



Islamic Republic of Afghanistan



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization



Cultural Landscape and  
Archaeological Remains of  
the Bamiyan Valley  
inscribed on the World  
Heritage List in 2003

## **International Technical Meeting on the future of the Bamiyan World Heritage Property**

The “International Technical Meeting on the future of the Bamiyan World Heritage Property” was held in Salalah, Oman from December 3 to 5, 2018. It was organized by the Ministry of Information and Culture of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan, GUtech University of Technology in Muscat, UNESCO and RIO – Research Centre Indian Ocean, with the financial assistance from the Government of Japan and in close cooperation with the Office of the Adviser for Cultural Affairs to His Majesty the Sultan and ICOMOS Oman. The final meeting agenda and participants’ list are in attachment (Annex 1).

The participants to this technical meeting,

Considering the particular importance of the Bamiyan World Heritage property for the people of Afghanistan and the humankind;

Acknowledging the generous and long-term engagement of international donors to the safeguarding of the Bamiyan property, in particular the ongoing support of the European Union, Italy, Japan and the Republic of Korea;

Reiterating the Decision 31 COM 7A. 21 by the World Heritage Committee at its 31<sup>st</sup> session in 2007, which set a series of benchmarks to achieve a “Desired State of Conservation” that would enable the removal of the Bamiyan property from the List of World Heritage in Danger;

Acknowledging the Decision of the previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee on the state of conservation of the Bamiyan property,

Also acknowledging the Recommendation of the 14<sup>th</sup> Expert Working Group Meeting for the Safeguarding of the Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley World Heritage Property, held in Japan in 2017;

Taking note of the ongoing debates on the issue on recovery and reconstruction of cultural heritage;

Referring to the ICOMOS Salalah Guidelines for the Management of Public Archaeological Sites, adopted at the 19<sup>th</sup> ICOMOS General Assembly in India, in December 2017;

Also referring to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict and its two Protocols;

### **Session 1 – Current status of the Bamiyan World Heritage property**

1.1 Suggest that all the technical information produced by experts, agencies and UNESCO be centralized and shared as a single system by the Government of Afghanistan, notably the Ministry of Information and Culture, and encourage coordination with relevant Ministries and the local Bamiyan government in this regard;

1.2 Recommend that the inventory and documentation of Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) in Bamiyan be conducted and integrated into a database of the national and local government;

1.3 Recommend that all issues regarding illegal construction and land acquisition within the World Heritage property and buffer zones be coordinated between the Ministry of Information and Culture, the Ministry of Urban Development and the Lands, , the Ministry of Finance and the local government in Bamiyan, to ensure protection of the property;

1.4 Recommend that a Management Plan be established, and within it a relevant governance system;

### **Session 2 – Favouring the sustainable development of the Bamiyan Valley**

2.1 Take note that the Bamiyan Strategic Master Plan has been approved by the President of Afghanistan and recommend that the Plan be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review of its advisory body;

2.2 Take also note that the Strategic Master Plan includes a traffic plan component and a bypass road, and that this requires further technical, geological and economic feasibility studies, including Environmental and Heritage Impact Assessments in accordance with national rules and regulations;

2.3 Remind that in 2018, the Afghan authorities received the evaluation on the stone-paved road project by ICOMOS through UNESCO, and recommend to examine the project in due time against the concept of the future Bamiyan Archaeological Park, and further recommend that prior to the implementation of any construction activities these recommendations be taken into account;

2.4 Recommend the use of accurate GIS-based cultural mapping information, such as the one prepared for the Cultural Master Plan, for future development plans in Bamiyan (and not that from the 2003 map used for the nomination dossier of the World Heritage List, which is outdated);

### **Session 3 – Potential Rehabilitation of the Eastern Buddha Statue**

3.1 Welcome the authorities' decision and the detailed Action Plan (Annex 2) prepared by the national technical working committee, which resulted from the international meeting on "The Future of the Bamiyan Buddha Statues: Technical Considerations and Potential Effects on Authenticity and Outstanding Universal Value", held in Tokyo in September 2017; and support the authorities' plan in further investigating the four technical proposals presented at the same 2017 Tokyo meeting;

3.2 Underline, in the meantime, the importance of a proper preservation of the Buddha statue fragments;

#### **Session 4 – Management of the Bamiyan World Heritage site – opportunities and challenges**

4.1 Acknowledge the current Government's efforts to revise the 2004 National Law for the Protection of Cultural and Historical Properties, which should respect the provisions of the international cultural conventions, and recommend accelerating the adoption of the revised law and adopting further regulations and guidelines for the protection and promotion of the Bamiyan World Heritage property;

4.2 Acknowledge that the Government of Afghanistan, through the Ministry of Information and Culture and other relevant national and local institutions, is securing national budget to manage the Bamiyan World Heritage property and recommend further efforts to ensure proper financial and human resources to address future challenges;

4.4 Encourage the Government of Afghanistan to promote outreach activities for an enhanced interpretation of the World Heritage property, in order to provide information on tangible, moveable and intangible heritage related to the property, notably by using the Bamiyan Cultural Centre;

4.5 Acknowledge the need for a museum in Bamiyan and for an archaeological park for the interpretation and presentation of the World Heritage property;

4.6 Suggest that the results of workshops relating to the Bamiyan World Heritage property be included in the state of conservation report, so that they can be evaluated by UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies;

#### **Session 5 – Roundtable on donor initiatives in Bamiyan**

5.1 Appreciate past and ongoing generous financial support to the Bamiyan World Heritage property by international donors, and strongly encourages that such financial support continues into the future;

5.2 Note the Government of Afghanistan's sincere appreciation to the Government of Italy through the Italian Agency for Development Cooperation concerning the project for the Preservation and Promotion of the Bamiyan Valley through Culture-Oriented Sustainable Development, and to the Government of Japan for considering the possibility to continue providing financial support to safeguard the Bamiyan World Heritage property.

## Annex 1



### **International Technical Meeting on the future of the Bamiyan World Heritage Property**

#### **Organizers:**

The Ministry of Information and Culture, Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

GUtech University of Technology, Muscat & RIO – Research Centre Indian Ocean

and

UNESCO

#### **In close cooperation with:**

Office of the Adviser for Cultural Affairs to His Majesty the Sultan and ICOMOS Oman

December 3-5, 2018

## International Technical Meeting on the future of the Bamiyan World Heritage Property

### PROGRAMME

#### Day 1: Monday, December 3, 2018

##### Opening session

- 09.30
1. Welcome speech by Michael Jansen, Professor, GUTech University of Technology, Muscat, Oman
  2. H.E. Mohammad Rasul Bawary, Deputy Minister of Cultural Affairs, Ministry of Information and Culture of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
  3. Masanori Nagaoka, Chief of Culture Unite, UNESCO Office in Afghanistan

A brief outline and objectives of the meeting by Masanori Nagaoka

##### Session 1 – Current Status of the Bamiyan World Heritage site

**Chair:** Kazuya Yamauchi, Professor, University of Teikyo

- 10.00 – 10.20
- Recent World Heritage Committee's decision and the recommendations of the 14<sup>th</sup> Bamiyan Technical Working Group, recent international debates on the issue of recovery and reconstruction of cultural heritage
- Nao Hayashi, Programme Specialist, Asia and Pacific Unit, World Heritage Centre
- 10.20 – 10.40
- Government's initiatives to protect the Bamiyan World Heritage property
- Abdul Ahad Abassi, Director, Department of Historical Monuments, Ministry of Information and Culture
- 10.40 – 11.00
- On-going UNESCO's projects for the safeguarding of the Bamiyan World Heritage Property (I-FIT, J-FIT, EU projects)
- Nuno Vasco Oliveira, Project Manager, UNESCO Office in Afghanistan
- 11.00 – 12.30
- Open Discussion (Coffee will be served during the session)

12.30 – 13.30 Lunch

### **Session 2 – Favouring the sustainable development of the Bamiyan Valley**

**Chair:** Georgios Toubekis, Aachen University

13.30 – 13.50 Government's recent initiatives for the development of the Valley – plans of by-pass road and stone paved road in front of the Buddha cliff

H.E M. Asif Mobaligh, Deputy Governor of Bamiyan

13.50 – 14.10 City Development and Preservation of the Bamiyan World Heritage site

Reza Sharifi, Director of Preservation of Historic Cities, Ministry of Urban Development and Housing

14.10 – 14.30 Bamiyan Strategic Master Plan

Mirella Loda, Professor, *Dipartimento di Storia, Archeologia, Geografia, Artee Spettacolo* – SAGAS, University of Florence

14.30 – 16.00 Discussion

16.00 – 16.20 Coffee break

### **Session 3 – Potential Rehabilitation of the Eastern Buddha Statue**

**Chair:** Nuno Vasco Oliveira, Project Manager, UNESCO Office in Afghanistan

16.20 – 16.30 Decisions of the National Technical Working Committee concerning the future treatment of the Buddha niches and the Bamiyan World Heritage property

Mohammad Fahim Rahimi, Director of the National Museum of Afghanistan

16.30 – 17.30 Open discussion

### **Special Session - Preparation for the Excursion on day 2**

17.30 – 18.00 Introduction to the Land of Frankincense World Heritage property and the Al Baleed Archaeological Park

Michael Jansen, Professor, GUTech University of Technology, Muscat, Research Center Indian Ocean RIO

19.30 – 21.00 Welcoming dinner

## **Day 2: Tuesday, December 4, 2018**

<b>Field visit:</b>	Al Baleed Archaeological Park, UNESCO World Heritage and Khor Rori
08.30 – 18.00	Departure from Salalah Rotana Resort to Wadi Dawka, Al Baleed Archaeological Park & Museum (morning) and Khor Rohri Archaeological Park & Visitor Centre (afternoon)
18.30 – 20.00	Reception hosted by H.E. Mr. Abdulaziz bin Mohammed Al-Rowas Advisor for Cultural Affairs to His Majesty the Sultan of the Sultanate of Oman
21.00	Arrival at Hotel

## **Day 3: Wednesday, December 5, 2018**

### **Session 4 – Management of the Bamiyan World Heritage site – opportunities and challenges**

<b>Chair:</b>	Noor Agha Noori, Director of the Institute of Archaeology
09.00 – 09.15	The National Program for Culture & Creative Economy – program’s initiatives for the Bamiyan Valley  Maria Rita Acetoso, Team Leader for Tangible Heritage, UNESCO Office in Afghanistan
09.15 – 09.45	Applicability of the ICOMOS ICAHM’s 2017 Salalah Doctrine: Guidelines for the Management of public archaeological sites for the Bamiyan World Heritage property  Michael Jansen, Professor, GUTech University of Technology, RIO, Muscat Georgios Toubekis, Aachen University
09.45 – 12.30	Open Discussion (Coffee will be served during the session)
12.30 – 13.30	Lunch

### **Session 5 – Roundtable on donor initiatives in Bamiyan**

<b>Chair:</b>	Masanori Nagaoka, Chief of Culture unit, UNESCO Kabul office
13.30 – 14.30	Participants:  - Taeko Yamamoto, Assistant Director, Multilateral Cultural Cooperation

Division, Japanese Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
- Mauro Ghirotti, Director, Italian Agency for Development Cooperation

14.30 – 15.00 Coffee break

**Session 6 – Recommendations/Result of the International Technical Meeting**

**Chair:** Masanori Nagaoka, UNESCO Office in Afghanistan

15.00 – 16.30 Drafting of recommendations/results of the International Technical Meeting  
(Coffee will be served during the session)

16.30 – 17.00 Adoption of the Recommendations of the International Technical Meeting and  
Closing Session & acknowledgments

19.30 – 21.00 Closing dinner



## List of Participants

No.	Name	Nationality	Title	Agency
1	Mohammad Rasul Bawary	Afghan	Deputy-Minister	Government
2	Abdul Ahad Abassi	Afghan	Director, MoIC	Government
3	Nooragha Noori	Afghan	Director, MoIC	Government
4	Mohamad Fahim Rahimi	Afghan	Director, MoIC	Government
5	Reza Sharifi	Afghan	Director, MUDH	Government
6	Mohammad Asif Mobaligh	Afghan	Deputy-Governor Bamiyan	Government
7	Mohammad Aman Aman	Afghan	Mayor Bamiyan	Government
8	Qadam Shah Shahim	Afghan	Ambassador to Oman	Government
9	Sayed Muneeb	Afghan	Deputy-Ambassador to Oman	Government
10	Michael Jansen	German	Professor	GUtech
11	Georgios Toubekis	German	Architect, Dipl.-Ing.	RWTH Aachen University
12	Kazuya Yamauchi,	Japanese	Professor	University of Teikyo
13	Mirella Loda	Italian	Professor	Florence University
14	Philippe Marquis	French	Dr.	DAFA
15	Nao Hayashi	Japanese	Programme Specialist	UNESCO
16	Masanori Nagaoka	Japanese	Head of Unit	UNESCO
17	Nuno Vaso de Oliveira	Portugese	Project Manager	UNESCO
18	Maria Rita Acetoso	Italian	Project Manager	UNESCO
19	Reza Mohammadi	Afghan	Ass. Project Officer	UNESCO
20	Ruggiero Ludovici	Italian	Infrastructure Advisor	IADC
21	Gianna DA RE	Italian	Advisor	IADC
22	Mauro Ghirotti	Italian	Country Director	IADC
23	Matteo Puttilli	Italian	Professor	Florence University
24	Manfred Hinz	German	Professor	Passau University
25	Taeko Yamamoto	Japanese	Multilateral Cultural Cooperation Division	MoFA Japan
26	Said Nasser Al Salmi	Omani	Secretary General	ICOMOS Oman
27	Michaela Liehner	German	Secretary General	RIO Heritage

**ACTION PLAN CONCERNING THE FUTURE TREATMENT OF THE BUDDHA NICHES  
AND THE  
CULTURAL LANDSCAPE AND ARCHAEOLOGICAL REMAINS OF THE BAMIYAN  
VALLEY, WORLD HERITAGE PROPERTY**

---

**I. Objectives of the Action Plan<sup>1</sup>**

This Action Plan, prepared by the Technical Working Committee, has the following objectives:

1. Deciding on the future treatment of the Bamiyan Buddha niches;
2. Safeguarding the *Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley* World Heritage property as a whole;
3. Removing the site from the World Heritage List in Danger.

**II. Background**

1. The Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley property was inscribed on the World Heritage List in 2003 and simultaneously placed on the List of World Heritage in Danger.
2. At its 31<sup>st</sup> session in New Zealand, in 2007, the World Heritage Committee defined a series of benchmarks to achieve a “Desired State of Conservation”, which would enable the removal of Bamiyan from the List of World Heritage in Danger. These included:
  - a) Acceptable levels of site security;
  - b) Addressing issues concerning the structural stability of the two standing Giant Buddha niches;
  - c) Achieving an adequate state of conservation of both the archaeological remains and surviving mural paintings;
  - d) The finishing and implementation of an effective and workable Management and Cultural Master Plan.
3. Since 2003, the Government of Afghanistan, in close collaboration with UNESCO and technical experts, and with financial support from the Governments of Japan, Italy, Germany and Swiss, have conducted a series of conservation works and implemented a series of technical measures to safeguard the Bamiyan World Heritage site.

---

<sup>1</sup> Once the Action Plan is finalized, the MoIC will send it to the President’s Office, for endorsement. Once it is approved and endorsed by the President, Government will submit it to the World Heritage Centre, who will share it with its Advisory Bodies for their review. The World Heritage Centre will finally send the result of the review back to the Afghan government and will also discuss it during the forthcoming World Heritage Committee meeting.

4. In its latest decision (Decision: 41 COM 7A.54, from 2017), the World Heritage Committee decided to retain the Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley on the List of World Heritage in Danger (Annex 1).
5. Between September 27-29, 2017, an International Technical Meeting was organized in Tokyo to discuss technical considerations and potential effects on Authenticity and Outstanding Universal Value of the Bamiyan World Heritage property, if one or more of the Bamiyan Buddha Statues were to be treated or reconstructed. Four technical proposals were presented and discussed in this meeting (from Japan, Italy and Germany), which also recommended the establishment of the Technical Working Committee to review those proposals (Annex 2).

### III. **Decisions on the Committee**

The main decisions of the Committee, include:

- a) The Committee considers that all four proposals presented at the Tokyo meeting present opportunities and challenges, and thus recommends a study to investigate similar cases in World Heritage properties around the world;
- b) In the spirit of national interest and international standards in terms of heritage reconstruction ethics, the Committee wishes to invite further proposals;
- c) The Committee recommends further investigation on the potential effects on the Outstanding Universal Value of the Bamiyan World Heritage property, if one or more of the Bamiyan Buddha statues were to be reconstructed, and a detailed assessment of the heritage conservation ethics associated to the reconstruction of cultural heritage;
- d) The Committee strongly suggests that a priority be given to remove Bamiyan from the World Heritage List in Danger, defined by the World Heritage Committee in 2007, and that a detailed Action Plan with a time frame be conducted.

### Bamiyan draft-Action Plan & Timeline

				Three-months period (over a total of 36 months)											
	Programs	Indicators/ Actions	Means of verification	1-3	4-6	7-9	10-12	13-15	16-18	19-21	22-24	25-27	28-30	31-33	34-36
<b>Assessment of the four technical proposals presented during the 2017 Tokyo Meeting</b>	Regular meetings of the Technical Working Committee	The Technical Working Committee develops a Plan of Action regarding the four proposals presented at the Tokyo meeting; The MoIC is to create a mechanism to invite further proposals for the future treatment of the Bamiyan Buddha	The Plan of Action is endorsed by the Government of Afghanistan and a decision is made and approved by the WH Centre, regarding the future treatment of the Buddha statues/niches	December 2018											
	Desktop study on WH properties that were affected by war or conflict and were the target of reconstruction or rehabilitation measures	The desktop study is developed and presented to the Technical Working Committee	The desktop study is used by the Technical Working Committee to make an informed decision regarding the technical proposals presented to treat the Buddha statues/niches	December 2019											
	International seminar concerning the Future	The MoIC and UNESCO	The decisions of the Seminar will be presented	From January to December 2020											

	Treatment of the Buddha Niches & Statues	organize this international event to present and discuss all existing information	to the President of Afghanistan, who will endorse them	
--	--	---	--	--

	Programs	Indicators	Means of verification	Three-months period (over a total of 36 months)														
				1-3	4-6	7-9	10-12	13-15	16-18	19-21	22-24	25-27	28-30	31-33	34-36			
<b>WHC Benchmark 1: Structural stability of the two Buddha niches</b>	Stabilization of the West Buddha niche	Complete scaffolding	Report of finalization of scaffolding and its physical completion															
		Physical conservation works	Report of physical conservation of the West Buddha niche, and its physical conservation completion															
		Scientific studies, including assessment of the remaining percentage of the demolished Buddha statue	International and national experts hired, studies developed, and reports delivered															
		Periodic monitoring of stabilization	Monitoring system acquired, installed in the West Buddha niche and in use															

	Research and monitoring of landslides and rockfalls, and mitigation measures	Research conducted, monitoring system acquired, installed along the West Buddha cliff and in use, and mitigation measures implemented, if required																
Stabilization of the East Buddha niche	Physical conservation works	finished in 2011	Completed															
	Scientific studies, including assessment of the remaining percentage of the demolished Buddha statue	International and national experts hired, studies developed, and reports delivered																
	Periodic monitoring of stabilization	Monitoring system acquired, installed in the East Buddha niche and in use																
	Research and monitoring of landslides and rockfalls, and mitigation measures	Research conducted, monitoring system acquired, installed along the East Buddha cliff and in use, and mitigation measures implemented, if required																

				Three-months period (over a total of 36 months)												
	Programs	Indicators	Means of verification	1-3	4-6	7-9	10-12	13-15	16-18	19-21	22-24	25-27	28-30	31-33	34-36	
<b>WHC Benchmark 2: Achieving an adequate state of conservation of the archaeological remains and surviving mural paintings</b>	Preservation of archeological remains within Bamiyan	Archaeological excavations and conservation at serial sites classified within Bamiyan	Archaeological and conservation reports, MoIC website													
		Archaeological field assessment within the wider Bamiyan Valley	Archaeological and conservation reports, MoIC website													
		Development and implementation of a Heritage Impact Assessment mechanism	Heritage/environment impact assessment													
		Development of a Bamiyan archaeological museum in the valley	An archaeological museum plan													
	Preservation of mural paintings within Bamiyan	Conservation of selected murals	Conservation reports													
		Conducting a full inventory of mural paintings within the property	Filled-out Inventory form and heritage database													

		Based on previous conservation assessments, develop a strategy for conservation	A strategic report and conservation intervention plan with a time frame														
		Conduct selected conservation of most significant and endangered mural paintings	Physical conservation intervention and conservation report														

	Programs	Indicators	Means of verification	Three-months period (over a total of 36 months)													
				1-3	4-6	7-9	10-12	13-15	16-18	19-21	22-24	25-27	28-30	31-33	34-36		
<b>WHC Benchmark 3:</b>	Providing security to WH property through formal security arrangements	Develop WH security guidelines and principles	Guidelines and principles document														



<b>Attaining acceptable levels of site security</b>		Hiring and training permanent Bamiyan WH guards (including police and heritage guards/rangers), using national budget	Allocation of national budget and selection/deployment of national guards	Ongoing													
		Mine clearance	A series of mining actions and mine clearance reports														
	Providing security to WH property through community-based initiatives	Create and train WH community-based security forces	A report of a series of workshop/community consultation gathering														
		Conduct awareness raising initiatives	A report of a series of workshop/community consultation gathering														
	Develop promotional materials	Publications and videos produced, MoIC's website															

				Three-months period (over a total of 36 months)											
	Programs	Indicators	Means of verification	1-3	4-6	7-9	10-12	13-15	16-18	19-21	22-24	25-27	28-30	31-33	34-36

<b>WHC Benchmark 4: Completing and implementing an effective and workable Management and Cultural Master Plan</b>	Create a Management Plan for the Bamiyan WH property	Revise the existing Cultural Master Plan, based on community consultation and inputs	Field survey and community consultation reports, updated database and new Cultural Master Plan document																	
		Modify the boundaries of the WH property and develop land use regulations and a building code	Boundaries modified and approved, and land use regulations and building code developed																	
		Officially adopt the Cultural Master Plan and integrate in within other national and regional development plans	Presidential/Minister Decree																	
		Develop promotional materials and conduct awareness raising on WH property	PR materials developed and distributed within communities																	
	Adopt a Bamiyan Tourism Plan	Develop a Tourism strategy	A tourism strategic plan developed																	
		Developing standardized procedures for visitors	Procedures developed and signage boards in-situ																	

	Prepare selected sites within WH property for visitors	Establishment of a tourism facility / information centre												
	Develop promotional materials for tourists	Publications produced in various languages												
	Officially adopt the Tourism Plan and integrate in within other national and regional development plans	PR materials produced and distributed												