Thematic Indicators for Culture
Prosperity & Livelihoods
Day 2 – Presentation by Naima Bourgaut
At the end of this training session, participants will:

» Learn how to construct indicators 6-12 of the framework and become familiar with the data tables of these indicators

» Impart with practical advise on constructing indicators with proxies in case of missing data
Module Outline

Module: Prosperity & Livelihood

6. Culture in GDP
7. Cultural employment
8. Cultural businesses
9. Household expenditure
10. Trade in cultural goods & services
11. Public finance for culture
12. Governance of culture
Related Goals

8.3 Promote development-oriented policies that support productive activities, decent job creation, entrepreneurship, creativity and innovation, and encourage the formalization and growth of micro-, small- and medium-sized enterprises, including through access to financial services.

8.9 By 2030, devise and implement policies to promote sustainable tourism that creates jobs and promotes local culture and products.

10.A Implement the principle of special and differential treatment for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, in accordance with World Trade Organization agreements.

11.4 Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world’s cultural and natural heritage.
Outputs and outcomes of the thematic

Providing a framework and a methodology, based on international standards and studies

Generating Data, from sources that are often scarce and disseminated

Multiple facets assessment, across all cultural domains and related, to inspire policy-making

Highlighting and strengthening the enabling and driving role of culture for sustainable development
Standard Classifications

» **International Standard Classifications**: common understanding of economic activities, occupations and consumption etc. = statistician language

» The International Standard Industrial Classification of Economic Activities (ISIC);

» The International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO);

» The Classification of Individual Consumption According to Purpose (COICOP).

» **National Classifications** – most of the time = adaptation of these international standards (ex: NACE rev.2 in Europe, OKVED 1.1 code of the economic activity in Russia)


→ Common language for cultural activities, occupations and consumption
General method

CULTURAL DOMAINS

A. CULTURAL and NATURAL HERITAGE
- Museums (also virtual)
- Archaeological and Historical Places
- Cultural Landscapes
- Natural Heritage

B. PERFORMANCE and CELEBRATION
- Performing Arts
- Music
- Festivals, Fairs and Feasts

C. VISUAL ARTS and CRAFTS
- Fine Arts
- Photography
- Crafts

D. BOOKS and PRESS
- Books
- Newspaper and Magazine
- Other printed matter
- Library (also virtual)
- Book Fairs

E. AUDIO-VISUAL and INTERACTIVE MEDIA
- Film and Video
- TV and Radio (also Internet live streaming)
- Internet podcasting
- Video Games (also Online)

F. DESIGN and CREATIVE SERVICES
- Fashion Design
- Graphic Design
- Interior Design
- Landscape Design
- Architectural Services
- Advertising Services

INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE
(oral traditions and expressions, rituals, languages, social practices)

EDUCATION and TRAINING

ARCHIVING and PRESERVING

EQUIPMENT and SUPPORTING MATERIALS

RELATED DOMAINS

G. TOURISM
- Charter travel and tourist services
- Hospitality and accommodation

H. SPORTS and RECREATION
- Sports
- Physical fitness and well being
- Amusement and Theme Parks
- Gambling

INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE

EDUCATION and TRAINING

ARCHIVING and PRESERVING

EQUIPMENT and SUPPORTING MATERIALS

### Core Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Locations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| CONTRIBUTION OF CULTURAL ACTIVITIES TO GDP    | Percentage of the contribution of private and formal cultural activities to GDP | • National Accounts  
• Industry surveys and censuses  
• Government records  
• Household income and expenditure surveys  
• Household enterprise surveys  
• Labour Force Sources  
• Cultural special surveys, etc. | National Statistic Office  
Ministry of Finance… |
| CULTURAL EMPLOYMENT                           | Percentage of persons engaged in cultural occupations within the total employed population | • Population Census  
• Labour Force and household employment surveys  
• Administrative records (e.g. social security registers) | National Statistic Office  
Ministry of Finance… |
| HOUSEHOLD EXPENDITURE                        | Percentage of household final consumption expenditures on cultural goods and services set against total consumption expenditures | • Household income and expenditure surveys  
• Industry surveys and censuses  
• Service surveys  
• Small establishment surveys | National Statistic Office  
Ministry of Finance… |
### Indicators – Data-mapping

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core Indicators</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Locations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8 CULTURAL BUSINESSES</td>
<td>Trends in cultural businesses as a percentage of all businesses</td>
<td>• National Accounts</td>
<td>Chamber of commerce and/or of Industries, Ministry of culture, sectorial surveys etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 TRADE IN CULTURAL GOODS AND SERVICES</td>
<td>Exports of cultural goods and services as a percentage of all exports.</td>
<td>• UNESCO data: UIS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• National Customs and Revenue reports preferred, otherwise the international COMTRADE database</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Indicators – Data-mapping

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core Indicators</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Data Sources</th>
<th>Locations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **PUBLIC FINANCE FOR CULTURE** | Proportion of public expenditure devoted to cultural and creative activities and the annual public budget and expenditure for the cultural and creative sectors | • Administrative data  
• Specific national surveys and Information systems for culture when available. |                                                                                                           |
• Administrative data  
• Specific national surveys and Information systems for governance culture when available |                                                                                                           |
Indicators – Data-mapping

First outputs:
- Identification of gaps and challenges
- Stocks of resources and references (by domains and/or sectors)
- Workplan !!!!

Must be:
- Partnerships and memorandum of understanding
- Technical capacities
- Regularly: updates and meetings

Keep in mind:
- Data quality criteria
- Possibility to provide Alternative and/or additional information

Presentation workshop – TAKE OFF - give some tips about how to organize the workshop
Data collection – Data Quality criteria

**Relevance:** It is always delicate to choose a single indicator to capture a political topic, but it's essential to build a pertinent data reflecting as accurately as possible determined objectives. The validity of chosen indicators can be additionally assessed by using statistical techniques.

**Alignment:** To ensure a reliable and valid measurement regarding the objectives, no matter the nature of the indicator, it's necessary to rely on data, norms and recommendation already defined and widely accepted, inducing measuring constructs not to vary across settings. The measurement of different variables raises challenges over data targeting and calculation methods and these challenges also vary according to the level of implementation (national and/or local).

**Feasibility:** The targeting of data sources and construction of the indicator should be realized on a regular basis, considering the way countries, cities and different organizations collect and process information. Statistical capacities largely condition the consistency of the chosen indicator. The preference should be given to cost-effective collection of data.

**Interpretation and communication:** The selected indicator must be easy to understand and lead to a clear lecture or interpretation regarding the related objectives and potential progresses to be made.

The value of the indicator must be striking and transparent, its evolution over time must be obvious for an efficient communication and advocacy. All forms of derivatives should be accompanied by methodological documentation.
Data Collection : General method

>> **Step 1 :** Asking for questionnaire used for national surveys and classification standards of the corresponding database ([codebook](#))

>> **Step 2 :** Identification of central and equipment/supporting cultural domains in the identified national classifications. Using the questionnaire codebooks identify all relevant cultural codes
- Use the FCS/ISU

>> **Step 3 :** Correspondence exercise between the codes selected from international standards and national classifications
- Fill in the table of correspondence for each indicator in the Data Table depending on the number of digit available (4, 3 or 2 digit level codes)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2 digits</th>
<th>3 digits</th>
<th>4 digits</th>
<th>ISCO Rev.4</th>
<th>National classification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Activity class</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3211</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Manufacture of jewelry and related articles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3220</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Manufacture of musical instruments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>591</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Motion picture, video and television programme production activities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Useful for others indicators!!
Data Collection: General method

>> **Step 4:** Asking for the extraction of the selected codes from national accounts/surveys and recodification
- For occupations and consumptions, ask as much as possible data to be disaggregate by key socio-economic variables (sex, age, level of education, quintile of resources etc.)

>> **Step 5:** Construction of indicators depends on the digit level of available classifications.
- Provide the digit level of the national classification employed in the data table
- Closely follow the selection of codes proposed by the FCS.ISU -> core indicator
- Possibility to construct additional indicators to better explore the specificity of national cultural sectors contribution -> including more codes

>> **Step 6:** Construction of infographics -> giving life to data

**Technical Report** – to present the methodological process and the statistical validity
Include: implementation process; main partner involved; working methods employed, description of data sources and calculation methods for all indicators, technical challenges encountered etc.

THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS
6. Culture in GDP
6 Culture in GDP

Method

» Percentage of Gross Domestic Product attributable to private and formal cultural production

» To obtain the ratio of cultural GDP, add the values obtained using the ISIC statistic codes include in the UIS Framework for Cultural Statistics (UNESCO-UIS 2009, pp. 52-64) then compare this sum with the gross domestic product (GDP) of the local economy.

\[
CGDP = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{GV_A}{GDP} \text{isic codes}
\]

» Where GVA is (GDP + subsidies – (direct, sales) taxes)

Data sources

» National and local sources: National Accounts, Business surveys and censuses, Service and commercial surveys, Government records, Cultural special surveys, artist registers, etc., Private sector sources (e.g. special surveys done by trade unions or chambers of commerce).

» Stock of ressources and references
6 Culture in GDP

Purpose

» This indicator aims to **assess the overall contribution of the culture sectors** to the economy in a given territory.

» Notes:
- this indicator is not taking into account all informal and unpaid cultural activities – the tip of the iceberg
- It allow the alignments of data with international classification standards (FCS/ISU) – international comparison
- Once created the data extraction can be done on regularly basis – trends

Interpretation guideline

» It will serve to quantitatively demonstrate how the culture sector contributes to growth, economic diversification, and helps to generate income and sustain livelihoods.

» At the national level, it is highly recommended to compare the contribution to GDP of cultural activities with other economic sectors with similar or higher contributions.

» Comparisons can only be made between countries using exactly the same codes selected under the methodology and the same digit level of data
7. Cultural employment
7. Cultural employment

Data sources

» UNESCO data: UIS

» National and local sources: National Accounts, Population Census, Labour Force surveys (LFS), Administrative records (e.g. social security registers), Professional associations.
7. Cultural employment

**Method**

- Number of people employed in the cultural and creative sectors and cultural occupations as a percentage of overall employment for the latest year.

\[ CEP_0 = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} CE_{isco\ codes}}{EP} \]

- CEP0 is the percentage of people engaged in cultural occupations;
- CE_isco codes is the total number of people employed in cultural occupations according to the selected International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO) codes; (or ISIC codes – see below – where occupation data is not available)
- EP is the total number of the employed
7. Cultural employment

Purpose

» This indicator aims to assess the role of culture as an “employer” at the national and local level as well, as the vitality and dynamism of the culture sector and its potential in improving the material welfare of those employed in it

» allows for a detailed and disaggregated snapshot of employment in central and equipment/supporting cultural professions and gives some basic indications of the employment status of women and men in this sector

» At the national level, it is highly recommended to compare the share of cultural occupations within total employment with other major sectors with similar or higher contributions

» Comparisons can only be made between countries using exactly the same codes selected under the methodology and the same digit level of data.

Interpretation guideline

» provides a picture of its contribution and weight how the culture sector contributes to job creation and the material welfare of those employed in this sector.
8. Cultural businesses
Data sources

- National and local sources: Business surveys, Registers of businesses (such as the Chamber of Commerce and sectoral bodies).

Method

Trends in cultural businesses as a percentage of all businesses.

Level of change as measured by annual percentage points difference in cultural businesses as a percentage of all businesses for the given area:

\[
\frac{CE}{\sum E} \times 100 \text{ (Year 2)} - \frac{CE}{\sum E} \times 100 \text{ (Year 1)}
\]

Where CE = number of cultural establishments and \( \sum E \) = the total number of establishments in the given city.
8. Cultural businesses

Data sources

» National and local sources: Business surveys, Registers of businesses (such as the Chamber of Commerce and sectoral bodies).

» Trends in cultural businesses as a percentage of all businesses.

» Level of change as measured by annual percentage points difference in cultural businesses as a percentage of all businesses for the given area:

Method

» CE/∑E*100 {Year 2} – CE/∑E*100 {Year 1}

» Where CE = number of cultural establishments and ∑E = the total number of establishments in the given city.
8. Cultural businesses

Purpose

This indicator aims to assess the enabling conditions provided to cultural businesses (especially small and micro enterprises) by following the trend in numbers of cultural businesses, in particular, where there is no data for indicator 6 “Culture in GDP”.

Interpretation guideline

- The more nuanced indicators of production (6) and employment (7) are to be preferred.
- This indicator can provide an overall summary of changes in the nature of cultural business.
- Easiest to present in the form of a graph of trends for each year.
9. Household expenditure
9. Household expenditure

Data sources

» National and local sources: Industry surveys and censuses, Service surveys, Small establishment surveys, household expenditure surveys.

Method

» Percentage of total household expenditure devoted to cultural activities, goods and services.

» CHFC is the household final consumption expenditure on cultural activities, goods and services set against total household final consumption expenditure;

» HCSCOICOP codes is the total amount of household expenditure in the selected COICOP codes; HFC is the total household final consumption expenditure.

\[
CHFC = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} HCS_{coicop~codes}}{HFC}
\]
9. Household expenditure

Purpose

» This indicator aims to assess how households of a given territory value cultural goods and services through markets transactions and to obtain insight into the size and the potential of the local market for cultural activities, goods and services.

» it is recommended to analyze the results according to the disaggregation criteria proposed in the Data Table, namely by income quintiles, urban/rural, central and equipment/supporting cultural goods and services. This would help to obtain a more accurate picture of cultural consumption patterns of the overall population as well as that of particular social groups.

Interpretation guideline

» The final results will sub-estimate the total actual final consumption of households of cultural goods and services

» It is recommended to explore how this indicator enhances the information obtained from the indicator on value added of cultural production
10. Trade in cultural goods & services
10. Trade in cultural goods & services

Data sources

» National and local sources: National Customs and Revenue reports preferred, otherwise the international COMTRADE database (comtrade.un.org)

» The value of exports of cultural services using the codes (EBOPS where possible) as listed in FCS (p. 39) as a percentage of the value of all service exports. The value of exports and imports either in US$ (preferred) or national currency.

Method

» The value of physical cultural exports using the codes (HS where possible) as listed in FCS as a percentage of the value of all exports of physical goods. The value of exports and import either in US$ (preferred) or national currency.
10. Trade in cultural goods & services

Purpose

» This indicator aims to assess the degree to products as expressions of culture are exported reflecting both the economic demand, the international profile of the country/city’s cultural products and services, and the regulatory environment to enable this

Interpretation guideline

» Amongst the easiest data to obtain thanks to the national submissions for physical goods included in the COMTRADE database

» May be restricted to physical products

» The indicator measures the significance of the cultural products of a country that are circulated internationally
11. Public finance for culture
11. Public finance for culture

Method

For public expenditure for culture, the following disaggregation would be required:

» Public expenditure by administrative unit
» Type of public expenditure (capital investment, operating expenditure)
» Public expenditure per inhabitant
» By sector of intervention
» Public expenditure by source

For public budget for culture, the following disaggregation would be required:

» Public budget by administrative unit
» Type of public expenditure (capital investment, operating expenditure)
» Public budget per inhabitant
» By sector of intervention
» By source of funding (donation, central government allocation, local taxes)
11. Public finance for culture

Purpose

» This indicator aims to monitor the amount of actual public spending on cultural and creative activities. Actual expenditure figures are preferred to the allocated budget. Expenditure figures may be compared to the allocated budget. Where expenditure is not available, budget figures may still be presented.

Interpretation guideline

» This indicator can be difficult to calculate for several reasons:
  - National accounting frameworks may not clearly separate cultural and other activities
  - Money may be rechannelled for different uses

- Money may be double counted at different levels of public administration

But, any framework for culture must attempt to gain a clear picture of public spending in culture and the arts.

» Public spending on culture may include much more than direct support to the ‘sector’.

» Figures for this indicator would include public expenditure on heritage (as included in Indicator 1).

» If allowance is made for the use of different sources, it is possible to estimate the % of public cultural spending devoted to heritage.

» For public budget for culture Information on expenditure is to be preferred to budgets, since actual spending often differs considerably from budget.

» The current indicator includes all public budgets allotted to projects or institutions which would be included in FCS domains
12. Governance of culture
12. Governance of culture

Data sources


» National and local sources:
  - Administrative data, Specific national surveys and Information systems for governance culture when available.
12. Governance of culture

Checklists for Governance of Culture

A) NATIONAL LEVEL ONLY
All responses in the form of ‘Yes’ or ‘No’ with supporting evidence in the form of policy/legal documents, or reports of resulting activities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Convention Reference</th>
<th>YES/NO</th>
<th>EVIDENCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. SUPRANATIONAL OR INTERNATIONAL LEVEL</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binding International instruments ratified</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

B) NATIONAL AND URBAN LEVEL
This checklist is designed to assess cultural governance across all the domains of cultural activity (as classified by FCS). While not all items will be relevant across all domains, it is important to obtain as comprehensive a picture as possible.

Table 6(b). Checklist for Governance of Culture – NATIONAL AND URBAN LEVEL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard-setting, policy and institutional framework to support culture and creativity at the government level (State / City)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Institutional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of a Ministry of Culture or a Culture secretariat with ministerial/directorial status at the State/national level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005 Conv./ Govt. 1.1. Question 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence of a ‘culture committee’ in the Parliament/main national legislative body</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Governance of culture

Purpose

This indicator offers an overall picture of the government policies and regulatory frameworks in place to support a variety of activities in the culture sector, intended to ensure and foster its contribution for economic and social development as well as the decision-making processes in cultural domains. This indicator aims to assess the regulation of the Culture sector and to promote better working and trade conditions for better livelihoods.

Interpretation guideline

» Wherever possible, each component (row) should be evaluated for each domain (column) as defined by UIS/FCS. This will not be possible for all aspects of the table.

» Please note that in each case, ‘evidence’ in the form of supporting documentation is required.

» Cultural and natural heritage are inextricably linked; wherever the checklist below considers cultural heritage it should be understood to include natural heritage, as well as taking into account the impact of cultural activity on the natural environment.
Purpose

This indicator offers an overall picture of the government policies and regulatory frameworks in place to support a variety of activities in the culture sector, intended to ensure and foster its contribution for economic and social development as well as the decision-making processes in cultural domains. This indicator aims to assess the regulation of the Culture sector and to promote better working and trade conditions for better livelihoods.

Interpretation guideline

- Wherever possible, each component (row) should be evaluated for each domain (column) as defined by UIS/FCS. This will not be possible for all aspects of the table.
- Please note that in each case, ‘evidence’ in the form of supporting documentation is required.
- Cultural and natural heritage are inextricably linked; wherever the checklist below considers cultural heritage it should be understood to include natural heritage, as well as taking into account the impact of cultural activity on the natural environment.
6 Prosperity and livehoods

Contribution of cultural activities to GDP

**Percentage of the contribution of private and formal cultural activities to GDP by main sectors in Ecuador**

- Information and communication: 4.76%
- Professional and technical activities: 21%
- Manufacture: 15%
- Wholesale and retail: 12%
- Education: 10%
- Other sectors: 43%

Source: Censo Económico, INEC (2010). Methodology: UNESCO CDIS

**Percentage of the contribution of private and formal cultural activities to GDP - 4.04%**

- A. Cultural and Natural Heritage: 31,82%
- B. Art Performances and Celebrations: 10,25%
- C. Visual Arts and Crafts: 5,62%
- D. Books and Press: 1,28%
- E. Audiovisual and interactive media: 0,36%
- F. Design and creative services: 0,02%


---

**Distribution of the Cultural Activities Value added in GDP by cultural domains (including equipment and support materials)**

- A. Cultural and Natural Heritage: 31,82%
- B. Art Performances and Celebrations: 10,25%
- C. Visual Arts and Crafts: 5,62%
- D. Books and Press: 1,28%
- E. Audiovisual and interactive media: 0,36%
- F. Design and creative services: 0,02%


---

**Contribution of cultural activities to GDP**

- Support activities: 18%
- Central activities: 32%
- 5,72%

Source: Consultations with key stakeholders (2012). Methodology: UNESCO CDIS
7 Prosperity and Livelihoods

Cultural employment

Percentage of persons engaged in cultural occupations within the total employed population in Burkina Faso

2.82% Central occupations 96%
Support occupations 3%


Percentage of women engaged in cultural occupation in Burkina Faso

Within the total cultural occupations

50.1%

Within the "middle and superior" cultural occupations

9.9%


Répartition des emplois culturels per type de profession


Cultural employment by context

Urban context 8.7%
Rural Context 1.2%

9 Prosperity and livelihoods

Household expenditures on culture

Percentage of household final consumption expenditures on cultural activities, goods and services set against total consumption expenditures by income quintile in Uruguay

Final Result: 3.08%


Source: Consultations with key stakeholders (2011). Methodology: UNESCO CDS

UNESCO
Prosperity & Livelihoods
By Naima Bourgaut
Prosperity and livelihoods

Household expenditures on culture

Analytical Brief – summarizes and interprets the results

Include: concrete and sound policy messages to focus political attention and foster public debate on culture

3 descriptive and contextual indicators that:

- Offer valuable information of the income, employment and resources generated by cultural activities at national level (as well as relevant disaggregation) to assess the vitality of cultural sectors and ICC

- Measure only the contribution, employment and consumption of private and formal cultural activities -> reflect only “the tip of the iceberg” of the overall cultural sectors dynamism ...

- Represent a significant investment in cultural data system bringing national classification in line with international classification system
Tools

- FCS/ISU and codebooks
- Data-mapping
- Draft Workplan
- Lots of international resources

Collaborative platform

Data tables
Thank You

UNESCO World Heritage Centre

culture2030indicators@unesco.org

whc.unesco.org/en/culture2030indicators