The central sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long – Hanoï

MANAGEMENT PLAN

December 2008

Cooperation program between Hanoi People’s Committee and Ile-de-France Region, developed by Regional Committee for Tourism of Paris Ile-de-France
Cooperation program between Hanoi People’s Committee and Ile-de-France Region, developed by Regional Committee of Tourism of Paris Ile-de-France

The central sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long - Hanoi

MANAGEMENT PLAN

December 2008
# CONTENT

Preface of Vice Chairwoman of Hanoi People’s Committee 3

**I. Introduction**

1.1 What is the World Heritage? 5
1.2 The Socialist Republic of Viet Nam and World Heritage 5
1.3 The significance of the Management plan 6
1.4 Status of the Management plan 8
1.5 Preparation and structure of the Management plan 9
1.5.1 Available researches 9
1.5.2 Structure of the Management plan 11

**II. Description and significance of the site**

2.1 Significance of the site 13
2.1.1 Universal Values 13
2.1.2 Brief presentation on the changes of the Ancient Citadel during 1873-1930 14
2.2 Boundary of the site 15
2.2.1 Buffer zone 17
2.3 Proprietary rights and legal framework 18
2.4 Related Administrative Offices 19

**III. Opportunities, risks, and problems in management**

3.1 Introduction 22
3.2 Opportunities 22
3.3 Risks 25
3.4 Site Management (current status) 26
3.4.1 Organizing structure of the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa vestiges Preservation Center 26
3.4.2 Regulation on Legal Status of the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa vestiges Preservation Center and Financial Mechanism 29
3.4.3 Partners of management 30
3.5 Conservation of Archaeological heritage site 31
3.5.1 The necessary things needed to be done 31
3.5.2 The project of preservation and value development 32
3.5.3 Archaeology 36
3.5.4 Researches about the Heritage Area 38
3.6 Urban landscapes, development project and urban transportation systems 39
3.7 Travel management and sustainable tourism 40
3.8 Immaterial and educated heritages 40
3.9 Risks and natural landscapes 43
3.9.1 Risks 43
3.9.2 Natural landscapes 44

**IV. The future of Thang Long Imperial Citadel Heritage Area and management purposes**

4.1 Introduction 47
4.2 The future of Thang Long Imperial Citadel Heritage Area (vision) 48
4.3 Heritage Management 49
4.3.1 Management partners
4.3.2 Hanoi Ancient Walls, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre
4.3.3 Legal structures of Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre and Financial structures

4.4 Heritage preservation and Archaeological site
4.5 Tourism management and Sustainable Tourism
4.5.1 Introduction
4.5.2 Reception Possibility of the Heritage Area
4.5.3 Evaluation of the number of tourist
4.5.4 Sketch of sightseeing route and conditions of managing the number of tourist
4.5.5 Conditions of tourist management
4.5.6 Ticket cost
4.5.7 Physical conditions and planning works
4.5.8 The measures of visiting support
4.5.9 Value promotion activities
4.5.10 Promotion plan
4.5.11 Disable people reception
4.5.12 Security for the nominated property and the visitors

4.6 These activities aims at local community

V. Implementation and supervision
5.1 Management plan implementation
5.1.1 Introduction
5.1.2 Specific capacity of management agency: Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre
5.1.3 Financial problems

5.2 Action plan and implementation roadmap
5.2.1 1st Phase 2008- 2010
5.2.2 2nd Phase: 2010-2015
5.2.3 3rd phase: 2015 and afterwards

5.3 Supervision and Review the Management Plan

5.4 Administrative mechanism serving for Heritage site supervision
5.4.1 Indicator- main factors for preservation activities
5.4.2 Administrative mechanism to supervise the Heritage Area

VI Appendix
Preface

The Central Sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long – Hanoi has exhibited the values of a national power centre of Vietnam for more than a millennium. This is the cultural property of incomparable importance in Vietnam’s history. For a comprehensive understanding from the public about the values of the property, people who is in charge of the site management are required to increase the effectiveness of the introduction of the Site.

Hanoi People’s Committee has the honour to be entrusted by Vietnamese Government with the responsibilities of conserving and promoting values of the site which can be seen as a property of not only Vietnamese people but the world community also, a nominated property for the inscription in the UNESCO’s World Heritage List. However, we are facing great challenges to implement the Management Plan for the site that locates in centre of a developing city likes Hanoi. We need a flexibility for the Plan, of which we can provide quick response once new vestiges revealed from archaeological excavations. Our Plan is to protect all the historical properties within the area, prevent them from the violations of the one who do not understand or admit the values of the properties. The main problems and the principal solutions to solve them for the present and future as well are also recomended in the Plan.

The goal of the Management Plan is to reach a balance between requirements of conservation and economic development, connecting the Central Sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long – Hanoi to the socio-economic life of the capital. According to the Management Plan, the site of the Imperial Citadel will be organized to meet different requirements of researchers who want to study about historical and architectural values of the site. The Site is also going to become a destination for visitors who want to know about Hanoi of the ancient time.

The Plan shall be implemented by competent organizations, local communities and other partners who want to pay contribution for the site conservation and promotion.

Hanoi, 19 January, 2009

[Signature]

Ngô Thị Thanh Hà
Vice Chairwoman of Hanoi People’s Committee
Deputy Director of National Commission for Celebrating
the 1000th anniversary of Thang Long - Hanoi
I. INTRODUCTION
1.1 What is World Heritage?

Until 25th October, 2006, there are about 183 countries in the world ratify the 1972 Convention. The State parties, which are members of this Convention, committed in World Heritages Preservation for the future generations.

The 1972 Convention stipulates the classification of Natural and Cultural Heritages, which we could register in World Heritage List. The Convention also stipulates obligations of all countries in finding out potential Heritage Sites as well as their roles in preserving and protecting those Heritage sites.

The members are encouraged to bring Cultural and Natural Heritage protection into Area planning program, human resources supplement, and services at the Heritage site, to conduct scientific and technical researches on preservation and implement measures in order to set an important role of heritage site in people’s lives.

The 1972 Convention defines in a general document all concepts about natural protection and cultural properties preservation.

World Heritages List currently comprise of 878 properties constitute Cultural and Natural Heritage, which are considered as an exceptional outstanding universal value by “World Heritage Committee”. In the total of 878 properties in 145 members (in the total of 185 State parties ratifying the Convention), there are about 679 cultural properties, 174 natural properties, 25 mixed properties.

1.2 The socialist republic of Viet Nam and World Heritage

The socialist republic of Viet Nam has ratified World Heritage Convention in 1987 and now there are five World Heritages in which consists two natural Heritages and three Cultural Heritages stating in the World Heritage List.

Viet Nam is the country with long history of heritage protection. After ratifying Convention in 1987, there are many considerable advances in legal framework for this issue.

In particular, the 1993 Constitution clearly stipulates heritage protection and focuses on the essential values of culture to Vietnamese, and “the Law on Heritage” in 2001 was formulated mainly based on the principles of the 1972 Convention and Orientation of World Heritage Centre.
1) **Hue Heritage complex**  
   1993- Cultural Heritage  

2) **Ha Long Bay**  
   1994, 2000- Natural Heritage  

3) **My Son Holy Land**  
   1999- Cultural Heritage  

4) **Ancient Hoi An**  
   1999- Cultural Heritage  

5) **Phong Nha –Ke Bang National Park**  
   2003 – Natural Heritage  

Fig 1: Viet Nam map with World Heritage Sites. © UNESCO, 2006.

The Law on Heritage in 2001 covers all ways of heritage classification, controls archaeological excavations and trades or exchanges artistic works, stipulates preservation activities, protection, and embellishment. The law also supports monitoring and evaluation tasks and listing valuable Heritage areas of every level, from local, regional, national to global, as well as to stipulate the boundary of heritage areas and buffer zones. Besides, the Law also helps to respond to the challenges of tourism development.

1.3 **Significance of management plan**

Paragraph 97 of the Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention 2005 affirms, “All properties inscribed on the World Heritage List must have adequate long-term legislative, regulatory, institutional and/or traditional protection and management to ensure their safeguarding.”

The orientations is also repeated in the paragraph 108 “Each nominated property should have an appropriate management plan or other documented management system which should specify how the outstanding universal value of a property should be preserved, preferably through participatory means”
Those prerequisite conditions should be reflected in all nomination dossiers.

*The orientations* also show the general index about protection and management. As said above in the paragraph 96 “*protection and management World Heritage properties should ensure that the outstanding universal value, the conditions of integrity and/or authenticity at the time of inscription are maintained or enhanced in the future*”

The Government of Viet Nam encourages and supports the preparation of the management plan of the Heritage sites, which are inscribed in World Heritage List and all new nomination dossiers as well.

Besides, it is necessary to formulate a management plan that not only derives from the international requirements, but also from analyses current situation of the Heritage site and surrounding areas. In fact, this nominated Heritage site locates in the center of a big city with rapid development process. To achieve these goals stipulated by the Convention 1972, it is very important to ensure a clear regulatory frame and an effective regulation that can regulate and manage development of the Heritage site in the long run. Management plan becomes the spine of this program.

One of the most obvious impacts of the inscription one Heritage site in World Heritage list is that it is best way to affect on people’s awareness on the Heritage site and its outstanding value, and in consequence, tourism activities in the Heritage will be developed and promoted.

Planning and organizing of the development in conformation with *the principles of sustainable tourism* constitutes key elements of the management plan, that allows the protection of the fragile site and at the same time manage and exploit tourism as a source of income for the site and the local economy.

In the recent decades, heritage management has been appropriately reflected. Consequently, a management system will not only stop at a preservation plan. Particularly, with cultural heritage site, it is not only a restoration project of architect of the present, the past or the future; it is not only a project to manage the number of visitors, a strategy to attract tourists, or a business plan. All these main elements are only the single part of a management plan¹.

¹ See the 16th meeting of the committee of members about 1972 Convention relating to protecting Cultural and Natural Heritage. UNESCO main building on 24-25/10/2007, 14 and 15(online document on Internet: http://whc.unesco.org/archive/2007/whc07-16ga-12f.pdf )
1.4 Status of the management plan

Through adoption of this management plan, Vietnamese leaders have shown the determination to preserve Thang Long Imperial Citadel Heritage Area as a birthplace of Viet Nam and Hanoi Capital. They also have intention to propose the management plan become a plan to develop tourism and culture in the coming years.

Management plan consists strategic measures and orientations for Heritage preservation and urban management in the nominated area. Those strategies and orientations need to be considered thoroughly by all related people such as leaders (Hanoi People’s Committee, Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Ministry of Defense), local communities and private sector. The objective of the management plan aims to identify a program and regulatory frame that meet the demand of UNESCO in inscription of the Thang Long Imperial Citadel to the World Heritage List.

This management plan is approved by the Prime Minister and The Chairman of the Ha Noi People’s Community in order to ensure financial and policy support at the highest level and simultaneously stipulates related partners in this project.

The management plan is approved in accordance with the Law on Heritage adopted nation wide.

The management plan brings about strategic objectives for Thang Long -Ha Noi Imperial Citadel. These targets have been implemented according to criteria approved by the related Ministries and Hanoi People’s Community. The concrete measures should be conducted in very specific steps in order to achieve strategic goals in a continuous roadmap. The monitoring and evaluation system of the impact of continuous activities allow the identification of problems and conduct the necessary measures.

This Management plan bases on the concept “Sustainable development” which can easily defined “the development that meets the needs of present while ensuring future generations' ability to do the same”. This management plan also bases on Budapest Declaration on the World Heritage, in which there are three following statements:

“In view of the increasing challenges to our shared heritage, we will:

2 Dated 28th June 2002, referred to: http://whc.unesco.org/fr/decisions/1217
c. **seek to ensure** an appropriate and equitable balance between conservation, sustainability and development, so that World Heritage properties can be protected through appropriate activities contributing to the social and economic development and the quality of life of our communities;

d. **join to co-operate** in the protection of heritage, recognizing that to harm such heritage is to harm, at the same time, the human spirit and the world's inheritance;

e. **promote** World Heritage through communication, education, research, training and public awareness strategies;

f. **seek to ensure** the active involvement of our local communities at all levels in the identification, protection and management of our World Heritage properties”.

### 1.5 Preparation and the structure of the Management Plan

Management Plan is developed suitable with the orientations introduced in “*Management Guide of World Heritage Cultural Sites*” written by Bernard M. Feild and Jukka Jokilehto (expert of ICCROM, UNESCO, ICOMOS) published in 1993. Besides, this plan also bases on other documents, especially “Nara Declaration about the authenticity” in 1994.

#### 1.5.1 Existing studies

Since the exposure of the Thang Long-Ha Noi Imperial Citadel Heritage site in 2002, a lot of researches and projects have been conducted to analyze, identify and protect archaeological remains.

At present, there is a concrete planning of the Ba Dinh political center (where most important offices of the countries and Thang Long-Ha Noi Imperial Citadel Heritage locates). The orientations to guide the development of the capital city is also stated in the Master plan of Ha Noi (this plan is in the review and amendment process) in which the anticipation for building an administrative and economic centre in the north of the Red River.

The related plans and regulations will introduce as following:

- The Master plan of Ha Noi City;
- Construction scheme of Hanoi Capital until 2020 and vision to 2050;
- Detailed Plan of Ba Dinh District (scale: 1/2000);
- Decision No. 543/QD-TTg dated 8/7/2002 of the Prime Minister on the approval of detail plan the Ba Dinh political center;
- Ha Noi tourism development plan;
- Decision 3806/QD-UBND dated September 29, 2007 by Hanoi People’s Committee on the approval of the draft detailed Planning for the conservation, restoration and development of Hanoi Ancient Citadel Relic site;
- Decision 370 QD/TTg, dated 16 April 2004 by the Prime Minister amending the above Decision 543/QD-TTg on the approval of the Detailed Planning for Ba Dinh Political Centre, Hanoi

After exposure of the archaeological Heritage, Vietnamese leaders decided to protect Thang Long Imperial Citadel first and protect it out of the new urban development. Many international conferences had been organized in collaboration with UNESCO and on-going studies have been carrying out with foreign partners in order to supplement and complete strategies as well as technical measures for preservation of the heritage site, in which many measures have been implemented (roofing for excavated holes and protecting archaeological artifacts).

Inscription of Thang Long - Ha Noi Citadel into the World Heritage List is one part of the comprehensive strategy to preserve and promote the value of the city and the Heritage site as a coming place of tourists.

Vietnamese leaders start to prepare for the great 1000-year anniversary of Thang Long-Hanoi (1010-2010) in 2010. Archaeological remains of Thang long Ancient Citadel, the first capital of an independent country in 1010 which used to be the citadel and rampart ruled by China. This also the first place where Vietnamese identity took shape, therefore it owns a symbolic value to Viet Nam.

The management plan presents in the following pages is prepared by the Ha Noi People’s Committee from January to September 2008, and is an integral part of the Nomination Profile to the World Heritage List. This plan constitutes all existing studies and reports and at the same time integrates regulations of other plans which are now under elaboration process.
1.5.2 Structure of the management plan

Chapter 2: Introduction

This chapter introduces the nature, purposes, and the structures of the management plan.

Chapter 3: Description of Heritage Area

This chapter briefly describes the Heritage site, location, area and features. This chapter also introduces the current management system and land-using situation in the Heritage site.

Chapter 4: Opportunities, risks and management issues

This chapter analyzes plan that focuses on affirming and introducing chances, risks, and questions relating to the Heritage and surrounding areas. Managing consists of many topics from preservation to the character of the Heritage Area, from socio-development to culture.

Chapter 5: The future of the inscribed World Heritage site and the objective of the management plan

This is the “core” part of the Management plan. This chapter will introduce general overview of the Heritage site and a set of purposes for management activities. These factors will guide sustainable development at the heritage site and surrounding areas, in which all opportunities, risks, and management problems are raised.

Chapter 6: Implementation and monitoring

This chapter refers to measures to carry out management plan. It also introduces activities to face the risks mentioned in the proceeding parts and to make use of opportunities for sustainable development in the heritage site. This chapter also introduces monitoring measures that allow the verification of the impacts of changes and successfulness of the implementation of the management plan.
II. DESCRIPTION AND SIGNIFICANCES OF THE HERITAGE
2.1  The significance of the site

2.1.1  Universal values

The value and the significance of the site is described in the nomination profile. The basic principles of nominated file inscribing in the World Heritage List is repeated as follow:

*Thang Long-Hanoi Citadel is of outstanding universal value for its exemplary exhibition of the interchange of human values over more than a millennium in the development of Asian architecture, construction technology, town planning, monumental and plastic arts and landscape design.*

As the power centre of the Red River region and eventually of Vietnam as a whole for a thousand years, the site bears exceptional testimony to the development of the civilization of Vietnam and to the process of state formation in Southeast Asia.

The continual evolution of the Thang Long-Hanoi Citadel on the same site over more than a millennium provides an exceptional testimony to the evolution of imperial city design under the influence of diverse religious and political philosophies from many cultures.

Chinese dominance of the Red River delta until the 11th century provided an important, underlying cultural influence that has persisted ever since. The city’s proximity to the coast brought it into contact with other cultures, often from far away, including Japan, while trade routes through China brought contact with the Middle East. Through all of these contacts, Taoism, Buddhism, Confucianism, colonialism and socialism all influenced the architecture, town planning and artistic expressions of Thang Long-Hanoi Citadel. The exceptional nature of Thang Long-Hanoi lies in the way diverse cultural expressions and evidence of human interaction were adapted and melded to produce a unique culture manifested in distinctive monumental arts, architecture, city design and other cultural expressions.

The proposed World Heritage site reveals a continuous pattern of evolution of architecture and urban planning, a layering of styles and influences that provides an exceptional record of imperial city design.

Thang Long-Hanoi provides exceptional testimony to the evolution of a major Southeast Asian civilization.

Architectural elements, such as roof tiles and decorations, reflect world-historical trends such as the influence of Buddhism on the development of Southeast Asian concepts of kingship. The importance of Confucianism in the development of the
Vietnamese state – its role in the consolidation of territorial administration, the evolution of law, and social organization – is reflected in the morphology of the citadel and in found objects and architectural remains, particularly the hierarchical nature of the citadel’s space and the large number of objects associated with Imperial power, in particular dragons in various forms.

Over more than one thousand years, a major Asian civilization was constructed and refined at Thang Long-Hanoi. Its universal significance derives from the fact that its continuity over such a long period of time allows unprecedented understanding of developments in architecture, town planning, and artistic expressions in an area where North and Southeast Asia meet. This continuity also facilitates exceptional understanding of the process of development of this major Asian civilization, in its cultural and world-historical context. The physical evidence available in the archaeological record and extant archaeological and town planning features provides a uniquely rich and impressive testimony to cultural, social, political, religious, philosophical and economic developments of universal significance.

2.1.2 Brief introduction the changes of the Ancient Citadel during 1873-1930

Before finding out the Thang Long Imperial Citadel in 2003, the obvious trace of the multi-layered Citadel is the citadel constructed under Gia Long King period in 1805. Nowadays, the influences to urban structures are still visible in satellite photos.

The changes of the heritage site in the second half of the 19th century can be clearly seen through comparing Ha Noi maps from 1873 to 19303.

Hanoi in 1873: the city located in the southern belt, a wide dyke surrounding countryside areas with lots of villages and buildings surrounded by walls. In this belt, two poles of the city were distinguished clearly by organization and structure. The special general structure of the site together with the foundation angles of fortifications and square lines in the map separate out of the dense structure of trading Quarter. This Quarter expanded from the east of the Citadel to the River.

The Ancient Citadel played an important role in politic life of Ha Noi, a historical and symbolic place of a city. The Ancient Citadel was both the heritage site in 11th century and the power place of the imperial kingdom in the northern area from 13th to 18th century.

The Ancient Citadel locates in a broad context with many symbolic elements; and where cosmology plays an essential role. Inside the fortification network, a sacred relation that links natural spaces with belts or hierarchy of temples or administrative buildings or military buildings.

Hanoi in 1885: the Ancient Citadel- the place was attacked and occupied by the troops of Riviere Commander – was used for military since then. Artillery Steering Committee occupied the Palace of the King in the past, hospital located in the food stores; the temples were destroyed, lakes were filled up to build billets. The affirmation of the French military, both physical and symbolic, meant that the representation of royal family lost and the annihilation of local heritage that was unavoidable (…). There existed parts of the walls, which were repaired by French soldiers as requested by Gia Long King, manifest the “vauban style” features.

The comparison with classic fortifications models of the Court manifest the impact on historical landscapes of the Ancient Citadel. However, the Confucian scholars and geomancy experts objected to the new walls with western styles. On the other hand, with such height, the natural flows would be confused; consequently, the city wall was fallen down in 1835.

Ha Noi in 1902: the City walls were destroyed in 1894. The fortifications disappeared, as wishes of City’s Council, changed completely the balance of the inside part of the last heritage site. The area of the Ancient Citadel was divided into 2 parts: Eastern part was for military works, and Western part was divided into many blocks surrounded by new streets. All the streets converged to Governor Palace and toward Botanic Garden (...), just a few heritages left to represent for the Ancient Citadel.

Hanoi in 1929: the project for building new streets covered half of western of the Ancient and expanded the southern Railway station and to Truc Bach Lake according to the big streets in the Master plan map developed by Ernest Hebrard in 1924.

### 2.2 Boundary of heritage site

The identification of the boundary of the nominated property and the buffer zone is the result of a long discussion relating to the outstanding universal value of the site. Thanks to the activities funded by World Heritage Center, a strategy to emphasize the importance of the Heritage Area as a role of “a power center” in a long time (1000 years from 11th century to 20th century) has been established.
This choice has led to the foundation of the formation of the boundaries of the nominated property and the buffer zone that can represent for the continuous presence of the power system in the city.

On the other hand, this requires limiting the boundary of Imperial Citadel and not being expanded to other historic city areas of Hanoi. The relics considered to mark the outskirts of suffer zone are shown in the following map.

Fig 2: World Heritage site location map

Thang Long-Hanoi Citadel Heritage site is constituted by different parts lying on the two sides of Hoang Dieu Street. The first area locates next to the National Assembly Building, which is now being constructed. This is a big archaeological area in which one part is excavated and surrounded by a protecting fence. The second part consists of the centre of 19th Ha Noi Ancient Citadel constructed basing on the models of European Ancient Citadels. This 1km long and 250m wide section which can be seen as a complex of historical properties, is divided into 3 parts: the central zone (the most important place with many vestiges remained from remote history from 11th century to 20th century), the Northern part is still under the management of Military and will be handed over to Ha Noi city in April, 2009, finally the Southern Part where exists the Military Museum and Military Sport Complex Area.
2.2.1 Buffer Zone

The identification of the buffer zone around the Heritage site is strongly recommended by UNESCO, especially to protect the views (both by 2 directions from inside and from outside) of the Heritage Area. UNESCO considers buffer zone creation is the most suitable way to identify, protect, and promote the value of the Heritage as well as surrounding areas.

The boundary of Thang Long Heritage is identified to ensure that the development in this area will be closely controlled and respect the value of the Heritage site. This boundary is approved after consultations with authorities relating to the project during the preparatory period for Nomination profile and the management plan.
The recommended area for the buffer zone of the Thang Long-Hanoi Citadel is very coherent and forming a boundary around the nominated property, except the eastern part, which is under strong protection of the Ministry of Defense. The boundary consists of the main overview, relation between the city centre and the rest of it and especially it refers to historic aspects of the Heritage area.

Buffer zone locates in Ba Dinh area, where gather all highest power offices of the Government of Viet Nam. These offices are subject to very detailed construction plan and special management system. Ba Dinh is the political, diplomatic and cultural centre of the country, comprising the Presidential Palace, National Assembly Building, Government Office, Headquarter of the Communist Party, Ministry of Foreign Affairs as well as many Embassies. This is also the place of cultural tourism centre of Vietnam, including Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum, Ho Chi Minh Museum, One Pillar Pagoda, Uncle Ho’s house and Botanic Garden.

The identification of the boundary has taken into consideration the analysis of the Heritage site within urban context. That approach not only considers the overview of the Heritage area from inside to out side but also the significance of the site itself, particularly the historical meaning to the rest of the city. With the case of Thang Long Imperial Citadel, the overview is not a problem because there is no impact from the height of the existing buildings to the archaeological site. The only landmark affects to the vision is Flag Tower (33m high), Bac Mon gate and the nearby main street built on the foundation of the once city walls.

The nominated area consists of all valuable elements. However, within the managerial framework of the heritage site, it is necessary to consider the possibilities of change inside the site and surrounding area or results of new researches, which may lead to the change of the boundary. Periodical monitoring of the property will help to identify the issues and recommend potential changes for the site.

In order to manage effectively the site, all related agencies need to acknowledge and approve the proposed boundary. To facilitate this process, managing entity will explain clearly the boundary of the nominated property and the buffer zone in all aspects.

2.3 Proprietary rights and legal framework

Vietnamese Land Law stipulates that the land belongs to every people and the state is the representative. The State give land use right to the users through land tenure,
land renting and recognize the land use right of the stable land users; stipulates rights and obligations of the land users.

The government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam is the legal owner of the Heritage area which is now under the management of different agencies such as Ministry of Construction, Ministry of Defense, Hanoi People’s committee, etc.

From April 2009, the land use right of the nominated property (core zone) will be handed to Hanoi People’s Committee and Hanoi People’s Committee will then assign to Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre to manage.

In the area controlled by Ministry of Defense and nearby areas, the population density is quite high, up to millions of people. On the contrary, there are only 23 households in the nominated property. These people will be relocated in the near future.

Viet Nam Law protects relics in the nominated property which are listed in the national Heritage List recently (Decision No. 28/2007/QD-BVH-TT-DL dated on 16th December, 2007, in the process of preparation of the Nomination Profile for inscription to the World Heritage List).

This Decision is the continuation of those preceding Decisions. Since 1925, under the French domination, 8 relics of the ancient Citadel were recognized. In 1989, Ministry of Culture and Information recognized Flag Tower the national historical and cultural relic (Decision No.100/VH-QD on 21st January, 1989). In 1994, Ministry of Culture and Information recognized Hanoi Ancient Citadel as an historical, architectural and artistic heritage (particularly Doan Mon Gate, Hau Lau Pavilion, Bac Mon Gate in the Decision No. 22/1999/Q/g264-BVHTT dated on April 6th, 1999)

The Heritage Area is protected by Vietnam Law, especially the adoption of the Law on Heritage Law approved by the National Assembly in the 9th meeting on 29th June, 2001.

2.4. Related management agencies

Currently, the nominated property is still under the management of different agencies.

The Agreement between Hanoi Government and related partners has achieved a common consensus in which the handover of the property will be conducted in April 2009.
For the time being, the heritage site is under the management of the following agencies:

- Ministry of Construction
- Ministry of Defense
- Military History Museum
- Viet Nam Academy of Social Sciences
- Communist Party of Viet Nam
- Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism
- Hanoi Ancient Wall - Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre
III. OPPORTUNITIES, RISKS, AND MANAGEMENT ISSUES
3.1 Introduction

The Thang Long Imperial Citadel Heritage area does not situate in a stable environment. On the contrary, the heritage area constitutes of archaeological relics and architectural structures lying in the centre of a large capital city in Asia with high-speed development. With those features, Hanoi on the one hand, has big opportunities but on the other hand face with challenges in preservation of the site within the context of urban expansion.

The following sections present the opportunities and the risks of the heritage area. Each part will be introduced separately although there may some overlap in term of contents.

3.2 Opportunities

The survive of Thang Long Imperial Citadel today is greatly thanks to its political and military role which makes the area located separately with the rest of the city. Within this heritage area, there previously were building structures of the country’s political organizations as well as those of the Ministry of National Defense (MOD).

Therefore, this urban area is not affected by new constructions or demolishment of the buildings, which is the common trend of urban cities in Asia.

Plans approved by Vietnamese leaders for this area all acknowledge and highlight the historical and symbolic value of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long-Hanoi. Those plans bring about great opportunities to Hanoi in integrating political determination and urban development projects to promote the value of the site and development strategy for sustainable cultural tourism, which bring benefit to the citizen of Hanoi.

Based on those advantages in term of history for the on-going development plans, there is an essential task for the management plan is to be able to anticipate preservation, reuse and promotion of the value of archaeological relics and historical site, both inside and outside the heritage area in a way that the heritage conservation works can be done to contribute to the development of the city.

The two aspects of preservation and development can be interlinked in order to integrate the historical site to the overall structure of the city regarding both functional and economic roles.

In addition to the nomination of this Heritage area to the World Heritage List, the city also develop several plans for preservation and promotion of the value of other heritage areas with a view to promote heritage resources for the sustainable
development of the city. Those projects are for the old quarter « 36 streets » and the area of « Temper of Literature – First National University ».

« 36 streets » is a planning project initiated in 1995, including the preservation, embellishment and development of the streets area. Research on the area has been implemented within the framework of an international cooperation project for preparation of a preservation plan to restore and develop the area as a tourism and economic development resource.

The Temple of Literature, one of the most important historical vestiges of Hanoi, attracting almost 1 million visitors per year, has been supported by several projects for preservation and restoration of the buildings and construction works.

Apart from such heritage preservation projects, Hanoi People’s Committee and the Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism have shown their commitment on preservation and promotion the value of the Thang Long Imperial Citadel.

In that spirit, several local organizations also participate in the project, like the Thang Long- Hanoi Cultural Heritage and the Trade Village Associations. Such organizations have made contribution to draw the people’s attention to the heritage area as well as its history. Especially, the Department of Education and Training has usually organized visits for school-pupils to the heritage area and published brochures on the significance and historical values of this area for Vietnamese pupils and students.

The development of the city centre in the role of an important heritage area has brought about great opportunity to the city, especially when the Imperial Citadel stays intact out of the continuous urban changes in the last centuries.

The decision of Vietnamese leaders of not carrying out new construction at the heritage area and promote it into an important relic site for the Vietnamese people in general and the people in Hanoi in particular, as well as for the increasing number of foreign visitors to Vietnam is of great significance and long-term effect to the urbanization of the capital city.

The Imperial Citadel a place of powerful organizations and some historical relics receiving the largest amount of visitors in the country (Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum and Ho Chi Minh Museum) is considered the most important tourism centre in the future.

Besides, the management role of the site that Hanoi Government taken over from the Ministry of Defense also enable Hanoi people to enjoy large areas of green trees and many relics right in the centre of the city.
Additionally, the large number of relics in this Heritage area also allows us to re-study the country’s history and to transfer to the future generations a rich and diversified history, which covers different periods of civilization and the successive traditions here. It would be impossible to keep the Vietnamese identity from the establishment of an independent feudal government in the 11th century to the anti-American war unless we admit the different effects that constitute the current Vietnamese cultural foundation. That is why we can easily identify in the Heritage area the relics of Chinese citadels before the Thang Long time as well as of French colonial and military architecture in the late 19th century and early 20th century.

Thang Long Heritage area characterized by its complexity and vulnerability may also be an important place in the region as well as in the world for studies on issues related to archaeological investigation of urban area in tropical region, preservation methods, dissemination, sustainable management and tourist management.
3.3 Risks

In a complicated site like Thang Long Imperial Citadel, it is obvious that the site has to face with several problems, some of which are the threats to its future integrity. In a certain aspect, even the chances defined in the previous section can also be the risks for the area.

In general, some of the potential risks are as follow:

- The fast development of Vietnam tourism in general and of Hanoi tourism in particular gives us the vision of a great pressure on tourism of Thang Long Imperial Citadel as well as unbeneficial impacts on the preservation of the relics. Moreover, the threat becomes bigger when the Heritage place is located in the area which attracts the largest number of tourists to the city, right next to Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum and Ho Chi Minh Museum (1.2 million visitors in year 2007) and Temple of Literature (0.96 million of participations in year 2007);

- Development projects for new urban areas that contradict with urban preservation principles which are the basis for nomination process;

- Real estate pressure on the area surrounding the heritage area, especially the vulnerable ones which are now under the management of Ministry of Defense, and it needs the sufficient attention from functional bodies so that potential changes to the area are pro-actively managed;

- Conditions of climate and hydrology which are inherently big challenges for archaeological sites which threat the archaeological site preservation of the site in the recent years;

- Tourism promotion projects with tedious and low quality that can undermine the unique features of the heritage area;

- Lack of maintenance system to ensure good conditions of the heritage areas and to call for the indispensable preservation activities;

- Demand for a long-term budget scheme.

However, these risks should be considered as the challenges for management plan to find out and propose the solutions.
3.4 Heritage site Management (current situation)

As mentioned in the part 2 of the Management Plan, the management of the heritage area is currently managed by 10 different organizations for different purposes and needs.

The management of the centre area of « core zone » is assigned by the People’s Committee of Hanoi to the Hanoi Ancient Walls, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation.

In the nominated property, 23 households are living. In the buffer zone area where there exist man headquarters of state agencies, embassies and a hundred of people. With those areas next to the heritage site that are now under the management of the Ministry of Defense, except the buildings for offices, there are also a thousand of people living.

So far, right before the submission of the nomination profile, the related parties have not yet reached an agreement that the heritage area should be considered as a unified site and need to have a comprehensive management plan.

In order to reach a single and rational management system for the heritage area, it needs to answer for the following issues:

- Introduction of the roles and tasks of the Management Plan;
- Integration of the Management plan in the decision making process
- Future role of the Project’s Steering Board;
- The participation of local community in management process;

The local community should be considered as an integral part of the management of the heritage area. Active participation of local residents would provide them with better knowledge on the Heritage area and ensure the monitoring and effective implementation of preservation programs. The risk that the Hanoi people do not understand the value and significance of world heritage should be avoided. The heritage area should certainly be the pride of the country and the city and should play an important part in improving the people’s attitudes and emotions toward the valuable heritage of Hanoi City.

3.4.1 Organizing structure of the Hanoi Ancient Wall - Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center

The below organizing figure is used for routine management of the property and also can be found in the National Dossier. The structure includes seven main divisions and a series of sub-divisions.
The Center was established to meet requirements of preparing Nomination Dossier according to the Decision No 3855Q-UBND of Hanoi People’s Committee dated on 1st September 2006 (see 2.4.3).

The Center has around 100 staffs under directorship of Mr. Nguyen Van Son. The Center enjoys the budget directly from Hanoi People’s Committee.

The Center has experience from preserving Co Loa vestiges. Many of 99 staffs of the Center, including ones who work in Co Loa, have been trained for managing vestiges which are archaeological sites or architectural works. However, archaeological activities in Ba Dinh area have been taken place by a task force of around 50 workers (August 2008) from the Institute of Archaeology (under the directorship of Prof. Tong Trung Tin). The task force, of which Mr. Bui Minh Tri is the leader, can ask for more workers according to requirements of archaeological activities. All the task force members are paid by the Government.
December 2008
3.4.2 Regulation on Legal Status of the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center and Financial Mechanism

A. *Regulation on Legal Status of the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center*

The Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center is an administrative unit with low financial income. According to the Decree 43 dated on 25 April 2006, there are three kinds of administrative units having financial income. The units belong to category 1 having financial income that enough to pay for their regular operation, for ones belong to category 2 the income enough to partially pay, and the units of category 3 (like the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center) having income that not enough to cover 10% of their operation budget.

B. *Financial Mechanism*

**Investment:**

The Government has approved to distribute $6.3 million for conservation and promotion of the site until 2008, and is going to pay additional $3 million for the period 2008 – 2010.

Hanoi People’s Committee has plans distributing capital for 33 projects directly related to conserving and promoting the values of the site, mobilizing local communities to take part in the projects as follows:

- Drawing a detailed plan of the site in scale of 1/500
- Collecting and comparing documents related to the site
- Implementing conservation programs in many sections of the sites (belong to Ancient Citadel and Archaeological Site)
- Setting up a website
- Building a mock-up of the site
- Collecting metrological data
- Implementing programs of reference and cooperation with local inhabitant.

Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center is responsible for removing unvalued buildings in nominated area of the site.

UNESCO’s World Heritage Center provided an assistance of $29,700 within the frame work of International Assistance Project.

Japanese Government provided assistance of $78,488.
Regional Committee for Tourism of Ile-de-France, Paris has provided technical assistance for building Management Plan.

$1 million from UNESCO - Japan Trust Fund is going to be distributed for protecting and conserving the vestiges of the site.

Vietnamese Government, local government, ministries and related organizations are raising campaigns for donation for domestic and international sponsors

**Operation:**

Many organizations are contributing for operation budget of the Site. The scheduled archaeological excavation and protective archaeological excavation (carried out at the position of new National Assembly Building before the construction) are paid by the Government. Other activities of the Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center and salary paid for freelance workers are covered by money distributed by Government and Hanoi People’s Committee (about $15,000 - $18,000 per month for 86 people).

Within its competence, the Center is able to increase the income by charging visiting fee or providing other services (guiding, organizing events, exhibition – *See Chapter 5.1.3*)

Basing on the results in future, a modification for the Financial Mechanism should be taken into account, of which the income of the Center can be as high as enough to cover more than 10% of operation budget. (See below: visiting fee strategy and planned income).

### 3.4.3 Partners of management:

The Site has been managing by many administrative and scientific units as follows:

- Hanoi People’s Committee and its functional Departments (International Affairs, Heritages, Culture, Tourism…)
- Ministry of Culture, Sport and Tourism
- Ministry of Construction
- Ministry of Defense
- Military History Museum
- Vietnam Academy of Social Science
- Vietnamese Communist Party
- The Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center
Hanoi People’s Committee and relevant organizations are in charge of managing the Site, of which Vietnam Academy of Social Science consults scientific matters and Hanoi Ancient Wall-Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center implements technical management on administrative and finance. A steering committee including various partners is planed to be established for orienting and observing the management of the Site, especially the matters relating to power transference of the northern and southern of Hanoi Ancient Citadel, one of the most urgent tasks.

After finishing excavation process, organizing structure might be refine. In the part 4.3, we suggest a proposed organizing structure that can be able to meet long-term requirements.

3.5 Heritage and Archaeological preservation

3.5.1 Archaeological Excavation Site

Excavated holes in the archaeological site are on the soil levels from 1 to 4 meter deep from the ground.

Archeological artifacts such as terra-cotta, wood, stone, coins, etc. have been collected and put in the storage place after being processed with preventive preservation. In the long run, all these artifacts should be collected and partly exhibited in a museum constructed right in the place of the excavation site. The museum will secure good conditions for displaying and managing the items.

The architectural relics are expected to be preserved in place for an “archeological park”. The area is suffering from unfavorable impacts of the weather on the preservation process. Most of the relics are constituted from vulnerable or organically originated materials which are very sensitive to changes in the humidity.

Major factors of the environment that cause harm to the archaeological site include:

1. **Humidity:** Humidity is monitored on-site by electronic appliances the presence of water and light make good conditions for the fungus and algae to growth, which represent substantial threats to artifacts. In general, current measures to reduce the humidity are quite efficient.

2. **Water:** There are two sources of potential water damage-rain and subterranean infiltration. Current covering roof can control of effects of heavy rains, which are very popular in Vietnam. The underground water, on the other hand, is controlled by a pumping system.
3. **Light**: Exposure to sunlight encourages figure synthesis and the growth of plant on the archaeological relics. A roof has been installed to help control the exposure to sunlight.

4. **Wind**: Wind speed is monitored on site by electronic appliance. The circulation of air by wind can help in reducing humidity and preventing moss and fungus growth, but high winds can also cause damage, especially through the circulation of wind-borne abrasives.

A number of primary preservative measures are being applied by functional bodies:

- 2005: construction of plastic roof to protect excavated holes.
- 2005: construction of a drainage system for rain water in sections A, B and C.
- 2005: installation of an underground water controlling system to ensure suitable water level for the preservation of the Heritage area and control of the development of fungus and moss.
- Pilot project on preservation and sand re-filling of the A5 trench together with indication of positions of the pillars’ foundation.

These measures allow the next excavation steps in the program to be carried out in acceptable working and preservation conditions.

In the long run, it is necessary to have alternative measures for the exhibition and preservation of this area.

### 3.5.2 Imperial Citadel Central Area

The most important relics in this area include:

- Relics from the Le dynasty, especially the stone dragon steps;
- Structures from the Nguyen dynasty during the reconstruction of the Imperial Citadel in early 19\(^{th}\) century (especially the gates and Hau Lau pavilion);
- Military constructions during the French colony (late 19\(^{th}\) and early 20\(^{th}\) century);
- Relics from the Revolution period (D67 house and bunkers)
Relics in the Imperial Citadel centre are mostly constructed from refined bricks with some wooden, iron or stone parts.

Most destruction comes from heavy rains and the lack of preservation of house roofs and drainage system for rain water. Other sources of serious damage are originated from green trees and fungus growing inside and outside the relics (see Appendix B for additional information – Report on preservation and promotion of the values of the RC centre of Thang Long – Hanoi RC Heritage).

In general, the later constructed sites (the French and Post-colonial time) in the RC centre of the RC Heritage are in good conditions, not posing excessive problems. Similarly, entrance gates and windows are also well preserved in the unfavorable weather conditions in the area.

In most of the cases, the preservation of the RC centre can be dealt with by strengthening the maintenance rather than actual restoration.
In recent years, several preservation and restoration projects in the RC Heritage have been carried out by functional bodies. The major stages of preservation from year 1998 include:

- Doan Mon preservation project and restoration of the paths in the campus (1999);
- Installation of steel and glass lean-to system on the excavation holes at Doan Mon (2002);
- Restoration of Harem Palace and planning projects for the campus (2002);
- Restoration project of Bac Mon and the campus (2003);
- Preservation project of excavation points in Doan Mon (2006): removing algae, construction of water drainage and treatment system (in cooperation with the National Preservation Institute);
- Plan for resettlement of current households in the Imperial Citadel centre (2008, implementation in year 2009).
Those activities are initiated by the Department of Culture and Information of Hanoi, and then executed by the Hanoi Ancient Walls, Co Loa vestiges Preservation Centre.

The preparation for inscription of the site to the World Heritage List has helped functional bodies benefit from international experience on preservation and restoration and improve their knowledge in the filed of architectural preservation. Many graphic documents of high quality have been developed after working sessions to draw, record and collect data and information in the past ten years.

Based on those documents, Hanoi Ancient Walls, Co Loa vestiges Preservation Centre has made the first plan for demolishment of selective structures built recently with little heritage value in order to promote the value of the heritage area (below diagram). This plan is approved by the highest competent agencies of the State.

Construction works for preservation and restoration within the framework of a project to promote their tourism value are on drafting process.

This project will be formulated taking into account relevant data and information, analysis of historical value, heritage significance of each structure, their conservation status as well as the demand for a planning scheme.

Fig. 7: Approved demolishment plan – Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa vestiges Preservation Centre
The scheme identifies 5 types of functional operations shown in different colors on the map:

1. Historical architectural works remaining intact (both modern and ancient ones)
2. Construction works opening to visitors (ticket booth, reception, WC, reception place for group delegation, area of presenters, etc.)
3. Educational and exhibition space (interpretation centre, museum, publication booth)
4. Service works (café, restaurant, souvenir shops, etc.)
5. Administration house (office, guards, fire-prevention, health care centre, etc.)

The project keeps the original foundation code of the site (activities of establishing foundation by decreasing height or digging hole are not allowed)

3.5.3 Archaeology

Besides the above mentioned preservation activities that have been carried out since 2004 on the excavation site, management plans are also required to identify criteria and regulations for the preservation of the archaeological values which remain undiscovered underground in other parts of the RC area.

Relics located inside the urban area like Hanoi Thang Long RC are still challenging archaeologists. Densely constructed housing structure, underground infrastructure, real estate pressure, changes of soil levels due to modern construction works, etc are unusual problems faced by archaeologists in urban areas. The abundant archaeological remaining underground bring about diversity but also vulnerability.

Thang Long Imperial Citadel is an exceptional case thanks to the preservation of a large number of archaeological relics in an area of thousands meters square right in the centre of a big capital city. The role of the site as an urban area is surprisingly maintained without much destruction during the history period of over 1000 years.

The appreciation of the great significance of the heritage area and the unique features of the archaeological relics discovered in the area enables us to save it from impacts of any urban development plans in this sensitive area of the city. Vietnamese authorities have decided to separate the archaeological excavation area and change it into the focal point of a large scaled preservation program for the area which has located the most powerful authorities of the country over the last 1000 years.
However, even it is an exceptional case, the excavation site is certainly just part of what locating in the RC area, and there are other parts, which remain undiscovered and are suffering from great risks.

In order to develop a long-term management plan for the archaeological relics, the detailed knowledge about these other parts is essential. Currently, apart from the large excavation site, which is under investigation for introduction and analysis, knowledge on the other parts remains limited.

Excavation works have just uncovered a part of the road system in a linear axis and identified the positions of interconnected construction works inside and main gates. The activities have only been conducted in the core in recent years. However, a large underground area on the site has been greatly affected by different events in the two revolutions of anti-French and anti-American wars. The bunkers and secret tunnel network connecting the military steering board (right at the centre of the Imperial Citadel) to the surrounding political and military bodies also insert effects on the archaeological site. Similarly, the base of the new housing estate of Ministry of Defense impacts the soil foundation of the Eastern Hanoi Imperial Citadel.

An non-invasive investigation is to be carried out at the proposal of Italian expert from Fondazione Lerici who had visited the heritage area in a mission organized with UNESSCO’s support.

In general, any newly constructed works will surely threaten the underground soil level due to digging, razing and building activities. Any development projects in Hanoi within the boundary of the heritage area will affect the archaeological levels. Vietnamese leaders have been aware the threats and have developed an investigative excavation plan in the area of new House of the National Assembly (in place of the old, already demolished one) in order to collect the archaeological remaining under the foundation of the old House of the National Assembly.

Finally, for pilot excavation, it is necessary to pay special attention to the framework of planning projects for developing the values of the area. The implementation of such projects should take into account of the presence of archaeological levels and should not excavate any level in depth without archaeological supervision.

In management aspect, new excavation should not be carried out (with possible exception of the front of the dragon stone terrace) and should consider the Imperial Citadel centre as an “archaeological reserve” area.
One of the main objectives of the management group for the heritage area is to develop a long-term strategy for the recognition of archaeological values of the whole area.

3.5.4 Researches and studies on the Heritage area

The management and promotion of heritage values, especially for such a complex area as Hanoi RC should be based on the comprehensive knowledge of the history, values and preservation situation of the site.

Such knowledge allows us to understand the threats to the Heritage area and to its values, thus identifying management and promotion priorities. The management plan and nomination documents are in fact only the initial steps and additional scientific researches are greatly in demand in order to improve future management plans for the Heritage area as well as its buffer.

Several studies have been actively carried out after the discovery of the relics in the RC area, in cooperation with domestic and international organizations. Some researches can only provide usable information once the excavation work is completed after 2010. Others are expected to be conducted and finished in the following months. Such researches specifically concern:

- Current situation of the hydrographical system in the Heritage area;
- The ancient drainage system;
- Urbanization and city development;
- The history of Vietnam’s dynasties;
- Architectural works in nominated area and buffer zone (ancient architecture and relics of the last citadel in Hanoi, military and civilian buildings in the French colony time);
- Current situation of architectural preservation;
- People’s expectations and demands.

The new management body for the Heritage area should ensure the coordination and promotion of research programs. The body should create close relationship with domestic and international research organizations, basing on the long-term and large-scale issues.
3.6 Urban landscapes, development projects and urban transportation

The unique features of Thang Long Hanoi Imperial Citadel does not only lie in the quality and the significance of the archaeological relics, but also in the rare and valuable architectural remains from the successive dynasties in this heritage area. The urban structure of the Imperial Citadel area, the auxiliary and main axis of the urban space, the functions of the area, construction techniques, diversified architectural styles, ratios of French architecture, green trees and large avenues are the main characteristics that form the area’s identity and values. It is the mixture of such factors – the archaeologically valued ruins, construction works, buildings, avenues, public space – that makes up the urban landscape of the Imperial Citadel and give us the inspiration.

Preservation and promotion of values by re-utilizing some of the buildings for tourism purposes, improving public spaces (campus and avenues), preserving the existing transportation axis and maintaining a suitable population in the buffer should meet the requirements of a comprehensive, reasonable project to accommodate the heritage significance of the heritage area.

The image and unique features of this area in the city are not easily recognized by the people. The importance is to promote such features, not only by restoring the relics and architectural structures, but also by building new housing estate (in necessary places) in the styles and materials that are compatible to the historical environment and to make the planning projects for public space within the international heritage site suitable to the identity of a relic area. The implementation of regulations on urbanization in compliance with urban and historical values of the world heritage and the strict application of such regulations to the buffer is the key to success of management activities in both long and middle run.

The concept of urban landscape includes not only the font sides of the street, but also the pavements, squares, urban equipment, transportation management and the use of housing estate. The full management of such compositions falls in different independent organizations.

Therefore, a sensible management plan of the urban landscape in the Imperial Citadel area requires the establishment of a management board involving participants from different related organization.

Motorbikes remain the most popular means of transportation in Hanoi in general and in the nomination area for the World Heritage List in particular. It is likely that a majority of such 2 wheels vehicles will be replaced by cars in near future. The
change would certainly affect transportation and preservation of relics. This is an issue for consideration in making management plans.

On the other hand, the expansion of the RC area after re-location of a major part of military service would attract more Hanoi people to visit the inner of the protection area.

What are the solutions for such urban changes?

Here requires sound measures for management and preservation of the heritage area as well as for the planning of public space. The tourism management plan based on assumptions of foreign visitors to the area should show a comprehensive strategy and should always take into account of and reflect the actual development of the heritage area as well as the number of visitors.

### 3.7 Tourism management and sustainable tourism

There has been some progress in the management of visitors and preservation and promotion of cultural and natural values in the last 10 years. The key concepts like reception capacity, localization, guide map for visitors, information policies have been introduced and implemented in an increasing number of heritage areas. A typical example is the Alhambra Heritage area in Grenade (Portugal).

In the case of Thang Long RC, it is essential to be prudent in tourism management plan since tourism may pose important risks to the Heritage area: urban place, the vulnerability of the excavation site within the Heritage area which is located in an area of many domestic and foreign visitors, the close relation of the local people to the important places in the country’s history. However, once effectively managed, the large number of visitors may create good conditions to call for the public participation as well as to attract an important financial source for the heritage area.

### 3.8 Intangible heritage and education

The UNESCO’s Convention⁴ for the Safeguarding of the Intangible cultural heritage gives definition for intangible heritage as follows:

> Article 2.1 : The “intangible cultural heritage” means the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artifacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as

⁴ Dated 17th October 2003, being in force since 20th April 2006
part of their cultural heritage. This intangible cultural heritage, transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity. For the purposes of this Convention, consideration will be given solely to such intangible cultural heritage as is compatible with existing international human rights instruments, as well as with the requirements of mutual respect among communities, groups and individuals, and of sustainable development.

The Convention aims at safeguarding oral traditions and expressions, performing arts, social practices, rituals and festive events, knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe, as well as traditional craftsmanship. The beginning part of the Convention recognizes « the deep-seated interdependence between the intangible cultural heritage and the tangible cultural and natural heritage» and emphasizes “invaluable role of the intangible cultural heritage as a factor in bringing human beings closer together and ensuring exchange and understanding among them.

Such concepts as “cultural” and “intangible heritage”, though difficult to be included in the management plan, would be significant in our attempts to transfer the values of Hanoi Imperial Citadel to the next generations. These values should be well understood, safeguarded and transferred.

What important to do is:

- To help local people understand the significance of the Heritage area;
- To acknowledge and respect local cultural traditions;
- To disseminate and transfer the unique intangible heritage values of the Heritage area;
- To collect, maintain and analyze cultural traditions as well as the development of such traditions.

In recent years, Vietnamese authorities have consistently organized cultural activities in the RC area in cooperation with a number of citizen organizations and the Department of Education and Training of the City.

A collective list of cultural activities which have been carried out since the discovery of Thang Long RC heritage is attached in Appendix.
Celebration activities and fairs which inherently attract many people are evident for the attention of leaders at different levels to Thang Long RC area.

Besides, in Vietnamese culture, the legends and oral dissemination are still preserved, which make the historical events in Co Loa and Thang Long popular to many Hanoi people.

Publications for Vietnamese pupils and students also devote several pages for introduction of Thang Long Imperial Citadel, making contribution to transfer the values to the next generations (see illustrations below).

Contents of such publications should be carefully revised and improved to include concepts of the different Conventions on world heritage and intangible cultural heritage, and should re-state the « invaluable role of the intangible cultural heritage as a factor in bringing human beings closer together and ensuring exchange and understanding among them ».

Fig. 4: Cover of course books published by the Department of Education and Training

Once the heritage area is listed in the world heritage, the new management body of the relics should make to most use of UNESCO’s tools to promote the world heritage values, especially the kid program « World heritage in young hands » which aims to attract the youth to participate in the preservation of world heritage.
3.9 Risks and natural landscapes

3.9.1 Risks

Climate in Hanoi is typical for the monsoon tropical climate. Climate data are continuously collected and monitored with electronic devices in the city area as well as the Heritage area.

The Heritage area is less polluted in comparison to other parts of the city. Moreover, there are no industrial activities in Ba Dinh district. The risks of air pollution to the preservation of the heritage area are also reduced. In the long run, pollution from transportation vehicles may become alarming due to the fast growth of cars and tourism buses in the area. This issue should be strictly supervised.

Hanoi is located in an area of seismic activities though it is not in a fracture zone. There was a historical earthquake in 1285. An electronic monitoring system has been in place together with a data collection station in Hanoi.

Fire risks are considered rather limited due to the characteristics of a heritage area and of the relics themselves.

Flooding risks are shortly discussed in the following section. These risks are strictly controlled thanks to a dyke system along the Red River.

Fig. 9. Hanoi Map 1490.

(Ministry of Construction, Preservation of Hanoi Architectural heritage and landscape, Construction Publisher, 1999, Hanoi, Vietnam, Page 5)
3.9.2 Natural landscapes

**Campus and plants**

Although natural landscape is not considered one of the criteria for nomination, Hanoi- Thang Long Imperial Citadel may utilize it as an additional value for the Heritage site located inside this urban area.

There is Botanic Garden in the buffer area, large sections of green trees and streets with plants on two sides in the RC square area, which increase the values for this urban space.
The green areas with frequent gardening service by competent organizations of Hanoi City have also been taken into account in the management system of the heritage area.

**High humidity environment**

The excavation of RC area reveals the archaeological relics of a complicated drainage system, which was typical of the area through its different historical periods. On the other hand, in the 19 century, Hanoi RC was surrounded by a number of water-full canals and also enclosed a small lake (Elephant Lake) in the place of the current Lenin statue.

The whole system of water routes and interlaced canals which used to play a key role in irrigation management has no longer existed. However, Hanoi still maintains a number of lakes in the city area, most well-known of which is the Sword Lake. Besides, there are West Lake and Truc Bach Lake near the Botanical Garden and the buffer area in the North.

Water management does not directly come within the competence of the management board of the heritage area. However, issues relating to water pollution, lake surrounding planning, underground water levels and flooding risks will directly affect the relics. Most importantly, the annual floods in Red River should be closely monitored to assess its impacts on the excavation site.
IV. FUTURE OF THANG LONG IMPERIAL CITADEL HERITAGE AREA AND MANAGEMENT GOALS
4.1 Introduction

Thang Long Imperial Citadel centre is of special importance to Vietnam’s history and the country’s people. This is one basic element of the national cultural heritage. Once being preserved and promoted, Thang Long Imperial Citadel centre will play a key role in diversifying the cultural images and heritage of Hanoi, thus luring more visitors, expanding their stay and bringing significant economic benefits. The opening of the heritage area to visitors will, therefore, contribute to consolidate cultural and tourism policies which devise important directions in the development strategies of the capital city.

The pressure imposed by the number of visitors (both domestic and oversea) on the heritage site is expected to be equal or even higher than the neighboring famous sites (Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum, Temple of Literature) which currently receive about 1 million visitors per year. Consequently, a suitable preservation system and visitor-management method is required to avoid destruction or damage to the archaeological and architectural remains and the green trees, which may undermine the significance of the relics and their conditions for sightseeing. In this regard, in the early years, there should be a special process (control of visitors, strengthen security methods) for the excavation site which is inherently more vulnerable than the RC centre.

The preservation program also needs to overcome the limits relating to urban characteristics of the heritage area (access possibility, dealing with surrounding area and views and pollution) as well as the hydrographical scheme (rain water and surface water levels) which has currently become a real threat to archaeological relics.

On the other hand, as in the cases of many big relics, it is important to ensure long-term financial source for preservation, promotion and exploitation of the values. In this case, it is possible to rely on income from tourism services (ticketing and other services in the heritage area), as well as to maintain a ticket pricing policy which enables normal people to easily pay a visit to the heritage area.

Finally, due to the importance of preservation and promotion activities, the scheduling for transferring the whole sites in the heritage area from Ministry of Defense to Hanoi City and the presence of a excavation site to be continued till 2013, there is a need to divide the management plan into 3 phases. Phase I ends in 2010; phase II covers the period from 2010 to 2015 and phase III begins after 2015 (see Chapter V).
4.2 Future of the heritage area (vision)

- The heritage area and the city: to open the Imperial Citadel centre which previously remained «closed» so that the Hanoian can gain access to a cultural and scenery place and its military and capital significance is maintained and promoted. The registration of Thang Long Imperial Citadel heritage area to the World Heritage List aims at 2 goals: on one hand, it is to remind of the existence of the Imperial Citadel from the 11th century; on the other hand, it is to open the relics in a direction that makes it compatible to the urban space through a policy focusing on sustainable cultural tourism.

- To make the Thang Long heritage area a focal point of tourism for the Hanoi people in particular and the country’s people and international visitors in general, to pay attention to the continuity of the places symbolized for power in the same area of the 1000 year city.

- To concentrate relics of great significance to the major stages in the country history to an area that promotes the continuity and everlasting of Vietnamese culture and reflects the development of such a culture through several stages from the 11th century to the end of the country liberation war.

- To preserve and exhibit relics of the Imperial Citadel palaces uncovered in the recent excavation by establishing an in-place museum in the excavation site. The museum will help visitors to gain understanding of the relics and the work of the archaeological research team and to protect the relics under unfavorable conditions of the excavated site.

- To connect the two visiting places by a tunnel to ensure the continuity and security for visitors in crossing Hoang Dieu Street.

- To restore the sites inside the Imperial Citadel centre (selectively destruct the later built works and restore, utilize the military works in French colony time) for reception of visitors and site introduction.

- To strengthen, promote the position of the Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre as a unit of independent finance to be responsible for management, maintenance and implementation of promotion projects. The Centre will directly manage income from the relics in compliance with the law to ensure financial sources for its activities.

- To clearly define the actual borderlines of the nominated property and the buffer to propagandize to the public and to help to popularize concepts of world heritage. This goal can be further identified as preservation and restoration of the part of the
wall that shows the boundary of the RC and the promotion of values of the road axis through the use of urban equipment to create typical features for the heritage area; or the construction of a consistent sign post system to show the logo of the heritage area and the symbol of World Heritage; or the utilization of public lighting method specified for this area.

4.3 Heritage area management

4.3.1 Management partners

The management of the Heritage area is closely related to all parties which are administrative and scientific agencies, namely:

- People’s Committee of Hanoi and the city’s functional bodies (Department of Foreign Affairs, Culture, Sports, Heritage),
- The Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism
- The Ministry of Construction,
- The Ministry of National Defense,
- Military History Museum,
- Vietnam Academy of Social Science,
- Vietnam Communist Party,
- Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre

The Hanoi People’s Committee and ministerial equivalent agencies should ensure the management role of their sub-bodies in direct participation in activities in the Heritage area, especially the Vietnam Academy of Social Science (in scientific research aspect), and the Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre (in technical, administrative and financial management aspects). A steering board consisting of participants from different parties shall be established to give directions and control the management conditions for the vestige area, especially to deal with issues related to the transferred management authorization of the northern and southern parts of the Imperial Citadel area to Hanoi City in the earliest possible future.

Recently the Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre has been assigned to the management of the heritage area (in year 2006) for the whole time of preservation and promotion of its values in the future (as in the below organization chart).
4.3.2 Hanoi Ancient Wall - Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre, the management body of Thang Long Imperial Citadel

Hanoi Ancient Wall - Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre (referred below as Centre for Ancient Citadel) has had a lot of experience through the work of preserving Co Loa relic (the centre is also assigned to manage Co Loa Vestiges which is 20 km away from Hanoi) and the staffs here are primarily trained to manage archaeological relics and architectural buildings.

The centre has 99 staffs including the staffs working at Co Loa Vestiges. These staffs are not responsible for preserving and exploiting archaeological items identified at Ba Dinh excavated area. These tasks (excavation and exploitation in terms of scientific research) are now assigned to a particular group of staff (approximate 50 staffs up to June 2008, sometimes there are additional staffs for preserved excavation area) who are managed by the Institute of Archaeology of Vietnam (headed by professor Tong Trung Tin) working at excavation area under the direction of Doctor Bui Minh Tri. These staffs get the salary from State budget.
Fig. 12: Proposed organism structure of Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre
4.3.3 Legal regulations of the Centre for Ancient Citadel and financial mechanisms

A – Legal regulations

Centre for Citadel is a public institution in group 3 partially entering into account. Pursuant to legal regulation of Vietnam (Decree No.43 issued on April 25th 2006), there are three public institutions based on levels of financial autonomy. Group I includes institutions which totally enter the account by themselves, group II includes institution whose revenue primarily comes from entering the account by themselves and group III (like Centre for Ancient Citadel) has the rate of revenue from entering the account less than 10%.

B – Financial resource

Investment capital

The State of Vietnam foresees a budget account of 6 millions USD to ensure the implementation of excavating items up to 2013.

Hanoi city foresees a series of 33 projects directly related to preservation, promotion of value and participation of people. In which, the particular ones are:
- Sketching the entire relic area at the ratio of 1/500;
- Collecting and comparing documents and archived information resource relating to the relic;
- Implementing the programs of preservation at various areas in the relic (Imperial Citadel, archaeological area);
- Establishing a website;
- Creating and introducing a marquette representing the entire relic area;
- Surveying in detail the climate
- Organizing a program for consulting and exchanging information with local people.

The demolishment of non-archaeological value in the Centre of Imperial Citadel shall be carried out by Centre for Ancient Citadel

World Heritage Centre of UNESCO provided an aid account of 29,700 USD within the frame of the program International Assistance Request Description (IARD)

The government of Japan granted an account of 78,488 USD
Ile-de-France passed the committee of tourism in Paris-Ile-de-France to support technical facilities to set up the plan for managing the Thang Long Imperial Citadel and protecting and promoting the value of Temple of Literature.

Within the agreement between UNESCO and the government of Japan, an assisting sum of 1 million USD shall be granted for protecting and preserving the relic.

Eventually, various agencies of the government of Vietnam (Ministries, State agencies) and local authorities (Hanoi city) shall cooperate and unify the activities with foreign and domestic capital donors.

**Exploitation**

At present, there are many institutions contribute financial resource for the relic. Expected excavation areas and stand by ones (implemented before the construction of new National Assembly building) managed by the State of Vietnam. Operation expenses and salaries for freelancers of Centre for Ancient Citadel paid by the State of Vietnam and Hanoi city (approximately 15/18000 USD per month for 86 persons)

Based on administrative frame, the centre can increase the revenue by selling visit ticket and supplementary account from services (guiding, concession of some services, organizing events, short term exhibition).

Based on actual result, it is necessary to amend the regulation of the centre to increase the revenue over the level of 10% of total budget as now. (See below in the ticket price policy and revenue expectation)

4.4 Heritage preservation and Archaeology

The archaeological area is easily encroached upon. The Heritages are mainly made of clay and wood, they are easily ruined by tropical environment conditions (air contamination) and the appearance of transversal water spring at the depth of excavation hole make the task of specialists more complicated.

Since 2004 up to now, a lot of conferences have been organized to attempt to identify exact scientific criteria in preserving the Heritages. Temporary measures have been applied right at the beginning of the excavation. Excavation holes have been equipped with big transparent roofs to avoid heavy rains and a pump system has been provided to control the water level in excavation holes.
These preliminary measures help implementing excavation in acceptable conditions, but they can’t help preserving the Heritages in long term serving for widely introducing to the public.

The issue of preservation is one of the fundamental challenges to planned tasks from now to the completion of excavation and it needs the professional cooperation between Vietnamese archaeologists and Japanese specialists in the frame of an international project sponsored by Japan. In waiting for study’s result, the centre must maintain temporary protection measure and apply a professional monitoring system to continuously identify the physical and chemical damage of items and structures. These data shall be viewed when considering the preservation directions and help identifying final solutions.

An UNESCO-backed research was conducted by the experts from Italian Fondazione Lerici to evaluate the buildings in the Site. The recommendation from the research would be used for making decision on the building maintenance. The research was also aimed to collect urban data for further planning and historical understanding as well.

Generally, any new construction is potential danger for the beneath soil layers. In Hanoi, any new developing project implemented within protected area can be harmful for archaeological layers underground.

The Government, with full awareness about the potential danger from new construction, has launched a campaign of excavation at the place of new National Assembly Building (the old National Assembly Building had located at the same place).

Finnally, it is a must to pay much attention to the archaeological excavations in the central area within the framework of the project of planning and promoting values of the Site. A fact that there are many archaeological layers probably still remain underground need to be taken into account. It is a strict requirement that no archaeological excavation is conducted without supervision of archaeologist.

One of the main targets of authorized organization to manage the Site is to map out a long-term strategy on recognizing archaeological values of the Site.
4.5 Tourism management and sustainable tourism

4.5.1 Introduction

At present, methods to plan the tourism management of a landscape based primarily on:

- An assessment on reception capability (the maximum number of visitors at a place at the same time);

- An expected assessment on the number of visitors (single visitor and delegation, tourists and local people);

- A scientific project developed by specialists (Historians, archaeologists, preservation experts) basing on collected data. The implementation of scientific projects (visiting aid documents and facilities, presentation Center, in place museology, visiting circuits, tourist guide training) must take the features of visitors and their behavior into account (preference, expectation, visiting time) and emphasize the typical features of each place which are listed in the World Heritage (global value, originality)

- Protection regulation proposed in preservation plan

Basing on these data, the centre continues to identify:

- Visiting circuits basing on the number of visitors, impediment factors inside and outside the Site (surrounding areas, entrance, preservation, introduction, services and facilities)

- Policy for managing visiting circuits and ticket price

- Program for facilities and services arrangement (shops, café, handicraft shops)

- Visiting aid facilities (instruction map, tourist guide, presentation cassettes, direction signs)

- Program for cultural values’ promotion (publication, short term exhibition, entertainment activities and events)

- Introduction strategy (documents, internet, relationship with mass media);

- The impact of visitor current management (tourists and local people) on administration, technique and financial management system in terms of personnel, expense, finance and education methods.
4.5.2 The reception capability of the Site

The assessment of reception capability based on the estimation of surface area of the Site available for visiting without applying special regulations to prevent the landscapes from violation, it is necessary to count on the areas surrounding the Site and their roles in managing visitors.

The Site can be divided into 3 areas

- The area of Imperial Citadel (13.865 ha)
- Archaeological excavation area (4.77 ha)
- Surrounding areas including traffic centre lines and vacant grounds for parking are mostly in the boundary of buffer zone

In comparison regarding reception capability, these three areas have serveral distinctive features.

A – Archaeological area

The number of visitor visiting the archaeological area currently is restricted because areas available for visiting are limited, excavation holes are still being studied (which will last several years) as well as the low-capacity access bridge supported by columns above the holes (designed for some VIP visitors: researchers, governmental officials etc, for example, but not for popular and regular visitors).

Similarly to above-mentioned access, in situ museum is also designed for receiving selective visitors only. With this situation, the archaeological area, in normal condition (ensuring safety for both visitors and the landscapes) can receive 100 visitors each half an hour i.e. 1.500 visitors/day. Until the excavation finishes, the area shall not be re-planned for strengthening reception ability of the Site by increasing available space for visiting and enlarging in situ museum.

B – Imperial Citadel

In contrary, the area of Imperial Citadel is rather large. There are many trees in the area, the convenient traffic lines here allow visitors to walk in and use essential services.

Basing on current structure and scale, the Imperial Citadel can receive more than 5.000 participations/day, i.e. the constant number of visitors (the maximum number of visitor present in the Citadel at the same time) can reach 1.500 visitors.
Reception capability in the Thang Long Imperial Citadel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place</th>
<th>The number of tourist per day</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Archaeological site</td>
<td>1 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imperial area</td>
<td>More than 5 000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

C – Surrounding areas

Surrounding area of the Site is quite airy. It is easy to access the Site because of its surrounding convenient traffic and spaces, of which some is equipped public facilities for using as permanent or temporary parking-plot of bus, car and motorbike.

On the other hand, being adjacent to other well-known historical relics (Uncle Ho Mausoleum, Literature Temple) is also an advantage because the parking areas are available and the travel agencies are used to organizing tours.

Lying on this location, the Citadel also enjoys another typical advantage, from which a comprehensive management system could be set without the need to establish large-scale office building within the Site and apply measures restricting number of visitors. In terms of reception, the parking adjacent to the Citadel can park more than 20 buses at the same time (1000 visitors). Moreover, there are several other parking places for traveling buses visiting Ho Chi Minh mausoleum and museum. These parking areas are adjacent to the expected main entrance of the site (including Hanoi citadel and Archaeological site) of which possible capacity is more than 20 travel buses.

4.5.3 Assessment on the number of visitors

A – The number of visitors to neighboring areas of Thang Long Imperial Citadel

Up to now, the Citadel has not been widely opened to the public, but only receive selective visitors, of which almost are students and local habitants during festivals or short-term exhibitions being conducted in the central sector of the Imperial Citadel.

For above reason, below data do not succeed in showing the potential number of visitors in the future, therefore, the data of neighboring areas, in some extent, are more significant.
The number of visitors in Thang Long Imperial Citadel

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>estimated 70 000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of visitors</td>
<td>200 000</td>
<td>60 000</td>
<td>35 000</td>
<td>10 000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Famous places (Ho Chi Minh mausoleum and Literature Temple) receive more than 1 million participations per year. 80% of which are Vietnamese (local people and domestic tourists) and 20% of which are foreigners. This ratio shows that the number of visitors shall increase rapidly in July and August.

On the other hand, visitors to Fine Art museum are mainly foreigners; therefore, the period of high number of visitors is from September to March.

The number of foreign visitors in Military History Museum is also very high, mainly Chinese visitors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ho Chi Minh museum</td>
<td>1 063 741</td>
<td>1 200 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temple of Literature</td>
<td>870 000</td>
<td>960 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fine Art museum</td>
<td>48 798</td>
<td>55 314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military History museum</td>
<td>300 000 (estimated)</td>
<td>324 000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These average figures enable us to assess the maximum number of visitors in one day at these places.

In Ho Chi Minh museum, the highest number of visitors in one day in the rush month (July) can reach 5000 visitors, i.e. « number of permanent visitors » (the maximum number of visitors at the same time, at the same place) reaches 1500 visitors. These figures show that there are many days in the year when the number of visitors exceeds 4000 visitors/day.
In the Temple of Literature, on rush day, the number of visitor can reach 4500 visitors, i.e. “number of regular visitors” reaches 1200 visitors. These figures show that there are many days in the year when the number of visitors exceeds 3500 visitors/day

**B – The expected number of visitors in Thang Long Imperial Citadel**

Playing an important role during Vietnamese history, Thang Long Imperial Citadel is considered as well-known as Ho Chi Minh museum and Temple of Literature. This place possibly attracts a vast number of local and domestic visitors, accordingly. Foreign tourists can find this a particularly interesting place. Consequently, we believe that the number of visitors to this Site shall reach 1 million visitors per year.

At hand, like Ho Chi Minh museum and Temple of Literature, the number of visitors to Thang Long Imperial Citadel shall increase steadily if tourism activities in Vietnam and in Hanoi in particular continue to increase as expected in the research of World Tourism Organization

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of visitors in Hanoi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of visitor</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Among the tourists came to Hanoi in 2006, the number of Korean tourists is the highest (13%), followed by Chinese (12.6%), Japanese (9.4%), French (7.6%), Australian (6.5%), North American (5.6%) and the UK (4.1%)

If estimated according to the total number of visitors in Hanoi (domestic and foreign), in 2007, the city received 6.7 millions participations of visitors (5.4 millions participations of domestic visitors and 1.3 millions of foreign ones). In 2003, the number was 3.88 millions; i.e. there is an increase of 70% within 4 years. Finally, it is necessary to emphasize that, the target of Hanoi city is to receive 2 millions of participation of foreign visitors by 2010, in the anniversary of 1000th years Thang Long - Hanoi

Thus, the number of domestic and foreign visitors is possible to increase substantially in the coming years at the average rate of 5-10%. Even when this trend is affected by unusual event impacting on the development of international tourism.
activities (e.g. the September 11th 2001 event), the experience shows that such events only influence the number of visitors in 2 or 3 years, after that, it will be stable as before

By all means, the Thang Long Imperial Citadel shall be put under the pressure of the large number of visitors which can be approximate or even higher than that of adjacent places (Ho Chi Minh museum and Temple of Literature), i.e the place will welcome more than 1 million participations of visitors each year right after opening for visit (2010) and expectedly reach 1,5 millions of participation of visitors by 2020

These figures say that on special occasions, the number of participations can reach 5000/day, i.e. from 40-50 days in the year have the number of participations of 7000/day, the maximum number of permanent visitors will be 1500-2000.

Thus, in the plan of visitor current management, we must take account of these figures and long term trend to well protect the Citadel (both real factors and cultural value) and offer the visitors the safe and high quality access

4.5.4 Visiting circuits and the facilities for managing visitor flow

The above analysis shows that the organization and management of visiting activities in the Imperial Citadel (entrance, parking areas, visiting conditions) do not face any difficulties even in high season (1 million participations of visitors each year after opening for visit by 2010 and 1,5 million by 2020)

On the contrary, in the first phase (till the finish of archaeological excavations), we might pay more attention on the requirement of limiting the number of visitors to the archaeological area for keeping it under good protection, preservation and ensuring safety for both visitors and exhibiting artifacts.

Visiting circuits in the Citadel taking into account of other adjacent places has been drafted (following map). In fact, almost visitors are local habitant and visitors who are familiar with the whole area, especially Ho Chi Minh mausoleum and museum, thus, the Imperial Citadel and Archaeological Site are possibly two of partly-visiting elements of the whole circuit.
In terms of visiting management, adding these two sites to the visiting circuit of the whole area will prolong visitors’ staying time in the area from 2 to 4 hours, this requires additional services (especially restaurants/café, restrooms, stop).

The visiting circuits in the Imperial Citadel starts from, the main entrance of the Citadel (1) and Archaeological Site (2) and finishes at West entrance (3) in opposite of Archaeological Site (Hoang Dieu street). The space adjacent to this entrance can be used as parking-plot for 10 buses (55 visitors each) and other kinds of vehicles (4). On the other hand, it is possible for the buses to stop for picking up visitors at the entrance and park at the parking-plot at Nguyen Tri Phuong Street (8) or the park of Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum and Museum afterward (5).

After entering the main entrance, visitors will reach the reception hall, information centre and ticket box. The circuits of visiting the Imperial Citadel can be in two forms: free sightseeing and sightseeing with tourist guide the entrance, visitors will receive an visiting instruction clearly explain features and locations of historic building, presentation area (museum) and auxiliary buildings (restroom, shops, refreshment shops and restaurant, medical stations).

- In the first phase, visitors can visit the Archaeological area after exiting the Imperial Citadel by the main entrance (3) and pass Hoang Dieu Street. This arrangement requires traffic solution (traffic lights, speed down sign) for the safety of visitors when crossing the road. In the first phase (till the finish of archaeological excavations), only visitors with tourist guide are welcomed to Archaeological area.

- In the second phase (2010/2015), visitors can access the Archaeological area through a tunnel which connects the Imperial Citadel with archaeological area. This construction will be implemented after excavating items. Identified items, if any, will be shown in place. The city of Hanoi can completely apply that technology of excavation because at present, the city is planning to build subway lines and mostly the lines run through areas of the same geology as that under Hoang Dieu Street (full of water).

After finishing the circuit in Archaeological area, visitors can directly come to (4) parking area, go around or come back to the Citadel whether they want to go to the restroom, stalls, restaurants or café.

After visiting the Imperial Citadel, visitors can exit on Hoang Dieu (4) or Nguyen Tri Phuong streets (7). There is a large space near the East entrance where 10 buses and other kinds of vehicles can park (8). This can be used as the second entrance. On the other hand, the area outside the gate in Nguyen Tri Phuong street, for example, can be used as parking-plot for workers of the Center.
Figure 13: Visiting circuits
4.5.5  The facilities for managing visitor flow

Regarding the risks of violation and exploitation abilities, the management of visitor flow of the Imperial Citadel and of Archaeological area show apparently difference.

A – The Imperial Citadel

For effective visit, visitors are provided a free instruction map explaining clearly existing signs in visiting area (color, signs in number, etc). Due to structure of the Imperial Citadel, there are some visiting options for visitors to choose (free or with tourist guide).

With the expectation of high number visitors, in long term period, a « reservation in group » system must be established which requires a full preparation of technical support and staff training.

In the first phase, management organization of the Citadel (Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre) coordinates with management organizations of Ho Chi Minh Museum and of Temple of Literature with the assistance of Hanoi Tourism Department in announcing introduction information to travel agencies, simultaneously giving them « priority in some specific time ». Moreover, ‘reservation in group’ system (for tourist and student delegation) is possible to be set in fixed time of 1 hour (allowing 15-20 minutes more or less). Single visitor can access to the Citadel from both entrances (main entrance (3) and secondary entrance (7)) to avoid long queue for tickets. In spite of being planned in the Citadel planning diagram already, this system will not be applied until the average number of visitors is counted.

Opening time can increase by 1 hour or 1 hour and half in rush seasons. Currently, due to limited facilities for security, visiting tours in the evening is not shaped, however, for long term plan, such tours will be planned.

B – Archaeological area

The management of visitor flow in Archaeological area is totally different.

Receiving capacity of 1500 visitors/day is too low in comparison with the expected pressure of nearly 5000 visitors/day. Therefore, we need to establish a time control system (no more than 200 to 250 visitors/hour) for both single visitors and delegation following two requirements: compulsory tour with tourist guide and 30 minute limitation.

This method must be applied until excavations finish. Afterward, basing on preservation program, we can apply a new management method, for example,
building an in situ museum which helps to develop presentation and increase receiving ability of the site.

The Imperial Citadel and Archaeological area will be connected by a tunnel across Hoang Dieu street which planned to be used by 2015.

In the first phase, the number of tickets for sale is limited according to the norm of 200-250 visitors/hour.

**C – Ticket and ticket fare system**

Visitor can buy ticket at the main entrance on Hoang Dieu Street (3) or secondary entrance on Nguyen Tri Phuong Street (7). Tickets are also checked at the entrance of Archaeological area, but at least up to 2015, no ticket box shall not be placed in archaeological area.

Visitors can stay longer in Imperial Citadel without causing big disorder which enables the method of selling ticket according to time. With this kind of ticket, in waiting for visiting archaeological area, visitors can stay in the Imperial Citadel.

**4.5.6 Ticket fare system**

Money received from ticket selling must be important revenue of management committee (Centre for Ancient Citadel) but the committee must maintain the right of visiting of local people and domestic visitors.

At present, places selling ticket for visiting in Vietnam do not make any distinction among visitors. At the Temple of Literature where most of visitors are Vietnamese, ticket fare is 0.30 USD, whereas at Fine Art museum where most of visitors are foreigners, ticket fare is 3 USD.

After approved by Management committee of the State, we need to apply the system « two level of ticket fare » to combine two options as many tourism places abroad (as Galapagos archipelago of Ecuador which recognized as World Heritage).

Based on ticket fare by 2010, ticket fare of Imperial Citadel can be 0.40 USD for domestic visitors and 5USD for foreign ones. The ticket fare for both Imperial Citadel and archaeological is 7.5 USD for foreign visitors and 0.50 USD for domestic visitors.

Ticket fare for visitors in delegation may be discounted in accordance with the number of visitors each year. As with domestic visitors, children at the age of 12 and less can enter freely, from 12-18 years old, ticket fare will be discounted.
with foreign visitors, children of 2 years old can enter freely and ticket fare for those who from 2 to 18 years old will be discounted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of ticket fare by 2010</th>
<th>Imperial Citadel only</th>
<th>Imperial Citadel + archaeological area</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic visitors and Overseas Vietnamese of more than 18 years old</td>
<td>0.40 USD</td>
<td>0.50 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic visitors and Overseas Vietnamese of 12-18 years old</td>
<td>0.20 USD</td>
<td>0.25 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic visitors and Overseas Vietnamese of less than 12 years old</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigner of more than 18 years old</td>
<td>5 USD</td>
<td>7.5 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigner from 2 to 18 years old</td>
<td>3 USD</td>
<td>4 USD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreigner less than 2 years old</td>
<td>Free</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the first phase, before the construction of the tunnel connecting the Imperial Citadel with archaeological area, the ticket can be use multiple times (at least 2 times) within one or a half day. So, visitors can use one ticket to come back to Imperial Citadel after visiting archaeological area.

For long term plan, if approved by administrations, we should apply the subscriber card allowing a tourist when staying in Hanoi can visit all places and building listed on that card as well as Museum of Ethnology outside city centre.
4.5.7 Infrastructure and planning items

A – Planning items in Imperial Citadel area

The visitors’ reception and management required a lot of infrastructure, planning items and services.

All the visitors will easily find surrounding location of Imperial Citadel (parking area) when go into existing construction after being reconstructed, consolidated and preplanned. A detail scheme of this construction location accompanied with the introduction of relevant conservation and protection measures are being drawn up. These main infrastructures anticipated in the value displaying plan of relic area including:

- parking area;
- reception stand, ticket stand, information stand, toilets;
- sale area (sightseeing document, books, cultural products);
- medical aid station;
- administration and reception houses of these pupil mission;
- interpretation Center, on-site museum, short-term exhibition and introductory space;
- café, restaurant, souvenir stand;
- Hanoi library
- sightseeing guidance service.

Parking area

These empty yards for parking area will be preplanned, but with the actual state, we don’t need to invest much. Lying along these two roads of Hoang Dieu and Nguyen Tri Phuong, these two areas can receive each side of 10 tour buses (equivalent to 1000 tourists). On the Nguyen Tri Phuong side, a motor park will be planned. These two 1500 m² yards will be arranged a space for « quick pick –up and pick- out visitors » for the other cars parked in the other places.

The reception area at the main entrance (on Hoang Dieu side)

These areas for the reception work at the main entrance, ticket and information stand will be divided into three points. At the main entrance (on the Hoang Dieu side), there will be 4 ticket stands indoors (including one stand for group plan), working room for reception staff force, an information stand where freely delivers
sightseeing guidance maps in many languages and the toilets area only for staff (2 chambers).

These house areas for these functions at the area of about 180/200 m² (in which 150 m² used for reception, information and ticket area and docent desk). At this layout, it allows managing about 250 tourists in 15/20 minutes; it means that we can ensure « the amount of permanent customers » of about 1500 people. If the selected building has aeration corridor, the area of the room can be smaller.

This is also the starting point of these customer groups with description so we need arrange a desk for people that take over the description work.

Reception house at the sub-entrance side (on Nguyen Tri Phuong Street) is with the smaller scale, only need of 100 m². This house area has the same functions like at the main entrance, exception for the desk of description staff.

Toilets

These Toilets for visitors (12 chambers– 60 m²) are closed to the reception area. It needs to plan the second toilet area (6 chambers – 30 m²) in the central area of the Imperial Citadel.

The stand in the relic area

The stand area in the relic zone a need to have store house, working room for sale and management staff, toilets for staff (2 chambers) and the sale area. The total needed area is about 200 m², including 150 m² for sale area and can be divided into 2 floors.

If we let the exploration right of the stand area for private unit, we need to anticipate clearly that the goods sold is of corresponding quality of relic zone reputation to prevent « false goods ».

Medical aid station

Medical aid station is also arranged at the same area with administrative house. This construction need the area of about 80 m² including a working room /toilets for medical staff, toilets for patients, an area to restore medical equipments and a reception room. The medical aid station location is defined in the map that delivers to visitors at the main entrance and on the signboard system in relic zone. In the case of holding art performance and cultural events, organizer offices will arrange necessary first aid force. These infrastructures are very important because we have to ensure safety and the necessary medical care for visitors as the key element in management. Without essential services, in the case of incidents, these damaged
visitors or travel agency can complaint about responsibility of relic management office.

These working rooms of administrative area

These working rooms of Imperial Citadel Center are arranged at building line inside relic zone since the Center’s establishment. In the long period, these value promotion programs of the total Imperial Citadel zone will require the expansion of staff and these activities of management unit.

When building value displaying and conservation programme of relic zone, we will arrange the second building for management functions. It needs to mobilize more lay-out of total area of 150 m² (add up to toilets).

These rooms for conference activity

We need to arrange a 50- seats conference hall with enough sound, light equipment and air conditioning to serve for these activities of relic zone. This room has area of about 100/120 m².

We can make a plan of a larger conference hall for 100 seats, but it will require a lot of constructions part. This plan can be done afterward and inserted to museum of relic zone as expected will be built in archaeological zone after finishing the period of disinter.

In addition, we need one or two more rooms of 50/60 m², with enough sound and light equipments and school equipments (blackboard, table, and seat) to welcome juvenile groups and used for knowledge universal activities.

Interpretation Center

It is compulsory for a relic zone of this kind to establish an interpretation Center and a zone for short-term exhibition activities. However, due to the actual state of disinter activities which is possibly lasted many years, it should be implemented following each phase.

In the first phase, we only rehabilitate existing museum in opposite to disinter zone to welcome visitors to archaeological zone and provide them with general vision of history, architecture and these detected objects at this zone.

Concurrently, in this period we need to arrange an interpretation Center at the Citadel (in the restoration building). Interpretation Center helps the visitors who cannot come to archaeological zone due to the limitation of visitors can collect the basic information of both Citadel and archaeological zone. If the technical
conditions allowed, archaeological objects found in disinter hole can be displayed. Therefore, visitors will know about the uniformity in this historic relic zone.

In the interpretation Center, a zone used for introduction of world heritage value of this relic as well as other place-name that be recognized as world heritage can be arranged. Such a zone requires area of about 300 m$^2$ and can be arranged into two floors. In addition, we need a zone for short-term exhibitions with technical equipments (protection, conservation and security) at the area of about 200 m$^2$. Lastly, we need standby area (100 m$^2$) with necessary equipments to support for these above-mentioned zones.

**Cafe, restaurant and shops**

The flow of visitors management programme in the Citadel zone (including all Citadel zone, temple of literature, Ho Chi Minh mausoleum and Ho Chi Minh museum) aim at prolong the visit time from 2-2½ at present up to 4 hours.

If the visitors come here in the morning, all of them will have needed to eat and rest on-site. Therefore, to meet this demand, these cafes, restaurants and fine art handcrafted shop become necessary.

The total area required of about 400 m$^2$ for restaurants (account both logistic zone) and 2 cafe inns with the area of each inn is 200 m$^2$. In term of function, these buildings used as cafe inns and restaurants must have a special power, water supply and water drainage system. On the other hand, we also ensure that these private vans of exploited units can access conveniently (goods delivery, security insurance).

In term of management, Citadel Center can directly control these activities or give a concession to exploit for private units. The second measure brings many advantages if we make strict plan for management conditions.

These awarded contracts with special private exploited unit allow monitoring the service quality and decorating style. For example, when outdoor yard space will be required to exploit, management office must ensure that this space will be fallen in line with landscape in the relic zone and don’t affect the harmony element of these location in this area (these buildings with back yards and gardens).

Fine art handcrafted shop can be divided into two blocks; each block consists of 5 shops. Each shop has goods restore area that car can access and the selling zone has area of about 15 m$^2$.

**Library**

One of these buildings built in French domination in Citadel zone laid beside Doan Mon relic is now used by the Hanoi city library. Depending on the research result of
value conservation/displaying, we can make a plan to remain this library, concurrently add more private zones for these literatures about the history of Citadel and Hanoi city. In the case of remaining the library, it needs to plan these management periods of entrance and clearance Citadel zone visitors to distinguish excursionist and the guest going into the library.

| **Conclusive table of necessary lay-out area for many different infrastructure** |
|---------------------------------|------------------|
| Infrastructure                   | Area (m²)        |
| Parking area on the Hoang Dieu street | 2 000           |
| Parking area on the Nguyen Tri Phuong street | 2 500          |
| Main entrance (ticket and information stand, desk of description staff) | 200              |
| Sub- entrance (on the Nguyen Tri Phuong street ) | 100             |
| Main toilets(12 chambers) – closed to the gateway | 60              |
| Sub-toilets (6 chambers) – in the relic zone | 30              |
| Stand                           | 200              |
| Medical aid station            | 50               |
| Additionally arranged administrative houses | 150             |
| Conference hall                | 120              |
| Pupils mission reception room  | 120              |
| Interpretation Center          | 300              |
| Short-term exhibition room     | 200              |
| Spare area                     | 100              |
| Restaurant                     | 400              |
| Café (200m² x 2)               | 400              |
| Fine art hand crafted shop     | 150              |
| Control door of archeological area entrance | 10              |
B – The planning of archeological area

These necessary equipments for tourism management at archeological area must take into consideraion basing on each phase to sthengthen the value of relic zone.

The opening for visiting during the period from the first phase to the beginning of the second phase must be controlled and organized in group within the precinct of the archeological area, including the following points as belows:

- Reception position located at the relic zone (10 m²),
- To arrange tour direction conveniently (being protected by guard wire or differentiated form that is suitable for relic zone)
- To make access bridge system enough steady to bear many continuous visit, despite the fact that visitors are not much,
- To replan museum house to provide the visitors with information of relic zone, history and disinter result rapidly,
- To reinforce the safety level at the working area of archaeologists and object restore zone.

In the second phase, it is ancitipated to build an in situ museum on site, arranged at the area of low trespass threat to establish the equality level at these two relic zones (Citadel and archeological zone).

At present, archaeologists and scientists make a plan to arrange museum in adjacent location of National Assembly house, where has sports facilities zone. Such a project need to consider carefully on the basis of previous research to be suitable for the landscape as well as brings the good effect on relic zone, besides this, we have to define these tools that the museum can provide for visitors with all the information to help them know about history of relic through different dynasties.

It is important for archaeological museum to introduce suitably with the important image of Thang Long Citadel (these conservation condition, embellish experiment research rooms, value displaying, storage, information for visitors). In addition, the museum must have a short-term exhibition room. Building a museum is a good chance of establishing a larger scale conference hall (about 250 seats) at the Citadel zone. Almost exhibiting artifacts of the Archaeological Site are under qualified preservation and protection in a museum, the others is stored nearby. We have been continuously studied experiences from Ecole Francaise D’Extreme Orient who conducted a mission for French preservation experts to exchange experiences in Hanoi. This mission aims to build an in situ museum within the archaeological site.
In the second phase, a subway jointing between Citadel and archeological site is planned to built. Before implementing this subway, we have to carry out exploratory disinter to ensure absolutely safety for the joint way between these two areas.

Guidance sightseeing

Guidance sightseeing is one of the key methods to control the flow of visitors at the archeological zone. Tourist guide training is secured to meet all the demands (as the concept of global value, the characteristics of the relic zone that be recognized as the world heritage, history of relic zone, disinter techniques, visitors group management). Similar to Citadel, although the sightseeing with the tourist guide is only one type among many types in this relic zone.

4.5.8 Support tools for sightseeing

Understanding the relic zone, managing the number of visitors and the quality of visit depend mostly on the document and support tools that the visitors have.

According to the existing model being used at many places, visitors receive a free guidance map. This document consists of 6 pages at the reception stand with these following content:

- History of relic zone (both archeological and Citadel area),
- Location of important house area accompanied with brief introduction of architecture and history along with the illustrated images,
- Guidance information of sightseeing direction help make it easily convenient for the tourists to go sightseeing,
- Useful information (time of opening, ticket price, information of website, gateway).

It is necessary to draw up detail guidance document, but we should wait till the planning items at Citadel and archeologic area completed. During the first phase (up to 2015) it need to give out a temporary detail guidance document to provide visitors with complete information in comparison with guidance maps. This document have to write in many languages (Vietnamese, English, French) at suitable price at relic zone and at the other publication network (other relic zone, bookstore, tourism information point). Similarly, These existing document of Vietnam or foreign countries (historic books, Hanoi and Vietnam tourism guidance books) will be inventoried in term of available document and will be sold at relic zone.
The application of *description hearing devices* can be deployed to implement, but only when we had bought private devices. In this case, management office must build the visit direction and enclosed content. But this measure is not a prior for this period.

A programme of *visit information and route* must be carried out with the combination of these guidance document composers (guidance map and detail guidance table). These direction signs are easy to see and read and suitable for natural and architectural space here. We need to avoid so much information on the big board that limit the pathway of visitors, because these too big boards will destroy the landscape (herein are buildings, plants, archaeological zone).

The content of direction signs is decided by the researchers, but a technician in communication field will take over the design and final composer work. We can use one electronics signal or logo. This electronics signs are also necessary for proliferation document. The direction signs must exist in both English and Vietnamese.

Sightseeing route guidance also provides the information related to « safety », allows visitors to define dangerous place, therefore it will become supporting tools for responsibility of relic zone management unit.

The training of *description staff* will contribute to value displaying of relic zone, help everyone understand more and support the management of visitors number, especially at the archaeological zone that is compulsory for the tourist guide go with the visitors. Description staffs not only enable to master the relic zone history, but they also enable to manage a group of visitors and explain clearly about the characteristics of the world heritage (global value, registration system…)

### 4.5.9 Value promotion activities

Value displaying must base on these tools and events. Besides these mentioned value displaying elements (conservation, repair of some architectural zone at Citadel, direction signs, sightseeing document, activities aimed at local people) and especially the Citadel zone should equip *lighting programme* for night sightseeing. The deploy of corresponding programme requires a large money invested and have to apply some technical measures without destroying the landscape of relic zone.

Research work for this programme can be carried out at the second phase from 2010/2012) when all the relic zone is opened in the less strings in comparison with the phase of 2008/2010 – or the first phase).
In term of event development, if we have a short-term exhibition zone at the Citadel, we can perform many special art activities with the topic related to the relic zone (see the detail list in the appendix), like these things achieved since 2003.

When the relic zone is openned for visit and all the work items is developing well, conservation Center of Co Loa- Hanoi Citadel relic zone can develop these regular cultural activities, support for publication and cultural activities (conference, publication, teaching document).

Center can become look-up point of Citadel related document and disinters due to the collection of document and data on the available document in other place (library) can be stored in term of literature document or on the Internet. Hanoi library is now on the Citadel can help preliminarily establish this works.

4.5.10 Promotion plan

There are many units participating in the tourism and culture proliferation of Hanoi city. That is Hanoi tourism service, the unit that issues many document and participating in many international fair. In private sector, Hanoi Tourist Corporation also plays an active role.

Relic zone proliferation plan have to be one of the general policies of city. It needs to introduce this significant relic zone and organize an special communication manner that aims at many different public objects, especially for the youth, local people, local tourism agent (travel company, hotels, restaurant, taxi agency), Vietnamese and foriegn tourists.

This Proliferation strategy must base on these following supporting tools:

- A press profile;
- A website to provide archeologic, architectural and historic information of Citadel and archeologic zone, and have relation with other tourism relic zone of the city;
- A series of poster;
- A data base related to communication media and the reporters who specialized in “heritage, culture, tourism”;
- An image data base (photographs, film) can be used for communication media and tour organizers when they want to use that illustrated image in their communication document.
If the nomination process is completed and Hanoi –Thang Long Imperial Citadel relic is recorded in the List of the World heritage, these managers will have right to popularize on the Label magazine about the World heritage on basis of referencing these use requirements defined by UNESCO.

The launch of image convention set with electronics identity signs of relic area (logo, baseline) can be used in all proliferation tools and if any an identity characteristics of the relic area will be another strong point.

Lastly, It need to set up the relation rapidly with Publication house of tourism guidance books to popularize about the open door project for visitors as well as the related content to the relic area (history, architecture, archaeology, useful information) and the easily injured characteristics of this area.

4.5.11 Disable people reception

Disable people reception gives out these different difficulties depend on the type of injury.

These people who have difficulties in traveling can move without facing to big challenges. However, it needs to redefine the sightseeing and if necessary we have to implement planning work at the essential places (stairs, expand entrance doors, erect the signs support).

These hearing less people need another supporting form. It can be a brailed document or copy of displayed objects for them to touch.

4.5.12 Security for the nominated property and the visitors

These safety issues at the relic zone have become sensitive issues that need a specific management mechanism. To cultural property, safety insurance can be carried out by machinery tools and people. To Hanoi Ancient Citadel, security and safety issues don’t face to any big challenges because the entire relic area is enclosed by the high city walls, as well as the big and certainly gateway system. This allows efficient safeguard (both day and night). These house line that open door for visitors are all protected according to the normal conditions: with bodyguards, the objects are kept in glass case, and in some cases have monitor camera. To the archaeological zone, the situation becomes more complicated. We have to protect the relic area that is easier to break into than Ancient Citadel area, and we also have to protect archaeological relict in it. We can install the anti-thief system not only in archaeological area but also in the display rooms of the relics
disinterred at the relic area. At these rooms, we also can install the fire-alarm system. The museum house of the relic area is a safe and suitable measure (because anti-theft, safeguard, monitoring camera, fire alarm system will be available)

To the safety of visitors, the planning of the relic area (both Imperial Citadel and archaeological area) in general can’t cause any risk to visitors, because the relic area is comparatively flat, almost have the same height. However, some following measures need to be mentioned:

- In term of equipments, the relic area need to have a first-aid room accompanied with the most necessary equipments to serve for emergency cases. These staffs of the relic area have to be trained to participate in first aid reliably for who need help.
- The relic area needs to maintain regularly to prevent the risks from the tree branch drop or the collapse of some parts of the buildings. We need to erect the warnings board for visitors at some dangerous places (e.g. narrow stairs, high degree of slope). The safeguard staffs of the relic area are also trained to realize quickly these risks that can threaten the visitors’ safety (both in garden and inside these buildings).

The management unit have to draw up a table of rules including the compulsory article that the visitors have to obey for safety, as well as set the standards of necessary behavior of each visitors when visit the relic area. The Center also coordinates tightly with Public security for timely interference in these necessary cases.

4.6 These activities aim at local community:

Thang Long- Hanoi Imperial Citadel relic zone is the important relic of Vietnamese history. It plays the important role in country history as well as in daily life of Vietnamese people.

Many occasions of pupils’ sightseeing were organized, each school year has many occasions, and Hanoi Ancient Citadel is also the place to witness many large scale activities (seeing the appendix A – The list of cultural events related to Hanoi Ancient Citadel).

Opening for visitors don’t have right to affect the propaganda activities as well as the relation of Vietnamese people in general to this important relic area in the country’s history.

Of course, these sightseeing of pupils need to organize more, with enclosed suitable pedagogic tools, in which not only introduce the necessary information for the relic
area’s learning but also the meaningfulness of registering to the list of The world heritage (the global value).

A display can be added for this document in order to help the youth know both other relic area of Vietnam that is classified as the World heritage, as well as some other important global relic areas also laid on the list of the World heritage.

We can organize some special visits for teachers. The careful monitor of these activities for these pupils and students may need the establishment of a responsibility room in the number of teams of Co Loa-Thang Long Hanoi relic conservation Center.

These activities of local representatives still play an important role in this relic zone. However, due to management will become more complicated, so these activities will be strictly organized with conservation Hanoi Ancient Wall, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Center to ensure safety as well as the suitable time.
V. IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING
5.1 Management plan implementation process

5.1.1 Introduction

These decisions in the year 2007 and 2008 by Vietnam government (on preservation of the heritage area and fund for archaeological excavation) and by Hanoi city (assigned to the Hanoi Ancient Walls, Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre as the administrative unit to manage the site, to negotiate and receive those areas under the management Ministry of Defense, provide investment fund for value displaying and conservation) has facilitated for the implementation of the management plan.

As a result, the administrative unit for the site has been equipped with necessary tools to start implementing the management plan in term of budget management, property in land use and relics, technical tools and human resources.

However, these tools need to ensure the reasonable and long-time characteristics to different tasks by implementing a long-term management plan to related respect of human resource and finance.

5.1.2 Specialized ability of management agency: Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre

Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre, from the first phase (2008/2010), has started expanding their ability to other fields, in addition to the fields that the centre found out specializes in, including:

- Managing tourists in accordance with individual or group tourists;
- Establishing good relationship with schools and inhabitants in the area;
- Establishing the relation with certified people within the relic area or near the relics (souvenir store, entertainment, etc.)
- Safety in the relics (relation with the public security);
- Cultural programs (events, workshops, publication);
- Promotions to spread.

Improving the staffs to face with tourist management, land transfers, popularizing promotions is necessary, supported by Hanoi Administration of Tourism. Administration of Tourism is the unit to be assigned managing travel agency and popularizing “Hanoi as a destination” at home and abroad, focusing on Asean tourism. A lot of conventions on tourism have been signed between Hanoi City and
many large capitals of ASEAN (Bangkok, Dehli, Jakarta, Kuala Lumpur, Bejing, Taiwan và Tokyo).

The recruitment of human resource who are good at foreign languages (English, French, Chinese) helps improve the Centre’s ability.

In addition, the Centre also needs to inspect these existing projects in Citadel and Archaeological Site. Hanoi City will assign the task of an investor for the Centre.

When the main excavation is finished, the conservation task between scientific organizations and Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre have to be allocated in accordance with level of complication of tasks and bases on functions of organizations in this field. This issue is being implemented well.

It is supposed that the recruitment of an conservation architect at Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre can be done in correct progress to take over the coordination and promotion in term of finance for the tasks using own budget of the Centre.

Finally, the implementation of the Management Plan requires the regular coordination with the partners of the Site: Hanoi City, Ministry of Culture, Sports and Tourism, Ministry of Defense, Institute of Archaeology, Vietnamese Academy of Social Sciences, Ministry of Construction, the media as well as other managing organizations of propertties in adjacent areas (Ho Chi Minh Mausoleum, Ho Chi Minh Museum, Temple of Literature, Military museum). A Steering and Observation Board shall be established to coordinate these relations among partners.

To fulfil the tasks in the time to come Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre will have to employ additional qualified workers.

5.1.3 Financial issues

In term of financial issues, regulation of the Law on public bodies Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre to have its own revenue income by selling ticket and additional businesses (stands, restaurants, etc.). Probably, in the period of next 3 to 5 years, it is neccessary to change regulations of the Center to help the Center have the new revenue source up to 50% of total budget, it means that from state-owned organization class 3 to class 2 (According to Decree No. 43 dated April 25th, 2006). So the revenue sources of this Site is surely large.

In addition to revenue sources from visiting fee and relic agent for hire (coffee bars, restaurants, souvenir shop), exploiting tourism in relic site can bring profit at the value of 2 million dollar/year in the normal management condition and the number
of tourist regularly. This amount is used in the activities of Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre, site management unit. This revenue source is surely enough to pay for Thang Long Imperial Citadel management and contribute to enhance the used methods in protection and promotion other properties (Temple of Literature).

### Revenue assessment from ticket selling (in USD)

Counting method bases on large relic model issuing ticket.

Average of 100 tourists have:
- 60% above 18 years old
- 40% lower than 18 years old (of which 5% lower than 2 years old, 10% from 2 to 11 years old and 25% from 12 to 18 years old)

Division between domestic tourists (75%) and foreign ones (25%) in the Site based on figures collected on adjacent relics. The rate of foreign tourist is a bit higher in the archaeological Site (30%).

Total estimation of visitors: 1,200,000 visitors (year 2015)
- Citadel: 750,000 people
- Citadel + archaeological Site: 450,000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Classification of tourists</th>
<th>Citadel %</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Revenue</th>
<th>Archaeological site %</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Revenue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic tourists, overseas Vietnamese above 18 years old</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>337,500</td>
<td>135,000</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>189,000</td>
<td>94,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic tourists, overseas Vietnamese from 12 to 18 years old</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>142,500</td>
<td>28,500</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>81,000</td>
<td>20,250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic tourists, overseas Vietnamese lower than 12 years old</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>82,500</td>
<td>Gratuit</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>112,500</td>
<td>562,500</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>81,000</td>
<td>607,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annual total revenue of ticket is up to 1,850,000 USD. In addition, revenue gains from transfer the concession of enclosed service rights (restaurants, coffee bars, souvenir shop) and organizing events or film studio for hire. These are the activities can be taken place in large relics, bringing about significant budget. These revenues require close management in the framework of permissive agreement, protect seriously the relics.

If based on the popular rate of revenue source in this field, the total revenue could gain exceed 2 million USD/year.

### 5.2 Action plan and periods to carry out

The projects to bring into play and embellish Thang Long Hanoi Citadel are large projects that need carrying out in the long periods.

In fact, recommendation of relic is an aspect in the promotion of the value and long-term embellishment. World Heritage Committee recognizes the value of the relic bring benefits in the future, contributes to support and promote commitment of Vietnam leaders in the period from 10 to 15 years.

Although the most important steps has been carried out very quickly in the last year to relic conservation, now there remains many tasks in combination with the large goals by Management Plan (Item 4.1). It is expected that parts is carried out following each phase.

Expected management plan has three main phases to be suitable for particular situation of relic:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>tourists above 18 years old</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Foreign tourists 2/18 years old</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>67 500</td>
<td>202 500</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>49 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign tourists lower than 2 years old</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7 500</td>
<td>Gratuit</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4 500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>750 000</td>
<td>928 500</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>450 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total revenue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 848 750</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- 2010: open for tourists and toward the 1000th anniversary years of Thang Long Hanoi;
- 2010-2015: carry out conservation and bring into play Imperial Citadel and archaeological site value;
- After the year 2015: duration to withdraw all land area of Imperial Citadel kept by Ministry of Defense.

5.2.1 Phase 1: 2008 - 2010

The task of the first phase is to prepare for opening door for tourists timely in 2010 on the 1000th anniversary of Thanh Long. In this phase, it is necessary to carry out the following tasks:
- Completing research to make plan of conservation and promotion of Archaeological site and Hanoi Citadel.
- Implementing initial study on planning the northern and southern of the central sector before being transferred from Ministry of Defense to Hanoi People’s Committee.
- Discovering the possible risks of existing ammunition stores in the northern and southern of the site.
- Implementing the safety system for tourists in the archaeological site (entrances, bridge systems, reprogramming existing museum in archaeological site, guaranteeing safety for excavation holes, departments, boards, storage, and guaranteeing safety in the street connecting the Citadel with Archaeological site-Hoang Dieu street side)
- To carry out conservation tasks and project Citadel: parking lot (Nguyen Tri Phuong road side) main and auxiliary welcome destinations, toilets, sign, first research on gallery, publish the first excursion document (guide map)
- To determine excursion direction, installing equipment and carrying out measurement to guarantee safety for tourists in the Citadel
- To implementing the first spread: newspaper document, establishing the relationship with publishers, website, travel companies (information, negotiation)
- To recruit additional staffs, prior to preparing open door to welcome tourists:
  - 01 chief architect is responsible for planning and supporting techniques of Hanoi City
  - 02 people in charge for chief architect
  - 01 conservation staff for conservation protection of relic
- 01 assistant of conservation staff
- 01 staff for financing and finding sponsors (unless this activity is undertaken by a body at city level or ministry level)
- 02 staff for culture (exhibitions, cultural publications, relation with school and local people)
- 01 staff for “transfer, for hire” and finding private partners for business in relic and near after this relic opens (stores, restaurants, coffee bars, event organization, film)
- To improve maintenance and security staffs.
- To improve reception staffs
- To improve management staffs (law, finance, administration)
- Training human resources for the Center:
  - Training in project supervision and preservation (improving awareness)
  - Training tourist management, finance, administration (selling ticket, transfer land use right, event organization, film making)
  - Training organization for exhibition
  - Training reception and management of tourists
  - Training technique of communication, publication and promotion
  - Training asking fund raising skill
  - Training guide/interpreter

All above training programmes must be supported by domestic training organizations (colleges and universities). Some programmes can be supported by international organizations such as «Cultural Heritage Specialist Guide Programme» by UNESCO/Bangkok, World Heritage Center, ICCROM Asian Academy for Heritage Management and (Institute for Tourism Study). Other organizations in cooperation field also need to appeal to support (coorporation organizations, foreign universities, private funds).

5.2.2 Phase 2 : 2010 - 2015
Phase 2010 – 2015 is an completion period of tasks beginning before year 2010. These tasks are:
- Conservation program and special value promotion is the first study before Great Museum of the relic, including site, management as stipulated and implementing works.
- Building an underground road connecting Citadel and archaeological site;
- Conservation programme and value promotion of Citadel, temporary gallery, expanding the administrative departments of Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre, open destination for pupils, sign, completing sightseeing documents (map, guide), open enclosed services (restaurants, coffee bar, souvenir shop);
- Implementing the first tasks of Citadel cultural programmes (Gallery), short-term exhibition;
- Implementing the first phase of selective demolition plan and starting the planning of the northern and southern parts.
- Developing the spread and communication (circulation of documents for international conferences (printing documents or e-documents), supporting more information on website ;
- Recruiting staffs (2010/2012) and training: Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre focuses on museum management cadre (archaeological site): personnels for security, maintenance, cultural activities (welcome pupils, students visit on special subject, short day exhibition).

The rest which is the works that started implementing from the previous phase (2008-2010) also must be improved: item supervision, visitor conservation and management, spread. In this period, training must be carried out as phase 1. In this phase, it need recruit positions as follows:

- 02 staffs are responsible for culture (publication, communication with researchers, pupils, students, and local people)
- 01 staff is responsible for managing flow visitors (signs, researches on sightseeing map, ticket price, and connection with travel agencies)
- 01 staff for communication and promotion in collaboration with with City tourism department.
5.2.3  Phase 3: 2015 and next

The final phase is to implement management plan related to the North and South of Citadel handed over to Hanoi before 2015.

A series of research and reference are carried out in the phase 2010/2015 to determine major orientation project. In fact, this relic had no visitors in the long time, so it has a specific feature when changing it into urban park. At the moment, some regulations have to be paid attention to guarantee the future of this area, that is:

- Promoting management the centre of relic (Citadel and archaeological site)
- To continue planning the northern and southern part in order to establish close connection on history of the current heritage area is divided into three parts (North, south and centre)
- Creating a space for local people to stroll easily at the centre of the city
- Effectively using available buildings and offices at the North of the heritage site.

At this point, it is possible to remove offices of the Centre at buildings of the Citadel to more suitable buildings at the North of the heritage area.

5.3 Monitoring and Reviewing the Management Plan

Managing heritage area is a flexible change process and will not stop at the time determined management plan. New data, economic changes or idea changes on priority of management can change the targets of proposed plans, at the same time the qualification and experience of staffs of the Centre are improved.

Collecting new information gradually, understanding the meaning and value of relic and contributing factors will still change and impact on long-term management.

Thus, management plan has to be reviewed regularly and corrected in accordance with actual situation.

Steering Committee and Hanoi Ancient Wall – Co Loa Vestiges Preservation Centre (relic management office) has responsibility for monitoring and reviewing management plan.

Particularly, two above bodies are responsible for monitoring implementation process, specifically:

- Reviewing predicted tasks in the action plan and complete each year;
- Preparing reports in which define the priorities for the following years;
- Evaluating the effectiveness of activities to reach goal of the Management Plan;
- Reviewing general goals and strategies in case of changing priority contents;

Management plan defines orientation for a period of 10 years. Reviewing generally this management plan, the limit of relic and buffer zone has to be carried out regularly (about 8-10 years) to predict new context which can happen to the heritage ares.

5.4 Administrative structure for the heritage site supervision

In order to preserve outstanding universal value of the heritage site, the preservation condition of the property need to be regularly checked; information collected must be update regularly into the management plan. Chapter VI of Nomination Profile has clearly define key indicators serving for the conservation monitoring of the site.

5.4.1 Essential indicator-elements for conservation

Relic includes vulnerable archaeological sites, architectural works, buildings in various periods, streets, public space and gardens, each element above must be checked regularly in term of conservation and impact of projects being implemented with these factors. There are many forms of supervision: store, photograph, drawing, collected figure, basis of management figure, legal document, etc. But all documents share the same feature is that collecting into set of data enable to check impact level of projects and achievement in administrative apparatus being deployed.

Conservation of all heritage site

- Satellite images to check the complied standards of urbanization apply for each buffer zone;
- Layout area of public planning items (analysis of investment and processed areas can give out solutions to quantity of improved buildings and public space conservation)
- Figures related to temperature and rainfall at protected archaeological site (to check effectiveness of proposal technical solution)
- Figures related to the number of tourists. That many tourists can affect documents using in relic conservation (air and water pollution) and have negative impact on exploiting tourism (sound and sight pollution). Collecting figures and
kinds of vehicle passing in this area at various time in many years shall create specific view on practical situation and change.

*Relic conservation*

- Summary table on effectiveness and progress of conservation plan of archaeological excavation sites;
- Regular monitoring of the condition of collections (lists available)
- Situational monitoring system implementation (regular check and measure by machine) to keep track of ranked buildings (cracks, spillways, etc.)
- Annual Inventory of buildings/relics under the threat. When minimizing the number of relic which suffers risks, it is the evidence that applied methods display effect.

*Introduction and promotion of the value of the heritage site*

It is not easy to identify the quantitative criteria to check and monitor the success of ideas aiming at promoting relic value, but it still need defining specific criteria, of which:

- The number of opening place to welcome tourist to the relic;
- The number of visitors at each place: museums, welcome centres, archaeological areas, souvenir stores, restaurants, etc. (It is expected that an collecting figure system is installed on visitors in the framework of tourist management projects);
- Conducting the surveys to confirm satisfactory level of the public on visiting relics;
- Collecting figures on quantity (both quality) of publications related to relic.

*5.4.2 Administrative body to monitor the heritage area*

Basic factor to monitor effectively conservation is quality and commitment of all monitoring bodies. Manager of Co Loa – Hanoi Citadel conservation centre plays the most important role in coordinating and supplying new information. Steering committee and Manager of the Centre have to ensure that as quickly as possible complete budget deficit or human resource in administrative apparatus at the present of the Centre.

Drafting *State of Conservation Report – SOC* send World Heritage Centre is the good opportunity to review the implementing efforts in monitoring conservation and check the practical validity of the chose indices.
VI. APPENDIX

Report of *RC Heritage* on preservation and development of values of the central sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long – Hanoi is fully introduced in English with 56 color pages in A4 size.

![Development and Conservation Plan](image-url)
Cooperation program between Hanoi People’s Committee and Ile-de-France Region, developed by Regional Committee for Tourism of Paris Ile-de-France

The central sector of the Imperial Citadel of Thang Long – Hanoi

MANAGEMENT PLAN

Valéry Patin, expert
Simone Ricca, expert

December 2008