

45 COM

WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B4 Paris, 31 juillet 2023

Original: anglais

CONVENTION CONCERNANT LA PROTECTION DU PATRIMOINE CULTUREL ET NATUREL MONDIAL

COMITÉ INTERGOUVERNEMENTAL DE LA PROTECTION DU PATRIMOINE MONDIAL CULTUREL ET NATUREL

Quarante-cinquième session élargie Riyad, Royaume d'Arabie Saoudite 10 - 25 septembre 2023

Point 8 de l'ordre du jour provisoire : Établissement de la Liste du patrimoine mondial et de la Liste du patrimoine mondial en péril

INF.8B4: Notifications d'erreurs factuelles

RÉSUMÉ

Ce document contient les notifications relatives aux erreurs factuelles reçues de la part des États parties avant le 30 juin 2023, et transmises en utilisant le formulaire approprié en conformité avec le paragraphe 150 des Orientations.

Liste alphabétique par État partie des notifications identifiant des erreurs factuelles dans les rapports d'évaluation des Organisations consultatives relatifs aux propositions d'inscription 2022 devant être examinées lors de la 45° session élargie du Comité du patrimoine mondial

État partie	Proposition d'inscription sur la Liste du patrimoine mondial	N° d'o	rdre	Recomm.	Рр
	SITES NATURELS				
Azerbaïdjan, Iran (République islamique d')	Forêts hyrcaniennes [extension et nouvelle proposition d'inscription des « Forêts hyrcaniennes » Iran (République islamique d') inscrit en 2019, critère (ix)]	1584	Bis	OK	3
Congo	Massif Forestier d'Odzala-Kokoua	692	Rev	D	12
Viet Nam	Baie d'Ha Long – archipel de Cat Ba [extension et nouvelle proposition d'inscription de la « Baie d'Ha Long » inscrit en 1994, critères (vii)(viii), élargi en 2000]		Ter	D	16
	SITES CULTURELS				
Allemagne	Patrimoine médiéval juif d'Erfurt	1656		I	50
Cambodge	Koh Ker : site archéologique de l'ancienne Lingapura ou Chok Gargyar	1667		I	43
Canada	Tr'ondëk-Klondike	1564		I	44
Danemark	Forteresses circulaires de l'âge des Vikings	1660		I	48
Éthiopie	Le paysage culturel du pays gedeo	1641		I	49
Guatemala	Parc archéologique national Tak'alik Ab'aj	1663		R	51
Iran (République islamique d')	Le caravansérail persan	1668		R	65
Lituanie	Kaunas, ville moderniste : une architecture de l'optimisme, 1919-1939			D	77
République de Corée	Tumuli de Gaya	1666		I	86
Spain	Talayotic Menorca - A cyclopean island odyssey	1528	Rev	I	88
Türkiye	Gordion	1669		1	89

Les notifications d'erreurs factuelles sont présentées dans la langue dans laquelle les États parties les ont soumises et présentées selon l'ordre alphabétique anglais.

Liste alphabétique par État partie des notifications identifiant des erreurs factuelles dans les rapports d'évaluation des Organisations consultatives relatifs aux propositions d'inscription 2023 devant être examinées lors de la 45° session élargie du Comité du patrimoine mondial

État partie	Proposition d'inscription sur la Liste du patrimoine mondial	N° d'ordre		Recomm.	Pp
	SITES NATURELS				
Arabie saoudite	'Uruq Bani Ma'arid	1699		I	101
Canada	Anticosti	1686		I	93
Rwanda	Parc national de Nyungwe	1697		R	98
	SITES CULTURELS				
Azerbaïdjan	Le paysage culturel du peuple Khinalig et la route de transhumance « Köç Yolu »	1696		I	103
Fédération de Russie	Observatoires astronomiques de l'université fédérale de Kazan	1678		D	138
France	La Maison Carrée de Nîmes	1569	Rev	I	104
Inde	Ensembles sacrés des Hoysala	1670		R	108
Indonésie	L'axe cosmologique de Yogyakarta et ses monuments historiques emblématiques	1671		I	110
Iran (République islamique d')	Le Paysage culturel de Masouleh	1690		N	113
Palestine	Ancien Jéricho/Tell es-Sultan	1687		I	132
Portugal	Centre historique de Guimarães et zone du Couros [extension de « Centre historique de Guimarães », inscrit en 2001, critères (ii)(iii)(iv)]		Bis	OK	135
Suriname	Site archéologique de Jodensavanne : établissement de Jodensavanne et cimetière de Cassipora Creek	1680		I	153
Thaïlande	La ville ancienne de Si Thep	1662		l	155
Türkiye	Mosquées médiévales d'Anatolie dotées de colonnes et d'une structure supérieure en bois	1694		R	157

Les notifications d'erreurs factuelles sont présentées dans la langue dans laquelle les États parties les ont soumises et présentées selon l'ordre alphabétique anglais.



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Azerbaijan / Iran (Islamic Republic of)

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Hyrcanian Forests [extension of Hyrcanian Forests (Islamic Republic of Iran), inscribed in 2019, criterion (ix)]

RELEVANT ADVISORY BODY'S EVALUATION: IUCN

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluatio n	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 54, Column 1, line 13	The Global Comparative Analysis does not consider the neighboring Arasbaran Protected Area, on the Tentative List of the Islamic Republic of Iran, under criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x). This site was evaluated by IUCN in 2018 and deferred by the Committee (Decision 42 COM 8B.7). The nomination dossier for Arasbaran clearly separated the Arasbaran from the Hyrcanian region. This is also reflected in contemporary literature, which locates the geographical distribution of the Hyrcanian Forests within the watershed of and exposed to the Caspian Sea, covering the gradient from the coast to the upper limit of the tree line.	After nomination of Arasbaran protected area for inscription on UNESCOs world heritage list, several Iranian scientists was disagreeing with nomination of Arasbaran protected area separately from Hyrcanian forests as an individual dossier: Dr. Morteza Sharifi who had very long experience in conservation of forest ecosystems emphasized "The Arasbaran protected area must have inscribed as a component part of Hyrcanian forest in UNESCOs world heritage list and the separate nomination of the area is not logic. Also, the area similar to Golestan national park is an ecotone and extreme of Hyrcanian forest in the western territory". Before decision of preparation of dossier for extension of two nominated component parts (Blue color points No 4 and 5 in the western part of the map in (Fig.1) in Dizmar proposed area to Hyrcanian forest inscribed property, we had a discussion with several Scientists in related field that they are knowing the Dizmar protected area well about the relation of this area as an isolated	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN thanks the State Party for the detailed scientific account presented in this factual error letter. In relation to the points raised by the State Party, IUCN wishes to add the following points: 1. In its 2019 evaluation report, IUCN has noted the following: "Apart from this continuous forested belt shared between 3 provinces (Gilan, Mazandaran and Golestan), there are some smaller forests ecosystem rich in Hyrcanian species remaining in Azerbaijan and a few patches only with scrub forests in Turkmenistan." The evaluation report also noted that: "The components selected encompass the widest array of ecosystems and species habitats illustrating the main biodiversity features and assets that can be met in the whole Hyrcanian Forest (). IUCN recommends that a finite serial site for the Hyrcanian Forest be created through future extension to other areas located in Azerbaijan." These statements

part with other parts of Hyrcanian forest we also investigate various related published references:

Dr. Hossein Akhani, Dr. Morteza

Djamali, Dr. **Atefeh** Ghorbanalizadeh and Dr. Elias Ramezani, Professors Universities of Tehran, Cadex of France and Urmia in their published paper entitled "Plant biodiversity of Hyrcanian relict forests, N Iran: An overview of the flora, vegetation, paleoecology and conservation" in Pak. J. Bot., 42: 231-258, 2010, stated that: The Hyrcanian forests Apart from its continuous belt were located in provinces of Gilan, Mazandaran and Golestan, there are some isolated forests, in the west, located in East Azarbaijan province (the proposed area) and the forest isolates in the east, near Joozak located in Northern Khorassan province. Also, a few patches of scrub forests rich in Hyrcanian species exist in Turkmenistan.

Dr Adel Jalili and Dr Ziba Jamzad in the book of Red Data of Iran indicate the proposed area as Hyrcanian territory (**Fig. 2 and 3.**).

Dr. Khosro Sagheb Talebi, Dr. Toktam Sajedi, Dr. Mehdi Pourhashemi in chapter two of the book entitled: "Forests of Iran: A Treasure from the Past, a Hope for the Future" which published by Springer, stated that the proposed area is in the Euxino- Hyrcanian Province (Fig. 4).

In the book published by Michael Zohary, famous botanist entitled: "Geobotanical foundations of the Middle East", Vols. 1–2. Fischer, Stuttgart, 1973, Stated that the western boundary of Hyrcanian forests is Aras River. (The Aras River is the boundary of Dizmar protected area (**Fig. 5.**).

In Reference by Frey W and Kuerschner H (1983) entitled "Contributions towards a bryophyte flora of Iran". Journ.

- were not challenged by the State Party in the factual error letter in 2019 (Committee document WHC19-43COM-INF8B4).
- 2. Accordingly, the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the existing property, adopted by the Committee in its Decision 43 COM 8B.4, defines the Hyrcanian Forests as "a unique forested massif that extends from southeastern Azerbaijan eastwards to the Golestan Province, in Iran."
- 3. In addition, there is a breadth of scientific literature that neither suggests Dizmar nor Arasbaran protected areas as being part of the Hyrcanian Forests. The definition of the extent of the Hyrcanian Forests used in IUCN's 2019 and 2022 evaluations is in line with the extent used by for instance Gholizadeh et al. (2020), Rahutsrishvili et al. (2015), Ramezani et al. (2016) and Tohidifar et al. (2016).
- 4. Figure 5 presented by the State Party in the present factual error letter and in the nomination dossier indicates that the area in question has the lowest density of woody Euxinian and Hyrcanian species and thus appears to be considerably less significant than all other component parts.
- Figure 7 presented by the State Party in the present factual error letter is annotated as "Map of the study area" (i.e. not as map of Hyrcanian Forests) in the original paper Ghorbanalizadeh Akhani (2022), and the area in question is annotated as "Arasbaran Protected Area located in East Azarbaijan" (i.e. not as "Dizmar Protected Area"). On p. 39, the paper defines the Hyrcanian forests as stretching "as a green **continuous** arc from the Talish in Azerbaijan Republic, cover the northern slopes of the Alborz Mountains along three

Bot. 2(1): 13 -19, the area mapped in Hyrcanian forest (**Fig. 6.**).

Dr. Atefeh Ghorbanalizadeh and Dr. Hossein Akhani Professors of Tehran University in their published paper in Plant Diversity, Volume 44, Issue 1, January 2022, Pages 39-69, entitled: "Plant diversity of Hyrcanian relict forests: An annotated checklist, chorology and threat categories of endemic and near endemic vascular plant species" stated that the proposed area is an isolated part of Hyrcanian forests (Fig. 7.). Some of these evidences were presented in page 41 and 48 of the nomination dossier.

Provinces Iranian (Gilan, Mazandaran and Golestan) and end in Golestan National Park (GNP) (Fig. 1). There are some isolated outliers of the Hyrcanian forests in North Khorassan Province (Jowzak area) and East Azarbaijan Province in [sic] Arasbaran Protected Area (APA)" (emphasis added). The paper does not refer to the Dizmar Protected Area. Furthermore, Fig. 6. of the same paper suggests that the percentage of the Hyrcanian endemic and near endemic species within each identified distribution pattern is the lowest in Euxinothe Hyrcanian distribution pattern. Fig. 8. in the same paper strongly suggests that the area of Dizmar Protected Area is significantly less relevant in terms of Hyrcanian endemicity than all other component parts. IUCN further notes that this paper has been published after submission of the the nomination. IUCN strongly welcomes this paper and considers that this paper may serve as a basis for further inquiry in relation to the Arasbaran Protected Area and Committee Decision 42 COM 8B.7, and as a potential basis for further inquiry in relation to future consideration of the potential of criterion (x) for the World Hyrcanian Forests Heritage property.

Beyond the present nomination, IUCN also notes this information is relevant to the potential future consideration of criterion (x) for the Hyrcanian Forests as a whole and to other potential World Heritage nominations in the region and would be happy to engage in a further technical exchange on these matters.

References:

Gholizadeh, H., Naqinezhad, A., Chytrý, M. (2020). Classification of the Hyrcanian forest vegetation, Northern Iran. Appl

			Sci. 2020; 23: 107– 126. https://doi.
			org/10.1111/avsc.12469
			Ghomi A., Akbarinia M., Hosseini
			S. M., Talebian M. H., Knapp H. D.
			(2020). Prioritizing of the Hyrcanian
			Proposed Sites for Inscription on the
			UNESCO'S World Heritage List by
			use of Decision Making Methods.
			ifej; 8 (16): 90-102,
			http://ifej.sanru.ac.ir/article-1-322-
			en.html
			Ghorbanalizadeh, A. Akhani, H.
			(2022). Plant diversity of Hyrcanian
			relict forests: An annotated
			checklist, chorology and threat
			categories of endemic and near
			endemic vascular plant species,
			Plant Diversity, 44, 1, 39-69,
			• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •
			https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pld.2021.0
			7.005.
			Nakhutsrishvili, G., Zazanashvili, N., Batsatsashvili, K., C. Mancheno
			(2015). Colchic and Hyrcanian
			forests of the Caucasus: Similarities,
			differences and conservation status.
			Flora Mediterranea. 25, pp.185-192. 10.7320/FlMedit25SI.185
			Ramezani, E., Mrotzek, A.,
			Mohadjer, M., Kakroodi, A.,
			Kroonenberg, S. and Joosten, H.
			(2016). Between the mountains and
			the sea: Late Holocene Caspian Sea
			level fluctuations and vegetation
			history of the lowland forests of northern Iran. Ouaternary
			northern Iran. Quaternary International. 408.
			10.1016/j.quaint.2015.12.041.
			Tohidifar, M., Moser, M., Zehzad, B,
			,
			Forests: A synthesis report. UNDP/GEF/FRWO Caspian
			1
			Hyrcanian Forest Project. Iran. 41
Page 55	While the nominated	As we stated in page 41 and 42 of	pp. Not a factual error.
Page 55, Column 1,			inot a factual citor.
line 23	component parts of Dizmar East and		Difference of opinion.
11116 23	Dizmar West (Iran) are	Dizmar protected area was connected with main part of	Difference of opinion.
	` '	Hyrcanian forests in the past but it	The text in question does not refer
	1		
	V 1	is as an isolated part today due to Volcanic activities were	to connectivity in the past, which is not challenged. It refers to
	between the Hyrcanian and the Colchic	Volcanic activities were associated with Mt. Sabalan	not challenged. It refers to connectivity today.
	forests, there does not	(4,820 m a.s.l), the largest volcano	connectivity today.
		in northwest Iran (yellow color	
	appear to be any forest		
	connectivity to the	point in Fig.32.) and Glacial fluctuations.	
	same degree as		
	between the existing	There are several evidences	
	component parts and the nominated	between main part of Hyrcanian forests and the nominated area of	
		Dizmar for extension which show	
	component parts in	DIZIHAI TOI CAUTISIOH WIIICH SHOW	<u> </u>

	Azerbaijan. The	this connectivity in the past: One	
	limited connectivity is	of them is an isolated patch from	
	also exemplified by	the Hyrcanian Forests called	
	satellite imagery and	Fandoqlo Forest (Purple color	
	the low integrity of the	point in Fig.32.) with an area of	
	nearby Arasbaran	4000 hectares, in the east of	
	Protected Area,	Ardabil province in Namin with	
	evaluated by IUCN in	Corylus avellana as a dominated	
	2018. In the following,	species. Fagus orientalis,	
	the boundaries of each	Ligustrum vulgare, Acer	
	of the nominated	campestre, Acer cappadocicum,	
	component parts are	Malus orientalis, Acer hyrcanum,	
	discussed in detail.	Mespilus germanica, Carpinus	
Page 56,	While the boundaries	betulus, Prunus divaricate,	See point above.
Column 1,	of the nominated	Quercus castaneifolia, Carpinus	
line 1	component parts of	orientalis, Quercus macranthera,	
	Dizmar East and	Carpinus schuschaensis,	
	Dizmar West (Iran)	Vaccinium arctostaphylos,	
	and their buffer zone	Corylus maxima, Rosa canina,	
	are appropriate, these	Crataegus pseudoheterophylla,	
	nominated component	Rosa boissieri, Crataegus	
	parts are disconnected	pentagyna, Rubus raddeanus,	
	from the existing series	Cornus mas, Salix aegyptiaca,	
	of the inscribed	Cotoneaster nummularius, Sorbus	
	property.	graeca, Sorbus torminalis,	
		Euonymus latifolius and	
		Euonymus velutina are the most	
		important wooden species in this	
		forest (Fig 8 and Fig. 9).	
		Fossil of Mammoth was found in	
		Ardabil, (Turquoise color point in	
		Fig.32.) between main part of	
		Hyrcanian forests and the	
		nominated area of Dizmar, belong	
		to 20 million years ago and it was	
		related to broadleaved forest, its	
		nutrition was by Oak, Ash, Beech,	
		walnut and Caucasian wingnut	
		(Fig. 10.).	
		Fossil trunks of Oak and other	
		broadleaved trees was found in	
		Meshginshahr, (Green color point	
		in Fig.32, between main part of	
		Hyrcanian forests and the	
		nominated area of Dizmar as an	
		isolated part), This Fossil Forest	
		was relict of forest area in the past	
		-	
		that destroyed by Sabalan Volcanos activity, showed the area	
		was a dense stand of Hyrcanian forest in past (Fig. 11 and fig. 12)	
		forest in past (Fig. 11 and fig. 12.).	
		There is a natural forest by main	
		species of Corylus avellana in	
		Ahar (blue color point in Fig.32.)	
		in Eastern Azarbaijan province,	
ĺ		between main part of Hyrcanian	

between main part of Hyrcanian

forests and the nominated area of Dizmar (Fig.13). Existence of these forests is interpreted as evidence confirming the connection between the Hyrcanian main part and Dizmar region as an isolated part of Hyrcanian forest. Page 55, As stated in page 71, paragraph 2 Not a factual error. The boundaries Column 2, these component parts of the nomination dossier The high line 26 include most degree of naturalness is Difference of opinion. See also of the contiguous in most cases a function of natural points above, in particular point 5. forests in the Dizmar protection due to remoteness and Neither the IUCN evaluation Protected Area. rugged terrain mission nor the IUCN evaluation void of any road and explicit conservation efforts. infrastructure or power Unlike most report called into question that comparable lines. The temperate forests in the there exist some old-growth stands nominated component northern hemisphere, the selected in the proposed component parts. forests show all the elements However, at the location shown in parts display a full characterizing ancient natural Fig. 17. and at other locations range of evolved characteristic forests with very limited human visited by the mission (some of plants and animals. impacts. These characteristics them outside the boundaries of the However, the include large numbers of very old nominated property), there does not field evaluation appear to be evidence of the did existence of significant extents of mission not The area containing a lot of old observe any significant growth trees as a genetically old-growth forest. Fig. 14, Fig. 15, Fig. 16 and Fig. 17 provided in the old-growth or primary treasure of biodiversity. In the forest stands and most period of presence of the present factual error letter do in the respected evaluator of IUCN view of IUCN confirm that of the trees are aged 20-40 due to limited time and hard conclusion and suggest only the years. Trees older than access, visit of the old growth presence of some dispersed single 60 years stands was not possible. Please old-growth trees and small stands are rare. see Fig.14, Fig. 15, Fig. 16 and of old-growth forest. Fig. 17. some old growth stands in the proposed component parts. The main reason for existence of young stands in Dizmar forests is **severity of wild fires.** In page 81, line 29 of nomination dossier we stated that forest fires are one of the most important threats with the potential to affect the nominated components. Establishment of three fire control stations and providing aerial fire control facilities in the area, shows the severity of Forest fires in this ecosystem. In last decades with lack of roads and facilities, the control of forest fires was very difficult and burned surfaces by forest fires was very vast. of the One interesting ecological cases is existence of various stages of natural

		succession in the Dizmar	
		protected area after wildfire.	
Page 54,	Furthermore,	In page 47 of the nomination	See point above.
Column 1,	the forests included in	dossier we focused that The	1
line 24	the nominated	Hyrcanian Forests include two	
	component parts of	main important gradients: first	
	Dizmar East and	gradient from east to west with	
	Dizmar West appear to	about 900 km length and the	
	lack characteristic	second is from lowlands to	
	Hyrcanian elements,	highlands with about 2,800m	
	such as Parrotia	difference in elevation. These	
	persica, Albizia	effective gradients cause very	
	julibrissin, Quercus	diverse	
	castaneifolia, Tilia	ecological situation in the	
	hyrcana, Pyrus mazandaranica, and	Hyrcanian Forests with different	
	mazandaranica, and many of the	precipitation and temperature. This situation causes considerable	
	Hyrcanian-Euxinian	fauna and flora diversity. The East	
	forest elements, such	and West of Hyrcanian show	
	as Zelkova	marked differences and so do the	
	carpinifolia,	highlands compared to the lower	
	Pterocarya	elevations. The Hyrcanian Forests	
	fraxinifolia, and Fagus	in Gilan boast various exclusive	
	orientalis.	species not found in Mazandaran	
	Therefore, IUCN	and Golestan, including four	
	considers that the	major tree species. Some	
	proposed component	important species are restricted to	
	parts of Dizmar East	the west or east, for example the	
	and Dizmar West do	oriental beech is absent in both the	
	not appear to	eastern extreme of the serial	
	contribute to the series	property, Golestan National Park,	
	of Hyrcanian Forests of the existing	and western extreme, Dizmar	
	C	Protected Area.	
Page 57,	property. Dizmar East and	In newest published evidence in 2022,	See point above.
Column 2,	Dizmar West do not	Dr. Atefeh Ghorbanalizadeh and	See point above.
line 21	appear to contribute	Dr. Hossein Akhani Professors	
	attributes that would	of Tehran University in their	
	clearly be	published paper in Plant	
	representative of the	Diversity, Volume 44, Issue	
	Hyrcanian Forests,	1, January 2022, Pages 39-69,	
	which mainly	entitled: "Plant diversity of	
	occur in the Caspian	Hyrcanian relict forests: An	
7 - 50	Sea's watershed.	annotated checklist, chorology	
Page 58,	These forests	and threat categories of endemic	See point above.
Column 1	entirely lack the	and near endemic vascular plant	I 112 HIGH A
and 2	Hyrcanian (such as	species" showed, Distribution	In addition, IUCN notes that none
	Parrotia persica, Albizia julibrissin,	patterns of the Hyrcanian endemic and near endemic	of the species listed in the sentence in question are shown in Figs. 19-
	Albizia julibrissin, Quercus castaneifolia,	species. A. Omni-Hyrcanian	25.
	Tilia hyrcana,	pattern; B. West Hyrcanian	23.
	Pyrus mazandaranica,	pattern; C. Manjil-Rudbar	
	etc.) and many of the	pattern; D. Central Hyrcanian	
	Hyrcanian-Euxinian	pattern; E. Central and East	
	forest elements (such	Hyrcanian pattern; F. East	
	as Zelkova	Hyrcanian pattern; G. Alborz-	
	carpinifolia,	Hyrcanian pattern; H. Euxino-	
	Pterocarya	Hyrcanian pattern (Fig. 18.)	
	fraxinifolia, and Fagus	That approve valuable role of	
	orientalis). They have	nominated component parts in	

different species adding biodiversity values of composition from Hyrcanian forests with endemic other "Hyrcanian and exclusive plant species. It the approves the importance of the Forests' in Therefore, Dizmar protected area in added property. IUCN considers that biodiversity value of endemic nominated and exclusive species. It also the component parts of shows that all Hyrcanian Dizmar West and elements aren't present in all Dizmar East do not parts of Hyrcanian forest. substantially add value Some Maps regarding to the existing series distribution of some trees and and are thus not shrubs spices were presented in recommended Reference of Trees and Shrubs for of Iran by Habibollah Sabeti consideration as an extension. which published by Yazd University publication in 1995, We presented some samples in Figs. 19-25. For introduce presences of some Hyrcanian elements such as pouplus caspica and the similarity of two parts of Hyrcanian forests. Page 57, IUCN considers that Extension of 7122 ha. core area Not a factual error. column 1, the integrity and 55725 ha as buffer zone of last Dizmar proposed component parts Difference of opinion. requirements and protection will guarantee best protection of paragraph and all 560000ha of the whole Chapter 4 of the evaluation report management requirements of the watershed. does not consider inadequate Operational Just by nomination of Dizmar actions 1 to 7 presented here. IUCN Guidelines are only protected area for extension very considers that the "threat levels for partially met. valuable activities performed for all nominated component parts are increasing the conservational currently low, though the potential future threat of mining in the buffer management such as. 1.Three stations was established zone of Dizmar East and Dizmar for aerial fire control and West (Iran) would be of concern." It further considers that the providing aerial fire control Management Plan of Dizmar facilities. 2. One New protection building Protected Area would need to be revised and that the integrity of the opened in Dizmar protected area for better Level of conservation forest is compromised, which is (**Fig. 26.**). where visited by also confirmed by the State Party respected evaluator of IUCN. above in regard to Page 55, Column 3. Special extra budget was 2, line 26. Thus, the integrity provided for the area. requirements and protection and 4. Two bridges was established for management requirements of the wildlife safe pass with very Operational Guidelines are only effective performance (Fig. 27 partially met. and 28). where visited by respected evaluator of IUCN. 5. Very powerful Cooperation was created between government, local communities and NGOs for conservation of the area. 6. Banning all requests for mining activities, road construction and establishment of infrastructures and tourism related buildings.

		7. Recruitment of new	
		conservation staffs for the area and	
		a lot of other effective activities.	
		We hope with successful	
		extension of Dizmar Forests these	
		activities will confirm, continue	
		and improve and fully meet.	
Page 57,	This is limited to the	One of the best habitats of	Not a factual error.
column 1,	movement of large	Vulnerable species of Persian	
line 40	mammals, in particular	Leopard (Panthera pardus	Difference of opinion.
	the Persian	saxicolor,) is Dizmar with several	1
	leopard and some	record of this valuable species.	IUCN does not call into question
	connectivity efforts,	Seeing the remnant of Hunted	the importance of Dizmar
	however, this	animal by leopard on trees is	Protected Area for the Persian
	alone does not, in	almost ordinary. Some Samples of	Leopard; however, based on the
	IUCN's view,	remnant of Hunted animal by	above, and based on the 2019 and
	constitute a	leopard on trees was observed by	2022 evaluations, this alone does
	compelling case for	respected evaluator during his	not, in IUCN's view, constitute a
	the addition of the	filed visit and some photos of	compelling case for the addition of
	nominated component	presence of leopard were taken in	the nominated component parts of
	parts	the area (Fig. 29 and 30).	Dizmar West and Dizmar East.
	of Dizmar West and	In the published paper entitled	
	Dizmar East.	"Leopard (Panthera pardus) status,	
		distribution, and the research	
		efforts across its range" by	
		Andrew P. Jacobson et al in	
		zoological science in 2016, The	
		Dizmar protected area is one of the	
		fixed habitat of Persian leopard	
		(Fig. 31.)	



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S): Congo

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Massif Forestier d'Odzala-Kokoua

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE: UICN

Page, colonne,	Phrase incluant l'erreur	Correction proposée par	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de
ligne de	factuelle	l'Etat partie	l'Organisation consultative
l'évaluation de	(l'erreur factuelle devrait	•	et/ou du Centre du
l'Organisation	figurer en gras)		patrimoine mondial
consultative	8 /		*
p. 8; Section 4.1.	Toutefois, l'information	L'Etat partie note une erreur	Pas une erreur factuelle.
Protection; § 2-3	complémentaire fournie	factuelle sur la carte de la	
	par l'État partie signale la	Figure 1 de l'information	Nouvelles informations.
	présence d'une concession	complémentaire fournie le	L'UICN se félicite de la
	minière à l'intérieur du	28 février 2022 signalant la	confirmation qu'aucun permis
	bien proposé et dans sa	présence de concessions	d'exploitation minière ne
	périphérie (voir sections 4.2	minières chevauchant sur le	chevauche le bien proposé.
	et 4.5). L'UICN note avec	bien proposé et dans sa	L'UICN note cependant que
	préoccupation que les	périphérie. L'Etat partie	deux permis sont encore actifs
	concessions minières	rassure l'organisation	(Ngoyboma-Lebay (société
	peuvent empiéter sur le	consultative qu'aucun	agil-Congo) et Obakadzokou
	parc national malgré son	permis minier en	(SOG Congo Mining)) dans la
	régime de protection strict.	exploitation chevauche sur le	zone tampon du bien proposé.
	L'exploitation minière à	bien proposé et que des	L'UICN prend note du fait que
	l'intérieur du bien étant	dispositions ont été prises	le procès-verbal de la réunion
	incompatible avec le statut	pour le retrait de toutes les	fournie par l'État partie
	de patrimoine mondial,	autorisations de recherche et	confirme son intention de
	l'UICN considère que la	d'exploitation minière	révoquer également ces
	protection requise n'est,	attribuées dans la zone	permis restants. L'UICN
	actuellement, pas satisfaite.	tampon du bien proposé. A	recommande vivement à l'État
		cet effet, l'Etat partie partage	partie d'achever la révocation
	L'UICN considère que le	le procès – verbal de la	de ces permis avant que le
	statut de protection du bien	réunion relative à l'examen	Comité du patrimoine mondial
	proposé ne remplit pas les	des permis miniers attribués	examine la proposition
	obligations requises,	dans le Bien et sa zone	d'inscription.
	énoncées dans les	tampon ci-joint précisant les	
	Orientations.	dispositions à prendre à ce	
		sujet. Une lettre du Ministère	
		en charge des Mines	
		s'ensuivra.	
		Sur la base des	
		commentaires développés	
		ci-dessus, l'Etat partie	
		propose que les § 2-3 de la	
		Section 4.1. Protection	
		soient modifiés pour lire :	

		L'Etat partie a partagé des informations complémentaires précisant qu'aucun permis minier chevauche sur le bien proposé et que des dispositions ont été prises depuis l'évaluation de l'UICN pour le retrait de toutes les autorisations de recherche et d'exploitation minière attribuées dans la zone tampon du bien proposé. L'UICN considère que le statut de protection du bien proposé remplit les obligations requises, énoncées dans les Orientations.	
p. 8; Section 4.2. Protection; § 2-3	L'UICN note toutefois que la configuration de cette zone tampon est variable car elle présente plusieurs lacunes, notamment des zones où il y a des projets miniers dans la périphérie immédiate du bien proposé qui ne sont sous aucun régime de protection. Les cartes fournies par l'État partie, dans l'information complémentaire, illustrent aussi l'existence de concessions minières empiétant sur le bien proposé. L'UICN considère que, pour sauvegarder efficacement le niveau élevé d'intégrité actuel du bien proposé, la zone tampon devrait être reconfigurée pour combler les lacunes et garantir une approche plus cohérente. L'UICN observe que la configuration de la zone tampon devrait être révisée pour éliminer les lacunes et améliorer la cohérence, sinon, l'UICN considère que les limites du bien proposé remplissent les obligations requises, énoncées dans les Orientations.	Sur la base du commentaire précédent, l'Etat partie propose que les § 2-3 de la Section 4.2. Limites soient modifiés pour lire : Suite au partage d'informations complémentaires par l'Etat partie, l'UICN note que des dispositions ont été prises pour le retrait de toutes les autorisations de recherche et d'exploitation minière attribuées dans la zone tampon du bien proposé. L'UICN considère que les limites du bien proposé et de sa zone tampon remplissent les obligations requises, énoncées dans les Orientations.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Voir point ci-dessus (p. 8; Section 4.1. Protection; § 2-3). L'UICN recommande vivement à l'État partie d'achever la révocation de ces permis avant que le Comité du patrimoine mondial examine la proposition d'inscription. Bien que l'UICN se félicite des progrès accomplis, elle maintient sa position initiale jusqu'à ce qu'elle reçoive une confirmation supplémentaire et finale du retrait complet et définitif de tous les permis d'exploitation minière.

n 9. Castion 12	La DNOV act admi dans la	L'Etat mantia mata qua la mlan	Dog yma amayn factyalla
p. 8; Section 4.3. Gestion; § 2-3	Le PNOK est géré dans le cadre d'un plan d'affaires et	L'Etat partie note que le plan d'aménagement qui était en	Pas une erreur factuelle.
Sestion, § 2 5	d'un plan d'aménagement	cours de préparation lors de	Nouvelles informations.
		la mission d'évaluation a été	L'UICN se félicite de la
	•••	approuvé en Conseil des Ministres par décret no2022-	confirmation de l'adoption du nouveau plan d'aménagement.
	L'UICN considère que la	1922 du 26 décembre 2022	Dans le cadre d'une lettre
	gestion du bien proposé ne	et est valable pour une durée	d'erreur factuelle, il n'est pas
	remplit pas les obligations	de 10 ans. A cet effet, l'Etat	possible pour l'UICN
	requises, énoncées dans les Orientations.	partie partage le nouveau plan d'aménagement 2022-	d'évaluer si ce nouveau plan de gestion répond aux
	One manons.	2032 joint à ce formulaire et	exigences des Orientations.
		propose que les § 2-3 de la	
		Section 4.3. Gestion soient modifiés pour lire :	
		_	
		Suite au partage d'informations	
		complémentaires par	
		l'Etat partie, l'UICN note	
		que le PNOK est géré dans le cadre d'un plan	
		d'affaires et d'un plan	
		d'aménagement valables	
		jusqu'en 2032.	
		L'UICN considère que la	
		gestion du bien proposé remplit les obligations	
		requises, énoncées dans les	
		Orientations.	
p. 9; Section 4.5. Menaces; § 1	une attention particulière compte tenu	Sur la base des commentaires précédents,	Voir points ci-dessus (p. 8; Section 4.2. Protection; § 2-3
Wichaecs, § 1	des activités extractives qui	l'Etat partie propose que le §	p. 8; Section 4.1. Protection; §
	ont lieu dans la zone	1 de la Section 4.5. Menaces	2-3).
	tampon (activités minières et d'exploitation du bois)	soit modifié pour lire :	
	,	une attention	
		particulière compte tenu des activités extractives qui	
		ont lieu dans la zone	
		tampon (telles que	
		l'exploitation du bois)	
p. 9; Section 4.5.		Sur la base des	Voir points ci-dessus (p. 8;
Menaces; § 3		commentaires précédents, l'Etat partie propose que le §	Section 4.2. Protection; § 2-3 p. 8; Section 4.1. Protection; §
		3 de la Section 4.5. Menaces	2-3; p. 8; Section 4.3. Gestion;
		soit modifié pour lire :	§ 2-3).
		Suite au partage	
		d'informations	
		complémentaires par l'Etat partie, l'UICN note	
		que des dispositions ont été	
		prises pour le retrait de	
		toutes les autorisations de recherche et d'exploitation	
		minière attribuées dans la	

Г	_		
		zone tampon du bien	
		proposé.	
p. 9; Section 4.5.	En résumé, l'UICN	Sur la base des	Voir points ci-dessus (p. 8;
Menaces; § 6	considère que le bien	commentaires précédents,	Section 4.2. Protection; § 2-3
	proposé remplit les	l'Etat partie propose que le §	p. 8; Section 4.1. Protection; §
	conditions d'intégrité	6 de la Section 4.5. Menaces	2-3; p. 8; Section 4.3. Gestion;
	requises, mais pas les	soit modifié pour lire :	§ 2-3).
	obligations en matière de		
	protection et de gestion,	L'UICN considère que le	
	énoncées dans les	bien proposé remplit les	
	Orientations.	conditions d'intégrité	
		requises, ainsi que les	
		obligations en matière de	
		protection et de gestion,	
		énoncées dans les	
		Orientations.	
p. 11; Section 7.		Suite à l'argumentaire	Voir points ci-dessus (p. 8;
Recommandations		présenté ci-dessus, l'Etat	Section 4.2. Protection; § 2-3
		partie estime que les	p. 8; Section 4.1. Protection; §
		recommandations soient	2-3; p. 8; Section 4.3. Gestion;
		modifiées en tenant compte	§ 2-3).
		des information fournies.	



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Viet Nam

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago [extension of "Ha Long Bay" inscribed in 1994, criteria (vii)(viii), extended in 2000, renomination under criteria (ix)(x)]

RELEVANT ADVISORY BODY'S EVALUATION: IUCN

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 39 Column 1 Line 9	The nomination dossier outlines seven key ecosystem types (criterion ix): tropical rainforest; mangrove forest; caves; marine lakes; tidal flats; soft bottom ecosystems; and coral reefs. It highlights a gradient and transgression of habitats from forest covered limestone hills and karst valleys, down to the	It highlights the process of the sea level rising to sink the karst cockpit, which developed within a vast complex setting at the interface between karst islands and the sea. The representatives are the fengcong depressions of the karst in Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago, which ranges from steep karst depressions with primary monsoon forests to the marine lakes that are gradually merged into the sea.	Not a factual error The purpose of chapter 2 is to provide a brief summary of the natural values of the nominated property. The suggested wording would consist of 66 words being copy-pasted from the nomination dossier. Copypasting text would not be in line with scientific standards.
Page 39 Column 1 Line 48	submerged karst plains. IUCN notes that these earlier concerns have again not been addressed in the present nomination dossier.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence Explanation: Species data and choice of site compared are done properly in the current dossier as per the Operational Guidelines. Reference to the withdrawn dossier might be misleading about the current nomination as the context is different. Ha Long Bay – Cat Ba Archipelago is now nominated under criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x). Therefore, it is compared with other properties under at least one common criterion and with those in similar tropics/subtropics. Species data presented for both the existing World Heritage Ha Long Bay and Cat Ba	Not a factual error Difference of opinion. Expert reviewers have noted various inconsistencies and inaccuracies in species data. For instance, the nomination dossier states that there are 70 mammal species (p.70) whereas it is stated on p.90 that there would only be 53. The comparative analysis notes 75 mammal species on p. 193. The Keeled Box Turtle has been counted twice under its current name (Cuora mouhotii) and its old name (Pyxidea mouhotii).

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		Archipelago are based on the latest scientific research studies and reliable sources (as per Annex III of the dossier). And the comparative analysis is done as per Paragraph 132 of the Operational Guidelines and every effort has been made to explain the importance of the current nomination (of extended existing world heritage site) at both the national and international context.	
Page 39 Column 2 Line 43	Furthermore, IUCN notes that the information on the size and importance of mangrove forest within the nominated property is inaccurately portrayed. Supplementary information provided by the State Party has confirmed that only 10.34 ha of mangrove forest exists within the nominated property, and not up to 650 ha as indicated in the nomination dossier.	We hereby request IUCN to delete these sentences. Explanation: Mangrove forest in the nominated property is a typical representative of the tidal environments, which is diverse in species composition, with some threatened species included in the Viet Nam Red Book like Sargassum tenerrimum. For HLB, the mangrove forest is 15.65 ha scattered around the bay according to the latest survey in 2022. For CBA, the nomination dossier presents the total of 650 ha mangrove forest existing in the entire CBA, but as indicated in the supplementary information only 10.34 ha of intact mangrove forest located in Phu Long is included in the property, which is shown in the maps attached to the dossier. The remaining mangrove forest in Phu Long is put in the buffer zone as a forest regeneration area as well as a layer of protecting the property.	Not a factual error Difference of opinion. The explanation confirms that the area of intact mangrove forest is considerably smaller than indicated in the nomination dossier and can thus not be considered as an intact feature of OUV within the nominated property.
Page 39 Column 2 Line 53	Moreover, in its 2014 evaluation of the standalone CBA nomination, IUCN argued that claims on the transgression of ecosystems from terrestrial to marine, are not a valid argument and merely	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence Explanation: In its 2014 evaluation for the previous dossier, IUCN argued that claims about the range and juxtaposition (sequence) of ecosystems in the terrestrial environment are not a valid argument.	Not a factual error. The sentence in question is an accurate description of IUCN's previous evaluation.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
	demonstrate that there is habitat diversity within the nominated property.	However, the current dossier highlights the process of the sea level rising to sink the karst cockpit, which developed within a vast complex setting at the interface between karst islands and the sea. In no other karst area in the humid tropics of Asia, the interface between the karst and the sea occupies such a large area, has developed such intricate coastline patterns with such a varied geomorphology and, as a result, shows such a wide range of different environments, particularly environments associated with karst depressions in various stages of marine inundation, ranging from fully terrestrial, through fresh-water, brackish and marine swamps, to enclosed but fully marine environments, the marine lakes.	
Page 40 Column 1 Line 4	IUCN notes that the species data in the current nomination dossier remain inaccurate and do not provide evidence for outstanding endemism or evolutionary processes. The nominated extension of HLB to include CBA has not strengthened above arguments. In summary, there does not appear to be a case for criterion (ix).	We hereby request IUCN to delete these sentences. Explanation: The current nomination dossier presents 4,910 species of plants and animals, both terrestrial and marine, of which 2,752 species are terrestrial, accounting for 56% of the total number of species; 2,158 species are aquatic (with 11 freshwater fishes), accounting for 44%. Particularly, a list of 51 endemic species is provided. There are 253 species recorded in the IUCN Red List and Viet Nam's Red Book (198 species in the IUCN Red List). Details are included in Annex III of the dossier, with cited data sources. However, the dossier truly justifies the nominated property under criterion (ix) with as the leading OUV the spatial representation of the environments resulting from the process of repeated marine transgression over a karst area.	Not a factual error The data presented in the explanation here would primarily support criterion (x) but not criterion (ix).

Page, column, line of the	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Advisory Body Evaluation	highlighted in bold)		
Page 40 Column 1 Line 29	IUCN finds that up to 25% of the mammals listed in the nomination dossier (excluding bats) are not considered to exist within the nominated property Among marine species, it is highly unlikely that Leatherback Turtles (Dermochelys coriacea) are present.	We hereby request IUCN to delete these sentences. Explanation: It is assumed this percentage is calculated in different approach. We affirm the mammal list as well as other species lists in the dossier are valid and include only species existed in HLB and CBA. The dossier presents 4,910 species of fauna and flora, both terrestrial and marine, which is based on the national studies KC.09.11/16-20 by the Institute of Marine and Environmental Resources (IMER) and Institute of Ecology and Biological Resources (IEBR) as well as the research by Ha Long – Cat Ba Alliance, and Cat Ba National Park. Details are as per Annex III of the dossier	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN concluded that up to 25% of the mammals listed in the nomination dossier (excluding bats) are not considered to exist within the nominated property based on desk review input from experts having analysed the species lists provided by the State Party and other databases.
Page 40 Column 1 Line 48	Some agricultural areas exist within the nominated area on Cat Ba Island, for example in Viet Hai commune, but the state, via Hai Phong province, exercises control over these areas.	Some agricultural areas exist within the nominated area on Cat Ba Island, for example in Viet Hai commune, which are traditionally farmed by the local inhabitants for generations. Hai Phong People's Committee exercises state administrative management over the entire CBA, including the agricultural land here. Explanation: The area of Viet Hai Village and the surrounding agricultural land is excised from the Cat Ba National Park. For the future world heritage site, it is neither necessary nor desirable, if agricultural and commercial activities in the area are sustainable. In fact, serious steps towards sustainability are taken already, namely electrical transport, and community-based (small-scale) tourism. Furthermore, traditional village communities in the core zone of the property can be an asset rather than a liability, provided they are managed sustainably. This is because local residents	Not a factual error. Clarification. The sentence in question is a brief summary of the text proposed. Chapter 4.1 does not describe the agricultural areas as reason for concern. Whilst Viet Hai Village and the surrounding agricultural land is excluded from the Cat Ba National Park, it is included within the nominated area.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		can provide modest services to visitors, and self-interest ensures that they become the eyes and ears of park management; informal park rangers that help ensure on-going sustainability.	
Page 40 Column 1 Line 59	the nominated area also includes areas outside the National Park boundaries, on Cat Ba Island as well as the Long Chao island group.	Long Chau island group	Not a factual error. Typographic error.
Page 40 Column 2 Line 29	However, the field evaluation mission, supported by research and publications referenced in section 1 c) above, found law enforcement, especially for poaching and illegal resource extraction, to be ineffective.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Provincially, HLB is directly controlled by Quang Ninh Province People's Committee and CBA under Hai Phong People's Committee. Both Quang Ninh and Hai Phong have a joint managing mechanism in place. At the grassroot level, each management board in HLB and CBA implements its obligations according to its authority and plays a vital role in protecting HLB, National Park, Biosphere Reserve and marine areas in CBA. Besides, relevant departments like Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, Department of Natural Resources and Environment and others carry out their obligations and protect the property according to their authority. Publications mentioned by IUCN have been seriously taken into consideration and some issues have been duly addressed. Poaching of sky birds, for example, have been stopped after the news was published on Vietnam Plus (2000). Hai Phong People's Committee had issued one writing circular and one official dispatch on strengthening the protection of wild, migratory birds. Accordingly, relevant	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN's conclusion in question is based on recent scientific literature. IUCN does not call into question the measures described in the explanation.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 40	Maps provided in	departments and Cat Hai District People's Committee took active actions to prevent any harms and threats to these birds. This mechanism is applied to managing and addressing other issues concerned by IUCN. We hereby request IUCN to	Not a factual error.
Column 2 Line 34	supplementary information also indicate that there are gaps in the protection of CBA (see also section 4.2).	delete this sentence. Explanation: The nominated property is mapped to contain HLB, the most parts of Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve, Cat Ba Marine Protected Area and Long Chau island groups to the south. All of them have been protected by relevant laws and decisions, and legally enforced as mentioned in the dossier and management plan as well as the supplementary information. Relating to the section 4.2, maps and boundaries of nominated property are subject to the Operational Guidelines in that all necessary elements and components representing adequate outstanding universal value of the property sit within the nominated area and are protected by necessary buffer zone. For the CBA extension, the following areas are included in the core zone: (i) the area with patches of high monsoon forest, which is the most species-rich terrestrial habitat on the island; (ii) all freshwater swamps (particularly those inland in Viet Hai) with undisturbed or little disturbed environment. Each freshwater swamp differs from the next in species composition. Next to that, most freshwater swamps seem relatively pristine, at present a rare feature among freshwater wetlands; (iii) As many marine lakes in the area as possible, intertidal and fully marine;	Difference of opinion. The maps provided in supplementary information do not suggest a consistent and complete coverage of strict protection of the boundaries of the nominated area.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		(iv) Areas where the low, vegetation on rocky ground predominates, home to most CBA and HLB endemic plant species; (v) All the area presently inhabited by the Cat Ba Golden langur; (vi) Corridors to enable populations of Cat Ba Golden langurs to meet, as well as land to colonize once their numbers start increasing again. The areas of concern bordering the core zone including the Cat Ba National Park headquarter area, Gia Luan harbour in the north, disturbed Phu Long areas are in the buffer zone as well as the ecological restoration area No.3 including tidal flats and aqua-products lakes, part of it used for economic development and transportation purposes by the district authorities. In sum, these boundaries favour the values of the areas and could limit the possibility of damage caused by future developments.	
Page 40 Column 2 Line 36	The protection status of the Long Chao island group is not clear apart from the fact that it is controlled by the military.	containing typical intact coral reefs, is under control of Cat Hai District People's Committee. Explanation: As mentioned in the supplementary information, Cat Hai People's Committee assigns the island group protection to Cat Ba Border Post that takes the main responsibility and coordinates with the Cat Ba Bays Management Board in managing and protecting the natural resources around the island group. Long Chau island group, included in Cat Ba marine protected area (MPA), contains coral reefs that have a typical feature and are a representative for the entire area in terms of their structure, distribution, and	Not a factual error. IUCN does not call into question that the Long Chao island group is under the control of Cat Hai District People's Committee. The maps provided in the nomination and supplementary information do not suggest that Long Chau island group would be part of the Cat Ba marine protected area (MPA). According to the World Database for Protected Areas, Long Chau appears to be located outside of this marine protected area. Therefore, IUCN proposes the following wording: "The protection status of the Long Chao island group is not clear apart from the fact that

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		composition as well as community structures of reef building organisms.	it is controlled by the military."
Page 41 Column 1 Line 9	Concerning the CBA extension, the boundaries would encompass about half of Cat Ba Island and most of Cat Ba National Park. Cat Ba National Park includes three zones: a strictly protected zone, an administrative zone and a restoration zone. However, some areas of importance to protect rare, endemic and threatened species are not located within the strictly protected zone.	the boundaries encompass most of Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve, Cat Ba Marine Protected Area and Long Chau island groups to the south, with attention to some areas of concern. As explained above.	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.
Page 41 Column 1 Line 37	The buffer zone, especially on Cat Ba Island, does not appear to serve as effective layer of protection for the nominated property from development or other use (see section 4.5).	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Given that the function of the buffer zone is to help protect the core from intrusive impacts of developments as well as noise and air pollution from local sources, then the buffer zone is large enough to be an effective protecting layer. For Cat Ba Island, its boundary on land depends on suitable topography, land use and potentially threatening developments. The buffer zone as such is clearly shown in the maps attached in the dossier.	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN does not call into question the size of the buffer zone. Given the significant touristic development plans within the buffer zone, it does not appear to be an effective layer of additional protection.
Page 41 Column 1 Line 40	IUCN considers that some areas, including mangrove forests in Phu Long should be added to the buffer zone as an added layer of protection, especially to facilitate better protection for threatened bird species.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: As mentioned in the supplementary information, about 620ha of the strictly protected mangrove forest in Phu Long is excluded from the core zone of the property and moved to the buffer zone. The main reason is that this mangrove forest of Phu Long	Not a factual error. Misunderstanding. IUCN suggests extending the buffer zone. IUCN is not suggesting to include these areas within the nominated property.

Page,	Sentence including the factual error (the factual	Proposed correction by the State	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the
column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	error should be highlighted in bold)	Party	World Heritage Centre
		has been assigned to local households for protection and management and they have erected earth dykes surrounding it in order to raise aqua-products on a small scale as well as having protected it for many years now. Therefore, to ensure the integrity of the mangrove forest ecosystem in the nominated area, this modified part of the mangrove forest ecosystem has been moved to the buffer zone for biological restoration. It has now been done under the coastal forest restoration and development project directed by the Haiphong city's authorities. Furthermore, as per the Plan No.85/KH-UBND dated March 23 rd , 2018, Hai Phong People's Committee assigns Cat Hai District People's Committee to check and grant the mangrove forest areas within the masterplan of Cat Ba National Park to Cat Ba National Park for management and protection as per the current laws. With effective management measures by the authorities and participation of local residents as well as larger protected mangrove forest, these areas has offered better protection of species developing in the tidal environments, including threatened birds.	
Page 41 Column 1 Line 47	In order to meet integrity requirements, the boundaries of the nominated property would need to align with an enlarged national park to ensure the boundaries comprise all attributes	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: The boundaries encompass existing HLB WHS, most of Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve, Cat Ba Marine Protected Area and Long Chau island groups to the south. As explained above, CBA is under direct control of Hai Phong People's Committee. While the national park would be consulted with relevant ministries and agencies as well as international specialists about	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		a necessary extension, we assure that proposed boundaries, both terrestrial and marine, contain all possible OUV which are protected properly as presented in the dossier.	
Page 41 Column 2 Line 2	The Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism is directly responsible for conservation of the nominated property.	The Government performs the uniform state management of the nominated property. Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism takes responsibilities before the Government for exercising uniform state management over the nominated property. Relevant ministries and agencies exercise state management according to their authority. Explanation: The institutional arrangements for management and conservation of the property are subject to Decree No.109/2017/NĐ-CP dated September 21, 2017 issued by the Government on the protection and management of world natural and cultural heritage in Viet Nam, relevant legal normative documents and the decisions issued by the People's Committee of Quang Ninh Province and Hai Phong City, as well as the actual situations of the property management. The administrative arrangements for managing, monitoring the property are decentralized as follows: - The Government performs the uniform state management of the nominated property. - Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, a government's agency, is responsible before the Government for exercising the uniform state management of the nominated property. - Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, Ministry of Planning and Investment within	Not a factual error Clarification. The sentence in question is a brief summary of the text proposed.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		their tasks and competencies take the responsibilities for coordinating with Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism in exercising the state management of the nominated property according to the laws. - National Cultural Heritage Council, and Viet Nam National Committee for UNESCO exercise the uniform state management of the nominated property. - The agencies that take the responsibilities at the provincial level for Quang Ninh Province include the People's Committee, Department of Culture and Sports, Department of Natural Resources and Environment, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development. - The agency takes direct responsibility for the management and monitoring of Ha Long Bay is Ha Long Bay Management Board. - The agencies that take the responsibilities at the provincial level for Hai Phong City include the People's Committee, Department of Culture and Sports, Department of Natural Resources and Environment, Department of Agriculture and Sports, Department of Natural Resources and Environment, Department of Agriculture and Rural Development. - The agency takes direct responsibility for the management and monitoring of Cat Ba Archipelago include Cat Ba Archipelago Natural Heritage Management Board (Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba World Biosphere Reserve, and Cat Ba Bay Management Board). - Communities at the ward level within the property can participate in supervising the management of resources in the areas where they live. - Organizations that participate in monitoring includes IMER, Viet Nam Institute of Science and Technology, and Institute of	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		Ecology and Biological Resources. This information is presented in the dossier and management plan.	
Page 41 Column 2 Line 4	However, since the National Park included within the nominated property (Cat Ba National Park) is located in only one province it is managed at that level of authority and not at national level.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Cat Ba National Park is under direct control of Hai Phong People's Committee (as per Decision No.1876/QD-UBND dated July 24, 2017 by Hai Phong People's Committee). Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) takes the main responsibility before the Government for exercising state management over special-use forests throughout the country, including those in Cat Ba National Park. Therefore, while directly controlled by Hai Phong People Committee, Cat Ba National Park is administered by MARD in terms of special-use forests.	Not a factual error. Clarification. Whilst the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development is responsible for the management of special use forest, the nominated property does not appear to be (exclusively) managed at the national level, which is not raised as a concern by IUCN. IUCN proposes the following wording to clarify the interplay between the national and provincial levels: "However, since the National Park included within the nominated property (Cat Ba National Park) is located in only one province, it is managed at that level of authority, whilst the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development takes the main responsibility over special-use forests."
Page 41 Column 2 Line 13	Within CBA, the Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba Bay and the Cat Ba Biosphere Reserve are managed by the respective Management Boards.	Within CBA, the Cat Ba National Park, Cat Ba Bay and the Cat Ba Biosphere Reserve are directly controlled by Cat Ba Archipelago Natural Heritage Management Board.	Not a factual error. Annex I indicates that there are three management boards, one for Cat Ba National Park, one for Cat Ba Bay and one for Cat Ba Biosphere Reserve. Based on the preceding sentence, it is clear that these management boards are subordinated to the Cat Ba Archipelago Natural Heritage Management Board.
Page 41 Column 2 Line 28	Most pressures are well described with a good overview of the situation, however, measures to address	from poaching. Explanation: Pressures on the property have been recognized and addressed, including development,	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN maintains its position given the prospect of large-scale

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
	these do not appear to be sufficient to address threats from poaching and tourism.	environment, natural disaster, tourism, and population growth. Tourism pressures are dealt with properly while threats of poaching seem to be inadequate, except for sea organisms fishing, and Cat Ba Langur hunting. We shall make a more comprehensive integrated approach to address the threats indicated.	tourism developments coupled with existing impacts from tourism. Most expert reviewers highlighted the increasing pressure from tourism.
Page 41 Column 2 Line 36	The Management Plan does not demonstrate any clear institutional arrangements for biodiversity conservation or commitment to conserve or monitor terrestrial species other than the Cat Ba Langur.	The Management Plan presents effective administrative arrangements for monitoring the property from the central to the grassroot levels. Explanation: The Management Plan, among other objectives, aims at proposing an effective coordination mechanism between Ha Long Bay Management Board, Cat Ba Archipelago Natural Heritage Management Board and all relevant administrative agencies in the region, as well as private enterprises, local communities, and residents on the basis of maintaining harmony and minimizing conflicts of interest between sectors and communities in exploiting and utilizing the heritage values, in order to prevent activities that can affect the outstanding universal values, and the environmental landscape of the heritage site. Regarding the institutional arrangements for biodiversity conservation, commitment or monitoring, the Management Plan present clearly the direct responsibilities of Hai Phong and Quang Ninh authorities subject to the uniform state management by the Government as well as the monitoring indicators of all biodiversity values, both terrestrial and marine, and implementing periods.	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. Chapter 6 of Annex 1, including table 3, do not define clear baselines and benchmarks for monitoring of several indicators. The indicator "Changes in rare species" is also focused on the Cat Ba Langur and is not specified further. Whilst responsibilities are outlined, it is not indicated what action would be taken if indicators show a declining trend.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 41	The action plan for	Cat Ba Langur is one of those indicators that is listed in Table 3 as well as Annex 1 of the Management Plan. The action plan for 2021-2025	No factual error.
Column 2 Line 40	2021-2025 is based on tourism and the marine part of the nominated property (managing tour boats, fishery, aquaculture and marine habitats), with no actions specified for terrestrial protection or management.	is made with a vision towards keeping intact the values and attributes of OUV of HLB-CBA in accordance with international commitments and Vietnamese laws as well as in a state of climate change preparedness, specifying actions to protect the landscapes and seascapes, manage tourism activities, cruise ships, ports, and tourist wharf, manage aqua-product farming, fishing, trading and investment projects, protect ecological environment, prevent natural disasters, fire, explosion, rescue, ensure safety for tourists, and focus on human resource development.	The sentence in question represents an accurate summary of the wording proposed. The wording proposed does not contain any action specifically for the terrestrial part of the nominated property.
Page 41 Column 2 The last line	Monitoring, protection and conservation of the Cat Ba Langur is largely dependent on international funds.	is implemented by Cat Ba National Park in cooperation with Cat Ba Langur Conservation Project funded by Munster Zoo, Germany (Allwetterzoo Münster).	Not a factual error. Clarification confirming IUCN's observation.
Page 42 Column 1 Line 1	In conclusion, IUCN considers that the interprovincial management of the nominated property could be strengthened by a joint Management Board for the whole HLB-CBA nominated property.	mechanism that has been officially established between the People's Committees of Hai Phong and Quang Ninh. Explanation: As mentioned in the supplementary information, Haiphong City People's Committee shall propose and chair an international symposium in coordination with the counterpart of Quang Ninh Province in order to consult the relevant ministries and agencies, specialists, scientists, international organizations especially about a management model, coordinating mechanism and the two Committees' policies for the inter-provincial	Difference of opinion. The explanation notes that an international symposium shall be proposed "to consult the relevant ministries and agencies, specialists, scientists, international organizations especially about a management model, coordinating mechanism and the two Committees' policies for the inter-provincial property so as to enhance the effective management of the property". According to this wording, the effective implementation of the management of the nominated property does not appear to be in place yet,

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		property so as to enhance the effective management of the property, and address the challenges of Ha Long Bay and Cat Ba Archipelago as a whole as well as continue to complete the Management Plan of Ha Long Bay and Cat Ba Archipelago and effectively implement it in the reality.	confirming IUCN's observation in the evaluation report.
Page 42 Column 1 Line 27	The field evaluation mission met with some selected people from Viet Hai commune but did not meet resident populations within the floating villages.	most local people and representatives of civil society organizations (CSOs) in Viet Hai commune including farmer union, women union, and youths.	Not a factual error. IUCN does not call into question that the mission has met with these stakeholders and has noted in section 1 d) that the mission was able to meet with NGOs and civil society associations. However, the paragraph in question is about the relocation of people living within the national park and floating villages, of which the mission has not met any representatives from the floating villages. Nevertheless, IUCN proposes to rephrase the sentence in question as follows: "The field evaluation mission met with some selected people from Viet Hai commune (e.g. farmer union, women union and youths) but did not meet resident populations within the floating villages."
Page 42 Column 1 Line 37	According to the nomination dossier, the reason for the resettlement was to minimise the impact on the environment.	was to help protecting the core zone, and guaranteeing the new settlement conditions as well as livelihoods for impacted locals.	Not a factual error The nomination dossier states on p. 213 that "Quang Ninh [the province of HLB] has resettled the floating fishing villages on the bays onto the mainland to minimize the impact on the environment." On p. 227, the nomination dossier notes that "there should be a plan for stabilizing the livelihoods and avoiding environmental pollution for

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
			these people." On p. 85, the nomination dossier speaks to livelihoods, but notes that "some people () shall be planned to resettle in the new residential area". Against this background, IUCN proposes to reword the phrase as follows: "According to the nomination dossier, the main reason for the resettlement was to minimise the impact on the environment.
Page 42 Column 1 The last sentence	According to the supplementary information, the reasons for the relocation of people are to: 1) protect the environment from sediment- and organic pollution, 2) not hinder transportation in and out of harbours, and 3) reduce the "untidy and disordered scenery in the eyes of visitors, for them to not have a bad impression on CBA	1) protect the environment from sediment- and organic pollution, and reduction of tidal amplitude, 2) not hinder water flow and transportation in and out of harbours, 3) reduce the "untidy and disordered scenery in the eyes of visitors, for them to not have a bad impression on CBA, 4) improve raising methods for the people, and overcome difficulties and problems rising from the implementation of fishery law.	No factual error. Clarification. The sentence in question represents a summary of the three points presented in the supplementary information.
Page 42 Column 2 Line 3	While IUCN has not received any direct representations or objections from local communities, IUCN notes with concern that the information obtained in the course of the evaluation process, including the information provided by the State Party, does not demonstrate that local communities have been appropriately consulted and given their free, prior and informed consent to the relocation and its conditions.	Both provinces of Hai Phong and Quang Ninh has made every effort to balance between conservation and development, especially livelihoods for the people living in the property and to negotiate with impacted local people and their CSO representatives through consultation mechanisms in conformity with the laws in order to make a consensus among the people before any decisions are implemented. Explanation: We have submitted this information in the supplementary information, stating that before removing, rearranging and replanning any aqua-product raising premises,	Not a factual error. The wording of the evaluation report does not propose to "make a consensus among the people" or that "prior and informed consensus is made", it is intended to refer to the requirement to obtain the free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) from the people affected in line with relevant international norms and standards. The mission could not verify that FPIC had been achieved.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		the district authorities have received a consensus from the	
		majority of the owners and residents. 437 out of 440	
		premises have been listed, accounting for 99.32%. 422/440	
		owners have signed a	
		commitment to removing their	
		premises, accounting for 95.9%. The city authorities have been	
		promoting, encouraging and	
		negotiating with the remaining owners on the compensation	
		schemes before breaking down	
		the floating facilities.	
		Consultations, communications and information dissemination	
		on relocation are made so as to	
		discuss and solve concerns and	
		livelihoods and to achieve the support from the local people	
		and related parties. Their	
		comments and concerns are duly	
		taken into account and given serious consideration from the	
		authorities. Prior and informed	
		consensus is made between the	
		authorities, local people living in the property and related parties	
		before any consequences of	
		administrative decisions has impact on them.	
		The IUCN mission met some	
		resettled people who worked as a	
		tourism boat rower in HLB during the day and went back to	
		their homes inland. The mission	
		also met the people and their	
		CSO representative in Viet Hai commune located in the core	
		zone of Cat Ba National Park,	
		who lived on agricultural farming and carried out	
		community-based tourism	
		activities. Though having not	
		met with any people who lived on fish floating cages, the	
		mission could understand the	
		consultation mechanism and	
		consensus reaching process when working with relevant	
		CSO representatives at the	
		meetings held in the district	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Evaluation		meeting hall and in Viet Hai	
		commune.	
Page 42 Column 2 Line 12	Both HLB and CBA are subject to several current threats, which are likely to be exacerbated in future.	meeting hall and in Viet Hai commune. which are clearly recognized and duly addressed through action plans and with participation of communities and stakeholders. Explanation: Threats including development pressure, aquaculture exploitation and environmental pollution are clearly presented in the Management Plan, together with relevant measures to minimize any impacts on the property in conformity with WHS requirements. HLB has made a report in response to the recommendations by the 2018 Advisory mission in which it has implemented a management plan as an integrated management tool, completed tourism capacity carrying, and developed a strategic framework for sustainable tourism development. Dealing with mass tourist influx, especially in caves. HLB Management Board has regulated daylight cruise boat schedules with attention to the peak time, arranged tourists into small groups, and managed any stay plans of night junks or travel agencies at certain destinations. Timed ticketing for tourists visiting caves has been seriously taken into consideration. CBA is moving forward to sustainable tourism with steps and measures proposed in the Management Plan. For example, community-based tourism activities in Viet Hai commune like home stay, farming, cycling, etc. have been promoted. Serious steps towards sustainability have been taken already, including: electrical transport, and small-scale tourism industry all over the	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN maintains its position as the "List of tasks and solutions" and the "List of investment projects" presented in Annex I include actions that would exacerbate the threats (e.g. "Organizing the exploitation of tourism products using adventure tourism vessels/cruise ships"; "Constructing floating wharfs combined with management posts at three anchorage sites for luxurious cruise ships"; "Bai Chay Tourism Zone and International Port of Hòn Gai"; "Wharfs for cruise ships at the site No.3"). The points reported in the State Party report on the state of conservation of the existing property has been considered in document 7B.
		archipelago.	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
	Other terrestrial resources exploited include timber, fuel wood, honey, bamboo shoots, edible roots, ornamental and medicinal plants, while some rare species of the limestone forest, such as the Cat Ba Gecko and Keeled Box Turtle, are subject to overexploitation to supply international pet trade.	Local people, especially rural people have participated in the protection and development of ecological resources. The programs "Cat Ba Langur safeguarding", "Green Sunday", "Saturday volunteering" and clubs for protecting forests have been effectively organized and implemented among communes and villages. Active species and natural value safeguarding by communities is the most effective sustainable protection of the entire property. We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Illegal exploitation of forest and marine resources is strictly prohibited by the laws, and monitored and dealt with by forest rangers and relevant authorities. All threats have been recognized and addressed duly as mentioned in the Management Plan. Besides, biodiversity protection and management obtain the international support and participation of communities and stakeholders. Ha Long - Cat Ba Alliance initiated by USAID has provided useful information for the management to prepare any plans and implement appropriate measures, both long term and short term, to protect and promote the property. Particularly, it has helped monitor 6 threatened species including Cat Ba Gecko, Cat Ba Langur, Rhesus Macaque, Nageia fleuryi, Livistona Halongensis palm and Ardisia silvestris, offering training sources or mentionic limestance.	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See point above.
		courses on monitoring limestone vegetation and 5 prioritized terrestrial species including Livistona Halongensis, Cycas tropophylla, Paphiopedilum concolor; Macaca mulatta, Cat Ba gecko (Goniurosaurus catbaensis), as well as	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		monitoring phytoplankton. All monitored species are presented in Annex III of the dossier.	
Page 42 Column 2 Line 56	However, no improvements in water quality have so far been detected, possibly due to continued discharge from industry and fishing boats, tankers and cargo ships passing through the nominated property, as well as the discharge of several large rivers into the bay area.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Water quality in the property is confirmed to be within the limits of Vietnam environmental standards. Effective measures have been done to improve water quality in both HLB and CBA through controlling the pollution at sources (industries, hospitals, construction sites, ships and domestic wastes), upgrading domestic wastewater treatment plants onshore and at islands open to tourists in Quang Ninh province and putting smaller waste water treatment systems into operation in CBA. All cruise ships in HLB are equipped with oil wastewater treatment system in conformity with QCVN 14/2008 standards. Particularly, eco-labelling Sail Green has been promoted among cruise ships. Some active programs have been launched in HLB and CBA such as 'Building a model of community to manage, classify, collect and treat plastic waste in Ha Long Bay coastal areas', 'Pilot of urban plastic waste management in the coastal area of Ha Long Bay, Vietnam', 'Reducing plastic waste in Ha Long City' as well as 'Green Sunday', 'Saturday volunteering' held by communities and CSOs in CBA. According to Quang Ninh authorities, the adoption of not carrying and using single-use plastic products in Ha Long Bay has decreased over 90% plastic trash in HLB since September 1st, 2019. Environmental-friendly buoys used in floating structures in HLB, replacing foam, have reached 94%. Details are as per the report by Quang Ninh Province in response to the	Difference of opinion. The nomination dossier has noted accumulation of pollutants in sediments and organisms is relatively high, with oil spills and pollution as a threat (see nomination dossier, p. 220). The nomination dossier states that: "Every day, there are hundreds of passenger ships and fishing boats anchoring in the bay, discharging waste, sewage, and leaked oil into the bay, which creates a local pollution to Cat Ba Bay" (p. 219). The points reported in the State Party report on the state of conservation of the existing property have been considered in document 7B.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		recommendations under Decision No. 44 COM 7B.98. Threats from fishing boats, tanker and cargo ships, and river discharge have been recognized and addressed properly through the measures mentioned in the Management Plan as well as the strong wills of both Quang Ninh and Hai Phong, and the participation of communities and stakeholders.	
Page 43 Column 1 Line 6	Therefore, IUCN considers that the integrity of HLB and CBA is currently under serious threat. In addition, IUCN notes with concern that the prospect of further large-scale tourism development will likely compromise the integrity of the proposed extesnion further.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: Large tourism development projects including a golf course and Amatina in CBA as well as Domino in HLB are planned outside the boundaries of the extended property. The golf course and Domino project have not yet been licensed to construct while Amatina project is awaiting for EIA. Those projects have been seriously taken into consideration and consulted with relevant ministries and agencies. Particularly, Quang Ninh People's Committee has seriously taken Domino project into consideration and sought to assess its impacts on both environment and heritage before implementation as per Paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines. Upon preparation for the nomination, HLB is already recognized by UNESCO so the extension of this property to include the equally spectacular and beautiful CBA reinforces its outstanding universal value. Its addition to the existing property would considerably increase the area that is protected and further enhance its integrity. CBA also adds new dimensions marked by steep, rocky, forested peaks and a myriad of hidden lakes, labyrinthine coastal inlets, and jigsaw puzzle shaped islands as well as a comprehensive array of	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. The fact that these projects would not be located within the boundaries of the nominated property does not imply that there would not be any further negative impacts on the integrity of the nominated property. As noted above as well, there are projects foreseen within the buffer zone of the nominated property, according to the management plan.

Page, column, line	Sentence including the factual error (the factual	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the
of the Advisory Body Evaluation	error should be highlighted in bold)	·	World Heritage Centre
Page 43	IUCN concludes that	characteristic humid tropical limestone karst landforms, which further strengthen HLB's OUV at least under criterion (vii) and (viii). Therefore, threats and pressure from development have been fully recognized and duly addressed to minimize to the natural carrying capacity. Explained the same as above.	Not a factual error.
Column 1 Line 52	the significant growth plans for large-scale tourism and industrial developments pose serious threats to the integrity of the terrestrial and marine parts of the nominated property, precluding the possibility of inscription.	The manipution design	See point above.
Page 44 Column 1 Line 20	The nomination dossier contends that the nominated	The nomination dossier presents karst inundation stages illustrated with seven	Not a factual error Difference of opinion.
	property would meet this criterion due to the high representation of the world's total number of marine lakes within the nominated area, these habitats could be of value for on-going speciation. However, as no endemic species have so far been recorded in the marine lakes within the nominated property, there is currently no evidence demonstrating that such biological processes are taking place. Besides marine lakes, the nomination also proposes six further habitat or ecosystem types under criterion (ix) as prime examples of tropical and subtropical insular limestone ecosystems: primary	karst ecosystems, from terrestrial to marine. Each possible stage of the process of marine inundation of karst depressions is represented in the fengcong depressions of the HLB - CBA karsts, from hanging karst depressions with primary monsoon forests, to marine lakes gradually merging into the open sea. Explanation: Nowhere else in the world is this process so well illustrated in so many examples, from its very beginning to its very end, in all its variations, and with a wide spectrum of associated environments. Formulated in a context broader than that of the karst depressions, the complexity and the extent of the interface between the karst and the sea, displaying all the stages of repeated marine transgression over a karst area, and all the different environments associated with this process, represents an OUV under criterion (ix).	The description provided in the explanation would primarily support criterion (viii) but does not provide a strong case for criterion (ix).

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
	forest; caves; mangrove forest; tidal flats; soft sea bottom and corals.	If the full spectrum of environments resulting from the process of marine transgression over a karst area is presented as an OUV under criterion (ix), HLB WHS alone does not illustrate the entire process from terrestrial to fully marine, and thus lacks integrity. Extending the HLB WHS over CBA will show the entire process, and give the new property the necessary integrity.	
Page 44 Column 1 Line 25	However, as no endemic species have so far been recorded in the marine lakes within the nominated property, there is currently no evidence demonstrating that such biological processes are taking place.	We hereby request IUCN reexamine this sentence. Explanation: For a population of a species trapped in this environment, a marine lake is a small universe all by itself: Genetic exchange with populations outside the marine lake is very limited or impossible. The number of individuals in marine lake populations are often limited. Conditions in the marine lake are often not optimal for fully marine species. In such relatively small water bodies temperatures may greatly fluctuate following the seasons, and sharp salinity drops may occur during rainy periods. This may set in motion hazardous processes such as layering of a lake (with a layer of freshwater on top of the sea-water), and the development of seasonally or permanent anaerobic layer on the bottom of the lake. In trapped populations, these conditions, if they do not lead to extinction, may set in motion the process of genetic drift: evolution at greater than normal speed, necessary to adapt to the adverse conditions, and leading to the formation of new species. Geologically speaking, marine lakes are short-lived. Depending on relative sea level movements, they may either dry up again, but	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. The explanation provided hypothesizes ongoing speciation but does not demonstrate that it is taking place. Apart from the possibility of speciation, the explanation would in fact suggest a limited ecosystem value.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		it is also possible that erosion will widen the conduit until the separating walls collapse, and they are part of the open sea. Then, the new species, genetically and morphologically different from their ancestors living in the open sea, are released from their prison, and may populate the open sea, next to their ancestral species.	
Page 44 Column 1 Line 51	Considering that the remaining areas of undisturbed or seminatural habitats of most of the key ecosystems, and their size, within the nominated property are very small, IUCN considers that criterion (ix) is not met for the nominated property.	We hereby request IUCN delete this sentence. Explanation: We would like to draw your attention to karst depressions with emphasis on ecological and biodiversity values, starting with fully terrestrial and ending with fully marine types, which is presented clearly in the nomination dossier. Among them, the total surface of monsoon forests on Cat Ba Island is small, the fact that less than 10% of the Vietnamese lowland 'rain' forests are extant (Wikramanayake & Rundel, undated) adds value to this vegetation type. Although small, and of minor economic importance, we find that freshwater swamps like Ao Ech (Frog Pond), depressions of Viet Hai with freshwater swamps, or a swamp near Viet Hai harbour seem to differ from the next, and some are home to unusual species such as Combretocarpus. Also, many are in a good state, with few signs of disturbance, and some seem virtually pristine, which is rare among freshwater wetlands. The freshwater swamps deserve a prominent position in the nomination dossier. They should be prioritized when it comes to protective measures, and they urgently need to be mapped and explored, particularly their flora. We contend that the process of marine inundation of karst depressions represented in the	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		fengcong depressions of the CBA and HLB karsts, with 7 key ecosystem types, can meet the criterion (ix) though some of ecosystems are small in size, which is clearly presented in the dossier.	
Page 44 Column 2 Line 30	The state, abundance and distribution of the other species within the nominated property remain largely unclear. The species lists in the nomination dossier appear to be conflicting with more recent information.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence. Explanation: The dossier presents 4,910 species in total with detailed state, quantity and distribution in the lists attached. And the sources as well as related studies on which those lists are based are also clearly presented. Among them, 51 endemic species to HLB-CBA are specified.	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.
Page 45 Column 1 Line 3	3. Defers the nomination of Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago (Viet Nam), in order to allow the State Party to prepare a new nomination focused on criteria (vii), (viii) and (x)	3. Inscribes Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago (Viet Nam) on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x). Explanation: Ha Long Bay - Cat Ba Archipelago deserves to be inscribed under criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x) because of its superlative coastal karst landscape dominated by a spectacular array of limestone peaks and towers, many being islands with sheer cliffs plunging into the sea, as well as exhibits a comprehensive array of characteristic humid tropical limestone karst landforms. In no other karst area in the humid tropics of Asia the interface between the karst and the sea occupies such a large area, has developed such intricate coastline patterns with such a varied geomorphology and, as a result, shows such a wide range of different environments, particularly environments associated with karst depressions in various stages of marine inundation, ranging from fully terrestrial, through fresh- water, brackish and marine swamps, to enclosed but fully	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.

Page, column, line of the	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Advisory Body Evaluation	highlighted in bold)		
		marine environments, the marine lakes. Furthermore, it contains the most natural habitats including high biodiversity and many rare and precious species of global conservation significance, particularly over 51 endemic and potentially endemic species.	
Page 45 Column 1 Line 6	and taking account of the need to: a) revise the boundaries of Cat Ba National Park to align with the proposed boundaries of the Cat Ba Archipelago extension to the Ha Long Bay World Heritage property, and include the Phu Long mangrove forest within the buffer zone of the nominated property,	4. Requests the State Party to: a) Modify the boundary of the property to better reflect the areas and attributes of Outstanding Universal Value and ensure an appropriate surrounding buffer zone,	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.
Page 45 Column 1 Line 13	b) cancel large-scale development projects located in the buffer zone of the nominated property and adjacent to the buffer zone, such as a new golf course and the Cat Ba Amatina and Domino projects, and strengthen the legal protection status of the buffer zone,	b) minimize impacts of current large-scale development projects located in the buffer zone of the property and adjacent to the buffer zone, such as a new golf course and the Cat Ba Amatina and Domino projects, to the natural carrying capacity,	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.
Page 45 Column 2 Line 5	d) address key threats to the nominated property and strengthen law enforcement accordingly, including threats from mass tourism, a major shipping lane, growth of settlements, poaching, exploitation of marine resources and forest products, overfishing, unsustainable aquaculture, pollution (oil, noise, sewage,	d) revise the property management plan to incorporate appropriate measures to address threats from tourism, aquaculture, pollution, and significant developments in the buffer zone, and updates it as necessary	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. IUCN welcomes the State Party's willingness to revise the management plan.

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
	litter, including from river catchment inputs), and significant developments in the buffer zone,		
Column 2 Line 14	e) ensure a new nomination dossier includes accurate, up-to-date and verifiable data on species and habitats both in Ha Long Bay and Cat Ba Archipelago, distinguishing between the biodiversity values found within the nominated property and within the buffer zone,	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.
Page 45 Column 2 Line 20	f) demonstrate that local communities have been appropriately consulted and given their free, prior and informed consent to any relocations from the nominated property and its conditions.	We hereby request IUCN to delete this sentence	Not a factual error. Difference of opinion. See points above.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Cambodia

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Koh Ker: Archaeological Site of Ancient Lingapura or Chok Gargyar

Evaluation	actual error should be thted in bold)		World Heritage Centre
Colum 1, leaf fo and Ku Line 50 gently	y hidden in a dense broad- rest between the Dangrek den mountain ranges on a sloping hill some eighty tres northwest of Angkor	Change from "northwest" to "northeast"	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Tr'ondëk-Klondike

Page, Column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page: 122 Column: LC Section: Background Paragraph 1, Line 1	"A previous nomination was submitted in 2018 but was withdrawn before consideration by the World Heritage Committee."	"A previous nomination was submitted in 2018 2017 but was withdrawn before consideration by the World Heritage Committee in 2018.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page: 122 Column: RC Section: Description and History Paragraph 2, Line 2	"The area of the eight component parts totals 334.54 ha, with buffer zones originally totalling 53.85 ha."	Add: "The revised buffer totals 357.19 ha."	The updated area for the buffer zone was not specified in the documents provided by the State Party with the additional information submitted on 28 February 2022. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page: 123 Column: LC Section: Description and History Paragraph 6, Line 2	"The serial nomination is held to attest to the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in's ancestors' relationship with their homeland, to the alteration of this relationship"	"The serial nomination is held to attest to the Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in's continued relationship with their homeland	ICOMOS acknowledges this editorial change.
Page: 123 Column: LC Section: Fort Reliance Paragraph 1, Line 7	"the collaboration of the Indigenous people,"	"the collaboration of Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in people,"	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page: 123 Column: LC Section: Fort Reliance Description: Paragraph 1, Line 8-9	"The log buildings were demolished in the subsequent decade."	"The log buildings were disassembled in the subsequent decade."	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page: 123 Column: RC Section: Fort Cudahy and Fort Constantine Paragraph 1, Line 2	"Fort Constantine was built in 1895 as the first station of the North-Wes Mounted Police (NWMP) in these territories"	"Fort Constantine was built in 1895 as the first station of the North-West Mounted Police (NWMP) in these territories"	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.

Page: 123	"The site was used only	Add: "By 1901, the	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	until 1901, as the miners	much-reduced force at	this clarification.
Section: Fort Cudahy and	moved to another gold	Fort Constantine had	
Fort Constantine	deposit location and the	moved to the two-storey	
Paragraph 2, Line 5-8	police force relocated to	timber building in the	
	Dawson City."	Forty Mile settlement."	
Page: 123	"This component part is	"This component part is	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	located south of Dawson	located south of Dawson	this clarification.
Section: Tr'ochëk	City, on the opposite side	City, on the opposite side	
Paragraph 1, Line 1-3	of the Klondike River, at	of the Klondike River, at	
	its confluence with the	its confluence with the	
	Yukon."	Yukon River ."	
Page: 123	"Preserved archaeological	"Preserved archaeological	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	evidence of this period is	evidence of this period is	this clarification.
Section: Tr'ochëk	limited to traces of	limited to traces of	
Paragraph 1, Line 9-10	transport infrastructure."	transport infrastructure,	
		building foundations	
		and artifacts."	
Page: 123	"Newcomers settled in	1902 is not a discrete end	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	this area between 1898,	date to the settling of the	this clarification.
Section: Dawson	when the Yukon Territory	area. Suggested change:	
Paragraph 1, Line 3-5	was established as a	"By 1898 newcomers had	
	separate entity, and	heavily settled in this	
	1902."	area, with some 30 000	
		gold seekers reaching the	
		Dawson area. Over the	
		next three years, building	
		occurred at a rapid pace."	
Page: 123	"The town was given its	"The town was given its	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	urban layout, and	urban layout, and	this typing error.
Section: Dawson	institutional religious and	institutional, religious and	
Paragraph 1, Line 5-7	commercial buildings	commercial buildings	
	were erected"	were erected." (addition	
		of comma after	
		"institutional")	
Page: 124	"The component part is	The component part is	This is a factual section of
Column: LC	held to demonstrate	held to demonstrate	the ICOMOS report, in
Section: Tthe Zray Kek'it	ingenuity, resistance, and	ingenuity, resistance, and	which inference related to
(Black City)	adaptation in the face of	adaptation in the face of	significance are not usually
Paragraph 1, Line 8-10	the colonial push."	the colonial push,	included.
	1	demonstrating a place	
		where Indigenous	ICOMOS acknowledges
		Peoples used their	this clarification.
		traditional skills and	
		resources to maintain	
		their identity while	
		participating in a	
		rapidly changing socio-	
		economic reality.	
Page: 124	"With the end of the	"With the end of the	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: LC	Klondike Gold Rush,	Klondike Gold Rush,	this clarification.
Section: Tthe Zray Kek'it	between 1898 and 1908	between 1898 and 1908	
(Black City)	the population of	the population of	
Paragraph 2, Line 1-3	newcomers dropped from	newcomers dropped from	
	some 30,000 to less than	some 30,000 to less than	
	5,000 people."	5,000 people in the	
		region."	
Page: 124	"At Jëjik Dhä Dënezhu	"At Jëjik Dhä Dënezhu	ICOMOS accepts this
Column: LC	Kek'it, archaeological	Kek'it, archaeological	correction as a factual error.
	investigations were		
	-		

	T	Γ	
Section: Tthe Zray Kek'it	carried out repeatedly	investigations were	
(Black City)	from the 1960s until the	carried out over several	
Paragraph 4, Line 4-6	early 21st century."	years between 1989 until	
		the early 21st century"	
Page: 124	"Artefacts that emerged	"Artefacts that emerged	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: LC	during archaeological	during archaeological	this clarification.
Section: State of	excavations are properly	excavations are properly	
Conservation	preserved in museums"	preserved in Museums	
Paragraph: 1, Line: 9-12		and collections facilities"	
Page: 124	"However, permafrost	"However, permafrost	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	melting and wildfire	melting and wildfire	this editorial change.
Section: Factor Effecting	would need closer	effects would need closer	
the Property	monitoring and proactive	monitoring and proactive	
Paragraph: 3, Line: 4-6	measures to prevent or	measures to prevent or	
	reduce their adverse	reduce their adverse	
	impacts."	impacts."	
Page: 126	"a settlement pattern	"a settlement pattern	ICOMOS considers this
Column: LC	reflecting the dramatic	reflecting the dramatic	correction to be an editorial
Section: Proposed	encounter triggered by the	encounter - triggered by	change which does not
Justification for	feverish search for	the feverish search for	modify the meaning of the
Inscription	precious metals between	precious metals -	sentence.
Paragraph 3, Lines 5-6	the Indigenous population	between the Indigenous	Sentence.
Turugruph 3, Emes 3 0	and outsiders in a sub-	population and outsiders	
	arctic region, the colonial	in a sub-arctic region, the	
	affirmation of the later	colonial affirmation of the	
	over the lands, resources	later over the lands,	
	and people"	resources and people"	
Page: 127	"1,375 inhabitants are	"1,577 inhabitants are	ICOMOS asknowledges
Page: 127 Column: LC	T		ICOMOS acknowledges
	living within the	living within the	this clarification and notes
Section: Boundaries	nominated property, with	nominated property, with	that the updated figures
Paragraph: 1, Line: 9-12	almost all of them living	almost all of them living	were not mentioned in the
	within the boundary of	within the boundary of the	additional information
	the Dawson City	Dawson City component	provided by the State Party
	component part. There are	part. There are no	during the evaluation
	no inhabitants within the	inhabitants within the	procedure.
	buffer zones (2016	buffer zones (2021	
7 127	figures)."	figures)."	7707107
Page:127	"However, the disposition	However, the disposition	ICOMOS accepts this
Column: RC	of these remains may	of these remains may	correction as a factual error.
Section: Documentation	change following the	change following the	
Paragraph 2, line 5	completion of Tr'ondëk	completion of Tr'ondëk	
	Hwëch'in's archival	Hwëch'in's Heritage	
	facility in Dawson City."	Facility in Dawson City.	
Page: 127	"The Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in	"Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in has	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	have been actively	been actively building	this grammatical error.
Section: Documentation	building cultural	cultural collections and	
Paragraph 2, Lines 7-8	collections and have	has assembled"	
	assembled"		
Page: 128	"The nominated	"The nominated	ICOMOS acknowledges
Column: RC	component parts and	component parts and	this clarification.
Section: Legal Protection	respective buffer zones	respective buffer zones	
Paragraph 6, Line 3-4	are under different	are under different	
	ownership, but only a	ownership, but only a	
	limited percentage of	limited percentage of	
	component parts is in	component parts is in	
	private ownership, all in	private ownership, all in	
	Dawson City"	Dawson City excepting a	
		small vacant surveyed	
		parcel located within	
L	1	Parent totaled within	

		Ch'ëdähdëk (Forty	
Page: 129 Column: RC Section: Visitor Management Paragraph 1, Line 5-7	"The exhibits at the museum are being improved to reflect the nomination narrative"	Mile)" The exhibits at the museum have recently been revamped to reflect the nomination narrative	ICOMOS notes that the nomination dossier states that "the exhibits in the museum are currently being upgraded to provide interpretation that reflects the history of Tr'ondëk Hwëch'in, and the evolution of Dawson City up to the twenty-first century" (p. 267). ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
Page: 129 Column: RC Section: Management System Paragraph 4, Line 1-3	"In its additional information of February 2022, the State Party explained that the (MoU) concerning the Joint Management and Protection of Tr'ondëk-Klondike"	"In its additional information of February 2022, the State Party explained that the MoU concerning the Joint Management and Protection of Tr'ondëk-Klondike"	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page: 129 Column: RC Section: Conclusion Paragraph 3, Lines 5-6	"a settlement pattern reflecting the dramatic encounter triggered by the feverish search for precious metals between the Indigenous population and outsiders in a subarctic region, the colonial affirmation of the later over the lands, resources and people"	Add dashes to provide clarity in sentence. "a settlement pattern reflecting the dramatic encounter - triggered by the feverish search for precious metals - between the Indigenous population and outsiders in a sub-arctic region, the colonial affirmation of the later over the lands, resources and people"	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
Page: 131 Column: LC Section: Recommendations Paragraph 2, Line 8	"These have been significant resource areas for the"	"These have been significant resource and cultural areas for the"	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Denmark

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Viking-Age Ring Fortresses

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 135, column 1, lines 1-2	The area of the five component parts originally totals 49.333 ha, with buffer zones totalling 10.802 ha.	The area of the five component parts originally totals 51 ha, with buffer zones totalling 16.821 ha.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that was not provided during the evaluation procedure, hence the recommendation to provide updated figures for the areas of the revised boundaries of the serial property as a whole, and of each component part.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Ethiopia

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: The Gedeo Cultural landscape

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Pp.22; Col.2; Line 22	"Two prehistoric rock art sites"	ONE prehistoric art site	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Pp.23; Col.1; Line 31	Social changes are also impacting adversely on the steles which are no longer protected as part of community traditions, and are being damaged or even used for building stone.	The state party believes that some stelae are not well protected and thus subjected to damage and loss. However, this does not mean that the stelae are no longer protected by the community. The three clusters of megalithic sites are managed and protected by the local community in collaboration with local and regional government. Thus, this sentence needs to be corrected as follows: 'Social changes are also impacting adversely the stele and they were damaged or even used for building stone.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Germany

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Jewish-Medieval Heritage of Erfurt

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
146, left column, third paragraph, line four	The building was heated and included a cellar, a high-ceilinged ground floor, and a low-ceilinged first floor.	The building was heated and included a cellar, a ground floor and a first floor	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Guatemala

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: National Archaeological Park Tak'alik Ab'aj

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
246, chiefdom	It seems that this situation was appropriate for the emergence of a "chiefdom."	The State Party clarifies that the word chiefdom does not represent the magnitude of the first kingdom cities, which arose in the Preclassic as part of the long-distance trade route on the Pacific coast and that this situation was appropriate for the emergence of a kingdom city in this place. The long-distance trade route has a catalytic effect for the early cities of the different peoples that participated as partners in it. The flow of people, goods and ideas along the route creates an opening towards other cultures and the very need to negotiate and maintain diplomatic relations. This climate of openness favors innovations, which are responses to increasingly complex emerging needs, as well as social structures, with a centralized government with a king ruler, which is also accompanied by a nascent bureaucracy. Without this centralized government structure, such complexity of public works programs, hydraulic engineering, workshops of generations of highly specialized artisans, astronomers, and long-distance import and export trade would not have been possible.	ICOMOS notes the clarification. However, the SP uses de term chiefdom throughout the nomination dossier. Kingdom or king is not mentioned; the text only refers to rulers. The long occupation of the site may have warranted a change of use of term (chiefdom to kingdom) at some point, but no clear definitions of the terms and their application to different stages of development were included in the nomination text.
248, chiefdom	"This architectural layout par	The State Party clarifies that the word chiefdom does not represent the magnitude of the first kingdom cities,	ICOMOS notes the clarification. However, the SP uses de term chiefdom

	•		
	excellence, with	which arose in the Preclassic period as	throughout the nomination
	a conspicuous	part of the long-distance trade route on	dossier. Kingdom or king is
	integrated	the Pacific coast and that the architectural	not mentioned; the text only
	sculptural	layout par excellence, with a integrated	refers to rulers. The long
	program,	conspicuous program sculptural, created	occupation of the site may
	created ritual	ritual settings for the public presentation	have warranted a change of
	settings for the	of the first kings of the Preclassic period.	use of term (chiefdom to
	public	of the first kings of the Preciassic period.	kingdom) at some point, but
	representation		no clear definitions of the
	of the incipient		terms and their application
	"chiefdom".		to different stages of
			development were included
			in the nomination text.
249, chiefdom	"This exchange	The State party clarifies that the word	ICOMOS notes the
,	is manifested in	chiefdom does not represent the	clarification. However, the
	the monumental	magnitude of the first kingdom cities,	SP uses de term chiefdom
	ceremonial	which arose in the Preclassic period as	throughout the nomination
	architecture	part of the long-distance trade route on	dossier. Kingdom or king is
	used as a ritual	the Pacific coast and that the exchange of	not mentioned; the text only
	setting for the	cultural traits with places as far away as	refers to rulers. The long
	public	the Olmec Lowlands in present-day	occupation of the site may
	performance of	Mexico on the one hand and present-day	have warranted a change of
	the incipient	El Salvador on the other, is manifested in	use of term (chiefdom to
	"chiefdoms".	the monumental ceremonial architecture	kingdom) at some point, but
		used as a ritual setting for the public	no clear definitions of the
		performance of early preclassic kings.	terms and their application
		performance of early preemastic kings.	to different stages of
			development were included
			in the nomination text.
248, Criterion	"ICOMOS	The State Party clarifies that the	ICOMOS considers that this
(i): represent a	considers that	nominated property is considered in a	reflects a difference of
masterpiece of	the long history	broad cultural-historical context, and its	opinion.
human creative	of the	creative excellence, assessed in relation to	opinion.
genius;	nominated	that context, has shown that it is a	
8	property and	masterpiece of human creative genius per	
	the	se.	
	accumulation of	The sculptural wealth represented in the	
	a large number	quantity and diversity of sculpture styles	
	of sculptures of	that are an integral part of the ritual	
	different styles	spaces of the Central Group squares,	
	is an expression	offers a representative sample of each	
	of a very	style, which provides the unique	
	interesting and	opportunity to observe -how in a	
	possibly unique	laboratory-, throughout 1000 years of	
	evolutionary	sculptural and lapidary tradition, the	
	development,	differences between each style and	
	but has not been	particularly the gradual change of the	
	demonstrated to	transition from the Olmec to the Maya	
	be a	style. This has not been possible to	
	masterpiece of	document in other Mesoamerican	
	human creative	archaeological sites (Schieber and Orrego	
	genius per se.	2010). It should be added that this	
	Uniqueness is	transition is gestating within itself and is	
	not, on its own,	of an evolutionary nature.	
	sufficient to	The sophisticated lapidary art carved in	
	justify	the precious jadeite material, which	
	inscription. The	represents the symbols of preclassic	
	nominated	kings, is equally exceptional and	
	property must	masterfully reflects this change (annexes	
	be considered in	8d and 8e). This is particularly well	
	55 551151461 Cu III	ma co, man paraconary wen	<u> </u>

a broad culturalhistorical context, and its possible creative excellence assessed in relation to that context."

illustrated through the evolution of the "Olmec" ax (Middle Preclassic), to the bird (vulture) head hatchet (Transition) and the ceremonial miniature head of jadeite mosaics (Late Preclassic, early Early Classic) (Schieber de Lavarreda 2015) (annexes 8d and 8e). There are archaeological sites that present a first phase of their history related to the Olmec culture and then early Mayan development, such as the Ceibal site, Aguada Fénix Inomata et al, 2013; Inomata and Henderson 2016; Inomata Takeshi et 2020), Cival (Estrada Belli 2008) in the Maya Lowlands, El Naranio/Kaminal Juvu (Arrovo 2010: Kidder and Shook 1952) in the central highlands of Guatemala, Chalchuapa on the Pacific coast, El Salvador (Sharer 1986; Ito 2019), Chiapa de Corzo, Chiapas (Lowe and Bachand 2011-2012). But none presents that magnitude of sculptural heritage. There are sites with representative sculptural heritage, both Olmec and Early Maya, but not the combination and even less the transition between the two: Olmec San Lorenzo, La Venta and Tres Zapotes (sculpture, Tabasco Gulf of Mexico). Early maya Kaminaljuyu (Central Highlands sculpture); San Bartolo (murals), Nakbe, El Mirador, Maya Lowlands and Hills, Belize (mascarons). Tak'alik Ab'aj is distinguished from other pre-Columbian cities by the number and diversity of styles of sculptures that are an integral part of the ritual spaces of the Central Group plazas. The more than 400 sculptures and monuments represent the pre-classical sculptural tradition over a millennium. Among the particular richness of 6 different sculptural styles, which involve different techniques, the Olmec and Mayan styles stand out, which stylistically describe the two eras, the Middle and Late Preclassic, and most importantly, the gradual transition between both aesthetic expressions, which illuminated the story of Tak'alik Ab'aj (exhibits 8a, 8b and 8c). See also elements of this approach in the Dossier: subtitles called: Looking from halfway up the volcanic foothills towards the ocean: The city and the landscape, Pages 20 and 21 (annexes 1a and 1b); Chronological genealogy of Tak'alik Ab'aj, Fig. 14 Chronology of the occupation of the

archaeological site Tak'alik Ab'aj on page

_	T		
		22 (annex 1c) and text on page 23 (annex	
		1d); The power of the message carved in	
ļ		stone, page 61 and 62 (annexes 1e and	
ļ		1f); Lapidary art: The passion for	
		miniatures and mosaics, pages 65 and 68	
		(Annexes 1g and 1h); Additional	
		Information II: subtitle Comparative	
		analysis, page 7 (annex 1i); Table 1.	
		Comparative table for each criterion that	
		meets the postulated area and outside it,	
		within the archaeological site, pages 8 and	
		9 (annexes 1j, 1k and 1l), annex 10a	
240	Q '4 ' ('')	bibliography.	IGOMOG 11 d d1
248	Criterion (ii):	The following summary and	ICOMOS considers that this
ļ	exhibit an	strengthening of the argument that	statement re-iterates
	important	supports criterion ii presented in the	arguments/justification put
	interchange of	Dossier and Additional Information I and	forward in the nomination
	human values,	II is presented.	dossier that have been fully
	over a span of	Urbanism with a worldview intertwined	considered.
1	time or within a	with the environment	
	cultural area of	The plan to take advantage of and design	
	the world, on	the displacement of the ancient city on 10	
ļ	developments in	of the characteristic natural terraces of the	
ļ	architecture or	fertile slopes of the volcanic chain,	
	technology,	reflects the deep knowledge and at the	
ļ	monumental	same time respect that the ancient	
ļ	arts, town-	architects professed towards their	
	planning or	environment, making it sacred. Likewise,	
	landscape	the decision to select the most stable	
ļ	design;	stellar constellation at that time in the	
ļ	design,	night sky to anchor in it the orientation	
ļ		that will govern the outline of the	
		cosmogram combined with the daily	
		journey of the sun, replicated in the layout	
ļ		1 2 2	
		of the buildings, and the central point of	
		it, in the precise middle of the square. The	
ļ		management of the copious rains in the	
		region, an essential source of life, formed	
ļ		an integral part of the design of the sacred	
ļ		scenery of the plazas, as well as an	
		ingenious system for the evacuation of	
		rainwater, and spring water supply	
		channels for the residential areas.	
249	Criterion (iii):	The following summary and	ICOMOS considers that this
	bear a unique or	strengthening of the argument that	statement re-iterates
	at least	supports criterion iii exposed in the	arguments/ justification put
	exceptional	Dossier and Additional Information I and	forward in the nomination
,	testimony to a	II is presented.	dossier that have been fully
	cultural	Astronomical Observatory	considered.
	tradition or to a	Maya astronomers of the Middle and Late	
,	civilization	Preclassic made meticulous observations	
	which is living	of the path of the stars and the sun. These	
	or which has	records were represented and	
1	disappeared	commemorated in the sculptural	
		alignments on the sacred platform of the	
		Astronomical Observatory. The	
1		combination of the record of both	
i '	I		
		hhonomona is exceptional in the way it is	
		phenomena is exceptional in the way it is	
		phenomena is exceptional in the way it is commemorated in Structure 7, unique in the archaeological remains of preclassic	

		sites in Mesoamerica (Ivan prajs et al	
		;2023) documents the search for	
		precision in counting days of the year, the	
		basis for the long count, of which Tak'alik	
		Ab'aj was a part and which represents a	
		milestone in Mesoamerican intellectual	
		development.	
249, Criterion	ICOMOS	The State Party considers that the	ICOMOS considers that this
(iv): be an	recognises the	archaeological evidence and the	reflects a difference of
outstanding	potential for	interpretation of the exceptional	opinion.
example of a type	Outstanding	manifestation of the creation of a	
of building,	Universal Value	historical discourse through the	
architectural or	in the	combination of sculpture with	
technological	phenomenon	architecture anchored in the primordial	
ensemble or	described by the	concept of ancestor veneration, supports	
landscape which	State Party.	criterion iv. While the archaeological	
illustrates (a)	However, it is	exponents presented to justify criterion iii	
significant	better justified	are a material expression par excellence	
stage(s) in human	as a cultural	of astronomical observations and the	
history;	tradition under	development of writing and Long Count.	
	criterion (iii).	Therefore, the State party reiterates that	
		criterion iv, representing the historical	
		discourse, and criterion iii, representing the theme of the advances of Tak'alik	
		Ab'aj's science in the Preclassic, are two	
		essentially different concepts, and should	
		be kept separate.	
		Open Air Museum	
		Tak'alik Ab'aj has a special composition	
		of sculptures of different styles and	
		periods, placed in and forming an integral	
		part of the settings of the squares and	
		buildings. Facing the west façade of	
		Structure 12, this is eloquently and	
		exceptionally presented, where the	
		diversity of styles and techniques of the	
		monuments evokes and summarizes the	
		pre-classical history of the site. The order	
		in which the sculptures were placed, Stela	
		5 of Mayan style and with a long count	
		date of 126 AD. in the center of the	
		façade, with two zoomorphic monuments on either side, framed at the ends by two	
		Olmec convention monuments that	
		centuries before had been erected at	
		another important site in the ancient city,	
		communicates a message of deep	
		historical significance. The present must	
		be accompanied by the past, the basic	
		principle of historicity in public discourse.	
		For this reason, this square is called the	
		"Open Air Museum" (annex 8f).	
		Likewise, this is manifested in a	
		superlative way in the sculptural	
		masterpiece The Carrier of the Ancestor,	
		that shows the early Mayan style	
		"carrying" the ancestral precedent "Olmec" style and emphasizing that it in	
		turn has its ancestor (annex 8g).	
		See also elements of this approach in the	
L	l .	200 and crements of and approach in the	

	I	T =	
		Dossier: subtitles called: Open-air	
		museum: architectural and sculptural	
		setting for political, ideological, and	
		historical discourse - Ancestor Carrier	
		Sculpture, page 81 (annex 2a); Additional	
		Information II Table 1. Comparative table	
		for each criterion met by the postulated	
		area and outside it, within the	
		archaeological site, pages 14 and 15	
		(annexes 2b and 2c).	
249, Criterion	ICOMOS	The State party clarifies that the	ICOMOS considers that this
(vi): be directly or	recognises the	nominated property can be considered	reflects a difference of
tangibly	importance the	outstanding under this criterion, since it	opinion.
associated with	nominated	can demonstrate the continuity and direct	ориноп.
events or living	property holds	association between the archaeological	
traditions, with	for different	characteristics of the nominated property	
ideas, or with	Indigenous	and the current practices of the	
beliefs, with	communities.	indigenous peoples, which besides being	
artistic and literary	However,	exceptional, they have been sufficiently	
works of	ICOMOS	documented. Tak'alik Ab'aj is the only	
outstanding	considers that	site in Guatemala where for more than	
universal	the continuity	three decades an exhaustive and	
	and direct		
significance. (The Committee	association	documented record of all the ceremonies	
considers that this	between the	performed by the different Mayan ethnic	
		groups in the park has been kept. This has	
criterion should	archaeological features of the	made it possible to demonstrate the	
preferably be used		continuity of the symbols embodied in the	
in conjunction	nominated	discovered archaeological remains,	
with other	property and	procedures (ritual protocol) and their	
criteria);	the current	meanings, in research carried out for	
	practices by	more than three decades, which continue	
	Indigenous	to be used in the practice of current	
	peoples have not	Mayan spirituality.	
	yet been	Among the oldest vestiges dating back to	
	sufficiently documented. In	the beginning of its history, 800 BC, the	
	addition, the	symbols of its worldview, such as the	
	persistence and	cosmogram (Annex 8j) and the K'an cross, expressed in multiple ways (Annex	
	resilience of beliefs can be	8k). In arrangements of vessels, in the Las Muñecas Offering of the wonderful six	
	observed at	figurines, in the Sculpture "El Abuelo", of	
		1	
	many sites in the geo-cultural	the possible founder of Tak'alik Ab'aj, who dressed in wings with the K'an	
	region and	symbol of foundation. The tradition of	
	around the	these symbols - alive 3000 years later -	
	world. In the	today, is found in the drawing of the same	
	framework of	symbols, practiced in the rituals	
	this nomination,	celebrated by the carriers of these	
	it has not yet	ancestral peoples in the place of this	
	been well	ancient city. The transfer of this	
	demonstrated	knowledge through oral tradition, from	
	through the	generation to generation during the	
	comparative	Colony and the Republican era, and the	
	analysis that the	ability to adapt and reinvent oneself,	
	nominated	made it possible for the umbilical cord	
	property can be	with the ancestral past not to be broken,	
	considered	and that is what that makes possible its	
	outstanding	resilience and continuity into the future.	
	under this	The result of this has been published in	
	criterion	different publications, articles and	
L	CHICHOH	arretent publications, articles and	

		symposiums, among which La Ciudad	
		Puente (Schieber de Lavarreda and	
		Orrego 2013), First Meeting of Spiritual	
		Guides (Orrego and Torres 2016), Dance	
		of the Maidens and The Dimensions stand	
		out. of Rituality (referenced on pages	
		511-517 of the Dossier and Annex VII.8)	
		(Schieber de Lavarreda 2016a and b),	
		mentioned in the Dossier and Additional	
		information I and II.	
		Living Ancestral Culture.	
		Tak'alik Ab'aj today is an important	
		sacred place for the communities of the	
		Mayan peoples, visited by the ethnic	
		groups of the 21 linguistic groups (Annex	
		8h). Through careful research and	
		archaeological documentation, as well as	
		the rituals performed by the current	
		Mayan peoples, for more than three	
		decades, it can be verified that this ancient	
		city is now the sacred place of an	
		ancestral culture that is still alive (Annex	
		8i).	
		See also elements of this approach in the	
		Dossier: subtitles: "Monument 253a and	
		253b "The descent of the Grandfather",	
		page 35 (annex 3a); Resilience of sacred	
		rituals: current ceremonial life, survival of	
		ancient sacred calendars and ancestral	
		Mesoamerican cosmogonic symbols,	
		page 82 (annex 3b), annex 10a	
		bibliography.	
251, Limits	"The State	The State Party considers that intensive	ICOMOS considers that this
,	party provides	work has been done on the excavations,	reflects a difference of
	very little	therefore, the information provided on the	opinion.
	information on	archaeological remains is sufficient to	T
	the	understand the relationship of the	
	archaeological	Nominated Area with the rest of the	
	remains located	archaeological site; these data are widely	
	outside the	reflected in the Report Additional II.	
	proposed	Archaeological investigations have been	
	property.	carried out for more than three decades,	
	ICOMOS	both in the Nominated Area, as well as in	
	requested more	the rest of the archaeological site.	
	information on	However, the type of research has been	
	this topic to	different since, within the Nominated	
	improve its	Area, it is intense and constant, while	
	understanding	outside it is sporadic and only through	
	of the	systematic prospection research	
	relationship of	(Permanent Program for Study of	
	the nominated	Settlement Patterns and Potential Zones	
	part of the	of crops on the outskirts of the Tak'alik	
	Central Group	Ab'aj National Archaeological Park).	
	to the rest of the	In thirty-five years of research, 1,638	
	650-hectare	archaeological excavations have been	
	archaeological	carried out with an average of 47	
	site, and the	excavations per year. Of which 75%	
		(1,226 excavations) have been carried out	
1	justification for	(1,220 excuvations) have been curried out	
	the delimitation	within the Nominated Property and only	

	T .		
	nominated	In addition, 62 walls have been scraped	
	property."	off, revealing strategic profiles on the	
		exterior roads of the Nominated Property.	
		See also elements of this approach in	
		Additional document II paragraph 3,	
		pages 44, 45, 49, 50 and 51, (annexes 4a,	
		4b, 4c and 4d)	
251, limits	"It should be	The state party ratifies the desire to	ICOMOS considers that this
231, 11111165	noted that	protect the "islands of protection". The	statement re-iterates
	ICOMOS does	so-called "islands of protection" are small	arguments/justification put
	not consider the	areas with special characteristics,	forward in the nomination
	creation of	however, they still require study,	dossier that have been fully
	"islands of	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	considered.
		consensus and legal approval.	considered.
	protection" to	The proposal to create the so-called	
	be an	"islands of protection" does not imply	
	appropriate way	adding more elements to the Nominated	
	of adding more	Property. However, the State Party	
	elements to the	confirms that, through comparative	
	nominated	analyses, the Nominated Property is	
	property. If	representative of the entire	
	there is a desire	archaeological site, grouping the	
	to strengthen	majority of the exponents of each	
	the protection of	criterion par excellence.	
	these features	See also elements of this approach in	
	without	Additional document II: subheadings	
	including them	Current Islands of Protection and	
	in the	Potential Islands of Protection, pages 18	
	arguments	and 19 (Annex 5a); which was based on	
	supporting the	Practice Guideline II.F Limits for	
	proposed	effective protection, paragraph 102 of the	
	Outstanding	Operational Guidelines 2019, page 33	
	Universal	(Annex 5b).	
	Value, they	(Thutex 50).	
	could be		
	included in an		
	appropriate		
252	buffer zone."		rgo) rog
252,	"It is not clear	The State Party considers that the	ICOMOS considers that this
Documentation	to what extent	Research Plan establishes which research	statement re-iterates
	the research	programs, due to their nature and	arguments/justification put
	topics involve	objective, include excavations inside and	forward in the nomination
	excavations on	outside the nominated Property (see	dossier that have been fully
	the nominated	Additional information II) as indicated in	considered.
	property or on	the 2021-2025 Management Plan (page	
	the larger	36, subtitle specific objectives, annex 9d),	
	archaeological	it is clear how the research topics are	
	site."	involved in the excavations inside and	
		outside the Nominated Property, existing	
		planning with a permanent research	
		system or program.	
		In the Nominated Property there is a	
		system that allows permanent, systematic,	
		intensive, simultaneous and above all	
		multidisciplinary research to be carried	
		out. In the rest of the site, the	
		investigation has been at the level of	
		surveys and archaeological surveys. The	
		results of the intensive investigations have	
		allowed different publications to be	
	j	carried out with the different lines of	

		investigation of the recovered	
254, Management system	"ICOMOS considers that the document must be more	archaeological artifacts (ceramics, lapidary art, obsidian and lithics; study on the traces of lapidary production, study on the traditions of cephalic modification, multidisciplinary study of Stela 87 on the beginnings of writing, among others). While the Permanent Program for the study of settlement patterns and potential cultivation areas on the outskirts of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park is carried out outside the Nominated Property and covers the entire extension of the archaeological site, due to the fact that the core The ceremonial center of the Central Group is located within the confines of the Nominated Property. This has allowed to strengthen and compare the data obtained inside and outside the Nominated Property, which offers the opportunity to compare cultural patterns of core areas versus peripheral areas. See also elements of this approach in the Additional document II: Chapter Research Planning and strategy for the sustainability of Outstanding Universal Value, pages 62, 63, 64 and 65 (annexes 6a, 6b and 6c) The State party expands the information indicating that the Comprehensive Risk Management Plan was completed in December 2021 and currently has a	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
	practical to be a useful tool. The State Party did not indicate whether the plan was being prepared or approved"	corresponding administrative resolution (DGPCYN 236-2023, annex 91).	stage.
256, recommendations	"Analyze the limitations of the legal protection of the proposed property and the surrounding archaeological site, caused by the lack of norms that allow the application of the relevant laws, and implement these norms."	In order to strengthen the legal protection of the proposed property and the surrounding archaeological site, the State Party, through an inter-institutional agreement, undertakes to reinforce the implementation of relevant laws through the corresponding regulations and compliance with prior heritage and environmental impact assessments. to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus on the immediate surroundings of the Park, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for the implementation of the World Heritage Convention.	ICOMOS welcomes this information, but considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.

256	4F-4-1-P-1	TI Cott Date d'Cattalia	ICOMOS
256, recommendations	"Establish a buffer zone that	The State Party ratifies the priority	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new
recommendations	effectively	importance of the buffer zone issue	information that cannot be
	reduces the land	necessary for the protection of the heritage of the Nominated Property, and	taken account of at this
	use threat in the	informs that it has been resolved, now	stage.
	areas	having a Cooperation Agreement for the	
	surrounding the	Constitution of the Buffer Zone as	
	nominated	Additional Protection of the Park Tak'alik	
	property that	Ab'aj National Archaeological Site in the	
	could adversely		
	affect the	long term.	
	proposed	The proposed buffer zone reduces or	
	Outstanding Universal Value	minimizes the threat of land use through a 10 m strip, preventing inappropriate land	
	of the property		
	and meets the	use from affecting the Nominated	
	requirements	Property. Therefore, it lessens the impact,	
	outlined in	as described in paragraph 104 of the	
	paragraphs 103-	Operational Guidelines for the	
	107 of the	Implementation of the Operational Guidelines for the application of the	
	Operational	World Heritage Convention (see site map	
	Guidelines for	with proposed buffer zone, annex 9a).	
	the	with proposed burier zone, aimex 9a).	
	Implementation		
	of the World		
	Heritage Convention".		
256,	"Define the	The exact location is defined in the	ICOMOS considers that this
recommendations	exact location	Protection Islands files sent to the World	correction contains new
recommendations	and extension of	Heritage Delegation and are attached in	information that cannot be
	the "protection	annex 9b of this document.	taken account of at this
	islands", as well	The State Party (through the	stage.
	as the permitted	administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj	
	land uses and	National Archaeological Park) undertakes	
	their legal	to implement a socialization program and	
	status, and	workshops with the owners of the farms	
	consider their	where the Tak'alik Ab'aj Archaeological	
	inclusion within the limits of the	Site is located to generate the appropriate	
	buffer zone".	conditions and facilitate the definition of	
	builer zone .	the extension of the "islands of	
		protection", as well as the permitted land	
		uses and their legal status, so that their	
		inclusion in a future expansion of the	
		buffer zone can be considered; A land use	
		map with protection islands for the year	
		2021 is attached, see annex 9c.	
		Most of the site is privately owned	
		(except for the nominated property) and	
		for many decades has been used for	
		monoculture agriculture, (coffee, rubber,	
		sugarcane, cocoa, and macadamia);	
		Currently, there is a more accentuated and	
		frequent trend of land use change in the	
		area.	
256,	"Update the	The Cultural Heritage that represents the	ICOMOS considers that this
recommendations	management	Exceptional Universal Value (see annex	correction contains new
	plan to include a	9k), is part of the general inventory of the	information that cannot be
	practical risk	heritage of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National	taken account of at this

	management	Archaeological Park. The objective of the	stage.
	plan, a visitor	instruments of the Risk Management and	
	management	Management Plans is to investigate,	
	plan and a	conserve and protect this heritage.	
	detailed	The State Party undertakes (through the	
	conservation	administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj	
	plan aligned	National Archaeological Park) to update	
	with the	in 2023 and validate the Management	
	research	Plan (2021-2025) Management (2021-	
	framework, all	2025, Administrative Resolution	
	aimed at	DGPCYN 251- 2023, annex 9m) and	
	maintaining the	Risk Management Plan (December 2021)	
	proposed	(December 2021, Administrative	
	Outstanding	Resolution DGPCYN 236-2023, annex	
	Universal Value	91), the Conservation Plan (Strategic Plan	
	of the	for the Conservation of the Exceptional	
	nominated	Universal Value of the Tak' National	
	property, and	Archaeological Park alik Ab'aj) will be	
	make the	part of these instruments with a priority	
	connection	focus on OUV (sculptures and structures	
	between the	that are inventoried as stated in Additional	
	management	Documentation II, these are part of the	
	objectives and	general inventory for their investigation,	
	the proposed	conservation and protection). The	
	Outstanding	management of visitation, study of	
	Universal Value	carrying capacity and internal regulations	
	more explicit".	of the Park are found in the Management	
	more explicit.	Plan 2021-2025 pages. 45-51, Annex 9d.	
		This will also be updated.	
256,	"Ensure that	The State Party has had and has included	ICOMOS considers that this
recommendations	Heritage Impact	_	statement re-iterates
recommendations	Assessments are	in the management processes the concern	
	Assessments are	to guarantee the heritage impact	arguments/justification put
	included in		formand in the momination
	included in	assessment, complying with the	forward in the nomination
	management	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and	assessment, complying with the	
	management processes and are carried out	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum,	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum,	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e).	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement,	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation.	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the immediate surroundings of the Park, as	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the immediate surroundings of the Park, as required in paragraph 118bis of the	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the immediate surroundings of the Park, as	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the immediate surroundings of the Park, as required in paragraph 118bis of the	dossier that have been fully
	management processes and are carried out as a prerequisite for any development projects and activities that are planned for implementation on or around the nominated property, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for Implementation. of the World Heritage	assessment, complying with the prerequisite for any project. The beginning of this management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies Annex 9d and Action Plan Annex 9e, Strategic Objective 11, number 15 page. 80-81 Risk Plan 2021 p. 19, numeral 3.6 The evaluation of the heritage impact has been part of the efforts of the Park for the infrastructure and construction works of the El Caracol del Tiempo Museum, inside and outside the Park itself (see Management Plan Annex 9d, Management Plan Annex 9e). Through an inter-institutional agreement, the State Party undertakes to strengthen compliance with heritage and environmental impact assessments prior to development projects and economic activities with a priority focus in the immediate surroundings of the Park, as required in paragraph 118bis of the Operational Guidelines for the	dossier that have been fully

include local and indigenous communities in the decision-making processes for the nominated property". 56, Additional Recommendations 86				
and indigenous communities in the decision of making processes for the nominated property". 56, Additional Recommendations 56, Additional Recommendations 1 Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 1 Definition Measurable (Incompany) asserting the nominated property. 1 Definition Measurable (Incompany) asserting the conservation of all the attributes of the proposed post of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 1 Definition Measurable (Incompany) asserting the proposed, leading through a quarterly decording to the factors of affectation account of the "Nominated Property", through monthly monitoring in the dry season and bivesekly or weekly in the rainy season, which is the proposed property in the proposed property i	56,	"Further	The State Party (through the	ICOMOS considers that this
sommunities in the decision-making processes for the nominated property". 56, Additional Recommendations 80 "Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 81 "Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 82 "Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators have been developed conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 83 "Develop quantifiable follow-up indicators have been developed conservation of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". 84 "Port 1987 to 2023 (36 years of operation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE assets in general and bearers of the VUE monitoring. This includes the definition according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. 85 "Additional Property" that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. 85 "Additional Property" the updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 2022-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation factors in the remember of the properties of the	recommendations		1	
the decision- making processes for the nominated property". 56, Additional Recommendations **Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that tale into account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Poeting in the account of a the decision of the the account the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Datached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation between 0 – 1 cm — minor laccardions **Poeting in the account of a this that this t				
making processes for the nominated property". 56, Additional Recommendations **Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that affect the factors that affect the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that affect the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that affect the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that affect the proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation: End of the proposed Outstanding the proposed Outstanding the proposed Outstanding the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors that affect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. The updating of the tables of the conservat			l =	
processes for the nomperty". 56, Additional Recommendations **Develop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property. **In order to monitor the factors that affects the factors that affect the factors that affect the nominated property (inversal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". **In order to monitor the factors that affect the nominated proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". **In order to monitor the factors that affect the nominated proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation or according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of the health of the top to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of the word of the conservation of the proposed property, until the according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of the property of the definition of quantifiable follow-up to monitoring. This includes the definition of quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation of the development of the property. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of the development of the property. **The updating of the tables of the conservation of the development of the property. **Th			<u> </u>	stage.
inclusion of flocal and indigenous communities in decision-making processes for the nominated property. "Pevelop quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed property, quantifiable flow-up indicators have been developed according to the affectation factors that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to monitor the factors that affect proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to monitor the factors that affect proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to monitor the factors that affect proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to monitor the factors that affect proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that affect a quantifiable indicators (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9 frand 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of crosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations of the Takalik Abia National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the taken account of at this stage. S6, Additional Recommendations of the updating and v		_	_ = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = =	
Property". communities in decision-making processes for the nominated property. In order to monitor the factors that affect the proposed of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to monitor the factors that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to expect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to expect the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to expect the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In order to expect the proposed of the Wolfing of the State of Conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterfy form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 91 and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation between 0 – 1 cm = mimor lacerations 56, Additional Recommendations Potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Parry in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Wanagement Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and R		_		
Provelop In order to monitor the factors that affect the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed proposed proposed (Dustanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property." In order to reside the proposed property, quantifiable follow-up indicators have been developed according to the affectation factors that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property." In order to reside the nominated property. In order to reside the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property." In order to reside the nominated property. In order to reside the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property. In order to reside the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property. In order to reside the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that affect the proposed outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the factors that take of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors of the Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that t			_	
## Overlop quantifiable monitoring indicators that the measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ## Proposed Outstanding Universal Value, From 1987 to 2023 (36 years of operation of the "Nominated Property"), through monthly monitoring in the dry season and betweekly or weekly in the rainy season, the state of conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. ## Proposed Leading for the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Amnexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable ## COMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination of the view page and archiving facilities, the State of conservation of affects		property".	_	
Recommendations quantifiable monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. And that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". Property Property Property Property Property Property Property Property". Property Proper				
monitoring indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". Material Property and the tatled property affect the nominated property". Material Property and the tatled property affect the nominated property and the factors that affect the nominated property and the tatled property affect the nominated property and the factors that affect the nominated property and the factors that affect the nominated property and the factors that affect the nominated property and the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation of quantifiable follow—up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation approach, and approach and according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation Property (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation Frosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of crosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities. the State Party in the year 2023 minor lacerations and archiving facilities with the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCXN		"Develop	In order to monitor the factors that affect	ICOMOS considers that this
indicators that measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In the state of conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterly from, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation of the total conservation for the state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation for the same sure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation for the same sure is state of conservation for the same sure is the state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation for the same sure is the state of conservation for the state of conservation for the proposed. (ading through a quarterly forms, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention for quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Ecroation between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention for the mazer in the updating and validation of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvement	Recommendations	-		
measure the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ### Addressing the state of conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". ### Addressing the type of preventive intervention according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. ### The updating of the tables of the conservation of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 97 and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations. ### Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". ### Addressing the potential fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) ### The updating of the tables of the conservation of the Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) ### The updating and validation of the Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) ### The updating and validation of the Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		_	follow-up indicators have been developed	
the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". It is affect the nominated property". It is includes the indicators that affect the nominated property". It is affect the nominated property". It is includes the indicators that affect the nominated property". It is affect the nominated property". It is includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation-Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		indicators that	according to the affectation factors that	
conservation of all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property. Prom 1987 to 2023 (36 years of operation of the "Nominated Property"), through monthly monitoring in the dry season and biweekly or weekly in the rainy season, the state of conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation/factors (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 97 and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 156, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tal'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		measure the	measure the state of conservation of all	
all the attributes of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". **Proposed Leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators property". **In updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) all paready includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) **From 1987 to 2023 (36 years of operation of the hery season and the wine workseason and biomexity from the remined season, the state of conseason of the PVIE proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that lideators of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-239) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High definition of the potential fire the treat storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023,		state of	the attributes of the proposed Outstanding	considered.
of the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". Market in the property affect the nominated property". In the state of conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations Medium: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Talkalik Ab'aj National Anchaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		conservation of	Universal Value.	
Outstanding Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". In the state of conservation of the heritage assets in general and bearers of the VUE proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations ### Addressing the potential fire thazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities he State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		all the attributes	From 1987 to 2023 (36 years of operation	
Universal Value, and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". If the second property is includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation of quantifiable indicators (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations *Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'a) National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		of the proposed	of the "Nominated Property"), through	
and that take into account the factors that affect the nominated property". It is includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		Outstanding	monthly monitoring in the dry season and	
into account the factors that affect the nominated property". Proposed, leading through a quarterly form, specifically designed for periodic monitoring. This includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations		Universal Value,	biweekly or weekly in the rainy season,	
factors that affect the nominated property". property". property". property". property". property is state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities," and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		and that take	the state of conservation of the heritage	
affect the nominated property". In includes the indicators that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Parky to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		into account the	assets in general and bearers of the VUE	
mominated property". Hat allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		factors that	proposed, leading through a quarterly	
that allow a quantifiable follow-up to measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = innerdiate intervention Medium: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities.** In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		affect the	form, specifically designed for periodic	
measure its state of conservation according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		nominated	monitoring. This includes the indicators	
according to the factors of affectation and define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 156, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)		property".	that allow a quantifiable follow-up to	
define the type of preventive intervention required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations *Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			measure its state of conservation	
required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The updating of the tables of the conservation (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) The updating of the tables of the definition of quantificators (see attached in Annexes			according to the factors of affectation and	
required. The updating of the tables of the conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The updating of the tables of the conservation (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) The updating of the tables of the definition of quantificators (see attached in Annexes				
conservation reports (see Dossier pages 222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)				
222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)			The updating of the tables of the	
222-230) already includes the definition of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN)			conservation reports (see Dossier pages	
of quantifiable indicators (see attached in Annexes 9f and 9g of this document). Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations "Addressing the potential fire fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN				
Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN				
Definition Measurable Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			Annexes 9f and 9g of this document).	
High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations The commendations *Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.				
erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". Park to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			Conservation/Erosion Status Indicators	
erosion = immediate intervention Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations **Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". Park to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			High: deterioration between 5 – 8 cm of	
of erosion = intermediate intervention Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN				
Low: deterioration between 0 – 1 cm = minor lacerations 56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities," the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			Medium: deterioration between 2 – 4 cm	
56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". Hacklities". "Addressing the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) December 2021, DGPCYN Decembe			of erosion = intermediate intervention	
56, Additional Recommendations "Addressing the potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities". In order to reduce the potential danger of fire in the current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			Low: deterioration between $0 - 1$ cm =	
Recommendations potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			minor lacerations	
Recommendations potential fire hazard in current storage and archiving facilities, the State Party in the year 2023 undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN) correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	56, Additional	"Addressing the	In order to reduce the potential danger of	ICOMOS considers that this
current storage and archiving facilities". undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN	Recommendations		_ =	
current storage and archiving facilities". undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		•		
the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		current storage	_ = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = =	
Park) to include improvements or changes in the updating and validation of the Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		and archiving	<u> </u>	stage.
Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN		facilities".	Park) to include improvements or changes	
Management Plan (2021-2025, DGPCYN Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			1 -	
Administrative Resolution 251-2023, annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN			1 -	
annex 9m) and Risk Management Plan (December 2021, DGPCYN				
Administrative Resolution 236-2023			(December 2021, DGPCYN	
raministati v rosolation 250 2025,			Administrative Resolution 236-2023,	

amex 9). Actions and recommendations to reduce the threat of fires are contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025 in the Chapter: Description of Identified Risks refers to the source risk of conatus and its proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136); Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 94, 9e and 9h. In order to minimize the frigility of the budget, the State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'a) Manional Archaeological Park), to minimize expersive to minimize expensive to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendation		T	I	T
the threat of fires are contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025 in the Chapter: Description of Identified Risks refers to the source risk of conatus and its proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136); Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. In order to minimize the fragility of the budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". In order to minimize the fragility of the budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". Park. This management plan (Page 29) Amex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". Park. This management plan (Page 79) Amex 9d. Currently, the non-governmental organization of the population. Currently, the non-government to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hirring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. Texture is the valuation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to make a decided profit of the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and a cover of the protected ele			,	
Management Plan 2021-2025 in the Chapter: Description of Identified Risks refers to the source risk of conatus and its proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136); Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green O Seal of NGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. 256, Additional Recommendations "Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize expensure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". In order to minimize the fragility and limited implementation capacity". Park				
Chapter: Description of Identified Risks refers to the source risk of conatus and its proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136), Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16, Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. 256, Additional Recommendations accounting accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations 257, This includes the contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Pages 79) Amex 9d. 258, Additional Recommendation of the population of Aritisans of Tak'alik Aba'j and "Association of Aritisans			±	
refers to the source risk of conatus and its proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136); Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. 256, Additional Recommendations exposure to budget fragility and limited emperation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations 257, This includes the commitment to implement the sparticipation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations 257, This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of Gindes of Tak'alik Ab'aj'. This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of Gindes of Tak'alik Ab'aj' and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj' and "Association of Gindes of Tak'alik Ab'aj'			_	
proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135 and 136), Risk Management Plan, Page 25, Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. 256, Additional Recommendations **Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize experise to budget, the State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik and limited implementation capacity". **Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. **Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. **Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population.** **This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hirring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the covers used in the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommenda			Chapter: Description of Identified Risks	
and 136). Risk Management Plan, Page 25. Threat 16. Fires; Practical Evaluation Test, Green Q Seal of INGUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 5.20 Annexes 94, 9e and 9h. 256, Additional Recommendations apacity". **Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". **Toninagement lallows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Inakalik Abaj National Archaeological Park) to Cuentadancia, to promote independent management hat allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Inakalik Abaj National Archaeological Park and the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations **Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **Continue exploring the creation of Anone-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **Continue exploring the creation of Anone-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". **Toninagement Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. **Continue exploring the creation of Anone-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Takalik Abaj and Anone-governmental organizations). "Association of Guides of Takalik Abaj and "Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Takalik Abaj and actors to strengthen the participation of the Population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Takalik Abaj and actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the T			refers to the source risk of conatus and its	
256, Additional Recommendations **Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational imited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational imited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to terretion of a to strengthen the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population of the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 256, Additional Recommendations **Terview in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 257 Threat I 6. Fires; Practical Fixed party in forted the budget of the budget fragility and finistration of the fixed party to the transplant and the monimization to the population of the population of the population. **Todational organization organizatio			proposal to solve the problem (Pages 135	
256, Additional Recommendations **Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational imited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational imited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to terretion of a to strengthen the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations **Todational organization to the participation of the population of the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 256, Additional Recommendations **Terview in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 257 Threat I 6. Fires; Practical Fixed party in forted the budget of the budget fragility and finistration of the fixed party to the transplant and the monimization to the population of the population of the population. **Todational organization organizatio			and 136); Risk Management Plan, Page	
Test, Green Q Seal of INCUAT, of the Occupational Safety Axis in Criterion 5, numerals 5.19 and 52.00 Annexes 9d, 9e and 9h. In order to minimize the fragility of the budget, the State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". This management that allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park to management that allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park. This management that allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park. This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. Currently, the non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Citides of Tak alik Ab'aj and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the protected elements to eases their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the rotected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manace and palm in ranches that have information that cannot be freedived heritage inside and outside the brotected he				
256, Additional Recommendations independent accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Reco				
#Establish independent accounting expertise to minimize the fragility of the budget, the State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to facilitate the creation of its own Cuentadancia, to promote independent management that allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. ### Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. ### Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. ### Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. ### Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization for the population. ### Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization for the population. ### Continue exploring the creation of an non-governmental organization of the population. #### Continue exploring the creation of an non-governmental organization of the population. #### Continue exploring the creation of an non-governmental organization of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Crudes of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Crudes of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of				
Secommendations Secommenda				
Recommendations Independent accounting Surgerities to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". Abaj National Archaeological Park) to facilitate the creation of its own Cuentadancia, to promote independent management that allows an agile and efficient execution from the budget of the implementation capacity". Park. This management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective II, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. Currently, the non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj national Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of an "Recommendations" The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to inspend the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj national Archaeological Park, confirm the tomination dossier that this statement re-iterat			-	
Recommendations independent accounting experitse to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations exploring the population of the population of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations of the population of the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations of the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Review in situ the manufaction of the population Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Review in situ the recation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the population Recommendation and the participation of the populat	256, Additional	"Establish	In order to minimize the fragility of the	ICOMOS considers that this
accounting expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a monogovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj (and instruction of Tak'alik Ab'aj) and maca and palm in ranches that have been fully considered. "Continue exploring the creation of a monogovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj) and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj (and the participation of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj) and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of T	I .		= -	
expertise to minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional recommendations 259, Additional recommendations 250, Additional recommendations 250, Additional recommendations 250, Additional recommendations 251, Additional recommendations 252, Additional recommendations 253, Additional recommendations 254, Additional recommendations 255, Additional recommendations 256, Additional recommendations 257, Additional recommendations 258, Additional recommendations 259, Additional recommendations 250, Additional		_	· ·	
minimize exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Cobjective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology program with the hiring of the covers used in the protected elements to discovery the		_	-	
exposure to budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations 8 "Continue exploring the creation of a nongovernmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". 1256, Additional Recommendations 1257, Additional Recommendations 1258, Additional Recommendations 1259, Additional Recommendations 1250, Additional Recommendations 1250		-		dossier that have been fully
budget fragility and limited implementation capacity". 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations Recommendations Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations Recommendations Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations Recommendations Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 250, Additional Recommendations 251, Additional Recommendations 252, Additional Recommendations 253, Additional Recommendations 254, Additional Recommendations 255, Additional Recommendations 256, Additional Recommendations 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. 257, Additional Recommendations 258, Additional Recommendations 259, Additional Recommendations 260, Additional Recommendations 270, Additional Recommendations 271, This includ				
and limited implementation capacity". Capacity		-		
implementation capacity". Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park. This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-non-non-non-non-non-non-non-non-non				
capacity". Park. This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hirring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". "The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact in an and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the protected heritage inside and outside the stage.				
This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Talk'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of Animal Program with the hirring of a local anthropology program with the barticipation of the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". This management is contemplated in the Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. Currently, the non-governmental organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the Talk'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Talk'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hirring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Talk'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have em fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new to reputation. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Talk'alik Ab'aj and "Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengt		-		
Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non- governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the rocovering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". Management Plan 2021-2025, Chapter 8 Strategies and Action Plan, Strategie Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. Currently, the non-governmental organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association of (Coused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, to nofirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the		capacity.		
Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. 256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj') National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj''. This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the Fectiveness and visual impact "For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of and visual impact". Strategies and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 11, number 3 (Page 79) Annex 9d. ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this correction of actival his correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.				
256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". Tobate Party undertakes (through the participation of the Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of the population. The evaluation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and the solutions for covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the stage.				
256, Additional Recommendations "Continue exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Fak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Fak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Fak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of and visual of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of and visual impact". TCOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.				
256, Additional Recommendations Review in fix alik Cultural Archaeological Association (Ocucal actors to strengthen the participation of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm the participation of the population. Recommendations Recommendations Review in situ steen control be taken account			, ,	
Recommendations creation of a non- governmental organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". The evaluation of the effectiveness and of elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". The evaluation of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	256 4 110 1	"C 4:		ICOMOS 11 4 41
creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". The evaluation of the effectiveness and of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. Information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	1 756 Additional			
is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organization of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj (National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the epopulation. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj (National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of administration of on-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of the Editarial facilitating the creation of the teoministent to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology program with t				
actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab al'aj and "Association of the implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab al'aj and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the effectiveness and the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the effectiveness and the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the population. The Etatratack, storugh the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the Tak'alik Ab'aj and "Association of the commitment to implement the social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropology an		exploring the	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural	correction contains new
organization to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact "To 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact".		exploring the creation of a	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n)	correction contains new information that cannot be
strengthen the participation of the population". The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the		exploring the creation of a non-	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
participation of the population". National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the Incommendation to the population of the protected to considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
the population". National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population.	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". for 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj Tak'alik Ab'aj" The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
"Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non-	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hirring of a local anthropology. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. 256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". Proview in situ the evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
256, Additional Recommendations "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". "Review in situ the evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
Recommendations the solutions for covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have impact". statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.		exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
covering the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population".	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population.	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population".	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and	correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this
elements to assess their effectiveness and visual impact". that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the	information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates
assess their effectiveness and visual impact". diat die hiost recommendation is die paint of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj	information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put
effectiveness and visual impact". For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the material. new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm	information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination
and visual impact". For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the be taken account of at this stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of non- governmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
impact". manaca and palm in ranches that have protected heritage inside and outside the stage.	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material.	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains
impact". protected heritage inside and outside the	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the population. The evaluation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material.	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot
Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this
	Recommendations 256, Additional	exploring the creation of a non-governmental organization to strengthen the participation of the population". "Review in situ the solutions for covering the protected elements to assess their effectiveness and visual	organization "Ab aj Tak alik Cultural Archaeological Association" (Annex 9n) is being reactivated, focused on local actors to strengthen the participation of the population. The State Party undertakes (through the administration of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park) to continue facilitating the creation of nongovernmental organizations, "Association of Guides of Tak'alik Ab'aj" and "Association of Artisans of Tak'alik Ab'aj". This includes the commitment to implement the Social Anthropology program with the hiring of a local anthropologist to strengthen the participation of the effectiveness and visual impact of the covers used in the protected elements of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National Archaeological Park, confirm that the most recommendable is the palm of recycled synthetic material. For 32 years (1987 to 2019) the use of manaca and palm in ranches that have	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this

		Park has required frequent renewals	
		(estimated life time of three and two years	
		respectively) Given the necessary	
		policies for the protection and	
		conservation of the mangroves, from	
		where these materials are extracted, as of	
		2019, the alternative of using recycled	
		synthetic material palm imitation was	
		sought. These covers, apart from having a	
		longer duration, with an average useful	
		life of twenty years, and the potential to	
		replace natural materials, offer a low	
		visual and environmental impact, see	
		image Annex 9i	
		This is also reflected in the Management	
		Plan 2021 – 2025, Chapter 8 Strategies	
		and Action Plan, Strategic Objective 8,	
		number 2 page. 70 Annex 9d.	
256, Additional	"Improve	Since its inception in 1987, security	ICOMOS considers that this
Recommendations	security	measures around open excavations have	statement contains new
	measures	been part of the occupational safety	information that cannot be
	around open	protocols of the Tak'alik Ab'aj National	taken account of at this
	excavations".	Archaeological Park. As of 2017, with the	stage and re-iterates arguments/justification put
		beginning of the implementation	forward in the nomination
		processes of the Sustainable Quality Seal,	dossier that have been fully
		protective bamboo fences were	considered.
		implemented, see image Annex 9j. At the	
		same time, there is the Manual of	
		Conduct Standards and	
		Recommendations for the visitor	
		(Management Plan 2021 – 2025, page	
		107 Annex 9d) in which the visitor is	
		warned to walk only on the sidewalks	
		authorized for public use.	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Iran (Islamic Republic of)

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: The Persian Caravanserai

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
P. 69, Left Column, Lines: 20-42	This caravanserai underwent considerable changes in the late 1950s and early 1966, when it was transformed into an hotel.	This caravanserai underwent moderate changes in the late 1950s which ended in 1966 early 1960, when it was transformed into a hotel. State Party's further explanations: These changes were carried out prior to the adoption of the Venice Charter and based on the National Law of Antiquities	Regarding the proposed correction 'moderate', ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. ICOMOS notes that on page 640 of the nomination dossier, it is stated that "During the construction, they tried to rehabilitate the remnants of the [Mādar Shāh] caravanserai and create a building similar to the architecture of the Safavid era". Regarding the proposed correction '1960', ICOMOS considers that the inclusion of this date would sound confusing immediately after the date of 1966. Regarding the proposed correction 'a hotel', ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
P. 69, Left Column, Lines: 42-44	The nomination dossier acknowledges that the interventions attempted to create a building similar to the architecture of the Safavid era.	The nomination dossier acknowledges that the interventions attempted to create two extra floors on one wing similar to the architecture of the Safavid era. (See Nomination Report, p. 278, arial photo/ p. 281, Photo)	ICOMOS acknowledges the clarification. However, it notes that the term used (i.e., building) is exactly what is stated on page 640 of the nomination dossier: "During the construction, they tried to rehabilitate the remnants of the caravanserai and create a building similar to the architecture of the Safavid era."

D (0 7 6	Od	Od-	ICOMOS
P. 69, Left Column,	Other	Other caravanserais that were listed	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of
Lines: 51-56	caravanserais that	up until the 1970s such as Miāndasht	opinion.
Lines. 21 20	were listed up until	(1957) – went through early a few	opinion.
	the 1970s – such as	restorations and partial reconstructions	
	Ganjali Khān	involving the use of cement, reinforced	
	(1937), Mahyār	concrete and white-washing of walls	
	(1942), Gaz (1951) and Miāndasht	and ceilings.	
	(1957) – went		
	through early		
	heavy-handed		
	restorations and		
	partial		
	reconstructions		
	involving the use of		
	cement, reinforced		
	concrete and white-		
	washing of walls		
	and ceilings.		
P. 69, Right Column,	ICOMOS	ICOMOS considers that the state of	ICOMOS considers this
Lines: 23-26	considers that the	conservation for most component parts	proposed correction to be an
Lines. 25-20	state of conservation	is acceptable except for a few	editorial addition, which
	for most component	component parts. These are: Titi, Khoy, Sāeen and Chameshk. The said	modifies the meaning of the
	parts is acceptable except for a few		sentence.
	_	components are almost intact and their conservation plans are under	Regarding the proposed wording 'The said
	component parts. These are: Titi,	study. An urgent conservation	components are almost intact',
	Khoy, Sāeen and	operation is in place for Khoy.	ICOMOS notes that, based on
	Chameshk.	operation is in place for ixing.	paragraph 88 of the
	Chamesin.		Operational Guidelines,
			integrity is a measure of the
			wholeness and intactness
			which requires assessing the
			extent to which the property
			suffers from adverse effects of
			development and/or neglect.
			Based on the observations of
			the technical evaluation
			mission and the photos
			included on pages 408, 411,
			416, 690, 698, 770, 771 of the
			nomination dossier, ICOMOS
			considers that the required
			conditions of integrity have
			not been demonstrated at this
			stage.
			Regarding Khoy, ICOMOS
			notes that its evaluation on
			page 69 states that 'During the
			period of the mission, Khoy
			was undergoing conservation
			works'.

P. 70, Left	Bastak is used as an	Bastak is used as a hotel and café-	Regarding the proposed
Column, Lines: 15-17	hotel and café-	restaurant by a private investor. Some of	correction 'a hotel', ICOMOS
	restaurant by a private investor.	the temporary additions which were not well adapted to the architectural	acknowledges this typing error. Regarding the situation at
	Some of the	design of the building have later been	present, ICOMOS position is
	interventions are not	removed.	based on the observations of its
	well adapted to the		technical evaluation mission.
	architectural design		Regarding past situations,
	of the building.		ICOMOS
			considers that this correction
			contains new information that cannot be verified at this stage.
			ICOMOS notes that the
			information included on page
			692 of the nomination dossier,
			related to past interventions in
			this component part, does not
			reflect the additions now
P. 71, Left	ICOMOS notes that	State Party's further explanations:	suggested by the State Party. ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	the nomination	Moreover, the proposed 56	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 4-8	dossier and the	caravanserais represent the	arguments/ justification put
	additional	developmental trend and evolution of a	forward in the nomination
	information	type of architecture. In addition, these	dossier that have been fully
	provided include	caravanserais as a whole represent the	considered.
	many written and	intangible cultural heritage in inside and	
	graphical references to the historical	outside the city caravanserais which were transmitted through the exchange	
	routes to which the	of experiences, ideas and skills among	
	caravanserais were	scientists, elites, merchants, artists,	
	linked – namely the	artisans, etc. (See Interim Report, pp. 4-	
	Silk Roads, the	5)	
	Spice Roads, the		
	Khorasan Road, and		
P. 71, Left	the Royal Road. Moreover, this	Moreover, this network was not the	ICOMOS considers this
Column,	network was not the	same across the timeframe of almost	proposed correction to be an
Lines: 58	same across the	two millennia associated with the series	editorial change, which modifies
P. 71, Right Column,	timeframe of almost	presented but some of them have been	the meaning of the sentence.
Lines: 1-2	two millennia	developed through several time	
	associated with the	periods.	
	series presented but varied over time.		
P. 71, Right	ICOMOS considers	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	that what needed	The State Party has tried to provide the	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 3-5	to be clearly	required explanations through the	arguments/ justification put
	explained is how the	Additional Information (See Additional	forward in the nomination
	fifty-six component	Information, pp. 2-20) and in the Interim	dossier that have been fully
	parts, which are part	Report (pp. 2-5) where the justifications	considered.
	of the nominated	are made for the connection of the fifty- six component parts with each other	
	property, are connected.	making a whole out of their link.	
	Tomicotou.	maning a whole out of their mik.	

			<u> </u>
P. 72, Left Column, Lines: 3-5	ICOMOS considers that the reasons why the State Party chose to limit the comparative analysis to only five countries are insufficiently justified.	Moreover, the following indicators constitute the totality of the link between the fifty-six component parts not merely the architecture: exchange of experiences, ideas and skills among scientists, elites, merchants, artists, artisans, etc. (See Nomination Report, pp. 515-516/ Interim Report, pp. 4-5) State Party's further explanations: The State Party focused on the five caravanserais in five countries around Iran because firstly, they are in good conservation state and secondly, they are closely linked with the Persian caravanserais, thirdly they still stand and did not lose their functionality.	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
P. 72, Left Column, Lines: 5-10	ICOMOS also considers that some of the conclusions presented by the State Party are related to quantitative measures (i.e., number of caravanserais or number of routes) rather than the combination of values and attributes expressed by the nominated property.	State Party's further explanations: Although some of the conclusions presented by the State Party are related to quantitative measures (i.e., number of caravanserais or number of routes) (four parameters) but there exist 12 qualitative parameters by which the values and attributes were expressed. (See Nomination Report, p. 580)	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
P. 72, Left Column, Lines: 14-18	The comparative analysis also fails to explain how the Persian Caravanserai presents distinctive features or characteristics that are specific to Iran, to be considered as a separate typology that does not exist in the wider geocultural area.	State Party's further explanations: The State Party through the comparative analysis tried to explain that the origin of caravanserai dates back to the Achaemenids in the Iranian Central Plateau and caravanserais which have been built throughout the world were the continuation of a Persian ingenuity in architecture. (See Nomination Report, pp. 90-94, 185-188 & etc.)	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
P. 72, Left Column, Lines: 46-48	The State Party replied that certain caravanserais included in the 'description' section	State Party's further explanations: The State Party tried to provide a method for nominating the component parts which has been explained in the Nomination Report (p. 580). In addition	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination

	were not selected	to the sixteen parameters for	dossier that have been fully
	because they do not	to the sixteen parameters for comparison study, the following	considered.
	meet the selection	subjects were of paramount importance	considered.
	criteria established	for the selection of the component parts:	
	or because their condition is not	1. Historical continuity (See Nomination	
		Report, p. 586)	
	stable enough.	2. Evaluation of architecture (See	
		Nomination Report, p. 588)	
		3. They represent the superior	
		architectural pattern for each certain	
		historical period; (See Nomination	
		Report, p. 590)	
		4. They bear a witness to the ancient and	
		pilgrim interconnected roads; (See	
		Additional Information, p. 4)	
		5. They represent the adoptability of	
		architectural patterns of caravanserais	
		to their setting and climate; (See	
		Nomination Report, p. 594)	
		More detailed information has been	
		provided in the Additional Information,	
		pp. 2-14 and the Interim Report pp. 4-5	
		& 7-9.	
		It should be mentioned that the	
		nomination of the component parts are	
		compatible with recommendations of	
		the Ittingen Expert Meeting (held in	
		Switzerland in 2010).	
P. 72, Left	ICOMOS notes that	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column, Lines: 57-58	some of the	Some of the nominated caravanserais	reflects a difference of opinion;
Continued to	caravanserais	have been partly reconstructed through	and that the explanations re-
the Right	selected have been	employing traditional materials and	iterate arguments/ justification
column,	heavily	workmanship while respecting original	put forward in the nomination
Lines: 1-2	reconstructed in the	design and form based on the demand of	dossier and additional
	past, as shown in the	time (See Nomination Report pp. 604-	information provided that have
	photos included in	692). Exceptionally, Yām has been	been fully considered.
	the nomination	reconstructed based on the architectural	
	dossier and the	remains (See Nomination Report pp.	
	additional	674), historical photos (See Interim	
	information	Report, p. 12) through employing	
	submitted in	traditional knowledge, materials and	
	February 2022.	workmanship while respecting original	
		form and design (See Interim Report, pp. 11-20).	
P. 72, Right	The additional	The Interim Report then states that 250	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	information then	caravanserais in one historical period	proposed correction contains
Lines: 15-18	states that 250	were identified specifically related to	new information that cannot be
	caravanserais in one	the Qajar period.	taken account of at this stage.
	historical period		and account of at this stage.
	were identified	State Party's further explanations:	The ICOMOS sentence is based
	without specifying	Zanc z ar cy o rur ener capitaliations.	on the additional information
	which historical		received from the State Party on
	,, motorical		10001.00 Hom the battle I arry on

	period was	It should be mentioned that the Central	28 February 2022: on page 8, it
	referred to.	Archive in the IMCHTH hosts all	is stated that "For instance, we
	referred to.	relevant categorized data.	have identified a number of two-
		Televant entegorized data.	hundred-and-fifty caravanserais
			in one historical period and all of
			them enjoy the same
			architectural style and design
			and are thus classified into a
			single architectural design group
			drawing on their many
			commonalities and the twelve
			criteria and provisions for
			selection already referred to
			previously."
P. 72, Right	However, it could be	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column, Lines: 26-28	expected to know	The data concerning the above-	contains new information that
Lines. 20-20	out of those 500	mentioned 500 caravanserais is	cannot be taken account of at this
	caravanserais, how	available in the National Cultural	stage.
	many belong to each historical period	Heritage List in which the time period of each and single caravanserai are	
	considered.	clarified.	
P. 72, Right	There is also no	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	information why,	There existed a large number of	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 31-35	out of those few,	caravanserais in Sassanid period of	arguments/ justification put
	only two were	which only four caravanserais are	forward in the nomination
	included in the	known. Only two out of the four known	dossier that have been fully
	series or why those	caravanserais still stand and enjoy the	considered.
	two are the most	requirements of the OUVs.	
	representative, in the	(See Nomination file, p. 159)	
	absence of		
	information about		
	the other		
D 72 D: 14	caravanserais.		1001/00
P. 72, Right Column,	ICOMOS therefore	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Lines: 37-39	concludes that the selection of the	The State Party believes that the justification regarding selection process	explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put
	component parts	of the component parts is adequately	forward in the nomination
	does not appear	explained and elaborated in the	dossier and additional
	adequately	Nomination Report, the Additional	information provided that have
	elaborated and	Information and the Interim Report.	been fully considered; and
	justified at this	Moreover, the components were	contain advocacy for the
	stage, despite the	selected based on the following criteria:	proposals made in the
	additional	(1) interconnectivity of the major roads;	nomination dossier.
	information	(2) the viability and visibility of the	
	provided.	intangible cultural heritage; (3) Creation	
		and development of the prototype of	
		caravanserais in the Achaemenid	
		period; and (4) These 56 caravanserais,	
		together, showcase the evolution and	
		network of caravanserais in Iran, in	
		different historical stages.	

	T	[
		(See, Nomination Report, p. 586, 588,	
		590, 594/ Additional Information, pp. 2-	
		14/ the Interim Report pp. 4-5 & 7-9)	
P. 73, left	ICOMOS noted that	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	the justification	The State Party's rationale is the	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 20-23	offered by the State	developmental trend and evolution of	arguments/ justification put
	Party relates to	the concept of caravanserai as an	forward in the nomination
	caravanserais in	architectural, technological, and cultural	dossier that have been fully
	general and is not	process throughout the Iranian history.	considered.
	specific to the	Indeed, later development of	
	caravanserais	caravanserais in other territories proved	
	included in the	an important interchange of human	
	nominated property.	skills, traditional knowledge and values,	
		over a span of two millennia which	
		could be best shown in the components	
		of the nominated property. (See	
		Nomination Report, pp. 515 & 516)	
P. 73, Right	ICOMOS considers	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	that the justification	The State Party tried to present two	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 22-26	provided in the	complementary facts:	arguments/ justification put
	additional	1. Caravansaries functioned as an	forward in the nomination
	information differs	infrastructure to facilitate the	dossier that have been fully
	to a certain degree	travelers especially the elites,	considered.
	from that included in	authors, historians, painters,	
	the nomination	engineers, physicians, musicians,	
	dossier; whereas the	men of religion and literature who	
	latter	played an important role in the	
	emphasises a	transmission of ideas, skills,	
	tradition associated	sciences, thoughts, art, trade and	
	with long journeys	even religious beliefs and teachings	
	and the network of	and etc.;	
	caravanserais along	2. The very important tradition of	
	the travel routes, the	VAGHF (endowment) which serves	
	former focuses on	as a social mechanism for	
	the construction of	construction, conservation,	
	caravanserais per se.	restoration, revitalization, and maintenance of.	
		(See Nomination Report, pp. 515 &	
		516/ Addition Information pp. 17-	
		20)	
		State Party's further explanations:	
P. 74, Left	ICOMOS considers	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	that the information	The State Party believes that sufficient	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 1-7	and documentation	justification is made for the creation,	arguments/ justification put
	provided in the	continuity and development of	forward in the nomination
	nomination dossier	caravanserai through its statements in	dossier that have been fully
	did not clearly	the Nomination Report and Additional	considered.
	illustrate in what	Information. The oldest types of the	
	ways the	caravanserais can only be found in Iran	
	caravanserais of Iran	which was later dispersed throughout	
	significantly differ	the world.	
	from other		
<u> </u>	1	<u> </u>	<u>I</u>

		L (G . X	
	caravanserais	(See, Nomination Report pp, 154-160,	
	situated in other	185, & 597 / Additional Information, pp.	
	countries, which	13 & 15)	
	flourished in relation		
	to terrestrial		
	commercial and		
	cultural routes		
	between the East		
	and the West.		
p. 74, Left	that is, what	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column, Lines: 16-19	architectural,	The State Party believes the focus of the	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 10-19	artistic or	nomination file was simply a	arguments/ justification put
	construction	presentation of a type of building from	forward in the nomination
	specificities make it	its conception in the Achaemenid period	dossier that have been fully
	recognizable as a	to maturity in the Safavid and Qajar	considered.
	different type of	eras. The caravanserais in other	
	building when	countries have later been developed and	
	compared to other	inspired by the Persian caravanserais.	
	caravanserais in	(See Nomination Report, pp. 90-93,	
	other countries.	155-159, 185-187, 587-589)	
p. 75, left	there are problems	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
column,	of physical integrity	It should be noted that there were no	reflects a difference of opinion.
Lines: 21-23	in three component	interventions in Tāj Ābād except that a	
	parts: Tāj Ābād,	small structure which was attached to	
	Chameshk and	the caravanserai some decades ago,	
	Yengeh Emām.	before its national inscription. However,	
		that part was obtained by the	
		government for removal.	
		Chameshk is fully intact except for	
		some minor parts which were only	
		stabilized.	
		Yengeh Emām is selected and supported	
		by UNESCO as one of the caravanserais	
		along the Silk Road is currently under	
		restoration.	
P. 75, left	Some examples	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS acknowledges this
Column,	include: the	The fuel tank and the communication	clarification which does not
Lines: 37-43	construction of a	towers have been temporary installed	modify the meaning of the
	highway tunnel	which will be dislocated according to	sentence.
	close to the Khoy	the management plan.	
	caravanserai; the	(See Management Plan, pp. 96 & 97)	
	existence of modern		
	structures around		
	Borāzjān, and Jamāl		
	Ābād; the presence		
	of a fuel tank in		
	close proximity to		
	Maranjāb; and the		
	presence of		
	communication		
	towers at		
i	Zeynoddīn;		

P. 75, Left Column, Lines: 49-51	Sarāyān; Rashti; Neyestānak; Meybod; Maranjāb; and Deh Mohammad. ICOMOS noted that the boundaries of each component part are drawn to include the area of the footprint of the caravanserai only.	State Party's further explanations: The structures such the water reservoirs and other similar facilities which were created concurrent to the caravanserais have been considered as parts of the property. (See Additional Information, pp. 21-23)	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered. ICOMOS notes that the sentence mentioned by the State Party must be read in conjunction with the following sentence to understand its rationale: "ICOMOS noted that the boundaries of each component
			part are drawn to include the area of the footprint of the caravanserai only. Therefore, in its request for additional information sent in September 2021, ICOMOS asked the State Party to clarify the reasons as to why the immediate setting and important related elements were not included within the boundaries of the component parts."
P. 75, Right Column, Lines: 9-12	For instance, the historic bridge constructed over a valley flood plain that connects the road to the entrance of the Īzadkhāst caravanserai.	State Party's further explanations: The said bridge is related to the road between Esfahan and Fars which is part of the national road network.	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
P. 75, Right Column, Lines: 35-36	These relationships must also be reflected in the boundaries of the component parts.	These relationships were indeed reflected in the boundaries of the component parts. For Example, Sa'ad al-Saltaneh in Qazvin shows the said relationships. (See Nomination Report, Arial photo with boundaries, p. 86)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion and contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P. 76, Left Column, Lines: 22-25	Among these, many have been adapted, or are being adapted, to a modern version of their original use and function, and have different	Among these, many have been adapted, or are being adapted, to a modern version of their original use and function, and have minor degrees of alterations made to their form and design for Adaptive reuses. State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion and re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

	Ι.		
	degrees of	The only exception is Mādar Shāh in	
	alterations made to	which only one wing has had major	
	their form and	alternations which dates back to the	
	design.	1950, i.e., before the advent of the Venice Charter, and based on the guide	
		1.s offered by the Athens Charter for	
		Restoration and the National Law of	
		Antiquities. (See Nomination Report, p.	
		278, arial photo)	
P. 76, Right	It added that only the	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column,	Yām caravanserai	As the Yām caravanserai is comprised	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 14-22	was reconstructed	of an exceptional pattern of "garden-	arguments/ justification put
	based on	caravanserai" in Iran, it was	forward in the nomination
	archaeological	reconstructed according to the para. 86	dossier that have been fully
	excavations and	of the Operational Guidelines of the	considered.
	historical	1972 Convention. As the historical	
	photographs, some	photos show in the Interim Report (pp.	
	of which were	12-20), some parts of the caravanserai	
		_	
	included in the additional	were remained. Accordingly, the reconstruction was carried out based on	
	information	existing historical documents, with	
	provided. As noted	traditional materials and workmanship,	
	in its Interim Report,	respecting the original plan and	
	ICOMOS recalls	according to the spirit of the Nara	
	that, based on	Document.	
	paragraph 86 of the	As the Yām caravanserai was located on	
	Operational	a busy historical roads, the IMCHTH	
	Guidelines for the	preferred to revitalize this caravanserai	
	Implementation of	as a regional cultural identity which a	
	the World Heritage	modern on-road facility fails to present.	
	Convention, the		
	reconstruction of		
	archaeological		
	remains or historic		
	buildings or districts		
	is justifiable only in		
	exceptional		
	circumstances.		
P. 77, Left	ICOMOS also	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	considers that the	As explained earlier, The temporary	reflects a difference of opinion
Lines: 7-11	conditions of	additions to the Bastak were already	and re-iterates arguments/
	authenticity of the	removed.	justification put forward in the
	caravanserai of	The alternations (only in one wing) in	nomination dossier that have
	Yām, which has	Madar Shāh were carried before the	been fully considered.
	been significantly	advent of the Venice Charter and based	-
	reconstructed, and	on the National Law of Antiquities.	
	of the caravanserais	The State Party believes that the	
	of Bastak and Mādar	reconstruction of Yām was according to	
	Shāh, which have	the Nara Document on Authenticity.	
	undergone	and I take Document on I takenticity.	
	considerable		
	alterations to their		
	anciations to men		

	architectural		
D 55 1 0	designs, are not met.		700.100
P. 77, Left	ICOMOS considers	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column, Lines: 26-31	that at present, the	The State Party is of the opinion that the	reflects a difference of opinion
Lines. 20-31	way the boundaries	rationale employed in this nomination	and
	are drawn presents	dossier is similar to the other serial	contains advocacy for the
	the caravanserais	nominations such as the Persian Garden	proposals made in the
	mainly as isolated	and the Persian Qanat (World Heritage	nomination dossier.
	architectural objects.	Sites).	
	ICOMOS considers	The said rationale includes that all	
	that the locations	immediate and necessary elements	
	and settings of the	attached to the caravanserais have been	
	caravanserais are	included in the property. The same	
	integral parts of their	rationale was employed for the Persian	
	identity and must be	Garden and the Persian Qanat serial	
	included within the	nomination dossiers.	
	boundaries of the	(See Additional Information, pp. 21-23)	
	component parts.		
P. 77, Left	This aspect of the	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	caravanserais is	The Persian Caravanserai Research	correction contains new
Lines: 38-43	insufficiently	Base is working on a specific	information that cannot be taken
	developed in the	management plan for the environmental	account of at this stage.
	nomination dossier.	dynamics of the caravanserais and as a	
	The technical	pilot project, the water resources close to	
	strategies for	the Miāndasht Caravanserai were	
	obtaining and	revitalized while respecting the	
	distributing water	surrounding wild life.	
	allow better	surrounding wild life.	
	understanding of the		
	environmental		
	dynamics that		
	shaped the design		
	and location of the		
	caravanserais on a		
	landscape scale.		
P. 77, Right	ICOMOS considers	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	that, beyond the	The State Party believe that the	reflects a difference of opinion
Lines: 3-7	explanation that the	justification regarding selection process	and re-iterates arguments/
	caravanserais were	of the component parts is adequately	justification put forward in the
	associated with	explained and elaborated in the	nomination dossier that have
	historical routes, the	nomination file and the Additional	been fully considered.
	clear links between	Information. Moreover, the components	been fully considered.
	the fifty-six	were selected based on the following	
	-	criteria:	
	component parts that form the		
		(1) Interconnectivity of the major roads;	
	nominated property	(2) The viability and visibility of the	
	have not been	intangible cultural heritage;	
	sufficiently and	(3) Creation and development of the	
	comprehensibly	prototype of caravanserais in the	
	justified beyond	Achaemenid period;	
	their typology	(4) These 56 caravanserais, together,	
		showcase the evolution and network of	

		caravanserais in Iran, in different	
		historical stages.	
		(See, Nomination Report, p. 586, 588,	
		590, 594/ Additional Information, pp. 2-	
		14/ the Interim Report pp. 4-5 & 7-9)	
P. 81, Left	For example, whilst	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	-	· -	
Lines: 11-15	the State Party	Considerable reconstruction can only be	reflects a difference of opinion.
Lines. 11-13	explained that	observed in two caravanserais: Yām and	
	authenticity was a	Mādar Shāh which rationale for their	
	consideration for the	reconstruction have already been	
	selection of the	explained.	
	component		
	parts, ICOMOS		
	notes that some of		
	the caravanserais		
	selected have been		
	considerably		
	reconstructed in the		
	past.		
P. 81, Left	ICOMOS further	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column,	recommends that the	The State Party believes that	reflects a difference of opinion.
Lines: 41-43	name of the property	considering the origin of the	remons a difference of opinion
	be changed to reflect	Caravanserai from the Achaemenid era	
	the revised focus of	and later its development and evolution	
	the justification for	through the history of Iran and its	
		· ·	
	•	immediate territories fully justify the	
	reduced series.	name the Persian Caravanserai.	
		The origin of its creation, its long history	
		of development and evolution, their	
		numbers and distribution justify the	
		name allocated to the property.	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Lithuania

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Modernist Kaunas: Architecture of Optimism, 1919-1939

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 177 Left column Paragraph 1 Line 4	Modernist Kaunas: Architecture of Optimism, 1919-1939, testifies to the rapid urbanisation and modernisation that, within two decades, transformed the provincial town of Kaunas into a modern city that served as the capital of an independent Lithuania between the First and Second World Wars.	Explanation: Please, refer to the Nomination dossier, Executive Summary, page 16, paragraph 1, lines 2-8 "The area within the nominated property was planned in the mid-19th century and developed in 1919–1939 when, after the declaration of an independent Republic of Lithuania in 1918, Kaunas served as the provisional capital of the state. The status of provisional capital was crucial for the city's unprecedented growth and architectural development." Proposed correction: provisional capital	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 179 Left column Paragraph 2 Line 3	Kaunas served as capital of the new nation-state from 1919 to 1939.	Explanation: see above Proposed correction: provisional capital	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 179 Left column Paragraph 4 Line 6	the State Party explained in more detail the status of Kaunas and its population when the city became the capital of Lithuania,	Explanation: see above Proposed correction: provisional capital	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 180 Right column Paragraph 6 Line 1	Kaunas, the capital of Lithuania from 1919 to 1939, represents an outstanding example of urbanisation and modernisation processes that took place across Eastern and Central Europe in the interwar period.	Explanation: see above Proposed correction: provisional capital	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

T.		[_ · ·	
	ntioned in Interim	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that
n 12 1	ICOMOS considers	The specific explanation and detailed tangible attributes that reflect the	this reflects a difference of opinion.
Ling 8	nomination poses	evolutionary modernisation of the	ориноп.
some Ke	ey problems with	urban plan of Kaunas, optimistic	
regard	to the	construction, and plurality of	
conceptu		architectural styles were described in	
nominate	ed property. The	the Nomination dossier (pages 35-56),	
explanati	ons provided on	and Additional information that	
how it co	onveys its proposed	ICOMOS has received from the State	
Outstand	ing Universal Value	Party on 25 February 2022 (pages 9-	
through	attributes reflecting	11). Proposed correction:	
the	evolutionary	The explanations were provided on	
modernis	sation of the urban	how it conveys its proposed	
plan of	Kaunas, optimistic	Outstanding Universal Value through	
construct	ion and plurality of	attributes reflecting the evolutionary	
architectu	ıral styles are not	modernisation of the urban plan of	
specific e	enough.	Kaunas, optimistic construction and	
		plurality of architectural styles are not	
		specific enough.	
Page 181 ICOMOS	S considers that:	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
	h the comparative	In the Nomination Dossier (page 286,	corrections re-iterate
	includes a brief	right column, paragraphs 2 and 3)	arguments/ justification put
	nt related to the	local cities Klaipėda and Šiauliai are	forward in the nomination
national	context, no local	discussed showing that the detailed	dossier that have been fully
cities are	e discussed.	discussion of local cities was not	considered.
		productive because of the outstanding	
		position of Kaunas in the national	
		context: "The country's sole seaport, Memel, severed from Germany after	
		World War I, aspired to the status of a	
		free city, and only later became	
		Klaipėda, Lithuania's gateway to the	
		Baltic sea, after a valiant Lithuanian	
		military escapade in 1923. The city	
		remained German at heart, however,	
		and was unsuited to serve as a symbol	
		of Lithuanian urbanisation. Rapidly modernising Šiauliai in the northwest	
		(31.500 residents in 1939), could not	
		equal the tempo of the provisional	
		capital. In interwar Lithuania, Kaunas	
		became the fastest growing and largest	
		city, which stood out in the context of	
		Lithuanian urbanisation.	
		In 1932 ten cities in Lithuania received the status of the first class.	
		Kaunas significantly surpassed the	
		others in terms of size, population	
		(155.000 in 1939), the scale of new	
		construction (12.000 construction	
		permits in 1918–1940), and	
		concentration of modern buildings. As	
		a primary city of Lithuania where	
		modern ideas were generated and implemented, Kaunas made a great	
		impact on the modernisation of other	
		Lithuanian towns."	

	T		
		Proposed correction:	
		The comparative analysis includes a	
		brief statement related to the	
		national context.	
Page 181	ICOMOS considers that the	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that
Right column	comparative analysis is	The comparative analysis includes a	this correction contains
Paragraph 5	incomplete. Cities within the	brief statement related to the national	advocacy for the proposals
(last)	national context are absent,	context. On page 286, right column,	made in the nomination
Lines 1-4	and the analysis should also	paragraphs 2 and 3 of the Nomination	dossier.
	be further developed with	Dossier the national context is	
	respect to key cities in the	described.	
	former Soviet Union.	ICOMOS did not provide arguments	
		why the comparative analysis "should	
		also be further developed with respect	
		to key cities in the former Soviet	
		Union". Historically Kaunas, as a	
		provisional capital of the Republic of	
		Lithuania, was not part of Soviet	
		Union in 1919-1939 (Lithuania was	
		occupied by Soviet Union in 1940).	
		Therefore Kaunas, as a provisional	
		capital of independent Lithuania had	
		nothing in common whatsoever with	
		Soviet context.	
		Proposed correction:	
		Cities within the national context	
		are absent, and the analysis should	
		also be further developed with	
		respect to key cities in the former	
		Soviet Union.	
Page 182	ICOMOS also considers that	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
Left column	the comparative analysis	The comparative analysis has been	corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 2	has been developed around	developed around the unique status of	arguments/ justification put
Lines 1-6	differences between	Kaunas as the provisional capital in	forward in the nomination
	Kaunas and other modern	the period 1919-1939 which provided	dossier that have been fully
	cities instead of	the unprecedented urban and	considered.
	demonstrating the	architectural growth that led to	
	nominated property's	Kaunas gaining outstanding	
	outstanding characteristics	characteristics of modern movement	
	in relation to its proposed	in architecture. The arguments were	
	Outstanding Universal	supported in the Additional	
	Value and the attributes	information (page 8) that ICOMOS	
	that support that value.	has received from the State Party on	
		25 February 2022.	
		Proposed correction:	
		ICOMOS also considers that the	
		comparative analysis has been	
		developed around differences	
		between Kaunas and other modern	
		cities instead of demonstrating the	
		nominated property's outstanding	
		characteristics in relation to its	
		proposed Outstanding Universal	
		Value and the attributes that	
		support that value.	
Page 182	ICOMOS considers that the	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
Right column	concept of 'optimistic	The attribute "2.a.2.2. Optimistic	corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 6	construction', said to be a	construction of the capital city" is	arguments/ justification put
rafagiann o			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
(last) Lines 1-6	defining attribute of the city's urban form and the	explained in detail in the Nomination dossier not as an abstract concept but	forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully

associated architecture, is as a tangible urban and architectural considered. abstract, which makes it legacy that was inspired by and difficult to understand how implemented exceptionally because of it is reflected in the the fact that Kaunas received a status nominated property's built of provisional capital in 1919-1939. environment and historic Therefore, its urban development and landscape. buildings that had to serve the purpose of State administration and capital city were built with an optimistic belief in the nation-state and modern society. On pages 50-51, there are mentioned and shown on a map 22 new national administrative and cultural buildings constructed for the purposes of the provisional capital in 1919-1939 that constitute an important attribute of the optimistic construction of the new capital city; on page 52-53, there are mentioned 9 modern buildings that were constructed for modern public and social needs and is an important attribute of the optimistic state and civic initiative to create a modern social infrastructure and modern lifestyles. The Additional information, that ICOMOS has received from the State Party on 25 February 2022, provided detailed information on tangible attributes that reflect the "Optimistic construction of the capital city" (see p. 10-11). Proposed correction: ICOMOS considers that the concept of 'optimistic construction', said to be a defining attribute of the city's urban form and the associated architecture, is abstract. which makes it difficult to understand how it is reflected in the nominated property's built environment and -historic landscape. ICOMOS considers that Page 184 Public buildings and private Explanation: Left column houses listed in the National As described in the Nomination this reflects a difference of Register of Cultural Heritage Paragraph 2 dossier, page 233(232-237), The opinion. Line 5 have retained their forms and Research Laboratory Complex in the exterior appearances, despite 1970s lost several auxiliary buildings ICOMOS notes as well that cases of considerable losses were not considered it is stated the following the in some of the structures (the architectural value and therefore nomination dossier, p. 233: cannot be evaluated as "considerable "In 1940, the laboratory Ažuolynas Sports Complex Research campus consisted of twelve and the losses". Laboratory Complex, for Proposed correction: different types and sizes of example). Public buildings and private houses structures. The authenticity listed in the National Register of of three of these has been Cultural Heritage have retained their preserved to this day, the forms and exterior appearances, two most important being despite cases of considerable losses in the Research Laboratory some of the structures (the Ažuolynas and glassworks facility, and Sports Complex and the Research one additional workshops Laboratory Complex, for example). building. Another surviving

		inadequate, as it only prohibits	
		activities that may have an impact	
		on the views to and from the listed	
		sites.	
Page 185 Left column	The comparative analysis, developed around the idea	Explanation: The comparative analysis has been	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 1	of Kaunas being different,	developed around the unique status of	arguments/ justification put
Lines 6-9	does not demonstrate the	Kaunas as the provisional capital in	forward in the nomination
	exceptionality of the	the period 1919-1939 which provided the unprecedented urban and	dossier that have been fully considered.
	nominated property,	architectural growth that led to	considered.
	whether as an example of	Kaunas gaining outstanding	
	post-war urbanisation and	characteristics of modern movement	
	modernisation processes or	in architecture. The arguments were supported in the Additional	
	an expression of the	supported in the Additional information that ICOMOS has	
	Modern Movement in	received from the State Party on 25	
	architecture.	February 2022.	
		Proposed correction:	
		The comparative analysis, developed around the idea of	
		Kaunas being different, does not	
		demonstrate the exceptionality of	
		the nominated property, whether as	
		an example of post-war	
		urbanisation and modernisation	
		processes or an expression of the	
		Modern Movement in architecture.	
Page 185	The proposed concept of	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
Left column	'optimistic construction' is	The Nomination dossier (p. 50-53)	corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 1 Lines 20-22	not easily translated into	and the Additional information, that ICOMOS has received from the State	arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination
Emes 20-22	the city's urban form.	Party on 25 February 2022, provided	dossier that have been fully
		detailed information on tangible	considered.
		architectural and urban attributes that	
		reflect the "Optimistic construction of the capital city" (see p. 10–11).	
		Proposed correction:	
		The proposed concept of 'optimistic	
		construction' is not easily translated	
		into the city's urban form.	
Page 186	ICOMOS notes that the	Explanation:	ICOMOS acknowledges
Right column Paragraph 3	nominated property is covered by protection	The plot falls within the green spaces and squares zone in Žaliakalnis 1, a	this correction and considers this correction to
Lines 1-7	assigned to seven sites and	Historic District of Kaunas, protected	be a clarification.
Emes 1 ,	complexes listed in the	as a historic urban site (listed on the	oc a charmonicalion.
	National Register of Cultural	National Register of the Cultural	
	Heritage, with one	Heritage in 2007, unique code No.	
	exception: a plot bordering Žemaičių Street, which is a	31280; area: 799,160 m2), and doubles as visual protection zone of	
	'visual protection zone' and	the Naujamiestis protected site. The	
	a 'specialized complexes	regulation for its protection as green	
	zone' under the General	space is ensured by Žaliakalnis 1, a	
	zone' under the General Plan of the Territory of	space is ensured by Žaliakalnis 1, a Historic District of Kaunas, Special	
	zone' under the General	space is ensured by Žaliakalnis 1, a Historic District of Kaunas, Special Plan (Nomination file's page 320,	
	zone' under the General Plan of the Territory of	space is ensured by Žaliakalnis 1, a Historic District of Kaunas, Special	

	,		
		ICOMOS notes that the nominated	
		property is covered by protection	
		assigned to seven sites and	
		complexes listed in the National	
		Register of Cultural Heritage, with	
		one exception: a plot bordering	
		Žemaičių Street, which is a 'visual	
		protection zone' and a 'specialized	
		complexes zone' under the General	
		Plan of the Territory of Kaunas	
		City.	
Page 186	ICOMOS considers that it is	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
	not clear what measures are	In additional information that	corrections re-iterate
	envisaged to ensure the	ICOMOS received from the State	arguments/ justification put
	protection of buildings that	Party on 25 February 2022 has been	forward in the nomination
	-		
		explained: "Buildings representing	dossier that have been fully
	nominated property but not	modern housing typology and	considered.
	included in the National	plurality of modernist architecture,	
	Register. Wooden houses	including wooden vernacular, wooden	
	can be considered an	modernist, neo-classical, art deco, and	
	example.	modernist style residential	
		architecture (annex 1) listed on	
		Cultural Heritage Register or	
		protected by Zaliakalnis reglament	
		and special plan, according to	
		individually defined attributes."	
		(Additional information 2022-02-22,	
		page 10, paragraph (table line 4). Also,	
		The Nomination file's page 320, left	
		column, chapter 3, lines 11-12 and the	
		same page right column, lines 1-6;	
		The Nomination file's page 322, left	
		column, chapter 2, lines 9-20. The	
		same protection mechanism applies to	
		the Naujamiestis area (Conservation	
		Plan Concept for Naujamiestis	
		(Nomination file's page 320, chapter	
		3, lines 4- 7). The above-mentioned	
		plans have been presented and	
		discussed in detail during the	
		ICOMOS expert visit (September 20 –	
		25, 2021), as well as the protection of	
		the buildings not listed on the National	
		register but protected as attributes	
		(inventoried) of the listed urban sites	
		that comprise the nominated property.	
		The measures envisaged for	
		protection of wooden houses, have	
		been explained in the additional	
		information that ICOMOS received	
		from the State Party on 12 November	
		2021 "the promotion of wooden	
		buildings restoration is considered	
		and increased funding for the	
		restoration of wooden cultural	
		heritage buildings is planned, as	
		well as a targeted information	
		campaign for wooden building	
		owners to apply for the Heritage	
		Restoration Program. " (Page 9,	

chapter 2, lines 13-16). Proposed correction: Protection is ensured only—for buildings included in the National Register or inventoried as attributes of listed urban sites by law or special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management of the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's Toologs considers that to corrections re-itera arguments/ justification provides in orange and blue colour, Management plan yangement plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Page 187 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan plan, p. 4 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
buildings included in the National Register or inventoried as attributes of listed urban sites by law or special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. The procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. The procedures for public corrections re-itera arguments/ justification program tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Register or inventoried as attributes of listed urban sites by law or special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management of the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the nominated property. The management of the nominated property. of listed urban sites by law or special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the nominated property. The management of the nominated property. of listed urban sites by law or special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's
special planning documents. The promotion of restoring wooden buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the nominated property. The management of the nominated property. Promotion of restoring wooden building is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
buildings is considered and increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
increased funding for the restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's information campaign for wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. ICOMOS considers that to corrections re-itera arguments/ justification program in the management tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's
restoration of wooden cultural heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's ICOMOS also notes that the following is stated in the management plan, p. 4
heritage buildings is planned, as well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
well as a targeted information campaign for wooden building owners to apply for the Heritage Restoration Program. Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community forward in the nominated engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. The management plan does procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Restoration Program. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Page 187 Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 The management plan does not include procedures for public participation in the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. Explanation: The procedures for public corrections re-iteral arguments/ justification property forward in the nominated dossier that have been full considered. Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Left column Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 not include procedures for public participation in the management of the nominated property. The procedures for public participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Paragraph 5 Lines 1-3 public participation in the management of the nominated property. public participation in the management of the nominated property. participation are included in the management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
Lines 1-3 management of nominated property. management plan as "Community engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
nominated property. engagement tools" and some as "Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
"Financial tools" (highlighted in orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: 4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
orange and blue colour, Management plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: following is stated in the following
plan/Annex 4, page 41, chapters 3 and 4) in actions e.g.: following is stated in the following is stat
4) in actions e.g.: following is stated in the description of the desc
4.1. Cultural Heritage Conservation's management plan, p. 4
action "promotion of preservation and "Strong attention in t
awareness raising programs to planning process must
encourage community demand" paid to public participation
(Management plan/Annex 4, page 43, (current practices
table line 8); 4.2. Managing Change's engagement processes a
action: "Community engagement in very bureaucrati
planning processes" (Management stakeholders are bare
plan/Annex 4, page 45, table line 4); identified, their influence
4.3. Education and awareness action unclear)."
"Further development of "Initiatives"
for Kaunas' programme to promote
creative inclusion of NGO's and local
communities" (Management
plan/Annex 4, page 47, table line 5).
Proposed correction:
The management plan does not
include procedures for public
participation in the management of
the nominated property.
Page 187 In summary, ICOMOS Explanation: ICOMOS considers that the nonlineared property:
Right column considers that the Though the current management corrections re-itera
Paragraph 8 management system does system is not integral, it covers the full arguments/ justification p
Lines 3-6 not cover the full range of range of attributes that express the forward in the nomination
attributes that express the potential Outstanding Universal Value dossier that have been ful
potential Outstanding of the nominated property through the considered.
Universal Value of the principal protective measures and
nominated property. strategic planning documents
described in sections 5.c and 5.d of the
Nomination file (Nomination file's
page 314-327) that include not only
protection of listed buildings, listed
cultural heritage sites and their
attributes, but a range of intangible
attributes as traditions and events, as

		well as strengthening community	
		involvement and developing creative	
		and tourism industries (e.g. Kaunas	
		City Cultural Strategy up to 2027,	
		Nomination file's page 316, Section	
		2).	
		Proposed correction: In summary, ICOMOS considers that	
		the management system is not	
		integral but does not cover the full	
		range of attributes that express the	
		potential Outstanding Universal Value	
		of the nominated property.	
Page 187	Protection is ensured only	Explanation: see above (explanation	ICOMOS considers that the
Right column	for buildings included in the	for Page 186	corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 8	National Register.	Right column, Paragraph 4, Lines 1-5)	arguments/ justification put
Lines 6-7	Trational Register.	Proposed correction:	forward in the nomination
Lines o 7		Protection is ensured only for	dossier that have been fully
		buildings included in the National	considered.
		Register or inventoried as attributes	
		of listed urban sites.	
Page 188	The management plan	Explanation:	ICOMOS considers that the
Right column	addresses only selected	The statement "only selected features	corrections re-iterate
Paragraph 1	features of the protected	of the protected areas" is not correct.	arguments/ justification put
Lines 3-6	areas and landmark	The Management plan addresses the	forward in the nomination
	buildings listed in the	full range of objectives and actions	dossier that have been fully
	National Register of	that are to safeguard and enhance the	considered.
	Cultural Heritage.	historic and cultural environment of	
		the nominated property, through	
		activities contributing to the integrated	
		development policies. The Action	
		plan of the management plan (Annex	
		4 of the Nomination file) covers the	
		areas of (i) Cultural heritage	
		conservation; (ii) Managing change;	
		(iii) Education and awareness raising;	
		(iv) Sustainable tourism; (v)	
		Emergency and risk management.	
		Each area comprises certain objectives	
		and actions (measures), planned to achieve them based on UNESCO	
		Recommendation on the Historic	
		Urban Landscape (HUL) approach,	
		involving knowledge and planning	
		tools, regulatory mechanisms,	
		community engagement tools, and	
		financial tools (highlighted in different	
		colours).	
	I	Colouis).	i



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Republic of Korea

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Gaya Tumuli

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 84, left column, paragraph 4, line 1	The area of the seven component parts totals 189 ha, with buffer zones totalling 964.8 ha.	The area of the seven component parts totals 189 ha, with buffer zones totalling 967.84 ha. * The buffer zone of the Songhakdong Tumuli had been expanded from 46.35 ha to 49.39 ha since the submission of the nomination dossier. This boundary modification was reported during the field mission as well as in page 63 of the additional information submitted in November 2021. The buffer zones of the nominated property now total 967.84 ha.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification but notes that this correction contains new information that was not provided during the evaluation procedure as the additional information mentions the expansion of the buffer zone without detailing the revised total extension.
Page 84, right column, paragraph 3, line 14	a more recent and very busy road divides the (07) Gyo-dong and Songhyeon-dong Tumuli component part.	at the (07) Gyo-dong and Songhyeon-dong Tumuli component part, there is a road that has been used for a long time.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence.
Page 87, left column, paragraph 1, line 4	Research at approximately 780 burial grounds as well as the historical records point towards the existence of seven polities belonging to the Gaya Confederacy: Geumgwangaya, Aragaya, Daraguk, Daegaya, Sogaya, Gimunguk, and Bihwagaya.	Research at approximately 780 burial grounds as well as the historical records point towards the existence of seven polities belonging to the Gaya Confederacy: Geumgwangaya, Aragaya, Daegaya, Sogaya, Bihwagaya, and the Gaya polities respectively located in the present-day Ssangchaek area and Unbong Plateau area. * As explained in the documents the State Party has additionally submitted, names referring to the Gaya polities responsible for the formation of the	ICOMOS notes that the names of the Daraguk and Gimunguk polities have been used on different occasions throughout the nomination dossier. ICOMOS acknowledges this editorial change.

Page 90, left column, paragraph 3, line 1	The nominated component parts are mostly under state ownership, and only a small portion is owned privately (14.57% in total, with the largest percentage of nongovernment owned land at the (03) Okjeon Tumuli component [42%]).	Okjeon Tumuli and the Yugok-ri and Durak-ri Tumuli differ across historical records (because place names were variously described during the process of oral transmission and of producing manuscripts). Given this, the State Party proposes to describe these two polities more flexibly as suggested above. The State Party considers that the existence of diverse names for referring to the individual Gaya polities has no bearing on any attributes of the property that convey its Outstanding Universal Value. The nominated component parts are mostly under state ownership, and only a small portion is owned privately (15.02% in total, with the largest percentage of non-government owned land at the (07) Gyo-dong and Songhyeon-dong Tumuli component [30%]). * Relevant data is included in page 35 of the additional information submitted in November 2021. The State Party will make continuous efforts to purchase private land plots within the component parts.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 90, left column, paragraph 5, line 10	Furthermore, the new World Heritage law (the Special Act on World Heritage Conservation, Management and Utilization, enacted in 2021),	Furthermore, the new World Heritage law (the Special Act on World Heritage Conservation, Management and Utilization, enacted in 2020),	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Spain

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Talayotic Menorca - A cyclopean island odyssey

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 242 Column 2 Line 34	taulas (T-shaped constructions formed by a large rectangular supporting stone slab and an inverted and truncated pyramidal capital), taula enclosures (religious structures comprised of an apsidal ground plan and concave facade), navetas (which display an inverted ship shape, and in some	taula enclosures (religious structures with a central T-shaped construction formed by a large supporting rectangular stone slab and an inverted truncated pyramidal capital), navetas (which display an inverted ship shape, and in some cases rounded ground plans), circular houses, and hypostyles (roofs supported by pillars).	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
		Taulas and burial navetas are unique and exclusive constructions to Menorca.	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Gordion

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
p.210; left column; title	Gordion (Turkey) No 1669	Gordion (Türkiye) No 1669	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error. ICOMOS notes that at the time of the finalization of the ICOMOS evaluations of nominations submitted for evaluation in 2022, the official name of the State Party was not changed yet.
p.210; left column; 7	Turkey	Türkiye	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error. ICOMOS notes that at the time of the finalization of the ICOMOS evaluations of nominations submitted for evaluation in 2022, the official name of the State Party was not changed yet.
p.211; left column; 15- 19	The buildings in the Temple Complex have revealed rooms with remains of grinding stones and evidence of textile production, from wool spinning to weaving; adjacent rooms contain mudbrick-and-clay ovens and other cooking installations.	The buildings in the Temple Terrace Complex have revealed rooms with remains of grinding stones and evidence of textile production, from wool spinning to weaving; adjacent rooms contain, as well as grinding stones, mudbrick-and-clay ovens and other cooking installations. Comment of the State Party: "Temple" is incorrect, it should read "Terrace"; and the text have been rearranged slightly	ICOMOS acknowledges both clarifications.

		T	
		to put "grinding stones" with the other evidence for food production.	
p.211; left column; 23	A disastrous fire, which occurred around 800 BCE, created a 'destruction level' marked by a thick layer of ash that preserved a wealth of precious and fine objects in the Palace Area: they shed light on the skills and taste of the Phrygians, during the Early Phrygian period.	A disastrous fire, which occurred around 800 BCE, created a 'destruction level' marked by a thick layer of ash that preserved a wealth of precious and fine objects in the Terrace Complex and Palace Area: they shed light on the skills and taste of the Phrygians, during the Early Phrygian period.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
p.211; left column; 5154	Archaeological campaigns at both areas have revealed stone buildings on the east and smaller, mudbrick buildings on the west. Objects found during the excavations included hearths, ovens, grinding	Archaeological campaigns at both areas, and in the Phrygian city district on the east side of the site directly adjacent to the modern village, have revealed monumental stone buildings on the east and smaller, mudbrick buildings on the west. Objects found during the excavations included hearths, ovens, grinding	ICOMOS acknowledges these clarifications.
p.211; right column; 1-6	implements, and other installations related to food processing. Archaeological evidence attests that around 700 BCE settlement activity ended by fire, and the area was subsequently used as a cemetery, known as the Common Cemetery, where members of the lower classes of Phrygian society were buried.	implements, and other installations related to food processing. Archaeological evidence attests that settlement activity in the district adjacent to the modern village ended by fire around 700 BCE, while the settlement in the Lower Town ended around 400 BCE.	ICOMOS acknowledges these clarifications.
		settlement activity ended by fire, and the area was All these areas were subsequently used as a eemetery, cemeteries in the Hellenistic and / or Roman periods (4th century BCE – 3rd century CE); and significantly the ancient cemetery in the area adjacent to the modern village, the known as the Common Cemetery, has revealed rare evidence for the graves of where members of the lower classes of Phrygian society were buried, dating to the 7th and 6th centuries BCE.	
p.212; left column; 21	A long-term conservation programme has been in progress since 2011 and will continue for at	A long-term conservation programme has been in progress since 2011 1998 and	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.

p.216; left column; 3134	least another decade to ensure the appropriate conservation and protection of the excavated structures and remains. As per the Turkish legislation, yearly reports are submitted to	will continue for at least another decade to ensure the appropriate conservation and protection of the excavated structures and As per the Turkish legislation, yearly reports are submitted to	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
	Turkey's Ministry of Culture and Tourism and to the Ankara Museum of Anatolian Civilisations.	Turkey's Ministry of Culture and Tourism General Directorate of Cultural Properties and Museums (Ministry of Culture and Tourism) and to the Ankara Museum of Anatolian Civilisations.	
p.217; left column; 710	The nominated property is protected under the Law on the Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties n. 2863/1983 as amended.	The nominated property is protected under the Law on the Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties Law n. 2863/1983. as amended.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
p.217; left column; 2027	Development in the 3rd degree archaeological conservation area is subject to provisions set out in the Gordion Conservation Development Plan (scale 1:5000) and in the Gordion Conservation Development Implementation Plan (scale 1:1000), which were approved in 2013 by the Ankara Regional Conservation Council for the Protection of Cultural Properties .	Development in the 3rd degree archaeological conservation area is subject to provisions set out in the Yassıhöyük (Gordion) Conservation Development Plan (scale 1:5000) and in the Yassıhöyük (Gordion) Conservation Development Implementation Plan (scale 1:1000), which were approved in 2013 by the Ankara Regional Conservation Council for the Protection of Cultural Properties Ankara	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p.217; right column; 1316	The Ministry of Culture and Tourism and the Ankara Museum of Anatolian Civilisations are key actors for the protection of the nominated property and its movable remains.	Regional Council for Conservation of Cultural Properties. The Ministry of Culture and Tourism and the Ankara Museum of Anatolian Civilisations, are is the key actors for the protection of the nominated property and its movable remains. Comment of the State Party: Since the Museum of Anatolian Civilizations is a unit of the Ministry of Culture and Tourism, the sentence has been rearranged.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
p.219; right column; 1314	ICOMOS recommends that Gordion, Turkey , be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (iii).	ICOMOS recommends that Gordion, Türkiye , be inscribed on the World	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error. ICOMOS notes that at the time of the finalisation of the

		Heritage List on the basis of criterion (iii).	ICOMOS evaluations of nominations submitted for evaluation in 2022, the official name of the State Party was not changed yet.
p.219; right column; 2025	Gordion lies approximately ninety kilometres south-west of Ankara in central Turkey , at the intersection of the great empires to the east (Assyrians, Babylonians, Hittites) and the west (Greeks, Romans).	Gordion lies approximately ninety kilometres south-west of Ankara in central Türkiye , at the intersection of the great empires to the east (Assyrians, Babylonians, Hittites) and the west (Greeks, Romans).	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error. ICOMOS notes that at the time of the finalisation of the ICOMOS evaluations of nominations submitted for evaluation in 2022, the official name of the State Party was not changed yet.
p.220; left column; 41	This is also protected and managed within the framework of the Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties Law (Kültür ve Tabiat Varlıklarını Koruma Kanunu) No. 2863, 23/07/1983 as amended by the Law No. 5226, 14/07/2004.	This is also protected and managed within the framework of the Protection of Cultural and Natural Properties Law (Kültür ve Tabiat Varlıklarını Koruma Kanunu) No. n. 2863/ 1983, 23/07/1983 as amended by the Law No. 5226, 14/07/2004.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.



FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des Orientations)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Canada

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE: Anticosti

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE: UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 205, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 3, ligne 9 Page 206, colonne de	Quebec, Canada Il comprend aussi le lit majeur des deux rivières principales,	Québec, Canada Il comprend aussi le lit majeur de deux des rivières	Pas une erreur factuelle. Erreur typographique. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée. Erreur factuelle.
gauche, paragraphe 1, lignes 7 et 8	Jupiter et Vauréal	principales, Jupiter et Vauréal	La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 206, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 1, ligne 13	Le bien proposé [] gouvernement de la province du Québec (ministère de l'Environnement, de la Lutte contre les changements climatiques, de la Faune et des Parcs).	Le bien proposé [] gouvernement de la province du Québec (ministère des Ressources naturelles et des Forêts).	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 206, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 2, lignes 1 à 4	Le bien proposé comprend des sédiments fossilifères [] datant du Silurien supérieur à l'Ordovicien inférieur, []	Le bien proposé comprend des roches fossilifères [] datant de l'Ordovicien Supérieur au Silurien inférieur, []	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 206, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 2, ligne 10	Les écosystèmes étaient dominés par des invertébrés et des vertébrés marins	Les écosystèmes étaient dominés par des invertébrés marins	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 206, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 1	C'est une des zones les plus importantes d'Amérique du Nord pour les oiseaux.	C'est une zone importante d'Amérique du Nord pour les oiseaux.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Divergence de vues. Le bien proposé abrite la zone importante pour la conservation des oiseaux « Falaise aux Goélands et pointe de l'Est ». L'UICN note par ailleurs que le

Page 206,	Dans les eaux du golfe du	Dans les eaux douces de l'île	dossier de nomination constate que la « zone tampon du bien proposé pour inscription est aussi un endroit exceptionnel pour les oiseaux de la forêt boréale nord-américaine en raison de l'absence de l'écureuil roux (Sciurus vulgaris) » (p. 69) et que le « secteur de l'est de l'île d'Anticosti abrite une des plus importantes colonies d'oiseaux marins de la côte est de l'Amérique du Nord » (p.122).
colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 7	Saint-Laurent, l'on trouve des espèces de poissons tels []	d'Anticosti, on trouve des espèces de poissons tels []	La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 206, colonne de droite, paragraphe 4, lignes 9 à 16	À la première étape, [] cinq critères : a) l'abondanceet la diversité des fossiles, b) l'élimination des graptolites (c'est-àdire le registre des organismes se nourrissant par filtration) c) l'étendue géographique et stratigraphique, d) l'accessibilité et e) la composition des faciès sédimentaires (c'est-à-dire la masse rocheuse dans tout milieu sédimentaire) d'importance critique []	À la première étape, [] cinq critères: a) l'abondance et la diversité des fossiles, b) les sites limités en grande partie aux graptolites ont été éliminés, sauf s'il s'agissait d'un site GSSP c) l'étendue géographique et la fenêtre stratigraphique, d) l'accessibilité et e) la composition des faciès sédimentaires d'importance critique []	Pas une erreur factuelle. La section présentant l'analyse comparative est conçue comme un bref résumé pour un public non spécialisé et a donc été raccourcie.
Page 206, colonne de droite, paragraphe 4, ligne 25	À la deuxième étape, [], et c) permanence du site en tant que bien du patrimoine mondial.	À la deuxième étape, [], et c) intensité de recherche et permanence du site en tant que bien du patrimoine mondial.	Voir point ci-dessus.
Page 207, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 1, ligne 10	Selon les évaluateurs, le registre est complet, ininterrompu et intact.	Selon les évaluateurs, le registre est complet et intact.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 207, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 3, lignes 5 et 6	S'appuyant [] d'extinction de masse de l'Ordovicien [] Silurien inférieur.	S'appuyant [] d'extinction de masse de la fin de l'Ordovicien [] Silurien inférieur.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 207, colonne de gauche,	Les connaissances spatiales [] d'extinction massive complexe de l'Ordovicien et	Les connaissances spatiales [] d'extinction massive complexe de la fin de l'Ordovicien et du	Voir point ci-dessus.

paragraphe 3,	du rétablissement ultérieur de	rétablissement ultérieur de la	
lignes 32 et 33	la vie au Silurien .	vie au début du Silurien.	
Page 207, colonne de droite, paragraphe 2, ligne 7	Plusieurs petites propriétés fédérales et privées sont exclues des zones désignées ;	Plusieurs petites propriétés privées et terrains publics sont exclues des zones désignées ;	Pas une erreur factuelle. Clarification. Cette clarification est acceptable pour l'UICN comme suit: « Plusieurs petites propriétés privées et terrains publics sont exclus des zones désignées »
Page 207, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 9	La réserve de biodiversité [] géologique insulaire et la biodiversité des écosystèmes représentatifs.	La réserve de biodiversité [] géologique insulaire et la biodiversité représentative des écosystèmes.	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 207, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, lignes 12 à 14	Le reste de la superficie du bien proposé est couvert par le parc national d'Anticosti (catégorie II, 9,8 %) et les réserves écologiques de la Pointe-Heath (catégorie Ia, 0,4 %) et du Grand-Lac-Salé (catégorie Ia, 0,2 %).	Le reste de la superficie du bien proposé est couvert par le parc national d'Anticosti (catégorie II, 5,4 %) et les réserves écologiques de la Pointe-Heath (catégorie Ia, 0,2 %) et du Grand-Lac-Salé (catégorie Ia, 0,1 %).	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 207, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, lignes 17 à 20	Dans la zone [] aucune nouvelle concession ne sera autorisée pour construire des établissements touristiques.	Dans la zone [] aucune nouvelle perturbation (développement touristique, etc.) ne sera autorisée si elle va à l'encontre de l'objectif prioritaire de conservation de la biogéodiversité.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 208, colonne de droite, paragraphe 1, lignes 11 à 16	Il est possible d'appliquer des sanctions légales. Dans la section du bien proposé couverte par le parc national d'Anticosti, la mise en œuvre du plan de gestion du parc national incombe au ministère et elle est déléguée à la Sépaq (Société des établissements de plein air du Québec).	Il est possible d'appliquer des sanctions légales. Dans la section du bien proposé couverte par le parc national d'Anticosti, la mise en œuvre du plan de gestion est une responsabilité partagée entre le ministère et la Sépaq (Société des établissements de plein air du Québec).	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 208, colonne de droite, paragraphe 2, lignes 6 à 8	Dans certains secteurs de la réserve de biodiversité projetée, [] in situ.	Dans la réserve de biodiversité projetée, à l'exception de certains secteurs plus sensibles, [] in situ.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 208, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 10	Des consultations avec des parties prenantes ont lieu régulièrement avec les Premières Nations des Innu de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan, [] et des citoyens et citoyennes.	Des consultations avec des parties prenantes ont lieu régulièrement avec les Premières Nations des Innus de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan, [] et des citoyens et citoyennes.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Les traducteurs engagés par l'UICN ont noté une utilisation incohérente (« des Innu » et « des Innus ») et ont décidé d'utiliser « des Innu ». Cependant, la proposition de l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 209, colonne de gauche,	En outre, des ressources ont été attribuées à la Municipalité de-L'Île d'Anticosti.	En outre, des ressources ont été attribuées à la Municipalité de L'Île-d'Anticosti.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Erreur typographique.

paragraphe 1,			
ligne 12	D 12:f	D 12:f	Dag for etc. 11.
Page 209, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 2, lignes 4 et 5	Dans l'information complémentaire, l'État partie mentionne []	Dans l'information complémentaire, le gouvernement du Québec mentionne []	Pas une erreur factuelle. Au niveau de la Convention, l'information complémentaire est soumis par l'État partie. Il est donc possible de dire que « l'État partie mentionne [] » quelque chose.
Page 209, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 4, lignes 4, 11 et 12	Les Premières Nations des Innu de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan soutiennent [] et leur gouvernance traditionnelle sur ce patrimoine important, sa protection et sa gestion effectives.	Les Premières Nations des Innus de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan soutiennent [] avec ce patrimoine important, sa protection et sa gestion effectives.	Pas une erreur factuelle. La phrase en question représente le point de vue de la mission. Suite aux consultations avec la mission, la phrase pourrait être reformulée comme suit : « [] avec l'inscription du bien proposé, les Premières Nations ont, du point de vue de la mission, une occasion de rétablir leurs liens traditionnels sur ce patrimoine important, sa protection et sa gestion effectives. »
Page 209, colonne de gauche, paragraphe 5, ligne 2	Le dialogue est réel entre les nombreuses parties prenantes : les Premières Nations des Innu de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan, []	Le dialogue est réel entre les nombreuses parties prenantes : les Premières Nations des Innus de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan, []	Pas une erreur factuelle. Voir point ci-dessus (Page 208, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 10)
Page 209, colonne de droite, paragraphe 2, lignes 1, 4 et 5	La Première Nation de Ekuanitshit []. La Première Nation de Nutashkuan []	La Première Nation des Innus de Ekuanitshit []. La Première Nation des Innus de Nutashkuan []	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 209, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, lignes 1, 6 et 7	Port-Menier, la seule ville de l'île, [] Les principales activités économiques de l'île sont la foresterie, la chasse et la pêche au saumon.	Port-Menier, le seul village de l'île, [] Les principales activités économiques de l'île sont la chasse, la villégiature, la foresterie et la pêche au saumon.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision de l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 209, colonne de droite, paragraphe 4, lignes 11 à 15	Dans la réserve de biosphère projetée, [] barrages hydroélectriques, l'activité forestière et la création de nouveaux établissements touristiques.	Dans la réserve de biosphère projetée, [] barrages hydroélectriques et l'activité forestière. La création de nouveaux établissements touristiques est sujette à autorisation et cette dernière sera délivrée uniquement si le projet est compatible avec l'objectif prioritaire de conservation de la biogéodiversité.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. La précision de l'État partie est acceptée.

Page 209, colonne de droite, paragraphe 1, ligne 1	L'_impact permanent le plus important est l'érosion naturelle.	L'impact permanent le plus important est l'érosion naturelle.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Erreur typographique. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 211, colonne de droite, paragraphe 1, ligne 16	Le bien proposé [] des récifs tropicaux.	Le bien proposé [] des récifs fossiles.	Erreur factuelle. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 211, colonne de droite, paragraphe 2, lignes 9 et 10	Toutefois, la contribution exceptionnelle est la fenêtre []	De plus, la contribution exceptionnelle du site tient à la fenêtre []	Pas une erreur factuelle. La traduction met l'accent plus fortement sur « toutefois » que la version anglaise. L'UICN propose la révision suivante : « La contribution exceptionnelle du bien proposé tient à la fenêtre [] »
Page 212, colonne de droite, paragraphe 1, entête	Eléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion	Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion	Pas une erreur factuelle. Utilisation incohérente des accents pour les lettres majuscules. La correction proposée par l'État partie est acceptée.
Page 212, colonne de droite, paragraphe 3, ligne 9	En outre, la gestion des zones du bien couvertes par le parc national est guidée par le plan de gestion du parc national d'Anticosti.	Supprimer cette phrase, car il n'y a pas de plan de gestion propre au parc national, mais un plan directeur. Nous proposons donc de supprimer cette phrase, car le plan de gestion s'applique pour l'ensemble du site proposé, y compris le parc national.	Pas une erreur factuelle. Précision. L'UICN considère que cette information est importante et propose la précision suivante : « En outre, la gestion des zones du bien couvertes par le parc national est guidée par le plan directeur du parc national d'Anticosti. »
Page 212, colonne de droite, paragraphe 5, lignes 3 à 6	Félicite l'État partie pour l'extrême qualité de l'analyse comparative et du dossier de la proposition, et se félicite de l'appui financier et scientifique solide fourni par l'État partie pour soutenir le bien, ainsi que de l'engagement des communautés innues de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan []	Félicite l'État partie pour l'extrême qualité de l'analyse comparative et du dossier de la proposition, pour l'appui financier et scientifique solide pour soutenir le bien, ainsi que de l'engagement des communautés locales et innues de Ekuanitshit et de Nutashkuan []	Pas une erreur factuelle. La proposition par l'État partie est acceptée.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Rwanda

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Nyungwe National Park

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 5 Column 1 Paragraph 3	but considers that the legal definition of the buffer zone would need to be strengthened so as to serve	mapped and gazetted. Tea plantations, fully playing a buffer role and meant to last long were not included in the gazetted buffer zone. This is something that will be addressed in signing a sustainable land use agreement with the tea factory managers and including the plantations in the gazetted buffer zone	
Page 5 Column 1 Paragraph 4	IUCN considers that the protection status of the nominated property meets the requirements of the <i>Operational Guidelines</i> but that the requirements are currently not met for the nominated property's buffer zone.	put in place for the property's buffer zone to fully meet the	Not a factual error Difference of opinion. The proposed wording confirms IUCN's position in the evaluation report. IUCN agrees that provisions are to be put in place for the property's buffer zone to fully meet the requirements. Thus, the requirements are currently not met.
Page 5 Column 2 Paragraph 4	IUCN considers that the boundaries of the nominated property and buffer zones partially meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines	provisions are to be put in place for the property's buffer zone to fully meet the requirements (cfr above)	Not a factual error. See point above and IUCN wishes to recall that the supplementary information provided by the State Party stated that the "long term plan as reflected in the Long Term Sustainability Strategy () is for the creation of wildlife corridors linking the 2 forests (Cyamudongo and Gisakura) to the main forest."

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		through the tea fields. On the other hand, the Cyamudongo forest was never really connected with the Nyungwe forest. The two forests were "joined" and in contact until over a century ago but have always been separated ecologically by the Bugarama Rift (a fault older than that of the Rusizi Valley). The forests located at the same altitude on either side of this rift are markedly different; botanical inventories carried out recently but still unpublished demonstrate this perfectly. Establishing a corridor connecting these two forests would therefore not make sense biologically and, moreover, would inevitably provoke hostile	
		reactions among human populations.	
	Therefore, IUCN considers	The nominated property is in a	Not a factual error
Paragraph 3	property is currently not meeting management requirements in line with paragraph 108 of the Operational Guidelines, which requires each nominated property to have an appropriate management plan which must specify how the Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property should be preserved	108 of the operational guidelines which requires each nominated property to have an appropriate management plan It should be remembered that if the Rwandan government called on African Parks to manage this national park, it is partly because the previous managers did not meet expectations. It was therefore quite normal that the production of a new management plan took time and could only be done after having acquired a good knowledge of both the forest massif and the	management system is not fully in place yet as additional tools are to
		problems that threaten it The Long Term Sustainable Strategy shared with the evaluation team sets a global management framework and additional tools are to follow.	
Column 1 Paragraph 4		The management of the nominated property meets the requirements of	Not a factual error. See point above.
Page 7 Column 1 Paragraph 8	In summary, IUCN considers that the integrity requirements and protection and management requirements of the Operational Guidelines are partially	protection and management requirements of the <i>Operational Guidelines</i> are met. Moreover, the LTSS document details the plans and interventions underway to improve the park's protection and rehabilitate the	Not a factual error. See point above. IUCN notes that the proposed conclusion does not logically follow from the wording proposed above on which this conclusion would be based.
	met	habitat and historically present wildlife (Cfr explanations above)	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in hold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		The nominated property meets the	Not a factual error
Column 2	nominated property does not	1 1 2	
Body Evaluation Page 7	should be highlighted in bold) IUCN considers that the	criterion. (ix) Nyungwe Forest is currently the only forest in the Albertine Rift where the full range of forest and non-forest habitats still exists. Elsewhere, moors and other open habitats have been planted with exotic trees since for many people only dense forests are valuable. It is also true that the dynamic between all these environments, forest and non-forest, has not been "scientifically" studied. It hasn't been anywhere else. On the other hand, this dynamic has been observed over more than 50 years, enough time to understand its mechanisms to recognise and	not been studied in the nominated property is in the view of IUCN not offset by the fact that these dynamics have not been scientifically studied anywhere else. Global significance under criterion (ix) cannot be scientifically proven based on the absence of scientific study globally. Whilst improvements in condition following the decline of illegal activities could be anticipated, the assessment of criteria has to be made based on the current situation of the property, and criterion (ix) is not met in the view of IUCN.
		illegal activities and strict respect of the integrity of the property	
		over the last 25 years give hope for a brighter future.	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Saudi Arabia

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
P 1 (149) column 2 line 1	Uruq Bani Ma'arid Protected Area, Empty Quarter of Saudi Arabia. Mammalia	'Uruq Bani Ma'arid Protected Area, Empty Quarter of Saudi Arabia. Mammalia	Not a factual error Reference correctly displayed as published. Error in title of the reference.
p 1 (149) column 2 lines 8-12	Hall, M., Miller, A., Liewellyn , O., Al-Abbassi, T., Al-Harbi, R., Al-Shammari, K. (2011). Important Plants Areas in the Arabian Peninsula: 3: 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid .	Hall, M., Miller, A., Llewellyn, O., Al-Abbassi, T., Al-Harbi, R., Al-Shammari, K. (2011). Important Plant Areas in the Arabian Peninsula: 3: 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid.	Not a factual error Typos. Reference incorrectly displayed and not as published. Therefore, the correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 1 (149) column 2 line 29	National Heritage Commission	Heritage Commission	Factual error The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 1 (149) column 2 line 31	municipality of Sultana	municipality of Sultanah	Not a factual error IUCN followed the corresponding references in the nomination document (see e.g. page 123) and the management plan (see e.g. page 33). The correction proposed by the State Party is however agreed.
p 2 (150) column 2 line 1	Spiny-tailed Lizard (Uromastyx aegyptica)	Spiny-tailed Lizard (Uromastyx aegyptia)	Not a factual error Typo. The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 2 (150) column 2 lines 56-57	contains the largest dunes on the Arabian Peninsula, which are one of the largest of this type worldwide	contains the largest linear dunes on the Arabian Peninsula, which are among the largest of this type worldwide	Factual error The first point of the correction proposed by the State Party is agreed (the text should read "largest linear dunes"). The second point ("one of" or "among") is not considered necessary as both versions are correct.
p 3 (151) column 1 lines 15-18	the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelle, and the Arabian Mountain Gazelle have successfully been reintroduced into their natural habitats after decades of extinction in the wild.	the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelle, and the Arabian Mountain Gazelle have successfully been reintroduced into their natural habitats; in the case of the Arabian Oryx, after decades of extinction in the wild.	Factual error The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.

p 4 (152) column 1 lines 27-28	the National Centre for Wildlife (NCW)	the National Center for Wildlife (NCW)	Not a factual error IUCN followed the corresponding references in the nomination document (see p.148, 173, and 176).
p 4 (152) column 1 lines 35-36	the protection and management of the States Party's protected areas.	the protection and management of the State Party's protected areas.	Not a factual error Typo. The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 4 (152) column 1 lines 38-40	The legal responsibility for historical monuments is vested in the Ministry of Cultural through its Heritage Committee .	The legal responsibility for historical monuments is vested in the Ministry of Culture through its Heritage Commission.	Factual error The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 4 (152) column 1 lines 43-44	overall, the protection and management of Uruq Bani Ma-arid is robust	overall, the protection and management of 'Uruq Bani Ma'arid is robust	Not a factual error Spelling mistake. The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 4 (152) column 2 lines 14-17	It is also the only place where these animal populations are completely free ranging in an area with a high level of ecological integrity	It is also the only place where the Arabian oryx is completely free ranging in an area with a high level of ecological integrity	Factual error The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 5 (153) column 1 lines 15-16	the National Centre for Wildlife (NCW)	the National Center for Wildlife (NCW)	See above point.
p 6 (154) column 1 lines 23-24	So far, visitator activity has not caused negative impacts on the nominated property.	visitation activity has not caused negative impacts (or, visitor activity has not)	Not a factual error Typo. The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 6 (154) column 2 lines 1-2	there are further archeological artefacts inside the nominated area.	further archaeological artefacts (the spelling archaeological is used elsewhere in the report)	Not a factual error Typo. The correction proposed by the State Party is agreed.
p 6 (154) column 2 lines 55-56 – p 7 (155) column 1 lines 1-2	reintroduction of iconic desert animals, including the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelle, and Arabian Mountain Gazelle into their natural habitats after decades of extinction in the wild.	reintroduction of iconic desert animals, including the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelle, and Arabian Mountain Gazelle into their natural habitats – in the case of the Arabian Oryx, after decades of extinction in the wild.	See above point.
p 8 (156) column 1 lines 26-31	The varied topography of the property creates a wide range of wildlife habitats and niches, including ecological refuges to the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelles, and Arabian Mountain Gazelles, successfully reintroduced into their natural habitats after decades of extinction in the wild,	The varied topography of the property creates a wide range of wildlife habitats and niches, including ecological refuges for the Arabian Oryx, Arabian Sand Gazelles, and Arabian Mountain Gazelles, successfully reintroduced into their natural habitats (in the case of the Arabian Oryx, after decades of extinction in the wild),	See above point.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Azerbaijan

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Cultural Landscape of Khinalig People and "Köç Yolu" Transhumance Route

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 385, Column 2, Paragraph 3	The original boundaries of the nominated property as proposed in the nomination dossier had an area of 40,443.255 ha, and a buffer zone of 100,491.845 ha	The original boundaries of the nominated property as proposed in the nomination dossier had an area of 44,829.41 ha, and a buffer zone of 109,392.78 ha	The updated areas for the property and the buffer zone were not specified in the documents provided by the State Party with the additional information submitted on 28 February 2023. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification and suggests to change "original" for "revised" in the correction proposed by the State Party.



FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des Orientations)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : France

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : La Maison Carrée de Nîmes

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE: ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Catoon P 469 Coll. I L 1 et 6	The Maison Carrée in Nîmes (France) No 1569rev 1 Basic information Official name as proposed by the State Party The Maison Carrée in Nîmes	The Maison Carrée of Nîmes (France) No 1569rev 1 Basic information Official name as proposed by the State Party The Maison Carrée of Nîmes	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
P 517 Coll. II L 31 et 32	3. lancer un programme de conservation actif pour améliorer l'état et le cadre de la porte d'Auguste et de la porte de France tout en réduisant	3. lancer un programme de conservation actif pour améliorer l'état et le cadre de la Porte d'Auguste et de la Porte de France tout en réduisant	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
P 518 Coll. I L 32	Toutes sont dotées d'un fût cannelé et agrémentées de chapiteaux corinthiens en forme de cloche sur lesquels repose un entablement	Toutes sont dotées d'un fût cannelé et agrémentées de chapiteaux corinthiens en forme de cloche inversée sur lesquels repose un entablement	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence and suggests that "inversée" be translated as "inverted".
P 470 Coll. I L 25	All are fluted and adorned with Corinthian bell-shaped capitals, on which rests an entablature composed of a three-fascia architrave with rows of ovolo ornaments between them, a frieze with acanthus rinceaux, and an elaborately sculpted cornice.	All are fluted and adorned with Corinthian inversed bell-shaped capitals, on which rests an entablature composed of a three-fascia architrave with rows of ovolo ornaments between them, a frieze with acanthus rinceaux, and an elaborately sculpted cornice.	
P 518 Coll. I L 39	Une toiture à deux pans, sur un cadre en bois, couverte de tuiles romaines <i>imbrex</i> et <i>tegulae</i>	Une toiture à deux pans, sur une charpente en bois, couverte de tuiles romaines <i>imbrex</i> et <i>tegulae</i>	ICOMOS accepts this clarification and considers it to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.

D #10	True de la constantina della c	T111 11 11 11	1001100
P 518	Elle se lisait comme suit	Elle se lisait comme suit	ICOMOS considers this
Coll. II L 7 à 10	(traduction du latin); « À Caius Caesar, fils	(traduction du latin); « À Caius Caesar, fils	correction to be an editorial change which does not
L/alu	« A Caius Caesar, fils d'Auguste, consul, et Lucius	« A Caius Caesar, fils d'Auguste, consul, À Lucius	modify the meaning of the
	Caesar, fils d'Auguste, consul	Caesar, fils d'Auguste, consul	sentence and notes that
	désigné ; aux Princes de la	désigné ; Princes de la	different translations were
	jeunesse ».	jeunesse ».	used in the nomination
			dossier (pp. 28, 60, 73).
P 470	It read (translated from Latin):	It read (translated from Latin):	
Coll. I et II	'To Gaius Caesar, son of	'To Gaius Caesar, son of	
L 52 et L 1	Augustus, consul, and Lucius	Augustus, consul, to Lucius	
	Caesar, son of Augustus consul	Caesar, son of Augustus consul	
	designate; to the Princes of Youth'.	designate; Princes of Youth'.	
P 518	Cette pratique religieuse a été	Cette pratique religieuse a été	ICOMOS considers it to be
Coll. II	utilisée par le système de	utilisée par le système de	an editorial change which
L 23	propagande impériale	propagande impériale	does not modify the meaning
	d'Auguste comme un outil pour	d'Auguste comme un outil	of the sentence.
	encourager la loyauté des	pour encourager la loyauté des	
	provinces vis-à-vis de leur	provinces vis-à-vis de	
	maître, et ainsi unifier l'empire	l'empereur et ainsi unifier	
	sur le plan politique.	l'empire sur le plan politique.	
P 470	This religious practice was used	This religious practice was	
Coll. II	by Augustus system of imperial	used by Augustus system of	
L 13	propaganda as a tool to foster	imperial propaganda as a tool	
	loyalty of the provinces to the	to foster loyalty of the	
	ruler and thus politically unify	provinces to the Emperor and	
	the Empire.	thus politically unify the	
P 519	De nos jours, les façades néo-	Empire. De nos jours, les façades néo-	ICOMOS considers it to be
Coll. I	classiques des immeubles	classiques des immeubles	an editorial change which
L 23	donnent sur le monument au	donnent sur le monument au	does not modify the meaning
	nord, à l'est et au sud, tandis	nord, à l'est et au sud, tandis	of the sentence.
	qu'à l'ouest, le bâtiment du	qu'à l'ouest, le bâtiment du	
	Carré d'Art (musée d'art	Carré d'Art (musée d'art	
	contemporain) avec sa façade	contemporain -bibliothèque)	
	en verre ferme cet espace.	avec sa façade en verre ferme	
		cet espace.	
P 471	Nowadays, neoclassical façades	Nowadays, neoclassical	
Coll. I	of buildings face the monument	façades of buildings face the	
L 10	on the north, east and south	monument on the north, east	
	_		
		C	
	"		
P 519			ICOMOS accepts this
Coll. I	toiture en verre fut installée	verrière fut installée au	clarification and considers it
L 38	dans la cella et le plafond du	dessus de la cella et le plafond	to be an editorial change
	pronaos fut remplacé.	du <i>pronaos</i> fut remplacé.	which does not modify the
D 510	77	YY	
1.41			
	7	* ·	-
	zone tampon, où est	zone tampon, où est	2024-2025) are scheduled for 1
	zone tampon, où est actuellement développé le	zone tampon, où est actuellement développé le	2024-2025) are scheduled for 2022-2024; the statement of
Coll. I L 10 P 519 Coll. I	of buildings face the monument on the north, east and south while to the west the building of <i>Carré d'Art</i> (Museum of Contemporary Art) with its glass façade closes off the space. À cette époque également, une toiture en verre fut installée dans la <i>cella</i> et le plafond du <i>pronaos</i> fut remplacé. Une intervention similaire est prévue aux abords de la Porte de France (projetée pour 2022 -2025), à l'extrémité sud de la	façades of buildings face the monument on the north, east and south while to the west the building of <i>Carré d'Art</i> (Museum of <i>Contemporary Art - Library</i>) with its glass façade closes off the space. À cette époque également, une, verrière fut installée au dessus de la <i>cella</i> et le plafond du <i>pronaos</i> fut remplacé. Une intervention similaire est prévue aux abords de la Porte de France (projetée pour 2024-2025), à l'extrémité sud de la	clarification and considers it to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification but notes that studies that will precede the actual works (planned for

	A simultan torring	A	stance of the treatment
P 471	A similar intervention is planned in the vicinity of <i>Porte</i>	A similar intervention is	stages of the implementation
Coll. II	de France (projected for 2022-	planned in the vicinity of <i>Porte</i> de France (projected for 2024 -	of this project.
L 6	2025), in the southern end of the	2025), in the southern end of	
LU	buffer zone, where the project of	the buffer zone, where the	
	Palais des Congrès	project of <i>Palais des Congrès</i>	
	T didis des Congres		
P 520	la Maison Carrée est un	la Maison Carrée est un	ICOMOS considers it to be
Coll. I	exemple exceptionnel de temple	exemple exceptionnel de	an editorial change which
L 16	romain d'ordre corinthien,	temple romain d'ordre	does not modify the meaning
	conçu sur le modèle des	corinthien, conçu sur le modèle	of the sentence.
	monuments construits à Rome	des monuments construits à	
	sous l'administration	Rome sous le règne	
	d'Auguste, qui témoigne d'une	d'Auguste, qui témoigne d'une	
	période importante dans	période importante dans	
D #44	l'histoire de la Rome antique	l'histoire de la Rome antique	100100
P 522	La piétonisation de la rue	La piétonisation de la rue	ICOMOS accepts this
Coll. I L 22	Auguste est censée renforcer l'axe visuel depuis la place de la	Auguste est censée renforcer l'axe visuel depuis la place de	correction as a factual error.
1.22	République en direction de	la Révolution en direction de	
	l'entrée du temple.	l'entrée du temple.	
	r charce du temple.	r charce da temple.	
P 473	Pedestrianisation of <i>rue</i>	Pedestrianisation of <i>Rue</i>	
Coll. II	Auguste is meant to accentuate	Auguste is meant to accentuate	
L 44	the visual axis from the <i>place de</i>	the visual axis from the <i>Place</i>	
	<i>la République</i> towards the	de la Révolution towards the	
	entrance of the temple.	entrance of the temple.	700700
P 522	De ce fait, la place de la	De ce fait, la place de la	ICOMOS accepts this
Coll. II L 31	République et la zone située le long de l'avenue Feuchères,	Révolution et la zone située le long de l'avenue Feuchères,	correction as a factual error.
L 31	reliant la gare ferroviaire de la	reliant la gare ferroviaire de la	
	SNCF à l'esplanade Charles-de-	SNCF à l'esplanade Charles-	
	Gaulle, ont été ajoutées à la zone	de-Gaulle, ont été ajoutées à la	
	tampon.	zone tampon.	
	_	_	
P 474	Hence, the <i>place de la</i>	Hence, the <i>Place de la</i>	
Coll. I	République and the area along	Révolution and the area along	
L 48	avenue Feuchères, connecting	avenue Feuchères, connecting	
	the SNCF train station with	the SNCF train station with	
	esplanade Charles-de-Gaulle, have been added to the buffer	esplanade Charles-de-Gaulle, have been added to the buffer	
	zone.	zone.	
P 523	, la Direction régionale des	, la Direction régionale des	ICOMOS acknowledges this
Coll. I	affaires culturelles Languedoc -	affaires culturelles Occitanie à	clarification but notes that the
L 25 et 26	Roussillon-Midi-Pyrénées à	Montpellier, le Service du Site	ICOMOS sentence is based
	Montpellier, le Service du	patrimonial remarquable de	on the information provided
	secteur sauvegardé de Nîmes	Nîmes et le Service régional de	on p. 230 of the nomination
	et le Service régional de	l'Inventaire à Toulouse.	dossier.
	l'Inventaire à Toulouse.		
D 474	the Direction DC : 1 1	the Diversion BC : 1	
P 474 Coll. II	, the Direction Régionale des	, the Direction Régionale	
Coll. 11 L 38 et 39	Affaires Culturelles Languedoc-Roussillon-Midi-	des Affaires Culturelles Occitanie in Montpellier, the	
1 30 Ct 37	Pyrénées in Montpellier, the	Service du Site patrimonial	
	Service du Secteur Sauvegardé	remarquable of Nîmes, and	
	of Nîmes, and the Service	the Service régional de	
	régional de l'Inventaire in	l'Inventaire in Toulouse.	
	Toulouse.		
P 523	La Direction régionale des	La Ville de Nîmes avec la	ICOMOS acknowledges this
Coll. I	affaires culturelles (DRAC)	Direction régionale des	clarification.

L 35	réunit actuellement la documentation associée à la conservation et à la restauration du temple,	affaires culturelles (DRAC) réunit actuellement la documentation associée à la conservation et à la restauration du temple	
P 474 Coll. II L 47	The Direction Régionale des Affaires Culturelles (DRAC) is currently assembling documentation related to the conservation and restoration of the temple,	The City of Nîmes with the Direction Régionale des Affaires Culturelles (DRAC) is currently assembling documentation related to the conservation and restoration of the temple,	
P 525 Coll. I L 2	Le plan directeur du tourisme pour la ville de Nîmes est actuellement en cours de révision.	Le schéma directeur du tourisme pour la ville de Nîmes est actuellement en cours de révision.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
P 525 Coll. I L 33	Un plan de formation continue pour sensibiliser les agents municipaux, tels que les agents d'exécution, les prestataires de de la collectivité	Un plan de formation continue pour sensibiliser les agents municipaux, tels que les agents d'exécution, les prestataires de la collectivité	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
P 525 Coll. II L 37	Brève synthèse La Maison Carrée est un temple pseudo-périptère hexastyle de style corinthien érigé au Ier siècle de notre ère sur le forum de la colonie romaine de <i>Nemausus</i> .	Brève synthèse Située en région Occitanie, la Maison Carrée de Nîmes est un temple pseudo-périptère hexastyle de style corinthien érigé au Ier siècle de notre ère sur le forum de la colonie romaine de <i>Nemausus</i> .	ICOMOS considers it to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
P 477 Coll. I L 35	Brief synthesis The <i>Maison Carrée</i> is a pseudoperipteral hexastyle Corinthian-style temple erected in the 1st century CE in the forum of the Roman colony of <i>Nemausus</i>	Brief synthesis Located in the Occitanie region, the Maison Carrée of Nîmes is a pseudoperipteral hexastyle Corinthian-style temple erected in the 1st century CE in the forum of the Roman colony of Nemausus	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): India	
----------------------------	--

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Sacred Ensembles of the Hoysalas

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page, column, line	Recommendations by the	Responses by the state party	
of the evaluation	Advisory body		
report by the			
Advisory Body	Evnand the preparty sweet of	The raft factival (thematagus) is and	ICOMOS
Page 350; Column 2;	Expand the property area of the Channakeshava Temple to	The raft festival (<i>theppotsava</i>) is one of the festivals that forms part of the	considers that
Line 33	include the Vishnusamudra	temple's annual festival. On this day,	this reflects a
Emic 33	Tank and the Kere Beedi	a procession goes through the tank	difference of
	(Tank Road);	street (kere beedhi) to the	opinion.
	,	Vishnusamudra tank, where the deity	•
		is taken around on a raft. This tradition	
		of celebrating the raft festival,	
		annually at the Vishnusamudra tank	
		along the tank street (kere beedhi) began only in the 16th century, more	
		than 400 years after the establishment	
		of the Channakeshava temple.	
		It was introduced during the	
		Vijayanagara dynasty which ruled in	
		these parts after the Hoysalas had	
		disappeared from history. An	
		inscription dated 1524 CE and located	
		at Utpati village close to the tank	
		records the beginning of the raft	
		festival in this tank and the construction of a pillared hall	
		(mantapa) for this purpose.	
		The tank is devoid of any of the	
		attributes of the nomination such as	
		Architectural Eclecticism; Profusion,	
		Ornament and Embellishment to	
		Enhance Sacredness; or Artistic	
		Agency. However, since it is now	
		culturally significant to the temple, the	

		tank and the street were included in the buffer zone of the nominated property.	
Page 350; Column 2; Line 36	Improve the conditions of the historical remains and significant views in the buffer zone of the Channakeshava Temple component part;	An action plan is prepared by the respective authorities to take up the conservation of the historical remains in the Buffer Zone. The action plan will be submitted to the District Level Heritage Committees and the Apex Committee for approval in the next financial year.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
Page 350; Column 2; Line 39	Develop and implement a holistic interpretation and presentation plan, including an enhanced contextualised interpretation at all component parts, improved tourism facilities, an increased number of qualified tour guides and interpretative materials, and develop a diversified presentation of the lost temple structures and enclosure walls;	The interpretation panels which give a holistic idea of the dynasty and provide the context on the emergence of the spectacular Hoysala Architecture are under preparation by Archaeological Survey of India. Regarding tourism facilities, the works are in progress, they are already being improved by the Archaeological Survey of India and the Department of Tourism, Government of Karnataka.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
Page 350; Column 2; Line 46	Establish the carrying capacity for the nominated property to use it as the baseline for tourist management;	Channakeshava Temple is the only living temple of the three nominated properties. The annual festival of the temple, conducted outside the temple complex, attracts large number of devotees. The festival is traditionally a community managed event. Local residents volunteer their services for various roles including crowd management, safety and security, food distribution, and managing the surroundings. Devotees are allowed into the temple complex in a highly regulated manner, thus preserving the values of the temple. The carrying capacity is not a concern in such annual festivals which are a feature of many other World Heritage living temples in India such as the Virupaksha Temple in Hampi and the Brihadeshwara temple in Thanjavur, to name a few. District authorities have worked with local stakeholders to successfully manage such large crowds for many decades, without any untoward incidents.	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re- iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and the additional information letters that have been fully considered.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Indonesia

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: The Cosmological Axis of Yogyakarta and its Historic Landmarks

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
p. 352, L column, line 9	City of Yogykarta and Regency of Bantul	City of Yogyakarta and Regency of Bantul	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 352, L column, line 14	by Sultan Mangkubumi and has continued	by the Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono I and has continued	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
p. 352, R column, line 18	The letter sent by ICOMOS in October 2022 requested clarification from the State Party on the implications for the nominated property and its buffer zone.	The letter sent by ICOMOS in October 2022 requested clarification from the State Party on the implications for the nominated property and its buffer zone. Information has been given by the State Party that this issue has been resolved and there is no implication for the nominated property and its buffer zone.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change. The purpose of this section of the evaluation text is only to summarise the requests from ICOMOS to the State Party. The responses by the State Party, and resolution of these issues is acknowledged in other parts of the evaluation document.
p. 353, L column, line 10	the Sultan Mangkubumi in 1755, and is laid out to represent	the Sri Sultan Hamengku Buwono I in 1755, and is laid out to represent	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
p. 353, L column, line 48	The town plan comprises the Tugu Monument situated at the northernmost point of the axis with the Malioboro Street as the communication route.	The Town Plan comprises the Tugu Monument situated at the northernmost point of the axis with the Margatama Street – Malioboro Street – Margamulya Street – Pangurakan Street as the communication route.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
p. 353, L column, line 57	From the southern gate of the Kraton, Ali Maksum Street axis leads to the Panggung Krapyak Monument, the landmark which	From the southern gate of the Kraton, D.I Panjaitan street (Gebayanan Street) and Ali Maksum Street axis	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

p. 354, L column, line 24 p. 354, L column,	indicates the southern border of the town. the restoration of the northern square/Karaton Ngayogyakarta Complex and several adaptive reuse proposals. The Yogyakarta Regional Government has strategies in	lead to the Panggung Krapyak Monument, the landmark which indicates the southern border of the town the restoration of the Northern Square/Kraton Ngayogyakarta Complex and several adaptive reuse proposals. The Government of the Special Region of	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error. ICOMOS acknowledges this editorial change.
p. 355, R column, line 14	place for disaster Mataram Java	Yogyakarta has strategies in place for disaster Mataram of Java	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 355, R column, line 49	Javenese cultural traditions	Javanese cultural traditions	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 356, L column, line 3	making of Batik cloth and Keris daggers, as well as the performance of Gamelan music and Wayang puppet theatre. The State Party refers to the inclusion of a number of these art forms in the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity (UNESCO 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage).	making of Batik cloth and Keris daggers, as well as the performance of Gamelan music and Wayang puppet theatre. The State Party refers to the inclusion of a number of these art forms in the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity (UNESCO 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage), i.e. Wayang puppet theatre (2008), Indonesian Kris (2008), Indonesian Batik (2009), dan Gamelan (2021).	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
p. 356, L column, line 12	ICOMOS acknowledges the importance of intangible cultural heritage attributes of the nominated property, although considers that the values they expressed are better reflected in relation to the justification for criterion (iii). ICOMOS considers that criterion (vi) has not been demonstrated.	ICOMOS acknowledges the importance of intangible cultural heritage attributes of the nominated property. The living traditions of wayang shadow puppet, batik, gamelan and keris are all preserved, used, and performed in the Kraton. Hence, these traditions are tangibly associated with the nominated property and all have outstanding universal values as recognized by UNESCO in the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity.	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
p. 356, L column, line 18	ICOMOS considers that criteria (ii) and (iii) have been met, but that criterion (vi) has not been demonstrated.	ICOMOS considers that criteria (ii), (iii), and (vi) have been met	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

p. 357, R	Most of the attributes are	Most of the attributes are	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	maintained by the Office of the	maintained by the Office of	typing error (Karaton).
line 28	Kraton and the Special Region of	the Karaton and the	opping error (rammon).
	Yogyakarta which are under the	Government of the Special	In relation to the rest of the
	administration of the Sultan.	Region of Yogyakarta which	proposed text, ICOMOS
		are under the administration	considers this correction to be
		of the Sultan who is also the	an editorial change which does
		Governor of the Special	not modify the meaning of the
		Region of Yogyakarta.	sentence.
p. 358, L	These are the Law of the Republic	These are the Law of the	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	of Indonesia No. 13 of 2012	Republic of Indonesia No.	typing error.
line 38	Concerning the Specialty of the	13 of 2012 concerning the	
	Special Region of Yogykarta	Specialty of the Special	
	(Article 5e),	Region of Yogyakarta	
		(Article 5e),	
p. 358, L	Yogyakarta laws that apply	Provincial laws that	ICOMOS considers this
Column,		apply	correction to be an editorial
line 48			change which does not modify
			the meaning of the sentence
p. 358, R	The Sultan, the royal family, and	The Sultan, the royal family,	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	the Office of the Kraton are the	and the Office of the	typing error (Karaton).
line 3	responsible persons in these	Karaton are the responsible	
	matters in cooperation with the	persons in these matters in	In relation to the remainder of
	Directorate of Cultural	cooperation with the	the revised text, ICOMOS
	Protection, Directorate General	Government of the Special	acknowledges this
	of Culture, Ministry of	Region of Yogyakarta and	clarification.
	Education, Culture, Research,	Directorate General of	
	and Technology in the	Culture, Ministry of	
	supervision of the areas of	Education, Culture,	
	Yogyakarta and the Bantul	Research, and Technology	
	Regency.	in the supervision of the	
		areas of Yogyakarta	
		Municipality and the Bantul	
250 D		Regency.	1700100
p. 358, R	A Management Plan has been	A Management Plan has	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	developed with actions proposed	been developed with actions	editorial change.
line 24	for the period 2022-2025. The	proposed for the period	
	responsible body is the Special	2022-2025 under the	
	Region of Yogyakarta.	responsibility of the	
		Government of the Special	
- 250 D	h C C 13	Region of Yogyakarta.	ICOMOS a Last 1 Last 2
p. 359, R	have proof of residence permits	have proof of residence	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	issued by the Karaton	permits issued by the	clarification.
line 31	Ngayogyakarta	Karaton Ngayogyakarta	
- 261 B	is shall and a C	Hadiningrat	ICOMOS considered in
p. 361, R	is chaired by the Governor	is chaired by the Sultan	ICOMOS considers this
column,	(the Sultan of Ngayogyakarta	of Ngayogyakarta	correction to be an editorial
line 37	Hadiningrat)	Hadiningrat who is also the	change which does not modify
		Governor of the Special	the meaning of the sentence.
261.75		Region of Yogyakarta	rgoved 1 · · · ·
p. 361, R	management system though an	management system	ICOMOS acknowledges this
column,	administrative structure	through an administrative	typing error.
line 44		structure	



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Iran (Islamic Republic of)

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: The Cultural Landscape of Masouleh

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
P:364, Column: 1 Line: 30	Houses in Masouleh may have up to two floors;	Houses in Masouleh may have up to three floors; ===================================	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. There is no mention of the floor numbers of houses in Masouleh in the executive summary. Photos also show two-storey houses in Masouleh.
P:364, Column: 1 Line: 33	windows may vary in size and are usually decorated with intricate wooden frames;	Windows in Masouleh enjoy an evolutionary pattern which are known as "Masouleh-specific window pattern" but may vary in size and are usually decorated with intricate wooden frames; (See the Executive Summery, P. 21) State Party's further explanations: This type of window may be considered as an OUV relating to the Criterion II.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change and detailing which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS considers that this explanation contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P:364, Column: Left Lines: 46-48	it was a settlement specialising in blacksmithing, which remained in operation between the 11th and the 14th centuries.	residence of people (at least from Parthian period onwards) and has been one of the important centers in the field of metalworking between the 11th and the 14th centuries. (See Nomination Report p. 25, line 14 & p. 43, line 7)	The nomination dossier at p. 25 states the following: [] test excavations in the Masouleh town and its vicinity in 2012 during which evidence of Parthian, Safavid and Qajar occupations was identified (Hamrang, 2017). He also reexcavated Kohneh Masouleh. In the same year, Behzad Ali-Talesh

	T		
			conducted a regional
			archaeological survey
			around Masouleh that led to discovery of eight
			archeological sites dating to
			the Iron Age III, Seljuk and
			recent centuries.
			Occupation in
			archaeological terms is not
			used to indicate "main a
			primary residence of people"
			but is more generic in nature. ICOMOS considers this
			correction to be an editorial
			change which modifies the
			meaning of the sentence and
			which contradicts
			information provided at
			earlier stages of the
P:36 5 ,	No clarification is	A along alonification is provided horses	evaluation procedure.
Column: 1		A clear clarification is provided, however,	ICOMOS considers that the
Line: 11-14	provided, however, on how this distinction has	on how this distinction has emerged and what are the ties between the Taleshi	correction and explanation
			re-iterate arguments/
	emerged and what are	living in Masouleh and those in other	justification put forward in
	the ties between the	mountainous regions or in the plains	the nomination dossier and
	Taleshi living in	themselves.	in the additional information
	Masouleh and those in	State Dental's fronth or combonetic and	that have been fully
	other mountainous	State Party's further explanations:	considered.
	regions or in the plains	As clearly mentioned in the Additional	
	themselves.	Information II (p. 17, lines: 24-28), semi-	
		nomadic settlements located in the	
		cultural landscape, have formed social	
		unity through their years of coexistence	
		and they all identify as citizens of	
		Masouleh and refer to themselves as	
		Masoulehie (being from Masouleh).	
		Being from Masouleh does not mean that	
		they have distanced from their original	
D 26 7	TT1 ' ' 1 '	racial and linguistic roots.	ICOMOS 11 4 4 4
P:36 5 , Column: 1	The nomination dossier maintains that the	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the explanation re-iterates
Line: 32		The relationship between the ancient	arguments put forward in the
	Taleshi people who	Cadusii and present Taleshi people can be	nomination dossier and
	today inhabit the	easily seen in many scientific works	additional information
	nominated property and	including the works of the following	provided that have been fully
	the region are	famous Iranists: Roman Ghirshman,	considered.
	descendants of the	Richrd N. Frye, and Igor M. Diakonoff.	
	ancient Cadusii,	It was available for the State Party to	
	nomadic herdsmen and	clarify this relationship if the ICOMOS	
	warriors, on the implicit	asked.	
	grounds that the Taleshi		
	occupy more or less the		
	same area as was		
	attributed to the Cadusii		
	by narrative sources.		
	ICOMOS observes		

	that occupation of the same area at very distantly separated time periods represents a weak indicator for linking these populations.		
P:36 <i>5</i> , Column: 1 Line: <i>46-50</i>	The boundaries are punctiliously described, but the rationale for their delineation is not clear, nor has it been clarified by the additional information provided by the State Party.	In the Nomination Report (p. 195), the rationale is "based on the (bowl-shaped) watershed that is known today as the cultural landscape of Masouleh. It includes all elements related to the pastoral lifestyle, ancient communication roads, permanent and temporary settlements of semi-nomads, migration routes, ancient monuments and burial sites, and villages and the historical city of Masouleh as the largest permanent settlement in this landscape."	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.
P:36 <i>5</i> , Column: 1 Line: <i>46-50</i>	Additional cartographic material for the whole nominated property was requested by ICOMOS, but the provided maps are too small to show the necessary level of detail to be informative about the potential attributes supporting the proposed justification for inscription.	Additional cartographic material for the whole nominated property was requested by ICOMOS, and the State Party delivered detailed maps which included potential attributes supporting the proposed justification for inscription to the World Heritage Office and ICOMOS.	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion about the size and detail of the maps.
P:36 <i>5</i> , Column: <i>2</i> Line: <i>8-16</i>	it is not explained whether this distinction is tangibly reflected by the landscape and whether it has generated functional interdependencies between the groups. As all these groups extend well beyond the boundaries of the nominated cultural landscape, none of them is specifically connected only with the nominated property. The importance of cultural interaction between urban dwellers and	State Party's further explanations: As it has already explained, the bowl-shaped landscape of Masouleh is located at the provincial borders of three provinces of Gilan (territory of Taleshis), Azerbaijan region (territory of Azeris) and Zanjan (territory of Taats). Although these three groups originally belong to areas much more extensive than the landscape of Masouleh, but as they have lived in this bowl for centuries, they collectively developed a unique Masoulehie identity (See the Additional Information II, p. 17) which differentiates them from their relatives and friends in their original territories. Therefore, the boundaries of the nominated property have been limited to the bowl-shaped landscape.	ICOMOS considers that the explanation re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.

	livestock breeders is		
	stated but not explained.		
P:36 <i>5</i> , Column: <i>2</i> Lines: <i>21</i> -	The description of the nominated property and the additional information provide some information about	The description of the nominated property and the additional information provide some information about the features of the historic city of Masouleh,	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification about town and city in Iran.
	the features of the	State Party's further explanations:	
	historic town of Masouleh,	The conceptual difference among "village", "town" and "city" in the Islamic architecture is very distinctive, and as Masouleh is a "city", it meets the criterion II. (See Nomination Report, p. 83)	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P:36 <i>5</i> , Column: <i>2</i> Lines: 23- 28	, its surrounding landscape, and the different historic phases witnessed by this region. However, all these elements do not provide a clear and cohesive image of the nominated property, its formation and of the attributes supporting its potential outstanding significance.	, its surrounding landscape, and the different historic phases witnessed by this region. The data that has provided in the Nomination report, Executive Summery and the two sets of Additional Information, clearly present a clear and cohesive image of the nominated property, its formation and of the attributes supporting its potential outstanding significance. State Party's further explanations: 1. Existence of transhumance at more than 2000 a.s.l. from the Neolithic period onwards as a result of ecotonic conditions; (See	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and the additional information that have been fully considered. ICOMOS also considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
		Nomination Report, p. 36, lines: 2-3 & 18-19/ p. 37, line: 9 & 14/ p. 40, line: 4; the Executive Summery, p. 20, line; 7) 2. Emergence of early mining and smelting of iron from the Iron Age and producing high-grade sponge iron (Direct Reduced Iron (DRI)) through genius invention of a four-stage furnace which is, at least, unique in the region from the Parthian period to its golden age in Islamic period. (See Executive Summery, p. 22, line 17/	
Continued from the previous column		p. 23, line: 22/ Nomination Report, p. 26, line 10/ Photos in page 27/ p. 45, photo above shows the four-stage furnace in which high-grade sponge iron (DRI) was produced)/p. 110, lines: 3-20/ p. 120/ p. 126, line: 16/ p. 134, line: 1) 3. Emergence of is "the sole Ilkhanid habitat" " with a pre-planned urban design" that is also the first terraced	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and the additional information that have been fully considered. ICOMOS also considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

		Islamia "aity" in Ivan and the	
		Islamic "city" in Iran and the region as a result of the Mongol invasion. (See Executive Summery, p. 21, lines 8 & 11/ p. 81/ p. 83, lines: 8-9/ p. 120, lines: 8-17/ p. 125, lines: 1-14/ p. 121, lines: 21-29 / p. 137, lines: 8-17/ Additional Information II, pp. 18 & 19)	
P:366 Column: Right Lines: 14	The area was home to the Cadusii people, nomadic herdsmen ancestors of the Taleshi people; they made the region an unrivalled example of a pastoral system based on native sheep, goats, and cattle breeds.	The area was home to the Cadusii people, nomadic herdsmen ancestors of the Taleshi people; they made the region an unrivalled example of a pastoral system based on native sheep, goats, cattle breeds and especially Caspian horses. (See Nomination Report, pp. 50, 51, 123; Executive Summery, p. 8, photo above)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
P:366 Column: Right Lines: 18- 20	It includes sites demonstrating the early development of early mining and smelting industries that have shaped the economy of the region for millennia.	It includes sites demonstrating the early development of early mining and smelting industries especially the invention of four-phased production of high-grade sponge Iron (DRI) that have shaped the economy of the region for millennia. (See, Nomination Report, Photos in p. 27/p. 45, photo above shows the four-stage furnace in which high-grade sponge iron (DRI) was produced.)	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
P:366 Column: Right Lines: 32- 37	The additional information provided in February 2023 suggests a refocus of the narrative around the Masouleh region as a gateway and a refuge in the Alborz Mountains between the coastal plains to the north and the Central Iranian Plateau, and a place for trade with cultural transfer and inter-ethnic exchange.	The additional information in February 2023 reconfirmed the narrative mentioned the Nomination Report around the Masouleh region as a gateway and a refuge in the Alborz Mountains between the coastal plains to the north and the Central Iranian Plateau, and a place for trade with cultural transfer and interethnic exchange. (See Nomination Report pp. 16, 106, 108, 112, 118, 133, 164)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
P:366 Column: Right Lines: 43- 45	However, the additional information provided does not suggest that the shift in the justification for inscription can be justified.	State Party's further explanations: As it has been mentioned in the Nomination Report (p. 121, lines: 23-29; p. 125, lines: 1-14; p. 137, lines: 8-17), designing of the historical "terraced city" of Masouleh is inspired by the immigrants -escaping from the Mongol invasion in the Ilkhanid period-who took refuge to this bowl-shaped cultural landscape. As said frequently, the terraced city of Masouleh	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered. ICOMOS considers that this explanation contains advocacy for the proposals

		in the Circle Televisia terms of the televisian	and the discussion of the
		is the first Islamic terraced city in the	made in the nomination dossier.
		Ilkhanid period in the region; therefore,	UUSSICI.
		the Criterion II is justified. For better	
		understanding the matter, the following	
		facts should be kept in mind:	
		1-Contrary to "village" and "town", in the	
		history of urban city-planning of the	
		Islamic period, "City" enjoys to integral	
		components that "villages and towns"	
		did not have: (1) Jame' Mosque	
		(Friday-Prayers Mosque); (2)	
		Permanent bazaars (trade centers); (3)	
		the inhabitants are not herders or	
		farmers; and (4) existence of complex	
		public services such sanitation system.	
		Having said that, "city" of Masouleh	
		enjoys all four features -contrary to its	
		comparators;	
		2-Moreover, this historical city has had a	
		water supply and sewage system from	
		the Ilkhanid period onwards. (See,	
		Nomination Report p. 89, 90, 91, 120,	
		121, 124 & 165; Additional Information	
		II, pp. 37-39);	
		3-It is an unrivaled exception in the whole	
		region that houses in the city of Masouleh enjoy flat roofs while the city	
		is located in the rainy Hyrcanian section	
		of the ecotone (transition region) which	
		needs houses with sloped roof. (See	
		Executive Summery, p. 24, lines 1-2)	
		Based on the foregoing facts, the Criterion	
		II is justified.	
P:367	The comparison outside	The comparison outside Iran has been	ICOMOS considers that this
Column:	Iran has been limited to	limited to seven World Heritage cultural	reflects a difference of
Left	seven World Heritage	landscapes from Europe which (1) all of	opinion.
Lines: 3-7	cultural landscapes from	them are located in the mountainous	
	Europe and could not	regions; (2) four of them are located on	
	be considered	the steep slopes; (3) one is located in a	
	adequate, because	transition region (ecotone); (4) one of	
	some of the selected	them enjoys Iron smelting; (5) two of	
	comparators are not	them enjoy transhumance on highland	
	relevant for the	postures; and (6) one of them presents	
	nominated property.	early mining. Therefore, the selected	
		comparators are adequate and relevant	
		for the nominated property.	
		(See Nomination Report, Table 3 .2.	
		Comparing CLM with similar cultural	
D 0.57		landscapes in other countries p. 160-164)	1001100
P:367	the comparative	the comparative analysis was limited	ICOMOS considers that this
Column: Left	analysis was too limited.	based on two filters: "lifestyle" and	reflects a difference of opinion.
Lines: 8-13			opinion.
	1	1	1

	T	Lua a	
		"landscape features". (See the Nomination Report p. 130, line: 20).	
		State Party's further explanations:	
		Based on the two above-mentioned filters,	
		eleven (11) sites have been selected for the	
		comparison study in the Nomination	
		Report. Four other sites were added in the	
		Additional report. In addition to those four	
		added sites, two sites which had already	
		been mentioned in the Nomination Report	
		were fully compared in the Additional	
		report.	
		Accordingly, all-in-all 15 sites were	
		compared with the nominated property.	
P:367	The additional	The additional comparative exercise	ICOMOS considers that this
Column:	comparative exercise	prepared by the State Party for the	reflects a difference of
Left	prepared by the State	Caucasian region in which three	opinion.
Lines: 14-	Party, however, is	additional cultural landscapes in Georgia	
17	insufficient as it	and Azerbaijan were compared by the	
	examines only three	request of ICOMOS. There existed no	
	additional cultural	other significant landscape in Caucasia	
	landscapes in the	to be compared with the Cultural	
	Tentative Lists of	Landscape of Masouleh.	
	Georgia and		
	Azerbaijan,		7007100
P:367	, focusing not on the	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column:	, focusing not on the characteristics and	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the	corrections re-iterate
	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and	
Column: Left	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments:	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining,	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city.	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement.	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period.	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Accordingly, the additional comparison	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Accordingly, the additional comparison study was limited to the settlements.	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Accordingly, the additional comparison study was limited to the settlements. It should be reminded that this additional	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully
Column: Left Lines: 17-	, focusing not on the characteristics and development of the landscapes but only on	The three Caucasian landscapes lack the following characteristics and developments: 1- Khinalug in Azerbaijan: This landscape enjoys similar transhumance any ancient mining, iron smelting and from the Neolithic period. The main settlement is village not a city. 2- Musto in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Its only similarity to Masouleh is its terraced fortified settlement. 3- Dartlo in Geogia: This landscape also lacks any ancient mining, iron smelting and transhumance from the Neolithic period. Accordingly, the additional comparison study was limited to the settlements.	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully

P:367 Column: 1 Lines: **39-** ICOMOS notes that the urban and built fabric of the village in Hawraman/Uramat presents similarities with Masouleh in the distribution of buildings along the slopes and in the flat roofs.

State Party's further explanations:

The State Party has fully shown the differences, here below, between the village in Hawraman/Uramat and the city of Masoulh in the Nomination Report (p. 159) and the Additional Information (II) (p. 12):

- Difference in geographical and climatic conditions;
- Urban lifestyle in CLM;
- Mining activity in CLM;
- Formation of CLM based on situation in a safe strategic location on the skirts/slopes of the Alborz ranges;
- Economy based on livestock husbandry and trade in HC of Masouleh;
- No agricultural activity in CLM.

ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion and that the statement re-iterates arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

P:367 Column: Left Lines: 42The additional comparative work has been directed to show the specificity of the cultural landscape of Masouleh. However, it has not succeeded in demonstrating that the nominated landscape stands out among those considered in the additional comparison and would deserve consideration for the World Heritage List.

State Party's further explanations:

The State Party has provided additional explanations on the differences between Hawraman/Uramat and Masouleh (See the table mentioned in p. 12 of its Additional Information).

In the said table (lines: 14-17), the following outstanding fact has been mentioned which has the potential to justify the Criterion II:

"Historical iron mines and the industry of Direct Reduced Iron (DRI) or sponge Iron are of great significance in Masouleh..."

Why is the Criterion II justified?

In ancient times, it was possible to produce iron through direct reduction and production of sponge iron in a solid state and at a temperature much lower than the melting point of pure iron. The iron obtained in this way is called "Direct Reduced Iron (DRI) or "sponge iron".

The archeological investigations show that DRI was firstly produced in the Iron Age

through single-phase furnaces, while in the CLM, a four-stage furnace has been used in which iron became purer in an unbroken sequence at each phase which resulted in a high-grade sponge iron. This unique process which dates back to the Parthian period proves an exceptional development in technology of iron smelting.

ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.

There is no explanation about the DRI and the four-phased furnaces in the dossier – in fact, only images of furnaces have been provided and the additional information does not discuss this aspect.

This explanation about the DRI contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.

		(See the Nomination Report, Figure 2.41,	
		p. 45; Figure 5. 22, p. 258).	
P:367	ICOMOS considers that	State Party's further explanations:	
Column: Right Lines: 16- 18	the justification of this criterion is not supported by information in the description section or by the proposed arguments.	Regarding the arguments mentioned above and the facts mentioned in the Nomination Report and two sets of the Additional Information, the Criterion II is the most justified criterion. In brief, there exist the two following major	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
	the proposed arguments.	justifications which meet the said Criterion: 1. Existence of archeological evidence for early mining and production of Direct Reduced Iron ((DRI) or sponge iron) through four-phase furnaces 2. Formation of the terraced city of Masouleh in the Ilkhanid as the first terraced city based on the Islamic urbanplanning throughout the region. Other criteria will be justified in the following rows.	There is no explanation about the DRI and the four-phased furnaces in the dossier – in fact, only images of furnaces have been provided and the additional information does not discuss this aspect. This explanation about the DRI contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
P:367 Column: Right Lines: 21- 24	there is a big gap in the narrative on the Bronze and Iron Age periods and on the later phase related to the Mongol invasion and the arrival of peoples from different regions.	There is continuous narrative from the paleolithic, Neolithic, Bronze and Iron Ages and historical period Cadussian period (contemporaneous with the Median, Achaemenid), Parthian and Sassanid periods, and early Islamic period and the later Islamic period including the time of the Mongolian invasion and the Ilkhanid, Timurid, Safavid, Qajar and Pahlavi periods. State Party's further explanations: Continuity of the human settlement in the CLM is clearly attested by the archeological studies (See Nomination Report, Table 2.1, pp. 45 & 46). In addition, A chronology of the human settlement has been also provided (See Nomination Report, p. 117). As everybody knows, there is a general limitation of data about the Achaemenid, Parthian, and Sassanid periods, since the existing archeological activities cannot	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P:367 Column: Right Lines: 24- 26	Furthermore, details on the exchanges and relations in the various chronological phases are	provide the respective full data. State Party's further explanations: There exists no single reference in the Nomination Report and two sets of the Additional Information claiming that the	ICOMOS considers this explanation to be a clarification.

	technology from	never raised such a claim; therefore, no	
	Anatolia	reference was needed to provide.	
P:367	and the use of kurgans (a	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that this
Column:	type of burial mound) by	The State Party did not intend to employ	explanation contains
Right	Iron Age inhabitants	Kurgans for justifying the Criterion II,	advocacy for the proposals
Lines: 26-	does not suffice to	however, the Kurgans contribute to the	made in the nomination
30	demonstrate this	justification of the Criterion V as the	dossier.
	criterion or the	existence of Kurgans on the highlands at	
	exchanges between	more than 2000 a.s.l. cannot be seen in any	
	different peoples in the	other place throughout the region; and	
	historic periods.	secondly, they prove the continuity of	
		human settlements at least from the	
		Neolithic period to the Bronze and Iron	
		Ages up to the later periods.	
		Why is the Criterion V justified?	
		The CLM is a witness for presence of	
		herders from different ethnic groups on	
		highlands at more than 2000 a.s.l. from the	
		Neolithic period to the Bronze and Iron	
		Ages up to the contemporaneous periods.	
		(See Nomination Report, p. 36/ p. 37, line:	
P:367	More recent exchanges	14/ p. 40, line: 4) Exchanges between the different peoples	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2	between the different	living in the " city " and the landscape	corrections re-iterate
Lines: <i>30</i> -	peoples living in the	appear to testify to the proposed important	arguments/ justification put
34	town and the landscape	interchanges reflected by the landscape,	forward in the nomination
	appear to be rather	the urban structure or the architecture of	dossier that have been fully
	common and do not	Masouleh due to the fact that the said	considered.
	seem to testify to the	exchanges have been done among the	
	proposed important	immigrants of different groups through	
	interchanges reflected	time which resulted in, e.g., foundation	
	by the landscape, the	of terraced city based on the Central-	
	urban structure or the	Plateau pattern in a rainy and	
	architecture of	mountainous Hyrcanian region. (See	
	Masouleh.	Nomination Report, p. 81, lines: 13-16/ p.	
		83, lines; 8-9/ p. 120. Line; 9/ p. 121, line:	
D 267	TO 11 O TO TO	18)	1001100
P:367 Column: <i>2</i>	The hint of the link	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the explanations re-iterate
Lines: 54-	between the Taleshi and	As mentioned earlier, the relationship	arguments/ justification put
<i>57</i>	the Cadusii is mentioned as a possible indicator of	between the ancient Cadusii and present	forward in the nomination
&	the long-lasting	Taleshi people can be easily seen in many scientific works.	dossier that have been fully
P:36 8	presence of the Taleshi	Moreover, there exist a series of	considered.
Column: <i>1</i> Lines: <i>1-2</i>	in the region. However,	researches in which the relationship	
Lines. 1-2	no explanation is	between the Taleshi people and the	
	provided about whether	ancient Cadusii has been confirmed	
	and how Taleshi culture	through biological anthropology findings.	
	would be a continuation	The skeletons found in the ancient Cadusii	
	of, or connected to, the	graves have been compared with the	
	ancient Cadusii.	present Taleshi people.	
	Furthermore, the area	Furthermore, the area has been more	ICOMOS considers that the
P:36 8	has been more recently	recently occupied also by other groups,	corrections re-iterate
			arguments/ justification put

Column: Left Lines: 7-13	occupied also by other groups, such as the Azeri, the Taat as well as the Taleshi, who are	such as the Azeri, the Taat as well as the Taleshi, who are spread well beyond the boundaries of the nominated area. Hence, the nominated property is the host of	forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
	spread well beyond the boundaries of the nominated area. Hence,	various ethnic groups (not specifically the Taleshi culture) (See Nomination Report, p. 36, lines: 1	
	it is difficult to consider the nominated property as the cradle of the Taleshi culture and, if so, it would extend beyond the currently	&2/ As a matter of fact, the CLM has always been the host of different ethnic groups through the course of time from the Paleolithic to the modern times. (See the Nomination Report, p. 119, lines: 7 & 8)	ICOMOS considers that this explanation contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
	proposed boundaries.	State Party's further explanations: The bowl-shaped CLM is located at the western borders of Taleshi region and at the south of the Azeri region and north of the Taat region. Due to its unique ecotonic conditions, it represents a unified culture and tradition which has been called "Masoulehie Culture". Therefore, the Criterion III is justified. The State Party believes that the CLM is "cradle of the Neolithic nomadic herdsmen" not the "Cradle of Taleshi culture", consequently, this matter is related to the Criterion V not the Criterion III. (See the Nomination Report, p. 119, 124 & 165; Executive Summery, p. 20)	
P:368 Column: 1 Lines: 13- 18	According to the additional information provided in February 2023, it seems that the transhumance system between the plains and the highlands has ceased, since, as suggested by the document, the Taleshi of the plains and those of the mountains now form two distinct groups.	According to the additional information provided in February 2023, the transhumance system between the plains and the highlands has continued . "These groups in winter live in the down-stream areas of the property and in the spring and summer, they move to the upstream areas of the property." (See the Additional Information II, p. 4, lines: 17-19/ the Additional Information I, p. 2, line: 4-6/ the Additional Information II, Map in p. 33)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
P:368 Column: Left Lines: 35- 37	It also does not clarify what could be the significant stages in human history related to the specific context of the nomination.	State Party's further explanations: Exchanges between the different peoples living in the "city" and the landscape appear to testify to the proposed important interchanges reflected by the landscape, the urban structure or the architecture of Masouleh due to the fact that the said	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

		exchanges have been done among the immigrants of different groups through time which resulted in, e.g., foundation of terraced city based on the Central-Plateau pattern in a rainy and mountainous Hyrcanian region. (See Nomination Report, p. 81, lines: 13-16/ p. 83, lines; 8-9/ p. 120. Line; 9/ p. 121, line: 18)	
P:368 Column: 1 Lines: 50- 56	Concerning the vernacular architecture and townscape of Masouleh in a natural setting, ICOMOS does not consider that Masouleh could be seen as an outstanding example of an architectural and urban ensemble in a mountainous environment. The nomination dossier does not present robust arguments for justifying inscription under this criterion of either the landscape or the town.	 The CLM is a masterpiece of an adaptive architectural style with unique terraced buildings, flat roofs, water supply and sewage system that is located in the rainy Hyrcanian region. This brief explanation justifies the Criterion IV. The CLM hosts exceptional houses that enjoy unique architecture. In a general look, one may see general similarities between Masoulehie houses with the other houses in other terraced villages but there exist two exceptional architectural matters which are exclusively seen in the CLM houses: Spatial structure of their plan is defined by the arrangement of some elements such as "Ka", "Soma", "Berj", "Choqam" and "Lun" in specific patterns; The pattern of their façade such as the "Masouleh-specific window pattern" which is well-known and a unique design. 	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P:368 Column: Right Lines: 13- 15	the justification for this criterion is consistent with its wording but too descriptive and does not explain what culture(s) the local land uses represent	the justification for this criterion is consistent with its wording and explains that Masoulehie culture represents the local land uses ———————————————————————————————	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

P:36**8**Column:
Right
Lines: 1617

.... and how these characteristics and processes shape an outstanding example of a human settlement.

State Party's further explanations:

The Criterion V is justified due to following facts:

1. Existence of transhumance at more than 2000 a.s.l. from the Neolithic period onwards as a result of ecotonic conditions has been proven (See Nomination Report, p. 36, lines: 2-3 & 18-19/p. 37, line: 9 & 14/p. 40, line: 4). In other words, the CLM is a witness for presence of herders from different ethnic groups on highlands at more than 2000 a.s.l. from the Neolithic period to the Bronze and Iron Ages up to the contemporaneous periods due to the specific Hyrcanian-Irano-Turanian ecotonic (transitional region) conditions. This fact provides an outstanding example with human interactions environment, namely, sustainable landuse. Hence, the Criterion V is also justified.

(See the Nomination Report, p. 36, lines: 2-3, 18-19/p. 37, lines: 9, 14/p. 40, line: 4/p. 126/p. 133, lines: 5-7/p. 159, lines: 3-10)

- 2. The city of Masouleh represents an outstanding "sustainable interaction with its surrounding environment" as it showcases the excellent management of cool-dry and/or hot-dry climatic city-planning in the rainy and heavy humid Hyrcanian environment. Tangibly speaking, it is a regional unrivaled exception where houses in the city of Masouleh enjoy flat roofs while the houses in the rainy Hyrcanian climate recurrently need sloped roofs.
 - (See Nomination Report p. 52, lines: 3-5/ p.121, lines: 23-25, 28-29/p. 137, lines: 11-14)
- 3. Methods of smelting and exploiting iron ores which started from Neolithic period and reaches to its zenith in the Islamic period in this landscape show an outstanding example of human interaction with the environment since the Neolithic period onwards due to the following reasons:

ICOMOS considers that this explanation contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.

		a) Utilizing the natural wind of the	
		landscape for blowing the fire in the	
		furnaces;	
		b) Sustainable management of the	
		natural resources including wood and	
		lime stones to produce charcoal and	
		management of the fire temperature;	
		c) Positioning and the exact place of and	
		building unrivalled four-stage	
		furnaces based on the traditional	
		knowledge about topography and	
		wind direction, vicinity to the iron	
		mines and natural fuel resources.	
		(See Nomination Report, p. 21, lines: 1-5/	
		p. 22, Lines: 17/p. 26, line 10/p. 110, lines:	
		9-13/ Additional Information I, p. 15,	
		lines: 7-8/p. 12, lines: 16-19)	
P:36 8	ICOMOS also notes that	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2	several summer pasture	The State Party has provided some	corrections re-iterate
Lines: <i>36- 38</i>	places and stretches of	explanations about the summer pasture	arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination
30	migration routes are	places through providing information and	dossier and the additional
	located in the buffer	detailed maps showing the summer	information that have been
	zone and not in the	pasture places and stretches of migration	fully considered.
	nominated property.	routes.	
		(See Additional Information I, p. 2, lines:	
		4-6/ Additional Information II, p. 4, lines:	
D 260	4 112 1	16-20/p. 21, maps 3 &4/ p. 33, map)	ICOMOR 11 4 4
P:36 8 Column: 2	the additional information clarifies that	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate
Lines: 38-	wintering stations are	In the online meeting with the ICOMOS as well as the two sets of the Addition	arguments/ justification put
45	located in the plains,	Information, the State Party clearly	forward in the nomination
	outside the nominated	explained that all of the "Masoulehie"	dossier and the additional
	cultural landscape and	herdsmen live within the nominated	information that have been
	the buffer zone. A	property both in summer and winter.	fully considered.
	question arises about	Moreover, there is also clarified that there	
	whether the inclusion of	exist other herdsmen who live in outside	
	only summer pasture	of the property are not Masoulehie. (See	
	sites could be seen as a	the Nomination Report, p. 119, 124 &	
	complete representation	165/ Executive Summery, p. 20/	
	of all processes	Additional Information II, p. 17)	
	underlying the semi-		
	nomadic pastoral		
	subsistence system of		
	the Taleshi people.		
P:36 8	Furthermore, in the	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2	additional information	• The State Party tried to explain its	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 45- 50	provided in February	focus as it has always been highlighted	arguments/ justification put
. 717	00000 1 0 0	that the CLM has been leasted at the	forward in the nomination
	2023, the State Party	that the CLM has been located at the	dossier and the additional
	suggests that the	cross-point of three provinces	dossier and the additional information that have been
	suggests that the nominated area offered	cross-point of three provinces (territories) of Ardabil (where the Azeri	
	suggests that the	cross-point of three provinces	information that have been

	who settled in the area	(where the Taleshi tribes come from)	
	with their own cultural	(Nomination Report, p. 15, lines: 1-2/	
	traditions, shifting the	Map in p. 12 & 13).	
	focus from the Taleshi	Describing this, the State Party provided	
	culture.	archeological evidence in which it has	
		been shown that the Kurgan tradition	
		unearthed in the CLM belonged to the	
		Azerbaijan (Nomination Report, p. 37,	
		lines: 9).	
		Reiterating these facts by the State Party	
		in the two sets of the Additional	
		Information was due to the ICOMOS'	
		question and ambiguity about this	
		matter, the State Party provided detailed	
		information in the on the coexistence of	
		Azeris, Taats and Taleshis from the	
		ancient times onwards.	
		• Consequently, the CLM has always	
		been the host of different ethnic	
		groups through the course of time	
		from the Paleolithic to the modern	
		times. (See the Nomination Report, p.	
		119, lines: 7 & 8)	
P:36 9	Despite this explanation,	State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2	ICOMOS considers that	The State Party has tried to clearly explain	explanations re-iterate
Lines: 8-16	the rationale for the	the rationale of the delineation of the	arguments/ justification put
	boundary delineation is	boundaries of the nominated property in	forward in the nomination
	not robustly related to	the Nomination Report (p. 195, lines: 10-	dossier and the additional information that have been
	the proposed	17):	fully considered.
	justification for	"The selection of the property and	j
	inscription or the	buffer zone boundaries is in	
	distribution of attributes,	accordance with the unity of the	
	the latter not having	landscape, based on the watershed	
	been presented in the	that is known today as the cultural	
	nomination dossier. A	landscape of Masouleh. It includes	
	small-scale map	all elements related to the pastoral	
	indicating some of these	lifestyle, ancient communication	
	attributes has been	roads, permanent and temporary	
	prepared upon	settlements of semi-nomads,	
	ICOMOS' request: it	migration routes, ancient monuments	
	suggests that the	and burial sites, and villages and the	
	boundaries of the	historical city of Masouleh as the	
	pastoral landscape could	largest permanent settlement in this	
	have been drawn	landscape, which all are protected by	
	differently to encompass	active conservation efforts. The boundaries are marked by natural	
	further pastures and transhumance routes.	features such as mountains and	
	danshumance routes.	valleys".	
P:36 9	The additional	The Nomination Report and the	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2	information provided in	additional information provided in	corrections re-iterate
Lines: 22-	February 2023 confirms	February 2023 confirms that (short-	arguments/ justification put
27	that transhumance	range) transhumance routes are within	forward in the nomination
		8-7	dossier and the additional

routes have not the delineation of the boundaries of the information that have been been fully considered. considered in the nominated property. (See Nomination Report, p. 195, lines: 10delineation of the boundaries of the 17/ Additional Information I, p. 2, lines: 4nominated property. 6/ Additional Information II, p. 4, lines: 16-20/p. 21, maps 3 &4/p. 33, map) P:369 ICOMOS observes that **State Party's further explanations:** ICOMOS considers that this Column: 2 correction contains focus of the The State Party has tried to illustrate a Lines: 35advocacy for the proposals cohesive narrative which includes the nomination is not clear, 48 made in the nomination as it presents several following sub-narratives (themes) that dossier. made its cohesive narrative. themes that remain • The CLM is an outstanding cultural separate from one landscape that represents the designing another and do not seem of the first Islamic "terraced city" which to coalesce in one consistent narrative that is inspired by the immigrants, escaping could be tangibly and from the Mongol invasion in the outstandingly reflected Ilkhanid period. As this heritage the nominated property exhibits developments in property. This lack of town-planning architecture, focus persists in the landscape design over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world. additional information provided and seems to Accordingly, the Criterion II is justified. have influenced also the • The CLM exhibits Existence of delineation of the archeological evidence for early mining boundaries, the rationale and production of Direct Reduced Iron ((DRI) or sponge iron) through fourof which is not clear in phase furnaces. As it shows a unique relation to the proposed values but seems to be development of technology in iron ICOMOS considers that this determined by the smelting; therefore, the Criterion II is correction contains once again justified. protection status. The advocacy for the proposals currently provided • The bowl-shaped CLM bears an made in the nomination information and the exceptional testimony to a living mixed dossier. proposed justification but unified cultural tradition that has for inscription propose been shaped by the interaction of disparate arguments and different ethnic groups which has been do not clarify what called "Masoulehie Culture". Taleshis, could be the outstanding Taats, Azeris, Khorasanis and others universal significance of played an important role in formation of the nominated property. the Masoulehie Culture". Accordingly, the Criterion III is justified. • The CLM is a masterpiece of an adaptive architectural style with unique terraced buildings, flat roofs, water supply and sewage system that is located in the rainy Hyrcanian region. This brief explanation justifies the Criterion IV. The bowl-shaped CLM is an outstanding example of semi-nomadic settlement, culture and land-use in which herders from different ethnic groups have lived on highlands at more

	T		
P:36 9	The comparative	than 2000 a.s.l. from the Neolithic period to the Bronze and Iron Ages up to the contemporaneous periods. As a result, it justifies the Criterion V. • The CLM is an outstanding example of human interaction with the environment where a well-adapted terraced "city" - taken from hot-dry climate- was founded on the steep slopes of the heavy humid mountainous Hyrcanian region. This brief explanation justifies the Criterion V. The comparative analysis has been built	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: 2 Lines: 51- 53	The comparative analysis has been built around parameters that are not all relevant to the analysis and have drastically reduced the number of comparators while, at the same time,	around parameters that are all relevant to the analysis and have been based on two filters: "lifestyle" and "landscape features" and 15 sites have been selected for the comparison study. (See the Nomination Report p. 130, line: 20).	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered. ICOMOS considers that this explanation contains
	leaving out key comparators from relevant geo-cultural regions.	State Party's further explanations: The State Party has compared 15 sites including the Caucasian comparators which has been requested by the ICOMOS. There existed no other significant landscape to be compared with the Cultural Landscape of Masouleh. If the ICOMOS needed more key comparators, the State Party could be informed and introduced to the given comparators.	advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
P:3 <i>70</i> Column: <i>1</i> Lines: <i>33</i> - <i>36</i>	Much less documentation seems available on the overall cultural landscape, particularly on the features and heritage resources related to the seminomadic pastoral system.	State Party's further explanations: The State Party is ready to deliver more documents on the seminomadic pastoral system, if ICOMOS needs more documents.	ICOMOS cannot receive additional information at this stage
P:3 <i>7</i> 2 Column: <i>1</i> Lines: 38- 41	ICOMOS observes that the involvement of herders seems to have been limited to providing information for the nomination dossier, rather than being involved in its preparation or in the management planning.	State Party's further explanations: There are a number of activities in place in which all stakeholders including the herders participate in. For example, they are actively involved in the election of the city council and consequently, the election of the "mayor of the city" of Masouleh. The mayor is a member of the Steering Committee of the Cultural Heritage Base.	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.

P:3 <i>7</i> 2	but it is not clear what	The State Party would like to thank ICOMOS for its suggestion to add the representatives of the herders in the said Steering Committee. State Party's further explanations:	ICOMOS considers that the
Column: Left Lines: 53- 55	protection measures are in place to ensure that the traditional seminomadic pastoral system continues to thrive.	The State Party believes that there exists a clear set of protection measures mentioned in "Regulations applied to Zone C" of the CLM to ensure that the traditional seminomadic pastoral system continues to thrive. (See Nomination Report, p. 231 lines: 16-28/p. 232, lines: 1-2) In addition to the protection measures that have been provided by the Base, there exist a number of social agreements for the protection measures (See Nomination Report, p. 171, lines: 5-6)	corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.
P:3 72 Column: Right Line: 3	No comprehensive management plan is in place	State Party's further explanations: There exists an integrated Conservation Management plan in place (See Nomination Report, p. 194, line: 23) which is under an all-inclusive study which will result in a comprehensive management plan.	ICOMOS considers that the correction re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered and contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
P:372 Column: Right Line: 35-38	Ancient traces of iron smelting and working have been found in the landscape; this activity grew in the Iron Age and became a key economic base for Masouleh, but it gradually declined and lost its economic role.	State Party's further explanations: As it has been mentioned in the Nomination Report, the CLM has been known for its iron mines and its iron production throughout the history for example: 1. Adam Olearius (in The Travels of Olearius in Seventieth-Century in Persia), the famous German scholar (17th century) who traveled to Iran in the Safavid period, reported: "There are indeed certain forges at Masula,, but the best iron comes from Masula, where it is so soft and tractable that it is malleable and yields to the hammer without hating". 2. Moreover, in Qajar period, Hyacinthe Louis Rabino, the French-British archaeologist, reported: "blacksmiths of Masouleh used to make shells for Iranian artillery which was operating under the control of the armory". (See Nomination Report, p. 65, lines: 8-11) In the 20th Century, as a result of the nationalization of forests of Iran including the Hyrcanian Forests, and limiting the	ICOMOS considers that the explanation re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.

		production of charcoal (fuel for smelting); the iron smelting declined.	
P:3 72 Column: Right Line: 35-38	The pastoralism tradition seems to have changed and it is not clear whether transhumance is still practiced by the Taleshi and other ethnic groups present in the area.	The pastoralism tradition and transhumance are practiced by the Taleshi and other ethnic groups present in the area and the State Party has clearly shown this tradition to the ICOMOS	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Palestine

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 308, column 1, first Paragraph of the brief description, line 6.	A sizeable permanent settlement had emerged here by the 9th to 8th millennium BCE ,	We prefer to use BC instead of BCE , and AD instead of CE for dating system to be consistent with the Nomination File. This note is applied to all the report.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS' practice is to use BCE and CE in all its evaluation.
Page 308, column 1, last Paragraph, line 3	The World Heritage Centre supported an International Assistance request submitted in 2020 to prepare a Management and Conservation Plan.	The State Party did not receive an International Assistance in 2020 nor in the following years to prepare a Management and Conservation Plan for the property.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 309, Column 2, paragraph 1, line 1	The settlement regressed and was finally deserted during the Chalcolithic period	The settlement regressed and was deserted during the Chalcolithic period.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
Page 309, Column 2, paragraph 3, lines 2-4	The settlement relocated to Tulul Abu al-'Alayiq in the Hellenistic period, and in the Byzantine and Early Islamic periods the urban core of the Jericho oasis was at Tell Hassam	The settlement relocated to Tulul Abu al-'Alayiq in the Hellenistic period, in the Byzantine period the urban core of the Jericho oasis was at Tell Hassan, and in the Early Islamic period was at Tell Hassan and Khirbet al-Mafjar.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.
		Note: (Misprint has been identified in Tell Hassan. It ends with N not M)	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 309, Column 2, paragraph 3, lines 7-8	Jericho was barely a village until the beginning of the 20th century CE, when it became an agricultural centre under the British Mandate. At that time, the 'Ain es-	Jericho was barely a village until the beginning of the 20th century AD, when it became an agricultural centre under the British Mandate. After the Nakba in 1948, the	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS' practice is to use BCE and CE in all its evaluations.

	Sultan Refugee Camp grew	'Ain es-Sultan Palestinian	
	north of Tell es-Sultan.	refugee camp was built north	
		of Tell es-Sultan.	
			ICOMOS acknowledges this
		General note applied for	clarification.
		all report: We prefer to use	
		AD instead of CE, and BC	
		instead of BCE for dating to	
		be consistent with the	
		Nomination File	
Page 309,	During Israeli occupation	During Israeli occupation	ICOMOS considers this
Column 2,	from 1967 to 1994, Ancient	from 1967 to 1994, Ancient	correction to be an editorial
paragraph 3,	Jericho/Tell es-Sultan	Jericho/Tell es-Sultan	change which does not modify the
line 12	became an Israeli National	became a National Park and	meaning of the sentence.
	Park and was opened to the	was opened to the public in	
	public in 1984.	1984.	
Page 309,	Some of the collapsed	Some of the collapsed	ICOMOS acknowledges this
Column 2, last	structures were restored and	structures were restored and	clarification.
paragraph, line	trenches were backfilled.	trenches were partially	
6		backfilled.	
Page 310,	In 2021, the Neolithic tower,	In 2021, the Neolithic tower,	ICOMOS considers that this
Column 1,	which previously had metal	which previously had metal	correction provides information
paragraph 1,	beams installed to stabilise it,	beams installed to stabilise it,	which contradicts information
line 2	underwent maintenance	underwent cleaning work.	provided at earlier stages of the
	work.		evaluation procedure.
			In the nomination dossier, on p.
			121, the following can be read:
			"In early 2021, the Neolithic
			Tower underwent several
			maintenance projects to ensure
			its structural integrity. Soil and
			other debris were removed from
			the stairs and passageway. Cracks
			on the surface of lintels were
			documented and measured"
Page 315,	The monitoring system is	The monitoring system is	ICOMOS considers this
Column 1,	operated and technically	operated and technically	correction to be an editorial
paragraph 4,	implemented by the Ministry	implemented by the Ministry	change which does not modify the
lines 2-3	of Tourism and Antiquities'	of Tourism and Antiquities.	meaning of the sentence.
	Jericho Office.		
			ICOMOS notes that the following
			information was provided in the
			nomination dossier, p. 156:
			"Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan is
			managed by MoTA's Jericho
			Office, which has a staff of 23
			[]. The Jericho Office manages
			the nominated property with four
			employees [] The staff
			physically and visually monitors
			the whole site."
Page 316,		The Ministry of Tourism and	ICOMOS considers this
	The Ministry of Tourism and		
Column 1,	Antiquities' Jericho Office	Antiquities is responsible for	correction to be an editorial
paragraph 1,	Antiquities' Jericho Office is responsible for managing	Antiquities is responsible for managing and conserving the	change which does not modify the
	Antiquities' Jericho Office	Antiquities is responsible for	
paragraph 1,	Antiquities' Jericho Office is responsible for managing	Antiquities is responsible for managing and conserving the	change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
paragraph 1,	Antiquities' Jericho Office is responsible for managing	Antiquities is responsible for managing and conserving the	change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS notes that the following
paragraph 1,	Antiquities' Jericho Office is responsible for managing	Antiquities is responsible for managing and conserving the	change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.

			"Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan is managed by MoTA's Jericho Office, which has a staff of 23 []. The Jericho Office manages the nominated property with four employees [] The staff physically and visually monitors the whole site."
Page 318, Column 1, paragraph 4, line 4	The property is owned by the State Party and managed as a National Archaeological Park by the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, the highest heritage authority in Palestine, whose Jericho Office is responsible for onsite management.	The property is owned by the State Party and managed as a National Archaeological Park by the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, the highest heritage authority in Palestine, which is responsible for on-site management and conservation.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS notes that the following information was provided in the nomination dossier, p. 156: "Ancient Jericho/Tell es-Sultan is managed by MoTA's Jericho Office, which has a staff of 23 []. The Jericho Office manages the nominated property with four employees [] The staff physically and visually monitors the whole site."



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

 $\boldsymbol{STATE(S)}\;\boldsymbol{PARTY(IES):}\;\boldsymbol{Portugal}$

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
page 457 column 1 line 34	on the tentative list as a new property named "The Guimarães leather sector" in 2016	"The Couros (Leather) Zone" in 2016.	The Tentative List Entry mentions "Historic Centre of Guimarães and Couros Zone (extension)". ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
page 458 column 1 line 4	This includes "Ilha do Sabão", the 19 th century working-class neighbourhood.	This includes "Ilha do Sabão", a 19 th century working-class neighbourhood.	ICOMOS acknowledges this editorial change.
page 458 column 1 line 30	on the trade route between the coast and the interior, connecting Monçao and Braga with Viseu and Caminha.	on the trade route between the coast and the interior.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
page 458 column 1 line 48	were gradually demolished between between the 17 th and the 19 th centuries.	were partially demolished between the 17 th and the 20 th centuries.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
page 458 column 2 line 3	They were first developed in	They were highly developed in	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
page 458 column 2 line 9	Guimarães is today the second-largest city in Portugal.	Guimarães is today the mid-sized city in Portugal.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
page 458 column 2 line 15	enlarged to an area of 38.2 ha.	enlarged to an area of 38.4 ha.	The additional information provided by the SP in February 2023 at p. 5 mentions 38.2ha for the nominated property. ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure.

page 458 column 2 line 20	buffer zone has become 129.4 ha.	buffer zone has become 129.3 ha.	The additional information provided by the SP in February 2023 at p. 5
			mentions 129.4ha for the buffer zone. ICOMOS considers that this correction provides
			information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of
			the evaluation procedure.
page 463	107/2001 of 8 September,	107/2001 of 8 September,	ICOMOS acknowledges
column 2	Decree-Law No. 120/97 of 16	Decree-Law No. 115/12 of 25	these clarifications and
line 25	May, and Decree No. 3/98 of	May, and Decree-Law No.	accepts these corrections as factual errors in the list of
	26 January, and to legal provisions regarding town	309/09 of 23 October, and to legal provisions regarding	legal provisions.
	planning, including Decree-	town planning, including	legai provisions.
	Law No. 38/382 of 7 August	Decree-Law No. 38 382 of 7	
	1951, Decree-Law No. 445/91	August 1951, Decree-Law No.	
	of 20 November, and Decree-	555/99 of 16 December, Decree-	
	Law No. 250/94 of 15 October.	Law No. 307/2009 of 23	
	Its master plan (dated 1994)	October. Its master plan (dated 1994, revised in 2015)	
page 464	is the responsibility of the Local	is the responsibility of the	ICOMOS acknowledges
column 2	Technical Office for the Historic	Municipal Division for the	this clarification and notes
line 3	Centre of the Municipality	World Heritage and Listed	that it was unclear that the
	(GTL), established in 1985.	Properties, former Local	Municipal Division for the
		Technical Office for the Historic Centre of the Municipality	World Heritage and Listed Properties replace the
		(GTL), established in 1985.	former Local Technical
		(G12), established in 1963.	Office in the given
			documentation.
page 466	Founded in the 4 th century	Founded in the 10 th century	ICOMOS accepts this
column 2			correction as a factual error.
line 10 page 467	107/2001 of 8 September,	107/2001 of 8 September,	ICOMOS acknowledges
column 1	Decree-Law No. 120/97 of 16	Decree-Law No. 115/12 of 25	these clarifications and
line 42	May, and Decree No. 3/98 of	May, and Decree-Law No.	accepts these corrections as
	26 January, and to legal	309/09 of 23 October, and to	factual errors in the list of
	provisions regarding town	legal provisions regarding	legal provisions.
	planning, including Decree-	town planning, including	
	Law No. 38/382 of 7 August 1951, Decree-Law No. 445/91	Decree-Law No. 38 382 of 7 August 1951, Decree-Law No.	
	of 20 November, and Decree-	555/99 of 16 December, Decree-	
	Law No. 250/94 of 15 October.	Law No. 307/2009 of 23	
	Its master plan, which dates	October. Its master plan, which	
	from 1994,	dates from 1994, revised in	
page 467	centre. The historic centre	2015, centre. The Historic Centre of	ICOMOS accepts this
column 1	includes fourteen historic	Guimarães and Couros Zone	correction as a factual error
line 42	buildings that are legally	includes nineteen properties	
	protected as National	that are legally protected as	
	Monuments (eight) or as	National Monuments (ten) or as	
	properties of Public Interest	properties of Public Interest	
	(six), according to the	(nine), according to the	
	Portuguese Law on the Protection of Historic	Portuguese Law on the Protection of Historic	
	Monuments.	Monuments.	
L	1710Hullicitis.	monuments.	

page 467 column 2 line 9	the Local Technical Office for the Historic Centre of the Municipality (GTL).	the Municipal Division for the World Heritage and Listed Properties (DPMBC).	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification and notes that it was unclear that the Municipal Division for the World Heritage and Listed Properties replace the former Local Technical Office in the given documentation.
page 467 column 2 line 41	the Plano Director Municipal (Municipal Master	Diretor	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error and notes that, in the nomination dossier, both versions are used.
page 467 column 2 line 51	Plano Director	Diretor	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error and notes that, in the nomination dossier, both versions are used.
page 468 column 1 line 26	session;	•	ICOMOS follows the guidance provided by the World Heritage Centre as regards punctuation codification on recommendations.



(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Russian Federation

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Astronomical Observatories of Kazan Federal University

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
p. 421, col. 1, ln. 22-25	Component part 001: Kazan City Astronomical Observatory This component part comprises two buildings, the astronomical observatory building, and a present-day laboratory, which marks the site of, and retains some remains of, the former Littrow Observatory	The historical building of the Littrow Observatory has been completely preserved up to the present moment. Currently it is part of the southwestern block of the flat semicircular niches of the laboratory building. There are four windows in the Littrow Observatory. The Observatory has been preserved intact. The historic building currently houses a laboratory. Consequently, the original historic building of the Littrow Observatory is used for scientific purposes at the present time. The plan of the first Littrow Observatory, Kazan University, 1814 is available (RGIA. F. 733 Op. 39 D. 156). The building of the Littrow Observatory has retained its integrity and original scientific functioning as part of the laboratory.	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. The following is stated in the nomination dossier, p. 23: "In 1814 //Littrow adapted this building for astronomical observations. Above the building there was erected a tower for the equatorial, a span for the meridian circle and a small room with a retractable roof for small instruments. // Over time, the building of Littrow Observatory fell into disrepair; //. The property is an authentic building associated with the development of astronomy in our region. Later, a similar volume was added to the building acquired a modern look."
p. 421, col. 1, ln. 48-49	The laboratory building is converted from parts of the former Littrow Observatory.	The northeastern block of the laboratory was attached to the Littrow Observatory in the 1830s. It has equal historical importance. The northeast extension of the Littrow Observatory did not change its original appearance. The building of the	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure.

	T		
p. 422, col.	The Engelhardt	Littrow Observatory retains its original location on the edge of the hill, its volume and structures. Its historic facade opens onto the southwestern horizon, like 200 years ago. In the 1940-1950s the Engelhardt	ICOMOS acknowledges this
1, ln. 54- 57; col. 2, ln. 1-2	Astronomical Observatory was completed in 1901. In October 1918, battles of the Russian Civil War took place near Engelhardt observatory, but no damage was done to the buildings and instruments of the observatory. Conservation and some completion works were carried out in 1934 and after a fire in 1942.	Astronomical Observatory was replenished with new instruments. They were stored in small pavilions in the observation clearing, in front of the Observatory building. At the same time, the pavilion of the Meteor Department was being built, completing the classical architectural ensemble. There was no fire at the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory in 1942. However, there was a fire in Kazan in 1842. It affected only the City Astronomical Observatory causing little damage to the building. Only the stucco cladding of the facades and the wooden structures of the roofs were damaged in the fire of 1842. The architectural and structural basis of the building was not damaged. The Vienna meridian circle was damaged. It was restored in 1847. All the design documents were saved from the fire. It was easy to restore the lost wooden elements of the covering of the Observatory building. The authenticity of the building was preserved.	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. The following is stated in the nomination dossier, p. 148: "The complex of buildings of Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory // On January 30, 1942, a fire broke out in the engine room of the astronomical observatory and destroyed the room itself and the equipment located there."
p. 422, col. 2, ln. 7-9	In 2013, the planetarium and Astro Park located	In 2013, the Planetarium and the Exhibition Pavilion of the Astro Park were	ICOMOS notes that contradictory information is
	within the boundaries	opened to visitors. The exhibition	provided on the location of
	of the nominated property were opened to	pavilion of the Astro Park is located outside the nominated territory, within	the Astropark in the nomination dossier.
	the public.	the buffer zone of the Engelhardt Observatory.	The following is stated p. 17 (description of the
			nominated property as a whole): "The Astronomical Observatories of Kazan
			Federal University comprise the building of
			Kazan City. Astronomical Observatory (001) and a
			complex of Suburban
			Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory (002) with
			their historic buildings,
			museum expositions, a cultural and presentation
			complex of planetarium
			and the astropark." The following is stated p.
			148: "In 2013, a modern educational and
			entertainment complex of
			the Planetarium of Kazan Federal University and an
			astropark, located outside
1	i		the nominated territory, in

			T
			the buffer zone of the
			facility, were opened for
			visitors."
p. 423, col.	the construction of the	It is noted on page 426 of the ICOMOS	ICOMOS considers that this
1, ln. 5-8	KFU planetarium has	Opinion that "the newly built Planetarium	reflects a difference of
	already had a detrimental	can be seen as the development of the	opinion.
	impact on the nominated	site in accordance with its historical	
	property and the way it	function", which contradicts the statement	The full extract of the
	functions (the	on page 423 of the same Opinion about the	ICOMOS evaluation text in
	planetarium has	detrimental effect of the Planetarium on	p. 426 is the following: "In
	become a dominant	the nominated property and its	addition to the changes
	space and function).	<u>functioning</u> . The impact assessment	within the historic residential
		conducted by the state party indicates that	part of the site located on its
		the Planetarium meets the historical	outskirts, there are also
		function of the Astronomical	current changes to the
		Observatory , the presentation and	composition of the site, in
		popularization of astronomical knowledge	particular the recently-built
		among children, schoolchildren, the youth	planetarium which could be
		and general public, as well as its	considered as a development
		Outstanding Universal Value, sustainable	of the place in line with its
		development of the territory. It perfectly	historic function but which
		fit the spatial and compositional concept	still constitutes an important
		of the complex, designed by its creators at	alteration to the historic
		the beginning of the 20th century and	composition of the park".
		successively developed over the 100 years	
		of its existence. The Planetarium aims at	
		maintaining the authentic practice of the	
		Observatory in popularizing astronomy	
		and at expanding its educational	
n 422 aa1	Further development of	programmes. The astronomical observatories were	ICOMOS considers that this
p. 423, col.	Further development of	The astronomical observatories were	ICOMOS considers that this
p. 423, col. 1, ln. 8-15	educational and tourist	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and	
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008,	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity.	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings,	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property.	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property.	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence.	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the nominated property, which does not	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the nominated property, which does not threaten the proposed Outstanding	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the nominated property, which does not threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the nominated property, which does not threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property, provided that all requirements	reflects a difference of
-	educational and tourist infrastructure, such as the Scientific and Educational Center for Space Research and Technology project which started in 2008, together with upgrading of the territory and buildings, including the reconstruction of some residential buildings, may threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the	The astronomical observatories were initially created as scientific and educational centres. Both the City and the Suburban observatories still perform the original scientific and educational function, i.e. to preserve and develop the scientific, technical, and educational potential of the nominated sites, with maintaining their integrity and value. This contributes to the preservation of the spirit of the place and its authenticity. The project of the Scientific and Educational Centre provides for the development of the KFU infrastructure at the observatories adjacent to the territory, outside the boundaries of the nominated property. The management plan outlines further work on restoration, scientific research of architectural monuments, preservation of authentic tools, and elimination of risk factors for their existence. Only the existing utilities can be upgraded within the boundaries of the nominated property, which does not threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated	reflects a difference of

development of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory territory provides for the reconstruction of two halls of residence located in the buffer zone of the nominated site, while maintaining the existing dimensions of the two-story buildings and preserving the residential function. The impact assessment will be carried out after developing the building programme and project documentation; the mandatory nature of this procedure is also determined by Russian law. p. 423, col. The Imperial period the The role of Nikolav Lobachevsky, Ivan ICOMOS considers that the 2, ln. 5-12 Simonov and other scientists in the iustification corrections re-iterate inscription refers to was creation of the Kazan Astronomical arguments/justification put characterised by the deep School is outstanding. This can be proved forward in the nomination involvement of by the following: dossier and the additional the Russian scientists in Nikolay Lobachevsky's astronomical information that have been European science, and fully considered. observations influenced the creation of the many facets show some world-famous discovery of non-Euclidean notable contributions and geometry. It was the multidisciplinary important exchanges by research of Kazan scientists, the breadth of their horizons and views that contributed some notable personalities of KFU. to both the widespread use of astronomical However, it should be knowledge for practical purposes and for noted that they were the development of other branches of the working mostly natural sciences, as well as the use of parallel scientific fields mathematical methods of analysis in such as geography, astronomy, and the popularization of mathematics, astronomy. geophysics. Lobachevsky, along with mathematical disciplines, lectured on astronomy, expanding and deepening the content. His lectures, for example, were devoted to determining the elements of orbits, their secular changes, the theory of ebbs and flows, the theory of perturbed motion of comets and satellites of planets. He described in detail his observations and reflections on the then mysterious phenomena of prominences and the solar corona. He was also engaged in the improvement of methods for processing astronomical observations. Being the rector of Kazan University, he contributed to the development of astronomy in Kazan. In 1833-1837 he initiated the construction of a new observatory on the campus; it one of the best at that time. It was open in 1838, a year earlier than the Pulkovo Observatory. Lobachevsky used the parallaxes of three stars to check the validity of non-Euclidean geometry in outer space. Lobachevsky geometry is used in astronomy to describe the holographic universe and black holes. In 1819-1821, Ivan Simonov, as an astronomer-observer, took part in a round-

p. 423, col. 2, ln. 25-29	A significant part of the features of the nominated property constitutes movable heritage and cannot be considered as elements supporting the proposed justification for inscription of the nominated property.	the-world expedition on the military sloops Vostok and Mirny, under the command of F. Bellingshausen and M. Lazarev. In 1820, the expedition discovered Antarctica and 29 other islands in the Southern Hemisphere. Being the only scientist on the expedition, Simonov did not limit himself to astronomical observations and the use of astronomical knowledge for confident navigation and cartography, he conducted a number of valuable studies and collected material on meteorology, hydrology, zoology, ethnography, and mineralogy. Simonov published the findings of the round-the-world expedition in individual publications, for example, "Astronomical and Physical Observations Made During the Journey around the World" (St. Petersburg, 1828), "Determining the Geographical Position of the Anchorage of the Vostok and Mirny Sloops" (St. Petersburg, 1828) and in dozens of articles in Russian, French and German journals. This fact also shows how the 19 th -century interdisciplinary research contributed to the discovery of world importance. At the request of the expert group, the nomination was supplemented with a description of unique (original) instruments (tools), carefully preserved and continuing to perform their functions (currently for educational purposes). This fact emphasizes the careful and reverent attitude of the KFU administration, students and faculty to the historical heritage over many decades and should be considered as an undoubted plus of the Nomination. However, the unique instruments occupy only a few paragraphs out of a dozen pages of the description of the nominated sites. A more detailed description is given for stationary and semi-stationary devices, which we consider as part of the nomination, and movable devices ascertain only the historical background and the level of development of technologies of that time. The presented instruments comprise 2 stationary ones from the City Observatory; 7 stationary instruments from the Suburban Observatory. They	ICOMOS considers that this statement re-iterates arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and the additional information that have been fully considered.
		are all preserved intact. Moreover, as	
		noted, some of them are the only	
		surviving ones.	
p. 424, col.	The selection of	The components of the KFU	ICOMOS considers that this
1, ln. 57-	component parts is not	Astronomical Observatories clearly	reflects a difference of
58; col. 2,	supported by the	represent their historical, cultural,	opinion and contains

ln. 2-14	comparative analysis	scientific and technological evolution, the	advocacy for the proposals
111. 2 1 1	either Their	gradual development of space and time,	made in the nomination
	functional and	the expansion of astronomical	dossier.
	historical	observations and technologies. The	dossier.
	interrelationship as	continuity and inseparable connection of	
	complementary elements	the two components is also demonstrated	
	of an evolutionary	by the architectural embodiment.	
	process in scientific,	Architectural forms of the English	
	cultural and	landscape park with neoclassical buildings	
	technological terms, is	of the Engelhardt Observatory	
	not clearly explained	demonstrate a continuity with the classical	
	and their selection is	forms and urban design of the City	
	not justified. The fact	Observatory of Kazan University.	
	that they belong to the	Together, these two complexes illustrate a	
	same University and are	significant period in the history of the	
	administratively	formation of scientific and educational	
	connected is not	architectural and landscape complexes.	
	sufficient to justify the series, as each part	The relationship between them manifested itself in stationary and semi-stationary	
	should contribute to the	instruments, the transfer of the traditions	
	proposed Outstanding	of the scientific school and the training of	
	Universal Value of the	personnel and other attributes that testify	
	nominated property as a	to their inseparable unity.	
	whole in a substantial,	The functional connection of the	
	scientific, readily defined	constituent parts is proved by the building	
	and discernible way, as	of KFU telescopes in the North Caucasus	
	prescribed by paragraph	and Turkey, which are presented to	
	137 of the Operational	confirm the continuation of scientific	
	Guidelines for the	observations and knowledge. The City	
	Implementation of the	Astronomical Observatory carries out	
	World Heritage	remote control, management and analysis	
	Convention.	of all data obtained with the telescope	
	Convention.	made in Turkey. Maintenance of the	
		telescope, its modernization is carried out	
		by the KFU employees.	
		The Engelhardt Astronomical	
		Observatory carries out remote control,	
		management and analysis of data obtained	
		with the telescopes at the North Caucasus	
		Astronomical Station. Maintenance of the	
		telescope, its modernization is carried out	
		by the KFU employees.	
p. 425, col.	However, it has not	Firstly, it should be noted that the concept	ICOMOS considers that the
1, ln. 44-47	been demonstrated that	of Russia should not be confused with the	statements re-iterate
	any cultural or	modern-day territory of Russia after 1991.	arguments/justification put
	scientific exchange has	The territory of Russia (Russian Empire)	forward in the nomination
	produced an	as of 1914 included part of modern Poland	dossier and the additional
	outstanding creative	(Warsaw Governorate General), Finland	information that have been
	response with a	(8 Finnish provinces), and second in size	fully considered. ICOMOS
	physical or functional	only to the British Empire. The population	also considers that the
	representation.	was about 170 million people of different	statements contain advocacy
		nationalities - more than in any country in	for the proposals made in the
		the world.	nomination dossier.
		By 1991 the territory of Russia (USSR)	
		included the territories of now 15	
		independent countries and was the largest	
		and most multinational country in the	
		world.	
		Thus, Kazan University and its	
		Observatories played a significant role	

on a global scale.

Secondly, we would like the honourable experts to take into consideration the material widely presented in the Nomination, starting from the founding of the Astronomical School in Kazan and justifying its significant achievements. Here are a few examples:

- 1. M. Kowalski. It can be noted that the City Astronomical Observatory is the only university observatory in Russia that has successfully completed all observations and further processing on the meridian circle to compile the international catalogue of stars of the German (now International) Astronomical Society (4,200 stars, zone 75°–80°).
- 2. Kowalski's important research "About the Proper Motions Laws of the Bradley Catalogue Stars" is devoted to solving a very difficult problem the study of the proper motions of stars. It developed and applied a new method for determining the motion of the solar system in space, now known as the Kowalski-Ehry method. The research also gave a mathematical formulation of the problem of galactic rotation the rotation, the existence of which was finally established only in 1927. It thoroughly refuted the theory of the central position of the Sun in the Galaxy.

Kowalski M. Sur les lois du mouvement propre des etoiles du Catalogue de Bradley // Recherches Astronomique de l'Observatoire // Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. – Vol. 151 (1861). – P. 835.

- 3. Starting with Littrow's observations, intensive work on the observation of astronomical objects continued in the Soviet times. So, with the help of the 6inch "comet detector" Mertz, A. Dubyago discovered two comets in 1921 and 1923. The American astronomer Otto Struve wrote a letter to Dubyago. "Your discoveries of comets and calculations of the orbit are astonishing to the whole world," he wrote. Let me express my best congratulations to you. I am glad that there are people in Russia with enough energy to continue the work of the past generation. I enclose a clipping from the Chicago Tribune, which you may be interested in. It was a photograph of Dubyago with the caption: discoverer of comets Alexander Dubyago, 19 years old, who surprised the astronomical world."
- 4. Studies of comets, the Moon, the Sun,

planets and starry space by Kazan astronomers have been noted by the world community. In 1923, the Commission on the Nomenclature of Astronomical Names of the IAU assigned the names of famous astronomers of Kazan University to the astronomical objects noted in the Nomination. 5. In 1957, the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory introduced stations for the observation of artificial satellites, including the observation of the world's first artificial Earth satellite. After the observations, the data were processed and urgently sent to Moscow to the Centre for the Observation of Artificial Earth Satellites. Without these works, the development of astronautics around the world would have been impossible or shifted in time. 6. Explorations of the Moon, which were carried out in the Kazan observatories: the study of the surface of the Moon and the mapping of the Moon played a very important role in the implementation of lunar programmes, in launching and research with the help of automatic devices such as Lunokhod. 7. The meteor school became one of the leading schools in the USSR and the world, supplemented by radar instruments and measurements. A statistical theory of meteor radar was developed, and the meteor hazard for the Martian missions Phobos-1 and Phobos-2 in 1988 was calculated. p. 425, col. The development of the We believe that all the components of the ICOMOS considers that this nominated property clearly reveal the 2, ln. 16-20 observatories as a unit in reflects a difference of evolutionary, historical, landscape and correlation with the opinion and contains ecological connection. advocacy for the proposals development of sky observations over a given The functional connection between the made in the nomination period is not presented nomination components in scientific and dossier. clearly. **Their functional** educational activities, the transfer of interrelations, traditions of practical observations from typological features of the city to the suburbs, the relocation of the the unit and its meridian circle from the city to the outstanding qualities suburbs, the constant interaction of are not demonstrated students and teachers of the City at this stage. Observatory with the employees of the Suburban Observatory and the smooth flow of theoretical education in the City Observatory into practical classes in the suburbs, resulted in the training of highly qualified astronomers and geodesists, who became famous both in the Russian Empire, the USSR, and in European countries. There are other numerous facts that testify to the inextricable functional connection between the components of the Nomination.

		In fact, these two observatories have	
		always represented a single entity both in	
		scientific research and in the educational	
		process, which take place in two locations.	
		The successive development and integrity	
		of the two components also demonstrates	
		the architectural embodiment. The	
		Suburban Observatory park was created following the generally accepted ideas for	
		public areas at the beginning of the 19th	
		century which were seen as a "natural"	
		landscape that also referred the visitor to	
		the ideas of the Enlightenment expressed	
		in the philosophy of a picturesque English	
		park with the inclusion of classical	
		buildings, temples, tombs, and ramparts.	
p. 425, col.	ICOMOS considers that	The dossier shows in detail that the	ICOMOS considers that this
2, ln. 21-25	criterion (iv) is not	Suburban Observatory is a genuine	reflects a difference of
	justified at this stage	monument that has developed over the	opinion.
	with respect to the	course of a century preserving the general	
	proposed series . ICOMOS considers that	idea and purpose. The integrity is characterized by the preservation of the	
	criterion (iv) may have	complex within its original boundaries,	
	potential to be justified	fixed by a fence, alleys, and other	
	in the case of the Kazan	landscape boundaries, and by the unity of	
	City Astronomical	compositional and stylistic solutions at all	
	Observatory	stages of its development.	
		Each stage emphasizes and develops the	
		idea of the unity of natural and man-made,	
		space and time.	
		The architectural value of the Engelhardt	
		Astronomical Observatory is expressed in the characteristics of the town-planning	
		ensemble comprising buildings of	
		different times, united by a style affiliation	
		based on the philosophy of neoclassicism,	
		built, in turn, on the ideas of the	
		Enlightenment. The unique structure of	
		the Southern Mark, which is a hill-tomb	
		with a chapel-tool on top, is an undoubted	
		metaphor for the possibility of existence	
		outside of time. Pavilions for stationary astronomical	
		instruments demonstrate the highest	
		technical achievements of world	
		engineering at the turn of the 19th and 20th	
		centuries (foundation structures providing	
		the highest seismic stability, sliding domes	
		and enclosing structures, temperature and	
		humidity control).	
		The transformation of the natural landscape into a park ensemble,	
		simultaneously being an astronomical	
		instrument, makes the Engelhardt	
		Astronomical Observatory a unique	
		monument that combines architecture,	
		landscape art, engineering, philosophy	
		and science, which makes it a	
		masterpiece of human genius.	
		Among the neoclassical complexes, the	

Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory occupies a special place as an example of a unique cultural landscape, the first example of an observatory park as an independent genre dating back to the ideas of the Enlightenment. The embodiment of an English landscape park with classical buildings demonstrates a successive connection with the City Observatory of Kazan University. Together, these two complexes illustrate a significant period in the history of the formation of public architectural and landscape complexes. The site inspired the formation of similar complexes in the world. p. 426, col. The Engelhardt The territorial development ICOMOS considers that the 1, ln. 25-30 Zelenodolsky district of the Republic of re-iterate Astronomical corrections Tatarstan and its constituent settlements is arguments put forward in the Observatory is in the determined by a number of documents of nomination dossier and the suburban area, with active development of urban planning documentation: additional information that the neighbouring territorial planning scheme of have been fully considered. settlements and transport Zelenodolsky district, master plans for the settlements of Oktyabrsky, Orekhovka, routes. Their also contains development may have information that cannot be etc. an impact on the setting All these documents are approved and taken account of at this stage. the nominated have the force of law; they clearly indicate of property and, therefore, the boundaries of territorial growth, which are also protected by the Forest Code of its integrity. the Russian Federation, which excludes the possibility of transferring lands occupied by the forest fund to lands for other purposes. The buffer zone of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory covers the territory of the forest. Construction on the lands of the forest fund is strictly prohibited. Construction on the territory of Oktyabrsky and Orekhovka settlements is limited by the established urban planning regulations. In addition, a special document, the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan dated November 24, 2022 No. 1258, approved the protection zones of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory, land use regimes and requirements for town-planning regulations, which apply to the entire territory of the buffer zone of the nominated site and to the adjacent territory of settlements. This document establishes additional restrictions (prohibition and restriction of construction and reconstruction in height, requirements for the angle of inclination of the roof, the use of traditional finishing materials, etc.) in order to exclude the negative impact of the potential development of the territory around the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory on

		the complex of the nominated site.	
		It is also necessary to take into account that	
		by nominating a property to the UNESCO	
		World Heritage List, a country-party to the	
		Convention assumes additional	
		obligations to ensure its safety and	
		integrity.	
		Under Russian law, the buffer zones of a	
		property inscribed on the World Heritage	
		List, and regimes that ensure its protection	
		from potential negative impacts, are	
		approved at the level of national	
		legislation. Thus, inscription on the	
		World Heritage List will provide the	
		necessary protection against the threats	
		caused by the processes of urban	
		planning and transport development.	
p. 426, col.	the recently-built	The basis of the complex is the	ICOMOS considers that this
1, ln. 12-16	planetarium which could	Observatory building located in the centre	reflects a difference of
1, 111. 12-10	be considered as a	of the site with the pavilions of the	opinion.
	development of the place	refractor, meridian circle and marks	opinion.
	in line with its historic	related to them (structures for adjusting	
	function but which still	the meridian circle), the heliometer	
	constitutes an	pavilion, the building of the meteor	
	important alteration to	department, the library, and the	
	the historic	administrative building.	
	composition of the	The refractor pavilion, the Observatory	
	park,	building, the pavilion of the meridian	
	park,	circle and the perpendicular set by the	
		northern and southern marks, located	
		along the west-east axis, create a semantic	
		and compositional basis to which all other	
		components of the complex are	
		subordinated. In continuation of the	
		compositional logic of the complex, the	
		building of the Planetarium was placed at	
		the end of the north-south perspective,	
		adjusted by the direction of the meridian	
		circle towards the marks.	
		The Planetarium building is far removed	
		from the central observation field	
		surrounded by the main large historical	
		buildings of the complex, the Tomb-Mark	
		and pavilions with instruments, which still	
		play the role of the main compositional,	
		functional and semantic dominant.	
		The perspective, which the Planetarium	
		closes, only complements the main	
		compositional axis "west-east",	
		connecting the main entrance to the	
		territory with the observation field through	
		a linden alley and directed to the	
		heliometer pavilion. The Planetarium	
		building stands apart from the main	
		axis; it is not part of the historical	
		scenario and cannot be interpreted as	
		"dominant space and function".	
		An additional compositional axis	
		connecting the central part of the complex	
		of the Engelhardt Astronomical	
	ı		1

		Observatory (observation field) with the	
		main entrance to the pavilion of the	
		Planetarium, emphasizes and develops the	
		idea of the unity of natural and man-made,	
		space and time.	
		Thus, the original idea has been	
		developed throughout the whole period	
		keeping the ideas embedded in it. Both	
		in terms of composition and functionality,	
		the Planetarium is not the main point of	
		attraction, but only supplements the main	
		role of the Astronomical Observatory	
		complex, first of all, being a scientific and	
		educational institution with scientific and	
		educational programmes for a wide range	
		of visitors.	
n 426 asl	The city component part		ICOMOS considers that this
p. 426, col. 1, ln. 21-25	The city component part is located within a	The visual and compositional landscape analysis of the influence of this building	
1, 111. 41-43	densely built-up part of	on the City Astronomical Observatory	reflects a difference of opinion.
	the town. The high-rise	showed that the high-rise building of the	оринон.
	building from the 1970s,	KFU educational building affects the	
	located in the direct	panorama of the city from the Volga. It	
	vicinity of the nominated	does not exert urban pressure on the	
	property, that houses the	perception of the building of the City	
	Institute of Physics of	Observatory, since when the public is	
	KFU, has a detrimental	near the Observatory, the lower two-story	
	impact on the visual	part of the high-rise building is located on	
	integrity of this	the red building line and is perceived in a	
	component part.	row of comparable buildings along	
	component part.	Astronomicheskaya Street. The	
		southwestern horizon, which was and still	
		is important for astronomical	
		observations, is not covered by a high-rise	
		building and is generally located in the so-	
		called 'shadow' side of the observation	
		horizon.	
		The public will perceive the high-rise	
		building surrounded by the City	
		Observatory and the University complex	
		only if they raise their eyes high to the sky,	
		much higher than the natural angle of human vision.	
n 426 aa1	The nomination dession	The nomination dossier demonstrates that	ICOMOS considers that the
p. 426, col.	The nomination dossier does not offer a		
1, ln. 31-35		the inscription of the City Astronomical Observatory and the Suburban	corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the
	=	· ·	nomination dossier and the
	rationale for the selection of the	Astronomical Observatory as the component parts in the serial nomination	additional information that
	component parts,	is justified by the fact that each of them,	have been fully considered.
	component parts,	is justifica by the fact that each of them,	
	• • •		ICOMOS also considers that
		despite their direct continuity, reflects	ICOMOS also considers that
	• •	despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development	this reflects a difference of
	• •	despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of	
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations.	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of astronomy, cartography, magnetic	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of astronomy, cartography, magnetic observations, to the establishment of	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of astronomy, cartography, magnetic observations, to the establishment of methods for calculating the orbits of small	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of astronomy, cartography, magnetic observations, to the establishment of methods for calculating the orbits of small planets and binary stars, to determining	this reflects a difference of
		despite their direct continuity, reflects only a certain stage in the development of astronomy during the period of optical visual observations. The City Observatory made a significant contribution to the development of astronomy, cartography, magnetic observations, to the establishment of methods for calculating the orbits of small	this reflects a difference of

	1		
		etc. The solution of these tasks was within the short 50-year period allowed by history before the development of urban lighting. The main areas of scientific activity of the Suburban Astronomical Observatory observatories have always been astrophysics, celestial mechanics, meteor astronomy, astronomy, geophysics of the Earth, i.e. areas of research characteristic of the 20th and early 21st centuries. Outstanding scientists consistently worked in both the City and the Suburban observatories.	
p. 426, col. 2, ln. 37-	the buffer zone (of component part 001)	The tearing out of one observatory would interrupt this scientific circle, either in theory or in practice violating, respectively, the overall research result. Currently, the urban protection of the City Astronomical Observatory, as a cultural	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate
38.	should be formally adopted.	heritage site of federal significance within the Kazan University complex, is provided by the protection zones of the Kazan Kremlin Ensemble approved by the Order of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation dated July 28, 2020 No. 845, the territory of which covers most of the historical centre of Kazan. According to Russian legislation, the buffer zones of a World Cultural and Natural Heritage property, with regimes that ensure its protection from potential negative impacts, are approved at the level of national legislation after a decision is made by the UNESCO World Heritage Committee to inscribe the property in the List.	arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and the additional information that have been fully considered.
p. 426, col. 2, ln. 50-53	The protection zone (of component part 002) should introduce restrictions for the height of new developments, but the regulations are not fully in force.	Protection zones of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory, land use regimes and requirements for town planning regulations were approved by the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Tatarstan No. 1258 dated November 24, 2022. All the regimes and restrictions that prohibit and limit construction and reconstruction in height, requirements for the angle of inclination of the roof, the use of traditional finishing materials and landscaping on the territory of the buffer zone of the nominated property and beyond came into force on the day the resolution was signed. In addition, the Forest Code of the Russian Federation establishes a ban on construction and on the transfer of forest fund lands to lands for other purposes. It should be noted that the buffer zone covers the territory of the forest.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

1, in. 21-28 City Astronomical Significance, the building of the Kazam a legally protected monument at the federal level, includes the whole territory of the KFU and matches the boundaries of the proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the component part. At the same time, the monument at the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the component at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430				
Observatory building, as a legally protected monument at the federal level, includes the whole territory of the KFU and matches the boundaries of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. P. 428, col. 1, In. 34-36 P. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 P. 428, col. 1, In. 51-50 P. 428, col. 1, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 1, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 1, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 1, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 D. 428, col. 1, In. 56-10 D. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 D. 430, col. 1, In. 51-10 D. 4	p. 428 col.	the territory of the Kazan	Being a cultural heritage site of federal	ICOMOS considers that the
a legally protected monument at the federal significance. Between the houndaries of the component part, as the co	1, ln. 21-28	3		
monument at the federal level, includes the whole territory of the KFU and matches the boundaries of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. l. (EAO) is also designated as monument of urban planning and architecture of federal spinificance. p. 428, col. l. (EAO) is also designated as monument of urban planning and architecture of federal level. p. 428, col. l. There is no overall management of the nominated serial property p. 428, col. Simultaneously, the observatories, notwithstanding being part of the same University, and the developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, the observatories, notwithstanding being of the exchange between Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, the observatories of the Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, difference of global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, and the observatories, notwithstanding being of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, die object of the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, die object of the competencies is central proper simulating of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. Simultaneously, die object of the competencies is central proper simulation of the same University, are undoes the competencies in the University of the competencies in the		Observatory building, as		
level, includes the whole territory of the KFU and matches the boundaries of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part. At the same time, the component part. At the same time, the mounter at the component part as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 P. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 P. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 P. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 P. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 P. 428, col. 1, ln. 54-10 P. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 P			_	
territory of the KFU and matches the boundaries of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. l. t. (EAO) is also designated as a monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. The restablishment or federal significance in the Unified State Register of Cultural Heritage Sites of the Peoples of the Russian Federation, (registry number 161610773750036). The establishment or change of the boundaries of the territory of a cultural heritage site cannot affect its conservation status. The Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory is under state protection as a cultural heritage site of regional importance (registry number of federal significance). There is no overall management of the nominated serial property p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 4, ln. 56-107 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-		monument at the federal		
matches the boundaries of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 1, ln. 34-36 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 34-36 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 51-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 51-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 51-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 54-57 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 54-57 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 54-10 p. 4		level, includes the whole	RSFSR No. 1327 dated 30.08.1960. It is	information that have been
of the proposed buffer zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 54-50 p. 429, col. 2, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 1, ln. 54-50 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 54-50 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 4, ln. 56-57 D. 428, col. 5, ln. 56-57 D. 429, col. 6, ln. 6, ln		•		fully considered.
zone for the nominated component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 There is no overall management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col.			• •	
component part. At the same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 1, ln. 34-36 2, ln. 56-57 2, ln. 56-57 2, ln. 56-57 3, ln. 56-57 3, ln. 56-57 4, ln. 56-57 4, ln. 56-57 4, ln. 56-57 5, ln. 5				
same time, the boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 4, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 4, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 5, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 6, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 3, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 4, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 5, ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 6, ln. 56-57 ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 56-57 ln. 56-57 ln. 56-57 ln. 56-57 ln. 56-57 p. 428, col. 1, ln. 56-57 ln				
boundaries of the component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 1, ln. 34-36 2, ln. 56-57 2, ln. 56-57 3, ln. 56-57 4, ln. 56-57 5, ln. 56-57 5, ln. 56-57 6, ln.				
Component part, as they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. P. 428, col. 1, In. 34-36 Col. 2, In. 56-57 P. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 Col. 3, In. 56-57 P. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 P. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 P. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 P. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 P. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 P. 43		*		
they are proposed, are in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. It (EAO) is also designated as a monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. There is no overall management of the nominated serial property p. 428, col. 2, in 56-57 p. 428, col. 3				
in contradiction to the legal recognition of the monument at the federal level. p. 428, col. 1, In. 34-36 legignated as a monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 management of the nominated serial property p. 428, col. 3, In. 56-57 management of the nominated serial property p. 428, col. 4, In. 56-57 management of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the management of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the management of the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 legislated as a monument of the Management is carried out by the Rectorate of Kazan Federal University, a were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. 1. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): Al. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
P. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 The is no overall management of the nominated property				
p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 The Eagelhardt Astronomical designated as monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 There is no overall management of the nominated property Section 1, ln. 5-10 P. 430, col.				
p. 428, col. 1, In. 34-36 designated as monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, In. 56-57 management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, In. 5-1				
p. 428, col. 1, ln. 34-36 designated as a a monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 Phere is no overall management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 440, col. 2, ln. 56-57 observatory: a well as by the Institute of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. There is no overall management is carried out by the monitation dossier and the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430,				
1, ln. 34-36 designated as monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 56-67 moniversity, as well as by the Institute of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. There is no overall management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-1	120			YG0.10G
monument of urban planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 There is no overall management of the nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1,		` /	\mathcal{E}	_
planning and architecture of federal significance. p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 56-57 notwithstanding being part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. He Russian Revolution. importance (registry number out by the Rectorate of Wazan Federal University, as well as by the Institute of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-	1, In. 34-36			clarification.
p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 There is no overall management of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 56-57 development of the libroric contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. There is no overall management of the large libroric contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmæev. "Barium abundances in cood dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
p. 428, col. 2, ln. 56-57 management of the nominated nominated property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 56-57 motivithstanding part of the developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. P. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 3, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 Simultaneously, the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-		1 0		
2, ln. 56-57 management of the nominated serial property p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 450, col. 1, ln. 5-10 part of the observatories, notwithstanding part of the developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Rectorate of Kazan Federal University, as well as by the Institute of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-	n 428 col			ICOMOS considers that the
nominated property nominated property serial property as well as by the Institute of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5-10 part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. New York Part of the Soviet and post-Soviet notwithstanding being part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. New York Part of Physics of KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of the Directorate of the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet notwithstanding being part of the Some Astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-	-			
Property KFU and its structural subdivisions created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory.	2, III. 30-37			
created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 3, ln. 5-10 part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Russia Revolution. Created in accordance with the competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
competencies, i.e. the Department of Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5-10 part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Russia and Europe after the Susian Revolution. Competencies, i.e. the Department of the Engelhardt Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-		property		
Astronomy and Geodesy and the Directorate of the Engelhardt Astronomical Observatory. p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 3, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 3, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 4, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 5, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 5, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 6, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, ln. 5, ln. 5		ļ		
p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 2, loservatories, notwithstanding being part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. But the district of the same University were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. But the district of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				have been runy considered.
p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 simultaneously, the observatories, notwithstanding part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Astronomical Observatory. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-		ļ	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
p. 430, col. 1, ln. 5-10 Simultaneously, the observatories, notwithstanding being part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Russia Revolution. There is a conceptual factual error in the assessment of the Soviet and post-Soviet period of development of the Kazan Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-			E .	
observatories, notwithstanding being part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-	p. 430, col.	Simultaneously, the		ICOMOS considers that this
part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
part of the same University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Astronomical School. Here are just a few results demonstrating the involvement of Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-	,			
University, were developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				·F
developed in different historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Kazan astronomers in world science through articles in scientific journals and their wide citation (demand): Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-		-	· ·	
historic contexts due to global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-			_	
global geopolitical shifts which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
which led to a limiting of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. Ade, Peter AR, et al. "Planck 2013 results. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
of the exchange between Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. I. Overview of products and scientific results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
Russia and Europe after the Russian Revolution. results." Astronomy & Astrophysics 571 (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
the Russian Revolution. (2014): A1. They are authors from over 100 organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
organizations worldwide. According to the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-		the Russian Revolution.	(2014): A1.	
the Scopus database, there are 2,846 references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
references to this article (19.06.2023). Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
Mashonkina, L., T. Gehren, and I. Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
Bikmaev. "Barium abundances in cool dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
dwarf stars as a constraint to s-and r-				
			process nucleosynthesis." Astronomy and	
Astrophysics, v. 343, p. 519-530 (1999) –				
it is an example of cooperation with				
Germany. According to the Scopus				
database, there are 98 references to this				
article (19.06.2023).				
A review of solar and lunar research at the				
EOA from 1948 to 2005 is presented in the			EOA from 1948 to 2005 is presented in the	

research paper: Rizvanov, N.G., Nefed'ev, Y.A. and Kibardina, M.I., 2007. Research on selenodesy and dynamics of the Moon in Kazan. Solar System Research, 41(2), pp.140-149. There are about 70 references to the article of Kazan astronomers.

It is important to remember that the USSR included 15 now independent countries, and the CMEA/OVD countries included 7 more European countries (Czechoslovakia is now two countries), Mongolia and Cuba. Literature published in the USSR, including that published in the EAO and Kazan University, was available in all these countries. Materials on astronomy were available as well. Astronomers who graduated from Kazan University were working in the above-mentioned countries. Articles were written by Kazan astronomers in journals published in Russian, but their translated versions in English were available in all educational institutions and libraries in the world (such as the Astronomical Journal, Letters to the Astronomical Journal, Astronomical Bulletin, etc.). The Panel hasn't noted the role of the Observatories in the study of comets, observations of the entry of the first man into space, the study of not only the Sun, but also the planets of the solar system and other important world discoveries.



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Suriname

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Jodensavanne Archaeological Site: Jodensavanne Settlement and Cassipora Creek Cemetery

RELEVANT ADVISORY BODY'S EVALUATION: ICOMOS

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 480, right column, line 16-17	The settlement, located on high ground in the densely forested frontier zone amidst Indigenous territory, was inhabited, owned, and governed by Jews who lived there with free and enslaved persons of African descent.	The settlement, located on high ground in the densely forested frontier zone amidst Indigenous territory, was inhabited, owned, and governed by Jews who lived there with free and enslaved persons of African and Indigenous descent.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not reflect the information provided at earlier stages in the nomination dossier. The phrasing, as suggested by ICOMOS, is based on the draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value submitted in the nomination dossier.
Page 482, left column, lines 4-5	Based on the nomination dossier, the key attributes of the nominated property are the archaeological remains of the Jodensavanne Settlement, including the ruins of the Beraha VeSalom synagogue and other buildings, military repository, boat landing sites, natural springs, Ceiba trees, sand pit, Jewish cemetery, and African-Creole cemetery, and the Beth Haim Velho cemetery at Cassipora Creek.	Based on the nomination dossier, the key attributes of the nominated property are the archaeological remains of the Jodensavanne Settlement, including the ruins of the Beraha VeSalom synagogue and other buildings, military post and Cordonpad, boat landing sites, natural springs, Ceiba trees, sand pit, Jewish cemetery, and African-Creole cemetery, and the Beth Haim Velho cemetery at Cassipora Creek.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification, but suggests the following wording: " military post and a small section of the military defense line Cordonpad,"
Page 487, Left column, lines 26-30	In this context, it is important to recognise that the history of the nominated property is complex and that, while there seems to be general interest, it remains unclear as to what degree the nomination is supported by the	During the ICOMOS Technical Mission representatives of the plantation boards of neighboring plantation Ayo and Carolina, who are descendants of the enslaved people, have stated that they supported the nomination.	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

Page 487, right column, Lines 51-52	descendants of the formerly enslaved peoples. Located on the densely forested banks of the Suriname River, the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site in northern Suriname is a serial property with two component parts that illustrate early Jewish colonisation attempts in the New World.	Furthermore, in the board of the Jodensavanne Foundation are also two descendants of the formerly enslaved peoples with roots in Jodensavanne. Located on the densely forested banks of the Suriname River, the Jodensavanne Archaeological Site in northern Suriname is a serial property with two component parts that illustrate early Jewish colonisation attempts in the AtlanticWorld .	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not reflect the information provided at earlier stages in the nomination dossier. ICOMOS notes that, the expression "New World" in this context is used in the draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value submitted in the nomination dossier (e.g. ND, p. 13).
Page 488, left column, lines 12-13	Located amidst Indigenous territory, the settlements were inhabited, owned, and governed by Jews who lived there together with free and enslaved persons of African descent.	Located amidst Indigenous territory, the settlements were inhabited, owned, and governed by Jews who lived there together with free and enslaved persons of African and Indigenous descent.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not reflect the information provided at earlier stages in the nomination dossier. The phrasing, as suggested by ICOMOS, is based on the draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value submitted in the nomination dossier.
Page 488, left column, lines 20-21	Criterion (iii): The Jodensavanne Archaeological Site is an exceptional testimony within the Atlantic Sephardic diaspora of a Jewish civilisation that was granted territorial and communal autonomy, a Jewish 'state within a state' that existed successfully from the 17th to the 19th century.	Criterion (iii): The Jodensavanne Archaeological Site is an exceptional testimony within the Atlantic Sephardic diaspora of a Jewish civilisation that was granted territorial and communal autonomy, a Jewish 'state within a state' that existed from the 17th to the 19th century in a slave society and a frontier zone.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 488, left column, lines 25-29	Furthermore, the archaeological evidence at the settlement and cemeteries points towards a coexistence of different cultures and ethnocultural groups, including Jews, Indigenous peoples, enslaved Africans, and European colonists.	Furthermore, the archaeological evidence at the settlement and cemeteries points towards a coexistence and collision of different cultures and ethnocultural groups, including Jews, Indigenous peoples, enslaved Africans, and European colonists.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification, but suggests the following wording: " points towards differing degrees of coexistence and conflict between cultures"



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S) PARTY(IES): Thailand

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: The Ancient Town of Si Thep

RELEVANT ADVISORY BODY'S EVALUATION: ICOMOS

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
Page 379	The Si Thep Historical Park	Correction:	ICOMOS accepts
Paragraph 12	Office is further supported by	The Si Thep Historical Park Office is	this correction as a
Line 7	the professional expertise of	further supported by the professional	factual error.
	the Fine Arts Department and	expertise of the Fine Arts Department. and	
	of the Office of Natural	of the Office of Natural Resources and	
	Resources and Environmental	Environmental Policy and Planning	
	Policy and Planning (ONEP).	(ONEP).	
Page 379	ONEP is responsible for the	Correction:	ICOMOS accepts
Paragraph 13	preparation of the	ONEP The Fine Arts Department is	this correction as a
Line 1	management plan.	responsible for the preparation of the	factual error.
		management plan.	
		Explanation:	
		The nomination property and its areas	
		have been protected under the Act on Ancient Monuments, Antiques, Objects	
		of Art and National Museum, B.E. 2504	
		(1961) and its Amendment (No.2) B.E.	
		2535 (1992) and has been registered in the	
		ancient monument registration by the Fine	
		Arts Departments. The protection	
		activities have been implemented by	
		government agencies at all level, with the	
		Fine Arts Department, Ministry of Culture	
		overseeing overall protection and	
		management of the Ancient Town of Si	
		Thep and enforcing the relevant	
		legistration.*	
		(*Pages 12 13 and 357 of the Nomination	
		Document) The management plan is aligned with	
		Thailand's 20-year National Strategy,	
		especially with regard to the culture aspect	
		under a portfolio on the Ministry of	
		Culture.**	
		(**Page 355 of the Nomination	
		Document)	

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
		Explanation: (Con.) overseeing overall protection and management of the Ancient Town of Si Thep and enforcing the relevant legistration.* (*Pages 12 13 and 357 of the Nomination Document) The management plan is aligned with Thailand's 20-year National Strategy, especially with regard to the culture aspect under a portfolio on the Ministry of Culture.** (**Page 355 of the Nomination Document)	



FORM FOR THE SUBMISSION OF FACTUAL ERRORS IN THE ADVISORY BODIES EVALUATIONS

(in compliance with Paragraph 150 of the Operational Guidelines)

STATE(S)	PARTY((IES)): Türkiye
----------	--------	-------	------------

EVALUATION OF THE NOMINATION OF THE SITE: Medieval Mosques of Anatolia with Wooden Posts and Upper Structure

RELEVANT ADVISORY BODY'S EVALUATION: ICOMOS

Page, column, line of the Advisory Body Evaluation	Sentence including the factual error (the factual error should be highlighted in bold)	Proposed correction by the State Party	Comment (if any) by the Advisory Body and/or the World Heritage Centre
433, Right, 32- 35	Next to the minaret and attached to the west wall is a small brickdomed building (Sölpük Masjid) with a floor raised one metre above the mosque floor.	Next to the minaret and attached to the southeast wall is a small brickdomed building (Sölpük Masjid) with a floor raised one metre above the mosque floor.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
434, Left, 8-10	It is accessed through a crowned gate in the northeast façade and small entrances in the east and west walls.	It is accessed through a crowned gate in the north façade and small entrances in the east and west walls.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.