



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

Patrimoine mondial

41 COM

WHC/17/41.COM/INF.8B4

Cracovie, 3 juillet 2017

Original : anglais / français

ORGANISATION DES NATIONS UNIES POUR L'ÉDUCATION,
LA SCIENCE ET LA CULTURE

CONVENTION CONCERNANT LA PROTECTION DU
PATRIMOINE MONDIAL, CULTUREL ET NATUREL

COMITÉ DU PATRIMOINE MONDIAL

Quarante-et-unième session

Cracovie, Pologne

2 – 12 juillet 2017

Point 8 de l'Ordre du jour provisoire : Établissement de la Liste du patrimoine mondial et de la Liste du patrimoine mondial en péril

INF.8B4 : Notifications d'erreurs factuelles

RÉSUMÉ

Ce document contient les notifications relatives aux erreurs factuelles reçues de la part des États parties au plus tard le 16 juin 2017 en conformité avec le paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*.

Liste alphabétique par État partie des notifications identifiant des erreurs factuelles dans les rapports d'évaluation des Organisations consultatives relatifs aux propositions d'inscription devant être examinées lors de la 41e session du Comité du patrimoine mondial (Cracovie, Pologne, 2 – 12 juillet 2017)

Etat partie	Proposition d'inscription au patrimoine mondial	N° d'ordre		Recomman.	Pp
SITES NATURELS					
Albanie / Autriche / Belgique / Bulgarie / Croatie / Espagne / Italie / Roumanie / Slovénie / Ukraine	Forêts primaires de hêtres des Carpates et d'autres régions d'Europe	1133	Ter	D	2
Bénin / Burkina Faso	Complexe W-Arly-Pendjari	749	Bis	OK	11
Ghana	Parc national Mole	1514		N	16
Mongolie / Fédération de Russie	Paysages de la Dauria	1448	Rev	I	34
SITES MIXTES					
Mexique	Vallée de Tehuacán-Cuicatalán : habitat originel de Mésopotamie	1534		D / D	36
SITES CULTURELS					
Afrique du Sud	Paysage culturel des #Khomani	1545		D	43
Allemagne	Les grottes avec l'art le plus ancien de la période glaciaire	1527		I	52
Allemagne	Le Bauhaus et ses sites à Weimar, Dessau et Bernau	729	Bis	OK	56
Allemagne	Cathédrale de Naumburg et sites associés dans le paysage culturel de la Saale et de l'Unstrut	1470	Rev	N	57
Angola	Centre historique de Mbanza Kongo	1511		I	59
Azerbaïdjan	Centre historique de Sheki avec le palais du Khan	1549		N	61
Chine	Kulangsu : un établissement historique international	1541		I	66
Danemark	Kujataa - un paysage agricole subarctique au Groenland	1536		R	68
Émirats arabes unis	Khor Dubaï, un port marchand traditionnel	1458	Rev	N	71
Érythrée	Asmara : ville moderniste d'Afrique	1550		I	77
Géorgie	Monastère de Ghélati	710	Bis	OK	90
Inde	Ville historique d'Ahmedabad	1551		D	97
Iran (République islamique d')	Ville historique de Yazd	1544		D	99
Japon	Île sacrée d'Okinoshima et sites associés de la région de Munakata	1535		I	105
Jordanie	L'architecture éclectique d'As-Salt (1865-1925), Origines et évolution d'un langage architectural au Levant	689	Rev	N	111
Pologne	Mine de plomb, argent et zinc de Tarnowskie Góry et son système de gestion hydraulique souterrain	1539		D	112
Royaume-Uni de Grande-Bretagne et d'Irlande du Nord	Le District des Lacs anglais	422	Rev	I	130
Turquie	Aphrodisias	1519		D	134

Modifications Mineures des Limites de Biens

État partie	Bien du patrimoine mondial	N° d'ordre		Recomman.	Pp
Pays-Bas	Ligne de défense d'Amsterdam	759	Bis	N	137

Les notifications d'erreurs factuelles sont présentées dans la langue dans laquelle les États parties les ont soumises.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Albanie / Autriche / Belgique / Bulgarie / Croatie / Espagne / Italie / Roumanie / Slovénie / Ukraine

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Forêts primaires de hêtres des Carpates et d'autres régions d'Europe

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
P57/left/113	Issues raised included the conceptual rationale for the transnational extension and a trend in this nomination toward smaller, less viable components and buffer zones.	The average size of component parts is the same as the one of the extension that was inscribed in 2011. The calculation in the IUCN Evaluation neglects that the small component parts are grouped in clusters which are ecologically linked by forest ecosystems within the buffer zones. From the ecologically functional perspective, the component parts within one cluster should be summed up, which leads to a mean size of component parts/clusters of 1824 ha. The area of buffer areas in relation to the component parts has been significantly increased. For details, see below (remark on P65/left/55 and p65/right/105).	Not a factual error This is describing the nature of issues raised by IUCN following its first Panel. The IUCN analysis is factually correct, and it is based on an assessment of the differences between the component parts proposed for inscription, which are the components which carry OUV. Buffer zones serve to protect, but do not form part of the property so it is not appropriate to count them in the comparison of areas in the way that is being suggested. All necessary elements of OUV should be included within the nominated property – consistent with paragraphs 88 and 94 of the Operational Guidelines.
p60/left/17	within the border zone between Albania and Yougoslavia	within the border zone between Albania and former Yougoslavia	Clarification The context of this remark in the IUCN report relates to the history of the area in current and previous configurations of nations. IUCN fully accepts this proposed changed text to reflect the current situation.
p60/left/4	and represent the most natural parts of a peri-urban forest (...) which is now strictly protected	and represent the most natural parts of a peri-urban forest (...) which are strictly protected	Difference of opinion It is true that all the components in Belgium are strictly

			protected; however this statement expresses IUCN’s understanding that some parts of this forest have been protected since the 1850s but some other areas have been subject to much more recent protection decrees (2010 and 2016).
p60/left/10	Beech trees in the Sonian Forest were favoured through human intervention, particularly through the work of the young Austrian landscape architect Joachim Zinner (...)	Beech trees have always been present in the Sonian Forest. See:Scientific references and background in the annex below ‘comments of Belgian State Party’.	Not a factual error The statement “...were favoured...” clearly implies the understanding that beech was already present. The proposed amendment is not accepted.
p61/left/5	cathedral trees	"particularly ...cathedral trees". Scientific research has destroyed the myth about the planting on a massive scale and about Zinner’s impact in particular. See:Scientific references and background in the annex below ‘comments of Belgian State Party’.	Not a factual error Difference of opinion IUCN is noting the fact that there is history of forest practice which favoured beech trees in the Sonian Forest and there is a high likelihood that some of the monumental trees (cathedral trees) were planted. Whilst the scale of impact can be debated the fact of this intervention clearly is not compatible with any definition of these areas as being “Primeval”.
p61/left/7	Whilst the forests within the nominated property are now the most undisturbed parts of the Sonian system, it is highly likely that some of the cathedral trees were planted in the past.	The nominated components are forest reserves and the most undisturbed parts of the Sonian forest; they host one of the largest lists of species related to Atlantic Beech Forests. There is no scientific evidence for the assumption that the cathedral trees in the components were planted, nor is it essential for the appreciation of the ecological value of the components. Contrary to the assessment of the components in other State Parties, information on the species was missing. See: Scientific references and background in the annex below ‘comments of Belgian State Party’.	Not a factual error Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies There are references to the cathedral trees in the Sonian Forests resulting from human intervention. IUCN does not accept that this constitutes a natural forest development and succession process in this case, and is not compatible with any definition of “Primeval Forest”. The maintenance of species diversity in a forest with significant human role in past and present management, and the current concerns on integrity are not compatible with recognition under natural criteria.
p61/left/109	The Sonian Forest is the northernmost extent of this serial transnational extension and the nomination proposes it to represent Atlantic Beech Forest; however this is a large BFR with natural forested areas in other countries.	The Sonian Forest is the northernmost extent of this serial transnational extension and represents Atlantic Beech Forest. The European screening process conducted by the scientific panel of Beech Forest Specialists has come to the conclusion	Not a factual error Difference of opinion IUCN’s position on these components is clearly stated in the nomination, and is further noted above.

	<p>The Sonian Forest is (...), but is not, in IUCN's view, a result of natural ecological processes.</p> <p>IUCN considers these forests are not the result of natural ecological processes and evolution.</p>	<p>that there are NO large natural beech forests left in the Atlantic region . Neither in UK nor in FR sites have been suitable for extension. Furthermore, the original forest reserve of Fontainebleau is far smaller (100 ha) than the Sonian one – although it was recently enlarged, the New Forest in UK shows much more intensive human influence (grazing, coppicing, etc.).</p> <p>While the 'Brief description of each of the country components' from page 60 of the IUCN technical evaluation describes the forest types and / or species richness of all components, the natural values of the Sonian Forest remain unmentioned. Therefore, we explain the exceptional natural value of the proposed site(s) in the annex below.</p>	
p61/left/13-20	The Sonian Forest is (...) 2x	<p>These two statements are about the Sonian Forest as a whole. However, the nominated property is limited to 5 components. The components are forest reserves (and not cultural landscapes) clustered within the Sonian forest.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies</p> <p>The small size of the Belgian components and their context in this peri-urban forest was considered. At the first suggested factual error point above, the States Parties are arguing that the complexes (including surrounding forest buffer zones) are what should be considered in assessing OUV. This SP comment is in contradiction with that position by suggesting that the reduced area of the 5 components is what should be considered. This illustrates very clearly the sort of issues that require reconsideration in this nomination.</p>
P65/left/30	the series include areas (most notably in Belgium) where the scope of past use is of a different character with significant loss of naturalness	<p>Delete "most notably in Belgium" because the statement does not apply to the 5 nominated components but concerns the Sonian Forest as a whole.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of opinion</p> <p>See points above.</p>
P65/left/145	IUCN considers the protection status of the nominated property does not meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.	<p>In line 33, same column, same page, it is stated: "All five IUCN field missions concluded that adequate protection regimes were in place within the nominated components;". The main concern is expressed in the buffer zone management. As all buffer zones are managed by the same authorities as the nominated property itself, buffer zone management is fully in line with the functional protection as described in the</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies</p> <p>The legal protection regimes within the areas proposed for inscription was considered adequate in terms of the boundaries proposed; however,</p>

		nomination dossier (p265).	protection of OUV is also a product of external threats and the configuration and efficacy of buffer zone mechanisms. Thus the protection of potential in terms of the full requirements is considered not adequate.
We P65/left/55	There is a clear and concerning trend toward smaller components compared to the existing property to which this nomination would serve as an extension, with the average size in the present nomination being 871 ha compared to an average of 2,200 ha in the inscribed site, a reduction of around 60% .	The calculation in the IUCN Evaluation neglects that the small component parts are grouped in clusters which are ecologically linked by forest ecosystems within the buffer zones. From the ecologically functional perspective, the component parts within one cluster should be summed up, which leads to a mean size of component parts/clusters of 1824 ha, which is significantly higher than the German extension in 2011 and only 18% less than the whole listed property.	Not a factual error As noted above, analysis must be done on the nominated component areas, which are what carry the potential OUV. Buffer zones by definition do not carry OUV so cannot be counted as a measure in this regard. If attributes of OUV are contained in the buffer zone (such as regarding connectivity in clusters) those areas should be included in the nominated property.
p65/right/105	Similarly, buffer zones in the existing property average 4,160 ha, whereas they average 2,857 ha in the current nomination.	As described above, the calculation in the IUCN Evaluation is misleading, as it neglects that several interconnected component parts are within the same buffer zone. Therefore, the division of the buffer zone by the number of components will give no scientifically meaningful result. Table 1 on page 60 in the Evaluation report clearly shows that in the already listed property the average site of the buffer zone is 1.85 ha for each hectare of the property, while in the proposed extension it is 3.28 ha of buffer zone for each ha of proposed property. This shows that the buffer zones have been extended twice in comparison of the existing property.	Not a factual error IUCN understands the point being made as it is true that some components are embedded within larger connecting buffer zones. However, this does not materially alter the evaluation's findings that question the variations in site configuration country to country and the efficacy of the buffer zones. The configuration of the series, and the component parts and buffer zones requires reconsideration. To the extent that this is an issue it is important to note that whilst some components are clustered, many are not and stand alone, so this point is in any case only related to parts of the series.
p65/right/117	However, analyzing the component size based on 300 ha is somewhat misleading as 11 of the components are <100ha and four of the Belgium components are <50 ha which was argued by the States Parties as the minimum viable forest size, so these components are clearly inappropriate even on the minimalist argument advanced.	First, this argumentation again neglects the existence of Clusters (which is well described in the nomination dossier and presented in the maps, as well). It is clearly visible that e.g. the 5 component parts in Belgium are all located in the same protected area, linked by forest ecosystems, thus represent a total area of 269 ha. We would like to point out that in the first nomination in 2007 small sites have been included as well (Rozok 67 ha, Havesheva 173 ha,) which were not regarded to violate the minimum requirements.	Not a factual error Points already made above respond to this. The current nomination clearly reduces the standard for selection of serial components compared to the previous series. 5 components are smaller than the smallest (67ha) in the existing site. IUCN considers that a discussion about how small clusters can be is antithetic to the concept of OUV, and to the accepted and credible approaches to serial sites which should be based on selecting exceptional examples, not assembling a large series based

			on a criteria of minimum size.
p66/left/109	Fundamentally, as noted above, it is apparent that beech trees in the nominated components of this forest were planted (albeit centuries years ago) and beech has also been actively favored in management over oak and other native tree species. IUCN considers these forests [the 5 component parts of the Sonian forest] are not the result of natural ecological processes and evolution.	<p>Delete the marked texts because scientific evidence proves the opposite:</p> <p>On the natural presence of beech trees, see: Munaut 1967; Verbruggen et al. 1996; Magri 2008, Munaut 1967.</p> <p>On the natural predominance of beech, see: Deforce, 2015 and Deforce et al: in prep. But also: Donatio Angelae, a bull dated 891 AD.</p> <p>On the natural ecological processes and evolution, see: Scientific references and background in the annex below 'comments of Belgian State Party'.</p> <p>The Sonian forest is not a man-made beech forest plantation, as suggested.</p> <p>For the proposed site, paleobotanic evidence proves that beech was already present in the Brussels region 4500-5000 years ago (<u>Bastin 1968</u>, Munaut 1967; Verbruggen et al. 1996; Magri 2008), which is the estimated time of re-colonisation of that area after the Ice Ages. The sources also indicate that beech had a predominant position in this forest for at least 2000 years. Beech (as well as oak) have been protected against unregulated cutting already since the 9th century. The extensive high-forest management system, using natural regeneration, that was applied since the Middle Ages, much better conserved natural species competition and composition than the elsewhere widespread coppicing. The 18th century plantings (of beech but also oak and hornbeam) the evaluation report explicitly mentions were only applied in areas that needed restocking after unregulated cuttings in the century before and covered about 20% of the complex. In these plantings, and also later, only local provenances were used.</p> <p>Soils remained undisturbed since the last ice ages and have never been cultivated.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of Opinion</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p> <p>IUCN is not disputing the long evolutionary history of beech in the Atlantic BFR. The concerns in the evaluation relate to the history of human intervention in the forests and the ecological viability of these very small forest remnants in a peri-urban forest to sustain ongoing ecological and biological processes under criterion (ix). The points made above cover this point.</p> <p>It is not the case that IUCN represents the Sonian Forest as a Beech Forest "plantation", but it is clear that it is not a forest that can be considered to be Primeval.</p>
p66/left/127	Reviewers have noted that some buffer zones may permit logging to open up canopies by up to 60%.	Maybe the translation was misleading on p265. It should be: "In the case of managed forest, it is obligatory that the density of the tree layer should not be reduced to less than 60% by human activities."	<p>Clarification</p> <p>This may be a mistranslation, but the implication of 40% canopy opening would be highly questionable, even if the figure has been inverted.</p>
p66/left/155	In addition, the approach to designing the buffer zones in	The functional and spatial design of the buffer zones follows the internal	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/</p>

	different components/clusters differs greatly from country to country and is inconsistent across the nominated series.	guideline which was developed by the coordination team to ensure the same approach during the planning phase of the expansion in all countries (p265 in the nomination dossier). This extension nomination clearly describes how buffer zones should protect the property on page 265 of the nomination dossier. For the current nomination procedure, we analysed the potential threats and, based on those, developed a buffer zone design with minimum requirements for all component parts. For the case that several component parts are clustered within one protected area, buffer zones have been enlarged significantly. As neither the ecological conditions nor land ownership or protected area management regimes are the same in all 10 countries, the final buffer zones design varies of course from cluster to cluster.	justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies. Examples were given in the evaluation of the quite different conceptual approaches to site design – from components with their own individual buffer zones to components in much larger enveloping buffer zones and diverse relations between the sizes of components related to buffers.
p66/right/111	It is also not clear how World Heritage buffer zones add to the protection already afforded by protected area zoning systems or how the management of the buffer zones will favour the maintain of the Outstanding Universal Value attributes and the integrity of each cluster in the long term.	The functionality of the buffer zones and their management requirements are described on page 265 in the nomination dossier. There are two functions described: Protection and connection of component parts. The protective function is realised by conserving tree cover at the border of the component parts to protect from microclimatic impact and other negative human-induced influences (e.g. exposure to wind throw risk). All buffer zones are managed by the same authorities that are managing the component parts.	Not a factual error Clarification The IUCN evaluation report and above comments address this point.
p67/left/161	Given concerns regarding the lack of an overarching management framework and a long-term sustainable financial mechanism for the transnational serial site, IUCN considers the management of the nominated property does not meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.	The overarching management framework is described in the integrated Management Systems within the nomination dossier (p277 ff). In the development of the extension nomination we built up the management framework on the approved and inscribed extension of the German property. The nomination used the same approach to have local protected area management plans in place that ensure non-intervention management for each component part (which is acknowledged to be sufficient in the IUCN Evaluation (e.g. p65/left/line 33, p67/left/line 38). It is not feasible that 12 State Parties install an overarching management system and set up financing BEFORE the inscription is in place. Nevertheless, there is a letter of intent prepared (and added in the annex to the nomination dossier), where all State Parties involved agree on implementing the Integrated Management System and a respective	Not a factual error IUCN acknowledges the expressed intention of the nominating States Parties to expand the IMS and understands the reasons why it is not proposed that this be done until the extension is approved. However concerns are centred on the lack of any precision or detail regarding specific funding and actions at national levels and funding/actions to support transnational cooperation. The letter of intent was noted but further specific information is needed on this matter.

		funding system. We assume this is in line with the Operational Guidelines (108-118).	
p67/right/154	An example is grazing within the Central Balkans National Park which is managed by annual quotas to local herders and where there is pressure to see additional areas opened to stock. Here grazing may impact seedlings and young trees limiting the natural ecological development of forests beyond the nominated areas.	There is no grazing allowed or practised, neither for the component parts nor for the buffer zones of the Central Balkans National Park. See description of the component part on p26 (“Where the component parts’ border areas are close to the Park’s multifunctional zone with livestock grazing, buffer zones were established”) in the nomination dossier and detailed comments on this in the Annex to this document.	Not a factual error Clarification IUCN notes that the information that annual quotas were used to manage grazing was provided via the field evaluation. The points made here also do not materially alter the concern within the evaluation that grazing in some areas of the park may interfere with natural forest development beyond the nominated areas. The additional information provided by the State Party of Bulgaria (annexed) notes that grazing takes place in the CBNP but is restricted to treeless parts. Grazing is also confirmed as occurring over 15,500 ha of the CBNP which is more than 21% of the area of CBNP (72,021 ha) .
P68/left/24	In summary, IUCN considers that whilst the condition and protection of many individual components is good, buffer zones are not adequate and the integrity requirements of the Operational Guidelines are not met by the nominated extension.	There is no evidence indicating that the proposed buffer zones are not able to fulfil their protective function. The protective function is described in detail on page 265 of the nomination dossier. The IUCN Evaluation report does not specify which threats are not sufficiently being buffered by the buffer zones.	Not a factual error Difference of opinion Threats such as grazing and forest canopy management have been alluded to in the evaluation, and some examples are given. It is true that a precise review of this matter is beyond the level of detail that the evaluation can address. The additional protection afforded by the buffer zones over and above that of protected zoning is not clear.
p68/right/106	Thus, a serial approach is justified in principle, however the present nomination is not , as was requested by the Committee, either of itself a finite series, nor is it indicating what an eventual finite series could be.	In the decision: 35 COM 8B.13 from 2011 it is stated "... to ensure a comprehensive approach to conserving the primeval and ancient beech forests of Europe and for their exploration of the potential for the World Heritage Convention to further these efforts by cooperating with the support of IUCN and the World Heritage Centre, with other interested States Parties towards a finite serial transnational nomination in order to assure the protection of this unique forest ecosystem." As argued above, the OUV under criteria ix focuses on the postglacial extension process of the beech. To represent this in a serial site, all different development processes and states found within the different beech forest regions have to be represented. All relevant State	Not a factual error Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies The acknowledgment that only interested States Parties have nominated (and noting the withdrawal of components from the SP of Poland) confirms that there exists potential for further expansion of the property and a lack of clarity on what would constitute a complete and finite serial site on the World Heritage List. This confirms the need for a reexamination of the serial approach, to understand what an eventual finite series would be,

		Parties have been invited and the interested State Parties are part of this extension nomination. This extension will increase the property by 200% and will cover 80% of all primeval and ancient beech forests in Europe that have the needed protection status of IUCN category I or II (Vienna Short List). All other forests are located in State Parties that are not interested or not able (not ratified the WH Convention, internal procedures not ready) to join this extension.	even if this nomination is not able to accommodate all potential areas that could eventually be nominated in future years by States Parties.
p68/right/119	Nevertheless, some components such as those in Belgium are not considered to contribute to this Outstanding Universal Value as they do not represent natural ecological processes.	To represent the postglacial expansion process, it is of upper most importance to include the different genetic types and climatic regions to cover the overall diversity of beech forests. The Sonian Forest in Belgium is the best preserved and oldest beech forest in the Atlantic Region that is available to represent this specific type of beech forest and therefore contributes considerably to the OUV. Furthermore, it represents an important and unique genetic 'pool' of beech. If the Sonian Forest is excluded, a whole important biogeographic region with beech forest is not presented in the property. See additional comments of the State Party in the annex.	Not a factual error Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies IUCN notes that there are other European BFRs not represented by any areas (Pannonic and Euxinic BFRs). The point being made in the nomination regarding the Belgium components relates to their integrity, and capacity to sustain natural ecological processes. The measure of OUV should be exceptional, not just representative sites, but must relate to the criteria and relevant conditions of integrity being considered, and be fully consistent with the OUV of the site being extended.
p69/left/126	It has also seen a progressive decrease in the size of nominated components (now argued by the State Parties as a 50ha minimum size) and a significant decrease in the average size of buffer zones and with different and inconsistent configurations from country to country.	As described above, the relative buffer zone size per hectare property has been more than doubled on average. It is a fact that in Central and Western Europe primeval and ancient forests in general are rare and of smaller size. This does not limit the importance of their protection and of their value – on the contrary! Their protection contributes to the understanding of the ecological processes of the beech forest expansion in Central and Western Europe. For the first time, a standardized technically described approach for the buffer zone design is given in the nomination dossier, enabling and ensuring a consistent buffer zone configuration.	Not a factual error Points have been noted above concerning the efficacy of the buffer zones and the inconsistencies in suite design from country to country.
p70/left	IUCN concurs with this description of the values which any series of components should possess to potentially meet criterion (ix), but does not consider that the nomination meets either the requirement to represent this phenomenon, nor	The same OUV was acknowledged by the UNESCO WH Committee in 2011. There are no forests included in the proposed property that are not at least as "ancient" as those accepted in 2011. The property is not designed to represent the largest and most undisturbed beech forest of Europe,	Not a factual error Difference of opinion IUCN appreciates the changing understanding of OUV for the European Beech forests which has resulted from the 2010 extension. IUCN's conclusion is

	<p>does it meet the requirements of Outstanding Universal Value as defined in the Operational Guidelines.</p>	<p>but to represent the postglacial expansion process of beech through a network of the most undisturbed forests that are available.</p>	<p>that the present nomination has not made a compelling case that the sites selected, nor the configuration of component parts and buffer zones, are ones that demonstrate OUV consistent with understanding the history and evolution of European Beech. A selection of the “most undisturbed forests that are available” is not, without a highly selective approach, likely to produce a series that meets the currently applied criterion, and the conditions of integrity.</p>
--	--	--	--

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Bénin / Burkina Faso

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Complexe W-Arly-Pendjari

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 6, Colonne 2, Ligne 16	La mission a rencontré des représentants et du personnel de différentes autorités concernées, au Burkina Faso et au Bénin, notamment des organisations régionales telles que l'Union Économique et Monétaire Ouest- Africaine – UEMOA, les autorités concernées par la gestion des parcs nationaux et des zones cynégétiques – l'Office National des Parcs et Réserves – OFINAP , au Burkina Faso, et le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune – CENAGREF, au Bénin.	La mission a rencontré des représentants et du personnel de différentes autorités concernées, au Burkina Faso et au Bénin, notamment des organisations régionales telles que l'Union Économique et Monétaire Ouest- Africaine – UEMOA, les autorités concernées par la gestion des parcs nationaux et des zones cynégétiques – l'Office National des Aires Protégées – OFINAP -, au Burkina Faso, et le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune – CENAGREF, au Bénin.	Erreur factuelle L'UICN a utilisé les abréviations fournies en page 4 du dossier de la proposition d'inscription.
Page 6, Colonne 2, Ligne 56	Au Burkina Faso, deux zones villageoises d'intérêt cynégétique (ZOVIC) ont également été ajoutées au bien proposé alors qu'elles se trouvaient précédemment dans la zone tampon : les ZOVIC de Koakrana et Kourtiagou.	Au Burkina Faso, deux zones cynégétiques ont également été ajoutées au bien proposé alors qu'elles se trouvaient précédemment dans la zone tampon : les zones cynégétiques de Koakrana et Kourtiagou.	Erreur factuelle L'UICN note que cette abréviation est utilisée dans certaines références, comme ici par exemple : https://transhumance-burkinafaso.jimdo.com/r%C3%A9seau/burkina-faso/ L'UICN accepte la modification demandée.
Page 7, Tableau 1 Colonne 2, Ligne 8 et 9	ZOVIC Koakrana, ZOVIC Kourtiagou	Zone cynégétique de Koakrana Zone cynégétique de Kourtiagou	Erreur factuelle Comme ci-dessus.
Page 7, Colonne 1,	Le bien proposé est à cheval sur les bassins versants de la Volta et du Niger et quatre rivières principales coulent dans la région	Le bien proposé est à cheval sur les bassins versants de la Volta et du Niger avec des principaux cours d'eau qui coulent dans la	Pas une erreur factuelle Formulation différente qui ne change pas le sens de la

Ligne 11	(Niger, Pendjari, Mékrou et Alibori).	région (Niger, Pendjari, Mékrou et Alibori).	phrase Clarification
Page 7, Colonne 1, Ligne 25	Le Complexe WAP est la plus grande mosaïque d'aires protégées transfrontalières d'Afrique de l'Ouest et il est intégré dans la « Réserve de biosphère transfrontalière du W » que se partagent le Niger, le Bénin et le Burkina Faso.	Le Complexe WAP est la plus grande mosaïque d'aires protégées transfrontalières d'Afrique de l'Ouest et inclut la « Réserve de biosphère transfrontalière du W » que se partagent le Niger, le Bénin et le Burkina Faso.	Erreur factuelle Modification acceptée
Page 7, Colonne 1, Ligne 36	Le Complexe WAP est une vaste étendue de savane soudano-sahélienne intacte, avec des types de végétation nombreux et divers : prairies, brousses, savane boisée et vastes forêts-galeries et riveraines.	Le Complexe WAP est une vaste étendue de savane soudano-sahélienne intacte, avec des types de végétation nombreux et divers : les savanes boisées, arbustives, arborées, herbeuses, les forêts galeries, les végétations ripicoles.	Clarification
Page 9, Colonne 2, Ligne 42	Des aires protégées autorisant une chasse contrôlée –appelées Zones cynégétiques au Bénin et Zones villageoises d'intérêt cynégétique (ZOVIC) au Burkina Faso – entourent les parcs nationaux et, dans certains cas, font partie de la zone tampon du patrimoine mondial.	Des aires protégées autorisant une chasse contrôlée – appelées zones cynégétiques entourent les parcs nationaux et, dans certains cas, font partie de la zone tampon du patrimoine mondial.	Erreur factuelle Voir commentaire ci-dessus
Page 9, Colonne 2, Ligne 47	Quatre zones cynégétiques ont été intégrées dans le bien proposé : les zones cynégétiques de Konkombri et Mékrou au Bénin et les ZOVIC de Koakrana et Kourtiagou au Burkina Faso.	Quatre zones cynégétiques ont été intégrées dans le bien proposé : les zones cynégétiques de Konkombri, Mékrou, Koakrana et Kourtiagou.	Erreur factuelle Voir commentaire ci-dessus
Page 10, Colonne 1, Ligne 27 et 29	Les autorités publiques gèrent le bien proposé : au Bénin, le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune (CENAGREF) est l'autorité responsable et au Burkina Faso, le PN d'Arly est géré par l'Office National des Parcs et Réserves (OFINAP) tandis que le PNW-Burkina Faso est géré par la Direction Générale des Forêts et de la Faune (DGFF).	Les autorités publiques gèrent le bien proposé : au Bénin, le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune (CENAGREF) est l'autorité responsable et au Burkina Faso, le PN d'Arly est géré par l'Office National des Aires Protégées (OFINAP) tandis que le PNW-Burkina Faso est géré par la Direction Générale des Eaux et Forêts (DGEF).	Erreur factuelle Voir commentaire ci-dessus. L'UICN a utilisé les abréviations indiquées dans la proposition d'inscription en page 4 et qui sont utilisées dans tout le dossier.
Page 11, Colonne 2, Ligne 13	Le budget de fonctionnement du PN de la Pendjari, par exemple, se monte à 350 millions de francs d'Afrique centrale (XAF) (env. 530 000 euros), dont 100 millions XAF proviennent du revenu du tourisme, 75 millions XAF correspondent aux subventions des États et le reste provient de partenariats.	Le budget de fonctionnement du PN de la Pendjari, par exemple, s'élève à 350 millions de francs d'Afrique de l'Ouest (XOF) (env. 530 000 euros), dont 100 millions XOF proviennent du revenu du tourisme, 75 millions XOF correspondent aux subventions des États et le reste provient de partenariats.	Pas une erreur factuelle Erreur dans le choix de la monnaie locale mais qui ne change pas le sens de la phrase. L'UICN accepte ce changement.
Page 15, Colonne 1, Ligne 7	Situé dans la zone de transition entre les savanes de la région soudanaise et de la région forestière guinéenne, le Complexe W-Arly-Pendjari est situé au cœur du bloc d'aires protégées le plus vaste et le mieux protégé de la province biogéographique des savanes/zones boisées d'Afrique de l'Ouest et comprend le continuum le plus vaste et le plus important d'écosystèmes	Situé dans la zone de transition entre les savanes de la région soudanaise et de la région forestière guinéenne, le Complexe W-Arly-Pendjari est le bloc d'aires protégées le plus vaste et le mieux protégé formant le continuum le plus important d'écosystèmes terrestres, semi-	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification

	terrestres, semi-aquatiques et aquatiques de la ceinture de savanes d'Afrique de l'Ouest.	aquatiques et aquatiques de la province biogéographique des savanes d'Afrique de l'Ouest.	
Page 15, Colonne 1, Ligne 14	Il comprend le Complexe trinational du Parc national du W (que se partagent le Bénin, le Burkina Faso et le Niger), le Parc national d'Arly (Burkina Faso), le Parc national de la Pendjari (Bénin) et les réserves de chasse de Koakrana et Kourtiagou (Burkina Faso) et Konkombri et Mékrou (Bénin).	Il comprend le Complexe trinational du Parc Régional du W (que se partagent le Bénin, le Burkina Faso et le Niger), le Parc national d'Arly (Burkina Faso), le Parc national de la Pendjari (Bénin) et les réserves de chasse de Koakrana et Kourtiagou (Burkina Faso) et Konkombri et Mékrou (Bénin).	Pas une erreur factuelle L'UICN accepte ce changement.
Page 15, Colonne 1, Ligne 30	Situé dans le bassin de la Volta, il comprend un système dynamique où le flux et le reflux de l'eau, au fil de saisons humides et sèches alternées, créent une riche diversité de communautés de plantes avec la faune associée.	Situé à cheval sur les bassins de la Volta et du Niger, il comprend un système dynamique où le flux et le reflux de l'eau, au fil de saisons humides et sèches alternées, créent une riche diversité de communautés de plantes avec la faune associée.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification
Page 15, Colonne 1, Ligne 34	Le Complexe est une vaste étendue de savane soudano-sahélienne intacte comprenant des types de végétation nombreux et divers tels les prairies, brousses, savanes boisées, forêts ouvertes, vastes forêts-galeries et forêts riveraines, sans oublier la rare forêt semi-décidue de Bondjagou, dans le Parc national de la Pendjari.	Le Complexe est une vaste étendue de savane soudano-sahélienne intacte comprenant des types de végétation nombreux et divers telles les savanes boisées, arbustives, arborées, herbeuses, les forêts galeries, les végétations ripicoles, sans oublier la rare forêt semi-décidue de Bondjagou, dans le Parc national de la Pendjari.	Clarification
Page 15, Colonne 1, Ligne 40	Les effets à long terme des feux liés à l'occupation par l'homme datant peut-être de 50 000 ans ont façonné la végétation du bien, et le recours traditionnel au feu entretient la diversité des types de végétation qui, à son tour, assure un habitat aux espèces sauvages charismatiques du bien.	Les effets à long terme des feux liés à l'occupation par les humains datant d'environ 50 000 ans ont façonné la végétation du bien, et le recours traditionnel au feu entretient la diversité des types de formation qui à son tour, assure un habitat aux espèces sauvages charismatiques du bien.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification Pas une erreur factuelle Le mot « formation » n'est pas assez spécifique dans ce cas. Il s'agit de préciser qu'il s'agit de différents types de végétation.
Page 15, Colonne 2, Ligne 14	Couvrant une superficie comparativement vaste de 1 714 831 ha, le bien trinational contient un ensemble représentatif d'écosystèmes soudaniens bien conservés.	Couvrant une superficie comparativement vaste de 1 714 831 ha, le bien trinational contient un ensemble représentatif d'écosystèmes soudano-sahéliens bien conservés.	Clarification L'UICN accepte la précision.
Page 15, Colonne 2,	Quatre réserves cynégétiques relient le Parc national du W et les complexes des Parcs nationaux Arly-Pendjari assurant la connectivité à travers le bien et permettant le déplacement libre des animaux à travers le	Quatre zones cynégétiques relient le Parc Régional du W et le bloc écologique des Parcs nationaux Arly-Pendjari, assurant la connectivité à travers le bien et	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification L'UICN accepte le

Ligne 23	complexe.	permettant le déplacement libre des animaux à travers le complexe.	changement pour le Parc Régional.
Page 15, Colonne 2, Ligne 27	Dans les réserves cynégétiques, la chasse a, jusqu'à maintenant, été gérée de manière durable et les réserves englobent des systèmes et habitats naturels qui sont considérés comme de qualité semblable à ceux des parcs nationaux et renforcent donc la résilience.	Dans les zones cynégétiques, la chasse est gérée de manière durable et les zones englobent des systèmes et habitats naturels dont la qualité est semblable à ceux des parcs nationaux et renforcent donc la résilience.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification
Page 15, Colonne 2, Ligne 32	Les réserves cynégétiques équivaudraient à la Catégorie VI de l'UICN et les activités, au moment de l'inscription, ne semblent pas avoir d'effets négatifs sur la Valeur Universelle Exceptionnelle du bien dans son ensemble.	Les zones cynégétiques équivalent à la Catégorie VI de l'UICN et les activités, au moment de l'inscription, n'ont pas d'effets négatifs sur la Valeur Universelle Exceptionnelle du bien dans son ensemble.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification
Page 15, Colonne 2, Ligne 48	Le bien bénéficie d'une protection juridique à long terme conférée par les législations nationales et reçoit un appui financier et technique des États et de quelques partenaires pour le développement.	Le bien bénéficie d'une protection juridique à long terme conférée par les législations nationales, les accords régionaux et reçoit un appui financier et technique des États et de quelques partenaires pour le développement.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification
Page 16, Colonne 1, Ligne 15	Au Bénin, le bien est géré par le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune (CENAGREF) ; et au Burkina Faso, le Parc national d'Arly est géré par l' Office National des Parcs et Réserves (OFINAP) et le Parc national du W du Burkina Faso, par l'administration d'État des forêts , la Direction Générale des Forêts et de la Faune (DGFF) .	Au Bénin, le bien est géré par le Centre National de Gestion des Réserves de Faune (CENAGREF), au Burkina Faso, le Parc national d'Arly est géré par l' Office National des Aires Protégées (OFINAP) et le Parc national du W du Burkina Faso est géré par la Direction Générale des Eaux et Forêts (DGEF) .	Erreur factuelle Voir commentaire ci-dessus
Page 16, Colonne 1, Ligne 21	Le Parc national du W du Niger est géré par la Direction Générale des Eaux et Forêts (DGEF), Ministère de l'Environnement, de la Salubrité Urbaine et du Développement Durable (MESU/DD).	Le Parc national du W du Niger est géré par la Direction Générale des Eaux et Forêts (DGEF)/ Ministère de l'Environnement et du Développement Durable (MEDD) .	Erreur factuelle Voir commentaire ci-dessus
Page 16, Colonne 1, Ligne 44	De même, les trois États parties devraient coopérer avec l'Union Économique et Monétaire Ouest-Africaine (UEMOA) pour planifier, surveiller et agir pour que la transhumance à travers le bien et les zones tampons ne porte pas préjudice à la Valeur Universelle Exceptionnelle.	De même, les trois États parties sont encouragés à poursuivre la coopération avec l'Union Économique et Monétaire Ouest-Africaine (UEMOA) pour coordonner la gestion transfrontalière et agir pour que la transhumance à travers le bien et les zones tampons, ne porte pas préjudice à la Valeur Universelle Exceptionnelle.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification

Page 16, Colonne 1, Ligne 53	Les États parties devraient s’engager à apporter un financement public adéquat pour gérer le Complexe et assurer la coordination nécessaire.	Les États parties sont encouragés à apporter un financement public adéquat pour gérer le Complexe et y assurer la coordination nécessaire.	Pas une erreur factuelle Clarification
------------------------------------	---	---	---

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Ghana

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Parc national Mole

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisati on consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 20, column 1, line 20	Field Visit: Wendy Strahm and Oscar Mthimkhulu 31 October – 7 November, 2016	Evaluators arrived in Ghana on 31 st October and 1 st November, 2016 respectively and arrived in Mole on the night of 3 rd November, 2016. Field Visit commenced on the 4 th November until noon of 6 th November, 2016 (Two and a half days).	Not a factual error The field mission took place during the period noted to an agreed timetable.
Page 20, column 1, line 29	The park covers 457,700 ha of strictly protected land, falls entirely within the Sudanian vegetation zone, and is mostly comprised of open Sudanian woodland.	This statement is incorrect. The park is located within a typical Guinea Savannah Ecological Zone, and is mainly open savannah woodland with close canopy riverine/riparian forest. MNP also includes understorey of grasses layer in the open canopy forest that reach 3 metres in height during raining season and not Sudanian Vegetation Zone with Sudanian woodland.	Not a factual error Clarification IUCN believes this is an issue with the different nomenclature used for vegetation types in this region. The statement in the evaluation is derived from Dowsett & Dowsett (2004) (a reference sent with the nomination). This paper states "Mole National Park...protecting a sizeable chunk of Sudanian (= Guinea-Sudanian) woodland in the north of the country." adding "The whole of Mole N.P. falls within the Sudanian vegetation zone (White 1983, synonym "Guinea savanna"), and Sudanian woodland is the most extensive vegetation type. White (1983) calls the zone within which the property sites as "Sudanian regional zone of endemism". IUCN notes that the nomination calls the vegetation Guinea Savannah and that this term could also have been used.

			<p>The dominance of woodland does not seem to be in question. IUCN’s Protected Area Management Effectiveness (PAME) report for 2010 notes that open savannah woodland is the dominant vegetation type.</p> <p>The clarification above does not materially alter the evaluation findings.</p>
<p>Page 20, column 2, line 22</p>	<p>The level of endemism within the vegetation is generally low in West African Savannah. The nomination stated that five species of endemic plants occurred in the nominated property, but it is unlikely that the sedge <i>Kyllinga echinata</i> is unique to MNP, and <i>Ancilema setiferum</i> var <i>pallidiciliatum</i>, <i>Gongronema obscurum</i>, <i>Raphionacme vignei</i> and <i>Phinopterys angustifolia</i> occur elsewhere in Ghana.</p>	<p><u>According to IUCN-Parks and Reserves of Ghana-2010/ISBN: 978-2-8317-1277-2 Page 17</u></p> <p>“Most of the 742 plant species found in Mole are widespread throughout the savannah zone. However, the species of conservation value (4 endemic, 12 disjunction and 24 species which are rare or have a very limited distribution) is relatively high. Their abundance is generally low and they are often confined to small areas.</p> <p>Three species which are endemic to Ghana were recorded in Mole, namely <i>Gongronema obscurum</i>, <i>Raphionacme vignei</i> and <i>Rhinopterys angustifolia</i>. There are 5 plants species endemic to the region where the PA is located. <i>Croton pseudopulchellus</i>, <i>Indigofera conferta</i>, <i>Indigofera trichopoda</i>, <i>Jatropha nerifolia</i>, <i>Pleiotaxi newtonii</i>”</p> <p>This explanation above justifies plant endemism in the nominated property.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies</p> <p>IUCN observes that the cited 2010 report notes these species are endemic to Ghana and are not site-specific endemics to MNP. In IUCN’s view this is therefore not an argument that makes Mole stand out as globally exceptional in terms of plant endemism.</p> <p>IUCN in general cautions against using the 2010 Protected Area Management Effectiveness (PAME) report to justify confirmed values within MNP. The field evaluation and additional analysis has thrown considerable doubt on the species data in the nomination quoted within the IUCN report. Much of the values data has been sourced from secondary references and has not been reviewed or challenged. IUCN also notes that the focus of this report was on protected area management effectiveness not on an in-depth analysis of the values.</p>
<p>Page 20, column 2, line 42</p>	<p>The nomination states over 93 species of mammals, 300 species of birds, nine amphibians, 33 reptiles and many invertebrates including 120 butterfly species have been recorded in MNP, IUCN notes that different numbers are given in the dossier for species – for example mammals are variously reported as numbering between 90 and 94 and birds between 300 and 344 species.</p>	<p>These variation in figures for birds came about as a result of referring to different literature: <u>Ornithological Surveys in Mole National Park (August – September 2004)</u> by <u>Francoise Dowsett-Lemaire & Robert J. Dowsett</u> provided 335 bird species whereas <u>IUCN-Parks and Reserves of Ghana-2010</u> stated 344 bird species.</p> <p>The correct numbers are: 94 species of mammals, 344 species of birds as per IUCN’s document, 9 amphibians, 33 reptiles and 149 butterfly species.</p> <p>Note: The phrases ‘between 300 and 344 species of birds’ and ‘between 90 and 94 mammals’ which were used in our description</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>IUCN’s evaluation acknowledged that the variation in data was due to varied sources and the age of census data. The evaluation concluded that despite these variations in species data the case was not made that the property was of globally exceptional importance for conserving globally threatened species when compared with other sites in West Africa. MNP is certainly very important for conservation at a regional level.</p>

		were done in situations where we did not want to be specific about species numbers. However, we can state emphatically that, the IUCN Parks and Reserves of Ghana 2010 report which confirm the presence of 344 bird species is what we stand by.	
Page 20, column 2, line 56	Ten mammals are noted as being on the IUCN Red List, however, the data on their threat issue is out of date.	<p>See the updated IUCN Red List of Threatened Species found in Mole below:</p> <p>Lion Panthera leo - Vulnerable (2017-1)</p> <p>Elephant Loxodonta Africana - Vulnerable (2017-1)</p> <p>Spotted hyaena Crocuta crocuta - Least Concern (2017-1)</p> <p>Buffalo Syncerus caffer - Least concern (2017-1)</p> <p>Oribi Ourebia ourebi - (this taxon has not yet been assessed for the IUCN Red List)</p> <p>Roan antelope Hippotragus equines - Least concern (2017-1)</p> <p>Kob (Buffon's kob) Kobus kob - Vulnerable (2017-1)</p> <p>Gambian mongoose Mungos gambianus - (this taxon has not yet been assessed for the IUCN Red List)</p> <p>Yellow-backed duiker Cephalophus silvicultor - Near threatened (2017-1)</p> <p>Bohor Reedbuck Redunca redunca - Least concern (2017-1).</p> <p>Leopard -Panthera pardus - Vulnerable (2017-1).</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>The IUCN text is correct in context and part of the discussion of the comparative analysis.</p>
Page 20, column 2, line 58	More generally, IUCN points out that several of the species noted as occurring within the nominated property are from older survey work and in some cases the species data is exaggerated.	<p>The figures quoted are not exaggerated. They are the results of research which shows an increment in a number of species such as the Leopard <u>Panthera pardus</u> as shown in camera- trap survey 2013 -2015 (“A Short Synthesis of Mammals Diversity in Mole National Park-Ghana” by Francesco M. Angelici and Lorenzo Rossi, 2017 University of Della Tuscia, Department of Environmental Sciences, Italy)</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of opinion</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p> <p>IUCN provided several examples of discrepancies and overstatement in the species data reported in the nomination. Several other references such as “The decline of lions in Ghana’s Mole National Park” (2010)” suggest declining populations of key carnivores due to anthropogenic factors even in flagship protected areas like MNP.</p>

			<p>The quoted 2017 paper is new information. IUCN notes that it reports anecdotal evidence suggesting lions may still be seen in the property. It also includes at Fig 2 the 2014 map showing that lions are confirmed in other protected areas in West Africa but considered absent in MNP. IUCN's evaluation concluded that lions are likely either extinct in the property or with a reduced population that no longer plays a significant role in ecosystem function, or is not currently viable.</p> <p>An overstatement of claims is an understandable consequence when using uncertain and variable data, and IUCN's wording is not intended to criticize, but simply to report the fact that the claims appear to be overstated.</p>
Page 21, column 1, line 8	<p>There are numerous references in the nomination to very substantial numbers of endemic butterflies (56 of the 120 species) occurring in the nominated property.</p> <p>However, IUCN believes this to be misinterpretation of the 2006 survey of butterflies in Ghana, including MNP. While 149 species of butterfly are estimated to occur in MNP (out of a total estimated number of 925 species for Ghana as a whole), IUCN could find no evidence to support the claim of such high numbers of endemic butterflies occurring within the nominated property.</p>	<p><u>“The Ghana Butterfly Fauna and its Contribution to the Objectives of the Protected Areas System”</u> by <u>Torben B. Larsen</u>” in March 2006 recorded 149 species in Mole and the 56 species expressed as endemic actually refers to species almost certain to occur in MNP, and not endemism but rather one species (Athene talboti) that is endemic to East Africa (Uganda) that is found in Mole.</p> <p>Page 13 paragraph 4, line 3 of the Nomination Dossier should read:</p> <p>“.....and 56 species recorded as species almost certain to occur in Mole National Park”</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>IUCN appreciates the clarification, however does not consider this a factual error.</p>
Page 21, column 1, line 20	<p>The IUCN field mission pointed out that much of the area surrounding the nominated property, which is unfenced, appears to be very similar to that located within the park, and wildlife has free movement across the park's boundaries.</p>	<p>All wildlife occurring anywhere in Ghana is legally protected. A permit is needed to hunt wildlife off-reserve similar to the hunting zones of the W Arly Complex. For animals moving beyond the boundary are equally protected and therefore no fence is needed around the park, hence the promotion of CREMA concept to surround the entire reserve. The areas in question are CREMA areas and legally protected.</p> <p>NOTE: The CREMA areas serve as buffer to take care of off-reserve areas of the park thereby improving the security.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>IUCN's comment was a positive reflection on the systems of wildlife protection generally in Ghana.</p>

<p>Page 21, column 1, line 40</p>	<p>The nomination, however, provides no comparative analysis specific to criterion (vii) and therefore offers little evidence to support the merits of MNP over sites with similar aesthetics.</p>	<p>Criterion (iv) was related to Niokolo-Koba instead of criterion (x). This was a typographical error.</p> <p>Statement in dossier should read:</p> <p>“Niokolo-Koba is a World Heritage Site justified under criterion (x), while Mole is nominated justifiably under criteria (vii), (ix) and (x)”.</p> <p>As mentioned in the introduction to the Comparative Analysis: “There are many national parks in the world but not all can be compared to the Mole National Park. The Guinea Savannah Ecological Zone can be found in West Africa only. This extends from western Senegal to eastern Nigeria, and includes portions of Gambia, Guinea Bissau, Guinea, Sierra Leone, Cote d’Ivoire, Ghana, Togo and Benin.</p> <p>Certainly, the national parks outside of West Africa are entirely different ecological systems supporting their own unique biodiversity. It might be difficult to see extensive similarities between other natural heritage properties outside the region and the Mole National Park but they are included in the discussion below for the purposes of comparison”.</p> <p>We therefore state categorically that, there is no site in the sub-region with criterion (vii) comparable to Mole National Park.</p> <p>Air and Tenere Natural Reserves in Niger, although was also inscribed under criteria (vii), (ix) and (x), it is not located in the Guinea Savannah Ecological Zone but rather a Sahelian enclave surrounded by the Sahara Desert.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN notes the correction of the nomination. IUCN considers that the inscription of other sites in the region under criterion (vii) or not, is not the basis of a comparative analysis of the relative values of MNP. The fact that other sites in the region are not inscribed under (vii) is not a reason that Mole should be, and the issue is that values must be compared. IUCN’s evaluation of criterion (vii) is made in the report.</p>
<p>Page 21, column 1, line 46</p>	<p>The Murugu Spring was visited, however, not considered exceptional.</p>	<p>Early aquatic life forms are normally found to be associated with very serene environment. However, fish fingerlings have been found in the very turbulent part of the spring and flowing out to a more serene environment. So the phenomenon found here confirms the fact that the turbulent water as the breeding grounds as against most fishes that will adopt serene water for breeding purposes. This could be unique adaptation for the fishes here which might have evolved with the Murugu Spring. Plans have been made with the Fisheries Department of the University for Development Studies</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>New information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure</p>

		to identify the fishes and research into this unusual adaptation.	
Page 21, column 1, line 48	The two 10 – 20m high waterfalls are certainly beautiful features of this landscape, but they are not unique in the region. Whilst this is a subjective issue, IUCN notes that there are four other waterfalls in Ghana which are listed on popular websites as more notable; Boti, Kintampo, Tagbo and Wli Falls (here a waterfall is considered ‘notable’ if it warrants a specific Wikipedia entry, and the height or width is a minimum of 15m, or the falls have some historical significance based on multiple reliable references).	<p>The occurrence of waterfalls in the Guinea Savannah is a rarity. The incidence of the two waterfalls in MNP is unique in the sense that, these are perennial and found in the drier part of MNP, which means they are coming from an underground rock aquifer which is able to hold water and release it gradually throughout the year. This is a critical life supporting system for the animals and plants in this part of the park and needs to be recognised as such. Polzen and Kparia waterfalls are found in a typical Guinea Savannah ecosystem, whilst Niokolo-Koba is located within a Sudanian Transitional Zone. We also wish to stress here that; Niokolo-Koba and Comoe National Parks, though, they have waterfalls were never inscribed under criterion (vii).</p> <p>The four (4) other waterfalls in Ghana which were referred to, are in forest areas with high rainfall and therefore should not be compared to the falls within MNP. We strongly believe that, popularity should not be equated to uniqueness. For the fact that Kparia and Polzen waterfalls are not on popular websites does not mean they are not unique. The uniqueness of Kparia and Polzen waterfall lies in the fact that, they contribute to the aesthetic beauty and diversity of the special geological formations exhibited by the nominated property. They also have enormous potential for ecotourism, though currently, they are not as popular as the others because of their inaccessibility and the yet to be developed tourism infrastructure. Furthermore, they are located within a protected area.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN notes that values under natural beauty and aesthetic values under criterion (vii) are not necessarily restricted to similar climatic and biological contexts. In that sense it is considered justified to compare the waterfalls with other scenically recognised waterfalls in Ghana.</p> <p>The fact that Niokolo-Koba and Comoe National Parks have waterfalls but are not inscribed under criterion (vii) is not justification for concluding that MNP meets criterion (vii).</p> <p>The tourism potential of the waterfalls is acknowledged however this is not the basis for assessing OUV.</p>
Page 21, column 2, line 17	As noted above there are also discrepancies in the data with some exaggerated claims made on the presence of species within the nominated property that brings into question some of the conclusions of the analysis.	<p>As mentioned earlier, there is no exaggeration.</p> <p>This statement is inappropriate since the dossier does not mention species that does not exist in Mole National Park.</p> <p>The indications of occurrence of various species were confirmed through scientific research by national and international scientists, field observations and sightings by the wildlife division staff and tourists.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of opinion</p> <p>See above comment on this issue.</p>
Page 21, column 2, line	The most valuable comparisons in the	The word ‘most’ was omitted.	Not a factual error

21	<p>dossier are between MNP and the existing Guinea savanna World Heritage properties of Niokolo-Koba (Senegal) and Comoe National Park (Cote d'Ivoire). However, some of the claims made for the nominated property are misleading: for example, in the comparison with Niokolo-Koba it is stated that MNP 'has all the key species in Niokolo',</p>	<p>The statement should read: 'has most of the key species in Niokolo'</p>	<p>Clarification</p> <p>IUCN appreciates this important clarification, however, confirms that the nomination dossier at page 88 states "Mole has all the keys species in Niokolo in addition to spotted hyaena, roan antelope, oribi, and 56 endemic butterfly species."</p>
Page 21, column 2, line 34	<p>Further, there is no evidence to support the claim that 'the vegetation and habitats in MNP are more varied and diversified than Niokolo, with its many endemic species. There are similar unsupported claims in respect of the comparisons with Comoe National Park.</p>	<p>We stand by the fact that this information is not an exaggeration but confirmed by documented evidence.</p> <p>Evidence can be found at: www.en.wikipedia.org/Niokolo-Koba National Park</p> <p>Niokolo-Koba National Park is Woodland Savannah and semi-arid Sudanese Forest.</p> <p>However, Mole National Park is within a typical Guinea Savannah with 8 broad vegetation types. Reference 'Parks and reserves of Ghana – Management Effectiveness Assessment of Protected Areas' IUCN 2010 Page 17: 'The Vegetation of Mole National Park' by Schmitt, K and Adu-Nsiah, M 1993):</p> <p>Also refer to: www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Comoe National Park for supported claims in respect of comparisons with Comoe National Park. Mole National Park has 742 plant species whilst Comoe has 620 plant species. Comoe National Park is mainly a transitional zone whilst Mole National Park is Guinea Savannah ecosystem.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>See above comments, and the evaluation report for discussion on this matter.</p>
Page 21, column 2, line 45	<p>This analysis notes however, that much of the data for MNP is outdated and all the values within MNP are found within other World Heritage sites, albeit a number are now on the World Heritage in Danger List.</p>	<p>Some of the recent research work can be found in:</p> <p>"Trend of Poaching in Mole National Park" Asare R, 2013 Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology, Department of wildlife and Ecotourism.</p> <p>"A Short Synthesis of Mammal Diversity in Mole National Park"</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p>

		<p>by <u>Francisco M. Angelici and Lorenzo Rossi, 2017 University Della Tuscia, Department of Environmental Sciences, Italy</u> .</p> <p>Copies attached for ease of reference</p>	
<p>Page 21, column 2, line 49</p>	<p>MNP is not found in any broad-scale global conservation priority areas and neither Mole, nor any of the biogeographical regions where it is found, have been mentioned as a gap on the World Heritage List. MNP does not overlap with any protected area with a high irreplaceability score.</p>	<p>Not true.</p> <p>It is worth noting that, MNP is an Important Birds Area (IBA), one of the Global Conservation strategies prescribed by BirdLife International. So far as MNP stands out as a well protected typical Guinea Savannah ecosystem as compared to Comoe and Niokolo-Koba National Parks.</p> <p>IUCN's statement implies that, no site in West Africa deserves to be inscribed. However, from IUCN's reference, W-Arly Pendjari Complex has been recommended for inscription. We do agree that this is a typical Sudanian ecosystem while MNP is a typical Guinea savannah ecosystem. Mole National Park therefore could equally fill the gap as a typical representative of a Guinea savannah ecosystem.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>See notes above on the nomenclature of vegetation types in West Africa, and the evaluation for discussion on this point. This point appears to acknowledge that Niokolo-Koba and Comoe are also Guinea Savannah ecosystems. As can be recognised by IUCN's past evaluations, IUCN considers the most exceptional sites, including sites in West Africa, are those that should be recommended for inscription.</p> <p>IUCN acknowledges that the site coincides with an IBA. IBAs are one of several types of Key Biodiversity Areas (KBA): there are c.12,000 IBAs worldwide, so whilst important context, IBA status is not a direct indicator of OUV.</p>
<p>Page 22, column 1, line 19</p>	<p>However, it appears to have an average level of biodiversity when compared to other world heritage sites found in savanna ecosystems in the same biome and so does not stand out as exceptional.</p>	<p>This is not correct.</p> <p>MNP is unique because it can boast of large aggregations of elephants, buffalos, kobs, hartebeest and roan antelopes than those endangered sites in the West African sub-region. These animals are easily viewed within short range.</p> <p>The average level of biodiversity, compared to other World Heritage Sites in the Savanna Ecosystem is significantly high. The number of each species may not always be high, but we are referring to several areas of high conservation value, endemic species and healthy assemblages of plants and animals for which Mole National Park is outstanding.</p> <p>Table 1 of page 22 of the evaluation report does not represent fairly the situation on the ground since it displays for Comoe and Selous records which are clearly two decades older than those of MNP. The census year for Mana Pools is even unknown.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN acknowledged the differences in census data however concluded it was still plausible to conclude that large mammal populations in MNP remain depleted. IUCN restates its view that levels of endemism in the property are not globally exceptional.</p> <p>Regarding elephant numbers, the ranking of MNP in West Africa is indeed of high regional conservation significance, but is not considered to be of OUV.</p> <p>Hooded Vulture is not referred to in the nomination.</p>

		<p>Since Comoe National Park (2003), Niokolo-Koba National Park (2007) and Selous Game Reserve (2014) have been on the List of World Heritage in Danger, they are therefore not good examples to emulate.</p> <p>MNP is one of the important IUCN designated elephant ranges. MNP ranks third in West Africa regarding elephant numbers (after the W-Arly-Pendjari Complex which has the largest population, followed by the Gourma Mali/Sahel Burkinabè, Nazinga-Sissili-Zabre-NE Ghana-Doungou Parc population). With elephant population declining in all Africa, MNP, with its extremely low incidence rate of elephant poaching, plays a critical role in the overall conservation efforts for the remnants of the West African elephant population. MNP also plays an important role by facilitating connectivity with the Nazinga Game Ranch and other forest blocks southwards thus providing a viable corridor to link the Bui National Park.</p> <p>MNP hosts other endangered species, among which, apart from those mentioned above. We wish to point out that, among the bird life, the Martial Eagle <i>Polemaetus bellicosus</i>, (VU) the Hooded Vulture <i>Necrosyrtes monachus</i> (CR) Critically endangered and the White – headed Vulture (<i>Trigonoceps occipitalis</i>) Critically endangered.</p> <p><u>Reference: Data from Massimiliano Di Vittorio – University of Palermo 2013-2014 with photographic evidence.</u></p>	
<p>Page 22, column 1, line 36</p>	<p>Based on the views of expert reviewers within IUCN networks with knowledge of the region, and additional research, there are serious doubts about the status of many of the claimed species. Lions are probably extinct, African or functionally extinct, African Wild Dog was last recorded in 1975 and Leopards are very rare.</p>	<p>This statement is incorrect.</p> <p>It is widely believed that, the Lion still occurs in Mole National Park but it has not been scientifically confirmed. Between the year 2013 and 2016, there have been few sightings of lions by researchers, rangers and tourists.</p> <p>The research by <u>Burton et al, 2010 and Henschel et al, 2014</u> indicating the absence of Lions of Mole has been disputed by the works of <u>Angelici et al, 2015 and 2017</u> respectively and several field staff observations.</p> <p><u>Reference: 1. Angelici, F. M.,</u></p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>See above re the conclusion regarding the functional status of large mammal populations in the nominated property.</p>

		<p><u>Mahama, A. & Rossi, L., 2015. The lion in Ghana: its historical and current status. <i>Animal Biodiversity and Conservation</i>, 38.2:151–162</u></p> <p><u>2. Angelici, F., Rossi, L., 2017 “A Short Synthesis of Mammal Diversity in Mole National Park, Ghana” University of Della Tuscia, Department of Environmental Sciences, Italy.</u></p> <p>Copies attached</p>	
Page 22, column 2, line 46	It is also noteworthy that a management effectiveness evaluation carried out with the support of IUCN in 2010 assessed the biological importance of several other protected areas in Ghana as higher than MNP.	<p>This is not a fair assessment.</p> <p>All the several other protected sites are dotted with peculiar and important biodiversity, but as Mole National Park is located in the Guinea Savannah there cannot be fair comparison as far as biological importance is concerned.</p> <p>Park management is a dynamic process, it is not static and it is not an event. Since the last assessment in 2009, management effectiveness has improved.</p> <p>The involvement of communities has contributed to improve the management effectiveness of the park through the establishment of CREMAs and PAMAUS.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN agrees that there have been important management efforts which have taken place to improve conservation in MNP. The findings in the IUCN 2010 report at page 48 indicate overall management effectiveness across 8 protected areas in Ghana.</p>
Page 23, column 1, line 8	Examples include repeated references to Lion (which are probably extinct or at least functionally extinct in the property), references to threatened bird species which do not occur in the property including three different figures for the total number of recorded bird species, and erroneous information about butterflies.	<p>This is incorrect, unfair and misleading.</p> <p>The accusation of repeated misleading figures runs through the whole IUCN evaluation report. This is creating a wrong impression for the reader.</p> <p>For further explanation on these issues raised refer to previous or earlier corrections which sought to cure or address these misleading statements.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>As stated above IUCN notes that the questions on the claims are an understandable consequence when using uncertain and variable data. IUCN stresses it is not intended to imply any “accusation”, but the discrepancies where the claims in the nomination are not supported by the available information are important to note.</p>
Page 23, column 1, line 16	MNP has many natural values that are extremely important for Ghana, and has an important regional conservation role, but the justification for Outstanding Universal Value in the dossier is lacking.	<p>This issue raised by IUCN is not fair.</p> <p>The property is the only link of the western wildlife corridor in this part of the world to the Nazinga National Park in Burkina Faso and Bui National Park in Ghana. The property’s importance in providing ecosystem services such as mitigating the impact of climate change, watershed functions and biodiversity conservation are of global significance. As such Mole National Park contributes to the diversity and the environmental sustainability of our planet and its</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies</p> <p>IUCN considers that the evaluation is consistent with normal practice in evaluating the requirements of OUV.</p>

		<p>inhabitants.</p> <p><u>THE PROPOSED STATEMENT OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE IN THE NOMINATION DOSSIER SHOULD NOW READ:</u></p> <p>“Mole National Park is the largest (457,700 ha) wildlife protected area in Ghana and is the most prestigious in terms of its facilities and attraction to visitors in Africa and the world at large. The lack of disturbance and the remoteness, the scenic beauty, and the considerable amount of wildlife make Mole National Park a prime area for tourism, recreation, education and research.</p> <p>Apart from flora and fauna there are other attractions such as ponds, caves, waterfalls, spring, slave and a pilgrim route, spectacular landforms and natural features.</p> <p>The Park is an outstanding example of a typical undisturbed Guinea Savannah Ecosystem. Mole National Park has the significant number of animal species of global conservation concern.</p> <p>The Mole Park forms part of the White Volta River Catchment and numerous rivers cross or originate in the Park to drain into the White Volta, contributing significantly to the volume of water of the Akosombo Dam, the largest man-made dam in the world, used for the generation of hydro electric power for the nation.</p> <p>Mole National Park is rich in biodiversity due to its unique and diverse habitat and is home to 742 vascular plant species, 94 mammal species, 344 bird species, 33 reptile species, 149 species of butterflies of and 9 amphibian species.</p> <p>The existence of rare species of mammals such as Yellow-backed Duiker and Black and white Colobus Monkeys which are typical forest species is very important. Efforts are being made to protect the riverine habitats in which these two species are found.</p> <p>Apart from the Rhinoceros, the Mole Park can also boast of four of the “African Big Five”.</p> <p>Leopards, Lions, Caracal and Hyenas are important large carnivores and as such constitute a major tourist attraction. Mole Park</p>	
--	--	--	--

		has a healthy population of many species of special conservation interest typical of Guinea Savannah notably, Buffon's kob, western hartebeest, roan, waterbuck, warthog, oribi and red-flanked duikers. The buffalo population is also of great scientific interest, indicating black and red colour sexual dimorphism and albinism. Other interesting species of bats and rodents are also found in the area”.	
Page 23, column 1, line 28	As noted above, the park has potential for a higher carrying capacity of some large mammal species which have either declined or disappeared.	The only large mammal that cannot be accounted for is the hunting dog. All other mammal species have been observed in normal field patrols. All the nocturnal species have been confirmed by our camera traps and their populations are thriving well. The most widely sighted carnivores are the leopards and hyenas particularly at night. As a result of improved park management, the numbers of animals regularly sighted are appreciating.	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier Issues concerning the viability of key large mammal populations is discussed above and in the evaluation report.
Page 23, column 2, line 12	This will be improved when the remaining zones surrounding the park are developed as CREMAs, and ideally when a corridor allowing the free and safe movement of elephants to the north of the Park into Burkina Faso is developed.	The establishment of the CREMAs are in process. North and North-West of Mole: These areas have been agreed with the communities under the Sustainable Lands and Water Management Project. Current coverage area is 3062.36 square kilometres. This area effectively covers the north western part of Mole. This initiative was concluded in the first quarter of 2017. The remaining area under consideration to ensure a complete buffer zone is 340 square kilometres. The peripheral area already covered by the buffer (CREMAs) is 90.48%.	Not a factual error Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies
Page 23, column 2, line 23	Boundaries are delineated on the ground by boundary ‘pillars’ largely installed in the 1970s. Although there is clear boundary delineation to excise two villages (Kananto and Kabampe) from the southern part of the property, there is still a potential conflict around natural resource utilization and land space because these villages are confined between the park and the forest reserve.	This is incorrect. First of all the IUCN report failed to indicate whether there was encroachment or not. It also failed to confirm that, just adjacent to the Kananto community there is a well established sub-range camp, with permanent Wildlife Division staff to patrol the area. The report also failed to indicate that both Kananto and Kabampe, given their peculiar situation benefit from a number of development projects aiming at enhancing household income through the development of small eco-business and sedentary farming.	Not a factual error Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies IUCN reports the potential for conflict and goes on to state that “The arrangement with these communities not to encroach and expand the village into the park needs to be closely managed and monitored.” IUCN views under section 4.4 Communities note the positive community

		<p>As part of good practice in natural resource management, adequate provision has been made for the two communities (Kananto and Kabampe) to collect non timber forest products from the nearby Kenikeni Forest Reserve which buffers MNP on the southern side. They are also provided with farmlands in the forest reserve and have access to additional farm areas through the Modified Taungya System whereby communities are given the opportunity to cultivate food crops while maintaining regenerating tree species.</p> <p>Many statements in this report display a limited knowledge of the area and of the reality on the ground.</p>	<p>collaboration practice taking place in and around MNP. IUCN's comments were informed directly by the comments made in meetings held during the evaluation mission.</p>
<p>Page 23, column 2, line 33</p>	<p>IUCN considers that the boundaries of the nominated property do not meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines</p>	<p>This statement is incorrect and unfair.</p> <p>The boundaries of the nominated property are intact and not disputed in any portion. It is also well maintained by the park management with the active involvement of the communities.</p> <p>MNP boundaries are very well demarcated and known. MNP is not encroached; it is not crossed by seasonal transhumance corridors. The population of the 33 fringe communities is only 40,000 and have an increasingly minimal impact on the park. Thanks to the on-going sustainable tourism and agricultural initiatives which started in 2007 under the Sustainable Land and Water Management Project supported by the World Bank.</p> <p>The property does not suffer from adverse effects of development and/or neglect. MNP therefore meets the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>IUCN's concerns regarding the boundaries primarily relate to the presence and conservation status of key species which raise doubts that the nominated property includes all elements necessary to express its Outstanding Universal Value as required by paragraph 88 of the Operational Guidelines.</p>
<p>Page 23, column 2, line 52</p>	<p>The property has a management plan which expired at the end of 2016.</p>	<p>It is worth noting that, during the time of the submission of the dossier and evaluation mission, the management plan was still up to date.</p> <p>The management plan which expired recently is currently under review according to normal practice.</p> <p>When finalised, the updated management plan will be approved for implementation. The recent expiry of the management plan is therefore not an issue because there is a process already in place to</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>The requirement is for a management plan to be in place.</p>

		update it.	
Page 24, column 1, line 26	The nomination dossier did not provide figures on annual operational budgets which are made available through the Ghanaian government; however, it noted significant support from various international projects.	<p>Though the annual operational budget was not included in the nomination dossier, the evaluators were given copies of government budgetary allocation for the management of the Park which is a confirmation of an equally significant funding from the Government of Ghana.</p> <p>Copies of the annual budget attached for your information.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p>
Page 24, column 1, line 30	Although financial assistance in the form of a budget is guaranteed from the government, the current budget is noted in the nomination to be insufficient for the property's critical operations.	<p>In addition to the regular Government of Ghana subvention which is inadequate, there are other donor funds that support the park's operation. We therefore state here that, government subvention and donor funds prudently managed are sufficient for the management of the Park.</p> <p>Annual Budget for 2016 as per attached for your information.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of opinion</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p>
Page 24, column 1, line 44	Due to concerns about budgeting and the need to update the management plan, IUCN considers the management of the nominated property does not fully meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.	<p>Insufficient funds do not mean a site is not managed at all. There is a level of proper management.</p> <p>Management planning is a process since arrangements have already been put in place. IUCN's concerns are therefore unfair.</p> <p>Even though the existing management plan is being reviewed, some of the activities are still relevant and being implemented.</p> <p>We therefore state categorically that, MNP fully meets the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Difference of opinion</p> <p>IUCN does not imply there is no management taking place, but the concerns are about the adequacy of funding.</p>
Page 24, column 2, line 8	These communities are still allowed to come to the park to sustainably harvest plant resources for household use and to perform rituals.	<p>Communities are allowed with guided services to collect specific resources such as thatch roofing material and also to perform rituals.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p> <p>The amend is precision.</p>
Page 24, column 2, line 24	Local community have been trained on strategies to prevent human-wildlife conflict but this has not yet been implemented owing to resource constraints from the community members to purchase deterrents.	<p>This initiative has been implemented and adopted in some communities. However, it is an ongoing process and eventually other communities will benefit.</p> <p>As part of current management practice, the park staff are deployed to carry out patrols in community farm land areas and do loud-sound canister blasting to deter stray</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p>

		animals.	
Page 24, column 2, line 45	Bush meat trade is a national issue/challenge which is beyond the control of a site manager.	Not true. The bush meat trade is effected off-reserve by both licensed hunters and traders and monitored by Wildlife Division. Bush meat traders are issued with licences to trade in bush meat acquired from licensed hunters. Therefore, there is no evidence to prove that, the bush meat trade is a threat to MNP since hunting is prohibited in the park.	Not a factual error Difference of opinion
Page 24, column 2, line 58	It is reported that most of the park is burnt in most years, especially in the north, and in fact the park is burnt frequently than surrounding areas.	It is not true that the entire park is burnt every year. Burning is a management practice, whereby only earmarked zones are burnt as part of wildlife habitat management strategy.	Not a factual error Clarification IUCN notes that the MNP Management Plan states that “Aerial surveys and ground coverage have shown that most of the park is burnt most years, especially in the north. Indeed, the park is burnt much more than the surrounding lands.” IUCN’s report does not state that the entire park is burnt every year.
Page 24, column 2, line 61	The field mission assessed that current fire application is more reactive than proactive and there is an urgent need to develop a more appropriate fire management strategy with clear protocols and long term monitoring programme to analyse trends and impacts on biodiversity.	The issue of frequent fire everywhere is not correct. According to the ongoing university research titled “ <u>Anthropogenic Fires on Savannah Ecosystem: The Case of Mole National Park</u> ” has confirmed that as a result of implementation of an effective fire management plan, there are now extensive areas where grass cover has been eliminated and the woody vegetation is recovering rapidly. The park has a burning policy in place with clearly outlined burning regimes. There are various university research programmes that monitor the impact of the park’s fire management regime.	Not a factual error Clarification New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage See point above regarding the information provided in the site’s management plan.
Page 25, column 1, line 6	Small parts of the property are infested invasive alien species, and some of the alien species such as Teak have been used to delineate the park boundary but they are now spreading inside the park.	The spread is negligible and the space occupied is very insignificant and limited only to the main gate. There is also an ongoing programme in place to eliminate all alien species.	Not a factual error Clarification The text copied from the IUCN report is mistyped, but there is no error within it.
Page 25, column 1, line 54	IUCN considers that the integrity, protection and management do not meet the requirements of the	This is incorrect. The integrity of MNP meets the requirements of the Operational	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the

	Operational Guidelines.	<p>Guidelines. The boundary integrity is intact. MNP has a properly delineated zone of exclusion. It functions as a holistic unit where the elements and features are intact. It is of adequate size with its boundaries well demarcated.</p> <p>IUCN has earlier on page 23, column 1, last paragraph, line 53 mentioned that, <u>“IUCN considers that the protection status of the nominated property meet the requirements of the Operational Guidelines”</u>. So this contradiction needs to be corrected. We wish to emphasize that, the Management of Mole National Park meets the requirements of the Operational Guidelines.</p>	<p>nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN conclusions quoted under protection are consistent as this relates to the legal protection status of the nominated property as opposed to the overall conclusions on integrity and management.</p>
Page 25, column 2, line 30	Features such as the Konkori Escarpment, the two moderate size (10-20m high) waterfalls of Kparia and Polzen, and the Murugu spring, whilst unquestionably beautiful at the national level, are not exceptional in the region, nor superlative at the global level	<p>This statement is not true.</p> <p>Even though we agree that there are other waterfalls in other sites around the world; we confidently state that, Polzen and Kparia waterfalls are exceptional because they are the only falls found in a typical Guinea Savannah Zone.</p> <p>The others in the sub-region are found in transitional zones and rain forest areas.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>There arguments have been considered in the evaluation.</p>
Page 25, column 2, line 36	IUCN considers that the nominated property does not meet this criterion	<p>The nominated property meets this criterion (vii).</p> <p>For the fact that, there is no other representative site in the typical Guinea Savannah Zone that justifies this criterion, what Mole National Park possesses make it outstanding.</p> <p>Note that, all features within MNP are exceptional in this regard.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>IUCN does not agree that the fact there is no other site in the Guinea Savannah Zone listed under criterion (vii) justifies inscribing MNP under this criterion. The comment is a misunderstanding of the basis for determining OUV.</p>
Page 25, column 2, line 58	Mole National Park is put forward in the nomination as an outstanding example of ecological processes occurring in the Guinea savannah ecosystem, but in comparison with other areas, the processes of seasonal changes affecting the plant and animal populations are neither unique nor especially remarkable. The loss of viable populations of top predators such as Lion and the African Wild Dog	<p>Recent research works (A Short Synthesis of Mammal Diversity in Mole National Park, Ghana Francesco M. Angelici and Lorenzo Rossi, 2017 University of Della Tuscia, Department of Environmental Sciences, Italy) disprove the extinction of the Lion at Mole National Park. Park management has documented recent evidence of the presence of the Lion as reported by patrol staff, researchers, local communities and tourists.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>New information that cannot be taken into account at this stage</p> <p>Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies</p> <p>See points made above</p>

	in the region, the increase in numbers of Hyena and many questions on the population trends of large mammal populations (of which some may be declining) significantly weaken the nominated property's capacity to support outstanding ecological processes.		
Page 26, column 1, line 1	IUCN considers that the nominated property does not meet this criterion.	Further to our explanations above, and since these other areas being compared are not typical Guinea Savannah as MNP, we reiterate that, Mole National Park meets criterion (ix).	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier See comments above. IUCN remains of the view that the nominated property does not meet criterion (ix).
Page 26, column 1, line 14	For mammals, the elephant population is clearly important, but data is lacking as the last census took place in 2006, and other areas host much larger elephant populations.	Mole National Park ranks third in West Africa regarding elephant numbers. With elephant population declining in all Africa, MNP provides a critical habitat for one of the remnants of the West African elephant population.	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier The statement offered reinforces, in IUCN's view, the clear regional significance of MNP. IUCN remains of the view that the nominated property does not meet criterion (x).
Page 26, column 1, line 22	The nomination property does not display particularly high levels of endemism among plants and animals as is the case generally for this biome.	Endemism is generally low in the African sub-region. The little that exists can be found in MNP. Mole National Park has plant species of high conservation values. The distribution of some of the endemic species are localised within the park and hence makes the park to harbour several places of high conservation value and therefore merits the status of World Heritage Site. <u>Reference: IUCN Parks and Reserves of Ghana, 2010, page 17.</u>	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier See points raised above
Page 26, column 1, line 19	Furthermore, MNP does not correspond to any global biodiversity priority areas, has not been identified as filling a gap on the World Heritage List, and is not a protected area with high irreplaceability in terms of threatened species.	Even though MNP might not have been identified as filling a gap on the World Heritage List, it is a protected area with high irreplaceability in terms of threatened species as compared to Comoe National Park, Niokolo-Koba National Park and Selous Game Reserve which have been on the List of World Heritage in Danger. MNP is also a protected area of high conservation value: endemic plant species, butterfly, viable elephant population thriving well	Not a factual error Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier IUCN's findings are based on the standard comparative analysis metrics that all natural nominations related to biodiversity are subject to.

		and four of the “African Big Five” together with the common hippopotamus.	
Page 26, column 1, line 24	IUCN considers that the nominated property does not meet this criterion.	Based on the explanation stated above we strongly disagree with IUCN’s statement. We are therefore of the strong view that the information provided meets criterion (x) of the requirement in the Operational Guidelines.	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>See points discussed above. IUCN considers the nominated property does not meet criterion (x) for the reasons discussed in the evaluation report.</p>

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Mongolie / Fédération de Russie

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Paysages de la Dauria

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
P.11, Left column, 2nd paragraph from bottom, line 7 from end	Mongol Daguur Special Protected Area	Mongol Daguur Strictly Protected Area Official name of this PA is Mongol Daguur Strictly Protected Area	Factual error The nomination contains several references to special protected areas and the references to the Mongolian Law on Special Protected Areas.
P.11, Left column, 2nd paragraph from bottom, line 6 from end	Most of this property is then surrounded by a World Heritage buffer zone of 307,317 ha, which overlaps with Ramsar sites and UNESCO Biosphere Reserves in both countries (Mongol Daguur in Mongolia and Torrey Lakes in the Russian Federation).	Most of this property is surrounded by a World Heritage buffer zone of 307,317 ha, which overlaps in both countries with Ramsar sites (Mongol Daguur in Mongolia and Torrey Lakes in the Russian Federation) and UNESCO Biosphere Reserves (Mongol Daguur Biosphere Reserve in Mongolia and Daursky Biosphere Reserve in Russian Federation). Specification of the official names of Ramsar sites and Biosphere Reserves.	Not a factual error Clarification This provides more detail but not a correction.
P.11, Left column, 1nd paragraph bottom, line 6 from bottom	The property provides key habitats for rare fauna species such as the White-naped Crane, the Great Bustard and millions of other vulnerable, endangered or threatened species of migratory birds . The property is also an important area on the migration route of the Mongolian Gazelle (Dzeren) and the only place where this species is known to breed in the	The property provides key habitats for rare fauna species such as White-naped Crane, Great Bustard and millions migratory birds of other species, including vulnerable, endangered or threatened . The property is also an important area of the migration routes of the Mongolian Gazelle (Dzeren) and the major known place where this species breed in the Russian Federation in present time . The property also provides sanctuary to endangered Mongolian Marmots (Tarbagan) , as well as to the near-threatened Pallas Cat. Correction of formulation, especially:	Factual error and clarifications The sentence has indeed missed precision in final edits. IUCN considers the following would be accurate: “The property provides key habitats for rare fauna species such as White-naped Crane, Great Bustard and millions of migratory birds of other species, including vulnerable, endangered or threatened species . The property is also an important area of the migration routes of the

	Russian Federation. The property also provides sanctuary to both endangered Tabargan and Mongolian Marmots , as well as to the near-threatened Pallas Cat.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - not millions of endangered or threatened species, but millions individuals of birds; - now the second place of Dzeren breeding (above 50-150 females every year) locates near Kyra village in Zabaykalsky kray; - Tarbagan and Mongolian Marmot are different names of the one species. 	Mongolian Gazelle (Dzeren) and the major known place where this species breeds in the Russian Federation at the present time . The property also provides sanctuary to endangered Mongolian Marmots (Tarbagan) , as well as to the near-threatened Pallas Cat.”
P.11, Right column, Criterion (x), 4 line from end of paragraph	The property also provides critical summer grounds and autumn migration routes of the emblematic Mongolian Gazelle.	<p>The property also provides critical winter grounds and seasonal transboundary migration routes of the emblematic Mongolian Gazelle.</p> <p>Correction of formulation according to the maintenance of the nomination and real situation. In summer on this territories present above 10,000 dzerens, but wintering up to 100,000 - 150,000 individuals every year.</p>	Clarification IUCN accepts this as a clarification. The submitted documentation following the referral of the property states “Thousands of herds of Mongolian gazelle migrate through this area in autumn and spring. The northeast and southeast parts of the (Ugtam) NR are used by Mongolian gazelles for rutting in winter and for giving birth in summer.”

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Mexique

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Vallée de Tehuacán-Cuicatalán : habitat originel de Mésio-Amérique

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : UICN

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 92 First column Line 8	The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica (TCV) is nominated as a mixed site and cultural landscape with a serial configuration of three component parts.	The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica (TCV) is nominated as a mixed site with a serial configuration of three component parts.	Not a factual error WHC/16/40.COM/INF.8B3, as noted by the World Heritage Committee, lists the nomination as a Cultural Landscape.
Page 92 First column Line 21	The nominated property has a complicated alignment with the UNESCO Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve (TCBR), designated in 2012. The nominated area is entirely within the TCBR:	The nominated property is completely included within the boundaries of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve (TCBR), which was designated by the Mexican federal government as a NPA under the category of biosphere reserve since 1998. (Misinterpretation, Refer to pages 8 and 12 of the Nomination Dossier)	Not a factual error Clarification Re-iterates arguments/ justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered by the Advisory Bodies The issue is that it is not clear how the nominated areas align with the core zones within the biosphere reserve and if all the elements necessary to express OUV are included.
Page 92 First column Line 24the later has defined core zones as well as a buffer and larger transition zone totalling more than 814,000 ha. The combined area of the nominated property (145,255.20 ha) plus the World Heritage buffer zone (344,931.68 ha) equals the total area of the TCBR core zones.the TCBR has defined core zones as well as a buffer zone. The combined area of the nominated property (145,255.20 ha) plus the World Heritage buffer zone (344,931.68 ha) equals the total area of the TCBR (NPA) of 490,186.88 ha (Missinterpretation, Refer to page 8 of the Nomination Dossier).	Clarification IUCN's information on the TCBR was sourced from the UNESCO MAB website which indicates the TCBR also has a transition zone: Declaration Date: 2012 Administrative authorities: Comisión Nacional de Areas Naturales Protegidas

			<p>Surface Area: 490,186.875 ha Core area: 141,781.711 ha Buffer zone: 348,405.161 ha Transition area: 324,045.46 ha</p> <p>UNESCO may wish to comment if this information is not correct.</p>
<p>Page 92 First column Line 38</p>	<p>The property is also nominated as a cultural landscape and IUCN notes that the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley as a whole possesses cultural values that are manifested through multiple archaeological remains found in the area.</p>	<p>The property is nominated as a mixed site and IUCN notes that the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley as a whole possesses cultural values that are manifested through multiple archaeological remains found in the area.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>See comment above, the site was registered as a cultural landscape nomination.</p>
<p>Page 97 Second column Line 12</p>	<p>The good interinstitutional coordination of CONANP (protected areas) and INAH (anthropology and archaeology) has only started recently in the context of the nomination process and preparation of the dossier.</p>	<p>The good interinstitutional coordination of CONANP (protected areas) and INAH (anthropology and archaeology) has many years of joint work, including the TCBR.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>New information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure</p> <p>This was the conclusion based on the field evaluation. Does not materially alter the evaluation findings commending the efforts to better integrate natural and cultural values management.</p>
<p>Page 97 Second column Line 18</p>	<p>....an important opportunity bought about by this nomination and are committed to use this site as a first case of integrated management of a mixed World Heritage site in Mexico</p>	<p>....an important opportunity bought about by this nomination and are committed to use this site as another case of integrated management of a mixed World Heritage site in Mexico, in compliance with the Global Strategy.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Clarification</p>
<p>Page 97 Second column Line 33</p>	<p>The property has been nominated as both a mixed site and a cultural landscape.</p>	<p>The property has been nominated as a mixed site.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>See comments above.</p>
<p>Page 98 First column Line 40</p>	<p>Potential to meet this criterion, subject to further reflection on the mixed site approach and confirmation that the key natural values are within the boundaries of the nominated area.</p>	<p>Potential to meet this criterion, confirming that the key natural values are within the boundaries of the nominated area.</p>	<p>Not a factual error</p> <p>Advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier</p> <p>The issue regarding clarification of values remains.</p>

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Mexique

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Vallée de Tehuacán-Cuicatlán : habitat originel de Méso-Amérique

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Pp. 21 Left column Lines 31-33	"In terms of categories of cultural property set out in Article I of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a serial nomination of 3 sites. "	"In terms of categories of cultural property set out in Article I of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a serial nomination of 3 components or zones. "	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
Pp. 22 Left column Lines 1-3	"... This appears to show that research on cultural aspects lags behind that on natural aspects, to the point where the nomination for cultural criteria may be somewhat premature. "	"... Research on cultural aspects is a permanent task, as well as in natural aspects." The Dossier (p.216) refers to the need to continue with the archaeological studies that started back in the 1960's by both international and national research institutions. The management plan calls for more research to reinforce the knowledge that is already available on the themes.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
Pp. 22 Right column Lines 20-26	"... Cueva de las Manitas, in the component site of Zapotitlán-Cuicatlán, (1200-1550 AD) is another rock shelter, where cave art displays several motifs related to humans and animals, such as footprint and handprint (from which it derived its name), and a human-like figure in the shape of a tree (named "tree of life")."	"... Cueva de las Manitas, in the component site of Zapotitlán-Cuicatlán, (1200-1550 AD) had a long occupation period, from Prehistory up to Pre-Hispanic era. The cave is one of the most important findings of its type in Mesoamerica. " (See pp.112 of the Dossier)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Pp. 24 Left column Lines 31-36	"ICOMOS notes that the comparative analysis is quite compartmentalised, without comparisons put forward for	"The comparative analysis is of a mixed property and since no other site worldwide contains both the same	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.

	<p>the overall landscape, and the text mainly references water management and archaeological sites, which are compared separately. Moreover, the comparisons made mainly relate to inscribed properties.”</p>	<p>natural and cultural attributes, the natural and the cultural comparative analysis were made separately. The analysis has a section specifically for the comparison within the Mesoamerican cultural region, to which the nominated property belongs (see Chapter 3.2 of the Nomination Dossier, pp. 172-177). It includes the most relevant Pre-Hispanic water management systems together with foundational sites of Mesoamerica. The majority of these sites are not inscribed properties.”</p>	
<p>Pp. 24 Right column Lines 34-37</p>	<p>“What does not quite emerge from these comparisons is how the differences outlined between the water system of the nominated property and other sites can be translated into an exceptional system.”</p>	<p>“What does emerge from these comparisons is how the differences outlined between the water system of the nominated property and other sites in the region, translates as the first and most representative water management system that has been discovered for the Mesoamerican region.”</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments/justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.</p>
<p>Pp. 24 Right column Lines 38-49</p>	<p>“ICOMOS considers that the property is not characterized by its monumental heritage. Most of its remains are archaeological and none of them can really compete with sites inscribed for their above-ground remains. Comparisons with Xochicalco, 650-900 AD, (Archaeological Monuments zone of Xochicalco, Mexico, 1999, criteria (iii), and (iv)), El Tajín, 800-1200 AD (Mexico, 1992, criteria (iii) and (iv)), let alone the most famous landmarks like Chichen-Itza, 415 BC-35 AD (1988, criteria (i), (ii) and (iii)), Teotihuacan, 1st-6th centuries AD (Mexico, 1987, criteria (i), (ii), (iii), (iv) and (vi)) or Uxmal, 700-1000 AD (Mexico, 1996, criteria (i), (ii) and (iii)) are not relevant.”</p>	<p>“The property is not being nominated for its monumental heritage and therefore the analysis does not include comparisons with Mesoamerican sites inscribed for their archaeological above-ground remains.</p> <p>On the contrary, the analysis emphasizes the unique long chronological sequence of human adaptations and developments which allow a profound and detailed study of the evolution of humanity in the Mesoamerican region as per the HEADS programme of UNESCO. Moreover, it further enriches the World Heritage List in regional, chronological, geographic and thematic terms according to the ICOMOS study “Filling the Gaps – an Action Plan for the Future” (2005).”</p> <p>(For example, in the Dossier’s pp. 173-74 there is the Comparison chart of Irrigation sites.</p> <p>In pp. 174. First paragraph says “..the hydraulic</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.</p>

		<p>systems of Teopantecuanitlan, Copalillo, Guerrero and that of Xoxocotlán, Monte Albán, Oaxaca, are the ones that more resemble the hydraulic system of Tehuacán-Cuicatlán due to their antiquity and diversity”.</p> <p>Pp. 175 reads “..other sites from Mexico that have been previously inscribed on the World Heritage List and comparable to the current nomination are the following, Xochimilco, an the Prehistoric Caves of Yagul and Mitla in the Central Valley of Oaxaca. This is to say, monumentality is not a factor considered in this Dossier.)</p>	
Pp. 24 Right column Lines 50-56	“The fragile relics of plant domestication that reflect early cultivation and the process of sedentarisation in the valley are not compared with other sites....particularly in relation to the Central Valley of Oaxaca, inscribed in 2010... ”	“The fragile relics of plant domestication that reflect early cultivation and the process of sedentarisation in the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán valley are compared with other sites....particularly in relation to the Prehistoric Caves of Yagul and Mitla in the Central Valley of Oaxaca, inscribed in 2010... ” (See pp. 177 of the Nomination Dossier)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. The text in the nomination dossier does not compare evidence in both sites for plant domestication.
Pp. 25 Left column Lines 2-8	“...it is still not clear what differentiates early plant domestication in Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley from a diachronic point of view, with that in the Oaxaca Valley, since both areas were modified by human action, which transformed them into man-made landscapes where plant domestication took place during a more or less long process.”	“ The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán relics of plant domestication and the many other aspects constitute an evolving system that allows to learn how that evolution took place. ” (Evidence of that was provided in the Nomination Dossier and in the Additional Information)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion on evidence that might differentiate the two properties.
Pp. 25 Left column Lines 17-20	“Overall, the comparative analysis has not demonstrated how the property as a whole, for the combination of aspects for which it is nominated, could be said to be exceptional and to have no comparators.”	“ The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley is an invaluable and irreplaceable heritage of humanity. Adaptation and creativity based on technological advances had a multiplying effect that fostered the discovery of other innovations which were essential to the organization and complexity of the first civilizations. ”	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion in terms of justification for the value proposed.

		(See p. 10 of the Nomination Dossier)	
Pp. 26 Left column Lines 43-46	“ICOMOS considers that the authenticity of the whole series has not been demonstrated, and that the authenticity of the individual archaeological sites appears satisfactory. ”	“ The authenticity of the individual archaeological sites are satisfactory, therefore authenticity of the whole series has been demonstrated ” (← Contradictory statement)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. Authenticity of the whole property relates to how well the whole property as a series might convey the proposed OUV.
Pp. 26 Right column Lines 26-29	“ICOMOS considers that the Otomanguean linguistic tradition is certainly an interesting phenomenon , and linked to the linguistic fragmentation and diversity in Mesoamerica...”	“ Otomanguean Linguistic tradition is one of the most solid traditions that still continues in Mesoamerica, it is a living example of the sophistication reached by these cultures. ”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Pp. 26 Right column Lines 38-41	“...While the Otomanguean linguistic tradition may be considered as one aspect of the civilization that developed in the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, it cannot be said to define the specific place. ”	“...The Otomanguean linguistic tradition may be considered as one aspect of the civilization that developed in the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, and defines the cultural profile of the region. ” (See the vast bibliography provided in the Nomination Dossier)	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion in relation to how the property might be defined.
Pp. 27 Left column Lines 23-29	“... ICOMOS considers that water management sites (wells, dams, canals, fields for rain-fed agriculture, fields for flood irrigation, fields on terraces, rock aqueducts, filtration galleries, large square water catchment wells, most of them dating back to between 800-700 BC) are potentially the strongest point of this nomination. ”	“... Water management sites (wells, dams, canals, fields for rain-fed agriculture, fields for flood irrigation, fields on terraces, rock aqueducts, filtration galleries, large square water catchment wells, most of them dating back to between 800-700 BC) are among the most important strengths of this nomination, however, they have to be considered not as isolated constructions, but as components of a particular way of life that characterise the property. ”	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification as water management systems need be understood in relation to their historical, social, and economic context
Pp. 28 Left column Lines 7-8	“... Many of the archaeological sites have been affected by erosion, weathering, and wind and water runoff. ”	“... Many of the archaeological sites have been affected by erosion, weathering, and wind and water runoff, however, mitigation projects are considered in the Conservation aspect of the Management Plan. ” (ICOMOS Evaluation Report, p. 30. Right column, Lines 31-38) (There are no archaeological	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification. The evaluation considers not only natural erosion but also other aspects of conservation of the archaeological sites.

		sites in the world that have not been affected by the elements)	
Pp. 32 Left column Lines 1-3	“ a) Consider a revised nomination, as a cultural landscape focusing on the development of irrigated culture.”	<p>“The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica (TCV) is nominated as a mixed site with a serial configuration of three component parts.”</p> <p>(The proposed consideration as a cultural landscape, would mean to conceive the property in a very narrow perspective. This idea was already preconceived by the Advisory Bodies experts for the Evaluation Mission; they suggested this opinion since the beginning of their mission, even before having visited the property.)</p>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Afrique du Sud

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Paysage culturel des #Khomani

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
P59,C1,L9-12	<p>No San population resides within the nominated property; however a portion of the southern edge of the KGNP has been set aside for use by the #Khomani San people, to practice and rejuvenate aspects of their culture</p>	<p>Only San community members who work within the nominated property reside there; however a portion of the southern edge of the KGNP has been transferred to and is now owned by the #Khomani San, who, along with extensive rights elsewhere in the property, use it to practice and rejuvenate aspects of their culture</p> <p><i>Many #Khomani San community members work in the Transfrontier Park and the community has full ownership title to the southern area mentioned and varied rights elsewhere.</i></p> <p><i>The #Khomani San have rights of access to the rest of the park where attributes that bear witness to their association with the landscape are located. These attributes include pans, graves, sacred trees and wells.</i></p>	<p>The Nomination dossier states the following (P.42): There are not permanent inhabitants in the Nominated Property, only SANParks personnel and tourist visiting the National Park.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this as a clarification</p>
P59,C1,L28-31	<p>The State Party has submitted a large amount of information but this largely deals with the land-claim activity and only limitedly responds to the ICOMOS requests.</p>	<p>The State Party has submitted a large amount of information as Appendix 3 of the Nomination Dossier which maps the cultural landscape of the #Khomani San including sites and land use over wide areas. (This was resubmitted subsequently and more fully explained in response to issues raised by ICOMOS.) The information consists of over 30 maps and five information sheets, being the product a cultural mapping process undertaken as part of the research to substantiate the communal land claim.</p> <p>Annexures 2a and b contain at least 12 hours of video material from a variety of sources being mainly interviews with</p>	<p>This documentation was assessed and this triggered the additional information request.</p> <p>The response by the State Party was assessed by ICOMOS and findings expressed in the evaluation. The maps mainly cover boundary delineation and land use in the plans.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		community members and interactions between older and younger members illustrating cultural transmission.	This is not information, rather raw data.
	Around 2000 years ago Khoekhoen herders are said to have migrated into southern Africa and to have progressively assimilated and supplanted the Xam.	Around 2000 years ago Khoekhoen herders migrated into southern Africa and progressively assimilated and supplanted the San . <i>This is now substantially proven through very recent DNA based research, involving amongst others the #Khomani San, references for which was submitted to ICOMOS in October 2016, ie: Uren C, Kim M, Martin AR, Bobo D, Gignoux CR, van Helden PD, Möller M, Hoal EG, & Henn BM (Sep 2016) Fine-Scale Human Population Structure in Southern Africa Reflects Ecogeographic Boundaries, <u>Genetics</u>, Vol. 204, 303–314.</i> <i>Furthermore, it is very clearly stated in this paper that those displaced were the San in general and not the Xam specifically. The Xam are only one of many San cultures.</i>	ICOMOS drew the information from the nomination dossier. The nomination dossier at p. 14 states: "...Some 2000 years ago, Khoekhoen (hereafter Khoe) herders migrated into southern Africa. They expanded up the southern and south-western coast, coexisting, assimilating and supplanting the Xam "
P59,C1,L33-36	Until relatively recently the nominated cultural landscape was the domain of hunter-gatherers belonging to the linguistic group of the Xam, which is said to have emerged around 20,000 years ago.	Until relatively recently the nominated cultural landscape was the domain of hunter-gatherers belonging to the linguistic group of the Ui-Taa Family of languages , which is said to have emerged around 20,000 years ago. <i>See Section 2.b p13 of the Nomination Dossier. The Xam had a separate cultural identity, but with a language that also belonged to the Ui-Taa language family. These issues were also more fully explained and maps provided as part of supplementary information requested in October 2016.</i>	The nomination dossier states at p. 13: "San" is a linguistic term, which refers to a group of related languages. ICOMOS acknowledges this as a clarification.
P59,C1,L3-6	The creation of the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP) in 1931 led to the relocation of indigenous and Baster families (a group descended from European settlers and African women) elsewhere	The creation of the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP) in 1931 led to the relocation of indigenous and Baster families (communities descended from both European settlers and indigenous people) elsewhere <i>The Basters are descended from both male and female settlers and on the one hand and on the other from male and female indigenous KhoeKhoen and San. The dossier does not state that they are only descended from African women.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
P60,C2,L16-20	The additional information provided in November 2016 by the State Party on linguistic groups inhabiting the wider region attest that San linguistic groups and the related speaking peoples are spread well outside South Africa, in Namibia and in Botswana.	The additional information provided in November 2016 by the State Party on linguistic groups inhabiting the wider region attest that San linguistic groups and the related speaking peoples were in the past spread well outside South Africa, in Namibia and in Botswana. <i>The various San peoples are now a small minority interspersed between other peoples. Many of the San communities of the past are now also extinct, eg: the Xam.</i>	The additional information sent in Nov 2016 contains a map (map 2 – p.8) indicating that contemporary San linguistic families, e.g. the same !XO family, are spread in Northern South Africa (particularly the nominated property), in Botswana and Namibia.
P60,C2,L21-24	Therefore, ICOMOS considers	Therefore, ICOMOS considers that	

	that several groups survive that belong to San-related people in South Africa, Namibia and Botswana and they also have left traces on landscapes in the same region:	several groups survive that belong to the San of South Africa, Namibia and Botswana and they also have left traces on landscapes in the same region: <i>'San-related' does not reflect accurately the status and connection of San groups. The people discussed are not partially, but fully San, The Nomination Dossier uses the term 'related San' and the meaning and intention of this term is substantially changed by transposing the two words.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
P60,C2,L41-44	ICOMOS notes that the dossier itself recognises that the original landscape of the #Khomani and other San-related people is much larger than the one being nominated.	ICOMOS notes that the dossier itself recognises that the original landscape of the #Khomani and related San people is much larger than the one being nominated. <i>'San-related' does not reflect accurately the status and connection of San groups. The people discussed are not partially, but fully San, The Nomination Dossier uses the term 'related San' and the meaning and intention of this term is substantially changed by transposing the two words.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
P60,C2,L47-49	The historical landscape of the #Khomani San is known to extend into much of the Northern Cape, southern Namibia and western Botswana.	While noting that the property is nominated as a living cultural landscape , the historical landscape of the #Khomani San is known to have extended into much of the Northern Cape, southern Namibia and western Botswana. <i>This nomination is of an associative living landscape, eg: it is specifically nominated under Criterion vi being 'directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs'. Furthermore the term 'living is repeatedly used throughout the nomination dossier, particularly in the section on Justification of OUV.</i> <i>Since there are no known #Khomani San in the other countries mentioned there is no way of knowing what might have comprised their cultural landscape in those places in the past. It is not denied that the cultural landscape did previously extend beyond current political boundaries, but the remaining #Khomani San only know the area within South Africa as the colonial frontiers that separated them from those who may have lived in Namibia and Botswana many generations ago. (For discussion of the fact that there are no known #Khomani San outside of South Africa see comments on P61,C2,L1-5)</i>	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
P61,C1,L1-8	Elements expressing the values are included in the core area; however, stronger living traditions and elements representing the #Khomani way of life can be found in their	Elements expressing the values are included in the core area; however, living traditions and elements also representing the #Khomani way of life can be found in their communities, located approximately 72km from the nominated property. In	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

	<p>communities, located approximately 72km from the nominated property. In Askam and the nearby reclaimed farms, the #Khomani San have places of memory and burial grounds, and practice various aspects of their culture.</p>	<p>Askam and the nearby reclaimed farms, the #Khomani San have a few places of memory and burial grounds, and practice various aspects of their culture.</p> <p><i>The nominated property includes the vast majority of places identified in cultural mapping exercises, it is hence an error to state that there are 'stronger' traditions outside of the property. This statement reflects an understandable lack of understanding of how the land claims system in South Africa works. Land outside of the property was given to the #Khomani San as compensation for the fact that they could not be given full ownership rights over the whole of the nominated property which is what they had claimed. If associations with sites outside the nominated property had been stronger the land claim would surely have included a much wider area than the nominated property. This fact should amply demonstrate what the #Khomani San community itself regards as most important. The State Party firmly believes that the elements/ attributes found in the nominated area including pans, sacred trees, wells and graves are representative enough to demonstrate the authenticity, integrity and justification of outstanding universal value.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p>
<p>P61,C2,L1-5</p>	<p>Additionally, the fact that #Khomani San groups can be found in Botswana and Namibia and that their historic landscape was much wider than what is currently being nominated, does not support the arguments proposed in the nomination dossier.</p>	<p><i>Delete entirely. This is not a fact. There are no known #Khomani San living in either Namibia or Botswana. The Nomination dossier states very clearly that the San known to live on the Botswana side are !Kung (p16) and Naron (p37). Nowhere does it mention #Khomani San presently living in Namibia. It does postulate that 'there may be families in southern Botswana' (p17 & 38). However, none have ever been found and if they exist could only be in small, dispersed family units. It seems also that ICOMOS has made an understandable misreading of the second sentence of paragraph 2 of p25 due to a typographical error. The word 'currently' should have been preceded by a comma as the clause of which it is part is intended only to apply to the !Kung and was not intended to imply that there are #Khomani known to be living in Botswana.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification of the text of the nomination dossier.</p>

P61,C2,L32-36	<p>Firstly, looking at contemporary San communities as remnants of a Pleistocene people is seriously flawed. It negates social, cultural and environmental changes. There is ample archaeological, historical and ethnographic evidence for cultural dynamics over thousands of years.</p>	<p>Firstly, looking at contemporary San communities as remnants of a Pleistocene people is debatable depending upon the theoretical approach taken to issues of cultural dynamism relative to cultural continuity. Some opinions are that it negates social, cultural and environmental changes. There is ample archaeological, historical and ethnographic evidence for cultural dynamics over thousands of years.</p> <p><i>This statement by ICOMOS simply reflects a different theoretical approach. The argument made in the dossier is not 'flawed' it simply reflects a different perspective. (While it is accepted by the State Party that there will be theoretical difference of opinion in the World Heritage nomination process, an advisory body is surely obliged to carefully explain why it prefers one theory over another rather than simply stating that a different approach is 'flawed'.)</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
P61,C2,L48-52	<p>Describing and discussing aspects related to toponyms, ethno-botany and traditional knowledge as it was, or still is, practiced in the nominated property would be necessary to provide arguments in support of this criterion.</p>	<p>Describing and discussing aspects related to toponyms and traditional knowledge as it was, or still is, practiced in the nominated property would be necessary to provide arguments in support of this criterion.</p> <p><i>A master's thesis fully documenting and explaining the ethno-botany of the †Khomani San was submitted in October 2016 as Annexure 8 of the supplemental information requested.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this information needs to inform a revised nomination dossier and the justification for inscription.</p>
P62C2L44-50	<p>This shift appears highly problematic, in that referring to the †Khomani as the sole surviving group directly linked to this now culturally extinct group appears to be like using the †Khomani traditions and cultural expressions as a proxy for the Xam rather than recognising that they deserve consideration in their own right.</p>	<p><i>Delete entirely. It is not contended in the Nomination Dossier that the †Khomani are the sole surviving San community or that the Xam were of the same 'culture'. Identity and relationships amongst San communities differ/ed from the western concept of the mono-cultural 'nation state' and care should be taken to understand the different degrees of relationship between groups of San based on a number of factors, such as language, geographical proximity, kinship, etc.</i></p> <p><i>Furthermore, ICOMOS has missed the fact that the references to the Xam arise as a result of the tentative listing including both theirs' and the †Khomani cultural landscapes. It is intended that a Xam nomination may still follow at a future date.</i></p>	<p>At p. 21, the Nomination dossier states:</p> <p>“However, after hundreds of years of progressive subordination, assimilation and finally colonial era genocide, the Xam are culturally extinct. Only the †Khomani remain and the spirit that moved the artists continues to live in them”.</p> <p>ICOMOS does not consider that there is an error in its evaluation.</p>
P63,C1,L35-45	<p>ICOMOS notes that the landscape that is being nominated is confined to South Africa, whilst the historic landscape pertaining to the San also extends to neighbouring Namibia and Botswana. Botswana has on its Tentative List the Central</p>	<p><i>Delete entirely. This nomination is not a nomination of a San landscape, but of the landscape of the †Khomani San. The San are not a nation, or a single culture and the additional areas referred to are not directly associated with the †Khomani San although they are part of a 'circle of cultures'. (ie: This statement is similar to regarding the cultural landscapes of all</i></p>	<p>The comparative analysis among the tentative cultural landscapes in South Africa, Namibia and Botswana might have highlighted relevant distinctions and</p>

	Kalahari Game Reserve as a mixed property based on the human/nature interaction of the Basarwa (San people). At present, even within South Africa, aspects of the †Khomani’s living culture and other places of memory are outside the nominated property.	<i>Latin peoples as being of value only as a single serial nomination when in fact Latin peoples, like the San, form many distinct and widely dispersed cultures and polities.)</i> <i>‘Basarwa’ is a term similar to ‘San’ that is used in Botswana as a collective term for San communities. It was not used in the nomination dossier and introducing it here adds to the confusion already created around San identity.</i>	potential exceptionality of the nominated one in terms of the Operational Guidelines. This comparison is lacking.
P63,C2,L	ICOMOS considers that the distribution of the San-speaking people in a much wider area indicates that the boundaries need to be reconsidered, in light of the focus of the nomination and of the evidence, as well as tangible and intangible attributes supporting the justification for inscription.	<i>Delete entirely. This nomination is not a nomination of a San cultural landscape, but of the landscape of the †Khomani San, a community that is one part of a circle of cultures that make up the San. (See comments immediately above.)</i> <i>There is also no such thing as ‘San-speaking’. The San speak a variety of related languages in the same way as Germanic peoples speak Germanic languages, but do not all speak German. (As ICOMOS points out elsewhere in its document, the language of the †Khomani San was explained in detail in the nomination dossier. This statement by ICOMOS illustrates precisely why it was necessary to emphasise why language is a major aspect of understanding separate identities amongst San peoples.</i>	The comparative analysis among these cultural landscapes might have highlighted relevant distinctions and potential exceptionality of the nominated one. This comparison is lacking.
P63,C2,L14-15	No buffer zone is proposed for the nominated property, relying on buffering mechanisms of the planning system.	No buffer zone is proposed for the nominated property, relying on buffering mechanisms of the planning system; the formal conservation status of the Botswana part of the KTP, which forms around 50% of the boundary of the property; and the formal conservation status of the farms Tween Dabas and Loretto which cover approximately 50% of the South African sector of the boundary. Planning tools by the State Party <i>This was explained in some detail in supplementary information supplied in October 2016.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
P64,C1,L16-22	ICOMOS observes that the array of instruments described above seem to form a solid basis for the protection of the property currently being nominated; however, it appears that the entirety of the property is not currently protected under the National Heritage Resources Act nr. 25/1999. Consideration should be given to the opportunity to add this layer of protection.	<i>Delete entirely. The property is protected in terms of Chapter II, Part 2, Sections 34-38 of the NHRA. (See for eg: what ICOMOS says in contradiction of this statement in the immediately following paragraph and at P63,C2,L42-44.)</i>	ICOMOS understand that the archaeological sites are designated and therefore formally protected under the NHRA but not the entire cultural landscape and nominated property. The nomination dossier states (p. 43): The property encompasses the KGNP inclusive of the Heritage Park. The KGNP was declared a Schedule 1 National Park in 1933, and the

			Heritage Park as a Schedule 2b Contractual National Park, in terms of the National Parks Act of 1976 (as amended) [...]. It is not mentioned a designation under the NHRA.
P64,C1,L26-29	ICOMOS also observes that the planning framework and its tools may also provide for buffering mechanisms, the effectiveness of which largely depends on their enforcement and adoption by all decision-makers.	ICOMOS also observes that the planning framework and its tools may also provide for buffering mechanisms, the effectiveness of which largely depends on their enforcement by the relevant municipalities . <i>Decision-makers including Municipalities are behind this nomination. The use of the surrounding areas is and has always been dominantly eco-tourism, game farming as the area cannot support any other uses. The planning tools applicable to the area therefore support existing uses and have support of all decision makers.</i>	ICOMOS considers this as a clarification
P64,C2,L4-8	In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the legal protection in place for the nominated property could be considered adequate although consideration should be given to protecting its entirety under the National Heritage Resources Act .	In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the legal protection in place for the nominated property could be considered adequate. <i>The NHRA protects the entire nominated property through its general protections in section 34 to 38. See comment under P64,C1,L16-22 above.</i>	The nomination dossier states (p. 43): The property encompasses the KGNP inclusive of the Heritage Park. The KGNP was declared a Schedule 1 National Park in 1933, and the Heritage Park as a Schedule 2b Contractual National Park, in terms of the National Parks Act of 1976 (as amended) [...]. It is not mentioned a designation under the NHRA. ICOMOS understands that the archaeological sites are designated and therefore formally protected under the NHRA but not the entire nominated property.
P64,C2,L45-48	Some 30 cultural heritage sites have been documented. ICOMOS notes that this is a very positive step; however, this number is still inadequate considering the huge size of the cultural landscape.	Some 30 cultural heritage sites have been documented as have traditional land use patterns over large expanses of the nominated property as have ethno-botanical plant uses . ICOMOS notes that this is a very positive step; however, the number of heritage sites identified is still inadequate considering the huge size of the cultural landscape. <i>Documents clearly setting out traditional land uses over wide areas of the property were provided in Appendix 3 of the nomination dossier. A full master's thesis fully documenting the ethno-botany of the †Khomani San, including medicinal and</i>	Appendix 3 contains maps related to land use regimes related to planning and not to traditional use patterns. The information contained in the thesis on ethnobotany has not informed the nomination dossier or the justification for inscription.

		<i>food plants, etc, was provided as requested supplementary information in October 2016.</i>	
P65,C1,L1-3	archaeological investigations focussing also on the human-made environmental modifications may assist in improving the understanding of the length of time of occupation and use of the nominated landscape by the #Khomani San and other San-related populations.	archaeological investigations focusing also on the human-made environmental modifications may assist in improving the understanding of the length of time of occupation and use of the nominated landscape by the #Khomani San and related San populations. <i>'San-related' does not reflect accurately the status and connection of San groups. The people discussed are not partially, but fully San, The Nomination Dossier uses the term 'related San' and the meaning and intention of this term is substantially changed by transposing the two words.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
P65,C2,L7-10	Sustainable use of natural resources is the focus of training at the Imbewu veld school/bush camp that is operational and run by the #Khomani San communities .	Sustainable use of natural resources is the focus of training at the Imbewu veld school/bush camp that is operational and run by the #Khomani San community . <i>There is only one #Khomani San community.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
P65,C2,L32-40	On the other hand, cultural heritage officers are centrally based at SANParks' Head Office in Pretoria and their involvement in regular conservation work is limited. Therefore, expertise in archaeological, heritage and historical issues in the day-to-day running of the nominated property is necessary, so as to elevate the cultural heritage component in the park to the level of the natural heritage.	On the other hand, some cultural heritage officers are centrally based at SANParks' Head Office in Pretoria and their involvement in regular conservation work is limited. There are also specialists based in the Scientific Services Regional Office in Upington two hours' drive from the nominated property and there is a People and Conservation Unit based in the property that deals with community issues. Expertise in archaeological, heritage and historical issues in the day-to-day running of the nominated property is believed to be necessary, so as to elevate the cultural heritage component in the park to the level of the natural heritage. In addition members of the #Khomani San community work in a variety of capacities in the Kgalagadi Trans-frontier Park (and some indeed accompanied the ICOMOS and IUCN evaluation mission) which they also partially own, they are well positioned to exercise traditional and other oversights of their own heritage. <i>It appears to be incorrectly assumed by ICOMOS that it is impossible for an indigenous community to fulfill an oversight role over its own heritage.</i>	The Additional information states: "...The Cultural Heritage Section like other Scientific Services is currently centralised at Head Office. The day to day management of cultural heritage sites in the Parks is done by the People and Conservation Department. There are however plans to increase capacity." ICOMOS considers that the part highlighted in yellow contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. ICOMOS considers that this (<i>italics</i>) reflects a difference of opinions. There is no such an assumption in ICOMOS, as attested to by the ICOMOS text at p. 65, C 2, L17 - 23
P67,C1,L20-25	The integrity of the nominated property also poses questions, as the original landscape of the #Khomani and other San-	The integrity of the nominated property also poses questions, as the original landscape of the #Khomani and related San people is much larger than the one	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

	<p>related people is much larger than the one being nominated and therefore the nominated property represents only a portion of what used to be the #Khomani San associative landscape.</p>	<p>being nominated and therefore the nominated property represents only a portion of what used to be the #Khomani San associative landscape.</p> <p><i>'San-related' does not reflect accurately the status and connection of San groups. The people discussed are not partially, but fully San, The Nomination Dossier uses the term 'related San' and the meaning and intention of this term is substantially changed by transposing the two words.</i></p>	
P67,C2,L23-26	<p>In summary, ICOMOS considers that further work is needed to achieve a convincing nomination for the cultural landscape associated to the #Khomani and other San-related peoples.</p>	<p>In summary, ICOMOS considers that further work is needed to achieve a convincing nomination for the cultural landscape associated to the #Khomani and other related San peoples.</p> <p><i>'San-related' does not reflect accurately the status and connection of San groups. The people discussed are not partially, but fully San, The Nomination Dossier uses the term 'related San' and the meaning and intention of this term is substantially changed by transposing the two words.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Allemagne

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Les grottes avec l'art le plus ancien de la période glaciaire

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
183, left, 18	The figurines depict species of animals who lived in that ice age environment – cave lions, mammoths, birds, horses, cattle and fish.	The figurines depict species of animals who lived in that ice age environment – cave lions, mammoths, birds, horses, bovids and fish.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
183, left, 20	Other figurines depict creatures that are half animal, half human and there is one statuette of a female form .	Other figurines depict creatures that are half animal, half human and there is one statuette of a woman .	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
183, right, 42	Geißenklösterle is the westernmost cave in this component.	Geißenklösterle is the northeasternmost cave in this component.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
183, right, 50	Deposits in Geißenklösterle range in age from the Middle Palaeolithic (Mousterian) to the Mesolithic.	Deposits in Geißenklösterle range in age from the Middle Palaeolithic (Mousterian) to the Mesolithic.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 7	Deposits in Sirgenstein Cave range in age from the Mousterian to medieval times.	Deposits in Sirgenstein Cave range in age from the Middle Palaeolithic to medieval times.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 8	Finds from the Aurignacian layers include ornamental beads made from mammoth ivory dated to between 35,000 and 39,000 years ago.	Finds from the Aurignacian layers include an ornamental bead made from mammoth ivory dated to between 35,000 and 39,000 years ago.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.

184, left, 10	Hohle Fels is the easternmost cave in the Ach valley.	Hohle Fels is the southwesternmost cave in the Ach valley.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
184, left, 27	The Lone valley is narrower than the Ach , its floor is less than 200 m wide for most its length in this component, widening out to 500 m in places.	The Lone valley is narrower than the Ach valley , its floor is less than 200 m wide for most its length in this component, widening out to 500 m in places.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 31	The setting of the Lone valley is rural with farm fields in the valley floor and forests on the valley slopes.	The setting of the Lone valley is rural with meadows in the valley floor and forests on the valley slopes.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 47f.	Many different ice age animals are represented, cave lions, mammoths, wild cattle , wild horses, water fowl and fish.	Many different ice age animals are represented, cave lions, mammoths, bovids , wild horses, water fowl and fish.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 53ff.	Its entrance faces north and the cave is narrow but deep, extending 50 m into the rockface with small side bays and passages.	Its entrance faces north and the passageway extends along a length of 50 m to the south in a straight line into the rock.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
184, left, 55f.	Some undisturbed deposits are thought to still exist in front of the cave and in the interior.	Undisturbed deposits still exist in front of the cave and in the interior.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
184. left, 57f.	Deposits from Hohlenstein Stadel Cave range from the Mousterian of the Middle Palaeolithic to the Magdalenian period.	Deposits from Hohlenstein Stadel Cave range from the Mousterian of the Middle Palaeolithic to the medieval period.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
186, right, 29f.	The current research plan includes only the ongoing excavations at Hohle Fels and test excavations at Sirgenstein Cave.	The current research plan includes only the ongoing excavations at Hohle Fels and test excavations at Sirgenstein Cave.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.

187, left, 47	The artefacts and excavated materials housed in the Archäologisches Landesmuseum Baden-Württemberg (Stuttgart), Urgeschichtliches Museum (Blaubeuren), Ulmer Museum (Ulm), Museum Universität Tübingen, and Archäopark Vogelherd (Niederstotzingen) are also associated with the values of the nominated property.	The artefacts and excavated materials housed in the Archäologisches Archäologisches Landesmuseum Baden-Württemberg (Stuttgart), Urgeschichtliches Museum (Blaubeuren), Ulmer Museum (Ulm), Museum Universität Tübingen, and Archäopark Vogelherd (Niederstotzingen) [...].	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
188, right, 16	ICOMOS notes that the backdirt from the early excavations at Sirgenstein and Bockstein caves is of potential significance.	ICOMOS notes that the backdirt from the early excavations at Sirgenstein, Hohlenstein Stadel and Bockstein caves is of potential significance.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
188, right, 20f.	The backdirt from Sirgenstein and Bockstein caves may have the same research potential.	The backdirt from Sirgenstein, Hohlenstein Stadel and Bockstein caves may have the same research potential.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
188, right, 32f.	The property is administrated by the Ministry of Finance and Economics Baden-Württemberg as the supreme monument protection authority, [...].	The property is administrated by the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Labour and Housing Baden-Württemberg (formerly Ministry of Finance and Economics) as the supreme monument protection authority, [...].	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
189, left, 7f.	The management plan for the nominated property was prepared in mutual agreement of all representatives of the townships and municipalities, the District of Heidenheim and the Alb-Donau District, the Ministry of Finance and Economics Baden-Württemberg , [...].	The management plan for the nominated property was prepared in mutual agreement of all representatives of the townships and municipalities, the District of Heidenheim and the Alb-Donau District, the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Labour and Housing Baden-Württemberg (formerly Ministry of Finance and Economics) , [...].	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

190, left, 39f.	Excavated from the 1860s up to the present day, these six caves have revealed a long record of human presence and an earlier Neanderthal presence before that.	Excavated from the 1860s up to the present day, these six caves have revealed a long record of human presence, including both anatomically modern humans and Neanderthals before that.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
190, left, 46	The figurines depict species of animals who lived in that ice age environment – cave lions, mammoths, birds, horses, cattle and fish.	The figurines depict species of animals who lived in that ice age environment – cave lions, mammoths, birds, horses, bovids and fish.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
190, left, 48	Other figurines depict creatures that are half animal, half human and there is one statuette of a female form.	Other figurines depict creatures that are half animal, half human and there is one statuette of a woman.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
190, right, 44	The property is administrated by the Ministry of Finance and Economics Baden-Württemberg and other branches of state, regional and municipal governments.	The property is administrated by the Ministry of Economic Affairs, Labour and Housing Baden-Württemberg (formerly Ministry of Finance and Economics) and other branches of state, regional and municipal governments.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
191, left, 14	c) Ensuring the protection and monitoring, and consider the future research potential of the backdirt from the early excavations at Sirgenstein and Bockstein caves (these might have a similar research potential as the recently re-excavated backdirt of Vogelherd cave)	c) Ensuring the protection and monitoring, and consider the future research potential of the backdirt from the early excavations at Sirgenstein, Hohlenstein Stadel and Bockstein caves (these might have a similar research potential as the recently re-excavated backdirt of Vogelherd cave)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Allemagne

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Le Bauhaus et ses sites à Weimar, Dessau et Bernau

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
286, left, 10	The Bauhaus cannot be understood as a whole without addressing the work of its second director, Hannes Meyer, who founded and led its building department.	The Bauhaus cannot be understood as a whole without addressing the work of its second director, Hannes Meyer, who formed and led its building department.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence Page 90 ND The complexity and global impact of the Bauhaus cannot be fully understood without addressing the work of the Bauhaus director Hannes Meyer. He reformed the Bauhaus and, by leading and developing the building department, influenced the way in which architects were taught.
290, right, 43	This network is coordinated and chaired by the Bauhaus Dessau Foundation, which is responsible for site management, cross-cutting issues, communication, protection policy and research (in connection with the Universities in Berlin, Potsdam, Frankfurt and Cottbus).	This network is coordinated and chaired by the Bauhaus Dessau Foundation, which is responsible for site management, cross-cutting issues, communication, protection policy and research (in connection with the Universities in Berlin, Potsdam, Frankfurt (Oder), Cottbus and especially the Bauhaus-University in Weimar).	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Allemagne

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Cathédrale de Naumburg et sites associés dans le paysage culturel de la Saale et de l'Unstrut

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
307, left, 1	Official name as proposed by the State Party Naumburg Cathedral and related sites in the Cultural Landscape of the Rivers Saale and Unstrut	Official name as proposed by the State Party Naumburg Cathedral and the High Medieval Cultural Landscape of the Rivers Saale and Unstrut	ICOMOS wording is based on the additional information received on 28 November 2016
307, left 11 (and below 308, left, 11; 309, left, 5; 311, right, 19; 312, left, 38; 313, left, 40; 317, right, 28)	Three selected components, out of 11 originally proposed , represent the historical developments and landscape patterns [...]	Eleven components represent the historical developments and landscape patterns [...]	ICOMOS wording is based on the additional information received on 28 November 2016
307, right, 44	The nomination received and evaluated by ICOMOS during 2016 was comprised of eleven components within a single, large and encompassing buffer zone. However, following discussions with ICOMOS in November 2016, the State Party advised that the serial nomination had been reduced to three components only; and minor changes were made to the title of the nomination (from 'Naumburg Cathedral and the High Medieval Cultural	The nomination received and evaluated by ICOMOS during 2016 is comprised of eleven components within a single, large and encompassing buffer zone. However, following discussions with ICOMOS in November 2016, the State Party proposed that the serial nomination be reduced to three components in reaction to the concerns raised by ICOMOS; likewise, minor changes were proposed to the title of the nomination (from 'Naumburg Cathedral and the High Medieval	ICOMOS wording is based on the additional information received on 28 November 2016

	Landscape of the Rivers Saale and Unstrut’). This evaluation is based on the revisions made by the State Party in November 2016.	Cultural Landscape of the Rivers Saale and Unstrut’).	
317, right, 28	ICOMOS appreciates that the decision taken by the State Party in November 2016 to reduce the number of components from eleven and three was intended to further improve the focus of the nomination following the discussions with representatives of the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel.	ICOMOS appreciates that the proposal made by the State Party in November 2016 to reduce the number of components from eleven and three was intended to further improve the focus of the nomination following the discussions with representatives of the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel.	ICOMOS wording is based on the additional information received on 28 November 2016
314, right, 42	While the State Party identifies population decline as a possible factor affecting the property, demographic information provided to the ICOMOS mission suggests that the population levels area relatively stable throughout this area.	Demographic information provided to the ICOMOS mission suggests that the population levels are relatively stable throughout this area.	(1) ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. (2) ICOMOS accepts this correction as a typing error.
312, right, 22	For example, Neuenburg Castle was substantially rebuilt a few decades ago; significant amounts of modern reconstruction have occurred at a number of the castles and monasteries; and the old towns of Naumburg and Freyburg have experienced some renewal and renovation of urban areas and buildings.	Repairs have occurred at a number of the castles and monasteries; and the old towns of Naumburg and Freyburg have experienced renovation of urban areas and buildings.	(1) ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. (2) ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
315, left, 45	In order to ensure coordination and internal monitoring a Working Group World Heritage Saale and Unstrut has been established, and acts as an official forum for coordination, supported by an Advisory Committee. The State Party advises that this Working Group will come into effect once the property is inscribed in the World Heritage List.	In order to ensure coordination and internal monitoring a Working Group World Heritage Saale and Unstrut has been established, and acts as an official forum for coordination, supported by an Advisory Committee.	ICOMOS acknowledges this editorial change
316, left, 1 (and below 316, right, 16; 316, right, 21)	The Management Plan provided by the State Party is unchanged from the version drafted for the nomination presented in 2014. The State Party advises that this Management Plan is in the process of review and adaptation to this revised nomination, but that the earlier one serves as a baseline for information, evaluation and consultation.	[suggest to delete]	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Angola

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Centre historique de Mbanza Kongo

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 47, colonne 1, ligne 5	Lieu: Province du Zaïre	Province du Zaire (Zaire, avec un seul accent sur le i)	L'usage en français est d'écrire Zaïre avec un tréma pour la prononciation du mot.
Page 47, colonne 2, ligne 33	Au nord-ouest de l'Angola, près de l'embouchure du fleuve Congo, Province du Zaïre	Au nord-ouest de l'Angola, près de l'embouchure du fleuve Congo, Province du Zaire , (Zaire, avec un seul accent sur i)	L'usage en français est d'écrire Zaïre avec un tréma pour la prononciation du mot.
Page 48, colonne 1 ligne 40	Le premier était dédié au lavage du corps et le second daté du XIVe , était un lieu où l'on embaumait le corps des rois.	Le premier était dédié au lavage du corps et le second daté du XIVe au XVIIe siècle , était un lieu où l'on embaumait le corps des rois.	L'ICOMOS considère que cette correction est une clarification.
Page 48, colonne 2, ligne 47	Sur ce plateau, un bois sacré abritait l'espace du rituel traditionnel et le cimetière royal (déjà nommé Kulumbimbi, de Nkulu : « ancêtre », et Mbimbi : « lieu périlleux »)	Sur ce plateau, un bois sacré abritait l'espace du rituel traditionnel et le cimetière royal (déjà nommé Kulumbimbi, de Nkulu : « ancien », et Mbimbi : « durable et indestructible »)	L'ICOMOS accepte cette clarification.
Page 49, colonne 1, ligne 7.	Mais son influence dépassait cette aire et s'étendait à d'autres peuples limitrophes (Loango au Nord, Kasanje au Sud), sur les territoires des actuels Gabon, Angola et République démocratique du Congo .	Mais son influence dépassait cette aire et s'étendait à d'autres peuples limitrophes (Loango au Nord, Kasanje au Sud), sur les territoires des actuels Gabon, Angola et la République Démocratique du Congo .	L'ICOMOS considère qu'il s'agit d'un changement éditorial qui ne modifie pas le sens de la phrase.
Page 49, colonne 1, ligne 30	Elle était entourée du palais royal, du quartier des colons portugais et du collège des jésuites .	Elle était entourée du palais royal, du quartier des colons portugais et du quartier des autochtones .	L'ICOMOS accepte cette correction comme une erreur factuelle.
Page 41, colonne 1, ligne 41.	L'ancienne capitale du Royaume du Kongo et en effet, de nos jours, le siège	L'ancienne capitale du Royaume du Kongo et en effet, de nos jours, le siège politique, culturel et	L'usage en français est d'écrire Zaïre avec un tréma pour la prononciation du

	politique, culturel et administration de la province du Zaire .	administration de la province du Zaire , (Zaire, avec un seul accent sur le i)	mot.
Page 53, colonne 1, ligne 6.	Succédant à la cathédrale du Saint-Sauveur (Kulumbimbi), qui est le plus ancien des vestiges catholiques (fin du XVIe siècle), et au collège des jésuites (Tadi dya Bukikwa, siècle XVIIe siècle).	Succédant à la cathédrale du Saint-Sauveur (Kulumbimbi), qui est le plus ancien des vestiges catholiques (fin du XVIe siècle), et au collège des jésuites (Tadi dya Bukikwa, siècle XVIIe).	L'ICOMOS ne relève pas d'erreur dans l'évaluation. p. 53 « et au collège des Jésuites (Tadi dya Bukikwa, XVIIe siècle) »
Page 55, colonne 1, ligne 10.	La mise en œuvre des textes législatifs est assurée par le Comité de gestion participative qui coordonne l'action des entités en charge de la gestion du site, à savoir le ministère de la culture (Institut national du patrimoine culturel) Gouvernement province du Zaire .	La mise en œuvre des textes législatifs est assurée par le Comité de gestion participative qui coordonne l'action des entités en charge de la gestion du site, à savoir le ministère de la culture (Institut national du patrimoine culturel) Gouvernement province du Zaire , (Zaire, avec un seul accent sur le i).	L'usage en français est d'écrire Zaire avec un tréma pour la prononciation du mot.
Page 55, colonne 1, ligne 23.	Lui-même intégré au Plan national de développement 2013.2017 et au Plan de développement province du Zaire 2013-2017.	Lui-même intégré au Plan national de développement 2013.2017 et au Plan de développement province du Zaire 2013-2017, (Zaire, avec un seul accent sur le i).	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error
Page 56, colonne 1, ligne 20.	À côté d'éléments positifs, cette analyse signale des dangers ou urgences : vestiges sous des bâtiments récents, démographie, aéroport, distribution d'eau, assainissement, érosion, brûlis, infrastructures hôtelière, circulation automobile, trafic des biens culturels, faible apprentissage de la langue Kikongo .	À côté d'éléments positifs, cette analyse signale des dangers ou urgences : vestiges sous des bâtiments récents, démographie, aéroport, distribution d'eau, assainissement, érosion, brûlis, infrastructures hôtelière, circulation automobile, trafic des biens culturels, faible apprentissage de la langue Kikongo . La population de Mbanza Kongo a comme langue maternelle le Kikongo, qui est apprise dès le plus jeune âge. Avec la réforme de l'éducation nationale certains manuels scolaires comme les manuels de mathématique sont en langue Kikongo.	ICOMOS acknowledges this considers this correction to be a clarification.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Azerbaïdjan

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Centre historique de Sheki avec le palais du Khan

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 153, left column, lines 4-8 from the top	ICOMOS considers that in comparing the Qajar elements of the palace architecture, several similar palaces in Iran should have been analysed and discussed. ICOMOS considers that it is not evident how the Sheki Khan's Palace can be said outstanding within a regional or even global comparison.	<p>ICOMOS considers that in comparing the Qajar elements of the palace architecture, several similar palaces in Iran should have been analysed and discussed. ICOMOS considers that it is not evident how the Sheki Khan's Palace can be said outstanding within a regional or even global comparison.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that the Qajar elements of Sheki Khan's Palace should be viewed in comparison with several similar palaces in Iran. One also has to acknowledge that the Khan Palace should be seen in relation to the historic urban fabric. The Qajar impact has clearly been diffused in the urban fabric, seen for example in the refined fireplaces and other decorative features of interiors. The palace retained its significance as an integral part of the urban ensemble of Sheki and bears importance at regional and international levels.</p> <p><i>Comment from the State Party:</i> Regarding the remaining examples of Qajar architecture in Sheki, it is true that there are Qajar palaces in other parts of the Qajar Persian Empire. At the same time, Sheki's khanate buildings should be understood as part of the regional development during Qajar reign. They are not to be compared with the main cities in Iran, such as the market city of Tabriz, or the royal complex of Golestan Palace. The Khanate palaces of Sheki should rather be seen in relation to the historic urban fabric. They existed here prior to the flood of the late 18th century, and then became focal points and centrepieces of the new development. One of the characteristics of Sheki is the diffusion of the Qajar impact in the vernacular urban fabric, seen for example in the refined fireplaces and other decorative features of interiors. Within this historic urban landscape, the palaces have thus retained their significance as an integral part of the urban ensemble of Sheki, and certainly have great importance not only for the region but also for the world.</p>	ICOMOS considers that this justification reiterates arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
Page 153, right	Integrity	Integrity	ICOMOS considers

<p>column</p>	<p>The property area proposed for the Historic Centre of Sheki with the Khan's Palace is inclusive of all elements reflecting its historic significance. The urban fabric has retained its traditional typology of neighbourhoods and much of the surrounding landscape. However, the landscape setting is affected by a few hotel complexes which have been developed and remains subject to further urban development pressures given that Sheki is surrounded by mountains in three directions and has limited opportunity to expand. Several hotels were also built within the historical and architectural reserve without respecting the surrounding architectural volumes and styles. In addition, these structures were inserted in key urban historic neighbourhoods and, at times, interrupt the functional and visual relations between the historic monuments. In the same manner, several new residential structures do not correspond to the surrounding architectural proportions, materials or designs.</p> <p>ICOMOS notes that the percentage of historic structures within the property has been significantly reduced over time. A small percentage of architectural structures is in a very vulnerable condition, the majority of which is in a state of being abandoned or out of appropriate use. These structures are faced with challenges of decay, which might further reduce the integrity of the property in the future.</p> <p>Authenticity ICOMOS notes that while authenticity of design, structure and to some extent setting has been affected negatively, the city largely retains its urban typology and environment. It is noteworthy that Sheki has retained its traditional mechanisms for property maintenance and community involvement through neighbourhood representatives and a council of elders. A majority of private residences and some public buildings have kept their traditional use and function. However, several other important information sources of authenticity are lost. ICOMOS observed that past and on- going structural and surface repairs and restorations do not pay respect to authenticity of material, substance or workmanship and, in several cases, design. These repairs are carried out with inappropriate materials including concrete and cement mixtures instead of traditional brick and adobe materials as well as plaster surfaces. These measures</p>	<p>The property area proposed for the Historic Centre of Sheki with the Khan's Palace is inclusive of all elements reflecting its historic significance. The urban fabric has retained its traditional typology of neighbourhoods and much of the surrounding landscape. However, the landscape setting is affected by a few hotel complexes which have been developed and remains subject to further urban development pressures given that Sheki is surrounded by mountains in three directions and has limited opportunity to expand. Several hotels were also built within the historical and architectural reserve and had to adapt themselves into the scale and visual integrity of Sheki, without respecting the surrounding architectural volumes and styles. In addition, these structures were inserted in key urban historic neighbourhoods and, at times, interrupt the functional and visual relations between the historic monuments. In the same manner, several new residential structures do not correspond to the surrounding architectural proportions, materials or designs.</p> <p>ICOMOS notes that the percentage of historic structures within the property has been significantly reduced over time. A small percentage of architectural structures is in a very vulnerable condition, the majority of which is in a state of being abandoned or out of appropriate use. These structures are faced with challenges of decay, which might further reduce the integrity of the property in the future.</p> <p>Authenticity ICOMOS notes that while authenticity of design, structure and to some extent setting has been affected negatively, the city largely retains its urban typology and environment. It is noteworthy that Sheki has retained its traditional mechanisms for property maintenance and community involvement through neighbourhood representatives and a council of elders. A majority of private residences and some public buildings have kept their traditional use and function. However, even if some authenticity aspects are lost in terms of building materials (unbaked earth), ICOMOS observed that past and on- going structural and surface repairs and restorations use baked earth and stone, to make buildings more resistant to earthquakes and floods. These repairs are carried out with inappropriate materials including concrete and cement mixtures instead of traditional brick and adobe materials as well as plaster surfaces. These measures unfortunately change the visual appearance of the town's streetscape, in particular the repairs of the outer townhouse walls, which are so visually determining the appearance of Sheki to a visitor. In addition, these repairs are likely to reduce the traditional earthquake resilience of the original construction methods.</p> <p><i>Comment from the State Party:</i> The historic urban settlement of Sheki was built from the end of the 18th to the early 20th century. It was built in a higher ground in a mountain valley after a flood had destroyed the earlier city down on the main river. Consequently, even though based on earlier traditions, the Historic Centre of Sheki is an early modern urban settlement, which has maintained its historical stratigraphy and urban morphology until today. Indeed, there are two components in this process over time; one is the memory; the other is a creative response to evolving needs.</p> <p>Examining the history of the urban and architectural development of the historic centre of Sheki, it can be noted that it is fundamentally a vernacular settlement, which was gradually built over more than a century. It</p>	<p>that those corrections reflect a difference of opinion.</p>
---------------	--	--	--

	<p>unfortunately change the visual appearance of the town's streetscape, in particular the repairs of the outer townhouse walls, which are so visually determining the appearance of Sheki to a visitor. In addition, these repairs are likely to reduce the traditional earthquake resilience of the original construction methods.</p>	<p>was not the result of urban design or urban master plan. It was initiated from a road along a stream, leading to the fortified Khan's Palace Compound further north. This road became the main street of the new settlement. Over the 19th and early 20th century, the city expanded in the valley, leaving the mountain slopes unbuilt, thus creating the characteristic urban landscape, which has been exceptionally well preserved until today. What is particularly interesting in the case of Sheki is the continuity of the building typology in the successive periods. Historically, buildings of different periods are mixed, and also buildings of the 20th century have become an integral part of the complex. Indeed, contrary to ICOMOS criticism, it should be fair to say that the overall visual integrity is clearly dominated by the traditional roofscape and building typology.</p> <p>It is understood that the building technology in Sheki was first based on the use of unbaked earth, still present in some buildings. Subsequently, it was preferred to opt for fired brick and stone, a regional tradition, which was more resistant to eventual floods and earthquakes. This building tradition is common in the Caucasus region, including Azerbaijan as well as Georgia, while for example in northern Iran it was more common to use timber. Within its region, Sheki is particularly significant for having maintained its overall character and integrity as an urban ensemble. The Historic Urban Landscape of Sheki includes not only the historic urban area but also the surrounding mountain slopes that form an environmentally protected wider setting, thus contributing to its exceptional significance. Taking into account the scale and general visual integrity of Sheki, the relatively few modern constructions, such as the hotel and the municipality, cannot be considered to have interrupted the continuity of the landscape.</p>	
<p>Page 154, left column, criterion (ii)</p>	<p>Criterion (ii) This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the historic centre of Sheki exhibits an important interchange of cultural influences over two millennia. Its location on the Great Silk Road and the trade relations Sheki established promoted an exchange of goods and traditions, which had impacts on the architectural design of the town. In particular, its renewal with Qajar influences in the early 19th century and its expansion influenced by Russian architecture in the late 20th century. ICOMOS considers that while the city was exposed to various cultural influences through the presence of traders, this would apply to any city located along the Great Silk Road or other important trade routes. ICOMOS considers that the architectural features reflect regional influences in line with the political regimes exerting power over the region at the time of construction. Very limited architectural references to an exchange of cultural traditions can be seen beyond these. ICOMOS further considers that Sheki's architectural and urban testimony is very homogenous in result of its construction within a few years following the earlier</p>	<p>Criterion (ii) This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the historic centre of Sheki exhibits an important interchange of cultural influences over two millennia. Its location on the Great Silk Road and the trade relations Sheki established promoted an exchange of goods and traditions, which had impacts on the architectural design of the town. In particular, its renewal with Qajar influences in the early 19th century and its expansion influenced by Russian architecture in the late 20th century. ICOMOS notes that while the city was exposed to various cultural influences through the presence of traders, this would apply to any city located along the Great Silk Road or other important trade routes, the peculiarity of Sheki in that sense lies in the fact that it was exposed mainly to 3 influences – Persian, Caucasian and Russian, which have given a special character to the city. ICOMOS considers that the architectural features reflect regional influences in line with the political regimes exerting power over the region at the time of construction. Very limited architectural references to an exchange of cultural traditions can be seen beyond these. ICOMOS further considers that Sheki's architectural and urban testimony is very homogenous in result of its construction within a few years following the earlier destruction in 1772. This implies that compared to older settlements along the trade routes of the wider region, it has less capacity to illustrate architectural references to cultural exchanges than cities which look back at millennia of trade exchanges along these very trade routes. ICOMOS considers that it has not been demonstrated how the interchange of cultural influences can be seen as outstanding when compared to other cities along important trade routes in the</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.</p>

	<p>destruction in 1772. This implies that compared to older settlements along the trade routes of the wider region, it has less capacity to illustrate architectural references to cultural exchanges than cities which look back at millennia of trade exchanges along these very trade routes. ICOMOS considers that it has not been demonstrated how the interchange of cultural influences can be seen as outstanding when compared to other cities along important trade routes in the wider region.</p>	<p>wider region.</p> <p><i>Comment from the State Party:</i> In reference to the justification of criterion (ii), the 19th-century city of Sheki should be understood as an interchange of Persian, Russian and Caucasian influences, which have together provided it with a particular character, reflected in the typology of its built heritage and in its traditions, that still continue as the most representative example of such influences.</p>	
<p>Page 154, right column, criterion (iii)</p>	<p>Criterion (iii): bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared; This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the urban layout of Sheki provides a testimony to the Sheki Khanate which is said the most powerful khanate in the Caucasus. This is illustrated by the division of the town into neighbourhoods, so-called mahallah, and the architecture of the Khan's palace and merchant houses. The nomination also indicates that the architectural testimony of the city illustrates the cultural traditional of silkworm breeding, cocoon trade and the production of embroideries. ICOMOS considers that the urban typology illustrates clear influences of Islamic city design with clear division into neighbourhoods which have increasingly private character and often dead-end streets. However, ICOMOS reminds that this urban typology is not unique to khanates and has been recognized in exceptional ways in other cities already inscribed on the World Heritage List. ICOMOS considers that it is not demonstrated that the Sheki khanate produced architectural features or urban layouts which differ distinctively from other cities in the region and therefore could act as an outstanding testimony of khanates as such. ICOMOS further considers that Sheki's function as a Caucasus khanate capital was rather short-lived and ended after merely 18 years. With regard to the ongoing tradition of sericulture, ICOMOS considers that it has not been demonstrated how the urban or architectural form can be said a unique testimony to sericultural traditions. ICOMOS in its request for additional information asked the State Party to further elaborate how Sheki's urban or architectural expressions could be considered a unique testimony of the tradition of silkworm breeding. In its response of 14 November 2016, the State</p>	<p>Criterion (iii): bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared; This criterion is justified by the State Party on the grounds that the urban layout of Sheki provides a testimony to the Sheki Khanate which is said the most powerful khanate in the Caucasus. This is illustrated by the division of the town into neighbourhoods, so-called mahallah, and the architecture of the Khan's palace and merchant houses. The nomination also indicates that the architectural testimony of the city illustrates the cultural traditional of silkworm breeding, cocoon trade and the production of embroideries. ICOMOS considers that the urban typology illustrates clear influences of Islamic city design with clear division into neighborhoods, which have increasingly private character and often dead-end streets. However, ICOMOS reminds that this urban typology is not unique to khanates and has been recognized in exceptional ways in other cities already inscribed on the World Heritage List. that the urban typology illustrates clear influences of the Sheki Khanate and elements of Islamic urban architecture and is unique to the Sheki Khanate, which existed from 1743 to 1819. ICOMOS considers that it is not demonstrated that the Sheki khanate produced architectural features and urban layouts which differ distinctively from other cities in the region and therefore can act as an outstanding testimony of a Caucasus khanate as such. ICOMOS further considers that Sheki's function as a Caucasus khanate capital was rather short-lived and ended after merely 18 years. With regard to the ongoing tradition of sericulture, ICOMOS considers that Sheki it has not been demonstrated how the urban or architectural form can be said a unique testimony to sericultural traditions. ICOMOS in its request for additional information asked the State Party to further elaborate how Sheki's urban or architectural expressions could be considered a unique testimony of the tradition of silkworm breeding. In its response of 14 November 2016, the State Party indicated that the silk production was more essential as a basis of trade in the interlink of historic trade routes than for the urban or architectural testimony. Silk production at Sheki was limited to cocoon rising and sale of raw silk which both did not require special constructions for this purpose. Moreover, Sheki houses were impacted by sericulture trends, as the city grew with its vernacular houses surrounded by large gardens with mulberry trees. Subsequently, while the cultivation of mulberry trees expanded to the region, the gardens were used to receive new buildings to meet the spatial requirements of extending families. In the late 19th century, silk production has been considerably increase. This gave rise to the construction of large industrial complexes, of which seven exist in Sheki today and</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.</p>

	<p>Party indicated that the silk production was more essential as a basis of trade in the interlink of historic trade routes than for the urban or architectural testimony. Silk production at Sheki was limited to cocoon rising and sale of raw silk which both did not require special constructions for this purpose.</p>	<p>are considered historic monuments.</p> <p><i>Comment from the State Party:</i> In reference to criterion (iii), Sheki bears an exceptional testimony to cultural and economic traditions that have by now basically become part of the history of the place. It is stressed that the urban morphology and building typology are the result of such traditions.</p> <p>Regarding the concept of ‘khanate’, it refers to a political entity ruled by a Khan. Moreover, a khanate refers to an administrative system, not a type of urban morphology. The notion of ‘khanate’ has been used by the Mongols, by the Turkic peoples, as well as in Iran and in the Caucasus region. The Sheki Khanate was founded in 1743, and it lasted until 1819, when the territory became a Russian province. Therefore, it lasted 76 years; not “merely 18 years”. In the Caucasus region, the Sheki Khanate became significant as the initiator and principal reference for a new administrative system.</p> <p>Regarding the idea of “Islamic city”, it is obvious that an Islamic community, as is the case in other religions, has its specific requirements, which find spatial and functional expressions in a settlement. Nevertheless, there is not one type of Islamic city; there is a great variety of architectural and urban solutions that reflect the cultural-spiritual and environmental requirements of each region. It is an oversimplification to speak of ‘clear influence of Islamic city design’. At the same time, Sheki contains the different types of buildings, structures and spaces that were and continue being used for social, spiritual and/or religious functions relevant to an Islamic community, taking into account the geological and climatic conditions.</p> <p>Considering that sericulture was an important part of its economy, the newly built city responded to all specific requirements. The vernacular houses were normally surrounded by large gardens with mulberry trees. Subsequently, while the cultivation of mulberry trees expanded to the region, the garden lots could receive new buildings to meet the spatial requirements of the extending families. Indeed, rather than expanding outwards, the city grew within itself, as can be observed from the historical analyses. Relevant facilities obviously existed for cultivating cocoons, and for the production of silk. In the late 19th century, due to market developments, the silk production had an important increase, resulting in the construction of large industrial complexes, of which seven exist in the town today as historic monuments.</p> <p>In terms of sericulture, Sheki must be understood as a regional concentration of a particular type of economic development, which gradually grew into an industry also involving a larger territory of the region. Today its historic significance is in representing a particular historic period, a memory of the past in the present. It is recalled that Sheki also has two enormous caravanserais, which are testimony to the 19th century expansion, as well as several historic mosques and public baths. Some of the streets and larger open squares were used as market areas. In the Russian period, some of the Khanate buildings in the citadel were lost, though maintaining at least two important palaces and the fortification. At the same time, Russian military structures were added within the palace compound. Historically, these should not be considered as negative but as an essential part of the later history of the place.</p>	
--	---	---	--

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Chine

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Kulangsu : un établissement historique international

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
104, 1,12	integrated influences of foreigners living there is the late 19th century in the vicinity of Yiamen international port and later in the early 20th century of Chinese returning from abroad.	integrated influences of foreigners living there in the late 19th century in the vicinity of Xiamen international port and later in the early 20th century of Chinese returning from abroad.	ICOMOS acknowledges those typing errors.
105, 1,1	Kulangsu also integrates four roads designated as of historic importance as well as the natural landscapes of several hill and cliff sites.	Kulangsu also integrates four groups of roads designated as of historic importance as well as the natural landscapes of several hill and cliff sites.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
105, 1, 27	After the Opium War in the 1840s, Kulangsu became administratively independent from the British Settlement in Xiamen , which was then an open commercial port.	After the Opium War in the 1840s, Kulangsubecame administratively separate from Xiamen , which was then an open commercial port.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modify the meaning of the sentence.
105, 1, 48	The second, a phase of blending and maturation, symbolically started when the 1903 Land Regulations for the Settlement of Kulangsu took effect. The starting of the Pacific War in 1941 caused many foreigners and overseas Chinese to settle in Kulangsu, which accelerated the maturation of the multi-cultural blending in the island.	The second, a phase of blending and maturation, symbolically started when the 1903 Land Regulations for the Settlement of Kulangsu took effect. The starting caused many foreigners and overseas Chinese to settle in Kulangsu, which accelerated the maturation of the multi-cultural blending in the island.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence.
107,1,8	In its additional information submitted in February 2017 at the request of	In its additional information submitted in February 2017 at the request of	ICOMOS accepts this

	ICOMOS, the State Party specified that the maximum number of visitors per day would amount to 15,000 while measures towards a better distribution of these on the island were being developed.	ICOMOS, the State Party specified that the maximum daily capacity of persons (including residents, visitors and commuters) per day would amount to 65,000 while measures towards a better distribution of these on the island were being developed.	correction as a factual error, with the additional clarification as indicated in the text suggested by the State Party.
108,2,25	Prominent examples of these many buildings are the Hongning Hospital, the Yanping Complex, the former water supply facility , the building of the former Kulangsu Telephone Company, and the former building of China & South Sea Bank Limited.	Prominent examples of these many buildings are the Hongning Hospital, the Yanping Complex, Yang family mansion , the building of the former Kulangsu Telephone Company, and the former building of China & South Sea Bank Limited.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
109,1,11	The responses to the September 2016 typhoon, the strongest in recent years - which caused the fall of three thousand trees, among them nineteen designated Historic Trees and damaged up to 42 historic buildings.	The responses to the September 2016 typhoon, the strongest in recent years - which caused the fall of three thousand trees, among them nineteen designated Historic Trees and damaged up to 42 historic buildings in various degrees .	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
109, 2, 2	... optimum capacity of Kulangsu Scenic Area is 25,000 persons per day, including visitors and commuters. Xiamen Municipal Government has accordingly decided to adopt this number, and an official order is being drafted and is foreseen be implemented starting from 15 June 2017.	... optimum capacity of Kulangsu Scenic Area is 25,000 persons per day, while 50,000 persons on peak , including visitors and commuters. Xiamen Municipal Government has accordingly decided to adopt this number (maximum 50,000 per day), and an official order is being drafted and is foreseen be implemented starting from 15 June 2017.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
109, 2, 21	The boundaries of the 316.3 hectares property include the entire Kulangsu Island and its adjacent coastal waters...	The boundaries of the 316.2 hectares property include the entire Kulangsu Island and its adjacent coastal waters...	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
109, 2, 33	Both, the nominated property and its buffer zone are protected as the Kulangsu Mountain Scenic Area under the 2006 Management of Scenery Areas Regulations.	Both, the nominated property and its buffer zone are protected as the Kulangsu-Wanshi Mountain Scenic Area under the 2006 Management of Scenery Areas Regulations.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
110, 1, 15	The nominated property and its buffer zone are also part of the Kulangsu Mountain Scenic Area , which is governed by the 2006 Management of Scenery Areas Regulations.	The nominated property and its buffer zone are also part of the Kulangsu-Wanshi Mountain Scenic Area , which is governed by the 2006 Management of Scenery Areas Regulations.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
110, 1, 32	The State Party further elaborates that the 931 historic buildings not protected at a national level were subject to the Regulations of Xiamen Special Economic Zone on the Conservation of Historic Buildings on Kulangsu (2009) .	The State Party further elaborates that the 931 historic buildings are protected by the Regulations of Xiamen Special Economic Zone on the Conservation of Historic Buildings on Kulangsu (2009), and some of them are subjected to national level .	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Danemark

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Kujataa - un paysage agricole subarctique au Groenland

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
p.161, col. 1, ligne 36	"There are 11 sheep farms within the boundary of the component, and the house of the first modern sheep farmer in Greenland, Otto Fredericksen "	"There are 11 sheep farms within the boundary of the component, and the house of the first modern sheep farmer in Greenland, Otto Frederiksen "	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p.161, col. 2, ligne 4	"Norse Greenlandic remains of the religious, domestic and agricultural infrastructure associated with the diocese of Greenland from the 12 th -14 th centuries are found in this component (17 sites)."	"Norse Greenlandic remains of the religious, domestic and agricultural infrastructure associated with the diocese of Greenland from the 12 th -14 th centuries are found in this component (18 sites)."	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error
p. 161, col. 2, ligne 10	"(said to have sheltered close to 150 head of cattle)"	"(said to have sheltered close to 100 head of cattle)" <i>(This information is not derived from the nomination material, but 100 is the traditional estimate for the total capacity of the two byres)</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
p. 161, col. 2, ligne 14	"Modern farming was introduced in the late 17 th century in this component."	"Modern farming was introduced in the late 18 th century in this component."	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 161, col. 2, ligne 19	"There are four registered Inuit archaeological sites in this component."	"There are eight registered Inuit archaeological sites in this component."	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
p. 161, col. 2, ligne 46	"There are no Inuit sites or Inuit farming attributes in this component,..."	"There are no registered Inuit sites or Inuit farming attributes in this component,..."	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

p. 162, col.1, line 1	“... and includes the small plain of Igaliku Kujalleq (Höfða), ...”	“...and includes the small plain of Igaliku Kujalleq (undir Höfða), ...”	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 162, col. 1, line 3	“Several large glaciers, ice and Katabatic winds are found further inland from this component, ...”	“Several large glaciers are found further inland from this component, which is afflicted by Katabatic winds , ...”	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
p. 162, col. 1, line 16	“There are no Thule Inuit sites, ...”	“There is one Thule Inuit site, ...”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
p. 162, col. 1, line 28	“5. Qaortukuloq (Hvalsey)”	“5. Qaortukuloq (Hvalsey) (73.82 km²)”	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the heading
p.162, col. 1, line 29	“This component is located in the transition zone between the inner and outer fjords and contains 11 Norse sites, and 2 Thule Inuit sites.”	“This component is located in the transition zone between the inner and outer fjords and contains 11 Norse sites, and 5 Thule Inuit sites of which 4 have registered number. ”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification, although it seems to contradict information provided during the evaluation process.
p. 162, col. 2, line 24	“There are seven sites that provide evidence of Palaeo-Eskimo occupation of the nominated property from the 3rd millennium BC. These sites share similarities with those elsewhere in Greenland and in Canada.”	“There is archaeological evidence for Palaeo-Eskimo occupation in the nominated property, sharing similarities with such evidence elsewhere in Greenland and in Canada.” <i>(This information is not derived from the nomination material. (The additional information refers to 7 registered sites in all of South Greenland, but there is one confirmed Palaeo-Eskimo site in the nominated property and it does not have a definite 3rd millennium dating (pp. 67-68, 120).)</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p. 162, col. 2, line 35	“From the 13th century, Norse Greenlandic settlements had their own bishop, ...” [this is how page 54 reads...but p. 131 says 1120s.	“From the 12th century, Norse Greenlandic settlements had their own bishop ...”	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
p. 163, col. 2, line 4	“Specialised sheep farming was introduced to Kujataa in the early 20th century at Qassiarsuk ” [p. 56 seems to say so; p. 144 matches the correction – 1924 for Q)	“Specialised sheep farming was introduced to Kujataa in 1914 at Igaliku ”	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
p. 164, col. 2, line 43	“ICOMOS does not consider that the conceptualisation of the two major cultural-historical periods as demonstrating a ‘continuity’ or ‘ symbiosis ’ is necessary ...”	<i>(The term ‘symbiosis’ is not used by the state party in the nomination material)</i>	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence

p. 168, col.1, line 53	“Executive Order on Cultural Heritage Protection (approved in July 2016, and entered into force on 1 August 2016);”	“Executive Order no.16 of 5th of July 2016 on Cultural Heritage Protection, entered into force on 1. August 2016.”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p. 168, col.2, line 17	“The Greenland National Museum and Archives can require archaeological investigations.”	“The Greenland National Museum and Archives must by law be consulted and, if deemed necessary, can require archaeological investigations.”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p.168, col.2, line 41	“ICOMOS therefore considers that the Executive Order on Cultural Heritage Protection (July 2016) provides the essential for the overall protection of the proposed World Heritage property.”	“ICOMOS therefore considers that Executive Order no.16 of 5th of July 2016 on Cultural Heritage Protection, entered into force on 1. August 2016 provides the essential for the overall protection of the proposed World Heritage property.”	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p. 169. col. 1, line 15	“For example, there are unanswered questions about the antiquity of some road alignments.”	<i>(There are no roads in the nominated property older than the 20th century)</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
p. 169, col. 2, line 29	“The State Party is considering the introduction of admission charges for visitor access to tourism sites and/or specific taxes for tourism. ”	“The Government of Greenland is considering the introduction of admission charges for visitor access to tourism sites.”	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. In relation to the proposed change to specify the Government of Greenland (instead of the ‘State Party’), ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
p. 171, col. 1, line 14	“...and from the 13th century, Norse Greenlandic settlements had their own bishop, ...”	“...and from the 12th century, Norse Greenlandic settlements had their own bishop, ...”	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Émirats arabes unis

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Khor Dubaï, un port marchand traditionnel

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 81, column 1, line 30-34	The creek continues to be a place of trade, with active boat traffic and commercial structures along both banks, though at a much reduced scale since the development of new port facilities of Jebel Ali, Port Rashid and the Dubai Maritime City.	The creek continues to be a place of trade, with active boat traffic and commercial structures along both banks, continuing to develop and thrive alongside the new port facilities of Jebel Ali and Port Rashid. <i>NB: Dubai Maritime City is not open; the project is still on paper.</i> <i>Statistic data show that the number of wooden boats mooring in the creek has increased in the past 10 years.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedures. See Nomination dossier p. 222 "Dubai Maritime City established in 2007".
Page 81, column 1, lines 35-40	Its relationship with the Gulf has been much changed though, as result of land reclamations at the mouth and both sides of the creek, and by roads, new infrastructure, demolition and housing developments that obscure the links between the creek and its markets and merchants' houses, which were once essential to its function.	Its relationship with the Gulf has been partially modified, as result of land reclamations at the mouth and both sides of the creek, and by roads, new infrastructure, and housing developments necessary for the continuity of the merchant organization of the site that do not obscure the links between the creek and its markets and merchants' houses, which were once essential to its function. <i>NB: Cf. Advisory Mission Report, p.5:</i> <i>" The (...) chronological series of maps contributes to the justification of this approach. (...) This allows for consideration of the process of</i>	ICOMOS considers that the extract mentioned here does not reflect on all the issues left open by the ICOMOS advisory mission report

		<p><i>creation of artificial land." And</i></p> <p><i>"Changes in the trading activities and consequently changes in construction (morphology of banks, souk buildings, housing above the souks, etc.) seem logical and also a typical/traditional character of the merchant organization of the site (...)"</i></p>	
<p>Page 81, column 2, lines 4-7</p>	<p>The property also includes the creek harbour in front of the historic souk while the traditional boat maintenance yards at the mouth of the creek have not been preserved."</p>	<p>The property also includes the creek harbour in front of the historic souk while the traditional boat maintenance yards originally located at the mouth of the creek have moved few kilometres inland along the creek shores and are not included in the property."</p> <p><i><u>NB:</u> The location of boat yards constantly shifted in the past century to adapt to urban growth and evolution. Boat yards are currently located downstream along the creek and there are plans for their further relocation on the seafront in the coming years. However — and this is crucial in the context of this nomination — the traditional activities related to wooden dhow making and repairing are still active (as shown in the Nomination File). Skilled craftsmen coming from the Emirates and the wider Gulf Region continue to build new wooden dhows in Dubai in yards owned by local and foreign small entrepreneurs. This continuity of a traditional activity reinforces the concept of the nomination even though the yards have moved their location and couldn't therefore be included within the property's perimeter.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
<p>Page 81, column 2, lines 30-32</p>	<p>The former historic nucleus is now fragmented with, in places, only street or water surfaces connecting the various areas and components."</p>	<p>The remaining parts of the former historic settlements are now fragmented connected by the waterway that links the various areas and components."</p> <p><i><u>NB:</u> There was no clearly defined "historic nucleus" of the city. Until WWII, the city's built up areas were distinct and only connected by the Creek, while at that time most of the city houses were still made of "arish" huts. The map presented at page 59 of the Nomination shows the city with its separated neighbourhoods</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		<p><i>connected by the creek.</i></p> <p><i>The previous file demonstrated that, differently from any other Gulf city, a relevant number of "original" houses of Dubai is preserved. This nomination, however, does not focus on the "historic neighbourhoods", but on the traditional harbour of Creek Dubai.</i></p>	
Page 81, column 2, lines 46-48	<p>Although the souks were developed as part of the trading function of the creek, today they are often catering to tourist audiences."</p>	<p>Although the The souks were developed as part of the trading function of the creek, today they are still active popular markets catering to residents and tourist audiences."</p> <p><u>NB:</u> <i>ICOMOS Advisory Mission that visited the property had a very different perception of the current role and meaning of the traditional souks. The Report reads:</i></p> <p><i>"Every ancient/traditional souk close to the creek is still there with no significant change in extension/location.</i></p> <p><i>Integrity of use in the commercial sense is excellent; it remains a highly living commercial centre (...)." (AM Report p.8)</i></p>	ICOMOS considers that the extract mentioned here does not reflect on all the issues left open by the ICOMOS advisory mission report
Page 82, column 1, lines 12-13.	<p>Today, the neighbourhood (al-Faheidi) preserves several historic as well as reconstructed houses.</p>	<p>Today, the neighbourhood (al-Faheidi) preserves several restored historic as well as reconstructed houses.</p> <p><u>NB:</u> <i>False statement: the houses of Bastakiya/Al Faheidi have not been "rebuilt" but restored, according to their physical conditions, by the Municipality of Dubai.</i></p>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 84, column 1, line 15-20	<p>"The original spatial relations of the three historic neighbourhoods, the creek and the markets as well as the urban landscape surrounding it, have changed considerably, often to the extent that their features are difficult to recognize when historic and contemporary aerial photographs are compared"</p>	<p>"The original spatial relations of the three historic neighbourhoods, the creek and the markets have not changed considerably, while the urban landscape surrounding it has greatly evolved in the past 40 years.</p> <p><u>NB:</u> <i>The Nomination File and the Advisory Mission Report do demonstrate that the dredging did not substantially alter the shape of the Khor (cf. Nomination File, Vol. I, p.28: "Creek footprint 1950-2010").</i></p> <p><i>The evaluation does not seem to grasp the "timeframe" of Gulf cities</i></p>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

		<p><i>development. In 1950, Dubai was still largely composed of arish huts (cf. Nomination File, Vol. I, pp. 19 and 51). The pace of development and change of the Gulf Cities cannot, and should not, be compared with the one of European, or even North-American cities. “Aerial pictures” from the 1950s show a world that has as much in common with today’s city, as a Middle Age engraving compared to a contemporary view of a European city. Within such an “accelerated” timeframe, the fact that Dubai original neighbourhoods can still be identified is a proof of the attention paid to the preservation of the architectural heritage of the city on the one side, and of its actual “continuity” and integrity on the other.</i></p> <p><i>Furthermore, the evaluation continues to focus on architectural and urban elements, and not on the morphology of the creek, port banks, and associated specialized traditional markets”.</i></p>	
<p>Page 84, column 1, line 21-26</p>	<p>The property also cannot reflect in a comprehensive fashion the contemporary character of Dubai as a trade city given that the key port and trade administration functions nowadays occur outside the property boundaries, so that the representation of free trade cannot be seen as complete.</p>	<p>The property also cannot reflect in a comprehensive fashion the contemporary character of Dubai as a trade city given that the key port and trade administration functions nowadays occur outside the property boundaries, so that the representation of free trade cannot be seen as complete.</p> <p><u>Delete the paragraph</u></p> <p><i>NB: Not true and irrelevant. The aim of the nomination is not to “reflect the contemporary character of Dubai as a trade city”, but to demonstrate the relevance and continuity of traditional trade in Dubai Creek until today as the material presence of a cultural tradition based upon the morphological ensemble of the creek, the quays and the souks.</i></p> <p><i>Dubai modern harbours and world scale trade and finance are certainly connected to the free trade cultural tradition but do not constitute the actual focus of the nomination. Besides, the original Custom buildings, as well as the Gold Souk, are actually located within the</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		<i>property and its buffer zone.</i>	
Page 84, column 2, line 39-45	ICOMOS also notes that the urban form and layout has been modified over recent decades by narrowing of the natural creek as result of land reclamations and the construction of the Baniyas Road, with the result that the areas between and around the property could no longer credibly communicate the potential Outstanding Universal Value of Khor Dubai in relation to urban form and layout as well as location and setting.	<p>ICOMOS also notes that the urban form and layout has been modified over recent decades by narrowing of the natural creek as result of land reclamations and the construction of the Baniyas Road. with the result that the areas between and around the property could no longer credibly communicate the potential Outstanding Universal Value of Khor Dubai in relation to urban form and layout as well as location and setting.</p> <p><i><u>NB:</u> To permit boat navigation, the creek has been dredged to increase its depth. The sand removed from the bottom was laid on the banks that were stabilized and regularized (cf. pictures p. 27 of the Nomination File). The deepened creek acquired a slightly reduced footprint, resulting from its continuous adaptation as an evolving traditional harbour. On part of the dredged sands were built the road and some construction used to establish activities intimately connected to trade: banks, hotels, the chamber of commerce of Dubai, and new areas for loading and unloading of goods. The creation of a road along part of the creek banks has not prevented their use of the banks for the harbour facilities. The functional and symbolic relationship between the creek and the historic souks is entirely preserved.</i></p>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 87, column 2, line 18-22	After a phase of fast pace development in the second half of the 20 th century, a policy change has created a stronger focus on identity and heritage, which generated desire to reconstruct the previously demolished quarters and create stronger protection for the few elements which survived.	<p>After a phase of fast pace development in the second half of the 20th century, a policy change has created a stronger focus on identity and heritage, which generated desire to reconstruct the previously demolished quarter of Shindagha and create stronger protection for the few elements which survived.</p> <p><i><u>NB:</u> There are no other “reconstructed neighbourhoods” in Dubai. It was the high symbolic and emotional attachment of the urban elites to this neighbourhood that permitted to counter and stop — unfortunately only after the bulldozers razed most of the historic buildings — the foreseen</i></p>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

		<i>development projects, and to launch instead the comprehensive and carefully implemented reconstruction campaign of Shindagha that is presented in detail in the Nomination File.</i>	
Page 87, column 2, line 23-25	Comprehensive reconstruction projects were launched in 1996 aimed at recreating previously demolished historical neighbourhoods	Comprehensive reconstruction projects were launched in 1996 aimed at recreating the previously demolished historical neighbourhood(s) of Shindagha. <i><u>NB:</u> This apparently minor “mistake” is in fact strongly misleading. It undermines the specificity of Shindagha reconstruction project presented instead as one of “previously demolished quarters”. More than just a “mistake”, it appears to be an intended false reading of the events, because there are no other reconstructed neighbourhoods in Dubai.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 86, column 2, lines 31-34	The management authorities aim at involving communities into the management processes, however, apart from the merchants in the two souks and the shipmen on the creek there is hardly a community.	The management authorities aim at involving communities into the management processes, and notably the merchants in the two souks and the shipmen on the creek. there is hardly a community. <i><u>NB:</u> The comment does not concern the harbour, but the existence of (or, better, the perceived “absence of”) a “traditional historic city”. However, the property is nominated as a “traditional merchants’ harbour”, focusing on the creek, its traditional morphology and its traditional trade practices. Dismissing the involvement of the merchants of the souks and of the shipmen of the creek is scientifically unacceptable. The involvement of these two communities in the management of the property is a very positive achievement and a major step for the long-term sustainability of the property.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

E POUR LA SOUMISSION S FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS SATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Érythrée

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Asmara : ville moderniste d'Afrique

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
45, 1, 20-25	Asmara, located on a plateau at the centre of the country, is the capital city of Eritrea. The nominated property encompasses the area of the city that resulted from subsequent phases of planning between 1893 and 1941, developed during the Italian colonial occupation . The property includes the urban layout of the city, which emerged from the different plans based mainly on an orthogonal grid but incorporating elements of a radial system, and a large number of buildings designed in the early modernist and rationalist architectural language of the fascist era. It also includes the indigenous unplanned neighbourhoods of Arbate Asmera and Abbashawel.	Asmara, located on a plateau in the centre of the country, is the capital city of Eritrea. The nominated property encompasses the area of the city that resulted from successive phases of planning during the Italian colonial occupation between 1885 and 1941 . The property includes the urban layout of the city, which emerged from the different plans based on an orthogonal grid and incorporating elements of a radial system and picturesque elements , and a large number of buildings designed in the early modernist and rationalist architectural language of the fascist era. It also includes the indigenous unplanned neighbourhoods of Arbate Asmera and Abbashawel.	ICOMOS considers these corrections to be editorial changes which do not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS referred to the planning phases, the SP refers to the Italian occupation.
45,2,100-105	The property nominated includes the Historic Perimeter of Asmara which emerged from the successive planning phases from 1893 until 1941 , when the town passed under British military administration, during World War II. It also includes the pre-existing settlement of Arbate Asmera and the indigenous quarter of Abbashawel.	The nominated property includes the Historic Perimeter of Asmara which emerged from the successive phases of planning during the Italian colonial occupation between 1885 and 1941 , when the town passed under British military administration, during World War II. It also includes the area formerly occupied by the pre-existing settlement of Arbate Asmera and the subsequent indigenous quarter of Abbashawel.	1) ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error. 2) ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence (see above). 3) ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
45,2,107-114	Asmara developed from the 1890's onwards as a military	The plateau of Asmara was occupied by the Italians in 1889, when it became	

	<p>outpost for the Italian colonial power, thanks to its strategic location at the centre of the colony. But it was soon to have better prospects: due to its fortunate geographical position, at 2,323m a.s.l. it enjoys a temperate climate and was free from malaria. Italians living in Eritrea subsequently preferred to reside in Asmara rather than in Massawa</p>	<p>an important military outpost due to its strategic location on the main caravan route from the coast to the hinterland. Located at 2,323m a.s.l. Asmara enjoys a temperate climate and therefore the Italians favoured it to the port of Massawa as the site of their future colonial capital</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p>
<p>45,2,115 Up to 46,1,3</p>	<p>The early settlement – the Campo Cintato – originated thanks to the building of Fort Baldissera. The position of the Campo Cintato with respect to the main route coming from Massawa and crossing the Asmara upland, to Fort Baldissera and Arbata Asmera, determined a polarity and an axis at the territorial scale that was confirmed in all subsequent development plans. The first plan of development dates back to 1902, although until 1908 most of the interventions in Asmara focussed on providing necessary infrastructure.</p>	<p>The early Italian settlement comprised the small military fort of Campo Cintato in the centre of the plateau and the much larger Fort Baldissera, marking its western boundary. Both were strategically located on the caravan route, which linked them to the indigenous settlement of Arbata Asmera, which marked the plateau’s eastern boundary, and the principal route to the coast. The ancient caravan route therefore determined the city’s main axis that was preserved in all subsequent development plans. The first plan of development dates back to 1902, although until 1908 most of the interventions in Asmara focussed on providing necessary infrastructure.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this is not a typing error.</p> <p>Both typings are allowed, although the one with single s is generally preferred.</p>
<p>46,1,11-15</p>	<p>The early military settlement also included a residential area for conscripted Eritreans who served in the Italian Army (known as askari) which used the local residential models of the hidmo (a square-plan-based dwelling) and of the agdo (a circular-plan-based dwelling).</p>	<p>The early military settlement also included a residential area for conscripted Eritreans who served in the Italian Army (known as askari) which used the local residential models of the hidmo (a rectangular-plan-based dwelling) and of the agdo (a circular-plan-based dwelling).</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
<p>46, 1, 17-22</p>	<p>The grid layout was delimited by two main parallel arterial streets: the Corso del Re (King’s Avenue, today’s Nakfa Street) and Via Regina (Queen’s Boulevard). On Corso del Re, which followed the same direction as the caravan route, a wide square – Piazza del Tribunale, later Piazza Roma – opened up: it functioned as the heart of city life. A garden with palm trees and a fountain adorned the square and buildings symbolic of the colonial power, such as the courthouse and the bank headquarters, overlooked it.</p>	<p>The grid layout was delimited by two main parallel arterial streets: the Corso del Re (King’s Avenue, today’s Nakfa Street) and Via Regina (Queen’s Boulevard). On Corso del Re, which followed the line of the caravan route, two civic squares were planned. One was Piazza Italia (Piazza Michele) and the other, at the western end, was Piazza del Tribunale, later Piazza Roma, which functioned as the civic heart of city life. A garden with palm trees and a fountain adorned the square and buildings symbolic of the colonial power, such as the courthouse and the bank headquarters, overlooked it. Behind the courthouse, a smaller square with the post office was</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>

	Behind the courthouse, a smaller square with the post office was created.	created.	
46, 1, 35	<p>The first organic plan for Asmara was issued in 1908, when its growth came to be regulated for the first time by an urban layout based on four zones, in conformity with ethnic segregation and functional programmes.</p> <p>The mixed zone corresponded to that of the market, eastward of the Campo Cintato, while the indigenous zone was located around the indigenous settlement. The industrial area was located at the periphery.</p>	<p>The first plan for Asmara was issued in 1908, when its growth came to be regulated for the first time by an urban layout based on four zones, in conformity with ethnic segregation and functional programmes.</p> <p>The mixed zone corresponded to that of the market, eastward of the Campo Cintato, while the indigenous zone was located around the indigenous settlement to the northeast. The industrial area was located on the northern periphery.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this is not a factual error.</p> <p>There were other plans before but the one in 1908 is considered the first mature/ comprehensive/ organic.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
46, 1 40-60	<p>With the city growing, a new plan was necessary. Odoardo Cavagnari was appointed to draw it up and the new Plan was ready in 1913. It confirmed the racial segregation of the previous plan and its orthogonal grid by adding two new East-West axes at the edge of the previous expansion: Corso Italia (today's Harnet Avenue) to the south, which superseded Corso del Re (today's Nakfa Street) as the focus of the urban development; and Viale Manzoni (today's Afabet Avenue) to the north. In the fascist decades, some of the most important buildings that gave Asmara its rationalist appearance grew up along these streets. Radiating from their furthest ends and taking into account the uneven geography of the plain, a system of diagonal streets was developed to expand the city and to locate the new allotments. The rigidity of the grid therefore came to a halt in the layout of three grand goose-feet, located at the corners of the triangle containing the early core of Asmara. With the increase in the number of inhabitants between the 1920's and the mid 1930's, the entire periphery of the city to the south-east, south-west and north-west came to assume</p>	<p>The city's steady growth throughout the 1910s necessitated a new plan. The city's chief engineer, Odoardo Cavagnari, was appointed to draw it up and the new plan was published in 1913. The orthogonal grid that defined the original civic centre and market area was framed by two new east-west axes: Corso Italia (today's Harnet Avenue) to the south, which superseded Corso del Re (today's Nakfa Street) as the city's principal thoroughfare; and Viale Manzoni (today's Afabet Avenue) to the north. From the mid-1930s, some of the largest buildings that gave Asmara its rationalist appearance were constructed along Harnet Avenue. Radiating from important intersections and taking into account the uneven geography of the plain, a system of diagonal streets was developed to expand the city and to locate the new allotments. With the increase in the number of inhabitants between the 1920s and the mid-1930s, the entire periphery of the city to the south-east, south-west and north-west came to assume the appearance of a large new residential quarter made up of two- or three-storey houses.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges these clarifications.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

	the appearance of a large new residential quarter made up of two- or three-storey houses.		
46, 2, 65	<p>The time was ripe for a new plan of expansion and in 1936 Vittorio Cafiero was charged with the task of developing a new regulatory plan for Asmara. His plan, completed in 1938, and accompanied by regulations still in existence today, focused on the reinforcement of the central axis between the Governor's Palace and the new railway station – thus shifting the representative areas of the town to the south – and the selective demolition of the oldest area. Cafiero conceived a new large indigenous quarter north of Abbashawel, which was intended to be transformed into a green belt. The plan should have been developed starting from the indigenous area while at the same time elaborating a detailed plan for the most representative parts of the city, such as those around the railway station and the old Governor's Palace. Cafiero integrated the previous street pattern conceived by Cavagnari into the new plan through a bypass, which linked the new residential quarters to the existing city.</p>	<p>Vittorio Cafiero was charged with developing a new regulatory plan for Asmara. His plan, completed in 1938, and accompanied by regulations still in existence today, focused on the reinforcement of the central axis between the Governor's Palace and the new railway station – thus shifting the representative areas of the city to the south – and the selective demolition of the oldest area. Cafiero conceived a new large indigenous quarter north of Abbashawel, which was intended to be transformed into a green belt.</p>	<p>ICOMOS does not consider this as a typing error.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p> <p>ICOMOS does not consider this as a typing error.</p>
46, 2, 83-97	<p>Before 1935, the architectural character of the buildings erected in Asmara was mainly eclectic in nature and many areas still retain their eclectic appearance. It was only after 1935, with the Italian invasion of Ethiopia, that Asmara underwent a large scale programme of construction following the Italian rationalist idiom of the time: governmental and other administrative edifices, residential and commercial buildings, churches, mosques, synagogues, cinemas, hotels and restaurants, factories and service stations, and sport facilities, were erected</p>	<p>Before 1935, the architectural character of the buildings erected in Asmara was mainly eclectic in nature and many areas still retain their eclectic appearance. It was only after 1935, with the Italian invasion of Ethiopia that Asmara underwent a large scale programme of construction following the Italian Rationalist idiom of the time: governmental and other administrative edifices, residential and commercial buildings, churches, mosques, synagogue, cinemas, hotels and restaurants, factories and service stations, and sport facilities, were erected following the most up-to-date designs, in an expression of architectural experimentation and creativity that could be expressed in a freer manner than in the</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial</p>

	following the most up-to-date design forms , in an expression of architectural experimentation and creativity that could be expressed in a freer manner than in the homeland, where architects were more directly subjected to ideological control .	homeland, where architects were more directly subjected to ideological constraints .	change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
46, 2, 117-123	Relying on the indigenous workforce and as a result of specific interests of rationalist architects in traditional forms and techniques, elements of local construction idioms and techniques were used to construct a number of buildings, which, although exhibiting rationalist forms, thanks to the local workforce make use of local workmanship, materials and techniques.	Relying on the indigenous workforce and as a result of specific interests of Rationalist architects in traditional forms and techniques, elements of local construction idioms and techniques were used to construct a number of buildings, which, although exhibiting Rationalist forms, thanks to the local workforce make use of local workmanship, materials and techniques. Heavily reliant on the indigenous workforce and on locally sourced materials, Asmara's modernist architecture possesses characteristics in form, material and construction technique that evidence their local and African context.	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
47, 1, 8-10	When the Italian colonial process began in 1890 , the existing settlement was no more than a large village; at the time the population would not have exceeded a few thousand.	when the Italians occupied the plateau of Asmara in 1889 , the existing settlement was no more than a large village; at the time the population would not have exceeded a few thousand.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
47, 1, 13-30	The first governmental decree aiming to give the centre of Asmara urban stature dates back to 1898. The relocation of the capital from Massawa to Asmara triggered architectural, infrastructural, and urban interventions, as well as public regulations and ordinary maintenance. In 1903, the first secular elementary school was inaugurated, and the market area near the Mosque was equipped with services and facilities, as well as the construction of the Governor's Palace, the opening of a few roads, and tree planting. The 1902 plan was not implemented and was superseded by another one in 1908 . The growth of the town required a new plan, outlined by Cavagnari in 1913 and subsequently amended in	The first governmental decree aiming to give the centre of Asmara urban stature dates from 1898. The relocation of the capital from Massawa to Asmara triggered architectural, infrastructural, and urban interventions, as well as public regulations and ordinary maintenance. In 1903, the first secular elementary school was inaugurated, and the market area near the Mosque was equipped with services and facilities, as well as the construction of the Governor's Palace, the opening of a few roads, and tree planting. The 1902 plan was not implemented and was superseded in 1908 . The growth of the town required a new plan, drafted by Cavagnari in 1913 and amended in 1916. In the 1920s, Asmara was a small town of no more than 18,000 inhabitants. However, by 1936 it had grown to 98,000, of which 53,000 were Italians. [No, by the late 1930s, the Italians resided far and wide.]	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence. See Nomination Dossier p. 40 " The comparatively unimaginative approach was superseded in the same year by another plan, drafted by the city's chief engineer, Odoardo Cavagnari (1868–1920) in Asmara's newly established Civil Engineering Office."

	<p>1916. In the 1920's, Asmara was a small town of no more than 18,000 inhabitants. However, by 1936 it had grown to 98,000, of which 53,000 were Italians, based in the area close to the older core, at the time occupied by military barracks.</p>		<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
47, 1, 32-39	<p>The new 1938 plan of Cafiero designed the expansion of the city and integrated the eclectic city that had developed since the early 1900's. Within a five-year timespan, between 1935 – when preparations for the war against Ethiopia began – and April 1941 – when Italy lost Eritrea to the British army – Asmara saw a dramatic increase in population and underwent an unprecedented urban development</p>	<p>The 1938 plan by Cafiero anticipated the expansion of the city and successfully integrated the eclectic city that had developed since the early 1900s. Within five years – from the invasion of Ethiopia in 1935 to April 1941 when Italy was defeated by the Allies – Asmara underwent an unprecedented urban development.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that the insertion of the word “successfully” represents advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p>
47, 1, 46-50	<p>The city changed little during the British presence and, subsequently, under Ethiopian rule, although a few public buildings, the American military base, and an unfinished stadium were built.</p>	<p>The city changed little during the British Military Administration (1941-1952), but was further expanded during the Ethiopian period under Haile Selassie (1952-1974), with new residential suburbs, such as Tiravolo, added to the Cafiero plan. The American military base, Kagnev Station, was a very significant presence, albeit largely isolated from the city, during this time. Under the communist Derg (1974-1991) Asmara experienced serious neglect and little was constructed.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
47, 1-2, 60-65	<p>In 1997, the Government of Eritrea, with the support of the World Bank, initiated the Cultural Assets Rehabilitation Project, with a mandate to document and preserve the character of Asmara, an initiative that continues today with the Asmara Heritage Project.</p>	<p>In 2001, the Government of Eritrea, with the support of the World Bank, initiated the Cultural Assets Rehabilitation Project (CARP). The documentation and preservation of the built environment was one of CARP's four key aims. The spirit of CARP continues today with the Asmara Heritage Project (AHP).</p>	<p>ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p>
48, 2, 84-91	<p>ICOMOS concurs with the State Party that the nominated property is an exceptionally well-preserved planned urban ensemble based on an orthogonal grid plan combined with diagonal axes,</p>	<p>ICOMOS concurs with the State Party that the nominated property is an exceptionally well-preserved planned urban ensemble based on the combination of orthogonal grid plan, radial axes and picturesque elements, characterized by a human scale, eclectic</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>

	characterised by a human scale, eclectic and rationalist built forms , well-defined open spaces, and public and private buildings, including cinemas, shops, banks, religious structures, public and private offices, industrial facilities, and residences.	and Rationalist architecture , well-defined open spaces, and public and private buildings, including cinemas, shops, banks, religious structures, public and private offices, industrial facilities, and residences.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
49, 1, 11-16	The urban layout of Asmara combines the more traditional orthogonal grid with the radial system , which was being explored in its functional and architectural potential by the emerging discipline of urban planning at the dawn of the 20 th century.	The urban layout of Asmara combines the conventional orthogonal grid with the radial axes and picturesque elements , which was being explored in its functional and architectural potential by the emerging discipline of urban planning at the dawn of the 20 th century.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. (idem, cf above)
50, 1, 10-19	ICOMOS considers that Asmara's urban layout and character, in combining the orthogonal grid with radial street patterns, integrating topographical features, taking into account local cultural conditions created by different ethnic and religious groups, and using the principle of zoning for achieving racial segregation and functional organisation, bears exceptional witness to the development of the new discipline of urban planning at the beginning of the 20 th century and its application in an African context to serve the Italian colonial agenda.	ICOMOS considers that Asmara's urban layout and character, in combining the orthogonal grid with radial street patterns and picturesque elements , integrating topographical features, taking into account local cultural conditions created by different ethnic and religious groups, and using the principle of zoning for achieving racial segregation and functional organisation, bears exceptional witness to the development of the new discipline of urban planning at the beginning of the 20 th century and its application in an African context to serve the Italian colonial agenda.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
50, 1, 52-59 and 50, 2, 60-73	The ensembles attest to the colonial power and to the presence of Coptic and Jewish communities in Asmaran society, with their institutional and religious places , the elements of the urban architecture (Harnet et Sematat Avenues; Mai Jah Jah Park ; the footpaths; the old plaques with traces of the street names), the buildings, complexes and facilities resulting from the 1930s programmes (the Post Office building at Senegyeti Avenue), the	The ensembles attest to the colonial power and to the presence of a strong and religiously diverse local civic society, with their institutions and religious sites , the elements of the urban architecture (Harnet and Sematat Avenues; Mai Jah Jah fountain ; the footpaths; the old plaques with traces of the street names), the buildings, complexes and facilities resulting from the 1930s programmes (the Post Office building at Segeneyti Street), the cinemas (Impero, Roma, Odeon, Capitol, and Hamasien), the schools, the sports facilities, the garages, the residential complexes and buildings, the villas, the commercial buildings, the factories (soap and textiles), the cores of the community quarters (e.g. the	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error. ICOMOS acknowledges

	<p>cinemas (Impero, Roma, Odeon, Capitol, Hamasien), the schools, the sports facilities, the garages, the residential complexes and buildings, the villas, the commercial buildings, the factories (soap and textiles), the cores of the community quarters (e.g. the Italian quarter, the Coptic quarter and the Muslim quarter). The major religious places, marking the landscape with bell-towers, towers, and minarets, and civil and military cemeteries, illustrate the diversity of the populations and of their rituals. The main trade route was also incorporated into the plan; the administrative area with ministerial buildings and the Governor's palace, the public markets, the service stations.</p>	<p>Italian quarter and the market area and the mosque quarter). The major religious places, marking the landscape with bell-towers, spires, and minarets, and civil and military cemeteries, illustrate the diversity of the populations and of their rituals. The main trade route was also incorporated into the plan; the administrative area with ministerial buildings and the Governor's palace, the public markets, and the service stations.</p>	<p>this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
50, 2, 90-91	<p>Especially to the infrastructure and the buildings, which all suffer from lack of maintenance.</p>	<p>Especially to the infrastructure and the buildings, the majority of which suffer from lack of maintenance.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p>
51, 1, 6-8	<p>The nominated property has a total area of 1,684 ha, which encompasses a property of 481 ha and a buffer zone of 1,203 ha.</p>	<p>The property along with its two layers of protection has an area of 1,684 ha, which encompasses a nominated property of 471 ha and a buffer zone of 1,213 ha.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken into account at this stage.</p> <p>At p. 25 of the nomination dossier the indicated size of the nominated property is 481ha and that of the buffer zone is 1,203ha.</p> <p>The boundaries have been modified by the SP in February 2017 to respond to ICOMOS suggestions, however no information was provided on the modified areas before 28 February 2017.</p>
54,2, 95-99	<p>Asmara is an exceptionally well-preserved planned urban ensemble based on an orthogonal grid plan combined with diagonal axes, characterised by a human scale, eclectic and rationalist</p>	<p>Asmara is an exceptionally well-preserved planned urban ensemble based on the combination of an orthogonal grid plan, radial axes and picturesque elements, characterised by a human scale, eclectic and Rationalist built forms, well-defined open spaces, and</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>Rationalist: ICOMOS acknowledges this typing</p>

	built forms, well-defined open spaces, and public and private buildings.	public and private buildings.	error.
55, 1, 9-19	This protection system dates back to the time when the city was planned and constructed and is essentially based on the <i>Regolamento Edilizio</i> 1938, which was issued at the time of Cafiero's plan and continued to be upheld through the decades; it was further complemented since Eritrea's independence by important protective measures that have ensured the preservation of the urban and built fabric and character of Asmara, first and foremost by the moratorium on high-rise buildings issued in 2001. Asmara's authorities should be praised for the efforts made for almost 20 years to protect the city.	This protection system dates back to the time when the city was planned and constructed and is essentially based on the <i>Regolamento Edilizio</i> 1938, which was issued at the time of Cafiero's plan and continued to be upheld through subsequent decades; it was further complemented since Eritrea's independence by important protective measures that have ensured the preservation of the urban and built fabric and character of Asmara, first and foremost by the moratorium on all new buildings issued in 2001. Asmara's authorities should be praised for the efforts made for almost 20 years to protect the city.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. At p. 485 of vol. 1 of the Nomination Dossier, it is written "moratorium on adverse construction"
55, 2, 66-86	Located on an upland plateau at the centre of Eritrea, Asmara, a Modernist city of Africa is the capital of the country and is an exceptionally well-preserved example of a colonial planned city, which resulted from the subsequent phases of planning between 1893 and 1941, under the Italian colonial occupation. Its urban layout is based mainly on an orthogonal grid which later integrated elements of a radial system. Asmara preserves an unusually intact human scale , featuring eclectic and rationalist built forms, well-defined open spaces, and public and private buildings, including cinemas, shops, banks, religious structures, public and private offices, industrial facilities, and residences. Altogether, Asmara's urban-scape outstandingly conveys how colonial planning, based on functional and racial segregation principles, was applied and adapted to the local geographical conditions to achieve symbolic messages and functional requirements. The town has come to be associated with the struggle of the Eritrean people for self-	Located on a highland plateau at the centre of Eritrea, the modernist city of Asmara is the nation's capital and is an exceptionally well-preserved example of a colonial planned city, developed under the Italian occupation from 1889-1941. Its urban layout is based on the combination of an orthogonal grid, radial axes and picturesque elements . Asmara preserves an unusually intact and well-defined combination of open spaces and eclectic and Rationalist built forms, defined by public and private buildings, including cinemas, shops, banks, religious structures, public and private offices, industrial facilities, and residences. Altogether, Asmara's urban landscape outstandingly conveys how colonial planning, based on functional and racial segregation principles, was applied and adapted to the local geographical conditions to achieve symbolic meaning and address functional requirements. The town has come to be associated with the struggle of the Eritrean people for self-determination, which was pursued whilst embracing the tangible, yet exceptional, evidence of their colonial past.	ICOMOS acknowledge this clarification. ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS focused on the planning phases. ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence. ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.

	determination, which was pursued whilst embracing the tangible, yet exceptional, evidence of their colonial past.		
55, 2, 93-122	<p>These spaces and use patterns also bear witness to interchange and cultural assimilation of successive encounters with different cultures as well as to the role played by Asmara in building people identity that also allowed for early efforts for its preservation.</p> <p>Asmara's urban layout with its different patterns associated to the planning phases, illustrates the adaptation of the modern urban planning and architectural models to local cultural and geographical conditions. The ensembles attesting to the colonial power and to the presence of the copt, jewish communities of the Asmaran society, with their institutional and religious places, the elements of the urban architecture (Harnet et Sematat avenues; Mai Jah Jah park; the walking paths; the old plaques with traces of the street names), the buildings, complexes and facilities resulting from the 1930s programmes (the post office building at Senegyeti avenue) the cinemas (Impero, Roma, Odeon, Capitol, Hamasien) the schools, the sport facilities, the garages, the residential complexes and buildings, the villas, the commercial buildings, the factories (soap and textiles); the cores of the community quarters (e.g. the Italian quarter, the Copt quarter and the Muslim quarter). The major cult places, marking the landscape with bell-towers, towers, and minarets, civil and military cemeteries illustrate the diversity of the populations and of their rituals. The main trade route which has been incorporated into the plan, the Capitol area with ministerial</p>	<p>These spaces and use patterns also bear witness to the interchange and cultural assimilation of successive encounters with different cultures as well as to the role played by Asmara in building a collective identity that was later instrumental in motivating early efforts for its preservation. Asmara's urban layout with its different patterns associated to the planning phases, illustrates the adaptation of the modern urban planning and architectural models to local cultural and geographical conditions. The ensembles attesting to the colonial power and to the presence of a strong and religiously diverse local civic society, with their institutional and religious places, the elements of the urban architecture the buildings, complexes and facilities resulting from the 1930s programmes (the post office building at Segeneyti Street) the cinemas (Impero, Roma, Odeon, Capitol, and Hamasien) the schools, the sports facilities, the garages, the residential complexes and buildings, the villas, the commercial buildings, the factories; the cores of the community quarters (e.g. the Italian quarter and market square and mosque square). The major religious buildings, marking the landscape with bell-towers, spires, and minarets, and the civil and military cemeteries which illustrate the diversity of the populations and of their rituals.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that what has been removed reflects a difference of opinion between ICOMOS and the State Party.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledge this correction as a factual error.</p>

	buildings and the governor palace, the public markets, the service stations.		
56, 1, 1-18	<p>Criterion (ii): Asmara, a Modernist City of Africa represents an outstanding example of the transposition and materialization of ideas about planning that developed in Europe and North America, in the multi-confessional African context and were used for functional and segregation purposes; the adaptation to the local context is reflected in the urban distribution and functional zoning, and in the architectural forms, which, although expressing a modernist and rationalist idiom, borrowed morphologies, construction methods, local materials combined with imported ones, as well as the use of local skills and workforce. The way in which Asmara came into being contributed to Eritreans' particular response to the tangible legacies of their colonial past. Despite the evidence of its colonial imprint, Asmara has been incorporated into the Eritrean identity and struggle for self-determination and has been the object of early efforts for its protection.</p>	<p>Criterion (ii): Asmara, Africa's modernist city represents an outstanding example of the transposition and materialization of ideas about planning, in a n African context and were used for functional and segregation purposes; the adaptation to the local context is reflected in the urban layout and functional zoning, and in the architectural forms, which, although expressing a modernist and Rationalist idiom and exploited modern materials and techniques, also relied on and borrowed heavily from local morphologies, construction methods, materials, skills and labour. Asmara's creation and development contributed significantly to Eritrea's particular response to the tangible legacies of their colonial past. Despite the evidence of its colonial imprint, Asmara has been incorporated into the Eritrean identity, acquiring important meaning during the struggle for self-determination that motivated early efforts for its protection.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p> <p>ICOMOS acknowledges all the following clarifications.</p>
56, 1, 20-38	<p>Criterion (iv): Asmara's urban layout and character, in combining the orthogonal grid with radial street patterns, integrating topographical features, taking into account local cultural conditions created by different ethnic and religious groups, and using the principle of zoning for achieving racial segregation and functional organisation, bears exceptional witness to the development of the new discipline of urban planning at the beginning of the 20th century and its application in an African context, to serve the Italian colonial agenda. This hybrid plan, that combined the functional approach of the grid with the search for the</p>	<p>Criterion (iv): Asmara's urban layout and character, in combining the orthogonal grid, radial street patterns and picturesque elements, integrating topographical features, taking into account local cultural conditions created by different ethnic and religious groups, and using the principle of zoning for achieving racial segregation and functional organisation, bears exceptional witness to the development of the new discipline of urban planning at the beginning of the 20th century and its application in an African context, to serve the Italian colonial agenda. This hybrid plan, that combined the functional approach of the grid with the picturesque and the creation of scenic spaces, vistas, civic plaza and monumental places, served the functional, civic and symbolic requirements for a colonial capital. The</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.</p>

	<p>picturesque and the creation of scenic spaces, vistas, civic plaza and monumental places, served the functional, civic and symbolic requirements for a colonial capital. The architecture of Asmara complements the plan and forms a coherent whole, although reflecting eclecticism and rationalist idioms, and is one of the most complete and intact collections of modernist/rationalist architecture in the world.</p>	<p>architecture of Asmara complements the plan and forms a coherent whole, although reflecting eclecticism and Rationalist idioms, and is one of the most complete and intact collections of modernist/Rationalist architecture in the world.</p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.</p>
<p>57, 1,33</p>	<p>Moreover, ICOMOS recommends that the name of the property be modified to become: “Asmara: a Modernist City of Africa”.</p>	<p>Thank you for your recommendation that the name of the property been modified: “Asmara: a Modernist City of Africa” rather than “Asmara: Africa’s Modernist city”. The State Party noted ICOMOS’s reservations about the original title at the meeting in Paris last November.</p> <p>The State Party acknowledges the concerns but wish to respectfully reiterate that there was no intent to imply exclusivity in the original title. “Africa’s Modernist City” doesn’t mean, nor does it intend to mean, Asmara is the only modernist city in Africa (despite the fact that, as the additional comparative analysis argues, it is in fact the most complete modernist city in Africa), but rather it was intended to emphasizes the counter narrative to the more widely known examples of European or North American modernism: Asmara is Africa’s modernist city.</p> <p>“A Modernist city of Africa’ downplays this significance considerably and suggests that Asmara is one of many different modernist cities in Africa and elsewhere. Although Asmara’s nomination was not based on its uniqueness, it is fair to say that the authenticity and integrity are unique in an African context, and perhaps even globally too, where development rather than preservation has had a negative impact.</p> <p>Finally, on the point of syntax, brevity is also preferable and the state part feels that a four word title is clearer</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		and more eloquent than six words. We sincerely hope you agree with our recommendations and thank you in advance for your consideration.	
--	--	--	--

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Géorgie

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Monastère de Ghélati

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 6, Column 2, Paragraph 5	The main church of the monastery, the Church of the Nativity of the Virgin, is flanked by the Church of St George to the west , with the two-storeyed Church of St Nicholas and the Academy building behind it .	The main church of the monastery, the Church of the Nativity of the Virgin, is flanked by the Church of St George to the East and with the two-storeyed Church of St Nicholas and the Academy building to the West .	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 6, Column 2, Paragraph 6	King David's tomb is in the south porch which was the original entrance	<i>The sentence is out of context and should be deleted here</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 7, Column 1, Paragraph 3	They include more than 40 portraits of kings, queens, and high clerics and are unparalleled in Georgia	They include more than 40 portraits of kings, queens, and high clerics and are unparalleled in Georgia. Among them is the only preserved portrait of King David the Builder himself.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 7, Column 1, Paragraph 5	While Georgian mural paintings show influences from Byzantine style, during their peak in the 11-13th centuries a unique Georgian hagiography emerged that diverged from Byzantine forms.	While Georgian mural paintings show influences from Byzantine style, during their peak in the 11-13th centuries a unique Georgian iconography emerged that diverged from Byzantine forms.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 7, Column 2, Paragraph 4	Within the four hectares monastic enclosure are royal graves , reflecting the monastery's role as a burial place for the Georgian Royal family.	In the main church and its chapels, there are graves of Georgian kings and queens , reflecting the monastery's role as a burial place for the Georgian Royal family.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

Page 7, Column 2, between paragraphs 4 and 5	<i>A paragraph should be added</i>	The monastery is enclosed by a wall circuit that has two gates. The smaller one on the North-Eastern side has served as the main entrance to the monastery ever since the 17th century. Originally, however, the road led to the Southern gate that dates to the early years of the monastery. The gate contains the grave of king David the Builder.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 7, Column 2, Paragraph 6	Christianity became established in Georgia as early as 1st century when it was adopted as the state religion in what was then Iberia (East Georgia).	Christianity was spread in Georgia as early as 1st century. Around 300 , it was adopted as the state religion in what was then Iberia (East Georgia).	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 7, Column 2, Paragraph 7	He moved his capital to Kutaisi, (in the centre of what is now Georgia) an ancient city reputed by the Greeks to be the final destination of the Argonauts and the residence of the legendary Colchian King Aeëtes.	He moved his capital to Kutaisi, (in the centre of what is now West Georgia) an ancient city reputed by the Greeks to be the final destination of the Argonauts and the residence of the legendary Colchian King Aeëtes.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 8, Column 2, Paragraph 2	The cross-in-square plan and multi-domed form developed in East Georgia in the 10th and 11th centuries. It can be seen in the Cathedral of Bichvinta (now in Abkhazia) which was built by King David III in the 10th century and may have influenced Gelati. At Gelati, though, the unusual width of the main dome of the main church and the abundance of light in the interior recall middle Byzantine churches and reflect its royal status.	The cross-in-square plan developed in East Georgia in the 10th and 11th centuries. It can be seen in the Cathedral of Bichvinta (in Abkhazia) which was built in the 10th century and may have influenced Gelati. At Gelati, though, the unusual width of the dome of the main church and the abundance of light in the interior recall middle Byzantine churches and reflect its royal status.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 9, Column 2, Paragraph 9	At the time of inscription, in 1994, the Academy building was a roofless ruin .	At the time of inscription, in 1994, the Academy building was standing roofless . The building was conserved to a certain degree in the 1960-ies, 1980-ies and all the structure, including masonry walls with gables and most of the cornices have survived in its authentic form up to date. Even though the building has significantly damaged, it was not a ruin per se.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 9, Column	In 2009 the upper parts of the ruin's walls were	In 2009 the upper parts of the Academy's walls were	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

2, Paragraph 9	rebuilt , a new wooden roof constructed and the interiors re-shaped.	restored, an anti-seismic belt arranged to base timber beams and rafters on it , and a new wooden roof constructed. The roof is reversible. No rebuilding has taken place during the rehabilitation works.	
	the work has not been undertaken on the basis of evidence of what existed before it became a ruin.	The rehabilitation design was based on the results of archaeological investigation as well as of architectural historical research. The rehabilitation project design was preceded by the art-historical research. One of the factual evidences, leading to the decision on the shape of the roof, apart from the existing building structure with the preserved gables, was an historical engraving by the Swiss traveler Diubua De Monpere from 1833 that gives detailed view of the Academy building before the collapse of the roof. Furthermore, the detailed archaeological investigations of the interior of the Academy did not reveal any evidence, e.g. column basements, arched stones, etc., that would suggest the different shape of the roof. Therefore, taking into account the need for preservation of the building and restoring its public function, it was decided to install the light and reversible wooden roof structure, with the ceramic tile cover. The tiles were discovered during the archaeological works and therefore were suggested as most appropriate roof cover based on factual evidence.	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 10, Column 1, Paragraph 1	There has thus been some loss of authenticity for this important element of the monastery	<i>The sentence should be deleted as it is factually irrelevant as stated in the comments given in this document</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 10, Column 1 Paragraph 2	“ICOMOS considers that overall the conditions of integrity and authenticity have been met, although authenticity has been to a degree weakened by the re-building of the Academy , and is vulnerable due to the	<i>The academy:</i> The restoration of the roofing of the Academy was assessed positively by the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory Mission on Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery on 15-17 March	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.

	<p>fragility of some of the wall paintings”.</p>	<p>2010. The Mission Report refers to the intervention in the section Positive Measures in the Assessment of the State of Conservation of the Property.</p> <p>The intervention includes a reversible wooden structure on the existing masonry walls and does not deal with rebuilding of the masonry. As mentioned in the Boundary Modification Dossier, the roofing of the Academy was based on a thorough study of the preserved wall pockets and gables, in order to prevent deterioration of the building. The roof is completely reversible.</p> <p>Thus, it would be preferable to reconsider the assessment of the Academy given in the report taking into account the Advisory Mission Report of 2011.</p> <p><i>The wall paintings:</i></p> <p>Some of the wall paintings in the main church are indeed fragile. Some urgent conservation works have been carried out in 2010. The information about the works are included in the State of Conservation Report provided to the World Heritage Centre in January 2011. Further conservation works are to be continued. Negotiations on possible funding is led by the NACHPG</p> <p>V</p> <p>2017.</p>	
<p>P.11 Column 1 Paragraph 3</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that the main threats to the property are potential inadequately regulated development in the buffer zone and uncontrolled tourism pressures and the main vulnerability is the lack of formal registration of the Patriarchate’s land rights.</p>	<p>The measures for the regulation of the potential developments within the buffer zone, as well as rules for its management are proposed in the Management Plan for the Gelati Monastery WHS.</p> <p>The National legislation (law on Cultural Heritage, 2007 art. 36¹) sets the regulations for visual and physical protection of the listed buildings. The current buffer zone of the property has been based on the enlargement of the standard 1 km Visual</p>	<p>ICOMOS summarises the potential threats in this section and goes on to say how they are to be addressed in subsequent sections on legal protection and management.</p>

		<p>Protection Area by the Decree of the Minister of Culture and Monuments protection #03/5 09.01.2014.</p> <p>Within the framework of the Management Plan, a special Visitor Management Programme has been developed that deals with the threats of uncontrolled tourism pressure</p>	
	<p>What has still not been assured are adequate resources for long-term programmes of restoration for the fabric of the monastery and its mural paintings</p>	<p><i>The Gelati Monastery Conservation Master Plan, submitted to the WHC in 2010, remains the guiding document for implementing and planning the long-term rehabilitation and conservation of the property. In 2015 the Conservation Master Plan was updated to reflect new realities and meet current and future needs of the monastery complex. In addition, 5-year action plan for archaeological surveys was prepared within the Conservation Master Plan. The archaeologically sensitive areas within Gelati monastery complex are clearly marked and protection secured.</i></p> <p><i>In 2010-2017 the State Party implemented step by step rehabilitation of the Gelati monastery complex based on the comprehensive studies in cooperation with different international institutions and donors in conformity with the Conservation master Plan.</i></p> <p><i>The long term state funding for cultural heritage and the World Heritage sites is ensured by the Culture Strategy 2025 approved by the Government. This together with the Georgian legal framework provides the basis for continued and sustainable funding of the Gelati Monastery conservation works.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
<p>p.13 column 1 paragraph 1</p>	<p>The new revisions to the Conservation Master Plan now suggest an area within the wall of the monastery, based on recent archaeological surveys. No details are provided as to the extent of new buildings or the number of monks for whom the</p>	<p>The new revisions to the Conservation Master Plan now suggest an area within the wall of the monastery, based on recent archaeological surveys. Even though the State has not declared intentions for the extension of the Monastery, in case such intentions emerge, all</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.</p>

	<p>facilities will be provided.</p>	<p>necessary documentation shall be submitted to the WHC according to the paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.</p> <p><i>As at this stage there are no needs or intentions for increasing number of Monks in the Monastery, no further documentation or proposal has been elaborated; All the project documentation are provided to the WHC and Advisory Bodies prior to implementation and also in the reporting phase</i></p>	
<p>p.13 column 1 paragraph 3</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that financial and institutional support for essential conservation and restoration work on roofs and wall paintings is urgently needed in order to allow a sustained work on both. Allied to this urgent work is the need for a programme to address restoration of stone facades and provision of adequate services.</p>	<p><i>Should be deleted.</i></p> <p>As evident from the SoC reports over the last decade the state funding for conservation of Gelati Monastery has been stable and will remain so in the forthcoming years. As states above the legal and institutional framework, including the Culture Strategy 2025, ensures the continued and sustainable funding of the conservation activities for Gelati Monastery.</p> <p>The international fund-raising also remains as a funding source to the site</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
<p>P 14 Column 1 Paragraph 7</p>	<p>Recently, a Memorandum on Collaboration on Cultural Heritage Issues between the Georgian Apostolic Autocephaly Orthodox Church and the Ministry of Culture and Monument Protection of Georgia has been signed. It concerns all properties of the church. Nevertheless, it seems that an unresolved management conflict still exists. It is essential that clarification is provided of procedures and specific responsibilities for the special case of Gelati Monastery.</p>	<p>Recently, a Memorandum on Collaboration on Cultural Heritage Issues between the Georgian Apostolic Autocephaly Orthodox Church and the Ministry of Culture and Monument Protection of Georgia has been signed. It concerns all properties of the church. It is essential that clarification is provided of procedures and specific responsibilities for the special case of Gelati Monastery.</p> <p>Joint Heritage Council of the NACHPG and the Patriarchate of Georgia established by the Memorandum ensures the coordination in decision making on conservation of the religious properties including the Gelati Monastery.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this re-iterate arguments put forward in the supplementary material that have been fully considered.</p>
<p>p.16 column 1</p>	<p>The one area where there is some loss of authenticity is in the</p>	<p>Should be deleted</p> <p>The restoration of the roofing of the Academy was assessed</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

<p>paragraph 3</p>	<p>Academy building which was roofless in 1994 at the time of inscription as part of the series, but re-roofed and the interiors re-shaped in 2009.</p>	<p>positively by the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM Advisory Mission on Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery on 15-17 March 2010. The Mission Report refers to the intervention in the section Positive Measures in the Assessment of the State of Conservation of the Property.</p>	
<p>p.16 column 1 paragraph 5</p>	<p>Conservation work is guided by the Conservation Master Plan, produced by the Ministry of Culture, Monuments Protection and Sports of Georgia in collaboration with the Orthodox Church of Georgia. This plan covers conservation of the built structures as well as proposals to support the revival of monastic life that started in the 1990s and the needs of visitors. Adequate resources for long-term conservation programmes still need to be assured.</p>	<p>Conservation work is guided by the Conservation Master Plan, produced by the Ministry of Culture, Monuments Protection and Sports of Georgia in collaboration with the Orthodox Church of Georgia. This plan covers conservation of the built structures as well as proposals to support the revival of monastic life that started in the 1990s and the needs of visitors. The State should sustain targeted funding for long-term conservation of the site</p> <p>The state funding for conservation of Gelati Monastery has been stable over the last decade and will remain so in the forthcoming years. Along with this, the international fund-raising continues to ensure necessary funds to the site.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this re-iterate arguments put forward in the supplementary material that have been fully considered.</p>

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Inde

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Ville historique d'Ahmedabad

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page117 RC Para-2 Lines 1 to 6	ICOMOS notes some issues that compromise the integrity of the property . For example, high rise concrete blocks have been constructed east and north of Bhadra Fort, raising questions about the effectiveness of the protection of historic sites listed by the Archaeological Survey of India (ASI) .	<p>These are State owned buildings which have come up between 60s and 70s of the last century. The ASI's restrictive regulations, though came in 1992, its effective implementation began after the issue of notification of Amendment And Validation Act, in 2010 under the provisions of Ancient monuments and Archaeological sites and Remains Act, 1958.</p> <p>Since 2010, it has been made mandatory to obtain NOC from National Monument Authority (GoI), to undertake any repairs or new construction within the prohibited/ regulated areas of the protected monuments.</p> <p>In a recent amendment to ASI Act, approved by the National Parliament, this restriction of development within 100 metres is modified and now does not apply to construction/modifications/additions to Public buildings. Please refer Annexure Volume 01 submitted in the main dossier for ASI and other relevant Acts.</p>	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.
Page-120 RC Para-2 Line 5to9	At the western boundary of the property, the strip of land between the western city walls and the bank of the Sabarmati River is outside the property boundary . This has historically been an integral part of city life and the connection between the city and	The strip of land mentioned here on western side of the historic city was actually a part of the riverbed in earlier times and the river extended up to the western fort line. The Property boundary also follows the Fort wall profile as on other sides in order to define the historic city-	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate justification put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

	the river.	walled city. The Revised map attached for the property boundary and the boundary of buffer zone in the Dossier clearly mentions this.	
Page-121 LC/RC Para-7 Line 5to11	<p>The legal protection of the remaining valuable buildings and the entire urban fabric of the walled city is incomplete and needs to be put into effect.</p> <p>Because these buildings and areas are central to the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property, ICOMOS concludes that the required legal protection is not fully in place at this stage.</p>	<p>Legal protection instruments for all of the buildings within the historic city is in place in the form of heritage regulations and General development control Regulations as stated in the nomination dossier.</p> <p>These are already protected by AMC as explained in the earlier Additional Information Reports. Also please see the documents submitted in Annexure Volume 01 which lists all the legal documents in force.</p>	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : République islamique d'Iran

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Ville historique de Yazd

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
129 - 1- 38	In addition ICOMOS has noted some important discrepancies between the maps provided by the State Party, and the situation on the ground, Especially for the shops facing Imam Khomeini street which are mostly new but are indicated on the maps as being historic buildings. Also in the Zoroastrian component, new houses are indicated on the maps as historic buildings.	Unfortunately ICOMOS has not taken into consideration relevant documents, additional information and maps which refer to this subject. Imam Khomeini Street, all of its related shops and its structure were constructed about eighty years ago during the reign of Pahlavi I. Obviously this era is regarded as an important part of the Iranian history and plays a major role in the history of Iranian architecture and urban planning in various cities of Iran including Yazd. Facades of only a few these shops have been repaired with modern construction materials before being added to the national list of registered monuments and thus coming under heritage regulations. Nevertheless the general structure of the shops is completely historic. In the Description section of the nominated dossier (page 115), a prototype of their plan has been presented and a full discussion has been provided in the section about the historical development process of the street on pages 201-203 of the dossier. Annexed are some general views of the present condition of Imam Khomeini Street for clarification purposes.	ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.

		<p>Regarding the Zoroastrian district, it can be said that this is the most integrated and intact urban neighborhood of Iran in which only the Zoroastrian minority lives. Also it is the most populated Zoroastrian community of the world and enjoys a high rank in practicing religious ceremonies of Zoroastrians the world over. Therefore it has prominent values concerning tangible and intangible heritage. As a result it has been included in the nominated property in order to contribute more to its OUV. The entire structure of the district is integrated and historical with only a few of its buildings suffering erosion and damage in the course of time. At present these buildings have undergone renovation providing service functions such as: hostel for pilgrims, day care center, senior citizens' center, library, Zoroastrian archives and museum.</p> <p>Please correct this text as:</p> <p>Construction of Imam Khomeini Street goes back to the first Pahlavi era, almost eighty years ago, a period considered as an important part of the history of the city. Furthermore all of the shops related to this street are historic, except a few which had their facades renovated but the overall structure of streets and shops are all historic.</p>	
--	--	---	--

<p>130- 1-19</p>	<p>ICOMOS agree that Yazd demonstrates the use of construction systems and techniques to cope with the environmental conditions. However, no evidence was presented to support these as millennia-long traditions. ICOMOS does not consider that the arguments concerning “Qanat Civilization” are supported or appropriate, and note that this was not used previously for other qanat properties inscribed on the world heritage list.</p>	<p>It seems that there is misunderstanding about concepts and role of different techniques in construction of Yazd city and cope with the environmental conditions.</p> <p>As it is mentioned in the Nomination dossier of the Persian Qanat (Criteria, III, IV, 2016) the city of Yazd has been founded based on the notion, methods and technology of water usage in desert regions. Historical evidences and archaeological studies of the sites related to Qanat of Zarch show that this tradition dates back at least to thousand years ago. The issue here is not only concerned with qanat civilization but also with the way the technology is being utilized of technology usage, the necessity and circumstances of function. Ancient monuments of Yazd built on Qantas indicate a cultural tradition dating back to thousands of years ago. Monuments discovered during archaeological studies conducted on Friday mosques of Yazd and Fahraj (the 1st and 2nd centuries of the Islamic Era) prove that these mosques were built on relevant qanats. Also according to archaeological studies carried out in Sareyazd and based on historical researches mentioned in pages 170 and 171, it can be claimed that no sign of Yazd had been existent before the construction of Zarch and Vaghf-abad qanats. As a matter of fact, hundreds of qanats have been built upon these two qanats after the formation of the initial nucleus of Yazd depicting the continuance of a cultural tradition. The subject of qanat civilization has been fully discussed in the Qanat nomination dossier, in page 68 and in pages 16 & 17 of additional information of the dossier. Therefore please change this text as: Archaeological studies on the two historical Qanats of the city and monuments that from thousand years ago were affecting the formation and the main core of the city, confirms the qanat civilization in Yazd.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
-------------------------	--	--	---

<p>130- 2-54</p>	<p>The State party identifies development pressures affecting the nominated property, including the commercial use of historic buildings and the creation of parking lots, especially in commercial streets. The need to provide infrastructure and services to the residents is a source of new development proposals.</p> <p>Pressures that affect the quality of new buildings and repairs to historic buildings occur because of easy availability and use of non-local and modern building materials and contemporary building systems, and the lack of a skilled workforce. In some instances, the construction of modern buildings is causing some loss of character, particularly within the buffer zone.</p>	<p>It was mentioned in the nomination dossier that the nominated property include the area of the city which is particularly during the last 50 years could survive from modern reconstructions and development activities. Also since 2005 that Yazd historic city was registered on the national heritage list, all conservation and restoration operations were under the supervision of ICHHTO. (Nomination dossier, Conservation, page 249)</p> <p>The entire 900-hectares area of the historic fabric of Yazd City has been registered as no.15000 in the list of national monuments of Iran and is subject to special regulations for historic cities. Therefore since its addition to the national list, it has been under strict control of the existing rules. Also there are cases outside this area breaching height regulations. As a result their height will be gradually adjusted according to long-term programs of the management plan. But the cases mentioned in ICOMOS report are very few. At present usage of modern construction materials is rare particularly after the city was enlisted as a national heritage. Most of these cases are outside the nominated property because within the nominated property, regulations are strictly enforced. Additionally after informing the residents and raising public awareness, local people have voluntarily resorted to use traditional earthen construction materials at an increasing rate. Among architectural characteristics of Yazd are presence of traditional master workers and usage of traditional construction techniques in the city. These master workers not only give advice and guidance to other historical buildings or cities but also participate in their projects.</p> <p>Please correct this text as:</p> <p>In the nominated property, the traditional knowledge is applied and the implementation and regulation is under control. Through the proposed buffer zone of the historic city of Yazd, combination of traditional knowledge and modern engineering that gradually created by management plan and it will be understandable by engineers, is applied. Traditional craftsmen in Yazd, not only in the Yazd, but also contribute all over the Iran regarding traditional architecture and its techniques, and traditional knowledge in architecture is continues in the city of Yazd.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that the corrections re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier that have been fully considered.</p>
------------------	--	---	--

<p>132- 1-31</p>	<p>ICOMOS notes that the nominated property enjoys the highest level of protection as a historic city on the national list through cultural heritage legislation and planning tools According to the Master Plan of Yazd City (2016), the heights of buildings are determined by the number of storeys rather than by measurements: one storey for buildings in the nominated components , and 1-2 storeys for buildings in the buffer zone However, ICOMOS notes that there is some confusion in the submitted plans as the heights of some buildings are marked as one-storey high but these are actually one storey above the ground floor (ie. two storeys).</p>	<p>According to urban planning regulations and architectural tradition of Iran, the basement is not considered as a storey of a building so storeys begin from level 0.0 of the ground. In buildings with basement constructed observing urban planning regulations, “storeys” have been clearly marked on the plan. Therefore the submitted plans are accurate and without discrepancies. All the historic buildings of the historic city of Yazd are 1- or 2- storied (mostly one). Therefore enforcement of regulations for new constructions must take into account the height of existing historical buildings. In other words, the height of new structures must be exactly equal to the height of its adjacent old structure not a little lower or higher so that the skyline and visual integrity are preserved. But because of the different height of historical buildings which varies between 4 to 5.5 meters, no constant number can be set as the standard height. This way the height of each individual building must be adjusted equal to its neighboring building. This has been pointed out in the section on regulations and is generally comprehensible. Moreover, confirmation of ICHHTO for plans of individual cases is necessary and a supervision team operating in the Historical City of Yazd Base regularly controls and monitors all cases at hand.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage.</p>
-------------------------	---	---	--

<p>134- 1-33</p>	<p>ICOMOS has identified a few issues with the delineation of the boundaries of the central and southern components (particularly the Zoroastrian district). Currently; they are not adequate as they include buildings that do not support the nomination while excluding significant buildings. The delineation of the buffer zone could be adjusted to provide enhanced protection to the setting of the Dolat-abad garden which is currently exposed to development pressures.</p>	<p>Buildings standing within the Zoroastrian district are those which are owned by this religious minority. These buildings have complementary and religious functions in the neighborhood such as: day care center, centers for aged-people, hostels for pilgrims, museum, library (which is a specialized one for Zoroastrians) and/or places used for religious instruction of Zoroastrians. These buildings boast tangible and intangible values contributing to the OUV. Despite the fact that a few significant buildings also stand within the buffer zone, it is not possible to add them to the nominated property because for this to happen the whole neighborhood must be added to the nominated property. Of course more prominent examples of them have already been added to the buffer zone. Addition of single buildings will result in several problems for an integrated management; for example it causes confusion in the public understanding about buffer zone and property boundaries going through alleys, streets and big units. Considering Dolat-abad Garden which is a component of the Persian Garden on the world heritage list (Criteria I, II,III,IV,VI 2010), an exact delineation confirmed by ICOMOS and the World Heritage Committee has been fully included in the dossier and according to relevant regulations no development pressure exists within the area. Also rest of the area is controlled within the framework of regulations of the master plan for Yazd city. Therefore Please remove this sentence about development pressures for Dolat-abad Garden.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
-------------------------	---	---	---

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Japon

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Île sacrée d'Okinoshima et sites associés de la région de Munakata

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 136, Column 1, Line 8	Located 50 km off...	Located 60 km off... <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 136, Column 2, Line 50	, which is located some 50 km off ...	, which is located some 60 km off ... <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 137, Column 1, Line 1	: no women are allowed on the island,	: no one except the priests of Munakata Grand Shrine is allowed on the island, <i>Just clarification.</i>	ICOMOS accepts this as a clarification. However, ICOMOS notes that while men are exceptionally accepted, this does not seem the case for women, who are not allowed in any circumstances.
Page 137, Column 1, Line 30	On the northern part of the island is preserved a primeval forest	On the other part of the island is preserved a primeval forest <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 137, Column 1, Line 47	Okistu-miya	Okitsu-miya <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 137, Column 1, Line 52	on land which was once part of a small sea islet.	on land which was once facing a sea inlet. <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 137, Column 2, Line 7	However, no details about archaeological excavations and studies are illustrated.	Details about archaeological excavations and studies are illustrated in Appendix 3 of the nomination dossier, Additional Information 14/11/2016 and Additional Information 28/02/2017. <i>See Annex 1 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.

Page 137, Column 2, Line 15	Shimbary -Nuyama Mounded Tombs	Shimbaru -Nuyama Mounded Tomb Group <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 137, Column 2, Line 17	on a plateau overlooking the sea islet and with a visual connection with Okinoshima.	on a plateau overlooking the sea inlet and with a visual connection with Okinoshima. <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 137, Column 2, Line 50	Three different early maritime routes have been identified through archaeological investigations.	Three different early maritime routes have been identified through archaeological investigations and by documentary sources. <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 138, Column 1, Line 47	From the late 9th century onwards, archaeological investigations have confirmed that rituals on Okinoshima were no longer performed.	From the late 9th century onwards, archaeological investigations have confirmed that rituals on Okinoshima were continued to be performed. <i>Archeological and historical evidences of the continuity of the worship on Okinoshima since 9th centuries onward had been submitted as Additional Information 14/11/201</i> <i>See Annex 2 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. (November Additional information p. Part 1 – 3: “While the “state rituals” including the custom of depositing vast quantities of votive objects in Okinoshima ceased in the ninth century, it is evident from great amounts of archaeological evidence, textual records and folklore studies connected to Okinoshima, Oshima, and the main island of Kyushu that the worship practices established in the three precincts described above continued from that time onward”)
Page 138, Column 2, Line 14	The role of the Shrine declined significantly and the religious duties were carried out separately at Hetsumiya by the sha-ke (12 priestly families) as expressed in the Daiguji family’s records, amongst which was the Munakata Ujimori kotogakian, compiled in 1313.	The role of Shrine declined compared to how it had flourished in earlier times and the religious duties were carried out separately at Hetsumiya by the sha-ke (12 priestly families) as expressed in a variety of historical records (Delete). <i>Just correction. The Munakata Ujimori kotogakian does not refer the contents, while it indicates the strong rule of the high priest’s family over the coasts, islands and mountains of Munakata province, as it is referred in the footnote of the nomination dossier, page 85. On the other hand, as it is suggested in Appendix 5 of the nomination dossier, page A5- 8, there are a lot of written documents concerning the sha- ke.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.

Page 138, Column 2, Line 21	Following the Meiji Restoration,	Following the Meiji Restoration, <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 138, Column 2, Line 24	In 1942 the Munakata Shrine Revival Association worked to renew the shrine compound and repair the buildings.	Since 1942 Munakata Shrine Revival Association worked to renew the shrine compound and repair the buildings. <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 138, Column 2, Line 31	Tombs 1 to 6 were excavated between 1976 and 1980,	Tombs 1 to 6 of the Shimbaru-Nuyama Mounded Tomb Group were excavated between 1976 and 1980, <i>Just clarification.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 138, Column 2, Line 36	The earliest record of the Hetsu-miya shrine buildings dates back to 1119 AD...	The record of Hetsu-miya itself is found in the Kojiki and Nihonshoki in the early 8th century, although the earliest record of the buildings of Hetsu-miya dates back to 1119 AD ... <i>Just clarification.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. However, ICOMOS underlines that the ICOMOS evaluation mentions elsewhere the records of Hetsu-miya and other shrines in the Kojiki and Nihonshoki
Page 138, Column 2, Line 38	; in 1675 the secondary and tertiary shrines of Hetsu-miya were moved to their present location,	; in 1675 the 108 subordinate shrines of Hetsu-miya were moved to their present location, <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. At p. 48 of the Nomination dossier it can be read “1675 - The secondary and tertiary shrines are relocated, together with 75 auxiliary shrines”
Page 138, Column 2, Line 49	The shrine building was rebuilt in 1928	The worship hall was rebuilt in 1928, while the extant main hall was in the 17th century <i>Just clarification.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 140, Column 1, Line 43	In particular, ICOMOS noted that the purported continuity of worship was not proven, particularly when noting that worship practices ceased on Okinoshima in the 9th – 10th centuries AD.	(Delete) <i>Archeological and historical evidences of the continuity of the worship on Okinoshima since 9th centuries onward had been submitted as Additional Information 14/11/201</i> <i>See Annex 2 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. (November Additional information p. Part 1 – 3: “While the “state rituals” including the custom of depositing vast quantities of votive objects in Okinoshima ceased in the ninth century, it is evident from great amounts of archaeological evidence, textual records and folklore studies connected to Okinoshima, Oshima, and the main island of Kyushu that the worship practices established in the three precincts described above continued from that time onward”)

Page 140, Column 2, Line 8	Okistu-miya	Okitsu-miya <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 140, Column 2, Line 9	The chronology also reports that the Hetsu-miya shrine was relocated in 1675, therefore suggesting that the present locations of these shrines may not necessarily coincide with past ones.	The chronology also reports that the Hetsu-miya's 108 subordinate shrines were relocated in 1675, while the primary shrine of Hetsu-miya has remained at the same location. <i>Just clarification. The primary shrine was just repaired in 1675 and it is not included among the shrines relocated at that time.</i>	1) ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. At p. 48 of the Nomination dossier it can be read "1675 - The secondary and tertiary shrines are relocated, together with 75 auxiliary shrines" 2) ICOMOS considers this a clarification.
Page 140, Column 2, Line 46	Some further explanations were also necessary with regards to the gap in findings on Okinoshima for the period between the 6th-7th centuries, as this represents an interruption also of the purported continuity of ritual practices between the 4th and 9th centuries.	Some further explanations were also necessary with regards to the density of findings on Okinoshima for the period between the 6th-7th centuries, in order to strengthen the purported continuity of ritual practices between the 4th and 9th centuries. <i>As ICOMOS suggested in the E-mail feedback 03/02/2017, the issue is on the density of the archaeological remains, not on the continuity of the worship.</i> <i>See Annex 3 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 141, Column 1, Line 5	the first testimony of the worship of Okinoshima from afar is said to be the rock engaving at Oshima dating back to 1750 in relation to Okitsu-miya Yohaisho.	the first testimony of the worship of Okinoshima from afar is said to be the hisorical document dating back to some 1705 in relation to Okitsu-miya Yohaisho. <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this correction provides information which contradicts information provided at earlier stages of the evaluation procedure. At p. 40 of the nomination dossier it can be read: "...a stone monument [...] still remains at the site, with an inscription dating it to 1750..."
Page 141, Column 1, Line 16	ICOMOS found that the continuity of worship between the phase of ritual practices on the Island and the worship of the Munakata deities was not ascertained, as too many interrogatives on how and why the rituals changed, what they implied in the different stages, and what were the meanings associated with these rituals, remain unexplained.	(Delete) <i>The evidence of the continuity of worship between the phase of ritual practices on the Island and the worship of the Munakata deities and the significance of changes in rituals had been submitted by Additional Information 28/02/2017 Page 14-16 and 24-29.</i> <i>See Annex 4 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. ICOMOS indeed received and assessed additional information in February 2017.

Page 142, Column 1, Line 42	with some gaps between the 6th and 7th centuries AD,	(Delete) <i>It is the same issue mentioned above.</i> <i>See Annex 3 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 143, Column 2, Line 32	Additionally, ICOMOS considers that the mention of the three shrines of Munakata in the <i>Kojiki</i> and <i>Nihonshoki</i> cannot be considered as a record for the worship of the Island. Rather, it appears as a recognition of the importance of the Munakata Clan, in the context of the emerging Yamato state, when the chronicles were written.	(Delete) <i>The reason is not manifested why ICOMOS does not consider these earliest documents as records.</i> <i>Historical Study has formulated that Okinoshima corresponds to Okitsu-miya written in Kojiki and Nihonshoki, and the three archeological ritual sites also correspond to the three shrines of Munakata, which is submitted by Nomination Dossier 7.e. especially Page 234-236 and Appendix 5 as well as Additional Information 28/02/2017 Page24-30.</i> <i>The statement raised by ICOMOS here is totally opposite to the accumulated study of history.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 144, Column 2, Line 22	Additionally, ICOMOS considers that the limit at the top of the mountain marking the south-eastern corner of the buffer should incorporate entirely the summit.	(Delete) <i>The revised extent of the buffer zone had submitted with Additional information 14/11/2016, as Topographic map B.</i> <i>See Annex 5 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS does not consider this as an error. The point is inserted into the evaluation as the map provided in the additional information submitted in November 2016 was not detailed enough to understand whether the top is incorporated or not.
Page 145, Column 2, Line 26	Maintenance work is regularly carried out on the main shrine, with a major restoration program planned in the near future.	Maintenance work is regularly carried out on the main shrine, with a restoration program planned in the near future. <i>The planned restoration is the changing the damaged roof and the partial repair of the shrine buildings.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 147, Column 1, Line 9	no access for women	no access except the priests of Munakata Grand Shrine <i>Just clarification.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this as a clarification. However, ICOMOS notes that while men are exceptionally accepted, this does not seem the case for women, who are not allowed in any circumstances.

Page 147, Column 2, Line 35	the changes in rituals and worship, away from natural forces, represented by Okinoshima, to deities, represented by the three goddesses protecting the Munakata Clan;	the changes in practices of rituals and worship from Okinoshima itself to three deities as symbols of natural forces; <i>Just clarification. These deities for maritime safety do not protect a particular clan, however it is the fact that the ritual of the three goddesses were nurtured by the Clan.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 148, Column 1, Line 43	better explaining how the worship of Okinoshima has come to be embedded within the cult of the Munakata Goddesses	better explaining how the worship of Okinoshima has evolved to the cult of the Munakata Goddesses <i>Just correction. It is not accurate to consider that there had been the cult of the Munakata Goddesses and the worship of Okinoshima has come to be embedded. The fact is that there had been the worship for maritime safety on not only Okinoshima but also Oshima and the main island of Kyushu, and the worship has been evolved into the cult of the Munakata Goddesses.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 149, Column 1, Line 13	Located 50km off ...	Located 60km off ... <i>Just correction.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 150, Column 1, Line 19	d) Stating that the construction of wind turbines, offshore or on land, will not only be “appropriately restricted” but will be totally forbidden within the entire property limits, including the buffer zone, as well as in areas outside the property where it would affect the visual integrity of the components,	d) Stating that the construction of wind turbines, offshore or on land, will not only be “appropriately restricted” but will be forbidden within the entire property limits, including the buffer zone, in case it would affect the visual integrity of the components, <i>Outside of the buffer zone need not be included in controlled area, because the adequate buffer zone that necessary for the proper protection of the property has provided, as ICOMOS states at Page 145, Column 1 of the evaluation report.</i>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Page 150, Column 1, Line 34	g) Confirming that the limit at the top of the mountain marking the south-eastern corner of the buffer zone, incorporates entirely the summit	(Delete) <i>The revised extent of the buffer zone had submitted with Additional information 14/11/2016, as Topographic map B. See Annex 5 of this form.</i>	ICOMOS does not consider this as an error. The point is inserted into the evaluation as the map provided in the additional information submitted in November 2016 was not detailed enough to understand whether the top is incorporated or not.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Jordanie

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : L'architecture éclectique d'As-Salt (1865-1925), Origines et évolution d'un langage architectural au Levant

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
P. 69, Left, 3	No 689rev	Change the reference number, since it refers to the 1994 nomination.	The numbering system used by the World Heritage Center is automatically attributed to the nomination dossiers. If a decision of a previous session of the World Heritage Committee exists, the systems uses the number previously attributed.
P. 69, Left, 38	This is a deferred nomination (18 COM Phuket, 1994).	This is a new nomination.	The Bureau decided to defer this proposed nomination until such time as the State Party is in a position to confirm that appropriate protection measures, based on the Plan of Action of 1990, have been adopted and being effectively implemented. (Decision of the Bureau, 18 COM, Phuket, 1994)
P.71, Right, 41	[...] and decoration to which they gave a clear vernacular patina that met their clients' tastes.	[...] and decoration to which they gave a clear historicist patina that met their clients' tastes.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence.

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Pologne

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Mine de plomb, argent et zinc de Tarnowskie Góry et son système de gestion hydraulique souterrain

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
The Property			
209, Description, para 1	<u>It is:</u> <i>... and the mining of non-ferrous minerals, at Tarnowskie Góry.</i>	<u>It should read:</u> <i>... and the mining of ferrous and non-ferrous minerals, at Tarnowskie Góry and Bytom region.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
210, Description, para 11	<u>It is:</u> <i>The water drained through pumping in the Northern Adit System was channelled to be used for fire prevention purposes, from 1797 from the Reden and Machine shafts and from 1835 from the Kaehler Shaft, which is still in use...</i>	<u>It should read:</u> <i>The water drained through pumping in the Northern Adit System was channelled potable water, and to be used for municipal fire prevention purposes, from 1797 from the Reden and Machine shafts and from 1835 from the Kaehler Shaft, which is still in use...</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
210, Description, para 12	<u>It is:</u> <i>It was built between 1821-1834 and was the deepest drainage for the mine. The main adit is 17km in length. ... The key element of the Southern Adit System was the Friedrich Mine Deep Adit that connected the Adolph Shaft with the Drama River. This adit was further extended by creating a second drainage system built throughout the 1860's and completed in the 1880's.</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>It was built between 1821-1834, extended by creating a second drainage system built throughout the 1860s and completed in the 1880s, and was the deepest drainage for the mine. The main adit is 17km in length. ... The key element of the Southern Adit System was the Friedrich Mine Deep Adit that connected the Adolph Shaft with channels water from the whole undergrounds into the Drama River. This adit was further extended by creating a second drainage system built throughout the 1860's and completed in the 1880's.</i> <u>Comment:</u>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

		The Friedrich Mine Deep Adit goes far beyond the Adolph Shaft.	
211, Description, para 4	<u>It is:</u> <i>Mining Landscape (A5)</i> <i>This feature comprises a shaft, mounds, and open earthworks featuring a topography shaped by humans attesting to the intense exploitation of silver and lead ores in the 16th century, and, later in the 19th century, for stone quarrying.</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>Mining Landscape (A5)</i> <i>This feature comprises shaft mounds and open earthworks featuring a topography shaped by humans attesting to the intense exploitation of silver and lead ores in the 16th century, and, later in the 19th century, for stone quarrying. and later in the 19th century.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
211, History and development, para 3	<u>It is:</u> <i>...A strategic support to this process was given by the production of zinc: Tarnowskie Góry, along with other Silesian mines, came to dominate world output throughout much of the 19th century until the closure of the mine, in 1933.</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>...A strategic support to this process was given by the production of zinc: Tarnowskie Góry, along with other Silesian mines in the Tarnowskie Góry area, came to dominate world output throughout much of the 19th century until the closure of the mine, in 1933.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
212, History and Development, para 1	<u>It is:</u> <i>In 1797 a system was put in place integrating one mining shaft (Reden Shaft) with a Boulton & Watt steam-engine. This was further adapted in subsequent years following the modifications to the mining and water management system throughout the 19th century, with subsequent relocation and replacement of steam-engine machines. In 1903 the steam-engine was supplanted by gas works to operate the waterworks.</i>	<u>It should read:</u> <i>In 1797 a system was put in place integrating one mining shaft (Reden Shaft) with a Boulton & Watt steam-engine. This was further adapted in subsequent years following the modifications to the mining and water management system throughout the 19th century, with subsequent relocation and replacement of steam-engines (subsequently on Aurora, Frederica and Kaehler Shafts). In 1903 the steam-engine was supplanted by gas works to operate the waterworks.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
212, History and Development, para 3	<u>It is:</u> <i>The water supply system has been upgraded over the course of the 20th century; the Staszic Waterworks continued to supply water to Upper Silesia until 2001.</i>	<u>It should read:</u> <i>The water supply system has been upgraded over the course of the 20th century; the Staszic Waterworks continued to supply water to Upper Silesia until 2001; the Kaehler Shaft serves as a municipal water supply to this day.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Justification for inscription, integrity and authenticity			
212-216, Comparative analysis		<u>Comment:</u> The whole evaluation of the comparative analyses should be redone with the more careful read of the nomination dossier. The properties suggested by ICOMOS as meriting discussion actually formed part of the original comparative analysis and were concluded decisively to contain relatively	

		<p>(technically) straightforward <u>mine water drainage systems constructed in mountainous or hilly terrain (as opposed to the technically challenging flat terrain of Tarnowskie Góry. Additionally Tarnowskie Góry received an average of three times the water inflow compared to its other European counterparts</u> – see chapter on hydrology in the Nomination Dossier). Even more importantly, these <u>do not contain potable water abstraction as an integrated part of the underground water management system that was developed at the same time as mining</u>. This key attribute is stated in the justification for inscription and is one of the key attributes used in the comparative analysis.</p> <p>For the justification for this statement see extracts from the comparative analysis and comments on some of the paragraphs below.</p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 4	<p><i>ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis could have been limited to the properties, inscribed or not on the World Heritage List, that were relevant for the nominated property on the basis of the values and attributes they express.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The original comparative analysis complies with the “Operational Guidelines” and was guided by “Preparing World Heritage Nominations” (UNESCO, 2011). It was extensive, systematic and maintained a broad scope as recommended.</p> <p>Whilst perhaps involving more research than strictly needed, it was, however, undertaken on the basis of the values and attributes of the nominated property, against which properties likely to be assumed to share some key values were studied and clear conclusions drawn. Further information was then requested by ICOMOS regarding sites that were actually <u>irrelevant</u> to the nominated property.</p>	<p>ICOMOS did not state that the comparative analysis was not in line with the Operational Guidelines.</p> <p>This reflects a difference of opinion</p>
212, Comparative analysis, para 5	<p><i>ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis does not point towards the exceptionality of Tarnowskie Góry in respect to its comparators already inscribed on the World Heritage List.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The comparative analysis was thorough, objective and conclusive. It demonstrated that the property is exceptional and that there is a place for it on the World Heritage List. Further, that no other similar properties could be nominated in the future.</p> <p>All relevant integrated mining and mine water management properties on the World Heritage List, on Tentative Lists, and the most relevant not on any list, were thoroughly analysed. In the concise summary presented in the Nomination Document, their similarities and differences were stated, with an explicit conclusion drawn as to why the nominated property is exceptional. Requested (unnecessary) supplementary comparative analysis considered surface steam pumping waterworks - unconnected with mining - again on the World Heritage List, on Tentative Lists, and the most relevant not on any list. This exercise was also extensive and thorough and its conclusions presented</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this comment contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p> <p>I</p> <p>ICOMOS did not state that the comparative analysis was not in line with the Operational Guidelines.</p> <p>ICOMOS concluded that the results of the comparative analysis</p>

		as a summary, as requested.	did not succeed at this stage.
212, Comparative analysis, para 5	<i>With regard to the water management system, other regions exhibit highly developed adit systems in which the length of single adits is comparable with the length of the totality of the network in the nominated property:...</i>	<u>Comment:</u> Exceptionality simply in the length of adit systems is not what the nomination claims. Response (Warsaw, 24 February 2017) to the Interim Report stated: <u>The greatest contribution to potential OUV is present in the <u>underground and aboveground mining-water management technical ensemble that dates from the late 18th to the early 20th century.</u></u> This is because it is this system that also incorporated <i>water supply</i> (potable, fire, and industrial) that was <i>coeval with mine dewatering</i> – all from within the same property under singular state ownership and operational management. <i>This is an exceptional and far-sighted technical achievement that was at the cutting-edge of mining and modern water distribution.</i> And this later ensemble incorporates the earlier ensemble that is a necessary inclusion to demonstrate functional integrity.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.
212, Comparative analysis, para 5	<i>...the Ernst August Adit in Mines of Rammelsberg, Historic Town of Goslar and Upper Harz Water Management System, Germany (1992, extension in 2010, criteria (i), (ii), (iii) and (iv), is 35 km long; ...exhibits important similarities that would have merited discussion.</i>	Extract from the original Nomination Dossier, specifically concerning the <i>Ernst August Adit</i> , Nomination Dossier, page 300: <i>SIMILARITIES: Underground remains (significant, in particular, from the Middle Ages and Renaissance period) and adits – notably the 35 km-long Ernst August Adit that was driven in the mid-nineteenth century from the western edge of the Harz mountains to drain the mines of Clausthal-Zellerfeld (centre of orefield) and Wildemann-Bockswiese-Lautenthal (in the north).</i> <i>DIFFERENCES: Deep mining with near-vertical veins in steep mountainous terrain with deep valleys; straightforward topography for adit driving. The water management ensemble, though completely different from that at Tarnowskie Góry, is the largest of its kind in Europe and lies south of the Rammelsberg mines and the town of Goslar. It was an <u>energy system</u> developed, over a period of some 800 years, primarily for the <u>generation of waterpower</u> (mostly to drive waterwheel-powered pumps at surface and underground, and surface processing and smelting facilities). The Harz system once comprised 143 dammed ponds, 500 km of supply channel ditches, 30 km of tunnels and up to 100 km of adits. In the twentieth century some modern dams and infrastructure were constructed for electricity generation, some ponds becoming reservoirs subsequently used for drinking water supply (the sale of which now funds the maintenance of a substantial portion of the water Regale). Mining water energy systems similar to the Harz survive in the Erzgebirge (Germany, nominated</i>	ICOMOS has examined arguments presented by the SP. They were found convincing. However, the statement “... exhibits important similarities that would have merited discussion ” in the ICOMOS evaluation should more precisely read: “... exhibits important similarities that would have merited <i>ampl</i>er discussion ”.

		<p>with the Czech Republic as part of a transboundary mining cultural landscape), Banska Stiavnica (Slovakia, inscribed as part of the technical monuments of the World Heritage Site) and Kongsberg (Norway). <u>Large-scale public water supply was never developed underground at any of these properties.</u></p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 5	<p>...the Great County Adit in Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape (2006, criteria (ii), (iii) and (iv), is 61 km long and drains 50 copper and tin mines;</p> <p>...exhibits important similarities that would have merited discussion</p>	<p>Extract from the original Nomination Dossier concerning <i>the Great County Adit in Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape</i>, Nomination Dossier, page 306:</p> <p><i>SIMILARITIES: ...The most comparable drainage network to Tarnowskie Góry's is the Great County Adit. This was started in 1748 and eventually reached a length of 61 km of main adit and drained 50 copper and tin mines in an area of 19 square km...</i></p> <p><i>DIFFERENCES: ...The Great County Adit was developed from a valley that discharged into a river and estuary and was driven in hilly topography (unlike the flat-lying terrain of Tarnowskie Góry). Adit drainage consistently worked in conjunction with steam engines that pumped from depths of up to 700 m and discharged into the adit system. <u>The Great County Adit did not constitute a water supply</u>, the mine water being far too acidic due to sulphur-rich copper mineralisation and the abundance of pyrite (iron sulphide) which was mined mainly for sulphuric acid production. A number of other adit systems were developed within the property and numerous examples survive, though incomparable in extent to Tarnowskie Góry. Some are used to collect spring water for small-scale private domestic water supply.</i></p> <p>For information, much of the Great County Adit no longer drains these mines, is substantially inaccessible, and its majority is not part of the inscribed property.</p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 5	<p>...the Freiberg Adit in the Mining Cultural Landscape Erzgebirge/Krusnohori, Tentative List of Germany/Czech Republic,</p> <p>...exhibits important similarities that would have merited discussion</p>	<p>Extract from the original Nomination Dossier concerning <i>the Freiberg Adit in the Mining Cultural Landscape Erzgebirge/Krusnohori</i>, Nomination Dossier, page 316:</p> <p><i>SIMILARITIES: ...Extensive single adit system in Freiberg (40 km), constructed (1844-77) in a similar manner/German design using lichtlocht shafts for multiple simultaneous drivage (except in contrasting topography: mountainous terrain as opposed to flat plain) to phase II system of Tarnowskie Góry.</i></p> <p><i>DIFFERENCES: ...The Freiberg adit system (Rothschonberger Stolln) was part of the <u>water management system for energy</u> (completed 1882, though with sixteenth century origins, similar to the Harz and elsewhere). Today, parts of the surface water management system comprise</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS has examined arguments presented by the SP. They were found convincing.</p> <p>However, the statement “...exhibits important similarities that would have merited discussion” in the ICOMOS evaluation should more precisely read:</p> <p>“...exhibits important similarities that would have merited ampler discussion”.</p>

		<p>reservoirs which are used for potable water. <u>The mines were not, however, historically adapted for potable water supplies abstracted from underground.</u></p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 6	<p>With regards to the mining site, the comparative analysis could have included additional sites, not included on the World Heritage List nor on the Tentative Lists, e.g. Derbyshire Soughs...</p>	<p>Extract from the original Nomination Dossier concerning the Derbyshire Soughs, Nomination Dossier, page 322</p> <p><i>SIMILARITIES: ...Adit drainage. Water quality from similar geological lithology and structure.</i></p> <p><i>DIFFERENCES: ...The soughs are exceptionally fine in terms of their construction and preservation but they are sited in hilly (as opposed to flat) topography and their individual lengths are short in comparison with Tarnowskie Góry. <u>They were not historically used for potable water supply, this came after mining ceased and when water (spring water quality entering from limestone aquifers) was collected from the discharge portals, for example Meerbrook Sough from 1903.</u></i></p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 6	<p>With regards to the mining site, the comparative analysis could have included additional sites, not included on the World Heritage List nor on the Tentative Lists,</p> <p><i>...and other lead mining areas in the United Kingdom (Yorkshire, Durham, Scotland – Kilhope, Wanlockhead, Leadhills) that, although smaller-scale, preserve extensive remains.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>These were each considered, and more sites, too. The only reasonably relevant site was found to be the Milwr Tunnel (Sea-Level Tunnel), Halkyn Mines, in Wales. This is the most well known amongst experts (not cited by ICOMOS) and was brought into the original comparative analysis and included in the nomination document.</p> <p>Extract from the original Nomination Dossier concerning the Milwr Tunnel, Halkyn Mines, in Wales, Nomination Dossier, page 321:</p> <p><i>SIMILARITIES: ...Whilst shafts and adit portals are sealed, there is maintenance access as the system is now used as an industrial water supply by Welsh Water (supplying industrial water since 1992).</i></p> <p><i>DIFFERENCES: ...Principal phase of mining (and adit driving) much later than Tarnowskie Góry. <u>No historic abstraction of potable water from the underground system.</u></i></p>	
212, Comparative analysis, para 7	<p>ICOMOS notes that the aspect of water supply ... has not been addressed... In this regard, the comparative analysis should look at properties encompassing attributes such as networks of water towers, steam engines and other pumping systems, filtration plants, reservoirs, dams, aqueducts, in order to establish whether the nominated property would justify consideration as an outstanding example, in terms of conception, technology used and surviving tangible evidence, of a public water supply system set up to exploit drained water.</p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The waterworks were built to counteract side effects of mining activity. It cannot be presented in isolation from the mining activity as such presentation distorts the character of this site. Furthermore, such presentation is at odds with cause and effect development of the entire system of management of underground waters in Tarnowskie Góry. The effectiveness of the system built, together with the mining activity in the region caused a dramatic water shortage. Hence, by court order, the mining enterprise Friedrich Mine was forced to construct regional and city waterworks system. Since the</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p>

		<p>underground water was potable, the Tarnowskie Góry undergrounds were used as a large well.</p> <p>The nominated property is an <u>underground water management system of mining origins – hence the name in the title of the property.</u> The Tarnowskie Góry town had a steam-pumped water supply before New York – with abstraction from the current surviving underground network designed coeval with mine drainage - and, in the 1880s even steam engines were placed at the water table in elaborate underground chambers 50m vertically below ground. <u>In terms of conception: human creative genius, with no other known examples that parallel this innovative approach: as determined by the comparative analysis.</u></p> <p>The gravity drainage system – during the construction for which many steam engines were used on surface as transitional and highly mobile technology – survives fully functional to this day (with no machines to ‘drive’ it). Water abstraction continues from the underground network, the Kaehler Shaft installation supplying the town’s inhabitants with potable water. A vision of sustainable technical creativity almost 200 years old.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p>
213, Comparative analysis, para 2	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>However, the State Party claims that no property has been found that was planned and used by combining mineral extraction, dewatering and water supply by the use of steam engines.</i></p>	<p><u>It should read:</u></p> <p><i>However, the State Party claims that no property has been found that was planned and used by combining mineral extraction, dewatering and water supply by the use of steam engines.</i></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Use of steam engines was limited to constructing the dewatering system and to pump water into the water supply system.</p>	
213, Comparative analysis, para 3	<p><i>ICOMOS notes that the comparative analysis shows that the use of the steam-engine in mining contexts was frequent in Britain but also in France (e.g. Anzin) as well as for water supply, both in Britain and Paris (Gros Caillou and Chaillot, 1781). The comparative analysis shows also that for the second-generation steam pumping engines, these were rather widespread, although not in use. Therefore ICOMOS considers that a further search could be done to reach more conclusive results.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>This is irrelevant: The steam engine in mining contexts was frequent in Britain, continental Europe, Asia, North and South America, Australia and New Zealand, South Africa etc. And, for water supply in Britain, continental Europe, America, Australia and elsewhere – but <u>separately, and not integrated with mining – as detailed in values and attributes present in the nominated property.</u></p> <p>The steam engine was technically and commercially developed as mine pumping technology and was applied separately to create modern steam-pumped waterworks. In case of Tarnowskie Góry <u>steam-power technology was mainly used to construct the gravitational dewatering system</u> and to pump water into the water supply system.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		Suggestion to divide the property and compare separated aspects is in contradiction with the definition of integrity and requirements of the Operational Guidelines.	
213, Comparative analysis, para 5	<i>...the use of now-disappeared steam engines...</i>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Steam engines at surface were predominantly a transitional/ constructional phase technology</u>, as explained in the nomination dossier and in response to further ICOMOS questions. They were used as part of the overall creative and sustainable approach to develop the ultimate gravity system that continues to operate today, with continued potable water abstraction from the mine underground system.</p> <p><u>The value of the now-disappeared steam engines</u> (steam engines at surface that were mobile, very temporary and even housed in temporary wooden engine houses) <u>lies in their absence !</u></p> <p>These were used in a rapidly portable manner and nowhere else have such large engines been used in such a way, being disposed of when the construction of the gravity dewatering system was complete. The underground water management system is testimony to their innovative use (we don't see the scaffolding used to build the pyramids). Even if an engine was not taken away for re-use elsewhere, it could arguably be deemed to be movable heritage and therefore not listable. The information of the transition of the engines was provided on the request of the ICOMOS.</p> <p>In further paragraphs in the ICOMOS evaluation, it is repeatedly stressed that none of these surface engines that were used to construct the gravity drainage system survive. They were all recycled (information on their subsequent destinations was provided on the request of the ICOMOS) - a more thorough read of the nomination document, and of the repeated responses corresponded, should have corrected this misunderstanding.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p> <p>This confirms that they disappeared.</p> <p>This confirms that they disappeared.</p>
213, Justification of OUV, para 3	<i>...when it concerns the first period of exploitation of the mine (15th -17th centuries) of which no evidence is documented and presented by the nomination document or the additional information.</i>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Included in the original Nomination Dossier, and additional information provided to ICOMOS, dated Warsaw, 24 February 2017:</p> <p><u>Late 15th to the 17th century</u></p> <p><u>At surface: The mine dewatering features of God Help Adit Portal and Ditch (2.8 and 2.9) - selected as it was the principal adit system of this period and one that was later integrated into the complete modern system of the second phase of mining (late-18th/19th c) under the Prussian state; and the large</u></p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges the comment. The evaluation should read: "...no sufficient evidence is documented and presented..."</p>

		<p>number of small-scale and closely spaced <i>shafts at Silver Mountain</i> (3.3) – selected as the largest concentration of such shafts in the entire Tarnowskie Góry area, one that is best-preserved (for centuries set in beech forest) in terms of illustrating characteristic ‘pingi’ and ‘warpie’ terrain, and comprising an ore zone that is entirely underlain by the second phase of workings drained by the Friedrich Deep Adit (it is connected underground).</p> <p><u>Underground:</u> The mine dewatering features of <i>God Help Adit</i> (2.0) that display fine architectural structures of masonry arches, buttresses and lichlocht shuttering in the accessible adit section; <i>St Jacob’s Adit</i> northeast of Kaehler Shaft (another very important adit that drained north into the Stola River, currently inaccessible due to potable water abstraction but included well within the property’s northeast boundary lobe and having considerable archaeological potential); Krakow Adit and adit shafts located parallel to the Friedrich Deep Adit (located within the property boundary and subject of future archaeological investigation; again an important adit undertaking but one that ultimately failed and was abandoned, but that was a consideration in the location of the Friedrich Deep Adit); and areas of archaeological potential above the 16th-17th and 18th-20th century workings (including those in Silver Mountain).</p>	
213, Justification of OUV, para 3	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>ICOMOS notes that all mining properties had to face the problem; however, the specific geomorphological conditions of an almost flat mining area and a rather superficial water table, caused substantial technical challenges for the mining and triggered inventive solutions, initially based on the gravity system and later improved with the use of the steam engine.</i></p>	<p><u>It should read:</u></p> <p><i>ICOMOS notes that all mining properties had to face the problem; however, the specific geomorphological conditions of an almost flat mining area and a rather superficial water table, caused substantial technical challenges for the mining and triggered inventive solutions, initially based on the gravity system and later improved with the use of the steam engine to create the fully effective gravity dewatering system functioning until today.</i></p>	The State Party bold text does not highlight any error in the ICOMOS text.
213, Justification of OUV, para 7	<p><i>The exploitation of the dewatering network to supply water to the towns and the industrial district of Upper Silesia is a specificity of the nominated property that could potentially deserve consideration, but only on the grounds of the results of an augmented comparative analysis based on additional research and additional information, and a photogrammetric survey and 3D modelling, which can provide further information.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The underground system is well documented. Entire archival documentation of the Friedrich Mine (state mining company) exists, it is archived at the TGLL Association, the State Archives in Katowice and in the Coal Mine Museum in Zabrze. The archival mining maps are incredibly accurate. They are checked and their accuracy was confirmed by the TGLL Association along with their work on making the mine accessible for tourists as well as by the town municipality for the land use and planning purposes.</p>	Historic plans cannot replace the documentation of the actual property as it was ‘constructed/ excavated and as it came down to present day, which only can document the real consistence of what has

		<p>Examples of these maps are presented in the nomination dossier and were also presented to the Accessor during the technical evaluation mission.</p> <p>The investigation of the undergrounds was also carried out in order to establish the boundaries of the Natura 2000 site. The works were initiated by the TGLL Association. They included, i.a. counting bats in the underground system.</p> <p>It is unreasonable to expect an investment in over 150 km of laser scanning in flooded passages, many of which are traversable only by kayak.</p> <p>3D scanning of the tourist route is by the TGLL Association for the interpretation and presentation purposes.</p>	<p>survived and its conditions.</p> <p>Survey is crucial to know the current consistency of the property and its state of conservation</p>
213, Justification of OUV, para 8	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>...although no draft of this work has been presented and only a few schematic sections of the Adolph Shaft, have been provided.</i></p>	<p><u>It should be:</u></p> <p><i>...although no draft of this work has been presented and only a few but-schematic sections of the Adolph Shaft, Reden, Frederica, Pachaly, Viper, Kaehler Shafts, the main parts of the system, have been provided.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.</p>
214, Integrity, para 1	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>On the other hand, the 19th-20th century portion is known for the most part and its integrity may be considered acceptable. The pumping station and related facilities at Adolph Shaft express their function and significance.</i></p>	<p><u>It should read:</u></p> <p><i>On the other hand, the 19th-20th century portion is known for the most part and its integrity may be considered acceptable. The pumping station and related facilities at Adolph Shaft as well as at Kaehler Shaft express their function and significance.</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification</p>
214, Integrity, para 2	<p><i>However, for the purpose of the nomination, ICOMOS considers that an expanded explanation and illustration of its different elements and how they work appears necessary to assess whether those attributes adequately express the proposed justification for inscription.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Enough has been provided, in spite of the potentially challenging nature of the property to those not used to industrial and/or underground heritage.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
214, Integrity, para 5	<p><i>The surface features, on the other hand, present an uneven degree of integrity but mostly survive as archaeological remains or landscape features. Only through systematic archaeological investigations could these vestiges be able to convey their significance.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The value of the property is stated as <u>predominantly being the underground network; an aspect commonly excluded in inscribed mines</u>, yet often the greatest monument to the labours of generations of miners.</p> <p>The State Party considers, in general, that they currently have sufficient knowledge of the mining topography that has been mapped, consistently, for centuries. They have, however, included one surface area (connected by shafts to the underground network) in the nomination for its further archaeological potential – as per “Operational Guidelines”, para 100</p>	<p>The SP comment does not highlight an error.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this correction contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>

		<p>“... boundaries should be drawn to include all those areas and attributes which are a direct tangible expression of OUV... as well as those areas which in the light of future research possibilities offer potential to contribute to and enhance such understanding.” It has already initiated research into the extensive historic archive of thousands of Prussian mining plans of the property (of exceptional detail and accuracy), <u>before</u> considering any archaeological excavations or other non-intrusive methods such as geophysical techniques.</p> <p>The surface features are less important in the conveying the significance of the property, they are important for the understanding history and function of the nominated property, and therefore are crucial for its presentation. The area of the nominated property is 1672.76 ha. 80% of the nominated property are the undergrounds, assessed as generally authentic. The surface attributes consist about 20% of the nominated property (Silver Mountain and Washing Tip themselves cover about 90% of the surface nominated property).</p> <p><i>Through systematic archaeological investigations, as recommended by ICOMOS, won't bring much more knowledge about the property if not accompanied by the interdisciplinary research.</i></p>	<p>The historic plans cannot replace the documentation of the actual property as it was 'constructed/ excavated and as it came down to present day, which only can document the real consistence of what has survived and its conditions.</p> <p>Archaeological investigations represent the first step.</p>
214, Authenticity, para 3	<p><i>Overall, the features presented in the nomination dossier can be considered generally authentic in terms of location, function, materials, workmanship and form, but the lack of investigation on their substance, construction phase, and specific roles, limits their potential to support the claimed justification for inscription and of the selected criteria.</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The almost wholly accessible underground network that ICOMOS considers the most significant is well documented. In addition to historic mining maps, the fine architectural features of masonry arches and stone-bricked walls commonly carry stone tablets with the date of construction (also correlated in detail on archive plans) and the distance to and from the next shafts (that also commonly carry fine stone tablets). All is well researched, interpreted and figured in the Nomination Dossier.</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p>
215, Criterion (i), para 1	<p><i>ICOMOS considers that the challenge of dewatering underground mines has to be faced everywhere...</i></p>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Yes, it is a universal challenge, just like the challenge of building tombs for the dead; but the Taj Mahal is still a masterpiece of human creative genius that manages to solve those challenges in an outstanding way. And, the challenge at Tarnowskie Góry – water inflow at around 300 per cent of that of its Central European counterparts, and a level terrain with no significant rivers as water receivers - is not faced and tackled anywhere else, as explained in great detail in the Nomination Document, including in</p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this comment contains advocacy for the proposals made in the nomination dossier.</p>

		the comparative analysis.	
215, Criterion (i), para 2	<i>...technology was invented elsewhere and only transferred and later adapted to be used in Upper Silesia and Tarnowskie Góry. The use of these engines was limited to the dewatering during the construction operation. Finally, no original steam engines or other structures related to their use survive from that era.</i>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The steam engines were invented somewhere else, but it was their innovative application to produce the masterpiece of hydraulic engineering that matters – and this testimony survives in the nominated underground property.</p> <p>This aspect is covered earlier, the planned mobility of such engines including wooden engine houses that were dismantled when the engines were moved to the next shaft, or when they were recycled off the mining field.</p> <p>In the case of the water supply system, where the concept of using steam power was different, steam engines installed underground at the Adolph Shaft to pump water up into the water supply system survive.</p>	<p>The State Party comments do not highlight errors.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that the comments re-iterate arguments put forward in the nomination dossier and in the additional information that have been fully considered.</p>
215, Criterion (i), para 4	<i>Finally, the nominated property does not exhibit any monumental landmark that could justify the reference to this criterion.</i>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>To give just one example, with specific reference to the World Heritage List: When “The Neolithic flint mines at Spiennes” was recommended to the World Heritage Committee for inscription in 2000, ICOMOS stated, <u>with reference to “criterion (i) The Neolithic flint mines at Spiennes provide exceptional testimony to early human inventiveness and application.”</u></p> <p>This property is almost <u>wholly underground</u> (shafts and short galleries dug by prehistoric miners). The <u>surface is predominantly farmland</u> bearing <u>levelled evidence</u> of massive flint scatters that indicate the former presence of flint knapping workshops destroyed by deep ploughing.</p> <p>As clearly, and repeatedly, stated by Poland, the principal values of the nominated property are also <u>underground</u>, manifest in the integrated mining and water management network. The ICOMOS evaluation persistently ignores these physical attributes of the site that are clearly described in the nomination file and directly related to the justification criteria.</p> <p>Criterion (i) is to “represent a masterpiece of human creative genius”, and in recent years, there have been an increasing number of inscriptions that are technically oriented. The notion of “creative” is key.</p> <p><u>In summary: Criterion (i), Poland considers this to have been justified.</u></p> <p>The monumental underground mining and water management system at Tarnowskie</p>	<p>The time gap between The Neolithic flint mines at Spiennes” (5th millennium – 3rd millennium BCE) and Tarnowskie Gory (1) is immense (thousands of years) and make the two cases not comparable.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p> <p>ICOMOS has considered that the property is mostly underground and that this is the main focus of the nomination.</p> <p>ICOMOS considers</p>

		Góry is a masterpiece of hydraulic engineering, <i>an exceptional expression of technical creativity.</i>	that this reflects a difference of opinion.
215, Criterion (ii), para 4	<u>It is:</u> <i>ICOMOS notes that this justification is based on two major strands: the contribution of the nominated property to the global economy of silver and, later, of zinc; ...</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>ICOMOS notes that this justification is based on two major strands: the contribution of the nominated property to the global economy of lead, silver and, later, of zinc; ...</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
216, Criterion (iv), para 2	<u>It is:</u> <i>ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis has highlighted similarities with other properties on the World Heritage List with regards to the water management system...</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis has highlighted similarities and differences with other properties on the World Heritage List with regards to the water management system...</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this integration.
216, Criterion (iv), para 2	<i>ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis has highlighted similarities with other properties on the World Heritage List with regards to the water management system... ...the specificity of the adaptation of the dewatering system to create a public water supply, and of its surviving features, requires further exploration in terms of comparative analysis as well as in terms of careful documentation and illustration.</i>	<u>Comment:</u> This is overtly selective to be misleading. Similarities, and <u>differences that clearly make the property stand out as exceptional</u> , were systematically and diligently highlighted in the comparative analysis. Further exploration in terms of comparative analysis will not yield anything different. Documentation and illustration exceeds adequate. <u>In summary: Criterion (iv), Poland considers this to be justified.</u>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion. ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
Factors affecting the property			
216, para 1	<u>It is:</u> <i>Tarnowskie Góry is still an important railway hub and this causes pressures in terms of transportation infrastructure upgrading.</i>	<u>It should be deleted.</u> We are completely unsure of both the meaning and relevance of this statement; and where it comes from.	ICOMOS acknowledges the comment
Protection, conservation and management			
217, Boundaries of the nominated property and buffer zone, para 5	<i>ICOMOS considers that overall the boundaries of the nominated property are acceptable, with possible expansion to be considered for area A5 that could be joined to area A4.</i>	<u>Comment:</u> This can be done, immediately, as a minor boundary modification, and was offered as such to do.	ICOMOS considers that this is not the crucial issue of this nomination.
218, Protection, para 3	<i>...ICOMOS recalls that protection mechanisms for a buffer zone should be in place at the moment the property is inscribed.</i>	<u>Comment:</u> They are in place, as the current regulations of the local development plans guarantee status quo of the area within limits of the proposed buffer zone. The buffer zone as such (under this name) will be introduced in the local development plans during their first actualisation.	ICOMOS notes that the additional information states the following "...special protective zones shall be introduced to the studies of the condition and directions of spatial development and to the spatial development plans

			along with the nearest update or amendment thereof.” ICOMOS therefore understood that they were not introduced yet.
219, Management, para 1	<u>It is :</u> ...also the National Heritage Office, the World Heritage Directorate as well as the Water Company... ...as well as various academics, in personal capacity. The Voivodeship seems to have been only recently linked to the project.	<u>It should be:</u> ...also the National Heritage Office Board of Poland, the Centre for World Heritage Directorate as well as the Water Company Companies -- Upper Silesian Water Supply company in Katowice and Water Supply and Sewerage company in Tarnowskie Góry (Veolia)... ...as well as various academics, in personal capacity. The Voivodeship (Marshal's Office) is fully engaged to the project as the owner of the over 90% of the nominated property seems to have been only recently linked to the project.	ICOMOS acknowledges these clarifications
219, Management, para 5	<u>It is:</u> ICOMOS observes that the Association TGLL has been carrying out remarkable work for the conservation and valorisation of the nominated property for 40 years.	<u>It should be:</u> ICOMOS observes that the Association TGLL has been carrying out remarkable work for the conservation and valorisation of the nominated property for 40 60 years.	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
219, Management, para 1	<u>It is:</u> The management plan (2016-2020) in preparation, as declared in the nomination dossier, is provided in draft form in an annex to the nomination dossier.	<u>It should be:</u> The management plan (2016-2020), prepared and adopted by the TGLL Association and the Tarnowskie Góry Municipality with the support of the National Heritage Board of Poland in preparation, as declared in the nomination dossier, is provided in draft form in an annex to the nomination dossier.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. The additional information reads “The Management Plan was formally adopted by all key stakeholders, [...] on the November 7, 2016. ICOMOS understands that the adoption of the Management Plan occurred on the same date.
219, Management, para 2	<u>It is:</u> The additional information provided in November 2016 includes the finalised version of the Management Plan, which was adopted on 7 November 2016, when the cooperation agreement among all parties involved was also signed, formally establishing the	<u>It should be:</u> The additional information provided in November 2016 includes the resubmission finalised version of the Management Plan, which was adopted on 7 November 2016, when the cooperation agreement among all 12 parties involved was also signed, formally establishing the Steering Committee.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. ICOMOS text should have read “...includes the adopted version of the management Plan”

	<i>Steering Committee.</i>		
219, Summary para	<i>ICOMOS considers that the management system set up appears adequate, although establishing a scientific committee advising the Steering Committee would greatly assist in developing the necessary research programme of the archaeological mining features and landscape....</i>	<u>Comment:</u> The nominated property already receives top specialist scientific advice. This is obtained on a weekly basis through appropriate specialist groups within the TGLL Association, and externally, as required, from Polish universities that have specialist departments on each scientific aspect of the property. They have been engaged for decades. The system can easily be formalised into a “scientific committee” however.	The comment by the State Party does not highlight an error in the ICOMOS text.
Monitoring			
219, para 2	<u>It is:</u> <i>A comprehensive monitoring system has been prepared within the Management Plan, submitted in its finalised version in November 2016.</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>A comprehensive monitoring system has been prepared within the Management Plan, submitted in its finalised version in November annexed to the nomination dossier and submitted in January 2016 in its final version.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification. ICOMOS text should have read ” ...in its adopted version”
Conclusions			
220, para 1	<u>It is:</u> <i>...elements connected with the dewatering network: adits and shafts; elements connected with the water supply system: Adolph Shaft Waterworks and other underground and surface workings.</i>	Last sentence, Kaehler Shaft (potable water abstraction still <u>continuing</u>), should be added. <u>It should read:</u> <i>...elements connected with the dewatering network: adits and shafts; elements connected with the water supply system: Adolph Shaft Waterworks and Kaehler Shaft, and other underground and surface workings.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
220, para 2	<u>It is:</u> <i>The nomination is proposed as one single property, the unifying element being the underground network of tunnels and adits that connects the above-ground individual features.</i>	<u>It should be:</u> <i>The nomination is proposed as one single property, the unifying element being the underground network of workings, tunnels, shafts and adits that connects the above-ground individual features.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
220, para 3	<u>It is :</u> <i>The property is located in one of three major historic mining regions in Central Europe – Upper Silesia, the Harz and the Erzgebirge – all sharing notable reciprocal similarities in terms of geology...</i>	<u>It should read:</u> <i>The property is located in one of three major historic mining regions in Central Europe – Upper Silesia, the Harz and the Erzgebirge – all sharing notable reciprocal similarities of which Upper Silesia is fundamentally different in terms of geology...</i> <u>Comment:</u> <i>The Erzgebirge-Krušné hory (both literally meaning “ore <u>mountains</u>” (the subject of a transnational cultural landscape nomination submitted in 2015), and the Harz (inscribed as a World Heritage Site through the</i>	ICOMOS got different expert opinion on this point. However, ICOMOS acknowledges that this aspect is debated.

		<p>Rammelsberg property) <u>are somewhat similar to each other</u> – granite intrusions in the Variscan orogenic belt.</p> <p><i>The Erzgebirge-Krušné hory</i> is a fault-block mountain range comprised of igneous, metamorphic and sedimentary rocks (notably a 40km-long x 24km wide granite pluton!) that rises up to 1,244 m (!) above sea level, dissected by more than a dozen rivers (!). The Harz is a mix of granite (the Brocken 1,142 m above sea level!), slates, sandstone and limestone, with rivers dissecting the mountains and even creating spectacular gorges!</p> <p>Upper Silesia (<u>Tarnowskie Góry region</u>) is <u>fundamentally different in terms of geology (and geomorphology and hydrology;</u> as explained in the Nomination Dossier). It is the <u>largest Mississippi Valley Type lead-zinc deposit in the world</u> – with mineralisation <u>stratabound in sedimentary Middle Triassic carbonate rock (dolomite)</u> that <u>creates the special conditions for water supply that make the property exceptional</u> (explained in great detail in the Nomination Dossier).</p>	
220, para 5	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>The past history of mining activity at a heritage site may be reflected by several examples of spoil heaps, pit heads, adits or pumped shafts, pumping and winding machinery, chimneys/engine houses, surface dressing/sorting/washing plants for the minerals, provision of baths for the miners, housing (of higher and lower quality), miners' libraries and institutes, industries that use the mineral, ore clays, and other related activities.</i></p>	<p><u>It should be:</u></p> <p><i>The past history of mining activity at a heritage site may be reflected by several examples of underground workings, spoil heaps, pit heads, adits or pumped shafts, pumping and winding machinery, chimneys/engine houses, surface dressing/sorting/washing plants for the minerals, provision of baths for the miners, housing (of higher and lower quality), miners' libraries and institutes, industries that use the mineral, ore clays, and other related activities.</i></p>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
220, para 9	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>The dossier itself admits that little is known about the underground mining system related to the 16th century; however, ICOMOS notes that not much is presented either for the 19th century underground system.</i></p>	<p><u>It should be:</u></p> <p><i>The dossier itself admits that little is known about the underground mining system related to the 16th century; however, ICOMOS notes that not much enough is presented either for the 19th century underground system.</i></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>The underground system is well documented. In addition to historic and contemporary mapping, there is much photographic documentation of the undergrounds coming from all the periods of underground investigations (started in 1930s).</p>	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
220, para 11	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>...so somewhat later than the period of significance (late 18th-early 19th</i></p>	<p><u>It should be:</u></p> <p><i>...so somewhat later than the period of significance (late 18th-early 19th 20th</i></p>	ICOMOS acknowledges typing

	centuries).	centuries).	error. Elsewhere in the ICOMOS report the period is correctly indicated.
220, para 12	<i>No comparison was initially carried out with regard to this aspect of the property; however, the State Party provided an augmented comparison in February 2017, which has been found incomplete and not conclusive. Therefore, although interesting, the potential of the nominated property for inscription on the World Heritage List remains at this stage unclear.</i>	<p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>No comparison was initially presented - although considerable consideration was given during the study - because these sites were not relevant comparators. <u>What needs to be compared is the whole integrated system</u> of mining and water management/water supply.</p> <p>When requested to provide additional material, an extensive comparative study was, however, undertaken and summarised in the response to the Interim Report in February 2017. A firm conclusion reads as follows (page 28-29):</p> <p><i>All prominent well-known mining-related water management systems have already been examined and the findings presented in the Nomination Document. These were related to water for power, with some post-mining use of water collection systems for water supply (usually surface reservoirs, but there are some instances of water collection from post-mining mine-water discharge – almost exclusively from mines hosted in limestone – and of water abstraction from mineshafts).</i></p> <p><i>Following the request by the World Heritage Panel for further work to be undertaken, waterworks, particularly steam-powered water pumping stations, have now been brought into the scope of the comparative analysis. <u>None bear the combination of attributes, as illustrated by the nominated property, that contribute to the exceptional values of the Tarnowskie Góry underground water management system.</u></i></p> <p><i>Concerning other types of water management systems, such as Aflaj Irrigation Systems of Oman (World Heritage Site, criterion (v)), The Persian Qanat (World Heritage Site, criteria (iii), (iv)) and Bam and its Cultural Landscape, Iran (World Heritage Site, criteria (ii), (iii), (iv), (v)), these are not particularly relevant as they represent gravity (free-flow) systems, unrelated to any mine context, and are located in a different geographical and cultural context with very different technology and application. These properties illustrate, however, the underground tapping and distribution of water from alluvial aquifers. Mount Qingcheng and the Dujiangyan Irrigation System (World Heritage Site, criteria (ii), (iv), (vi)) is also gravity flow and, in common with these superlative sites, irrigation for agriculture is usually the</i></p>	<p>ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.</p> <p>Additional comparison has been provided but ICOMOS did not find it conclusive.</p>

		<p><i>dominant theme. The recently inscribed Aqueduct of Padre Tembleque Hydraulic System, Mexico (WHS, criteria (i), (ii), (iv)) is a fascinating water catchment and surface distribution network including, of course, the remarkable aqueduct, but it is an entirely different and incomparable property to Tarnowskie Góry's underground water management system. The Tarnowskie Góry system is entirely complementary to the above-mentioned inscribed sites, managing water underground, innovatively intercepting high-quality water inflow from an aquifer as it reaches the mine workings and distributing it using steam-pumping for consumption as drinking water and to support the development of large-scale heavy industry.</i></p>	
221, para 2	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>In terms of protection, not all features included in the nominated property enjoy legal protection, although procedures are underway to warrant protection status to a number of them.</i></p>	<p><u>It should be:</u></p> <p><i>In terms of protection, not all features included in the nominated property enjoy legal protection at the national level, although procedures are underway to warrant national protection status to a number of them.</i></p>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
221, para 3	<p><u>It is:</u></p> <p><i>Management has been carried out for several decades mainly by the Association TGLL and by the body responsible for the water supply (today the Veolia company)...</i></p>	<p><u>It should read:</u></p> <p><i>Management of has been carried out for several decades mainly by the Association TGLL and by the body bodies responsible for the water supply Upper Silesian Water Supply company in Katowice and Water Supply and Sewerage company in Tarnowskie Góry (today the Veolia company), together with respective local and regional authorities...</i></p>	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Royaume-Uni de Grande-Bretagne et d'Irlande du Nord

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Le District des Lacs anglais

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 319, Column 1, Line 24	Following the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel, an Interim Report was sent to the State Party on 16 January 2017, explaining the findings of the ICOMOS Panel and requesting further elaboration on criteria (ii) and (vi) and additional information on the development of the new nuclear power station at Moorside, on the NWCC planned for construction on the western edge of the property, on the protection measures of the setting of the nominated property, and on strategies to address tourism and conservation.	Following the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel, an Interim Report was sent to the State Party on 16 January 2017, explaining the findings of the ICOMOS Panel and requesting further elaboration on criteria (ii) and (vi) and additional information on the development of the new nuclear power station at Moorside, on the North West Coastal Connections planned for construction on the western edge of the property, on the protection measures of the setting of the nominated property, and on strategies to address tourism and conservation.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 320, Column 1, Line 37	Other functional structures that can be found in the fields include peat storage huts, hogg houses for sheltering young sheep and fodder, and vaccaries (cattle farms), which combine cow sheltering and dairy processing.	Other functional structures that can be found in the fields include peat storage huts, hogg houses for sheltering young sheep and fodder. In the Middle Ages, vaccaries (cattle farms), which combined cow sheltering and dairy processing, were located in some of the Lake District valleys.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 320, Column 2, Line 9	This appreciation generated tourism, artistic interpretations and efforts to reinforce this character through a number of modifications, including the construction of villas with their own parks (Rydal Hall being a very early example) in different styles, often to the designs of renowned architects (e.g. the Art and Crafts Movement), of protected viewing stations , and the landscaping of notable features or areas.	This appreciation generated tourism, artistic interpretations and efforts to reinforce this character through a number of modifications, including the construction of villas with their own parks (Rydal Hall being a very early example) in different styles, often to the designs of renowned architects (e.g. the Art and Crafts Movement), the designation of viewing stations, and the landscaping of notable features or areas.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 321, Column 1, Line 1	The stone circles near Swinside are evidence of Neolithic occupation.	The stone circle at Swinside is evidence of Neolithic occupation.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 321, Column 1, Line 42	It is a typical U-shaped glacial valley containing two lakes: Crummock and Buttermere .	It is a typical U-shaped glacial valley containing three lakes: Crummock, Buttermere and Loweswater.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 321, Column 2, Line 50	The valley also bears witness to early visitor appreciation and the efforts to improve the landscape to meet Picturesque or Romantic standards.	<i>This sentence is missing in the French version.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 322, Column 1, Line 40	Open grazing fields progressively disappeared with the creation of walled intakes outside the ring garth, and this led to the enclosure of the fields within the ring garth with the creation of inbye fields.	Open fields in the valley bottoms progressively disappeared with the building of walls to create inbye fields within the ring garth. Walled intakes were also constructed outside the ring garth.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 322, Column 1, Line 44	Major changes to the landscape occurred in the 19th century, following the Parliamentary general enclosure Acts, which led to the enclosure of large areas of the upland common land.	Further changes to the landscape occurred in the 19th century, following the Parliamentary general enclosure Acts, which led to some enclosure of areas of the upland common land.	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 325, Column 2, Line 25	The Lake District accounts for about 17 million visitors a year.	The Lake District accounts for about 17 million visitors a year (data from 2016).	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 326, Column 1, Line 30	The results of this HIA are expected by April 2017 and will inform the details of the Development Consent Order (DCO) for the project.	Work on the Moorside nuclear plant and NWCC has paused pending a review of the entire project. If the project resumes, the HIA will be completed and will inform the details of any future DCO.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. (communication via email dated 18 May 2017)

(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 326, Column 1, Line 42	Although these practices have been corrected, there seems to be a certain imbalance in the consideration of the natural values favoured over the cultural values of farming practices. In the future, measures should be adopted that consider also the cultural values and benefits of the farming activities.	These practices are currently being addressed through agri-environment grant schemes which provide funding for natural values of the landscape whilst also providing support for traditional agropastoralism. In the future, measures should be adopted that maintain an appropriate balance between cultural values and the benefits of farming activities and natural values.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which modifies the meaning of the sentence.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 326, Column 2, Line 42	Although the region has traditionally played a role in quarrying, being rich in stone-types useful to the construction industry , ICOMOS considers that a progressive reduction of this activity within the nominated property needs to be considered by the State Party and limited to the extraction of materials that may be needed to ensure the maintenance of the attribute-related features within the property.	<i>The text in bold is missing from the French version.</i>	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 327, Column 1, Line 20	Almost 40% is owned by members of the 25 organisations forming the Lake District Partnership, 20% is owned by the National Trust, most of which is considered inalienable, and a significant proportion of the land that is held in private/other ownership is owned by estates, conservation bodies and trusts.	Almost 40% is owned by members of the 25 organisations forming the Lake District Partnership, 20% is owned by the National Trust, most of which is legally inalienable, and a significant proportion of the land that is held in private/other ownership is owned by estates, conservation bodies and trusts.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 328, Column 1, Line 31	This has been informed by a strategic Heritage Impact Assessment .	This has been informed by a Sustainability Appraisal.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 328, Column 1, Line 41	The Plan for the National Park identifies its Special Qualities which should steer decision making: these qualities cover also many attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value.	The Plan for the National Park identifies its Special Qualities which should steer decision making: these qualities cover all the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 329, Column 1, Line 37	The Lake District forms a huge mountainous region with 13 different valleys within which a strong community of farmers has practiced most aspects of the traditional agropastoral system, including the hefting of heritage breeds of sheep in the common uplands.	The Lake District forms a compact mountainous region with 13 different valleys within which a strong community of farmers has practiced most aspects of the traditional agropastoral system, including the hefting of heritage breeds of sheep in the common uplands.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 330, Column 2, Line 1	From the late 18th century, a new land use developed in parts of the Lake District, designed to augment its beauty through the addition of villas and designed landscapes.	From the late 18th century and throughout the 19th century, a new land use developed in parts of the Lake District, designed to augment its beauty through the addition of villas and designed landscapes.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 330, Column 2, Line 56	The boundary of the property is the English Lake District National Park boundary as designated in 1951 and is established on the basis of both topographic features and local government boundaries.	The boundary of the property is the Lake District National Park boundary as designated in 1951 and is established on the basis of both topographic features and local government boundaries.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 331, Column 1, Line 7	These risks are managed through established systems of land management overseen by members of the English Lake District National Park Partnership and through a comprehensive system of development management administered by the National Park Authority.	These risks are managed through established systems of land management overseen by members of the Lake District National Park Partnership and through a comprehensive system of development management administered by the National Park Authority.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_EN) Page 331, Column 1, Line 39	The National Park Authority owns around four per cent of the site, and other members of the English Lake District National Park Partnership, including the Forestry Commission and United Utilities Ltd, own a further 16 per cent.	The National Park Authority owns around four per cent of the site, and other members of the Lake District National Park Partnership, including the Forestry Commission and United Utilities Ltd, own a further 16 per cent.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_FR) Page 353, Column 1, Lines 1, 7, 14 AND THROUGHOUT THE DOCUMENT	Le District des Lacs anglais	Le Lake District Anglais	L'usage dans la langue française est de traduire les noms propres et les noms des lieux en français. Par ailleurs, on ne met pas de majuscule aux adjectifs. L'ICOMOS a utilisé la traduction en français de la décision CONF 004 VII.D du Comité du patrimoine mondial (1990).
(UnitedKingdom-422rev_eval_ICOMOS_FR) Page 365, Column 2, Line 48	Le développement dans le District des Lacs anglais de l'idée de la valeur universelle d'un paysage spectaculaire, à la fois en soi et dans sa capacité à nourrir et à élever l'imagination, la créativité et l'esprit, en même temps que les menaces pesant sur la région, ont conduit au développement d'un mouvement de conservation et à la création du National Trust, qui s'est répandu dans de nombreux pays, et a contribué à la formation du concept moderne de paysages légalement protégés.	Le développement dans le District des Lacs anglais de l'idée de la valeur universelle d'un paysage spectaculaire, à la fois en soi et dans sa capacité à nourrir et à élever l'imagination, la créativité et l'esprit, en même temps que les menaces pesant sur la région, ont conduit au développement d'un mouvement de conservation et à la mouvement du National Trust , qui s'est répandu dans de nombreux pays, et a contribué à la formation du concept moderne de paysages légalement protégés.	ICOMOS suggest the following: ont conduit au développement d'un mouvement de conservation et à l'établissement du mouvement du National Trust

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Turquie

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Aphrodisias

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
Page 259, column 2, line 47	Cult images of the Aphrodite of Aphrodisias are characterized by an original cult statue embodying Anatoolian and Hellenistic characteristics.	The original cult statue of the Aphrodite of Aphrodisias embodies Anatolian and Hellenistic characteristics. (There is only one cult statue. "Cult images" is an unusual formulation.)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 259, column 1, line 19	A large stadium is at the north end of the city, near a monumental gateway, the tetrapylon.	A large stadium is at the north end of the city. (The Tetrapylon is not near the stadium and is not to be associated with it.)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 260, column 1, line 10	The theatre is at the south-end of the city's core, built into an artificial mound that contains evidence for earlier settlement at Aphrodisias dating to 600 BCE.	The theatre is at the south-end of the city's core, built into a hill that contains evidence for earlier settlement at Aphrodisias dating back to the Early Bronze Age.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 260, column 1, line 15	A wall on the north side of the theatre is covered with inscriptions that describe the patronage and history of the construction of the city's buildings and the priveleges ...	A wall on the north side of the theatre's stage building is covered with inscriptions that describe the privileges.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change, which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
Page 261, column 1, paragraph 3	but the current programme was abandoned	Delete! (Not true)	ICOMOS accepts this clarification as a factual error.
Page 261, column 1, paragraph 3	The Institute of Fine Arts at	Delete (Not true)	ICOMOS accepts this clarification as a factual error.
Page 261, column 1, paragraph 3	The Institute continues...	The Institute of Fine Arts, New York University continues	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification

Page 261, column 1, paragraph 3	large scale restoration	large scale anastylosis	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
Page 261, column 1, paragraph 3	and then the Sebasteion	and then parts of the Sebasteion	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
Page 261, column 1, line 30	The nomination dossier states that the city component is owned by the State.	The nomination dossier states that the city component is mostly owned by the State.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 261, column 2, line 10-11	... not only in public buildings, but also of private ones, which are almost unknown in Aphrodisias ...	This is not true. Among the main domestic complexes, there are for example: the Tetrapylon House, the Atrium House, the Triconch House, the North Temenos House, the Water Channel House, the Cryptoporticus House.	ICOMOS considers that this correction contains new information that cannot be taken account of at this stage. (Only the Atrium house is described in the dossier with a one paragraph description.)
Page 261, column 2, line 30	Except for the nearby Görtepe quarry,	Göktepe	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error.
Page 263, column 2, line 8	The quarries, the workshop, the great wall of the theatre with its inscriptions...	The quarries, the workshop, the archive wall of the theatre with its inscriptions...	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
Page 265, column 1, line 47-52	The quarry component was registered as a 1st degree archaeological conservation zone by the decision of Aydin Regional Conservation Council dated 27th October 2016, numbered 5580. The map of the boundaries of the property should be updated to reflect this.	The map submitted by November 2016 already shows that the quarry component is registered as a 1 st degree conservation zone.	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error. However, ICOMOS would like to highlight that the scale used on the map for the quarries is not the same as for the city and therefore the dotted line is not easily readable.
Page 265, column 2, line 5	ICOMOS notes that the legal protection of the property is satisfactory, though there is a pressing need for a better enforcement processes.	ICOMOS notes that the legal protection of the property is satisfactory, though there is a pressing need for better enforcement processes.	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
Page 265, column 2, last paragraph, line 9	A modern quarry has been in use until a few years ago and an	A modern quarry had been in use until a few years ago...	ICOMOS considers this correction to be

	abandoned crane and other extraction equipment remain in place.		an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence
Page 265, column 2, line 28	Sebasteion Propylea	Sebasteion Propylon	ICOMOS acknowledges this typing error
Page 265, column 2, line 34	On the Sebasteion, marble casts are mounted in place of the originals.	On the Sebasteion, casts made of artificial stone are mounted in place of the originals. (Casts cannot be made of marble.)	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification.
Page 266, column 2, line 16	Additional information received in February 2017 indicates that the boundary of the management plan will be increased to include all of the quarry component and the portion of the buffer zone surrounding it.	has been	ICOMOS accepts this correction as a factual error.
Page 266, column 1, line 24 - 30	ICOMOS considers that given the extensive and apparently on-going programme of anastylosis, more details should be provided on precisely what has been reconstructed, how it has been documented, and what ancillary associated interventions have been undertaken. It is also necessary to understand what further work is planned.	A flash memory full of detailed reports, maps and drawings that explains the methods, techniques and stages of each of anastylosis projects was provided to the evaluator during site mission. As also explained to the Panel members, there is no current planned anastylosis project for the site.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification
Page 266, column 2, line 32 -36	It is not clear from the nomination dossier how the site manager relates to the museum director nor whether the museum staff have responsibilities outside the museum building.	An organigram presenting the respective levels of authority among the relevant partners was presented via additional information report on November, upon the request of the evaluator during the site mission. The area of responsibility of the museum staff was clearly depicted to the evaluator as being the whole registered conservation sites.	ICOMOS acknowledges this clarification (although it is still not clear from the organigram how the site manager relates to the museum director)

FORMULAIRE POUR LA SOUMISSION DES ERREURS FACTUELLES DANS LES EVALUATIONS DES ORGANISATIONS CONSULTATIVES

(conformément au paragraphe 150 des *Orientations*)

ÉTAT(S) PARTIE(S) : Pays-Bas

ÉVALUATION DE LA PROPOSITION D'INSCRIPTION DU SITE : Ligne de défense d'Amsterdam

ÉVALUATION DE L'ORGANISATION CONSULTATIVE CONCERNÉE : ICOMOS

Page, colonne, ligne de l'évaluation de l'Organisation consultative	Phrase incluant l'erreur factuelle (l'erreur factuelle devrait figurer en gras)	Correction proposée par l'Etat partie	Commentaire (s'il y en a) de l'Organisation consultative et/ou du Centre du patrimoine mondial
p.26, right, line 30-33	terms of reference focused on property, but	terms of reference focused on ... property and the potential inclusion of some minor boundary modifications , but	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence and the sentence that follows.
p.28, right, l. 3 and 15	advises	Declares	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
p.28, right, l. 22-23	the recommendation to establish a buffer zone	the recommendation to consider to establish a buffer zone	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
l. 29		All other legal regulations that have been implemented are missing in the assessment.	ICOMOS has taken into account all the information included in the documentation provided by the State Party for the evaluation of this request

l. 11 f.u.	the advice	the notification	ICOMOS considers this correction to be an editorial change which does not modify the meaning of the sentence.
l. 3 f.u.	should be thoroughly assessed	have been thoroughly assessed	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion
p. 29, left, line 6-7	this was not the primary focus of the terms of reference, and does not replace ...	this was one of the four terms of reference and replaces	ICOMOS considers this correction to be a clarification.
line 11-12	cannot not	can	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion
p.29, right, line 21	“should not be approved”	“should be approved”	ICOMOS considers that this reflects a difference of opinion