

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

> Organisation des Nations Unies

> pour l'éducation,

la science et la culture

# **World Heritage**

# 41 COM

# WHC/17/41.COM/7A.Add.2

Paris, 8 June 2017 Original: English / French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

**Forty-first session** 

Krakow, Poland 2-12 July 2017

# <u>Item 7A of the Provisional Agenda:</u> State of conservation of the properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

# SUMMARY

In accordance with Section IV B, paragraphs 190-191 of the *Operational Guidelines*, the Committee shall review annually the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. This review shall include such monitoring procedures and expert missions as might be determined necessary by the Committee.

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. The full reports of Reactive Monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language: http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/41COM/documents

All state of conservation reports are also available through the World Heritage State of conservation Information System at the following Web address: http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc

**Decision required**: The Committee is requested to review the following state of conservation reports. The Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

# TABLE OF CONTENT

NATURAL F	PROPERTIES	2
AFRICA		2
13.	Simien National Park (Ethiopia) (N 9)	2
14.	Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)	6
CULTURAL	PROPERTIES	10
ARAB	STATES	10
36.	Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (Site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)	10

# NATURAL PROPERTIES

# AFRICA

# 13. Simien National Park (Ethiopia) (N 9)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1978

Criteria (vii)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1996-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Major declines of the Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf populations and of other large mammals
- Agricultural encroachment at the borders of the property
- Impacts of road construction through the property

<u>Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger</u> Adopted, see <u>http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4085</u>

### Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4085

<u>Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures</u> Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/9/documents/

International Assistance Requests approved: 10 (from 1978-2013) Total amount approved: USD 323,171 For details, see http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/9/assistance/

#### UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 100,000 (2012-2015) in support of community conservation programme with co-financing from Global Environment Fund (GEF) and development of the grazing pressure reduction strategy (UNESCO-Spain-Funds-in Trust and UNESCO-Netherlands-Funds-in-Trust)

#### Previous monitoring missions

2001, 2006 and 2009: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions; 2017: IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission.

#### Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Road construction through the property
- Identity, social cohesion, changes in local population and community
- Crop cultivation
- Overgrazing by livestock causing land degradation and human-wildlife conflict
- Declining populations of Walia ibex, Ethiopian wolf and other large mammal species
- Agricultural encroachment at the borders of the property
- · Impacts and risks associated with tourism

## Illustrative material see http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/9/

## Current conservation issues

On 8 February 2017, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property in response to Committee Decision **40 COM 7A.43** (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016). From 23 to 30 April 2017 an IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission visited the property. Both reports are available at <a href="http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/9/documents">http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/9/documents</a>. The State Party reports progress made towards the corrective measures as follows:

- Preparation towards a boundary modification of the property is underway;
- Beginning implementation of a consolidated strategic framework, including the General Management Plan (GMP), a Tourism Master Plan, a Grazing Pressure Reduction Strategy and Livelihood Improvement Strategies;
- Relocation of the Gich community has been completed, with most individual compensations secured while a few individual court cases are still ongoing, infrastructure and the draft livelihood improvement strategy and action plan have been developed;
- Cooperation with partners including the Austrian Development Cooperation, the African Wildlife Foundation, Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (KfW) and UNDP in the operational park management and livelihood improvement of resettled communities;
- Significant increases of the populations of Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf over the past decade;
- Delays of the construction of a new road to serve as an alternative route to an existing road crossing sensitive areas within the property. The task has been transferred to the governmental Defense Construction Company, which is expected to complete the stalled works;
- Commitment is made to re-align the power line along the above-mentioned new road;
- Increase in tourism activities, with reported interest to develop the sector further.

The State Party also provides a map with the locations of the existing and proposed eco-lodges, stating that they are all located "almost on the boundary line (within the buffer zone)" of Simien Mountains National Park (SMNP).

# Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The 2017 mission confirmed that the overarching challenge for the relatively small property arises due to the growing human population living in its immediate vicinity and to a lesser extent within it, and relying on the property's natural resources. The State Party has made considerable progress in responding to Committee requests but further efforts are needed to reduce overgrazing, better manage tourism and infrastructures and promote alternative livelihoods. The 2009-2019 GMP provides a good framework for the management of the property, but its implementation is currently limited. Development of a new GMP provides a clear opportunity to address the above concerns and expand the geographical scope of the GMP to incorporate the newly defined boundaries.

The voluntary resettlement of the Gich community reduces the unsustainable agricultural and grazing pressure on a centrally located and particularly valuable area within the property. Great care should be taken to fulfil all the necessary commitments from the resettlement process, including payment of the remaining compensations and implementation of the livelihood strategy, in full compliance with both national laws and international policy and guidance.

While noting the difficulties in estimating populations of Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf, there appears to be an encouraging indication on increasing or at least stable populations, thereby meeting the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) ecological indicators. However, there is a need for a clearer monitoring protocol for populations of Walia ibex, Ethiopian wolf and gelada to establish a consensus on realistic population numbers and trends of these three flagship species of the property.

Tourism has the potential to create alternative employment and income opportunities but also comes with impacts and risks, which need to be understood and addressed. Despite the map submitted and State Party's description, the locations of the current and proposed eco-lodges remain unclear, especially regarding whether the lodges are inside or outside of SMNP boundaries. The State Party refers to a buffer zone, which has not yet been defined for the property but this should be encouraged.

It is also noted that no update is provided on the status of the Environmental Impact Assessments (EIAs) for these proposed developments in order to assess the potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property as requested by the Committee in Decision **40 COM 7A.43**.

While the delay of the road construction aiming at reducing disturbance in important afro-alpine habitats is unfortunate, the renewed State Party commitment to finalize the project is encouraging. As noted by the State Party, the new road will cross a different section of the SMNP. An EIA should be developed in line with IUCN's World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Assessment to mitigate the impacts of the new road.

The mission reports the State Party's strong commitment and management responses at all governmental levels. Zonation and user agreements defining rights and responsibilities for local subsistence use of natural resources are among the promising instruments in making further progress to address overgrazing while supporting livelihoods, as proposed by the Grazing Pressure Reduction Strategy,. The mission recommends the DSOCR indicator on grazing be updated to assess the enabling framework rather than a quantitative indicator. It is important to note that addressing the conflicts between local livelihood needs and conservation objectives are permanent and fundamental management requirements. Despite substantial investments made to date, major additional investment is required and external governmental and non-governmental partners are strongly encouraged to closely coordinate with the State Party.

The mission considers that, despite the commendable progress, the property should remain on the List of World Heritage in Danger. As a pragmatic and coherent way forward, the mission recommends a focus on the formalization of the Significant Boundary Modification requested by the Committee. As this procedure involves the preparation of a new nomination, it represents an opportunity for the State Party to demonstrate compliance with World Heritage expectations such as Committee requests, mission recommendations, including further progress achieved towards the DSOCR. At the same time, it is recommended that the elaboration of the next GMP to encompass the expanded SMNP should start as soon as possible, fully considering the World Heritage status and its implications. It is therefore recommended that the Committee encourage the State Party to take advantage of these two pending processes in an effort to refine the evolving policy and management framework along with a realistic and fundable implementation plan.

# Draft Decision: 41 COM 7A.13

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/17/41.COM/7A.Add.2,
- <u>Recalling</u> Decisions 35 COM 7A.9, 39 COM 7A.10 and 40 COM 7A.43 adopted at its 35th (UNESCO, 2011), 39th (Bonn, 2015) and 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) sessions respectively;
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> further progress towards the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), including:
  - a) Further refinement of the policy and management framework that has been achieved,
  - b) The evidence of stable and possibly increasing populations of the flagship species Walia ibex, Ethiopian wolf and gelada;
- 4. <u>Adopts</u> the updated DSOCR indicator on grazing as recommended by the 2017 IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission, and <u>requests</u> the State Party to implement the other recommendations of the 2017 mission, which build upon earlier mission recommendations, in particular to:
  - a) Initiate the evaluation of the current 2009-2019 General Management Plan (GMP) to inform the next GMP,

- b) Strengthen the participation of local communities in the management and eventually the governance of the property;
- 5. <u>Reiterates its repeated request</u> to the State Party to submit a proposal for a Significant Boundary Modification through the preparation of a new nomination as per Decisions **35 COM 7A.9** and **40 COM 7A.43**, in order to harmonize the boundaries of the property with the new boundaries of the national park, and <u>encourages</u> the State Party to use the process as a coherent framework to structure and coordinate the implementation of actions towards meeting the DSOCR;
- 6. <u>Also requests</u> the State Party to initiate the development of a new GMP to encompass the expanded Simien Mountains National Park boundaries and to further refine the policy and management framework with the objectives to reduce overgrazing, better manage tourism and infrastructures and promote alternative livelihoods;
- 7. <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to develop clear and agreed monitoring protocols for the populations of Walia ibex, Ethiopian wolf and gelada;
- 8. <u>Takes note</u> that the voluntary relocation of the Gich community has been completed, and <u>requests furthermore</u> the State Party to ensure the application of the highest international standards in concluding all the remaining commitments, including in regard to compensation and establishment of alternative livelihood options;
- 9. <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the State Party's commitment to complete the construction of the alternative road aiming at reducing disturbance of the existing main road in important afro-alpine habitats, and to re-align the power line with this new road, and <u>requests moreover</u> the State Party to conduct an Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) for the part of the new road crossing the national park in line with IUCN's World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Assessment, and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by IUCN;
- 10. <u>Also notes with appreciation</u> that multilateral, bilateral and non-governmental partners cooperate with the State Party on the conservation of the property and <u>strongly</u> <u>encourages</u> all current and future partners to fully coordinate their efforts under the leadership of the State Party;
- 11. <u>Also reiterates its request</u> to the State Party to clarify the location of the proposed ecolodge developments inside the park, and to undertake EIAs including a thorough assessment of the potential impacts on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property in line with IUCN's World Heritage Advice Note on Environmental Assessment, and to submit these EIAs to the World Heritage Centre for review before any decisions are made, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- 12. <u>Finally requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2018**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 42nd session in 2018;
- 13. <u>Decides</u> to retain Simien National Park (Ethiopia) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

# 14. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2007

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2010-present

<u>Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger</u> Illegal logging of precious wood species (ebony and rosewood) and its secondary impacts; poaching of endangered lemurs were identified as threats for the site's integrity.

<u>Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger</u> Adopted, see page <u>http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344</u>

#### Corrective measures identified

Adopted, see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344

*Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures* Adopted, see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4344

Previous Committee Decisions see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/documents/

International Assistance Requests approved: 3 (from 2000-2016) Total amount approved: USD 155,000 For details, see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/assistance/

#### UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 1,890,000 from the United Nations Foundation and the Nordic World Heritage Foundation; USD 1,039,000 from the Government of Norway

Previous monitoring missions

May 2011, September 2015: Joint World Heritage Centre / IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Encroachment
- Fire
- Hunting and poaching
- Artisanal mining
- Illegal logging
- Governance
- Engagement of local communities

Illustrative material see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/

#### Current conservation issues

On 8 February 2017, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, available at <u>http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1257/documents/</u>, presenting its progress achieved in implementing the Committee's decisions and the 2015 mission recommendations as follows:

- Decree No 2016-801 to operationalize Act No 2015-056 has been issued to combat illegal trafficking of rosewood and ebony, and in December 2016, the Ministry of Justice issued a circular in order to prosecute offenders;
- In December 2016, a report on the status of the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) Action Plan was submitted to the CITES Secretariat, focussing on its plans for the legal exportation of at least one third of the stock, regulation of trade in rosewood, and progress in implementing anti-fraud measures;

- Resources have been allocated to undertake a stock inventory from January 2017 to estimate the volume of stockpiles and its monetary value. Other internationally funded projects include wood specimen identification to reduce false declarations, Sustainable Landscape Management, and forest governance. However additional funding is still required to fully implement the Action Plan;
- A factory for the treatment of seized timber is no longer proposed;
- Monitoring for illegal logging, mining and poaching has been undertaken through intensive patrolling in collaboration with the Local Parks Committees, with particular focus on Marojejy National Park. 175 staff have been trained in Spatial Monitoring and Reporting Tool (SMART) software, which is being implemented in all components of the property;
- Sapphire and ruby miners were evacuated from the Ankeniheny-Zahamena Corridor, approximately 10 km from Zahamena National Park, but this led to the invasion of the Corridor by 200,000 squatters. A five-year Action Plan on illegal mining at Ranomafana National Park is being developed, and efforts to reduce pressures associated with artisanal mining, particularly gold, are undertaken;
- Satellite and aerial surveillance are being used to detect and predict suspicious vessel movements for transport of timber;
- A sustainable coastal fisheries project is being implemented to provide food security to local communities.

Progress towards the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) is reported as follows:

- The illegal logging of precious woods increased in 2016 (99) compared to 2015 (36). While the exploitation of rosewood is reported to have ceased, palisander continues to be exploited;
- Forest clearance increased from 0.004% in 2015 to 0.16% in 2016, notably in Masoala and Andohahela National Parks;
- In 2016, 123 ha of degraded areas were restored in Andringitra, Masoala and Zahamena National Parks;
- The number of recorded lemur traps decreased from 112 in 2015 to 65 in 2016.

#### Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The State Party's continued effort to address the threats on the property is appreciated. In particular, the issuance of the Decree to operationalize Act No 2015-056 creating a special tribunal to adjudicate wood traffickers and reinforce penalties, allocation of resources to undertake stock inventory, and the multiple projects to strengthen the monitoring, management and governance towards reducing illegal logging planned through international donor support and collaborations are welcomed.

Although the last report submitted by the State Party to the CITES Secretariat is yet to be discussed, the 17th meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES (COP17) in September 2016 led to the decision to further strengthen the protection given to *Dalbergia* and *Diospyros* species in Madagascar. Furthermore, the Government of Madagascar adopted a Biodiversity Management Plan at COP17, which presents activities and indicators to strengthen the protection of World Heritage and protected areas, including by enacting a decree to punish offenders relating to rosewood and ebony exploitation, and formation of joint forces (the State Party, police and the military) to ensure regular patrols of the property. It is therefore recommended that the Committee strongly encourage the State Party to continue to implement the CITES Action Plan and the Biodiversity Management Plan.

It is noted that fewer lemur traps were detected in 2016 compared to the preceding year, but data since 2009 indicate annual fluctuations, which remain relatively stable overall. Positive progress however has been made by the State Party in restoring degraded areas across three of the components of the property, including local community consultations on the restoration approaches, and the implementation of SMART software in the monitoring of all six components of the property.

In spite of the State Party's ongoing efforts, it is regrettable that an increase in demand for precious woods and minerals are leading to further exploitation of the property. Notably, the rise in the number of cases of illegal logging and the staggering increase in the percentage of forest clearance, which has

exceeded the DSOCR indicator of 0.01% in the property for the first time since 2013, are of significant concern.

The entry of artisanal miners into the Ankeniheny-Zahamena Corridor and the subsequent squatting is also of much concern, especially considering that the Committee recommended the State Party to review potential future addition of protected areas forming corridors of natural forest between existing reserves within the property, at the time of inscription (Decision **31 COM 8B.9**). The reported prioritization by the State Party to resolve this issue is appreciated in this regard.

Regarding the Conservation and Management Assistance Project (USD 100,000 from the International Assistance, Decision **34 COM 15.2**), the second phase was implemented by the Foundation for Protected Areas and Biodiversity of Madagascar, producing encouraging results. The relay structures of Masoala and Marojejy National Parks have been strengthened in their logistical and operational capacities in the fight against illegal trafficking of precious wood. Local communities have been made aware of the conservation and sustainable management of the property through the organization of an information campaign and the development of information media.

Whilst acknowledging the State Party's progress, further efforts are still needed to meet the DSOCR indicators, especially in light of the reported increases in illegal logging and forest clearance, and it is therefore recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

# Draft Decision: 41 COM 7A.14

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/17/41.COM/7A.Add.2,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decision **40 COM 7A.44**, adopted at its 40th session (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016),
- 3. <u>Welcomes</u> the issuance of a decree to operationalize Act N° 2015-056 creating a special tribunal to adjudicate traffickers and reinforce penalties, which should contribute towards halting the illicit trafficking of precious wood;
- 4. <u>Appreciates</u> the international donor support provided in strengthening the monitoring, management and governance of the property towards reducing illegal logging;
- <u>Notes with appreciation</u> the progress achieved in restoring degraded sites and <u>requests</u> the State Party to report on the remaining sites to be rehabilitated and ensure continued engagement with the local workforce;
- 6. <u>Notes with significant concern</u> that illegal logging and forest clearance have increased in 2016, particularly in Masoala and Andohahela National Parks, exceeding for the first time since 2013 the indicator for forest clearance of maximum 0.01%, as defined in the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to further enhance its monitoring activities in these two components of the property;
- 7. <u>Strongly encourages</u> the State Party to continue to fully implement the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES) Action Plan and the Biodiversity Management Plan;
- <u>Further requests</u> the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2018**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 42nd session in 2018;

9. <u>Decides</u> to retain Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

# **CULTURAL PROPERTIES**

# **ARAB STATES**

# 36. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (Site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1981

Criteria (ii)(iii)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 1982-present

<u>Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger</u> (cf. Document CLT 82/CH/CONF.015/8)

"[...] the situation of this property corresponds to the criteria mentioned in the ICOMOS note and, in particular, to criteria (e) (significant loss of historical authenticity) and (f) (important loss of cultural significance) as far as "ascertained danger" is concerned, and to criteria (a) (modification of juridical status of the property diminishing the degree of its protection), (b) (lack of conservation policy) and (d) (threatening effects of town planning) as far as "potential danger" is concerned. [...]"

<u>Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger</u> Not yet drafted

<u>Corrective measures identified</u> Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/148/documents/

<u>International Assistance</u> Requests approved: 1 (from 1982-1982) Total amount approved: USD 100,000 For details, see page <u>http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/148/assistance/</u>

# UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: approximately USD 5,000,000 (since 1988)

# Previous monitoring missions

February-March 2004: World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM mission; from September 2005 to May 2008: 6 experts missions within the framework of the elaboration of the Action Plan for the Safeguarding of the Cultural Heritage of the Old City of Jerusalem; February-March 2007: special World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM mission sent by the Director-General of UNESCO for the issue of the Mughrabi ascent; August 2007, January and February 2008: missions for the application of the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism; March and December 2009: World Heritage Centre missions; December 2013, October 2014, February 2015 and June 2015: project missions.

#### Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Natural risk factors
- Lack of planning, governance and management processes
- Alteration of the urban and social fabric
- Impact of archaeological excavations
- Deterioration of monuments
- Urban environment and visual integrity

# • Traffic, access and circulation

Illustrative material see page http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/148/

#### Current conservation issues

The Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (Site proposed by Jordan) was inscribed, as a holy city for Judaism, Christianity and Islam, on the World Heritage List in 1981. It has been further inscribed since 1982 on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

A report was provided to the World Heritage Centre by the Israeli Permanent Delegation to UNESCO on 6 February 2017. A joint report was provided to UNESCO by the Jordanian and Palestinian Permanent Delegations on 16 May 2017. These reports are available at <a href="http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/148/documents/">http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/148/documents/</a>.

### I. Report by the Israeli authorities

It is to be noted that since 1967, the Old City of Jerusalem has been *de facto* administered by the Israeli authorities. The report submitted on 6 February 2017 underlines that it refers only to new actions taken or ongoing processes in the areas inside the Walls of the Old City of Jerusalem – intra muros sites. The report presents a wide range of activities. Most of them are similar to those mentioned in the 2016 report and the previously reported activities are therefore not included in the present document. Updates are summarized hereunder:

### a) Overall plans and development

Regarding town planning, the report informs about detailed plans in the Old City and notably about a local plan for the construction of the Western Wall Heritage Foundation administrative building which received validation in 2016.

Regarding physical infrastructure, design and execution, the report provides a list of upgrading of infrastructures. It informs notably that two of the wider public projects, Public Infrastructures renewal and streetscape improvement along Hagai (EI Wad) Street as well as Installation of Interpretation and Orientation Signage through the Old City, were concluded in 2016. The report also indicates that next comprehensive public space improvement projects are to implemented in 2017 in the Christian and Armenian quarters. It furthermore underlines that management and maintenance activities in the Old City as well as accessibility improvement works have expanded.

# b) Archaeology and conservation activities

The report mentions that ongoing conservation and repair works are conducted by the Islamic Waqf and supervised by Israel Antiquities Authority (IAA). In this regard, The report indicates that preservation and conservation works on the Dome of the Rock were conducted in 2016 and informs of ongoing conservation works at Solomon's Stables.

Conservation activities are also reported at the Western Wall compound.

It also provides information on conservation works and activities in the Old City and along its Walls, which includes renovation works and graffiti cleaning; rescue excavations and renovation as well as preservation works in the Jewish Quarter as well as at the Church of the Holy Sepulcher.

The report also provides a list of other conservation works in the Old City, including renovations activities carried out as an initiative of the Islamic Waqf.

Further to the 2016 report, which described "excavation along the foundations of the Western Wall (...) which will help understand the building procedure of the Temple Mount", the 2017 report provides a list of several reported archaeological and rescue excavations in the Old City and along the Walls, notably in the Muslim and Armenian Quarters. Some of the excavations included in the report are referred to as "salvage excavations" notably in the Jewish Quarter and Christian quarters.

Finally, the report provides a list of tourism and cultural events that were organized.

# II. Report by the Jordanian and Palestinian authorities

The report submitted on 16 May 2017 provides information based on the observations and reports of the Jordanian Jerusalem Awqaf and the Jordanian National Committee for World Heritage. It presents conservation activities by the Jordanian Jerusalem Awqaf and by the Hashemite Fund for the Restoration of Al-Aqsa Mosque/Al-Haram Al-Sharif as well as information on measures undertaken in the Old City, reiterating the concern of the Jordanian and Palestinian authorities on these matters.

The content of report is summarized below:

# a) Renovation and Conservation activities

The report refers to reported prevention of the Jordanian Jerusalem Awqaf, from performing renovation works, emergency restorations and stabilization measures to historical structures and to the Mughrabi Gate Pathway.

Furthermore, the report presents a detailed list of activities and projects implemented by the Hashemite Fund for the Restoration of Al-Aqsa Mosque/Al-Haram Al-Sharif and the Hashemite Restoration Committee notably on the Dome of the Rock, the Al-Jame' Al-Aqsa / The Qibli Mosque as well as in the Marwani Mosque.

The report also includes a list of conservation and renovation activities undertaken in the Old City, and reported some of them as "stopped" or "banned". Specific reported damages, notably to several buildings and structures such as the Mamluk wooden gates of Al-Jame' Al-Aqsa / The Qibli Mosque as well as the Dome of Ascension, are also registered in the report.

# b) Archaeology and construction

The report provides an update on constructions, excavations and reported intrusive tunneling actions in and around the Old City<sup>1</sup>, in particular in the areas of the Western Wall and in Silwan. Of particular concern to the Jordanian and Palestinian authorities are demolitions, intrusive constructions, tunneling and extensive underground excavations.

In addition, the report provides several examples of construction projects in the Old City of Jerusalem, in a manner that negatively affects the function, visual view and skyline of the Old City, notably for what concerns the tramway adjacent to the Northern Wall and the reported plans to construct a cable car system at the southern walls. Furthermore, the report expresses concern related to reported aggressions against religious sites and prayer places.

The report also refers to the Resolutions and Decisions taken in this regard, notably by the United Nations.

# c) Recommendations

The report adresses several recommendations notably with a view to ensuring the implementation of Resolutions and Decisions taken by UNESCO.

# III. The Mughrabi Ascent

# a) Expert meeting

Since its 31st session (Christchurch, 2007), the World Heritage Committee has repeatedly asked "the World Heritage Centre to facilitate the professional encounter at the technical level between Israeli, Jordanian and Waqf experts to discuss the detailed proposals for the proposed final design of the Mughrabi ascent, prior to any final decision." (Decision **31 COM 7A.18**). Two such meetings took place in Jerusalem on 13 January and 24 February 2008.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The issue of the archaeological excavations carried out since 1967 in the Old City of Jerusalem is also the subject of consideration by the Governing Bodies of UNESCO. These archaeological campaigns are in contradiction with article VI. 32 of the 1956 New Delhi *Recommendation on International Principles Applicable to Archaeological Excavations*, related to excavations in an occupied territory.

UNESCO convened a technical meeting at its Headquarters in 2012, however neither examination nor discussion to reach a consensus on the design of the Mughrabi Ascent could take place on this occasion.

Another meeting was foreseen to take place at the World Heritage Centre in May 2013. However not all the parties concerned were in a position to attend. Since then, the World Heritage Committee has deplored the fact that the meeting of experts on the Mughrabi Ascent had not taken place.

Should such a meeting take place, the Secretariat will report on it such a meeting to the World Heritage Committee accordingly, either through an Addendum or orally.

# b) Conservation

The information provided in the report by the Jordanian and Palestinian authorities indicates reported "Systematic Demolition of the Magharbeh Gate Pathway (MGP) 2004-2016". It refers notably to reported extensive "aggression against the MGP" by many constructions, excavations, demolitions, expansions of prayer areas as well as underground tunneling beneath the MGP.

# IV. UNESCO operational projects

The Norwegian Government and UNESCO signed in December 2011 an agreement for the project "Ensuring the sustainability of the Centre for the Restoration of Islamic Manuscripts of the Haram al-Sharif in Jerusalem" to build capacities of the staff of the Centre in the preservation of Islamic manuscripts. The stakeholders are currently discussing a possible new phase of the project to be implemented from 2017 onwards.

The project "Safeguarding, Refurbishment and Revitalization of the Islamic Museum of the Haram al-Sharif and its Collection" started in 2008 with funding from the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. The project is currently on hold as it requires additional funding to complete the proposed museographical and scenographical planning, which was approved in March 2015 by the Awqaf authorities. A follow-up mission took place in June 2015. The re-opening of the Museum depends on the availability of funds, and is foreseen beyond 2017.

# V. Reactive Monitoring mission

The World Heritage Committee requested at its 34th (Brasilia, 2010), 35th (UNESCO, 2011), 36th (Saint Petersburg, 2012) sessions respectively, "a joint World Heritage Centre/ICCROM/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property as referred to in the *Operational Guidelines* to assess and advise on progress made in the implementation of the Action Plan and, in cooperation and consultation with the concerned parties, to identify appropriate operational and financial mechanisms and modalities to strengthen technical cooperation with all concerned parties in the framework of the Action Plan". However, no agreement could be reached between the concerned parties on the Terms of Reference of the mission which was planned to take place in May 2013.

Since then, the World Heritage Committee has reiterated the request of the dispatch of the mission. In case it would take place, the Secretariat will be reporting on such a mission to the World Heritage Committee accordingly, either through an Addendum or orally.

# VI. Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism

The "Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism", requested by the UNESCO Executive Board at its 176th session and by the World Heritage Committee at its 31st session (Christchurch, 2007), has been applied to the Mughrabi Ascent since then. Consequently, nine reports were prepared by the World Heritage Centre and forwarded to the concerned parties and the members of the World Heritage Committee. At its 35th session (UNESCO, 2011), the World Heritage Committee decided to expand the mechanism to the entire Old City of Jerusalem and, thus, 7 reports were prepared respectively in December 2011, March 2012, February 2013, March 2014, April 2015, April 2016 as well as in May 2017 and transmitted to the members of the World Heritage Committee and the concerned parties.

# Draft Decision: 41 COM 7A.36

The Draft Decision will be presented to the World Heritage Committee during the session.