acknowledges</u> that the State Party has invited a joint World Heritage Centre/ICCROM/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property scheduled to take place in mid-2023, which will formulate recommendations for actions to be taken in order to address the numerous challenges the property is facing;
- 12. <u>Notes</u> that alternative solutions to the Lamu Coal Plant proposed to meet the electricity needs of the region were halted and <u>requests</u> that any proposed future development be subject to EIAs/HIAs to ensure that there are no negative impacts on the OUV of the property;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

127. Thimlich Ohinga Archaeological Site (Kenya) (C 1450rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.127

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **42 COM 8B.14** and **44 COM 7B.7** adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Welcomes the information provided by the State Party concerning the progress made to extend the buffer zone on the western side of the property boundary, encourages the State Party to ensure that the rights of land owners are respected in the processes of land acquisition, and requests the State Party to continue implementing the recommended extensions to the property boundary at its south-eastern end near the entrance to Koketch, and the extension and demarcation of the buffer zone, and to submit a proposal for minor boundary modification once these are in place;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the completion of an archaeological survey and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue documenting the cultural values of the property, including oral traditions;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> that the property is important for local artists and musicians and <u>commends</u> the reported activities' efforts to digitalise the property with a 360 degrees virtual tour and ensure continued community engagement, including involvement in its maintenance and in management decision-making;
- 6. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to continue to implement the monitoring system for the property, including indicators associated with visitor management issues, and invites it to

- provide details about the selection of indicators and reporting methodology to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Requests the State Party to continue to ensure that all planned projects or works, including infrastructure to support tourism, are subject to Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, and that information on any planned projects that could have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is forwarded to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines:
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

128. Aapravasi Ghat (Mauritius) (C 1227)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.128

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.119** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- Commends the State Party for the improvements that it has made in the protection and management of the property, notes with appreciation the State Party's reports on its institutional structures for stakeholder consultation and requests the State Party keep it informed of further steps taken to facilitate more frequent comprehensive stakeholder consultation;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> the submission of the archival survey on the Parc à Boulets, <u>further notes</u> the State Party's commitment to submit the results of the archaeological survey to the World Heritage Centre and <u>also requests</u> that the State Party submit the outcomes of the archaeological survey to the World Heritage Centre to be reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Notes furthermore with appreciation</u>, the progress made on the overarching Heritage Impact Assessment and Visual Impact Assessment for the project in the buffer zone, the State Party's commitment to continuing the dialogue with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and the submission of the outcomes of these assessments to the World Heritage Centre to be reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

129. Osun-Osogbo Sacred Grove (Nigeria) (C 1118)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.129

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.9** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the collaborative project between The National Commission for Museums and Monuments, CyArk, The Adunni Olorisa Trust (AOT) and Google Art & Culture, to digitally document the forty shrines and artworks within the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the digital documentation is supported by detailed information on the shrines and artworks in terms of materials, interventions related to their maintenance and repair, and changes over time;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the revision of the Management Plan and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit it for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to allow for an understanding of how it has addressed the various recommendations of the Committee over many years, as well as recommendations from the 2015 Reactive Monitoring mission, including those that still remain to be addressed;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the commitment of the Ataoja-in-Council to share revenue from the annual Osun festival for the conservation of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide details of this agreement and how it will be implemented to ensure that the festival sustainably supports the Sacred Grove on which it is based;
- 6. <u>Also notes</u> the intention to prepare plans for a new bridge to allow the diversion of the current road to the outskirts of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit details of the alignment of the proposed road, the design of the bridge and plans for downgrading the existing road;
- 7. <u>Expresses concern</u> that the waters of the sacred Osun River remain polluted and continue to be used by devotees of the annual Osun Festival and that insufficient actions have been taken to control activities upstream in order to improve water quality to an acceptable level, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to take concrete steps, together with traditional religious leaders, to avoid the use of the water by festival participants;
- 8. <u>Further expresses concern</u> at the alarming recent reports that link pollution to illegal and legal gold mining upstream, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit details of the most recent water analyses as soon as they are available as well as plans to address the causes of pollution;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> the State Party's continued use of cement in the repair of sculptures and <u>expresses concern</u> that an appropriate methodology for the conservation of sculptures has not been put in place which avoids the use of cement as this will ultimately lead to the recreation of sculptures and damage to the authenticity of the property, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to develop a Conservation Strategy for the property, as recommended by the 2015 mission, that will be adapted to the specificities of each of the sculptures and to submit this for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before any further work is undertaken;

- 10. Also expresses regrets that the State Party did not alert the World Heritage Centre to the collapse of the large Busanyin shrine as a result of flooding in 2019, and that no details are provided on immediate actions to protect its remains, put in place measures to document, restore the shrine and mitigate flooding, while information available online indicates that support from the United States of America has recently allowed the remains to be digitally documented, and that a Master Plan is to be drawn up for the restoration of the shrine and for flood protection measures, and requests the State Party to submit details of the Master Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before approval is given.
- 11. <u>Considers</u> that the sacred shrines, river and natural forest that make up the Osogbo Sacred Grove all remain extremely fragile and that the protection and management regimes are currently inadequate to address the key threats to the property that were known at the time of inscription, have been addressed by the Reactive Monitoring mission of 2015 and have been set out in several Committee decisions, and <u>further considers</u> that this fragility is exemplified by the collapse of the large Busanyin shrine and the lack of immediate actions to protect its remains or to put in place measures to mitigate flooding, by the lack of a Conservation Strategy, and by the continued pollution of the sacred Osun River, all of which pose threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 12. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> that the State Party has invited a joint World Heritage Centre/ICCROM/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property scheduled to take place in mid-2023 to address these concerns, which will formulate recommendations for actions to be taken in order to tackle the numerous challenges the property is facing:
- 13. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and on the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its OUV, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

130. Sukur Cultural Landscape (Nigeria) (C 938)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.130

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.10** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Commends the State Party on the progress it has made in ensuring security returns to the property and on the collaboration with international partners to address the challenges that emerged from the 2014 insurrection, and encourages the State Party to continue its work in ensuring security at the property, implementing conservation work, provisioning of essential community facilities and community engagement activities in the property;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the updating of the Management Plan for the property and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit this for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;

- 5. <u>Further commends</u> the State Party and national stakeholders, especially ICOMOS Nigeria, for conducting an assessment of the climate vulnerability of the property, but <u>also notes</u> the State Party's reports of climate change impacts and the challenges these are causing to the livelihoods of the inhabitants of the property and to the implementation of conservation measures due to the strain on the availability of traditional construction materials, and <u>welcomes</u> the actions undertaken by the State Party to monitor the situation;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> that a departure from traditional building forms and materials may adversely affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to develop, with the support of the Secretariat, Advisory Bodies and other partners, a comprehensive and inclusive strategy to define the contribution that traditional construction techniques make to the OUV of this property and, in collaboration with the Hidi-in Council and the local communities, including an appropriate policy, guideline and awareness programme for existing and future construction in the property, addressing also the opportunities for the development and promotion of employment, in particular of young people, related to traditional construction techniques;
- 7. <u>Notes furthermore</u> that the persisting security concerns in the area that continue to prevent an international expert's mission to the property, <u>also welcomes</u> the State Party's invitation for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to be carried out as soon as the necessary security clearance can be obtained;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

131. Island of Saint-Louis (Senegal) (C 956bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.131

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.120** adopted at its 44th extended session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the initiatives in favour of the rehabilitation of the private built heritage and the commitment of private owners through the support provided under the Rehabilitation Programme, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to pursue these efforts, in particular by persuading owners to commit and invest more in the rehabilitation of their property;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the strengthening of the SINDAR database through the establishment of a monitoring committee and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide more details on the updated state of developments and transformations in the urban fabric;
- 5. Requests the State Party, inter alia, to accelerate the elaboration of the first Management and Conservation Plan for the property, foreseen during 2023, and reminds it that it may submit a request for international assistance for this purpose by 31 October 2023 at the latest;

- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit the study on the impact on heritage and on the possible weakening of the quays following the development of the former Place Faidherbe, in addition to the global environmental study already carried out;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre details of the technical, financial and architectural aspects of the project to rehabilitate and extend the Great Mosque, and also requests the State Party to provide more details on the Island's emblematic squares currently being rehabilitated:
- 8. <u>Taking note</u> of the major issue represented by the Grande Tortue Ahmeyim (GTA) gas project, <u>thanks</u> the State Party for having submitted the Environmental and Social Impact Study to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) continue, with BP Petroleum, the consultations with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies begun in January 2021,
 - b) provide more information on the commitments made by the Ministry of the Environment and assurances that ecological and heritage issues will be taken into account.
 - raise awareness, through the Ministry of Culture and Historical Heritage, of all government bodies involved in heritage prerogatives to protect the property and which could be impacted by this project;
- 9. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the efforts made to combat coastal erosion in the framework of the Saint-Louis Coastal Protection Project (PPCS / <u>SLCPP</u>), notably the completion of the basaltic riprap structure and the various measures for the regular monitoring of the coastal protection of Saint-Louis, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide more information on these measures in order to better assess their effectiveness, which could also serve as an experience benefiting other World Heritage properties facing threats of coastal erosion;
- Reiterates its request to the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the overall state of conservation and progress made in implementing the recommendations of the 2017 mission;
- 11. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

132. Fossil Hominid Sites of South Africa (South Africa) (C 915bis)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.132

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.121** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),

- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the Integrated Management Plans (IMP) for all three components of the property, of the Integrated Management Plan Framework (IMPF), as well as the continued monitoring of the risk reduction and risk prevention interventions at the Fossil Hominid Sites of Sterkfontein, Swartkrans, Kromdraai and Environs (FHSSSKE) component;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that the implementation plan of the IMPF and the IMPs for the individual components are planned up to 2026 and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure the Joint Management Committee is established and functioning and to provide an interim monitoring report of the implementation of the IMPF, as an annex to its next state of conservation report, so that the efficacy of the IMPF can be assessed;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to expedite the development of the Western Basin Treatment Works Long-Term-Solution (LTS), and submit the following: A specialist committee report on the Western Basin Treatment Works LTS at the FHSSSKE component; A report on the choice of the option selected for implementation and the design specification; The design specifications for the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for LTS; for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as these are available and prior to implementation:
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party, with the support from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and with urgency and including through a Memorandum of Understanding with the local municipality, to address the function of the Percy Stewart Waste-Water Treatment Works to reduce the instances of bacteriological contamination in the surface water of the FHSSSKE component, and to continue monitoring surface water quality and to provide the Committee with a report thereon;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party for the submission to the World Heritage Centre the Heritage Management Plan, along with an updated masterplan and more detailed information on the proposed renovation of these built attributes, including how they support the historical narrative of this component, and await the review of the Advisory Bodies before further implementation;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

133. Koutammakou, the Land of the Batammariba (Togo) (C 1140)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.133

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.122** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the efforts made by the State Party for the conservation of the property, the involvement of local communities and the development of management and guidance tools for various stakeholders through the project "Improving the state of conservation of Koutammakou, the land of the Batammariba" and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue these efforts;

- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> in particular the reconstruction of almost all the collapsed sikien and degraded houses during the bad weather of 2018, as well as the information provided on 1,716 sikien and their state of conservation, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure continuous and detailed documentation of ongoing and future restoration and reconstruction measures, reporting on the scope and progress of the work, the location of the restored sikien, the types of work undertaken and the construction materials and systems;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the updating of the maps showing the boundaries of the property, the finalization of the 2022-2024 Conservation and Management Plan and the publication of a Recommendations Booklet for the maintenance of the sikien, which promote the commitment and empowerment of local communities for the restoration and maintenance of their heritage, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to translate these documents into the local language and to strengthen this community commitment through awareness-raising and the training of young Batammaribè in trades relating to the restoration and reconstruction of the sikien;
- 6. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the strengthening of the human resources of the Koutammakou Conservation and Promotion Service (SCPK), as requested by the Committee at its extended 44th session, as well as the project to integrate the Recommendation concerning the Historic Urban Landscape (2011) into the Communal Urbanism and Development Plan of Kéran 3 commune and Nadoba, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the SCPK and the communes of Kéran 3 and Nadoba have adequate financial resources for the effective conservation, restoration, management and protection of the property;
- 7. Expresses its concern at the deforestation and uncontrolled cutting of trees required for the construction of sikien diverted to the sale of charcoal and the plank trade, as well as the shortage of straw attributed to the impact of transhumance, noting that the transport of these materials from remote locations is not a sustainable solution and that these phenomena are likely to be exacerbated by the impacts of climate change, and encourages the State Party to develop a strategic plan to mitigate these phenomena, including reforestation measures, areas closed to grazing and raising public awareness of the importance of these measures;
- 8. Reiterates its thanks to the Government of Norway for its generous financial support for the implementation of the project "Improvement of the state of conservation of Koutammakou, the land of the Batammariba" and the publication of a Recommendations Booklet for the maintenance of sikien:
- 9. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party for inviting the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM reactive monitoring mission requested by the Committee at the 43rd and 44th sessions and <u>requests</u> that this mission be carried out as soon as possible;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

134. Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Ruins of Songo Mnara (United Republic of Tanzania) (C 144)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.134

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.11** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the continuing effort to implement conservation works, notably the restoration of the stairs at Husuni Palace, as a continuous response to the challenges of the property following its removal from the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- 4. <u>Takes note with appreciation</u> that the World Heritage Centre, through the World Heritage Fund, and with the Advisory Bodies, supported the State Party in taking concrete actions to counter the impacts of climate change;
- 5. Reiterates the importance that the State Party integrate climate change mitigation and adaptation actions plans in risk preparedness policies and action plans in order to protect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and requests the State Party, with the support of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, to continue monitoring the situation of the property and develop activities to consolidate the ongoing initiatives to mitigate the effect of climate change in the property;
- 6. <u>Further commends</u> the State Party for mobilising funds to review the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to expedite the process to finalise the revision of the IMP, addressing all aspects as previously noted by the Committee, including but not limited to a detailed Land Use Plan and Tourism Development Plan, the establishment of boundaries and a buffer zone, and to submit the revised IMP to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Further notes with appreciation</u> the commitment of the State Party to ensure that the Environmental Impact Assessments (EIA) and Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA), including a strong focus on archaeological attributes, be carried out with appropriate and detailed documentation and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any large conservation projects and/or any commitments are made, consistent with the requirements of Paragraphs 172 and 118bis of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ARAB STATES

135. Kasbah of Algiers (Algeria) (C 565)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.135

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.123** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Taking note of the activities carried out by the State Party for the safeguarding, conservation and enhancement of the tangible and intangible heritage of the property and the socioeconomic revitalization of its urban fabric, as well as for the involvement of civil society and youth in particular, congratulates the State Party on the progress made in the preservation of the property by taking into account the social, economic and tourism dimensions of the safeguarding of the property and encourages it to continue its efforts;
- 4. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the initiative for intersectoral consultation and the dialogue established with citizens' associations and the inhabitants of the Kasbah, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to maintain an integrated coordination mechanism through the operational establishment of the structure placed under the aegis of the Prime Ministry;
- 5. Continues nevertheless to express its concern at the identification of 18 additional buildings in an advanced state of deterioration, and at the results of the expert assessment of nearly 70% of the properties, which show that 48% of them are in a worrying state of deterioration, and urges the State Party to continue its efforts to assess the entire urban fabric of the property and to continue to take the necessary measures to halt its progressive deterioration;
- 6. Welcomes the proposed revision of the Permanent Plan for the Safeguarding and Valorization of the Safeguarded Sectors (PPSMVSS), in order to establish regulatory provisions reflecting the current state of conservation, as well as the activities that have enabled civil society to be involved in its implementation, and invites the State Party to submit its revised version to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for their opinion;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

136. Ancient Thebes with its Necropolis (Egypt) (C 87)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.136

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.126** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the progress made in relation to compliance with the requirements and processes of the World Heritage Convention and Operational Guidelines, including its decision to require Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) to be prepared for all projects at the property, and <u>requests</u> that HIAs should be completed in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and <u>reiterates its previous request</u> that HIAs and relevant project documentation should be submitted for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the instigation of an Integrated Management Plan for the property, <u>notes</u> its previous request that this Plan should address risk preparedness and sustainable tourism, and <u>also requests</u> that the draft Integrated Management Plan be submitted for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, prior to being finalised adopted and implemented;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the advice from the State Party that the recommendations of the 2017 Joint Reactive Monitoring mission and 2021 UNESCO Advisory mission are being comprehensively implemented and <u>also notes</u> the progress reports provided by the State Party on the implementation of specific mission recommendations;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> the reports submitted on the four sphinxes from the Karnak Temple that were transferred to Tahrir Square in Cairo, the works undertaken and ongoing conservation and management arrangements for Sphinx Avenue, as well as the extensive information submitted regarding the lighting and security cameras project, the underground water project, works at the Temple of the Apt, the Temple of Medinet Habu, the Ramesseum, and the Temple of Seti, disabled access works at Karnak, as well as the Flood Emergency Plan for the Valley of the Kings and the Valley of the Queens;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit further information on the proposed implementation of the sustainable visitor services to be pursued through a public-private partnership for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. <u>Further welcomes</u> advice that the State Party will invite a Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission in 2023 to evaluate the property's state of conservation, assess implementation of the recommendations from the 2017 and 2021 missions, review ongoing and planned projects and assess how they may affect the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and <u>requests furthermore</u> that the extensive documentation submitted by the State Party with its state of conservation report be reviewed by the mission;

- 9. <u>Encourages again</u> the State Party to continue exchanges with ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre to finalize the retrospective Statement of OUV for the property;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

137. Memphis and its Necropolis – the Pyramid Fields from Giza to Dahshur (Egypt) (C 86)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.137

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.127** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Commends the State Party on the further progress made in relation to compliance with the requirements and processes of the World Heritage Convention and the Operational Guidelines, including its decision to require Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) to be prepared for all projects at the property, the cumulative map of property attributes, the ban on new construction projects, and the instigation of an Integrated Management Plan (IMP) for the property, and requests that the draft IMP be submitted for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, prior to being finalised adopted and implemented;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the findings and recommendations of the 2022 Reactive Monitoring mission, and <u>welcomes</u> the advice from the State Party that the recommendations of this mission and the 2021 Advisory mission are being comprehensively implemented;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the considerable progress that has been made in archaeological and conservation work, improving access and connectivity at the property, including the network of tracks, pathways and rail tracks which provide access to landmarks, as well as the provision of new visitor facilities, and the programme of training and capacity building;
- 6. Also notes that the Touristic Path and Middle Ring Road, which were constructed without referral to the World Heritage Centre and contrary to previous Committee decisions, have been subject to detailed studies, HIA, mitigative measures and review by the 2022 mission, which concluded that urban development should be prevented along or in the vicinity of the Touristic Path and the Middle Ring Road segments passing through the property in order to avoid threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and, in accordance with the mission report findings, also requests that comprehensive details of the archaeological surveys and impact assessments undertaken in advance of the road works be submitted to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. Regrets that information about the High-Speed Rail Green line project and an HIA were not submitted to the World Heritage Centre in advance of commencement of construction, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, but <u>further notes</u> that the technical review by ICOMOS concluded that the chosen alignment appears to be the best option to achieve the east-west connection through the property, but that additional information and clarifications are required and the HIA requires amendment and

augmentation with further mitigation measures to reduce the impact of the development and its operations on the OUV of the property, and therefore <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit an amended HIA for this project, completed in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;

- 8. Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to submit in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, a detailed document providing comprehensive information on the Pyramids Security Project to the World Heritage Centre, as soon as possible;
- 9. <u>Also reiterates its previous request</u> to the State Party to further strengthen the protection and management of the property, with particular regard to its retrospective Statement of OUV, and by defining a buffer zone and submitting a minor boundary modification request, in line with Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>further notes</u> that an Advisory mission has been invited to enable consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in accordance with the previous decisions of the Committee;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

138. Saint Catherine Area (Egypt) (C 954)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.138

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **27 COM 8C.16** and **28 COM 15B.51** adopted at is 27th (UNESCO, 2003) and 28th (Suzhou, 2004) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the conservation and research work undertaken by the State Party, specifically the archaeological research undertaken and <u>requests</u> that the State Party ensure these excavations are adequately consolidated;
- 4. Also notes that large scale developments have been implemented as part of the Saint Catherine City Development Initiative entitled 'Great Revelation Initiative the Land Peace' which may have superseded the 1998 Sustainable Development Plan (SDP), and due to the envisaged further tourism development at the property and the lack of a Management Plan with a tourism management component, also requests that:
 - a) Further developments included in the Saint Catherine City Development 'Great Revelation Initiative – the Land Peace' be halted until a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is undertaken, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and the HIA report and details of the Saint Catherine City Development have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) The State Party initiate and complete an inventory of urgent conservation needs and develop a Conservation Plan for the property,

- c) Develop a Management Plan with a tourism management component that also makes provision for the implementation of the Conservation Plan for the property and submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to assess all future development projects that may affect the integrity or authenticity of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property through impact assessments in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, developed in collaboration between the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre;
- 6. Reminds the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any major development project that may negatively impact the OUV of a property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. Requests furthermore the State Party to invite urgently a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess the state of conservation of the property, the already executed components of the 'Great Revelation Initiative the Land of Peace' project, and the efficacy of the protection and management system of the property;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

139. Babylon (Iraq) (C 278rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.139

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.14** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the progress made by the State Party in continuing conservation activities and in augmenting the management and presentation of the property;
- 4. Reiterates its requests to the State Party to:
 - a) Develop and finalize the comprehensive conservation plan for the property, and within this, address the various risk factors identified in the risk map previously provided. This should include proposals of concrete measures towards their effective reduction and mitigation as well as the establishment of a priority intervention scheme for the most urgent conservation measures needed,
 - Augment the Management Plan to include the comprehensive conservation plan so as to allow the management team to focus on priority, emergency interventions, and providing detailed implementation-oriented guidance as well as quality indicators for its successful implementation,
 - c) Research further the relationships between the Neo-Babylonian capital and its wider landscape, in particular towards the Euphrates River, and based on the outcomes of

- this research, consider further extending the buffer zone in order to address actual and potential future challenges which can be identified in the wider setting of the archaeological city,
- d) Communicate to visitors the three-dimensional boundary concept and the explicit exclusion of 20th century additions from the property;
- 5. Reminds the States Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any major development project that may negatively impact the Outstanding Universal Value of a property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. <u>Welcomes again</u> the willingness of the State Party to host as soon as possible a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission to assist the State Party to develop a phased action plan for the conservation of the property;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

140. Baptism Site "Bethany Beyond the Jordan" (Al-Maghtas) (Jordan) (C 1446)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.140

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- Recalling Decisions 39 COM 8B.10, 40 COM 8B.50, 41 COM 7B.79, 43 COM 7B.46 and 44 COM 7B.128 adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019), and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the development of the updated Earthquake Response Preparation Plan, and Guidance of Flash Flood Response Plan;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts to update the Management Plan to reflect the adopted Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), as well as other matters that have changed since the plan was first developed, and <u>awaits</u> submission of the revised draft, integrating the updated Earthquake Response Preparation Plan, and Guidance of Flash Flood Response Plan;
- 5. <u>Takes notes</u> of the ongoing_revision of the Design and Construction Guidelines for New Churches in the Buffer Zone, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to consider strengthening measurable standards for new design and sensitive integration into the 'wilderness' environment of the property, and to submit the revised guidelines to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts to define the boundaries for the Baptism Site Nature Reserve, however, <u>reiterates the need</u> to consider undertaking a visual landscape analysis of the potential impacts on the Jordan River landscape area (the nature reserve) of various development options for the new churches, and accordingly to clarify the integration of the

'wilderness' environment in the revision of the Design and Construction Guidelines for New Churches;

- 7. <u>Also takes note</u> of the ongoing revision of the Master Plan, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit the Master Plan for the whole buffer zone when completed, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to clarify how the master planning process will relate to the planning of the Baptism Development Zone (BDZ), including the establishment of a pilgrimage village complex adjacent to the property boundary and within the buffer zone, and how the objectives of the BDZ satisfy the purpose of the buffer zone in protecting the OUV of the property;
- 9. <u>Further welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts to progress in the development of the revised Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) for completed and new buildings in the buffer zone, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to apply the revised HIA to the planning and proposed developments within the BDZ, and to submit the HIA to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as a critical step before any development proceeds;
- 10. <u>Welcomes furthermore</u> the State Party's action on the conservation of a range of attributes, rehabilitation of visitor facilities, development of documentation concerning management and tour guides, and capacity building, demonstrating ongoing improvement in the protection of OUV and the management of the property;
- 11. <u>Welcomes again</u> the State Party's efforts to report on developments across the Jordan River, beyond the property boundaries, and <u>reiterates</u> the need to ensure the preservation of important vistas and views by all concerned parties;
- 12. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

141. Petra (Jordan) (C 1326)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.141

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.16** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts of the State Party in preventing further densification of the property's setting and diverting urban growth towards the east of the property, and beyond its immediate setting, nevertheless, <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide further detailed information about these plans, especially with regard to developments located to the north of Umm Sayhoun, and to the east, adjacent to the property;

- 4. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to afford priority to the proposed Integrated Territorial Master Plan (ITMP) which is required to facilitate sustainable economic, social and environmental development, based on a detailed assessment of the cultural and natural assets of the property and its surroundings, and the social and economic needs of the resident and tourism communities and to submit the draft ITMP for review by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, before it is finalised and adopted;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to continue working towards the establishment of a sustainable tourism strategy for the property, which takes into consideration and integrates all measures and services planned within and beyond the boundaries of the property, and <u>also welcomes</u> the elaboration of the Petra Tourism Development Master Plan;
- 6. Notes with concern that the al-Dara project has proceeded and that, despite design changes made following initial technical review, at least one major infrastructure element was added in the wider setting of the property, without prior advice to the World Heritage Centre, and which may result in negative impacts, and therefore <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit copies of complete detailed information and any Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) undertaken, and <u>requests furthermore</u> that this material and the March 2023 update be subject to technical review by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Reiterates the need for devising new regulations for a designated buffer zone and its larger setting, in line with the proposed ITMP, reiterates its previous requests to the State Party to submit a minor boundary modification request, in line with Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines, and to clarify the protective urban regulations of the planned buffer zone, in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies; and further welcomes the invitation by the State Party for an Advisory mission to provide advice on this process, and the steps needed to define a framework for a comprehensive planning approach to address needs, and mitigate densification, tourism and development pressures, within and beyond the boundaries of the property;
- 8. <u>Welcomes furthermore</u> the updating of the Geographic Information System (GIS) to record and manage information on the Petra Archaeological Park and <u>also urges</u> the State Party to finalize this work as soon as possible and proceed with the preparation of an accurate GIS-based map of the property, with its precise boundaries, topography, location of all its component attributes and planned buffer zone;
- 9. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for pursuing the implementation of some recommendations of the November 2017 Reactive Monitoring mission and Committee decisions, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to further pursue these efforts, notably concerning:
 - a) Commitment to enforce a permanent moratorium on new buildings and infrastructure that are visible from the site.
 - b) Establishing a process for consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS prior to the implementation of major projects, and for subsequently undertaking the necessary measures concerning development projects in the vicinity of the property in order to avoid or reduce negative impacts on its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV),
 - c) Addressing water harvesting and flood management in Petra,
 - d) Carrying out community engagement and awareness raising activities, including with a focus on animal welfare;
- 10. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to continue the ongoing dialogue and collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies towards the conservation and management of the property, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party of the obligation to submit to the

World Heritage Centre, in conformity with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines, HIAs, prepared in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, for all proposed projects, which may affect the OUV of the property;

11. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

142. Um er-Rasas (Kastrom Mefa'a) (Jordan) (C 1093)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.142

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.129** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts in updating and expanding the content of the 2017 Management Plan, revising the priority ranking of the Implementation Action Plan, and making the Plan available in Arabic, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to maintain this momentum and submit the draft updated Management Plan for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, when completed;
- 4. Reiterates its request to the State Party to submit the final conservation project proposal for the Stylite Tower as soon as possible for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, and urges the State Party to continue monitoring the conservation situation closely;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the detailed survey carried out of the Castrum, but <u>reiterates its concern</u> that the urgent conservation work at the Castrum identified in the Management Plan and highlighted in the new survey drawings does not appear to have taken place (including urgent conservation work to the south wall and the already excavated gates and walls);
- 6. Requests the State Party to provide greater detail and plans of the proposed 'rehabilitation' of six churches (The Peacock Chapel, Church of the Lions, Church of Priest Wa'il, Church of the River, Church of the Palm Tree and Church of Saint Paul) and the construction of wooden shelters and platforms, including the extent and nature of the work and an assessment of the potential impact on Outstanding Universal Value;
- 7. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the repair and augmentation of the visitor signage and the protective measures at wells to ensure public safety;
- 8. <u>Also commends</u> the State Party on the steps being taken to address illegal excavation and <u>also requests</u> information on the extent of illegal excavation taking place, and on the effectiveness of the camera and lighting system once installed and operating,
- 9. <u>Also welcomes</u> the State Party's undertaking to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission, possibly when the draft updated Management Plan is finalized and approved;

- Also encourages the State Party to continue to review the boundaries of the buffer zone in keeping with the 2017 Management Plan and, if necessary, propose minor boundary modifications;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

143. Byblos (Lebanon) (C 295)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.143

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 42 COM 7B.56, 43 COM 7B.48 and 44 COM 7B.130 adopted at its 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the submission of the State Party's report in light of the severe national economic crisis affecting all sectors and society as a whole;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that all works on the 'Diplomatic Club' touristic beach resort project remain suspended, as requested by the Committee in its previous Decision, and that no further archaeological investigations have yet been conducted in this location since;
- 5. Requests that any future projects that may have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property or its setting should be preceded by appropriate investigations and be subject to impact assessments prepared in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to any decision on their implementation, to ensure appropriate environmental and archaeological outcomes for the World Heritage property:
- 6. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to inform the Committee, through the World Heritage Centre, of any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoing mission, with particular attention to the following:
 - Exploring synergies with the UNESCO 2001 Convention on the Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage and the UNESCO 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage,
 - b) Developing a management plan with provisions for sustainable tourism, conservation activities, and regular maintenance,
 - c) Establishing a national data management strategy that ensures making documentation and inventory information available for site management and research at the local level.
 - d) Considering the Historic Urban Landscape approach for integrating the management plan with the urban development for the Old Town of Byblos;

- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to submit an International Assistance request to support efforts in the elaboration of the required management tools;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

144. Ouadi Qadisha (the Holy Valley) and the Forest of the Cedars of God (Horsh Arz el-Rab) (Lebanon) (C 850)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.144

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.131** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the progress made by the State Party, despite a difficult financial and social context;
- 4. <u>Welcomes with satisfaction</u> the progress made by the State Party in implementing the Action Plan with the "Rehabilitation Valorization of Ouadi Qadisha" project, which has improved accessibility, conservation and presentation at Mar Assia and Deir el-Salib, and the restoration of the frescoes:
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of other activities programmed with the support of the UNESCO Office in Beirut, which provide support with appropriate solutions for the sustainable development of the property, improving the livelihoods of the populations while contributing to the promotion of responsible tourism, as recommended by the 2012 mission;
- 6. <u>Welcoming</u> the results of the project concerning access to Hadshit cemetery, <u>recalls</u> the importance of establishing a management and coordination system that involves all stakeholders;
- 7. <u>Notes</u> that the revision of the boundaries of the property and of the buffer zone has been temporarily interrupted due to economic and financial constraints, <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to finalize this revision in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies as soon as the situation permits, and to submit it in the form of a Minor Boundary Modification, in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines, and <u>invites</u> it to submit a request for international assistance to the World Heritage Fund for this purpose;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above.

145. Tyre (Lebanon) (C 299)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.145

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 37 COM 8B.45, 39 COM 7B.54, 41 COM 7B.83, 43 COM 7B.50, and 44 COM 7B.132 adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019), and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the submission of the State Party's report in light of the severe national economic crisis affecting all sectors and society as a whole;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to implement the decisions adopted by the World Heritage Committee, in particular Decisions **39 COM 7B.54**, **41 COM 7B.83**, **43 COM 7B.50** and **44 COM 7B.132**, and in line with the reporting requirements under the World Heritage Convention;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that the process towards creating a partial agreement between the primary stakeholders (Directorate General of Antiquities, Municipality of Tyre) for the creation of municipal parking within the archaeological zone have been paused due to the complex situation in the country, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to submit the details of this arrangement and design details, when available, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before taking any decisions on the matter:
- 6. <u>Also notes</u> that the State Party is currently preparing a new Management Plan that includes provisions for a maritime protection zone to preserve the underwater archaeological remains, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit as a priority the revised Management Plan for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and to expedite completion and implementation of the Management Plan;
- 7. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to provide sufficient resources for the property to ensure regular maintenance in the long-term;
- 8. Also reiterates its request to the State Party to implement the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission recommendations, with particular attention to establishing a comprehensive management strategy for the property that covers all aspects of documentation, conservation and monitoring, summarizing the knowledge on techniques and procedures in a manual, with an updated action plan, as a core component of the future management plan for the property, including:
 - a) Defining approaches to improving current maintenance practices concerning vegetation, drainage and sewage control through appropriate preventive measures,
 - b) Establishing principles of minimal intervention in the conservation of mosaics and structures as lessons learned from the pilot projects,
 - Developing and implementing a monitoring protocol to be available for scientific conservation research and to enable evaluation of the efficacy of conservation measures.
 - d) Developing and implementing a comprehensive presentation strategy for the property to reflect the actual understanding of its values as reflected in the various architectonic

- technologies and funerary practices of past generations, as well as conservation challenges,
- e) Considering integrating the Management Plan with regional and urban development and traffic-mobility plans to manage the development pressures in the long term;
- 9. <u>Further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to revise the proposed boundary of the property, identify a buffer zone and develop regulations and procedures for the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in accordance with Decision **37 COM 8B.45**, and to submit a Minor Boundary Modification, in line with Paragraphs 107, 164 and Annex 11 of the Operational Guidelines, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. Reiterates furthermore its request to the State Party to initiate an in-depth study of traffic and the urban road network, and to submit this study to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies, and reminds the State Party of the Committee's invitation, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to submit details for proposed road and infrastructure projects at the property, including Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) for the Coastal Highway and other planned major infrastructure projects, to be conducted in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 11. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to submit an International Assistance request to support efforts in the elaboration of needed management tools;
- 12. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

146. Medina of Essaouira (formerly Mogador) (Morocco) (C 753rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.146

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **32 COM 7B.61** adopted at its 32nd session (Quebec City, 2009).
- 3. <u>Congratulates</u> the State Party for the positive and transversal dynamics established with all stakeholders responsible for protection and civil society actors, as well as for the quality of the work carried out, <u>encourages</u> it to continue its efforts for the preservation and enhancement of the property and <u>requests</u> it to provide more information, including visuals, on all the work carried out and planned for the monumental attributes of the property and its urban fabric, so that a more precise overall assessment of the state of conservation of the property can be established;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the development and adoption of planning tools such as the Master Plan for the Urban Development of Greater Essaouira (SDAU) and the Plan for the Development and Safeguarding of the Medina (PASME), and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to provide the World Heritage Centre with further information on these plans, and in particular to confirm whether they are based on the approach of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), for the integration of the property into its surrounding context in

- order to preserve the Outstanding Universal Value, but also the other values of the property such as those relating to its social-economic aspects;
- 5. <u>Noting</u> that no information has been provided on the management plan previously requested by the Committee, <u>also requests</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre of the management structure in place for the property, particularly in view of the ongoing transformations within the property and its buffer zone;
- 6. Notes with satisfaction the collaboration established with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to advance the project to restructure the port of Essaouira, as well as the conclusions and recommendations of the March 2022 online technical meeting that allow the State Party to move forward with the project, nevertheless requests the State Party to submit visualizations from the Porte de la Marine towards the port and the Mogador archipelago as soon as the installation of the fishermen's stalls is completed and the traffic study to the World Heritage Centre as soon as it is prepared,
- 7. Reminds the State Party of its obligation to submit information on any other significant project to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before decisions are taken that could be difficult to reverse;
- 8. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to submit, as part of the retrospective inventory a proposal for boundary clarification of the property as soon as possible;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

147. Himā Cultural Area (Saudi Arabia) (C 1619)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.147

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.11** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes notes with satisfaction</u> of the progress made by the State Party in implementing the recommendations made by the Committee at the time of inscription;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to set up the documentation system and to complete the inventory of heritage sites within the buffer zone and the wider setting;
- 5. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to complete the monitoring programme, commence its implementation as soon as possible, and refine it based on lessons learned, particularly in relation to the conservation indicators, which should be prioritized;
- 6. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to implement the conservation programme for the Ḥimā wells, within the expected timeframe, and to develop a similar programme for the property as a whole;

- 7. Recommends the State Party to carry out Heritage Impact Assessments, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, for any projects related to tourism activities and infrastructure that may arise in the future and requests the State Party to submit, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, detailed information on any such projects within the property, its buffer zone and wider setting, which may impact the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to any decisions being taken that could be difficult to reverse;
- 8. Also takes notes of the State Party's intention to submit to the World Heritage Centre a proposal for a minor boundary modification, prepared in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines, to expand the buffer zone and also recommends that the State Party consider the option of extending the property as well, in case information comes to light from the inventory and archaeological research, that would reinforce the integrity and understanding of the property;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

148. Historic Jeddah, the Gate to Makkah (Saudi Arabia) (C 1361)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.148

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.136** adopted at its 44th extended session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts undertaken by the State Party to strengthen its legislation to ensure better management and conservation of the property, including through the adoption of Antiquities, Museums and Urban Heritage Law by Royal Decree (655);
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the significant progress made with regard to the development of the Jeddah Historic District Geographic Information System (GIS), as well as the detailed assessments and conservation projects that have been executed, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue with this work to ensure the protection and conservation of the property;
- 5. Acknowledges with satisfaction the State Party' submission of the complete version of the Regeneration and Development Plan (Masterplan), along with technical information on conservation and restoration projects, the conservation strategy, design guidelines and heritage conservation manual, and the emergency plan and procedures, and also commends the efforts made in developing the various plans, guidelines and procedures to ensure the adequate protection, conservation and management of the property;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that the State Party recognises that the scale of the task of conserving and regenerating Al Balad (which includes both the property and a wider city area) involves a long and complex process, and therefore <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide ongoing advice

- on the experience in coordinating and utilising the wide range of guidance documents in the expanded management system, and of any modifications required;
- 7. Reiterates its request that the State Party_submits to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, a complete version of the risk management and prevention plan for the property, noting that the current documents only address security and first-response aspects; such a plan should assess risks, address minimisation strategies, and develop responses to such issues as fire prevention, suppression and recovery, flood risk assessment and preparation, as well as earthquake and tsunami preparedness and recovery planning;
- 8. <u>Acknowledges again</u> the State Party's efforts in the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) approach to the management and urban regeneration of the property and also welcomes the sharing of the new planning tool with the World Heritage Centre;
- 9. <u>Recalls</u> the importance of integrating the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) process in the implementation of the Masterplan for developments within the property, its buffer zone or the wider setting, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre about any major development that may impact the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above

149. Archaeological Site of Carthage (Tunisia) (C 37)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.149

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.18** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continuing demolition of illegal structures and further land acquisitions to help control development pressures;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to implement all remaining demolition decrees as soon as possible to maintain the momentum of this programme, particularly the completion of the Police Academy demolition, which was considered essential by the 2019 mission;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> that a delineation of the archaeological park of Carthage has been approved at national level and integrated into the Protection and Presentation Plan of Carthage (PPMV), which is being updated;
- 6. Recalls the importance of establishing criteria for the definition of a buffer zone as well as the regulations and measures that govern it and requests the State Party to submit to the

World Heritage Centre a Minor Boundary Modification proposal, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;

- 7. <u>Also notes</u> that work has commenced on the development of strategies for research and for conservation and enhancement;
- 8. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to develop a Management Plan for the property at the earliest opportunity;
- 9. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party, notwithstanding a wide range of activities at the property relating to restoration, excavations and the development of the Museum, to address the Committee's requests relating to the modification of the urban development plan to control inappropriate development and the creation of a more symbiotic relationship between the property and its surroundings to support socio-economic development of the wider area, the elaboration of communication strategies, as well as all remaining requests from the 2019 mission;
- 10. <u>Further notes</u> that a competition has been launched for the rehabilitation of the National Museum on Byrsa Hill within the property and that measures have been taken to ensure that any proposals to enhance and/or extend this museum do not impact adversely on Outstanding Universal Value, <u>commends</u> the engagement with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS on the procedures for the competition, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to ensure that the technical review's recommendations are integrated into the development of the winning project;
- 11. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

150. Medina of Sousse (Tunisia) (C 498bis)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.150

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision 44 COM 7B.138 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the measures taken by the State Party for greater collaboration in the management of the property, for the elaboration of a safeguarding and valorisation plan (PSMV) and for fundraising, in order to stem the threats to the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), and urges the State Party to strengthen its efforts;
- 4. <u>Taking note</u> of the findings and recommendations of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission of January 2023, <u>requests</u> the State Party to implement the mission's recommendations, and in particular:
 - a) rigorously monitor urban operations to reduce the risk of infringements,
 - b) based on the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), conduct an in-depth study of the attributes of the property, the qualities of the buffer zone as well as the visual fields to be preserved, including in the buffer zone

- and its surrounding context, in order to better understand how they support and protect the OUV,
- c) document and analyze traditional and current patterns of use of the urban infrastructure that could serve as a basis for the socio-economic regeneration of the property, and integrate them into the provisions of the PSMV, to support the regeneration of the property, while protecting its OUV,
- benefit from the preparation of the PSMV to set up a joint management mechanism for the medina that includes representatives of the resident community, and involves civil society more closely, in the preservation, enhancement and management of the property,
- e) carry out a pilot project, reflecting the provisions of the PSMV, in one area of the medina to ensure that it is adapted and applicable to the context, before developing it on a property-wide scale.
- f) finalize, adopt and implement the PSMV in order to ensure the preservation of the OUV of the property, its conservation and management, including tourism management, the socio-economic regeneration of the property and coordination between all stakeholders,
- g) integrate into the PSMV the sustainable development aspects of the second phase of the Sousse Urban Development Programme (PDUI-II), while respecting the OUV of the property, in order to ensure the link with the city of Sousse as a whole, and to give it precedence over the Urban Development Plan (PAU) as soon as it is adopted, so as to ensure better protection of the property;
- 5. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to seek the expertise of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies as necessary, in the implementation of the above recommendations, and in particular in relation to the implementation of the HUL Recommendation;
- 6. Reminds the State Party of its obligation to submit information on significant projects to the World Heritage Centre, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, for review by the Advisory Bodies, before decisions are taken that could be difficult to reverse;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

151. Temple Zone of Sambor Prei Kuk, Archaeological Site of Ancient Ishanapura (Cambodia) (C 1532)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.151

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,

- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 8B.15**, **43 COM 7B.56** and **44 COM 7B.140** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and 43rd (Baku, 2019) sessions and its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021) respectively,
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the State Party's report concerning conservation, research and restoration of attributes in the temple zone, based on the risk mapping for the property, and the completion of the Conservation Manual for Sambor Prei Kuk;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the resumption of the State Party's training and education programmes, which include awareness-raising programmes for the local community, training for archaeology and conservation students, support for scientific researchers, staff exchanges, and on-the-job training for the local community;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the continuing, high-quality scientific work carried out to document the attributes of the property and its buffer zone, contributing to the longer-term possibility of deepening the interpretation of the site and extending the property boundary;
- 6. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the progress made in implementing the Committee's previous recommendations concerning the completion and implementation of the management system, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to continue its progress by:
 - a) Continuing to assess the carrying capacity of each of the temple zones, based on the collection of visitor data and the observation of changes to visitor routes and day-long fluctuation of visitor behaviour within the property, with a view to potentially revisiting the Tourism Management Plan,
 - Continuing to ensure the effectiveness of the monitoring system through regular reporting on the conservation and restoration works, risk data, settlement patterns, ancient hydraulic structures, visitor satisfaction, community involvement, and broader environmental indicators,
 - c) Considering the long-term possibility of extending the property's boundaries, once the inscribed area and buffer zone have been thoroughly documented and assessed,
 - d) Continuing to enrich the interpretation of the property through museum displays and educational activities.
 - e) Continuing to develop and implement capacity-building programmes for a variety of audiences;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

152. Angkor (Cambodia) (C 668)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.152

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision 44 COM 7B.139 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).

- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for making steady progress implementing various activities in the field of conservation, research, environmental conservation and management for the attributes of Angkor, with a growing ownership ensured by the national authorities, benefitting from the expertise of the International Coordinating Committee for the Safeguarding and Sustainable Development of Angkor (ICC-Angkor) and strong support of a number of international partners;
- 4. Recalling paragraph 6 of Decision 44 COM 7B.139, welcomes the updated Tourism Development Plan and requests that it be further revised in accordance with the findings of the ICOMOS technical review, including by clarifying its relationship with the 2012 Tourism Management Plan (TMP), the integration of guidelines for future tourism projects in line with the 2015 Policy Document for the Integration of a Sustainable Development Perspective into the Processes of the World Heritage Convention in order to guide the scale, scope and nature of future tourism projects and avoid potential impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and also requests the State Party to instigate a carrying capacity assessment for the property, as provided for in the 2012 TMP, as a matter of priority, and to revise the 2012 TMP accordingly to ensure its alignment with the Tourism Development Plan;
- 5. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that the State Party has addressed the issue of disturbances to the wildlife caused by social media content producers, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to keep monitoring the situation and applying lawful measures, as well as to consider means to avoid impacts from wildlife on the security and safety of the property's attributes and of visitors:
- 6. Takes note that the State Party has been acting to enforce zoning regulations and has relocated families who settled illegally in the property, taking into account the threats that may be posed to the integrity and authenticity of the property and its OUV, and therefore requests the State Party, taking into consideration the living conditions and the rights of local communities and inhabitants affected by these relocations and those already living lawfully within the property boundaries prior to inscription, to continue implementing appropriate measures for the management of the World Heritage property and its OUV, as well as to reinforce awareness of zoning regulations for all local populations;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for review by the Advisory Bodies and examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

153. Ancient Building Complex in the Wudang Mountains (China) (C 705)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.153

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.19** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts made by the State Party to strengthen the management of the property, and particularly the work for improved fire protection;

- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the completion of the uplift project of the Yuzhen Palace and the report provided by the State Party after completion of the project, as requested in its previous decisions, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre a comprehensive set of visual materials, including before and after photographs of the work carried out, for review by the Advisory Bodies, in order to allow for a full assessment of the project;
- 5. Notes with concern the information provided regarding the carrying capacity of the property and the substantial increase in visitor numbers at the property by comparison with the initially estimated carrying capacity, and requests that more detailed information be provided to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, on the rationale for this change and its potential impacts on the property and attributes which support its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), especially the most sensitive areas, such as the Golden Peak:
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the clarification provided by the State Party concerning the number of component parts of the property, the boundaries and the buffer zone, but <u>recalls its previous request</u> that the buffer zone should incorporate the entirety of the Wudang Mountains Scenic Area, and therefore <u>urges</u> the State Party to submit up-to-date maps of the property as inscribed and the buffer zone, including detailed maps of each component part, to the World Heritage Centre:
- 7. Encourages the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission to the property to assess the overall state of conservation of the property, the outcomes of the uplift project of the Yuzhen Palace, and any resulting impacts on the property and its OUV and resulting mitigative measures, and to provide guidance to and engage with the State Party in its efforts to address the issues surrounding the component parts of the property, the delineation of the buffer zone, as well as the property's carrying capacity and commensurate, sustainable visitor management strategies;
- 8. Requests the State Party to finalise the management plan for the property as soon as possible following the adoption of the boundary clarification, taking into account the revised delineation of the boundaries and buffer zone;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

154. Historic Centre of Macao (China) (C 1110)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.154

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- Recalling Decision 44 COM 7B.141 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the enactment of the Master Plan of the Macao Special Administrative Region (2020-2040) as an important milestone for the conservation and management of the property;

- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of progress made with the 'Administrative Regulation for the Protection and Management Plan of Historic Centre of Macao' and, keeping in mind that it will be revised in line with the technical advice of ICOMOS, <u>requests</u> the State Party to re-submit the amended Administrative Regulation to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption and implementation, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to accelerate its efforts to bring this body of work to its final legal conclusion, through the promulgation of the revised Administrative Regulation in tandem with the final Management Plan for the property;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the legislation requiring Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) and the integration of the process to assess the potential impacts of projects on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of a property through HIAs to be undertaken in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 6. Welcomes the approach to deal with the unfinished buildings at 18-20 Calçada de Gaio, the suspension of new building projects on Avenida do Dr. Rodrigo Rodrigues, and the instigation of the new study 'Heritage Impact Assessment and Urban Design of the area around Avenida do Dr. Rodrigo Rodrigues', and requests that a draft of this study be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before it is finalised and implemented;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre key management and planning documents for the New Urban Zones, along with documents pertaining to the monitoring of the property, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, including:
 - a) the planning study of the New Urban Zone Areas A and B,
 - b) the proposed design of the Light Rail Transit East Line project connecting the New Urban Zone Areas A and E,
 - c) up-to-date information about the 'Plan for the Establishment of the Early Warning System for the Monitoring of the World Heritage of the Historic Centre of Macao', and
 - d) information about the 'Macao World Heritage Monitoring Centre';
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

155. Historic Ensemble of the Potala Palace, Lhasa (China) (C 707ter)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.155

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.20** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the advice provided by the State Party regarding the three pavilions erected close to the Jokhang Temple Monastery to protect three historic stelae, and requests the State Party

to submit the complete Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) which has been prepared to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies in accordance with the provisions of the Operational Guidelines,

- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the three conservation plans for the three component parts of the property, and <u>also notes</u> that abstracts of these conservation plans have been provided, but <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit all three complete conservation plans to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Notes with concern</u> that, despite its previous decisions, the buffer zone of Norbulingka will not be adjusted to conform more clearly to identifiable landmarks, and that the regulations that will apply to the buffer zones have not been clarified, and <u>also requests</u> the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to review the buffer zone assessment as part of the technical review of the Norbulingka conservation plan;
- 6. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit up-to-date maps of the property as inscribed, including detailed maps of each component part and their buffer zones, to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2023**, for examination by the Committee at its 46th session if the technical requirements are met;
- 7. <u>Commends</u> the efforts of the State Party to manage visitation at the property and to ensure that the Jokhang Temple plaza is being managed in a manner which facilitates respectful pilgrim visitation, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to monitor and report on the efficacy of the new visitation management measures;
- 8. Also notes the advice of the State Party about the proposed demolition of the TV tower at the Chakpori Hill, but <u>further reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to prepare an HIA for the new tower, in accordance with the methodology of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, to ensure that, even though it is outside the buffer zone of the property, the new tower does not have any negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to provide a status update report on implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission and the programme for improving the monitoring and early warning system at the property;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 156. Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang'an Tian-shan Corridor (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) (C 1442)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.156

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7B.34, 41 COM 7B.88, 42 COM 7B.5 and 44 COM 7B.22 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,

- 3. Notes the important coordinating role of the Secretariat based at the ICOMOS International Conservation Centre-Xi'an (IICC-X) in ongoing research, interpretation, stakeholder involvement and monitoring, and the progress with management plans for some components of the property, but reiterates its previous requests that outstanding management plans be finalized as a matter of priority, taking into consideration the outcomes of the 2016 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, and be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> the response to the COVID-19 pandemic and resulting reduction in visitor numbers and again <u>encourages</u> the States Parties to review carrying capacities at all component sites in the light of post-COVID-19 health and safety regulations, while ensuring that visitor management places sustainability and the protection of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) at its core;
- 5. Further notes the information provided by the State Party of Kazakhstan that the revised route of the Birlik-Akbulak highway and bridge will pass to the north of the buffer zone of the Talgar settlement and that the old bridge will be retained in pedestrian use as tourist infrastructure, and also reiterates its previous request to the State Party of Kazakhstan to submit to the World Heritage Centre more detailed plans of these proposals, showing the precise route of the road, the location of the new bridge and any demolition or new construction, in one of the working languages of the Committee (i.e., English or French), for review by the Advisory Bodies, before any commitment is made or any work undertaken;
- 6. Again urges the three States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, details of any major restoration or new construction, which may affect the attributes which support the OUV of the property, including Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) prepared in accordance with methodology of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to continue to submit detailed project documentation to the World Heritage Centre for review, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, and in particular, requests the State Party of China to submit detailed documentation of the integrated rural sewage treatment project and special education school proposed within the buffer zone of the Weiyang Palace in Chang'an City of the Western Han Dynasty;
- 7. <u>Welcomes</u> the decision not to approve the proposed Eco-Village within the buffer zone of the Talgar settlement and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party of Kazakhstan to consider alternative options for such projects, outside the component site and its buffer zone;
- 8. <u>Further reiterates its previous requests</u> to the State Party of Kazakhstan to establish a World Heritage Steering Committee for the component sites in Kazakhstan and to develop effective coordination with China and Kyrgyzstan for the management of the property through the existing agreements and management mechanisms, and <u>further encourages</u> the three States Parties to ensure the effective and coordinated conservation and management of component sites through the International Coordination Committee and IICC-X:
- Notes with concern that development issues in the buffer zones of the Ak-Beshim and Krasnaya Rechka settlements remain unresolved and <u>also requests</u> the State Party of Kyrgyzstan to continue efforts to ensure that attributes which support the OUV of the property are not impacted by development;
- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the three States Parties to ensure that the boundaries and buffer zones of all inscribed component sites are duly documented in cadastral maps and that these maps are submitted to the World Heritage Centre and that 2011 Recommendation on the Historic

- Urban Landscape is implemented as a tool for integrating heritage protection with development plans and processes for the cities and settlements in the property;
- 11. <u>Also welcomes</u> the use of new technologies and collaboration with the International Centre on Space Technologies for Natural and Cultural Heritage (HIST) to monitor World Heritage properties in Xi'an, but <u>reiterates furthermore its previous request</u> that all concerned partners work closely with the HIST and the International Institute for Central Asian Studies to use space technology applications to monitor the state of conservation of the entirety of the property, and <u>invites again</u> all parties to share good practice examples with the World Heritage Centre, so that they may be made available to other States Parties on the World Heritage Centre's website;
- 12. Requests the three States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

157. Group of Monuments at Hampi (India) (C 241bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.157

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **37 COM 7B.61**, **39 COM 7B.64**, **41 COM 7B.90** and **43 COM 7B.61** adopted at its 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013), 39th (Bonn, 2015), 41st (Krakow, 2017) and 43rd (Baku, 2019) sessions respectively,
- 3. Requests the State Party to provide updated information on the status and implementation of the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) as well as the Master Plan of the entire site of Hampi, and submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 4. Requests the State Party to provide information on the monitoring of the property, in particular the activities undertaken to address tourism development pressures, as well as the conservation strategy for the protection of the historic mandapas near the Virupaksha temple, in line with the IMP, as requested in Decision **37 COM 7B.61**;
- 5. Requests the State Party to provide detailed information about the widening of a road near the Kamalapur Tank, along with a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), as requested in Decision **43 COM 7B.61**;
- 6. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to undertake, as soon as possible, HIAs for the proposed tourism infrastructure development and road widening projects in Anjanadri that might affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to put the implementation of these projects on hold until the HIA reports have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre and reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Noting</u> that it is the intention to amend planning zones to allow villages to have tourist accommodation and other development works, <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit details of the changes once approved and their implications, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party that details of the tourism infrastructures projects and any other major projects, including HIAs, should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, in line with paragraphs 118 bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

158. Hill Forts of Rajasthan (India) (C 247rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.158

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.24** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the updated information concerning the planned and ongoing conservation projects at Chittorgarh Fort and Jaisalmer Fort;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's advice regarding the formal inclusion of the Site Management Plan (SMP) for Jaisalmer Fort within the legal frameworks for the protection and management of the property, the progress made toward the establishment of the Jaisalmer Fort Management Authority, and the preparation of annual conservation plans along with a five-year plan for Jaisalmer Fort, and <u>requests</u> the State Party submit the next Annual Conservation Plan as well as the five-year plan for Jaisalmer Fort to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to provide the World Heritage Centre with information on the implementation of the planned actions for Jaisalmer Fort at its earliest convenience or whenever such information becomes available, and in particular concerning:
 - a) The finalisation of the establishment of the Jaisalmer Fort Management Authority, and details about its legal and operational purview and its priority activities,
 - b) The establishment of the SMP for Jaisalmer Fort under the Town and Country Planning Act, and continuing efforts to clarify the ownership of buildings within the property,
 - c) The development of a sub-plan for visitor management for Jaisalmer Fort, which should be a high-priority activity as an essential part of the property's management system,
 - d) The development of the sub-plan for risk preparedness for Jaisalmer Fort,
 - e) The development of the sub-plan for livelihood generation for the local population, taking into account the need for capacity building,
 - f) Further development of the comprehensive Conservation Plan, taking into account the Technical Review and feedback to be provided by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies following the submission of the Annual Conservation Plan and the five-year Plan for Jaisalmer Fort,
 - g) The development of detailed and action-oriented monitoring of the condition of the World Heritage property, based on a clear articulation of its Outstanding Universal Value and attributes;

- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's commitment to conduct Heritage Impact Assessments for all development projects within the serial property and its buffer zones, including conservation and restoration projects, new visitor facilities and adaptive reuse projects, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to carry out these activities in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and to request dedicated training on this revised methodology from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, if needed;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

159. Historic City of Ahmadabad (India) (C 1551)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.159

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.25** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the information provided by the State Party concerning the progress made in addressing the recommendations for strengthening the management system for Ahmadabad, including the documentation of buildings, work towards a detailed map of the property and the completion of the draft Heritage Conservation Plan (HCP), and requests the State Party to amend the draft HCP by continuing to give priority to the completion of these key elements of the management system, including:
 - a) The finalisation of the HCP considering the outcomes of the Technical Review by ICOMOS on the final draft.
 - b) Development of an implementation plan and associated financial resources for the HCP, including the Visitor Management Plan,
 - c) The completion of the documentation of historic buildings and structures in the city, particularly the distinctive 'pol' housing,
 - d) The completion of the detailed map of the entire property and buffer zone, planned for 2025;
- 4. Notes the information provided by the State Party as annexures to the HCP such as the Uniform Monument Specific By-Laws and guidelines for issues such as timber conservation, 2022 Urban Design Guidelines, the strengthening of the Ahmadabad World Heritage City Trust, and the ongoing initiatives to manage pollution and traffic congestion, also requests the State Party to implement the recommendations contained in the ICOMOS Technical Review on the 2022 Urban Design Guidelines prior to formalising their implementation;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> information from the State Party demonstrating the regular use of Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) for new developments in the property and its buffer zone, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure that:
 - Conservation works are subject to HIAs, including those established through Public-Private-People partnerships,

- b) The recommendations contained in the ICOMOS Technical Review of the HIA for the proposed Danapith Fire Station are implemented before any construction commences.
- c) All impact assessments are undertaken following the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 6. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

160. Kakatiya Rudreshwara (Ramappa) Temple, Telangana (India) (C 1570)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.160

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.12** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Takes notes with satisfaction</u> of the progress made by the State Party to complete the comparative study of the Rudreshwara (Ramappa) Temple and other Kakatiya temples, and to update the Tourism Development Plan;
- 4. <u>Takes notes</u> of the work schedule submitted for the reassembly and conservation of Kameshwara Temple, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to complete the works within the timeframe provided:
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the constitution of the Palampet Special Area Development Authority, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to further clarify the role and responsibilities of this body in relation to the overall governance arrangements of the property and the roles of the other institutions responsible for the management of the property and its buffer zone;
- 6. <u>Requests</u> that the State Party give further consideration to the involvement of local communities, particularly religious communities, in the governance and management arrangements for the property and its buffer zone;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit the finalised Integrated Conservation Management Plan, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to undertake Heritage Impact Assessments for all development projects that could affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and to submit them to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, as well as detailed information on any current or future works, before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, in conformity with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines and conducted in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;

- 9. Reiterates its request to the State Party to submit a boundary modification of the extended boundaries of the property and the buffer zone, with a view to including relevant elements of the wider temple context of the Rudreshwara (Ramappa) Temple;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

161. Mountain Railways of India (India) (C 944ter)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.161

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.62** and **44 COM 7B.26** adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its investment into the maintenance of steam engines and historic rolling stock, the construction of new engines at the Nilgiri Mountain Railway (NMR), and the conversion of oil-fired engines to diesel-fired engines, which is a potentially major step towards making the long-term conservation of steam railways environmentally sustainable;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the documentation of important documents and objects relating to the railways and the development of accessible website presentations of each railway, and <u>strongly encourages</u> the State Party to continue its actions to both conserve the documentary and artefactual components of the railways and make them accessible to the public;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's advice that the management structures at the three railways include heritage units, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide information on how in-house heritage conservation expertise is represented within those structures at the property component level and at zonal railways level;
- 6. <u>Reiterates its request</u> that the State Party submit the Comprehensive Conservation Management Plan (CCMP) for the Darjeeling Himalayan Railway (DHR) for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to its formal adoption;
- 7. Requests the State Party to complete the development of the Comprehensive Conservation Management Plan (CCMP) for the Kalka Shimla Railway (KSR) and the NMR and submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before the relevant management bodies formally endorse any of the plans;
- 8. Requests that the State Party inform the Committee, via the World Heritage Centre, of the specific conservation guidelines used to guide the conservation of the three railways in the absence of endorsed CCMPs;
- 9. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to determine what provisions would be required in the CCMP for the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the component railways of property if private operation is considered, and <u>recommends</u> that specific clauses be included in any contract to ensure compliance with the CCMP policies along with commitments to implementing any measures included in the Committee's decisions, protecting identified heritage attributes, submitting proposed actions to the World Heritage Centre in a timely

- manner, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, and complying with the recommendations formulated by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. Requests the State Party to complete the mapping of property and buffer zone boundaries for all property components and, when they are endorsed by the relevant management agencies, to submit them to the World Heritage Centre, in conformity with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Takes note</u> that the State Party does not regard the proposed conservation of the DHR stations at Ghum and Darjeeling as falling under the provisions of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, but <u>urges</u> the State Party to ensure inputs from heritage specialists to ensure the protection of the property's OUV and to consider submitting information about these conservation actions to the World Heritage Centre, in line with the aforementioned Paragraph 172, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 12. <u>Acknowledges</u> the progress made by the State Party with the implementation of some of the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, and <u>reiterates its request</u> that it fully implement these recommendations;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

162. Borobudur Temple Compounds (Indonesia) (C 592)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.162

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.142** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Deeply regrets</u> that, despite its previous requests, the State Party has completed significant development projects within and around the property prior to submitting the requested Integrated Tourism Management Plan of Borobudur-Yogyakarta-Prambanan (ITMP BYP), the Borobudur Visitor Management Plan (BVMP), or the updated Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to address the projects' potential impact on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that the ITMP BYP and BVMP are to be reviewed to align with the latest national policy and post-pandemic situation, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the updated versions of these documents to the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for review before they are finalised;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to duly implement the revised HIA in accordance with the newly provided Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, as submitted on 9 March 2023:
- 6. <u>Notes with utmost concern</u> that eight out of eleven proposed projects have already been completed, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to halt the projects that have not yet been completed until the submitted documents have been reviewed by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies and any resulting recommendations for change have been addressed:

- 7. Welcomes the State Party's ongoing endeavour to harmonize the management of Borobudur Temple Compounds by updating the Presidential Decree No. 1 of 1992, and requests the State Party to prioritize establishment of an integrated management body for the entire Borobudur National Strategic Area, involving multiple stakeholders such as, national and regional governments, private sector partners and local communities, and to oversee its development and operation;
- 8. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property as soon as possible to review the state of conservation of the property, assess the existing, cumulative and potential impacts of the finalised, ongoing and/or planned construction projects and any planned mitigation measures on the property and its OUV, propose any further required mitigation measures, and to consider what advice or assistance might enrich the Management Plan for the property;
- 9. <u>Further notes</u> that the State Party's Technical Guidance for Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is to be revised to align with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party to submit information on any proposal that may have an impact on the OUV of the property to the World Heritage Centre for examination by the Advisory Bodies before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse and before any further works commence, along with HIAs, in conformity with paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 163. Cultural Landscape of Bali Province: the Subak System as a Manifestation of the Tri Hita Karana Philosophy (Indonesia) (C 1194rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.163

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.143** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the advice of the State Party regarding the Provincial and Regency regulations and intiatives developed to support the economic viability of Subak farming;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to finalise the process of designating the property as a National Strategic Area as soon as possible;
- 5. <u>Notes</u> the process for the re-registration of Subaks across all Balinese Regencies, and the information provided by the State Party regarding the completion of the operational directives materials that include Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA), and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to develop associated capacity building activities;
- 6. <u>Also notes</u> the advice from the State Party that local traditional decision-making structures will be further supported by the development of Detailed Spatial Plans in several districts.

<u>requests</u> that further information is provided to explain how local traditional decision-making will be specifically supported through these Plans, and <u>recommends</u> that these are developed for all component parts of the serial property;

- 7. Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to ensure that all development projects within the property and buffer zones are subject to HIAs, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and that information about any project that could have an impact on the OUV of the property is submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

164. Meidan Emam, Esfahan (Iran (Islamic Republic of)) (C 115)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.164

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **44 COM 7B.144** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the completion of the Conservation and Management Plan (CMP), and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the translated plan for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption and implementation;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the completion of the first part of the Disaster Risk Management Plan (DRMP), and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide information on the development of the next part of the DRMP, to prepare a detailed prioritised work plan to address the extreme and high priorities identified in the DRMP, and to submit these to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre for review by the Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption and implementation;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the Water System and Sewage System Reorganization Plan, and <u>reiterates its</u> <u>request</u> that the State Party submit a prioritised work programme for the implementation of this plan to the World Heritage Centre as soon as possible, for review by the Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Notes the submission of a paper on pedestrian access routes, and reiterates its request that the State Party submit to the World Heritage Centre the final plan towards the development of spatial structures for motorised and pedestrian access to the property, which should focus on resolving historical alterations that enabled access and circulation for motorized vehicles and are detrimental to the conservation of heritage values, and on improving pedestrian movement in and around the property, for review by the Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Requests the State Party to provide detailed information on the conservation work for the Emam Mosque dome, including the mortars being used and the structural causes of the

dome's deformation, as well as on proposed actions to address the conservation of the Portico of Qaysariyyeh, which could be supported by a Heritage Impact Assessment carried out in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context:

- 8. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to add advice in the Conservation and Management Plan to counter future problematic changes to the property;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

165. Trans-Iranian Railway (Iran (Islamic Republic of)) (C 1585)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.165

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44COM 8B.13** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Appreciates</u> the efforts made by the State Party to implement the decisions of the Committee;
- 4. Requests the State Party to consider the following:
 - a) Ensure, as a matter of priority, the conservation of stations, workshops and buildings in accordance with their historical and heritage values, whether in use or in a situation of reconversion of use, by:
 - (i) Completing architectural inventories and master plans for major stations,
 - (ii) Carrying out the architectural restoration studies deemed necessary with the active support of heritage conservation architects approved by the Ministry of Cultural Heritage, Tourism and Handicrafts, while taking into account the integrity and authenticity of the buildings concerned,
 - (iii) Providing examples with more visible illustrations and legible texts,
 - (iv) Providing statistical information on what has been achieved, what is planned in the short-term and what is planned for the longer-term, for the entire property;
 - b) Set up an inventory of engineering structures similar to that of buildings and stations;
- 5. Requests the State Party, when carrying out a Heritage Impact Assessment for the Tehran–Garmsar–Bandar-e Torkaman line electrification project, to ensure that the visual impact of the electrification project is properly documented, in particular at the level of the reference structures and historic stations, and to carry out this study in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context published in 2022;
- 6. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to pursue the railway museum project in Tehran and its network of interpretation centres along the line, which are of great importance in terms of enhancement and community involvement;

7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

166. Gusuku Sites and Related Properties of the Kingdom of Ryukyu (Japan) (C 972)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.166

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.29** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that restoration work for the archaeological remains has been completed and that the reconstruction of replica structures damaged in the fire, especially the State Hall, has progressed as scheduled;
- 4. Requests the State Party to continue its efforts to reconstruct the replica structures in accordance with the recovery work schedule and retain the authenticity of design, form, and artisanship, while ensuring that these constructions do not have any negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the development of "Fire Prevention Measures for The State Hall of Shuri-jo Site" as the basis of the fire prevention concept, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to fully implement them at every structure, and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to continue facilitating the involvement of all stakeholders, including local communities, in the recovery process of the property;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the fact that the State Party has invited a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in June 2023;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the Committee at its 46th session.

167. Sites of Japan's Meiji Industrial Revolution: Iron and Steel, Shipbuilding and Coal Mining (Japan) (C 1484)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.167

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,

- 2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 8B.14**, **42 COM 7B.10** and **44 COM 7B.30** adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 42nd (Manama, 2018) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the implementation by the State Party of the new set of measures as confirmed by the verification mission carried out by the World Heritage Centre;
- 4. <u>Considers</u> that the State Party has taken several additional steps in view of responding to the requests outlined in its Decision **44 COM 7B.30**;
- 5. <u>Acknowledges</u> the State Party's efforts in implementing the World Heritage Convention and <u>underlines</u> the importance for the State Party to continue the implementation of its commitments in order to enhance furthermore the overall interpretation strategy of the site;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue dialogue with the concerned State Parties as well as to conduct further research, data collection and verification, including regarding new testimonies to enhance the interpretation strategy of the site;
- 7. Requests the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any new measures that may be taken in the future with regards to the interpretation strategy of this site and to submit an update on the continued dialogue with the concerned State Parties, as well as on further measures to enhance the interpretation strategy of the site, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, by **1 December 2024.**
- 168. Vat Phou and Associated Ancient Settlements within the Champasak Cultural Landscape (Lao People's Democratic Republic) (C 481)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.168

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 7, 43 COM 7B.68 and 44 COM 7B.146 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul, 2016), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) session respectively,
- 3. Regrets that the State Party has not submitted a state of conservation report for this property, as requested by this Committee;
- 4. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the submission and review of the 2022 Management Plan for the property, <u>also noting</u> that the ICOMOS technical review concluded that this is a preliminary plan that requires augmentation to create a comprehensive document and that concluded that the plan should be augmented to embed a clearly defined processes for protecting the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies:
 - a) An update of the Management Plan which specifically provides the tools to effectively halt the erosion of the OUV of the property,
 - b) An update of the 2022-2026 Action Plan that comprehensively reflects the recommendations and actions in the Management Plan,

- c) An update of the 2016 Champasak Cultural Landscape Master Plan;
- 5. Reiterates its requests to the State Party to:
 - a) Mobilise the necessary resources required for the implementation of the road network, including Roads 14A and 14B,
 - b) Submit an up-to-date topographic map of the property as inscribed in 2001 by **1 December 2023**, for examination by the Committee at its 46th session if the technical requirements are met,
 - Submit a report on progress with the implementation of the mitigation measures suggested in the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) on the water supply extension implemented by Champasak Water Supply State Enterprise,
 - d) Consider the establishment of a legal framework which would require that appropriate Impact Assessments are carried out proactively for all development projects that could have potential impacts on the OUV of World Heritage properties in the Lao PDR;
- 6. <u>Notes with concern</u> the tree planting project and the Phou Ngoy Dam hydropower development project and <u>also requests</u> that the State Party to:
 - a) Provide clarification on the planting project, including whether potential impacts of this
 project were evaluated, notably through a HIA or an Environmental Impact
 Assessment (EIA), and how it intends to take necessary measures to avoid impacts
 on the OUV of the property,
 - b) Before taking any further decisions, granting further rights or entering into any commitments with regards to, or dependent on, the development of the Phou Ngoy Dam hydropower project, develop an independent multidisciplinary HIA or EIA, which should include cultural, environmental and social components, in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and provide as soon as possible the Impact Assessment along with complete details, technical documents and any other relevant material to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies:
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property to assess its state of conservation, the efficacy of its management system and the threat that the Phou Ngoy Dam hydropower development project may pose to the OUV of the property;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

169. Archaeological Ruins at Moenjodaro (Pakistan) (C 138)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.169

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- Recalling Decision 35 COM 7B.77 adopted at its 35th session (UNESCO, 2011).

- 3. <u>Notes with great concern</u> the damage suffered by several parts of the property following the exceptionally heavy rain of August 2022 and <u>commends</u> the great efforts deployed by the management authority to cope with the most urgent needs for consolidation of these affected segments;
- 4. Expresses its appreciation for UNESCO's two emergency missions funded by Emergency International Assistance under the World Heritage Fund to the property in October 2022 and January 2023, as well as the support through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund (HEF) to integrate evaluation on culture and heritage into the Post-Disaster Need Assessment (PDNA) of Pakistan after the August 2022 monsoon;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the analysis provided by the State Party based on UNESCO's abovementioned two emergency missions, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to consider their recommendations and pursue its efforts, in particular for the followings:
 - a) Completion of the overall condition assessments of the property with maps by quarters and by damage and risk item to plan prioritized actions,
 - b) Continuation of the short-term conservation actions to cope with the most vulnerable and damaged parts of the property where quick deterioration is suspected.
 - c) Research to deepen the understanding of major causes of deterioration, such as water stagnation, capillary action salinity and ground water effects on the foundations, as well as to improve conservation materials,
 - d) Elaboration of a full technical proposal, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and designated expert(s) to launch an international appeal and to secure funds for a multi-annual preservation project to cope with short-, medium- and long-term conservation needs, to review and update the existing management and conservation tools, as well as to establish a management plan to strengthen emergency response and preparedness to the multiple effects of climate change and extreme natural hazards.
 - e) Provision of necessary human resources and workforce to cope with the immediate preservation needs as well as with the longer-term conservation actions as necessary;
- 6. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the overall state of conservation of the property, review the overall management and conservation framework, assist in elaborating and updating the necessary management and conservation tools, and review the efficacy and appropriateness of emergency measures applied following the flooding emergency;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

170. Historical Monuments at Makli, Thatta (Pakistan) (C 143)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.170

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.35** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Expresses its profound compassion to the State Party on the impacts of the August 2022 monsoons on the World Heritage property, as well as its loss in human lives and livelihoods, welcomes the response and recovery efforts undertaken, and calls on the international community to support the State Party as it responds to the immediate threats, undertakes longer-term conservation programmes and further addresses risk preparedness and emergency response planning;
- 4. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> for UNESCO's two emergency missions funded through Emergency International Assistance under the World Heritage Fund to the property in November 2022 and February March 2023, as well as the support through Heritage Emergency Fund (HEF) to integrate evaluation on culture and heritage into the Post-Disaster Need Assessment (PDNA) of Pakistan after the August 2022 monsoons;
- 5. <u>Suggests</u> that the State Party consider the recommendations of the two abovementioned UNESCO emergency missions in preparing a report assessing the damage from the August 2022 monsoon, and presenting short-, medium- and long-term action plans and related financial and technical requirements in preserving monuments and areas, which should be treated as priority, conducting monitoring and documentation, studying on the drainage plan, rules to be observed by the visitors, and the update of the Management Plan, including the progress on the disaster risk mitigation plan already under way;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the Management Plan for the property, including the requested Mission Statement and <u>requests</u> that the Management Plan be revised with regard to the comments and findings of the recent technical review, particularly to address engagement of the local managers, and then re-submitted to the World Heritage Centre;
- 7. Welcomes the progress made with implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission, the protection and visitor management initiatives and conservation works undertaken at the property, the staff workshops, stakeholder engagement and community education programmes and urges the State Party to continue with its action programme and to complete the proposed risk preparedness strategy and emergency response plan, and the visitor management framework and to submit these documents and the proposed report on the effects of the recent monsoons, to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Welcomes</u> the 'We Connect Makli' project, the training programmes and capacity building initiatives that have been undertaken and <u>encourages</u> the State Party and collaborating agencies to continue to identify opportunities for staff to benefit from national and international capacity-building programmes, in particular for risk preparedness and disaster response, management, stone conservation, and conservation of moveable heritage and detached architectural elements;
- 9. <u>Takes note</u> of the submission of the action plan for the stabilization and conservation of the mausoleum of Jam Nizamuddin II;
- 10. <u>Takes note</u> of the plans to renovate the main gate at the property and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit documentation including architectural details, materials schedules and visualizations, to the Word Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, prior to commencement of works in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 11. <u>Reiterates its previous request</u> that the State Party submit additional information about the works carried out to provide waterproofing of the Mausoleum of Isa Khan Tarkhan II,

including particularly the reasons for the installation of such extensive areas of new paving, whether the historic pavement was documented, the use of different size pavers and the functionality of the new system;

- 12. Notes the deferral of the proposal for a minor boundary modification to be prepared in line with Paragraphs 163-164 and Annex 11 of the Operational Guidelines and reflecting the boundaries identified in 2013, along with a regulatory plan for the proposed buffer zone, but further requests that this proposal be prepared and submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies at the earliest opportunity;
- 13. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

171. Baroque Churches of the Philippines (Philippines) (C 677bis)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.171

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.149** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the various communication activities with stakeholders and general public undertaken by the State Party;
- 4. Notes with concern that the construction of Binondo-Intramuros Bridge (BIB) project was completed without change to its design and location nor consideration cancelling the project despite the Committee's previous requests, and regrets that the State Party did not submit requested documentation for this project, including updated Archaeological Impact Assessment (AIA), Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), and Conservation Management Plan (CMP) for review, as requested by the Committee, prior to construction works proceeding;
- 5. Notes that the updated HIA concluded that no immediate and direct physical impact has been observed on San Agustin Church including during the construction period, but also notes with concern the significant potential indirect and long-term impacts arising from growth in traffic volume identified through the HIA process, and therefore requests the State Party to implement mitigation measures and to submit a report on these measures and monitoring results, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in order to assess the effectiveness of mitigation against adverse impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 6. Regrets that the BIB has impacted the overall extended setting of the property in the buffer zone and extended setting of the property, and therefore also requests the State Party to consider further mitigation measures and submit a plan for implementing these measures to the World Heritage Centre for review by Advisory Bodies;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to provide further information regarding the proposed, larger heritage development plan for the Intendencia and to clarify the current status of the

potential reconstruction of the Baluarte de Santo Domingo, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre of any project that may impact the OUV of the property, and to submit project documentation including an HIA, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, before making any decision that would be difficult to reverse, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

172. Old Town of Galle and its Fortifications (Sri Lanka) (C 451)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.172

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.37** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Requests the State Party to use the retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value as a foundation for identifying and prioritising all actions for preservation and management of the property, as adopted by the extended 45th session of the World Heritage Committee;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's ongoing commitment to respond to the pervious decisions of the Committee concerning the management of the property, <u>notes</u> the ongoing management efforts; however, in light of the challenges in implementing the Integrated Management Plan (IMP) and the Sustainable Tourism Management Plan (STMP) and <u>also requests</u> that a review and prioritisation of outstanding actions in the existing plans is undertaken and submitted;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to pursue the elaboration of the Conservation Plan and a rapid conservation survey is carried out in order to identify any urgent conservation priorities that have arisen while conservation planning has been delayed and to use this as a basis on which to draft the outstanding Conservation Plan;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to provide details of development and conservation projects that have been approved over the past three years and reminds the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any significant projects, including conservation or adaptive reuse projects, that may negatively impact the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.
- 7. Requests furthermore that a management effectiveness evaluation is undertaken to understand if the financial, human and intellectual resources correspond to the needs of the property, and to identify where additional resources and capacity building are required for Galle Heritage Foundation;

8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

173. Rangiri Dambulla Cave Temple (Sri Lanka) (C 561)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.173

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.75, 43 COM 8B.1** and **44 COM 7B.150** adopted at its 43rd session (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the efforts and progress made by the State Party to continue to improve the overall state of conservation and management of the property;
- 4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on inviting a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to implement all the recommendations of the mission:
- 5. Requests the State Party to further restructure and revise the Management Plan for the property, in collaboration with the key management stakeholders, in line with the recommendations of the 2023 mission, and in particular to ensure that all attributes conveying the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) are identified and protected, and the root causes of their deterioration are identified and acted on:
- 6. <u>Also urges</u> the State Party to facilitate an improved and effective relationship between the Department of Archaeology and the Temple Authority and common commitment to conservation of the OUV of the property, to encourage dialogue between the key stakeholders in the management of the property, and to develop a mutually acceptable and clearly outlined decision-making process;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to adopt systematic and coherent documentation methods to enable the establishment of baseline data leading to the regular monitoring and understanding of changes and effectiveness of adopted conservation actions;
- 8. <u>Further urges</u> the State Party, in consultation with the key management stakeholders, to establish a visitor management framework including appropriate codes of conduct for visitors, pilgrims and tourists to regulate the flow and sensitive to the needs of both pilgrims and the conservation of all attributes of OUV; such framework and codes of conduct to be based on the information collected through a visitor monitoring programme which clarifies the current visitation pattern and impacts, and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to clearly define the boundaries of both the property and the buffer zone, define the purpose of the buffer zone, and submit, when completed, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;

- 10. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to advise the Committee on the reported development of the proposed Central Expressway Project, Kadawatha to Dambulla, and its relationship to the property and the buffer zone;
- 11. <u>Requests furthermore</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the Committee at its 47th session.

174. Historic Centre of Bukhara (Uzbekistan) (C 602bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.174

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.38** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made to address previously identified threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property through regulatory change, capacity building, preparation of additional guidance documents, and proposed conservation works;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the establishment of the of the Agency for Cultural Heritage (ACH), the local Public Scientific Advisory Council and the International Advisory Committee (IAC) for World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan and <u>emphasizes</u> that the IAC with the support of its experts should advise the national authorities on the conservation of the cultural heritage properties and implementation of Committee decisions and previous mission recommendations;
- 5. Notes that substantial revisions are necessary to incorporate the outcomes of the 2020 Reactive Monitoring mission into the Management Plan and integrate the principles of the Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011) within the Master Plan, and further welcomes advice from the State Party that the moratorium on development and new work has been extended to include the buffer zone of the property and will remain in place until the integrated Master Plan and Management Plan are finalised, submitted to the World Heritage Centre and positively reviewed;
- 6. Reiterates its previous request that the State Party implement fully the recommendations of the 2020 mission;
- 7. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, and in accordance with the provisions of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, revised detailed project documentation for proposed works to Shakhristan Bazaar, Kalon Mosque, Amir Alimkhan Madrassah, Mir Arab Madrassah, within the Ark Citadel and Khoja Kalon Hauz, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to provide a report on urgent conservation works to Abdulazzizkhan Madrassah, as well as on the implementation of the project for Abdulakhan Madrassa, which have been supported through International Assistance;
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue to prepare Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) for all major conservation or development projects, and to adopt the methodology of the

Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to continue to submit detailed project documentation to the World Heritage Centre for review, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, including for the proposed installation of 15 vertical drainage wells, which are intended to address salinity and groundwater issues;

- 9. Also encourages the State Party to ensure that stronger legal protection, planning codes and owner incentives are provided to control development in mahallas, including protection for individual traditional houses, which are not listed under national protection, as these are attributes supporting the OUV of the property, as well as the continued efforts to deepen the understanding of all stakeholders on the rules, regulations and role of each stakeholder relating to the World Heritage properties, especially the local authorities and inhabitants;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

175. The Architectural Work of Le Corbusier, an Outstanding Contribution to the Modern Movement (Argentina, Belgium, France, Germany, India, Japan, Switzerland) (C 1321rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.175

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.152** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the enhanced cooperation between States Parties for the conservation of the property, in particular through regular meetings of the International Standing Conference;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> the efforts made by the States Parties to undertake Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) for proposed works in the different components of the property, <u>also welcomes</u> the submission of three HIA reports for proposed works at the Capitol Complex of Chandigarh (India), and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to consistently notify the World Heritage Centre of new projects within the property and its buffer zone that may have a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to approve only approve those project proposals for which HIAs, conducted in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, do not identify a negative impact;
- 5. Recommends that the projects for the Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning ancillary structures project, for the Multilevel basement car park project and for the Holistic Development of Punjab and Haryana High Court Project in the Capitol Complex of Chandigarh be suspended, in view of the negative impacts resulting from the HIA reports, and that alternative locations and solutions be sought, which do not impact on the OUV of

- the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to submit the new proposals to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party of India that the recommendations contained in the ICOMOS Technical Review of the three proposed projects for the Capital Complex of Chandigarh, a component of the property located in India, be implemented prior to the commencement of any construction;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

176. Historic Centre of the City of Salzburg (Austria) (C 784)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.176

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.41** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Acknowledges the efforts of the State Party to mitigate the negative impact of the 'Schwarzstrasse 45/Ernest-Thun-Strasse', the 'Nelböck Viaduct Rainerstrasse/Bahnhofsvorplatz', the 'Paracelsus indoor swimming pool', and the 'Dr Franz-Rehrl Platz Residential Area (Residential Buildings City Life Rehrlplatz)' projects on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and its attributes during their implementation phase, but regrets that the impacts of these projects on the OUV of the property were not systematically assessed and a dialogue on the plans for these projects with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies was not conducted early in the planning or concept phase, and that the possibility of mitigating their recognised adverse impacts was therefore limited:
- 4. <u>Also acknowledges</u> the submission of the design concept for the planned Salzburg Festival Building, <u>welcomes</u> the revised design of the project, which has abandoned the envisaged golden wall coating, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit its final design plans to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before building rights are granted or implementation is undertaken;
- 5. Also welcomes the information that the original Priesterhausgarten housing project has been abandoned and that new planned projects will consider the outcomes and recommendation of the 2019 Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), and also requests the State Party to submit the final design plans of the project to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before building rights are granted, and only approve a project proposal for which HIAs, conducted in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, do not identify a negative impact on the OUV of the property;
- 6. <u>Notes</u> the information on the status of the zoning and development plans, as well as the advisory framework developed to assess the potential impact of projects on the OUV of the

property, and <u>urges</u> the State Party to implement its previous requests for the development of a comprehensive Urban Land Use Plan to further strengthen the protection of the setting of the property;

- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to further revise the Management Plan to ensure that:
 - The Management Plan becomes a comprehensive tool to support the planning framework for planned and proposed projects within the property, its buffer zone and its wider setting,
 - b) Adequate management mechanisms are in place to protect and preserve the OUV of the property and its attributes, in line with the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, including mechanisms to carry out impact assessments (including visual impact assessments and cumulative impact assessments) in conformity with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context, developed in collaboration between the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre, for changes and projects that may have a negative impact on the OUV of the property;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 177. The Great Spa Towns of Europe (Austria, Belgium, Czechia, France, Germany, Italy, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1613)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.177

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.16** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021).
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress made by the States Parties to revise the boundaries of Baden bei Wien and Montecatini Terme and to extend the buffer zones of Karlovy Vary and Vichy, and <u>requests</u> the States Parties to submit a minor modification to the boundaries of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines, as soon as all legal procedures to extend the buffer zone of Vichy are completed;
- 4. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties to continue their efforts to strengthen the legal protection of Baden bei Wien, Montecatini Terme, Spa, Bad Ems and Bad Kissingen and to submit detailed maps showing the extent of the legal designations in place;
- 5. <u>Reiterates</u> its recommendation to extend and further detail the monitoring programme for the property as a whole;
- 6. <u>Encourages</u> the States Parties to continue their efforts to integrate impact assessment procedures into the management systems of all component parts, and to define the role and responsibilities of the Great Spas Management Board in these procedures as well as in the assessment of potential cumulative impacts arising from development projects in the component parts that is also consistent with 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape:

- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to implement the recommendations contained in the ICOMOS Technical Review of April 2023 on the redevelopment of the former Gasworks at the Bath component and to submit project plans for the redevelopment of the Rugby Stadium to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS;
- 8. Requests the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated joint report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

178. Historic Centre of Sheki with the Khan's Palace (Azerbaijan) (C 1549rev)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.178

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.153** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made to strengthen protection and conservation of the overall historic urban landscape of the property, particularly the planned productive 'garden city', the distinctive local architectural traditions and the forested setting of the property;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the updated Urban Regeneration Plan, the new liaison with the Forestry Service to improve monitoring, the ongoing monitoring of development projects by the Yukhari- Bash Reserve Office, and the proposed improvements to the Restoration and Infill Manuals;
- 5. Also notes that the State Party acknowledges the current weaknesses related to the absence of a detailed inventory of the elements of the historic urban landscape that need to be monitored, and the limited power of the Yukhari-Bash Reserve Office over a sizeable part of the property (approximately 75%) that is privately owned, as owners do not have to obtain authorization for alterations to either their buildings or garden areas, and expresses concern over that green garden areas are being built upon which, as the State Party acknowledges, poses a threat to Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the commencement of an inventorying process for the attributes of the OUV and the development of a GIS database to encompass urban form, building types, traditional buildings materials, architectural details and gardens;
- 7. <u>Further welcomes</u> the initiation of the process of designating the property as a Special Protection Regime of the Yukhari-Bash State Historical and Architectural Reserve, which will define rules and regulations for each of the attributes of the property's OUV based on detailed inventories, and formally recognise the Restoration and Infill Manuals;
- 8. <u>Further notes</u> the proposed timeframe for the completion of the inventories, and rules and regulation necessary for the finalisation of the Special Protection Regime and its intended approval by the Cabinet of Ministers by the end of 2023, but <u>considers</u> that this timeframe is too tight to allow these to be defined in ways that ensure that the measures are as effective as possible, and requests the State Party to consider extending this timeframe;
- 9. <u>Recommends</u> that the State Party submit drafts of the inventory and of the rules and regulations for the proposed Special Protection Regime to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, in advance of either being finalized;

10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

179. Ancient City of Nessebar (Bulgaria) (C 217)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.179

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.154** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress made by the State Party in addressing the Committee's previous decisions and the mission's recommendations, but <u>notes with concern</u> that some issues continue to remain unresolved:
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> that the 2023 Reactive Monitoring mission confirmed the findings of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission that some of the attributes underlying the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property have deteriorated;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> that important actions to establish a spatial planning framework and instruments, essential for adequate protection and management of the property, are being implemented and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to finalize the Conservation and Management Plan (CMP), in 18 months;
- 6. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to invite a series of consultative missions of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in order to assist the CMP elaboration;
- 7. Further notes with great concern that the Integrated Development Plan for Nessebar Municipality 2021-2027 adopted in August 2021, proposes a vision for the future of Nessebar revolving around the tourism mono-economy, with actions that may locally improve spatial qualities of the property but have greater potential to exacerbate current threats and further erode the attributes of OUV, and urges the State Party to revise the Plan in the light of an OUV-based vision and strategy for the future of Nessebar that does not focus only on tourism;
- 8. <u>Strongly reiterates its urgent requests</u> to the State Party to:
 - Devise a vision for the future of the "Ancient City of Nessebar" based on its OUV, which pursues sustainable, compatible and equitable development of the property within the larger municipal territory and is not solely focused on tourism,
 - b) Develop, approve and implement the CMP for the property, with the ultimate goal of ensuring the safeguarding and recovery of the attributes of OUV, while harnessing the participation of the local community and civil society and building on the principles of the UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (2011) and the ICOMOS International Charter for Cultural Heritage Tourism (2022); establish mechanisms to guarantee that the CMP objectives, strategies and actions are taken into due account in all other spatial or development plans under preparation or already adopted,

- c) Approve and enforce the General Development Master Plan for Nessebar Municipality and consequently the Detailed Development Plan for the Ancient City of Nessebar, with all necessary support from the national authorities and incorporating all relevant Committee's and missions' recommendations,
- d) Guarantee that the protection regimes for the property are known and respected by all stakeholders;
- Further requests the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2023 Reactive Monitoring mission as well as previous recommendations of the 2018 Reactive Monitoring mission;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, the Conservation and Management Plan, including the heritage under water, Detailed Development Plan and the General Development Master Plan, and by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session, considering that the urgent conservation needs of this property require a broad mobilization to preserve its Outstanding Universal Value, including the possible inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

180. Old City of Dubrovnik (Croatia) (C 95ter)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.180

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.42** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> progress achieved with the successful completion of the development of the Buffer Zone part of the Conservation Plan for the Old City of Dubrovnik and the Management Plan for the property;
- 4. Requests the State Party to finalise and submit, at the earliest opportunity, in one of the Committee's working languages, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, the following documents (or their translations):
 - a) The Conservation Plan for the Historic Core of Dubrovnik,
 - b) The Study of Sustainable Tourism Development and Carrying Capacity of the City of Dubrovnik,
 - c) Disaster Risk Management Plan,
 - d) Interpretation Strategy;
- 5. Reiterates its previous requests to the State Party to submit, in one of the working languages of the Committee, comprehensive project details of the repair works undertaken on the sewer system and for the on-hold Bosanka project (if and when it will proceed), including related Heritage Impact Assessments prepared in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, for review by the World

- Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, in conformity with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. Takes note of the sustainable tourism and interpretation measures and projects reported by the State Party, including: traffic regulation, the 'Smart City' programme, green tourism initiatives, the communication plan the 'Marking the Protected Objects in the City of Dubrovnik', and the proposed new so-called 'World Heritage Centre', also requests the State Party to ensure that these initiatives are guided by an over-arching Interpretation Strategy, as already requested by the Committee, and strongly encourages the State Party to opt for a different name for the new network of spaces for interpretation, education and research, that does not lead to any confusion with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre;
- 7. <u>Also takes note</u> of the State Party's report on actions arising from the Memoranda of Understanding between the City of Dubrovnik, the Cruise Lines International Association and the Global Sustainable Tourism Council;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 181. Venetian Works of Defence between 15th and 17th centuries: Stato da Terra western Stato da Mar (Croatia, Italy, Montenegro) (C 1533)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.181

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 8B.21** and **44 COM 7B.43** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the States Parties on their support for the International Coordinating Group (ICG) and its ongoing and important efforts to establish coordinated reporting and processes for carrying capacity studies, local management plans, visitor management plans, transnational research, conservation and interpretation strategies;
- Notes the completion of the carrying capacity studies for each component and the progress made in relation to coordinated promotion and educational activities for the transnational property;
- 5. Also notes that information and documentation on the four projects identified in the Committee's previous decision have been provided, and recommends that more detailed project information and documentation as well as Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) focusing on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and the attributes that underpin it be submitted by the respective States Parties to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, prior to the implementation of:
 - a) the renewal of the Citadela Bastion project (Zadar), if it is planned to resume in the future,
 - b) the Ravnice Urban Plan project/Gates of Zadar,

- c) the Visitor Centre at Minerska Bay (Šibenik),
- d) the urban redevelopment and rehabilitation project of a section of Palmanova, including the water tower reuse proposal;
- 6. Reminds the State Party of Italy of its previous request to comply with the recommendations of ICOMOS concerning the Fara parking project and, in particular, to submit as a matter of urgency the HIA requested by the World Heritage Centre in a letter dated 8 January 2020 and to develop a comprehensive plan for parking infrastructure and traffic control to reduce traffic and to reduce or ration car parking opportunities in the Upper City of Bergamo for non-residents in this part of the town;
- 7. Requests the States Parties, individually and through the ICG, to continue to complete and finalise the work in progress on the Committee's previous requests, including:
 - a) Finalising, as an urgent priority, visitor management plans based on the completed carrying capacity studies;
 - b) Revising and enlarging the buffer zones as specified for the components of Zadar, Kotor and Peschiera del Garda, and submitting these as minor boundary modifications according to Paragraphs 163-164 of the Operational Guidelines;
 - c) Establishing, as an urgent priority, a common template for local conservation and management plans, based on the property's OUV and the identification of the attributes of each component, and finalise them for each component,
 - d) Developing values-based, transnational conservation, promotion and interpretation strategy for the whole property;
 - e) Finalising monitoring arrangements for the whole property;
 - Finalising, as an urgent priority, a coordinated and harmonised approach to HIA, based on the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context,
 - g) Ensuring that all future changes that may affect the OUV of the property are subject to formal HIA processes prior to their approval, including tourism infrastructure and restoration projects and other projects included in local management plans;
- 8. <u>Also reminds</u> the States Parties to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any major development project that may negatively impact the OUV of a property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 9. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a joint updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

182. Historic Centre of Český Krumlov (Czechia) (C 617)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.182

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **35 COM 7B.88** and **37 COM 7B.103** adopted at its 35th (UNESCO, 2011) and 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to dismantle the revolving theatre from its current location immediately after the expiration of the current lease agreement for its operation in the castle park on 31 December 2023, and <u>requests</u> that this work be accomplished by 30 June 2024;
- 4. Notes that a project to construct a replacement theatre adjacent to the Baroque castle park as recommended by the 2014 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission is included in the National Investment Plan of the Czech Republic until 2050, but that this project is currently not being actively developed, and requests the State Party, should this project proceed, to ensure that the design of a new revolving theatre in the buffer zone is in accordance with the mission's recommendations and to conduct a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the project, in line with the Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage Context, and submit it together with the detailed project documentation to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Further welcomes</u> the proposed renovation of the overall historic park within the framework of the National Investment Plan and the on-going restoration of the Bellaire Pavilion, including the re-landscaping of the adjacent site of the revolving theatre once it is removed; <u>also requests</u> the State Party to seek the advice of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to decisions being taken on the overall rehabilitation of the castle park;
- 6. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to systematically conduct HIAs as a pre-requisite for all development projects within and around the World Heritage property, in line with the Guidance for Impact Assessment in a World Heritage Context, and to submit them to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 7. Requests finally the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies.

183. Historic Centre of Prague (Czechia) (C 616bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.183

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,

- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.44** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the State Party on the progress made in complying with the requirements and processes of the World Heritage Convention, its Operational Guidelines, previous Committee decisions and mission recommendations, including the completion of the Metropolitan Plan and the Architectural-Urbanistic Analysis of the Prague Heritage Reservation, the publication of the Management Plan in English, the new Building Act, the advice that the City of Prague Principles of Territorial Development are being updated taking into account the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, and the integration of heritage into government processes and agencies;
- 4. Welcomes the State Party's decision that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) will be prepared for major projects within the property, its buffer zone or wider setting and for regulatory changes, which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, requests that these HIAs adopt the methodology of the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and reiterates its previous request to the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, in conformity with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines:
 - a) HIAs for all proposed projects which may affect the OUV of the property,
 - b) An assessment of the cumulative impacts of all projects executed within the property, its buffer zone and wider setting, from the baseline condition of the property at the time of its inscription on the World Heritage List, on the OUV of the property;
- 5. Reiterates its previous request to the State Party to submit the proposal for the cable car project between Podbada-Troja-Bohnice within the buffer zone of the property, along with the corresponding Environmental Impact and Strategic Environmental Assessments, including an HIA, and also requests the State Party to submit an HIA for the final design of the proposed Prague Philharmonic Hall, including verified visual images of the views from the property, including Prague Castle, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. Notes the information provided by the State Party about a range of conservation and other projects, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to revise and amend the proposals for the Vyšehrad Railway Bridge and the Masterplan for New Florenc in accordance with the technical reviews provided by ICOMOS, and to continue to inform the World Heritage Centre of the specific proposals for these projects as well as for the proposed Kavčí Hory Residence Park and for other projects, which may affect the OUV of the property, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations of the 2019 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to provide updates regarding:
 - a) Advancement in aligning national and local laws and regulations with those necessary for heritage protection and management of World Heritage properties in accordance with the World Heritage Convention and its Operational Guidelines and in line with international norms and standards that may include new laws as well as amendments to existing ones, such as the Amendment of the State Heritage Care Act and the Act for Cultural Heritage Preservation,
 - b) The forthcoming update of the City of Prague Principles of Territorial Development to take into account the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, and building regulations that may be varied for each guarter or historical block as

appropriate, to guide and manage the identity of the built form at a range of scales, from volume and height to building materials, colours, railings and doorframes;

- 8. <u>Notes further</u> that although the State Party has not implemented the Committee's previous requests to introduce a general moratorium on major projects within the property, its buffer zone and wider setting, the Metropolitan Plan provides that future construction will not exceed the height of existing structures in the Pankrác Plain, that construction in the Pentagon is restricted and that a process is now in place to develop and implement appropriate building regulations;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

184. Le Havre, the City Rebuilt by Auguste Perret (France) (C 1181)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.184

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **29 COM 8B.38** adopted at its 29th session (Durban, 2005), through which 'Le Havre, the City Rebuilt by Auguste Perret' was inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv),
- 3. Notes with utmost concern that the State Party did not comply with the requirements of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines and did not provide timely information to the Committee on a large-scale project, did not share with the World Heritage Centre the Heritage Impact Assessment of the project until after the building permit had been issued, and failed to take into account the findings of the related ICOMOS Technical Reviews clearly outlining the negative impact of the project on the attributes underlying the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 4. Regrets that the State Party did not better seize the opportunities to reduce the negative impacts of the Project on the property's OUV during the planning stage;
- 5. <u>Further expresses concern</u> that the planning and management systems in place at the property have allowed this development to take place, and <u>recommends</u> that these systems be strengthened and made consistent with the aim of maintaining the OUV of the property;
- 6. <u>Further notes with concern</u> the findings of the 2023 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property, which found that its integrity may be no longer guaranteed, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to urgently reduce the negative impacts of the Tour Alta on the integrity of the property according to the recommendations provided by the mission, namely:
 - a) Lightening as much as possible the shades of the Tour's facade cladding,
 - b) Avoiding any night-time lighting,
 - c) Ensuring a better interface with the public spaces at the foot of the tower and the urban fabric between Quai Videcog and Rue de Paris and in relation to the Saint-

François district through an ad hoc urban planning study to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS;

- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to take prompt action to ensure that the property's OUV is duly taken into account in all municipal regulations and to proactively implement all recommendations provided by the Advisory mission to reduce the impacts of the Tour Alta on the property's OUV and to improve the effectiveness of protection and management mechanisms taking into consideration the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL);
- 8. Requests furthermore the State Party to invite a Reactive Monitoring mission to be carried out in 2024 to examine the overall state of conservation of the property, to follow up on the recommendations of the Advisory mission of 2023, and to make recommendations to the Committee, in particular on how the management system of the property can be strengthened and more effective planning controls put in place to prevent a recurrence;
- 9. Requests finally the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

185. Nice, Winter Resort Town of the Riviera (France) (C 1635)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.185

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.38** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the progress made by the State Party in implementing most of the recommendations made by the Committee at the time of inscription;
- 4. <u>Also notes</u> that the boundaries of the property as indicated in the revised map submitted by the State Party are considered adequate;
- 5. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to complete the inventory of built heritage as well as the documentation of the interiors of the buildings with a view to protecting them;
- 6. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to strengthen the monitoring programme for the state of conservation of the property based on clear, easy to measure indicators to track changes in the condition of the attributes over time, and against a well-defined baseline;
- 7. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to undertake a mid-term review of the management plan by 2025;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies.

186. Historical Monuments of Mtskheta (Georgia) (C 708bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.186

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.48** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the State Party's continued efforts to advance the development of the 'Management Documentation for Spatial Territorial Development of Mtskheta', including Mtskheta Urban Land Use Master Plan (ULUMP), and <u>reiterates its request</u> that the drafts of the main components of ULUMP be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, no later than **1 February 2024**;
- 4. Commends the State Party for its decision to maintain the 'Enactment of Special Regime of Regulation of Urban Development and Land Privatization in the Cultural Heritage Protection Zones of Mtskheta Municipality' (the Moratorium) until the 'Management Documentation for Spatial Territorial Development of Mtskheta' has been adopted, and until all the necessary control and monitoring systems have been put in place, and encourages the State Party to strictly implement the Moratorium in the meantime;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> the ongoing and planned conservation works at Svetitskhoveli Cathedral Church, Jvari Monastery Complex and Samtavro Monastery taking into account ICOMOS recommendations on these projects in order to complete the procedures or considering additional aspects for their documentation, analysis, conservation and protection measures;
- 6. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to continue to implement the recommendations of the 2018 Advisory mission as well as to take into account the recommendations included in relevant ICOMOS Technical Reviews to ensure that actions with negative impacts on the World Heritage property are avoided;
- 7. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue to submit, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, detailed information on all proposed development within the property, its buffer zone and its wider setting, for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to any decisions being taken that could be difficult to reverse;
- 8. <u>Takes note</u> that no major development project other than the Tbilisi Wind Power Plant project is currently planned in the setting of the World Heritage property, <u>requests</u> that an update of its status be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, and <u>invites</u> the State Party to continue to ensure that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) for development projects are undertaken, assessing the multiple and cumulative impacts of current and planned developments and taking into account potential impacts on the OUV of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

187. Upper Middle Rhine Valley (Germany) (C 1066)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.187

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 7B.83** and **44 COM 7B.155** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the conclusion of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission of May 2022 that there are currently no major threats to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, its authenticity and integrity, but that a negative evolution related to changes is already discernible and could cumulate to a serious loss of values and degradation of the OUV, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to implement the mission's recommendations in a timely manner;
- 4. Notes with satisfaction the dedicated work and progress made in updating the property's Management Plan, as well as the development of tools to protect and preserve its OUV, encourages the State Party to revise and further develop the attributes that convey the OUV of the property in line with the retrospective Statement of OUV and other research resources, and to develop a sustainable tourism strategy for the property, and also requests the State Party to:
 - a) Ensure that an adequate management system of the property extends also to its buffer zone and its wider setting,
 - b) Submit the final draft Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to adoption;
- 5. Further requests the State Party to:
 - a) Submit the conclusions of the regional impact assessment and the related decision for the planned permanent river crossing over the Rhine, as well as the planned specific design that will form the basis of a planning approval procedure, to the World Heritage Centre and not to take any irreversible decisions on the final plans until to the conclusions and recommendations of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies' review are known.
 - b) Not to approve any design proposal for the planned permanent river crossing over the Rhine that would threaten the property's authenticity and integrity and the protection and preservation of its OUV;
- 6. Commends the State Party for developing a comprehensive tool to assess the impact of existing and planned wind turbines in the buffer zone and wider setting of the property, which provides the basis for establishing exclusion zones for these facilities and a framework for spatial planning, but <u>regrets</u> that a harmonised legislative tools for the entire property has not been developed as requested in Decision 43 COM 7B.83;
- 7. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to finalise the Hall of Myths building with a flat skylight and to place the planned crystal rock inside the building;
- 8. <u>Notes with regret</u> that the plans for a new hotel on the Loreley Plateau are planned to be resumed, and <u>reminds</u> the State Party of its previous request to:

- Develop a strategic spatial framework for the future use of the area, tested through an impact assessment, that supports the OUV of the property before any new proposals are developed,
- b) Ensure that an impact assessment process is conducted at the early planning stages of any new hotel project, and to submit the related plans to the World Heritage Centre as soon as possible for review with the Advisory Bodies, accompanied by supporting documentation that ensures that the plans are compatible with the World Heritage status and the outcomes of the impact assessment;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to consider the outcomes and implement the specific recommendations of the 2022 mission in relation both to the 2029 Federal Horticultural Show and other specific projects planned and implemented, including the Koblenz Cable Car, the 'Koblenzer Brauerei' area and the Summer Bobsleigh Run next to the Loreley Landscape, while continuing to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of the status of these projects;
- 10. Requests moreover the State Party, in relation to the plans for the expansion of the Sooneck open pit quartzite mine, to consider approving the proposal only after it has been reviewed the Advisory Bodies, together with the corresponding impact assessment which should be conducted in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage context;
- 11. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, detailed plans for the planned redevelopment of the Löhnberger Mill building complex and site in Lahnstein, as well as for the planned modernization or replacement of the existing moorings in the river Rhine as soon as they become available, together with the corresponding impact assessment documentation, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

188. The Porticoes of Bologna (Italy) (C 1650)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.188

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.41** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes notes</u> of the progress made by the State Party in the implementation of the recommendations made by the Committee at the time of inscription and <u>notes with</u> satisfaction the creation of a dedicated office for the management of the property;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the invitation by the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Advisory mission to assist in the implementation of the Committee's recommendations,

particularly the revision of the boundaries of the property, with a view to submitting both a revised draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (SOUV) and a minor boundary modification request in the future, in accordance with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;

- 5. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to strengthen the management and monitoring of the property and to ensure that all component parts that constitute the property benefit from the highest level of protection available, and <u>considers</u> that such protection must extent to the entire area covered by the component parts and <u>also encourages</u> the implementation of the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape as a tool for integrating urban heritage protection with urban development plans and processes;
- 6. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to submit further details of planned projects to the World Heritage Centre, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to ensure that all projects which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property are subject to impact assessments before any decision is made that would be difficult to reverse, as required by Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines and in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

189. Venice and its Lagoon (Italy) (C 394)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.189

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- Recalling Decisions 38 COM 7B.27, 40 COM 7B.52, 41 COM 7B.48, 43 COM 7B.86, 43 COM 8B.46 and 44 COM 7B.50 adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019), and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's efforts to implement previous Committee decisions and several of the 2020 mission recommendations, including:
 - Continuing enhancing tourism management tools, public spaces, and public housing possibilities,
 - b) Improving coordination between the different stakeholders to enhance the protection of the ecosystem of the Lagoon and reduce the polluting emissions from the industrial area of Marghera,
 - c) Creating and reinforcing tide barriers, and the reconstruction and consolidation of beaches and coastal dunes, as well as the development of advanced tidal forecasting technology,
 - Reconfirmation of the ban on large ships from the San Marco Basin Giudecca Canal and the continuing efforts to find new options for docking large ships outside the Lagoon,

- e) Still ongoing update of the Management Plan, as well as the development of World Heritage-focused Heritage Impact Assessments for a set of projects,
- f) Adopting an experimental system for managing tourist flows, based on an entry fee and a compulsory booking method;
- 4. <u>Considers</u> nevertheless that further progress still needs to be made by the State Party in addressing individual threats and their cumulative impact, and therefore <u>requests</u> the State Party, as a matter of priority, to:
 - Continue research on the evaluation of existing phenomena, prediction and modelling
 of future phenomena related to climate change and its current and potential impacts
 on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and develop related action
 plans,
 - b) Fully complete and operationalise the MoSE system and ensure its long-term management and maintenance including through establishing with urgency the proposed management authority.
 - c) Ensure close joint monitoring by all relevant stakeholders of the impacts of the MoSE system (construction and operation), and continue developing appropriate measures to mitigate any negative impacts it might have on the ecosystem of the Lagoon,
 - d) Submit the results of related studies on the environmental impact of large ships passing through the Malamocco-Marghera canal and the competition for docking points outside the Lagoon for large passenger ships and container ships to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before irreversible decisions are made, furthermore, to continue to prioritise the option of redirecting large ships to other more suitable ports in the region as a final solution,
 - e) Continue submitting action plans and documents related to the morphological conditions of the Lagoon and sustainable energy use to the World Heritage Centre for review and comments by the Advisory Bodies
 - f) Continue working towards a sustainable tourism model for the property and developing efficient strategies and measures that will reduce the exceptionally high number of visitors to the property, significantly improve the quality of life of the residents and the requalification of urban areas to their former residential use, as well as creating a more diverse resilient economic basis for future of the property and its inhabitants:
- 5. Also notes the information provided on the construction of temporary barriers to protect the San Marco Basilica and the surrounding area from the high-water phenomena not managed by the MoSE, and <u>furthermore requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, as soon as possible, detailed documentation on the works planned to elevate the entire San Marco insula, for review by the Advisory Bodies, prior to any irreversible decision being taken and implemented:
- 6. <u>Also considers</u> that a strategic long-term vision for the long-term preservation of the property has to be further developed, and that integrated coordinated management at all stakeholder-levels needs to be further strengthened, and therefore <u>urges</u> the State Party to:
 - a) Finalise the updating of the Management Plan with adequate measures for the future buffer zone as well, and develop in parallel an Integrated Master Plan and a skyline policy for the property,
 - b) Integrate measures in line with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines that ensure the protection and preservation of the OUV of the property in the planning, Environmental Impact Assessment and Strategic Environmental Assessment processes, and ensure that specific World Heritage-focused impact assessments are

- carried out if no other impact assessment procedures are in place to consider the impacts of planned or proposed projects within the property and its wider setting,
- c) Establish processes in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines for submitting planned/proposed changes and projects to the World Heritage Centre in a timely manner for review by the Advisory Bodies and ensure that impact assessment processes and the Management Plan support the relevant decision-making,
- d) Resubmit a revised minor boundary modification request for the establishment of a buffer zone, responding to the requests made in previous Committee decisions;
- 7. <u>Further considers</u> that reported large scale development projects that are currently being investigated for implementation in the property hold potential, individually and cumulatively, to have an adverse impact on the OUV of the property, and therefore <u>expresses concern</u> that these projects, when implemented, will add to the possible deterioration effects of human intervention, climate change impacts and mass tourism, which could threaten to result in irreversible change, and substantial loss of historical authenticity and cultural significance, which are an integral part of the OUV of the property, if appropriate measures are not implemented;
- 8. <u>Expresses concern</u> that, despite the progress assessed in the implementation of previous Committee decisions and mission recommendations some important issues remain to be addressed, related in particular to mass tourism, development projects and climate change;
- Further considers that the corrective measures proposed by the State Party need to be further developed, and therefore <u>also urges</u> the State Party to continue, in the implementation of previous Committee decisions and recommendations of the 2020 Advisory mission, a structured consultation process with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 10. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory mission to the property to assess the overall state of conservation of the property and to engage with the State Party in its efforts to address the issues which could have a potential impact on the preservation of the property;
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

190. City of Valletta (Malta) (C 131)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.190

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **33 COM 7B.113** adopted at its 33rd session (Sevilla, 2009),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the efforts of the State Party with regard the restoration of state-owned monuments and churches in the property;

- 4. Requests the State Party to submit the following documents to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in a timely manner and prior to their formal adoption:
 - a) The 'Views and Vistas analysis' from strategic viewpoints to address the issue of height controls inside and outside the property,
 - b) The delineation of an adequate buffer zone, which should also be responsive to the conclusions of the 'Views and Vistas analysis', in accordance with paragraphs 103 to 105 of the Operational Guidelines.
 - c) The final draft of the Management Plan for the property, in line with the 2011 Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape, including a tourism management plan and provisions for the management of the buffer zone, once adopted by the Committee, and the maintenance of important views and vistas in the setting of the property, so that it becomes a fully operational instrument for the efficient management of the property and its future;
- 5. Welcomes the preparation of Heritage and/or Environmental Impact Assessments for several large-scale development projects, and encourages the State Party to continue to improve the Heritage Impact Assessments process by paying due attention to the indirect and cumulative impacts of the many projects under preparation, including for individual adaptive re-use of buildings and large-scale developments both within the property and its setting, such as the Evans Building and Manoel Island projects, based on a finalised 'View and Vista's analysis' and using the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and to submit details of these projects with their accompanying impact assessments to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any decisions are made that may be difficult to reverse;
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

191. Natural and Culturo-Historical Region of Kotor (Montenegro) (C 125ter)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.191

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.51** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the preparation of Heritage Impact Assessments (HIA) for a number of developments and the provision of information on various proposed projects, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue to improve the HIA process and to give particular consideration to the indirect and cumulative impacts of the many projects being implemented, in the light of the strategic documents being prepared for the property and the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 4. <u>Expresses concern</u> about the slow pace of revision of the Management Plan and <u>requests</u> that it is completed as a matter of priority, incorporating the recommendations of the 2018 Joint Reactive Monitoring mission so that it becomes a fully operational instrument for the

efficient management of the entire property and its buffer zone, with binding policies and provisions endorsed at national and local government level within the changing legal framework, addressing the following issues in particular:

- a) Development issues, in harmony with the Spatial urban Plan for Kotor Municipality,
- b) The conservation of the tangible and intangible attributes that convey Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and other values,
- c) Disaster risk reduction,
- d) Tourism management, including issues related to the direct, indirect and cumulative impacts that tourism could have on the property;
- 5. Notes that the moratorium on new construction and development ended in 2020 and urges the State Party to renew it until a complete suite of planning and protection measures are in force to satisfactorily accommodate possible sustainable developments within the sensitive landscape of the area and prevent any impact on the cultural and landscape values of the property;
- 6. <u>Reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit the following documents to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies at the earliest opportunity:
 - The updated HIA for Natural and Culturo-Historic Region of Kotor for Harmonizing Policy/Planning Framework and Instruments,
 - b) The Detailed Urban Plan for Lepetani and the Urban Plan for the Lepetani Tourist Zone,
 - c) The buffer zone study to define areas in and around the property where an impact assessment should be required for potential projects,
 - d) An HIA for the Verige Bridge project,
 - e) Documentation on the proposed underpass near Kotor old town and the planned developments associated with the Luštica peninsula road, even if these have already been authorised.
 - f) The revised project for the Morini accommodation complex,
 - g) The detailed spatial plan under preparation for the conversion and construction of a hotel complex on the former Fjord Hotel site and the Jugooceanija building,
 - Relevant documentation on any other projects proposed in the property, buffer zone or wider setting that may have a potential negative impact on the OUV, such as the projects proposed on the Sveti Marko Island and the projects located on either side of the entrance to Kotor Bay;
- 7. Further expresses concern about quarries which were recently permitted in the buffer zone of the property, and about plans for future quarries, requests the State Party to provide as a matter of urgency to the World Heritage Centre precise maps indicating the exact location of these quarries, as well as the relevant sections of the adopted Spatial Urban Plan of the Municipality of Kotor with reference to quarries, and advises the State Party to immediately halt any further projects until an Impact Assessment has been completed and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 8. <u>Further requests</u> that the planning for the property, its buffer zone and wider setting be carried out in the light of the State Party's commitment to protecting the property's OUV and be informed by a strategic approach to impact assessment that considers the potential cumulative impacts of proposed projects; and <u>requests furthermore</u> that decisions to

- authorise new developments should only be taken where it is clear that negative impacts on OUV will be avoided;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

192. Dutch Water Defence Lines (Netherlands) (C 759bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.192

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.23** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- Commends the State Party for the progress made in implementing the Committee's previous decisions, particularly the work carried out to define the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) within the property and its larger spatial context, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to submit these inventories to the World Heritage Centre with its next state of conservation report;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the forthcoming implementation of the new Environment and Planning Act and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide details of its implementation and effectiveness also in its next state of conservation report;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the cancellation of the zoning plan for the housing development at Woudrichem, the ongoing reassessment of the Zeilfort Kudelstaart development and that the timeline for decision-making on the A8-A9 connection has not yet been set, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - a) provide details of the modified plans for the Woudrichem site and Zeilfort Kudelstaart to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any planning decisions are made.
 - investigate alternatives to the Golf Course and Heemskerk variants for the A8-A9 connection, including other modes of transport to improve connectivity in the region, and to provide details of timelines and designs for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before any planning decisions are made;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> the overview provided by the State Party of projects that may affect the property, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party provide information on the new visitor centre at Loevestein Castle, the housing development in the inundation zone of Werkendam, the planned development at Voordorpse Veld, the rehabilitation process of Fort bij Velsen, and other intervention projects for the reuse of the built heritage within the property before any planning decisions are made;
- 7. <u>Notes furthermore</u> the assessment framework for incorporating solar and wind energy into spatial planning and requests furthermore that details of the assessment framework and of

- planned wind and solar projects which may affect the OUV of the property be provided to the World Heritage Centre;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

193. Auschwitz Birkenau German Nazi Concentration and Extermination Camp (1940-1945) (Poland) (C 31)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.193

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.52** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made by the State Party in establishing a closer dialogue between the national and local authorities, other key stakeholders and local communities, paving the way for the development of the Management Plan for the property and its subsequent adoption by all stakeholders and <u>encourages</u> these dialogue activities be continued;
- 4. <u>Further welcomes</u> the establishment of a team to monitor the preparation of Management Plans for World Heritage properties in Poland, <u>urges</u> the State Party to develop a comprehensive Management Plan for the property, including a comprehensive tourism management and interpretation Plan for the whole property and its setting, as a matter of priority, in line with the recommendations of the 2021 Advisory mission and the 2013 Expert Group, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the final draft of the Management Plan to the World Heritage Centre for its revision and comments by the Advisory Bodies, prior to its adoption; <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to finalise the update of the Conservation Strategy for the property;
- 5. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to establish a buffer zone for the property, encompassing both the silence zone and the wider protection zone, or to develop appropriate spatial planning policies to provide greater protection to the immediate setting of the property;
- 6. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the efforts made by the State Party in progressively enriching and supporting educational and social awareness-raising activities linked to the historical structures within the property and in the protection zone, and <u>further encourages</u> the State Party to pursue these efforts;
- 7. <u>Also notes</u> the efforts of the State Party to put on hold the construction of the Oświęcim southern ring road until it had considered the recommendations of the 2021 Advisory mission to the property;
- 8. Recommends to the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2021 Advisory mission to the property;
- 9. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the

implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

194. Centennial Hall in Wrocław (Poland) (C 1165)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.194

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision 36 COM 7B.80 adopted at its 36th session (Saint Petersburg, 2012),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the establishment of the Team for Monitoring the Preparation of Management Plans for World Heritage properties in Poland and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide information on the progress made in updating the 2016 Management Plan for the property;
- 4. <u>Notes with concern</u> that the State Party did not comply with the requirements of paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines and has not provided to the World Heritage Centre timely information about large-scale projects which have now been completed or are in an advanced stage of development that may have the potential to negatively impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;
- 5. Regrets that the State Party did not harness the opportunity for a constructive dialogue with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS over the years to improve planned projects and reduce or mitigate potential impacts when there was still room for improvement;
- 6. Reiterates its request to the State Party to provide an overall Development Plan for the property and its buffer zone that provides an understanding as to how all implemented and planned projects support the OUV of the property, and <u>further requests</u> that this plan be integrated into the updated Management Plan;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the impacts of all completed and ongoing projects in the property, its buffer zone and wider setting on the attributes of its OUV, examine planned projects that may have an impact on the property and assess its overall state of conservation;
- 8. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

195. Tarnowskie Góry Lead-Silver-Zinc Mine and its Underground Water Management System (Poland) (C 1539)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.195

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.53** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes</u> the continued progress made by the State Party in implementing its past recommendations;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the inventories for the areas under the control of the Tarnowskie Góry Land Lovers' Association (TGLLA), the Coal Mining Museum in Zabrze and the Veolia Water Supply and Sewerage Company in Tarnowskie Góry, the scientific research undertaken by the TGLLA and its partners, as well as the development of a GIS platform for the property;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the progress made in providing protection to the aboveground attributes underpinning the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to provide an inventory of all aboveground attributes that have been protected, including an assessment of their state of conservation as an annex to its next state of conservation report;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> that past monitoring has indicated that the extraction of water from the Adolph Shaft does not negatively influence the water system and water quality of the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to commit to a programme of close monitoring and reporting should pumping commence at the Adolph Shaft in future;
- 7. Reiterates its request to the State Party to expeditiously finalise and submit to the World Heritage Centre all necessary documentation for the addition to the property of the historic water tower immediately adjacent to Kaehler Shaft, and to conclude the feasibility analysis which is considering the extension of area A5 to join area A4;
- 8. <u>Considers</u> that the establishment of a research and inventory programme, with goals and timelines, and the institutional support for such a programme are essential to support the protection of the OUV of the property and its management, and <u>further requests</u> that the State Party to:
 - a) Establish the multidisciplinary scientific committee as a matter of urgency,
 - b) Develop and implement a research and inventory programme to complete the inventory of the entire property,
 - c) Ensure the sustainability of the research and inventory programme through institutional support,
 - d) Further develop the GIS multi-layer map system to include the information from existing inventories,
 - e) Provide the research and inventory programme, including timeframes for its implementation, information on its institutional support and progress on its implementation with its next state of conservation report;

9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

196. Royal Building of *Mafra* – Palace, Basilica, Convent, *Cerco* Garden and Hunting Park (*Tapada*) (Portugal) (C1573)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.196

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 8B.30** and **44 COM 7B.54** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's implementation of the requests made by the Committee with regards the constituting and functioning of the Cooperation Unit and the Advisory Unit and the continued development of various management tools for the property, including the Strategic and Management Plan for the Hunting Park and the 'preliminary study' for the Management Plan for the Cerco Garden;
- 4. Requests that the State Party accelerate the development of the various management plans so as to allow for the completion of the Integrated Management Plan for the property and the proper functioning of the Cooperation Unit, and submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's timely notification of its intent to renovate a portion of the Mafra Palace to house the National Museum of Music;
- 6. <u>Further notes</u> that the Memorandum of Understating between the School of Arms and the Mafra City Council, which includes the implementation of demolitions and new construction, was due to lapse in July 2023 and that the 'preliminary study' for the Management Plan for the Cerco Garden outlines a notable number of construction projects to be implemented in the medium term, and therefore <u>also requests</u> the State Party to:
 - Extend the Memorandum of Understating between the School of Arms and the Mafra City to allow for the completion of the requalification and rehabilitation of the Military Parade Square,
 - b) Submit a landscape architectural report for the Military Parade Square on improving the setting of the convent whilst meeting the functional needs,
 - c) Ensure appropriate documentation of the buildings dating from the mid-20th century identified for removal before their demolition,
 - d) Provide details of the design of the new storage building for tactical vehicles to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before implementation of this component of the project,
 - e) Provide details of the design of the Cerco Garden new construction and adaptation projects, which include a new aviary and enlargement of the Winter Greenhouse, the Administrative Office and the visitor's shop, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as soon as they are ready;

- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit an update on the functioning of the Advisory Unit and the Cooperation Unit in relation to its role in the conservation and management of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
- 8. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

197. Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands (Russian Federation) (C 632)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.197

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.159** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> progress towards the designation of the property as a religious-historical site, to reinforce conservation of the archipelago as a living, sacred, cultural landscape with intertwined culture, nature, people and process and strong intangible associations; and requests the State Party to clarify that this designation will protect all the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV):
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> concerns over the translation of the term 'Master Plan' and <u>agrees</u> that in future, this will be referred to as 'Master Plan (Development Strategy)' in state of conservation documents and as 'Development Strategy' locally;
- 5. Notes that the Master Plan (Development Strategy) is nearing completion for the settlement part of the main island, reiterates its request for this to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before final approval, and <u>further notes</u> that a Management Plan will be developed once the Master Plan (Development Strategy) has been approved;
- 6. <u>Also welcomes</u> the process that is now in place for major restoration projects which involves support from the Ministry of Culture, Solovetsky Museum, Solovetsky Monastery and the Russian Orthodox Church and the use of contractors licensed by the Ministry, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit details of major conservation projects to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies in advance of work commencing;
- 7. Notes the extensive list of projects that have been undertaken over the past two years, including routine conservation work, emergency repairs and large-scale projects, welcomes the dialogue between the State Party, the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, as well as the ICOMOS technical reviews, which have been provided, and encourages the State Party to take into account their recommendations;
- 8. <u>Commends</u> the creative proposals to re-shape the half-built museum building, in response to the Committee's request at its 40th session to halt work, demolish what had already been built, and submit new proposals, and <u>considers</u> that the submitted plans, which reduce the existing half-built structure to one storey, cover it with a grass roof and screen it with planted

- trees, result in an acceptable, if not ideal, building that does not impact adversely on the property's OUV, but <u>recalls</u> that this is an appropriate solution in these circumstances;
- 9. <u>Further welcomes</u> the collection of scientific documentation for the restoration of parts of the main island's hydrological systems which present serious problems, underlines the crucial impact of this single system of 52 lakes and several kilometres of canals, dating mainly from the 15th and 16th centuries, on the cultural landscape of the main island and on the supply of water to the monastery from the Sacred Lake, and <u>welcomes</u> the commitment of the State Party to take into account the recommendations of the missions and the advice of ICOMOS experts as this project develops;
- 10. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies the proposed reconstruction (restoration) concept for the 'lost' monastic sites and areas related to former economic activities, once it has been developed and before its implementation;
- 11. <u>Further notes</u> that Heritage Impact Assessments (HIAs) have been introduced for all new construction, <u>encourages</u> the State Party to extend this measure to major conservation projects, <u>appreciates</u> the detailed HIAs which have already been provided, and <u>requests</u> that in future such assessments for major restoration projects as well as for new construction be submitted to the World Heritage Centre, accompanied by copies of the proposed plans, for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 12. <u>Reiterates its request</u> that details of the repair and restoration project of the largely destroyed, early-19th-century Preobrazhenskaya Hotel be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies at the earliest stage possible, considering its prominence near the Monastery;
- 13. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

198. Kizhi Pogost (Russian Federation) (C 544)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.198

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.160** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the completion of the the 'Plan for conservation of the Outstanding Universal Value of the World Heritage Site "Kizhi Pogost" and development of the Kizhi Island territory and 'The Sustainable Development Plan for the Buffer Zone of the WHS "Kizhi Pogost" (2022-2032)';
- 4. <u>Notes</u> the continuous monitoring of the structural stability of the built structures of the Kizhi Pogost and the continuous research undertaken at the property and its buffer zone;

- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the selection of a preferred design project for the restoration of the Church of the Intercession, the Heritage Impact Assessment of this project and the State Party's commitment to submit these to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before its implementation;
- 6. Requests that the State Party provide details on the project for fire extinguishing and safety systems for the Church of the Transfiguration and on the project to reconstruct the 'Worship Cross' at the eastern side of the property to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before implementation;
- 7. <u>Further notes</u> the commitment of the State Party to submit details of any proposals for development of the entrance of Zone A to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before its implementation, as outlined in the 'Plan for conservation of the Outstanding Universal Value of the World Heritage Site "Kizhi Pogost" and development of the Kizhi Island territory';
- 8. <u>Recommends</u> that the State Party give consideration to defining spatial limits for new construction and land uses within the buffer zone;
- 9. <u>Also recommends</u> that the State Party reconsider globally the proposed removal of twentieth century structures in the buffer zone so as to avoid erasing historical layers in the development of the property's setting;
- 10. <u>Acknowledges again</u> the invitation from the State Party for an ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property and <u>welcomes</u> the preparations that are underway to finalise the planning for the mission:
- 11. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

199. Petroglyphs of Lake Onega and the White Sea (Russian Federation) (C 1654)

Decision: 45 COM.7B.199

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- Recalling Decision 44 COM 8B. 44 adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress accomplished by the State Party and <u>requests</u> as a matter of priority that it:
 - a) Confirm that the entirety of the two components of the property have been afforded the highest legal protection by being included in the State Code of Especially Valuable Properties of Cultural Heritage of the Peoples of the Russian Federation,
 - b) Provide detailed information on the archaeological sites that have been included in the two components of the property,

- c) Confirm the establishment of the State Centre for the Management, Conservation and Study of the Petroglyphs of Karelia;
- 4. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to build on the establishment of a centralized management system and submit an augmented and strengthened Management Plan and associated Action Plan, to include:
 - a) A full Conservation Plan as the basis for a well-planned and long-term conservation approach, with associated detailed action plan and dedicated resources,
 - b) The Risk Management and Research Plans,
 - c) A visitor/tourism strategy,
 - Details of baseline data and monitoring protocols for conservation work, risk assessment, visitor satisfaction, community indicators and broader environmental indicators,
 - e) Details of how the new digital documentation system underpins the management system;
- 5. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to monitor developments around the property that may have an impact on its landscape, integrity and archaeological potential, and assess these through impact assessments based on the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, and in accordance with Paragraphs 110, 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 6. Reminds the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course about any major development project that may negatively impact the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

200. Paseo del Prado and Buen Retiro, a landscape of Arts and Sciences (Spain) (C 1618)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.200

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.21** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> the progress made by the State Party in clarifying the delimitation of the property and the submission of a request for a Minor Boundary Modification for the creation of a buffer zone to be examined by the World Heritage Committee under Item 8 of the Agenda of this session;

- 4. <u>Notes</u> the existence of GEOPORTAL as basis for a monitoring system for the property and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to strengthen this tool and develop a set of indicators clearly linked to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) and attributes of the property that foster integrated management and can alert when actions are required to preserve its state of conservation;
- 5. Requests the State Party to provide further details on the projects and studies being developed to improve the public space in the Paseo del Prado, to address the issues related to intensive use and the effects of climate change;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to continue its efforts to resolve the legal issues in order to finalise the listing of buildings, with a view to completing this process within a short period of time:
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to develop a comprehensive interpretation strategy for the property as a whole, which is clearly based on its OUV and presents and promotes its title as adopted by the Committee at the time of inscription;
- 8. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to take the necessary steps to establish the Civic and Social Board as an independent association that might function in an efficient manner for community engagement;
- 9. <u>Urges</u> the State Party to reconsider the urbanistic and architectural design of the new building of the Niño Jesús University Children's Hospital project, and to significantly reduce the number of parking spaces foreseen, before the project is approved for implementation, and to resubmit the revised design plans to the World Heritage Centre prior to taking any decisions that may be irreversible;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2024, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

201. Aphrodisias (Türkiye) (C 1519)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.201

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.55** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Expresses its concern</u> at the lack of information on new activities that may have been undertaken since the last report submitted by the State Party in response to the Committee's decisions and of details of progress made since then;
- 4. <u>Takes notes</u> of the progress made by the State Party and <u>requests</u> it to continue working on the issues identified at the time of inscription and beyond by:

- a) Revising, as a matter of priority, the Management Plan and submitting it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its adoption,
- b) Providing appropriate legal protection for the entire buffer zone by considering the extension of the 3rd Degree Conservation Zone to encompass all of the buffer zone,
- c) Continuing to implement the drainage rehabilitation plan, with appropriate archaeological supervision,
- d) Submitting the fire prevention plan to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre details on the location and the characteristics of the new buildings that have occurred close to main quarries, including informing the World Heritage Centre on how their impact on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) was assessed;
- 6. Reminds the State Party that infrastructure projects within or around a World Heritage property should be assessed on the basis of its potential impact on OUV and draws on the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and that the World Heritage Centre should be informed in due course before any irreversible decisions are made, in line with Paragraphs 118bis and 172 of the Operational Guidelines respectively;
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

202. Arslantepe Mound (Türkiye) (C 1622)

<u>Decision</u>: 45 COM 7B.202

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.22** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. Expresses its solidarity with the State Party of Türkiye and its people for the devastating effects of the earthquakes that took place in February 2023, assures the State Party of the availability of the Convention assistance mechanism to support affected World Heritage properties and invites the State Party to call upon them;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress reported by the State Party and <u>requests</u> that it continues working on the issues identified at the time of inscription of the property, giving priority to the completion and submission of the relevant documentation for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, before adoption:
 - a) The conservation strategy and plan, specifically including a cautious strategy for anticipated research and excavations, that determines protocols, priorities and procedures for all forms of conservation, excavation and maintenance interventions needed for the property,

- A comprehensive risk assessment and risk preparedness plan, including details of baseline data and monitoring protocols, and the use of periodic photographic documentation.
- c) A revision of the current management plan with specific reference to the conservation plan and strategy and the risk preparedness plan;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the State Party's reports on planned archaeological, conservation and interpretation projects and its commitment to submit the revised design of the project for extension and alteration of the new roof shelter and rainwater drainage project for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies prior to its implementation, and <u>further requests</u> the State Party to:
 - Continue to undertake survey work to determine the exact extension of archaeological findings, particularly towards the north and west of the property, and that basis submit a report on the results of such investigations to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies,
 - b) Submit an assessment of the state of conservation of the previously excavated areas that remain unsheltered and develop cautious conservation measures to address any deficiencies.
 - c) Extend the Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the proposed visitor centre to include the Associated social facility and carry it out in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and await its review by the Advisory Bodies before taking any decision on its implementation;
- 6. Reminds the State Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course, and before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, of its intention to undertake or authorize any major developments that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of a World Heritage property, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 7. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property, including on the impact of the earthquakes in February 2023, and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

203. Göbekli Tepe (Türkiye) (C 1572)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.203

- 1. The World Heritage Committee,
- 2. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 3. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8B.57** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 4. Notes the progress accomplished by the State Party but requests that it:
 - a) Submit, as a matter of priority for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies a revised Management Plan, utilizing the Enhancing our Heritage Toolkit 2.0 and including:

- (i) A full conservation plan as the basis for a well-planned and long-term conservation approach, with associated action plan and dedicated resources,
- (ii) A comprehensive risk assessment and risk preparedness plan based on the Resource Manual Managing Disaster Risks at World Heritage,
- (iii) Details of baseline data and monitoring protocols, including on conservation work, risk assessment, visitor satisfaction, community indicators and broader environmental indicators,
- (iv) A draft Visitor Management Plan, including a Tourism Management Plan and actions, time schedules and dedicated resources,
- b) Continue to closely monitor developments around the property that may have an impact on the landscape, integrity and archaeological potential of the property and assess the impact of any proposed compulsory infrastructure before consent is granted, in accordance with Paragraphs 110 and 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
- c) Carry out a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) of the proposed development of a railway line to the south of the property, in accordance with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context and prior to any construction, and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies,
- d) Continue to take active amelioration measures to ensure that the visual impact of the irrigation channel in the management area and south-east of the property is reduced and to further assess the visual impact of the quarry in the management area to the west of the property,
- e) Continue to undertake archaeological survey work as the basis for reassessing the degree of statutory protection of the buffer zone;
- 5. Reminds the States Party to inform the World Heritage Centre in due course of its intention to undertake or authorize any major developments that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of a World Heritage property and to undertake Heritage and/or Environmental Impact Assessments before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, in line with Paragraph 172 and 118bis of the Operational Guidelines respectively;
- 6. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

204. Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1215)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.204

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 7B.60** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the continued application of the World Heritage Site (WHS) Supplementary Planning Document, WHS Planning Toolkit, Planning Performance Agreements, and

neighbourhood development plans to protect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, the progress made in the implementation of the recommendations of the 2015 ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission and previous Committee decisions, as well as the adoption of the revised Management Plan for the property;

- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the early engagement of Historic England in specific planning applications and in wider guidance and policy implementation, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to ensure that the advice of Historic England and the WHS Planning Officer continue to inform statutory decision making;
- 5. Notes the ongoing engagement regarding the North Quay Phase 2 projects and the commitment to implement the recommendations provided by ICOMOS, and requests the State Party to submit revised plans for the Hilltop site, amended in line with the recommendations of ICOMOS, to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS before granting approval;
- 6. Acknowledges the information provided by the State Party concerning the South Crofty Mine, and in particular the details requested on the boundary treatment, but considers that further updated information should be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, and therefore requests the State Party to submit a comprehensive information package on the current status of this project, taking into account the recommendations of the 2013 mission and recalls that any plans of a potential reopening of the mine shall be subject to impact assessments in line with Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines and using the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context;
- 7. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to continue to ensure that, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, details of significant changes to statutory documents and any new planning applications which may impact on the OUV of the property are submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before final decisions are taken;
- 8. <u>Further acknowledges</u> the efforts made by the State Party for increased interpretation, research and stakeholder involvement across the property;
- 9. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- 205. Palace of Westminster and Westminster Abbey including Saint Margaret's Church (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 426bis)

Decision: 45 COM 7B.205

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/7B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **44 COM 7B.161** and **43 COM 7B.94** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021) and 43rd session (Baku, 2019) respectively,

- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's continued efforts to implement and use the 2017 joint ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission recommendations to inform emerging planning policy, and the continued efforts and advice of Historic England to influence statutory decision making, <u>acknowledges</u> the information provided on the 'Levelling Up and Regeneration' Bill and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed about its progress and implications;
- 4. <u>Also acknowledges</u> the progress made in the finalization of the Management Plan and requests the State Party to submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to adoption;
- 5. <u>Also welcomes</u> the revisions made to the new London Plan and Westminster City Plan, in line with Committee decisions, and also <u>requests</u> the State Party to submit the new framework for Annual Monitoring Reports (AMR) and the first new AMR to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- 6. Notes with concern the findings of ICOMOS technical reviews of the Evelina Children's Hospital extension of Saint Thomas' Hospital and the Royal Street Site planning applications, as well as the objections by Historic England to both applications, and urges the State Party not to grant planning permissions and to conduct a detailed study of the assets of the area south of the property in its immediate setting and how these assets relate to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, as a basis for the development of a Master Plan and to inform site allocations under the Lambeth Local Plan;
- 7. <u>Further welcomes</u> the information provided on the data sharing platform, the database for tall buildings, and the use of this data for 3D models and <u>also encourages</u> the State Party to actively use the digital data and 3D modelling for long-term planning and management of development, such as in the area south of the property in its immediate setting, to effectively safeguard the OUV of the property and in particular its integrity from any visual impacts;
- 8. <u>Takes note</u> of the updates provided by the State Party regarding the Restoration and Renewal (R&R) project for the completion of the Palace of Westminster and the Conservation Management Plans, as well as the ongoing restoration and repair works, and the need for an ongoing Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), <u>further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre the details of the proposed Parliament Square Streetscape project, at an early stage, if the project proceeds beyond the concept stage, and <u>reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to submit the details, including HIAs, of the R&R project to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, as soon as they are available and prior to any decision or approval;
- 9. Further notes with concern that the State Party has introduced legislation to remove the obstacle that led the High Court to quash the decision to build the Holocaust Memorial and Learning Centre in Victoria Tower Gardens, reiterates its serious concerns that the proposed location of the Holocaust Memorial and Learning Centre in Victoria Tower Gardens would have a significant adverse impact on the OUV of the property, and therefore requests the State Party to refrain from any action which would allow the current proposal to proceed, and to seek alternative locations and/or designs;
- 10. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

8. NOMINATION PROCESS

Decision: 45 COM 8

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/8,

REFLECTION ON NOMINATIONS UNDER NATURAL CRITERIA

- 2. Recalling Paragraph 71 of the Operational Guidelines, encourages States Parties to consult the relevant IUCN gap analysis, and to seek as early as possible upstream advice from the Advisory Bodies during the development of their Tentative Lists, as appropriate, and to make full and effective use of IUCN's global, regional and thematic studies when preparing nominations to be submitted under natural criteria;
- 3. Taking into account the heavy budget constraints on the Convention's resources, the need for an effective management of the increasing size of the World Heritage List and the call for a more balanced World Heritage List, urges States Parties to provide the necessary financial voluntary contributions to support the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to prepare and implement jointly with the respective States Parties a series of 10-year regional action plans to provide priority support to regions underrepresented in natural heritage, with a view to improving the regional balance on the World Heritage List and to fill important gaps that remain on the List for natural heritage;

NOMINATIONS NOT EVALUATED FOR THE EXTENDED 45TH SESSION

- 4. <u>Decides</u> that nominations, which were submitted for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) and the extended 45th (Riyadh, 2023) sessions but which could not be evaluated due to the health and/or security situation, be examined at the 46th session of the Committee without impinging on national and overall quota of nominations (Paragraph 61 of the Operational Guidelines), in accordance with the timeframe foreseen in Paragraph 168 of the Operational Guidelines.
- 8A. Tentative Lists submitted by States Parties as of 15 April 2023, in conformity with the Operational Guidelines

Decision: 45 COM 8A

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/8A,
- 2. <u>Stressing</u> the importance of the process of revision and updating of Tentative Lists, as a tool towards regional harmonisation of the World Heritage List and long-term planning,
- 3. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties to seek as early as possible upstream advice from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies during the development or revision of their Tentative Lists as appropriate,

- 4. <u>Commends</u> the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies for the preparation of a toolkit to operationalise the "Guidance on Developing and Revising World Heritage Tentative Lists", in response to Upstream Process requests concerning Tentative Lists;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the Tentative Lists presented in Annexes 2 and 3 of this document.
- 8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List
- I.A NOMINATIONS TO BE EXAMINED AT THE EXTENDED 45TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE PROPOSED FOR EXAMINATION IN 2022
- A. NATURAL SITES
- A.1 AFRICA
- A.1.1 Nominations deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Decision: 45 COM 8B.1

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- Recalling Decision 19 COM VIIIA.3 adopted at its 19th session (Berlin, 1995).
- 3. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Forest Massif of Odzala-Kokoua, Congo** on the World Heritage List, on the basis of **criteria (ix)** and **(x)**;
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

[Text available in French only]

- 5. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Finalize the full cancellation of the last two non-operational licences that partially overlap with the buffer zone of the property,
 - b) Increase the area of the buffer zone that would not be subject to logging regimes to the greatest extent possible in order to reduce any edge effects on the natural systems inside the property, and ensure that all concessions in the buffer zone of the property work towards obtaining FSC certification, and that they will be strictly controlled and managed without any significant impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2025** a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

A.1.2 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.2

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decisions CONF.004/13</u> and **35 COM 8D** adopted at its 14th (Banff, 1990) and 35th (UNESCO Headquarters, 2011) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Approves</u> the significant boundary modification of the Tsingy de Bemaraha Strict Nature Reserve, to become Andrefana Dry Forests, Madagascar, on the World Heritage List, on the basis of criteria (vii), (ix) and (x);
- 4. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Andrefana Dry Forests serial property involves four national parks – Ankarafantsika, Mikea, Tsingy de Bemaraha and Tsimanampesotse - and two special reserves -Analamerana and Ankarana. The property represents centres of endemism in the dry tropical and subtropical biomes of Madagascar with its western dry forests and southwestern dry thorny forests and thickets that have evolved in isolation on a large, massive island separated from all other land for tens of millions of years. The parks and reserves comprising the property provide a continuum of dry to arid forest formations from north to south, including almost all of the dry forest centres of endemism in western Madagascar. These centres of endemism evolved in isolation as a result of geographic barriers formed by major river systems, and as a result of paleoclimatic changes over millions of years, where changing rainfall patterns led to expansion and contraction of forest ecosystems. The property represents and conserves globally unique ecosystems, habitats and species. Madagascar's long isolation has contributed to the development of a natural laboratory of evolution marked by exceptional biological diversity, one of the highest rates of endemism in the world, and a large number of ancient lineages that have disappeared elsewhere, such as the endemic order of mesites which are about 54 million years old. The Andrefana Dry Forests are essential for the protection of the island's endemic ecosystems and biodiversity, as well as the diversity of evolutionary, ecological and biogeographic systems that have developed in Madagascar.

Criterion (vii): The Tsingy de Bemaraha Strict Nature Reserve, which has since become a National Park, represents rare or highly remarkable geological phenomena of exceptional beauty. It presents impressive geological elements including karstic scenery with a highly dissected limestone massif, crossed by a deep river gorge, which is the spectacular expression of a stage of evolution of the earth in the form of a "forest of sharp stones" with high limestone pinnacles rising up to 100 metres, forming veritable cathedrals, offering a grandiose, spectacular natural landscape. Further, "the Tsingy" of the limestone plateau forms an unusual feature of outstanding beauty, unique in the world, universally recognized by the effect created by the shades of forest green on metallic reflections of the grey karst "bristles". While not adding additional attributes, the other five component parts of this serial property contribute to the overall natural beauty of the property.

Criterion (ix): The palaeoclimatic oscillations of the last few million years have had a profound effect on the landscapes and the evolution of the fauna and flora of Madagascar. The Andrefana Dry Forests are a complex product of this process. They have retreated during dry periods; they have expanded during wet periods but with

variations deeply linked to the relief with its hydrological network. The centres of endemism that are home to many endemic species and higher taxa are the "interfluves" of the great rivers that have their sources on the highest peaks of Madagascar. The centres of endemism on the western slopes were refugia that captured parts of the hydrological system, allowing animal and plant populations to survive in isolation during dry periods. The Andrefana Dry Forests are distributed over all but one of the western endemic centres. Namely from south to north in the serial property, the endemism centres of Karimbola (Tsimanampesotse National Park), Mikea (Mikea National Park), Melaky (Bemaraha National Park), Sofia (Ankarafantsika National Park), Ankarana (Ankarana Special Reserve) and Vohimarina (Analamerana Special Reserve).

Criterion (x): Madagascar's different forest types are home to 80% of its endemic species, and the dry forests make a major contribution to this richness. The dry forests are clearly distinct from the humid forests of Madagascar with flagship groups entirely restricted to dry formations such as baobabs, most members of the family Didiereaceae, flamboyant trees, mammals, birds, reptiles, amphibians, tortoises and more than half of the scorpions. Important species also include the Perrier's Sifaka, and the Mongoose Lemur, the Madagascar Fish Eagle and the Western Woolly Lemur. Within the orders and families endemic to Madagascar, many genera and species are found only in dry forests or thorny thickets. Even more notable are the ancient orders of fauna that are endemic to the island, such as the two endemic birds of Mikea, named after a centre of endemism and a cultural group. The presence of endemic genera, and even families of vertebrates, many of them containing species that are highly threatened, in the component parts added in 2023 is unique among dry forests of the world. The additions also include almost one thousand endemic species and sub-species of plants, 156 endemic reptiles, 57 endemic mammals and 34 endemic amphibians.

Integrity

The size of the serial property and its buffer zone, the strict protection status of its component parts, and the north-south continuum they provide, ensure a strong basis for its Outstanding Universal Value. The size of the northern reserves is relatively small, but they are set in a local geographical context and their integrity is enhanced by the dry forests of the Andrafiamena-Andavakoera Reserve (IUCN category V) which links the two reserves. The Andrefana Dry Forests serial property includes all the elements necessary for the inclusion of key aspects of the processes essential for the long-term conservation of the ecosystems and the biological diversity they contain. Its component parts represent a series of unique centres of micro-endemism. Each of the property's component parts has pursued a distinct but circumscribed history through the paleoclimatic oscillations of the Quaternary and earlier periods; this history, set in geological time, has had a determining impact on the groups of flora and fauna observed today and has directed evolution in many groups. Each nominated area contains those habitats that maintain the maximum animal and plant diversity that are characteristic of the centres of endemism in which biodiversity is embedded.

The component parts have in the past suffered impacts related to slash and burn agriculture, burning to renew pasture, agricultural intensification, charcoal production, bushmeat hunting and illegal wildlife trade, illegal logging and illegal mining. Invasive species, fire and habitat loss as well as climate change are continuing to threaten the integrity. However, effective management and restoration efforts have been successful in addressing threats, with deforestation rates having plummeted between 2006 and 2016. Nevertheless, these efforts, including ecological restoration, must be maintained.

Protection and management requirements

The Andrefana Dry Forests form a serial property including the Tsingy de Bemaraha Strict Nature Reserve, which was inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1990 and extended in 2023 to include the two Special Reserves of Ankarana and Analamerana

and the three National Parks of Ankarafantsika, Mikea and Tsimanampesotse. The six protected areas in this serial property are managed by the Government of Madagascar with Madagascar National Parks. They are officially protected by their respective creation decrees but also by legal measures starting with the Constitution of the Fourth Republic of Madagascar which underpins the management and conservation of biodiversity at the country level. The network is managed in accordance with the Strategic Plan, which presents the guidelines for the integrated management of properties. These guidelines are set out in the Development and Management Plans of each of the six protected areas and are complemented by a monitoring and evaluation system based on standardised tools, including tools using innovative technologies facilitating the maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value. The plan is divided into four strategic axes which should ensure (1) conservation, (2) development and sustainable support of communities and development of the riparian communities, and (4) effective management of the property.

Fire is one of the major pressures facing the Andrefana Dry Forests. Mitigation and monitoring measures based on key indicators are in place to address the pressures identified in the property. It should be recalled that primary forests, even extremely dry ones, are less susceptible to fire than degraded forests and have a much higher resilience.

- 5. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for its very thorough nomination dossier and its extensive work in integrating local communities into protected area management and ensuring benefit sharing, <u>while noting</u> the need to strengthen wherever possible the full participation by women and youth in community management structures;
- 6. <u>Strongly encourages</u> the State Party to consider a future addition of suitable component parts of the Menabe-Antimena center of endemism as soon as the identified preparatory measures in compliance with the Operational Guidelines are complete, including by increasing the State Party's restoration efforts within Menabe-Antimena, given past degradation and deforestation;
- 7. Recommends the State Party to consider the development of a standalone integrated management plan for the whole serial property as extended to support more integrated, harmonized and effective management, and to monitor whether staffing levels continue to be adequate for the management of the property, and to increase these resources further as necessary.

A.2 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

A.2.1 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.3

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 18 COM XI, 24 COM XA.2 and 44 COM 7B.98 adopted at its 18th (Phuket, 1994), 24th (Cairns, 2000) and the extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,

- 3. <u>Approves</u> the significant boundary modification of Ha Long Bay, Viet Nam, to include the Cat Ba Archipelago to become Ha Long Bay Cat Ba Archipelago, Viet Nam, on the basis of criteria (vii) and (viii);
- 4. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago is located in the North East of Viet Nam, 165km from Ha Noi, including Ha Long Bay, Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve and Cat Ba marine areas, which is one of the most important areas in the world for karst tower landscapes (fenglin) and the peak-cluster depression (fengcong), and an excellent example of karst matured in humid tropical conditions containing limestone karst terrains flooded by the sea, with a multitude of majestic limestone towers, and features of shore erosion such as notches and caves. The property has contributed to completing the stages of the process of sea-inundation of tropical karst through examples of the terrestrial and intertidal stages.

Criterion (vii): Ha Long Bay-Cat Ba Archipelago is an outstanding karst example of fengcong and fenglin matured in humid tropical conditions. The outstanding value of this property is the limestone karst terrain being invaded by the sea with a multitude of majestic limestone towers and features of shore erosion, such as the notches, caves creating a wonderful natural landscape. These features are being in almost original conditions which are rarely found anywhere else in the world. Cat Ba Archipelago adds a new dimension to the property, being by far the largest island in the region and, further, it is also a high island with inaccessible wilderness interior, marked by steep, rocky, forested peaks and a myriad of hidden lakes, labyrinthine coastal inlets, and jigsaw puzzle shaped islands.

Criterion (viii): Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago is the product of deep dissection of extensive areas of Paleozoic limestones that were uplifted as a consequence of the collision of the Eurasian and Indo-Australian tectonic plates. It is an outstanding and large sample of the sea-invaded karst tower terrain and one of the most important areas in the world for the fenglin and fengcong karst. The transition from terrestrial cone karst to marine-modified tower karst is superbly displayed at Ha Long Bay – Cat Ba Archipelago. The commencement of the present phase of karst evolution responsible for the modern landscape around Cat Ba Archipelago dates from the Pliocene, when uplift would have rejuvenated the landscape by providing more relief and reactivating groundwater circulation. The sequence of geomorphic evolution that followed is now coming to its final stages in Ha Long Bay, but is less advanced on Cat Ba island. The property displays beautifully the progression of landforms from coastal hills to the sea, and in detail reveals the shoreline complexities that arise from repeated shifts of sea level. These include cones, enclosed depressions (cockpits), interior draining valleys (polies), karren, subterranean streams, caves with speleothems, and an array of these features partly drowned by the sea and modified by coastal processes.

Integrity

All the necessary elements fully reflecting the outstanding universal values of the Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago are located within the property as described above and protected by a surrounding buffer zone. In the property, many human activities occur such as tourism, marine transportation, sea product exploiting, and other activities conducted by inhabitant communities living on the sea and islands. However, the natural landscapes, aesthetics, geology, morphology, biodiversity, and typical features such as limestone islands and caves within the property have been maintained and kept intact.

The boundaries include the existing Ha Long Bay World Heritage Site, most of Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve, Cat Ba marine protected areas and Long Chau Island group. Additionally, the entire areas of Cat Ba Archipelago belong to

the protected areas of the Cat Ba National Special Scenic Site, which is the most highly classified according to Vietnam's heritage laws, and therefore the extended Cat Ba Archipelago is strictly protected in an effective manner.

IUCN already recommended in 2013 that Cat Ba Archipelago be included in the World Heritage Perimeter. The extension will help to better protect the intrinsic values of the property at present and in the future.

The State Party convenes further research and consultation to consider the enlargement of Cat Ba National Park according to the IUCN recommendations.

Protection and management requirements

Internationally, Ha Long Bay was recognized by UNESCO as World Natural Heritage in 1994 and 2000, the Cat Ba Archipelago was recognized by the UNESCO as a World Biosphere Reserve in 2004. Nationally, the Government of Viet Nam ranked Ha Long Bay as a National Scenic Site in 1962 and a Special National Monument in 2009; the Cat Ba Archipelago was designated as a National Park in 1986, a Marine Protected Area in 2003, and was ranked as a Special National Monument in 2012. Accordingly, Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago is effectively protected through relevant laws of the State and Decrees of the Government such as Law on Cultural Heritages, Law on Biodiversity, Law on Forest Protection and Development, Law on Tourism, Law on Environmental Protection, Law on Fisheries, Law on Inland Waterway Navigation, Law on Natural Resources, Environment, Sea and Island. On the basis of available legal framework, all activities occurring in the Heritage area that may affect the value of the heritage must be approved by the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism and other relevant agencies.

Ha Long Bay is directly protected and managed by the Ha Long Bay Management Board. At the same time, the Cat Ba Archipelago is protected and managed by Cat Ba Archipelago Natural Heritage Management Board (whose main human resource is recruited from the Management Board of Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba Archipelago Biosphere Reserve, and Management Board of Cat Ba Bays). These units base themselves on their assigned functions and tasks as well as the relevant provisions of Vietnamese and international law to implement and carry out the activities of managing and protecting the property. In addition, systematic coordination between the management boards of the two sites is in place. Regular management of the property also receives the active participation of all levels, relevant sectors and local communities monitoring cultural and socio-economic activities happening in the property, maintaining its global outstanding values, and ensuring its integrity.

Socio-economic activities in the site are clearly defined and monitored closely and effectively. Management and preservation have also been strengthened through the regulations, master plans and action plans of Quang Ninh province and Hai Phong city, such as: regulations on the management of cruise ships, dredging of sludge, encroachment of seas, discharge of waste, population, and floating farmhouses, as well as education and awareness raising for the communities on heritage preservation. Besides, there are specific plans for environmental protection, tourism development and management, conservation planning, especially the Master Plan for Conservation, Management and Promotion of Ha Long Bay World Natural Heritage until 2020 has been approved by the Government and the comprehensive management plan of Ha Long Bay World Natural Heritage in the period of 2010 - 2015 approved by the People's Committee of Quang Ninh Province in 2010 and that of 2017 - 2021 period approved by the People's Committee of Quang Ninh Province in 2017. The Cat Ba Archipelago Biosphere Reserve comprehensive management plan, Master Plan for Conservation, Management and Promotion of Cat Ba National Park until 2020 have been approved by the People's Committee of Hai Phong City. Cat Ba Langur Conservation projects have attracted the interest and attention from the international organizations. Long-term orientations for heritage management focus on such issues as: ensuring the integrity of the natural landscape, geological, geomorphologic and environmental values of the property; continuing to institutionalize current coordination platform; closely supervising and monitoring socio-economic activities; applying science and technology into heritage management; conducting more research to clarify the values of the property; enhancing heritage management competencies; raising public awareness of the communities and involving them in the management and protection of the property, studying the development of a monitoring plan and management indicators in order to manage the property effectively and efficiently; additionally, ensuring to assess impacts of projects on both environment and heritage before implementation as per Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines.

- 5. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Revise the boundaries of Cat Ba National Park to align with the boundaries of the Cat Ba Archipelago extension to the Ha Long Bay World Heritage property,
 - b) Revise development projects of all kinds in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, undertake Heritage Impact Assessment for any relevant projects in the buffer zone and adjacent to the buffer zone and continue strengthening the legal protection status of the buffer zone,
 - c) Expand the existing ecological carrying capacity analysis conducted for Ha Long Bay to the entire property, ensuring effective tourism management that respects the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
 - d) Revise and complete the management plan to address key threats to the property and strengthen law enforcement accordingly, including threats from mass tourism, a major shipping lane, growth of settlements, poaching, exploitation of marine resources and forest products, overfishing, unsustainable aquaculture, pollution (oil, noise, sewage, litter, including from river catchment inputs), and significant developments in the buffer zone, and consider to study the development of a monitoring plan and management indicators in order to manage the property effectively and efficiently,
 - e) Continue appropriate consultations with the local communities, particularly those
 who might be affected and be relocated from the core area, and conduct support
 policy and programmes to facilitate the integration of the relocated communities,
 including subsidy financial schemes and social services, and consider assessing
 the needs of relocated communities in order to ensure adequate support from the
 State Party;
- 6. Encourages the State Party to also consider nominating the property under criterion (x);
- 7. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for review by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

A.3 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

A.3.1 New nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.4

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Volcanoes and Forests of Mount Pelée and the Pitons of Northern Martinique, France**, on the World Heritage List, on the basis of criteria (viii) and (x);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

[Text available in French only]

- 4. <u>Underlines</u> the global importance of biodiversity conservation in the Caribbean region, a biodiversity hotspot, and the worldwide importance of the forests of Martinique for the conservation of the endemic flora of the Lesser Antilles:
- 5. <u>Also underlines</u> the worldwide importance for earth sciences of Mount Pelée and the Carbet Pitons within the Caribbean volcanic systems and the island arc of the Lesser Antilles:
- 6. <u>Notes</u> that the property includes the fundamental elements of the Outstanding Universal Value on the basis of the two criteria, in particular the major geological attributes;
- 7. <u>Recommends</u> the State Party to ensure the conservation of the entire property and buffer zone by giving consideration to the following:
 - a) Complement the existing protection system with coherent and effective protection for geosites of scientific and educational interest located in the buffer zone, and strengthen the management capacity for the geological attributes of the property to ensure the protection and management of geological values,
 - b) Extend biodiversity protection measures, possibly through an extension of the *Reserves Biologiques Intégrales* inside the property:
- 8. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to continue and strengthen cooperation with the other States Parties of the Lesser Antilles for the conservation of species, environments and geological values;
- 9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2025**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

A.3.2 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.5

The World Heritage Committee,

1. <u>Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2</u>,

- 2. Recalling Decisions **30 COM 8B.24** and **43 COM 8B.4** adopted at its 30th (Vilnius, 2006) and 43rd (Baku, 2019) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Approves</u> the significant boundary modification of the **Hyrcanian Forests**, **Islamic Republic of Iran**, by including the "Dangyaband" and "Istisuchay Valley" component parts, Azerbaijan, to become the **Hyrcanian Forests**, **Azerbaijan**, **Islamic Republic of Iran**, on the World Heritage List, on the basis of **criterion (ix)**;
- 4. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Hyrcanian Forests form a green arc of forest, separated from the Caucasus to the west and from semi-desert areas to the east: a unique forested massif that extends from south-eastern Azerbaijan eastwards to the Golestan Province, in Iran. The Hyrcanian Forests World Heritage property is situated in Azerbaijan and Iran, within the Caspian Hyrcanian mixed forests ecoregion. It stretches approximately one thousand kilometres along the southern and south-western coast of the Caspian Sea and covers around 7% of the remaining Hyrcanian forests in Iran.

The property is a serial site with 17 component parts shared across three Provinces (Gilan, Mazandaran and Golestan) in Iran and across two Districts (Lenkoran and Astara) in Azerbaijan and represents examples of the various stages and features of Hyrcanian forest ecosystems. Most of the ecological characteristics of the Caspian Hyrcanian mixed forests are represented in the property. A considerable part of the property is in inaccessible steep terrain. The property contains exceptional and ancient broad-leaved forests which were formerly much more extensive however, retreated during periods of glaciation and later expanded under milder climatic conditions. Due to this isolation, the property hosts many relict, endangered, and regionally and locally endemic species of flora, contributing to the high ecological value of the property and the Hyrcanian region in general.

Criterion (ix): The property represents a remarkable series of sites conserving the natural forest ecosystems of the Hyrcanian region. Its component parts contain exceptional broad-leaved forests with a history dating back 25 - 50 million years ago, when such forests covered most parts of the Northern Temperate region. These huge ancient forest areas retreated during Quaternary glaciations and later, during milder climate periods, expanded again from these refugia. The property covers most environmental features and ecological values of the Hyrcanian region and represents the most important and key environmental processes illustrating the genesis of those forests, including succession, evolution and speciation.

The floristic biodiversity of the Hyrcanian region is remarkable at the global level with over 3,200 vascular plants documented. Due to its isolation, the property hosts many relict, endangered, and regionally and locally endemic plant species, contributing to the ecological significance of the property, and the Hyrcanian region in general. Approximately 280 taxa are endemic and sub-endemic for the Hyrcanian region and about 500 plant species are Iranian endemics.

The ecosystems of the property support populations of many forest birds and mammals of the Hyrcanian region which are significant on national, regional and global scales. To date, 180 species of birds typical of broad-leaved temperate forests have been recorded in the Hyrcanian region including Steppe Eagle, European Turtle Dove, Eastern Imperial Eagle, European Roller, Semicollared Flycatcher and Caspian Tit. Some 58 mammal species have been recorded across the region, including the iconic Persian Leopard and the threatened Wild Goat.

Integrity

The component parts of the property are functionally linked through the shared evolutionary history of the Caspian Hyrcanian mixed forest ecoregion and most have good ecological connectivity through the almost continuous forest belt in the whole Hyrcanian forest region. Khoshk-e-Daran, is the only component part that is isolated, however it still benefits from a high level of intactness and contributes to the overall value of the series. Each component part contributes distinctively to the property's Outstanding Universal Value and the component parts together sustain the long-term viability of the key species and ecosystems represented across the Hyrcanian region, as well as the evolutionary processes which continue to shape these forests over time.

Several component parts have suffered in the past from lack of legal protection, and continue to be negatively impacted to some extent by seasonal grazing and wood collection. The sustainable management of these uses is a critical issue for the long-term preservation of the property's integrity and it will require strong ongoing attention by the States Parties.

Protection and management requirements

All component parts of the property are state owned and strictly protected by the respective national legislation in Azerbaijan and Iran. The two component parts in Azerbaijan are located within the boundaries of Hirkan National Park under the responsibility of the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources, and are subject to a strict protection regime. The 15 component parts in Iran are protected through the Nature Conservation Law and by the Heritage Law. It will be important to harmonize and streamline the management and protection regime across the transnational property as a whole.

The management of the property's component parts in Azerbaijan is subject to the Management Plan of Hirkan National Park. The management is ensured by around 100 staff. The national park authority manages the component parts and their buffer zone in cooperation with local stakeholders, especially the Talish people living within the national park. The Talish people follow close to sustainable livelihoods, which has contributed to secure the preservation of the valuable forest until the present time. They have traditional rights to use the land within the buffer zone of the national park.

The management of the property's component parts in Iran is under the responsibility of three national agencies, the Iranian Forests, Range, Watershed and Management Organization (FRWO), Department of Environment (DoE) and the Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization (ICHHTO). A National Steering Committee is in place to ensure coordination across the series as a whole. This mechanism will need to be maintained in order to guarantee comprehensive management of the property into the future, based on a common vision and supported by adequate funding. Each component part has a management plan however, a transnational "Master Management Plan" for the whole property is also a long-term requirement. The national and component-specific plans should be maintained, developed and updated regularly together by the responsible management institutions, in cooperation with ministries, universities and NGOs across both States Parties.

Public access and use of the area is legally regulated and logging, grazing, hunting and most other uses that may potentially impact the property are strictly prohibited within all component parts. Vehicle access and other uses and activities that may potentially impact the property are also either forbidden or strictly regulated. However, enforcement of access and use regulations is not always effective and requires strengthening. Particular attention is required to maintain and enhance where possible, ecological connectivity between component parts and to ensure effective regulation of seasonal grazing and wood collection, in consultation with local communities.

- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the potential for Khanbulan (Azerbaijan) as an additional component part for this series, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party of Azerbaijan before considering potential resubmission of this component part to align the boundaries of the Khanbulan (Azerbaijan) nominated component part with the boundaries of the Hirkan National Park, in consultation with local communities;
- 6. Also takes note of the potential for this property to also meet criterion (x) and recommends the States Parties of Azerbaijan and Islamic Republic of Iran to continue work to complete species inventories and confirm species composition and population conservation status within each of the component parts, and to consider submitting a renomination of the property if the further studies appear to confirm the relevant values are sufficient to meet criterion (x).
- **B. CULTURAL SITES**
- **B.1 AFRICA**
- **B.1.1 New Nominations**

Decision: 45 COM 8B.6

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **The Gedeo Cultural Landscape**, **Ethiopia**, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape on the basis of **criteria** (iii) and (v);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Gedeo Cultural Landscape spread along the eastern escarpment of the Ethiopian highlands, is an exceptional testimony to a long-standing and still living indigenous Gedeo cultural tradition of agroforestry, with its layered cultivation of mature trees providing shelter for enset, coffee and other food crops. This symbiotic system, linking culture and nature, is underpinned by traditional knowledge systems of the Gedeo community, and has the capacity to sustain livelihoods while ensuring environmental sustainability.

The abundant alluvial rivers and fertile soils of the escarpment support the agroforestry layers spread over the twenty kilometres that separate the top of the escarpment from the lowlands. Large trees shelter indigenous enset – (enset ventricosum) the main food crop under which coffee grows, and now the main cash crop – together with other indigenous trees, root crops, shrubs, etc., each species occupying a distinct layer. The Gedeo Cultural Landscape property is home to just over a quarter of a million Gedeo people.

While the Gedeo are Indigenous to Ethiopia and have been associated with the cultivation of enset for perhaps a few thousand years, oral traditions suggest that they moved to the southwest from the north sometime during the last two millennia. The Gedeo communities are still largely guided by indigenous knowledge, and traditional institutions including the Songo, or Council of elders, as well as the Ballee system that regulates interaction with nature. Parts of the natural forest are set aside as sacred areas for ritual purposes, where no trees are felled or cultivation practised, and where

indigenous tree species and medicinal plants have been preserved, while on the mountain ridges dense clusters of megalithic monuments, some steles and others in phallic form, were also revered by the Gedeo and cared for by their elders. The Gedeo traditional systems and practices underpin the forest regimes.

Criterion (iii): The Gedeo Cultural Landscape is an exceptional testimony to the long-standing and still living indigenous Gedeo cultural tradition of agroforestry with its layered cultivation of mature trees providing shelter for enset, and more recently coffee as well as shrubs and other food crops. For centuries, or perhaps even millennia, in what is now the southwest of Ethiopia, these traditional agroforestry practices have provided a sustainable living for communities, based on traditional knowledge and belief systems that reserved certain parts of the forest as sacred areas and protected megalithic clusters of steles as ritual sites.

Criterion (v): The Gedeo Cultural Landscape is as an outstanding example of how communities over time have devised systems to optimising the constraints and opportunities of their natural environment. The Gedeo indigenous Ballee system combines customary laws, rules, regulations, norms, and codes of social relations to govern interactions with nature. The resulting landscape not only supports the highest density of population in Africa, but it also maintains harmony with species, rich biodiversity and produces high quality organic coffee. It is though highly vulnerable to a range of social and economic pressures that are threatening its resilience and sustainability.

Integrity

The key attributes are present within the boundaries, though some of the landscape areas immediately beyond the boundaries may also include some attributes. The overall ensemble of attributes is extremely vulnerable to a large number of social and economic pressures. Although traditional management underpins the management of the property, the Ballee and Songo institutions that govern management are no longer adhered to by all community members which means that the traditional processes that support the overall layered agroforestry practices have been weakened. This could result in systemic collapse. In order for the Gedeo cultural landscape to survive in a sustainable form and to keep its value, the whole network of attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value must be sustained as a single integrated system. Urgent measures are needed to support and strengthen the traditional framework, as part of a wider strategic approach to development, in order to address the extreme vulnerability of integrity.

Authenticity

Traditional agroforestry practices and governance underpin and shape the whole Gedeo cultural landscape. The attributes are all interlinked and vulnerability of one part of the system can lead to vulnerability of the whole property. Thus, how well the agroforestry landscape conveys its value depend on the resilience of the traditional processes. The traditional practices and governance still persist but have been weakened and are extremely vulnerable to a host of different economic and social factors, which means that their ability to reflect meaning is compromised to a degree. Authenticity is thus highly vulnerable. If authenticity is to persist, and if the overall landscape is to reflect its meaning truthfully and credibly in the long term, traditional practices and traditional governance both need strengthening and supporting as a matter of urgency, in order to address the extreme vulnerability of authenticity.

Protection and management requirements

The status and protection of traditionally used land by local communities is enshrined in the Ethiopian Constitution. At the federal level, the Research and Conservation of Cultural Heritage Proclamation (209/2000) recognises the value and heritage status of a property that describes and witnesses the evolution of nature and which has a major

value in its scientific, historical, cultural, artistic and handicraft content. This general protection for cultural aspects of the property is augmented by more local instruments that address the specificities of protecting the overall Gedeo cultural landscape.

The two key local instruments that were adopted by the Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region are: 1) The Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region Rural Land Administration and Utilization Proclamation (110/2007), that states that "land for communal use which includes social and cultural affairs and religion is reserved for the communities"; and 2) the Proclamation for Conservation and Protection of South Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region State Cultural Landscape Heritages of Gedeo (189/2021). This second Proclamation is specific to the property and covers heritage sites, sacred sites and agroforestry which is defined as a "land management system for the cultivation and use of a wide range of valuable tree species, animals, combined with annual and permanent crops". It also sets out the management structure and operational mechanisms that will translate its clauses into practice within the property, including constraints on where crops are planted, and support for traditional practices. The scope and details of the landscape to be protected will be determined by directives, and both Ethiopian and foreign universities are to be encouraged to undertake research and documentation to underpin these directives. These will need to define the traditional agroforestry of the property both generally and for specific areas as well as the limits of cultivation.

- 4. Also recommends that the State Party give urgent consideration to the following:
 - a) Continuing to progress the sustainable land use plan in order to:
 - i) Define a strategic approach for the development of the property that encompasses the need to provide incentives and support for traditional agroforestry practices; to improve prices for high-quality organic coffee; to raise the overall standard of living of communities; and put in place appropriate constraints for the expansion of settlements, the scope of cultivation and the type of crops and trees planted,
 - ii) Ensure that the plan builds on existing national government initiatives, and provides a context for the management plan but also focuses on the specific aspects within the property's area for which long-term protection is needed in order to address the many acknowledged threats that it faces so as to ensure its resilience and sustainability,
 - iii) Consider, in the context of the large scale of the property and the size of the Gedeo community, extending the timescale for the plan beyond the six months envisaged to allow for more in-depth assessment and documentation to be gathered, full engagement and consultation with agroforestry communities, and delivery mechanisms to be developed,
 - iv) Ensure that the plan defines specific measures to address dangers that the property faces, and frames actions in the short-term as well as in the mediumand long-term to ensure that forces for drastic and irreversible change can be contained and their impacts mitigated, and overall defines how and when the property might achieve a state of conservation that would ensure its Outstanding Universal Value is sustained for the long-term,
 - v) Include within the plan a strategy to protect the local and national natural values of the property in ways that support traditional knowledge and the livelihoods of local communities,
 - b) Implementing fully the management plan and strengthening the property management office,

- Extending the monitoring system to encompass all the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value and consider introducing a partly community-based monitoring system,
- d) Undertaking a detailed analysis of the boundaries of the property to justify its specific alignment in relation to cultural communities and cultural processes and identify whether any minor adjustments are necessary,
- e) Considering putting in place a buffer zone for the property that provides appropriate protective measure to ensure a gradation between the property and its wider setting in terms of the impact of development and other changes;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2025**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

B.1.2 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.7

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the significant boundary modification of **Koutammakou**, **Land of the Batammariba**, **Togo** to include **Koutammakou**, **Land of the Batammariba**, **Benin**, on the basis of **criteria** (v) and (vi);
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Koutammakou is a vast living cultural territory, dominated largely by the Atakora range. It is located in the northwest of Benin, in the department of Atacora and extends over the northeast of Togo. In Benin, it straddles three communes, namely Boukombé, Natitingou and Toucountouna. Country of the Batammariba, the Koutammakou still has its characteristics in terms of spatial planning, illustrated by scattered concessions, agricultural areas (subsistence and cash crops, livestock) that surround them, terraced hills, groves and other sacred places, ritual and funerary spaces, virgin areas and spaces for clan ritual routes. The Batammariba have developed a culture that judiciously combines fusion with nature, technical knowledge, social peace and religious practices. Their territory is in this image, a witness to the fabulous knowledge of this people and its constant search for harmony between the inhabitants, but also harmony with other elements of nature. The site is distinguished from other Sahelian landscapes by the Takienta, this family unit of unique and exceptional habitat by the technical prowess of its construction, the ingenuity of the spaces it offers and the richness of the symbolism it radiates.

The property proposed by Benin corresponds to the extension of property No. 1140 located in Togo and inscribed in 2004. The Beninese part is located between 10°00' and 10°31' north latitude and between 0°59' and 1°35' east longitude and covers an area of 240,658 hectares in Benin and 31,168 hectares in Togo. It forms a coherent continuum with that of Togo. The Beninese part, however, has the exceptional advantage of being home to the historic cradle of the Batammariba and major religious sites, possessing the five major types of Takienta known to date and extending over an area seven times larger

than that of Togo. Despite these peculiarities, both sides are endowed with the same cultural, anthropological and historical characteristics. The project for the inscription of the Beninese side is proposed to be recorded according to the same criteria as that of Togo, namely that the Koutammakou is, on the one hand, an exceptional example of a traditional system of occupation of the territory and, on the other hand, an eloquent testimony of the strength of the spiritual association between peoples and the environment. If the site encounters difficulties such as urbanization in places, the exodus of young people, climatic threats, there are fortunately many guardians of the tradition who perpetuate the habits and customs in Tammari country. Better still, the vision of the Beninese State is already bearing fruit through the launch of the Route des tatas to promote the destination of Koutammakou. At the same time, a management plan for the period 2021-2025, an interministerial order for the protection of the boundaries of the site, a management body, tata restoration activities and economic support to some custodians of the tradition, to name just a few of the ongoing actions, are being put in place.

Criterion (v): The Koutammakou is an outstanding example of a traditional system of land occupancy. Always alive and dynamic, it is subject to traditional and sustainable systems and techniques, and reflects the singular culture of the Batammariba, including the remarkable turreted houses called "Sikien" (Takienta in the singular).

Criterion (vi): The Koutammakou is an eloquent testimony to the strength of the spiritual association between peoples and the environment. Technical know-how, endogenous knowledge, social practices and religious beliefs maintain a permanent dialogue with the surrounding natural resources, thus creating homogeneity and fusional harmony with and between the Batammariba.

Integrity

With several thousand Sikien inventoried including 1400 still inhabited, the Beninese part of Koutammakou includes all the elements to express its outstanding universal value, both material (exceptional architecture) and intangible (practices and beliefs related to the Sikien).). The entire territory proposed for extension has the landscape features presented in the description that make it surprising, namely a scattered fortified habitat surrounded by cultivated areas and sacred groves hosting ritual practices. This living and dynamic occupation of the territory, a real lesson of sustainable development for humanity, is present throughout Koutammakou. Beyond these maintained physical characteristics of the landscape, this extension reinforces the historical integrity of Koutammakou. Indeed, it is in present-day Benin that the first Batammariba settled in the 6th century and that the cradle of this people is located. These pilgrimage sites are recognized by all Batammariba and are extremely well protected. The part inscribed in 2004 in Togo (Bien N ° 1140) corresponds to secondary migrations several centuries later. The proposed extension therefore restores the historical integrity of this territory.

Regarding the geographical limits of the area proposed for extension, they correspond to the cultural territory defended by the Batammariba on the Benin side. The same spiritual and cultural practices are shared by the inhabitants of this area. In addition, they meet every year for a major festival (FESTAM), organized alternately in Benin and Togo. By joining this extension zone to the Togolese territory inscribed in 2004, it is the entirety of Koutammakou as recognized by the Batammariba that is delimited and protected. Proposing a smaller area would have created tensions and undermined the integrity of this cultural area, by excluding groups that recognize themselves as part of Koutammakou.

Authenticity

The landscape of Koutammakou reflects a way of life that has persisted for centuries. None of the landscape is very old. The traditional habitat consists of a few models reproduced until today. Throughout the region, we see that the life cycle of buildings

continues: construction, abandonment, destruction and reconstruction on ruins. If a close observation shows that there are changes concerning the materials used, the sizing of the living space and the constructive forms, the traditional model persists. Indeed, the house is much more than a habitat. It is a temple dedicated to worship. In fact, even if a modern house is built, only a traditional habitat can integrate this symbolic and religious dimension. Traditional housing is essential for funeral rites for example and every Otammari citizen attaches great value to the respect of this tradition around his Takienta. Similarly, the ground floor reserved for animals and the presence of attics remain essential elements. Better still each court must have its Tètcheinkotè which is the "ancient", "mother" or "reliquary" Takienta of the family. Thus, many "modern" houses are complemented by a traditional habitat, which, if it is sometimes of reduced dimensions, nevertheless retains all the traditional characteristics and its spiritual dimensions. Even if it is noted today that in peri-urban hamlets, some young people refuse their constructive labor force for the Sikien, preferring to exile themselves in the city for economic reasons, the guardians of the tradition remain and continue to preserve the integrity of this architectural know-how.

Tammari society evolves over time. This evolution takes place within the community itself and thanks to external contributions. If the repeated aggressions of ethnic wars, slavery and colonization have led to the refinement of this defensive habitat, it should also be noted that colonization, independence and all their avatars have influenced the Tammari people and caused mutations. This evolution continues under the influence of schools, the centralization of administrative power, religions, tourism, monetarization, and the emergence of new needs. Despite these aggressions that tend to shake Tammari society, there are in all the villages very strong and very hard nuclei that constitute this melting pot where essential elements of Tammari culture move and perpetuate themselves through time and space. Despite the threat of globalization, cultural expressions and identities are resisting. The rites of age passage of men (Difoni) and women (Dikuntri) are perpetuated with as much interest for the local populations as for the diaspora. Thus, and despite the development of small urban centers (as in Natta or in the center of Natitingou and Boukombé), it is still the same landscape that can be observed today, with villages with houses located in the middle of their cultivable space, spaced and independent. The natural space also remains very present, although it is certainly desirable that some of its components can be regenerated. However, all sacred natural places remain preserved.

- 4. <u>Invites</u> the State Party to take into account, in a planned programme, the following recommendations:
 - a) Submit a map indicating the location of the sikien in their territory, and providing details of the nature of land use, the terraced slopes, the network of water retaining walls, and the location of groves and other sacred places. This geo-referenced database will ensure regular updating and appropriate document management, which are essential for effective management and protection of the extension and its attributes.
 - Incorporate the results of the "HTC-ATACORA" research project in the management of the cultural landscape of Koutammakou. These results will be useful in identifying more precisely areas of high concentrations of cultural and natural attributes,
 - c) Ensure greater involvement of local communities in the management and conservation plan of the extension, and take into account traditional practices for the management and conservation of Koutammakou.
 - d) Elaborate the municipal development master plans of Boukombé, Toucountouna and Natitingou,

- e) Diligently implement the current management plan and evaluate it as soon as it expires,
- f) Define clear protection and conservation priorities for areas with high concentrations of attributes,
- g) Set up the transnational property management body, under the supervision of the two cultural heritage Directorates of Togo and Benin, and define its operating procedures and missions;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

B.2 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

B.2.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.8

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Koh Ker: Archaeological Site of Ancient Lingapura or Chok Gargyar, Cambodia, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Koh Ker: Archaeological Site of Ancient Lingapura or Chok Gargyar was a capital of the Khmer Empire between 921 and 944 CE. Partially hidden in a dense broad-leaf forest between the Dangrek and Kulen mountain ranges on a gently sloping hill some eighty kilometres northeast of Angkor, the archaeological site comprises numerous temples and sanctuaries with associated sculptures, inscriptions, and wall paintings, archaeological remains and hydraulic structures.

Established by King Jayavarman IV in 921 CE, Koh Ker was one of two rival capitals of the Khmer Empire that co-existed between 921 and 928 CE – the other being Angkor – and the sole capital until 944 CE, after which the Empire's political centre moved back to Angkor. Constructed in a single phase over a twenty-three-year period, the sacred city was believed to be laid out on the basis of ancient Indian concepts of the universe. Koh Ker demonstrated markedly unconventional city planning and architectural features, which were primarily the result of the combination of King Jayavarman IV's grand political ambition and the two outstanding innovations that helped to materialise this ambition: the artistic expressions of the Koh Ker Style, and the construction technology using very large monolithic stone blocks. Although short-lived as a capital and thus acting only as an interlude in Khmer history, these innovations had a profound and lasting influence on urban construction and artistic expression in the region.

Criterion (ii): The archaeological site of Koh Ker exhibits in an exceptional way the interchange of human values that resulted in the Koh Ker Style, a sculptural expression featuring bold, expressive imagery and a dynamic sense of movement that resulted from the fusion of Indian religious and artistic symbolism with local design concepts and

artistic craftsmanship. The Koh Ker Style, though formed within a short period of twenty-three years in the 10th century, had an enduring influence on the artistic expression of the subsequent period of the Khmer Empire and other Southeast Asian countries.

Criterion (iv): The archaeological site of Koh Ker is a prototype of a new urban landscape featured by grand-scale buildings, thanks to the use of colossal monolithic stone blocks for construction and sculptures. It had inaugurated a centuries-long phase of stone temple construction across the Khmer Empire and became a source of inspiration for the great monuments of Angkor and Southeast Asia in later centuries.

Integrity

All attributes necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including the temples and sanctuaries, archaeological remains and hydraulic structures, are included within the property. The layout and built environment of the entire ancient capital are evident. Many looted sculptures have been repatriated. Threats to the attributes are under control.

Authenticity

The link between the property's attributes and its Outstanding Universal Value is truthfully expressed, and the archaeological remains can be said to truthfully convey their meaning; there are no conjectural reconstructions. The absence of later modifications or reuse after its abandonment in the 15th century has left the property with a high level of authenticity in terms of its location and setting, forms and designs, and materials and substances, as demonstrated by the archaeological evidence. The geographical location of the ancient capital city, the layout of the original urban plan, and the archaeological remains of the temples, royal palace, hydraulic systems, sculptures, inscriptions, and wall painting are authentically preserved in situ. The property is the same size and is in almost the same condition as at the time of its documentation in the late 19th century.

Protection and management requirements

Koh Ker: Archaeological Site of Ancient Lingapura or Chok Gargyar is protected by the Law on the Protection of Cultural Heritage (1996). The Royal Decree on the Establishment of Koh Ker Temple Site, NS/RKT/0504/070, of 2004, as amended in 2020, defines the boundaries of the property, the buffer zone, and the satellite zone beyond the buffer zone.

The National Authority for Preah Vihear (NAPV) is the dedicated governmental authority that oversees policy formulation and implementation for the protection and conservation of the property, and for combating illegal destruction, alteration, excavation, alienation or exportation of cultural objects at both Preah Vihear and Koh Ker. The NAPV technical teams, together with the active participation of the community, undertake activities for the conservation and promotion of the property according to a Comprehensive Cultural Management Plan. The International Coordinating Committee for Preah Vihear advises and monitors all NAPV activities. Heritage Impact Assessment mechanisms have been embedded in the current management system. Risk management for both the natural environment and the cultural heritage is carried out by staff with adequate equipment following established procedures. Specific long-term expectations include building up staff capacity.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Establishing the carrying capacity for each monument,
 - b) Undertaking a full Heritage Impact Assessment for the proposed visitor centre complex, and for any other development projects and activities that are planned for implementation within or around the property,

- Developing an overall research strategy to guide the conduct of all future research in order to further improve the understanding of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
- d) Strengthening the capacity of the staff for the long-term protection, conservation, and management,
- e) Adjusting the monitoring system to take into account the factors affecting the property and for easy integration of its outcomes into the Periodic Reporting questionnaire.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.9

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er, China, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape, on the basis of criteria (iii) and (v);
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er is located in Huimin Town, Pu'er City, Yunnan Province, in southwestern China. This organically evolved cultural landscape consists of a tea production area of old tea groves, tea plantations, forests, and traditional villages on Jingmai Mountain. This land-use system has been developed over a thousand years by the Blang and Dai peoples following traditional practices that date back to the 10th century. The traditional understorey cultivation of old tea trees is a method that responds to the specific conditions of the mountain ecosystem and subtropical monsoon climate combined with a particular governance system maintained by the Indigenous communities residing in this area. Traditional ceremonies and festivities related to the Tea Ancestor belief that special spirits live in the tea plantations, local fauna, and flora are at the core of this cultural tradition.

Criterion (iii): The Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er represents an exceptional testimony of the understorey tea cultivation traditions that enabled the development of a complementary spatial distribution of different land uses providing ecosystems and microclimates that support both the cultivation of old tea forests and the well-being of communities residing in this organically evolved cultural landscape. Blang and Dai peoples sustained these traditions for over thousand years by following a tripartite social governance system of tribe-government-religion that, based on the Tea Ancestor belief, has protected the natural resources and preserved the old tea forests. Traditional practices follow careful considerations of the mountain climate, topographic features, and local flora and fauna, demonstrating important local and traditional knowledge that safeguards cultural and biological diversity.

Criterion (v): The Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er is an outstanding example of a sustainable land-use system based on a combination of horizontal and vertical land-use patterns. This land-use system permits the complementary use of natural resources in the mountainous environment of Jingmai Mountain and represents an exceptional example of a human interaction by Blang and Dai peoples with a challenging environment that is vulnerable to negative impacts of modernisation, urban development, and climate change. The location and layout of the

traditional villages and the style of residential buildings represent the cultures and traditional knowledge of Blang and Dai peoples.

Integrity

The integrity of the property is based on the preservation of the social relationships and ecological interdependencies between the climate, the topographic features, and the cultural practices of the Blang and Dai peoples on Jingmai Mountain. All the key attributes are included within the boundaries, including the old tea forests, the protective partition forests, the tea plantations, the traditional villages, the traditional knowledge and governance system associated with the tea culture, and the cultural and spiritual expressions associated with that culture such as festivals, religious ceremonies, and traditional dances. The boundaries also encompass the immediate setting, thus reinforcing the integrity of the cultural landscape.

Traditional villages within the property are currently under pressure from urban development and could be negatively affected in the future by increased tourism development.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the property is based on the location, use, and function of the old tea forests; the location, form, and design of the traditional villages; the form and design of the traditional houses; and the form, function, and substance of the land-use system, including the horizontal and vertical patterns. It is also based on the continuity of traditions associated with the tea culture on Jingmai Mountain.

Sources of information include the continuous presence of the landscape elements and the continuous upkeep of the land-use system, the cultural practices associated with understorey tea cultivation, legends, oral history, traditional knowledge and the related belief and governance systems.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected at the highest level by national laws for cultural property, ecology, environment, forests, animal and plant species, and intangible cultural heritage. In addition, the local authorities have prepared and announced laws and regulations tailored to its protection. The buffer zone adds a layer of protection to the property, containing forests, farms, and villages where development is regulated.

A protection and management system that involves all stakeholders, including the local authorities, villagers, and professional institutions, has been developed. This protection and management system, along with the tribe-government-religion tripartite social governance arrangement and relevant planning documents such as the Conservation Plan for the Cultural Heritage of Old Tea Plantations of Jingmai Mountain as a National Priority Protected Site (2017-2035), the Plan for Villages in the Jingmai Mountain (2019-2040), and the Conservation Management Plan for the Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er (2020-2040) provide a robust mechanism for the conservation and management of the property and the sustainable development of its communities. The old tea forests, protective partition forests, villages, and entire environment of the property are the subjects of comprehensive monitoring, and a disaster preparedness mechanism has been developed.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - Approving on priority and implementing accordingly the Conservation Management Plan for the Cultural Landscape of Old Tea Forests of the Jingmai Mountain in Pu'er (2020-2040),
 - b) Further developing a climate vulnerability assessment and climate change resilience and adaptation plan that address the Outstanding Universal Value of the

- property, in conjunction with establishing clear limits of acceptable change for the cultural landscape with monitoring thresholds,
- Developing a strategy and programmes for the sustainability of the property by engaging youth in the intergenerational transmission of tea culture and related cultural practices,
- d) Integrating biodiversity values and indicators in the monitoring system of the property considering the traditional knowledge of Blang and Dai peoples,
- e) Strictly enforcing the tourism strategy, maintaining the carrying capacity of the property, ensuring adequate access, and managing potential growth of the traditional villages,
- f) Developing and implementing a Heritage Impact Assessment for any development proposals in the property, its buffer zone and/or wider setting that could potentially affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
- g) Informing the World Heritage Centre of the intention to undertake or authorise all major projects which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, in line with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.10

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Santiniketan, India**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (iv)** and **(vi)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Established in rural West Bengal in 1901 by the renowned poet and philosopher, Rabindranath Tagore, Santiniketan was a residential school and centre for art based on ancient Indian traditions and on a vision of the unity of humanity transcending religious and cultural boundaries. Santiniketan is an embodiment of Rabindranath Tagore's vision and philosophy of where 'the world would form a single nest' using a combination of education, appreciation of nature, music and the arts. It represents the distillation of Rabindranath Tagore's greatest works and the continuing legacy of his model of education that reinterpreted ancient Vedic traditions with open air classrooms arranged under the canopies of trees.

Santiniketan exhibits the crystallisation of the ideas of Rabindranath Tagore and the pioneers of the Bengal School of Art. Set within the historical and geocultural context of early 20th-century colonial India, the ideas embodied in Santiniketan influenced educational and cultural institutions in south Asia. Santiniketan is therefore an outstanding example of an enclave of intellectuals, educators, artists, craftspeople and workers who collaborated and experimented with an Asian modernity based on an internationalism that drew upon ancient, medieval and folk traditions of India as well as Japanese, Chinese, Persian, Balinese, Burmese and Art Deco forms.

The built elements of Santiniketan demonstrate experimentation in construction techniques, materials and designs, a counterpoint to prevailing colonial templates. Santiniketan displays eclectic influences and a revived attention to the local in a search for a modernity based on internationalism. Santiniketan represents the physical manifestation of a utopian ideal of a community that became a crucible for intellectual

and artistic ideas that were to have a decisive impact on 20th century art, literature, poetry, music and architecture in the south Asian region.

Criterion (iv): Santiniketan was an experimental settlement in education and communal life in a rural setting. The community was in many ways meant to represent a uniquely Indian example of a 'total work of art' (Gesamtkunstwerk) where life, learning, work and art along with the local and the global intertwined seamlessly. The built and open spaces constitute an exceptional global testimony to ideas of environmental art and educational reform where progressive education and visual art are intertwined with architecture and landscape: with the Ashram, Uttarayan, and Kala-Bhavana areas forming the prime sites of these practices in the most significant periods of development. Santiniketan represents in an outstanding way, the emergence of post-colonial centres of cultural, philosophical and spiritual exploration in the early 20th century in south Asia.

Criterion (vi): Santiniketan is directly and tangibly associated with the ideas, works and vision of Rabindranath Tagore and his associates, pioneers of the Bengal School of Art and early Indian Modernism. Against the backdrop of the Partition of Bengal, Santiniketan became the crucible for an artistic and intellectual renaissance in the early 20th century. As a cultural and intellectual incubator, it had an indelible imprint on the leaders of the Indian Freedom Movement, including Mahatma Gandhi, Nehru and Indira Gandhi. The significant influence of the ideals and philosophies represented in Santiniketan are demonstrated at other early 20th-century locations of cultural learning in south Asia. Santiniketan represents the distillation of the ideas and continuing legacy of a unique model of education recalling ancient Indian ideas as well as internationalism through a living institution, embodied in the buildings, landscape, artworks and continuing festivals and traditions. And while many of Tagore's art and literary works bear a unique association with Santiniketan, his experimentation through education with an internationalist humanist ideology finds its manifest reflection in Santiniketan.

Integrity

Part of a continuing contemporary university campus, Santiniketan is an ensemble of historic buildings, landscapes and gardens, pavilions, artworks and continuing educational and cultural traditions that together express its Outstanding Universal Value. The property is of adequate size and all the attributes needed to convey its significance are included. The property includes the areas developed at Santiniketan during the life of Rabindranath Tagore and his family and associates, a period of experimentation and flourishing of ideas. Changes to uses, building alterations and installation of some new artworks and plantings have occurred, yet these areas and the elements within them are generally intact. The state of conservation of the property has been improved over the past decade through institutional partnerships. Santiniketan is in use as part of the Visva-Bharati campus. Spirit and feeling of the place reside in both the tangible (buildings, artworks, pavilions, gardens and landscapes) and intangible attributes (educational philosophies, building practices and cultural celebrations). The integrity is potentially vulnerable to development pressures, particularly on the periphery of the buffer zone.

Authenticity

Santiniketan meets the requirements of authenticity through its ability to convey Tagore's philosophy and global learnings. There is a high degree of continuity in the spatial layouts of the Ashram, Uttarayan, and Kala-Bhavana areas. Despite changes in uses and new artworks in some areas, the buildings and other attributes retain their eclectic forms based on experimentation with techniques and materials ranging from brick, mud, coal tar, living tree, sandstone, glass, cast iron, thatch, timber, bamboo, laterite, precast concrete, and reinforced concrete. Some of these attributes could be vulnerable through decline in traditional skills. The pavilions, gardens and platforms that were central to the education philosophies are in place and in continued use; and the murals and frescos, wooden windows and furniture retain their authenticity, depicting oriental influences and

local indigenous plant species. Aesthetic development of the senses went hand in hand with intellectual development at Santiniketan. The festive celebrations that have come to form a special culture of the institution, and within the local communities use traditional Indian forms and rituals, including decoration of the site, use of flowers, alpana, chanting of Vedic hymns and blowing of conch-shells.

Protection and management requirements

The property and buffer zone are within the Visva-Bharati campus. The legal protection is provided by the Visva-Bharati Act of 1951, a national law established to continue the ideals of Rabindranath Tagore that establishes Visva-Bharati as an institution of national importance. Because there are no other heritage designations in place at the national or state level, further strengthening of the legal framework and management system is recommended.

Further documentation of the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value has been identified in the management plan as a priority. While the historic buildings have been relatively well documented, the same standard has yet to be achieved for the other attributes. A fully integrated inventory is needed as a basis for the future effective management of Santiniketan, including the recording and safeguarding of traditional practices and celebrations. The main factors affecting the property are development pressures (particularly in the buffer zone and wider setting), construction of new roads, visitor management pressures, and deterioration of physical materials. The value of the maintenance regimes for the landscape and buildings cannot be over-stated; and the engagement with national and state specialist agencies for heritage conservation, such as the Archaeological Survey of India, is an important component of the management system. The development of individual conservation plans for the attributes of the property is recommended.

There will be no new developments approved within the property boundary, and all conservation projects will be overseen by the Visva-Bharati Heritage Committee. Due to the delineation of the buffer zone based on the area within the Visva-Bharati campus, it is relatively narrow and vulnerable to development pressures in several places. The importance of the wider setting of Santiniketan has been recognised and a range of state land management laws and protective mechanisms apply to the wider setting.

A campus masterplan is being developed to ensure that the needs of the ongoing uses of Visva-Bharati as a contemporary educational institution are aligned with the long-term obligations arising from World Heritage inscription.

Within the management system, the effective operation of the Visva-Bharati Heritage Committee is essential to the long-term conservation of the property. This should be further strengthened through the development of guidelines for the Heritage Committee's responsibilities, and by ensuring that Heritage Impact Assessments are prepared for the Heritage Committee in a written format in accordance with the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - Considering possibilities to strengthen the long-term legal protection of the property currently provided by the Visva-Bharati Act of 1951 by applying appropriate national and/or state laws for heritage protection,
 - b) Developing a master plan for the Visva-Bharati campus and submitting this to the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies for comments,
 - c) Implementing the documentation priorities outlined in the management plan and establishing a single consolidated inventory of attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property as a basis for the implementation of the management system, including buildings, platforms/pavilions, interiors and

- furnishings, artworks (murals, sculptures), landscape plantings and features and intangible heritage elements of Santiniketan,
- d) Developing conservation plans and policies for each of the identified tangible attributes.
- e) Closely monitoring the ability of the buffer zone to protect the property from development pressures, and consider possibilities for revising the delineation and/or strengthening the legal protection of the buffer zone.
- f) Developing and implementing formal Heritage Impact Assessment processes to aid the Visva-Bharati Heritage Committee in its role, ensuring that assessments are fully documented in written form,
- g) Fully implementing the disaster risk management strategy and monitoring system outlined in the management plan,
- h) Developing a post-pandemic plan for visitation to Santiniketan, including interpretation strategies,
- i) Identifying opportunities for enhanced community involvement in the management system for the property.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.11

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> The Persian Caravanserai, Islamic Republic of Iran, excluding the component parts Yām and Mādar Shāh, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iii);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Persian caravanserai is a collection of 54 caravansaries selected among numerous historical caravanserais based on typology, climate zones the ancient network of roads, which is an outstanding evidence of the tradition of travel in the historical and cultural periods before the industrial age and the development of modern roads, railways and air corridors. The caravanserai was supposed to facilitate comfort for travellers and pilgrims on long and or difficult road to pass in different geographical conditions, especially desert areas.

The development and evolution of this property from the Achaemenid period (530 BC) to the late 19th century, the Qajar period, shows the stability and importance of this architectural structure in the lives of the people of Iran and West Asia. This nomination includes 54 caravanserais located in a network of ancient, historical and pilgrimage routes, which resemble as a chain, not only from the point of view of tangible heritage, but also enjoys a remarkable and integral intangible heritage. This human phenomenon has been the place of exchange of ideas, knowledge, trade and the meeting place of different cultures, ethnicities and religions throughout time. These are the irreplaceable features that connect this number of caravanserais to each other and furnishes them with the outstanding universal value.

Criterion (ii): Emergence of the Persian caravanseral enriched the exchange of cultural values. The diversity and variety that could be seen in this heritage were the result of the extremely long period of time and uninterrupted use of the caravanserals that were a place for interaction between various civilizations over the span of the last three

millennia. Caravanserais, as one the most significant structures constructed on historical routes, such as the Silk Roads, Shāhrāh-e-Khorāsān (Khorasan Road) and pilgrimage routes, presented valuable ideas.

Criterion (iii): Persian caravanseral bears an exclusive cultural tradition for long journeys in the past times and is a symbol of a civilization in the region of Iran that has lasted from the 5th century BC to the early years of the 20th century. The network of caravanserals and its related infrastructures in different time periods were of significant importance for the expansion of trading among different areas of the known world as well as the growth of economic and cultural interactions among various ethnic groups and nations.

Integrity

The selected caravanserais in the serial nomination dossier of the "Persian Caravanserais" are spread over a network of historical roads. These caravanserais can be divided into urban and suburban types. The components enjoy integrity, and as a whole, they have a good and stable relation with each other. The integrity of the components can be confirmed, each in its place and in general in relation to the network of historical and ancient roads. In addition, despite the passage of time, the integrity of the caravanserais that have been protected as ancient relics, can also be confirmed. The current conservation plans emphasize on safeguarding of their integrity as a whole and each component regarding the property as the components have kept their connection with the surrounding and landscape. The serial and web-like network of the caravanserais constitute an integrated network across the historical roads.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the Persian caravanserais can be proven based on the form, function and design. Some of these caravanserais have still kept their historical functions for pilgrims and traders; and the new functions have been assigned for other caravanserais, which have also been carried out in order to revive these properties, have not damaged the originality of the properties. The caravanserais that are preserved as archaeological site enjoy higher degrees of originality.

The caravanserais bear a unique testimony to a disappeared tradition of traveling which enjoyed tangible and intangible features. The spatial background of the caravanserais and the main elements related to the components enjoy the same originality as the components'. And the authenticity of the property is properly protected.

The spatial structure and historical details of all inscribed caravanserais have been well restored while keeping the authenticity. The conservation and revitalization programs have been prepared aiming at preserving the authenticity of the property. The materials used in the components were mostly stone and bricks that have been restored and preserved through traditional and historical methods.

Protection and management requirements

All component parts have been inscribed on the National Cultural Heritage List. Therefore, they are protected by different legislative instruments. Buffer zones are subject to regulations that prohibit any damaging or disturbing activity such as polluting industrial activities or garbage accumulation. By law, the Iranian Ministry of Cultural Heritage, Tourism and Handicrafts (IMCHTH) is the responsible authority for the conservation of all artistic, historical and cultural monuments and sites within the country. For the purpose of managing the nominated property, the IMCHTH has established the Persian Caravanserai Cultural Heritage Base, under the Deputy of Cultural Heritage. The work of the Persian Caravanserai Base is supported by two Committees – the Technical Committee and the Steering Committee – and by locals. The Technical Committee is a consultant committee which provides advice about any technical details such as interventions or use of materials. Therefore, it consists of experienced specialists from

various fields including restoration and conservation, tourism, handicrafts, anthropology, archaeology, road engineering, and architecture. The Steering Committee is composed of representatives of different institutions related to the management of the nominated property.

All caravanserais included in the nominated property have individual restoration plans. In addition, urban are taken into consideration in urban and rural master plans. The provisions included in those plans in relation to the caravanserais and their buffer zones should be approved by the IMCHTH. The national plan for expanding tourism nationwide, titled "Document 15-Years Development of the Tourism Industry in the I.R Iran", is considered as the upstream document for the tourism extension plans of all provinces. Local communities are involved in the management of the component parts that are located in cities or within the vicinity of villages. In such cases, some members of the local communities are employed in different positions. In addition, some adaptive reuse projects aim to serve the community in a direct manner by allocating spaces within the component parts for local NGOs or for locally needed functions, such as a library, child care center or a training center.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give urgent consideration to the following:
 - a) Revise the boundaries of the component parts to include the immediate surroundings of the caravanserais and important ancillary buildings related to each and submit a minor boundary modification request,
 - b) Strengthen the management plan for the property as a whole to include clear management objectives, detail the governance arrangements and how the different actors coordinate their actions, define decision-making processes, and include disaster risk-preparedness, comprehensive interpretation, and tourism strategies for all component parts, especially for the caravanserais: Khoy, Titi, Sāeen and Chameshk,
 - c) Strengthen the monitoring programme for the property as a whole to include a clear, simple to measure and cost-effective set of indicators in terms of data collection, analysis and interpretation, and which allow the easy aggregation of data and transmission across different administrative levels;
- 5. <u>Also recommends</u> that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Issuing general guidelines for the adaptation of the caravanserais with regards to modern commercial and hospitality functions,
 - b) Ensuring that laws and regulations that apply to the buffer zones are strictly enforced.
 - Undertaking maintenance work on a regular basis so that necessary interventions are kept to a minimum and respecting international conservation principles and good conservation practice;
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for review by the Word Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.12

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,

- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Gaya Tumuli, Republic of Korea**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (iii)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Gaya Tumuli are a serial property consisting of seven cemeteries created by members of the Gaya Confederacy, an ancient collection of several polities that persisted from the 1st through the mid-6th centuries CE in the southern section of the Korean Peninsula. The seven cemeteries are the Daeseong-dong Tumuli, Marisan Tumuli, Okjeon Tumuli, Jisan-dong Tumuli, Songhak-dong Tumuli, Yugok-ri and Durak-ri Tumuli, and Gyo-dong and Songhyeon-dong Tumuli.

Through its geographical distribution, locational characteristics, types of burials, and contents of grave goods, the property attests to the distinctive Gaya political system in which affiliated polities were allowed to exist as autonomous political equals while sharing cultural commonalities. The Gaya Confederacy responded with flexibly to political shifts in ancient East Asia and contributed to maintaining the balance of power in the region by cooperating internally and taking part in exchanges with neighbouring states.

The seven cemeteries are the burial grounds for the top leaders of seven Gaya polities that developed independently at different sites across the southern portion of the Korean Peninsula. The cemeteries are all located on elevated terrain at the centre of a polity and are home to densely clustered tombs constructed over a long period. This dispersed distribution of equally monumental and elaborate tomb clusters manifesting shared practices for locating and building high-status tombs testifies to the existence of multiple equally powerful and autonomous polities living under the influence of the same culture.

The cemeteries all feature a particular kind of stone-lined burial chamber and have produced a distinctive form of pottery, respectively known as the Gaya-type stone-lined chamber burial and Gaya-style pottery. These commonalities contribute to identifying the territorial bounds of the Gaya Confederacy. Individual variations can still be found within these two indicators, allowing the boundaries of each polity to be identified and testifying to their political autonomy. Other grave goods, such as iron weapons reflecting similar levels of military power and trade goods imported into and exchanged within the Gaya Confederacy, demonstrate how the seven polities existed as political equals and maintained a level of internal parity.

Criterion (iii): The Gaya Tumuli bear exceptional testimony to Gaya, a unique ancient East Asian civilisation that coexisted with its more strongly centralised neighbours but maintained a distinct confederated political system. The property is important evidence of the diversity found among ancient East Asian civilisations.

Integrity

The Gaya Tumuli comprehensively manifest the distinct political system of Gaya, incorporating within the boundaries of the component parts all the attributes necessary to convey its Outstanding Universal Value, such as geographical distribution, locational characteristics, types of burial and grave goods.

The archaeological attributes of the property are mostly conserved in good condition. The component areas are large enough to demonstrate the topographical and spatial characteristics of the property and the process of its development.

The property is under rigorous government protection according to the Cultural Heritage Protection Act and is unlikely to suffer from adverse effects of either development or neglect. Some of the cemeteries have been affected by nearby urbanisation, but not to an extent that would have an adverse impact on their attributes.

Authenticity

The seven cemeteries meet the conditions of authenticity in terms of form and design, materials and substance, and location and setting.

Excavation within the property has been conducted to the minimal possible extent and only for academic or conservation purposes by expert institutes. The excavations conducted to date have confirmed the authenticity of the burial structures, burial-mound construction methods and building materials. Repair work within the component parts' settings is conducted by nationally licensed heritage professionals and ensure that there are no impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value. It is based on the findings of archaeological research and takes place only after a thorough analysis of the original form, structure, material, and construction methods.

Although the wider settings of the property component parts have evolved to a certain extent, there has been little change in location and topography, the major attributes conveying the Outstanding Universal Value.

Protection and management requirements

The property is safeguarded by the Cultural Heritage Protection Act and other rules and regulations. Each of the seven cemeteries has been nationally designated as a Heritage Area with the title "Historic Site". The buffer zones are mostly included in the Historic and Cultural Environment Preservation Area for each cemetery (an additional layer of protection offered to a Heritage Area) and therefore benefit from strict development restrictions.

The authorisation of any change in the current state of the property falls under the responsibility of the Cultural Heritage Administration and on-site management is carried out by the pertinent local governments. Archaeological research and repair efforts on the property are conducted by professionally certified groups and individuals under the overriding principle of maintaining the authenticity and integrity. Grave goods from the property are vested with the State and housed at museums and other research institutes. Funds required for the management and conservation of the property are provided by the Cultural Heritage Administration and the pertinent local governments.

A conservation plan has been prepared for each cemetery. The World Heritage Nomination Office for the Gaya Tumuli is leading the efforts at monitoring the property in an integrated manner. The Nomination Office has also established an integrated management plan. Disaster-prevention facilities have been installed at each site. A network of close cooperation for disaster prevention has been established at each cemetery with relevant organisations. Local residents are participating in heritage interpretation and monitoring activities.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Continuing the process of acquisition of the privately-owned land plots within the component parts,
 - b) Mitigating the impact of intrusive elements in the buffer zones and on the property, especially the road that is dividing the Gyo-dong and Songhyeon-dong Tumuli component part,
 - c) Developing strategies to promote all the sites, in order to disperse the visitor levels more evenly amongst the component parts,
 - d) Establishing an integrated monitoring system based at least partly on quantitative data.
 - e) Further involving local communities in the decision-making processes.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.13

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the Silk Roads: Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iii) and (v);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor is one of the key sections of the Silk Roads in Central Asia that connects other corridors from all directions. Comprising thirty-four component parts located in rugged mountains, fertile river valleys, and uninhabited desert, the 866-kilometre corridor runs from east to west along the Zarafshan River and further southwest following the ancient caravan roads crossing the Karakum Desert to the Merv Oasis.

Dotted along the corridor passing through varied geographical areas such as highland, piedmont, dry steppe, oases, fertile valleys, and arid-desert zones, the selected component parts reflect the complexity of landscapes and the adaption of societies to the control of the Silk Roads movement and trade. The variation in human responses between the fertile valleys and deltas, and the desert and river crossings, are clearly reflected in the selection of small towns, forts, and way stations; while the outcomes of the political and social capital generated by trading contacts are reflected in the range of commercial, elite, and religious buildings included in the nomination. It was the place where the Sogdians, some of the most international merchants in the world history, flourished. The control of these corridors was of vital significance to many of the great Silk Roads empires, such as the Sogdian, the Parthian, the Sassanian, the Timurid and the Seljuk, as they were fundamental to long-distance exchange along the Silk Roads.

Along the corridor, a large quantity of goods and some high-value commodities from the East and the West were moved and traded, and many famous local products were brought out of there to feed the desires of the populations afar. People travelled, settled, conquered, or were defeated there, making it a melting pot of ethnicities, cultures, religions, sciences, and technologies. During the historic period of the Silk Roads between the 2nd century BCE and the 16th century CE, the Corridor had experienced three prosperous periods: the rise of Sogdians merchants between the 5th and 8th centuries CE; the thriving trade with the Muslim world and beyond between the 10th and 12th centuries CE, and significant development of science, culture, urban planning and economics under the Mongols' rule from the 13th century to the 17th century CE.

Criterion (ii): The Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor exhibits an important interchange of human values over a span of eighteen centuries in the heart of Central Asia as demonstrated by the architecture, monuments, town planning, landscapes, arts, and technology of its component parts which reflect diversified cultures, ethnic traditions, beliefs, and technologies in both distinct and fused ways. Being one of the key sections at the centre of the Silk Roads network linking multiple ethnic regions, which has been alternatively controlled by nearby great empires, the Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor clearly demonstrates the diversity of populations, and the cultures and traditions, ideas and beliefs, as well as knowledge and technologies associated with them.

Criterion (iii): The territory of the Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor is overlaid by rich layers of cultural depositions which accumulated throughout history, which is an exceptional testimony to the cultural traditions of the societies that were shaped by the trade and exchanged along the Corridor. These are evidenced by the wealth of the Sogdian merchants as displayed by their luxurious residences, the Sogdian temples with fire altar and murals, the Achaemenid citadels, the early Islamic hypostyle mosques with a large

minaret, the rich Sufism buildings after the Great Arab Conquest, the advanced irrigation systems, as well as the wide spectrum of the caravan service facilities that had been provided and maintained by the successive empires controlling the Corridor.

Criterion (v): The Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor is an outstanding example of traditional human settlements and land use that is representative of human interaction with nature. The territory of the Corridor covers diverse geographic areas such as highlands, piedmonts, dry steppes, oases and fertile valleys, and arid-desert zones, which dictated the town planning, architectural designs, agricultural and other production activities. It was also the people's determination, initiatives, and ingenious designs that transformed the harsh land into one on which populations thrived.

Integrity

The integrity of the property is at two levels: the corridor level and the individual component part level. At the corridor level, the diversity of forms and functions of the selected component parts, including mausoleums, sardobas, caravanserais, minarets, mosques, religious complexes, settlements, and remains of ancient cities, fully demonstrate the active role the Corridor once played in history as a nodal section, which not only linked other corridors but also contributed to the trade with locally produced goods. The serial property as a whole also showcases the exchange of ideas and knowledge along the Silk Roads as the result of the movement of people and goods. At the individual component part level, all the attributes that are needed to convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the property are included in the property. The factors affecting the property, such as development pressure, are largely under the control of the States Parties.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the property resides at both the corridor level and the individual component part level. At the corridor level, the direction of the route, the geographical conditions, and the landscape settings that had shaped this section remain relatively unchanged over time. At the component part level, the location, the planning, and the layout of the sites remain unchanged. With many stretches of roads still used for transportation as they were used in the past, and most of the religious buildings and cemeteries still performing their original functions today. Many archaeological sites have been excavated and backfilled to protect the materials from deterioration, with the great majority of the portion remaining untouched, providing an opportunity for future research and the recovery of authentic data. The original materials and designs are found in most of the buildings. Conservation interventions conducted on the buildings observed internationally accepted principles such as minimal interventions. Reconstruction for interpretation purposes was undertaken in such a way that the reconstructed parts are distinguishable from the original structures and materials.

Protection and management requirements

The legal protection operates at the international, national, and component part levels. At the international level, an Agreement between the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Tajikistan, the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Uzbekistan and the Ministry of Culture of Turkmenistan for common promotion, management and protection of the components of the Serial Transnational Nomination "Silk Roads: Zeravshan-Karakum Corridor" was signed among the States Parties in 2020 as the legal basis for the protection and management of the property. At the national level, all thirty-four component parts are state-owned and listed under state-level legal designations. At the site level, all thirty-four component parts have been meticulously surveyed, studied, and documented, the necessary measures required for their preservation are implemented, and land-use restrictions as well as planning regulations necessary for conservation purposes, are put into effect.

The Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor is managed at the transnational, national, and component part levels. At the corridor level, the management is regulated by the Agreement, which establishes a Coordinating Committee and a Working Group for the overall protection and management of the property. The Coordinating Committee conducts meetings with relevant stakeholders to resolve arising issues on the protection and management of the Corridor. The Coordinating Committee, together with the local authorities also provides the necessary tools and training to the managers and inspectors and encourage research and joint activities for the protection and promotion of the Silk Roads Corridor. The Working Group conducts meetings to discuss issues on protection and management of the component parts at the request of the Coordinating Committee. The Working Group is also responsible for the monitoring of the state of conservation of the component parts and informing the Coordinating Committee on adopted decisions. The International Institute for Central Asian Studies (IICAS), based in Samarkand (Uzbekistan), facilitates the sharing of information among the countries during management processes. It also acts as the secretariat of the nomination of the Zarafshan-Karakum Corridor.

At the national level, all the component parts are owned by the States Parties, and designated as protected heritage sites. Ministries of Culture of the States Parties are respectively responsible for the management of the cultural heritage in their countries in terms of state registration, policy-making, administration and budget allocation, among others.

At the component part level, each site is managed by the regional branches or governmental institutions under the Ministries of Culture of the States Parties. The costs of site management, maintenance, conservation, and monitoring are mainly covered by the central and local government annual budgetary fund, while national and international ex-budgetary aids are allocated for specific projects such as conservation campaigns, capacity building, and research. Technical support is provided by international resources, as well as universities, and academic institutions of the States Parties.

Staff capacity has been significantly improved in the past decade, but can be further strengthened in the future. A site management plan with a monitoring mechanism should be developed for each component part, and an interpretation strategy should be adopted.

- 4. Recommends that the States Parties give consideration to the following:
 - a) Developing and implementing a five-year management plan with monitoring mechanisms as an integral part,
 - b) Developing and implementing a coordinated interpretation strategy to guide all the interpretation initiatives at the component parts,
 - c) Establishing visitor management systems at all component parts with basic infrastructure, safety measures, service, and interpretation,
 - d) Continuing capacity building for on-site staff members,
 - e) Undertaking research to address the problem of rising damp coupled with salt activities that damage the lower portion of historic structures of the component parts,
 - f) Engaging local communities in site management, archaeological excavation, conservation and restoration, and tourist services for them to better benefit from the World Heritage status,
 - g) Undertaking research on artificial irrigation systems that helped the growth of the populations and cities in the region, with the view to consider potential extensions of the property in the future,

- h) Considering the Sheibanikhan Water Divider Bridge in the future as an extension of the property when conditions allow it,
- i) Investigating on the location and extent of the Toksankoriz Irrigation System (Tajikistan) component part and adjusting the boundaries of the property area and the relevant buffer zone accordingly, so as to cover the whole historical irrigation system, through a minor boundary modification request,
- j) Undertaking a study on the associative values of the necropolis, the pilgrim route, and the sacred spring outside the buffer zone of the Mausoleum of Khoja Mukhammad Bashoro (Tajikistan) component part, taking into consideration the requirements of integrity and authenticity, and considering adjustments of the boundaries of this component part, through a minor boundary modification request, if relevant.
- k) Incorporating the three World Heritage properties along the Corridor into the management and interpretation systems of this property;
- 5. Requests the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

B.2.2 Nominations deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Decision: 45 COM 8B.14

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Deer Stone Monuments and Related Sites of Bronze Age, Mongolia**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (i)** and **(iii)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Deer Stone Monuments and Related Sites are significant and striking examples associated with the Late Bronze Age culture of Eurasian nomadic peoples. Deer stone monuments dated from approximately 1200 to 600 BCE. They are almost always located within complexes that include khirgisüürs (elaborated burial mounds), sacrificial altars, human burials and remains of horses, and other elements. Together the four component parts represent the occurrence and diversity of Mongolian deer stone monuments, khirgisüürs and satellite structures, and are notable examples of the world's megalithic ceremonial and funeral sites. Deer stones are gigantic steles, ranging in height up to four metres with engravings of stylised stag images. Elaborately decorated the stones are set directly in the ground singly or in groups.

In terms of ornamentation, cultural significance, archaeological and landscape contexts, the Mongolian deer stones are unique within the world's Bronze Age monumental heritage sites. About 1,500 deer stones have been discovered across the Eurasian steppe, classified into three distinct forms based on their artistic traditions. More than eighty percent of these occur in Mongolia, and the images of a stylised stag that cover these stones are without parallels across Bronze Age Eurasia. The significance of deer stone complexes at Khoid Tamir, Jargalantyn Am, Urtyn Bulag and Uushigiin Övör lies not only in their ancient origins and broad distribution, but also in their number, the variety

and elegance of their ornamentation, and their intact spatial associations with khirgisüürs and other elements.

Criterion (i): The Deer Stone Monuments are of exceptional beauty and cultural significance and are masterworks of Late Bronze Age culture. They constitute an outstanding example of Bronze Age megalithic monumental art of the highest quality, demonstrating the artistic vitality and creative genius of human achievement in prehistoric times. They demonstrate an extraordinary variety in their ornamentation, yet all featuring the imagery of a great antlered stag.

Criterion (iii): The Deer Stone Monuments and Related Sites provide an exceptional testimony to the culture of Eurasian Bronze Age nomads, which had evolved and disappeared slowly from the 2nd to the 1st millennia BCE. In their landscape settings, they are testimony to the ceremonial and funeral practices of these peoples.

Integrity

The serial property includes all the elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value, and the selection of component parts has been justified. The elements within the four component parts reflect the original layout and size of the complexes as they were shaped in the Late Bronze and Early Iron Ages. Aside from some tourism facilities, there are no commercial activities associated with the property. The individual component parts and the serial property as a whole meet the requirements of integrity.

Authenticity

Archaeological studies support the truthfulness of cultural values attributed to the sites within the property. The component parts reflect the original form, design, materials, layout, size, and locations of these complex monuments as they were created and shaped in the Late Bronze and Early Iron Ages. Surviving vestiges and monuments attest to the artistic skills and techniques used in the creation of these complex structures, and the knowledge and talent of the people who built them.

Protection and management requirements

Legal protection is provided through the Mongolian Law on the Protection of Cultural Heritage (2014) and the List of Immovable Historical and Cultural Heritage Properties under State, Provincial and Local (Soum) Protection (2008). Protection applies to the four component parts via various provincial and local proclamations and lists. Khoid Tamir and Uushigiin Övör are included in the State list, while Jargalantyn Am and Urtyn Bulag are in provincial and local lists. Uushigiin Övör is also a monument under State Special Protection.

All component parts derive some protection from their remote locations and their traditional land use by nomadic herders. For the most part, such traditional ways of protection are still observed within these areas.

A concise management plan establishes a shared set of objectives for the four component parts. This has been elaborated with the active participation of local communities and stakeholders. A site management administration unit for the protection and management of World Heritage properties which will ensure the implementation of the integrated management plan has been established. There are a number of aspects of the management system that require continuing development and implementation including documentation, risk management, sustainable tourism planning and monitoring.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Implementing the management plan fully, ensuring that sufficient personnel and resources for the administration and management are in place,

- b) Completing the survey and documentation of the component parts, including important elements in the landscape setting,
- c) Adopting a landscape management approach for the setting of the property,
- d) Preparing and implementing more detailed risk management and sustainable tourism plans,
- e) Avoiding further re-erection of deer stones without a robust methodology consistent with best conservation practices, and consideration of remedial measures as needed,
- f) Giving emphasis, in the monitoring arrangements, to the actual state of conservation of the identified attributes,
- g) Defining the carrying capacity of the land for grazing, and supporting traditional methods of pasture rotation,
- h) Establishing a timetable for the removal of the remnant machinery of the disused coal mine in the southwestern part of the buffer zone of the Khoid Tamir component part,
- i) Implementing the planned improvements to the interpretation of the serial property,
- j) Relocating the wire mesh protective fence at the Uushigiin Övör component part that currently cuts through one of the khirgisüürs,
- k) Continuing the consultations needed to relocate the tent hotel at the Uushigiin Övör component part outside of the buffer zone;
- 5. <u>Decides</u> that the name of the property in English be changed to "**Deer Stone Monuments and Related Bronze Age Sites**" in order to better reflect the revised justification presented by the State Party.

B.3 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

B.3.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.15

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Tr'ondëk-Klondike, Canada**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (iv)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Tr'ondëk-Klondike is located in the homeland of the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in, in north-western Canada. It is a serial property that includes eight component parts: Fort Reliance; Ch'ëdähdëk (Forty Mile); Ch'ëdähdëk Tth'än K'et (Dënezhu Graveyard); Fort Cudahy and Fort Constantine; Tr'ochëk; Dawson City; Jëjik Dhä Dënezhu Kek'it (Moosehide Village); and Tthe Zrąy Kek'it (Black City). These have been significant resource and cultural areas for the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in's ancestors for thousands of years and were fundamentally transformed during the colonial occupation of these lands. Collectively,

the geographical, structural, and archaeological evidence of the Tr'ondëk-Klondike serial property represents a rare and exceptionally preserved tangible illustration of dramatic modifications of land use, settlement patterns, and economy caused by the rapid and large scale of the colonising incursion of newcomers into the ancestral land of the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in in search of gold and precious minerals. It also testifies to the intense upheaval that impacted the Indigenous people between 1874 and 1908, their dispossession from, and marginalisation in, their ancestral land, as well as their response and adaptation to the progressive colonial affirmation of the newly established Dominion of Canada. The component parts are also places where, through the endurance and revival of traditions, the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in have fostered and maintained their distinct cultural identity.

Criterion (iv): Tr'ondëk-Klondike includes archaeological immovable remains, built structures and settlement patterns that illustrate the dramatic encounter triggered by the feverish search for precious metals between the Indigenous population and outsiders in a sub-arctic region, the colonial affirmation of the latter over the lands, resources and people, and the Indigenous people's response to these events, in the late 19th century. Tr'ondëk-Klondike stands out as a very rare occurrence and provides remarkable evidence of growing colonial influence within a concentrated timeframe – from the construction of the first commercial fur-trading post at Fort Reliance in 1874, to the Klondike Gold Rush of 1896-1898, and, ultimately, the consolidation of colonial authority by 1908.

Integrity

Tr'ondëk-Klondike falls entirely within the homeland of the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in. All the elements necessary to demonstrate the integrity of Tr'ondëk-Klondike – composed of encampments and harvesting sites, buildings, artefacts, and buried archaeological features – are found within the boundaries of the serial property, which is of adequate size to convey the property's Outstanding Universal Value. Key elements of the landscape setting that provide functional links among component parts are included in the buffer zones, whilst expansive views and viewsheds from component parts over the riverine landscape, the surrounding hills and mountains that contribute to the understanding of the Outstanding Universal Value are part of the wider setting. As a whole, the property does not suffer from the adverse effects of development or neglect. The physical evidence that transmits the Outstanding Universal Value of Tr'ondëk-Klondike is in good condition and the property's component parts are protected and managed under appropriate legislation and policy, with no component part exposed to unplanned or unregulated developments.

Authenticity

The authenticity of Tr'ondëk-Klondike is confirmed in the location and setting, changing land uses, and patterns of settlement by the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in in response to the incursion of foreigners into their homeland. The property includes evidence related to both foreign colonial actors and Indigenous people that demonstrates extreme and rapid socio-economic change, as well as an active continuation of cultural traditions, resource use, and established settlement patterns. The authenticity of Tr'ondëk-Klondike is supported through Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in's stories and oral history about the property, the assessment and reporting on the archaeological and historical resources, and archival and documentary records. Authenticity is also confirmed by language and other forms of intangible heritage, such as place names and the traditions, laws and customs of the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in known as 'Tr'ëhudè', and the landscape setting and views from and over the Tr'ondëk-Klondike serial property.

Protection and management requirements

The property is subject to a strong and comprehensive legislative and jurisdictional framework, across four levels of government, that protects the historic and

archaeological resources of Tr'ondëk-Klondike. Protection and management of the serial property is secured through Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in, territorial, federal, and municipal legislation and policies. Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in's legislation is consistent with traditional governance, traditional practices, community planning, and conservation policies.

Territorial, federal, and municipal laws and policies contribute to the protection, conservation practices, management, and legal recognition of community-based planning and formal designation of historic sites. All component parts are designated as either national, territorial, or municipal historic sites or protected burial sites, or identified in the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in Final Agreement, which outlines provisions of protection and management. The Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) concerning the Joint Management and Protection of Tr'ondëk-Klondike and the "Tr'ondëk-Klondike World Heritage Site Management Plan" provide a framework for the four levels of government that have regulatory, management, or administrative responsibilities for the property. The management plan describes principles, objectives and responsibilities of each partner and relies on existing management plans for individual designated heritage sites.

Long-term protection and management challenges for the property include the effects of climate change and other environmental factors; the decision-making process has been strengthened to avoid threats from mineral exploitation.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Finalising and implementing the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) concerning the Joint Management and Protection of Tr'ondëk-Klondike and related ancillary management coordination mechanisms,
 - b) Preparing a study on key views and viewsheds over the landscape setting to ensure their consideration in all developments and related decision-making processes,
 - c) Proceeding with the finalisation of the announced measures and instruments to further reinforce management effectiveness according to the proposed timeframes:
- 5. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to provide updated figures for the areas of the revised boundaries of the buffer zones.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.16

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Viking-Age Ring Fortresses**, **Denmark**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria** (iii) and (iv);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The ring fortresses of Aggersborg, Fyrkat, Nonnebakken, Trelleborg and Borgring, constructed between about 970 and 980 CE during the reign of King Harald 'Bluetooth' Gormsson, represent outstanding examples and technological mastery of military architecture. Strategically positioned close to important land and sea routes across the Jutland peninsula and on the islands of Funen and Zealand in present-day Denmark, all five enclosures were constructed based on a uniform, precise, geometric, scalable design, and incorporated elements of natural topography for defensive purposes. The structures included fortified circular ramparts with four gateways located close to the

cardinal points. In most cases, they were equipped with a concentric ditch, axial streets encircled by a ring street, and rows of longhouses geometrically arranged in the four quadrants of the fortified ring.

While functioning for only a brief period, this chain of Viking-Age fortresses is representative of the largest monuments that illustrate the centralisation of power by the Danish Jelling Dynasty and the consolidation of the kingdom of Denmark under King Harald, who integrated a vast territory spreading from present-day northern Germany to Denmark, southern Sweden and Norway. This network demonstrates the existence of a strong royal authority that was able, through military operations and alliance building, to command sufficient resources to exert sovereign control over territorial waters, land traffic and trade.

The fortresses, the function of which can only be inferred, testify to the early stages of state formation and socio-political transformations of the late 10th century CE in the Danish kingdom, including the conversion to Christianity, which eventually triggered the progression of statehood and Christianity in the whole of Scandinavia, and heralded the beginning of the Middle Ages in Northern Europe.

Criterion (iii): The monumental scale of the Viking-Age ring fortresses, built in a precise manner and within a single decade, signifies a high degree of centralised control and is evidence of King Harald's ability to muster military power, resources and a local workforce to create a coherent system of surveillance and control over a vast territory. The ring fortresses testify to Harald's state-building ambitions and can be seen as an outstanding testament of the process of state formation and an expression of a cultural shift in the geo-cultural context of Scandinavia and Northern Europe.

Criterion (iv): The chain of fortresses represents an outstanding example of monumental military architecture in Scandinavia and an exceptional integrated system within the wider context of the European Viking Age. The network demonstrates high technical values of construction and the exceptionality of a strictly ordered geometry in scalable form. The precise manner in which all five ring fortresses were built over a short period of time testifies to the existence of centralised power that was required to manage such a monumental infrastructure project involving resource-intensive engineering. Their strategic positioning linked to the control of major land and sea routes, and their territorial spread, hint at a unified system of governance over a vast area.

Integrity

All the elements necessary to express the property's Outstanding Universal Value are included within its boundaries. Archaeological deposits have been preserved at all five component parts sufficiently well to sustain the essential values of the property. The form of the excavated features survives intact in the subsoil. While the above-ground elements of the fortresses have suffered decay, the key structural elements of the Aggersborg, Fyrkat and Trelleborg enclosures are readable in the landscape. The Borgring and Nonnebakken fortresses are discernible only as small elevations, the latter being covered entirely by urban fabric. The landscape around the fortresses has changed substantially since the Viking Age due to natural and human-made factors. Elements of modern infrastructure have a visual impact on some of the individual component parts.

Authenticity

The original forms, designs, materials and substance of the ring fortresses have survived unaltered below ground at all five component parts, even in areas where archaeological excavations have taken place. The above-ground elements of the enclosures have been damaged due to various human activities and natural erosion over many centuries, and the landscapes of the five fortresses have evolved, but the strategic settings of the structures can still be comprehended. The five component parts contribute to the

Outstanding Universal Value of the site as a whole, and the property does not suffer unduly from adverse effects of development and/or neglect.

Protection and management requirements

All five component parts are legally protected as ancient monuments at the national level through the Danish Museum Act (No. 1505 of 14 December 2006). At the municipal level, all of the fortresses are cited in the respective municipal plans, which are regulated by the Planning Act (No. 1027 of 20 October 2008). Spatial planning documents and special zoning restrictions provide additional protection to the property and the buffer zones.

The boundaries of the property reflect the highest level of national legal protection, with the exception of parts of Trelleborg and Borgring, where the process of extending the scheduled areas to cover the entire area of these component parts will depend on further archaeological investigations and negotiations with landowners. In these cases, the sections falling outside the scheduled areas are protected by compatible high-level nature protections.

Protection and management of the property reside at the highest level with the Danish Agency for Culture and Palaces. Management at the level of the component parts lies with the Danish Nature Agency at Aggersborg, the National Museum of Denmark at Fyrkat and Trelleborg, the Museum Southeast Denmark at Borgring, and the Odense City Museums at Nonnebakken. The management of the serial property will be coordinated by a Series Coordinator, responsible for the delivery of an integrated Property Management Plan (2023-2027) across all the component parts. A key mid- to long-term challenge will be to mitigate the negative visual impact modern infrastructure has on views to and from some of the component parts.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Supplementing the integrated Property Management Plan with dedicated management plans for each individual component part and its buffer zone,
 - b) Developing for the ensemble of fortresses an overarching conservation plan, a concept for an interpretation and promotion strategy, and an integrated tourism strategy,
 - c) Further developing the draft research strategy and integrating it with the Property Management Plan,
 - Establishing clear baseline data to be used as a point of reference for monitoring purposes, and specifying limits to acceptable changes in order to inform future actions,
 - e) Considering the possibility of extending the boundaries of the component parts to include the strategic landscape setting of the fortresses, if and when this becomes possible, through a minor boundary modification request,
 - f) Exploring the possibility of extending the serial property to include the two similar Scanian fortresses, should future research and sufficient evidence justify including these archaeological sites.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.17

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1</u>,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Jewish-Medieval Heritage of Erfurt, Germany**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (iv)**;

3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located in the heart of the Old Town of Erfurt in Thuringia, the Jewish-Medieval Heritage of Erfurt comprises the Old Synagogue, the Mikveh and the Stone House, which are rare and exceptionally preserved examples of Central European Jewish buildings that illustrate, in their built fabric, architectural details and decoration programme, the adaptation to the town's specific spatial and social conditions and the coexistence of a Jewish community with a predominantly Christian society, during the urban development of Erfurt at the crossroads of important commercial routes in Central Europe in the Middle Ages. The property sheds light on the heyday of a Jewish community engaged with trade and exchanges in Central Europe during the Middle Ages, between the late 11th and mid-14th centuries CE, until the Black Death wave of pogroms.

Criterion (iv): The Old Synagogue, the Mikveh and the Stone House of Erfurt are an early and rare testimony to Jewish religious and secular architecture from the Middle Ages in Central Europe. The buildings illustrate the conformity with vernacular architecture and adaptation to local conditions and thus reflect the coexistence with a predominantly Christian society and the heyday of Jewish life in Central Europe's medieval Erfurt until the wave of pogroms of the mid-14th century.

Integrity

The property includes all attributes necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value. The former Jewish Quarter, in the buffer zone, with its well-preserved urban layout, medieval built fabric, and street network, includes visual connections and attributes that are functionally important as a support to the property and its protection. The integration of the buildings of the Jewish community into the medieval city is impressively perceivable to this day. They reflect how Jews and Christians lived together in the midst of coexistence, persecution and expulsion in a medieval city in Europe. The three component parts are of adequate size, so the protection of the characteristics and processes, which communicate the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, is guaranteed. The Jewish-Medieval Heritage of Erfurt is not threatened by any adverse developments or neglect.

Authenticity

The form and materials of the Old Synagogue, the Mikveh and the Stone House are largely preserved. Evidence of their construction and use by the Jewish community and Jewish citizens of the city and their conformity with local building traditions and techniques is provided by the preserved original medieval building fabric. The exceptionally well-preserved building fabric of the Old Synagogue mostly dates to the period from around 1100 to the early 14th century, when it was in use as a synagogue. In the Mikveh, the form of the ground plan and room height, as well as the medieval building fabric (12th-14th centuries), have been authentically preserved. Its original function as a ritual bath is fully perceivable. The Stone House is largely preserved in its fundamental structural elements from the 13th century and its unique interior design. The traces of a key event of European history, the wave of pogroms of 1348-1350, are clearly perceivable to this day.

Protection and management requirements

The laws and other regulations of the Federal Republic of Germany and the Free State of Thuringia guarantee the continuous protection of the Jewish-Medieval Heritage of Erfurt. The Old Synagogue, the Mikveh and the Stone House are registered as cultural monuments in the Book of Monuments (Denkmalbuch) of the Free State of Thuringia in accordance with Article 4 of the Protection of Cultural Heritage Act of Thuringia (ThürDSchG). In addition, they are included in the monument ensemble "Old Town of Erfurt", which is also recorded in the Book of Monuments. All measures in the monument

ensemble "Old Town of Erfurt", in which the three component parts and the buffer zone are located, require permission from the Local Cultural Protection Authority (Untere Denkmalschutzbehörde). In addition, municipal statutes and planning such as the preservation and design statutes and the Urban Development Concept ensure the sustenance of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and the protective function of the buffer zone.

The City of Erfurt is responsible for management as the owner of the property. A management plan has been developed as a binding action and planning instrument and will be periodically updated. The Site Coordinator office, backed up by the Steering Group and the Advisory Board, is key to guaranteeing coordination and management effectiveness at the property. A careful strategy for the use, interpretation and communication of the property is crucial for long-term sustenance of its Outstanding Universal Value.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Preparing a Heritage Impact Assessment for the planned visitor centre and sending it for review to the World Heritage Centre prior to any final decision on the matter,
 - b) Sharing with the World Heritage Centre the feasibility study for the use of the Stone House as soon as it has been finalised.
 - Integrating risk management considerations and measures within the overall management system and plans, including reviewing security measures for the three monuments.
 - d) Implementing an interpretation strategy aimed at all segments of the local population to disseminate and raise awareness about the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and in general on Jewish heritage in Erfurt and Central Europe,
 - e) Further developing specific indicators to ensure effective monitoring of all attributes of the property,
 - f) Ensuring regular monitoring of the management plan implementation and its periodical update;
- 5. <u>Requests</u> the State Party to provide updated figures for the areas of the revised boundaries of the property and of its buffer zone.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.18

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Old town of Kuldīga, Latvia**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (v)**;
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located in the western part of Latvia, in the central Kurzeme (Courland) region, the town of Kuldīga is an exceptionally well-preserved example of a traditional urban settlement. At the confluence of the Venta River and the smaller Alekšupīte stream, the beginnings of Kuldīga, which was called Goldingen at the time, date back to the 13th century. The rivers' intersection is a defining element of the town's structure, contributing to its scenic

character. The medieval area of Kalnamiests, located on a hill, is clearly distinguishable in the townscape, given its oval shape.

A significant part of Kuldīga's history and development is linked to the Duchy of Courland and Semigallia, which governed a significant part of the Baltics between 1561 and 1795. The town was the primary residence and administrative centre of the Duchy's first ruler and maintained an important role afterwards. As a result, the town developed into a prosperous trading hub. The international orientation of the Duchy led to a rising number of foreign merchants and craftsmen settling in Kuldīga, who left their mark on the architectural language and building decoration of the region. The town's structure has largely retained the street layout which developed during the period of the Duchy.

The architectural influences and craftsmanship traditions introduced during the era of the Duchy endured well into the 19th century. However, different laws and regulations, aimed at fire safety, led to the progressive replacement of fire hazardous roofing materials. The proportion of masonry buildings also increased, replacing traditional wooden ones. In the second half of the 19th century, the brick bridge over the Venta River was constructed, connecting Kuldīga to the east.

Unlike other towns in the Baltic region, Kuldīga survived the great wars of the 20th century largely unscathed and modern urban developments were largely implemented far outside its historic centre.

Criterion (v): The old town of Kuldīga is an outstanding example of a well-preserved urban settlement, representative of traditional Baltic architecture and urbanism and of multiple historical periods – from the 13th to the early 20th centuries. Its historic urban fabric includes structures of traditional local log architecture as well as largely foreign-influenced techniques and styles of brick masonry and timber-framed houses that illustrate the integration of local craftsmanship with foreign influences from other Hanse towns and centres around the Baltic Sea as well as Russia. The craft skills are prominent in functional and ornamental building details throughout the town and continue to be employed by craftspeople today. The predominance of clay tiles as a roofing material contributes to the harmonious townscape of Kuldīga.

Integrity

The property encompasses the medieval castle mound plateau, the medieval area known as Kalnamiests, and the urban areas which developed during the ducal period from the 16th until the 18th centuries but continued to organically evolve afterwards. In addition, large areas of the environmental setting of Kuldīga are also included, namely the intersection of the Venta and Alekšupīte rivers, as well as the Ventas Rumba waterfall, which was essential for the growth of Kuldīga into a trading centre.

In the past, fires destroyed substantial parts of the urban fabric and remain a risk to this day, since the town has many wooden buildings as well as buildings with important wooden elements. Floods are another important factor that can potentially affect the property, particularly in view of climate change. To maintain the harmonious townscape, the town's general construction rules stipulate maximum building heights within the property and its buffer zone.

The boundaries of the property coincide, for the most part, with the national designation of the "urban construction monument" of state importance. The area of the Venta Valley is not included in that designation but is protected as a nature reserve. The buffer zone corresponds to the "individual protection zone" and has complementary legal provisions in order to give an added layer of protection to the property.

Authenticity

Kuldīga's urban and architectural heritage is well retained in terms of material, design and craftsmanship. It illustrates continuity in function and use as residences, auxiliary

structures and religious spaces for the resident community. The old town further preserves its authenticity in setting and location, which was a fundamental aspect for the development of the urban structure of the town, influenced by the intersection of the Venta and Alekšupīte rivers. The river landscape has changed over time but not to the extent that it fundamentally alters the environmental setting of the property.

Protection and management requirements

The property was first nationally recognised in 1969 and received the highest level of national protection as a cultural monument under the national Law "On the Protection of Cultural Monuments". The landscape elements of the Venta Valley have been protected since 1957 and were recognised in 2004 as part of the NATURA 2000 network. The buffer zone also has legal status as a monument of architecture (urban construction) of local importance in the list of state protected cultural monuments.

On a local level, multiple planning documents, such as a local territorial development plan, define strict legal mechanisms that contribute to the protection of the historic urban settlement and further prevent development pressures that might affect the property's significance.

Kuldīga Municipality acts as the main management authority for the property and its buffer zone. With regards to the conservation of historic buildings, the Kuldīga Restoration Centre is an essential partner of the municipality. The day-to-day management of the World Heritage property is guided by a management plan, which is complemented by subsidiary plans related to risk management and tourism management.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - Revising the monitoring programme to focus on a set of indicators clearly connected to the main attributes of the property and taking into account the main factors affecting the property,
 - b) Ensuring that the interpretation of the property reflects its significance as an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, reflecting multiple layers from the 13th to the early 20th centuries; while Kuldīga's importance in relation to the Duchy of Courland and Semigallia merits emphasis, it should be understood in relation to the town's development prior to and after that historical period,
 - c) Conducting a Heritage Impact Assessment, if the watch tower project were to go ahead, in line with the provisions included in the management plan and with paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.19

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Modernist Kaunas: Architecture of Optimism, 1919-1939, Lithuania, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (iv);
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Modernist Kaunas is situated in central Lithuania, at the confluence of two major rivers: the Nemunas and the Neris. The area within the nominated property was planned in the mid-19th century and developed in 1919–1939 when, after the declaration of an independent Republic of Lithuania in 1918, Kaunas served as the provisional capital of

the state. The status of provisional capital was crucial for the city's unprecedented growth and architectural development. In less than twenty years, under the auspices of the new national government and civic initiative, Kaunas was transformed into a modern city based on the assimilation of modern urban planning and architecture with pre-existing natural, urban, and other local conditions. Architecture, specifically in the form of a local inflection of the international language of modernism, played a particularly important role in that transformation. Kaunas Modernism, therefore, bears exceptional testimony to an authentically multifaceted modernism born out of local political and cultural exigencies and an evolutionary urban modernisation responding to pre-existing humanmade and natural features.

The property comprises two areas: Naujamiestis and Žaliakalnis. Naujamiestis (New Town), a generous grid planned in 1847, was attached to the eastern edge of the Old Town and extends eastwards along the valley of the Nemunas River. Naujamiestis was modernised and intensively developed in 1919–1939. Encircling Naujamiestis to the north and east is Žaliakalnis (Green Hill) – a distinctive natural plateau rising to an average of 35–40 metres. Žaliakalnis was developed as a garden city residential suburb in 1919–1939 according to a 1923 master plan of Kaunas, which enabled a seven-fold increase in area and accommodated a doubling of the city's population to 155.000 over the same period.

The most significant attributes of the city's resulting urban form and associated architecture are defined by the inherent optimism and civic initiative behind the creation of the new modern city as a provisional capital with inherited geographical and urban morphological distinctiveness. A rich architectural heritage of emerging modernism overlaid on the 19th century urban grid and a new garden suburb create a unique ensemble of two complimentary urban landscapes. The sensitive adaptation of the preexisting 19th-century urban grid, implementation of a garden city residential suburb, the successful integration of the natural environment, and the assimilation of local and global interpretations of architectural modernism gave birth to Kaunas Modernism, that reflects a diverse and innovative response to Lithuania's encounter with modernity and early 20th century European modernism. 1500 of the 6000 remaining buildings erected in Kaunas in 1919–1939 are concentrated in the nominated area and bear exceptional testimony to the multifaceted nature of architectural modernism in response to local conditions. The façades, streetscapes, and natural elements, combined with the pre-existing urban and geomorphological setting, create a unique sense of place exhibited through broad panoramas, open urban and natural spaces, and varied topography. Unlike many experiences of urban and architectural modernity, Kaunas reflects an evolutionary rather than revolutionary process of and response to modernisation in the early 20th century Europe.

Criterion (iv): Modernist Kaunas is an outstanding example of a historic city subject to rapid urbanisation and modernisation, encapsulated by diverse expressions of the values and aspirations associated with an optimistic belief in an independent future amid the turbulence of the early 20th century, when national borders were changing fast. The creation of a modern capital city of an emerging nation state is an outstanding testament to people's faith in the future and their ability to be creative under difficult political and economic conditions. The gradual and sustainable modernisation of Kaunas, carried out through civic initiatives with respect to the urban context and natural environment, produced an outstanding urban landscape and modern architectural language serving the needs of provisional capital and possessing functions, structures, and building typologies that reflected the modernisation of urban life in the 20th century.

Integrity

Modernist Kaunas consists of Naujamiestis and Žaliakalnis, two adjacent districts that have been preserved in adequate size in almost unchanged historical form and design.

The significant architectural structures and the original urban layout, including the characteristic sloping natural and humanmade terrain, public spaces and historic parks, have been retained in their entirety. Of 6000 surviving buildings constructed in Kaunas in 1919–1939, the greatest concentration of significant modernist structures is located in Naujamiestis and Žaliakalnis with 1500 buildings of representative administrative, public, industrial, and residential functions testifying to the speed and diversity of_development undertaken in the spirit of modernity. 220 structures and urban areas, constructed in the period of 1919–1939 within the Nominated Property, are listed on the National Register of Cultural Heritage. The buffer zone contains structures and groups of buildings dating back to the interwar period which strengthen the character of the property.

Kaunas lost its status as Lithuania's provisional capital in October 1939, and the sudden change in the city's political status helped to preserve the physical attributes of the 1920s and 1930s. Under the Soviet rule, which lasted from 1944–1990, the physical state of interwar modernist buildings was not deliberately neglected, since the superior quality of the architecture was put to pragmatic use. Intermittent development of the area continued with the construction of many buildings that, although new, were compatible with the interwar period of development by being restrained in volume and form. Construction during this era did not alter the established street grid and squares, but it did see the addition of large modernist buildings. The growth of contemporary Kaunas and developmental pressures resulted in several large structures along Karaliaus Mindaugo Prospektas and sparked numerous debates about the relationship between new commercial architecture and the historic surroundings. Any risk is mitigated by listing of all areas comprising the Nominated Property on the National Register of Cultural Heritage and preparing of adequate conservation and management plans.

Authenticity

Because the historically evolved areas of Naujamiestis and Žaliakalnis have changed relatively little, Modernist Kaunas is truly a time capsule of the 1919–1939 period. The location and setting, form and design, material and substance as well as use and function of the Nominated Property all represent a historic modernist city of the interwar period that evolved harmoniously, integrating the natural and historic settings, producing a diverse legacy of architectural modernism. The area of Naujamiestis is home to the largest concentration of landmark modernist buildings that were part of the formation of a new administrative, cultural, and social core of the Lithuanian state in 1919–1939. Modernist residential areas of Naujamiestis constitute a superior architectural background for the landmark buildings, creating a harmonious cityscape. The urban structure of the Naujamiestis, embodying the architectural and urban nature of a modern city, is noted for the greatest diversity of stylistic forms, materials, and functions – a feature which is still evident in the city today.

The Žaliakalnis area with Ąžuolynas Park, designed in 1923 and gradually developed up to 1939, represents an outstanding example of the integration of urban and natural landscapes and the adoption of the contemporaneous garden city concept to local conditions. Although the plan was only partially implemented, the elements that were realised and which have survived to this day reflect the local interpretation of the most progressive garden city urban planning concepts of the time, adjusted with an intelligent approach to suit pre-existing natural, topographical, and humanmade features. Another feature of Kaunas Modernism that has retained its authenticity is its historical, cultural and symbolical significance (intangible heritage). Today, the_Nominated Property continues to see the highest concentration of active social, cultural, and economic activity, as well as the evolution of new traditions and initiatives inspired by the legacy of Kaunas Modernism.

Protection and management requirements

The property covers a central part of the city Kaunas – a group of areas that are legally protected on the national and local level under the Law on the Protection of Immovable Cultural Heritage, the Law on Protected Areas, the Law on Spatial Planning, the Law on Construction, the Law on Landscaping, and the Law on Environmental Protection. The property consists of seven protected zones: Naujamiestis, a historic district of Kaunas (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 22149); Žaliakalnis, a historic district of Kaunas (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 22148); Žaliakalnis 1, a historic district of Kaunas (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 31280); Kaunas Ąžuolynas Park Complex (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 31618); the Research Laboratory complex (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 28567) and Christ's Resurrection Church (National Register of the Cultural Heritage No. 16005). There are 408 listed cultural heritage properties and areas within the property.

The cultural significance of the property is integrated into the Kaunas City General Plan 2013–2023, as well as in subsequent preservation, regulation, and special plans on the national and local level. In 2015, the Kaunas City Municipal Heritage Restoration Programme was launched to provide financial support for the maintenance of cultural heritage and to improve the condition of modernist buildings in Kaunas. In 2017, the Kaunas City Municipality approved a Cultural Strategy for 2027 to establish an integrated approach toward the interwar period heritage, with a view to protecting this legacy and meeting the contemporary needs of the public. A management plan concept was formulated in 2020 to safeguard the preservation and proper management of the property, Modernist Kaunas.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Highlight the model of modernisation developed within Eastern and Central Europe and stipulate its key features in relation to Western modernity in order to emphasize the specific contribution of interwar Kaunas within this framework,
 - b) Consider a minor boundary modification to include all attributes of the property,
 - c) Expand the inventory of the buildings and structures from the 1919-1939 period within the property, with their state of conservation and brief restoration history, to reinforce the attributes of the property and effectively manage and protect the interwar modern heritage of Kaunas,
 - d) Improve the Management Plan so that it includes management mechanisms that will ensure protection of the full range of attributes that express the Outstanding Universal Value, and set out the conditions for the Heritage Impact Assessment of new development projects and activities that are planned for implementation within or around the property,
 - e) Prepare an integrated conservation plan that ensures the conservation of all attributes that support the Outstanding Universal Value, including modernist wooden architecture,
 - Strengthening management instruments to protect privately-owned buildings and structures within the property and support the owners in maintaining their properties,
 - g) Continue raising awareness among the local community about the values of the property and creating procedures for public participation in the management of the property to ensure its long-term protection,

- Complete the monitoring system to include indicators related to all the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value and take into account the main factors affecting the property;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2025**, a report on the implementation on the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 48th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.20

The nomination of **The Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation Head Office and Garden**, **Portugal**, was withdrawn at the request of the State Party.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.21

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.
- 2. <u>Defers</u> the examination of the nomination of the **Historic Centre of Gorokhovets**, **Russian Federation**, in order to allow the State Party, with the advice of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, if requested, to:
 - a) Develop coherent argumentation for the justification for inscription of the nominated property in order to demonstrate how or in which way the architectural monuments and/or the urban landscape of the historic centre of Gorokhovets stand out in illustrating a particular significant stage in human history or how it illustrates in an outstanding way the history and historical development of the wider geocultural region,
 - b) Develop an appropriate comparative analysis, including a thorough, wellstructured, criteria-based qualitative assessment of relevant comparators, presented in a clear and comprehensive manner,
 - Revise the boundaries as may be necessary to ensure the integrity of the nominated property in light of a revised justification, as well as its appropriate protection;
- 3. <u>Considers</u> that any revised nomination would need to be considered by an expert mission to the site;
- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Preparing a long-term integrated conservation programme paired with a careful conservation approach that allows for the long-term conservation of key architectural monuments and the respectful modernisation of the urban fabric without compromising their authenticity or their historical and cultural values,
 - Legally enacting the management plan once a Heritage Impact Assessment process has been embedded in it and a full range of projects have been included in its action plan,
 - c) Considering the inclusion of the Znamensky-Krasnogrivsky Monastery ensemble in the nominated property, if relevant with the revised justification for inscription,

- d) Expanding the buffer zone boundary at the north-western corner of the nominated property, or providing visual, mapping or viewshed analyses that justify the current delineation;
- e) Further developing the monitoring system to encompass all the attributes that support the potential Outstanding Universal Value, while also taking into account the main factors affecting the nominated property,
- f) Mapping important urban features and architectural elements of the nominated property as a whole in order to analyse and demonstrate the different construction types, interventions and evolution of the historic centre, and of the individual constitutive buildings and ensembles by means of detailed architectural drawings.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.22

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. Inscribes Gordion, Türkiye, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (iii);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The archaeological site of Gordion ranks as one of the most important historical centres in the ancient Near East. Gordion lies approximately ninety kilometres south-west of Ankara in central Türkiye, at the intersection of the great empires to the east (Assyrians, Babylonians, Hittites) and the west (Greeks, Romans). Consequently, it occupied a strategic position on nearly all trade routes that linked the Aegean and Mediterranean seas with the Near East. Gordion is an outstanding archaeological site for understanding the Phrygian civilisation and its achievements. The buildings of its Early Phrygian citadel, and the burial mounds of the city's rulers, constitute the exceptional exemplars of monumental architecture in the Iron Age Near East.

The entrance to the Phrygian citadel features the best-preserved Iron Age (10th-8th centuries BCE) fortified gate complex that has yet been discovered, with stone masonry still preserved to a height of ten metres. The elite buildings within the citadel feature the earliest known coloured floor mosaics. The citadel's industrial quarter, or Terrace Complex, was dedicated to large-scale food preparation and the production of textiles. With a length of over a hundred metres, the complex is without parallel in the ancient world. The roofing systems of the citadel's buildings featured timber beams over ten metres in length with no internal supports, which is a daring, unparalleled feat of engineering for the period. The large concentration of monumental tumuli in the vicinity of Gordion creates an exceptional landscape of power, different from any other site in the Near East. The largest of the tumuli, the "Midas Mound" (Tumulus MM), rises to a height of fifty-three metres and the burial chamber within is the oldest known standing wooden building in the world (ca. 740 BCE), and inside it was found the best-preserved wooden furniture known from antiquity.

Criterion (iii): Gordion was the political and cultural centre of ancient Phrygia and today it represents the best surviving testimony to Phrygian civilisation, an Iron Age civilisation which developed in Anatolia and excelled in timber construction, woodcarving and metalwork.

Integrity

The property fully includes all the attributes that reflect its Outstanding Universal Value and is large enough for the context of these to be properly appreciated and understood.

A long-term conservation programme under implementation ensures that an appropriate state of conservation is progressively achieved for all excavated areas. The tumuli and the unexcavated areas are overall in good condition, although smaller tumuli suffer from the effects of deep-ploughing. Measures are being envisaged to prevent their further erosion.

Authenticity

The level of authenticity of all attributes of the property is high. Seventy years of excavation and research have revealed a remarkable quality, quantity, and variety of archaeological remains, with high levels of preservation. There has been in situ consolidation work on parts of the structures on the Citadel Mound. The substantial amount of data recovered from the archaeological excavations has ensured that the archaeological remains subject to stabilisation/consolidation work retain a high level of authenticity in terms of material and design. All stabilisation work has been based on complete and detailed documentation.

Protection and management requirements

The property has the highest level of site designation, having been designated as a 1st and 3rd degree archaeological conservation area by the Decision No.1096, 16/02/1990 of the Ankara Regional Council for Conservation of Cultural and Natural Properties. In addition, the status of 3rd degree archaeological conservation area designation ensures that the immediate setting of the Citadel Mound at the west and north peripheries is protected from adverse development. This is also protected and managed within the framework of the Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties Law n. 2863/1983.

The buffer zone is protected through national, regional, or local plans and through its designation as agricultural land, subject to provisions of the Soil Protection and Land-Use Law n. 5403/2005. The wider setting is covered by District Rural Settlement Development Plans. A management system and mechanisms are in place and include a management plan: its implementation through a participative approach towards the local community will guarantee its effectiveness.

Proactive measures to prevent looting and mechanisms to support the farming community vis-à-vis the necessary restrictions to preserve buried archaeological deposits are key for the long-term sustenance of the integrity and authenticity of the attributes of Gordion's Outstanding Universal Value, as is the preservation of the rural character of its immediate and wider setting.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Relocating the planned new museum outside the property's boundaries,
 - b) Considering a reduction of the currently permissible development in the village of Yassıhöyük, particularly of the Special Project Area (ÖPA).
 - c) Implementing the proposed programme for upgrading the protection of all areas of the property from a 3rd degree to a 1st degree archaeological conservation area, according to the timeframe set out in the February 2023 additional information,
 - d) Preparing a conservation plan for all designated archaeological areas within the property and the buffer zone that are not currently covered by such a plan,
 - e) Ensuring regular patrolling in all areas included in the boundaries of the property and developing measures to prevent looting,
 - Developing strategies and mechanisms to support the farmers that may be affected by restrictions on agricultural activities to preserve underground archaeological remains,

- g) Preparing a visitor management strategy for Gordion, with a particular focus on Tumulus MM, based on the outcomes of indoor parameters' monitoring and modelling, to ensure that a potential increase of visitors does not negatively affect the Iron Age wooden chamber;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations.

B.3.2 Nominations deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Decision: 45 COM 8B.23

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops, Czechia, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape on the basis of criteria (iii), (iv) and (v);
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops is situated in the north-western part of Czechia in a location that provides ideal conditions for growing hops, a central aromatic ingredient in beer production. It consists of two component parts that together illustrate the entire cycle of cultivating, processing and trading the world's most renowned variety of hops. Component part 1 - Saaz Hop Landscape - consists of rural hop fields and the small villages of Stekník and Trnovany, and component part 2 - Žatec - consists of the historic urban centre of the town of Žatec (Saaz in German) along with its 19th century industrial suburb. Both component parts are geographically close, linked by the river Ohře.

This evolved and continuing cultural landscape and its built heritage associated with hop growing and processing is testimony to a tradition that has been practiced here for more than 700 years and still continues to this day, despite tremendous demographic changes at various points in its history. The features of this striking landscape range from traditional hop fields to buildings used for drying, packing, certifying and storing hops, to parts of the historic transportation network of roads, railway, the river Ohře and other watercourses. These also include supporting administrative, cultural and religious buildings, as well as cultural practices. This landscape, with specific buildings and structures linked to hop production, demonstrates close interactions between the rural hop growing landscape and its urban base.

Criterion (iii): Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops bears exceptional testimony to a strong centuries-long cultural tradition of growing and processing the world's most renown hops variety. Evidence of this testimony is found in the spatial configurations, urban patterns and buildings of this evolved and continuing cultural landscape. The town of Žatec became a globally recognised centre of hops in the 19th century as a result of innovations in hop production and flourishing global trade undertaken by local Czech, German and Jewish communities. This renown continues to the present day. The exceptional testimony of this cultural landscape is expressed in its traditional hop fields and buildings used for drying, packing, certifying and storing hops, as well as the related administrative, cultural and religious buildings.

Criterion (iv): Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops is an outstanding example of a monoculture landscape. Associated with hop growing and processing in both rural and urban environments over a period of more than 700 years, the property includes outstanding examples of agricultural landscapes, buildings, architectural and technological ensembles. These examples illustrate various methods of hop breeding, drying, preservation, packaging and quality certification that were developed here since the Late Middle Ages and climaxed in the 19th and early 20th century.

The rural landscape is particularly defined by hop fields, with their typical trellises of poles and wires. It also includes rural settlements with preserved farm buildings and barns where hops were dried and stored, and the former residence of the local landlord, the Stekník Chateau, which is a dominant landmark in the landscape as it rises above the still-used historic hop fields. The urban centre of this hop-growing landscape is the town of Žatec, with its municipal warehouses, hop drying kilns, sulphuring chambers, and hop packaging and certification facilities. The town's exceptional skyline is accentuated by the vertical dominants of the hop-drying kilns and the tall chimneys of the sulphuring chambers.

Criterion (v): Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops is an outstanding example of a traditional agricultural landscape and traditional human settlements related to growing a crop with very special requirements for climate, cultivation and processing. It illustrates continual interactions between people and their environment over a very long period of time in a well-preserved example of the cultural tradition of hop breeding, cultivation and processing in Europe.

The technical knowhow and skills developed and refined here are well demonstrated by the hop fields with their characteristic trellises, drying kilns and other hop-related facilities that were built in the rural area. The processing of the hops grown here had a defining influence on the town of Žatec and its Prague Suburb, where very specific typologies of industrial facilities were created by communities associated with the hop processing business, as well as the residential buildings, educational and religious institutions and amenity centres needed to support this agro-industrial system.

Integrity

The serial property includes all the elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value. Its boundaries adequately ensure the complete representation of the entire cycle of growing, processing and distributing hops.

The two component parts contribute to the Outstanding Universal Value of the site as a whole. Among the most distinctive attributes of component part 1 are the hop fields around the small villages of Stekník and Trnovany. These illustrate the growing and initial processing of hops. The village of Stekník features well-preserved typical brick buildings surrounding a central village square, and an eponymous chateau. A transportation network based on historic roads, railways and water streams enabled access to the hop fields and facilitated the export of hops. This landscape has changed little over the centuries and its current use reflects its historical use.

Component part 2, the historic centre of the town of Žatec and its industrial Prague Suburb, illustrates the further processing, certification and distribution of hops. This urban environment includes all the elements needed to illustrate the last stages of the industrialised "hop cycle," as well as the administrative and socio-cultural infrastructure that testifies to the specific societal contexts of hop production in Žatec. Traditional knowledge of hop growing and processing developed over the centuries can be considered an intangible attribute. The property does not suffer unduly from adverse effects of development and/or neglect.

Authenticity

Žatec and the Landscape of Saaz Hops is authentic in terms of its locations and setting, its forms and designs, its materials and substances, and, to a degree, its uses and functions. The locations, setting and function of the hop-growing rural landscape in component part 1 have been fully preserved. The locations of hop fields have not changed, nor has the presence of watercourses and historic communication networks. Rural settlements that served as bases for the farmed fields have largely preserved their forms. The built environment has a high degree of authenticity, including individual buildings, farmsteads, the former estate of the local landlord (Stekník Chateau) and the large Baroque granary at Stekník, which was later converted into a hop drying kiln.

The buildings in the historic centre of Žatec (component part 2) display authentic signs of an older traditional method of drying hops in lofts. The authentic forms of the buildings are closely monitored during all refurbishment and restoration projects. Even more recent hop-related buildings with unique functions concentrated in a small area of the Prague Suburb have mostly been preserved. Some of them no longer serve their original function but remain in a relatively stable condition, authentic in form and materials and with many specific details preserved. They are expected to undergo sympathetic conversion.

Protection and management requirements

Both component parts of the property are protected under the National Act no. 20/1987 Coll. on the National Heritage Protection, as amended, in combination with other protective regimes stemming from this Act. At present, the cultural values are administratively protected by Land Use Plans of the village of Zálužice and the town of Žatec. For the hop fields of component part 1, a Landscape Heritage Zone has been outlined for designation and declared by the Measure of General Nature N. 1/2021 in August 2021. The cultural values of Žatec in component part 2 are fully protected by two decrees of the Ministry of Culture which, in several steps, delineate joint heritage areas.

The hop fields located in the property and its buffer zone are also protected under Act no. 97/1996 Sb. on Protection of Hops and safeguarded under a Designation of Origin appellation, both of which regulate the quality and processing of the hops.

Management is the responsibility of the Municipal Office of Žatec through a steering group, the core team of which was established at the municipal level in 2013. The steering group includes the key stakeholders active in the property, and is assisted by working groups focused on specific areas of the management plan. A management plan sets out goals and measures for the effective protection of the property's tangible and intangible heritage for the period 2020-2030. No major changes are envisaged for component part 1 or the urban structure of component part 2. A key issue that will require long-term attention is finding appropriate uses for historic hop processing buildings that have been left vacant or underutilised in the wake of evolving processes.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Expanding the existing inventories to encompass all historic buildings within the property as a basis for monitoring and decision-making,
 - b) Developing a coherent conservation framework for the urban component part and for hop-processing buildings throughout the property, including guidelines for the conservation and reuse of empty hop warehouses in the Prague Suburb,
 - c) Involving a landscape professional competent in historic landscapes for future planning within the Saaz Hop Landscape component part,
 - d) Preparing an analytical study of the characteristic landscape features of the Saaz Hop Landscape component part as a basis for defining limits of change for future conservation and development,

- e) Preventing future projects of comparable visual impact and height to that of the Hop Lighthouse within the property or in its vicinity,
- f) Reconsidering the residential development rights along the entrance road north of Stekník, as is currently granted by the Zálužice Land Use Plan and carrying out Heritage Impact Assessments should specific development plans arise for any of the eight concerned plots in the future,
- g) Adhering to the principles of good governance by fostering the inclusion of stakeholders not yet participating in the protection and management of the property, in line with paragraphs 40 and 117 of the Operational Guidelines,
- h) Developing and implementing risk preparedness plans for the property, such as fire protection for historic buildings and other attributes, and flood protection in the event of a dam failure.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.24

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Talayotic Menorca A cyclopean island odyssey, Spain**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (iii)** and **(iv)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located on the Island of Menorca, the second largest of the Balearic Islands in the western Mediterranean Sea, a series of nine component parts in the Migjorn and Tramuntana regions of Menorca encompasses a dense assemblage of archaeological sites that feature cyclopean structures dating from the Bronze Age (1600 BCE) to the Late Iron Age (123 BCE). Agropastoral landscapes recall the occupation of the island by prehistoric communities in diverse settlements and burial sites scattered across the dry tableland in the south and in the rugged hills rising in the north.

Cyclopean architecture – which consists of structures built of very large blocks of stone without mortar – in a wide range of typologies illustrate the evolution of the island's dry stone building practices. The characteristic structures include hypogea (artificial caves), talayots (large cone-shaped structures, generally truncated), taula enclosures (religious structures with a central T-shaped construction formed by a large supporting rectangular stone slab and an inverted truncated pyramidal capital), navetas (which display an inverted ship shape, and in some cases rounded ground plans), circular houses, and hypostyles (roofs supported by pillars).

The evolution on the spatial organisation of these prehistoric structures suggests the emergence of a hierarchical society. Distinct visual interconnections between archaeological sites indicate the existence of social networks, and astronomical orientations imply possible cosmological meanings. Together, this series of ancient stone-built settlements and their landscapes provide a window into this region's prehistoric island cultures.

Criterion (iii): The high density of prehistoric sites on Menorca and their unusual level of preservation represent an outstanding demonstration of prehistoric dry stone building techniques. The structures unique to this island such as the burial navetas, circular houses and taulas, together with talayots and other dry-stone structures associated with the spatial organisation and occupation of the landscape by prehistoric communities in

a challenging island environment, are an exceptional testimony to a tradition of cyclopean architecture and its evolution over a period of approximately 1,500 years.

Criterion (iv): Talayotic Menorca represents an outstanding ensemble of prehistoric cyclopean architecture that demonstrates the organisation and practices of communities from the Bronze Age through to the Late Iron Age. Navetas, talayots, taulas and circular houses within the serial property's nine component parts illustrate the evolution of the occupation of the island and represent an important source of knowledge about life during this period. The distribution of the prehistoric sites in the agropastoral landscape of Menorca illustrates a spatial organisation that, due to the preservation of large amounts of evidence, is still readable to a large extent, showing visual interconnections between cyclopean structures as well as potential sacred, symbolic and political connotations.

Integrity

Within the boundaries of the serial property are located all the elements necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of Talayotic Menorca, including prehistoric cyclopean architecture in a wide range of typologies that illustrate the evolution of the island's cyclopean building practices for approximately 1,500 years from the Bronze Age to the Late Iron Age. Its boundaries adequately ensure the complete representation of the features and processes that convey the property's significance. The property does not suffer unduly from adverse effects of development and/or neglect.

Authenticity

The serial property meets the conditions of authenticity. Its cultural values are truthfully and credibly expressed through a variety of attributes, including the locations and settings, forms and designs, and materials and substance of the archaeological remains, most of which have high degrees of authenticity. The locations of the prehistoric cyclopean structures and settlements are authentic, while their settings, represented by the agropastoral landscapes included within the boundaries of the property as well as the buffer zones, have evolved but are believed to evoke earlier epochs. The archaeological sites have been well documented, and the sources of information about the sites and excavations are credible.

Protection and management requirements

The serial property is protected by an integrated system of environmental, cultural, landscape and territorial protection regimes overseen by the Island Council of Menorca. All prehistoric archaeological structures are protected under the Law 12/1998 on the Historical Heritage of the Balearic Islands, with a majority also designated as Heritage of Cultural Interest (Bien de Interés Cultural, BIC), which is the highest level of protection for cultural assets under Spanish legislation, regulated by Law 16/1985 on Spanish Historical Heritage. The Menorca Island Land-Use Plan (2020) further protects all nine component parts of the serial property as Areas of Landscape Interest. A special protection is also granted to the night sky.

The Island Council of Menorca is responsible for managing the serial property, enforcing all laws for the protection of heritage and implementing planning instruments. It has created the Talayotic Menorca Agency to coordinate and implement the programmes established in the management plan, which include conservation, restoration, monitoring, visitor management, communication and research. Master plans will be prepared for individual key archaeological sites that are considered the most significant and most visited. Sustaining the Outstanding Universal Value of the property over time would benefit from each key archaeological site having a master plan, and setting specific management objectives for each of the component parts in relation to the conservation of the attributes that support the Outstanding Universal Value.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Completing the master plans for four key archaeological sites: Naveta des Tudons, Trepucó, Talatí de Dalt, and Torralba d'en Salort,
 - b) Preparing master plans for the remaining seventeen key archaeological sites within the serial property, and setting out specific management objectives for each of the component parts in relation to the conservation of the attributes that support the Outstanding Universal Value.
 - c) Developing a research strategy/framework for the property as a whole that is linked to the above-mentioned detailed conservation plan and aligned with the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
 - d) Developing a risk management strategy and a climate change adaptation and mitigation plan that specifically address the property and the attributes that support its Outstanding Universal Value,
 - e) Developing a tourism strategy specifically for the property that complements the Tourism Development Plan of Menorca (2018),
 - f) Creating a harmonised interpretation strategy for the serial property as a whole, including each archaeological site and each component part, in order to deliver a common understanding of the property's Outstanding Universal Value,
 - g) Updating the management plan by integrating the above-recommended instruments (conservation plan, research strategy/framework, risk management strategy, climate change adaptation and mitigation plan, sustainable tourism plan and interpretation strategy),
 - h) Developing definitive best-practice solutions for the stainless-steel beam supporting the pillar in the hypostyle hall at Torre d'en Galmés (Area between the ravines of Torrevella and Cala en Porter component part), and the concrete block used in the taula enclosure at Trepucó (Prehistoric village of Trepucó component part),
 - Removing at the earliest opportunity the partially completed road works in the South-east area-Alaior component part and the electrical poles and lines in the landscape areas between different archaeological sites that have a negative influence on the landscape views,
 - j) Undertaking additional research to better understand the function of talayots, and the relationship of the inter-visibility networks with the social organisation and astronomical connections of the structures;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations:
- 6. <u>Decides</u> that the name of the property be changed to "**Prehistoric Sites of Talayotic Menorca**".

B.4 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

B.4.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.25

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **National Archaeological Park Tak'alik Ab'aj, Guatemala**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria** (ii) and (iii);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Tak'alik Ab'aj is an archaeological site located in the piedmont of the Pacific Coast of Guatemala. Its 1,700-year history spans the years from 800 B.C.E. to 900 C.E. The first half of that period saw the transition from the Olmec civilization to the emergence of the Early Mayan culture.

Tak'alik Ab'aj served as an important protagonist and catalyst in this transition, in part due to the vital role it played in the long-distance trade route connecting the Isthmus of Tehuantepec, in present-day Mexico, with present-day El Salvador. Ideas and customs were widely shared along this route, as indicated by the diversity of sculptural styles found at Tak'alik Ab'aj as at no other site in Mesoamerica, as well as analogous artefacts from sites hundreds of kilometers away.

In the site, sacred spaces and buildings were designed according to cosmological principles, and innovative water management systems, ceramics, lapidary art, and lithic tools are found.

Today, indigenous groups of the 22 different Mayan language affiliations still consider the site a sacred place and visit it to perform rituals.

Criterion (ii): Tak'alik Ab'aj played a key role in the ancient long-distance trade route. Through the exchange of ideas, materials, and goods, received and disseminated many of the most advanced ideas of urbanism, monumental architecture, sculptural program, and the water management, which attest a high level of urbanism and planning achieved in the Preclassic.

The monumental architecture was based on ancestral cosmological precepts and the space was used as a ritual setting for the public performance of the first kings of the incipient city-kingdoms of the Preclassic. In addition, the quantity and diversity of stone sculptures from the Preclassic period reflect the richness and diversity of cultural expressions resulting from contact with distant people and cultures, and from the transition from Olmec to Mayan cultural expressions. Combined with the evidence of advances in early writing, mathematics and calendrical systems, Tak'alik Ab'aj is considered to be the best exponent of this extraordinary cultural region.

Criterion (iii): Tak'alik Ab'aj is an outstanding example of the early development and use of many important cultural traditions, some of them considered as representative of Mesoamerica, including the symbolic representation of the astronomical observations, urban design, calendrical system, and hieroglyphic writing. Additionally, the re-use and re-combination of sculptures from different styles and earlier eras, is an outstanding example of the creation of architectural settings for public display of the astronomic and calendric development through time and ancestral history, which is particularly

noticeable at Tak'alik Ab'aj and seems to be a central element in its long 1,700-year history.

Integrity

The integrity of the property is based on the archaeological evidence being whole and intact, attesting the transition from Olmec to Mayan cultural expressions, the urban layout based on cosmological precepts and astronomical orientations, and the structures and sacred spaces for ritual representations.

The archaeological site is intact and is not subject to great pressures. After its abandonment around 900 C.E., the property was reclaimed by dense vegetation. In more recent times, coffee, rubber and sugar cane plantations were created but do not reach archaeological levels in the soil. The excavations have uncovered largely intact contexts, and the documentation and inventory of the finds have created a very comprehensive archaeological record.

The boundaries of the nominated property have been drawn to encompass features located in the Central Group of the large archaeological site. The Central Group represents par excellence the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, however a possible extension of the site, could be analyzed in the future.

The distribution of sculptures in the site was not random. Most of the monuments were placed in the Central Group on Terraces 2 and 3. The clustered distribution of monuments in the Central Group draws attention to this sector as the ceremonial heart of Tak'alik Ab'aj and the probability that the display of stone monuments is related to this critical function.

Authenticity

The National Archaeological Park Tak'alik Ab'aj is authentic in terms of its ability to express its cultural values truthfully and credibly through its attributes. The archaeological site is authentic in its location and setting, forms and designs, materials and substances as is evidenced by archaeological investigations. The manifestations of living culture and the continuity of the ancestral ritual practices, is an expression of authenticity of its own, bestow and underscore the character of sacred to the place.

The archaeological remains that convey the Outstanding Universal Value (buildings, sculptures, and artifacts) show a high degree of authenticity because they had not been disturbed prior to excavation. A special ecological conservation program is carried out at the site; the conservation and stabilization of the remains is made respectfully, using materials directly from the area. The restored drainage channels are still in use and prevent the accumulation of rain water in the archaeological site. In terms of intangible cultural heritage, the place is subject of pilgrimage for indigenous people led by spiritual guides (Ajq'ijab').

Protection and management requirements

The boundaries have been drawn to encompass the elements located in the Central Group of the archaeological site that primarily represent the Outstanding Universal Value.

A Cooperation Agreement, containing specific measures to constitute and guarantee a buffer zone to increase the protection of the National Archaeological Park Tak'alik Ab'aj was signed and is currently effective. This functional instrument provides an additional layer of protection for the site and helps to avoid possible future uses of the land that may threaten or violate the protection and conservation of the Outstanding Universal Value, as described in paragraphs 103-107 of the Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention.

Administrative procedures have been generated through the Ministry of Culture and Sports, in which the Management Plan and Risk Management Plan are approved, updated, and instructed to update with a priority focus on the patrimony that represents the Outstanding Universal Value, which is part of the general inventory of the nominated property, and is protected.

The management of visitation, study of carrying capacity and internal regulations of the National Archaeological Park Tak'alik Ab'aj, as well as the evaluation of the patrimonial impact, are described in the Management Plan.

Through programs and projects, participation spaces are generated for local and indigenous communities in decision-making processes. This site is one of the best examples of inclusion and community participation in the country, where the different cultural communities converge freely to carry out their traditional practices and promotes tolerance and appreciation of multiculturalism.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party gives consideration to the following:
 - a) Analyze the limitations of the legal protection of the property and the surrounding archaeological site caused by the lack of regulations that allow the application of the relevant laws, and put in place these regulations,
 - b) Further explore the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the involvement of the population,
 - c) Establish an independent accounting competency to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited capacity for implementation;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.
- I.B NOMINATIONS TO BE EXAMINED AT THE EXTENDED 45TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE PROPOSED FOR EXAMINATION IN 2023
- C. NATURAL SITES
- C.1 AFRICA
- **C.1.1 New Nominations**

Decision: 45 COM 8B.26

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Nyungwe National Park, Rwanda** on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion** (x):
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The property is part of the Albertine Rift Ecoregion and of the Albertine Rift section of the Afro-montane Regional Centre of Endemism. With its 101,900 ha, it represents the second largest area of mountain forest in this exceptionally rich ecoregion. It covers an altitudinal gradient of 1,470 m (1,480-2,950 m) and harbours a full range of climax, pioneer and secondary forest formations known from this elevation interval. It is not only home to forest habitats, however: it also has bamboo thickets, vast peat bogs located between 1,650 and 2,550 m above sea level, as well as high altitude moors and grasslands. All of its environments are over 95% intact and are therefore highly representative for the mountain landscapes of this ecoregion.

NNP is also one of the only sites of this ecoregion which still ensures the continuation of the various dynamic processes which characterize this montane ecosystem. In particular have to be mentioned the various plant successions which take place within the peat bogs or which characterize the colonization process of meadows and moors, the interactions between dense forests and bamboo thickets, and the interaction between dense forests and open-canopy forests.

In addition, NNP is home to 89 species of vertebrates, endemic to the Albertine Rift and 28 threatened species of vertebrates. It is also home to very rare relict environments of the Last Glacial Maximum (Cliffortia scrub) and even from before the Last Glacial Maximum (the at least 43,000 years old Kamiranzovu swamp forests). Besides the Kamiranzovu swamp preserves in the depth of its peat accumulations the pollen archives of the last few hundred thousand of years (perhaps 300,000).

On the whole, the NNP covers the best protected and second largest mountain forest of the Albertine Rift region.

Its fauna is almost complete and the four species which became locally extinct during the latter half of the 20th century (giant forest hog, buffalo, savanna elephant, and leopard) will be reintroduced.

Criterion (x): The intact forest ecosystem of the property supports a wide variety of forest types as well as non-forest montane environments such as grasslands, moors, thickets and peat bogs. These environments are home to a total of 1,468 species of vascular plants (143 ferns, two or three gymnosperms and 1,322 angiosperms). Among these, 240 species are endemic to the Albertine Rift, at least 32 of which are endemic to Rwanda, and 76 species are threatened to varying degrees. Since parts of the forests are hyper-humid with a very abundant flora of epiphytes, the Orchidaceae are particularly well represented with 198 species, 59 of which are endemic to the Albertine Rift with 18 endemic to Rwanda. In all 18 species are threatened to varying degrees.

As for its fauna, this ecosystem preserves currently 101 species of mammals, including 20 endemic of the Albertine Rift, two species endemic to Rwanda and 14 endangered species. Among these species are 14 primate species (or taxa) and the populations of the l'Hoest's monkey and the Albertine Rift race (ruwenzorii) of the Angola colobus are probably among the most important for these two species.

The population of over 300 chimpanzees is not very large, but it is important for the preservation of the eastern race schweinfurthii of this endangered species. The avifauna has 351 species, including 31 (84%) of the 37 known endemic species of the Albertine Rift and 10 threatened species. In particular, NNP is home to the only large population of the Grauer's rush warbler, an endangered Albertine Rift endemic, living in a protected area. Reptiles number 46 species, 14 (33%) of which are endemic to the Albertine Rift but only one species is endangered.

Amphibians number 32 species, 21 (69%) of which are endemic to the Albertine Rift and two endemic to Rwanda. In addition, three species are threatened. The entomofauna

has at least 290 species of butterflies, including 47 species endemic of the Albertine Rift and 3 local endemic taxa.

Integrity

The NNP covers an area of 101,967 ha. It is totally uninhabited and is over 95% intact. Its buffer zone covers an area of 10,085 ha (Figure 2). It essentially comprises a narrow and discontinuous belt of exotic woods (pine or eucalyptus plantations) whose function is to mark the boundary of the national park, to produce wood for the human populations of the periphery and to prevent any further encroachment.

As Rwandan farmers practice intensive and permanent agriculture, it was impossible to create a wider buffer zone without harming the farmers or degrading the forests.

The adjacent regions of NNP indeed support human population densities of the order of 300-420/km2. Rwandan farmers are strict food producers, however, and rely very little on the spontaneous resources of the park. Also, all water courses flow out of the park so that pollution risks are extremely low.

In the long term, its size, its very rugged and complex relief, its dense hydrographic network, its important gradients in altitude and rainfall, and its very diverse plant formations, make this montane forest ecosystem capable of withstanding climate changes — at least those predicted by the current climate models.

Protection and management requirements

As with all Central African forests, whether lowland or mountainous, poaching is an inevitable threat to wildlife. This threat is much less important than in the Guinean-Congolian lowland forests, but the fight against poaching is an unavoidable necessity. It is done both on the ground within the limits of NNP and among the populations in the form of intelligence gathering. Paradoxically, the high density of human populations around the park, which in itself constitutes a potential threat, facilitates the fight against poaching, because everyone knows what everyone is doing. Boundary encroachment remains also a potential threat in some places. Overall is it only anecdotal. Nevertheless, it requires constant monitoring of the boundaries.

Tourism will be developed as soon as possible, including domestic tourism, to generate fund. Apart from essential management activities, research and tourism, no extractive activity is authorized. Bamboo cutting and collection of medicinal plants exist but are not threatening the integrity of the park. Illegal gold or coltan mining are more a problem and require constant monitoring. Many illegal miners come from Burundi. Border surveillance is carried out in collaboration with the army, but it could be made more efficient by the rehabilitation of a track running along the border and accessible only to park staff, military patrols and possibly some tourists.

In the long term the most important challenges are of a socio-economic nature. They are based on the strong demographic growth in the peripheral regions of the park, the great poverty of the peripheral populations and their very low education level. The development of an adequate Community strategy will therefore be of paramount importance.

Along with the fight against poaching and the various surveillance activities, regular monitoring is organized, both of the actions implemented and the results obtained, the state of the main wildlife populations, and the state of the vegetation. Estimates of the populations densities of primates, duikers and other ungulates, as well as of traces of human activity are expected to be organized all over the park every two years. Reintroduction of locally extinct species will be implemented.

All these surveillance and monitoring activities are provided for legally, mainly by the law on the protection of animals and environment.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Implement the provisions of the Law Governing National Parks and Nature reserves with regards to the management of buffer zones, with a special focus on agreements with Tea estates owners in the buffer zone,
 - b) Ensure traffic on roads crossing the property is reduced following the upgrade of an alternative road to the north of the property,
 - c) Fully implement the updated General Management Plan (2023-2032);
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations.

C.1.2 Nominations deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Decision: 45 COM 8B.27

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Bale Mountains National Park, Ethiopia**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria** (vii) and (x);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Bale Mountains National Park (BMNP) boasts a spectacularly diverse landscape mosaic comprised of distinct ecosystems and habitats and associated biodiversity. The property covers an area of 215,000 hectares in the heart of the Bale-Arsi Massif in the southeastern Ethiopian Highlands in Oromia National Regional State. Building upon much earlier efforts, the National Park has been legally protected and demarcated since 2014. The property includes the Africa's largest area of afro-alpine habitat above 3,000 m above sea level (a.s.l.) with numerous glacial lakes, wetlands and moorlands. Volcanic ridges and peaks tower above the plateau, most prominently Tullu Dimtu, Ethiopia's second highest peak at 4,377 m a.s.l. Elsewhere in the park, extensive grasslands thrive next to various types of forests including tree heath, bamboo and juniper forests. Significantly, the southern slopes of the Bale Mountains descend dramatically into the famous Harenna Forest, the second largest moist tropical forest in Ethiopia, including patches of cloud forest.

As the origin of several important rivers, the ecosystems and habitats within BMNP and its surroundings regulate the supply of water for millions of people in and beyond Ethiopia. The park and its surroundings are home to an extraordinary fauna and flora with an exceptional degree of endemism and in several cases the only remaining populations of globally threatened species across numerous taxonomic groups. For example, Mountain Nyala and Bale Monkey are both endemic to this area, along with numerous endemic rodents and amphibians, as well as the most important remaining population of Ethiopian Wolf. It is important to understand, however, that at the time of inscription, the property's exceptional conservation values coincide with very high pressure on the ecosystems. Despite severe threats and a continuing need to better balance local livelihoods with the conservation of biodiversity and ecosystem services, longstanding conservation efforts, partnerships and the natural protection granted by the

rugged terrain have maintained a favourable conservation status and outlook by the standards of the afro-alpine and East Africa's moist tropical forests.

Criterion (vii): The property protects a landscape mosaic of extraordinary beauty that is shaped by the combined forces of ancient lava outpourings, glaciation and the dissection by the Great Rift Valley. It features volcanic peaks and ridges, dramatic escarpments, sweeping valleys, glacial lakes, lush forests, deep gorges and numerous waterfalls, creating an exceptional natural beauty. The altitudinal gradient of the park spans almost 2,900 metres from the highest peak standing at 4,377 m a.s.l. (Tullu Dimtu) down to approximately 1,500 m a.s.l. in the Harenna Forest. The altitudinal gradient not only creates vibrant changes in topography, soil, vegetation and species assemblages but constantly changing, breath-taking vistas. Amongst scattered wetlands and rocky outcrops, the iconic Giant Lobelias break the skyline above the otherwise stunted afroalpine vegetation of the Sanetti Plateau, a harsh and aesthetically stunning high altitude environment. Unusual striations, or boulder grooves, mark the shallow hillsides, a natural phenomenon, which remains an enigma to geologists and glaciologists. Dropping from the plateau, the Harenna and the adjacent Mena Angetu form the second largest moist tropical forest in Ethiopia, transitioning in some areas into the country's only remaining patches of cloud forest. This, combined with the plateaus, complete a unique, majestic landscape with an extraordinary natural aesthetic.

Criterion (x): The property harbours diverse and unique biodiversity at ecosystem, species and genetic levels. The Sanetti Plateau and the slopes of the Bale Mountains National Park above 3,500 m a.s.l. encompass the largest intact and contiguous expanse of afro-alpine habitat in the world further adding to the importance of the property as a rare large-scale remnant of this habitat. Uniquely, the afro-alpine of the Bale Mountains continues to be intricately linked to intact and large-scale expanses of forest, wetland and grassland ecosystems and habitats. More than 80% of all species found in the afromontane habitat are endemic.

Bale Mountains National Park is home to 1,660 documented species of flowering plants, 177 of which are endemic to Ethiopia and 31 exclusively to the Bale Mountains. The forests of the Bale Mountains serve as a genetic reservoir for Wild Forest Coffee and countless medicinal plant species. 79 mammal species have been recorded in the park; 23 of these are endemic, including eight rodent species. There are 363 documented bird species, including over 170 recorded migratory bird species, such as wintering and passing raptors, including the Greater Spotted Eagle. While the afro-alpine habitats are not conspicuously rich in terms of plant species, more than 80 % of all species found in this type of habitat are endemic, an extreme degree of endemism by any standard. The afro-alpine has been recognized as a globally significant place in literally all major global conservation priority-setting exercises.

At the time of inscription, the Harenna Shrew, the Giant Mole Rat, the Malcolm's Ethiopian Toad, the Bale Mountains Tree Frog and the Bale Mountains Frog can only be found in the Bale Mountains. The property hosts an estimated two-thirds of the global population of the endemic Mountain Nyala, the most important population of the endemic Ethiopian Wolf and it is home to the Menelik's Bushbuck, an endemic subspecies. The Bale Monkey is endemic to the Ethiopia Highlands, east of the Rift Valley and is restricted to the bamboo belt of the Bale Mountains and the Sidamo Highlands.

Integrity

Covering 215,000 hectares, the property serves as a meaningful and viable representation of afro-alpine and associated forests. The afro-alpine Sanetti Plateau is situated within the property in its entirety. At the foot of the southern escarpment lies the tropical moist Harenna Forest, one of Ethiopia's largest natural forests, granted protection in the national law with about 100,000 hectares within BMNP and the adjacent areas. The forest cover in the park is almost continuous with a low level of fragmentation

and degradation. The dense, green, misty jungle contains huge trees, moss draped branches, and impenetrable undergrowth wrapped in a tangle of creepers among which wild coffee and medicinal plants grow. Unlike most of the wider ecoregion, the land and resources protected by the national park are still in a relatively good state of conservation due to the longstanding conservation efforts, the remote location and the rugged terrain.

Nevertheless, pressures on the property's nature conservation values at the time of inscription are related to unsustainable practices linked to increasing human settlement within and around the park, including expansion of livestock grazing and agriculture. Although localized degradation has occurred, the full array of ecosystem and habitat diversity, hosting complete native species assemblages, continues to exist. Other threats to the integrity of BMNP requiring long-term attention include the existing road crossing the park's vulnerable key habitats. The road generates some direct disturbance and facilitates access to otherwise remote areas.

The property, with its clear, legally defined boundary, is of sufficient size to protect a large, particularly valuable and still remarkably intact example of the linked ecosystems and habitat mosaic of this area. The property has a recognized buffer zone comprising all 29 neighbouring kebeles (the smallest administrative unit in Ethiopia) surrounding the legally gazetted and demarcated park boundary as a key investment in the future integrity of the property. The buffer zone itself harbours very important conservation values, as well as securing landscape connectivity beyond the property.

Protection and management requirements

Bale Mountains National Park is managed by the Ethiopian Wildlife Conservation Authority (EWCA). EWCA is a self-governed body, created by Proclamation No. 575/2008 of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia and regulated by National Law of Wildlife Development, Conservation and Utilization (Proclamation No. 541/2007). The entire surface area of the property of 215,000 hectares enjoys a high level of legal protection in line with IUCN Protected Area Category II. The national park is surrounded by an officially recognized buffer zone of 235,121 hectares, ranging between approximately 5 to 20 km from the boundaries of the park. The Oromia National Regional State acting through the local woreda (district authorities) and kebele committees are critically important partners in the management of the property and its buffer zone. Regulation 338/2014 includes the establishment of a statutory Park Advisory Committee (PAC) with representation of the park adjacent woredas. In each woreda, a Park Community Dialogue Forum (PCDF) has been established with representation from each of the park adjacent kebele. The PAC reports to the Bale Regional-Federal Coordination Committee which provides the policy direction with regard to addressing threats to the park.

In the buffer zone, Oromia National Regional State, the local government bodies and Oromia Forest and Wildlife Enterprise (OFWE) support more integrated and landscape scale governance of the Bale eco-region through Participatory Forest Management (PFM) cooperatives, Community Conservancies (CC) and Controlled Hunting Areas (CHA) linking to the park through bodies such as the PCDF. The Governance of the buffer zone promotes sustainable natural resource use by the park adjacent communities without compromising conservation and the ecosystem services of the property.

Managed by EWCA, the park has its own park administration office with additional ranger outposts and mobile camps. Park staff includes around 80 rangers at the time of inscription. The property's strategic and operational management is guided by a 10-year General Management Plans (GMP), which includes management programmes on Park Operations; Tourism Management; Interim Settlement & Grazing Management; Outreach and Ecological Management. In addition, a Tourism Development Plan guides the management actions to improve community benefits from tourism whilst managing the impact of visitors on the property. Threats to the property are actively being

addressed through the General Management Plan's Interim Settlement Grazing Management Programme, a Grazing Pressure Reduction Strategy and a linked Livelihood Improvement Strategy, which include measures to reduce livestock to sustainable levels and gradually expand no-grazing zones through a participatory process with relevant communities. Strict adherence to a rights-based approach and to the principle of free, prior and informed consent of the affected communities are key requirements for the management of the property.

One challenge beyond the scope of EWCA and park management has been sporadic civil unrest but the situation is improving. Nonetheless, there is progress in terms of enhancing communication and collaboration with all stakeholders and rights-holders, a crucial long-term task. Efforts are underway to improve the critically important dialogue and cooperation with local communities, resource users and all levels of government. Mechanisms are emerging to more effectively incorporate park protection into local development strategies with an emphasis on addressing the issues of settlement and livestock grazing in the park, while fully taking into account local needs.

4. Requests the State Party to:

- a) Continue to address the threats to the Outstanding Universal Value of the property through the appropriate implementation of the General Management Plan, including regarding unsustainable practices, such as overgrazing by livestock,
- b) Ensure that, in line with the State Party's continued commitments made in the nomination, any proposed relocation of people and communities from within the property follows a rights-based approach, ensuring the free, prior and informed consent of the affected communities and applying international best practices and applicable norms and standards;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations.

C.2 ARAB STATES

C.2.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.28

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2.
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid, Saudi Arabia, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (vii) and (ix);
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

'Uruq Bani Ma'arid is situated at the western edge of Ar-Rub' al-Khali, known to be the largest continuous sand sea on Earth. The property's hyper-arid desert represents iconic wilderness of Arabia and conserves one of the Earth's most spectacular desert landscapes with a wide variety of wildlife habitats. It harbours greater biological diversity than any other part of Ar-Rub' al-Khali and features one of the world's largest longitudinal sand dune systems overlying a dissected limestone plateau, and the southern end of the Tuwayq Escarpment with its vegetated wadis, gravel plains, and inter-dune corridors.

The gradient of natural habitats embraced within the property forms the building blocks of a functioning ecological network of patterns and processes supporting the survival and viability of key plant and animal species of global importance, including successfully reintroduced species. 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid is the last place where Arabian Oryx were observed in the wild, and it is now the focus of an intensive and successful reintroduction program for Arabian Oryx and other keystone species, such as the Arabian Sand Gazelle, and the Arabian Mountain Gazelle.

Located at the southern end of the Jabal Tuwayq limestone escarpment, the area covered by the property exemplifies the interaction of Ar-Rub' al-Khali's dunes with the escarpment creating a topographic diversity that distinguishes the property from the surrounding areas of the Ar-Rub' al-Khali. Where the dynamic sand dunes witness the process of species adaptation to extreme physical environments, the more stable escarpment provides the sporadic refuge needed for the survival of the property's free-ranging species. In total, the property encompasses 1.27 million hectares of intact desert ecosystems with a buffer zone of 80,600 hectares.

Criterion (vii): 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid is an iconic hyper-arid sand desert representing the largest sand sea on Earth, Ar-Rub' al-Khali. Where the sands meet the Tuwayq escarpment, they form an extraordinary spectrum of juxtaposed contrasts and fusions of forms and colours. 35 longitudinal sand dunes ('uruq in Arabic) reach up to 200 km in length and rise up to 170 m in height. Their wavelength ranges between 2.5 and 4.5 km. The property is also distinguished by the widespread presence of zibars, which are particularly well-developed in the property. Zibars are features that are generally of low relief, without well-formed slip faces, and composed of coarse and relatively poorly-sorted sand.

The property serves as an ecological refuge for iconic wildlife of the desert and offers a world-class panorama of the windblown sands of the Ar-Rub' al-Khali desert, with some of the world's highest longitudinal dune fields, and inter-dunal corridors, eastward-flowing high vegetation wadis, the Tuwayq Escarpment engulfed by westward flowing sands, and low sand plains to the west of the escarpment. A wide spectrum of colour harmonies derives from the resonance of contrasting hues of the sand grains in the ripples that cover the dunes. A true portrait of the desert where the light-coloured Arabian Oryx (or wudayhi, meaning clear in Arabic) contrasts against the large-scale and dramatic backdrop of the hyper-arid environment.

Criterion (ix): The varied topography of the property creates a wide range of wildlife habitats and niches, including ecological refuges for the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelles and Arabian Mountain Gazelles, successfully reintroduced into their natural habitats (in the case of the Arabian Oryx, after decades of extinction in the wild), with each having 19%, 25% and 2% respectively of their total worldwide population present within the property. The animal populations are completely free ranging in a huge area with a high level of ecological integrity. Ingenious adaptations by plant and animal species to the hostile environment and speciation processes can be observed. The Arabian Sand Gazelle is adapted to great extremes of temperature and drought and the Arabian Oryx is able to adapt to rising temperatures. The property counts 526 recorded species at the time of inscription, forming an intact ecosystem. The Tuwayq Escarpment and its associated network of inland wadis play a vital role to support woody perennial plants, which are essential as feeding and shelter areas for the flagship species.

Whilst low on biodiversity compared to other desert properties globally, 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid appears to exhibit the richest flora in the Ar-Rub' al-Khali with 118 plant species recorded and a high level of endemism. The area also hosts five reptile species endemic to Arabia and it is a critical site for plant conservation, with locally endemic, near-endemic, regionally endemic and/or regional range-restricted taxa.

Integrity

The property stands out due to its large size and high level of integrity with impacts from tree-cutting, overgrazing, hunting and other drivers of desertification largely being absent. The vast area of the property ensures representation of the hyper-arid desert ecosystem with all its elements covered and subject to undisturbed evolution. The trophic network is intact and in balance. However, it is important to note the fragile nature of the property's ecosystem, especially in the context of climate change.

The configuration of 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid, combining sand dune systems with an escarpment and incised plateau creates an exceptional "edge effect" for the survival of wildlife in a hyper-arid environment. Integrity is maintained thanks to the property's remoteness and long distance to major developments. A rugged terrain and harsh climate have deterred permanent human residence and large-scale resource use.

Protection and management requirements

The property is congruent with the 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid Protected Area, which effectively protects flagship species. It is important to maintain the high level of intactness of the property and to ensure the desert ecosystem remains undisturbed and will not be affected by camel grazing and illegal wildlife hunting. It is excluded from oil and gas exploration and extraction, which is confirmed by Royal endorsement. Requirements of environmental audit, rehabilitation of former quarry sites, and needs to monitor private farms in the vicinity of the protected area are receiving adequate attention at the time of inscription.

In 1996, 'Urug Bani Ma'arid was designated a protected area by Royal Decree and it enjoys the highest level of protection at the national level. The property is entirely stateowned with no private lands or land claims within its boundaries. It is adequately protected by national legislation. The main legislative framework is the national environmental protection law of 2020, which represents a legal umbrella. It is executed through several bylaws, including an updated protected areas bylaw, ratified by the Government in September 2021, which is the main legislative instrument pertaining to protected areas. The National Centre for Wildlife is the national authority in charge of proposing, managing, and supervising protected areas. Other legislative frameworks regulate human activities primarily outside protected areas, including the national wildlife hunting regulation, wood cutting regulation, environmental violations and penalties regulation, environmental licensing for the construction and operation of development activities regulation, and the environmental rehabilitation and degraded and polluted sites regulation. Increased camel grazing, occurring in the sustainable resource use zone, and illegal wildlife hunting are the main activities that could become a concern. They are both adequately addressed by the management team at the time of inscription. A buffer zone to the west protects the property against environmental degradation from nearby development activities.

A three-year management plan guides the property's transition from a national protected area to a World Heritage property. Implementation started in 2021 and all required human, financial, and logistical resources have been allocated, along with national and international technical expertise. On-site management is guaranteed by more than 140 staff and sustainable funding is provided by the Government. In 2021, an updated zoning plan was developed, representing a ten-year conservation vision for the protected area as a natural World Heritage property. This will ensure the highest level of integrity and effective long-term protection of the property's natural values and attributes. At the time of inscription, the property is divided into four distinctive zones balancing conservation and sustainable development objectives: wilderness zone (54%), nature-culture ecotourism zone (2%), sustainable resources use zone (44%), and the general use zone (less than 0.5%), in addition to a buffer zone of 80,600 hectares.

4. Requests the State Party to:

- a) Ensure that no projects are developed in the buffer zone nor within the property area that could negatively impact the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
- b) Rehabilitate the two quarrying sites inside the buffer zone, as planned,
- c) Continue consultations with the local communities to ensure camel grazing remains at sustainable levels,
- d) Monitor and respond to any negative impacts from the established cement works located within the property's buffer zone,
- e) Submit the updated management plan for 2024-2028 to the World Heritage Centre, once it becomes available.

C.3 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

C.3.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.29

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Cold Winter Deserts of Turan, Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan,** comprising the following component parts: Altyn-Emel East, Altyn Emel Central, Altyn-Emel West, Barsakelmes Island, Kaskakulan, Bereketli Garagum, Gaplankyr, Repetek, Yeradzhi, Saigachy, Saigachy-Beleuli, Saigachy-Duana, Saigachy-Zhideyli and Southern Ustyurt, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (ix)** and **(x)**;
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Cold Winter Deserts of Turan is a transnational serial property shared by Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan. The property comprises 14 component parts distributed across arid areas of Central Asia's temperate zone between the Caspian Sea and the Turanian high mountains system. The property is subject to extreme climatic conditions with minimal levels of precipitation, very cold winters and hot summers. In spite of these extreme conditions, the property boasts an exceptionally diverse flora and fauna that has adapted to the harsh conditions. The property also represents a considerable diversity of desert ecosystems, their evolution, functions and natural dynamics, covering Turan Deserts from the mountain depressions and piedmonts of Altyn-Emel to the gypsum deserts of Southern Ustyurt, spanning a distance of more than 1,500 kilometres from East to West. Each of the component parts has its own specifics, and at the same time, they complement each other in terms of biodiversity, desert types, and ongoing ecological processes. The component parts located in the Aral Sea region represent the desert ecosystem and not the wetland ecosystem of the Aral Sea itself as they were present before desiccation of the sea and fully reflect the biodiversity values of the Turanian deserts. The property holds a vast area of 3,366,441 hectares, with buffer zones adding up to a total of 622,812 hectares.

Criterion (ix): The serial property represents the cold winter deserts as an outstanding example of the development of terrestrial ecosystems in extreme climate conditions and

of the evolution of survival and adaptation strategies of plants and animals as ongoing ecological and biological processes. The ten component parts include diverse geomorphological desert types, which are reflected by different ecosystems. It is representative of most of the ecological-physiographic vegetation types in the Turan deserts: sagebrush and perennial saltwort vegetation; psammophytic vegetation, i.e. desert grasses; saxaul shrubs and woodland. Taxonomic diversification and morphological convergence of plants are significant ongoing biological processes. Saxaul woodland demonstrates the ability of desert ecosystems for ongoing carbon sequestration and storage. Morphological, physiological and behavioural adaptations ensure survival of animal life as a fundamental ongoing process within the cold winter deserts of Turan. The component parts are important to the migration of migratory birds and ungulate species and serve as node points for migratory species and their dispersal across wider areas in the region.

Criterion (x): The serial property hosts very specific and diverse flora and fauna, adapted to the extreme climatic conditions of the Cold Winter Deserts of Turan. The species diversity is high, including diversity hotspots of Chenopodiaceae and plant genera of different families such as Artemisia, Calligonum, Salsola, Zygophyllum or Limonium, including a high share of endemic species. The property hosts numerous breeding birds, and important resting places of migrating bird species, as well as desert-adapted herpetofauna and insects. The Cold Winter Deserts of Turan are the habitat of globally threatened mammals, such as Goitered Gazelle, Saiga and Urial. Further important species that occur in component parts of the property include Kulan, Snow Leopard, Marbled Polecat and Striped Hyena as well as Asian Houbara, Great Bustard, Saker Falcon, White-headed Duck, Egyptian Vulture and Steppe Tortoise.

Integrity

The property's 14 component parts are representative of the Turanian cold winter deserts. They include the most intact examples of desert ecosystems within legally protected areas. The serial property covers a total of 3,366,441 hectares, with some component parts benefitting from buffer zones with a combined area of 622,812 hectares. The ecosystems fulfil their ecological functions, and host the characteristic plant and animal diversity of cold winter deserts.

Most of the 14 component parts are very remote and far from settlements. However, historical population decline of ungulate species has occurred across the region due to poaching, and significant barriers to migration exist through the border fencing, causing disruption to migratory routes. Further threats to the property include linear infrastructure, such as tracks, roads, border fences, railways and canals, affecting connectivity as well as continued poaching and grazing by livestock. Overgrazing by livestock in the areas outside the property can also cause threats to ungulates as it affects their food source availability. The overall threat level is low at the time of inscription but these threats will require close attention, including through monitoring and mitigation action.

Protection and management requirements

All 14 component parts of the property are publicly owned and protected by the relevant national legislation of Kazakhstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan and managed on the basis of specific management plans by state administrations under the responsibility of the relevant ministries. It will be essential for each component part of the property to maintain the strict protection regime in the long term. The three component parts of the Altyn Emel cluster in Kazakhstan are encompassed by the Altyn-Emel National Park, while another two components are part of Barsakelmes State Nature Reserve. The component parts in Turkmenistan are fully covered by Nature Sanctuaries and State Nature Reserves. In Uzbekistan, the Southern Ustyurt component parts of Saigachy-Duana,

Saigachy-Zhidely and Saigachy-Beleuli are covered by the Saigachy complex (landscape) reserve, which is managed as a wilderness area.

The priority management objective for all 14 component parts is to ensure the ecosystem integrity of desert landscapes, including their biological diversity of plants and animals. Each of the component parts benefit from well-defined governance frameworks and management plans as well as staff with growing technical capacities in essential areas of expertise. There are various projects in support of the management of the component parts, including on monitoring and patrolling which will need to be continued along with continued capacity development in relation to the threats, size of the areas and future management objectives, including sustainable tourism not exceeding the carrying capacity and affecting the fragile desert ecosystem.

The transnational management will be ensured by a Joint Steering Committee with responsible representatives of all three States Parties on the basis of a Memorandum of Understanding, signed on 10 January 2022. The Memorandum commits the States Parties of the property to effective transnational management and protection mechanisms, according to the Operational Guidelines. The joint management is to be implemented and coordinated through the Joint Steering Committee, including through exchanges on the individual and national management plans, by staff exchange, joint public awareness campaigns and environmental education. It is important that the Joint Steering Committee also coordinates approaches to enhancing connectivity between the component parts and the wider landscape and that sufficient budget is allocated by the governments.

- 4. <u>Requests</u> the States Parties to ensure the protection and management of the Outstanding Universal Value is guaranteed in the long term, including by:
 - Increasing the connectivity between the component parts of the property and with the wider ecosystem, including by removing and mitigating barriers to large mammal migration,
 - b) Ensuring the legal protection of each component part and each buffer zone is maintained in the long term,
 - c) Allocating sufficient funding to the Joint Steering Committee, strengthening the transnational and transboundary management of the property, including through regular exchange and capacity-building and research and monitoring across the 14 component parts of the property, including for transboundary migration patterns;
- 5. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.30

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Tugay Forests of the Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve, Tajikistan**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (ix)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Tugay Forests of the Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve is located in the interfluve of the Vakhsh and Panj rivers in southwestern Tajikistan at the border of Afghanistan. The confluence continues as the Amu Darya, the largest river in Central Asia, running to the Aral Sea. The Reserve includes extensive riparian tugay ecosystems, the sandy Kashka-Kum desert, the Buritau peak, as well as the low (1,000-1,200 m a.s.l.) mountains of the southern spurs of the Aruktau range – the Hodja-Kaziyon mountains. The area of the Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve is 49,786 hectares and its buffer zone is 17,672 hectares. The property is composed of a series of floodplain terraces covered by alluvial soils, comprising tugay riverine forests with very specific biodiversity in the valley. Significantly, the property preserves a natural Asiatic poplar tugay vegetation complex.

Criterion (ix): The natural complex of Tigrovaya Balka is an outstanding example of continuous ecological and biological processes taking place in the evolution and development of desert-tugay biocenoses and their characteristic plant and animal communities. The reserve hosts various ecological units, not only tugay lowland forests, but also steppe and semi-desert areas and their various ecotones where many stenoeceous species of flora are found. The reserve's forests, sandy and saline semi-deserts, piedmont semi-savannas, and various wetlands are dynamically adapting to changes in the hydrological regime of the territory. There are several habitats in the reserve: tugay riverine forests, freshwater bodies and marshes, semi-deserts, takirs and solonchaks.

The complex features water-resistant and thermophilic, salt-tolerant trees and shrubs such as the Asiatic Poplar or Blue Poplar, the Dzhida or Oleaster, the Multiramose Tamarix. Wildlife includes Bactrian Deer, whose population in the reserve exceeds 300; Goitered Gazelle, Striped Hyena, Gray Monitor, Tajik Black-and-gold Pheasant, and many waterfowl, completing the largely intact tugay ecosystem. The 24,100 hectares of tugay forests in the reserve represent the largest and most intact tugay forest of this type in Central Asia, and this is the only place in the world where the Asiatic poplar tugay ecosystem has been preserved in its original state over an area of this size.

Integrity

The Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve is an integral natural complex, the main components of which are inseparably associated with each other by the common origin and dynamics of natural development, and includes the elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value. The reserve presents ecosystems of tugay floodplain forests, sandy and saline semi-deserts, foothill low-grass semi-savannas and wetlands, with the spectrum of characteristic flora and fauna. The size of the property (49,786 ha) is sufficient to support the sustainable functioning of tugay ecosystems. The buffer zone of the reserve (17,672 ha), though narrow in places, provides additional guarantees of the integrity of the property.

The integrity of the property depends on the riparian dynamics of the Vakhsh and Panj rivers, with the Vakhsh being the most important but also the most modified by eight dams. These dams change inter-seasonal and inter-annual flow dynamics reducing the flooding on which riparian tugay ecosystems depend. Only the section along the Panj river is still under some influence of natural riparian dynamics but their riparian woodlands are of limited size. The water balance is now partly supported by secondary water sources from irrigation systems. The water regime within the property has been restored to the extent that the property's integrity is ensured, but the matter requires constant attention and action.

Biophysical processes and properties of the natural landscape of the Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve are indirectly affected by economic activities (irrigated agriculture and cattle grazing) conducted in adjacent lands, but at the time of inscription they have not significantly impacted the property and their water footprint has been greatly reduced.

Protection and management requirements

The property has had the status of a state nature reserve since 1938, the highest nature protection status of Tajikistan, corresponding to IUCN category Ia. The Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve is a structural subdivision of the State Committee for Environmental Protection under the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan and operates in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Tajikistan "On Specially Protected Natural Territories" of 27 November 2014. The protection of the reserve is the responsibility of a special inspection service, consisting of 30 rangers and 5 senior rangers, who conduct daily rounds and night patrols. Agriculture, animal husbandry and other economic activities are strictly forbidden within the property's boundaries, but do occur in the adjacent territories. The nature protection institution for the Tigrovaya Balka Nature Reserve has the necessary material and human resources to ensure undisturbed natural processes within the property.

Operational protection and preservation of the property's Outstanding Universal Value is carried out by reserve managers according to medium-term management plans, which define specific measures for protection, scientific research, monitoring of the state of conservation, environmental education and interaction with the local population, the timing of their implementation, actors, sources of funding and expected results. Reserve managers undertake a wide range of active management projects to counter the disruption of the hydrological regime due to upstream dams. Central to this is regular clearing of channels to deliver water from the Vaksh River to and among the lakes. Maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value is contingent on regular supply of water from upstream sources.

- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party of Tajikistan to coordinate with the State Party of Afghanistan to secure water flows from the Panj River to maintain the hydrological regime of the property;
- 5. Requests the State Party to:
 - a) Secure and maintain a natural hydrological regime for the property with sufficient provision of water to the property to maintain its Outstanding Universal Value,
 - b) Assess regularly the management effectiveness of the property, including research on the hydrological regime of the Vakhsh River in relation to the property,
 - c) Enhance management capacity of the Nature Reserve with special focus on community engagement.

C.4 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

C.4.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.31

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Anticosti, Canada, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (viii);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Anticosti is a stratigraphic and fossiliferous site of worldwide importance with an exceptionally well preserved, abundant and diverse fossil fauna. Anticosti is the largest stratigraphic record in thickness and the most complete and best preserved palaeontological record representing the first mass extinction of animal life on a global scale, 447-437 million years ago. The property and buffer zone are located within protected areas that are free of any industrial activity.

The property is situated on the island of Anticosti, the largest island in Quebec at the entrance to the Gulf of St. Lawrence in eastern Canada. The area of the property is 18,240 hectares with a buffer zone of 89,740 hectares, together covering nearly 14% of the total area of Anticosti Island. Both the property and buffer zone are situated on the Nitassinans or territories claimed by the Innu communities of Ekuanitshit and Nutashkuan who have both provided their consent to the inscription of the property.

Criterion (viii): Anticosti is the best natural laboratory in the world for the study of fossils and sedimentary strata from the first mass extinction of life, at the end of the Ordovician period, which represents an important milestone in the history of Earth. It contains the largest stratigraphic record in thickness and the most complete, and best-preserved fossil record of marine life covering 10 million years of Earth history, from the Upper Ordovician to the Lower Silurian, 447-437 million years ago. The abundance, diversity, and state of conservation of the fossils are exceptional and allow for world-class scientific work

Thousands of large bedding surfaces allow the observation and study of shell and sometimes soft-bodied animals that lived on the shallow sea floor of an ancient tropical sea. These animals were buried by the continual passage of strong storms, which completely preserved the organisms and the ecological structure of the ancient marine communities. The exquisite preservation of the fossil shells allows the analysis of their geochemical composition to identify ancient climatic and oceanographic signals, and to study in depth the causes of the mass extinction of life at the end of the Ordovician period.

Integrity

The fossiliferous strata included within the boundaries of the property have all the attributes to bear full witness to the first mass extinction of life on Earth. The property includes all coastal outcrops extending from low tide to cliff top for nearly 550 kilometres and outcrops along the Vaureal and Jupiter rivers respectively. Natural erosion plays an important role as the retreat of the cliffs uncovers new fossil horizons and serves to maintain the Outstanding Universal Value in the long term. Whilst the vast majority of the millions of fossils are found in-situ on the bedding surfaces of rocks within the property, ex-situ fossils are also found in the collections of major museums around the world, and these collections outside the property are accessible to researchers from all over the world and help to enhance the understanding of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

Protection and management requirements

The property and its buffer zone benefit from strong and long-term legal protection. They are part of a network of publicly owned protected areas managed by the Quebec provincial government, free from any industrial activity, and there are no permanent residents in the property or its buffer zone. The prospect of new developments in or near the property and its buffer zone is minimal, and any potential development will be subject to strict guidelines. The Natural Heritage Conservation Act and the Quebec Parks Act ensure the protection and maintenance of all stratigraphic and palaeontological attributes essential to the full expression of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property as well as the island's biological diversity, with additional protection ensured by the buffer zone.

The Permanent Biodiversity Reserve covers 94.3% of the property and was designed to protect the island's geological heritage and biodiversity. The remaining areas of the property are covered by Anticosti National Park and the Ecological Reserves of Pointe-Heath and Grand-Lac-Salé. The buffer zone of the property is also covered by the Biodiversity Reserve, the National Park and the Ecological Reserves. A legal mechanism has been established to enable future boundary adjustments to accommodate natural changes.

The management team established by the Quebec provincial government enforces protective legislation, carries out day-to-day management activities and monitors natural factors and human activities threatening the property and its buffer zone. The management is guided by the property's management plan, which includes measurable objectives. A community committee ensures that local and indigenous concerns and knowledge are integrated into management and conservation. A scientific committee supports the management board of the property.

Information panels inform the public of the need to respect the geological heritage and the tight restrictions on collecting fossils, enforceable by the management team on the property. The protection measures for the geological heritage stipulate it cannot be sampled, altered, or painted. In certain sectors, visitors may collect a few small samples that have been naturally eroded and are no longer in-situ.

4. <u>Commends</u> the State Party for the high quality of the comparative analysis and nomination dossier, <u>welcomes</u> the strong financial and scientific support to the property provided by the State Party, and the involvement by the Innu communities of Ekuanitshit and Nutashkuan whose participation and knowledge will be an essential element for the property's protection and management.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.32

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Evaporitic Karst and Caves of Northern Apennines, Italy, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (viii);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Evaporite Karst and Caves of Northern Apennines constitute the most complete, outstanding and accessible examples of the karst phenomena in gypsum and anhydrite at humid sub-tropical climate conditions. Located in northern Italy, this serial property unites together the most internationally studied areas with regard to hydrogeology, mineralogy and speleology in evaporitic karstic systems. The evaporitic rocks of this property were deposited in two distinct geological periods: the breakup of the supercontinent Pangea (c.200 million years ago) and during the ecological catastrophe when the Mediterranean Sea largely evaporated (c.6 million years ago). The cave system developed over the last 500,000 years.

The site hosts different type of mineralogical evolution of gypsum, including its transformation into anhydrite and alabaster, and many speleothems and minerals that are peculiar to this area, thanks a complex relationship among rocks, geological evolution and climate.

The explorations and discoveries that took place in this area - described in the pioneer speleological publications - are considered as milestones in the development of the

geosciences. The property includes the evaporite cave with the deepest drop in the world, the world largest epigenetic cave and the largest karst salt spring of Europe

In a very narrow belt - made of vertical cliffs emerging from the surrounding clays - it is possible to study the evolution of Mesozoic and Cenozoic evaporite deposits, with the same access easiness that led to their exploration since the pre-scientific era. Many caves have been explored since prehistoric times, and they became one of the first excavation areas of lapis specularis, the stunning transparent crystals, which replaced glass during Roman times.

Criterion (viii): The property comprises the most complete sulfate-halite karst systems on Earth, due to the exceptional combination of humid sub-tropical climatic conditions and a peculiar geological setting. It also includes a complete collection of epigean and hypogean karst morphologies from the dissolution surfaces in vertically exposed gypsum cliffs to the speleothems in the abysses of the caves.

In a relatively small area over 900 caves (amongst the largest, deepest and most complex of this type at global scale) represent the best worldwide scientifically documented sulfate-halite karst from the geological, speleological and hydrological points of view. An uncommon richness of rare speleothems and minerals, sometimes unique to these caves, have attracted naturalists and scientists since the 16th century and tens of evaporitic karst phenomena have been described here for the first time. The discipline of speleology was born in this area and its easy accessibility make it a leading research location even nowadays. The educational value of this property is well illustrated in the several caves that are open to the public.

Integrity

The property's nine component parts involve approximately 90% of evaporitic rocks of the northern Apennine chain and ensure the entire representation of karst phenomena in gypsum and anhydrite, including all the outcropping and underground karst areas, all the main karst aquifers, and all their recharge areas.

The state of conservation of the karst biotic and abiotic systems is excellent. The continuity of the karst hydrological system, above and below ground, is well preserved in all the component sites. The fruition of the few caves open to the public takes place with speleological modalities, without alterations of the natural conditions and habitats.

Settlement pressures are absent, although some component sites are close to metropolitan areas. Agriculture – where present - is limited and extensive, and the management of the existing woods is conservative, aimed at increasing their wilderness. Within the property the mining exploitation of gypsum, which has affected these areas since Roman times, is now prohibited.

Protection and management requirements

All evaporitic karst areas of the property are identified and strictly protected by a specific geological and speleological heritage protection act, in accordance with European, national and regional regulations.

The great majority (96%) of the property is protected by European Community directives and is part of the Natura 2000 Network. Most of the property (71%) is protected by a national park and by two regional parks. The remaining areas are nature reserves and protected landscapes, preserved by law. The surrounding areas are subject to the territorial and landscape planning of the Emilia-Romagna Region that establishes the rules for the management of the territory.

At the time of inscription, the management system consists of two bodies: the Appennino Tosco-Emiliano National Park and the Emilia-Romagna Region. The latter directly supervises the management bodies of the regional protected areas. These management

bodies have a management plan, a specific budget and a dedicated staff (technical and administrative) to manage and control the different protected areas.

A World Heritage-oriented management structure is currently being established and the management strategy is expected to take 18 months to finalise. This strategy includes a governance agreement that mutually commits the current management bodies (EKCNA Programme Agreement), the setting up of a WH-dedicated coordination office (EKCNA Office) and a shared action plan to ensure an effective long-term protection of the property's natural values and attributes.

Key management issues include the protection of the attributes and values of the geological heritage, conservation measures for habitats and species of Community interest, knowledge and communication of the natural environments. The karst hydrological system is also a very relevant management topic in these highly dynamic environments. Other management themes include education, enhancement, quality of visitor experience, and finally environmental restoration and conversion of abandoned and disused quarries for educational purposes.

A long-term monitoring system has been set up, using ground- and underground-based observations, for improved evaluation of the chemical and ecological state of karst aquifers, seismo-tectonic movements, and climate cave conditions. Key aspects of the property's flora and fauna are also monitored.

- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the State Party's commitment not to extend the permit for quarrying in the Monte Tondo quarry and to commence restoration activity as soon as practical;
- 5. <u>Recommends</u> the State Party to fully establish the planned management structure for the serial property, and to consider:
 - a) Submitting a minor boundary modification to enlarge two component parts located in Alta Valle Secchia and in Vena del Gesso Romagnola Monte Mauro,
 - b) Developing a single unified protection system for the component parts of the serial property,
 - c) Ensuring that the zonation of the Appennino Tosco-Emiliano Biosphere Reserve aligns with the protection and management regime needed for the property,
 - d) Preparing a visitor management plan that identifies areas of expected high levels of visitation, and the carrying capacity of the property;
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations.
- D. MIXED SITES
- D.1 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC
- **D.1.1 New Nominations**

Decision: 45 COM 8B.33

The World Heritage Committee,

1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B, WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1 and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,

- 2. <u>Defers</u> the examination of the nomination of the **Highlands of the Mongolian Altai**, **Mongolia**, in order to allow the State Party to prepare a fully revised and expanded nomination, with the advice of the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre, if requested, to:
 - a) With regard to cultural values:
 - i) Gather, compile and appraise all existing information and knowledge about the archaeological landscape and detected archaeological remains beyond the ten documented sites as a basis to confirm the potential of the nominated property to demonstrate Outstanding Universal Value.
 - ii) Develop a programme for systematic inventorying and documentation of archaeological remains and features of the archaeological landscape,
 - iii) Refocus the narrative of the nomination on the archaeological dimensions of the landscape,
 - iv) Consider whether the currently proposed boundaries for the nominated property are adequate on the basis of the above-mentioned appraisal and if needed, revise them;
 - b) With regard to natural values:
 - Establish complete and up-to-date species data for the nominated property to ensure a comprehensive assessment of the potential species richness of the nominated property and an accurate and revised comparative analysis demonstrating potential Outstanding Universal Value,
 - ii) Consider including the full extent of Altai Tavan Bogd National Park and Siilkhem Mountain National Park Part A, as well as adding Siilkhem Mountains National Park Part B in the nominated property to ensure a more complete representation of wildlife values and to improve connectivity should the up-to-date species data confirm Siilkhem Mountains National Park Part B as an essential element to justify criterion (x),
 - iii) Include in the management plan, through the ongoing revision of the current 2020-2024 management plan for the nominated property, a wildlife monitoring plan for threatened species and to prevent illegal activities, as well as a tourism management plan for key routes for low-impact tourism, zones and attraction areas, according to their carrying capacities, and including the installation of adequate visitor control mechanisms and monitoring arrangements,
 - iv) Increase funding and staffing levels for the implementation of the revised management plan,
 - v) Ensure Strategic Environmental Assessments and Environmental Impact Assessments are conducted as needed, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, for development plans, projects and linear infrastructure, including the transnational road between Siilkhem Mountain National Park Part A and Part B and any planned mining project within the nominated property, its buffer zone and/or its wider setting, while noting the Committee's established position that mining exploration and exploitation are incompatible with World Heritage status;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to:
 - Ensure that the entire archaeological landscape is covered by protection designations that include protection mechanisms to protect archaeological sites and remains and preserve the potential for future archaeological research,

- b) Clarify the governance of the nominated area and the role of all relevant administrations to ensure that decision-making about activities within the nominated property, its buffer zones and wider setting takes into account the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property,
- c) Reinforce the World Heritage Administration Office of the Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai in terms of resources to enable it to manage effectively the whole archaeological landscape,
- d) Expand the management plan being prepared for the petroglyphs to cover all archaeological remains and the archaeological landscape as a whole,
- e) Ensure that spatial and development plans align with the objectives of the management plan so as to avoid possible future developments harming the attributes of the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property,
- f) Continue the efforts undertaken to involve the communities using and inhabiting the nominated property to ensure its effective protection and management,
- g) Ensure that any proposed developments that may impact on the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property are assessed for their potential impacts, in line with the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context, prior to taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse.
- h) Explore the possibility of including criterion (ix) based on a comprehensive global comparative analysis, given the nominated property represents the most complete sequence of altitudinal vegetation zones in central Siberia, and further considering its significant hydrological integrity;
- 4. <u>Considers</u> that any revised nomination would need to be considered by an expert mission to the site:
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's efforts to take a comprehensive and integrated approach to protecting both the cultural and natural values of the nominated property.

D.2 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

D.2.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.34

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B, WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1 and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2.
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Zagori Cultural Landscape**, **Greece**, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape on the basis of **criterion** (v);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Zagori Cultural Landscape is located in the region of Epirus, in northwestern Greece. The property and its buffer zone contain 45 traditional villages known as Zagori villages (or Zagorochoria) and extend along the western slopes of the Pindus Mountain range.

Human presence in the area, dating as early as the Upper Paleolithic, has been always adapted to this seemingly rough and inaccessible environment and was guided by the spirit of self-sufficiency. As a result, an agro-pastoral landscape has been elaborated, focusing on small-scale cultivation, animal husbandry and forest exploitation, and marked by dry-stone constructions such as terraces, mills, threshing floors, sheepfolds, pens, etc. The built environment consisting of unique urban-like residences, commonwealth structures (schools, fountains, churches) inside the villages and an impressive network of stone-arched bridges, took its present form during the 18th and 19th centuries. At that time, it acquired a special architectural identity, the outcome of the mobility of the Zagorisians, and their economic prosperity. Zagori combine the above with the impressive natural environment and dramatic geological formations. It also includes mature and extensive forests, age-old individual sacred trees, groves, alpine meadows, undisturbed rivers and ravines.

Contrary to what happens in most of Epirus and also in most of the Balkan regions, where the architecture of the residence has a largely rural character, in the villages of Zagori, which, as early as the 18th, but mainly during the 19th and early 20th centuries, developed in a truly exceptional way and were urbanized to a significant extent, houses of extremely high standard for the wider area can be found. The nominated property encompasses twenty of these villages in three municipal units of the present Municipality of Zagori: Central Zagori, Tymphi, and Pápigo. The traditional villages are typically organized around a central square containing a plane tree. Each showcases drystone cobbled pathways adapted to the topography, and some are still surrounded by sacred forests maintained by local communities. The central square is dedicated to community life, and functions as a centre for social gatherings and religious events.

Criterion (v): Traditional villages of Zagori, are an outstanding example of traditional human settlements where the characteristics of the stonework showcased in traditional buildings, stone bridges, stone paths, and stone staircases represent a distinctive culture developed in Zagori. The vernacular architecture, urban structure, and public infrastructure of the villages have been influenced by an exchange with other areas of the Balkan region, Central Europe, Russia, Asia Minor, and Constantinople, where Zagorisians practiced temporary migration. Zagorisians imported ideas and styles to their homeland and provided investments which enabled the development of this isolated area of the Pindus Mountain range. Zagorochoria are representative of the common legacy of Byzantine and Ottoman vernacular architecture of the larger Balkan region. This style has become rare in the region, but is still reflected in the traditional stone architecture and traditional village layouts of Zagori.

Integrity

Zagori Cultural Landscape form a cohesive whole of interconnected cultural and natural elements that coexist in harmony, as they have been co-formed over a period of long duration. The property includes exceptional preserved examples of cultural heritage, small-scale rural mountain landscapes and extensive pastures that have retained their character since the Bronze Age.

The values of the property can be discerned in their entirety whereas the distinctive features of the landscape, both man-made and natural, have maintained their integrity due to the isolation of the area, the mild economic activities that have been implemented so far, as well as the protective framework that has been timely established so as to prevent the degradation of the landscape.

In addition, the further safeguarding of the architectural values of Zagorochoria is underway through their declaration in total as a historical site in accordance with the very strict archaeological law and therefore they will be consequently subject to strict control and licensing procedures for all types of works and interventions.

Authenticity

Zagorochoria constitute a rare example of authentic and well-preserved traditional settlements within an agro-pastoral landscape and a rich natural environment. The strict institutional framework for the protection of the cultural assets, the maintenance of the use of stone and wood as predominant construction materials, as well as restrictions on building standards regulations have contributed significantly to preserve the authentic character of the settlements of the nominated area. Furthermore, traditional craftsmanship along with the use of authentic techniques and materials never ceased to be implemented – even in modern constructions – and have played an important role to the sustainable management of natural resources.

As a result, all the original attributes of the landscape are adequately expressed in the present form of the landscape in a way that the property constitutes today an eloquent example of traditional and customary practices that have been preserved unaltered in time.

Protection and management requirements

Zagori Cultural Landscape is protected through an integrated system that is long established. It comprises the legal framework for the preservation of the multifaceted values of the area, as well as the existence of competent state authorities at both central and local levels, that ensure its implementation. In the frame of its nomination for inscription in the World Heritage List a special Management Plan has been drafted taking into account national and European legislation, UNESCO policies for natural and cultural heritage, and the Sustainable Development Goals, as set out in Agenda 2030.

More precisely, the Management Plan aims at drafting and implementing measures based on five main axes: cultural heritage, built environment / architectural heritage, natural heritage, sustainable development, awareness-raising and promotion. The main body for the implementation of the Management Plan will be the Municipality of Zagori through an Independent Department that will be established within its organization chart. It will be assisted by the Committee for the Preservation and Promotion of Cultural Landscape, which will include representatives of key stakeholders, cultural associations and productive organizations in the area.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Include the villages of Skamnéli and Eláti in the buffer zone,
 - b) Prepare documentation on the traditional villages and traditional buildings within the property to create a baseline for the conservation and management of the property as a whole.
 - Develop a comprehensive conservation plan that considers the stone-arched bridges, the historical paths and staircases, and the traditional villages in a holistic way,
 - d) Develop a coordination platform and mechanisms for the management of the property, taking into consideration other designations, institutions, and levels of implementation that overlap with the property,
 - e) Include within the proposed management plan a financial programming, a detailed timetable, and a Local Master Plan based on a comprehensive conservation plan,
 - Develop a mechanism and opportunities for local communities, rights-holders, and other stakeholders to participate in the management of the property,
 - g) Develop a risk preparedness and disaster risk management strategy,
 - h) Develop a tourism strategy that takes into account the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, and determine scientifically its carrying capacity,

- i) Develop a sustainability strategy for the traditional masonry and building techniques and skills in order to maintain the traditional villages over the long term;
- 5. <u>Also recommends</u> the State Party to investigate the potential for a future nomination under criterion (x) based on a reconfiguration of the boundaries of the property in order to include the relevant biodiversity-related attributes;
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session;
- 7. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's efforts to take a comprehensive and integrated approach to protecting both the cultural and natural values of the property.

E. CULTURAL SITES

E.1 AFRICA

E.1.1 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.35

The extension of the Sukur Cultural Landscape, Nigeria, to include the Cultural Landscape of Diy-Gid-Biy, Cameroon, and become The Sukur and Diy-Gid-Biy cultural landscape of the Mandara Mountains, was withdrawn at the request of the State Party.

E.2 ARAB STATES

E.2.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.36

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan, Palestine, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii) and (iv);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located northwest of present-day Jericho in the Jordan Valley in Palestine, Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan consists of an oval-shaped tell, or mound, that contains archaeological deposits of human activity dating back to about 10,500 BC, and the adjacent perennial spring of 'Ain es-Sultan, which for millennia has been an important source of water for the inhabitants of this area.

The stratigraphy of this archaeological site shows twenty-nine phases of occupation and testifies to two historical-cultural contexts, namely the Neolithisation of the Fertile Crescent and the phenomenon of urbanism in southern Levant during the Bronze Age.

By the 9th to 8th millennium BC, Neolithic Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan was already a sizeable permanent settlement, as expressed by surviving monumental architectural features such as a wall with a ditch and a tower. It reflects the developments of the period, which include the shifting of humanity to a sedentary communal lifestyle and the related transition to new subsistence economies, as well as changes in social organisation and the development of religious practices.

The Early Bronze Age archaeological material on the site provides insights into urban planning, while vestiges from the Middle Bronze Age reveal the presence of a large Canaanite city-state, equipped with an urban centre and technologically innovative rampart fortifications, occupied by a socially complex population.

Criterion (iii): Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan testifies in an exceptional way to developments that took place across the Near East in the Neolithic, characterised by the shifting of humanity to a new sedentary lifestyle and the related transition to new subsistence strategies. It demonstrates how people learned to live in larger, more permanent settlements and develop new social and ritual methods of communal living. Monumental features of the property, the presence of shared structures, and the evidence of post-mortem treatment of skulls provide important insights into changes in social organisation, and into the degree of skill, planning, and labour that this social organisation required. The deep stratigraphy preserved on the tell has the potential to answer many questions related to development and change of societies in the Neolithic period.

Criterion (iv): Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan is an outstanding example of a permanent settlement with a long history that testifies to the transition of the people of the Levant from hunter-gatherers to a sedentary lifestyle in the Neolithic, and provides evidence of the rise of early Levantine urban culture in the Early Bronze Age. With its monumental architectural features and shared structures dating from the 9th to 8th millennium BC, the property exemplifies in an exceptional way the process of Neolithisation of the Fertile Crescent, a significant stage in human history. It further allows developments in building traditions to be observed in both the private and public spheres in the Neolithic and the Bronze Age, its Middle Bronze Age ramparts in particular showing evidence of innovative construction techniques.

Integrity

All the attributes necessary to convey the Outstanding Universal Value are located within the boundaries of the property. These attributes include the archaeological deposits and the above-ground archaeological vestiges of Ancient Jericho dating to the Neolithic and Bronze Age periods, as well as the adjacent spring of 'Ain es-Sultan. The excavated artefacts have been alienated from the site. The property is of sufficient size to ensure the complete representation of the features and values that convey its significance. Its archaeological deposits and deep stratigraphy are well preserved, despite destruction of some structures as a result of past archaeological investigations. The uncovered structures are fragile in some instances. The property does not suffer from adverse effects of development and/or neglect.

Authenticity

Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan is authentic in terms of its forms and designs, materials and substance, and location. The Neolithic and Bronze Age archaeological vestiges of Ancient Jericho, while in some cases damaged during early excavations, truthfully convey the Outstanding Universal Value. The designs, materials and substance of the archaeological vestiges in situ are authentically preserved and have maintained their

intact forms. Conservation measures are needed in several cases, such as for the Middle Bronze Age ramparts. No reconstructions have been made at the site, which remains in its historical location. Minimal interventions that have occurred have been made distinguishable from the original fabric. The rehabilitated 'Ain es-Sultan spring has retained its original function as a water source.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by the Tangible Cultural Heritage Law (No. 11, 2018) of Palestine, according to which any major intervention, including conservation activities and excavations, must first be approved by the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, and any new structures or major changes in the areas surrounding the property require an Environmental and Heritage Impact Assessment. The Building and Planning Law (No. 79, 1966; Jordanian Law) is in force in the buffer zone. Additional regulatory measures apply through the Jericho City Spatial Urban Plan, soon to be supplemented with regulations pertaining to the Detailed Urban Master Plan for the Tell es-Sultan Area. The Jericho City Spatial Urban Plan identifies the property and the majority of its buffer zone as a protected archaeological area (antiquities zone).

The property is owned by the State Party and managed as a National Archaeological Park by the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, the highest heritage authority in Palestine, which is responsible for on-site management and conservation. The 'Ain essultan spring will be managed jointly with the Ministry. A Management and Conservation Plan is intended to address the most important aspects of research, management, conservation, and interpretation of the property.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Completing and adopting the Management and Conservation Plan for the property, integrated with a tourism management and promotion strategy, research strategy, risk management strategy, community involvement strategy, and an interpretation and presentation strategy that includes careful elucidation of the wider setting of the property, and submitting the Plan to the World Heritage Centre as soon as it is finalised.
 - Undertaking a hydrological study and including in the Management and Conservation Plan a hydrological strategy for the evacuation of rainwater from the property,
 - c) Assembling complete baseline documentation of the property, and further developing the monitoring system,
 - d) Negotiating with relevant stakeholders for the removal of the existing tourism facilities encroaching on the property, and developing a process to remove the cable car as soon as is practicable,
 - e) Considering extending the buffer zone (and the associated regulatory mechanisms that are being developed) to include the proposed additional outer protection zone, when this becomes possible, through a minor boundary modification request,
 - f) Carrying out Heritage Impact Assessments as a pre-requisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation within or around the property, such as tourism facilities and road realignments,
 - g) Informing the World Heritage Centre of the intention to undertake or authorise all major projects which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, in line with paragraph 172 of Operational Guidelines.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.37

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Djerba: Testimony to a settlement pattern in an island territory, Tunisia, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (v);
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The serial property of Djerba: Testimony to a settlement pattern in an island territory bears an exceptional testimony to an insular urban system that developed between the 9th and the 18th centuries and still expresses today the way in which an island territory was occupied by communities of different cultures and faiths who had to coexist to survive.

During this period marked by the predominance of Ibadism, a doctrinal movement in Islam advocating the virtue of work and egalitarian principles while having the religious and social organization entrusted to an assembly of wise men, this complex urban system developed in response to a combination of environmental, socio-cultural and economic factors. It was characterized by the occupation of the whole island's territory in a remarkable illustration of adaptation of the population to the combined constraints of secular water scarcity, the unfavourable flat topography and insularity's challenges, particularly in terms of defence against threats from the sea.

The complex combination of scattered and low-density settlements (districts combining residential and family scale economic activities) with denser urban ensembles (the secular Jewish quarter and dedicated trading quarters, including the Souks) was at the heart of this urban system.

The Houma (district), formed by a number of Menzel (family domain), was an autonomous economic entity, including handicraft and agricultural activities, representing on a small scale the social and economic organization of the island's urban system as a whole. The latter's defensive orientation highly influenced the architecture of its various components. By its massive form, the lack of openings to the outside and the towers flanking its corners, the Houch (house) looked like a fortress, hidden behind the tabia (talus of earth covered with hedges marking the limits of each Menzel) and palm and olive groves. The numerous mosques of the island were also built based on the permanent prevailing lack of security. With their squat, compact forms, the loopholes that punctuate their façades and the crenelations that run around their terraces, the mosques have often been places of refuge and resistance. Their typology and positioning in the territory are unusual in that they are free-standing features, unlike those found elsewhere in the traditional Arab Islamic towns, where they blend into the dense urban fabric of which they are the centre. Some mosques were placed along the coastline, within earshot of each other, forming a first line of forward defence and surveillance and warning points; others, fortified and massive in appearance, formed a second line of rear defence; still others, scattered inland, sometimes troglodytic to serve primarily as refuge, were dedicated not only to religious functions, but also to teaching and the organisation of civic and cultural life.

This traditional way of using the island's territory as well as building the components of people's daily life with a primarily defensive concern recall the long tumultuous periods of Djerba's thousand-year history, and bear, today, an exceptional testimony to the way men and women adapted to their environment and interacted with it.

Criterion (v): Djerba: Testimony to a settlement pattern in an island territory is an outstanding example of a traditional insular human settlement, combining land-use and sea-use. The insular urban system resulting from this way of occupation of an island territory bears as an exceptional testimony to human interaction with the environment but has also become vulnerable under the impact of the sociocultural and economic mutations stemmed from the contemporary development, thus making its safeguarding of utmost importance.

Integrity

The key attributes that carry the Outstanding Universal Value of this serial property, both at urban and architectural levels, are included within the property's boundaries. Despite the sociocultural and economic changes that the island has been facing over the last decades due, inter alia, to the development of the tourist industry, the evolution of transportation and housing models and the partial abandonment of agriculture, the property has kept its integrity. The traditional road networks linking the Houma are still present and so is the complex urban pattern they form. The denser urban ensembles, which witnessed changes to their urban fabric, have also kept enough urban and architectural elements to express their main features. The majority of the mosques, regularly rehabilitated, are in a good or acceptable state of conservation and so are the other key architectural elements of the property such as the Foundouks or the other religious buildings (the synagogue of the Griba and the catholic and orthodox churches).

From the landscape point of view, the uninhabited coastal zones and the environment of the remote mosques such as those of Bardaoui and Moghzal (both strongly marked by their relation to their environment, over kilometres almost virgin lands towards the seashore) as well as the lands of olive groves are still in a good state of integrity, despite the growing threats in terms of contemporary urban development. This general good condition of integrity of the property is nevertheless fragile and requires a reinforced vigilance and mobilization of all parties concerned by its safeguarding.

Authenticity

Despite the changes mentioned here above, the property has maintained its authenticity. The traditional road networks linking the Houma have not suffered from major modifications and globally remain in their original form, despite the evolution of the transportation services and the increasing number of vehicles. Although a number of contemporary functions (health and education centres, financial structures, etc.) has appeared with time, the denser urban ensembles have kept their main original function (primarily as commercial places, including the Souks) and so is it for their other key components, notably the Foundouks and the religious buildings. The architectural components of the property have largely kept their original form, materials, and functions, except for some of the Menzel that are not anymore inhabited and for which measures have been put in place to have them occupied again for housing, even in a more contemporary way. The uninhabited areas that are part of the property (coastal zones, lands of olives and palm groves, environment of remote mosques) present either their original setting or very limited disturbance to it.

Protection and management requirements

The property being a complex series of public and private areas of various scales as well as of numerous buildings of different typologies and functions, its legal protection relies on the combination of several legal tools covering not only the urban fabrics and the buildings but also the costal zones, the agricultural lands, the environment, and the development of tourism.

The Heritage Code (adopted on 24 February 1994) ensures the protection of historic and traditional ensembles as well as historic monuments. Among the 24 monuments included in the property's boundaries, 7 benefit from legal protection as national historic

monuments. A legal process is currently underway to provide the remaining monuments with adequate legal protection. Their dossiers are currently being drawn up and will be submitted to the National Heritage Commission (decree no. 1475 dated 24 July 1994) at a special session scheduled for the end of 2023. The 7 zones of the property (5 scattered and low-density settlements and 2denser urban ensembles located in the districts of Houmt-Souk and Hara Sghira) will benefit from a decree creating protected areas in accordance with the Heritage Code (Art. 6) and the Buildings General Regulation.

The Urbanism Code (adopted on 28 November 1994) brings a high level of protection to the island of Djerba as a whole, based on the production of legal relevant planning documents and special zoning restrictions. The current development of an adapted master plan to the specific context of Djerba (SDAZS) is the main framework for an integrated protection and sustainable development of the island while ensuring the safeguarding of the property.

The Law on Agricultural Lands (1983 Decree) is a key tool for the protection and management of the scattered and low-density settlements as well as the agricultural lands included in the property. The Law stipulates that a minimum of one hectare of land is required to obtain a building permit. This protective measure was reinforced by the establishment of the Agricultural Map in 1985.

The protection of the coastal zones is ensured by Law no. 95-73 of 24 July 1995 on the Public Maritime Domain (DPM) and whose easements are set by the Code of Land Use Planning and Urbanism (CATU) and Law no. 75-16 of 31March 1975, promulgating the Water Code and the Public Hydraulic Domain (DPH).

Regarding the management system of the property, the consultation within the Government and with regional and local authorities has led to the adoption, by the Ministry of Cultural Affairs of the most adapted available tool to ensure adequate cooperation between all concerned parties, both public and private. This tool consists in two Ministerial Decrees, one establishing the property's Steering Committee (signed on 1 September 2023), involving all concerned ministries and regional and local institutions; and the other establishing the Property's Management Unit (signed on 1 September 2023), as executive operational body, formed by a multidisciplinary team of locally based representatives of national and regional institutions, selected on the basis of their expertise and experience.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Putting in place urgent conservation measures to preserve the property,
 - b) Ensuring a sustainable source of funding for long-term conservation and regular maintenance,
 - c) Including the assessment of the carrying capacity of the individual component parts of the property in the study on the carrying capacity of Djerba as a tourist destination to establish relevant indicators, which would also take into consideration the Ramsar sites and help prevent loss of their internationallyrecognised natural values,
 - d) Considering the proximity of some component parts to the Ramsar sites when planning for tourism activities, so that the pressures exerted on the latter are not exacerbated:
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit a minor boundary modification request so that complementary attributes (including uninhabited coastal zones and olive groves lands) are included within the property's boundaries;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to pursue its efforts to ensure relevant legal protection for all the component parts of the property and improve the latter's governance system and

create relevant management structures that will take into consideration different rights-holders and stakeholders;

- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session;
- 8. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit the map showing the revised boundaries of the property and buffer zone as inscribed by **1 December 2023**.

E.3 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

E.3.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.38

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas, India**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (i)**, **(ii)** and **(iv)**;
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas is a serial property comprising three component sites in the southern Indian state of Karnataka. The three components of the serial nomination, viz., the Channakeshava temple in Belur, the Hoysalesvara temple in Halebidu and the Keshava temple in Somanathapura, are the three best representatives of the 12th – 13th century Hoysala oeuvre of sacred architecture.

The early Hoysala rulers who established their new kingdom and state fashioned a distinct and novel sacred architecture that set their temples apart from those of contemporary kingdoms and dynasties, even as it drew inspiration from them.

Hoysala temple plans and forms were the result of adaptations, modifications, and experimentation with features drawn from different temple-building traditions including the Nagara tradition predominant in north India, the Dravida tradition prevalent in south India, the Bhumija tradition of central India and the Karnata Dravida tradition of the Kalyani Chalukyan territories. The multi-pointed stellate ground plan common in Karnata Dravida and Bhumija temples inspired the extremely complex, stellate plans of the Hoysalas, with rhythmically indented walls of a kind not seen before. Horizontal sculptural bands of elephants and people first featured in temples in western India in the 11th century. The Hoysalas built on this germ of an idea to create the stunning multi-tier friezes that are unique to their temples. Similarly, ceilings featuring corbelled domes, also inspired by temples of western India, have been used and embellished here very differently, thereby making them quite emphatically local.

Hoysala temples are characterised by profuse embellishment and an exuberant horror vacui. The temples' external walls are animated with a continuous parade of life-sized or larger sumptuous images of gods, goddess, musicians, dancers, ascetics and attendant figures. Along the temple plinths, a teeming multi-tier frieze comprising vigorous elephants, horses, crocodiles, plants, humans and birds-a microcosm of the living worlds-twists around the whole temple. The interiors of these temples showcase finely carved, highly polished pillars in myriad profiles, along with exquisite bracket figures of

dancers and musicians, their sensuality and dynamism expertly rendered in stone. Ceilings are adorned with figurative sculptures and with floral, geometric and botanical motifs, the stone resembling wood in its ornateness.

The Hoysala aesthetic emphasised intricacy and hyperreal detail across all levels of sculpture, whether it is pillars, ceilings or wall sculptures. Carvings are in high relief with deep undercutting, and artists have delighted in minutiae, detailing each bead, fingernail or leaf blade with great attention. This extravagant ornamentation and relentless pursuit of detail was made possible by fully exploring and exploiting the qualities of schist the fine-grained, relatively soft mineral that the Hoysalas chose for their temples.

This technical mastery over their material complemented a creative genius in translating beliefs, stories and abstract ideas into the medium of stone. In their narrative scenes and figural sculptures, artists varied perspective, composition and points of view to best convey the drama or essence of a scene.

The creative interventions and innovations of the Hoysala artists and architects created visually stunning masterpieces that also served to emphasise sacral meanings. Thus, the large sculptures of deities on the temple's outer walls invited greater interaction with the divine as devotees performed the ritual circumambulation of the temple. The practice of having stories from the Hindu epics and puranas unspool in sequence along the walls similarly deepened the religious experience of the circumambulation The idea of an unfolding narrative along the circumambulation path, first introduced by the Hoysalas, is carried forward in some 15th century temples in the World Heritage Site of Hampi and elsewhere around Karnataka.

This coming together of creative genius, architectural eclecticism and symbolism led to outstanding and unequalled sacred architecture and the birth of the novel 'Hoysala temple'.

Such creativity was accompanied by an unprecedented degree of artistic agency as evidenced by the hundreds of artists' 'signatures' in Hoysala temples. While many are only names or initials chiselled just below a carving, several epigraphs also include details such as the artist's lineage and his titles, in language reminiscent of royal epithets. Such artistic agency was unusual in the precolonial Indian subcontinent and points to the high standing that artists enjoyed in Hoysala society.

Criterion (i): The Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas, represented by the three components chosen here, testify to the creative genius of the Hoysala architects and artists. In their profuse embellishment, high relief and joyous horror vacui, the temples are testimony to the artists' technical expertise over stone carving, a skill that remains matchless. The richly experiential and visually astounding temples they built demonstrate their creativity in translating religious beliefs and stories into sculpture. This coming together of technical mastery and symbolism to create novel masterpieces of architecture is an outstanding achievement of the Hoysala artists.

Criterion (ii): The three components of the Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas chosen here are examples of the new forms of temple architecture developed by them. These novel temple forms were a result of creative modifications of the plans and elements of temple architecture as prevalent elsewhere, complemented with indigenous innovations. Although some elements of this new and distinct language of temple architecture were carried forward in other regions, the masterpieces of sacred architecture built by the Hoysalas remain unequalled.

The 'Hoysala' temple form emerged from considered and informed choices of elements and features that were used in very self-conscious ways, with a clear understanding of the overall outcome that was desired. This deliberate and reflexive architectural eclecticism on the part of the temple builders is a unique Hoysala aesthetic.

Criterion (iv): Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas is an exceptional testimony to the Hoysala-style temples, which illustrate a significant stage in the historical development of Hindu temple architecture. It is an exceptional physical testimony to the diversity of religious architecture in India.

Integrity

The three components of the serial nomination with all their elements represent the significant style that developed in this region in the 12th - 13th century. These representative temples demonstrate one hundred and fifty years of building activity where the Hoysalas have adopted elements of temple building from different regions and creatively developed it into a novel style of their own.

The temples collectively bring out a holistic understanding of the context, society, culture, religion, politics and economy of the Hoysalas, expressed through their art and architecture. The typologies of these temples, built in chloritic schist, the elements of planform such as stellate plans and their complex variations, the elements such as adhisthana, the sculptural panels, many with artists' signatures, the intricate carvings in the interior and exteriors, all form an integral part of the temple expressing the outstanding universal values. The artistic excellence became the hallmark of the temples as demonstrated in the elements of the three components.

The integrity of each of these components in its architecture, sculptures and carvings continue to define the experience of the characteristic style of this region in this period. Though there have been damages to some sculptures, nonetheless, the features of the sculptures are clear enough to convey the sacral meanings of the iconography in these components and to show the creative skills in the intricacies of the carvings which became the hallmark of this dynasty.

Each of these components are nationally protected monuments and thus have defined boundaries for nominated property and the buffer zone. The buffer zones adopted for the management of the components are based on the law and therefore are regulated. In Belur, where the temple is a living temple, the buffer zone defines the context of the temple with the community still engaged with temple rituals and activities. In Halebidu, the buffer includes the context of the tank and the other nationally protected monuments. In Somanathapura, the temple has a large open space all around, protecting the nominated property. The three components along with their buffer zones are the best representative sites of the cultural era of the Hoysala temple style of the 12th and 13th century.

Authenticity

The three components of the serial nomination constitute the most significant temples of the Hoysala cultural era, representing a significant level of authenticity of the attributes which give the OUV to the serial nomination collectively as well as for each individual component. All these three components are built with chloritic schist and reflect the features such as stellate plans, horizontal friezes of the adhisthana, artists' signatures, sculptural panels and carvings that became the hallmark of this period.

At Channakeshava Temple at Belur, there is a continuity of worship, rituals and all festivals since its inception in 1117 CE. At Hoysalesvara Temple at Halebidu, worship has long been discontinued. Presently, only symbolic worship is allowed, and no rituals or festivals are allowed. The third component, Keshava Temple at Somanathapura, is also a non-worshipping temple.

In form and design, Somanathapura represents a complete example with all elements of Hoysala temple architecture including the shikhara or tower over all the three sanctums. The main temple which carries all the attributes of OUV is surrounded by a prakara which was completely dismantled and reconstructed in the last decade. The reconstruction was carried out by the Archaeological Survey of India (ASI) in a scientific manner. The

attributes which express the outstanding universal values are part of the main temple and have not been impacted.

The shikhara or temple towers are absent at Hoysalesvara Temple at Halebidu. There is no clear evidence of its existence in any epigraphical collection. The Hoysalesvara Temple, also retains authenticity by virtue of its sumptuously carved exterior and interior which are all present in their original form. Towards the eastern side of the temple are the Nandi mandapas (pillared halls built to enshrine the sacred bulls) associated with the main temple. The temple still retains all the attributes which expresses its OUV. The setting of the temple on the banks of the large tank is well maintained.

At Channakeshava Temple, the main temple expresses all the attributes which convey the OUV. There are other shrines in the temple complex which were built over a period of time since the inception of the temple. The stylistic features of these temple structures reflect the time period in which they were built. They were built around the main temple and hence have not disturbed the setting of the Channakeshava Temple itself, the main temple in the complex. The shikhara or the tower over the main temple was dismantled in the late 19th century and was thereafter never rebuilt. However, this has not affected the living temple which continues to be an important place of worship. All the features which define the attributes are still very evident in the temple.

Thus, the three components retain authenticity in form and design, materials of the attributes which clearly express the OUV of the components.

Protection and management requirements

The components of the Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas are protected and managed by the Archaeological Survey of India (ASI), an attached office and organization under the Ministry of Culture, Government of India. All three temples are safeguarded by the Ancient Monument and Archaeological Sites and Remains Act, 1958 (AMASR), the national-level law amended in 2010. The conservation, maintenance, and management for these ensembles are guided by the National Conservation Policy for Monuments, Archaeological Sites, and Remains 2014. Designated as "Ancient Monuments" of national significance, these components are safeguarded well defined buffer comprising a Prohibited Area extending 100 meters in all directions from the monument's boundaries. Additionally, there is a Regulated Area of 200 meters beyond the Prohibited Area. In these protected and regulated areas, all activities are subject to prohibition and regulation, as outlined in the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Sites and Remains Rules 2011. In addition, the buffer zone of Channakeshava Temple, Belur has been extended to incorporate the Vishnusamudra tank and tank street (Kere Beedhi).

The buffer zone is managed as per the statutes of the AMASR Act, 1958 and is guided by a two-tier structure: the Regional Level Apex Committee and the Local Level Committee comprising all concerned stakeholders such as ASI, State Government of Karnataka, Karnataka Hindu religious Institution and Charitable Endowment Department, local municipal bodies, Panchayat and local community representatives.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Monitoring the impacts of the increasing air pollution on the sculptures and developing mitigation measures,
 - b) Encouraging community involvement in the conservation and management of the property,
 - c) Improving the conditions of the historical remains and significant views in the buffer zone of the Channakeshava Temple component part,
 - d) Developing and implementing a holistic interpretation plan and tourists' amenities;

5. <u>Also recommends</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for review by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.39

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks, Indonesia, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iii);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks includes the Kraton (Palace) Complex and a series of linked landmarks, monuments and spaces located along a six-kilometre-long south-north axis in central Yogyakarta. The property is an exceptional testimony to Javanese civilisation and culture, and exhibits an important interchange between diverse belief systems and values.

The orientation of the axis and the placement of the landmarks along its length were designed to manifest in physical form the Javanese philosophical thoughts on human life, especially the cycle of life (Sangkan Paraning Dumadi), ideal harmonious life (Hamemayu Hayuning Bawana), the connection between human beings and the Creator (Manunggaling Kawula Gusti), and the microcosmic and macrocosmic worlds. The landmarks are connected spatially, in their design, through rituals, and by the traditional management system of the Sultanate of Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat known as Tata Rakiting Wewangunan. The axis is aligned between Mount Merapi, considered the abode of Guardian Spirits, and the Indian Ocean, regarded as the home of the Queen of the Southern Sea, reflected in the shape and meaning of the northernmost and southernmost monuments that define the axis.

The location of the Kraton and the city were chosen by the Sultan Mangkubumi in 1755 to conform to Javanese cosmological beliefs, where the capital of the Kingdom is considered to be a miniature of the universe following the Hindu-Buddhist concepts of the physical, metaphysical and spiritual universes. These concepts pre-date the property itself, shaped through the history of Java since before the 1st century CE.

The attributes of the property have been identified and include both tangible and intangible aspects. The latter include cultural heritage practices relating to the cycle of life (birth, marriage and death), venerating ancestors, coronations, funerals, Islamic days, the connection of the natural and macrocosmic microcosmic worlds, and day to day offerings.

Criterion (ii): The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks exhibits an important interchange of human values and ideas between different belief systems related to Javanese animism and ancestor worship, Hinduism and Buddhism from India, Sufi Islam from either India or the Middle East, and Western influences, which were adapted and integrated into the beliefs and culture of the Mataram Kingdoms over hundreds of years. This important and complex interchange of values is demonstrated by the tangible and intangible attributes of the cultural ensemble evident in the property's spatial planning, architecture and monuments, as well as ceremonies and festivals.

Criterion (iii): The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks bears an exceptional testimony to Javanese civilisation and living cultural traditions after the

16th century. The Sultanate of Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat remains the centre for Javanese civilisation and its maintenance and development through the cultural traditions and practices including governance, customary law (paugeran), arts, literature, festivals, and ceremonies. The property is associated with Javanese rituals relating to the cycle of life, venerating ancestors, coronations and royal occasions, Islamic days, and connection with the forces of nature. The Tata Rakiting Wewangunan concept has its origins in Mataram Royal courts since the 16th century and refers to the holistic management of the tangible and intangible aspects of the Sultanate of Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat, including the uses of space along the axis and in the Kraton Complex.

Integrity

The property includes all of the tangible and intangible attributes necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value. Most of the attributes are in a good state of conservation, and actions have been implemented to address continuing pressures including urban development and tourism infrastructure. In the past, damage has occurred through earthquakes, wars and inappropriate urban development, particularly high-rise buildings, including hotels along the Northern Axis. Informal settlements along parts of the Kraton outer walls have also impacted on the condition of the property, and a voluntary scheme to support relocation of the residents has been established.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value of the property is satisfactory through their form and design, materials, uses, traditions and management system, location and setting, intangible heritage, and spirit and feeling. Many repairs and modifications have occurred through time, and some reconstructions have occurred in response to damage caused by the 1867 and 2006 earthquakes, and the Beringharjo Market was rebuilt as an Art Deco concrete structure in the 1920s. The approach to maintenance and conservation are appropriate to sustain the authenticity, although greater caution with the use of non-traditional materials is needed. The traditional management in place for this property is an added support to sustaining the authenticity.

Protection and management requirements

The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks is protected at the national level according to Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 11 of 2010 concerning Cultural Property. Based on this law, the Ministry of Education and Culture has designated the Kraton and its surrounding area as a National Cultural Property Area (Decree of the Minister of Education and Culture No. 117 of 2018) and as National Cultural Property.

At the regional level, the Governor of the Special Region of Yogyakarta has designated the property, buffer zone and wider setting as a Provincial Cultural Heritage Area. A heritage impact assessment mechanism has operated at the property since 2012 and has been further strengthened through the regional law and guidelines on heritage impact assessments which was legally adopted in 2022. The Special Provincial Regulation No. 5 of 2019 concerning Spatial Land-use Plan for 2019-2039 provides additional protection for the property, and regulates the height, location, and density of buildings.

The property is also protected through traditional and modern management systems, under the overall coordination of the Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta Management Unit. The Management Unit has a dedicated staff and budget and is responsible for the implementation of the Management Plan. The Unit also coordinates all stakeholders including the local Community Working Groups.

The Joint Secretariat for the Management of the Sultanate is chaired by the Sultan of Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat who is also the Governor of the Special Region of

Yogyakarta and is responsible for the overall strategic management of the property. All key government agencies responsible for the management of the property are included.

The Sultanate of the Ngayogyakarta Hadiningrat implements the Tata Rakiting Wewangunan traditional management system through an administrative structure called Tata Rakiting Paprentahan. This is led by the Sultan and consists of units run by the Abdi Dalem (Royal Courtiers). The Kraton is managed under this system.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Elaborating in more detail the implementation of the Historic Urban Landscape approach to the management of urban development pressures in Yogyakarta,
 - b) Augmenting the indicators for monitoring to include direct measures of the state of conservation of the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value,
 - c) Maintaining the moratorium on hotel development and ensuring its implementation within the buffer zone while completing the carrying capacity studies and creating a special regulation that will permanently prevent high rise development,
 - d) Continuing to implement the process for voluntary relocation of informal settlements within the property ensuring that the rights and needs of the communities are safeguarded,
 - e) Considering the possibilities for extending the boundary and buffer zone in some parts of the property in the future through minor boundary modification requests in order to aid the effectiveness of the management of urban development pressures,
 - f) Continuing the development of a Disaster Risk Management Plan for the property, including training for risk reduction and disaster responses,
 - g) Implementing the recently finalised heritage impact assessment guidelines, and ensuring that all major urban development, tourism and infrastructure projects that could impact on the property are communicated to the World Heritage Centre in line with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.40

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Defers</u> the examination of the nomination of **The Cultural Landscape of Masouleh**, **Islamic Republic of Iran**, in order to allow the State Party, with the advice of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, if requested, to reconsider the scope of the nomination and bring into focus the potential themes that might support a robust case for demonstrating potential Outstanding Universal Value, including where needed through the reconfiguration of the nominated property;
- 3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Involve communities in the management of the nominated property, including the monitoring, conservation and decision-making processes,
 - b) Present a clear socio-economic development strategy to ensure that tourism does not erode the current socio-economic fabric of the nominated property and further benefits local communities;
- 4. <u>Encourages</u> the State Party to invite an Advisory Mission to support the State Party in reconfiguring the proposed nomination.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.41

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Ancient Town of Si Thep, Thailand**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (ii)** and **(iii)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Ancient Town of Si Thep is a serial property of three component parts that represent Dvaravati culture from the 6th to the 10th centuries, an important phase in the history of Southeast Asia. The component parts are the unique twin-town lay-out of the Ancient Town of Si Thep (component part 001), featuring Muang Nai (Inner Town) and Muang Nok (Outer Town) surrounded by moats; Khao Klang Nok ancient monument (component part 002), the largest surviving Dvaravati monument; and, the Khao Thamorrat Cave ancient monument (component part 003), a unique Mahayana Buddhist cave monastery that contains important examples of Dvaravati art and sculpture.

More than 112 significant monastery sites have been identified at Si Thep, and the local adaptation of Hindu artistic traditions resulted in a distinctive artistic tradition known as the Si Thep School of Art which later influenced other civilisations in Southeast Asia. The round-relief sculpture without a back-support arch in the standing Tribhanga posture, depicting body movement, is especially distinctive.

Together these sites represent the architecture, artistic traditions and religious diversity of the Dvaravati Empire that thrived in Central Thailand from the 6th to the 10th centuries, demonstrating the influences from India including Hinduism, and Theravada and Mahayana Buddhism.

Criterion (ii): The Ancient Town of Si Thep demonstrates important interchanges of cultural and religious traditions that originated in India and were adapted by the Dvaravati Empire between the 6th and 10th centuries. Through these interactions, the town developed a distinctive identity expressed in its artistic and architectural traditions. The Si Thep School of Art subsequently influenced the art and architecture of other areas in Thailand. The cohabitation of Theravada and Mahayana Buddhism and Hinduism is a distinctive characteristic of Dvaravati architecture, town planning and art, and these are demonstrated by the three component parts.

Criterion (iii): The Ancient Town of Si Thep, the Khao Klang Nok ancient monument and the Khao Thamorrat Cave ancient monument bear an exceptional testimony to the Dvaravati culture and civilisation. Together, these sites demonstrate the complexity and the specific artistic and cultural characteristics of the Dvaravati period in terms of urban planning, religious architecture, and monasticism. The architectural and artistic forms of Si Thep are not found elsewhere, particularly the unique twin-town lay-out, and distinctive Dvaravati forms of sculpture such as the standing Tribhanga posture depicting body movement. The Khao Klang Nok ancient monument is the largest monument of Dvaravati art, influenced by South Indian and Indonesian artistic traditions; and the Khao Thamorrat Cave ancient monument is located in a sacred mountain and the only known cave monastery in Mahayana Buddhism in Southeast Asia.

Integrity

The three component parts contain all the attributes necessary to convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. The serial approach is justified, and the property presents a comprehensive understanding of the layout, planning, water infrastructure, various layers of inhabitation and evidence of the Dvaravati city and associated monuments. The

attributes of the serial property have a good state of conservation and there are few pressures impacting on the sites and their wider setting.

Authenticity

The authenticity of The Ancient Town of Si Thep is demonstrated by the richness of its archaeological structures and materials including rare and distinctive Dvaravati artistic elements. Khao Klang Nok ancient monument conveys Dvaravati cosmological beliefs, and features Dvaravati architectural forms of the indented corners system, the Bua Valai base and replica Prasats for the building base decoration. Archaeological recording and continuing research are important contributors to the authenticity of the property. Repairs and other conservation interventions have been sensitively completed, and any new materials are clearly indicated as such. The sites are relatively free from development pressures.

Protection and management requirements

Legal protection for the three component parts is provided by the Act on Ancient Monuments, Antiques, Objects of Art and National Museums, B.E.2504 (1961) and its Amended Act (No.2), B.E.2535 (1992). The buffer zones are protected under the National Reserved Forest Act, B.E.2507 (1964), the Agricultural Land Reform Act, B.E.2518 (1975), and the Ministerial Regulation regarding the Enforcement of Unitary Town Plan of Phetchabun Province, B.E.2560 (2017).

A management plan is being finalised. It includes a community engagement plan, a sustainable tourism plan, and risk management. The long-term engagement and support of local communities is a key element of the protection and management of the serial property. The Memorandum of Understanding agreed by government agencies will ensure the implementation of conservation measures and ongoing community engagement.

There are few factors affecting the property at present, although it is vulnerable to climate impacts, extreme weather events and the potential loss of community support. Unlawful excavations and development pressures posed threats to the property in the past, but these are no longer current. The monitoring system should be enhanced in relation to changes in ground water, and to development of indicators which more directly measure the state of conservation of the attributes.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Finalising as a priority the Management Plan for the Conservation and Development of the Ancient Town of Si Thep, including fully developed plans for risk management and sustainable tourism, the archaeological research strategy, and more detailed policies and actions for each of the three component parts,
 - b) Implementing, as a high priority, co-designed strategies for community engagement which are inclusive, transparent, ongoing, and well-resourced, and ensuring that the boundaries of the component parts are clearly explained to the local communities,
 - c) Continuing the negotiations with private landowners regarding the future extension to the boundary of component part 002 to incorporate all key elements of the monument through the procedure of minor boundary modification,
 - d) Enhancing the documentation of the attributes of the property using a digital platform that could facilitate more efficient means of storing and retrieving data,
 - e) Implementing planned research to more fully understand the layout and history of the property, particularly in relation to the non-invasive archaeological exploration of the Outer Town (component part 001), and research to determine the full extent and spatial layout of component part 002,

- f) Establishing future research projects to deepen the understanding of how Buddhist and Hindu traditions have influenced the residential patterns, street alignments, location of official buildings in the town, as well as a stronger sense of how the attributes demonstrate the founding, rise, and decline of the Dvaravati period,
- g) Enhancing the monitoring system by introducing measures of the state of conservation of the attributes, ensuring that the impacts of changes in ground water levels on the attributes of Si Thep are regularly monitored, and adapting the monitoring system for easy integration of the outcomes into the Periodic Reporting questionnaire.
- h) Developing formal processes for Heritage Impact Assessment utilising the Guidance and Toolkit for Impact Assessments in a World Heritage Context prepared by the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre,
- i) Ensuring that all new developments, including the plans for a visitor centre for component part 002, and a future museum in the buffer zone of component parts 001 and 002 are the subject of a full Heritage Impact Assessment,
- j) Ensuring that new oil drilling projects are strictly prohibited in the property and its buffer zones, and in the wider setting, particularly the area that lies between the buffer zones.
- k) Ensuring that the future uses and developments within the wider setting take into account the symbolic connection and physical alignment between component parts 002 and 003:
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session;
- 6. <u>Decides</u> that the name of the property be changed to "The Ancient Town of Si Thep and its Associated Dyaravati Monuments".

E.4 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

E.4.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.42

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route, Azerbaijan, on the World Heritage List as a cultural landscape, on the basis of criteria (iii) and (v);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route is a continuing cultural landscape comprised of the high-mountain Khinalig village in northern Azerbaijan, high-altitude summer pastures and agricultural terraces in the Greater Caucasus Mountains, winter pastures in the lowland plains in central Azerbaijan, and the connecting 200-kilometre-long seasonal transhumance route called Köç Yolu ("Migration")

Route"). The village of Khinalig is home to the semi-nomadic Khinalig people, whose culture and lifestyle are defined by the seasonal vertical migration between summer (yaylaqs) and winter (qishlaqs) pastures, and who retain the ancient way of long-distance vertical transhumance. The organically evolved network of ancient routes, land-use features, temporary pastures and camping sites, irrigation systems, springs and wells, mausoleums, mosques, cemeteries, bridges, and infrastructure for animal husbandry illustrate a sustainable eco-social system adapted to extreme and diverse environmental conditions that has served to build and retain transhumance as the dominant economy.

Criterion (iii): The Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route is an exceptional living testimony to the long-distance vertical transhumance cultural tradition of the Khinalig people, a tradition of communal transhumance in the Caucasus geo-cultural region. The property demonstrates a significant degree of preservation of its ancestral semi-nomadic eco-social system.

Criterion (v): The Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route is an outstanding example of a long-standing traditional and sustainable land use that reflects the semi-nomadic Khinalig transhumance culture and lifestyle. Animal husbandry remains the dominant economy, though a highly vulnerable one. The range of physical features across a great diversity of landscapes illustrates an adaptation to extreme environmental conditions and the resilience of semi-nomadic socio-economic structures based on the sustainable use of natural resources.

Integrity

All the attributes necessary to convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the property are located within its boundaries. These attributes include the village of Khinalig, its surrounding landscape of summer pastures, agricultural terraces, and related infrastructure, and the network of ancient routes, traditional irrigation systems, places of worship, and archaeological sites. The attributes also include the architectural and infrastructural elements of the Köç Yolu route, the winter pastures and their infrastructure, and intangible attributes such as the collective planning, organisation, and implementation of transhumance practices, as manifested in architectural, infrastructural, and landscape elements, that are of vital importance for the practice of transhumance by the Khinalig people. The property is of adequate size to ensure the complete representation of the features and processes that convey its significance. It is highly vulnerable to the adverse effects of development and neglect.

Authenticity

The Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route is authentic in terms of its forms and designs, materials and substance, uses and functions, locations and settings, traditions and management systems, and language and other forms of intangible heritage. While some changes have had an impact on the authenticity of the forms and designs, materials and substance, and uses and functions of some parts of the property, the key attributes are largely authentic and convey the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. The socio-spatial organisation of communal transhumance remains authentic despite a previous socio-economic reorganisation; traditions of semi-nomadic communal life remain effective, and the Council of Elders continues to act as an informal self-governing body in charge of collective affairs such as the seasonal migration, turns for grazing, and shared use of water and pastures.

Protection and management requirements

Most of the property is protected at the highest level under the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan and its normative laws such as the Law on Culture, the Law on Preservation of Historical and Cultural Monuments, and the Law on the Veterinary Control (for animal herding). Presidential Decrees and Decisions by the Cabinet of Ministers also play a role in protecting the cultural and natural heritage. A protective

designation for the entire property through a single protected Reserve is being achieved by means of a Presidential Order. In addition to the legal protection instruments, there are traditional mechanisms for protecting and safeguarding the tangible and intangible aspects of the property.

The property and its buffer zone are under the ownership of diverse public and private entities. The majority of the summer pastures, all the winter pastures, and the Köç Yolu transhumance route are owned by the State. The management system involves the Ministry of Culture, the State Tourism Agency and its subordinate Reserves Management Center, and the Khinalig Reserve. A new management entity for the property and its buffer zone will incorporate relevant sectoral government agencies, local governments, and local communities within a single participatory, cross-sectoral management framework. The management plan needs to be implemented. Its objectives and action plan are structured around the key aspects of the property, including the transhumance, land use, and intangible heritage. The existing informal communal management by the Council of Elders is planned to be integrated within the new management and coordination framework.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Ensuring that all the key attributes of the entire property, including the cultural values of the semi-nomadic communal transhumance, benefit from the highest level of protection, through the implementation of the single protected Reserve,
 - b) Approving and making operational the new management entity planned for the property and its buffer zone, and refining, approving, and implementing the management plan,
 - c) Revising the Restoration Manual adopted in 2022 to ensure that it properly addresses the authenticity of forms and designs within the property and is fully compatible with international scientific principles and practices,
 - d) Completing the elaboration of the Conservation Master Plan for the property as a whole, and the conservation plans for each monument.
 - e) Ensuring that new developments and infrastructure projects in the property and buffer zone are designed and built with adequate consideration of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, on the basis of detailed spatial planning and decision-making tools such as local/regional land-use plans, Environmental Impact Assessments, and Heritage Impact Assessments,
 - f) Determining scientifically the carrying capacity of the property in order to guide and manage the limits for tourism and to help sustain the traditional livelihoods of the Khinalig people,
 - g) Completing the cadastral information for the entire property and marking the boundaries on the ground,
 - h) Completing the inventory and documentation of the property,
 - Developing a monitoring system that includes adequate assessment of all the key attributes, acknowledgement of key threats, and delivery of outcomes that can inform management;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.43

The nomination of the Alpine and pre-alpine meadows, pastures and wetlands in the Ammergau, the Lake Staffelsee Area and the Werdenfelser Land, Germany, was withdrawn at the request of the State Party.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.44

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Koninklijk Eise Eisinga Planetarium (Royal Eise Eisinga Planetarium), Netherlands**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (iv)**:
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located in a modest house within the historic centre of Franeker, the Koninklijk Eise Eisinga Planetarium (Royal Eise Eisinga Planetarium) is the oldest continuously operating planetarium (i.e. orrery) in the world. Built between 1774 and 1781, this accurately working model of our solar system provides an up-to-date and realistic image of the positions of the Sun, the Moon, the Earth and the five other planets that were known at the time (Mercury, Venus, Mars, Jupiter and Saturn).

Conceived and largely built by an ordinary citizen – the wool manufacturer Eise Eisinga – the planetarium mechanism is ingeniously built into the ceiling and the closet-bed wall of the living room. Doing this made it possible to build a large orrery and to use the room beneath it as a reception and presentation area – just as in modern planetariums. To this day, it is open to the public and used as an educational centre dedicated to astronomy.

The fact that the mechanism is still in working order is evidence of the ingenuity and foresight of its maker, who left detailed instructions for its maintenance.

Criterion (iv): The Koninklijk Eise Eisinga Planetarium (Royal Eise Eisinga Planetarium) is an outstanding example of an 18th-century orrery, representing exceptional creativity in its technical design and execution. The orrery provides an up-to-date and realistic image of the positions of the Sun, the Moon, the Earth and the five other planets that were known at the time. The planetarium mechanism is ingeniously attached to the original beam construction of the house, which was specially adapted for this purpose. In operation almost continuously since 1781, it consists of simple but robust components, such as wooden hoops and discs, and iron pins. As a technological ensemble, it continues to contribute to the dissemination of astronomical knowledge, and in particular to the understanding of the heliocentric model of the Universe. The property is also associated with the transfer of scientific knowledge to a wider audience in 18th-century society.

Integrity

The property includes all constituent elements of the mechanical planetarium, including those that allow its functioning as well those associated with its presentation and the building in which it is located and to which the planetarium mechanism is inextricably linked. This 18th-century depiction of the solar system fills the entire ceiling of the former living room/bedroom of Eise Eisinga. The planets hang like wooden balls from metal rods that protrude through the slots in the ceiling. The mezzanine space above the ceiling houses the pendulum clock and the cogwheels. Despite being made of ordinary materials, such as wood, the mechanism is still in full use and continues to work

according to its original design. Thanks to a very strict maintenance regime, almost all the original parts have been preserved.

Authenticity

In operation almost continuously since 1781, the planetarium instrument has retained a high level of authenticity. Aside from necessary repairs, the various components of the instrument have remained unchanged since its completion. Two important sources of information help confirm the authenticity of the property: the first complete description of it, published in 1780 by Franeker University professor Jean Henri van Swinden; and the description and maintenance instructions left by Eise Eisinga in 1784. The almost complete series of guest books that have been kept from the very beginning also attest to its educational significance.

Protection and management requirements

The planetarium building has been designated as a national monument since 1967. In addition, the property bears the blue and white shield, the international distinguishing mark to identify cultural heritage properties protected by the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict.

The property and its buffer zone are part of the larger protected cityscape of the inner city of Franeker. The protection of this area falls under the Environment and Planning Act. World Heritage occupies a special state-controlled position under this Act. The State provides mandatory instruction rules for provinces and municipalities in order to regulate matters in their environmental ordinances or environmental plans. All the rules relating to the living environment are included in the environmental plan. This concerns a balanced allocation of functions to locations (comparable to the current designations), as well as rules in respect of activities with consequences for the living environment.

Since 2001, the management of the planetarium has been in the hands of the Royal Eise Eisinga Planetarium Foundation. The board of the foundation consists of five members from scientific fields (University of Groningen and scientific journalism), the financial sector (accountancy) and local representatives. The day-to-day business is carried out by a managing director and nine employees. The municipality of Waadhoeke has a structural subsidy relationship with the planetarium.

Since it came into operation in 1781, maintenance of the planetarium instrument has taken place on the basis of the instructions of its maker. Approximately every twelve to fifteen years, the planetarium mechanism undergoes major maintenance. In addition, the cogwheels are cleaned, lubricated and waxed annually. All this work is carried out by regional professionals, under the supervision of the curator. Because the property consists mainly of wooden parts, these are checked every two years for the presence of woodworm and longhorn beetle.

4. <u>Decides</u> that the name of the property be changed to "Eisinga Planetarium in Franeker".

Decision: 45 COM 8B.45

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University, Russian Federation**, on the World Heritage List, on the basis of **criteria (ii)** and **(iv)**;
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University is a facility consisting of two component parts: one of them is located in the historical centre of Kazan, the other, which is the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory, is located in a forested countryside area twenty-four kilometres west of the city.

World-class astronomical observatories in Kazan are an exceptional phenomenon for the East European Plain and Eurasia as a whole in the 19th century. Aimed at boosting scientific research and enhancing Eurasia's intercultural and scientific dialogue and bringing it to a new level, they have brilliantly fulfilled the historical mission of a bridge between the cultures of the West and the East, North and South, Europe and Asia. The development of astronomy in the observatories of Kazan university is a natural result of cultural and scientific synthesis, and intercultural dialogue of Eurasia.

The project of the university, including astronomical observatories, was initially international in its concept, ideas and human resources. The founder of Kazan Observatory Joseph Johann von Littrow represented the Austrian astronomical school. Russian scientists and visiting professors from Europe and Asia worked together in the same team. A doctor of philosophy at Jena University, the author of a two-volume translation of the "History of New Astronomy", a German mathematician Johann Christian Martin Bartels became the teacher of the outstanding mathematician, author of non-Euclidean geometry Nikolay Lobachevsky, and the famous astronomer, member of the round-the-world expedition that discovered the Antarctic, Ivan Simonov (both were rectors of Kazan University). Working together in observatories, representatives of the Austrian, Jewish, Polish, Russian, Tatar, Ukrainian, Czech and many other cultures mutually enriched astronomy with their knowledge and discoveries as well as introduced new traditions into intercultural communication.

The names of famous astronomers of Kazan University have been assigned to a number of astronomical objects (Lunar Crater Kovalskiy Marian Albertovich, Comet 1921 I Dubyago, Asteroid Martunov Dmitrij Yakovlevich, etc.).

The buildings of the observatories are unique examples of classical and neoclassical architecture combined with a technological ensemble which illustrates more than two centuries of human history. The Kazan observatories represent a unique architectural structure for its time period and are one of the first examples of buildings designed with the peculiarities of using astronomical instruments in mind. The sites have been preserved in integrity and authenticity and constitute a unified entity in architecture, as well as in research and educational process. Exceptional evidence of the evolution of optical astronomy in the world is a collection of authentic historical instruments, transferred, among other things, from Engelhardt's Dresden Observatory to the ownership of Kazan University thanks to close scientific ties and personal friendship of two outstanding scientists Dmitry Dubyago and Vasily Engelhardt. The collection contains the world's only and still functioning heliometer telescope. The site influenced the formation of similar complexes in Europe and the world, which determines its significance and testifies to its outstanding universal value.

Criterion (ii): The Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University are the examples of scientific and cultural space focused on step-by-step development, evolution and continuity in architecture, culture and astronomical research that demonstrate important changes in human values during the 19th – early 21st centuries, as well as changes in the cultural environment, technology, art, environmental design and city structure in this geo-cultural region and the whole world. They are the vivid evidence of the synthesis of scientific and cultural traditions, mutual influence of human values and the mutual enrichment of cultures.

Criterion (iv): The Observatories of Kazan Federal University are unique examples of classical and neoclassical buildings linked with the technological ensemble represented

by the set of instruments as well as the landscape aimed at astronomical research and discoveries; they illustrate more than 200 years of human history. The design and construction of Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University are the milestones in the development of European and world astronomical observatories. A special location within the ensemble of Kazan University, historic and cultural landscapes and unique architectural and planning solutions determine the uniqueness and characteristic features of their Outstanding Universal Value.

Integrity

The complex of Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University is an integral ensemble showcasing the development of astronomical science in the east of Russia.

The City Astronomical Observatory building has retained its integrity and original scientific function. The oldest building of the Littrow Observatory retains its original location on the edge of the hill, dimensions and structures and its historic facade looks towards the south-western horizon, just as it did 200 years ago.

The integrity of the Complex of Astronomical Observatories and the preservation of attributes expressing their Outstanding Universal Value are ensured by the established boundaries of the sites and their buffer zones. The boundaries of the urban and suburban astronomical observatories cover a sufficient area. The boundaries of the buffer zones are set to cover all important viewpoints and eliminate multi-storey construction, which could disrupt the visual perception of the sites. Thanks to protective measures that were undertaken in the 20th – early 21st centuries, which aimed at the presentation and popularization of astronomy as an important scientific discipline, as well as due to the world discoveries that were made in these buildings, the state of their preservation and the state of astronomical instruments are good. The preservation of the integrity of the observatories is facilitated by being a part of Kazan Federal University.

Including the city astronomical observatory and the suburban astronomical observatory in the serial nomination is due to the fact that each of them, in spite of having direct continuity, reflects a certain stage in the development of astronomy of the period of optical visual observations and their modern development within the framework of astrophysics, etc. Virtually these two observatories have represented, and represent, a single entity, both in architecture, scientific research, and in the educational process that takes place in the two locations.

Authenticity

The complex of the Observatory in Kazan and Engelhardt Observatory have a high degree of authenticity, as well as the preservation of the original forms, use and content of the sites. The scientific community has sufficient documentary evidence of the design, creation and condition of the monuments in different periods of their existence. The authentic instruments have been preserved intact; Kazan University scientists used this astronomic equipment in the 19th-20th centuries allowing them to carry out revolutionary observations and discoveries for their time. Without losing their uniqueness and relevance to this day, the instruments are still used for education, as well as for fundamental research and popularization of astronomy, space and the Universe.

In the building of Kazan City Astronomical Observatory, authentic cabinets and tables of the 19th century have been preserved; they were made by order specifically for Observatories; they contain a unique library of authentic books of the 19th - 20th centuries mostly in German, Russian, French and English; some books have survived in a single copy. Moreover, journals of observations compiled by Kazan scientists starting from 1814 are kept there too. The pavilions with the telescopes are in good condition; the mechanism opening the shutters for observation and rotating the telescope is in good order.

The architectural monuments of both Observatories underwent conservation and maintenance. A museum on the history of Kazan Astronomical School was established in the building of Engelhardt Observatory. The attributes inherent in the complex of the astronomical observatories, including form and design, building materials and substances, use and function, location and environment, etc., are ensured by meeting the necessary requirements for conservation and maintenance. The degree of management of the buildings of Kazan City Astronomical Observatory and Engelhardt Observatory inscribes it in the historical urban landscape, they are a part of the ensemble of Kazan University and the naturally developing landscape with forest surroundings.

Protection and management requirements

The Astronomical Observatories of Kazan University are legally protected in accordance with the Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the RSFSR No. 1327 dated August 30, 1960 and the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan No.318 dated June 4, 2001. The City Observatory is located within the territory of Kazan State University, the cultural heritage site of federal significance, and within the protective zone of Kazan Kremlin ensemble, which covers the main part of the historical centre, in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation No. 845 of July 28, 2020 and the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan of August 20, 2020 No. 715. The protection zones of Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory, land use regulations and requirements for urban planning rules are established by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan dated 24.11.2022 No. 1258. All regimes and restrictions that prohibit and restrict construction and reconstruction in terms of height, and establish the requirements for the roof pitch, the use of traditional finishing materials, landscaping and gardening within the buffer zone of the nominated property and beyond, came into force from the date of signing of the resolution.

The legal and institutional framework for effective protection and management of the facility is established by legal and regulatory acts of the Russian Federation and the Republic of Tatarstan. The status of the monuments of federal significance, which are under state protection, and a particularly valuable site of the cultural heritage of the peoples of the Russian Federation, made it possible to preserve the Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University in good condition. To preserve the attributes of the Observatories and their historical and cultural surroundings, buffer zones have been allocated.

The property is managed and operates on the basis of the stakeholder interaction system enshrined in the Management Plan in accordance with the Strategy for the Conservation and Use of Astronomical Observatory Complexes of Kazan University designed for a period up to 2043. The site management focuses on preservation, scientific conservation and study of the Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University, organization of museum affairs, harmonious combination of academic and educational activities and tourist guiding, effective risk management, interaction with the local community in order to preserve all the characteristics of the site, its integrity and authenticity.

In order to prevent possible threats and provide safety of the Astronomical Observatories, when planning any new projects within the boundaries of the buffer zone, a thorough analysis and impact assessment on the Outstanding Universal Value of the site is carried out. The legal framework, and the strategy and philosophy of the Management Plan have been thoroughly developed. Mechanisms for heritage impact assessment and risk management are put in place.

Buffer zones, Management Plan, General Plan of Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory have been approved and relevant funding has been provided.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Ensuring the application of the approved Management Plan for the Astronomical Observatories of KFU for the long- and medium-term and implementing policies and programmes for the preservation of the property and its Outstanding Universal Value, as well as the Master Plan for the Conservation and Use of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory, provided with appropriate funding and scientific and organizational measures;
 - b) Implementing at the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory (component part 002) a Heritage Impact Assessment of all proposals, related to the regeneration of the approved buffer zone, as well as controlling the possible impact of the development of settlements (Oktybarsky and Orekhovka villages), Novaya Tura Technopolis, and their urban planning documentation,
 - c) Providing information on the legal status of the two approved buffer zones;
- 5. <u>Invites</u> the State Party in cooperation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to actively participate and contribute to programmatic activities of the Thematic Initiative "Astronomy and World Heritage" to enhance scientific research and capacity building on this matter, and to raise the visibility of the Initiative, relevant properties and the sites related to astronomy;
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation on the above-mentioned recommendations for review by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.46

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the **Medieval Mosques of Anatolia with Wooden Posts and Upper Structure**, **Türkiye**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria** (ii) and (iv);
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The nominated serial property is comprised of five hypostyle mosques built in Anatolia between the late 13th and mid-14th centuries, each of which is located in a different province of present-day Türkiye, as well as a number of associated buildings and a small graveyard. The components include the Great Mosque of Afyon (1272-77), the Great Mosque of Sivrihisar (1274-75) in Eskişehir; Ahi Şerefettin (Aslanhane) Mosque in Ankara (1289-90), the Eşrefoğlu Mosque of Beyşehir in Konya (1296-99), and the Mahmut Bey Mosque (1366-7) of Kasabaköyü in Kastamonu.

The unusual structural system of the mosques combines an exterior building envelope built of masonry with multiple rows of wooden interior columns ("hypostyle") that support a flat wooden ceiling and the roof. These mosques are known for the skilful woodcarving and workmanship used in their structures, architectural fittings, and furnishings. Some of them have an outstanding example of the late 13th century minbars with the tongue-and-groove construction (kündekari) technique They also bear inscriptions giving the names and titles of the craftsmen who made them as carpenter (neccar or derüdger) or decorator (nakkaş). The construction of these mosques, five of which have been selected as the best representatives of the wooden hypostyle mosques of medieval Anatolia, can be linked to the Mongol invasions of this area in the 1240s and the subsequent immigration of Central Asian craftspeople knowledgeable about wooden construction

technology and possessing excellent woodworking skills, coupled with the driving forces from powerful political figures in the Anatolia region.

Criterion (ii): The selected five mosques with wooden posts and a timber ceiling are significant evidence for the interchange of ideas and practices regarding a building type with a specific wooden construction that originated in the early Islamic period in the Arabian Peninsula and Central Asia, and transmitted to Anatolia during the medieval period. The nominated property exerted considerable influence in large areas of Anatolia from the 14th to early 20th centuries.

Criterion (iv): The selected five mosques are the surviving representatives the hypostyle type mosques built in a unique wooden structure where the original timber ceilings composed of wooden beams running perpendicular and/or parallel to the kıbla wall, is carried by wooden columns that have capitals either with wooden muqarnas shells or marble (spolia). As a specific group, they testify an important historical period of medieval Anatolian architecture which illustrates expertise in timber construction techniques, use of wood as structural element, decorating style of interior, woodcarvings, and artworks.

Integrity

The serial property composed of five component parts contains all the necessary attributes that can reflect the architectural style, construction techniques, cultural traditions, workmanships and aesthetics of a major type of mosque that developed in the history of Islamic architecture. The unique timber construction system, wooden architectural elements and decorations; the form and design of its components, traditional historic settings where the components are located and historic cultural and social relations and the functions have been well preserved and all these are included within the boundaries of the nominated property. The form and structural design of each individual component of the nominated property is largely intact. As each component of the property is located within whether urban sites (designated historic conservation zones) or delineated conservation areas their setting as well as visual integrity with their environs are well preserved. Furthermore, all the components of the nominated property have a designated buffer zone which comprises a wider setting of each component and important views in order to sustain the relations and values of the site. Restrictions for new developments have been determined within the buffer zones of each component of the nominated property with the conservation plans. Besides the components of the nominated property are protected by a strict regime of maintenance and control, derived from extensive statutory protection.

Authenticity

Each component of the property retains a high degree of authenticity in terms of form and design, materials and substance, use and function, spirit and feeling, traditions and management system, location and setting. The mosques retain their original layout together with the valid contributions of later periods. The most important intervention to the form and design of the components were carried out during 1940's and 1950's. Due to difficulty of implementations such as periodic maintenance and repair, renovation, rainwater isolation and drainage in practice, and extra load they put on the structure, form and materials of the authentic flat earthen roof of each component have been modified with restorations and changed with pitched roof covered with copper, lead and tile sheeting on the exterior. Most of the architectural elements of the monuments preserve their authenticity. Hence, they reflect examples of traditional material, craftmanship and technique of their period. Each component has maintained its original function since its construction date, and prayer services are conducted regularly. Each component has spiritual and intangible values not only for the local people but also for the wider public. Hence the property retains high degree of authenticity in spirit and feeling of the place.

Protection and management requirements

All nominated components are protected under the most fundamental law concerning protection in Turkey, Law on the Conservation of Cultural and Natural Properties numbered 2863 and dated 1983. Except for Mahmut Bey Mosque in Kastamonu, all mosques and their buffer zones are located within the boundaries of an "urban site". The proposed mosques are also protected by Foundations Law No. 5737, which was amended and entered into force in 2008. All projects and implementations related to foundation properties are carried out by Regional Directorates for Foundations. The sites have also proper conservation and management mechanisms which ensured its protection for decades. A site manager was appointed in order to coordinate the necessary works defined in management plan in order to protect, enhance and promote not only the properties but also the wider setting. Also, advisory boards and coordination and supervision boards comprising the representative of the local people, academicians, NGO's, local authorities and conservation authorities were established.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Completing the establishment of the sub-working groups within the scope of the management plan,
 - Completing the Heritage Impact Assessment Report of the cable car project near the Afyonkarahisar Ulu Mosque and submitting it to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS,
 - c) Completing the comprehensive risk management plan for the serial property as a whole,
 - d) Developing a maintenance manual based on internationally accepted conservation principles,
 - e) Updating the outdated conservation plans of the component parts,
 - f) Implementing the tourism-related actions described in the management plan,
 - g) Developing a set of indicators to assess the effectiveness of the outcomes of implementing the management plan of the property;
 - h) Controlling the factors that affect the property and, in particular, immediately addressing the threats common to all five component parts, including fire, insects, moisture, and deterioration of the settings,
 - Undertaking comprehensive documentation of all the mosques following a common standard, with the outcomes to be used as the baseline information for monitoring and management,
 - j) Building capacity for maintenance and monitoring staff,
 - k) Conserving the dismantled original pieces in safe storage for research and reference,
 - I) Improving the current monitoring system by establishing the links between the monitoring outcomes and responsive actions;
- 5. <u>Decides</u> that the name of the property be changed to "Wooden Hypostyle Mosques of Medieval Anatolia";
- 6. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.47

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks, United States of America**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (i)** and **(iii)**;
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Value:

Brief synthesis

Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks is a series of eight monumental earthen enclosure complexes built between 2,000 and 1,600 years ago along the central tributaries of the Ohio River in east-central North America. They are the most representative surviving expressions of the Indigenous tradition now referred to as the Hopewell culture. Their scale and complexity are evidenced in precise geometric figures as well as hilltops sculpted to enclose vast, level plazas. Huge earthen squares, circles, and octagons are executed with a precision of form, technique, and dimension consistently deployed across a wide geographic region. There are alignments with the cycles of the Sun and the far more complex cycles of the Moon. These earthworks served as ceremonial centres, built by dispersed, non-hierarchical groups whose way of life was supported by a mix of foraging and farming. The sites were the centre of a continent-wide sphere of influence and interaction, and have yielded finely crafted ritual objects fashioned from exotic raw materials obtained from distant places.

Criterion (i): Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks comprises highly complex masterpieces of landscape architecture. They are exceptional amongst ancient earthworks worldwide not only in their enormous scale and wide geographic distribution, but also in their geometric precision. These features imply high-precision techniques of design and construction and an observational knowledge of complex astronomical cycles that would have required generations to codify. The series includes the finest extant examples of these various principles, shapes, and alignments, both in geometric earthworks and in the pre-eminent surviving hilltop enclosure. They reflect the pinnacle of Hopewell intellectual, technical, and symbolic achievement.

Criterion (iii): Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks bears exceptional testimony to the unique characteristics of their builders, who lived in small, dispersed, egalitarian groups, between 1 and 400 CE, amongst the river valleys of what is now southern and central Ohio. Their economy was a mix of foraging, fishing, farming, and cultivation, yet they gathered periodically to create, manage, and worship within these massive public works. The precision of their carefully composed earthen architecture, and its timber precursors, reflected an elaborate ceremonialism and linked it with the order and rhythms of the cosmos. The earthworks in this series, together with their archaeological remains, offer the finest extant testimony to the nature, scope, and richness of the Hopewell cultural tradition.

Integrity

All the attributes necessary to convey and sustain the Outstanding Universal Value are in the boundaries of the serial property. These include the earthwork walls, gateways, ditches, ponds, and in situ archaeological remains. The series is of sufficient size to ensure the complete representation of the features and values that convey the significance of the property, through the inclusion of the largest and best-preserved examples of each major geometric form found amongst Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks, as well as the most important hilltop enclosure. In addition, all the component parts are complete and in good condition, with the ability to convey their large forms and the relationships amongst them. The property does not suffer from adverse

effects of development and/or neglect, as each site is managed as a public park in rural or low-density suburban settings. The curated artefacts in site-based collections also support the understanding of the attributes.

Authenticity

Hopewell Ceremonial Earthworks is authentic to an extraordinary extent, given the long time that has elapsed since its construction, in terms of their locations and settings, forms and designs, materials and substance, and spirit and feeling. The locations for all the component parts are unchanged; the settings for the earthworks are still predominantly semirural or are in low-density residential districts buffered for most of their perimeters by parkland. In form and design, the enclosure walls and mounds remain mostly intact. High-resolution remote-sensing data for the Seip Earthworks, Hopewell Mound Group, Hopeton Earthworks, and High Bank Works component parts clearly show intact subsurface portions of wall and building constructions. The predominant materials and substance of the earthworks are likewise authentically preserved in the intact forms of Fort Ancient and the component parts at the Newark Earthworks complex, and in the in situ archaeological remains at all the other sites.

Protection and management requirements

All the component parts are protected as national or State parks. Rigorous federal, state, and local protective measures are also in place to ensure the continued conservation and protection of the property. The buffer zones provide additional protection around the component parts.

Detailed management plans are in place for all eight component parts, following the established policies and legal requirements of their respective governmental owner agencies, the Ohio History Connection and the United States National Park Service, whose local representatives work closely together to provide consistent and coordinated management for the series. All features and elements within the boundaries of the property are closely monitored on a regular basis by professional expert staff from the two owner agencies. Regular maintenance and periodic conservation programmes ensure that the sites, features, and resources will be sustained in a superior state of conservation in the future.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Ensuring the acquisition by Ohio History Connection of the Octagon Earthworks leasehold from the Moundbuilders Country Club following the Ohio Supreme Court ruling issued in December 2022, and creating conditions to increase public access to the site.
 - b) Ensuring the coordinated management of the separate component parts of the serial property,
 - c) Adding to the Cooperative Agreement a commitment to protect and conserve the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value,
 - d) Furthering the inclusion of local and Indigenous communities in the management and decision-making processes at the property,
 - e) Elaborating an overarching research plan for the property,
 - f) Implementing the Long Range Interpretive Plan that will include information explaining the various alterations done to the earthworks as a result of the numerous changes caused by secondary uses and restorations, in order to facilitate a correct understanding of the public visiting the property,
 - g) Elaborating a carrying capacity study for all component parts of the property,

- h) Acquiring from willing sellers any privately-owned parcels of land in the buffer zones that include parts of the earthworks, followed by adjustments to the boundaries of the property through requests for minor boundary modifications,
- i) Making efforts to resolve the issues associated with non-conforming elements and uses such as high-voltage transmission towers and gravel extraction,
- j) Including Heritage Impact Assessment mechanisms and risk management provisions in the management system,
- k) Facilitating more research and deliberation on the astronomical alignments of the property.

E.4.2 Significant boundary modifications of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Decision: 45 COM 8B.48

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the significant boundary modification of the **Historic Centre of Guimarães** to include the **Couros Zone**, and become the **Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone**, **Portugal**, on the basis of **criteria (ii)**, (iii) and (iv);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Founded in the 10th century CE, the Historic Centre of Guimarães became the first capital of Portugal in the 12th century. Its historic centre, including its extra muros area known as the Couros Zone, is an extremely well-preserved and authentic example of the evolution of a medieval settlement into a modern town, its rich building typology exemplifying the specific development of Portuguese architecture from the 15th to the 19th centuries through the consistent use of traditional building materials and techniques. This variety of different building types documents the responses to the evolving needs of the community, both for residential and proto-industrial purposes. There was developed a particular type of construction in the Middle Ages featuring a ground floor in granite with a half-timbered structure above. This technique was transmitted to Portuguese colonies in Africa and the New World, becoming their characteristic feature.

The Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone is distinguished in particular for the integrity of its historically authentic building stock. Examples from the period from 950 to 1498 include the two poles around which intra muros Guimarães initially developed; the castle in the north and the monastic complex in the south. The town expanded extra muros around the Franciscan and Dominican monastic complexes. The period from 1498 to 1693 is characterised by the building of grand houses, the development of civic facilities and the layout of city squares. While there have been some changes during the modern era, the Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone have maintained their medieval urban layout. The continuity in traditional technology, the maintenance and gradual change have contributed to an exceptionally harmonious townscape.

Criterion (ii): Guimarães, with its proto-industrial Couros Zone, is of considerable universal significance due to the fact that specialised building techniques developed

there in the Middle Ages were transmitted to Portuguese colonies in Africa and the New World, becoming a characteristic feature.

Criterion (iii): The early history of Guimarães is closely associated with the establishment of Portuguese national identity and language in the 12th century. The Couros Zone bears witness to the wealth that independence brought to Guimarães and that made possible its continuous and harmonious urban and architectural development until the end of the 19th century.

Criterion (iv): The Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone is an exceptionally well-preserved town that illustrates the evolution of particular building types from the medieval settlement to the present-day city, and particularly in the 15th–19th centuries.

Integrity

The boundaries of the Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone encompass all the elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value, including a particular type of construction developed in the Middle Ages using granite combined with a timber-framed structure, and a well-preserved historic building stock that represents the evolution of building typologies from the Middle Ages to the 19th century. This development is documented in the rich variety of different building types that have responded to the evolving needs of the community for residential and production purposes. The Historic Centre of Guimarães does not suffer unduly from adverse effects of development and/or neglect, whilst the Couros Zone needs an urgent conservation and rehabilitation strategy. Development pressures and gentrification related to tourism pressures may undermine, over time, the integrity of the property.

Authenticity

The Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone is authentic in terms of its location and setting, forms and designs, and materials and substances. It has succeeded in preserving its historic stratigraphy and territorial integrity. Different phases of development are well integrated into the layout of the property.

Protection and management requirements

The Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone is subject to several legal provisions regarding the protection of historic buildings, including Law No. 107/2001 of 8 September, Decree-Law No. 115/12 of 25 May, and Decree-Law No. 309/09 of 23 October, and to legal provisions regarding town planning, including Decree-Law No. 38 382 of 7 August 1951, Decree-Law No. 555/99 of 16 December, Decree-Law No. 307/2009 of 23 October. Its master plan, which dates from 1994, revised in 2015, includes regulations for the protection of the historic centre. The Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone includes nineteen properties that are legally protected as National Monuments (ten) or as properties of Public Interest (nine), according to the Portuguese Law on the Protection of Historic Monuments. Apart from some State-owned properties, most of the building stock is privately owned. The public areas of the historic centre are the property of the Municipality of Guimarães.

Parts of the buffer zone established for the property and its extension remain outside the protection zone. Whilst norms for the protection of the historic centre exist and a designation as National Monument is about to be approved for the Historic Centre of Guimarães and the Couros Zone, these have not been established for the buffer zone.

Management of the historic centre is the responsibility of the Municipal Division for the World Heritage and Listed Properties (DPMBC). Any intervention related to listed buildings is under the control of the Directorate General for Cultural Heritage (DGPC). Sustaining the Outstanding Universal Value of the property over time will require preparing, approving, and implementing the required norms and regulations for the extended property and buffer zone based on the attributes of Outstanding Universal

Value. A Heritage Impact Assessment approach integrated into urban planning, and the rehabilitation strategy for the Couros Zone are essential for safeguarding the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value in the highly dynamic urban environment of Guimarães.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Finalising the protection of the Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone as a National Monument as soon as possible,
 - b) Finalising the definition of the expanded buffer zone and the related set of protection mechanisms as soon as possible,
 - c) Preparing individual Heritage Impact Assessments for the planned projects within the extension, the buffer zone and the wider setting to assess whether they have any negative impacts on the attributes supporting the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and its extension,
 - d) Preparing a comprehensive Heritage Impact Assessment in the framework of the revision of the Plano Diretor Municipal (Municipal Master Plan), to assess the cumulative impacts of all approved, ongoing and planned projects, to determine whether limits to change that can be absorbed by the extension and the property without negative impacts on Outstanding Universal Value have been reached, to guide future planning previsions,
 - e) Finalising the regulations related to the management of the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value and linked to the Plano Diretor Municipal (Municipal Master Plan),
 - f) Completing the inventory of sightlines and the landscape legibility plan, complemented by a co-visibility study to guide development in the wider setting,
 - g) Monitoring development pressures and gentrification related to tourism-related pressures to preserve the integrity and the authenticity of the property,
 - h) Ensuring that a single vision guides the governance, coordination and collaboration of the agencies responsible for the property,
 - i) Encouraging the State Party to pursue its efforts in documenting the water management infrastructure,
 - j) Developing conservation, restoration and rehabilitation strategies for the tanneries,
 - k) Engaging residents, local communities and relevant rightsholders in the management process and in defining the future of the property and its extension through regular participatory processes;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

E.4.3 Nominations deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Decision: 45 COM 8B.49

The World Heritage Committee,

1. <u>Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1</u>,

- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **The Maison Carrée of Nîmes, France**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (iv)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located in the Occitanie region, The Maison Carrée of Nîmes is a pseudoperipteral hexastyle Corinthian-style temple erected in the 1st century CE in the forum of the Roman colony of Nemausus. It was dedicated to the prematurely deceased presumptive heirs of Augustus – Gaius and Lucius Caesar – who were accorded the title Princes of Youth (principes juventutis), through which the dynastic line of Augustus was sanctified and the edifice turned into a temple of imperial cult.

The strategic and symbolic position of the Maison Carrée in the forum in conjunction with other buildings that in the past hosted key political and religious institutions testify to the significance of the monument as a representation of the imperial authority of Rome in Nemausus and the protection of domus Augusta over the city and its citizens.

Through its architectural design that recalls key edifices from the Augustan period in Rome, and its symbolic decorative programme, the temple testifies to the moment of unification of the territory of Ancient Rome and the transition from republic to empire, which carried the promise of peace, prosperity and stability brought by Pax Romana.

Criterion (iv): The Maison Carrée is an early and one of the best-preserved examples of a Roman temple dedicated to the imperial cult in the Roman provinces that testifies to the period of Rome's transition from republic to empire, reflecting the political system and the imperial ideology that underlay the process of consolidation of the territory conquered by Ancient Rome in the hands of Augustus. Through the historical circumstances of its construction in the Roman colony of Nemausus, its ideological significance as a place of imperial cult, as well as the symbolic architectural and decorative programme, the edifice manifests the values brought to the Roman Empire by Pax Romana.

Integrity

The key elements necessary to express the property's Outstanding Universal Value are included within its boundary. The structural and decorative elements of the temple have survived in their original form or have been restored with great attention to detail. The cella of the temple has no original elements preserved. The historic setting of the property within the ensemble of the forum has changed due to the evolution of the urban fabric of Nîmes over the years.

Authenticity

Restorations that the temple has undergone since the 17th century helped the Maison Carrée to recover its original form without major structural changes and to preserve its decorative elements. All structural elements of the edifice are original, with the exception of the roofing, the ceiling of the pronaos, and the cella. The materials are still largely original or closely resemble the original local ones. The authenticity of the strategic setting of the Maison Carrée within the space of the ancient forum has been lost. It can be partly appreciated through the form and design of the place de la Maison Carrée, which was created with a view of imitating the historical context.

Protection and management requirements

The property is legally protected as a national historic monument through the Code du Patrimoine (art. L.621-1 to 33). Regulatory protective measures apply to the buffer zone through Site Patrimonial Remarquable mechanism under the Code du Patrimoine, and the relevant planning documents and special zoning restrictions developed under Code de l'Urbanisme and the Code de l'Environnement.

The management structure is based on a cooperation of city services and local and regional partners. Management of the property remains at the local level, in the hands of the municipality of Nîmes, and is executed in collaboration with the Direction Régionale des Affaires Culturelles; Direction Régionale de l'Environnement, de l'Aménagement et du Logement; and the Direction Départementale des Territoires. The Comité de Bien Maison Carrée Patrimoine Mondial de l'Unesco has been established as a decision-making organ, and a Technical Committee that relies on the competences of municipal divisions acts as its operational body.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - Developing and implementing a Heritage Impact Assessment for development proposals, such as the project of pedestrianisation of rue Auguste or the redirection of traffic from boulevard Alphonse-Daudet and boulevard Victor-Hugo, if envisaged in the future, to evaluate their impacts on the property,
 - b) Adopting promptly the Charte de protection et d'utilisation de la Maison Carrée et de ses abords once finalised,
 - c) Developing further the monitoring system to encompass all the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value,
 - d) Preparing a disaster/crisis management plan to enhance protection of the integrity of the property.

E.5 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

E.5.1 New Nominations

Decision: 45 COM 8B.50

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site: Jodensavanne Settlement and Cassipora Creek Cemetery, Suriname, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (iii);
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

Located on the densely forested banks of the Suriname River, the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site in northern Suriname is a serial property with two component parts that illustrate early Jewish colonisation attempts in the Atlantic World. The Jodensavanne Settlement, founded in the 1680s, includes the ruins of what is believed to be the earliest synagogue of architectural significance in the Americas, along with cemeteries and the foundations of brick buildings, boat landing areas, and a military post. The Cassipora Creek Cemetery is the remnant of an older settlement founded in the 1650s which ceased to exist three decades later when its inhabitants migrated two kilometres downstream to Jodensavanne. Unusual for the Atlantic Sephardic diaspora, these early Jewish colonies were not situated in existing urban settings, and were longer-lived than many. Located amidst Indigenous territory, the settlements were inhabited, owned, and governed by Jews who lived there together with free and enslaved persons of African

and Indigenous descent. The settlements had the most extensive arrangement of privileges and immunities known in the early modern Jewish world.

Criterion (iii): The Jodensavanne Archaeological Site is an exceptional testimony within the Atlantic Sephardic diaspora of a Jewish civilisation that was granted territorial and communal autonomy, a Jewish 'state within a state' that existed from the 17th to the 19th century in a slave society and a frontier zone. The settlement existed in an area adjacent to Indigenous territories, and the Jewish settlers were instrumental in its defence. Several of the material remains in the property are exceptional due to their age (the cemeteries) and their architecture. Furthermore, the archaeological evidence at the settlement and cemeteries points towards differing degrees of coexistence and conflict between cultures and ethnocultural groups, including Jews, Indigenous peoples, enslaved Africans, and European colonists.

Integrity

The integrity of the serial property is based on the Jodensavanne Settlement component part, with the remains of buildings, cemeteries, and several other elements that played important roles in the development and daily life of the Jewish community, including the boat landings that connected Jodensavanne with the river, the military post and part of the defences, the medicinal springs, sacred Ceiba trees, and a sand pit. The Cassipora Creek Cemetery component part's gravestones have inscriptions in Hebrew, Portuguese, Spanish, Dutch, Aramaic, and combinations of these languages. The Cassipora Creek Settlement, the first autonomous Sephardic Jewish community in the colony of Suriname and precursor of the Jodensavanne Settlement, is not yet located, but its probable location is included in the buffer zone.

Authenticity

The attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value are substantially authentic in terms of their forms and designs, materials and substance, and locations and settings. Ongoing maintenance work is based on the advice of specialists, and is done with great care regarding the original materials and substance.

In general terms, the authenticity of the remains as well as their settings do not raise any serious concerns at the moment. There is a need to strengthen protection of the surroundings of the property's component parts in order to avoid potential negative impacts to the authenticity of these settings in the future.

Protection and management requirements

The two component parts of the property are recognised as archaeological monuments under the Monuments Act of 2002 and have been legally protected at the highest level since 2009 through Ministerial Resolution No. 873. The Jodensavanne Foundation, created in 1971, is the official management authority of the property. It has the right of use for rehabilitation, conservation, management, and touristic purposes, and holds the official land rights of the property. Local Indigenous peoples are the traditional custodians of the archaeological site, which adds another layer of protection. The property is co-managed by the Indigenous village of Redi Doti. A Memorandum of Cooperation between the Redi Doti Village Council and the Jodensavanne Foundation establishes that the Indigenous village of Redi Doti is co-responsible for the preservation, protection, and management of the cultural heritage of the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site, while the Jodensavanne Foundation recognises its shared responsibility for the sustainable socio-economic development of Redi Doti. Any changes to the management plan as well as any tourism, recreation or construction projects must be agreed to by both partners. The Memorandum of Cooperation is evaluated and signed by the two partners every four years.

The Jodensavanne Settlement and Cassipora Creek Cemetery Management Plan 2020-2025 gives guidance for the management, protection, conservation, and promotion of

the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site. Operation of the property depends heavily on income from entrance fees and private donations. An annual subsidy from the Ministry of Education, Science and Culture is being pursued to help cover the operational costs of the property.

- 4. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - Obtaining adequate and stable funding for the operation and maintenance of the property,
 - b) Finalising the designation of the Special Protected Forest zone,
 - c) Preparing and/or centralising the inventories of archaeological finds and the accompanying information, and presenting this information on detailed topographical maps and/or in a Geographical Information System (GIS),
 - Identifying quantifiable indicators for monitoring the state of conservation of all the attributes of the property, as well as general environmental conditions and changes to its surroundings, in order to help detect long-term developments at the property and its surroundings,
 - e) Elaborating an integrated risk preparedness plan for the two component parts,
 - f) Evaluating the current land use (e.g., location of visitor installations) with the objective of developing a land-use plan for the property,
 - g) Exploring the possibility and relevance of including additional interest groups and stakeholders in the property management process,
 - h) Determining the carrying capacity of the property,
 - i) Further exploring the possibility of including the remains of the Cassipora Creek Settlement in the property's boundary, through a minor boundary modification request, if its location and state of conservation can be accurately determined,
 - j) Undertaking research on the interrelations between the different groups (Jewish people, local African descendants) that were living together in Jodensavanne in order to further the understanding of the property;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

I.C NOMINATIONS EVALUATED IN COMPLIANCE WITH DECISION 18 EXT.COM 4

E.6 AFRICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.51

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Memorial sites of the Genocide: Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero, Rwanda, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (vi);
- 3. Takes note of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda in 1994 is a highly notable event due to its intensity – the number of people exterminated in a relatively short period of time –, and its modality – pre-meditated and organised extermination of civilians by neighbours, family members and militias. The Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda has been influential at a global level in the process of creation of the International Criminal Court (2002), through the establishment of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (1994-2015). In order to remember the Genocide in Rwanda, the United Nations General Assembly has established the International Day of Reflection on the 1994 Genocide against the Tutsi in Rwanda on April 7, recalling the importance of early warning and prevention of mass atrocities and the need for the international community to intervene in situations of genocide.

The Genocide Memorial Sites: Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero represents the material evidence of the genocide committed against the Tutsis in Rwanda. This serial property signifies a place of reconciliation, remembrance and peaceful reflection, and plays an educational and reconciliatory role in promoting a culture of peace and dialogue. All four sites bear witness to the last genocide of the 20th century and have existed as sites of memory since the genocide was halted in July 1994. Since then, Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero have become exceptional sanctuaries of memory, but also places of meditation, gathering and collective mourning. These silent edifices are both a symbol of the destructive power man has invented, and a hope for peace and tolerance.

Criterion (vi): The Outstanding Universal Value of the four genocide memorial sites lies in their association with the genocide perpetrated against the Tutsi (massacres of more than million Tutsi in 1994 by Hutu extremists) which took place there. The genocide against the Tutsi is an event of global significance (Crime against Humanity) and whose impact was felt far beyond national borders to present and future generations. The four memorial sites are also associated with the genocide ideology which was conceived, taught and spread by the political regimes in Rwanda since 1950s. Indeed, the genocide memorial sites of Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero are not only the places where the killings took place, they also preserve bodies of thousands of killed Tutsi as well as other genocide evidence (Victims' clothes, belongings, weapons). Furthermore, the four memorial sites remind the atrocities committed in the 20th century of on one side, but also contribute to memory, unity, reconciliation and peace among people and countries (Never again). The four sites were selected to represent many more across the whole country because they reflect the depth of the horrors and suffering that are found in other sites of memory of similar nature.

Integrity

The four memorial sites proposed for inscription possess and retain complete necessary elements that underpin their outstanding universal value which is made of tangible memory (material evidence of the genocide committed against the Tutsi in Rwanda) and intangible memory (values above-mentioned). They are preserved in their intact status because no amputation of all or part of their constituent elements was made on constituent elements. Furthermore, the proposed memorial sites are not exposed to development projects that could threaten their integrity because the Government of Rwanda has established the legislation protecting the memorial sites and their buffer zones.

Each of the four memorial sites presents a set of attributes sufficient to convey the context of the genocide perpetrated against the Tutsi in Rwanda in 1994: All elements needed to understand the values conveyed by the memorial sites are still present, within the boundaries of the areas concerned. In addition, the size of each memorial site allows visitors to see and understand the scenarios of the events that took place there.

Authenticity

The cultural values of the sites are truthfully and credibly expressed through their use and function. Indeed, they retain their functional authenticity as places of memory, contemplation and reflection on unity and reconciliation, peace and tolerance, education, and the elimination of all forms of atrocity. Furthermore, their form, design, materials, substance and location, spirit and feeling have remained intact, as evidenced by their unchanged location since 1994 (Nyamata and Murambi), 1998 (Bisesero) and 2000 (Gisozi), when the buildings were erected to add value to the sites which date back to 1994 as sites of the massacres where the bodies of the victims were preserved.

The conservation activities carried out on several occasions at the Murambi and Nyamata sites have not affected their authenticity but, on the contrary, contribute to the preservation of the sites' attributes. Indeed, the genocide memorial sites reflect the social and cultural characteristics that have always characterized the victims' way of life, the discriminatory policy that forced the Tutsis to live in isolation and in fear of being killed. Accounts of the genocide perpetrated against the Tutsis were gathered in an inclusive and diversified manner. Testimonies were collected from genocide survivors to document their experiences throughout the period of persecution. Narratives were collected from the actors of the genocide to understand the political and/or social mechanisms and factors that drove them to kill their compatriots. Other accounts were gathered during sessions of the traditional courts. Testimonies were gathered from the Righteous to understand their motivations and the reasons for their resistance at the most dangerous times for them and their families. Consultations were held with elders and sages to understand the historical context in which the hatred that led to the Tutsi genocide developed.

Protection and management requirements

The four sites are particularly protected by the Law N° 28/2016 of 22/7/2016 on the preservation of cultural heritage and traditional knowledge as well as the Ministerial order classifying them on the National tangible cultural heritage List. In addition, regularly updated management plans serve as strategic tools to manage, protect and monitor elements of the serial nominated property; to build capacity with mechanisms involving local communities in site planning, management and protection.

The management of the four genocide memorial sites Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of National Unity and Civic Engagement (MINIUBUMWE) in accordance with Prime Ministerial Order no 011/03 of 24/07/2023 determining the mission, powers and organizational structure of the Ministry of National Unity and Civic Engagement. MINUBUMWE manages and preserves these sites using material, financial and human resources provided by the government. Each site has its own managers, governed by civil service statutes, who manage the sites on a day-to-day basis.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - Mapping the key attributes for the component parts of Gisozi and Bisesero in order to define and support the conservation and management strategies at these two serial component parts,
 - b) Documenting all key attributes for all four component parts of the serial property and preparing a baseline for its conservation, management and monitoring,
 - c) Providing updated information as regards the designation of the component parts as national cultural heritage,
 - d) Providing the updated management plan including disaster risk management protocols and a visitor and interpretation strategy that is participatory and inclusive of all relevant actors.

- e) Incorporating Heritage Impact Assessments into the planning framework of the buffer zones and wider setting of the property,
- f) Developing a monitoring system that includes key indicators that are related to the key attributes and main threats;
- 5. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024** a report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the abovementioned recommendations, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

E.7 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.52

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add.
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> Funerary and memory sites of the First World War (Western Front), Belgium, France, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii), (iv) and (vi);
- 3. <u>Takes note</u> of the following provisional Statement of Outstanding Value:

Brief synthesis

The funerary and memory sites selected form the component parts of the series proposed for inscription. They bear witness to an entirely new relationship to the death of the soldier in combat. For the first time, these soldiers were mobilised civilians on a massive scale, from every social class and in every country. The unprecedented loss of life, due to the industrial and total nature of the First World War, profoundly transformed funeral rites. Only a new cult of the dead, whose individual identity was recognised by all for the first time, provided a human and universal response to the inhumanity of war. This new funerary memory is expressed in cemeteries made up of individual graves repeated in very large numbers. Their uniformity reflects equality in the face of death above all other considerations, while respecting individual beliefs. The inscription of names on mausoleums and memorials is primarily a response to the desire to keep alive the memory of combatants whose bodies have not been found or identified. They are the natural complement to these cemeteries.

All the component parts also reflect the international nature of the conflict, whether they are cemeteries or memorials explicitly associated with one of the belligerents or paying tribute to soldiers from all over the world. Funerary and memorial sites range from simple stele to commemorative monument and large national memorials. They bear witness to a completely new architectural movement, specific to each belligerent and which continues today. All keep alive the memory of victims (military and civilian) and bear witness to the suffering and grief of the masses. Although centred on the death of the soldier, these funerary and memorial sites are a constant reminder, through their symbolism, that each fallen man was also a father, a son or a husband. This funerary cult is therefore more than a combatant cult; it is a civil and humanist cult that invites us to reflect and then, gradually, to reconcile and make peace.

Criterion (iii): The funerary and memorial sites of the First World War, which make up the series, bear witness to the establishment and spread of a new tradition of worshipping the war dead. For the first time in history, each victim was commemorated

and recognised individually, on a universal scale, and without distinction as to social or cultural background. Individuals who die in combat are recognised first and foremost for themselves, while respecting their religious or philosophical convictions.

Each body is buried in an individual grave. If the deceased is identified, his or her name is engraved. Individual graves are generally grouped together in military cemeteries or in dedicated enclosures in civilian cemeteries. The remains of unidentified soldiers are sometimes grouped together in ossuaries. For those who have no identified individual grave, monuments to the missing are erected. In most cases, ossuaries and monuments to the missing bear the names of individuals engraved in the form of vast alphabetical lists.

This practice of recognising all victims individually and equally became a tradition for conflicts after the First World War.

Criterion (iv): The funerary and memory sites of the First World War, which make up the series, bear witness to the creation of a new typology of decorative, architectural and landscape elements of exceptional quality. Created and organised according to cultural sensibilities or national styles, the attention paid to aesthetics is universal.

They offer a new, large-scale example of the construction and creation of sites organised to commemorate all those who died in battle. By their size and number, they express the unprecedented scale reached by the destructive force of a total and global war. By their location, generally around the sites of major battles, and combined with the presence of elements that bear direct witness to the conflict, they form a landscape of remembrance.

The typology of military cemeteries, ossuaries and war memorials of the First World War has been taken as the standard for all subsequent conflicts.

Criterion (vi): The funerary and memory sites of the First World War, which form part of the series, by virtue of the unprecedented degree of destruction and mass death, respond to the desire to perpetuate the individual identity of the war victim and to rehumanise societies traumatised by the disappearance of a large part of their population.

The shared remembrance of the war dead is both contemporary and dynamic. Millions of visitors from all generations and from all over the world visit these sites. They take part in collective commemorations, international, national or local events organised by institutions or associations, as well as private pilgrimages and individual or family visits. In these places, the history of remembrance takes on exceptional value.

Today, the funerary and memory sites of the First World War have become places of meditation and celebration of the memory of the dead, whose symbolism exalts peace and reconciliation.

Integrity

The overall integrity of the proposed series is broken down into several major axes and concepts in order to illustrate as fully as possible the different aspects of outstanding universal value.

In the diversity of its component parts, the series reflects the common desire of governments to respond to the expectations of populations to see the sacrifice of their loved ones recognised. This desire is expressed by a vast international movement to create cemeteries with individual graves and memorials listing those who have died in combat. The series presents a selection of the most emblematic burial sites of this new cult of the fallen on the Western Front of the First World War (France-Belgium), as part of a group of several thousand cemeteries and monuments.

The series reflects the memory of the nations and peoples who took part in the fighting, and bears witness to the incredible diversity of the belligerents, fully justifying the term First World War. Through its component parts, the series presents a very complete

picture of the nations and peoples involved in this conflict, implying a high degree of respect for the international testimony of the fallen.

The series is based on the different areas of the Western Front and the different phases in the history of the war. The general cartography expresses this dual spatial and chronological balance. The series aims to respect and illustrate the historical extension of the Western Front.

Over and above this new cult of the dead, the elements making up the series express the diversity of the cultural references of the different belligerents. The series represents all the architectural, decorative and landscaping trends that were expressed both by the diversity of those involved and throughout the history of cemeteries and memorials. It therefore expresses as fully as possible this stylistic and typological diversity of funerary and memory buildings.

It is also a memorial tradition that has evolved over time and is still alive and well today, on a large scale. The proposed series takes account of these different timeframes in the construction of the sites, as well as their current cultural and symbolic importance.

All the elements making up the serial property individually have good structural integrity, as memorials, necropolises, organised military cemeteries or monuments. Almost all of them were conceived from the outset as coherent monumental and landscape ensembles expressing remembrance values through their structure and form. Their construction followed the canons of a funerary art defined as much by the cultural context of the inter-war years as by the cultural and mental weight of the memory of the war. Plant elements (lawns, trees, ornamental beds) are designed to visually enrich the monumental or territorial element. The component parts are all of great symbolic significance, which is still perceived today. They are living sites of both the memory of war and the values of reconciliation and peace that they subsequently promoted. On their own, these component parts express a high integrity of intangible testimony and its transmission over generations, particularly since the disappearance of the last eyewitnesses to the First World War.

Authenticity

The sites selected to form part of the serial nomination are cemeteries and funerary monuments used exclusively for the worship of the dead. They comprise a group of sites developed to fulfil a funerary and memorial function that has been carefully preserved to the present day. They are complementary places of remembrance linked to the events of the First World War, expressing the different national, historical and territorial aspects as well as the structural, architectural and decorative variants. These funerary and memorial sites have been preserved and maintained in accordance with their original purpose.

Cemeteries for fallen soldiers were created as soon as the war itself began, reflecting the widespread adoption of the new cult of the fallen. In particular, during the war, individual graves and cemeteries were created for the burial of fallen soldiers. After the armistice, the systematic search for the dead began, with the identification and grouping of remains. This led to the organisation of cemeteries and necropolises, as well as ossuaries for unidentifiable human remains. The creation of funerary sites, some of them very large, followed organisational logics and traditions specific to each nation. A number of wartime cemeteries have had their remains exhumed and have subsequently been abandoned. But their memorial function has generally been respected, giving some of them an archaeological dimension. Some cemeteries were affected by the events of the Second World War, and some were rebuilt in the aftermath, but in keeping with their original funerary vocation. The same is true of the funerary monuments, which generally include long individual lists. They have had a parallel history to cemeteries, and are frequently associated with them. They were sometimes created during the war itself, but more often than not were designed during the inter-war period, in direct connection with

the commemoration of the fallen. Some of these monuments were reconstructed in the post-Second World War period, and sometimes even in relatively recent times. However, all of them have retained their original purpose since their creation and any restructuring that may have taken place. With very few exceptions (the monument at the former German military cemetery in Sedan), these sites are well maintained by the national or local authorities responsible for them. They are therefore individual testimonies to a high degree of authenticity of the new widespread cult of the fallen. Taken together, they form a very complete and carefully-constructed selection of the monumental, decorative and landscape typologies that make up the cult and give expression to it today. An expression that can be described as perfectly authentic and that bears witness to a rich and complex history of the cult of the dead between the start of hostilities and the present day.

The component parts also reflect an architectural and decorative movement that began at this period in history, and is closely linked to its symbolic values. The cemeteries express a convergence towards new values, common to all the belligerents, of recognising the fallen, while their architecture and statuary reveal national attitudes to remembrance. In addition, memorials to the war and its dead were erected close to the old front lines, as well as in the villages and towns of the nations and peoples involved in the fighting. The most imposing memorial monuments in the series mark out the extent of the front line visually and symbolically. Beyond this, the symbolic art, memorial monumentalism and landscape of the cemeteries express a profound desire for peace. All the component parts bear witness to these tangible and intangible values with great authenticity. The entire series expresses the living and ongoing nature of this tribute, now a century old, as well as its evolution towards the search for peace and reconciliation.

In conclusion, the sites selected to form the component parts of the series have, almost as a rule, a high level of maintenance and conservation, respecting both their material authenticity and their symbolic value. The serial property strongly expresses the authentic and living nature of the cult of the fallen, who are recognised as individuals.

Protection and management requirements

All the sites making up the serial property are or will be protected in the short term. To achieve this, each partner has used its own legislation. The Belgian partners (Flanders and Wallonia) have chosen to apply heritage legislation systematically and to protect all the sites. Classification is both a recognition of heritage value and a safeguarding tool.

In Wallonia, the sites concerned are all protected as monuments or sites. The buffer zone is established using another heritage tool: the protection zone, whose definition is similar to that of the buffer zone. In two cases, the heritage quality of the surrounding area has also conferred the status of classified site on the buffer zone.

In Flanders, the sites in the series are all protected as monuments. This is the highest possible level of heritage protection. The buffer zones around the sites have all been defined in consultation with the partners involved. The buffer zones are based on heritage tools and spatial planning tools. In accordance with Flanders' heritage law, these buffer zones come into force when the site is listed as a World Heritage Site, even though the area around most of the sites has already been protected or recognized as an urban or landscape site.

In France, all military cemeteries are protected under the 1919 law. In addition, for the sites in the series, this basic protection has been supplemented by various instruments of a heritage nature (historic monument, inclusion in the inventory, site), of an environmental or spatial planning nature.

The priority in managing the serial property is to conserve the component parts, and to preserve its outstanding universal value and the attributes on which it is based.

Communicating and sharing this outstanding universal value with as many people as possible, both locals and visitors, is another important aspect of management.

The sites in the series are spread over the territory of 2 States (Belgium, France) and are presented by 3 independent and autonomous institutional partners in terms of heritage (Wallonia, Flanders, France). In addition, the maintenance, management and conservation of these sites fall within the remit of specific structures created during or just after the war by the main belligerents. The objectives of these structures are much the same: to create military cemeteries and ensure their upkeep and management. These missions are not limited to Belgium and France, but to the whole world.

The management plan therefore takes account of this complexity and is based on a structure that brings together representatives of the institutions behind the project (Wallonia, Flanders and France) and the site managers (CWGC, ABMC, VDK, DMPA, IV-INIG). The management plan will have to integrate this dual component: serial management of the property and respect for the international models created by the managers on the western front and generalised.

It should also be borne in mind that each institution involved in the project has developed its own legislation or practices concerning the management of the World Heritage sites located on its territory.

In addition, it will also be necessary to preserve the anchoring of these sites in their territory, their landscape and their history, and to maintain or even strengthen links with the local populations and communities.

In order to respond to this complexity and these different challenges, the management plan for the serial property will therefore combine a transnational, national-regional and local level.

4. Requests the States Parties to:

- a) Protect all component parts through national designations in accordance with the current heritage legislation,
- b) Adjust the boundaries of the following component parts as follows:
 - i) Belgium:
 - Enlarge the boundaries of component part WA02 Robermont Military plots to also include the burial grounds and tombs of the German soldiers,
 - Reduce the boundaries of component part WA06 Enclosure of the Executed in Tamines to include only the cemetery,
 - ii) France:
 - Revise the boundaries of component parts PC03 Canadian National Memorial "Vimy Memorial", PC04 Commonwealth Military Cemetery "Canadian Cemetery n°2" and PC05 Commonwealth Military Cemetery "Givenchy Road Canadian Cemetery" and merge them to form one single component part to cover part or the entirety of the Vimy Ridge National Historic Site of Canada,
 - Exclude the civil cemetery from component part ND04 German Military Cemetery of la Route de Solesmes and Commonwealth "Cambrai East Military Cemetery" and retain only the two military cemeteries,
 - Modify the buffer zone of component parts PC07 French National Necropolis of la Targette and Commonwealth Military Cemetery "La Targette British Cemetery", and PC08 La Maison Blanche German Military Cemetery to include also component part PC09 Czechoslovakian Military Cemetery of Neuville-Saint-Vaast, as it is part of the same memorial sector,

- c) Finalize the Framework Agreement with all relevant actors for the management of the French section of the serial property,
- d) Adopt a common conservation and management approach that safeguards the specificity of each component part and reinforces their capacity to convey the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the serial property,
- e) Strengthen the transnational coordination and cooperation in management,
- f) Develop a common transnational interpretation strategy for the serial property that incorporates narratives related to the tribute paid during the First World War by the nations formerly colonised by European countries;
- 5. Recommends that the States Parties give consideration to developing a common transnational monitoring system, based on the attributes of the property and on the same set of indicators, that would allow for a joint periodical evaluation of the state of conservation of the serial property;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties to submit to the World Heritage Centre by **1 December 2024**, a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 47th session.

E.8 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

Decision: 45 COM 8B.53

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add.
- 2. <u>Inscribes</u> **ESMA Museum and Site of Memory Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination, Argentina**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (vi)**;
- 3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination is located on the grounds of what was once the Officers' Quarters of the Navy School of Mechanics (ESMA), in the city of Buenos Aires, Argentina.

In the Clandestine Centre installed at the ESMA Officers' Quarters, officers and subordinates belonging to the Argentine Navy kidnapped, tortured, and murdered more than 5,000 people, carried forward a plan to steal babies born in captivity, exercised sexual and gender violence, subjected groups of detained-disappeared persons to forced labour of various kinds, and organised the spoliation of movable and immovable assets of the victims. The systematic and organised exercise of secretly carried out violence by the dictatorship took place as part of a transnational plan of cooperation among dictatorships in the American Southern Cone to fight political left- and Marxistoriented armed and non-armed opposition, and a wide range of progressive political and social associations. Due to the transnational implications of these events, in a context of global geo-political tensions between opposing worldviews and socio-political values, the building and operational magnitude, its location in the heart of the city, the coexistence of naval officers and detained-disappeared persons and the variety and complexity of the crimes committed, ESMA Clandestine Centre transcended its political and

geographical borders to turn into an international and emblematic symbol representing the characteristics of the enforced disappearance of persons, considered today as a crime against humanity by the United Nations.

Criterion (vi): The ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination is closely and tangibly associated with, and highly representative of, the illegal repression of armed and non-armed opponents and dissenters carried out and coordinated by the dictatorships of Latin America in the 1970s-1980s on the grounds of the enforced disappearance of persons, in a climate of global geopolitical tensions between opposing worldviews about the world's socio-political order.

Integrity

The property contains all the strata which clearly explain its historical-constructive evolution, necessary to understand its Outstanding Universal Value. The building has been protected as judicial evidence since 1998 owing to the crimes against humanity committed there during the operations of the Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination. From then on, any kind of modification was prohibited. The Argentine Navy vacated and handed down the building in 2004. Until 2014, only maintenance and deterioration arrest works were performed. From 2014 to 2015, the works to create and open the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory were carried out with scrupulous respect for the preservation of the state of the building, as it was at the time of its decommissioning, and its status as judicial evidence. At present, different marks and vestiges denoting the stay of the detained-disappeared at the place are preserved. The building today displays the inalterability conditions necessary to continue with studies which may allow access to new judicial evidence. Furthermore, it represents a documentary source for the historical reconstruction of the events which took place there.

Authenticity

The property's structure, spatial configuration, coatings, and marks of the various constructive alterations and uses over time allow to understand its own history and evolution and convey in a credible manner the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. The validation of the building as judicial evidence in the trials for crimes against humanity committed there is based upon the recognition of the authenticity of the facilities and the veracity of the testimonies referring to such events and confirms the property's tangible and close association with those events. The conservation and restoration protocols applied for the installation of ESMA Museum and Site of Memory were jointly endorsed by experts in such matters, by an Advisory Council made up of representatives of Human Rights organisations and by the judicial body. Nowadays, all the conservation and restoration measures of the building are based upon scientific studies carried forward in order to preserve it by virtue of its dual nature of judicial evidence and documentary source.

The tangible attributes of the property which reflect its Outstanding Universal Value are complemented and reinforced by the painstaking and early activated process to ascertain facts and seek justice in relation to the criminal events that took place during the dictatorships at the hands of the military led to the first Trial of the Military Juntas in 1985 by a civil court. This trial and the following mega-cases have produced overwhelming evidence of what happened at ESMA. The Officers' Quarter was protected as judicial evidence for the trials. The process of seeking truth and justice is still ongoing and shall form the basis of a robust reconciliation process.

Protection and management requirements

Various legal and institutional protection measures cover the property and its buffer zone for the preservation of its Outstanding Universal Value. Legally speaking, the building has been protected since 1998 under an injunction to maintain the status quo in its

capacity as judicial evidence. Additionally, the Court continuously issues specific provisions on the topics concerning the entire building preservation. At the heritage level, in 2008, the property was listed as a National Historic Monument and its buffer zone, made up of the premises destined for the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA), as a National Historic Site. From the institutional point of view, the national decree for the creation of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination sets its administrative role as a decentralised body of the National Secretariat for Human Rights, whose mission is to inform and convey the events which took place in the Clandestine Centre, its precedents and its consequences.

The ESMA Museum and Site of Memory is managed by an executive directorate and has an Advisory Council composed of the same members coming from the Directory of Human Rights organisations belonging to the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights. The Museum and Site of Memory is located within the boundaries of the premises destined for the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA), which nowadays houses public institutions and civil society associations with a local, national and regional reach. The Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA) is administered by an Executive Body made up of representatives from the National Government, the Autonomous City of Buenos Aires and a Directory integrated by Human Rights organisations.

The long-term sustenance of the Outstanding Universal Value and of the mission of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory to accompany Argentina to fulfil its aspiration that these events will not happen again need the continued commitment of all relevant institutions in presenting what happened during the dictatorship in all its complex precedents and consequences and guaranteeing that the property continues to be the inheritance of all Argentinians so as to become that of the world.

- 4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Expanding the buffer zone through a minor boundary modification request or establishing robust protection mechanisms for the plots corresponding to the Raggio Technical School and its Sports field.
 - b) Exercising close vigilance on any change to planning provisions in the immediate and wider setting of the property that may lead to development incompatible with the sustenance of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
 - c) Carrying out an assessment of all buildings and structures located in the buffer zone about the level of protection and conservation policy which would be adequate for each of them in relation to their ability to support the Outstanding Universal Value.
 - d) Carrying out a systematic review of all risk management measures in place to verify whether inter-agency communication and coordination need strengthening to tackle effectively disaster response,
 - e) Completing the Strategic Management Plan with a chapter on risk management arrangements and responsible actors to address and respond to specific risks,
 - f) Submitting for review by the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS the concept and the project for the expansion of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory in line with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
 - g) Ensuring that the interpretation at the Museum and Site of Memory includes expanded information on the Argentinian historic–political context that prepared the advent of the civic-military dictatorship in 1976 and on the background of those imprisoned and tortured at ESMA to ensure that full understanding is achieved that

- the repression methods used during the dictatorship were unjustifiable, abhorrent state-led crimes,
- h) Relocating all visitors-related services of the museum outside the Officers' Casino building at a different premise and keeping the property only as a place for education, remembrance and recollection.
- II. MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATIONS OF PROPERTIES ALREADY INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST
- II.A MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATIONS PROPOSED FOR EXAMINATION IN 2022
- F. NATURAL PROPERTIES
- F.1 AFRICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.54

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **07 COM VIII**, **34 COM 8E**, **43 COM 7B.32** and **44 COM 7B.200** adopted at its 7th (Florence, 1983), 34th (Brasília, 2010), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary of **Comoé National Park**, **Côte** d'Ivoire:
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the successful conservation action undertaken by the State Party to date and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to continue implementing effective protection measures based on the modified boundaries of Comoé National Park;
- 5. <u>Also encourages</u> the State Party to proceed progressively, and through a participatory process, to a physical demarcation of the boundaries of the property;
- Considers that the property should not be subject to any further net reductions in area, and <u>invites</u> the State Party to consider a future extension of the property, in consultation with local communities, to fully include Mount Gorowi and Mount Kongoli into the property as recommended by the World Heritage Committee in its Decision **07 COM VIII**;
- 7. Requests the State Party to confirm that the modified boundaries of the property comprise 1,148,756 ha and to clarify the reasons for inconsistent area figures being reported.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.55

- Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2.
- 2. Recalling Decisions **06 COM VIII.20**, **43 COM 7B.31** and **44 COM 7B.200** adopted at its 6th (UNESCO, Paris, 1982), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively.

- 3. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary of **Taï National Park**, **Côte d'Ivoire**;
- 4. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made by the State Party to address threats to the property, <u>underlines</u> the importance of continuing efforts to eliminate those threats posed to the property by illegal activities, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to report on any development of threats as applicable and in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, including on any potential impacts on the integrity of the property and the newly added areas.

F.2 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.56

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 31 COM 8B.16, 35 COM 8B.13, 41 COM 8B.7, 44 COM 7B.99 and 44 COM 8B.32, adopted at its 31st (Christchurch, 2007), 35th (UNESCO Headquarters, 2011), 41st (Kraków, 2017) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. Approves the minor modification to the boundary of the Ancient and Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and Other Regions of Europe, Albania, Austria, Belgium, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czechia, France, Germany, Italy, North Macedonia, Poland, Romania, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Switzerland, Ukraine, by enlarging the Dürrenstein component part (Austria) to become Dürrenstein-Lassingtal, and by merging the component parts Paklenica National Park Suva draga-Klimenta and Paklenica National Park Oglavinovac-Javornik (Croatia) to become Paklenica National Park component part;
- 4. Recommends the State Party of Austria to further strengthen the protection of the enlarged component part of Dürrenstein-Lassingtal by phasing-out completely any remaining use of timber in the buffer zone to optimize the corridor function of the entire buffer zone;
- 5. <u>Also recommends</u> the State Party of Croatia to:
 - Ensure that the small areas excised from the component parts and buffer zones in Paklenica National Park will not be subject to increased use, especially if such use could result in a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the transnational serial property, and
 - b) Consider an extension of the buffer zone to align with the boundaries of Paklenica National Park;
- 6. Requests the States Parties of Austria and Croatia to submit further information to the World Heritage Centre in response to above recommendations by **1 December 2024** as part of the state of conservation report.

G. CULTURAL PROPERTIES

G.1 ARAB STATES

Decision: 45 COM 8B.57

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Refers</u> the examination of the minor modification to the boundary and to the buffer zone of **Abu Mena**, **Egypt**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Clarify the protection regime that will apply to the enlarged property which is not included within the designated archaeological site,
 - Establish an appropriate protective designation for the areas added to the property, in order to ensure that it is covered in its entirety by explicit legal protection designations,
 - c) Establish an ad-hoc management body for the property,
 - d) Consider enlarging the buffer zone or, at least, establish mechanisms that guarantee the effective management of the immediate and wider settings of Abu Mena in a way that is supportive of the property's Outstanding Universal Value and the maintenance of the rural character of the property's surroundings.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.58

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Refers</u> the examination of the minor modification to the boundary and buffer zones of **Historic Cairo, Egypt**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Prepare further documentation and undertake analysis in order to:
 - i) Delineate in detail the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value, based on an approved Statement of Outstanding Universal Value,
 - ii) Prepare detailed maps that define the discrete urban neighbourhoods of the property and their relationship to registered monuments and attributes of Outstanding Universal Value,
 - iii) Demonstrate changes that have taken place affecting the integrity of the property since inscription,
 - b) Invite an advisory mission to the property to consider proposals for modifications to the boundaries and buffer zones in relation to the enhanced documentation and analysis and to protection and management requirements,
 - c) On the basis of advice from the advisory mission, submit a revised minor boundary modification request.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.59

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary and to the buffer zone of the **Old Town** of **Ghadamès**, **Libya**;
- 3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Amending the Regulation for the land use within the boundaries of the Old Town of Ghadamès, "The Property and its buffer zone" to integrate the modified boundaries of the property and its buffer zone.
 - b) Developing the announced special regulations for the property and its buffer zone based on the Law n.3/1994 and the Law on Urban Planning as a matter of urgency,
 - c) Developing and adopting an agreement among all relevant institutional actors involved at different levels in the protection and management of the property to guarantee their participation in decision-making and to ensure clarity of mandates and tasks in implementing the management of the property.

G.2 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.60

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary of the **Historic Centre of Florence**, **Italy**.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.61

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zones of the **Archaeological Areas of Pompei**, **Herculaneum and Torre Annunziata**, Italy;
- 3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Considering submitting in the future a minor boundary modification with a view to extending the buffer zone to include the Villa in Boscoreale that was initially included in the 2020 proposal,
 - b) Providing a timeframe for the finalisation and implementation of the management plan.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.62

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary and to the buffer zones of **The works** of Jože Plečnik in Ljubljana Human Centred Urban Design, Slovenia;
- 3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to submitting in the future a minor boundary modification with a view to:
 - a) Including within the property relevant transversal axes, if their state of conservation could be improved to fully meet the conditions of authenticity and integrity,
 - b) Extending the buffer zone of the Roman Walls in Mirje component part to the stretch of Barjanska Street leading from the Roman Walls up to Aškerčeva Street and onto the plots located south of the traffic artery Mirje on the entire length of the serial component part.

G.3 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

Decision: 45 COM 8B.63

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. Refers the examination of the minor modification to the boundary and the buffer zones of the Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo, Panama, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Clarify the rationale to define the boundaries of the buffer zone in the San Lorenzo Castle, and eventually consider its extension if appropriate,
 - b) Consider the possibility to adopt the area of the Monumental Historic Ensemble of Portobelo established by Law 91 of 1976 as a single buffer zone that encompasses the component parts located in the area of Portobelo,
 - c) Elaborate an integral management plan for the serial property that clarifies the protection and management for its component parts and their buffer zones.

II.B MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATIONS PROPOSED FOR EXAMINATION IN 2023

H. NATURAL PROPERTIES

H.1 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.64

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the minor modification to the boundary of the **French Austral Lands and Seas, France**.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.65

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B2,
- 2. <u>Recalling Decision 44 COM 8B.8</u>, adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Approves</u> the proposed minor modification to the boundary of the **Colchic Rainforests** and **Wetlands**, **Georgia**;
- 4. Requests the State Party to submit maps at the appropriate scale, showing the boundaries of the component parts and their buffer zones as approved.

I. CULTURAL PROPERTIES

I.1 ARAB STATES

Decision: 45 COM 8B.66

- Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. Refers the examination of the minor modification to the boundary of **Rock Art in the Hail Region, Saudi Arabia**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Consider extending the buffer zone by 1.0 to 1.5 km towards the south, in accordance with Decisions 39 COM 8B.11, 41 COM 7B.85, 43 COM 7B.53 and 44 COM 7B.137.
 - b) Include in the buffer zone, based on visual perspectives, a viewshed entering from the main road (Al-Muhaffar) leading to Jubbah, so as to protect the essential covisibility from and towards the property along the panoramic road;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:

- a) Providing explanations about the substantial differences in area of the Jabal Umm Sinman component part, even though the boundaries are not affected,
- b) Putting in place, as a matter of urgency, effective inter-sectorial consultation mechanisms to ensure that no development project takes place within the property boundaries or the nearby areas, and that the projects under way, such as the abattoir, are halted until a heritage impact study has been conducted,
- c) Establishing viewshed studies so as to determine the zones that are visually sensitive, to protect them and to regulate construction in these zones, in order to protect the character of the landscape and preserve the visual integrity of the property,
- d) Developing, in accordance with Decision **39 COM 8B.11** (point 4.f), monitoring indicators to measure the impact of development on the attributes of the site.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.67

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for the Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din, Syrian Arab Republic, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Explain the methodology used to delineate the proposed boundary of the buffer zone, especially in relation to the protection of the wider setting of Qal'at Salah El-Din and important views from the castle, to be able to assess how the new buffer zone will support the visual integrity of the property and its surroundings, to justify the proposed extension of the buffer zone in all directions, beyond the horizontal spread of archaeological structures observed on the ground,
 - b) Revise the perimeter of the proposed buffer zone to allow for greater precision in the definition of the boundary, especially with regard to topographical features which constitute the anchors of the perimeter.
 - c) Clarify the size of the extension to the existing buffer zone (as approved by the World Heritage Committee in 2006 with the size of 129.52 ha) and the total area of the new buffer zone of Qal'at Salah El-Din after the proposed modification,
 - d) Officially endorse through national regulation the proposed extended buffer zone,
 - e) Clarify the need for and the division into different zoning within the proposed buffer zone and consider simplifying it, taking into consideration the extent of applicable controls, the need for protecting features that support the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, the views and the broader setting of the castle, as well as the related management objectives,
 - f) Provide more information on any arrangements made with private landowners of plots within the proposed extension in terms of management of the area, and the timeframe for endorsement of the new buffer zone at the national level.

I.2 ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

Decision: 45 COM 8B.68

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1</u>,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed minor modification to the boundary of **Mozu-Furuichi Kofun Group: Mounded Tombs of Ancient Japan, Japan**;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Continuously monitoring development in this buffer zone and its surrounding areas,
 - b) Further exploring how the buffer zones relate to the broader setting and what, if anything, needs protecting in the broader setting; and implement the subsequent measures.

I.3 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Decision: 45 COM 8B.69

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zones for the **Colonies of Benevolence**, **Belgium** and **Netherlands**.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.70

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed minor modification to the boundary of the **Ancient City of Nessebar, Bulgaria**;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Formally proposing a minor boundary modification for the buffer zone of the property, in response to the recommendations provided by ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre in 2012, 2015, 2017 and 2018,
 - Completing the Conservation and Management Plan for the Ancient City of Nessebar, and considering the underwater archaeological vestiges in all areas of management and planning by making provisions for specific regimes for conservation, management, sustainable development, and monitoring of this heritage,
 - Reinforcing and expanding the research programme for the underwater cultural heritage of the Ancient City of Nessebar as an integral part of developing the national inventory,

- d) Considering underwater cultural heritage values as part of heritage impact assessment of any new development along the coastline,
- e) Launching a feasibility study on the underwater archaeological sites to explore how to make them accessible to the public through maritime archaeological routes and pursuing other interpretation initiatives,
- f) Establishing a capacity-building programme in cooperation with UNESCO and its partners to improve the identification, evaluation, research and protection of underwater cultural heritage,
- g) Not undertaking any intervention on the seabed that may affect underwater archaeological vestiges and controlling navigation around the peninsula,
- h) Considering, in the long-term, relocation of the Nessebar Port Terminal and the Marina Nessebar facilities outside of the peninsula;
- 4. Requests the State Party to submit a revised map at the appropriate scale, showing the boundary of the property as approved following this minor boundary modification request, and the buffer zone as clarified in 2008.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.71

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zone for the **Prehistoric Sites and Decorated Caves of the Vézère Valley, France**;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Providing a timeframe for the finalisation, adoption and implementation of the management plan, especially for tourism facilities and development,
 - b) Proposing a project for the study, monitoring and regulation of human activities with regard to their long-term impact on:
 - i) The water resource and its foreseeable evolution across the whole property and its buffer zone,
 - ii) The hydrogeological environment of the property and its buffer zone, evolution of which could affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property in a midterm to long-term perspective,
 - iii) The integration of appropriate regulations into the town planning documents as approved by the local authorities.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.72

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zone for the Historic Centre of Rome, the Properties of the Holy See in that City Enjoying Extraterritorial Rights and San Paolo Fuori le Mura, Holy See, Italy;

- 3. Recommends the States Parties to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Completing the management plan of the property as a matter of utmost urgency, and submitting it to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS,
 - b) Submitting details of how and when the delimitations of the new buffer zone will be transcribed into existing local and national regulations in order to provide a statutory status for its boundaries,
 - c) Integrating into the management mechanisms, a systematic application of Heritage Impact Assessment for any plan and project that may impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.73

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zone for the Paseo del Prado and Buen Retiro, a landscape of Arts and Sciences, Spain.

Decision: 45 COM 8B.74

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed buffer zone for the **Three Castles, Defensive Wall and Ramparts of the Market-Town of Bellinzona, Switzerland**;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - a) Finalising the management plan currently in its revision phase, concentrating on the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and its attributes, while paying particular attention to the key visual perspectives,
 - b) Implementing systematic Heritage Impact Assessment mechanisms for any project planned or under way inside the buffer zone, and in the surrounding zones, that could have an impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
 - c) Introducing building regulations in the urban expansion zone to the north-west of the buffer zone, by setting standards for scale and character. The aims of this regulation are to ensure the architectural compatibility of new buildings with the property, and to preserve views and the landscape,
 - d) Ensuring that synergies are generated between the property management plan and the national and cantonal urban planning instruments, so as to incorporate urban planning guidelines that take into account visual axes and panoramas, in the urban planning of the buffer zone perimeter and its surrounding and territorial setting.

I.4 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

Decision: 45 COM 8B.75

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1,
- 2. <u>Approves</u> the proposed minor modification to the boundary and to the buffer zone of **Historic Centre of Lima, Peru**;
- 3. Recommends the State Party to give consideration to the following:
 - Carefully planning and implementing restoration, enhancement and reconstruction projects in line with standard principles based on evidence and baseline documentation.
 - b) Informing the World Heritage Centre of the intention to undertake or authorise all major projects which may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, in line with paragraph 172 of Operational Guidelines,
 - c) Developing and implementing a Heritage Impact Assessment for any development proposals in the property, its buffer zone and/or wider setting that could potentially affect the property's Outstanding Universal Value.
- III. STATEMENTS OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED AT PREVIOUS SESSIONS AND NOT ADOPTED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Decision: 45 COM 8B.76

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/8B,
- 2. <u>Adopts</u> the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for the following World Heritage properties inscribed at previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee:
 - Chile, Settlement and Artificial Mummification of the Chinchorro Culture in the Arica and Parinacota Region
 - Côte d'Ivoire, Sudanese style mosques in northern Côte d'Ivoire
 - France, Nice, Winter Resort Town of the Riviera
 - Gabon, Ivindo National Park
 - Germany, Mathildenhöhe Darmstadt
 - India, Kakatiya Rudreshwara (Ramappa) Temple, Telangana
 - Iran (Islamic Republic of), Trans-Iranian Railway
 - Netherlands, Dutch Water Defence Lines
 - Republic of Korea, Getbol, Korean Tidal Flats
 - Russian Federation, Petroglyphs of Lake Onega and the White Sea
 - Saudi Arabia, Himā Cultural Area
 - Spain, Paseo del Prado and Buen Retiro, a landscape of Arts and Sciences

- Thailand, Kaeng Krachan Forest Complex
- Türkiye, Arslantepe Mound.

8C. Update of the List of World Heritage In Danger

Decision: 45 COM 8C.1

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined the state of conservation reports of properties inscribed on the World Heritage List (WHC/23/45.COM/7B, WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add, WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.2, WHC/23/45.COM/7B.Add.3) and the proposals for inscription of properties on the World Heritage List (WHC/23/45.COM/8B and WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add),
- 2. <u>Having examined</u> the recommendations of the Advisory Bodies, <u>decides</u> to **inscribe** the following properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger:
 - Ukraine, Kyiv: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kyiv-Pechersk Lavra (Decision 45 COM 7B.59)
 - Ukraine, L'viv the Ensemble of the Historic Centre (Decision **45 COM 7B.60**)

Decision: 45 COM 8C.2

- Having examined the state of conservation reports of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger (WHC/23/45.COM/7A, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.3, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4),
- 2. <u>Having examined</u> the recommendations of the Advisory Bodies, <u>decides</u> to **retain** the following properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger:
 - Afghanistan, Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Decision 45 COM 7A.51)
 - Afghanistan, Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Decision 45 COM 7A.52)
 - Austria, Historic Centre of Vienna (Decision 45 COM 7A.55)
 - Bolivia (Plurinational State of), City of Potosí (Decision 45 COM 7A.18)
 - Central African Republic, Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park (Decision 45 COM 7A.3)
 - Côte d'Ivoire / Guinea, Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Decision 45 COM 7A.4)
 - Democratic Republic of the Congo, Garamba National Park (Decision 45 COM 7A.5)
 - Democratic Republic of the Congo, Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Decision 45 COM 7A.6)

- Democratic Republic of the Congo, Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Decision 45 COM 7A.7)
- Democratic Republic of the Congo, Virunga National Park (Decision 45 COM 7A.8)
- Egypt, Abu Mena (Decision 45 COM 7A.26)
- Honduras, Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Decision 45 COM 7A.1)
- Indonesia, Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Decision 45 COM 7A.15)
- Iraq, Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Decision **45 COM 7A.27**)
- Iraq, Hatra (Decision 45 COM 7A.28)
- Iraq, Samarra Archaeological City (Decision 45 COM 7A.29)
- Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (Decision 45 COM 7A.31)
- Kenya, Lake Turkana National Parks (Decision 45 COM 7A.10)
- Libya, Archaeological Site of Cyrene (Decision 45 COM 7A.33)
- Libya, Archaeological Site of Leptis Magna (Decision 45 COM 7A.34)
- Libya, Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Decision 45 COM 7A.35)
- Libya, Old Town of Ghadamès (Decision 45 COM 7A.36)
- Libya, Rock-Art Sites of Tadrart Acacus (Decision 45 COM 7A.37)
- Madagascar, Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Decision 45 COM 7A.11)
- Mali, Old Towns of Djenné (Decision 45 COM 7A.22)
- Mali, Timbuktu (Decision 45 COM 7A.23)
- Mali, Tomb of Askia (Decision 45 COM 7A.24)
- Mexico, Islands and Protected Areas of the Gulf of California (Decision 45 COM 7A.2)
- Micronesia (Federated States of), Nan Madol: Ceremonial Centre of Eastern Micronesia (Decision 45 COM 7A.53)
- Niger, Aïr and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Decision 45 COM 7A.12)
- Palestine, Palestine: Land of Olives and Vines Cultural Landscape of Southern Jerusalem, Battir (Decision 45 COM 7A.39)
- Palestine, Hebron/Al-Khalil Old Town (Decision 45 COM 7A.38)
- Panama, Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Decision 45 COM 7A.19)
- Peru, Chan Chan Archaelogical Zone (Decision 45 COM 7A.20)
- Romania, Rosia Montană Mining Landscape (Decision 45 COM 7A.56)
- Senegal, Niokolo-Koba National Park (Decision 45 COM 7A.13)
- Serbia, Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Decision **45 COM 7A.57**)
- Solomon Islands, East Rennell (Decision 45 COM 7A.16)
- Syrian Arab Republic, Ancient City of Aleppo (Decision **45 COM 7A.40**)
- Syrian Arab Republic, Ancient City of Bosra (Decision 45 COM 7A.41)

- Syrian Arab Republic, Ancient City of Damascus (Decision 45 COM 7A.42)
- Syrian Arab Republic, Ancient Villages of Northern Syria (Decision 45 COM 7A.43)
- Syrian Arab Republic, Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Decision 45COM 7A.44)
- Syrian Arab Republic, Site of Palmyra (Decision 45 COM 7A.45)
- United Republic of Tanzania, Selous Game Reserve (Decision **45 COM 7A.14**)
- United States of America, Everglades National Park (Decision **45 COM 7A.17**)
- Uzbekistan, Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Decision 45 COM 7A.54)
- Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of), Coro and its Port (Decision **45 COM 7A.21**)
- Yemen, Historic Town of Zabid (Decision 45 COM 7A.47)
- Yemen, Old City of Sana'a (Decision **45 COM 7A.49**)
- Yemen, Old Walled City of Shibam (Decision 45 COM 7A.50)
- 3. Recalls that the following properties were inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger at its 18th extraordinary session (UNESCO, 2023):
 - Lebanon, Rachid Karami International Fair-Tripoli (Decision 18 EXT.COM 5.1)
 - Ukraine, The Historic Centre of Odesa (Decision 18 EXT.COM 5.2)
 - Yemen, Landmarks of the Ancient Kingdom of Saba, Marib (Decision 18 EXT.COM 5.3)

Decision: 45 COM 8C.3

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> the state of conservation reports of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger (WHC/23/45.COM/7A, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.2, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.3, WHC/23/45.COM/7A.Add.4),
- 2. <u>Having examined</u> the recommendations of the Advisory Bodies, <u>decides</u> to **remove** the following property from the List of World Heritage in Danger:
 - Uganda, Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Decision 45 COM 7A.25).

8D. Clarifications of property boundaries and areas by States Parties

Decision: 45 COM 8D

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/8D,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 8D** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online 2021),

- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the excellent work accomplished by States Parties in the clarification of the boundaries of their World Heritage properties and commends them for their efforts to improve the credibility of the World Heritage List;
- 4. Recalls that the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies are not able to examine proposals for minor or significant modifications to boundaries of World Heritage properties whenever the delimitations of such properties as inscribed remain unclear;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the clarifications of boundaries and areas provided by the States Parties for the following properties, as presented in the Annex of Document WHC/23/45.COM/8D:

AFRICA

- Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea, Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve
- Togo, Koutammakou, the Land of the Batammariba

ARAB STATES

Oman, Bahla Fort

ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

- China, Longmen Grottoes
- China, Old Town of Lijiang
- China, West Lake Cultural Landscape of Hangzhou
- Iran (Islamic Republic of), Bam and its Cultural Landscape
- Iran (Islamic Republic of), Meidan Emam, Esfahan
- Iran (Islamic Republic of), Pasargadae
- Iran (Islamic Republic of), Shahr-i Sokhta
- Iran (Islamic Republic of), Shushtar Historical Hydraulic System
- Japan, Historic Villages of Shirakawa-go and Gokayama
- Viet Nam, Ha Long Bay

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

- Armenia, Monastery of Geghard and the Upper Azat Valley
- Czechia, Historic Centre of Český Krumlov
- Czechia, Historic Centre of Telč
- Czechia, Kutná Hora: Historical Town Centre with the Church of St Barbara and the Cathedral of Our Lady at Sedlec
- Italy, Mantua and Sabbioneta
- Lithuania, Kernavė Archaeological Site (Cultural Reserve of Kernavė)
- Malta, City of Valletta
- Malta, Ħal Saflieni Hypogeum
- Norway, Bryggen
- Norway, West Norwegian Fjords Geirangerfjord and Nærøyfjord
- Sweden, Church Town of Gammelstad, Luleå
- Sweden, Engelsberg Ironworks

- Sweden, Hanseatic Town of Visby
- Sweden, Rock Carvings in Tanum
- Switzerland, Three Castles, Defensive Wall and Ramparts of the Market-Town of Bellinzona
- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Blenheim Palace
- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Palace of Westminster and Westminster Abbey including Saint Margaret's Church
- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Saltaire
- United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Studley Royal Park including the Ruins of Fountains Abbey

LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

- Argentina, Península Valdés
- Chile, Sewell Mining Town;
- 6. Requests the World Heritage Centre to continue the identification and collection of geographic and cartographic information of World Heritage properties in nominations where the required information is not available or not adequate;
- 7. <u>Also requests</u> the States Parties which have not yet answered the questions raised in the framework of the Retrospective Inventory, to provide all clarifications and documentation as soon as possible, and by **1 December 2023**, for their subsequent examination, if the technical requirements are met, by the 46th session of the World Heritage Committee.

8E. Adoption of Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

Decision: 45 COM 8E

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/8E,
- Commends the States Parties for the work accomplished in the elaboration of retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties located within their territories:
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value, as presented in Annex of Document WHC/23/45.COM/8E, for the following World Heritage properties:

ARAB STATES

- Egypt, Abu Mena
- Egypt, Ancient Thebes with its Necropolis
- Egypt, Historic Cairo
- Egypt, Nubian Monuments from Abu Simbel to Philae
- Egypt, Saint Catherine Area
- Iraq, Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat)

Iraq, Hatra

ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

- Australia, Tasmanian Wilderness
- Sri Lanka, Old Town of Galle and its Fortifications

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

- Croatia, Episcopal Complex of the Euphrasian Basilica in the Historic Centre of Poreč
- Croatia, Historic City of Trogir
- Croatia, The Cathedral of St James in Šibenik
- France, Historic Fortified City of Carcassonne
- Greece, Meteora
- Spain, Doñana National Park
- Spain, Historic City of Toledo
- Spain, Historic Walled Town of Cuenca
- Spain, Ibiza, Biodiversity and Culture;
- 4. <u>Notes</u> that retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger will be reviewed in priority by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. Requests the World Heritage Centre to upload the two language versions of the above-mentioned retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value on its website.

9. GLOBAL STRATEGY FOR A REPRESENTATIVE, BALANCED AND CREDIBLE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

9A. Upstream Process

Decision: 45 COM 9A

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/9A,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 9A** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021), and its previous decisions concerning the Upstream Process,
- 3. <u>Also recalling</u> that upstream support should take place at an early stage, preferably at the moment of preparation or revision of States Parties' Tentative Lists, <u>welcomes</u> that States Parties from all regions make use of the Upstream Process;
- 4. <u>Also welcomes</u> the preparation by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies of a toolkit to operationalize the "Guidance on Developing and Revising World Heritage Tentative Lists", in response to Upstream Process requests concerning Tentative Lists and <u>invites</u> States Parties to follow this guidance and toolkit whether or not they engage with the Upstream Process;

- 5. Recognizes the efforts undertaken by the State Party involved, the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre in the implementation so far of the project and <u>decides</u> to phase out the Pilot Project of the Coral Stone Mosques of the Maldives (Maldives);
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress made regarding the Upstream Process requests received from 2018 to 2021;
- 7. <u>Further welcomes</u> the submission of the Upstream Process requests received by the 31 March 2022 and 31 March 2023 deadlines, and the efforts by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to process all requests received in the timeliest manner possible within the resources available;
- 8. <u>Also invites</u> the States Parties to contribute extra-budgetary resources for the overall coordination and capacity building support of the Upstream Process, and <u>also decides</u>, in case the resources are insufficient to ensure continuity, to supplement the funding of an extra-budgetary position from the Upstream Support budget line in the World Heritage Fund:
- 9. <u>Thanks</u> the States Parties of Slovenia, Switzerland and United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland for their financial support to the overall coordination of the Upstream Process;
- 10. <u>Requests</u> the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, to present a progress report on the support offered to Upstream Process requests received, for consideration at its 46th session.

10. PERIODIC REPORTS

10A. Report on the results of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise in Asia-Pacific

Decision: 45 COM 10A

- 1. Having examined document WHC/23/45.COM/10A,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **41 COM 10A**, **43 COM 10B** and **44 COM 10D** adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively:
- 3. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that the overwhelming majority of States Parties in the Asia and the Pacific region participated in the completion and submission of Section I (State Party level) and Section II (World Heritage property level) of the Periodic Reporting questionnaire;
- 4. <u>Acknowledges</u> that the region of Asia and the Pacific was the first to undergo the Periodic Reporting exercise entirely online due to the global sanitary situation, and <u>thanks</u> the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, the Advisory Bodies, Category 2 Centres, the UNESCO Field Offices and in the region for adapting the training and accompaniment throughout the exercise in line with new engagement modalities;
- 5. <u>Notes with satisfaction</u> that a number of States Parties organised national meetings of Periodic Reporting stakeholders at different stages of the reporting process, and <u>thanks</u> the States Parties in the region for their flexibility and dedication throughout the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting exercise in Asia and the Pacific, and especially the national

- Focal Points and World Heritage site managers for their commitment and active participation;
- 6. <u>Thanks</u> the State Party of the Republic of Korea, through its Cultural Heritage Administration, for its contributions towards supporting the implementation of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the region of Asia and the Pacific via the UNESCO/Republic of Korea Funds-in-Trust mechanism;
- 7. <u>Welcomes with satisfaction</u> the Third Cycle Regional Report for the Asia and the Pacific region and <u>encourages</u> all States Parties to widely disseminate its main outcomes among all relevant stakeholders in the region;
- 8. Endorses the Third Cycle Regional Framework Action Plan developed in cooperation with all States Parties and other heritage stakeholders in the region and notes with satisfaction that the priorities align with those set out in the Declaration unanimously adopted at the UNESCO World Conference on Cultural Policies and Sustainable Development MONDIACULT 2022 (Mexico City, September 2022) and the reflections undertaken at the international conference "The Next 50 The Future of World Heritage in Challenging Times, Enhancing Resilience and Sustainability" (Delphi, November 2022);
- 9. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties to appropriate the Regional Framework Action Plan into their national and sub-regional heritage strategies and policies, and <u>requests</u> UNESCO, in collaboration with the Category 2 Centres, the Advisory Bodies and other partners, to support States Parties in its implementation;
- 10. Notes that the Republic of Korea has approved, under its Funds-in-Trust at UNESCO, an extra-budgetary project to be coordinated by the World Heritage Centre on transboundary heritage in the region and beyond, as a follow-up of the main priorities identified through the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting, invites the Advisory Bodies and other relevant technical partners to provide advisory services and participate in the activities associated with this project, and also encourages all interested Donors to support activities that are in line with the priorities and activities identified in the Framework Action Plan by making dedicated funding available to the World Heritage Centre and the UNESCO Field Offices;
- Encourages States Parties in the region to initiate regular meetings at the regional and/or sub-regional level to ensure continuous implementation and monitoring of the Regional Framework Action Plan, and <u>invites</u> States Parties and other relevant stakeholders to support such efforts;
- 12. <u>Takes note</u> of the possible publication of a World Heritage Papers Series volume dedicated to the Third Periodic Report for the Asia and the Pacific region, if the financial situation permits, and <u>encourages</u> States Parties to make financial contributions available at the World Heritage Centre for this purpose;
- 13. <u>Requests</u> the UNESCO World Heritage Centre to monitor the implementation of the Framework Action Plan for Asia and the Pacific in view of preparing a mid-cycle assessment report after 3 years.

10B. Report on the results of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise in Latin America and the Caribbean

Decision: 45 COM 10B

- 1. Having examined document WHC/23/45.COM/10B,
- 2. Recalling Decisions 41 COM 10A, 42 COM 10A, 43 COM 10B and 44 COM 10D adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/Online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Commends</u> the efforts of States Parties in the Latin America and the Caribbean region in the completion and submission of Section I, and the very high level of completion and submission of Section II of the Periodic Reporting questionnaire;
- 4. <u>Thanks</u> the Regional World Heritage Institute in Zacatecas (Mexico) and the Regional Heritage Management Training Centre 'Lucio Costa' (Brazil), and Advisory Bodies in facilitating the Periodic Reporting exercise in the region;
- 5. <u>Welcomes</u> with satisfaction the Third Cycle Regional Report in Latin America and the Caribbean and encourages the States Parties to widely disseminate it among all relevant stakeholders in the region;
- 6. <u>Takes note</u> of the planned publication of the Third Cycle Periodic Report in the Latin America and the Caribbean region in the World Heritage paper series, subject to the availability of funding resources, and invites States Parties to contribute financially for this purpose;
- 7. <u>Also commends</u> the joint efforts made by the national Focal Points and World Heritage site managers, the UNESCO World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in producing an Action Plan framework in an adaptable format, in order to facilitate its appropriation and implementation by the States Parties;
- 8. <u>Endorses</u> the Third Cycle Regional Framework Action Plan developed in cooperation with all States Parties and other heritage stakeholders in the region and notes with satisfaction that the priorities align with those set out in the Declaration unanimously adopted at the UNESCO World Conference on Cultural Policies and Sustainable Development MONDIACULT 2022 (Mexico City, 2022) and the reflections undertaken at the international conference 'The Next 50 The Future of World Heritage in Challenging Times, Enhancing Resilience and Sustainability' (Delphi, 2022);
- 9. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties to appropriate the Third Cycle Regional Framework Action Plan into their national and sub-regional heritage strategies and policies, and <u>requests</u> the World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, the Category 2 Centres, and other partners, to support States Parties in its implementation;
- 10. <u>Also requests</u> the UNESCO World Heritage Centre to monitor the implementation of the Framework Regional Action Plan in view of preparing a mid-cycle assessment report to be presented to World Heritage Committee after three years.

10C. Follow-up on the implementation of the Action Plans for the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the Africa and Arab States regions

Decision: 45 COM 10C.1

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10C,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 10B** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/Online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in the follow-up of the implementation of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting Action Plan in the Africa region (2021-2027);
- 4. <u>Expresses</u> its appreciation to the African World Heritage Fund for its follow-up on the implementation of the Action Plan for Africa (2021-2027);
- 5. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the financial contribution of the Governments of China, France, Japan, the Netherlands, Norway, Switzerland and the Sultanate of Oman, to the activities carried out in the framework of the implementation of the Action Plan 2021-2027 for the Africa region;
- 6. <u>Calls upon</u> States Parties to financially and technically support the implementation of the Regional Action Plan for the Africa Region through follow-up activities with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, the Advisory Bodies, the École du patrimoine mondial africain and the African World Heritage Fund;
- 7. <u>Takes note with satisfaction</u> of the creation of the African Site Managers Network, working to develop a network of African universities and five centres of excellence in each of the five subregions to empower local experts and better institutionalise capacity development in implementing the World Heritage Convention in Africa and, notably, in synergy with the other UNESCO Culture Conventions;
- 8. Requests the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, in collaboration with the Advisory Bodies, the African World Heritage Fund and with the support of States Parties, to continue its efforts to coordinate and implement the Regional Capacity Building Programme according to the Action Plan 2021-2027;
- 9. <u>Acknowledges with appreciation</u> that the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa was informed by an inclusive consultation process, which included the seven Arab States located in the African Continent, and that it is aligned with the regional Action Plans for Africa and the Arab States;
- 10. Also acknowledges with appreciation that the outcomes of the UNESCO World Conference on Cultural Policies and Sustainable Development MONDIACULT 2022 (Mexico City, 2022), and the reflections undertaken at the international conference The Next 50 The Future of World Heritage in Challenging Times, Enhancing Resilience and Sustainability (Delphi, 2022), as well as the Yaoundé Call to Action adopted at the Sub-Regional Celebration of the 50th Anniversary of the UNESCO World Heritage Convention in Central Africa (Yaoundé, 2022) have been taken into consideration in the implementation of activities carried out thereafter:
- 11. <u>Further reminds</u> States Parties of the Africa region, which have not already done so, to submit their Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value by **1 February 2024** at the latest, as well as clarifications of boundaries by **1 December 2023** at the latest;
- 12. <u>Reiterates</u> its request to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre to monitor the implementation of the Regional Action Plan, in collaboration with the African World

Heritage Fund, in view of preparing a mid-cycle assessment report to be presented to the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

Decision: 45 COM 10C.2

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10C,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 10A** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/Online, 2021).
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in the follow-up on the implementation of the Third Cycle Regional Action Plan for the Arab States (2021-2027);
- 4. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> to the Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH) for its follow-up on the implementation of the Action Plan for the Arab States (2021-2027):
- 5. <u>Invites</u> the States Parties to support the implementation of the Action Plan for the Arab States (2021-2027), and to continue their collaboration with the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, the Advisory Bodies and ARC-WH in implementing the related activities;
- 6. <u>Acknowledges with appreciation</u> that the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa was informed by an inclusive consultation process, which included the seven Arab States located in the African Continent, and that it is aligned with the regional Action Plans for Africa and the Arab States;
- 7. Also acknowledges with appreciation that the outcomes of the UNESCO World Conference on Cultural Policies and Sustainable Development MONDIACULT 2022 (Mexico City, 2022), and the reflections of international conference The Next 50 The Future of World Heritage in Challenging Times, Enhancing Resilience and Sustainability (Delphi, 2022), have been taken into consideration in the implementation of activities carried out thereafter;
- 8. Reminds the States Parties of the Arab States region, which have not already done so, to submit their Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value by **1 February 2024** at the latest, as well as clarifications of boundaries by **1 December 2023** at the latest;
- 9. <u>Reiterates</u> its request to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre to monitor the implementation of the Regional Action Plan in view of preparing a mid-cycle assessment report to be presented to the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.

10D. Progress report on the implementation of the Action Plans for the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the other regions

Decision: 45 COM 10D.1

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10D,
- 2. Recalling Decision **43 COM 10A.1** and **44 COM 10C.3** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online 2021) session respectively,

- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in the follow-up of the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the region of Asia and the Pacific;
- 4. <u>Thanks</u> the Governments of China, Japan, the Netherlands and the Republic of Korea as well as the European Union for their contributions towards supporting follow-up activities to the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the region of Asia and the Pacific;
- 5. <u>Takes note</u> of the progress made on the Silk Roads nomination process, initiated by the Asian States Parties in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre, and <u>commends</u> the fruitful international cooperation between the national institutions of various States Parties in the region:
- 6. Welcomes the progress made in finalizing Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value in Asia and the Pacific and reminds States Parties that have not yet done so to submit Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value by 1 February 2024, as well as clarifications of boundaries by 1 December 2023 at the latest, for review by the Advisory Bodies and consideration at the upcoming sessions of the Committee.

Decision: 45 COM 10D.2

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10D,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 10C.4** adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in the follow-up of the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting for Latin America and the Caribbean,
- 4. <u>Thanks</u> the Governments of Flanders (Belgium), Germany, Japan, the Netherlands, the Republic of Korea, Norway as well as the World Bank and European Union for their contributions towards supporting follow-up activities to the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the region of Latin America and the Caribbean.

Decision: 45 COM 10D.3

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10D,
- 2. Recalling Decisions **43 COM 10A.5** and **44 COM 10C.5** adopted at its 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Notes</u> that further progress has been made in the follow-up of the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting for Europe and North America, and <u>encourages</u> the States Parties of the region to continue their efforts to address the priority actions identified during the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting, while keeping informed the World Heritage Centre on significant advances and/or challenges;
- 4. Recalls further that the follow-up of the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting has considerable resource and workload implications for both States Parties and the World Heritage Centre and therefore, encourages States Parties to both financially support follow-up activities to the Second Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the Europe and North America region within their countries and to consider making voluntary contributions to

- the sub-account of the World Heritage Fund dedicated to enhancing the human capacities of the Secretariat or seconding experts;
- 5. <u>Also notes</u> the lack of financial support from States Parties to follow up on the 2016 Helsinki Action Plan Monitoring survey and to assess the results of the 2015 sub-regional Action Plan for North America;
- 6. <u>Welcomes</u> the progress made in finalizing Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value in Europe and <u>reminds</u> the States Parties of the region which have not already done so to submit their Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value by **1 February 2024** at the latest, as well as clarifications of boundaries by **1 December 2023** at the latest;
- 7. <u>Invites</u> the World Heritage Centre to include in the Regional Report to be submitted to its 46th session an assessment of the progress made in the implementation of the respective Action Plans based on the information shared by the States Parties in the framework of the Periodic Reporting exercise between 2022 and 2023.

10E. Progress report on the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the other regions

Decision: 45 COM 10E

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/10E,
- Recalling Decisions 41 COM 10A, 41 COM 11, 42 COM 10A, 43 COM 10A.1, 43 COM 10B, 43 COM 11A and 44 COM 10D adopted at its 41st (Krakow, 2017), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/Online, 2021) sessions respectively, as well as the provisions of Paragraph 204 of the Operational Guidelines,
- 3. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the successful start of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the Europe and North America region and <u>commends</u> the preparations undertaken by the Secretariat prior to the exercise;
- 4. <u>Noting</u> that the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting is following a holistic and a State Partydriven approach, <u>invites</u> States Parties to financially support activities in the framework of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting in the Europe and North America region;
- 5. <u>Thanks</u> the Government of Sweden for the funds provided to ensure that the Secretariat is able to maintain a holistic approach throughout the Third Cycle, and <u>calls upon</u> States Parties to continue providing sustainable funding towards the global coordination of the Periodic Reporting exercise and its follow-up;
- 6. Takes note of the outcomes of the MONDIACULT 2022 Declaration and the opportunity provided by the UNESCO Global Report on Cultural Policies to analyse the relevant input from States Parties to UNESCO's cultural policy monitoring efforts, requests the Secretariat to use the Reflection Period to proceed with a feasibility study to consider the practical modalities of enhancing the Periodic Reporting of the Convention in this framework, including, inter alia, the possibility of moving from a regional approach to Periodic Reporting to a global approach, examining the implementation of the Convention at global level through a succinct analytical report prepared by the Secretariat, and reviewing the analytical framework for Periodic Reporting and its monitoring indicators:

- 7. <u>Calls upon</u> States Parties to provide to the World Heritage Centre, through earmarked contributions to the World Heritage Fund, other voluntary contributions and/or seconded personnel, the necessary financial and human resources to proceed with the requested feasibility study;
- 8. Requests the World Heritage Centre to submit a report on the overall implementation of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting at its 46th session.

11. FOLLOW-UP TO RECOMMENDATIONS OF EVALUATIONS AND AUDITS ON WORKING METHODS AND OUTCOMES OF THE AD-HOC WORKING GROUP

Decision: 45 COM 11

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/11.Rev,
- 2. <u>Expresses its appreciation</u> to the Ad-hoc Working Group for its efforts and <u>takes note</u> of its recommendations:
- 3. Recalling Decisions 40 COM 11, 42 COM 12A, 43 COM 8, 43 COM 12, 44 COM 8, 44 COM 11 and 44 COM 12 adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018), 43rd (Baku, 2019) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 4. <u>Taking into account</u> the heavy budget constraints of the World Heritage Fund and the need for an effective management of the increasing size of the List and the call for a more balanced World Heritage List, considering the aspirations of non-represented and under-represented States Parties and regions on the World Heritage List;
- 5. <u>Taking note</u> of the Global Strategy adopted by the World Heritage Committee at its 18th session (Phuket, 1994) to provide a broad framework for an analysis and action programme to reduce the gap in regional representation to achieve a balanced and credible World Heritage List, considering the aspirations of non-represented and underrepresented States Parties and regions on the World Heritage List;
- 6. <u>Decides</u> to create an Open-ended Working Group of States Parties to the Convention, transfer the mandate of the Ad-hoc Working Group to it and allow all States Parties to the Convention to continue contributing to the discussions in order to:
 - a) Consider the necessary improvement aiming at reducing the gap of the representation of States Parties on the World Heritage List and enhancing the balance of the List,
 - b) Propose solutions to the technical evaluation requirements, including improving capacity building activities,
 - c) Explore the possibility of using additional service providers,
 - d) Propose sustainable solutions to the financial requirements of the nomination process to implement the above including the Preliminary Assessment,
 - e) Consider the mandate and working methods for an extension of this Open-ended Working Group, with a view to starting a fundamental reflection on the operation of the World Heritage Convention;

- 7. <u>Also decides</u> that the Open-ended Working Group shall work in consultation with the World Heritage Centre, Advisory Bodies and, as appropriate, relevant stakeholders, and submit its report and recommendations to the 46th session of the Committee;
- 8. <u>Calls upon</u> States Parties to the Convention to voluntarily contribute to the creation of this Open-ended Working Group through voluntary contributions;
- 9. <u>Also takes note</u> of the Committee consensus in favour of Saudi Arabia assuming the chairpersonship of the Open-ended Working Group.

12. REVISION OF THE OPERATIONAL GUIDELINES

Decision: 45 COM 12

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/12,
 - PART I Assessment of the impact of Decision 40 COM 11 (Paragraph 61 of the Operational Guidelines)
- 2. Recalling Decisions **40 COM 11** and **44 COM 8** adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and extended 44th (Fuzhou/online, 2021) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Taking into account</u> the heavy budget constraints of the World Heritage Fund and the need for an effective management of the increasing size of the World Heritage List and the call for a more balanced World Heritage List,
- 4. <u>Decides</u> that the impact of the proposed amendments of Paragraph 61 of the Operational Guidelines will be assessed at the 51st session of the World Heritage Committee, and <u>encourages</u> States Parties to consider submitting nominations under natural criteria, based on IUCN's regional and thematic studies;
- 5. <u>Adopts</u> the proposed revision of Paragraph 61 of the Operational Guidelines, as presented in Annex 1 of Document WHC/23/45.COM/12;
 - PART II Revision of Chapter VIII and Annex 14 of the Operational Guidelines concerning the World Heritage Emblem and its use following the changes to the UNESCO logo
- 6. <u>Also takes note</u> of the new "Graphical Standards and Logo Toolkit" document issued by UNESCO Secretariat in July 2021 as a response to the recommendations of the Working Group on Communication established within the Strategic Transformation process;
- 7. Recognizing that changes reflected in this new toolkit will have an impact on the joint use of the UNESCO logo and World Heritage emblem, consequently <u>adopts</u> the revisions to Chapter VIII and Annex 14 of the Operational Guidelines proposed in Annex 2 of Document WHC/23/45.COM/12.

13. 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION

Decision: 45 COM 13

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/13,
- 2. Recalling Decision **44 COM 5A**, adopted at its extended 44th session (Fuzhou/online, 2021) and Resolution **23 GA 9**, adopted by the General Assembly of States Parties at its 23rd session (UNESCO, 2021),
- 3. <u>Thanks</u> all the States Parties, and organizations, that have carried out more than 65 activities to mark the celebration of the 50th Anniversary of the World Heritage Convention, as well as other partners for related events and publications on the theme "The Next 50: World Heritage as a source of resilience, humanity and innovation";
- 4. <u>Expresses appreciation</u> to the Secretariat for the 50th Anniversary Survey that was opened to all stakeholders of the World Heritage Convention and to all those who provided their valuable reflections to this end, and <u>takes note</u> of the Survey's conclusions:
- 5. <u>Thanks also</u> the Government of Cameroon for the regional celebration of the 50th Anniversary in Central Africa and <u>takes note</u> of the Yaounde Call for Action and the priorities it has identified for Central Africa in particular;
- 6. <u>Thanks furthermore</u> the Government of Greece for the Delphi Conference and <u>requests</u> the Secretariat to follow up on its conclusions and outcomes;
- 7. <u>Expresses its gratitude</u> to the Government of France and private sector partner, Felissimo, for their financial contributions in the context of the 50th Anniversary of the World Heritage Convention;
- 8. Recognizes all who have contributed to the reflections on the 50th Anniversary of the Convention, commending in particular the scientific contribution of experts, and <u>invites</u> States Parties to take note of the key reflections of the 50th Anniversary and enhance their implementation of the World Heritage Convention and the protection of the world's cultural and natural heritage recognizing its enduring and irreplaceable value for furthering sustainable development and for biological and cultural diversity worldwide.

14. INTERNATIONAL ASSISTANCE

Decision: 45 COM 14

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/14,
- 2. <u>Decides</u> to approve the following International Assistance requests:
 - a) "Conservation and management of Sudanese style mosques in northern Côte d'Ivoire" (Côte d'Ivoire) for an amount of US\$ 85,058 under the Conservation and Management-Culture budget, replacing the "per diem" amounts of US\$ 8,000 and US\$ 5,000 (corresponding to the defrayment for the participants in the workshops) by the fixed amounts of US\$ 1,800 and US\$ 1,125 respectively,

- b) "Preparation of a Conservation Management Plan for the Asante Traditional Buildings of Ghana" (Ghana) for an amount of US\$ 43,678 under the Conservation and Management-Culture budget, the US\$ 1,700 foreseen for the DSA for the international experts being reallocated to cover the DSA of an additional seven cultural officers, under whose jurisdiction the Ashanti Traditional Buildings are located, and three conservators in the Upper West and Central regional offices of Ghana Museums and Monuments Board,
- c) "Training program about the preparation of site conservation plan" (Egypt) for an amount of US\$ 56,504 under the Conservation and Management-Culture budget; the status of the national experts will be clarified prior to the establishment of the contract, since the World Heritage Fund cannot cover salaries of a government's employees,
- d) "Condition assessment of shipwrecks within the Bikini Atoll Nuclear Test Site" (Marshall Islands) for an amount of US\$ 70,000 under the Conservation and Management-Culture budget (i.e. without the amounts dedicated to diving equipment (US\$ 3,000) and marine park fees (US\$ 1,800)),
- e) "Conservation of Ancient Siva Devale No 01 within the World Heritage site of Polonnaruwa Ancient City" (Sri Lanka) for an amount of US\$ 47,500 under the Conservation and Management assistance-Nature budget as authorized by Paragraph 240 of the Operational Guidelines,
- f) "Raising awareness of the population of the Park to the seismic threats to the Department of the North and the installation of a system of conservation, maintenance of the monuments and a compilation of technical specifications for earthquake-resistant reinforcement of the vernacular architecture of the PNH CSSR" (Haiti) for an amount of US\$ 33,325 under the Conservation and Management-Culture budget; at the time of the implementation of the activity, the use of International Assistance funds should focus primarily on the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value, in close consultation between the State Party, the Secretariat (World Heritage Centre and the UNESCO Office in Port-au-Prince) and the Advisory Bodies;
- 3. <u>Having noted</u> the lack of funding under Preparatory Assistance and the amount left under the "Conservation and Management Assistance" category, <u>authorizes</u> the transfer of US\$ 119,500 from the Conservation and Management Assistance budget to the Preparatory Assistance budget;
- 4. Welcomes the review of the International Assistance 2016-2021 focusing on Conservation and Management Assistance and Emergency Assistance and takes note of the outcomes and the benefits that International Assistance has brought to Africa, LDCs and to local communities, and the role it has played in furthering sustainable development in the context of World Heritage properties; and invites States Parties benefitting from International Assistance to submit full reports on the interventions and outcomes;
- 5. <u>Encourages</u> States Parties considering preparation of International Assistance requests to contact the World Heritage Centre for advice either on the topic and/or on the technicalities of their International Assistance requests well ahead the annual deadline of 31 October.

15. PRESENTATION OF THE FINAL ACCOUNTS OF THE WORLD HERITAGE FUND FOR 2020-2021, REPORT ON THE EXECUTION OF THE BUDGET FOR THE BIENNIUM 2022-2023, BUDGET PROPOSAL OF THE WORLD HERITAGE FUND UNDER THE BIENNIUM 2024-2025 AND FOLLOW UP DECISION 44 COM 14

Decision: 45 COM 15

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/23/45.COM/15,
 - Part I: Final reports on the World Heritage Fund for 2020-2021 and for 2022-2023
- 2. <u>Takes note</u> of the financial report for the 2020-2021 biennium, which ended 31 December 2021, as presented in Annexes I and II of Document WHC/23/45.COM/15;
- 3. <u>Also takes</u> note of the 2022-2023 financial reports at year-end 2022 and as of 30 June 2023 as presented in Annexes III, IV and V of Document WHC/23/45.COM/15;
- 4. Recalls that the payment of assessed compulsory and voluntary contributions is, as per Article 16 of the World Heritage Convention, an obligation incumbent on all States Parties which have ratified the Convention and calls upon all States Parties, which have not yet paid the totality of their assessed contributions for 2023, including voluntary contributions in accordance with Article 16.2 of the Convention, to ensure that their contributions are paid at their earliest convenience;
- 5. <u>Thanks</u> those States Parties which have already made supplementary voluntary contributions in the past years and also calls upon all other States Parties to commit to consider allocating supplementary voluntary contributions to the World Heritage Fund in line with the Roadmap for the Sustainability of the World Heritage Fund with the target of 10 or more States Parties doubling their annual contributions;

Part II: Preparation of the budget for the biennium 2024-2025

- 6. <u>Approves</u> the budget for the World Heritage Fund for the biennium 2024-2025 at the level of US\$ 5,898,076 and its corresponding breakdown as shown in Annex VII of Document WHC/23/45.COM/15, and <u>decides</u> to retain the Emergency Reserve Fund and the Provision for exchange rate fluctuation at the level of US\$ 400,000 each;
- 7. <u>Decides</u> that contracts for the implementation of the Preliminary Assessment will be established annually with the Advisory Bodies at a maximum level of US\$ 21,161 per file;
- 8. Recalling its Decision **44 COM 14**, paragraphs 17 and 19 and <a href="https://harvner.com/harvner.c
- 9. Recalling paragraph 168bis of the Operational Guidelines, <u>further calls on</u> States Parties to pay voluntary contributions to the sub-account dedicated to the Evaluations of nominations to support the submission of Preliminary Assessment requests and nomination dossiers, and <u>requests</u> the World Heritage Centre to report on the use of sub-

- account dedicated to the Evaluations of nominations and on the use of the operating reserve at its 46th session;
- 10. Recognizing the need for additional human resources at the World Heritage Centre, <u>calls upon furthermore</u> States Parties to consider allocating voluntary contributions to the subaccount of the World Heritage Fund dedicated to human resources and <u>authorizes</u> the World Heritage Centre to enhance the use of the World Heritage Fund to complement funding for temporary staff, as appropriate, for the implementation of activities decided by the World Heritage Committee in the framework of the Fund;

Part III: Follow-up to Decision 44 COM 14

- 11. Recalling its Decision 44 COM 14 on the sustainability of the World Heritage Fund,
- 12. <u>Takes note</u> of the work undertaken by the Ad-hoc Working Group and its recommendations made in Document WHC-23/45.COM/11.Rev with regard to the follow-up of Decision **44 COM 14**;
- 13. Recalls that the sustainability of the World Heritage Fund and overall funding for World Heritage are strategic issues and a shared responsibility which concerns all States Parties and relevant partners, affecting the overall credibility of the World Heritage Convention, including effectiveness and efficiency of World Heritage protection everywhere;
- 14. <u>Having considered</u> the current options for voluntary contributions, <u>calls upon</u> all States Parties to allocate voluntary contributions to the sub-account for Human Capacities and to the sub-account for the Evaluation of nominations, and to make unrestricted voluntary contributions to the World Heritage Fund, including by choosing among the options described in Resolution **19 GA 8** as follows:
 - Option 1: Increasing the standard percentage used in the calculation of the contributions to the World Heritage Fund from 1% to 2%,
 - Option 3.1: Increasing the contributions by a flat rate of US\$3,300 per property inscribed.
 - Option 3.2: Increasing the contributions by an additional 4% of the current assessed contribution per property inscribed.
 - Option 3.3: Increasing the contributions by an additional amount per property inscribed, according to a percentage increasing with the number of properties inscribed,
 - Option 3.4: Increasing the contributions by an additional amount per property inscribed, according to a percentage decreasing with the number of properties inscribed.
 - Option 4: Increasing the contributions on the basis of the number of tourists arrivals at World Heritage Sites,
 - Option 5: Contributing per activity;
- 15. Recalling its Decision **42 COM 14**, paragraph 17, reiterates its invitation to all States Parties to support fund-raising events dedicated to the implementation of the Convention such as the Partners' Forum, and also encourages all States Parties to assist the World Heritage Centre in fund-raising activities, in the form of secondments dedicated to fund-raising or in-kind/pro-bono consultancy in this field;
- 16. Requests the World Heritage Centre to report on the implementation of the Resource Mobilization and Communication Plan for 2022-2023 at its 46th session.

16. OTHER BUSINESS

No Decision.

17. ELECTION OF THE CHAIRPERSON, VICE-CHAIRPERSONS AND RAPPORTEUR OF THE 46TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Decision: 45 COM 17

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Takes note</u> of the willingness by the State Party of India to host the 46th session of the World Heritage Committee and <u>thanks</u> the Indian authorities for their interest;
- 2. <u>Decides</u> to prolong the mandate of its Bureau composed of the following members:

Chairperson: Dr Abdulelah Al-Tokhais (Saudi Arabia)

Rapporteur: Ms Shikha Jain (India)

Vice-Chairpersons: Argentina, Italy, Russian Federation, South Africa, Thailand,

until its 19th extraordinary session to be held during the 24th session of the General Assembly of States Parties to the World Heritage Convention in November 2023 at UNESCO Headquarters;

- 3. <u>Also decides</u> that the Bureau of the 46th session will be elected during its 19th extraordinary session, with a mandate extending until the end of the 46th session of the Committee;
- 4. <u>Further decides</u> that the dates and venue of the 46th session will be determined during the 19th extraordinary session.

18. PROVISIONAL AGENDA OF THE 46TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Decision: 45 COM 18

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/23/45.COM/18,
- 2. <u>Adopts</u> the following provisional Agenda:

PROVISIONAL AGENDA OF THE 46TH SESSION OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

OPENING SESSION

- 1. Opening session
- 2. Admission of Observers
- 3. Adoption of the Agenda and the Timetable
 - 3A. Adoption of the Agenda
 - 3B. Adoption of the Timetable

REPORTS

- 4. Report of the Rapporteur of the extended 45th session of the World Heritage Committee (Riyadh, 2023)
- 5. Reports of the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies
 - 5A. Report of the World Heritage Centre on its activities and the implementation of the World Heritage Committee's decisions
 - 5B. Reports of the Advisory Bodies
 - 5C. Progress report on the implementation of the Strategy for World Heritage in Africa
- 6. Follow-up to the World Heritage Capacity-Building Strategy and Progress report on the World Heritage-related category 2 centres
 - 6A. World Heritage-related Capacity-Building activities and Follow-up to the World Heritage Capacity-Building Strategy
 - 6B. Progress report on the activities concerning the implementation of the World Heritage Convention by the World Heritage-related category 2 centres

EXAMINATION OF THE STATE OF CONSERVATION

- 7. State of conservation of World Heritage properties
 - 7A. State of conservation of World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
 - 7B. State of conservation of World Heritage properties inscribed on the World Heritage List

ESTABLISHMENT OF THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST AND OF THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER

- 8. Nomination process
 - 8A. Tentative Lists submitted by States Parties as of 15 April 2024
 - 8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List
 - 8C. Update of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

- 8D. Clarifications of property boundaries and areas by States Parties
- 8E. Review and approval of retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

GLOBAL STRATEGY FOR A REPRESENTATIVE, BALANCED AND CREDIBLE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

- 9. Global Strategy for a representative, balanced and credible World Heritage List
 - 9A. Upstream Process

PERIODIC REPORTS

- 10. Periodic Reports
 - 10A. Report on the results of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting exercise in Europe and North America
 - 10B. Mid-Cycle assessment report on the implementation of the Third Cycle Action Plan in Africa and the Arab States
 - 10C. Report on the implementation of the Third Cycle of Periodic Reporting and general reflection on Periodic Reporting

WORKING METHODS AND TOOLS

11. Report of the Open-ended Working Group established by the extended 45th session of the World Heritage Committee

FINANCIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE ISSUES

- 12. International Assistance
- 13. Presentation of the final accounts of the World Heritage Fund for the biennium 2022-2023, Report on the execution of the budget for the biennium 2024-2025, Follow-up to Decision **45 COM 15**

CLOSING SESSION

- Other business
- 15. Election of the Chairperson, Vice-Chairpersons and Rapporteur of the 47th session of the World Heritage Committee
- 16. Provisional Agenda of the 47th session of the World Heritage Committee
- 17. Adoption of Decisions
- 18. Closing session

19. ADOPTION OF DECISIONS

No Decision.

20. CLOSING SESSION

No Decision.