

UNESCO

WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION
BUREAU OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

25th ordinary session
(25 - 30 June 2001)
Paris (France)

EVALUATIONS OF CULTURAL PROPERTIES

Prepared by the
International Council on Monuments and Sites
(ICOMOS)

The IUCN and ICOMOS evaluations are made available to members of the Bureau and the World Heritage Committee. A small number of additional copies are also available from the secretariat.
Thank you.



2001

WORLD HERITAGE LIST

Nominations 2001

Introduction

A Nominations of cultural properties to the World Heritage List

A.1 Archaeological site

Turkey

- Ephesus 1

A.2 Historic towns

Austria

- The Historic Centre of Vienna 5

Brazil

- Historic Centre of the Town of Goiás 9

France

- Provins, Town of Medieval Fairs 13

Georgia

- Vardzia-Khertvisi Historical Area 18
- Tbilisi Historic District 22

Israel

- The Old City of Acre 25

Italy

- Noto and late Baroque architecture in south-eastern Sicily 32

Kenya

- Lamu Old Town 36

Morocco

- The Medina of Essaouira (ancient Mogador) 40

Portugal

- Historic Centre of Guimarães 42

Uzbekistan

- Samarkand - The place of crossing and synthesis of world cultures 46

A.3 Religious properties

Chile

- Churches of Chiloé 51

China

- Yungang Grottoes 53
- The Expanded Potala Palace -Norbulingka - Jokhang Monastery Project in Lhasa: Norbulingka - (Extension) 57

Cyprus

- Painted Churches in the Troodos Region - Palaichori, Church of Ayia Sotira (Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour) - (Extension) 60

India

- The Mahabodhi Temple Complex at Bodh Gaya 62

Poland

- Wooden Churches of Southern Little Poland 66
- Churches of Peace in Jawor and Swidnica 71

Spain

- Mudéjar de Aragon (Extension of Mudéjar Architecture of Teruel) 75

A.4 Architectural monuments and ensembles

Czech Republic

- Tugendhat Villa in Brno 81

Latvia

- Jurmala Wooden Construction (Dzintari District of Summer Cottages) 84

A.5 Traditional settlements and architecture

Indonesia

- Tana Toraja Traditional Settlement 87

A.6 Technological ensembles

Germany

- The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine 91

Sweden

- The Historic Cultural Landscape of the Great Copper Mountain in Falun 96

<i>United Kingdom</i>	
- Derwent Valley Mills	100
- New Lanark	105
- Saltaire	110

A.7 Cultural Landscapes

<i>Botswana</i>	
- Tsodilo	115

<i>Italy</i>	
- Val d'Orcia	120
- The Middle Adda Valley (extension to "Crespi d'Adda")	123
- Villa d'Este	126

<i>Lao People's Democratic Republic</i>	
- Vat Phou and Associated Ancient Settlements within the Champasak Cultural Landscape	131

<i>Lebanon</i>	
- The entire natural site of the region of the Chouf, with its monuments and sites	136

<i>Madagascar</i>	
- The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga	143

<i>Portugal</i>	
- Alto Douro Wine Region	147

<i>Spain</i>	
- Aranjuez Cultural Landscape	154

<i>Uganda</i>	
- Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi	159

B Nominations of mixed properties to the World Heritage List

<i>Austria-Hungary</i>	
- Natural Site and Cultural Landscape of Fertö-Neusiedler Lake	164

<i>Israel</i>	
- Masada National Park	168

<i>Russian Federation</i>	
- Natural complex "Central Sikhote-Alin"	173

<i>Turkey</i>	
- Karain Cave and the Surrounding Palaeolithic Caves	176

INTERNATIONAL COUNCIL ON MONUMENTS AND SITES (ICOMOS)

World Heritage Nominations 2001

1 Analysis of nominations

In 2001 ICOMOS has been requested to evaluate 39 new and deferred nominations of and extensions to cultural and mixed properties.

The *geographical spread* largely duplicates the trend that has become apparent in recent years, with more than half the nominations coming from European countries. There is a marked decrease in nominations from Latin America and the Caribbean, but on the other hand there are more from Africa:

<i>Europe</i>	29 nominations (6 deferred, 3 extensions) 16 countries
<i>Asia/Pacific</i>	4 nominations 5 countries
<i>Latin America/ Caribbean</i>	1 nomination 1 country
<i>Africa</i>	4 nominations 4 countries
<i>Arab States</i>	1 nomination

The *distribution by country* from those States Parties nominating more than one property was as follows:

4 nominations	Italy (1 extension)
3 nominations	United Kingdom (1 deferral)
2 nominations	Austria (1 with Hungary) China (1 extension) Georgia Israel Poland Spain (1 extension) Turkey

Comparison with the distribution in 2000, the *types of site* show a substantial increase in the proportion of cultural landscapes and a decrease in monuments and archaeological sites:

Monument or group	11 (28%)
Historic towns/town centres	9 (23%)
Cultural landscapes	9 (23%)
Archaeological sites	2 (5%)
Mixed sites	4 (10%)
Industrial sites	4 (10%)

2 ICOMOS procedure

a Preparatory work

Following an initial study of the dossiers, expert advice was sought on the *outstanding universal value* of the nominated properties, with reference to the six criteria listed in the *Operational Guidelines* (1999), para 24(a). For this purpose, ICOMOS called upon the following:

- ICOMOS International Scientific Committees;

- individual ICOMOS members with special expertise, identified after consultation with International and National Committees;
- non-ICOMOS members with special expertise, identified after consultation within the ICOMOS networks;
- collaborating NGOs (TICCIH, DoCoMoMo).

Concurrently, experts were selected on the same basis for *evaluation missions* to nominated properties. The same procedure was adopted for selecting these experts as that just described. The missions were required to study the criteria relating to authenticity, protection, conservation, and management (*Operational Guidelines*, para 24(b)).

Experts are sent photocopies of dossiers (or relevant parts of them, where the dossiers are extensive). They also receive documentation on the Convention and detailed guidelines for evaluation missions.

ICOMOS missions are to be sent to all the nominated sites. In the case of mixed sites the missions are organized jointly by ICOMOS and IUCN. IUCN experts also participated in joint missions to some cultural landscapes. It has been necessary for climatic and logistic reasons to delay missions to several properties.

The missions will have been carried out by a total of 33 experts from 24 countries. The geographical distribution of experts closely parallels that of the nominated sites, in accordance with the ICOMOS policy of selecting regional experts for missions. The countries from which ICOMOS experts were drawn were Belgium, Czech Republic, Egypt, Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, Iran, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Malta, Norway, Pakistan, The Philippines, Poland, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Sweden, Thailand, the United Kingdom, and Zimbabwe. In addition, missions were carried out by representatives of ICCROM, TICCIH, and the ICOMOS World Heritage Secretariat.

b Evaluations and recommendations

On the basis of the reports prepared by the two groups of experts, draft evaluations and recommendations (in either English or French) were prepared and considered by the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel and Executive Committee at a meeting in Paris on 29–31 March 2001. Following this meeting, revised evaluations have been prepared in both working languages, printed, and despatched to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre for distribution to members of the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee for its 25th Session in June 2001.

Paris

April 2001

Ephesus (Turkey)

No 1018

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Ephesus
<i>Location</i>	Province of İzmir
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Turkey
<i>Date</i>	30 September 2000

Justification by State Party

Like only a few other ancient cities in Turkey (eg Perge, Aphrodisias, etc), since its decline Ephesus has never been built over and so it enables visitors to experience the scene of a vast and major Roman city. This is intensified by the fact that visitors have the opportunity to walk in the Roman streets and thus to gain an incomparable three-dimensional view of the evidence of Roman town planning and interior design, public monuments, and religious and private dedications.

In the case of Ephesus the marble splendour of a Roman city is increased by the historical dimension of the city, which surpasses that of virtually any other city around the Mediterranean. The city owes its importance mainly to its location on the west coast of Asia Minor with a natural harbour and its function as a place of cultural and commercial exchange between east and west. Six millennia of history are concentrated in a site of international interest.

A continuous and complex settlement history can be traced, beginning with the earliest traces in the 5th and 3rd millennium BCE, the earliest settlements of the Geometric Period, followed by the zenith of the Ionian civilization in the 6th century BCE and the beginnings of the history of Western thought by people such as Heraclitus. The city reached its apogee in the Roman period, when it was the most densely populated and wealthy city of Asia Minor, bearing the title of "the first and greatest metropolis of Asia." It also flourished in the 5th and 6th centuries, and again during the rule of the dynasts of Aydın in the 13th–15th centuries, with Ayasoluk one of the most important ports on the west coast of Asia Minor, trading with Venice and Genoa. All these historic periods are illustrated by magnificent monuments that testify to the city's original grandeur.

As the centre of three world religions, Ephesus surpasses most other ancient cities in intensity and fascination. In ancient times the cult focused on the goddess Artemis, whose far-reaching influence is documented by finds dating back to the 2nd millennium BCE. The Christian community (which

was obviously linked with a Jewish community) is recorded by the visit of the Apostle Paul, and it acquired greater significance first through the tradition of its links with John, author of the *Book of Revelations*, and later in the worship of the Virgin Mary, who was declared to be Mother of God (*Theotokos*) at the Council of Ephesus (431), the effects of which can still be seen in the Meryemana (House of the Virgin Mary).

Note The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

There has been human settlement on the site of Ephesus since the 5th millennium BCE. It is known that there was a Mycenaean settlement at Ayasoluk. Legend has it that Androklos led the Ionian Greeks who arrived in the Bay of Kaystros around 1050 BCE: there is archaeological evidence for a sanctuary on the site of the Artemision as early as the 9th century BCE: it is conjectured that this was an example of syncretism, worship of the local deity Cybele being merged with that of the Greek Artemis. The mid 6th century temple of Artemis (the Artemision), renowned as one of the Seven Wonders of the World, became one of the most important centres of pilgrimage of the ancient world. It was destroyed by fire in 356 BCE and rebuilt on the orders of Alexander the Great.

Ephesus came under the sway of the Lydian king Croesus in the mid 6th century BCE. It was absorbed into the Persian Empire in the following century and then conquered by Alexander. After his death it formed part of the territory ruled by Lysimachos, who established a new, heavily fortified city on the flanks of Mount Koressos (Bülbüladağ), naming it Arsinoeia after his wife.

In 133 BCE Ephesus became part of the Roman province of Asia Minor, of which it was to become the capital nearly a century later. The first two centuries of the Christian era were the most glorious in the history of Ephesus. However, it suffered badly from earthquakes in 262 and again in the mid 4th century, and went through a period of decline and decay. There was a revival at the end of the 4th century, associated with the fact that the city had become an important religious centre, as demonstrated by the fact that the IIIrd Ecumenical Council, at which the Virgin Mary was declared the Mother of God, was held there in 431. This prosperity continued during the 5th and 6th centuries following the construction on the orders of Justinian of the Basilica of St John and the settlement round it, now known as Ayasoluk.

Ephesus lost much of its influence and wealth when the harbour silted up. Nonetheless, the city which at that time extended from the Ayasoluk to the modern town of Selçuk, continued to have an important role during the Aydın (Seljuk) period in the 14th century, to decline yet again after being taken over by the Ottomans.

Description

The Graeco-Roman city has been enclosed by defensive WALLS since the Hellenistic period, and these survive to a considerable extent. There are also remains of the Byzantine walls and gates, when enclosed a much smaller area, to be discerned.

Excavations have revealed two main OPEN SPACES, the *State*, with its administrative and religious buildings, in the south and the *Tetragonis Agora*, a large market in the lower town. The steep *Curetes STREET* links the two; this is lined with the remains of important buildings, including the 2nd century Corinthian temple dedicated to Hadrian, the *bouleuterion* (council chamber) or *odeon* (small theatre), and the Scholastikia baths (1st century CE). There is also a number of excavated PRIVATE HOUSES on the west side of the street.

At the foot of *Curetes Street* is the LIBRARY OF CELSUS, an imposing structure from the 2nd century CE with a monumental facade that has been reconstructed. Behind it lies the remains of the COMMERCIAL AGORA, built in the Hellenistic period and extensively rebuilt in the early Roman period. Close by is the fine TEMPLE OF SERAPIS, approached by a flight of steps from the agora. This interesting and massive structure was probably the work of Egyptian colonists or traders

From here the so-called MARBLE STREET leads to the THEATRE, the largest and best preserved ancient building in Ephesus. Work began on this fine example of the Greek classical theatre, constructed making extensive use of marble, in the Hellenistic period, but it was enlarged considerably by successive Roman Emperors in the 1st century CE. It is 145m wide and with an auditorium 30 m high. The stage (*proscenium*) measured 25m x 40m and the auditorium had a seating capacity of 24,000. The acoustics remain excellent to the present day. Across from the theatre is the THEATRE GYMNASIUM, which appears to have served as a small stadium. Further to the north is the stadium proper, which is in a very fragmentary state.

By contrast, the mid 2nd century CE VEDIUS BATHS AND GYMNASIUM, which lies just to the north of the stadium, is one of the best preserved buildings in Ephesus. It is a very complete example of this characteristic Roman building type.

There is another large late 1st century CE PUBLIC BATHS complex, still not fully excavated, to the north-west of the theatre, with two spacious *palaestrae* (exercise areas). These lie alongside the ARKADIANE, a handsome colonnaded street running down from the theatre to the harbour and named after the Emperor Arcadius, who restored it at the end of the 4th century.

Outstanding among the Christian monuments within the town is the CHURCH OF THE VIRGIN MARY. This forms part of a converted Roman building of the early 2nd century CE. It is in the form of a basilica and probably served originally as a corn exchange or some similar commercial function, an interpretation strengthened by its proximity to the harbour.

All that remains of the famous ARTEMISION, the Temple of "Diana of the Ephesians" where according to the *Acts of the Apostles* the Apostle Paul raised a riot, is a single re-erected column. This is a very swampy area of low-lying ground between the main Ephesus site and the hill of Ayasoluk; it is usually deep in water, but during drier periods some internal features are revealed, along with the remains of some

ancillary cult buildings. Much of the finer architectural and sculptural items were removed to the British Museum in the 19th century.

The strongly defended CITADEL of Ayasoluk (Selçuk) lies on a steep hill to the north-east of Ephesus. It was first fortified in the Byzantine period and considerably strengthened subsequently, through to the Ottoman period. The lower courses of the walls are for the most part Byzantine and the upper Turkish. The main feature of the walled settlement below the citadel is the monumental BASILICA OF ST JOHN, built on the orders of Justinian in the 6th century to replace a more modest structure from the previous century. Legend has it that this was the site of the tomb of St John: this is generally held to be the Beloved Disciple, though it is not certain whether it was indeed this saint who was buried there. The church was cruciform in layout, with a broad nave, chancel, and transepts and cupolas over the nave, transepts, choir, and crossing. The walls were faced with marble and the columns had richly carved capitals.

Between the Artemision and Ayasoluk is what remains of the fine 15th century MOSQUE OF İSA BEY, with the ruins of its associated *hammam* (baths). Only one of its two minarets survives and the other lacks its peak. It was constructed of material taken from the classical city of Ephesus. The surviving interior decoration is a striking example of the development of Islamic art before it had been influenced by the capture of Constantinople in 1453.

The MERYEMANA is located on the south-western slopes of Mount Koressos. This is a 1st century CE structure to which, according to legend, the Virgin Mary was brought by St John after the Crucifixion. It is a small domed stone structure with a cruciform plan, heavily restored in 1950.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Ephesus was registered as a first class archaeological site by İzmir Regional Council for the Preservation of Cultural and Natural Heritage by its Decree No 2809 of 4 April 1991. This action was taken in conformity with the Turkish Law for the Conservation of Cultural and Natural Property (Law No 2863 of 21 July 1984, amended by Law No 3386 of 17 June 1987).

All listed sites are State property. No action which may have an adverse impact on the listed properties may take place without the authorization of the Ministry of Culture. This provision extends to cover repairs, construction, installation of infrastructure or other equipment, partial or total demolition, excavation, and other activities.

Regional Councils are empowered to designate protected sites and monuments in accordance with this law. In so doing they are required to ensure that the cultural properties are enclosed by "an adequate portion of their environment" so that the context of the property can be understood. Procedures and principles for these actions are issued by the Ministry of Culture.

The directors of excavations authorized by the Ministry of Culture are responsible for the maintenance and presentation of immovable property discovered during excavations.

Management

According to the nomination dossier the ancient city and the Artemision are mostly in State ownership, although some areas are still privately owned. It is managed by the Efes Müzesi (Ephesus Museum) in Selçuk, in cooperation with the Austrian Archaeological Institute, which has been excavating the site since 1895 with authorization that is renewed annually. The work of the Institute in Ephesus is financed by the Austrian Ministry of Science.

The Basilica of St John is also in State ownership and managed by the Museum. Both sites, to which there is public access, are enclosed by fences and under constant surveillance.

The İsa Bey Mosque and baths are owned by a religious organization, Vakıflar Genel Müdürlüğü. They are partly accessible, with some areas fenced off.

The Meryemana is owned by the Roman Catholic Church. There is public access throughout the year and it is under constant surveillance.

Overall responsibility at national level is vested in two General Directorates of the Ministry of Culture, those for the Preservation of Cultural and Natural Heritage and for Monuments and Museums respectively; both are located in Ankara. The Ministry of Forests collaborates at national level. At the Regional level the responsible organizations are the İzmir Regional Council for the Preservation of Cultural and Natural Heritage and the Governorship of İzmir, working through the Efes Müzesi in Selçuk.

The nomination dossier provides details of certain long-term objectives. These include the expropriation of the remaining privately owned properties within the archaeological site with international financial support, the removal of the airstrip to the north-west of the site, and redesign of the entrances to the site so as to achieve a satisfactory balance between the objectives of conservation and of tourism. At the Artemision there are also plans for a new entrance layout, with an archaeological interpretation centre relating specifically to the Hellenistic cult site.

When archaeological work in the Theatre is completed, it is intended to make provision for its use for public spectacles. One of the houses is to be used as a site museum, and one of the large baths will be laid out so as to demonstrate the bathing practices of antiquity.

From a broader perspective there are plans to create a new tourist path linking most of the sacred sites in Selçuk (the Artemision, Basilica of St John, İsa Bey Mosque, etc) so as to present the town as the centre of three world religions. This is an important initiative, reflecting the ever-increasing role of heritage sites such as Ephesus in the rapidly growing tourism industry in Turkey.

There is no overall management plan in force for the entire area proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List.

One serious lacuna in the nomination dossier is a map which shows all the sites nominated for inscription (that provided omits the Artemision) and the buffer zone.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Work has been going on at Ephesus for more than a century, largely by the Austrian Archaeological Institute. The nomination frankly acknowledges that some of this, particularly in the first half of the 20th century, was not in accordance with contemporary conservation principles –the use of exposed concrete and the re-erection of the columns in the Artemision, for example. However, work carried out since the 1960s has fully respected the principle of anastylosis as defined in the Venice Charter.

The project for the construction of a new museum/interpretation centre in one of the houses to the south side of *Curetes* Street will, by contrast, be realized using only contemporary materials so as to ensure the optimum condition for the conservation of the ancient constructional materials.

Authenticity and integrity

The archaeological sites and ruins nominated for the World Heritage List may be considered to be authentic: only ancient materials have been exposed and such reconstruction work as has been carried out (with certain early exceptions, noted above) has in no way impaired that level of authenticity. However, the extent of the restoration and reconstruction carried out at the Meryemana, albeit for reasons of faith, has gravely affected the authenticity of this element of the nomination.

The integrity of the ancient city remains is also high. Inevitably in the case of a multi-period site such as Ephesus decisions have to be taken to decide which elements to preserve. In general what is now available for visitors to see represents the city at its apogee in the Early Roman Empire. However, some later elements, such as the remains of the Byzantine fortifications of the much diminished city of that period and the palaeochristian church of the Virgin Mary, have been exposed.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Ephesus in January/February 2001.

Qualities

Ephesus was one of the greatest cities of antiquity, and particularly in the Hellenistic and Early Roman periods. This is demonstrated by the size, nature, and quality of its public and private buildings, as revealed by archaeological excavation, which are among the finest in the Mediterranean region.

The city was also of considerable importance as a religious centre. The prehistoric cult of Cybele was widespread in early Asia Minor; with the arrival of the Ionian Greeks the worship of this goddess was merged with that of Artemis and the new cult attracted many adherents. The famous Artemision constructed in her honour became a place of pilgrimage from all over the region.

With the advent of Christianity Ephesus became a major pilgrimage centre for the new religion, thanks to being

associated with St John the Beloved Disciple and the Virgin Mary, who was entrusted to his care by the dying Christ.

There is therefore a *prima facie* case for the eventual inscription of Ephesus on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria ii, iii, and possibly vi.

Comparative analysis

When compared with other ancient cities in Asia Minor, such as Aphrodisias, Aspendos, Jerash, Palmyra, Pergamum, Perge, or Xanthos, Ephesus scores highly on two accounts. First, it was a major city for a long period, from the Hellenistic period to the Late Roman Empire, and then again in the Selçuk period, and retains ample evidence of this long history. Secondly it has exceptional religious associations, with one of the most influential pre-Christian cults and then with the roots of Christianity itself.

In the broader context of the great classical civilizations, Ephesus also possesses outstanding qualities, for the same reasons. It might be argued, with some justification, that cities from antiquity, and in particular those from the Hellenistic and Roman periods, in the Mediterranean region are over-represented on the List. There are currently over twenty World Heritage sites which consist of complete cities (or those parts which have been excavated), whilst there are some ten classical monuments located in historic towns. However, whilst towns such as Cyrene, Leptis Magna, Tipasa, or Volubilis have many values which justify their inscription on the World Heritage List, none has the unique combination of qualities that distinguish Ephesus. Only Pompeii can give the visitors such a graphic insight into the way of life in classical antiquity.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

In order to conform with the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, para 24.b.i, a plan must be completed and in force before any property may be inscribed on the List. In the case of Ephesus, it is of special importance that the eventual management plan should pay special attention to the management of tourism at this sensitive site.

Brief description

Much of the Hellenistic and Roman past of Ephesus, one of the greatest cities of the ancient world, has been revealed, including a fine theatre and other buildings, both public and private. Little remains of the famous Artemision, but the importance of Ephesus to Christianity because of its links with the Virgin Mary and St John is demonstrated by the Basilica of St John.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred* to enable the State Party to prepare and implement a comprehensive management plan; this should be accompanied by a map which clearly indicates the areas nominated for inscription and the buffer zone.

Vienna (Austria)

No 1033

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Historic Centre of Vienna
<i>Location</i>	Vienna
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Austria
<i>Date</i>	27 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The historic centre of Vienna proposed for inclusion in UNESCO's World Heritage List constitutes a uniquely preserved town monument, which is of outstanding universal value from the point of view of history, cultural history, and art. Its outstanding historical significance becomes manifest in "Vienna, the capital and residence city," ie the political and spiritual centre of a multi-national state, which was a decisive factor within European history from the Middle Ages to the break-up of the Austro-Hungarian monarchy. Promotion of science and art on a broad basis was concentrated in the imperial city, building on medieval tradition and developing into an instantly recognizable Austrian form of Baroque culture, a Viennese *Gründerzeit* idiom and a Viennese modernity, all of these styles aspiring to meet the challenges of a *Gesamtkunstwerk*, based on an overall design concept. Vienna was important for the history of music (Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Strauss, Schönberg), as well as for the history of literature and psychology (Freud, Frankl). The historic centre exhibits a series of significant Baroque ensembles superimposed on the medieval core. The political situation after 1683 (decisive resistance to the Ottoman army) resulted in an urban development that was characterized by the newly accentuated axes leading from the centre to the suburbs and palaces, and contrasted by the *Ringstrasse* in the area of the former fortifications, built in the *Gründerzeit* at the end of the 19th century.

The historic centre of Vienna exhibits an important interchange of human values on developments in architecture, town planning, and landscape design. The spatial organization as well as the density and quality of the historic buildings bear testimony to the socio-economic and cultural development of Vienna. This heritage is the bearer of a cultural tradition of outstanding universal value, designating Vienna as a city of art and culture.

Criterion ii

The historic centre of Vienna is an outstanding example of a city that illustrates significant stages in human history,

including three major developments, medieval, Baroque, and *Gründerzeit*, in its urban pattern and its individual buildings. The historic centre of Vienna has an imperial design in its layout and the individual monuments, and has thus become a symbol of Austrian history. **Criterion iv**

Vienna is directly and tangibly associated with artistic and especially musical works of outstanding universal significance. Based on ecclesiastic liturgical music since medieval times, as well as *minnesang* and ancient dance music, Vienna became a centre of European music as early as the beginning of the 16th century under the Habsburgs. Opera, which emerged in Italy at the end of 16th century, became firmly established at the court of Vienna in the High Baroque. The Viennese Classicists (Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert) consolidated Vienna's reputation as the musical capital of Europe, a reputation that has continued and is expressed also in light music (Strauss) and modern music (Neo-Viennese School). **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

Having been first inhabited in the Neolithic period, the history of Vienna has the following main phases:

- Antiquity and early medieval (up to 11th century)

Archaeological evidence has shown that the site of Vienna had a Celtic settlement when the Romans extended their control into the Danube region in the 1st century CE, building the *castellum* of *Vindobona* on the edge of the river, and staying here until 488. The meandering Danube formed the *limes* of the Roman Empire, the border to *Germania libera*, influencing later urban development until modern times. The High German name *Wenia* was first mentioned in 881, during the conflicts of Germans and Magyars.

- High and late medieval (12th to 15th centuries)

Vienna started regaining significance in the late 12th and 13th centuries, becoming one of the largest towns of the German Empire, next to Cologne. Several monastic complexes were erected, including the *Minoritenkirche*, as well as starting the construction of the ducal residence, today's *Hofburg*, taken over by the Habsburgs in 1276. In the 14th and 15th centuries the town flourished from trade, and the first German university was founded in 1365. The church of St Stephen became reference for an independent bishopric in 1469 and an archbishopric in 1718. A Jewish community existed here since the 12th century but was destroyed in 1420–21.

- Schism and Turkish siege (16th century till 1683)

In the 16th century Europe was in conflict with the Ottoman Empire, who occupied most of Hungary. Vienna became a frontier fortress, being first besieged in 1529, and trade started declining. In 1533 Ferdinand I transferred to Vienna, making it the capital of the Holy Roman Empire; this lasted

until 1806 with an interruption from 1583 to 1612. In 1683 Vienna successfully resisted the Ottoman army, a victory which brought Hungary under Habsburg rule.

- Baroque metropolis (1683 to French Revolution)

The change in the political situation after 1683 brought important changes also to the town of Vienna, starting an important development phase. An increase in population led to the construction of suburban areas, which were protected by their own fortifications, the *Linienwall*. Baroque palaces were designed for the centre of the town by the leading architects of the time, including J.B. Fischer von Erlach and L. von Hildebrandt, resulting in the construction of the palaces of Schönbrunn and Belvedere, the extension of the Hofburg, and a large number of ecclesiastical and civic ensembles. Vienna became the European capital of music with the genius of Haydn and Mozart. After Napoleon's defeat, the venue of the Congress of Vienna (1814–15) resulted in the political continuation of absolutism (*Vormärz*, ie before March 1848). At the same time, the *petite bourgeoisie* continued an interest in arts, furniture (*Biedermeier*), painting, and especially music (Beethoven, Schubert).

- The Era of Francis Joseph I (1848–1916)

At the end of 1848, the young Emperor Francis Joseph I ascended the throne of the Austro-Hungarian Empire. The desire for democratic government remained a dream, although constitutional government was restored in 1860. The city walls were razed to ground in 1857 in order to create the *Ringstrasse*, an outstanding example of 19th century town planning. With the emerging ambitions of the *haute bourgeoisie*, the new *Ringstrasse* became a major construction site for an impressive number of major buildings, including theatres, museums, university, and large private constructions, characterized as the *Gründerzeit*, the constructors' period. There was also an important development in the field of culture, including composers: Bruckner, Brahms, Wolf, Mahler, and Schönberg, architects and painters such as O. Wagner, A. Loos, G. Klimt, and O. Kokoschka, as well as philosophers, including L. Wittgenstein.

- Period from World War I

With the death of the emperor in 1916, the empire came to an end, and Austria was proclaimed a democratic republic in 1918. Between the two World Wars, Vienna involved leading architects in social housing projects that came to dominate the expression of some Viennese neighbourhoods. World War II caused major damage to the city, and the reconstruction phase lasted well into 1960s. At the same time, a new approach to preservation evolved, and the old town was legally protected in 1972. In 1945, Vienna regained its status as a federal province (*Land*) and capital of Austria.

Description

The property nominated to the World Heritage List consists of the medieval core (based on the Roman settlement), the principal Baroque ensembles with their axes, and the *Gründerzeit* constructions at the beginning of the modern period. The property covers an area of 371ha, surrounded by a buffer zone of 462ha.

The city of Vienna is situated on the Danube in the eastern part of Austria. The ancient Roman military camp was situated on a plain, west of an old branch of the Danube. The site is surrounded by hills, now built on by small villages and vineyards. Traces of the Roman camp are still visible in the medieval urban fabric of the historic town centre of the present-day Vienna, north of St Stephen's Cathedral and the *Graben* (450m x 530m). The ancient forum is now a market place, the *Hoher Markt*. The Roman camp became the starting point for the further development of the town. Beginning in the 12th century, the settlement expanded beyond the Roman boundaries, which were demolished, and the new medieval town walls surrounded a much larger area (about six times the area of the Roman camp). The walls were rebuilt during the Ottoman conflicts in the 16th and 17th centuries and provided with bastions. This remained the core city of Vienna until the demolition of the walls in the second part of the 19th century and the development of the *Ringstrasse* area

This inner city contains a number of historic buildings from the medieval period, including the *Schottenkloster*, the oldest monastery in Austria, from the 12th century, which served as a stopover for crusaders and pilgrims on their way to Jerusalem. Other medieval buildings include the churches of *Maria am Gestade* (one of the main Gothic structures), *Michaelerkirche*, *Minoritenkirche*, and *Minoritenkloster*, from the 13th century. St Stephen's Cathedral dates from the 14th and 15th centuries (with a major restoration in the 19th century). The period also saw the construction of civic ensembles, such as initial parts of the *Hofburg*. Whilst the monastic complexes were generally built in stone, becoming also part of the defence system of the medieval city, the residential quarters were built in timber and suffered frequent fires.

After the victory of the Ottoman army in 1683, Vienna developed rapidly as the capital of the Habsburg Empire, becoming an impressive Baroque metropolis with some 100,000 inhabitants in the 17th century. The Baroque character was expressed particularly in the large palace layouts built under Emperor Charles VI (1711–40) and Maria Theresa (1740–80), such as the *Belvedere* palace and garden ensemble (1712–21), extending along an axis to the south from the inner city (but part of the nomination). The first designers and craftspersons came from Italy, but one generation later there was an increasing number of Austrian architects, painters, and artisans, including Johann Bernhard Fischer von Erlach, who designed additions to the *Hofburg Palace* (eg the Riding School, the National Library) and the *Karlskirche*. Many existing medieval buildings, churches, and convents were altered and given Baroque features (eg the *Schottenkirche* and the *Annakirche*), and additions were made to representative administrative buildings (eg the Bohemian Court Chancery, the Hungarian Court Chancery). A growing number of new palaces were built by noble families (eg *Palais Batthyany*, *Palais Lobkowitz*, *Palais Wilczek*, *Palais Esterhazy*). Several historic buildings are now associated with the important Viennese residence of personalities such as Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, and others.

A new phase in the history of Vienna took place when the 34 suburbs were incorporated with the city, and the Emperor gave the order to demolish the fortifications around the inner city, executed from 1858 to 1874. While the demolition of the fortifications may be regretted from the historical point of

view, this opportunity was taken in order to create one of the most significant 19th century ensembles in the history of urban planning, which greatly influenced the rest of Europe in this crucial period of social and economic development.

The new area became the planning ground for large civic complexes in the period of 19th century Historicism. The *Hofburg* complex was extended with the *Neue Hofburg*, an "imperial forum," and joined with large museum complexes into a single ensemble. The *Burgtheater* designed by G. Semper, the Parliament (*Reichsratsgebäude*) by Theophil von Hansen, the Town Hall, and the University formed another ensemble linked with these. To this was added the Opera House as well as a large number of public and private buildings along the *Ringstrasse*. The overall planning concept followed the idea of a *Gesamtkunstwerk*, ie planned and executed on the basis of coherent design concepts, as already conceived in the Baroque. The late 19th and early 20th centuries testify to further creative contributions by Viennese designers, artists, and architects in the period of *Jugendstil* (eg the *Postsparkasse* by Otto Wagner, 1904–06), *Secession* (eg buildings by Josef Maria Olbrich), and the early Modern Movement of the 20th century in architecture (eg the *Looshaus* by Adolf Loos, 1909). Here the contribution of Vienna has been fundamental to the formation of modern architecture.

The buffer zone (462ha) surrounds the historic core area on all sides, with a portion of the Danube canal on the north side. The urban development of the buffer zone includes some of the former suburban areas and a number of historic buildings from the 17th to early 20th centuries.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The nominated historic core area of Vienna as well as the proposed buffer zone are well protected by various legal instruments. These include the Amended Law on Old Town Conservation (No 16/1972), passed in 1972. Within the proposed nomination area, there are about 1500 protected structures, Historic buildings are subject to protection under the Monument Protection Act (No 533/1923), the most recent amendment entering into force on 1 January 2000. Relevant parts of Vienna are subject to the Vienna Nature Conservation Act (from 1998) and other legal regulations. About 75% of the properties are in private ownership, 18% publicly owned, and 7% by the church.

Management

The historic area proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List is indicated as a protected zone ("Innere Stadt" and "Ringstrasse") in the Urban Master Plan of Vienna. Protection is also specified particularly to the *Belvedere* Park, the gardens of the *Hofburg* ensemble, the *Rathauspark*, the park of the *Palais Schwarzenberg*, and the *Stadtpark*. The Municipality of Vienna and its departments provide a modern and efficient means of administration and management, including monitoring systems for the areas concerned. These offices are integrated in relevant fields by the *Bundesdenkmalamt* of Austria, the *Landeskonservatorat* for Vienna, and professional advisory bodies.

The Urban Development Plan was revised in 1994, and is since being updated on an on-going basis. This in itself

constitutes a perfectly valid management plan for the historic urban area seen in relation to its overall context. It is, however, integrated with a medium-term (3-year) specific management plan with clearly laid-out objectives. The management processes are well sustained by professional and scientific expertise and facilities. Vienna also has a fully competent infrastructure for visitor management, taking account of its importance for tourism. The historic town is conceived not as a museum but rather as a living and vibrant city. Preservation and conservation are targeted in accordance with international agreements and recommendations.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The historic town of Vienna is an example of a town where the city centre has always remained at the same place. As a result, the city has undergone a continuous process of change, rehabilitation, and adaptation. The town suffered from damage during World War II, but this has since been repaired and restored. The city has been under legal protection as an historic area since 1972. Many of the individual historic buildings have been protected since the 1920s, and the history of modern conservation goes back to 1850.

The municipality of Vienna is giving due consideration to all relevant issues related to the monitoring of change. Particular attention is given to economic trends and pressures, traffic control, tourism, and environmental conditions. There are no serious natural hazards.

Authenticity and integrity

The historic town of Vienna, like an urban cultural landscape, integrates a complex stratigraphy of historic layers from the ancient Celtic and Roman times onwards. Over time the earlier structures have been adjusted in accordance with the needs of later periods, including the *Graben*, which replaced the former Roman walls, and the *Ringstrasse*, which was built over the area of the medieval fortifications. Through this process of gradual change and development, the town has acquired its particular historical integrity and specific character and its outstanding universal value. The development of modern conservation policies goes back to the mid 19th century. Within this context, the historic fabric satisfies the test of authenticity.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Vienna in February 2001. An evaluation of the "outstanding universal value" of the nominated property was provided by the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH).

Qualities

Vienna has had three major periods in its history, the medieval period (12th to 15th centuries), the Baroque period (late to 18th centuries), and the late 19th to the early 20th centuries. Through these periods, the city has developed its imperial status as well as its cultural character, particularly in

relation to the history of music. Vienna has preserved its authenticity and historic integrity to a considerable degree and has been influential and diffusing the models created to the rest of Europe and the world, including in particular Baroque architecture and the 19th century *Ringstrasse*. Vienna has also been important in contributing to the development of *Jugendstil* and *Secessionstil*, as well as the Modern Movement in architecture. As an ensemble, Vienna is extremely rich in architectural and urban planning terms, including important ensembles of historic buildings and garden layouts.

Vienna is directly associated with artistic and musical developments of outstanding universal significance from the medieval period, becoming a major reference for the history of European music in the High Baroque period, and especially at the time of the Viennese Classicists (Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert), continuing these traditions until the modern period (Strauss, the Neo-Viennese School).

Comparative analysis

The nomination document proposes that Vienna should be compared, in terms of size, significance, and state of conservation, with Prague (inscribed 1992: categories ii, iv, vi) and Budapest (inscribed 1987: categories ii, iv]. The nomination of Prague consists of the historic centre of the city and that of Budapest the banks of the Danube and the Old Buda Castle quarter. For Prague reference is made to its role in European developments, its architectural quality, and its role as a cultural centre. For Budapest, the criteria are referred to Roman and Gothic influences in the region and the representativity of the Austro-Hungarian period in 19th century architecture.

It is recognized that Prague, Budapest, and Vienna are three major historic cities in the same region in central Europe, with some similarities in terms of history, art, and architecture. There are also, however, many differences between these three cities. Their urban and architectural developments have differed substantially, resulting in distinct qualities and cultural integrity characterizing each for its own outstanding universal value. Furthermore, Prague and Budapest developed in a decentralized manner while Vienna always evolved at the same place.

In many aspects, Vienna has been a forerunner that has influenced other cities through its example. This was the case in the development of Baroque architecture; other cities have considered it a question of prestige to be seen as "Little Viennas," such as Varaždin in Croatia. The demolition of the fortifications in the 19th century and the design of the *Ringstrasse* layout also had considerable influence in the history of town planning.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

While taking note of the fact that there are a number of historic buildings of great importance in the proposed buffer zone, such as the *Auersperg* and *Trautson Palaces*, the *Piarist Monastery* and the *Maria Treu Church*, ICOMOS concurs with the proposed boundaries of the nominated area and the buffer zone.

Recognizing the high quality of the historic fabric and appreciating the efforts made at the level of urban planning and management, ICOMOS nevertheless wishes to emphasize the importance of the further development of

appropriate instruments for the protection and the control of changes in all structures pertaining to the nominated area.

Brief description

The historic centre of Vienna developed from early Celtic and Roman settlements into a medieval and baroque city, the capital of the Austro-Hungarian Empire. It had an essential role as the European capital for music being associated with all major personalities, from Viennese Classicism to modern music. Vienna is rich in architectural ensembles, including particularly baroque castles and gardens, as well as the late-19th century *Ringstrasse* ensemble.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iv, and vi*:

The historic centre of Vienna, in its architectural and urban qualities, bears an exceptional testimony to an important interchange of values related to the history of architecture, art, music, and literature. In its urban and architectural layout, the historic centre mirrors three major phases of development – medieval, Baroque, and the *Gründerzeit* – which have become a symbol of Austrian and central European history. Vienna has been directly and tangibly associated with the fundamental development of the history of music from the 16th to the 20th centuries, particularly the Viennese Classicism and Romanticism, consolidating Vienna's reputation as the "musical capital" of Europe.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Goiás (Brazil)

No 993

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Historic centre of the town of Goiás
<i>Location</i>	State of Goiás
<i>State Party</i>	Brazil
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1999

Justification by State Party

The territory of Brazil was formed in the space between the Atlantic coast and the line drawn by the Treaty of Tordesillas and was progressively extended to the Plate and Paraguay rivers, culminating in the occupation of the interior. Occupation thus took place from the periphery to the centre. The first people responsible for this formation process were the pioneers (*bandeirantes*) of São Paulo, who went in search of gold and settled areas that today constitute the States of Goiás and Tocantins, Mato Grosso, and Mato Grosso do Sul. This arduous progress towards the heart of the country was only concluded when the federal capital was installed in Brasília on 21 April 1960. Two State capital cities mark the beginning of this venture, Cuiabá (Mato Grosso), close to the geographical centre of South America, and Goiás, close to the geographical centre of Brazil. Of the two only Goiás has preserved urban design and architecture that date back to the 18th century. The surrounding countryside has also remained the same as the landscape the pioneers encountered. Goiás is thus the last witness of this fundamental chapter of the history of Brazil.

Goiás, the capital of the State of Goiás, was part of the 18th century occupation of the heart of Brazil in the search for gold. Vila Boa de Goiás, which became a borough in 1739, today still keeps the original character of its urban layout, of the common grounds and private spaces, of the volumetric scale, colouring, and street layout, of the urban construction, in the two hundred and sixty years that have elapsed, notwithstanding the recent impact of Brasília on the Brazilian Midwest. In addition to its stability and authenticity, the city of Goiás exhibits a series of features that bear witness to its exceptional importance, its universal value.

It was the first officially recognized urban core, the first borough to be planned west of the demarcation line of the Treaty of Tordesillas that defined the boundaries of the Portuguese possessions. The informal urban mesh of a spontaneous essence and the civil and religious architectural ensemble differ from the Minas Gerais urban centres of the

mining cycle, with respect to its relation to topography and the environment, as well as in the scale and building techniques. As the seat of the County and later of the Province of Goiás, it influenced or at least reflected its principal urban characteristics on the built ensembles of the cities similar to Goiás, such as Pirenópolis (former Meia Ponte), Corumbá de Goiás, Luziânia (former Santa Luzia), Pilar, Natividade, Traíras, and Niquelândia (former São José do Tocantins).

From the city of Goiás issued an organized architecture whose influence spread over a very large region, that of the South American Brazilian Central Plateau. Therefore, the city of Goiás holds an incontestable universal value and is in perfect conformity with criteria ii and v for inscription as a World Heritage cultural property. The entire geo-economic region, of mining and of occupation of the central Brazilian plateau, was influenced by the settlement characteristics in the territory and by the architectural ensemble during the 18th and 19th centuries. Furthermore, it was influenced because it represents the beginning of the occupation of this territory, remaining authentic over the two hundred and fifty years of its existence, although nowadays it is vulnerable to the nearby threat of Brasília.

Goiás bears witness to the way in which the explorers of the territory and the founders of the Portuguese and Brazilian cities, isolated from the motherland and the coast of Brazil, adapted Portuguese models of town planning and architecture to the harsh realities of a tropical region, and borrowed from the Indians several new ways of using local materials.

Criterion ii

Goiás is the last remaining example of the occupation of the interior of Brazil, as it was practised in the 18th and 19th centuries. A fragile site, which is becoming increasingly vulnerable as the city begins to develop again, this example is the more admirable because the surrounding countryside has remained practically unchanged.

Criterion v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

The origins of the town of Goiás are closely related with the history of the more or less official expeditions (*bandeiras*), which left from São Paulo to explore the interior of the Brazilian territory. One expedition, under the command of Fern Dias Pais, explored the region of Minas (1673–81), and another expedition, under the command of Bartolomeu Bueno da Silva, explored the region of Goiás (1682), finding some gold. However, the discoveries at Minas were far superior and, from 1700, attracted a vast number of people; the population of Brazil went from 80,000 to over one million in a few years. As a result of wars in the coastal regions, attention was again drawn to the interior; in 1718, gold was found in Cuiabá (the current capital of Mato Grosso), and three years later the son of Bartolomeu Bueno discovered gold in Rio Vermelho, where he was nominated

the superintendent of the mines of Goiás. One year later he established the settlement of Santana, and a chapel was built there in 1729.

In order to guarantee better control of the mines of Goiás, the Portuguese authorities decide to reinforce the regional government. In 1739, the governor of São Paulo chose Santana, which took the name of Vila Boa de Goiás. The mining village was thus doubled in size by adding to it a small administrative quarter. In 1748, Goiás was chosen as the headquarters of a new sub-district; its first governor was Dom Marcos de Noronha (1749–55), who transformed the modest village into a small capital. Amongst the first constructions was the Casa de Fundação (1750) for the control of gold, the governor's palace (1751), and the military barracks (1751). Under his successors the town continued being improved, including the construction of the Casa de Câmara e Cadeia (1761), improvement of the roads and streets, building of the fountains of Carioca and Chafariz de Cauda, and opening of a theatre (1772–77). The governor Luis da Cunha Meneses (1778–83) planted trees, improved the street alignment, laid out the public square of Chafariz, and opened a slaughterhouse (1778–83). He also had the urban master plan prepared (1782), providing the town with a structure that has survived till the present day.

In 1770 an inevitable decline in gold mining began and Goiás entered a long period of stagnation. It retained its status as a capital, but remained far behind Rio de Janeiro, and so further progress was arrested. In 1935–37 its administrative status was removed but the townscape remained intact. In 1950 IPHAN, the conservation authority of Brazil, listed its principal churches and the barracks, and in 1951 the Casa da Câmara, the palace, and the main areas in the centre. The inauguration in 1960 of the new capital city of Brazil, Brasília, gave the region a new impetus. Since the 1980s Goiás has been revitalized with some new constructions. Fortunately, the entire centre area was listed by IPHAN for protection in 1978.

Description

The town of Goiás is built between two series of hills, along a small river, the Rio Vermelho. The areas on the right bank are tight up against the north-western hills (Cantagalo and Santa Barbara), and have a popular character, indicated by the church of Rosario, which was traditionally reserved for slaves. The areas on the left bank, limited by the hills to the south-east (Dom Francisco and Chapeu do Padre), are reserved for the more representative groups of buildings, including the parish church (today the cathedral) of Santana, the governor's palace, the barracks, the Casa de Fundação, extending to the Praça do Chafariz (200m long), and climbing towards the hill of Chapeu do Padre. Here are also to be found the historic residential quarter and a characteristic market place.

The town is characterized by the harmony of its architecture, due to the proportions and types of buildings. At the same time, the history of construction can be read in the variation of styles from the classical 18th century buildings to the eclectic architecture of the 19th century.

The zone proposed for inscription consists essentially of the zone listed and protected by IPHAN in 1978. To this have been added some typical 19th century streets, which are considered to be important for appreciating the history of the town. IPHAN has already initiated the process for including

these streets in the protected area. The buffer zone surrounds the nominated zone, including green areas and hillsides, where new constructions are under strict control.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The ownership of the town of Goiás is mixed, including a large number of private owners, as well as the municipality, the State, and the diocese. IPHAN itself owns a few listed properties.

The first listing of limited historic buildings was undertaken in 1950 and 1951, but the entire historic core of the town was listed by the State (IPHAN) in 1978. The protection is based on the Federal Constitution of Brazil and the Decree for the Protection of Cultural Heritage of 1937 at the federal level. The Regional Decree of 22 April 1993 regulates the preservation of the historic and natural landscape, including the core and the buffer zones. On 29 August 1996 the municipality approved the Urban Master Plan, developed jointly with IPHAN to respond to the conservation requirements of the historic areas. Furthermore, there is a recent decree creating an Area of Environmental Protection that includes both Goiás and its surroundings. All industry and mining activities are banned.

Management

In addition to the control exercised by IPHAN on behalf of the Federal State, the listed properties are managed by the regional superintendence and the authorities of Goiás.

The Urban Master Plan of 1996 establishes policies for urban development, limits the perimeter of the town, regulates the preservation of historic and natural heritage in the area, and controls building norms and standards. A new Department of Infrastructure and Urbanism was created in 1999 whose function is to design and manage the development of the town. IPHAN acts as a partner and adviser in issues related to the conservation of heritage.

The recent creation of a non-governmental association, *Pro Cidade de Goiás Patrimônio Mundial*, which has the objectives of raising awareness and involving the population, is worth noting. Another association, NATIVA, focuses on the protection of the natural environment.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The historic town of Goiás has preserved its urban fabric reasonably well. The public buildings are in good condition. However, about 30% of the private houses are considered in poor condition, while the rest are in good or normal condition.

The municipality has an active role in promoting the conservation and rehabilitation of historic structures. Such programmes are undertaken in partnership with various institutions and organizations. The projects include restoration of the Museum of Sacred Art of Boa Morte (1997), the Cathedral of Santana (1998), and the church of Santa Barbara (1999), burial of electric poles and wiring, cleaning up of the Rio Vermelho, protection of the municipal archives, undertaking a university research programme on

cultural heritage, promotion of educational programmes regarding heritage, and establishment of the association *Pro-Cidade de Goiás*. IPHAN has established a local office in Goiás to provide administrative and technical assistance in restoration works.

The main pressures affecting the property come mainly from the current development trends. In this regard, the candidature of the historic area to the World Heritage List has been beneficial in accelerating the decision-making process at the local level. The current level of tourism is relatively modest. However, measures are being taken to improve the reception of visitors and the presentation of historic sites. No natural hazards are indicated.

Authenticity and integrity

Goiás went through a long period of stagnation from the 19th century until recent times. Its townscape has therefore not been subject to any major changes in modern times, except perhaps for the reconstruction of the church of Rosário in Gothic Revival style in 1933. Otherwise, Goiás is a good example of the appearance of the mining town of the 18th and 19th centuries, including its natural environment, which has remained intact. The few constructions that have taken place since the 19th century have been made using for the most part traditional techniques and building materials, or their size and architectural expression do not jeopardize the integrity of the place.

Goiás and its hinterland bear a rich cultural tradition that includes not only architecture and construction techniques, but also music, poetry, gastronomy, and popular events. Many of these traditions are still alive and form a substantial part of the cultural identity of Goiás. The historic centre has an important meaning for the local community, not only on the account of its urban and architectural values, but also for its rich social and cultural life. The relatively modest development of tourism reinforces the genuineness and authenticity of these cultural manifestations.

As a conclusion, the historic town of Goiás is considered to have well preserved its historical authenticity and its integrity, including the continuation of local traditions.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

The nomination of Goiás was first proposed in 2000, and an ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 2000. ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages, CIVVIH. The nomination was deferred by the Bureau, requesting the State Party to verify the justification of the outstanding universal value and the definition of the nominated area. The State Party has now provided additional information regarding the construction techniques of the place, as well as its comparison with sites already inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Qualities

ICOMOS recognizes that Goiás bears important witness to the occupation and colonization of central Brazil. It can also be seen in the context of mining towns. The historic town of Goiás represents an authentic testimony to such

developments and could be considered complementary to the town of Diamantina, already inscribed on the List.

The urban layout of Goiás is an example of an organically developed colonial town, adapted to the conditions of the site. The architecture of public and private buildings is unpretentious, plain, and severe in character, and the whole is harmonious, resulting also from the continuity of a coherent use of local materials and vernacular techniques, as interpreted by local craftsmen. It is further recognized that the community of Goiás has maintained many traditional and cultural issues that have been lost elsewhere in the country, and the site has not been negatively affected by tourism. The whole site is embedded in an attractive river valley.

The main qualities of Goiás, its exceptionality and its outstanding universal value, lie less in its artistic aspects and rather more in its being a genuine and rare document of the way in which the explorers of the territory, in an isolated situation, adapted models of planning and construction to the realities of a tropical region, borrowing from the indigenous people the use of local materials and techniques.

Comparative analysis

The nomination dossier compares Goiás with two types of Brazilian town:

1. Colonial towns, such as those stemming from the exploitation of gold or diamonds (Ouro Preto or Diamantina): mining towns in mountainous areas were generally constructed without following regular plans, adapting themselves to the physical sites. In the case of Goiás, the river was the basis for the first urban layout and played a significant role in its form, dividing it in two parts, which is somewhat exceptional in Latin America.
2. Towns related to the occupation of central Brazil (Goiás, Guinea, and Brasília): Goiás is the first of these, and differs substantially in its urban and architectural features from the others, including Ouro Preto (inscribed 1980), Serro, and Diamantina (inscribed 1999).

The austere architecture of Goiás is characterized by the use of vernacular, *adobe*, *taipa*, and *pau-a-pique* techniques, which have continued over time, giving the town its particular harmony. It also represents the original conditions of such mining towns in an authentic and less altered state than any other.

The special significance of Goiás is based on its being one of the key references in the process of the colonization of the Brazilian inland, which as a whole deferred from the rest of Latin America due to its Portuguese connection. This process has already been documented through the inscription of Ouro Preto (inscribed 1980: criteria i, iii), Diamantina (1999: ii, iv), and the Sanctuary of Bom Jesus do Congonhas (1985: i, iv) in the interior, and Olinda (1982: ii, iv) and São Luis (1997: iii, iv, v) on the coast.

The closest comparison to Goiás probably comes from Diamantina and Ouro Preto, both related to the exploration of the rich resources of Brazil, the former of diamonds, the latter of gold. The two have some similarity to Goiás in their organic development, but differ in terms of architecture. Ouro Preto is characterized by its very fine Baroque ensembles; Diamantina has fairly formal qualities in its

buildings, even though integrating with local craftsmanship. Goiás was born as a truly vernacular settlement and has remained as such. It differs from the other two in being more austere and more local in character and workmanship.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

ICOMOS recommends that particular attention be given to the control of future tourism developments, mitigating any changes that might be introduced to the area and the single properties.

Brief description

Goiás testifies to the occupation and colonization of the lands of central Brazil in the 18th and 19th centuries. The urban layout is an example of an organic mining town, adapted to the conditions of the site. The architecture of the public and private buildings is modest in form, but the whole is harmonious, resulting also from the coherent use of local materials and vernacular techniques.

Recommendation

Recognizing the additional information provided by the State Party, regarding the outstanding universal value of Goiás, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*.

The historic town of Goiás constitutes an important testimony of the occupation and colonization of central Brazil. The urban layout of Goiás is an example of an organically developed colonial town, adapted to the conditions of the site. The architecture is plain and severe in character, and the whole is harmonious, resulting also from continuity in the coherent use of local materials and vernacular techniques, as interpreted by local craftsmen. The site has retained its remarkable setting intact.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Provins (France)

No 873

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Provins, town of medieval fairs
<i>Location</i>	Région Ile-de-France, Département de la Seine-et-Marne
<i>State Party</i>	France
<i>Date</i>	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The town of Provins was built on a site well suited for defence, selected by the Counts of Champagne for the establishment of a political and military stronghold soon to become a nerve centre of European trade. An important financial, industrial, and intellectual centre, Provins contributed to the development of culture and trade over two centuries; today it is an exceptionally well preserved example of a west European trading town. Its medieval atmosphere is due not only to an exceptional concentration of ancient buildings but also to many details, such as the paving, old wells, and even the rose, the symbol of Provins. In the Lower Town, the mills, the wash basins, and the tanneries document some of the principal activities. There are gardens scattered throughout the town and five farms are still in use today.

Provins has preserved a considerable number of civic and religious buildings, and it retains most of its medieval town plan. The original ramparts extend over 1.5km, and the walls of the Upper Town are intact. The fortifications of the Lower Town are clearly traceable, though replaced by boulevards starting in the 18th century. The principal axes of communication, along the trade routes of Champagne, are still in place. Some of the gardens between the Bourg and the ramparts have been divided into plots over the past century, but many still exist.

Because of economic stagnation from the 14th to the 19th centuries, the town underwent no major development. However, instead of becoming a museum town, it was adapted to modern life and has integrated new residences remarkably well without modifying the urban layout. At the same time, Provins continues to live and function within its medieval perimeter, relating to a period when it was the third largest city in France, after Paris and Rouen.

Although sited curiously outside the earlier major Gallo-Roman routes, the objective was to derive every benefit from its location in the new communication artery through central France. The bipolar settlements of the Châtel (Upper Town)

and the valley (Lower Town) were soon joined, forming an ensemble with a remarkable canal system that has merited the appellation of “Little Venice” by the romantics. There is no doubt that it is the most beautiful example of a trade town in the western Europe, which still presents the original locations of its functions. The position of the town favoured the development of a stopover along the commercial routes running from south-west to north-east. In 1137 and 1164 Count Henry the Liberal of Champagne conferred the privilege of holding fairs to Provins. Safe conducts granted by the Counts made it possible for trade connections to develop between Europe and the Orient.

Today, Provins is a veritable conservatory of medieval military, religious, and civic architecture. Its fortifications are a dictionary of military architecture with a diversity of creative solutions. The town has a number of characteristic constructions, such as the cellars of the Upper Town and the vaulted ground floors of the Lower Town, used as storage for the fairs. The churches that were saved from the ravages of the Revolution offer interesting records of the history of architecture. A cultural centre with considerable economic and commercial weight, Provins was at the root of banking development and monetary policies, a clearing house for world economy at the time. A city of fairs, its cloth trade was well known. The theologian Abélard (1079–1142) taught there, and Count Thibault IV (1222–53) was one of the greatest troubadours of his time. Provins is also associated with the name of a rose, brought from Jericho during the Crusades, which had an enormous success due to its medical virtues.

The site of Provins, a town of medieval fairs within the early 13th century enclosure, is proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria ii, iii, and iv**:

ii The site bears witness to a considerable exchange of economic, commercial, and cultural influences during the period from the 11th to 13th centuries, and to the planning of the town in this period, involving drainage of marshland, creation of a system of water management, and building of the fortified enclosure.

iii The site is exceptional and even unique testimony to medieval civilization, rediscovering almost intact the locations of the most significant fairs in Europe. It is directly associated with the economic development of Christianity in the Middle Ages, which has been of outstanding universal significance for the progress of exchange and of civilization.

iv The site is a well known example of a type of construction, especially noteworthy for its cellars and vaulted ground floors, which exemplifies a significant period in human history, the beginning of economic trade in Europe.

As a historic town, and located in an exceptional natural setting, the site has well preserved the stratigraphy of its evolution, demonstrating the spatial organizations and the characteristic structural systems of the succeeding phases of its history.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

In the Gallo-Roman period, the site of present-day Provins was related to two important regional axes: the route from Soissons to Troyes toward the north, and the route to Sens toward south-west. These two routes, together with the valley of Seine, form an important communication artery enclosing the rocky spur of the early settlement. The origin of the name Provins is uncertain, but could be an abbreviation of *Probus Vinum*. The earliest document related to Provins is an ordinance by Charlemagne of 802 which indicates that the site was already an established fort. In 983 the site became part of the lands of the powerful Counts of Champagne, one of the great feudal domains in France, and a favoured place of residence of the Counts.

Because of its political and commercial importance, the castle (*Châtel*) on the high ground was fortified in the 11th and 12th centuries. The original enclosure (*castrum*) was small, including, in addition to the castle, the Collegiate Church of Saint-Quiriace and the Palace of the Counts. However, the settlement grew up rapidly outside the fortifications and this, too, was encircled by a defensive wooden wall in the late 12th century. A third set of fortifications, this time in stone, was added in the first half of the 13th century, to protect the houses and stalls erected for the great fairs in the town outside the earlier walls, down in the river valley.

Provins is thus one of the four towns (together with Troyes, Lagny, and Bar-sur-Aube) where medieval fairs were held in the reign of the Counts of Champagne, developing here from the 11th to the 14th century. Of the four towns, Provins is the only one to retain its original medieval fabric; the others have been substantially altered. The importance of the fairs in Champagne is at the beginning of the process. Their location in central France was along the favoured route to the north. Their political and economic ambitions decided the development by the Counts of Champagne of a system of fairs that were regularly programmed over a yearly cycle, avoiding overlaps and competition. The fairs led to merchants converging here from all over Europe and from the Orient. They became important centres of banking; the Provins *denier* was one of the few currencies accepted widely throughout the continent of Europe. The towns also became centres of intellectual and artistic life, and Abélard and Chrétien de Troyes are known to have spent time in Provins. The fairs continued from 1120 till 1320, when the economic and political situation changed, and commercial contacts developed elsewhere, particularly with the Hanseatic League, Flanders, and Italy. The function of Provins was thus reduced to a local context.

Provins is fortunate in having preserved good documentation dating from the 12th century onwards, which has helped to throw light on the entire process of development and its consequences.

It is important to distinguish between a market and a fair. A market could be a yearly event, or even a continuous activity, where the purpose was to sell goods directly to consumers. A fair, on the other hand, indicated an activity that was aimed at merchants and dealers, with an international character. It was generally composed of three parts: first the presentation and study of merchandise by potential customers, then negotiation and acquisition, and finally legal verification of the sales that had taken place. The fair required long-distance transport systems and special conditions to guarantee safety and security. Fairs were also accompanied by the development of a multitude of other activities, which together gave the incentive and motivation for the development of a particular type of urban fabric. The historic town of Provins, therefore, can be seen as a materialization of a built framework for the fairs.

The Counts of Champagne starting losing interest in the region on assuming the crown of Navarre in 1234. In 1284, with the marriage of Philip the Fair (Philippe IV le Bel) to Jeanne of Navarre, Champagne (and with it Provins) became part of the royal domain. The town was in English hands during the 15th century, but was finally to become French at the end of the Hundred Years' War. Provins was not to be affected to any marked extent by the Industrial Revolution. It has survived to the present day as a small market town, and so has escaped the demolitions and reconstructions that other towns have undergone, allowing it to conserve its medieval form.

Description

The town developed to the south of the Brie chalk plateau, in a gently hilly region at the confluence of the valleys of the Voulzie and the Durteint. It consists of the Upper Town (*Ville Haute*, known as the *Châtel* until the Revolution), which grew up on a spur of the Brie plateau, and the Lower Town (*Ville Basse*, pre-Revolutionary *Val*), lying further to the east at the confluence of two rivers. These two parts together form the present nomination. The area totals 1472ha and its population is now c 12,000, having been estimated c 10,000 (or even more) in the Middle Ages.

The Upper Town is characterized by the small houses built in stone and timber-framed construction and by green areas and gardens. There are two large buildings, the so-called *Tour de César* (Caesar's Tower) and the Romanesque-Gothic church of *Saint-Quiriace*. Caesar's Tower, or the Big Tower, is a stone structure, dating initially from the 12th century, which consists of three large spaces one above the other, covered with a conical roof from the 17th century. The name of Caesar refers to a romantic association with ancient Rome. Construction of the church of Saint-Quiriace began with a choir of impressive size in the 12th century and went on until the decline of Provins in 1320 up to the crossing of the nave and two bays beyond. The vaults above the crossing were damaged in a fire in the 17th century and were replaced with a dome.

The centre of the town was the old market square, surrounded by houses that developed in relation to the fairs, each with large vaulted underground storage spaces. The 12th century ramparts still surrounding the Upper Town on three sides have been relatively well preserved, while the enclosure of the Lower Town was dismantled in the 19th century. The existing walls include two gates (Porte Saint-Jean and Porte de Jouy), twenty bastions whose ground-

plans are variously circular, square, and polygonal, and other features.

In the area of the Lower Town there were at first religious ensembles, including the churches of *Saint-Ayoul* (started in the 11th century) and *Sainte-Croix* (started in the 12th century). About 60% of the land was the property of the religious orders. When the town was extended into the valley, the orders formed lots, building and selling houses, following a typology that corresponded to the needs of the fairs. Since the land did not allow underground spaces, the storage areas were built above ground, using a similar vaulted construction to that in the Upper Town. The occupation and building activities also necessitated the canalization and drainage of the land, and this developed into a sophisticated water management system.

The private buildings may be divided into two groups: those with multiple functions and those with solely commercial functions.

The multiple-function buildings are for the most part the private residences of merchants, the lower floors of which served as shops and stores. All date to the 12th and 13th centuries; some are built entirely in stone and other have timber-framed structures above lower stone courses. They are located either around the perimeter of the town, inside the defences, or around the *Place du Châtel*. This was the commercial heart of the town in which the fairs were held twice a year, in May and at Martinmas (11 November); another fair was held in the Lower Town in September. The latter was later transformed into a yearly market, in order to avoid overlap with other fairs in the region.

Commercial buildings such as the Tithe Barn (*Grange aux Dîmes*) are more monumental structures, with stores and counting-houses on several floors. A characteristic of all the ancient buildings in Provins, whether for mixed or for commercial use, is their system of vaulted cellars, dating from the 12th to the 14th centuries. These are either entirely underground (Upper Town) or partly built up above ground (Lower Town), and all open out to the street by means of a large door to which access is gained by a wide stone staircase. In cases where the surface area is large there are internal lines of pillars dividing the spaces into two or three bays.

The oldest building in the town is probably the 12th century *Maison Romane* (now the Museum), constructed in coursed dressed stone. Its location in the former Jewish quarter suggests that it may originally have been a rabbinical school or even a synagogue. Its large cellars, separated by semi-circular arches, were probably originally vaulted.

With the development of the fairs, there also grew various types of activities related to the crafts and elaboration of the merchandise, particularly woollen drapery, tanning, dyeing, and weaving. There was need for extended outdoor spaces to be able to stretch out the fabric for drying (*tiroirs*), and there were water mills on the canals required for the production of flour. The Lower Town of Provins is in particular testimony to the development of various handicrafts into an industrial process; the locations of this development still exist. Some of the canals have been covered, but most still remain as in the Middle Ages. There are three areas in the slopes of the plateau where clay was extracted for the process of removing grease from wool. These intricate underground galleries were quarried at

several levels, and were later also used for storage of wine, etc. The entire town developed in relation to the fairs, either directly serving the fair functions* or being indirectly related as an outcome.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Fifty-four historic buildings in the nominated area of Provins (plus a zone of 500m around each) are protected under the provisions of the French antiquities legislation (1913 Law on the protection of buildings, movable objects and archaeological remains; 1930 Protection of natural monuments and sites). Twelve out of these are identified as *Monuments classés* and 41 are included on the list of *Monuments inscrits*. Ministerial authorization is required for any form of intervention, and the works are supervised by the Architecte-en-chef or the Architecte des bâtiments de France.

The protection of individual properties is reinforced by the 1983 Law on Protection Zones for the Protection of the Architectural and Urban Heritage (ZPPAUP) and the 1962 Law on Protected Sectors (*Secteurs sauvegardés*). Relevant areas of the town of Provins are covered by these two statutes; the Lower Town was identified as a zone of ZPPAUP in February 2001. The municipality has applied to be accepted in the programme of *Villes et Pays d'Art et d'Histoire*, which gives benefits particularly related to the presentation of the site. The intention is also to propose the historic area as a *Secteur sauvegardé*, which would provide instruments for more detailed conservation management, as well as facilitating resources for conservation work.

Management

Ownership of the properties included within the nominated area is shared among regional and communal authorities and private individuals and institutions. Responsibility for ensuring the proper implementation of the different forms of statutory protection is vested in the Ministry of Culture. The direct functions are exercised by the Regional Director for Cultural Affairs (DRAC) for the Île-de-France, through the Regional Conservator for Historic Monuments. Individual proprietors are responsible for the maintenance of protected properties, all work being supervised by an Architecte des Bâtiments de France.

The nominated area of the Upper and Lower Towns and their immediate surroundings are part of an extensive ZPPAUP zone (designated in 1990 and 2001 respectively), within which there is strict control over development.

Provins had had a series of plans since the 1960s, designed to protect and enhance its medieval centre. The 1984 *Plan d'occupation des sols* was revised in 1990 and again in 1996. There is also a series of programmes directed to individual monuments or for special aspects of protection, such as cultural tourism, control of advertisements, and pedestrianization.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Restoration projects began in Provins in the mid 19th century at the Collegiate Church and the Tour César, and the

ramparts were listed in 1865. It is noted that the historical value of Provins had already been recognized in the previous centuries, resulting in its retaining its historical integrity fairly well intact. The town suffered somewhat during the Hundred Years War in the 14th and 15th centuries, when the farms in the surrounding countryside were destroyed, as well as during the French Revolution, when the town lost several of its religious ensembles (including nine churches). There was no major restoration in the 19th century, unlike many other major sites in France. However, the fortifications of the Lower Town were replaced with boulevards, and some green areas and gardens were built over. Since the 1950s there has been work on different components of the town's medieval heritage, including recent consolidation and reinforcement of the ramparts of the Upper Town.

Authenticity and integrity

Because of the decline in its economy, but also owing to the continuity of its functions, Provins has survived fairly well intact. Some destruction took place during the Hundred Years War in the 14th and 15th centuries, as well as during the French Revolution, but this was fortunately relatively limited. At the present, Provins is a normal country town with an active population, associated with agriculture and related activities. The medieval town plan has been well preserved, as well as a large part of the historic buildings, the canals, and the water management system. About 150 historic houses have retained their medieval vaulted storage spaces. Though there have been minor changes since the 17th century, the town has preserved its historic integrity and the authenticity of the places related to the different functions of the fairs. The relationship of the Upper Town with the plains of the high plateau have also been preserved intact. Some new buildings in the Lower Town are unpretentious in respecting the overall patterns and volumes; they integrate well with the historic building stock.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

Provins was first proposed to the World Heritage List as "The medieval town of Provins" in 1997. Following the ICOMOS evaluation, the State Party withdrew the nomination. In the present proposal, the nomination has been revised completely. An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in March 2001.

Qualities

Provins provides authentic testimony of an important and early economic development in central Europe related to fairs. Differing from markets, medieval fairs became an international institution generating communication and contacts with distant countries, the Mediterranean, the Orient, and northern Europe. In this process, the Counts of Champagne, because of their political and economic ambitions, were in a key position; they initiated the institution of fairs in Champagne, which were later continued and imitated elsewhere. Many fundamental elements of the fairs were first developed in Champagne, the initiator of the process. Provins is the best preserved example in Champagne, and it was built as a function of the fairs. The typology of the houses, the fortifications, the

waterways, and other features all reflect the processes related to or generated by the fairs.

Comparative analysis

The Champagne fairs started developing in four cities (Provins, Troyes, Lagny, Bar-sur-Aube) from the 11th and early 12th century. Of these four cities, Provins is the only one to have preserved its medieval fabric intact. It had fairs from at least as early as 1120, as confirmed by original charters dating 1137 and 1164.

The Hanseatic League developed from the early 13th century, starting with German merchants who had settled in Gotland (at Visby, inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1995: criteria iv, v). From 1241 the leadership was passed to Lübeck (1987: iv), and the League gradually developed into a major association of "free cities" situated in present-day Germany, the Baltic States, England, Poland, and Russia. Fairs were established in Bruges (2000: ii, iv, vi) in 1200, and its golden era extended from the 14th to 15th centuries. Another fair, based on the Champagne model, developed outside the Hansa in Frankfurt-am-Main in 1240. There were contacts between the cities of the Hansa and those of Champagne. Fairs also developed in Northern Italy (Genoa, Siena), the first being held in 1179.

In this context, the fairs of Champagne anticipated the other developments, often providing a model and reference, and Provins represents the only remaining testimony of this early development.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

ICOMOS recognizes the degree of protection implemented so far in the historic town of Provins and its surroundings. Nevertheless, and in accordance with the intention of the authorities, ICOMOS recommends that the nominated core area should be designated as a *Secteur sauvegardé*, in order to guarantee control of the urban fabric as a whole, particularly considering the vulnerability of this type of heritage in view of any major development and consequent transformation in the future.

Brief description

The fortified medieval town of Provins is situated in the former territory of the powerful Counts of Champagne. It is testimony of early developments in the organization of international trading fairs and the wool industry. Provins has well preserved its urban structure, which was built specifically as a function of the fairs and related activities.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

The historic fortified town of Provins is an outstanding and authentic example of a medieval fairs town in the territories of the Counts of Champagne. It represents an important interchange of human values which led to the early developments of international fairs in central Europe. The institution of fairs guaranteed the protection of long-distance transport of merchandise between Europe and the Orient, and led to the development of

activities such as banking and exchange, tanning, dyeing and weaving of textiles, etc, through which handicrafts evolved into an industrial process. The existing medieval urban layout and houses of Provins represent an outstanding example of an architectural ensemble specifically built to fulfil such functions, including merchants' houses, storage spaces, mills, water management systems, open spaces for treatment of textiles, farmhouses, and religious ensembles. Recognition has also been given to the town for its well preserved defence systems, built for the protection of the fairs.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Vardzia-Khertvisi (Georgia)

No 1019

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Vardzia-Khertvisi Historical Area
<i>Location</i>	Samtskhe-Javakheti Region, Aspindza District
<i>State Party</i>	Georgia
<i>Date</i>	9 December 1999

Justification by State Party

The Vardzia-Khertvisi Historic Area, in a vast river basin, is the oldest historical-geographical and administrative unit in Georgia, traceable back to prehistoric times, which retained and heightened its significance through the Middle Ages. The area comprises monuments, groups of buildings, and sites located in one historical-geographical region and connected with one another by their common evolution. They are considered to be an integrated unity resulting from an uninterrupted historical process. Accordingly, the site meets the following criteria for inscription on the World Heritage List.

A general characteristic trait of Georgian culture is its openness towards the outside world. In the course of its age-old history Georgia practised active contacts with countries of diverse cultural background. These links developed with the cultural centres of Asia Minor. Monasticism was initiated by the Syrian Fathers in the 6th century; rock-cut monasteries reflect two significant stages of this development (8th–9th and 12th–13th centuries), making it possible to have a complete picture from simple one-storey buildings to multi-storey ensembles. The murals of the Vardzia rock-cut monastery testify to contacts with the Christian Orient and Byzantine world, but the influences were transformed in accordance with local artistic traditions. The paintings in *secco* technique also differ from the mixed techniques of the Byzantine murals. Chronologically, Vardzia represents the earliest brilliant murals of the turn of the 12th/13th centuries, the first to introduce a new, decorative, and dynamic style in Georgia. **Criterion ii**

The Vardzia monastic complex bears evidence of the best achievements and cultural traditions at the turn of the 12th/13th centuries, when Georgia was the most powerful state in the Near East. Development of medieval Georgian culture had reached its acme at that time; science, literature, and art showed a vigorous upswing. This was the epoch of humanism. Capital punishment was practised not practised in Georgia at that time. Vardzia exercised a strong influence, even outside Georgia. **Criterion iii**

The Vardzia-Khertvisi Historic Area has preserved one of the best examples of a particular type of church building, that with two aisles (Zeda Vardzia, 11th century). This is a local variation of the three-aisled basilica imported along with Christianity. Some examples exist in other countries, but the origin is traceable only in Georgia. Because of its unique landscape, the area has important natural values: a narrow gorge of volcanic origin with various types of lava reaching the riverbed. Diverse types of buildings and rock-cut complexes are organically embodied in the canyon-like gorge of the River Mtkvari. Relatively open, wide portions of the gorge are covered with artificially arranged terraces. Human intervention does not violate the scale of the landscape. **Criterion iv**

The nominated area has preserved medieval rock-cut complexes of traditional vernacular dwellings and village sites, testifying to the high level of living and building activity. Everyday life and subsidiary and defensive aspects are well thought out in diverse types of structures, functionally connected with one another. Mention should be made of a whole system of underground hiding places, providing shelter for the population in case of invasion. Noteworthy are also the examples of terrace farming, a developed form of intensive agriculture, preserved until the present day. **Criterion v**

Vardzia-Khertvisi belongs to the region (Javakheti) from where Christianity was introduced to Georgia. In the 4th century, St Nino, the Apostolic Saint of Georgia, crossed Javakheti by foot on her way to the capital of Kartli. In the same period, Christianity was declared the state religion, and a bishop was invited from Greece to erect here one of the first Christian churches in Georgia. The Vardzia-Khertvisi route became the main road of special significance at the turn of the 12th and 13th centuries. Georgia had then an active foreign policy, which also influenced the foundation of the royal monastery in Vardzia. Building of this monastery is directly connected with the activity of King George III (1156–84) of Georgia and his daughter Queen Tamar (1184–1213), who continued the construction, which makes the site even more precious, and associated with legends. This period is called "Tamar's Period," and it is of great political and cultural significance. It is also associated with the life of the great Georgian poet, Shota Rustaveli, whose immortal poem *Knight in the Panther's Skin* reflects the humanist ideals that are characteristic of Georgian culture. The verses of this poem written in ink on the façade of the rock-cut church in Vahanis Kvabebi monastery, dating from 15th–16th century, are the earliest written record of the text of the poem. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

Georgia was a single kingdom from the 4th century BCE with Mtskheta as its capital. Christianity was introduced in the country in the 4th century CE. Until the 7th century it

was challenged by the Persian and Byzantine empires; it was conquered by the Arabs in the 7th century and by the Seljuk Turks in the 11th century. The Turks were expelled in the early 12th century, when Georgia was again united as a kingdom. It was destroyed by Mongol invaders in the 13th century, and was then under the Persians and the Ottoman Empire until the 18th century.

The area of Vardzia-Khertvisi has had a significant role in the history of the country. It formed part of the historical province of Javakheti, first mentioned in Urartu inscriptions (785 BCE) as having favourable climatic conditions and being an important crossroads. The area was first governed by Georgian kings. The first Christian churches were built here as early as the 4th century CE. It was under the Arabs in the 8th and 9th centuries, under the Persians in the 16th century, and under Turkish rule from 1578 to 1829. The nominated area includes the remains of a series of forts (Tsunda, Tmogvi, and Khertvisi), small monasteries and churches (Margastani, Jolda, Gelsunda), and royal monastic ensembles with their churches (Vanis Kvabebi and Vardzia), as well as numerous villages.

TSUNDA is one of the early fortified settlements, established on an ancient site. It had an administrative unit (*saeristavo*) and a royal summer residence in the 3rd century BCE. After Christianization in the 4th century, the king of Kartli invited a bishop and builders from Greece to erect here one of the first Christian churches of Georgia; an Episcopal see was founded here in the 5th century.

The Arab invasions of the 8th and 9th centuries caused a gradual decline of Tsunda, and the removal of the political centre to the fortified city of TMOGVI. The site is mentioned in historical sources from the 10th century onwards, and controlled main roads leading to Georgia from Asia Minor. Severely damaged by earthquakes (in 1089, 1283, and 1319), it was restored several times. In 1578 the site was occupied by Ottomans and returned to Georgians only in 1829. Today it is in ruins.

The site of KHERTVISI fortress is associated with the name of Alexander the Great. However, the existing construction seems to date from the 10th century. It was renovated many times in its history, and was in use until the 18th century.

Of the royal monasteries, the earliest cells of VANIS KVABEBI date from the 8th century; the monastery was enlarged from the 9th to 11th centuries. In 1089 its central part was destroyed by an earthquake. It was rebuilt and enlarged in the 12th century, and the monastic enclosure was restored in 1204. In 1283 it was again damaged by an earthquake, but revived in the 14th and 15th centuries. From the 16th century onwards it was subject to looting by invaders.

The largest rock-cut monastery was the VARDZIA complex, started by King George III (1156–84) and considerably enlarged by his daughter, Queen Tamar (1184–1213). The main church in the centre of the complex was painted in 1184–85, commissioned by Rati Surameli, a Kartli ruler (*eristavi*). The rock-cut village of Ananauri (10th–11th centuries) and its church with murals (13th–15th centuries) were integrated into the complex. An earthquake damaged the monastery in 1283, and it was renovated in the 13th and 14th centuries, including the erection of a porch and bell tower. The complex was plundered by the Persians in 1551 and the service was only restored in 1861. Today the site is in ruins, and includes a museum (1938).

Apart from the monasteries, there are several individual churches built by local feudal overlords: eg ZEDA VARDZIA church (11th century) built by Liparit ruler (*eristavteristavi*), ZEDA TMOGVI church (11th century) by Parsman Chimchmelidze, TSUNDA church (12th–13th centuries) by Ichkit Gurgenisdze.

The area has numerous villages and estates, such as the village site of PIA, where viticulture, horticulture, apiculture, and field-crop cultivation, as well as cattle breeding, were carried out, demonstrating a strong economic basis. This village had two churches from the 10th century.

Description

The Vardzia-Khertvisi area proposed for inscription is situated in south-western Georgia, in the Aspindza district, near the Turkish border. The nominated area is c 25km² and it has a buffer zone of some 90km².

The site can be described as a cultural landscape with an important archaeological character. The nominated area extends over 18km from the medieval fortress of Khertvisi in the north to the Vardzia rock-cut monastic ensemble in the south, along the gently curving gorge of the River Mtkvari, and is about 1–3km wide. The buffer zone surrounds the core area on all sides, and extends several kilometres further north and south along the river. The climate of the area is conditioned by the absence of wind in the gorge, the warmth and abundance of natural springs and warm mineral waters. It has thus favoured the development of agricultural activities since prehistoric times, especially viticulture and horticulture.

The landscape is of strong visual nature with sublime rock formations of volcanic origin, contrasting with the green plains of the plateau above. The area is characterized by the mixture of natural and human elements, contributing to an effect of drama. The fortresses and churches integrate with the rocky hills and mountains, emphasizing verticality but maintaining great harmony and a feeling of grandeur. Because of the rough soil conditions, agriculture only became possible by building terraces that stretch along both sides of the river. Closely linked with these terraces are the numerous rock-cut monastic ensembles at different levels, the churches, fortifications, and remains of villages.

The KHERTVISI fortress is situated at the junction of two rivers on the top of a high rock formation. It is one of the best preserved forts in Georgia. The construction in sandstone and volcanic granite includes a citadel at the higher level and an enclosure (50–100m x 200m) built at a lower level with a group of residential buildings. The citadel has three towers of square plan and the remains of a church. Near the fortress there is a village and fruit gardens.

About 2.5km to the south is the rock-cut settlement of GELSUNDA, and the caves of Navardzievi across the river higher up on the mountain. The settlement of PIA is situated 3km further south, with simple rock-cut dwellings and two churches. The better preserved church of St Theodore is built in well dressed stone and an inscription gives the date 995. There are fragments of mural paintings, and a quotation from the Gospel of St John in *Asomtavruli* script. This is the oldest painted script in southern Georgia, dated to the late 10th to 11th centuries.

About 8km south of Khertvisi the gorge widens and there is a little lake. This is the site of the ancient settlement of

TSUNDA, which is believed to have been the centre of the principality in the 3rd century BCE, including the royal summer residence and the Episcopal See. Nothing remains of the fortified city, which declined around the 9th century, but there are churches dating to the 12th–14th centuries. The fortress of TMOGVI was built over a large rock formation, and the church of Zeda Tmogvi is located at some distance to the north. The church contains several inscriptions, and there are two stone stelae from the 7th to 9th centuries. Further south there are several cave complexes, including the VANIS CHABEBI and the church of GAMOGMA CHACKARI.

The largest monastic complex is that of VARDZIA GRAND MONASTERY, which is cut in the middle of a steep rock, stretching over a length of some 500m, and comprising more than 600 compartments, including fifteen churches. The construction dates mainly from the 12th–13th centuries. The village of Ananauri and its church are also part of the complex. The caves of Vardzia are arranged in tiers, ranging from five to thirteen, connected one to another through holes and tunnels. The front of the caves has collapsed. Originally, there were roofed corridors arranged along the tiers. The eastern part of Vardzia has the main church of the monastery, a spring, "Tamar's Room," meeting hall (*sadarbazo*), reception hall (*salkhino*), pharmacy, wine cellars, and a secret tunnel. The church is entirely covered with mural paintings that date from 1184–85, including portraits of the royal family. These paintings are considered of high artistic merit, recognized as masterpieces of medieval painting.

In addition to the medieval structures and remains, the gorge has various archaeological sites dating to prehistoric era, even to 4th or 3rd millennium BCE. There are burial sites particularly in the area of the former settlement of Tsunda, dating from the 4th to 3rd centuries BCE.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The nominated area forms part of the Vardzia State Museum Reserve of Monuments of Art, History, and Architecture. It comprises 79 sites, out of which 46 are defined as architectural, 12 archaeological, and 21 monumental art. Based on the Law of Protection of Cultural Heritage of Georgia (25 June 1999), the properties within the reserve are in state ownership. The nominated area also comprises seven villages with arable land. Based on the Law on Land Ownership (24.11.1998), arable land is given in private ownership to the users.

The Vardzia Museum Reserve was founded on the basis of Decree No 319, 21.04.1981 of the Council of Ministers of Georgian SSR, and was adopted in 1985 (Decree No 1204). This document contains the conservation and management plans for the site, as well as general regulations for its protection. The latest version of the statutes of the Reserve defines the aim, objectives, organisational structure, accountability, financial resources, relation with the state budget, and regulations for site protection.

At the present, there is a process to confer the status of Protected Natural Site on the Vardzia Museum Reserve. This means a strict protection zone regulated within the limits of the Protected Natural Site, which will comprise the nominated area.

Management

The management of the nominated area is the responsibility of the Vardzia Museum Reserve of Monuments of Art, History, and Architecture, and of the Main Board for Protection and Utilization of Monuments of History and Culture of Georgia.

Up to 1990, the issues of management were not causing any problems, but since then the social, political, and economic changes in the country have considerably reduced the resources. There is also a serious lack of professional skills required for the tasks. This has caused a certain stagnation in activities.

There are, however, some fund-raising initiatives, including the joint programme of the World Bank and the Georgian Government. Financial assistance from the Dutch Government assisted a conservation project for the Vardzia complex in 1998. The project for the restoration of the Khertvisi fortress has been prepared by the Main Board for Protection of Monuments, and a major part of the project has already been implemented.

The strategy for tourism development and management has been prepared by the Centre for Architectural Heritage Conservation (1999), and the Fund for Preservation of Cultural Heritage of Georgia is working to raise the necessary funds for implementation.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Human habitation in the area of Vardzia-Khertvisi is of ancient origin, but the existing remains date mainly from the Middle Ages. Having undergone a series of destructions, the remains have become a part of a rich cultural landscape with its cultivation, fortresses, and churches. There have been some initiatives for the consolidation and restoration of the Vardzia caves, which had suffered from recent collapses. There have also been some limited restorations in the various churches and fortresses.

Authenticity and integrity

The nominated property may be considered to fulfil the test of authenticity and integrity seen as a historical and cultural landscape and considering that it has been conditioned by various factors. The main roads that used to go through this area have been located elsewhere since the 19th century. In the Soviet period the region was a frontier area, and therefore only accessible with special permission. Traditional farming has continued there, contributing to the maintenance of its character.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission will visit the site in April 2001 after this evaluation had to be sent for press.

Qualities

Georgian culture has always been characterized by its openness and its ability to integrate influences from different cultures. The nominated area is a cultural landscape in the gorge of the Mtkvari River, which has a rich variety of

ancient sites and monuments starting from prehistoric times and is closely associated with significant stages of the history of the Georgian kingdom in the different phases of Christianity in this region.

The Mtkvari River basin testifies to long interaction between man and nature, expressed in the series of terraces built along both sides of the river, which document continuous cultivation of the area from the ancient times to the present day, favoured by a warm climate and good water sources.

The area has some of the first Christian churches set up in Georgia as early as the 4th century, soon after Constantine the Great had declared Christianity to be the state religion in Rome. The rock-cut monasteries of the area document two significant stages of the evolution of monasticism, the 8th–9th and the 12th–13th centuries, providing a complete picture ranging from simple to complex ensembles. Of particular interest is the period from the 12th to the 13th centuries, when the Georgia was liberated from Seljuk dominion and revived as an independent kingdom.

The mural paintings of the Vardzia rock-cut monastery testify to contacts with the Christian Orient and the Byzantine world, but applied using local artistic traditions. The paintings also differ from the mixed techniques of Byzantine murals. Chronologically, Vardzia represents the earliest murals of the 12th/13th centuries, introducing a new, decorative, and dynamic style in Georgia, and representing the humanism of the period.

Comparative analysis

In terms of its constructions and the rock-cut ensembles, the Vardzia-Khertvisi area may be compared with other sites of the Near East and the Mediterranean area. The most relevant of these are Göreme National Park and the Rock Sites of Cappadocia (inscribed on the List 1985: cultural criteria i, iii, v), Petra (1985: i, iii, iv), and *I Sassi di Matera* (1993: iii, iv, v).

The significance of this area is in its close association with the development of Christianity and monasticism, and it represents a wide range of early examples, from simple to more complex, documenting the evolution of such architecture and ensembles. The area has early examples of the types of churches that later became characteristic, as well as having preserved the earliest mural paintings representing a new humanism of Georgia in the 12th and 13th century.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Comments will be eventually formulated on the basis of the ICOMOS evaluation mission to be undertaken in April 2001.

Brief description

The Vardzia-Khertvisi historical area in Georgia is a cultural landscape in the gorge of the River Mtkvari, which has strong historical associations, ranging from prehistory to the beginnings of Christianity in the 4th century, and the development of monasticism in the 8th–9th and the 12th–13th centuries. The site contains remains of ancient rock-cut medieval monastic ensembles such as Vardzia, fortresses such as Khertvisi, churches, and villages. The landscape merges the architectural remains with terraced fields and sublime rock formations.

Recommendation and statement of significance

Subject to a favourable expert mission report, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, iv, and v*:

The Vardzia-Khertvisi historical area has strong historical associations, ranging from prehistory to the beginnings of Christianity in the 4th century, and the development of monasticism in the 8th–9th and the 12th–13th centuries. The area contains some of the earliest prototypes of the later churches in the region. The area also contains the remains of the first capitals of the Georgian kings, as well as a series of fortresses, such as Khertvisi, and remains of villages. Mild climatic conditions have attracted settlements from ancient times, and the interaction between man and nature is attested by the cultivation terraces that are still in use.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Tbilisi (Georgia)

No 1020

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Tbilisi Historic District
<i>Location</i>	Region Kartli, Central Georgia
<i>State Party</i>	Georgia
<i>Date</i>	9 December 1999

Justification by State Party

Tbilisi, an urban heritage site, can be considered a meeting place of diverse nations and cultures, where foreign influences were filtered through national traditions and established in the specifically Tbilisian form of interpretation of the imported themes. The capital of a country and residence of successive invaders, Tbilisi underwent a continuous metamorphosis, being enriched in the process and never losing its own identity. The historic buildings of western and oriental influence, the churches, synagogues, and mosques bear vivid witness to the intense cultural and spiritual interrelations that contributed to its architectural diversity and urban fabric, still continuing to sustain age-old traditions of different origins merged with local culture.

Criterion ii

Tbilisi has always been a multi-national and multi-cultural city, where the immigrants felt at their ease and were able to retain their own religions, languages, and ethno-cultural peculiarities, contributing to the process of the development of a Tbilisian mode of life, character, and relations. This unity has to a certain extent helped to resist pressure of ethnic confrontation, being particularly important in the Soviet period.

Criterion iii

The Tbilisian mode of life and daily activities have contributed to a typically Tbilisian spatial organization of the residential districts. Here, interiors and exteriors were connected via balconies; courtyards were the focal points for various activities, often partly open toward the street, creating connections to the different parts of the house and linking with the staircases. All this played a role in the development of an open and communicable type of dwelling, corresponding to the conditions of the city and the needs of the inhabitants.

Criterion iv

Tbilisi belongs to a number of cities which have undergone significant evolution in the course of history, being a settlement, a fortress, a fortified city, and a capital. Having become a capital city, it has acquired cultural, administrative, and trading functions that it still retains, not only for the country but for the whole region. At present, Tbilisi faces the

serious risk of losing its identity owing to major changes threatening its historic district.

Criterion v

The fertile cultural traditions and the continuously advancing position of the capital city encouraged creative processes providing many brilliant artists with equal opportunities. Tbilisi was praised in the songs and verses of poets and witnessed the debut or crucial moments in the career of famous singers (Theodore Shalyapin), poets (Alexandre Griboedov), writers (Boris Pasternak, George Gurijiev), and painters (Niko Piroshmanashvili). The city flourished especially in the 19th century with its workshops and markets, bathhouses and gardens. Tbilisi is directly linked with the life and creative activity of Georgian Romanticism, associated with Alexander Chavchavadze, Gregory Orbeliani, and Nikoloz Baratashvili, and literature with Ilia Chavchavadze and Akaki Tsereteli. It was the inspiration of avant-garde Georgian poets, the *Tsisperkantslebi* group, and Galaktion Tabidze, symbol of modern Georgian poetry, as well as an attraction to many foreign painters and poets.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Human life in the area of Tbilisi has ancient origins, and has been traced back to the 5th millennium BCE, demonstrated by rich archaeological evidence. The first urban settlements date from the end of the 1st millennium BCE, and the earliest evidence of a construction is from 4th century CE, a fragment within the Narikala fortress from the time of Persian occupation. According to legends, the capital was moved from Mtskheta to Tbilisi by King Bakhtang Gorgasali and his son Dachi Ujarmeli in the late 5th and early 6th centuries. There is evidence of active building shown by several early medieval churches (Anchiskhati Church, Sioni Cathedral).

Tbilisi was destroyed by Buga Turk in 853, but a century later Armenian and Arab writers mention it as a flourishing town. This sequence is symptomatic, considering that Tbilisi has been destroyed and revived some twenty times in its history. In 1121, after a victorious battle, Tbilisi was released from the Arab domination, becoming the capital of the united Kingdom of Georgia. The period of King David the Builder (1089–1125) marks its heyday as the largest and richest city in the Near East, the period when Lurji Monastery was founded, Sioni Cathedral renovated, and Metekhi Church built. From 1226 to 1230 it was attacked several times and then invaded by the Mongols. In the 13th century King Demetre the Self-Sacrificer commissioned restoration and rebuilding. The domed church of St Nicholas was built in the Narikala fortress, and records mention 65 baths over hot springs.

The period from the 15th century onwards is marked by devastating invasions by Tamerlan and the troops of Safavid Persia, lasting until the treaty between the Persians and the Ottomans in 1639. Taking advantage of the relative peace,

Tbilisians started rebuilding their town, resulting in a number of churches of different beliefs, palaces, and caravanserais. However, in 1795, Tbilisi was again completely burned down, this time by Aga-Mahmad-Khan. At the beginning of the 19th century, Georgia was annexed to Russia and Tbilisi became the centre for the whole Transcaucasus. This resulted in a new wave of building activity, giving the city the character that has survived till the present.

The new constructions were built on old foundations, respecting the urban layout in the area of the Narikala fortress and the Metekhi plateau. Old residential areas such as Kala, Isani, Kharpukhi, and Avlabari were extended into the Gare Avlabari, Sololaki, Mtatsminda, and Vera quarters, as well as on the left bank of the River Mtkvari. The architectural character of the old quarters was changed to some extent: for example, the old *darbazi* dwellings disappeared. Many features such as churches and the fortress were also preserved, although the old city walls and towers were demolished in the early 19th century. The residential areas were built with wider streets and to a regular grid pattern. European architectural styles merged with traditional building traditions, especially from the mid 19th century onward. Thus, the city had no equivalent elsewhere in Russia. The Soviet period brought many changes to the townscape, including the construction of embankments and city squares, based on the new urban master plan. In the 1960s the Rike quarter near the Metekhi plateau was demolished, producing an urban void.

With growing heritage consciousness in the 1970s, Tbilisi became subject to campaigns of regeneration and reconstruction. The remaining old houses in the area of Metekhi were restored and new strategies were developed based on emerging international principles, gradually leading to integrated conservation. However, the first step was often an improvement of the exterior, followed by the restoration of the rest of the building. Several historic areas were targeted for renovation or reconstruction, including Baratashvili Street (1979), Kibalchich Hill (1980), Leselidze Street (1983), the right embankment area (1983), and the Abanotubani quarter (1984). All these works brought public attention to the historic centre, but there were also losses, such as those in the Vera quarter in the 1980s, and particularly those caused by war damage in 1991–92 and the subsequent reconstruction period.

Description

The nominated historic district of Tbilisi is situated in the centre of the city, on the west side of the River Mtkvari. The area is reported to have some 138,000 inhabitants, while the indicated buffer zone has some 118,000 inhabitants.

Even though Tbilisi has experienced a long series of destructions, the townscape of a medieval feudal city still survives, and a number of historic monuments are embedded in the urban fabric dating from the 19th and 20th centuries. In the areas around the citadel in the narrow gorge of the River Mtkvari, the architectural dominants include Narikala fortress and the churches of Metekhi, Sioni, and Anchiskhati. The oldest part of the city is in the area of Kala, which has retained its medieval layout as well as a number of typical Tbilisian residential houses. This spontaneously evolved area is characterized by irregular streets, narrow lanes, blind alleys, and houses that reflect the fantasy of the builder.

The Abanotubani quarter, to the south of Kala, is so named because of the abundance of bathhouses. The areas around the Narikala fortress have less well preserved medieval fabric, while the Garetubani quarter, on the right bank of the river, houses many significant public buildings. Sololaki is a regularly laid-out quarter, built in the late 19th century on the site of the former royal gardens. On the north side there is the Mtatsminda quarter, which developed on the slopes of Mount Mtatsminda, retaining its Tbilisian character, as does the somewhat later Vera quarter. In the 20th century a series of large public buildings were built on two main axes that were opened into the historic fabric.

The fortifications were demolished in the 19th century, but there are still remains, such as the ruins of the Narikala fortress, which dominate the silhouette of the old town.

The historic district includes a large number of religious ensembles, such as the 16th century church of *Anchiskhati*, the oldest preserved in Tbilisi, renovated in the 17th century, a typical example of Georgian basilicas. The *Subgevork* church, acquired by the Armenian community in the late Middle Ages, has a large 17th century dome. The other buildings include the 19th century *Roman Catholic Church*, the *Synagogue* of 1904–13, and the 17th century *Mosque of Shah Ismail*, transformed in the 19th century and damaged in the 1930s. The remains of a fire-worship temple, *Ateshgha*, were transformed into a mosque in the 18th century and are now in ruins.

There are a number of interesting residential buildings that represent the Tbilisian typology, particularly in the Kala quarter. The houses are built in brick or earthen structures, using plenty of wooden finishes, and are characterized by open balconies, inner courtyards, and various decorative features.

Some ancient palaces still remain, such as the *Sachino Palace* built by Queen Darejan and King Erekle II in 1719, and there are a number of bathhouses, of which the oldest date from the 17th century. The many caravanserais have unfortunately been lost.

Many of the public buildings date from the 19th century, and include the *Palace of the Vice-Gerent* (present Students' Palace) with its "Persian Hall" with stucco ornaments, the present *Major Office* and *Opera House* in pseudo-Moorish Oriental style. The *Rustaveli Theatre* was built in 1901 and reflects late Eclectic styles; the *Hotel Majestic* (Hotel Tbilisi) was built in 1911–14 in a neo-Renaissance style with good detailing, and the *National Bank* of Georgia is a good example of *Art Nouveau* style in the town. Finally, the *Government Palace*, built from 1938 to 1953, dominates the area of Rustaveli Avenue with its Soviet character.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The historic district of Tbilisi has legal protection under the national legislation: Decree No 141, 25.02.1975, of the Council of Ministers of Georgian SSR (Establishment of State Protection Zone of Tbilisi Historic District), Decree No 76, 29.01.1985, for the further enlargement of the State Protection Zone and perfection of protection measures. The List of Monuments of History and Culture in Tbilisi was adopted in 1976 and an additional list in 1986.

The properties were in State ownership until 1992. Since the adoption of the Law on Privatization of Dwellings, most residential buildings have been given to private ownership. Part of the buildings belong to various institutions, such as banks and commercial firms. Since 1997 a Decree of the Parliament of Georgia has prohibited privatization of listed monuments. Listed residential buildings that had not been privatized therefore remain the property of the municipality.

Management

The declared State Protection Zone secures protection of the historic area in terms of urban planning and urban fabric, landscape, as well as the possibility to reconstruct lost elements and parameters.

The Management Plan of the Urban Planning Board of Tbilisi Historic District (Municipality Architecture Services) envisages the following activities: updating the existing master plan, recording the historic quarters, preparation of projects for reconstruction, investments, building of infrastructures, launching of competitions for key areas, and design projects for individual sites.

The management of the historic district of Tbilisi is the responsibility of the Tbilisi Municipality Architecture Services and of the Urban Planning Board of the Tbilisi Historic District. The scientific supervision of conservation projects is guaranteed by the Cultural Heritage Department of Georgia.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The history of Tbilisi records a long series of successive destructions and reconstructions. The last major destruction occurred in 1795; since then the town has been rebuilt, but has suffered from further demolitions and damages, such as those during the 1991–92 war. In the current situation, the city still retains some of its medieval fabric, some ancient monuments, especially churches, and areas of residential housing of typical Tbilisian character. Unfortunately, much of the historic fabric is not in good condition, and the area is subject to pressures from development, illegal construction, air pollution, lack of experienced personnel, lack of quality equipment, and lack of funding. The town is situated in a seismic risk zone, and the Armenian earthquake of 1989 already increased the vulnerability of the historic housing stock. There are no risk preparedness programmes for cultural heritage. Furthermore, there is increasing pressure from tourism; the number of visitors was 85,000 in 1996 and over 300,000 in 1997.

Authenticity and integrity

The historic district of Tbilisi undoubtedly possesses many qualities, partly owing to its multi-cultural society, partly owing to its built fabric, characterized by the open nature of its residential quarters. These qualities have been much spoken about by writers and poets and illustrated by painters. It is also true that, despite the many destructions even in the recent past, the area is still notable for its traditional housing stock, mainly dating from the 19th and early 20th centuries.

Nevertheless, the integrity of the historic area has certainly been impaired to a considerable extent. Relatively few

structures antedating the 19th century remain and many of the existing buildings are in a poor condition.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission will be visiting Tbilisi in April 2001. In the meantime, the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH) has been consulted.

Qualities

ICOMOS notes the cultural value of Tbilisi, recognized in the different centuries, and particularly in its having provided a creative and inspiring cultural context for the development of literary and artistic works of great significance for Georgia and even the whole region.

The existing building stock, which dates from the 19th and 20th centuries, represents an integration of influences from the Orient and from European countries, which in itself certainly is of interest.

With respect to the proposed criteria, many cultural aspects are certainly valid. Nevertheless, the loss of much of the historic fabric, the rapidly deteriorating condition of the residential fabric, the increasing pressures, the difficulties met in management, and the resulting deterioration of authenticity and integrity, means that inscription of the site will meet with some difficulties. Nevertheless, ICOMOS wishes to postpone its recommendation until it has reviewed the results of the expert mission to the site.

Comparative analysis

The Tbilisian residential typology is a special one, reflecting an openness in its plan as well as details that recall the architecture of the Black Sea region, northern Iran, and Turkey. Many comparisons could thus be made with other historic towns in the region. However, the particular cultural context, characteristic to Tbilisi, gives it its own specificity, which is difficult to find elsewhere.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The ICOMOS recommendations will be formulated on the basis of the results of the expert mission to take place in April 2001.

Brief description

The historic centre of Tbilisi, the capital of Georgia, represents a long historical evolution from the Middle Ages till the present. The typology of the current fabric of the town, dating mainly from the 19th and 20th centuries, characterizes the open and multicultural society of Tbilisi.

Recommendation

Because its expert mission will not take place until after this volume is delivered to the printer, ICOMOS will defer presenting a recommendation until the meeting of the Bureau in June 2001

ICOMOS, March 2001

Acre (Israel)

No 1042

Identification

Nomination The Old City of Acre

Location Western Galilee

State Party Israel

Date 30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

During its existence, Acre has been a unique example of the symbiosis between different cultures and values. Its geographical position made it a meeting point between east and west. The fact that various cultures struggled for control over the city ensured that all parties were exposed to each other's influence.

Acre's uniqueness becomes apparent when examining the Crusader city. The Crusaders brought European building technology with them to the Holy Land whilst utilizing local materials. They built in accordance with various needs that were dictated by the city's geographical position. Their relationship with the place and the local population led to the development of the hybrid city of its period, of which no comparable example exists in Europe

Crusader Acre evolved for 200 years, reaching the peak of its importance on a world scale at the time when it was the capital city of the Crusaders, and a main entrance for many visitors to the Holy Land. Another example of the city's uniqueness may be found in the way that Crusader Acre eventually played a role in Ottoman plans for building. After the Mamelukes captured the city they attempted to bury the original city. However, during rebuilding in the 18th century, the original Crusader buildings were used as foundations for the new buildings, thus keeping the basic Crusader city plan.

Criterion ii

Acre is a living witness to the existence of two now extinct cultures – those of the Crusaders in the Holy Land and of the Ottomans. A Crusader city for pilgrims such as Acre could only exist in the Holy Land. As things developed in the region, Acre became the second most important city in the country after Jerusalem.

Since Acre was the capital of the second Crusader kingdom it offers today unique evidence of the highly particular lifestyle of the Crusaders, which lasted for a relatively short period in history before disappearing. The crux of this evidence of culture and life style is to be found in the lower level of the city in the multitude of

archaeological remains, preserved in superb condition for hundreds of years.

It is enough to walk around old Acre of today in order to get a constant sense of Ottoman culture because of the unusual degree to which its lifestyle has been preserved within the city walls and due to its geographical location. This happened despite the fact that changes in the socio-economic conditions led the wealthy classes to leave the city.

Criterion iii

Acre demonstrated settlement and utilization of available land by great masses of people by military means, for a specific religious purpose. This was not in fact settlement for its own sake but in order to provide a stepping stone on the way to Jerusalem. Thus the city was a mixture of garrison and way station. This manner of settlement as part of a historical process over a short period of time is unique.

The Crusaders created a new culture in the land which did not seek either to perpetuate its influence on local culture or to absorb the influence of local culture. Thus in a moment Crusader Acre ceased to exist as soon as it was captured by the Mamelukes and the Crusades were over. There was no continuity of the special life style that had existed until that point.

Criterion v

Acre is directly connected with a number of important historical world events, and also to the Baha'i faith.

In 1189 the Crusaders under King Guy de Lusignan laid siege to Acre in a two-year operation that went unparalleled in the tales of medieval wars of both the Christian and Muslim worlds. Salah-A-Din, Richard the Lion Heart, and Philippe II all participated in the war and Acre surrendered to the Crusader forces on 12 July 1191. Acre experienced its golden age as the capital of the second Crusader kingdom from 1191 to 1291. It stood at a junction of international routes and was a trading centre between Europe and Asia. In 1291 the city was finally captured by the Moslems and systematically destroyed on the orders of Sultan El Ashraf.

In 1799 Acre became world-famous owing to the failure of Napoleon's army to capture the city after laying siege to it for a long time. The city's defenders, with the active aid of the English, managed to repel the French forces, forcing them to withdraw. "Tel Akko," previously called "King Richard Hill," was renamed "Tel Napoleon." The failure of the siege of Acre marked a turning point in Napoleon's career.

In 1868 the Baha'ullah arrived in Acre as a prisoner of the Ottoman Empire. He spent the remaining 24 years of his life in the city, first imprisoned in the city's fortress and later kept under house arrest in a small building in the alleyways of the old city. During his sojourn in Acre, the Baha'ullah wrote his most important work, setting out the laws and precepts to be observed by Baha'i adherents. He was freed towards the end of 1870 and went to live on a nearby estate outside the walls of the city. He died in 1892, his remains were buried on the estate, and to this day his tomb is the holiest shrine of the Baha'i.

During the British mandate in Palestine nine freedom fighters from the resistance were executed in the Gallows Room, part of the British prison occupying the citadel.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Ancient Acre was situated on Tel Akko (or Tel El Fukhar), about 2.5km to the east of the location of the old city. Settlement at the tell appears to have begun during the Early Bronze Age (c 3000 BCE). Around 1900 BCE the town was fortified by a high earthen rampart with a brick gateway facing the direction of the sea.

Acre was founded on the peninsula during the Hellenistic period (3rd–2nd centuries BCE) and named Ptolemaeus after the name of its founder, Ptolemy II of Egypt. There are still traces of fortifications, a wall, and tower from this period. Acre was a centre for international trade because of its strategic position and its natural port.

The city fell to the Roman conquest of the land of Israel and in the 1st century CE it was granted the status of *colonia*. The first Christian pilgrims passed through Acre on their way to Jerusalem. In 330, during the Byzantine period, the land of Israel passed into the control of the Eastern Roman Empire. This was a time of economic and demographic expansion, when hundreds of churches and monasteries were established all over the Holy Land. The larger cities expanded and were encircled by new fortification systems; Acre retained its status as the principal port of the land of Israel.

During the early Arab period (638–1099), many of the country's cities were abandoned and destroyed. Acre decreased in importance as an international port and the city limits were reduced to include several quarters around the port, where a Moslem naval fleet was stationed. Acre began its economic recovery during the 10th and 11th centuries and the port and city walls were rebuilt.

The Crusader period began for Acre in 1104, some five years after the fall of Jerusalem. Baldwin I, King of Jerusalem, and the Genoese commercial fleet cooperated in laying siege to Acre from land and sea until the city fell to the Crusaders. A new and special model of settlement evolved, characterized by defined and autonomous quarters. The king settled in the northern part of the city, where he built a fortified palace.

Genoese, Venetian, and Pisan merchants built autonomous quarters nearby the port. The military orders installed themselves nearby – the Hospitallers in the north of the city to the west of the palace, the Templars in the south-west of the city, and the German Knights close to the eastern wall of the wall. Other important quarters included those of the Patriarch (in which the Church of the Holy Cross, Acre's main cathedral, was built), the French merchants (the Provençal quarter), and the English merchants. Moslem and Jewish merchants also settled in the city.

Many public buildings were erected – fortified buildings, churches, bathhouses, bakeries, courts and hostels for pilgrims and merchants, covered markets – and also private

dwellings. During the two centuries of Crusader rule Acre developed into a wealthy and thriving trading city. It symbolized the interchange between the eastern and western cultures better than any other city.

In 1187, after the debacle at Hattin and the destruction of the Crusader army, the Moslems captured the whole of the land of Israel and Acre was held for four years. It was not until 1191 that the Third Crusade led by Richard the Lion Heart led to the recapture of Acre and the shores of northern Israel. A second Crusader kingdom was established with Acre as its capital, since the Crusaders were not able to retake Jerusalem.

From 1191 to 1291 the second Crusader Kingdom expanded its borders. New neighbourhoods such as Monmizar to the north were built and Acre was given a new double city wall. More palaces, churches, and public buildings were erected, at a time when styles in the west were changing from Romanesque to Gothic. This change in style was put into practice in Acre and recent excavations have revealed buildings that reflect the transition between styles and the initial establishment of the Gothic style in the 13th century.

The Mameluke period (named after the Moslem rulers of Egypt) began in 1291 with the conquest of Acre and continued until 1517. The city was destroyed and totally abandoned, with only a few buildings remaining around the port.

During the Ottoman period (1517–1917) Acre was described by pilgrims and merchants who visited it in the 16th and 17th centuries as a deserted ghost town, with some structures from the Crusader period still standing, some jutting out of the earth, and others buried. Reconstruction did not begin until the middle of the 18th century, under Daher El Amar, who renewed the port, manned it with officials and merchants, built a palace for himself, and rebuilt the fortifications.

The building of Ottoman Acre in the 18th and 19th centuries buried the remains of the Crusader city, thereby preserving the Crusader remains. In 1799 Acre attained world fame after Napoleon failed to capture the city, under the command of its Turkish ruler Ahmed El Jazar, after a long siege.

Acre enjoyed renewed economic expansion in the 19th century. Mosques, bathhouses, and caravanserai were built. Wealthy merchants settled there, building grand mansions in the eastern Neo-Classical style of the end of the 19th century.

In 1868 Baha'ullah, founder of the Baha'i faith, arrived in Acre as a prisoner of the Ottoman Empire. He spent the remaining 24 years of his life in the city, first imprisoned in the city's fortress and later under house arrest in a small building in the alleyways of the old city. During his sojourn in Acre, the Baha'ullah wrote his most important work, setting out the laws and precepts to be observed by Baha'i adherents. The Baha'ullah was freed towards the end of 1870 and went to live on a nearby estate outside the walls of the city. He died in 1892, his remains were buried on the estate, and to this day his tomb is the holiest shrine of the Baha'i.

After capturing Acre in 1918 and being given control of Palestine by mandate of the League of Nations, the British

used the fortress as a prison. Several leading Jewish settlers were imprisoned there, and hangings also took place. The British developed the city outside the boundaries of the walls, constructing dwellings and administrative buildings. However, they did nothing to alter the fabric of life within the walls of the old city. The port fell into disuse as the nearby modern port of Haifa superseded it.

During Israel's war of independence the Jews captured Acre on 16 May 1948. At first only a few Moslem residents remained in the old city, but after the fighting had died down many Palestinian Arab refugees from other places began to arrive and settle in the old city, whilst many Jews settled in the new sections. At the present time the five thousand inhabitants of the walled city are exclusively Arab and some 80% are migrants from other parts of Israel.

Description

The built city comprises two levels:

The Crusader city, mainly subterranean remains, partly revealed and in a very good state of preservation – wall, quarters (Hospitaller, Genoese, Pisan, Venetian, *Burgus Novos*, etc), open and covered streets, monuments, drainage tunnels, systems of hideaway passages, shops, and dwellings.

The Ottoman city, built over the ruins of the Crusader city, using the earlier structures as foundations and thereby helping in the preservation of the remains of the Crusader city and its outline. The Ottoman city is characterized by its narrow alleyways, monuments, and inhabited dwellings with inner courtyards.

The *system of fortifications* comprises the city walls, gates, towers, and moat. The walls were built in stages between 1750 and 1840. They include the ruins of the Daher-El-Umar's wall (built 1750–51) and its Lion Gate, the El-Jazar wall, and the city gates (the Landward Gate, built by El Jazar, the Seaward Gate, and two entrances in the northern walls opened in 1910).

Two elements of the *water-supply system* survive: the remains of the water aqueduct, built by either Dahar El Umar or El Jazar, which brought water from the Kabri fountain to the city and supplied it to the bathhouses and the public fountain, and a reservoir constructed of five Ottoman barrel vaults.

There are several noteworthy *tombs of sheikhs and cemeteries*, including the Nebi Tzalah Tomb in the cemetery near the eastern wall, the Sheikh Yanis Tomb inside a room in a southern wall of the Jabhanee opposite to the Jazar mosque, the Sheikh Ana'am Tomb built in 1807–08 by Suliman Pecha, the Sheikh Az A-Dean Tomb north of the wall by the sea (traditionally considered to be the tomb of Dahar El-Amar), and three cemeteries – the Muzoleom, a cemetery behind Hann-Shuni, and the cemetery of St George's Church.

Acre has four historic *churches*: St John's Church, built in 1737 by the Franciscans, probably on top of the Crusader St Andrew's Church and now used by the Roman Catholic community; the Maronite Church; St Andrew's Church, apparently built on top of the Crusader St Anne's Church and now used by the Greek Catholic Church; and St

George's Church, one of the most ancient in Acre and referred to in 17th century pilgrims' description as St Nicolas's Church (it is constructed on Crusader cross-vaults, which matches the description of St Lawrence's Church).

There are eight *mosques* within the nominated old city of Acre. The El-Jazar mosque, built in 1781 by El-Jazar, on the remains of the Holy Cross Cathedral, is one of the most important mosques in the country. It comprises religious institutions and a famous library. El-Jazar, Suliman Pecha, and their families are buried in the courtyard. The El-Zaituna mosque was built in 1745 by Husain Abed Elhadi. What are believed to be remains of the Hospitallers' Church are incorporated in its structure. The Snan-Basha mosque was built in 1806–7 by Suliman Pecha above the remains of the mosque built by Snan-Basha in the 16th century. The Elmualic mosque was originally a synagogue of the Jewish community in Acre and was converted into a mosque by Dahar El-Amar in 1746. Like most of the mosques in Acre it overlies Crusader remnants: this is also the case of the A-Ramal (1704) and A-Magdala (1710) mosques. The Shazalia mosque was built in 1862 by the Sheikh Ali Nur A-Dean El-Yasruti, founder of the Shazalia cult, whose body and those of his family are buried nearby. Also of importance is the El Burg' mosque, located near the wall at the Lion Gate.

Other fine examples of Moslem architecture in Acre are two *bathhouses*: the large Hammam El-Basha built by El-Jazar in the 18th century, apparently on top of an ancient bathhouse, and the small Hammam built by Dahar El-Amar in the 18th century and in continuous use until the 1940s.

Among the historic *khans* (caravanserai) are Khan El Umdan, built in 1784 by El-Jazar; Khan El-Farang', built in the 16th century by French merchants in the central courtyard of the Crusader-period Venetian quarter; Khan A-Shauardee, built in the 18th century by Dahar El-Amar; Burg' El-Sultan, a Crusader tower, reconstructed for use by the Mamelukes and later incorporated into the khan; the Donkeys Khan, built in 1810 and ruined by an explosion at an ammunition depot; and Khan A-Shune, built in the period of Dahar El-Amar over the remains of the Pisan quarter.

Two *Baha'i holy sites* are also in the area of the old city nominated for inscription: the Jabotinsky Tower and the Abud House.

There are two *markets*: the Turkish Bazaar (El-Jazar Market) and Shuk El-Abyad (the White Market), built by Dahar El-Amar and reconstructed in 1817 by Suliman Pecha after a fire.

The main *Government Building* is the Citadel, which was the Ottoman governors' palace and a prison during the British Mandate. It was built over the citadel of the Hospitallers, which includes the Knights' Halls, the Grand Munier, the Crypt, the "Beautiful Hall," and the courtyard. The Seraya is thought to have functioned as a courthouse during the Ottoman period

The urban structure of contemporary Acre is based on the following fundamental factors:

- Acre's geographical position on a natural bay was a significant reason for its development as a port. Being located on a peninsula with its limits defined by its walls

and by the sea that defined its boundaries dictated the need for dense building, a characteristic feature of medieval cities.

- The Crusader city was built in clearly defined quarters.
- The Ottoman city blended with the Crusader remains, using them as foundations. It is characterized by its layout of blocks and buildings set around inner yards.

At first glance, Acre's winding streets and blocks of buildings appear to have grown in an unplanned way: it is difficult to perceive any particular order according to which the city might have been arranged. It was, however, carefully laid out: it is arranged around two complementary hierarchies, the hierarchy of areas of transit and the hierarchy of built areas and blocks of buildings.

The built areas consist of quarters, blocks of buildings, individual buildings, and apartments. Apartment dwellings form blocks set around inner courtyards, the blocks forming larger blocks and quarters.

The boundary of every built component of the city is defined by some kind of wall.

- At city level by fortified walls that surround the old city in its entirety, detaching it and cutting it off from anything outside.
- At block level by uninterrupted stone fascias at ground level which constitute a "wall."
- At larger block level by the formation of inner courtyards.

The urban characteristic of Acre is one of looking inwards and containment, reflecting the role of the home in traditional Moslem society. The fascias of buildings serve to separate the home from the street, thereby protecting the inhabitants. Upper floors were built on at a later stage and clearly reflect western influence, with less closure and containment, reflected in large picture windows and balconies.

The areas of transit are also arranged according to hierarchy, following the same hierarchic principle as in built areas – division and gradual passage:

- Main thoroughfares running between the city churches and public centres and the perimeter route running parallel to the city walls.
- Alleyways leading from the main thoroughfares into the built-up masses of dwellings and circular alleyways that encompass the blocks.
- Secondary cul-de-sac alleyways that run into the blocks, usually as far as the inner courtyards and sometimes connecting with another thoroughfare.

The large blocks are set around inner courtyards, giving the impression from outside that they are built very densely and closed. Within, the courtyards form intimate empty spaces that allow access to fresh air and sunlight. Inner courtyards are found in a number of styles: at ground level, open to the sky; at ground level, but covered; set on roofs. They fulfil a number of roles: they may serve a single apartment or dwelling, they may serve as nuclei for a number of buildings grouped together into a block, or they may be located between blocks. The courtyards are part of

the typological and morphological characteristics of the city's construction.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The old city of Acre is designated an antiquity site under the provisions of the 1978 Antiquities Law. Article 29.a prohibits any of the following activities without the written approval of the Director of the Israel Antiquities Authority:

- building, paving, the erection of installations, quarrying, mining, drilling, flooding, the clearing away of stones, ploughing, planting, or interment;
- the dumping of earth, manure, waste, or refuse, including the dumping thereof on adjoining property;
- any alteration, repair or addition to an antiquity located on the site;
- the dismantling of an antiquity, the removal of part thereof or the shifting thereof;
- writing, carving, or painting;
- the erection of buildings or walls on adjoining property;
- any other operation designated by the Director in respect of a particular site.

Management

Ownership of the property is divided between three main owners: the Israeli Land Administration (80%), the Muslim *Wakf* and the Christian Churches (15%), and private ownership (5%).

Following the establishment of the Old Acre Development Co Ltd (OADC) in 1983, a steering committee for urban planning drew up a new Master Plan for the old city of Acre for the years 1993–2000. The plan takes into account the international heritage of Acre, and takes account of the requirements of the Building and Urban Planning Law while considering the possibility of turning the city into a tourist attraction.

The main provisions are:

- Preservation of the special character of the old city of Acre – cultural, architectural, and aesthetic values.
- Preservation of the physical fabric whilst adapting to the modern quality of life.
- Provision of a solution to the inhabitants in the fields of residential accommodation, environment, community services, infrastructure, employment, and involvement in the process of developing whilst involving the public in the planning process.
- The development of tourism as a principal economic activity in Acre, Western Galilee, and throughout the State of Israel.
- Determining the permissible type of usage for each plot of land and building.
- Determining priorities and the distribution of resources.

- Provision of general planning whilst providing solutions to suitable specific programmes at the planning and execution stage.

- Provision of a solution for the planning framework of urban systems: ie transportation, infrastructures, sign posting, maintenance, management and preservation of the environment.

Preparation of the Plan involved a number of studies and surveys. These included a condition survey of the buildings, the development of a traffic plan, a study of the morphology of residential houses, a survey of potential tourist needs, and a survey of infrastructure of services (water, electricity, etc). As a result, areas in need of urgent intervention and priorities were identified.

The agencies with management authority under the terms of the Master Plan are the Acre Municipality, the OADC, the Israel Antiquities Authority (and its Conservation Department), and the Israel Land Administration (National Housing Authority). Site management is the responsibility of the OADC, a wholly state-owned professional body with expertise in management economics and marketing, and it is the OADC which coordinates the activities of the other partners. The Conservation Department of the Israel Antiquities Authority, which has a staff of conservation architects, engineers, archaeologists, and specialized conservators, is responsible for all conservation work.

Monitoring and control activities carried out under the plan are:

- Municipal inspection for enforcing the Building and Urban Planning Law;
- Archaeological inspection under the Antiquities Law (article 29.a);
- Conservation inspection;
- A Conservation Steering Committee composed of representatives of the following bodies: Conservation Department of the Israeli Antiquities Authority, the District Engineer, the Old Acre Development Company Ltd, the National Housing Authority, the Master Plan architect, the District Architect of the Israeli Land Administration, and a representative of the local community.
- A municipal tourist police.

Regular monitoring of the buildings in the old city is shared between the Municipality, the National Housing Authority, and the Conservation Department of the Israel Antiquities Authority, all of which are represented by inspectors on site.

ICOMOS considers that this plan and its implementation fulfil the requirements regarding management planning laid down in paragraph 24.b.ii of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

A programmed approach to the conservation of the old city of Acre began in the 1990s. The first buildings survey had

been carried out during the British Mandate. An extensive survey was made in 1962, and this served as the basis for the first master plan. From 1993 onwards there was a series of surveys of individual buildings, monuments, and blocks, and these have resulted in a number of technical manuals designed to provide architects, engineers, institutions, and private individuals with field solutions relating to specific aspects of the conservation and restoration of buildings. Restoration and conservation work on many of the major buildings are accompanied by scientific excavations, which are revealing many facets of the Crusader city.

At the present time the residential areas of the old city show little outward sign of the conservation effort over the past eight years. The facades of many of the buildings are in poor condition and there is substantial evidence of the use of inappropriate materials. The surfaces of many of the smaller streets and open spaces are poorly maintained. There is a profusion of cables and other infrastructural elements on the facades and pavements everywhere.

This appearance is, however, slightly misleading. The initial surveys showed that a large proportion of the housing stock was seriously decayed, to an extent that buildings were at risk and consolidation was urgently needed. This interior structural work has now been completed, as has the provision of underground conduits for electricity, telephone, and other services.

For the next stage of conservation and rehabilitation, a pilot project in a largely traditional residential area was selected. Work is in progress on this neighbourhood, adopting an overall approach rather than a piecemeal one directed to individual structures.

Excavation of the Crusader city beneath the Ottoman city is proceeding steadily. A number of innovative civil engineering solutions have been developed to stabilize cleared areas and permit exploration to continue.

Authenticity and integrity

Two periods in history have contributed to the appearance of contemporary Acre: the Crusader period and the Ottoman period. The special nature of the city's evolution has led to the preservation of its authenticity and the principal values of each of the two periods and of the city in general.

Crusader Acre is today mostly subterranean and has only begun to be uncovered recently. The well preserved remains include large portions of the fabric of urban life and buildings with all parts intact – walls, quarters, streets, alleys, fortresses, public buildings, religious buildings, dwellings, and shops, together with the subterranean infrastructure, architectural details, original plasterwork, and masonry. Building plans are clearly identifiable and building technology and materials can be accurately determined.

The Ottoman city was built on the Crusader city and took the form of an urban system of alleyways, courtyards, and squares, reflecting the values of Moslem society. The geographical conditions that determined its development, together with its socio-economic structure, maintained the integrity of Acre as essentially an Ottoman city, without significant changes in the 19th and 20th centuries.

Acre has retained its character as a port city, with a blend of public buildings, caravanserais (*khans*), and religious buildings alongside markets, small shops, and large residential quarters, together with an active port which is still a source of income and access to the city. The major proportion of Acre's individual buildings have remained largely in the same form as when they were built, with few alterations over the last 150–300 years. Ottoman Acre exists in an architectural/social bubble reflecting the meeting between east and west.

It may therefore be concluded that Acre fulfils all the criteria regarding integrity and reliability of information sources as expressed in the Nara Document and as required by paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

A ICOMOS expert mission visited Acre in February 2001. A evaluation of the "outstanding universal value" of the nominated property was provided by the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH).

Qualities

Acre is a well preserved example of a walled city of special historical interest. It was of major significance during the Crusader period in the Holy Land, first as its principal port and later as the capital of the second Kingdom of Jerusalem for a century. Following a long period of decline, during which it was still the main entry port for Christian pilgrims visiting Jerusalem, it flourished again in the 18th century as the capital of this part of the Ottoman Empire. Its historical trajectory gives it a unique character, in that the substantial remains of the Crusader city are preserved virtually intact beneath the typical Moslem city of the present day, and have in recent years been revealed by scientific excavation.

Comparative analysis

There are three similar Mediterranean towns with which Acre may justifiably be compared: Rhodes in Greece (already on the World Heritage List), Famagusta (Magussa) in Cyprus, and Sidon in Lebanon. All three towns have long histories, and the relevant periods for comparison are from the Crusader period onwards.

Rhodes was founded after the expulsion of the Crusaders from the Holy Land and was exclusively a city of the Order of St John (Hospitallers). By contrast, Acre was founded during one of the peaks of the Crusader period, it became the capital of the kingdom, and its inhabitants represented the full range of Crusader orders, reflecting the history of the Crusades in the Holy Land.

Contemporary Rhodes is more like a medieval European city than Acre, which is in its present form an Ottoman city. It has also not undergone major restoration projects in the 20th century.

After the capture and partial destruction of Acre, Famagusta inherited its position as the main trading port in the region, although it never attained either Acre's significance or the rate of development that it underwent at its peak. Famagusta essentially represents a city built during the process of withdrawal of the Crusaders.

Furthermore, it did not form part of the itinerary of pilgrimages to the Holy Land. At first glance Famagusta seems similar to Acre: it is an example of a walled Ottoman port city that has undergone some changes. The essential difference between the two is that the Crusader city of Famagusta is not preserved in its entirety beneath the Ottoman city: it has instead been blended with Ottoman structures.

Sidon was also an important port city during the Crusader era, but it was one of many port cities whereas Acre was the capital. There is also far less evidence of the Crusader City in Sidon than in Acre.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

There is no buffer zone to provide protection of the setting of the old city of Acre defined in the plans provided with the nomination dossier, as required by the World Heritage Committee. This must be defined and appropriate regulations enacted before the property can be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The most serious problem confronting those responsible for the conservation and maintenance of the old city is a social one. There is an almost total absence of pride of place. Few of the present-day inhabitants have any family ties with the city and so there is a lack of identification with it. Furthermore, many of the inhabitants are unemployed or poorly remunerated and so cannot afford to live elsewhere. If and when their personal fortunes change, they will immediately seek housing outside the walled city. As a result, they do not feel themselves under obligation to respect the appearance of what is to them no more than a transitory place of residence.

The task that confronts the managers of Old Acre is therefore fundamentally one of education, so as to demonstrate to the inhabitants that they live in a city with a long history and a rich heritage. The efforts already made over the past two to three years, since it became known that Acre appeared on the tentative list of Israel, need to be maintained and intensified. The educational programme should be accompanied by an intensified social programme aimed at improving the quality of life of the inhabitants of Acre.

Brief description

The townscape of the walled port city of Acre is characteristic of Moslem perceptions of urban design, with narrow winding streets and fine public buildings and houses. Beneath it lies almost intact the remains of its predecessor, the Crusader city, which is being revealed by archaeological excavation.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the definition and regulatory protection of an appropriate buffer zone. The State Party should also supply information regarding existing and proposed educational and social projects relating to heritage protection and conservation. In the event that this information is provided by the State Party, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and v*:

Acre is exceptional in that beneath its present-day appearance as a typical Moslem fortified city lie the remains of an almost intact medieval city on the European model. It bears exceptional material testimony to the Crusader kingdom established in the Holy Land in the 12th–14th centuries, and also to the Ottoman Empire in the 18th and 19th centuries.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Noto (Italy)

No 1024

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Noto and late Baroque architecture in south-eastern Sicily
<i>Location</i>	Provinces of Catania, Ragusa, and Syracuse, Sicily
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	22 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The historic centres and urban environments of the towns proposed for inscription are a masterpiece of the human creative genius of the late Baroque epoch.

Criterion i

The historic centres and urban environments of the towns proposed for inscription reveal a remarkable and unique exchange of human values accomplished in the collective effort to reconstruct the towns after the 1693 earthquake. The social classes of that period (clergy, aristocracy, and the new urban middle classes) together with the Spanish government, architects, and craftsmen, co-operated in the recreation of entire urban realities.

Criterion ii

The historic centres and urban sites proposed for inscription bear witness to cultural traditions that have disappeared elsewhere: eg the design abilities and the innovative approach typical of the post-1693 era, in which major and minor art forms intertwine into a peculiar unity, and the exceptional skills of workmen in using local stone.

Criterion iii

The historic centres and urban sites proposed for inscription are instances of great importance for the high concentration of monumental late Baroque buildings of outstanding architectural and decorative value: eg the plans and layouts of religious buildings and facades with bell-towers. Facades as urban monuments peak with San Domenico in Noto, San Giorgio in Ragusa Ibla, and San Giorgi' in Modica.

Criterion iv

The historic centres and urban sites proposed for inscription are vulnerable because of their location in an area of high seismic risk and because of the poor state of much of the stonework, especially the limestone. In addition, Catania is at risk from volcanic eruption.

Criterion v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this nomination consists of eight separate *groups of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Some of the nominated towns (Caltagirone, Mitello) were of pre-medieval origin, and all were in existence in medieval times, characteristically around a castle and with monastic foundations. Most seem to have been changing during the 16th and 17th centuries and then been affected differentially by the 1693 earthquake, which resulted in some 93,000 casualties. Catania, for example, was destroyed, as was Noto on top of Mount Alveria, whereas Mitello was partially destroyed and Ragusa seriously damaged. Reactions to the earthquake also differed, ranging from Catania's complete rebuild on the same site, through Mitello's partial abandonment and Ragusa's combination of new and old, to Noto's complete rebuild on a new site. All the towns saw considerable building activity through the 18th century, notably of churches, large public buildings, and *palazzi*. Another serious earthquake in 1990 affected some parts of some towns, Ragusa in particular. The nomination is almost entirely based on 18th century urban art and architecture and says nothing about urban economy or urban/rural relationships.

Description

The territory of south-eastern Sicily, once the territory of the ancient province of Val di Noto, contains an exceptional homogeneity and quality of urban centres within it. They are characterized by a large number of late Baroque buildings and monuments, all built after earthquakes on 9 and 11 January 1693, which seriously damaged about sixty towns in that territory. The seismic area, which had its epicentre in the Valley of Noto, stretched from Calabria to Malta to the northern African coast.

Most of the towns in south-eastern Sicily were rebuilt on the original site (eg Catania). Some, such as Noto, were rebuilt on new sites. Others, like Ragusa and Palazzolo Acreide, were "doubled up," with new urban centres created next to the ancient ones. Yet others either moved to adjoining areas that were already partially urbanized (eg Scicli and Modica) or were simply repaired (eg Caltagirone).

The rebuilding of the Val di Noto was a chance for an enormous artistic, architectural, and anti-seismic renewal of the cities, medieval in their styles until 1693. The architecture and "modern" town-planning of south-eastern Sicily became the first specific response to seismic disaster, carried out by a host of people ranging from famous architects like Rosario Gagliardi and Giovan Battista Vaccarini to many inspired artists and thousands of skilled but anonymous craftsmen. Strongly influenced by external Baroque fashions, the "Sicilian style," including not least its characteristic tower in facades, developed to become itself influential, its achievement possible because of a strong economic interplay of different social groups in the aftermath of disaster. Enormous state intervention and great

organizing ability seem to have been the two conditions that achieved such an original and impressive solution, seizing the chance to turn such a disaster into an opportunity. Two hundred years later, as a result of long-term degradation and further seismic activity, there are still a great many buildings and monumental complexes which require major restoration, consolidation, and maintenance interventions.

The eight separate inner cities and urban areas proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List should be considered as representative of a great, post-seismic rebuilding achievement in the decades following 1693.

CALTAGIRONE: the most westerly of the eight cities nominated, its inner city is significant for its multi-faceted town planning and architectural facades, and for its unusual link between the pre- and post-1693 periods. Its rich architecture exists inside an urban context resulting from the configuration of the site. The most important buildings include the Churches of Santa Maria del Monte, St James the Apostle, St Joseph, St Dominic, the Holy Saviour (and Monastery of the Benedictine Sisters), St Chiara and St Rita (and Monastery of the Poor Clares), Jesus (and former College of the Jesuits), St Stephen, and St Francis of Assisi and, among secular buildings, the Corte Capitanale, the Civic Museum, the former Pawnshop, and the San Francesco Bridge.

MILITELLO VAL DI CATANIA is significant for its wealth of architecture from the 14th century onwards, and for the outstanding 17th century, walled pre-earthquake town plan which was in the vanguard of Sicilian feudal towns and was then faithfully followed in the late Baroque reconstruction. Principal buildings include the Churches of San Nicolò and Santa Maria della Stella, the latter completed in 1741 on the site of St Anthony the Abbot, and the former in the San Leonardo area.

CATANIA acquired a particular quality of urban design when it was rebuilt on a comprehensive, geometric unitary plan among the rubble of the destroyed city. At its core are the outstanding Piazza del Duomo and the Via dei Crociferi, together with the nearby Badia de Sant'Agata, the Collegiata, Benedictine Monastery, and Palazzo Biscari.

MODICA consists of two urban centres, the older perched on the rocky top of the southern Ibeli hill, the other rebuilt further downhill after the 1693 earthquake with imposing and conspicuous urban monuments such as the Cathedral of St George and the Church of St. Peter.

NOTO, outstanding among the towns that were totally rebuilt on a site close to the original town, is on two levels, an upper part on the plateau and a lower, newer part on the slope below. The latter accommodates the buildings of the nobility and the religious complexes of the 18th century, the topography, town-plan, and architecture combining to create a spectacular "Baroque stage set." It includes nine religious complexes and numerous *palazzi*.

PALAZZOLO, like Modica, has two centres, the medieval one on which a new town was reconstructed on the old site but along a new axis, and a post-1693 "new town" which was developed along a crescent up to

the earliest site of all, the Greek *Akrai*. The two churches of St Sebastian and Sts Peter and Paul were largely rebuilt after 1693, the latter the centre of the old nobility, the former marking the quarter of the new urban classes.

RAGUSA, the ancient *Ibla*, is built over three hills separated by a deep valley. It, too, consists of two centres, one rebuilt on the old medieval layout and the other, Upper (present-day) Ragusa, newly built after 1693. It contains nine major churches and seven major *palazzi*, all Baroque. Upper Ragusa has been adversely affected by inappropriate modern development and the town overall is adversely affected by the proximity of chemical, industrial, and mining activities.

SCICLI: the via Francesco Mormina Penna stretches to the nearby Beneventano palace, perhaps the only one in Sicily to display fantastic decoration, in an urban setting where churches rise alongside patrician buildings of late Baroque age. Three churches (St John the Evangelist, St Michael, and Saint Teresa) are of the 18th century.

The whole area is a Level 2 seismic risk area (the most recent earthquake was in 1990) with an expected intensity of *c* 4.5 on the Richter scale. Caltagirone and Noto could also be subject to post-seismic landslides and Catania could be affected by volcanic eruption from Mount Etna. All of the towns in the nomination have Civil Protection Plans identifying main evacuation routes in the event of disaster.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The majority of the properties in all eight of the towns are in private ownership. The religious buildings open to worship are mostly owned by the Diocesan Curias; some are owned by the Italian State through its Ministry for Internal Affairs. Most of the monumental buildings of architectural value are owned by the local authorities. All such are public bodies, and the assets for which they are responsible are considered as public property.

Management

The main protection and conservation measures are provided by the national and regional legislation for the protection of the artistic, monumental, landscape, natural, seismic, hydrogeological and forestry heritage, in particular by Acts 1089/39, 1497/39, 64/74, 431/85, and Regional Acts 61/81 and 15/91. Within the bureaucratic infrastructure for implementing these provisions, the various Sicilian sections of the *Soprintendenze ai Beni Architettonici e Ambientali* report directly to the Regional Department for Cultural Heritage. Because of the seismic factor, the Civil Engineers Office plays an important role in monitoring the safety of buildings and therefore in the maintenance of fabric; it reports direct to the Regional Public Works Department.

The Regional Provinces of Catania, Ragusa, and Syracuse and the Municipalities of the eight towns in the nomination have the responsibility for looking after the urban and architectural heritage in their respective territories. In the case of religious buildings and their artistic contents, responsibility rests with the four Diocesan Curias, any one of which may approach any one or more of five different agencies from state to municipal level in the event of works being required.

The eight towns in the nomination come under the various regional plans, exemplified by that for Regional Economic and Social Development, within which are "Implementation Projects" such as those for Tourism and Cultural Heritage. Regional Guidelines on Landscape Planning identify, *inter alia*, four "strategic intervention axes directly involving the protection and enhancement of the landscape and environment," which include conservation and qualification of the heritage of historic, archaeological, artistic, cultural, and documentary interest. The eight towns are identified in the respective town plans as Homogeneous Territorial Zones or Historic Centres, where the existing urban and architectural heritage can be submitted only to rehabilitation and maintenance works in full respect for the historic and cultural vocation of each town. Ragusa has its own Five-Year Plan.

Conservation is funded annually in the normal way as part of the regional, provincial, and municipal budgets. Ragusa and Ibla enjoy special Regional funding. Lit 2849,000,000,000 was made available for public buildings of architectural importance immediately after the earthquake of 13 December 1990, and is still the main source of special funding. Lit 970,000,000,000 was additionally made available for privately owned historic buildings.

There is in fact no management plan in the nomination, though a document with that title is included. This is, however, concerned only with the future. It stresses the considerable difficulties involved in attaining agreement on any sort of management uniformity in eight different, quite widely spaced, and diverse municipalities over a large area involving different agencies in an administrative hierarchy. It nevertheless lays out the steps by which such a plan could be achieved, and lists thirteen goals concerning further research, database development, anti-seismic measures, monitoring, programme integration, private sector partnership, fund-raising including tapping European sources, local community regeneration, and improving access.

It identifies the need for a Supervisory and Monitoring Committee to carry out, supervise, and update the Plan. This Committee is envisaged as consisting of representatives of the parties to a Programme Agreement (the municipalities, the relevant *Soprintendenza*, and the Region of Sicily). The Church will also have to be involved. A Standing Committee already exists to cover the period of the nomination.

It is envisaged that the final draft of the Plan will be submitted for public consultation, one aim of which will be to raise awareness about the importance of inscription on the World Heritage List and the size of the commitment that the local communities have to take on to ensure the conservation and management of this heritage (in an area, ICOMOS notes, which according to EC economic indicators is one of the poorest in Europe). The existing and continuing "burden represented by the management and maintenance of (generally large) buildings which have lost their original functions" is quite properly emphasized; integrated planning which sees such buildings acquiring new functions is posited as the answer. The general tone of the document is realistically optimistic.

Over 2 million visitors came to the area in 1999 but the nomination does not regard them as in any way threatening the historic, artistic, architectural, or environmental heritage, or the traditional life-style of the residents.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The conservation history of all eight nominated towns is simply summarized as long-term maintenance battling with long-term degradation and punctuated by earthquake disasters (plus volcanic eruptions in the case of Catania) in a permanent regime of seismic potential.

Authenticity and integrity

In artistic, architectural, and aesthetic terms, authenticity and integrity are high, both in original quality and survival. Additional quality and interest, again in both authenticity and integrity, are provided by the almost complete survival, with little inappropriate intrusion, of town plans expressing a variety of reactions to a single, disastrous event in 1693.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the nominated towns in January 2001. ICOMOS also received comments from its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH).

Qualities

The towns offer a plethora of late Baroque art and architecture of high quality and of a remarkable homogeneity as a result of the circumstances of time, place, and social context in which they were created. Their current contexts vary between considerable urban extents in basically untouched 18th century streetscapes to the largest place, Catania, where the geometry of the 1690s town plan and the grandeur of the buildings exist in the bustle and traffic of a busy modern city. Overall is the evidence of slow decay in the stonework and, inevitably in a well recorded earthquake zone, an awareness of further potential disaster. Catania could also be affected by volcanic eruption.

Comparative analysis

For the Baroque age in Europe, there is no other urban and architectural phenomenon of comparable interest. Its context in post-earthquake reconstruction adds to that interest.

A similar reconstruction effort was simultaneously carried out in Malta, though the 1693 earthquake there was less destructive. The ancient centre of Mdina was rebuilt, like Catania, on the same site, whereas Valletta, of more modern construction, was less affected. Overall, Malta confirms certain Sicilian traits as representing a Mediterranean reaction to earthquake disaster in the Baroque period, but the Maltese reconstruction phenomenon is much smaller and produced fewer and more easily managed monuments.

The 1755 Lisbon earthquake destroyed that city, with 30,000 casualties. Its main relevance to Sicily is not so much in architecture as art as in architecture as structural engineering. Pioneer research into anti-seismic construction was undertaken in Sicily after 1693 and the first anti-seismic regulations were built into the Sicilian reconstruction, notably at Catania It was this aspect which was taken forward in a systematic way by the Portuguese in the second half of the 18th century.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

ICOMOS notes that the eight nominated towns are a careful selection from many more towns affected by the 1693 earthquake. Nevertheless, it wonders if it would not be possible to express the glory of the local late Baroque and the universal value of the phenomenon of post-seismic urbanism that are at the core of this nomination in other ways – namely, by an even greater level of selection.

The inclusion of the *setting* of one or more towns would add to the validity of a future nomination. A thematic study of urban Baroque, perhaps even post-earthquake rebuilding, could help place south-eastern Sicily in context.

If inscribed on the World Heritage List, the property would bring with it four long-standing challenges to management:

- i. it is in an economically poor area;
- ii. it is in an area with a high potential for natural disaster, notably earthquakes;
- iii. all the historic buildings require long-term maintenance and many, because of the material of their construction, are in a poor state of conservation;
- iv. the organizational and bureaucratic complexity in managing as a World Heritage Site a property consisting of parts of eight towns dispersed over an extensive area.

Such factors need to be taken into account in considering in advance the management of this potential World Heritage Site. During the ICOMOS mission, discussions with all relevant authorities, and a draft document, about such management, mark important steps towards a Management Plan. ICOMOS recommends that, building on these developments and following reconsideration and reformulation of the nomination, an appropriate Management Plan be included with a renewed nomination.

Brief description

The eight nominated towns in south-east Sicily were all rebuilt after 1693 on or beside towns in existence at the time of the earthquake in that year. They represent a considerable collective undertaking, successfully carried out at a high level of architectural and artistic achievement, broadly within the late Baroque style of the day but with distinctive innovations in town planning and urban building.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*, inviting the State Party to reconsider the nature, size and structure of a renewed nomination including a Management Plan.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Lamu Old Town (Kenya)

No 1055

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Lamu Old Town
<i>Location</i>	Coast Province, Lamu District
<i>State Party</i>	Kenya
<i>Date</i>	3 July 2000

Justification by State Party

Lamu is one of the oldest and the best preserved living settlements among the Swahili towns on the East African coast. Its buildings and the applied architecture are the best preserved and carry a long history that represents the development of Swahili technology. The old town is thus a unique and rare historical living heritage with more than 700 years of continuous settlement. It was once the most important trade centre in East Africa before other towns such as Zanzibar and Mombasa took over.

Since the 19th century, Lamu has been regarded as an important religious centre in East and Central Africa due to the *tarika* activities introduced by Habib Swaleh, a Sharif descendant of Prophet Mohamed (PBAH). There are many descendants of the Prophet in Lamu. Their presence has kept up that tradition, which continues to the present day Lamu in form of annual festivals known as *Maulidi*. These festivals are endemic to Lamu and draw the Muslim community from all over East and Central Africa, part of North Africa, as well as the Gulf region. Lamu is an Islamic and Swahili education centre in East Africa with an important Islamic college. Researchers and scholars of Islamic religion and the Swahili language come to Lamu to study this cultural heritage, which is relatively unchanged. The island town has adopted very little modern technology owing to its isolation.

Lamu exhibits an interchange of human values over a span of time on developments in architecture with its unique fusion of Arabic, Indian, European, and Swahili building styles. The town has been inhabited continuously since its foundation. Lamu is a reservoir of the Swahili culture and plays an important role as a religious Islamic centre as well as Swahili education centre for whole of East Africa.

Criteria ii and vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

- THE EARLY PHASE

The town of Lamu represents the Swahili culture, resulting from interaction between the Bantu, Arabs, Persians, Indians, and Europeans (in Arabic *sawāhili*, "of the coast"). The Swahili language is principally a mixture of Bantu and Arabic. The relevant cultural region extends from the island of Lamu in the north to Tanzania and Mozambique in the south, along the East African coast.

The origins of the town of Lamu date back to the 12th century, but the site was probably inhabited earlier. Archaeological evidence shows that there were two early Swahili settlements surrounded by walls, one to the south and the other to the north of the present town, which flourished in the early 13th century among the independent city states on the East African coast. It has been recorded as a large town with the office of *Qadi* (Muslim judge) in the mid 15th century. It first developed in the form of small clusters of stone buildings, including the Council Chamber, in the northern part of the present town (*Pangahari, Yumbe*) where the Friday mosque still is. The original market (*Utuku Mkuu*, the Great Market) lay west of this area. Later the town extended to the south (*Mtamwini*), an area north of the Fort, thus representing the full extent of the town in the 18th century. Lamu then came under Omani rule and was subject to the influx of Indian merchants from Gujerat in the 19th century. This period saw the building of the new Fort, and the development of the bazaar street, *Usita wa Mui*, and the area along the shore line.

Lamu was first developed by local Bantu people together with maritime traders from the Arabian Peninsula, the Persian Gulf, and the Far East. The town merchants prospered acting as middlemen between the interior and the sea, exporting ivory and timber in exchange for manufactured goods such as cloth, porcelain and spices across the Indian Ocean. In 1506 Lamu was invaded by the Portuguese, who monopolized shipping and suppressed coastal trade; consequently, the once prosperous city state lost its position, and gradually declined. In 1585 and 1588 Lamu and other coastal towns suffered from raids by Turks and rose in rebellion but were crushed by the Portuguese. In 1652 the Sultanate of Oman was persuaded to help the city states to overthrow the Portuguese regime, which was accomplished in 1698.

- THE OMANI PERIOD Under Omani protection the coastal commerce slowly regained its momentum, leading to a further development of Lamu and the construction, by skilled craftsmen and slave labour, of town houses and mosques using coral stone and mangrove timber. The merchants' houses were decorated with Chinese porcelain, and slaves were used to maintain plantations, keeping a share of the crops in return. In 1744 the Mazrui clan started ruling Mombasa, forming an alliance with the town of Pate in the north and forcing Lamu to strengthen its defences. After winning a battle in 1813, Lamu invited Seyyid Said Ibn Sultan-al-Busaidi, the Sultan of Oman, to install a garrison to protect the town, leading to the construction of the Fort, which was completed in 1821. In 1840 the capital of Seyyid Said was transferred from Oman to Zanzibar, helping Lamu to prosper. In the 1880s the Sultan of Zanzibar was granted the islands of Zanzibar, Maria, Pemba, and Lamu, and a strip

of the mainland up to Kipini in the north. The inland was declared open for European exploitation.

Until the end of the 19th century the population contained a large number of slaves providing cheap labour and living both in the hinterland and in households. Freeman consisted of three social groups: the often land-owning merchants who lived in stone houses, the shariffs who claimed to be descendants of the Prophet Mohammed, and the fishermen and artisans. In the 19th century Lamu became an important religious centre as a result of *tarika* (The Way of the Prophet) activities introduced by Habib Swaleh, a shariff, who had many ancestors traced directly back to the Prophet Mohammed. The religious annual festival of *Maulidi* has continued up to the present day, attracting Muslim followers. Lamu has also become an important Islamic and Swahili educational centre in East Africa, owing to the relatively unchanged and conservative character of its Muslim society.

- THE BRITISH PERIOD

In 1890 the entire coastal strip north of Zanzibar was assigned to the Imperial British East Africa Company. The East African Protectorate was established in 1895 and organized into provinces and districts under the new British administration in 1898. Lamu became the headquarters of Lamu District, administered by a resident British officer together with a Muslim officer (*Liwali*, Viceroy). During the British rule many houses were built on the reclaimed seafront, but after the construction of the railroad from Mombasa to Uganda in 1901 and the transfer of Protectorate government from Mombasa to Nairobi the town's economy gradually declined. This was caused partly by the abolition of slavery at the end of the 19th century and the loss of cheap labour. In a way, this contributed to Lamu retaining its traditional character.

- KENYA

In 1963 Lamu became part of the independent state of Kenya. Aware of the cultural significance of the town, the government authorized the first conservation study, sponsored by UNESCO, in 1974 and the old town was gazetted as a national monument in 1983.

Description

The town of Lamu is located on an island known by the same name on the east coast of Africa some 250km north of Mombasa. In 1986 the population of the town was some 12,000. The town is made up of two distinct sections, one built in stone and the other in mud brick. The old town centre consists of large houses built in coral stone and mangrove timber. The relatively larger, surrounding area consists of mud, wattle, and makuti houses. The whole built area covers about 37ha, while the stone town is about 15.6ha (750m x 280m), articulated in three distinct areas: the oldest part of the town is in the north, the areas of *Pangahari* and *Yumbe* with the Council Chamber and the Friday Mosque, then expanding to the west and south in the 18th century (the *Mkomani* area); the bazaar street runs north-south behind the seafront; the Fort and the houses on the seafront were built in the 19th century.

The c 400 houses of the Mkomani area date mainly from the 18th century, forming the largest and historically and architecturally the most interesting part of the old town. It is characterized by narrow streets and two to three story buildings, mingled with small gardens. The SWAHILI HOUSES

are marked with simplicity and uniformity in their exteriors, but they have elaborately carved wooden doors particularly characteristic to Lamu. The massive walls are 40–60cm thick covered with lime mortar. The houses have an entrance porch (*Daka*) and an interior vestibule (*Tekani*) with seats. Inside the house the spaces develop around small courtyards (*Kiwanda*) and open galleries (*Misana*); they are decorated with painted ceilings, large niches (*Madaka*), small niches (*Zidaka*), and pieces of Chinese porcelain.

The town of Lamu is divided into small wards (*Mitaa*), 36 in total, which provide the framework for the social structure. The LAMU FORT was built between 1813 and 1821 in the southern corner of the old stone town, encouraging new development, particularly on the seafront. The Fort is a massive multi-storey building with a central courtyard and has become an image of the Lamu community, being now used for weddings, meetings, and theatre productions. It also hosts the Lamu Conservation Office which manages the conservation and development of the town. The BUILDINGS ON THE SEAFRONT with their arcades and open verandahs provide a unified visual impression of the town when approaching it from the sea. One of the largest buildings on the seafront (dating from 1892) has been acquired as the Lamu Museum, exemplifying the finest characteristics of the verandah-style construction in the 19th century.

The section consisting of MUD-BRICK BUILDINGS covers an area of some 21ha and is spread between *Langoni* (the oldest part south of the Fort), *Tundami* (north of the old town), and *Gademi* (the newest part west of the old town). These are almost exclusively residential areas, with some commercial developments recently. Having first developed spontaneously, many of the houses have been transformed into permanent buildings with concrete block walls and corrugated iron roofs. Such development has taken place particularly after fires in 1962 and 1981.

Management and Protection

Legal status

A UNESCO-sponsored survey in 1975 provided the framework for the development of a conservation master plan, and the historic town was protected by law (The Antiquities and Monuments Act) in 1983. The gazetted area (about 3km x 4km) includes the entire historic town with its surroundings, and extends to the east across the water to Manda Island, where both the mangrove forest and the skyline are protected. Following this, all buildings, streets, frontages, open spaces, streetscape elements, and environmental features in the conservation area are preserved as historical and architectural features.

Protective procedures for the Lamu Old Town stipulated in the Antiquities and Monuments Act of Kenya are implemented following the Lamu Old Town Conservation bye-laws of Lamu County Council. Any development, improvement or alteration of buildings or plots in the Old Town as well as in the outer protection area are subject to approval by the local Planning Commission.

The series of sand dunes extending on the waterfront south of the town form the principal area for fresh water and are being gazetted separately to guarantee their protection against any development. Furthermore, special protection is provided to the mangrove thickets on Manda Island.

Management

The Lamu Museum was established in 1968, marking the start of an active interest in the conservation of Swahili culture. Several surveys and conservation plans have been prepared and published since: the first one in 1976 (Usam Gaidan), 1981 (W.H. Mangelus), and 1984–85 (F. Siravo). The last plan was adopted and the Old Town of Lamu was gazetted as an historic monument in 1986. The Lamu Town Planning and Conservation Office was established in 1987.

The management is controlled and executed by several authorities, each in the relevant field, including the Ministry of Home Affairs, National Heritage and Sports the National Museums Board; the Director General of the National Museums of Kenya (in Nairobi) the regional unit of Coastal Archaeology and the Conservation and Planning Unit for the Coastal Region (in Mombasa) the Lamu Museums, the Lamu Town Conservation Office, and the Lamu County Council (in Lamu).

The District Commissioner as the Chairman of the District Development Committee is the coordinator of all development activities between the different parties in Lamu. The Chief Curator of the Lamu Museums is in charge of everyday conservation management, and the Lamu County Council manages services needed by the residents. At the top, however, is the local planning commission which brings all the players together with the representatives of the community, and authorizes developments.

There are currently plans to upgrade the drainage system in Lamu by a Small Town Development Project. National resources are complemented by international and foreign funds from, for example, UNESCO and several development agencies. The European Union, in conjunction with the National Museums of Kenya, is sponsoring a programme for the renovation of Swahili houses. Expertise has been provided with the help of sponsors and on-site programmes have been organized to train local technicians in traditional Swahili artisan skills.

The number of visitors to Lamu has been about 15,000–20,000 per year, with about one-third from Kenya. The airport is situated on Manda Island and receives direct flights from Nairobi, Mombasa, and Malindi. The Lamu Museum is a resource centre for tourism, providing information and organizing tours. On Lamu Island there are two major hotels, in addition to private accommodation and smaller hotels in the area, amounting to some 500 beds.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The old town of Lamu has survived until the present owing to fortunate circumstances, partly due to the remoteness of the area and the absence of roads and vehicles and partly to the decline in development during the 20th century. Being built in stone, the structures have resisted weathering and are relatively well maintained at the present. Efforts are currently being made to improve garbage collection and drainage.

Recent increases in population and numbers of visitors are, however, creating pressures for change and have resulted in some problems despite the control mechanisms that are in place. The changes are felt especially in the gradual widening of a society with a previous emphasis on privacy into a more

open lifestyle, with consequent social conflicts. There is also an increase in the demand for visitor accommodation and the consequent conversion of private houses into guesthouses.

Authenticity and integrity

Lamu Old Town is a rare example of a settlement that has maintained its social and cultural integrity until the present day. The same applies to the historic fabric, which has well maintained its historical authenticity, both in material and in design. As a result of the efforts to provide training in traditional Swahili skills, there is currently a basis for the continuation of repair and maintenance respecting the cultural significance of the place. The town has also maintained its relationship with the surrounding landscape intact, and efforts have been made to extend environmental protection both to Manda Island and to the sand dunes in the south.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Lamu in January 2001.

Qualities

Lamu Old Town is the oldest and best preserved example of Swahili settlement in East Africa: it has maintained its social and cultural integrity, as well as retaining its authentic building fabric up to the present day. Once the most important trade centre in East Africa, Lamu has exercised an important influence in cultural as well as in technical terms. Characterized as being a conservative and closed society, Lamu has retained an important religious function with annual celebrations, and it is also a significant centre for education in Islamic and Swahili culture.

Comparative analysis

The East African coast had commercial developments since the Roman period through Arabic and Indian merchants, and particularly following the introduction of Islam by Persian merchants from Shiraz in the 7th century. In this coastal region, there developed a particular Swahili culture, a mixture of African, Arabic, Persian, Indian, and later European (Portuguese) influences finding an expression in the development of architecture and settlements as well as language. The oldest remains of Swahili settlements date from the 8th or 9th centuries, such as those of the ancient town of Manda, close to Lamu, and the ruins of Kilwa Kisiwani and Songo Mnara (inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1981: criterion iii) in Tanzania. From the 13th to the 15th century there were over a hundred city states along the east coast, but most of these have either fallen into ruins or have been transformed into modern towns. In Kenya, Mombasa, Malindi, Witu, Faza, and Lamu continue to exist; of these, Lamu is the best preserved example. Amongst the other Swahili towns are Mogadishu in Somalia and Zanzibar in Tanzania. Zanzibar is already on the World Heritage List (2000: ii, iii, vi), while Mogadishu and Mombasa have been subject to changes in the modern period. Most of the others are of later date or are only ruins.

Compared with Zanzibar, Lamu presents some similarities due to similar influences, but also many differences. The differences are particularly in the construction techniques as well as in building typology, in the way the town developed, and how the spatial quality of single buildings evolved. The community of Lamu has been more conservative than that of

Zanzibar, partly for cultural and religious reasons, partly helped by the smaller size of the town, its distance from major cities, and the absence of any motorized traffic. As a consequence, the town has also best preserved its particular Swahili character, and represents an excellent complement to the sites on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The ICOMOS expert mission confirmed the value of Lamu, and its authenticity and integrity. The mission drew the attention to potential risks to the area, such as fire, the construction of hotels just outside the historic area, and the need to strengthen collaboration between the different authorities. Particular attention was given to the role of the buffer zone, the need for continuous updating of action plans related to management of change, and the possibility of exchanging management experiences with the Zanzibar Stone Town Authority.

While recognizing the serious efforts already undertaken by the authorities, ICOMOS wishes to underline the importance of the social and cultural quality of Lamu and the need to search for culturally sustainable development. Such efforts should certainly include continuous education as well as training programmes.

On the basis of the recommendations of the expert mission to Lamu, ICOMOS recommends that the buffer zone be extended to some 2km on the shoreline in order to guarantee control of new constructions, that a more detailed management plan be prepared with clearly defined tasks for the authorities, and that the possibility of establishing an inter-departmental Lamu Town Authority be considered.

Brief description

Lamu Old Town is the oldest and best preserved Swahili settlement in East Africa, retaining its traditional functions. Built in coral stone and mangrove timber, the town is characterized by simplicity of structural forms enriched by features such as inner courtyards, verandahs, and elaborately carved wooden doors. Owing to the conservative character of its Muslim community, Lamu has continued important religious celebrations from the 19th century, and has become significant for the study of Islamic and Swahili cultures.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iv, and vi*:

Lamu Old Town is the oldest and best preserved example of Swahili settlement in East Africa. It has maintained its social and cultural integrity, as well as retaining its authentic building fabric until the present day. While built using traditional Swahili techniques, the unique character of the town is reflected in the architectural forms and spatial articulation. Once the most important trade centre in East Africa, Lamu has exercised important influence in cultural as well as technical aspects. It has retained an important religious function and is a significant centre for education in Islamic and Swahili culture.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Essaouira (Morocco)

No 753rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Medina of Essaouira (ancient Mogador)
<i>Location</i>	Province of Essaouira, Tensift Region
<i>State Party</i>	Kingdom of Morocco
<i>Date</i>	7 September 1995; revised text 21 July 2000

Justification by State Party

Since its foundation in the 18th century and up to the beginning of the 20th century Essaouira has played a fundamental role as an international trading port between Morocco and the rest of the world. A number of consulates and traders from different countries were established there.

Essaouira is a leading example of building inspired by European architecture. It is a town that is unique by virtue of its design: it was created in conformity with a predetermined plan (the Cornut plan). Since the beginning, the medina of Essaouira has been a major place for the peaceable coming together of the architectural and town-planning models of Europe and of Morocco itself. In this way a symbiosis was achieved between building techniques from Morocco and elsewhere which gave birth to some unique architectural masterpieces (the *Sqalas* of the port and of the medina, the Bab Marrakech bastion, the water gate, mosques, synagogues, churches, etc).

Criteria ii and iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the town of Essaouira is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Archaeological excavations have shown that the site of Essaouira was originally a Phoenician trading settlement; they were followed by Cretans, Greeks, and Romans. The earlier name of Mogador derives from Migdol, meaning a small fort. In 1506 it was to become the site of a Portuguese fortress, but this was abandoned soon after.

The present town dates from 1765, when the Alaouite Sultan Sidi Mohamed ben Abdellah decided to build a port that would open Morocco up to the outside world and assist in developing commercial relations with Europe. He sought the help of Nicholas Théodore Cornut, a surveyor specialist in military fortifications from Avignon, who was strongly influenced by Vauban's defences at Saint-Malo. He partially dismantled the Portuguese fortress to build an esplanade with a row of cannons, known as the *Sqala*. He laid out a checkerboard plan for the town with forts of Roussillon type, in the European tradition. The entire town was enclosed by a defensive wall on the Vauban model.

During the reign of this Sultan, Mogador assumed a major commercial and fiscal role. In order to control maritime trade, he closed the southern coast to European traders, obliging the European consuls at Safi, Agadir, and Rabat to move to Mogador, where all southern mercantile activities were concentrated. The new port became one of the country's main commercial centres; it was called "the port of Timbuktu," since it was the destination of caravans bringing a variety of products (including slaves) from black Africa.

The town was made up of three separate districts. The *Kasbah* comprised the old administrative district. The *Medina* was built between the 18th century and the early 20th century. It was crossed by two main axial streets, one running from Bab Doukalla to the harbour and the other from Bab Marrakech to the sea. At their intersection, known as Souk Jdid, there were four markets, for fish, spices, grain, and general goods respectively. Each of the districts bears the name of one of the tribes that were involved in the building of the town.

The *Mellah* is the Jewish quarter; it played a very important role in the history of the town, since the Sultan made use of this community to establish relations with Europe and to organize commercial activities with them. They were given the title of Toujjar Es-Sultan (Royal Merchants), giving them considerable economic and political privileges.

Description

The main features of the town are:

- The ramparts, most of the northern section of which survives.
- The town gates, especially the ornamental Sea Gate (1170–71).
- The bastions and forts (*borjs*), especially the *Sqala* of the Port and the *Sqala* of the Medina and the Bastion of Bab Marrakech.
- The Kasbah, which was originally the seat of power and the military garrison, and now integrated into the town proper.
- The Mellah (Jewish quarter), which retains many of its original special features.
- The prison, located on the offshore island (now a refuge for rare birds, such as hawks).
- The many mosques, in a characteristic style, and especially the Mosques of the Casbah and Ben Yossef.
- The synagogues (in particular the 19th century synagogue of Simon Attias), which preserve the dynamism of the Jewish inhabitants.

- The late 18th century Portuguese church.
- The Dar-Sultan (old Royal Palace).
- The very attractive private houses.

The harbour of Essaouira is approached through a sheltered narrow channel. It is flanked by large expanses of sand dunes, beyond which lie the *argan* (*Argania spinosa*) forests unique to Morocco.

There is at present no detailed survey and inventory of the buildings in the three districts, with descriptions, plans, etc, but this is essential for future restoration and conservation projects.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The only monuments in Essaouira protected by the series of statutes and regulations, the most recent of which is Royal Decree No 22/80, which imposes controls over any work of demolition, alteration, extension, and reconstruction of listed buildings, are the fortifications, which have been legally protected since 1924 as a historic monumental ensemble.

The first urban planning legislation was enacted in 1954. In conformity with Royal Decree No 12/90, there are strict controls on development, based on individual town plans.

Management

Ownership of the elements that make up the historic town of Essaouira is divided between the State, the municipality, the Habous, the Alliance Israélite, cooperatives, and private individuals.

The 1988 urban plan No 4001 provides for a zone round the historic town within which no construction is permitted. Conscious of the threats to the cultural heritage of Essaouira, the provincial and municipal authorities have since 1996 been carrying out a number of studies, some with the support of international bodies (UNESCO, UNICEF, GTZ, CNUEH/Habitat, etc).

Two significant measures of protection and management are currently in the final stages of application. These are the *Schéma Directeur d'Aménagement Urbain de la Ville d'Essaouira* and the *Plan de sauvegarde de la médina d'Essaouira*, both prepared by the Ministère de l'Aménagement du Territoire, de l'Environnement, de l'Urbanisation et de l'Habitat. These fully conform with the requirement of the Committee relating to management plans (*Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 39.b.2).

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

There appears to have been little, if any, conscious conservation policy in Essaouira until recently.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the ensemble is high: the original street plan and the defences survive virtually intact. However,

some measure of authenticity has been lost owing to repair and reconstruction work involving modern materials, especially concrete.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

ICOMOS consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages on the cultural significance of the site. An ICOMOS expert mission visited Essaouira in February 1996. A second ICOMOS mission visited the town in April 1997 and a third in May 2001.

Qualities

Essaouira is an excellent example of the translation of the urban design and fortification principles of 18th century Europe to the Moslem world.

ICOMOS observations

When it first evaluated the property in 1996, ICOMOS was concerned that there was no programme for the restoration and preservation of this town, and in particular for its fortifications, or for the survey and inventory of the existing stock of buildings and monuments. It was also not convinced that the town possesses the "outstanding universal value" needed for inscription on the World Heritage List.

It accordingly recommended to the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee at its 20th session in Paris in June 1996 that the property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List. The Bureau decided, however, to defer the examination of the nomination until its 21st session, so that the Moroccan authorities might submit additional information concerning the site. Following receipt of this additional information by ICOMOS, the second mission took place in April 1997.

Whilst the 1997 mission confirmed the ICOMOS reservations expressed above regarding the conservation and management of Essaouira, it dissented from the view that the property does not possess "outstanding universal value." It stressed the fact that the fortifications are of outstanding quality, and also that the urban fabric and the traditional way of life survive intact.

At the 21st session of the Bureau in Paris in June 1997 further consideration of this nomination was deferred, to enable the State Party to formulate and implement a management plan.

Recommendation

Confirmation that this property was to be presented to the Bureau in June 2001 was not received by ICOMOS until after its World Heritage Panel had met at the end of March. In addition, this text has been prepared before the report of the expert mission has been received. ICOMOS will make a formal recommendation to the Bureau in June.

ICOMOS, April 2001

Guimarães (Portugal)

No 1031

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Historic Centre of Guimarães
<i>Location</i>	Province of Minho, District of Braga
<i>State Party</i>	Portugal
<i>Date</i>	27 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The historic centre of Guimarães is an ensemble and a testimony of urban development that brings together renowned examples of a special type of construction. Because of its unity, its construction system (in traditional techniques), its architectural characteristics (diversity of typologies, illustrating the evolution of the city at different periods), and its integration with the landscape setting, the town represents outstanding universal values.

The zone proposed for inscription contains an urban fabric that has medieval origins and includes a succession of places of great formal significance, where the built structure (mainly from the 17th century), while representing a variety of types, is built using traditional technology, ie the *colombage* and the *pisé de fasquio* in which timber is a fundamental element.

The authenticity and integrity of the traditional construction methods remain a living presence in the city. This type of construction is still widely used in the urban area and represents a cultural heritage to be safeguarded.

The authenticity and the strong visual impact of the historic centre of Guimarães result from the unified protection strategies that have been implemented by the Municipal Technical Offices (GTL). The policies of urban conservation have been based on the promotion of rehabilitation and the re-evaluation of public spaces, retaining the resident population, protecting and maintaining the existing historic structures built in traditional technology, as well as guaranteeing a strict implementation, which have resulted in an exemplary case that distinguishes Guimarães amongst the other towns of the country.

The exemplary results have been recognized by several international and national awards, such as the Prix Europa Nostra in 1985.

The traditional techniques used in Guimarães derive from experience and from oral transmission, transferring the past to the present and guaranteeing continuity to the knowhow and manual skills. The wealth of traditional techniques

resides in the combination of these factors, man being an agent of practice and of tradition. **Criterion ii**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Guimarães was situated on the most important early medieval route of communication connecting Monção and Braga with Viseu and Caminha, the seat of the Portuguese (*Portugalense*) Counts from the 10th century. This urban settlement developed as a result of two forces, a monastery and a fort, one in the valley, the other on the hill, surrounded by two rivers. The town thus dominated the fertile plain that extended towards the sea. The two focal points continued growing in parallel until they were brought together within a single enclosure in the 13th and 14th centuries.

The early history of Guimarães is closely associated with the forming of the national identity and the language of Portugal, being associated with the early Portuguese sovereigns. The region was given as a feudal property to the family that created the country in the 12th century. In 1139 Count Dom Afonso Henriques declared the independence of Portugal from León and took the name of Afonso I as the first king of the new kingdom. Because of the association of the family with the region, the monastery of Guimarães was transformed into a royal college, thus obtaining a primary institutional role in the country. It also became a pilgrimage place on the route of Santiago de Compostela because of an image of the Madonna that was considered to be miraculous.

In the 15th and 16th centuries, the Bourg developed a variety of activities, including the manufacture of cutlery and jewellery, the treatment of leather, and marketing of the goods. The production reinforced the position of Guimarães on the route between the coast and the inland. The establishment of Dominican and Franciscan orders outside the walls of the Bourg contributed to the beginning of urbanization *extra muros*, including an area for the treatment of leather close to the river Couros. The economic and social status of the town was recognized in the new charter granted by Dom Manuel in 1517.

The 18th century was a period of intensive construction activity, particularly marked by noble residences. It was also the period of the first urban master plan, though most of the implementation took place in the first half of the 19th century. There were also new access roads, which came to modify the medieval situation, establishing the basis for the present-day layout in the region. The medieval defence walls and gates, which had already lost their function in the 16th century, were gradually demolished starting from the 17th to 19th centuries.

In the 20th century the town expanded at an increasing speed due to industrial development. In the 1980s the municipality recognized the importance of the historic centre of the town, establishing a technical office responsible for the strategies of conservation and rehabilitation.

Description

The nominated area of Guimarães (16ha) consists of the historic centre as it was formed at the time of the construction of the medieval enclosure of the 13th century. This core area is surrounded by a buffer zone (45ha), which roughly corresponds to the built area in the first half of the 20th century. The nominated area has a population of about 1000 and the buffer zone 1850 inhabitants.

The urban layout of the historic centre is an area some 850m long and about 250m wide, with the castle in the north and the original monastic complex in the south. The different constructions fall into several periods, though the single buildings may have undergone various changes and additions over time. The following have been identified as the main periods of construction:

- I. The early settlement, 950–1279;
- II Unification within one enclosure, 1279–1498;
- III Renaissance to Baroque, 1498–1750;
- IV Rococo to Neo-Classicism, 1750–1863;
- V Eclectic to industrial period, 1863–1926;
- VI Modern expansion, 1926 till today.

The historic centre is characterized by a large number of buildings from the different periods. Period I and II have a number of stone constructions, including the two poles around which the town initially developed, the castle in the north and the monastic complex in the south. The third and fourth period are characterized by noble houses and the development of civic facilities, city squares, etc. The fifth and sixth period are characterized by some modern changes, though the town essentially has maintained its medieval urban layout.

The systems and techniques of construction and building types have evolved over time. The residential buildings in the nominated area are characterized by the use of two construction techniques, one dating from before the 16th century, called *taipa de rodízio*, a particular type of half-timber structure, which mixed granite with a structure in timber and a filling in sun-dried brick, using clay mortar. The other technique, called *taipa de fasquio*, came into use in the 19th century and was built entirely in timber. These techniques are still mastered today. This technology was first developed in the region of Guimarães. From here it was exported to Portuguese colonies in other parts of the world, becoming a distinct characteristic of the personality of Portuguese colonial architecture.

Considering that the town had begun to develop *extra muros* in the 16th century, the historic area is not limited to the core zone within the original medieval enclosure. The core area and the buffer zone contain several listed monuments of national and public interest: 12 in the core area and 10 in the buffer zone. Furthermore, the municipality has identified buildings of particular heritage interest: 36 in the core zone and 24 in the buffer zone.

The monuments of national interest include the medieval CASTLE, built on the site of the first fort of the 10th century. The present construction was built in stone, begun at the time of Afonso I in the 12th century and continued with various modifications in the following centuries. The building is an austere crenellated structure with towers, designed for

defence. Part of it was demolished in the 18th century and it has been subject to restorations in the 19th and 20th centuries.

Close to the castle, there is a small Romanesque church, SÃO MIGUEL DO CASTELO, which was consecrated in 1239. Having been ruined in the 19th century, the building was restored in the 1920s.

The church of NOSSA SENHORA DA OLIVEIRA was founded in the 12th century on the site where the first monastery had existed some three centuries earlier. The church was completely renovated from 1387 to 1413, with three naves and a wooden roof structure, according to the Portuguese Gothic model. The cloister was added in the 16th century and the present sanctuary to the church in the 17th century.

The PALACE OF THE DUKES OF BRAGANÇA is a large complex built in stone down the hill from the castle. The first construction dates from 1420–22, most probably under French influence. The building, a late medieval type, was conceived as a symbol of the pride of the Bragança family. The building underwent various vicissitudes, serving as a military headquarters in the late 19th century. It was restored in the 1930s, much of the restoration based on hypothesis.

The TOWN HALL, in the square in front of the church of Nossa Senhora, dates mainly from the 16th and 17th centuries. The palace, primarily in stone, has one main floor with large doors opening to a balcony along the main facade. The ground floor is characterized by open arcades. In the same square, in front of the church, there is also a 14th century Gothic arch, a monument commemorating the victory of Dom Afonso IV in the battle of Padrão do Salado.

The core area and the buffer zone contain several interesting religious buildings, such as the CONVENT OF SANTA CLARA from the 17th and 18th centuries and the CHURCH OF MISERICÓRDIA from the early 17th century.

Guimarães has a rich typology of houses and palaces ranging from the 16th to the 19th and even the 20th centuries, continuing to use similar traditional techniques. The BOURGEOIS HOUSES OF THE 16TH CENTURY have a ground floor in granite and the upper floors are built using the half-timbered structure of *taipa de rodízio*. The 16th century houses of noble families have often been an alteration of a previous structure, and have generally their elevation built in granite, as a sign of distinction.

The typical HOUSES OF THE 17TH CENTURY continued using the same construction technique, ie granite in the ground floor and half-timbered structure in the upper floors, usually three, which extend stepwise over the ground floor. Another type of house of the same century was built with a peristyle and arcaded ground floor, and is usually found in public squares. The noble palaces were built in granite ashlar, including a series of recesses. The building extended along the street front with its characteristic windows and balconies, giving it a dignified aspect. More modest town houses have a simple facade without any decorative features.

The NOBLE PALACES OF THE 18TH CENTURY were built in ashlar stone with recessed elevations, but more modest dimensions than in the previous century. In the transition, from the 18th to the 19th and 20th centuries, the constructions still continued using certain traditional features, but they are distinguished by their size and the

horizontal accent. In the 20th century it is fashionable to use *azulejos* as a decorative element in the elevations.

The continuity in traditional technology and the maintenance and gradual change have contributed to an exceptionally harmonious townscape, but limited to the core area. The buffer zone has several interesting monuments, including an entire traditional street, Rua Dom João I, though otherwise the area results from industrial housing developments in the 20th century.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The public areas of the historic centre are the property of the municipality of Guimarães. Apart from some state-owned properties, most of the building stock is privately owned.

The historic centre is subject to legal prescriptions regarding the protection of historic buildings (L. 13/85; L. 120/97; D.L. 3/98), and related to town planning (D.L. 38/382 of 1951; L. 445/91; D.L. 250/94). The urban master plan dates from 1994 and includes norms for the protection of the historic centre.

In the historic centre there are 14 historic buildings legally protected as national monuments (8) or as historic buildings of public interest (6), according to the Portuguese Law on the Protection of Historic Monuments. Where no protected zone has been established, the protection also includes prescriptions regarding the setting of the protected buildings, up to 50m from the exterior of the construction.

During the mission to the site, the ICOMOS expert noted that parts of the buffer zone remained outside the protection zone. While norms for the protection of the historic core area exist, these have not been established for the buffer zone. Consequently, the municipality has already taken measures to rectify the situation and to extend protection to the entire area proposed for inscription and to prepare the required norms for the buffer zone.

Management

The management of the historic centre is the responsibility of the Local Technical Office for the Historic Centre of the Municipality (GTL), established in 1985. Any interventions related to listed buildings is under the control of the Portuguese Institute of Architectural Heritage (IPPAR).

The ICOMOS site mission was able to verify and confirm that the conservation and maintenance of the historic area is exceptionally well managed. In fact, the area is in good condition, also as a result of the systematic maintenance programme, sponsored by European funding. Most of the building stock has already been subject to this maintenance programme.

It is noted furthermore that Guimarães has continued to make use of traditional knowhow and skills up to the present day. As a consequence maintenance work and repairs have been executed using traditional methods, thus guaranteeing a harmony with and respect for the existing historic fabric.

The historic town has a considerable number of visitors, out of whom about 75% are foreigners, mainly from Europe. It is well equipped to manage such tourism flows.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The town of Guimarães has been fortunate in that it has never been subject to any major disasters in its history. As a result the town represents an exceptional harmony in the continuation of eventual changes and developments. This is also due to the continuity in the use of traditional techniques and materials since the Middle Ages. Although the different epochs have introduced a variety of building types, the typology as a whole also represents a continuity that gives the town a remarkably well balanced townscape.

So far as the single buildings are concerned, there have been various interventions, changes, and additions, resulting from changes in uses. Some of the public buildings, such as the Castle, the Bragança Palace, and several churches have been subject to restoration in the 19th and early 20th centuries. These restorations have been carried out following the criteria of the time, including reconstructions on the basis of evidence or sometimes based on hypothesis. However, these interventions can be seen as part of the history of the place and they do not impair the overall issue of authenticity.

Authenticity and integrity

ICOMOS regards the historic area of Guimarães to have well retained its historic stratigraphy and to pass the test of authenticity. The historic core also presents an area of great integrity, where the different phases of development are well integrated into the whole.

It is also to be noted that the core area obviously represents the historic centre of a town, which has continued to grow and develop around it in the 20th century. As a result the areas outside the perimeter of the protected zone reflect a more ordinary townscape.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted its International Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH).

Qualities

The history of Guimarães is closely associated with the creation of the national identity and language of Portugal. It was the feudal territory of the Portuguese Dukes who declared the independence of Portugal from León in the mid 12th century.

Guimarães has well preserved its historic building stock, which represents the evolution of building typologies from the Middle Ages to the 19th century. This development is documented in the rich variety of different building types that have responded to the evolving needs of the community.

Guimarães also developed a particular version of a type of construction using granite mixed with a timber-framed structure, a technology which was widely diffused in the Portuguese colonies.

Comparative analysis

In the Portuguese context there are basically two urban developments; one is related to the Roman, Germanic, and Arabic inheritance, such as Evora (inscribed on the World

Heritage List 1986: criteria ii, iv), which were then expanded in the Portuguese period. The other development has a Portuguese basis, resulting in cities such as Guimarães and Minho.

As the seat of the king and the government Lisbon has had its own particular basis for the development. There is also a difference with cities such as Oporto (1996: iv), which architecturally represents a different development, becoming a major metropolis, when compared with the traditionally evolved Guimarães on a small scale.

While Portugal certainly has a rich heritage with numerous historic cities, Guimarães is distinguished in particular for its integrity, where the historically authentic building stock is presented in an exceptionally well managed context.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Considering the verified lack of protection in certain areas of the buffer zone and the lack of specified norms of protection in the same areas, ICOMOS urges the State Party to take the necessary action and to provide the required legal protection and protection norms for the areas concerned.

Brief description

The historic town of Guimarães is associated with the creation of the Portuguese national identity in the 12th century. The town is an exceptionally well preserved and authentic example of the evolution of a medieval settlement into a modern township, retaining a rich building typology representing the specifically Portuguese development over the centuries, particularly from the 15th to the 19th centuries, and consistently built using traditional building materials and techniques.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and iv*:

The historic town of Guimarães is associated with the definition of the Portuguese national identity and language in the 12th century. The town is exceptionally well preserved, illustrating the different phases of the evolution of particular building types from the medieval settlement to a modern township, and particularly from the 15th to the 19th centuries, and consistently built in traditional building materials and techniques. Because of the role of Guimarães in the exploration of new territories, the specialized building techniques developed there in the Middle Ages were introduced to Portuguese colonies, becoming their characteristic feature.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Samarkand (Uzbekistan)

No 603rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Samarkand – the place of crossing and synthesis of world cultures
<i>Location</i>	Samarkand Region
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Uzbekistan
<i>Date</i>	7 July 2000

Justification by State Party

The city of Samarkand is a historically well known social, political, cultural, and economic centre of Central Asia. Being situated on the crossing of the Great Silk Roads, Samarkand has preserved the values of cultures, religions, and arts of the ancient world. Nowadays in the historical part of the city there are magnificent examples of the architecture and culture of ancient civilizations (Afrosiab, Shakhi-Zinda, Registan, Gur-Emir, and others). As Samarkand was the capital of ancient states various religions concentrated there: Zoroastrianism, Buddhism, Christianity, and Islam. The material remains related to these religions are an evidence of cultures that have disappeared.

The historical part of Samarkand and its elements reflect the creativity of human genius and a synthesis of world arts. The ancient city of Afrosiab has preserved its original forms and unique wall decorations, which are now conserved.

The monuments reflect the achievements of material culture in Central Asian history. The architectural ensembles of the Timurid epoch have played a great role in the development of town planning, architecture, and arts in this region.

These monuments are unique and there is nothing comparable known elsewhere in the world.

These architectural ensembles and archaeological monuments are the only examples that illustrate the important stages of Central Asian and world history.

Criteria i, ii, iii, and iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Located on the crossroads of the great trade routes that traversed Central Asia, Samarkand has a multi-millennial history. Archaeological excavations in present-day Samarkand have brought to light the remains of settlements related to the first half of the 1st millennium BCE. The ancient Afrosiab (the predecessor of Samarkand) had a strategic location at the time of the formation of the first large states in Central Asia, such as Khorezm, Baktria, and Sogd, and it was the capital of Sogdiana. It was part of the Achaemenid Empire (6th–4th centuries BCE) and that of Alexander the Great (4th century BCE). Situated at the crossing of trade routes from China, Afghanistan, Iran, India, and the Caucasus, the city became prosperous and an important centre of silk trade in the 2nd century CE. The city was part of a Turkish kingdom in the 6th century, and was conquered by Kuteiba-ibn-Muslim in 712 CE, starting the penetration of Islamic culture into the region of the present-day Uzbekistan (*Maverannah* or *Transoxiana*). The Arabs rulers turned the ancient temples into mosques, administrative centres, places of learning, courts, and treasuries.

The Samanids of Iran occupied the place from the 9th to 10th centuries and Turkic peoples from the 11th to 13th centuries; it was part of the Kingdom of Khwarezm in the 13th century, until it was devastated by the Mongol invasion of Genghis Khan in 1220. The city emerged as a major centre through the efforts of Timur the Lame (Tamerlane) (1369–1404). It was rebuilt on its present site, south-west of Afrosiab, and became the capital of Timur's powerful state and the repository of the material riches from conquered territories that extended from Central Asia to Persia, Afghanistan, and India. It remained a cultural capital of the Timurids until the end of the 15th century, during the reign of Ulugh Bek (1409–49) and his successors. Timur built a citadel, the Blue Palace (*Kuk-Saray*), and other important buildings. The period was characterized by a new synthesis of arts; local traditions were influenced from other regions of the empire (Persian Khorasan, Khorezm), resulting in the construction of major religious ensembles, such as Bibi-Khanum Mosque in front of the main city gates, the Gur Emir complex, and the Grave of Emir near the palace of Muhammad Sultan. The eastern gates of the town linked with the city centre, known as Registan Square, where Ulugh Bek started the construction of a major complex in 1447.

In the 16th century, during the Uzbek occupation (1500), Samarkand became the Khanate of Bukhara and gradually lost its earlier importance, though some notable construction works were still undertaken in the 17th century. These included the Madrassah of Shir-Dor built by Yalandtush Bahadur on Registan Square opposite the Ulugh Bek Madrassah, and was followed by the Tilla Kari Madrassah, a new Friday mosque, to complete the ensemble. In the 18th century, the city suffered a serious economic decline.

In 1868 the Russians conquered Samarkand, making it a provincial capital (1887) and thus reviving its economy. The Caspian Railway was brought to the town in 1888, linking the European part of Russia and Central Asia, and again reinforcing the role of Samarkand as an important trade centre. The Russian administration constructed

schools, churches, and hospitals, and the western part of Samarkand was redeveloped according to current town-planning ideas. The period, however, also led to the destruction of the city walls and gates, as well as of several monuments, such as Timur's citadel. At the beginning of the 20th century the city thus included three main sectors one next to the other: the archaeological area of the ancient city (*Afrosiab*), the medieval Timurid city, and the modern city, the construction of which started in the 1870s. The city was the capital of the Uzbek SSR from 1924 to 1930 and later an administrative centre.

Description

Samarkand is located in a large oasis in the valley of the Zerafshan river, not far from the Kara-Kum desert, in the north-eastern part of Uzbekistan. Surrounded by high mountains and having enough water, a fertile soil, and a rich fauna, this valley has always attracted people. Evidence of settlements in this region goes back to 1500 BCE. The historical part of Samarkand consists of three main sections: in the north-east there is the site of the ancient Afrosiab (founded in the 7th century BCE) including the necropolis of Shakhi-Zinda; to the south of this there is the medieval Timurid city; and to the west there is the area of the 19th century expansion in European style. The modern city extends around this historical core zone.

The nomination proposes a series of monuments for inscription to the World Heritage List. The most important of these are the following:

1. Shakhi-Zinda ensemble, Hazrat-Hizr Mosque, and remains of the city walls in the Afrosiab archaeological area;
2. The Bibi-Khanum ensemble;
3. The Registan ensemble;
4. The ensembles of Gur-Emir and Rukhabad;
5. Ulugh-Bek's Observatory;
6. The ensembles of Abdi-Darun and Ishrat-khona;
7. The City Garden ensemble in the 19th century town.

Afrosiab is the ancient site of the town before the Timurid period dating from the 7th century BCE to the beginning of the 13th century CE. It has the form of a triangle and an extent of about 289ha. Archaeological excavations have revealed the ancient citadel and fortifications, the palace of the ruler, and residential and craft quarters. The ruler's palace (7th century CE) has important wall paintings, and there are also the remains of a large ancient mosque built from the 8th to 12th centuries. In 1962 the road to the airport was built across the territory of Afrosiab and a new access road was provided to the archaeological site.

The medieval town of Samarkand was built by Timur starting in the 14th century and it retained its integrity intact until the 19th century. There are several major monumental ensembles and over 300 ancient monuments. Since the 19th century, there have been losses, particularly in the western part (the Timurid citadel), the area around the Registan Square in the centre of the old town, and the area around the Bibi Khanum Mosque in the north-east. In addition, some modern roads have been built across the traditional urban fabric. Nevertheless, the old town still

contains substantial areas of historic fabric with typical narrow lanes, articulated into districts with social centres, mosques, *madrassahs*, and residential housing.

The traditional Uzbek houses have one or two floors and the spaces are grouped around central courtyards with gardens. Built in mud brick, the houses have painted wooden ceilings and wall decorations. Before 1982, when Samarkand was provided with legal protection, some large modern constructions were built in the historic area. Since the proclamation of the independence of the Republic of Uzbekistan such large-scale construction works have been stopped.

When Samarkand was occupied by the Russians at the end of the 19th century, an extension was designed to the west of the old town. This area was built according to the European town-planning ideas of the period, and it was designed with a series of streets radiating from the former citadel area. It included a large city park with public buildings, churches and a synagogue. Much of the residential housing was still built using traditional techniques.

- THE SHAKHI-ZINDA ENSEMBLE

The ensemble of Shakhi-Zinda, on the southern edge of Afrosiab, contains a magnificent series of mosques, *madrassahs*, and mausolea dating from the 11th to the 19th century. These domed structures are covered with glazed tiles, mosaics, and paintings from the different centuries, and in effect form an architectural museum which hardly has any parallel elsewhere.

- THE BIBI KHANUM ENSEMBLE

Timur built the Bibi Khanum Mosque in memory of his wife close to the northern gate of the city in 1399–1405. Additions were made later in the 15th century. It is an imposing Friday mosque, built around a central courtyard and richly decorated with marble carvings, glazed tiles, minarets, and domes. The original upper part of the building had collapsed and was recently rebuilt in reinforced concrete. The ensemble includes the Bibi-Khanum Mausoleum across the road.

- THE REGISTAN ENSEMBLE

Registan Square was identified as the centre of the new city after the destruction of Afrosiab in 1220. The site was constructed in several phases, and it now includes three large *madrassahs*, originally built in mud brick and covered with decorated ceramic tiles. The Ulugh Bek *Madrassah* is the oldest, dating from 1420. The *Madrassah Shirdor* (1619–32), opposite this, reflects its facade, and the *Tilla Kari* *madrassah* (1641–60) closes the square on the north side. The buildings have been partly rebuilt in recent decades.

- THE RUKHABAT MAUSOLEUM AND GUR-EMIR

The Rukhabat Mausoleum is situated south-west of Registan Square. The building was intended for the burial of Burkhan ad-Din Sagardji, who died in the 1380s. It is a simple brick structure with central plan and covered with a dome and has no portal. It was restored in 1996, on the occasion of the Timurid anniversary. The surrounding urban fabric was demolished, leading to the discovery of the remains of related buildings. The Gur Emir ensemble is situated to the south of the mausoleum and connected with

it via a stone-paved alley. The central building has been restored and its dome rebuilt; the large portal is restored and the remains of the other constructions of the ensemble are displayed after excavations.

- ULUGH BEK'S OBSERVATORY

Over a hill north-east of Afrosiab there are the remains of the Observatory of Ulugh Bek, the 15th century ruler and noted scientist and astronomer. The site includes a large semi-circle dug into the ground (11m deep), forming the lower part of the 15th century astronomical instrument built in marble and with indication of degrees. The site is of great scientific significance.

- THE CITY GARDEN

The ensemble of the City Garden is situated in the 19th century part of Samarkand. It includes several religious and public buildings: Alekseyevsky Cathedral, the Roman-Catholic Church, the Armenian Church, Georgievsky's Cathedral, the Synagogue, the Palace of the General Governor, the Russian-Chinese Bank, the Public Meeting Building, the Military Meeting Building, and Hotel Zarafshan.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The monuments are state and national property under the provisions of the Constitution of the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Law of the Republic of Uzbekistan on Safeguarding and Using of Historical and Cultural Monuments, and the Decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan (26 May 1982) concerning the establishment of the State Samarkand Historical-Architectural Reserve. The status of the Reserve prohibits construction of new buildings or carrying out changes that violate the condition of the territory or cultural monuments within the boundaries of the Reserve.

Management

After the proclamation of independence of the Republic of Uzbekistan, the Government adopted a number of Decrees directed to the preservation of historical and cultural monuments in historic cities. Some large-scale works were carried on the basis of a long-term programme in two stages: the first up to 1996 and the second up to 2000, connected with the 600th anniversary of Mirzo Ulugbek and the 660th anniversary of Amir Timur. In the first stage measures on engineering, strengthening, and conservation of preserved fragments of architectural decoration were implemented. The second stage has included works directed to improve the geological situation of the territory, strictly limiting construction works in the protected areas, reconstruction of old dwellings with relevant roads and public centres, and the provision of these areas with modern technical facilities.

The protected historic sites are managed following the Instruction on Organization of Protective Zones of Immovable Historical and Cultural Monuments, dated 24 January 1986, which defines the boundaries of the areas, the norms for the use and repair of protected zones and monuments, as well as defining the content and procedures of projects. The overall responsibility of the management

of protected areas is with the Ministry of Cultural Affairs of the Republic of Uzbekistan, shared with the Office for Scientific Production of Cultural Monuments, the Board of the Samarkand Historical-Architectural Reserve, the Khokimiyat [Municipality] of Samarkand and the Siab District of Samarkand.

The long-term national heritage programme, "Meros", is developed in collaboration between State and municipal authorities, the Ministry being more focused on monuments and the municipality on historic areas. The National Company Uzbekturism conducts projects with the objective of including architectural and archaeological monuments in tourist itineraries. The principal financial resources are provided by the State, but there is growing participation by non-governmental organizations and the private sector interested in the preservation of historic monuments. The technicians and specialists involved in the preparation and execution of the projects are trained by national universities and in practical field seminars. An example of such activity has been the recent involvement of the Aga Khan Trust in pilot projects on the restoration and rehabilitation of historic residential areas.

Earlier, several industrial enterprises were located in the historic area, but these have been systematically removed since the protection process started in 1982. The aim is to remove all such activities and locate them outside the historic area. Samarkand is in a seismic area and relevant measures are taken, such as strengthening the foundations of historic buildings. The state of conservation of protected monuments is regularly monitored by specialists and materials are tested in scientific laboratories.

The city of Samarkand is a large tourist centre, and the historic area of the town has some 185,000 inhabitants. The National Company Uzbekturism as well as International Charitable Foundation Oltin Meros (Golden Heritage) publish various brochures, albums, books, tourist guides, and maps.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The historic town of Samarkand has suffered several losses since the 18th century, when its decline started. These have included the demolition of the fortifications and the ancient citadel at the end of the 19th century, as well as several areas of traditional residential buildings even in the recent past. The ancient religious monuments, madrassahs, and mosques have also suffered, and many were already in a poor state of repair in the 19th century. Since then a substantial amount of restoration work has been carried out, following a variety of principles. Some of the repairs have been carried out as a minimum intervention, fully respecting the original fabric; in other cases, there have been different degrees of restoration and reconstruction. It should be noted that the restoration and reconstruction of ancient Timurid monuments has become a special priority since the independence of Uzbekistan, because of their identity value to the newly independent state.

The Shakhi Zindar ensemble has retained its important religious significance throughout the years, but the repair and restoration works have remained minimal until today. In fact, many of the monuments are in need of repair and

consolidation. The Guri-Emir ensemble and the Rukhabad mausoleum have been restored and they are in satisfactory condition. The ensembles of Registan and the Bibi-Khanum have been subject to partial reconstruction using reinforced concrete structures and reproduction traditional-type glazed tiles.

So far as the traditional urban fabric of the historic area is concerned, the conditions vary. Until recently little attention has been paid to guaranteeing maintenance and repair of the residential housing, except within the limits of resources provided by individual inhabitants. The houses are generally built in mud brick and timber. It should be noted that the relevant skills still exist in the region and several work sites have been conducted in recent years for the rehabilitation and restoration of historic houses. In this context, the pilot projects of the Aga Khan Trust have been significant. Generally speaking, the state of conservation of the existing urban area is variable; some parts are in satisfactory condition, while others may be close to collapse.

The nomination document illustrates a project for the reconstruction of the central part of Samarkand in which it is proposed to integrate the Timurid city and the 19th century part of the old town into a large-scale urban planning scheme. The proposed central axis links the former citadel area of the old town with a new administrative structure and public facilities in the south. No details or explanations are provided about the impact of such a scheme on the historic town core.

Authenticity and integrity

The question of authenticity in reference to the various monuments proposed to the World Heritage List varies from one case to another. The ensemble of Shakhi-Zinda has been subject to decay and some of the buildings are in need of repair. Past repairs have been minimal and as a result the existing structures and materials have retained their authenticity.

Some of the mosques and madrassahs, however, have been subject to restoration and reconstruction. The important Bibi-Khanum Mosque was partly in ruins, having lost its upper part in an earthquake some two centuries ago (about 50%). It has now been rebuilt using reinforced concrete over the existing historic structures. It should be noted that the tone of the new tiles is slightly lighter than the original. Similar restoration has been undertaken in Registan and Gur-Emir, though on a smaller scale and over a relatively long period of time. The reconstruction has been based on research of the original architecture and using old photographs and documentary evidence. Caution is expressed regarding the limits of this type of work.

In other cases, in fact, new parts have been treated as "neutral," clearly distinguishing modern intervention, such as the large portal structure of the Gur-Emir complex. Limited repairs have been carried out in Shakhi-Zinda, which has preserved its historic authenticity, but the ensemble is in urgent need of consolidation and repair (obviously to be done with great care and following internationally accepted guidelines).

On the question of integrity, which is essential in the case of a historic town, the situation is complex. The different historic phases of Samarkand's development from Afrosiab to the Timurid city and then to the 19th century development have taken place by side rather than on top of each other.

This core area is surrounded by a more recent development. Afrosiab has been partly excavated, and the Timurid city could be conserved as a living historic urban area. The latter has lost some of its medieval features, such as the city walls and the citadel, as well as parts of the traditional residential structures in areas surrounding major monuments. Nevertheless, it still contains a substantial urban fabric of traditional Islamic quarters, with some fine examples of traditional houses.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

The site of Uzbekistan was first proposed for nomination in 1990, but it was deferred because some major monuments had not been included in the proposal. The site was again proposed in 1991, and the Bureau again deferred consideration, proposing that only Muslim monuments be included in the proposal. The site was visited by an ICOMOS expert in November 1991. ICOMOS recognized the potential universal value of the site, noting that the designation should focus on the Timurid achievements and the pattern of survival of the capital city of Tamurlane. In respect of the current nomination, a new ICOMOS mission will visit the site in April 2001. ICOMOS has also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH) and other members.

Qualities

The historic town of Samarkand is well known from history as a symbol of ancient oriental culture. Although much has been lost in the past, the existing remains still retain a flavour that recalls the splendid past of the place. The Timurid architecture of the mosques, madrassahs, and mausolea is of fundamental importance to the history of Islamic art and architecture, leading to the achievements of the Safavids in Persia, the Moghuls in India, and even the Ottomans in Turkey. Even in its present state, the city represents documentary evidence of the development over several centuries, including the ancient civilizations represented in the area of Afrosiab and the scientific achievements of Ulugh Bek's Observatory.

The principal significance of the historic town of Samarkand relates to its being at the crossroads of different cultures and to its role in the development of Timurid architecture and building types. In this evolution the historic town should be seen as a whole rather than as a collection of separate monuments. Even though the residential part of the city obviously dates from the post-Timurid period, it does represent traditional continuity and qualities that are reflected in the neighbourhood structure, the small centres, mosques, and houses. Many houses retain painted and decorated interiors, grouped around courtyards and gardens. The medieval Timurid city should be seen as a fundamental part of the integrity of the place, a setting and a support to the value of the ancient monuments. ICOMOS considers that Samarkand has the potential for inscription on the basis of criteria i, ii, and iv.

Comparative analysis

The significance of Timurid architecture (14th–15th centuries) should be seen as part of the chain of the cultural and architectural developments in Western and

Central Asia. Following in the footsteps of the great Seljuk builders (10th–13th centuries) of Isfahan, Tabriz, Bukhara, or Herat, the Timurids continued and enriched these building traditions, which were then further developed by the Safavids in Persia (eg the Meidan-Emam of Isfahan, inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1979: criteria i, v, vi) and by the Moghuls in India (eg the Taj Mahal (1983: i).

Of the other Uzbek sites, the historic centre of Itchan-kala (1990: iii, iv, v) is distinguished by its medieval fortress in the form of a rectangle, which is exceptionally well preserved. The Historic Centre of Bukhara (1993: ii, iv, vi) was the second largest city in the Timurid period, but its main development was in the 16th and 17th centuries when it became capital of the Sheibanid city state. The historic centre of Shakhrisyabz (2000: iii, iv) was a minor centre during the Timurid period in the 15th century. All three centres have ancient origins; they developed in the Islamic period, were devastated by the Mongols, and were then revived. In this context, the role of Samarkand is significant as the most important cultural capital of the Timurid period in the 14th and 15th centuries; it not only absorbed ideas but also enriched and contributed to such traditions. Its fame as an icon of an Oriental city is an important indication of its influence.

ICOMOS recommendations

The importance of Samarkand is recognized. However, it is noted that an historic town is an intricate compound of different elements, as stated in the 1976 UNESCO *Recommendation regarding historic areas* (paragraph 3): "Every historic area and its surroundings should be considered in their totality as a coherent whole whose balance and specific nature depend on the fusion of the parts of which it is composed and which include human activities as much as the buildings, the spatial organization and the surroundings."

Considering that Samarkand is proposed as a historic place related to the crossing and synthesis of world cultures, it is all the more relevant that due consideration be given not only to a selection of monuments but to the historic site as a whole. It is unfortunate that several areas surrounding major monuments such as Registan, Bibi-Khanum, and Gur-Emir have suffered losses. Nevertheless, considering that most of the traditional urban fabric is still intact, serious consideration should be given to its future protection and conservation as an essential part of the significance of the historic town.

While recognizing the outstanding universal value of Samarkand, ICOMOS recommends that the nomination be redefined including the archaeological area of Afrosiab, the medieval Timurid city, and relevant parts of the 19th century development in a single large buffer zone. The nominated units within this buffer zone should be identified as compounds that include relevant parts of their surroundings.

Consequently, coherent urban conservation and planning policy should be developed for the management of the whole historic town (including the nominated areas and the buffer zone). Such a master plan should provide for an integrated conservation strategy for the existing residential quarters, as well as for the sympathetic reintegration and rehabilitation of the surrounding areas that have previously been demolished. The large-scale urban planning schemes, such as the

proposed "Project for the reconstruction of the central part of Samarkand" should be reviewed in this light. Any further demolition of traditional housing areas should be avoided and measures should be taken to encourage their sustainable development and rehabilitation as part of the whole. Furthermore, ICOMOS draws attention to the need to review the issues of authenticity and integrity in the light of accepted international principles and guidelines within the framework of the World Heritage Convention.

Brief description

The historic town of Samarkand is defined as the crossing and synthesis of world cultures. Developed from the 7th century BCE in the area of Afrosiab, Samarkand had its most significant development in the Timurid period from the 14th to the 15th centuries. The major monuments include the Registan mosque and madrassahs, the Bibi-Khanum Mosque, the Shakhi-Zinda compound, and the Gur-Emir ensemble, as well as Ulugh-Bek's Observatory.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That the nomination should be *referred back* to the State Party in order to redefine the nominated site and its buffer zone, aiming at a more unified proposal, taking into consideration the whole Timurid town, the archaeological area, Ulugh-Bek's Observatory, and the 19th century development. ICOMOS further recommends that the State Party should provide protection and a coherent conservation master plan for the historic town as a whole as well as preparing a strategy for the restoration of historic buildings, consistent with the principles guiding the implementation of the World Heritage Convention. ICOMOS additionally proposes that the title of the nominated property might be simplified to "Samarkand – crossroads of culture."

Under these conditions, ICOMOS recommends the inscription of the site on the basis of *criteria i, ii, and iv*:

The historic town of Samarkand has been considered a symbol of ancient oriental cultures. It has been an important crossroads of ancient civilizations, documented in the archaeological area of Afrosiab and the Timurid city. The principal development of the city coincides with the 14th and 15th centuries, when it was the capital of the powerful Timurid realm. The contribution of the Timurid masters to the design and construction of the Islamic ensembles, such as Bibi Khanum Mosque and Registan Square, have been crucial for the development of Islamic architecture, exercising an important influence in the entire region, from the Near and Middle East to India.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Chiloé Churches (Chile)

No 971

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The churches of Chiloé
<i>Location</i>	Municipalities of Castro, Chonchi, Dalcahue, Puqueldón, Quemchi, and Quinchao, Chiloé Province, X Region de los Lagos
<i>State Party</i>	Chile
<i>Date</i>	24 June 1999 and 23 June 2000

Introduction

This property was inscribed on the World Heritage List at the 23rd Session of the World Heritage Committee in Cairns (Australia) in December 2000. As a result of an administrative error, ICOMOS did not include in its evaluation two churches, those of Caguach and Chelín, which the State Party had requested should be added to the original group of fourteen.

ICOMOS has subsequently studied the detailed documentation for both churches supplied in June 2000 by the State Party.

Additional properties

The two churches are on two small islands to the west of the main island of Chiloé in the archipelago of the same name.

The church of *Caguach* is in the village at the extreme southern end of this small rocky island, where some of the most ancient traditions in the region are preserved. The village is tranquil apart from on two short each year, in August and January, when the Festival of Jesus the Nazarene, which is of great significance in Chile, takes place and there are many pilgrims and other visitors. The original church, dating from 1782, was completely destroyed by fire in 1919 during one of the festivals. The five island communities united in reconstructing it in its original form

The church is an imposing structure, built entirely of wood, on an impressive site on the spacious esplanade leading down to the harbour. It measures 16.8m by 47.75m and is clad in larch shingles, which shows some indications of having been painted at one time; it is roofed with larch shingles, as is the tower (23.9m high). There is a portico 2.5m deep with six square-section pillars, again made of larch. Unlike the other churches in this group, it has a wooden railing in front of the porch to keep animals out.

In the interior the spacious nave is defined by two rows of eight cylindrical columns and is barrel-vaulted. The vaulting

has some unusual structural features that are not to be found in the other churches of the group. The two narrow but lofty side aisles have flat ceilings; each ends in a subsidiary altar. The central feature of the main altar is the statue of *El Nazareno de Caguach*, the object of veneration at the twice-yearly religious festivals, which was brought there in 1778.

The church of *Chelín* is located on the even smaller island of that name (11.3km²), which lies to the north-east of Caguach. There was some form of chapel there at least as early as 1734. As in virtually all the churches of this group, that of Chelín commands the small harbour at the southern end of the island; however, the village itself is located a short way inland.

The church is of more modest proportions than that of Caguach, measuring 30m by 11.8m, but resembles it closely in form and materials. The larch cladding of the walls and tower is in the form of planking instead of shingles, but these are used for roofing. There is more colour than at Caguach, however: there is a blue and green frieze above the portico, the interior of which is painted in yellow and blue, whilst the two rows of nine wooden columns flanking the nave are painted to resemble marble.

Management and conservation

Legal status

Like the other fourteen churches, those of Caguach and Chelín belong to the Ancud Diocese of the Roman Catholic church, which is an entity in public law and enjoys a special legal status under the Chilean Civil Code.

Management

Direct management of the nominated churches is the responsibility of the Ancud diocesan administration and the local communities. Each church has its own chapel committee, a tradition that goes back to the work of the *fiscales* appointed by the Jesuits, the lay members of which are responsible for different aspects of the management and conservation of the church.

Conservation history

Because of the close identification of the local communities with their churches from the outset, something which has continued uninterrupted to the present day, it may justly be claimed that these churches have been conserved continuously since they were built. Over the past three decades their inscription on the national register of historic monuments has ensured that conservation and restoration interventions are now carried out in accordance with the highest modern professional and scientific principles.

Qualities

The group of churches founded by the Peripatetic Mission in the Chiloé Archipelago in the 17th century is remarkable testimony to the missionary zeal and skill of the Society of Jesus and to the effectiveness of its policy of fostering community development and participation. In the materials of which they were built and the techniques of construction and decoration employed the churches represent the harmonious fusion of indigenous and European cultural and religious traditions.

The churches of Caguach and Chelín complement those already inscribed on the List because of their remoteness, on two small islands, and, in the case of Caguach, because of its high religious significance in the region.

Recommendation

That the inscribed property of the Churches of Chiloé be *extended* to cover the churches of Caguach and Chelín.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Yungang Grottoes (China)

No 1039

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Yungang Grottoes
<i>Location</i>	Datong City, Shanxi Province
<i>State Party</i>	The People's Republic of China
<i>Date</i>	29 June 2000

Justification by State Party

An early masterpiece of Chinese cave art, the Yungang Grottoes are an important component of cave art not only for China but for the world. They belong to the period between the mid 5th and early 6th centuries (the early years of the reign of Emperor Heping and the era of Emperor Zhengguang of the Northern Wei Dynasty). The cutting of the grottoes started in 460 CE; it was intensively carried out till 490, and lasted until 520 CE. The exquisite carvings cover a large surface area and deal with a rich variety of themes. The statues are made in a typical Imperial style. The Yungang grottoes are different from other grottoes cut earlier in China and are characterized by their integration in the distinctive processes of nationalization across China, developing a style of their own in Chinese cave art. The large number of images and written records in the Yungang Grottoes are key elements in showing the development and changes of style in Chinese cave art and the religious beliefs in northern China during the mid 5th and early 6th centuries CE, and made major contributions to the innovation and development of Chinese cave art. They have a historical, artistic, scientific, and appreciative value irreplaceable by any other grottoes cut earlier in China.

The Yungang Grottoes are one of the great treasure houses of ancient statuary in the world. The site has 252 caves and niches, containing over 51,000 statues; the over 18,000m² of carved surface extending for 1km. The grottoes are the most important testimony of the highest quality of artistic achievement of Chinese Buddhist carving art in the second half of the 5th century CE. Various caves contain majestic statues or have decorations that are world-famous in their bright colours and in their important and even rare themes.

The Yungang Grottoes have made important contributions to the reform and development of cave art, regarding laws of aesthetics in religious art in the language of carving. They are an excellent example of the development and transition of the Buddhist art of India and Central Asia (the Gandhara and Mathura art of ancient India) into the Buddhist art of China in the short time-span of 30 years. These transitions include

various aspects of forms, themes, and concepts that reflect the aesthetic and ethical values of Chinese culture. So far as their artistic style is concerned, they reveal a marked revolution of localization of the styles of foreign statuary.

The Yungang Grottoes stand as a special evidence to the great blending of the Chinese nation in the 5th century CE, and an outstanding representative of the rooting of early Buddhist art in the central areas of China. Datong was not only one of the biggest metropolitan centres in the world of the 5th century CE, but also a hub for the absorption of culture and art from India and other Central Asian countries, and the blending of the cultures and arts of the various states in the Western regions and those of the various nationalities living in various Chinese regions with a highly developed economy and culture.

The Yungang Grottoes are the best works produced during the second period of the prosperity of Buddhist cave art in the world. The Five Caves, cut by Tan Yao, an eminent monk, to symbolize Emperor Dao Wu, Emperor Ming Yuan, Emperor Tai Wu, Emperor Jingmu, and Emperor Wen Cheng of the Northern Wei Dynasty have tried to bring out, in artistic form, the magnificent, simple, and vigorous appearance of the statues, and to impart, in religion, thinking about the perpetuity of Buddhist law.

Criteria i, ii, iii, and iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

Datong, known as Pingcheng in ancient times, became the capital of the Northern Wei Dynasty between 398 and 494 CE, and thus the political, economic, and cultural centre of their kingdom. It kept its importance up to 523, when it was deserted following to a revolt. The statues of the Yungang Grottoes were completed in the span of 60 years (460–525 CE); this period marks the peak of development in Buddhist cave art of the Northern Wei Dynasty. When the first emperor assumed the throne, Buddhism flourished and in 460 the monk Tan Yao started the carving of the Five Caves; since then, these grottoes became the centre of Buddhist art in North China. Between 471 and 494 worshipping Buddha was diffused among the imperial members and nobles. Thus, as many as 12 large caves and as many as 70% of the total number of the big caves were dug and Chongfu Temple was built. By 525 CE the initial project, sponsored by the court, was mostly completed, but low-ranking officials and monks continued to dig more caves and carve statues. These caves are more than 200 in number; although they are relatively small, some are of excellent quality. During the Liao Dynasty, wooden shelter structures were built in front of the caves, turning the grottoes into temple buildings, such as the Ten Famous Temples. In 1122 CE, these temples were destroyed in a war. Four-storeyed wooden-structured garrets, each with five rooms, were constructed in front of Caves 5 and 6, and three-storeyed structures with three rooms each were in front of Cave 7 in 1651 CE. Since the foundation of

the People's Republic of China in 1949, the major caves and the wooden structures in front of them (caves 5, 6, and 7) have all been conserved. The grottoes are protected and are open to the public.

Description

The Yungang Grottoes, known as Wuzhoushan Grottoes in ancient times, are located on the southern foot of the Wuzhou Mountains, in the Shi Li River valley, 16km west of Datong City. They consist of 252 caves of various sizes housing more than 51,000 statues; the site extends much as 1km east-west. Three main periods can be identified in the construction: the early period (460–65 CE), the middle period (c 471–94 CE), and the late period (494–525 CE). The nominated area is about 350ha and the buffer zone is 850ha. Apart from the grottoes, the nominated core area includes the remains of a castle, a defence wall, and a beacon tower of the Ming Dynasty on the plain above the grottoes. In front of the grottoes, in the river valley, there are some recent constructions, including offices and tourism facilities. To the east of the core area (within the second protection zone), there is a workers' village. In the north-western part of the buffer zone, there are the Wuguantun coal mines. Other mines and villages exist to the east outside the protection area.

The grottoes of the *early period* (460–65 CE) are composed of five main caves (16–20); these magnificent and simple caves were dug under the direction of the monk Tan Yao and are named after him. For the layout of the grottoes, large caves were dug to house the giant statues (13–15m tall). They have a U-shaped plan and arched roofs, imitating the thatched sheds in ancient India. Each cave has a door and a window. The central images have tall bodies and occupy the major part of the caves, while on the outer walls a thousand Buddhist statues are carved, a feature rarely seen in the tradition of Chinese history of grotto carving. Buddhas of the past, present, and future, a thousand Buddhas standing together, are the dominating subject matter. The styles of the statuary reflect some of the characteristics of the Liangzhou Grottoes and the Gandhara and Mathura statues, demonstrating a strong foreign flavour, especially in clothing and jewellery. For the human forms, features of the ethnic groups (tall, robust, powerful) living in northern China at that time may have been imitated, thus creating a new model for Buddhist statuary.

The grottoes of the *middle period* (c 471–94 CE) are located in the east and in the middle of the grotto area. They form the essence of the Yungang Grottoes, consisting of large caves, including four groups of twin caves (caves 1 & 2; 5 & 6; 7 & 8; 9 & 10) and one group of triple caves (caves 11–13). Cave 3, the biggest cave of the site, was mainly carved in this period (with the exception of the three statues of the Tang Dynasty). In this period there was a rapid development of the Han style and many new subject matters and combinations of statues were introduced, shifting the attention to creation of law-enforcing images and various kinds of adornment; thus the Buddhist cave art of Indian origin developed into a local art. These caves are square in plan, usually with chambers both in front and in the rear. Some caves have so-called *stupa* pillars, carved out of rock, in the centre and others can have ritual passageways carved in the rear wall. In caves with a square plan, carvings on the walls are divided into upper and lower bands and right and left sections. Level caisson ceilings are carved on the roofs in most cases. On both sides

of the outer walls, there are high double-floored attics, and monuments stand high in the centre of the courtyard. The shelters in the style of wooden structures are supported by octagonal pillars, each carved with a thousand Buddhas. The walls inside the caves are covered by long rolls of paintings divided into different layers and columns. All these reflect the layouts and traditional arrangements of halls in vogue in China during the Han Dynasty. The themes of the statues are varied: prominence is given to Sakyamuni, Maitreya, Prabhutaratna, Manjusri, and Vimalakirti and various moments of the life and activities of Buddha. Much attention is given to vestiary: there are thousands of statues of dignified and amiable Buddha, elegant deities, heavenly kings, powerful warriors, and lively flying *apsaras*, all reflecting the social background and characteristics of the period, and also gradual maturing in the style and skill of carving.

The grottoes of the *late period* (494–525 CE) are located in the west of the grotto area, mainly Caves 21–45, Cave 4, those in the Dragon King Temple Valley between Caves 4 and 5, the small niches in the cliffs of Caves 11–13 and also Caves 14 and 15. In total, over 200 caves and niches were cut in this period. These caves are of medium and small sizes with varied and complicated irregular shapes. Decorations were also carved on the cliff around the door of the caves. There is a tendency towards simplification of the contents of the statuary and stylizing the forms, but with a new look of delicacy and gracefulness. Apart from Buddha in seated position, Buddhas were carved sitting face to face and warriors were carved at the cave door.

After the completion of the construction of the grottoes, there were various events that affected the site. At the time Emperor Chongxi and Emperor Qingning of the Liao Dynasty (1049–60) there was an important project including the construction of the so-called Ten Temples of Yungang, in front of a series of caves, but these were destroyed by fire in 1122. In the period of Emperor Shunzhi of the Qing Dynasty (1651 CE), funds were raised for the construction of wooden garrets in Caves 5 and 6, resulting in the creation of the Ancient Temple of the Grotto Statues. During the same dynasty, several efforts were made to rebuild the shelters of some caves, to carve and re-paint some statues. The period also includes some inscriptions.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Yungang Grottoes are owned by the People's Republic of China. In 1961 the Grottoes were declared a major cultural heritage site to be protected at the national level. The site was listed as a special place open to overseas tourists in 1983 (like the Imperial Palace, the Great Wall, and the Dunhuang Grottoes) and was included in the State plan on tourism.

In 1997, the municipal government promulgated the Regulations of Datong City on the Protection and Management of the Yungang Grottoes, the first local regulations in China for the protection of major cultural heritage areas, giving an important contribution to the protection and management of the Yungang Grottoes.

The site has different degrees of protection: a. the key area includes the grottoes, the Ming structures on the plain, and

an area in front of the caves in the river valley; b. an outer protection area, including an area of controlled reconstruction; and c. a buffer zone surrounding the area, which includes parts of the plain north and south of the river. Each area is protected according to various civic, cultural, environmental, and urban planning laws and regulations. The regulations concern density, height, content, form, and size of the buildings and settlements.

The boundary of the site has been identified both above the ground and underground, taking into account the fact that Datong is a major coal-producing area and there are mines around the site. In an area of 300m from the outer protection area, any mining is banned with a collapse angle of 70 degrees.

The rural villages and buildings near the site have a total of 1700 inhabitants, and there are some 2300 employees. The villages do not present a hazard to the protection of the site, but the general policy is to encourage removal of population to other areas and to ban any new arrivals. All buildings in the neighbourhood, which could be considered to disturb the scenery of the site, will eventually be removed.

Management

In 1952 a special organization was set up for the conservation of the grottoes, now known as the Yungang Grottoes Institute of Shanxi. This institute has organized a systematic survey and documentation of the site and the statuary between 1973 and 1999, and has set up an office for reception and publicity for the site, together with the necessary staff and professionally trained guides. Tourist facilities have been set up in various key areas of the site, as well as other services such as offices, a laboratory, a projection room, and guest rooms. The Yungang Grottoes Institute of Shanxi pays special attention to promoting the coordinated development of tourism in order to prevent unfavourable influences on the cultural heritage. The number of visitors has varied from year to year: it has been above 200,000 per year since 1980. Safety precautions are taken to avoid any damage caused by visitors in peak periods. The Grottoes are open to the public and the government promotes the site in the media. In the past decade, a highway and a coal transportation road have been re-routed to avoid pollution to the site.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

There are records indicating that some of the grottoes were rebuilt in 640 CE during the Tang Dynasty. According to another source, the monk Yan restored the old statues every time he went to Heng'an. A massive project was launched between 1049 and 1060 CE and the so-called Ten Temples of the Yungang were built in the areas linking the front of the caves with the cliffs. These temples were destroyed in a fire in 1122 CE. An inscription discovered in Cave 13 indicates the restoration of 1876 statues during the Liao Dynasty. There are indications such as holes on the cliff or stylistic clues that some restoration works were carried out during the Liao and Jin dynasties. In 1651 CE funds were raised to rebuild wooden attics with four storeys and five rooms in Caves 5 and 6, as well as some side halls, passageways, and gates in order to create the Ancient Temple of the Grotto Statues. During the Qing Dynasty efforts were made to

rebuild the shelters of some caves and re-carve and repaint some statues. The bright colours in Caves 5, 6, and 9–13 indicate such repainting.

A few of the caves have suffered damage such as collapse of the rock of the front walls, weathering of the carved details, or damage to the limbs of statues. Because of being built in sandstone, there has been weathering due to water erosion, and there are cracks in the ceilings and back walls of most caves. These have been sealed, but seepage continues to occur in some caves in rain seasons. Problems exist particularly in the northern part of the caves, ie against the hillside. In spite of many efforts, new technology needs to be developed to solve this problem which is due to a multiplicity of causes. An additional problem on the site is caused by pollution from the industrial areas of Datong, an industrial city using coal as a fuel as well as from the truck traffic from the coal mines, which used to pass in front of the caves. As a result, coal dust has deposited on the statues. Measures have already been taken in order to correct this problem and a new road has been built elsewhere, thus considerably reducing the dust in the area. The nearest mine to the north-west of the caves has been closed.

From 1950 to 1973 conservation work concentrated on monitoring the climatic conditions in the caves and their study, survey, and documentation. There has been some rescue work on various statues and caves, as well as grouting and solving problems related to water infiltration. From 1974 to 2000 work focused on reinforcing the caves, re-attaching fallen parts, filling and consolidating the cracks, and controlling and monitoring climatic changes. The area is subject to great changes in temperature (-25 +37), and the average relative humidity is 50–90%. Datong is in a seismic area and it is exposed to Mongolian sandstorms. In fact, planting trees has been useful in reducing the sandstorm damage. There has been collaboration with the Getty Conservation Institute and the Geology Institute of Giessen University, Germany, in the studying and monitoring the climate.

The Plan for the Development of the Yungang Grottoes, implemented in 2000, and the Ten-Year Programme for the Development of Yungang Grottoes have aimed at strengthening the management structures and improving the protection, study, presentation, promotion, and conservation of the site. The programme also includes raising awareness of the local people. The protection of cultural heritage and the environment and the development of the local economy have been considered as parts of a coordinated management effort of the site. Taking into account the various problems of the context, the grottoes in a fairly good condition and can be considered to be some of the best preserved examples of Chinese cave art.

Authenticity and integrity

The caves and statues of the Yungang Grottoes have retained their historical authenticity, although they have been subject to repairs and restorations in the centuries subsequent to their construction. These include the construction of wooden temple fronts, such as the Ten Temples in the 12th century, destroyed in fire soon afterwards, and other structures in the 17th century. The more recent works have mainly focused on the conservation of the statues, consolidation of the grottoes, and the improvement of management. Nevertheless, most of the statues and grottoes date from the original construction in the 4th and 5th centuries. Most of the statues have retained

their original colour scheme, though some statues were repainted in the 17th century. Subsequent interventions have not made substantive alterations to this heritage. The site can therefore be considered to satisfy the requirements of the test of authenticity and integrity.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February-March 2001.

Qualities

Buddhist art was introduced from India to China in the 3rd century CE, and it reached its greatest development here in the period from the 5th to the 7th centuries, during the Northern Wei and Tang Dynasties. The Yungang Grottoes are considered to be the classical masterpiece of the first peak in Chinese history, and an outstanding example of the second period. The statues of the Five Caves built by Tan Yao (Caves 16–20), the first to be carved in Yungang, including the statue of "Buddha in the Open," represent the integration of the Gandhara and Mathura art of ancient India with Chinese concepts. This is the first large group of grottoes cut under government control, in part reflecting Chinese imperial policies and in part representing an acceleration of the process of integrating Buddhist art into Chinese heritage.

Comparative analysis

Three sites of Buddhist cave art have so far been inscribed on the World Heritage List in China: Mogao Caves (inscribed 1987: criteria i, ii, iii, iv, v, vi), Longmen Grottoes (2000: i, ii, iii), and the Dazu Rock Carvings (1999: i, ii, iii). Buddhist cave sites have also been inscribed in India: Ajanta Caves (1983: i, ii, iii, vi), Ellora Caves (1983: i, iii, vi), and Elephanta Caves (1987: i, iii); others are in Sri Lanka – the *Golden Temple of Dambulla* (1991: i, vi) – and in the Republic of Korea – *Sokkuram Grotto* (1995: i, iv).

The Chinese caves are distinguished from the other Asian sites because of their particular qualities, resulting from integration with Chinese culture and local characteristics. The earliest caves are those in Mogao, which range from the 4th to the 14th centuries, integrating influences through the Silk Road connections. The Longmen Grottoes start in 495 and continue till the mid 8th century; they perpetuate the style of Yungang, though the sculptures are stylized, showing a hierarchical verticality, and the bas-reliefs are softer in character. The Dazu caves represent a relatively late period from the end of the 9th to 13th centuries.

The Yungang Grottoes represent a turning point in Chinese cave art, due to numerous new factors. They differ from the other Chinese regions, such as Mogao, which have strong influences from India and Central Asia. While developing a century later (starting in 460) than the Mogao caves, Yungang distinguishes itself by being the first imperial commission in China, and thus clearly reflecting the political ambitions of the time. The decoration represents one of the first manifestations in China of the Buddhist art that the Tuoba tribe (who founded the Northern Wei Dynasty and chose Datong as their capital) brought from Central Asia and India through Gandhara. The first period of Yungang represents the classical representation of cave art in China,

and the middle period is also an outstanding example of that particular epoch.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The State Party is encouraged to monitor the situation within and around the site of the Yungang Grottoes, particularly regarding mining activities, pollution, and the development of tourism. It is recommended that a long-term comprehensive preservation programme should be prepared with clearly formulated objectives to eliminate and mitigate the hazards caused by deterioration.

Brief description

The Yungang Grottoes, in Datong, with their 252 caves and 51,000 statues, represent the outstanding achievement of Buddhist cave art in China in the 5th and 6th centuries. The Five Caves created by Tan Yao are a classical masterpiece of the first peak of Chinese art, with a strict unity of layout and design.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, iii, and iv*:

The Yungang Grottoes were built in a relatively short time (460–525 CE) and constitute a classical masterpiece of the first peak of Buddhist cave art in China. The site integrates influences from southern and central Asian regions with Chinese culture. It is distinguished by being the first Imperial commission in China, reflecting the political ambitions of the time. Yungang also gives this art a clearly Chinese and local spirit, which was important for the later artistic developments in the country.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Norbulingka (China)

No 707ter

Identification

Nomination The Expanded Potala Palace – Norbulingka – Jokhang Monastery Project in Lhasa: Norbulingka

Location Province, autonomous region or municipality directly under the central government of Lhasa, Tibet Autonomous Region

State Party The People's Republic of China

Date 30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

In history, Norbulingka, since its construction by the seventh Dalai Lama in the 18th century, was the habitual residence of successive Dalai Lamas and was known as the Summer Palace. From the third to ninth month of the Tibetan calendar each year, the Dalai Lama moved to live in Norbulingka from the Potala Palace, and all the major functioning departments of the local Tibetan government also moved to work in Norbulingka. Like the Potala Palace and the Jokhang Monastery, Norbulingka exerted a significant influence over the history, society, and culture of Tibet.

The architecture of Norbulingka is a masterpiece of Tibetan arts, combining unique architecture, religious traditions, and gardening. Its architecture mainly follows the Tibetan style, and at the same time it also incorporates many architectural elements of the palace and garden architecture of other ethnic groups, including the Han.

From the overall layout of Norbulingka to the indoor decorations of single buildings, as well as the handling of some wooden structural parts, it shows the inheritance of fine traditional techniques and also influences received from elsewhere in architecture and the layout and local handling methods of garden architecture. It reflects the development of architecture, technology, and social productivity in Tibet, expressed in the Tsoje Palace, the Dragon Palace, as well as the Tagtan Migyur Palace, built under the supervision of Taring Jigme Songtsan Wangbo.

Norbulingka is a large garden located at a very high altitude. At an elevation of 3,650m where the pressure is low and oxygen is lacking, it has a large man-made green area, a beautiful landscape, and an agreeable environment. It is an indisputable masterpiece of harmonious coexistence of man and nature at a high altitude, creating and maintaining sound ecological environment.

Norbulingka was an important residence of the Dalai Lamas in the past, and it is now used for various activities and the celebration of festivals, such as the Shoton Festival (sour milk drinking), the typical Tibetan operas from across the country, attended by farmers, herdsmen and pilgrims from Lhasa and elsewhere. It is the garden of Tibetan songs and dances.

The construction and development of Norbulingka was closely associated with well-known historic events, personalities and religious beliefs in the more than 200 years of history, such as the events related to the agreements signed by the Tibetan government and the Central People's government in the 1950s.

Criteria i, ii, iv, and vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

The site of Norbulingka was a place with gentle streams, dense and lush forest, birds, and animals known as *Lava tsel*. The 7th Dalai Lama is reported to have had health problems and he used to come here for a cure. The construction of Norbulingka started in 1751 with the Uya Palace, benefiting from financial assistance from the central government. Successive Dalai Lamas continued building pavilions, palaces, and halls, making it their summer residence, and soon the site became another religious, political, and cultural centre of Tibet, after the Potala Palace. The Gesang Palace was built in 1755 and included a court for debates. The Tsoje Palace and the Jensen Palace were built by the 13th Dalai Lama in the 1920s, influenced by his time in Beijing; the Gesang Deje Palace was constructed in 1926. The Tagtan Migyur Palace was built in 1954–56 with the support from the Central People's Government. Since the departure of the 14th Dalai Lama in 1959, Norbulingka has been managed, first by the Culture Management Group under the Preparatory Committee of the Autonomous Region and later directly by the Cultural Management Committee and Bureau.

Description

Norbulingka is located at the bank of the Lhasa river about 2km west of the Potala Palace in Lhasa. The name means "treasure garden." In fact, the site consists of a large garden with several palaces, halls, and pavilions, amounting to some 36ha. The area is composed of five sections.

The GESANG PALACE group includes the *Uya Palace*, *Gesang Palace*, and *Komsom Selon* architecture. The Uya Palace is a two-storeyed Tibetan style building, and it has fine mural paintings by famous artists. The Komsom Selon is a two-storied pavilion with a Han-style golden roof, the place where Dalai Lama watched opera performances.

The second group is related to the TSOJE PALACE, including the *Tsoje Palace* (Palace in the Lake), *Lokang* (Dragon Palace), *Lukhangsha* (East Dragon Palace), the *Druzing Palace*, and lounges. The Tsoje Palace itself is waterside pavilion architecture, representing the Han style with hip-

and-gable roof, gabled ridge, and overhanging corners. Lokang was a place for sacrificial activities, held yearly for the dragon and fortune-telling.

The third group consists of the *Jensen Palace*, the *Gesang Deje Palace*, and the *Chimi Chogyal Palace*. The Jensen Palace is noted for its fine carvings, identical with those in the White Palace of the Potala Palace area.

The fourth group consists mainly of the *Shabucho Monastery*, the former offices of the local Tibetan government and secretariat.

The fifth group is composed of the *Tagtan Migyur Palace* (New Palace), including a small scripture hall on the second floor, with murals depicting Tibetan history (301 pictures). It is the most representative modern example in Tibet, originally with finely decorated features, and adapted to office use, recreation, and vocation.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The site is in the ownership by the People's Republic of China. It has been designated as a major site of protection for its historical and cultural value, at the national level, on 13 January 1988. Protection is thus subject to the laws and regulations of the People's Republic of China (especially the Law on the Protection of Cultural Heritage), and the Regulations of Tibet Autonomous Region on the Protection and Management of Cultural Heritage. The principal protection area is defined by the surrounding wall of Norbulingka; the area within 200m from this wall is a construction-control zone. Funds are allocated yearly for maintenance and protection.

Management

The management of the site is in the hands of the State Administration of Cultural Heritage of the People's Republic of China, the Department of Culture of the Tibet Autonomous Region, and the Administration of Cultural Heritage of the Tibet Autonomous Region.

Management is exercised within the framework of two master plans, the Urban Plan of Lhasa and the Norbulingka Protection Plan. Local government and residents are not allowed to undertake any construction, renovation, or addition within the protective zone. In exceptional cases, if any change is required, authorization is given by the relevant authorities after an opinion by experts.

There is a management office on the site, also responsible for visitor management and tour guides. The number of visitors is increasing amounting to 100,000 in 1999. The site is located in a new urban area of Lhasa, where there are several hotels and visitor services.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The construction history extends from the mid 18th century until the 1950s, when the Dalai Lama departed. Since then the site has been under the care, first of a local management group, then of the Central People's Government.

Authenticity and integrity

The group of buildings and the surrounding garden of Norbulingka have been well maintained and have had no major modifications or damage. Their authenticity and integrity are therefore intact.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in March 2001.

Qualities

The palace and garden areas of Norbulingka are intimately linked with the Potala Palace, despite having been built later and taking up complementary functions. It became the summer residence of the Dalai Lamas because of its favourable climate, almost as an oasis in the otherwise harsh climate of the high altitude. The constructions represent high quality in their design and execution, integrated into the garden layout. The site is also closely linked with religious and political issues, having been a place for contemplation and for signing political agreements.

As already indicated in the ICOMOS evaluation of the Potala Palace, Norbulingka will be an important integration to the existing World Heritage site.

ICOMOS proposes that the previous criteria i, iv, and vi be retained in the extended nomination, in the light of the highly creative and artistic ensemble, the fact that it represents an outstanding example of a type of architecture, and its strong spiritual and religious associations with Buddhism.

Comparative analysis

The Potala Palace area can be considered unique in the Buddhist world of eastern Asia, as the long-time residence of the theocratic government of Tibet.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The current nomination is an extension to the Potala Palace nomination of 1994 (criteria i, iv, and vi). It is a follow-up to the ICOMOS recommendation, which considered the Potala Palace to be inseparably linked in spiritual and historical terms with the Tsuklakhang Temple and the holy city of Lhasa itself and proposed that the Government of the People's Republic of China should give consideration to an eventual extension of the Potala Palace nomination to include the whole area.

ICOMOS recommends that the name of the nomination be reconsidered, taking into account the previous site (the Potala Palace, Lhasa) and the extension, *The Historic Ensemble of Potala Palace, Lhasa*.

Considering the development pressures in the city of Lhasa, ICOMOS recommends that particular attention be given to mitigating changes, particularly in the area extending from the Norbulingka Palace to the properties already inscribed.

Recommendation

That the nominated Norbulingka area be inscribed as an extension to the existing World Heritage Site of the Potala Palace, Lhasa, maintaining the existing criteria i, iv, and vi.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Troodos (Cyprus)

No. 351bis

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Painted churches in the Troodos region: Palaichori, Church of Ayia Sotira (Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour) – extension
<i>Location</i>	Troodos Region, Nicosia District
<i>State party</i>	Cyprus
<i>Date</i>	3 July 2000

Justification by State Party

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) in Palaichori belongs to the architectural type of the steep-pitched wooden roof with flat hooked tiles. This type of roofing over a Byzantine church is not found elsewhere, making the wooden-roofed churches of Cyprus a unique group example of religious architecture.

The wall paintings decorating the walls of the church are also of universal importance, dating back to the 16th century.

Criteria i, ii, iii, iv, and vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

Although the last line of the inscription indicating the date of construction and decoration of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) has been erased, research by specialists has enabled it to be dated to the beginning of the 16th century. As regards the wall paintings that decorate the interior of the church, comparative iconographic and stylistic studies with other churches in the region (Churches of the Holy Cross at Agiasmati, 1494; St Mamas at Louveras, 1495; St Sozomenus, 1513; the Archangel-Panagia Theotokos at Galata, 1514), have dated them to the second decade of the 16th century. At the beginning of the 17th century, a surrounding wall was built on the southern and western sides of the edifice.

Description

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour is a type of construction that is characteristic of the mountainous region of Troodos. It is a small building, rectangular in plan and with a small eastern apse, covered with a shingle roof. Niches have been cut into the side walls.

The church is particularly notable for its very rich wall paintings. On the side walls the paintings are arranged in two rows, while the western wall has three rows plus the gable. The New Testament scenes are arranged on the upper level and the large figures of saints decorate the lower part of the walls.

The New Testament cycle opens with the Annunciation on the eastern wall and continues on the western gable with the Crucifixion before ending with the Descent of the Holy Spirit on the north side.

Several New Testament scenes show the existence of relations between the painting of Cyprus and that of the Christian art of the West from a stylistic and iconographic viewpoint. In the Crucifixion, although the representation of the thieves harks back to the beginning of Byzantine art, some details recall western art. For the Resurrection, the painter uses the western iconography showing Christ emerging from the tomb and the three sleeping soldiers in the foreground. The architectural decoration in the background of several scenes, including the Meal at Abraham's dwelling reflects a certain Italian influence.

The apse houses the representation of the Last Supper, one of the masterly compositions of the church. Christ appears twice behind the table: on the left he gives bread to the twelve apostles, and on the right he gives wine, a scene from which Judas is excluded. Although the treatment of the draperies of the figures recalls that of 14th century painters, the unusual treatment of the faces with its diffused lighting effect lends a certain degree of emotion to the scene as a whole. In the Last Supper, the apostles are usually arranged in two groups of six on either side of Christ, and in Cyprus only two paintings survive in which the twelve apostles are shown twice, of which this is one. The other is in the Church of St Nicholas at Galataria, which is not in the group of churches already inscribed in the World Heritage List.

The scene of the *Thisia* (the Sacrifice) is unusual in that it shows the Christ Child both in the paten and in the chalice under the silk veil supported by two angels. In Byzantine art, the Christ Child usually only appears in one of the two sacred vessels.

The specific style of the wall paintings of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour which places it at the boundaries of the 16th century Cretan school of painting, as already indicated in case of the Last Supper, emerges more markedly in the figures of the saints in the lower row on the walls. Already at this point, however, the Virgin Mary in the apse vault is portrayed with greater simplicity, particularly as regards the treatment of her vestments, in which the complex and emphasized folds have been abandoned by comparison with paintings of the same subject in other churches in the Troodos region at the end of the 15th century (eg the Church of the Archangel Michael at Pedoulas, 1474). What is most

innovative, however, is the treatment of the Virgin's face, where the lighting is emphasized by delicate lines of white paint which radiate so as to create an expression of joy.

The faces of the saints in the lower rows in the church, such as those of St Anthony and St Andrew, are treated with great variety, as though they were portraits, using many white painted highlights.

Management and conservation

Legal status

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour is the property of the Church of Cyprus and the local Church Committee. Although private property, the church proposed for inclusion on the World Heritage List is listed as an Ancient Monument (N2/40) and protected under the provisions of the basic 1931 Law on Antiquities. This law states that any intervention requires approval by the competent authorities (Department of Antiquities, Ministry of Communication and Public Works). Severe penalties are imposed in the event of violation of the law.

Furthermore, the law stipulates that listed monuments must be surrounded by a zone in which the height and architectural style of any new construction is subject to control. The Department of Antiquities and the local authorities have already demolished a recent building in the vicinity of the church.

Management

The management of the nominated property proposed for inclusion is the responsibility of the Department of Antiquities of the Ministry of Communication and Public Works, in conjunction with the Church of Cyprus and the local Church Committee. The Department of Antiquities is responsible for repair work on the church and the preservation of the wall paintings.

Conservation and authenticity

Conservation history

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour has been in the care of the Department of Antiquities since 1935. Structural work has been carried out by the Department in conjunction with the competent religious authorities. Starting in 1963 specialists from the Department cleaned the paintings and undertook their conservation. Since that time other interventions have been carried out when they became necessary.

The church is currently in a good state of conservation. However, protective measures should be taken to cope with the increase in the number of visitors.

The improvement of the immediate environs of the church is covered by a Landscape Plan that is currently being prepared. This includes the development of an information centre, sanitary services, and signs for visitors. Implementation of the Plan will be the responsibility of the Department of Antiquities, the local Church Committee, the Church of Cyprus, and the local authorities.

The church has retained its original use as a place of worship and, although the number of visitors is not very large, protective measures should be taken to cope with an eventual increase.

Authenticity

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour meets the criterion of authenticity in its design, materials, execution, and function. Works needed for conservation of the structure and wall paintings have in no way affected the authenticity of the monument.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission from ICOMOS is to visit Cyprus in April 2001.

Characteristics

The remarkable post-Byzantine wall paintings of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) at Palaichori form a complete cycle of paintings from the second decade of the 16th century. They embody an iconography, style, and technique which stem from various sources and foreshadow, in certain of their characteristics, the 16th century Cretan school of painting. Through its architecture and its decoration this church forms a whole and completes the set of nine painted churches in the Troodos region already included in the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria ii, iii, and iv.

Comparative analysis

The specialists consulted by ICOMOS about this proposal for an extension of the painted churches of the region of Troodos have confirmed that in the region there is no other church from the start of the 16th century which is comparable with the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour at Palaichori.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

[This paragraph will be completed after the expert appraisal mission to take place in April 2001.]

Recommendation and statement of significance

Subject to a favourable mission report, it is recommended that this extension should be *approved*.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Mahabodhi Temple (India)

No 1056

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Mahabodhi Temple Complex at Bodh Gaya
<i>Location</i>	State of Bihar, Eastern India
<i>State Party</i>	India
<i>Date</i>	7 July 2000

Justification by State Party

The Mahabodhi Temple Complex in Bodha Gaya (Buddha-Gaya) has outstanding universal importance as it is the hallowed spot where the ascetic Prince Siddhartha attained Enlightenment and became Buddha. This site is believed to be one of the four significant sites in the life of Buddha, including *Lumbini* in Nepal, his birthplace, which is already in the World Heritage List, *Bodh Gaya*, where he attained the supreme and perfect insight, *Sarnath*, where he made his first sermon after Enlightenment, and *Kusinagar*, where he passed away.

The Mahabodhi Temple is a living monument where people from all over the world even today throng to offer their reverential prayers to the Buddha. The tradition of worship here has continued over the centuries, as is recorded in the pillar edicts of Asoka and is seen depicted in the sculpture in Sanchi and Bharhut, as well as reflected in the accounts by various travellers over the course of centuries, including the Chinese travellers of the 4th and 7th centuries. The site itself is an exceptional testimony of the importance given to it by pilgrims of various provenances through centuries. It is also a unique example of the efforts made by the devotees to preserve and conserve its legacy in time.

In the context of philosophical and cultural history, the Mahabodhi Temple Complex is of great relevance as it marks the most important event in the life of Buddha, an event that was to change the shape of human thought and belief. Bodh Gaya is the very cradle of Buddhism and compares as such with Jerusalem and Mecca, which are themselves the cradles of two great religions of the world.

Criterion vi

The grand 50m high Mahabodhi Temple of the 5th–6th centuries is of immense importance, being one of the earliest temple constructions existing in the Indian sub-continent. It is one of the few representations of the architectural genius of the Indian people in constructing fully developed brick temples in that era.

Criterion i

The Mahabodhi Temple is also important as it exhibits an important phase in the development of architecture. It is one of the very few well represented temple structures, and also the grandest one from a period of history when numerous such brick structures would have been built all over India. As such, it bears an exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition and to the prevalent forms of architecture in the late Gupta period (the "Golden Age" of Indian culture).

Criteria ii and iii

The sculpted stone railings (partly seen on the site and partly preserved in the nearby Archaeological Museum) are an outstanding example of the art and architecture of the period of Emperor Asoka (3rd century BCE) and soon thereafter. These railings also present some of the oldest sculptural reliefs found in the country. As there are few remnants of such railings, which were a very important feature of early Buddhist monuments of that time, these are of great importance.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

The Mahabodhi Temple in Bodh Gaya is the sacred place where Buddha (566–486 BCE), while seated under the Bodhi Tree, attained Enlightenment in 531 at the age of 35. Emperor Asoka made a pilgrimage to this spot around 260 BCE and built the first temple at the site of the Bodhi Tree, under which Buddha had meditated. This included a railing around the Tree and a small temple near it. He offered a *Vajrasana* (Diamond Throne), placed in the middle of the temple, at the place where Buddha was believed to have been sitting. The *Vajrasana* was unearthed during the excavations in 1863 and 1881. The clay plaque of Patna Museum has inscriptions of the 1st–2nd centuries CE showing that the Asoka temple had been replaced by a new temple. The Hindus built the stone railing with carvings of the image of sun god around the new temple. It seems that many additions and renovations to the complex were made in the 2nd century CE.

The earliest historical account of Mahabodhi Temple is by the Chinese traveller Fa-Hien in 404–5 CE. The main temple at the site and the Bodhi Tree are briefly mentioned in his account. According to him, a great pagoda was built on all the four important sites in the life of Buddha. In 637 CE, when another Chinese traveller Hiuen-Tsang came to the city of Bodh Gaya, he found the Bodhi Tree surrounded by strong walls. Within the walls, there was the grand Mahabodhi temple, 160ft (50m) tall, and a large fine sanctuary. He mentions the bluish bricks, plaster, niches containing gilded statues of Buddha, and many other details. In this period, the porch, the corner tower, and the high plinth were added to the main temple. Various parts of the existing temple have been dated, such as the railings (3rd or 1st century BCE) and the temple itself, which is from 450 or the 6th century CE.

There is only limited information about the repairs that have taken place from the 7th to 11th centuries, but it appears that extensive works would have been made by the Burmese in the 11th century. Other repairs are recorded in the 12th century. In the centuries following the Muslim conquest in the 13th century, the Mahabodhi Temple was deserted and gradually started falling into ruins. In the 19th century the Burmese kings started making repairs. The works were continued by the British in 1880–84. In 1949 the temple was protected by Bodh Gaya Temple Act and a restoration campaign was carried out in 1953–56, to be continued with further improvements in the following decades.

Description

The Mahabodhi Temple Complex is located in the very heart of the city of Bodh Gaya. The site proposed for inscription covers an area of 12 acres (c 4.8ha), consisting of the main temple and six sacred places within an enclosed area, and a seventh one, the Lotus Pond, just outside the enclosure to the south. Both the temple area and the Lotus Pond are surrounded by circulating passages at two or three levels. Surrounding the temple area, to the east, there is a Shiva temple under the control of a *Mahant*. The land to the south of the Temple Complex is the lowest in level and the Niranjana river flows in this area. In the north are some shops built by the District Administration. A hotel is under construction in the south-west corner of the Temple Complex. To the west, beyond the road, there is a mosque which, owing to the high ground and its height, competes with the main temple of the Temple Complex.

The Temple is enclosed by a boundary wall with an average height of 11m. The area of the ensemble is 5m below the level of the surrounding land. From the east a flight of steps leads down through a long central path to the main temple and the surrounding area. Along this path there are significant spots associated with events that immediately followed Buddha's Enlightenment, together with votive *stupas* and shrines.

The most important of the sacred spots is the giant Bodhi Tree (*Ficus religiosa*, known in India as the peepal tree). This tree is to the west of the main temple and is supposed to be a direct descendant of the original Bodhi Tree under which Buddha spent his FIRST WEEK and where he had his Enlightenment. To the north of the central path, on a raised area, is the *Animeshlochana Chaitya* (prayer hall) where Buddha is believed to have spent the SECOND WEEK. Buddha spent the THIRD WEEK walking eighteen paces back and forth in an area called *Ratnachakrama* (the Jewelled Ambulatory), which lies near the north wall of the main temple. Raised stone lotuses carved on a platform mark his steps. The spot where he spent the FOURTH WEEK is *Ratnagar Chaitya*, located to the north-east near the enclosure wall. Immediately after the steps of the east entrance on the central path, there is a pillar which marks the site of the *Ajapala Nigrodh* Tree, under which Buddha meditated during his FIFTH WEEK, answering the queries of Brahmans. He spent the SIXTH WEEK next to the Lotus Pond to the south of the enclosure, and the SEVENTH WEEK was spent under the *Rajyatana* Tree, to the south-east of the main temple, currently marked by a tree.

The MAIN TEMPLE, an ancient structure (5th–6th centuries CE), is 50m high and built in the classical style of Indian temple architecture. It has a low basement with mouldings decorated with honeysuckle and geese design. Above this is

a series of recessed niches containing images of Buddha in seated or standing position with various gestures. Further above there are mouldings and *chaitya* niches, and then the curvilinear *shikhara* or tower of the temple surmounted by *amalaka* and *kalasha* (architectural features in the tradition of Indian temples). At the four corners of the parapet of the temple are four statues of Buddha in small shrine chambers. A small tower is built above each of these shrines.

The temple has entrances from the east and from the north. It seems that the east entrance was constructed later; at the present time it is the main one. Although the temple area is 5m below the surrounding land, the photographs of 1863 show the main Temple on a high platform with an archway leading to it. The Temple faces east (the direction faced by Buddha while meditating) and consists of a small forecourt in the east with niches on either side containing statues of Buddha. A doorway leads into a small hall, beyond which lies the sanctum, which contains a gilded statue of the seated Buddha (over 5ft high) holding earth as witness to his achieved Enlightenment. Above the sanctum is the main hall with a shrine containing a statue of Buddha, where senior monks gather to meditate.

Next to the Bodhi Tree there is a place with a statue of Buddha that stands on a part of the polished sandstone *Vajrasana* (the Diamond Throne), originally installed by Emperor Asoka to mark the spot where Buddha sat and meditated. A sandstone railing once encircled this site under the Bodhi Tree, but only a few of the original pillars of the railing are still *in situ*; they contain carvings of sculpted human faces, animals, and decorative details. More granite pillars were added to enlarge the area in the 5th–6th centuries CE.

Further up the central path towards the main temple to the south is a small shrine with a standing Buddha in the back and with the footprints (*Padas*) of Buddha carved on black stone, dating from the 3rd century BCE, when Emperor Asoka declared Buddhism to be the official religion of the state and installed thousands of such footprint stones all over his kingdom. The gateway to the Temple, which is on the central path, was also originally built by this Emperor, but was later rebuilt. Further on the path towards the main temple is a building which houses several statues of Buddha and Bodhisattvas. Opposite this building is a memorial to a Hindu *Mahant* who had occupied this site during the 15th and 16th centuries. To the south of the pathway is a cluster of votive *stupas* built by kings, princes, noblemen, and lay people. They vary in shape and size, from the simplest to the most sumptuous ones.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Mahabodhi Temple is the property of the State Government of Bihar. On the basis of the Bodh Gaya Temple Act of 1949, the State Government is responsible for the protection, management, and monitoring of the Temple and its properties. The Act also makes provision for the Bodh Gaya Temple Management Committee (BTMC) and an Advisory Board by the Governor of Bihar, consisting of 20–25 members, half of them being from foreign Buddhist countries. There is a legal land act to protect the Temple's land from illegal constructions. All finds in the area are protected by the Treasure Trove Act of 1878. The Temple is

also protected by the Gaya Regional Development Authority (GRDA), which is responsible for the planned development of Bodh Gaya town and is advised by BTMC in matters relating to the Temple and its environs.

Management

The Bodh Gaya Temple Management Committee (BTMC), constituted in 1949, is the executive body for the management of the site; it works under the supervision, direction, and control of the State Government of Bihar. The Temple Complex is guarded by its own staff and the State Police collaborates in its protection. BTMC keeps a systematic and updated inventory of all the properties of the temple.

The sources of finance for the Temple come mainly from donations. The Committee raises funds by renting property and other means, which are sufficient for the management and maintenance of the site. For conservation work, expertise is given by various ministries.

The BTMC is expected to make provision for the better management of the Bodh Gaya Temple and properties appertaining to it. The nomination document indicates that there is no "property management plan" for the site, but there are plans and projects related to the redevelopment and the presentation of the Temple Complex and its setting. Basic monitoring and documentation of the buildings in the temple complex are carried out periodically. It is noted that the parking area has recently been moved away from the Temple Complex and there are plans to decongest the temple area.

In 1987 the conservation status of the Temple was examined by the National Research Laboratory for Conservation. In 1997 the Temple Advisory Board and the BTMC carried out a detailed survey of the site and drew up a Master Plan for the development of the Temple Complex and the area around the Temple, proposing to make a Meditation Park, a Museum of Buddhism, and a Reception and Information Centre. The plan further proposes to recreate the landscape of the area as it would have appeared in ancient times, together with lawns, flower beds, deer park, and meditation areas.

In 1999, at the request of BTMC, the Patna Circle of the Archaeological Survey of India has prepared an evaluation for a conservation project for the Temple Complex for the next two years. The State Archaeology Department of Bihar has also prepared a project for the excavation and presentation of the area, uncovering the ancient city, and the sanctuaries and monasteries built by foreign kings over the centuries. The project aims at recreating the area to match a depiction on a terracotta plaque found in the excavations of Pataliputra (the capital city of Bihar).

The population of Bodh Gaya town where the Temple Complex is located was 16,000 in 1991, but this figure is estimated to have doubled by 2001. Over the years foreign countries have acquired land to build temples, monasteries, and residential accommodations for their visiting pilgrims in the buffer zone of the Temple. There is pressure from construction activity in the vicinity of the Temple area at the present time. This is likely to grow owing to further development of the site and the increase in the number of visitors, although there the heights of buildings are limited within 2km distance from the Temple area. All this puts particular pressure on development in the town and its suburbs in the near future.

The Government of India and the State Government of Bihar are promoting the site through their Departments of Tourism. An annual celebration of the Buddhist legacy is held by the Department of Tourism in Mahabodhi and in other important Buddhist sites. There are plans to illuminate the approach to the Mahabodhi Temple Complex. A sound and light show on the life of Buddha and the events at this historic site is also under preparation at the behest of the BTMC. There are currently some 400,000 visitors per year (30% foreign and 70% domestic). During November to February the average is 2000 visitors per day, but during special festivities, there have been as many as 60,000 visitors in one day.

As part of the general scheme, the roads have been improved to connect the capital city of Bihar to Bodh Gaya and to other Buddhist sites in Bihar. The Central and State Governments propose to connect all Buddhist sites through tourist circuits developed to promote these sites. Construction of an airport near the site is foreseen by the Ministry of Civil Aviation. A scheme has also been proposed by an NGO for the construction of the tallest statue in the world, a Buddha 152.4 m high.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

After the long period of abandonment, the temple complex was in a poor state, and was extensively restored in the 19th century, first by the Burmese and then by the British (1880–84). These works were based on existing evidence and no new features are reported to have been added. The front pavilion of the temple was in ruins and it was rebuilt on the basis of a stone model found at the Temple.

The next significant work on the site was undertaken after the approval of the Bodha Gaya Temple Act in 1949. The repair and development works were made under the supervision of BTMC (1953–56), including the inner and outer pathways around the Temple Complex and the excavation of the Lotus Pond, which was provided with railings. Other works have been carried out from the 1960s onwards, including the boundary wall, transforming the upper shrine area into a meditation hall, and adding other facilities.

At present the site is experiencing strong pressures from increasing tourism and pilgrimage. This has been accompanied by various improvement works, and there are plans for carrying out excavations, improving the presentation of the Temple, and the construction of more visitor facilities in the neighbourhood.

Authenticity and integrity

The belief that Buddha has attained Enlightenment in this particular place has been confirmed by tradition. This has been documented since the time of Emperor Asoka, who erected a memorial column and built the first temple here in 260 BCE.

Parts of the present temple complex date from different periods. The main part of the temple is recorded from about the 6th century, but it has undergone various repairs and renovation works since then. Having suffered from long abandonment, it was extensively restored in the 19th century, and more works were carried out in the second half of the 20th century.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in January 2001.

Qualities

The outstanding universal value of the Mahabodhi Temple Complex in Bodh Gaya lies in its direct association with the life of the Lord Buddha, as one of four sites: Lumbini, the Birthplace of the Lord Buddha, in Nepal (inscribed 1997: criteria iii, vi); Bodh Gaya, where he attained the supreme and perfect insight; Sarnath, where Buddha preached his first sermon after Enlightenment; and Kusinagar, where he died.

The area of the Mahabodhi Temple is an ancient site which has great archaeological significance in respect of the events associated with the time Buddha spent there, as well as documenting the evolving worship, particularly since the 3rd century BCE, when Emperor Asoka built the first temple, the railings, and the memorial column.

The present Temple is dated to the 5th or 6th century CE and, although it has been subject to various repairs and partial reconstruction, it remains an exceptional evidence of the history of architecture. It is considered to be one of the earliest temple constructions in India still standing and one of the few built entirely in brick that remain from the late Gupta period. The sculpted stone railings are an outstanding example from the period of Emperor Asoka and his successors, exhibiting some of the oldest sculptural reliefs found in the country.

The site has the potential to be recognized for its outstanding universal value for inscription on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria ii, iii, iv, and vi.

Comparative analysis

The religious significance of the Mahabodhi Temple for Buddhism is outstanding, comparable particularly with *Lumbini, the Birth Place of the Lord Buddha*. The site has also been compared with equivalent sites related to other religions, such as Jerusalem and Mecca. As a place of worship the site represents a continuous tradition of philosophical thought and human values since the time of Buddha.

The Mahabodhi Temple is significant as an exceptional example of an early Buddhist structural temple still standing today. There are a few structural temples of the 5th–6th centuries CE in India, but the Mahabodhi Temple is considered to be the best preserved, the largest, and the most imposing.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

While the outstanding universal significance of the property is recognized, there is a need for better documentation of the site nominated for inscription and the surrounding buffer zone. ICOMOS therefore requests the State Party to provide precise maps with a clear indication of the perimeter proposed for the core area and for the buffer zone.

Taking note of the number of ambitious initiatives for the presentation of the site, providing facilities for visitors, and the development of the area as a whole, the town, and even the entire region, ICOMOS is concerned about the increasing pressures placed on this historic site and the challenges that

its religious and spiritual significance may face in the future. The site is currently subject to major promotion for more visitors and pilgrims. It is noticed that the town of Bodh Gaya is thought to have doubled its population in the last 10 years. The increasing flux of visitors will obviously have its impact on the social and economic situation, with consequences on the built environment of which the temple is an integral part.

The current documentation provides little information on the surroundings of the Temple and on the city itself, which is essential for the proper planning and management of the site. There is a lack of graphic documentation of the temple site and of the town, especially within the limits of the proposed buffer zone. ICOMOS therefore invites the State Party to provide more detailed information on the issues raised above, including precise maps and graphic documents, and to indicate the expected impact of the development foreseen for the site.

Brief description

The Mahabodhi Temple Complex is one of the four holy sites related to the life of the Lord Buddha, and particularly to the attainment of Enlightenment. The first temple was built by Emperor Asoka in the 3rd century BCE, and the present temple dates from the 5th or 6th centuries CE. It is one of the earliest Buddhist structural temples still standing in India, and one of the few built entirely in brick from the late Gupta period.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

While recognizing the outstanding universal significance of the Mahabodhi Temple, ICOMOS recommends that further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*. The State Party should be requested to provide precise maps of the temple site and the surrounding built environment, with a clear indication of the proposed perimeters of the core area and the buffer zone. Furthermore, the State Party should be requested to provide more details of the suggested plans for development and presentation, indicating the expected impact on the spiritual and historical values of the site.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Wooden Churches (Poland)

No 1053

Identification

Nomination Wooden Churches of Southern Little Poland

Location District: Malopolskie (Little Poland):
Commune: Biecz, Village: Binarowa
Commune: Jasienica Rosielna, Village Blizne;
Commune: Nowy Targ, Village: Debno;
Commune: Haczów, Village: Haczów;
Commune: Lachowice, Village Lachowice;
Commune: Lipnica Murowana, Village: Lipnica Murowana;
Commune: Jablonka, Village: Orawka;
Commune: Sekowa, Village: Sekowa;
Commune: Luzna, Village: Scalowa;

State Party Republic of Poland

Date 30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The log-built Catholic timber churches in Poland are unique phenomena closely related both to general European architectural trends and the local building tradition. They were the most valuable and elite buildings, the creation of which was closely connected with the social, cultural and political structures of the medieval state. They are witness to a centuries-long development process, and the oldest source references about them date back to the 11th century. Subsequent centuries are well documented in the archival resources, beginning from the registers of "St Peter's Pence" to the detailed reports and inventories contained in the diocesan records of the Visitations of the bishops to parishes under their care. Wooden churches became also a motif in literature and art. They were noticed by foreign travellers as structures having no equivalents in other countries.

Although several dozen similar structures have been preserved in a good state in this area, the buildings presented here for inclusion are the best-preserved examples of them. They are the evidence of all stages of the centuries-long process of transformations of architecture and sacral art beginning in the Middle Ages, and finishing at the end of the 18th century. They represent the persistence of vanished archetypes, through Gothic to contemporary, and the continuation of traditional-type churches related to folk architecture. The wide application of Baroque motifs resulted in the phenomenon of "imitating" in wood Baroque monumental sacral architecture, a unique phenomenon which never existed in other regions of the continent. Since the 16th century, south Polish wooden churches acquired

bell-towers, added to the nave where there had been none before; they were constructed using the post-frame technique, and the most frequent variant is the tower with sloping walls with a projecting bell-chamber. This represents the rediscovery of the form of medieval fortified towers.

The chosen churches also contain interiors of exceptional artistic quality, which reflect the development of European art from the Gothic to late Baroque and contemporary times, many of them of museum quality. It should be mentioned that the Polish wooden church took their functional spatial composition from liturgical requirements adopted from the West. They form an exceptional enclave situated at the boundary between the cultures of the East and the West, in the area of Christian Slavs.

The proposed group of timber churches are unique relics of the centuries-old development of a tradition, only dying out in our times. The demise of this tradition has been caused by modern demographic conditions, and technological and stylistic tendencies. These buildings no longer have the prospect of further development, and have become a monument to a vanished epoch. As has been emphasized, they are a unique phenomenon, and appear only in a closely defined area of Polish territory, at the cultural boundary between East and West.

Criterion iii

The selected timber churches are pre-eminent examples of the survivals of a tradition of construction of timber buildings which was once much more widespread, and which was connected with the most important ideological concepts of Christian Europe. They are the most representative examples of these structures (which is reflected in the range of their type and identity). These structures preserve lost technological knowledge and constructional skills, specific to the historical period in which they were constructed. Modern technology is no longer related to these material traditions.

Criterion iv

All the proposed structures have fulfilled a liturgical and cult function for an unbroken period of several centuries. Around these churches have materialized cultural values having universal value, and at the same time acting as a focus for and acting as a document of local cultural identity. Without change, they fulfil the purpose for which their founders and builders created them, retaining their historical form and at the same time fulfilling the needs of modern religious life.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

The history of Poland goes back to the unification of the Christian lands and the constitution of the kingdom in the 10th and 11th centuries. Marked by important progress and the foundation of dozens of new cities in the 14th century, Poland's most impressive development is from the end of the 15th through the 18th centuries, when it was united with Lithuania and formed an empire ranging across the entire

central Europe. It is against this background that one can also see the development of wooden architecture in southern Poland, where it has been an inseparable element of the cultural landscape.

Churches have been of particular significance in the development of Polish wooden architecture, and an essential element of settlement structures, both as landmarks and as ideological symbols. They were an outward sign of the cultural identity of communities, reflecting the artistic and social aspirations of their patrons and creators. In early Poland, churches were elite buildings of exceptional significance due to the importance of their patrons, usually monarchs, Church officials, monasteries, and finally knights (later aristocrats). Construction of churches was not the work of folk carpenters, except much later, in the 18th and 19th centuries, in a period of increasing social and cultural differentiation.

The oldest well-preserved Roman Catholic wooden churches date back to the 15th century. They demonstrate the participation of professional craft workshops, belonging to guilds and builders' lodges, sometimes employing both carpenters and masons. These churches are complex, of good craftsmanship, and free from improvisation in their construction. The few well-preserved late medieval churches have many features in common. The typical church building was composed of a nave, almost square in plan with a narrow chancel, and generally with a three-sided east end. The churches were orientated with their altars to the east. Originally, the churches were built without towers, which were added later. There were various architectural developments, such as roof structures, in succeeding centuries, and some of the solutions are unique in Europe. The Gothic character of medieval churches was emphasized by simple stylistic details, such as the shape of door and window openings, arcades, and arches. Until the second quarter of the 16th century there was a common plan for the churches.

The internal fittings were in the style of the period, produced in guild workshops, and the themes and presentations followed rigorous ideological and iconographic rules. New architectural elements, such as towers and arcades, started appearing in the late 16th century, and strict adherence to the old church type was gradually abandoned. From the beginning of the 18th century there was a tendency to exceed the limitations of the traditional model, a symptom of institutional and social changes, and architects or skilled dilettantes attempted to apply to wood Baroque concepts developed in brick architecture. This is an interesting chapter in the history of the wooden sacral architecture, represented in basilica- and aisled-hall churches, sometimes with cupola-covered chapels or cruciform buildings with a central plan, facades with two towers and elaborate interiors with spiral columns, cornices, all executed in wood in "imitation" of brick architecture. Later styles, such as late Baroque, the Regency and Rococo, also had an impact and mural decoration is used in illusionist compositions to increase the impression of interior spaciousness. In the 19th century there were revivals, and wooden churches were built with classicist or neo-Gothic features but mostly in details and interiors. The beginning of the 20th century was marked by an interest in the beauty of folk art and the "rediscovery" of a "national" architecture.

Description

The nine properties in southern Little Poland represent different aspects of these developments, and include the churches of *Binarowa*, *Blizne*, *Debno*, *Haczów*, *Lachowice*, *Lipnica Murowana*, *Orawka*, *Sekowa*, and *Scalowa*. Most of these date from the late 15th century, being completed in the 16th century, except for *Lachowice* and *Scalowa*, which were built in the 18th century. They were all designed for the liturgies of the Roman Catholic Church. They are generally located in the centre of a village (except for *Lipnica Murowana*, which is outside the defence walls). All were built as horizontal log constructions. The interiors have rich painted decoration and fittings that initially date from the late Gothic period, later often over-painted in Baroque and Rococo styles. The buildings are characterized by high roofs covered with wooden shingles.

- The church of Archangel Michael (Binarowa)

The parish church of Binarowa was probably first built around 1500, with a roof of *zaskrzynienia* type. In 1595 a tower was added to the west end, and at the beginning of the 17th century the church was enclosed by an external arcade. In 1602–8 a ridge turret was added to the roof. The church was substantially rebuilt in 1641–50, and a chapel was added to the north end. Window openings were enlarged, and new polychrome decoration replaced the earlier stencilled work. The church has a crypt under the sacristy and the exterior, the tower, and the south porch are roofed with shingles; other roofs are covered with galvanized metal sheets. The interior is painted in thin tempera. The earliest, stencilled ornament of the ceiling is from the beginning of the 16th century in late Gothic style. Most of the Baroque paintings are from the 17th century. The Gothic sculptures of the end of 14th century are probably from an earlier church at Binarowa and the reliefs of various saints are from the 15th century. Most other decoration, including the pulpit, altarpiece, and the Crucifix, are from the 17th century. After 1909, the roofs of the nave, the chancel, and the upper part of the tower were covered with galvanized sheeting, the shingle covering of the walls was replaced by weatherboarding, and the *zaskrzynienia* of the nave was supported by a pillared arcade.

- The church of All Saints (Blizne)

The parish church of Blizne is referred to in the 14th and 15th centuries. In 1549 the church had its first bell tower, and the interior had a rich painted decoration. The remarkable Last Judgement scene is from this period. The present bell tower is first mentioned in 1646, when also the arcades were built around external walls and the interior was newly decorated. In the early 18th century there were changes to interior decorations and furniture. The 16th century altar was replaced in 1720, using parts of the old one. The church was restored and the arcades were removed in 1811. The churchyard has a wooden enclosure and there is a late 20th century chapel. Near the church, there is a singular group of wooden buildings of the presbytery.

- The church of Archangel Michael (Debno)

The church of Debno is first mentioned in 1335, and it became a parish church in 1400. The present building is the second on the site and it dates from late 15th century. The tower was added in 1601. The arcade around the exterior wall and the south porch are from the 17th century. The exterior walls and the roofs are covered with shingles or

weatherboarding. The walls at the top of the tower have wooden lacework decorations, also found in the interior. This church has a unique example of medieval decorations. The ceiling and the interior walls are painted using stencils from the 15th and 16th centuries. The decoration contains more than 77 motifs; there are frequent architectural motifs recalling Gothic forms. There are also animal and human motifs other than religious. The Crucifix is from the 14th century, probably from an earlier building, and it is the oldest element in the church. Similar examples exist in Slovakia (1330–70) known as "Hungarian Mystical Crosses." The altar is from the 14th century, a work from a guild workshop in Cracow.

- The church of the Blessed Virgin Mary and Archangel Michael (Haczów)

An auxiliary (earlier parish) church of Haczów has original Gothic polychrome decoration from the late 15th century, although the building has been dated to the previous century. At the beginning of the 17th century the church was enclosed by an earthen defensive rampart. In 1624, the tower, a ridge turret and the external arcade were constructed, and the round window openings were cut in nave walls. In 1784–89 the sacristy was enlarged, the northern chapel was built, a treasury and new arcades were added and the roof over the nave was remodelled. In 1864 the interior of the church was substantially restored and modernised. The roof, damaged in 1914, was renewed in 1915.

- The church of St Peter and St Paul (Lachowice)

The parish church of Lachowice was built in 1789 from a donation, and it was consecrated in 1792: The bells date from 1802–06. The furniture was designed in baroque style, but was substantially altered in 1836. In 1846 the Stations of the Cross were installed in the external arcade. There have been more renovations later, but the form and decorations have been kept. In 1930 the interior decorations were renewed.

- The church of St Leonard (Lipnica Murowana)

The church of Lipnica Murowana was built at the end of the 15th century. From this date have survived parts of the polychrome decoration stencilled on the ceiling of the nave. The church was situated outside the defensive wall of the township, and had the function of a cemetery church, a function that it still fulfils. It has been renovated many times, but this has not significantly affected its form or spatial arrangement. The ornamental polychrome decoration of the ceiling of the cancel dates from the 16th century, and the walls were painted in 1689, those of the nave in 1710–11. In the 17th century, an external arcade was built around the church. The western portal was added in 1837. A crypt under the nave contains Ledochowski family grave.

- The church of St John the Baptist (Orawka)

The beginnings of this parish were connected with the re-Catholicization of the region by the Austrian emperor Ferdinand III. The construction of the church of St John the Baptist began in 1651, and the bell tower is from 1656, but the church was only consecrated in 1715. A brick-built chapel was added in 1728. The church was renovated in 1816–19, and the tower was remodelled in 1901. In 1926–27 the chapel was covered with a cupola, which was removed in 1935 and rebuilt as it had been earlier. A new ridge turret was built in 1935.

- The church of St Philip and St James the Apostles (Sekowa)

This auxiliary church (earlier parish church) was built around 1520, on the site of an earlier church. The building has a square plan with no aisles; the chancel has a three-sided east end, and the building is covered with a high roof. Some renovation took place in the 17th century, and there were further changes in the 18th century with the addition of the towers, the stone paving around the church, and the high external arcades. The sacristy and the choir were added prior to 1819. The ceilings and the interior walls were covered with neo-Gothic decorations in late 19th century. During World War I, Sekowa was in the front-line zone, since the Austro-Hungarian trenches were near the church, which had some damage during military action.

- The church of Archangel Michael (Szalowa)

The parish church of Szalowa was built in 1736–56 and consecrated in 1756. The interior was completed in 1782. The vestibules in the façade are later additions; there is a separate, new vestibule by the sacristy. This church differs from the others because of its architectural form, though it still built with the same technique as the rest. The church has a nave and two aisles, and it is built in a basilica form. The extremely rich Baroque-Rococo polychrome decoration and fittings date from the 18th century. The west front has two towers over the aisles, integrated with the facade, and provided with small onion-shaped cupolas. A 19th century fence with a masonry bell-tower surrounds the churchyard.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The monuments are the physical and legal property of the Roman Catholic Church, represented by Church authorities (Bishops) and parochial administration.

The monuments are inscribed in the Register of Monuments and are protected on the basis of the requirements of Polish law. They are also included in conservation zones, which are defined in the land-use master plans of each of the communes.

All the churches are provided with three levels of protected areas: a direct protection in the indicated core area, a buffer zone including the immediate surroundings, and a landscape protection zone, where the main viewpoints from the surrounding hills indicate the limits of the restricted area.

Management

Direct care of the monument remains in the hands of the owner (the Church). Monitoring and control over the conservation work are the responsibility of the Provincial Commissioner for Historical Monuments and of the Historic Monuments Protection Service. The administration of some communes also includes a Department of Architecture, which is responsible for the protection of the church.

The buffer zones defined in the nomination document are divided into two categories: a. the traditional enlarged conservation or protection area, and b. the long-distance protection, including the surrounding cultural landscape and marking on the map different long-distance view points to be included and protected by the spatial planning. The buffer zones around the nominated properties and

conservation areas are mostly defined in accordance with the borders of the historic settlement. Exception makes the buffer zone surrounding the conservation area at Lipnica Murowana, where the church is situated outside the walls of the medieval settlement being used today as a cemetery chapel. Here the buffer zone includes the free territory of meadows and pastureland on the east side used in the past also by the small villages of Lipnica Murowana Górna and Dolna.

During the expert mission to Lachowice, a note was made regarding the southern border of the buffer zone, limited by a railway track. Some new housing has been erected in the vicinity of the churchyard, across the railway. After discussion, the authorities have agreed to enlarge the buffer zone to include these lots in order to avoid uncontrolled building activity in the future.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The dates of construction of the churches in the present nomination range from the 15th to the 18th centuries. During the centuries, the buildings have been subject to some alterations, thus acquiring a historical stratification. Typically, the buildings have had the tower added in a later period, as well as the external gallery that has become a characteristic feature of several of the churches. Also in the interior, there have been changes regarding the painted decoration and the furniture and fittings, respecting the taste of the time. As a whole, the various additions and alterations are in harmony with the whole of the architecture, and can therefore be considered enrichment acquired through their useful life. The churches have survived surprisingly well until the present, some with hardly any change. In relatively few cases the buildings have suffered from damage, such as the church of Sekowa, damaged during World War I and subsequently repaired.

The churches have generally been subject to restoration in recent decades. This has also meant an opportunity, using modern scientific methods, to remove later paint layers and to reveal underlying older decoration. It has thus been possible to reacquire parts of the medieval appearance of the interior of the oldest churches. Restoration has also given an opportunity for methodical survey and research of the buildings and the verification of their history. It has shown, for example, that many of the buildings have retained much of their original material and structure, rare in the case of wooden constructions, which are generally subject to weathering and loss of material.

Authenticity and integrity

The wooden churches of southern Little Poland have been preserved exceptionally well through the centuries. They have all maintained their original structure, much of their fittings, and even of the first layers of painted decoration. Some of the churches have been hardly changed since their completion (including the construction of the tower and the external arcade, which are often of later date). Others have been subject to alterations, particularly in the 18th century, and the redecoration in the baroque-rococo style. Such changes have however been in the character of the architectural conception of the buildings, and can be considered a part of their historical value.

The rural settings of the churches and their relationship with the landscape have been preserved. It is noted with satisfaction that the nominated areas include also the auxiliary structures related to church functions, and thus contributing to the integrity of the sites concerned.

The buildings have also been in continuous use as church buildings, a scene of traditional ceremonies and rituals, until the present. Recent restorations have been carried out according to modern principles.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the nine churches in January 2001. Particular attention was given to the issues of protection and management with the proposal to modify the perimeter of the buffer zone in the case of the church of Lachowice. While recognizing the justification of the current nomination, the mission noted the need for a thematic study of wooden church architecture, which would take into account the whole cultural region in eastern and south-eastern Europe. The mission verified the issues of authenticity in the church constructions and the integrity of the sites concerned.

Qualities

The wooden churches of southern Little Poland represent an age-old tradition that goes back to medieval times. The construction dates range from the 15th and 16th centuries, the Polish Middle Ages, to the 17th and 18th centuries, documenting the continuation of the traditions. Built using horizontal log technique, common in eastern and northern Europe since the Middle Ages, the buildings present many characteristic features that qualify their singularity, including the overall architectural form, the roofs, the towers, and the arcades around the building. The Polish wooden church took its functional and spatial composition from liturgical requirements adopted from the West, forming a sort of enclave between East and West.

Considering the social and political situation in Poland from the 15th century onwards, and the commitment of the noble families to sponsor the construction of church buildings not only for the cult but also as a symbol of their own prestige, these churches have strong social significance. They represent a wooden alternative to the architecture developed in masonry structures in urban centres, but also an alternative that used the best available craftsmanship and technology.

Furthermore, the churches are an exceptionally well preserved testimony of the medieval decorative systems, and how these concepts were continued and further developed over the centuries, when other styles became more dominant, especially Baroque and Rococo. The churches have retained their original architectural form and the liturgical use, and also the rural setting of the sites has remained exceptionally well intact.

Comparative analysis

The other wooden church buildings on the World Heritage List include the medieval *Urnes Stave Church* [inscribed on the List in 1979: criteria i, ii, iii] in Norway; *Kizhi Pogost* [1990: i, iv, v] in the Russian Federation (Carelia); *Petäjävesi Old Church* [1994: iv] in Finland, the *Wooden*

Churches of Maramures [1999: iv] in Romania; the *Churches of Chiloé* [2000: ii, iii] in Chile. Furthermore, the Churches of Peace in Poland are presented for nomination in 2001. A comparative study has been carried out on Nordic church buildings.

The stave churches of Norway represent a different architectural and structural system, and the churches of Finland, Russia, Romania, and Chile date from the late 17th and 18th centuries, as well as representing different cultural and architectural traditions. The current nomination is related to the Roman Catholic tradition in wooden church architecture in southern Poland and its development since the late Middle Ages, with reference only to the traditional horizontal log construction. It is noted that there is also a family of some 70 Greek Catholic churches in southern Poland, the architecture of which is different from the Roman Catholic tradition reflecting a particular liturgical division of interior spaces and influences from the Russian and Ukrainian wooden church architecture. Nevertheless the construction technique and many details represent a common language of traditional wooden church architecture in the area of Central, Eastern and Northern Europe, and particularly from Southern Poland to Ukraine, Russia, Slovakia, Hungary and northern Romania, that is in the region around the Carpathian Mountains.

Even though the selection for this nomination is of great interest, a comprehensive thematic study is missing from the nomination document.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

Taking into account the fact that the proposed churches are part of a building tradition that extends to central and Eastern Europe and even beyond, ICOMOS considers that it is necessary that a thematic study in wooden architecture should be undertaken in relation to wooden churches in the region of the Carpathian Mountains in order to have a more comprehensive representation of these traditions recognized on the World Heritage List. Depending on the results of the study, the possibility of a thematic nomination should be considered recognizing the different cultural expressions related to a similar building tradition in this region.

Brief description

The wooden churches of southern Little Poland represent outstanding examples of the different aspects of the medieval church building traditions in the Roman Catholic culture as these developed from the 15th to the 18th centuries. Built using horizontal log technique, common in eastern and northern Europe since the Middle Ages, the buildings were sponsored by noble families and became also a symbol of prestige, representing a highly qualified wooden alternative to the masonry structures in urban centres.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

While recognizing the great interest of the heritage concerned, ICOMOS considers it necessary to evaluate the nomination in the larger regional context. Therefore, ICOMOS recommends that the nomination be *deferred* to await the outcome of a thematic study.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Churches of Peace (Poland)

No 1054

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Churches of Peace in Jawor and Swidnica
<i>Location</i>	Historic region of Silesia, Principality of Swidnica and Jawor
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Poland
<i>Date</i>	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Churches of Peace in Jawor and Swidnica give exceptional testimony to the cultural tradition of timber-frame architecture at the peak of its structural and aesthetic potential. They also bear witness to the coexistence of Baroque art and Lutheran theology. **Criterion iii**

The Churches of Peace are outstanding, pioneering, and unique structures, whose construction, spatial arrangement, and technology were later imitated only in a simplified and reduced form. Developed in response to imposed external conditions, their architecture satisfied the expectations and needs of local communities in terms of space arrangements, architectural forms, and ideological content. **Criterion iv**

The Churches of Peace are directly linked to an important historical event (the Peace of Westphalia), to a universal idea (religious freedom), and to ideology (the Christian faith, the Reformation). Their form and symbolism were closely linked with the political situation of a large and dynamic population group defined by its religious denomination – a group which, as a result of internal conflicts and war, was reduced to the position of a diaspora barely tolerated by state authorities. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

The Thirty Years' War in Europe ended with the Treaty of Westphalia (1648), which upheld the principle of *cuius regio eius religio*, ie the faith professed by the ruler was obligatory for his subjects. At that time Silesia was a part of the

Catholic Habsburg monarchy. In most of the province Protestants were persecuted and deprived of the right and possibility to practise their faith. Through the agency of the Lutheran king of Sweden, the Emperor finally allowed (1651–52) the erection of three churches, henceforth known as the Churches of Peace, in Silesian principalities under direct Habsburg rule in Glogow (Glogau), which ceased to exist in the 18th century, Jawor (Jauer), and Swidnica (Schweidnitz) in the south-west part of present-day Poland. The Emperor's consent was, however, given upon conditions that were difficult to comply with. The churches had to be built exclusively of perishable materials (wood and clay), located outside city walls, and built in a limited period of time. These restrictions, together with the need to provide adequate space for large crowds of worshippers, forced the architect, Albrecht von Sabisch (1610–88), a prominent master-builder and fortification designer active in Wroclaw, to implement pioneering constructional and architectural solutions of a scale and complexity unknown ever before or since in wooden architecture. The timber-framed structures of enormous scale and complexity were assembled. The Churches of Peace, as they are still called today, were to be as inconspicuous as possible in the townscape; they were to be the refuge of a legally disadvantaged and only reluctantly tolerated minority, whose role as outsiders should be evident in the location of the churches outside the protective city walls.

The first permit was given to Glogow (1651) and the site was located 300m outside the city walls. Building started quickly and the first service was held in October 1652, but the church was destroyed by a violent storm in the summer of 1654. A new church was built the following year, but this burnt down in 1758 and was then replaced by a brick building. The permit for the other two churches was given in 1652. The church of Jawor was built in 1654–55. In Swidnica, a temporary structure (*Gotteshüttlein*, God's hut) was built in 1652 and the actual construction was able to take place in 1656–57, thanks to the donation of Count Hans Heinrich von Hochberg and support from the Lutheran magistrate of Swidnica. A new sacristy was erected in 1695 and private loges were built by noble families in the early 18th century. Several auxiliary buildings were added to the ensemble, including the residences of the pastor and the vicars, a Latin school, and a German school. The two churches were designed as basilicas with built-in galleries but their plans and spatial arrangements differed. In their décor, integrated into the architectural framework, exuberant Baroque forms and complex imagery were used in a truly unique way to convey concepts of Protestant theology. During the Silesian War, Swidnica was under siege on several occasions, and the hostilities resulted in the destruction of the sacristy and structural damage to the northern wall. All the damage was repaired by 1763.

Description

Unlike the Baroque Catholic churches of Silesia, the Churches of Peace do not represent a self-confident mission-oriented religion, triumphant in its victory over heretics, but rather they embody a place of refuge for an oppressed religious minority that wanted to assert its faith, to remain conscious of its individuality, and to preserve the communal cult of its traditions and practices. Stability and durability were achieved ability by means of an efficient structural system and careful use of traditional techniques in handling the materials and in connecting the individual timbers with

one another. The Churches of Peace are among the latest examples of an architecture that combines post-and-beam construction (building with one-piece wall-high posts) with the techniques of halved joints; the structural framework of regularly placed uprights and horizontal connecting rails is reinforced by means of diagonal crossed struts that are inserted in the posts and rails in a way that makes shifting of the structural framework impossible. As post-and-beam buildings, the Churches of Peace are part of a European tradition that goes back to the 12th century (the Norwegian stave churches, one of which found its way to Silesia in the 19th century) and continued into the 18th century (eg the Churches of Grace). The churches in Jawor and Swidnica differ from one another in the character of their floor plans. Both have three aisles, both terminate in a polygonal east end., but whereas in Jawor the eastern end is still a true chancel, in Swidnica it is only the formal remembrance of such; its function has become that of a sacristy.

- THE LUTHERAN CHURCH OF PEACE IN JAWOR

The church was designed by the architect Albert von Sabisch and constructed by the master carpenter Andreas Gamper from Jawor in 1654–55. Located outside the town, the church is surrounded by a park, the former graveyard, with the original layout of tree-lined alleys. The auxiliary buildings occupy a quarter of the site. The church is in the form of a basilica with one nave, two aisles, and a presbytery. The building is a timber-framed structure, filled with vertical wooden chips wrapped in straw and plastered with clay. It is covered with shingle roofs. The bell-tower adjoining the south elevation was erected in 1707 on a rectangular plan, the first storey in brick and the upper storeys timber-framed, with an octagonal helmet on top. The building is 43.3m long and 26.8m wide. Its height from floor to ceiling is 16.4m and externally to the rooftop 23.7m.

The interior has two tiers of principal galleries and two tiers of auxiliary galleries. The auxiliary galleries were added in the 18th century. The galleries are divided by screens and partitions into a complex system of interconnected loges for local nobility and craft guilds. The original polychrome decoration consists of ornaments in tones of white and blue and of 143 biblical scenes with inscriptions. The paintings, inspired by Mathias Merian, were executed by Georg Flegel. Similar decoration is also on the auxiliary galleries, and the décor is supplemented by cartouches bearing coats of arms. The high altar (1672) is a multi-storeyed structure executed by the workshop of Michael Schneider of Landshut.

- THE LUTHERAN CHURCH OF PEACE IN SWIDNICA

The church was designed by the same architect as the Church of Jawor, Albert von Sabisch, and built by master carpenters Andreas Gamper (from Jawor) and Kaspar König (from Swidnica) in 1656–57. It is located north of the town centre, and was incorporated into the outer ring of fortifications in the mid-18th century. The polygonal site is occupied by the churchyard with its original layout and surrounded by walls. The auxiliary buildings include the residence of the head pastor, the vicarage, and two schools. The church is in the form of a basilica with a transept and four tiers of galleries. Its plan is close to a Greek cross. The structure is similar to the Jawor church. The church is 45.1m long and 20.9m wide; the nave is 11.5m wide and 14.5m high. Externally the building is 22.5m tall. The polychrome decoration of the interior, started in 1693 under the direction of Christian Sussenbach, was inspired by the Bible. The high altar was

executed in 1752 by the sculptor Gottfried August Hoffman, replacing an old altarpiece, and he also built the pulpit. The main organ was built by Christoph Klose in 1666–69; it was repaired several times in the 18th century and more recently in 1834.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The churches of Jawor and Swidnica are both property of the Diocese of Wrocław.

The Church of Jawor and its surrounding area (former cemetery and a Soviet army cemetery) are legally protected as monuments (No 990/173/L, as of 1963). The current master plan contains provisions for the protection of the site (1988, amended in 1994 and 1996).

The Church of Swidnica and its auxiliary buildings are legally protected as monuments (No 9/131 of 1950) and have been placed in Zone A (strict conservation and archaeological protection) of the historic town, designated in the current master plan (1994).

Management

The Churches of Jawor and Swidnica are regularly used for religious purposes and there is no intention to change this. The general management and routine maintenance are carried out and financed by the respective parishes. There are no particular environmental pressures that would threaten the churches.

The conservation management of the church of Jawor is the responsibility of the Lower Branch of Historical Monuments Protection Service in Legnica and in the case of Swidnica of the corresponding office in Walbrzych. The protection is supervised by the Voivodship Conservator's office in Wrocław and the Commissioner for Historic Monuments in Warsaw. Regular monitoring is carried out by specialists.

Both churches are currently subject to a comprehensive conservation programme by the Deutsches Zentrum für Handwerk und Denkmalpflege, Probstei Johannesberg, Fulda e.V. The programmes are implemented in close collaboration with the Institute of Science of Historical Works of Art and Conservation Techniques of the Nicolaus Copernicus University in Toruń; the conservation of decorations is the responsibility of the Department of Conservation of the Polychrome Paintings and Sculpture and the *Department of Conservation of Paper and Leather*.

Both churches are included in regional and local tourism development plans. The sites are accessible to groups and individual visitors, and have the necessary facilities. Most visitors come from Germany, the Czech Republic, and Austria, and amount to 12,000 per year in Jawor and 24,000 in Swidnica.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The embellishment and decoration of both churches lasted well into the 18th century, including additional structures on the site. In Jawor some major repairs were undertaken on the occasion of the anniversaries in 1852 and 1902. Recognizing

the significance of the building, special care was taken to minimize interference with the original structure, but involving repair and replacement of fillings and clay renderings. The church had structural deformations and, because of the lack of proper maintenance during and after World War II, its condition caused serious concern in the 1970s. Thorough survey and recording were undertaken in this period, followed by the development of conservation programmes in the 1980s. An immediate result was the reinforcement of the deformed central roof trusses, thus preventing further deterioration and without compromising the authenticity of the building.

In the case of Swidnica, the Seven Years' War and the siege by the Prussian army in 1762 caused considerable damage to the church. The facade away from the city received so many direct hits that large parts had to be renewed during repairs the year after the peace treaty. The new sections were harmoniously integrated with the existing structure but using joinery characteristic of the 18th century. A new timber-framed sacristy was also built. As in Jawor, further repairs were carried out in 1852 and 1902. In 1852, a new porch was added to the sacristy and the so-called nuptial hall was built, both in neo-Gothic style. A baptism hall was built inside the church. In 1902 the main entrances received timber-framed porches. Structural repairs were as a rule limited to the replacement of individual members and the construction has remained basically that of 18th century. The timber structure was stabilized and consolidated in the 1960s and 1970s and the shingle roof was replaced.

Both churches are currently subject to conservation programmes, in two parts, one dealing with structural consolidation and the other with interior decoration and furnishings. The structural work will be completed in the near future. The conservation of the décor has been initiated with a pilot phase and will be continued subject to obtaining funds.

Authenticity

Both Churches of Peace have a very high degree of historical authenticity. Their basic historic fabric and their formal appearance have remained unchanged since they were built. Any later elements in the interior fit in well with the older components in the existing architecture and form an artistic whole. The construction and roof forms of the external additions are adapted to those of the main building. Although the churches have had some restoration, this has been carried out in a correct and respectful manner. Lutheran services have continued being held in both Churches of Peace without interruption since the time of construction, and their relationship with the setting has remained intact. The churches can therefore be judged to pass the test of authenticity.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 2001, and ICOMOS scientific committees were consulted on the quality of the architecture concerned.

Qualities

Protestant churches were generally built in simple forms, avoiding excessive decoration. In the case of Silesia, with an impact of the Counter-Reformation, the Churches of Peace were the only Lutheran churches in an otherwise Catholic context. Because of the context and an obvious competition between the two religions, these churches set out to match the Baroque language used by the Catholics. This resulted in a unique phenomenon in Europe both ideologically and artistically, and gave a particular significance to these buildings.

The two churches are the only examples of their kind. They have been built using old traditional techniques, but reaching exceptional dimensions which have required high technical mastery as well as outstanding quality in their architecture. The buildings, in fact, should not be considered vernacular but as outstanding examples of 17th century architecture.

Comparative analysis

Before proposing the properties for inscription, the State Party has undertaken a thorough comparative study. It is understood that the two extant Churches of Peace represent a particular phenomenon in the history of art and architecture with no real analogies elsewhere. This is due not only to the ideological and artistic content of their design and construction but also to their size and type of construction.

The scale of the Churches of Peace is nearly matched by only two other wooden churches. The Lutheran church of the Holy Ghost in Clausthal, Lower Saxony, consecrated in 1642, is a hall church with two aisles and two tiers of galleries. It is 36.5m long and 17.7m wide, with an overall height of 19.5m, and accommodates some 2200 persons. The Lutheran church in Kerimäki, Finland, was built entirely in wood in 1848. This building has a cross plan with a dome over the crossing. The main nave is 45m long and the transept 42m long; the building is 24m high to the rooftop. In the past it could accommodate 3600 persons; now this has been reduced to 3300. Jawor with its 6000 seats and Swidnica with 7500 thus represent the largest existing wooden church buildings.

The study indicates that most timber-framed buildings have followed a simple scheme without aisles. There are few examples of larger hall churches, and the basilica type is the most complex. Of the two Churches of Peace, the plan of Swidnica is the more complicated owing to its large transept. A limited number of timber-framed churches with similar structural system were erected in the early 18th century (Freystadt, Sagan, Wrocław, Voigtsdorf, Leipe, Guhrau) but all of these have since been destroyed or demolished. The only existing ones of this type are the two Churches of Peace. Considering the required size of the churches and the conditions imposed on building materials, the builders had to use the utmost inventiveness to apply time-tested carpentry techniques at this scale, resulting in a sophisticated use of such technology.

The other wooden church buildings on the World Heritage List include the medieval Urnes Stave Church (inscribed on the List in 1979: criteria i, ii, iii) in Norway, Kizhi Pogost (1990: i, iv, v) in the Russian Federation (Carelia), Petäjävesi Old Church (1994: iv) in Finland, built by a peasant master builder in 1763–64; the Wooden Churches of Maramures (1999: iv) in Romania, and the Churches of

Chiloé (2000: ii, iii) in Chile. Furthermore, a selection of wooden churches in Southern Poland is presented for nomination in 2001. On the occasion of the nomination of the Petäjävesi church a comparative study identified and evaluated the different types of wooden churches in northern Europe. It is noted that the buildings mentioned above represent different types of all-wooden construction, whereas the Churches of Peace are timber-framed constructions. Furthermore, the case of the Churches of Peace is fundamentally the result of a particular political and cultural situation in Europe at the time, and the consequent challenges to find technical, architectural, and artistic solutions for their design and construction.

In this context the Churches of Peace are distinguished as exceptional because of their typology and the application of timber-frame construction to congregation buildings of this size. At the same time their particular value lies in the ideological significance of their construction and artistic expression, where they remain unique. These churches are the largest sacred timber-framed buildings in Europe and as such are an engineering achievement that has never been surpassed in this material and in this building technology. The construction method and the structural system of the Churches of Peace are both the result of an historical situation that existed nowhere other than in Silesia and at no other time than after the Thirty Years' War. There was a need for churches that combined a minimum of expense and an extremely short building period (one year) with maximum accommodation for the faithful. The emphasis was not on development of the liturgy or cultivation of private piety but rather for the congregation to be brought as close as possible to the point from which the word of God was proclaimed. These were the premises for the spatial design, from which the architect developed a convincing solution in Swidnica: the cross-shaped central plan with surrounding galleries, which was prototypical for Protestant church construction up until the end of the 18th century.

Brief description

The Churches of Peace in Jawor and Swidnica in Poland are an exceptional achievement, the largest religious timber-framed buildings in Europe, at the time of the religious dispute after the Peace of Westphalia in the former Silesia in the mid-17th century. Constrained by physical and political conditions, the Churches of Peace are testimony of the search for religious freedom and a rare expression given to Lutheran ideology in using the means generally associated with the Catholic Church.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii, iv, and vi*:

The Churches of Peace bear exceptional witness to a particular political and spiritual development in Europe and represent outstanding technical and architectural solutions to meet the difficult conditions imposed on the builders and the community, using age-old traditional techniques. They represent architectural and artistic evidence of the faith of a religious community and its will to survive. Under difficult circumstances this community created, in an unparalleled *tour de force*, the spaces it needed to exercise its faith up to the present day. The Churches of Peace are masterpieces

of skilled handicraft, demonstrating what men are capable of when the utmost is demanded from them.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Mudejar of Aragon (Spain)

No 378 bis

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Mudejar of Aragon (Extension of <i>Mudejar Architecture of Teruel</i>)
<i>Location</i>	Region of Aragón
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The present proposal is intended to extend the existing inscription of Mudejar properties (*Mudejar Architecture of Teruel*, inscribed 1986: criterion iv) to include all Mudejar architecture in the entire region of Aragón, on the basis of the same criteria. The reason is simple: because the question is of the same unique artistic manifestation, of singular character and of universal value. Obviously, Teruel is not the only place in Aragón presenting a strong personality; one can list many others. Furthermore, Teruel has retained close relationships with the city of Zaragoza due to its ecclesiastical links. The formal associations of Teruel with the Islamic tradition in Aragón are identical with those of the rest of the Mudejar of this region. The most significant of previous Islamic monuments has been the Aljaferia Palace in Zaragoza (11th century), where the tradition of Córdoba was developed in depth, reaching unrivalled quality in decoration. After the Reconquest (1118), the palace was transformed into the Christian palace of the Kings of Aragón, who contributed to the social acceptance and diffusion of this Mudejar art. The same criteria of the existing World Heritage site of 1986 can thus be transposed to the rest of the monuments presented in this new proposal.

The specific characteristics that are met in all the nominated monuments make special, though not sole, reference to the special use of brick ornamentation and glazed ceramics in architecture, the two elements most specific to Mudejar art in Aragón.

Other artistic elements that may be noted, such as those related to ornamental systems, are more a result of specific historic and cultural conditions, which change from place to place, and therefore cannot be analysed on a comparative basis. Each location gives its own identity which is just as valid as in any other.

In addition to these formal criteria, there are also others that relate to particular social-historical and ethical situations. These refer to intangible and non-material values, such as the teaching of tolerance and the cultural coexistence of different

religious faiths and political authorities. The Mudejar art created by the Mudejars (Muslims who remained in the reconquered Christian territories) is a symbol of religious and political tolerance, as well as of peaceful and positive coexistence. These monuments show the fruitful interrelation in medieval Aragón between the Christians and the Muslims, and even with Jews. These monuments are therefore a sample of cultural interbreeding and of globalization (considering that Mudejar art was extended to the whole peninsula, and even to Spanish America) at the same time as they determine the singularity of certain locations, of which the most interesting are those in Aragón. Furthermore, the study, promotion, and diffusion of the arts of Aragón will help to develop values of culture and of peace, defended by UNESCO and continuing to be a delicate issue between the Islamic and the Western worlds.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a group of *monuments*.

History and Description

History

The Mudejar art in Aragón is a direct consequence of the singular nature of the Christian Reconquest in the early 12th century of territories that had been dominated by the Moors since the 8th century. For various practical and political reasons the Christians allowed the Moors to remain in the reconquered territories and keep their own culture and religion. On the other hand, the Islamic art fascinated the Christians, who continued using its themes for a long time. Because of this cohabitation, many Islamic buildings were preserved, such as the Aljaferia Palace in Zaragoza and other palaces and mosques in Toledo, Córdoba, Seville, and Granada. In this cultural context, a new expression also developed, the Mudejar art, which represented the fusion of two artistic traditions, Islamic and Christian. The region of Aragón became one of the principal locations for this development. Here the easily available materials were brick, lime, ceramics, and timber, which were also economical in use. Most master builders were Moors, who continued to contribute to the construction. Mudejar art gradually declined with the interruption of relations with the Islamic world and the introduction of Italian Renaissance concepts in the 16th century.

The history of Mudejar art in Aragón can be articulated in three phases: the beginning from the 12th to 13th centuries, the full development and expansion in the 14th and 15th centuries, and the survival and extension in the 16th and 17th centuries.

Only few examples of Mudejar art remain from the period immediately succeeding the Reconquest. The earliest surviving buildings are in Daroca and Teruel. In Daroca these include the tower of Santo Domingo, and the apse of San Juan, from the mid 13th century. Both constructions were begun in stone and completed in brick. In Teruel the earliest examples are the church of Santa Maria de Mediavilla (the cathedral), and the tower of San Pedro, of a

slightly later date. Both of these have very similar decorative systems and structures: they are gate towers on a square base, allowing a passage under a pointed vault, reinforced with buttresses. It is understood that, apart from their religious and military functions, these bell towers also had an important town planning function in tracing the routes. The ceiling of the cathedral of Teruel, dating from the second half of the 13th century, is the most interesting artistic achievement of the Mudejar art in Aragón.

The full development of Mudejar art in Aragón in the 14th and early 15th centuries coincides with the introduction of Gothic to the Hispanic peninsula. In Aragón Mudejar art continued to predominate over Gothic, except in some minor areas in the south. The most common type of church has a single aisle with a polygonal apse of five or six sides and without any buttresses. The structure presents some characteristics typical of Gothic architecture, showing the interrelation between these two art forms. Many of these churches have been modified in later periods. The churches of Zaragoza (La Magdalena, San Gil, and San Miguel de los Navarros) correspond with this type. Perhaps the most distinguished type of church building in this period is one with a strongly military function, a fortified church with tribunes over the lateral chapels, opening towards the exterior. In fact, the patrons were mainly from military orders.

In the last period, starting from the beginning of the 16th century (1502–26), the Mudejars were forced to convert to Christianity, becoming "new Christians" or *moriscos*. This is followed by a period of intolerance, resulting in the expulsion of these new Christians in 1609–10. This is also the period of the decline and extinction of Mudejar art, though there were still some interesting achievements, of which there are examples in Zaragoza, Muniesa, Mara, Tiera, Alcubierre, Utebo, Villamayor, and Ricla.

Description

The sites representing Mudejar art in Aragón proposed for inscription were 157 in the first nomination proposal. This number was subsequently reduced by the State Party to 64. These sites are nominated to be added to the four sites of Teruel already on the List, making the total of 68. According to the revised list, the sites proposed for inscription are situated in 49 municipalities, most of them in the province of Zaragoza (54 sites), and a few in the provinces of Teruel (9 sites) and Huesca (1 site). To this should be added the four sites in the municipality of Teruel, province of Teruel. The properties are in variable settings, which may be large urban areas, small townships, villages, and even open countryside.

Regarding the definition of the nominations, the sites can be classified on the basis of what is proposed to be included in each case. The following list is arranged in groups, indicating the province, municipality, name of the building, date of construction, and level of protection (see "Legal status" below): a. tower alone, b. tower and church, c. religious building with no mention of tower, and d. other buildings or parts of buildings. Each group is arranged in an approximate chronological order.

a Tower, either standing alone or as part of church: 5 towers in the province of Teruel; 13 towers in the province of Zaragoza, each in a different municipality:

- | | |
|----------|---|
| Zaragoza | <i>Daroca (Santo Domingo de Silos, tower of church, mid 13th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Escatrón (Rueda de Ebro, tower of ruined monastery, 14th c. BIC.)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Longares (Asunción de la Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, 14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Almunia de Doña Godina, La (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, mid 14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Puebla de Alfindén, La (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, 14th–16th c. CAT)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Tarazona (Santa María Magdalena, tower and ceiling, end 14th–mid 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Belchite Viejo (Torre del Reloj, tower of church in ruins, 15th c. CAT)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Romanos (San Pedro Apóstol, tower of parish church, 15th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Villar de los Navarros, El (San Pedro, tower of church, 15th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Utebo (Santa María, tower of parish church, early 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>Muniesa (Asunción de la Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>Navarrete del Río (Asunción de la Nuestra Señora, late 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>Olalla (Iglesia Antigua, tower standing alone, 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Moyuela (Nuestra Señora de la Piedad, tower of parish church, 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Villamayor (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Fuentes de Jiloca (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, end 16th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>San Martín del Río (San Martín, tower of parish church, 16th – 17th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>Báguena (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, tower of parish church, 17th c. CAT)</i> |
- b** Tower and church: 2 ensembles in 2 municipalities of Teruel; 21 ensembles in 16 municipalities of Zaragoza:
- | | |
|----------|---|
| Zaragoza | <i>Tauste (Santa Maria, end 13th c. BIC)</i> |
| Teruel | <i>Montalbán (Santiago, 13th–14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Ateca (Santa Maria, 13th–14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Zaragoza (San Pablo, end 13th–14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Zaragoza (San Gil Abad, early 14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Zaragoza (Santa Maria Magdalena, early 14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Alagón (San Pedro Apóstol, early 14th c. CAT)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Calatayud (San Pedro de los Francos, early 14th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Maluenda (La Asunción, old tower and ceiling, 15th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Alfajarín (San Miguel Arcángel, 14th – 15th c. CAT)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Herrera de los Navarros (San Juan Baustista, 14th – 15th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>Zaragoza (San Miguel de los Navarros, end 14th–15th c. BIC)</i> |
| Zaragoza | <i>San Mateo de Gállego (San Mateo, 14th–16th c. BIC)</i> |

- Zaragoza *Aniñón (Nuestra Señora del Castillo, 14th–16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Calatayud (Santa María, 14th–16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Belchite Viejo (San Martín, 15th–16th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Calatayud (San Andrés, 15th–16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Ricla (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, 15th – 16th c. BIC)*
- Teruel *Albalate del Arzobispo (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, 16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Peñaflor (Nuestra Señora de los Angeles, mid 16th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Mainar (Santa Ana, late 16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Monterde (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, late 16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Paniza (Nuestra Señora de los Angeles, late 16th–17th c. CAT)*

c Religious buildings (tower not specified): 1 parish church and 1 sanctuary in Teruel; 9 parish churches, 1 cathedral and 1 monastery in Zaragoza, each in a different municipality:

- Zaragoza *Borja (Santa María, parish church, 13th–14th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Maluenda (Santas Justa y Rufina, church, early 14th–15th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Magallón (Santa María de la Huerta, church in ruin, mid 14th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Zaragoza (Monasterio de la Resurrección, 14th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Cervera del Cañada (Santa Tecla, parish church, 14th–15th c. BIC)*
- Teruel *Híjar (Santa María la Mayor, church, 14th–16th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Tarazona (Cathedral of Santa María de la Huerta, 14th–16th c. BIC)*
- Teruel *Peñarroya de Tastavins (Ermita del Santuario de la Virgen de la Fuente, late 14th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Tobed (Santa María, late 14th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Torralba de Ribota (San Félix, parish church, end 14th–15th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Azuara (Nuestra Señora de la Piedad, parish church, late 14th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Morata de Jiloca (San Martín de Tours, parish church, 15th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Quinto de Ebro (Asunción de Nuestra Señora, parish church, 15th c. BIC)*

d Other types of buildings or parts of buildings: 1 church interior in the province of Huesca; 5 churches and 2 castles with extant Mudéjar elements, and 2 residential buildings, in 7 municipalities of Zaragoza:

- Zaragoza *Daroca (San Juan de la Cuesta, apse of church, 13th c. CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Almunia de Doña Godina, La (Nuestra Señora, elements of interior, mid 14th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Belmonte de Gracián (San Miguel, tower of 14th c. and apse of 17th c. in parish church, CAT)*
- Zaragoza *Zaragoza (La Seo, apse, ciborium & elements of interior in a church, 14th–16th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Zaragoza (Palacio de la Aljafería, decorative elements, 14th–15th c. BIC)*

- Zaragoza *Mesones de Isuela (Castillo, interior of castle, late 14th c. BIC)*
- Huesca *Puebla de Castro, La (San Román de Castro, interior of church, ca. 1400, BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Cetina (Castillo, decorative elements of palace, 15th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Daroca (Palacio de los Luna, residential building, 15th c. BIC)*
- Zaragoza *Borja (Casa de la Estanca, house, 16th c. CAT)*

The **churches** are characterized in three groups: churches with one nave, fortress churches, and churches with three aisles. The *first type*, with one nave, is the most common, eg San Pedro of Alagón, Nuestra Señora del Castillo of Aniñón, San Martín of Belchite, Santa María of Borja, and other churches in Gracian, Calatayud, Cañada, Híjar, Magallón, Mainar, Rufina, Jiloca, Peñaflor, Tastavins, Ricla, Tauste, and Tobed. The *second type*, fortress churches, is represented by Nuestra Señora de la Piedad of Azura, Santiago of Montalbán, Nuestra Señora de l'Asunción of Quinto de Ebro, and San Gil of Zaragoza. The *third type* of church with three aisles is rare and is represented by San Pedro de los Francos of Calatayud, the chapel of the Palace of Aljafería in Zaragoza.

The **bell towers** represent perhaps the most visible element of Mudéjar architecture and are characterized by great richness in their decoration: a variety of geometric patterns of brick reliefs, different patterns of coloured ceramics, elements in gypsum, as well as various architectural forms, niches, windows, and buttresses. The towers can have different forms in the plan: *octagonal* base (San Pedro of Alagón, Santa María and San Andrés of Calatayud, Nuestra Señora of Muniesa, Santa María of Tauste), or *square* base (San Miguel of Alfajarín, Nuestra Señora of La Almunia de Doña Godina). Several towers have Christian influence, and have either a square or an octagonal plan, or a mixture of both forms (*square* base: Nostra Señora de la Piedad of Moyuela; *octagonal* base: Santa Ana of Mainar; *mixed* base: Nuestra Señora of Ricla). Their internal structure differs from the "Almohades model" (with one tower inside another) and the stairs are additional feature. Some churches have a *ciborium* over the nave, in the form of tower with a square plan, which then becomes octagonal and is crowned with a bell tower (eg the cathedral of Tarazona, La Seo of Zaragoza).

Another typical feature of Mudéjar architecture is found in the painted and decorated *ceilings* in wood, of which the best known example is in Santa María de Mediavilla (13th c.) of Teruel, already inscribed on the World Heritage List. The current proposal includes various additional examples (eg Santa Tecla of Cervera de la Cañada, the chapel of the Castel of Mesones de Isuela).

Most of the proposed sites are churches or parts of churches, but the list also includes a *monastery* (the Real Monasterio of Zaragoza), and selected elements of two *castles* (the Palacio de la Aljafería of Zaragoza and the Castillo of Mesones de Isuela). Furthermore, there are three *residential buildings*, including the Castillo Palazzo of Cetina, the Palacio de los Luna of Daroca, and the Casa de la Estanca of Borja.

Management and Protection

Legal status

There are two basic legal instruments that concern cultural heritage in the province of Aragón: the national law of 25 June 1985 on the *Patrimonio Histórico Español* and Regional Law No 3-99 of 10 March 1999 on the *Patrimonio Cultural Aragonés*. The latter law identifies three different categories of properties for protection: the *Bienes de Interés Cultural* (BIC), the *Bienes Catalogados* (CAT), and the *Bienes Inventariados*. The properties proposed for inscription are either *Bienes de Interés Cultural* or *Bienes Catalogados*. There are 50 properties in the first category (indicated BIC in the list above), in which any alteration to the property is forbidden and the owner is obliged to take necessary measures for adequate conservation. The control is extended also to the immediate surroundings of the property (buffer zone). There are 14 properties in the category of *Bienes Catalogados* (indicated CAT in the list above), for which there are fewer obligations. It is understood that, should such properties be inscribed, they would be protected under the BIC category.

The present nomination generally identifies the property within the strict limits of the description (ie the tower, the whole building, or selected elements). This core area is surrounded with a buffer zone, which is generally limited to the public open space, including the facades of surrounding buildings that have a direct visual connection with the property. There are some exceptions, such as the church of Santa Maria in Borja, where the buffer zone includes the surrounding buildings, and the sites of Torre del Reloj and Torre e Iglesia de San Martín in Belchite Viejo, where the buffer zone includes the entire village.

The Departamento de Cultura y Turismo, instituted in 1999, includes in its responsibilities issues related to the protection and conservation of cultural heritage.

Management

Fundamentally, the responsibility for the management of the properties is with the respective municipal authorities and the owners. Finances for interventions can come from different sources, including the yearly budgets of the responsible authorities, but also from private sources, and in some cases from the European Union.

The situation regarding the management of the monuments proposed to the World Heritage List is quite complex. This is due to the large number of properties (64) distributed in a vast territory (the Aragón region has a territory of nearly 48,000km² and about 1.2 million inhabitants), the number of municipalities and other authorities involved (49), the number of provinces (3), and the number of owners, generally private in the case of churches, and users, which is generally the public. The settings of the different monuments vary greatly, from urban centres to rural ensembles and even to open countryside. Most of the buildings are in current use and management responsibilities may vary greatly from one case to another. The conditions of the buildings also vary: some are in good condition, others may be in ruins. Some of the buildings are in a fairly isolated situation in small rural settlements and they are rarely open for visits.

According to Law No 3-1999 on the *Patrimonio Cultural Aragonés*, Article 78 requires the preparation of a *Plan de Promoción y Conservación del Patrimonio Cultural* and

Article 83 *Planes Territoriales del Patrimonio Cultural*. During the mission to Aragón, the ICOMOS expert was able to verify that only one such plan existed so far, the *Plan de Restauración del Mudéjar de Teruel*, prepared after this site had been included on the World Heritage List. The other plans have not yet been completed. In any case, coordination of management, including scheduled maintenance, monitoring of the state of conservation, and periodic reporting, are certainly not easy to guarantee.

The authorities of Aragón are aware of the need to promote the protection and conservation of Mudéjar art and architecture, and it is believed that qualified cultural tourism can be a useful instrument in this regard. There are different promotional activities, such as the organization of selected itineraries to improve the knowledge and diffusion of information of Mudéjar culture. Such itineraries are promoted in particular by the City Council of Zaragoza.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Mudéjar architecture is particularly vulnerable to various causes of deterioration, including climatic factors, earthquakes, floods, and also damage caused by man and animals. In the past these have included, for example, the Civil War of 1936–39, during which several properties were destroyed. The continuity of use has favoured their maintenance, but it has also caused problems related to uncontrolled changes and alterations. The exposed brick decorations and ceramics are fragile in terms of wind erosion, temperature changes, and frost. Many of the roofs and ceilings have been lost as the result of fires and other disasters.

The properties proposed for nomination are reported to be generally in good condition. It is mentioned that about 65% have been restored. The authorities have estimated that another decade will be necessary to complete the task, subject to available finances.

Authenticity and integrity

Mudéjar architecture was created in a specific period in time, ranging from the moment when the Mudéjars were allowed to stay in Aragón, in the 12th century, until their final expulsion at the beginning of the 17th century. This art has drawn its inspiration basically from two sources, from Islamic connections in North Africa and from European Gothic as this evolved in the same period. The question can be raised up to what point such traditions can be seen as having continued beyond those limits, but it would be logical to limit the consideration to the preservation of the historic monuments that have survived. In terms of restoration, therefore, the question concerns assurances that the historical authenticity of the material is guaranteed and that any restoration and changes are carried out respecting internationally accepted principles. The ICOMOS expert has indicated a variety of situations and approaches in the different sites that were visited. While many of the monuments can be considered historically authentic, there are other cases where the interventions raise problems. It is noted, however, that, after the visit of the ICOMOS expert several compromised sites with such problems were removed from the revised proposal.

Regarding the question of integrity, the nomination proposal raises various issues. The fact that the proposal has focused on extremely limited elements of architecture – often a tower, an apse, or a ceiling, in other cases an entire building – the relationship of these fragmentary elements with their setting remains unclear. It is appreciated that the decorative elements of Mudejar art are certainly the most characteristic. Nevertheless, such elements were conceived as components of architecture, and even parts of a larger context. The nomination fails to deal with this issue. Rather, the selection is made more or less on terms of museum-like preservation. In fact, even in the case of whole buildings, there is no indication about the built or natural environment of which these form part.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

Four Mudejar sites situated in the town of Teruel were inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1986 on the basis of criterion iv. The area of the present extension was visited by an ICOMOS expert in January–February 2001. Following the mission, the authorities of the State Party prepared a revised proposal, reducing the number of properties from 157 to 64 and eliminating some of the sites that were not considered to be of the same quality as the others or where their condition was not satisfactory.

Qualities

The development of Mudejar art was the result of special political, social, and cultural conditions in Spain after the Reconquest, a coexistence of Islamic and Christian societies. This art contains influences from the Islamic world as well as from European Gothic and is characterized by the extremely refined and inventive use of brick and glazed ceramics in architecture, particularly marked in the bell towers. Other elements include painted coffered ceilings made in wood. The outstanding universal value of Mudejar art has already been recognized by the World Heritage Committee on the occasion of the inscription of the monuments of Teruel in 1986.

Comparative analysis

Mudejar art developed mainly in Spain, though it was also diffused into a broader context, including even Latin America. In this context, the region of Aragón has been recognized as the area where this art reached its most outstanding achievements.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

It is noted that the aim of the World Heritage Convention is to provide an international instrument for the protection of cultural and natural heritage of outstanding universal value. At the same time, as is stated in the General Principles of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (paragraph 6, i), the Convention “is not intended to provide for the protection of all properties of great interest, importance or value, but only for a select list of the most outstanding of these from an international viewpoint.” It is noted that an inscription is subject to the condition that the site passes the test of authenticity and has adequate protection and management mechanisms, including regular monitoring and periodic reporting.

The issue of the outstanding universal value of Mudejar art has already been assessed. There would therefore appear to be no need to provide any further proof by inscribing more properties of the same type. A reason for such an extension as the present one would be the desire to make sure that the different aspects of the heritage have been covered in the nomination. It is also considered necessary that such a serial nomination should have the necessary coherence required for its protection, management, and monitoring as required by the Committee.

ICOMOS recognizes the efforts made by the State Party in preparing the nomination documents and the intention to guarantee the protection of the monuments. At the same time, taking into consideration the large number and the variable conditions of the monuments concerned, the great variety of ownerships, and the number of authorities who are responsible, there are limits to the efficiency of coordinated management and control. In fact, there are no management plans as yet, although these are reported to be under preparation.

It is noted, furthermore, that the international coordination of efforts related to the protection of the sites inscribed have specific requirements as well as limitations. There is a need to gather all relevant information in a single document presenting the proposal, considering that the original nomination has since been integrated by an addendum, which has altered the character of the nomination but without providing all necessary information. No database has yet been provided on the nomination to indicate the exact locations of all sites concerned (eg a GIS file), as requested by UNESCO.

While recognizing the potential for the inscription of the current nomination, either as an extension or perhaps rather as a new nomination that could integrate the site already inscribed (Mudejar Architecture of Teruel), it is proposed that the nomination be reformulated taking into consideration the various issues raised above. This requires a strict limitation of the number of the sites to be inscribed with the object of forming a serial nomination that illustrates the different aspects of Mudejar art, but without attempting to include everything that is of value. There is a need to give serious consideration to the issues of protection and coherent management and control of the ensemble of sites, not simply of the single elements but also their relationship with their settings, in conformity with current World Heritage policies.

Brief description

The development of Mudejar art in Aragón was the result of particular political, social, and cultural conditions in Spain after the Reconquest, the coexistence of Islamic and Christian societies from the 12th to 17th centuries. This art contains influences from the Islamic world and reflects the various European trends that developed in parallel, particularly Gothic. It is characterized by an extremely refined and inventive use of brick and glazed ceramics in architecture, particularly marked in the bell towers.

Recommendation

While confirming its appreciation of the universal significance of Mudéjar art and architecture and complimenting the State Party for the serious work in the identification and documentation of this heritage, ICOMOS recommends that a further effort be made in order to make a strict selection of the most outstanding of these sites for nomination. ICOMOS thus recommends that the nomination be *deferred* and the State Party requested to reformulate the nomination and redefine the properties concerned.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Tugendhat Villa (Czech Republic)

No 1052

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Tugendhat Villa in Brno
<i>Location</i>	Moravia, South Moravian region
<i>State Party</i>	Czech Republic
<i>Date</i>	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

As is apparent from the great deal of attention that has been afforded the Tugendhat Villa since its construction, this building is considered to be one of the most significant works to have been constructed in the 20th century. Doubts as to its innovatory concept, which arose for a short period following 1930, were soon replaced by admiration and enthusiasm. With time, this appreciation became unambiguously positive, as did the position that Brno held in the history of modern world architecture. Theorists, art historians, and architects are agreed that this work forms a milestone in the development of architecture, especially in the modern approach to living space and its construction. This is first and foremost due to the fact that the inward fusion and the outward open nature of the space considerably altered the relationship that one has to the spatial infiniteness surrounding the building in a similar way in which the interpretation of space was understood by contemporary philosophy and physics. From this point of view it is important to take into account the architect's designs and aims when evaluating the Tugendhat Villa, which have remained intact to the present day, both spatially and visually – ie they were not altered by the original inhabitants nor by the later disruptions in the history of the building. Its extraordinary value is also supported by the fact that the other ideas included in the architect's building programme have either remained intact in their original form or, with the help of the great deal of planning and photographic documentation available and technical building analysis that has taken place, may be restored to this original form. This is also true for the villa's sober furniture and fittings, the majority of which were designed by Mies van der Rohe, the lightness and relative lack of which lent superiority to the spatial element; all missing furniture in the main living area has now been replaced by replicas. It should be mentioned that the author of this building was able to realize his aims in full thanks especially to the ideal nature of his co-operation with the cultured Tugendhat family, which adds to the singular value and importance of the building. This fact was probably one of the reasons why such an analogically

conceived work was never to appear again in Mies's work, either in Europe or in America.

The Tugendhat Villa in Brno, along with several other works from the end of the 1920s (Glasraum in Stuttgart, the reconstructed pavilion in Barcelona), is one of the masterworks of Ludwig Mies van der Rohe. In constructing this building, for the first time in the history of modern architecture, Mies realized to a monumental degree the idea of "new living," based on the new theory of freely floating space in the house and its relationship to its surroundings. This idea, which had previously only been touched upon by Adolf Loos and Frank Lloyd Wright and which had been applied to a lesser degree in small family houses or in apartment blocks, resulted in the occupants using the living space to its greatest extent, and not just a part of it. This in turn fundamentally changed the relationship that people had to their spatial surroundings, and even infinite space by suppressing anxieties that come from unknown distances. It was a revolutionary approach to construction, space, and materials and the mutual ties that they and the whole building have to their natural surroundings. **Criterion i**

The new theory of living space, which was related to existential philosophy and which transformed isolated living areas into a living environment without boundaries, brought new ideas to the development of the family house model and its variations. Because of its radical nature, these ideas could only gradually be implemented following World War II.

Criterion ii

In addition, the Tugendhat Villa is a superlative example of the new concept of villa-type housing for the way in which it limits the traditional stately nature and formal surroundings in favour of heightening the standard of living both physically (comfort provided by technical equipment) and spiritual (using space as the highest aesthetic category of living). The building provides an example of a higher standard of living from the 20th century inter-war period, showing the lifestyle of a cultured, wealthy, and modern-thinking level of society. **Criterion iv**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

Tugendhat Villa was designed by the German architect, Mies van der Rohe (1886–1969), for Grete Weiss and her husband Fritz Tugendhat, members of wealthy industrial families in the city of Brno in former Czechoslovakia. The architect accepted the commission in 1927, and the design process lasted about two years, parallel with designing the German Pavilion (1928–29) at the International Fair in Barcelona, commissioned by the German Government. The construction of the Tugendhat Villa was completed by the end of 1930. The architect took charge of the project down to the smallest detail, also designing all the furniture of the house, designs that have become world-renowned.

Mies van der Rohe was one of the principal architects in the development of the Modern Movement in Architecture, which characterized design and construction in the 1920s and 1930s in Europe and North America. Originally from Aachen and then working in Berlin, he was influenced by the work and teachings of Behrens and Berlage, by the principles of the *De Stijl* movement, as well as by Frank Lloyd Wright. His early interests were in developing design concepts for high-rise buildings in reinforced concrete and glass in the early 1920s: he designed the Weissenhof apartments in Stuttgart in 1927, another key work in the Modern Movement. From 1926 Mies van der Rohe was a member of the *Deutscher Werkbund*, and, from 1930 to 1933 he was Director of the Bauhaus in Dessau. He later moved to Chicago in the USA, teaching at the Illinois Institute of Technology and designing large office buildings, his later trademark. His furniture designs have become classics in the 20th century.

During the German occupation, the Tugendhat family left Czechoslovakia and the Villa was taken over by the German State in 1939. It lost most of its original furniture, and was subject to some alterations and damage – eg that caused by a bomb explosion in the neighbourhood in 1944. After the war, the building was taken over by the State of Czechoslovakia; it served a nearby children's hospital and then the national health institute of Brno, becoming the property of the City of Brno. In 1962 the Villa was protected as a national monument. There was increasing interest in restoring it, and the first study to this effect was made in 1971, leading to a restoration campaign in 1981–85, which guaranteed the continuation of the use of the building on a provisional basis. The Tugendhat Villa Fund was established in 1993, followed by the decision of the Friends of the Tugendhat Fund to undertake a scientific restoration of the building. This work took place beginning in 1994 and funds were raised to furnish the building with replicas of the original designs by Mies van der Rohe.

Description

The Tugendhat Villa is a detached house in a residential area of the city of Brno, in Brno-Černá Pole at 45 Černopolní Street. The entrance to the house is from the street on the north side of the lot, which slopes down toward the south forming a small garden. The building is situated along the street and has three floors, one facing the street and three developing down towards the garden. The house has a flat roof, and each floor has a different plan. The total floor area is about 2000 m².

The uppermost floor is entered directly from the street level and includes a terrace that traverses the house and forms a balcony on the garden side. From here one reaches a small entrance hall, family bedrooms, and services; the master bedroom and dressing room are on the garden side. The garage and caretaker's lodging are at the west end of the house. From the hallway and from the balcony there are stairways leading down to the main floor, which has three parts: the main living area with a winter garden measuring c 280 m², almost two-thirds of the entire floor space, and subtle divisions between spaces with different functions – reception room, music corner, study and library, sitting areas, dining room, and services. The second part has kitchen facilities, and the third part consists of the servants' area. The living area has large windows on two sides and is directly joined to the terrace,

which is partly open, partly covered, and has a wide stairway leading down to the garden level. The ground level has utility rooms and is used for technical purposes.

The main structure of the house is made of reinforced concrete with steel frames. A structure of polished steel pillars supports the entire house. A steel skeleton also carries ceramic ceiling panels. The exterior of the house is rendered and painted white. Light-coloured travertine tiles are used in the staircases leading down to the garden, and in the living hall there is an ivory-coloured linoleum. The entrance is panelled with dark palisander wood. The back wall of the living area is made of beautiful onyx, articulated in 3m x 5m panels, the same division as in the glass wall opening toward the garden. The original furniture was designed by the architect himself and some of the pieces were made specifically for this house, such as the so-called Tugendhat chair, in chromium-plated flat steel elements and upholstered in stitched leather. The living area was furnished in such a way that each piece had its specific place. The mechanical equipment designed and built for the house was also exceptional, including special structural solutions for the use of steel pillars, for processing the onyx wall that was brought from the African Atlas Mountains, and for the electrically operated large steel-frame windows. The house had central heating and an air-conditioning system with a regulated fine-spray humidifying chamber.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The owner of the Tugendhat Villa is the City of Brno, represented by the Brno City Municipality. The administrator and user is the Brno City Museum. The Tugendhat Villa is classified as cultural heritage, and as a national cultural heritage property by Czech Republic Governmental Statute No 262/1995 Coll. on 16.8.1995. It is thus subject to protection under relevant legislation (No 20/1987, concerning the state conservation of cultural heritage and Decree No 66/1988; Construction Act No. 50/1976). A buffer zone has been designated for the property.

Management

The Villa has a property management plan. Since 1994 the responsibility for the management is with the City Museum of Brno. The main purpose is to maintain the villa and to present it to the public. In the past the villa was not accessible to visitors, but being now open it attracts an increasing number of Czech and foreign tourists (nearly 8000 in 1999).

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

During World War II the Villa suffered damage and after the war there were several changes of occupancy, causing some alterations in the building. Since the 1960s the Villa has been protected as cultural property and efforts have been made both to undertake research and care for its condition. The first restoration took place in the 1980s and another in the

1990s. Currently the Villa is in a good condition and subject to regular maintenance.

Authenticity

Over the period of its seventy-year existence, and in spite of the various alterations that the building has undergone since the loss of its first function, the original design of the architect has remained intact. The changes that have occurred over its lifetime have not affected the engineering features (construction, materials, and form). Its present condition results from the restorations in the 1980s and 1990s, based on detailed surveys of the building itself, the graphic and written documentation by Mies van der Rohe (archives in New York, Bauhaus Archiv of Berlin, Munich, and Brno), and recorded testimonies of the original inhabitants. The building has been furnished with replicas of the original designs. While the building has suffered in the past, it has retained all essential elements of its architecture and can be considered to satisfy the test of authenticity in all aspects.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS evaluation mission visited the site in February 2001. The committee of DoCoMoMo was also consulted.

Qualities

Mies van der Rohe worked both as an architect and as a furniture designer. In both fields his work is included amongst the principal references in 20th century design. The particular quality of Mies van der Rohe is in his drive for perfectionism in the design overall as well as in the smallest details. This could be seen specially in the fusion of neo-classical forms of simplicity, universality, and austerity with cleanliness, perfect proportions, elegance, and severity of detail. His aim was to find the essence in all construction elements and to develop his design solutions until he found the purest expression. It meant a further development of the spatial quality of the building, relating and articulating the various functions in the interior and linking with the exterior. The Tugendhat Villa (together with the Barcelona Pavilion) is the best known early example of his work in this line. The Villa is characterized by having its furniture designed by the architect, of which some pieces have become classics and are still in production today. In his later career Mies van der Rohe further developed his fundamental ideas, particularly in the construction of large office buildings, and his approach became extremely influential in the second part of the 20th century in America.

Comparative analysis

The Modern Movement in 20th century architecture responded to the rapidly evolving socio-economic situation, the new type of industrial production, and the emerging new needs, having its first expressions in 1910–20 (eg works by F. Lloyd Wright in USA and European architects such as H.P. Berlage in the Netherlands, O. Wagner and A. Loos in Austria, P. Behrens and W. Gropius in Germany, and A. Perret in France). Between 1920 and 1930 these beginnings developed into an International Style, acquiring universal significance as the fundamental basis for all subsequent development, and including examples such as the Rietveld-Schröder House of 1924 (inscribed on the World Heritage List in 2000: criteria i, ii) in Utrecht, the Bauhaus of 1926

(1996: ii, iv, vi) by Gropius in Dessau, the Weissenhof Building of 1927 by Mies van der Rohe in Stuttgart (an exhibition settlement designed by the foremost architects of the time), the Viipuri Library of 1927 in Russia and the Paimio Sanatorium of 1929 (on the tentative list) in Finland, both by A. Aalto, and the Villa Savoye of 1928 by Le Corbusier in France.

The contribution of Mies van der Rohe to this development was fundamental, and his design of the Tugendhat Villa (1927–30) in Brno is among the most outstanding expressions of residential architecture of the period. (The contemporary German Pavilion in Barcelona was demolished and has recently been rebuilt.) Mies van der Rohe learnt his concepts from Behrens (also the teacher of Gropius and Le Corbusier), Berlage, and the *De Stijl* group. His architecture can be characterized as concentrating on the essential and aiming at the purest expression in each detail as well as in the whole. His approach contributed to the later industrialization of building methods. Unlike many other modern architects, Mies van der Rohe often opted for the use of symmetry in his designs. The architecture of Gropius is perhaps closest in its functionalistic Bauhaus spirit. By comparison, from an initial search for rationality and modularity Le Corbusier developed his expression in a more sculptural and even "brutalistic" spirit, particularly in his later production, while Aalto searched for humane contacts with society and nature, relating his works with the character of the place.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Considering the care given by Mies van der Rohe to the relationship of architecture with their settings, ICOMOS recommends particular attention should be given to the garden layout of the Villa. Furthermore, while recognizing the current legal protection for the area of which the Tugendhat Villa is part, ICOMOS recommends careful control of land-use in the neighbourhood of the villa.

Brief description

The Tugendhat Villa in Brno (Czech Republic) was designed by the architect Ludwig Mies van der Rohe and built on a commission from Grete and Frits Tugendhat in 1927–30. It is an outstanding example of a small residential building representing the international style of the Modern Movement in the early 20th century architecture.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, and iv*:

The Tugendhat Villa in Brno, designed by the architect Mies van der Rohe, is an outstanding example of the international style in the Modern Movement in Architecture as it developed in Europe in the 1920s. Its particular value lies in the search for ways to implement innovative spatial and aesthetic concepts satisfying the emerging new needs in living standards as well as implementing the opportunities offered by modern industrial production. The Tugendhat Villa established a prototype for 20th century residential housing and became extremely influential in later designs.

ICOMOS, April 2001

Jurmala (Latvia)

No 1036

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Jurmala Wooden Construction (Dzintari District of Summer Cottages) (Latvia)
<i>Location</i>	City of Jurmala, Dzintari District
<i>State Party</i>	Latvia
<i>Date</i>	28 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Jurmala construction shows one of the characteristic features of European cultural history in the 19th and 20th centuries, ie the formation and development of health resorts. Jurmala is the most remarkable health resort in Latvia and one of the most famous and significant in the Baltic Sea coast. Jurmala wooden architecture, especially that of the Dzintari district, is comparatively well preserved and its architectural styles are characteristic of the epoch. Building traditions, especially related to decoration, demonstrate the quality of the handicrafts developed in Latvia over a long period of time. The pine forest and beach environment of Jurmala is of high value, favouring recreation, and the harmonious relationship between nature and culture is here well preserved. Dzintari is an urban area, which combines in a limited compound the stylistic trends and the main types of public and residential buildings of the time. Preservation of such values is seriously endangered, and the inclusion of the site on the World Heritage List would help to diminish such dangers.

Criterion ii

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Jurmala was first used by wealthy people from Riga and even as far away as Moscow and Petersburg, who came to stay with fishermen and farmers during their summer vacations. As a result, these started adjusting their buildings to meet the needs of summer residents. In the mid 19th century, vacant plots were assigned and cottages were built specifically for

seasonal needs, resulting in the construction of the Edinburg (Dzintari), Jaundubulti, Bulduri, and others.

The Dzintari resort area in Jurmala developed in the 1870s, starting with land division in plots in 1871 and the construction of the Edinburg district and Dzintari Avenue, and in 1877 Kara Street (now Edinburgas Avenue). A Lutheran church was authorized by the Russian Emperor in 1887 and an Orthodox parish church in 1896. A well-house was opened in Edinburg in 1897, developing into a casino in 1910; the sanatorium of Dr Maximovich was established in 1905 and the Edinburg Bathing Union was founded in 1907. In 1884 there were 73 land plots in Dzintari, mostly belonging to wealthy German and Russian owners. The resort population of Jurmala grew especially in the early 20th century, being 70,000 in 1914 while local residents numbered only about 6000. The communication of Jurmala with Riga (20km distant) was facilitated by transport on the Lielupe river, beginning in 1844, and by the building of a railway in 1877.

The Dzintari district was governed by the state administration of the Baltic Region until World War I, but from 1920 it became part of the city of Riga's Jurmala. In 1922 Edinburg was renamed Dzintari (amber), and the regulations excluded commercial, industrial, or crafts activities. During the Soviet period the district was nationalized and the Edinburg Orthodox church was demolished. Currently, the area is in the process of being privatized and it is a popular holiday place for Rigans and visitors from the former USSR.

Description

The Jurmala resort area extends over some 30km along the Gulf of Riga in the Baltic Sea. The area along the seafont consists of low sandy dunes and beaches with pine woods and it is separated from the mainland by a river. The Dzintari district is located in the eastern part of the resort area, which consists of several districts, listed from the west: Dubultu, Majoru, Dzintaru, Bulduru, and Lielupes. The 1887 railway runs along the southern border of the area. Two main streets run parallel to the seafont, Dzintaru Avenue along the sea and Edinburgas Avenue along the railway line. The area is divided into regular building plots with secondary streets across and other roads also through the central park area.

The natural environment of the region is characterized by pine forests and birch woods and their typical biodiversities. While generally dry and sandy, the region also contains some marsh land and it is rich in bird species. There are four nature protection areas, including the Kemeru national park.

The construction of the Dzintari area started in the 1870s; it was known as Edinburg until 1922, and it has continued until the present time. The architectural character of the area is very diversified, including buildings that represent a number of different styles and types, such as neo-Classical in the early phase, later mixed with Historicist approach. *Art Nouveau* became fashionable at the beginning of the 20th century, followed by National Romantic, Functionalistic and vernacular-type constructions. The older buildings of the district are generally built in wood using characteristically Nordic building techniques, but the more recent structures (since 1945) are in reinforced concrete. The historic buildings of the area include the Lutheran church (1889–96), the Maksimovitch sanatorium (1906), and the dwelling house of K. Morbergs (1883). Some of the dwelling houses

have retained their original interiors, containing decorated ceramic stoves and mural paintings.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The area proposed for nomination contains about 200 structures, of which 94% are privately owned, 5% state property, and 1% municipal property. Most of the Dzintari district is legally protected as a conservation area. Such protection does not include the central park nor some of the more recent buildings, even though these have been included in the nominated area. In the whole of Jurmala there are 568 listed monuments. In Dzintari, there are 43 listed monuments (ie 7% of the whole), comprising 12 monuments of art and 31 architectural monuments. Territorial protection is ensured under the Law on Environmental Protection (06.08.91) and the Law on Environmental Impact Assessment (31.08.98), as well as the Jurmala City Building Regulations.

Management

The authorities responsible for the control of protection and management of cultural heritage in general and this site in particular, include at the highest level the Minister's Cabinet and the State Inspection for Heritage Protection. Jurmala City Council is responsible for the development plan and construction control, implemented by the Cultural Historical Heritage Department of the Jurmala Town Council Building Board. Furthermore, there are several public institutions which play their role in the process. The Jurmala Development Plan was adopted in 1997; the relevant building regulations for the area date from 1998.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The resort town of Jurmala has been under continuous development since the 19th century, when it was first established. There have been basically three development periods, one in the first part of the 20th century, the second during the Soviet occupation, and the third since independence.

The original garden city layout with small villas has partly changed its character. In fact, the master plan of 1897 for the Edinburg area has since been substantially enlarged and altered through later development. At the same time older buildings have been demolished. New constructions have taken their place, many of these dating from the period after 1945 and consisting of multi-storey constructions that rise well above the treetops, thus detracting from the earlier resort character of the place. These include the Baltija sanatorium and other tall buildings (varying from three to eleven storeys), some of which have remained unfinished since the 1980s. There are also some large hotels directly on the dunes.

The condition of the buildings is variable; some have been restored or renovated recently, others are in poor condition. There is a general lack of maintenance, in many cases due to lack of funds. In several cases the ownership is unclear, many properties belonging to more than one owner. Many owners live abroad. Many of the houses were built as summer villas, not intended for year-round

occupation. There is concern that a transition from summer resorts to year-round residential use would change the historic character of the town. The smaller villas could be more easily rehabilitated, but the larger houses are more difficult to use. In the case of new uses, existing room patterns would need to be changed substantially.

Authenticity and integrity

The statistics given in the nomination document indicate that 28% of the buildings have specific value, the "volumes" of 20% should be kept, 32% have historical background but no architectural value, and 20% have been built after 1945. It is thus apparent that less than half of the buildings in this area can be considered as having specific value. While several listed villas can be seen to have maintained their authenticity, many of the older buildings have also been demolished. Furthermore, while the area of Jurmala as a whole continues to have a garden-city character of great importance, particularly owing to the presence of the remarkable pine forest, the original layout of the site, as it was planned in the late 19th century, has evolved and changed in various details.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in February 2001.

Qualities

The Jurmala Wooden Construction has been qualified as a representative example of a planned holiday resort area. Jurmala has a rich variety of late 19th to 20th century resort villas, bearing witness to different levels of class status. Some of the summer residents belonged to the upper middle classes, and even the high society, of St Petersburg and Moscow. At the other end of the spectrum was the resident population, living mainly in the western and southern parts and serving the summer guests. The varying sizes and standards of architecture still reflect this spectrum of social levels.

The area undoubtedly continues to have a large number of interesting historic buildings from the late 19th or early 20th century, which certainly justify protection and conservation at the national level. Jurmala represents a relatively late example in the history of European holiday resorts and could be compared with many similar sites elsewhere. The particular value of Jurmala is in the size of the area and in the garden-city character of the villa areas in the pine forest. Unfortunately, the later modifications and new constructions detract from the original planning concept.

Comparative analysis

The construction of health resorts in Europe relates to social and economic developments from the end of the 18th and particularly throughout the 19th century. Marienbad, Baden-Baden, Carlsbad, etc are well known examples. In the Baltic countries, such resorts include Arensburg in Saaremaa and Haapsalu in Estonia, as well as Palanga in Lithuania. Many of the holiday resorts have developed into relatively large compounds, having hundreds of buildings and including public services. The list is not complete though, and a more in-depth study could provide a clearer picture.

The following wooden ensembles are on the WH List: Røros (inscribed on the World Heritage List 1980: criteria iii, iv, v) and Bryggen (1979: iii) in Norway, Old Rauma (1991: iv, v) in Finland, and the Church Village of Gammelstad, Luleå (1996: ii, iv, v) in Sweden.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

ICOMOS recognizes that the area of Jurmala certainly has many qualities, as has been favourably noted by professionals who have visited the area. These qualities become evident perhaps more in the ensemble of the site, which is of impressive size, rather than in a limited area such as Dzintari. It is understood that the motivation for selecting this particular area relates to the fact that this was the first planned part of the resort, and that it has retained its original building stock reasonably well. Nevertheless, Dzintari is not necessarily an obvious choice, as most of the resort contains similarly valuable environments, and at least the proposed area should be extended westwards into the Majori district for inclusion of another kind of environment represented in Jurmala, with more densely set villas. The rest of the resort area could be seen as a buffer zone.

The Jurmala area has many shortcomings that range from the uncertainty of ownership, the variable condition of buildings, and lack of maintenance to the difficulty of guaranteeing a sustainable use for the historic buildings, originally built for holiday purposes only. The quality of the single properties varies greatly, though a large number of buildings have been listed in the entire area of Jurmala. In fact, only a few listed buildings are included in the nominated area. Though the theme of a resort area may be of interest, there is a need for comparative study taking into account that this was a major fashion in Europe much earlier than the period represented by Jurmala.

Brief description

The Dzintari holiday resort district of the Jurmala Wooden Construction is part of a late 19th century holiday resort town on the Baltic Sea. The holiday resort of Jurmala is an exceptionally large area built mainly in timber and has preserved interesting examples of villa architecture reflecting a variety of styles of the period.

Recommendation

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Tana Toraja (Indonesia)

No 1038

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Tana Toraja Traditional Settlement
<i>Location</i>	Tana Toraja Regency, South Sulawesi Province
<i>State Party</i>	The Republic of Indonesia
<i>Date</i>	29 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Tana Toraja, located on Sulawesi Island, is an important part of Indonesian culture. The Toraja Tribe is the general nomenclature applied to the people living along the Sa'dan River, which runs from north to south through the prefecture. The tribe cultivates rice for subsistence and in recent years coffee has become their crop. Although the island is experiencing an emergency because of the rapidly growing tourist industry promoted by the country, the Toraja Tribe manage to maintain their settlement and traditional ceremonies and lifestyles, living in traditional high-floored wooden houses. **Criteria ii, v, and vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

The Tana Toraja settlement represents traditional architecture in Indonesia, having its common origin with the other South-East Asian countries in Austronesian architecture, a fact that accounts for similarities in the houses of the region. The term "Austronesian" refers to a group of related languages spoken throughout the islands of South-East Asia and some parts of the Asian mainland, including Taiwan, the Pacific, and Madagascar. It is believed that this language group originated in southern Taiwan about 6000 years ago and has since spread throughout the region. The traditional architecture of the region shares the same cultural and stylistic roots, continuing to reflect the common heritage up to the present day.

The fact that close links between culture, the villages, and the landscapes on Sulawesi Island has been maintained as far back as 500 years (as some residents claim) is exceptional. Traced to the great migration of populations, the indigenous people of Toraja belong to the Proto-Malays, like the Batak Tribe in North Sumatra and the Dayaks in Kalimantan. The Torajan area was first surveyed by Dutch Jesuits at the end of the 19th century, and it is then that the name "Torajan," meaning the "Great or Respected People" or the "Mountain Tribe," was first applied to the population.

About one-third of the indigenous people of Toraja still maintain their traditional religion, Aluk Todolo, which is a form of animism, while the rest of the population practise Christianity or Islam. In the beliefs of Aluk Todolo, a major emphasis is placed on respect for ancestors and on complying with ancient traditional customs. One's duty is to fulfil the obligations and responsibilities toward the community in order to live happily until the time of dying and moving into the other world. Death itself is an important event, associated with elaborate rituals that involve the family and the village community. Since continuation after death is conditioned by behaviour in this world, life becomes preparation for the afterlife.

Cosmological symbolism is also reflected in the Toraja house. The front of the house is always oriented to the north, the direction which religious belief associates with the creator deity, Puang Matua. It is also the direction of Dongson in Indochina from where their ancestors are believed to have set sail for Sulawesi. The sweep of the roof recalls the ancient boats. Decorative motifs carved and painted on the exterior walls of the houses represent wealth and the multiplying effect of nature. Just below the roofline a cock stands above the figure of the moon, emblems of family greatness and high rank.

The houses exemplify themes central to the social organization of the Torajan culture. Only the nobility had the right to build a *tongkonan*. It establishes the family position's in the community and is a source of pride. Descendants are therefore bound by tradition to maintain the family house in the manner that their ancestors kept it. Genealogy, prized in the local traditions, is the basis for residents to date the age of their houses. With oral history as a guide, some descendants trace their genealogy back to the ancestors who first built the structure. Some oral accounts go back twenty generations (approximately 500 years assuming 25 years per generation) of the same family occupying a *tongkonan*, thus dating some houses as 500 years old. No scientific testing has been carried out to validate this claim.

Description

The nomination comprises four areas: Kete Kesu, Pala Toke, Buntu Kana, and Buntu Pune. The first three are owned by the Kete Kesu Foundation, a legal entity whose membership is composed of all the villagers, and the whole comprises a territory of 295ha. Kete Kesu is a traditional village, including a mountain burial site. Pala Toke is a cliff burial site within a communally owned forest. Buntu Kana is a communal forest surrounded by communally owned rice paddies. The area owned by the foundation also contains other villages with new architecture, including residences, schools, grazing land, forests, as well as two categories of rice paddies – communal paddies growing

rice for ceremonial purposes, and individually owned land producing rice for private consumption. The recently completed master plan has articulated the area into the sanctuary zone, the agricultural zone, and the development zone. Buntu Pune is a village similar to Kete Kesu, set on a low hill and surrounded by private forests and rice paddies. The principal difference between the two villages is that Kete Kesu is still an inhabited community whilst the inhabitants of Buntu Pune have left their village to migrate to urban centres and have entrusted its maintenance to a resident caretaker.

The layout of Kete Kesu and Buntu Pune is typical of Torajan villages. A row of *tongkonan* stand parallel to one another facing north. In front of the houses is a wide, boulevard-like open space, bounded on one side by the row of *tongkonan* and on the other by a parallel row of rice granaries (*lumbung*). The granaries are smaller structures of the same architectural design. Rice is stored on the upper level. The storage room below is an open platform where the owner of the granary entertains guests. Next to the compact village is an open field with upright column-shaped natural stones (menhirs) rising out of the ground. These stones seem to date as far back as the oldest house in the village. During funeral ceremonies water buffaloes are tethered to stones in preparation for their sacrificial slaughter.

In the early development of the Toraja style, houses were built close to the ground with designs incised on the unpainted exterior walls. Originally there was only a slight curve to the roof. Later examples take the style to extremes. The house was built higher off the ground. Its walls became more intricately carved and painted in tones of red, black, and yellow. The most significant development was the roof curve, giving a pronounced overhang over the north and south elevations to illustrate the power and prestige of the owner. The exaggerated roof jutted so far from the house that a freestanding wooden post is needed to keep up its tip from falling over. A collection of the horns of water buffaloes sacrificed during the funerals is displayed on the post and the exterior walls as a symbol of prestige. Villages are surrounded by rice paddies for food and ceremonial purposes as well as by forests of bamboo and wood used for the repair of *tongkonan* houses.

The burial grounds are located a short walk behind the village. Usually stone cliffs are chosen as burial sites: these are cut into by hand high up to receive coffins. In other cases, wooden posts are cantilevered out high up on the cliffs to support the "hanging" wooden coffins. Shallow incisions are made into the stone cliffs to accommodate a gallery of wooden sculptures (*tau-tau*), effigies of the dead buried in the site, wearing clothing belonging to the dead person. In more recent years, family mausolea have been built on the ground close to the cliff for those who have turned Christian or Muslim but who still wish to follow the animist Torajan burial practices. In other burial grounds, the bodies of small babies are placed inside incisions made in large trees.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The sites are protected by the following national legislation of Indonesia: Law of Environmental Protection (No 4/1982); Law concerning items of cultural property (Government Regulation No 10/1993 and Ministerial Decree No 063/U/1994).

Since March 2001 the Directorate General for Culture has no longer been under the Ministry of Education, and has joined the Ministry of Tourism. The merger is expected to mean some changes in policies, as well as the provision of a Culture and Tourism Plan for 2001–2006.

Each villager of Kete Kesu and Buntu Pune is a full member of their respective Village Foundation; these are legally chartered. Their primary purpose is to manage all communal properties of the village and to assure the continued maintenance of the historic sites (*tongkonan*, communal ceremonial fields, burial grounds) and the communal agricultural and forest areas.

Management

The site boundaries of the cluster consisting of Kete Kesu, Pala Toke, and Buntu Kana are delineated by the property boundaries belonging to the Kete Kesu Foundation. The site has a Master Plan, according to which the entire 295ha owned by the Foundation is protected and forms a buffer zone for the three sanctuary areas. The Master Plan also specifies development zones, such as building tourist lodging facilities and restaurants. The new buildings are built in a modern version of the traditional *tongkonan*. The development cluster is out of sight of the main road and Kete Kesu village and is separated from Buntu Kana (a communal forest and a sanctuary zone) by large rice paddies. The zoning keeps the tourist cluster clearly separate from the forest and Foundation statutes prevent the new construction from encroaching on the forest.

The Buntu Pune Foundation is organized along similar lines as the Kete Kesu Foundation. Its charter legally defines its site boundaries. Buntu Pune village stands on a hill surrounded by rice paddies which belong to the Foundation: these form an adequate buffer zone. The difference between this site and Kete Kesu is that Kete Kesu is a living site still inhabited by the community whereas the Buntu Pune is empty except for a lone resident caretaker. There is no Foundation member residing in the village to carry out the protection mandate in their charter.

On a national level the Department of Archaeology of the Directorate General for Culture is responsible for the management of the site. At the provincial level the Sulawesi Province Unit of the Department of Archaeology located in the city of Makassar directly supervises the site. Kete Kesu is the model for site management in Tana Toraja. All site management plans and conservation interventions are strictly controlled by the Provincial Unit of the Department of Archaeology. The leading resident of Kete Kesu Village, a local craftsman, is on the staff of the Provincial Unit of the Department of Archaeology, and he ensures that conservation is carried out as specified as well as constantly surveying the site. The charter of the Kete Kesu Foundation stresses the preservation of the natural and cultural heritage, ensuring the active participation of its Board with the Provincial Unit in preservation matters.

Buntu Pune residents have abandoned the village to live in the city, leaving the maintenance of the village their houses to a resident caretaker. However, the village has a registered Buntu Pune Foundation for the administration and management of communal properties, and especially the *tongkonan*. The Provincial Unit has undertaken some conservation projects in the village, involving the caretaker as a craftsman in the project to make him aware of proper preservation procedures. The Department of Archaeology, therefore, maintains good links with the village caretaker and is able to entrust him with monitoring conservation and safeguarding the site.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The traditional villages, burial grounds, rice paddies, and forests that form the area of the Tana Toraja traditional settlement have been managed and maintained respecting ancient traditions. The Department of Archaeology has programmed limited conservation funds for 2001 to replace the zinc roofs of some *tongkonan* with the traditional bamboo. As a whole, the nominated area is well maintained and in satisfactory condition. It is, however, noted that new houses have been built in the rear of the *tongkonan* for the families to carry out their daily functions, while they all return to the *tongkonan* at night to sleep.

The future of the Tana Toraja settlement depends on the environment, the rice paddies, private forests, and burial sites, whose continuation can be severely threatened with a change in environmental policy. Any degradation in the environment will affect the cultural life and traditions of the community. Deforestation and mining of limestone for cement production would endanger the traditional burial grounds located in mountain cliffs. Particular attention is required on these issues.

The area is a major tourist destination, the second most important in Indonesia after Bali, despite its remote location. So far, tourism planning has focused on increasing the number of visitors. It is hoped that the merging of the Directorate General for Culture with the Ministry of Tourism will endorse the involvement of conservation specialists in the preparation of the second five-year tourism plan. It is also noted that a new tourist lodging facility is planned across the provincial road from Kete Kesu Village in such a way that it would block the view of the rice fields. Its relocation is desirable.

Authenticity and integrity

Owing to the nature of wooden structures subjected to severe moisture in the damp tropics, members must be routinely replaced. The craftsmanship in the replacement of structural members has been carried out in the traditional manner and to a high quality, following the original design, ensuring that the integrity of the structure is maintained fully respecting the design.

The continuation of traditional beliefs on the value of the *tongkonan* in the Torajan community and its relation with the natural sites that surround it (agricultural and forest fields, burial sites) assures the traditional integrity of the site. Maintenance of the communally owned forests guarantees a supply of bamboo and wood needed for house

repairs. Maintenance of the *tongkonan* is undertaken with full cooperation between the local community and the Department of Archaeology, thus assuring both traditional craftsmanship and scientific measures for conservation. Torajan craftsmen have also been invited to Japan for training.

New houses have been built in the rear of the *tongkonan* where family members perform daytime functions, though all return to the *tongkonan* to sleep. This arrangement is necessary because the spaces inside a *tongkonan* are quite small. The Kete Kesu Development Plan specifies the removal of such new houses and their relocation away from the sanctuary zone.

The site thus meets the test of authenticity in design, workmanship, and setting; the materials used in the construction have mostly retained their traditional character with some minor exceptions (eg some zinc roofs in Buntu Pune). The site also contains various elements of ancient origin, such as the *menhir* stones in burial grounds. The site has maintained the integrity of its setting exceptionally well and its components imprint a distinctive character on the landscape.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

The site was visited by an ICOMOS evaluation mission in February 2001.

Qualities

The Tana Toraja Traditional Settlement is an outstanding example of Indonesian vernacular architecture and part of the Austronesian building tradition. The outstanding feature of the nomination is in the bold architectural character of its constructions. The *tongkonan* in particular exemplify themes central to the social organization of the Torajan culture, and are also closely associated with cosmological symbolism. Even more importantly, the site represents an ongoing tradition, based on the beliefs of the Aluk Todolo animist religion, expressed in the combination of the components of the settlement, its residential areas, burial grounds, rice paddies, and forests. All these form a cultural landscape resulting from a long interaction between the local community and nature. It is also noted that, in addition to the nominated sites, there are other villages with similar characteristics. The villages are placed in prominent positions overlooking communal rice fields and forests, and forming a landscape of remarkable beauty.

The nominated property is considered to have the potential of being recognized for its outstanding universal value on the basis of criteria iii, iv, and v.

Comparative analysis

The uniqueness of the Toraja house (*tongkonan*) is well known in Indonesian vernacular architecture and its significant characteristics (exaggerated roof line and richly carved exterior walls) set it apart from other examples of South-East Asian vernacular architecture. Like other South-East Asian dwellings, the *tongkonan* have high-pitched rooflines and their living quarters are also raised above the ground by means of a system of wooden posts. The extended roof ridge and wooden pile structure attest to

an ancestry shared with other vernacular Austronesian dwellings that still continue to be built in rural areas in most South-East Asian countries today. However, the bold upward sweep of their roofs and the painted etched relief texture of the carved exterior wooden walls resting upon a system of exposed wooden stilts show an ingenuity that pushes the structure to its extreme limit, therefore representing a unique architectural achievement in South-East Asian vernacular architecture.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Recognizing the serious interest by the local population and by the state authorities in retaining the character and the values of the sites, ICOMOS observes that the integrity of the site and the authenticity of its components fundamentally depend on the continuity of the cultural traditions and beliefs of the community in the future. Considering the qualities of the nomination overall as well as the fragility of the sites, the identification and protection of the area as a cultural landscape would bring the various components and the traditional land use into a more coherent context, thus enforcing the possibilities for the local community and the state authorities to manage the site. The ICOMOS mission noted issues that give reason for some concern, although these may not be an immediate threat. Such issues include the increasing tourism and its consequences on the environment and the traditional culture itself. Moreover, considering the area overall, any deforestation or mining would undermine its fragile integrity. At the same time, ICOMOS wishes to commend in particular the beneficial cooperation between the Village Foundations, the local authorities, and the Department of Archaeology, which it considers to be a fundamental condition for successful protection and conservation management of the area.

Recognizing the initiatives already taken by the State Party, and based on the observations of the site mission, ICOMOS recommends that the State Party take the following actions:

- Prepare and submit a clear delineation and map of the boundaries of the nominated area and of the relevant buffer zone. The nominated area should be preferably clustered so as to facilitate conservation management. Consideration should also be given to the possibility of nominating the site as a cultural landscape, including other village areas if feasible.
- Prepare and submit a Management Plan for the entire nominated area and buffer zone, as well as a development plan for the area owned by the Buntu Pune Foundation.
- Provide the information relevant to the Tana Toraja area in the new Five-Year Tourism Development Plan of the region, in preparation by the Ministry of Tourism and the Directorate General for Culture.
- Transfer the proposed tourist accommodation planned close to Kete Kesu Village to a location where it would not hinder the panorama from the village.

Brief description

The Tana Toraja Traditional Settlement is an outstanding example of the vernacular traditions of South-East Asia. The area is characterized by the combination of residential areas,

burial grounds, rice paddy fields, and forests, all integral parts of the traditional functions and land uses. The rows of *tongkanan* buildings with their bold overhanging roofs and the cosmological symbolism reflected in their decoration represent a unique architectural achievement.

Recommendation

While recognizing the great interest of the proposed nomination as a significant cultural landscape, ICOMOS recommends that further consideration of this nomination be *deferred* subject to a clear definition of the nominated area and relevant buffer zone, the preparation of a coherent management plan for the whole, and provision of providing information on tourism development and assurances on the policies regarding new constructions in critical areas. The possibility of the State Party making a request for preparatory assistance should also be considered.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Zollverein (Germany)

No 975

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine
<i>Location</i>	Land Nord-Rhein-Westfalen
<i>State Party</i>	Federal Republic of Germany
<i>Date</i>	4 November 1999 (revised text)

Justification by State Party

When the Zollverein Mine XII was completed in 1932, it was considered to be the most modern and beautiful coal mine in the world, the daily output of which, 12,000 tonnes of hard coal, was four times higher than the normal figure. The same year saw the end of the Bauhaus, the most noble objective of which had been to work towards the “new building of the future” by fusing craft and art. In the opinion of the founder of the Bauhaus, Walter Gropius, the goal of architecture was to create objects and spaces for the purpose of which a new development of form had to proceed, in particular, from the works of engineering and industry. At the Zollverein mine the Bauhaus maxim that form must be oriented towards function is perfectly translated into reality.

Zollverein XII was created at the end of a phase of political and economic upheaval and change in Germany, which was represented aesthetically in the transition from Expressionism to Cubism and Functionalism. At the same time, Zollverein XII embodies this short economic boom between the two World Wars, which has gone down in history as the “Roaring Twenties.” However, Zollverein is also, and by no means least, a monument of industrial history reflecting an area in which, for the first time, globalization and the worldwide interdependence of economic factors played a vital part.

The architects Fritz Schupp and Martin Kemmer developed Zollverein XII in the graphic language of the Bauhaus as a group of buildings which combined form and function in a masterly way. **Criterion i**

The cultural landscape of the Zollverein Mine bears unique witness to the complex interrelationships of living and working, dominated by large-scale industry, in the midst of one of the largest cultural landscapes in the world. **Criterion ii**

Zollverein XII is an individual monument of outstanding significance in the landscape. During the phase, never to be

repeated, of concentration of groups of heavy industries, it was built as an investment provided with all the visionary ambitions of industrial rationalism. Thus it embodies one of the most fundamental ideas of industrial activity in a globally unique manner. **Criterion iii**

With a daily output of 12,000 tonnes of usable coal, Zollverein XII was the most efficient mine in the world. Under the difficult geological conditions of the region, the achievement of this level of output was an outstanding technological feat. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

Consolidation of the mining claim area was completed in December 1847: the area concerned covered 13.2km². At that time it was the northernmost mine in the region. It belongs to the Gelsenkirchen anticline, in which the coal seams, averaging 1.17m thick, are deeply stratified. Mining began in the mid 19th century at a depth of *c* 120m and finished at the fourteenth level (1200m). By the end of mining the underground roadways extended over 120km; they were accessed by twelve shafts, opened up progressively between 1847 and 1932. When Zollverein XII was opened, the earlier shafts were used solely for the movement of men and supplies; all the extracted coal was handled by the new shaft until the mine closed in 1986. The methods of mining evolved as technology developed from hand picks to mechanized coal cutting.

The coals being extracted at Zollverein were especially suitable for coking. Consequently, the first stack-type coke-ovens were built there in 1857. The coking plant expanded considerably over the decades that followed. However, when the Zollverein mine was taken over by the steel company, Vereinigte Stahlwerke AG, in 1926, a new coking plant (the Nordstern plant) was built to process all the coal from its pits in the region. Coke production returned to Zollverein in the late 1950s, when the then holding company for the mines in the region, Gelsenkirchen Bergwerks AG, decided to build a new coking plant to supplement the Nordstern plant. It began production in 1961 from eight batteries, each of 24 ovens, producing 8600t per day; there were also facilities for processing by-products such as tar, sulphuric acid, benzene, ammonium compounds, and gas. This plant closed down in 1993 because of the fall in the demand for coke.

The construction of the stretch of the Cologne-Minden railway between Oberhausen and Hamm in 1847 was decisive for the location of the early Zollverein shafts, which were sunk 500m from the new line so as to facilitate transport of the coal and coke produced. The first passenger station did not open until forty years later. There were also links with the Emscher Valley line, also opened in 1847, which cut the north-western corner of the Zollverein concession. There followed a series of internal link lines during the next eighty years. It was connected with that of

the neighbouring Bonifacius mine after Zollverein was taken over by Vereinigte Stahlwerke in 1926.

Coal mining produces enormous quantities of waste material, which is deposited in the characteristic pit heaps. The earliest of these, to the east of shaft 1/2, was planted with trees in 1895 and used as a recreational area for the mine officials. A second grew to the west of shaft 1/2 from that time, and in 1932 was used for pond management, to dry out the boiler-ash and coal slurries from Zollverein XII. A heap begun in 1880 was partially cleared in 1958 to provide land for miners' housing. Other heaps were used for filling areas where coal had been removed from a steeply dipping seam and on an abandoned airfield.

Intensive mining resulted in a number of subsidences, in some places as deep as 25m. This necessitated clearance of irretrievably damaged housing and other facilities. Subsidence exacerbated the water problems in the so-called Emscher Zone, where mining adversely affected the gravitational flow and created large areas of swamp. Local industries and municipalities created the Emscher Association, which carried out a number of projects using pumping stations and creating polders.

The workforce steadily increased to *c* 5000 by the end of the 19th century. During the 20th century it fluctuated between 5000 and 8000. Because there were no alternative property developers when work began in 1847, Zollverein began to construct housing for its workers. Building projects were integrated with the mine operating programmes.

Large building sites were purchased and by 1860 146 flats were ready for occupancy; at that time the mine employed 710 workers. This "Hegemannshof Colony" expanded steadily (by the turn of the century it covered around 90ha), and subsequently two more colonies, "Ottekampshof" and "Beisen," were added. By World War I the property owned by the mine had grown to over 720ha. However, this was by means adequate for a workforce that numbered some 5000 at that time. Between the two World Wars new workers' housing developed, notably the housing estate built by the Trust Agency for Miners' Housing. In the late 1920s the mine could provide each of its salaried employees and officials with an apartment, but only some 3000 were available for the 8000 workers. After World War II new estates consisting of apartment blocks were built by the housing association established by Vereinigte Stahlwerke AG, such as the Kaldekirche, Westerbruch, and Kapitlacker estates from the 1950s. The Glückauf estate was built by the miners themselves working in collaboration. The houses were owned by private individuals. Two Pestalozzi villages were also built for apprentices. In 1958 there were 7061 dwellings available for a workforce of 8000.

From the start the mine provided consumer services for its employees, selling food and manufactured goods at low prices. They began on a "cooperative" basis, profits being returned to consumers in the form of an annual dividend. This scheme, with its six outlets, was taken over as a company enterprise by Vereinigte Stahlwerke. The system gradually declined after World War II because of competition from commercial stores, and the remaining outlets were bought out in the 1970s.

From the mid 1920s the mine provided welfare services for its employees. The first welfare centre was set up in 1928 (it was rehoused in 1938) and the second in 1934. A large modern welfare centre designed by Fritz Schupp was built in

1953. However, Zollverein closed its welfare facilities in the early 1960s, in line with the current trend in the Ruhr.

Description

- The pits

Only the foundations of the Malakow towers of the original pit survive; they are built over by the present headgear (Pit 1, 1956-58; Pit 2, constructed at the Friedlicher Nachbar mine 1950, transferred to Zollverein 1965), both designed by Fritz Schupp. The brick winding-engine building dates from 1903, with an extension by Schupp of 1958. The 1922 main store has a reinforced concrete frame. The pithead baths are in the form of a brick hall, capable of providing facilities for 3000 miners. The ensemble is completed by the imposing administrative building (1906), the director's villa (1898), and the mine officials' residence (1878). Less survives of the buildings of Pits 3/7/10, 4/11, and 6/9, apart from the 33m high headgear of Pit 10 (1913).

At Pit XII the central hoisting unit (Schupp, 1932) is preserved almost in its entirety. The building axis, which runs parallel to the tracks of the mine railway station, is defined by the central energy-supply plants. These comprise the compressed-air plant (boiler house and upstream compressor houses) in the north and the control station in the south. The stack on the axis of symmetry behind the boiler house, the main feature of the ensemble, was demolished in 1979 for safety reasons.

At right-angles to this group are the buildings of the tub turntable, raised so as to permit passage for wagons. The buildings of the screening plant, the electrostatic precipitator, and the refuse hopper are annexed to this group. The belt-conveyor bridge establishes a functional connection between the refuse hopper, the picking-belt hall, and the coal-washing plant.

With the change from tub to skip extraction at the pit large parts of the tub turntable became redundant, but it was necessary to build an additional conveyor-belt bridge and a connecting building. The facade on the right of the pithead building was closed because of appearance of the "court of honour" was impaired by the new structures.

This entire ensemble was the work of Fritz Schupp, apart from the roof superstructure, which had to be raised in 1982 to accommodate large new dust-extraction plant.

- The coking plants

The coking plants at the individual Zollverein pits have all been demolished, but the central plant has been conserved since it closed down in 1993. The ovens extend over a distance of nearly 1km, parallel to the former Cologne-Minden railway line. Their equipment – pushers, quenching station, screening plant, and loading stations – are all intact, as are the gas-treatment and by-products installations, and ancillary buildings. The result is a unique example of a large-scale industrial complex, which is open to the public and had more than 200,000 visitors in 1999.

- The railway lines

The original main railway lines (Cologne-Minden and the Bergische-Märkische line) are still in use, as part of the Bahn AG network. The railway connection between the Cologne-Minden line via the mine to the Rhein-Herne Canal is also preserved. The route from Zollverein to Bonifacius no longer has its tracks; it is now used as a bicycle path.

- The pit heaps

Most of the mine-refuse heaps are still visible, several having been planted with trees and are used as local recreational areas. Subsidence has created small valleys which would be waterlogged had corrective measures not been taken. The pumping stations built in the 1960s and 1970s to relieve problems associated with gravitational water flow are standard functional structures.

- Miners' housing

In the former Hegemannshof and Ottekampshof colonies a considerable number of houses survive almost in their original state, but in a bad state of repair. These are for the most part four-dwelling buildings on a cross-shaped ground plan. They are built in brick, with large gardens attached. Large sections of both estates were, however, demolished in the 1960s as part of large-scale redevelopment projects and replaced by multi-storey apartment blocks.

The early private development in the centre of Katernberg and around the Roman Catholic church is virtually untouched. The facades of the upper floors retain their elaborate decorative details. The buildings around the market place such as the post office and the former town hall, built on land donated to the community by the mine, have preserved their original appearance to a considerable degree.

The Glückauf houses still survive, as do the Pestalozzi villages, with their characteristic single-storey houses with pitched gabled roofs in quiet winding streets. The multi-storey apartment blocks built by the housing associations are undistinguished in style; they are set apart from the earlier housing by the fact that they do not have individual gardens but are sited with extensive green areas around them. The Kapitalecker estate has survived essentially in its original form, though it is greatly in need of repair. Of greater interest are the Westernbruch and Kaldekirche estates with their decorative clinker brick facades.

The successive groups of houses constitute a remarkable sequence of approaches to workers' housing over a period of 140 years, during which profound social and economic changes took place.

- Consumer and welfare facilities

Two of the consumer facilities survive, although one had to undergo extensive rebuilding after wartime damage. One is a three-storey brick-built structure and the other is two-storey with a decorated plaster facade. Both are now in use as retail shops.

The former welfare centre 1 in Viktoriastrasse still fills a similar function, as offices for medical and law practices. Modifications to the brick building designed by Fritz Schupp in 1938 to adapt it for its present use respected the original design and detailing. His 1953 centre, now in use as accommodation for asylum seekers, has been conserved but is not in a good state of repair.

Management and Protection

Legal status

When coal extraction ceased at Zollverein, the boundaries of the legally defined mining concession covering 13km² were no longer of relevance. The larger part, situated within the town of Essen, is within the Düsseldorf

administrative district of the Province of North-Rhine Westphalia (*Land Nordrhein-Westfalen*). The north-eastern corner is in the town of Gelsenkirchen.

The area nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List is protected under the Law Governing the Protection and Conservation in the Federal State of North-Rhine Westphalia of 11 March 1980.

Management

Different parts of the nominated area are owned by both public and private bodies: Landsentwicklungsgesellschaft Nordrhein-Westfalen, Ruhrkohle AG, Kommunalverband Ruhrgebiet KVR, and VEBA Immobilien.

Application of the legislation is supervised by the provincial Ministry of Employment, Social and Urban Development, Culture and Sport, working with the municipal authorities of Düsseldorf and Essen. Direct management is the responsibility of two non-profit-making foundations, Stiftung Industriedenkmalpflege und Geschichtskultur and Stiftung Zollverein.

A "Craftsmen's Guild," analogous to those at the great cathedrals, has been set up by the town of Essen and the Regional Development Company to carry out regular maintenance and provide training in conservation practices and techniques.

A National Park of Industrial Culture is being established, which will operate in accordance with a management plan covering the entire area of industrial sites making up the Zollverein. New uses have been devised for most of the main industrial features – a theatrical rehearsal stage, the municipal meeting centre, the North-Rhine Westphalia design office, a private art gallery, workshops for retraining the long-term unemployed, etc.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

A large-scale rehabilitation programme to preserve the external appearance of the mine complex was carried out in 1990-98. The steel frames of the buildings have been secured and conserved.

The interrelationship of the different industrial components has been secured by retaining at least one major item of plant in each building. In the case of the main boiler house, the vast items of equipment are still *in situ*, but the interior has been adapted for use as an exhibition centre in accordance with plans drawn up by the UK architectural office of Sir Norman Foster and Partners.

Maintenance is assured with the willing help of former workers of the Zollverein mine. There are also training programmes connected with maintenance and presentation of the complex.

Future projects include a major restoration project for the coke-oven plant and further conservation work on the pit heaps.

There is, however, no overall management plan for the historic industrial plant, with a clear management philosophy and objectives. Especially serious is the lack of any conservation programme for the many large items of equipment, the coking plant, or the "white side" of the coke ovens, the chemical processing plant. This is essential, and

should begin with a complete inventory of every item of plant on the site.

Authenticity

As an industrial landscape, the Zollverein mine has a high level of authenticity. It comprises all the components of intensive 19th and 20th century industrial exploitation – the complete complex of buildings and equipment necessary for the extraction and treatment of coal and the production of coke, the requisite transportation network (in this case of railways), and the dwellings and communal buildings of the large community of workers, as well as the vast heaps of pit waste.

The individual industrial components have of necessity lost their functional authenticity. However, a policy of sensitive and imaginative adaptive reuse has ensured that their forms survive intact, with significant items of industrial plant preserved, and that their interrelationships remain clearly and logically visible. In particular, the authenticity of the important group of industrial buildings designed for Zollverein XII by Fritz Schupp has been carefully conserved

Social and economic changes have meant that the authenticity of the surviving workers' houses is somewhat variable. However, efforts have been made to ensure that part at least of their group value and authenticity has been retained, so that the corpus illustrates the development of attitudes to workers' housing over an economically and socially significant period of 150 years.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the property in February 2000.

Qualities

Coal was essential to the rapid development of industry worldwide in the 19th and 20th centuries. The Zollverein mine constitutes outstanding material evidence of the evolution and decline of this key industry over the past 150 years. The picture that it presents is a comprehensive one, covering the industrial, economic, and social aspects in a remarkably comprehensive manner. The buildings of Pit XII are exceptional examples of the successful application and adaptation of the principles of the Modern Movement to the requirements of heavy industry.

Comparative analysis

The number of coal-mining complexes that operated from the 19th century through to the latter part of the 20th century has never been large, since mines closed down once their coal deposits were exhausted and mining moved elsewhere. The use of alternative sources of energy has seen the role of coal diminish greatly in the past half-century, and in consequence mines have closed down at an accelerating rate. In most cases, this has been accompanied by the demolition of the coal and coke treatment and handling installations. The Zollverein is a rare survival and no comparable site can be identified.

ICOMOS comments

The nomination is of an area based on the previous extent of underground coal-mining concessions at the Zollverein mine. This bears no relationship to surface features,

frequently intersecting streets or districts, and does not include all the historic settlements, of which there are at least nine on the map provided with the nomination. ICOMOS believes that it would be more appropriate if the nominated area were to be confined to the Zollverein XII and Zollverein I and II mines, with the adjoining coking plant. This would provide a clear site boundary, bordered by suitable roads and for the most part enclosed by a high wall.

It is accepted that the surrounding area is a cultural landscape with many important workers' housing complexes, villas, public buildings, churches, etc, but these might be better treated as the buffer zone to the main industrial complex. The zone should be extended to include the suburbs of Katernberg, Schonnebeck, and Stoppenberg. Consideration should also be given to the inclusion of other important mining sites in the area as part of the nominated area.

ICOMOS is very impressed by the meticulous and sensitive conservation and adaptive reuse of the 1930s buildings. It is, however, concerned about the interventions in the coking plant, now managed by an arts organization. A large section of one of the coke ovens has been removed, which is praiseworthy, in that it reveals the structure of this type of plant. The insertion of a Ferris wheel towering some 50m above the ovens, however, compromises this imposing industrial monument and has no connection with the original function of the ovens.

The ICOMOS expert mission was informed that there are plans to build a five-storey glass block on top of the washing plant, to house a postgraduate institute of art and design. This would jeopardize the whole appearance of the site, since it would be higher than the main feature of the industrial complex, the headgear of the Zollverein XII mine.

At its 24th session in Paris in June 2000 the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee deferred further consideration of this nomination, requesting the State Party to reconsider the boundaries of the nominated area and the buffer zone, to remove the Ferris wheel in the coking plant, to abandon the plans to build a new structure on top of the washing plant, and to prepare a comprehensive management plan for the industrial site, with a conservation plan based on the preparation of a detailed inventory.

The State Party subsequently provided a new plan which took into account the revised boundaries proposed by ICOMOS and gave assurances about the future management of the coking plant and washing plant. In November 2000 a document was submitted to ICOMOS entitled *Regulatory regime for the conservation of "The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine"*. This document has been studied by ICOMOS and TICCIH, who are of the opinion that it does not fully comply with the requirements of the Committee.

Brief description

The Zollverein industrial landscape consists of the complete installations of an historical coal-mining site, with some 20th century buildings of outstanding architectural merit.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting that a more detailed management plan be prepared, in consultation with ICOMOS and TICCIH.

In the event that this is prepared by the end of October 2001, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iii*:

The Zollverein landscape is an important example of a European industrial region of great economic significance in the 19th and 20th centuries. The installations of the Zollverein XII coal-mine, which forms the nucleus of the site, is especially noteworthy for the high architectural quality of its buildings.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Falun (Sweden)

No 1027

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The historic cultural landscape of the Great Copper Mountain in Falun
<i>Location</i>	Dalarna
<i>State Party</i>	Sweden
<i>Date</i>	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Great Copper Mountain in Falun and its cultural landscape are an outstanding example of a technological ensemble with an historical industrial landscape and unique type of buildings and settlements.

The Falun Copper Mine, otherwise known as the Great Copper Mountain (*Stora Kopparberget*) is the oldest and most important mine working in Sweden and the world, and of great international significance. It is one of the world's most remarkable industrial monuments. The manmade landscape surrounding the mine is very remarkable and unique by Swedish and international standards. The Falun mine has developed and influenced international mining technology and played a very important part in the world economy.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

The oldest surviving document relating to the Great Copper Mountain was issued in 1288, but scientific studies suggest that its origins date back to the 8th or 9th century. This was a period when there was considerable trade between Germany and Sweden and German settlement in Sweden, and it is likely that the Swedish industry was upgraded at this time under German influence. There is considerable evidence of this in the form of the technology being applied, such as fire-setting and mine drainage, the origins of which can be traced to continental sources such as the Harz Mountains.

A charter of 1347 led to the creation of a distinctive manmade landscape. Miners were granted the right to establish new settlements in the forests without paying any compensation to the landowners. At the same time they were exempted from land or forest taxes and their properties could pass to their children.

The 15th century was a period of unrest and armed conflict. The "free miners" of the Great Copper Mountain played their full part in this, protesting against trade restrictions and taxation. This culminated in a major rising in 1531–34, as a result of which several distinguished citizens of Falun were executed on the orders of Gustavus Vasa.

During the 16th and 17th centuries the Great Copper Mountain was the mainstay of Sweden's economy, enabling it to become one of the leading European powers. By the mid 17th century Falun was producing 70% of the world's output of copper. It was exported all over the world – for the roofs of the Palace of Versailles or for Spanish coinage, for example. The revenue from copper financed the disastrous involvement of Sweden in the Thirty Years' War (1618–48).

The Great Copper Mountain was organized as a corporate operation, with free miners (*bergsmän*) owning shares (*fjärdeparter*) proportional to their interests in copper smelters. The 1347 charter covered, *inter alia*, ore extraction, settlement, and trade within the region. It may justifiably be considered to be the precursor of the later joint stock companies, and it is often referred to as "the oldest company in the world."

A cultural region known as Kopparbergslagen developed around Falun which is unique to Sweden. There were no fewer than 140 copper smelting furnaces in the region at this time, and the free miners had their estates and manor-houses close to the furnaces. The agrarian landscape was dominated by grazing land wooded pastures. A crop-rotation system with a five-year cycle, known as *lindbruk* or the Falun method, was developed here in the 17th and 18th centuries.

Despite the high level of technology developed and applied in and around the Great Copper Mountain, there were inevitably accidents, and especially in the 17th century, when production was at its most intensive. The most dramatic was that in 1687, when a massive landslip led to the creation of the Great Pit (*Stora Stöten*) there.

The town of Falun was founded in the 17th century: its population of some six thousand people made it the second largest city in Sweden at that time. The formal 1646 layout survives in the three districts of Gamla Herrgården, Östanfors, and Elsborg.

The copper furnaces were water-powered from as early as the 13th century, and the earliest water-powered hoisting gear was built in 1555 at Blankstöten, one of the open-cast mines. Ponds, dikes, and canals were constructed to supply the furnaces and the mines; the oldest surviving dam dates from the 14th century.

Many foreign scientists and businessmen visited Falun in the 17th, 18th, and 19th centuries, and all were very impressed by the enormous size of the mine, the smoke from the furnaces, and the remarkable structures related to the copper industry. The Great Copper Mountain became Sweden's first tourist attraction: the first recorded use of the word "tourist" is from 1824.

This was a leading centre of technological progress from the 16th century onwards. Among those who worked there and developed their research were the mechanical engineer Christopher Polhem and the chemist Jöns Jacob Berzelius.

As the demand for copper receded in the 18th and 19th centuries, production was extended to other mineral resources of the Great Copper Mountain, including sulphur, lead, zinc, silver, and gold. In 1888 the old company was reconstituted as a modern limited company, Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB. The old copper furnaces were abandoned and large new factories built. Outside Falun itself the company had been acquiring iron mines and setting up iron and steelworks, and it became one of the major Swedish enterprises in this field. Another area was that of forestry, producing paper and sawn timber.

The company celebrated its seventh centenary in 1988. However, by 1992 all the viable ore deposits had been extracted and so mining ceased: the last round of shots was fired on 8 December 1998. The only industrial activity remaining is the production of the traditional and very distinctive Falun (Swedish) red paint, used for the protection of the wooden buildings of Sweden and other parts of Scandinavia.

Description

The property proposed for inscription consists of the Great Copper Mountain and several areas around it which make up Kopparbergslagen. The core area is the historic mine at Falun with associated facilities above and below ground. The other areas contain many furnace sites, waterways, ponds, canals, and ancient mining settlements. There is a specific landscape of slagheaps and furnace remains to the north of the mine. To this should be added the town of Falun with its 1646 gridiron street plan and the three districts of wooden houses (Gamla Herrgården, Östanfors, and Elsborg). Four of the areas are free miner landscapes: the area north of Lake Varpan between Österå and Bergsgården, the area surrounding Lake Hosjö, the Sundsbornsån valley, and the Knivaån valley from Staberg to Marieberg. Also included is Linnévågen, the well preserved ancient bridle path and cart track leading to the mining town of Röros in Norway and named after the famous Swedish naturalist Carl von Linné (Linnaeus), who travelled along it in 1734.

- The Great Copper Mountain

This consists of the underground mine itself, where operations ceased in 1992, and the enormous pit (Stora Stöten), measuring 300m x 350m by c 90m deep, resulting from a colossal cave-in in 1687. There is visitor access to some of the older parts of the mine, notably the impressive Creutz's Shaft, which is 208m deep and partitioned by what is often called "the highest timber structure in the world." A vast open chamber known as *Allmänna Freden* (Universal Peace) houses a display of historic working equipment.

Above ground the historic mining landscape comprises mine spoilheaps and heaps of "Swedish red," together with historic buildings from the 17th–19th centuries. As mining operations expanded a number of these wooden buildings were moved around.

They include mining installations such as headframes, wheelhouses, powder magazines, tally chambers, administrative offices, workshops, stores, mills, and living quarters. They date from the late 17th century

(Bergmästaregården) to the 20th century. Several have been adapted for alternative use: thus the former administrative building (*Stora Gruvstugan*), built in the 1770s, has been the Mining Museum since 1922. The 20th century Paint Factory is still in use, producing "Swedish red" paint. The most recent building is the Berget Auditorium, designed by Bo Wederfors and awarded the prize for timber architecture of the National Association of Swedish Architects in 1988.

- The furnace landscape

This consists of three large slag heaps lying to the north of the core area: Ingarvshyttan, Syrfabriksågen, and Hyttberget. Between them are to be found the remains of historic industrial installations such as furnaces, roasting houses and early tracks. Archaeological excavations have been carried out on several of these sites.

- The town of Falun

The oldest surviving building in this planned town, laid out in 1646, is Stora Kopparberg Church, part of which dates from the 14th century. The main square (Stora Torget) is the site of the Kristine Church (1642–60), the Town Courthouse (1647–53), and the head office of the Stora Kopparberg Bergslag Company (1766). Following a major fire in 1761 there was considerable rebuilding, and there is some particularly fine late 17th century buildings along Åsgatan.

Falun also has a number of well preserved old workers' houses at Elsborg, Gamla Herrgården, and Östanfors. The Villastaden district, as its name implies, has some fine early 20th century villa architecture.

- The free miner landscapes

Bergsmanslandskapet, the first of these landscapes lies to the west of the core area. It consists of spoilheaps, furnace sites, and well preserved early settlements. There is a network of waterways, canals, dikes, ponds, and dam buildings stretching from Igeltjärn in the north-west to the Crown Dikes and the mine in the south-east.

The Österå-Bergsgården landscape to the north-west of the mine, on the western and northern sides of Lake Varpan, contains these two free miner settlements, each of which had some ten copper-smelting furnaces and more than 25 ore-roasting furnaces in the 17th century. This heyday is represented today by enormous slagheaps, furnace chambers, workers' houses, and manor houses. There are some particularly well preserved free miners' homesteads in this area.

Copper furnaces were first recorded (in 1357) in the third area, that of Hosjö. There are many well preserved miners' homesteads, and Linnaeus was married in 1739 at one of these (Sveden), the home of the famous bishop and author Jesper Swedberg and his world-renowned son, the philosopher Emmanuel Swedenborg.

The Sundsbornsån valley, running along the waterways joining Lakes Runn and Toftan to the north of the Hosjö area, is a manmade landscape containing many archaeological remains from the Neolithic period and the Iron Age. There were many copper furnaces here from medieval times until the early 19th century. Once again, there are many fine miners' homesteads of the 18th and 19th centuries.

The fourth area is the Knivaån Valley, on the eastern side of Lake Runn. There is abundant evidence of its mining past. Staberg is particularly noteworthy for its slagheaps and smelting remains. Of particular importance is Gamla Staberg, a free miner's homestead from around 1700 with a fine Baroque garden that is currently being restored.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The monuments, sites, and landscapes that make up this nominated area are all protected under the comprehensive and interlocking Swedish legislation for cultural and environmental protection. The relevant measures are the following:

- The Cultural Monuments (etc) Act (1988: 950) with Amendments up to and including SFS (1996:529)

All archaeological sites and monuments are given full legal protection. Listed historic buildings are given similar protection, as are ecclesiastical buildings of the established Church of Sweden. Any interventions must receive authorization from the National Heritage Board (*Riksantikvarieämbetet*) in the case of archaeological monuments or the relevant County Administration in the case of built heritage.

- The Environmental Code (1997)

The Code lays down general rules relating to the protection and conservation of the environment. There are two provisions relating to cultural values. First, it specifies fundamental requirements for the use of land and water areas, designed to maintain their cultural values. These are applicable to public authorities as well as private individuals or enterprises. Secondly, it introduces the concept of the cultural reserve. There are considerable restrictions over use and construction in these areas. The Code is regulated by County Administrations. It interacts with the Building and Planning Act 1987 and the associated Ordinance.

- The Planning and Building Act (1987: 10)

This Act (supported by the Planning and Building Ordinance, last updated in February 1997) gives local authorities considerable autonomy in regulating planning and developments within their respective districts. However, the State is given powers to intervene in matters considered to be of national importance where it is adjudged that the Environmental Code has not been properly implemented. So far as cultural heritage is concerned, general requirements are laid down for buildings, sites, and public open spaces. Alterations to existing buildings must take account of structural, historical, environmental, and architectural values. The special characteristics of buildings of historical and architectural importance must be preserved. Local authorities are required to produce and implement comprehensive plans, which are made binding through detailed development plans and/or area regulations.

The entire area covered by the nomination was classified as a series of areas of national interest in 1987 under the provisions of Chapter 3 of the Environmental Code. The Great Pit was protected under the Cultural Monuments Act

as a heritage site in 1995 under a resolution of the County Administrative Board. There are currently thirteen archaeological sites and monuments and historic buildings in the nominated area which are also protected as heritage sites under this Act and four more are being considered for this level of protection. In addition, substantial areas are also protected under the Planning and Building Act. All the areas in the nomination are covered by local authority development plans and area regulations.

Relevant authorities are Dalarna County Administration (*Länsstyrelsen Dalarna*), Falun Municipality, and the Church of Sweden, through the Falun Ecclesiastical Congregation (*Falu Kyrkliga Samfällighet*). Overall supervision of all cultural property is exercised by the National Heritage Board (*Riksantikvarieämbetet*).

Management

Ownership of properties included in the nomination and their management is distributed between Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB (the Falun mine, managed by the Dalarnas Museum located in Falun), the Falun Municipality, and individuals (homesteads, town buildings).

Under the terms of the Environmental Code and the Planning and Building Ordinance, a comprehensive plan for the centre of Falun was adopted in 1998, and this is supported by detailed development plans in the other areas, with specific provisions for the protection of buildings and settlements of historical interest. Detailed development plans are also in force for substantial areas outside the nominated area. These are covered by a cultural environment plan for the entire municipality, also dating from 1998. Since 1998 work has been in progress to develop the Falun Mine and Kopparbergslagen as an ecomuseum. This is a joint enterprise of the Municipality of Falun, the Dalarnas Museum, and Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB (hereafter referred to as Stora), working with voluntary bodies.

Although mining ceased at Falun in 1992, Stora has respected its obligations vis-à-vis the industrial heritage by maintaining the buildings and the mining environment adjoining the Great Pit, as well as the giant timber wall in Creutz's Shaft. The company has a long-term management plan for all its heritage sites in Sweden, of which Falun is unquestionably the most important.

Although the development plans and those of Stora cover virtually every aspect of the future maintenance and development requirements of the entire area covered in the nomination, there is no overall management plan *stricto sensu*.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Swedish industrial companies have long been conscious of the importance of their industrial heritage, and the country probably possesses the largest number of industrial monuments and museums anywhere in the world, covering mining, metallurgy, paper and board production, and engineering. Since 1973 there has been a series of surveys and inventories of cultural properties of all kinds in the area covered by the nomination. The most comprehensive of these was probably the total inventory and documentation of the mine itself and the associated buildings carried out by the company before mining operations ceased. Other important

survey and inventory projects have been carried out by the National Heritage Board and the Dalarnas Museum.

In exercising their statutory functions the relevant national and local authorities have ensured that the heritage sites and monuments have maintained a high level of conservation. Stora has ensured that all the properties in its ownership have conformed with statutory requirements in this respect.

Authenticity and integrity

The authenticity of individual buildings and monuments within the nominated area is high. This is the result of the stringent conditions laid down in the relevant legislation regarding maintenance and the selection of materials for restoration and implemented by the national, County, and municipal agencies involved.

The integrity of both the Great Pit and its associated buildings and the urban fabric of the old part of Falun has been sedulously maintained by the application of statutory regulations, reinforced by a strong resolution on the part of the residents to ensure the survival of the evidence of Falun's great industrial heritage.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited Falun in January 2001. ICOMOS consulted TICCIH experts on the cultural significance of this property.

Qualities

The Great Copper Mountain and its cultural landscape at Falun is one of the most outstanding industrial monuments in the world. Copper was mined there from at least the 13th century, and probably much earlier, until the end of the 20th century. It claims, with some justification, to be the oldest joint-stock company in the world. Many important developments in the extraction of copper ores and their refining took place at this site, and the cultural landscape bears abundant witness to its long and distinguished technological history. The dominance of Sweden as the major producer of copper in the 17th century had a profound impact on that country's economic and political development, and hence of that of the whole of Europe.

The landscape is noteworthy not for its technological heritage but also to the abundant evidence of the social structure of the mining community over time. It contains many small mining settlements and miners' dwellings, as well as a planned town of the 17th century, which graphically illustrate the special socio-economic framework of much of European mining up to the late 19th century.

Comparative analysis

There are several World Heritage sites associated with mining: Kutná Hora (Czech Republic), the Rammelsberg/Goslar site (Germany), Røros (Norway), Banská Štiavnica (Slovakia), and Blaenavon (United Kingdom) in Europe, and Guanajuato (Mexico), Potosí (Bolivia), and Zacatecas (Mexico).

Of the European sites, the nomination of Kutná Hora extends only to the historic centre, omitting the early mines. The significance of Banská Štiavnica also lies in its historic town centre, together with its significance in mining research and

education: the industrial remains do not compare with those of Falun. The cultural landscape of Blaenavon developed around coal and iron-ore mining and iron production, but it is significantly different in many respects from Falun. Røros is a very well preserved wooden town that developed around its copper mining activities in the 17th century. Whilst it is comparable with Falun, it lacks the extensive industrial heritage of Falun. The Rammelsberg silver mining area and the fine associated medieval and Baroque town of Goslar is comparable in time-scale with Falun, but its visible industrial heritage is considerably less prominent than that of Falun.

Of the three Latin American sites, only Guanajuato possesses significant industrial monuments, but these are different in scale, nature, and period of exploitation from those of Falun.

It is justifiable to assert, therefore, that the Great Copper Mountain and its associated cultural landscape around Falun is exceptional as being one of the most enduring and complete monuments of the world's industrial heritage.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The properties covered by the nomination are protected by a number of statutory instruments and regulations. They are also included in land-use plans at several levels. There is also a general plan for the improvement and management of all the Stora industrial heritage sites. There is, however, no overall coordinating management mechanism. ICOMOS and TICCIH consider that it is essential for these diverse measures to be coordinated by means of a comprehensive management plan (to include a special plan relating to tourism).

Brief description

The enormous mining excavation known as the Great Pit at Falun is the most striking feature of a landscape that illustrates the survival of copper production in this region since at least the 13th century. The 17th century planned town of Falun with its many fine historic buildings and the industrial and domestic remains at a number of settlements spread over a wide area of Dalarna provide a vivid picture of what was for centuries one of the world's most important mining areas.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the provision of a coordinating management plan.

In the event of this request being complied with and found to be satisfactory, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and v*:

The Great Copper Mountain and its cultural landscape at Falun graphically illustrate one of the most significant areas of mining and metals production. Mining ceased at the end of the 20th century, but over many centuries it had exerted a strong influence on the technological, economic, social, and political development of Sweden and Europe. The history of the mining industry can be seen in the abundant industrial and domestic remains characteristic of this industry that still survive in the natural landscape around Falun which has been moulded and transformed by human ingenuity and resourcefulness.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Derwent Valley (United Kingdom)

No 1030

Identification

Nomination Derwent Valley Mills

Location Derbyshire, England

State Party United Kingdom

Date 26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The nominated site relates to developments in technology in the 18th century that introduced the mechanically powered factory system within the textile industry. It began with the construction of the Silk Mill in Derby in 1727 for the brothers John and Thomas Lombe, which housed machinery for throwing silk, based on an Italian design. The scale, output, and numbers of workers employed were without precedent. However, it was not until Richard Arkwright constructed a water-powered spinning mill at Cromford in 1771, and a second, larger mill in 1776–77 using power from a tributary of the river Derwent to operate his machinery, that the "Arkwright System" was truly established. Arkwright's mills were so efficient and profitable that they were replicated hundreds of times before the end of the century and the textile mill became the archetypal factory of the Industrial Revolution. Factory production came to dominate the manufacturing economy not only of Britain but also of much of the world for most of the next two centuries.

Criterion ii

The advent of the factory system, which developed in the textile mills of the Derwent valley, but which spread rapidly to other locations and to other industries, created a new cultural tradition. It was one in which people, often unskilled or semi-skilled, worked on a regular shift system in large buildings and lived in nearby dependent communities. These mill villages, many of which evolved into factory towns, grew rapidly in number during the 19th century. From Britain these developments moved across continental Europe and North America and spread to much of the rest of the world.

The factory, as it grew in the hands of the Derwent valley mill owners at Cromford, Belper, Milford, and Darley Abbey, brought with it a degree of social enlightenment which included a concern for the quality of life of their workforce and their workers' families and led to the provision of decent housing and other amenities.

Criterion iii

A large proportion of the textile mills of the Derwent valley, including some of the earliest examples known to have been built in the world, are still standing. Apart from the buildings themselves, important elements of the supporting infrastructure have survived, including the engineering structures which carried the water-power systems from the river Derwent and its tributaries, and the transport infrastructure, including toll roads, tramways, and canals. Furthermore, the factory settlements that were constructed at Cromford, Belper, Milford, and Darley are almost completely preserved, including in Cromford and Milford the factory masters' own residences and, notably in Belper and Cromford, farms and estate buildings.

The overall result is an ensemble of buildings, structures, and settlements, all grouped within a distinctive landscape. Dominated by the river that attracted the initial investment in the area. The integrity of the scene remains evocative of the period in the late 18th and early 19th centuries when, in this hitherto obscure Derbyshire valley, the factory system was born. **Criterion iv**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

The construction in 1721 at Derby in the English East Midlands of a water-driven mill to manufacture silk thread was a very significant event in the Industrial Revolution. The large mill building was five storeys high and housed machines driven from a common power source, thus laying the foundations of the modern factory.

This was the work of Richard Arkwright (1732–92), who in the 1760s successfully developed a machine for spinning cotton. His search for backers to finance a patent and further develop his machine brought him to the Derby area, where he formed a partnership with silk manufacturer Jedediah Strutt (1726–97) and his partner Samuel Need.

They selected Cromford, a village upstream of the river Derwent from Derby, for their first mill, work on which began in 1772. Between 1772 and 1775 much of Arkwright's time (and hence the work of the mill) was devoted to experimentation, as a result of which he was able in 1775 to file his second patent, which was devoted primarily to mechanization of the pre-spinning processes.

This was put into operation in the second Cromford Mill, built in 1776–77 and financed by local lead merchant Peter Nightingale, who purchased the Cromford Estate on which the mill and a residence for Arkwright were built. Arkwright also made provision for his workforce, mostly children. In order to attract them and their parents, he developed the village of Cromford. Weavers were invited to live in the houses that he built, their children working in the spinning mills and the parents weaving calico from Arkwright's cotton.

on the topmost floors. This ingenious method of recruiting labour was adopted by the Derwent valley factory owners.

Once the second Cromford Mill was in operation a period of intensive activity began. Mills were built by Arkwright and his family and by Strutt in other parts of Derbyshire between 1777 and 1783. Royalty agreements licensing the use of the Arkwright machinery and process led to similar mills springing up in other parts of the country and overseas. Meanwhile, the Cromford operation expanded, and it was joined by another large installation, the Masson Mill at Matlock Bath, which was in operation by the mid 1780s.

Jedediah Strutt and his brothers established their mills further down the Derwent Valley. His first mill was built around 1776/7 in Belper. The destruction of this and a second one on the same site by fire led to the building of the fireproof North Mill in 1804. From 1781 onwards work went ahead on a second group of Strutt mills, this time at Milford, further down the river. Like Arkwright in Cromford, the Strutts created housing and other facilities for their workers in Belper and Milford. The Strutt business prospered during the first quarter of the 19th century, when it was the largest cotton factory enterprise in England, but thereafter it declined as the centre of the cotton industry moved to Lancashire.

The Evans brothers (Thomas, Edward, and William) began building a cotton mill at Darley Abbey, just north of Derby, in 1782, in the beginning possibly in partnership with Richard Arkwright. It was completed around 1786, but burned down two years later. Its replacement was constructed immediately and was considerably enlarged between 1796 and 1805 and again between 1818 and 1821. The company diversified its production, eventually giving up spinning, under the Evans family until 1903, then under two successive owners until 1969, when the mill was sold for other uses. It is now the home for a number of small businesses.

Like Arkwright and the Strutt brothers, the Evans family provided a community for their workers. Sir Richard Arkwright died in 1792 and the business passed to his son, Richard Arkwright junior, who sold all its holdings apart from the Cromford and Masson Mills. The late 1820s saw the beginning of a progressive decline in the fortunes of both mills. Cotton manufacture came to an end on the Cromford site in the 1870s: parts of it continued in use for other industrial purposes, but even these came to an end in 1979, by which time it had suffered two fires and much alteration. It is now home to a range of small businesses, as well as a popular heritage attraction. The Masson Mill, by contrast, was modernized in the late 1880s and was in continuous operation until 1992.

Description

The nominated property consists of a continuous strip 24km in length, from the edge of Matlock Bath in the north nearly to the centre of Derby in the south. It includes four industrial settlements (Cromford, Belper, Milford, and Darley Abbey), which are articulated by the river Derwent, the waters of which provided the power to drive the cotton mills. Much of the landscape setting of the mills and the industrial communities, which was much admired in the 18th and early 19th centuries, has survived.

In what follows only the more exceptional buildings and features will be described. These are treated in groups, sequentially from north to south.

- Cromford and Matlock Bath

Masson Mill was originally a 21-bay five-storey building 43m long and 8.4m wide built of brick on a gritstone base. The staircase and ancillary services are housed in a three-bay central projection, leaving the main floors uncluttered: its facade has a decorative architectural treatment. The original single waterwheel had another added in 1801, and both were replaced by turbines in 1928. It should be noted that there was no workers' housing provided by Arkwright at Matlock Bath.

The earliest industrial building of the *Cromford Mill Complex* was the Upper Mill (1771). It was originally a building of eleven bays 28.5m long by 7.9m wide and five storeys high. It was built of coursed gritstone lined with a skin of brick. The construction was entirely traditional, with timber beams and roof members and sash windows. It was a simple functional building with no concessions to architectural design apart from the original main entrance. The upper two storeys were removed by a fire in 1929 and it was reroofed in asbestos sheet. Power came from a single overshot wheel.

The Lower Mill of 1776 (sixteen bays, six storeys high, 36m x 8m) was built to house Arkwright's complete cotton spinning mechanism. It has now disappeared completely, but archaeological excavation has revealed its ground plan and internal details. The four-storey annexe still survives. Of particular interest is the complete hot-air system built within the separate service tower.

A large five-storey mill/warehouse of 1785–90, which survives in excellent condition, has an unusual apsidal end containing the staircase and services, freeing the entire interior for production. An internal lavatory column at the other end contains a heating system similar to that in the annex described above.

There is a number of other industrial buildings within the complex with various original functions – warehouses, workshops, a loom shop, mill managers' houses, etc.

Construction of the *industrial settlement* took place over a period of twenty years from 1776 onwards. In addition to the individual workers' houses (notably the fine 1776 terraces of North Street), there are some important social facilities, such as the market place, created in 1790 and dominated by the fine pedimented three-storey Greyhound Hotel. The school and schoolhouse in North Street date from 1832, when new legislation required employers to provide half-day schooling for child workers. There are many good buildings on the outskirts of the village, some antedating the establishment of the mill complex.

The *Cromford Canal*, built in the 1790s, ran 23.5km from Cromford to join the Erewash Canal, as part of a through route to Manchester. A section 10.5km long lies within the nominated area. The surviving buildings on the Cromford Wharf include two warehouses, an office or counting house, and two cottages. A number of structures survive along this stretch of the canal, including bridges, aqueducts, a tunnel, and several cottages, most of them from the end of the 18th century.

- Belper

Belper is located halfway between Cromford and Derby. The Strutts' mill complex lies to the north of the town centre, a medieval foundation, with the houses stretching up the slopes of the hills to the north and east.

Belper North Mill (1804) was built to replace that burned down in 1803 and incorporates the pioneer fire-resistant structure developed by Charles Bage in 1796 at the Ditherington flax mill in Shrewsbury. It is constructed in brick on a stone plinth, and the exterior retains the appearance of an "Arkwright" mill, with seventeen bays and a wing of six bays, on a T-shaped plan, with the wheel chamber in the wing. However, in the interior there are many features designed to resist or restrict combustion. The floors are of brick and tile supported by arches that spring from cast-iron beams. The beams in their turn are supported on cast-iron columns, linked together by wrought-iron ties. The floor arches in the bays above the waterwheel are filled with clay pots, thereby lessening the load in this area.

The North Mill is overshadowed by the East Mill (1912), a fortress-like seven-storey building with four corner turrets and an Italianate tower.

The *houses* built by the Strutts are built in gritstone or locally made brick and roofed with Welsh slate. They are laid out in rows, largely on an east–west alignment and in various forms as the company experimented with different designs. The Chapel and Chapel Cottage (1788) was one of the first buildings commissioned by Jedediah Strutt. It is an outstanding example of nonconformist architecture built in ashlar with a hipped slate roof. It was extended on either side in the 19th century.

- Milford

The Strutts purchased land in Milford in 1781 and immediately began building what was to become a complex of cotton mills and bleach works. Little remains of the industrial buildings following a radical clearance operation around 1960, but much of the industrial housing survives intact. The houses, many of them in rows because of the topography of the area, are in a range of styles. Some are earlier farm houses that were purchased by the company and converted into multiple dwellings. The public buildings established by the Strutts include schools, churches, and public houses.

- Darley Abbey

This settlement lies 2km north of Derby City Centre. It was an industrial hamlet, with fulling mills, corn mills, and a forge, by the middle of the 17th century, and these had grown by the early 1770s to five water-powered mills – a paper mill, a corn mill, two flint mills (for porcelain production), and a leather mill. The cotton mill development of the Evans family began in 1782 and was followed by their factory village.

The industrial structures that survive are among the most complete of any of the early cotton factory sites, and are comparable with those at Cromford.

The *Long Mill* (1789) was built to replace the 1782 factory, which was destroyed by fire. It consists of five storeys plus attic and is 38.4m long and 10.1m wide. The ground floor is in masonry and those above in brick. Many of the exposed wooden members inside are sheathed in metal for increased

fire resistance (possibly the first known use of this technique). The attic floor is supported by a matrix of wooden beams, a feature not found on any of the other floors, and all are clad in sheet metal. The lower floors have structures of transverse beams with a central row of cast-iron columns.

The mill was extended in 1818 and again in 1821: these became what are known as the *East Mill* and the *West Mill*. The latter is an L-shaped extension projecting from the middle five bays of the Long Mill. It is brick-built with a masonry ground floor, but one floor lower than the Long Mill. The entire mill is fireproofed.

The *housing* built by the Evans family has survived almost intact. Only the family's own mansions, their farm, and the paper mill have been demolished. There is no discernible pattern in the distribution of these houses, built over more than four decades from *c* 1790 onwards: this can in no sense be considered to be a planned or model community. However, in the range and diversity of house types it compares favourably with Cromford and Belper.

Management and Protection

Legal status

There are thirteen Conservation Areas falling wholly or partly within the nominated area. These are designated under 69 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act (1990). Local planning authorities are responsible for their designation and periodic monitoring.

Under the provisions of the same Act, 838 buildings within the nominated area are included on the List of Buildings of Special Architectural or Historical Interest. Eighteen are Grade I (mostly at Cromford), 42 are Grade II*, and the remainder Grade II. Authorization for demolition or alteration must be sought from the relevant local planning authority.

The nominated area contained nine Scheduled Ancient Monuments, designated under the provisions of the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979. Any works affecting these monuments must be submitted to the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport for approval.

The nominated area also contains two Sites of Special Scientific Interest, designated under the Wildlife and Countryside Act (1981); one Special Area of Conservation, designated under European Union Directive 92/43/EEC on the Conservation of Natural Habitats etc; two parks on the Register of Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest in England; and 14 sites on the Derbyshire Wildlife Trust's Register of Wildlife Sites.

Management

Ownership of properties within the nominated area is varied. Most of the residential property is privately owned, as are some of the industrial sites and monuments. However, many of the important industrial buildings are in public ownership or owned by charitable trusts.

A comprehensive system of statutory control operates under the provisions of the Town and Country Planning Act (1990) and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act (1990). Certain responsibilities are delegated by the two responsible government departments (Environment,

Transport and the Regions; Culture, Media and Sport) to local planning authorities. In the case of the Derwent valley, strategic planning is the responsibility of the Derbyshire County Council and Derby City Council, who jointly produce the Derby and Derbyshire Structure Plan, which has to be reviewed and revised regularly.

Direct control of development and local planning is handled by the relevant district councils: Derbyshire Dales District Council, Amber Valley Borough Council, and Erewash Borough Council. In Derby the City Council combines the functions of strategic and local planning authority. Each has produced a local plan which is implemented through its development control powers and which includes policies relating to the conservation of its heritage.

There is an Economic Development Strategy for the East Midlands for 2000–2010, and the three district councils and Derby City Council have produced, or are preparing, similar strategic documents.

It will be seen that management responsibility is shared by a number of local authorities and government agencies. A coordination mechanism was created in 1997 in the form of the Derwent Valley Mills Steering Panel, which is served by a technical working party. It has established a close working relationship between the local authorities involved in the nominated area.

This Panel has been responsible for the preparation of a draft management plan for the nominated property, which is in the consultation stage. The plan:

- Established a forum for those with ownership of, and management duties and rights over, land and buildings within the nominated site, including the occupiers of residential and commercial properties. The intention is to achieve a consensus for a strategy which is realistic and achievable, and which will be implemented in a sensitive and sustainable manner.
- Includes summaries of the description and significance of the area detailed in the nomination, as a basis for developing a management strategy to protect and enhance the nominated site, with a commitment to continued monitoring and review.
- Identifies the incidence and degree of vulnerability of the cultural heritage of the area.
- Develops proposals for the protection and enhancement of the special qualities and significance of the cultural landscape and identifies strategies for implementation.
- Identifies and reviews the effectiveness of current measures within the site that are designed to protect and enhance the area's special status and significance.
- Proposes ways of developing access to, and within, the nominated site sustainably, with regard both to the needs of individual sites and the local community.
- Proposes a mechanism for the management of the nominated site based upon a partnership of local authorities, agencies, and other bodies coordinated by Derbyshire County Council.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Recognition of the historical importance of the Derwent valley mills and the need to conserve its industrial heritage began in 1971 when the Arkwright Festival took place, bringing together experts from a range of disciplines. It led to the creation of the Arkwright Society and in 1979 of a detailed study of the valley. Since that time there has been an ongoing programme of research, inventory, conservation, and rehabilitation on all the major industrial sites.

The sale of the workers' housing as the industrial companies that owned them closed down or were dispersed resulted in some inappropriate additions and alterations and loss of architectural detail, especially of the original joinery. This problem was recognized in the 1970s and 1980s and a strategy for protection and enhancement was set up by the local authorities and English Heritage involving grant-aid and technical advice for property owners.

Authenticity and integrity

As a cultural landscape this stretch of the Derwent valley possesses a high degree of integrity. The relationship of the industrial installations and their dependent housing settlements to the river and its tributaries and to the topography of the surrounding rural landscape has been preserved, especially in the upper reaches of the valley, virtually intact. Similarly, the interdependence of the mills and other industrial elements, such as the canals and railway, and the workers' housing, is still plainly visible.

The industrial buildings have for the most part retained a large measure of authenticity. It has to be borne in mind that some have undergone substantial alterations and additions in order to accommodate new technological and social practices, but their original forms, building materials, and structural techniques are still intact and easy to discern. In those cases where buildings have been lost through fire or demolition, no attempt has been made to reconstruct. Restoration work on buildings that have been in a poor state of repair has been carried out following detailed research on available documentation and contemporary built architectural examples, and every effort has been made to ensure that compatible materials are used.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the property in January 2001. ICOMOS consulted TICCIH experts on the cultural significance of this property.

Qualities

This stretch of the Derwent valley is an exceptionally well preserved historic industrial landscape. It contains a number of important industrial buildings from the late 18th and 19th centuries, together with their associated workers' housing. It is especially important because it may justifiably be asserted that the modern factory owes its origins to Richard Arkwright's innovative mills at Cromford.

Comparative analysis

In terms of industrial buildings the Derwent valley mills may be considered to be *sui generis* in the sense that they were the first of what was to become the model for factories throughout the world in subsequent centuries.

The provision of houses and other services for the workforce of the mills is an interesting, though by no means unique element. This practice was adopted at New Lanark by David Dale, but it was the moral philosophy of Robert Owen that introduced a new dimension into what had been no more than a pragmatic approach to securing a workforce in a rural area. Owen's example was later followed and rationalized by Titus Salt in the mid 19th century at Saltaire, which in turn provided the model for the later Italian textile settlement of Crespi d'Adda, inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1995.

Brief description

The Derwent valley in central England contains a series of 18th and 19th century cotton mills and an industrial landscape of high historical and technological significance. The modern factory owes its origins to the mills at Cromford, where Richard Arkwright's inventions were first put into industrial-scale production. The workers' housing associated with this and the other mills is intact and illustrates the socio-economic development of the area.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

The cultural landscape of the Derwent valley is of outstanding significance because it was here that the modern factory system was established, to accommodate the new technology for spinning cotton developed by Richard Arkwright. The insertion of industrial establishments into a rural landscape necessitated the construction of housing for the workers in the mills, and the resulting settlements created an exceptional industrial landscape that has retained its qualities over two centuries.

ICOMOS, March 2001

New Lanark (United Kingdom)

No 429rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	New Lanark
<i>Location</i>	South Lanarkshire
<i>State Party</i>	United Kingdom
<i>Date</i>	28 June 2000

Justification by State Party

New Lanark is a unique reminder that the creation of wealth does not automatically imply the degradation of its producers. The village offers a cultural response to the challenges presented by industrial society and was the test-bed for ideas that sought to reform humanity. Today the village provides physical evidence of Robert Owen's model for a New Moral World.

New Lanark is a great landscape modified, through the medium of architecture, to meet the needs and vision of a pioneer working community.

The simple grandeur of the Scottish urban tenement tradition comes through both in the tall New Buildings and in the architectural treatment of the then new demands of mill construction. Contrast and variety are given by individual buildings, but the theme remains good proportion, good masonry, and simplicity of detail. The artisan's understanding of Scottish classical vernacular, built up through the 18th century, reaches something of an apogee at New Lanark. This common building language produces a monumental unity of character remarkably suited to convey to us today the idealistic paternalism of David Dale's and Robert Owen's great enterprise.

The community spirit generated by Dale, fostered by Owen, and nurtured by subsequent owners has survived the end of manufacturing and rapid slide into decay, and also the stresses of again becoming a showpiece. New Lanark attracted attention in the days of Dale and Owen as a model village and one of the greatest sights of its kind. Today, warmed by the ideas of two of the greatest and most humane industrialists of the Industrial Revolution, it has become again one of the greatest sights of its kind.

New Lanark combines this unique cultural heritage with an outstanding natural setting. The gorge in which it is located contains, by volume, the greatest waterfalls in Britain. These became an essential stop for every late 18th and early 19th century picturesque tourist, a resource for outstanding poets and artists, the response to which is still readable in the

landscape and visible on the walls of our national galleries. The Falls of Clyde have achieved iconic status as the archetype of the picturesque or sublime landscape in Britain. They have been visited, written about, drawn, painted, and photographed for some 300 years. Today's visitors stand on the same ground to admire the Falls as did artistic and literary figures such as William Wordsworth, William Turner, and Sir Walter Scott.

Without them our appreciation of sublime scenery would not be what it is today. Owen commissioned artists' views of New Lanark that firmly place it in this awesome, yet designed, cultural landscape.

New Lanark can be seen as the model for industrial communities, and at least two cities, world-wide. Technical developments by the first manager, William Kelly, in heating, ventilation, and the self-acting mule resulted in correspondence with other leaders in the field. He was succeeded by Robert Owen, whose constant pronouncements about his management of society at New Lanark led to the intense scrutiny of the place by engineers, philanthropists, architects, and town planners the world over. The conceptual blueprint has become part of the philosophical equipment of the world's architects and planners. **Criterion ii**

New Lanark is preserved almost whole and has the most complete integration of architectural design of all the early cotton mill settlements, a type illustrating the most revolutionary element of the Industrial Revolution. The buildings and water-power system express the extension to the outermost limits of the application of building materials and techniques to the new industrial age. Owen's additions are distinctive but integrate harmoniously with the general framework devised for David Dale. New Lanark was at its time a major economic and technical development: one of the largest cotton mills in the world. It was in such sites that modern systems of manufacturing organization, management structure, and class relations began to develop, and New Lanark is outstanding in this regard. **Criterion iv**

Owenism, Utopianism, cooperation, communitarianism, industrial capitalism, concepts of the sublime landscape, and models for modern conservation partnerships were all shaped at New Lanark.

Through its founder, David Dale, New Lanark is directly and tangibly associated with the development of industrial capitalism. As a major figure in the Scottish commercial and banking world of the mid to late 18th century, Dale offers the pre-eminent example of individual enterprise and prudent financial planning that led to an unprecedented expansion of employment and productivity. Dale's success was tempered by his philanthropy. New Lanark is the place with which he was most deeply and longest associated and is best preserved.

New Lanark is famous, directly and tangibly associated with the Utopian ideas of Robert Owen, partner in the firm from 1800 to 1825. His publications, including *A New View of Society*, drew on his experience at New Lanark and inspired progressive education, factory reform, humane working practices, international cooperation, and garden cities.

The physical evidence of New Lanark's role as test-bed for his Rational Social System is shown by the presence today of his New Institution for the Formation of Character, School, Store, and Counting House. The greater extent of the buildings that preceded Owen offer evidence that it was

Dale's village that moulded many of Owen's ideas, rather than *vice versa*, and this serves to heighten the significance of the village. The rational classicism of the fabric of the village gave credibility to Owen's ideas.

The landscape of the Falls of Clyde, of which New Lanark forms part, was highly influential to the career of Scottish landscape painter Jacob More, and was also painted by Turner, alluded to by Sir Walter Scott, and versified by Wordsworth. The Falls had an important role in shaping Scottish culture. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

New Lanark was founded in 1785 to take advantage of the cotton-spinning patents secured by Richard Arkwright, which allowed yarn to be spun in water-powered mills on an unprecedented scale. Arkwright came to Scotland in 1783 and met David Dale, a leading West of Scotland linen yarn merchant and Glasgow agent of the Royal Bank of Scotland. The splendid latent water power at New Lanark led to Dale to undertake development on his own, and with the quashing of Arkwright's patents in 1785 his involvement ceased.

The first mill at New Lanark went into production in 1786 and was soon followed by another. Dale continued to build, the third and fourth mills being designed for Samuel Crompton's mule, which was capable of spinning finer yarn than Arkwright's frame. The fourth mill was not used for spinning in Dale's time, housing instead child apprentices and a mechanics' shop.

Housing had to be provided for the workers. Owing to the restricted site in the gorge of the river Clyde, this was built in the form of blocks three or four storeys in height rather than the two-storey buildings favoured at other Scottish cotton mills. The houses were superior in quality to those general occupied by working people at that time. Rapid technical changes led to increases in the workforce and so new houses were added, the last in 1798 (known as "New Buildings").

Dale was a humane employer, who treated his workers well. He established a school in New Lanark which by 1796 had eighteen teachers for 510 pupils. As the most successful cotton spinner in Scotland his was an important example.

In 1799 a partnership was formed by Robert Owen, a Welsh cotton spinner, who had married Dale's daughter. Owen tightened up the management of the mill, introducing new standards of book-keeping and factory discipline. He began to remodel the village around 1809. The fourth mill was brought into production, a house being built for the apprentices as well as a foundry and machine shops.

Owen became convinced that by treating his workers as being responsible for their actions and by encouraging them to realize their mutual dependence productivity would rise and a community spirit would develop. He also realized that an educated workforce was more likely to achieve his

objectives, and so in 1809 he began the construction of his "New Institution for the Formation of Character." He failed to get the support of his partners for this project, but after several changes in the partnership the building was finally opened in 1816; a school was added in the following year.

Because of its location, on the route from Lanark to the famous Falls of Clyde, the mills became one of the features of a tour of Scotland. Contact with distinguished visitor and a high level of public consciousness widened Owen's ideas. His vision of a society without crime, poverty, and misery had a wide appeal in the years following the Napoleonic Wars, and he was encouraged by this to write and to travel widely to promote his views. In 1824 a bitter quarrel with his partners over his educational methods led him to leave New Lanark to develop a community at New Harmony, Indiana (USA), on the cooperative lines that he had described in his influential *Report to the County of Lanark* (1820). This community failed because it lacked the central focus provided by a disciplined factory and Owen left it in 1828, though he continued to develop and promote his ideas until his death in 1858.

The mill was sold by the surviving partners to the Walker brothers in 1828 and they continued to spin cotton until they sold it in 1881 to a partnership which introduced net-making and canvas weaving. From them it passed to the Gourcock Ropework Company, the world's largest rope and net producers, who made cotton canvas and nets there until 1968.

Description

The area proposed for inscription consists of the village of New Lanark and an area around, which includes areas of woodland and a number of minor monuments. The total area nominated is 146ha. It is surrounded by a buffer zone covering 667ha.

Details follow of the major monuments within the nominated area.

- Residential buildings

1–10 Braxfield Row: Built 1785–95, four- and five-storey tenements, one room deep.

1–8 Caithness Row and the Counting House: Built *c* 1792, three storeys high, one room deep. The bowed Counting House was added at the north end by Owen *c* 1810–16.

9–16 Caithness Row: A detached continuation of the previous row. An abattoir, later used as a wash-house and water-closets, was added on the opposite side of the street later (now a double garage).

1–8 Double Row (Wee Row) and 9–24 Double Row: Built before 1799, three storeys high, double room depth.

1–14 Long Row: Built *c* 1792, two storey and basement, one room deep. Cellarage and wash-houses were located in the basements.

1–3 Mantilla Row: Built *c* 1790, two storey with basement, one room deep.

New Buildings: Single-storey cottages built in 1798 were replaced twelve years later by large tenements of double room depth. The block was extended by Owen soon after his arrival to provide rooms for Sunday schools, and a pediment, an oculus, and advanced end bays were added. Some time in

the 19th century the bellcote was removed from Mill 1 and re-erected here.

1–11 Nursery Buildings and Store: Built in 1809 for pauper apprentices, but adapted for family dwellings soon after. It is three- and four-storey high, with a single-storey bakery (later a post office) added c 1850. The village store was set up by Owen c 1810 and run by the company until 1933, when it was purchased by the local cooperative society.

Robert Owen's House, Rosedale Street: One of the two detached houses built for David Dale and William Kelly. Owen lived here from 1799 to 1808, when a growing household compelled him to move to Braxfield House. It is plain in form, in the Georgian style, with two storeys and an attic.

David Dale's House, Rosedale Street: This is the largest detached house in the village. It is similar in style to Owen's house, but with tripartite wings.

Braxfield House: This house has a 17th century core, extended to form a U-plan in the 18th century. Since 1931 it has been a roofless ruin.

- Public buildings

The Institute for the Formation of Character: Begun in 1809 but not completed until 1815. This austere building has two floors and an attic, a central Doric portico its only concession to contemporary public building styles in the village. The first floor was originally divided into large galleries for study and teaching. The lower storey was divided into three halls for infants; it has hollow iron pillars for heating which vent into the floor above.

The School: Built 1817, it is a two-storey building with a symmetrical layout of equal-sized classrooms. The basement houses water cisterns and the furnace for the heated air system, which is similar to that in the Institute.

New Lanark Church: This is a simple Neo-Gothic church dating from 1898, now no longer in ecclesiastical use.

- Industrial buildings

Mill No 1: Building started on a site facing the river Clyde in 1785 and it was spinning cotton by March 1786. After being burned down in October 1788 it was rebuilt the following year. It measures 47m x 8.20m by 18.3m high. Three waterwheels placed transversely drove 4500 spindles in 1793 and 6556 in 1802. It has a projecting Venetian-windowed stair tower.

Mill No 2: This mill was added in 1788 and is similar in form and proportions to No 1.

Mill No 3: This mill was built c 1790–92, at which time it measured 40m x 9m by 18.3m high. After it burned down in 1819 it was completely rebuilt in the late 1820s as a 37.75m three-bay iron-framed mill. Brick arches spring between cast-iron beams on cast-iron columns, and the roof trusses have iron queen-posts. It was originally the Jenny House, for self-acting spinning jennies to William Kelly's patent. It was linked by a three-bay extension to No 4 Mill of an unusual construction: iron plate floors laid on a grid of short cast-iron joists and a roof of iron purlins.

Mill No 4: This mill was built in 1791–93, when it measured 47.5m x 10m by 21.3m high. It was not fitted up as a mule-spinning mill until 1813. The original structure burned down

in 1888. Its north gable survives as the south gable of No 3 Mill. In 1990 a waterwheel was brought in from elsewhere in Scotland and installed here.

The Mechanics' Workshop and Foundry: Built in the early years of the 19th century, it was used for making equipment for New Lanark, and also for other Scottish mills. It is one of the oldest engineering workshops in Scotland. The Neo-Classical style, used at the Institute and School, is repeated here, with pediments to the east and north gable elevations.

The Dyeworks: This long low building was originally the brass and iron foundry of the mill, built c 1806.

Waterhouses: Originally each of the mills has one of the two-storey structures, which straddle the tailraces of the water wheels to prevent back-watering (reverse flow). Only parts of those fronting Mills Nos 1 and 2 survive.

- The buffer zone

The landscape of the extensive buffer zone contains a number of elements that are complementary to that of the main New Lanark nominated area. These include farms, estates, woodland, bridges, etc of historical interest. Worthy of mention is Bonnington Power Station, the first large-scale hydro-electric scheme for public power supply in Britain, which still includes two original turbines.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The whole of the nominated area is within the New Lanark Conservation Area, one of the first to be designated in 1973 under the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act. Within a designated Conservation Area no buildings which are not protected by other statutory instruments (Ancient Monuments, Listed Buildings) may not be demolished without authorization.

Within the nominated area there are 27 Listed Buildings protected under this Act. It is noteworthy that no fewer than 21 of these are protected as category A buildings, the highest level, reflecting the high national and interest of New Lanark. There is a number of Listed Buildings in the buffer zone.

The Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 makes it a criminal offence to alter, damage, or destroyed any Scheduled Ancient Monument without the written consent of the Secretary of State for Scotland. There is one Ancient Monument (the Museum Stair at Double Row) in the nominated area and two in the buffer zone.

In addition to these statutes, some measure of protection, especially of gardens and designed landscapes, is also conferred by the Town and Country Planning (General Development Procedures) Scotland Order (1992), under which developers must consult the Secretary of State for Scotland when any development is proposed which may have an adverse impact on Listed Buildings, Ancient Monuments, or historic landscapes and gardens on the official Inventory of Gardens and Designed Landscapes.

Management

Ownership of New Lanark Village is shared between the New Lanark Conservation Trust, the New Lanark

Association, South Lanarkshire Council, and twenty private householders (for which restrictive covenants apply).

Management at the local level is the responsibility of the New Lanark Conservation Trust. This is a non-profit-making charitable trust through which the development of New Lanark Village has been managed and through which the majority of funding for capital projects is channelled.

South Lanarkshire Council is the local government body responsible for structure and local planning and for development control in South Lanarkshire. It also has powers and duties under the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act (1997) and powers under the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act (1979).

Historic Scotland is the executive agency within the Scottish Executive responsible for discharging the Government's functions in relation to the protection and presentation of Scotland's built and archaeological heritage. So far as the natural heritage is concerned, the responsible Government agency is Scottish Natural Heritage.

There is a long history of management planning and control in New Lanark, beginning with *A Future for New Lanark: a Report to the New Lanark Working Party by the Feasibility Study Team* published by the County Council of Lanark in 1973. This led to the creation of the New Lanark Conservation Trust and established the policy and principles that have governed the management of New Lanark ever since. No fewer than 47 discussion papers have been produced since 1975. The Trust has an outline Business Plan, prepared by consultants KPMG, and to this will shortly be added a Conservation Plan, as required by the Heritage Lottery Fund.

It is perhaps relevant to mention in this context that in 1996 a team from the Trust prepared a business plan and development report for the World Heritage site of the historic salt mine at Wielicka (Poland).

These plans are set within the framework of the land-use planning system established in the United Kingdom by the Town and Country Planning Act (1947). The regional strategic Strathclyde Structure Plan (1995) includes a policy specifying New Lanark as being of special heritage significance. At local level the Lanark Local Plan (1983) lays down policies for the conservation and management of New Lanark, stressing the need for a development policy. The consultative document for the Lower Clydesdale Local Plan (1999) concentrates on traffic and the need to establish links between New Lanark and Lanark, reflecting the progress made since 1983.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The conservation and rehabilitation of New Lanark has now been in progress for more than a quarter of a century. It has been guided throughout that period by the commitment and the expertise of the New Lanark Conservation Trust and its collaborators. This effort continues through to the present day and a number of projects are in progress.

Authenticity and integrity

The authenticity of the historic industrial and other buildings at New Lanark is relatively high. As the economic and industrial basis of the community fluctuated and eventually died between 1785 and 1968, new buildings were constructed, others were demolished or destroyed by fire, and many underwent radical changes in use. From the 1970s onwards careful research has preceded the restoration and rehabilitation of these buildings.

The appearance of the village is now very close to that of its heyday, the first half of the 19th century, as confirmed by the voluminous graphic and written archive available for research. It might be argued, however, that the integrity of the village has been destroyed. This has been a conscious act, involving the demolition of many more recent buildings: in a sense New Lanark has been arrested at a certain time of its history.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited New Lanark in January 2001. ICOMOS consulted TICCIH experts on the cultural significance of this property.

Qualities

New Lanark is an exceptional example of an early 19th century purpose-built cotton milling town, in which the majority of the original buildings survive intact and well conserved. It is of special interest because it was there that Robert Owen first applied his form of benevolent paternalism in industry, building on the altruistic actions of his partner, David Dale. It was there, too, that he formulated his Utopian philosophy of vision of a society without crime, poverty, and misery.

Comparative analysis

The model industrial settlement is a phenomenon of the Enlightenment. The San Leucio silk factory was set up in 1789 as part of the never realized utopian town of Ferdinandopolis in the park of the Royal Palace at Caserta (Italy): it forms part of the World Heritage site inscribed in 1997. Many more were created in the 19th century: the textile mill settlement at Crespi d'Adda in northern Italy became a World Heritage site in 1995. Other notable settlements of this kind are Le Grand Hornu (Belgium) from the 1830s, Noisiel, near Paris (started in the 1870s), and Port Sunlight, United Kingdom (from 1888).

When Crespi d'Adda was nominated, TICCIH prepared a comparative study of "Workers' villages as elements of the industrial heritage," at the request of ICOMOS. This defined a workers' village as "any group of residential buildings created on the initiative of an employer in a symbiotic relationship with the workplaces," and laid down certain criteria for the evaluation of monuments of this kind when proposed for the World Heritage List. Two main criteria were identified, relating to the expression on the part of employers of their wish to provide their workers with quality housing:

1. the size, number, and degree of comfort of the dwellings and their disposition in relation to the settlement pattern or the surrounding landscape – ie the provision of a way

of life for their workers that would ensure their remaining, but for more than simple financial reasons;

2. the quality of the materials used and their architectural style linked with a local or regional identity.

In this study New Lanark was cited as admirably fulfilling both criteria. Stress was laid upon the moral and social philosophy that underlay Robert Owen's creation, which was recognized as the paradigm of this form of heritage.

When this nomination was first considered in 1987 some concern was expressed about its relationship with Owen's later foundation, New Harmony (USA). ICOMOS is of the opinion that the two are not comparable. New Lanark was an existing textile village under benevolent management where Owen was given the opportunity to develop and put his moral and social ideas into practice in a flourishing industrial context. New Harmony (which is on the US tentative list) by contrast was set up by Owen as a Utopian settlement without any industrial or economic foundations where he hoped to be able to create a new kind of morally impeccable. Lacking this material backing it did not succeed and he left it after a short time. The differences between the two settlements become clear when the buildings and institutions that survive are compared: the monumentality of New Lanark is completely lacking in New Harmony.

Consideration should also be given to the influence of Owen on later industrialists and planners in the United Kingdom. The nature and layout of New Lanark inspired other benevolent industrialists to follow his example, and this movement laid the foundations for the work of Ebenezer Howard in creating the concept of the Garden City.

Brief description

New Lanark is a small village in a beautiful Scottish landscape where in the early years of the 19th century a model industrial society was created by the philanthropist and Utopian idealist Robert Owen. The imposing mill buildings, the spacious and well designed workers' housing, and the dignified educational institute and school still survive to testify to Owen's humanism.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iv, and vi*:

The creation of the model industrial settlement at New Lanark, in which good-quality planning and architecture were integrated with a humane concern on the part of the employers for the well-being and lifestyle of the workers, is a milestone in social and industrial history. The moral and social beliefs that underlay Robert Owen's work there provided the basis for seminal material and intangible developments that have had lasting influences on human society over the past two hundred years.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Saltaire (United Kingdom)

No 1028

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Saltaire
<i>Location</i>	West Yorkshire
<i>State Party</i>	United Kingdom
<i>Date</i>	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

[This is a slightly shortened version of the Statement of Significance in the nomination dossier.]

The settlement of Saltaire is of outstanding universal significance in three ways. First, it encapsulates the maturing of industrial society and the industrial system. Secondly, it represents an important stage in the development of a formal land-use planning system. Thirdly, in its unified architectural style, its construction quality, and its building hierarchy it exhibits mid-Victorian society's pre-eminence in European imperialist and technological domination, and the paternalistic, moral, and practical philanthropy that was characteristic of that society. All this exists in a remarkably complete physical entity, which continues to operate as a living and working community.

Saltaire provided a model for resolving the problem of how to deal with rapid urbanization in an industrial society. This problem did not really exist before 1800, but it erupted in Britain in the 19th century and spread rapidly, first to mainland Europe and North America and subsequently to the rest of the world. The creation of Saltaire was one of the first successful solutions to the problems of the unprecedented urban growth of industrialization. The planned model settlement, which was a complex and self-contained socio-economic unit, represents an important stage in the development of modern town planning. Not only does it represent the integration of industrial, residential, and civic buildings and open spaces within a framework of unified design, but it also showed how this could be created on a greenfield site away from the parent city by means of "planned dispersal."

Criterion ii

By the middle of the 19th century Great Britain was the first industrialized nation in the world. Its international trade, colonization, and political linkages led it to become the first truly global "superpower," albeit for only a few decades. While its supremacy lasted, much of the urban development which took place showed the self-confidence and technological flair and sense of civic pride and social philanthropy that mirrored the spirit of the mid-Victorian

age. This is seen in Salt's Mill, which was built to resemble an Italian Renaissance palace whilst operating at the cutting edge of industrial technology. It is also evident in the ordered hierarchy and unified architectural style of employees' housing and the institutional buildings. The survival of the ensemble at Saltaire, almost intact, provides its own authenticity for it meeting this criterion.

Criterion iii

The town of Saltaire, as it was built in the mid 19th century, constitutes an architectural and technological ensemble that reflects the culmination of the first wave of the Industrial Revolution. It shows this in two ways. First, Salt's Mill is a most remarkable industrial complex, which demonstrates both the most advanced technology of the age and a sophisticated use of integrated transport networks to optimize the area's locational advantages. Salt's Mill is described as "one of the largest mill complexes to be designed in a unity," and is indisputably one of the largest, best designed, and most architecturally accomplished textile mills of the 1850s. Secondly, the construction of a settlement for the workforce, which included not only good-quality housing but also a range of handsome and "improving" facilities, demonstrates Victorian philanthropic paternalism at its best. The fact that William Fairbairn was the best mill engineer of the time and that the prominent architects Lockwood and Mawson designed the settlement as a harmonious whole undoubtedly contributed greatly to the success of Salt's enterprise.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

The worsted trade began in Bradford in the mid 18th century as the centre of a semi-rural production system, but it did not develop rapidly until the advent of steam power. The result was an urban population explosion: between 1780 and 1850 it rose from 8500 to nearly 104,000. The living conditions of the workforce was abysmal, and the life expectancy for both men and women was little over twenty years, in a town recognized as one of the most polluted in England.

Titus Salt joined his father as a partner in his wool business in 1824. His success in spinning Donskoi wool from Russia and then spinning and weaving Peruvian alpaca wool made him very wealthy and influential. He became Mayor of Bradford in 1848 and committed himself to reducing Bradford's pollution problems. When the town council refused to take any action, he resolved to remove his operations away from Bradford.

Land was acquired a few miles away which met Salt's requirements. It had access to a plentiful supply of soft water for washing the wool. The transportation links were excellent: the river Aire and the Leeds and Manchester Canal by water and the Midland Railway line by land. The site lay almost equidistant from the two major ports of Liverpool in the west and Hull in the east. Almost the entire operation could be brought under a single roof using the most up-to-date technology and the vertical integration of the process.

Technological developments made it possible for the building to be fireproofed.. For this workers there would be a healthier environment and access to the open countryside.

Having selected the site for his new town to the north-west of Bradford city centre, Salt commissioned the leading Bradford architects Henry Lockwood and Richard Mawson to design and supervise the realization of his visionary plan. To ensure that the new mill would meet the highest standards of cleanliness and safety, Salt enlisted the services of the celebrated engineer William Fairbairn. The Mill, work on which began in 1851 and which was opened in 1853, incorporated every recent structural and mechanical innovation in its equipment and design.

Titus Salt was business man enough to ensure that the mill itself was given top priority in construction, but work began as soon as it was completed on the first workers' cottages. Until they were ready, workers were brought in by train from Bradford, and even after they were completed workers continued to travel in from surrounding districts.

Salt's new village eventually had over 800 dwellings in wide streets with a large dining hall and kitchens, baths, and wash-houses, an almshouse for retired workers, a hospital and dispensary, an educational institute and a church. There was ample recreational land and allotments, in order to improve the diet of the workers.

He gave his new village his own name, coupled with that of the nearby river, and the streets were named after members of his own family (as well as the Queen and her Consort and the architects). However, this pardonable self-promotion in no way detracts from his achievement. He had a genuine philanthropic concern for his workers and succeeded in providing them with a healthy and secure environment (not unconscious, of course, of the economic benefits that this bestowed).

Salt and his model village were given national and international recognition. Many tributes paid to him on his death in 1876, shortly after the last house in the village was completed, from the highest to the lowest, and some 100,000 people lined the route of his funeral cortege.

After his death, the firm was taken over by three of his sons, but its profits declined, to the extent that it was wound up in 1892. Four Bradford businessmen bought the Mill and the village in 1893, one of them (James Roberts) becoming sole owner in 1899. Roberts sold his assets in 1918 for £2 million to another syndicate which reformed in 1923 as Salts (Saltaire) Ltd. The village was sold in 1933 to the Bradford Property Trust, enabling their occupants for the first time to purchase them.

Following booming business in the inter-war years and full operations during World War II, the Mill progressively declined, finally closing down in 1986. Many of the major buildings became semi-redundant and fell into disrepair, and this had an adverse effect on the entire village. With the formation of the Saltaire Village Society in 1984 serious efforts began to regenerate the entire area. The Mill itself was purchased in 1987 by Jonathan Silver, whose enthusiasm and imagination turned it into a major cultural centre.

Description

- The village

The village is laid out on a gridiron pattern, so as to make the maximum possible use of the land. In the first phase the streets were organized on a north-south orientation, those in the second phase running east-west. Almost all the public and community buildings were constructed along Victoria Road, leading to the Mill.

- Housing

The houses, built between 1854 and 1868, are fine examples of 19th century hierarchical workers' homes. All are constructed of hammer-dressed stone with slate roofs. Each was equipped with its own water and gas supply and an outside lavatory. They vary in size from "Two-up two-down" terraces to much larger houses with gardens, for the use of the managers. They are all "through" terraces, allowing light and air to penetrate and refuse to be evacuated without passing through the houses. The monotonous rhythm of the unbroken frontages of the terraced rows was interrupted by the insertion of three-storey buildings, designed as lodgings for single people.

The design and disposition of the houses developed as successive groups were built, ending with the final phase in 1869 when Albert Road was lined with 22 large well appointed properties with more elaborate detailing and larger gardens. They were used by senior executives of the company and worthies such as the Minister of the Congregational Church, the Registrar of Births, Deaths and Marriages, and schoolteachers. No 1 Albert Road is only detached house in the village, occupied in 1871 by the chief cashier of the company.

- Salts Mill

The Mill is an imposing building in a grand Italianate style. It fronts on the former Midland Railway line and the Leeds and Liverpool Canal runs behind it, roughly parallel with the river Aire.

The entire structure was built of stone, with a brick and cast-iron internal framework to minimize the fire risk. The main material is a local sandstone, hammer-dressed with ashlar and rock-faced dressings, red brick lining, a hipped Welsh slate roof, and a deeply bracketed cornice. The entrance and office block on Victoria Road has two storeys with a basement level to the left imposed by the sloping ground. The facade is made up of a symmetrical arrangement of twenty bays with two symmetrically placed projecting bays. The frontispiece of three bays had a giant portal with a round-headed arch extending into the first storey and it is surmounted by a tall turret with a segmental pediment and flanking scrolls. The ground-floor windows are round-arched with rusticated voussoirs and those on the first floor have cambered heads.

The main mill building is four-storey with a basement in a T-shaped plan; there are lower sheds in the angles extending to the east. The south facade is 166m long by 22m high, consisting of sixty bays arranged symmetrically, with a pair of symmetrically placed projecting bays with round-headed openings on the ground floor. Two square attached towers, also symmetrically placed on either side of the projecting bays, project above the eaves and are

pierced by pairs of round-arches openings; they are capped by hipped roofs.

The three upper floors of the facade are punctuated by camber-headed windows linked by string courses at sill level, whilst the ground-floor windows are round-arched with rusticated rock-faced voussoirs, also linked by a similar string course. A deep-bracketed eaves cornice caps the whole composition and a parapet links the central bays and towers.

The roof structure is of an advanced design, composed of cast-iron struts and wrought-iron rods which, unlike the floors below, did not require decorative cast-iron columns for support. The result was a huge undivided space, considered to be the largest in the world at the time it was built.

The mill chimney standing 68m high dominates the main facade, offset to the eastern end. It is constructed of hammer-dressed stone and tapers upwards from a square base with rusticated quoins and a cornice on large square brackets.

Power was supplied from two beam engines designed by William Fairbairn, with ten subterranean boilers, underground shafting, and upright shafting and belting. The drive shafts and other machinery were housed underground so as to minimize the risk of injury. The vast underground reservoir to supply the engines and boilers was supplied partly by rainwater.

- New Mill

New Mill, the work of Lockwood and Mawson, stands on the site of the former Dixon Mill. Further additions were made in 1871. It is built in similar materials to Salts Mill and consist of two four-storey blocks with lower sheds attached to the north and east. The larger block, running parallel to the canal, faces south and has 28 bays by four bays of industrial casement windows. The other block is on the west side of the group and has fourteen bays of industrial casement windows, with segmental heads to its western facade. Between the two blocks is the ornate chimney, based on the campanile of the church of Santa Maria Gloriosa dei Frari in Venice. It is a square tower with paired round-arched sunken panels, above which there are three-light rounded arched louvred openings with hood moulds. An octagonal lantern with round-arched openings surmounts a deep-bracketed cornice.

- The Dining Room

Built in 1854, this was the first building to be completed after the main Mill. Its role was to provide cheap meals for those workers who had to travel to work – 600 breakfasts and 700 dinners daily. It also served as a schoolroom, public meeting hall, and place for religious services until custom-built properties had been erected within the village. It stands opposite the mill complex, with which it was once linked by means of a tunnel under the road. It is a single-storey structure of hammer-dressed stone, with ashlar facings and a hipped Welsh slate roof. The elevation to Victoria Road has seven bays, with the central one forming the doorways and surmounted by the Salt coat of arms.

- Other buildings

The *Congregational (now United Reform) Church* (1856–59), sited opposite the main mill complex, is an elaborate structure in the Italianate style. It has an aisle-less nave and a

semi-circular portico, with a round tower at the east end supported on giant Corinthian columns: above this eight engaged columns support the dome. The interior has dark blue scagliola pilasters, a richly decorated coffered ceiling, and oak pews for 600 people.

The Italianate *Almshouses* (1868) form a U-shaped group around Alexandra Square, one of the few open spaces in the village. There were originally 45 individual houses, each with oven, boiler, and pantry and a single bedroom; four have been absorbed by the expansion of the Hospital and Dispensary. They are alternately single- and two-storeyed.

The *Hospital* (1868) was originally two storeys high and had nine beds, but was progressively extended in the first half of the 20th century and now has 47 beds. It has an asymmetrical facade of eleven bays in an ordered Italianate style. The left facade, on Saltaire Road, has an elaborate central bay, its tympanum enriched with foliage and the Salt coat of arms.

The *School* (1869) is a single-storey structure consisting of three pedimented pavilions linked by a tower and three-bay open colonnade. The central part has a central section breaking forward with an elaborate bell turret above, with the carved figures of a boy, a girl, and a globe. It was designed to take 750 children, boys and girls being segregated.

The *Institute* (1867–71) is a symmetrical T-plan building of two storeys and a basement. The front facade has a central bay that breaks forward with an elaborate square towers and pyramidal roof. In front of the building are two large sculpted lions, representing War and Peace. It originally contained a lecture theatre for 800 people, a smaller hall for 200, a library, reading room, games room, billiard room, drill room, gymnasium, armoury, kitchen, and meeting rooms.

Roberts Park (1871) is a landscaped open space of 6ha with a cricket ground, promenade, bandstand, refreshment rooms, and facilities for swimming and boating.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The entire nominated area was designated a Conservation Area under the provisions of the Civic Amenities Act (1967). Nearly every building and structure within the area is listed under the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act (1900): the Church is Grade I, the Institute, the School, and Salt's Mill are Grade II*, and the others (c 800) are Grade II. Roberts Park is designated Grade II in the Register of Parks and Gardens of Special Historic Interest.

All these complementary forms of statutory protection require authorization by the local planning authority for any form of development. There is an appeal procedure against refusal of consent operating at central government level.

Management

Ownership of the properties that make up the nominated area is varied. Owners include the local authority, the local health authority, private utilities (waterways, railways), church authorities, and private owners (all the residential accommodation, shops, and four almshouses).

The local planning authority is the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council, which has produced a Unitary

Development Plan (UDP), as required under the land-use planning legislation. These plans are subject to regular review and extensive public consultation. The current Bradford UDP was adopted in 1998 and is due for review in 2001. It contains specific policies relating to conservation, including Conservation Areas and Listed Buildings. The Saltaire-Shipley Corridor is one of two areas identified as a regeneration area, in which conservation of the built heritage and encouragement of tourism management is one of the main issues identified.

Although World Heritage List inscription does not carry with it additional statutory controls under UK legislation, central government does recognize the need for extra protection being afforded to them. Local planning authorities are required to formulate specific planning policies for them. The central government Planning Policy Guidance Note (PPG) 15 *Planning and the historic environment* requires management plans to be prepared for World Heritage sites.

A draft management plan has been prepared for Saltaire, based on the *Management Guidelines for World Heritage Sites* (Feilden and Jokilehto) and on management plans prepared for other UK World Heritage sites. The plan aims to:

- establish a forum for those with ownership of and management rights over sites within Saltaire;
- identify the incidences and levels of vulnerability of the cultural heritage of the area;
- be a working document that is comprehensive and flexible, written in a clear and factual style, and capable of continuous development;
- produce a strategy to protect the significance of the site that is realistic and achievable and which will be implemented in a sensitive and sustainable manner;
- identify and review the status and effectiveness of current measures within the site that are designed to protect and enhance the area's special status and significance;
- develop new strategies for the protection and enhancement of the significance of Saltaire.

The nomination dossier contains a map showing the buffer zone around the nominated property which takes the form of a roughly drawn circle. ICOMOS suggests that this delineation, although adequate, should be made more realistic and amended so as to take account of features such as roads and district boundaries.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

In the mid 1980s the state of conservation of many of the buildings in Saltaire, including Salts Mill and the New Mill, had deteriorated alarmingly, and a number of the buildings in the village were in a poor state of repair. The first move to regenerate the area was the establishment of the Saltaire Village Society in 1984. A major contribution was made by the late Jonathan Silver, who purchased Salts Mill in 1987. He established an art gallery there and succeeded in attracting tenants who undertook sympathetic and imaginative rehabilitation projects.

In 1989 the Saltaire Town Scheme was established by the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council and English Heritage. It provided 40% grants for the restoration of original features and repairs to the properties. This scheme ran successfully for seven years; it has recently been superseded by a Conservation Area Partnership Scheme.

The success of these efforts may be judged by the fact that in 1997 the village was awarded the Europa Nostra Award for Conservation-Led Regeneration, Europe's highest conservation award.

Authenticity and integrity

The authenticity of the buildings in Saltaire has been maintained to a very high degree. Little modification took place in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, beyond that required for the application of improved industrial processes. Since industrial activities ceased in the mid 1980s there has been an intensive programme of sensitive rehabilitation and conservation of the entire complex.

The integrity of Saltaire as a model industrial village is total: there have been no changes to its layout and appearance since work began in the 1850s.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited New Lanark in January 2001. ICOMOS consulted TICCIH experts on the cultural significance of this property.

Qualities

Saltaire is an exceptionally complete and well preserved example of a mid 19th century industrial village. It is an outstanding illustration of the philanthropic approach to industrial management typical of this period, and one that acquires further value because of the quality of the architectural and engineering solutions adopted in its design.

Comparative analysis

The concept and realization of Saltaire derive from the workers' housing provided by Sir Richard Arkwright and other mill owners in the Derwent Valley and the more idealistic development of New Lanark by Robert Owen. Saltaire represents the culmination of the tradition of paternalistic philanthropic development by enlightened textile manufacturers. It provided the model for similar developments, both in the United Kingdom and elsewhere in the world, more particularly in the USA. In Italy the layout of Crespi d'Adda (inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1995) was directly inspired by Saltaire, and this is acknowledged in the adoption of a similar form of name, combining that of the owner with that of the river passing through the site.

The TICCIH comparative study of "Workers' villages as elements of the industrial heritage" (1995) laid down certain criteria for the evaluation of monuments of this kind when proposed for the World Heritage List. Two main criteria were identified:

1. the size, number, and degree of comfort of the dwellings and their disposition in relation to the settlement pattern or the surrounding landscape – ie the provision of a way

of life for the workers that would ensure their remaining, but for more than simple financial reasons;

2. the quality of the materials used and their architectural style linked with a local or regional identity.

There can be no dispute that Saltaire fully satisfies these two criteria.

By comparison with other complexes of this type from the second half of the 19th century Saltaire is outstanding because of its completeness and its integrity. It also had a significant influence on town-planning developments in the United Kingdom, which can be seen in the late 19th century garden city movement, which was in turn to have a profound effect internationally.

Brief description

Saltaire is a complete and well preserved industrial village of the second half of the 19th century. Its textile mills, public buildings, and workers' housing are built in a harmonious style of high architectural quality and the plan survives intact, giving a vivid impression of the philanthropic paternalism of the Victorian age.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

The industrial village of Saltaire is an outstanding example of mid 19th century philanthropic paternalism which had a profound influence on developments in industrial and urban planning in the United Kingdom and beyond. It survives in a complete and well preserved form as testimony to the pride and power of basic industries such as textiles for the economy of Great Britain and the world in the 19th and earlier 20th centuries.

The State Party should be requested to supply a map showing a revised buffer zone as suggested by ICOMOS.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Tsodilo (Botswana)

No 1021

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Tsodilo
<i>Location</i>	The Ngamiland District, north-west Botswana
<i>State Party</i>	Botswana
<i>Date</i>	19 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Tsodilo, a major geological landmark in the Kalahari Desert, has been called the "Louvre of the Desert" for the quality and quantity of the rock art contained in an area of only 10km². The archaeological record is particularly good. The place offers a singular opportunity to comprehend the traditions, cultures, and technologies of the people of the Kalahari region from time immemorial to the present.

Geologically, Tsodilo provides a rare opportunity to observe one of the ancient rock formations that make up the Earth's crust, for its very old rock, uplifted by tectonic forces, has resisted many millions of years of weathering and erosion. The place combines several aspects of Earth's history with the cultural history of humankind. It shows an interplay between geological processes spanning more than a billion years and human activities, particularly those involving minerals, over tens of thousands of years.

The archaeology of the area preserves a chronological account of human activities and environmental changes over at least 100,000 years. Outstanding in this record is the rock art. It consists of over 4500 paintings and numerous carvings which provide a vivid insight into early perceptions of this environment while giving artistic expression to contemporary ways of life. Tsodilo has one of the highest concentrations of rock art in the world and so is of major international significance; it also possesses the largest concentration of such work in Botswana. The emphasis on large herbivores echoes the metaphorical idiom of the San people, indicating that, although the symbolism behind the art remains obscure, it is of a religious nature. Whatever the original intentions of the artists, the art has inspired modern interpretations and been put to current use in stamp designs, etc.

Criterion i

The archaeology also demonstrates technology, exchange, and significant detail of settlement pattern and form. It ranges in time from Middle Stone Age to traditional societies, demonstrating not just antiquity but also great diversity. The sites consist of caves, rock shelters, seasonal camps, and settlements; their stratification contains the palaeo-environmental record and cultural sequence. In

particular, the caves and rock shelters provide evidence of a relatively rare phenomenon in Botswana, the evidence of repeated use over an extensive period of time. The combination of natural and artefactual evidence in stratified deposits demonstrates the interaction of people and environment through time and space.

Criterion iii

Tsodilo is unique in being different from the rest of southern Africa in terms of its Iron Age settlement pattern and the way in which its spatial organization within settlements was executed. It defies stereotypes, be they of aboriginal or Bantu peoples.

Criterion v

Traditions speak of Tsodilo as being the home of all living creatures, more particularly home to the spirits of each animal, bird, insect, and plant that has been created. Though exact interpretation and dating of the rock art is uncertain, the art itself clearly testifies to the long tradition of the site as spiritual, a tradition continued today in practices of the !Kung and in visits by, in effect, pilgrims in Western parlance, often from some distance.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It also qualifies as a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

Present evidence indicates the earliest occupants at Tsodilo probably in the Middle Stone Age, perhaps around 100,000 years ago or earlier. A Late Stone Age cultural presence is dated around 70,000 years ago. In general, repeated use over an extensive period of time appears to reflect small mobile groups of people camping briefly, perhaps on seasonal visits, for example when the fruit of the mongongo tree, *Ricinodendron rautanenii*, ripens. Local quartz as well as exotic stone were used for tool-making in both the Middle and Late Stone Ages. The use of non-local raw material suggests that contact and some form of exchange have existed at Tsodilo for tens of thousands of years. The Middle Stone Age is marked by the appearance of large stone blades. Tsodilo is unique in demonstrating an extensive record of freshwater fish exploitation in a now arid landscape where rivers formerly flowed. Barbed bone points were probably used to tip fish-spears; bone toolmaking at Tsodilo may well go back 40,000 years.

Fishbone and stone artefacts decrease in the Late Stone Age (*c* 30,000 BP). The appearance of ostrich eggs in archaeological deposits then indicates the development of a new strategy for acquiring a new resource for food and artefact-making. In particular, a tradition of making beads of ostrich egg-shell began then and continues today. Until as recently as *c* AD 600, the people of Tsodilo lived entirely by hunting, fishing, and foraging for wild food.

By the 7th century AD, however, the pace of change in technology, subsistence, and settlement organization increased as iron and copper metallurgy were introduced. This phase is also marked by the introduction of cattle. Interaction between Late Stone Age foragers and Early Iron Age agro-pastoralists occurred. Settlement took the form of

apparently unique social structures. Divuyu itself is the richest site yet discovered in southern Africa for this period. Copper and iron beads, bracelets, and other ornaments became common. All the metal was imported – the copper probably from southern Zaire or north-eastern South Africa, the iron perhaps from only 40km distant – and worked locally. Nqoma at the end of the 1st millennium has the richest variety of metal jewelry of any known contemporary site in southern Africa.

The same two sites in particular, Divuyu and Nqoma, have indicated domestic herding and a settled lifestyle as early as the 7th–8th centuries AD from evidence of middens and house foundations. Cultivated crops such as sorghum and millet were added to the diet. Sheep and goats augmented the few domestic cattle kept by earlier foraging communities. Pottery was produced for a range of domestic purposes and personal adornment became common and often elaborate. Mining for specularite was extensive in 800–1000, and continued into the 19th century. The output was enormous, doubtless contributing to the amount of jewellery and cattle owned by the Nqoma people. The rich elements of Tsodilo Iron Age culture continued well into the 13th century when Nquoma declined, possibly because of drought or war. No further durable exotic objects seem to have entered the Tsodilo region until the effects of the European Atlantic trade began to be felt in the 18th century. Tsodilo became part of the Portuguese Congo-Angola trade axis.

Historically, the Tsodilo area was occupied by the N/hae, who left in the mid-19th century. Its first appearance on a map was in 1857, as a result of information collected by Livingstone during his explorations in 1849–56. In the 1850s the earliest known horsemen, Griqua ivory hunters, passed through the region. The !Kung arrived in the area and made at least a few of the paintings, possibly some of those showing horsemen. The rock art was first sketched and brought to Western attention in 1907 by Siegfried Passarge, a German geologist.

The two, present-day local communities, Hambukushu and !Kung, arrived as recently as c 1860. Nevertheless, they both have creation myths associated with Tsodilo, and they both have strong traditional beliefs that involve respect for Tsodilo as a place of worship and ancestral spirits. The spirituality of the place has become best known to non-local people through the writings of Laurens van der Post, notably *The Lost World of the Kalahari* (1958). Today, local churches and traditional doctors travel to Tsodilo for prayers, meditation, and medication. Most visitors arrive for religious reasons.

Description

Tsodilo is situated in the north-western corner of Botswana near the Namibian border. Its massive quartzite rock formations rise from ancient sand dunes to the east and a dry fossil lake bed to the west. They are therefore called inselbergs, meaning a prominent isolated residual small mountain of circumdenudation rising from and surrounded by an extensive lowland erosion surface in a hot dry region. The surrounding dunes are covered with trees and open savannah vegetation. The setting and the multicoloured rock formations combined with the large number of rock paintings immediately bestow an iconographic quality to the place, and comparisons with Uluru in central Australia inevitably spring to mind. Three of the inselbergs form a cluster over a 3km x 10km rectangle; a fourth, and smallest,

lies 2.1km to the north-west. Their height, shape, and spatial relationships have given rise to a distinctive name for each: *Male*, *Female*, *Child*, and *Grandchild*. *Male*, at 400m above sea level, is the highest peak in Botswana. The rock ensemble is visible from the Okavango River, c 40km to the north-east.

Caves and shelters are one of the main resources of the rock outcrop from the human point of view. Where excavated, they characteristically show a long, though not necessarily continuous, sequence of occupation beginning in some cases as early as c 100,000 years ago (Middle Stone Age). They indicate repeated use thereafter, the artefact densities appearing to reflect visits, perhaps seasonal, by small mobile groups of people. At White Painting Shelter, Tsodilo, for example, excavation has exposed a 7m deep stratigraphy demonstrating such use over at least 100,000 years.

Divuyu and Nqoma are two excavated settlements of particular significance in the 1st millennium AD. Divuyu lies in a saddle at the top of *Female*; Nqoma is on a plateau below. A general pattern of public housing and living spaces in the centre of the saddle at the former, flanked by communal middens and perhaps burial areas, seemed to be the settlement plan. Much the same was suggested by Nquoma. If so, then these sites at Tsodilo do not share the spatial structure of other settlements in southern Africa, and suggest similarities with the spatial patterning of villages in the "matrilineal belt" of central Africa.

The rock art paintings are often large and imposing, and can be seen from a distance. Most of it has been executed in red ochre derived from hematite occurring in the local rock. Much of the red art is naturalistic in subject and schematic in style, described in the dossier as "sketches capturing the essential character of the creatures depicted." The rock art occurs throughout the rock outcrop. Many of the graphics have been executed in fairly small, isolated panels in contrast to the large friezes elsewhere in the region. In comparison with the naturalistic styles in Namibia, Zimbabwe, and South Africa, the Tsodilo paintings are more schematic, characterized by a variety of geometric symbols, distinctive treatment of the human figure, and exaggerated body proportions of many animals. Overall, in terms of style and content the art has more in common with paintings of similar antiquity in Zambia and Angola to north and north-east than neighbouring Namibia, Zimbabwe, and South Africa.

The wild animals depicted are characteristically "big game" such as giraffe and rhinoceros until the relatively late appearance of domestic cattle. Some depictions are in outline only, others are in silhouette, differences in style which seem to relate to particular animals (eg zebra in outline and elephant in silhouette). Human figures, or abstracts of them emphasizing, for example, sexual features, are frequent. There is nevertheless a high proportion of geometric designs, frequently lines and grids enclosed in circles or ovals and in rectangles. Such apparently symbolic graphics are rare in southern African Stone Age art.

A distinctive series of white paintings occurs at only twelve sites, in some instances superimposed on the reds but never the other way round. Animals in white are rarer and include more domestic species than the reds. Human figures are common, as are geometric designs.

The art in general is not well dated, though at least some of it could be two thousand and more years old. Pictures with

cattle are regarded as c 600-1200, following the introduction of cattle to Tsodilo after the 6th century AD. Geometric art is generally regarded as about a thousand years old. The latest paintings date to the 19th century on oral evidence. Some white paintings appear to be riders on horses, unknown at Tsodilo until the 1850s, which possibly provides a date for the last paintings. Certainly domestic animals indicate a relatively recent date for the white paintings.

Cup and canoe-shaped hollows in rock, a common phenomenon throughout the continent, are particularly numerous at Tsodilo. One group, interpreted as a trail of animal footprints, is spread over several hundred metres and is one of the largest rock pictures in the world. As poorly dated as the other art, these hollows may have been made in the Late Stone Age about two thousand years ago.

The extent and intensity of mining activity on the mountains to recover ochre, specularite, and green stone, used for decorative purposes, is impressive. The mines are clearly pre-colonial.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Monuments and Relics Act 1970 provides for better preservation of ancient monuments, ancient workings, relics, and other objects of aesthetic, archaeological, historical, or scientific value or interest. Tsodilo was declared a National Monument under an early version of this Act in 1927.

Tsodilo is a Conservation Area (but no information is given about the meaning of that phrase in Botswana or its legal standing).

It is also affected by conditions in the Anthropological Research Act 1967, National Parks Act 1967, and Tribal Act 1968.

Management

The site is owned by the Government, controlled by the Tswana Land Board, and managed by the Botswana National Museum. The area nominated for inclusion in the World Heritage List, including both the core and buffer zones (respectively 4800ha, to be fenced in, and 70,400ha), will be leased to the Botswana National Museum.

The Tsodilo Hills Management Plan: Scheme for Implementation (20 February 1994) was reviewed and amended in 1999. Essentially, it is a modern management plan based on generally accepted principles of conservation in a broad sense, while recognizing its particular context, for example within a national policy to develop rural areas in such a way that local people are able to improve the quality of their lives. One of its premises is that Tsodilo is primarily a heritage area and only secondly a settlement; another basic one is to protect traditional rights but encourage traditional methods of land use. Excess population will be encouraged to settle elsewhere, but any actual financial or other loss incurred by the community as a result of the Management Plan should be compensated. Further the Plan recognizes that people have the right to learn about, appreciate, and enjoy their heritage, provided that they do not damage it. On-site activities are, therefore, controlled, and restricted and monitoring is constantly leading to appropriate and timely action.

One of the strongest recommendations of an *Evaluation* (August 1995) of the Management Plan was that the site should be nominated for World Heritage Listing, to which end it recommended that Botswana sign the 1972 Convention. It identified reasons for this as "help in marketing the site to tourists, in raising additional capital and in negotiating international assistance." It noted that increasing tourism was already then (1995) leading to vandalism of some art and so it recommended "the systematic recording of all the rock art." Between 1994 and 1996 the archaeology of Tsodilo, including the rock art sites, was recorded by Botswana National Museum staff. The *Evaluation's* long list of recommendations was much concerned with acquiring and training appropriate personnel.

National Development Plans 1997/98 and 2002/03 emphasize the development of cultural resources to contribute towards the expansion of the tourism sector. It estimates that 30,000 tourists visit historical monuments throughout Botswana annually. In 1998, 3698 people visited Tsodilo, a low on-site number but nevertheless c 10% of the national total of such visitors.

The Department of Tourism will play an active role in defining the policies relating to the presentation and promotion of the property. The Department of Wildlife and National Parks also has responsibilities for the management of tourism.

The Management Plan recognizes the importance of securing the participation of the local communities (c 200 people), expressed in a Tsodilo Liaison Committee of tribal and Museum representatives. The purpose of this Committee is "to ensure harmonious co-operation," but a distinction is drawn between community participation and "formal management" by the National Museum. An elaborate consultative process preceded the nomination of Tsodilo for World Heritage status, a nomination which consequently comes forward with broad-based support over a wide area.

Botswana National Museum policy is to promote the heritage at Tsodilo for Botswana and tourists. A new museum complex is nearing completion. Campsites are provided. A signage system is in hand within a larger system for all National Monuments. Educational programmes will implement a continuing Tsodilo and World Heritage awareness programme among Botswana schools.

Financial resources for Tsodilo include US\$651,000 for the new museum, about US\$2000 a year for hiring casual labourers, and US\$16,000 a year, within the National Museum budget. Five full-time staff have been employed specifically on the Tsodilo project. Unspecified amounts of funding are mentioned for a range of tasks like fencing and "preservation of rock art."

In January 2001, a fairly long list of tasks identified in the Schedule of Implementation awaited completion.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Three basic long-term facts contribute to Tsodilo's outstanding state of preservation: its remoteness, its low population density, and the high degree of resistance to erosion of its quartzitic rock.

Recording of the rock art began in the early 20th century. The site became a National Monument in 1927. A landmark

in its conservation, in part led by consideration of the needs of the national economy and tourism at the site, was the preparation of a Management Plan in the early 1990s. This was followed by an expert evaluation which, while generally approving, provided in its recommendations the basis for at least a ten-year programme of improvement.

Authenticity and integrity

Tsodilo is a classic case where both integrity and authenticity must be taken into account. The whole ensemble, over and above its scientific interest, possesses an aesthetic dimension.

The diverse fauna and flora have remained largely intact because of the remoteness of the site. Many species attested in archaeological deposits of the 7th century AD were depicted in rock paintings, and most were probably still present until the early 20th century. Mongongo nuts continue to be a food staple; a particular beetle, *Diamphidia sebae*, continues to provide poison for the !Kung's hunting arrows; two African rock pythons, *Python sebae*, have been living at the waterhole halfway up *Female* for at least ten years and are regarded as messengers of the spiritual realm. The baobab tree, *Adansonia digitata*, continues to be used in different ways (food, water collection, textile raw material, medicine, manure, etc). The tree clearly therefore possesses considerable socio-economic and cultural significance, as was recognized at the First Global Strategy meeting in Harare (October 1995). It has been called "a symbol of the continent and the people of Africa" and was strongly recommended for World Heritage listing.

The archaeological record is large, generally well preserved, and still respected, for some of its content is still living rather than redundant. Excavations have been well conducted and backfilled, leaving deposits and strata intact as a resource for future investigation. Results from the site so far have been illuminating both of the local prehistory and of key significance at regional and continental levels. Overall, the condition and authenticity of the rock art in terms of materials, techniques, setting, and workmanship is impeccable. The art remains a key element in the spirituality of the site today.

Taken as a whole, the site embraces a diverse authenticity, dependent on an integrity nurtured over tens of thousands of years and providing a vivid illustration of natural/cultural interdependence.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 2001. ICOMOS also consulted a distinguished expert on the rock art of southern Africa.

Qualities

The physical attraction and availability of shelter that probably originally drew people to Tsodilo was and still is augmented by local animals, fruit-bearing trees and shrubs, edible plants, and tubers. The plants and the diversity of wild life offered food, water, protection, and sanctuary to the earliest visitors and caused them to settle or return during annual foraging expeditions, a process which has continued over at least 100,000 years. Although changes have occurred through time, particularly in the availability of water, Tsodilo's resources have in general been exploited within

sustainable strategies. Over and above the geological interest of the rock itself, the fact that it is granite is of considerable significance for the site. On the one hand its impermeability has meant that it collects water; on the other, it is resistant to erosion and has therefore preserved the art upon it very well.

Tsodilo is also important for its intellectual contribution to scientific studies of human adaptation and the revision of ideas on forager/farmer interaction. The Stone Age of Botswana is poorly understood, partly through inadequate study, partly because the nature of the landscape offers little incentive for repeated visits to the same locations. Tsodilo, because of its nature as a place where people stay and to which they return, has already contributed significantly to African prehistory, and it has a high potential in its stratification further to illuminate the sequence and character of human activity and environmental change.

The rock art is outstanding in quantity, quality, distinctiveness, scientific interest, and state of preservation. It represents in graphic form a long-lived traditional practice giving cultural expression to different and, until right at the end, anonymous cultures.

Comparative analysis

There are no other African sites like Tsodilo on the World Heritage List. The Brandberg inselberg in neighbouring Namibia is similar in some ways geologically, but the rock art and archaeological history are different. It compares favourably with the Uluru/Kata Tjuta cultural landscape of central Australia in terms of both its spectacular rock formations that, from a geological perspective, represent exceptional examples of tectonic and geomorphic processes; and as a basically natural feature which has become an icon in a cultural landscape.

The cultural heritage is manifest in many forms with similarities to others in Botswana, in southern Africa, in Africa, and in the world but whose combinations may only be peculiar to Tsodilo, an area which itself possesses a unique combination of features. For its size, it compares favourably with Kakadu National Park, Australia, in terms of the concentration of rock art: Tsodilo is of 10km² with c 4500 paintings in more than 400 sites, Kakadu is of 19,804 km² with 15,000 rock-art sites. At Matobo in Zimbabwe some 30,000 paintings are estimated to exist at c 3000 sites over c 2000km²; at the Drakensberg/uKhahlamba, South Africa, 600 sites with 35,000 individual images are spread over a vast area; an estimated 6000 sites occur in c 30,000km² in Lesotho. Quantitatively, the density of rock art at Tsodilo is among the highest in the world.

The art itself exhibits idiosyncratic characteristics rather than close parallels with other sites and areas. Certainly there is nothing to suggest that its origins and development were externally introduced or influenced. Its qualities are very much of this place and its peoples. The art is usually found, for example, on overhangs and ledges; it is not hidden as at Matobo and Drakensberg. Nor is it closely correlated with living sites such as Matobo. Stylistically, the paintings are distinct, being more schematic than the naturalistic paintings in most other parts of southern Africa. Both humans and animals are characteristically expressed by strokes and other minimalist devices; some, humans in particular, are not immediately recognizable. Overall, the style, though neither the colour nor the content, is closer to that of the Iron Age or agro-pastoralist art found elsewhere in southern Africa than shamanistic hunter-gatherer art. The Tsodilo artists preferred

big game, cattle, humans, and geometric or, to us, abstract, images. Similar large game emphases occur in the paintings of Namibia, South Africa, and Zimbabwe. Geometric shapes are rare in southern African Stone Age rock art, though comparisons have been drawn between the Tsodilo examples and similar designs in the arid interior of southern Africa, especially in Namibia. The nearest examples are c 400km west of Tsodilo. Paintings in eastern Zambia, 1000km away, also contain schematic animals and geometric designs. The nearest art is 250km away at Savuti; it is in a similar style to that at Tsodilo.

Tsodilo's flora and fauna provide the basis of much of the cultural development there. While this is not in itself of universal significance, the relationships within the environment including humankind are.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The site is nominated in an excellent dossier which is a credit to those concerned and the State Party. It is well qualified to be entered on the World Heritage List under criteria i, iii, and vi. The rock art alone, so persistently created over centuries, represents a masterpiece of human creative genius. Tsodilo vividly demonstrates an exceptional testimony to a specific place as the meeting place of humanity and an environment over 100,000 years. And the very place is directly and tangibly not just associated with, but is itself, a living tradition.

A claim is also made under criterion v. As expressed, however, it is largely academic, and the academic argument itself is not sound. The claim is not, in any case, necessary.

A letter of 15 September 2000, from the National Museum, Botswana, states that the site is not nominated as a cultural landscape. ICOMOS recommends, nevertheless, that it should be considered as such because it is well qualified in this category of cultural site. It qualifies primarily under category iii, "an associative cultural landscape" with "powerful religious, artistic, and cultural associations of the natural element." It is also an organically evolved landscape, falling into sub-category "continuing landscape." The *Operational Guidelines*' own definition in fact closely defines Tsodilo in asking for the retention of "an active social role in contemporary society closely associated with the traditional way of life and in which the evolutionary process is still in progress." The presence of Tsodilo among the emerging group of cultural landscapes on the World Heritage List would both grace that group and help clarify its nature.

There are currently less than 4000 visitors to the site per year. The carrying capacity is estimated to be in the tens of thousands per year (though no definition of "carrying capacity" is offered, even though it is well known that absolute numbers are not the only criterion for judging stress on a site). Clearly, with a site so robust in some natural qualities but so fragile in others, not least in its art and human/environment relationships, the development of the place as a tourist destination must be very clear-sighted and sensitively managed, with a sharp, scientifically well informed management focus on the essential qualities of the place. In that context, despite a new museum having only just been completed near the rocks, ICOMOS suggests that, given the close parallel with Uluru, the possibility of moving everything away from the rocks themselves should be borne in mind, perhaps, as at Uluru, when a second phase of tourism facilities is planned.

Noting that the excellent 1994 Management Plan is now nearly seven years old, ICOMOS also recommends that a new one be drawn up including an annual schedule of works to be implemented.

Brief description

A small area of quartz outcrop in the Kalahari Desert has provided shelter and other resources to people over 100,000 years. It now retains a remarkable record, in its archaeology, its rock art, and its continuing traditions, not only of this continual use but also of the development of human culture and of a symbiotic nature/human relationship over many thousands of years.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, iii, and vi*:

The significance of the place lies in its visual prominence, its geological and archaeological character as scientific resources, its use over ten of thousands of years as an area of settlement and nourishment, its outstanding rock art, and its long-term sanctity. All of those elements individually bear witness to different universal significances; collectively they combine to create a veritable "node of universal significance" on the surface of the earth. Furthermore, the symbiotic relationship between nature and culture, the very essence of Tsodilo, is, in itself, universally significant.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Val d'Orcia (Italy)

No 1026

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Val d'Orcia.
<i>Location</i>	Province of Siena, Tuscany
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	23 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The *Crete Senese* (Sienese chalk uplands) appear in many works of art and literature. The general character of the nominated area has been sanctioned and affirmed through many visual and written works. The area has also been an inspiration to many artists.

The area is traversed by the medieval *Via Francigena*, a pilgrim route to Rome and the Holy Land.

The Val d'Orcia represents an exceptional testimony to a traditional cultural phenomenon, that of "sharecropping,"* which has shaped the countryside in terms of land-use and architecture to produce a landscape demonstrating the beauty of the still-visible cohesion between man and nature.

Criteria iii, iv, and v

[**Note** This property is nominated as a cultural landscape, for which the State Party's prime justification is its geomorphology, stating that "it is necessary to protect, safeguard and conserve this very unique landscape."]

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* in terms of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, para. 39.

History and Description

History

No historical narrative is provided by the nomination. In summary, however, this landscape began to develop culturally in prehistoric times, was developed in the

* The term "share-cropping" is not explained in the nomination dossier but it usually describes a system of land-holding whereby a tenant supplies a share of the crop to the proprietor in lieu of labour services or payment of rent.

Etruscan and Roman periods either side of AD 1, and then witnessed, and perhaps in part stimulated, a flowering in the arts and architecture in two periods, the 11th–14th ("medieval") and 15th–16th ("Renaissance") centuries. This is marked in the character of towns and villages, in the style and form of numerous individual buildings, both ecclesiastical and secular, and in many paintings and sculptures. Underlying this cultural expression was a basic agrarian economy, including vineyards and olive-groves, moulding the geomorphologically unusual landscape towards its present appearance. A significant factor in this process throughout the 2nd millennium was the local system of land-tenure called "share-cropping," though its impact on the landscape is not explored in the dossier. The area is now fairly intensively exploited agriculturally and touristically.

Description

The Val d'Orcia in southern Tuscany is part of the *Crete Senese* which begin south of Sienna and continues to the Lazio region. The *Crete* consist of clayey soil formations caused by the ingress of the Pliocene sea. Although natural (and its evaluation therefore outside ICOMOS's brief) it is this fact which gives the landscape its basic characteristics and provides the stage on which humans have interacted with nature and cultural developments have occurred.

The Val d'Orcia consists of a valley opening to the north and with high ground on the other three sides. Monte Amiata is on its west. The River Orcia cuts laterally across the valley. Within Val d'Orcia are generally low and gently rolling hills and small undramatic valleys, with much of the central area in pasture. The main settlements are on the high points in this landscape, small towns and larger villages: Radicofani, Catiglio d'Orcia, Rocca d'Orcia, Ripa d'Orcia, Montalcino, and Monticchiello. Outside them, the landscape is studded with many villages, often fortified, and other types of civil and ecclesiastical site. Villages of particular interest include Corsignano and Vivo d'Orchia, and other built features of special interest include the complex of Spaletto, San Piero in Campo, Sant'Anna in Camprena, the Palazzo Massaini and the Abbey of Saint' Antimo near Montalcino.

Of the towns themselves, PIENZA, named after its founder Pope Pius II, is a planned town of the mid-15th century built around a monumental main piazza flanked by the Cathedral, Palazzo Piccolomini, Palazzo Vescovile, and Palazzo Comunale. It is already a World Heritage Site in its own right

CASTIGLION D'ORCIA is an old rustic castle on a hilltop, surrounded by four other impressive castles and the villages of Rimbecca and Vivo d'Orcia. The *Via Francigena*, a medieval pilgrimage road, passes by the Ospedale delle Bricole with the small church of San Pellegrino, the Ospedale de Arcimbaldo, and stopping points at Scala, Poderina, and Rocorsi. Numerous churches and farm buildings linked to the granary of Spedalotto include fortified estate farms controlled by the Ospedale di Santa Maria della Scala in Siena. Of those, the Geta Palace, Rimbecca, Tricerchi Palace and Vignalonga farm are listed as particularly interesting. In all eleven building complexes and structures are listed (under the provisions of Law No 1089/1939).

MONTALCINO, a small town of late medieval architecture, is situated in a high dominant position on a hill between the valleys of the Ombrone and Asso rivers. Inhabited since Etrusco-Roman times, it has played a significant part in military affairs since the 13th century, principally as a fortified frontier post of the Siene Republic. It finally surrendered to the Medici in 1559. The earlier 16th century Fortezza survives intact and, with it and the historic centre counting as one, 30 other complexes and structures are listed.

RADICOFANI is an agricultural centre documented as an ecclesiastical holding since AD 1000 and crowned by the ruins of a mid-12th century, papal fortress. Like Montalcino, after a turbulent 16th century, it fell to the Medici in 1559. It is a distinctly medieval village of narrow street, *culs-de-sac*, and external stairs. Twelve complexes and buildings are listed, including the town walls.

SAN QUIRICO D'ORCIA sits on a ridge between the Rivers Orcia and Asso; the *Via Francigena* traverses the entire town, with Romanesque structures of the late 12th century at either end. It came under the domination of Siena in the 13th century, but its major monuments are from the 17th century – a stronghold and the Palazzo Chigi of 1680. It, too, retains its walls which, with 12 other complexes and buildings are listed.

No comparable description of the countryside is provided in the nomination.

There are 14,300 inhabitants in the Park area; 1,200 live in the buffer zone.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Ownership rests with local government entities (the Province and five communes), and public, ecclesiastical, and private entities.

Law No 1089/1939 (Conservation of items of historic or artistic interest) involves the listing for protection of various structural complexes and individual buildings of historic interest. In addition, ten areas in the Park are protected under Law No 1497/1939 on landscape conservation, including some town centres and surrounding areas and some areas around individual sites (eg Spedaletto). The Park was created by Provincial Law No 161/99, and includes a Protected Natural Area of Local Interest in 1995.

Management

The *Conferenze di Area della Val d'Orcia* (CdA) is the governing body of the Park, made up of the mayors of the five communes and the president of the Provincial administration of Siena. *Val d'Orcia srl* is the management executive. Its programme as approved by the CdA embraces the management of tourism, cultural activities, and agriculture. The current management plan is for 1999–2004. It constitutes the instrument which the administrations involved have developed to safeguard and protect the development of the Val

d'Orcia. Economic and social activities compatible with the protection of natural resources come under a Multi-year Plan for Economic and Social Development. All five town councils and the province contribute routine funding, which supports fifteen staff in the Park office.

The nominated area follows the administrative boundaries of the Artistic, Natural, and Cultural Park of Val d'Orcia, created in 1999. The Region of Tuscany is one of the foremost in Italy in assessing new and comprehensive territorial planning and monitoring. It works closely with the State authorities in heritage development issues. The nominated area as a whole is not under a single specific statute, so successful use of the complex legal framework requires co-operation and adequate resources in the relevant administrations. The management guidelines of the recently formed Park, for example, require all five of the municipalities within it to prepare regulations covering the use of traditional materials in both urban and rural area. This is a detail within the Park's Management Plan 1999–2004 which, at another level, covers such strategic matters as environmental matters, urban planning, agriculture, rural roads and tourism.

The area of the Park receives now *c* 4.5 million visitors each year, after huge increases in numbers and infrastructure during the 1990s. Management is trying to develop and control its own brand of "agritourism," encouraging visitors to stay on farms and in the villages rather than congregate at major visitor attractions, and spreading the tourist influx throughout the year and to lesser known sites. It is appreciated by the authorities that the landscape is the region's main attraction and that it is therefore economically important both to control modern intrusions and to maintain viable livelihoods on the land. The mission encountered a keen awareness among all, not least the farmers, of the qualities and character of the area and a will to pursue policies of sustainable and careful development. It was stressed that both the Park and the World Heritage nomination were local initiatives.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

No history of conservation is provided in the nomination, and it is difficult to discern any patterns in single items of information on the point.

The nomination makes two important comments on the state of conservation:

- i. "The increase of agricultural mechanization has allowed and continues to allow the drastic levelling of areas of pronounced relief," a point emphasized by some of the wonderful photographs which show in effect degraded landscapes appearing to have lost much of their historical interest and visual attractiveness.
- ii. "The notable architectural heritage ... is continually at risk for serious deterioration and/or complete loss due to the particular geomorphological composition of the soils ... that does not offer a good load-bearing condition for structures."

Authenticity and integrity

The nomination does not address these issues directly, merely asserting that the area consists of an environmental, historical, and cultural territory of rare beauty where the works of man and nature co-exist harmoniously, in a relationship in which they together compose an artistically whole, well conserved landscape of universal cultural value.

An outstanding example of the sort of relational evidence which the nomination needs to bring forward lies in the fortified farm of Spedaletto which administered the system of share-cropping. Spedaletto retains its visually dominant position in the landscape; it also represents the investment of the Sienese nobility in land through the powerful role of the Ospeda di Santa Maria della Scala di Siena.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the area in February 2001

Qualities

A quality of beauty has been retained in a landscape subject to considerable agricultural intensification and tourism pressure. This depends very much on the "flowing" character of much of the terrain given by the cretaceous nature of the geology and geomorphology. The network of small towns and villages, and many other structures and monuments, collectively represent a significant cultural achievement among which is a number of individually outstanding creations.

Comparative analysis

The nomination contains no comparative study about the significance of the proposed cultural landscape. It remarks that, geomorphologically, the Pliocene claylands of Val d'Orcia area can be compared "with any number of formations," such as the American "badlands." The landscape of the *Crete Senesi* itself is in fact well documented and has been subject to substantial international research and publication.

The subtitle of the nomination clearly calls for a comparative analysis in which the relationship of the cultural landscape of Val d'Orcia should be placed in the World Heritage context of Siena and Pienza and related to other Italian landscapes of the Renaissance.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

With this nomination, it has now become a matter of urgency that, for the purpose of progressing and evaluating "cultural landscapes," some form of comparative assessment of "ordinary" agricultural landscapes (as distinct from specialist ones like vineyards) be carried out. This study should provide some pointers as to whether development of the WH List of such landscapes is to be along "scientific" lines (as with the Val d'Orcia, where the landscape is on a particular geomorphological subsoil; the very rare lowland heath on Tertiary subsoil is another example), on "functional" lines (as already the case with vineyards, rice-growing, and pasture), or on a

geographical/topographical basis eg reclaimed wetlands, as at Schokland, and montane pasture, as at Mont Perdu).

With regard to the "Justification" and criteria for inscription (*see above*), ICOMOS notes the following:

i. So far no convincing evidence has been found that share-cropping is either particular to this area or has produced in its operation a distinctive landscape here

ii. The Renaissance is splendidly represented in the towns and individual buildings, but no case is developed to relate the landscape itself to the same phenomenon or to the towns. There may nonetheless be an interesting case to be made for the Val d'Orcia as a Renaissance landscape.

iii. If the use of Criterion v rests on share-cropping, the connection has to be made between tenure and the landscape. Nowhere does the nomination make any connection between not explain share-cropping, but nowhere does it such a form of landholding or the historic development of the landscape as exemplified, for example, by field shapes, patterns of field systems, or the location and distribution of particular types of farm.

Brief description

The Val d'Orcia contains a much used and attractive agricultural landscape and numerous historic villages and small towns with a wealth of Renaissance and later architecture. Much of its history up to the mid-16th century was bound up with its frontier role in relation to Siena. Overall, though exhibiting considerable variety, it is typical of the Tuscan landscape initially made famous by Renaissance writers and painters. Now, where once pilgrims passed through, it is a favourite tourist destination.

Recommendation

That the nomination be *deferred*, with a request to the State Party to reformulate it. The revised nomination should focus on exactly what is in mind as a cultural landscape in this case, with reasons for the criteria chosen. It should be based on and include evidence of research in landscape history, and it should include a comparative analysis of its significance in relation to similar landscapes, certainly in Italy but ideally further afield, which illustrate significant stages in human history.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Middle Adda (Italy)

No 730bis

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Middle Adda Valley [extension to Crespi d'Adda, inscribed 1995]
<i>Location</i>	Provinces of Lecco, Milan, and Bergamo, Region of Lombardy
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

This study makes it possible to confirm without any hesitation that the sites being considered possess in every respect the characteristics of outstanding universal value, discernible in the attitudes adopted unanimously by all experts. The middle Adda valley is an outstanding site, although it might be fairer to describe it as a group of incomparable natural, technological, artistic, and social sites. The loss of this system would deprive the entire world of a group of powerful symbols that are exemplary because of their unique and meaningful character. History, art, nature, and technology here live alongside one another in the short space of some dozen kilometres.

The adjoining areas which enrich this system – the Brivio marshes (Isola della Torre, Isolone del Serraglio), the Paderno ravine, the great sweep of Trezzo sull'Adda, the arch of Cassano – do not detract from the system. Quite the opposite: they enrich it by furnishing additional depths and treasures.

It is possible to leave the isolated river system and to reach adjoining areas to follow a specific thematic itinerary - historic towns, historic industrial installations, religious architecture, or rural farming architecture, as well as natural areas, natural areas, or human landscapes, historic trackways, and so on in a crescendo of legitimate, plausible, defensible implications and derivations.

Note The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph

39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

Water management underlies the history and development of this region - for transport, for irrigation, for drainage. This began during the Roman period, as early as the 2nd century AD, when the first efforts were made to make the minor rivers crossing the often difficult terrain navigable so as to facilitate trade between the Western and Eastern Empires.

In the medieval period there was intense political and commercial rivalry between the city states of Lombardy. Towards the end of the 12th century Milan began the construction of the first of numerous canals, the Naviglio Grande, on which a busy trade in all kinds of goods developed. An important component of this system of waterways was the Martesana Canal, built between 1457 and 1463 to the plans of the engineer Bertoli de Novate in the Adda valley. By the end of the 15th century 90km of canals made trade possible from the Adriatic to Milan.

However, some physical obstacles remained to be circumvented. Notable among these were the Paderno rapids, between Paderno d'Adda and Trezzo d'Adda, where the Martesana Canal began. In the early 16th century Francis I of France financed a commission to carry out a study for a new navigable canal, which recommended the opening-up of the water routes between Lake Como and Milan. In 1518 the Milanese Senate approved a project for improving navigation in the middle Adda between Brivio and Trezzo by constructing a canal to bypass the most difficult parts of this stretch of the river.

Work began on the Paderno Canal immediately under the control of the architect and painter Giuseppe Meda. It was abandoned in 1599 on the death of Meda, and did not start up again until 1773, when Lombardy was under Austrian rule. The Canal was formally opened in 1777, but a technical problem delayed its coming into full operation for a further two years.

The coming of the railways (the first was built in Lombardy in 1840) saw a decline in the use of canals, as was the case everywhere in Europe. There was a rally at the end of the century, when the canals of Lombardy were used to bring coal into Italy for electric power generation. However, the potential for producing electricity of water was recognized around this time. In 1898 the Italian Edison Company began using the Paderno Canal for its Bertini hydroelectric power station, followed between 1901 and 1920 by others (Taccani, Esterle, and Semenza). The electric power produced in the Adda valley played a very important role in the economic expansion of Italy in the years leading up to the outbreak of World War I.

The 20th century saw a steady decline in the use of the canals for navigation. Maintenance became so expensive that in 1953 the Martesana Canal had been removed from the navigable system. They supplied water for irrigation and to drive some industrial plants such as mills and presses. This had been a factor in the installation of the Crespi textile mill and workers' village in the valley in 1878.

Description

The area proposed for inscription follows the course of the river Adda from the Olginate dam (and just slightly further north, into Lake Garlate, to include the Silk Museum there) down to Cassano d'Adda, where the Muzza irrigation canal joins the river. It covers 1874.2ha and is surrounded by a buffer zone (the Northern Adda Park) of 7115ha.

From Lake Olginate (77ha) the Adda follows a winding course through a marshy area that constitutes the Isola della Torre (Tower Island) and the Isolone del Serraglio (Menagerie Island). This area is uncontaminated and supports a rich biota.

On the left bank lies the Sonna valley with a now abandoned system of water mills. A plan is currently being studied for a footpath between Volpino, on the slopes of Mount Canto, and Crespi d'Adda.

The main town on this stretch of the river is Brivio, at a point where a major Roman road from Milan to Bergamo and Aquileia crossed the Adda (hence its name, which derives from the Celtic word for "bridge"). It became an important trading centre and also a border strongpoint.

The water management system hinges on the Paderno ravine, between Robbiate and Cornate. This is an exceptional natural environment of steep eroded rocks; it comes as no surprise to learn that it was selected by Leonardo da Vinci as the background for one of his most famous paintings, *The Virgin of the Rocks*. The Canal itself is an outstanding example of a stepped canal. It is a monument to the hydrological genius of Leonardo combined with the expertise of the architect Giuseppe Meda and the mathematician Paolo Frisi. Safe navigation at the Paderno rapids is ensured by a system of basins on the da Vinci principle. There is also a series of hydroelectric power stations along the canal.

The river then follows a less violent course around the large meander at Trezzo sull'Adda, where the dam for the Tacconi power station has created a dramatic landscape, dominated by the power station and by the 14th century Visconti castle.

Below Trezzo the river is joined by the Brembo, to form the Capriate San Gervasio peninsula, where the World Heritage site of Crespi d'Adda is located. Further downstream is the picturesque landscape of Vaprio d'Adda, with its villas, small towns, and proto-industrial works.

The Little Martesana Canal runs alongside this stretch of the river, from the hamlet of Concesa just south of Trezzo to La Volta (Cassano d'Adda), where it makes an abrupt right-angled turn to the west, on its way to Milan. On the opposite (eastern) bank, between Vaprio and Cassano, is the industrial settlement of Fara Gera d'Adda, built alongside a short industrial canal.

Cassano is the last town in the nominated area, which is notable for a complex system of irrigation canals. The oldest of these, the Muzza Canal, was constructed in 1220; its confluence with the Adda marks the southernmost boundary of the nominated area.

There is a number of protected historic buildings along the Adda and within the nominated area or the buffer zone. These include castles, churches, abbeys, domestic buildings, farms, and industrial sites.

Management and Protection

Legal status

More than forty buildings and monuments along the course of the Adda in the nominated area are protected as historic monuments under the provisions of the basic Italian monuments protection law, No 1089 of 1 June 1939. Nineteen landscapes are similarly protected under the complementary nature-protection law, No 1497 of 29 June 1939. Under both statutes any changes to the appearance or ownership of the designated properties may only be carried out with the permission of the relevant national authority.

At regional level, the statutory Territorial Coordination and Control Plan for the North Adda Park, adopted by the Regional Council for Lombardy on 8 January 1993, imposes strict constraints on activities that may adversely impact settlements, buildings, and landscapes within the Park.

Management

Ownership of individual properties within the nominated area is diverse, including national agencies, regional and local authorities, the Roman Catholic Church, private business and industry, and private landowners.

Overall management is the responsibility of the regional autonomous agency, the North Adda Park authority (Parco Adda Nord), which was set up (as the North Adda Natural Park) in 1983. The broad lines of its management policies are defined in a series of land-use planning regulations with statutory force at different administrative levels. These include the Regional Plan for Protected Areas (30 November 1983) and the Territorial Plan of January 1983 (see above).

As part of its basic structure the Park has an overall strategy for environmental protection and cultural promotion. The document supplied with the nomination lists several international projects with which the Park is collaborating, including a joint project with national parks in Catalonia and France on energy conservation in nature reserves and the European "Historic canals" project. Several internal research projects are also in progress, studying *inter alia* aspects of the ecosystem of the Brivio marshes and the rehabilitation of traditional trackways.

There is a number of programmed ongoing activities within this strategy. They include a policy of acquisition of properties of high natural value, the rehabilitation of degraded areas and environmental restoration, and water quality control. The Park has a policy of working closely with agricultural and forestry enterprises to develop a sense of stewardship. It also has a programme aimed at the development of a new approach and way of thinking, with the traditional industrial base being superseded by the use of the area's cultural and natural resources for tourism.

Whilst the document referred to is not a management plan *sensu stricto*, it is in keeping with the Italian concept of a national park. It is not prescriptive, since the necessary sanctions against transgression are provided under the national and regional legislation. Instead, it concentrates on the study and recording of the cultural values, on education, and on economic and social rehabilitation and development.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation of the area covered by the nomination has only become a living issue since the creation of the Park in 1983. Even at that time, the emphasis was largely on the natural values. The protected buildings were subject to monitoring by the relevant agencies at national and regional level, and the planning legislation, including the plans at the lowest administrative level (*Piani Regolatori Generali*) ensured some measure of control over urban and sub-urban development. The coordination resulting from the creation of the Park and its strategic programme represents a more systematic approach to the conservation of a somewhat complex and diversified landscape.

Authenticity and integrity

Because of its heterogeneous nature it is difficult to apply the test of authenticity to this landscape, much of which has been subject to change as technology has developed over the past centuries. It is probably more valid to look at its integrity, as is the case with most cultural landscapes.

The unifying feature of the landscape is, of course, the river Adda and its waters. The landscape that is visible today provides excellent testimony to its political and technical significance and the way in this has changed since the 13th century. The commercial importance of the waterborne trade route across northern Italy is well illustrated by the hydrological works inspired by Leonardo da Vinci. The importance of water to industry and hence to economic development, first providing direct mechanical power by means of water-wheels and then indirectly by harnessing the river to generate electricity, is equally well demonstrated. Its role in the improvement of agricultural yields through irrigation is also demonstrated.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the property in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted TICCIH on the cultural importance of this property.

Qualities

The central stretch of the river Adda provides an interesting insight into human exploitation of water, first for commercial traffic and later for the direct benefit of industry by providing mechanical power by means of water-wheels and then generating electricity in hydroelectric power stations.

Comparative analysis

The very diverse qualities of the middle Adda valley make it difficult to find precise *comparanda*. The canal design and construction are of value in that they utilize the designs of Leonardo da Vinci. However, as navigations (simple canals running alongside rivers) they are not outstanding: there are better examples in Europe – and, indeed, elsewhere in Italy (eg the Naviglio Grande).

Similarly, the concentration of industry along a river is interesting, but hardly unique. The Adda complex does not stand comparison in terms of historical significance with the Derwent Valley in England (nominated for the World Heritage List in 2001), which is notable for the pioneer work

of Richard Arkwright and the birthplace of the modern factory. In any case, the most significant industrial site in the valley, Crespi d'Adda, is already on the World Heritage List.

When the overall valley is considered as a cultural landscape, it is once again possible to point to numerous other river valleys that show similar characteristics and have similar historical trajectories.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this extension should not be approved.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Villa d'Este (Italy)

No 1025

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Villa d'Este
<i>Location</i>	Region of Latium, Province of Rome, Commune of Tivoli
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	23 June 2000

Justification by State Party

[**Note** The text below is the summary of a longer version in the nomination dossier.]

The Villa d'Este is the masterpiece of Pirro Ligorio, architect, painter, and "antiquary," whom recent studies have established among the great Renaissance artists; moreover, in the 17th century, Gianlorenzo Bernini contributed many additions to it. **Criterion i**

Among its contemporaries, the Villa d'Este soon became famous, thanks to its innovative plan, magnificence, rich decorations, and the extraordinary variety of its *jeux d'eau*. The influence of the Villa d'Este was decisive for the development of the art of European gardens, and it remained an unrivalled model until the French garden of Versailles and Vaux-le-Vicomte came into fashion.

With the revival of formal gardens in the first decades of the 20th century, the Villa d'Este became once more a source of inspiration for architects and landscape designers, particularly British and Americans who had studied in Roman academies. Back in their own countries they put the principles they had learnt into practice. **Criterion ii**

The Villa d'Este is one of the most refined and complete examples of Italian Renaissance civilization. Besides bearing witness to the learning and refinement of its creator, today the Villa d'Este still represents an exceptional synthesis of the values of an epoch, combining elements ranging from architectural styles to the humanities, from science to antiquarian passion, from hydraulics to complex iconology. **Criterion iii**

The Villa d'Este owes its enduring fame to its fountains and countless *jeux d'eau*, by means of which its 16th and 17th century builders experimented with all kinds of water forms and sounds. However, the Villa d'Este is most of all an unrivalled example of an 16th century Italian garden, representing, with its architectural works (palace, fountains, loggias, nymphaea, and grottoes) and precious decorations (such as the pictorial cycles painted

by famous artists from the Roman Mannerist school, such as Federico Zuccari and Girolamo Muziano), one of the most fascinating accomplishments of Italian Renaissance architecture. **Criterion iv**

Based on 16th century theory on gardens by B Taegio (1559), according to which "by combining art with nature a third nature is produced," at the Villa d'Este the original landscape was remodelled by means of colossal works, a sort of Demiurge-like feat much admired at the time. Hence a new landscape, a third nature, was produced, featuring Tivoli's *genius loci*, with its mountains, woods, and small and large waterfalls. The Villa d'Este also commands a breathtaking view of the Roman countryside, despite rampant post-war urbanization. **Criterion v**

For centuries the Villa d'Este was a must in travellers' and artists' Grand Tours in Italy. It inspired, either directly or indirectly, painters, composers, and literary men from all countries. Among Italian monuments, the Villa d'Este is one of the most often portrayed, to the point that almost every European museum has a painting, a watercolour, an engraving, a drawing portraying it. Today, five hundred years since it was built, the Villa d'Este's beauty has not waned: every year hundreds of thousands of tourists, scholars, and artists come to it, making it one of Italy's five most visited monuments. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is an *ensemble*. It is also a cultural landscape, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

On 9 September 1550, Cardinal Ippolito II d'Este (1509–72) arrived in Tivoli, having obtained the post of governor of the town. The Cardinal came from the cultured background of the Court of Ferrara and had immersed himself in humanist studies. He was therefore an erudite and cultivated art patron who was surrounded by famous artists, painters (Girolamo da Carpi, Girolamo Muziano, Federico Zuccari, Livio Agresti, etc), silversmiths and goldsmiths (Benvenuto Cellini), musicians (Palestrina), and poets (Tasso, Ariosto).

The official residence assigned to him in Tivoli, part of the monastery of the church of Santa Maria Maggiore, did not suit him. He therefore decided to build a splendid villa with gardens, the design of which is traditionally attributed to Pirro Ligorio (1500–83), an antiquary and archaeologist who carried out archaeological excavations at the Villa Adriana nearby.

The church and monastery stood at the top of a hill, with slopes covered in gardens, vineyards, and a few houses and churches. The cardinal, who was removed from the circles of power in Tivoli and Rome for a while because of simony (1555–59), needed a little over ten years to buy the land and demolish the buildings.

Between 1563 and 1565 the land was remodelled to create a steep slope descending to the old monastery and another gentler slope facing the north-east. A terrace was laid out in the south-west, supported by the old wall of the town.

Starting in 1560 great efforts were made to supply the water needed for the numerous fountains that were intended to embellish the garden. First, an aqueduct was built to capture the waters from Monte Sant'Angelo, but this source of water turned out to be inadequate and so an underground canal was dug beneath the town to harness the waters of the Anio river (1564–65).

Once the water supply had been ensured and its flow made possible by the natural gravity created by the different levels of the garden, work started on constructing the fountains, ornamental basins, and grottoes and on laying out the landscape.

During this period the old monastery was converted into a villa, and the original cloister was modified to become the central courtyard, its south-east wall being that of the old church of Santa Maria Maggiore. The pace of the decoration work for the palace speeded up between 1565 and 1572, the year in which Cardinal Ippolito II d'Este died. Much of the work remained unfinished and many of the fountains for the garden still have to be built

Cardinal Luigi d'Este (1538–86) inherited the property of his uncle but his financial resources only allowed him to complete the work already started and to carry out a few repairs. After the Villa d'Este was placed at the disposal of the Dean of the Holy College of Cardinals, it returned to another cardinal of the house of Este in 1605, Alessandro (1568–1624). He wasted no time in starting a huge programme of work, which was not limited to repairing the damages caused by a lack of maintenance on the part of the Deanery, but also included many innovations to the layout of the garden and the decoration of the fountains

The maintenance, restoration, and layout works (the rotunda of the Cypresses around 1640) continued under the Dukes of Modena, who were related to the House of Este, until 1641. Cardinal Rinaldo I (1618–72) turned to Bernini (the Fountain of the Bicchierone) in 1660–61 and, starting in 1670, the architect Mattia de Rossi carried out more work, including changes to the palace.

The period when the Villa d'Este was abandoned started with Rinaldo II (1655–1736). The situation worsened when the complex passed into the hands of the Hapsburgs in 1803. However, thanks to the work undertaken by Cardinal Gustav von Hohenlohe (1823–96), the villa was saved from what might have been an irreversible loss. In 1920 the Villa d'Este became the property of the Italian State, which initiated a restoration campaign from 1920 to 1930, and another following damage caused by bombing in 1944.

Description

The Villa d'Este is situated in the historical centre of Tivoli, in the midst of hills bordered by the turbulent waters of the river Anio. The ensemble composed of the palace and gardens forms an uneven quadrilateral and covers an area of about 4.5ha.

Pirro Ligorio, Cardinal Ippolito II, and his secretary, the humanist Marc-Antoine Muret, designed the Villa d'Este

according to a very elaborate iconography that celebrated the residence and Cardinal Ippolito II d'Este by magnifying his virtues and lineage. A statue of Hercules in the middle of the garden above the Fountain of the Dragons identifies the Tivoli garden with the mythological one of the Hesperides. According to 16th century historians, Hercules was the legendary ancestor of the Este family but he was also one of the old protective divinities of Tivoli. Both the decorative elements of the garden (fountains, basins, etc) as well as the painted decoration of the palace and the antique statues adorning the garden and palace, illustrate these allegories and symbols, which complement each other to form a cohesive whole.

The plan of the villa is irregular because the architect was obliged to use certain parts of the previous monastic building. The present entrance at Piazza Trento (originally the secondary one because the main entrance used to be at the bottom of the garden) leads to the central courtyard, the reconverted former cloister (1566–67) embellished with the Fountain of Venus. On the garden side the architecture of the palace is very simple: a long main body of three storeys, marked by bands, rows of windows, and side pavilions that barely jut out. This uniform facade is interrupted by an elegant loggia in the middle, with two levels and stair ramps, built by Raffaello da Firenze and Biasioto (1566–67). The lower level is decorated with the Fountain of Leda.

The main rooms of the villa are arranged in rows on two floors and open on to the garden. The private apartment of the Cardinal, consisting of four rooms, is on the same level as the courtyard, and the reception rooms, linked together at the back by a long corridor called the *Manica lunga*, are on the lower level.

The precious furniture and antique statues from the Cardinal's collection were dispersed but the rooms still have much of their magnificent painted decoration, the work of several studios of painters and stucco artists, under the supervision of Federico Zuccari, Girolamo Muziano, Livio Agresti, and Cesare Nebbia. The paintings, framed by wide stucco cornices, in the Cardinal's apartment (drawing room, antechamber, bedroom, and chapel) were painted by Livio Agresti around 1568 and are based on the central theme of the victory of virtue over vice. The drawing room has four idealized landscapes of the region of Tivoli, depicting the ruins of the temple of Sibylla and Hercules. The decoration of the small chapel, the work of artists close to Federico Zuccari, consists of large figures of prophets and sibyls in alcoves, surmounted by monochrome panels depicting the life of the Virgin and the Coronation on the ceiling. The painted decoration of the reception rooms on the ground floor is unusual, with imitations of various materials (marble, fabrics, etc), optical illusions to make the rooms seem bigger, false windows and doors, prospects and landscapes, and scenes from classical mythology (the Hercules Salon and the Tibur Salon) or the Bible (the Moses Salon and the Noah Salon).

The Villa d'Este garden stretches over two steep slopes, descending from the palace down to a flat terrace in the manner of an amphitheatre. The loggia of the palace marks the longitudinal and central axis of the garden. Five main transversal axes (paths and promenades) – an unusual feature in gardens of this period – become the central axis from the fixed point of view created by the

villa, since each of these axes terminates in one of the main garden fountains. Even though the central aisle stops beyond the axis of the Hundred Fountains to give way to a network of diagonal paths that make it easier to climb back to the palace, the latter remains the main visual axis

This arrangement of axes and modules was adopted to disguise the irregular outline of the garden, rectify by means of an optical illusion the relationship between the transversal and longitudinal dimensions, and give the palace a central position, even though it is in fact out of line in relation to the whole

At the same time, the garden does not give priority, as in the case of contemporary villas, to a longitudinal distribution of water down the steepest slope, but offers more complex walks along transversal axes that in fact follow the direction of the Anio.

These waters supply some fifty fountains, ornamental basins, nymphaea, and grottoes, only a few of which are described below.

The first main transversal axis, bordering the flat part of the garden, the *Peschiere* (Fishponds), is composed of a row of three basins. At the extreme east of this water chain is the *Fontana dell' Organo* (Fountain of the Organ), begun in 1547 by the French fountain-maker Luc Leclerc. It is rectangular in shape with two orders crowned by a double-scrolled pediment. A deep recess is cut out in the centre, with a statue of Diana of Ephesus at the end, containing an octagonal kiosk. The facings of the building are decorated with bands, made of different materials, of reliefs of busts of telamons, caryatids, and pastoral scenes. The two lower alcoves hold statues of Apollo and Orpheus. The water organ is the work of Claude Venard, inspired by examples from antiquity (Hero of Alexandria in his treatise *Pneumatica* and Vitruvius in *De Architectura* describe this technique, while Banu Musa and Al Jazari in the Arab world had worked on hydraulic sound mechanisms). It gives its name to the Fountain that stands behind the statue of Diana of Ephesus. The interaction between water and air produced music, probably madrigals for four or five voices. This music was preceded by the sound of two trumpets, followed by the release of water jets that were so violent that they were compared to the Deluge.

This taste for sophisticated hydraulic mechanisms and automata can also be also found in the Fountain of the Owl, where the songs of some twenty bronze birds produced by the pressure of water are stopped by the appearance of the owl.

Beyond the *Peschiere*, two staircases start climbing towards the villa. The side stairs, the *Scalinata dei Bollori* (Bubbling Stairs) of 1567, are flanked by two stepped parapets crowned by basins pouring out torrents of water.

Beyond the transversal path of the Dragons, the central stairway is divided into oval flights around the *Fontana dei Draghi* (Fountain of the Dragons), erected in honour of the visit by Pope Gregory XIII in 1572. This nymphaeum and its exedra, placed on the longitudinal axis of the garden, is the real centre of the ensemble. Four winged dragons emerge from the middle of the big oval basin, spurting out strong jets of water. The parapet with

the flights of stairs is ornamented with vases from which water also flows.

The Alley of the Hundred Fountains is formed of three long rectilinear superposed basins, its streams of water crossing the entire garden. The edge of the upper watercourse is adorned with obelisks, small boats, and eagles bearing the Este coat-of-arms, and the *fleur-de-lys* of France spurting out water in the shape of a fan. The low reliefs illustrating scenes from Ovid's *Metamorphoses* had almost totally disappeared by the end of the last century.

Several fountains have been arranged on each side of the Alley of the Hundred Fountains, including the *Fontana dell' Ovato* to the east, one of the main fountains in the garden laid out by Pirro Ligorio. It has a large oval basin with a rim decorated in majolica. At the back it is delimited by an exedra pierced with arcades and alcoves holding ten statues pouring water into the basin. However, the most striking effect is produced by the big cascade flowing out of a *crater* perched in the middle of the exedra. Jets of water were activated whenever unsuspecting people walked under the arcades. Behind the exedra rises an artificial mountain, with three alcoves holding statues of the Sibylla of Tibur with her son Melicerte (1568) and the river divinities Erculaneo and Anio.

To the west is its counterpart, the Fountain of Rome (the *Rometta*) built in 1567–70 by the fountain-maker Curzio Maccarone to symbolize ancient Rome bathed by the Tiber after it merges with the waters of the Anio. The water theatre is situated on a big terrace supported by a vaulted structure with arcades as much as 10m high. This cascade represents the famous waterfall of the Anio river in Tivoli, with a statue of the river god Anio bearing the temple of Sibylla. Under the cascade is a statue representing the Apennines supporting the hill from which the Anio flows. Below, the waters of the Anio join those of the Tiber to form a small pool in the centre of which floats a boat with a mast in the shape of an obelisk, illustrating the Tiber Island (*Isola Tiberina*) in Rome. Small-scale models of famous Roman buildings used to decorate the large upper terrace, like a stage setting. Most of them were lost when the supporting wall collapsed in the 19th century.

The *Fontana del Bicchierone* (Fountain of the Great Glass), built according to a design by Bernini (1660–61) was added to the decoration of the central longitudinal axis in the 17th century. This fountain is in the shape of a serrated chalice, from which a high jet of water falls into a conch shell. It was also during this period that the large pergola at the original entrance to the villa was replaced by the Rotunda of the Cypresses (around 1640), a circular area adorned with four small fountains and surrounded by ancient cypress trees.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Villa d'Este has been the property of the Italian government since 1920 and falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Cultural Property and Activities. As a listed monument it has been protected by national legislation on the Protection of Artistic and Historic Property (No 1089 of 1 June 1939) since 1988 and by

several decrees implemented by the *Soprintendenza per i Beni Ambientali e Architettonici del Lazio*, the regional branch of the Ministry. According to these decrees, the external volumes, colours, and architectural lines of cultural property cannot be changed without the prior permission of the Ministry of Cultural Property and Activities. The Villa d'Este also benefits from regulations protecting landscapes prescribed in the law of the Ministry of Education (No 1497 of 29 June 1939, decrees of 29 September 1956 and of 11 May 1955). This landscape protection covers the entire buffer zone around the nominated property proposed. Protection of landscapes is also ensured through the application of the Territorial Plan for the Landscape of Sector 7 – Monterotondo-Tivoli, approved by the Regional Council (Decision No 4477 of 30 July 1999). A series of appropriate measures combine to safeguard the Villa d'Este and guarantee its protection.

Management

At national level, the management of the Villa d'Este falls under the responsibility of the Ministry of Cultural Property and Activities (Central Office for Archaeological, Architectural, Artistic, and Historical Property) and at regional level under the responsibility of the *Soprintendenza per i Beni Ambientali e Architettonici del Lazio*.

In view of the complex problems relating to the conservation of the property, the Central Restoration Institute in Rome has been carrying out a specific multidisciplinary study since 1997 with its own technical and scientific staff, which had assisted in perfecting methods and techniques for the restoration of fountains

The *Soprintendenza* has drawn up a plan to enhance the Villa d'Este. This plan includes the restoration of the palace and garden, the adaptation and completion of technical amenities in the palace (electricity, heating, drainage, etc) and garden, the modernization of services (access, welcome, and information facilities for visitors, sign panels, cultural activities, etc).

As the growing number of visitors has been identified as one of the management aspects of the property which would also have an effect on the local economy, the Region of Latium, the *Soprintendenza*, and the town council of Tivoli drew up a project in 1995, now in progress, to give added value to the archaeological and monumental heritage of the town, as well as its tourist and cultural resources.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Because of micro-climatic conditions that have caused rapid deterioration in the decoration and finishing materials, the Villa d'Este has gone through several restoration campaigns, with the use of techniques and materials that were sometimes different from the originals.

In the last ten years the Villa d'Este has benefited from an active policy in favour of the renovation of monuments. The palace has been the object of some major restoration works undertaken by the *Soprintendenza* (5000m² of structures and decoration),

using very rigorous methods in conformity with the principles laid down in the Venice Charter. These will continue on the top floor of the north-east wing (installation of a documentation centre), the *Manica lunga*, the ground-floor rooms, and the courtyard.

One of the major problems concerning the quality of water has been solved. Water was indispensable for feeding the fifty fountains, jets, and basins. The restoration programme for these elements, initiated at the end of the 1980s (restoration of the Fountain of Proserpine and the Rotunda of the Cypressess) had come to a halt in 1990 because of the polluted water from the Anio that flowed into these fountains. This programme could not started again until 1998, after the construction of a purifying plant which ensured the flow of water into the garden in perfect conditions. At present, there is still work to do on half of the fountains, grottoes, and nymphaea. In this context, part of the sound effects of the fountains and the *jeux d'eau* will be restored.

Authenticity

The degree of authenticity of both the palace and of the garden is very high, and the different periods of the ensemble are clearly visible and recognizable. The remains of the Roman villa and the monastery on which the palace was built are still visible. Moreover, a large part of the spatial and ornamental structure of the garden has been preserved. The restoration of the murals is methodical and rigorous. Other notable Baroque works, such as those by Bernini, have been well conserved and restored.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Villa d'Este in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted the ICOMOS-IFLA International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Cultural Landscapes

Qualities

The Villa d'Este in Tivoli, and in particular its garden, is outstanding by virtue of its refinement and the innovative character of its design and architectural works. The ingenious and creative way the fountains, ornamental basins, etc make use of water – the main feature of the garden – was unequalled in Europe during Renaissance.

Comparative analysis

The Villa d'Este formed part of a series of villas belonging to the aristocracy and princes of the Church which developed in particular around large Italian towns. Even though other very important villas exist, such as Villa Lante, Villa Farnese in Caprarola, Boboli and Pratolino in Florence, the Palladian Villas, and Fontainebleau in France, the Villa d'Este is undoubtedly the most representative and the most important. Moreover, the Villa d'Este still retains its original structure and statuary in the most complete form possible. The decoration of its garden, above all, with the first "water theatre," the *scala d'acqua* (water staircase), the artificial cascade, the Hundred Fountains, and the terraces, has been the source of inspiration for artists from all over the world. The fountains at the Villa d'Este play a vital role, and they are incomparable because of

the abundance of water, the large number of fountains, the grottoes, and the statues all concentrated in a single garden.

As a place of culture and nature, technology and the mastery of water, land and landscape, and as an allegory of the ancient and symbolic world, the Villa d'Este is one of the finest examples and an outstanding landmark in the art of gardens during the Italian Renaissance period.

The Villa d'Este played a very important role in the design of villas and gardens all over Europe, and it was an endless source of inspiration for many artists. It is unquestionably one of the most important ensembles of this period.

Recommendations by ICOMOS for future action

Access to the garden is a problem. It should be changed so as to meet the required standard and to permit a better understanding of the whole. The town of Tivoli has already initiated a master plan and a project entitled *Tivoli ama la Città* aimed at rehabilitating its historic centre. Restoration works have already started, and these include an alternative itinerary for leaving the garden. Improved access to the garden should, however, be seriously taken into consideration.

Although there are many projects, budgets, plans, general information notes, and schedules for the works, the State Party ought to have included in its nomination dossier an overall management plan in the form of a more detailed and finalized document. This overall management plan was provided in March 2001 and ICOMOS considers it to be acceptable

The overall restoration project for the garden is more complex. A series of activities are under way, including the restoration of the fountains, a botanical inventory, treatment against diseases, historical research, etc, but it is crucial to establish general and specific criteria for restoration, including archaeological research and landscape analysis. A master plan for the appropriate restoration of the garden should be established within the next two years.

It is therefore recommended that the World Cultural Heritage Committee request the State Party to provide assurances as to the implementation of the overall management plan and the preparation of a master plan for the garden.

Even though this is not absolutely necessary, it would be desirable to carry out an in-depth analysis of the landscape surrounding the Villa d'Este. The Villa has a very close relationship with the surrounding landscape, since it was its abundant water resources that determined the location of the villa and garden. It is impossible to ignore the influence of this relationship or that of the Roman remains in Tivoli on the symbolic decorative programme of the palace and its garden. Such an analysis would reinforce and give coherence to an understanding of one of the richest and most significant landscapes of humankind

If in the future the town council of Tivoli successfully implements its plan to restore the historical centre near the garden, an extension of the zone proposed for inscription could be envisaged

Brief description

The Villa d'Este in Tivoli, started for Cardinal Ippolito II d'Este in 1550, was designed by the architect and antiquary Pirro Ligorio according to an iconographic plan and very elaborate composition so as to form an ensemble typical of the Renaissance. The palace still has its original painted decoration dating back to the 16th century, the work of studios of the Roman Mannerist School. The Villa is outstanding, however, mainly for its water garden, embellished with a profusion of fountains, nymphaea, ornamental basins, and grottoes, one of the first *giardini delle meraviglie*.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, iii, and iv*:

The Villa d'Este in Tivoli, with its palace and garden, is one of the most remarkable and comprehensive illustrations of Renaissance culture at its most refined. Owing to its innovative design and the creativity and ingenuity of the architectural components in the garden (fountains, ornamental basins, etc), is a true water garden and a unique example of an Italian 16th century garden. The Villa d'Este, one of the first *giardini delle meraviglie*, served as a model for and had a decisive influence on the development of gardens in Europe.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Vat Phou (Laos)

No 481rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Vat Phou and Associated Ancient Settlements within the Champasak Cultural Landscape
<i>Location</i>	(mainly) Champasak District, (entirely) Champasak Province
<i>State Party</i>	Lao People's Democratic Republic
<i>Date</i>	29 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The site was planned during the second half of the 1st millennium AD to represent on the ground the Khmer symbolic universe, itself the Hindu view of the world. It is focused on, to the west, the natural features of Phou Kao Mountain and, on the east, the Mekong River, used to represent respectively the sacred mountain dwelling of the god Shiva and the Ganges River or the Universal Ocean. The plain between, containing the main extent of temples and associated works, formed Kurukshetra, the Holy Land.

The degree of survival of the overall topography of the Khmer landscape (*c* AD 600 onwards), and of many archaeological remains above and below ground, has resulted in the continued existence of evidence of the planning and utilization of the landscape over some 400km² during nearly a thousand years (*c* 5th–15th centuries AD). This is the only place in south-east Asia where such a landscape has been recognized to survive in all its essential parts.

Some of the individual buildings are of major architectural and historical significance. The Vat Phou Temple Complex itself is one of the major buildings of the pre-Angkorian and Angkorian periods, and is an example of a relatively rare form of hilltop Khmer temple planning. Much of its sculpture exemplifies high artistic standards and creativity of both the formative and classical periods of Khmer civilization.

The nominated property includes Shrestrapura, one of the earliest known urban settlements in south-east Asia, and its 9th century successor. Early social organization is evidenced by road systems and water management. The city is significant as the cradle of the culture and birthplace of the state of Chenla, which dominated much of south-east Asia for several centuries before its incorporation into the Khmer Empire. The archaeological potential of the urban sites, including the area around Hong Nang Sida which became the urban centre in Angkorian times, is very high.

Overall, the Champasak landscape is a very early cultural landscape, demonstrating the beginnings of urbanism in south-east Asia as well as the way in which the Khmers moulded their landscape to reflect their symbolic universe.

Note The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

The nomination dossier provides no history of the site before its abandonment in the 13th century. The origins of the site nevertheless lie before AD 600, at least at the city of Shrestrapura, where archaeological research has produced evidence of pre-Angkorian times (up to *c* AD 900). The development of the site as a whole, however, was intimately bound up with the origin, development, and zenith of the Khmer Empire between the 7th and 12th centuries. A new line of kings probably centred in the Champasak region expanded its authority from its capital at Isanapura from the 10th century onwards until it encompassed not only most of modern Cambodia but also considerable parts of what is now eastern Thailand. The *floruit* of the elaborate landscape at Vat Phou probably occurred during these centuries. Its historical significance lies in its role as an imperial centre and its demonstration of Indian rather than Chinese influence in the clear evidence of Hindu religious belief.

The last major developments to the Champasak cultural landscape were in the 13th century, just before the collapse of the Khmer Empire. There is no evidence of any maintenance of the monumental buildings since then, although various other occupations and events have occurred on the site. Vat Phou itself, in contrast to what it represented in the first millennium, was converted to Theravada Buddhism and remains a local centre of worship today. Essentially, however, the area reverted to secondary forest, which covered most of it when the first European arrived in the 19th century. An annual Vat Phou Festival demonstrates the continuing place of the site in the lives of the local community.

Description

Champasak District lies 500km south-east of the capital, Vientiane, on the west bank of the Mekong River. It contains the Vat Phou temple complex, a major example of both early and classic Khmer architecture of the 7th–12th centuries AD. Recent research has shown that this complex is the focal point of a sophisticated cultural landscape centred on the Champasak Plain, taking in the Phou Kao Mountain to the west and the banks of the Mekong River to the east. Between them are temples, shrines, water tanks, water channels,

quarries, historic field systems, settlement sites, and an ancient road to Angkor. A planned pre-Angkorian Ancient City (4 ha) on the banks of the Mekong appears to have been replaced as the urban centre by another planned city immediately south of Vat Phou itself in the Angkor period. A probably contemporary road leads southwards from it, past quarries and other industrial works.

Many of these features exist in a carefully planned landscape laid out to reflect its sacred character as perceived by the builders of Vat Phou. The terraced Temple Complex lies at the foot of Phou Kao Mountain, stretching from west–east to a freshwater spring on a rock terrace where the shrine was built. An axial line from the natural *lingua* (phallic-like point) on the mountain summit through the shrine was used as the basis for the layout of the temple complex: it is 1400m long, with lakes as well as buildings to either side, bisected by an axial processional way. The use of a natural mountain-top eye-catcher (elevation 1416m) and the relatively high degree of survival of landscape and its structural components assist present-day appreciation of the grand concept of the original design of what was always intended to be what would now be known as a cultural landscape. Much of it continues in use now as shallow paddy-fields for rice.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Government, through the provincial and district authorities, is the principal landowner of the entire property.

The Vat Phou area is protected by the Provincial Decree on the Regulations for the Preservation of the Historical Site of Vat Phou and the Areas related to Vat Phou. No 38/88 (October 1988). This defined a large Protection Zone, not just the main monuments; within it are three Preservation Areas, essentially the three main temple complexes. A national legal framework for heritage preservation was adopted by a Presidential Decree of June 1997.

Other plans have a direct bearing on the status and management of the site: eg the National Master Plan for Tourism for Champasak Province 1995 and the Provincial Development Plan for Transportation, Post and Construction 1996–2000.

Management

Management responsibility is currently distributed through five different Ministries: Finance (land title and tax collection), Agriculture and Forestry (land-use), Industry and Handicrafts (industrial development and minerals), Information and Culture (monitoring of historic landscape), and Communication, Transportation, Post, and Construction (road and urban development). The Government has established a National Inter-Ministerial Co-ordinating Committee to oversee the management of the Protection Zone and to co-ordinate the activities of the various Government Departments at national, provincial, and district levels.

The Champasak Heritage Management Plan was officially adopted by the Government in September

1998 to put the 1997 Presidential Decree into effect. The Plan defines the boundaries of the Protection Zone and the three Areas within it, and contains regulations for the management of the entire nominated World Heritage site. These cover archaeological work, conservation, and development control.

The Plan implements the policies of the Government for the sustainable development of the cultural tourism while making pre-eminent the maintenance of the character and integrity of this cultural landscape and its component monuments. Policies for presentation of the Champasak Cultural Landscape are set out in Chapter 8 of the Plan. Development controls as set out in the Management Plan need to be actively enforced, especially in the Ancient City of Shrestrapura.

Policies in the Management Plan envisage sustainable growth of tourism with improved facilities and housekeeping at the sites currently open, plus the development of access to new monuments, the further production of educational materials, and the involvement of the local communities both as guides and as providers of services to visitors. Currently a staff of twelve look after the site. A Site Management and Training Centre is being set up, handicapped by inadequate staffing, training, and skills.

A local site management office has been funded by central Government since 1989. Since 1995, Italian and Japanese funding has enabled UNESCO and the Government to develop a new, more holistic, and non-interventionist approach to the management of the cultural landscape (as evidenced in the voluminous professional and academic Annexes to the nomination). Otherwise, funding comes mainly from the Provincial Government (with site revenue going to the District). At the time of the nomination, external funding of some US\$ 5 million was being sought for training and conservation in 2000–2005. Meanwhile visitor numbers have more than doubled since 1997 to 14,000 (7322 of them foreigners); this figure does not take account of the c 100,000 who arrive during the three-day Vat Phou festival.

Overall, management now needs to learn to work more closely with the Plan, perhaps revising it after nearly two years' experience. Systematic monitoring using the site's good existing database is essential, while dealing with the main factors affecting the site: development pressures, environmental pressures (mainly flooding, run-off, and erosion), visitor/tourism pressures including those of the Festival each February, and the growing population with higher lifestyle expectations within the Protected Zone itself (no permanent inhabitants live in Zones 2 or 4 but almost 28,000 live in Zones 1 and 3).

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

There has been minimal conservation work to any part of the site. The process by which the Champasak landscape has survived in its present state is essentially one of benign neglect and natural damage and decay. Water is now in some sense the most serious problem, for the original drainage system no longer works and in the rainy season water cascades

down the terraces and causes erosion both there and elsewhere through the site. The central processional road was restored in the 1960s when a large pavilion was also built. Some stone robbing has occurred but, largely because of the site's little-known existence and difficulty of access until recently, looting has been minimal. Perhaps the worst damage is at Tomo Temple where the principal brick shrines have been almost totally demolished. The site has also been spared the sort of archaeological work which has damaged so many sites in the name of excavation but provided scant information. The clearance of forest only began in the 1950s, but now there is a great need for regular maintenance to stop regrowth and further root damage. The lack of modern threats has continued until the present but now the situation is changing. The basically non-damaging nature of traditional agriculture (shallow paddy-fields) is changing under pressures to intensify and has recently caused considerable damage. The main road through the Ancient City is attracting constant new building and improvement of existing ones.

A good site conservation assessment has been carried out. As a result, the great and urgent need now has been identified as at the Vat Phou Temple Complex itself where most of the major structures are in danger of imminent collapse. Repair of the ancient water system is also a high priority.

Authenticity

Evaluation of authenticity involves in this case five main elements:

1. The landscape setting of the whole

The river and the mountain, the frame of the man-made complex, remain in place and little altered; the plain in between is probably more wooded and less coherent in appearance than it was a thousand years ago. Overall, however, authenticity in this respect is high.

2. The association of the various elements and the evidence for deliberate planning

The various elements comprising the landscape survive well as archaeological sites or standing ruins. It is therefore relatively easy to see how the elements were articulated with one another and to understand their relationships. The axial arrangement of structures in relation to the Lingaparvata of the Phou Kao Mountain is clearly visible.

3. Buried archaeological sites

The general depth of archaeological stratigraphy is no more than 0.5m in the urban sites, but neither natural nor human disturbance has so far been significant. The archaeological integrity is therefore high.

4. Archaeological sites surviving as visible earthworks

Of former structures now earthworks, the most notable are the ramparts around the two cities. Some damage has been caused by cuts through them (eg for modern roads), but the most serious damage has been erosion of the second and third walls of the Ancient City by a stream. Other upstanding earthworks include the roads, canals, and *baray* (reservoir), and mounds where buildings or other structures have collapsed and become overgrown. Again erosion, and some robbing and

digging, have affected these features but generally they are in good condition.

5. Standing structures

While no ancient buildings are now intact, most survive to the top of their walls. No large-scale restoration has occurred. The standing structures are therefore still entirely authentic with a high level of integrity despite partial collapse.

Most of the present population live away from the main archaeological complexes. Many of the inhabited houses are traditional in form, but developmental pressures are mounting. Nevertheless, overall, with little vegetational or other natural changes and almost no archaeological or restorative activity, the integrity and authenticity of the site of this nomination are remarkably high.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in February 2001.

Qualities

The site is remarkably well preserved, although now in great need of careful conservation and firm management. It promises a great time-depth of considerable research interest, from within the first half of the 1st millennium AD, bearing on at least one of the main issues, urban origins, concerning developments in south-east Asia. It exhibits a remarkable spread of monuments and other structures over an extensive area between river and mountain, some of outstanding architecture, many containing great works of art, notably sculpture. Above all, the whole was created within a geometric framework linking such man-made works with natural phenomena, notably the distinctive pointed summit of Phou Kao. This landscape planning on the grand scale in the second half of the 1st millennium AD was carried out not merely to make a pleasure garden but to express a relationship between the gods, nature, and humanity as believed in Hindu religion. The sanctity of the mountain is still observed today by the people of Champasak, who continue to respect and preserve the natural environment of this mountain abode of ancient gods, whilst across the Mekong the riverside temple of Tomo continues to bear witness to the cosmological template used to plan the site.

Comparative analysis

Many Khmer-period monumental buildings survive, primarily in Cambodia but also in other countries. In terms of architectural magnificence, and also of its significance in terms of its spatial composition, the complex at Angkor, the capital of the Khmer Empire from the 10th to 14th centuries AD, is without peer. Indeed, the Khmer culture is in general better represented in Cambodia than in Lao. Angkor was justifiably inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1992, and continues to be the subject of much international attention.

The Vat Phou Temple Complex, however, is on a par with the most important Khmer sites found outside modern Cambodia in terms of its plan, decoration, and survival. It is also one of the major building complexes of the pre-Angkorian and Angkorian periods.

The Champasak cultural landscape is the only known early cultural landscape in south-east Asia, preserving both good and relatively undamaged evidence for the beginnings of urbanism and for the ways in which the Khmers engineered their landscape to meet both their practical and spiritual needs. The particular topography of the area makes it relatively easy to demonstrate to local people, visitors, and scholars the symbolic constructs which underlay the Khmer use of the landscape. This is the only known landscape of its sort to survive in all its essential parts. As a rare linear layout of Khmer temples, it can be compared, for example, with Preah Vihear on the Thai-Cambodian border. It is also an example of a relatively rare form of hilltop Khmer temple planning.

Only at this property has evidence so far been found for cities, rural agglomerations, sites specializing in different craft activities, and communications systems, all associated with water-management structures and religious buildings to provide a basis for an overall understanding of the development of Khmer civilization.

In terms of historical significance and monumental importance, Vat Phou can be compared directly with two other sites emerging in mid-millennium as belonging essentially to the pre-Angkorian phase. The major ruins are regarded as being at Phnom Da near Angkor Borei in the Mekong delta and Sambor Prei Kuk. At both there is much stone sculpture representing a rich pantheon of Hindu deities with hardly any evidence of Buddhism. It needs to be borne in mind that irrigation was a well known and widespread phenomenon in south-east Asia in the early centuries AD, and probably began much earlier. Particularly was this true of areas like Cambodia that are subject to heavy seasonal rains and long dry periods, weather which made water-storage and distribution essential for successful rice-growing. Elaborate though the systems at Vat Phou are, they can be appreciated within a regional context in which they are representative rather than exceptional. Similarly, although recent research has undoubtedly given Shrestapura a place in the debate about urban origins in south-east Asia, it has not diminished the significance, actual or, like Shrestapura, potential, of other early cities in the region. Oc-éo, for example, to the south of Vat Phou lay in a lowland area west of the delta of the Mekong and Bassac Rivers where access to the sea and other settlements was by canals in a system described as "the outstanding urban feature ... to an extent [not] found elsewhere in south-east Asian settlements." Canal-based irrigation was also developing elsewhere in the world in the 1st millennium AD. In the North American south-west, for example, the economy of the desert-living Hohokam was almost exclusively agricultural by AD 500 because their irrigation system was ambitious from the outset.

The Champasak cultural landscape as a whole can be viewed in wider perspectives. Considerable significance is attached in the nomination to the fact that the urban centre shifted westwards from Shrestapura on the bank

of the Mekong to Hong Nang Sida south of Vat Phou temple itself. Undoubtedly this adds considerably to the interest of the property overall and the case is well made that the archaeological potential of two successive but adjacent rather than superimposed cities will bear significantly on regional issues of state formation and urban development. But "settlement shuffle" is a common phenomenon, archaeologically well recorded around the world and not least with cities such as Delhi, and, among current nominations, Samarkand.

In a global perspective, the nominated property overall also shares many features in common with some principal sites of different but contemporary cultures developing in those centuries perceived in Western scholarship as Early Medieval. In western Europe itself, for example, great religious complexes, also involving alignments, as at Cologne (Germany), Chartres (France), and Canterbury (England), were developing. A close parallel in terms, not of architectural form but of state formation, water management, and road network within a core area containing built, religious complexes closely allied to natural phenomena, is at the World Heritage site of Chaco in New Mexico (USA), part of a civilization flourishing and fading at about the same time as that of the Khmer.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

That within the site's management programme urgent attention be given to the stabilization of ancient standing buildings and other structures, and that a particular effort be made to bring the hydrological situation under control, both in preventing flash floods and the undercutting of buildings and in restoring the ancient system of water management as far as possible.

ICOMOS believes that inscription would reflect international endorsement of the stated objectives of the Champasak Heritage Management Plan which comes as an integral part of the nomination and already has the force of law at national level. ICOMOS therefore expects the practical implementation of that Plan should inscription occur.

Brief description

The Champasak cultural landscape, including the Vat Phou Temple Complex, contains a remarkably well preserved planned landscape more than a thousand years old. It was contrived to express the Hindu version of the relationship between Nature and humanity, using an axis from mountain top to river bank to lay out a geometric pattern of temples, shrines and water-works related over some 10km. The site also contains two successive early planned cities between the banks of the Mekong and Phou Kao mountain, the whole representing a development over nearly a thousand years from the 5th to 15th centuries AD associated above all with the Khmer Empire.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage list on the basis of *criteria iii, iv and vi*:

The outstanding significance of the Champasak cultural landscape lies in the broad scientific perspective of the powerful Khmer culture of the 10th–14th centuries AD as a whole. In particular, the Temple Complex of Vat Phou represents a masterpiece of human creative genius for the high quality of its artistic work and the integration of its symbolic plan with the natural landscape to create a physical manifestation of a Hindu mental template of the perfect universe. The resulting expression of these ideas, not only on the ground but also in architecture and art was a unique fusion of indigenous nature symbols, religious inspiration, and technical prowess.

ICOMOS, March 2001

The Chouf (Lebanon)

No 1036

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The entire natural site of the region of the Chouf, with its monuments and sites.
<i>Location</i>	Caza of Le Chouf
<i>State Party</i>	Lebanon
<i>Date</i>	15 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Note : The text below is an abbreviated version of the justification submitted in the file of the proposal for inscription.

Both Fakhreddine II Maan for Deir el-Qamar, and Bechir II Chehab, for Beiteddine two centuries later, resorted to Florentine and local architects to design their villa or palace.

This combination of Islamic and Tuscan creativity inevitably generated an original and unique architectural lexicon. Another exceptional and unique feature for Lebanon and the Middle East, resulting directly from functional needs, was the corner door. This was hollowed out from the orthogonal meeting of two walls, through a thickness that could reach up to two or three metres, to lead to corner rooms and thus avoid having to enter through a succession of two adjoining rooms.

Criteria i and ii

Deir el-Qamar and the seigneurial palace of Beiteddine form a whole that is an integral part of the history of Lebanon and the Near East from the 16th to the 19th century, before Beirut became the official capital of Lebanon. This monumental and urban unity is a physical and still living illustration of the important contribution made to the history of the Near East by Moslem, Druse, Jewish, and Christian communities. Deir el-Qamar, the first capital of an independent state during the Ottoman occupation, succeeded in being the home of three monotheistic religions that lived together in harmony for a long time. Moreover, the town had the first municipal council to be elected in the region and served as the earliest example of direct democracy. Independence and freedom accompanied the reigns of the Maan and Chehab Emirs for about four centuries. These "expressions," which were forbidden and inconceivable under the Ottoman Empire, disappeared in 1842, at the end of the last Emirate, but resumed one century later, in 1943, under a new form of independence for Lebanon.

Criterion iii

As a capital recognized by contemporary international authorities, Deir el-Qamar developed an urban infrastructure

and a homogeneous architectural ensemble which is so coherent that it must have been planned in advance.

The architecture and its urban impact on the town of Deir el-Qamar and the palace of Beiteddine make them exceptional sites. They provide vital evidence of a period that was in effect the bright dawn preceding the assertion of Lebanon as an independent nation. This fundamental chapter in the history of Lebanon is certainly the one that played the most important role in shaping the Lebanese lifestyle and architectural art.

Deir el-Qamar was founded by Fakhreddine I Maan at the beginning of the 16th century. Emir Fakhreddine II, on his return from Tuscany in 1618, gave Deir el-Qamar its final architectural, urban, and social aspect by building an infrastructure that was unique for the Middle East at the time: the first drains, water pipes, paved streets, etc, which are still in use. The palaces and residences, built in a mixture of Islamic and Tuscan styles, gave this oriental town a unique character that soon served as an example not only in Mount Lebanon but also throughout the region, especially in Syria and Palestine, for the Emir had extended his power over an area of more than 20,000km².

Criterion iv

The palaces and residences of Deir el-Qamar have been inhabited continuously by local people from the 15th century up to the present, including the periods of a second emirate, two *kaimakamates*, the regime of the Mutassarifs, and the French mandate. It should be noted that most of the families who occupied these residences or palaces are the descendants or heirs of the original owners.

From another angle, the social fabric woven around the central square of the town of Deir el-Qamar, next to the mosque and the Saïdet el-Talle church, led in 1751 to the first mixed, democratic, and free school, 38 years before the French Revolution and the declaration of Human Rights (1789).

Criterion v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Deir el-Qamar, the "Convent of the Moon," has a very ancient origin. The Phoenicians had most probably built a temple dedicated to the Moon, and the Byzantines inhabited this site. During the Crusades, the town, which was converted into a fortress, was mentioned in the chronicles of the Knights of Saint John and the Teutonic Knights.

The town flourished in the 16th century, when it became for more than a century the seat of the governors of Lebanon, the Maan Emirs, who were Druses of Kurdish origin. It developed with Fakhreddine I Maan (1518–44), who became an ally of the Ottoman Sultan Selim I when he conquered Syria in 1516. Nominated Grand Emir by the Sultan, he decided to make Deir el-Qamar his capital. Fakhreddine I extended and established his authority from Jaffa to Tripoli (Lebanon) where he erected numerous

buildings and fortresses. He was murdered at the instigation of the Ottomans, like his son Qorqmaz forty years later.

Fakhreddine II, the grandson of Fakhreddine I, was appointed governor in 1598 and tried to unify the leading feudal families of the country. He started by expanding his territory well beyond the Chouf, until his authority covered what is now Lebanon. At the same time, he encouraged trade and alliances with the West, particularly with the Spaniards and the Grand Dukes of Tuscany, who had ambitions to seize the declining power of Venice in the ports of the Levant. In 1613 the Ottomans sent the Pasha of Damascus, Hafiz Pasha, to oppose him and he was forced into exile in Italy.

Fakhreddine II spent five years at the Court of Duke Cosimo II de' Medici. He took advantage of his stay in Florence to learn about the political, economic, and social life of the Italian republics. He initiated himself into Florentine banking practices and studied Italian agricultural methods.

He returned home in 1618 and started to expand his territory once again. Because of his passion for art, music, and poetry, he brought scholars over from Europe, offering them material conditions that were very favourable for that time. Fakhreddine II introduced printing into Lebanon, an activity that was unique in the East at that time.

The prince built new palaces in Deir el-Qamar, Beirut, and Saïda, his favourite places. At Deir el-Qamar, he installed a drainage system, water pipes, and paved streets. Fakhreddine II rebuilt the palace destroyed in 1615 by the Sayfa, using stones from their castle at Akkar, which he captured in 1627. Other constructions followed: the Kaïssarie (Silk Market), a reminder that the breeding of silkworms was one of the most prosperous activities of Lebanon between the 17th and 19th centuries, the el-Kharge palace, and the seraglio built around a square, the Midane.

The modernization works in Lebanon alarmed the authorities in Istanbul. Denounced by his detractors, Fakhreddine II surrendered in 1632 after a battle against the Ottoman fleet and army, and he was executed in 1635 with his three sons. This enlightened prince had succeeded in creating a modern Lebanon founded on solid institutions that lasted for over thirty years. Thanks to his liberal attitude, he was able to encourage all the religious communities in Lebanon to live peacefully together. His successors, however, were incapable of containing the ambitions of the feudal lords and freeing themselves from the control of the central power. As a result, power passed into the hands of the Chehab, relatives and allies of the Maan.

Internal fighting frequently hampered the government of the first line of the Chehab, stirred up by recalcitrant Ottoman pashas and feudal lords who objected to any form of central authority. Emir Bechir II Chehab (1789–1840), subsequently known as Bechir the Great, did his best to put an end to the upheavals caused by the emirs, feudal lords, and clan chiefs. The situation remained unstable, however, and when the seraglio of Deir el-Qamar became too cramped he decided in 1807 to move to Beiteddine, where he lived until he was evicted in 1840.

For over thirty years Emir Bechir II was the almost independent sovereign of a country that had once again become prosperous and safe. Although he was a Sunni Moslem, he secretly became a Maronite in order to have the clergy on his side, but he did not dare favour the Christians openly. The construction of the palace at Beiteddine, which started at the end of the 18th century on the site of a hamlet enclosing a Druse stone house, a *khalwa*, took some 36 years, in a succession of phases lasting up to 1840. In 1812 the sovereign demanded of his subjects two days of free labour to lay down the pipes.

Like Fakhreddine II, Bechir II loved the arts and was a great patron and protector. A whole host of poets and writers resided in his palace at Beiteddine. Bechir II was also highly appreciated for his policy of religious tolerance, especially by Pope Gregory XVI. In 1840 the English handed him over to the Turks against whom he had taken sides by becoming the ally of Egypt, and he was obliged to go into exile.

His successor, Emir Bechir III, appointed by the Ottomans, settled in Deir el-Qamar. Bloody incidents broke out in the autumn of 1841 between Druses and Christians. The Porte used this incident to put an end to the power of the Chehabs. Bechir III was deposed the following year and the Emirate abolished. 1842 marked the end of the Lebanon of Emirs, a Lebanon grouped around its princes and sheikhs, and the start of a long period of turmoil.

Mount Lebanon was then governed directly by the Ottomans who introduced a “dual *kaimakamate*,” dividing the country into two districts, one Druse and the other Maronite. The situation in Deir el-Qamar was delicate because, although it was located in the Druse district, the majority of the people were Maronite. The town was neutralized and placed under the direct authority of the Sublime Porte. The Beiteddine palace became the seat of the Ottoman governors, and later of the Mutassarrifs of Mount Lebanon, who occupied it between 1860 and 1915 and proceeded to make several additions.

Trouble flared up again in 1860 and the violence did not spare Deir el-Qamar. After the clashes between the communities came to an end, the town started to sink into a kind of provincial torpor. At that point, Lebanon enjoyed an “organic status” within the Ottoman Empire (1864). This status gave the town of Deir el-Qamar a special regime in order to avoid a repetition of events similar to those that had broken out in 1860.

After World War I, the authorities of the French Mandate (1920–41) housed some of their administrative services in the Beiteddine palace. It was during this period that the old capital finally gave way to Beirut and the towns along the strategic axis between Beirut and Damascus. In 1943 the palace of Beiteddine became the summer residence of the Presidents of the Lebanese Republic.

The 1975 war rekindled the old hatreds and resentments, once again sweeping the communities into a vicious circle of violence. Mostly driven away from the Chouf by the Druses, the handful of Christians left in 1984 were nearly all concentrated in Deir el-Qamar, the only area of cohabitation in the region. The Chouf was then governed by Walid Jumblatt who took possession of the Beiteddine palace, returning to the fold of the State in 1992.

Description

- DEIR EL-QAMAR

The mountains of the Chouf stretch from south of Beirut north of Nabatiyet and from the coast up to Jebel el-Barouk (the Chouf Bayadi). Deir el-Qamar is at an altitude of 800m and is built on terraces, facing south, above the valley. The small town consists of sixteen palaces and monuments arranged round a square, the Midane. The historic area is also composed of old districts and lanes. The network of streets and footpaths all radiate from this square. They were paved in the 17th century, when the town was also equipped with water pipes and drains, the oldest drainage system in the Orient after that of Istanbul. Deir el-Qamar is well supplied with springs, one of the reasons why the Maan Emirs settled here. The Al-Chalout fountain, the main spring of the town, and the Oum-Nicolas fountain supply the various palaces, thermal baths, and private houses of the town.

The commercial part of the town was divided between the different guilds, with souks for shoemakers, butchers, carpenters, etc. The old shoemakers' souk had over 38 shops and some two hundred craftsmen worked there. The Kaissarie (Silk Souk) occupied the northern section of the Midane. This closed market, built by Fakhreddine II in the 17th century, was originally intended for trade in jewellery, silk, and imperial commodities. The rectangular building has a central open square with a basin in the middle. The arcades housed the shops of the craftsmen. This monument shows that Deir el-Qamar was an important trading centre until the 19th century.

The palaces and residences of the town are characteristic of 17th and 18th century Lebanese architecture, a synthesis of eastern and western styles. The plans of the houses are typical of Lebanese traditional domestic architecture, of the *khan* type with a *iwān*, central hall, and gallery. The construction method and the materials used are typically Lebanese. The stone, from a quarry that is unique in Lebanon, is called *bouzennār* where the unusual nature is due to a mixture of greyish beige and pink colours, and from another quarry in the Akkar, known for its yellow colour.

Four palaces clearly illustrate the architecture of Deir el-Qamar from the historical and chronological view, as well as in terms of typology and architectural exchanges and contributions: the palace of Emir Fakhreddine II, the seraglio, the palace of Emir Ahmed Chehab, and the palace of the poet Nicolas el-Turq.

The palace of Fakhreddine II, on the east side of the Midane square, was first destroyed in 1615, and then rebuilt around 1625 under the supervision of two Tuscan architects and sculptors, Francesco Cioli and Giulio Pariggi. The *khan*-type building has one dwelling floor and one partial floor built around a paved central courtyard. The massive building is partly built on a very solid base. It is entered through a first vaulted guardroom preceding a second room. The latter leads through a right-angle to the open courtyard. This indirect access permitted the guards to defend the entrance to the palace more effectively, a protective measure typical of the plans of Arab houses and palaces. To the north of the central courtyard, with its octagonal fountain, are a service *iwān* with its own fountain. To the south is a second *iwān*, slightly out of line

in relation to the first one and used for living. The sober decoration of the palace is achieved through a polychrome effect based on an alternation of white and yellow. The yellow stones were brought from the Akkar, after the destruction of the palace of the Sayfa, the enemies of Fakhreddine II.

The seraglio, situated to the south of the square, was built during the first half of the 18th century by Emir Melhem Chehab, Governor of Lebanon from 1729 to 1754, and later completed by his son Emir Youssef Chehab (1770–89). The building served as the seat of the regional government. The lower floor goes back to the Maan period and was part of the palace of Fakhreddine I. The upper floor, dating to the Chehab period, was inhabited until 1810 by Bechir II. This *khan*-type building is arranged around a huge paved courtyard. The entrance is through a beautiful monumental gate guarded by two lions, symbols of the dynasty of the Chehab Emirs, and then through a guardroom, perpendicular to the courtyard. To the west is a *iwān*. The main room on the south side has a dome pierced by a series of windows. Two small rooms on the courtyard side have a magnificent wood decoration of geometric and floral motifs. Semi-circular *bouzennār* stone steps precede every room and each door has a decorated lintel.

Ahmed Chehab built the palace that closes off the east side of the square in 1760. The architecture of this imposing palace is of the *khan* type, with two floors overlooking an open central courtyard. The entrance is inlaid with white marble and red and white stone and framed by geometric cable mouldings, sharply contrasting with the stone bonding of the facade. The main entrance opens on to a small room leading to the courtyard adorned with a multicoloured pond and surrounded by huge rooms. The south-west corner door of the courtyard is an interesting architectural feature, typical of buildings of this type, making it possible to use an independent corner room. A decorative lintel composed of a double volute surmounts it. The room in the north-west corner can only be entered from the outside. On the eastern side of the courtyard are the *hammams*, composed of small areas topped by domes and corridors linking the huge rooms. On the northern side of the upper floor is a *iwān* opening on an arched passage with a pigeon house above it. A sculpted wooden kiosk on the southern facade completes the ensemble.

The *khan*-type palace of the poet Nicolas el-Turq was built in 1805 on uneven land. It is laid out around a paved central courtyard with an octagonal fountain. On the northern side of the courtyard, a *iwān* decorated with a small basin and leading to side rooms was reserved for women. The *iwān* in the south of the courtyard, slightly out of line in relation to the first, was reserved for men. To the west an arched passage links the two parts of the building. Two sculpted oculi give a certain rhythm to this arcade. The arches of this passage, slightly in Moorish style, are borne by fine smooth columns. The lack of symmetry was deliberate on the part of the architect. The pond in the courtyard is not placed in the axis of the *iwāns* and the openings on each side of the entrance door are not symmetrical. The south facade has three *mandalouns* looking out on the mountain.

The originality of the palaces and houses of Deir el-Qamar lie in the fact that they are the result of different architectural traditions, both in terms of geography and of time. Some of the main features of Islamic architecture can

be seen in this ensemble. The houses arranged around a central courtyard function like a closed world. The fountains and ponds in the middle of the residence are a reminder that water, the symbol of purity, is one of the important elements of this architecture. The influence of Islamic philosophy is also reflected in the artistic and architectural shapes and details (geometric and polychrome decoration), especially of the entrances marking the transition between the inside and outside, the fountains, and the woodwork. The elements composing the windows, *mandalouns*, roses, oculi, and balconies result from the blending of Arab and European decorative movements. There is a certain resemblance to the twin windows with small columns on the facade of the Ducal Palace in Florence, where Fakhreddine II resided during his exile. The kiosks, galleries, and corbels have definite similarities with Venetian architecture of the 14th and 15th centuries.

Deir el-Qamar also has many buildings for worship – a mosque, a synagogue, and five churches and chapels belonging to different rites (Maronite, Greek Orthodox, and Greek Catholic) – reflecting the policy of religious tolerance adopted by Fakhreddine II.

Construction of the mosque began in 1493 and it was restored by Fakhreddine I for his Sokman mercenaries. It is the oldest mosque of Mount Lebanon, built in the Mameluke style. It has a vast square room with groined vaults resting on a massive pillar and an octagonal minaret. The blind arcade sculpted with interlacing has the kind of geometric motifs often used in Islamic art.

The synagogue, of the Maan period (17th century), was in ruins in 1900 but was restored in a somewhat fanciful manner. The Jewish community of Deir el-Qamar, probably founded in the 16th century, was mainly of Spanish origin. The community was well integrated in the life of the town and lived there until the mid 20th century.

The churches of Deir el-Qamar have a simple plan: a nave without side aisles. This type of plan is directly inspired by rural architectural tradition and displays the same austere exterior as the houses. The church of Saïdet el-Talle, built in the 5th century over an old Phoenician temple dedicated to the Moon, was destroyed by an earthquake in 859 and rebuilt during the reign Fakhreddine I. The building is enclosed in a convent of Maronite monks built in 1831. The old door of the original church was inserted in the facade overlooking the valley. It has a lintel in Byzantine style, adorned with a cross in relief and surmounted by an inverted crescent, the tips of which hold a rose.

- BEITEDDINE

Built on a rocky spur 850m high and overlooking the valley, the palace of Beiteddine is surrounded by gardens and terraces. This building is nearly 300m long and has a simple exterior. Italian engineers directed the works, which were carried out by local foremen and workers from Damascus, Aleppo, and Istanbul. Like other Ottoman palaces (Topkapı in Istanbul), several inner courtyards are placed along an axis (slightly broken in this case), revealing the hierarchy of their different functions. Details typical of Lebanese architecture are incorporated in this system of courtyards, such as the arched passage and the *iwan*.

The building is divided into three sections: the Dar el-Baranie (the external residence), the Dar el-Wousta (the

middle residence), and the Dar el-Harim (the private residence). Building began with the Dar el-Harim at the end of the 18th century and lasted until 1840 when the Dar el-Baranie was completed.

The entrance to the palace is through this last part. It is composed of a rectangular courtyard, 107m long by 45m wide, the *midane*, which is reached through a wide vaulted corridor. The *madafa*, a building where visiting guests were accommodated, closes the courtyard on the north side; the south side looks over the valley. The first courtyard was used for holding the crowds and organizing games.

Dar el-Wousta is reached by a monumental double staircase on the east side of the *midane*. It was used for dealing with official business and for big receptions. Built around a courtyard embellished with a basin and a water channel, it overlooks the valley on the south side. The offices of the secretaries of the Emir are in the north section. This part of the building, known as the Dar el-Kataba, has a facade with a double staircase and an arcade. The east wing contains the apartments of the sheikhs, the ceremonial rooms, and the offices of high officials, in particular that of the Minister Boutros Karami. This room is decorated with marble mosaics and delicately sculpted and painted woodwork. Wall fountains cool the rooms in the summer. The north-west corner of the courtyard has a wooden kiosk, a kind of open balcony from where the Emir watched certain events. The courtyard is closed on the west side by a facade marking the entrance to the Dar el-Harim, the private apartments of the Emir.

The private residence is entered through a gate decorated with mosaics of coloured marble and sculptures in *bouzennâr* stone. It is framed by a projecting arch resting on stone pillars in two colours and has two oculi. The southern part of the Dar el-Harim has an antechamber or room with a column, a reception room or *salamlek*, and the apartments of the Emir arranged around a small closed courtyard. The walls and floor of the antechamber are covered in different types of marble forming an inlaid pattern, plus motifs in stucco and finely carved stone. The ceiling is richly decorated with woodwork. The reception room, built on two levels, is decorated with sculptures, coloured marble mosaics, and panels ornamented with maxims in calligraphy. The traditional Damascus forms and techniques are easily recognizable here, especially the technique used for colour paste. The kitchens and the lower harem are located on the north side of the covered courtyard.

The middle part of the Dar el-Harim consists of an upper harem, reception rooms, and tribunal (*mahkamat*). The upper harem opens on to the courtyard of Dar el-Wousta through a passage with arches resting on fine pillars. A double staircase leads up to it.

The northern part of the Dar el-Harim is occupied by the *hammams*. Following the tradition of Roman baths, they are composed of a cold room (*frigidarium*), warm rooms (*tepidaria*), and hot rooms (*caldaria*). The cold room, used for resting, is a small construction covered by a dome, with a marble pool in the middle. The warm rooms were used for massage and served as a transition between the cold and hot sections of the baths. The floors are covered in marble. The Dar el-Wousta and the Dar el-Harim are built over vast vaulted rooms that once housed the stables.

The architectural composition of the Beiteddine palace has a wide variety of techniques, forms, colours, and materials, resulting in a blend of Eastern and Western stylistic features.

Management and protection

Legal status

The seraglio of Deir el-Qamar, the mosque of Fakhreddine I, the door of the palace of Fakhreddine II, and the palace of Ahmed Chehab were listed as historic monuments by Decree No 208 of 5 June 1934. The Deir el-Qamar square, the residences and palaces, and the old lanes in the historical area are also protected by Regulations No 166 of 7 November 1933 and No 225 of 28 September 1934. Presidential Decree No 2837 of 16 March 1945 designated the entire area, including the Maan and Chehab palaces of Deir el-Qamar, as a "listed site of historic monuments."

The palace of Beiteddine was listed as a "historical monument" on 5 June 1934.

Management

The monuments and residences of Deir el-Qamar belong to different private, public, and religious bodies –individual owners, the Department of Antiquities, the town council, the Moslem Wakf, the Greek Catholic Wakf, and the Mariamite Order of Maronites

The owners of monuments and sites are responsible for the protection, management, and maintenance of their properties. Several public authorities, including the Ministries of Culture, the Environment, and Tourism, supervise the management of private palaces.

Protective buffer zones around Deir el-Qamar have been established by the regional master plan, including recommendations relating to new constructions on empty plots of land. They do not take into consideration either the aesthetic aspect of the building or the urban fabric. In 1996 the municipal authorities of Deir el-Qamar developed, in collaboration with the Office of Regional Planning of the Chouf based in Beiteddine, a procedure for the "heritage control" of applications for building permits. This makes it possible to evaluate the inclusion of a building on the site, the aesthetics of the project, and the functional integration of a programme, and, if necessary, to modify or re-adapt certain projects in accordance with specific directives.

The first master plan for the town was promulgated in 1971 by Decree No 1770. It divides the town into different areas, subject to specific regulations. Area S, which covers the historic centre of the town, accounts for less than 1% of the total surface of Deir el-Qamar. The other areas, which are residential, residential and commercial, or devoted to tourism, sports, or industry, are spread around Area S. The Urban Planning Department, in collaboration with the town council of Deir el-Qamar, is at present revising this plan with a view to strengthening the protection of the historic centre and its surroundings.

The Beiteddine Palace belongs to the Lebanese State. Its management is the responsibility of the Department of Antiquities, which comes under the Ministry of Culture and appoints the Curator of the Palace. The Ministry of Finance and the town council of Beiteddine share the

revenues from the entry tickets to the site. The Ministry of Tourism is in charge of its tourist promotion

The Beiteddine Palace only became the responsibility of the Ministry of Culture in 1999, after having been under the civil administration of Walid Jumblatt during the war in Lebanon.

The town of Beiteddine also has a master plan, promulgated in 1971. However, no information was provided in the nomination dossier about the arrangements made for the management and conservation of the Palace.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

After Deir el-Qamar was stripped of its status as a capital on the removal of Bechir III it sank into a period of relative stagnation until recently. The fifteen years of war suffered by Lebanon isolated the town and pushed its inhabitants to flee. Paradoxically, the Department of Antiquities carried out major restoration works during this period. It cleared, refurbished, and restored the Midane Square and neighbouring palaces, using photographs and old plans as a guide. The shops, especially the souk of the butchers and part of the souk of the shoemakers, as well as the modern buildings on the Midane Square and around the mosque, were demolished. The walls of the mosque were strengthened. The fountain in the square was moved back to its original place and installed on the esplanade of the public square. The Kaissarie and the el-Kharge palace were restored and the staircase leading to the palace Fakhreddine II was rebuilt.

At present the seraglio houses the offices of the town council of Deir el-Qamar, the Kaissarie now accommodates a French cultural centre, and the palace of Fakhreddine II has been converted into a wax museum.

The churches were also restored in the 1980s and 1990s. These works were not always undertaken in an appropriate way, especially in the use of certain materials and from the stylistic point of view. A *mandaloun* was added to the facade of the synagogue, an unusual decorative feature for a religious building. After the war the inhabitants returned to the town and it started to develop once more. The municipality was obliged to strengthen the regulations controlling new buildings.

The Beiteddine Palace was damaged by a fire in 1912. The Department of Antiquities renovated the buildings after it was listed as a historic monument in 1934, and new restoration works were undertaken shortly after 1943, when the monument became the summer residence of the President of the Lebanese Republic. The palace was also damaged during the Lebanese war. From 1984 to 1990 the civil service set up by Walid Jumblatt financed works to restore and waterproof the buildings, costing some \$3.5 million. During the same period, a commemorative monument, the *Immortal Flame*, and a statue of Kamal Jumblatt were erected in the Dar el-Baranie.

The building is now home to several museums; the Kamal Jumblatt Museum near the main entrance, the archaeological and ethnographical museum on the first floor of the *madafa*, and a museum of Byzantine mosaics

in the former stables. Sizeable sums of money were also spent to enrich the collections of these museums.

Authenticity

The geographic location of Deir el-Qamar has helped to a certain extent to protect the monuments and residences of the town. Even though certain inappropriate materials, such as concrete, have been used and certain stylistic inconsistencies have been noted in the course of the restoration works, the degree of authenticity of the historical centre is high in terms of the urban fabric, materials used, design, and building techniques.

The Beiteddine Palace, standing on a rocky outcrop and surrounded by a defensive wall, is also well protected. The same applies to Deir el-Qamar, which has a high degree of authenticity in terms of the design of the building, as well as the materials and construction techniques used, although the square has been undermined by the erection of the commemorative monument.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the town of Deir el-Qamar and the palace of Beiteddine in February 2001.

Qualities

The town of Deir el-Qamar and the Palace of Beiteddine were the princely residences of the Lebanese Maan and Chehab Emirs during the Ottoman period. They form a homogeneous architectural ensemble that is characteristic of Lebanese architecture in the 17th, 18th, and 19th centuries, which skilfully integrated local designs and construction techniques with eastern and western components. Their geographic position in the Chouf mountains made it possible, to a certain extent, to preserve and protect them from ill-considered urban developments. They illustrate the determination of the Emirs Fakhreddine II and Bechir II to unify and encourage the co-existence of feudal families and religious Moslem, Druse, Christian, and Jewish communities in this part of the Near East.

Comparative analysis

From the stylistic point of view the monuments of Deir el-Qamar can be compared to certain 17th and 18th century residences in Damascus and Aleppo (eg the Jumblatt and Ajiqbach houses). The Beiteddine Palace can be compared to the palaces of Azem de Hama (1740) and Damascus (1749). Aleppo and Damascus were inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1979 and 1986 respectively.

However, the unusual nature of the residences of Deir el-Qamar and the Beiteddine Palace is due to the topography of the site, which dictates the orientation of the buildings. These face the valley and have to adapt to the uneven ground, by means of solid bases. The compact plan of the Azem Palace in Damascus contrasts with the open and elongated plan of the Beiteddine Palace. Moreover, the local features of these mountain residences predominate over the Ottoman style of architecture.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The historical centre of Deir el-Qamar and the Beiteddine Palace were proposed for inscription in 1983 and rejected by the World Heritage Committee because it felt that this cultural property did not meet the criterion of outstanding universal value. The present proposal for inscription, entitled "Ensemble of the natural site of the Chouf region with its monuments and sites" is, in fact, only a re-submission of the 1983 nomination under a different name.

The latter focused on the Beiteddine Palace and treated the two cultural properties independently and individually. The 1984 ICOMOS evaluation was accordingly based on the same principle. The present proposal for inscription restores the place of Deir el-Qamar by providing more detailed and comprehensive documentation on the town. Nevertheless, even though ICOMOS recognizes the cultural value of Deir el-Qamar and the Beiteddine Palace at national level, it has doubts as to the outstanding universal value of this ensemble.

Two comments arise directly from this observation. First, the State Party should be requested to provide a fuller and more detailed study to justify the outstanding universal value of the ensemble composed of the historic centre Deir el-Qamar and the Beiteddine Palace. Secondly, the present title of the nomination does not illustrate accurately the nature of the property proposed for inscription, and ICOMOS therefore suggests that it should revert to its earlier title.

The ICOMOS expert mission was able to discuss the revision of the master plan for the town of Deir el-Qamar with the authorities on the spot. It was stressed that the new master plan should incorporate certain proposals made by the mission organized in 1999, within the framework of assistance to the State Party for the preparation of the nomination dossier for Deir el-Qamar. The report of this mission emphasized the importance of increasing the surface of Area S by about 40% and of adopting a detailed conservation plan. ICOMOS feels these points should be taken into consideration when finalizing the master plan. It suggests that this last phase should be undertaken in close collaboration with the Department of Antiquities and that Areas E and E1, consisting of the two slopes opposite Beiteddine and Deir el-Qamar, should be subject to specific regulations preventing construction in this area, especially south of the river

ICOMOS notes that there are certain gaps in the nomination dossier relating to the management and the state of conservation of the Beiteddine Palace, and to the plans and boundaries of the two properties. In fact, the dossier indicates that the historic area of Deir el-Qamar corresponds to Area S of the master plan for the town, and that the buffer zones correspond with Areas E and E1. A preliminary master plan drawn up in 1996 was provided, but it does not correspond in an adequate and coherent way to a boundary plan for the area proposed for inscription and the buffer zone of Deir el-Qamar. Nor is such a document included for the Beiteddine Palace. It would be desirable for the State Party to provide such boundary plans while at the same time studying the creation of a buffer zone common to both properties.

Recommendation

ICOMOS recommends that the proposal for inscription be *deferred* to enable the State Party to prepare a justification of the outstanding universal value of the ensemble formed by the two properties, to finalize the master plan for Deir el-Qamar taking the above comments into consideration, to provide detailed information on the management plan and state of conservation of the Beiteddine Palace, and to draw up a boundary plan for the areas proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List, as well as the buffer zones for the two properties.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Ambohimanga (Madagascar)

No 950

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga
<i>Location</i>	Municipality of Ambohimanga Rova, Province of Antananarivo Avaradrano
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Madagascar
<i>Date</i>	7 July 2000

Justification by State Party

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga provides an exceptional witness to the civilization which developed on the Hautes Terres Malgaches between the 15th and 19th centuries, and to the cultural and spiritual traditions, the cult of Kings and Ancestors, which were closely associated there.

Criterion iii

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga provides an outstanding example of an architectural ensemble (*Le Rova*) and an associated cultural landscape (wood and sacred lakes) illustrating significant phases in the history of the islands in the Indian Ocean between the 16th and 19th centuries.

Criterion iv

The countryside of the Royal Hill of Ambohimanga is associated with historic events (the historic site of the unification of Madagascar) and living beliefs (ancestor worship), giving it an exceptional universal value.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. In term of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, para 39, it is also a *cultural landscape*.

History and Description

History

The growth in Madagascar of a fragmented political structure based on local lords meant that, from the 15th century onwards, defensible hills were in demand for

the construction of *rova* or fortified royal enclosures (analogous to hillforts in western Europe during the 1st millennium BC). On the summits, woodland was kept for practical and spiritual reasons but the forest on lower ground was cleared to provide the economic base for such places to exist. Agricultural terraces were also constructed on the lower hill-slopes. In effect, the cultural landscape was in place by the 16th century. The only major change since then has been the removal of upland forest on the neighbouring heights to Ambohimanga during the French colonial period.

Ambohimanga itself originated in at least the 15th century and by the 18th century, particularly under Andriantsimitoviaminandriana (1740–45), had developed into a capital with defences and seven gates. Outer defences and seven more gates were added, probably before 1794 when the royal palace was moved to Antananarivo, leaving Ambohimanga as the royal burial place and religious capital. The existing defensive wall was built by Queen Ranavalona I (1828–61), with new gateways to north and south-west (c 1830). The palace *Fandriampahalemana* and the glass pavilion *Tranofitaratra* were added in 1871.

In March 1897 the mortal remains of royalty were transferred to Antananarivo by the French colonial authorities in a failed attempt to erase the holiness of the site and the nationalistic legitimacy attached to it. The royal tombs were demolished and military buildings erected in their stead for the garrison on the site. By 1904, all trace of them, in their turn, had been removed. The site continued to be used for religious purposes, particularly as a pilgrimage destination, throughout the 20th century, and remains an active holy place today.

Description

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga consists of a royal city, a burial site (royal tombs), and a collection of sacred places (wood, spring, lake, public meeting place). It is associated with strong feelings of identity, emphasizing its sacred character, which continues into the present in popular recognition. It is a pilgrimage destination within Madagascar and internationally (Ivato international airport lies 10km to the west). In addition, it possesses an architectural quality in its groups of buildings and an ecological value in its natural ecosystems which conserve numerous species of indigenous plants. The site is inhabited by some 900 people, with about 2000 in the buffer zone.

The whole can be considered as an assemblage of ten *sous-ensembles*:

1. *The Hill*, rising to 1468m above the plain at an altitude of about 1300m, carries residual forest cover which masks numerous archaeological remains and shelters the royal city.

2. *The fortifications* protected the royal city in an arrangement of banks, ditches, and 14 stone gateways. The outer seven were built in 1787; the inner seven, interspersed around a 2.5km circuit, date to the early 18th century. Doors were large, thick and up to 12 tonnes in weight – very much status symbols. Use of these gateways was carefully regulated.

3. *The fortified royal city (Le Rova)* originated in the 15th century and developed in the 17th and 18th centuries. Contained within an enclosure, it consists of a

coherent suite of buildings and provides a place for public functions. Called *Le Fidasiانا*, it was where sovereign and subject met in the shade of royal fig-trees. Royal pronouncements were made from a holy stone; nearby was a sacrificial stone. The space was ritually divided e.g. the eastern sector was the sacred area, for ancestor worship and royal burial. Two holy, rock-cut basins, filled with water by young virgins, played a significant role, particularly at the time of the annual royal 'fête du Bain'. Royal corpses rested in a wooden mortuary house, *Tranomanara*, en route to the royal tombs whence royalty, as ancestors, continued to exercise powers of protection and punishment over the living from inside a holy place enclosed by a wooden fence coloured in white and red, the holy colours of Imerina royalty. There, eleven sovereigns rested in tombs surmounted by small wooden houses, *Tranamara*, until, in an abortive attempt to break the power of both the ancestors and the site itself, the French colonial authorities moved the regal mortal remains to Antananarivo in March 1897.

4. *The royal trees* are species of *Ficus* and *Draceana* sp., specifically reserved to royal cities, apparently since 1540.

5. *The seat of justice*, on a huge spherical, granite rock in the northern sector, is surrounded by a brick balustrade and shaded by a royal fig tree with stone steps surrounding its trunk. Here Andrianampoinimerina was proclaimed king and dispensed justice.

6. *Other holy places*, natural and constructed, exist both inside and outside the royal enclosure.

7. *The holy spring* is natural and always flowing, exiting through two orifices beneath a drystone cover. Its water is regarded as purifying.

8. *The holy lake of Amparihy* is artificial, its use being confined to royalty and ritual, such as the annual royal bath, princely circumcision, and the receipt of royal entrails. The bath is particularly symbolic, for then the king takes upon himself all the sins of the kingdom and, in ritually cleansing himself, both purifies his subjects and enables nature to regenerate.

9. *The sacred woods* consist of indigenous plants and, in a manner now absolutely rare on the *Hautes Terres*, represents in residual form the natural forest which once covered this and other hills. It has survived because it was always in the royal domain, managed under strict regulations. Attempts are in train to eradicate alien species introduced since the end of the 19th century.

10. *The agricultural terraces* developed during the 17th–18th centuries on the north and south of the hill, extending the royal power into economic matters and representing on the lower slopes of a holy hill agricultural production of rice, the staple food of the local population. The higher terraces are dry, the lower ones are in effect stepped rice paddy-fields.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The area of the proposed World Heritage site belongs largely to the State. Private individuals own some

agricultural plots, houses and gardens, and family tombs, a situation which has existed since the end of the 19th century.

In general, the legal provisions and regulations (details are provided in the nomination dossier) are adequate, but a special point is being made to the authorities to try to ensure that their implementation is both vigorous and rigorous, not least in the buffer zone. The sacred nature of the site affords it a strong guarantee of protection in some respects, for the hill is an object of popular veneration.

Management

Site management is provided by a Site Committee made up of national and local representatives, with a small permanent staff on site. Its responsibility is to manage according to the Management Plan, giving special emphasis to maintenance and preventative conservation, promotion, education, and publicity. It is advised by a Scientific Committee, particularly in respect of the maintenance of the site's integrity and authenticity. Another Committee is currently charged with revising the Management Plan, and will revise it periodically thereafter.

Locally, and day-to-day, the Municipality of Ambohimanga and the Museum Service (Directorate of Cultural Heritage) are responsible for the management and security of the site. Professionals from the Service visit the site regularly. Nine guards during the day and three at night provide on-site security. In total, 21 people are employed on site.

Finance is provided nationally via the Mayor's office, and from 60% of entrance fees received. Annual expenses are of the order of US\$113,000; gate receipts US\$20,000. External grants have been obtained for both restoration work and publicity.

An important role is played by non-governmental bodies (NGOs), notably MAMALOMASO and MIKOLO. Most of the restoration work, for example on the gates, stone-paved roads, and holy fountain, are undertaken by them with respect to appropriate standards of work. They are also involved in significant fund-raising, and play an important role in the dialogue between local inhabitants and other interested parties. With national and local authorities, universities and conservation professionals, and local people, the NGOs participate in the co-operative management of the site through the three Committees enumerated above.

Visitor numbers have risen from 34,000 to 41,000 (c 20%) between 1995 and 1999 (4% annually on average, though in fact there was a slump in 1996–98). Foreign tourists now number c12 000 a year, having risen by c 30% since 1995 (again after a slump). The site can take c 1000 visitors per day or 120 per hour; in 1999 the average was 187 visitors daily, but much higher numbers were recorded on some days in May 1999. Some visitor wear-and-tear has been noted and preventive measures are being considered.

Pressures on the site appear to be minimal. There is concern about the gradual degradation of the countryside, but more obvious threats from development seem to be almost non-existent. A buffer zone is nevertheless proposed, primarily to keep the long-term threat of urbanization at bay. Fire is the main

day-to-day risk, and steps are in hand to improve on-site precautions.

Both the proposed site itself (59ha), and its buffer zone (425ha) are well defined and realistic.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Ambohimanga owes its state of preservation to the fact that it remained the religious capital and burial place of the royal family until 1896 and has continued to be revered and respected since. The removal of the mortal remains of royalty in 1897 was followed soon afterwards by the destruction of the tombs and the construction of temporary military buildings, removed by 1904. The place retained, however, as it continues to do, its feeling of sanctity, with a lawn now growing where the tombs once stood.

A programme of positive maintenance and restoration began in 1996 and has resulted in a satisfactory state of conservation. The nomination dossier details the state of each of the gateways, the defences, the footpaths, the royal city itself (including the palace and glass pavilion), the sacred places, and the natural resources (including the royal trees and sacred woods). While much work remains to be done, with a need above all for continuous maintenance, overall the situation is in hand. This was found to be the case by the ICOMOS mission.

Authenticity and integrity

The site possesses an exceptional universal value as a place representing the political aspirations of an indigenous people and representative of other iconographic places in the world where long-term historic, cultural, and spiritual values coalesce on the same spot. It is highly valued by the people of Madagascar and additionally, in the World Heritage context, provides an excellent example of one of those places in the world which have commanded peoples' veneration and respect through numerous vicissitudes over several centuries. Today it is apparently appreciated by an increasing number of visitors.

Ambohimanga has lost one of its principal functions, as a centre of political power, and it is no longer used for royal burial (but that is the result of the political process, and not Ambohimanga's fault); it has also lost the original royal tombs. There are, however, no inappropriate additions on site, and only one intrusive addition nearby (which is being dealt with). Overall, it is physically in good shape, with a reasonable degree of integrity despite the considerable range of its constituent parts.

It also possesses a high degree of authenticity. In this respect, its signal attribute is that, despite political moves to degrade the nature of the site, the hill has maintained its sacred nature and the respect of the people, somehow managing to transfer its qualities from the political context of a kingdom to that of a republic.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

It has been intended that a joint IUCN/ICOMOS mission should visit the site in January 2001 but, through force of circumstances, the mission was carried out almost completely by ICOMOS alone.

Qualities

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga constitutes the most characteristic and most representative example of this type of site in Madagascar. It is an historic place, containing clear archaeological evidence of the former exercise of power and justice while marking the independence of the modern state of Madagascar. At the same time it is a holy place, recalling past kings and revisiting them as ancestors.

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga bears a remarkable witness to, on the one hand, eastern Asiatic cultures through the cult of ancestors and in agricultural practices, notably rice-growing by irrigation and on terraces, and, on the other, to eastern and southern African cultures through the cult of royalty.

Comparative analysis

No other comparable property is inscribed on the World Heritage List and no study of such sites has yet been undertaken in a World Heritage context. However, the tombs of the Baganda Kings at Kasubi (Uganda), which is nominated for 2001, is a comparable site with, as at Ambohimanga, qualities based on hill-top location, royal residence, royal burial, ancestor worship, and a sanctity linked to group identity continuing into the present.

The nomination claims that the combination of material and spiritual in the context of a cultural landscape developed in Madagascar following the integration of cultural influences from eastern Asia and eastern Africa. This was effected in a particular geographic and biological context which allowed the inhabitants of the *Hautes Terres Centrales* of Madagascar to express a close relationship between the natural setting and the elements of power, between authority and the sacred. The expression took the form of the double cult of ancestors and royalty.

A number of other similar sites exist in Madagascar. Ambohimanga is the one which best preserves its integrity and spiritual significance. A visit to the site by an outsider brings to mind, in a completely different context, the atmosphere of the Shin-to shrines of Isé in Japan.

Similar sites in Africa in general testify to a relationship between the natural heritage and sanctity in a context of mythology and cosmology embedded in spirituality. While such African holy sites are frequently associated with ancestor worship, they are not generally linked to local secular power. Their function and significance are therefore different to those of the royal sites of the *Hautes Terres Centrales* in Madagascar. (However, the site of Kasubi in Uganda, referred to above, would seem to be an exception to this generalization.)

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The Royal Hill of is a significant and well-run site, highly regarded in Madagascar. ICOMOS wishes to make the following observations:

- i. While adequate statutory protection is in place on paper, it is crucial that its provisions be implemented and that the Management Plan be followed, monitored, and revised from time to time.
- ii. It is particularly important for as much support as is actually needed, in terms of both visible encouragement as well as financial and other resources, to be given to the managers and on-site personnel by the relevant authorities.
- iii. The particular threat on this site is from fire and so it is imperative that appropriate fire precautions measures, with an adequate water supply, are installed, implemented, and regularly tested.
- iv. Inscription, if implemented, is likely to encourage tourists to a site where, at the moment, visitor management is well controlled. The consequences of increased numbers, and probably in particular high numbers at predictable times, should be anticipated in terms of site management.

Brief description

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga consists of a royal city, a royal burial site, and an ensemble of sacred places. It is associated with strong feelings of national identity, and has maintained its spiritual ambience and sacred character in both practice and popular respect over some five hundred years up to the present. It remains a place of worship and a place of pilgrimage from within and outside Madagascar.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii, iv, and vi*:

The Royal Hill of Ambohimanga is of great significance to the people of Madagascar as a place vital in their political development yet at the same time of great religious meaning. As such, the Royal Hill of Ambohimanga is also of global significance as an excellent example of a place where, over centuries, so much of the common human experience comes to be focussed in memory and aspiration, in ritual and prayer.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Alto Douro (Portugal)

No 1046

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Alto Douro Wine Region
<i>Location</i>	Douro Region, Trás-os-Montes e Alto Douro
<i>State Party</i>	Portugal
<i>Date</i>	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Alto Douro represents a unique example of people's relationship with the natural environment: it is a monumental combined work of nature and man. First, the river dug deeply into the mountains to form its bed. Then people adapted the steep hillsides for the cultivation of the vine. Using methods and means acquired over the ages, they scarified the land and built terraces supported by hundreds of kilometres of drystone walls. With great acumen and creative genius, they mastered the physical constraints of the natural environment and exploited the opportunities presented by the climate and the nature of the soil. Thus was born one of the most ancient winemaking regions in the world, one that produces a universally acclaimed wine designated "Porto."

The justifications for the inscription that we feel are most relevant, are:

Natural elements: the narrow valleys, the steep slopes; the paucity of water, the scant rainfall; the diversity of natural habitats, the transition from the Atlantic to the Mediterranean; select Mediterranean crops: grapes, olives, and almonds; the ephemeral: light and colour, sound and silence and smells

Cultural elements: land-use: the structure of the landscape, the dominant vineyards, the human settlements and the fabricated soil, or anthroposoil; access (the river Douro and the railway); cultural landmarks (the *quintas* and the *casais*); religious structures; and the walls.

The boundaries of the nominated property define the exact territory that is simultaneously 1. truly representative of the nature of the Demarcated Douro Region and its three sub-regions, from the most Atlantic to the most Mediterranean, 2. most consistently enclosed the majority of the most significant assets, and 3. best preserved overall.

The Alto Douro's claim of outstanding international value is further supported by three of the six cultural criteria:

Alto Douro exhibits an important interchange of human values over a span of time within a specific cultural area. The property is a continuing, organically evolved cultural landscape, truly representative of the Demarcated Douro Region. It reflects specific techniques of sustainable land-use, those of both the past and the present, alongside a set of significant natural habitats typical of a Mediterranean environment.

Criterion ii

Alto Douro is an outstanding example of a technological landscape that illustrates several significant stages in human history. Here, in spite of nature's hostility to human settlement, man adapted Mediterranean crops, particularly vines and olive and almond trees, and planted them on terraces fashioned from the steep rocky slopes. Changes in the several methods employed over the centuries are evident in the landscape.

Criterion iv

Alto Douro is an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement and land-use that has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change. Although its geomorphological nature and its climate do not invite human settlement, the vine – as well as the olive, the almond, other fruits and cereals – has sustained a dynamic economic activity.

Criterion v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. In terms of the definition in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, para. 39, it is also a *cultural landscape*.

History and Description

History

Recent archaeological discoveries have revealed the presence of very ancient human settlements in the more sheltered valleys of the Douro and its tributaries and in neighbouring mountains. The great many Palaeolithic rock carvings found in the extreme eastern area of the Demarcated Douro Region between the valleys of the rivers Côa and Águeda and Douro represent a cultural aggregate that itself is of outstanding universal value.

Seeds of *Vitis vinifera* have recently been found at the 3–4 thousand year old Buraco da Pala Chalcolithic archaeological site near Mirandela. However, the more significant relics of viticulture and winemaking that have been uncovered date to the Roman occupation and particularly to the end of the Western Empire (3rd and 4th centuries AD). At the beginning of the Christian era, the Romans redefined all the land-use and restructured the economic activities in the entire valley of the Douro. From the 1st century onwards, they either introduced or promoted cultivation of vines, olive trees and cereals (the "cultural trilogy of Mediterranean agriculture"), exploited the numerous sources of mineral water, mined minerals and ore, and built roads and bridges. One of the most important rural sanctuaries in Europe (Panóias, near Vila Real) shows traces of native, Roman, and oriental religious cults.

From the beginning of the Middle Ages, until just before the birth of Portugal as a nation in the 12th century, the valley of the Douro was ruled in turn by the Suevi (5th

century), the Visigoths (6th century), and the Moors (8th–11th centuries). This opening of the region to a communion of assorted, continuously overlapping, cultures is reflected in the traditional collective imagination. The victory of the Christians over the Moors in Iberia does not appear to have interrupted the Douro valley's long-standing tradition of interracial cross-breeding and cultural acceptance.

The valley continued to be occupied. Viticulture increased during a period of the establishment and growth of several religious communities whose importance to the economy was especially noteworthy from the mid-12th century onwards, namely the Cistercian monasteries of Salzedas, São João de Tarouca, and São Pedro das Águias. They invested in extensive vineyards in the best areas and created many notable *quintas*. The end of the Middle Ages saw an increase in population, agriculture, and commercial exchange as towns and cities grew, particularly walled towns such as Miranda and Porto. Long-distance trade flourished, namely the shipping of products from the region down river to the city of Porto, linked with the major European trading routes. The rising demand for strong wine to supply the armadas led to a new expansion of the regional vineyards, particularly in those areas that were rapidly becoming famous for the quality of their wine.

From the 16th century onwards, the making of quality wines for commercial purposes assumed an increasing importance. Viticulture continued to expand throughout the 17th century, accompanied by advances in the techniques for producing wines and increased involvement in European markets for wine. The first reference to "Port Wine," in a shipping document of wine for Holland, dates to 1675. This period marked the onset of a great volume of trade with England that benefited greatly from the wars between Britain and France. Port rapidly dominated the British market for wine, overtaking those from France, Spain, and Italy. The 1703 Treaty of Methuen between Portugal and England set the diplomatic seal of approval on this trade and granted preferential rights to Portuguese wines. Throughout the 18th century, the fact that the sale of fortified wines from the Douro depended on the British market was reflected by adapting the product to the taste of this market and, at the same time, by a rapid increase in the number of British wine merchants. The British Factory House was founded in Porto in 1727.

Conflicts arose between these commercial interests and the Douro farmers. The latter were forced to accept continuously lower prices, together with the demand for darker, stronger, sweeter wines with a higher alcohol content. The State therefore regulated the production and trade of this vital economic product, initially with the creation, by Royal Charter on 10 September 1756, of the *Companhia Geral da Agricultura das Vinhas do Alto Douro*. The productive region was formally marked out. Its entire perimeter around the vineyards was carefully demarcated by 335 large rectangular, flat, or semi-circular granite markers. The word *FEITORIA* and the date on which each was placed *in situ* (usually 1758, occasionally 1761), was carved on the side facing the road.

This first demarcation represents an early manifestation of unmistakably contemporary practices. It included making an inventory and classifying the vineyards and their respective wines according to the complexity of the region. It created institutional mechanisms for controlling and

certifying the product, supported by a vast legislative framework.

The first demarcation enveloped the traditional wine-growing area, mainly in the Lower Corgo. Not until 1788–92 did the vineyards expand to the Upper Douro. The surge of commercial vineyards eastwards of the gorge, however, only occurred following epidemics of diseases of the vines (especially oidium in 1852 and phylloxera in 1863) that devastated the vines in the traditional wine-growing areas. The regime that relaxed control over production and trade (1865–1907), and the construction of the Douro railway line (1873–87) encouraged this expansion. When in 1907 the State undertook a profound revision of the legislation regulating the winemaking sector, the new demarcation covered the entire area under vines, including the Upper Douro, as far as the Spanish border.

Concurrently, in 1876, Douro farmers began to recover the vineyards that had been damaged by phylloxera. As throughout Europe, the definitive solution only appeared with the introduction of American rootstock on which domestic varieties of vines were grafted. Recovery of Douro viticulture and the introduction of new techniques for planting and training the vines has had a significant impact on the landscape due to the construction of wider *socalcos* with taller and more geometric walls that are distinctly different from the narrow pre-phylloxera terraces and their lower, tortuous walls.

Throughout the 20th century the Demarcated Douro Region has been subject to several regulatory models. The Interprofessional Committee for the Demarcated Douro Region (CIRDD) was instituted in 1995. The principal regulatory mechanism for production continues to be the system for distributing the *benefício*, according to which the amount of must that is authorized for making Port Wine is allocated according to the characteristics and quality of the respective vines. Mechanization was introduced, somewhat hesitantly, in the 1970s to help with some of the more arduous tasks in the vineyard such as the scarifying of the land and bringing with it new wide, earth-banked vineyards and "vertical planting" along steeper hillsides that no longer require building walls to shore up the terraces. The aesthetic impact of these new vineyards on the landscape varies, yet the mountain viticulture of the Douro continues to be carried out almost totally by hand. The rocky nature of the soil, the steep hillsides, and the existing terraces themselves are extremely difficult to adapt to the use of machines; though the product, port wine, is today mostly made in modern, totally mechanized wineries.

Description

Protected from the harsh Atlantic winds by the Marão and Montemuro mountains, the nominated property is located in the north-east of Portugal, between Barqueiros and Mazouco, on the Spanish border. The Mediterranean climate in this landscape of schist and steep hills far from the sea, adds a unique flavour to the feeling of *genius loci*. The popular saying about it is: "Nine months of winter and three months of hell."

The terraces, by blending into infinity with the curves of the countryside, endow this property with its unique character. Seen from above, the vineyards look like a series of Aztec pyramids.

The Douro and its principal tributaries, the Varosa, Corgo, Távora, Torto, and Pinhão, form the backbone of the nominated property, itself defined by a succession of watersheds. The Douro itself is dammed, so its valley through the property now contains a long reservoir 100–200m wide. However, although this change is important from the ecological and visual points of view, the flooded part of the valley was neither occupied nor cultivated. The boundaries correspond to identifiable natural features of the landscape – watercourses, mountain ridges, roads, and paths.

The area of nominated property is:

Alto Douro Wine Region	24,600ha
Buffer zone	225,400ha
Demarcated Douro Region	250,000ha

The landscape in the Demarcated Region of the Douro is formed by steep hills and boxed-in valleys that flatten out into plateaux above 400m. The Douro valley is now water-filled behind dams. Valley sides slope at over 15%, particularly in the Lower and the Upper Corgo. Soil is almost non-existent, which is why walls were built to retain the manufactured soil on the steep hillsides. It has been created literally by breaking up rocks and is known as “anthroposoil.”

The most dominant feature of the landscape is the terraced vineyards that blanket the countryside. Throughout the centuries, row upon row of terraces have been built according to different techniques. The earliest, employed during the pre-phylloxera era (pre-1860), was that of the *socalcos*, narrow and irregular terraces buttressed by walls of schistous stone that were regularly taken down and rebuilt, on which only one or two rows of vines could be planted.

The long lines of continuous, regularly shaped terraces date mainly from the end of the 19th century when the Douro vineyards were rebuilt, following the phylloxera attack. The new terraces altered the landscape, not only because of the monumental walls that were built but also owing to the fact that they were wider and slightly sloping to ensure that the vines would be better exposed to the sun. Furthermore, these terraces were planted with a greater number of rows of vines, set more widely apart, in order to favour the use of more technical equipment such as mule-drawn ploughs. The great majority of the hundreds of kilometres of walls that cover the riverbanks today date from that late 19th/early 20th century stage in the evolution of the Douro landscape. In the Lower and Upper Corgo a great many post-phylloxera terraced vineyards represent up to 50% of all the area under vine in each parish. Transforming the natural environment, clearing the land, and restructuring the hillsides required a great of labour that was brought in from outside.

The more recent terracing techniques, the *patamares*, and the vertical planting that began in the 1970s have greatly altered the appearance of this built landscape. Large plots of slightly sloping earth-banked land, usually planted with two rows of vines, were laid out to facilitate mechanization of the vineyard. Trials of other systems are continuing with a view to finding alternatives to the *patamares* and to minimize the impact of the new methods on the landscape. Among the expanse of vineyards remain areas, nevertheless, which have survived untouched since the days of the phylloxera, abandoned *socalcos* known as

mortórios. These have become overrun with native scrub or olive trees. More continuous, regular olive groves have been planted on either side of the land under vine. In the Upper Douro, olive and almond trees represent the dominant crops, although these are slowly being replaced by vines. Along the lower banks of the Douro or on the edges of watercourses on the hillsides are groves of orange trees, sometimes walled. On the heights, beyond that altitude at which vines can grow, the land is covered with brushwood and scrub and, here and there, a coppice of trees. Woods are still to be found in places on the ridges and amongst the crags.

During the long, hot, dry summers that afflict the region, water used to be collected in underground catchments located on the hills or even within a vineyard. From there it was channelled along stone gutters to storage tanks, usually made of granite, scattered throughout the *quinta*. In contrast, the winter rain gushes down the hills in torrents, so underground conduits and drainpipes attached to the top of retaining walls try to prevent it destroying the *socalcos*.

Grain-mills stood next to the watercourses but there are few settlements in such a disease-ridden location. Above, characteristically white-walled villages, medieval in origin, and *casais* are usually located midway up the valley sides. Around an often imposing 18th century parish church, rows of houses opening directly on to the street to form a web of narrow, twisty roads with notable examples of vernacular architecture, now occasionally tarnished by inappropriate recent building. The Douro *quintas* are major landmarks, easily identified by the groups of farm buildings and wineries that crowd around the main house. Although notably present throughout the region, they are particularly evident in the Upper Corgo and the Upper Douro.

No churches or shrines of any significant value lie in the nominated property, although the landscape is dotted with small chapels located high on the hills or next to manor houses. Some chapels and shrines were erected on the site of ancient settlements, usually hillforts. Furthermore, Douro folklore is a compendium of tales and legends that associate elements of Celtic, Arab, and Christian culture.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The cultural landscape of the Alto Douro is community property. The various elements that make up this landscape, however, are generally privately owned by a great many individuals, mostly local residents. Today, 48,000ha of vines are distributed over more than 100,000 plots, as well as many tens of thousands of hectares of olive groves and other crops.

The region does not enjoy a specific juridical protective statute, as Portuguese jurisprudence makes no mention of cultural landscapes. The instruments governing the land-use and protection of the landscape are the Municipal Master Plans, created under the terms of Decree-Law No 69 of 1990. All such Plans for all the townships in the municipalities in the Demarcated Douro Region are fully in force. These plans consist of three essential sections: the general cartographic map, the updated map of restrictions, and the regulations. It is now up to the Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region to integrate the various plans.

Management

Management interventions in the Demarcated Douro Region have rapidly increased over the past few years as it has come to be realized that increasing pressures require active management to preserve and safeguard the landscape over and above its function of producing wine. The regime currently regulating the region, as fine-tuned over the centuries, is centred on regulating, licensing, and controlling planting and cultivation of the vineyards. The process of progressively regulating local supervision and management of the land has culminated with the approval, during the 1990s, of the Municipal Master Plans. These are centralized and uniform instruments for regulating and managing the use and occupation of the land, at the county level.

Key elements are:

- The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region (PIOT), directed at conserving and improving the living, evolving cultural landscape;
- Alto Douro Bureau, consisting of a technical management assistance staff, who will act in close co-operation with an Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage;
- The Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage, an entity devoted to encouraging private and public entities interested and/or involved in the ownership of assets, in preserving, safeguarding, improving and promoting the Alto Douro.

Responsibility for the management of the territory and the management and protection of its territorial assets and local infrastructures rests with the municipalities. The proposed property covers thirteen municipalities, plus an additional eight that are part of the buffer zone. Responsibility for the management of the vineyards and all agricultural and forestry land, as well as private buildings, rests with their owners.

When it is created, the Alto Douro Bureau will undertake to safeguard and protect the cultural landscape of the Alto Douro by co-ordinating the technical management assistance that is given at a local level, in direct collaboration with the municipalities and the Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage.

Several EU-based plans currently in force directly address the Alto Douro landscape. Municipal Master Plans exist for each of the eight municipalities in the buffer zone and several Urban Plans, namely for the county seats. Furthermore, three major Plans are currently in the final stages of their preparation: the Plans for the Carrapatelo Reservoir, the Bagaúste Reservoir, and the River Douro River Basin. The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region is expected to be concluded by the end of 2001.

Finance, and the resources funding makes available, come from a mixture of European, state, and local sources. It is anticipated that current programmes will be completed and similar funding will enable similar programmes to continue in future. The PRODOURO Programme (1996–99), for example, will continue from 2000 to 2006 through the Third Community Support Framework. Similarly, the Operational Economic Programme will undoubtedly, as part of the section for tourism, aim to strengthen the Douro's position as an alternative tourist destination.

The process involved in nominating the Alto Douro for the List of World Properties has itself stimulated interest in developing facilities for tourism. This will most probably result in the creation of an Integrated Structural Programme for Regional Tourism in the Alto Douro that will supply a structure for the many private and public projects for tourism to be developed in the region over the next few years. In effect, some of these projects have already been put into practice, such as the Port Wine Route, Medieval Routes, and the Route of the Romanesque, Tourist and Historic Trains of the Douro, among others. The flow of visitors to the region, although significant, is attenuated by the size of the property and, according to the nomination, has so far not created any major problems (though four are incidentally explicit and others well known elsewhere, are implicit), but there is no serious discussion of the likely nature of an expanded tourism or of its long-term impact on the character of the area and on management requirements.

The Alto Douro already offers some facilities for visitors, such as Municipal Tourist Bureaux. It is, however, essential that the Alto Douro Wine Region Landscape Management Programme address the creation of an integrated network of all these services. From the viewpoint of the tourist market, the Douro has gradually acquired a degree of national and international fame as a new destination, and the number of visitors is consistently rising at 10–20 % per annum. Cruises to the Douro Valley, for example, are attracting 100,000 users annually; Mateus Palace is attracting 40,000 visitors/year; the Festival of Our Lady of Remedy, Lamego, attracts 10,000 visitors. Local promoters have substantially increased the local hotel facilities, especially at the top of the range. Existing structures can, however, support a sustained growth in tourism if all-year-round use is promoted.

The principal objectives of the Alto Douro Wine Region Landscape Management Programme are to improve the landscape and its patrimonial assets, minimize all interference with the landscape, and raise the quality of the environment and the standard of living in the area. It includes schemes, for example, to improve features of the landscape such as walls and terraces, to survey the heritage, to stimulate rural activities such as crafts, to facilitate the reception of visitors, to organize festivals and country fairs, and, under "Research and Development, Education, Training and Support," to provide local courses on how to interpret the landscape. The Plan also entails the Alto Douro Bureau's implementation of more specific management and conservation tasks, including monitoring. The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region will reveal and formulate a series of relevant steps to monitor the state of conservation of the landscape. Amongst the principal indicators, the physical ones are the most noteworthy: the walls and their state of conservation, the methods for creating vineyards, the associated planing of other crops, the trees that are used to edge properties with vertical vines, the elimination or reduction of intrusions on the landscape, and the registration and conservation of the vernacular heritage.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation as a "heritage concept" has scarcely been carried out in this area until recently. With everything

subordinate to wine-growing, functional need has driven maintenance. As a result, the state of conservation of the Alto Douro, in particular of the majority of supporting walls, is remarkably good, and clearly superior to that of the buffer zone. There, although a considerable amount of land under vine in *quintas* and *casais* and considerable vernacular heritage exist, the settlements in particular have suffered the loss of much of their original character.

Authenticity and integrity

The cultural landscape of the Alto Douro is an outstanding example of humankind's unique relationship with the natural environment. Its nature is determined by wise management of limited land and water resources on extremely steep slopes. It is the outcome of permanent and intense observation, of local testing, and of the profound knowledge of how to adapt the culture of the vine to such extremely unfavourable conditions. The landscape is an expression of people's courage and determination, of their acumen and creative genius in understanding the cycle of the water and the materials, and of their intense, and almost passionate, attachment to the vine. The setting, in the landscape of several forms of training the vines, is an outstanding example of human ability to master physical constraints, here actually creating the soil and building an immense and extensive construct of buttressed *socalcos*. It is this acumen that enabled a multitude of anonymous artists to create a collective work of land art.

This landscape, however, is a whole and it is in constant evolution, now with new terrace-forms reflecting the availability of new technology. It is a diverse mosaic of crops, groves, watercourses, settlements, and agricultural buildings, arranged as *quintas* (large estates) or *casais* (small landholdings). Today they maintain the landscape's active social role in perpetuating a prosperous and sustainable economy. Popular identification with the Region is reinforced by the congruence between its area now and that of the original demarcation.

The Alto Douro Wine Region has, and undoubtedly always had, a different meaning according to the perspective of each interest group. It is not looked at in the same manner by the parishioner who lives in the middle of the vineyard that has shaped his horizon since birth and which provides his sole source of income, or by the man from the mountain who remembers the days when the *roga* joyfully descended the hills to the *Terra Quente* to spend a few weeks working for the vintage. The Douro equally belongs to the small shopkeepers and middlemen in the region, to the owners of the *quintas* – both Portuguese and foreign – who stay there at different times in the year, to the shippers in the Douro and in Vila Nova de Gaia who are engaged in the wine trade, and to all those people in Portugal and the world over who have learnt to celebrate each great moment in their lives or in the destiny of nations with a glass of port wine.

Yet the man-made landscape of so many significances is visibly there, a series of impressive views but also a seriously complex machine, still working. The Alto Douro is of outstanding universal value both as a monumental construct in a demanding environment and as the unique setting for an exceptional product. The general state of preservation of this historic landscape is good. Alterations do exist, but they do not seem of sufficient importance to impair its integrity. Some terraces suffered badly during torrential rain in the later part of January 2001, and a

special effort will be needed to restore parts of vineyards to working order.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Alto Douro in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted the ICOMOS-IFLA International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Landscapes.

Qualities

The landscape is visually dramatic, a very unnatural creation. It is witness to the huge efforts of many generations of almost entirely anonymous farmers and winemakers to master the physical constraints of a natural environment in order to create conditions favourable to the production of wines (and other crops) whose quality and distinctive characteristics have enjoyed worldwide acclaim since the 17th century. Specialization in the making of quality wines and the early assimilation of Douro wines by international circuits exposed, early on, the Douro valley to a cosmopolitan system of relations.

Wine from the Douro, especially port wine, represents a collective cultural creation. For countless generations, the inhabitants of the Alto Douro developed specific techniques for cultivating the vine and making wine, many of which were introduced in Roman times and had been perfected by the Middle Ages by religious communities. From the Middle Ages, the Douro valley has attracted huge numbers of outside workers, and it is in part very much their monument. The role of the Douro valley as both destination and corridor of peoples and cultures endures to this day, not least in the traditional visual and oral manner of expression of its people.

Comparative analysis

The Demarcated Douro Region is one of the oldest of all the historic winemaking regions in the world. It was the very first institutional model for organizing and controlling a winemaking region. Contrary to that which occurred following earlier demarcations of other winemaking regions (Chianti 1716, Tokay 1737), demarcation of the Alto Douro was accompanied by mechanisms for controlling the quality of the product supported by a legislative framework and a system for classifying and qualifying the wines. In many ways, the winemaking legislation of this region led the way for the modern legislation adopted by many wine-producing countries.

All the major mountain winemaking regions of the world, including the Demarcated Douro Region, are members of the *Centre de Recherches pour la Viticulture de Montagne et/ou en Forte Pente* (CERVIM). In comparison with them, Alto Douro is the most extensive, the most historical, and the one with the greatest continuity and the greatest biological variety in terms of the vines that have been perfected there.

Of all the historic mountain vineyards in Europe, the Alto Douro with its 36,000ha of steeply sloping vineyards is the most significant example of this type of viticulture. It represents about 18% of all European mountain vineyards registered with CERVIM.

Other winemaking regions already inscribed on the World Heritage List are Cinque Terre (Italy), Saint-Émilion (France), and the Wachau in Austria, all cultural landscapes. Future likely nominations are the Pico Wine Region in the Azores (Portugal) and Le Vignoble Champenois (France).

The Alto Douro demonstrates, particularly as regards the *socalcos*, its original formula for terracing to create vineyards. Motivation was functional but, particularly in this case, the resultant landscape, as at Cinque Terre, can be seen as the expression of a centuries-old toil transforming an inhospitable land of rock and shrubs into a fertile winemaking region.

All the CERVIM vineyard areas share – Alto Douro dramatically – the guideline for quality winemaking rooted in Roman viticulture and best-expressed in the saying "Bacchus loves rugged hillsides." The Douro valley is in fact universally acclaimed as the source of one of the finest fortified wines on earth, port wine.

Yet, while wine-production has contributed significantly to the national and regional economy, paradoxically the locality only benefits from one-fourth of the added value generated by this product. This, as compared to the majority of other winemaking regions, explains the marked dissimilarity between the opulence of the landscape and the humble buildings in the settlements.

As an agricultural landscape, Alto Douro demonstrates its own unique process for optimizing the ecological conditions under which water resources are very carefully controlled to produce a crop. In that sense, it is comparable to another World Heritage cultural landscape, the rice-growing terraces of Banaue in the Philippines, a masterpiece of simple montane hydrology producing a dramatic landscape.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

ICOMOS considers that the Alto Douro does not particularly exhibit "an important interchange of human values" (criterion ii). Much more appropriate is criterion iii, for it very much provides an exceptional testimony to a living cultural tradition. While undoubtedly an outstanding example of a type of landscape, it does not, however, illustrate particularly well "significant stages in human history" (criterion iv) because, despite the length of history which has passed in this area, much of the visible physical landscape is of late 19th/20th century date. On the other hand, it could still qualify under criterion iv if the phrase 'technological landscape' is allowed from the wording of the criterion, for that is exactly what it is, a landscape reflecting responses to changing technology in the context of an evolving relationship between man and the natural elements. ICOMOS therefore recommends that this nomination should be considered, as was that of the closely comparable St Emilion, under criteria iii, iv, and v.

ICOMOS appreciates the attractions of promoting tourism as a relatively new phenomenon in the area, and would encourage the authorities to be proactive as well as well informed and as sensitive as possible about the range of possible consequences arising from such promotion. Critical are such concepts as, for example, Planning Control and "appropriateness" in terms of scale, design, and materials for the various new facilities like hotels and visitor centres envisaged as necessary in the visually dramatic and sensitive landscape of this nomination.

However, as many other areas have experienced, tourism can bring far more than ugliness to a landscape; it can also erode the social fabric, something of great concern when a cultural landscape such as this needs large numbers of local residents, together with their skills and dedication, to keep the landscape working. Without a firm grasp of such consequences of tourism in a poor, deeply rural area, and a well informed management sensitivity about, in effect, sociology and the aesthetics of landscape development, experience suggests that this area might well be seriously compromised in 25 years' time. That the process, of both degradation and management reaction has started is acknowledged in the nomination, and it is crucial that, should this nomination be approved, local awareness and resources are ready to deal with the extra pressures.

No management plan specific to the nominated area accompanies the nomination nor is one proposed in the nomination but the mission found one is in active preparation. ICOMOS recommends that this address the issues of controlling development in the buffer zone and maintaining the characteristic features of the infrastructure of the landscape, notably the narrow, stone-paved local roads, the vernacular architecture, and, above all, the ability to maintain and rebuild the stone revetments of the terraces. So far the changes in viticultural practice, including making fields up and down rather than always along the contours, have not affected the landscape adversely; indeed, they have added to its time-depth and visual variety. It is crucial that the further development of this "continuing landscape," for example in response to technical change, occurs in the same mode.

Following completion of the Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region, the Alto Douro Bureau should prepare a management plan specific to the area and status of the World Heritage Site, taking into account existing management plans for comparable properties.

Brief description

The Alto Douro wine region produces a world commodity, port, a wine of a quality defined and regulated since 1756. Centred on the valley of the River Douro, now flooded, the region is characterized topographically by sloping vineyards arranged in various terraced configurations. Most date from after the phylloxera disease of the mid-19th century, but some are earlier – wine-growing here goes back at least to Roman times – and the 20th century added to the range of types of vineyard and terrace in response to changing technology and the constant needs to control water and prevent erosion. The result is a visually dramatic landscape still profitably farmed in traditional ways by traditional landholders.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party so that it may complete and implement a management plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region. In the event of this being submitted in time for the December 2001 meeting of the World Heritage Committee and found to meet its requirements, ICOMOS recommends that this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii, iv, and v*:

ine has been produced in the Alto Douro for some two thousand years, and since the 18th century its main product, port wine, has been famous for its quality throughout the world. This long tradition has produced a cultural landscape of outstanding beauty that is at the

same time a reflection of its technological, social, and economic evolution.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Aranjuez (Spain)

No 1044

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Aranjuez Cultural Landscape
<i>Location</i>	Aranjuez, Madrid
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Aranjuez has been witness to various cultural exchanges over a span of time, in a specific cultural area, that have had a tremendous influence in the development of its landmarks and the creation of its landscape. **Criterion ii**

Aranjuez offers a splendid example of diverse architectural styles and varied landscapes that depict key periods throughout the history of mankind. **Criterion iv**

Aranjuez represents a model for a given culture's use of its territory. However, the city has become increasingly vulnerable since the disappearance at the turn of the century of the Royal Court that had so much influence in its development. **Criterion v**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in para. 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description*

History

The Aranjuez area enjoyed a long history of human settlement before becoming a strategic stronghold during Roman times. Then its position at a river crossing and cross-

roads – a factor to be repeatedly influential - gave it a significance in the political geography of the time. It lay in a sparsely populated region thereafter and was eventually granted by the Crown to the military order of St James of Santiago in the medieval period. Towards the end of the 14th century, the knights built a palace in the middle of the woods, then replete with game.

Aranjuez became a Royal site in the 15th century, but it was Philip II in the 16th century who created the first period of splendour. He built a new palace and large ornamental and vegetable gardens laid out according to geometric principles, attempting to symbolize his world-wide imperial sovereignty based on a centralized state while, at the same time, celebrating a return to nature, its structure, and man's supremacy according to the canons of Humanism. It was also a private and personal retreat. Phillip meanwhile pursued botanical experimentation, acclimatizing plant species from all over the world, and introduced hydraulic engineering based on best practice in central Europe and Italy. During the 17th century Aranjuez prospered as the annual abode of royalty, a place of pageantry and hunting, and a source of inspiration for and patronage of some of the greatest Spanish poets of the Golden Age.

The continuing splendour of the 18th century culminated in the building of a new town close to the palace. During the reign of Charles III, the city and its surrounding area became an experimental ground for physiocratic, agricultural, scientific, and social ideas lying at the heart of the Enlightenment. The King sought to provide exemplars both for horticultural practice and in the design of model farms. Such cultural grandeur effectively died when, under external pressure of French Revolutionary ideas and Napoleon's ambitions, the Aranjuez Riot at the end of the century signalled the end of Spain's *Ancien Régime*.

After a brief revival which added a new element of modernism and eclecticism to the Royal Site during the first half of the 19th century, the end of the reign of Isabella II marked the close of the Crown's exclusive role in the history of this riverside complex and community. A City Council was established independent of Royal command (1836) and the Royal family's use of Aranjuez decreased. At the Revolution in 1868, all Crown property passed to the State and, although large parts of Aranjuez were initially excepted, all that was left in Royal hands by the early 1870s were fragments of their former estate. Meanwhile, the population increased and a railway line (1851) stimulated vigorous economic activity at the price of cutting the Palace's eastern vistas and bisecting the Picotajo garden. During the 20th century Aranjuez became a densely populated satellite city of Madrid, an industrial and cultural centre in which memory and maintenance of the Royal Site deteriorated. Nevertheless, the Site overall kept its integrity, and by the end of that century new assessments, policies, and programmes of works reflected new attitudes of respect for the Royal Site.

Description

The nominated property lies at the junction of the Rivers Tajo (Tagus) and Jarama, south of Madrid and north-east of Toledo. The buffer zone embraces parts of the valleys of both rivers upstream of Aranjuez itself and the south side of the valley downstream towards Toledo. The whole area "floats," as it were, beside and above hundreds of water-channels ranging in scale from waterways to narrow irrigation ditches. As a result, it appears as a green oasis in a

* Aranjuez and its history were elegantly synthesized by Carmen Añon Feliu in her contribution to von Droste B., Plachter H. and Rössler M., *Cultural Landscapes of Universal Value – Components of a Global Strategy* (Fischer Verlag, Jena, Stuttgart and New York, 1995), pp 295–306. The nomination elaborates on but closely follows her work, in particular using her categorization of the types of landscape present at Aranjuez (as does the Guidebook submitted with the nomination). The present "Description" therefore uses the same structure.

landscape otherwise of sierra type, dry, brown and fairly barren of vegetation as a result of climate, geomorphology, and over-exploitative land-use. This "natural effect" is based on the genuinely natural resources of the place but is actually artificial, the result of a conscientious effort to create a place of enjoyment and well-being, a sort of Eden for its inhabitants and visitors.

The site incorporates a planned town, large gardens, vegetable gardens and orchards, lagoons, rivers and waterworks, woods, and moors. The main elements are:

1. *The Palace and Island Garden* The Palace lies along the south bank of the Tajo, arranged around a plaza with, on the east, the King's Garden of irregular plan with fountains and, on the west, avenues and vistas eventually cut by the railway. Across a canal to the north, entirely within a sharp bend of the river beyond the Garden of the Statues and a fountain, is the geometric Island Garden full of fountains and other structures. Beyond that are kitchen gardens, with woodland occupying the end and sides of the peninsular.

2. *The Great Historic Garden (Huertas históricas)* This consists of a series of gardens which together comprise the bulk of the area of the nominated property. On the west, at the junction of the rivers, is Legamarejo Garden, essentially a large number of small irrigated plots with boundaries connecting to the feeder channels following the river banks on either side and only in part related to a south-westerly axial line from the Garden of the Twelve Roads (*see below*). North-east of that is Picotajo Garden with some irrigation channels but generally larger plots and much more closely related in its main subdivisions to the geometry of the axial line already mentioned. It is bisected by the main railway line to Madrid. North-east of that again is the Garden of the Twelve Roads, a roughly triangular area with a near-central point from which radiate twelve alignments marked by roads and tracks. The longest is that to the south-west through the two gardens already described. Four others link westwards to the adjacent Rebollo Garden, the whole of its southern edge along the north bank of the Tajo. Like the Legamarejo Garden, it is characterized by irrigation channels, most striking in plan being an extensive area of regular, rectilinear plots either side of a channel through its centre and parallel to the river.

3. *The urban area* For the purposes of the nomination, this is subdivided into two: an industrial area west of the Palace, incorporating the railway station and the gardens west of the Palace (*see 1. above*); and the 18th century town which is now the historic core of modern Aranjuez. The original town plan is intact, incorporating in particular, across its northern, riverside end, two broad avenues radiating from the east end of the Palace and earlier than, though apparently cutting, the urban geometric grid plan. In the town's north-western corner, adjacent to the Palace, is a complex of official buildings around the Plaza de San Antonio, with other major civic, religious and private buildings, including five nobles' palaces, occurring throughout the measured symmetry of the urban fabric. The southern edge of the grid is marked by the Bull Ring.

4. *The Prince's Garden* This late 18th/early 19th century garden stretches along the south bank of the Tajo, north-east of the town. Its ruler-straight southern edge is along the *Calle de la Reina*, the third, and most northerly, of the easterly lines radiating from the Palace (*see 3. above*). It contains two distinct areas, each with further subdivisions

in terms of separate units of designed garden. The westerly half is subdivided into eight gardens, all essentially geometric to a greater or less extent except for one half of the *Jardín Séptimo* which is arranged around an irregular water feature with an island hermitage. Outstanding in the magnificent botanical collection are eighteen monumental trees. The eastern half, the *Parque de Miraflores* (1848), was a park in the English style, effectively an irrigated horticultural/nursery area where functionalism took precedence over ornamental geometry. Now decayed, it is not open to the public. Overall, the network of ditches in the Prince's Garden is more than 6000m in length, from which the entire garden is naturally watered.

These elements are subsumed in a series of intermeshed landscapes as perceived by the nomination, all combining conceptually to create a cultural landscape:

- The water landscape: rivers, leets, dams, ditches, fountains

In medieval times and earlier, the valley was filled with marshy areas, mud slides, water courses, forests, and wetlands. Archaeology shows early attempts to control this natural situation in Roman and Visigothic times. The documented history of Aranjuez began as an attempt to control its rivers by restraining, crossing, and steering them. The riverbanks were filled with dams, jetties, feeders, and bridges, and came to represent a pioneer system of hydraulic engineering. The rivers both demanded and gave the opportunity for the development of a complex system of irrigation which enriched Arabic and medieval traditions with Renaissance engineering. Phillip II built leets in particular as part of an irrigation system for the area's fertile soils as he attempted to create in central Spain a little bit of landscape like those he had seen in Flanders and knew about from Italy. The ubiquitous water is both symbolic and functional. It tells on the one hand of life and happiness and provides the stage for metaphorical shipyards, naval fleets, and iconographic statues and fountains. On the other, it releases the fertility of the soil for edible crops while providing a moving dimension in the static formal geometry of the ornamental gardens.

- The agricultural landscape: vegetable gardens, orchards, nurseries and stock-breeding

The growing of edible crops at Aranjuez depends on the soil's fertility and the success of irrigation not only in providing water but in controlling flooding. Royalty banished "common" vegetables and encouraged the cultivation of "worthy and regal" varieties. Aranjuez gave its name to exquisite fruits: in particular strawberries, asparagus, plums, and water pears. Agricultural experiments were based on models in Flanders, Switzerland, and Valencia. The grounds contain a fowl house, a cattle house, and, in particular, the Royal Stud House, which greatly contributed to the breeding of Spanish horses.

- The gardens, a delectable landscape

Gardens along the Tajo are representative of the Spanish experience in this field: Renaissance gardens with a slight Arab touch; Baroque and French Classicism-style gardens; "Anglo-Chinese" gardens; and 19th century bourgeois gardens. Trees and shrubs from all over the Spanish Empire were brought to be acclimatized and cross-cultivated, often then being returned to their place of origin.

- Landscape and geometry

There is no single geometric axis or grid for the whole site, but the whole of the site is affected by geometric design ranging from the grand alignments of Phillip II and the "Great Historic Garden" to detailed arrangements in nursery gardens. If there is one main axis, it is the *Calle de la Reina* laid out by Phillip II with that intention; if there is one main control point, it is the node in the Garden of the Twelve Roads, for its axial influence extends right across the whole property north of the River Tajo and, indeed, across the river to the lines radiating from the Palace and the geometry of the new town. Particularly outstanding is the way in which the apparently asymmetrical, rectilinear grid of the new town, a late addition to an already geometrically complex landscape, was "morticed" into existing axial lines emanating both from the Royal Palace and from the gardens. Geometry also influenced parts of the hydraulic system, though clearly other factors were at play there; conversely, the hydrology fed the fountains and ponds, which were usually placed at particular points determined by geometry, albeit serving an aesthetic purpose (eg in the Island Garden and the western parts of the Prince's Garden).

- The constructed landscape: roads, architecture, town

The "New City" was built in the 18th century fronting on to the Tajo. It was designed in the form of a new garden, but with buildings where there would have been flowerbeds. A pattern of radial and lattice lines are superimposed on the geometric plan. The *Canal de las Aves* zigzags its way through the town centre; straight, tree-lined streets overlie channels of running water. The architecture and the urban spaces are contrived to seem like decoration for the abundant vegetation in and visible from the streetscape. The whole is linked visually, in plan, hydrologically, and botanically to the surrounding landscape, yet the city is part of that landscape in a unique composition.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Two legal instruments are specific to Aranjuez. The whole area was declared an Historical Complex in 1983 under the Spanish Heritage Law. This sets basic guidelines to ensure the preservation and upkeep of the city's historic area as well as the landmarks, palaces, orchards, avenues and groves. The Urban Development Plan sets objectives for and analyses the city's status and preservation, establishing what sort of activities should be encouraged and discouraged. In addition, the nominated area is covered by a wide range of regulations from other government bodies (eg the Madrid Community and Aranjuez City Council).

Management

National, regional, and local agencies are all involved separately, but it now seems that a series of specialized agencies are likely to exert control over the preservation of the historical complex. They are: the National Heritage, in charge of Crown properties such as palaces and gardens; the Local Heritage Commission, consisting of representatives of regional and local government; the Technological Institute for Agricultural Development, Ministry of the Environment, which manages the orchards and historical avenues; and the Tajo Hydrographic Confederation, which is in charge of the management of the water and its associated structures.

The nomination dossier is descriptive of these and other management matters, but no analysis is provided of effectiveness, nor proposals for prioritization, co-ordination, review, or revision. ICOMOS would stress the need for the ready availability of high-quality management information, based here above all on well researched historical data implemented by management sympathetic to the priority of historicity throughout the work of maintaining and improving the site.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Essentially the well-being of Aranjuez was sustained and promoted under continuous Royal care until the 1868 Revolution. Ownership then became fragmented and the site became both prey to neglect and vulnerable to pressures of industrial, commercial and demographic growth. Despite a railway and National Highway through it, and despite being surrounded by economic development, it survived this phase remarkably well, however, and was undergoing restorative programmes and enjoying better-informed conservation management by the end of the 20th century. The Ayuntamiento has, for example, embarked on a programme of renewing and repairing the avenues and their associated roads in the former Royal estate where they are such a key element in the historical layout. The ICOMOS mission noted, however, that many components of the site need repairing, renewing, improving, and even, in some cases, recreating in order to improve the historical integrity and the understanding of it for the present-day visitor.

Authenticity and integrity

Both the natural and geometric bases of the site as a whole survive remarkably well, with relatively little loss and effectively, modern communication routes apart, no inappropriate intrusion. Major buildings as well as the city's layout and its gardens and tree-lined avenues have been preserved as the characteristic of an urban community among orchards and groves living on a ground plan mimicking those of ornamental gardens across the river. Though some of the garden areas require restoration, overall the state of preservation is such that the site is able to demonstrate clearly, not its state at any one moment in history, but the stages of its development from mid-16th to mid-19th century.

The most important general factor which makes Aranjuez and its landscape distinctive and a strong candidate for World Heritage status, is the way in which it has been shaped and developed by the interests of the Kings and Queens of Spain and their Courts between the early 16th and mid-19th centuries. Both Charles V and Phillip II were leading figures in Europe and the world in their time, and therefore in the history of Europe and the world. They were extremely well informed, immensely influential, and wealthy. The present site still recognizably represents the Golden Age of Aranjuez, not only as the creation of Spanish Royalty but as a place and a period when ideas and materials from much of the known world came to Aranjuez and ideas and influence emanated from it for long after the 16th century.

A detail, but an important one, is that the Palace was originally approached from the west and not the east i.e. from both Toledo and Madrid. This is now impossible because both bridges across the Rio Tajo are missing.

The ICOMOS mission also noted the omission from the nomination, without explanation, of several structures and features which appear to be integral parts of the whole: eg the Royal stable near the Rio Tajo east of the Jardin del Principe, the Casa de la Monta, and the late 18th century model farm, the Real Cortijo de San Isidro.

Another question concerns the wider landscape: the views out from the proposed area, and the way in which the proposed area sits within the wider landscape, are significant aspects of the nature of the site and its integrity. In particular, is the boundary on the north west far enough out? Should it be across, not along, the Rio Jarama?

A daily loss of integrity is produced by the large amount of traffic, affecting not just the town but also the Palace, the gardens, and their landscape setting. Improvements need to continue to be made, and to be kept under review.

The site is in general of high integrity and retains its authenticity to a considerable degree, authenticity of place and in design, architecture, and hydrology, and to a surprising extent, in function too, though it has, of course, lost its role as a royal residence.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 2001. It also consulted the ICOMOS-IFLA International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Landscapes.

Qualities

Aranjuez the town, as distinct from the whole landscape, is an integral part of the cultural landscape. In this context, its relationship with the design of both the water management and with the geometric dimension of the planned landscape is outstanding. As a town in its own right, its salient characteristics are covered by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 27, where it falls into category (ii), and by paragraph 29 where it meets criteria about "spatial organization, structure, materials, forms and ... functions" which "essentially reflect the civilization which [has] prompted the nomination," and falls into category (iii), "Historic centres that cover exactly the same area as ancient towns and are now enclosed within modern cities." Aranjuez the town is, in other words, a distinctive and distinguished urban ensemble which might well have been considered for World Heritage status in its own right. However, it is properly presented in its landscape context, thereby adding to understanding of its own nature and becoming a key element in the cultural landscape nominated for World Heritage status.

Stages of that landscape's development from the mid-16th to mid-19th century are clear on the ground and in plan. This is particularly important because several of the stages capture significant phases in the development of European thought, scientific enquiry and landscape design.

The combination of natural situation with running water, managed hydrology, fertile soils, scientific plantsmanship, great garden design, royal palatial context, and planned urban development makes for an outstanding cultural landscape, well within the Western tradition in thought and physical realization but expressing values of global interest about matters such as man/nature relationships, technology,

and aesthetics, and how rulers can best use their power and resources.

Comparative analysis

The nomination offers no comparative analysis. A guidebook submitted with it contains, however, a map of "European Royal Sites" which presumably provides the context within which Aranjuez would wish to be seen. These include: within Spain, the Escorial (World Heritage Site – WHS) and La Granja clustered with Aranjuez around Madrid; Sintra (WHS) and Queluz near Lisbon; Caserta (WHS) near Naples; Schönbrunn (WHS) outside Vienna; Potsdam (WHS), Berlin; Compiègne, Versailles (WHS) and Fontainebleau (WHS) around Paris; Greenwich (WHS), Hampton Court and Windsor near London; and Mariefred outside Stockholm

The constant references in the nomination's text to the sources of inspiration underlying the development of Aranjuez also imply comparisons. Phillip II in particular was much influenced in terms of waterscape by his travels in Flanders. A completely different example of external influence is the Petit Trianon at Versailles which was the immediate reference for the artificial streams and ponds arranged irregularly as the context for classical pavilions and "eye-catchers" of Chinese and Turkish inspiration, obelisks, false ruins, and artificial prospect mounds in the Prince's Garden.

Though design and cultural context are completely different, at global level this nomination seems as a cultural landscape conceptually close to that of Vat Phou, Laos, among current nominations.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The nomination documentation was exemplary in many respects but it made ICOMOS's task a little more difficult than need have been the case by containing no comparative analysis and omitting a scale from all maps.

No management plan was submitted with the nomination and a request from the World Heritage Committee for technical assistance to prepare one has apparently not produced a positive response. All the elements required in a management plan are actually present in, though dispersed throughout, the documentation. The missing elements are a statement of objectives on a short- and long-term basis (five and twenty years?) and a formal mechanism for reviewing implementation of the plan and making consequential revisions.

ICOMOS also recommends that such revision should include reconsideration of the boundaries of the nominated property. Some buildings are inexplicably omitted. More generally, the outer boundaries of the buffer zone across the river on the north-west and west of the site need rethinking.. Although the river itself is clearly a convenient line, ICOMOS is anxious to see some protection in place of views out of the core zone into the surrounding countryside.

Further consideration also needs to be given to an exposition of the policies, both general and more specific, that will apply to the proposed site and buffer zone, in connection with their conservation, care, and use. It would also help if more explanation could be offered in respect of the management structure for the implementation of these policies. Mechanisms for co-ordination, monitoring, and review are needed.

With regard to executive capacity, ICOMOS notes the familiar organizational complexity and overlapping fields of responsibilities and expertises that exist in the management of the whole Site. It therefore recommends that the authorities concerned give serious consideration to the establishment, under democratic control, of a dedicated executive agency solely concerned with promoting, sustaining, and, where necessary, defending the interests of the nominated property. This might well prove to be appropriate in so large and multi-dimensional a cultural landscape which can only be given part of the attention of institutions with many other responsibilities. It would follow such a step in the case of the Loire Valley and run with a similar proposal being implemented in the case of Alto Douro, Portugal (currently being evaluated).

ICOMOS reiterates its appreciation of both this site and the quality of the work on the nomination already achieved. Its unusually detailed response here recognizes those facts, and is motivated by the thought that here is a splendid opportunity to produce an exemplary World Heritage site if all concerned will dedicate time and effort to achieving a correct nomination.

Whether or not Aranjuez be inscribed on the World Heritage List, the fact that eight royal palace/park/garden complexes in Europe are already inscribed might suggest that, in a world perspective, the List is now reasonably representative in this respect (particularly as it also includes other, non-royal, European designed parks/gardens).

Brief description

The Aranjuez cultural landscape is an entity of complex relationships between man and nature, between horticulture and ornamental garden, between fixed structures and flowing water, between sinuous water courses and straight lines of geometric landscape design, between the rural and the urban, between carefully regulated treescapes and as carefully modulated architecture in palatial buildings, garden furniture, and streetscape. Three hundred years of Royal attention to the development and care of this landscape have seen it variously express concepts such as humanism and political centralization and enshrine values such as those in the 18th century of the French-style Baroque garden and, a little later, urban living side by side with the scientific practice of plant acclimatization and stock-breeding in the Age of Enlightenment.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred* to allow time for the State Party to prepare and submit for approval a revised nomination with an appropriate management plan (addressing *inter alia* the recommendations in "ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action").

ICOMOS, March 2001

Kasubi (Uganda)

No 1022

Identification

Nomination Tombs of the Buganda Kings at Kasubi

Location Kampala District

State Party Uganda

Date 20 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The royal tombs of Buganda *Kabakas* are sheltered in a gigantic, circular, thatched building which is a unique surviving example of an architectural style developed by the powerful Buganda kingdom since the 13th century. This structure represents one of the most remarkable buildings using purely organic material in the whole of sub-Saharan Africa. Its unusual scale and its outstanding details of assembly bear witness to the creative genius of the Baganda and are a masterpiece of form and craftsmanship. **Criterion i**

The Kasubi Tombs site is a unique testimony to the living cultural traditions of the Baganda. The built and natural elements are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. The site continues to be managed in a traditional manner through a complex system of responsibilities. The site is a major spiritual centre for the Baganda and is the most active religious place in the kingdom. Its place as the burial ground of the previous four *Kabakas* makes it a religious centre for the royal family, a place where the *Kabaka* and his representatives carry out important rituals related to Buganda culture. **Criterion iii**

The Kasubi Tombs site is an outstanding example of traditional Ganda architecture and palace design. Its spatial organization represents the best existing example of a Baganda palace/architectural ensemble. The complex reflects the technical achievements developed over centuries of the Baganda clans and the ingenuity and creativity of the craftsmen who designed it and continue to maintain it. The Tombs testify to the power of Muteesa I and his importance in the history of the Baganda, and mark a starting point for new customs related to the burial of the *Kabakas*. **Criterion iv**

The Kasubi Tombs site has a direct and tangible association with the living traditions of the Baganda people. Its rich architectural and decorative features and the variety of custodians, each with his or her traditional role to play, reflects the fusion between nature and culture, between the spirits and the living population. The site is strongly linked to the beliefs associated with the spirits of the *Kabakas* buried there. Other traditional events occur throughout the year, such as the new moon ceremony, but the main spiritual life is not visible to the

ordinary visitor as many ceremonies are performed secretly inside the buildings. This aspect of the Ganda tradition represents a continuing link with the longstanding Baganda belief system. **Criterion vi**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

The Baganda belong to the Bantu-speaking people and date their political civilization from about the 13th century AD. Today, the Baganda are the major ethnic group in Uganda, their 6 million people constituting about 28% of the population. The Buganda region covers about 66,350km². From the first legendary *Kabaka*, Kintu, to Muteesa I, there were 35 *Kabakas*. Precise dates, however, are known only from *Suuna II* (1836–56), who established his palace at Kasubi. He was succeeded by his son Muteesa I who did likewise, constructing the present tomb structure as his palace in 1882. He became a very powerful *Kabaka*, the first to be influenced by foreign cultures. He adopted some Islamic religious practices learnt from ivory and slave traders from Zanzibar. He also showed interest in Europe after acting as host in 1862 to John Hanning Speke, the first European visitor. In 1875 he asked Henry Morton Stanley, the explorer, for teachers of European learning and religion. Some remaining artefacts reflect this pivotal period in local history when the Baganda were first exposed to Arab traders and European explorers.

When Muteesa I died in 1884, he broke two traditions: his body was buried whole and it was buried in his palace, Kasubi, not somewhere else. This practice was followed when, in 1910, the remains of his successor, Mwanga II (*ob.* 1903), were brought back from the Seychelles and also buried there, establishing Kasubi as an important burial place of the *Kabakas* of Buganda. This status was reinforced when his son and successor, Daudi Chwa II, died in 1939 and was also buried at Kasubi.

His son and successor, Edward Muteesa II, was first in conflict with Britain and then, after independence in 1962 when he became President, with his own Prime Minister. Kasubi was stormed in 1966 and the President went into exile, but when he died in 1969 his remains were returned and buried at Kasubi in 1971. Four successive *Kabakas* of Buganda were therefore buried in the same tomb house at Kasubi, the building which is at the core of this nomination. Each prince and princess who is a descendant of the four *Kabakas* is also buried there behind the main shrine.

Between 1967 and 1993 the site was controlled by central government, but the traditional institutions of kingship were restored in 1993. *Kabaka* Ronald Mutebi II was crowned as the *Kabaka* of Buganda, and in 1997 the Kasubi tombs were returned to the Buganda kingdom. Buganda is today one of four kingdoms in

Uganda. The site is now not only the most important cultural shrine for the Baganda but also the most attractive tourist site in the country.

Description

The Kasubi Tombs site is situated on a hill within Kampala. It covers an area of 30ha, on the hilltop and down its eastern slopes. About 35 people live within it. The whole is encircled by a fence of bark cloth trees, now somewhat depleted. It consists of three main zones:

- i. the main tomb area located at the western end of the site on top of the hill;
- ii. an area located behind the main tombs containing a number of buildings and graveyards;
- iii. a large area on the eastern side of the site used primarily for agricultural purposes.

On the western border of the site is the gatehouse (Bujjabukula), traditionally containing guards 24 hours a day. It was constructed of wooden columns and invisible walls of fired brick supporting a thatched roof, with walls of woven reeds. Beyond is a small courtyard containing the Ndogo-Obukaba, a circular building containing the royal drums. Also of wooden columns and thatch, it has walls visibly constructed of fired brick. A recent cement floor is intended to protect the drums from termites. Alongside is the ticket office, one of the few modern buildings added to the site.

The D-shaped main courtyard (Olugya) lies through a gap in a reed fence. This fence encloses the courtyard and links nine buildings, five of them houses for the widows of the Kabakas, the other four respectively a twins' house, two tombs, and a mortuary. Various constructed of wattle-and-daub and fired brick, three have round plans, the others are square. All were originally thatched, but several now have new roofs of galvanized metal

The courtyard itself is empty, enhancing the visual dominance on its eastern side of the large timber, reed and thatched building (Muzibu-Azaala-Mpanga) housing the tombs of the four Kabakas. The building is circular in plan and has a dome-like shape. Its external diameter is 31m and internal height 7.5m. It has both changed its profile and been significantly repaired since its construction in 1882. The roof catches the eye: it slopes right down to the ground and is reinforced underneath by 52 woven rings of palm fronds and spear grass, representing the 52 Ganda clans. The whole structure is carried by gigantic straight wooden columns wrapped in bark cloth.

The building is entered through a low, wide arch flanked on both sides by richly woven reeds. Its inside is partitioned with a huge bark cloth which hides the "sacred forest" where four royal graves lie. Entrance to the "forest" is limited to widows of Kabakas, the royal family, the Nalinya, and Katikkiro. The inside of the building is adorned with power insignia such as drums, spears, shields, medals, and pictures of the buried Kabakas. On the floor is a thick layer of lemon grass and palm-leaf mats.

Beyond the Olugya is scattered a large number of buildings – houses, royal tombs and ones for agricultural purposes – and a royal cemetery. The whole

area is sacred and is not open to visitors. It was formerly completely screened off but now moves uninterrupted into the agricultural land behind and east of it. This land was originally occupied by homesteads but was later subdivided among the widows of the Kabakas. It is now rented to and farmed by members of the community; the income is used on the site. The area contains graves, two man-made mounds, medicinal plants, and the trees used in making bark-cloth.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The King of Buganda is the private legal owner as trustee for the kingdom.

The site is enlisted as a National Monument under the Historical Monuments Act 1967, and therefore "shall not be used for any use inconsistent with its character."

The site is located within a zoned residential area, limiting the types of incompatible uses that could be initiated nearby. The proposed buffer zone, if approved by the Town Council, would limit construction to two storeys and functions to those appropriate to the environs of the Kasubi Tombs site.

Management

The site is protected under the Historical Monuments Act from residential and other encroachment. Recent attempts to breach this provision had been rebuffed at the time of the nomination but, although the boundary of the site as defined in this nomination is newly mapped and marked on the ground, it is being less and less respected.

The site is managed under the overall authority of the Kabaka. The Buganda kingdom is the single management agency, and all those involved belong to it. A management framework was defined in March 2000, identifying the roles of each person involved in site conservation and clarifying the hierarchy in the decision-making process. The main management body is the Buganda Heritage Site Commission (also responsible for other sites; with external advisors). A new Kasubi Tombs Heritage Committee includes the site's traditional managers. They are the custodians deployed on site to perform precise, traditional tasks at different levels: administrative, technical, and spiritual. Significant roles belong to the Nalinga (spiritual guardian and supervisor of the site) and the Lubunga (land-use co-ordinator). All these tiers of management share a commitment to the heritage of Kasubi tombs. The ICOMOS mission was convinced that the tier system of management provides adequate legal, contractual, and traditional protection and management mechanisms to ensure the conservation of the nominated property.

Thatching is clearly a major issue on the site. It is carried out by the Ngeye clan, who are sole keepers of the knowledge of how it is done and are the only people allowed to climb on the roofs. They train young members of the clan to continue the tradition and the maintenance. They do not accept advice from anyone nor do they accept technical orders.

The site is protected through Buganda custom because of its strong traditional, historical, customary, and ritual importance. Everyone fears the powerful Kabakas' spirits and respect for age-old traditions affords protection. Yet the site exists in the middle of a growing urban area, with great pressure to encroach on it, pressure which seemed to have increased quite palpably between the time of the preparation of the nomination and the ICOMOS mission. It was nevertheless a recent but not immediately past development which stood out on the western part of the core area, where a mosque and modern Islamic primary school have not only encroached but show a disregard for the norms of the site. Understandably, these buildings represent a particularly sensitive issue. Small-scale dumping on the periphery had been a problem; a small corner of the site was leased to an oil company in 1992 but local opposition has so far stopped any development. But few of the boundary bark trees remained in January 2001, when the boundary itself was seen to be less and less respected, being both encroached upon and in places crossed. In particular, dumping of waste is taking place at an accelerated rate and unauthorized farming by non-residents of Kasubi is increasing.

Rents and entry fees are the only source of funds for the site. The State does not contribute. The widows who maintain the tombs sustain themselves with small amounts of cash collected in baskets displayed in the tombs. About 4500 visitors a year come to the site; it is hoped to increase that number to 18,000 by 2005. Currently, once unavoidable expenditure like salaries has been paid, little money remains for maintenance, etc. In preparing this nomination, a Management Plan was drawn up. It estimates that US\$24,000 are needed for immediate emergency conservation and US\$13,000 per year for regular maintenance.

The Plan's twelve guiding principles include concepts such as sustainability, partnership, transparency, communication, education, and evaluation as well as specifics such as improving the lives of the permanent caretakers of the tombs, the widows. It identifies priority actions in four main areas:

1. to establish a sustainable funding system for the site;
2. to stabilize the state of conservation;
3. to improve the visitor experience;
4. to improve the conditions for the expression of living traditions.

The proposed buffer zone would be ineffectual given that its restrictions are only on the heights of buildings and uses inconsistent with the character of the site. Some much stronger provision is now needed to protect one of the main characteristics of the site, that is its very authenticity in being on the original site which happens now to have been caught up in rapid urban development. The Ugandan authorities realize the extent and nature of the problem, which has increased in the last two years; but clearly there is no easy solution. A fast-growing thorn hedge could provide some physical protection if it was allowed to mature over three years or so.

The site is included in the Heritage Trail Project, an initiative to promote community-based tourism at

heritage sites. The project aims to conserve and promote cultural heritage, diversify the cultural product, and encourage new income-generating activities.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

During its first fifty years (1882 to the 1930s) the palace-cum-tomb called Muzibu Azaala Mpanga experienced only minor maintenance work, although in 1905 it was reduced in size to make it more maintainable. Since 1938, however, the building has suffered several processes of restoration and modification, primarily to meet threats of structural failure. It was completely reconstructed in 1938–40; modern materials were introduced, such as some concrete columns. During the 1990s, changes incurred by most of the buildings have slightly changed the architectural value of the site. The tendency to modernize the site has now been checked, however, and efforts over the last three years have sought to change attitudes and revive traditional skills.

The site suffers badly from rain, drainage problems, and termites, with a constant threat of fire. Most of the smaller buildings show deficiencies. Of their unsightly and untraditional galvanized metal roofs, most leak. One building burnt down in 1998 has been rebuilt but is without a thatch roof for lack of funds. The Muzibu Azaala Mpanga is structurally in good order but major thatching works are necessary; too much repair work has been done as emergency (see below). Partial restoration of the drum-house in 1998 has left it without an adequate roof. The gatehouse was also restored in 1998, an achievement which has already underlined the need for continuous maintenance. The traditional voluntary maintenance by the clans is tending to disappear as there is no means of rewarding it: for example, the traditional royal free meal, cooked by the widows, no longer exists.

The original reed fence around the whole site has long since disappeared; the living fence of bark cloth trees around the site has suffered quite badly as an obvious target in the endless search for firewood. The site has, nevertheless, to an extent been preserved out of fear and respect for its sacred and religious nature. This spiritual protection has freed the site from urban modernization in the 20th century, despite the booming development which has occurred all around it. Yet, as the Management Plan notes, "The vast majority of the local population ... do not consider the conservation of the site as their primary objective."

Authenticity

The existing layout of the site remains as it was at the time of construction. It is a typical example of a palace of the Baganda Kabakas. The Muzibu Azaala Mpanga itself is now more rounded in profile than originally, but this is neither deliberate nor the result of poor workmanship but an accidental product of continuous traditional maintenance. It does not affect the authenticity in any significant way.

Materials are, however, another matter. Modern materials introduced into the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga in 1938–40 included a steel structure, a few concrete

columns, a curved concrete lintel above the entrance, and some fired clay bricks. All are invisible. The thatched roof resting on structural rings of palm tree fronds is still intact, as are internal elements and finishing materials such as the long wooden poles wrapped in bark cloth decoration. Overall, especially with regard to the main buildings – the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga, the Bujjabukula (gate-house), and the Ndogo-Obukaba (drum-house) – the material and functional authenticity is high.

The houses surrounding the Olugya have experienced more change, although the overall layout is authentic. Two of the nine buildings are of wattle-and-daub construction. The other seven have been constructed or reconstructed using fired bricks. The roofs of all nine are now of galvanized metal, visually damaging but not structurally disastrous. A change back to thatch is envisaged in the Management Plan, once more urgent work has been executed. New thatching is, of course, being put in place continuously on the site. Woven reed partitioning is well preserved and is another feature of organic material which can be replaced using traditional methods and material.

Two of the 52 clans of the Baganda are directly involved in maintaining the physical aspects of the site. The Ngeye clan does the thatching, the Ngo clan is responsible for the decoration and bark cloth. Execution of these responsibilities continues, so the site is witness to a high degree of authenticity in terms of traditional workmanship.

Functionally – and perhaps most importantly in terms of authenticity – the site retains its main purpose that it has enjoyed since its nature was changed from a palace to royal burial place in 1884. It also retains its purpose as a living place for widows of the Kabakas, the custodians of the tombs. It continues to be a primary religious and ritual centre of the Buganda. In 1999 it featured significantly in the wedding of the current Kabaka.

Although the site is now surrounded by urban development, it is sufficiently large and well respected to have resisted the worst effects. Being in its original position, it therefore retains an authenticity of location and setting, its interior in particular still being one with a rural atmosphere. The most extensive, agricultural, part of the site continues to be farmed in a traditional manner.

A judgement about the degree and validity of authenticity on the site is clearly finely balanced. The nomination document itself states that "the authenticity of the site, in all of its aspects remains at a very acceptable level," while the accompanying Management Plan states that "...many changes have already occurred on site which have seriously faded the authenticity and the general value of the site." Perhaps the most important point is in the former, where it goes on to remark that "the conservation works carried out since 1998 show a willingness by all those involved, to maintain the site more faithfully...".

Such an attitude was found to be in place in January 2001, when, following the brave decision to remove the thatch roof from the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga, the ICOMOS mission witnessed its replacement. Proper documentation preceded and accompanied the exercise

at all stages, as it was executed in the traditional way using traditional materials.

Overall, and to a proven extent, Kasubi enshrines the principles enunciated at Nara and at the Great Zimbabwe meeting on authenticity and integrity.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 2001.

Qualities

The site's main qualities are intangible ones to do with belief, spirituality, community, and identity. It has been at the centre of the Baganda kingdom since its origins about a thousand years ago, it has witnessed interaction with the Arab world, it was in the vanguard of contact with the arrival of the European world, and its influence has stretched far over Africa and beyond. It possesses an aura which is distinctly original. Simultaneously, it possesses a considerable physical presence, being visually striking and a place of the royal dead exhibiting outstanding examples of indigenous architecture, craftsmanship, and traditional organization, methods, and skills.

Its overall plan also exhibits significant historical patterning. A Kabaka became the first President of Uganda. Almost all heads of state and dignitaries who have cause to call on the Kabaka visit Kasubi as "the spiritual heart of the Baganda." Furthermore, the site as a whole is clearly of high potential in cultural and tourism terms, and it acts as a "green lung" in an area of rapid urban expansion.

Comparative analysis

There are 33 tombs remaining in the kingdom where previous Buganda Kabakas were buried. Traditional practice was to bury each Kabaka at one site and establish a royal shrine containing the royal jaw at another. Many such shrines continue to be maintained. The state of conservation is less good or well maintained at most sites, and they are less well known and less visited by tourists.

The Kasubi Tombs site presents some unique features. It is a multiple Kabaka burial site, the only one where four are buried. It is also the cemetery of the royal family. It is bigger than most other Baganda tombs, and it is the best known. It has become a landmark, not only for the Buganda but also for Uganda. Its location and status ensure that the Kasubi Tombs site will continue to be maintained for its cultural values. Were Kasubi to be inscribed on the World Heritage List, it would bring some unique elements currently missing among the cultural properties.

The ICOMOS mission visited two Kabaka tombs near Kampala: the Wamala tomb where Suuna II is buried only a few kilometres from Kasubi, and Masanufu where Kiwewa is buried. Wamala was not mentioned in the nomination but is in fact almost a replica of Kasubi, although the relationship is rather the other way round. Wamala is the earlier, because the first Kabaka buried at Kasubi was the son of Suuna II (1837–56). The internal arrangements of the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga at Kasubi replicate those at Wamala; the traditional objects at the

latter are all in wood, replicated in metal by those at Kasubi. It would seem, therefore, that Kasubi can best be understood as a development of the formative processes represented at Wamala, and should not be divorced from them.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

- General

a. Wamala should be recognized now as an integral part of the ensemble containing Kasubi and as a future addition to this nomination should it be inscribed on the World Heritage List. Wamala will therefore in due course need to enjoy a similar restorative and maintenance regime to that Kasubi, so meanwhile some effort should be made at least to prevent deterioration of its critical elements.

b. Aware of the considerable input in recent years from ICCROM, UNESCO, the World Heritage Centre, and CRATerre-EAG, the ICOMOS mission was highly impressed with the synergy at Kasubi between the locally derived traditions and techniques and those based on scientific principles. This experience and the results should be publicized in the interests of global conservation issues.

c. While Kasubi is a Buganda heritage site, it is also a significant component of Uganda heritage as would indeed be acknowledged in the title were Kasubi to be inscribed on the World Heritage List. Central government funding of the site, in part at least, could well be reconsidered.

- Site-specific

d. The Management Plan states that the car park is in front of the site and that the ticket office is in a poor state of conservation, but no mention of improvements here is made other than noting that the latter requires some conservation works. Rather than repairing the ticket office *in situ*, it should be demolished, and the whole issue of car-parking and ticketing should be reconsidered in the context of a review of visitor reception aimed at improving the visitor welcome while restoring respect to the traditional entrance by removing facilities for that purpose away from the entrance.

e. In this context, ICOMOS notes the proposal for a cultural village as an added tourist attraction, but could discover in the dossier nothing about where this development is to be sited or about its nature. It strongly recommends that very careful consideration be given to the character and theme(s) of this village, and to its location. The latter could perhaps be away from the core area of the site, and the possibility of carrying out ticketing functions within it might then be particularly appropriate.

f. The Masiro road serves as the western boundary of the nominated site. Beside it on its west (ie immediately outside the site) is the mausoleum of a Katiro, a tomb belonging to Jundu, son of Muteesa I, and the site of a 1971 ceremony involving the return of the body of Muteesa II. These landmarks are there because they are an integral part of Kasubi. They should therefore be considered as part of the core area of the nomination.

g. The ICOMOS mission commends highly the work under way on the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga and

ICOMOS recommends that all other structures be tackled following the same principles and appropriate methodologies, that is using traditional materials and techniques and recording both the state of conservation and the course of the work on each structure.

h. Particular attention should be given to reinforcing the traditional roles played by such officials as the Nalinga and the Lubunga.

i. ICOMOS recognizes the crucial nature and roles of the agricultural and horticultural area of the site downhill from the royal structures, particularly on its east, and in order to reinforce the concept of this area as an integral part of the site would therefore recommend that the whole be inscribed as a cultural landscape. ICOMOS also has in mind the analogies with the Colline Royale d'Ambohimanga (Madagascar) which was nominated, and is recommended for inscription, as a cultural landscape.

j. There may be some merit in reconsidering the outer boundary of the buffer zone so that it accords with some reality on the ground such as vegetation, topography, or street/property lines, rather than simply being a regular geometric shape.

k. Noting the considerable assistance already given to this carefully selected site by the World Heritage Centre, and noting its extremely fragile nature in terms of its situation, nature, and proposed management, it is suggested that, should the site be inscribed on the World Heritage List, a mission to review the situation may well be helpful to all concerned two to three years after inscription.

Brief description

The Tombs of Buganda Kings at Kasubi is a site embracing almost 30ha of hillside now within Kampala. Most of the site is agricultural, farmed by traditional methods. At its core on the hilltop, retaining its original plan, is the former palace of the Kasanga of Baganda, built in 1882 and converted into the royal burial ground in 1884. Four royal tombs now lie within the Muzibu Azaala Mpanga, the main building, which is circular in plan and dome-like in shape. It is a major example of architectural achievement in organic materials, here principally wood, thatch, reed, and wattle and daub. Maintenance is continuous and traditional. The site's main significance lies, however, in its intangible values of belief, spirituality, continuity and identity.

Recommendation and statement of significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, iii, iv, and vi*:

The most important value associated with the Kasubi Tombs site are the strong elements of intangible heritage. The built and natural elements of the site, which is an outstanding example of traditional *Ganda* architecture and palace design, are charged with historical, traditional, and spiritual values. The site is regarded as the major spiritual centre for the Baganda. It also serves as an important historical and cultural symbol for Uganda and East Africa as a whole.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Fertő-Neusiedler Lake (Austria/Hungary)

No 772rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Natural Site and Cultural Landscape of Fertő-Neusiedler Lake
<i>Location</i>	Burgenland, Austria Győr-Moson-Sopron County, Hungary
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Austria and Republic of Hungary
<i>Date</i>	7 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Fertő-Neusiedler Lake and its surroundings are an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement and land-use which is representative of a culture. The present character of the landscape is the result of millennia-old land-use forms based on stock-raising and viticulture to an extent not found in other European lake areas. The historic centre of the medieval free town of Rust constitutes an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement representative of the area. The town exhibits the special building mode of a society and culture within which the lifestyles of townspeople and farmers form a united whole.

Criterion v

Notes

- i. Other elements under criterion v were advanced by the States Parties but are excluded here because they lie outside the nominated area.
- ii. This property is nominated as a *mixed* site; the natural significance has been assessed by IUCN and a report is awaited.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. Under paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, it is also a *cultural landscape*.

History and Description

History

Two broad periods can be discerned: from *c* 6000 BC until the establishment of the Hungarian state in the 11th century AD and from the 11th century until the present. The

nomination lies in a region that was Hungarian territory from the 10th century until World War I.

The landscape began to be developed from at least the 6th millennium BC. Then, early Neolithic communities lived in large permanent villages: a row of such settlements follows the southern shore of the Lake. Cultural and trading connections with neighbouring areas are characteristics of a later Neolithic phase. Distinct cultural attributes distinguish a phase at the beginning of the 4th millennium when settlements were on different sites and cattle-raising was the basis of the economy. Metallurgy was introduced around 2000 BC, and thereafter this area shared in what appears to be a general European prosperity of the 2nd millennium BC. One of its manifestations was the dispersal of amber: the Amber Route connecting the Baltic and the Adriatic passed near the Lake.

From the 7th century BC onwards the shore of the Lake was densely populated, initially by people of the Early Iron Age Hallstatt culture and on through late prehistoric and Roman times. In the fields of almost every village around the Lake are remains of Roman villas. Two in Fertőrákos are accompanied by a 3rd century Mithraic temple open to visitors. The Roman hegemony was ended in the late 4th century, however, by the first of numerous invasions, beginning a phase of continual change and bewildering replacement of one people by another until the Avar Empire in the 9th century. Hungarians occupied the Carpathian Basin and became the overlords of the Lake area around AD 900.

A new state and public administration system was established in the 11th century. Sopron, a place with prehistoric and Roman origins, became the seat of the bailiff and centre of the county named after it. The basis of the current network of towns and villages was formed in the 12th and 13th centuries, their markets flourishing from 1277 onwards, when they were effectively relieved of many fiscal duties. A migration of German settlers started in the 13th century and continued throughout the Middle Ages. The mid-13th century Tartar invasion left this area unharmed, and it enjoyed uninterrupted development throughout medieval times until the Turkish conquest in the late 16th century. The economic basis throughout was the export of animals and wine.

Rust in particular prospered on the wine trade. Its refortification in the early 16th century as a response to the then emerging Ottoman threat marked the beginning of a phase of construction in the area, first with fortifications and then, during the 17th–19th centuries, with the erection and adaptation of domestic buildings. The liberation of the peasants after 1848 and the political situation after 1867 promoted development and building activity was renewed. The most important events locally in the second half of the 19th century were the construction of railways and the completion of the water management facilities.

In the 20th century, the Austro-Hungarian frontier created after World War I divided the area into two, but true isolation started only with the establishment of the Iron Curtain between the Communist world and the rest of Europe after World War II. It was at Fertőrákos, "the place where the first brick was knocked out of the Berlin wall," that participants at a Pan-European Picnic tore down the barbed wire and re-opened the frontier which still crosses the Lake.

Description

The site lies between the Alps, 70km distant, and the lowlands in the territory of two states, Austria and Hungary. The Lake itself is in an advanced state of sedimentation, with extensive reed stands. It has existed for 500 years within an active water management regime. In the 19th century canalization of Hanság shut the Lake off from its freshwater marshland. Since 1912, completion of a circular dam ending at Hegykő to the south prevents flooding.

The Lake is surrounded by an inner ring of sixteen settlements and an outer ring of twenty other settlements. However, only three – Podersdorf, Illmitz, and Apetion – are entirely within the nominated area, with parts of Rust and Fertőrákos also included. The Palace of the township of Nagycenk is included as a detached part of the core zone; Fertőd Palace is also included, though in a detached area of core zone outside the buffer zone.

Among the three dozen or so settlements within the buffer zone, several are picked out as being particularly noteworthy by the nomination: Rust above all, but also Mörbisch, with its typical narrow lanes, Donnerkirschen, with its homogeneous settlement structure, walled Purbach, Breitenbrunn with its peel tower, and Fertőrákos, formerly a lakeside settlement but now left high and dry as the Lake has shrunk. It must be stressed, however, that, except for parts of the first and last in that list, none are within the nominated area, and so they are not further described here.

Two palaces are both within detached portions of core area. Széchenyi Palace, Nagycenk, lies at the southern end of the Lake, associated above all with one of the greatest personalities in modern Hungarian history, Earl Széchenyi István (1791–1860). The settlement itself was created by merging several smaller medieval villages. The Palace is a detached ensemble of buildings in the centre of a large park, initially built in the mid-18th century in place of a former manor house. It acquired some of its present form and appearance around 1800. An addition in the 1830s after English models was accompanied by sanitary novelties, while on the east were the stables for some twenty stallions and sixty mares bought by Earl Széchenyi in England as a basis for renewed horse-breeding in Hungary. The Baroque Palace garden originated in the 17th century. Its main avenue leads 2.6 km to the lake-shore. In the late 18th century an English-style landscape garden was laid out. Following fashion, major trees were added in the 1860s. They and other plants survived World War II but the building was much damaged.

Between 1769 and 1790 Joseph Haydn's compositions were first heard in the Fertőd Esterházy Palace. It was the most important 18th century palace of Hungary, built after the model of Versailles. The plan of the palace, garden, and park was on geometrical lines which extended to the new village of Esterháza. There, outside the palace settlement, were public buildings, industrial premises, and residential quarters. The Palace itself is laid out around a square with rounded internal corners. To the south is an enormous French Baroque garden; the main avenue is more than 1km long. The garden itself has been changed several times, the present design being essentially of 1762. The garden was reconstructed in 1904 after a long period of disuse and the Baroque composition, though many of its elements require restoration, remains almost intact.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Ownership is complex: in the Austrian part of the nomination less than 1% lies with the State, the bulk of the 41,590ha belonging to private owners and communities. In the Hungarian part, within the Fertő-Hanság National Park the State owns 10,790ha (86%), with other owners there and elsewhere in the nominated areas being local government, the Church, and private individuals.

Cultural property, including outstanding monuments, groups of buildings, and objects, is protected by the Austrian Monument Protection Act 1923, subsequently amended several times. The entire historic centre of the free town of Rust is under a preservation order. In Hungary, the legal situation continues to evolve. The Fertő-Hanság National Park was created in 1994, and now the nationalization of National Park land formerly owned by co-operatives should soon be completed. New laws replacing the object-and-monument-centred approach are in train. Law No 65 of 1990 made the protection of the built environment a task of both the communities and county-level local government. Law No 54 of 1997 endeavours to promote the interests of monument preservation within a holistic concept of protecting the built environment with due consideration to numerous other factors, including the promotion of public awareness of the cultural heritage. The Széchenyi Palace, Nagycenk, and the whole assembly of historic monuments come under this Law; the same applies to the Fertőd Esterházy Palace as well as the former Bishop's Palace and its garden in the protected area of Fertőrákos. Law No 78 of 1997 defines as an objective the protection of village-scapes and landscapes.

The Hungarian part of the nomination is covered by the National Land Use Plan, which recognizes the Fertő-Hanság National Park as a priority area and extremely sensitive in terms of cultural heritage. The Park has recently been successful in attracting significant foreign funding for infrastructural development. Overall, the objective is to preserve the entire heritage as one single entity.

Management

For conserving the existing cultural properties on both sides of the frontier, responsibilities are distributed between Federal, provincial, and local levels. In Austria the combined effects of the Monument Protection Act and village renewal regulation within a tourist context encourage sustainable tourism. In practice, work and resources are in the hands of the cultural office of the provincial government, the Burgenland tourist association, provincial museums, and village renewal advisory boards. The last produce binding village renewal plans which provide the framework for management and development.

Management is designed to supervise and monitor the state of preservation. A complete inventory of monuments and sites compiled at State level is available for conservation and management. Arrangements are similar on the Hungarian side.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The whole area has been a nature and landscape protection area since 1965, and the protection area has been classified as a reserve under the Ramsar Convention since 1983. The Fertő-Neusiedler Lake is a MAB Biosphere Reserve. In Austria, Neusiedler See-Seewinkel National Park (1993) is within the Ramsar area. The southern (Hungarian) end of the proposed site has been a landscape protection area since 1977 and the Fertő-Hanság National Park since 1992.

The traditional architectural monuments within the property and buffer zone are well preserved as regards the original fabric, appearance, and artistic effect. The continuing preservation and maintenance of the historic building material is guaranteed. Rust was declared a "model town" as a fully preserved vintners' town by the Council of Europe in 1975.

The provincial government of Burgenland recognizes the principle of sustainable tourism and the special needs of a region characterized by comprehensive landscape, nature, and monument conservation programmes. Since 1976 it has tried to reduce mass tourism in favour of individual travellers. Policies and programmes designed to present and promote the area are in place in a number of towns and villages and throughout the National Park. Nevertheless, especially in the Austrian part of the buffer zone, changes to the fabric of several settlements and in the appearance of numerous buildings, both as a result of unsympathetic modernization over the last decades of the 20th century, have cumulatively detracted from the historicity of an important element in the landscape. Tourism grew during the same period and the authorities nevertheless recognize that properly preserved houses and townscapes are among the area's main tourist attractions. The Hungarian National Park maintains a separate department responsible for "soft" or sustainable tourism in an area visited by c 500,000 people per year.

Authenticity and integrity

- Authenticity

The landscape overall and the scale as well as the internal structure and characteristically rural architecture of the towns and villages bear witness to an agricultural land-use and way of life uninterrupted since medieval times. The nomination dossier claims that "Both the area proposed for inscription and the buffer zone are characterized by a continuing settlement history dating back to the Middle Ages"; the settlement pattern, and indeed the occupation, of several present-day village sites actually go back to Roman times and more. Buildings, walls, and vistas have been preserved in such places as Donnerskirchen and Purbach, both nevertheless carefully excluded from the core zone of the nomination.

A varied ownership pattern is exemplified by the remarkable rural architecture of the very small villages situated in the buffer zone and by the Fertőd Esterhazy and Nagycenk Széchenyi Palaces, outstanding examples of the nobility's architecture of the 18th and 19th centuries.

- Integrity

The landscape of the Fertő-Neusiedler Lake area has advantageous natural and climatic conditions which have made it suitable for agricultural cultivation and stock-

breeding for thousands of years. The water, the reed-beds with their labyrinth of channels, the saline fields once flooded by salt water, the row of hills enclosing the lake from the west with forests and vineyards on top represent not only the natural-geographical component features but also hundreds of years of identical land-use, making the area a unique example of humans living in harmony with nature. The Leitha limestone, west of the Lake and quarried from Roman times until the mid-20th century, provided building stone to Sopron and Vienna as well as local settlements.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

A joint ICOMOS-IUCN expert mission visited the site in March 2001

Qualities

The area in general is of considerable cultural interest, though much of the landscape containing and expressing that interest lies in the buffer zone. The nominated area is primarily concerned with the Lake itself and its shores, and does not of itself constitute a cultural landscape. The Lake is changing and affecting its environs, yet much of the cultural value of the area lies in its genuinely unchanging qualities of way of life and landscape based upon a traditional and sustainable exploitation of a limited range of resources – particular habitats for reed-production, cattle-raising, fishing, and viticulture. Though tourism is both a change and a bringer of change, as a phenomenon it was recognized early and has been quite successfully controlled and modified to suit the area. As a result, and largely concerning the buffer zone, the insertion of the intrusively modern has been largely confined to some of the main settlements and is not generally apparent in either the wider landscape or individual farms. Much of the vernacular architecture is well preserved and is considered by many to be outstandingly attractive. One of the great palaces of Europe, with a smaller one of great national interest, stand in the core zone at the Lake's southern edge, both related, like everything else here, to the Lake itself.

Comparative analysis

The area is characterized by a long tradition of viticulture – strong red wines on the low level lime-based rock and light white wines on the eastern river bank since Roman times. A similar viticultural area occurs on the Balaton hills, Hungary, but they are on slopes and open straight on to the water without the intervention of reed beds. The cattle-raised beside the Lake, on the Aföld meadows, were driven to the Austrian and German markets. That they were raised here at all, however, results from the creation by natural forces of excellent pastures, which has permitted a particular type of economic activity otherwise more characteristic of Eastern Europe and Asian grassy biospheres, unknown to the west of Fertő-Neusiedler Lake.

Under "Comparative analysis" the nomination dossier asserts that "The geographical position of the Lake has contributed to an uninterrupted evolutionary process involving diverse civilizations across two thousand years. Such an organic evolution, interaction and close association between the Lake and the local population cannot be found in any of the comparable lakes." However, no further comparative analysis of cultural matters is offered there, though elsewhere it is stated that "The

organic, historical and diverse associations of humans with the ecological environment in the Fertő-Neusiedler Lake area is unique among the salty, saline lakes of the world." However, the comparative analysis of cultural matters offered by the States Parties is weak: two assertions do not constitute a compelling argument. On a comparative basis, the nominated area of the Fertő-Neusiedler Lake and its immediate surrounds are not presented as at all exceptional in terms of cultural quality or history.

In fact, lakeside settlement by humans involving fishing and stock-raising is common throughout Europe and has been since the advent of people with domesticated animals c 6000 BC. It flourished in particular around, for example, Swiss lakes in the 2nd millennium BC, the Somerset marshes in England in the 1st millennium BC, and Scottish and Irish lakes in the 1st millennium AD. A combination of stock-raising and fishing with viticulture beside a lake, as distinct from other crops and watersides, is, however, less common and obviously confined to the wine-growing zone. Analogues should therefore probably be sought in the Mediterranean region or, for example, in the Rhône or Rhine/Moselle drainage basins. A further qualification is added in this case, however, because the Lake is saline, which makes the combination of qualities rare. This is perhaps emphasized by the obviously comparable saline lakes in, for example, Israel whose shores support neither viticulture nor cattle-breeding. IUCN has prepared from the point of view of natural interest a comparative analysis of saline lakes in the world for its report.

In comparable terms, a strong argument for a rare combination of factors occurring at Fertő-Neusiedler Lake can probably be advanced, including interactions between people and nature. However, more thought needs to be given to the expression of that cultural and cultural/natural dimension in the landscape, both on the ground in terms of what exactly needs to be nominated, and why, and on paper to develop whatever line of argument proves most appropriate for World Heritage cultural landscape purposes..

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

i The documentation specifies only one *cultural criterion* (v) to justify this nomination. The whole area does indeed clearly constitute an "example of a traditional human settlement and land-use," and one criterion may well be sufficient; but most of the human settlement is excluded from the nominated area and discussion of land-use is conducted by simplistic reiteration. ICOMOS strongly advises that it is essential to demonstrate by the production of good cultural evidence (for example from documentary research), and by cogent argument, that an area is a cultural landscape in World Heritage terms.

ii ICOMOS notes in particular that the nomination is over-reliant on its reiteration throughout of the importance of the string of lake-side settlements which are – judging by the care with which the boundary of the core zone avoids them – nevertheless deliberately excluded from the nominated area. This discordance between perception and text/graphics is nowhere explained. Furthermore, not one settlement is illustrated with a plan, nor are either of the two palaces which are within the nomination. The section on "Cultural property," which is mainly about the villages excluded from the core zone, is therefore in a sense largely irrelevant, unnecessarily long, and difficult to follow.

iii The absence of plans is a serious impediment to understanding the detail and nuances of this nomination. It also suggests an absence of realization that settlement-form and settlement pattern are "cultural." There is no serious spatial/historical analysis of the settlements, though clearly this could contribute much to the interest of the nomination, especially if at least some settlements, carefully selected by clearly stated criteria, were included in the nomination. They are an integral part of the cultural landscape physically and should also be integral both conceptually and, in practice, in the way the nomination is defined and presented. ICOMOS advises that it regards this matter as central to a successful nomination in this case and would encourage the nominees to address it.

iv In addition to the major query about the line of the boundary of the core zone, there are several queries about detail of boundaries as they stand at present.

v ICOMOS notes that this property is nominated as a mixed site, the cultural aspect being defined as a cultural landscape. It recommends that, if the Fertő-Neusiedler Lake area is to be considered as such, the nomination requires significant reconsideration of the boundaries of the core area, and of the concepts within which they are redefined. In particular, the States Parties should be invited to clarify their thinking about and presentation of the lakeside villages, and about fields and field systems, preferably in conjunction with their villages.

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this nomination be *referred back* to the two State Parties, requesting them to revise it as proposed in "ICOMOS recommendations and comments" above, paragraph v. In the event that the revised text is submitted in time and found to be satisfactory, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criterion v*:

The Fertő-Neusiedler Lake area is the meeting place of peoples arriving as migrants or conquerors. The dynamism of the Lake itself has presented people with both challenges to face and a resource to exploit since their arrival here some eight thousand years ago. The diverse cultural landscape of which it is the core has been created by an organic process of evolution, by the work of man living in symbiosis with the natural environment.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Masada (Israel)

No 1040

Identification

Nomination Masada National Park

Location Tamar Region

State Party Israel

Date 30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Masada is a cultural and natural heritage site, with universal importance. It is an isolated rock in a remote corner of the Judean Desert, facing the Dead Sea and expressing the special geology and nature of that area. Its archaeological remains relate to three periods of human settlement on the site which are chronologically separated and different in character. Each reflects on one hand certain uniqueness and on the other a fabric of intertwined human cultural contexts of its period.

The sophisticated water system at Masada transformed a barren, isolated hilltop with an arid climate into a lavish royal retreat. This system used run-off water from a single day of rain to sustain life for a thousand people for two to three years.

The "hanging" Northern Palace with its three terraces presents the ultimate challenge in designing and building in extreme conditions. It is a masterpiece of the engineering and architecture of antiquity.

Criterion i

The developments in architecture and landscape design illustrated by the three Herodian and later Zealot building phases at Masada illustrate an important interchange of human values over time. The early Herodian phase was one of survival, but in which Roman architecture and the Roman way of life were introduced into a harsh natural environment. With the main Herodian phase a lavish architectural style was adopted and fully integrated into the desert landscape. The fear and paranoia of the king resulted in the site being heavily fortified in the late Herodian period. Finally, a humbler form of architecture was introduced during the Zealot phase, suitable for a simpler way of life adapted to the harsh living conditions.

Criterion ii

The fall of Masada in 73 CE symbolized the end of the Second Temple Period, which was a major turning point in Jewish history. The Masada synagogue is one of the earliest examples of a ceremonial prayer building during the last phase of the Second Temple Period and after the destruction of the Temple in Jerusalem.

Criterion iii

The ruins of Masada reflect several stages in human history. These include classical Roman architecture (palace, bath-houses, store-rooms, water system, military installations), humble Jewish domestic architecture (with a synagogue and ritual baths), and early Christian monasticism. The most outstanding elements of these are the Roman siege works around the mountain, the most complete in the world and almost completely unexcavated, and the Northern Palace.

Criterion iv

The ruins and historical accounts of Masada are directly associated with the most fundamental human values. Issues decided at Masada – the few against the many, liberty versus slavery, religious freedom versus oppression, life versus death – are subjects of universal moral and academic discussion and will long continue to be so.

Criterion vi

Note This property is nominated as a mixed site. Its evaluation under the natural criteria will be carried out by IUCN.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

The history of Masada is known principally from the work of Flavius Josephus, the Jewish historian of the 1st century CE, and from the excavations of 1963–65.

According to Josephus, the site was first fortified by the High Priest Jonathan. There were two High Priests of this name in the 2nd century BCE and it is not certain to which he was referring. The only material from the Hasmonaean period (103–40 BCE) so far discovered in excavations at Masada is a number of coins of Alexander Jannaeus, from the early part of the period. There is evidence in the form of archaeological finds in a cave that there was human settlement there in the Chalcolithic period (4th millennium BCE) and then in the Early Iron Age (10th–7th century BCE).

Herod the Great (ruled 37–4 BCE) selected the virtually impregnable site of Masada to build a refuge for himself and his family at a period when he felt himself threatened both internally by the Jews of his kingdom and externally by Cleopatra, who wanted to add Judaea to her Egyptian kingdom. At first the buildings were relatively modest, though conforming with classical Roman architectural forms. They were progressively enlarged and lavishly decorated, to become a luxurious royal palace. Towards the end of his reign Herod felt himself threatened once again and so the fortifications were rebuilt and reinforced.

To the *early phase* (c 35 BCE) belong the nucleus of the Western Palace, three small palaces, an administrative building, a barracks, three *columbaria* (also used as watch-towers), several large cisterns, and a swimming pool. These buildings are scattered all over the hilltop, without any apparent overall plan. The architects had previously served the Hasmonaean court, and the early buildings are strikingly similar to those at Jericho.

The *main phase* is dated to the mid 20s of the 1st century BCE. The most important new construction was the large Northern Palace; close by was the large bath-house, for the use of the king and his family and guests. Also close to the palace was a large storage complex composed of eighteen long store-rooms. This group, together with an administrative building, are located at the highest point of the hilltop and constitute a defensible acropolis or citadel.

The Western Palace was considerably enlarged at this time. A series of very large cisterns were dug, and new access paths were laid out. By contrast with the early period, the new works carried out in this period appear to have been carried out in accordance with a plan. They are integrated into two complexes, one around the Northern Palace and the other round the Western Palace. The architecture is also different in that it is in the full Roman style and tradition.

In the *final phase*, dated to around 15 BCE, the most important new construction was the casemate wall, 1290m long, which surrounds the entire summit. In addition, some small modifications and additions were made to the northern complex.

With the end of the Herodian dynasty in 6 BCE Judaea came under direct Roman rule, and a small garrison was installed at Masada. At the beginning of the Jewish Revolt in 66 a group of Zealots led by Menahem, one of the Jewish leaders, surprised and slaughtered the garrison. The Zealots held Masada throughout the revolt, and many Jews settled there, particularly after the fall of Jerusalem and the destruction of the Temple by Titus in 70. They occupied some of the Herodian palace buildings, and added more modest structures of their own, such as a synagogue, a ritual bath, and small houses.

Two years later Flavius Silva, the Roman Governor, decided to eliminate this last remaining centre of Jewish resistance. He sent the X Legion and a number of auxiliary units there, with many prisoners of war for manual duties. The Jews, led by Eleazar Ben Yair, prepared for a long siege as the Romans and their prisoners built camps at the base of the hill and a long siege wall (circumvallation). On a rocky site near the western approach to Masada they constructed a massive ramp of stones and rammed earth. A giant siege tower with a battering ram was constructed and moved laboriously up the completed ramp. It succeeded in breaching the wall of the fortress in 73, allowing the Roman soldiers to enter.

The Zealots defended stoutly, but there was no hope of resisting the Roman attack for long. Josephus reports that Ben Yair talked to the 960 men, women, and children who survived, telling them that "a glorious death is preferable to a life of infamy." All but two took their own lives on 2 May 73.

A Roman garrison was once again installed at Masada and stayed there for some forty years. It occupied both the hilltop and the fortress constructed by Flavius Silva for the besiegers. After the withdrawal of the Roman garrison, the site was abandoned until the 5th century. Following a powerful earthquake, which caused most of the surviving Herodian buildings to collapse, a small community of Christian monks established themselves on the hilltop. They built a modest chapel and lived in primitive cells constructed from the ruins and in caves. After some decades this community was disbanded and Masada was deserted until excavations began in the 1960s.

Description

The towering hill of Masada, with its precipitous flanks, overlooks a natural landscape of savage beauty. To the west lies the Judaeian Desert, with its hills and terraces: it is arid, yet can burst into bloom during a rainy winter. To the east is a wildly broken terrain, running down to the brilliant colours of the Dead Sea. A giant scarp stretches to the south away to the horizon – the western wall of the Syrian-African rift valley – and Masada forms part of this scarp. The top of the hill is roughly trapezoidal, measuring c 600m x 300m.

- The northern area (Herodian period)

The main structure here is the *Northern Palace*, which in its present form is from the main phase (late 1st century BCE). It was built on three slightly modified natural rock terraces. The upper level, through which access was gained to the Palace, was mainly used for residential purposes, with two wings of bedrooms flanking a hall; all were originally decorated with mosaic floors and wall paintings. To the north of the bedrooms there is a semi-circular colonnaded terrace surrounding what was probably a garden.

On the two lower levels are to be found imposing colonnaded reception halls, one rounded and the other rectangular; both had bathing facilities. The lower reception level is the best preserved of the three. Access was through a trapezoid courtyard, with store-rooms, meal preparation facilities, and a small bathhouse below and around it. There are two rock-hewn cisterns underneath.

On a small hill just to the south of the Northern Palace is the *large bath-house*. The large courtyard entrance was probably used as a *palaestra* (exercise area). The bathing facilities consisted of a changing room (*apodyterium*), a cold room (*tepidarium*) in the form of a stepped pool, and a large hot room (*caldarium*) with a barrel-vaulted roof. The entire complex was originally decorated with mosaic floors and wall paintings, but the floor mosaics were later replaced by coloured stone slabs (*opus sectile*). In addition, here are the remains of the heating furnaces and water installations.

The *store-rooms complex* originally contained 18 rooms, 13 of which were 26m long. They are surrounded by a system of long corridors, also probably used for storage. It was easily defensible, with only two entrances. In addition, there were two (perhaps three) guard towers. A number of long storerooms were added to this complex at the end of the final phase, together with another small bath-house.

- The western area (Herodian period)

Work on the *Western Palace* began in the early phase, but it was substantially enlarged and rebuilt in the main phase. To the nucleus, which consisted of a courtyard (with in all probability a garden) surrounded by bedrooms and reception rooms, were added two extensive service wings. Their functions would have been varied: storage of furniture, domestic utensils, and food, and food preparation for all the palaces on the summit.

The Palace was expanded once more in the final phase, with the addition of new wings, including four long storerooms. It became the largest building on the hilltop. Its size and layout, together with the opulence of its decoration (mosaic floors and walls of white plastered painted to imitate marble panels). This confirms the hypothesis that this was the

ceremonial palace, the Northern Palace being the private palace for the king and his family.

There is a number of smaller palaces, residential blocks, and administrative buildings to the east of the Western palace and between it and the Northern Palace.

- The defences (Herodian period)

The *casemate wall* was built in the final phase. This massive defensive wall, 1290m in length, contains nearly 70 rooms on its inner side, some more than 30m long, and has 27 towers. Three gates pierce the wall: the Western Gate, the Southern Gate, and the Snake Path Gate (the eastern gate). The existing Water Gate, which gave access to the Northern Palace, was not incorporated into the casemate wall.

- Water management

A number of deep cisterns were dug into the rock of Masada in all three phases. The small ones dug during the first phase were filled by run-off from the hill-top itself during the winter. During the main phase two rows of cisterns were dug beneath the hill-top. The row of four 130m below the summit each had a capacity of 4000m³. The second row was 50m higher: the eight cisterns were each capable of receiving 3000m³. Water was delivered through a network of dams and channels into this system during the winter floods in the wadis to the west of Masada.

- Structures from the Zealot period

Most of the buildings on the hilltop were occupied by the around one thousand people who lived there at that time, and more particularly the casemates and the smaller palaces (the Western Palace appears to have been used for communal and administrative purposes). Large rooms were partitioned into smaller units, existing entrances were blocked and new ones opened, and temporary constructions added. Facilities for baking and cooking, water, and storage were also inserted.

The most important new feature from this time was the *synagogue*, a square building from the Herodian period that was probably used as a stable. Three rows of benches, characteristic of early synagogues, were built round the walls, and the *genizah* (depository for superseded scrolls) under the floor of the back room.

Seven or eight ritual baths (*mikveh*) were identified, including one large stepped immersion pool to the south of the Western Palace. A public hall was also constructed at this time attached to one of the smaller palaces.

- Roman military remains

There is a network of eight Roman *military camps* around Masada, none of which has been excavated. Two are large, two smaller. One of the large camps lies to the east and the other to the west of Masada. Evidence from aerial survey and probing show them to be standard Roman legionary fortresses of quadrilateral plan. In that lying to the west (which is believed to have been the headquarters of Flavius Silva) a smaller sector had been fortified later, to form the headquarters of the later garrison. Both lie outside the circumvallation, whereas the smaller ones are more closely associated with that long earthwork. A striking feature of all the Roman camps are the hundreds of *contubernia* (messing units), consisting of walls of stones 1–1.5m high on which the soldiers erected their leather tents.

The great ramp used for the final assault was built of soil and stones braced by an armature of timber beams.

- The Byzantine church

The church is located virtually in the centre of the summit, and its walls still stand to a considerable height. It was built of coursed dolomite, most of it robbed from the ruins of the Herodian buildings. The walls were bonded with lime mortar. The floor was originally covered with a mosaic, but much of this was removed to the Louvre in Paris after a 19th century excavation. The walls were plastered, and surviving fragments show that it was decorated with designs made of coloured stones and potsherds. The plan is the characteristic rectangular hall with an apse at the east end and a narthex at the west end.

- Building materials and techniques

Most of the Herodian walls and their foundations were built of undressed blocks of the local dolomite, bonded with mortar made of local earth mixed with straw. The blocks were laid in courses, with larger blocks (c 90cm long) in the lower courses. The only worked stones were those used for constructing corners and doorjambs. Walls varied in thickness between 60cm and 95cm. The defensive walls are different both in dimensions and construction. They average 6.5m in thickness and consist of an outer wall 1.4m thick and an inner one 0.95m thick filled with rubble.

The use of ashlar (dressed stone) is very rare at Masada: it is restricted to the three terraces of the Northern Palace and the three *columbaria*. Here the stone used was not the hard local dolomite but a soft grey-green limestone. Sandstone was used where precision was needed: columns, architraves, central pillars in staircases, etc. These materials were either extracted from nearby quarries or from quarries near Jericho, the latter being brought to Masada by boat. A lime-based mortar was used in such cases

With the exception of the casemate walls, all the walls (and many of the ceilings) were plastered. In many interiors a plaster of earth and straw was used, identical with the mortar used for wall building. This was probably coated with a lime wash, though little of this has survived.

Lime-based plaster was also used in some cases, both internally and externally. Where plaster was used on external surfaces, it extended either over the lower section only or over the entire surface. A special plaster containing ash as well as lime (hydraulic plaster) was used in rooms exposed to high humidity, notably the bath-houses, cisterns, and water channels.

These techniques are to be found, to a high level of craftsmanship, on the more substantial buildings from the Zealot period.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The entire site is a National Park, established under the provisions of the National Parks, Nature Reserves, Memorial Sites and National Sites Law (1998), and the archaeological sites are covered by the Antiquities Law (1978). The National Park is further protected by being entirely surrounded by the Judean Desert Nature Reserve, also established under the 1998 Act. There is also a belt of open

land between the site and the Dead Sea which is protected as open agricultural land under the provisions of a local master plan under the Planning and Building Law 1965. There are very severe penalties for any unauthorized actions that in any way affect the qualities of the National Park and the archaeological monuments.

Management

The entire nominated area and the buffer zone are owned by the State of Israel.

Management of the Masada National Park and of the Judean Desert Nature Reserve is the legal responsibility of the Nature and Parks Protection Authority, whilst responsibility for the archaeological sites is vested in the Israel Antiquities Authority. The belt of agricultural land comes under the control of the Regional Council.

Direct management of the Park is in the hands of the Park Director. The nature reserves around the archaeological site is regularly patrolled by rangers, operating from En Gedi oasis and Arad, 20km north and 25km west of Masada respectively.

The headquarters of the Nature and Parks Protection Authority has planning committees which are responsible for approving and implementing development plans. Independent experts attend the meetings of these committees and public hearings are held to consider issues of outstanding national and international interest. The Israel Antiquities Authority has an independent conservation committee which considers conservation and reconstruction proposals and projects.

Following the merger of the Nature Reserves Authority with the National Parks Authority in 1998 an outline management plan for heritage sites in nature reserves was prepared with the assistance of the Getty Conservation Institute. An updated version is nearing completion: the coverage is comprehensive and fully in conformity with the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* so far as the cultural heritage element is concerned.

One of the most serious problems is that of visitor numbers: currently the number of visitors is around 650,000, and it is forecast that this figure will rise to 900,000 by 2001 and 1.25 million by 2010 (it should be noted, however, that the current disturbed internal political situation has resulted in a drastic reduction in visitor numbers). There have also been determined efforts in recent years to commercialize the archaeological site. These points were given special consideration in the development programme

A project for the construction of an hotel and recreation area 11km to the north has been shelved. A policy of prohibiting commercial activities of any kind or picnic facilities on the summit has been rigorously maintained. There is now a visitors' trail on the summit with interpretation along its length.

A new entrance project on the eastern side, almost entirely invisible from the summit, is nearing completion and all facilities are being moved there. This will house interpretive material, conservation facilities, management offices, restaurants, etc. The building is well designed so as not to conflict with its historic and natural environment and sited so as to have a minimal visual impact when viewed from the

summit. There are underground parking facilities for cars and small buses and an open park for coaches.

A number of commercial enterprises are to be relocated in a new facility that will not be visible from the summit. The youth hostel is also to be located here.

A new cable car, which began operating in May 1999, has halved the waiting time for visitors; this starts from the new entrance. The site of its upper terminal was carefully selected: it is located below the ancient entrance gate and access to the site proper is via a bridge. All the facilities that are being replaced are being demolished and the land restored to its earlier appearance.

Of particular importance is the project to dismantle and relocate the service cable lift, which dates from the excavations in the 1960s. At present this passes directly above the Roman ramp and enters the enclosure through the breach made by the besiegers, which is one of the key historical locations on the site.

There is a *son-et-lumière* installation below the western side of the hill, used principally for educational purposes.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The site was first identified as that of Masada by two travellers in 1863. Other visits followed in the second half of the 19th century and the 20th century, in particular the scholars responsible for the Palestine Exploration Fund's Survey of Western Palestine in 1867 and 1875.

A limited archaeological survey was carried out in 1955–56, sponsored by the Israel Exploration Society, the Hebrew University, and the Department of Antiquities. In 1963–65 Professor Yigael Yadin carried out his celebrated excavation. The decision was taken before the excavations ended to open the site to the public as a national park, and conservation work began immediately the excavators moved out.

The work was based on a plan set up by a committee of specialists, according to the prevailing standards of the period (which involved the use of Portland cement, now almost entirely replaced). Conservators from Israel and abroad have worked on the site continuously since that time, continually updating their techniques and expertise. In the course of the past five years, since the Masada development project began, most of the buildings in the northern area have been worked on. Work has been carried out to evaluate and improve the stability of the rock. A major stabilization and conservation project is in progress on the Western Palace by a team headed by Professor John Ashurst (University of Oxford, UK).

As part of the development project there is a five-year conservation programme, due to end during 2001, which has involved fifteen trained conservators and twenty unskilled workers. From 2002 onwards there will be a planned maintenance programme operated by a team of between five and seven trained workers. This will coincide with the introduction of a systematic monitoring process. A detailed manual has been prepared, covering different aspects of conservation, maintenance, and management, and is systematically updated.

An important part of the management plan is the decision to carry out no further research excavation on the main site "in the present generation." Limited excavation will be permitted when necessitated by conservation or restoration projects.

Authenticity and integrity

This is a site that remained untouched for more than thirteen centuries. The buildings and other evidence of human settlement gradually collapsed and were covered over until they were revealed in the 1960s. There have been no additions or reconstruction (beyond an acceptable level of anastylosis), and inappropriate materials used in early conservation projects are being replaced. Certain significant archaeological elements, such as the Roman camps and siegeworks, remain virtually untouched. The authenticity is therefore of a very high level.

There is a case for examining the integrity of Masada, like most archaeological sites. As mentioned above, nothing has been added and nothing taken away from the remains. Of equal importance is the fact that the setting of Masada, the magnificent wild scenery of this region, has not changed over many millennia. The only intrusions are the visitor facilities, which in their new form have been designed and sited sympathetically, and the cable car. The latter has been, and still is, controversial. However, access to the summit is extremely arduous: if some assistance were not provided, many of the Jewish people for whom this site has immense symbolic value would be unable to visit it. The new facilities at each end have been designed and, in the case of the upper terminal, located with care, so as to minimize their visual impact.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

A joint ICOMOS-IUCN expert mission visited Masada in March 2001.

Qualities

Masada is a dramatically located site of great natural beauty on which the Judaean king Herod the Great constructed a sumptuous palace complex in classical Roman style. After Judaea became a province of the Roman Empire, it was the refuge of the last survivors of the Jewish revolt, who chose death rather than slavery when the Roman besiegers broke through their defences. As such it has an emblematic value for the Jewish people.

It is also an archaeological site of great significance. The remains of Herod's palaces are outstanding and very intact examples of this type of architecture, whilst the untouched siegeworks are the finest and most complete anywhere in the Roman world.

Comparative analysis

There are several imperial Roman villas from the 1st centuries BCE and CE of which substantial remains survive. The closest to Herod the Great's villa at Masada is probably the slightly later *Villa Jovis* built by Tiberius on a similar prominent site on the island of Capri. However, it differs in a number of respects, notably the fact that it lacks the associated administrative structures of Masada and its massive defences.

For the Roman military camps, circumvallation, and ramp there is no site that can compare with Masada in terms of visibility and completeness.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Careful consideration needs to be given to the siting of the coach park at the entrance facility. The present site interrupts the line of the Roman siege wall between two forts. The black tarmac surface is intrusive when seen from above.

Whilst good relations clearly exist between the groups responsible for the management of the "cultural" and "natural" elements, it would be desirable for there to be careful scrutiny of their respective objectives and programmes in order to ensure homogeneity and avoid potential conflicts.

Brief description

Masada, the site of the self-immolation of nearly a thousand Jewish patriots in the face of a large Roman army, was built as a palace complex and place of refuge by Herod the Great, King of Judaea. Its extensive remains survive on the summit of this seemingly impregnable fortress, set in a rugged natural landscape of great beauty. Below are the unexcavated sites and siegeworks of a large Roman army

Recommendation and Statement of Significance

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *cultural criteria iii, iv, and vi*:

The palace complex built by Herod the Great, King of Judaea, on the summit of the dramatic mountain site of Masada in the 1st century BCE consists of an exceptional group of classical Roman Imperial buildings. When this natural defensive site, further strengthened by massive walls, was occupied by survivors of the Jewish Revolt against Roman rule, it was successfully besieged by a massive Roman army. The group of military camps and siegeworks at Masada are the most complete anywhere in the Roman world. Masada is a poignant symbol of the continuing human struggle between oppression and liberty.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Sikhote-Alin (Russian Federation)

No 766rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Natural complex «Central Sikhote-Alin»
<i>Location</i>	Ternejski, Krasnoarmejski, Dalnegorski, and Pozharski Districts, Primorski Region
<i>State Party</i>	Russian Federation
<i>Date</i>	27 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Archaeological monuments include late Palaeolithic sites with material analogues on Hokkaido Island (Japan), a reminder that, as with the natural history, the property occupies a key location in the study of the interface between Eurasia and further east including, ultimately, North America. Bronze Age and medieval sites also exist on the property.

The traditions, language, and material culture of the present-day Udege and their ancestors have been preserved and are respected. Special words are in use for various types of building: for example, *kumirmi* used as both birthing huts and mortuaries. Traditional clothes are retained for ceremonies, festivals, and ritual occasions.

Notes

i The dossier specifies no criteria under which this nomination is proposed: the most appropriate cultural criteria, should the nomination be approved, would appear to be iii and v (and only those two on present evidence).

ii This property is nominated as a *mixed site* under both natural and cultural criteria. IUCN will provide a complementary evaluation of the natural qualities.

iii In 1996 a nomination of this property for World Heritage status was deferred by the Bureau on the grounds that the boundary of the nomination was not justified, that a legal basis was provided for only 14% of the nominated area, and that the Regional Government wished to be involved in a revised nomination. The last of those conditions has been met and the second one may have been, but the nomination contains no statement specifically on this matter.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this

is a *site*. It should also be considered a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

People were active in the area in prehistoric times. In the 7th century AD arrivals from Zabaikalie created a new Tungus-language society, the Mukri, who developed under Mongol and Turkish influence. In the mid-19th century, the Ussuri region became part of Russia, and thereafter various "Western" influences affected local culture to some degree. Despite the remoteness, traditional clothing materials, for example, were replaced by woven cloths in the 19th century for everyday use. About 1900 Chinese migrants brought with them naive Taoism to mix with Udege paganism. A further addition was given to local culture by the arrival of Russian Old Believers, devout ultra-orthodox Christians fleeing persecution and seeking refuge in the remote valleys and mountains that were the hunting and collecting territories of the indigenous peoples.

The process of collectivization reached even as far east as Central Sikhote-Alin. In the later 1930s the population in the nominated area was brought together in just two settlements, one of which, Krasny Yar, continues as the main settlement today. In 1993, the Sikhote-Alin Ethnic territory was formalized around the concept of man in relation to the taiga (pine forest) environment, itself representative of the principle, admirably expressed by the nomination, of "the reasonable and sparing use of the nature resources," so characteristic of the indigenous peoples of this area in former times as well as the present. The continuance of the indigenous way of life is now, however, under severe threat, both because of the small size of the population (c 2000) and from external influence.

Description

The nominated property lies on the eastern coast of Asia between extreme north-eastern China and the Sea of Japan. The total area of the nomination is 1,549,179ha, made up of five blocks of land. Only 2000 people live within it, a low number even by Siberian standards of population density. It is a unique region with locally dominant woodland such as virgin, broad-leaved Korean pine forests on either side of the Bikim valley to the north-west and, to the south in the Sikhote-Alin Nature Reserve and along the coast, discrete areas of larch and Japanese oak. Overall, the environment is remarkably stable and unpolluted.

Reference is made in the nomination dossier to the existence of Bronze Age and medieval sites on the property, but it does not enlarge on their number or significance.

The territory is home to the remaining indigenous Udege people, 700 of whom live in one village, Krasny Yar, in the Bikin valley immediately west of one of the nominated areas. Hunting and fishing are their traditional and basic activities, combined with collecting fern, berries, mushrooms, and seeds. Their ability to manage the game animals and the habitat by the effective use of non-wood resources is critical to the survival of the Udege. A particular habitat of

outstanding importance and fragility is in the middle and upper reaches of the Iman River, where the species range from ginseng to the Amur tiger in association with 122 people of the Iman group of the Udege.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The whole of the nominated area is the property of the Russian Federation.

The nominated property area consists of four discrete statutorily designated areas (here numbered to accord with the map, Figure 2, not as in the text of the nomination):

1. Sikhote-Alin State Biosphere Nature Reserve;
2. Goralij Zoological Reserve;
3. Verkhnebikinski Landscape Reserve;
4. The territory of traditional land-use by the indigenous peoples of the Pozharski District on both sides of (but divided by) the Bikin River.

Management

Management is delegated from the Federation to various agencies, notably the Nature Reserve. Funding of the Nature Reserve is currently self-generated, Federal, and international, with nothing from the Region. In 1999, international sources provided more than twice the Federal budget and 65% of the total (\$72,237). Of the 154 employees, six work for the Department of Ecological Enlightenment. Eleven field research stations inside the Reserve carry out monitoring. Economic activity in the Nature Reserve is nil, and its scale on adjoining territories extremely limited. Only poaching causes some anxiety. Fire is the main threat.

Figure 1 in the nomination dossier purports to show a buffer zone around Sikhote-Alin State Biosphere Nature Reserve (1. above) but it seems, at least at the scale of the map (not stated), to be coterminous with the boundary of the Nature Reserve. None of the other territories in the nomination claims a buffer zone.

Essentially, though supported by different regulations, all four territories are collectively seeking to protect the environment, conserve habitat, and maintain the indigenous human population as a viable society. Only No 4 is of direct concern to ICOMOS, and its detail in the nomination shows a growing concern throughout the 1990s, as expressed in statutory documents, for the well-being of the small Udege community.

In response to a request from the World Heritage Centre, a management plan was added to the nomination dossier (4 September 2000). The document concerned is entitled *A Biodiversity Conservation Strategy for the Sikhote-Alin (2000)*, its primary purpose being "as a pre-planning document that limits the kinds and conditions of land-use, determines a system of ecological, economic and social goals and potential ways of achieving them." It is not a management plan in a form familiar to ICOMOS and so judgement must await the joint mission report;

moreover, its main thrust is concerned with the natural aspects of the nomination.

The Strategy nevertheless contains in its Chapter 7 discussion of a system of protected territories and territories having special resource-use restrictions, with various proposals for extending the protected areas and reducing modern-style activities such as logging. Part of the purpose of these proposals is to provide for indigenous peoples. A major proposal concerning the headwaters of the Bikin, for example, is to exclude commercial timber harvesting altogether, a proposal which, if implemented, would have implications for the inhabitants. The Strategy specifically acknowledges that this is so, seeking a merging of the boundaries of areas identified as important for nature conservation with those of "Ethnic Territories."

The traditional way of life in the area is now under considerable threat of collapse. Its reinforcement presents a task probably more important than simply ensuring the physical protection of the nominated territory. Faced by all the negative influences from man and nature, the existence, even rebirth, of a strong ethnic-cultural complex is a more reliable mechanism for integrated management of people and nature than all the laws that government can provide.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

No direct information is provided on this score (eg early efforts at protection, dates of founding National Parks, etc).

Fire, natural and man-made, is the principal agent of change and is a regular feature of the nominated area. Its effects are not necessarily either disastrous or long-term.

Currently a considerable effort, backed by international funds, is being made to promote nature conservation and tourism, especially in the upper and middle Bikin River area, with an emphasis on aspects of the traditional culture of the indigenous people. Programmes of reviving traditional crafts and ecological tourism are in hand. During 1999, the Nature Reserve was visited by 85 people on the one-day excursion, while 10–200 visitors per day bathed from the tourist base on the coast. Tourism is more developed, though numbers are still low, in the Bikin region. Currently ten to twelve groups of foreign tourists visit the whole territory per year.

Authenticity

The remoteness of and difficulty of access to the area mean that cultural contact is difficult and of limited influence. Despite superficial changes, for example in clothing, culturally the most significant point is that the small indigenous population continues to live within a sustainable hunter-gatherer economy which, as well as keeping people alive, maintains the natural diversity of flora and fauna. Authenticity and integrity are, in cultural terms, respectively relatively undiminished and reasonably intact, but both could well succumb to the early 21st century.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

For climatic and logistic reasons the joint ICOMOS-IUCN mission will not be able to visit the property until July 2001.

Qualities

The heritage qualities of this property derive from its remoteness, unpolluted environment, nature/people sustainability, and small remnant population in danger of disappearing.

Comparative analysis

No comparative cultural data are supplied in the nomination dossier. The earliest archaeology on the property finds its material analogues in Japan rather than mainland Asia.

ICOMOS comments

This property is nominated as a mixed site, under both natural and cultural criteria. However, there is a very close relationship between the natural environment and the cultural element. This is in fact a cultural landscape, in which part of the natural environment has been, and continues to be, subtly modified by the small Udege hunter-gatherer society.

This raises an important issue: that of the need for consideration in a global perspective of "preserving" small, essentially non-Westernized indigenous populations in their "natural" habitats, as exemplified by peoples like the Udege characteristically living in a non-agricultural, or non-mechanized agricultural, economy within a significantly non-monumental lifestyle with minimal material culture. ICOMOS therefore recommends that such a study be initiated.

Brief description

The Natural complex "Central Sikhote-Alin" nomination is of a huge and very important area in terms of natural history, consisting of several separate blocks of largely forested landscape. It contains a small population of hunter-gatherer people whose activities exploit the natural environment in a sustainable way and simultaneously have a significant effect upon flora and fauna.

Recommendation

That further consideration of this nomination under the cultural criteria be *deferred* until the Extraordinary Meeting of the Bureau in December 2001 to await the report of the joint IUCN/ICOMOS mission in July 2001.

ICOMOS, March 2001

Karain Cave (Turkey)

No 1059

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Karain Cave and the surrounding Palaeolithic caves
<i>Location</i>	Yagca village, Yenikoy, Province of Antalya
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Turkey
<i>Date</i>	3 August 2000

Justification by State Party

In general, the nominated area centred on Karain Cave is the most important Palaeolithic site in Anatolia and the Near East. The archaeological value of Karain itself derives from its consistent stratigraphy, 11 m deep, from the Lower Palaeolithic to the late Roman period. Each chamber of the cave has nevertheless been used in different periods. The Palaeolithic evidence is important for demonstrating relationships between Europe and the Near East. The earliest human fossil remains in the Anatolian region have been found here, linking Near Eastern and Western European Neanderthals in the process of hominoid evolution. The cave is also important for its palaeo-environmental and artefactual evidence. In the late Roman period, one chamber was used as a sanctuary of the goddess of the mountains. The caves' potential for further scientific research is high, and the continuing excavations there provide both a training and educational centre and, in Karain itself, a tourist attraction. Overall, the Karain complex is an authentic archaeological site of outstanding importance.

Criterion iii

In particular, the caves are unique in providing evidence of human history since the Palaeolithic period (*c* 50,000 years ago) up to the Roman and Byzantine periods. The excavated artefacts include the earliest examples of Anatolian art.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

Note: it is nominated as a *mixed site*. IUCN is assessing its natural values.

History and Description

History

In Palaeolithic times, a lake with Pleistocene fauna such as hippopotamus lay immediately down hill and east of Karain cave. Around it were "open" settlements so the cave as a living place was part of a settlement pattern, not a discrete habitation. Occupation was continual until the Early Bronze Age; during the Upper Palaeolithic, some 20,000–10,000 years ago, the population spilled out into neighbouring caves. Local drainage and irrigation systems were probably in place in the Roman period when there was a high local population. Karain itself was re-used as a shrine in late Roman times and activity continued into the Byzantine period.

Archaeologically, the cave was found in 1946 by Professor Kökten and periodically excavated by him until 1974. Since 1985, excavations have been conducted under the direction of Prof Dr Isin Yalcinkaya (Ankara University) in co-operation with foreign universities. This work is planned to last for another five years. No up-to-date report accompanied the nomination though published academic works up to 2000 and three PhD dissertations 1999–2000 are cited.

Description

The Karain cave is situated 30km north-west of Antalya, inland from the Mediterranean coast of Turkey. It lies in the Western Taurus Mountains, on the eastern slopes of Mount Katran in limestone at an altitude of 430m. It is itself made up of seven chambers, separated by calcite walls and linked by curving passageways. Stalactites and stalagmites add to its attractions, with niches and Greek inscriptions on the outer surface. Karain contains Upper, Middle, and Lower Palaeolithic levels; its depth of stratigraphy is as much as 11m, mostly natural and the result of complex patterns of deposition. Karain is part of a complex of caves numbering perhaps as many as twenty; eight partially explored ones seem to represent Chalcolithic/Early Bronze Age phases.

The site in general overlooks a plain on its east, formerly the site of one of the largest travertine seas in the world. The ground is still wet in places below the caves. A spring marks the northern end of the nominated site; along its eastern edge, not mentioned in the nomination, is a canal and irrigation system, probably Roman in origin. High-rise buildings are now visible in the distance from the site.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The caves themselves and the area in front of Karain are state-owned. The buffer zone is in private hands.

The whole site is a First Class Archaeological and Natural Site under a decree of the Regional Council of Antalya, 1990

Management

The provincial authorities of the Province of Antalya, and the Antalya Regional Council for the Preservation of Cultural and Natural Heritage are generally responsible for the caves' management, under Law No

2863 for the Preservation for the Preservation of Cultural and Natural Heritage. The Director of Antalya Museum is professionally responsible; at the Cave, the museum in Karain works in co-operation with the excavation team, which is on site for 2–3 months each year. Karain Cave is looked after in day-to-day terms by two guards, responsible for maintenance and security. There is public access throughout the year, for a fee. 19,459 visitors produced an income of \$6,540 in 1999, but, as the nomination dossier observes, "only interested professionals or curious tourists visit the site" (maximum c 150 per day at the height of the season during excavation). A major increase in visitor numbers is not anticipated.

The Regional Development Plan recognizes the area of the nomination as one of archaeological and natural sites, reserving the surrounding area for farming. The aim is to prevent urbanization and development near the cave and its vicinity, although recent building is already visible from the site. There is also a landscape plan (1990) for the entrance and surroundings of Karain cave where what is described as "a very little museum-visitor centre" and car-parking currently exist well below the actual cave-mouth. The site is lacking in visitor safety measures, especially around the excavation.

Routine monitoring and care of the area is financed by the Ministry of Culture, which also contributes to the cost of the excavations, otherwise financed independently. Annual records of the state of conservation are kept by the excavation team and an official of the Ministry of Culture. Periodic inspection by staff of the Regional Council occurs, but in general management is with a light touch. No management plan exists. The nomination indicates cartographically that in effect the nomination is of a conservation area in which an area of natural interest acts as the buffer zone to four archaeological sites, the largest around Karain Cave, the others around three other caves.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The nomination mentions no activity in the cave between the Byzantine period and Kökten's archaeological discovery of Karain in 1946. Excavation has demonstrated a complex stratigraphy, most of it of natural origin and deposition. Preservation and conservation work now marches with the excavation progress, and it is hoped to preserve a section for public display; but no detail is provided. Nor is a statement provided indicating how much of the deposit in Karain Cave it is intended to excavated and how much to leave *in situ* as a conscious conservation of the resource. A wire fence across the cave-mouth keeps animals out. Given the paying public access, presumably health and safety factors come into play, though they are not mentioned.

Authenticity and integrity

The natural surroundings and structure of the caves are well-preserved. Some 20 caves together form a geological and archaeological unity. The long-term excavations in Karain itself are well conducted and have demonstrated a significant scientific value in the deposits. The nominated area is also protected against

development *in situ* and is subject to no significant environmental pollution or tourist pressures. However, economic development of the region in which it lies, the hinterland of Antalya, is visibly occurring with some rapidity.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 2001

Qualities

Scientific importance is claimed and, within that context, high levels of authenticity and integrity are manifest. Academic sources consulted by ICOMOS lay stress on the importance of Karain in understanding the movement of hominids from Africa into Europe through Asia Minor. As far as can be judged from the nomination dossier and the ICOMOS mission to the site, no other significant qualities relevant to World Heritage status are present.

Comparative analysis

The network of caves at this site is unique in Anatolia and rare elsewhere in terms of its particular characteristics. The 11m deep depositional sequence and the richness of the archaeological and environmental evidence make Karain unique in Anatolia and the Balkans. In particular, the fact the Karain contains Lower, Middle, and Upper Palaeolithic levels makes it unusual. It shares some common features with Near Eastern Palaeolithic sites such as Shanidar (Iraq) and Mount Carmel (Israel).

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

ICOMOS was disappointed to read in the nomination file the statement that "Karain has 54 years of excavation history. It is not possible to give a brief result of those reports." The onus for demonstrating significance, in this case the scientific significance of the results of 54 years of excavation, must surely rest with the State Party. Particularly is this so when the credibility of the nomination, rather unusually, rests on a single significant cultural justification. Obviously, this needs absolutely to be presented coherently so that it can be peer-reviewed.

The inadequacy here is emphasized by two facts. One is the nomination's stated justification which claims that "The earliest human fossil remains in the Anatolian region" have been found at Karain, yet there is no further discussion of this crucially important claim, for example by providing the dating evidence, listing the hominid remains themselves, and arguing their significance. In fact, according to the later (1993) of the two published reports submitted with the nomination (*see below*), "a few fragmentary human remains were uncovered during the Kökten excavations, *but their provenience is uncertain* [ICOMOS italics]. One milk tooth ... belong[ed] to a Neanderthal child ... In 1986 two additional teeth were uncovered ... In 1987 one tooth and a humerus head were found ... additional human remains are needed in order to achieve a better definition of the Mousterian population of Anatolia."

The nomination does not mention any such additional remains. The known material did not merit Karain Cave being listed among the 31 sites identified in a comparative study entitled *Potential fossil hominid sites for inscription on the World Heritage List* (1997) commissioned by ICOMOS from two academic experts of world-standing.

The second presentational inadequacy is that the copies of two academic papers included as Annexe V are merely interim reports, one dated 1988, the other 1993. This is clearly an inadequate basis on which to assess the merit of a site nominated for World Heritage status primarily on its scientific value. Consequently further study needs to be made of at least some of the post-1993 publications listed in the nomination's lengthy Bibliography. Meanwhile, the case for the Karain Cave, which may well be a good one, has in effect suffered by default.

In any case, both in the nomination dossier and on the ground ICOMOS detected a sense that this nomination is premature. The State Party might, therefore, be well advised to withdraw it now until such time as the state of the current excavations and associated research can demonstrate beyond all doubt that this one site is of outstanding scientific significance in early hominid development, and until such time as the nomination dossier can comprehensively synthesize the results of all such on-site research, both in their own right and also comparatively.

Were this nomination to move towards inscription, ICOMOS would wish to recommend significant changes to the boundaries of the property.

Brief description

Karain Cave, one of a number of caves in the limestone of the Western Taurus Mountains, Turkey, has been shown by over 50 years of archaeological excavation to contain a scientifically-important sequence of deposits ranging from the Upper Palaeolithic some 50,000 years ago to the mid-1st millennium AD.

Recommendation

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*, so that the State Party may prepare and present both a more comprehensive and scientifically well documented justification for inscription and an adequate management plan for the site.

ICOMOS, March 2001