



Department for Culture Media & Sport

Heritage Team
4th Floor
100 Parliament Street
London SW1A 2BQ

T: 020 7211 2018
hannah.jones@culture.gov.uk
www.gov.uk/dcms

January 2015

Dear Kishore

Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (C1215)

In accordance with Decision 38 COM 7B.34 of the 38th session of the World Heritage Committee, I am submitting the State of Conservation Report for the Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape. We have used the format stipulated as far as is possible. The text of Decision 38 COM 7B.34 is shown below in italic print to distinguish it from the State Party response which forms the body of the report.

I can confirm that I am content for the report to be posted on the UNESCO World Heritage Centre website.

Yours Sincerely

Hannah Jones
World Heritage Site and Underwater Policy Officer

cc

HE Matthew Sudders, UK Permanent Delegate to UNESCO
UK National Commission for UNESCO
English Heritage



Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland (C1215)

Executive Summary

In accordance with Decision 38 COM 7B.34, the United Kingdom State Party has produced a State of Conservation Report for the Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape World Heritage Site. This State of Conservation Report addresses:

- the recommendations made by the joint ICOMOS/ICCROM Reactive Monitoring Mission of October 2013, in so far as these are not addressed separately in the points below;
- provides updates on the repairs to the property following storm damage during winter 2013/14;
- the assessment and control of large scale development within the UK planning system;
- the current situation in relation to the potential recommencement of mining at South Crofty, and the development of policy guidance on underground remains;
- the heritage impacts of development on the South Quay at Hayle Harbour.

1. Response from the State Party to the World Heritage Committee's Decision 38 COM 7B.34 paragraph by paragraph

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC-14/38.COM/7B;*
2. *Recalling Decisions 36 COM 7B.94 and 37.COM 7B.89, adopted at its 36th (Saint Petersburg, 2012) and 37th (Phnom Penh, 2013) sessions respectively,*
3. *Notes the information provided by the State Party in January 2014;*
4. *Takes note of the recommendations of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICCROM/ICOMOS reactive monitoring mission to the property in October 2013 and requests the State Party to give highest priority to the implementation of its recommendations*

The recommendations of the reactive monitoring mission are dealt with elsewhere in this report, except for recommendations 12 & 13, regarding the proposed development outside the World Heritage Site boundary at Callington Road, Tavistock.

The recommendations made by the reactive monitoring mission were taken into account in the

determination of the planning application, which was granted outline consent by West Devon Borough Council (WDBC) on 26 August 2014, with all matters reserved, except access. No objections were made by local or national statutory heritage agencies. The need to protect the setting of the WHS was recognised, and the views expressed by the mission informed the conditions of the consent and the Section 106 legal agreement relating to public realm works, in which overall design, on-site public art, street furniture, signs etc. are required to incorporate recognition of heritage assets, particularly the World Heritage Site.

The outline planning consent establishes the principle of development. Although the development site is 36 hectares in size, it is accepted that 9/10 hectares of this will not be developed due to topographical constraints and the need to protect sensitive landscape features such as the Tavistock Canal, as an attribute of Outstanding Universal Value. This will also allow retention of existing woodland that currently screens the canal from the development site, and a Tree Preservation Order is currently being prepared to protect all trees on the site. In addition, the application is subject to the Council's policies that require public open spaces to be provided, managed and maintained as part of any new development that takes place.

With all matters reserved except access, the developer will have to submit details concerning such matters as layout and design for approval by the local authority. These approvals will be informed by the developer's Design and Access Statement, which establishes the principles on which all future design decisions for the development will be based:

- preserve, integrate and enhance natural assets;
- work with and not against the natural topography of the site to reflect the best of Tavistock street layout and public realm;
- produce permeable and legible movement framework through the site and by creating safe, efficient and usable non-vehicular links to the town centre and local facilities;
- provide appropriately located and well served public transport links that are centred in the new railway;
- Provide a safe and legible vehicular network that connects key destinations in an efficient but safe hierarchy of streets;
- Locate appropriately a diverse range of public open spaces integrated with the green infrastructure and movement framework;
- the architectural style and appearance should reflect but not mimic the best of Tavistock, drawing inspiration from the WHS whilst remaining of its time;
- Fabric first design principles and incorporation of local energy production

These principles will be used to guide the evolution of the application through the next stages of the planning process, in conjunction with relevant policies in WDBC's Strategic Plan, the WHS Management Plan and the master plan for the site. The commitment from the developer to high quality design, the inclusion in the process of an Independent Design Review, in accordance with the Design Council Commission for Architecture and the Built Environment (DCCABE) good practice, and the fact that WDBC retains control over approval of reserved matters, will ensure

that the Outstanding Universal Value and setting of the World Heritage Site will not be harmed by the development.

- 5. Expresses its concern at the recent flooding at the property caused by severe weather, and also notes the commitment of the State Party to repair resulting damage*

Storm Damage Update Reports are as follows:

World Heritage Site Area: A5iii

Site: Portreath Harbour (Cornwall)

Statutory designations: Listed Grade II

Ownership: Cornwall Council

NGR: SW 65534 45408 (nominal centre)

Issue/damage

Unusually strong winds in combination with spring tides caused significant damage to the historic structures of Portreath Harbour over the Christmas to New Year period, 2014.

Extensive damage was caused to the Eastern Breakwater of the harbour (c.1760 and NGR: SW 65485 45473) where extreme wave action resulted in the removal of eight courses of granite facing blocks and the associated rubble fill within. Additional courses of granite facing and infill were also lost from the parapet walling set back from the end of the breakwater, adjoining the section described above.

Sustained wave action also destroyed the Forward Observation Hut, a small granite built shelter (c.1890s) located at the end of western breakwater (c.1824) on 3rd January, also known locally as the ‘Pepper Pot’, or ‘Monkey House’ (NGR: SW 65430 45583).

Actions

Former Cornwall Council Senior Building Conservation Officer, Karen Pritchard, liaised with Cornwall Council Maritime Manager Andy Brigden to secure repair estimates responding to the ‘like for like’ reinstatement option requested by the World Heritage Site team. Hyder Consulting (UK) Ltd., Exeter, were contracted to work with Cornwall Council to prepare tender documents for the required works.

Following the careful retrieval of the granite facing blocks from the beach around the breakwaters, this was used to reinstate the latter and lime-based mortar was used throughout

for all re-pointing.

The Forward Observation Hut, on the western breakwater, was also carefully restored using detailed photos of the interior and exterior of the hut to inform its accurate reconstruction.

Update: November 2014

The rebuilding of the quays of the Western and Eastern breakwaters damaged in the winter storms has been completed except for approximately six granite blocks which formed part of the 'wave wall', which were displaced and, at the time of writing, have yet to be recovered from the beach. The Forward Observation Hut located at the end of the Western Breakwater has been reinstated using only the original granite blocks.

The total cost of works to date is £262,795.10 which has been covered with a repair grant from the Department for Transport. Re-pointing of the outer face of the Western Breakwater, using conservation approved lime based mortars, is on-going as part of Cornwall Council's harbour maintenance programme.

Images



Top left: the storm damaged Eastern Breakwater and top right, following reconstruction guided by expert conservation advice.

Above left: the remains of the Forward Observation Hut (on the Western Breakwater) and, right, nearing the completion of the reconstruction guided by expert conservation advice.



World Heritage Site Area A10i – Tamar Valley Mining District with Tavistock

Site: Calstock (Cornwall)

Statutory designations: Tamar Valley AONB; Conservation Area

Ownership: Cornwall Council (highway)

NGR: SX 43351 68702

Issue/damage

Exceptional rain fall over a sustained period caused the progressive failure and eventual collapse of a c.10-15 metre section of revetment walling below and adjoining Lower Kelly Road, and adjacent to the Calstock rail viaduct. The collapse, which took place on Christmas Day 2013, is understood to have occurred due to the higher than normal amount of water present within the ground and fill material below the road surface at this point. Due to the subsequent road closure in excess of 20 properties were without vehicular access for a time.

Actions

Cornwall Council co-ordinated surveys of those properties immediately adjacent to the landslip to assess any structural problems that may have occurred and to assess their condition prior to further works. A weekly Calstock residents' information bulletin was also produced to keep

householders affected informed of all developments.

Update: November 2014

The section of revetment walling supporting Lower Kelly Road has now been carefully reinstated and the wall above rebuilt, following the structural shoring of the support fill below the road level. The works are now complete and the road open for public use.

World Heritage Site Area A10i – Tamar Valley Mining District with Tavistock

Site: Morwellham and New Quay (west Devon)

Statutory designations: Morwellham - Scheduled Monument, Conservation Area; New Quay - Listed Grade II

Ownership: Private

NGR: Morwellham - SX 44592 69707 (nominal centre) and New Quay - SX 45432 69531 (nominal centre)

Issue/damage

The high tides of late December and early January caused a degree of flooding on two occasions at Morwellham with river water entering properties adjoining the former ore quays. The resulting impacts are understood to have been largely superficial and no structural damage was caused.

Flooding is a not infrequent occurrence at Morwellham with serious inundations being recorded as early as 1800. In 1979 flood levels were recorded on site in excess of 2 metres above the current road, and level with the top of the door to the Harbour Master's Cottage; flooding also took place in December 2012. Flooding is also understood to have taken place at the nearby historic and abandoned ore quay at New Quay (600 metres downstream from Morwellham) during the winter high tides but no damage was sustained.

Update: November 2014

The private owners of Morwellham instigated clean up actions once the river had returned to its usual level and no significant damage was sustained.

6. Encourages the State Party, Cornish Mining World Heritage Site Partnership Board, the Cornish Mining World Heritage Site Management Office, and the three local councils that constitute the main agencies in the management system of the serial property to develop

the necessary assessment and control mechanisms for large-scale development proposals.

Further to our State of Conservation report from January 2014, we can update the Committee that the planning policy framework at national, regional and local levels, in so far as it affects the Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape World Heritage Site and its setting, has been amended in the following ways.

Circular 07/09: Protection of World Heritage Sites has been archived and since March 2014 has been superseded by the National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG). This provides additional support to the interpretation of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), and includes specific reference to the management of World Heritage Sites and the consideration of development proposals that may impact upon their Outstanding Universal Value and setting. Although archived there is much in Circular 07/2009 and in the supporting guidance produced by English Heritage that remains valid and accessible.

To supplement the guidance in the NPPG, English Heritage in conjunction with the national Historic Environment Forum, has also developed draft good practice advice for the Historic Environment. This includes additional guidance on World Heritage Site's in relation to the historic environment in local plans and the setting of heritage assets. This will update the guidance previously contained in the English Heritage PPS5 Practice Guide, Circular 07/2009 and the supporting guidance note produced by English Heritage, and it is expected that it will be adopted in early 2015. While this guidance is designed to relate to the whole historic environment and not solely World Heritage Site's, it provides additional advice on the setting issues identified by the World Heritage Committee and maintains the State Party's commitment to protect World Heritage properties and their setting.

The partner local authorities in Cornwall and Devon have included policies within their Local and other statutory Plans, which require protection of OUV and its setting and which support the detailed policies in the Cornish Mining World Heritage Site Management Plan. These reinforce UK National Planning Policy Framework statements and add local context to guide the preparation of Heritage Impact Assessments and assist in the consideration and determination of development within the World Heritage Site.

The UK planning system already sets out a number of Statutory Consultees, including English Heritage, that local planning authorities are duty bound to consult on relevant planning applications. The Appendices to the Cornish Mining World Heritage Site Management Plan (2013–2018) (http://www.cornish-mining.org.uk/sites/default/files/Cornwall_and_West_Devon_Mining_Landscape_World_Heritage_Site_Management_Plan_2013-2018_Appendices.pdf) outline the planning application scrutiny and advice process undertaken by the partner local authorities, operating in accordance with UK planning statutes and guidelines.

Planning and Historic Environment Officers from all three local planning authorities and English Heritage also sit on the World Heritage Site Technical Panel to help develop and ensure

consistent policy guidance and receive input from other technical advisors and the WHS Management Office.

To ensure sufficient suitably qualified capacity to give accurate guidance on WHS policy to Local Planning Authorities, the Cornish Mining World Heritage Site Partnership Board (hereafter the Partnership Board) currently invests 25% of its annual revenue budget in Historic Environment Advisory Services. Whilst it considers the system described above as “fit for purpose” in achieving the necessary assessment and control for large scale development within the WHS, arising from the mission report, the Partnership Board has committed additional funding, provided by its local authority partners, to the research and drafting of a Supplementary Planning Document (SPD), which will support these existing arrangements by:

- expanding the description of the attributes of OUV summarised in the Management Plan (2013-18)
- describing the approach for assessing development affecting OUV and establishing when and where Heritage Impact Assessments will be required
- establishing criteria to be applied in determining planning applications for development within the setting of the World Heritage Site
- establishing protocols for early and effective consultation between Local Planning Authorities and English Heritage
- guiding decisions on planning appeals and enforcement

7. Further notes that mining at South Crofty will most likely not proceed for some time and calls on the State Party to request a design revision for the ensemble of buildings, based on a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), in conformity with the ICOMOS Guidelines on HIA's for World Heritage cultural properties, and taking into account the attributes of Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), with particular consideration of the views to, and relationship between, them

The local planning authority has discussed the details of the mission’s recommendations with the applicant and they are, in the main, amenable to considering changes to their proposals providing those changes do not result in extensive redesigns that require a new planning application. The Local Planning Authority is willing to work with the applicant to achieve this and will work alongside national and local heritage agencies to achieve acceptable design solutions to the matters that have been raised.

The existing plans were informed by an Environmental Impact Assessment that incorporated an analysis of impacts on OUV. This work pre-dated the introduction of the ICOMOS HIA methodology. Should the developer come forward with design revisions, the local planning authority will recommend that HIA is undertaken and advise the applicant on scoping and preparing it. In this event the various archaeological reports that are available for this area would be reviewed and, if necessary, updated in order to inform the HIA.

The SPD referred to above will also provide some further planning guidance on significant underground heritage, in line with the mission report suggestions, as far as may be practicable. It should however be noted that there will be legal and practical constraints on the extent to which management prescriptions can be applied to underground heritage. Nevertheless the Partnership Board commissioned an audit of significant accessible underground features within the WHS, which will be used to inform the SPD.

8. Strongly regrets that the State Party did not comply with the request made in Decisions 36 COM 7B.94 and 37 COM 7B.89 to halt the supermarket development project at Hayle Harbour, and calls on the State Party to find more appropriate, heritage –led regeneration options for any future development at Hayle Harbour, which may be proposed in future.

The long standing disuse and disrepair of the South Quay was agreed by all interested parties as unsatisfactory. There was support from all stakeholders, including the 2013 Reactive Monitoring Mission, for the principle of some form of heritage-led mixed use developments on the Hayle Quays and no objection in principle to a supermarket. There was not however consensus on how best this objective should be delivered.

The Partnership Board believes that during the planning process for the supermarket, Cornwall Council's engagement, consultation and design revision has resulted in a final scheme that addressed a number of the concerns voiced by the heritage agencies, including those made in previous World Heritage Committee sessions, regarding the scale of the supermarket structure. As a result the final structure is less than half the size of the original proposed supermarket and the Partnership Board believes that it displays a bespoke design that references the local history of copper production in its surface materials.

Since the construction of the supermarket the State Party has reviewed carefully the issue of whether the OUV of the property has been harmed. In reaching its conclusions the State Party notes the point made by the mission in its 2013 report, that the mission's recommendations were made at a time "when it might be problematic to incorporate changes". This was indeed the case as the planning decision on the supermarket had already been taken at that time and the extent of change advised by the mission was such that a new application would have been required to bring this about. As the developer was fully entitled to proceed with the scheme for which approval had been granted there was no opportunity to secure changes to the design of the scheme.

In assessing whether the supermarket has caused harm to the OUV of the World Heritage property the State Party has taken a number of considerations into account as described below. The attributes of OUV are described in outline in the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value and in more detail in the Management Plan 2013-2018 and its appendices. The attributes most relevant to Hayle are *Mine Transport Infrastructure* and *Ancillary Industries*. The former refer to amongst other things "ports, harbours, wharfs and quays", while the latter includes "foundries and engineering works, smelting works..." The principal physical structures of quay and sluice systems are the most significant attributes in relation to South Quay; there are very few physical

historic structures on the quay as a result of degradation by twentieth century ship-breaking activity and demolition long before the inscription of the property. The principal attributes of OUV have not therefore been physically harmed by the supermarket development.

Harvey's Foundry lies on the other side of the railway viaduct from the South Quay. Although intimately linked functionally, the views between Foundry Square and South Quay at the time of operation were limited by harbour structures on the quay and also the original Hayle Railway Terminus – all lost prior to the Site's inscription on the World Heritage List. The limited historically visible links between Foundry Square and the Quay have not been harmed by the construction of the supermarket.

However, the State Party acknowledges that the construction of a substantial monolithic building, with copper cladding and an angular overhanging roof at the entrance on the town side, diminishes the ability to understand and appreciate the attributes of the quay as an important component part of OUV. The scale and nature of the design also conflicts with the distinctive historic character and appearance of Hayle. Although it is still possible to appreciate the form and function of the quay from viewpoints such as the North Quay, it is more difficult to do so from within the redeveloped part of the quay itself. On this basis the State Party accepts that, regrettably, the construction of the supermarket has caused some harm to the OUV that this component part of the World Heritage property contributes to the whole.

This harm is offset to some extent by the fact that the harbour walls, and the Carnsew Pool and sluice system have been repaired and that this is not only beneficial for the structures themselves but also has wider value as it keeps the Carnsew Channel and the Harbour Approach Channel – vital parts of the legibility of this component of the World Heritage property - open to navigation. The interpretation panels that will be introduced on the quay, as part of the supermarket scheme, will explain the history and development of the site and will assist in promoting understanding of the World Heritage property.

The State Party has noted the mission's conclusion that the beneficial conservation work should not be linked to the supermarket development on the basis that funding for these works could have been provided from other sources. However the State Party is very clear that the £4m expended on the repair work could not have been raised from elsewhere in the current or foreseeable financial climate.

The State Party also notes the mission's view that the issues related to keeping the Port of Hayle open to navigation should be kept separate from the question of whether the development scheme does or does not impact negatively on the OUV of the property. The State Party does not believe that this link should be broken. In the absence of funding from elsewhere we believe it is necessary for the benefits and dis-benefits of the scheme as a whole, including the repair works to historic structures and the maintenance of navigation channels, to be considered. We note that this balancing of benefits and dis-benefits is a part of the ICOMOS HIA methodology. Such a consideration also needs to take account of the economic viability assessment provided with the

2013 State of Conservation Report as this suggests that other less harmful forms of development favoured by English Heritage and the mission could have been difficult to achieve.

While the State Party would have wished to see a scheme which caused less harm to the historic environment, it believes that, now the supermarket is built, a judgement needs to be made on the level of harm to OUV that has been caused and the extent to which this harm is offset by the benefits of the development. The conclusion of the State Party is that, while there has been some harm to the OUV of the World Heritage property, this is at least partially offset by the positive benefits that have been derived from the scheme. Lessons have been learned at both local and national level from the issues that have arisen from the development of the supermarket in Hayle. These will be applied in future through enhanced processes for identifying major development that could impact on OUV and ensuring that the procedure set out in paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines* is followed rigorously, thus ensuring that the risk of harm to the OUV of the World Heritage property in future is reduced.

9. Requests the State party to invite a joint ICOMOS/ICCROM reactive monitoring mission to evaluate the extent of impacts resulting from the implementation of the supermarket project at Hayle Harbour on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and to address potential courses of action to address and/or mitigate these impacts

The State Party has invited a mission which is scheduled to take place from 26 – 30 January 2015.

10. Further requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 February 2015, an updated report, including a 1 page executive summary, on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above for examination by the World Heritage Committee in its 39th session in 2015

This report represents the State Party's updated report.

2. Other Current conservation issues identified by the State Party

The overall condition of the World Heritage property remains very good. Survey work commissioned by the Partnership Board has identified that approximately 18% of the heritage assets within the property would benefit from some form of, often limited, remedial work and a programme of work to address this is being developed. Survey work of underground mining features has also been commissioned to inform future management.

3. In conformity with paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines* please describe any major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) envisaged within the protected area and its buffer zone and/or corridors

The proposed footbridge in Hayle between South Quay and Penpol Terrace that received outline consent as part of the supermarket application has been registered as a full planning application - PA14/04724 - and is currently (January 2015) subject to public and agency consultation. Details can be viewed on-line. The application is accompanied by an HIA and Environmental Statement. English Heritage has been consulted and did not object. The application will probably be decided in January 2015

Detailed proposals for the housing and retail elements on South Quay which have received outline planning consent are in the process of being worked up. A full planning application will be submitted in due course.

Developers are currently devising an application for retail on the former Harvey's Foundry car park opposite South Quay, which is expected to be submitted shortly.

Information about the latter two developments and time for their consideration is being built into the programme for the reactive monitoring mission scheduled for 26-30 January 2015.