

ICOMOS

INTERNATIONAL COUNCIL ON MONUMENTS AND SITES
CONSEIL INTERNATIONAL DES MONUMENTS ET DES SITES
CONSEJO INTERNACIONAL DE MONUMENTOS Y SITIOS
МЕЖДУНАРОДНЫЙ СОВЕТ ПО ВОПРОСАМ ПАМЯТНИКОВ И ДОСТОПРИМЕЧАТЕЛЬНЫХ МЕСТ

Our Ref. GB/AS/1605/IR

Charenton-le-Pont, 18 January 2019

H. E. Mr. Vinay Mohan Kwatra
Permanent Delegation of India to UNESCO
Maison de l'UNESCO
1, rue Miollis
75732 Paris CEDEX 15

World Heritage List 2019
**Jaipur City, Rajasthan (India) –
Interim report and additional information request**

Dear Ambassador,

As prescribed by the revised Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention and its Annex 6, the Advisory Bodies have been requested to submit a short interim report for each nomination by 31 January 2019. We are therefore pleased to provide you with the relevant information outlining issues related to the evaluation process.

The ICOMOS technical evaluation mission to the “Jaipur City, Rajasthan” was carried out by Sharif Shams Imon (Bangladesh) in September 2018. The mission expert highly appreciated the availabilities and support provided by the experts in your country for the organization and implementation of the mission.

On 09 October 2018, a letter was sent by ICOMOS to request further information regarding the maps and inventories, integrity and authenticity, protection and management. Please convey our thanks to all the officials and experts for the additional information you provided on 06 November 2018 and for their continued cooperation in this process.

At the end of November 2018, the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel evaluated the cultural and mixed properties nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List in 2019. The additional information, together with mission and desk review reports were carefully examined by the Panel members. This process will conclude in March 2019.

We thank you for the availability of your Delegation to the meeting held on Friday 23 November 2018 with some representatives of the ICOMOS Panel. The exchanges during this meeting were of great help for the discussions at the ICOMOS Panel meeting. Following the completion of their deliberations, the ICOMOS Panel has identified areas where it considers further information is needed.

While the ICOMOS Panel considered that the “Jaipur City, Rajasthan” might have the potential to meet the requirements for Outstanding Universal Value, this has not yet been demonstrated.

Therefore, we would be pleased if the State Party could consider the following points:

Documentation

In order to fully understand the extent of the nominated area and its Buffer Zone, the ICOMOS Panel would be pleased if the State Party could provide good quality and detailed mapping of the boundaries and buffer zone at a better scale than that provided with the nomination dossier.

The ICOMOS Panel took note that the State Party is preparing a more detailed inventory of the nominated property to be completed by the end of 2020. It is understood the focus is on urban character rather than individual buildings. Could the State Party provide further information about the level and the nature of details to be included in the inventory, and its adequacy to assist with understanding heritage values and guide protection, conservation and management? A few samples of the proposed detailed inventory would be appreciated.

Attributes

The Nomination dossier indicates in one place that the proposed attributes related to the proposed Outstanding Universal Value are the "18th century town plan, iconic monuments, urban form, gates, bazars and streets". At another place, a slightly different list of attributes is suggested in the Nomination dossier, i.e. "architectural style, grid-iron plan, town planning principles, traditional house forms, iconic monuments, living traditions and artistic works".

The city wall is also referenced in other places in the Nomination dossier, although it is not clear if this means the remnant wall, the subsurface wall footings where the wall above-ground no longer survives, and/or the alignment of the wall where the wall exists or not.

During the meeting between the ICOMOS Panel and the State Party, it has been suggested that the haveli (traditional noblemen houses) were not considered as part of the proposed attributes. However, the draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value makes several references to haveli.

Therefore, the ICOMOS Panel would be pleased if the State Party could provide a clarified list of proposed attributes, as well as a good quality mapping to indicate their location within the nominated area. It is noted that the list may refer to classes or types of attributes, rather than each individual example. However, in the case of a general class such as "iconic monuments", a complete list of each example should be provided.

In the case of the mapping of crafts as an attribute, the map provided in the nomination dossier at Figure 3.11 is noted. However, it would be useful if the State Party could provide better quality and detailed mapping at a larger scale to indicate more precisely the locations/areas where such crafts are practiced?

Justification for Criterion (vi)

Jaipur is historically associated with 36 craft industries, the Nomination dossier indicates that "today the city has over 30 different craft forms", and the map provided suggests there are only about 8 crafts within the nominated property.

The ICOMOS Panel would be pleased if the State Party could provide a list of crafts in the property, along with a summary statement about the health and organisation of their current practice. Could the State Party confirm whether these crafts are thriving, stable, in decline or no longer existing?

In addition, the comparative analysis makes little reference to these crafts, which are central to the proposed justification for criterion (vi).

Could the comparative analysis be further augmented to consider similar arts and crafts zoning in Chinese cities and in Hanoi, for example.

Conservation

It is apparent the state of conservation of the property varies greatly with some features being in an acceptable condition, but others appear in poor condition. It is noted there are existing conservation projects and programs, especially for bazaar facades, and a joint project to be undertaken with the Archaeological Survey of India to improve conservation.

Given the large number of attributes to be conserved and managed, the ICOMOS Panel would be interested to receive further information on how does the State Party propose to address this challenge and achieve an acceptable state of conservation across the whole property – including all attributes.

Legal protection

One of the apparent major issues with the nominated property appears to be the extent of unauthorised and illegal constructions, this raises serious doubts about the on-ground effectiveness of legal protection. It is understood that notices have been issued for illegal constructions, but that enforcement is constrained by ongoing legal action by owners. This situation undermines the effectiveness of legal protection.

It is also noted there is an initiative to make local people aware of cultural values, and to seek their cooperation in protection activities.

Could the State Party indicate what is proposed regarding the future of existing unauthorised and illegal constructions? In addition, the ICOMOS Panel would be pleased if the State Party could provide further information on what level of commitment could be given by the stakeholders that legal protection will be effective in the future?

Management

The Nomination dossier provides details about the management system including the existence of various plans and the establishment of a Heritage Cell within the Jaipur Municipal Corporation. However, it is apparent the current management system is uncoordinated and lacks adequate supportive legal and administrative tools and power.

The ICOMOS Panel would be pleased if the State Party could provide additional information on the improvements planned to the coordination of the management system, and how adequate supportive legal and administrative tools and power can be provided to ensure the satisfactory management of the property?

Forward planning

The Walled City of Jaipur is a Heritage Zone and the Jaipur Development Plan acknowledges that the walled city is the densest part of the wider city. This puts an additional load on the historic infrastructure and services, and this in turn impacts on the overall quality of life. It also acknowledges that Heritage Zones require special conservation and regeneration plans.

The ICOMOS Panel would be pleased to receive updated information and confirmation on when these plans will be developed.

Monitoring

The Nomination dossier provides details about the proposed monitoring for the property. This includes a list of key indicators for measuring state of conservation. However, the indicators do not appear to cover the state of conservation of the full range of attributes, and threatening processes.

Could the State Party indicate if the monitoring system can be improved by the addition of indicators to cover the state of conservation of the full range of attributes, and threatening processes?

We look forward to your responses to these points, which will be of great help in our evaluation process.

We would be grateful if you could provide ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre with the above information **by 28 February 2019** at the latest, the deadline set out in paragraph 148 of the Operational Guidelines for supplementary information on nominations to be received. Please note that any information submitted after this date will not be considered by ICOMOS in its evaluation for the World Heritage Committee. It should be noted, however, that while ICOMOS will carefully consider any supplementary information submitted, it cannot properly evaluate a completely revised nomination or large amounts of new information submitted at the last minute. So we request to keep your response concise and respond only to the above requests.

We thank you for your support of the World Heritage Convention and the evaluation process.

Yours faithfully,



Marie-Laure Lavenir
Director General
ICOMOS International Secretariat

Copy to Jaipur Municipal Corporation
 UNESCO World Heritage Centre