

Limited distribution

WHC-03/27.BUR/1 Rev
Paris 13 March 2003
Original : English/French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL
ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD
CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE BUREAU

Twenty-seventh session

Paris, UNESCO Headquarters, Room VIII
18 March 2003

Only item on the agenda: International assistance requests

Background: In accordance with paragraphs 94-121 of *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, the Bureau examines and decides whether or not to approve requests for international assistance requiring financial support

- of more than US\$ 20,000 and up to US\$ 30,000 in the categories of preparatory assistance, technical cooperation and training;
- of more than US\$ 50,000 and up to US\$ 75,000 for emergency assistance.

The Bureau also issues recommendations to the World Heritage Committee on requests exceeding the approval ceiling.

The World Heritage Centre has received 2 requests concerning preparatory assistance and training respectively. In order to facilitate the Bureau's work, the **Summary table** on the following page gives an overview of these requests as well as the amounts available for approval to date according to the types of heritage and categories of assistance. This table is followed by a reminder of the priorities and conditions for granting international assistance as described in paragraphs 113-116 and 121 of the *Operational Guidelines*, as well as a reminder of the Committee's decisions relating to international assistance.

Action by the Bureau: The Bureau is kindly requested to examine these requests and decide whether to approve them.

All the requests already approved under the World Heritage Fund's 2002/2003 international assistance budget will be available for consultation by the Bureau on request.

Summary table of all the requests presented in this document:

No. of the request	Type of heritage	Type of assistance	State Party - title of activity	Amount requested (US\$)	Amount recommended for approval (US\$)
Preparatory assistance (budget available for approval as at 1st March: US\$ 250,200)					
1	Cultural	Preparatory assistance	Niger – Consultation meeting in view of the inscription of the "Great Salt Road" on the World Heritage List	30,000	30,000
Preparatory assistance Sub-total				30,000	30,000
Training (budget available for approval as at 1st March: US\$ 394,896, including US\$ 79,896 for cultural heritage and US\$ 315,000 for natural heritage)					
2	Mixed	Training	Russian Federation – Organization of an international training workshop for the specialists of the CIS and the Baltic States involved in the preparation of the periodic report	29,390	29,390
Training Sub-total				29,390	29,390
TOTAL				59,390	59,390

	Number of preparatory assistance requests	Number of technical cooperation requests	Number of training requests	Number of emergency assistance requests	Total number of requests
Natural heritage	0	0	0	0	0
Cultural heritage	1	0	0	0	1
Mixed heritage	0	0	1	0	1
Total	1	0	1	0	2

Paragraphs 113-116 and 121 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*

C. Order of priorities for the granting of international assistance

113. Without prejudicing the provisions of the Convention, which shall always prevail, the Committee agreed on the following order of priorities with respect to the type of activities to be assisted under the Convention:

- emergency measures to save property included, or nominated for inclusion, in the World Heritage List;
- preparatory assistance for drawing up tentative lists of cultural and/or natural properties suitable for inclusion in the World Heritage List as well as nominations of types of properties under-represented on the List and requests for technical co-operation;
- projects which are likely to have a multiplier effect (“seed money”) because they:
 - stimulate general interest in conservation;
 - contribute to the advancement of scientific research;
 - contribute to the training of specialized personnel;
 - generate contributions from other sources.

114. The Committee also agreed that the following factors would in principle govern its decisions in granting assistance under the Convention:

- (i) the urgency of the work and of the protective measures to be taken;
- (ii) the legislative, administrative and financial commitment of the recipient State to protect and preserve the property;
- (iii) the cost of the project;
- (iv) the interest for, and exemplary value of, the project in respect of scientific research and the development of cost/effective conservation techniques;
- (v) the educational value both for the training of local experts and for the general public;
- (vi) the cultural and ecological benefits accruing from the project, and;
- (vii) the social and economic consequences.

115. Properties included in the World Heritage List are considered to be equal in value. For this reason, the criteria proposed above make no reference to the relative value of the properties. A balance will be maintained between funds allocated to projects for the preservation of the cultural heritage on the one hand and projects for the conservation of the natural heritage on the other hand.

116. Requests for emergency, training, and technical co-operation shall be referred, if deemed necessary by the Secretariat, to the appropriate Advisory Bodies (IUCN, ICOMOS, and/or ICCROM) for professional review and evaluation, and its recommendations shall be presented to the Bureau and the Committee for action.

F. Conditions for the granting of international assistance

121. The conditions for and types of international assistance are established by Articles 19 to 26 of the World Heritage Convention. Establishing a parallel between the conditions of eligibility for the World Heritage Committee set out in Article 16 of the Convention, the Committee decided, at its thirteenth session (1989), that States who were in arrears of payment of their contributions to the World Heritage Fund would not be able to receive a grant of international assistance in the following calendar year, it being understood that this provision would not apply in case of emergency assistance and training as defined in these Guidelines. In making this decision, the Committee wished to emphasize the importance which it accorded to States Parties paying their entire contribution within the periods set out in Article 16 of the Convention.

Decisions of the Committee

- (a) **The allocation of international assistance between cultural and natural heritage:** At its nineteenth session (Berlin, Germany, 4-9 December 1995), the Committee decided that half of training and one third of technical co-operation would be reserved for natural sites (Paragraph XIII of the Report of the nineteenth session of the Committee).
- (b) **International assistance requests related to the state of conservation reports of the same properties:** At its twentieth session (Mérida, Mexico, 2-7 December 1996), the Committee decided to consider international assistance requests together with reports on the state of conservation of the same properties (Paragraph XII of the Report of the twentieth session of the Committee).
- (c) **Evaluation by the Advisory Bodies:** At its twentieth session (Mérida, Mexico, 2-7 December 1996), the Committee requested the Secretariat 'to call upon the advice of the experts of the appropriate bodies (ICOMOS, IUCN and ICCROM), according to paragraph 102 of the Operational Guidelines'. (Paragraph XII of the Report of the twentieth session of the Committee).

REQUEST No. 1
Preparatory assistance
Cultural heritage
Africa

State Party: NIGER

Status of dues to the World Heritage Fund as at 31 December 2002: all dues paid

Name of Activity: Consultation meeting in view of the inscription of the "The Great Salt Road" on the World Heritage List.

Amount requested: US\$ 30,000

Previous contributions from the World Heritage Fund for this site: None

Background: Although present on Niger's Indicative List since 1996, "The Great Salt Road" is far from involving only Niger. The numerous trade exchanges that it has made possible over the centuries and until very recently had economic consequences far beyond the borders of Niger. Even if their economic importance has considerably decreased, the "The Great Salt Road" routes used by the caravans in the past have left important emotional and historic traces, which justify, according to the State Party, the inscription of this property on the World Heritage List.

Objectives:

The main objectives of the meeting are as follows:

1. To raise the awareness of the countries concerned of the importance and memory value of the "The Great Salt Road".
2. To produce a joint dossier in view of the inscription of the "The Great Salt Road" on the World Heritage List.

Project plan:

Schedule:

Duration: 4 days

Place: Niamey

Provisional date: during 2003

Participants:

* 2 experts appointed by the World Heritage Centre

* 1 participant per country invited (7 countries: Algeria, Libya, Morocco, Mali, Mauritania, Chad and Burkina Faso)

* 13 national participants: 3 from the Ministry of Culture, 1 from the Ministry of Tourism, 1 from the Ministry of the Environment, 1 from the UNESCO Bureau, 1 from the IRSH (Institut de Recherches en Sciences Humaines), 1 from the National Museum of Niger, 2 from the Regional Museums, 1 from the University of Niamey (History Department) and 2 resource persons.

Anticipated output: The aim of the consultation meeting that Niger proposes to host is to enable the countries concerned (Algeria, Libya, Morocco, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Chad and

Burkina Faso) to jointly consider the proposal with a view to arriving at the production of a dossier proposing the inscription of "The Great Salt Road" on the World heritage list.

Total activity budget (in US\$):		34,100
National or other contributions (in US\$):		4,100
- 3 liaison vehicles	1,800	
- 1 pool of secretaries	1,000	
- 3 drivers	600	
- 1 secretary	500	
- 1 office boy	200	
Amount requested from the World Heritage Fund (in US\$):		30,000
1. Travel and participants' per diem		20,000
- Transport for the international experts :1.000 US\$ x 9	9,000	
- Participants' per diem :100 US\$ x 22 x 5 days	11,000	
2. Logistics		10,000
- Internal transport	2,000	
- Miscellaneous supplies	2,500	
- Media cover	1,500	
- Simultaneous translation (French, English)	2,500	
- Production of the final document	500	
- Excursion	500	
- Gratuities paid to auxiliaries	500	

Comments of the Advisory Bodies:

According to ICOMOS, the preparation of a dossier proposing inscription on this theme is an excellent idea which would deserve a good project, for the subject is a difficult one. However, what is presented in this preparatory assistance request is rather succinct from the point of view of the schedule (a four-day meeting). It would be desirable to have more information and better documentation. ICOMOS would like to be consulted on the choice of the experts and resource persons.

Comments of the Secretariat:

The Secretariat supports this request, which fits in perfectly with the policy of the grouped inscription of properties applied by the World Heritage Centre.

Action by the Bureau: The Bureau may wish to approve the application for the requested amount of US\$ 30.000.
--

REQUEST N°2
Training
Mixed Heritage
Central & Eastern Europe

State Party: RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Status of dues to the World Heritage Fund as at 31 December 2002: all dues paid

Title of Activity: Organization of an International Training Workshop for the Specialists of CIS and Baltic Countries involved in the preparation of the Periodic Reporting.

Amount requested: US\$ 29,390

Previous contributions from the World Heritage Fund for this site: none on Periodic Reporting.

Background: In accordance with the decisions of the 11th General Assembly of States Parties and the 29th UNESCO General Conference, the State Parties to the Convention of the Europe region are invited to prepare in 2003 the periodic reports on the application of the World Heritage Convention and on the state of conservation of World Heritage properties. The World Heritage Committee will examine the periodic reports of the Europe and North-America region in 2005 and 2006. For Russia and the former States of the USSR, it will be the first Periodic Report to submit. The section I of the Periodic report could be prepared by the specialists of the national Ministries of Culture, as they are more informed on the legislative and administrative measures taken at national level. The section II would be mainly prepared by the sites managers of the World H properties. The members of the Russian National Committee of the World Heritage visited several World Heritage cultural sites in Russia (Veliky Novgorod, Kolomenskoye, Saint Petersburg) and discussed with the sites managers and the specialists of the Department of Monument Protection the forthcoming submission of the periodic reports. It appears evident that the specialists who will be involved in the preparation of the section II of the periodic reports need more information and special training for the preparation of the reports and inclusion of information into the UNESCO format for periodic reports. Therefore, a training workshop concerning the preparation of periodic reports should be organized. It is proposed to hold the seminar from 19 to 23 May 2003 in Novodevitchiy Convent (Moscow).

Objectives:

1. to improve the knowledge of the specialists involved in the preparation of the Section I of the Periodic report about the States Parties obligation to follow the Convention;
2. to brief and to train sites managers and experts to fill in section II of the periodic report;
3. to discuss the obligations and commitments of the States Parties to the World Heritage Convention and the cooperation with the international community in protection, conservation and transmission to future generations of the World Heritage;
4. to exchange experience between the workshop participants on periodic reporting.

Project plan:

Schedule:

19 May 2003 – Arrival of participants

20 May 2003 – Theme 1 States Parties obligations and role of the World Heritage Convention regulations in the protection of the World Cultural Heritage

21 May 2003 – Theme 2 Preparation of the Section I of the periodic report

22 May 2003 - Theme 3 Preparation of the Section II of the periodic report
 23 May 2003 – Departure of participants

Participants:

- World Heritage Centre, for the UNESCO guidelines to prepare the periodic reports
- Ministries of Culture of 10 countries (Armenia, Azerbaijan, Byelorussia, Georgia, Estonia, Lithuania, Russia, Turkmenistan, Ukraine, Uzbekistan), for national legislative and administrative provisions for the application of the Convention
- National Commissions for UNESCO, for the timetable for the preparation of the periodic reports and participating national agencies obligations.
- Russian National Committee of the World Heritage and UNESCO Chair in Urban and Architectural Conservation, for the information on filling up of the periodic reports step by step.
- Trainees: about 35 sites managers of the World Heritage properties and members of Regional Departments of cultural monuments protection

Anticipated outputs: Sites managers for both natural and cultural sites to be informed about Periodic Reporting

Total activity budget (in US\$):		36,910
Contribution from the Russian Government(in US\$):		7,520
- Conference hall, audio-visual equipment, sets for participants, stationery, secretarial assistance (1 receptionist, 2 conference clerks, 1 typist, 1 to assist with the audio-visual equipment), coffee breaks	4,020	
- Fees for trainers from the Russian National Commission to UNESCO (2 hours), the Russian National Committee of the World Heritage (4 hours), the UNESCO Chair in Urban and architectural conservation (6 hours) and the Russian National Committee of ICOMOS (2 hours)	700	
- Rent of a minibus (5 days) and of a car (3 days)	1,600	
- Collection of documents and translation into Russian (about 40 pages)	1,200	
Amount requested from the World Heritage Fund (in US\$):		29,390
1. Travel		8,100
- Air tickets for trainees from Armenia (4 x US\$250), Azerbaijan (2 x US\$300), Byelorussia (2 x US\$150), Georgia (4 x US\$300), Estonia (2 x US\$250), Lithuania (2 x US\$200), Turkmenistan (2 x US\$500), Ukraine (3 x US\$200), Uzbekistan (3 x US\$500)	7,100	
- Travel for 10 Russian trainees	1,000	
2. Accommodation		18,000
- hotel accommodation and meals for representatives of the Ministries of Culture of 9 countries (Armenia, Azerbaijan, Byelorussia, Georgia, Estonia, Lithuania, Turkmenistan, Ukraine, Uzbekistan), for 1 representative from WHC and 1 from ICOMOS (11 persons x US\$150 x 4 days)	6,600	
- hotel accommodation and meals for 25 sites managers	11,250	
- meals for 1 representative of the Ministry of Culture of Russia	150	
3. Fees for trainers		700
- Trainer from the Institute of Art Restoration (4 hours)	200	
- Trainer from the Management Central Atelier of Restoration (6 hours)	300	
- Trainer from the Department of Monument Protection (4 hours)	200	

4. Organizational - Simultaneous interpreters (2 persons x 3 days) - Equipment for simultaneous translation	960 630	1,590
4. Publication - Edition of 50 booklets (Russian version) including the text of the World Heritage Convention, the Venice Charter, the Burra Charter, the format for periodic reporting with explanatory notes.		1,000

Comments of the Advisory Bodies:

1. Comments provided by IUCN

The proposed request in its present form only deals with issues concerning cultural sites. While IUCN understands the differences in management between natural and cultural sites, Periodic reporting is about the application of the Convention as a whole; therefore IUCN recommends that this request would not be approved until the following clarifications are received:

- (a) Would it be possible to expand the scope of the proposed training workshop to include issues related to natural sites?
- (b) If not, would the State Party consider the submission of another technical assistance request targeting issues of periodic reporting on natural properties?
- (c) If option (b) is intended what is the proposed process to produce an integrated periodic report considering issues concerning both cultural and natural properties?

2. Comments by ICOMOS and ICCROM:

ICOMOS and ICCROM reviewed the request and consider that the objectives of the workshop are well identified.

However, Latvia has not been included in the List of State Parties to be present (see travel). Concerning the budget, the amounts should be calculated on the basis of the duration of the seminar (5 days). ICOMOS and ICCROM question whether trainers from the Russian public services can receive honoraria.

In general terms, ICOMOS and ICCROM point out that following a training request from Kazakhstan, a coordination should be ensured between the content and the participation between different seminars.

Following the comments from IUCN, the Permanent Delegation of the Russian Federation to UNESCO informed the Centre that the seminar would cover both natural and cultural heritage.

Comments of the Secretariat: The World Heritage Centre supports the request for a training activity on periodic reporting. It is recommended to focus on the site managers from the Russian Federation and the neighbouring CIS countries, excluding those who were already covered under the Asia Periodic Reporting. 1-2 experts from Asia could report to the meeting on their experiences and lessons learnt. Furthermore, the activity has to take into account the training provided in coordination with the Council of Europe (HEREIN project) as well as be jointly organized with the UNESCO Moscow Office to ensure appropriate follow-up.

Action by the Bureau: The Bureau may wish to approve the request for the requested amount of US\$ 29,390 with the changes in participation as suggested.

Draft decision: The Bureau of the World Heritage Committee meeting during this session, approves the following international assistance requests:

PREPARATORY ASSISTANCE

CULTURAL (Niger) *Consultation meeting in view of the inscription of the "The Great Salt Road" on the World Heritage List*

US\$ 30,000 for funding in 2003.

TRAINING

MIXED (Russian federation) *Organization of an International Training Workshop for the Specialists of CIS and Baltic Countries involved in the preparation of the Periodic Reporting*

US\$ 29,390 for funding in 2003.