ICOMOS

TATERNATIONAL COUNCIL ON MONUMENTS AND SITES CONSEIL INTERNATIONAL DES MONUMENTS ET DES SITES CONSEID INTERNACIONAL DE MONUMENTOS Y SITIOS MEXIMAPOLIBIL COBETHO BOHPOCAMHAMSHIHIKOB IL LOCTORPHMI JAIL IBHBIX MECT

Our Ref.GB/AS/1623/IR

Charenton-le-Pont, 20 December 2019

H. E. Mr Massimo Riccardo Ambassador, Permanent Delegate Permanent Delegation of Italy to UNESCO 50, rue de Varenne 75007 Paris

World Heritage List 2020 Padova Urbs picta, Giotto's Scrovegni Chapel and Padua's fourteenth-century fresco cycles (Italy) - Interim report and additional information request

Dear Ambassador,

As prescribed by the revised *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* and its Annex 6, the Advisory Bodies have been requested to submit a short interim report for each nomination by 31 January 2020. We are therefore pleased to provide you with the relevant information outlining issues related to the evaluation process.

The ICOMOS technical evaluation mission to "Padova Urbs picta, Giotto's Scrovegni Chapel and Padua's fourteenth-century fresco cycles" was carried out by Benoit de Tapol (France) in September 2019. The mission expert highly appreciated the availabilities and support provided by the experts in your country for the organization and implementation of the mission.

On 9 October 2019, a letter was sent by ICOMOS to request further information regarding the description of the property, justification for criteria (ii) and (iii), comparative analysis: justification for serial approach and criteria for selection of the component parts of the serial nomination and development projects. Please convey our thanks to all the officials and experts for the additional information you provided on 24 October 2019 and for their continued cooperation in this process.

In mid-November 2019, the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel evaluated the cultural and mixed properties nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List in 2020. The additional information provided by the State Party, together with mission and desk review reports were carefully examined by the Panel members. This process will conclude in March 2020.

We thank you for the availability of your Delegation to the meeting held on Thursday 21 November 2019 with representatives of the ICOMOS Panel. The exchange during this meeting was of great help for the third part of the ICOMOS evaluation meeting in which the Panel identified areas where it considers further information is needed.

Therefore, we would be pleased if the State Party could consider the following points:

Authenticity

ICOMOS recognizes the significance of the nominated property in illustrating an entirely new way of depicting allegorical narratives in spatial perspectives influenced by 14th century studies in the science of optics giving a new capacity in capturing human figures, including individual features displaying affect and emotions.

ICOMOS would however appreciate if the State Party could provide additional information on the authenticity of the upper three bands of frescoes in the Palazzo della Ragione, in particular on the closely related motives in the miniature manuscript attributed to Giotto and the ongoing investigations on lower paint layers which may exist below the frescoes visible today. ICOMOS would also suggest that perhaps the State Party may wish to consider redefining this component to contribute attributes of Outstanding Universal Value merely in the lower fresco sections of Palazzo della Ragione.

Management

In view of the management office structure and resources, which were discussed during the World Heritage Panel meeting with the State Party, ICOMOS would like to receive information on the official approval of the management coordination office's establishment by the City of Padua along with further details concerning human and financial resources attributed to this coordination office for the management partners.

In relation to risk preparedness and disaster management, ICOMOS acknowledges the information provided on practices established for the Scrovegni Chapel. It would be useful if the State Party could provide information on the timeframe for this practice to be applied to the other nominated property components, both by extending the mandate of the Interdisciplinary and Scientific Committee for the Conservation and Management of the Scrovegni Chapel (ISCCMSC) and applying risk preparedness and disaster management provisions to the other property components. In this context, ICOMOS would like to know whether an update of the management plan is anticipated to contain sections on risk preparedness and disaster management as well as consistent risk monitoring for the serial property.

Name of the property

The name of the property "Padova Urbs Picta" is not considered fully clear by ICOMOS due to the notion of *urbs picta*. The series of fresco cycles is neither a painted city nor do the frescoes depict the city of Padua as their prime motive. In addition, the name of Giotto within the title does not seem fully relevant, as he contributed merely a few of the property's frescoes and given that the series as a whole is meant to reflect the proposed Outstanding Universal Value, it should be well reflected in the property's name. Could the State Party consider an alternative name for the serial nomination which would describe more precisely the content of the serial property?

We look forward to your responses to these points, which will be of great help in our evaluation process.

We would be grateful if you could provide ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre with the above information by 28 February 2020 at the latest, the deadline set out in paragraph 148 of the *Operational Guidelines* for supplementary information on nominations to be received. Please note that any information submitted after this date will not be considered by ICOMOS in its evaluation for the World Heritage Committee. It should be noted, however, that while ICOMOS will carefully consider any supplementary information submitted, it cannot properly evaluate a completely revised nomination or large amounts of new information submitted at the last minute. So we would be grateful if the State Party could keep its response concise and respond only to the above requests.

We thank you for your support of the World Heritage Convention and the evaluation process.

Yours faithfully,

Gwenaëlle Bourdin

Director

ICOMOS Evaluation Unit

Copy to Ministry for Cultural Heritage and Activities (MiBAC)

Mayor of Padua City Council UNESCO World Heritage Centre