

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

> Organisation des Nations Unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

# **World Heritage**

**42 COM** 

# WHC/18/42.COM/8B.Add

Paris, 28 May 2018 Original: English / French

# UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

# CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

# **WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

Forty-second session

Manama, Bahrain 24 June - 4 July 2018

<u>Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda:</u> Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List

# SUMMARY

This Addendum is divided into three sections:

- I. Examination of nominations referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee
- II. Examination of minor boundary modifications of natural, mixed and cultural properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List
- III. Statements of Outstanding Universal Value of properties inscribed at previous sessions and not adopted by the World Heritage Committee

# **Decisions required:**

The Committee is requested to examine the Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraphs 153, 161 and 162 of the *Operational Guidelines*, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) properties which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) properties which it decides not to inscribe on the World Heritage List;
- (c) properties whose consideration is **referred**:
- (d) properties whose consideration is **deferred**.

In the presentation below, ICOMOS Recommendations and IUCN Recommendations are presented in the form of Draft Decisions and are extracted from WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add (ICOMOS) and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B2.Add (IUCN).

Though Draft Decisions were taken from IUCN and ICOMOS evaluation books, in some cases, a few modifications were required to adapt them to this document.

# I. EXAMINATION OF NOMINATIONS REFERRED BACK BY PREVIOUS SESSIONS OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Property	Chaine des Puys - Limagne fault tectonic arena
ID No.	1434 Rev
State Party	France
Criteria proposed by State Party	(viii)

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 3.

# **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.10**

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B2.Add,
- Recalling Decisions 38 COM 8B.11 and 40 COM 8B.13 adopted at its 38th (Doha, 2014) and 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) sessions respectively,
- Inscribes the Chaîne des Puys Limagne fault tectonic arena, France, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criterion (viii);
- 4. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

## Brief synthesis

The Chaîne des Puys - Limagne fault tectonic arena, situated in the Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes Region in the centre of France, is an emblematic segment of the West European Rift, created in the aftermath of the formation of the Alps 35 million years ago. The property comprises 24,223 ha with a 16,307 ha buffer zone configured to provide strategic protection in key areas. The boundaries of the property were drawn up to include geological features and landscapes which characterise the tectono-volcanic assemblage and include the long Limagne fault, the scenic alignment of the Chaîne des Puys volcanoes, and the inverted relief of the Montagne de la Serre. Together these demonstrate how the continental crust cracks, then collapses, allowing deep magma to rise, causing widespread uplift at the surface.

The property is an exceptional illustration of the processes and characteristic features of continental break-up, a fundamental phenomenon in the Earth's history. It is globally significant in terms of its completeness, density and clarity of topographic expression, providing distinctive evidence of the

genetic and chronological links between the rifting features. Densely grouped and clearly interconnected, these features provide focused access to a planetary scale geological phenomenon and its overall understanding.

Criterion (viii): Continental drift, manifested through plate tectonics, is an essential paradigm for the history of the Earth as it explains the current makeup of oceans and continents and their past and future movements. The property is an exceptional illustration of the phenomenon of continental breakup, or rifting, which is one of the five major stages of plate tectonics. The Chaîne des Puys - Limagne fault tectonic arena presents a coincident view of all the representative processes of continental break-up and reveals their intrinsic links. The geological formations of the property, and their specific layout, illustrate with clarity this planet-wide process and its effects on a large and small scale on the landscape. This concentration has a demonstrated global significance in terms of its completeness, density and expression and has contributed to the site's prominence since the 18th century for the study of classical geological processes.

# Integrity

Due to its size, continental break-up creates rift systems several thousands of kilometres long. The property's boundary incorporates all the elements necessary for a full presentation of this process. All the most impressive and best preserved examples are included in relatively close proximity.

The property includes the most impressive section of the fault, which forms a marked border between the flattened continental basement and the wide adjoining graben. It also contains a young volcanic field, relatively unaffected by erosion, exhibiting the complete spectrum of typical magmas in rift zones. Lastly, the long lava flow of the Montagne de la Serre, from an earlier phase of volcanism, straddles the basement and the sedimentary basin, which it overlooks. This inverted topography is a characteristic indicator of the wide-spread uplift which affects rift zones.

The landscape setting for the property's geological attributes has a long history of conservation measures; it is sparsely inhabited, with the main population being concentrated on the adjacent Limagne Plain. The geological features encompassed by the property's boundary are fundamentally intact: they are preserved from urbanisation: the erosion is very superficial and has not altered the structures; and past quarrying activity has affected only a minor part of the property. Overall, human impact remains limited and does not compromises the geological value of the Chaîne des Puys - Limagne fault tectonic arena concerning the integrity of the property in relation to criterion (viii).

# Protection and management requirements

The property has been subject to management and preservation measures for nearly one hundred years, under the impetus of local actors and supported by the State. Critical to protecting the property's Outstanding Universal Value is preventing any degradation to the geological features and

maintaining, even accentuating, their visibility in the landscape. The main potential threats are thus the quarries, urbanisation, encroachment of forest masking the geological features, and erosion of soils linked to human action. All of these threats are managed via a combination of regulatory measures, an integrated management plan, and the availability of dedicated human and financial means.

The property is part of the Auvergne Volcanos Regional Natural Park (IUCN Cat.V protected area) which provides a management framework legally subject to review and renewal every 12 years. The property is subject to strong national legislature which applies to both public and private land and prohibits in particular the opening of any new quarries, mandates State authorization for any changes to the site, and prohibits or strictly limits construction. In addition there are local regulations which reinforce and add greater precision to these environmental, landscape and urban protection measures. Continued efforts should be directed toward engaging with private landholders to raise awareness, ensure compliance with regulations and incentivize good stewardship practice.

Proactive management measures are also applied to the property through a tailored management plan which is focused towards the preservation of the geological features and their clarity of outline, management of visitor numbers, enabling traditional local activities, and interpreting the property's Outstanding Universal Value to the public.

Care is needed to manage the balance between forest cover and pasture when seeking to optimize the exposure of the property's geological features. It is important to ensure the property is protected against erosion and visitor impact.

- 5. Requests the State Party to:
  - a) Continue its efforts to strengthen engagement with private landholders to raise awareness, ensure compliance with regulations and incentivize good stewardship practice, in particular to secure formal agreements with the Department of the Puy-de-Dôme and the Auvergne Volcanoes Natural Park to ensure enforcement,
  - b) Adhere to the proposed schedule for closure of the two active pouzzolane quarries which were formerly inside the nominated area, ensure quarrying operations are conducted at the highest technical and ecological standard to safeguard the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and furthermore to develop and implement clear rehabilitation plans and submit these plans to the World Heritage Centre and IUCN for review,
  - c) Strengthen the level of protection applying to the Montagne de Serre area of the property.

Property	Tehuacán-Cuicatlán originary habitat Mesoamerica	Valley: of
ID No.	1534 Rev	
State Party	Mexico	
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(iv)(vi)(x)	

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 25. See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 1.

# Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.13

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add, WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B2.Add,
- <u>Recalling</u> Decision 41 COM 8B.9 adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017);
- 3. <u>Inscribes</u> **Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica, Mexico,** on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (x)**;
- 4. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

# **Brief synthesis**

The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán: originary habitat of Mesoamerica is located in central-southern Mexico, at the southeast of the State of Puebla and north of the State of Oaxaca. The property is a serial site of some 145,255 ha composed of three components: Zapotitlán-Cuicatlán, San Juan Raya and Purrón. All these share the same buffer zone of some 344,932 ha. The entire property is located within the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. property coincides with a global biodiversity hotspot and lies within an arid or semiarid zone with one of the highest levels of biological diversity in North America, giving rise to human adaptations crucial to the emergence of Mesoamerica, one of the cradles of civilisation in the world. Of the 36 plant communities, 15 different xeric shrublands are exclusive to the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley. The valley includes representatives of a remarkable 70% of worldwide flora families and includes over 3,000 species of vascular plants of which 10% are endemic to the Valley. It is also a global centre of agrobiodiversity and diversification for numerous groups of plants, in which the cacti stand out, with 28 genera and 86 species of which 21 are endemic. Large "cacti-forests" shape some landscapes of the Valley making it one of the most unique areas in the

The property exhibits the impressively high levels of faunal diversity known in this region including very high levels of endemism among mammals, birds, amphibians and fish. It also hosts an unusually high number of threatened species with some 38 listed under the IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. The property is one of the richest protected areas in Mexico in terms of terrestrial mammals (134 species registered, two of them endemic to the Valley). The TCV is part of the Balsas Region and Interior Oaxaca Endemic Bird Area (EBA). There are 353

bird species recorded, of which nine are endemic to Mexico. The property has eight known roosting areas of the threatened Green Macaw including a breeding colony.

Criterion (x): The Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley demonstrates exceptional levels of biological diversity in an arid and semiarid zone in North America. A remarkable 70% of worldwide floral families are represented in the Valley, by at least one species, and the area is one of the main centres of diversification for the cacti family, which is highly threatened worldwide. A remarkable diversity of cacti exists within the property often in exceptional densities of up to 1,800 columnar cacti per hectare. The property exhibits particularly high diversity among other plant types, namely the agaves, vuccas, bromeliads, bursera and oaks. Worldwide, it hosts one of the highest animal biodiversity levels in a dryland, at least with regard to taxa such as amphibians, reptiles and birds. The property coincides with one of the most important protected areas worldwide for the conservation of threatened species encompassing over 10% of the global distribution range of four amphibian species, and is ranked as the one of the two most important protected areas in the world for the conservation of seven amphibian and three bird species. The biodiversity of this region has a long history of sustaining human development and today a third of the total diversity of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, some 1,000 species, are used by local people.

# Integrity

The property is of sufficient overall size and contains the key representative habitats and plant communities of the floristic province Tehuacán-Cuicatlán that convey its Outstanding Universal Value under criterion (x). The three components include relatively undisturbed areas of high conservation value and are embedded within a larger buffer zone all of which coincides with the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. Further protection is afforded by the biosphere reserve's larger transitional zone. The management systems in place address the various threats to the area and establish objectives, strategies and specific actions in coordination with key local, national and international stakeholders to address these threats including any adverse effects of development.

# Protection and management requirements

The property Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica has effective legal protection to ensure the maintenance of its Outstanding Universal Value. At the time of inscription the property has a recently updated Strategic Management Plan which aims to integrate the management of natural heritage with archeological features through a series of interrelated objectives. The plan provides a description of natural and cultural assets within the framework of a mixed World Heritage property and prescribes additional measures for the conservation and management of intangible cultural heritage, such as linguistic diversity and communities' sustainable development.

The institutions in charge of implementing protective measures are the Ministry of Environment, the Commission for Protected Areas National (CONANP), the Federal Attorney General for Environmental Protection and the National Institute for Anthropology and History (INAH). For monitoring of biodiversity the National Commission for Knowledge and Use of Biodiversity and the National Forestry Commission coordinate with CONANP. All these institutions work together with the Administration Office of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve. Ongoing efforts are needed to ensure full integration and institutional coordination across issues related to natural and cultural heritage in accordance with the respective mandates of CONANP and INAH. Both managing institutions are committed to actively working with local communities and efforts to strengthen these approaches are ongoing.

In comparison to other regions, current and potential threats are considered quite low, and the population density is low. Tourism use at time of inscription is relatively minimal, however, has the potential to rapidly grow. A Nature Tourism Strategy for the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve (2018-2023) seeks to balance the protection of the property's Outstanding Universal Value with fostering responsible visitation that empowers local communities. Priority needs to be given to the adaptive implementation of this strategy based on monitoring the impacts.

# Requests the State Party to:

- a) Submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2018, an updated nomination dossier to reflect its inscription only under natural criterion (x),
- b) Confirm to the World Heritage Centre the correct figures of the size in hectares of the areas of each component part and buffer zone,
- c) Conduct a more systematic inventory of fauna and flora within the property and the wider biosphere reserve and Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley to guide opportunities for further extension of the property,
- d) Continue to strengthen participatory governance arrangements which work with local communities in harnessing tangible benefits from the World Heritage property;
- 6. Welcomes the improved integration of natural aspects with archaeological features within the updated Strategic Management Plan for the Cultural Sites within the property which complements the actions set forth in the Management Programme of the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve and encourages continued harmonization between natural and cultural heritage management;
- 7. <u>Also welcomes</u> the updated Nature Tourism Strategy for the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Biosphere Reserve (2018-2023) which seeks to balance the protection of the property's Outstanding Universal Value while fostering responsible visitation that empowers local communities and also encourages

the State Party to implement the strategy including the envisaged infrastructure, long-term impact monitoring, and tourism-related capacity building for local communities;

- 8. <u>Further encourages</u> the State Party to consider in future renominating the property under additional natural criterion (ix) in recognition of the global ecological significance of this region which coincides with an arid and semiarid zone with one of the highest levels of biological diversity in North America;
- <u>Defers</u> the examination of the nomination of the <u>Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley: originary habitat of Mesoamerica, Mexico</u>, to the World Heritage List in relation to cultural criteria, in order to allow the State Party with the advice of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, if requested, to:
  - a) Undertake further surveys, research and documentation of cultural heritage sites in the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley, including in areas currently located outside the property boundaries, related to irrigation systems and settlements these enabled in the context of an overall assessment of the several thousand known sites in the valley,
  - b) Consider a revised nomination, including revised boundaries, based on a broader selection of cultural heritage evidence which is focused on the early horticultural community settlement processes in Mesoamerica, as well as the intricate and complex water irrigation systems which facilitated these processes,
  - c) Complete the legal protection of the relevant cultural heritage resources to be recognized at highest levels appropriate, including the full recognition at national level of the sites presently proposed,
  - d) Further detail the envisaged implementation of management, research and monitoring activities for cultural heritage within the strategic management plan, integrating also conservation and maintenance as well as visitor management provisions, and ensure that this plan is formally adopted by cultural heritage authorities at the national level,
  - e) Strengthen the overall human and financial resources for management of cultural assets within the Tehuacán-Cuicatlán Valley;
- 10. <u>Considers</u> that any revised nomination would need to be considered by an expert mission to the site.

Thimlich Ohinga Archaeological Site
1450 Rev
Kenya
(iii)(iv)(v)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 12.

### Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.14

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Inscribes Thimlich Ohinga Archaeological Site, Kenya, on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii), (iv) and (v);
- 3. <u>Adopts</u> the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

# Brief synthesis

Located 46 km northwest of Migori Town in the Lake Victoria region, Thimlich Ohinga archaeological site is a dry-stone walled settlement, based on a complex organization system of communal occupation, craft industries and livestock that reflects a cultural tradition developed by pastoral communities in the Nyanza region of the Lake Victoria basin that persisted from 16th to mid 20th centuries

Thimlich Ohinga is the largest and best preserved of these massive dry-stone walled enclosures. The Ohinga appear to have served primarily as security for communities and livestock, but they also defined social units and relationships linked to lineage based systems.

The property comprises four larger Ohingni, all of which have extensions. The main Ohinga is referred to as Kochieng, while the others are Kakuku, Koketch and Koluoch. The dry stone wall enclosures are constructed in a three-phase design with separately built up outer and inner phases, held together by the middle phase. Stones were placed in an interlocking system that enhanced overall stability without use of any mortar or cement. The walls are built of neatly arranged stones of various sizes and without mortar, ranging from 1.5 m to 4.5 m in height, with an average thickness of 1 m.

Thimlich Ohinga is an exceptional testimony of settlement patterns and spatial community relations in the Lake Victoria Basin, which documents the successive occupation by different people from various linguistic origins during an important episode in the migration and settlement of the Lake Victoria Basin between the 16th and 17th centuries. It also gives reference to habitation patterns, livestock cultivation and craft practices prevalent in communal settlements at this time.

Criterion (iii): Thimlich Ohinga provides an exceptional testimony to settlement traditions in the Lake Victoria Basin. It illustrates shared communal settlement, livestock cultivation and craft industry patterns, utilized and practiced by several

successive inhabitant groups of different linguistic origin. The archaeological evidence testified not only to the communities' spatial organization but also to an elaborate system of interrelations between the different Ohingni within proximity to each other. It therefore allows to understand and further research community interaction patterns between the 16th and the mid 20th century in the region.

Criterion (iv): The settlements of Thimlich Ohinga provide an impressive reference to spatial planning and settlement types in the wider Lake Victoria Basin, at a period in history characterized by increased human mobility as a result of social, economic and environmental pressures that affected human populations in the region. The massive stone walled enclosures at Thimlich Ohinga mark an important episode in the migration and settlement of the Lake Victoria Basin and sub-Saharan Africa as a whole. Thimlich Ohinga also illustrates an outstanding example of undressed dry-stone construction typology characterized by a threephase building technology using stones of irregular shapes in two phases joined together by a third middle phase.

**Criterion** (v): Thimlich Ohinga, as the best preserved example of Ohingni constitutes a representative and outstanding example of Ohingni, a distinctive form of pastoral settlement that persisted in the Lake Victoria Basis from the 16th to the mid 20th centuries.

#### Integrity

The property includes the Ohingni with their stone walls and low entrances, the structural support features known as buttresses, low water/sludge drainage vents from the inner livestock enclosures (kraals), the three-phase wall design, the inner and outer enclosures, industrial site and house pits.

To ensure the full protection of the archaeological remains, the entire property area, including the suggested extension toward a yet private land in the south, will need to be considered in an integrated management approach. This also applies to the property's immediate setting, where visual integrity depends on the conservation of the surrounding vegetation to retain the traditional atmosphere of the jungle-protected settlement.

# Authenticity

Maintenance work of the structures was carried out over the centuries using traditional materials and Several subsequent periods of techniques. occupation and repair did not interfere with the design or workmanship of the structures. After their abandonment, the Ohingni became ruins. In the past decades, these ruins have now been largely restored, and selected walls have been added to demarcate the boundary between the archaeological site and the forest. This new work is not always easily distinguishable from the historic stone structures. Future conservation measures should be undertaken based on minimum intervention approaches and should continue to train younger apprentices in traditional maintenance techniques.

#### Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by the National Museums and Heritage Act, Cap 216 of 2006 and is managed by the National Museums of Kenya. The legal protection is further strengthened by traditional rules and taboos maintained by community elders, which assist in the protection of the property and its surrounding flora and fauna. The archaeological potential of features located on the south side of the property requires the extension of the property boundary towards this direction, in line with the recommendation by the World Heritage Committee in its Decision 39 COM 8B.8. Likewise, the buffer zone, though adequately extended in southern direction needs to be further adjusted in all other directions.

A new management plan for the property has been adopted in 2017 and guides site management until 2027. The management authorities plan to develop controlled tourism while conserving cultural and environmental values. Plans are underway to develop a picnic site, a camping site and an ecolodge as additional visitor infrastructure. While at a theoretical levels the aims of this emphasize sustainability, it will need to be observed in practice how the anticipated new infrastructure and significant visitor increase will affect the property. It will be essential that any tourism or infrastructure project in the boundaries or the wider setting of the property will be evaluated by a comprehensive Heritage Impact Assessment before permissions are granted.

The property serves as a meeting venue for the community and remains a location for community rituals, in particular in times of crisis. These as well as the community-based maintenance strategies need to be continued to retain the strong involvement and attachment of the local communities.

- Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
  - Expanding the property boundary at the southeastern end of the property near the entrance of Koketch in line with Decision 39 COM 8B.8,
  - b) Defining and legally approving the exact demarcation of the extended buffer zone,
  - Establishing a single database to compile documentation regarding archaeological excavation results, conservation activities and associated oral traditions,
  - d) Establishing a monitoring system based on further detailed, precise indicators, assessment methods and responsibilities and define how the monitoring exercise results can also feed into the above database,
  - e) Undertaking comprehensive Heritage Impact Assessments for any infrastructure developed in and around the property, before permissions for these are granted;
- Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 December 2019 a report on the implementation of the above-mentioned

recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

Property	Khor Dubai, a Traditional Merchants' Harbour
ID No.	1458 Rev
State Party	United Arab Emirates
Criteria proposed by State Party	(ii)(iii)(vi)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 22.

**Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.17** 

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- <u>Decides not to inscribe</u> Khor Dubai, a Traditional Merchant's Harbour, United Arab Emirates, on the World Heritage List.

Property	Naumburg Cathedral
ID No.	1470 Rev
State Party	Germany
Criteria proposed by State Party	(i)(ii)(iv)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 34.

**Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.35** 

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Recalling Decisions 39 COM 8B.26 and 41 COM 8B.29 adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions respectively,
- Considering that Naumburg Cathedral, Germany, does not meet any of the cultural criteria and thus Outstanding Universal Value is not demonstrated,
- 4. <u>Decides not to inscribe</u> **Naumburg Cathedral, Germany,** on the World Heritage List;
- 5. <u>Also considering</u> that, in compliance with the Convention and the Operational Guidelines, Outstanding Universal Value is recognised at the time of inscription of a property on the World Heritage List and that no recognition of Outstanding Universal Value is foreseen prior to this stage, <u>also decides</u> to include the review of the referral procedure and its application for examination in the framework of the next revision of the Operational Guidelines at its 43rd session in 2019.

# II. EXAMINATION OF MINOR BOUNDARY MODIFICATIONS OF NATURAL, MIXED AND CULTURAL PROPERTIES ALREADY INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

# Alphabetical Summary Table and Index of Recommendations by ICOMOS and IUCN to the 42nd session of the World Heritage Committee (24 June - 4 July 2018)

State Party	World Heritage nomination	ID	No.	Recommendation	Pp
	NATURAL PROPERTIES				
Republic of Korea	Jeju Volcanic Island and Lava Tubes	1264	Bis	OK & NA	8
	CULTURAL PROPERTIES				
Croatia	Old City of Dubrovnik	95	Ter	OK	8
Croatia, Italy, Montenegro	Venetian Works of Defence between the 16th and 17th Centuries: Stato da Terra – Western Stato da Mar	1533	Bis	NA	8
Czechia	Jewish Quarter and St Procopius' Basilica in Třebíč	1078	Bis	OK	9
Denmark	Jelling Mounds, Runic Stones and Church	697	Bis	OK	9
France	Mont-Saint-Michel and its Bay	80	Ter	OK	9
Italy	Archaeological Area and the Patriarchal Basilica of Aquileia	825	Ter	OK	9
Ukraine	Kiev: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kiev-Pechersk Lavra	527	Ter	R	9

# **KEY**

R Referral

OK Approval Recommended NA Approval Not recommended

# A. NATURAL PROPERTIES

#### A.1. ASIA - PACIFIC

Property	Jeju Volcanic Island and Lava Tubes
ID No.	1264 Bis
State Party	Republic of Korea

See IUCN Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 17.

### **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.36**

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B2.Add,
- <u>Recalling</u> Decision 31 COM 8B.12 adopted at its 31st session (Christchurch, 2007),
- 3. <u>Approves</u> the proposed minor boundary modification for the **Jeju Volcanic Island and Lave Tubes, Republic of Korea,** namely to add the new Upper Geomunoreum Lava Tube System component parts to the property;
- 4. <u>Does not approve</u> the addition of the other three proposed component parts as a minor boundary modification to the **Jeju Volcanic Island and Lave Tubes, Republic of Korea**, namely Suwolbong Tuff Ring, Chagwido Tuff Cone Complex and Socheongul Lava Tube, and recommends the State Party to resubmit a significant boundary modification for these three component parts, with revisions to clarify the boundaries of the nominated components and their buffer zones, in order that a full evaluation of these proposals can be undertaken by IUCN;
- 5. Requests the State Party to provide to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 December 2018, a new large scale map of the whole of the Geomunoreum component as modified, including all of the relevant component parts, and the buffer zone, and also to provide separate measurements for the area of each of the component parts, as well as their buffer zone.

# **B. CULTURAL PROPERTIES**

# **B.1. EUROPE - NORTH AMERICA**

Property	Old City of Dubrovnik
ID No.	95 Ter
State Party	Croatia

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 49.

**Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.37** 

The World Heritage Committee,

 Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,

- Approves the proposed buffer zone for the Old City of Dubrovnik, Croatia;
- <u>Recommends</u> that the State Party give consideration to the following:
  - a) Taking into account the fact that development outside the buffer zone may still have an adverse impact on the property, including development on the Srd plateau and within Bosanka, consistent with paragraph 112 of the Operational Guidelines,
  - b) Finalising, approving and implementing the Management Plan for the property to ensure that the buffer zone is able to provide effective protection for the Outstanding Universal Value of the property,
  - c) Introducing legislation which limits, or prohibits, the passage and mooring of boats, ships and yachts (except for the passage of small boats transporting visitors to the island of Lokrum) in the coastal area between the old city and Lokrum island, in accordance with the proposed revision of the boundaries of the buffer zone,
  - d) Submit the Management Plan, tourism strategy and maritime navigation regulations, when available, to the World Heritage Centre for consideration.

Property	Venetian Works of Defence between the 16th and 17th Centuries: Stato da Terra – Western Stato da Mar
ID No.	1533 Bis
State Party	Croatia, Italy, Montenegro

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 46.

# **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.38**

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Does not approve the proposed minor modification to the boundary of the Fortified City of Kotor, Montenegro, component part of the serial property of the Venetian Works of Defence between 16th and 17th Centuries: Stato da Terra – Western Stato da Mar, Croatia, Italy and Montenegro.

Property	Jewish Quarter and St Procopius' Basilica in Třebíč
ID No.	1078 Bis
State Party	Czechia

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 42.

# Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.39

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Approves the proposed minor modification to the boundaries and the proposed buffer zone of the Jewish Quarter and St Procopius' Basilica in Třebíč, Czechia;
- Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
  - a) Completing the draft memorandum to provide a formal framework for cooperation between the administrators of the three components of the property,
  - b) Include the entire former monastery in the management plan when next updated.

Property	Jelling Mounds, Runic Stones and Church
ID No.	697 Bis
State Party	Denmark

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 44.

# **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.40**

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Approves the proposed minor modification to the boundaries and the proposed buffer zone of Jelling Mounds, Runic Stones and Church, Denmark.

Property	Mont-Saint-Michel and its Bay
ID No.	80 Ter
State Party	France

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 52.

# **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.41**

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Approves the proposed buffer zone for Mont-Saint-Michel and its Bay, France;
- Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:

- a) Completing the designation of relevant municipal territories as remarkable heritage resources,
- b) Submitting the Management Plan, when available, to the World Heritage Centre for consideration.

Property	Archaeological	Area	and	the
	Patriarchal Basilica of Aquileia			
ID No.	825 Ter			
State Party	Italy			

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 54.

# **Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.42**

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Approves the proposed buffer zone for the Archaeological Area and Patriarchal Basilica of Aquileia, Italy.

Property	Kiev: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kiev- Pechersk Lavra
ID No.	527 Ter
State Party	Ukraine

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2018, page 56.

# Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.43

The World Heritage Committee,

- Having examined Documents WHC/18/42.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/18/42.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
- Refers the proposed minor modification to the buffer zone of Kiev: Saint-Sophia Cathedral and Related Monastic Buildings, Kiev-Pechersk Lavra, Ukraine, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
  - a) Consider creating a single buffer zone for the property surrounding all components,
  - b) In the case of the Saint-Sophia Cathedral component, amend the proposed buffer zone in order to:
    - Ensure that the boundary is running behind the first row of buildings on the other side of the road,
    - ii) Reduce or eliminate the large indented section of the buffer zone on the north-west side.
  - c) In the case of the Kiev-Pechersk Lavra component, amend the proposed buffer zone in order to extend it:
    - North along the river edge to a point adjacent to the northern tip of the current buffer zone,

- ii) on the western side one more block and including territory bounded by Moskovska Street, Tsydalena Street and back to Leiptsyzka Street,
- d) Implement the recommendations of the 2017 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission and Decision 41 COM 7B.53 relevant to the legal protection and management mechanisms of the buffer zone;
- 3. Recommends that the State Party notes possible impacts on the property, which might arise outside the buffer zones, consistent with paragraph 112 of the Operational Guidelines and ensures that legal protection and management mechanisms are available to regulate changes and development outside the buffer zone to ensure no adverse impact on the visual integrity of the property.

# III. STATEMENTS OF OUTSTANDING UNIVERSAL VALUE OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED AT PREVIOUS SESSIONS AND NOT ADOPTED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

**Draft Decision: 42 COM 8B.44** 

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined</u> Document WHC/18/42.COM/8B.Add,
- Adopts the Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for the following World Heritage properties inscribed at previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee:
  - Denmark, Kujataa Greenland: Norse and Inuit Farming at the Edge of the Ice Cap;
  - India, Archaeological Site of Nalanda Mahavihara (Nalanda University) at Nalanda, Bihar;
  - India, Historic City of Ahmadabad;
  - Iran (Islamic Republic of), Historic City of Yazd:
  - Japan, Sacred Island of Okinoshima and Associated Sites in the Munakata Region;
  - Poland, Tarnowskie Góry Lead-Silver-Zinc Mine and its Underground Water Management System;
  - South Africa, ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape.

Property	Kujataa Greenland: Norse and Inuit Farming at the Edge of the Ice Cap
State Party	Denmark
ID No.	1536
Date of inscription	2017

# Brief synthesis

Kujataa is a sub-arctic farming landscape located in the southern region of Greenland. The cultural landscape is comprised of dramatic natural features and processes that have shaped the farming and grazing traditions in two distinct periods and cultures: Norse Greenlandic people (10th to 15th century) and modern Inuit farmers (18th century to present). The property consists of five components, which together represent the demographic and administrative core of the two farming cultures.

Although these two cultures are distinct, each are pastoral farming cultures situated on the Arctic margins of viable agriculture, relying on a combination of farming, pastoralism and marine mammal hunting. The cultural landscape represents the earliest introduction of farming to the Arctic, and the Norse expansion of settlement beyond Europe. The Norse farming

settlements laid the physical foundations for Inuit farming in Greenland many centuries later.

The attributes of the property include the structures and archaeological sites and artefacts associated with the Norse settlement of Kujataa; the home fields of the farms, pasturelands and meadows; vegetation patterns associated with farming and grazing; the landscape settings (including landforms and ecological characteristics) of the five components; Inuit farming houses and associated buildings (listed historic buildings); and a wealth of intangible attributes including language, historical place names, ecological knowledge, crafts and seasonal rituals and activities.

**Criterion** (v): Kujataa is an outstanding example of human settlement. Although marginal for farming, the relatively mild climate of southern Greenland has allowed the development of settlements based on farming and hunting during two major historical periods: the Norse Greenlandic farming settlement from the 10th to the 15th centuries, and Inuit-European farming from the 1780s to the present.

Norse Greenlandic and Inuit farming settlement have resulted in distinctive and vulnerable cultural landscape based on land use practices within a specific ecological niche that could support farming and pastoralism when complemented with the hunting of marine mammals. The specific climatic conditions that allowed two different cultural traditions to develop land use, settlement and subsistence within this extreme setting have allowed the Inuit farming landscape to reveal and visualize the earlier Norse settlements in an exceptional way.

# Integrity

All the elements necessary to convey the Outstanding Universal Value occur within the five components of the property, including key attributes of the Norse and Inuit farming systems. They illustrate different facets of farm types, land use patterns, landforms and cultural histories. In some places, modern Inuit farms juxtapose relict Norse farms, while others are relatively undisturbed archaeological landscapes where sheep grazing maintains the pastoral character of the abandoned Norse farm sites.

The cultural landscape encompasses landscapes, farming and settlement patterns and archaeological attributes.

The condition of the attributes is satisfactory, and while there are potential threats, these are

adequately managed. The integrity of the property is considered vulnerable due to the range and scale of proposed mining, energy and infrastructure development projects in this area of southern Greenland. The commitments made by the State Party to establish legal protection for the buffer zones will assist in improving the integrity of the property.

# Authenticity

The authenticity of the cultural landscape is based on its pastoral character, introduced from the 10th century AD. The archaeological evidence of Norse Greenlandic settlement and farming are found at a substantial number of heritage sites within the components and the form, materials and design of farm buildings and monumental architecture are from both historical periods. The settlement patterns of the Norse landscape are legible in and between the selected components.

Conservation of architectural attributes has aimed to ensure their structural stability; and most archaeological sites have not been modified by human activity since their abandonment. Detailed historical documentation supports the authenticity of many attributes.

Further documentation of the Palaeo-Eskimo, Thule Inuit and post-18th century farming landscapes, including the mapping of hunting resources and sites, will assist in further understanding of the cultural landscape.

### Protection and management requirements

A number of legal protection mechanisms apply to the property: The Heritage Protection Act (Act no. 11, 19 May 2010) on Cultural Heritage Protection and Conservation; Executive Order on Cultural Heritage Protection (approved in July 2016, and entered into force on 1 August 2016); the Museum Act (Inatsisartut Act no. 8, 3 June 2015); and the Planning Act (Act no. 17, 17 November 2010). In addition to protection of material cultural heritage, the Museum Act protects immaterial (intangible) culture heritage in accordance with the 2003 UNESCO Convention on the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (ratified by Denmark in 2009).

The Heritage Protection Act creates protection for ancient monuments, historic/listed buildings and historical areas.

Protection of the landscape and natural attributes is provided by a wide range of laws and planning regulations, including the Acts on Preservation of Natural Amenities, Environmental Protection and Catchment and Hunting as well as laws pertaining to the different land uses within and outside the property, and the Executive Order on Cultural Heritage Protection (July 2016). The Nature Protection Act (Act no. 29, 18 December 2003) provides for the management of landscape values and the sustainable use of natural

resources, including agriculture. The Executive Order on Cultural Heritage Protection (July 2016) provides the essential overall protection for the cultural heritage and attributes of the World Heritage property.

Aside from ongoing environmental pressures (including those associated with climate change), the main threats to the property are mining and infrastructure development, and intensification of agriculture. Greater attention and detailed planning is also needed for the area's future tourism management.

As land is not privately owned in Greenland, activities and constructions require land use approvals from the Kujalleq Municipality or the Government of Greenland. The Greenland National Museum and Archives is one of the authorities responsible for reviewing land use applications as relating to protected heritage values; and the Greenland National Museum and Archives function as advisory consultant in land use project developments, as well as monitoring of heritage values. Any disturbance and demolition of heritage sites is prohibited and punishable by law.

Approvals for activities related to mineral resources are subject to strict legal requirements through the Mineral Resources Act (7 December 2009). Exploitation license applications are subject to for example Environmental Impact Assessment and Social Impact Assessment (each with public hearing and consultation requirements) and must have an impact mitigation plan. The Greenland National Museum and Archives can require archaeological investigations. Heritage Impact Assessment processes are needed for development proposals, mining exploration and changes to agricultural land uses.

The property is governed and managed by a steering group with representatives from the Government of Greenland, the Greenland National Museum and Archives, Kujalleq Municipality, village councils, farmers, the Danish Agency for Culture and Palaces and the tourism industry. Engagement of local people in the nomination and management processes has been well-established.

The management system provides a framework for decision-making, and will be implemented from public financial commitments. The management plan, in which priorities are defined, such as sustainable tourism, local and indigenous ownership, engagement and sustainable development, has been approved by the Government of Greenland and Kujalleq Municipality. The day-to-day management will be carried out by a local secretariat headed by a site manager and field staff consisting of one or more park rangers working in close collaboration with the authorities represented in the steering group.

Resources for implementation of the management system could be increased, and

additional mechanisms are necessary for sustained and direct engagement with authorities responsible for mining approvals and monitoring, and coordination amongst relevant organisations should be further strengthened. A National Tourism Strategy (2016-2020) foreshadows enhancement of harbours and the airport, and the Tourism Strategy of the Kujalleq Municipality (2015- 2020) has a focus on improved coordination and branding initiatives focussing on the Arctic Vikings and agrotourism.

Property	Archaeological Site of Nalanda Mahavihara (Nalanda University) at Nalanda, Bihar
State Party	India
ID No.	1502
Date of inscription	2016

# Brief synthesis

of Archaeological The Site Nalanda Mahavihara is located in the North-eastern state of Bihar, India. Spread over an area of 23 hectares the Archaeological site of Nalanda Mahavihara presents remains dating from circa. 3rd Cen BCE with one of the earliest, the largest of its time and longest serving monastic cum scholastic establishment in Indian Subcontinent from 5th Cen CE - 13th Cen CE before the sack and abandonment of Nalanda in the 13th Century. It includes stupas, chaityas, viharas, shrines, many votive structures and important art works in stucco, stone and metal. The layout of the buildings testifies to the change from grouping around the stupa-chaitya to a formal linear alignment flanking an axis from south to north. The historic development of the property testifies to the development of Buddhism into a religion and the flourishing of monastic and educational traditions.

**Criterion (iv):** The Archaeological Site of Nalanda Mahavihara established and developed planning, architectural, artistic principles that were adopted later by many similar institutions in the Indian Subcontinent, South Asia and Southeast Asia.

Standardisation of the architecture of viharas and the evolution of temple-like chaitya into Nalanda prototypes manifests the sustained interchange and patronage towards the expansion of physical infrastructure. The quadrangular free-standing vihara of Gandhara period evolved into a complete residential cumeducational infrastructure borrowed by monastic-cities of South Asia such as Paharpur, Vikramshila, Odantapuri and Jagaddala.

Nalanda shows emergence and mainstreaming of a chaitya having quincuxial (five-fold) form. As a reflection and representation of changing religious practices, this new form replaced the traditionally dominant stupa and influenced Buddhist temples in the region.

Criterion (vi): Nalanda Mahavihara, as a centre for higher learning marks the zenith in the evolution of sangharama (monastic establishment) into the earliest higher learning establishment of early medieval India. Its merit-based approach said to have embraced all contemporary sources of knowledge and systems of learning practiced in the Indian subcontinent.

Nalanda remains one of the earliest and longest serving extraordinary institution-builder. Its systems of pedagogy, administration, planning and architecture were the basis on which later Mahaviharas were established. Nalanda continues to inspire modern university establishments in the region like Nava Nalanda Mahavihara, Nalanda University and several others across Asia.

#### Integrity

Archaeological remains of Nalanda Mahavihara were systematically unearthed and preserved simultaneously. These are the most significant parts of the property that demonstrate development in planning, architecture and artistic tradition of Nalanda. As evinced by the surviving antiquities, the site is explicit of a scholar's life recorded a monastic cum scholastic establishment.

While the original mahavihara was a much larger complex, all surviving remains of Nalanda present in the property area of 23 hectares comprising 11 viharas and 14 temples, besides many smaller shrine and votive structures, demonstrate amply its attributes such as axial planning and layout along north-south axis, its architectural manifestation and extant building materials and applied ornamental embellishments. Preserved in-situ are the structural remains of viharas and chaityas whose layers of construction show evolution of the respective forms. The positioning of these structures over the extent of the site shows the planned layout unique to Nalanda. The property also retains a corpus of moveable and immoveable artefacts and artistic embellishments that show iconographic development reflecting changes in Buddhist belief system.

Archaeological remains including the entire protected area of the property are maintained by the Archaeological Survey of India (ASI). The buffer zone of the property is sparsely populated with agricultural land and seasonal water bodies and thus poses no threat to the property. The property and the buffer zone are protected by a national-level law, the Ancient Monument and Archaeological Sites and Remains Act (AMASR), 1958 and (Amendment and Validation, 2010) and is monitored by the National Monument Authority (National level) and office of the

District Commissioner, State Government of Bihar (local level).

### Authenticity

In subsurface condition for over seven centuries the archaeological remains of Nalanda Mahavihara were systematically excavated in the early 20th Cen. CE and conserved in-situ by the Archaeological Survey of India. Methodology adopted by the Archaeological Survey of India for the conservation and consolidation of its viharas and temples ensured the preservation of its historic fabric through adequate capping by reversible and sacrificial layers and providing supports wherever necessary. All conservation works and interventions are documented through photographs and drawings and published in the annual reports of ASI.

Historical research should be continued, supported by appropriate documentation, with particular attention to the identification of all excavation works carried out before the Archaeological Survey of India, as well as excavations by any other parties of the property, and the identification of all repair works carried out throughout the site, with particular attention to the repairs of brickwork and the documentation of the differentiation of authentic archaeological fabric and added repairs and added capping and sacrificial layers, some of which are marked by way of inscription of dates on select bricks at inconspicuous locations.

Nalanda's layers of construction, iconography and records testify these remains to be its oldest surviving parts. The spatial organization evident in these excavated remains demonstrate its systematic planning. Temple-like form of chaityas and quadrangular-form of viharas replete with infrastructure authenticate Nalanda's contribution in developing sacred architecture of the Buddhists and residential-cum-scholastic facilities. Its stucco, stone and metal art retain iconographic features that enabled changes in Buddhist belief system and transition of Mahayana to Vajrayana.

Ceasing functionally as an institution (13th century CE), Nalanda's role as an institution-builder is testified by the borrowing of its system of organization by later Mahaviharas of the 8th century CE. Nalanda's system of pedagogy is best preserved in Tibetan monasteries where discourses are conducted through debate and dialectics. Furthermore, universities across Asia consider Nalanda the landmark of academic learning excellence.

# Protection and management requirements

The property is owned, protected, maintained and managed by Archaeological Survey of India vide national level laws - the Ancient Monuments and Sites Remains Act of 1958 (Amendment and Validation, 2010) Decisions pertaining to its conservation and management are governed by National Conservation Policy for Monuments, Archaeological Sites and Remains promulgated by the Archaeological Survey of India.

Conservation and management of the property is ordained by a perspective plan and an annual conservation programme. An in-house committee of the Archaeological Survey of India monitors its state of conservation and conducts need-analysis. A conservation plan for the excavated remains of the property should be worked out for the safeguarding of its Outstanding Universal Value and authenticity. This apart, plans for visitor should be developed to strengthen approaches to visitor management and interpretation. Also the risk preparedness plan should be completed.

The buffer zone is also managed by the National Monument Authority vide Ancient Monument and Archaeological Sites and Remains Act (AMASR), 1958, (Amendment and Validation, 2010) in consultation with National Monument Authority (NMA), New Delhi and the State Government of Bihar. The buffer zone also has facilities to augment visitor's experience.

The Integrated Master Plan of Nalanda should be prepared and implemented by the State Government of Bihar, keeping in mind national and regional laws, to mitigate concerns by any development in the vicinity of the property that may impact its Outstanding Universal Value. And a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) should be conducted for any development plans within the vicinity of the property, which are vetted by the competent authorities, Archaeological Survey of India, State Government of Bihar and Nalanda's District Collectorate's Office.

Property	Historic City of Ahmadabad
State Party	India
ID No.	1551
Date of inscription	2017

## **Brief Synthesis**

The walled city of Ahmadabad was founded by Sultan Ahmad Shah in 1411 AD on the eastern bank of the Sabarmati River. It continued to flourish as the capital of the State of Gujarat for six centuries.

The old city is considered as an archaeological entity with its plotting which has largely survived over centuries. Its urban archaeology strengthens its historic significance on the basis of remains from the Pre-Sultanate and Sultanate periods.

The architecture of the Sultanate period monuments exhibits a unique fusion of the multicultural character of the historic city. This heritage is associated with the complementary traditions embodied in other religious buildings and the old city's very rich domestic wooden architecture with its distinctive "havelis" (neighbourhoods), "pols" (gated residential main streets), and khadkis (inner entrances to the pols) as the main constituents. These latter are presented as an expression of community organizational network, since they also constitute an integral component of the urban heritage of Ahmadabad.

The timber-based architecture of the historic city is of exceptional significance and is the most unique aspect of its heritage. It demonstrates Ahmadabad's significant contribution to cultural traditions, to arts and crafts, to the design of structures and the selection of materials, and to its links with myths and symbolism that emphasized its cultural connections with the occupants. The typology of the city's domestic architecture is presented and interpreted as an important example of regional architecture with a community-specific function and a family lifestyle that forms an important part of its heritage. The presence of institutions belonging to many religions (Hinduism, Islam, Buddhism, Jainism, Christianity, Zoroastrianism, Judaism) makes the historic urban structure of Ahmadabad an exceptional and unique example of multicultural coexistence.

Criterion (ii): The historic architecture of the city of the 15th century Sultanate period exhibited an important interchange of human values over its span of time which truly reflected the culture of the ruling migrant communities. The settlement planning was based on the respective tenets of human values and mutually accepted norms of community living and buildings monumental sharing. Its representative of the religious philosophy exemplified the best of the crafts and technology which saw growth of an important regional Sultanate architectural expression that is unparalleled in India. In order to establish their dominance in the region, the Sultanate rulers recycled the parts and elements of local religious buildings to reassemble those into building of mosques in the city. Many new mosques were also built in the manner of smaller edifices with maximum use of local craftsmen and masons, allowing them the full freedom to employ their indigenous Therefore, craftsmanship. the resultant architecture developed a unique provincial Sultanate idiom unknown in other parts of the subcontinent where local traditions and crafts were accepted in religious buildings of Islam, even if they did not strictly follow the tenets for Islamic religious buildings. The monuments of Sultanate period thus provide a unique phase of development of architecture and technology for monumental arts during the 15th century period of history of western India.

Criterion (v): Ahmadabad city's settlement planning in a hierarchy of living environment, with streets as also community spaces, is representative of the local wisdom and sense of strong community bondage. The house is a selfsufficient unit with its own provisions for water, sanitation and climatic control (the court yard as the focus). Its image and its conception with religious symbolism expressed through wood carving and canonical bearings is an ingenious example of habitat. This, when adopted by the community as an acceptable agreeable form, generated an entire settlement pattern with community needs expressed in its public spaces at the settlement level and composed the self-sufficient gated street "pol". Thus Ahmadabad's settlement patterns neighbouring close-packed pol provide an outstanding example of human habitation.

# Integrity

Ahmadabad has evolved over a period of six centuries and has gone through successive periods of cyclic decay and growth. By and large the city still exudes wholeness and intactness in its fabric and urbanity and has absorbed changes and growth with its traditional resilience.

Conditions of integrity in the historic city, including topography and geomorphology, are still retained to a large degree. The hydrology and natural features have been subjected to changes due to progressive implementation of infrastructure by the local authorities. Its built environment, both historic and contemporary, has been also subjected to the changes and growth in terms of city's population and community aspirations. Its infrastructure above and below ground also has been successively added and/or expanded as the need grew. Its open spaces and gardens, its land use patterns and spatial organization have largely remained unchanged as the footprints of earlier times have not been changed very much, perceptions and visual relationships (both internal and external); building heights and massing as well as all other elements of the urban character, fabric and structure have undergone change in most cases fitting within the existing historic limits and massing although some aberrations have occurred over a process of time.

# Authenticity

The settlement architecture of Ahmadabad represents a strong sense of character of its conception through domestic buildings. The wooden architecture so prominently preferred is unique to the city. The entire settlement form is very 'organic' in its function considering its climatic response for year round comforts for the inhabitants.

The construction of the fort, the three gates at the end of the Maidan-e-Shahi and the Jama Masjid, with a large maidan on its north and south, were the first acts of Sultan Ahmed Shah to establish this Islamic town. On either side of the Maidan-e-Shahi and on the periphery around the Jama Masjid, the suburbs came up in succeeding phases of development.

The material used in construction of domestic building for all communities is composite with timber and brick masonry. Timber also provided a very good climatic comfort and humane quality in its usage. It also was a great unifying effect in developing harmonious living environment with significant elemental control of sizes in its building elements offering this harmonious quality.

The house form exhibited a very strong sense of an accepted type for organising the plan with a central courtyard within the house irrespective of its overall size. The functions within were always typically organised around the courtyard or along it depending on the size of the house. This was essentially similar in all communities.

The concept of 'Mahajan' (nobility-guild) where all the people irrespective of their religious beliefs joined created a culture of society where there was a great sense of social wellbeing and of sharing. This was also observed in other prominent communities of Islamic and Hindu-Jain followers. The community bondage was the intrinsic duty of all people as a response to healthy co-existence. Markets were organized on this basis and all the merchants and traders became part of this, where individual interests were considered subsidiary to the collective ethics and morality. The culture shared thus also became an important source for encouraging exemplary enterprises in the city which helped progressively evolve a city into a formidable place with industry and trade positioning it globally as a major centre.

# Protection and management requirements

Ahmadabad includes 28 monuments listed by the Archaeological Survey of India (ASI), one monument listed by the State Department of Archaeology (SDA), and 2,696 important buildings protected by the Heritage Department at the Ahmadabad Municipal Corporation (AMC).

Monuments listed by the ASI enjoy legal protection at the national level via the Antiquities and Art Treasures Act, 1972, and the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Sites and Remains Act, 1958, and Amendment & Validation Act, 2010 (AMASR). The monument listed by the SDA is of regional significance and is protected by AMASR.

The buildings and sites listed by the AMC (components of the walled historic city) are protected as a zone with special regulations by the development plan of Ahmadabad Urban Development Authority (AUDA).

The Heritage Department, AMC, as the nodal agency for heritage management in Ahmadabad, plays a leading role in the preparation of the Heritage Management Plan of the city. It has the support from all relevant

administrative wings in the AMC, as well as authorities like the AUDA as well as ASI, Gujarat SDA and National Monuments Authority.

The Heritage Department at AMC should be enriched with capacity building and technical capacity relevant to the challenging size and extent of responsibilities of the documentation, conservation and monitoring of the city.

The proposed Heritage Management Plan is an important tool for the conservation and sustainable management of its cultural heritage of the city. The aim of the management plan is to ensure protection and enhancement of the Outstanding Universal Value of Historic City of Ahmadabad while promoting sustainable development using the Historic Urban Landscape approach. It aims at integrating cultural heritage conservation and sustainable urban development of historic areas as a key component of all decision-making processes at the city, agglomeration and larger territorial level.

The effective implementation of the Heritage Management Plan should be ensured together with the finalization, ratification and implementation of the modification and additions to the Development Control Regulations.

In order to complement the Heritage Management Plan, a visitor management plan for the city should be prepared, approved and implemented.

The Local Area Plan should be completed and implemented as part of the Heritage Conservation Plan, with a special focus on conservation of wooden historic houses.

A comprehensive and accurate documentation of the historic buildings of the property should be conducted, particularly the privately-owned timber houses, according to accepted international standards of documentation of historic buildings for conservation and management purposes.

A detailed assessment of the extent and impact of the new constructions and development projects on the western section of the city should be conducted.

Property	Historic City of Yazd
State Party	Iran (Islamic Republic of)
ID No.	1544
Date of inscription	2017

# **Brief synthesis**

The City of Yazd is located in the deserts of Iran close to the Spice and Silk Roads. It is a living testimony to intelligent use of limited available resources in the desert for survival. Water is brought to the city by the qanat system. Each

district of the city is built on a ganat and has a communal centre. Buildings are built of earth. The use of earth in buildings includes walls, and roofs by the construction of vaults and domes. Houses are built with courtyards below ground level, serving underground areas. Windcatchers, courtyards, and thick earthen walls create a pleasant microclimate. Partially covered alleyways together with streets, public squares and courtyards contribute to a pleasant urban quality. The city escaped the modernization trends that destroyed many traditional earthen cities. It survives today with its traditional districts, the ganat system, traditional houses, bazars, hammams, water cisterns, mosques, synagogues, Zoroastrian temples and the historic garden of Dolat-abad. The city enjoys the peaceful coexistence of three religions: Islam. Judaism and Zoroastrianism.

Criterion (iii): The historic city of Yazd bears witness to an exceptionally elaborate construction system in earthen architecture and the adaptation of the ways of living to hostile environment for several millennia. Yazd is associated with the continuity of traditions that cover social organization. These include Wagf (endowment) benefitting public buildings, such as water cisterns, mosques, hammams, ganats, etc. as well as developed intangible and multicultural, commercial and handicrafts traditions, as one of the richest cities of the world entirely built of earthen material, a quality which contributes to the creation of an environmentfriendly microclimate. It reflects diverse cultures related to various religions in the city including Islam, Judaism and Zoroastrianism, which are still living peacefully together and having a combination of buildings including houses, temples, mosques, fire synagogues, mausoleums, hammams, water cisterns, madrasehs, bazaars, etc. as it can be seen in their traditional crafts and festivities.

Criterion (v): Yazd is an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement which is representative of the interaction of man and nature in a desert environment that results from the optimal use and clever management of the limited resources that are available in such an arid setting by the qanat system and the use of earth in constructing buildings with sunken courtyards and underground spaces. Besides creating pleasant micro-climate, it uses minimum amounts of materials, which provides inspiration for new architecture facing the sustainability challenges today.

# Integrity

From the 1930s onwards, several policies were established to modernize the city. That led to the creation of a few wide commercial streets and provision of easy access to "modern" housing. This happened mostly outside the historic city. Contrary to some intentions including those belonging to higher classes, the populations of Yazd, as well as the city

decision-makers, have managed to maintain large zones of the historic city intact, including the restoration and conservation for a number of large houses.

Today, Yazd possesses a large number of excellent examples of traditional desert architecture with a range of houses from modest ones to very large and highly decorated properties. In addition to the main mosque and bazaar which are in a very good state, each district of the historic city still has all its specific features such as water cisterns, hammams, tekiehs, mosques, mausoleums, etc. In the city, there are still many streets and alleys which have kept their original pattern, having also many sabats, i.e. partially or entirely covered alleys, and series of arches crossing them for protection from the sun. The skyline of the city punctuated with wind catchers, minarets and domes of the monuments and mosques offer an outstanding panorama visible from far away, from inside and outside the historic city.

#### Authenticity

Being a living dynamic city, Yazd has evolved gradually with some inevitable changes. However, there are still many qualities which allow Yazd to meet conditions of authenticity, including those related to the continuity of its intangible heritage.

Yazd is recognized as the place where religious festivals and pilgrimages have a special dimension. There is also a lively network of social organizations (Waqf) that still play a strong role at district level, besides those represented by the municipality and the government. In terms of use and function, mention must be made to the religious activities said above. Bazaar is still in function, with addition of a few shops specifically addressing the tourist market. Also a large part of the historic city is still inhabited (with a rate of 80% private ownership). On the other hand, some elements have lost their original use but there are new ideas for their adaptive re-use. A part of the University of Yazd has been established in the historic city. There are also some hotels and restaurants that are operating within some of the existing structures which have been rehabilitated and restored by keeping their main physical elements and minimizing interventions.

This has had a positive influence in terms of authenticity linked to location, setting, form, design and materials. Apart from the changes that have occurred throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century, the property boasts plenty of well-preserved buildings and public spaces. In all interventions, priority has always been given to traditional techniques whenever restoration works were needed.

# Protection and management requirements

The Historic City of Yazd was listed as a national monument in 2005, which provides legal protection according to the Law for Protection of National Heritage (1930) and the

Law for Establishing Iranian Cultural Heritage Organization (1979). The property is also subject to laws and standards for the protection of historic cities.

The management of the property is centralized in Iran's Cultural Heritage Handicrafts and Tourism Organization (ICHHTO), who is the national body responsible for World Heritage properties, including reporting to UNESCO World Heritage Committee, and who coordinates efforts with local and national authorities as well as non-governmental organizations, the traditional waqf system, and the local communities. ICHHTO has a number of policies that underpin the management system for the property.

Efforts which have been made by the local population, in some instances under the districts organizations and social structure of Waqf (endowment), as well as efforts by Yazd Municipality, ICHHTO, and local representatives of the Government of Iran (Ministries of education, health, etc...) have still to be promoted.

All these partners have joined efforts to elaborate a new management mechanism that will allow directing their capacities towards common goals. This has been facilitated by the creation of a steering committee in charge of defining general orientations for the management and conservation of the historic city.

A technical committee has also been established with representatives of the major stakeholders, who will work under the direction of specialized working groups to identify, study, and monitor different kinds of projects.

ICHHTO has decided to establish a specific office (Base) that will have the responsibility to coordinate the meetings of these two committees and to organize the monitoring of the historic city regarding its state of conservation.

The training of the ICHHTO staff should continue specially on relevant conservation philosophies, and the impacts of different interventions on the integrity and authenticity of the inscribed property.

Guidelines for the use, maintenance and conservation of earthen historic buildings, with attention to interiors, should be elaborated in order to assist private owners of historic buildings.

Risk preparedness research should be conducted for the property with regards to earthquakes.

Analytical studies of the Historic City of Yazd, elaborating the relationships between the intangible aspects of each district (including social, cultural and religious dimensions) and the tangible aspects (such as the ganats, water

cisterns and religious structures) should be undertaken.

Property	Sacred Island of Okinoshima and Associated Sites in the Munakata Region
State Party	Japan
ID No.	1535
Date of inscription	2017

## **Brief synthesis**

Located 60 km off the north-western coast of Kyushu Island, the Island of Okinoshima is an exceptional repository of records of early ritual sites, bearing witness to early worship practices associated with maritime safety, which emerged in the 4th century AD and continued until the end of the 9th century AD, at a time of intense exchanges between the polities in the Japanese Archipelago, in the Korean Peninsula, and on the Asian continent. Incorporated into the Munakata Grand Shrine (Munakata Taisha), the Island of Okinoshima continued to be regarded as sacred in the following centuries up until today.

The entirety of the Island of Okinoshima, with its geomorphological features, the ritual sites with the rich archaeological deposits, and the wealth of votive offerings, in their original distribution, credibly reflect 500 years of ritual practices held on the Island; the primeval forest, the attendant islets of Koyajima, Mikadobashira and Tenguiwa, along with the documented votive practices and the taboos associated with the Island, the open views from Kyushu and Oshima towards the Island, altogether credibly reflect that the worship of the Island, although changed in its practices and meanings over the centuries, due to external exchanges and indigenisation, has retained the sacred status of Okinoshima.

Munakata Taisha is a shrine that consists of three distinct worship sites - Okitsu-miva on Okinoshima, Nakatsu-miya on Oshima, and Hetsu-miya on the main island of Kyushu, all of which are located within an area that measures some 60 kilometers in breadth. These are the living places of worship that are linked to ancient ritual sites. The form of worshipping the Three Female Deities of Munakata has been passed down to the present day in rituals conducted mainly at the shrine buildings and safeguarded by people of the Munakata region. Okitsu-miya Yohaisho, built on the northern shore of Oshima, has functioned as a hall for worshipping the sacred island from afar. The Shimbaru-Nuyama Mounded Tomb Group, located on a plateau overlooking the sea that stretches out towards Okinoshima, is composed of both large and small burial mounds, bearing witness to the lives of members of the Munakata clan, who nurtured a tradition of worshipping Okinoshima.

Criterion (ii): The Sacred Island of Okinoshima exhibits important interchanges and exchanges amongst the different polities in East Asia between the 4th and the 9th centuries, which is evident from the abundant finds and objects with a variety of origins deposited at sites on the Island where rituals for safe navigation were performed. The changes, in object distribution and site organisation, attest to the changes in rituals, which in turn reflect the nature of the process of dynamic exchanges that took place in those centuries, when polities based on the Asian mainland, the Korean Peninsula and the Japanese Archipelago, were developing a sense of identity and that substantially contributed to the formation of Japanese

Criterion (iii): The Sacred Island of Okinoshima is an exceptional example of the cultural tradition of worshipping a sacred island, as it has evolved and been passed down from ancient times to the present. Remarkably, archaeological sites that have been preserved on the Island are virtually intact, and provide a chronological record of how the rituals performed there changed over a period of some five hundred years, from the latter half of the 4th to the end of the 9th centuries. In these rituals, vast quantities of precious votive objects were deposited as offerings at different sites on the Island, attesting to changes in rituals. While direct offerings on Okinoshima Island ceased in the 9th century AD, the worship of the Island continued in the form of worshipping the Three Female Deities of Munakata at three distinct worship sites of Munakata Taisha – Okitsu-miva on Okinoshima, Nakatsu-miya on Oshima, and Hetsu-miya, along with "distant worship" exemplified by the open views from Oshima and the main island of Kyushu toward Okinoshima.

# Integrity

The sacred Island of Okinoshima, with the other seven components, comprise all attributes necessary to illustrate the values and processes expressing its Outstanding Universal Value. The property ensures the complete representation of the features illustrating the property as a testimony to a worshipping tradition of a sacred Island for safe navigation, emerging in a period of intense maritime exchanges and continuing in the form of worshipping the Three Female Deities of Munakata. This has passed down to this day, through changes in ritual practices and meanings but whilst still retaining the sacred status of Okinoshima. The property is in good condition; it does not suffer from neglect and is managed, although consideration of potential impacts from off-shore infrastructure and increased cruise ship traffic is needed.

# Authenticity

A substantial body of archaeological investigation and research on the Island of Okinoshima bears credible witness to the Outstanding Universal Value of the property; the

unchanged location of the ritual sites, their distribution, and the still-abundant undisturbed deposits of votive offerings provide opportunities for future research and increased understanding of the values of the property. Existing restrictions and taboos contribute to maintaining the aura of the island as a sacred place. Continuing research on the three islands and on the maritime routes within Japan and its neighbouring countries will sustain the full expression of the authenticity of the property.

#### Protection and management requirements

The property enjoys legal protection at the national level under several laws, designations and planning instruments; protection is also guaranteed by traditional practices, in the form of restriction of use and taboos that have proven effective over time until the present day.

The management system envisages overarching management body, the Preservation and Utilization Council, which includes the representatives of Munakata City and Fukutsu City and Fukuoka Prefecture. The Council is tasked with coordination of and responsibility for the implementation of the "Preservation and Management Plan", which incorporates four individual management plans covering different parts of the property as well as the buffer zone. Mechanisms to integrate a Heritage Impact Assessment approach into the management system will strengthen its effectiveness. To ensure full coordination and implementation of the management tasks, the owners of the property need to be involved in the Council; the representatives of the residents in the buffer zone and of the local businesses will coordinate and collaborate with the Preservation and Utilization Council. The National Agency for Cultural Affairs provides guidance and advice as well as an ad-hoc Advisory Committee. Minor repairs and everyday maintenance are carried out by craftsmen from the local community, using methods passed down from generation to generation.

Property	Tarnowskie Góry Lead-Silver-	
	Zinc Mine and its Underground	
	Water Management System	
State Party	Poland	
ID No.	1539	
Date of inscription	2017	

## Brief synthesis

Tarnowskie Góry Lead-Silver-Zinc Mine and its Underground Water Management System is located in the Silesian plateau of southern Poland, in one of Europe's classic metallogenic provinces. It possesses a monumental underground water management system that reflects a 300-year ingenious development of hydraulic engineering.

The mining and water management system was constructed in flat and technically challenging terrain, a gently undulating plateau at an elevation between 270-300 m above sea level: the difference between the highest and lowest points amounts to less than 50 m. This is unusual in that most European metalliferous deposits are located in mountainous terrain, an occurrence that heavily influenced drainage techniques, in particular. The underground system at Tarnowskie Góry experienced up to three times the volume of water inflow compared to other major European metal mines at the time and eventually comprised a water catchment of over 50 km of main drainage tunnels and 150 km of secondary drainage adits, access tunnels, shafts and extraction areas. This surviving network is complemented by substantial remains of the principal water management infrastructure, both above and below ground, together with directly connected surface elements that comprise essential mining landscape features.

The water supply system was planned, integrated and managed as part of a contemporary underground metal mining system, illustrating how, in a surviving and fully accessible mine context, modern steampumped water systems were developed using mining technology.

The integrated and symbiotic relationship of mineral extraction, mine dewatering and water supply, creatively developed at an early period under the same ownership, sets Tarnowskie Góry apart as being exceptional.

**Criterion (i):** Water Management System provides exceptional testimony to outstanding human technical creativity and application. It represents a masterpiece of mid-sixteenth to late-nineteenth century underground hydraulic engineering, its vast underground system representing the peak of European skills in such dewatering technology at a time when mining engineering provided the technical wherewithal for the development of the world's first large-scale public water supply systems based on the steam-powered pumping of groundwater.

Criterion (ii): Water Management System exhibits an exceptional interchange of technology, ideas and expertise in underground mining engineering and public water supply between leading mining and industrial centres in Saxony, Bohemia, Hungary, Britain and Poland. This led to the creation of a viable underground mine drainage network based on gravity freeflow, together with an integrated water pumping system that redistributed potable and industrial water to an entire region. This technical achievement, aided by the special natural attributes of the property, created a hotspot of industrial expertise in Silesia. The system still functions in much the same way as originally designed, supplying drinking water to the inhabitants of Tarnowskie Góry; an operation devised over two hundred years ago but which

would be considered sustainable if conceived today.

Criterion (iv): Water Management System is an enduring technical ensemble of metal mining and water management, distinguished by a significant output of lead and zinc that sustained international metallurgical and architectural demands of the time, and a water system that ultimately drained the mine by gravity and met the needs of the most industrialized and urbanized region in Poland, and amongst the largest in Europe.

#### Integrity

The overall size of the property provides a complete representation of all the significant surviving attributes of the mine and its water management system, supporting historical and geographical-spatial integrity as well as structural and functional integrity. The majority of the site is underground, and the small number of discrete areas delineated at surface is directly linked to it in the third dimension.

# Authenticity

The cultural value of the property is reliably and credibly expressed through: form and design of mine and water management features, both below and above ground; materials and workmanship manifested by original and intact physical and structural remains; and use and function fully understood through exceptional archives held in Poland, together with a gravity drainage and water pumping facility that continues in operation today. The property's location, and setting, is still pervaded by highly authentic and characteristic mining features in the landscape.

# Protection and management requirements

The State Party has designated the property for which the preservation is in the public interest and which it protects through various forms of legal protection. The World Heritage Centre of The National Heritage Board of Poland cooperates directly with the Management Board of the stakeholder partnership that is responsible for the protection and management of the nominated site at the local level. A Conservation Management Plan is being developed that will further guide protection, conservation and presentation of the attributes that carry Outstanding Universal Value. Continuation of scientific research. documentation and survey is key to sustain the understanding and conservation of the Water Management System, its values and attributes.

Property	‡Khomani Cultural Landscape
State Party	South Africa
ID No.	1545
Date of inscription	2017

# **Brief synthesis**

The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape is located at the border with Botswana and Namibia in the northern part of the country. The property comprises a vast area that coincides with the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP). The large expanse of sand dunes forms a landscape which contains tangible evidence of human occupation from the Stone Age to the present and is associated with the culture of the ‡Khomani and related San people. The landscape includes landmarks of the history, migration, livelihoods, memory and resources of the ‡Khomani and related San people and other communities, past and present, and attests to their adaptive responses and interaction to survive in a desert environment. The ‡Khomani and related San people are formerly nomadic populations and among the last indigenous communities in South Africa. They developed subsistence strategies to cope with the extreme conditions of the environment and developed a specific ethnobotanical and veld knowledge as well as cultural practices and a worldview where geographical features embody symbolic links between humans, wildlife and the land.

The ‡Khomani are actively reclaiming their knowledge, practices and traditions, bringing back to life a rich associative landscape, thanks also to the survival of the last speakers of the !Ui-Taa languages in the ‡Khomani community. The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape reflects the ethos of the ‡Khomani and related San people of living softly on the land and seeing themselves as part of nature, in a landscape where there is a respectful relationship between humans, plants and animals, links them to this land in a unique way that epitomises sustainability.

Criterion (v): The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape is uniquely expressive of the hunting and gathering way of life practised by the ancestors of all modern human beings; so are the simple, yet highly sophisticated technologies which they used to exploit scarce resources such as water, find plant foods in an extremely hostile environment, and deal with natural phenomena such as drought and predators.

Criterion (vi): The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape reflects and is associated with the ethnobotanical knowledge and memories embedded in the !Ui-Taa languages still spoken by a few people in the ‡Khomani community, illustrating a virtually extinct way of life and beliefs.

#### Integrity

As an associated landscape, the ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape is a vast area on the South African side of the Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park (KTP), which is large enough to accommodate a reasonably complete representation of the landscape values, features and processes which convey the special way in which the people were linked with the land. It is also sufficiently large to accommodate the tangible elements of landscape and culture, such as the wide and open dunes, examples of Bushman architecture and the 'lightness' of being in the desert. The archaeological sites in the dunes remain largely intact and the names of important places have been recorded and mapped. More vulnerable are the languages spoken by the ‡Khomani, which are being promoted through joint activities between the community and supportive Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs). In the areas outside the property there are a number of settlements and sites that play a role in the cultural memory of the ‡Khomani and its diaspora.

Residential development, commercial farming and the state-run National Park have changed the cultural landscape over the past century, resulting in severe disruptions of the living traditions of the ‡Khomani San and related families. However, links to the landscape persist and are being re-established since the land claim success. The South African San Institute (SASI) and other institutions have been working with the ‡Khomani to record knowledge systems, language, and oral history through stories. The Imbewu bush camp is situated deep in the dunes of the !Ae!Hai Kalahari Heritage Park which lies in the southern part of the KGNP. The Imbewu camp belongs to the **‡Khomani-Mier community.** Here the tradition of 'veldskool' (meaning 'field or bush school') is regularly practised, affording young people from the community the opportunity to learn from the elders about the plants, animals, and ecological interrelationships as well as the spiritual world.

The property's Outstanding Universal Value is enhanced through its association with the wider territory over which the ‡Khomani families migrated on a seasonal basis, and shared with the !Kung in the south of Botswana.

## Authenticity

The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape reflects the cultural links that a core group of ‡Khomani San people retained with their land. These associations are expressed by tangible and intangible attributes, the former mainly represented by archaeological testimonies, the latter including the ethnobotanical and 'veld' knowledge, and the persistence of linguistic memory, supported now by NGOs and academics who are documenting language and culture in accessible ways. The ‡Khomani have regained symbolic and cultural rights to that land, including resource use and traditional hunting rights in a large part of the park. This

helps to ensure that the ‡Khomani's cultural renaissance and ensures that it would not become a "museum culture". An important element of this is the wider ecological and ultimately even social connectivity made possible by the KTP, including the revival of old social networks to communities in Botswana. The ‡Khomani will not revert to a "genuine" transhumant hunter-gatherer existence. Yet, the continued existence of Bush craft and tracking skills, the persistence of cultural practices like dancing, healing, singing and storytelling contribute to maintain the association with the property as well as the indefinable spirit of "Boesman wees" ('being a Bushman'). Authenticity is further enhanced through the wider context of the +Khomani Cultural Landscape as part of the broader |Xam and **‡Khomani Heartland Cultural Landscape.** 

# Protection and management requirements

The ‡Khomani Cultural Landscape falls wholly inside the Kalahari Gemsbok National Park (KGNP), of which it forms the overriding cultural component and it is also included in the Kgalagadi Transfrontier Park (KTP). Both Parks provide formal statutory protection status as protected areas. The relevant environmental protection laws are the National Environmental Management Act, 1998 (NEMA); National Environmental Management: Protected Areas Act n. 57/2003 (NEMPAA) and National Environmental Management: Biodiversity Act. All archaeological sites within the property are protected under the National Heritage Resource Act n. 25/1999 (NHRA).

On the Botswana side, the property is bordered entirely by the Gemsbok National Park, which also forms the Botswana component of the KTP. Beyond the borders of the KGNP on the South African side there is communal land of the Mier community and private farms. It is envisaged that any development therein would require consultation to avoid negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property.

Further protection is granted by the planning system which is regulated by an array of laws and instruments. Local and district municipalities prepare an Integrated Development Plan (IDP) – a strategic planning instrument which guides and informs all planning, budgeting, management and decision-making in a municipality and is reviewed annually (Municipal System Act (2000)). The 2016/17 IDP for the ZF Mgcawu District Municipality is in place. The Spatial Planning and Land Use Management Act, 2013 (SPLUMA) provides for the national, provincial and local spheres of government to prepare

Spatial Development Frameworks (SDFs) with a 5-year lifecycle - to represent the spatial development vision and to guide planning and development decisions across all sectors of government.

The overarching management framework of the Park provides a well-entrenched set of legal mechanisms relating to heritage, conservation and environmental protection that applies to all National Parks in South Africa. Reviewing mechanisms of the Management instruments of the KGNP allow for updating and integrating provisions and measures to ensure effective safeguard of both tangible and intangible heritage in compliance with the 2003 UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage to which South Africa is a signatory. The protection of cultural heritage is further dealt with in the Integrated Development Plan of the KTP and the !Ae!Hai Kalahari Heritage Park management plans (hereafter simply referred as the 'Heritage Park'), which falls wholly inside the KGNP. The KGNP, acting in collaboration with the Joint Management Board of the Heritage Park and a number of NGOs, provides the necessary institutional capacity needed for the protection of the property. The sustenance in the long term of the cultural associations of the ‡Khomani San with the property and of their culture relies on improved capacity of the local communities, e.g. through the ‡Khomani San Communal Property Association (CPA), to increase involvement in all aspects of management, conservation and safeguarding of the property and on ensuring that benefits produced by the World Heritage property improve the social and economic development of the ‡Khomani as a community, in accordance with the Johannesburg Declaration on World Heritage in Africa and Sustainable Development of 2002, and the UNESCO Action Plan 2012-2017 for the Africa Region. The property management is guided by various management plans: the management plans of the Heritage Park and the KGNP will guide appropriate tourism development within the property. To ensure effective protection and sustenance of the OUV of the property, the management plan of the KGNP shall include adequate provisions for the protection of the OUV and the integrity and authenticity of the property and prevent any potential negative impacts by development, including tourism. The use of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) processes, as well as stringent Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) criteria, under South African law, shall ensure that development, including tourism related facilities and amenities within, and adjacent to, the property, will not have negative impacts on the OUV of the property.