

Report of the State of Conservation of Stone Town of Zanzibar (United Republic of Tanzania) C 173

- a) **State Party:** United Republic of Tanzania
- b) **Name of the World Heritage Property:** Stone Town of Zanzibar (C 173 Rev)
- c) **Geographical Coordinates to the nearest second:** S6° 09' 47'' E39° 11' 21''
- d) **Date of Inscription on the World Heritage List:** Year 2000
- e) **Organization (s) responsible for the preparation for the report:** Zanzibar Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA)

Name: Mr. Issa S. Makarani
Title: Director General of STCDA
City: Zanzibar
Country Code: +255
Telephone Number: +255 24 223 8823
Mobile: +255 777 432002

Email: ismakarani@gmail.com

- f) Date of submission of Report: 20th December, 2019

- g) Signature on the behalf of the State Party:
Prof. Hamisi M. Malebo

**SECRETARY GENERAL OF THE NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR
UNESCO OF THE UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA**



Report of the State of Conservation of Stone Town of Zanzibar (United Republic of Tanzania) C 173

- a) State Party: United Republic of Tanzania
- b) Name of the World Heritage Property: Stone Town of Zanzibar (C 173 Rev)
- c) Geographical Coordinates to the nearest second: S6° 09' 47'' E39° 11' 21''
- d) Date of Inscription on the World Heritage List: Year 2000
- e) Organization (s) responsible for the preparation for the report:
- f) Organization Name: Zanzibar Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA)

Name: Mr. Issa S. Makarani

Title: Director General of STCDA

City: Zanzibar

Country Code: +255

Telephone Number: +255 24 223 8823

Mobile: +255 777 432002

Email: ismakarani@gmail.com

g) Date of submission of Report: 20th December, 2019

h) Signature on the behalf of the State Party:

Decision: 42 COM 7B. 21

3. Welcomes with satisfaction the development of the Department of Urban and Rural Planning (DoURP) Ng'ambo Local Area Plan and Green Belt proposals, the successful restoration of the Chawl Building, and supports the proposed development of the Hifadhi Zanzibar Majestic Theatre;

Response:

The State Party acknowledges the appreciations as expressed by the WHC regarding the DoURP Ng'ambo Local Area, the successful restoration of the Chawl Building, the proposed project of Majestic Theatre and the Green Corridor Project. Presently the Consultant of the Project is going on with the preparation of a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) on the Green Corridor Project and the first draft is ready. .

4. Notes that the State Party has followed the ICOMOS recommendations regarding Beit el Ajaib (House of Wonders) and requests the State Party to keep the World Heritage Centre informed of all developments regarding the rehabilitation project;

Response:

The State Party appreciates the acknowledgement made by the WH-Committee on the directives for the preparation of the required documents, synopsis of the rehabilitation of House of Wonder and existing drawings. The State Party submitted on 18th July 2019 a Theoretical –Normative Support report for the patrimony criteria applied in the intervention guidelines that was prepared by Formento Territorial and STCDA agreed on the comments raised.

During the RMM, the comments raised on the earlier technical review STCDA agreed to work on it and submit to UNESCO immediately. The State Party signed a contract in Zanzibar on 11th October, 2019 with Costruzioni Generali Gilardi S.P.A a Company from Italy to undertake the project, the site handover between Clients and Contractor happened on 12th November, 2019 on the site premises.

The following contractual documents including Volume two (specifications), Volume three (Drawings), Volume four (Bill of Quantities) and Appendices

presented during the RMM visit for their review, were immediately sent to UNESCO/ICOMOS.

Due to the present situation of the project, it has been advised to immediately submit the plans for mobilization and stabilization of the building and later followed by required State Party's response to recently highlighted technical reviewed reports from ICOMOS.

5. Notes with concern that minimum mitigation measures for the Mambo Msiige project, identified by the 2016 mission as non-negotiable minimum, have not all been implemented, while the Tippu Tip House and the Palace Museum remain vulnerable unless urgent measures are taken;

Response:

State Party took initiatives as directed by UNESCO on the establishment of Cross Cutting Task Team (CCTT) based on the 42 COM recommendations; The CCTT immediately started to implement the mitigation measures for Mambo Msiige, all details of the work done are shown in the attached matrix. CCTT managed to review the mitigation measures proposed on Mambo Msiige Monument, considering the workability, possibility and sustainability of the activities.

CCTT after reviewing the mitigation measures meet with the Park Hyatt management on 20th March, 2019 to discuss the implementation of the mitigations

(The matrix shows the mitigation measures, CCTT recommendations, progress, way forward and time frame are attached as appendix No: 1).

Emergency Works to Rescue Tippu Tip House:

Over the past few years the Tippu Tip building faced a serious continuous deterioration caused by various reasons; apart from other factors affecting this building, deterioration was mainly accelerated during the rainy seasons. Considering the poor condition of Tippu Tip Building due to the leaking of the entire roof which caused serious damages to the walls and the boriti slabs has endangered the life span of the building.

The State Party took initiative of taking emergency works of doing restoration on the following: -

a) Major roof restoration work was undertaken as a replacement of serious rotten corrugated iron sheets by new aluminum corrugated sheets with the same profile, all timber structural members which were damaged/decayed were replaced with new ones of the same measurements with existing members 100%,

b) On the walls (externally), all vertical cracks were stitched with burnt clayed roofing tiles powder with lime based mortar, hacked walls and plastered them with two coats, render coats and lime sand plaster, and finally finished with emulsion paint 98%.

c) Externally, repaired all timber elements, balcony, windows and doors 90%.

d) Strengthening of boriti slab, replacement of all rotten boriti with new ones with ceiling lime sand plaster 84%.

Presently, the proposed function of the Tippu Tip building will be discussed between the developer and the Ministry of Lands, Housing, Water and Energy, Zanzibar.



Before Rehabilitation



After Rehabilitation

Regarding People's Palace Museum building, the Sultanate Government of Oman funded the initial stage of rehabilitation by providing funds for rescuing activities including the supporting of the boritis slabs and shoring of the external walls. Moreover the updated report of Conservation Plan of November done by World Monument Funds in 2015 is completed. The State Party has already organized for

the restoration of the building and the cost estimate has already been prepared and submitted to the Cabinet for approval.

6. Notes with great concern that the Advisory mission of October 2017 considered that none of the factors affecting the property, as listed in the state of conservation reports since 2014, has been addressed successfully and nearly all comments and recommendations made in the 2014 and 2016 mission reports still remain valid today, and moreover that the current Management System, including the 2010 Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA) Act, is not being implemented fully, with resultant negative consequences for the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);

Response:

Cross Cutting Task Team (CCTT) was established on 11th February, 2019 as requested by UNESCO and supported by the State Party in order to assist STCDA on the implementation of the previous recommendations and mission reports since 2014 to date. Therefore CCTT has started to work on those recommendations and the achievements have been obtained. The CCTT achievements are attached with this report. For more information please find *appendix no: 2* a summary of progress report.

Management system

On the Management system: to address the efficiency of the current arrangements, the Development Control Unit (DCU), the Board of Directors for the Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA), the Stakeholders Forum and the Heritage Board have been established to improve coordination and decision making. The above management system will facilitate the implementation of the STCDA 2010 Act due to the strong collaboration created within the Institutions after the establishment of the Cross Cutting Task Team.

The management system which has been developed creates a situation that ensures that the conservation and development projects in the Stone Town are implemented in accordance to the Conservation Master Plan.

The mission noted that these mechanisms are currently in place and that a Master Plan for the extended city of Zanzibar has been publicized. It includes urban regulations and will be further complemented with a detailed plan for different zones. It notes that particular attention will need to be placed on the buffer zone to avoid developments that could impact existing views and to ensure plan and architectural quality that is in compliance with the land use regulations. It also noted the urgency of updating the Conservation and Heritage Management Plan for Stone Town to integrate it with the recently formulated Master Plan;

Act, 2010

Actually the Stone Town Act of 2010 is well and fully implemented, but there are some challenges that have to be solved and in some areas need to be improved in their implementation, like the Overlapping of Power that still needs further consideration. When dealing with these challenges, several meetings were held between STCDA and ZUMC. In these meetings it was agreed not only to work together, but also to allow more discussions with Zanzibar Tourism Commission and Zanzibar Investment Promotion Authority on the area of Investment and Tourism activities. This situation was improved more after the establishment of CCTT that involved all necessary and needful stakeholders on the implementation of the Stone Town committee decisions and recommendations.

The appointment of Departmental Directors to assist the Director General is in progress. The organization Structure was submitted to the Board of Directors of STCDA for their inputs and approvals and later was submitted to the Ministry and received her consent.

On the Financial Support, STCDA implemented the recommendation of UNESCO on the issue of looking for financial support. STCDA has tried a number of institutions for consultation and directives include NATCOM, American Fund and Ministry of Finance and Planning Zanzibar.

7. Also notes with satisfaction that the overall state of conservation of the general building stock remains vulnerable and that an overall detailed inventory of the building stock is still lacking whilst welcoming the categorization of some 300

buildings owned by the Zanzibar Housing Corporation (ZHC) and the restoration skills training undertaken.

Response:

The State Party through the Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority decided to take a thorough detailed building survey work (building inventory) from the 1st June, 2018, throughout the Stone Town area. The exercise concentrated on details: on the condition of the buildings, ownership, classification and its uses. The heritage site was divided into nine zones; Shangani, Sokomuhugo, Vuga, Kajificheni, Mkunazini, Forodhani, Kiponda, Malindi and Darajani.

The exercise managed to cover 84% of survey buildings and it is expected to be completed in December 2019. Due to the above information, STCDA now is in position to know exactly the number of buildings which are in good condition, sound, poor, dilapidated and ruins.

Regarding the restoration of the building owned by the Zanzibar Housing Corporation, special collaborations and efforts between ZHC and STCDA have been taken to ensure that rehabilitation of the building meets the conservation standard. Nearly 11 poor buildings were restored out of 27, the 2019/2020 financial budget of ZHC aimed to renovate 15 buildings.

8. Expresses its concern that major development projects have not been notified to the World Heritage Centre and reiterates its request to the State Party to submit details for the Malindi Container Port and Tippu Tip House projects before any implementation is undertaken, development rights granted or fundraising started, in the light of their high potential impact on the OUV of the property, and submit for review the World Monument Fund Report for the Palace Museum Restoration;

Response:

The State Party has not yet notified the World Heritage Center and has not submitted the details for the Malindi Container Port. Presently, the State Party has not yet completed the details for the Malindi Container Port.

The State Party continues to respect the halting of all developments and expansion programs within the Port of Malindi. The Program of the demolition of the old

storage sheds in and around the port has been suspended as recommended by the WHC/ICOMOS/ICCROM Mission of February, 2016 in order to support the Stone Town Conservation efforts, when the State Party is ready for such developments will officially make notification.

9. Also requests the State Party to:

a. Halt as a matter of urgency the extensive Bwawani Hotel Redevelopment Plan (including proposals for the sea front, Funguni Lagoon and Blue Mosque), in view of its highly negative and irreversible potential impact on OUV,

b. Clarify the current status of rights to development granted on the entire area and submit this, also as a matter of urgency, to the World Heritage Centre,

c. Protect the remains of the Bwawani Hotel, and its sea front and the Funguni Lagoon as public open spaces,

d. Further develop appropriate plans for the Bwawani Hotel complex for submission to the World Heritage Centre for review,

e. Halt the current Darajani Bazaar project as it will have an adverse effect on the OUV of the property, and to develop a new project, based on the principles contained in the DoURP Ng'ambo Local Area Plan and the Green Belt proposals;

Response:

The State Party as a matter of urgency has decided to halt the extensive Bwawani Hotel Development Plan including a proposal for the sea front, Funguni Lagoon and Blue Mosque in order to save the highly negative and irreversible potential impact on OUV, as requested by UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM.

The State Party when it is ready for the development of the Bwawani Hotel project will officially make a new Notification to the WHC.

e) Concerning the Darajani Bazaar project, State Part took several initiatives concerning this issue as follows:-

- The State Party agreed to halt the project and instead to proceed with the preparation of HIA.

- STCDA collaborates with Tanzania National commission (NATCOM) in order to make sure that the project will follow the recommendations of UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM. NATCOM helped to have discussions with State House cabinet under the Chairmanship of the President. The Chairman (president) agreed with all comments from UNESCO and confirmed that the Zanzibar Government is ready to follow all opinions and recommendations from UNESCO to make sure Zanzibar Stone Town remain on the World Heritage list.
- Preparation of HIA for Darajani Project has been submitted to UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM
- During the RMM visit it was suggested that the Consultants of both two projects should meet so as to merge these two projects on considering both options and later to relate their HIA reports. Also it was directed that HIA expert for Darajani Corridor to consider the visual impact assessment and archival materials in the document of HIA.
- STCDA has been collaborating very well with the NEDCOM on the follow up of the issues on the Darajani Bazaar Project.

10. Also expresses its concern at the failure to provide project proposals and final details for the Mizingani Sea Wall project as requested in 2010, 2011 and 2016;

The final details drawings for the Mizingani Sea Wall project was submitted to UNESCO on 5th August, 2019

12. Urges the State Party to take the following actions to address these problems and, in light of their complexity and diversity and the range of stakeholders and actors involved, recommends that a cross-cutting Task Team be set up as recommended by the 2017 mission for a defined period of minimum five years with the mandate to:

a. Address the 'Procedures to Adequately Control Development and Promote Conservation',

b. Implement the outstanding recommendations of the 2014 and 2016 missions,

c. Guide the development of the new integrated Conservation Management Plan (CMP) and its coordination into all spatial local and regional plans, and invites the State Party to submit the terms of reference of the CMP for review;

Response:

The State Party under the Ministry of Land, Housing, Water and Energy Zanzibar established the team which has Chairperson and members from Stone Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA), Zanzibar Port Corporation (ZPC), Zanzibar Housing Corporation (ZHC), Zanzibar Urban Municipal Council (ZUMC), Zanzibar Environment, Management Authority (ZEMA), Zanzibar Investment Promotion Authority (ZIPA), Wakf Trust Commission, Department of Urban and Rural Planning (DoURP), Zanzibar Tourism Commission (ZTC), Department of Museum and Antiquities (DoMA), member from Tanzania National Commission for UNESCO (Natcom), Retired Director of Antiquities from Tanzania mainland and member of World Heritage Committee (2015 - 2019). The inauguration of this team was on 11th February, 2019, By the Minister of Land Housing Water and Energy, Zanzibar, the kick off meeting was 24th February, 2019, and they had five (5) meetings to date. The CCTT was part of stakeholders and actively participated in the Mission meetings.

13) Further requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in 2019 to assess the overall state of conservation of the property and in particular, progress with the formation of a Task Team;

The State Party invited the joint Reactive Monitoring Mission from UNESCO and arrived in Zanzibar on 4th December 2019 up to 7th December 2019

14. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2019, a report on the state of conservation of the property, and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020; with a view to maintaining the OUV of the property.

Response:

The State Party adheres and submits the State of Conservation of the property report on 20th December, 2019.

**STONE TOWN CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
CROSS CUTTING TASK TEAM (CCTT) REPORT**

1. Introduction

The Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority (STCDA) is an Autonomous Institution that manages the Stone Town of Zanzibar, a World Heritage site inscribed in 2000.

A series of pending issues that were requested by the World Heritage Committee meeting since 2014 has been a source of recommendations to the State Party to establish a Cross Cutting Task Team (CCTT), in a Decision 42COM 2018, which was proposed to work for five years from 2019.

The CCTT has a major role to make sure that, issues raised in the Decisions of the Committee and recommendations from the Reactive Monitoring Missions (RMM) are worked on. Therefore, the State Party under the Ministry of Land, Housing, Water and Energy established a Cross Cutting Task Team which has the following members:-

S/N	NAME	INSTITUTION	DESIGNATION
1	Mrs. Mwanaidi S. Abdalla	STCDA Board of Director	Chairperson
2	Mr.Issa S.Makarani	Director General STCDA	Secretary
3	Said J. Ahmada	Director ZUMC	Member
4	Dr. Mohammed Juma	Director DoURP	Member
5	Mr. Salum K.Nassor	Executive Director ZIPA	Member
6	Mr .Salim K. Sururu	Director DMA	Member
7	Mr. Abdulla Talib Abdulla	Executive Secretary WAKF Commission.	Member
8	Mr. Donatius Kamamba	Former, WHC – Member	Member
9	Dr. Abdulla M.Juma	Executive Secretary ZTC	Member

10	Dr. Fabian Kigabye	Director of Antiquities URT	Member
11	Mr .Erick J. Kajiru	NATCOM	Member
12	Mr .Sheha Mjaja	Director General ZEMA	Member
13	Capt. Abdalla Juma	Director General ZPC	Member
14	Mrs. Riziki Jecha Salum	Director General ZHC	Member
Secretariat Team			
1	Mrs. Madina H. Khamis	STCDA	
2	Mrs. Hidaya J. Ali	STCDA	
3	Mrs. Mafunda A. Abdalla	STCDA	
4	Mr. Mshenga M. Ali	STCDA	
5	Mr. Mussa A. Bakar	STCDA	
6	Mr. Iddi Mohammed	STCDA	

The Cross Cutting Task Team was inaugurated on 11th February, 2019 by the Minister of Ministry of Lands, Housing, Water and Energy, Zanzibar. The CCTT has held five (5) meetings to date.

2. ToR for CCTT

The CCTT has been assigned to work on issues raised in the Decisions of the World Heritage Committee from 2014 to 2018. These issues include:

- a. Ensuring the 2010 Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority Act is implemented to its full extent;
- b. Implementation of the Principles of the 2011 UNESCO Historic Urban Landscapes approach;
- c. Review of the past Committee Decisions, developing and implementing an action plan to address the following:-
 - Implementation of Approved Traffic Plan (39COM, Germany 2015);
 - Engagement of UNESCO to solicit International assistance to the State Party to improve the management capacity and system of the property. (40 COM, Istanbul, 2016);

- Continuation of the implementation of ICOMOS recommendations regarding Beit El Ajaib (House of Wonders) and keep the World Heritage Centre informed of all developments regarding the rehabilitation project of the building (42 COM, Manama 2018);
 - Assessment of the development plan and Green Corridor proposal in Ng'ambo local area by the Department of Urban and Rural Planning (DoURP), recommended preparation of the history of the successful restored Chawl building and supported the process of the Hifadhi Zanzibar Majestic Theater. (42 COM, Manama 2018);
 - Follow up on mitigation and restoration measures for the Mambo Msiige project, identified by the 2016 mission, the Tippu Tip House and the Palace Museum.
 - Assessment of the overall state of conservation of the general building stock and encourage STCDA to accelerate the preparation of inventory of the building stock (42 COM, 2018);
 - Encourage and direct STCDA to ensure that all major development projects are reported to the World Heritage Centre by submitting details for the Malindi Container Port and Tippu Tip House projects before any implementation is undertaken;
 - Advise the government to halt Bwawani Hotel Redevelopment Plan including proposals for the Sea Front, Funguni Lagoon and Blue Mosque;
 - Noted and appraise the finalization of the Mizingani Sea Wall Project as requested in 2010 and 2016. (42 COM, 2018);
 - Invitation of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in 2019 (42 COM, Manama 2018);
- d. Review of past recommendations of Reactive Monitoring and Advisory missions and developing and implementing an action plan to address the following:-
- i. Encourage the government to provide financial support systems for restoration processes;
 - ii. Encourage use of interpretive signage including visitors' behavior guidelines;

- Monitoring the implementation of all *Procedures to Adequately Control Development And Promote Conservation* as developed by the 2016 joint UNESCO/ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring mission;
- Monitoring of the proper functioning of the DCU, Heritage Board and Stakeholders Forum and reporting to the President of Zanzibar through the Minister of Lands, Housing, Water and Energy;
- Participation in the preparation of the development of the new integrated Conservation Management Plan (CMP) and coordination of its integration into all spatial local and regional plans, or the modulation of the latter, as needed to safeguard the OUV of the property and its setting;
- Serving as a central point of communication between the various bodies of government with a presence in the World Heritage Property;
- Developing strategically the newly constituted Condominium Board's contribution to the conservation of the buildings of Stone Town of Zanzibar and the buffer zone.

3. Achievements

S/N	TARGET	ACHIEVEMENT	REMARKS
1	A Green Corridor Proposal for Ng'ambo be presented to CCTT meeting for discussion and approval by 30 th December 2019	The Green Corridor Project was presented and discussed during the CCTT meeting held on 2nd October 2019	The proposal should be submitted to the Cabinet for decision and direction (Annex 1).
2	The rehabilitation project of the Beit - El - Ajaib contract be signed by 30 th December 2019	(i) The Contract for the rehabilitation of the Beit El Ajaib was signed on 11 th October 2019	The rehabilitation project for Beit –El Ajaib has started.
		(ii) Synopsis of rehabilitation of Beit-El-Aljaib	Documents are available
		(ii)Formento Territorial of comprehensive regeneration of Beit-El-Ajaib	Documents are available
		(iii) Schedule of works	Documents are available

		(iv) Working drawing of Beit –El-Ajaib	Documents are available
3	CCTT agreement with Mambo Msiige Management on the implementation of the RMM recommendations be prepared, discussed and approved by both parties by 30th December 2019	An Agreement on the implementation of the RMM recommendations was prepared, presented to CCTT, discussed and approved by both parties on Wednesday at 20/4/2019	A copy of the Agreement document be has been submitted to the Ministry of Land Housing, Water and Energy for information and action on September,2019. (Annex 6)
4	An updated conservation plan for the People's Palace Museum be prepared and approved by 30th December 2019	The people's Palace Museum Conservation Plan was prepared, presented to CCTT, discussed and approved in its 4th meeting held on Wednesday, 2 nd October 2019	The Conservation Plan document for the People's Palace Museum is in place (Annex 7)
5	The Darajani Corridor Project be presented to CCTT before 30 December 2019	The existed drawings that were prepared in 2017 were the ones that raised the HIA comments which needed to be reviewed.	Reviewed drawings based on HIA were submitted and presented to UNESCO World Heritage Center on November, 2019.
6	A conservation plan for Tippu Tip house be prepared by 30th December 2019.	The Tippu Tip Conservation Plan was prepared, presented to CCTT, discussed and approved.	A copy of the Tippu Tip House Conservation Plan be submitted to RMM. (Annex 9)
7	Effective implementation of STCDA Act, 2010 before 30 th March 2020 - Overlapping of power	Several meetings between STCDA and ZUMC were conducted and agreed to strengthen their collaboration.	After meeting with ZUMC and councilors which was chaired by honorable Mayor of Zanzibar Town, the Task Force Team which consist some

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Appointment of STCDA Departmental Directors - Financial support - Regulations for STCDA Act, 2010 	<p>Organization structure presented to CCTT on its 4th meeting</p> <p>Action Plan has been prepared and submitted to CCTT for discussion and approval.</p> <p>Areas of concern were identified, presented to CCTT, discussed and CCTT directed STCDA to prepare regulations</p>	<p>members from STCDA and ZUMC has been created in order to work on the challenges.</p> <p>The Organization Structure has been submitted to the Ministry of LHWE for comments and later be submitted to Public Services Commission.</p> <p>A copy of Organization structure is attached (Annex 10)</p> <p>A copy of draft Action plan is attached. (Annex 11)</p> <p>Work on regulations is in progress.</p>
8	An inventory of buildings in the Stone Town of Zanzibar be finalized by 30 th December 2019	The inventory of building stock in the Stone Town was prepared, submitted to CCTT for comments and directives in its 4 th meeting held on Wednesday 2 nd October 2019	The inventory work is in progress and will be submitted by 30 th December, 2019.
9	Invitation letter to RMM before 30 th December,	Done	A copy of Invitation letter (Annex 14)

	2019.		
10	Traffic Plan implementation before 30 th December, 2019.	The preparation of the traffic plan document completed and submitted to the Cabinet.	Stakeholders are in discussion for implementation A copy of Traffic Plan attached (Annex 15)
11	Meeting with Condominium Board before 30 th December 2019	Secretariat held the meeting with Condominium Board on September, 2019	Memorandum of Understanding should be developed for strengthening collaboration
12	Procedure to adequate control (updating)	Procedure to adequate control was prepared, presented to CCTT, discussed and approved in its 5 th meeting.	A copy of Procedure to adequate control (Annex 17)
13	Ensure the effective functioning of : a. DCU b. Stakeholders forum c. Heritage board	CCTT met with DCU, Stakeholders forum and Heritage board on its 5 th meeting. a. 44 Meetings held. b. 4 Meetings held. c. 3 Meetings held in preparation of guidelines	Constitution (Annex 18)
14	Conservation Master Plan (review)	The project started on 4 th September, 2019.	(Annex 18)
	SEA WALL	The drawings has been submitted to UNESCO	

	BWAWANI HOTEL		
--	---------------	--	--



**THE ZANZIBAR ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT AUTHORITY (ZEMA)
AND
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENT**

Environmental opinion of the outstanding issues on Park Hyatt Zanzibar Hotel
(Mambo Msiige Building) in light of UNESCO's heritage requirements

1. Introduction

The Stone Town of Zanzibar is located on western edge of the Zanzibar Town. It covers total area of 96 hectares and a buffer zone area of 84.79 hectares, which make about 5.4 % of the total area of Zanzibar Town (according to 1982 boundary). In 2000, the Stone Town of Zanzibar was included in the World Heritage Sites of the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). The Sites are established based on World Heritage Convention of 1972 with the aim of cataloging and preserving sites of outstanding importance, either cultural or natural, to the common heritage of humankind. World Heritage Sites are designated as having “an outstanding universal value” under the Convention Concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage.

The World Heritage Committee has been established, among others, to examine reports of the state of conservation of inscribed properties under the UNESCO's heritage programmes, and request States Parties to take action when properties are not being properly managed and abide to.. The Committee also decides on the continued inscription or removal of properties that are on the List of World Heritage Sites in Danger based on the compliance and performance of the States.

In this regard, there are documented non-compliance concerns from the World Heritage Committee on the structure that is now known as the Park Hyatt Zanzibar Hotel. This is a Five Star Hotel located in the former Mambo Msiige Building along Shangani Road and adjacent to the Serena and Tembo Hotels in the Stone Town of Zanzibar. Within the list of those outstanding non-compliant issues for Park Hyatt, there are two environmental related issues whereby Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority (ZEMA) and Department of Environment, Zanzibar have been requested to provide professional opinion on those issues.

Therefore, this report prepared by Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority (ZEMA) and Department of Environment highlighting technical opinions to support decision making process.

2. The Outstanding Environmental related Issues

There are two environmental related outstanding issues provided by World Heritage Committee for Park Hyatt Zanzibar Hotel (former Mambo Msiige Building). The issues are as follows:

- i. The compliance requirement to demolish all enclosing walls, fences and retaining walls to the beach and level the site with the level of the sidewalk on the sea front adjacent to the park perimeters; and instead to provide coral stone steps along the entire length of the sea-front of the park to the beach.
- ii. The compliance requirement to remove electricity generators from the existing garden zone (these could potentially be housed under-ground) and extend the park up to building edge, while ensuring the entire area is to be fully accessible to the public in line with the commitments of the Environmental and Heritage Assessment reports of the Hotel Project.

3. Objective of the report

The main objective of the Report is to provide technical environmental opinion of the above mentioned issues so as to support decision making process that will enhance the conservation and minimizing environmental risk of Park Hyatt Zanzibar Hotel (Mambo Msiige building) and Zanzibar Stone Town in general.

4. Methodology used

The following methods were used for the purpose of preparation of this report:

- i. **Formulation of Technical Team:** A Technical Team constituted of four (4) senior technical staff formed to carry out analysis of stated non-compliant issues and provide technical opinion on feasible solutions to the stated requirements. The team was constituted with the Director General, Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority, Director, Department of Environment, State Attorney of ZEMA, and Senior Environmental Impact Assessment Office of ZEMA.
- ii. **Consultations with Stakeholders (Meetings and Interviews):** Consultation with key members of the Park Hyatt Hotel, Tembo, Serena Hotel, Institute of marine Science, Stone Town Conservation and Development Authority, selected fishermen and beach users were carried out in order to gather their views and perceptions on the issues. The inputs from these Stakeholders form part of the opinion of the report.
- iii. **Review of Documents:** The team reviewed both secondary and primary information/data. Furthermore, the team reviewed policies, institutional and legal regulatory frameworks pertinent to environmental and heritage compliance in accordance with the ESIA procedures and implementation of the Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP). Some critical historical and archeological information was

obtained through literature, government reports and internet. Some of the reports consulted include; Environmental Impact Statement for the Proposed Zamani Palace Hotel At Stone Town, Zanzibar of 2012, Application for inclusion of Stone Town, Zanzibar on the World Heritage List, the Zanzibar Environmental Management Act, 2015, the Zanzibar Climate Change Strategy of 2014, the UNESCO and World Heritage Site websites; the Economics of Climate Change in Zanzibar of 2011.

- iv. **Transect Walk:** The team undertook a transect walk along the coastal line of the project area and near marginal zones of the Hotel site and further to existing garden/park area and in the generator room. This exercise was carried out in order to identify the morphology and nature of the beach of the coastal line of the site.

5. Key Observations

- i. There is a slight deformation or bending of the sea wall along the beach side on the sea front. This is due to frequent impacts exacerbated by storm surges and unusual fluctuation levels of high-tides, which is caused by sea level rise.
- ii. Depression or subsidence of the some of the floor levels exposed to coastal dynamics, which is also caused by storm surge and high-tide levels due to sea level rise.
- iii. The generators are well placed in a closed building, well surrounded by good vegetations and trees. In this regard, visual Impact is well mitigated.
- iv. Well designed and protected garden located eastern part of the hotel, which adds value of the hotel.
- v. The coastline along the hotel is easily accessible by community and no restriction from hotel.

6. Possible mitigation options for the issues

6.1 Demolish all enclosing walls, fences and retaining walls

6.1.1 Options outlined

Three options with their respective advantage and disadvantages were highlighted as follows:

- **Option 1: Demolish the seawall according to the directive from the Committee of World Heritage Site.**
 - **Advantage:** Advantage of this option is that the Government will follow the directive from the World Heritage Committee and therefore the issue will be resolved and removed from the list of outstanding issues.

- **Disadvantage:** The climate risk associated with storm surge and sea level rise will be highly increased and therefore jeopardizing the building as an “outstanding universal value”. Without any positive concrete structure to protect sea level rise, the building will be in danger.
- **Option 2: Not to Demolish the Seawall:**
 - **Advantage:** In the short term this will protect the building from storm surges and high-tide levels, which is caused by sea level rise.
 - **Disadvantage:** This will not provide the long term solution for climate change risks associated with storm surge and high tide level due to sea level rise, which is expected to continue rising in the future. Currently, there is a slight shifting of the wall and depression of some of the coastal line, which is mainly caused by the impact of storm surge and high tide level.
- **Option 3: Design and construct proper sea wall along the coastline of the entire Stone Town area of Zanzibar**

This option was provided by considering the fact that the climate of Zanzibar is changing, and recent decades have seen rising temperatures, increased rainfall variability, higher wind speeds and high-tide levels, and an increase in extreme events (climate variability). Without proper and adequate measures to protect the Stone Town of Zanzibar in term of storm surge and high tide levels, many building of the Town will be endangered and thus potentially harming the ‘outstanding universal value’ of the Town.

- **Advantage:** Will provide long term solution for protecting the entire area of the Zanzibar Stone Town due to risk associated to climate change and hence increasing the value of the town.
- **Disadvantage:** Would be very expensive, time consuming and more technical and studies needed.

6.1.2 Opinions of the Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority and Department of Environment

Based on the above-mentioned options and by considering the increasing global temperatures, the Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority and Department of Environment are of the view to have long term solution of protecting the Stone Town of Zanzibar from the risk associated with climate change impact in terms of storm surge and high tide level due to sea

level rise. In this regard, these two Institutions are highly recommending the following on the agenda:

1. *There is no need to demolish the existing seawall, which is protecting Park Hyatt Hotel from storm surge and high tide level.*
2. *For short term measures, the hotel could request the Stone Town Development Control Authority to provide proper remedy measure for the existing problem of shifting of the wall.*
3. *For the long term measures, there is a need for UNESCO in collaboration with UNEP and Government of Zanzibar to prepare a concept paper and project proposal for safeguarding the Stone Town of Zanzibar due to the impact of Climate Change, and in particular the sea level rise, by constructing proper and accepted sea wall across the town. The fund for the project could be mobilized through Green Climate Fund (GCF) or Adaptation Fund (AF) of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).*

6.2 Remove generators from the park

6.2.1 Options outlined

The following are the options outlined for the issue:

▪ Option 1: Remove the generators from the existing area

The Directive from World Heritage Committee is to remove the generators from their existing location to other place within the project area.

- **Advantage:** Advantage of this option is that the Government will follow the directive from the World Heritage Committee and therefore the issue will be cleared and removed from the list of outstanding issues.
- **Disadvantage:** Currently, there is no proper place within the project area that could be properly used to install the two big generators. Significant impacts that could occur in terms of demolishing building for placement of generators.

▪ Option 2: Put the generators on the ground

The height of the generator is about 2 meters and a length of 3meters; and width of 1,5m; therefore you need to dig a pit of nearly 12m³ for a single generator. For the existing situation of project site, it would be difficult to dig a pit of not more 2m without hitting on the seawater. Therefore, it would be a direct contact of generators with seawater and thus increasing the risk of rusting and leakage of the generator, which will lead to marine pollution.

- **Advantage:** Remove the visual Impact and you could use the top land of the generator by improving the landscape of the area.

- **Disadvantage:** Maintenance cost and replacement of new generator is high and well as risk to marine pollution due to leakage of oil.
- **Option 3: The generators remain in the existing state of affairs (status quo)**
 - **Advantage:** Maintenance cost is low, visual impact is mitigated through the existing trees and plants which also provide emissions mitigation. Leakage could be easily identified and handled and therefore, no risk to marine pollution.
 - **Disadvantage:** Could potentially not be accepted by the World Heritage Committee.

6.2.2 Opinion of the Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority and Department of Environment

Based on the above-mentioned options, the Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority and Department of Environment are of the view that the generators remain in the existing state of affairs. The Hotel management needs to be asked to provide timely maintenance services of the generators, and not allow any fuel or oil leakage. Furthermore, the Hotel Management needs to continue provide and maintain the existing garden and trees cover located around the generators.

7. Conclusion

The Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority and Department of Environment Zanzibar analyzed the two environmental related issues for the benefit of heritage and environmental conservation practices. Therefore, It is our hope that the options recommended in this report would be implemented to enhance long term sustainable management and conservation of the Zanzibar Stone Town for the benefit of all.

Submitted by:

.....
 Sheha M. Juma
 Director General
 Zanzibar Environmental Management Authority
 (ZEMA)
 Zanzibar

.....
 Farhat A. Mbarouk
 Director
 Department of Environment
 Zanzibar

Date:.....

Date:.....

S/N	MATRIX – MAMBO MSIIGE MITIGATION MEASURE				
	MITIGATION MEASURES	CCTT RECOMMENDATIONS	PROGRESS	WAY FORWARD	TIME FRAME
a	The State Party should prepare and implement in cooperation with the owner of the lease of the complex, a complete Heritage Conservation and Management Plan, developed by a qualified heritage professional for the Mambo Msiige Building for examination by the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies.	STCDA provide technical expertise for the preparation of Heritage Conservation and Management Plan for Mambo Msiige Building, and the cost for the preparation should be incurred by the Park Hyatt Management.	The Park Hayyat Management agreed	STCDA has engaged the needs to prepare the HMP, plan to get someone to do the work	April, 2020.
b	No first floor level link is to be constructed between the Mambo Msiige building and the new building (on 04 November 2014 no such permanent link had yet been constructed).	CCTT agreed with opinion of Park Hyatt Management that the first floor link have to remain for the following reasons:- <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It has Physical appearance in accordance with design and materials used. • To pay attention for the needs of people 		The first floor level link to continue to serve the human purposes	

		<p>with disability.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The link facilitates the provision of services between the buildings. • It is one among the feature available in the Stone Town area. 			
c	<p>Develop at own cost and install an extensive set of publicly accessible, high quality, visually designed interpretation panels in front of the old. Mambo Msiige Building facing on to Kelele Square outlining in both Kiswahili and English:</p> <p>i. Information regarding the World Heritage Status of Stone Town of Zanzibar, including its boundaries and list of its Grade I Monuments with a map of their locations.</p> <p>ii. The history of Kelele Square</p> <p>iii. The history of the Mambo Msiige building</p>	CCTT agreed on the proposed exhibition work.	STCDA, DMA together with Management of the Park Hyatt Hotel agreed for implementation on the design of Interpretation panels and display in front of Mambo Msiige, planned to start immediately.	STCDA and DMA are waiting for the final approval of budget before implementation from Hotel management	February 2020.

	<p>and its associated structures and including important people and events</p> <p>iv. The history of the surveying of the East African coast and the role of the Mambo Msiige and the beacon on the roof as part of this process.</p> <p>v. Visual historical drawings and photographs</p> <p>vi. Explanation of the public significance of the Mambo Msiige building to the people of Zanzibar.</p>				
d	<p>The building lease owner should be requested to develop, entirely at own cost and in conjunction with the Department of Antiquities and Museum, a permanent exhibition on the history and significance Mambo Msiige complex for inclusion in the new exhibitions of the National Museum of Zanzibar (Beit-al-Ajaib/House of Wonders). This should provide for complete funding for the cost of development, archival</p>	<p>CCTT agreed on the proposed exhibition work</p>	<p>STCDA and DMA have collected all the historical information concerning the building and Kelele Square. The Management of Park Hyatt agreed to incur the cost of research and display the historical information.</p>	<p>STCDA and DMA together with the Management of the Hotel to implement the first exhibition followed by this (d).</p>	<p>After the completion of the House of Wonder Project.</p>

	research and production and the final installation of the exhibition, which is to take place directly after restoration of the National Museum of Zanzibar.				
e	Traffic: Develop and submit for approval an updated traffic management plan for the Hotel which is to be implemented within 2 months after approval thereof.	CCTT advise the requested Stone Town Traffic Plan to incorporate the Hotel Traffic plan.	Traffic plan for the Hotel has been incorporated within the proposed Traffic Plan for the whole Stone Town, including ; a) Proper available parking system b) Load and unloading zones c) One way system from Malindi to Vuga via Serena Hotel	The new Traffic Plan has already approved by the State Party and now the special task team has formulated including the Traffic Police for implementation.	
	THE NEW BUILDING: Plaster and paint.				
a.	Remove all timber imitation wood siding panels on the façade of the new building.	Done			
b.	Install a continuous level parapet without any crenulations.	Done			

c.	Smooth over horizontal banding in the pilasters at the ground-floor façade facing onto Kelele Square. Paint to match the rest of the building.	CCTT agreed with the opinion and ask the Hotel owner leased to take action.	Park Hyatt Management agreed to implement within a short period.	STCDA for follow up and supervision.	On 20 th January, 2020.
OPEN SPACES:					
a.	Public Park. (North-east of new building) The park should remain public.	CCTT agreed with opinion of Park Hyatt Management, the park not to be open for the public due to the security reasons of the Hotel guests.	The place is opened for public on certain occasion.		
b.	Demolish all enclosing walls, fences and retaining walls to the beach and level the site with the level of the sidewalk. Provide coral stone seating steps along the entire length of the sea-front of the park leading from the park to the beach. • Remove generators from the park (these could potentially be housed under-ground) and extend the park up to building edge. Ensure the entire area is to be completely public.	CCTT agreed with opinion of Park Hyatt Management to maintain the retaining walls for protection of waves caused by high tides. CCTT agreed with opinion of Park Hyatt Management because of the following reasons:- Construction of the basement structure to	Zanzibar Environment Management Authority (ZEMA) report recommend that the wall should remain for the protection due the climate risk (see the attached environmental report)		

		shelter the Generator technically seems difficult and complicated due to the close water table of sea water, circulation of air The dampness created by sea water will seriously decay the generators.			
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pave the path between the public open space and the Tembo Hotel from the street to the beach to allow for access. No stairs are to be used along this path to allow for it to be used to transfer boats to the beach. 	Done			
b	Open space around the tree between Mambo Msiige and the new building to be retained as completely open to the public. No fence or other barrier is to be erected towards the street that might deter the public from accessing the space. Ensure the space remains publicly accessible.	CCTT agreed with opinion of Park Hyatt. The existing pattern of the area it is the same design appeared at present. Boundary fence with gate was there historically.	The space provided has been maintained as it was before.		
	c. Plant screening planting against the street-facing façade of the new building, along the entire length of the blind wall.	Done	Done		

	d. Any parking for the hotel should be in line with the approved parking plan.	CCTT advise the requested Stone Town Traffic Plan to incorporate the Hotel Traffic plan to the Stone Town Traffic Plan.	Traffic plan for the hotel has been incorporated within the proposed Traffic Plan for the whole Stone Town, including ; a) proper available parking system	The new traffic plan has already approved by the State Party and now the special task team has formulated including the Traffic Police for implementation.	
	e. Explore the re-construction of the timber jetty as required by the HIA:	CCTT observed that there was no timber jetty before the commencement of the project.			
	INTERIOR				
a	Remove ground floor marble floor tiling and replace as per HIA recommendations with checker-board of white marble and black slate.	CCTT advises the State Party to consider if there is any possible option	The State Party is looking for the availability of the historic floor marble tiling.	State Party will ask the Park Hayatt management to implement the recommendation as per HIA as appropriate.	April,2020
b	Remove newly installed two silver lanterns from the interior walls of the covered atrium. These are not appropriate in the historic building or its Swahili context and should not be relocated to either interior or exterior of the Mambo Msiige building.	CCTT opinion is that this feature is temporary and does not affect the structure and appearance of the building.			

c	The existing stone stairs in the north-western corner of the Mambo Msiige building are not to be covered and existing stone slabs, if broken should be restored. Only where stones are missing are new matching stones to be introduced	CCTT observed that, the stone stairs in the North west corner of the Mambo Msiige has not been covered.			
EXTERIOR					
a	Remove extension to the balcony, including the roof extension on the second floor of the sea-facing façade of the link building between the Mambo Msiige building and the boat house/WAKF building. The situation should return to the pre-construction set-up.	CCTT after visiting has seen that, there was no any impact on the appearance of the balcony and its roof. Proposed to discuss with RMM.			
b	Remove the new rooftop terrace and its balustrade on the old boat-house. Repair the parapet to its original appearance.	Done			
c	Reinstate the steel grills that were removed from the street facing archways (now located in the STCDA Workshop yard behind the Beit-al-Ajaib/House of Wonders) and reinstate the	CCTT will discuss this issue with RMM that there is no need to reinstate the steel grills.	The steel which are there are not historical elements but that time provided by STCDA for security reasons.		

	original façade configuration with one entrance only on the north-eastern corner of the old building.				
d	Ensure the reinstallation of the bronze plaque on the trigonometry beacon.	Done			
e	Replace the garage doors and service entrance with doors more in harmony with the building and environment. Again, the culture of doors in Zanzibar deserves better treatment than what has been used on this very visible street facade.	CCTT request the Park Hyatt Management to change the garage door into timber.	The Park Hyatt Management has agreed to change the garage door into timber as proposed.	RMM has advised the State Party to insist asking the Hotel management to change the door, once they complete the State Party can take a pictures of the changes and send to UNESCO for approval	March, 2020
f	The HIA called for the swimming pool to be moved to an inner courtyard. This would still be the best solution! At a minimum, however, the hotel should install a latticed wooden screen for the swimming pool, replacing the current plexiglass, which exposes the swimmers to the public walking along the beach.	CCTT request the Park Hyatt Management to install a latticed wooden screen for the swimming pool.	The Park Hyatt Management agreed to implement.	Waiting for budget approval for implementation from Park Hyatt Management.	March , 2020

	This screen would still allow for a view out from the pool, but would help screen it from public view on the beach.				
--	---	--	--	--	--