Report on the ICOMOS Advisory Mission to Kazakhstan

The Talgar component (S 01-KZ-01) within the serial World Heritage property Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang'an-Tianshan Corridor (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) (C 1442)

ICOMOS Advisory Mission: 20th to 28th March 2016
Visit to Talgar: 21st and 23rd March 2016
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**I. INTRODUCTION**

**II. BACKGROUND TO THE MISSION**

II.1. Inscription history
II.3 The component site of Talgar in Kazakhstan (S 01-KZ) as part of the serial World Heritage property
II.4. Examination of the state of conservation by the World Heritage Committee
II.5. Issues addressed by the ICOMOS Advisory Mission

**III. NATIONAL POLICY FOR THE PRESERVATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE WORLD HERITAGE PROPERTY (TALGAR COMPONENT SITE)**

Legal and Institutional Framework, Protection and Management
III.1. Legal and Institutional Framework
III.1.2. Protected area legislation and boundaries of the World Heritage property
III.1.3. Management structure

**IV. IDENTIFICATION AND ASSESSMENT OF SPECIFIC ISSUES**

Factors affecting the World Heritage property

IV.1. Road and bridge construction
IV.1.2. Sequence of events in the history of road project
IV.1.3. Suggestions for alternative route
IV.1.4. Reconstruction project within the World Heritage property
IV.1.5. Residential construction in the buffer zone

**V. ASSESSMENT OF THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF THE SITE**

**VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

**ANNEXES**

ANNEX I. Terms of Reference (TOR)
ANNEX II. Programme, Composition of Mission Team and List of Participants
ANNEX III. Illustrations (maps, graphic schemes and photographs)
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The ICOMOS Advisory Mission was organised under the aegis of the Ministry for Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan with visits planned to three cultural World Heritage properties on the State Party’s territory:
- The Mausoleum of Khoja Ahmed Yasawi, in Turkestan (inscribed in 2003);
- The Petroglyphs within the Archaeological Landscape of Tamgaly (inscribed in 2007);
- The Talgar component site of the serial property ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan; inscribed in 2014).

All site visits were carried out under the patronage of Mr. G. Akhmediarov, the Vice-Minister, and Ms. J. Moldabergenova, chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts, Ministry for Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The mission programme was very dense (see ANNEX II) and allowed for the opportunity to meet with all stakeholders involved (heritage experts, preservationists, architects, developers, investors, administration of different management levels – National, Regional and Local) and to discuss the current situation of the World Heritage properties in Kazakhstan with them in an open and constructive manner, and to establish the existing problems. The ICOMOS Advisory mission expresses its thanks to the State Party for the preparation and realisation of the site visits, the detailed information received during and after the mission and for the constructive spirit throughout this intensive visit, even during controversial discussions when opinions expressed. Representatives of the ICOMOS National Committee and the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO were present during the site visits and discussions.

As one of three cultural World Heritage properties in Kazakhstan, Talgar is a component site of the serial transnational property of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’, which extends through the territories of three different States Parties. The ICOMOS Advisory mission report has been split into two parts, with this present report on the Talgar component site of the ‘Silk Roads’ prepared separately as it also concerns the States Parties of China and Kyrgyzstan.

For the full list of participants, see ANNEX II.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Summary

The ICOMOS Advisory mission (hereafter “the Mission”) was invited by the State Party in order to review the state of conservation of the Talgar component site (S 01-KZ) of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan), inscribed on the World Heritage List in 2014 as a serial property. One of the Mission’s main tasks was to assess potential risks from the planning of the Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak road project (road section ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26). A road was briefly mentioned in the nomination dossier of 2012 (on page 592, under ‘Development pressure’, Talgar: modern residential buildings, stud farm, road), but without any details that indicated it was a threat that could not be addressed, and no details were provided to the ICOMOS mission. There was therefore no mention of the road in the ICOMOS Evaluation report 1.

Today, the construction of the road right through the World Heritage component site poses a serious threat to the contribution of Talgar to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ serial property. The development of alternative routes for this road is considered by ICOMOS to be a matter of urgency and some suggestions were considered during the site visit.

The Mission was also requested to review the protection of the property in the context of Talgar (as a nationally protected monument) and the buffer zone as it was set out at the time of inscription on the World Heritage List. The current management system for the internationally-valued archaeological site of Talgar is also a matter for analysis, including its correspondence to the nationally-protected natural areas.

The present report aims to provide additional information, observations, comments, general proposals and recommendations.

I. INTRODUCTION

News about the beginning of the road construction directly through the World Heritage component site and its buffer zone, separating it into the two parts, as well as of the construction of a bridge over the Talgar river right next to the main Talgar monument, appeared in on-line press articles at the end of October/mid-November 2014. It seems all the more incredible, following the decision adopted only four months earlier at the 38th Session of the World Heritage Committee, when the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ serial property was inscribed on the World Heritage List.

This negative information was then confirmed and strong concern expressed by UNESCO in the official letters of Mr. Kishore Rao (18 June 2015) and Ms. Mechtild Rössler (29 February 2016) – successive Directors of the World Heritage Centre – which were addressed to Mr. Nurlan Danenov, Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary, Permanent Delegate of the Republic of Kazakhstan to UNESCO.

1 http://whc.unesco.org/archive/advisory_body_evaluation/1442.pdf
On 6 October 2015, the authorities of the Republic of Kazakhstan requested an ICOMOS Advisory mission for Tamgaly and the Mausoleum of Khoja Ahmed Yasawi (Turkestan), and later added Talgar as well in order to clarify the impact of the construction of the Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak road on the property and its OUV. For now, all construction works in Talgar (road section ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26) have been stopped, though the bridge is in fact already totally built.

During the ICOMOS Advisory Mission, the representatives of the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO and the Secretary General of the National World Heritage Committee of the Republic of Kazakhstan Mr. Dmitry Voyakin officially provided the Mission with a dossier with copies of 53 documents (departmental correspondence, expert reports, requests and statement of the Prosecutor General, etc.), which reflect the history of the project, as well as the strong concern of the Kazakhstan expert heritage community. In turn, an ensemble of official documents was provided by the road designers and builders (Mr. Erzhen Zhasabaev, the Head of the Administration for Automobile roads of local administration, Akimat of the Almaty Region) illustrating the project from a different position.

II. BACKGROUND TO THE MISSION

II.1. Inscription history

The World Heritage Committee at its 38th session (Doha, 2014), inscribed the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) on the World Heritage List on the basis of four criteria and adopted the Statement of OUV (38 Com 8B.24). This transnational serial property consists of 33 components: 22 sites are located at the territory of China, 8 sites in Kazakhstan and 3 sites in Kyrgyzstan.


Brief synthesis²:

“The Silk Roads were an interconnected web of routes linking the ancient societies of Asia, the Subcontinent, Central Asia, Western Asia and the Near East, and contributed to the development of many of the world's great civilizations. They represent one of the world’s preeminent long-distance communication networks stretching as the crow flies to around 7,500 km but extending to in excess of 35,000 km along specific routes. [...] The routes served principally to transfer raw materials, foodstuffs, and luxury goods. [...] Starting on the Loess plateau at Chang’an, the central capital of China in the Han and Tang Dynasties, the routes of the Chang’an – Tian-shan corridor passed westwards through the Hosi Corridor across the Qin and Qilian Mountains to the Yumen Pass of Dunhuang. From Loulan/Hami, they continued along the northern and southern flanks

² Extracts from the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value adopted by the World Heritage Committee upon inscription of the property in 2014
of the Tian-shan Mountain and then through passes to reach the Ili, Chuy and Talas valleys in the Zhetsu Region of Central Asia, linking two of the great power centres that drove the Silk Roads trade.

Thirty-three sites along the corridor include capital cities palace complexes of various empires and Khan Kingdoms, trading settlements, Buddhist cave temples, ancient paths, posthouses, passes, beacon towers, sections of the Great Wall, fortifications, tombs and religious buildings.

[...] As well as conduits for goods and people, the routes allowed the exceptional flow of ideas, beliefs and technological innovations such as those related to architecture and town planning that shaped the urban spaces and peoples’ lives in many fundamental ways."

This transnational serial property is a unique evidence of historical, cultural, social and religious interchanges of great global significance.

The ‘Silk Roads’ serial property was inscribed on the basis of four out of the six cultural criteria, (ii), (iii), (v) and (vi):

**Criterion (ii):** The vastness of the continental routes networks, the ultra-long duration of use, diversity of heritage remains and their dynamic interlinks, as well as the richness of cultural exchange they facilitated, varied geographical environments they crossed and connected, which clearly demonstrates the extensive interaction within various cultural regions, especially the nomadic steppe and settled agrarian/oasis/pastoral civilizations on the Eurasian continent between the 2nd century B.C. and the 16th century A.D.

These interaction and influences were profound in terms of developments in architecture and city planning, religions and beliefs, urban culture and habitation, merchandise trade and interethnic relations in all regions along the routes.

The Chang’an–Tianshan corridor is an extraordinary example in world history of how a dynamic channel linking civilizations and cultures across the Eurasian continent realized the broadest and most long-lasting interchange among civilizations and cultures.

**Criterion (iii)** identifies how the Chang’an–Tianshan corridor bears an exceptional witness to traditions of communication and exchange in economy and culture, and to social development across the Eurasian continent between the 2nd century B.C. to the 16th century A.D.

Trade had a profound influence on the settlement structure of the landscape, through the development of towns and cities that brought together nomadic and settled communities, through water management systems that underpinned those settlements, through the extensive network of forts, beacon towers, way stations and caravanserai that accommodated travellers and ensured their safety, through the sequence of Buddhist shrines and cave temples, and through manifestations of other religions such as Zoroastrianism, Manichaeism, Nestorian Christianity and Islam that resulted from the cosmopolitan, multi-ethnic communities that organized and benefitted from the high value trade.

**Criterion (v):** The Chang’an–Tianshan corridor is an outstanding example of the way high value, long-distance trade prompted the growth of sizeable towns and cities, supported by elaborate, sophisticated water management systems that harvested water from rivers, wells and underground springs for residents, travellers and the irrigation of crops.
Criterion (vi): The Chang’an – Tianshan Corridor is directly associated with Zhang Qian’s diplomatic mission to the Western Regions, a milestone event in the history of human civilization and cultural interchange in the Eurasian Continent. It also reflects in a profound way the tangible impact of Buddhism into ancient China, which had significant impact on cultures of East Asia, and the spread of Nestorian Christianity (which reached China in 500 AD), Manichaeism, Zoroastrianism and early Islam. Many of the towns and cities along the corridor also reflect in an exceptional way the impact of ideas that flowed along the routes related to harnessing waterpower, architecture and town planning.

II.3 The component site of Talgar in Kazakhstan (S 01-KZ) as part of the serial World Heritage property

The eight sites in the Republic of Kazakhstan represent an important part of this serial property. Three, including Talgar, are in the Zheytsu Region which was an important intersection of routes between east and west over the Eurasian continent to the west of the Tian-shan Mountains. A combination of agriculture and trade led to the development of prosperous towns and cities that reflect the seven main powers that held sway over this area between the 2nd century BC and the 16th century AD (Hephthalite, Rouran Khaganate, Western Turkic Khaganate, Turgesh, Karluks, Karakhanids and Kara-Khitan Khanate) and the influence of ideas from both east and west, including Zoroastrianism, Manichaeism, Nestorian Christianity, Buddhism and Islam.

Talgar was a trading settlement that flourished between the 8th–13th centuries and demonstrates the following contribution to the OUV of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’:

- Trading city with fortress walls and towers in the river Talgar Valley; a key centre of trade between the Far and Middle East and throughout the Central Asia;
- Artefacts confirmed medieval trade links with China, Iran, India and Japan (Chinese ivory chopsticks, Japanese porcelain, etc.);
- Inscriptions in Arabic, ancient Turkic and Orkhon alphabet, Chinese and Kidan languages showing wide geographical and cultural links;
- Evidence of several religious communities (Nestorian Christian, Buddhist, Manichean, and Islamic in an urban environment);
- Rich variety of findings (pottery, bronze, iron articles, glass and porcelain) indicating the outstanding interchange of human and material values;
- Centre of iron/damask steel industry and blacksmith, high technological skills; links with the Far East;
- Nomad transits to settled life (combination of stationary housing, large courtyards and yurt grounds);
- Evidence of irrigation systems;
- Walled city located nearby settlement, with exposed excavated sites;
- Picturesque landscape with the river Talgar Valley; scenic ridge of mountains and gorge, the terrain drops attractive for understanding the historical site disposition and current visits.
II.4. Examination of the state of conservation by the World Heritage Committee

The World Heritage Committee at its 38th Session (Doha, 2014) assessed the nomination of the serial property, and recommended the States Parties to give consideration to the following:

- Undertaking further studies of sites reflecting the way stations and watch towers and suggesting how they might be added to the series;
- Extending boundaries of sites to include these facilities important for the settlements and their agriculture along the Silk Roads;
- Implementing the timetables for developing detailed management plans to provide strategies for conservation/visitor management, including interpretation; and
- Suggesting how international resources might contribute to the technical monitoring of remote sites.

Accordingly, the States Parties were requested to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 December 2015, a report on progress made in the implementation of these recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 40th session in 2016.

Regarding Integrity, the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value adopted by the World Heritage Committee indicates that:

- ‘The nomination sets out clearly why the nominated series as a whole should be seen to have integrity and, through a detailed analysis, how each of the individual sites can also be seen to have integrity’;
- ‘The overall series adequately reflects the significant characteristics of the Chang’an–Tianshan corridor and the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value’.

These remarks are especially important considering the potential impact of the road and bridge construction in Talgar on the ‘Silk Roads’ property as a whole, its Integrity and Authenticity and OUV.

The Statement of Outstanding Universal Value also states that for individual components (although it is recognized, that some sites are vulnerable in the face of urban, rural and infrastructural development, tourism or changes in agricultural practices) that:

- the pressures are adequately contained;
- there is a need to ensure that new interventions do not confuse the archaeological record;
- water management systems in their link with boundaries contribute to the integrity of the sites and need to be considered.

The Authenticity of individual sites was considered mostly satisfactory at the time of inscription.

As for Protection and Management, the following was noted:

- The establishment of the Intergovernmental Coordinating Committee for the overall Silk Roads, with the three States Parties involved, 2009;
- Specific agreement signed between the three States Parties for management coordination of all sites in the Silk Roads corridor, 2012;
- Further detailed agreement signed for identifying management mechanisms, including conservation, interpretation, presentation and publicity, 2014. Establishment of the
Steering Committee consisting of the Vice-Ministers, with Secretariat in the ICOMOS International Conservation Centre in Xi’an (IICC-X);

- Regular meetings for discussion, collecting and promoting information on the conservation initiatives along the ‘Silk Roads’;
- Specific mention that the national collaboration needs to be reinforced, particularly between Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan and for Kazakhstan the development of detailed management plans providing conservation strategies and visitor management should be elaborated in 2014-2016;
- Monitoring defined as a formidable task and crucial tool. For Kazakhstan, in addition to trained staff, the involvement of local communities needs to be encouraged.

II.5. Issues addressed by the ICOMOS Advisory Mission

Taking into consideration the alarming signals received by ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, the main issues addressed by the ICOMOS Advisory Mission for the Talgar component of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ property were as follows:

- To gather information on the planning of the proposed route of the Birlik-Almalyk-Ryskulov-Kazstroy-Akbulkak road and assess this situation in terms of impact on the OUV of the serial property;
- To evaluate possible alternative routes as a matter of urgency;
- To review the protection of the property and the buffer zone in the context of Talgar as set out at the time of inscription;
- To review the management of the property;
- To review the protection of the internationally valued Talgar archaeological site within the nationally protected natural areas.

For a more detailed justification of the Mission, see the Terms of Reference (TOR) attached in ANNEX I.

Resuming Part II of this report:

- The Advisory Mission would like to draw attention to the fact that the State Party by signing the World Heritage Convention in 1994 and nominating in 2012 eight component sites on the territory of Kazakhstan into the World Heritage serial property of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ took direct responsibility for their preservation, including the component of Talgar;

- The Advisory Mission, assessing the Talgar component site of the serial World Heritage property, confirms the fundamental contribution of the Talgar settlement to the OUV of the unique ‘Silk Roads’ system. The potential loss of this component would inevitably lead to the reduction of the overall value of the series and to a significant loss of Integrity and Authenticity, both within the Talgar component and in the whole series.

- The Advisory Mission would like to highlight that the World Heritage Committee in its examination of the state of conservation of the site in 2014, expressed its concern for the necessity of special care and control over the following:
- Water systems (which, in fact, also might be addressed to the Talgar river and water facilities in this area);
- Pressure of all types and new interventions;
- Integrity issues both for the whole series, and individually - for each of the components;
- The need for permanent monitoring;
- The need for the elaboration of the detailed Management plans.

- The State Party of Kazakhstan submitted a report on the state of conservation in 2015, answering some of these recommendations (section V of this Mission report). However, neither the road and bridge construction, nor the new cottages built in the near vicinity of the World Heritage property in the buffer zone, are mentioned in this report.

III. NATIONAL POLICY FOR THE PRESERVATION AND MANAGEMENT OF THE WORLD HERITAGE PROPERTY (TALGAR COMPONENT SITE)

Legal and Institutional Framework, Protection and Management

III.1. Legal and Institutional Framework

For the 'Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’' serial transnational property (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) there are several levels of Legal protection and Institutional Framework:

- Transnational level links to the Coordinating Committee combined with the Steering Committee supervised by the Vice-Ministers of the three States Parties, with the Secretariat in China, Xi’an. Within this level, there are agreements on cooperation (management system, conservation, monitoring, interpretation, risk prevention, financing, etc.) but without power of implementation, which means that protection and management should be carried out on the National, Regional and Local levels of each country, and namely – in the Republic of Kazakhstan;

- Accordingly, at National level, state management in the field of protection, preservation and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage in the Republic of Kazakhstan (Article № 16, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July 2, 1992, № 1488-XII ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’) is carried out by:
  - the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
  - the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
  - the Authorized body: Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan as the central executive body, which is responsible for implementation of the Protection state policy, National heritage law and management in general;

- At Regional and Local levels (‘Local Executive bodies of Region, cities of National significance and districts, cities of regional importance’, Article № 16), that is the Almaty Regional department of Culture and Inspection for heritage protection and the Talgar municipal department of culture – both being within Regional and Local executive bodies (Akimats).
It is important to stress that local Executive bodies, upon agreement with the Ministry of Culture and Sports, ensure all activities for the conservation of monuments, including the preparation of historical and architectural base plans and schematic maps in the process of developing and approving new planning or redevelopment projects (Article № 18). However, the Ministry of Culture and Sports, as the authorized body, is in charge of State control and all actions on heritage sites of international and national importance (Article № 19), and so is also responsible for the implementation of the World Heritage Convention.

The legal base for heritage protection in Kazakhstan consists of several main tools:
- Law on Culture, 2006;
- Convention on the means of Prohibition and Preventing the illicit Import, Export and Transfer of ownership of cultural property, 1970, with amendments of 2011.

The leading State Enterprise “Kazrestavratiya” is directly involved in major conservation projects for the territory of Kazakhstan, including all three World Heritage properties.

There is also a National protection project on ‘Cultural Heritage of Almaty and Zhambyl Regions for 2009-2011’, a Strategic Development Plan of the Ministry of Culture and Information of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as a ‘Strategic Plan of Management for Tourism, Physical Culture and Sports of Almaty Region for 2011-2015’ to enhance international tourism. These were all noted at the time of inscription.

The site of Talgar itself as a component of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor” serial World Heritage property (S01-KZ) is a State-owned monument. It has had a level of National protection since 1974, within the former USSR heritage legislation (adopted by the resolution of Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR, No. 338). In 2008, the Talgar archaeological site received the highest National protection level from the independent state (Decree № 279, State List of the Monuments of History and Culture of National Status, Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

It is also important to note that the National Heritage Law contains articles which set up the highest category of "Monuments of history and culture of the International significance representing historical, scientific, architectural, artistic, and memorial value, included in the UNESCO World Heritage List" (Article № 26) and which are submitted by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Article № 27). Article № 1 of the National Heritage Law, states that ‘If an international treaty ratified by Kazakhstan, establishes rules other than those contained in this Law, the rules of the International treaty are used’, meaning that the World Heritage Convention signed by Kazakhstan in 1994 has a superior force over the National Law.

Two facts are also important to note. On 19 November 2013, the Republic of Kazakhstan was elected a member of the World Heritage Committee for the next four years; and on 5 May 2014, the National World Heritage Committee was established under the presidency of the well-known archaeologist and academician Prof. Karl Baibakov, with archaeologist Dr.
Dmitry Voyakin as Secretary General. The objective is to reinforce the World Heritage system in Kazakhstan and to establish proper monitoring and management tools.

These details and facts, as well as the links to the Articles of the National Heritage legislation, are relevant for the assessment of the new road construction through the Talgar component site and its impact on the OUV of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ serial property.

Resuming Part III.1 of this report, it is important to stress:

- The Advisory Mission appreciates the amount of work done by the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO, the World Heritage Committee, the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and by different scientific, professional and public organisations, deputy corps in 2014-2016 with the purpose to prevent the construction of a road through the World Heritage property in Talgar. The correspondence between the different institutions inside the country, which was presented to the Mission, proves the numerous attempts to resolve this issue at the high state level and to find an alternative route to avoid the component site. Due to these activities, all road construction works in Talgar have been stopped;

- At the same time, the Mission notes that the construction of the road and bridge in Talgar through the World Heritage property and its buffer zone did not appear to receive the attention of the Coordinating Committee of the three States Parties (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) and its Secretariat in Xi’an, which was set up to coordinate management and emergency monitoring. In the case of Talgar, this seems to indicate a lack of awareness of the efficiency of this structure. The Statement of Outstanding Universal Value adopted by the World Heritage Committee (Decision 38 COM 8B.24) specifically mentioned that within Kazakhstan this collaboration needs to be reinforced;

- On 22 November 2014, a delegation of Chinese historians and archaeologists visited the Talgar ancient settlement, which initiated an information campaign for its urgent protection and salvation. Presumably, the Chinese experts arrived by special invitation, although the Mission was not provided with any official documentation that confirmed their invitation by the State Party of Kazakhstan, nor with any official response on behalf of the Chinese delegation on the road and bridge construction;

- The Mission notes that Kazakhstan possesses a sufficient and extensive level of legal support for the preservation of cultural heritage. At the same time, the analysis of the situation in Talgar, reveals:
  - A violation of heritage legislation (The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July 2, 1992, № 1488-XII ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’, and namely the Articles №№ 18, 33, 35, 36, 39 and some others);
  - A discrepancy in Heritage legislation and Land legislation. The latter has no provision for mandatory archaeological expertise prior to starting any works. For Kazakhstan, a country of great archaeological heritage, the integration of required archaeological expertise in Land legislation is absolutely vital;
  - A lack of proper coordination between the relevant State departments and branches, between the legislative and executive bodies on National, Regional and Local levels in ensuring the requirements of the World Heritage Convention and the National heritage legislation are met and the approval system is properly used;
A lack of sufficient consultation with the professional expert community on the need of legal compliance for cultural heritage protection and namely the Talgar settlement (demonstrated in correspondence provided to the ICOMOS Mission expert);

- Background information on the road and bridge construction in Talgar showed that a number of provisions in the Operational Guidelines\(^3\) have not been properly met;

- The Mission would also like to draw attention to the apparent lack of awareness (on almost all levels) of what ‘World Heritage’ is, what its legal status is and what guarantees the protection of the WH properties by States Parties. In particular, this applies to Regional and Local executive bodies.

III.2. Protected area legislation and boundaries of the World Heritage property

In Kazakhstan, the elaboration of zones of protection for historic and cultural monuments is subject to Heritage legislation. Article № 36 (The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan from July 2, 1992, № 1488-XII ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’) defines three types of zones of protection. The ‘Rules for definition and regime of use for zones of protection’ elaborated by the Ministry of Culture and Sports in December 2014 and approved by the Ministry of Justice in January 2015, gives an idea of their definition:

- **Protection zone:** with strict use and control, allowing conservation and maintenance of monuments and ancient structures. This zone is equal to the same distance as from the ground to its highest point but not less than 20 m (For an archaeological monument: 50m from its boundary, with a radius of 200m overview from its centre);

- **Zone for regulation of development:** since 2014 set equal to two times the distance of the protection zone;

- **Zone of protected natural landscape** is equal to the zone of regulation of development.

Following the Heritage legislation, the disposition of monuments and boundaries of all zones of protection should be approved by the Local representative bodies (Maslikhat) of the Regions and depicted on the historical-architectural reference plans and maps of the specific area (Article № 36).

The territory of the Talgar component site was defined as follows: the World Heritage site of 55.7 ha and the buffer zone of 329.3 ha (total 385 ha). The World Heritage site and the delimitation of its boundaries were elaborated in the nomination dossier on the basis of the ‘Project for Protection zones for Talgar settlement’ executed by the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ in 2008 using the former Soviet methodology of the 1980s. These zones were approved by the Local Administration (Maslikhat) of the Almaty Region in 2013, after the ‘Silk Roads’ nomination was submitted. The Ministry for Culture and Sports accepted the works carried out, however the Mission has not received any relevant document confirming this zoning issued by the Ministry of Culture as the authorised body for the World Heritage properties. However, the measurements of the established zones for Talgar do not correspond to the new Rules of 2014 for defining the zones of protection (they are smaller in size).

---

\(^3\) Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention (UNESCO, July 2015)
The delimitations of the Talgar component (the inscribed site and buffer zone) correspond to the National delineation for the zones of protection. Thus, the territory of the World Heritage property (55.7 ha) consists of the main presentation zone for the Talgar settlement (20.8 ha) and its protection zone, combined together as the territory of archaeological cultural layer (55.7 ha). The buffer zone (329.3 ha) includes the zone for regulation of development (82.7 ha), recreation zone (29.1 ha), and zone of the protected natural landscape (250 ha).

Along the approved ‘Protection zones for Talgar settlement’, 2013, the main presentation zone and its protection zone should be strictly controlled; excavations without special state permission, new construction and agricultural land use prohibited. Within the zone for regulation of development, the appropriate conditions for the preservation of monuments should be created. In the northern part adjacent to the nominated plot, new construction prohibited, and the height of buildings must not exceed one floor. Residential buildings, which are located directly on the territory of the monument’s cultural layer near the northern wall, along the prescriptions of 2008, to be demolished and land areas compensated to inhabitants. In this zone for regulation of development, construction of tall buildings, highways, bridges and industrial plants prohibited.

As for the zone of protected natural landscape - the historically-formed terrain, vegetation, road and water system, planning and other elements - is aimed at conservation and restoration. The nature of land use and agricultural activities are subject to regulation. Buildings, structures, and other objects that distort the character of the landscape, are to be eliminated. The challenge for the zone of protected natural landscape is to preserve the natural historical landscape around the monument and to prevent the construction of a cottage massif on the northern slope of the mountain.

Resuming Part III.2 of this report, the Advisory Mission finds important to acknowledge:

- **The positive efforts of the specialists of “Kazrestavratsiya” aimed at the development of the Project for the protection zones of Talgar ancient settlement (2008), which formed the basis for this component site and its delimitations in the World Heritage Nomination dossier (2012);**

- **The efforts of specialists and representatives of the State authorities who managed to achieve the approval of the boundaries of the protection zones for the Talgar ancient settlement by the Maslikhat of the Almaty Region in 2013, in accordance with Article № 36 of the National heritage legislation. However, it is quite important to receive official confirmation regarding the zones of protections in Talgar from the Ministry of Culture and Sports as the authorised body for implementation of the World Heritage Convention, especially in consideration of the new Rules of 2014 defining the measurements for zones of protection as smaller in size;**

- **The Mission positively assesses the work on the installation of fencing along the boundaries of the Talgar component site, implemented by the Akimat of Talgar (one of the urgent requirements in the ICOMOS Evaluation report). However, the Mission notes that the fence is not fully installed; the side facing the Talgar River remains open. In addition, the trajectory of the fence along the southeast boundary (and partly eastern) does not strictly match the boundary of the inscribed site. It is also unclear whether the**

---

4 http://whc.unesco.org/archive/advisory_body_evaluation/1442.pdf
project for installing the fence was discussed by the expert community and officially confirmed;

- That the Heritage legislation (Article № 36) which stipulates that the location of monuments and the boundaries of all zones of protection should be depicted on the historical-architectural reference plans and maps of the specific area, has been violated. Both the Master Plan of Talgar (2004) and actual Cadastre Map have no proper indications of the location of monuments and zones of protection, though Talgar is a monument of the State since 1974 (within the former USSR heritage legislation) and was granted top protection level in 2008 by the Kazakhstan Government;

- Accordingly, there are no any acting plans for Talgar at the National level (with an exception of the ‘Silk Roads’ Nomination dossier) showing the location and boundaries of the Talgar site as one of the components of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ serial property;

- The initial square of the protected archaeological site in Talgar was much less (3,89 ha) than as it was defined in the Project for the zones of protection in 2008 and later confirmed in the World Heritage nomination dossier (that is, the territory of the inscribed site is equal to 55.7 ha – the overall territory of the Talgar archaeological cultural layer). In the situation with a new road, this fact was used by the developers for speculations regarding the possibility of building the track near the archaeological plot of 3,89 ha, that is ignoring the actual delimitations of the inscribed site;

- Accordingly, the Mission would like to note that the construction of a new road with bridge through the inscribed zones of the Talgar World Heritage property and its buffer zone is a violation of both the National heritage legislation and the obligations to the World Heritage Convention.

III.3. Management structure

The Nomination dossier for the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ serial property (2012) presents the management system consisting of two levels:

- Transnational system between China, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan (The Coordination and Steering Committees) reinforced by the special co-signed The Agreement on Serial Transnational Nomination for World Cultural Heritage and Coordination, Protection and Management of the ‘Silk Roads: Initial Section of the Silk Roads, the Routes Network of Tianshan Corridor’ (May 15, 2012). This document stipulates the transnational protection, management and coordination mechanism along the paragraphs 114, 135 and 137 of the Operational Guidelines, which regulate the protection and management of serial and transnational heritage (Nomination dossier, p.611);

- National system presented at the Nomination dossier (Annex III, p. 38-54) as general approach for the Republic of Kazakhstan and specifically for the Talgar component (S 01-KZ). National system defines the main actors – Local Administration of Almaty Region (Department of Culture) responsible for registration of the monument, development of plans and programs to ensure the necessary protection level, conservation and use of monuments; Ministry of Culture and Information (presently, Culture and Sports) of the Republic of
Kazakhstan and the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavrotsiya’ for development/implementation of projects for protection, conservation and restoration. The A.Kh. Margulan Institute of Archaeology (Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan) is responsible for the implementation of research programs. Any projects and plans concerning the works at the monuments or on their territory are coordinated with government agencies for the protection of monuments (Nomination dossier, p. 616).

The Management Plan for the Talgar component site (2012), ensuring that this settlement ‘will be preserved for future generations through appropriate policies and appropriate protective measures’, has numerous important issues. For instance, it includes the development of the medium-term action plan for 5 years (2012-2017) for the protection of un-excavated archaeological sites from external influences, as well as the development of a plan for reducing the risk of damaging the objects of the settlement in case of emergency. All these points are of notable importance especially in a situation with the road construction, whilst also having in mind the ‘Strategic Plan of Management on Tourism, Physical Culture and Sport of Almaty Province for 2011-2015’. It is aimed at turning the Almaty Region into an international tourist centre with a developed system of services and infrastructure (accommodation, availability to the sites, propaganda of tourist routes on the ‘Silk Roads’ corridor).

Briefly resuming Part III.3., the Advisory Mission would like to note:

- The lack of a detailed Management plan as emphasized in the recommendations adopted at the 38th Session of the World Heritage Committee, 2014 (38 COM 8B.24);
- The lack of information relating to the construction of a road under the Management plan, including Part 2.4.1 of ‘Potential Threats’ in the Nomination dossier;
- The lack of active, joint actions on preventing the road and bridge construction through the inscribed site, relating to the participation of the Coordination and Steering Committees within the transnational system (China, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan), which indicates the lack of proper effectiveness of this international structure in a case of emergency;
- The constant rotation of officials at the Ministry of Culture and Sports, the responsible authority for the implementation of the World Heritage Convention, which, creates a negative influence on continuity in the management process.

IV. IDENTIFICATION AND ASSESMENT OF SPECIFIC ISSUES

Factors affecting the property

During the visit (21-23 March 2016) to the Talgar settlement (component S 01-KZ in the serial transboundary nomination of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang'an-Tianshan Corridor’), the Advisory Mission found an already-built concrete bridge over the Talgar river.
In addition, significant progress with the reconstruction project for the Northern gate and the corner of the north-east tower of the Talgar Citadel was revealed. In the close vicinity of the boundaries of the inscribed site, the active construction of private residential buildings was discovered in the buffer zone. All these issues will be analysed in the following part of the mission report.

IV.1. Road and bridge construction

The new four-span bridge (89 m long) is part of the new road Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak (section ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26), bypassing the town centre of Talgar to the Ak-Bulak Sportive area. The total road length is 23 km, with 17 km of reconstruction works. The new part of the road through the Talgar archaeological site is 300 m long. The axis of a new road, designed across the inscribed site and its buffer zone, is already marked by special signs. The profile of the road, which shall cross the inscribed site in an east-west direction and in near vicinity of the walls of the Talgar Citadel (Shahristan), consists of two road lanes with a total width of 12 m including roadsides. From the north side, a concrete retaining wall (7 m high and 45 m long) shall be built along the Shahristan. The total width of the road with slopes is 26 m. It appears that the rapid construction of the rather expensive bridge, which directly terminates onto the hill of the Talgar settlement at an elevation of around minus 3 m, indicates an attempt to make the road construction in this place irreversible.

The project of the road was not approved by the Ministry of Culture and Sports, and was not presented to the intergovernmental Coordination Committee for the ‘Silk Roads’ nor to the World Heritage Centre or ICOMOS. Protection measures with historical/cultural expertise were not carried out in due course, nor was archaeological investigation carried out before the land was allocated (Articles №№ 5, 13, 18, 35, 39, National heritage legislation).

IV.1.2. Sequence of events in the history of the road project

For a clear understanding of the situation and to inform conclusions, it is necessary to briefly describe the history of this issue. The Advisory Mission is fully aware of its complexity and intricacy and apologizes in advance for the possibility of small errors in the following presentation:

1974: the Talgar ancient settlement (archaeological site) registered as monument of National significance (Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR, No. 338), with the territory in 3, 89 ha;
April 1994: the President of Kazakhstan ratified the World Heritage Convention;
14 July 2004: Master Plan of the city of Talgar introduced the infrastructure network including roads going in the west-east and north-south direction through the archaeological site of Talgar. This Master Plan is the only acting urban document for the city until today. In 2013, the Master plan was amended but without the final approval. The Advisory Mission was informed that a detailed project plan (2007) was used in preparing the nomination dossier, and a new road was not designated in this plan;
2 February 2007: the order of the President of Kazakhstan № 772 for the construction and development of Technopolis ‘City of Science’ (Soldier valley, Talgar district of the Almaty Region) including the construction of a new road;
2007: development of technical justifications for new road, bypassing Talgar from the south, just through the territory of the archaeological ancient settlement;
2008: development of design/estimate documentation for construction and reconstruction of the road Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak. This project was not implemented within four years due to the lack of financial support;
2008: Akimat of Talgar district signed the Resolution № 04-491 on the land allocation for road construction;
2008: the Talgar archaeological site listed at the top level of National protection (Decree № 279, State List of the Monuments of History and Culture of National Status, Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan);
2008: State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ elaborated the ‘Project for Protection zones for Talgar settlement’. The territory of the Talgar monument (55, 7 ha) and zones of protection as defined in this project (overall 385 ha) became a basis for preparing the Nomination dossier and defining the boundaries of the component site and its buffer zone;
2009: State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ informed the Akimat of Talgar on elaboration of this project;
2012: the State Party of Kazakhstan (together with China and Kyrgyzstan) submitted a serial transboundary nomination of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor” for inscription on the World Heritage List. The nomination dossier provided no indication of the road construction and its potential threat; later the same year, the road project passed the adjustment, however with a lack of information provided on the future plans for the World Heritage property;
12 July 2012: Akimat of Talgar district signed the Resolution № 07-590 on the land withdrawal for road construction;
20 September – 20 October 2013: ICOMOS Evaluation mission for the World Heritage serial nomination visited Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. The mission was not provided with any information on the project of the road construction or on the Master Plan for Talgar;
31 December 2013: an adjustment of design and estimate documentation for road construction № 18-0988 and № 18-0219, 31 March, 2014. These technical acts did not include archaeological, historical-cultural and ecological expertise;
28 July 2013: the Zones for protection of Talgar settlement approved by the Local Administration (Maslikhat) of the Almaty Region with an overall territory in 385 ha and relevant boundaries. There were no indications of monument’s plot and delimitation in situ, no information in the database of the Land Cadaster. The Master Plan of Talgar was not revised, though situation changed;
19 November 2013: the Republic of Kazakhstan elected into the World Heritage Committee for the next four years;
5 May 2014: the National World Heritage Committee created under the presidency of the archaeologist, academician Prof. K. Baibakov and Secretary General, archaeologist Dr. D. Voyakin;
22 June 2014: with the decision adopted at the 38th Session of the World Heritage Committee, the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor” serial property was inscribed on the World Heritage List (38 COM 8B.24). The boundaries of the Talgar component site were not marked at the Talgar archaeological site; The Master Plan for Talgar was not revised;
27 July 2014: the construction of the road (in violation of Article № 127, the Land Code, and Article № 35 of Heritage legislation) started in the direction of the Sportive Centre Ak-bulak, where the ‘Universiade 2017’ (World student games) is planned. The concrete four-span bridge over the Talgar river almost built (89 m long) with the costs of 583.014 million
Kazakhstani Tenge. General costs for the road construction is 11.239 million US $ (the list of costs for the period of 2014-2016 presented);

22 November 2014: a delegation of Chinese historians and archaeologists visited Talgar. The first on-line information on the bridge construction appeared on the internet at the end of October/mid-November 2014. Since then, there is evidence of a large amount of protest letters and discussions at different state levels until spring 2016. The role of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Culture and Sports are is important in this campaign;

29 December 2014: given the importance of the planned road and the necessity to safeguard the Talgar protection zone, a decision to elaborate an alternative road was taken;

10 December 2015: the decision to stop all construction work was taken, as well as to carry out additional archaeological research at the site. A special expert Commission was established;

17 April 2016: the Prosecutor General of Kazakhstan A. Daulbaev provided a detailed assessment of the situation and confirmed that all works on the road in the area of the World Heritage property had been stopped;

2016: a draft project for a new alternative route was submitted for the review and approval by the international expertise (ICOMOS, World Heritage Centre). The archaeological expertise commissioned by the Department for the road construction ‘Almaty Zhoba’. The Advisory Mission had at its disposal the official report on the results of these excavations by the ‘Kazarheologiya’ Enterprise and its evaluation by the Ministry of Culture and Sports as the authorized body for implementation of the WH Convention, though only in the Kazakh language, which did not allow for its interpretation therefore. However, the Mission was told that the results of this research presented no evidence of a cultural archaeological layer, which the mission considers rather surprising.

The analysis of the sequence of events along this time-line, allows for the following brief observations:

- The evidence of un-coordination within different State departments and authorities, the lack of links between the National, Regional and Local executive bodies;
- The evidence of the violation of National law, as well as obligations related to of the World Heritage Convention;
- The dysfunction of monitoring and management systems, elaborated for World Heritage properties, in practice;
- A misunderstanding of heritage values and conditions for their sustainability;
- A lack of adequate knowledge and understanding of the notion of ‘World Heritage’ and its framework practically on all administrative levels;
- A lack of public awareness; in Talgar there were no public hearings on the inscription of the ancient settlement onto the World Heritage List.

In the case that this project is realized, the historic structure of the Talgar ancient settlement, the authenticity and the values associated with this component of the World Heritage serial property will be destroyed; the integrity of this protected archaeological layer lost forever. The natural and cultural landscape of this site currently protected by the National heritage law and the World Heritage Convention will be irreversibly disfigured.
IV.1.3. Suggestions for alternative route

Following the decision to stop the construction of the road section in Talgar (ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26) through the World Heritage property, the Kazakh experts have investigated two alternative options for a new route.

The first one assumes a continuation of the route from the west almost in a straight line and then along the northern boundary of the component site, in the buffer zone along the Derzhavin Street (zone for regulated development along the National heritage legislation). Later, this idea was not supported as the road would pass in close proximity to the boundary of the component site, and most importantly – involve new land acquisition in the residential area and the demolition of private houses, including some newly-built. In addition, since the construction of the road should be completed before 5 January 2017, this longer-term option was eventually rejected.

The second alternative that was approved at a national level was forwarded by the Ministry of Culture and Sports to the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in March 2016. This project was developed by the same organization "Almaty Joba" as the original new road proposal. This revised project involves bypassing the World Heritage property from the south, but still crosses its boundary, but at a greater distance from the Talgar Citadel. The construction of another bridge over the Talgar River would also be inevitable in this case.

The mission explored this alternative project on site, through conversations with the road builders and representatives of the local authorities. Besides the fact that this road will also cross the territory of the World Heritage property and complex terrain in the buffer zone, the proposed route will pass over the historical Muslim cemetery (archaeological layer) and in close proximity to important technical facilities. Among these are the water intake, feeding the whole of Talgar, water pipes, dam, and locks on the by-pass channels associated with the Talgar reservoir.

Although no Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) has been prepared for this revised route, it is clear that it would have considerable negative impacts on the Talgar component site and thus on the overall series of the Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang'an-Tianshan Corridor”. It is difficult to understand why this alternative route with the above-mentioned challenges was proposed for the consideration and evaluation of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre.

Resuming part IV.1.3 of the present report:

- The Advisory Mission notes that if the information about the road construction would have been mentioned in the World Heritage Nomination dossier already in 2012, and reported to the 2013 ICOMOS Evaluation Mission, the current road construction (including the bridge) which would have a completely unacceptable and irreversible impact on the Talgar component site and on the overall serial property of the Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor”, could have been prevented and work undertaken to explore an alternative route that would avoid adverse impact on the World Heritage property, and this could also have been a more efficient use of financial resources;
• Still, bearing in mind that the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) associated with the Talgar settlement and its contribution to the OUV of the whole series, the Mission considers it important that the State Party should continue to explore further the elaboration of the alternative route of the Ak-Bulak road that would sustain OUV and respect national protective designations. One of the options would be behind the Northern boundary of the buffer zone. Following the established regimes, the construction of tall buildings, highways and bridges is prohibited in the National zone of regulated development, which presently corresponds to the World Heritage buffer zone. Any such alternative would need to be presented for evaluation with an HIA before any formal commitments were made or any construction work undertaken;

• If such a solution can be found, there is a necessity to resolve the fate of the already-constructed bridge. Local specialists suggest using this concrete structure as tourist infrastructure for the World Heritage component site but any such proposal would need to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre and fully evaluated by the Advisory Bodies.

IV.1.4. Reconstruction project within the World Heritage property

The ICOMOS Evaluation report\(^5\) noted that a new gate was under construction in north-west corner of the Talgar site as a traffic control measure, but recommended that the building would be better constructed outside of the property boundary.

During the Advisory Mission, significant progress with this reconstruction project was noted. The Northern gate, in fact, has been totally built under the supervision of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan, who commissioned this project. The round north-east Corner tower is still under construction. The Mission was presented (upon request) with the project for the ‘Restoration, conservation and museumification of the Talgar historical and archaeological complex, 13-14 c.’, which is the basis for the on-going reconstruction works. The project elaborated by the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavrotsiya’ in 2008-2010, dates from several years earlier than the nomination and inscription of Talgar on the World Heritage List as part of the serial property in 2014.

Reconstruction is carried out in situ in principle, directly on archeological remains with interpretation of architectural forms based on a wide range of analogues from the Central Asia region (Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Afghanistan, and Uzbekistan). Different options suggested for the tower reconstruction (for instance, round or rectangular) demonstrate elements of an hypothetical approach. As the Talgar settlement was destroyed and declined in the 13-14th centuries, there is no documentary evidence available (photos or technical drawings), only the archaeological findings and these are inadequate to determine the precise form of the tower.

Both structures, the gate and the tower, are made of adobe bricks using traditional technology, but with reinforced concrete strip foundations. Plaster with cement additives has been used for strengthening the surface, which after a short period will acquire an unattractive appearance, covered with cracks and efflorescence. The proposed next step is the reconstruction of the northern walls, also on a reinforced concrete foundation. To carry out research on the wall's original construction, an archaeological test cut was made through the wall (around three meters wide) significantly destroying the original, ancient masonry. Thus,

\(^5\) http://whc.unesco.org/archive/advisory_body_evaluation/1442.pdf
the authenticity of the Talgar settlement in this area has been significantly reduced. Now this gap in the wall is used for the passage of trucks for construction works.

The reconstruction project was approved by the Ministry of Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan, but not by the Local authorities in charge of the Talgar settlement protection. The project was not presented to the Intergovernmental Coordination Committee for ‘Silk Roads’ (as required in accordance with paragraphs 135 and 137 of the Operational Guidelines, relating to transboundary and serial properties) nor transmitted to the World Heritage Centre or ICOMOS for consideration and evaluation (paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines). The Mission notes that the multiplication of reconstructed elements (and there are other plans in progress) will lead to an adverse change of a balance between original and newly-built structures and thus the gradual devaluation of authentic heritage.

The issue of reconstruction was not initially included in the terms of reference for the Mission. However, the Mission would like to make the following observation:

- **The reconstruction project requires further special consideration through the existing procedures established for the World Heritage properties. Full details should be provided to the World Heritage Centre for evaluation by the Advisory Bodies. However, it should be noted that in accordance with paragraph 86 of the Operational Guidelines: ‘In relation to authenticity, the reconstruction of archaeological remains of historic buildings or districts is justifiable only in exceptional circumstances. Reconstruction is acceptable only on the basis of complete and detailed documentation and to no extent on conjecture’. Until such evaluation has been undertaken, all work should be halted.**

**IV.1.5. Residential construction in the buffer zone**

The mission also noted the active construction of private residential buildings in close vicinity to the boundaries of the World Heritage property, in the buffer zone. As it was mentioned earlier, in line with the current national protection for the site and its buffer one, the main presentation zone and its protection zone should be strictly controlled; new constructions prohibited and the height of buildings must not exceed one floor (‘Protection zones for Talgar settlement’, approved in 2013). As we have already seen however, new construction is being carried out thus violating the National heritage legislation.

Looking at the panoramas of the Talgar settlement today and comparing these with the general views seen in the Nomination dossier of 2012, the mission noticed striking and negative contrasts in the skyline, the disposition of masses and colour gamma, through the presence of new buildings and cottages which did not exist before. There are several large-scale, two or three story structures with bright roofs built just behind the walls of the Talgar Citadel. These testify to direct violation of the established protection regimes, and introduce highly adverse elements into the visual perception of the World Heritage property and strongly diminishes its capacity to display its value and thus its OUV. The reconstructed Northern Gates, although themselves highly detrimental, are now lost amongst this colorful and distorted background.

- **Projects for the newly-built residential structures in the World Heritage buffer zone, were evidently not controlled or regulated on behalf of the Ministry of Culture and Sports as the authorized body for implementation of the World Heritage Convention, nor discussed or approved on Intergovernmental level relating to the World Heritage property of the ‘Silk**
Roads’, or reviewed by ICOMOS. At the same time, Local authorities demonstrate an inadequate understanding of the existing rules and regimes for the protection of World Heritage properties and thus permit this uncontrolled development in areas where the national protective regimes excluded such development.

V. ASSESSMENT OF THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF THE SITE

Several issues evaluated earlier are connected with this part of the mission report. In particular, the mission analysed in detail the situation of the road and bridge construction through the World Heritage property and its buffer zone; the partly hypothetic reconstruction over archaeological remains and uncontrolled residential construction in the protected area. All these issues have a negative impact on the property’s OUV and lead to partial losses. In addition, it is worth mentioning the still-functioning earth road between the northern and southern gates in the main property area, littered areas, the presence of soil stockpiles, the use of the area under pasture, etc., testifying to a lack of proper monitoring and maintenance.

A positive development is the installation of an information board and permanent fence (though partial and not strict to delimitations) along the archaeological site. However, the World Heritage property itself still remains permeable for cars and animals. The central excavated site of the Talgar Citadel is in good condition. Permanent archaeological investigations are under scientific control and included in the ongoing management programme. The picturesque natural landscape and mountains from the southern side remain practically intact. The electricity poles and power lines are disturbing encroachments both in terms of the general panorama along the Talgar River and in the residential area close to the property. In the long-term, these vertical obtrusive elements might be carefully eliminated, within a special programme.

The State Party already submitted a report on the state of conservation for 2015, in accordance with existing requirements. This report provides updates on the numerous correct and valuable positions as it was in the Nomination dossier of 2012. In answer to the recommendation of Decision 38 COM 8B.24 to develop a detailed Management Plan that would provide strategies for conservation and visitor management, including interpretation, only ‘a system to carefully control/monitory consists of three separate independent groups was created’, but not the detailed Management Plan as it is. Neither the road and bridge construction, nor the new cottages built in near vicinity of the World Heritage property in the buffer zone are mentioned again, even in the brief heritage impact report for Talgar. This fact seems unexplainable and prolongs the same unclear tactics to not acknowledge or present details on the real serious problems and existing threats (as previously in the Nomination dossier).

- The Mission notes that the elaboration and implementation of the Management Plan, as a detailed strategic program and tool, is needed as a matter of urgency.

The extensive reconstruction project for the Northern Gates, wall and Corner tower of the Talgar Citadel, is mentioned in the 2015 State Party state of conservation report and brief heritage impact report as a ‘project for conservation and restoration’, which is based ‘on scientific data and exclude any unscientifically reconstruction’.
In the light of the mission’s findings, this statement appears not to be correct, and the overall project needs to be halted while a detailed review of the project documentation in undertaken, since pictures of the archaeological site dating from the time of the property’s inscription on the World Heritage List and the present situation are radically different.

In this regard, it is worth mentioning ‘The ICOMOS Charter for the Protection and management of Archaeological Heritage’ (1990), which calls for extreme accuracy in the treatment of this type of cultural heritage and to search for a clever balance with heritage presentation needs: ‘Development projects constitute one of the greatest physical threats to the archaeological heritage. A duty for developers to ensure that archaeological heritage impact studies are carried out before development schemes are implemented, should therefore be embodied in appropriate legislation, with a stipulation that the costs of such studies are to be included in project costs. The principle should also be established in legislation that development schemes should be designed in such a way as to minimise their impact upon the archaeological heritage’ (Article 3). ‘Reconstructions serve two important functions: experimental research and interpretation. They should, however, be carried out with great caution, so as to avoid disturbing any surviving archaeological evidence, and they should take account of evidence from all sources in order to achieve authenticity. Where possible and appropriate, reconstructions should not be built immediately on the archaeological remains, and should be identifiable as such’ (Article 7).

Bearing in mind the specifics of the Talgar archaeological component, the proximity of its location to the inhabited area, and that the reconstruction project was implemented without consultation with the International bodies (including the Intergovernmental Coordination Committee of the ‘Silk Roads’), the Mission recommends the State Party to submit the reconstruction project for urgent review by the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS (in accordance with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines).

VI. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Assessing the current state of conservation of the Talgar component site of the serial World Heritage property of the ‘Silk Roads’, the Advisory Mission presents the following conclusions, recommendations and solutions targeted at two main goals:

- Evaluation of the road and bridge construction and decisions taken;
- Necessity for reinforcing and improvement of the World Heritage system in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

VI.1. Conclusions and Recommendations on road construction

The Advisory Mission has reviewed in detail the project of the road construction, the alternative option for the route proposed by the State party and inspected the site of the Talgar ancient settlement. Taking note of the following:

- Being aware of the complexity of conflict existing and positively assessing numerous attempts by the State Party to find a solution to this difficult situation;
- Keeping in mind the goals and objectives of the World Heritage Convention;
Clearly understanding the significant contribution of the Talgar component to the serial World Heritage property of the ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’, to its Integrity and Authenticity, and to the Outstanding Universal Value of the whole series;

Taking into consideration the above-mentioned observations of the present ICOMOS report (including the notes on violation of the national ‘Law on the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage, 1992, the World Heritage Convention and the Operational Guidelines for its implementation) and the overall highly negative and irreversible damage that the proposed road would have on the OUV of the overall series;

Preventing further potential destruction of the Talgar historical structure and its morphology, partial loss of the protected archaeological layer, cultural and natural landscape of the World Heritage component (S 01-KZ);

The ICOMOS Advisory Mission presents the following recommendations to the State Party:

- As a matter of urgency, to declare moratorium on the Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak road construction (section ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26);
- To reject the alternative version of the track proposed by the State Party on the south side of the World Heritage component site as it would adversely impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the component site and disturb both the established property zone, delimitations and technical water systems vital for Talgar city;
- To continue to explore further options for the elaboration of an alternative route for the Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak road (section ПК 0+00 – ПК 177+47.26) beyond the territory of the World Heritage component site and its buffer zone which are both protected by national legislation from major development;
- As a matter of urgency, establish an Expert Council including ICOMOS experts of the relevant profile and representatives of the Intergovernmental Coordination Committee of the ‘Silk Roads’ in order to search for an appropriate solution for an alternative route, its assessment and submission along with an Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) to the World Heritage Centre in accordance with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines for review by the Advisory Bodies;
- To take a decision to dismantle the bridge constructed over the Talgar River, as it is in total contradiction with the OUV of the serial transboundary property, as well as in violation of National heritage law and the Operational Guidelines.

VI.2. Observations on measures for reinforcing and improvement of the World Heritage system in the Republic of Kazakhstan

As was mentioned earlier, the Advisory Mission appreciated the amount of work done in 2014-2016 by the Ministry of Culture and Sports, the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO, the World Heritage Committee of the Republic of Kazakhstan and by different professional and public organisations with the purpose to prevent the construction of a road through the Talgar World Heritage component site of the Silk Roads World Heritage property.
However, in analysing this situation, the Mission has come to a conclusion on the necessity to significantly reinforce the World Heritage system in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

VI.2.1. Recommendations on Legal and Institutional Framework

Taking into consideration the different levels of the Legal and Institutional Framework existing at the disposal of the State Party for protection of the Talgar component, the Mission suggests the following recommendations:

- **At Transnational level:**
  To avoid the declarative character and to improve significantly the management and monitoring role of the Intergovernmental Coordinating Committee of the three States Parties (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan), following the recommendations of the World Heritage Committee on the ‘Silk Roads’ serial property, 2014. As it was noted, this collaboration needs to be reinforced within Kazakhstan specifically (38 Com 8B.24);

- **At National level:**
  - Calls the State Party to reinforce significantly the control over the implementation of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’, 1992, and namely the Articles №№ 18, 33, 35, 36, 39 and others);
  - Encourages the State Party to strengthen significantly the mechanisms for implementation of the World Heritage Convention (ratified by Kazakhstan in 1994) to guarantee the proper conservation of the World Heritage properties on its territory;
  - Encourages the State Party to update the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’, 1992, in line with the World Heritage terminology (such as World Heritage property, buffer zone, delimitations) and with relevant WH protection/management tools, in order to define their correspondence to the zones of protection and preservation regimes within the National Heritage legislation;
  - As a matter of urgency, encourages the establishment of efficient coordination and a harmonization of decisions in relation to the World Heritage properties in Kazakhstan between the relevant State departments and branches, as well as between the National, Regional and Local executive bodies in ensuring the requirements of the World Heritage Convention and National Heritage legislation;
  - Encourages the State Party to update the National Land legislation in line with the interests of the outstanding archaeological heritage of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which currently has no provision for mandatory archaeological expertise prior to starting any works. This contradicts the National Heritage legislation;

- **With respect to protection regimes, the Mission recommends the State Party to:**
  - Guarantee the preservation of the planning structure, the terrain, and all valuable elements forming the morphology of the Talgar World Heritage site;
  - Ensure further study and exposition of the archaeological heritage as well as its preservation.
• Encourages the establishment of a permanent educational and promotion system for a better understanding of the concepts and mechanisms of the World Heritage framework to be addressed to all administrative/executive levels.

VI.2.2. Recommendations on protected area legislation and boundaries of the World Heritage Site

The Mission positively-assessed the efforts of the State Enterprise "Kazrestavratsiya" towards the elaboration of the zones of protection for Talgar ancient settlement, which formed the basis for the World Heritage delimitations. However, the Mission considers it important that further steps are taken aimed at reinforcing the legal protection of the World Heritage property and its OUV and therefore recommends the State Party to:

• Approve, as a matter of urgency, the established delimitations of the zones of protections of the Talgar settlement, by the Ministry of Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan as the authorised body for implementation of the World Heritage Convention (currently confirmed by the Maslikhat of the Almaty Region, 2013), especially having in mind the new Rules of 2014 defining the measurements for zones of protection less in size;

• Implement the Article № 36 of the National Heritage legislation requiring mandatory designation for monuments and boundaries of all zones of protection to be depicted at the historical-architectural reference plans and maps of specific area;

• Accordingly, there is an urgent need to carry out the revision of the Master plan for Talgar in order to specify the territory and boundaries of the World Heritage site as well as the limits of its buffer zone. A similar strong recommendation also applies to the Cadastre Map of the Talgar territory;

• To continue the installation of fencing along the boundaries of the Talgar World Heritage property as presently not finished. To correct its trajectory on a site along the southeast (and partly eastern) delimitations in accordance with the project presented in the State Party's 2015 state of conservation report on Talgar.

VI.2.3. Recommendations on Management structure

In addition to VI.2.1, the Advisory Mission draws attention to shortcomings in the modern system of policies and legal mechanisms for the protection of the World Heritage property. Among them:
- The lack of a detailed Management plan as emphasized in the recommendations of the 38th Session of the World Heritage Committee (Decision 38 COM 8B.24);
- The lack of appropriate tools for conservation, management, presentation and development;
- The lack of a full archaeological cadastre of Talgar settlement and coordination between archaeology, preservation and new construction.
Addressing these weaknesses, the Mission recommends the State Party:

- As a matter of urgency, to elaborate and implement the Management Plan as strategic programme and tool, including the appropriate system for monitoring, management, general conservation plan, presentation and development (along the recommendations of the World Heritage Committee, Decision 38 COM 8B.24);

- To create a full archaeological cadastre of the World Heritage property (as part of the Management plan), to ensure coordination and balance between the archaeological site (integrating research, conservation and display), its preservation and the possibilities for new construction/development in the buffer zone;

- With regard to approaches to archaeological heritage and the historic context relations, to refer to the ICOMOS Charter for the Interpretation and Presentation of Cultural Heritage sites (Quebec, 2008);

- Reiterating the above recommendation in VI.2.1., to take appropriate measures for ensuring the effective Coordination of Steering Committees within the transnational system (China, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan), especially in case of emergency (following paragraphs 114, 135 and 137 of the Operational Guidelines, which regulate the protection and management of serial and transnational heritage).

**VI.2.4. Recommendations on the reconstruction project within the World Heritage property**

The issue of reconstruction was not initially included in the terms of reference for the Advisory Mission, however ICOMOS suggests the following recommendations for the State Party:

- To halt all reconstruction works going on at the Talgar World Heritage property since the actual state and pictures of the archaeological site dating from the time of inscription on the World Heritage List and the present situation are radically different. The Mission notes that the multiplication of reconstructed elements is leading to a change of balance between authentic and newly-built structures and to the gradual devaluation of heritage;

- To encourage the State Party to use non-destructive research methods on archaeological monuments, as a basis for reconstruction projects;

- To submit the reconstruction project to the World Heritage Centre for additional review by ICOMOS (in accordance with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines), as the reconstruction project was implemented without any previous consultation with the International bodies (including the Intergovernmental Coordination Committee of the ‘Silk Roads’), and presently requires further special assessment and a detailed review of all documentation relative to the existing procedures established for the World Heritage properties;

- Within the project, to exclude the possibility of a hypothetical reconstruction of lost monuments in the absence of complete and detailed documentation, in accordance with paragraph 86 of the Operational Guidelines, and to refer to the ICOMOS Charter for the protection and management of Archaeological Heritage (1990) calling for extreme
accuracy in the treatment of this type of cultural heritage and searching for a balance with heritage presentation needs.

VI.2.5. Recommendations on residential construction in the buffer zone

The Mission noted active uncontrolled development of private residential buildings in the near vicinity of the World Heritage property, in the buffer zone, which has led to an evident impact on the OUV of the property and thus recommends the State Party:

- To declare moratorium on any further construction in the World Heritage buffer zone violating the established regimes within the national zone for regulated development and, accordingly, the National Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan ‘On the protection and use of objects of historical and cultural heritage’, 1992; and consider removing these new structures;

- To the Ministry of Culture and Sports as the authorized body for implementation of the World Heritage Convention, to take the appropriate measures for the strict regulation of presently uncontrolled process;

- To the Local authorities of Talgar city, to provide a decision ‘on the suspension, as well as the prohibition of construction and other works, creating danger for the monuments of history and culture’ (Article № 18, National Law for protection of cultural heritage, 1992);

- To elaborate as soon as possible the General plan for the entire area to prevent approval of urban development and the construction of individual buildings in the buffer zone, which may impact on the OUV of the World Heritage property. The General plan should aim for the protection of the property’s Integrity, revealing and preserving the historical tracing, visual axis, dominant elements of the original topography, scale, panoramas, silhouette, etc.;

- The elaborated General plan should be submitted to the World Heritage Center and ICOMOS (in accordance with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines), with the application of the ICOMOS Guidance on Heritage Impact Assessments for Cultural World Heritage Properties (2011).
ANNEXES

ANNEX I. Terms of Reference (TORs)

For the Talgar component of the ‘Silk Roads: the routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan) the following issues addressed:

- Gather information on the planning of the proposed route of the Birlik-Almalyk-Ryskulov-Kazstroy-Akbulkak road and on why this proposed project was not mentioned in the nomination dossier or to the ICOMOS mission expert, as it appears to have been planned in 2007;
- Given the great threat this road appears to pose to the contribution of Talgar to the Outstanding Universal Value of the Silk Roads serial property, consider as a matter of urgency alternative routes for the proposed road;
- Review the protection of the property in the context of Talgar as a nationally protected monument and the protection afforded to the buffer zone as set out at the time of inscription: “A buffer zone is classified into three subcategories. First, zone of strict use and control that is up to 50 m from the property boundary in which is only allowed research related activity and conservation and maintenance of ancient structures and monuments. Second, a zone of regulation of development, of 100 m in which there are strict controls on construction activities. Third, a zone of protected landscape a further 100 m outward with measure designed to protect landscape. These restrictions for land use are supported by legal jurisdictions of the various local authorities”;
- Review the management of the property and in particular the governance structures and how the protection of the internationally valued Talgar archaeological site relates to the nationally protected natural areas.
ANNEX II. Programme, Composition of Mission Team and List of participants

Visit Programme
The ICOMOS Advisory Mission for the World Heritage Sites in Kazakhstan
20 – 28 March 2016

- The Talgar component of the serial property ‘Silk Roads: the Routes Network of Chang’an-Tianshan Corridor’ (China, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan);
- The Petroglyphs within the Archaeological Landscape of Tamgaly;
- The Mausoleum of Khoja Ahmed Yasawi, Turkestan

Extract of Advisory Mission Programme, relating to Visit to Talgar on 21st and 23rd of March 2016

20 March 2016, Sunday
16:00 Arrival of the ICOMOS expert Prof. Dr. Natalia Dushkina to the Almaty airport from Moscow (Russia)
16:00 – 17:30 Meeting of the ICOMOS expert in the Almaty airport, transfer to the Hotel 'Kazakhstan'. Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan Zh.S. Moldabergenova
19:00 – 20.30 Dinner with representative of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan Zh.S. Moldabergenova and the Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region, E.B. Zhasabaev

21 March 2016, Monday
08:00 Breakfast, Hotel 'Kazakhstan'
09:00 Departure from the city of Almaty to Talgar settlement (35 km.)
10:30 – 13.00 Visit to Talgar component of the World Heritage serial property. Visual and documentary introduction to the archaeological site, location of the road project and bridge construction. Present: Vice-Minister G.A. Akhmediarov, Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts Zh.S. Moldabergenova, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan; Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region, E.B. Zhasabaev; Head of the Department of Land relations, Almaty Region, Zh. Umarov; Akim of the Talgar district, Almaty Region R.N. Sadykov; Deputy Akim of the Talgar district, Almaty Region, D.A. Kkydrbekuly; Academician, member of the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO and ISESCO, the President of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan K.M. Baibakov; Secretary General of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan D.A. Voyakin; President of ICOMOS Kazakhstan N. Turekulova and others (list of participants, ANNEX III).
13:00 – 14:00 Lunch at Talgar with representatives of the Ministry of Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan and the Akimat of Talgar District; Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region.
14:00 – 15:00 Transfer from Talgar to Almaty
15:00 – 16:30 Meeting and discussion with the representatives of the local and central governmental officials, experts, specialists and other stakeholders on the issue of the Talgar settlement. Presentations on the road project and archaeological World Heritage site. Present: Vice-Minister G.A. Akhmediarov, Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts Zh.S. Moldabergenova, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan; Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region, E.B. Zhasabaev; Head of the Department of Land relations, Almaty Region, Zh. Umarov; Akim of the Talgar district, Almaty Region R.N. Sadykov; Academician, member of the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO and ISESCO, the President of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan...
K.M. Baibakov; Secretary General of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan D.A. Voyakin; President of ICOMOS Kazakhstan N. Turekulova; General Director of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’; Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan, A.Zh. Karymsakov; Advisor to the Director General of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ K.K. Tuyakbaev; Deputy Director General of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ E.E. Tokmagambetov and others (list of participants, ANNEX III).

16:30 – 17:00 Coffee break

17:00 – 19:00 Prolongation of the working session with ICOMOS expert.

Expert’s questions

19:00 – 20:30 Dinner with the representatives of the Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan

22 March 2016 Tuesday

Tamgaly

23 March 2016, Wednesday

08:00 Breakfast, Hotel 'Kazakhstan'

10:00 – 13:00 Expert Meeting with representatives of Management group and other interested professionals and individuals. Joint session on the matters of Talgar and Tamgaly World Heritage sites within the competence of the Advisory Mission. Discussion on additional documentation. Expert’s questions.

Present: Vice-Minister G.A. Akhmediarov, Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts Zh.S. Moldabergenova, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan; Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region, E.B. Zhasabaev; Head of the Department of Land relations, Almaty Region, Zh. Umarov; Secretary General of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan D.A. Voyakin; President of ICOMOS Kazakhstan N. Turekulova; General Director of the ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ State Enterprise A.Zh. Karymsakov; T. Turekulov, architect, ‘Kazrestavratsiya’ State Enterprise; and others.

13:30 – 14:15 Lunch on the way to Talgar.

14:30 – 17:00 Second visit to the Talgar World Heritage archaeological site, organized upon the expert’s request. Additional assessment of the alternative route for the road. Examination of the river Talgar valley and technical equipment, the Buffer zone.

Present: Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan Zh.S. Moldabergenova; Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region E.B. Zhasabaev; Designer of the road S. Ergaliev; Deputy Director of the Museum-Reserve Tamgaly B. Zheleznyakov, some others.

17:00 Departure from Talgar to Almaty

19:10 Departure from the Almaty airport to the city of Shymkent together with Vice-Minister G.A. Akhmediarov, Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts Zh.S. Moldabergenova, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan.

20:35 – 21:00 Arrival to Shymkent airport, transfer to the Hotel 'Shymkent'

Composition of Mission Team

ICOMOS representative: Dr. Natalia Dushkina
Professor at the Moscow Architectural Institute, Professor at the Moscow State University for Geodesy and Cartography; Member of the Scientific-Methodological Council for cultural heritage at the Russian Ministry for Culture.
Member of ICOMOS International Scientific Committees on Theory and philosophy of conservation and restoration, and 20th Century Heritage.

List of Participants

Working sessions on the Talgar World Heritage property
Project for a new road.
Almaty and Talgar, 21.03 and 23.03.2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>№</th>
<th>Name of participants</th>
<th>Occupied position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>G.A. Akhmediarov</td>
<td>Vice-Minister for Culture and Sports of the Republic of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>E.B. Zhasabaev</td>
<td>Head of the Administration for automobile roads of the Akimat, Almaty Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Zh. Umarov</td>
<td>Head of the Department of Land relations, Almaty Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>R.N. Sadykov</td>
<td>Akim of the Talgar district, Almaty Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Zh.S. Moldabergenova</td>
<td>Chief expert of the Department for Culture and Arts, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>A. Oraziman</td>
<td>Representative of the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO and ISESCO, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>D.A. Kydyrbekuly</td>
<td>Deputy Akim of the Talgar district, Almaty Region</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>K.M. Baibakov</td>
<td>Academician, member of the Kazakhstan National Commission for UNESCO and ISESCO, the President of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>A.Zh. Karymsakov</td>
<td>General Director of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>K.K. Tuyakbaev</td>
<td>Advisor to the Director General of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>E.E. Tokmagambetov</td>
<td>Deputy Director General of the State Enterprise ‘Kazrestavratsiya’, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>D.A. Voyakin</td>
<td>Secretary General of the World Heritage Committee of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Zh.E. Smailov</td>
<td>Archaeologist, PhD (Historical Sciences)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>T.N. Toibaev</td>
<td>Deputy Director of the State Historical and Cultural Reserve-Museum ‘Issyk’, Ministry for Culture and Sports of Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>N. Emelina</td>
<td>Architect, Scientific-Research project branch of 'Kazrestavratsiya'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>S. Rakhmetova</td>
<td>Architect, Scientific-Research project branch of 'Kazrestavratsiya'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>N. Turekulova</td>
<td>President of the ICOMOS Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>S. Ergaliev</td>
<td>Designer of the road</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX III. Illustrations (maps, graphic schemes and photographs)

(see PDF file attached)
ANNEX III

ILLUSTRATIONS
(maps, graphic schemes and photographs)
SCHEME 1. “Silk Roads: Initial Section of the Silk Roads, the Routes Network of Tian-shan Corridor”: China Section
SCHEME 2. Map Showing Geographical Distribution and Categories of Nominated Sites of the “Silk Roads: Initial Section of the Silk Roads, the Routes Network of Tian-shan Corridor”
SCHEME 3. “Silk Roads: Initial Section of the Silk Roads, the Routes Network of Tian-shan Corridor”: Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan Section
SCHEME 4. Talgar (S01-KZ) Aerial view. WH nomination dossier, 2012
SCHEME 5. Talgar (S01-KZ) Topographic Map. WH nomination dossier, 2012
1. New bridge over the Talgar river, the WH Buffer zone.
2. New constructions in the WH Buffer zone.
3. Reconstructed Northern Gate and Corner Tower.

SCHEME 6. Talgar (S01-KZ) Aerial view, 2016. Current state of the WH Site and Buffer zone.
SCHEME 8. Plan of the Talgar site with boundaries of the local Zones of protection, approved in 2013. Correspondance to the WH plot and Buffer zone delimitations.
SCHEME 9. Existing system of the road network in Talgar.

SCHEME 10. Fragment of the Master Plan, 2004, for Talgar with roads going through the archaeological site. Protected monument of Republican status since 1974 within the former USSR. National monument of Kazakhstan since 2008.
SCHEME 11. Fragment of the Master Plan, 2004, for Talger with road plan going through the archaeological site.

SCHEME 13. Fragment of the current Cadaster Plan for Talgar with a road plan. Indication of a pasture instead of the WH Site and Buffer zone.
СХЕМА 14. Талгар. Кадастровая карта с выделенными границами участка под хребтовым памятником. Все здания и земельные участки, включая зону номинации WH, не включены в официальную карту кадастр.
SCHEME 15. Talgar aerial view with old and new road network. 0-1 and 2-3 already built parts of a new road Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak. 1-2 under dotted line - part of a new road track crossing the WH Talgar settlement, where bridge built and road construction stopped.
SCHEME 16. The Talgar WH site with road and bridge project crossing the property and the Buffer zone.

SCHEME 17. The Talgar WH site with alternative road suggested by the State Party, however also going through the property. Dotted line in the upper part is another discussed alternative way.
SCHEME 18. Plan of a new road in Talgar through the WH property and Buffer zone (including an alternative option) for archaeologists.

SCHEME 19. Talgar air view showing the disposition of the WH heritage Site, Muslim cemetery and technical objects in the area of alternative road
SCHEME 20. Engineering project of the road through the World Heritage ancient settlement of Talgar.
SCHEME 21. Talgar. Profile of the new road going through the WH site.

SCHEME 22. Sections and plan profile of the road through the World Heritage ancient settlement of Talgar
SCHEME 23. Different options for reconstruction of the Northern Gate and walls of the WH ancient settlement of Talgar, on the basis of analogues.
Описание схемы см. лист АС-18
Данный лист см. с листами АС-17, 18, 20

639/10-1
Реконструкция, измерения и описания объектов археологических и исторических памятников города Талгар, XII-XIV вв. Алатырской области. Первый этап измерений.

Фасад А-Б

Фрагмент 1

Описание схемы см. лист АС-18
Данный лист см. с листами АС-17, 18, 19

639/10-1
Реконструкция, измерения и описания объектов археологических и исторических памятников города Талгар, XII-XIV вв. Алатырской области. Первый этап измерений.

Фасад Б-А

Фрагмент 1

SCHEME 27. Conditional drawing illustrating the trend of changes in the Northern panorama of the Talgar World Heritage Site. From the archaeological site - to the area of presentation with reconstructed gates and towers, and with uncontrolled dominating residential construction in the Buffer zone.
1. The Ak-Bulak Sportive Centre. The final point of the constructed and expended road the Birlik-Almalyk-Kazstroy-Ryskulov-Ak-Bulak. Photo: March 21, 2016
3. Talgar. Installed World Heritage Site sign board, northern boundary of the property. Below: Information board identifying the territory of the ancient settlement equal to 3,89 ha, which is much less the territory of the World Heritage Site. Photo: March 21, 2016
4. Talgar. Recently installed permanent fence partly surrounding the archeological World Heritage property. This demarcation is going along the road and does not strictly correspond to the WH delimitation of the core zone. Photo: March 21, 2016
5. Talgar archaeological site and roads within the World Heritage property. Well treated territory inside the historical walls of the Talgar Citadel (Shahristan), south-east corner. Photo: March 21, 2016
6. View of the Talgar World Heritage property. Archeological site (Rabad) behind the historical delimitation of the Talgar Citadel (Shahristan), south direction. Assumed that the route of a new road will pass through this core area. Photo: March 21, 2016
7. Talgar World Heritage property. The road inside the core zone, north-south direction. View of the recently reconstructed Northern Gate along the WH delimitation. Photo: March 21, 2016
10. Archaeological disclosure of the authentic walls (with partial destruction) of the Talgar ancient settlement along the delimitation of the World Heritage property. Distant view of new a cottage built in the buffer zone.
Photo: March 21, 2016
11. Talgar. View of the World Heritage buffer zone in the west and east directions as seen from the historical northern walls of the Talgar Citadel. New residential construction is going on in the national zone for regulated development. Photo: March 21, 2016
12. View of new construction in the buffer zone of the Talgar World Heritage Site, in near vicinity to the property. The street on above photo has been suggested as one of the alternatives for a new road. Photo: March 21, 2016
13. The potential layout of a new road (with demarcation of its axis) through the territory of the Talgar World Heritage property (historical Rabat) and its buffer zone. Photo: March 21, 2016
16. Territory across the Talgar river valley as an alternative route for a new road. The dam and water intake pipe are located in near vicinity to this track. The WH buffer zone. Photo: March 23, 2016

22. Recently constructed bridge over the Talgar river as part of a new road, the World Heritage Buffer zone. Photo: Boris Zheleznyakov, 23.03.2016.
23. Panoramic view of the Talgar river Valley, the Buffer zone. The World Heritage Talgar property as seen on the background. Photo: Boris Zheleznyakov, 23.03.2016.