



**FORMAT FOR THE SUBMISSION OF
STATE OF CONSERVATION REPORTS
BY THE STATES PARTIES**

(in compliance with Paragraph 169 of the *Operational Guidelines*)

Cultural Landscape of Bali Province: the *Subak* System as a Manifestation of the *Tri Hita Karana* Philosophy (Indonesia) (C 1194rev)

1. Executive Summary of the report

The Government of Indonesia has accepted Decision 43 COM 7B.63 adopted by the World Heritage Committee at its 43rd Session and has made priorities follow-up actions to address specific issues:

- A coordinative mechanism to protect and manage the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property
- Effectiveness of Subak Sustainability Incentives
- National Strategic Spatial Planning
- Farmers' participation in the management mechanism
- Development of Heritage Impact Analysis related to rural landscapes
- To implement Heritage Impact Analysis to all developments within the property and its setting, particularly in Subak Jatiluwih of the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru.

Coordinative management is an approach to protect the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province, and the coordination between sectors and regions has been effective. The national-level Coordination Team has implemented activities such as policy coordination, consultation and harmonisation of laws and regulation related to the designation of national strategic areas under the coordination of the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture (PMK). The local and regional-level government offices/agencies (Organisasi Perangkat Daerah) of culture have carried out its guiding function, i.e. in national policy coordination under the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Cultural from 2019 to 2020, in cultural protection coordination under the Ministry of Education and Culture in monitoring and reporting on the state of conservation primarily related to the status of the cultural property and the sustainability of Subak (the Tabanan Office of Culture informs the growing number of Subaks in the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru).

To ensure and monitor the effectiveness of Subak incentives, the Bali Provincial Government established the Customary Community Advancement Office (Dinas Pemajuan Masyarakat Adat), the provincial-level office formed to carry out the directions of the Bali Provincial Regulation Number 4 of 2019 concerning Customary Villages in Bali.

To designate the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province a National Strategic Area, stakeholders responsible for protecting this rural landscape area continued consultation for agreement and harmonisation of the draft presidential regulation on the National Strategic Area Spatial Plan (RTR) for the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province.

To ensure participation of farmers in protection and management, the Coordination Forum established the Subak Council at all levels (Village, Sub-district, Regency/City, and Province) within its structure. The Bali Provincial Regulation Number 9 of 2012 concerning Subak regulates the Subak members' participation, which has increased its legal certainty. Through issuing the Bali Provincial Regulation Number 4 of 2019 concerning Customary Villages in Bali, the sustainability of Subak is an integral part of the village administration and it is the duty of the Subak members/decision-making

assembly (krama) to take part in the village development plan. More than just the agricultural sector part in local government programs, Subak is a customary institution managed under the village government's plan and budget. Subak's sustainability is in the hands of Krama Subak as the Krama Adat.

The elaboration of the cultural property definition of the Cultural Property Area as regulated under Article 10 of the Cultural Property Law governs the development of Heritage Impact Assessment relevant to the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province—rural landscapes, property and settings and its cultural attributes and natural features. Studies, research, and environmental impact analysis could identify the risk of deterioration of cultural property's rural landscapes, cultural and natural elements from the planned use of development within the property and settings under the mandate of Article 86 of the Cultural Property Law.

Regarding the implementation of HIA in Subak Jatiluwih of the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru, the Jatiluwih Village Government has notified the Regent of Tabanan regarding residents' responses to the construction of facility and infrastructure for visitors to Subak Jatiluwih. For this matter, *perbekel* (Village Head), *bendesa pakeraman* (Head of Customary Village), and *pekaseh* (Head of Subak) of Jatiluwih Village issued a Joint Statement. They legalised the text in Jatiluwih Village on 24 September 2018 so that traditionally and under the village government regulation, the people of Jatiluwih Village have full control over the protection and use of Subak Jatiluwih.

2. Response to the Decision of the World Heritage Committee

Referring to Decisions 43 COM 7B.63 adopted by the World Heritage Committee in 2019 for Cultural Landscape of Bali Province: the Subak System as a Manifestation of the Tri Hita Karana Philosophy (Indonesia) (C 1194rev), the Government of Indonesia would like to address the Decision paragraph by paragraph as follows:

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7B,*
2. *Recalling Decisions 38 COM 7B.14, 39 COM 7B.66 and 41 COM 7B.91, adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014), 39th (Bonn, 2015) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions respectively,*
3. *Commends the State Party for progress made in implementing the Committee's previous decisions and the recommendations of the 2015 Advisory mission, and encourages it to continue working to implement effective mechanisms for the management and protection of the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;*
4. *Welcomes in particular the information provided by the State Party concerning the introduction of financial incentives to assist Subak farmers at the district level in 2019 and the financial support provided by the Regencies of Gianyar and Tabanan, and requests that the State Party monitor the effectiveness of all financial support mechanisms, taking all necessary steps to ensure that all subaks within the property have full and equitable access to such incentives;*

Response:

The Government—the National Government, Bali Provincial Government, Tabanan Regency Government, and Gianyar Regency Government—provided financial, physical, and policy supports. All Subaks in respective regencies within the property have received these supports.

- The Tabanan Regency Government provided financial assistance to all Subaks of the Tabanan Regency in the form of Land and Building Tax

relief, special financial assistance, crop insurance, health and death benefits, and organic-fertilizer subsidy. Physical support is in the way of repairing damaged irrigation canals. Another form of support is facilitating the drafting of the written awig-awig subak. Awig-awig is customary legal norms that regulate Subaks. Awig-awig used to be unwritten guidance to manage Subak. However, nowadays, Tabanan District Government assists the krama subak in drafting a written awig-awig. In particular, the subaks of the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru has received additional assistance to carry out ceremonies, to keep the environment clean, and, from the Japanese Government, to build micro-hydroelectric power. The subak which has awig-awig also has perarem (implementing regulations as a result of subak meeting decisions), which regulates various matters related to the sustainability of the subak. Perarem

- The Gianyar Regency Government supports subak in two ways, financial assistance to subsidize organic fertilizers for farmers, establish subak cooperatives, purchase of crops, and providing annual financial support for traditional ceremonies. The Government also provides annual financial support for repair and maintenance of temple buildings and improved irrigation canals. The Gianyar Regency protects three subaks (Pulagan, Kulub Atas, and Kulub Bawah) of the Subak Landscape of the Pakerisan Watershed as part of the conservation of 524 subaks (473 wet subaks and 51 dry subaks) in Gianyar Regency. The regency plans to provide scholarships for children of subak farmers.
- Bali Provincial Government provides financial assistance for all Subaks in Bali province in annual 50 million rupiahs direct financial aid, 10 billion rupiahs annual organic fertilizer assistance, farming insurance, and quality seeds provision. The Government also donates farming equipments (tractors, rice transplanter, and power thresher). The Bali Provincial Government established the Office of Customary Community Advancement, which oversees matters relating to customary community, including subak.

The provincial Office of Culture identifies and facilitates local employment opportunities and professions for Balinese youth, labour, and protection of water sources and agricultural land. The regional Office of Agriculture also empowers cooperatives in Jatiluwih as a part of land ownership mapping.

Every year, the local Government supervised and evaluated these supports to ensure that all subak has received help. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms include Subak Empowerment activities and forming and sending cross-sector teams to each subak existing in each district.

5. *Also welcomes the ongoing designation of the property as a National Strategic Area, and also encourages the State Party to finalize this process as soon as possible;*

Response:

The preparation process of the National Strategic Area Spatial Plan (RTR KSN) for the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province is currently under agreement process with the Regional Government of Bali Province. Relevant Ministries/Agencies and local/regional governments have discussed the RTR KSN content several times. In due course, there will be agreement on the content of the RTR KSN with Bali Provincial Government and the establishment of the Inter-Ministerial Committee (Panitia Antar Kementerian /PAK). By the end of the year, our target is

to complete the draft of the RTR KSN Cultural Landscape of Bali Province and submit it to the Ministry of Law and Human Rights for the harmonisation of regulations.

6. *Notes that further review, assessment and enhancements are planned to strengthen the coordination of the numerous programmes and initiatives that can have an impact on the effectiveness of the management system established for the property, including the functioning of the Coordination Forum and the national Coordination Team, and also requests the State Party to submit reports on the progress and monitoring of these mechanisms, particularly the effectiveness of the participation of subak farmers in decision making and the formal management system for the property;*

Response:

The interagency, inter-sectoral, and inter-regional coordination mechanism for subak management has been effective under the Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Culture from 2019 to 2020. The Coordinating Ministry harmonises and coordinates different policies of the stakeholders. Coordination meetings for the cultural property protection, which focused on monitoring and reporting of the state of conservation of subak also have been organised several times through this mechanism.

- The National Coordination Team and Coordination Forum

The National Coordination Team has held meetings and implemented management coordination directives. The Ministry of Education and Culture prepare the Cultural Property designations located in the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province in stages from the regency/municipal, provincial to national level.

The Ministry of Agriculture arranges and prepares the implementation of financial support (including equipment) to subak farmers' through the Office of Agriculture at the district/municipal level.

This year, the Ministry of Agrarian Affairs and Spatial Planning/National Land Agency (Kemen ATR/BPN) has held several cross-sector meetings and group discussions. The meetings discussed the Draft Presidential Regulation (Raperpres) on National Strategic Areas Spatial Planning (RTR KSN) of Cultural Landscape of Bali Province. This process is part of consultations and harmonisation with stakeholders, which try to achieve agreement in the preparation of the Raperpres on the National Strategic Area of the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province.

The Bali Province Subak Empowerment Team and the Tabanan and Gianyar Regency Governments implemented Subak Empowerment programme as part of the Coordination Forum activities. Coordination has become more effective with the establishment of the Office of Customary Community Advancement of Bali Province, which facilitates management of subak and Customary Villages.

- Management Mechanism Progress and Achievements

The effective management of the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province has increased through active National Coordination Team and various subak empowerment activities by the Office of Culture and the Office of Customary Community Advancement. The supports on finance, policy, and capacity building of human resource go directly to the subak community within the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province and are also received by all subak in Bali. The Regional Government, together with the Central Government, are

strengthening the legal protection of cultural properties located in the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province.

- Effective engagement of krama subak in the formal decision-making process and management system

The Bali Provincial Government issued the Bali Province Regional Regulation Number 9 of 2012 concerning Subak governing the Subak Assembly as a coordination forum. In 2019, the Bali Provincial Government issued the Bali Province Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2019 concerning Customary Villages in Bali, which opens opportunities for Customary Villages to get village income sources to support subak activities.

7. *Further requests the State Party to develop specific Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) mechanisms that are linked to the property's management system and can explicitly address the need for the ongoing protection of the OUV of the inscribed cultural landscape;*

Response:

The Cultural Landscape of Bali Province is protected, among others, by Law Number 11 of 2010 concerning Cultural Property, which in essence elaborates Heritage Impact Assessment.

In 2013, the Central Government prepared Provisions for the Utilisation of National and World Cultural Property to protect the National and World Cultural Property, including the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province, from potential destruction due to utilisation. Designation of the subak system as a World Heritage has increased tourist visits, especially in the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru, the Subak Landscape of Pakerisan Watershed, and other subaks in Bali. It also encouraged the growth of visitor facilities.

Through the Ministry of Education and Culture, the Government of the Republic of Indonesia is preparing and developing technical guidelines on Heritage Impact Assessment. It can be applied in all World Heritage of cultural categories in Indonesia, including the Cultural Landscape of Bali Province.

Guidelines for the Utilisation of National and World Cultural Heritage clearly define the principles and policies and technical measures. Also, the institutional authority boundary becomes clear. It is easy to understand on who can do what, where, when, and how, in a focused and integrated manner. The Cultural Landscape of Bali Province is protected in a coordinative way across sectors and regions. It creates coordinative and integrative actions and a better way of utilising Cultural Property.

8. *Requests furthermore the State Party to conduct HIAs for all new developments within the property and its setting, particularly at Jatiluwih, and submit documentation on all proposed developments and associated HIAs for review by the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies before taking any decision that would be difficult to reverse, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;*

Response:

Nowadays, space utilisation control on subak Jatiluwih of the Subak Landscape of Catur Angga Batukaru has been done customarily by residents of Customary Village (krama Desa Adat) and krama subak Jatiluwih. On 24 September 2018, pekaseh of Jatiluwih Village, bendesa pakeraman Jatiluwih, and pekaseh Jatiluwih Village had issued a joint statement to control development in subak Jatiluwih that are harmful to the beauty of the landscape and destroy cultural values of the

property. Villagers and subak Jatiluwih entirely control and manage the use of Jatiluwih landscape space for tourist visits.

Development in subak Jatiluwih and its settings shall follow environmental impact assessment and relevant regulations. The existing rules related to the Green Belt and the Eternal Paddy Fields against illegal constructions on the green belt, in no-build zones, are already controlling by lawful/legal means.

9. *Finally requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2020, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 45th session in 2021.*

3. Other current conservation issues identified by the State(s) Party(ies) which may have an impact on the property's Outstanding Universal Value

There are no current conservation issues identified.

4. In conformity with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*, describe any potential major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) intended within the property, the buffer zone(s) and/or corridors or other areas, where such developments may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including authenticity and integrity.

There are no potential major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) intended within the property, the buffer zone(s) and/or corridors or other areas, where such development may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the Property, including authenticity and integrity to be reported.

5. Public access to the state of conservation report

Uploading this report for public access on the World Heritage Centre's State of conservation Information System (<http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc>) is accepted without reservation.

6. Signature of the Authority



Hilmar Farid

Directorate General for Culture