Retrospective Statements of OUV for World Heritage Properties: Authenticity & Integrity

Susan Denyer
World Heritage Adviser, ICOMOS

Workshop for the 2nd Cycle of World Heritage Periodic Reporting for Western Europe
Prague 27th May 2011
Content of SoOUV

1. Brief synthesis
   • Summary of description
   • Summary of values and attributes

2. Criteria
   • (values and attributes which manifest them)

3. Integrity
   • (all sites)

4. Authenticity
   • (criteria i-vi)

5. Management and protection necessary to sustain OUV
   • Overall framework
   • Specific long-term expectations
Brief Synthesis

• Should try and evoke the property for those who do not know it
  – Its meaning and associations

• Say **why it is of OUV**

• **Summarise attributes that convey OUV**
• Essential that SoOUV is linked to tangible and relevant intangible attributes of the site

• So that there is a clear understanding of the link between OUV and the property’s attributes

• Attributes of OUV essential for considering authenticity and integrity
Content of SoOUV

1. Brief synthesis
   - Summary of description
   - Summary of value and attributes

2. Criteria
   - (value and attributes which manifest them)

3. Integrity
   - (all sites)

4. Authenticity
   - (criteria i-vi)

5. Management and protection necessary to sustain OUV
   - Overall framework
   - Specific long-term expectations
Authenticity & Integrity

• Integrity
  – Applies to both natural and cultural properties
  – But only to cultural properties since 2005

• Authenticity
  – does not apply to natural properties
Content of SoOUV

At time of inscription:
1. Brief synthesis
   - Summary of description
   - Summary of values and attributes
2. Criteria
   - (values and attributes which manifest them)

---

As of now when not considered at time of inscription:
1. Integrity
   - (all sites)
2. Authenticity
   - (criteria i-vi)
3. Management and protection necessary to sustain OUV
   - Overall framework
   - Specific long-term expectations
• For many properties, we do not have information about authenticity and integrity at time of inscription

• Cannot write retrospective statements of authenticity and integrity

• Such statements must be written for the property as it is today
There is sometimes:

- Confusion between the two concepts of authenticity and integrity

- An apparent lack of clarity as to ways in which authenticity and integrity may be defined and are evaluated
OUV / Attributes

- Attributes are those elements of the property that carry OUV

- **Authenticity** = Link between attributes and OUV

- **Integrity** = completeness/intactness of the attributes needed to carry OUV
Authenticity

- Authenticity = link between attributes and outstanding universal value

**OUV**

Attributes          Attributes          Attributes

**Link must be truthfully and credibly expressed**

Periodic Reporting Meeting Amman
April 2009
Before 2005:
The ‘test of authenticity’

Referred to four attributes:
• Design
• Material
• Workmanship
• Setting

– only tangible aspects of the heritage
1994 Nara Meeting

- Conservation of cultural heritage in all its forms and historical periods is rooted in the values attributed to the heritage

- **Our ability to understand these values depends ..... on the degree to which information sources about these values may be ... credible or truthful**

- Knowledge and understanding of these sources of information...... and their meaning is a requisite basis for assessing all aspects of authenticity (par. 9)
Conditions of authenticity:

• Depending on the type of cultural heritage, and its cultural context

• Properties may thus be understood to meet the conditions of authenticity if their **cultural values**
  – (as recognized in the nomination criteria proposed)

• **are truthfully and credibly expressed through a variety of attributes**, including ...
• Form and design
• Materials and substance
• Use and function
• Traditions, techniques and management systems
• Location and setting
• Language and other forms of intangible heritage
• Spirit and feeling
  – other forms of **intangible** heritage

Showing a much broader recognition of the different attributes that might carry OUV
• Attributes listed in Op Guidelines
  – Are *suggestions*

• For each property need to consider relevant aspects

• Not necessarily all the attributes suggested in Op Guidelines
Attributes of urban areas

OUV of urban areas might be ‘carried’ by the following attributes:

- Structures
- Spatial plans
- Traditions
- Living communities
  - socio-environmental ‘whole’, working collaboratively
Authenticity thus relates to
• How well attributes reflect OUV

Authenticity can be compromised
• If attributes weak,
  – communities cease to thrive, buildings collapse, traditions disappear etc
Archaeological sites

- If OUV is linked to the way the site reflects influences or interchange of ideas

- Attributes of the site need to manifest those ideas

- Archaeological remains must truthfully reflect their message
  - Reconstruction might hinder this process
Statement of Authenticity

• Authenticity is the ability of a property to convey its OUV
  – through the way its attributes convey truthfully (credibly, genuinely) that OUV

• Statements needs to say briefly whether the attributes that carry OUV

• are thriving

• and convey their message credibly and truthfully
OUV / Attributes

- Attributes are those elements of the property that carry OUV
- Authenticity = Link between attributes and OUV
- Integrity = completeness/intactness of the attributes that carry OUV
Integrity

- Integrity = completeness/intactness of the attributes that carry OUV
Integrity is a measure of the **wholeness and intactness** of the natural and/or cultural heritage and its **attributes**.

Examining the conditions of integrity, therefore requires assessing the extent to which the property:

- **a)** includes all elements necessary to express its outstanding universal value
- **b)** **is of adequate size** to ensure the complete representation of the features and processes which convey the property’s significance
- **c)** [does not] **suffer from adverse effects of development and/or neglect**
Integrity

- Wholeness = all the necessary attributes are within the property
- Intactness = all the necessary attributes are still present – none eroded
- Absence of threats = none of the attributes are threatened
  - by development or neglect
Statement of Integrity

• Needs to say whether the collection of attributes that convey OUV are all contained within the boundaries

• That the property does not have parts that have lost these attributes

• That the attributes are not threatened
• Defining statements of Integrity and Authenticity
• Will often identify vulnerabilities in terms of attributes, boundaries, setting etc

• Next part of SoOUV on
  Management and protection necessary to sustain OUV
  • Overall framework
  • Specific long-term expectations
• Needs to ensure that these vulnerabilities are acknowledged and addressed
Thank you