

UNESCO

**WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION
WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

24th ordinary session
(27 November - 2 December 2000)
Cairns (Australia)

EVALUATIONS OF CULTURAL PROPERTIES
- Addendum -

Prepared by the
International Council on Monuments and Sites
(ICOMOS)

The IUCN and ICOMOS evaluations are made available to members of the Bureau and the World Heritage Committee. A small number of additional copies are also available from the secretariat.
Thank you.



2000

Echmiatsin/Zvartnots (Armenia)

No 1011

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Cathedral and Churches of Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots
<i>Location</i>	Armavir Marz (Region)
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Armenia
<i>Date</i>	9 July 1999

Justification by State Party

The Armenian culture is one of the world's oldest. It carries all the layers of human civilisation. The beginning of the new period of the history of Armenia is considered to be 301 CE, when Armenia declared Christianity as its state religion. According to the great 5th century Armenian historian Agatangeghos (Agafangel in Greek), St Gregor Lousavorich (St Gregory the Illuminator), first Patriarch of Armenia, had a vision. Christ came down from Heaven and touched the earth with a golden hammer. In that place a church was built called Echmiatsin, "the place where the Only Begotten descended."

Scholars have variously interpreted the original construction of Echmiatsin Main Cathedral. In its present form it is the result of reconstruction carried out in the 5th–7th centuries and belongs to the central domed cross-hall type. It is, in fact, the prototype of all later constructions of the same type. Since the 15th century Echmiatsin with the Main Cathedral and surrounding other buildings has served as the Mother See of the Armenian Apostolic Church and the residence of the All-Armenian Catholicos. Besides the Main Cathedral, there are the Churches of St Gayaneh, St Hripsimeh, Sourb Astvatsatsin (Mother of Christ), St Shoghakat, and others.

Three separate areas are nominated for inscription:

1. The Mother Cathedral of Echmiatsin and St Gayaneh Church (30.2ha);
2. Saint Hripsimeh Church and St Shoghakat Church (25.3ha);
3. The Archaeological site of Zvartnots with the ruins of the Temple, the Royal Palace, and other constructions (18.8ha). —

Criteria iii, iv, and v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

Vagharshapat (now Echmiatsin) was an ancient settlement; research has revealed its layout in the 3rd–4th centuries BCE. It was destroyed and rebuilt many times, as a result of invasions from both east and west. At the end of the 19th century the population was about 10,000. During the Soviet period Echmiatsin became a regional centre and the population grew to 61,000 with a territory of some 2000ha.

The *Cathedral of Holy Echmiadzin* is the most ancient Christian temple in Armenia. It was built in 301–303 by Gregor Lousavorich (Saint Gregory the Illuminator), the founder of the Armenian Apostolic Church, in Vagharshapat (the former name of Echmiatsin), the capital and religious centre of Armenia at that time.

Echmiatsin Cathedral was originally a vaulted basilica. Serious damage was caused to it as a result of political upheavals and it received its present cruciform plan during restoration work by Vahan Mamikonian, the Governor of Armenia in 480. In 618 Catholicos Komitas replaced the wooden cupola with an identical one in stone. Its mass is supported on four massive independent pillars connected by slender arcades with the exterior walls; those on the northern side belonged to the 4th and 5th centuries. This structure survives almost unchanged.

A three-tier belfry was built in front of the western entrance in the 17th century. The six-column rotundas on four-pillar bases, built at the beginning of the 18th century over the northern, eastern, and southern apses, give the cathedral a five-domed outline. The interior murals, created by the Armenian painter Hovnatan in 1720, were restored and further worked on by his grandson in 1782–86. Rich gifts of church plate and valuable pieces of art were stored in three buildings added to the eastern side of the cathedral in 1869; they now house the monastery's museum. Around the courtyard of the monastery are the buildings of the Catholicosate, a school, winter and summer refectories, a hostel, and Trdat's Gate, built in the 17th–19th centuries. On the initiative of Catholicos Vazgen I, scientific restoration work has recently been undertaken, in the course of which excavations have revealed finds from the pagan era, such as a sacrificial altar and an Urartian stele in granite.

The *Church of St Hripsimeh* (618) represents the perfect example of cruciform plan and central cupola. Its dominant feature is the basic harmony of layout and proportions, as well as the simplicity and classical purity of its facades, the outstanding qualities of the Armenian architecture of the High Middle Ages. Apart from the addition of a bell-tower in the 17th century, the monument has undergone no fundamental transformation. The *Church of St Gayaneh* was built in Echmiatzin by the Catholicos Yezn in 630. Its distinctive features are its slender and delicate proportions. A dome and ceilings were rebuilt in the 17th century, when a spacious arched portico was built along the western facade as the burial place for the most senior Armenian clergy.

The *Zvartnots Archaeological Site* is a unique example of Armenian architecture of the early Christian period. The temple was built under Catholicos Nerses III (The Builder) in the mid 7th century. He relinquished the Catholicossal throne for a time in 652, but after his return to office in 658 he completed the construction of the Temple with its secular annexes and its ramparts in 662.

Zvartnots is an innovatory expression of Armenian religious architecture in the 7th century, and as such it exerted a major influence on the architecture not only of its own time but also on that of later centuries. Circular in plan and three-tiered, its only borrowing from earlier cruciform and central cupola churches was the interior cruciform plan, which was set inside walls that were circular on the inside but polyhedral on the outside. Refinements worked out with great subtlety are to be found in the capitals decorated with basket weave or eagle ornament, in the great variety of the external wall carving, in the fillets surrounding the windows, and even on the smallest surfaces.

The remains of Zvartnots and its related buildings, which had been destroyed by an earthquake in the 10th century, were revealed at the beginning of the 20th century by the architect Thoros Thoramian, who carried out the first reconstruction project.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The monuments included in the present nomination are protected under the provisions of the National Law on Protection of Historical and Cultural Monuments, and in particular by Articles 19, 21, 22, 36 and 45. All interventions that may affect the character or significance of monuments and sites require official authorization.

Management

The owners of the properties that make up this nomination are the Mother See of Echmiatsin, the Municipality of the City, and the State Department for Protection and Preservation of Historical and Cultural Monuments. The churches and their immediate surroundings belong to the Mother See, the protection and buffer zones mainly belong to the municipality (administered by the Office of the General Architect). The archaeological site of Zvartnots is owned and managed by the State Department on Protection and Preservation of Historical and Cultural Monuments through its Directorate of the Zvartnots Historical Cultural Reservation–Museum.

Most of the monuments included in the nomination are protected at national level, but some (or parts of them) are protected at regional level. A special body, in each *marz* (region) is responsible for the protection of the latter group of monuments. However, the State Department on Protection and Preservation of Historical and Cultural Monuments exercises overall supervisory control over these regional bodies.

There is an effective buffer zone around each of the properties which regulates all activities that may have adverse impacts on their settings.

Funding for all work of maintenance, conservation, and restoration comes variously from the central Government, the Municipality of Echmiatsin, the Mother See of Echmiatsin, the Armenian Fund for the Protection of Historic Cultural Monuments, and personal donations.

Echmiatsin is one of the most visited sites in Armenia. In the 1980s about 220,000 tourists and pilgrims visited Echmiatsin, but after the economic crisis the number of visitors has declined to around 40,000. The Government is expecting the expansion of tourism in Armenia with the forthcoming celebration of the 1700th anniversary of the adoption of Christianity. The General City Plan for Echmiatsin, prepared in 1997, has been approved by the central Government; it contains provisions relating specifically to the protection and presentation of the historic heritage and its role in tourism development.

Responsible bodies of the Armenian Government are at the present time working on the Management Plan for Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots, and this will be in force early in 2001. The plan will include further restoration work on the monuments and the development of tourism.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The Government of the Soviet Republic of Armenia decided in January 1945 to improve the historical part of Echmiatsin. In May 1948, the Council of Ministers of Armenia granted state-level protection to the city. In the decades that followed protection was extended to many individual monuments.

Over the same period a number of restoration and conservation projects were carried out. These included:

- conservation of Zvartnots archaeological site and part-reconstruction of the Church of St Gregor, 1952-73;
- renovation of the Church of St Hripsimeh, 1959;
- renovation of the Mother Cathedral, 1965;
- renovation of the Church of St Gayaneh, 1970;
- restoration of the bell-tower of the Church of St Mariam Astvatsatsin, 1978;
- renovation of the Seminarium, 1998.

Most of the ecclesiastical monuments are in good condition. Some are being renovated and restoration plans are being prepared for the others. The Mother See is taking care of the churches in use in co-ordination with the State Department of Protection of Historic and Cultural Monuments and the Municipality of Echmiatsin. At the present time restoration and consolidation work is in progress on some parts of the walls of the lowest tier of the Zvartnots Temple.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the ecclesiastical monuments is reasonable, given that they have been in religious use for many centuries and have been subject to changes in liturgy and fashion over that period. The archaeological site is fully authentic, since it consist solely of excavated remains of

vanished structures. However, some of the restoration work is not fully in conformity with the principles of the 1964 Venice Charter.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in May 2000.

Qualities

The religious buildings and archaeological remains in Echmiatsin bears witness to the implantation of Christianity in Armenia and to the evolution of a unique Armenian ecclesiastical architecture. This exerted a profound influence on architectural and artistic development in the region.

Comparative analysis

Armenian architecture has been the subject of intensive study by specialists from the Architecture Faculty of the Politecnico di Milano and the Armenian Academy of Sciences. This has resulted in the production of a series of scholarly studies of the main architectural monuments.

In the volume devoted to Echmiatsin it is pointed out that it is difficult to compare the early Christian buildings there with other structures of the central domed cross-hall type in the region, since it was essentially here that the form evolved from Byzantine prototypes and served as the model for most subsequent buildings.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The ICOMOS expert mission expressed concern about the proposal to construct a large open-air sanctuary near the Katholikon at Echmiatsin, which appeared to be out of sympathy with the existing monumental buildings. It also had some reservations about the nature of the restoration work carried out at Zvartnots, although it is recognized by ICOMOS that this had taken place at a period when contemporary approaches to restoration were not actively applied in the former USSR. It is accepted that any future restoration work should be carried out in accordance with present-day standards.

At the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000 this nomination was **referred back** to the State Party, asking for reconsideration of the open-air sanctuary project and recommending that the name of the property be revised to "The Cathedral and Churches of Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots."

At the request of ICOMOS, one of its senior members who was carrying out another mission in Armenia in September visited Echmiatsin and discussed the Sanctuary project with His Holiness the Katholikos of All Armenians. Following this meeting, a new plan has been provided which shows that the new open-air altar will now be located outside the area proposed for inscription. It will be situated in an area of gardens, the landscaping of which is to be improved (including the removal of a car-park). This information has subsequently been confirmed by the State Party. ICOMOS believes that the new structure in the location proposed will have no adverse impact on the setting of the nominated site, which will, in fact, be improved as a result of the new landscaping proposals.

The State Party has accepted the proposal of ICOMOS for the renaming of the nominated property.

Brief description

The cathedral and churches of Echmiatsin and the archaeological remains at Zvartnots graphically illustrate the evolution and flowering of the Armenian central-domed cross-hall type of church.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria ii and iii**:

Criterion ii The developments in ecclesiastical architecture represented in an outstanding manner by the churches at Echmiatsin and the archaeological site of Zvartnots had a profound influence on church design over a wide region.

Criterion iii The churches at Echmiatsin and the archaeological site of Zvartnots vividly depict both the spirituality and the innovatory artistic achievement of the Armenian Church from its foundation.

ICOMOS, October 2000

Mostar (Bosnia/Herzegovina)

No 946

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Old City of Mostar
<i>Location</i>	Herzegovina-Neretva Canton
<i>State Party</i>	Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina
<i>Date</i>	15 July 1998

Justification by State Party

Mostar is the result of interaction between natural phenomena and human creativity over a long historical period. The universal qualities of the cultural landscapes of south-eastern Europe represent a universal phenomenon that is the common property of all humankind. The cultural and historical value of Old Mostar resides in the urban agglomeration that was created in the 16th century during the height of the Ottoman Empire around the Old Bridge, the technological wonder of its age, in which complete harmony was achieved between the built structures and the natural environment of the Neretva River.

The Old Town has been embellished for centuries with the visual artistic expressions of succeeding generations, particularly towards the end of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th century under the influence of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and central European architecture.

The sustainable development of the area has been endangered by human destruction and devastation by war. This ensemble has attracted the continuous interest of both the local and the international public from the outset, as witnessed by many historical documents, up to the present day, when that interest has been renewed. Enduring interest has been shown in exploring the origins of the different styles and the way in which they have been expressed, in spatial harmony, and their preservation.

Protection, maintenance, regulation, and revitalization of the historic centre is a long-term process. Earlier minimal studies have only been known through preliminary reports, scattered references in the literature, or lectures at meetings. For all these reasons and because principles relating to the importance of preserving the material remains of the past, including the architectural heritage, and in particular because of the false impression that this part of the town has become outdated and is in the process of disappearing from the historical landscape, UNESCO and the international community must accept the justification for this nomination, the more so since the preserved remains of the earliest town are themselves urban in character. They became incorporated

over time into the urban fabric of the entire town of Mostar as an integral part of European culture. The historic core, with the surrounding areas, has become a symbol of civilized living. This almost automatically justifies the existence of the town as one of the earliest sources for the identity and history of Bosnia and Herzegovina as a whole.

Destruction of the town deprived cosmopolitan travellers of opportunities for resting both their bodies and their souls and for understanding their own past. The living townscape of Mostar constitutes, a vast class-room for the young and the enquiring in appreciating their own destiny.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

There has been human settlement on the Neretva between the Hum Hill and the Velež mountain since prehistory, as witnessed by discoveries of fortified enceintes and cemeteries. Evidence of Roman occupation comes from beneath the present town.

Little is known of Mostar in the medieval period, though the Christian basilicas of late antiquity continued in use. The name of Mostar is first mentioned in a document of 1474, taking its name from the bridge-keepers (*mostari*): this refers to the existence of a wooden bridge from the market town on the left bank of the river which was used by soldiers, traders, and other travellers. At this time it was the seat of a *kadiluk* (district with a regional judge). Because it was on the trade route between the Adriatic and the mineral-rich regions of central Bosnia, the settlement spread to the right bank of the river. It became the leading town in the Sanjak of Herzegovina and, with the arrival of the Ottoman Turks from the east, the centre of Turkish rule.

The town was fortified between 1520 and 1566 and the bridge was rebuilt in stone. The second half of the 16th century and the early decades of the 17th century were the most important period in the development of Mostar. Religious and public buildings were constructed, such as mosques, a *madrasah* (Islamic school), and a *hammam* (public bath); these were concentrated on the left bank of the river, in a religious complex (*kullia*). At the same time many private and commercial buildings, organized in distinct quarters, known as *mahalas* (residential) and the bazaar, were erected.

Bosnia-Herzegovina was first occupied (1878) and then annexed (1908) by the Austro-Hungarian Empire, and it was in this period that a number of administrative, military, cultural, and Christian religious buildings were established. These were mainly on the right bank of the river, where a new quarter was developed according to a strict "Rondo"

plan. This provides a strong contrast with the left bank, where there was a more organic growth on the steeper slopes, with winding narrow streets and public open spaces for trading (*pazar*), recreation (*mejdan*), and prayer (*musallah*). The town was also connected at this time by rail and new roads to Sarajevo and the Adriatic.

Description

The area nominated for inscription spans the Neretva River, with the bridge at its centre.

Of special significance is the Radobolja stream, which enters the Neretva on its right bank. This provided a source of water for the growing settlement, and from it spring a number of small canals used for irrigation and for driving the wheels of water-mills.

The centre of the settlement was the bazaar, which extended on both banks of the river, the two parts being articulated by the bridge. From them began the network of streets forming the *mahalas*. This system was altered to a considerable extent during the Austro-Hungarian period, when the new quarters were laid out on European planning principles and other bridges were built across the river.

The nominated area contains many important historic buildings. Of the thirteen original *mosques* dating from the 16th and 17th centuries, seven have been destroyed during the present century for ideological reasons or by bombardment. One of the two 19th century Orthodox *churches* has also disappeared, and the early 20th century *synagogue*, after undergoing severe damage in World War II, has been converted for use as a theatre.

Several Ottoman-period *inns* survive also survive, along with other buildings from this period of Mostar's history such as *fountains* and *schools*.

The *administrative buildings* are all from the Austro-Hungarian period and exhibit Neo-Classical and Secessionist features.

There is a number of *houses* surviving from the late Ottoman period (18th and early 19th centuries) which demonstrate the component features of this form of domestic architecture – hall, upper storey for residential use, paved courtyard, verandah on one or two storeys. The later 19th century residential houses are all in Neo-Classical style.

Some early *trading and craft buildings* are also still extant, notably some low shops in wood or stone, stone store-houses, and a group of former tanneries round an open courtyard. Once again, the 19th century commercial buildings are predominantly Neo-Classical in style.

A number of elements of the early *fortifications* are visible. The Herceguša Tower dates from the medieval period, whilst the Ottoman defences are represented by the Halebinovka and Tara Towers, the watch-towers over the ends of the Old Bridge, and a stretch of the ramparts.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Historic Mostar is protected by the 1985 Law on the Protection and Use of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina, the 1996 Interim

Statutes of the Town of Mostar, and the 1998 Law on Waters. In 1998 the Mostar Municipal Council promulgated a series of decisions relating to the rehabilitation and conservation of buildings in the protected zone of the town and the prohibition of any non-authorized interventions.

Management

Ownership of properties within the nominated area is varied – government bodies, religious communities, and private individuals and institutions.

At national level, overall supervision is exercised by the Centre for the Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina, based in Sarajevo. Direct responsibility at regional level is the responsibility of the Institute for the Protection of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage, located in Mostar. This body collaborates with the Mostar-based Institute for Urbanism and Spatial Planning and the Municipality of Stari Grad, and also works closely with the Old Mostar Foundation and the Research Centre for Islamic History, Art, and Culture in Istanbul (Turkey). It also collaborates closely with the Aga Khan Foundation and with the World Monuments Fund, which support a team of six young professional staff working on the implementation of the conservation plan and on the surveillance of specific restoration projects on behalf of the Mostar Institute.

All applications for authorization of projects coming within the provisions of the municipal decisions must be submitted to the Municipality of Stari Grad. These are then evaluated by the Institute for the Protection of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage, which submits recommendations to the Municipality, which in turn is responsible for final decision-making (working through its Programme Coordination Unit in respect of the reconstruction of the Old Bridge).

A UNESCO Rehabilitation Plan was prepared in 1997 and the Aga Khan Foundation has also produced a master plan, as well as undertaking detailed studies for the rehabilitation of some important monuments and districts on either side of the river. At the time of the original nomination there was no comprehensive management plan in force for the historic centre of Mostar. A copy of the outline Management Plan for the Old Town of Mostar, adopted by the Municipality Council of Stari Grad, Mostar, on 1 October 1999, has been received by ICOMOS. This conforms with the basic requirements of paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*. The second ICOMOS expert mission in October 2000 was informed that the Plan would be formally approved by the municipal council at the end of 2000 or at the beginning of 2001. The Aga Khan Trust for Culture and the World Monuments Fund will provide management for the detailed preparation of the neighbourhood improvement plan, the master plan for the Old Town, and the Strategic Plan for the Central Urban Area of Mostar. The International Experts Committee nominated by UNESCO has the role of reviewing important technical material concerning project investments.

The State Party also submitted details of the World Bank Pilot Culture Heritage Project for Mostar Old Bridge and Town and other documents relating to the future conservation and management of the Old Town. These reinforce the basic information given in the Management Plan.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The first steps in the conservation history of Mostar date from 1878, when the Ottoman Grand Vizier issued a decree “prohibiting the export of antiquities and the destruction of old buildings.”

The Old Town suffered grievous damage during World War II. Legal instruments enacted between 1945 and 1965 provided the basis for the conservation of historic buildings and their scientific study, and several relevant institutions were established in Mostar. A number of major restoration projects were undertaken during this period, including the reconstruction of Koski Mehmed Pasha’s *Madrasah* and the Old Bridge.

The hostilities that broke out in the early 1990s saw systematic destruction of much of the Old Town by bombardment and fire in 1992-95, with resulting structural destabilization and deterioration from natural forces as a result of neglect. Among the structures that were wholly or partially destroyed were the Old Bridge, with its towers, the old warehouses and shops close to the bridge, all the domed mosques, many other Islamic buildings, and a number of the Austro-Hungarian administrative buildings.

Some of the repair work carried out after this destruction, particularly by certain religious institutions and foreign humanitarian foundations, is frankly described by the State Party in the nomination dossier as being in contravention of recognized conservation principles. In addition, many new buildings were erected that were not compatible with the requirements of an historic town centre.

Authenticity

On the basis of the test of authenticity, as defined in paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, there must be considerable reservations about the authenticity of Mostar. In terms of authenticity of design and setting, the Old Town may be deemed to be acceptable, since the site of the medieval settlement is still occupied and the urban fabric that developed through the Ottoman and Austro-Hungarian can still be discerned relatively clearly.

However, as the preceding section shows, there has been a very substantial degree of reconstruction in Mostar, principally as a result of war, and the State Party itself comments adversely on the authenticity of both materials and workmanship in much of this work. The proportion of reconstructed buildings is also very high; this comment applies to many of the most important Islamic buildings and to the celebrated Old Bridge.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Mostar in February 1999. A second ICOMOS mission visited the town in October 2000.

Qualities

Mostar is an historic town of great importance, which represents the encounter between the cultures of the east, in

the form of its Ottoman Turkish heritage, and of Europe, as witnessed by the monuments of the Austro-Hungarian period. Its natural setting is a dramatic one, in a river gorge, and the human settlement has adapted itself harmoniously to its natural environment.

Comparative analysis

The obvious comparison to be made is with Sarajevo (also nominated in 1999 and not accepted for inscription on the World Heritage List). Both are basically 15th century Ottoman frontier towns on major communication and trade routes which reached an economic peak in the 16th century and have retained significant traces of their Islamic past, despite the process of “Europeanization” that resulted from the short but influential Austro-Hungarian occupation. Finally, both suffered enormous damage between 1992 and 1995 during a period of savage hostilities.

However, there is a significant difference between the two resulting from the spectacular site of Mostar and the symbiotic relationship between the human settlement and its natural setting.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

At the 23rd Session of the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee, held in Paris in July 1999, this nomination was referred back to the State Party, requesting further information about the management plan for the Old Town. This was supplied to the World Heritage Centre on 5 November and received by ICOMOS on 17 November. Since it was impossible for ICOMOS to study and report on this documentation before the Extraordinary Meeting of the Bureau held in Marrakesh (Morocco) on 26-27 November 1999, further consideration was deferred. The plan has now been reviewed by ICOMOS (see “Management” above).

Shortly before the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000 ICOMOS was informed by the UNESCO mission in Mostar that the terms of the management plan were not being implemented. It therefore proposed that a second mission should be sent there, and this proposal was approved by the Bureau.

Adequate protection and management of the Old Town depends upon the approval of the Master Plan by the Municipality of Mostar without further delay. Until this Plan is in force there are no sanctions that can be applied against unsuitable new constructions or unacceptable restoration and/or reconstruction work on existing buildings. The *Operational Guidelines* require there to be “adequate legal ... and management mechanisms” in force (para 24.b.ii) before a property may be inscribed on the World Heritage List. However, the Committee has in the past acknowledged that there are rare special cases where World Heritage listing is needed in order to reinforce the local authorities in their application of planning controls. After a long discussion during the meeting of the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel in November on the desirability of adopting this procedure, it was agreed exceptionally to recommend it in the case of Mostar. This is intended as, and should be interpreted by the State Party, as a positive contribution to the protection and management of this outstanding multicultural heritage site.

ICOMOS also wishes to stress the need for the preparation of a phased programme for the implementation of the Master Plan; this must be applicable to the totality of the Old Town,

without exceptions for individual development projects. This programme needs to be supervised by a small expert team, capable of monitoring projects from their formulation through to eventual completion. Their work requires the preparation of a list of individual properties given statutory protection (and access to possible sources of funding) at national, regional, and municipal level.

In its initial evaluation, following the visit of its expert mission in February 1999, ICOMOS suggested that it might be desirable for the State Party to initiate discussions that would lead to the nomination having the full support of both communities. ICOMOS wishes to repeat this proposal following its second expert mission, when the meeting at the city hall was not attended by the (Croat) deputy mayor nor by any representative of the Croat community.

Brief description

Mostar is an old town in a dramatic site spanning a deep river valley. Its street plan and historic buildings vividly illustrate its role as the meeting place of the cultures of east and west over many centuries, symbolized by its famous medieval bridge.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iv and vi*:

Criterion iv The Old Town of Mostar is an outstanding example of a multicultural European urban settlement.

Criterion vi Mostar is an exceptional symbol of the human potential for successfully integrating groups with differing ethnic, cultural, and religious backgrounds into a homogeneous civilized community.

ICOMOS further recommends that the attention of the State Party should be drawn to its recommendations above relating to the phased prioritization of the Master Plan, the establishment of a professional monitoring team, the preparation of an inventory of sites for protection at national, regional, and municipal level, and close collaboration between the two communities in the protection of the Old Town of Mostar. The State Party should be requested to provide a report on progress in these fields for consideration by the Bureau at its 25th Ordinary Session in Paris in June 2001, and thereafter regularly for the World Heritage Committee at its annual meetings.

ICOMOS, November 2000

Šibenik (Croatia)

No 963

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Cathedral of St. James, Šibenik
<i>Location</i>	Town of Šibenik, County of Šibenik-Knin
<i>State Party</i>	Croatia
<i>Date</i>	10 June 1999

Justification by State Party

The Cathedral of St James is an exceptional artistic achievement which had a tremendous influence on the architecture of the 15th and 16th centuries. It is an exceptionally fine example of its architectural type.

The significance of Šibenik Cathedral lies in the harmony of its form, despite the incorporation of various styles, and in the perfect balance of architectural parts within the whole. The Cathedral has several specific and unique characteristics, not only in the framework of the architecture of its period but also within European architectural heritage as a whole. The Cathedral of St James is an extraordinary example of Gothic-Renaissance construction using only stone. Structural elements simultaneously serve architectural and decorative purposes (eg the apse and the vaulted roofing). A complete unity of interior and exterior is thereby achieved, encompassing architecture, structure and decoration.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

Šibenik is a small town on the Dalmatian coast, opening out on a bay separated from the Adriatic by the Sveti Ante (St Anthony) channel and a multitude of tiny islands.

The town was founded in the 10th century by the Subić family, who were very influential in Croatia at this period. Early in the 12th century it came under the sway of the Kings of Hungary, who granted its independence. In 1116 and 1378 Šibenik suffered at the hands of the Venetians, who were vying with the kingdom of Hungary for control of the Dalmatian coast. In 1298 a papal bull issued by Boniface VIII created the Diocese of Šibenik. The Venetians took the town in 1412, renaming it Sebenico and holding it until the fall of the Venetian Republic in 1797.

The cathedral of St James owes its present appearance to three successive periods of construction between 9 April 1431, when the first stone was laid, and 1535. The first phase (1431-41) was carried out under the supervision of master mason Francesco di Giacomo and his journeymen Pincino and Busato, who began raising the west front and the walls of the nave and aisles as far as the first cornice. This first phase of construction in the Gothic style of northern Italy was completed by the west and north doors, the work of Lombard sculptor Bonino da Milano.

In 1441 Dalmatian architect and sculptor Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus (Juraj Matejev Dalmatinac) was charged with the resumption of work, which he continued until just before his death in 1473. In order to transform the simple basilica into a more imposing edifice, he drew up new plans for a more ornate east section (transept, three apses, a baptistery, and a sacristy) and thought of raising a dome over the transept crossing. His projects were only partially executed, however, and came to a halt once the apses were complete. This period also saw the completion of the nave and the vaulting over the aisles. Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus mingled the forms of late Gothic with those of the early Renaissance. Many artists came to join him in working on the Cathedral, the most famous being the architect Andrija Alešić, originally from Durrës (Albania), who worked with the successor to Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus on the third phase of the cathedral's construction.

This final phase was directed between 1475 and 1505 by Niccolò di Giovanni Fiorentino, an Italian architect and sculptor (active from 1467 to 1506) who retained the overall conception of the structure, the use of stone as the only material, and the method of joining the slabs of stone developed by his predecessor. He raised the wall studded with windows and the vaults of the nave, the vaulting over the galleries on the aisles, choir, and transept, the octagonal drum, and the dome in the early Renaissance style. He completed the trefoil of the west front (1475-1505), to which a rose window was added in 1555. The Cathedral was consecrated in 1555.

Description

Šibenik consists of a labyrinth of narrow streets and small squares climbing from the level of the Cathedral to the fortress at the summit of the old town. The Cathedral of St James stands down by the sea, on a small square that was once the ancient heart of the town, with the town hall on the north side of the square and the municipal loggia on the east, both buildings in Renaissance style. The episcopal palace,

built in the 16th century, runs alongside the southern flank of the cathedral.

The Cathedral of St James takes the form of a basilica consisting of three aisles, each ending in an apse, after a non-salient transept surmounted by a dome. A rectangular sacristy raised on pillars under which runs a passage leading to the baptistery stands between the southern apse and the episcopal palace.

The interior of the Cathedral is striking in the height of the nave and the richly decorated stonework. The three aisles are separated by two rows of Gothic columns, the capitals of which are decorated with plant motifs. Above them the fillet decorated with two rows of leafwork motifs and the openings in the galleries, where short fluted pilasters alternate with columns, bear witness to the second phase of construction. This ensemble contrasts with the smooth surface of the walls into which the windows are set and the sharp lines of the barrel vault that forms the convex roof seen from the exterior. The side aisles are surmounted at the level of the galleries by a quartered dome which is echoed on the exterior. There is thus a close correspondence between the interior and exterior forms of the building.

The nave extends into a raised choir reached by means of a circular stairway. The altar stands at the rear of the central apse and there is a quatrefoil baptistery below the southern apse.

The baptistery, designed as a circle within a square, is surrounded by four semi-circular niches topped with a shell design. The circular ceiling is made up of nine slabs of stone whose surface is decorated on the underside and smooth on the upper side, to form the pavement of the south aisle. The decoration of the baptistery, also the work of Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus, combines Gothic forms such as the patterns of interlacing with decorative relief work on the vaulting, which reveals the influence of the very early Renaissance, as do the three cherubim supporting the basin of the font. At the summit of the arch a laurel wreath concealed by an inscription frames the head of God the Father and the dove of the Holy Spirit, flanked by angels and seraphim.

On the exterior, the gable wall that forms the trefoil west front offers a direct projection of the tripartite interior volume of the Cathedral, following the contour of the vaulting to form a remarkable yet functional trefoil front. The west door, which illustrates the theme of the Last Judgement, is flanked by pierced belfries supported by cable columns and framed by two Gothic windows edged with a fine carved cord design. The oculi and rose windows are surrounded by finely worked cornices and arches reflecting the Renaissance style. The Gothic north door is flanked by columns supported by lions and surmounted by Adam and Eve. The north and south fronts of the Cathedral are pierced by broken barrel-arch windows over which run the blind arcades of the cornice.

The chevet consists of a central pentagonal apse and two rectangular side apses. The surfaces of both inside and outside walls of all three apses are decorated with

a row of shallow semi-circular niches carved into monolithic stone slabs. The niches are fluted and surmounted by a shell arch, while their interiors are framed by fluted columns topped with capitals. To accentuate the impression of depth, the base of the niches is raised and the upper section lowered as if converging towards the interior, creating an effect of perspective. Under this short row, at head-height, runs a remarkable frieze decorated with 72 faces of men, women, and children, emphasizing the monumental nature of the Cathedral chevet. The walls of the sacristy are given a simpler treatment with a mid-height row of narrow concave niches. The dome is supported by an octagonal drum pierced by windows divided on the outside by fluted pilasters topped with acanthus-leaf capitals under a cornice ornamented by ovates and stylised palm-leaves. Niccolò di Giovanni Fiorentino himself sculpted the figures of St Michael, St James, St Mark, and the Annunciation group crowning the central apse and the transept.

Although the cathedral was built in three stages, the styles of which can be distinguished in both interior and exterior, the whole partakes of a certain unity. The use of a single material, stone, from the footing of the walls through the vaulting to the dome itself, is no doubt largely responsible.

Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus built the Cathedral, with the exception of the nave and the aisle walls, by assembling slabs of stone and the contiguous sections of pilaster and ribbing using a particular technique for the joints. The roofing of the aisles, as well as that of the apses and the dome, is made from stone "tiles" of between 7 and 12 cm thick. These roofing tiles are laid side by side with their horizontal edges overlapping, and the joints are made by the perfect fit. On the dome the tiles are held in place by stone wedges fitted with great precision and are inserted into the ribs as into a portcullis. This type of construction could well have taken its inspiration from shipbuilding, or from the experience of many artists whose first trade was the working of wood as joiners, cabinet-makers, or model-makers. The solution adopted for the Cathedral at Šibenik was made possible by the outstanding quality of the stone used, which came from the stone quarries of Veselje, on the island of Brac, which are still in operation to this day.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Cathedral of St James, which is the property of the Diocese of Šibenik, has been classified as a listed monument since the promulgation of Decree No 35/93-1963 by the Dalmatian Institute for Conservation on 14 May 1963. Like the historic centre of Šibenik itself, it is subject to the provisions of several acts of parliament and regulations governing its protection. Certain of these have now been replaced, however, by the new law on the protection and conservation of heritage buildings passed by the Republic of Croatia on 18 June 1999, which includes new measures for the financing of

restoration work and defining the responsibility of owners of heritage buildings.

Management

The property nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List is managed by the Ministry of Culture (Bureau of Heritage Protection) and the Office of Works of the Diocese of Šibenik. Measures for the protection of the Cathedral of St James are implemented by the Šibenik Department of Conservation, the local representative of the Ministry of Culture. The Department is responsible for evaluating and approving projected interventions on the monument. It works in co-ordination with the Croatian Institute of Restoration (Zagreb), a body attached to the Ministry of Culture, which is currently carrying out a series of tests and studies of petrography and micro-climate.

The Cathedral of St James attracts many tourists visiting the region of Šibenik. The church authorities have therefore taken steps to preserve the sacred nature of the monument and the municipal authority applies strict restrictions on parking, which is permitted only on the sea front and prohibited in the historic town centre.

The buffer zone for the property nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List corresponds to the entire old town of Šibenik, the historic centre covering some 15ha. Following an historical analysis of urban development carried out in 1990, at the request of the municipality, by the Zagreb Institute of Historical Sciences (Art History Department) in conjunction with the Šibenik Department of Conservation, the same protection measures were extended to the whole historic centre as forming part of a single heritage entity. The town has an overall development plan.

The Cathedral of St James and the historic centre of Šibenik are protected by a specific policy based on four indicators: the significance and authenticity of the heritage property, the effectiveness of the management plan, control over risk factors such as visitor numbers, and compliance with the most stringent international standards of conservation.

Conservation and authenticity

Conservation history

Historical sources refer to periodic restoration work carried out on the Cathedral of St James from 1562 onwards. In many cases, this can be considered as no more than running maintenance, since it consisted of the replacement of damaged stones by others of the same material, design, and dimensions.

In 1846 problems with water run-off from the roof made it necessary to remove the dome and roof vaulting and fill the joints before replacing the same stones. After World War II major work was undertaken (1947-55) to reinforce the roof of the south aisle, which was in poor condition, and replace the stones of the sacristy.

During the hostilities of September 1991 some of the exterior decoration, the vaulting, and one side of the dome were damaged. The safety of the dome's structure giving some cause for concern, it was once again removed and the damaged elements were replaced by others, still of the same design and same material, before reconstruction. This intervention was carried out with the fullest respect for the techniques employed in the past, both at the time of dome's construction and at the time of the 19th century restorations. Work is currently under way to clean the stone cladding of the exterior, a task made necessary by the pollution caused by two major industrial complexes, now closed down. Current restoration work – in common with the dome restoration in 1992 – has played an important role in keeping the Veselje stone quarry in operation and in providing training for young workers on the restoration project. The Croatian Institute of Restoration is carrying out a series of studies, one of which is dedicated to dealing with the humidity that forms on the surface of the intrados of the roof.

Authenticity

In terms of fidelity to the initial model and respect during restoration for the criteria characteristic of the cultural context to which the building belongs, this property satisfies the test of authenticity to a degree rarely attained by constructions in stone.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Šibenik in January 2000.

Qualities

The Cathedral of St James in Šibenik is a monument that documents the transition from Gothic to Renaissance architecture. It is distinctive in the type of construction adopted, in its forms and decorative features, but most of all in the nature of its construction.

Comparative analysis

The Cathedral of St James in Šibenik has no equal in the context of European architecture of the 15th and 16th centuries by virtue of the nature of its construction.

ICOMOS comments

According to the text of the nomination for inscription, the property nominated is the Cathedral of St James and the buffer zone covers the historic centre of Šibenik. On inspection of the site plan, however, it appears that the buffer zone consists solely of those blocks of buildings forming the square on which the Cathedral stands. ICOMOS would therefore appreciate clarification from the State Party that the buffer zone around the property nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List does in fact correspond with the historic centre of Šibenik.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

In order to highlight the importance of the cathedral, for didactic as well as scientific purposes, it would be desirable to establish a Cathedral Museum, or at least a Diocesan Museum, to bring together a significant collection of works of art and the scale model of the dome currently kept in storage. The historic town centre has many unused convent buildings, as well as the church of St Barbara, which could be used to house the museum.

Brief description

The Cathedral of St James in Šibenik (1431-1535) bears witness to the considerable exchanges in the field of monumental arts between Northern Italy, Dalmatia, and Tuscany in the 15th and 16th centuries. The three architects who succeeded one another in the construction of the Cathedral, Francesco di Giacomo, Georgius Mathei Dalmaticus and Niccolò di Giovanni Fiorentino, developed a structure built entirely from stone and using unique construction techniques for the vaulting and the dome of the Cathedral. The form and the decorative elements of the Cathedral also illustrate the successful fusion of Gothic art and that of the Renaissance.

Recommendation

At the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000, this nomination was referred back to the State Party requesting a detailed plan of the perimeter of the buffer zone. This information has been provided and the buffer zone corresponds with the historic centre of Šibenik. ICOMOS therefore recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria i, ii, and iv**:

Criterion i The structural characteristics of the Cathedral of St James in Šibenik make it a unique and outstanding building in which Gothic and Renaissance forms have been successfully blended.

Criterion ii The Cathedral of St James is the fruitful outcome of considerable interchanges of influences between the three culturally different regions of Northern Italy, Dalmatia, and Tuscany in the 15th and 16th centuries. These interchanges created the conditions for unique and outstanding solutions to the technical and structural problems of constructing the cathedral vaulting and dome.

Criterion iv The Cathedral of St James in Šibenik is a unique testimony to the transition from the Gothic to the Renaissance period in church architecture.

ICOMOS, October 2000

Loire Valley (France)

No 933

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Loire Valley between Maine and Sully-sur-Loire
<i>Location</i>	Départements of Loiret, Loir-et-Cher, Indre-et-Loire, and Maine-et-Loire, Régions of Centre and Pays de la Loire
<i>State Party</i>	France
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

Justification by State Party

During the Renaissance the Loire Valley between Sully-sur-Loire and Maine was an important cultural area for meetings and influences between Mediterranean Italy, *la douce France*, and Flanders. This cultural area witnessed the emergence of a landscape civilization, first French, then European, which produced some of the most perfect models for modern landscapes.

The inhabitants of the Valley certainly cultivated, cared for, and loved to contemplate their land before the Renaissance, managing it according to the classic sequence *domus-hortus-ager-saltus* between the two great natural environments of the river and the surrounding forest. However, it was from the Renaissance, alongside the appearance of the word “landscape” in Europe, that original development of this spatial organization began to be represented in the form of writings, paintings, and gardens created as the aesthetic, and more specifically landscape, models needed to be able to speak of cultural landscapes.

Before the Renaissance the earliest literary accounts of these landscapes were those of Charles d’Orléans and then, in a different way, of Rabelais, whose Abbey of Thélème is still today a symbolic model. With the arrival of the Renaissance the main writers on landscape were Pierre de Ronsard, Honorat de Racan, and Joachim du Bellay. Their works described and celebrated the beauties of these landscapes, at times comparing them favourably with other famous examples, such as that of Rome, where Du Bellay spent time.

In parallel with these celebrations of the land, representations in the form of gardens that were laid out according to aesthetic principles, and which were more than simple subsistence gardens decorated with flowers, accompanied the transformation of the great medieval castles into country houses (*châteaux*) for pleasure and diversion. In these very numerous gardens, *l’aquosité*, a typical Renaissance term meaning enjoyment of water in all its forms, whether still,

running, or gushing forth, which has nowadays fallen into disuse, took its place alongside the love of plants and animals in the designs, considerably expanding the dimensions and the aspirations of medieval gardens.

This emergence of new models, celebrated by poets and laid out by architects, was not a passing fashion. The movement born out of Humanism on the banks of the Loire evolved and expanded over the centuries to become modern. The Loire landscapes were to establish themselves and contribute smoothly to the development of the modern landscape.

In the 17th century the Loire landscapes were celebrated by Jean de la Fontaine and the Marquise de Sévigné. The art of the garden led to the great classic masterpieces in which *l’aquosité* developed such a high profile that gardens became in a sense laboratories of the “hydraulic architecture” that was to reach its climax in the great canals of the Age of Enlightenment.

The Loire landscapes were celebrated in the writings of, among others, Alfred de Vigny, Gustave Flaubert, Honoré de Balzac, Charles Baudelaire, and even Victor Hugo, whose romantic sensibility was in full agreement with that of Turner, the most important painter of the Loire. The Loire Valley was also studied and celebrated by a glittering array of geographers. Some of them, the two Reclus for example, went so far as to talk of “the most beautiful realm under the heavens” and to assert that the middle reaches of the Loire had “more than any other province contributed to the birth and development of the nation.” The great pioneers of modern tourism – the Joannes, Abel Hugo, and Ardouin-Dumazet – joined their voices to those of these scholars to make the Valley one of the main tourist destinations of Europe and then of the world, a role that it continues to occupy. The 19th century witnessed the growth of pictorial and photographic depictions of the river, which played a part in the spread of its fame and in strengthening the will to protect the treasures of its heritage, a phenomenon that began in the mid 19th century and persists to the present day.

In fact, pictorial representations of the Loire landscapes were later than those in literature and in gardens. René Bazin attributed this timelag to the difficulty of painting the Loire because of the vast dimensions of the valley and its “delicate and hazy light which gives no deep shadows, no contrast.” It is true that in the Seine Valley painters could find viewpoints that would allow them to take in the river in its totality, from one line of hills to the other, so as to be able produce a framed view of the river. The size of the Loire is such that this type of framing is almost impossible, with the exception of those elements that painters and engravers generally took advantage of – the bridges, the quays, and the urban facades of its towns, all of which were often depicted from early on. This was the case in the 19th century with Joseph Mallord William Turner; however, he was able to create other viewpoints and, in addition, to use the transparency of water-colours to suggest the delicacy of the light of the Loire Valley. The series of paintings that he made during his journey between Nantes and Orléans in 1826 is both a monument and a dedication.

It is a source of regret that Delacroix, who painted the Loire with a sensibility that foreshadowed modern works of art, did not devote himself more to subjects that were so worthy of his visions of grandeur. It must finally be regretted that Stendhal appears not to have known the main work, because his romantic genius would doubtless have discovered a

dimension in these landscapes that he appears to have known nothing about.

There have been many painters of the Loire in the modern period, such as Debré, Boller, Kolsek, and Verdenet, but there have been many more photographers. In the Loire Valley, as in many of the natural mountain landscapes discovered in the last century, photography has been able to go beyond the limitations of painting in order to express the monumental and grandiose character of the river. Nevertheless, these graphic representations have not replaced those of writers and poets. In this long list, the name of Maurice Genevoix first comes to mind, but the many others who have found their sources of inspiration in the Loire, such as Charles Péguy, René Bazin, René Boylesve, Julien Gracq, Francis Ponge, and those who made up the Loire School at the end of the last century around Hubert-Fillay.

The celebration over the years of artists, not only those from the region but also from elsewhere in France and abroad, have all contributed to the growth of the Loire myth. They have all described at length and often addressed the Loire with the admiration mixed with respect and fear appropriate for a very high personage, in fact to a royal personage. One very recent work, which summarizes the unanimous opinion, celebrates the Loire as a queen, with the middle reaches as the crown. As such she is worthy of admiration, of respect, and of fear, for which monarch, although subject to the demands of the etiquette and rituals of his role, would not preserve a royal freedom to be moved to rages that are sometimes devastating? This is how it is with the Loire in her kingdom. Conscious of the requirements of rank, she submits to the constraints from the knowledge and needs of her subjects and allows her course to be managed in order to shower them better with her benefits, yet remaining royally free. Is the Loire “the last untamed river in Europe?” It is rather “the last free river in Europe.”

Criterion ii

The landscape models developed during the Renaissance in the Loire Valley were based on the spatial distribution system *domus-hortus-ager-saltus*. The contribution of the Renaissance can be measured by the impact that it had on three of these elements.

The major contribution was the metamorphosis of the *hortus* into a pleasure garden attached to a grand house and then, over time, to other residences and finally becoming a very large part of the space separating the two *saltus* from the river on one side and the forest on the other. It was not because this space was explicitly designed as a pleasure garden, but because types of cultivation connected specifically with gardens, in particular orchards and vineyards, where pruning and especial care play a major role, gradually took over most of the space, often replacing the arable fields of the *ager*. This extension of the garden and its techniques to the Loire Valley lands between the river and the forest found its most pronounced expression in Touraine, early celebrated as the Garden of France and itself often put forward as the representative model for the whole national territory: is France not first, for many people, a country whose most striking quality is that of being a garden?

The other models in the Valley during the Renaissance relate to buildings, in the form of the famous *châteaux* but also its towns and villages. The towns are all ports, laid out on a simple and effective plan which picks up the Roman *cardo* and *decumanus*. Thus the main elements are the quay flanked by the esplanade and the built-up river front; at right-

angles are the river, which is extended by the main street on or near which is the main square, surrounded by public buildings. These are the features most depicted and disseminated by designers and engravers. The villages are divided into those built at the foot of the hills on the highest flood terrace and those on the slopes themselves along the main communication routes, such as the Paris-Tours road. Today these models seem so complete in their design and function that they form an integral part of the image of the Loire and benefit from careful protection and restoration activities. Thus, the Loire bridges destroyed during World War II were rebuilt to their original design.

As for the two *saltus*, the river itself on one side and the forest on the other, they also bear the imprint of the creators of the Renaissance and in their turn served as examples in the organization of other landscapes, as, for example, in the transformation of the large forests into royal hunting parks. Elements that can still be discerned in the Loire forests, like that of Chambord, such as straight alleys several kilometres long, clearings, and crossroads, are to be found later in all the forests of the Ile-de-France, and gave rise to the famous series of maps known as the *Cartes des Chasses*, one of the most famous manifestations of which is the water-colour series of the Abbé Lagrive.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a cultural landscape, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

The Loire Valley was important over much of pre- and protohistory. The Roman impact on the landscape was massive, and it today still strongly influences settlement location and form (especially urban) and road communications. The Loire was one of the most important arteries for communications and trade in Gaul.

In the late Roman period St Martin, Bishop of Tours, founded an abbey at Marmoutier around 372, and this was to serve as the model for many other monastic settlements in the Loire Valley in the centuries that followed. The sanctuary at Tours was one of the most important pilgrimage centres in Europe until it was superseded by Santiago de Compostela. The many monasteries served as focal points for settlement in the Middle Ages.

Seigneurial power developed in the 10th century and made a profound impression on the landscape. Land allotment followed the patterns of feudal society and strongly fortified residences were built by the overlords. These, too, acted as focal points for settlement. The Loire Valley was a frontier zone during the Hundred Years' War and the scene of many confrontations between French and English. The castles were rebuilt and extended to become massive fortresses, the forerunners of the *châteaux* of today.

The ever-present danger to Paris from the English during the War resulted in the Royal court spending long periods at

Tours. With the end of the War in the mid 15th century the Valley was an ideal place for Humanism and the Renaissance to take root in France. This involved *inter alia* the dismantling of the massive medieval fortresses and their reconstruction as palaces for pleasure and recreation.

The 17th-18th centuries saw the development of a secular commercial economy based on industry, crafts, trade, shipping, the river, and the towns alongside the feudal survival of the *Ancien Régime*. The late 18th century also saw the first water-management controls introduced in the Valley; these were intensified throughout the 19th century.

The romantic representation of the Valley in the 19th century by writers and painters led to the Loire becoming a magnet for tourists, first from France, then Europe, and then in the 20th century the rest of the world. This interest in the scenic qualities of the Valley and its monuments encouraged efforts to preserve the heritage of the landscape, in the form of its monuments, its towns, and its rural structure.

Description

The basin of the River Loire occupies a huge area in central and western France, stretching from the southern part of the Massif Central to an estuary on the Atlantic coast. Some 200km of the central part of the main river valley are the subject of this proposal, stretching from Sully east of Orleans to the junction of the Loire and the Maine near Angers in the west. Essentially this is the “new” Loire, for the river originally drained north-eastwards into the Paris basin. This length now lies in two Régions, Centre and Pays de la Loire, and four Départements.

The valley runs almost exclusively from west-south-west to east-north-east along the length of the proposed World Heritage cultural landscape and is much affected by the prevailing south-westerly wind. The Loire itself is fed direct by two long tributaries running off the Massif Central some 350km to the south. In the length nominated for inscription there are numerous other tributaries, all coming in from the south and including three important ones, the Cher, the Indre, and the Vienne. They substantially drain areas of limestone, clays, and sands, producing significant deposits in the valleys.

Along the Loire between Orléans and Angers, the valley is characterized by low cliffs of tufa and limestone and, often below one or more river terraces, there is a flood plain dissected by old channels. The river itself contains many islands and gravel and sand banks; it also fluctuates significantly in depth and width from season to season and year to year. Some of the flood plain is regularly under water in winter, a phenomenon welcomed as refreshment for the soil rather than a hazard. The valley has, however, a long history of periodic catastrophic flooding, carefully recorded as stone-cut water levels at numerous places along it, and even today its inhabitants live perennially under threat of severe inundation. Much contemporary river management is concerned to minimize that risk.

For most of its length in the proposed area the Loire is confined within dykes. Its banks are also punctuated at intervals of only a few kilometres by a series of villages, small towns, and cities. Notable among the urban settlements are (from north-east to south-west) Sully, Orleans, Blois, Amboise, Tours, Saumur, and Angers. Land-use is extremely varied, from urban density through intense horticulture to vineyards (some reliant on flooding) to hunting forest. In

general, the economy of the region is buoyant, only in part based on a tourist industry primarily concerned to extol a quality of life associated with the heritage in general and the *chateaux* in particular.

The area selected for nomination is characterized by an integrity of heritage values. Many of the individual monuments and urban settlements are in themselves of great heritage value; they are to be seen, in the words of the nomination dossiers, as “precious stones in a diadem.” It is the overall landscape that has evolved over time that is considered to be of outstanding universal value, and so the nomination concentrates on the Loire Valley as a cultural landscape (as does this evaluation).

Management and Protection

The nominated area covers 745km² and is surrounded by a buffer zone of 400km².

Ownership of the myriad individual properties that make up the nominated area is varied, ranging through descending levels of government body to private individuals. The river itself and its banks are public property.

Protection is similarly very diverse in nature. Different natural areas may be listed under the 1930 Law on the Protection of Sites, designated as natural reserves, biotopes, natural zones of ecological, floral, and faunal interest (ZNIEFF), or important bird-conservation zones (ZICO), or included within a regional natural park. All these forms of legal designation involve varying measures of control over human interventions.

Cultural monuments may be protected under the 1931 Law on Historic Monuments, they may be protected areas (*Secteurs sauvegardés*) or zones for the protection of the architectural, urban, and landscape heritage (ZPPAUP).

The French Government decided in 1994 to implement a ten-year master plan for the coherent planning and management of the Loire Valley (*Plan Loire Grandeur Nature*). This covers the protection of the environment and the economic development of the area. It is operated in close collaboration with the relevant organizations and institutions – territorial collectivities, economic agencies, and associations. The following are the main objectives: protection of the inhabitants against flooding; specific planning measures for the Middle and Lower Loire; measures to ensure that water demands can be met; and restoration of the ecological diversity. In 1997 a “landscape” section was added to this plan; among other features, it envisages increasing the number of protected historic monuments in the nominated area.

Overall supervision of the nominated landscape at national level is exercised by the Ministry of Land Use Planning and the Environment (Directorate of Nature and Landscapes, Sub-Directorate of Sites and Landscapes) and by the Ministry of Culture and Communication (Directorate of the Heritage, Sub-Directorate of Historic Monuments). The Centre and Pays de la Loire Régions each have Regional Directorates of the Environment and of Cultural Affairs, and the Départements of Loiret, Maine-et-Loire, Loir-et-Cher, Loire-Atlantique, and Indre-et-Loire have Departmental Services of Architecture and Heritage.

On the perimeter of the nominated area is to be found the Loire-Anjou-Touraine Regional Natural Park whose management is covered by its charter.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation of the different and diverse elements that make up the nominated area has been in progress at varying rates over a long period. Most of the *châteaux* and many other historic buildings have been protected as historic monuments or sites for many years, a number of them since the beginning of the present century at least. With the enactment of the 1962 Law, a number of urban centres were protected as *Secteurs sauvegardés*, and ZPAUPP were declared in several villages following the promulgation of the 1983 Law.

All of these actions of designation and protection have brought in their train systematic programmes of conservation.

Authenticity

When assessed as a cultural landscape, the Loire Valley exhibits a high degree of authenticity. Its historical trajectory can plainly be seen in the present-day landscape. There are some obtrusive modern features, such as recent mineral extraction, a concentration of overhead electric lines, and some low-quality modern housing, including mobile homes, at certain points. However, regulation of this type of intrusion is covered in the master plan.

Since this nomination is of a cultural landscape, it would not be appropriate to consider the authenticity of every natural or cultural component. However, it may be relevant to note that the ICOMOS expert mission report commented favourably on the overall authenticity of materials and design at the numerous cultural monuments that it visited.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Loire Valley in March 1999.

Qualities

The dynamic relationship between the river and the landscape that has grown up along its valley over two millennia is a powerful one. The diversity of settlement reflects both the physical characteristics of different sections of the river and their historical evolution. The settlement pattern ranges from isolated farms through villages to small and important provincial towns. The social and political history of France and of western Europe in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance is illustrated by the series of magnificent great houses (*châteaux*) for which the Loire Valley is famous. The land-use patterns are also richly indicative of social and economic change over the past millennium.

Comparative analysis

Great rivers have played a fundamental role in the evolution and spread of culture: the great Old World civilizations can clearly be seen to have evolved along waterways such as the Tigris/Euphrates, the Nile, the Indus, the Mekong, and the Yangtze. In Europe the Danube, the Rhine, and the Rhône

have all been cultural and economic vectors of great significance.

The special character of the Loire is the coherence of its relationship with its natural environment. All rivers and their valleys exhibit abundant traces of the course of their use and settlement over time. However, this is more clearly evident and better preserved in its historical integrity in the valley of the Loire, which is a paradigm of human interaction within a riverine cultural landscape.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The ICOMOS mission report made a number of recommendations relating to the boundaries of the nominated area and its future management. These were referred back to the State Party, and the nominated area has been slightly revised, in accordance with the ICOMOS recommendations. A Steering Committee has been established to oversee the management of the area, with representation from the government authorities and institutions involved.

At the 23rd Session of the World Heritage Committee held in Marrakesh (Morocco) on 29 November–4 December 1999, there was a lengthy and substantive debate with regard to this nomination and on the general issue of cultural landscapes.

It was generally recognised that the Loire Valley had outstanding universal value and was worthy of being inscribed as a cultural landscape on the World Heritage List under cultural criteria (ii) and (iv). However, several delegates raised concerns about the nuclear power plant located within the boundaries of the proposed site. Concern was expressed that this issue was not raised in the ICOMOS evaluation.

During the debate that followed, two differing positions emerged. Some delegates supported the view that modern elements are acceptable in a continuing landscape and noted that, in this case, adequate measures and contingency plans were in place. Other delegates stressed the need for more in-depth consideration of this issue and recommended that consideration of this nomination be deferred. Following a vote the Chairperson declared the examination of the nomination deferred.

In March 2000 the State Party submitted a complementary dossier. In this cogently argued statement it stressed that in its opinion the nuclear power stations should be considered as integral components of the landscape and representative of the continuity of human occupation over many centuries. This was the view of ICOMOS, which determined its original evaluation of the nominated property. It therefore reiterated its original recommendation that the Loire Valley should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

However, following the closed session of the Bureau in June 2000, ICOMOS undertook to study the revised nomination to be submitted by the State Party, omitting the nuclear power station. This was received by ICOMOS in September. The boundary of the nominated area has been modified so as to exclude the nuclear power station. It has also been extended to the south, so as to include the World Heritage site of the Château and Estate of Chambord, inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1981 (which will cease to constitute a separate World Heritage monument). ICOMOS considers that these modifications are fully in conformity with the

wishes of the Committee expressed at the Marrakesh meeting in December 1999, and they are in no way in conflict with the integrity of the overall cultural landscape of the Loire Valley, as set out in the overall nomination.

Brief description

The Loire Valley is an outstanding cultural landscape of great beauty, containing historic towns and villages, great architectural monuments (the *châteaux*), and cultivated lands that has been formed as a result of many centuries of interaction between human beings and their physical environment, and primarily the river Loire itself.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii* and *iv*:

Criterion ii The Loire Valley is an outstanding cultural landscape along a major river which bears witness to an interchange of human values and to a harmonious development of interactions between human beings and their environment over two millennia.

Criterion iv The landscape of the Loire Valley, and more particularly its many cultural monuments, illustrate to an exceptional degree the ideals of the Renaissance and the Age of the Enlightenment on western European thought and design.

Since Chambord was inscribed on the List on the basis of criterion i alone, the Committee may wish also to apply this criterion to the new inscription:

Criterion i The Loire Valley is noteworthy for the quality of its architectural heritage, in its historic towns such as Blois, Chinon, Orléans, Saumur, and Tours, but in particular in its world-famous castles, such as the Château de Chambord.

ICOMOS, October 2000

Pécs (Hungary)

No 853 rev

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Complex of 16 Buildings of the Pécs (<i>Sopianae</i>) Early Christian Cemetery
<i>Location</i>	County of Baranya
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Hungary
<i>Date</i>	First submitted 9 July 1999, 2nd revision August 2000

Justification by State Party

[*Note* The nomination that is evaluated here is a second reformulation of the original nomination presented but withdrawn by the State Party in 1997.]

The Early Christian burial chambers of *Sopianae* can be considered unique as they compose a special group of the collection of Early Christian monuments. The Early Christian community of the 4th century Roman city of *Sopianae* (the predecessor of Pécs) erected a considerable number of sepulchral buildings (chapels, burial chambers, and clusters of graves) in their cemetery. The size and richness of the Early Christian cemetery monument complex is the most significant in the monumental collection of necropolises outside Italy, including similar buildings in Dalmatia (Salona, Split), Bulgaria (Sofia), or Spain (La Alberca). The figural and ornamental wall paintings of the burial chambers are comparable only with the catacomb paintings in the city of Rome (Catacomba Priscilla, Capella Greca).

Owing to their size the Early Christian vestiges of Pécs are still able to produce an intimate, antique atmosphere. Although the murals show some resemblance to the wall paintings in the catacombs of Rome, the nominated buildings show considerable architectural differences as well. These are individual buildings without direct architectural connection on the one hand, and they are considerably different from sepulchres in the Balkans and in other European provinces on the other. The fundamental difference is that they have two levels and were meant to fulfil a dual function: they were at the same time burial places (*cubicula*) and memorial chapels for ceremonies. The burial chambers, chapels, and mausoleum excavated on the site of the *Sopianae* cemetery form a complex that bears witness to an ancient culture and civilization that had and still has a lasting

impact, owing to its unique architectural appearance and wall paintings with Biblical references.

Criterion iii

The Early Christian complex of monuments is an exceptional evidence of the particular historical continuity that spans the turbulent centuries from the decline of the Roman Empire in the 4th century to the conquest of the Frankish Empire in the 8th century.

Early Christian monuments provide remarkable evidence of the cult of the dead in the 1st millennium and of the survival of this cult in the ensuing centuries among changing conditions. In spite of the decline and later abandonment of the Empire the cult buildings remained here for the people who inhabited the area in the following centuries or for those travelling along the commercial routes. They helped to keep the Christian traditions alive during the turbulent centuries of the great migrations and contributed to the growing strength of the Catholic Church in the Middle Ages, maintaining the sacred character of the place. The sepulchral buildings, and indeed the whole cemetery, provide the continuity of the history of the city from the Roman era to the present day.

Criterion iv

Pécs is a city that upholds a continuity of Christian worship. The foundation of the bishopric is closely connected with Christian mentality and the foundation of the Hungarian State.

The extremely rare survival of such a monumental complex and its spiritual message had a determining role and was of outstanding significance in the development of the Christian church, which eventually signalled the European integration of the Hungarian people in the 10th century. It was a tradition that helped Hungarians to adapt themselves to medieval European culture and secured their status among European Christian states. The spiritual continuity embodied in the complex of the Early Christian cemetery is made all the more apparent by the fact that the medieval diocese developed not on the foundations of the ancient city but on the cemetery.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a group of *monuments*.

History and Description

History

The part of modern Hungary west of the Danube, which was first settled in the Neolithic period, came into the Roman Empire in the 1st century CE. It formed part of the Roman province of Pannonia. The town of *Sopianae* was founded on the southern slope of the Mecsek massif in the 2nd century by colonists coming from western Pannonia and Italy, who intermarried with the indigenous Illyrian-Celtic peoples. It became the headquarters of the civil governor (*praeses*) of the new province of *Valeria* at the end of the 3rd century. *Sopianae* was especially prosperous in the 4th century because of its situation at the junction of several important trading and military routes. Archaeological excavations have revealed a number of new public buildings in the forum area

from this time. The town was also probably made the seat of an archbishopric around this time.

There was a cemetery to the north of the town, with many Christian burials from the 4th century; in the post-Roman period, up to the 8th century, the imposing tombs probably served as shelters for different incoming groups of Huns, Germans, and Avars. It was not until the 9th century that Christianity was re-established in the town.

St István (King Stephen I), founder of the Hungarian state, established one of his ten bishoprics there in 1009, no doubt influenced by the monumental Christian sepulchral buildings; the Cella Trichora was restored to its original use as a chapel. The fortified episcopal complex was to be expanded and reconstructed in the succeeding centuries, and it was within this enceinte that the Angevin King Laszlo I the Great established the first university in Hungary (1367). The medieval town grew outside the walls of the episcopal castle complex, and it was in turn fortified in the 15th century as protection against the growing Turkish threat.

Despite the heroic struggles of successive Hungarian monarchs over more than a century, the whole of the central part of the country was taken by the Ottomans in the mid 16th century. The episcopal castle of Pécs became the administrative centre of a *sandjak*. Most of the Hungarian inhabitants of the town fled, to be replaced by Moslems from Turkey or the Balkans, who demolished the churches and monasteries (with the exception of the cathedral) and used their stones for the construction of mosques and other Islamic buildings. The town walls were strengthened with bastions.

Pécs was freed from Ottoman rule in 1686, becoming part of the Habsburg lands. The bishopric was re-established and the town was repopulated with Hungarians and German colonists. The mosques and other Moslem buildings were converted for Christian purposes, although the baths (*hammams*) continued in use for a considerable time. The fortifications around the castle were demolished and the town began to take on a Baroque appearance. It was designated the administrative centre of a county and fine public buildings were added.

Pécs secured its independence from episcopal rule in 1780. During the 19th century it witnessed a spectacular development as a commercial centre, and was graced with many buildings in the architectural styles of the period – classical, romantic, historicizing, and eventually *Art Nouveau*. Fortunately, it was spared from inappropriate insertions during the second half of the 20th century.

Description

The Roman cemetery was found by archaeological excavations, which began two centuries ago, in the area now immediately in front of the Cathedral, which had been terraced in antiquity. In all twenty structures have so far been brought to light, all in a somewhat fragmentary state. Sixteen of these constitute the property nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List. In addition over five hundred more modest graves have been found in the Roman cemetery, clustering round the major monuments.

The sixteen nominated monuments are:

- Burial chamber I (Peter-Paul)

Discovered in 1782, this late 4th century chamber owes its name to the mural on its northern wall. It consists of an above-ground chapel, the subterranean burial chamber proper, with wall paintings, and a small vestibule leading to the burial chamber. It is cut into the slope of the Mecsek hills. The Apostles are depicted as clad in white togas, pointing to the Chi-Rho symbol with outstretched arms. Other Biblical subjects are Adam and Eve (with the Tree of Paradise and Serpent), Jonah, and a fragmentary Daniel on the eastern wall and Noah, the Virgin with the Infant Christ, and Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego in the fiery furnace on the western. The vaulting is richly decorated with floral ornaments and peacocks, and in each of the four corners there are half-length portraits in medallions of those interred in the chamber.

- Burial chamber II (The Wine Pitcher Chamber)

This is again a two-storey structure, with limestone walls and brick vaulting. On the wall of the niche carved above the sarcophagus there is a painting of a wine pitcher and glass, symbolizing the thirst of the soul journeying to the nether-world. The walls are painted with floral and geometric patterns.

- Burial chambers III, IV, and V

These undecorated chambers were discovered when the Peter-Paul chamber was being restored in 1913.

- Burial chamber VI

Only part of this undecorated chamber, discovered during drainage works in 1922, has been revealed.

- Burial chamber VII

A fragmentary undecorated chamber, possibly slighted during the 9th and 10th centuries and partly backfilled.

- Burial chambers VIII and IX

These two chambers were discovered in 1940. Both have plastered walls that do not bear any mural paintings.

- The Cella Trichora

This substantial structure was first excavated in 1922 and again in 1955. The elaborate chapel has a rectangular central space with three apses (hence its description, *cella trichora*) and a southern vestibule (*narthex*); the eastern apse has a raised floor and was probably an altar. The walls still survive to a height of 1.30m. The floor consists of a terrazzo of limestone mixed with brick fragments.

The inner surfaces of the walls of the apses were painted in red and black in the 4th century and overpainted when the building was restored for Christian use in the 11th century.

- The Cella Septichora

As the name that is given to it implies, this sepulchral building has a unique floor plan with seven apses. No graves were found when it was excavated in 1938-39, which suggests that it was not used for burial purposes. It dates from the end of the Roman period, in the 430s.

- *The Early Christian Mausoleum*

This, the largest of the two-storey burial chambers, lies a little to the south of the main group. It consists of a subterranean burial chamber entered from a vestibule or *narthex* surmounted by a single-nave church with an apse at its east end. The northern, eastern, and southern walls of the burial chamber, which was originally barrel-vaulted, are all decorated with mural paintings. The Biblical subjects are similar to those in the Peter-Paul Chamber. There is evidence that the brick vaulting was also painted with floral and other designs.

- *The Early Christian Burial Chapel*

This chapel has no burial chamber beneath it. It appears to have been built some time in the 4th century as a burial chamber, but it was reconstructed around 390, with the insertion of a semicircular bench and a stone altar in the apse. This suggests that its use became solely that of a chapel. There is a cluster of more than a hundred graves from the late 4th and early 5th centuries around this chapel.

- *The Painted Twin Grave*

A gabled double grave contains wall paintings of Christian symbols in red, carmine, and yellow on a white background. It is underground and appears not to have had a chapel above it.

- *Unpainted burial chamber*

One of three chambers discovered in the yard of the present-day county library. It was originally a barrel-vaulted subterranean chamber with no chapel above.

- *Communal burial chamber*

A large semi-subterranean burial chamber (9.44m by 5.40m), orientated north-south and originally barrel-vaulted. A short flight of steps led to down to the chamber, which contained fourteen graves, separated from one another by stones and bricks. Stone and brick fragments bear names, presumed to be members of a single family.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The zone comprising the nominated monuments and the buffer zone was declared a protected area by decree of the Ministry of Construction and the Ministry of Culture in 1966. The Roman Cemetery is also protected as an archaeological site under the Hungarian antiquities law of 1964. Both of these laws have been updated in 1997, specifically Act LIV of 1997 on the Protection of Historic Monuments and Act CXL of 1997 on the Protection of Cultural Goods, Museum Institutions, Public Library Services and Cultural Education. These laws regulate the excavation and conservation, and presentation of the site under consideration for nomination. At the local level, City Government Order No. 40 of 1994 declared the historic centre of the city and the area of the Roman Cemetery as a memorial zone. The city has also passed several other ordinances in relation to the protection of historical and architectural values within the context of city development.

Management

Ownership of the sixteen monuments is varied: five belong to the Hungarian State, seven to the Bishopric of Pécs, and four to Baranya County.

A Management Plan Committee has been set up by the Secretariat of the Hungarian National World Heritage Committee, under the direction of the Ministry of National Cultural Heritage. It is composed of representatives of the National Committee, the City of Pécs, Baranya County, the Bishopric of Pécs, the Treasury, and private stakeholders. Its role is to regulate every activity relating to the designated monuments, from day-to-day maintenance to long-term planning. A detailed plan has been produced which covers research strategies, conservation of the monuments and their surroundings, public presentation, tourism, and transportation, and involvement of the local community. There is a long-term (fourteen-year) plan, the first four years of which (2000–2004) will essentially be devoted to the establishment of the management structure and mechanisms, and this will be revised on a five-year cycle up to 2014.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The first burial chamber in the area were discovered in the early 18th century, with major finds being made in the later part of that century. Beginning in the late 19th century and throughout the 20th century other remains have been found and documented.

Conservation and presentation began in earnest after World War II, with a great deal of work on the burial chambers carried out in the 1970s and 1980s. Work is still underway, most notably on the Peter and Paul burial chamber, which led to the discovery in January 2000 of another burial chamber.

Authenticity

It is true that some original material is missing from the chambers, either because, as is the nature of archaeological sites, not all original materials are found during the excavations, or in some cases because during the early excavations in the 19th and early 20th centuries some materials, such as original floorings were not conserved. There is, however, still a great deal of original material present, as evidenced by the fine wall paintings in many of the chambers. Those responsible for the conservation of the sites are making every effort to conserve and maintain these original materials. Efforts have also been made for conservation and presentation purposes to distinguish between the original materials and those modern interventions necessary for their conservation/presentation. Many of the burial chambers are also still intact to the point that it is possible to get a sense of the original design concept.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Pécs in February/March 2000 to report on a larger area of the historic town, which had constituted the earlier nominated

property. During that mission it was learned that the Government of Hungary had decided to reduce and focus the scope of the nomination, concentrating on the remnants of the Early Christian Cemetery and burial chambers.

ICOMOS therefore sent a second mission in October 2000, concurrent with the preparation of a comparative study of Palaeochristian cemeteries in the western Roman provinces.

Qualities

Pécs is an interesting demonstration in material terms of the persistence of the Christian faith over two millennia. The form and decoration of the Early Christian burial structures in the *Sopianae* cemetery are outstanding examples of their type, without equal in the western Roman provinces.

Comparative analysis

The detailed study of the Pécs Roman cemetery carried out for ICOMOS by a distinguished expert in the field of Late Roman sepulchral monuments compares its architecture and art with that of the most significant examples of this category in Croatia, France, Germany, and Spain. It concludes that the *Sopianae* complex has the richest collection of structural types in the northern and western Roman provinces, reflecting a diversity of cultural sources. The quality of the mural paintings of Biblical and Christian scenes is comparable with that of the catacombs in Rome.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The name for the nominated site proposed by the State Party is accurate and fully descriptive of the property, but ICOMOS feels it to be somewhat clumsy. It is recommended that the State Party be requested to consider as an alternative “The Pécs (*Sopianae*) Early Christian Cemetery,” as used on the cover of the nomination dossier.

Brief description

In the 4th century a remarkable series of decorated tombs were constructed in the cemetery of the Roman provincial town of *Sopianae* (modern Pécs). These are important both structurally and architecturally, since they were built above ground and served both as burial chambers and memorial chapels, and also in artistic terms, since they are richly decorated with murals depicting Christian themes of outstanding quality.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of ***criteria iii and iv***:

Criterion iii The burial chambers and memorial chapels of the *Sopianae* cemetery bear outstanding testimony to the strength and faith of the Christian communities of Late Roman Europe.

Criterion iv The unique Early Christian sepulchral art and architecture of the northern and western Roman provinces is exceptionally well and fully illustrated by the *Sopianae* cemetery at Pécs.

The State Party should be requested to consider changing the name of the nominated property to “The Pécs (*Sopianae*) Early Christian Cemetery.”

ICOMOS, November 2000

Shey Phoksundo (Nepal)

No 992

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Shey Phoksundo National Park
<i>Location</i>	Dolpo and Mugu Districts, Mid-Western Development Region
<i>State Party</i>	Nepal
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1999

Justification by State Party

Note 1 This property is nominated as a *mixed site*, under the natural and the cultural criteria. This evaluation will deal solely with the cultural values, and the natural values will be covered in the IUCN evaluation.

Note 2 The text below is an abridged version of the justification in the nomination dossier, dealing only with the cultural aspects of the nomination.

Shey Phoksundo National Park constitutes a thriving paragon of an ancient culture associated with the unique biological diversity of the highest terrestrial ecosystem on Earth. Nepal's largest National Park represents a true trans-Himalayan region, largely nestled in the rain-shadow of the Himalayan Range in the Tibetan Plateau of the Palearctic Region. Shey Phoksundo's remote character has not only allowed both its biological and its cultural resources to remain well preserved, but it has also enabled an incomparable and exceptionally intact human ecosystem within the Himalaya to flourish.

The National Park remains a refuge for one of the few pockets of extant Tibetan culture in the Himalaya. Dolpo (the name traditionally used for the area covered by the National Park) is also the living spirit of the Bonpö religion, a precursor to Buddhism; indeed, it is the only surviving intact area where Bonpö still flourishes in peoples' daily lives. The landscape is dotted with the architecture and cultural symbols of pre-Buddhist Bonpö, including distinctive and sacred monasteries such as Shey Gompa, as well as numerous mural paintings, *thangka*, and *chortens*. The residents of Dolpo are a living legacy of the traditional way of life that has evolved over centuries and is still actively evolving. The National Park contains not only one of the highest settlements (Shey, 4480m) engaged in transhumant agro-pastoralism, but also one of the oldest and most exemplary system, since Dolpalis residing in the area since the 10th century have combined this way of life with age-old, though declining, traditional trading routes to Tibet.

Cultural criteria iii, iv, and v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

Dolpo is culturally unique in that it is, according to one commentator, "the last enclave of pure Tibetan culture left on earth." The people of the area are of pure Tibetan stock, with a way of life that cannot be far removed from that of the Ch'ang Tartars from central Asia, the original Tibetans. There are four main ethnic groups – Lama, Baiji, Gurung, and Rokaya – living in nineteen villages that are mostly located on the outskirts of the National Park.

It is also the last remaining region in which the Bonpö religion is practised. This shamanistic religion, with animistic and tantric elements, antedates the imposition of Buddhism by Lhasa kings in the 8th and 9th centuries, and it survives in its purest form and as part of everyday life only in the remote southern part of Dolpo, mostly in the villages of Ringmo and Pungmo. These two villages are closely linked culturally and are recognized as a separate sub-unit. Elsewhere, and particularly in northern Dolpo, Buddhism is the predominant religion.

Transhumance is practised, livestock being taken to mountain pastures in the summer and brought down again during the winter. For example, Ringmo is a summer settlement at 3600m, on the southern bank of Phoksundo Lake. The entire population of Pungmo (thirty households and c 160 inhabitants) spends the winter months (February–May) at the temporary village of Koinre, at a lower altitude. Whilst this is a practical necessity in these harsh climatic conditions, it also has the advantage of allowing the respective ecosystems to recover and ensuring the continuous availability of grazing for livestock. In addition to this pastoral transhumance, crops are cultivated in small fields, particularly *uwa* (a local variety of wheat), maize, and buckwheat, as well as some vegetables.

There are three forms of architecture that are unique to the high Himalaya. The *chorten* (the Tibetan equivalent of the Sanskrit *stupa* or memorial sanctuary) is the purest form of the meditating Buddhist mandala, and there are hundreds of these monuments in Dolpo. They are larger and more complex in form than others in the Himalayan region, and most bear an inscribed Bon mantra instead of the more common Buddhist *Om Mani Padme Hum*. In some places there are strings of *chortens* at the beginning and end of each village and along the trails, so as to separate sacred from profane spaces. Local materials are used – wood, clay, chalk, and rocks – and some are elaborately decorated and contain relics and other ancient artefacts.

There are 24 active *gompas* (monasteries) in the nominated area, both Buddhist and Bonpö, and most of them located in remote scenic sites. In addition, the remains of many abandoned *gompas* and meditation caves are to be found.

Shey Gompa is a monastery of the reformist Kagyu Buddhist sect. It is an important place of pilgrimage at the time of the full moon in August, when pilgrims circumambulate the

sacred Crystal Mountain, at the foot of which the monastery is located.

Thashung Gompa, at Phoksundo Lake, was built 900 years ago to conserve wildlife. The head abbot of a nearby monastery requested poachers to refrain from slaughtering musk ox in great quantities, and founded the *gompa* when they failed to comply. Samling Gompa is especially important to the Bonpö and a very early foundation. Another important pilgrimage site is Nellahi-Tingnam-So Lake.

The vernacular houses of the villages are timber-framed mud-brick buildings in tight rows. As with the *chortens* and the *gompas*, only local materials are used. Their facades are adorned with pillars, balustrades, and trapezoidal windows, all in wood and painted in various combinations of black, white, and red. The roofs are flat and plastered with a thick mud covering on a birch-bark backing. This form of roofing is appropriate to the steppe landscape of the region, in the rain-shadow of the Himalaya. The roof space provides dry and secure conditions for the storage of foodstuffs and other goods.

There is an age-old tradition of trade in this region, using pack animals (in this case yaks). Locally produced grain and flour, woollen goods, and medicinal plants are bartered by the Dolpali traders in other parts of Nepal (but no longer in Tibet) for salt, tea, rice, milk products, and livestock. This ancient commercial tradition is under threat at the present time as a result of the closure of the frontier with Tibet and the advent of new forms of handling long-distance goods.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Shey Phoksundo was officially designated a National Park in 1984, under the provisions of the 1973 National Parks and Wildlife Conservation Act.

Management

The whole area is owned by the Department of National Parks and Wildlife Conservation of the Ministry of Forests and Soil Conservation. There are detailed regulations in force to regulate access to the National Park and to provide protection for wildlife and landscapes. Regulations are also in force in the designated buffer zone around the Park.

All the communities within the National Park have formal Community Forest Management Committees; they also have informal pasture management committees. Of equal importance are the traditional institutions based on religious trusts that have been managed the landscape, both built and open, for many generations. This may best be described as a collective spirit of community heritage management. It has recently been strengthened by the creation of schools expressly designed to inculcate respect and reverence for the cultural and natural heritage in the young people.

The Shey Phoksundo National Park is a self-contained entity so far as management is concerned. It has its own administration, headed by the Park Warden, with appropriate staff at all levels. There has been a deliberate policy in recent years of progressively involving local communities more and more with conservation activities.

The Five-Year Management Plan for Shey Phoksundo National Park 1997-2001 places considerable emphasis on

the natural heritage of the Park, but it does contain policies and programmes for the conservation of the cultural heritage, and in particular work programmes for the conservation of three of the most important *gompas*.

Conservation work in the National Park has benefited from considerable assistance, particularly in survey and training programmes, from a number of non-governmental organizations, such as the WWF, and from bilateral aid, notably from the US Department of the Interior by means of USAID programmes.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation as such has only very recently played a role in the life of Shey Phoksundo. It began in the early 1970s with plans to establish a wildlife reserve. So far as the cultural heritage is concerned, the concept of conservation is only now beginning to be introduced. However, the cultural heritage of Dolpo has been conserved using traditional materials and techniques for many generations and without external influences, by virtue of its remoteness.

The ICOMOS mission, while generally approving the level of conservation of the traditional settlements, expressed concern about the conservation of the *chortens* that were visited. The mission also found the re-plastering of the walls in the *gompas* visited and the restoration of the wall paintings not to be carried out to an acceptable level.

Authenticity

Because of the reasons cited above under "Conservation history," the nominated area may be considered to have retained a substantial degree of authenticity and integrity. This was confirmed by the ICOMOS expert mission, with the exception of the use of synthetic paints in the restoration of some of the mural paintings in the *gompas*. The management policies now in force should ensure that this continues in the future so far as the vernacular buildings are concerned, but as greater care must be exercised in the choice of paints for the restoration of paintings.

However, the authenticity of the settings of the traditional villages is badly disrupted by the location and style of some of the official buildings (see "ICOMOS recommendations for future action" below). The same criticism applies also to the camping site at Ringmo, which occupies a site close to the lake and adversely affects the important relationship between the settlement and the major natural feature.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

For climatic and logistic reasons the joint ICOMOS-IUCN expert mission was not able to visit this property until October 2000.

Qualities

Shey Phoksundo National Park contains a remarkable culture of considerable antiquity associated with the highest terrestrial ecosystem on Earth. Its remoteness has made it possible for its cultural resources to survive virtually intact. Of particular interest is the survival of a pre-Buddhist

religion that plays an active role in the everyday life of its adherents, which is very rare in this region.

Comparative analysis

There are some 270 protected areas in the Himalayan mountain region, in six countries (Bhutan, China, India, Myanmar, Nepal, and Pakistan). Nine of these are in Nepal. In cultural terms, none has the level of authenticity and integrity of the Shey Phoksundo National Park. The nearest is the Upper Mustang part of the Annapurna Conservation Area, which is similar in several respects, such as the wide distribution of *chortens* and a long trading tradition. However, the greater remoteness of Shey Phoksundo has ensured that it has been less contaminated by outside cultural influences than Upper Mustang. It is also especially noteworthy for the remarkable survival of Bonpö as an active religion that permeates every aspect of the daily life of its practitioners.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Whilst the general level of authenticity in the vernacular buildings was good, the ICOMOS mission drew attention to the materials and workmanship of a number of buildings constructed by the Ministry of Forest and Soil Conservation, which clashed badly with both the vernacular buildings and the natural environment. ICOMOS urges the State Party to give priority to the replacement of these structures with buildings that in terms of design and materials are in harmony with the traditional architecture and natural surroundings.

The ICOMOS mission was also concerned about the location of these buildings and of the camp site at Ringmo. The State Party should give urgent consideration to the resiting of these elements, which seriously disrupt the relationship between the settlement and the natural environment.

Considerable work is needed as a matter of priority in the restoration of most the *chortens*, which are neglected and deteriorating rapidly. The State Party should request international assistance from the World Heritage Fund for the restoration of the historic structures. There is also a need for a training strategy, making use of surviving traditional skills and imparting them to a new generation. This could also be the subject of a request for training assistance from the Fund.

As a basis for future management and presentation, it is essential that the State Party should set up a project for the scientific documentation of the cultural heritage of Shey-Phoksundo National Park, including survey and inventory. It should pay particular attention to the relationship between the cultural and the natural heritage.

Finally, it is important that a multidisciplinary body should be established to advise the Department of National Parks and Wildlife Conservation on all aspects of the cultural heritage. This body should be responsible for the establishment of management and monitoring guidelines for the cultural heritage of the Park.

Brief description

The Shey Phoksundo National Park contains a remarkably intact cultural heritage that goes back many centuries. It retains a living pre-Buddhist religion which is active in the

everyday life of the people, along with its places of worship and pilgrimage. A pure form of transhumance, with livestock moving to upland pastures in summer, is still being practised.

Recommendation

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred* to enable the State Party to take account of the recommendations of the ICOMOS mission quoted above.

ICOMOS, November 2000

Saint-Louis (Senegal)

No 956

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Island of Saint-Louis (Ile de Saint-Louis)
<i>Location</i>	Region of Saint-Louis
<i>State Party</i>	Senegal
<i>Date</i>	17 September 1998

Justification by State Party

The historic centre of Saint-Louis is a colonial town; it is unique in this type of heritage partly owing to its relationship with water, being situated between two arms of the Senegal River, and partly to the novelty of the surrounding quays and the linkage with the system of transversal roads. No other colonial cities have the same characteristics. Saint-Louis has had considerable influence in the parts of Africa that were under French dominion and even further, particularly because of its architecture but also in terms of education, culture, craftsmanship, and services. The masons, joiners, carpenters, and jewellers have swarmed even into Anglophone regions, where they have worked and trained the natives in their crafts.

Criteria ii and iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

The Island of Saint-Louis was not inhabited before the arrival of the Europeans. The region belonged to the kingdom of Walo and was subject to exploration by Portuguese, Venetians, and Dutch from the 15th century onwards. There were a number of initiatives, particularly in the 17th century, when some settlements were established in the region. In 1633 the French decided to establish the first chartered company in Senegal, the Cap-Vert Company. The island at the mouth of Senegal River was selected in 1659 when, after some unsuccessful attempts, the Frenchman Louis Caullier chose this site for the fortification of the company. Several other companies followed the Cap-Vert

Company, and the English occupied Saint-Louis on three occasions, in 1693, in 1779, and from 1809 to 1817.

Initially unhealthy and inhospitable, the island also lacked building materials, until it was discovered that the plentiful masses of oysters could serve for lime production and road construction. Gradually the settlement of Saint-Louis developed its commercial activities, trading rubber, leather, gold, ivory, and cereals as well as dealing in slaves. To these were added the need for education and building of schools.

At the beginning of the 19th century the settlement had some 8000 inhabitants. In 1828 an urban master plan established the street pattern and regulated the development of the town, starting from the old fortification as the basic reference. The real development of the town, however, took place from 1854, when Louis Faidherbe was nominated governor. Thus from 1854 to 1865 Saint-Louis was urbanized. It was nominated the capital of Senegal in 1872 and reached its apogee in 1895 when it was nominated the capital of West Africa.

In this period Saint-Louis became the leading urban centre in sub-Saharan Africa, as well as the centre for the diffusion of cultural and artistic activities. The first museum of the industry, ethnography, and history of West Africa was opened in Saint-Louis on 15 March 1864. In this period the schools and other public institutions and services, as well as the first Senegalese military battalion, and a Muslim court of justice, were established.

The period of peace in the colony contributed to the development of economic and commercial activities, thus favouring the expansion and influence of the town. However, in 1902 Saint-Louis lost its status as the capital of West Africa and in 1957 it ceased being the capital of Senegal. This meant the departure of the French garrison with the military and their families and the closure of a number of offices and shops; the last to close were the customs in 1963. The French population was drastically reduced. At the same time, however, the overall population continued to grow, being 55,600 in 1960, 90,000 in 1976, and 150,000 in 1997.

The town has developed both on the Langue de Barbarie (the ridge against the Ocean) and in Sor on the continent. There has also been overpopulation in the old town, where some older structures been at risk of collapse. An new urban master plan was prepared in 1983 in order to regulate the situation, and also to provide for the protection of the historic areas. At present the city has revived its economy (based on fishing and agriculture) and tourism (international festivals, exhibitions, sports, etc.). The University of Gaston Berger was opened in 1992. A new airport was recently inaugurated in Saint-Louis to facilitate access. The growth of the city is giving the authorities the same concerns as any other large African city, including illegal occupation of land and environmental problems.

Description

The Island of Saint-Louis is articulated in three parts: the Nord quarter, the Sud quarter, and the Place Faidherbe and the Government Palace in the centre. The entire settlement is situated in a magnificent lagoon formed by the two arms of the Senegal River, which separate it from the maritime part of the town and from the Sor quarter on the continent. The long and narrow, almost rectangular, island is about 2500m long in the north-south direction and about 350m wide on average. The bridge of Moustapha Malick Gaye (formerly

Servatius) links the island to a ridge of land in the west, the Langue de Barbarie, which protects it from the Ocean. The Faïdherbe bridge, constructed at the end of the 19th century, links the town to the mainland and the area of Sor. The climate is tropical with a dry period from November to June.

The zone proposed for inscription consists of the central part of the Island of Saint-Louis, about 350m x 1300m. A buffer zone has been identified, mainly consisting of the water across the two arms of the Senegal River, east and west of the historic town, as well as of narrow areas of land of about 50m, to the north and south of the proposed zone.

The urban fabric of the old town is based on the orthogonal grid plan of 1828. There are four streets running north-south and a large number of short alleys crossing the island east-west. As a result there are blocks of different dimensions: 30m x 30m, 30m x 75m, and larger. The island is encased by a system of quays, which are a reference to all streets in the east-west direction. The urban layout gives the town its particular character and specificity. From the architectural and aesthetic point of view the quality of the two- or three-storied colonial buildings is distinguished in the form of wooden balconies with wrought-iron grilles, roofs with red tiles, and the doors and windows with wooden shutters.

The main historic buildings include the ancient fort, the *Hôtel du Gouvernement*, the Governor's Palace, which marks the centre of the island, the place where the first settlement was established. This ensemble has been modified to a great extent over the centuries, particularly in the interior, but it still conserves the exterior, although with some additions. The *Cathedral* is situated next to the Governor's Palace and was built with the voluntary contribution of the citizens, completed in 1828. The military barracks, called *Rognat Nord* and *Rognat Sud*, were constructed in 1837 in the centre of the town, on both sides of the *Place Faïdherbe*. Together with the Governor's Palace they form a classical composition in axis with the *Servatius Bridge*. The building of the *Regional Assembly for the River* has existed since 1825, first in a more modest form. It was extended to house a primary school in 1839, and after 1873 it was used for the colonial archives. Subsequently the building has provided the premises for various public authorities. A rather large complex, it is articulated with pilasters and balconies. It is in a good state of repair. Other buildings include *Faïdherbe Bridge* inaugurated in 1897 (506m long), the *Civic Hospital* built in 1822, and the *Great Mosque* of the North, built starting in 1838.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The owner of the Island of Saint-Louis is the State of Senegal; individual buildings have a mixed ownership, including public authorities and private individuals or institutions. As a result of inheritance succession, many buildings may have several proprietors, which complicates administration and restoration.

The legal instruments for the protection and management of the historic centre of Saint-Louis include the law for the protection of sites and historic monuments (71-12/1971), the decree for the application of the law (73-746/1973), and the decree declaring Saint-Louis a zone of urban renovation (76-277/1977).

Management

The town received an urban master plan in 1928, and this has been the basis of its further development.

Louis Barge International prepared the first urban master plan (*plan de sauvegarde*) for the historic centre of Saint-Louis in 1983. Krzysztof Pawlowski prepared the second plan in 1984. A third plan with technical guidelines dates from 1997 and was the responsibility of Cabinet Archi + de Fodé DIOP. There are no regional development plans with an impact on the historic town.

The planning and management are the responsibility of the public authorities, including the Ministry of Culture and the Ministry of Urbanism and Habitat (Dakar), as well as the Municipality of Saint-Louis. The authorities collaborate with the Bureau d'Architecture des Monuments Historiques for the implementation of the guidelines. The Syndicat d'Initiative et de Tourisme and the Convention des Saint-Louisiens participate in their fields of competence. Itineraries have been identified for visitors, including visits to major historic buildings.

There is, however, a lack of resources, and particularly of qualified technicians to control the works and to sustain building owners in their projects.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The conservation of the historic fabric is reported to have been satisfactory until the middle of the 20th century, when the capital of Senegal was transferred to Dakar. Since this date the old town has suffered from the lack of attention and means and has faced increasing degradation.

The historic centre has been inscribed on the list of protected sites since 1975 and it was identified as a zone for urban renovation in 1976 (Decree No 76-271).

Nevertheless, more and more buildings are getting into a hazardous state, risking collapse. Unauthorized ad-hoc repairs and works have been undertaken by owners or occupants which have undermined the character of the historic buildings. A certain amount of restoration work has been carried out in recent decades, conducted on listed historic buildings by the public authorities. Priority has been given to buildings and structures of architectural value that are still in functional order or risk ruin. However, the lack of resources has seriously limited the possibilities of public intervention. In fact, the current poor state of repair reflects the economic situation. In recent times, it has been necessary to demolish buildings for reasons of public safety.

Authenticity

The removal of the capital of Senegal from Saint-Louis to Dakar has seriously undermined the conservation of the old town. Up to the present the historic town has retained its historic integrity and character and most of its authentic historic fabric. However, the state of conservation of many of the buildings is not satisfactory.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in June 2000.

Qualities

The location of the historic town of Saint-Louis on an island at the mouth of the Senegal River gives it a special quality of setting. The regular town plan, the system of quays, and the characteristic colonial architecture and public buildings give Saint-Louis its particular quality and identity. Furthermore, it has been a cultural and economic centre that has influenced the whole of West Africa, particularly in the 19th century.

Comparative analysis

The historic town of Saint-Louis is a French colonial city and can therefore be compared with Gorée and Rufisque in Senegal and Bingerville in Côte d'Ivoire. The Island of Saint-Louis, however, is very different in its urban layout and character by comparison with Gorée, which is already on the World Heritage List. The other two towns have not been protected and are in poor condition. Through its history as a capital city, Saint-Louis has also acquired a more important architectural heritage than could be found in the other towns of West Africa.

ICOMOS comments

The report of the ICOMOS expert mission recommended that the entire island be included in the nomination area, considering that it forms an indivisible unity. The buffer zone should consist of the two branches of the river, extending some 500m downstream, as well as including the Langue de Barbarie.

Furthermore, the report stressed the need for a special office to be established for the conservation management of the protected area, providing this office with the necessary expertise, facilities, and resources.

Brief description

Founded as a French colonial settlement in the 17th century, the Island of Saint-Louis was urbanized in the mid 19th century. It was the capital of Senegal from 1872 to 1957 and played an important cultural and economic role in the whole of West Africa. The location of the town on an island at the mouth of the Senegal River, its regular town plan, the system of quays, and the characteristic colonial architecture give Saint-Louis its particular quality and identity.

Recommendation

The outstanding universal value of the site is recognized. At the Bureau meeting in June 2000, it was decided that the nomination should be referred back to the State Party to provide guarantees of the urgent establishment of offices and facilities integrated with the necessary expertise and resources for the long-term management of the site. Furthermore, it was recommended that the entire island be included in the nominated area, since it may be considered to constitute a conceptual unity.

Following the recommendation of the Bureau, the State Party has given the requested assurances, and has guaranteed that the local office for the protection of the historic area would

be re-established with the necessary personnel and under the direction of a qualified architect seconded for this position. A Committee will be established for the conservation of the Island of Saint-Louis, and the operational funds will be provided jointly by the State and the Agency for Municipal Development, and other sponsors. Furthermore, the State Party has agreed that the entire island be included in the nominated area, as recommended by the Bureau, with the two arms of the river forming the buffer zone.

It is thus recommended that the site be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria ii and iv**.

Criterion ii The historic town of Saint-Louis exhibits an important exchange of values and influences on the development of education and culture, architecture, craftsmanship, and services in a large part of West Africa.

Criterion iv The Island of Saint-Louis, a former capital of West Africa, is an outstanding example of a colonial city, characterized by its particular natural setting, and it illustrates the development of colonial government in this region.

ICOMOS, October 2000

Vall de Boí (Spain)

No 988

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Romanesque Catalan Ensemble of the Vall de Boí
<i>Location</i>	Autonomous Community of Catalonia, Alta Ribagorça Region, Municipality of La Vall de Boí
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	28 July 1999; revised 14 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The largest concentration of Romanesque art in Europe is to be found in the Vall de Boí. The group of exceptionally well preserved rural churches constitute a unique example of the cultural tradition which flourished in 12th century Catalonia. The Romanesque churches and the villages in which they are located form an excellent example of a cultural landscape which bloomed in a harmonious way in a natural setting in which the wealth of the environment has remained intact.

The nine Romanesque churches of the Vall de Boí are a masterpiece of their period and result from the human creative faculty. The Lombard Romanesque style in these Pyrenean churches took on an indigenous form of expression in which the rural spirit manifests itself in remarkable ways, such as the chain of elegant bell-towers which stretch throughout the Valley.

Criterion i

The Romanesque Catalan ensemble of the Vall de Boí furnishes unique evidence of the manifestation of an international artistic style (Lombard Romanesque or Early Romanesque) which, adapted to an isolated mountain environment and lying outside the great medieval religious routes, reflects an individual artistic personality and great powers of expression.

The Vall de Boí is the cradle of Catalan Romanesque art and bears unique witness to an indigenous cultural tradition which has survived since the 11th century. The churches of Sant Climent de Taüll, Santa Maria de Taüll, Sant Joan de Boí, Santa Eulàlia d'Erill la Vall, La Nativitat de Durro, Santa Maria de Cardet, and Santa Maria de Cóll have remained open for religious use since they were consecrated during the 11th and 12th centuries.

The rural centres in which they are located have continued in activity since the Middle Ages. From generation to generation the inhabitants of the valley have worshipped in

their country churches, which where they met not only for religious but also for cultural and community matters.

It should be added that, as well as the indisputable architectural Value of the group in the Vall de Boí itself, the National Museum of Catalan Art (MNAC) in Barcelona (the capital of Catalonia) contains wall paintings that once decorated the main churches. The decoration of the apse of Sant Climent de Taüll is acknowledged to be one of the masterpieces of Romanesque art.

The nomination to the World Heritage List of the architectural group of Romanesque churches in the Vall de Boí is completed with the inclusion of the wall paintings from Sant Climent de Taüll, Santa Maria de Taüll, and Sant Joan de Boí now in the MNAC in Barcelona. The exceptional nature of this nomination of properties that are distant in geographical terms is justified for historical reasons of the highest order. During the 1920s the Catalan cultural authorities removed these paintings from the Boí churches because of the danger of their being exported abroad at a time when there was no legal control of the cultural heritage in Spain. As a result of this rescue operation, which is unique in the annals of European art, the paintings are now on permanent display in the Barcelona museum, which has been recently renovated.

Criterion iii

The group of Romanesque churches in the Vall de Boí is a remarkable example of an important constructional style in human history, like that of Romanesque art, to which it contributes characteristics that are appropriate to both its religious and its secular aspects. The churches constitute the cultural elements that are essential and distinctive of this region.

The Vall de Boí illustrates the continuous occupation of an area of land. The churches that were built in the Middle Ages at the instigation of a single family symbolize the affirmation and geographical settlement at the time that historical Catalonia was created.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a group of *monuments*.

History and Description

History

The Arab invasion and occupation of the Iberian peninsula never penetrated the valleys of the high Pyrenees. Despite their inaccessibility, these valleys were exposed around the beginning of the 2nd millennium to ideas and cultural influences, brought there by merchants, by itinerant monks and by Christian pilgrims travelling to Jerusalem and Santiago de Compostela.

Moreover, of the three Christian territories in Spain at that period, Catalonia was in better contact with outside influences than the kingdoms of Navarre or León. It was a mosaic of the small fiefs of counts, who paid little heed to their Frankish nominal overlords. In the 11th century Ramon Borrell II established the hegemony of Barcelona and created a dynasty which survived until the early 15th century. New cultural styles were brought into Catalonia from Italy,

particularly Lombardy, and their fruits are to be seen in the religious ensembles of Vic, Cuixà, and Ripoll. Many craftsmen and artists came to Catalonia from this region of Italy, and testimony to their influence is given by the fact that the word *lombard* became synonymous with "stonemason" or "supervisor" in Catalonia. It was from here that Romanesque architectural and artistic influences were diffused throughout the Iberian peninsula in the 13th–15th centuries.

This new cultural movement was late in reaching the remote Vall de Boí. The exceptional number of Romanesque churches in the valley, which has supported a relatively low population since the end of the Middle Ages, is attributed to the fact that large quantities of silver came into the region, especially in the first decades of the 12th century, during the campaign to recover Barbastro and Saragossa. The counts of Erill took part in this campaign and drew handsome profits from it. They devoted considerable portions of their gains to embellishing their villages with handsome churches in the new style.

Description

The Vall de Boí is situated in the high Pyrenees in the Alta Ribagorça region, some 120km due north of Lleida. The deep valley is screened by the high peaks of the Beciberri/Punta Alta massif. Its scenery is one of woodland and meadows, adjoining and surrounding the small villages with their Romanesque churches. There is little industry - no more than two flour mills, a sawmill, some woollen weaving, and lead mining near Durro. The sulphur and mineral content of the waters of the area is the source of the small thermal establishments in the valley.

The layouts of the villages follow the feudal pattern of individual houses grouped around a main central building (church or castle) or main road (usually on Roman roads). Each has a small open space for meetings and festivals, their shape being determined by the alignments of the buildings that form them. Some of the villages rise steeply up the mountainsides, the houses being connected by ramps (*pujadors*). Only at Boí has a medieval gateway been preserved.

The tall towers of the churches served both to house the bells and to act as lookouts in case of attack. Alongside each of them is the walled village cemetery. The streets are paved with stone slabs or cobbles, their settings varying according to the local topography. They are now being replaced with modern materials (eg in Taüll and Boí).

Brief notes follow on churches that make up this nomination.

- Sant Feliú, Barruera

Barruera is located at a strategic point, where the Vall de Boí widens out. The village extends along the single main street (on the route of a Roman road), with narrow streets leading to the remaining older part of the village and small blind alleys opening off it. In the Middle Ages the settlement was much larger, linked with a now disappeared abbey. Its parish church of Sant Feliú lies outside the village immediately above the river flood plain. It has a single nave (the only survivor of the three in its original design) with a semi-circular apse, decorated on the outside with arches and pilasters. There is a square transept on the south side; two square chapels were added in Gothic style to the main nave. The church is entered through the western facade, also

Gothic; the bell-tower must have been renovated at around the same time, probably in the 16th century.

- Sant Joan, Boí

The fortified centre of Boí is also on the route of an ancient road, leading to a Roman thermal establishment. It is situated on the right bank of the Sant Martí river, between two high rocky outcrops in the centre of the Valley. The three bell-towers of Boí, Taüll, and Erill la Vall are intervisible, a notable defensive feature.

The church of Sant Joan is situated at the entrance to the village. It underwent considerable alteration in the 18th century; however, it retains its original basilical layout of three naves with apses at the eastern ends of the two flanking ones. The naves are separated by vaulted arcades supported on stout columns. There are windows in all the walls and access is through a doorway in the western end; there are traces of a no longer extant porch.

- Santa Maria, Taüll

The village of Taüll, on a medieval route, has two centres, one around the square and the church of Santa Maria, with a number of medieval houses surviving relatively intact, and the other an elongated space along the old route (now a modern road flanked by new buildings) leading to Sant Climent. However, the importance of Taüll lies in its churches, acknowledged to be archetypes of the Vall de Boí Romanesque style.

The parish church of Santa Maria dominates the village. It has three naves, each with a terminal apse. Its construction shows that strict orthogonality was not always respected. The apses are elaborately decorated in Lombard style, with false arcading separated by pilasters and saw-tooth friezes. The main door on the west facade is a plain semicircular arch. The masonry is very carefully dressed and laid. The masonry of the bell-tower, by contrast, is rough and less carefully laid; the tower itself clearly antedates the main church, which is attributable to a major restoration project in the 18th century. Archaeological excavations demonstrated the former existence of a cemetery beneath modern paving immediately outside the church's south wall and have made it possible to define the layout of the original church.

- Sant Climent, Taüll

The church of Sant Climent is located on a slight eminence on the ancient route between Taüll and Boí. It is the largest, best preserved, and most outstanding architecturally of the churches in the Vall de Boí. Moreover, its characteristic Lombard Romanesque architecture and interior decoration make it the symbol of Catalan Romanesque architecture. It is basilican in plan, with three naves, each with a terminal apse. The side naves are separated by arcades of large columns. The doorway opens on the west facade, where vestiges of a porch can be discerned. The only windows that survive are at the east and west ends respectively.

The most imposing feature of Sant Climent is its bell-tower, at the south-east corner of the church. This is square in plan and soars from a simulated solid base to six storeys, each with wide bilobate windows (those on the third level are trilobate). The facades are decorated with vaulted friezes and pilasters.

The masonry of the church and bell-tower is composed of carefully laid granite blocks, with pumice for decorative

elements and the window arches and columns. In places there is evidence remaining of the less meticulous masonry of the earlier church that stood here. The present structure is that of the building consecrated in 1123, replacing a late 11th century church.

- The Church of the Assumption, Coll

The late 12th century church of the Assumption lies outside this small village. It is basically Romanesque, with Gothic and later additions and modifications. It consists of a single nave with an apse. The semi-ruinous Gothic bell-tower is on the south side and four storeys high. Accessed by external steps to first floor level, its shell has preserved unweathered gargoyles on the earlier church, not otherwise present on the existing fabric.

- Santa Maria, Cardet

Cardet is built on a rocky eminence dominating the entrance to the Vall de Boí which is just large enough to accommodate the score of houses that make up the village. The little parish church of Santa Maria lies at the extreme eastern end of the village, on the edge of a steep slope. However, despite its small size, the layout and development of the church are complex. It has a single nave with apse, as at Coll. Uniquely in this valley, a crypt occupies the space beneath the apse created by the need to keep the latter horizontal as the rock falls away. There is a small bell-frame at the west end; the facade contains some interesting elements that span a relatively long period of medieval design. It appears to have been founded in the 11th century, remodelled in the 12th or early 13th century, and then again in the 17th–18th centuries. The interior is untouched, retaining its Baroque and later fittings and furnishings.

- Church of the Nativity, Durro

The buildings of this small village, built on a south-facing mountainside, extend up from the parish church of the Nativitat de la Mare de Déu along the single main street, which is on a medieval route. The church is a substantial structure with a long narrow single nave. However, it has undergone many transformations since the first Romanesque building was erected in the 12th century so that much of its original external appearance is masked or removed; its interior, however, has not been renovated in modern times, retaining Baroque and later features.

- The Hermitage of Sant Quirc, Durro

A winding path leads to the hermitage of Sant Quirc de Durro, on a low peak at an altitude of 1500m. It is a tiny church with a single nave and apse; there is a stone bell-frame on the west facade. There is a roof space accessible only from the outside which probably served as a granary and storeroom. It is very typical of small medieval hermitages in the Pyrenean region. Each village in the Vall de Boí had its own hermitage, characteristically high on one of the tracks leading into the mountains above it. This one has recently been renovated, its roof restored to its original height.

- Santa Eulàlia, Erill la Vall

This is a very small settlement, with four domestic ensembles of characteristic form. The church of Santa Eulàlia has a single long nave with a timber roof, which replaced a former barrel vault, the substantial supports for which are still visible. On the east end the nave terminates in a triple apse,

the centre element of which was replaced at the beginning of the 20th century. Entrance is gained by a doorway in the north wall, protected by a porch. The 12th century bell-tower is on the north side and rises to six storeys. It is interesting to note that the care given to the stonework decreases with each successive storey. It was originally faced with stone which has now disappeared, and so there is no evidence of what decoration may have existed.

As at Santa Maria de Taüll, restoration work has permitted archaeological excavations to take place at Santa Eulàlia, and these have revealed its successive transformations since the first building was erected in the 11th century.

Management and Protection

Legal status

All the churches enjoy full protection under state, regional, and local heritage laws and other provisions. The villages and individual buildings are covered by strict town and country planning provisions, regulating such matters as the siting, height, roof-line, and building materials of new constructions and renovations, which ensures that the settings of the churches are preserved intact. In general, provision seems to be about as all-embracing as possible or desirable.

The relevant statute is the Cultural Heritage Law (No 9/93) of the Generalitat of Catalunya, which protects both historic monuments and ensembles and historic and archaeological areas. Part of the valley, six of the villages (including the defences of Boí but not the village of Taüll), and all the churches are protected in this way. The historic and artistic heritage of the valley has been catalogued: the documentation and record of the architecture and art are excellent.

In addition, provisions are in place not merely to try to prevent bad consequences of tourism but positively to promote "good tourism." The main agreement is the Programme of Tourist Excellence in the Vall de Boí. It is recognized in the nomination that the single most serious threat to the integrity of the valley would be the release of mass visiting, and the intention is to prevent this happening. A document on tourism development strategies states that these must be compatible with the objectives of the protection and conservation of natural and cultural resources.

Management

The Mayor of the Vall de Boí is the all-important local figure in terms of decision-taking, implementation, and monitoring. Both the regional government and the Generalitat of Catalunya, particularly its Department of Culture, also play a direct role in terms of policy generation and implementation, finance, planning, and tourism.

Within the surrounding landscape management of the countryside is on the whole by the local farmers continuing to farm their land in the traditional manner. Planning control is strict outside the villages, in effect prohibiting new development, and land there is not available for sale.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

All the churches have received some conservation attention, but some much more than others. Several were the subject of major programmes of restoration and renovation in the second half of the 20th century, and it is intended that work of modern standard and scope will be carried out on the remainder in what is, in effect, a continuous programme of maintenance. The main works of mural art, and many of the older fittings and furnishings, have been removed for security reasons to the MNAC at Barcelona

Authenticity

There can be no question about the basic authenticity of the churches, the villages or the surrounding landscape. All have, however, experienced recent changes which might, to a greater or lesser extent, be seen as modifying that basic authenticity. However, this is a phenomenon to be observed in all cult buildings that have been in continuous use for spiritual purposes since their construction. None of the interventions, with the exception of the regrettable, but entirely justifiable, removal of much of the art treasures to Barcelona, has been such as to reduce the authenticity of any of the churches to an unacceptable extent.

Conservation of the churches' fabric has extended to removal, renovation, replacement, and new construction. Now, only Santa Maria at Durro to some extent, and otherwise only Santa Maria, Cardet, which are distinctive in several other respects also, provide in their unconserved state a good idea of church development and an interior in late- and post-medieval times.

The rescue of the mural art in the 1920s was a remarkable achievement and it has produced remarkable results, which can be seen at the MNAC, Barcelona. However, that achievement cannot alter the stark facts that the paintings are now out of the context in which they were meant to be seen, and that that context now lacks its crowning glory. While this does not undermine the churches' claim on the world's attention, it could be argued to diminish their authenticity to some extent. In their present location they cannot, of course, be considered for inscription on the World Heritage List.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Vall de Boí on 28 February–4 March 2000. Following discussions between the two Advisory Bodies on the nature of the property (which had been nominated originally as a cultural landscape), it had been agreed that IUCN would not be represented on this mission.

A second ICOMOS expert mission visited the Vall de Boí in October 2000, following the provision of a revised nomination by the State Party.

Qualities

The churches of the Val de Boí as a group represent an especially pure and consistent example of Romanesque art. Moreover, they preserve in their village centres to a remarkable degree the quality of daily life in medieval rural communities. It is crucial to their distinctiveness that each

church is an integral part of a village. Characteristically most of them stand immediately outside the medieval centre (because they were added to an existing village). The spatial and functional relationships between the churches and the villages are at the core of this application.

It is also legitimate to assert that the purity of the way of life in medieval Catalonia as expressed in this group of churches and their villages is of considerable significance in the recognition of Catalan cultural identity. The art of the Pyrenean village churches played a vital role in the movement for the re-establishment of Catalan nationality in the early years of the 20th century.

Comparative analysis

Europe contains many Romanesque churches, and many more important buildings, quite as fine architecturally as those in the Vall de Boí – in neighbouring Provence and Languedoc, for example, as well as in their "homeland," northern Italy. However, the importance of the churches in the Vall de Boí lies in their group value: there is no similar cluster of outstanding churches from the same relatively brief period to be found elsewhere. There is also no group which so graphically illustrates the transmission of a cultural movement across a mountain barrier into a region hitherto dominated by another and much different culture, that of the Arab conquerors of the Iberian peninsula.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The active conservation and promotion of the Vall de Boí is a relatively recent phenomenon. It is very important that there should be absolute respect for the original materials and techniques in all restoration projects relating to the churches, and also to the historic buildings that surround or adjoin them. It is essential therefore that every effort should be made to ensure that training is provided to maintain the knowledge and practice of traditional crafts in the valley.

ICOMOS is conscious of the need to ensure that the Romanesque art from the Vall de Boí churches is conserved and curated in conditions of complete security, as provided in the MNAC, Barcelona. It hopes, however, that the responsible authorities will keep the situation under constant review, in the hope that some of these artistic treasures may one day be restored to their original settings.

Brief description

The steep-sided, narrow Vall de Boí is surrounded by mountains. Each of the villages in the valley contains a Romanesque church, which as a group represent an especially pure and consistent example of Romanesque art.

Recommendation

This property was originally nominated as a cultural landscape. At the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000 further nomination of this nomination was deferred, to enable the State Party to consider the preparation of a revised submission relating only to the architectural significance of the area, as represented by its Romanesque churches. Having studied the revised nomination and evaluated it on site, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

Criterion ii The significant developments in Romanesque art and architecture in the churches of the Vall de Boí testify to profound cultural interchange across medieval Europe, and in particular across the mountain barrier of the Pyrenees.

Criterion iv The churches of the Vall de Boí are an especially pure and consistent example of Romanesque art in a virtually untouched rural setting.

ICOMOS also proposes a slight modification to the name of the property, so as to make it more representative of its exact nature: "The Catalan Romanesque Churches of the Vall de Boí."

ICOMOS, November 2000

Atapuerca (Spain)

No 989

Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Archaeological Site of the Sierra de Atapuerca in the Municipalities of Atapuerca and Ibeas de Juarros (Burgos)
<i>Location</i>	Autonomous Community of Castille and León, Province of Burgos
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	28 July 1999

Justification by State Party

The sequence of archaeopalaontological deposits in the Sierra de Atapuerca consists of a series of sites with a rich and abundant fossil and archaeological record. While they are all cave sites, some were initially exposed by a railway cutting. Nevertheless, the activities recorded in these deposits accurately reflect past ways of life which occurred over a very long period of time in a relatively undisturbed environment, and were preserved in pristine condition until the time of their discovery.

The archaeological sites of the Sierra de Atapuerca are significant testimony to the arts, not only because of the presence of the Palaeolithic drawing in El Portalón in the Cueva Mayor, but principally for the sanctuary in the Galería de Silex, which remained closed from the Bronze Age ($\pm$ 1500 BCE) until 1972, when it was discovered and studied.

Criterion ii

The Sierra de Atapuerca sites provide unique testimony of the origin and evolution both of the existing human civilization and of other cultures that have disappeared. The evolutionary line or lines from the African ancestors of modern humankind are documented in these sites.

Criterion iii

Exceptional examples of diverse and significant periods of human history are to be found in these sites. From the most ancient European settlements, nearly one million years ago, to modern times, the passage of history is recorded here in milestones such as the existence of Neolithic sanctuaries, Bronze Age offerings, and Megalithic structures.

Criterion iv

The sites of the Sierra de Atapuerca constitute an exceptional example of continuous human occupation, due to their special ecosystems and their geographical location.

Criterion v

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a series of *sites*. (It should be noted that this property is also nominated under natural criteria i and ii, and so it should be considered as a *mixed property*.)

History and Description

History

- Pleistocene deposits

The Pleistocene epoch of the Quaternary period is dated to 2.4 million to *c* 10,000 BP (*Note* Early dates resulting from scientific dating techniques are expressed as “years BP” – ie years before the conventional date of 1950 on which all radiocarbon dating is based.) The earliest fossil hominid remains in Europe, from *c* 800,000 BP as established by palaeomagnetic analysis, were found in the *Gran Dolina* site in the Sierra de Atapuerca, one of the *Trinchera del Ferrocarril* group. They are associated with simple stone tools of the Pre-Acheulean (Mode I) type, which is consistent with the dating of the earliest levels of this site.

Also in the *Trinchera del Ferrocarril* group of sites are those known as *Tres Simas*. The oldest human remains from the *Galería* site have been dated to between 200,000 and 400,000 BP, associated with Acheulean (Mode II) stone tools.

Similar dates have been established for human skeletal remains from the *Sima de los Huesos* in the *Cueva Mayor*. The absence of herbivores consumed by humans in this site, where the remains of no fewer than 32 humans have been discovered, suggests that this may have been a mortuary site. If so, it is the earliest yet recorded. The relatively large sample, largely of adolescents and young adults, has permitted a number of important studies to be carried out on the palaeopathology of this population, the growth and development of individuals, and their average size.

- Holocene deposits

The Holocene epoch of the Quaternary period is dated from 10,000 BP to the present day.

The archaeological significance of the *Portalón* of the *Cueva Mayor* was first recognized in 1910, when the representation of a horse's head found at the entrance to the cave was identified as Palaeolithic. Subsequent excavations have established that it was occupied by various human groups over many centuries, mainly at the beginning of the Bronze Age (*c* 3200 BCE) and again during the Roman period and the early Visigothic period.

The *Galería del Silex* contains abundant evidence of human occupation during the Neolithic and Bronze Age. More fifty painted and engraved panels have been recorded, with geometrical motifs, hunting scenes, and anthropomorphic and zoomorphic figures. Excavation has revealed the existence in the cave of what appears to be a sanctuary in which funerary rites took place, with human remains (largely young adults and children) and many ceramic fragments, identified as being related to sacrificial activities. At the far end of the gallery there is evidence that the flint from which the cave takes its name was being exploited.

There is evidence of there having been a similar sanctuary in the *Cueva del Silo*. Human activities have also been recorded at several other sites, such as the *Cueva Peluda*, the *Cueva Ciega*, and *El Mirador*.

Human activity declined in the Sierra de Atapuerca with the creation of permanent settlements in the plains below, especially in the Middle Ages.

Description

The Sierra de Atapuerca is located at the north-eastern corner of the Castilian plateau. Although it is more than 1000m above sea-level, it is now no more than a gently sloping limestone ridge, largely covered with scrub and with some farming. Water erosion over the past five million years has led to the formation of a karst landscape with an elaborate system of caves. The water table became lower as a result of geomorphological processes, making the caves suitable for animals and humans to live in them. The system of terraces formed along the southern margin of the Sierra shows that, during the Middle and Lower Pleistocene, streams flowed close to the entrances of these caves, making them especially suitable for human occupation.

Scientific interest in the caves began in the mid 19th century, concentrating on the *Cueva Mayor*. This is entered from the south, giving access immediately to *El Portalón*. To the east lies the sinuous *Galería del Silex*, extending more than 300m, and to the west the sequence of caves (including the *Sima de los Huesos* – the “Pit of the Bones”) leading over 1km to the *Galería del Silo*, which has its own access.

To the north-west is the group of sites revealed by excavation of a mining railway cutting (from which it takes its name, *La Trinchera del Ferrocarril*), never to be completed. These are in fact caves brought to light by the cutting and so with the appearance of rock shelters. To the north is the *Gran Dolina*, and further southwards are the *Tres Simas*, with the important finds at *La Galería*.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The nominated property was declared a Site of Cultural Interest (*Bien de Interés Cultural*) under the provisions of the Spanish Historic Heritage Law of 1985.

This imposes strict control over the protected area, requiring official authorization for survey and excavation and for transfer of ownership.

Management

Ownership of the lands covered by the nominated property is partly public and partly private. Overall supervision of activities within the prescribed area rests with the national Ministry of Education and Culture, located in Madrid. Much of this is delegated to the Council for Education and Culture, Directorate General of Heritage and Cultural Promotion of Castille and León, based in Valladolid, which in turns involves the municipal administrations of Atapuerca and Ibeas de Juarros in the conservation and protection of the sites.

A Management Plan (*Plan Director*), commissioned by the *Junta* (Government of the Autonomous Community) of Castille and León, was completed in April 1993. This

detailed plan begins with an analysis of the present situation and goes on to take account of the basic aspects of the protection, conservation, investigation, and presentation of the sites. It is not confined to the cultural sites alone, however, but contains a section detailing measures to protect the ecology of the Sierra de Atapuerca. It was prepared because of the lack of planning provisions relating to the sites in the two municipalities.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The first scientific investigations took place as early as 1863, but it was not until the early years of the 20th century that the first archaeological report was published, concentrating on the more recent prehistoric finds in the *Cueva Mayor*.

Excavations took place in *El Portalón* in 1964 and 1971. After the discovery of the *Galería del Silex* by the *Edelweiss* Spelaeological Group in 1972 a great deal of investigation took place in this group of caves during the 1970s and 1980s.

The *Trinchera* sites were discovered by the *Edelweiss* Group in the mid 1950s. The first major excavations took place in the 1970s at *Gran Dolina* and *La Galería*. While these excavations were in progress the rich fossil finds of the *Sima de los Huesos* were discovered, but its physical nature, that of a deep shaft filled with bones, precluded excavations starting in earnest until 1984, continuing until the present day under arduous conditions.

Systematic investigation of the *La Trinchera* sites began in 1978 and has been continuing uninterruptedly to the present. The sites, which are open as a result of the defunct railway cutting, were protected by the addition of roofs in the 1980s.

The only means of access to the Sierra de Atapuerca sites is on foot, using small paths through the thick brush. It has therefore not yet proved necessary to provide any elaborate form of additional protection. However, the *Plan Director* includes proposals and projects relating to the protection and presentation of the property.

Authenticity

The natural caves that form the subject of this nomination contain deep strata containing archaeological and palaeontological material of great scientific importance which have remained untouched since prehistoric times until the present day, when they are being excavated scientifically. Their authenticity may therefore be deemed to be total.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Sierra de Atapuerca in February 2000.

Qualities

The fossil deposits in the karst cave system of the Sierra de Atapuerca contain remains of the earliest known hominids in Europe. Their relative abundance and their association with animal bones make it possible for scientific studies to be carried out on many aspects of these early societies. There is

also evidence of continued human occupation in the caves over nearly one million years.

Comparative analysis

A comparative study of fossil hominid sites was carried out for ICOMOS in 1997. This study identified four periods of human evolution represented in these sites. The second of these covered the period from 1 million to 300,000 years BP. During this period there were only representatives of the genus *Homo*, but with considerable regional diversity, and still confined to parts of the Old World.

The study defined six criteria for the evaluation of fossil hominid sites:

1. *Well dated material* allows the taxonomist to sort out phylogenetic relationships and rates of evolutionary change.
2. The *numbers of fossils* from a single locality or within an identifiable geological unit, if well dated, provide opportunities for scientific analysis and answering questions of population variability, the necessary condition if evolution under natural selection is to occur.
3. The *antiquity of the finds*.
4. The *potential for further finds*.
5. *Groups of closely related sites and even landscapes*, which provide good contexts that preserve environmental and archaeological evidence as well as hominid fossils. This is needed in order to interpret their lifestyles and capabilities.
6. *Role in the discovery and demonstration of human evolution*.

The Sierra de Atapuerca sites perform highly when set against these criteria. The comparative study identified a number of sites with hominid remains that score most highly on these six criteria and which were strongly recommended for consideration. The Sierra de Atapuerca was the only site on this list from the second chronological group described above.

There is already a number of fossil hominid sites on the World Heritage List. However, only those at Sangiran (Indonesia) and Zhoukoudian (China) are noteworthy for fossil hominid remains from this period, and neither is in Europe.

It should also be borne in mind that scientific exploration of the caves in the Sierra de Atapuerca, which is a slow and meticulous process, has only been in progress for a quarter of a century. Much more work remains to be done on the known sites, and others will unquestionably come to light in the decades to come.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

ICOMOS has no reservations about the cultural value of the Atapuerca sites. However, it was concerned that no buffer zone was defined around the proposed site in the original nomination dossier. ICOMOS also recommended that there should be some form of tourism development plan, which imposed controls over development related to tourism in the nearby villages of Atapuerca and Ibeas de Juarros

At the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000 this nomination was *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the definition of a suitable buffer zone and the preparation of a tourism development plan.

In September 2000 the State Party supplied detailed information relating to these two points. The nominated archaeological Site of Cultural Interest (see "Legal status" above) is surrounded on all sides by agricultural areas where no construction is permitted (*Suelos No Urbanizables*) or areas of protected woodland (*Suelos No Urbanizables Forestales*). These give complete protection and constitute an effective buffer zone, which preserves the visual setting of the archaeological sites and is fully in conformity with the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines*.

The State Party also provided extensive information regarding provisions for tourist access and control in the immediate vicinity of the nominated area and in the neighbouring municipalities. All the local planning regulations are drafted so as to avoid undesirable development related to tourism in the municipalities of Atapuerca and Ibeas de Juarros. Work has begun on the coordination of local initiatives, by both municipal and voluntary groups, set against the overall tourism resources of the region, which centre on Burgos.

ICOMOS is satisfied that serious attention is being paid to this aspect of the future management and protection of the nominated archaeological area.

Brief description

The caves of the Sierra de Atapuerca contain a rich fossil record of the earliest human beings in Europe, from nearly one million years ago and extending into the Common Era. They represent an exceptional reserve of data, the scientific study of which provides priceless information about the appearance and the way of life of these remote human ancestors.

Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria iii and v**:

Criterion iii The earliest and most abundant evidence of humankind in Europe is to be found in the caves of the Sierra de Atapuerca.

Criterion v The fossil remains in the Sierra de Atapuerca constitute an exceptional reserve of information about the physical nature and the way of life of the earliest human communities in Europe.

ICOMOS, October 2000