
Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain (Spain)

No 669bis

Official name as proposed by the State Party

Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain

Location

The Autonomous Communities of Galicia, Cantabria, La Rioja, the Principality of Asturias, and the Basque Country
Spain

Brief description

The Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain is a network of four interconnected Christian pilgrimage routes, three of which lead to Santiago de Compostela in Galicia. Proposed as an extension of the serial property "Route of Santiago de Compostela" (1993), this almost 1500-km-long network is comprised of the Coastal, Interior, Liébana, and Primitive routes, as well as 16 individual cathedrals, churches, monasteries, and other structures along these four Ways of Saint James. The proposed extension includes some of the earliest paths of pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela created after the 9th-century discovery there of a tomb believed to be that of the Apostle James the Greater.

Category of property

In terms of categories of cultural property set out in Article I of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a serial nomination of 20 *monuments*.

In terms of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (July 2013), annex 3, this is also a *heritage route*.

1 Basic data

Included in the Tentative List

27 April 2007

International Assistance from the World Heritage Fund for preparing the Nomination

None

Date received by the World Heritage Centre

22 January 2014

Background

This is a proposed extension of the serial property "Route of Santiago de Compostela" (Spain) (the "French" Route), which was inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi) at the 17th session of the World Heritage Committee (17 COM, 1993).

Consultations

ICOMOS consulted its International Scientific Committee on Cultural Itinerary and several independent experts.

Technical Evaluation Mission

An ICOMOS technical evaluation mission visited the property from 15 to 23 September 2014.

Additional information received by ICOMOS

A letter was sent by ICOMOS to the State Party on 4 September 2014 to request further information about the proposed official name of the extended serial property, the choice of components that comprise this proposed extension, and the possibility of further extending the inscribed serial property; the choice of boundaries for the buffer zones; the relationship between the proposed boundaries and the existing protective legislation; the existing and proposed management system; the two components that have previously been inscribed on the World Heritage List; the sources and level of funding available; and community involvement in the preparation of the nomination dossier and management system.

The State Party replied on 17 October 2014, sending additional documentation which has been taken into account in this evaluation.

A second letter was sent to the State Party on 23 December 2014, asking it to provide further explanation of the methodology used in choosing the proposed extension's component parts, boundaries, and buffer zones; to reconsider the proposed changes to the wording of the criteria justifications; to provide additional documentation on the authenticity and integrity of the nominated pilgrimage routes; to provide a clarification of how the coordinated management system will be integrated in the existing management framework; and to undertake additional comparative studies with the two already inscribed Route of Santiago de Compostela properties and with other Jacobean routes.

The State Party replied on 25 February 2015, sending additional documentation that has been taken into account in this evaluation.

Date of ICOMOS approval of this report

12 March 2015

2 The property

Description

The proposed extension is comprised of four Christian pilgrimage routes in northern Spain and 16 of the most culturally significant structures along these routes. The *Coastal Route* starts at the mouth of the Bidasoa, a short river that forms part of the border between Spain and France, and follows the coast of the Bay of Biscay (Cantabrian Sea) westward to Santiago de Compostela by way of Donostia–San Sebastián, Bilbao, Santander, and Gijón, a distance of 936.28 km. Three additional routes branch off the Coastal Route. From east to west, they are

the *Interior of the Basque Country-La Rioja Route* (196.0 km long), which connects the start of the Coastal Route with the already inscribed French Route (the best known and most used of the Jacobean pilgrimage routes) by way of Vitoria-Gasteiz and thence to Compostela; the *Liébana Route* (55.32 km long), which provides access to Santo Toribio de Liébana Monastery, a Catholic pilgrimage site; and the *Primitive Route* (311.31 km long), which branches off the Coastal Route just east of Gijón to travel through Oviedo and Lugo and thence to Compostela via the French Route.

The Primitive Route linking Oviedo with the Galician capital largely follows ancient Roman inland routes in the western part of Asturias. It became the first pilgrimage route used after the tomb believed to be the Apostle's was discovered. The subsequent development of the northern pilgrimage routes facilitated the growth of cities and the creation of new population centres in this region of the Iberian peninsula. The inclusion in the nominated serial property of Roman walls, five cathedrals, four churches, two collegiate, two monasteries, a bridge, and a tunnel with a medieval roadway provides evidence of this history and development.

Inscribed property

The already inscribed World Heritage property, Route of Santiago de Compostela (1993), is a 738-km-long pilgrimage route from Spain's north-eastern border with France to Santiago de Compostela in the north-western corner of the Iberian peninsula. Known as the "French Route" (Camino Francés), it is the continuation of four pilgrimage routes in France (The Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France, inscribed in 1998) that merge into two after crossing the Pyrenees into Spain at Roncesvalles (Valcarlos Pass) and Canfranc (Somport Pass) and then converge at Puente la Reina south of Pamplona. The French Route passes through five Autonomous Communities and 166 towns and villages. The already inscribed property includes a large number of individual buildings and structures of historic interest along the route, including religious establishments, facilities such as hostels to assist pilgrims, and bridges, locks, and commemorative crosses. These range in date from the 11th century to almost the present day.

In October 2014 the State Party stated it does not foresee any further extensions to the already inscribed property.

History and development

The Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain developed following the 9th-century discovery in Galicia of the remains believed to be those of the Apostle James the Greater. "Primitive" segments of these routes, some Roman in origin, were used by the first pilgrims to visit the site. To avoid the Muslim-occupied territories immediately to the south, there emerged a consolidated east-west route along the Christian-occupied northern coast of the Iberian peninsula, possibly in the early 11th century.

Changes in the political spectrum of the Iberian peninsula due to the southward expansion of the Christian kingdoms beginning in the 11th century led to the decline of the Northern Routes in favour of the French Route – which was less difficult to traverse – as the preferred way to reach Santiago de Compostela. Abetting this decline was the early 12th century *Codex Calixtinus*, considered to be the first pilgrims' guide to Santiago de Compostela. Its detailed itinerary was confined to the French Route, the path taken by its author, Aymerid Picaud.

The 12th century saw the French Route achieve its greatest influence, used by thousands of pilgrims from all over western Europe and facilitating a cultural interchange between the Iberian peninsula and the rest of Europe. A smaller number of pilgrims continued to use the Northern Routes for various reasons: the Primitive Route included the second most important Jacobean pilgrimage destination, the relics in the Cámara Santa in Oviedo (Monuments of Oviedo and the Kingdom of the Asturias (Spain, 1985, 1998)); and the Coastal Route provided the most direct access for pilgrims living in the Aquitaine area and along the Cantabrian coast. The Coastal Route was connected to the French Route by roads originally created during the Roman Empire and the early Middle Ages to cross the mountain passes, repurposed to support the pilgrimage. Farther west, the Liébana Route gave access to Santo Toribio de Liébana Monastery, the destination for pilgrims wishing to venerate its most important relic, the Lignum Crucis.

Despite the rise of the French Route to become the main conduit serving Santiago de Compostela (Santiago de Compostela (Old Town) (Spain, 1985)), the old Northern Routes endured. A 13th-century Royal policy of urban renewal enabled a new economic and social momentum along the Northern Routes, which led to redevelopment and an increase in the flow of pilgrims on the coastal paths. The old routes were modified and churches, hospitals, and hostels for pilgrims were built. The surviving Northern Routes are a symbiosis of older sections and the changes made during this period.

Use of the Jacobean pilgrimage routes fluctuated during the 16th to 18th centuries, in step with the impacts of outside forces such as religious reforms and wars. The most profound decline came after the French Revolution (1789-1799). The growing secularization that followed lasted until the second half of the 20th century. After remaining in decline for years, the Routes of Santiago reached a new high point during the second half of the 20th century, after a renewed interest in their history, itineraries, and cultural heritage emerged and heritage policies were put in place to catalogue, protect, and promote the Routes, which were designated of historical importance by Spain in 1962. The designation as the first European Cultural Route by the Council of Europe in 1987, and the 1993 Jubilee (Holy) Year at Santiago de Compostela, helped spur the French Route's revival.

In the 1990s, Galicia launched an extensive promotional campaign and created an International Committee of

Experts, and the Autonomous Communities began to define the exact itineraries of the various Ways of Saint James. The trajectories of the Northern Routes have since been reconstituted on the basis of a large compendium of written, archaeological, and landscape sources, and analytical work, including on-site. The Association of Friends of the Way of Santiago has also contributed significantly to the revival of the Jacobean phenomenon since the last decades of the 20th century.

3 Justification for inscription, integrity and authenticity

Comparative analysis

The State Party did not include a comparative analysis in its original 1993 nomination of the French Route of Santiago de Compostela. ICOMOS, in its evaluation of the nomination, did not comment on the northern pilgrimage routes in Spain, stating of Spain's French Route that there was *"no comparable Christian pilgrimage route of such extent and continuity anywhere in Europe."* Furthermore, the subsequent 1998 nomination dossier for the Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France did not include a comparative analysis of other pilgrimage routes. ICOMOS, in its evaluation of the routes in France, indicated that its previous conclusion about the section in Spain – that there was no comparable route – was equally valid for the nominated sections in France.

As regards the present proposal for an extension of the Route of Santiago de Compostela to include the four Northern Routes, the State Party has provided a cursory comparative analysis in its nomination dossier. Christian pilgrimages are proposed as the geo-cultural focus, the Saint James pilgrimage being one of the "trinity" of great Christian pilgrimages, the other two being to Jerusalem and to Rome. Neither the Jerusalem itinerary (a short segment of which is in Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine, 2012, (iv), (vi)) nor the Rome itinerary (the Via Francigena) is discussed.

In February 2015, the State Party submitted brief comparisons with six other Jacobean routes: the two already inscribed on the World Heritage List; the Portuguese Route; the Southeastern Route (Vía de la Plata); the English Route; and the Spanish routes connecting Catalonia to Compostela. The characteristics that each shares with the Northern Routes, as well as those that set them apart, are highlighted in point form. To summarize: the legal protection and state of conservation of the non-inscribed comparatives are considered by the State Party to be "variable" or less robust than the Northern Routes; and the comparatives are later in date than the Northern Routes.

ICOMOS observes that specific attention must be paid to how a proposed extension compares with the original nomination, and how the values of the original nomination are articulated in the proposed extension. ICOMOS considers that the present analysis would have been more

useful had it focused on how the proposed extension's values and attributes compare with those of the already inscribed properties in Spain and France. ICOMOS considers that comparisons with additional Jacobean routes that share some or all of these same values would have served to highlight the full range of similarities and differences between the proposed extension and other Jacobean routes, both in Spain and beyond, and thereby more clearly indicate what makes the proposed extension stand apart.

While the comparative analysis in the nomination dossier does not include a discussion that justifies the selection of the 16 individual built components (cathedrals, churches, monasteries, etc.) that are included in this present proposal for an extension of Route of Santiago de Compostela, supplementary information submitted in October 2014 summarizes the conditions for their selection: each component must be of exceptional quality and value, and highlight the history of the Jacobean pilgrimage routes in northern Spain; each must reflect the occupation of this territory before the emergence of the phenomenon of pilgrimage to Compostela; each must reflect an aspect of northern Spain's different cultural periods from the first pilgrimages that traversed the Roman roads to the start of the belief that the apostle James' tomb was in Spain; and each must have Spain's highest legal protection.

Additional information provided by the State Party in February 2015 demonstrates how these conditions have been applied in the context of an inventory of more than 2,000 elements directly associated with the Northern Routes. ICOMOS considers that this additional information demonstrates in a readily defined and discernible way how the 16 components chosen by the State Party can be seen to extend, complement or amplify the attributes of the already inscribed property while bearing the same Outstanding Universal Value.

ICOMOS considers that the comparative analysis justifies consideration of this extension to the already inscribed property.

Justification of Outstanding Universal Value

The proposed extension is considered by the State Party to be of Outstanding Universal Value as a cultural property for the following reasons:

- It completes the two existing Route of Santiago de Compostela World Heritage properties (the main Christian pilgrimage in Europe) by adding the earliest routes of the Saint James pilgrimage, which date back to the 9th century, as well as other northern and coastal routes that resulted from the rise of the Jacobean phenomenon in the High and Late Middle Ages.
- The Northern Routes are cultural and monumental axes at the same level and with the same historic and heritage significance as the Jacobean pilgrimage routes already on the World Heritage List.

- The French Route and Northern Routes retain the most complete material record of the Christian pilgrimage routes, a heritage that stands out for the richness of its art and architecture.

ICOMOS considers that this justification concerning the earliest routes of the Saint James pilgrimage is most appropriate for the Primitive Route, whose early date and trajectory from Oviedo to Compostela are accepted by scholars. While the existence and trajectory of a demonstrable pre-11th-century pilgrimage path is not as clear for the Coastal Route, ICOMOS considers that it, along with the Interior Route and the Liébana Route, are important testimonies to the rise of the Jacobean phenomenon in the High and Late Middle Ages.

The “Route of Santiago de Compostela” (Spain, 1993) was inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi):

Criterion (ii): The Pilgrimage Route of St James of Compostela played a fundamental role in facilitating the two-way interchange of cultural developments between the Iberian peninsula and the rest of Europe during the Middle Ages.

Criterion (iv): Pilgrimages were an essential part of European spiritual and cultural life in the Middle Ages and the routes that they took were equipped with facilities for the spiritual and physical well-being of pilgrims. The Route of St James of Compostela has preserved the most complete material record in the form of ecclesiastical and secular buildings, settlements both large and small, and civil engineering structures.

Criterion (vi): The Route of St James of Compostela is outstanding testimony [to the] power and influence of faith among people of all classes and countries in Europe during the Middle Ages and later.

At its 38th session (Doha, 2014), the World Heritage Committee adopted a retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value that included the following revised justifications:

Criterion (ii): The Route of Santiago de Compostela played a crucial role in the two-way exchange of cultural advances between the Iberian Peninsula and the rest of Europe, especially during the Middle Ages, but also in subsequent centuries. The wealth of cultural heritage that has emerged in association with the *Camino* is vast, marking the birth of Romanesque art and featuring extraordinary examples of Gothic, Renaissance, and Baroque art. Moreover, in contrast with the waning of urban life in the rest of the Iberian Peninsula during the Middle Ages, the reception and commercial activities emanating from the *Camino de Santiago* led to the growth of cities in the north of the Peninsula and gave rise to the founding of new ones.

Criterion (iv): The Route of Santiago de Compostela has preserved the most complete material registry of all

Christian pilgrimage routes, featuring ecclesiastical and secular buildings, large and small enclaves, and civil engineering structures.

Criterion (vi): The Route of Santiago de Compostela bears outstanding witness to the power and influence of faith among people of all social classes and origins in medieval Europe and later.

As a point of information, “The Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France” (France, 1998) was also inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi):

Criterion (ii): The Pilgrimage Route of Santiago de Compostela played a key role in religious and cultural exchange and development during the later Middle Ages, and this is admirably illustrated by the carefully selected monuments on the routes followed by pilgrims in France.

Criterion (iv): The spiritual and physical needs of pilgrims travelling to Santiago de Compostela were met by the development of a number of specialized types of edifice, many of which originated or were further developed on the French sections.

Criterion (vi): The Pilgrimage Route of Santiago de Compostela bears exceptional witness to the power and influence of Christian faith among people of all classes and countries in Europe during the Middle Ages.

Integrity and authenticity

Integrity

The State Party considers that the proposed serial extension stands out for the excellent conservation of its rich intangible and tangible heritage, which makes it a unique example of a medieval pilgrimage route that has survived to the present day. Moreover, it states that ever greater efforts have been made to improve, protect, and maintain the Route of Santiago after its long decline.

While the nomination dossier does not provide a logical, scientific basis for the selection of all the components that make up this proposed serial extension or for the selection of the nominated area, as required in the *Operational Guidelines* (paragraphs 87-89), ICOMOS considers that the additional information provided by the State Party in February 2015 satisfies this requirement, particularly as regards the 16 built components proposed for inclusion in this serial extension.

ICOMOS considers that the integrity of the whole series has been justified; and that the integrity of the individual components that comprise the series has been demonstrated.

Authenticity

The State Party asserts that the Northern Routes benefit from a rich and varied documentation, supplemented by a large number of recent studies and research. The State Party concludes that, compared to other known Christian pilgrimage routes, the Route of Santiago, a living and magnificent example of integration in its environment, is the one that has best been able to retain its original layout.

According to additional maps and summaries provided by the State Party in February 2015, 60.08 percent of the total length of the four routes retain their historical characteristics; 29.52 percent have been converted into main roads; and 10.39 percent are new layouts. By way of comparison, the French Route entails an authenticity of about 80 percent. The inscribed Jacobean routes in France incorporate only the segments of the Chemin du Puy (Via Podiensis) whose authenticity has been scientifically demonstrated.

ICOMOS considers the degree to which authenticity is present in or expressed by each of the significant attributes of the proposed serial extension to be variable. The credibility of the related information sources is not questioned. ICOMOS considers that the cultural value of the proposed serial extension and of the individual components, as recognized in the nomination criteria proposed, has for the most part been demonstrated to be truthfully and credibly expressed through attributes such as their locations and settings, forms and designs, and materials and substances.

ICOMOS considers that the authenticity of the whole series has been justified; and that the authenticity of the individual components that comprise the series has been demonstrated.

In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the condition of integrity for the whole series and for the individual components has been justified; and that the condition of authenticity for the whole series and for the individual components has been justified.

Criteria under which inscription is proposed

The extension is nominated on the basis of cultural criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi). The same criteria are justified for the proposed extension as for the existing World Heritage property.

Criterion (ii): *exhibit and important interchange of human values over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on developments in architecture or technology, monumental arts, town-planning or landscape design;*

The State Party, according to additional information submitted in February 2015, now justifies this criterion on the same grounds as the revised justification for the existing World Heritage property adopted by the World Heritage Committee in 2014:

“The Route of Santiago de Compostela played a crucial role in the two-way exchange of cultural advances between the Iberian Peninsula and the rest of Europe, especially during the Middle Ages, but also in subsequent centuries. The wealth of cultural heritage that has emerged in association with the Camino is vast, marking the birth of Romanesque art and featuring extraordinary examples of Gothic, Renaissance, and Baroque art. Moreover, in contrast with the waning of urban life in the rest of the Iberian Peninsula during the Middle Ages, the reception and commercial activities emanating from the Camino de Santiago led to the growth of cities in the north of the Peninsula and gave rise to the founding of new ones.”

ICOMOS considers that the proposed serial extension as a whole should fulfil the criterion. The existing justification stresses that the Route of Saint James played a fundamental role in the bi-directional exchange of cultural developments between the Iberian peninsula and the rest of Europe. Information provided by the State Party largely substantiates the claim of the Northern Routes' importance in this two-way interchange of cultural developments.

ICOMOS considers that the proposed extension has been demonstrated to reinforce this criterion.

Criterion (iv): *be an outstanding example of a type of building, architectural or technological ensemble or landscape which illustrates (a) significant stage(s) in human history;*

The State Party, according to additional information submitted in February 2015, now justifies this criterion on the same grounds as the revised justification for the existing World Heritage property adopted by the World Heritage Committee in 2014:

“The Route of Santiago de Compostela has preserved the most complete material registry of all Christian pilgrimage routes, featuring ecclesiastical and secular buildings, large and small enclaves, and civil engineering structures.”

ICOMOS considers that there is a substantial and important material record related to the proposed serial extension.

ICOMOS considers that the proposed extension has been demonstrated to reinforce this criterion.

Criterion (vi): *be directly or tangibly associated with events or living traditions, with ideas, or with beliefs, with artistic and literary works of outstanding universal significance;*

The State Party, according to additional information submitted in February 2015, now justifies this criterion on the same grounds as the revised justification for the existing World Heritage property adopted by the World Heritage Committee in 2014:

“The Route of Santiago de Compostela bears outstanding witness to the power and influence of faith among people of all social classes and origins in medieval Europe and later.”

ICOMOS considers that the proposed serial extension, through its attributes, reinforces this criterion as an outstanding witness to the power and influence of faith.

ICOMOS considers that the proposed extension has been demonstrated to reinforce this criterion.

ICOMOS considers that the serial approach has been justified.

In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the condition of integrity for the whole series as well as for the individual components has been justified; that the condition of authenticity for the whole series as well as for the individual components has been justified; and that the proposed extension to the serial property has been demonstrated to reinforce criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi).

4 Factors affecting the property

The factors that are most likely to affect or threaten the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the proposed serial extension include development pressures, particularly related to the large number of industrial zones and sizeable factories that exist in the vicinity of the Northern Routes. Some parts of the Routes have disappeared or been significantly modified by the infrastructure of the industrial sector, in particular in the environs of Bilbao and Portugalete, the area from Veriña to Gijón, the Caudal coalfield, and the outskirts of Avilés. The State Party notes that the declaration of the Route of Santiago as a Site of Cultural Interest in 1985 allows the competent authorities responsible for cultural heritage to have a voice in new industrial zone projects, and to adopt measures to protect the historic values of this route. Nevertheless, the State Party also notes that the proliferation of industrial areas continues, with a very negative impact on the environment of the Routes, and sometimes on the Routes themselves.

The State Party identifies the development of communications corridors, such as the national network of roads and highways, as having had the most profound impact on the Routes of Santiago from a historical point of view. The Routes are still being affected by new road infrastructure, including Autoroute A-8, the construction of which continues in Asturias, sometimes directly overlaying sections of the historic Routes of Santiago.

Open-pit mines located near the Northern Routes have a negative visual, environmental, and acoustical impact, and some sections of the Routes are used as service roads for the mines. The growth of urbanized cities and towns along the Routes also has a negative impact; and in rural areas, the abandonment of farms is a serious problem because

of the resultant degradation and deterioration of the landscape surrounding the Routes. The State Party notes that the Site of Cultural Interest declaration allows the negative effects to be controlled and reduced, though detailed plans showing the locations of all these risks are not provided, nor are the planned corrective measures.

The State Party indicates that the Northern Routes are not threatened by environmental pressures, and that this region is one of the least exposed in the world to the potential risks of natural disasters. In terms of responsible visitation, the Routes included in this nomination are not currently overcrowded, and the State Party believes that any future increases in visitation can be accommodated.

ICOMOS recommends that heritage impact assessments be carried out in accordance with its *Guidance on Heritage Impact Assessments for Cultural World Heritage Properties* before any developments such as renewals, demolitions, new infrastructure, land-use policy changes, or large-scale urban frameworks are approved and implemented.

ICOMOS considers that the main threats to the property are industrial and urban growth and development, new transportation infrastructure, and rural depopulation.

5 Protection, conservation and management

Boundaries of the nominated property and buffer zone

The area of the four pilgrimage routes of the proposed serial extension is not provided; their combined length is 1498.91 km. The area of the 16 built components of the proposed extension totals 14.58 ha. The nomination dossier does not provide an explicit rationale or explanation for the chosen boundaries. In October 2014, the State Party clarified that the approach adopted 20 years ago for the boundaries of the French Route has been maintained for the present proposed extension. The boundaries of the four Northern Routes are therefore evidently limited to their actual surface areas; the boundaries of the 16 built components included in the proposed serial extension are, generally speaking, defined by their footprints.

In terms of buffer zones, the principle of a generic 30-m band of protection for the Routes, as was accepted for the French Route in 1993, has also been maintained, according to an explanation provided by the State Party in October 2014. In Cantabria, La Rioja, the Principality of Asturias, and the Basque Country, the buffer zone is a 30-m-wide strip on either side of the Routes in rural areas. In urban areas, however, it is 3 m wide in Cantabria and the Basque Country, 15 m wide in La Rioja, and 30 m wide in Asturias. In Galicia, the buffer zones are contextual, between 30 and 100 m wide. Buffer zones for the Routes of Santiago are regulated independently by each Autonomous Community.

In February 2015, the State Party modified the buffer zones originally proposed for 7 of the 16 built components in order to better take into account the particularities of each component and its environment, including views to and from the component. These modifications affect the buffer zones for the church and monastery of San Salvador (component P2); the cathedral of Saint James the Apostle (C2); San Salvador church (C5); Santa María de Soto de Luiña church (C6), which has also evidently been expanded to include its presbytery; the San Adrián tunnel and roadway (I1); the cathedral of Vitoria-Gasteiz (I2); and the Santo Toribio de Liébana monastery (L1). In some cases these buffer zones overlap, in whole or in part, the buffer zone for the adjacent pilgrimage route.

ICOMOS considers that the boundaries of the proposed serial extension, while less than optimal as concerns the four routes and 16 built components, are adequate; and that the proposed buffer zones, as revised in February 2015, while minimal in certain urban areas, are adequate for the purpose of giving an added layer of protection to the proposed serial extension.

Ownership

The four Northern Routes of Santiago within the proposed extension are Crown property and therefore in the public domain and inalienable. The 16 individual components are owned by the Catholic Church of Spain, the Archdiocese of Oviedo, the Catholic Church in Galicia, the Xunta (Government) of Galicia, the Monastery of the Olive, the Community of Cistercian Monks of Sobrado dos Monxes, the General Coparcener of Gipuzkoa and Alava, the Bishopric of Lugo, the Bishopric and Diocese of Bilbao, and the Bishopric and Diocese of Vitoria. The buffer zone is under a mixture of private, institutional, and public sector ownership.

Protection

Legal protection of the proposed serial extension at the national level is assured by means of Decree 2224/1962 of 5 September, which in 1962 designated the Route of Santiago as a Historic and Artistic Ensemble; and Law 16/1985 on Spanish Historical Heritage, designating the Route of Santiago in 1985 as a Site of Cultural Interest and a Classified Historical Monument. Responsibilities for cultural heritage have been decentralized by Spain to the Autonomous Communities, each of which has its own law on cultural heritage: Law 1/2001 of the Principality of Asturias on Cultural Heritage; Law 11/1998 on the Cultural Heritage of Cantabria; Law 7/1990 on the Basque Cultural Heritage; Law 8/1995 of 30 October on the Cultural Heritage of Galicia, and Law 7/2004 of 18 October on the Cultural, Historical, and Artistic Heritage of La Rioja, as well as sectoral regulations on the protection of cultural property. These laws represent the highest level of protection available in Spain.

Proposed interventions to the Routes require prior approval from the competent authority on cultural heritage, or from the local government if the corresponding instrument of territorial planning has been adopted. The Autonomous Communities have established obligatory

environmental impact assessments that include cultural heritage. Risks are classified as compatible, moderate, severe or critical. The assessments also establish corrective or protective measures, depending on the type of impact, ranging from preventing the problem by modifying the project, to full documentation before destruction.

The various laws on cultural heritage contain provisions to incorporate heritage protection into land use planning and management. Currently, municipalities have been charged with adapting their development standards to a new legal framework established by recent laws on land use and urban planning. All municipalities will therefore soon have a general plan, drafted within the context of the requirements of these new standards.

The buffer zones are protected under Law 16/1985 on Spanish Historical Heritage, and under the cultural heritage laws in the Autonomous Communities of Galicia, Asturias, Cantabria, the Basque Country, and La Rioja.

ICOMOS considers that the legal protection in place for the proposed serial extension and the buffer zones appears adequate.

Conservation

The four routes and 16 individual built components (cathedrals, churches, monasteries, etc.) have been inventoried during the preparation of the nomination dossier. A description, history, and present state of conservation is provided for each of the 16 individual built components, and active conservation measures are briefly summarized, though maintenance regimes are not. ICOMOS considers that an equivalent level of information on the present state of conservation of the four Routes themselves would have been appropriate.

ICOMOS considers that the general state of conservation of the proposed serial extension is adequate.

Management

Management structures and processes, including traditional management processes

Management of the proposed extension takes place within the framework of Spain's system of decentralized powers, including those relating to cultural heritage, which have been transferred to the Autonomous Communities. There is no management structure or unified supervisory and executive body for the entire extended property currently in place for the coordinated management of the 20 individual components that make up the proposed serial extension (paragraph 114 of the *Operational Guidelines*). In the event the Northern Routes are approved as an extension of the Route of Santiago de Compostela, it is intended that representatives of the Autonomous Communities of the Basque Country, Cantabria, and Asturias would be added to the Jacobean Council's existing Cooperative

Committee for the Management of the World Heritage Property. The Committee was created in 2009 and is currently comprised of senior personnel from the Ministry of Education, Culture and Sport and the Autonomous Communities traversed by the French Route. The Jacobean Council was established in 1992, in the context of the original nomination of the “Route of Santiago de Compostela,” to coordinate and collaborate on planned programs and interventions for the French Route.

There exists a Working Group on the Routes of Santiago in the Northern Iberian Peninsula, chaired by the Director General of Cultural Heritage of Asturias and including representatives of the other Autonomous Communities as well as the federal state administration. Created in 2006-2007 by the Executive Committee of the Jacobean Council, its functions relative to the Northern Routes include coordinating the preparation of the World Heritage nomination, sharing management systems, management experiences and joint promotional activities, and mapping the infrastructure of the four routes.

Policy framework: management plans and arrangements, including visitor management and presentation

There is no overall management plan for the proposed serial extension, nor have management plans for any of the four individual pilgrimage routes or 16 individual built components been provided. Regarding an overall management framework for all components in the proposed serial extension, ICOMOS considers that the State Party has not fully documented specifically how the cooperative management system preserves the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the proposed extension, nor how it ensures its effective protection for present and future generations. ICOMOS recommends that the elements typically included in an effective management system be included and documented, such as a shared understanding of the property by all stakeholders; a cycle of planning, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, and feedback; involvement of stakeholders; allocation of resources for staffing and training; capacity-building; and risk preparedness. Neither an accountable, transparent description of how the current (or proposed) management system actually functions, nor its effectiveness, is discussed in the nomination dossier.

An action plan for the next four years has been established. This plan acts on the policies for protection, rehabilitation, and dissemination that various authorities concerned with the management the Northern Routes have developed during the past ten years. The State Party advised in October 2014 that the Jacobean Council is developing a work plan for the seven-year period 2015-2021, subject to approval by a majority of all jurisdictions in the management and conservation of the French Route and Northern Routes.

The State Party has provided a compendium of interventions undertaken by the Autonomous Communities in recent years, including the amounts invested in specific projects – many of which appear to be outside the proposed extension. The State Party advised in October 2014 that the level of funding available to the proposed extension is adequate. A summary of the specialized skills and qualifications that exist to manage the proposed extension has been provided, though in a generic fashion and without reference to the actual staffing levels that currently exist. Existing or proposed management plans, such as visitor management and presentation plans, have not been provided or summarized.

Involvement of the local communities

The State Party notes that the promotion of the Northern Routes as a potential World Heritage site has involved governments, private operators, and most local communities. It further highlighted in October 2014 the constant involvement of the Association of Friends of the Way of Santiago.

ICOMOS recommends that the management system for the proposed serial extension (and for the already inscribed property) be fully documented, particularly concerning how it preserves the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the serial property and ensures its effective protection for present and future generations.

6 Monitoring

Six key indicators have been chosen as the measures of the proposed serial extension’s state of conservation. Two relate uniquely to the Route in Asturias. All indicate the periodicity of review. None, however, relate particularly closely to the proposed Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, and none express a benchmark that indicates a desired state of conservation.

Concerning the results of previous reporting exercises on the state of conservation of the proposed serial extension, the State Party has presented a list, with brief summaries, of ten earlier studies and analyses. Regrettably, eight of these concern the French Route and not the nominated Northern Routes. Of the remaining two, only one refers to the state of conservation of the proposed extension, and this single reference is to unspecified “various studies” analyzing the state of conservation that were carried out by each of the Autonomous Communities, the results of which, the State Party advises, are included in the present nomination dossier “in their corresponding paragraphs.”

In conclusion, ICOMOS considers that the key monitoring indicators need to be revised and augmented to relate more directly to the proposed Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, and should include specific indicators, periodicity, and institutional responsibilities.

7 Conclusions

The nomination dossier for Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain effectively illustrates this vast proposed extension, which at 1498.91 km long is more than twice the length of the already inscribed Route of Santiago de Compostela. The mapping in particular is exemplary.

ICOMOS considers that the State Party has demonstrated how the attributes of the already inscribed Route of Santiago de Compostela are exemplified, extended, complemented or amplified by the attributes of the Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain proposed extension, while bearing the same Outstanding Universal Value.

ICOMOS also considers that the authenticity and integrity of the proposed serial extension and of its individual components, as articulated in the cultural value recognized in the nomination criteria proposed, have for the most part been demonstrated to be truthfully and credibly expressed.

And finally, as prescribed in paragraph 114 of the *Operational Guidelines*, ICOMOS considers that it would be highly beneficial for the management system of the already inscribed serial property and its proposed extension to be fully documented, particularly concerning how it preserves the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the property and ensures its effective protection for present and future generations.

8 Recommendations

Recommendations with respect to inscription

ICOMOS recommends that the proposed extension of the Route of Santiago de Compostela to include the Routes of Santiago in Northern Spain and thus become the Route of Santiago de Compostela: French Route and Routes of Northern Spain, Spain, be **approved** on the basis of **criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi)**.

Recommended Statement of Outstanding Universal Value

Brief synthesis

The Route of Santiago de Compostela is an extensive interconnected network of pilgrimage routes in Spain whose ultimate destination is the tomb of the Apostle James the Greater in Santiago de Compostela, in Galicia. According to Saint Jerome, the apostles were to be interred in the province where each had preached the gospel. The tomb believed to be that of James the Greater was discovered in Galicia in the 9th century, a period when Spain was dominated by Muslims. Its discovery was of immense importance for the Christian world, and Compostela soon became a place of Christian pilgrimage comparable in importance to Jerusalem and Rome.

The almost 1500-km-long network of four Northern Routes (Primitive, Coastal, Interior of the Basque Country-La Rioja, and Liébana) are at the origin of the Jacobean pilgrimage. They are directly linked to the discovery of the Apostle's tomb, and to its promotion by the Kingdom of Asturias. It was not until the 11th century that the Northern Routes were surpassed by the 738-km-long French Route, which was less difficult to traverse and became the primary Way of Saint James across the Iberian peninsula to Compostela.

The Route of Santiago has been a meeting place for its pilgrims ever since it emerged some eleven centuries ago. It has facilitated a constant cultural dialogue between the pilgrims and the communities through which they pass. It was also an important commercial axis and conduit for the dissemination of knowledge, supporting economic and social development along its itineraries. Constantly evolving, this serial property includes a magnificent ensemble of built heritage of historical importance created to fill the needs of pilgrims, including churches, hospitals, hostels, monasteries, calvaries, bridges, and other structures, many of which testify to the artistic and architectural evolution that occurred between the Romanesque and Baroque periods. Outstanding natural landscapes as well as a rich intangible cultural heritage also survive to the present day.

Criterion (ii): The Route of Santiago de Compostela played a crucial role in the two-way exchange of cultural advances between the Iberian Peninsula and the rest of Europe, especially during the Middle Ages, but also in subsequent centuries. The wealth of cultural heritage that has emerged in association with the *Camino* is vast, marking the birth of Romanesque art and featuring extraordinary examples of Gothic, Renaissance, and Baroque art. Moreover, in contrast with the waning of urban life in the rest of the Iberian Peninsula during the Middle Ages, the reception and commercial activities emanating from the *Camino de Santiago* led to the growth of cities in the north of the Peninsula and gave rise to the founding of new ones.

Criterion (iv): The Route of Santiago de Compostela has preserved the most complete material registry of all Christian pilgrimage routes, featuring ecclesiastical and secular buildings, large and small enclaves, and civil engineering structures.

Criterion (vi): The Route of Santiago de Compostela bears outstanding witness to the power and influence of faith among people of all social classes and origins in medieval Europe and later.

Integrity

The property contains all the key elements necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of Route of Santiago de Compostela: French Route and Routes of Northern Spain, including the routes themselves and the ecclesiastical and secular buildings, large and small

enclaves, and civil engineering structures necessary to sustain the act of pilgrimage. The serial property is of adequate size to ensure the complete representation of the features and processes that convey the property's significance, and it does not suffer unduly from adverse effects of development or neglect. An added layer of protection for this extensive serial property is provided by buffer zones.

Authenticity

Route of Santiago de Compostela: French Route and Routes of Northern Spain is substantially authentic in its forms and designs, materials and substances, and use and function. The majority of the routes themselves follow their historic trajectories, and many retain their historical characteristics; along the five itineraries, the various built components included in this serial property are characterized by a high level of conservation. The property's function and use as a pilgrimage route has continued for more than a millennium. The links between the Outstanding Universal Value of the routes and their attributes are therefore truthfully expressed, and the attributes fully convey the value of the property.

Management and protection requirements

Pursuant to the First Additional Provision of the Spanish Historical Heritage Act, Law 16/1985 of 25 June 1985, the *Camino de Santiago* was registered in the category of Historical Complex as a Property of Cultural Interest (*Bien de Interés Cultural*), the highest level of cultural heritage protection in Spain. In exercise of their competences, the Autonomous Communities through which the routes pass have each defined the protection of this serial property in their respective territories. The routes are Crown property, and the built components are under a mixture of private, institutional, and public sector ownership, as are the buffer zones. The serial property is managed by the Jacobean Council (*Consejo Jacobeo*), which was created for the purpose of collaborating on programmes and actions to protect and conserve it; to further its promotion and cultural dissemination; to conserve and restore its historical-artistic heritage; to regulate and promote tourism; and to assist pilgrims.

Notwithstanding these arrangements, systematic actions will be needed to address the potential threats posed by industrial and urban growth and development, new transportation infrastructure such as motorways and railways, pressure from increased tourism and the number of pilgrims, and rural depopulation. Enforcement of regulatory measures and legislation will be crucial, as well as the development of environmental and heritage impact studies for new construction. In addition, urban development schemes of the municipalities along the routes will need to ensure protection of the attributes that sustain the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

Additional recommendations

ICOMOS recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:

- Fully documenting the management system for the proposed serial extension and for the already inscribed property, particularly concerning how it preserves the potential Outstanding Universal Value of the serial property and ensures its effective protection for present and future generations;
- Revising and augmenting the key monitoring indicators to relate more directly to the proposed Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, and adding specific indicators, periodicity, and institutional responsibilities;
- Carrying out heritage impact assessments in accordance with ICOMOS Guidance on Heritage Impact Assessments for Cultural World Heritage Properties before any developments such as renewals, demolitions, new infrastructure, land-use policy changes, or large-scale urban frameworks are approved and implemented.



Map showing the location of the nominated routes



Primitive route, A Fonsagrada



Coastal route, Gipuzkoa



Internal route, Basque country



Liebana's route, Cabanzón