



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

37 COM

WHC-13/37.COM/INF.7A

Paris, 17 May 2013

Original: English/French

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC
AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thirty-seventh session

Phnom Penh, Cambodia

16 – 27 June 2013

**Item 7A of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of World Heritage
properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger**

**INF.7A: Compendium on the Statements of Significance and of Outstanding
Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World
Heritage in Danger and discussed for in-Danger listing**

SUMMARY

This document presents, as requested by the World Heritage Committee at its 32nd session (see Decision **32 COM 7B.129**), a compendium on the Statements of Significance and of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger and discussed for in-Danger listing.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER	p. 4
<u>Natural properties</u>	p. 4
Africa	p. 4
1. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic)	p. 4
2. Comoé National Park (Côte d'Ivoire)	p. 5
3. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea)	p. 7
4. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 8
5. Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 10
6. Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 11
7. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 13
8. Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 14
9. Simien National Park (Ethiopia)	p. 16
10. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar)	p. 17
11. Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger)	p. 18
12. Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal)	p. 20
Asia and the Pacific	p. 21
13. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia)	p. 21
Europe and North America	p. 21
14. Everglades National Park (United States of America)	p. 21
Latin America and the Caribbean	p. 22
15. Belize Barrier Reef System (Belize)	p. 22
16. Los Katíos National Park (Colombia)	p. 22
17. Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras)	p. 22
<u>Cultural properties</u>	p. 22
Africa	p. 23
18. Timbuktu (Mali)	p. 23
19. Tomb of Askia (Mali)	p. 24
20. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda)	p. 26
21. Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Ruins of Songo Mnara (United Republic of Tanzania)	p. 28
Arab States	p. 29
22. Abu Mena (Egypt)	p. 29
23. Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq)	p. 30
24. Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq)	p. 30
25. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan)	p. 31

26. Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine)	p. 31
27. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen)	p. 33
Asia and the Pacific	p. 35
28. Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan)	p. 35
29. Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan)	p. 36
30. Bam and its Cultural Landscape (Islamic Republic of Iran)	p. 38
Europe and North America	p. 41
31. Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery (Georgia)	p. 41
32. Historical Monuments of Mtskheta (Georgia)	p. 41
33. Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Serbia) ¹	p. 42
34. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland)	p. 42
Latin America and the Caribbean	p. 44
35. Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works (Chile)	p. 44
36. Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama)	p. 44
37. Chan Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru)	p. 45
38. Coro and its Port (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela)	p. 47
II. PROPERTIES DISCUSSED FOR IN-DANGER LISTING	p. 47
<u>Natural properties</u>	p. 47
Africa	p. 47
39. Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya)	p. 47
Asia and the Pacific	p. 49
40. East Rennell (Solomon Islands)	p. 49
Europe and North America	p. 51
41. Virgin Komi Forests (Russian Federation)	p. 51
<u>Cultural properties</u>	p. 51
Arab States	p. 51
42. Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic)	p. 51
43. Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic)	p. 53
44. Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic)	p. 54
45. Ancient Villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic)	p. 56
46. Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic)	p. 58

¹ **Note:** The Secretariat was informed by the Legal Advisor that “The UNESCO Secretariat follows the practice of the United Nations, which considers that the Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999) continues to be applicable to the territory of Kosovo until a final settlement be achieved”.

47. Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) p. 59

Latin America and the Caribbean p. 60

48. Archaeological Site of Panamá Viejo and Historic District of Panamá (Panama)
p. 60

I. PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER

NATURAL PROPERTIES

AFRICA

1. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic) (N 475)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

With an area of 1,740,000 ha, Manovo-Gounda St Floris is the largest park in the Central African savannas. Straddling the two ecological zones, Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park owes its importance to its rich flora and fauna. It is home to many endangered species including the black rhino, elephant, hippopotamus and red-fronted gazelle as well as large concentrations of herbivores.

This Park is an interesting example of a “crossroads” where the species from savanna communities of East and West Africa, as well as those of the forest communities of the South, cross paths. The Park is a valuable area for the study of environmental changes occurring throughout the Sahel and Sudan under pressure from drought and overgrazing.

Criterion (ix): The Manovo Gounda St Floris National Park contains extraordinary natural formations. The Park straddles the Sudano-Sahelian and Sudano-Guinean biogeographical zones. This results in a variety of habitats from grassy plains in the north to savannas with gallery forests in the south. The property encompasses the entire watershed of three major rivers (Manovo, Koumbala and Gounda) with grassy floodplains and wetlands. The plains are interspersed with small granitary inselbergs with, to the south, the rugged sandstone massif of the Bongos.

This vast Park, surrounded by hunting areas and with a functional corridor to the National Park of Bamingui-Bangoran, protects the largest savanna of Central Africa. It represents a unique example of this type of ecosystem, home to viable populations of different species typical of this part of Africa and others from East and West Africa.

Criterion (x): The Park's wildlife reflects its transitional position between East and West Africa, the Sahel and the rainforests. It contains the richest fauna of the country including about 57 species of mammals that have been well protected in the past. In this respect, it resembles the rich savannas of East Africa.

Several important large mammal species in terms of conservation live in the Park, such as black rhino, elephant, hippopotamus, red-fronted gazelle (here at the southern limit of its range), lion, leopard, cheetah and wild dog. There are large concentrations of herbivores, including buffalo, Buffon's kob, waterbuck, and red hartebeest. Some 320 species of birds have been recorded in the Park, of which at least 25 species of raptors. Flood plains to the north of the Park are largely adequate for water birds, and the shoebill has been observed in the Park.

Integrity

With a total area of 1,740,000 ha, the Park is almost completely surrounded by the game reserves of Ouandija-Vakaga and Aouk-Aoukalé (480,000 ha and 330,000 ha respectively), which provide effective protection against threats to the property from

surrounding areas. Other hunting areas and reserves are also connected with the property, resulting in a contiguous area of 80,000 km² of protected areas. The property is large enough to ensure species viability.

Nevertheless, the integrity of the Park is a cause for concern because of the numerous threats, poaching in particular (notably of rhinoceros, elephant and giraffe) and grazing. The lack of protection and land management measures was also noted at the time of inscription of the property.

Protection and management requirements

The site has National Park status. It is governed by the 1984 Wildlife Protection Code on which the national legislation on the management of protected areas is based. At the time of inscription, the Park was managed by a private company (Manova SA) which benefited from a governmental contract to manage the site. The Park was then regarded as the best-managed protected area of the country.

Today, conservation is under the authority of the Ministry of Water and Forests, Hunting and Fishing, with a structure consisting of the Chief of Staff, the Director-General of Water, Forests, Hunting and Fishing, the Director of Wildlife and Protected Areas, the regional directors, site managers and national conservators. Two bases (Manova and Gordil) are situated alongside the Park, to the east and west, but only the former is truly functional. Anti-poaching actions are primarily organised from these bases, limited by the lack of personnel, means of transport and the prevailing insecurity in the Park.

The region is sparsely populated. However, nomad pastoralists from the Sudanese region of Nyala and from Chad, with 30 – 40,000 head of cattle, enter the Park every winter – the dry season grazing halt on their traditional seasonal migration routes. There is also dispersed and limited agricultural activity in the environs of the Park.

The pressures of poaching and grazing highlight the need for a functional management or development plan for the Park. This plan should take into account the zoning of the Park and its relationship with the Village Hunting Zones in the periphery, with participative management and a Development Plan for the entire north-east territory (grazing areas and redefinition of the seasonal migration corridors).

The creation of a transborder “Zakouma National Park (Chad) –Manovo Gounda St Floris National Park” protected area is also desirable.

2. Comoé National Park (Côte d'Ivoire) (N 227)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Comoé National Park, situated in the north-east of Côte d'Ivoire, with the surface of 1149450 ha, is one of the largest protected areas in West Africa. It is characterized by its great plant diversity. The Comoé River, which runs through the Park, explains the presence of group of plants that are usually found further south, such as the shrub savannas and patches of thick rainforest. The property thus constitutes an outstanding example of transitional habitat between the forest and the savanna. The variety of the habitats engenders a wide diversity of wildlife species.

Criterion (ix): The property, due to its geographical location and vast area dedicated to the conservation of natural resources, is an ecological unit of particular importance. Its geomorphology comprises wide plains with deep ridges carved by the Comoe River

and its tributaries (Bavé, Iringou, Kongo), allowing humid plant growth towards the north and favouring the presence of wildlife in the forest zone. The property also contains green rocky inselbergs in a north-south line, surmounted by rocky ridges that form in the centre and the north, isolated massifs and small chains of 500m to 600m in altitude. Comoé National Park contains a remarkable variety of habitats, notably savannas, wooded savannas, gallery forests, fluvial forests and riparian grasslands providing an outstanding example of transitional habitats from forest to savanna. Currently, the property is one of the rare sanctuaries for a variety of West-African biological species.

Criterion (x): Due to the phytogeographical situation and the crossing of the River Comoé for over 230 kilometres, Comoé National Park teems with a vast variety of animal and plant species. This location in fact makes this property a zone where the areas of division of numerous west-African plant and animal species mingle. The property contains around 620 plant species, 135 species of mammals, (including 11 primates, 11 carnivores and 21 species of artiodactyla), 35 amphibian species and 500 bird species (a little less than 20% of which are inter-African migratory birds and roughly 5% palearctic migratory birds). Several of these bird species enjoy international protection, among which the Denham's Bustard (*Neotis denhami*), the yellow casqued hornbill (*Ceratogymna elata*) and the brown-cheeked hornbill (*Bycanistes cylindricus*). The property also contains 36 of the 38 species of the biome of the Sudo-Guinean savanna inventoried in the country as well as resident populations of species that have become rare in West Africa, such as the Jabiru *Ephippiorhynchus senegalensis*. The different waters of the Comoé River and its tributaries are the habitat for 60 species of fish. As concerns reptiles, three species of crocodiles are found in the Park – including the dwarf crocodile (*Osteolaemus tetraspis*) – which are on the IUCN Red List. The property also contains three other threatened species which are the Chimpanzee, the African wild dog *Lycaon pictus* and the Elephant *Loxodonta africana africana*.

Integrity

Comoé National Park is one of the rare zones in West Africa that has maintained its ecological integrity. The property is sufficiently vast to guarantee the ecological integrity of the species that it contains, on the condition, however, that poaching is reduced. The boundaries have been clearly established and defined to include the watersheds or ecosystems in their entirety. However, if the boundaries were extended to the Mounts Gorowi and Kongoli, the ecological value of the property would be greatly increased, as this area could provide the elephants with a particularly suitable habitat and also enable the protection of other important species. The World Heritage Committee has, therefore, recommended to the State Party to extend the south-west part of the Park to include the Mounts Gorowi and Kongoli.

Protection and management requirements

The property was inscribed on the List of the World Heritage in Danger in 2003 because of the potential impact of civil unrest; decrease in the populations of large mammals due to increased and uncontrolled poaching; and the lack of efficient management mechanisms. The property is protected by various national laws. The main management challenges are combating poaching, human settlements, agricultural pressure and insufficient management and access control. In order to reduce these problems, an efficient surveillance system throughout the property, and the establishment of participatory management with local communities are required to diminish the pressures and impacts associated with the management of areas located on the periphery of the property. These measures shall be reflected in the overall management structure of the property. A sustainable funding strategy is also

indispensable to guarantee the human and financial resources required for the long-term management of the property.

3. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea) (N 155 bis)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

A veritable « water tower » with about fifty springs between the Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea, the Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve is dominated by a chain of mountains that culminate at 1,752 m altitude at Mount Nimba. The slopes, covered with dense forest at the lower levels, with grassy mountain pastures, overflow with particularly rich endemic flora and fauna. Extending over a total of area of 17,540 ha, with 12,540 ha in Guinea and 5,000 ha in Côte d'Ivoire, the property is integrated into the public domain of the two States.

This Reserve contains original and diverse species of the most remarkable animal and plant populations, not only in West Africa, but also in the entire African continent; notably threatened species such as the Micropotamogale of Mount Nimba (*Micropotamogale lamottei*), the viviparous toad of Mount Nimba (*Nimbaphrynoides occidentalis*) and chimpanzees that use stones as tools.

Criterion (ix): Part of the rare mountainous chains of West Africa, Mount Nimba rises abruptly to an altitude of 1,752 m above a rolling panorama and giving way to forested plains at the lower altitudes. It is an isolated refuge covered with montane forests, making the landscape of the Gulf of Guinea an exceptional site from the ecological perspective. Its geomorphological characteristics and its sub-equatorial montane climate of strong seasonal and altitudinal contrasts produce a rich variety of microclimates. This latter factor has contributed to the individualization of an insolate plant and fauna population, as well as a dynamic and exceptionally varied ecosystem.

Criterion (x): Its unique geographical and climatic location combined with its biogeographical background provides the Nimba chain with one of the most remarkable diversities of the whole West African region. It is also one of the only sites of the Gulf of Guinea with a strong endemism potential. The wide range of habitats in the Reserve with its numerous niches enables the property to provide shelter to more than 317 vertebrate species, 107 of which are mammals, and, to more than 2,500 invertebrate species with a strong endemism level.

The viviparous toad of Mount Nimba (*Nimbaphrynoides occidentalis*), critically threatened with extinction due to its very reduced breeding area, only lives in high altitude habitats. Another endemic species in danger of extinction is the micropotamogale of Mount Nimba (*Micropotamogale lamottei*), a small semi-aquatic insectivore. Several species of threatened primates are also present, including chimpanzees capable of using tools.

The Reserve contains a very important plant population, with a dense forest covering the lower level of the massif up to 1,000 m altitude, replaced higher up by a montane forest rich in epiphytes. The massif of Nimba has summits that extend over 15 km in length and covered with montane savanna. More than 2,000 species of vascular plants, including several endemic or quasi-endemic plants have been recorded.

Integrity

The property includes almost the totality of the massif of Nimba located in Guinea and the Côte d'Ivoire. Today, the Reserve covers an area of about 17,540 ha of which 12,540 ha in Guinea and 5,000 ha in Côte d'Ivoire. The part of the massif located on

the territory of Liberia is greatly degraded due to former mining activities. The property therefore includes the necessary sufficient habitats to sustain its integrity.

In the Guinean part, an enclave where mining has occurred is directly adjacent to the property. Even if this exploitation is technically outside the property, it remains questionable as to whether it may be worked without affecting the integrity of this property.

Protection and management requirements

Since 1944, Mount Nimba enjoys the status of strict protection in its northern part – today shared between Guinea and Côte d'Ivoire. The Reserve is clearly delineated by its natural boundaries (water ways) recognized and respected by the neighbouring populations. In Côte d'Ivoire, its status has been strengthened by Law 2002-102 of 11 February 2002 that confers the quality of public domain inalienable to the State. All the land rights of the Reserve are now the exclusive property of the State and any installation of human activity is prohibited. In addition to the legal framework, the Ivorian State has established a reinforced institutional framework that decentralises certain administrative functions to the Ivorian Office of Parks and Reserves (OIPR) by decree No. 2002-359 of 24 July 2002 and to the Foundation for Parks and Reserves (FPRCI) to seek permanent funding.

With regard to Guinea, the 1944 status remains the legal basis for protection. It is important that this protection is transcribed in Guinean law by means of a legal process. The administration of the Reserve is assured by a public establishment of administrative and scientific character (Centre for the Management of the Environment of Mount Nimba-Simandou (CEGENS)) under the responsibility of the Ministry of Environment, Water and Forests and Sustainable Development. The Guinean part was pronounced Biosphere Reserve in 1980.

The massif is threatened by increased pressure adjacent to the boundaries of the site, caused by the neighbouring populations and increased demographic pressure. Although the natural forests that cover the slopes of Nimba have not suffered much damage, on the contrary, the fauna has been the subject of very intense poaching.

The need for land for agriculture and cattle breeding has strengthened the traditional practice of clearing by fire. These anthropic fires occur regularly in the protected area, constituting an important administrative challenge. The participation of the neighbouring population in conservation measures is indispensable to remedy these problems.

Surveillance of the property must be assured to dissuade the practices that damage its integrity. Also, the capacities of the management authorities must be reinforced both at the technical and human resource levels as well as the financial means.

4. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 63)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Virunga National Park is unique with its active chain of volcanoes and rich diversity of habitats that surpass those of any other African park. Its range contains an amalgamation of steppes, savannas and plains, marshlands, low altitude and afro-montane forest belts to unique afro-alpine vegetation and permanent glaciers and snow on Monts Rwenzori whose peaks culminate in 5000 m height. The property includes the spectacular massifs of Rwenzori and Virunga Mountains containing the two most active volcanoes of Africa. The wide diversity of habitats produces

exceptional biodiversity, notably endemic species and rare and globally threatened species such as the mountain gorilla.

Criterion (vii): Virunga National Park offers the most spectacular montane landscapes in Africa. Mt Rwenzori with its jagged reliefs and snowy summits, their cliffs and steep valleys, and the volcanoes of the Virunga massif covered with an afro-alpine vegetation of tree ferns and Lobelia and their slopes covered by dense forests, are the places of exceptional natural beauty. The volcanoes, which erupt at regular intervals every few years, constitute the dominant land features of the outstanding landscape. The Park presents several other spectacular panoramas like the eroded valleys in the Sinda and Ishango regions. The Park also contains important concentrations of wildlife, notably elephants, buffalo and Thomas cobs, and the largest concentration of hippopotamuses in Africa, with 20,000 individuals living on the banks of Lake Edward and along the Rwindi, Rutshuru and Semliki Rivers.

Criterion (viii): Virunga National Park is located in the centre of the Albertine Rift, of the Great Rift Valley. In the southern part of the Park, tectonic activity due to the extension of the earth's crust in this region has caused the emergence of the Virunga massif, comprising eight volcanoes, seven of which are located, totally or partially, in the Park. Among them, are the two most active volcanoes of Africa – Nyamuragira and nearby Nyiragongo - which between them are responsible for two-fifths of the historic volcanic eruptions on the African continent and which are characterized by the extreme fluidity of the alkaline lava. The activity of Nyiragongo is of world importance as a witness to volcanism of a lava lake: the bottom of its crater is in fact filled by a lake of quasi permanent lava that empties periodically with catastrophic consequences for the local communities. The northern sector of the Park includes about 20% of the massif of Monts Rwenzori – the largest glacial region of Africa and the only true alpine mountain chain of the continent. It borders the Rwenzori Mountains National Park of Uganda, inscribed as World Heritage, with which it shares the 'Pic Marguerite', third highest summit of Africa (5,109 m).

Criterion (x): Due to its variations in altitude (from 680 m to 5,109 m), rainfall and nature of the ground, Virunga National Park possesses a very wide diversity of plants and habitats, making it the top African National Park for biological diversity. More than 2,000 premier plant species have been identified, of which 10% are endemic to the Albertine Rift. The afro-montane forests represent about 15% of the vegetation. The Rift Albertine also contains more endemic vertebrate species than any other region of the African continent and the Park possesses numerous examples of them. The Park contains 218 mammal species, 706 bird species, 109 reptile species and 78 amphibian species. It also serves as refuge to 22 primate species of which three are the great ape – mountain gorilla (*Gorilla beringei beringei*), the eastern plain gorilla (*Gorilla beringei graueri*) and the eastern chimpanzee (*Pan troglodytes schweinfurthi*), with a third of the world population of mountain gorillas. The savannah zones of the Park contain a diverse population of ungulates and the density of biomass of wildlife is one of the highest on the earth Planet (27.6 ton/km²). Among the ungulates, there are certain rare animals such as the okapi (*Okapi johnstoni*), endemic to the Democratic Republic of the Congo, and the red forest duiker (*Cephalophus rubidus*), endemic to Monts Rwenzori. The Park also comprises important tropical zones essential for the wintering of Palearctic avifauna.

Integrity

The Park is characterized by a mosaic of extraordinary habitats that extend over 790,000 ha. The property is clearly delineated by the 1954 Ordinance. The wealth is well protected despite the economic and demographic challenges to its periphery.

The Park contains two highly important ecological corridors as it connects the different respective sectors: the Muaro corridor connects the Mikeno sector to the Nyamulagira sector; the west side connects the north sector to the centre sector of the Virunga massif. The presence of the Queen Elizabeth National Park, a protected area contiguous with Uganda, also constitutes an ecological land corridor connecting the centre and north sectors. Also, Lake Edward forms an important aquatic corridor.

Protection and management requirements

The property has benefited from the status of National Park since 1925. Its management authority is the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN) the body which has lost numerous agents killed on active service. The Park encounters management problems.

To assure the perpetuation in resource values of the property, the Park must be managed on a scientific basis and possess a management plan which will facilitate, among others, a better delineation of the different zones. Strengthened surveillance is required to assure the integrity of the Park boundaries. It would reduce poaching, deforestation, and pressure on the fishery resources (which risk increase), notably activities by isolated armed groups. To this end, the strengthening of staff and availability of equipment as well as the training of Park staff are of primary importance.

Improvement and strengthening of the administrative and surveillance infrastructures would contribute towards reducing the pressure on the rare and threatened species, such as the mountain gorilla, elephants, hippotomuses and chimpanzees. In view of the important increase in the populations, the establishment of buffer zones in all the sectors is indispensable and a matter of urgency. Another priority is to establish a Trust Fund to guarantee sufficient resources for the long-term protection and management of the property.

The promotion of a localised and controlled tourism could increase the income and contribute towards regular financing for the maintenance of the property.

5. Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 136)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Covering vast grass savannas and woodlands interspersed with gallery forests and marshland depressions, Garamba National Park is located in the north-eastern part of the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) in the transition zone between the dense tropical forests of the Congo Basin and the Guinea-Sudano savannas. It contains the last worldwide population of the northern white rhinoceros, endemic sub-species of Congolese giraffe and a mixed population of elephants, combining forest elephants, bush elephants and individuals demonstrating morphological characteristics common to the two elephant sub-species. It is also characterized by an exceptionally high level of biomass of great herbivores as a result of the vegetation productivity of the environment. Extending over 490,000 ha and surrounded by 752,700 ha of three hunting grounds that contribute to an effective protection of the property against threats from the adjacent area, this property is an outstanding sanctuary with its unusual mix of large spectacular mammals.

Criterion (vii): Garamba National Park and its neighbouring hunting grounds offers a vast area scattered with a dense network of small permanent springs that support an exceptionally high plant productivity and herbivore biomass. This biomass translates for example in the presence of large herds of elephants at certain periods of the year, sometimes herds of more than 550 individuals, an exceptional natural phenomenon.

Criterion (x): Garamba National Park contains the four largest land mammals in the world, the elephant, the rhinoceros, the giraffe and the hippopotamus. The northern white rhinoceros population is the last surviving population of this sub-species. In addition, the sub-species of the Congolese giraffe is also endemic to the Park. Located in the transition zone between the Guinean-Congo and Guinean-Sudanese endemism centres, the Park and the nearby hunting domains contain a particularly interesting biodiversity with species typical of the two biogeographical zones. In addition to the rhinoceros and the giraffe, the purely savannicole species include the lion, the spotted hyena and numerous species of antelope. Furthermore, the species typical of the forest include the bongo, the forest hog, the chimpanzee and five species of small diurnal primates. The Park is also one of the rare places in Africa where one can observe both the African forest elephant *Loxodonta africana cyclotis* and the African bush elephant *Loxodonta africana africana*, as well as hybrid elephants presenting morphological characteristics common to both sub-species. A very large population of African buffalo also display intermediary forms between the forest buffalo *Syncerus caffer nanus* and the savannah buffalo *Syncerus caffer aequinoctialis*.

Integrity

Garamba National Park is delineated to the east, south and west by major rivers that constitute natural and precise boundaries, recognized by all. To the north, it shares its boundaries with the Lantoto National Park in South Sudan, offering interesting possibilities of protection on the transfrontier and regional level. In a virgin landscape, no human presence or installations were indicated in the Park at the time of the nomination and the peripheral population was sparse. Garamba National Park is surrounded by three large contiguous hunting grounds, constituting an ecosystem of a sufficiently extensive area (1,242,700 ha) to support vast populations of large mammals with their local seasonal migration routes. The hunting grounds contribute towards the effective protection of the property against the threats from the surrounding zone. Their value is primordial, particularly for the seasonal movement of elephants and for the maintenance of viable populations of bush species.

Protection and management requirements

Garamba National Park has had the status of National Park since 1938 under the management authority of the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN). It is managed by the three administrative sectors of Nagero, Gangala na Bodio and Beredwa at the northern limit, each having buildings and road infrastructures. The establishment of a management plan is an indispensable condition in the management of the Park, given the importance of these hunting grounds for the integrity of the property, they should benefit from an integrated management with the Park.

It is essential that the integration of the local communities in the management of the Park and the peripheral hunting grounds, through a community conservation approach, be established through the participatory management of natural resources.

Surveillance is ensured by the guards through patrols in the three hunting grounds as well as in the Park, in liaison with regular aerial patrols of all these zones. The tourism aspect has been developed and the possibility, unique in Africa, of tourism on elephant back existed; this activity could be revived once the security situation is more stable.

Partnerships with international bodies and sufficient fund-raising for an effective conservation of the property should also be reinforced, ideally including the creation of a Trust Fund.

6. Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 137)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Straddling the Albertine Rift and the Congo Basin, Kahuzi-Biega National Park is an exceptional habitat for the protection of the rainforest and the eastern lowland gorillas, *Gorilla berengei graueri*. Extending over 600,000 ha, are dense lowland rainforests as well as Afro-montane forests, with bamboo forests and some small areas of sub-alpine prairies and heather on Mounts Kahuzi (3,308 m) and Biega (2,790 m).

The Park contains a flora and fauna of exceptional diversity, making it one of the most important sites in the Rift Albertine Valley, it is also one of the ecologically richest regions of Africa and worldwide. In particular, the most important world population of eastern lowland gorillas (or de Grauer), sub-species endemic to the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC) and listed under the *endangered* category on the IUCN Red Data Book, uses the mosaic of habitats found in the property.

Criterion (x): Kahuzi-Biega National Park contains a greater diversity of mammal species than any other site in the Albertine Rift. It is the second most important site of the region for both endemic species and in terms of specific diversity. The Park protects 136 species of mammals, among which the star is the eastern lowland gorilla and thirteen other primates, including threatened species such as the chimpanzee, the colubus bai and cercopiuthic of Hoest and Hamlyn. Other extremely rare species of the eastern forests of the DRC are also found, such as the giant forest genet (*Genetta victoriae*) and the aquatic genet (*Genetta piscivora*). Characteristic mammals of the central African forests also live in the Park, such as the bush elephant, bush buffalo, hylochere and bongo.

The property is located in an important endemism zone (Endemic Bird Area) for birds identified by Birdlife International. The Wildlife Conservation Society established a complete list of birds in the Park in 2003 with 349 species, including 42 endemic. Also, the Park was designated as a centre of diversity for plants by IUCN and WWF in 1994, with at least 1,178 inventoried species in the highland zone, although the lowland yet remains to be recorded. The Park is one of the rare sites of sub-Saharan Africa where the floral and fauna transition from low to highlands is observable. In effect, it includes all the stages of forest vegetation from 600 m to more than 2,600 m, dense low and middle altitude rainforests to sub-mountain to mountain and bamboo forests. Above 2,600 m at the summit of Mounts Kahuzi and Biega, a sub-alpine vegetation has developed, with heather, and home to the endemic plant *Senecio kahuzicus*. The Park also contains plant formations, rare worldwide, such as the swamp and bog altitudes and the marshland and riparian forests on hydromorphic ground at all altitudes.

Integrity

The forests of the property are characterized by continuous vegetation from the summit of the mountains to the lowland regions. A corridor connects a highland zone of 60,000 ha to a lowland sector of 540,000 ha. The area of the property is considered as sufficient to maintain its fauna. Maintenance of the sustainability of the vegetation is essential to avoid the fragmentation of animal populations, in particular the large mammals.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by the National Park legal status and managed by the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN). A management and surveillance structure is present. A management plan should be finalized and approved.

Although the greater part of the property is inhabited, some villages were included in the Park at the time of its extension in 1975, creating disputes with the populations. These problems must be resolved to strengthen the effectiveness of conservation actions.

The boundaries of the property should also be clearly delineated, especially where there are no evident natural boundaries. This is particularly important both in the lowlands and the key corridor connecting the high and low biographic regions of the Park.

The highland sector is crossed by a national road with minimal traffic. The control of the traffic flow is important to avoid an impact on the populations of threatened species in this sector, notably the gorillas.

At the time of the inscription of the property in 1980, challenges of protection and management had been highlighted, including the economic problems that have caused a serious reduction in the effectiveness of the management and necessary protection to guarantee the survival of species in the Park and the sustainability of its ecosystems. It was also noted that because of logistical problems large areas of the Park were only rarely observed, even never visited by the under-staffed guards, and poaching has since increased.

Political instability in the region, provoking the displacement of thousands of people, represents a very serious threat to the integrity of the property, resources and populations of large mammals in the Park have declined dramatically. The Park does not have a designated buffer zone, supporting cooperation of the neighbour populations in the conservation of the property is one of the principal tasks of management, in particular in the zones of heavy human density.

Another key challenge is that of the control of poaching and artisanal oil exploration in the former extraction sites. Hunting of wild game for bush meat as well as the conversion of habitats are considered the consequence of the presence of numerous miners in the Park. With the financial and human resources being insufficient, it becomes imperative to obtain additional means to strengthen the effectiveness of management including, ideally, the creation of a Trust Fund.

7. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 280)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

At the heart of the central basin of the River Congo, Salonga National Park is the largest protected area of dense rainforest on the African continent (when considering the two disjointed sectors of the Park). Very isolated and only accessible by water transport, this vast Park (3,600,000 ha) contains the important evolution of both species and communities in a forest area still relatively intact. Playing also the fundamental role for the climate regulation and the sequestration of carbon, it constitutes the habitat of numerous threatened species such as the pygmy chimpanzee (or bonobo), the bush elephant and the Congo peacock.

Criterion (vii): Salonga National Park represents one of the very rare existing biotopes absolutely intact in central Africa. Moreover, it comprises vast marshland areas and practically inaccessible gallery forests, which have never been explored and may still be considered as practically virgin.

Criterion (ix): The plant and animal life in Salonga National Park constitute an example of biological evolution and the adaptation of life forms in a complex equatorial rainforest environment. The large size of the Park ensures the continued possibility for evolution of both species and biotic communities within the relatively undisturbed forest.

Integrity

Salonga National Park, created in 1970, with an area of 3,334,600 ha, is divided into two sectors (North and South) by a corridor outside the Park of about forty km wide. The Park is one of the most extensive in the world and its area is sufficiently important to offer viable habitats to its fauna and flora. The fact that the Park is divided into two distinct sectors suggests that biological corridors must be foreseen in the unlisted portion between the two sectors, to create an ecological liaison between these two zones.

Roughly one third of the southern sector of the Park is occupied by groups of pygmies and a part of this occupied land is claimed by the local population. The boundaries of the property are intact due to the existence of major rivers that form recognized, precise and natural boundaries and this despite the presence of some villages inside the Park.

Protection and management requirements

Salonga National Park is managed in accordance with Law 70-318 of 30 November 1970 and Law 69-041 of 28 August 1969, relating to nature conservation. It has six administrative sectors: Monkoto, Mondjoku, Washikengo, Yoketelu, Anga and Mundja that do not yet have any consequential infrastructure.

The management authority is the Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation (ICCN). The Park requires a management plan, even although a Coordination Committee for the site (COCOSI) exists and at least once a year reunites the partners supporting the site, the site chief and his collaborators.

At the time of inscription, it was noted that Salonga National Park suffered from pressures such as poaching and the removal of vegetation by the local populations. A management structure, sufficient qualified staff and a management plan are lacking. The future of the Park cannot be assured without a strengthening of both the management structure and available financial means.

Among the management problems requiring long-term attention are poaching using traditional methods, and more recently by the military with modern war weapons; pressure and human occupation by the Yaelima in the southern part and by the Kitawalistes in the northern area (with accompanying impacts, such as fire, deforestation for the sowing of food crops, logging for heating purposes, honey gathering and the building of pirogues); dispute of the Park boundaries by populations in certain areas; commercial traffic in bush meat; forestry exploitation by individuals in the southern part; and pollution of the Park waters with toxic products used for illicit fishing.

The integration of local communities established in the unlisted corridor between the two sectors of the Park is an important condition and must be implemented by means of participatory management of the natural resources.

Surveillance is assured by the guards by means of regular patrols and it is necessary to guarantee that the numbers are increased over the long-term to effectively monitor and manage the very vast areas of difficult access.

The partnership with international bodies and the seeking of sufficient funds for the effective conservation of the property must also be reinforced, ideally including the creation of a Trust Fund.

8. Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 718)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Okapi Wildlife Reserve contains flora of outstanding diversity and provides refuge to numerous endemic and threatened species, including one-sixth of the existing Okapi population. The Reserve protects one-fifth of the Ituri forest, a Pleistocene refuge dominated by dense evergreen « Mbau » and humid semi-evergreen forests, combined with swamp forests that grow alongside the waterways, and clearings called locally « edos » and inselbergs.

Criterion (x): With its bio-geographical location, wealth of biotopes and the presence of numerous species that are rare or absent in the adjacent low altitude forests, it is probable that the Ituri forest served, during earlier drier climatic periods, as refuge for the tropical rainforest. To the north of the Reserve, the granite rocky outcrops, provide refuge to a plant species particularly adapted to this microclimate, characterised by numerous endemic species such as the Giant Cycad (*Encephalocarpus ituriensis*).

The Reserve contains 101 mammal species and 376 species of documented birds. The population of the endemic species of Okapi (*Okapia johnstoni*), a forest giraffe, is estimated at 5,000 individuals. Among the endemic mammals of the forest in the north-east of the DRC identified in the Reserve, are the aquatic genet (*Osbornictis piscivora*) and the giant genet (*Genetta victoriae*). The Reserve provides refuge to 17 species of primates (including 13 diurnal and 4 nocturnal), the highest number for an African forest, including 7,500 chimpanzees (*Pan troglodytes*).

The Reserve also contains one of the most diverse populations of forest ungulates with 14 species, including six types of cephalophus. It also provides refuge to the largest population of forest elephants (*Loxodonta africana cyclotis*) still present in eastern DRC, estimated at 7,500 individuals, and it is important for the conservation of other forest species such as the bongo (*Tragelaphus eurycerus*), the dwarf antelope (*Neotragus batesi*), the water chevrotain (*Hyemoschus aquaticus*), the forest buffalo (*Syncerus caffer nanus*) and the giant forest hog (*Hylochoerus meinertzhageni*). It is also documented as one of the most important protected areas in Africa for the conservation of birds, with the presence of numerous emblematic species such as the Congo Peafowl (*Afropavo congensis*), as well as numerous endemic species in eastern DRC.

Integrity

The forests of the Reserve are among the best preserved in the Congo Basin and its area is considered sufficient to maintain its wildlife. The Reserve is part of a larger forestry area, that of Ituri, which remains almost untouched by logging and agricultural activities.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected under a Wildlife Reserve statute. The Reserve contains a large indigenous population, the Mbuti and Efe pygmies, and the forest ecosystem is essential for both their economic and cultural requirements. A management plan covering three management areas in the Reserve has been proposed.

This includes a fully protected core zone of 282,000 ha comprising 20% of the Reserve where all hunting is prohibited, and an area of 950,000 ha for traditional use, where self-regulated hunting, using traditional methods, is authorized to cover the basic needs of the human population of the Reserve in forest products. Permanent installations and agricultural clearing are authorized in the 18,000 ha development area that comprises a narrow band on each side of the No. 4 national road crossing through the central part of the Reserve, and along a secondary road that links Mambasa to Mungbere, at the eastern border of the property. There are plans to make the whole protected area a national park. A buffer zone of 50 km wide has been defined around the entire Reserve.

The primary management challenges facing this Reserve are immigration control in the development area, prohibition of agricultural encroachment within the 10 km wide strip located along the road, and ensuring of the involvement of the indigenous populations, Mbuti and Efe pygmies, in the management of the Reserve. Another key challenge concerns the control of commercial poaching and artisanal mining. While the Reserve benefits from support from various NGOs and additional funding, it is imperative to obtain human and logistical resources to ensure the effective management of the property and its buffer zone.

9. Simien National Park (Ethiopia) (N 9)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Simien National Park, in northern Ethiopia is a spectacular landscape, where massive erosion over millions of years has created jagged mountain peaks, deep valleys and sharp precipices dropping some 1,500 m. The park is of global significance for biodiversity conservation because it is home to globally threatened species, including the iconic *Walia ibex*, a wild mountain goat found nowhere else in the world, the Gelada baboon and the Ethiopian wolf.

Criterion (vii): The property's spectacular landscape is part of the Simien mountain massif, which is located on the northern limit of the main Ethiopian plateau and includes the highest point in Ethiopia, Ras Dejen. The undulating plateau of the Simien mountains has over millions of years been eroded to form precipitous cliffs and deep gorges of exceptional natural beauty. Some cliffs reach 1,500 m in height and the northern cliff wall extends for some 35 km. The mountains are bounded by deep valleys to the north, east and south, and offer vast vistas over the rugged-canyon like lowlands below. The spectacular scenery of the Simien mountains is considered to rival Colorado's Grand Canyon.

Criterion (x): The property is of global significance for biodiversity conservation. It forms part of the Afroalpine Centre of Plant Diversity and the Eastern Afrotropical biodiversity hotspot, and it is home to a number of globally threatened species. The cliff areas of the park are the main habitat of the Endangered *Walia ibex* (*Capra walie*), a wild mountain goat which is endemic to the Simien Mountains. Other flagship species include the Endangered Ethiopian wolf (or Simien fox, *Canis simensis*), considered to be the rarest canid species in the world and the Gelada baboon (*Theropithecus gelada*), both of which are endemic to the Ethiopian highlands and depend on Afroalpine grasslands and heathlands. Other large mammal species include the Anubis baboon, Hamadryas baboon, klipspringer, and golden jackal. The park is also an Important Bird Area that forms part of the larger Endemic Bird Area of the Central Ethiopian Highlands. In total, over 20 large mammal species and over 130 bird species occur in the park. The mountains are home to 5 small mammal species and 16 bird species endemic to Eritrea and/or Ethiopia as well as an important population of the rare lammergeyer, a spectacular vulture species. The park's richness in species and habitats is a result of its great altitudinal, topographic and climatic diversity, which have shaped its Afrotropical and Afroalpine ecosystems.

Integrity

The property was established in an area inhabited by humans and, at the time of inscription, 80% of the park was under human use of one form or another. Threats to the integrity of the park include human settlement, cultivation and soil erosion, particularly around the village of Gich; frequent fires in the tree heather forest; and excessive numbers of domestic stock. Agricultural and pastoral activities, including

both cultivation of a significant area of the property and grazing of a large population of animals in particular have severely affected the natural values of the property, including the critical habitats of the Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf. The boundaries of the property include key areas essential for maintaining the scenic values of the property. However, they do not encompass all the areas necessary to maintain and enhance the populations of the Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf, and a proposal to revise and extend the park boundaries was put forward in the original nomination. Whilst human settlements threaten the integrity of the originally inscribed property, two proposed extensions of the national park (the Masarerya and the Limalimo Wildlife Reserves, and also the Ras Dejen mountain and Silki-Kidis Yared sectors) and their interlinking corridors are free of human settlement and cultivation, and support the key species that are central parts of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. Several assessments have considered that an extension of the property to match extended boundaries of the National Park, which to include areas with negligible human population are an essential requirement to maintain its Outstanding Universal Value.

Protection and management requirements

The national park was established in 1969 and is recognised and protected under national protected areas legislation. The property requires an effective management presence and the maintenance and increasing of staff levels and training. Key tasks for the management of the park include the effective protection of the park's flagship species and close cooperation with local communities in order to reduce the pressure on the park's resources arising from agricultural expansion, livestock overstocking and overharvesting of natural resources. The pressures on the property are likely to increase further as a result of global climate change.

Significant financial support is needed for the management of the park, and the development of alternative livelihood options for local communities. The development, implementation, review and monitoring of a management plan and the revision and extension of the park boundaries, with the full participation of local communities, is essential. Community partnership is particularly important to both reduce community dependence on unsustainable use of the resources of the national park, and also to develop sustainable livelihoods. Adequate finance to support resettlement of populations living in the property, on a fully voluntary basis, and to introduce effective management of grazing is also essential to reduce the extreme pressure on wildlife. Improving and increasing ecotourism facilities, without impairing the park's natural and scenic values, has great potential to create additional revenue for the property. Environmental education and training programmes are also needed to support communities in and around the property as well as to maintain community support and partnership in the management of the property in order to ensure it remains of Outstanding Universal Value.

10. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 31 COM 8B.9)

Brief synthesis

The Rainforests of the Atsinanana are a serial property comprising six components. They contain globally outstanding biodiversity and have an exceptional proportion of endemic plant and animal species. The level of endemism within the property is approximately 80 to 90 percent for all groups, and endemic families and genera are common. The serial property comprises a representative selection of the most important habitats of the unique rainforest biota of Madagascar, including many threatened and endemic plant and animal species.

Criterion (ix): The Rainforests of the Atsinanana are relict forests, largely associated with steeper terrain along the eastern escarpment and mountains of Madagascar. The protected areas included in this serial property have become critically important for maintaining ongoing ecological processes necessary for the survival of Madagascar's unique biodiversity. This biodiversity reflects Madagascar's geological history and geographic placement. It is the world's fourth largest island and has been separated from all other land masses for at least 60-80 million years and thus most of its plant and animal life has evolved in isolation. These forests have also offered important refuge for species during past periods of climate change and will be essential for the adaptation and survival of species in the light of future climate change.

Criterion (x): The level of endemism within the property is approximately 80 to 90 percent for all groups, and endemic families and genera are common. Madagascar is among the top countries known for their "megadiversity" and features an extraordinarily high number (circa 12,000) of endemic plant species. The property is also globally significant for fauna, especially primates, with all five families of Malagasy primates, all endemic lemur families, seven endemic genera of Rodentia, six endemic genera of Carnivora, as well as several species of Chiroptera represented. Of the 123 species of non-flying mammals in Madagascar (72 of which are on the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species), 78 occur within the property. The critical importance of the property is underlined by the fact that deforestation has left eastern Madagascar with only 8.5 percent of its original forests and the property protects key areas of this remaining habitat.

All components of the serial property are formally protected as national parks and have management plans in place. Key management issues include effective control of agricultural encroachment and resource exploitation from logging, hunting, and gem mining. These issues require the implementation of clear and coordinated management strategies to manage the components of this serial property as a single entity. Also, coordinated planning and management of this serial property with adjacent protected areas and forest corridors is required, for which additional financial and human resources need to be obtained. There is potential for further extension of the property to include adjacent protected areas and forest corridors once they meet the conditions of integrity.

11. Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger) (N 573)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves is one of the largest protected areas in Africa, covering 7,736,000 hectares. It is the last bastion of Saharo-Sahelian wildlife in Niger. It comprises two main zones: the mountain massifs of Air rising up to 2000 m in altitude and the vast plain of the Ténéré desert. In the heart of a desert environment, the Air represents a small pocket of Sahelian plant life with Sudanese and Saharo-Mediterranean elements.

Criterion (vii): The Air constitutes a Sahelian enclave surrounded by a Saharian desert, thus forming a remarkable assemblage of relict ecosystems combined with mountain and plain landscapes of outstanding esthetic value and interest. The live dunes of the Ténéré rapidly modify the landscape through displacement and deposition of sand. The region contains the blue marble mountains that represent an exceptional aesthetic interest.

Criterion (ix): The Reserve of Aïr and Ténéré is the last bastion of Saharo-Sahlien wildlife in Niger. The isolation of the Aïr and the very minor human presence are the reasons for the survival in this region of numerous wildlife species that have been eliminated from other regions of the Sahara and the Sahel. The property contains a wide variety of habitats (living dunes, fixed dunes, stoney gravel desert, cliff valleys, canyons, high plateaus, water holes, etc.) necessary for the conservation of the Saharo Sahelian biological diversity.

Criterion (x): The property contains important natural habitats for the survival of the three antelopes of the Sahara Desert on IUCN's Red List of threatened species: the Dorcas gazelle (*Gazella dorcas dorcas*); the Leptocere gazelle (*Gazella leptoceros*); and the Addax (screw-horn antelope) (*Addax nasomaculatus*). About a sixth of the Reserve benefits from the statute of sanctuary for the protection of the Addax. The property contains important populations of species of ungulates of the Sahara and species of carnivore such as the fennec fox, Rüppells fox, and the cheetah. The massif of the Aïr also constitutes a transit zone for a large number of afrotropical and palaearctic migratory birds. In total, 40 species of mammals, 165 species of birds, 18 species of reptiles and one amphibian species have been identified in the Reserve. As concerns the flora, the steppe contains species of *Acacia ehrenbergiana*, *Acacia raddiana*, *Balanites aegyptiaca*, *Maerua crassifolia*, and at lower altitudes species of *Panicum turgidum* and *Stipagrostis vulnerans*. In the larger valleys where water in the alluvial reservoirs is plentiful, a very specific habitat has developed associating a dense ligneous stratum of doum palms, date palms, *Acacia nilotica*, *Acacia raddiana*, *Boscia senegalensis*, *Salvadora persica*, and a herbaceous stratum with among others, *Stipagrostis vulnerans*.

Integrity

The property is one of the largest protected areas in Africa covering a surface of 7,736,000 ha. Its central part (1,280,500ha) is listed as a strict reserve (Addax Sanctuary). As the desert species are found in very low densities, this large size is essential for their survival. In the boundaries of the Aïr mountains and the Ténéré desert, the boundaries are marked at all the principal entry points. An extension in the south-west to include a site for wildlife under certain rainfall conditions and to take into account a migration of Addax south-east to the Mt Termit region is under consideration.

Protection and management requirements

The property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 1992 due to political instability and dissension among the populations. The property benefits from legal protection and satisfactory management, with technical and financial support from the State and development partners. It does not have a management plan. Hunting and exploitation of wood products are forbidden in the Reserve; and access to the Addax Sanctuary is also strictly forbidden. Poaching and illegal grazing are the main threats that endanger the property. These threats are finding the beginnings of a solution with surveillance and awareness raising activities but much remains to be done to completely eliminate them. To minimize these problems, the physical presence of the management authorities in the Reserve needs to be strengthened; the respective land-use rights and access to resources by the local populations requires clarification, monitoring and surveillance of the property needs to be improved to combat the problems of poaching and the illegal extraction of natural resources and halt the collection of wood and haulm in the property for commercial purposes. The sustainable development and conservation of this property requires the strengthening of financial and technical support from the State and the development partners, in order to establish a development and management plan for the site, for efficient implementation a framework for inter-communal concertation, and to agree on the co-

management of the natural resources of the property by the State and the concerned communities.

12. Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal) (N 153)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Located in the Sudano-Guinean zone, Niokolo-Koba National Park is characterized by its group of ecosystems typical of this region, over an area of 913 000ha. Watered by large waterways (the Gambia, Sereko, Niokolo, Koulountou), it comprises gallery forests, savannah grass floodplains, ponds, dry forests -- dense or with clearings -- rocky slopes and hills and barren Bowés. This remarkable plant diversity justifies the presence of a rich fauna characterized by: the Derby Eland (the largest of African antelopes), chimpanzees, lions, leopards, a large population of elephants as well as many species of birds, reptiles and amphibians.

Criterion (x): Niokolo-Koba National Park contains all the unique ecosystems of the Sudanese bioclimatic zone such as major waterways (the Gambia, Sereko, Niokolo, Koulountou), gallery-forests, herbaceous savanna floodplains, ponds, dry forests -- dense or with clearings-- rocky slopes and hills and barren Bowés. The property has a remarkable diversity of wildlife, unique in the sub-region. It counts more than 70 species of mammals, 329 species of birds, 36 species of reptiles, 20 species of amphibians and a large number of invertebrates. Lions, reputedly the largest in Africa, are a special attraction, as well as the Derby Eland, the largest antelope in existence. Other important species are also present, such as the elephant, leopard, African wild dog and chimpanzee. The wealth of habitats should be noted, along with the diversity of flora, with over 1,500 important plant species.

Integrity

Covering nearly one million hectares, the Niokolo-Koba National Park is sufficiently vast as to illustrate the major aspects of the Guinean savanna-type ecosystem, and to ensure the survival of species therein. However, reports indicate a considerable poaching of elephants. The proposed dams on the Gambia and the Niokolo-Koba are also a concern because they would have disastrous consequences for the ecological integrity of the property.

Protection and management requirements

The park is managed by a management administration under the direct supervision of the State through the Ministry of Environment and Nature Protection and the National Parks Directorate. In 2002, a development and management plan was elaborated. This plan should be kept up to date through regular revisions to strengthen the conservation of the property, and provided with adequate resources to ensure its effective implementation.

The property, inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 2007, is subject to many pressures such as poaching, bush fires, the premature drying up of ponds and their invasion by plants. To this must be added population growth and poor soil in the surrounds, which has led to encroachment on agricultural land and livestock wandering in the park. The priorities for the protection and management of the property are thus to implement urgent measures to halt poaching, improve the park's ecological monitoring programme, develop a plan for survival of endangered species, address premature drying up of the ponds and their invasion by plants or find alternative solutions, and minimize the illegal movement of livestock. It is also

necessary to improve cross-border cooperation and measures to protect buffer zones and ecological corridors outside the park. For the long-term management, protection of the property should be a national policy, project and budgetary priority, with the assistance of development partners.

ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

13. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) (N 1167)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document WHC 13/37COM/8E.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2004), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **28 COM 14B.5**):

Criterion (vii): The parks that comprise the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra are all located on the prominent main spine of the Bukit Barisan Mountains, known as the 'Andes of Sumatra'. Outstanding scenic landscapes abound at all scales. The mountains of each site present prominent mountainous backdrops to the settled and developed lowlands of Sumatra. The combination of the spectacularly beautiful Lake Gunung Tjueh (the highest lake in southeast Asia), the magnificence of the giant Mount Kerinci volcano, numerous small volcanic, coastal and glacial lakes in natural forested settings, fumaroles belching smoke from forested mountains and numerous waterfalls and cave systems in lush rainforest settings, emphasise the outstanding beauty of the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra.

Criterion (ix): The Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra represent the most important blocks of forest on the island of Sumatra for the conservation of the biodiversity of both lowland and mountain forests. This once vast island of tropical rainforest, in the space of only 50 years, has been reduced to isolated remnants including those centred on the three nominated sites. The Leuser Ecosystem, including the Gunung Leuser National Park, is by far the largest and most significant forest remnant remaining in Sumatra. All three parks would undoubtedly have been important climatic refugia for species over evolutionary time and have now become critically important refugia for future evolutionary processes.

Criterion (x): All three parks that comprise the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra are areas of very diverse habitat and exceptional biodiversity. Collectively, the three sites include more than 50% of the total plant diversity of Sumatra. At least 92 local endemic species have been identified in Gunung Leuser National Park. The nomination contains populations of both the world's largest flower (*Rafflesia arnoldi*) and the tallest flower (*Amorphophallus titanum*). The relict lowland forests in the nominated sites are very important for conservation of the plant and animal biodiversity of the rapidly disappearing lowland forests of South East Asia. Similarly, the montane forests, although less threatened, are very important for conservation of the distinctive montane vegetation of the property.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

14. Everglades National Park (United States of America) (N 76)

Statement of Significance (Decision 30 COM 11B)

Everglades National Park is the largest designated sub-tropical wilderness reserve on the North American continent. Its juncture at the interface of temperate and sub-tropical America, fresh and brackish water, shallow bays and deeper coastal waters creates a complex of habitats supporting a high diversity of flora and fauna. It contains the largest mangrove ecosystem in the Western Hemisphere, the largest continuous stand of sawgrass prairie and the most significant breeding ground for wading birds in North America.

Criterion (viii): The Everglades is a vast, nearly flat, seabed that was submerged at the end of the last Ice Age. Its limestone substrate is one of the most active areas of modern carbonate sedimentation.

Criterion (ix): The Everglades contains vast subtropical wetlands and coastal/marine ecosystems including freshwater marshes, tropical hardwood hammocks, pine rocklands, extensive mangrove forests, saltwater marshes, and seagrass ecosystems important to commercial and recreational fisheries. Complex biological processes range from basic algal associations through progressively higher species and ultimately to primary predators such as the alligator, crocodile, and Florida panther; the food chain is superbly evident and unbroken. The mixture of subtropical and temperate wildlife species is found nowhere else in the United States.

Criterion (x): Everglades National Park is a noteworthy example of viable biological processes. The exceptional variety of its water habitats has made it a sanctuary for a large number of birds and reptiles and it provides refuge for over 20 rare, endangered, and threatened species. These include the Florida panther, snail kite, alligator, crocodile, and manatee. It provides important foraging and breeding habitat for more than 400 species of birds, includes the most significant breeding grounds for wading birds in North America and is a major corridor for migration.

LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

15. Belize Barrier Reef System (Belize) (N 764)

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

16. Los Katíos National Park (Colombia) (N 711)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

17. Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras) (N 196)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

AFRICA

18. Timbuktu (Mali) (C 119 rev)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Located at the gateway to the Sahara desert, within the confines of the fertile zone of the Sudan and in an exceptionally propitious site near to the river, Timbuktu is one of the cities of Africa whose name is the most heavily charged with history.

Founded in the 5th century, the economic and cultural apogee of Timbuktu came about during the 15th and 16th centuries. It was an important centre for the diffusion of Islamic culture with the University of Sankore, with 180 Koranic schools and 25,000 students. It was also a crossroads and an important market place where the trading of manuscripts was negotiated, and salt from Teggah in the north, gold was sold, and cattle and grain from the south.

The Djingareyber Mosque, the initial construction of which dates back to Sultan Kankan Moussa, returning from a pilgrimage to Mecca, was rebuilt and enlarged between 1570 and 1583 by the Imam Al Aqib, the Qadi of Timbuktu, who added all the southern part and the wall surrounding the cemetery located to the west. The central minaret dominates the city and is one of the most visible landmarks of the urban landscape of Timbuktu.

Built in the 14th century, the Sankore Mosque was, like the Djingareyber Mosque, restored by the Imam Al Aqib between 1578 and 1582. He had the sanctuary demolished and rebuilt according to the dimensions of the Kaaba of the Mecca.

The Sidi Yahia Mosque, to the south of the Sankore Mosque, was built around 1400 by the marabout Sheik El Moktar Hamalla in anticipation of a holy man who appeared forty years later in the person of Cherif Sidi Yahia, who was then chosen as Imam. The mosque was restored in 1577-1578 by the Imam Al Aqib.

The three big Mosques of Djingareyber, Sankore and Sidi Yahia, sixteen mausoleums and holy public places, still bear witness to this prestigious past. The mosques are exceptional examples of earthen architecture and of traditional maintenance techniques, which continue to the present time.

Criterion (ii): The mosques and holy places of Timbuktu have played an essential role in the spread of Islam in Africa at an early period.

Criterion (iv): The three great mosques of Timbuktu, restored by the Qadi Al Aqib in the 16th century, bear witness to the golden age of the intellectual and spiritual capital at the end of the Askia dynasty.

Criterion (v): The three mosques and mausoleums are outstanding witnesses to the urban establishment of Timbuktu, its important role of commercial, spiritual and cultural centre on the southern trans-Saharan trading route, and its traditional characteristic construction techniques. Their environment has now become very vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change.

Integrity

The three mosques and the sixteen mausoleums comprising the property are a cliché of the former great city of Timbuktu that, in the 16th century, numbered 100,000 inhabitants. The vestiges of urban fabric are essential for their context. However, as indicated at the time of inscription of the property, rampant urbanization which is rife in Timbuktu, as in Djenné, is particularly threatening to the architecture, and the large

public squares and markets. Contemporary structures have made irretrievable breaches in the original parcelling and obviously exceed the scale of the traditional buildings. This process is ongoing and most recently a new very large institute was built on one of the public squares, compromising the integrity of the Sankore Mosque. Urban development pressures, associated with the lack of maintenance and flooding, resulting from the heavy rains, threaten the coherence and integrity of the urban fabric and its relation to the property.

The three mosques are stable but the mausoleums require maintenance, as they are fragile and vulnerable in the face of irreversible changes in the climate and urban fabric.

Authenticity

The three mosques retain their value in architectural terms, traditional construction techniques associated to present-day maintenance, and their use. However, the Sankore Mosque has lost a part of the public square that was associated with it following the construction of the new Ahmed Baba Centre. Following this construction, the status of the mosque in the urban context and part of its signification have been compromised and require review and reconsideration.

Overall, because of the threat from the fundamental changes to the traditional architecture and the vestiges of the old city, the mosques and mausoleums risk losing their capacity to dominate their environment and to stand as witnesses to the once prestigious past of Timbuktu.

Protection and management requirements

The site of Timbuktu has three fundamental management tools: a Revitalization and Safeguarding Plan of the Old Town (2005), and a Strategic Sanitary Plan (2005), that are being implemented despite certain difficulties; and a Conservation and Management Plan (2006-2010) is being implemented and which shall be reassessed shortly.

The management system of the property is globally appropriate as its legal protection is jointly assured by the community of Timbuktu through management committees of the mosques, the cultural Mission of Timbuktu and the Management and Conservation Committee of the Old Town of Timbuktu. This mechanism is strengthened by two practical functioning modalities, initiated in consultation with the World Heritage Centre: the Town Planning Regulation and the Conservation Manual. The specific long-term objectives are the extension of the buffer zone by approximately 500 m to assure the protection of the inscribed property ; the development of the historic square of Sankore to integrate corrective measures proposed by the Committee at its 33rd session and by the reactive monitoring mission of March 2010 ; the extension of the inscribed property to include the entire Timbuktu Medina ; the development of an integrated conservation and sustainable and harmonious management project for the site, in the wider framework of development of the urban commune and in close cooperation with the elected members of the Territorial Communities of Timbuktu and the development partners ; the active conservation of the mausoleums.

19. Tomb of Askia (Mali) (C 1139)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The Tomb of Askia is located in the town of Gao. The site comprises the following elements: the pyramidal tower, the two flat-roofed mosques, the necropolis and the

white stone square. The spectacular pyramidal structure was built by Askia Mohamed, Emperor of the Songhai Empire in 1495. The Tomb of Askia was built when Gao became the capital of the Empire and Islam was adopted as the official religion.

The Tomb of Askia is a magnificent example of how the local traditions have adapted to the exigences of Islam in creating an architectural structure unique across the West African Sahel. The Tomb is the most important and best conserved vestige of the powerful and rich Songhai Empire that extended through West Africa in the 15th and 16th centuries. Its value is also invested in its architectural tomb/minaret shape, its prayer rooms, its cemetery and its assembly space that have survived and are still in use. From the architectural perspective, the Tomb of Askia is an eminent example of Sudano-Sahelian style, characterized by rounded forms resulting in the regular renewal of the layer of plaster eroded each winter by the rare but violent rains. The pyramidal form of the tomb, its function as central minaret as well as the length and shape of the pieces of wood comprising the permanent scaffolding, give the Tomb of Askia its distinctive and unique architectural characteristics.

Criterion (ii) : The Tomb of Askia reflects the way the local building traditions, in response to Islamic needs, absorbed influences from North Africa to create a unique architectural style across the West African Sahel.

Criterion (iii): The Tomb of Askia is an important vestige of the Songhai Empire, which once dominated the Sahel lands of West Africa and controlled the lucrative trans-Saharan trade.

Criterion (iv): The Tomb of Askia reflects the distinctive architectural tradition of the West African Sahel and in particular the way buildings evolve over centuries through regular, traditional maintenance practices.

Integrity

The integrity of the site is fully intact with regard to all its components which remain visually, socially and culturally associated, first in the town of Gao where its elements are integrated into the architectural traditions and in the associated sites (Saneye, Gounzourey, Koima, Kankou Moussa Mosque), important elements for its interpretation.

Authenticity

The monument reflects the constructive culture of the local populations as regards earthen architecture, even if the necessary repairs regularly carried out have engendered some minor alterations. Reversible, these alterations (tin water spouts, cement stairways, other wooden scaffolding than the *hasu* – *Maerua crassifolia*) do not however detract from the authenticity of the site.

Protection and management requirements

The site belongs to the State. It was inscribed in 2003 on the National Heritage List of Mali and the buffer zone is officially recognized by municipal decree. The management of the site is the responsibility of an association created by the Prefect of Gao in 2002 and comprises representatives of all the principal stakeholders.

The Conservation and Management Plan of 2002-2007 was prepared in the framework of the Africa 2009 Programme, in cooperation with two experts from CRAterre-ENSAG (International Centre for Earthen Construction, Grenoble, France). Its implementation has enabled the improvement of the state of conservation and authenticity of the site, and the maintenance of its harmony with the urban fabric of Gao.

The long-term specific objectives for the conservation of the Tomb of Askia are the following: redevelop the surrounding wall to include the entire prayer area and assure

a better visibility of the site from the Askia Avenue and the prayer area; gradually improve the state of conservation and authenticity of the site while continuing traditional maintenance practices; assure the promotion of the site and its improved use as an educative and tourism resource.

20. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) (C 1022)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The Tombs of Buganda Kings constitute a site embracing 26.8 hectares of Kasubi hillside within Kampala City.

The site is the major spiritual centre for the Baganda where traditional and cultural practices have been preserved. The Kasubi Tombs are the most active religious place in the kingdom, where rituals are frequently performed. Its place as the burial ground for the previous four kings (Kabakas) qualifies it as a religious centre for the royal family, a place where the Kabaka and his representatives carry out important rituals related to Buganda culture. The site represents a place where communication links with the spiritual world are maintained.

Its spatial organization, starting from the border of the site marked with the traditional bark cloth trees, leading through the gatehouse, the main courtyard, and culminating in the large thatched building, housing the tombs of the four Kabakas, represents the best existing example of a Baganda palace/burial site.

At its core on the hilltop is the main tomb building, locally referred to as the "Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga" which is a masterpiece of this ensemble. A tomb building has been in existence since the 13th century. The latest building was the former palace of the Kabakas of Baganda, built in 1882 and converted into the royal burial ground in 1884. Four royal tombs now lie within the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga.

The main tomb building, which is circular and surmounted by a dome, is a major example of an architectural achievement that was raised with use of vegetal materials comprised of wooden poles, spear grass, reeds and wattle. Its unusual scale and outstanding details bear witness to the creative genius of the Baganda and as a masterpiece of form and craftsmanship, it is an exceptional surviving example of an architectural style developed by the powerful Buganda Kingdom since the 13th century.

The built and natural elements of the Kasubi Tombs site are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. The site is a major spiritual centre for the Baganda and is the most active religious place in the kingdom. The structures and the traditional practices that are associated with the site are one of the exceptional representations of the African culture that depict a continuity of a living tradition. The site's main significance lies in its intangible values of beliefs, spirituality, continuity and identity of the Baganda people. The site serves as an important historical and cultural symbol for Uganda and East Africa as a whole.

Criterion (i): The Kasubi Tombs site is a master piece of human creativity both in its conception and its execution.

Criterion (iii): The Kasubi Tombs site bears eloquent witness to the living cultural traditions of the Baganda.

Criterion (iv): The spatial organization of the Kasubi Tombs site represents the best extant example of a Baganda palace/architectural ensemble. Built in the finest

traditions of Ganda architecture and palace design, it reflects technical achievements developed over many centuries.

Criterion (vi): The built and natural elements of the Kasubi Tombs site are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. It is a major spiritual centre for the Baganda and is the most active religious place in the kingdom.

Integrity

The boundary of the land on which the tombs are located is clearly marked with the traditional bark cloth tree (*Ficus* sp.) and coincides with the 1882 traditional boundary. The live markers have been useful in keeping away land encroachers for housing construction and other developments, thus maintaining the original land size. The architectural palace design that comprise of the placement of the buildings, and tombs/ grave yards of members of the royal family around the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga reflecting the traditional palace structure is still being maintained in its original ensemble.

Although the recent fire tragedy, that destroyed the main tomb building, means that one key attribute is now missing, the cultural traditions associated with building in poles, spear grass, reeds and wattle are still vibrant and will allow the recreation of this tomb building.

The other traditional structures are still in place and the key attributes related to traditional ceremonial and religious practices and land tenure and land use practices are still being maintained.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the Tombs of the Kings of Buganda at Kasubi is reflected in the continuity of the traditional and cultural practices that are associated with the site. The original burial system of the Kabakas of Buganda is still being maintained. The placement of Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga in the middle of other buildings around the large central courtyard (Olugya), with a forecourt containing the drum house and entry gate house, are a typical ensemble of the Buganda Kingdom palace. The practice of using grass thatched roof resting on structural rings of palm tree fronds is still being maintained as well as the internal elements and finishing materials such as the long wooden poles wrapped in bark cloth decoration. Although the authenticity of the site has been weakened by the loss to the fire of the main tomb structure, the building's traditional architectural craftsmanship and the required skills are still available to allow it to be recreated. This factor, coupled with the extensive documentation of the building, will allow an authentic renewal of this key attribute.

Protection and management requirements

Managed by the Buganda Kingdom, the property was gazetted a protected site under Statutory Instrument No. 163 of 1972 and under Historical Monument Act (Act 22 of 1967). This legal status was further strengthened by the National Constitution (1995). The Historical Monument Act protects the Kasubi Tombs from residential encroachment or any other purpose inconsistent with its character. The land that hosts the Tombs is titled under the Land Act (1998). The land title is registered in trust of the Kabaka (King) on behalf of the Kingdom.

The protection of the site is further strengthened by the various Tourism Policies of Uganda. The site has an approved General Management Plan (2009 - 2015). A Site Manager is in place.

The greatest threat to the site is fire. There is a need to develop a detailed Risk Management Plan to address this threat, in particular, and to ensure that site documented is as complete as possible and securely stored.

In order to ensure that the traditional building processes associated with the site are maintained over time, there is an on-going need to train young educated people.

There is a need to ensure that the principles guiding the recreation of the main tomb building are agreed by all the key stakeholders - the UNESCO World Heritage Committee, the Buganda Kingdom and the Government of the Republic of Uganda, and that the process of recreating the building is systematic, based on evidence and adequately recorded.

21. Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Ruins of Songo Mnara (United Republic of Tanzania) (C 144)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Located on two islands close to each other just off the Tanzanian coast about 300km south of Dar es Salaam are the remains of two port cities, Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara. The larger, Kilwa Kisiwani, was occupied from the 9th to the 19th century and reached its peak of prosperity in the 13th and 14th centuries. In 1331-1332, the great traveler, Ibn Battuta made a stop here and described Kilwa as one of the most beautiful cities of the world.

Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara were Swahili trading cities and their prosperity was based on control of Indian Ocean trade with Arabia, India and China, particularly between the 13th and 16th centuries, when gold and ivory from the hinterland was traded for silver, carnelians, perfumes, Persian faience and Chinese porcelain. Kilwa Kisiwani minted its own currency in the 11th to 14th centuries. In the 16th century, the Portuguese established a fort on Kilwa Kisiwani and the decline of the two islands began.

The remains of Kilwa Kisiwani cover much of the island with many parts of the city still unexcavated. The substantial standing ruins, built of coral and lime mortar, include the Great Mosque constructed in the 11th century and considerably enlarged in the 13th century, and roofed entirely with domes and vaults, some decorated with embedded Chinese porcelain; the palace Husuni Kubwa built between c1310 and 1333 with its large octagonal bathing pool; Husuni Ndogo, numerous mosques, the Gereza (prison) constructed on the ruins of the Portuguese fort and an entire urban complex with houses, public squares, burial grounds, etc.

The ruins of Songo Mnara, at the northern end of the island, consist of the remains of five mosques, a palace complex, and some thirty-three domestic dwellings constructed of coral stones and wood within enclosing walls.

The islands of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara bear exceptional testimony to the expansion of Swahili coastal culture, the Islamisation of East Africa and the extraordinarily extensive and prosperous Indian Ocean trade from the medieval period up to the modern era.

Criterion (iii): Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara provide exceptional architectural, archaeological and documentary evidence for the growth of Swahili culture and commerce along the East African coast from the 9th to the 19th centuries, offering important insights regarding economic, social and political dynamics in this region.

The Great Mosque of Kilwa Kisiwani is the oldest standing mosque on the East African coast and, with its sixteen domed and vaulted bays, has a unique plan. Its true great dome dating from the 13th was the largest dome in East Africa until the 19th century.

Integrity

The key attributes conveying outstanding universal value are found on the islands of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara. However, two associated groups of attributes at Kilwa Kivinje, a mainly 19th century trading town, and Sanje Ya Kati, an island to the south of Kilwa where there are ruins covering 400 acres, including houses and a mosque that date to the 10th century or even earlier, are not included within the boundaries of the property.

The property is subject to invasion by vegetation and inundation by the sea, and vulnerable to encroachment by new buildings and agriculture activities that threaten the buried archaeological resources. The continued deterioration and decay of the property leading to collapse of the historical and archeological structures for which the property was inscribed, resulted in the property being placed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 2004.

Authenticity

The ability of the islands to continue to express truthfully their values has been maintained in terms of design and materials due to limited consolidation of the structures using coral stone and other appropriate materials, but is vulnerable, particularly on Kilwa Kisiwani to urban encroachment and coastal damage as these threaten the ability to understand the overall layout of the mediaeval port city. The ability of the sites to retain their authenticity depends on implementation of an ongoing conservation programme that addresses all the corrective measures necessary to achieve removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Protection and management requirements

The sites comprising the property are legally protected through the existing cultural resource policy (2008), Antiquities Law (the Antiquities Act of 1964 and its Amendment of 1979) and established Rules and Regulations. Both the Antiquities laws and regulations are currently being reviewed.

The property is administered under the authority of the Antiquities Division. A site Manager and Assistant Conservators are responsible for the management of the sites. A Management Plan was established in 2004 and is currently under revision. Key management issues include climate change impact due to increased wave action and beach erosion; encroachment on the site by humans and animals (cattle and goats); an inadequate conservation programme for all the monuments, and inadequate community participation and awareness of associated benefits.

Long term major threats to the site will be addressed and mechanisms for involvement of the community and other stakeholders will be employed to ensure the sustainable conservation and continuity of the site. There is a need for better zoning of the property for planning in order to ensure development and agricultural uses do not impact adversely on the structures and buried archaeology.

ARAB STATES

22. Abu Mena (Egypt) (C 90)

Compendium of the Statements of Significance and of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger and discussed for in-Danger Listing

WHC-13/37.COM/INF.7A, p. 29

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

23. Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq) (C 1130)

No Statement is available for this property.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2003), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **27 COM 8C.45**):

Criterion (iii): Founded in the 3rd millennium BCE, the most important role of Ashur was from the 14th to 9th century BCE when it was the first capital of the Assyrian empire. Ashur was also the religious capital of Assyrians, and the place for crowning and burial of its kings;

Criterion (iv): The excavated remains of the public and residential buildings of Ashur provide an outstanding record of the evolution of building practice from the Sumerian and Akkadian period through the Assyrian Empire, as well as including the short revival during the Parthian period.

24. Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq) (C 276 rev)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 31 COM 8B.23)

Brief synthesis

The ancient capital of Samarra dating from 836-892 provides outstanding evidence of the Abbasid Caliphate which was the major Islamic empire of the period, extending from Tunisia to Central Asia. It is the only surviving Islamic capital that retains its original plan, architecture and arts, such as mosaics and carvings. Samarra has the best preserved plan of an ancient large city, being abandoned relatively early and so avoiding the constant rebuilding of longer lasting cities.

Samarra was the second capital of the Abbasid Caliphate after Baghdad. Following the loss of the monuments of Baghdad, Samarra represents the only physical trace of the Caliphate at its height.

The city preserves two of the largest mosques (Al-Malwiya and Abu Dulaf) and the most unusual minarets, as well as the largest palaces in the Islamic world (the Caliphal Palace Qasr al-Khalifa, al-Ja'fari, al Ma'shuq, and others). Carved stucco known as the Samarra style was developed there and spread to other parts of the Islamic world at that time. A new type of ceramic known as Lustre Ware was also developed in Samarra, imitating utensils made of precious metals such as gold and silver.

Criterion (ii): Samarra represents a distinguished architectural stage in the Abbasid period by virtue of its mosques, its development, the planning of its streets and basins, its architectural decoration, and its ceramic industries.

Criterion (iii): Samarra is the finest preserved example of the architecture and city planning of the Abbasid Caliphate, extending from Tunisia to Central Asia, and one of the world's great powers of that period. The physical remains of this empire are usually poorly preserved since they are frequently built of unfired brick and reusable bricks.

Criterion (iv): The buildings of Samarra represent a new artistic concept in Islamic architecture in the Malwiya and Abu Dulaf mosques, in the form of a unique example

in the planning, capacity and construction of Islamic mosques by comparison with those which preceded and succeeded it. In their large dimensions and unique minarets, these mosques demonstrate the pride and political and religious strength that correspond with the strength and pride of the empire at that time.

Since the war in Iraq commenced in 2003, this property has been occupied by multi-national forces that use it as a theatre for military operations.

The conditions of integrity and authenticity appear to have been met, to the extent evaluation is possible without a technical mission of assessment. After abandonment by the Caliphate, occupation continued in a few areas near the nucleus of the modern city but most of the remaining area was left untouched until the early 20th century. The archaeological site is partially preserved, with losses caused mainly by ploughing and cultivation, minor in comparison with other major sites. Restoration work has been in accordance with international standards.

The boundaries of the core and buffer zones appear to be both realistic and adequate. Prior to current hostilities, the State Party protected the site from intrusions, whether farming or urban, under the Archaeological Law. Protective procedures have been in abeyance since 2003 and the principal risk to the property arises from the inability of the responsible authorities to exercise control over the management and conservation of the site.

25. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

No Statement is available for this property.

26. Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem (Palestine) (C 1433)

A provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value was adopted by the World Heritage Committee for this property in 2012 (see Decision **36 COM 8B.5**). The final Statement is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-13/37.COM/8B.Add*.

Provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8B.5)

Brief synthesis

Since at least the 2nd century AD people have believed that the place where the Church of the Nativity, Bethlehem, now stands is where Jesus was born. One particular cave, over which the first Church was built, is traditionally believed to be the Birthplace itself. In locating the Nativity, the place both marks the beginnings of Christianity and is one of the holiest spots in Christendom. The original basilica church of 339 AD (St Helena), parts of which survive below ground, was arranged so that its octagonal eastern end surrounded, and provided a view of, the cave. This church is overlaid by the present Church of the Nativity, essentially of the mid-6th century AD (Justinian), though with many later alterations. It is the oldest Christian church in daily use. Since early medieval times the Church has been increasingly incorporated into a complex of other ecclesiastical buildings, mainly monastic. As a result, today it is embedded in an extraordinary architectural ensemble, overseen by members of the Greek Orthodox Church, the Order of St Francis and the Armenian Church in a partnership (the *Status Quo*) established by the Treaty of Berlin (1878).

For most of the last 1500 years, Bethlehem and the Church of the Nativity have been, as is still very much the case, a pilgrim destination. The eastern end of the traditional route from Jerusalem to the Church is along what is now officially called the

Pilgrimage Route, that is, along Star Street, through the Damascus Gate, and along a short stretch of Paul VI Street and Manger Square. This route is still followed ceremonially each year by the Patriarchs of the three Churches at their several Christmases. The Christian Christmas, centred on Bethlehem, is the most widely-celebrated religious festivity in the world.

Criterion (iv): The Church of the Nativity is an outstanding example of an early church in a remarkable architectural ensemble which illustrates both a significant stage in human history in the 4th-6th centuries AD and in later stages up to the present century.

Criterion (vi): The Church of the Nativity, and the Pilgrimage Route to it, are directly associated with events and beliefs of outstanding universal significance. The city of Bethlehem is Holy to Christians as well as to Muslims. It is a strong symbol for more than 2 billion believers in the world.

Integrity

The integrity of the architectural ensemble embracing the Church of the Nativity and its neighbours is conceptually unimpaired and only physically diminished in relatively minor respects by modern additions. The immediate surroundings included in this nomination embrace a small area of land to the east and some other structures directly associated with the ensemble, an area known to contain as yet systematically unexamined and largely undisturbed evidence of occupation and burial from the early centuries AD back to at least the mid-2nd millennium BC. The approach to the Church via Star Street and Paul VI Street retains the street width and line fossilized by urban development since c. 1800 AD. This 'width and line', as well as defining a working street in a busy town, now formalize a commemorative route for a religious ceremony. For the purposes of this nomination, the significant historical and religious feature is this line in the urban fabric rather than the architectural and historical features of the individual buildings which collectively delimit that line. Nevertheless, a few buildings of earlier date still stand and the street is now mainly defined by facades of the 19th and 20th centuries. The general aspect, almost completely in pale yellow limestone, is attractive. Most of the buildings incorporate traditional design and appearance, for example with living accommodation above and workshops at street level opening out on to the street. Most importantly, the relatively few unsympathetic modern intrusions are along the south side of Paul VI Street and around Manger Square.

Authenticity

Located on the spot believed to be the Birthplace of Jesus Christ for some 2000 years, the Church of the Nativity is one of the most sacred Christian sites in the world. In relation to this outstanding fact the authenticity of the place is unquestionable. That has been enhanced by worship and pilgrimage to the site since at least the 4th century AD up to the present. The sanctity of the site is maintained by the three churches occupying it. The construction of the church in 339 AD above the grotto commemorates the birth and attests to seventeen hundred years-long tradition of belief that this grotto was indeed the birthplace of Jesus Christ.

Protection and management requirements

The Church of the Nativity is managed under the terms and provisions of the '*Status Quo*' currently supplemented by an advisory committee formed by the Palestinian President. Each of the three adjacent Convents is maintained under its own arrangement: the Armenian Convent is controlled by the Armenian Patriarchate in the

Holy City of Jerusalem; the Greek Orthodox Convent by the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate in the Holy City of Jerusalem; and the Franciscan Convent and the Church of St Catherine by the Custody of the Holy Land, Holy City of Jerusalem. The second main component, the Pilgrimage Route, principally Star Street, is part of the Municipality of Bethlehem and is therefore covered by the provisions of 'Building and Planning Law 30, 1996', of 'the 'Bethlehem Charter 2008', of the 'Guidelines for the Conservation and Rehabilitation of the Historic Towns of Bethlehem, Beit Jala and Beit Sahour, 2010, and of the 'General Rules for the Protection of the Historic Area and Historic Individual Buildings, Bethlehem, 2006'. 'Protection', 'Conservation', and 'Rehabilitation' are the stated objectives of the last two enactments, and the 'Charter', which is already working well in the Historic Town, embodies a statement of principles as well as working practices to achieve those objectives.

27. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Zabid is one of the coastal towns in Tehama area west of Yemen, sitting on a rise above the river junction and the fertile flood plain. It is a circular fortified town with four remaining gates, which was supplied with water by extensive canals. It was already flourishing when Islam was established in the region in the 7th century. Its development is due to Ibn Ziyad (the founder of the Zyadite dynasty), who was sent to the region by the Caliph al-Mamun in 820 AD to quell a rebellion.

The core of the town is its first mosque, Asa'ir. The Great Mosque lies to the west of the town to which spread the souq. Zabid has the highest concentration of mosques in Yemen, some 86 in all, mainly simple brick structures but some with elaborate carved brick and stucco decoration. Fourteen of these date to the Rasulid period - all of them madrasas - and are the largest group of buildings from this period in Yemen.

A network of narrow alleys spreads over the town and its vernacular buildings, typical of the southern Arabian Peninsula, give the town outstanding visual qualities. The houses, built of burnt brick, display similar plans with a reception room, murabba, opening onto an enclosed yard. The larger houses extend upwards to two or three storeys and have fine, elaborate interiors with skilfully carved brick walls, niches and ceilings.

The city with its narrow closed streets, traditional houses and minarets is an outstanding example of a homogeneous architectural ensemble that reflects the spatial characteristics of the early years of Islam. Around the town are cemeteries, notably the one to the north-west with a mosque, a well and shady trees.

Zabid played an important role in spreading Islam due to its Islamic university (the ancient mosques and madrasas which received students from all over the world to obtain Islamic knowledge and study different sciences (substantially developed by Muslim scientists contributing to the advancement of science).

Criterion (ii): Zabid is of outstanding archaeological and historical interest for its domestic and military architecture and for its urban plan (the only city in Yemen to be built harmonizing the typical Islamic town's layout with the central mosque and souq, together with houses providing privacy). Its architecture profoundly influenced that of the Yemeni coastal plain.

Criterion (iv): Zabid's domestic and military architecture, its urban and defensive fabric layout manifested in its wall remains, watchtowers and citadel, as well as indirect access make it an outstanding archaeological and historical site. The domestic architecture of Zabid is the most characteristic example of the Tihama style of courtyard house, which is to be found over a wide area of the southern part of the Arabian Peninsula.

Criterion (vi): The Historic Town of Zabid is strongly linked with the history of the spread of Islam in the early years of Hijra as demonstrated in the archaeological remains within the Alash'ar Mosque, associated with Al-Alash'ari, one of the Prophet Mohammad's companions, who built it to become the fifth mosque in Islam. Besides being the capital of Yemen from the 13th to the 15th centuries, the town played an important role in the Arab and Muslim world for many centuries in view of its being one of the significant centres spreading Islamic knowledge.

Integrity

The adequate size of the property represents all necessary elements and components of domestic and military architecture, its urban and defensive fabric layout, which make it an outstanding archaeological and historical site. However, the recent insertion of concrete buildings, the installation of an electricity system, with unsightly overhead cables, and the increasing use of modern materials such as concrete and corrugated steel sheeting, as well as open spaces invasion, are seriously eroding that integrity.

The visual and physical integrity of the property is so threatened by these new developments and encroachments that up to 40% of the structures are vulnerable. There is an urgent need to halt this decline and reverse the undesirable changes.

Authenticity

The attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value, such as the mosques, city layout and traditional buildings are highly vulnerable to decay, to change in the forms and materials of buildings, and to the spread of new, inconsistent developments to the northern and eastern sides of the city. Nevertheless, even though threatened, a certain degree of authenticity exists and could be augmented if the urban layout and traditional buildings are restored to enable the Outstanding Universal Value to be more adequately conveyed. There is an urgent need to reverse the downward trends.

Protection and management requirements

The Historic Town of Zabid is protected by the Antiquities Law of 1973. A Master Plan for the entire city has been approved in 2004 and an Urban Conservation Plan is currently under preparation. A Management Plan for the property will follow the preparation of the Urban Conservation Plan. The Law for the Preservation of Historic Cities will be agreed upon and enforced in the near future.

The authority in charge of the property is the GOPHCY (General Organisation for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen), established in 1990 with the aim of managing and safeguarding all the historic cities of Yemen.

Since 2007, the local branch of GOPHCY in Zabid has been reinforced, with the support of a project, managed by the German Technical Assistance (GTZ), that aims at addressing the city's severe decline and improve its overall physical, social and economic conditions, through running a housing rehabilitation programme and an infrastructure improvement project.

In order to be able to meet fully the requirements of the long term preservation and sustainability of the property, and in the medium term to reverse the downward trends,

that threaten its Outstanding Universal Value, GOPHCY will need considerable support, resources, capacity building, as well as technical and financial assistance.

ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

28. Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) (C 211 rev)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

At 1,900 m above sea level and far from any town, the Minaret of Jam rises within a rugged valley along the Hari-rud River at its junction with the river Jam around 215km-east of Herat. Rising to 65m from a 9m diameter octagonal base, its four superimposed, tapering cylindrical shafts are constructed from fired bricks. The Minaret is completely covered with geometric decoration in relief enhanced with a Kufic inscription in turquoise tiles. Built in 1194 by the great Ghurid Sultan Ghiyas-oddin (1153-1203), its emplacement probably marks the site of the ancient city of Firuzkuh, believed to have been the summer capital of the Ghurid dynasty. Surrounding remains include a group of stones with Hebrew inscriptions from the 11th to 12th centuries on the Kushkak hill, and vestiges of castles and towers of the Ghurid settlements on the banks of the Hari River as well as to the east of the Minaret.

The Minaret of Jam is one of the few well-preserved monuments representing the exceptional artistic creativity and mastery of structural engineering of the time. Its architecture and ornamentation are outstanding from the point of view of art history, fusing together elements from earlier developments in the region in an exceptional way and exerting a strong influence on later architecture in the region. This graceful soaring structure is an outstanding example of the architecture and ornamentation of the Islamic period in Central Asia and played a significant role in their further dissemination as far as India as demonstrated by the Qutb Minar, Delhi, begun in 1202 and completed in the early 14th century.

Criterion (ii): The innovative architecture and decoration of the Minaret of Jam played a significant role in the development of the arts and architecture of the Indian sub-continent and beyond.

Criterion (iii): The Minaret of Jam and its associated archaeological remains constitute exceptional testimony to the power and quality of the Ghurid civilization that dominated the region in the 12th and 13th centuries.

Criterion (iv): The Minaret of Jam is an outstanding example of Islamic architecture and ornamentation in the region and played a significant role for further dissemination.

Integrity

Since the building of the Minaret around eight hundred years ago, no reconstruction or extensive restoration work has ever taken place in the area. The archaeological vestiges were surveyed and recorded in 1957 when the remains were first discovered by archaeologists. Subsequent surveys and studies have led only to simple precautionary stabilization measures to the base of the Minaret. Thus, the attributes that express the Outstanding Universal Value of the site, not least the Minaret itself, other architectural forms and their setting in the landscape, remain intact within the boundaries of the property and beyond.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the ensemble of the Minaret of Jam and the vestiges that surround it has never been questioned. The Minaret has always been recognised as a genuine architectural and decorative masterpiece by the experts and an artistic chef-d'oeuvre by the aesthetes. Its monumental Kufic inscriptions testify to the remote and glorious origin of its builders as well as giving evidence to its early dating (1194). No reconstruction or extensive restoration work has ever taken place in the area.

Protection and management requirements

The legal and institutional framework for the effective management of the Minaret and archaeological remains (70ha with a 600ha buffer zone), is regulated by the Department of Historic Monuments on behalf of the Ministry of Information and Culture of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan. The specific law under which the monument and its landscape are protected is the Law on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Properties (Ministry of Justice, 21 May 2004) which is in force and provides the basis for financial and technical resources.

The property will be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger when its desired state of conservation is achieved in accordance with Decision 31 COM 7A.20. This must include the increased capacity of the staff of the Afghan Ministry of Culture and Information who are in charge of the preservation of the property; precise identification of the World Heritage property and clearly marked boundaries and buffer zones; assurance of the long-term stability and conservation of the Minaret; assurance of site security, and a comprehensive management system including the development and implementation of a long-term conservation policy.

Proposals for the protection of the Minaret and its environs are under scientific discussion. They would seek to monitor erosion of the riverbanks adjacent to the Minaret, any further movement in the level of inclination of the monument along with any degradation in the historic fabric in general, and mitigate any adverse observations with appropriate programs of stabilization and conservation measures where necessary. Measures for the protection and monitoring of the wider archaeological site are currently under review and an approved program of research and public awareness raising is likely to be instigated in the long term.

29. Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan) (C 208 rev)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Enclosed between the high mountains of the Hindu Kush in the central highlands of Afghanistan, the Bamiyan Valley opens out into a large basin bordered to the north by a long, high stretch of rocky cliffs. The Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley comprise a serial property consisting of eight separate sites within the Valley and its tributaries. Carved into the Bamiyan Cliffs are the two niches of the giant Buddha statues (55m and 38m high) destroyed by the Taliban in 2001, and numerous caves forming a large ensemble of Buddhist monasteries, chapels and sanctuaries along the foothills of the valley dating from the 3rd to the 5th century C.E. In several of the caves and niches, often linked by galleries, there are remains of wall paintings and seated Buddha figures. In the valleys of the Bamiyan's tributaries are further groups of caves including the Kakrak Valley Caves, some 3km south-east of the Bamiyan Cliffs where among the more than one hundred caves

dating from the 6th to 13th centuries are fragments of a 10m tall standing Buddha figure and a sanctuary with painted decorations from the Sasanian period. Along the Fuladi valley around 2km southwest of the Bamiyan Cliffs are the caves of Qoul-i Akram and Lalai Ghami, also containing decorative features.

Punctuating the centre of the valley basin to the south of the great cliff are the remains of the fortress of Shahr-i Ghulghulah. Dating from the 6th to 10th centuries CE, this marks the original settlement of Bamiyan as stopping place on the branch of the Silk Route, which linked China and India via ancient Bactria. Further to the east along the Bamiyan Valley are the remains of fortification walls and settlements, dating from the 6th to 8th centuries at Qallai Kaphari A and B and further east still (around 15km east of the Bamiyan Cliffs) at Shahr-i Zuhak, where the earlier remains are overlaid by developments of the 10th to 13th centuries under the rule of the Islamic Ghaznavid and Ghorid dynasties.

The Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley represent the artistic and religious developments which from the 1st to the 13th centuries characterised ancient Bactria, integrating various cultural influences into the Gandharan school of Buddhist art. The numerous Buddhist monastic ensembles and sanctuaries, as well as fortified structures from the Islamic period, testify to the interchange of Indian, Hellenistic, Roman, Sasanian and Islamic influences. The site is also testimony to recurring reactions to iconic art, the most recent being the internationally condemned deliberate destruction of the two standing Buddha statues in March 2001.

Criterion (i): The Buddha statues and the cave art in Bamiyan Valley are an outstanding representation of the Gandharan school in Buddhist art in the Central Asian region.

Criterion (ii): The artistic and architectural remains of Bamiyan Valley, an important Buddhist centre on the Silk Road, are an exceptional testimony to the interchange of Indian, Hellenistic, Roman and Sasanian influences as the basis for the development of a particular artistic expression in the Gandharan school. To this can be added the Islamic influence in a later period.

Criterion (iii): The Bamiyan Valley bears an exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition in the Central Asian region, which has disappeared.

Criterion (iv): The Bamiyan Valley is an outstanding example of a cultural landscape which illustrates a significant period in Buddhism.

Criterion (vi): The Bamiyan Valley is the most monumental expression of the western Buddhism. It was an important centre of pilgrimage over many centuries. Due to their symbolic values, the monuments have suffered at different times of their existence, including the deliberate destruction in 2001, which shook the whole world.

Integrity

The heritage resources in Bamiyan Valley have suffered from various disasters and some parts are in a fragile state. A major loss to the integrity of the site was the destruction of the large Buddha statues in 2001. However, a significant proportion of all the attributes that express the Outstanding Universal Value of the site, such as Buddhist and Islamic architectural forms and their setting in the Bamiyan landscape, remain intact at all 8 sites within the boundaries, including the vast Buddhist monastery in the Bamiyan Cliffs which contained the two colossal sculptures of the Buddha.

Authenticity

The cultural landscape and archaeological remains of the Bamiyan Valley continue to testify to the different cultural phases of its history. Seen as a cultural landscape, the Bamiyan Valley, with its artistic and architectural remains, the traditional land use and the simple mud brick constructions continues to express its Outstanding Universal Value in terms of form and materials, location and setting, but may be vulnerable in the face of development and requires careful conservation and management.

Protection and management requirements

The monuments and archaeological remains of the Bamiyan Valley are public property, owned by the State of Afghanistan. However, large parts of the buffer zone are in private ownership. Many documents defining the ownership were destroyed during the decades of conflict and civil unrest, and are now being re-established. The State Law on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Properties (Ministry of Justice, May 21st 2004) is in force and provides the basis for financial and technical resources.

The management of the serial property is under the authority of the Ministry of Information and Culture (MoIC) and its relevant departments (Institute of Archaeology and the Department for the Preservation of Historical Monuments), as well as the Governor of the Bamiyan Province. The Ministry of Information and Culture has a provincial local office representative in Bamiyan. There are 8 guards specifically protecting the site against vandalism and looting, with additional resources provided by the Ministry of Interior in the form of a dedicated police contingent for the protection of cultural property (Police unit 012).

At present, the management system is provisional with help from the international community for the appropriate administrative, scientific and technical resources. Since 2003, UNESCO has been leading a three-phase safe-guarding plan for the property. Its focus has been to consolidate the Buddha niches, to safeguard the artefacts that survived the destruction of the Buddha statues and to render the site safe, notably by pursuing the complex de-mining operations at the site. A Management Plan for the property is under preparation with the objective to prepare and implement a programme for the protection, conservation and presentation of the Bamiyan Valley, to undertake exploration and excavation of the archaeological remains, and to prepare and implement a programme for sustainable cultural tourism in the Valley. The Governor of the Province is responsible for the implementation of a regional development plan, which includes rehabilitation of housing, provision of health and educational services, and development of infrastructure and agriculture.

In March 2011, it was concluded by Afghan officials and international experts at a meeting of the 9th Bamiyan Expert Working Group hosted by UNESCO that the World Heritage site is potentially ready to be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger by 2013, pending continued progress in addressing security risks, the structural stability of the remains of the two giant Buddha sculptures and their niches, the conservation of the archaeological remains and mural paintings and implementation of the Management Plan.

30. Bam and its Cultural Landscape (Islamic Republic of Iran) (C 1208)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The property of Bam and its Cultural Landscape is located on the southern edge of the Iranian high plateau, in Kerman Province, in south-eastern Iran, close to the Pakistan border. Bam lies 1,060 metres above sea level in the centre of the valley dominated to the north by the Kafut Mountains and to the south by the Jebal-e Barez Mountains. This valley forms the wider cultural landscape of the Bam County. Beyond the mountains lies the vast Lut Desert of Central Iran. Water from the Jebal-e Barez Mountains supplies the seasonal Posht-e Rud River that skirts Bam City between Arg-e Bam and Qal'eh Dokhtar. The Chelekhoneh River and its tributaries gather water from the central parts of the Jebal-e Barez Mountain range. It now runs northeast, although it formerly flowed through the Bam City until it was diverted by a dam into a new course that met with the Posht-e Rud northwest of Bam City. Water from the Kafut Mountains also supplies the catchment area.

The origins of the citadel of Bam, Arg-e Bam, can be traced back to the Achaemenid period (6th to 4th centuries BC) and even beyond. The heyday of the citadel was from the 7th to 11th centuries, being at the crossroads of important trade routes and known for the production of silk and cotton garments. The citadel, which contains the governor's quarters and the fortified residential area, forms the central focus of a vast cultural landscape, which is marked by a series of forts and citadels, now in ruins. The existence of life in the oasis was based on the underground irrigation canals, the *qanāts*, of which Bam has preserved some of the earliest evidence in Iran and which continue to function till the present time. Arg-e Bam is the most representative example of a fortified medieval town built in vernacular technique using mud layers (*Chineh*), sun-dried mud bricks (*khesht*), and vaulted and domed structures. Outside the core area of Arg-e Bam, there are other protected historic structures which include Qal'eh Dokhtar (Maiden's fortress, ca. 7th century), Emamzadeh Zeyd Mausoleum (11-12th century), and Emamzadeh Asiri Mausoleum (12th century and historic *qanāt* systems and cultivations southeast of the Arg.

Bam and its Cultural Landscape represents an outstanding example of an ancient fortified settlement that developed around the Iranian central plateau and is an exceptional testimony to the development of a trading settlement in the desert environment of the Central Asian region. This impressive construction undoubtedly represents the climax and is the most important achievement of its type not only in the area of Bam but also in a much wider cultural region of Western Asia. Bam is located in an oasis area, the existence of which has been based on the use of underground water canals, *qanāts*, and has preserved evidence of the technological development in the building and maintenance of the *qanāts* over more than two millennia. For centuries, Bam had a strategic location on the Silk Roads connecting it to Central Asia in the east, the Persian Gulf in the south, as well as Egypt in the west and it is an example of the interaction of the various influences.

The cultural landscape of Bam is an important representation of the interaction between man and nature and retains a rich resource of ancient canalisations, settlements and forts as landmarks and as a tangible evidence of the evolution of the area.

Criterion (ii): Bam developed at the crossroads of important trade routes at the southern side of the Iranian high plateau, and it became an outstanding example of the interaction of the various influences.

Criterion (iii): The Bam and its Cultural Landscape represent an exceptional testimony to the development of a trading settlement in the desert environment of the Central Asian region.

Criterion (iv): The city of Bam represents an outstanding example of a fortified settlement and citadel in the Central Asian region, based on the use mud layer technique (*chineh*) combined with mud bricks (*khesht*).

Criterion (v): The cultural landscape of Bam is an outstanding representation of the interaction of man and nature in a desert environment, using the *qanats*. The system is based on a strict social system with precise tasks and responsibilities, which have been maintained in use until the present, but has now become vulnerable to irreversible change.

Integrity

Bam and its Cultural Landscape form an organically grown relict cultural landscape. The World Heritage property encompasses the central part of the oasis of Bam, including the Citadel of Bam and the area along the Bam Seismic Fault. This contains historical evidence of the evolution of *qanat* construction from the first millennium till the present. The inscribed property and the buffer zone are of sufficient size and encompass the attributes that sustain the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including the elements that express the relationship between man and the environment.

In the Arg-e Bam, earthen structures have retained urban forms and type of construction which, in spite of requiring interventions as a result of the earthquake have still retained a high degree of integrity. The new urban master plan for the modern city of Bam, largely affected by the 2003 earthquake, will follow the traditional street pattern and overall garden city approach to maintain the character of the property.

The living cultural landscape retains a high level of integrity with the continued use and maintenance of the historic hydraulic systems *qanāts* and continued territorial land use for agricultural activities. The traditional visual relationship of the fortified ensemble with its setting is still preserved. However, there are challenges relating to new developments in industrial and residential areas developing in the outskirts of Bam city, which will need to be properly regulated and managed to preserve this relationship.

Authenticity

The property maintains several attributes that substantiate its authenticity. In regard to the historic fabric, although some deterioration existed and partial restorations were carried out between 1976 and 2003, these used traditional techniques and materials.

The 2003 earthquake caused the collapse of various sections of the Governor's Quarters and the upper parts of the defence walls. Notwithstanding, much of the lost fabric was from modern restorations. The materials found at the older levels are well preserved and have now been revealed. The traditional culture for architecture and the city plan have also been preserved, including the continuity in workmanship and know-how for earthen architecture construction. To maintain the authenticity of the property, it will be important that interventions follow appropriate restoration principles and guidelines, in accordance to international doctrine, and in consideration to the original materials and techniques.

The setting has also maintained many of the historical features that speak to the integration of man and environment and other symbolic associations with the natural landscape. To retain the authenticity of this relationship, the management of the buffer zone will play a critical role, as well as provisions made for the continuation of historic practices and rituals and the continuous function and use of the area.

Protection and management requirements

Bam and its Cultural Landscape are protected since 1945, under Iranian national legislation (Law of Conservation of National Monuments, 3 Nov. 1930), and other instruments of legal control and norms of protection related to architecture and land use control. Illegal excavations are prohibited in Iran.

The main management authority is the Iranian Cultural Heritage, Handicraft and Tourism Organization (ICHHTO), an independent directorate who collaborates with other national and local authorities and follows a programme that is regularly updated. Some of the listed buildings outside the Arg are the property of other government institutions but changes are subject to permission by ICHHTO. Management involves collaboration particularly with the Religious Endowment Organization (Sazeman-e Owqaf), Ministry of Housing and Town Planning (Vezarat-e Maskan va Shahrsazi), and the Municipalities (Shahrdari) of Bam and Baravat. ICHHTO has two offices in the region, the regional office of Kerman, and the Task Force office in Bam.

While the nominated World Heritage property is generally an archaeological area, the buffer zone consists of two towns, Bam and Baravat, and related palm groves. The buffer zone one covers the urban area next to the citadel: any construction activity or alteration here is forbidden without the permission and supervision of the ICHHTO. An extended landscape protection zone is provided, covering the entire town, the irrigation areas and cultivations in Bam and Baravat this allows for land use control. The skyline and views of the Arg will be protected as long as the building height is limited to 10m. Agricultural activity is allowed so far as this will not require constructions disturbing the landscape. Any mining or quarrying is forbidden if it affects the sight of the mountains visible from Bam. The balance between palm groves and built areas is retained the same as before the earthquake.

Following the 2003 earthquake, a team of experts coordinated by the UNESCO Tehran Cluster Office and ICHHTO prepared a Comprehensive Management Plan, 2008-2017, which covers the World Heritage property and was developed through a process involving the local authorities of the County, the five Districts and the municipalities of Bam and Baravat. The new urban master plan for the reconstruction of the City of Bam, prepared in 2004, respects the original street pattern. Conservation and management actions at the property need to guarantee the preservation and presentation of all the key characteristics of the Citadel and the other architectural remains in the inscribed property.

The restoration and partial reconstruction of selected elements need to be based on a critical assessment of the reliability of documentary and field evidence, and taking care that the impact on the archaeological and natural setting will not alter the existing balance of the property. The re-establishment of some of the pre-earthquake conditions will need to be in concurrence with international conventions and charters to ensure that the conditions of authenticity and integrity continue to be met. At the same time, conservation and protection of the World Heritage property requires a balanced approach to confer the site its place in the living culture and its contribution to the specific identity of Bam, as well as the values associated with the long and complex history of the city and its associated landscape.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

31. Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery (Georgia) (C 710)

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

32. Historical Monuments of Mtskheta (Georgia) (C 708)

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

33. Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Serbia)² (C 724 bis)

No Statement was adopted for this property.

34. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1150)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Located at the tidal mouth of the river Mersey where it meets the Irish Sea, the maritime mercantile City of Liverpool played an important role in the growth of the British Empire. It became the major port for the mass movement of people, including slaves and emigrants from northern Europe to America. Liverpool was a pioneer in the development of modern dock technology, transport systems and port management, and building construction.

Six areas in the historic centre and docklands of Liverpool bear witness to the development of one of the world's major trading centres in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries. A series of significant commercial, civic and public buildings lie within these areas, including the Pier Head, with its three principal waterfront buildings - the Royal Liver Building, the Cunard Building, and Port of Liverpool Building; the Dock area with its warehouses, dock walls, remnant canal system, docks and other facilities related to port activities; the mercantile area, with its shipping offices, produce exchanges, marine insurance offices, banks, inland warehouses and merchants houses, together with the William Brown Street Cultural Quarter, including St. George's Plateau, with its monumental cultural and civic buildings.

Liverpool - Maritime Mercantile City reflects the role of Liverpool as the supreme example of a commercial port at the time of Britain's greatest global influence. Liverpool grew into a major commercial port in the 18th century, when it was also crucial for the organisation of the trans-Atlantic slave trade. In the 19th century, Liverpool became a world mercantile centre for general cargo and mass European emigration to the New World. It had major significance on world trade as one of the principal ports of the British Commonwealth. Its innovative techniques and types of dock, dock facilities and warehouse construction had worldwide influence. Liverpool was instrumental in the development of industrial canals in the British Isles in the 18th century, and of railway transport in the 19th century. All through this period, and particularly in the 19th and early 20th centuries, Liverpool gave attention to the quality and innovation of its architecture and cultural activities. To this stand as testimony its outstanding public buildings, such as St. George's Hall, and its museums. Even in the 20th century, Liverpool has made a lasting contribution, remembered in the success of The Beatles, who were strongly influenced by Liverpool's role as an international port city, which exposed them to seafarers, culture and music from around the world, especially America.

² **Note:** The Secretariat was informed by the Legal Advisor that "The UNESCO Secretariat follows the practice of the United Nations, which considers that the Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999) continues to be applicable to the territory of Kosovo until a final settlement be achieved".

Criterion (ii): Liverpool was a major centre generating innovative technologies and methods in dock construction and port management in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries. It thus contributed to the building up of the international mercantile systems throughout the British Commonwealth.

Criterion (iii): The city and the port of Liverpool are an exceptional testimony to the development of maritime mercantile culture in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries, contributing to the building up of the British Empire. It was a centre for the slave trade, until its abolition in 1807, and for emigration from northern Europe to America.

Criterion (iv): Liverpool is an outstanding example of a world mercantile port city, which represents the early development of global trading and cultural connections throughout the British Empire.

Integrity

The key areas that demonstrate Outstanding Universal Value in terms of innovative technologies and dock construction from the 18th to the early 20th century and the quality and innovation of its architecture and cultural activities are contained within the boundaries of the six areas forming the property. The major structures and buildings within these areas are generally intact although some such as Stanley Dock and associated warehouses require conservation and maintenance. The historic evolution of the Liverpool street pattern is still readable representing the different periods, with some alteration following the destruction of World War II.

There has been some re-development on sites previously redeveloped in the mid-late 20th century or damaged during World War II, for example at Mann Island and Chavasse Park, north and east of Canning Dock. All archaeology on these development sites was fully evaluated and recorded; archaeological remains were retained *in situ* where possible, and some significant features interpreted in the public domain. A new visitor centre has been opened at the north east corner of Old Dock, which has been conserved and exposed after being buried for almost 200 years. The production and adoption of design guidance minimizes the risks in and around the WH property that future development might adversely affect architectural quality and sense of place, or reduce the integrity of the docks.

Authenticity

Within the property, the major dock structures, and commercial and cultural buildings still testify to the Outstanding Universal Value in terms of form and design, materials, and to some extent, use and function. Warehouses at Albert Dock have been skillfully adapted to new uses. Some new development has been undertaken since inscription and has contributed to the city's coherence by reversing earlier fragmentation. No significant loss of historical authenticity has occurred, as the physical evidence of the City and its great past remain prominent and visible, and in some cases has been enhanced. The main docks survive as water-filled basins within the property and in the buffer zone. The impact on the setting of the property of further new development on obsolete dockland is a fundamental consideration. It is essential that future development within the World Heritage property and its setting, including the buffer zone, should respect and transmit its Outstanding Universal Value.

Protection and management requirements

The property is within the boundary of Liverpool City Council and is protected through the planning system and the designation of over 380 buildings. The six sections of the property are protected as Conservation Areas under the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

The properties within the boundary are in mixed ownership and several institutions have management responsibilities relating to them. The property is subject to different

plans and policies, including the Liverpool Unitary Development Plan (2002) and the Strategic Regeneration Framework (July 2001). There are several detailed master plans for specified areas, and conservation plans for the individual buildings. A Townscape Heritage Initiative for Buildings at Risk in the World Heritage site and its buffer zone is successfully encouraging and assisting the restoration of buildings within designated areas of the property. A full Management Plan has been prepared for the property. Its implementation is overseen by the Liverpool World Heritage Site Steering Group, which includes most public bodies involved in the property.

At the time of inscription, the World Heritage Committee requested that the height of any new construction in the property should not exceed that of structures in the immediate surroundings; the character of any new construction should respect the qualities of the historic area, and new construction at the Pier Head should not dominate, but complement the historic Pier Head buildings. There is a need for conservation and development to be based on an analysis of townscape characteristics and to be constrained by clear regulations establishing prescribed heights of buildings.

A Supplementary Planning Document for Development and Conservation in and around the World Heritage site addresses the management issues raised by the World Heritage Committee in 2007 and 2008 and was formally adopted by the Liverpool City Council in October 2009.

LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

35. Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works (Chile) (C 1178)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document WHC-13/37.COM/8E.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2005), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **29 COM 8B.51**):

Criterion (ii): The development of the saltpeter industry reflects the combined knowledge, skills, technology, and financial investment of a diverse community of people who were brought together from around South America, and from Europe. The saltpeter industry became a huge cultural exchange complex where ideas were quickly absorbed and exploited. The two works represent this process.

Criterion (iii): The saltpeter mines and their associated company towns developed into an extensive and very distinct urban community with its own language, organisation, customs, and creative expressions, as well as displaying technical entrepreneurship. The two nominated works represent this distinctive culture.

Criterion (iv): The saltpeter mines in the north of Chile together became the largest producers of natural saltpeter in the world, transforming the Pampa and indirectly the agricultural lands that benefited from the fertilisers the works produced. The two works represent this transformation process.

36. Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama) (C 135)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

37. Chan Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru) (C 366)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The Chimu Kingdom reached its apogee in the 15th century, not long before falling to the Incas. Its capital Chan Chan, located in the once fertile river valley of Moche or Santa Catalina, was the largest earthen architecture city in pre-Columbian America. The remains of this vast city reflect in their layout a strict political and social strategy, emphasized by their division into nine 'citadels' or 'palaces' forming independent units.

The Outstanding Universal Value of Chan Chan resides in the extensive, hierarchically planned remains of this huge city, including remnants of the industrial, agricultural and water management systems that sustained it.

The monumental zone of around six square kilometres in the centre of the once twenty square kilometre city, comprises nine large rectangular complexes ('citadels' or 'palaces') delineated by high thick earthen walls. Within these units, buildings including temples, dwellings, storehouses are arranged around open spaces, together with reservoirs, and funeral platforms. The earthen walls of the buildings were often decorated with friezes representing abstract motifs, and anthropomorphical and zoomorphical subjects. Around these nine complexes were thirty two semi monumental compounds and four production sectors for activities such as weaving wood and metal working. Extensive agricultural areas and a remnant irrigation system have been found further to the north, east and west of the city.

The Moche and Chicama rivers once supplied an intricate irrigation system via an approximately 80 kilometre long canal, sustaining the region around Chan Chan during the height of the Chimu civilisation.

Criterion (i): The planning of the largest earthen city of pre-Columbian America is an absolute masterpiece of town planning. Rigorous zoning, differentiated use of inhabited space, and hierarchical construction illustrate a political and social ideal which has rarely been expressed with such clarity.

Criterion (iii): Chan Chan bears a unique testimony and is the most representative city of the disappeared Chimu kingdom where eleven thousand years of cultural evolution in northern Peru are synthesized and expressed. The architectural ensemble uniquely integrated the symbolic and sacred architecture with technological knowledge and the adaptation to the native environment.

Integrity

Chan Chan retains all the elements that carry its Outstanding Universal Value over an area of fourteen square kilometers, which although less than the original area of the city, contains representative features of the architectural units, ceremonial roads, temples and agricultural units that convey the property's significance.

The earthen construction of the city, as well as environmental conditions, including extreme climatic conditions caused by El Niño phenomenon, renders the archaeological site susceptible to decay and deterioration. However ongoing maintenance using earthen materials has mitigated the degree of physical impact.

The setting and visual integrity of the property has been impacted negatively by illegal farming practices, exacerbated by pending resolution of land tenure and relocation issues, and by encroaching urban and infrastructure development, including the recent

animal food plant and the Trujillo-Huanchaco highway that cuts the site in two since colonial times.

Authenticity

In terms of its form and design, the archaeological site still expresses truthfully the essence of the monumental urban landscape of the former Chimú capital. Also, the hierarchical arrangements reflecting the high political, social, technological, ideological and economic complexity attained by Chimú society between the ninth and fifteenth centuries are still clearly to be discerned. The original earthen architecture with its religious feature and decorations, although subject to decay, is undergoing conservation interventions using earthen materials and still truthfully represents the construction methods and the spirit of the Chimú people.

Protection and management requirements

The Ministry of Culture in Peru (MC), through its decentralized office in La Libertad, is the main agency charged with conserving and defending Chan Chan. It collaborates with authorities at the national, regional and municipal level to implement actions, particularly concerning illegal occupations of the property. The property is protected by national laws and decrees. However, long-standing issues, such as land tenure, relocation of illegal settlers, ceasing of illegal farming practices and enforcement of the regulatory measures have yet to be effectively resolved to ensure the long term conservation and full protection of the property. The regulatory measures for the buffer zone are still in the process of being established in collaboration with the local municipality.

The property was originally placed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 1986 because of the precarious state of conservation of the earthen architecture and its vulnerability to the extreme climatic events caused by El Niño phenomenon that affects the northern coast of Peru. Furthermore, the ruins were threatened by endemic plundering of archaeological remains, and by the proposed construction of a road crossing the site.

Since the inscription, various steps have been taken towards achieving the desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger including the implementation of corrective measures and the development of a management plan. In addition, remedial measures have been implemented since 1999 to address the threats derived by the rising water table levels at the property.

The management plan was approved in 2000, with a ten year action plan, which will need updating and review as new conditions arise and actions prescribed are completed. Implementation of the action plan has mainly involved the maintenance of drains that control the water table level, stabilization of perimeter walls of palaces and funerary platforms, control of vegetation, maintenance of public use areas, architectural documentation for conservation and management, capacity building for local craftsmen and awareness building measures for students and the local community. An emergency and disaster preparedness plan has been developed against the El Niño phenomenon.

The continuity in implementation of actions has improved with the creation of the Implementing Unit 110 and the allocation of sustained funding for the implementation of the management plan. However, in order to meet the challenges facing the property, there is an urgent need to secure the full operation of an adequate participatory management system and ensure that financial and human resources are adequate to allow for the sustained implementation of conservation, protection and public use

management actions. An effective risk management plan is also needed to address both the social and natural threats to the property.

The vision for Chan Chan is that it maintains its status as a cultural symbol for Peru that links the past to the present and plays an essential role in the human development of the region and the country. The conservation and presentation of the archaeological site and its context will contribute to its value and to the strengthening of Peruvian cultural identity.

38. Coro and its Port (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela) (C 658)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document WHC-13/37.COM/8E.

II. PROPERTIES DISCUSSED FOR IN-DANGER LISTING

NATURAL PROPERTIES

AFRICA

39. Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya) (N 801bis)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Lake Turkana National Parks are constituted of Sibiloi National Park, the South Island and the Central Island National Parks, covering a total area of 161,485 hectares located within the Lake Turkana basin whose total surface area is 7 million ha. The Lake is the most saline lake in East Africa and the largest desert lake in the world, surrounded by an arid, seemingly extraterrestrial landscape that is often devoid of life. The long body of Lake Turkana drops down along the Rift Valley from the Ethiopian border, extending 249 kilometers from north to south and 44 km at its widest point with a depth of 30 meters. It is Africa's fourth largest lake, fondly called the Jade Sea because of its breathtaking color.

The property represents unique geo-morphological features with fossil deposits on sedimentary formations as well as one hundred identified archaeological and paleontological sites. There are numerous volcanic overflows with petrified forests. The existing ecological conditions provide habitats for maintaining diverse flora and fauna.

At Kobi Fora to the north of Allia Bay, extensive paleontological finds have been made, starting in 1969, with the discovery of *Paranthropus boisei*. The discovery of *Homo habilis* thereafter is evidence of the existence of a relatively intelligent hominid two million years ago and reflect the change in climate from moist forest grassland when the now petrified forest were growing to the present hot desert. The human and pre-human fossils include the remains of five species, *Australopithecus anamensis*, *Homo habilis/rudolfensis*, *Paranthropus boisei*, *Homo erectus* and *Homo sapiens* all found within one locality. These discoveries are important for understanding the evolutionary history of the human species.

The island parks are the breeding habitats of the Nile crocodile *Crocodylus niloticus*, the hippopotamus amphibious and several snake species. The lake is an important flyway passage and stopover for palaeartic migrant birds.

Criterion (viii): The geology and fossil record represents major stages of earth history including records of life represented by hominid discoveries, presence of recent geological process represented by volcanic erosional and sedimentary land forms. This property's main geological features stem from the Pliocene and Holocene periods (4million to 10,000 years old). It has been very valuable in the reconstruction of the paleo-environment of the entire Lake Turkana Basin. The Kobi Fora deposits contain pre-human, mammalian, molluscan and other fossil remains and have contributed more to the understanding of human ancestry and paleo-environment than any other site in the world.

Criterion (x): The property features diverse habitats resulting from ecological changes over time and ranging from terrestrial and aquatic, desert to grasslands and is inhabited by diverse fauna. In situ conservation within the protected areas includes threatened species particularly the reticulated giraffe, lions and gray zebras and has over 350 recorded species of aquatic and terrestrial birds. The island parks are the breeding habitats of the Nile crocodile, *Crocodylus niloticus*, the hippopotamus amphibious and several snake species. Furthermore, the lake is an important flyway passage and stopover for palaeartic migrant birds, with the South Island Park also being designated as an important bird area under Birdlife International. The protected area around Lake Turkana provides a large and valuable laboratory for the study of plant and animal communities.

Remoteness has preserved the area as a natural wilderness. On the grassy plains yellow speargrass *Imperata cylindrica*, *Commiphora* sp., *Acacia tortilis*, and other acacia species predominate along with *A. elatior*, desert date *Balanites aegyptiaca* and doum palm *Hyphaene coriacea* in sparse gallery woodlands. *Salvadora persica* bush is found on Central and South Islands. The muddy bays of South Island have extensive submerged beds of *Potamogeton pectinatus* which shelter spawning fish. The principal emergent macrophytes in the seasonally exposed shallows are the grasses *Paspalum geminatum* and *Sporobolus spicatus*.

Integrity

The property covers a total area of 161,485 ha. The area around the property is sparsely populated due to its isolated location, inadequate freshwater and national protection status. It is an important habitat for hippopotamus and the world's largest colony of crocodiles (and the largest Nile crocodile breeding ground in the world). Physical evidence through scientific studies indicate the area's continued support for habitation of flora and fauna of diverse species over millions of years to the present. In addition, volcanic eruptions and extensive lava flows, geological faulting within the Great Rift Valley, and the formation of sedimentary deposits have assured preservation of fossil remains, which are significant in understanding the history of life especially human evolution. The adjacent Mount Kulal Biosphere Reserve serves as a water shed for the Lake Turkana Basin and as a wildlife dispersal area. It thereby assures the protection of the biological and natural processes making it an important site for avian habitation and migration, particularly water birds.

The area is managed under two State Acts ensuring protection, conservation and sustainability of the environment and addressing for example. post-archaeological excavation, illegal grazing, poaching and over fishing.

Protection and management requirements

The property enjoys the highest level of legal protection by both the Kenya Wildlife Act cap 376 as well as the Antiquities and Monument Act cap 215 (currently the National Museums and Heritage Act of 2006) under Kenyan legislation. Sibiloi National Park was legally designated as a national park in 1973 whereas South and Central Islands were legally designated in 1983 and 1985 respectively. The property is co-managed by Kenya Wildlife Service (KWS) and the National Museums of Kenya (NMK).

Following the extension of the property in 2001, a first management plan was developed for the period of 2001 to 2005. The long term planning foresees the development of an integrated management plan for the area. Formalization of the existing collaboration between KWS and NMK and other stakeholders through a Memorandum of Understanding will be necessary for the successful implementation of the plan.

Challenges and potential threats have been identified: these include severe droughts, livestock encroachment into the property, impacts from climate change, poaching, siltation, receding water level, human-wildlife conflicts and poor infrastructure in the area. Mitigation measures and strategies are required for the sustainable long-term management of the property and the development of an integrated management plan taking into account reforestation, law enforcement, education and awareness-raising, alternative livelihoods, resource mobilization and appropriate forms of infrastructure development (roads, electricity, telecommunication, etc.).

ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

40. East Rennell (Solomon Islands) (N 854)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 36 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

East Rennell is part of Rennell Island, the southernmost island of the Western Pacific, Solomon Islands Group. Rennell Island is the largest raised coral atoll in the world, covering an area of 87,500ha at 86km long and 15km wide and is located 250km due south of the Solomon's capital, Honiara. The World Heritage property occupies the southern third of the island and includes approximately 37,000ha and a marine area that extends 3km offshore. A prominent feature of the property is Lake Tegano, the former lagoon of the atoll, which at 15,000ha is the largest lake in the insular Pacific. Containing many rugged limestone islets the lake's brackish waters harbour numerous endemic species including an endemic sea snake. The surrounding karst terrain has a dense cover of indigenous forest. Remaining in its natural state, the forest has a rich biodiversity with many endemic species; four species and nine subspecies of land and water birds respectively, one bat and seven land snails.

The property was the first natural property inscribed on the World Heritage List with customary ownership and management. Approximately 1,200 people of Polynesian origin occupy four villages within the boundaries of the property, living mainly by subsistence gardening, hunting and fishing. Frequent cyclones can have severe consequences for the local people and the biota, and rising lake water levels from climatic change are adversely affecting some staple food crops.

Criterion (ix): East Rennell demonstrates significant on-going ecological and biological processes and is an important site for the science of island biogeography. The property is an important stepping stone in the migration and evolution of species in the western Pacific and for speciation processes, especially with respect to avifauna. Combined with the strong climatic effects of frequent cyclones, the property

is a true natural laboratory for scientific study. The unmodified forest vegetation contains floral elements from the more impoverished Pacific Islands to the east and the much richer Melanesian flora to the west. For its size, Rennell Island has a high number of endemic species, particularly among its avifauna and also harbours 10 endemic plant species.

The wildlife includes 11 species of bat (one endemic) and 43 species of breeding land and water birds (four species and nine subspecies endemic respectively). The invertebrate life is also rich with 27 species of land snail (seven endemics) and approximately 730 insect species, many of which are endemic. The flora of Lake Tegano is dominated by more than 300 species of diatoms and algae, some of which are endemic. There is also an endemic sea snake in the lake.

Integrity

East Rennell encompasses a number of marine, coastal and forest values, combined in one place and in a relatively undisturbed state. The clearly defined boundaries of the property encompass Lake Tegano as well as a continuous expanse of surrounding forest-covered karst terrain. The property also includes a marine area extending 3km offshore. Apart from subsistence garden cultivation, hunting, fishing and utilisation of forest products for building materials, the natural vegetation is little-modified by human impact and there are no serious invasive species of animals or plants. Both rats and alien land snails, which have decimated fauna of other islands, are absent.

The location of the western boundary, determined by community and administrative borders, is not optimal as it excludes important forest habitat for some species, particularly birds. Previously reported threats from mining and commercial fishing have passed. However, potential logging operations in the lands adjacent to the property, in West Rennell, could have severe adverse impacts on the forests within the property. These forests are intrinsically linked to those of West Rennell and are insufficient on their own to ensure the long-term survival of a number of endemic birds.

Increasing water levels and salinity in Lake Tegano, induced by sea level rise due to climate change, are adversely affecting plant growth in low-lying areas. Of particular concern is the reduced harvest of taro and coconut, both of which are vital staple foods for the local community. Of particular importance and significance is the support for conservation from the local community.

Protection and management requirements

All land, islands and marine reefs within the property are under customary ownership, which is acknowledged in the Constitution of the Solomon Islands and the 1995 Customs Recognition Act. East Rennell is also protected under a National Protected Areas Act, passed in 2010 and administered by a recently established Ministry of the Environment. The legislation is focused on biodiversity conservation and explicitly applies to World Heritage properties, but it requires a Provincial Ordinance and local regulations and by-laws to empower the traditional owners and make it fully effective at the local level. The property has a management plan as well as an action plan for implementation. The management plan requires more specific policies to address vulnerabilities and threats including mining, logging, over-exploitation of coconut crabs and marine resources and invasive species and has no timeline or budget. Customary values and traditional management practices are not detailed in the plan, though a recent scoping study has begun the task of addressing this gap.

The recently created Lake Tegano World Heritage Site Association, comprising some 250 community members, has established a representative committee to co-ordinate management activities. The committee, recognised by the Government, requires funding, office and communication facilities and a presence or counterpart focal point in either the provincial or national Governments to ensure it is effective.

Heritage management and capacity-building projects, conducted by foreign donor Governments and international NGO's, have provided beneficial outcomes including: enhanced awareness and understanding of World Heritage obligations on the part of the community, Government officials and other stakeholders; better co-ordination and co-operation in community management activities; improved survey and monitoring of natural resources; a strengthened legal basis for protection and management; and initial arrangements for twinning East Rennell with an Australian property.

The ability of the traditional owners to adequately protect and manage the natural values and resources of the property is limited by a lack of funding, capacity and resources. In particular, they require funding and substantial rural development aid in the form of improved communication and transport facilities, health and medical services, education resources and income-generating small business enterprises based on sustainable uses of the natural resources. The isolation of the property and the consequent restricted access, requiring long- distance travel on infrequent and unreliable air services and extremely difficult overland travel assist in protection of the property but have also impacted on attempts to develop eco-tourism. Restricted transport links also hinder the ability of the community to obtain food and medical supplies, and to access markets for locally produced products.

Future priorities for management of the property include: full implementation of legal and planning provisions; community capacity-building and empowerment for managing projects and natural resources; and increased sources of sustainable funding, including income generation, to improve the standard of living of the traditional owners and enhance their ability to protect the property to World Heritage standards.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

41. Virgin Komi Forests (Russian Federation) (N 719)

No Statement is available for this property.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

ARAB STATES

42. Ancient City of Aleppo (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 21)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Located at the crossroads of several trade routes since the 2nd millennium B.C., Aleppo was ruled successively by the Hittites, Assyrians, Akkadians, Greeks, Romans, Umayyads, Ayyubids, Mameluks and Ottomans who left their stamp on the city. The Citadel, the 12th-century Great Mosque and various 16th and 17th-centuries madrasas, residences, khans and public baths, all form part of the city's cohesive, unique urban fabric.

The monumental Citadel of Aleppo, rising above the suqs, mosques and madrasas of the old walled city, is testament to Arab military might from the 12th to the 14th centuries. With evidence of past occupation by civilizations dating back to the 10th century B.C., the citadel contains the remains of mosques, palace and bath buildings.

The walled city that grew up around the citadel bears evidence of the early Graeco-Roman street layout and contains remnants of 6th century Christian buildings, medieval walls and gates, mosques and madrasas relating to the Ayyubid and Mameluke development of the city, and later mosques and palaces of the Ottoman period. Outside the walls, the Bab al-Faraj quarter to the North-West, the Jdeide area to the north and other areas to the south and west, contemporary with these periods of occupation of the walled city contain important religious buildings and residences. Fundamental changes to parts of the city took place in the 30 years before inscription, including the destruction of buildings, and the development of tall new buildings and widened roads. Nonetheless the surviving ensemble of major buildings as well as the coherence of the urban character of the suqs and residential streets and lanes all contribute to the Outstanding Universal Value.

Criterion (iii): The old city of Aleppo reflects the rich and diverse cultures of its successive occupants. Many periods of history have left their influence in the architectural fabric of the city. Remains of Hittite, Hellenistic, Roman, Byzantine and Ayyubid structures and elements are incorporated in the massive surviving Citadel. The diverse mixture of buildings including the Great Mosque founded under the Umayyads and rebuilt in the 12th century; the 12th century Madrasa Halawiye, which incorporates remains of Aleppo's Christian cathedral, together with other mosques and madrasas, suqs and khans represents an exceptional reflection of the social, cultural and economic aspects of what was once one of the richest cities of all humanity.

Criterion (iv): Aleppo is an outstanding example of an Ayyubid 12th century city with its military fortifications constructed as its focal point following the success of Salah El-Din against the Crusaders. The encircling ditch and defensive wall above a massive, sloping, stone-faced glacis, and the great gateway with its machicolations comprise a major ensemble of military architecture at the height of Arab dominance. Works of the 13th-14th centuries including the great towers and the stone entry bridge reinforce the architectural quality of this ensemble. Surrounding the citadel within the city are numerous mosques from the same period including the Madrasah al Firdows, constructed by Daifa Khatoun in 1235.

Integrity

The boundary of the property follows the line of the walls of the old city and three extra-muros areas: North, Northeast and East suburbs. Some attributes exist beyond the boundary and need protection by a buffer zone.

Although the Citadel still dominates the city, the eight storey hotel development in the Bab al-Faraj area has had a detrimental impact on its visual integrity, as have other interventions before inscription. The remaining coherence of the urban fabric needs to be respected and the vulnerabilities of fabric and archaeological remains, though lack of conservation, need to be addressed on an on-going basis.

Authenticity

Since inscription, the layout of the old city in relation to the dominant Citadel has remained basically unchanged. Conservation efforts within the old city have largely preserved the attributes of the Outstanding Universal Value. However the setting is distinctly vulnerable due to the lack of control mechanisms in the planning administration, including the absence of a buffer zone. The historic and traditional handicraft and commercial activities continue as a vital component of the city sustaining its traditional urban life.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by the Antiquities Law administered by the Directorate of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM).

In 1992, the Project for the Rehabilitation of Old Aleppo was set up under the Municipality of Aleppo in cooperation with international agencies. In 1999, the Directorate of the Old City was established under the Municipality of Aleppo to guide the rehabilitation of the old city with three departments covering studies and planning; permits and monitoring, and implementation and maintenance. A comprehensive plan for the evolution of the city is being prepared by the Old City Directorate office. The city's development is being considered under the 'Programme for Sustainable Urban Development in Syria' (UDP), a joint undertaking between international agencies, the Syrian Ministry for Local Administration and Environment, and several other Syrian partner institutions. The programme promotes capacities for sustainable urban management and development at the national and municipal level, and includes further support to the rehabilitation of the Old City.

There is an on-going need to foster traditional approaches to conservation, restoration, repair and maintenance of building fabric. There is also a need for an overall conservation management plan to include planning rules for heights and density of new developments in specific neighbourhoods, and for policies for the protection of archaeological remains uncovered during infrastructure and development works. There is also a need for an approved buffer zone with appropriate planning constraints.

43. Ancient City of Bosra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 22)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

The name of Bosra occurs in the precious Tell el-Amarna tablets in Egypt, which date from the 14th century B.C. and represent royal correspondence between the Pharaohs and the Phoenician and Amorite kings. It became the northern capital of the Nabataean kingdom. In the year of 106 A.D, a new era began for Bosra when it was incorporated into the Roman Empire.

Alexander Severus gave it the title *Colonia Bostra* and Philip the Arab minted currency especially for it. During Byzantine times, Bosra was a major frontier market where Arab caravans came to stock up and its bishops took part in the Council of Antioch. Bosra was the first Byzantine city which the Arabs entered in 634 in the phase of Islamic expansion.

Today, Bosra is a major archaeological site, containing ruins from Roman, Byzantine, and Muslim times. Further, Nabataean and Roman monuments, Christian churches, mosques and Madrasas are present within the city.

Its main feature is the second century Roman Theatre, constructed probably under Trajan, which has been integrally preserved. It was fortified between 481 and 1251 AD. Al-Omari Mosque is one of the oldest surviving mosques in Islamic history, and the Madrasah Mabrak al-Naqua is one of the oldest and most celebrated of Islam. The Cathedral of Bosra is also a building of considerable importance in the annals of early Christian architecture.

Bosra survived about 2500 years inhabited and almost intact. The Nabataeans, Romans, Byzantines and Umayyad, all left traces in the city, which is an open museum associated with significant episodes in the history of ideas and beliefs.

Criterion (i): The incorporation of the exceptionally intact 2nd century Roman theatre, complete with its upper gallery, into later fortifications to create a strong citadel guarding the road to Damascus represents a unique architectural achievement. The remains of the 6th century basilica of the martyrs Sergios, Bacchos and Leontios, the

cathedral of Bosra, represent an extremely significant example of the centrally planned churches in terms of the evolution of early church architectural forms. The Mosque of Omar, restored in 1950, is one of the rare constructions of the 1st century of the Hegira preserved in Syria. The Madrasa Jâmi' Mabrak an-Nâqua is one of the oldest and most celebrated of Islam.

Criterion (iii): Of the city which once counted 80,000 inhabitants there remain today extensive ruins of Nabataean, Roman, Byzantine and Umayyad buildings. These ruins, including the major monuments mentioned under Criterion (i) above bear exceptional testimony to the past civilizations that created them.

Criterion (vi): In Islam, Bosra is associated with a significant episode in the life of the Prophet Mohammed, who is believed to have visited Bosra twice. At the end of his first visit, it is said that Monk Baheira indicated that Muhammad was to become a prophet.

Integrity

The Ancient city of Bosra is an inhabited archaeological site whose ruins had suffered greatly in the late 19th century. However, the large amount of surviving original fabric, including monuments of the Nabataean, Roman, Byzantine and Umayyad periods gives the site a high degree of integrity. The inhabitants of the village that has grown up amongst the ruins are being resettled outside the property. There is a need to define and manage a buffer zone to protect the setting.

Authenticity

The key surviving monuments of Bosra reflect the Outstanding Universal Value of the site. However, their setting is problematic in that a modern village had grown up among the ruins. A resettlement policy of the Directorate of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) is allowing most families to move to new houses outside the precincts of the old town. Ultimately the old town will be abandoned again, to be turned into a dead city revitalized as an open air museum.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected under the Antiquities Law 222 as amended in 1999. There is no management plan for the site and there are problems with conservation due to community issues, lack of funds and technical resources, and a lack of skilled labour. The Directorate of Antiquities and Museums is attempting to overcome these problems with the help of national and international institutions and foreign experts.

Recently the Syrian Government instigated a Master Plan project to recognize the importance of the site and to guide future use of Bosra city. A Protection Committee was established in 2007 to guide the project.

The DGAM is preparing terms of reference for implementing GIS system in the site; this project will start during 2009 and will continue for 1 year. There is a need to protect the setting of the property through an agreed and approved buffer zone.

44. Ancient City of Damascus (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 20 bis)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

Founded in the 3rd millennium B.C., Damascus was an important cultural and commercial centre, by virtue of its geographical position at the crossroads of the orient and the occident, between Africa and Asia. The old city of Damascus is considered to be among the oldest continually inhabited cities in the world. Excavations at Tell Ramad on the outskirts of the city have demonstrated that Damascus was inhabited

as early as 8,000 to 10,000 BC. However, it is not documented as an important city until the arrival of the Aramaeans. In the Medieval period, it was the centre of a flourishing craft industry, with different areas of the city specializing in particular trades or crafts.

The city exhibits outstanding evidence of the civilizations which created it - Hellenistic, Roman, Byzantine and Islamic. In particular, the Umayyad caliphate created Damascus as its capital, setting the scene for the city's ongoing development as a living Muslim, Arab city, upon which each succeeding dynasty has left and continues to leave its mark.

In spite of Islam's prevailing influence, traces of earlier cultures particularly the Roman and Byzantine continue to be seen in the city. Thus the city today is based on a Roman plan and maintains the aspect and the orientation of the Greek city, in that all its streets are oriented north-south or east-west and is a key example of urban planning.

The earliest visible physical evidence dates to the Roman period - the extensive remains of the Temple of Jupiter, the remains of various gates and an impressive section of the Roman city walls. The city was the capital of the Umayyad Caliphate. However, apart from the incomparable Great Mosque, built on the site of a Roman temple and over-laying a Christian basilica, there is little visible dating from this important era of the city's history. The present city walls, the Citadel, some mosques and tombs survive from the Middle Ages, but the greatest part of the built heritage of the city dates from after the Ottoman conquest of the early 16th century.

Criterion (i): Damascus testifies to the unique aesthetic achievement of the civilizations which created it. The Great Mosque is a masterpiece of Umayyad architecture, which together with other major monuments of different periods such as the Citadel, the Azem Palace, madrasas, khans, public baths and private residences demonstrates this achievement.

Criterion (ii): Damascus, as capital of the Umayyad caliphate - the first Islamic caliphate - was of key importance in the development of subsequent Arab cities. With its Great Mosque at the heart of an urban plan deriving from the Graeco-Roman grid, the city provided the exemplary model for the Arab Muslim world.

Criterion (iii): Historical and archaeological sources testify to origins in the third millennium BC, and Damascus is widely known as among the oldest continually inhabited cities in the world. The incomparable Great Mosque is a rare and extremely significant monument of the Umayyads. The present city walls, the Citadel, some mosques and tombs survive from the Medieval period, and a large part of the built heritage of the city including palaces and private houses dates from after the Ottoman conquest of the early 16th century.

Criterion (iv): The Umayyad Great Mosque, also known as the Grand Mosque of Damascus, is one of the largest mosques in the world, and one of the oldest sites of continuous prayer since the rise of Islam. As such it constitutes an important cultural, social and artistic development.

Criterion (vi): The city is closely linked with important historical events, ideas, traditions, especially from the Islamic period. These have helped to shape the image of the city and impact of Islamic history and culture.

Integrity

The line of the walls of the old city forms the boundary of the property. Although areas outside the walls that represent the expansion of the city from the 13th century, are considered related to the old city in terms of historical significance, and provide its setting and context, the key attributes of Outstanding Universal Value lie within the

boundary. These include the plan of the city and its dense urban fabric, city walls and gates, as well as its 125 protected monuments including the Umayyad Mosque, madrasas, khans, the Citadel and private houses.

The attributes are vulnerable to erosion from a lack of traditional approaches to maintenance and conservation, and use of traditional materials, while its setting and context are threatened by lack of conservation policy for the historical zones outside the walled city and by regional planning projects.

Authenticity

Since the inscription of the property, the morphological layout and the spatial pattern of the historic fabric have remained basically unchanged and the key discrete attributes survive. However commercial and semi-industrial activities are spreading into the residential area of the walled city and its suburbs, in places eroding the value of the attributes relating to the urban fabric and their inter-relationships.

Protection and management requirements

Responsibilities for planning control over the old city and its management are in the hands of two government departments (the Commission for Safeguarding the Old Town and the General Directorate for Antiquities and Museums (DGAM). Technical Cooperation for projects and programmes to enhance the city is undertaken by the Ministry of Local Administration and Environment with support from international organizations. The effectiveness of the conservation policy relies on full participation of various interests within the city such as public/private partnerships, all levels of government, the financial community, and citizens.

Legal protection is provided by the Antiquities law 222 amended in 1999 in addition to the Ministerial order no. 192 of 1976 designating the walled city as part of the cultural and historical heritage of Syria. Parliamentary Act N° 826 for the Restoration and Reconstruction/Rebuilding the city within the walls has been reviewed in light of changed conditions, needs and opportunities, and aims at establishing new conditions for the walled city.

A Committee for the Protection and Development of Old Damascus has been established, with representatives of the different bodies to coordinate the planning and building activities in addition to being responsible for the strategic planning for the Old City.

The draft of the Integrated Urban Plan of the old city had been formally approved by Ministerial decision N° 37/A of 2010. A buffer zone has also been delineated but not yet formally approved.

There is a need for the plan, once approved and implemented, to clarify the different levels of protection to be applied to the different parts of the urban fabric, to set out the appropriate interventions

45. Ancient Villages of Northern Syria (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1348)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8B.23)

Brief synthesis

Located in a vast Limestone Massif, in the northwest of Syria, some forty ancient villages provide a coherent and exceptionally broad insight into rural and village lifestyles in late Antiquity and the Byzantine Period. Abandoned in the 8th-10th centuries, they still retain a large part of their original monuments and buildings, in a remarkable state of preservation: dwellings, pagan temples, churches and Christian sanctuaries, funerary monuments, bathhouses, public buildings, buildings with

economic or artisanal purposes, etc. It is also an exceptional illustration of the development of Christianity in the East, in village communities. Grouped in eight archaeological parks, the ensemble forms a series of unique and exceptional relict cultural landscapes.

Criterion (iii): The Ancient Villages of Northern Syria and their relict landscapes provide exceptional testimony to the lifestyles and cultural traditions of the rural civilisations that developed in the Middle East, in the context of a Mediterranean climate in mid-altitude limestone mountains from the 1st to the 7th centuries.

Criterion (iv): The Ancient Villages of Northern Syria and their relict landscapes provide exceptional testimony to the architecture of the rural house and civilian and religious community buildings at the end of the Classical era and in the Byzantine Period. Their association in villages and places of worship forms relict landscapes characteristic of the transition between the ancient pagan world and Byzantine Christianity.

Criterion (v): The Ancient Villages of Northern Syria and their relict landscapes provide an eminent example of a sustainable rural settlement from the 1st to the 7th centuries, based on the careful use of the soil, water and limestone, and the mastery of production of valuable agricultural crops. The economic functionality of the habitat, hydraulic engineering, low protective walls and the Roman agricultural plot plan inscribed on the relict landscapes are testimony to this.

Integrity

The architectural integrity is expressed adequately. The sites are sufficiently extensive; they encompass a large number of villages, places of worship, and monumental and archaeological testimonies to adequately express the Outstanding Universal Value. The number and quality of the relict landscapes are also adequate and essential to the expression of this value. Nonetheless, the recent trend of an agricultural re-settlement of the Limestone Massif could affect the built integrity of certain villages and the associated landscapes.

Authenticity

As a result of the absence of human occupation for a thousand years, the absence of any re-use of the stones and the absence of restoration/reconstruction campaigns in the 20th century, the property and its landscapes have retained a very high degree of authenticity. However, recent rural relocation could affect the conditions of authenticity, although replanting respectful of the ancient agricultural plot plan should contribute to revitalising the landscape without affecting its authenticity.

Protection and management requirements

The dynamic of the legal protection is heading in the right direction, notably following the decrees creating the parks, and to control farming and urban development compatible with the archaeological, monumental and landscape values of the sites. This must be reinforced by a revision of the Antiquities Law to improve the protection of the relict cultural landscapes.

The property is currently (2010) managed by the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM), but on a transitional basis. The final management structure for the property will include eight parks set up for each of the sites, two management centres and the Maison du patrimoine to manage the ensemble overall and coordinate conservation, under the control of the DGAM, the Ministry of Tourism and the provincial governors. These bodies are currently being set up and are essential. In liaison with the municipalities, they will be tasked with overseeing successful economic, social and tourism development compatible with the conservation and expression of the property's Outstanding Universal Value.

46. Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 1229)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

These two castles represent the most significant examples illustrating the exchange of influences and documenting the evolution of fortified architecture in the Near East during the Byzantine, Crusader and Islamic periods. The Crac des Chevaliers was built by the Hospitaller Order of Saint John of Jerusalem from 1142 to 1271. With further construction by the Mamluks in the late 13th century, it ranks among the best-preserved examples of the Crusader castles. The Qal'at Salah El-Din, even though partly in ruins, retains features from its Byzantine beginnings in the 10th century, the Frankish transformations in the late 12th century and fortifications added by the Ayyubid dynasty (late 12th to mid-13th century). Both castles are located on high ridges that were key defensive positions.

Dominating their surrounding landscapes, the two castles of Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Din are outstanding examples of fortified architecture relating to the Crusader period. Their quality of construction and the survival of historical stratigraphy demonstrate the interchange of defensive technology through features of each phase of military occupation.

Criterion (ii): The castles represent a significant development in the fortification systems, which substantially differed from the European rather more passive defence systems, and which also contributed to the development of the castles in the Levant. Within the castles that have survived in the Near East, the property represents one of the most significant examples illustrating the exchange of influences and documenting the evolution in this field, which had an impact both in the East and in the West.

Criterion (iv): In the history of architecture, the Crac des Chevaliers is taken as the best preserved example of the castles of the Crusader period, and it is also seen as an archetype of a medieval castle particularly in the context of the military orders. Similarly, the Qal'at Salah El-Din, even though partly in ruins, still represents an outstanding example of this type of fortification, both in terms of its quality of construction and the survival of its historical stratigraphy.

Integrity

Both castles are located on hill tops dominating visually the surrounding landscape. Apart from some undesirable interventions in the buffer zones, the integrity of the surroundings is well preserved. The illegal constructions (some houses, restaurants and hotels) that have been built near the castles will be demolished. There are also plans for cable cars and an open-air theatre, which would not be in harmony with the integrity of the landscape.

Authenticity

The Crac des Chevaliers was subject to some limited restoration during the French mandate, while the relatively recent additions by local villagers were removed. The medieval structures were liberated of accumulated soil. As a whole it has well retained its authenticity.

The Qal'at Salah El-Din is located in an isolated region and was not subject to any changes in recent centuries. It has partly fallen in ruins, and is now an archaeological site. It has been subject some restoration. For example, the main gate of the Ayyubid palace was restored in 1936, imitating the original structure. This type of restoration has now been abandoned, and the main emphasis is on consolidation and

conservation. As a whole, the fortress has retained its historic condition and authenticity.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by the Syrian Antiquities Law (no. 222, revised in 1999) and by the Law of the Ministry of Local Administration (15/1971). The Ministry of Local Administration contributes to its protection in coordination with the Directorate of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) and the local authorities.

The DGAM is the agency responsible for the protection of heritage sites and the funds for the maintenance and care of the castles are guaranteed from its annual budget. Each castle has a separate management system, organized jointly by the DGAM in collaboration with the local authorities. In the case of Crac des Chevaliers, the management system involves the village of al-Hosn, and in the case of the Qal'at Salah El-Din, the DGAM collaborates with the department located in the regional capital of Latakiah.

At the time of inscription, the DGAM was in the process of adopting a new administrative structure with new regulations that would be integrated so as to allow for a unified management system for the Castles of Syria. There is an on-going need to protect the eastern slopes of the Crac de Chevaliers from the development of the nearby modern city. The necessary administrative procedures have started to ensure the removal of irregular buildings near the castles.

47. Site of Palmyra (Syrian Arab Republic) (C 23)

Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

Brief synthesis

An oasis in the Syrian desert, north-east of Damascus, Palmyra contains the monumental ruins of a great city that was one of the most important cultural centres of the ancient world. From the 1st to the 2nd century, the art and architecture of Palmyra, standing at the crossroads of several civilizations, married Graeco-Roman techniques with local traditions and Persian influences.

First mentioned in the archives of Mari in the 2nd millennium BC, Palmyra was an established caravan oasis when it came under Roman control in the mid-first century AD as part of the Roman province of Syria. It grew steadily in importance as a city on the trade route linking Persia, India and China with the Roman Empire, marking the crossroads of several civilisations in the ancient world. A grand, colonnaded street of 1100 metres' length forms the monumental axis of the city, which together with secondary colonnaded cross streets links the major public monuments including the Temple of Ba'al, Diocletian's Camp, the Agora, Theatre, other temples and urban quarters. Architectural ornament including unique examples of funerary sculpture unites the forms of Greco-roman art with indigenous elements and Persian influences in a strongly original style. Outside the city's walls are remains of a Roman aqueduct and immense necropolises.

Discovery of the ruined city by travellers in the 17th and 18th centuries resulted in its subsequent influence on architectural styles.

Criterion (i): The splendour of the ruins of Palmyra, rising out of the Syrian desert north-east of Damascus is testament to the unique aesthetic achievement of a wealthy caravan oasis intermittently under the rule of Rome from the 1st to the 3rd century AD. The grand colonnade constitutes a characteristic example of a type of structure which represents a major artistic development.

Criterion (ii): Recognition of the splendour of the ruins of Palmyra by travellers in the 17th and 18th centuries contributed greatly to the subsequent revival of classical architectural styles and urban design in the West.

Criterion (iv): The grand monumental colonnaded street, open in the centre with covered side passages, and subsidiary cross streets of similar design together with the major public buildings, form an outstanding illustration of architecture and urban layout at the peak of Rome's expansion in and engagement with the East. The great temple of Ba'al is considered one of the most important religious buildings of the 1st century AD in the East and of unique design. The carved sculptural treatment of the monumental archway through which the city is approached from the great temple is an outstanding example of Palmyrene art. The large scale funerary monuments outside the city walls in the area known as the Valley of the Tombs display distinctive decoration and construction methods.

Integrity

All the key attributes, including the main colonnaded street, major public buildings and funerary monuments, lie within the boundary. The tower tombs and the citadel are vulnerable to minor earthquakes and lack of conservation. Since the time of inscription, the population of the adjacent town has increased and is encroaching on the archaeological zone. Although traffic has increased, the main road that passed through the site has been diverted. Increased tourism has brought pressure for facilities within the property.

Authenticity

The key attributes display well their grandeur and splendour. However the setting is vulnerable to the encroachment of the adjacent town that could impact adversely on the way the ruins are perceived as an oasis closely related to their desert surroundings.

Protection and management requirements

The site was designated a national monument and is now protected by the National Antiquities law 222 as amended in 1999. A buffer zone was established in 2007 but has not yet been submitted to the World Heritage Committee.

The regional strategic action plan currently under preparation is expected to provide guidelines to expand and redefine the site as a cultural landscape, with respect to the transitional zones around the archaeological site, the oasis and the city.

There is an on-going need for a conservation and restoration plan to be developed that addresses fully the complex issues associated with this extensive multiple site and will allow for coordinated management, clear priorities and a cultural tourism strategy and address the issues of expansion of the nearby town.

LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

48. Archaeological Site of Panamá Viejo and Historic District of Panamá (Panama) (C 790 bis)

The draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value is presently in the review process.