

## 1. World Heritage Property Data

### 1.1 - Name of World Heritage Property

Petroglyphs within the Archaeological Landscape of Tamgaly

### 1.2 - World Heritage Property Details

#### State(s) Party(ies)

•Kazakhstan

#### Type of Property

cultural

#### Identification Number

1145


#### Year of inscription on the World Heritage List

2004

### 1.3 - Geographic Information Table

Name	Coordinates	Property (ha)	Buffer zone (ha)	Total (ha)	Inscription year
Petroglyphs within the Archaeological Landscape of Tamgaly	43.803 / 75.535	900	2900	3800	2004
Total (ha)		900	2900	3800	

### 1.4 - Map(s)

Title	Date	Link to source
The Archeological Landscape of Tamgay and the buffer zone	29/01/2003	

### 1.5 - Governmental Institution Responsible for the Property

#### Comment

Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 8 House of Ministries, Orynbor Str., Astana 010000, Kazakhstan, Tel.: +7 7172 74-01-07, TelFax: +7 7172 50-30-51, mkis@mininfo.katelo.kz;

### 1.6 - Property Manager / Coordinator, Local Institution / Agency

•Eleusiz Zhanpeisov

#### Comment

Mr. Eleusiz Zhanpeis, director State Historical, Cultural and Natural Reserve-Museum "Tamgaly" Address 257, Karasai Batyr Street Uzunagash village Zhambul Raion Almaty Oblast Kazakhstan Tel.: +7 (72770) 21854 Tel/fax: +7 (72770) 21296 VISITORS CENTER Karabastau village Zhambul Raion Almaty Oblast Kazakhstan Tel.: +7 (72759) 30210 Mobile (Director) +77017336850, +77771218179

### 1.7 - Web Address of the Property (if existing)

1. [View photos from OUR PLACE the World Heritage collection](#)

#### Comment

www.tamgaly.kz

### 1.8 - Other designations / Conventions under which the property is protected (if applicable)

## 2. Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

### 2.1 - Statement of Outstanding Universal Value / Statement of Significance

### 2.2 - The criteria (2005 revised version) under which the property was inscribed (iii)

### 2.3 - Attributes expressing the Outstanding Universal Value per criterion

rock art, petroglyphs, sacred images, altars, cult areas, associated settlements and burial sites

### 2.4 - If needed, please provide details of why the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value should be revised

### 2.5 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

## 3. Factors Affecting the Property

### 3.14. Other factor(s)

#### 3.14.1 - Other factor(s)

### 3.15. Factors Summary Table

#### 3.15.1 - Factors summary table

	Name	Impact	Origin
<b>3.1</b>	<b>Buildings and Development</b>		
3.1.1 Housing			
3.1.5 Interpretative and visitation facilities			
<b>3.2</b>	<b>Transportation Infrastructure</b>		
3.2.1 Ground transport infrastructure			
<b>3.5</b>	<b>Biological resource use/modification</b>		
3.5.4 Livestock farming / grazing of domesticated animals			
<b>3.7</b>	<b>Local conditions affecting physical fabric</b>		
3.7.1 Wind			
3.7.3 Temperature			
3.7.4 Radiation/light			
3.7.6 Water (rain/water table)			
3.7.8 Micro-organisms			
<b>3.8</b>	<b>Social/cultural uses of heritage</b>		
3.8.6 Impacts of tourism / visitor / recreation			
<b>3.10</b>	<b>Climate change and severe weather events</b>		
3.10.2 Flooding			
3.10.6 Temperature change			
<b>3.11</b>	<b>Sudden ecological or geological events</b>		
3.11.2 Earthquake			
3.11.6 Fire (wildfires)			
<b>3.13</b>	<b>Management and institutional factors</b>		
3.13.3 Management activities			
<b>Legend</b>	Current	Potential	Negative
	Positive	Inside	Outside

### 3.16. Assessment of current negative factors

#### 3.16.1 - Assessment of current negative factors

	Spatial scale	Temporal scale	Impact	Management response	Trend
<b>3.2</b>	<b>Transportation Infrastructure</b>				
3.2.1 <b>Ground transport infrastructure</b>	restricted	frequent	insignificant	medium capacity	static
<b>3.5</b>	<b>Biological resource use/modification</b>				
3.5.4 <b>Livestock farming / grazing of domesticated animals</b>	localised	frequent	minor	medium capacity	static
<b>3.7</b>	<b>Local conditions affecting physical fabric</b>				
3.7.1 <b>Wind</b>	widespread	on-going	minor	no capacity and / or resources	static
3.7.3 <b>Temperature</b>	widespread	on-going	significant	no capacity and / or resources	static
3.7.4 <b>Radiation/light</b>	widespread	on-going	significant	no capacity and / or resources	static
3.7.6 <b>Water (rain/water table)</b>	widespread	on-going	significant	low capacity	static
3.7.8 <b>Micro-organisms</b>	widespread	on-going	significant	medium capacity	static
<b>3.8</b>	<b>Social/cultural uses of heritage</b>				
3.8.6 <b>Impacts of tourism / visitor / recreation</b>	localised	on-going	significant	medium capacity	increasing
<b>3.10</b>	<b>Climate change and severe weather events</b>				
3.10.6 <b>Temperature change</b>	widespread	on-going	significant	low capacity	static

### 3.17. Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to factors affecting the property

#### 3.17.1 - Comments

Tamgaly staff have sought cooperation with experts both inside and outside of Kazakhstan to mitigate these negative impacts on the site.

## 4. Protection, Management and Monitoring of the Property

### 4.1. Boundaries and Buffer Zones

#### 4.1.1 - Buffer zone status

There is a buffer zone

#### 4.1.2 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The boundaries of the World Heritage property are **adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

#### 4.1.3 - Are the buffer zone(s) of the World Heritage property adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value?

The buffer zones of the World Heritage property are **adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

#### 4.1.4 - Are the boundaries of the World Heritage property known?

The boundaries of the World Heritage property are known by both the management authority and local residents / communities / landowners.

#### 4.1.5 - Are the buffer zones of the World Heritage property known?

The buffer zones of the World Heritage property are **known** by both the management authority and local residents / communities / landowners.

#### 4.1.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to boundaries and buffer zones of the World Heritage property

In the view of future development of the neighbouring settlements, tourism growing, It should be established and legalized zones of regulated building construction and of regulated agriculture and farming for the territories surrounding the buffer zone of the site. As soon as possible

## 4.2. Protective Measures

#### 4.2.1 - Protective designation (legal, regulatory, contractual, planning, institutional and / or traditional)

#### 4.2.2 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate for maintaining the

#### Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

The legal framework for the maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and / or Integrity of the World Heritage property provides **an adequate or better basis** for effective management and protection

#### 4.2.3 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate in the buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

The legal framework for the maintenance of the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and / or Integrity of the World Heritage property provides **an adequate or better basis** for effective management and protection

#### 4.2.4 - Is the legal framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) adequate in the area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone for maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Integrity and / or Authenticity of the property?

The legal framework for the area surrounding the World Heritage property and the buffer zone provides **an adequate or better basis** for effective management and protection of the property, contributing to the maintenance of its Outstanding Universal Value including conditions of Authenticity and / or Integrity

#### 4.2.5 - Can the legislative framework (i.e. legislation and / or regulation) be enforced?


There is **acceptable** capacity / resources to enforce legislation and / or regulation in the World Heritage property but some deficiencies remain

#### 4.2.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to protective measures

## 4.3. Management System / Management Plan

### 4.3.1 - Management System

#### 4.3.2 - Management Documents

Title	Status	Available	Date	Link to source
Management Plan for the Archaeological Landscape of Tamgaly	In Force	Available	27/05/2004	

#### 4.3.3 - How well do the various levels of administration (i.e. national / federal; regional / provincial / state; local / municipal etc.) coordinate in the management of the World Heritage Property ?

There is coordination between the range of administrative bodies / levels involved in the management of the property **but it could be improved**

#### 4.3.4 - Is the management system / plan adequate to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value ?

The management system/plan is only **partially adequate** to maintain the property's Outstanding Universal Value

#### 4.3.5 - Is the management system being implemented?

The management system is **only partially** being implemented

#### 4.3.6 - Is there an annual work / action plan and is it being implemented?

An annual work / action plan exists and **many activities** are being implemented

#### 4.3.7 - Please rate the cooperation / relationship with World Heritage property managers / coordinators / staff of the following

Local communities / residents	Fair
Local / Municipal authorities	Poor
Indigenous peoples	Not applicable
Landowners	Fair
Visitors	Fair
Researchers	Good
Tourism industry	Fair
Industry	Not applicable

#### 4.3.8 - If present, do local communities resident in or near the World Heritage property and / or buffer zone have input in management decisions that maintain the Outstanding Universal Value?

Local communities **directly contribute** to some decisions relating to management

#### 4.3.9 - If present, do indigenous peoples resident in or regularly using the World Heritage property and / or buffer zone have input in management decisions that maintain the Outstanding Universal Value?

**No indigenous peoples** are resident in or regularly using the World Heritage property and / or buffer zone

#### 4.3.10 - Is there cooperation with industry (i.e. forestry, mining, agriculture, etc.) regarding the management of the World Heritage property, buffer zone and / or area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone?

There is **little or no contact** with industry regarding the management of the World Heritage property, buffer zone and / or area surrounding the World Heritage property and buffer zone

#### 4.3.11 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to human resources, expertise and training

Until the new management plan is finalized we are using the plan from 2004-2008 for operational and management purposes. We also follow recommendations of the Plan for Museum Reserves development elaborated in 2009 by the State enterprise Kazrestavratziya under the Ministry of Culture

#### 4.3.12 - Please report any significant changes in the legal status and / or contractual / traditional protective measures and management arrangements for the World Heritage property since inscription or the last Periodic report

### 4.4. Financial and Human Resources

#### 4.4.1 - Costs related to conservation, based on the average of last five years (relative percentage of the funding sources)

Multilateral funding (GEF, World Bank, etc)	1%
International donations (NGO's, foundations, etc)	
Governmental (National / Federal)	99%
Governmental (Regional / Provincial / State)	
Governmental (Local / Municipal)	
In country donations (NGO's, foundations, etc)	
Individual visitor charges (e.g. entry, parking, camping fees, etc.)	
Commercial operator payments (e.g. filming permit, concessions, etc.)	
Other grants	

#### 4.4.2 - International Assistance received from the World Heritage Fund (USD)

##### Comment

\$ 15000, 2010

#### 4.4.3 - Is the current budget sufficient to manage the World Heritage property effectively?

The available budget is **inadequate** for basic management needs and presents a serious constraint to the capacity to manage

#### 4.4.4 - Are the existing sources of funding secure and likely to remain so?

The existing sources of funding **are secure** in the medium-term and planning is underway to secure funding in the long-term

#### 4.4.5 - Does the World Heritage property provide economic benefits to local communities (e.g. income, employment)?

There is **some flow** of economic benefits to local communities

#### 4.4.6 - Are available resources such as equipment, facilities and infrastructure sufficient to meet management needs?

There are **little or no** equipment or facilities despite an identified need

#### 4.4.7 - Are resources such as equipment, facilities and infrastructure adequately maintained?

There is **basic** maintenance of equipment and facilities

#### 4.4.8 - Comments, conclusion, and / or recommendations related to finance and infrastructure

Financial and human resources, involved in the site management, as well as equipment in the State Reserve Museum Tamgaly are below needed optimum. Lack of the

trained and educated specialists makes a great problem for increasing of the staff number, for elaboration of programs and budget proposals, for realization of the management plans

#### 4.4.9 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Full-time	100%
Part-time	

#### 4.4.10 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Permanent	100%
Seasonal	

#### 4.4.11 - Distribution of employees involved in managing the World Heritage property (% of total)

Paid	100%
Volunteer	

#### 4.4.12 - Are available human resources adequate to manage the World Heritage property?

Human resources are **inadequate** for management needs

#### 4.4.13 - Considering the management needs of the World Heritage property, please rate the availability of professionals in the following disciplines

Research and monitoring	Poor
Promotion	Poor
Community outreach	Poor
Interpretation	Poor
Education	Poor
Visitor management	Fair
Conservation	Fair
Administration	Fair
Risk preparedness	Poor
Tourism	Poor
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Poor

#### 4.4.14 - Please rate the availability of training opportunities for the management of the World Heritage property in the following disciplines

Research and monitoring	Low
Promotion	Not available
Community outreach	Low
Interpretation	Low
Education	Low
Visitor management	Low
Conservation	Low
Administration	Low
Risk preparedness	Low
Tourism	Low
Enforcement (custodians, police)	Not applicable

#### 4.4.15 - Do the management and conservation programmes at the World Heritage property help develop local expertise?

A capacity development plan or programme is in place and **partially implemented**; some technical skills are being

transferred to those managing the property locally **but most of the technical work is carried out by external staff**

#### 4.4.16 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to human resources, expertise and training

We have benefited from international experts and professional staff, but due to low salaries and the remoteness of the site we are unable to retain experts on a long term basis.

### 4.5. Scientific Studies and Research Projects

#### 4.5.1 - Is there adequate knowledge (scientific or traditional) about the values of the World Heritage property to support planning, management and decision-making to ensure that Outstanding Universal Value is maintained?

Knowledge about the values of the World Heritage property is **sufficient** for most key areas **but there are gaps**

#### 4.5.2 - Is there a planned programme of research at the property which is directed towards management needs and / or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value?

There is **considerable** research but it is **not directed** towards management needs and / or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value

#### 4.5.3 - Are results from research programmes disseminated?

Research results are **shared widely** with the local, national and international audiences

#### 4.5.4 - Please provide details (i.e. authors, title, and web link) of papers published about the World Heritage property since the last Periodic Report

1. Железников Б.п., Рогожинский п.Е. Материалы к изучению: «Петроглифы тюркского времени в Тамгале (Танбалы)». //Известия пп РК. Сер. Обществ. наук. № 3(282). Алматы, 2011 2. Luc Hermann, Die Petroglyphen von Tamgaly in Kasachstan, Paris, BOD, 2011, 68 p. 3. Рогожинский п.Е. новые находки памятников Древнетюркской эпиграфики и монументального искусства на юге и востоке Казахстана //Роль кочевников в формировании культурного наследия Казахстана. научные чтения памяти п.Э. Маханова: Сб. мат-лов Межд. науч. Конф. – Алматы, - 2010. -С. 335-342. 4. Рогожинский п.Е. «Мы, нижеприжившие истинные тамги...» (опыт идентификации родоплеменных знаков казахов Старшего жуза) //Роль кочевников в формировании культурного наследия Казахстана. научные чтения памяти п.Э. Маханова: Сб. мат-лов Межд. науч. Конф. – Алматы, - 2010. -С. 101-127. 5. Рогожинский п.Е. О современных задачах археологии национального искусства Казахстана и Средней Азии. Проблемы изучения первобытного искусства. // археологии, этнографии и антропологии Евразии, 4 (36), 2008. –С. 87-90 6. С.п. Потапов Древнее жилище Каракур, Алматы, 2007. 7. К.М. Байпаков, п.п. Марьяшев, С.п. Потапов Петроглифы Тамгалы, Алматы, 2006



#### 4.5.5 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to scientific studies and research projects

A significant publication on Tamgaly is about to be issued (later this year). It will be published in Russian and English. The research was possible thanks to UNESCO-Norwegian granting

#### 4.6. Education, Information and Awareness Building

##### 4.6.1 - At how many locations is the World Heritage emblem displayed at the property?

In many locations, but not easily visible to visitors

##### 4.6.2 - Please rate the awareness and understanding of the existence and justification for inscription of the World Heritage property amongst the following groups

Local communities / residents	Excellent
Local / Municipal authorities within or adjacent to the property	Average
Local Indigenous peoples	Not applicable
Local landowners	Average
Visitors	Average
Tourism industry	Excellent
Local businesses and industries	Poor

##### 4.6.3 - Is there a planned education and awareness programme linked to the values and management of the World Heritage property?

There is a limited and *ad hoc* education and awareness programme

##### 4.6.4 - What role, if any, has designation as a World Heritage property played with respect to education, information and awareness building activities?

World Heritage status has influenced education, information and awareness building activities, but it could be improved

##### 4.6.5 - How well is the information on Outstanding Universal Value of the property presented and interpreted?

The Outstanding Universal Value of the property is adequately presented and interpreted but improvements could be made

##### 4.6.6 - Please rate the adequacy for education, information and awareness building of the following visitor facilities and services at the World Heritage property

Visitor centre	Poor
Site museum	Poor
Information booths	Poor
Guided tours	Adequate
Trails / routes	Adequate
Information materials	Adequate
Transportation facilities	Poor
Other	Not needed

#### 4.6.7 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to education, information and awareness building

#### 4.7. Visitor Management

##### 4.7.1 - Please provide the trend in annual visitation for the last five years

Last year	Static
Two years ago	Minor Increase
Three years ago	Minor Increase
Four years ago	Minor Increase
Five years ago	Major Increase (100%+)

##### 4.7.2 - What information sources are used to collect trend data on visitor statistics?

Entry tickets and registries
Visitor surveys
Other

##### 4.7.3 - Visitor management documents

##### 4.7.4 - Is there an appropriate visitor use management plan (e.g. specific plan) for the World Heritage property which ensures that its Outstanding Universal Value is maintained?

Visitor use of the World Heritage property is managed but improvements could be made

##### 4.7.5 - Does the tourism industry contribute to improving visitor experiences and maintaining the values of the World Heritage property?

There is excellent co-operation between those responsible for the World Heritage property and the tourism industry to present the Outstanding Universal Value and increase appreciation

##### 4.7.6 - If fees (i.e. entry charges, permits) are collected, do they contribute to the management of the World Heritage property?

No fees are collected

##### 4.7.7 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to visitor use of the World Heritage property

We have a very good relationship with tour operators, not many exists at present. But there are only few places for tourists to stay in the area. The site would benefits from hotel or other tourist accommodation closer to the site. A road to the site for about 30km in the vicinity has a bad condition, though we hope this will be repaired this year.

#### 4.8. Monitoring

##### 4.8.1 - Is there a monitoring programme at the property which is directed towards management needs and / or improving understanding of Outstanding Universal Value?

There is a small amount of monitoring, but it is not planned

**4.8.2 - Are key indicators for measuring the state of conservation used to monitor how the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is maintained?**

Information on the values of the World Heritage property is **sufficient** for defining and monitoring key indicators for measuring its state of conservation

**4.8.3 - Please rate the level of involvement in monitoring of the following groups**

World Heritage managers / coordinators and staff	Average
Local / Municipal authorities	Average
Local communities	Non-existent
Researchers	Excellent
NGOs	Average
Industry	Not applicable
Local indigenous peoples	Not applicable

**4.8.4 - Has the State Party implemented relevant recommendations arising from the World Heritage Committee?**

Implementation is **complete**

**4.8.5 - Please provide comments relevant to the implementation of recommendations from the World Heritage Committee**

**4.8.6 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to monitoring**

**4.9. Identification of Priority Management Needs**

**4.9.1 - Please select the top 6 managements needs for the property (if more than 6 are listed below)**

Please refer to question 5.2

## 5. Summary and Conclusions

### 5.1. Summary - Factors affecting the Property

#### 5.1.1 - Summary - Factors affecting the Property

		World Heritage criteria and attributes affected	Actions	Monitoring	Timeframe	Lead agency (and others involved)	More info / comment
3.7	Local conditions affecting physical fabric						
3.7.1	Wind	Wind, in combination with sun and water creates a patina on the petroglyphs, obscuring them from view. In addition, wind can cause erosion on the rocks and in the desert landscape - especially exacerbating impact from tourists walking at the site	Monitoring on the influence of this factor is established, the pathes for visitors are maintained yearly	Monitoring on the influence of this factor is going on	on going	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly	This natural factor is impossible take under control
3.7.3	Temperature	Mostly dangerous for rocks with petroglyphs are fluctuations of day and night temperatures especially in winter, when water is freezing	Gathering of temperature data and tracking of water distribution on the rock slopes in spring and during heavy rains with the aim to elaborate program for its reducing from the most important places of the rock art;	The monitoring over the temperature changes is established	All year round	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly	The Reserve Museum has a great need of sufficient equipment for the temperature monitoring (weather station and special set of thermometers for taking measurements of the temperature of rocks surface and inside the rocks)
3.7.4	Radiation/light	Radiation forms patina on the rocks' surfaces, what decreases visibility of the images. Patina also helps the stones to accumulate the heat, making threat for the cracks appearing during the sudden weather changes	The monitoring of the influence of this factor is established	Monitoring of rocks with petroglyphs and the degree of environmental pressures of them is going on	All year round	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly	This affect of this natural factor is impossible to reduce or take under control
3.7.6	Water (rain/water table)	Water is a serious threat to the rocks and their surfaces with images, open to the air. It also adds to the development of erosion on the ground in the site landscape. Its negative affecting is especially heavy in the autumn-winter-spring periods	The staff of Reserve Museum is tracking water distribution on the rocks' slopes, appearing of under-surface cavities. Some conservation works are implemented to prevent destructions of the rocks surfaces with images and organize water on ground	Monitoring of the influence of water on the rocks and their setting is started and going on	All year round, on going	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly and trained by international experts	State enterprise Kazrestavratziya of the Ministry of Culture implements conservation works on the site in cooperation with the State Reserve Museum Tamgaly
3.7.8	Micro-organisms						
3.10	Climate change and severe weather events						
3.10.6	Temperature change	As it was said, mostly dangerous for rocks with petroglyphs are fluctuations of day and night temperatures especially in winter, when water is freezing	Gathering data on temperature changes along with amount of precipitation	Monitoring on the temperature changes and of the influence of this factor is established	on going	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly	Lack of equipment and of qualified personnel makes problems to do this job in an adequate way

## 5.2. Summary - Management Needs

### 5.2.2 - Summary - Management Needs

4.3 Management System / Management Plan				
	Actions	Timeframe	Lead agency (and others involved)	More info / comment



4.3.10	<b>There is little or no contact with industry regarding management</b>	The Reserve Museum will establish cooperation with industry in future	According to the next Management Plan recommendations	The Reserve Museum Tamgaly	At present there is no need to contact with any industry for the site management
<b>4.4 Financial and Human Resources</b>					
4.4.13	<b>Promotion</b>	The Reserve is actively working at the attraction of additional funds from the state budget and from other donors. it also try to conduct training for the staff and related organizations as appear any financial possibility	on going	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly, Ministry of Culture of RK	Hopefully Reserve will get in 2012 the higher status in the State Budget Commission register, so the salaries funds will be increased. We also look for the ways to open office in Almaty for experts, tourism, research better attraction.
<b>4.6 Education, Information and Awareness Building</b>					
4.6.3	<b>There is a limited education and awareness programme</b>	The Reserve has plans for education and awareness programme, lack of human resources and funds makes difficulties for its realization	Short-term, long-term	State Reserve Museum Tamgaly	We are seeking for cooperation with national and international experts and organizations for realizing and developing of this program.

### 5.3. Conclusions on the State of Conservation of the Property

#### 5.3.1 - Current state of Authenticity

The authenticity of the World Heritage property has been **preserved**

#### 5.3.2 - Current state of Integrity

The integrity of the World Heritage property is **intact**

#### 5.3.3 - Current state of the World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value

The World Heritage property's Outstanding Universal Value has been **maintained**.

#### 5.3.4 - Current state of the property's other values

Other important cultural and / or natural values and the state of conservation of the World Heritage property are **predominantly intact**

### 5.4. Additional comments on the State of Conservation of the Property

#### 5.4.1 - Comments

## 6. World Heritage Status and Conclusions on Periodic Reporting Exercise

### 6.1 - Please rate the impacts of World Heritage status of the property in relation to the following areas

Conservation	Positive
Research and monitoring	Positive
Management effectiveness	Positive
Quality of life for local communities and indigenous peoples	Positive
Recognition	Very positive
Education	Very positive
Infrastructure development	Positive
Funding for the property	Positive
International cooperation	Positive
Political support for conservation	Positive
Legal / Policy framework	Positive
Lobbying	Not applicable
Institutional coordination	Positive
Security	Positive
Other (please specify)	Not applicable

### 6.2 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to World Heritage status

### 6.3 - Entities involved in the preparation of this Section of the Periodic Report

Governmental institution responsible for the property
Site Manager/Coordinator/World Heritage property staff
Non Governmental Organization

### 6.4 - Was the Periodic Reporting questionnaire easy to use and clearly understandable?

no

### 6.5 - Please provide suggestions for improvement of the Periodic Reporting questionnaire

some questions have a dual understanding,

### 6.6 - Please rate the level of support for completing the Periodic Report questionnaire from the following entities

UNESCO	Very good
State Party Representative	Very good
Advisory Body	Very good

### 6.7 - How accessible was the information required to complete the Periodic Report?

All required information was accessible

### 6.8 - The Periodic Reporting process has improved the understanding of the following

The World Heritage Convention
The concept of Outstanding Universal Value
The property's Outstanding Universal Value
The concept of Integrity and / or Authenticity
The property's Integrity and / or Authenticity
Managing the property to maintain the Outstanding Universal Value
Monitoring and reporting
Management effectiveness

### 6.9 - Please rate the follow-up to conclusions and recommendations from previous Periodic Reporting exercise by the following entities

UNESCO	Excellent
State Party	Satisfactory
Site Managers	Satisfactory
Advisory Bodies	Satisfactory

### 6.10 - Summary of actions that will require formal consideration by the World Heritage Committee

Automatically generated in online version

### 6.11 - Comments, conclusions and / or recommendations related to the Assessment of the Periodic Reporting exercise

it was easier to answer questions working in group, together with advising experts