

1. World Heritage Property Data**1.1 - Name of World Heritage Property**

Monuments historiques à Makli, Thatta

1.2 - World Heritage Property Details**State(s) Party(ies)**

• Pakistan

Type of Property

culturel

Identification Number

143


Year of inscription on the World Heritage List

1981

1.3 - Geographic Information Table

Name	Coordinates	Property (ha)	Buffer zone (ha)	Total (ha)	Inscription year
Monuments historiques à Makli, Thatta	24.767 / 67.9	0	0	0	1981
Total (ha)			0		

1.4 - Map(s)

Title	Date	Link to source
Thatta and its environs	31/12/1979	

1.5 - Governmental Institution Responsible for the Property**Comment**

Department of Culture Govt. of Sindh. Old K.D Building Third Floor Sindh Secretariate Karachi. 02199211098

1.6 - Property Manager / Coordinator, Local Institution / Agency

• Fateh Ali Sheikh
Department of Culture, Information and Social Welfare,
Government of Sindh
Site Incharge

Comment

Department of culture , Government of Sindh ABDUL FATAH SHAIKH (Site manager)

1.7 - Web Address of the Property (if existing)

- 1001merveilles.org : visitez ce site en panophotographies - images à 360 x 180 degrés
- [Thatta \(Pakistan Travel web\) \(en anglais seulement\)](#)
- [Welcome to Pakistan \(en anglais seulement\)](#)

1.8 - Other designations / Conventions under which the property is protected (if applicable)**Comment**

It is protected under the Antiquities Act 1975 (national law)

2. Statement of Outstanding Universal Value**2.1 - Statement of Outstanding Universal Value / Statement of Significance****Comment**

All 26 monuments are within the boundaries of the inscribed area. The tomb architecture at historical monuments, Makli Thatta, displays a variety of influence at work in the development and execution of designs both in stone and bricks. Which have been well preserved and protected despite the fact that they are exposed to many threats ,both natural and manmade such as earthquakes, sandy stones, variations of temperature, winds containing the salt, Historical Monuments at Makli are the most substantial remains of Sindh's greatness between the fourteenth and eighteenth centuries. They present an impressive array of monumental buildings, mosques, domes, and arches designed in several architectural styles and finished in diverse geometrical and floral ornaments on tile and stone in the pattern of decoration, texture and color scheme are distinctively original. The tiles of the monuments Thatta are made of hard-backed terracotta unlike siliceous sand, lime, etc

2.2 - The criteria (2005 revised version) under which the property was inscribed

(iii)











































































































2.3 - Attributes expressing the Outstanding Universal Value per criterion

The Historical Monuments at Makli Thatta are testimony in an outstanding manner, to the civilization of the sindh from the 14th to 18th century, which has disappeared now. They provide a unique view of Sind civilization because genius of local craftsmen reveals itself in absorbing all these foreign elements (Iran, India and Central Asia) and developing the style of their own which is unique in the world of Islamic Architecture.

2.4 - If needed, please provide details of why the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value should be revised**2.5 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to Statement of Outstanding Universal Value****3. Factors Affecting the Property****3.14. Other factor(s)****3.14.1 - Other factor(s)**

3.15. Factors Summary Table

3.15.1 - Factors summary table

		Name	Impact			Origin
3.1		Buildings and Development				
3.1.1 Housing						
3.1.2 Commercial development						
3.1.3 Industrial areas						
3.1.5 Interpretative and visitation facilities						
3.2		Transportation Infrastructure				
3.2.1 Ground transport infrastructure						
3.2.4 Effects arising from use of transportation infrastructure						
3.3		Services Infrastructures				
3.3.4 Localised utilities						
3.4		Pollution				
3.4.2 Ground water pollution						
3.4.3 Surface water pollution						
3.4.4 Air pollution						
3.5		Biological resource use/modification				
3.5.4 Livestock farming / grazing of domesticated animals						
3.6		Physical resource extraction				
3.6.1 Mining						
3.6.2 Quarrying						
3.7		Local conditions affecting physical fabric				
3.7.1 Wind						
3.7.2 Relative humidity						
3.7.3 Temperature						
3.7.4 Radiation/light						
3.7.5 Dust						
3.7.6 Water (rain/water table)						
3.8		Social/cultural uses of heritage				
3.8.1 Ritual / spiritual / religious and associative uses						
3.8.2 Society's valuing of heritage						
3.8.4 Changes in traditional ways of life and knowledge system						
3.8.6 Impacts of tourism / visitor / recreation						
3.9		Other human activities				
3.9.1 Illegal activities						
3.10		Climate change and severe weather events				
3.10.1 Storms						
3.10.6 Temperature change						
3.10.7 Other climate change impacts						
3.11		Sudden ecological or geological events				
3.11.2 Earthquake						
3.11.5 Erosion and siltation/ deposition						
3.13		Management and institutional factors				
3.13.1 Low impact research / monitoring activities						
3.13.3 Management activities						
Legend	 Current	 Potential	 Negative	 Positive	 Inside	 Outside

3.16. Assessment of current negative factors

3.16.1 - Assessment of current negative factors

		Spatial scale	Temporal scale	Impact	Management response	Trend
3.1	Buildings and Development					
3.1.1	Housing	localised	on-going	minor	high capacity	increasing
3.2	Transportation Infrastructure					
3.2.1	Ground transport infrastructure	restricted	frequent	significant	high capacity	static
3.2.4	Effects arising from use of transportation infrastructure	restricted	on-going	insignificant	high capacity	static
3.4	Pollution					
3.4.4	Air pollution	widespread	frequent	insignificant	low capacity	static
3.5	Biological resource use/modification					
3.5.4	Livestock farming / grazing of domesticated animals	restricted	one off or rare	significant	medium capacity	static
3.7	Local conditions affecting physical fabric					
3.7.1	Wind	widespread	frequent	minor	no capacity and / or resources	static
3.7.2	Relative humidity	restricted	frequent	significant	no capacity and / or resources	static
3.7.3	Temperature	extensive	frequent	significant	no capacity and / or resources	static

3.17. Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to factors affecting the property

3.17.1 - Comments

4. Protection, Management and Monitoring of the Property

4.1. Boundaries and Buffer Zones

4.1.1 - Buffer zone status

There is no buffer zone, but there is a need for one

4.1.2 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The boundaries of the World Heritage property are **adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

4.1.3 - Are the buffer zone(s) of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The property had **no buffer zone** at the time of its inscription on the World Heritage List

4.1.4 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property known?

The boundaries of the World Heritage property are **not known** by the management authority or local residents / communities/landowners.

4.1.5 - Are the buffer zones of the World Heritage property known?

The property had **no buffer zone** at the time of its inscription on the World Heritage List

4.1.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to boundaries and buffer zones of the World Heritage property

4.2. Protective Measures

4.2.1 - Protective designation (legal, regulatory, contractual, planning, institutional and / or traditional)

4.2.2 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

An adequate legal framework for the maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and / or Integrity of the World Heritage property exists but there are **some deficiencies in implementation**

4.2.3 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value

including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

The property had **no buffer zone** at the time of inscription on the World Heritage List

4.2.4 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate in the area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

An **adequate** legal framework exists for the area surrounding the World Heritage property and the buffer zone, but **there are some deficiencies in its implementation** which undermine the maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and / or Integrity of the property

4.2.5 - Can the legislative framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) be enforced?

There are **major deficiencies** in capacity/resources to enforce legislation and / or regulation in the World Heritage property

4.2.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to protective measures

4.3. Management System / Management Plan

4.3.1 - Management System

Comment

It comes under the control the Ministry of culture, Provincial Government of Sindh , through the Curator who manages it. The entire site comes under the ownership of Government of Sindh and is protected the under the Antiquities Act 1975

4.3.2 - Management Documents

Comment

There is no specific management document as such.

4.3.3 - How well do the various levels of administration (i.e. national / federal; regional / provincial / state; local / municipal etc.) coordinate in the management of the World Heritage Property ?

There is a range of administrative bodies / levels involved in management but there is **little or no coordination** between them for managing different aspects of the property

4.3.4 - Is the management system / plan adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value ?

The management system / plan is **fully adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

4.3.5 - Is the management system being implemented?

The management system is **only partially** being implemented

4.3.6 - Is there an annual work / action plan and is it being implemented?

An annual work / action plan exists and **many activities** are being implemented

4.3.7 - Please rate the cooperation / relationship with World Heritage property managers / coordinators / staff of the following

Local communities / residents	Poor
Local / Municipal authorities	Poor
Indigenous peoples	Poor
Landowners	Non-existent
Visitors	Fair
Researchers	Good
Tourism industry	Fair
Industry	Not applicable

4.3.8 - If present, do local communities resident in or near the World Heritage property and / or buffer zone have input in management decisions that maintain the Outstanding Universal Value?

Local communities have **no input** into decisions relating to the management

4.3.9 - If present, do indigenous peoples resident in or regularly using the World Heritage property and / or buffer zone have input in management decisions that maintain the Outstanding Universal Value?

Indigenous peoples have **no input** into decisions relating to the management

4.3.10 - Is there cooperation with industry (i.e. forestry, mining, agriculture, etc.) regarding the management of the World Heritage property, buffer zone and / or area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone?

There is **little or no contact** with industry regarding the management of the World Heritage property, buffer zone and / or area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone

4.3.11 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to human resources, expertise and training

4.3.12 - Please report any significant changes in the legal status and / or contractual / traditional protective measures and management arrangements for the World Heritage property since inscription or the last Periodic report

The administration of historical monuments has been changed from federal govt. to provincial govt. of Sindh.

4.4. Financial and Human Resources

4.4.1 - Costs related to conservation, based on the average of last five years (relative percentage of the funding sources)

Multilateral funding (GEF, World Bank, etc)	0%
International donations (NGO's, foundations, etc)	0%
Governmental (National / Federal)	70%
Governmental (Regional / Provincial / State)	20%
Governmental (Local / Municipal)	0%
In country donations (NGO's, foundations, etc)	0%
Individual visitor charges (e.g. entry, parking, camping fees, etc.)	10%

Commercial operator payments (e.g. filming permit, concessions, etc.)	0%
Other grants	0%

4.4.2 - International Assistance received from the World Heritage Fund (USD)

Comment

No fund has been provided from WHF.

4.4.3 - Is the current budget sufficient to manage the World Heritage property effectively?

The available budget is **inadequate** for basic management needs and presents a serious constraint to the capacity to manage

4.4.4 - Are the existing sources of funding secure and likely to remain so?

The existing sources of funding **are secure** in the medium-term and planning is underway to secure funding in the long-term

4.4.5 - Does the World Heritage property provide economic benefits to local communities (e.g. income, employment)?

The World Heritage property **does not deliver any economic benefits** to local communities

4.4.6 - Are available resources such as equipment, facilities and infrastructure sufficient to meet management needs?

There are **little or no** equipment or facilities despite an identified need

4.4.7 - Are resources such as equipment, facilities and infrastructure adequately maintained?

There is **little or no** maintenance of existing equipment and facilities or no equipment and facilities, despite an identified need.

4.4.8 - Comments, conclusion, and / or recommendations related to finance and infrastructure

4.4.9 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Full-time	100%
Part-time	0%

4.4.10 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Permanent	100%
Seasonal	0%

4.4.11 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Paid	100%
Volunteer	0%

4.4.12 - Are available human resources adequate to manage the World Heritage property?

Human resources are **inadequate** for management needs

4.4.13 - Considering the management needs of the World Heritage property, please rate the availability of professionals in the following disciplines

Research and monitoring	Poor
Promotion	Non-existent
Community outreach	Not applicable
Interpretation	Not applicable
Education	Poor
Visitor management	Good
Conservation	Fair
Administration	Good
Risk preparedness	Good
Tourism	Good
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Fair

4.4.14 - Please rate the availability of training opportunities for the management of the World Heritage property in the following disciplines

Research and monitoring	Not available
Promotion	Not available
Community outreach	Not available
Interpretation	Not available
Education	Not available
Visitor management	Not available
Conservation	Medium
Administration	Medium
Risk preparedness	Not available
Tourism	Not available
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Not available

4.4.15 - Do the management and conservation programmes at the World Heritage property help develop local expertise?

A capacity development plan or programme is **in place and fully implemented**; all technical skills are being transferred to those managing the property locally, who are assuming leadership in management

4.4.16 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to human resources, expertise and training

4.5. Scientific Studies and Research Projects

4.5.1 - Is there adequate knowledge (scientific or traditional) about the values of the World Heritage property to support planning, management and decision-making to ensure that Outstanding Universal Value is maintained?

Knowledge about the values of the World Heritage property is **sufficient** for most key areas **but there are gaps**

4.5.2 - Is there a planned programme of research at the property which is directed towards management

needs and / or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value?

There is **no research** taking place in the World Heritage property despite an identified need

4.5.3 - Are results from research programmes disseminated?

Research results are **not shared** at any level

4.5.4 - Please provide details (i.e. authors, title, and web link) of papers published about the World Heritage property since the last Periodic Report

(1) The Architecture of Thatta by Dr. Ahmed hasan Dani.

4.5.5 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to scientific studies and research projects

4.6. Education, Information and Awareness Building

4.6.1 - At how many locations is the World Heritage emblem displayed at the property?

In **many locations and easily visible** to visitors

4.6.2 - Please rate the awareness and understanding of the existence and justification for inscription of the World Heritage property amongst the following groups

Local communities / residents	Average
Local / Municipal authorities within or adjacent to the property	Excellent
Local Indigenous peoples	Average
Local landowners	Average
Visitors	Average
Tourism industry	Excellent
Local businesses and industries	Average

4.6.3 - Is there a planned education and awareness programme linked to the values and management of the World Heritage property?

There is **no education and awareness programme**, despite an identified need

4.6.4 - What role, if any, has designation as a World Heritage property played with respect to education, information and awareness building activities?

World Heritage status has **not influenced** education, information or awareness building activities

4.6.5 - How well is the information on Outstanding Universal Value of the property presented and interpreted?

There is **excellent presentation and interpretation** of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property

4.6.6 - Please rate the adequacy for education, information and awareness building of the following

visitor facilities and services at the World Heritage property

Visitor centre	Not provided but needed
Site museum	Poor
Information booths	Adequate
Guided tours	Adequate
Trails / routes	Not provided but needed
Information materials	Adequate
Transportation facilities	Adequate
Other	Not needed

4.6.7 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to education, information and awareness building**4.7. Visitor Management****4.7.1 - Please provide the trend in annual visitation for the last five years**

Last year	Minor Increase
Two years ago	Major Increase (100%+)
Three years ago	Major Increase (100%+)
Four years ago	Major Increase (100%+)
Five years ago	Major Increase (100%+)

4.7.2 - What information sources are used to collect trend data on visitor statistics?

Entry tickets and registries
Other

4.7.3 - Visitor management documents**Comment**

There are no documents regarding visitor management.

4.7.4 - Is there an appropriate visitor use management plan (e.g. specific plan) for the World Heritage property which ensures that its Outstanding Universal Value is maintained?

There is **some management** of the visitor use of the World Heritage property

4.7.5 - Does the tourism industry contribute to improving visitor experiences and maintaining the values of the World Heritage property?

Although the tourism industry is active in the property, there is **little or no contact** between tourism operators and those responsible for the World Heritage property

4.7.6 - If fees (i.e. entry charges, permits) are collected, do they contribute to the management of the World Heritage property?

No fees are collected

4.7.7 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to visitor use of the World Heritage property**4.8. Monitoring****4.8.1 - Is there a monitoring programme at the property which is directed towards management needs and / or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value?**

There is **no monitoring** taking place in the World Heritage property or buffer zone despite an identified need

4.8.2 - Are key indicators for measuring the state of conservation used to monitor how the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is maintained?

There is **little or no information available** on the values of the World Heritage property to define key indicators

4.8.3 - Please rate the level of involvement in monitoring of the following groups

World Heritage managers / coordinators and staff	Excellent
Local / Municipal authorities	Non-existent
Local communities	Non-existent
Researchers	Poor
NGOs	Not applicable
Industry	Poor
Local indigenous peoples	Excellent

4.8.4 - Has the State Party implemented relevant recommendations arising from the World Heritage Committee?

Implementation is **underway**

4.8.5 - Please provide comments relevant to the implementation of recommendations from the World Heritage Committee**4.8.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to monitoring****4.9. Identification of Priority Management Needs****4.9.1 - Please select the top 6 managements needs for the property (if more than 6 are listed below)**

Please refer to question 5.2

5. Summary and Conclusions

5.1. Summary - Factors affecting the Property

5.1.1 - Summary - Factors affecting the Property

		World Heritage criteria and attributes affected	Actions	Monitoring	Timeframe	Lead agency (and others involved)	More info / comment
3.1	Buildings and Development						
3.1.1	Housing	Criteria 111	Plans are being made to diminish the effects	A strict policy of monitoring will be undertaken in this regard.	By the end of this year.	Culture department, Government of Sindh	No comments
3.2	Transportation Infrastructure						
3.2.1	Ground transport infrastructure	The same as above	the same as above	the same as above	the same as above	the same as above	no comments
3.4	Pollution						
3.4.4	Air pollution	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments
3.7	Local conditions affecting physical fabric						
3.7.1	Wind	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments
3.7.2	Relative humidity	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments
3.7.3	Temperature	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments	no comments

5.2. Summary - Management Needs

5.2.2 - Summary - Management Needs

4.1 Boundaries and Buffer Zones					
		Actions	Timeframe	Lead agency (and others involved)	More info / comment
4.1.1	There is a need for a buffer zone	The work of survey is is being conducted for determining the boundaries and creation of buffer zone.	A work of survey is to be completed by end of this year 2011	Department of Culture , Govt. of Sindh	No comments
4.1.4	The boundaries of the World Heritage property are not known	The serious campaigns are designed to create the awareness among the locals to let them know the boundaries of world heritage property .	By the end of 2011	Department of Culture, Govt. of Sindh	No comments
4.3 Management System / Management Plan					
4.3.3	Little or no coordination between administrative bodies	A legal frame work to be promulgated to create the coordination among the administrative bodies.	As early as possible	Department of Culture, govt, of Sindh	No comments
4.4 Financial and Human Resources					
4.4.3	The budget is inadequate for management needs	Effororts are being undertaken to secure funding from world bank for the cultural heritage and from other government agencies.	As aearly as possible	Department of Culture, Government, of Sindh	No comments
4.5 Scientific Studies and Research Projects					
4.5.2	There is no research taking place in the property	The research program is being initiated by the Department of Antiquities Department, Govt. of Sindh	Within short period of time	Department of culture, govt. of Sindh.	No comments
4.6 Education, Information and Awareness Building					
4.6.3	There is no education and awareness programme	There are serious plans in the pipe line to create awareness among the people.	By end of this year 2011	Department of Culture, Govt of Sindh	No comments
4.8 Monitoring					
4.8.1	No monitoring taking place in the World Heritage property or buffer zone	Serious efforts are being made to monitor the world heritage property.	by the end of this year	Culture department Govt. of Sindh	No comments

5.3. Conclusions on the State of Conservation of the Property

5.3.1 - Current state of Authenticity

The authenticity of the World Heritage property has been **compromised** by factors described in this report

5.3.2 - Current state of Integrity

The integrity of the World Heritage property has been **compromised** by factors described in this report

5.3.3 - Current state of the World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value

The World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value has been **impacted** by factors described in this report, but this situation is being **addressed through effective management actions**.

5.3.4 - Current state of the property's other values

Other important cultural and / or natural values are being **degraded** and have had an impact on the state of conservation of the World Heritage property

5.4. Additional comments on the State of Conservation of the Property

5.4.1 - Comments

6. World Heritage Status and Conclusions on Periodic Reporting Exercise

6.1 - Please rate the impacts of World Heritage status of the property in relation to the following areas

Conservation	Very positive
Research and monitoring	Very positive
Management effectiveness	Positive
Quality of life for local communities and indigenous peoples	Not applicable
Recognition	Not applicable
Education	Positive
Infrastructure development	Not applicable
Funding for the property	Positive
International cooperation	Positive
Political support for conservation	Positive
Legal / Policy framework	Positive
Lobbying	Positive
Institutional coordination	Positive
Security	Very positive
Other (please specify)	Not applicable

6.2 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to World Heritage status

6.3 - Entities involved in the preparation of this Section of the Periodic Report

Governmental institution responsible for the property
Site Manager/Coordinator/World Heritage property staff
Indigenous peoples

External experts
Others

6.4 - Was the Periodic Reporting questionnaire easy to use and clearly understandable?

yes

6.5 - Please provide suggestions for improvement of the Periodic Reporting questionnaire

More time should be earmarked for the training

6.6 - Please rate the level of support for completing the Periodic Report questionnaire from the following entities

UNESCO	Very good
State Party Representative	Very good
Advisory Body	Very good

6.7 - How accessible was the information required to complete the Periodic Report?

Most of the required information was accessible

6.8 - The Periodic Reporting process has improved the understanding of the following

The World Heritage Convention
The concept of Outstanding Universal Value
The property's Outstanding Universal Value
The concept of Integrity and / or Authenticity
The property's Integrity and / or Authenticity
Managing the property to maintain the Outstanding Universal Value
Monitoring and reporting
Management effectiveness

6.9 - Please rate the follow-up to conclusions and recommendations from previous Periodic Reporting exercise by the following entities

UNESCO	Excellent
State Party	Excellent
Site Managers	Excellent
Advisory Bodies	Excellent

6.10 - Summary of actions that will require formal consideration by the World Heritage Committee

• Statement of Outstanding Universal Value / Statement of Significance

Reason for update: All 26 monuments are within the boundaries of the inscribed area. The tomb architecture at historical monuments, Makli Thatta, displays a variety of influence at work in the development and execution of designs both in stone and bricks. Which have been well preserved and protected despite the fact that they are exposed to many threats, both natural and manmade such as earthquakes, sandy stones, variations of temperature, winds containing the salt, Historical Monuments at Makli are the most substantial remains of Sindh's greatness between the fourteenth and eighteenth centuries. They present an impressive array of monumental buildings, mosques, domes, and arches designed in several architectural styles and finished in diverse geometrical and floral ornaments on tile and stone in the pattern of decoration, texture and color scheme are distinctively original. The tiles of the

monuments Thatta are made of hard-backed terracotta
unlike siliceous sand, lime, etc

**6.11 - Comments, conclusions and / or
recommendations related to the Assessment of the
Periodic Reporting exercise**

no comments