



United Nations  
Educational, Scientific and  
Cultural Organization

Organisation  
des Nations Unies  
pour l'éducation,  
la science et la culture

# World Heritage

# 36 COM

**Distribution Limited**

**WHC-12/36.COM/INF.7A**

**Paris, 15 June 2012**

**Original: English/French**

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC  
AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF  
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

**World Heritage Committee**

**Thirty-sixth session  
Saint Petersburg, Russian Federation  
24 June – 6 July 2012**

**Item 7A of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger**

**INF.7A: Compendium on the Statements of Significance and of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger and discussed for in-Danger listing**

## **SUMMARY**

This document presents, as requested by the World Heritage Committee at its 32nd session (see Decision **32 COM 7B.129**), a compendium on the Statements of Significance and of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger and discussed for in-Danger listing.

Out of the thirty-five World Heritage properties in Danger, sixteen present a Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, two a Statement of Significance, four a clear justification of the criteria for inscription and thirteen none of these elements.

Out of the ten World Heritage properties discussed for in-Danger listing, four present a Statement of Outstanding Universal Value, two a clear justification of the criteria for inscription and four no justification/Statement at all.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>I. PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER</b>	<b>p. 3</b>
<u><b>Natural properties</b></u>	<b>p. 3</b>
<b>Africa</b>	<b>p. 3</b>
1. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic)	p. 3
2. Comoé National Park (Côte d'Ivoire)	p. 4
3. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea)	p. 5
4. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 5
5. Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 6
6. Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 6
7. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 7
8. Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo)	p. 7
9. Simien National Park (Ethiopia)	p. 8
10. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar)	p. 9
11. Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger)	p. 10
12. Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal)	p. 11
<b>Asia and the Pacific</b>	<b>p. 12</b>
13. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia)	p. 12
<b>Europe and North America</b>	<b>p. 13</b>
14. Everglades National Park (United States of America)	p. 13
<b>Latin America and the Caribbean</b>	<b>p. 13</b>
15. Belize Barrier Reef System (Belize)	p. 13
16. Los Katíos National Park (Colombia)	p. 14
17. Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras)	p. 14
<u><b>Cultural properties</b></u>	<b>p. 14</b>
<b>Africa</b>	<b>p. 14</b>
18. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda)	p. 14
19. Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Ruins of Songo Mnara (United Republic of Tanzania)	p. 16
<b>Arab States</b>	<b>p. 17</b>
20. Abu Mena (Egypt)	p. 17
21. Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq)	p. 17
22. Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq)	p. 18
23. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan)	p. 18
24. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen)	p. 18
<b>Asia and the Pacific</b>	<b>p. 20</b>
25. Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan)	p. 20

26. Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan)	p. 22
27. Bam and its Cultural Landscape (Islamic Republic of Iran)	p. 23
28. Fort and Shalamar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan)	p. 24
29. Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras (Philippines)	p. 26
<b>Europe and North America</b>	<b>p. 28</b>
30. Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery (Georgia)	p. 28
31. Historical Monuments of Mtskheta (Georgia)	p. 29
32. Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Serbia) <sup>1</sup>	p. 29
<b>Latin America and the Caribbean</b>	<b>p. 29</b>
33. Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works (Chile)	p. 29
34. Chan Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru)	p. 29
35. Coro and its Port (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela)	p. 31
<b>II. PROPERTIES DISCUSSED FOR IN-DANGER LISTING</b>	<b>p. 31</b>
<b><u>Natural properties</u></b>	<b>p. 31</b>
<b>Africa</b>	<b>p. 31</b>
1. Dja Faunal Reserve (Cameroon)	p. 31
2. Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya)	p. 32
<b>Europe and North America</b>	<b>p. 34</b>
3. Virgin Komi Forests (Russian Federation)	p. 34
<b>Latin America and the Caribbean</b>	<b>p. 34</b>
4. Pitons Management Area (Saint Lucia)	p. 34
<b><u>Cultural properties</u></b>	<b>p. 35</b>
<b>Africa</b>	<b>p. 35</b>
5. Timbuktu (Mali)	p. 35
6. Tomb of Askia (Mali)	p. 35
<b>Europe and North America</b>	<b>p. 35</b>
7. Cathedral, Alcázar and Archivo de Indias in Seville (Spain)	p. 35
8. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland)	p. 38
<b>Latin America and the Caribbean</b>	<b>p. 40</b>
9. Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama)	p. 40
10. Archaeological Site of Panamá Viejo and Historic District of Panamá (Panama)	p. 40

---

<sup>1</sup> **Note:** The Secretariat was informed by the Legal Advisor that “The UNESCO Secretariat follows the practice of the United Nations, which considers that the Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999) continues to be applicable to the territory of Kosovo until a final settlement be achieved”.

# I. PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER

## NATURAL PROPERTIES

### AFRICA

#### 1. Manovo Gounda St. Floris National Park (Central African Republic) (N 475)

##### Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

###### Brief synthesis

With an area of 1,740,000 ha, Manovo-Gounda St Floris is the largest park in the Central African savannas. Straddling the two ecological zones, Manovo-Gounda St Floris National Park owes its importance to its rich flora and fauna. It is home to many endangered species including the black rhino, elephant, hippopotamus and red-fronted gazelle as well as large concentrations of herbivores.

This Park is an interesting example of a “crossroads” where the species from savanna communities of East and West Africa, as well as those of the forest communities of the South, cross paths. The Park is a valuable area for the study of environmental changes occurring throughout the Sahel and Sudan under pressure from drought and overgrazing.

**Criterion (ix):** The Manovo Gounda St Floris National Park contains extraordinary natural formations. The Park straddles the Sudano-Sahelian and Sudano-Guinean biogeographical zones. This results in a variety of habitats from grassy plains in the north to savannas with gallery forests in the south. The property encompasses the entire watershed of three major rivers (Manovo, Koumbala and Gounda) with grassy floodplains and wetlands. The plains are interspersed with small granitic inselbergs with, to the south, the rugged sandstone massif of the Bongos.

This vast Park, surrounded by hunting areas and with a functional corridor to the National Park of Bamingui-Bangoran, protects the largest savanna of Central Africa. It represents a unique example of this type of ecosystem, home to viable populations of different species typical of this part of Africa and others from East and West Africa.

**Criterion (x):** The Park's wildlife reflects its transitional position between East and West Africa, the Sahel and the rainforests. It contains the richest fauna of the country including about 57 species of mammals that have been well protected in the past. In this respect, it resembles the rich savannas of East Africa.

Several important large mammal species in terms of conservation live in the Park, such as black rhino, elephant, hippopotamus, red-fronted gazelle (here at the southern limit of its range), lion, leopard, cheetah and wild dog. There are large concentrations of herbivores, including buffalo, Buffon's kob, waterbuck, and red hartebeest. Some 320 species of birds have been recorded in the Park, of which at least 25 species of raptors. Flood plains to the north of the Park are largely adequate for water birds, and the shoebill has been observed in the Park.

###### Integrity

With a total area of 1,740,000 ha, the Park is almost completely surrounded by the game reserves of Ouandija-Vakaga and Aouk-Aoukalé (480,000 ha and 330,000 ha respectively), which provide effective protection against threats to the property from surrounding areas. Other hunting areas and reserves are also connected with the property, resulting in a contiguous area of 80,000 km<sup>2</sup> of protected areas. The property is large enough to ensure species viability.

Nevertheless, the integrity of the Park is a cause for concern because of the numerous threats, poaching in particular (notably of rhinoceros, elephant and giraffe) and grazing. The lack of

protection and land management measures was also noted at the time of inscription of the property.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The site has National Park status. It is governed by the 1984 Wildlife Protection Code on which the national legislation on the management of protected areas is based. At the time of inscription, the Park was managed by a private company (Manova SA) which benefited from a governmental contract to manage the site. The Park was then regarded as the best-managed protected area of the country.

Today, conservation is under the authority of the Ministry of Water and Forests, Hunting and Fishing, with a structure consisting of the Chief of Staff, the Director-General of Water, Forests, Hunting and Fishing, the Director of Wildlife and Protected Areas, the regional directors, site managers and national conservators. Two bases (Manova and Gordil) are situated alongside the Park, to the east and west, but only the former is truly functional. Anti-poaching actions are primarily organised from these bases, limited by the lack of personnel, means of transport and the prevailing insecurity in the Park.

The region is sparsely populated. However, nomad pastoralists from the Sudanese region of Nyala and from Chad, with 30 – 40,000 head of cattle, enter the Park every winter – the dry season grazing halt on their traditional seasonal migration routes. There is also dispersed and limited agricultural activity in the environs of the Park.

The pressures of poaching and grazing highlight the need for a functional management or development plan for the Park. This plan should take into account the zoning of the Park and its relationship with the Village Hunting Zones in the periphery, with participative management and a Development Plan for the entire north-east territory (grazing areas and redefinition of the seasonal migration corridors).

The creation of a transborder “Zakouma National Park (Chad) –Manovo Gounda St Floris National Park” protected area is also desirable.

## **2. Comoé National Park (Côte d’Ivoire) (N 227)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Comoé National Park, situated in the north-east of Côte d’Ivoire, with the surface of 1149450 ha, is one of the largest protected areas in West Africa. It is characterized by its great plant diversity. The Comoé River, which runs through the Park, explains the presence of group of plants that are usually found further south, such as the shrub savannas and patches of thick rainforest. The property thus constitutes an outstanding example of transitional habitat between the forest and the savanna. The variety of the habitats engenders a wide diversity of wildlife species.

**Criterion (ix):** The property, due to its geographical location and vast area dedicated to the conservation of natural resources, is an ecological unit of particular importance. Its geomorphology comprises wide plains with deep ridges carved by the Comoé River and its tributaries (Bavé, Iringou, Kongo), allowing humid plant growth towards the north and favouring the presence of wildlife in the forest zone. The property also contains green rocky inselbergs in a north-south line, surmounted by rocky ridges that form in the centre and the north, isolated massifs and small chains of 500m to 600m in altitude. Comoé National Park contains a remarkable variety of habitats, notably savannas, wooded savannas, gallery forests, fluvial forests and riparian grasslands providing an outstanding example of transitional habitats from forest to savanna. Currently, the property is one of the rare sanctuaries for a variety of West-African biological species.

**Criterion (x):** Due to the phytogeographical situation and the crossing of the River Comoé for over 230 kilometres, Comoé National Park teems with a vast variety of animal and plant species. This location in fact makes this property a zone where the areas of division of numerous west-African plant and animal species mingle. The property contains around 620 plant species, 135 species of mammals, (including 11 primates, 11 carnivores and 21 species

of artiodactyla), 35 amphibian species and 500 bird species (a little less than 20% of which are inter-African migratory birds and roughly 5% palearctic migratory birds). Several of these bird species enjoy international protection, among which the Denham's Bustard (*Neotis denhami*), the yellow casqued hornbill (*Ceratogymna elata*) and the brown-cheeked hornbill (*Bycanistes cylindricus*). The property also contains 36 of the 38 species of the biome of the Sudo-Guinean savanna inventoried in the country as well as resident populations of species that have become rare in West Africa, such as the Jabiru *Ephippiorhynchus senegalensis*. The different waters of the Comoé River and its tributaries are the habitat for 60 species of fish. As concerns reptiles, three species of crocodiles are found in the Park – including the dwarf crocodile (*Osteolaemus tetraspis*) – which are on the IUCN Red List. The property also contains three other threatened species which are the Chimpanzee, the African wild dog *Lycaon pictus* and the Elephant *Loxodonta africana*.

### **Integrity**

Comoé National Park is one of the rare zones in West Africa that has maintained its ecological integrity. The property is sufficiently vast to guarantee the ecological integrity of the species that it contains, on the condition, however, that poaching is reduced. The boundaries have been clearly established and defined to include the watersheds or ecosystems in their entirety. However, if the boundaries were extended to the Mounts Gorowi and Kongoli, the ecological value of the property would be greatly increased, as this area could provide the elephants with a particularly suitable habitat and also enable the protection of other important species. The World Heritage Committee has, therefore, recommended to the State Party to extend the south-west part of the Park to include the Mounts Gorowi and Kongoli.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The property was inscribed on the List of the World Heritage in Danger in 2003 because of the potential impact of civil unrest; decrease in the populations of large mammals due to increased and uncontrolled poaching; and the lack of efficient management mechanisms. The property is protected by various national laws. The main management challenges are combating poaching, human settlements, agricultural pressure and insufficient management and access control. In order to reduce these problems, an efficient surveillance system throughout the property, and the establishment of participatory management with local communities are required to diminish the pressures and impacts associated with the management of areas located on the periphery of the property. These measures shall be reflected in the overall management structure of the property. A sustainable funding strategy is also indispensable to guarantee the human and financial resources required for the long-term management of the property.

## **3. Mount Nimba Strict Nature Reserve (Côte d'Ivoire and Guinea) (N 155 bis)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

## **4. Virunga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 63)**

A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

### **Statement of Significance (Decision 31 COM 8B.74)**

Virunga National Park is notable for its chain of active volcanoes and the greatest diversity of habitats of any park in Africa: from steppes, savannas and lava plains, swamps, lowland and Afromontane forests, to the unique Afroalpine vegetation and icefields of the Ruwenzori

mountains, which culminate in peaks above 5000m. The site includes the spectacular Ruwenzori and Virunga Massifs, including Africa's two most active volcanoes. The great diversity of habitats harbors an exceptional biodiversity, including endemic as well as rare and globally endangered species, such as the mountain gorilla.

**Criterion (vii):** Virunga National Park presents some of the most dramatic mountain scenery in Africa. The rugged Ruwenzori mountains with their snowcapped peaks and steep slopes and valleys and the volcanoes of the Virunga Massif, both with Afroalpine vegetation with giant heathers and Lobelias and densely forested slopes, are areas of exceptional natural beauty. The active volcanoes, which erupt every few years, form the dominant landforms of the exceptional scenery. The park contains several other spectacular landscapes such as the erosion valleys of the Sinda and Ishango areas. The park also contains great concentrations of wildlife, including elephants, buffalo and Uganda kob, and the highest concentration of hippopotamus in Africa, with 20,000 individuals on the shores of Lake Edward and along the Rwindi, Rutshuru and Semliki rivers.

**Criterion (viii):** Virunga National Park is situated at the heart of the Albertine Rift sector of the Great Rift Valley. In the southern section of the park, tectonic activity resulting from crustal extension of this area gave rise to the Virunga Massif, composed of eight volcanoes, of which seven are situated or partly situated in the park. These include Africa's two most active volcanoes, Nyamuragira and the neighbouring Nyiragongo, which alone account for two-fifths of the historical volcanic eruptions on the African continent. They are especially notable because of their highly fluid alkaline lavas. The activity of Nyiragongo is globally significant for its demonstration of lava lake volcanism, with a quasi-permanent lava lake at the bottom of its crater, periodic draining of which has been catastrophic to the local communities. The northern section of the park includes around 20% of the Rwenzori Massif, the largest glaciated area in Africa and the only truly alpine mountain range on the continent, and adjoins the Rwenzori National Park World Heritage Site in Uganda, with which it shares Mount Margherita, the third highest peak in Africa (5109m).

**Criterion (x):** Due to its variation in altitude (ranging between 680m and 5109m), rainfall and soils, Virunga National Park contains a very high diversity of plants and habitats, resulting in the highest biological diversity of any national park in Africa. More than 2000 higher plants have been identified, of which 10% are endemic to the Albertine Rift. Approximately 15% of the vegetation are Afromontane forests. The Albertine Rift has also more endemic vertebrate species than any other region of mainland Africa, an important number of which can be found in the park. The park harbors 218 mammal species, 706 bird species, 109 reptile species and 78 amphibian species. The park is home to 22 species of primates, including three great ape species (mountain gorilla *Gorilla beringei beringei*, eastern lowland gorilla *Gorilla beringei graueri* and eastern chimpanzee *Pan troglodytes schweinfurthi*), with one third of the remaining mountain gorilla population in the world. The savanna areas of the park are home to a diverse population of ungulates, with one of the highest biomass densities of wild mammals ever recorded on Earth (314 tonnes/km<sup>2</sup>). Ungulates include the rare Okapi (*Okapi johnstoni*), endemic to the DRC, and the Ruwenzori duiker (*Cephalophus rubidus*), endemic to the Ruwenzori mountains. The park contains significant wetland areas, particularly important as wintering grounds for Palearctic bird species.

## **5. Garamba National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 136)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

## **6. Kahuzi-Biega National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 137)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property

and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

## **7. Salonga National Park (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 280)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

## **8. Okapi Wildlife Reserve (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (N 718)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Okapi Wildlife Reserve contains flora of outstanding diversity and provides refuge to numerous endemic and threatened species, including one-sixth of the existing Okapi population. The Reserve protects one-fifth of the Ituri forest, a Pleistocene refuge dominated by dense evergreen « Mbau » and humid semi-evergreen forests, combined with swamp forests that grow alongside the waterways, and clearings called locally « edos » and inselbergs.

**Criterion (x):** With its bio-geographical location, wealth of biotopes and the presence of numerous species that are rare or absent in the adjacent low altitude forests, it is probable that the Ituri forest served, during earlier drier climatic periods, as refuge for the tropical rainforest. To the north of the Reserve, the granite rocky outcrops, provide refuge to a plant species particularly adapted to this microclimate, characterised by numerous endemic species such as the Giant Cycad (*Encephalocarpus ituriensis*).

The Reserve contains 101 mammal species and 376 species of documented birds. The population of the endemic species of Okapi (*Okapia johnstoni*), a forest giraffe, is estimated at 5,000 individuals. Among the endemic mammals of the forest in the north-east of the DRC identified in the Reserve, are the aquatic genet (*Osbornictis piscivora*) and the giant genet (*Genetta victoriae*). The Reserve provides refuge to 17 species of primates (including 13 diurnal and 4 nocturnal), the highest number for an African forest, including 7,500 chimpanzees (*Pan troglodytes*).

The Reserve also contains one of the most diverse populations of forest ungulates with 14 species, including six types of cephalophus. It also provides refuge to the largest population of forest elephants (*Loxodonta africana cyclotis*) still present in eastern DRC, estimated at 7,500 individuals, and it is important for the conservation of other forest species such as the bongo (*Tragelaphus eurycerus*), the dwarf antelope (*Neotragus batesi*), the water chevratina (*Hyemoschus aquaticus*), the forest buffalo (*Syncerus caffer nanus*) and the giant forest hog (*Hylochoerus meinertzhageni*). It is also documented as one of the most important protected areas in Africa for the conservation of birds, with the presence of numerous emblematic species such as the Congo Peafowl (*Afropavo congensis*), as well as numerous endemic species in eastern DRC.

#### **Integrity**

The forests of the Reserve are among the best preserved in the Congo Basin and its area is considered sufficient to maintain its wildlife. The Reserve is part of a larger forestry area, that of Ituri, which remains almost untouched by logging and agricultural activities.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

The property is protected under a Wildlife Reserve statute. The Reserve contains a large indigenous population, the Mbuti and Efe pygmies, and the forest ecosystem is essential for both their economic and cultural requirements. A management plan covering three management areas in the Reserve has been proposed.



This includes a fully protected core zone of 282,000 ha comprising 20% of the Reserve where all hunting is prohibited, and an area of 950,000 ha for traditional use, where self-regulated hunting, using traditional methods, is authorized to cover the basic needs of the human population of the Reserve in forest products. Permanent installations and agricultural clearing are authorized in the 18,000 ha development area that comprises a narrow band on each side of the No. 4 national road crossing through the central part of the Reserve, and along a secondary road that links Mambasa to Mungbere, at the eastern border of the property. There are plans to make the whole protected area a national park. A buffer zone of 50 km wide has been defined around the entire Reserve.

The primary management challenges facing this Reserve are immigration control in the development area, prohibition of agricultural encroachment within the 10 km wide strip located along the road, and ensuring the involvement of the indigenous populations, Mbuti and Efe pygmies, in the management of the Reserve. Another key challenge concerns the control of commercial poaching and artisanal mining. While the Reserve benefits from support from various NGOs and additional funding, it is imperative to obtain human and logistical resources to ensure the effective management of the property and its buffer zone.

## **9. Simien National Park (Ethiopia) (N 9)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Simien National Park, in northern Ethiopia is a spectacular landscape, where massive erosion over millions of years has created jagged mountain peaks, deep valleys and sharp precipices dropping some 1,500 m. The park is of global significance for biodiversity conservation because it is home to globally threatened species, including the iconic Walia ibex, a wild mountain goat found nowhere else in the world, the Gelada baboon and the Ethiopian wolf.

**Criterion (vii):** The property's spectacular landscape is part of the Simien mountain massif, which is located on the northern limit of the main Ethiopian plateau and includes the highest point in Ethiopia, Ras Dejen. The undulating plateau of the Simien mountains has over millions of years been eroded to form precipitous cliffs and deep gorges of exceptional natural beauty. Some cliffs reach 1,500 m in height and the northern cliff wall extends for some 35 km. The mountains are bounded by deep valleys to the north, east and south, and offer vast vistas over the rugged-canyon like lowlands below. The spectacular scenery of the Simien mountains is considered to rival Colorado's Grand Canyon.

**Criterion (x):** The property is of global significance for biodiversity conservation. It forms part of the Afroalpine Centre of Plant Diversity and the Eastern Afromontane biodiversity hotspot, and it is home to a number of globally threatened species. The cliff areas of the park are the main habitat of the Endangered Walia ibex (*Capra walie*), a wild mountain goat which is endemic to the Simien Mountains. Other flagship species include the Endangered Ethiopian wolf (or Simien fox, *Canis simensis*), considered to be the rarest canid species in the world and the Gelada baboon (*Theropithecus gelada*), both of which are endemic to the Ethiopian highlands and depend on Afroalpine grasslands and heathlands. Other large mammal species include the Anubis baboon, Hamadryas baboon, klipspringer, and golden jackal. The park is also an Important Bird Area that forms part of the larger Endemic Bird Area of the Central Ethiopian Highlands. In total, over 20 large mammal species and over 130 bird species occur in the park. The mountains are home to 5 small mammal species and 16 bird species endemic to Eritrea and/or Ethiopia as well as an important population of the rare lammergeyer, a spectacular vulture species. The park's richness in species and habitats is a result of its great altitudinal, topographic and climatic diversity, which have shaped its Afromontane and Afroalpine ecosystems.

#### **Integrity**

The property was established in an area inhabited by humans and, at the time of inscription, 80% of the park was under human use of one form or another. Threats to the integrity of the park include human settlement, cultivation and soil erosion, particularly around the village of

Gich; frequent fires in the tree heather forest; and excessive numbers of domestic stock. Agricultural and pastoral activities, including both cultivation of a significant area of the property and grazing of a large population of animals in particular have severely affected the natural values of the property, including the critical habitats of the Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf. The boundaries of the property include key areas essential for maintaining the scenic values of the property. However, they do not encompass all the areas necessary to maintain and enhance the populations of the Walia ibex and Ethiopian wolf, and a proposal to revise and extend the park boundaries was put forward in the original nomination. Whilst human settlements threaten the integrity of the originally inscribed property, two proposed extensions of the national park (the Masarerya and the Limalimo Wildlife Reserves, and also the Ras Dejen mountain and Silki-Kidis Yared sectors) and their interlinking corridors are free of human settlement and cultivation, and support the key species that are central parts of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. Several assessments have considered that an extension of the property to match extended boundaries of the National Park, which to include areas with negligible human population are an essential requirement to maintain its Outstanding Universal Value.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The national park was established in 1969 and is recognised and protected under national protected areas legislation. The property requires an effective management presence and the maintenance and increasing of staff levels and training. Key tasks for the management of the park include the effective protection of the park's flagship species and close cooperation with local communities in order to reduce the pressure on the park's resources arising from agricultural expansion, livestock overstocking and overharvesting of natural resources. The pressures on the property are likely to increase further as a result of global climate change. Significant financial support is needed for the management of the park, and the development of alternative livelihood options for local communities. The development, implementation, review and monitoring of a management plan and the revision and extension of the park boundaries, with the full participation of local communities, is essential. Community partnership is particularly important to both reduce community dependence on unsustainable use of the resources of the national park, and also to develop sustainable livelihoods. Adequate finance to support resettlement of populations living in the property, on a fully voluntary basis, and to introduce effective management of grazing is also essential to reduce the extreme pressure on wildlife. Improving and increasing ecotourism facilities, without impairing the park's natural and scenic values, has great potential to create additional revenue for the property. Environmental education and training programmes are also needed to support communities in and around the property as well as to maintain community support and partnership in the management of the property in order to ensure it remains of Outstanding Universal Value.

## **10. Rainforests of the Atsinanana (Madagascar) (N 1257)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 31 COM 8B.9)**

The Rainforests of the Atsinanana are a serial property comprising six components. They contain globally outstanding biodiversity and have an exceptional proportion of endemic plant and animal species. The level of endemism within the property is approximately 80 to 90 percent for all groups, and endemic families and genera are common. The serial property comprises a representative selection of the most important habitats of the unique rainforest biota of Madagascar, including many threatened and endemic plant and animal species.

**Criterion (ix):** The Rainforests of the Atsinanana are relict forests, largely associated with steeper terrain along the eastern escarpment and mountains of Madagascar. The protected areas included in this serial property have become critically important for maintaining ongoing ecological processes necessary for the survival of Madagascar's unique biodiversity. This biodiversity reflects Madagascar's geological history and geographic placement. It is the world's fourth largest island and has been separated from all other land masses for at least 60-80 million years and thus most of its plant and animal life has evolved in isolation. These forests have also offered important refuge for species during past periods of climate change

and will be essential for the adaptation and survival of species in the light of future climate change.

**Criterion (x):** The level of endemism within the property is approximately 80 to 90 percent for all groups, and endemic families and genera are common. Madagascar is among the top countries known for their "megadiversity" and features an extraordinarily high number (circa 12,000) of endemic plant species. The property is also globally significant for fauna, especially primates, with all five families of Malagasy primates, all endemic lemur families, seven endemic genera of Rodentia, six endemic genera of Carnivora, as well as several species of Chiroptera represented. Of the 123 species of non-flying mammals in Madagascar (72 of which are on the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species), 78 occur within the property. The critical importance of the property is underlined by the fact that deforestation has left eastern Madagascar with only 8.5 percent of its original forests and the property protects key areas of this remaining habitat.

All components of the serial property are formally protected as national parks and have management plans in place. Key management issues include effective control of agricultural encroachment and resource exploitation from logging, hunting, and gem mining. These issues require the implementation of clear and coordinated management strategies to manage the components of this serial property as a single entity. Also, coordinated planning and management of this serial property with adjacent protected areas and forest corridors is required, for which additional financial and human resources need to be obtained. There is potential for further extension of the property to include adjacent protected areas and forest corridors once they meet the conditions of integrity.

## 11. Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves (Niger) (N 573)

### Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

#### Brief synthesis

The Air and Ténéré Natural Reserves is one of the largest protected areas in Africa, covering 7,736,000 hectares. It is the last bastion of Saharo-Sahelian wildlife in Niger. It comprises two main zones: the mountain massifs of Air rising up to 2000 m in altitude and the vast plain of the Ténéré desert. In the heart of a desert environment, the Air represents a small pocket of Sahelian plant life with Sudanese and Saharo-Mediterranean elements.

**Criterion (vii):** The Air constitutes a Sahelian enclave surrounded by a Saharian desert, thus forming a remarkable assemblage of relict ecosystems combined with mountain and plain landscapes of outstanding esthetic value and interest. The live dunes of the Ténéré rapidly modify the landscape through displacement and deposition of sand. The region contains the blue marble mountains that represent an exceptional aesthetic interest.

**Criterion (ix):** The Reserve of Air and Ténéré is the last bastion of Saharo-Sahelian wildlife in Niger. The isolation of the Air and the very minor human presence are the reasons for the survival in this region of numerous wildlife species that have been eliminated from other regions of the Sahara and the Sahel. The property contains a wide variety of habitats (living dunes, fixed dunes, stoney gravel desert, cliff valleys, canyons, high plateaus, water holes, etc.) necessary for the conservation of the Saharo Sahelian biological diversity.

**Criterion (x):** The property contains important natural habitats for the survival of the three antelopes of the Sahara Desert on IUCN's Red List of threatened species: the Dorcus gazelle (*Gazella dorcas dorcas*); the Leptocere gazelle (*Gazella leptoceros*); and the Addax (screw-horn antelope) (*Addax nasomaculatus*). About a sixth of the Reserve benefits from the statute of sanctuary for the protection of the Addax. The property contains important populations of species of ungulates of the Sahara and species of carnivore such as the fennec fox, Rüppells fox, and the cheetah. The massif of the Air also constitutes a transit zone for a large number of afrotropical and palaeartic migratory birds. In total, 40 species of mammals, 165 species of birds, 18 species of reptiles and one amphibian species have been identified in the Reserve. As concerns the flora, the steppe contains species of *Acacia ehrenbergiana*, *Acacia raddiana*, *Balanites aegyptiaca*, *Maerua crassifolia*, and at lower altitudes species of *Panicum turgidum* and *Stipagrostis vulnerans*. In the larger valleys where water in the alluvial

reservoirs is plentiful, a very specific habitat has developed associating a dense ligneous stratum of doum palms, date palms, *Acacia nilotica*, *Acacia raddiana*, *Boscia senegalensis*, *Salvadora persica*, and a herbaceous stratum with among others, *Stipagrostis vulnerans*.

### **Integrity**

The property is one of the largest protected areas in Africa covering a surface of 7,736,000 ha. Its central part (1,280,500ha) is listed as a strict reserve (Addax Sanctuary). As the desert species are found in very low densities, this large size is essential for their survival. In the boundaries of the Air mountains and the Ténéré desert, the boundaries are marked at all the principal entry points. An extension in the south-west to include a site for wildlife under certain rainfall conditions and to take into account a migration of Addax south-east to the Mt Termit region is under consideration.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 1992 due to political instability and dissention among the populations. The property benefits from legal protection and satisfactory management, with technical and financial support from the State and development partners. It does not have a management plan. Hunting and exploitation of wood products are forbidden in the Reserve; and access to the Addax Sanctuary is also strictly forbidden. Poaching and illegal grazing are the main threats that endanger the property. These threats are finding the beginnings of a solution with surveillance and awareness raising activities but much remains to be done to completely eliminate them. To minimize these problems, the physical presence of the management authorities in the Reserve needs to be strengthened; the respective land-use rights and access to resources by the local populations requires clarification, monitoring and surveillance of the property needs to be improved to combat the problems of poaching and the illegal extraction of natural resources and halt the collection of wood and haulm in the property for commercial purposes. The sustainable development and conservation of this property requires the strengthening of financial and technical support from the State and the development partners, in order to establish a development and management plan for the site, for efficient implementation a framework for inter-communal concertation, and to agree on the co-management of the natural resources of the property by the State and the concerned communities.

## **12. Niokolo-Koba National Park (Senegal) (N 153)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Located in the Sudano-Guinean zone, Niokolo-Koba National Park is characterized by its group of ecosystems typical of this region, over an area of 913 000ha. Watered by large waterways (the Gambia, Sereko, Niokolo, Koulountou), it comprises gallery forests, savannah grass floodplains, ponds, dry forests -- dense or with clearings -- rocky slopes and hills and barren Bowés. This remarkable plant diversity justifies the presence of a rich fauna characterized by: the Derby Eland (the largest of African antelopes), chimpanzees, lions, leopards, a large population of elephants as well as many species of birds, reptiles and amphibians.

**Criterion (x):** Niokolo-Koba National Park contains all the unique ecosystems of the Sudanese bioclimatic zone such as major waterways (the Gambia, Sereko, Niokolo, Koulountou), gallery-forests, herbaceous savanna floodplains, ponds, dry forests -- dense or with clearings-- rocky slopes and hills and barren Bowés. The property has a remarkable diversity of wildlife, unique in the sub-region. It counts more than 70 species of mammals, 329 species of birds, 36 species of reptiles, 20 species of amphibians and a large number of invertebrates. Lions, reputedly the largest in Africa, are a special attraction, as well as the Derby Eland, the largest antelope in existence. Other important species are also present, such as the elephant, leopard, African wild dog and chimpanzee. The wealth of habitats should be noted, along with the diversity of flora, with over 1,500 important plant species.

## Integrity

Covering nearly one million hectares, the Niokolo-Koba National Park is sufficiently vast as to illustrate the major aspects of the Guinean savanna-type ecosystem, and to ensure the survival of species therein. However, reports indicate a considerable poaching of elephants. The proposed dams on the Gambia and the Niokolo-Koba are also a concern because they would have disastrous consequences for the ecological integrity of the property.

## Protection and management requirements

The park is managed by a management administration under the direct supervision of the State through the Ministry of Environment and Nature Protection and the National Parks Directorate. In 2002, a development and management plan was elaborated. This plan should be kept up to date through regular revisions to strengthen the conservation of the property, and provided with adequate resources to ensure its effective implementation.

The property, inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 2007, is subject to many pressures such as poaching, bush fires, the premature drying up of ponds and their invasion by plants. To this must be added population growth and poor soil in the surrounds, which has led to encroachment on agricultural land and livestock wandering in the park. The priorities for the protection and management of the property are thus to implement urgent measures to halt poaching, improve the park's ecological monitoring programme, develop a plan for survival of endangered species, address premature drying up of the ponds and their invasion by plants or find alternative solutions, and minimize the illegal movement of livestock. It is also necessary to improve cross-border cooperation and measures to protect buffer zones and ecological corridors outside the park. For the long-term management, protection of the property should be a national policy, project and budgetary priority, with the assistance of development partners.

## ASIA AND THE PACIFIC

### 13. Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra (Indonesia) (N 1167)

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2004), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **28 COM 14B.5**):

**Criterion (vii):** The parks that comprise the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra are all located on the prominent main spine of the Bukit Barisan Mountains, known as the 'Andes of Sumatra'. Outstanding scenic landscapes abound at all scales. The mountains of each site present prominent mountainous backdrops to the settled and developed lowlands of Sumatra. The combination of the spectacularly beautiful Lake Gunung Tujuh (the highest lake in southeast Asia), the magnificence of the giant Mount Kerinci volcano, numerous small volcanic, coastal and glacial lakes in natural forested settings, fumaroles belching smoke from forested mountains and numerous waterfalls and cave systems in lush rainforest settings, emphasise the outstanding beauty of the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra.

**Criterion (ix):** The Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra represent the most important blocks of forest on the island of Sumatra for the conservation of the biodiversity of both lowland and mountain forests. This once vast island of tropical rainforest, in the space of only 50 years, has been reduced to isolated remnants including those centred on the three nominated sites. The Leuser Ecosystem, including the Gunung Leuser National Park, is by far the largest and most significant forest remnant remaining in Sumatra. All three parks would undoubtedly have been important climatic refugia for species over evolutionary time and have now become critically important refugia for future evolutionary processes.

**Criterion (x):** All three parks that comprise the Tropical Rainforest Heritage of Sumatra are areas of very diverse habitat and exceptional biodiversity. Collectively, the three sites include more than 50% of the total plant diversity of Sumatra. At least 92 local endemic species have been identified in Gunung Leuser National Park. The nomination contains populations of both the world's largest flower (*Rafflesia arnoldi*) and the tallest flower (*Amorphophallus titanum*). The relict lowland forests in the nominated sites are very important for conservation of the plant and animal biodiversity of the rapidly disappearing lowland forests of South East Asia. Similarly, the montane forests, although less threatened, are very important for conservation of the distinctive montane vegetation of the property.

## EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

### 14. Everglades National Park (United States of America) (N 76)

#### Statement of Significance (Decision 30 COM 11B)

Everglades National Park is the largest designated sub-tropical wilderness reserve on the North American continent. Its juncture at the interface of temperate and sub-tropical America, fresh and brackish water, shallow bays and deeper coastal waters creates a complex of habitats supporting a high diversity of flora and fauna. It contains the largest mangrove ecosystem in the Western Hemisphere, the largest continuous stand of sawgrass prairie and the most significant breeding ground for wading birds in North America.

**Criterion (viii):** The Everglades is a vast, nearly flat, seabed that was submerged at the end of the last Ice Age. Its limestone substrate is one of the most active areas of modern carbonate sedimentation.

**Criterion (ix):** The Everglades contains vast subtropical wetlands and coastal/marine ecosystems including freshwater marshes, tropical hardwood hammocks, pine rocklands, extensive mangrove forests, saltwater marshes, and seagrass ecosystems important to commercial and recreational fisheries. Complex biological processes range from basic algal associations through progressively higher species and ultimately to primary predators such as the alligator, crocodile, and Florida panther; the food chain is superbly evident and unbroken. The mixture of subtropical and temperate wildlife species is found nowhere else in the United States.

**Criterion (x):** Everglades National Park is a noteworthy example of viable biological processes. The exceptional variety of its water habitats has made it a sanctuary for a large number of birds and reptiles and it provides refuge for over 20 rare, endangered, and threatened species. These include the Florida panther, snail kite, alligator, crocodile, and manatee. It provides important foraging and breeding habitat for more than 400 species of birds, includes the most significant breeding grounds for wading birds in North America and is a major corridor for migration.

## LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN

### 15. Belize Barrier Reef System (Belize) (N 764)

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

## **16. Los Katíos National Park (Colombia) (N 711)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

## **17. Río Plátano Biosphere Reserve (Honduras) (N 196)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

## **CULTURAL PROPERTIES**

### **AFRICA**

## **18. Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda) (C 1022)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

The Tombs of Buganda Kings constitute a site embracing 26.8 hectares of Kasubi hillside within Kampala City.

The site is the major spiritual centre for the Baganda where traditional and cultural practices have been preserved. The Kasubi Tombs are the most active religious place in the kingdom, where rituals are frequently performed. Its place as the burial ground for the previous four kings (Kabakas) qualifies it as a religious centre for the royal family, a place where the Kabaka and his representatives carry out important rituals related to Buganda culture. The site represents a place where communication links with the spiritual world are maintained.

Its spatial organization, starting from the border of the site marked with the traditional bark cloth trees, leading through the gatehouse, the main courtyard, and culminating in the large thatched building, housing the tombs of the four Kabakas, represents the best existing example of a Baganda palace/burial site.

At its core on the hilltop is the main tomb building, locally referred to as the "Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga" which is a masterpiece of this ensemble. A tomb building has been in existence since the 13th century. The latest building was the former palace of the Kabakas of Baganda, built in 1882 and converted into the royal burial ground in 1884. Four royal tombs now lie within the Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga.

The main tomb building, which is circular and surmounted by a dome, is a major example of an architectural achievement that was raised with use of vegetal materials comprised of wooden poles, spear grass, reeds and wattle. Its unusual scale and outstanding details bear witness to the creative genius of the Baganda and as a masterpiece of form and craftsmanship, it is an exceptional surviving example of an architectural style developed by the powerful Buganda Kingdom since the 13th Century.

The built and natural elements of the Kasubi Tombs site are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. The site is a major spiritual centre for the Baganda and is the most active religious place in the kingdom. The structures and the traditional practices that are associated with the site are one of the exceptional representations of the African culture that depict a continuity of a living tradition. The site's main significance lies in its intangible values of beliefs, spirituality, continuity and identity of the Baganda people. The site serves as an important historical and cultural symbol for Uganda and East Africa as a whole.

**Criterion (i):** The Kasubi Tombs site is a master piece of human creativity both in its conception and its execution.

**Criterion (iii):** The Kasubi Tombs site bears eloquent witness to the living cultural traditions of the Baganda.

**Criterion (iv):** The spatial organization of the Kasubi Tombs site represents the best extant example of a Baganda palace/architectural ensemble. Built in the finest traditions of Ganda architecture and palace design, it reflects technical achievements developed over many centuries.

**Criterion (vi):** The built and natural elements of the Kasubi Tombs site are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. It is a major spiritual centre for the Baganda and is the most active religious place in the kingdom.

### **Integrity (2010)**

The boundary of the land on which the tombs are located is clearly marked with the traditional bark cloth tree (*Ficus sp.*) and coincides with the 1882 traditional boundary. The live markers have been useful in keeping away land encroachers for housing construction and other developments, thus maintaining the original land size. The architectural palace design that comprise of the placement of the buildings, and tombs/ grave yards of members of the royal family around the Muzibu-Azaala- Mpanga reflecting the traditional palace structure is still being maintained in its original ensemble.

Although the recent fire tragedy, that destroyed the main tomb building, means that one key attribute is now missing, the cultural traditions associated with building in poles, spear grass, reeds and wattle are still vibrant and will allow the recreation of this tomb building.

The other traditional structures are still in place and the key attributes related to traditional ceremonial and religious practices and land tenure and land use practices are still being maintained.

### **Authenticity (2010)**

The authenticity of the Tombs of the Kings of Buganda at Kasubi is reflected in the continuity of the traditional and cultural practices that are associated with the site. The original burial system of the Kabakas of Buganda is still being maintained. The placement of Muzibu-Azaala- Mpanga in the middle of other buildings around the large central courtyard (Olugya), with a forecourt containing the drum house and entry gate house, are a typical ensemble of the Buganda Kingdom palace. The practice of using grass thatched roof resting on structural rings of palm tree fronds is still being maintained as well as the internal elements and finishing materials such as the long wooden poles wrapped in bark cloth decoration. Although the authenticity of the site has been weakened by the loss to the fire of the main tomb structure, the building's traditional architectural craftsmanship and the required skills are still available to allow it to be recreated. This factor, coupled with the extensive documentation of the building, will allow an authentic renewal of this key attribute.

### **Protection and management requirements (2010)**

Managed by the Buganda Kingdom, the property was gazetted a protected site under Statutory Instrument No. 163 of 1972 and under Historical Monument Act (Act 22 of 1967). This legal status was further strengthened by the National Constitution (1995). The Historical Monument Act protects the Kasubi Tombs from residential encroachment or any other purpose inconsistent with its character. The land that hosts the Tombs is titled under the Land Act (1998). The land title is registered in trust of the Kabaka (King) on behalf of the Kingdom.

The protection of the site is further strengthened by the various Tourism Policies of Uganda. The site has an approved General Management Plan (2009 - 2015). A Site Manager is in place.

The greatest threat to the site is fire. There is a need to develop a detailed Risk Management Plan to address this threat, in particular, and to ensure that site documented is as complete as possible and securely stored.

In order to ensure that the traditional building processes associated with the site are maintained over time, there is an on-going need to train young educated people.



There is a need to ensure that the principles guiding the recreation of the main tomb building are agreed by all the key stakeholders - the UNESCO World Heritage Committee, the Buganda Kingdom and the Government of the Republic of Uganda, and that the process of recreating the building is systematic, based on evidence and adequately recorded.

## **19. Ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Ruins of Songo Mnara (United Republic of Tanzania) (C 144)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Located on two islands close to each other just off the Tanzanian coast about 300km south of Dar es Salaam are the remains of two port cities, Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara. The larger, Kilwa Kisiwani, was occupied from the 9th to the 19th century and reached its peak of prosperity in the 13th and 14th centuries. In 1331-1332, the great traveler, Ibn Battouta made a stop here and described Kilwa as one of the most beautiful cities of the world.

Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara were Swahili trading cities and their prosperity was based on control of Indian Ocean trade with Arabia, India and China, particularly between the 13th and 16th centuries, when gold and ivory from the hinterland was traded for silver, carnelians, perfumes, Persian faience and Chinese porcelain. Kilwa Kisiwani minted its own currency in the 11th to 14th centuries. In the 16th century, the Portuguese established a fort on Kilwa Kisiwani and the decline of the two islands began.

The remains of Kilwa Kisiwani cover much of the island with many parts of the city still unexcavated. The substantial standing ruins, built of coral and lime mortar, include the Great Mosque constructed in the 11th century and considerably enlarged in the 13th century, and roofed entirely with domes and vaults, some decorated with embedded Chinese porcelain; the palace Husuni Kubwa built between c1310 and 1333 with its large octagonal bathing pool; Husuni Ndogo, numerous mosques, the Gereza (prison) constructed on the ruins of the Portuguese fort and an entire urban complex with houses, public squares, burial grounds, etc.

The ruins of Songo Mnara, at the northern end of the island, consist of the remains of five mosques, a palace complex, and some thirty-three domestic dwellings constructed of coral stones and wood within enclosing walls.

The islands of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara bear exceptional testimony to the expansion of Swahili coastal culture, the Islamisation of East Africa and the extraordinarily extensive and prosperous Indian Ocean trade from the medieval period up to the modern era.

**Criterion (iii):** Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara provide exceptional architectural, archaeological and documentary evidence for the growth of Swahili culture and commerce along the East African coast from the 9th to the 19th centuries, offering important insights regarding economic, social and political dynamics in this region.

The Great Mosque of Kilwa Kisiwani is the oldest standing mosque on the East African coast and, with its sixteen domed and vaulted bays, has a unique plan. Its true great dome dating from the 13th was the largest dome in East Africa until the 19th century.

#### **Integrity (2010)**

The key attributes conveying outstanding universal value are found on the islands of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara. However, two associated groups of attributes at Kilwa Kivinje, a mainly 19th century trading town, and Sanje Ya Kati, an island to the south of Kilwa where there are ruins covering 400 acres, including houses and a mosque that date to the 10th century or even earlier, are not included within the boundaries of the property.

The property is subject to invasion by vegetation and inundation by the sea, and vulnerable to encroachment by new buildings and agriculture activities that threaten the buried archaeological resources. The continued deterioration and decay of the property leading to collapse of the historical and archeological structures for which the property was inscribed, resulted in the property being placed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 2004.

### **Authenticity (2010)**

The ability of the islands to continue to express truthfully their values has been maintained in terms of design and materials due to limited consolidation of the structures using coral stone and other appropriate materials, but is vulnerable, particularly on Kilwa Kisiwani to urban encroachment and coastal damage as these threaten the ability to understand the overall layout of the mediaeval port city. The ability of the sites to retain their authenticity depends on implementation of an ongoing conservation programme that addresses all the corrective measures necessary to achieve removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

### **Protection and management requirements (2010)**

The sites comprising the property are legally protected through the existing cultural resource policy (2008), Antiquities Law (the Antiquities Act of 1964 and its Amendment of 1979) and established Rules and Regulations. Both the Antiquities laws and regulations are currently being reviewed.

The property is administered under the authority of the Antiquities Division. A site Manager and Assistant Conservators are responsible for the management of the sites. A Management Plan was established in 2004 and is currently under revision. Key management issues include climate change impact due to increased wave action and beach erosion; encroachment on the site by humans and animals (cattle and goats); an inadequate conservation programme for all the monuments, and inadequate community participation and awareness of associated benefits.

Long term major threats to the site will be addressed and mechanisms for involvement of the community and other stakeholders will be employed to ensure the sustainable conservation and continuity of the site. There is a need for better zoning of the property for planning in order to ensure development and agricultural uses do not impact adversely on the structures and buried archaeology.

## **ARAB STATES**

### **20. Abu Mena (Egypt) (C 90)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

### **21. Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) (Iraq) (C 1130)**

No Statement is available for this property.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2003), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **27 COM 8C.45**):

**Criterion (iii):** Founded in the 3rd millennium BCE, the most important role of Ashur was from the 14th to 9th century BCE when it was the first capital of the Assyrian empire. Ashur was also the religious capital of Assyrians, and the place for crowning and burial of its kings;

**Criterion (iv):** The excavated remains of the public and residential buildings of Ashur provide an outstanding record of the evolution of building practice from the Sumerian and Akkadian period through the Assyrian Empire, as well as including the short revival during the Parthian period.

## 22. Samarra Archaeological City (Iraq) (C 276 rev)

### Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 31 COM 8B.23)

The ancient capital of Samarra dating from 836-892 provides outstanding evidence of the Abbasid Caliphate which was the major Islamic empire of the period, extending from Tunisia to Central Asia. It is the only surviving Islamic capital that retains its original plan, architecture and arts, such as mosaics and carvings. Samarra has the best preserved plan of an ancient large city, being abandoned relatively early and so avoiding the constant rebuilding of longer lasting cities.

Samarra was the second capital of the Abbasid Caliphate after Baghdad. Following the loss of the monuments of Baghdad, Samarra represents the only physical trace of the Caliphate at its height.

The city preserves two of the largest mosques (Al-Malwiya and Abu Dulaf) and the most unusual minarets, as well as the largest palaces in the Islamic world (the Caliphal Palace Qasr al-Khalifa, al-Ja'fari, al Ma'shuq, and others). Carved stucco known as the Samarra style was developed there and spread to other parts of the Islamic world at that time. A new type of ceramic known as Lustre Ware was also developed in Samarra, imitating utensils made of precious metals such as gold and silver.

**Criterion (ii):** Samarra represents a distinguished architectural stage in the Abbasid period by virtue of its mosques, its development, the planning of its streets and basins, its architectural decoration, and its ceramic industries.

**Criterion (iii):** Samarra is the finest preserved example of the architecture and city planning of the Abbasid Caliphate, extending from Tunisia to Central Asia, and one of the world's great powers of that period. The physical remains of this empire are usually poorly preserved since they are frequently built of unfired brick and reusable bricks.

**Criterion (iv):** The buildings of Samarra represent a new artistic concept in Islamic architecture in the Malwiya and Abu Dulaf mosques, in the form of a unique example in the planning, capacity and construction of Islamic mosques by comparison with those which preceded and succeeded it. In their large dimensions and unique minarets, these mosques demonstrate the pride and political and religious strength that correspond with the strength and pride of the empire at that time.

Since the war in Iraq commenced in 2003, this property has been occupied by multi-national forces that use it as a theatre for military operations.

The conditions of integrity and authenticity appear to have been met, to the extent evaluation is possible without a technical mission of assessment. After abandonment by the Caliphate, occupation continued in a few areas near the nucleus of the modern city but most of the remaining area was left untouched until the early 20th century. The archaeological site is partially preserved, with losses caused mainly by ploughing and cultivation, minor in comparison with other major sites. Restoration work has been in accordance with international standards.

The boundaries of the core and buffer zones appear to be both realistic and adequate. Prior to current hostilities, the State Party protected the site from intrusions, whether farming or urban, under the Archaeological Law. Protective procedures have been in abeyance since 2003 and the principal risk to the property arises from the inability of the responsible authorities to exercise control over the management and conservation of the site.

## 23. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

No Statement is available for this property.

## 24. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)

### Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)

#### Brief synthesis

Zabid is one of the coastal towns in Tehama area west of Yemen, sitting on a rise above the river junction and the fertile flood plain. It is a circular fortified town with four remaining gates, which was supplied with water by extensive canals. It was already flourishing when Islam was established in the region in the 7th century. Its development is due to Ibn Ziyad (the founder of the Ziyadite dynasty), who was sent to the region by the Caliph al-Mamun in 820 AD to quell a rebellion.

The core of the town is its first mosque, Asa'ir. The Great Mosque lies to the west of the town to which spread the souq. Zabid has the highest concentration of mosques in Yemen, some 86 in all, mainly simple brick structures but some with elaborate carved brick and stucco decoration. Fourteen of these date to the Rasulid period - all of them madrasas - and are the largest group of buildings from this period in Yemen.

A network of narrow alleys spreads over the town and its vernacular buildings, typical of the southern Arabian Peninsula, give the town outstanding visual qualities. The houses, built of burnt brick, display similar plans with a reception room, murabba, opening onto an enclosed yard. The larger houses extend upwards to two or three storeys and have fine, elaborate interiors with skilfully carved brick walls, niches and ceilings.

The city with its narrow closed streets, traditional houses and minarets is an outstanding example of a homogeneous architectural ensemble that reflects the spatial characteristics of the early years of Islam. Around the town are cemeteries, notably the one to the north-west with a mosque, a well and shady trees.

Zabid played an important role in spreading Islam due to its Islamic university (the ancient mosques and madrasas which received students from all over the world to obtain Islamic knowledge and study different sciences (substantially developed by Muslim scientists contributing to the advancement of science)).

**Criterion (ii):** Zabid is of outstanding archaeological and historical interest for its domestic and military architecture and for its urban plan (the only city in Yemen to be built harmonizing the typical Islamic town's layout with the central mosque and souq, together with houses providing privacy). Its architecture profoundly influenced that of the Yemeni coastal plain.

**Criterion (iv):** Zabid's domestic and military architecture, its urban and defensive fabric layout manifested in its wall remains, watchtowers and citadel, as well as indirect access make it an outstanding archaeological and historical site. The domestic architecture of Zabid is the most characteristic example of the Tihama style of courtyard house, which is to be found over a wide area of the southern part of the Arabian Peninsula.

**Criterion (vi):** The Historic Town of Zabid is strongly linked with the history of the spread of Islam in the early years of Hijra as demonstrated in the archaeological remains within the Alash'ar Mosque, associated with Al-Alash'ari, one of the Prophet Mohammad's companions, who built it to become the fifth mosque in Islam. Besides being the capital of Yemen from the 13th to the 15th centuries, the town played an important role in the Arab and Muslim world for many centuries in view of its being one of the significant centres spreading Islamic knowledge.

#### Integrity (2010)

The adequate size of the property represents all necessary elements and components of domestic and military architecture, its urban and defensive fabric layout, which make it an outstanding archaeological and historical site. However, the recent insertion of concrete buildings, the installation of an electricity system, with unsightly overhead cables, and the increasing use of modern materials such as concrete and corrugated steel sheeting, as well as open spaces invasion, are seriously eroding that integrity.

The visual and physical integrity of the property is so threatened by these new developments and encroachments that up to 40% of the structures are vulnerable. There is an urgent need to halt this decline and reverse the undesirable changes.

### **Authenticity (2010)**

The attributes that convey the Outstanding Universal Value, such as the mosques, city layout and traditional buildings are highly vulnerable to decay, to change in the forms and materials of buildings, and to the spread of new, inconsistent developments to the northern and eastern sides of the city. Nevertheless, even though threatened, a certain degree of authenticity exists and could be augmented if the urban layout and traditional buildings are restored to enable the Outstanding Universal Value to be more adequately conveyed. There is an urgent need to reverse the downward trends.

### **Protection and management requirements (2010)**

The Historic Town of Zabid is protected by the Antiquities Law of 1973. A Master Plan for the entire city has been approved in 2004 and an Urban Conservation Plan is currently under preparation. A Management Plan for the property will follow the preparation of the Urban Conservation Plan. The Law for the Preservation of Historic Cities will be agreed upon and enforced in the near future.

The authority in charge of the property is the GOPHCY (General Organisation for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen), established in 1990 with the aim of managing and safeguarding all the historic cities of Yemen.

Since 2007, the local branch of GOPHCY in Zabid has been reinforced, with the support of a project, managed by the German Technical Assistance (GTZ), that aims at addressing the city's severe decline and improve its overall physical, social and economic conditions, through running a housing rehabilitation programme and an infrastructure improvement project.

In order to be able to meet fully the requirements of the long term preservation and sustainability of the property, and in the medium term to reverse the downward trends, that threaten its Outstanding Universal Value, GOPHCY will need considerable support, resources, capacity building, as well as technical and financial assistance.

## **ASIA AND THE PACIFIC**

### **25. Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) (C 211 rev)**

#### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

##### **Brief synthesis**

At 1,900 m above sea level and far from any town, the Minaret of Jam rises within a rugged valley along the Hari-rud River at its junction with the river Jam around 215km-east of Herat. Rising to 65m from a 9m diameter octagonal base, its four superimposed, tapering cylindrical shafts are constructed from fired bricks. The Minaret is completely covered with geometric decoration in relief enhanced with a Kufic inscription in turquoise tiles. Built in 1194 by the great Ghurid Sultan Ghiyas-od-din (1153-1203), its emplacement probably marks the site of the ancient city of Firuzkuh, believed to have been the summer capital of the Ghurid dynasty. Surrounding remains include a group of stones with Hebrew inscriptions from the 11th to 12th centuries on the Kushkak hill, and vestiges of castles and towers of the Ghurid settlements on the banks of the Hari River as well as to the east of the Minaret.

The Minaret of Jam is one of the few well-preserved monuments representing the exceptional artistic creativity and mastery of structural engineering of the time. Its architecture and ornamentation are outstanding from the point of view of art history, fusing together elements from earlier developments in the region in an exceptional way and exerting a strong influence on later architecture in the region. This graceful soaring structure is an outstanding example of the architecture and ornamentation of the Islamic period in Central Asia and played a significant role in their further dissemination as far as India as demonstrated by the Qutb Minar, Delhi, begun in 1202 and completed in the early 14th century.

**Criterion (ii):** The innovative architecture and decoration of the Minaret of Jam played a significant role in the development of the arts and architecture of the Indian sub-continent and beyond.

**Criterion (iii):** The Minaret of Jam and its associated archaeological remains constitute exceptional testimony to the power and quality of the Ghurid civilization that dominated the region in the 12th and 13th centuries.

**Criterion (iv):** The Minaret of Jam is an outstanding example of Islamic architecture and ornamentation in the region and played a significant role for further dissemination.

#### **Integrity (2011)**

Since the building of the Minaret around eight hundred years ago, no reconstruction or extensive restoration work has ever taken place in the area. The archaeological vestiges were surveyed and recorded in 1957 when the remains were first discovered by archaeologists. Subsequent surveys and studies have led only to simple precautionary stabilization measures to the base of the Minaret. Thus, the attributes that express the Outstanding Universal Value of the site, not least the Minaret itself, other architectural forms and their setting in the landscape, remain intact within the boundaries of the property and beyond.

#### **Authenticity (2002)**

The authenticity of the ensemble of the Minaret of Jam and the vestiges that surround it has never been questioned. The Minaret has always been recognised as a genuine architectural and decorative masterpiece by the experts and an artistic chef-d'oeuvre by the aesthetes. Its monumental Kufic inscriptions testify to the remote and glorious origin of its builders as well as giving evidence to its early dating (1194). No reconstruction or extensive restoration work has ever taken place in the area.

#### **Protection and management requirements (2011)**

The legal and institutional framework for the effective management of the Minaret and archaeological remains (70ha with a 600ha buffer zone), is regulated by the Department of Historic Monuments on behalf of the Ministry of Information and Culture of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan. The specific law under which the monument and its landscape are protected is the Law on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Properties (Ministry of Justice, 21 May 2004) which is in force and provides the basis for financial and technical resources.

The property will be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger when its desired state of conservation is achieved in accordance with Decision 31 COM 7A.20. This must include the increased capacity of the staff of the Afghan Ministry of Culture and Information who are in charge of the preservation of the property; precise identification of the World Heritage property and clearly marked boundaries and buffer zones; assurance of the long-term stability and conservation of the Minaret; assurance of site security, and a comprehensive management system including the development and implementation of a long-term conservation policy.

Proposals for the protection of the Minaret and its environs are under scientific discussion. They would seek to monitor erosion of the riverbanks adjacent to the Minaret, any further movement in the level of inclination of the monument along with any degradation in the historic fabric in general, and mitigate any adverse observations with appropriate programs of stabilization and conservation measures where necessary. Measures for the protection and monitoring of the wider archaeological site are currently under review and an approved program of research and public awareness raising is likely to be instigated in the long term.

## 26. Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley (Afghanistan) (C 208 rev)

### Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)

#### Brief synthesis

Enclosed between the high mountains of the Hindu Kush in the central highlands of Afghanistan, the Bamiyan Valley opens out into a large basin bordered to the north by a long, high stretch of rocky cliffs. The Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley comprise a serial property consisting of eight separate sites within the Valley and its tributaries. Carved into the Bamiyan Cliffs are the two niches of the giant Buddha statues (55m and 38m high) destroyed by the Taliban in 2001, and numerous caves forming a large ensemble of Buddhist monasteries, chapels and sanctuaries along the foothills of the valley dating from the 3rd to the 5th century C.E. In several of the caves and niches, often linked by galleries, there are remains of wall paintings and seated Buddha figures. In the valleys of the Bamiyan's tributaries are further groups of caves including the Kakrak Valley Caves, some 3km south-east of the Bamiyan Cliffs where among the more than one hundred caves dating from the 6th to 13th centuries are fragments of a 10m tall standing Buddha figure and a sanctuary with painted decorations from the Sasanian period. Along the Fuladi valley around 2km southwest of the Bamiyan Cliffs are the caves of Qoul-i Akram and Lalai Ghami, also containing decorative features.

Punctuating the centre of the valley basin to the south of the great cliff are the remains of the fortress of Shahr-i Ghulghulah. Dating from the 6th to 10th centuries CE, this marks the original settlement of Bamiyan as stopping place on the branch of the Silk Route, which linked China and India via ancient Bactria. Further to the east along the Bamiyan Valley are the remains of fortification walls and settlements, dating from the 6th to 8th centuries at Qallai Kaphari A and B and further east still (around 15km east of the Bamiyan Cliffs) at Shahr-i Zuhak, where the earlier remains are overlaid by developments of the 10th to 13th centuries under the rule of the Islamic Ghaznavid and Ghoriid dynasties.

The Cultural Landscape and Archaeological Remains of the Bamiyan Valley represent the artistic and religious developments which from the 1st to the 13th centuries characterised ancient Bactria, integrating various cultural influences into the Gandharan school of Buddhist art. The numerous Buddhist monastic ensembles and sanctuaries, as well as fortified structures from the Islamic period, testify to the interchange of Indian, Hellenistic, Roman, Sasanian and Islamic influences. The site is also testimony to recurring reactions to iconic art, the most recent being the internationally condemned deliberate destruction of the two standing Buddha statues in March 2001.

**Criterion (i):** The Buddha statues and the cave art in Bamiyan Valley are an outstanding representation of the Gandharan school in Buddhist art in the Central Asian region.

**Criterion (ii):** The artistic and architectural remains of Bamiyan Valley, an important Buddhist centre on the Silk Road, are an exceptional testimony to the interchange of Indian, Hellenistic, Roman and Sasanian influences as the basis for the development of a particular artistic expression in the Gandharan school. To this can be added the Islamic influence in a later period.

**Criterion (iii):** The Bamiyan Valley bears an exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition in the Central Asian region, which has disappeared.

**Criterion (iv):** The Bamiyan Valley is an outstanding example of a cultural landscape which illustrates a significant period in Buddhism.

**Criterion (vi):** The Bamiyan Valley is the most monumental expression of the western Buddhism. It was an important centre of pilgrimage over many centuries. Due to their symbolic values, the monuments have suffered at different times of their existence, including the deliberate destruction in 2001, which shook the whole world.

### **Integrity (2011)**

The heritage resources in Bamiyan Valley have suffered from various disasters and some parts are in a fragile state. A major loss to the integrity of the site was the destruction of the large Buddha statues in 2001. However, a significant proportion of all the attributes that express the Outstanding Universal Value of the site, such as Buddhist and Islamic architectural forms and their setting in the Bamiyan landscape, remain intact at all 8 sites within the boundaries, including the vast Buddhist monastery in the Bamiyan Cliffs which contained the two colossal sculptures of the Buddha.

### **Authenticity (2003)**

The cultural landscape and archaeological remains of the Bamiyan Valley continue to testify to the different cultural phases of its history. Seen as a cultural landscape, the Bamiyan Valley, with its artistic and architectural remains, the traditional land use and the simple mud brick constructions continues to express its Outstanding Universal Value in terms of form and materials, location and setting, but may be vulnerable in the face of development and requires careful conservation and management.

### **Protection and management requirements (2011)**

The monuments and archaeological remains of the Bamiyan Valley are public property, owned by the State of Afghanistan. However, large parts of the buffer zone are in private ownership. Many documents defining the ownership were destroyed during the decades of conflict and civil unrest, and are now being re-established. The State Law on the Protection of Historical and Cultural Properties (Ministry of Justice, May 21<sup>st</sup> 2004) is in force and provides the basis for financial and technical resources.

The management of the serial property is under the authority of the Ministry of Information and Culture (MoIC) and its relevant departments (Institute of Archaeology and the Department for the Preservation of Historical Monuments), as well as the Governor of the Bamiyan Province. The Ministry of Information and Culture has a provincial local office representative in Bamiyan. There are 8 guards specifically protecting the site against vandalism and looting, with additional resources provided by the Ministry of Interior in the form of a dedicated police contingent for the protection of cultural property (Police unit 012).

At present, the management system is provisional with help from the international community for the appropriate administrative, scientific and technical resources. Since 2003, UNESCO has been leading a three-phase safe-guarding plan for the property. Its focus has been to consolidate the Buddha niches, to safeguard the artefacts that survived the destruction of the Buddha statues and to render the site safe, notably by pursuing the complex de-mining operations at the site. A Management Plan for the property is under preparation with the objective to prepare and implement a programme for the protection, conservation and presentation of the Bamiyan Valley, to undertake exploration and excavation of the archaeological remains, and to prepare and implement a programme for sustainable cultural tourism in the Valley. The Governor of the Province is responsible for the implementation of a regional development plan, which includes rehabilitation of housing, provision of health and educational services, and development of infrastructure and agriculture.

In March 2011, it was concluded by Afghan officials and international experts at a meeting of the 9th Bamiyan Expert Working Group hosted by UNESCO that the World Heritage site is potentially ready to be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger by 2013, pending continued progress in addressing security risks, the structural stability of the remains of the two giant Buddha sculptures and their niches, the conservation of the archaeological remains and mural paintings and implementation of the Management Plan.

## **27. Bam and its Cultural Landscape (Islamic Republic of Iran) (C 1208)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.



At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2004), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **28 COM 14B.55**):

**Criterion (ii):** Bam developed at the crossroads of important trade routes at the southern side of the Iranian high plateau, and it became an outstanding example of the interaction of the various influences.

**Criterion (iii):** The Bam and its Cultural Landscape represents an exceptional testimony to the development of a trading settlement in the desert environment of the Central Asian region.

**Criterion (iv):** The city of Bam represents an outstanding example of a fortified settlement and citadel in the Central Asian region, based on the use mud layer technique (Chineh) combined with mud bricks (Khesht).

**Criterion (v):** The cultural landscape of Bam is an outstanding representation of the interaction of man and nature in a desert environment, using the qanats. The system is based on a strict social system with precise tasks and responsibilities, which have been maintained in use until the present, but has now become vulnerable to irreversible change.

## **28. Fort and Shalimar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan) (C 171)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

The inscribed property includes two distinct royal complexes, the Lahore Fort and the Shalimar Gardens, both located in the City of Lahore, at a distance of 7 km. from each other. The two complexes – one characterized by monumental structures and the other by extensive water gardens - are outstanding examples of Mughal artistic expression at its height, as it evolved during the 16th and 17th centuries. The Mughal civilisation, a fusion of Islamic, Persian, Hindu and Mongol sources (from whence the name Mughal derives) dominated the Indian subcontinent for several centuries and strongly influenced its subsequent development.

The Lahore Fort, situated in the north-west corner of the Walled City of Lahore, occupies a site which has been occupied for several millenia. Assuming its present configuration during the 11th century, the Fort was destroyed and rebuilt several times by the early Mughals during the 13th to the 15th centuries. The 21 monuments which survive within its boundaries comprise an outstanding repertory of the forms of Mughal architecture from the reign of Akbar (1542-1605), characterized by standardized masonry of baked brick and red sandstone courses relieved by Hindu motifs including zoomorphic corbels, through that of Shah Jahan (1627-58), characterized by the use of luxurious marbles, inlays of precious materials and mosaics, set within exuberant decorative motifs of Persian origins.

Akbar's efforts are exemplified in the Masjidi Gate flanked by two bastions and the Khana-e-Khas-o-Am (Public and Private Audience Hall). Akbar's successor, Jahangir, finished the large north court (1617-18) begun by Akbar and, in 1624-25, decorated the north and north-west walls of the Fort. Shah Jahan added a fairy tale-like complex of buildings surrounding the Court of Shah Jahan (Diwan-e-Kas, Lal Burj, Khwabgah-e-Jahangiri, and the Shish Mahal, 1631-32, one of the most beautiful palaces in the world, sparkling with mosaics of glass, gilt, semi-precious stones and marble screening).

The Shalimar Gardens, constructed by Shah Jahan in 1641-2 is a Mughal garden, layering Persian influences over medieval Islamic garden traditions, and bearing witness to the apogee of Mughal artistic expression. The Mughal garden is characterized by enclosing walls, a rectilinear layout of paths and features, and large expanses of flowing water. The Shalimar Gardens cover 16 hectares, and is arranged in three terraces descending from the south to the north. The regular plan, enclosed by a crenellated wall of red sandstone, disposes square beds on the upper and lower terraces and elongated blocks on the narrower, intermediate terrace; within, elegant pavilions balance harmoniously arranged poplar and cypress trees, reflected in the vast basins of water.

**Criterion (i):** The 21 monuments preserved within the boundaries of Lahore Fort comprise an outstanding repertory of the forms of Mughal architecture at its artistic and aesthetic height, from the reign of Akbar (1542-1605) through the reign of Shah Jahan (1627-58). Equally the

Shalimar Gardens, laid out by Shah Jahan in 1641-2 embodies Mughal garden design at the apogee of its development. Both complexes together may be understood to constitute a masterpiece of human creative genius.

**Criterion (ii):** The Mughal forms, motifs and designs developed at Lahore Fort and Shalimar Gardens have been influenced by design innovations in other royal Mughal enclaves but have also exerted great influence in subsequent centuries on the development of artistic and aesthetic expression throughout the Indian subcontinent.

**Criterion (iii):** The design of the monuments of Lahore Fort and the features of the Shalimar Gardens bears a unique and exceptional testimony to the Mughal civilisation at the height of its artistic and aesthetic accomplishments, in the 16th and 17th centuries.

### **Integrity (2011)**

The inclusion by the World Heritage Committee of the originally separate Lahore Fort and the Shalimar Gardens nominations in a single inscribed property in 1981 broadened the range of design expressions - from monumental structures to water gardens - representing Mughal artistic and aesthetic achievements included in the property, and enhanced the overall integrity of the property. Both of the complexes in the inscription as they survive today are complete in and of themselves; the Lahore Fort complex includes all 21 surviving monuments within the defined Fort boundaries, and the Shalimar Gardens includes all of the various water terraces and pavilions within its enclosing wall.

However missions to the property (2003, 2005, 2009) have noted that the Badshahi Masjid (Royal Mosque) and the Tomb of Ranjit Singh, although located outside the Fort proper form an integral part of its physical and historical context, and suggested their inclusion within the inscribed property would enhance its integrity.

However the accidental destruction of 2 of the 3 hydraulic works and related walls of the Shalimar Gardens in 1999 for widening the Grand Trunk Road from Lahore to Mughla significantly marred the integrity of the Gardens, and the property was placed on the World Heritage List in Danger in 2000. Detailed analysis at the time also revealed considerable deterioration of some constituent monuments and serious urban encroachments affecting some structures. While remedial conservation efforts since 2000 have progressively addressed repair needs of individual monuments, these have not focused on reinstatement of hydraulic systems or components.

Measures to improve property integrity have been identified which include consolidation and protection of damaged water tanks, protection of external walls for both complexes, major investment in upgrading of monuments and features within both complexes, extension of inscribed zones and buffer zones to better protect the Outstanding Universal Value of the two complexes and their settings, consideration of inclusion of adjacent monuments within the inscription, and removal of the urban encroachments and improved control of urban pressures (including tourist bus parking).

### **Authenticity (2011)**

The property in general maintains the authentic layout, forms, design and substance of both complexes and the constituent layouts, elements and features associated with the Mughal artistic and aesthetic expressions of the 16th and 17th century. Maintaining authenticity of workmanship necessitates that contemporary repair and conservation work use and revive traditional techniques and materials.

However authenticity of function and of setting has been eroded over time: the original function of these royal complexes has been replaced by public visitation and tourism, and the larger setting of both complexes now accommodates the traffic circulation and functional needs of the contemporary city of Lahore.

### **Protection and management requirements (2011)**

The World Heritage property is protected under the Antiquities Act (1975), administered until 2005 by the Department of Archaeology, Pakistan. At that time, management responsibility for the property was delegated from the national level to the provincial level; and the Directorate General of Archaeology, Punjab (DGoA,P) took on overall responsibility for property management. The DGoA,P is working within the guidelines laid down in the two Master Plans established for Lahore Fort and the Shalimar Gardens, and with project financing made

available by the Government of Punjab in a “Five Year Programme for Preservation and Restoration of Lahore Fort” and a “Five Year Programme for the Preservation and Restoration of Shalimar Gardens” launched in 2006-2007. The DGoA, P is also being supported in its management efforts by a Steering Committee to guide implementation of planned projects, a Technical Committee to supervise conservation activities and to develop a “conservation plan” on the basis of priorities established in the Master Plans, and a Punjab Heritage Foundation to attempt to provide a permanent source of funding.

The placing of this property on the World Heritage List in Danger has highlighted many threats to the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, and its integrity and authenticity. These include ongoing degradation of the tangible features of the property, insufficient ability to monitor and control urban encroachments on and adjacent to the property, and insufficient ability to control the actions of other agencies which could impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

The key components of the management response to sustain and protect its Outstanding Universal Value, integrity and authenticity, and to address the above threats include efforts to extend the boundaries of the inscribed area and its buffer zone, to complete and implement the Master Plans for Lahore Fort and Shalimar Gardens, to strengthen local community and institutional awareness of the values of the property and the primary sources of its vulnerability, and to improve co-ordination mechanisms among all stakeholders whose actions could affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, in particular national and local authorities involved in carrying out public works and promoting and managing tourism on the property.

## **29. Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras (Philippines) (C 722)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

The Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras is an outstanding example of an evolved, living cultural landscape that can be traced as far back as two millennia ago in the pre-colonial Philippines. The terraces are located in the remote areas of the Philippine Cordillera mountain range on the northern island of Luzon, Philippine archipelago. While the historic terraces cover an extensive area, the inscribed property consists of five clusters of the most intact and impressive terraces, located in four municipalities. They are all the product of the Ifugao ethnic group, a minority community that has occupied these mountains for thousands of years.

The five inscribed clusters are; (i) the Nagacadan terrace cluster in the municipality of Kiangan, a rice terrace cluster manifested in two distinct ascending rows of terraces bisected by a river; (ii) the Hungduan terrace cluster that uniquely emerges into a spider web; (iii) the central Mayoyao terrace cluster which is characterized by terraces interspersed with traditional farmers’ bale (houses) and alang (granaries); (iv) the Bangaan terrace cluster in the municipality of Banaue that backdrops a typical Ifugao traditional village; and (v) the Bataad terrace cluster of the municipality of Banaue that is nestled in amphitheatre-like semi-circular terraces with a village at its base.

The Ifugao Rice Terraces epitomize the absolute blending of the physical, socio-cultural, economic, religious, and political environment. Indeed, it is a living cultural landscape of unparalleled beauty.

The Ifugao Rice Terraces are the priceless contribution of Philippine ancestors to humanity. Built 2000 years ago and passed on from generation to generation, the Ifugao Rice Terraces represent an enduring illustration of an ancient civilization that surpassed various challenges and setbacks posed by modernization.

Reaching a higher altitude and being built on steeper slopes than many other terraces, the Ifugao complex of stone or mud walls and the careful carving of the natural contours of hills and mountains to make terraced pond fields, coupled with the development of intricate irrigation systems, harvesting water from the forests of the mountain tops, and an elaborate farming system, reflect a mastery of engineering that is appreciated to the present.

The terraces illustrate a persistence of cultural traditions and remarkable continuity and endurance, since archaeological evidence reveals that this technique has been in use in the region for 2000 years virtually unchanged. They offer many lessons for application in similar environments elsewhere.

The maintenance of the living rice terraces reflects a primarily cooperative approach of the whole community which is based on detailed knowledge of the rich diversity of biological resources existing in the Ifugao agro-ecosystem, a finely tuned annual system respecting lunar cycles, zoning and planning, extensive soil conservation, mastery of a most complex pest control regime based on the processing of a variety of herbs, accompanied by religious rituals.

**Criterion (iii):** The rice terraces are a dramatic testimony to a community's sustainable and primarily communal system of rice production, based on harvesting water from the forest clad mountain tops and creating stone terraces and ponds, a system that has survived for two millennia.

**Criterion (iv):** The rice terraces are a memorial to the history and labour of more than a thousand generations of small-scale farmers who, working together as a community, have created a landscape based on a delicate and sustainable use of natural resources.

**Criterion (v):** The rice terraces are an outstanding example of land-use that resulted from a harmonious interaction between people and its environment which has produced a steep terraced landscape of great aesthetic beauty, now vulnerable to social and economic changes.

### **Integrity (2011)**

While maps of the property are yet to be prepared and boundaries to be delineated, all important attributes of the rice terraces comprising the rice terrace paddies, the traditional villages and the forests that are its watershed are present in the five inscribed clusters. Although traditionally defined boundaries for the terraces with the buffer zone of private forests have provided some level of protection, the definition of precise limits of the protected areas and the preparation and implementation of Community-Based Land Use and Zoning Plans (CBLUZP) is critical to ensure that the conditions of integrity are maintained.

The inscribed terrace clusters continue to be worked and maintained in the traditional manner although other nearby terraces have been abandoned or have temporarily fallen out of use due to changes in climate and rainfall patterns in the terraces' mountain watershed. In some villages, Christianization in the 1950s affected the performance of tribal practices and rituals that were essential in maintaining the human commitment that balances nature and man in the landscape; today, tribal practices coexist with Christianity. However, the terraced landscape is highly vulnerable because the social equilibrium that existed in the rice terraces for the past two millennia has become profoundly threatened by technological and evolutionary changes. Rural-to-urban migration processes limit the necessary agricultural workforce to maintain the extensive area of terraces and climate change has recently impinged on the property resulting in streams drying out, while massive earthquakes have altered locations of water sources and caused terrace dams to move and water distribution systems re-routed.

These factors pose significant challenges that could be addressed through the sustained implementation of conservation and management actions.

### **Authenticity (2011)**

The Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras are authentic in form, character, and function as a direct result of the 2000 year-old and continuously maintained regime that balances climatic, geographical, ecological, agronomic, ethnographic, religious, social, economic, political and other factors. Through ritual practices, chants and symbols which emphasize ecological balance, the Ifugao community has maintained the intactness of the terraces' traditional management system over this long period of time, ensuring the authenticity of both the original landscape engineering and the traditional wet-rice agriculture. Once this balance is disturbed the whole system begins to collapse, but so long as they all operate together harmoniously, as they have over two millennia, the authenticity is total.

Being a living cultural landscape, evolutionary changes continuously fine-tune and adapt the cultural response of the terraces' owners and inhabitants in response to changing climatic, social, political and economic conditions. However, the fact that the Ifugao community continues to occupy, use and maintain their ancestral lands in the age-old traditional manner ensures appreciation and awareness of the enduring value of these traditional practices which continue to sustain them.

Nevertheless the reduction in the workforce and other social and environmental factors, including changes in management of the watershed forests, makes this traditional system and thus the overall balance highly vulnerable and requires sustained management and conservation.

### **Protection and management requirements (2011)**

The Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras were declared National Treasures in Presidential Decrees 260:1973 and 1505:1978. The terraces are likewise protected by the Republic Act No 10066:2010, providing for the protection and conservation of the National Cultural Heritage.

The terraces have long been protected and managed through traditional ancestral land use management traditions of the indigenous Ifugao community. Individual terraces are privately owned and protected through ancestral rights, tribal laws and traditional practices. The maintenance of the living rice terraces reflects a primarily cooperative approach of the whole community which is based on detailed knowledge of the rich diversity of biological resources existing in the Ifugao agro-ecosystem, a finely tuned annual system respecting lunar cycles, zoning and planning, extensive soil conservation, and the mastery of a most complex pest control regime based on the processing of a variety of herbs, accompanied by religious rituals. The Ifugao Terraces Commission, a Presidential Commission mandated to preserve the Rice Terraces, was set up in February 1994. At the time of inscription, a 6-year Master Plan was established, which was later expanded to cover a ten year period. At present, the Rice Terraces is under the management of the Provincial Government of Ifugao and the National Commission for Culture and the Arts. A Rice Terraces Master Plan comprehensively covers management, conservation and socio-economic issues.

Past attempts to conserve the terrace economies have been made sporadically, focused on singular attempts which had very little positive impact. However, on-going government efforts aimed at improving the economic conditions of the people through its various socio-economic programs are hopeful and encouraging.

Threats and concerns identified when the property was put in the List of World Heritage in Danger in 2001 are now being conscientiously and systematically addressed through efforts extended by the Provincial Government and the concerned national agencies. This will ensure completion of the corrective measures that constitute removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger. Programs have been established to ensure landscape restoration and conservation through the documentation and continuous physical rehabilitation of deteriorated areas, including the revival of traditional practices that addresses cultural degeneration.

As conservation and management challenges continue to persist in the rice terraces being a living cultural landscape, sustained efforts shall have to be carried out by the government and the concerned national agencies to ensure its long term sustainability and conservation. This will include the enactment of national government policies and laws for the preservation of natural resources, the adoption of guidelines for conservation and for procedures for Environmental Impact Assessments and infrastructure for the implementation of major projects. Management agencies at the provincial and municipal levels should be functional with adequate resources, and coordinate work with the rice terraces owners' organizations.

Pride of place and culture, including the long term commitment of its indigenous Ifugao stakeholders shall ensure the sustainability and conservation of this living cultural landscape over time.

## **EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA**

### **30. Bagrati Cathedral and Gelati Monastery (Georgia) (C 710)**

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

### **31. Historical Monuments of Mtskheta (Georgia) (C 708)**

No Statement is available for this property.

### **32. Medieval Monuments in Kosovo (Serbia)<sup>2</sup> (C 724 bis)**

No Statement was adopted for this property.

## **LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN**

### **33. Humberstone and Santa Laura Saltpeter Works (Chile) (C 1178)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2005), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **29 COM 8B.51**):

**Criterion (ii):** The development of the saltpeter industry reflects the combined knowledge, skills, technology, and financial investment of a diverse community of people who were brought together from around South America, and from Europe. The saltpeter industry became a huge cultural exchange complex where ideas were quickly absorbed and exploited. The two works represent this process.

**Criterion (iii):** The saltpeter mines and their associated company towns developed into an extensive and very distinct urban community with its own language, organisation, customs, and creative expressions, as well as displaying technical entrepreneurship. The two nominated works represent this distinctive culture.

**Criterion (iv):** The saltpeter mines in the north of Chile together became the largest producers of natural saltpeter in the world, transforming the Pampa and indirectly the agricultural lands that benefited from the fertilisers the works produced. The two works represent this transformation process.

### **34. Chan Chan Archaeological Zone (Peru) (C 366)**

#### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

##### **Brief synthesis**

The Chimu Kingdom reached its apogee in the 15th century, not long before falling to the Incas. Its capital Chan Chan, located in the once fertile river valley of Moche or Santa Catalina, was the largest earthen architecture city in pre-Columbian America. The remains of this vast city reflect in their layout a strict political and social strategy, emphasized by their division into nine 'citadels' or 'palaces' forming independent units.

The Outstanding Universal Value of Chan Chan resides in the extensive, hierarchically planned remains of this huge city, including remnants of the industrial, agricultural and water management systems that sustained it.

The monumental zone of around six square kilometres in the centre of the once twenty square kilometre city, comprises nine large rectangular complexes ('citadels' or 'palaces') delineated by high thick earthen walls. Within these units, buildings including temples, dwellings,

---

<sup>2</sup> **Note:** The Secretariat was informed by the Legal Advisor that "The UNESCO Secretariat follows the practice of the United Nations, which considers that the Security Council Resolution 1244 (1999) continues to be applicable to the territory of Kosovo until a final settlement be achieved".

storehouses are arranged around open spaces, together with reservoirs, and funeral platforms. The earthen walls of the buildings were often decorated with friezes representing abstract motifs, and anthropomorphical and zoomorphical subjects. Around these nine complexes were thirty two semi monumental compounds and four production sectors for activities such as weaving wood and metal working. Extensive agricultural areas and a remnant irrigation system have been found further to the north, east and west of the city.

The Moche and Chicama rivers once supplied an intricate irrigation system via an approximately 80 kilometre long canal, sustaining the region around Chan Chan during the height of the Chimú civilisation.

**Criterion (i):** The planning of the largest earthen city of pre-Columbian America is an absolute masterpiece of town planning. Rigorous zoning, differentiated use of inhabited space, and hierarchical construction illustrate a political and social ideal which has rarely been expressed with such clarity.

**Criterion (iii):** Chan Chan bears a unique testimony and is the most representative city of the disappeared Chimú kingdom where eleven thousand years of cultural evolution in northern Peru are synthesized and expressed. The architectural ensemble uniquely integrated the symbolic and sacred architecture with technological knowledge and the adaptation to the native environment.

### **Integrity (2010)**

Chan Chan retains all the elements that carry its Outstanding Universal Value over an area of fourteen square kilometers, which although less than the original area of the city, contains representative features of the architectural units, ceremonial roads, temples and agricultural units that convey the property's significance.

The earthen construction of the city, as well as environmental conditions, including extreme climatic conditions caused by El Niño phenomenon, renders the archaeological site susceptible to decay and deterioration. However ongoing maintenance using earthen materials has mitigated the degree of physical impact.

The setting and visual integrity of the property has been impacted negatively by illegal farming practices, exacerbated by pending resolution of land tenure and relocation issues, and by encroaching urban and infrastructure development, including the recent animal food plant and the Trujillo-Huanchaco highway that cuts the site in two since colonial times.

### **Authenticity (2010)**

In terms of its form and design, the archaeological site still expresses truthfully the essence of the monumental urban landscape of the former Chimú capital. Also, the hierarchical arrangements reflecting the high political, social, technological, ideological and economic complexity attained by Chimú society between the ninth and fifteenth centuries are still clearly to be discerned. The original earthen architecture with its religious feature and decorations, although subject to decay, is undergoing conservation interventions using earthen materials and still truthfully represents the construction methods and the spirit of the Chimú people.

### **Protection and management requirements (2010)**

The Ministry of Culture in Peru (MC), through its decentralized office in La Libertad, is the main agency charged with conserving and defending Chan Chan. It collaborates with authorities at the national, regional and municipal level to implement actions, particularly concerning illegal occupations of the property. The property is protected by national laws and decrees. However, long-standing issues, such as land tenure, relocation of illegal settlers, ceasing of illegal farming practices and enforcement of the regulatory measures have yet to be effectively resolved to ensure the long term conservation and full protection of the property. The regulatory measures for the buffer zone are still in the process of being established in collaboration with the local municipality.

The property was originally placed on the List of World Heritage in Danger in 1986 because of the precarious state of conservation of the earthen architecture and its vulnerability to the extreme climatic events caused by El Niño phenomenon that affects the northern coast of

Peru. Furthermore, the ruins were threatened by endemic plundering of archaeological remains, and by the proposed construction of a road crossing the site.

Since the inscription, various steps have been taken towards achieving the desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger including the implementation of corrective measures and the development of a management plan. In addition, remedial measures have been implemented since 1999 to address the threats derived by the rising water table levels at the property.

The management plan was approved in 2000, with a ten year action plan, which will need updating and review as new conditions arise and actions prescribed are completed. Implementation of the action plan has mainly involved the maintenance of drains that control the water table level, stabilization of perimeter walls of palaces and funerary platforms, control of vegetation, maintenance of public use areas, architectural documentation for conservation and management, capacity building for local craftsmen and awareness building measures for students and the local community. An emergency and disaster preparedness plan has been developed against the El Niño phenomenon.

The continuity in implementation of actions has improved with the creation of the Implementing Unit 110 and the allocation of sustained funding for the implementation of the management plan. However, in order to meet the challenges facing the property, there is an urgent need to secure the full operation of an adequate participatory management system and ensure that financial and human resources are adequate to allow for the sustained implementation of conservation, protection and public use management actions. An effective risk management plan is also needed to address both the social and natural threats to the property.

The vision for Chan Chan is that it maintains its status as a cultural symbol for Peru that links the past to the present and plays an essential role in the human development of the region and the country. The conservation and presentation of the archaeological site and its context will contribute to its value and to the strengthening of Peruvian cultural identity.

### **35. Coro and its Port (Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela) (C 658)**

No Statement is available for this property.

## **II. PROPERTIES DISCUSSED FOR IN-DANGER LISTING**

### **NATURAL PROPERTIES**

#### **AFRICA**

##### **1. Dja Faunal Reserve (Cameroon) (N 407)**

###### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

###### **Brief synthesis**

Founded in 1950, the Dja Faunal Reserve is an integral part of the dense rain forests that form the Congo Basin. This vast range is one of the largest and best-protected of the African rainforests: 90% of its area remains undisturbed. Almost completely surrounded by the Dja River, which forms a natural boundary, the Reserve is especially noted for its biodiversity and a wide variety of primates. Covering an area estimated at around 526,000 ha, the Reserve is home to many animal and plant species, several of which are globally threatened (western lowland gorilla, chimpanzee, forest elephant).

**Criterion (ix):** The primary forest of the Dja Reserve is interesting for its diversity of species and its unique pristine condition. With its topographical diversity and its three biogeographical



and geological influences, it has a rich and varied ecosystem that reflects the ecological evolution in progress in this type of environment. It belongs to the forest block considered to be the largest in Africa for the maintenance of biological diversity.

**Criterion (x):** The Dja Reserve is one of Africa's most species-rich rainforests. It includes the habitat of numerous remarkable animal and plant species, many of which are globally threatened. It has over 100 species of mammals, of which at least 14 primates (including several endangered species such as the western lowland gorilla, chimpanzee, white-collared mangabey, mandrill and drill). In addition, flagship species are found in the Reserve, such as the endangered forest elephant, and the nearly extinct African gray parrot, bongo and leopard.

### **Integrity**

The Dja Reserve is one of Africa's largest and best-protected rainforests. At the time of World Heritage listing in 1987, 90% of the area was considered intact and human pressure was low. The Reserve has a population of Baka pygmies who live in a relatively traditional manner and confer a recognized cultural value to the site. Agriculture and commercial hunting are prohibited, but the Pygmies are allowed to hunt traditionally.

At the time of inscription on the World Heritage List, thousands of people were already living on the outskirts of the Reserve. Traditional agriculture remains their main economic activity and hunting their main source of animal protein supply. Mining and forestry prospecting were also underway in the region. No deposits have yet been discovered inside the property, but mining activities in the periphery could be harmful to its integrity. The harvesting of timber remains a possibility, but the legal constraints and the inaccessibility of the region make it unlikely. The protection of the property against this type of activity as well as against other threats outside the boundaries of the property is essential.

### **Protection and management requirements**

At the institutional level, the Dja Faunal Reserve is managed by the Dja Conservation Services (DCS), headed by a conservator. The management of the Reserve receives significant support from international cooperation partners of Cameroon through many projects. Sustained funding for the Dja Faunal Reserve is critical to move towards financial autonomy and ensure an adequate staff and management of resources.

At the operational level, the natural resources affected by high pressure have been identified and a local anti-poaching strategy has been developed. There are regular patrols in the forest and on the road in and around the Reserve, and a cooperative framework with the forestry operators for continuous monitoring of their concessions is in place.

The strengthening of education and communication is vital to the management of the property, including increased awareness of local populations and the general public. The DCS is strongly committed to this work, and the establishment of a collaboration with 19 village vigilance committees is an important priority. The main areas of work include priority issues such as anti-poaching, collection of forest data, and the code of laws and procedures. A legal toolbox is also available and the optimal use of management effectiveness assessments to guide future management of the property, including its links with neighbouring areas is part of the process.

## **2. Lake Turkana National Parks (Kenya) (N 801 bis)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 35 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Lake Turkana National Parks are constituted of Sibiloi National Park, the South Island and the Central Island National Parks, covering a total area of 161,485 hectares located within the Lake Turkana basin whose total surface area is 7 million ha. The Lake is the most saline lake in East Africa and the largest desert lake in the world, surrounded by an arid, seemingly extraterrestrial landscape that is often devoid of life. The long body of Lake Turkana drops down along the Rift Valley from the Ethiopian border, extending 249 kilometers from north to

south and 44 km at its widest point with a depth of 30 meters. It is Africa's fourth largest lake, fondly called the Jade Sea because of its breathtaking color.

The property represents unique geo-morphological features with fossil deposits on sedimentary formations as well as one hundred identified archaeological and paleontological sites. There are numerous volcanic overflows with petrified forests. The existing ecological conditions provide habitats for maintaining diverse flora and fauna.

At Kobi Fora to the north of Allia Bay, extensive paleontological finds have been made, starting in 1969, with the discovery of *Paranthropus boisei*. The discovery of *Homo habilis* thereafter is evidence of the existence of a relatively intelligent hominid two million years ago and reflect the change in climate from moist forest grassland when the now petrified forest were growing to the present hot desert. The human and pre-human fossils include the remains of five species, *Australopithecus anamensis*, *Homo habilis/rudolfensis*, *Paranthropus boisei*, *Homo erectus* and *Homo sapiens* all found within one locality. These discoveries are important for understanding the evolutionary history of the human species.

The island parks are the breeding habitats of the Nile crocodile *Crocodylus niloticus*, the *hippopotamus amphibious* and several snake species. The lake is an important flyway passage and stopover for palaeartic migrant birds.

**Criterion (viii):** The geology and fossil record represents major stages of earth history including records of life represented by hominid discoveries, presence of recent geological process represented by volcanic erosional and sedimentary land forms. This property's main geological features stem from the Pliocene and Holocene periods (4million to 10,000 years old). It has been very valuable in the reconstruction of the paleo-environment of the entire Lake Turkana Basin. The Kobi Fora deposits contain pre-human, mammalian, molluscan and other fossil remains and have contributed more to the understanding of human ancestry and paleo-environment than any other site in the world.

**Criterion (x):** The property features diverse habitats resulting from ecological changes over time and ranging from terrestrial and aquatic, desert to grasslands and is inhabited by diverse fauna. *In situ* conservation within the protected areas includes threatened species particularly the reticulated giraffe, lions and gray zebras and has over 350 recorded species of aquatic and terrestrial birds. The island parks are the breeding habitats of the Nile crocodile, *Crocodylus niloticus*, the *hippopotamus amphibious* and several snake species. Furthermore, the lake is an important flyway passage and stopover for palaeartic migrant birds, with the South Island Park also being designated as an important bird area under Birdlife International. The protected area around Lake Turkana provides a large and valuable laboratory for the study of plant and animal communities.

Remoteness has preserved the area as a natural wilderness. On the grassy plains yellow speargrass *Imperata cylindrica*, *Commiphora sp.*, *Acacia tortilis*, and other acacia species predominate along with *A. elatior*, desert date *Balanites aegyptiaca* and doum palm *Hyphaene coriacea* in sparse gallery woodlands. *Salvadora persica* bush is found on Central and South Islands. The muddy bays of South Island have extensive submerged beds of *Potamogeton pectinatus* which shelter spawning fish. The principal emergent macrophytes in the seasonally exposed shallows are the grasses *Paspalidium geminatum* and *Sporobolus spicatus*.

### **Integrity**

The property covers a total area of 161,485 ha. The area around the property is sparsely populated due to its isolated location, inadequate freshwater and national protection status. It is an important habitat for hippopotamus and the world's largest colony of crocodiles (and the largest Nile crocodile breeding ground in the world). Physical evidence through scientific studies indicate the area's continued support for habitation of flora and fauna of diverse species over millions of years to the present. In addition, volcanic eruptions and extensive lava flows, geological faulting within the Great Rift Valley, and the formation of sedimentary deposits have assured preservation of fossil remains, which are significant in understanding the history of life especially human evolution. The adjacent Mount Kulal Biosphere Reserve serves as a water shed for the Lake Turkana Basin and as a wildlife dispersal area. It thereby assures the protection of the biological and natural processes making it an important site for avian habitation and migration, particularly water birds.

The area is managed under two State Acts ensuring protection, conservation and sustainability of the environment and addressing for example post-archaeological excavation, illegal grazing, poaching and over fishing.

### **Protection and management requirements**

The property enjoys the highest level of legal protection by both the Kenya Wildlife Act cap 376 as well as the Antiquities and Monument Act cap 215 (currently the National Museums and Heritage Act of 2006) under Kenyan legislation. Sibiloi National Park was legally designated as a national park in 1973 whereas South and Central Islands were legally designated in 1983 and 1985 respectively. The property is co-managed by Kenya Wildlife Service (KWS) and the National Museums of Kenya (NMK).

Following the extension of the property in 2001, a first management plan was developed for the period of 2001 to 2005. The long term planning foresees the development of an integrated management plan for the area. Formalization of the existing collaboration between KWS and NMK and other stakeholders through a Memorandum of Understanding will be necessary for the successful implementation of the plan.

Challenges and potential threats have been identified: these include severe droughts, livestock encroachment into the property, impacts from climate change, poaching, siltation, receding water level, human-wildlife conflicts and poor infrastructure in the area. Mitigation measures and strategies are required for the sustainable long-term management of the property and the development of an integrated management plan taking into account reforestation, law enforcement, education and awareness-raising, alternative livelihoods, resource mobilization and appropriate forms of infrastructure development (roads, electricity, telecommunication, etc.).

## **EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA**

### **3. Virgin Komi Forests (Russian Federation) (N 719)**

No Statement is available for this property.

## **LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN**

### **4. Pitons Management Area (Saint Lucia) (N 1161)**

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2004), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **28 COM 14B.11**):

**Criterion (viii):** The Pitons Management Area contains the greater part of a collapsed stratovolcano contained within the volcanic system, known to geologists as the Soufriere Volcanic Centre. Prominent within the volcanic landscape are two eroded remnants of lava domes, Gros Piton and Petit Piton. The Pitons occur with a variety of other volcanic features including cumulo-domes, explosion craters, pyroclastic deposits (pumice and ash), and lava flows. Collectively, these fully illustrate the volcanic history of an andesitic composite volcano associated with crustal plate subduction.

**Criterion (vii):** The Pitons Management Area derives its primary visual impact and aesthetic qualities from the Pitons, two adjacent forest-clad volcanic lava domes rising abruptly from the sea to heights greater than 700m. The Pitons predominate over the St Lucian landscape, being visible from virtually every part of the island and providing a distinctive landmark for seafarers. The combination of the Pitons against the backdrop of green tropical vegetation and a varying topography combined with a marine foreground gives the area its superlative beauty.

## **CULTURAL PROPERTIES**

### **AFRICA**

#### **5. Timbuktu (Mali) (C 119 rev)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

#### **6. Tomb of Askia (Mali) (C 1139)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is being presented to the World Heritage Committee in Document *WHC-12/36.COM/8E*.

At the time of the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List (2004), the criteria for inscription were defined as follows (see Decision **28 COM 14B.20**):

**Criterion (ii):** The Tomb of Askia reflects the way local building traditions in response to Islamic needs absorbed influences from North Africa to create a unique architectural style across the West African sahel.

**Criterion (iii):** The Tomb of Askia is an important vestige of the Empire of Songhai, which once dominated the sahel lands of West Africa and controlled the lucrative trans- Saharan trade.

**Criterion (iv):** The Tomb of Askia reflects the distinctive architectural tradition of the West African sahel and in particular exemplifies the way buildings evolve over centuries through regular, traditional, maintenance practices.

### **EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA**

#### **7. Cathedral, Alcázar and Archivo de Indias in Seville (Spain) (C 383 rev)**

##### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

##### **Brief synthesis**

Together the Cathedral, Alcázar and Archivo de Indias as a series, form a remarkable monumental complex in the heart of Seville. They perfectly epitomize the Spanish “Golden Age”, incorporating vestiges of Islamic culture, centuries of ecclesiastical power, royal sovereignty and the trading power that Spain acquired through its colonies in the New World. Founded in 1403 on the site of a former mosque, the Cathedral, built in Gothic and Renaissance style, covers seven centuries of history. With its five naves it is the largest Gothic building in Europe. Its bell tower, the Giralda, was the former minaret of the mosque, a masterpiece of Almohad architecture and now is important example of the cultural syncretism thanks to the top section of the tower, designed in the Renaissance period by Hernán Ruiz. Its “chapter house” is the first known example of the use of the elliptical floor plan in the western world. Ever since its creation, the Cathedral has continued to be used for religious purposes.

The original nucleus of the Alcázar was constructed in the 10th century as the palace of the Moslem governor, and is used even today as the Spanish royal family's residence in this city, thereby retaining the same purpose for which it was originally intended: as a residence of monarchs and heads of state. Built and rebuilt from the early Middle Ages right up to our times, it consists of a group of palatial buildings and extensive gardens. The Alcázar embraces a rare compendium of cultures where areas of the original Almohad palace – such as the “Patio del Yeso” or the “Jardines del Crucero” – coexist with the Palacio de Pedro I representing Spanish Mudejar art, together with other constructions displaying every cultural style from the Renaissance to the Neoclassical.

The Archivo de Indias building was constructed in 1585 to house the Casa Lonja or Consulado de Mercaderes de Sevilla (Consulate of the merchants of Sevilla). It became the Archivo General de Indias in 1785, and since then it has become home to the greatest collection of documentation concerning the discovery of and relations with the New World. The Archivo de Indias, designed by the architect responsible for completing El Escorial, Juan de Herrera, is one of the clearest examples of Spanish Renaissance architecture. An enormous influence on Baroque Andalusian architecture and on Spanish neoclassicism, it symbolizes the link between the Old and the New World.

Seville owes its importance during the 16th and 17th centuries to its designation as the capital of the *Carrera de Indias* (the Indies route: the Spanish trading monopoly with Latin America). It was the “Gateway to the Indies” and the only trading port with the Indies from 1503 until 1718.

The *Conjunto Monumental*, or group of historic buildings encompassing the Cathedral/Giralda, the Alcázar and the Archivo de Indias, constitutes a remarkable testimony to the major stages of the city's urban history (Islamic, Christian, and that of Seville with its associations with the New World), as well as symbolizing a city that became the trading capital with the Indies for two centuries – a time during which Seville was the hub of the Spanish monarchy and played a major role in the colonization of Latin America following its discovery by Columbus.

Each one of these monuments is associated with the colonization process. The tomb of Columbus is preserved in the Cathedral. The Sala de los Almirantes (Admirals' hall) in the Alcázar was the headquarters of the Casa de Contratación (House of Trade), from which the monopoly with the Indies operated, and where, as a seat of learning, it spawned some of the most important expeditions of exploration and discovery of that period. And the Archivo de Indias has, since the 18th century, housed the most valuable and important documents which provide an insight into this historical event.

**Criterion (i):** The Giralda constitutes a unique artistic achievement, a masterpiece of Almohad architecture. The immense Cathedral with five naves which replaced the mosque is the largest Gothic edifice in Europe. The elliptical space of the Cabildo, created by Hernán Ruiz, is one of the most beautiful architectural works of the Renaissance.

**Criterion (ii):** The Giralda influenced the construction of numerous towers in Spain, and, after the conquest, in the Americas.

**Criterion (iii):** The Cathedral – the largest Gothic temple in Europe – and the Alcázar of Seville bear exceptional testimony to the civilization of the Alhomads and to that of Christian Andalusia dating from the re-conquest of 1248 to the 16th century, which was thoroughly imbued with Moorish influences.

**Criterion (vi):** The Cathedral, the Alcázar and the Lonja are directly and tangibly associated with a universally important event: the discovery of the New World by Christopher Columbus in 1492/1493 and the colonization of Latin America. The tomb of Christopher Columbus is in the Cathedral. Plans were made in the Admirals' Hall (Sala de los Almirantes) for a number of history's greatest explorations, notably the circumnavigation of the globe by Magellan and Sebastián ElCano (1519-1522). In the Lonja are conserved the most precious documents from the archives of the colonies in the Americas.

### **Integrity (2010)**

The *Conjunto Monumental* retains in its configuration the physical integrity of the original buildings and the juxtaposition of the various major historical stages.

The Cathedral constitutes a fully-used and complete monument. A Gothic temple whose construction was begun at the beginning of the 15th century above Seville's former Mezquita

Mayor – an Almohad building whose Patio de los Naranjos has been preserved and converted into the access courtyard to the Cathedral – and the Giralda – the minaret that has been reused as a bell tower. It clearly displays the original Gothic masonry construction. Similarly, the later Renaissance buildings such as the Sala Capitular (Chapter House) retain their original fabric.

The Alcázar is another monument that retains the integrity of the phases of the various periods in which it was built. The rooms, patios and gardens of the original Almohad palace are preserved in their original state, as are the Mudejar constructions that make up the Palacio de Pedro I and the remaining later constructions and gardens that comprise the present-day *Conjunto Monumental*.

The Archivo de Indias building is preserved in its entirety, along with the valuable documents that it contains.

### **Authenticity (2010)**

Each of the three buildings reflects clearly its architectural histories and convey their roles in the Spanish “Golden Age” in terms of ecclesiastical power royal sovereignty and the trading power that Spain acquired through its colonies in the New World.

In the restricted perimeter covered by the property, the three buildings are the most important manifestations of the power and influence of Spanish trade in the Americas. They are however not the only manifestations in the city and to reinforce their ability to convey the outstanding universal value of the property, there is a need to allow them to be associated with other remaining buildings.

The authenticity of the series of three buildings is to a degree vulnerable to changes in their setting which could leave them isolated from other associated buildings.

### **Protection and management requirements (2010)**

Maintaining the Outstanding Universal Value remains guaranteed as long as individual protective mechanisms are in place for each one of the inscribed properties. The three buildings enjoy the highest degree of protection that exists in heritage legislation, at both regional and national levels, since they have been declared to be Properties of Cultural Interest in the Monuments category.

Similarly guaranteed are the conservation of individual buildings also associated with the Spanish trade in the Americas in the historical heart of the city that serves as the urban setting for the three monuments and the general characteristics of that urban environment. Fulfilling the legal requirement for the existence of specific urban plans and catalogues for its protection, this area, as a whole has been declared a Property of Cultural Interest. Given the enormous extent of this *Conjunto Histórico*, the protection plans have been drawn up according to homogeneous sectors. These Special Plans and Catalogues, together with the General Plan that came into force in 2006 (for those sectors whose Catalogue has yet to be completed), establish adequate measures for protection of the immediate setting of the property.

There are currently no action plans for the three buildings. However, there are provisions for improving the area included within a buffer zone whose boundary is under consideration.

In the medium term, provisions made by the City Council include the completion of the Catalogues of buildings to be protected in both of the *Conjunto Histórico* sectors that have not yet been drawn up (sector 7, “Cathedral Sector” and sector 8, “Encarnación-Magdalena Sector”) to replace the current *precatalogues*.

In the medium term, there are plans to restore two buildings in the proposed buffer zone that relate to the colonization of Latin America, the Atarazanas (shipyard) and the San Telmo palace.

## **8. Liverpool – Maritime Mercantile City (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland) (C 1150)**

### **Statement of Outstanding Universal Value (Decision 34 COM 8E)**

#### **Brief synthesis**

Located at the tidal mouth of the river Mersey where it meets the Irish Sea, the maritime mercantile City of Liverpool played an important role in the growth of the British Empire. It became the major port for the mass movement of people, including slaves and emigrants from northern Europe to America. Liverpool was a pioneer in the development of modern dock technology, transport systems and port management, and building construction.

Six areas in the historic centre and docklands of Liverpool bear witness to the development of one of the world's major trading centres in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries. A series of significant commercial, civic and public buildings lie within these areas, including the Pier Head, with its three principal waterfront buildings - the Royal Liver Building, the Cunard Building, and Port of Liverpool Building; the Dock area with its warehouses, dock walls, remnant canal system, docks and other facilities related to port activities; the mercantile area, with its shipping offices, produce exchanges, marine insurance offices, banks, inland warehouses and merchants houses, together with the William Brown Street Cultural Quarter, including St. George's Plateau, with its monumental cultural and civic buildings.

Liverpool - Maritime Mercantile City reflects the role of Liverpool as the supreme example of a commercial port at the time of Britain's greatest global influence. Liverpool grew into a major commercial port in the 18th century, when it was also crucial for the organisation of the trans-Atlantic slave trade. In the 19th century, Liverpool became a world mercantile centre for general cargo and mass European emigration to the New World. It had major significance on world trade as one of the principal ports of the British Commonwealth. Its innovative techniques and types of dock, dock facilities and warehouse construction had worldwide influence. Liverpool was instrumental in the development of industrial canals in the British Isles in the 18th century, and of railway transport in the 19th century. All through this period, and particularly in the 19th and early 20th centuries, Liverpool gave attention to the quality and innovation of its architecture and cultural activities. To this stand as testimony its outstanding public buildings, such as St. George's Hall, and its museums. Even in the 20th century, Liverpool has made a lasting contribution, remembered in the success of The Beatles, who were strongly influenced by Liverpool's role as an international port city, which exposed them to seafarers, culture and music from around the world, especially America.

**Criterion (ii):** Liverpool was a major centre generating innovative technologies and methods in dock construction and port management in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries. It thus contributed to the building up of the international mercantile systems throughout the British Commonwealth.

**Criterion (iii):** The city and the port of Liverpool are an exceptional testimony to the development of maritime mercantile culture in the 18th, 19th and early 20th centuries, contributing to the building up of the British Empire. It was a centre for the slave trade, until its abolition in 1807, and for emigration from northern Europe to America.

**Criterion (iv):** Liverpool is an outstanding example of a world mercantile port city, which represents the early development of global trading and cultural connections throughout the British Empire.

#### **Integrity (2009)**

The key areas that demonstrate Outstanding Universal Value in terms of innovative technologies and dock construction from the 18th to the early 20th century and the quality and innovation of its architecture and cultural activities are contained within the boundaries of the six areas forming the property. The major structures and buildings within these areas are generally intact although some such as Stanley Dock and associated warehouses require conservation and maintenance. The historic evolution of the Liverpool street pattern is still readable representing the different periods, with some alteration following the destruction of World War II.

There has been some re-development on sites previously redeveloped in the mid-late 20th century or damaged during World War II, for example at Mann Island and Chavasse Park, north and east of Canning Dock. All archaeology on these development sites was fully evaluated and recorded; archaeological remains were retained *in situ* where possible, and some significant features interpreted in the public domain. A new visitor centre has been opened at the north east corner of Old Dock, which has been conserved and exposed after being buried for almost 200 years. The production and adoption of design guidance minimizes the risks in and around the WH property that future development might adversely affect architectural quality and sense of place, or reduce the integrity of the docks.

### **Authenticity (2009)**

Within the property, the major dock structures, and commercial and cultural buildings still testify to the Outstanding Universal Value in terms of form and design, materials, and to some extent, use and function. Warehouses at Albert Dock have been skillfully adapted to new uses. Some new development has been undertaken since inscription and has contributed to the city's coherence by reversing earlier fragmentation. No significant loss of historical authenticity has occurred, as the physical evidence of the City and its great past remain prominent and visible, and in some cases has been enhanced. The main docks survive as water-filled basins within the property and in the buffer zone. The impact on the setting of the property of further new development on obsolete dockland is a fundamental consideration. It is essential that future development within the World Heritage property and its setting, including the buffer zone, should respect and transmit its Outstanding Universal Value.

### **Protection and management requirements (2009)**

The property is within the boundary of Liverpool City Council and is protected through the planning system and the designation of over 380 buildings. The six sections of the property are protected as Conservation Areas under the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

The properties within the boundary are in mixed ownership and several institutions have management responsibilities relating to them. The property is subject to different plans and policies, including the Liverpool Unitary Development Plan (2002) and the Strategic Regeneration Framework (July 2001). There are several detailed master plans for specified areas, and conservation plans for the individual buildings. A Townscape Heritage Initiative for Buildings at Risk in the World Heritage site and its buffer zone is successfully encouraging and assisting the restoration of buildings within designated areas of the property. A full Management Plan has been prepared for the property. Its implementation is overseen by the Liverpool World Heritage Site Steering Group, which includes most public bodies involved in the property.

At the time of inscription, the World Heritage Committee requested that the height of any new construction in the property should not exceed that of structures in the immediate surroundings; the character of any new construction should respect the qualities of the historic area, and new construction at the Pier Head should not dominate, but complement the historic Pier Head buildings. There is a need for conservation and development to be based on an analysis of townscape characteristics and to be constrained by clear regulations establishing prescribed heights of buildings.

A Supplementary Planning Document for Development and Conservation in and around the World Heritage site addresses the management issues raised by the World Heritage Committee in 2007 and 2008 and was formally adopted by the Liverpool City Council in October 2009.



## **LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARIBBEAN**

### **9. Fortifications on the Caribbean Side of Panama: Portobelo-San Lorenzo (Panama) (C 135)**

No Statement is available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.

### **10. Archaeological Site of Panamá Viejo and Historic District of Panamá (Panama) (C 790 bis)**

No Statement is currently available for this property. A draft retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value has been submitted by the State Party for this property and is presently in the review process.