



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

38 COM

WHC-14/38.COM/5B

Paris, 30 April 2014

Original: English

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC
AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thirty-eighth session

**Doha, Qatar
15 – 25 June 2014**

**Item 5 of the Provisional Agenda: Reports of the World Heritage Centre and
the Advisory Bodies**

5B. Reports of the Advisory Bodies

SUMMARY

This document contains the brief summary reports of the Advisory Bodies (ICCROM, ICOMOS and IUCN) on their activities in 2013-2014 from the 37th to 38th session of the World Heritage Committee as follows:

- I. ICCROM
- II. ICOMOS
- III. IUCN

Draft Decision: 38 COM 5B, see point IV.

I. REPORT ON ICCROM ACTIVITIES

A.1. Introduction

1. Following the request of the World Heritage Committee, this brief report outlines the key areas of ICCROM's work on the World Heritage Convention for the period from March 2013 to March 2014. ICCROM support to the Committee during this period has been provided principally by Joseph King (Unit Director, Sites Unit), Gamini Wijesuriya (Project Manager, Sites Unit), and Elena Incerti Medici (Senior Administrative Assistant), with collaboration from other ICCROM staff, all under the direction of ICCROM Director-General, Stefano De Caro. Members of the ICCROM network also contribute to support these activities. In addition to its direct work on the Convention, ICCROM also has a programme within its own Programme and Budget entitled, "Improving Conservation and Management Practices through the World Heritage Convention" which helps to improve both conservation at World Heritage properties and to use knowledge developed within the World Heritage system to better conserve cultural heritage properties more generally.

A.2. 37th session of the World Heritage Committee

2. ICCROM attendance at the 37th session of the World Heritage Committee was led by the Director General, Stefano De Caro, and included Joseph King, Gamini Wijesuriya, and Mounir Bouchenaki in the role of Special Advisor to the Director General. In addition, ICCROM participated in a number of meetings and activities in preparation of 38th session of the Committee including meetings of the Advisory Bodies and World Heritage Centre and World Heritage Information meeting in Paris. ICCROM also attended the General Assembly of State Parties to the Convention in November 2013.

A.3. Nominations to the World Heritage List

3. Not applicable to ICCROM's role with the World Heritage Convention.

A.4. Monitoring of State of Conservation of World Heritage properties

4. ICCROM has been fully involved in the preparation of State of Conservation reports for the 38th session of the World Heritage Committee. Towards this end, ICCROM led in the drafting of some reports, and commented on others prepared by ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre. ICCROM also participated in the drafting meetings for SoC reports that took place in March and April 2014. ICCROM participated in joint reactive monitoring missions to three World Heritage properties, the Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands in the Russian Federation, the Cornwall and West Devon Mining Landscape in the United Kingdom, and the Ancient Building Complex in the Wudang Mountains in China.

A.5. Periodic Reporting

5. ICCROM continues to fully contribute to the Periodic Reporting process in all regions in cooperation with the relevant regional units of the World Heritage Centre. This includes:
 - a) attendance at regional and sub-regional meetings during all phases of the Periodic Reporting process;

- b) working with regional partners on the development of regional or sub-regional capacity building strategies based on the results of the Periodic Reporting process;
- c) implementation of specific capacity building activities both during the process and after the reports are completed.

A.6. Capacity Building for World Heritage

6. ICCROM has continued to collaborate with IUCN, ICOMOS, and the World Heritage Centre on capacity building issues, and in particular in the development and implementation of the World Heritage Capacity Building Programme (WHCBP) with generous funding from the Swiss Government. The period between June 2013 and June 2014 has marked a period of transition for the programme as the overall responsibility for implementation has shifted from IUCN to ICCROM. Activities within this programme during the past year have included continued strengthening of the Advisory Bodies networks, as well as translation of resource manuals (see below) and other documents such as the ICOMOS guidance on Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) and IUCN guidance on Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA). As part of the WHCBP, ICCROM is in the process of developing a new course on management of cultural and natural heritage. A first module for this new course will be tested in April 2014 as part of ICCROM's International Course on Conservation of the Built Heritage.
7. ICCROM continues to update its training database, events database, and classifieds section of its website as a means of ensuring the dissemination of information on World Heritage capacity building and other activities to a wider audience.
8. ICCROM works with Category 2 Centres and other regional institutions to strengthen capacity building at the regional and sub-regional levels. This work includes ongoing partnerships with the AWHF, WHITR-AP, ARC-WH to name a few. Partnerships include sitting on governing or advisory boards, providing advice on the development of capacity building strategies at the regional and sub-regional levels, and partnership in the implementation of some activities. For example, ICCROM collaborated with the AWHF on the implementation of a Risk Preparedness Workshop in May 2013 in Zimbabwe, and worked with the UNESCO Jakarta Office on the development of a sub-regional workshop on disaster risk preparedness and management in October 2013. ICCROM will attend the 4th annual meeting of the Category 2 Centres which will take place in Shanghai, China in May 2014.
9. ICCROM also continues to lecture on invitation at a number of World Heritage related master degree training programmes including the World Heritage Studies Programme at BTU Cottbus, the Masters in World Heritage and Cultural Projects for Development at the Turin School of Development, and the Master in World Natural Heritage Management at the Trento School of Management.
10. Finally, ICCROM was responsible for the development and implementation of several World Heritage Orientation Sessions for Committee members including the induction session immediately following the General Assembly of States Parties and the first Orientation session in Paris in January 2014. ICCROM will work with the World Heritage Centre and other Advisory Bodies on the implementation of further sessions linked to the Information Meeting to be held in Paris in April/May and the session immediately before the 38th session in Doha, Qatar.
11. For more information on capacity building activities, see document WHC-13/38.COM/6.

A.7. Resource Manuals

12. ICCROM finalized the work on the new resource manual, Managing Cultural World Heritage, which was put on-line in December 2013. French and Spanish versions are being finalized at the time of the writing of this report. ICCROM and IUCN have also been working with the World Heritage Centre on the translation of all four of the resource manuals into Spanish.

A.8. International Assistance

13. ICCROM reviewed and advised on approximately 34 International Assistance requests made by States Parties and will have participated in 2 International Assistance Panel meetings during the year.

A.9. Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

14. Not applicable to ICCROM's role with the World Heritage Convention.

A.10. Policy Guidelines

15. At its 37th Session (Decision 37COM13), The World Heritage Committee requested ICCROM, in collaboration with the World Heritage Centre and the other Advisory Bodies, to further develop the Policy Guidelines and present a scoping document so that stakeholders are made fully aware of policy decisions that have been taken by the World Heritage Committee or the General Assembly. This scoping study is to be presented to the World Heritage Committee at its 39th session in 2015. ICCROM has begun work on this scoping study and two discussions have been held in conjunction with the semi-annual meetings of the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies. ICCROM proposes that such a scoping study should include a brief history of policy making within the World Heritage Convention and why a more structured policy making process may be useful; a proposed definition of "Policy Guidelines" as it would apply to the implementation of the World Heritage Convention; a proposed structure for each of the policy areas to be developed, and a discussion of the relationship between these new Policy Guidelines and the existing Operational Guidelines. A first list of proposed policy areas should also be put forward. In addition, the scoping study should discuss a proposed methodology and timeframe for developing the policies to be included in the Policy Guidelines, proposed procedures for adopting the new Policy Guidelines, and procedures for any eventual changes or amendments to the guidelines once they have been adopted. A procedure will also have to be proposed to ensure that the Policy Guidelines and Operational Guidelines remain in agreement with each other. An estimate of the costs associated with the development of the Policy Guidelines should also be presented. As requested in Decision 37COM13, the scoping study should also include an annex with a list of key policy decisions that have been taken by the World Heritage Committee and General Assembly.
16. ICCROM notes that to date, no funding has been made available for this activity as stipulated in Decision 37COM13. ICCROM would estimate a need for approximately US\$ 30,000 for the necessary senior policy consultant (approximately 3.5 to 4 months) to develop the scoping study in consultation with the Advisory Bodies and the World Heritage Centre, and an additional US\$12,000 – 15,000 for a research assistant for 3 to 4 months in order to carry out the necessary research on the existing policy decisions already taken by the World Heritage Committee and General Assembly, to accompany the scoping study.

A.11. Technical Meetings

17. ICCROM has participated in a number of technical meetings during the past year, such as the two expert meetings on the Historic Urban Landscape (in Brazil in September 2013 and Paris in December 2013). ICCROM was also involved in the Global Platform on Disaster Risk Reduction where UNISDR, ICCROM, the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, and ICOMOS-ICORP held a special session on Heritage and Resilience. ICCROM also continues to follow up on the results of the World Heritage Convention: Looking Ahead meeting hosted by the Director General of UNESCO. ICCROM looks forward to continued dialogue and exchange with State Parties to the Convention as we all work together to implement the recommendations of this important meeting.

II. REPORT ON ICOMOS ACTIVITIES

A.1. Introduction

18. ICOMOS reaffirms its commitment to serve the World Heritage Committee in spite of the challenges that the World Heritage Convention is facing. It continues to develop activities related to the implementation of the Convention with the help of its Working Group which meets three times a year to ensure that the work submitted to the Committee meets the highest performance criteria, to improve working procedures, and to review the principles for applying the mandate entrusted to it. (<http://www.icomos.org/fr/notre-action/participation-aux-conventions-internationales/convention-du-patrimoine-mondial>)
19. ICOMOS continues to work to ensure a broad geo-cultural representation within its Working Group, the World Heritage Panel, and the experts who are responsible for the evaluation of nominations and monitoring of the state of conservation of World Heritage properties.
20. ICOMOS confirms its willingness to strengthen the dialogue with States Parties, particularly with regard to the upstream processes and advisory missions.
21. ICOMOS acknowledges with appreciation the spirit of collaboration that prevails with UNESCO and the States Parties but equally the work that is carried out jointly with ICCROM, IUCN and other partner organizations.
22. IUCN and ICOMOS have strengthened their cooperation in the evaluation of mixed properties and initiated a project on Connecting practice: Defining new methods and strategies to support Nature and Culture through engagement in the WH Convention.

A.2. 37th session of the World Heritage Committee (Phnom Penh, Cambodia, June 2013)

23. ICOMOS was represented at the 37th session of the World Heritage Committee (Phnom Penh, 17-26 June 2013) by a strong delegation. The Advisory Body assisted in the preparation of the working documents for the Committee with the World Heritage Centre, and at the orientation session of the World Heritage Committee with ICCROM and IUCN.
24. It presented its work on the evaluation of nominations of cultural and mixed properties, on the Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value, and on the monitoring of the state of conservation of properties. It contributed to discussions on other items on the agenda: revision of the Operational Guidelines, Sustainable Development, evaluation of the Global Strategy and Strategic Action Plan, and pilot projects for the upstream processes.

A.3. Nominations to the World Heritage List

25. For the 2014 cycle, ICOMOS evaluated 32 properties nominated for inscription, including 27 new nominations (counting 3 large and complex nominations) and 1 emergency nomination to the World Heritage List in accordance with the Operational Guidelines, 1 referred nomination, 1 deferred nomination, 2 extensions, and 10 minor modifications / creation of buffer zones, which are to be presented at the 38th session of the World Heritage Committee.
26. Overall, ICOMOS notes that the nominations are becoming increasingly complex, and this is sometimes at the expense of clarity or coherence of the dossiers. Some nominations could benefit from a longer preparation time.
27. ICOMOS has provided follow up to the decisions of the World Heritage Committee in relation to pilot projects for upstream processes identified in consultation with the States Parties. Additional resources will be needed to develop this activity.

A.4. Monitoring the State of Conservation of World Heritage properties

28. ICOMOS prepared part of the reports on the monitoring of the state of conservation of cultural and mixed properties to be presented at the 38th session of the World Heritage Committee.
29. It will have carried out and prepared reports for 9 Reactive Monitoring missions for the 38th session. At the request of the States Parties, ICOMOS has also carried out 13 Advisory missions.
30. In addition, the World Heritage Centre consults on a regular basis throughout the year with the Advisory Body on problems with or threats to properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. Additional research work has been carried out, notably via ICOMOS networks, documents have been examined and written reports have been sent to the World Heritage Centre.
31. Monitoring of the State of Conservation of properties is an essential activity of the World Heritage Convention and additional resources should be made available for its implementation.

A.5. Periodic Reporting

32. The Advisory Body has participated in activities coordinated by the regional units for the second cycle of Periodic Reporting for the Latin America and Caribbean region and Europe, and the implementation of action plans for the Arab States and Asia-Pacific region.

A.6. Capacity building

33. ICOMOS, ICCROM and IUCN are collaborating with the Swiss Government in the implementation of the three-year project to build capacity within the framework of World Heritage. Within this context, regional workshops have been organised, aimed at strengthening and diversifying the network of expertise of the Advisory Body.
34. ICOMOS has continued its collaboration with the Category 2 Centres for the setting up of their programmes.

A.7. International Assistance

35. ICOMOS has considered all the requests for International Assistance for cultural and mixed properties that have been submitted to it and participated in the Panels that have examined these requests.

A.8. Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

36. ICOMOS has studied and reviewed all the Retrospective Statements of OUV which have been submitted to it in accordance with the timetable for this set by the World Heritage Committee. The review of the statements from the Europe and North America region continued.

A.9. Thematic Studies

37. ICOMOS initiated a thematic study on the Cultural heritages of water in the arid, semi-arid and Mediterranean regions of the Middle East and the Maghreb.

A.10. Technical meetings

38. ICOMOS has participated in many technical meetings organised by the World Heritage Centre.
39. ICOMOS also attended the 19th session of the General Assembly of States Parties to the Convention (UNESCO, Paris, 19 -21 November 2013).
40. It has participated at the meetings of the Advisory Bodies with the World Heritage Centre (September 2013 and January 2014) and at the orientation session of Members of the World Heritage Committee on the 23rd of January 2014.

III. REPORT ON IUCN ACTIVITIES

A.1. Introduction

41. In view of the budgetary pressures on the World Heritage Convention's documentation, IUCN's report to the Committee is very short and synthetic this year. Information on IUCN's work on the World Heritage Convention is available at the following address: www.iucn.org/worldheritage to complement the brief report below, and IUCN is pleased to provide further information on request on any aspect of its work.
42. IUCN's most recent approved resolutions on World Heritage from the IUCN World Conservation Congress (WCC) held in September 2012 form the specific basis for the prioritisation of World Heritage within the new IUCN Programme. Links to these documents which are available in IUCN's three official languages of English, French and Spanish are available below. IUCN Motions on World Heritage (available via links from the following page): http://www.iucnworldconservationcongress.org/member_s_assembly/resolutions/ and IUCN Programme: http://www.iucn.org/what/global_programme/.
43. IUCN notes that the Convention's budgetary challenges have worsened significantly in 2013-14, and that it is facing increasingly critical challenges to its performance and relevance. In line with the above IUCN motions and the IUCN Programme 2013-16, the work of its World Heritage Programme is focused on complementing its advisory role to the World Heritage Committee with proactive programmes of support to States Parties, and to the large body of IUCN's members and partners, to engage in the Convention. Priorities amongst this work include the (a) development of new and proactive means

to support World Heritage Site conservation, including new monitoring processes to report on the World Heritage Outlook which IUCN will launch at the World Heritage Committee in 2014, (b) proactive initiatives to promote work on possible priorities for World Heritage nominations (in line with the spirit of the “upstream process”, (c) strengthening of IUCN's regional capacity and diversity in both its secretariat, and its expert networks, (d) work on the consideration of rights based approaches in relation to World Heritage Sites, and the benefits they provide to local communities and indigenous peoples and (e) ensuring the relevance of World Heritage to wider conservation and sustainable development initiatives, notably in relation to the contribution to the Convention on Biological Diversity, and its agreed Programme of Work on Protected Areas.

44. In 2013-14 IUCN completed an evaluation of its World Heritage Programme, which is available via the following web page: https://www.iucn.org/knowledge/monitoring_evaluation/database/all_iucn_evaluations/. The evaluation received many inputs from States Parties, and other World Heritage partners. IUCN's management response to the findings of the review will be available before the Committee meets, and it is hoped to organise side events to present the findings in a side meeting.
45. IUCN acknowledges with thanks the strong and growing collaboration with UNESCO, ICCROM, ICOMOS and also with a range of partners and a number of States Parties to enable its work. IUCN also acknowledges with thanks the very significant volunteered efforts of its members and expert commissions, without whose support our work would not be possible. IUCN and ICOMOS are commencing a new joint project activity examining the opportunities for connecting practice in relation to cultural and natural World Heritage.

A.2. 37th session of the World Heritage Committee

46. IUCN attended the 37th session of the World Heritage Committee with a diverse and effective delegation and contributed fully in all relevant items of the Committee's business.

A.3. Nominations to the World Heritage List

47. IUCN completed evaluations of all natural and mixed nominations, and presented its recommendations to the 37th Session of the World Heritage Committee in line with the requirements of the Operational Guidelines. This work is also on track for the 38th Session. Commentary on these matters is provided in the introduction to IUCN's evaluation report (item 8B).

A.4. Monitoring of State of conservation of World Heritage properties

48. IUCN led the drafting of the majority of State of Conservation reports on natural properties presented to the 37th Session, and to be presented at the 38th Session of the World Heritage Committee.
49. As reported to previous sessions of the Committee, IUCN is also continuing to develop a new consistent and transparent, online World Heritage Outlook system for monitoring and identifying the management needs for all natural World Heritage Sites. The results of this work will be launched in a side event at the Committee meeting this year, and will also be carried forward as a key input to the IUCN World Parks Congress to be held in November 2014.

A.5. Periodic Reporting

50. IUCN has contributed fully to the continued programme of Periodic Reporting in all regions, and this input and further plans will be considered under the relevant items of Committee agenda. Strengthening IUCN's regional work on World Heritage is a continuing priority that has been supported in 2013-14 by the State Party of Germany, and this support is acknowledged with thanks. A major new initiative is anticipated to increase support for natural heritage in the Arab States in 2014-15, through the strong partnership of IUCN and the Arab Regional Centre – World Heritage (ARC-WH).

A.6. Capacity Building for World Heritage

51. Funding for capacity building by IUCN was cut in 2012 due to budgetary restraints in UNESCO, and remains at zero in the current biennium. With the continued support of the State Party of Switzerland, IUCN and ICCROM have continued to deliver capacity building focused on the strengthening and diversification of advisory body expert networks, supporting leading World Heritage training institutions, and engaging in support of Category 2 Centres. This will be further discussed under the relevant item on the Committee's agenda.

A.7. Resource Manuals

52. IUCN is pleased to see continued progress with the Resource Manuals, and is assisting translation of the manuals on Nominations and Managing Natural World Heritage as priorities. A focus on further translation and dissemination of these resources should be at the centre of capacity building efforts.

A.8. International Assistance

53. IUCN reviewed and advised on all International Assistance (IA) requests as required, and participated in the IA Panel.

A.9. Retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

54. IUCN has completed the review of all retrospective Statements of OUV requested in line with the agreed priorities of the World Heritage Committee.

A.10. Thematic studies

55. IUCN, in partnership with UNEP-WCMC, completed major new thematic studies in 2013-14 on Terrestrial Biodiversity, supported by the State Party of Germany and MAVA Foundation, Marine World Heritage, supported by the Arab Regional Centre-World Heritage and CORDIO, and an analysis of the natural heritage aspects of World Heritage cultural landscapes, supported by IUCN WCPA.

A.11. Technical Meetings

56. IUCN has attended, and helped organise, technical meetings on request, as reported during the agenda of the Committee. IUCN is committed to following up on the meeting held by the Director General of UNESCO in October 2012 on "the World Heritage Convention: Thinking Ahead". IUCN published a response to the findings of that meeting, available at this link: https://cmsdata.iucn.org/downloads/a_future_for_world_heritage_iucn_non_paper_september_2012.pdf.

57. IUCN notes the importance of following up on this meeting, as part of the response the external evaluation of the Convention by UNESCO's external auditors in order to develop an effective, prioritised programme of work to address the challenges raised.

B. GENERAL JOINT COMMENT OF THE ADVISORY BODIES ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CONVENTION

58. As requested by the 35th session of the World Heritage Committee, in Decision 35 COM 5B (point 3) the Advisory Bodies provide this short general statement on the implementation of the World Heritage Convention. The Advisory Bodies note that many of the issues brought out in last year's joint comment remain relevant today.
59. One of the most important strategic issues facing the implementation of the Convention as it enters its 5th decade is the need for proactive and constructive mechanisms to support conservation, monitoring, effective tentative lists and nominations; and uphold and celebrate the high standards that are the foundation of World Heritage. There is clearly a need for more dialogue between States Parties, the World Heritage Committee, the World Heritage Centre, and the Advisory Bodies, and more opportunities to provide advice and exchange ideas for improving the work of all actors in the World Heritage system. Several activities have been put into place, such as increased number of orientation sessions which provide an opportunity for questions and discussions among Committee members, the World Heritage Centre, and the Advisory Bodies, and the so-called, "upstream process" for nominations. The speed with which this has become mainstreamed indicates the benefit of such an approach, which could well be extended downstream for State of Conservation issues. However to enable wider and more profitable dialogue, there will be a need for new processes, as the possibilities within the existing system are now close to exhaustion.
60. The Advisory Bodies further note that some progress has been made in implementing of the recommendations that came out of the Director-General of UNESCO's meeting of October 2012, "The World Heritage Convention: Thinking Ahead" and the External Auditor's Evaluation of the Global Strategy. More work needs to be done, however, by all actors to ensure a full implementation of the recommendations of these two important initiatives. The Advisory Bodies would suggest the need for a more streamlined strategic planning framework. The current practice of creating a plethora of action plans and recommendations sometimes tends to lead to a situation where it is not possible to keep track of what has been accomplished and what still needs to be done, resulting in substantial time and financial investment in analysis and the making of plans being wasted.
61. Unfortunately, the implementation of all these activities relies very much on the existence of sufficient resources. The current reduction in the budget of the World Heritage Fund, along with the ongoing financial crisis both in UNESCO and globally, has meant that sufficient resources are neither available within the World Heritage Fund or through extra-budgetary contributions. This reduction in budget has a significant and worsening impact, not only on the increased opportunity for dialogue, but also on all aspects of the implementation of the Convention, including the professionals and volunteers who the Committee rely on for the Convention's work. The Advisory Bodies consider that this long-standing issue is now close to a breaking point, and we reiterate our willingness to work closely with the World Heritage Committee and World Heritage Centre to look for ways to expand the resource base available to carry out our mandated work, streamline and reduce workload, and respond to the requested support from the States Parties to the Convention.
62. To conclude, the Advisory Bodies pledge to continue working with all actors in the World Heritage system to ensure that the key goal of the Convention, international

cooperation for the protection of the World's Heritage of Outstanding Universal Value, can be achieved, but note their growing concern over the future effective implementation of the Convention.

IV. DRAFT DECISION

Draft Decision: 38 COM 5B

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC-14/38.COM/5B,*
2. *Recalling Decision **37 COM 5B** adopted at its 37th session (Phnom Penh, 2013),*
3. *Takes note with appreciation of the reports of the Advisory Bodies (ICCROM, ICOMOS and IUCN) on their activities;*
4. *Welcomes the harmonization of the reports by the Advisory Bodies and the comments on the progress made and gaps identified for the implementation of the Convention.*