



unesco

World Heritage Convention

45 COM

WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add
Paris, 5 September 2023
Original: English

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

**INTERGOVERNMENTAL COMMITTEE FOR THE PROTECTION
OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

**Extended forty-fifth session
Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia
10 - 25 September 2023**

Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List

Summary

This Addendum presents nominations evaluated in compliance with Decision **18 EXT.COM 4**.

Decisions required:

The Committee is requested to examine the recommendations and Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraph 153 of the Operational Guidelines, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) sites which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) sites which it **decides not to inscribe** on the World Heritage List;
- (c) sites whose consideration is **referred**;
- (d) sites whose consideration is **deferred**.

1. In the text below, ICOMOS Recommendations are presented in the form of Draft Decisions and are based on document WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add.
2. Though the Draft Decisions are based on ICOMOS Recommendations, in some cases few modifications were required to adapt them to this document.

Disclaimer

The Nomination files produced by the States Parties are published by the World Heritage Centre at its website and/or in working documents in order to ensure transparency, access to information and to facilitate the preparations of comparative analysis by other nominating States Parties.

The sole responsibility for the content of each Nomination file lies with the State Party concerned. The publication of the Nomination file does not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever of the World Heritage Committee or of the Secretariat of UNESCO concerning the history or legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its boundaries.

I.A NOMINATIONS EVALUATED IN COMPLIANCE WITH DECISION 18 EXT.COM 4

A.1 AFRICA

Property	Memorial sites of the Genocide: Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero
ID. N°	1586
State Party	Rwanda
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(vi)

See Addendum: WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add

Draft Decision: 45 COM 8B.51

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Defers the examination of the nomination of the **Memorial sites of the Genocide: Nyamata, Murambi, Gisozi and Bisesero, Rwanda**, in order to allow the State Party, with the advice of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, if requested, to:*
 - a) *Provide a wider historical and geocultural framework to allow a broader understanding of the context of the Genocide and its impacts and outcomes at regional and global levels, in order to frame and strengthen a justification for Outstanding Universal Value that would support a serial approach and a rationale for the selection of the component parts that would provide a complete understanding of the events,*
 - b) *Provide further details and documentation on how narratives of the event from all sides have been gathered and collated, and how they are contributing to the ongoing, long-term reconciliation process,*
 - c) *Develop an interpretation and presentation plan for the component parts that embraces a diversity of voices, with the complete history explained at each nominated component site and their present-day meaning;*

3. Considers that any revised nomination would need to be considered by an expert mission to the site;
4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Documenting and preparing a baseline for the conservation, management and monitoring of the component parts of the nominated serial property,
 - b) Adopting the designation of the component parts as national cultural heritage,
 - c) Updating the management plan including disaster risk management protocols and a visitor and interpretation strategy that is participatory and inclusive of all relevant actors,
 - d) Incorporating Heritage Impact Assessments into the planning framework of the buffer zones and wider setting of the nominated property,
 - e) Developing a monitoring system that includes key indicators that are related to the key attributes and main threats.

A.2 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Property	Funerary and memory sites of the First World War (Western Front)
ID. N°	1567 Rev
States Parties	Belgium / France
Criteria proposed by States Parties	(iii)(iv)(vi)

See Addendum: WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add

Draft Decision: 45 COM 8B.52

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the nomination of the **Funerary and memory sites of the First World War (Western Front), Belgium, France**, back to the States Parties in order to allow them to:
 - a) Reduce the selection of component parts of the nominated series to focus on funerary sites and exclude the memorials which do not include tangible evidence of the event being commemorated, and are not clearly linked with cemeteries and their design; the component parts that only reflect national values; the component parts that were created for and are associated with different events than the First World War; the component parts that do not contribute to the justification for inscription; and the component parts that exhibit less attributes, or which do not meet the conditions of authenticity and integrity,
 - b) Refocus the justification for inscription on the way the ensemble of funerary sites represents a tangible and outstanding response to an event of outstanding universal significance, the First World War, a significant period of human history with long-lasting impacts on individuals, communities, societies and nations across the world, under revised formulations for criteria (iv) and (vi),
 - c) Protect all component parts through national designations in accordance with the current heritage legislation,
 - d) Adjust the boundaries of the following nominated component parts as follows:

i) *Belgium:*

- *Enlarge the boundaries of component part WA02 Robermont Military plots to also include the burial grounds and tombs of the German soldiers,*
- *Reduce the boundaries of component part WA06 Enclosure of the Executed in Tamines to include only the cemetery,*

ii) *France:*

- *Revise the boundaries of component parts PC03 Canadian National Memorial "Vimy Memorial", PC04 Commonwealth Military Cemetery "Canadian Cemetery n°2" and PC05 Commonwealth Military Cemetery "Givenchy Road Canadian Cemetery" and merge them to form one single component part to cover part or the entirety of the Vimy Ridge National Historic Site of Canada,*
- *Exclude the civil cemetery from component part ND04 German Military Cemetery of la Route de Solesmes and Commonwealth "Cambrai East Military Cemetery" and retain only the two military cemeteries,*
- *Modify the buffer zone of component parts PC07 French National Necropolis of la Targette and Commonwealth Military Cemetery "La Targette British Cemetery", and PC08 La Maison Blanche German Military Cemetery to include also component part PC09 Czechoslovakian Military Cemetery of Neuville-Saint-Vaast, as it is part of the same memorial sector,*

- e) *Sign and operationalise the Framework Agreement prepared by the State Party of France among all relevant actors for the management of the French section of the nominated serial property,*
- f) *Adopt a common conservation and management approach that safeguards the specificity of each component part and reinforces their capacity to convey the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated serial property,*
- g) *Strengthen the transnational coordination and cooperation in management,*
- h) *Develop a common transnational interpretation strategy for the nominated serial property that incorporates narratives related to the tribute paid during the First World War by the nations formerly colonised by European countries;*

3. *Recommends that the States Parties give consideration to the following:*

- a) *Involving in the conservation and maintenance of the nominated component parts heritage experts and conservators to align maintenance activities with heritage good practices,*
- b) *Establishing protection mechanisms for the wider setting of the nominated component parts to prevent or reduce impacts from energy and transport infrastructure development,*
- c) *Regulating the speed of vehicles where roads run close to nominated cemeteries to reduce risks and disturbance to the experience of these sites,*
- d) *Improving the monitoring of the nominated serial property to reduce and avoid vandalism or theft,*
- e) *Improving collaboration on documentation to develop a coherent system of documentation,*
- f) *Developing a common transnational monitoring system, based on the attributes of the nominated property and on the same set of indicators, that would allow for a joint periodical evaluation of the state of conservation of the nominated serial property.*

A.3 LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

Property	ESMA Museum and Site of Memory – Former Clandestine Center of Detention, Torture and Extermination
ID. N°	1681
State Party	Argentina
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(vi)

See Addendum: WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add

Draft Decision: 45 COM 8B.53

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC/23/45.COM/8B.Add and WHC/23/45.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Inscribes **ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination, Argentina**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (vi)**;
3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination is located on the grounds of what was once the Officers' Quarters of the Navy School of Mechanics (ESMA), in the city of Buenos Aires, Argentina.

In the Clandestine Centre installed at the ESMA Officers' Quarters, officers and subordinates belonging to the Argentine Navy kidnapped, tortured, and murdered more than 5,000 people, carried forward a plan to steal babies born in captivity, exercised sexual and gender violence, subjected groups of detained-disappeared persons to forced labour of various kinds, and organised the spoliation of movable and immovable assets of the victims. The systematic and organised exercise of secretly carried out violence by the dictatorship took place as part of a transnational plan of cooperation among dictatorships in the American Southern Cone to fight political left- and communist-oriented armed and non-armed opposition. Due to the transnational implications of these events, in a context of global geo-political tensions between opposing worldviews and socio-political values, the building and operational magnitude, its location in the heart of the city, the coexistence of naval officers and detained-disappeared persons and the variety and complexity of the crimes committed, ESMA Clandestine Centre transcended its political and geographical borders to turn into an international and emblematic symbol representing the characteristics of the enforced disappearance of persons, considered today as a crime against humanity by the United Nations.

Criterion (vi): *The ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination is closely and tangibly associated with, and highly representative of, the illegal repression of armed and non-armed opponents and dissenters carried out and coordinated by the dictatorships of Latin America in the 1970s-1980s on the grounds of the enforced disappearance of persons, in a climate of global geopolitical tensions between opposing worldviews about the world's socio-political order.*

Integrity

The property contains all the strata which clearly explain its historical-constructive evolution, necessary to understand its Outstanding Universal Value. The building has been protected as judicial evidence since 1998 owing to the crimes against humanity

committed there during the operations of the Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination. From then on, any kind of modification was prohibited. The Argentine Navy vacated and handed down the building in 2004. Until 2014, only maintenance and deterioration arrest works were performed. From 2014 to 2015, the works to create and open the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory were carried out with scrupulous respect for the preservation of the state of the building, as it was at the time of its decommissioning, and its status as judicial evidence. At present, different marks and vestiges denoting the stay of the detained-disappeared at the place are preserved. The building today displays the inalterability conditions necessary to continue with studies which may allow access to new judicial evidence. Furthermore, it represents a documentary source for the historical reconstruction of the events which took place there.

Authenticity

The property's structure, spatial configuration, coatings, and marks of the various constructive alterations and uses over time allow to understand its own history and evolution and convey in a credible manner the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. The validation of the building as judicial evidence in the trials for crimes against humanity committed there is based upon the recognition of the authenticity of the facilities and the veracity of the testimonies referring to such events and confirms the property's tangible and close association with those events. The conservation and restoration protocols applied for the installation of ESMA Museum and Site of Memory were jointly endorsed by experts in such matters, by an Advisory Council made up of representatives of Human Rights organisations and by the judicial body. Nowadays, all the conservation and restoration measures of the building are based upon scientific studies carried forward in order to preserve it by virtue of its dual nature of judicial evidence and documentary source.

The tangible attributes of the property which reflect its Outstanding Universal Value are complemented and reinforced by the painstaking and early activated process to ascertain facts and seek justice in relation to the criminal events that took place during the dictatorships at the hands of the military led to the first Trial of the Military Juntas in 1985 by a civil court. This trial and the following mega-cases have produced overwhelming evidence of what happened at ESMA. The Officers' Quarter was protected as judicial evidence for the trials. The process of seeking truth and justice is still ongoing and shall form the basis of a robust reconciliation process.

Protection and management requirements

Various legal and institutional protection measures cover the property and its buffer zone for the preservation of its Outstanding Universal Value. Legally speaking, the building has been protected since 1998 under an injunction to maintain the status quo in its capacity as judicial evidence. Additionally, the Court continuously issues specific provisions on the topics concerning the entire building preservation. At the heritage level, in 2008, the property was listed as a National Historic Monument and its buffer zone, made up of the premises destined for the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA), as a National Historic Site. From the institutional point of view, the national decree for the creation of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory - Former Clandestine Centre of Detention, Torture and Extermination sets its administrative role as a decentralised body of the National Secretariat for Human Rights, whose mission is to inform and convey the events which took place in the Clandestine Centre, its precedents and its consequences.

The ESMA Museum and Site of Memory is managed by an executive directorate and has an Advisory Council composed of the same members coming from the Directory of Human Rights organisations belonging to the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights. The Museum and Site of Memory is located within the boundaries of the premises destined for the Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA), which nowadays houses public

institutions and civil society associations with a local, national and regional reach. The Space for Memory and for the Promotion and Defense of Human Rights (former ESMA) is administered by an Executive Body made up of representatives from the National Government, the Autonomous City of Buenos Aires and a Directory integrated by Human Rights organisations.

The long-term sustenance of the Outstanding Universal Value and of the mission of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory to accompany Argentina to fulfil its aspiration that these events will not happen again need the continued commitment of all relevant institutions in presenting what happened during the dictatorship in all its complex precedents and consequences and guaranteeing that the property continues to be the inheritance of all Argentinians so as to become that of the world.

4. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:

- a) *Expanding the buffer zone through a minor boundary modification request or establishing robust protection mechanisms for the plots corresponding to the Raggio Technical School and its Sports field,*
- b) *Exercising close vigilance on any change to planning provisions in the immediate and wider setting of the property that may lead to development incompatible with the sustenance of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,*
- c) *Carrying out an assessment of all buildings and structures located in the buffer zone about the level of protection and conservation policy which would be adequate for each of them in relation to their ability to support the Outstanding Universal Value,*
- d) *Carrying out a systematic review of all risk management measures in place to verify whether inter-agency communication and coordination need strengthening to tackle effectively disaster response,*
- e) *Completing the Strategic Management Plan with a chapter on risk management arrangements and responsible actors to address and respond to specific risks,*
- f) *Submitting for review by the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS the concept and the project for the expansion of the ESMA Museum and Site of Memory in line with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,*
- g) *Ensuring that the interpretation at the Museum and Site of Memory includes expanded information on the Argentinian historic–political context that prepared the advent of the civic-military dictatorship in 1976 and on the background of those imprisoned and tortured at ESMA to ensure that full understanding is achieved that the repression methods used during the dictatorship were unjustifiable, abhorrent state-led crimes,*
- h) *Relocating all visitors-related services of the museum outside the Officers' Casino building at a different premise and keeping the property only as a place for education, remembrance and recollection.*