



STATE OF CONSERVATION REPORT 2020

**“HISTORIC CENTRE OF BUKHARA”
UZBEKISTAN**

STATE OF CONSERVATION REPORT 2020

Historic Centre of Bukhara (Uzbekistan) (Nomination 602 bis)

In 1993, the “Historic City of Bukhara” has been inscribed on the World Heritage List, according to criteria (ii), (iv) and (vi). The Retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the property has been adopted in 2012.

The State of Conservation report was required by World Heritage Committee, Decision 43 COM 7B.78, point 12, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

The administration of Bukhara city, together with the Department of Cultural Heritage of the Bukhara Region, having studied and prepared the necessary information required by the Decision No. 43 COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee, reports the following:

1. Executive Summary

The city of Bukhara, like many other cities in Uzbekistan, is undergoing rapid urban transformation. In this process, the urban heritage of the Historic Centre of Bukhara is considered an important social, cultural and economic asset for the development of the city as a whole, mainly through sustainable tourism.

In order to reflect this approach, the legal and institutional frameworks have been amended and supplemented. The State Party adopted, in the last two years, important legal and institutional measures to protect cultural heritage and control development:

- On 24 August 2019, Senators approved a law “On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the republic of Uzbekistan concerning the enhanced protection of objects of the material cultural heritage”. The Criminal Code, the Code of Administrative Responsibility, the Tax Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, as well as the List of activities for which licenses are required, have been amended and supplemented. These amendments and addendums introduced an increased responsibility and liability for the destruction or damage to objects of tangible cultural heritage, not only for the intentional destruction, but also for negligence that caused significant damage. Liability for violation of the rules for the protection and use of cultural heritage applies to protected cultural properties situated within protected historical and cultural territories, including those inscribed on the World Heritage List, as well as to buildings, structures and other objects, which are not considered objects of cultural heritage, but are located in the above-mentioned protected territories.
- Regarding the moratorium on all construction works and upgrades, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019 No. UP-5781 “About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan” was issued. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the prevention of landscaping and construction work on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, included the UNESCO World Heritage properties.
- In Bukhara, the moratorium has been extended to the buffer zone, following the recommendation of the World Heritage Committee. The moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue to be so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have

been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place. The implementation of the moratorium is closely monitored.

- The Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 435 dated June 9, 2018 was adopted, according to which the construction on the territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara was halted and the property was given the status of ‘territory of special protection’. Also, with the aim of organizing the implementation of this resolution, a decision was made by the Hokim of the region No. 362 of June 16, 2018.
- Also in order to preserve the objects of cultural heritage in Bukhara, according to the order of the Hokim (Governor) of Bukhara Region dated January 30, 2018 No. 26-f., a Public Advisory Council was created to control the construction activity in the protected territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara. According to this order, the implementation of any construction works on existing buildings such as modification of street façades, modernization, repair, rehabilitation and restauration of cultural heritage, as well as construction of new buildings - enterprises, private houses, markets, from commercial and real estate sectors - located on the territory of the “Historic Centre of Bukhara”, require the authorization of the Public Advisory Council.

Furthermore, most of the planning tools had to be revised and updated, while new tools had to be prepared to ensure the effective protection of the World Heritage property for present and future generations:

- A new Master Plan has been developed and the Project of Detailed Planning (PDP) of 2017 is being revised, taking into account the conclusions and recommendations of the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory Mission. The draft of the revised PDP has been discussed with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara, 16-19 December 2019. The 2017 PDP has been invalidated and its application is suspended.
- A Management Plan for the Historic Centre of Bukhara World Heritage Property has been prepared using inclusive and participatory planning and stakeholder consultation processes. The reviewed draft of this document has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies. The Management Plan will be integrated to the Master Plan according to the 2011 Recommendation on Historic Urban Landscape, once both plans have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies.

The Hokim of the city of Bukhara created a specialized body - the Steering Committee. This council consists of specialists in the field of cultural heritage - architects, archaeologists, historians, art historians, as well as representatives of the community living in the territory of the property. The functions of this committee include monitoring the implementation of requirements for the preservation of cultural heritage, monitoring the implementation of the management plan, evaluating the implementation of the management plan, collecting, integrating, storing, analyzing and disseminating information about the property, monitoring of damaged, abandoned buildings and open spaces in the territory of the property.

The cultural heritage objects damaged through the implementation of the PDP of 2017 have been stabilized and protective measures have been taken – propping, shoring, installation of temporary supports, scaffolding, temporary protective roofs, safety nets, erection of fences around the damaged buildings, etc. Also, preventive measures have been taken to prevent their further damage and to eliminate threats to the property’s OUV.

Draft guidelines for restoration methods and materials have been developed and sent to the World Heritage Centre for review by Advisory bodies.

On September 23, 2019, the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan approved a Road Map for the implementation of Decision 43COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee. Several actions included in this road map have already been implemented. Among them, the expansion of the existing Interagency Task Force to include national and international experts reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Center for a period of at least five years, and provide it with a national level of mandate, to implement the tasks described in the Decision.

Finally, several major restoration projects and new constructions are planned in the property, including the restoration of Abdullaziz Khan Madrassah and the Reconstruction of the Shakhristan Market of Bukhara, among others. Documentation, drawings and Heritage Impact Assessments for all projects have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies.

2. Response to the Decision 43 COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee

In response to paragraph 3:

Welcomes the reported moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property and urges the State Party to adopt urgent legal and institutional measures to control development;

The Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 435 dated June 9, 2018 was adopted, according to which the construction on the territory of the Historic Center of Bukhara was halted and the property was given the status of ‘territory of special protection’. Also, with the aim of organizing the implementation of this resolution, a decision was made by the Hokim of the region No. 362 of June 16, 2018.

The Resolution was adopted in order to ensure the effective protection of the cultural heritage of Uzbekistan, including the territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara, to establish effective mechanisms of public control, including the work of the Public Councils and the UNESCO National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan, and to take into account the recommendations of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee regarding the Historic Centre of Bukhara. The moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property has been extended to the territory of the buffer zone, as recommended by the World Heritage Committee. This moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by ICOMOS. Its implementation is closely monitored.

Also in order to preserve the objects of cultural heritage in Bukhara, according to the order of the Hokim (Governor) of Bukhara Region dated January 30, 2018 No. 26-f., a Public Advisory Council was created to organize the construction activity in the protected territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara. According to this order, the implementation of any construction works on existing buildings such as modification of street façades, modernization, repair, rehabilitation and restoration of cultural heritage, as well as construction of new buildings - enterprises, private houses, markets, from commercial and real estate sectors - located on the territory of the “Historic Centre of Bukhara”, require the authorization of the City Council.

In response to paragraph 4:

Also welcomes the establishment of the World Heritage Property Steering Committee and the establishment of an Interagency Task Force to address emerging issues at the property, but requests that more details be provided on the scale, scope and mandate of the Task Force;

According to the Decision of the 41st session of the World Heritage Committee, by the initiative of the Bukhara State Regional Inspectorate for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage, a decision was made by the Hokim of the city of Bukhara to create a specialized body - the Steering Committee. This council consists of specialists in the field of cultural heritage, in particular architects, archaeologists, historians, art historians, as well as representatives of the local people living in the territory of the Historical Center of Bukhara. The functions of this committee include monitoring the implementation of requirements for the preservation of cultural heritage, monitoring the implementation of the management plan, evaluating the implementation of the management plan, collecting, integrating, storing, analyzing and disseminating information about the Historic Centre of Bukhara, monitoring damaged, abandoned buildings and empty spaces in the territory of Bukhara historical center, monitoring the preservation of the attributes of the Historic Centre of Bukhara from potential threats.

In response to paragraph 5:

Notes with grave concern the conclusions and recommendations of the April 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property, including the reported destruction of attributes of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) as a result of the implementation of the Project of Detailed Planning of Historical Centre of Bukhara Development (PDP), which is based on a national decree to stimulate tourism development in the property and its region;

The implementation of the 2017 Project of Detailed Planning (PDP) based on a national decree to stimulate tourism development in the property and its region, and which caused damage to some attributes of the property's OUV, has been suspended. A new PDP is being prepared for the Historic Centre of Bukhara, which addresses the conclusions and recommendations of the ICOMOS Advisory Mission of April 2018. The draft PDP has been discussed with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara, 16-19 January 2020.

In response to paragraph 6:

Takes note of the reported completion of the Integrated Management Plan and the Master Plan for the property, along with a system of protective zones for the property and its buffer zone, but expresses its concern that the Integrated Management Plan has not yet been submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies, despite earlier requests; that the Master Plan, although reportedly revised and updated, has been adopted without being submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies; and that the system of protective zones needs to be improved with regard to both its terminology and application;

The revised draft of the Integrated Management Plan has been sent to the World Heritage Center for review by the Advisory Bodies.

In response to paragraph 7:

*Also requests that:
The moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property be extended to include the buffer zone of the property,*

The Integrated Management Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its legal adoption,

The Master Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as possible and before any further decision is made that would be difficult to reverse;

Once both the Management Plan and the Master Plan have been reviewed, the Management Plan be integrated with the Master Plan, in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape;

The moratorium be enforced until both the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies, and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place and pilot projects have proven their effectiveness,

Prior to holding architectural design competitions for new projects, commissioning, or commencing any new development project or major restoration works, detailed proposals should be sent to the World Heritage Centre, for review in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

Regarding the moratorium on all construction works and upgrades, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019 No. UP-5781 “About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan” was signed. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the prevention of landscaping and construction work on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, included the UNESCO World Heritage properties. This moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place and pilot projects have proven their effectiveness. The implementation of the moratorium is closely monitored.

The draft of the Management Plan has been sent to the World Heritage Center for review by Advisory bodies (see point 6 above). The Management Plan will be integrated to the Master Plan according to the 2011 Recommendation on Historic Urban Landscape, once both the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies.

In response to paragraph 8:

Further requests the State Party to stabilize the valuable structures damaged through the implementation of the PDP and to take protective measures until a set of appropriate protocols on restoration methods and materials have been developed and reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;

The cultural heritage objects damaged through the implementation of the PDP of 2017 have been stabilized and protective measures have been taken – propping, shoring, installation of temporary supports, scaffolding, temporary protective roofs, safety netting, erection of fences around the damaged buildings, etc. Draft Guidelines for restoration methods and materials have been developed and sent to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory bodies.

In response to paragraph 9:

Also notes with grave concern the management weaknesses, damages to the property and threats to its OUV reported in the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission report, which echo the Committee's earlier concerns;

The management deficiencies highlighted in the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory Mission Report have been addressed, and the damaged cultural objects have been stabilized. In addition, preventive measures have been taken to prevent their further damage (see point 8 above) and to eliminate threats to the OUV of the World Heritage property.

In response to paragraph 10:

Requests furthermore the State Party to expand its Interagency Task Force to include national and international expert advisors reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Centre for a defined period of minimum five years, and grant it a national-level mandate to:

- 1. Fully assess the legal protection and management systems already in place for the property and its buffer zones and make recommendations for improvements,*
- 2. Assess and improve the roadmap to address the conservation of the property and oversee the implementation thereof after it is reviewed by the Advisory Bodies,*
- 3. Carry out an annual assessment of the state of conservation of the property,*
- 4. Monitor engagement with local and community stakeholders on the future of the property,*
- 5. Oversee the development of policies and guidelines for conservation and development which aim to preserve the property's OUV,*
- 6. Assess and recommend improvements to Impact Assessment processes, the reassessment of the Integrated Management Plan, Master Plan and other development plans and decrees, as well as reporting to the World Heritage Centre in the framework of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,*
- 7. Oversee the development and review of an appropriate and sustainable tourism development strategy and plan,*
- 8. Select and monitor the implementation of pilot projects to assess the efficiency of the developed, assessed and reviewed plans, guidelines and policies,*
- 9. Monitor the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property and its buffer zone and annually assess whether the moratorium could be lifted, provided that the management system and the various management, conservation and development plans have been proven to be efficient,*
- 10. Recommend the lifting of the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades in the property as well as its own dissolution once it is satisfied that the legal and management systems effectively protect the OUV of the property and its setting;*

On September 23, 2019, a meeting of the Presidium of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan was held, and a Road Map was approved. The road map includes the expansion of the existing Interagency Task Force to include national and international expert advisors reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Center for a period of at least five years, and provide it with a national level of mandate, to implement the tasks described in the 10 points above. This action, and several other actions included in the road map have already been implemented.

In response to paragraph 11:

Requests moreover the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to assess the full scope of the impacts already caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property;

The State Party invited a joint World Heritage /ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission to visit the property in order to assess the impacts caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property.

The Mission visited the Historic City of Bukhara between 16-19 January 2020 and met with local and regional authorities, members of the Interagency Task Force, mahalla leaders and residents.

3. Other current conservation issues identified by the State Party which may have an impact on the property's Outstanding Universal Value;

An important law, which will greatly contribute to the preservation of the OUV of the property, has been approved recently:

On 24 August 2019, Senators approved a law “On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the republic of Uzbekistan concerning the enhanced protection of objects of the material cultural heritage”. The Criminal Code, the Code of Administrative Responsibility, the Tax Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, as well as the List of activities for which licenses are required, have been amended and supplemented. These amendments and addendums introduced an increased responsibility and liability for the destruction or damage to objects of tangible cultural heritage, through the intentional destruction, but also through negligence that caused significant damage. Liability applies to protected cultural properties situated within protected historical and cultural territories, including those inscribed on the World Heritage List, as well as to buildings, structures and other objects which are not considered objects of cultural heritage, but are located in the above-mentioned protected territories.

4. Potential major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) intended within the property, the buffer zone(s) and/or corridors or other areas, that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including authenticity and integrity.

Several major restoration projects and new constructions are planned in the Historic Centre of Bukhara. Among them, the restoration of Abdullaziz Khan Madrassah and the Reconstruction of the Shakhristan Market of Bukhara. Heritage Impact Assessments have been prepared for each of them and sent, together with the detailed drawings, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies.

5. Public access to the state of conservation report

The full report can be uploaded for public access.

6. Signature of the Authority

.....

Mrs. Kamola Akylova
Deputy Minister
Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Uzbekistan