

Distribution limited

WHC-98/CONF.201/INF.10

Paris, 8 June 1998

Original: English/French

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL,
SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANISATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE
WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

BUREAU OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

**Twenty-second session
UNESCO Headquarters, Paris, Room X (Fontenoy)**

22-27 June 1998

**Executive Summary of the Meeting on Conservation of Immovable
Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa (Aidjan, 23-25 March
1998)**

AFRICA 2009

Conservation of Immovable Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa

WHC-UNESCO - ICCROM - CRATerre-EAG
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire

Abidjan, 23-25 March 1998

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF THE MEETING

1. Introduction

From 23 to 25 March 1997, a meeting was held in Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire to launch AFRICA 2009, a new initiative aimed at improving conditions for the conservation of immovable cultural heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa through its better integration into a sustainable development process. The elaboration of this new programme was a joint effort of ICCROM, the World Heritage Centre of UNESCO; two intergovernmental organizations and CRATerre-EAG, an Non governmental organization with close links with the School of architecture of Grenoble. The meeting was hosted by the Ministry of Culture of Côte d'Ivoire with assistance from the French Mission for Cooperation and Cultural Action in Abidjan. Local logistical support was provided by the UNESCO office in Abidjan. The meeting was attended by cultural heritage professionals from 9 African countries from across the continent, as well as representatives from a number of national and international institutions and development agencies. A list of the participants of the meeting can be found in **Annex 1** of this document.

The purpose of the meeting was to provide a forum for the African participants to present and discuss training needs for conservation of immovable cultural heritage in their own countries, to introduce the framework of the AFRICA 2009 programme, and to get input from the participants as to necessary modifications to the basic structure. In addition, the meeting was seen as a means of providing for the future direction of the programme, both through the comments of those present, and through the selection of a coordination committee to further develop the programme based on an outline agreed to at the meeting.

The agenda of the meeting, as agreed to by the meeting participants can be found in **Annex 2** of this document. The first day of the meeting was chaired by a representative of the Côte d'Ivoire. The second day of the meeting was chaired by George Abungu, Director of Regional Museums, Sites, and Monuments for the National Museums of Kenya.

2. Opening Session

In his address, Mr. Gael de Guichen, Assistant to the Director-General of ICCROM sent greetings to those assembled from Mr. Marc Laenen, Director-General of ICCROM, who could not attend the meeting due to illness. Mr. de Guichen spoke of the longstanding commitment that ICCROM has in the area of conservation of cultural heritage in Africa. In particular, he referred to the PREMA programme, which for 10 years has been working with museums across the continent on preventative conservation of museum collections. He pointed out that the new programme being discussed at this meeting was a logical next step for ICCROM in expanding its activities in Africa, in cooperation with the World Heritage Centre, to work with immovable cultural heritage. Mr. de Guichen added that in looking at immovable cultural heritage, there is a need to widen the scope of inquiry to place conservation within the larger context of sustainable development. He indicated that this should include not only conservation of the physical fabric, but also attention to the social, economic, and environmental needs of communities. He stated that we must think of conservation as a means of improving the well-being of peoples rather than just as a way of preserving architectural structures. Finally, he expressed the hope that ICCROM, through the new programme, would continue to build strong working relationships with institutions and individuals across the continent toward the shared goal of protecting Africa's cultural heritage.

In her address, Madame Lucette de Andrade-Diawara, Chef de Bureau, UNESCO Abidjan, on behalf of the Director-General of UNESCO, presented the World Heritage Convention and its implications for cultural heritage in Africa. She stated that at present, 30 African states are signatories to the convention and 44 sites are inscribed on the World Heritage List (17 cultural and 27 natural sites). She indicated that the World Heritage Committee was concerned about the under-representation of African sites on the List, and stated that the AFRICA 2009 programme was one of the steps that the Committee, along with ICCROM and CRATerre-EAG, was taking to redress this imbalance. She explained that the programme was developed as a result of a survey questionnaire that had been sent to 44 African cultural heritage institutions. The questionnaires, which had a response rate of over 60%, led to the creation of a "Training Strategy for the Conservation of Immoveable Cultural Property in Sub-Saharan Africa", which was presented at an expert meeting at ICCROM in September of 1996, and approved by the World Heritage Committee at its XXth session in December of that year. The AFRICA 2009 programme can be seen as a further development of this strategy. She said that the World Heritage Committee had funded this meeting in Abidjan, with the purpose of bringing together African professionals who had participated in the survey and who had been involved in some of the pilot "site projects" carried out over the past several years. It was felt that this group would be well placed to help launch this ambitious project, and give direction to it. She also expressed the hope that the meeting would serve to bring out the most important issues being faced for the preservation of an African identity and for the transmission of these values to future generations. The World Heritage Committee was represented during the meeting by Ms. Galia Saouma-Forero, Senior Programme Specialist for Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa, who initiated the cooperation for the programme between ICCROM, CRATerre-EAG, and the network of African

specialists who have been involved in improving the representivity of African heritage on the World Heritage List, and the implementation of *in-situ* training projects funded by the World Heritage Committee and its bureau, and who is responsible for the programme at the World Heritage Centre.

Following the speech of Madame de Andrade-Diawara, the meeting was officially opened with the Welcome Address by his excellency, Professor Bernard Zadi Zaourou, Minister of Culture of Côte d'Ivoire. Prof. Zadi Zaourou explained that, although encompassing a variety of traditions and ways of life, we must use our collective cultural heritage, with its commonality of values, as a means of building more harmonious societies. He stated that the cultural heritage must become a key element of consideration, to be conserved and integrated into the national consciousness. The state has the function of making and enforcing the rules and norms for protection and conservation, a role which should not be delegated to others. It must develop a framework, containing various kinds of concrete measures which can be applied equally both to publicly and privately owned heritage. Another problem he noted was the lack of technical expertise. In particular, he mentioned projects for the conservation of Grand-Bassam and for a group of mosques located in the northern regions of the country. He stated that there was a need for better technical know-how in relation to these projects. Finally, he expressed the hope that Côte d'Ivoire would continue to play an important role in the development of the AFRICA 2009 programme, and offered to host other activities for the initiative as needed.

3. Presentation by meeting participants of past interventions and training needs in their countries

It is beyond the scope of this executive summary to discuss each of the presentations made by the meeting participants in regard to the situation in their particular countries. The contents of those presentations can be found in the papers, prepared by the participants, in the document titled, *Participant Papers*, which was distributed at the meeting. (Additional copies are available on request from ICCROM.) Instead, this section will try to develop a brief synthesis of the major, common themes that were presented by participants during their presentations.

The presentations demonstrated the wide variety of immovable cultural heritage which represent only a portion of the total found in Sub-Saharan Africa. Presentations were made in regard to historic town and cities such as Mombasa and Lamu in Kenya, Zanzibar and Bagamoyo in Tanzania, and Grand-Bassam located in Côte d'Ivoire; archaeological sites in Kenya and Ethiopia as well as the Great Zimbabwe site; groups of buildings and monuments such as the Royal Palaces in Abomey, the mosques of Timbuktu, the forts, traditional and religious buildings of Ghana, and the rock hewn churches of Ethiopia; and finally, the rock art sites of Zimbabwe. The physical materials that make up the various elements of these sites ranges from earth, wood, straw, and metal to coral stone and lime construction, dry stone construction, and colour applied directly to rock surfaces.

Within the participant presentations, a number of key considerations were brought out. These issues can be grouped into four main categories: policy, management, technical know-how, and training. Some of the more prominent subjects are listed below.

Policy

Within the policy area, the need was expressed to:

- take into account social, demographic, economic, environmental, and development components when planning for conservation of immovable cultural heritage;
- create and implement better administrative and legal frameworks for conservation and development;
- better understand and communicate the economic (and other) values of conservation when faced with strong economic pressures;
- increase cooperation and links with local and national governments and other development organisations not directly involved in conservation, and improve coordination among all actors involved;
- better explore the relationships between public and private ownership of heritage resources;
- explore areas of commonality within the region in order to develop possible models and guidelines for action, while at the same time being careful to tailor solutions to individual situations.

Management

Within the management area, the need was expressed for:

- development of more comprehensive and integrated planning and management instruments for sites and also to link them to their surrounding environments;
- better management and planning for “sustainable” tourism (including better visitor management);
- improvement of management tools such as inventories and other forms of heritage documentation and recording;
- creation of new management tools (such as revolving funds) to promote conservation;
- creation, management, and implementation of maintenance schedules.

Technical know-how

In the area of technical requirements, the following needs were expressed:

- better understanding of particular materials and construction systems;
- better understanding of the mechanisms of decay and means of repair and maintenance;
- better understanding of previous interventions and how to ameliorate conditions when mistakes have been made in the past;

- searching and testing a variety of materials to find the most cost-effective methods that are consistent with conservation ethics.

Training

Within the area of training, a desire was expressed for better training opportunities for:

- traditional artisans and other building technicians;
- conservation professionals (architects, planners, archaeologists);
- site managers;
- politicians and other decision-makers (from both the national and local levels);
- members of the public.

One important area of discussion centred on the issue of community involvement. Many of the presentations spoke about the need to involve local communities (taking into account their traditional structures) in all phases of the planning and execution of conservation works. In places (such as Mali) where the community continues to play an important role in upkeep and maintenance, this role should be supported. In places (such as Ghana) where the cultural heritage authorities have taken over that role, there is a need to re-involve people directly in the care and management of their heritage. There is also a need to hold discussions with local groups to talk about the importance of heritage and to place it in the context of competing needs for modernisation, education, and economic growth. Finally, efforts should be made to ensure that members of local populations do not develop a “dependency” on grants and aid for the maintenance and upkeep of their properties. Instead, they should see these activities as part of their regular everyday routines.

Other interesting questions were also raised during the presentations, such as the relationship of colonial architecture heritage to the present modern nations of Africa, and the issue of intangible (non-physical) heritage and its relation to the immovable heritage.

Finally, the presentations also discussed some conservation programmes that had been developed and carried out to date, including both local efforts and partnerships with international organizations such as UNESCO, UNDP, the European Community, and ICCROM; development agencies such as NORAD and SIDA; and institutions such as CRATerre-EAG, the Aga Khan Trust for Culture, and various training centres in Africa.

4. Presentation of the results of the survey on “the state of cultural heritage and training needs in Sub-Saharan Africa”

A presentation of the survey on “the state of cultural heritage and training needs in Sub-Saharan Africa” was made by Thierry Joffroy of CRATerre-EAG. A full summary of the results of the survey can be found in the document, *Training Strategy for Immovable Cultural Heritage in Africa South of the Sahara*, distributed at the meeting. (Additional copies are available on request from ICCROM).

5. Presentation of the AFRICA 2009 Programme

The draft AFRICA 2009 programme was presented by Joseph King of ICCROM and Thierry Joffroy of CRATerre-EAG. The full text of the draft programme, entitled, *AFRICA 2009 Programme Document*, was distributed to the meeting. (Additional copies are available on request from ICCROM.) It was explained that the programme is a joint effort of ICCROM, the World Heritage Centre of UNESCO, and CRATerre-EAG, and was based on a questionnaire that was distributed and analysed in 1996.

The aim of the programme is to improve the conditions for the conservation of immovable cultural heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa through better integrating it into a sustainable development process. “Immovable cultural heritage” is defined as buildings, monuments, groups of buildings, archaeological or other sites, human settlements, towns, and cultural landscapes. “Sustainable development” is defined as a development process which takes into account the social, cultural, economic, and environmental needs of an area and its community.

The objectives of the programme can be divided into three main areas. The first is *to better integrate conservation of immovable cultural heritage into the larger context of development in Africa*. The intent of this objective is to work with African professionals to create a cultural environment within the development process that is tailored to their specific cultural context. This objective will be achieved through research, discussion, and dissemination of information on topics linking these two important areas and through strengthening awareness of these links for politicians, decision-makers, and the public at large. In addition, the programme will work with the relevant national and local officials to update the legal, policy, and administrative frameworks in which development and conservation take place.

The second area is *to increase the capacity of a broad spectrum of actors involved in conservation of immovable cultural heritage*. This objective is aimed at decision makers, heritage resource managers, professionals such as architects, planners, and archaeologists, and the craftsmen and building technicians who work at immovable cultural heritage sites. This objective will be accomplished through a variety of training activities including courses, seminars, and hands-on training at the regional, national, and site levels. One of the measures of success for this objective will be the creation of ongoing opportunities for African professionals to be trained on the continent by other African professionals.

The third area is *to create a network of communication which will enable rapid exchange of information among professionals in Africa*. This objective is aimed at reducing the isolation in which many professionals work on the continent and to ensure that research, know-how, and “best practices” are disseminated to increase knowledge and reduce waste and overlapping of resources.

The structure of the programme is designed as an integrated approach to meeting the objectives outline above, by taking advantage of activities at two levels. At the regional level, the *projet cadre* (framework project) is being developed as an overall framework for the programme. This framework can be seen as a means of carrying

out a variety of regional actions in the areas of training and the gathering and exchange of information, giving an orientation for the *projet situés*, and providing an administrative setting for overall programme execution and evaluation. At the national level, *projet situés* (site projects) will be developed to provide local capacity building in the context of carrying out conservation planning and work at specific sites of all types. Activities at both levels, the *projet cadre* and the *projet situés*, will work together to deliver a comprehensive strategy for meeting the aims and objectives of the AFRICA 2009 programme. All of these activities will be carried out in coordination with appropriate regional organisations and institutions.

The *projet cadre* is designed to have a number of components which together will serve to accomplish the described objectives. A **training course**, held on an annual basis and alternating between English and French, will be carried out, aimed at target groups including decision makers and professionals. The first two, scheduled for 1999 and 2000 would be intended for department heads responsible for conservation of immovable cultural heritage within their Ministries of Culture. These courses would be used to sensitise these important officials to important concepts and issues related to conservation and its relationship to a sustainable development process. The course is envisioned to last three months, and topics could cover a broad range of issues related to conservation and development. Courses after 2000 would target relevant professionals involved in the conservation of various types of immovable cultural heritage.

A continuing series of **research projects** would be carried out under the umbrella of the *projet cadre* in order to gather and analyse new information and to develop new lines of thinking about important issues. These projects could be directly related to a particular type of immovable cultural heritage or they could cover subjects that are broader in scope (for example, studies on designing legal frameworks to meet the needs of conservation and development, or sustainable tourism and site management). These studies would not only describe existing situations, but would also suggest means of formulating solutions to existing problems.

Regional seminars on specific topics would be held once per year at various venues. These meetings would serve as a forum for discussing common concerns and problems as well as a means for disseminating useful information in relation to the given topic. Partner institutions in the region would have to be identified for the coordination of these meetings.

A **communication programme** will be developed to ensure rapid exchange of information between local institutions involved in the programme. Initially this would take the form of a newsletter with articles detailing information related to the *projet situés* and regional activities. Efforts would also be made to ensure that each local institution has the necessary equipment and connections for taking advantage of email and the World Wide Web. Once this is accomplished, a web page and an email discussion group could be initiated to allow for efficient communications. Publication of research results, both on the Web and in book form, is also envisioned as a means of disseminating information gathered during the course of the programme to a wider audience.

A **co-ordination committee** is another important component of the programme. It will consist of four professionals from Africa and members (one each) of each of the three international organisations. The role of the co-ordination committee will be to oversee the progress of the programme including the review of proposals for individual projects, evaluation of the implementation of the *projet cadre* and the *projet situés*, and the development of themes and resource people for the various seminars, courses, and research held within the framework. The co-ordination committee tentatively would be scheduled to meet once per year in an Africa.

The aim of the *projet situés* is to improve conditions for conservation at specific sites in the region. *Projet situés* are foreseen as individual activities held at the national or local level. Their purpose is to build local capacity and awareness while working on actual conservation projects. They are designed to meet training needs, rationalise working methods, adapt these methods to the realities on the ground, and respond to the need for rapid intervention on some sites. Their operational methodology is to stabilise the existing situation, deepen knowledge of the current conditions and needs, and develop a programme for conservation and maintenance including a training of local professionals, building technicians, and the general public. *Projet situés* can be carried out on various types of immovable heritage including monuments or buildings, archaeological sites, urban areas, etc... The exact content of the *projet situés* would vary according to the type of heritage and particular needs of the site. A preliminary group of *projet situés*, has already been carried out at sites in Mali, Benin, Ghana, and Gambia. A second group has already been funded for sites in Ghana, Uganda, Zimbabwe, and Ethiopia.

The expected financial resources that will be necessary to carry out all of the actions of the *projet cadre* are estimated to be approximately US\$ 1,000,000 over the first three years of the project (the pilot phase). *Projet situés* will need to be funded on an individual basis. To date, the three partner organizations, WHC-UNESCO, CRATerre-EAG, and ICCROM, have already invested over US\$ 500,000 in the preliminary group of *projet situés* and on the development of the overall programme.

6. Discussion of the programme by meeting participants

Participants of the meeting were invited to discuss various components of the AFRICA 2009 programme outlined above. To facilitate this action, three groups were created, one English speaking and two French speaking. In order to create a better focus for the discussion, it was divided into two parts. In the first, participants were asked to review the aims and objectives of the project as a whole, and in the second, they were asked to focus on particular aspects of the training course.

In regard to the first part of the discussion, each of the groups were generally in agreement with the aims and scope of the AFRICA 2009 programme. Taking as a departure point, the participant presentations that had been given earlier in the meeting, it was agreed that the programme, as designed, reflected the most important concerns that had been expressed. There were some suggestions for fine-tuning the document, however. It was pointed out, for example that it would be a useful exercise to group and prioritise the lists of “General Objectives” and “Measurable Objectives”

found in the programme document. This would allow for a clearer picture of the programme and also allow for easier monitoring of the programme as it proceeds.

Several participants also felt that the definition of “immovable cultural heritage” should be amended to include:

- rock art sites (which are found throughout the southern portion of the continent);
- mixed sites (which would include sites with more than one of the already listed characteristic).

There was also a question as to whether “human settlements” was the correct word to use in within the context of this programme, but it was explained that an attempt was made to use the common language found in UNESCO World Heritage Convention.

There were also several suggestions for additions to the programme objectives including:

- integrate existing projects, actors (individuals and institutions) into the framework of the programme;
- attempt to involve youth more fully in the conservation process (It was pointed out that youth are a very important resource in Africa. As they will be responsible for care of the heritage in the future, it is important to bring them into the process now so that there will be a continuity of actions.);
- develop programmes for monitoring and surveillance of heritage to ensure its continued maintenance;
- strengthen community involvement in the conservation process.

In regard to the second part of the discussion, participants were asked discuss the following aspects of the potential first training course to be held in 1999 and 2000:

- length (3 months had been the suggested time period);
- language (French/English in alternating years or one course with simultaneous translation);
- target audience;
- a short list of possible course topics.

Group 1 (English)

Length: 3 months

Language: French/English in alternating years

Target Audience: Decision makers on both the national and regional level

Topics:

- site management
- tourism management and control (to include site presentation, development of tourism programmes, and the economic aspects of tourism)
- human resource management
- legal frameworks
- administrative structures

Group 2 (French)

Length: Varies according to target audience (see below)

Language: French/English in alternating years

Target Audience:

- managers of immovable heritage and professionals (3 – 4 weeks)
- managers of site projects (6 – 8 weeks)
- artisans (3 – 4 weeks)

Topics:

- identification of immovable heritage
- study of conservation and restoration
- institutional frameworks within which conservation takes place
- developing a basis for project evaluation
- training of trainers

Group 3 (French)

Length: 3 months

Language: French/English in alternating years

Target Audience:

- managers of patrimony
- architects (working with the Ministries of Culture)
- the cultural press (highlighting the importance of awareness)
- site project managers

Topics:

- theoretical concepts and knowledge of immovable heritage
- elements of archaeology
- issues in restoration and conservation
- issue in management

During the course of the general discussion that followed, the representatives of ICCROM, the World Heritage Centre, and CRATerre-EAG expressed their thanks to the participants for their valuable input. They pointed out that many of the issues raised by the participants had been ones that had been discussed during the formulation of the programme. For example, they pointed out that most of the target audiences identified by the groups would be accommodated within the various activities of the programme. They also promised that the final draft of the programme document (which would be discussed by the coordination committee) would reflect the comments raised during the meeting.

Discussion was also held on the estimated budget needs for the programme. It was explained that, at present, the project has only been funded with seed money to allow for the needs assessment and programme development. There will be a strong need in the coming months to explore partnerships with possible funding organisations. Meeting participants were encouraged to think about possible sources of funding both for *projet cadre* activities and for individual *projet situé*. In regard to the estimations for each activity, it was explained that the figures would vary, based on final decisions as to the location of the activity, the length of time, and the number of people involved. But, it was explained that the figures presented were estimates were based

on ICCROM's long experience in carry out these types of activities in Africa. As specific parameters are developed for each activity, more detailed budget estimates will be able to be created.

7. Follow-up actions

Within the section on follow-up actions, there were two issues which needed to be discussed. The first regarded the make-up of the coordination committee. After some discussion, it was decided that it would be best to have two English and two French speakers on the committee. It was decided that the African participants would designate their representatives by meeting in separate groups (English and French) and making their choice by consensus. The representatives who were chosen are:

- George Abungu, Kenya
- I.N. Debrah, Ghana
- Irie Bi Balo, Côte d'Ivoire
- Ali Ould Sidi, Mali

The first meeting of the coordination committee was set for 26 March 1998 in Abidjan as a follow-up to this meeting. The minutes of this meeting are contained in **Annex 3** of this document.

The second issue to be taken up was the drafting of a resolution stating support for the AFRICA 2009 programme. A draft of the resolution was discussed and amendments made. A final draft was then agreed to by all parties to the meeting. The final resolution can be found in **Annex 4** of this document.

8. Other issues arising

Within this agenda item, the representatives of the organisations who had been invited to attend the meeting were asked to make comments. Those who addressed the meeting included:

- Nicole F. Adam, Attaché d'administration centrale, Chargée du patrimoine et des archives, Secrétariat d'Etat à la Coopération et à la Francophonie;
- Reidun Veia, Head of Section for Development Technology Department, Norwegian Directorate for Cultural Heritage;
- Per Knutsson, Regional Officer for Culture and Media, Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA);
- Kouadio N'Da N'Guessan, Directeur Général, Ecole Africaine des Métiers de l'Architecture et de l'Urbanisme, Lomé, Togo ;
- Synnove Vinsrygg, Senior International Advisor, Norwegian Directorate for Cultural Heritage.

In general, the representatives expressed their interest in the discussions that had taken place over the previous two days, and all expressed their commitment to the aims of conservation of immovable cultural heritage within a framework of sustainable development. One issue that was raised was the need to ensure that

adequate coordination and networking exists among the many groups involved in conservation of immovable heritage in Africa. Per Knutsson pointed out that it was important that the focus not just be on individual projects, but also on the development of the sector as a whole. Synnove Vinsrygg added, that in addition to coordination, there was a need to ensure that “ownership” of the programme rests with African professionals. She expressed the hope that through the coordination committee and consultations with other actors that this would be accomplished. There was concern expressed by Kouadio N’Da N’Guessan that the design of the programme could have had more African input from organisations such as his institution. In the discussion that followed, it was pointed out that the programme had been based on input from African professionals (through the questionnaires) and through incorporating concepts discussed at other meetings on the topic in Africa (for example, the meeting in Nairobi in May 1997 funded in part by SIDA). Furthermore, it was stated that the programme, as developed, only represents a framework. The basis for the continued elaboration of the programme is that individual activities will be further developed by the coordination committee in contacts with professionals in the region.

Finally, those who spoke expressed a willingness to continue a dialogue with both individual meeting participants and the programme as a whole, with the aim of support and collaboration in, as of yet to be defined forms.

9. Conclusion of the meeting

At the conclusion of the meeting, all those who worked on the meeting and made it a success were thanked. These included:

- the Ministry of Culture of Côte d’Ivoire;
- the French Mission for Cooperation and Cultural Action in Abidjan;
- The Abidjan office of UNESCO;
- The UNESCO World Heritage Centre and Committee;
- ICCROM;
- CRATerre-EAG.

Finally, the participants of the meeting were thanked for their contributions to the meeting, both in terms of the presentation of their papers and for their comments, ideas, and enthusiasm for the future success of the programme. The hope was expressed that this meeting would play a key role in initiating an improvement of conditions and capacities for the conservation of immovable property in Sub-Saharan Africa.

10. Introduction to Grand-Bassam and excursion

The final activity of the meeting was an excursion, organised by the Ministry of Culture of Côte d’Ivoire, to the historic town of Grand-Bassam. Nicole F. Adam briefed the participants on some of the urban planning and conservation programmes that were currently being carried out with cooperation from France and the European Union. The excursion to Grand-Bassam was then carried out on 25 March.

Annex 1

AFRICA 2009

*Conservation of Immovable Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa/
Conservation du Patrimoine Culturel Immobilier en Afrique au Sud du Sahara*

WHC-UNESCO - ICCROM - CRATerre-EAG
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire

List of Participants/Liste des Participants

Abidjan, 23-25 March 1998

Benin

Aimé P. GONCALVES
Ministère de la Culture et de la
Communication
B.P. 490
Cotonou
BENIN
Tel: (229) 323022
Fax: (229) 323022
Email: eamau@syfed.tg.refer.org

Côte d'Ivoire

S.E. Prof. Bernard ZADI ZAOUROU
Ministre de la Culture
Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 40 34
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

BARRO AMINATA

Directeur du Musée National du Costume
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. 311
Grand Bassam
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 30 14 15 / 30 13 70

Philippe BONCOUR

Conseiller Technique
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 22 80
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

Nicolas CHAMBON

Assistant Technique PADEC
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 53 21
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

Pierre DJEDJE TRE

Directeur Régional de la Culture du Centre-
Ouest
B.P. 124
Daloa
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 78 33 18

Bernard GBEHE GUEI

Directeur Régional de la Culture de l'Ouest
B.P. 1050
Man
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 79 04 25

IRIE BI BALO

Sous-directeur des Sites & Monuments
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel et des
Musées
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 88 27
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

Tiburce KOFFI KOUADIO
Directeur Régional de la Culture du Sud
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 24 08

KOUAKOU KONAN
Directeur Régional de la Culture du Centre
B.P. 1314 ou B.P. 2659
Bouake
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 63 31 27
Fax: (225) 63 33 52

LASSINA COULIBALY
Directeur Régional de la Culture du Nord
B.P. 155
Korhogo
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 86 04 66 ou 86 00 95

Jean LOHOUROU
Sous-directeur des Cultures
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel et des
Musées
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 22 34 40
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

SAVANE YAYA
Directeur du Musée des Civilisations
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel et des
Musées
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 22 20 56
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

YANLA BI DJE
Directeur Régional de la Culture de l'Est
B.P. 712
Abengourou
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 91 36 51

ALLA KOUAMÉ MICHEL
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 22 34 44
Fax: (225) 21.33.59

Raymond ZOGBO GNOLEBA
Directeur
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel et des
Musées
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 53 21
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

Ethiopia
H.M. JARA
Director
Centre for Research and Conservation of
Cultural Heritage
P.O. Box 13247
Addis Ababa
ETHIOPIA
Tel: (251- 1) 157630

France
Nicole F. ADAM
Attaché d'administration centrale
Chargée du patrimoine et des archives
Secrétariat d'Etat à la Coopération et à la
Francophonie
75700 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: (33-1) 53693526
Fax: (33-1) 53693598

Ghana
I.N. DEBRAH
Acting Director
Ghana Museums and Monuments Board
PO Box 3343
Accra
GHANA
Tel: (233-21) 22 16 33/35

Kenya
George ABUNGU
Director
Regional Museums, Sites, and Monuments
National Museums of Kenya
P.O. Box 40658
Nairobi
KENYA
Tel: (254-2) 744673
Fax: (254-2) 741424
Email: abungu@arcc.or.ke

Mali
Ali Ould SIDI
Mission Culturelle Tombouctou
B.P. 63
Tombouctou
MALI
Tel: (223) 92 10 77
Fax: (223) 92 10 77

Norway
Reidun VEA
Head of Section for Development Technology
Department
Directorate for Cultural Heritage
P.O. Box 8196, Dep.
N-0034 Oslo
NORWAY
Tel: (47-22) 940 560
Fax: (47-22) 94 04 05
Email: reidun.vea@ra.dep.no

Sweden
Per KNUTSSON
Regional Officer for Culture and Media
Embassy of Sweden/Swedish International
Development Cooperation Agency (SIDA)
Embassy of Sweden
P.O. Box 9274
Dar es Salaam
TANZANIA
Tel: (255-51) 111235/40
Fax: (255-51) 113420
Email: per.knutsson@sida.se

Tanzania
Donatius M.K. KAMAMBA
Ag. Director of Antiquities
Department of Antiquities
P.O. Box 2280
Dar es Salaam
TANZANIA
Tel: (255-51) 116554
Fax: (255-51) 116554

Mwalim Ali MWALIM
Technical Director
Stone Town Conservation and Development
Authority
P.O. Box 4233
Zanzibar
TANZANIA
Tel: (255-54) 31408
Fax: (255-54) 30046
Email: stonetown@zanzinet.com

Zimbabwe
Edward MATENGA
Regional Director
National Museums and Monuments of
Zimbabwe
Great Zimbabwe National Monument
P.O. Box 1060
Masvingo
ZIMBABWE
Tel: (263-39) 62080
Fax: (263-39) 63310
Email: natmus@baobab.cszim.co.zw

CRATerre-EAG
Thierry JOFFROY
B.P. 2636
38036 Grenoble Cedex 2
FRANCE
Tel: (33-4) 76 40 66 25
Fax: (33-4) 76 22 72 56
Email: craterre-
eag.formation@grenoble.archi.fr

EAMAU
KOUADIO N'Da N'Guessan
Directeur Général
Ecole Africaine des Métiers de l'Architecture
et de l'Urbanisme
B.P. 2067
Lomé
TOGO
Tel: (228) 21 62 53
Fax: (228) 22 06 52
Email: eamau@cafe.tg

Christian BARILLET
Conseiller Technique
Ecole Africaine des Métiers de l'Architecture
et de l'Urbanisme
B.P. 2067
Lomé
TOGO
Tel: (228) 21 62 53
Fax: (228) 22 06 52
Email: eamau@cafe.tg

ICCROM

Gaël de GUICHEN
Assistant du Directeur Général
Via di San Michele 13
00153 Rome
ITALY
Tel: (39-6) 585 53 361
Fax: (39-6) 585 53 349
Email: gg@iccrom.org

Joseph KING
Programme Officer
Via di San Michele 13
00153 Rome
ITALY
Tel: (39-6) 585 53 313
Fax: (39-6) 585 53 349
Email: jk@iccrom.org

Nordic World Heritage Office

Synnove VINSRYGG
Senior International Advisor
Directorate for Cultural Heritage
P.O. Box 8196, Dep.
N0034 Oslo
NORWAY
Tel: (47-22) 94 04 78
Fax: (47-22) 94 04 05
Email: synnove.vinsrygg@ra.dep.no

UNDP

Susanne VEDSTED
Chargée de Programme
01 B.P. 1747
Abidjan 01
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: 21 13 41
Fax: 21 13 67
Email: fo.ivc.undp.org

UNESCO

Lucette De ANDRADE-DIAWARA
Chef de Bureau/Représentante
UNESCO Abidjan
01 B.P. 1747
Abidjan 01
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 22 42 99
Fax: (225) 21 68 77
Email: abidjan@unesco.org

Aicha KONE
Assistante pur la Communication et la Culture
UNESCO Abidjan
01 B.P. 1747
Abidjan 01
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 22 42 99
Fax: (225) 21 68 77
Email: abidjan@unesco.org

Galia SAOUMA-FORERO
World Heritage Centre
7 Place de Fontenoy
75352 Paris 07 SP
FRANCE
Tel: (33-1) 45 68 14 74
Fax: (33-1) 48 68 55 70
Email: g.saouma-forero@unesco.org

Annex 2

AFRICA 2009

*Conservation of Immovable Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa/
Conservation du Patrimoine Culturel Immobilier en Afrique au Sud du Sahara*

WHC-UNESCO - ICCROM - CRATerre-EAG
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire

Agenda

Monday, 23 March 1998

9:00

Arrival of Participants

9:30

1. Opening session
 - i) Address by Mr. Gaël de Guichen, Assistant to the Director-General of ICCROM
 - ii) Address by Madame Lucette de Andrade-Diawara, Chef de Bureau/Representative, UNESCO Abidjan
 - ii) Welcome address by his excellency, Professor Bernard Zadi Zaourou, Minister of Culture of Côte d'Ivoire

Coffee break

2. Presentation by meeting participants of past interventions and training needs in their countries
 - i) Benin
 - ii) Côte d'Ivoire
 - iii) Ethiopia
 - iv) Ghana
 - v) Kenya
 - vi) Mali
 - vii) Tanzania
 - viii) Zanzibar
 - ix) Zimbabwe
3. Presentation of the results of the survey on "the state of cultural heritage and training needs in Sub-Saharan Africa"
4. Presentation of the AFRICA 2009 Programme

Tuesday, 24 March 1998

9:00

5. Presentation of the AFRICA 2009 Programme (continued)
6. Discussion of the programme by meeting participants
7. Follow-up actions
8. Other issues arising
9. Conclusion of the meeting
10. Introduction to Grand-Bassam

Wednesday, 25 March 1998

11. Excursion to Grand-Bassam

Annex 3

Minutes Coordination Meeting for AFRICA 2009 Conservation of Cultural Heritage in Sub-Saharan Africa

Abidjan, 26 March 1998

Present: George Abungu, *Kenya*
Irie Bi Balo, *Côte d'Ivoire*
I.N. Debrah, *Ghana*
Ali Ould Sidi, *Mali*
Galia Saouma-Forero, *WHC-UNESCO*
Thierry Joffroy, *CRATerre-EAG*
Gaël de Guichen, *ICCROM*
Joseph King, *ICCROM (as observer and rapporteur)*

The meeting was chaired by G. Abungu. As it had already been agreed, in principle, that the committee would consist of 4 African professionals and 1 member of each of the three international organizations, G. de Guichen requested that the committee allow J. King (a second representative of ICCROM) to attend the meeting as an observer and the *rapporteur*. The committee agreed.

The following provisional agenda was discussed and agreed upon by members of the coordination committee.

Agenda (as decided by the committee)

1. Role of the committee, chairman, and secretariat
2. Communication
3. Follow-up to the Abidjan meeting and implementation
4. Funding strategy
5. Other business

1. Role of the Committee, Chairman, and Secretariat

The committee will consist of 4 professionals each from a different African country, reflecting, as much as possible, the diversity of cultural heritage on the continent, and 1 representative of each of the three international organizations, ICCROM, WHC, and CRATerre-EAG.

The work of this committee is to ensure that the objectives of the programme will be achieved through:

- developing a set of criteria for determining appropriate partner organizations and institutions in the region;
- discussing and evaluating the work that has been carried out on the *projet cadre* and the individual *projet situé*;
- examining proposals for future *projets situés*;
- identifying themes and resource persons for the various seminars, courses, and research within the project framework;
- giving a broad direction for the development of the programme as a whole;
- developing future phases of the programme beyond the pilot phase ending in 2000;
- undertaking any other actions felt necessary for the successful implementation of the programme.

The role of the chairman will be to lead the coordination meetings, represent the programme, and to ensure that actions are carried out for its implementation.

The role of the secretariat will be to ensure the smooth exchange of information among members of the committee, and to carry out the basic day to day operations of running the programme.

G. de Guichen pointed out that the secretariat will carry a heavy role in the success of the programme. He gave, as an example, the work of the PREMA programme which has 3 1/2 people involved at ICCROM in its day to day operations.

A discussion then centered on the eventual transfer of the secretariat. It was agreed that ICCROM would be designated secretariat for the pilot phase of the programme, (through 2000) and then an evaluation would be made as to how to proceed into the future.

The selection of the chairman followed with a unanimous decision for G. Abungu of Kenya to fill that role. It was further agreed that the chairmanship would be for 2 years.

The length of service for members of the coordination committee was discussed. As a guiding principle, it was agreed that terms should run through the pilot phase of the programme. But, it was agreed that the exact terms of service and mechanisms for transfer to new members be put off to the next coordination meeting. It was stressed, however, that the two generally agreed upon recommendations that came out of the Abidjan meeting be followed:

- there should be continuity on the committee (not all members' terms should expire at the same time);
- membership should be rotational (to allow for representatives from as many different countries as possible over the length of the programme).

2. Communication

It was pointed out that given the geographical spread of members of the committee and the inability to have frequent face-to-face meetings, it will be very important to create an easy and fast means of communication among members. Each member was polled to determine their particular communication situation with the following results (included is the contact information for each member):

Kenya (telephone, fax, and email)

George ABUNGU
Director, Regional Museums, Sites, and Monuments
National Museums of Kenya
P.O. Box 40658
Nairobi
KENYA
Tel: (254-2) 744673
Fax: (254-2) 741424
Email: abungu@arcc.or.ke

Mali (telephone and fax)

Ali Ould SIDI
Mission Culturelle Tombouctou
B.P. 63
Tombouctou
MALI
Tel: (223) 92 10 77
Fax: (223) 92 10 77

Ghana (telephone)

I.N. DEBRAH
Acting Director
Ghana Museums and Monuments Board
PO Box 3343
Accra
GHANA
Tel: (233-21) 22 16 33/35

Côte d'Ivoire (telephone and fax, email expected soon)

IRIE BI BALO
Sous-directeur des Sites & Monuments
Direction du Patrimoine Culturel et des Musées
Ministère de la Culture de Côte d'Ivoire
B.P. V. 39
Abidjan
CÔTE D'IVOIRE
Tel: (225) 21 88 27 / (cell phone) 08 03 14
Fax: (225) 21 33 59

CRATerre-EAG (telephone, fax, and email)

Thierry JOFFROY
B.P. 2636
38036 Grenoble Cedex 2
FRANCE
Tel: (33-4) 76 40 66 25
Fax: (33-4) 76 22 72 56
Email: craterre-eag.formation@grenoble.archi.fr

ICCROM (telephone, fax, and email)

Gaël de GUICHEN / Joseph KING
Via di San Michele 13
00153 Rome
ITALY
Tel: (39-6) 585 53 1
Fax: (39-6) 585 53 349
Email: gg@iccrom.org / jk@iccrom.org

WHC-UNESCO (telephone, fax, and email)

Galia SAOUMA-FORERO
World Heritage Centre
7 Place de Fontenoy
75352 Paris 07 SP
FRANCE
Tel: (33-1) 45 68 14 74
Fax: (33-1) 48 68 55 70
Email: g.saouma-forero@unesco.org

For those members without email and fax, a discussion followed on possible means of obtaining them as soon as possible in order to ease communication. Several possibilities were discussed including approaching the World Heritage Centre and the Norwegian government (possibly through the local embassy). It was decided that there would be an investigation as to what the best way would be to proceed. A suggestion was made that the committee set a goal of 6 months to have everyone linked on the computer. This was agreed to, in principle.

Once everyone is has an email connection, it was explained that ICCROM could then set up a newsgroup for sending questions and information to every member at the same time. G. de Guichen raised the possibility of connecting the network to other existing networks such as that of PREMA. It was agreed that this would be explored. There will also be a need to explore the communication needs of other participants in the programme as well as developing the communication network.

In regard to wider dissemination of news about the programme, it was felt that there was a need for each member of the committee (and other participants of the Abidjan meeting) to call press conferences and issue press releases when they return to their countries. There is a need to publicize the programme, to increase awareness within

the country and as a means of fundraising. Without local involvement, the programme will be impossible.

3. Follow-up to the Abidjan meeting and implementation

Documents

It was felt that there was a need to quickly provide an executive summary of the Abidjan meeting for participants and other interested parties. This would ensure that everyone understood and agreed as to the results that came out of the meeting. It would then be possible to revise the AFRICA 2009 programme document more slowly to ensure that the ideas raised at the meeting were taken into account.

The necessary documents to be produced are:

- Executive summary of the Abidjan meeting;
- Minutes of this coordination meeting;
- Revised AFRICA 2009 programme document.

Promotional Package

It was also decided that it will be necessary to create a promotional package explaining the project to all interested parties. This package should consist of an information pamphlet, poster, and sticker. In order to create this promotional document, a logo and motto for the programme will need to be developed in the near future.

Letters of Thanks

It was decided that letters of thanks, from the AFRICA 2009 programme, be sent to the following people:

- Minister of Culture of Côte d’Ivoire;
- The UNESCO office in Abidjan for its logistical help with the meeting;
- The French Mission for Cooperation and Cultural Action in Abidjan;
- The various donor agencies who attended;
- The World Heritage Committee for funding for the Abidjan meeting;
- ICCROM for carrying out the organization of the Abidjan meeting and for taking on the role of secretariat for the programme.

Priority Actions for the Programme

Taking into account the comments made during the Abidjan meeting, courses were considered a priority at this time. During the meeting, a variety of target audiences were discussed for possible courses (regional and site managers, conservation and other building professionals, etc.). The revised programme document will take into account the points of view expressed during the meeting, and the coordination committee will continue to discuss how to reach these audiences during the life of the programme.

For the first course, it was decided by the committee that it would be best to focus on National Directorates of Cultural Heritage. Directors themselves may not be able to get away for the length of the course, but they would, hopefully, be able to send someone at a senior enough level to give the proper scope to the course. This level was considered important for two reasons. First, the course would be discussing an entirely new setting for conservation of built heritage (within a sustainable development framework). It would be necessary for relatively senior people to take part in the discussion of these issues in order for them to be integrated within the national administrations and to be diffused to other levels. The second reason would be that the course could be used as a means of actually better developing some of these issues (almost in the form of a series of seminars or workshops). In this case, it would be necessary to have people with the right perspective to be able to contribute to the discussions. In accordance with the feedback from two of the three groups during the Abidjan meeting, it was decided to plan for a course of 3 months.

It was pointed out that the content of the course will be very important and should begin to be developed immediately in consultation with committee members. A first draft should be prepared by the summer for discussion and refinement.

A very important point of discussion was whether the first course should be held in French or English. After some discussion and taking into account that it may be easier to gather both didactic materials and funding for a course in English, it was decided to start with the English course in 1999 and follow with the French course in 2000. It was stressed however, that a shorter seminar in French would also be scheduled for 1999 in order to allow all countries to participate in activities in the first year.

In terms of selection of possible locations for activities (such as the course), issues to take into account included:

- minimization of the costs as much as possible;
- the presence of existing facilities;
- the ease of communication;
- the possibility of national contributions (either financial, in-kind, or organizational);
- the existence of sites of interest to the course to be used as case studies (both in terms of the variety of types of heritage and materials, and also the quality (for example, are they potential World Heritage List sites?).

4. Funding strategy

In terms of an overall strategy for fundraising, a first step was made by identifying possible organizations at various levels as possible collaborators for the various activities of AFRICA 2009.

International

ICCROM - through the work of the secretariat

WHF - both at the national level (individual countries requesting funds for particular activities) and at the *projet cadre* level.

UNESCO - through its participation programme

Organization of African Unity - through its Ubuntu programme

European Union - to be determined

Another possible organization on the international level includes the **Arab League Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (ALESCO)**.

The **World Bank** was discussed, but due to the fact that they are a lending organization rather than a donor agency, it was felt that they would be difficult to approach. It would be possible, however, at the national level, to engage the Bank in these activities as part of the loans that are made to individual countries. This should be examined on a case by case basis depending on the locations of various activities. G. Abungu pointed out, however, that there may be some small funds available from the bank for cultural activities. This is an avenue that should be explored.

National

Norway - attended the Abidjan meeting

Sweden - attended the Abidjan meeting

Denmark

France - attended the Abidjan meeting

others (**Germany, Italy, Switzerland, the Netherlands, etc...**)

Foundations

Aga Khan Trust for Culture

World Monuments Fund

Getty Grant Programme

Rockefeller Foundation

Ford Foundation

others....

Private Companies and Individuals

The possibility was discussed of going to private companies and individuals in some cases. This would be valid, for the most part, once a site for an activity has been selected. At that time, it may be possible within the country of the activity to approach certain companies or individuals for help or in-kind services.

Members of the coordination committee, and participants of the Abidjan meeting as a whole, should be encourage to approach organizations with which they have contacts to gauge interest in the programme. If interest is expressed, they can be informed that an information package will be forwarded by the secretariat and contacts will be made by members of the coordination committee.

5. *Other business*

The committee as a whole wished to thank the Government of the Côte d'Ivoire for its hospitality and help in organizing the meeting, UNESCO and ICCROM for their work on putting the meeting together, and G. Abungu for his work during the meeting to make it a success.

Annex 4

SEMINAR FOR THE TRAINING STRATEGY FOR IMMOVABLE CULTURAL HERITAGE SITES IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA

Abidjan, 23 - 25 March 1998

As a follow-up of the Training Strategy adopted by the World Heritage Committee at its 20th session in December 1996, the participants of the seminar coming from BENIN, COTE D'IVOIRE, ETHIOPIA, GHANA, KENYA, MALI, TANZANIA MAINLAND, ZANZIBAR, ZIMBABWE

Thank

The Ministry of Culture of the Côte d'Ivoire, the French Mission for Cooperation and Cultural Action in Abidjan, UNESCO, the World Heritage Centre, ICCROM, and CRATerre-EAG for helping to organize this meeting.

Recommend

1. That the programme **AFRICA 2009**, as discussed and approved, should be implemented to contribute to the well-being of African communities and permit the sustainable conservation of their immovable cultural heritage.
2. That during the three years of the pilot phase of the programme, a series of activities will be carried out, as indicated, aimed at various groups and actors at the continental level (*projet cadre*) and at the national level (*projets situés*).
3. That a coordination structure be established and supported, by, among others, a communication network for the harmonious implementation of the programme.

Appeal

To the diverse international, national, and non-governmental organizations and African and other interested governments to join together to assure the success of the programme **AFRICA 2009**.

Abidjan, 25 March 1998