

UNESCO

WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION
BUREAU OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

25th extraordinary session
(7 – 8 December 2001)
Helsinki (Finland)

EVALUATIONS OF CULTURAL PROPERTIES

Prepared by the
International Council on Monuments and Sites
(ICOMOS)

The IUCN and ICOMOS evaluations are made available to members of the Bureau and the
World Heritage Committee. A small number of additional copies are also available from the secretariat.
Thank you



2001

WORLD HERITAGE LIST

Nominations 2001

INTRODUCTION

I NOMINATIONS OF CULTURAL PROPERTIES

Properties which the Bureau referred back

B.1 Historic towns

Georgia

- Tbilisi Historic District 86

Israel

- The Old City of Acre 91

B.2 Religious properties

Cyprus

- Painted Churches in the Troodos Region - Palaichori, Church of Ayia Sotira (Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour) - (Extension) 98

Spain

- Mudéjar de Aragon (Extension of Mudéjar Architecture of Teruel) 100

B.3 Architectural monuments and ensembles

Russian Federation

- The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex 104

B.4 Technological ensembles

Germany

- The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine 109

Sweden

- The Historic Cultural Landscape of the Great Copper Mountain in Falun 114

B.5 Cultural Landscapes

Italy

- The Middle Adda Valley (extension to "Crespi d'Adda") 119

Portugal

- Alto Douro Wine Region 122

Spain
- Aranjuez Cultural Landscape

129

II NOMINATIONS OF MIXED PROPERTIES

Properties which the Bureau referred back

Austria-Hungary

- Natural Site and Cultural Landscape of Fertö-Neusiedler Lake 142

Russian Federation

- Natural complex "Central Sikhote-Alin" 146

Tbilisi (Georgia)

No 1020

Identification

Nomination	Tbilisi Historic District
Location	Region Kartli, Central Georgia
State Party	Georgia
Date	9 December 1999

Justification by State Party

Tbilisi, an urban heritage site, can be considered a meeting place of diverse nations and cultures, where foreign influences were filtered through national traditions and established in the specifically Tbilisian form of interpretation of the imported themes. The capital of a country and residence of successive invaders, Tbilisi underwent a continuous metamorphosis, being enriched in the process and never losing its own identity. The historic buildings of western and oriental influence, the churches, synagogues, and mosques bear vivid witness to the intense cultural and spiritual interrelations that contributed to its architectural diversity and urban fabric, still continuing to sustain age-old traditions of different origins merged with local culture.

Criterion ii

Tbilisi has always been a multi-national and multi-cultural city, where the immigrants felt at their ease and were able to retain their own religions, languages, and ethno-cultural peculiarities, contributing to the process of the development of a Tbilisian mode of life, character, and relations. This unity has to a certain extent helped to resist pressure of ethnic confrontation, being particularly important in the Soviet period.

Criterion iii

The Tbilisian mode of life and daily activities have contributed to a typically Tbilisian spatial organization of the residential districts. Here, interiors and exteriors were connected via balconies; courtyards were the focal points for various activities, often partly open toward the street, creating connections to the different parts of the house and linking with the staircases. All this played a role in the development of an open and communicable type of dwelling, corresponding to the conditions of the city and the needs of the inhabitants.

Criterion iv

Tbilisi belongs to a number of cities which have undergone significant evolution in the course of history, being a settlement, a fortress, a fortified city, and a capital. Having become a capital city, it has acquired cultural, administrative, and trading functions that it still retains, not only for the country but for the whole region. At present, Tbilisi faces the

serious risk of losing its identity owing to major changes threatening its historic district.

Criterion v

The fertile cultural traditions and the continuously advancing position of the capital city encouraged creative processes providing many brilliant artists with equal opportunities. Tbilisi was praised in the songs and verses of poets and witnessed the debut or crucial moments in the career of famous singers (Theodore Shalyapin), poets (Alexandre Griboedov), writers (Boris Pasternak, George Gurijev), and painters (Niko Pirosmanashvili). The city flourished especially in the 19th century with its workshops and markets, bathhouses and gardens. Tbilisi is directly linked with the life and creative activity of Georgian Romanticism, associated with Alexander Chavchavadze, Gregory Orbeliani, and Nikoloz Baratashvili, and literature with Ilia Chavchavadze and Akaki Tsereteli. It was the inspiration of avant-garde Georgian poets, the *Tsisperkantselebi* group, and Galaktion Tabidze, symbol of modern Georgian poetry, as well as an attraction to many foreign painters and poets.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Human life in the area of Tbilisi has ancient origins, and has been traced back to the 5th millennium BCE, demonstrated by rich archaeological evidence. The first urban settlements date from the end of the 1st millennium BCE, and the earliest evidence of a construction is from 4th century CE, a fragment within the Narikala fortress from the time of Persian occupation. According to legends, the capital was moved from Mtskheta to Tbilisi by King Bakhtang Gorgasali and his son Dachi Ujarmeli in the late 5th and early 6th centuries. There is evidence of active building shown by several early medieval churches (Anchiskhati Church, Sioni Cathedral).

Tbilisi was destroyed by Buga Turk in 853, but a century later Armenian and Arab writers mention it as a flourishing town. This sequence is symptomatic, considering that Tbilisi has been destroyed and revived some twenty times in its history. In 1121, after a victorious battle, Tbilisi was released from the Arab domination, becoming the capital of the united Kingdom of Georgia. The period of King David the Builder (1089–1125) marks its heyday as the largest and richest city in the Near East, the period when Lurji Monastery was founded, Sioni Cathedral renovated, and Metekhi Church built. From 1226 to 1230 it was attacked several times and then invaded by the Mongols. In the 13th century King Demetre the Self-Sacrificer commissioned restoration and rebuilding. The domed church of St Nicholas was built in the Narikala fortress, and records mention 65 baths over hot springs.

The period from the 15th century onwards is marked by devastating invasions by Tamerlan and the troops of Safavid Persia, lasting until the treaty between the Persians and the Ottomans in 1639. Taking advantage of the relative peace,

Tbilisians started rebuilding their town, resulting in a number of churches of different beliefs, palaces, and caravanserais. However, in 1795, Tbilisi was again completely burned down, this time by Aga-Mahmad-Khan. At the beginning of the 19th century, Georgia was annexed to Russia and Tbilisi became the centre for the whole Transcaucasus. This resulted in a new wave of building activity, giving the city the character that has survived till the present.

The new constructions were built on old foundations, respecting the urban layout in the area of the Narikala fortress and the Metekhi plateau. Old residential areas such as Kala, Isani, Kharpukhi, and Avlabari were extended into the Gare Avlabari, Sololaki, Mtatsminda, and Vera quarters, as well as on the left bank of the River Mtkvari. The architectural character of the old quarters was changed to some extent: for example, the old *darbazi* dwellings disappeared. Many features such as churches and the fortress were preserved, although the old city walls and towers were demolished in the early 19th century. The residential areas were built with wider streets and to a regular grid pattern. European architectural styles merged with traditional building traditions, especially from the mid 19th century onward. Thus, the city had no equivalent elsewhere in Russia. The Soviet period brought many changes to the townscape, including the construction of embankments and city squares, based on the new urban master plan. In the 1960s the Rike quarter near the Metekhi plateau was demolished, producing an urban void.

With growing heritage consciousness in the 1970s, Tbilisi became subject to campaigns of regeneration and reconstruction. The remaining old houses in the area of Metekhi were restored and new strategies were developed based on emerging international principles, gradually leading to integrated conservation. The first step was often an improvement of the exterior, followed by the restoration of the rest of the building. Several historic areas were targeted for renovation or reconstruction, including Baratashvili Street (1979), Kibalchich Hill (1980), Leselidze Street (1983), the right embankment area (1983), and the Abanotubani quarter (1984). All these works brought public attention to the historic centre, but there were also losses, such as those in the Vera quarter in the 1980s, and particularly those caused by war damage in 1991–92 and the subsequent reconstruction period.

Description

The nominated historic district of Tbilisi is situated in the centre of the city, on the west side of the River Mtkvari. The area is reported to have some 138,000 inhabitants, while the indicated buffer zone has some 118,000 inhabitants.

The site is characterized by a strong relief with dominant features, the Isani Plateau, Salaki Mountain, and Mtkvari River, combined with picturesque and unusually complex planning structure arranged at different levels. The flowing character and openness of the urban layout combined with the natural features contribute to a feeling of transparency, thus harmonising with the general character of the place reflected in all its urban fabric.

Even though Tbilisi has experienced a long series of destructions, the townscape of a medieval feudal city still survives, and a number of historic monuments are embedded in the urban fabric, though most of them dating from the 19th and 20th centuries. In the areas around the citadel in the

narrow gorge of the River Mtkvari, the architectural dominants include Narikala fortress and the churches of Metekhi, Sioni, and Anchiskhati. The oldest part of the city is in the area of Kala, which has retained its medieval layout as well as a number of typical Tbilisian residential houses. The area is divided in two parts: Zemo Kala (Upper Kala) and Kvemo Kala (Lower Kala). This spontaneously evolved area is characterized by irregular streets, narrow lanes, blind alleys, and houses that reflect the fantasy of the builder.

The Abanotubani quarter, to the south of Kala, is so named because of the abundance of bathhouses. The areas around the Narikala fortress have less well preserved medieval fabric, while the Garetubani quarter, on the right bank of the river, houses many significant public buildings. Sololaki is a regularly laid-out quarter, built in the late 19th century on the site of the former royal gardens. On the north side there is the Mtatsminda quarter, which developed on the slopes of Mount Mtatsminda, retaining its Tbilisian character, as does the somewhat later Vera quarter. In the 20th century a series of large public buildings were built on two main axes that were opened into the historic fabric.

There are a number of interesting residential buildings that represent the Tbilisian typology, particularly in the Kala quarter. The houses are built in brick or earthen structures, using plenty of wooden finishes, and are characterized by open balconies, inner courtyards, and various decorative features. The street façades of the more recent buildings often reflect international revival styles. Tbilisi is particularly renowned for its creative Art Nouveau design, which developed from the end of the 19th century, simultaneously with the movement in the rest of Europe.

While the overall character of the architecture of Tbilisi has similarities with other Caucasian, Balkan or Persian cities, it distinguishes itself in various important aspects related to the specificity of the Georgian culture, and the multicultural character of this society. The architecture is characterized by its system of balcony structures resulting from and building up its spatial character, at the same time closed and open. For example, the typical Bulgarian houses (of the so-called Bulgarian Renaissance) do have balconies cantilevered at all floor levels, sometimes in the form of bay-windows, but they always remain closed belonging only to the house concerned. The same is the case with similar buildings in Muslim society. Instead, the Georgian combination of balcony and courtyard form an organic prolongation of the inner space of the house, making it an integral part of the spatial quality of the town as a whole. The open balconies and galleries are linked with a complicated mixture of open staircases and passages as a mutual prolongation and linking of the house and the street. This gives its architecture a characteristic transparency that is not met in other cultures, and is abundantly illustrated in literature, cinema and visual arts.

Some ancient palaces still remain, such as the *Sachino Palace* built by Queen Darejan and King Erekle II in 1719, and there are a number of bathhouses, of which the oldest date from the 17th century. The many caravanserais have unfortunately been lost.

The historic district includes a large number of religious ensembles, such as the 16th century church of *Anchiskhati*, the oldest preserved in Tbilisi, renovated in the 17th century, a typical example of Georgian basilicas. The *Subgevork* church, acquired by the Armenian community in the late Middle Ages, has a large 17th century dome. The other

buildings include the 19th century *Roman Catholic Church*, the *Synagogue* of 1904–13, and the 17th century *Mosque of Shah Ismail*, transformed in the 19th century and damaged in the 1930s. The remains of a fire-worship temple, *Ateshgha*, were transformed into a mosque in the 18th century but are now in ruins.

The fortifications were demolished in the 19th century, but some parts still remain, such as the imposing remains of the Narikala fortress, which dominate the silhouette of the old town.

Many of the public buildings date from the 19th century, and include the *Palace of the Vice-Gerent* (present Students' Palace) with its "Persian Hall" with stucco ornaments, the present *Major Office* and *Opera House* in pseudo-Moorish Oriental style. The *Rustaveli Theatre* was built in 1901 and reflects late Eclectic styles; the *Hotel Majestic* (Hotel Tbilisi) was built in 1911–14 in a neo-Renaissance style with good detailing, and the *National Bank* of Georgia is a good example of *Art Nouveau* style in the town. Finally, the *Government Palace*, built from 1938 to 1953, dominates the area of Rustaveli Avenue with its Soviet character.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The historic district of Tbilisi has legal protection under the national legislation: Decree No 141, 25.02.1975, of the Council of Ministers of Georgian SSR (Establishment of State Protection Zone of Tbilisi Historic District), Decree No 76, 29.01.1985, for the further enlargement of the State Protection Zone and perfection of protection measures. The List of Monuments of History and Culture in Tbilisi was adopted in 1976 and an additional list in 1986.

The properties were in State ownership until 1992. Since the adoption of the Law on Privatization of Dwellings, most residential buildings have been given to private ownership. Part of the buildings belong to various institutions, such as banks and commercial firms. Since 1997 a Decree of the Parliament of Georgia has prohibited privatization of listed monuments. Listed residential buildings that had not been privatized therefore remain the property of the municipality.

While the area has legal protection, it is noted however that the administration lacks the necessary byelaws for the reinforcement of law. Nevertheless, a Special Law for Old Tbilisi is currently under preparation by the Parliament Cultural Heritage Committee, which is expected to improve the situation, and to provide the required instruments for the control of necessary change.

Management

The declared State Protection Zone secures protection of the historic area in terms of urban planning and urban fabric, landscape, as well as the possibility to reconstruct lost elements and parameters.

The Management Plan of the Urban Planning Board of Tbilisi Historic District (Municipality Architecture Services) envisages the following activities: updating the existing master plan, recording the historic quarters, preparation of projects for reconstruction, investments, building of infrastructures, launching of competitions for key areas, and design projects for individual sites.

The management of the historic district of Tbilisi is the responsibility of the Tbilisi Municipality Architecture Services and of the Urban Planning Board of the Tbilisi Historic District. The scientific supervision of conservation projects is guaranteed by the Cultural Heritage Department of Georgia.

The current condition of the historic quarters of Tbilisi, both physically and administratively, are very precarious. A large part of the building stock is in urgent need of consolidation and repair. Many of the recent interventions and new constructions are not in the spirit of the historic area. Even in the case of the relatively few restorations, the results are often not to a satisfactory standard. At the same time, there is lack of clarity in management responsibilities, which raises conflicts between the different owners and authorities, the State, the Church and the private proprietors.

Since the nomination document had been prepared, there have been a number of initiatives promoting an awareness of the significance of the historic town, as well as improving the management of the area. In March 2000, the ICOMOS Georgia mounted an exhibition, "Save Old Tbilisi", which was well received by the press and the media, and provoked a series of positive actions. The Union of Architects of Georgia launched an appeal to the Municipality for improved protection of the Old Town, and the Parliament set up an Extraordinary Committee for the Conservation of Old Tbilisi with the Parliament's Cultural Heritage Committee, in March 2001. This committee is now preparing a Special Law for Old Tbilisi to strengthen the protection and to provide guidelines for culturally sustainable development. A high priority is given to improving the coordination of management activities.

Support given by the Kress Foundation, in the context of the Old Tbilisi being placed on the World Monuments Watch List of 100 most endangered sites, has permitted ICOMOS Georgia and Save Old Tbilisi to carry out detailed surveys in the Betlemi area of the historic town. The Council of Europe Fund for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage in Georgia has sponsored similar studies in Kvemo Kala and Zemo Kala districts (typology, chronology, structural and architectural definition, features, condition, etc.). These have been sustained by the office established in the Old Town by the World Bank project. This office was started in 1998 with a fund of some 5 million US\$, and it employs 20 professionals in 50 emergency repair projects for the restoration of historic buildings in the Old Town. The work is seen as a series of pilot initiatives, and it aims to provide professional qualification and incentives for the work. The scope is to provide an institutional basis for the office within the municipal administration at the conclusion of the project.

The ICOMOS mission noted that while the heritage institutions, built at the national and local level during the Soviet era, lack both the resources and the controls to deal with managing development in a market economy, positive and innovative mechanisms are emerging to redirect activities in the field. In fact, the situation in this regard sounds much healthier than in many other countries in parallel position. Nevertheless, it will take more time and effort to meet the challenges more fully.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The history of Tbilisi records a long series of successive destructions and reconstructions. The last major destruction occurred in 1795; since then the town has been rebuilt, but has suffered from further demolitions and damages, such as those during the 1991–92 war. In the current situation, the city still retains some of its medieval fabric, some ancient monuments, especially churches, and areas of residential housing of typical Tbilisian character. Unfortunately, much of the historic fabric is not in good condition, and the area is subject to pressures from development, illegal construction, air pollution, lack of experienced personnel, lack of quality equipment, and lack of funding. The town is situated in a seismic risk zone, and the Armenian earthquake of 1989 already increased the vulnerability of the historic housing stock. There are no risk preparedness programmes for cultural heritage. Furthermore, there is increasing pressure from tourism; the number of visitors was 85,000 in 1996 and over 300,000 in 1997.

Authenticity and integrity

The historic district of Tbilisi undoubtedly possesses many qualities, partly owing to its multi-cultural society, partly owing to its built fabric, characterized by the open and transparent nature of its residential quarters. These qualities have been much spoken about by writers and poets and illustrated by painters. Despite the many destructions even in the recent past, the area is still notable for its traditional housing stock, mainly dating from the 19th and early 20th centuries.

The integrity of the historic area has certainly been impaired to a considerable extent. Relatively few structures antedating the 19th century remain and many of the existing buildings are in a poor condition. Nevertheless, the past destructions have generally been partial, and the city has experienced a considerable continuity both in terms of culture and in building forms. The ICOMOS mission stressed the importance of maintaining the nominated zones as a single entity, given that the various parts are closely related and contribute to the overall integrity of the district. In this regard, the Botanical Garden, established in 1636, is also part of the whole, even though its rich collections have been severely damaged during recent conflicts and shortages of energy.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Tbilisi in April–May 2001. The ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH) has been consulted and ICOMOS has also contacted several other experts in the countries of the region.

Qualities

ICOMOS notes the cultural value of Tbilisi, recognized in the different centuries, and particularly in its having provided a creative and inspiring cultural context for the development of literary and artistic works of great significance for Georgia and even the whole region.

The existing building stock, which mainly dates from the 19th and 20th centuries, represents an integration of

influences from the Orient and from European countries, which is of great interest. The whole is integrated in a particular context provided by the Georgian culture, which has its specific character and is distinguished from the rest of the region. In terms of architecture, it is noted that while the street elevations of many buildings represent revival styles from the European context, the local builders have used innovative solutions in adapting them into the traditional continuity of the place, reflected in the structures and the spatial solutions of the place. These solutions have been expressed in a variety of ways, characteristically linking the Tbilisi courtyards and balcony structures with the streets and the general urban fabric. The spirit of an ‘open society’ is well reflected both in the old parts and in the more recent constructions of Tbilisi, giving it its transparent and multifaceted character.

ICOMOS is satisfied with the outstanding universal value of Tbilisi in terms of its cultural and architectural significance as reflected in the urban fabric today. This historic town is a result of the meeting of different cultures, exhibiting an important interchange of values over a long period of time (ii). Tbilisi also bears an exceptional testimony to cultural traditions, which have found a concrete form in its urban fabric (iii). Thirdly, the characteristic courtyard buildings and their role in forming the urban fabric of Tbilisi represent an interesting architectural and urban development, which at the same time reflects a broad range of influences (iv).

ICOMOS recognises that the buildings in the nominated area are not in a good condition, except for those already repaired. Nevertheless, the ICOMOS mission confirms that the present development is giving guarantees for the possibility to establish proper management structures. The recent sociological surveys of the population have demonstrated that there is good will to contribute to the repair of the housing. The ICOMOS mission has also attested that the buildings, although not in good condition at the present, can be restored, and that the country is making a serious effort to build up the necessary resources for this purpose.

Comparative analysis

The development of the Georgian culture can be traced in the region ranging from Vardzia-Khertvisi to Mtskheta and Tbilisi, the successive capitals of the kingdom, coinciding with the valley of the Kura (Mtkvari) River from the southwest towards the Caspian Sea in the east. This culture has its own particular identity, reflecting influences from the East and the West. It is this Georgian culture that gives a particular flavour to the Tbilisian urban fabric and is at the origin of a type of construction that reflects a specific type of openness and transparency in its structure, while the details recall the architecture of a much broader region ranging from the Balkans and the Black Sea to Iran and Turkey.

The State Party has provided a comparative analysis with other cities of similar cultural significance, giving birth to interesting cultural phenomena, ie, cities bearing genuinely Asiatic and European spirit. This comparison has been verified and integrated by ICOMOS, consulting experts in the other countries of the region. Culturally, the closest comparison could be Baku (WH List in 2000) in Azerbaijan, though the architecture of Tbilisi is different in its character. The vernacular structures of Plovdiv, Tirnovo, Nesebre and Melnik represent a parallel phenomenon in the Bulgarian National Revival in the 18th–19th centuries. Tbilisi also has

affinity with the urban housing in Turkey and Greece, where one can detect similar balcony structures particularly in rural areas and in monastic complexes. Furthermore, especially the street elevations of buildings in Tbilisi represent similar stylistic features with contemporary European architecture, and the town offers a good choice of interesting Art Nouveau architecture and interiors, dating from the end of the 19th and early 20th centuries.

From the comparison emerges that the particular cultural context, the Georgian culture and the influences from the East and the West, which characterize Tbilisi, gives it its own specificity, which is not found elsewhere. The historic town of Tbilisi is characterised as a truly multicultural entity, which has been able to merge the different influences in a creative and innovative manner, forming an entity with a strong cultural and historical identity. It is only regretted that the physical condition of this heritage is in poor state, but it is noted that most other cities with similar character would not be in a better state.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

ICOMOS recognises the outstanding universal value of Tbilisi, but recommends that the State Party continue the efforts already initiated for the safeguarding of the historic city, and to provide the necessary planning instruments required for appropriate conservation and the control of change in the historic town as a condition for the inscription. ICOMOS also urges the international community to make every effort to assist in this significant undertaking.

Brief description

The historic centre of Tbilisi, the capital of Georgia, represents a long historical evolution from the Middle Ages till the present. Having much suffered in its history, the current fabric of the town dates mainly from the 19th and 20th centuries, though it also includes older monuments, such as the many religious ensembles, the bath houses and the Narikala Fortress. The open balconies and courtyards of the typical building types integrate with the urban fabric, giving it a particular transparency reflecting the Georgian culture and the open and multicultural society of Tbilisi.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That the site be deferred subject to establishment of an appropriate legal framework, the management structures and guidelines for the rehabilitation, restoration and control of change in the proposed nomination area.

Bureau Recommendation

The Bureau decided that the nomination of the Tbilisi Historic District be *referred back*, to allow ICOMOS time to study the recently received additional information, including a comparative study for the historic district. Should this study meet the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines*, in the view of ICOMOS, the Advisory Body will then formulate its recommendation for the extraordinary Bureau in December 2001.

Acre (Israel)

No 1042

Identification

Nomination	The Old City of Acre
Location	Western Galilee
State Party	Israel
Date	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

During its existence, Acre has been a unique example of the symbiosis between different cultures and values. Its geographical position made it a meeting point between east and west. The fact that various cultures struggled for control over the city ensured that all parties were exposed to each other's influence.

Acre's uniqueness becomes apparent when examining the Crusader city. The Crusaders brought European building technology with them to the Holy Land whilst utilizing local materials. They built in accordance with various needs that were dictated by the city's geographical position. Their relationship with the place and the local population led to the development of the hybrid city of its period, of which no comparable example exists in Europe

Crusader Acre evolved for 200 years, reaching the peak of its importance on a world scale at the time when it was the capital city of the Crusaders, and a main entrance for many visitors to the Holy Land. Another example of the city's uniqueness may be found in the way that Crusader Acre eventually played a role in Ottoman plans for building. After the Mamelukes captured the city they attempted to bury the original city. However, during rebuilding in the 18th century, the original Crusader buildings were used as foundations for the new buildings, thus keeping the basic Crusader city plan.

Criterion ii

Acre is a living witness to the existence of two now extinct cultures – those of the Crusaders in the Holy Land and of the Ottomans. A Crusader city for pilgrims such as Acre could only exist in the Holy Land. As things developed in the region, Acre became the second most important city in the country after Jerusalem.

Since Acre was the capital of the second Crusader kingdom it offers today unique evidence of the highly particular lifestyle of the Crusaders, which lasted for a relatively short period in history before disappearing. The crux of this evidence of culture and life style is to be found in the lower level of the city in the multitude of

archaeological remains, preserved in superb condition for hundreds of years.

It is enough to walk around old Acre of today in order to get a constant sense of Ottoman culture because of the unusual degree to which its lifestyle has been preserved within the city walls and due to its geographical location. This happened despite the fact that changes in the socio-economic conditions led the wealthy classes to leave the city.

Criterion iii

Acre demonstrated settlement and utilization of available land by great masses of people by military means, for a specific religious purpose. This was not in fact settlement for its own sake but in order to provide a stepping stone on the way to Jerusalem. Thus the city was a mixture of garrison and way station. This manner of settlement as part of a historical process over a short period of time is unique.

The Crusaders created a new culture in the land which did not seek either to perpetuate its influence on local culture or to absorb the influence of local culture. Thus in a moment Crusader Acre ceased to exist as soon as it was captured by the Mamelukes and the Crusades were over. There was no continuity of the special life style that had existed until that point.

Criterion v

Acre is directly connected with a number of important historical world events, and also to the Baha'i faith.

In 1189 the Crusaders under King Guy de Lusignan laid siege to Acre in a two-year operation that went unparalleled in the tales of medieval wars of both the Christian and Muslim worlds. Salah-A-Din, Richard the Lion Heart, and Philippe II all participated in the war and Acre surrendered to the Crusader forces on 12 July 1191. Acre experienced its golden age as the capital of the Second Crusader kingdom from 1191 to 1291. It stood at a junction of international routes and was a trading centre between Europe and Asia. In 1291 the city was finally captured by the Moslems and systematically destroyed on the orders of Sultan El Ashraf.

In 1799 Acre became world-famous owing to the failure of Napoleon's army to capture the city after laying siege to it for a long time. The city's defenders, with the active aid of the English, managed to repel the French forces, forcing them to withdraw. "Tel Akko," previously called "King Richard Hill," was renamed "Tel Napoleon." The failure of the siege of Acre marked a turning point in Napoleon's career.

In 1868 the Baha'ullah arrived in Acre as a prisoner of the Ottoman Empire. He spent the remaining 24 years of his life in the city, first imprisoned in the city's fortress and later kept under house arrest in a small building in the alleyways of the old city. During his sojourn in Acre, the Baha'ullah wrote his most important work, setting out the laws and precepts to be observed by Baha'i adherents. He was freed towards the end of 1870 and went to live on a nearby estate outside the walls of the city. He died in 1892, his remains were buried on the estate, and to this day his tomb is the holiest shrine of the Baha'i.

During the British mandate in Palestine nine freedom fighters from the resistance were executed in the Gallows Room, part of the British prison occupying the citadel.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

History and Description

History

Ancient Acre was situated on Tel Akko (or Tel El Fukhar), about 2.5km to the east of the location of the old city. Settlement at the tell appears to have began during the Early Bronze Age (*c* 3000 BCE). Around 1900 BCE the town was fortified by a high earthen rampart with a brick gateway facing the direction of the sea.

Acre was founded on the peninsula during the Hellenistic period (3rd–2nd centuries BCE) and named Ptolemaeus after the name of its founder, Ptolemy II of Egypt. There are still traces of fortifications, a wall, and tower from this period. Acre was a centre for international trade because of its strategic position and its natural port.

The city fell to the Roman conquest of the land of Israel and in the 1st century CE it was granted the status of *colonia*. The first Christian pilgrims passed through Acre on their way to Jerusalem. In 330, during the Byzantine period, the land of Israel passed into the control of the Eastern Roman Empire. This was a time of economic and demographic expansion, when hundreds of churches and monasteries were established all over the Holy Land. The larger cities expanded and were encircled by new fortification systems; Acre retained its status as the principal port of the land of Israel.

During the early Arab period (638–1099), many of the country's cities were abandoned and destroyed. Acre decreased in importance as an international port and the city limits were reduced to include several quarters around the port, where a Moslem naval fleet was stationed. Acre began its economic recovery during the 10th and 11th centuries and the port and city walls were rebuilt.

The Crusader period began for Acre in 1104, some five years after the fall of Jerusalem. Baldwin I, King of Jerusalem, and the Genoese commercial fleet cooperated in laying siege to Acre from land and sea until the city fell to the Crusaders. A new and special model of settlement evolved, characterized by defined and autonomous quarters. The king settled in the northern part of the city, where he built a fortified palace.

Genoese, Venetian, and Pisan merchants built autonomous quarters nearby the port. The military orders installed themselves nearby – the Hospitallers in the north of the city to the west of the palace, the Templars in the southwest of the city, and the German Knights close to the eastern wall of the wall. Other important quarters included those of the Patriarch (in which the Church of the Holy Cross, Acre's main cathedral, was built), the French merchants (the Provençal quarter), and the English merchants. Moslem and Jewish merchants also settled in the city.

Many public buildings were erected – fortified buildings, churches, bathhouses, bakeries, courts and hostels for pilgrims and merchants, covered markets – and also private

dwellings. During the two centuries of Crusader rule Acre developed into a wealthy and thriving trading city. It symbolized the interchange between the eastern and western cultures better than any other city.

In 1187, after the debacle at Hattin and the destruction of the Crusader army, the Moslems captured the whole of the land of Israel and Acre was held for four years. It was not until 1191 that the Third Crusade led by Richard the Lion Heart led to the recapture of Acre and the shores of northern Israel. A second Crusader kingdom was established with Acre as its capital, since the Crusaders were not able to retake Jerusalem.

From 1191 to 1291 the second Crusader Kingdom expanded its borders. New neighbourhoods such as Monmizar to the north were built and Acre was given a new double city wall. More palaces, churches, and public buildings were erected, at a time when styles in the west were changing from Romanesque to Gothic. This change in style was put into practice in Acre and recent excavations have revealed buildings that reflect the transition between styles and the initial establishment of the Gothic style in the 13th century.

The Mameluke period (named after the Moslem rulers of Egypt) began in 1291 with the conquest of Acre and continued until 1517. The city was destroyed and totally abandoned, with only a few buildings remaining around the port.

During the Ottoman period (1517–1917) Acre was described by pilgrims and merchants who visited it in the 16th and 17th centuries as a deserted ghost town, with some structures from the Crusader period still standing, some jutting out of the earth, and others buried. Reconstruction did not begin until the middle of the 18th century, under Daher El Amar, who renewed the port, manned it with officials and merchants, built a palace for himself, and rebuilt the fortifications.

The building of Ottoman Acre in the 18th and 19th centuries buried the remains of the Crusader city, thereby preserving the Crusader remains. In 1799 Acre attained world fame after Napoleon failed to capture the city, under the command of its Turkish ruler Ahmed El Jazar, after a long siege.

Acres enjoyed renewed economic expansion in the 19th century. Mosques, bathhouses, and caravanserai were built. Wealthy merchants settled there, building grand mansions in the eastern Neo-Classical style of the end of the 19th century.

In 1868 Baha'ullah, founder of the Baha'i faith, arrived in Acre as a prisoner of the Ottoman Empire. He spent the remaining 24 years of his life in the city, first imprisoned in the city's fortress and later under house arrest in a small building in the alleyways of the old city. During his sojourn in Acre, the Baha'ullah wrote his most important work, setting out the laws and precepts to be observed by Baha'i adherents. The Baha'ullah was freed towards the end of 1870 and went to live on a nearby estate outside the walls of the city. He died in 1892, his remains were buried on the estate, and to this day his tomb is the holiest shrine of the Baha'i.

After capturing Acre in 1918 and being given control of Palestine by mandate of the League of Nations, the British

used the fortress as a prison. Several leading Jewish settlers were imprisoned there, and hangings also took place. The British developed the city outside the boundaries of the walls, constructing dwellings and administrative buildings. However, they did nothing to alter the fabric of life within the walls of the old city. The port fell into disuse as the nearby modern port of Haifa superseded it.

During Israel's war of independence the Jews captured Acre on 16 May 1948. At first only a few Moslem residents remained in the old city, but after the fighting had died down many Palestinian Arab refugees from other places began to arrive and settle in the old city, whilst many Jews settled in the new sections. At the present time the five thousand inhabitants of the walled city are exclusively Arab and some 80% are migrants from other parts of Israel.

Description

The built city comprises two levels:

The Crusader city, mainly subterranean remains, partly revealed and in a very good state of preservation – wall, quarters (Hospitaller, Genoese, Pisan, Venetian, *Burgus Novos*, etc), open and covered streets, monuments, drainage tunnels, systems of hideaway passages, shops, and dwellings.

The Ottoman city, built over the ruins of the Crusader city, using the earlier structures as foundations and thereby helping in the preservation of the remains of the Crusader city and its outline. The Ottoman city is characterized by its narrow alleyways, monuments, and inhabited dwellings with inner courtyards.

The *system of fortifications* comprises the city walls, gates, towers, and moat. The walls were built in stages between 1750 and 1840. They include the ruins of the Daher-El-Umar's wall (built 1750–51) and its Lion Gate, the El-Jazar wall, and the city gates (the Landward Gate, built by El Jazar, the Seaward Gate, and two entrances in the northern walls opened in 1910).

Two elements of the *water-supply system* survive: the remains of the water aqueduct, built by either Dahar El Umar or El Jazar, which brought water from the Kabri fountain to the city and supplied it to the bathhouses and the public fountain, and a reservoir constructed of five Ottoman barrel vaults.

There are several noteworthy *tombs of sheikhs and cemeteries*, including the Nebi Tzalah Tomb in the cemetery near the eastern wall, the Sheikh Yanis Tomb inside a room in a southern wall of the Jabhanee opposite to the Jazar mosque, the Sheikh Ana'am Tomb built in 1807–08 by Suliman Pecha, the Sheikh Az A-Dean Tomb north of the wall by the sea (traditionally considered to be the tomb of Dahar El-Amar), and three cemeteries – the Muzoleom, a cemetery behind Hann-Shuni, and the cemetery of St George's Church.

Acre has four historic *churches*: St John's Church, built in 1737 by the Franciscans, probably on top of the Crusader St Andrew's Church and now used by the Roman Catholic community; the Maronite Church; St Andrew's Church, apparently built on top of the Crusader St Anne's Church and now used by the Greek Catholic Church; and St

George's Church, one of the most ancient in Acre and referred to in 17th century pilgrims' description as St Nicholas's Church (it is constructed on Crusader cross-vaults, which matches the description of St Lawrence's Church).

There are eight *mosques* within the nominated old city of Acre. The El-Jazar mosque, built in 1781 by El-Jazar, on the remains of the Holy Cross Cathedral, is one of the most important mosques in the country. It comprises religious institutions and a famous library. El-Jazar, Suliman Pecha, and their families are buried in the courtyard. The El-Zaituna mosque was built in 1745 by Husain Abed Elhadi. What are believed to be remains of the Hospitallers' Church are incorporated in its structure. The Snan-Basha mosque was built in 1806–7 by Suliman Pecha above the remains of the mosque built by Snan-Basha in the 16th century. The Elmualic mosque was originally a synagogue of the Jewish community in Acre and was converted into a mosque by Dahir El-Amar in 1746. Like most of the mosques in Acre it overlies Crusader remnants: this is also the case of the A-Ramal (1704) and A-Magdala (1710) mosques. The Shazalia mosque was built in 1862 by the Sheikh Ali Nur A-Dean El-Yasruti, founder of the Shazalia cult, whose body and those of his family are buried nearby. Also of importance is the El Burg' mosque, located near the wall at the Lion Gate.

Other fine examples of Moslem architecture in Acre are two *bathhouses*: the large Hammam El-Basha built by El-Jazar in the 18th century, apparently on top of an ancient bathhouse, and the small Hammam built by Dahir El-Amar in the 18th century and in continuous use until the 1940s.

Among the historic *khans* (caravanserai) are Khan El Umdan, built in 1784 by El-Jazar; Khan El-Farang', built in the 16th century by French merchants in the central courtyard of the Crusader-period Venetian quarter; Khan A-Sha'ardee, built in the 18th century by Dahir El-Amar; Burg' El-Sultan, a Crusader tower, reconstructed for use by the Mamelukes and later incorporated into the khan; the Donkeys Khan, built in 1810 and ruined by an explosion at an ammunition depot; and Khan A-Shune, built in the period of Dahir El-Amar over the remains of the Pisan quarter.

Two *Baha'i holy sites* are also in the area of the old city nominated for inscription: the Jabotinsky Tower and the Abud House.

There are two *markets*: the Turkish Bazaar (El-Jazar Market) and Shuk El-Abyad (the White Market), built by Dahir El-Amar and reconstructed in 1817 by Suliman Pecha after a fire.

The main *Government Building* is the Citadel, which was the Ottoman governors' palace and a prison during the British Mandate. It was built over the citadel of the Hospitallers, which includes the Knights' Halls, the Grand Munier, the Crypt, the "Beautiful Hall," and the courtyard. The Seraya is thought to have functioned as a courthouse during the Ottoman period

The urban structure of contemporary Acre is based on the following fundamental factors:

- Acre's geographical position on a natural bay was a significant reason for its development as a port. Being located on a peninsula with its limits defined by its walls

and by the sea that defined its boundaries dictated the need for dense building, a characteristic feature of medieval cities.

- The Crusader city was built in clearly defined quarters.
- The Ottoman city blended with the Crusader remains, using them as foundations. It is characterized by its layout of blocks and buildings set around inner yards.

At first glance, Acre's winding streets and blocks of buildings appear to have grown in an unplanned way: it is difficult to perceive any particular order according to which the city might have been arranged. It was, however, carefully laid out: it is arranged around two complementary hierarchies, the hierarchy of areas of transit and the hierarchy of built areas and blocks of buildings.

The built areas consist of quarters, blocks of buildings, individual buildings, and apartments. Apartment dwellings form blocks set around inner courtyards, the blocks forming larger blocks and quarters.

The boundary of every built component of the city is defined by some kind of wall.

- At city level by fortified walls that surround the old city in its entirety, detaching it and cutting it off from anything outside.
- At block level by uninterrupted stone fascias at ground level which constitute a "wall."
- At larger block level by the formation of inner courtyards.

The urban characteristic of Acre is one of looking inwards and containment, reflecting the role of the home in traditional Moslem society. The facades of buildings serve to separate the home from the street, thereby protecting the inhabitants. Upper floors were built on at a later stage and clearly reflect western influence, with less closure and containment, reflected in large picture windows and balconies.

The areas of transit are also arranged according to hierarchy, following the same hierachic principle as in built areas – division and gradual passage:

- Main thoroughfares running between the city churches and public centres and the perimeter route running parallel to the city walls.
- Alleyways leading from the main thoroughfares into the built-up masses of dwellings and circular alleyways that encompass the blocks.
- Secondary cul-de-sac alleyways that run into the blocks, usually as far as the inner courtyards and sometimes connecting with another thoroughfare.

The large blocks are set around inner courtyards, giving the impression from outside that they are built very densely and closed. Within, the courtyards form intimate empty spaces that allow access to fresh air and sunlight. Inner courtyards are found in a number of styles: at ground level, open to the sky; at ground level, but covered; set on roofs. They fulfil a number of roles: they may serve a single apartment or dwelling, they may serve as nuclei for a number of buildings grouped together into a block, or they may be located between blocks. The courtyards are part of

the typological and morphological characteristics of the city's construction.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The old city of Acre is designated an antiquity site under the provisions of the 1978 Antiquities Law. Article 29.a prohibits any of the following activities without the written approval of the Director of the Israel Antiquities Authority:

- building, paving, the erection of installations, quarrying, mining, drilling, flooding, the clearing away of stones, ploughing, planting, or interment;
- the dumping of earth, manure, waste, or refuse, including the dumping thereof on adjoining property;
- any alteration, repair or addition to an antiquity located on the site;
- the dismantling of an antiquity, the removal of part thereof or the shifting thereof;
- writing, carving, or painting;
- the erection of buildings or walls on adjoining property;
- any other operation designated by the Director in respect of a particular site.

Management

Ownership of the property is divided between three main owners: the Israeli Land Administration (80%), the Muslim *Wakf* and the Christian Churches (15%), and private ownership (5%).

Following the establishment of the Old Acre Development Co Ltd (OADC) in 1983, a steering committee for urban planning drew up a new Master Plan for the old city of Acre for the years 1993–2000. The plan takes into account the international heritage of Acre, and takes account of the requirements of the Building and Urban Planning Law while considering the possibility of turning the city into a tourist attraction.

The main provisions are:

- Preservation of the special character of the old city of Acre – cultural, architectural, and aesthetic values.
- Preservation of the physical fabric whilst adapting to the modern quality of life.
- Provision of a solution to the inhabitants in the fields of residential accommodation, environment, community services, infrastructure, employment, and involvement in the process of developing whilst involving the public in the planning process.
- The development of tourism as a principal economic activity in Acre, Western Galilee, and throughout the State of Israel.
- Determining the permissible type of usage for each plot of land and building.
- Determining priorities and the distribution of resources.

- Provision of general planning whilst providing solutions to suitable specific programmes at the planning and execution stage.

- Provision of a solution for the planning framework of urban systems: ie transportation, infrastructures, sign posting, maintenance, management and preservation of the environment.

Preparation of the Plan involved a number of studies and surveys. These included a condition survey of the buildings, the development of a traffic plan, a study of the morphology of residential houses, a survey of potential tourist needs, and a survey of infrastructure of services (water, electricity, etc). As a result, areas in need of urgent intervention and priorities were identified.

The agencies with management authority under the terms of the Master Plan are the Acre Municipality, the OADC, the Israel Antiquities Authority (and its Conservation Department), and the Israel Land Administration (National Housing Authority). Site management is the responsibility of the OADC, a wholly state-owned professional body with expertise in management economics and marketing, and it is the OADC which coordinates the activities of the other partners. The Conservation Department of the Israel Antiquities Authority, which has a staff of conservation architects, engineers, archaeologists, and specialized conservators, is responsible for all conservation work.

Monitoring and control activities carried out under the plan are:

- Municipal inspection for enforcing the Building and Urban Planning Law;
- Archaeological inspection under the Antiquities Law (article 29.a);
- Conservation inspection;
- A Conservation Steering Committee composed of representatives of the following bodies: Conservation Department of the Israeli Antiquities Authority, the District Engineer, the Old Acre Development Company Ltd, the National Housing Authority, the Master Plan architect, the District Architect of the Israeli Land Administration, and a representative of the local community.
- A municipal tourist police.

Regular monitoring of the buildings in the old city is shared between the Municipality, the National Housing Authority, and the Conservation Department of the Israel Antiquities Authority, all of which are represented by inspectors on site.

ICOMOS considers that this plan and its implementation fulfil the requirements regarding management planning laid down in paragraph 24.b.ii of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

A programmed approach to the conservation of the old city of Acre began in the 1990s. The first buildings survey had

been carried out during the British Mandate. An extensive survey was made in 1962, and this served as the basis for the first master plan. From 1993 onwards there was a series of surveys of individual buildings, monuments, and blocks, and these have resulted in a number of technical manuals designed to provide architects, engineers, institutions, and private individuals with field solutions relating to specific aspects of the conservation and restoration of buildings. Restoration and conservation work on many of the major buildings are accompanied by scientific excavations, which are revealing many facets of the Crusader city.

At the present time the residential areas of the old city show little outward sign of the conservation effort over the past eight years. The facades of many of the buildings are in poor condition and there is substantial evidence of the use of inappropriate materials. The surfaces of many of the smaller streets and open spaces are poorly maintained. There is a profusion of cables and other infrastructural elements on the facades and pavements everywhere.

This appearance is, however, slightly misleading. The initial surveys showed that a large proportion of the housing stock was seriously decayed, to an extent that buildings were at risk and consolidation was urgently needed. This interior structural work has now been completed, as has the provision of underground conduits for electricity, telephone, and other services.

For the next stage of conservation and rehabilitation, a pilot project in a largely traditional residential area was selected. Work is in progress on this neighbourhood, adopting an overall approach rather than a piecemeal one directed to individual structures.

Excavation of the Crusader city beneath the Ottoman city is proceeding steadily. A number of innovative civil engineering solutions have been developed to stabilize cleared areas and permit exploration to continue.

Authenticity and integrity

Two periods in history have contributed to the appearance of contemporary Acre: the Crusader period and the Ottoman period. The special nature of the city's evolution has led to the preservation of its authenticity and the principal values of each of the two periods and of the city in general.

Crusader Acre is today mostly subterranean and has only begun to be uncovered recently. The well preserved remains include large portions of the fabric of urban life and buildings with all parts intact – walls, quarters, streets, alleys, fortresses, public buildings, religious buildings, dwellings, and shops, together with the subterranean infrastructure, architectural details, original plasterwork, and masonry. Building plans are clearly identifiable and building technology and materials can be accurately determined.

The Ottoman city was built on the Crusader city and took the form of an urban system of alleyways, courtyards, and squares, reflecting the values of Moslem society. The geographical conditions that determined its development, together with its socio-economic structure, maintained the integrity of Acre as essentially an Ottoman city, without significant changes in the 19th and 20th centuries.

Acre has retained its character as a port city, with a blend of public buildings, caravanserais (*khans*), and religious buildings alongside markets, small shops, and large residential quarters, together with an active port which is still a source of income and access to the city. The major proportion of Acre's individual buildings have remained largely in the same form as when they were built, with few alterations over the last 150–300 years. Ottoman Acre exists in an architectural/social bubble reflecting the meeting between east and west.

It may therefore be concluded that Acre fulfils all the criteria regarding integrity and reliability of information sources as expressed in the Nara Document and as required by paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines*.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

A ICOMOS expert mission visited Acre in February 2001. A evaluation of the "outstanding universal value" of the nominated property was provided by the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages (CIVVIH).

Qualities

Acre is a well preserved example of a walled city of special historical interest. It was of major significance during the Crusader period in the Holy Land, first as its principal port and later as the capital of the second Kingdom of Jerusalem for a century. Following a long period of decline, during which it was still the main entry port for Christian pilgrims visiting Jerusalem, it flourished again in the 18th century as the capital of this part of the Ottoman Empire. Its historical trajectory gives it a unique character, in that the substantial remains of the Crusader city are preserved virtually intact beneath the typical Moslem city of the present day, and have in recent years been revealed by scientific excavation.

Comparative analysis

There are three similar Mediterranean towns with which Acre may justifiably be compared: Rhodes in Greece (already on the World Heritage List), Famagusta (Magussa) in Cyprus, and Sidon in Lebanon. All three towns have long histories, and the relevant periods for comparison are from the Crusader period onwards.

Rhodes was founded after the expulsion of the Crusaders from the Holy Land and was exclusively a city of the Order of St John (Hospitallers). By contrast, Acre was founded during one of the peaks of the Crusader period, it became the capital of the kingdom, and its inhabitants represented the full range of Crusader orders, reflecting the history of the Crusades in the Holy Land.

Contemporary Rhodes is more like a medieval European city than Acre, which is in its present form an Ottoman city. It has also not undergone major restoration projects in the 20th century.

After the capture and partial destruction of Acre, Famagusta inherited its position as the main trading port in the region, although it never attained either Acre's significance or the rate of development that it underwent at its peak. Famagusta essentially represents a city built during the process of withdrawal of the Crusaders.

Furthermore, it did not form part of the itinerary of pilgrimages to the Holy Land. At first glance Famagusta seems similar to Acre: it is an example of a walled Ottoman port city that has undergone some changes. The essential difference between the two is that the Crusader city of Famagusta is not preserved in its entirety beneath the Ottoman city: it has instead been blended with Ottoman structures.

Sidon was also an important port city during the Crusader era, but it was one of many port cities whereas Acre was the capital. There is also far less evidence of the Crusader City in Sidon than in Acre.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

There is no buffer zone to provide protection of the setting of the old city of Acre defined in the plans provided with the nomination dossier, as required by the World Heritage Committee. This must be defined and appropriate regulations enacted before the property can be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The most serious problem confronting those responsible for the conservation and maintenance of the old city is a social one. There is an almost total absence of pride of place. Few of the present-day inhabitants have any family ties with the city and so there is a lack of identification with it. Furthermore, many of the inhabitants are unemployed or poorly remunerated and so cannot afford to live elsewhere. If and when their personal fortunes change, they will immediately seek housing outside the walled city. As a result, they do not feel themselves under obligation to respect the appearance of what is to them no more than a transitory place of residence.

The task that confronts the managers of Old Acre is therefore fundamentally one of education, so as to demonstrate to the inhabitants that they live in a city with a long history and a rich heritage. The efforts already made over the past two to three years, since it became known that Acre appeared on the tentative list of Israel, need to be maintained and intensified. The educational programme should be accompanied by an intensified social programme aimed at improving the quality of life of the inhabitants of Acre.

Brief description

The townscape of the walled port city of Acre is characteristic of Moslem perceptions of urban design, with narrow winding streets and fine public buildings and houses. Beneath it lies almost intact the remains of its predecessor, the Crusader city, which is being revealed by archaeological excavation.

Statement of Significance

Acre is exceptional in that beneath its present-day appearance as a typical Moslem fortified city lie the remains of an almost intact medieval city on the European model. It bears exceptional material testimony to the Crusader kingdom established in the Holy Land in the 12th–14th centuries, and also to the Ottoman Empire in the 18th and 19th centuries.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the definition and regulatory protection of an appropriate buffer zone. The State Party should also supply information regarding existing and proposed educational and social projects relating to heritage protection and conservation. In the event that this information is provided by the State Party, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and v*:

Criterion ii Acre is an exceptional historic town in that it preserves the substantial remains of its medieval Crusader buildings beneath the existing Moslem fortified town dating from the 18th and 19th centuries.

Criterion iii The remains of the Crusader town of Acre, both above and below the present-day street level, provide an exceptional picture of the layout and structures of the capital of the medieval Crusader Kingdom of Jerusalem.

Criterion v Present-day Acre is an important example of an Ottoman walled town, with typical urban components such as the citadel, mosques, *khans*, and baths well preserved, partly built on top of the underlying Crusader structures.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the definition and regulatory protection of an appropriate buffer zone, and also information regarding existing and proposed educational and social projects relating to heritage protection and conservation.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Troodos (Cyprus)

No. 351bis

Identification

Nomination	Painted churches in the Troodos region: Palaichori, Church of Ayia Sotira (Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour) – extension
Location	Troodos Region, Nicosia District
State party	Cyprus
Date	3 July 2000

Justification by State Party

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) in Palaichori belongs to the architectural type of the steep-pitched wooden roof with flat hooked tiles. This type of roofing over a Byzantine church is not found elsewhere, making the wooden-roofed churches of Cyprus a unique group example of religious architecture.

The wall paintings decorating the walls of the church are also of universal importance, dating back to the 16th century.

Criteria i, ii, iii, iv, and vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

History and Description

History

Although the last line of the inscription indicating the date of construction and decoration of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) has been erased, research by specialists has enabled it to be dated to the beginning of the 16th century. As regards the wall paintings that decorate the interior of the church, comparative iconographic and stylistic studies with other churches in the region (Churches of the Holy Cross at Agiasmati, 1494; St Mamas at Louveras, 1495; St Sozomenus, 1513; the Archangel-Panagia Theotokos at Galata, 1514), have dated them to the second decade of the 16th century. At the beginning of the 17th century, a surrounding wall was built on the southern and western sides of the edifice.

Description

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour is a type of construction that is characteristic of the mountainous region of Troodos. It is a small building, rectangular in plan and with a small eastern apse, covered with a shingle roof. Niches have been cut into the side walls.

The church is particularly notable for its very rich wall paintings. On the side walls the paintings are arranged in two rows, while the western wall has three rows plus the gable. The New Testament scenes are arranged on the upper level and the large figures of saints decorate the lower part of the walls.

The New Testament cycle opens with the Annunciation on the eastern wall and continues on the western gable with the Crucifixion before ending with the Descent of the Holy Spirit on the north side.

Several New Testament scenes show the existence of relations between the painting of Cyprus and that of the Christian art of the West from a stylistic and iconographic viewpoint. In the Crucifixion, although the representation of the thieves harks back to the beginning of Byzantine art, some details recall western art. For the Resurrection, the painter uses the western iconography showing Christ emerging from the tomb and the three sleeping soldiers in the foreground. The architectural decoration in the background of several scenes, including the Meal at the House of Abraham reflects a certain Italian influence.

The apse houses the representation of the Last Supper, one of the masterly compositions of the church. Christ appears twice behind the table: on the left he gives bread to the twelve Apostles, and on the right he gives wine, a scene from which Judas is excluded. Although the treatment of the draperies of the figures recalls that of 14th century painters, the unusual treatment of the faces with its diffused lighting effect lends a certain degree of emotion to the scene as a whole. In the Last Supper, the Apostles are usually arranged in two groups of six on either side of Christ, and in Cyprus only two paintings survive in which the twelve Apostles are shown twice, of which this is one. The other is in the Church of St Nicholas at Galataria, which is not in the group of churches already inscribed in the World Heritage List.

The scene of the *Thisia* (Sacrifice) is unusual in that it shows the Christ Child both in the paten and in the chalice under the silk veil supported by two angels. In Byzantine art, the Christ Child usually only appears in one of the two sacred vessels.

The specific style of the wall paintings of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour, which places it at the boundaries of the 16th century Cretan school of painting, as already indicated in case of the Last Supper, emerges more markedly in the figures of the saints in the lower row on the walls. Already at this point, however, the Virgin Mary in the apse vault is portrayed with greater simplicity, particularly as regards the treatment of her vestments, in which the complex and emphasized folds have been abandoned by comparison with paintings of the same subject in other churches in the Troodos region at the end of the 15th century (eg the Church of the Archangel Michael at Pedoulas, 1474). What is most

innovative, however, is the treatment of the Virgin's face, where the lighting is emphasized by delicate lines of white paint which radiate so as to create an expression of joy.

The faces of the saints in the lower rows in the church, such as those of St Anthony and St Andrew, are treated with great variety, as though they were portraits, using many white painted highlights.

Management and conservation

Legal status

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour is the property of the Church of Cyprus and the local Church Committee. Although private property, the church proposed for inclusion on the World Heritage List is listed as an Ancient Monument (N2/40) and protected under the provisions of the basic 1931 Law on Antiquities. This law states that any intervention requires approval by the competent authorities (Department of Antiquities, Ministry of Communication and Public Works). Severe penalties are imposed in the event of violation of the law.

Furthermore, the law stipulates that listed monuments must be surrounded by a zone in which the height and architectural style of any new construction is subject to control. The Department of Antiquities and the local authorities have already demolished a recent building in the vicinity of the church.

Management

The management of the nominated property proposed for inclusion is the responsibility of the Department of Antiquities of the Ministry of Communication and Public Works, in conjunction with the Church of Cyprus and the local Church Committee. The Department of Antiquities is responsible for repair work on the church and the preservation of the wall paintings.

Conservation and authenticity

Conservation history

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour has been in the care of the Department of Antiquities since 1935. Structural work has been carried out by the Department in conjunction with the competent religious authorities. Starting in 1963 specialists from the Department cleaned the paintings and undertook their conservation. Since that time other interventions have been carried out when they became necessary.

The church is currently in a good state of conservation. However, protective measures should be taken to cope with the increase in the number of visitors.

The improvement of the immediate environs of the church is covered by a Landscape Plan that is currently being prepared. This includes the development of an information centre, sanitary services, and signs for visitors. Implementation of the Plan will be the responsibility of the Department of Antiquities, the local Church Committee, the Church of Cyprus, and the local authorities.

The church has retained its original use as a place of worship and, although the number of visitors is not very

large, protective measures should be taken to cope with an eventual increase.

Authenticity

The Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour meets the criterion of authenticity in its design, materials, execution, and function. Works needed for conservation of the structure and wall paintings have in no way affected the authenticity of the monument.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission from ICOMOS visited Cyprus in April 2001.

Characteristics

The remarkable post-Byzantine wall paintings of the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour (Ayia Sotira) at Palaichori form a complete cycle of paintings from the second decade of the 16th century. They embody an iconography, style, and technique which stem from various sources and foreshadow, in certain of their characteristics, the 16th century Cretan school of painting. Through its architecture and its decoration this church forms a whole and completes the set of nine painted churches in the Troodos region already included in the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria ii, iii, and iv.

Comparative analysis

The specialists consulted by ICOMOS about this proposal for an extension of the painted churches of the region of Troodos have confirmed that in the region there is no other church from the start of the 16th century which is comparable with the Church of the Transfiguration of the Saviour at Palaichori.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Whilst the quality of this church is undeniable, making it suitable for addition to the existing inscribed group of churches, ICOMOS feels that the State Party should be requested to complete the evaluation of all the other churches of this type and period in the Troodos region and resubmit it as a final extension with others that it considers to be worthy of inscription.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this proposal for extension be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting that a full evaluation of all the Troodos churches be carried out in order to identify others that it may wish to propose as extensions to the existing inscribed property.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, asking whether they wish to submit other extensions of this site in the future. In that eventuality, the State Party will be encouraged to provide a comparative study.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Mudéjar of Aragon (Spain)

No 378 bis

Identification

Nomination	Mudéjar of Aragon (Extension of <i>Mudéjar Architecture of Teruel</i>)
Location	Region of Aragón
State Party	Spain
Date	30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

In 1986, UNESCO included five monuments from the city of Teruel that represented Mudejar art in the Autonomous Community of Aragon on the World Heritage List. While the works referred to are magnificent examples of this style, subsequent research carried out into this matter, together with the changes brought about in the way of "seeing and understanding" Cultural Heritage, has led to the conclusion that it would be necessary to include in this declaration a limited number of Mudejar monuments with the aim of embracing and including in a more universal way the Mudejar phenomenon in all its complexity.

In our opinion, the extension requested would explain a sociological manifestation of several centuries' duration, which takes place mainly in the former Kingdom of Aragon during the period from the 12th to the 17th century. This phenomenon is none other than the coexistence and interrelation between three cultures, the Muslim, the Christian and the Jewish cultures that coexisted pacifically over all that time, exchanging knowledge and experiences. The greatest testimony of all this today is to be found in architecture and the decorative arts, together with the large number etymologically Arabic words that still exist in the Spanish language.

The material Mudejar culture has survived in space and time thanks to the historical processes of conquest and colonisation of new lands. The building techniques were first passed on to the Canary Islands and eventually to Latin America, where there are numerous examples of buildings constructed in accordance with this architectural tradition. Not only have the traditions overcome geographical barriers but they have done away with time constraints too, since even today the kind of building techniques used are still alive, keeping our roots and cultural identities alive.

In short, the aim of this proposal is not merely to have some more buildings included on the World Heritage List, but, by means of them, silent witnesses of a time gone by, to exemplify a time in the history of Spain during which the Arabic and Christian cultures, and frequently the Jewish culture too, were capable of living peacefully together. The spreading of knowledge of these phenomena may contribute to the development of the universal values of culture and of peace, which are also objectives shared by UNESCO.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of monuments*.

History and Description

History

The Mudéjar art in Aragón is a direct consequence of the singular nature of the Christian Reconquest, in the early 12th century, of territories that had been dominated by the Moors since the 8th century. For various practical and political reasons, the Christians allowed the Moors to remain on the reconquered territories and keep their own culture and religion. On the other hand, Islamic art fascinated the Christians, who continued using its themes for a long time. Because of this cohabitation, many Islamic buildings were preserved, such as the Aljafería Palace in Zaragoza and other palaces and mosques in Toledo, Córdoba, Seville, and Granada. In this cultural context, there also developed a new expression, Mudéjar art, which represented the fusion of two artistic traditions, Islamic and Christian. The region of Aragón became one of the principal locations for this development. Here the easily available materials were brick, lime, ceramics, and timber, which were also economical in use. Most master builders were Moors, who continued to contribute to the construction. Mudéjar art gradually declined with the interruption of relations with the Islamic world and the introduction of Italian Renaissance concepts in the 16th century.

The history of Mudéjar art in Aragón can be divided into three phases: a) the beginnings from 12th to 13th centuries, b) full development and expansion in the 14th and 15th centuries, and c) survival and extension in the 16th and 17th centuries.

Only few examples of Mudéjar art remain from the period immediately succeeding the Reconquest. The earliest surviving buildings are in Daroca and Teruel. In Daroca these include the tower of St Domingo and the apse of St Juan from the mid 13th century. Both constructions were initiated in stone and completed in brick. In Teruel the earliest examples are the church of St María de Mediavilla (cathedral), and the tower of St Pedro, of a slightly later date. Both of these have very similar decorative systems and structures: they are gate towers on a square base, allowing a passage under a pointed vault, reinforced with buttresses. It should be understood that, apart from their religious and military functions, these bell towers also had an important town-planning function in tracing the routes. The ceiling of the cathedral of Teruel, dating from the second half of the

13th century, is the most interesting artistic achievement of Mudéjar art in Aragón.

The full development of Mudéjar art in Aragón in the 14th and early 15th centuries coincides with the introduction of Gothic to the Iberian peninsula. In Aragón, Mudéjar art continued to predominate over Gothic, except in some minor areas in the south. The most common type of church has a single aisle, with a polygonal apse of five or six sides and without any buttresses. The structure presents some characteristics of Gothic architecture, showing the interrelation between these two art forms. Many of these churches were modified in later periods. The churches of Zaragoza (La Magdalena, St Gil, and St Miguel de los Navarros) correspond to this type. Perhaps the most distinguished type of church building in this period is one with a strongly military function, a fortified church with tribunes over the lateral chapels, opening towards the exterior. In fact, the patrons were mainly from military orders.

In the last period, starting from the beginning of the 16th century (1502–26), the Mudéjars were forced to convert to Christianity, becoming "new Christians" or "*moriscos*". This is followed by a period of intolerance, resulting in the expulsion of these new Christians in 1609–10. This is also the period of the decline and extinction of Mudéjar art, though there are still some interesting achievements, of which there are examples in Zaragoza, Muniesa, Mara, Tierga, Alcubierre, Utebo, Villamayor, and Ricla.

Description

The sites representing Mudéjar art in Aragón proposed for inscription were 157 in the first nomination proposal. This number was subsequently reduced by the State Party to 64, and then, after further negotiations with ICOMOS, to 6 sites. These sites are proposed to be added to the four sites of Teruel which are already on the List, making the total of 10.

The State Party has provided a fairly complete inventory of the most important Mudéjar sites, which can be classified on the basis of their characteristics. The monuments include churches characterized in three groups: churches with one nave, churches with three aisles, and fortress churches.

Another category is represented by the bell towers, perhaps the most visible element of Mudéjar architecture, which are characterized by great richness in their decoration: a variety of geometric patterns of brick reliefs, different patterns of coloured ceramics, elements in gypsum, as well as various architectural forms, niches, windows, buttresses. The towers can have different forms in plan: octagonal base, or square base. Several towers have Christian influence, and have either a square or an octagonal plan, or a mixture of both forms. Their internal structure differs from the *Almohades* model (with one tower inside another), and the stairs are additional feature. Some churches have a ciborium over the nave, in the form of tower with a square plan, which then becomes octagonal and is crowned with a bell tower.

Another typical feature of Mudéjar architecture is found in the painted and decorated ceilings in wood, of which the best known example is in *St María de Mediavilla* (13th c.) of Teruel, already inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Mudéjar architecture is also found in monasteries, castles, and in residential buildings.

The proposal includes the following six monuments, all in the Province of Zaragoza:

- The Palace of La Aljafería, Zaragoza, dating from the 14th to 15th centuries. This was initially a royal Islamic palace in the 11th century, becoming then the seat of Christian monarchs. The chapel of San Martín, built to the order of Pedro IV in the 14th century, has a fine gate in open brickwork, framed with Alfiz decorated with rhombuses and a tympanum. In various parts of the palace, there are carved and painted ceilings built at the time of Pedro IV and the Catholic Kings (15th century). The palace complex has a rich plaster decoration in floral patterns and its doors, windows and balustrades have geometric decoration. Some changes were introduced in the 18th century with the addition of a baroque tower, and the 14th-century chapel of San Jorge was removed in the 19th century.

- The Cathedral of La Seo del Salvador, Zaragoza, 14th to 16th centuries, was built on top of a former Moorish mosque and includes various Mudéjar elements. The funeral chapel, *La Parroquia de San Miguel*, built at the end of the 14th century, conserves beautiful canvases of Mudéjar decoration, merging Aragonese and Sevillian influences. It also shelters a spectacular wooden structure in so-called *moamar* technique. The apses of the building are decorated in brick and ceramic using geometric motifs and crowned with battlements, typical of Almohade art. The octagonal dome has large tracery windows and the lateral elevations are richly decorated; the lower parts remain from the initial construction, while the upper part dates from the 16th century always in Mudéjar style, serving as an example for other cathedrals.

- The Church of San Pablo, Zaragoza, 13th to 14th centuries. The base of the tower of the church has an octagonal form, and its Almohade-type minaret remains mostly intact though with some Renaissance additions and a baroque spire. Several chapels were built between the 15th and 18th centuries, and the building was given a neo-classical façade on the south side.

- The Collegiate Church of Santa María, Calatayud, 14th to 16th centuries, has replaced a former Moorish mosque. The 14th-century cloister on the north side is the largest of such Mudéjar constructions. It has an upper gallery built in the 17th century. The church has a polygonal apse decorated in brick, which was extended in the 16th century. The finest part is the octagonal tower with an Almohade minaret structure, dating from the end of the 15th century. A chapel was added to the lower part in the 17th century, and a baroque spire was built on top in the 18th century. Nevertheless, the building has well preserved its Mudéjar characteristics.

- The Parish Church of Santa Tecla, Cervera de la Cañada, was built on top of an old castle from the end of the 14th to the beginning of the 15th centuries. The church has carved and painted ceilings in the choir, large windows and oculi with plasterwork, as well as mural paintings with trimmed bricks and geometric motifs. While there have been some changes and additions in later periods, the essential parts of the Mudéjar structure have been preserved.

- The Parish Church of Santa María (La Virgen), Tobed, second half of the 14th century, has been well preserved and has fine interiors with carved and painted ceilings, built to the order of Pope Benedict XIII under the patronage of the

Order of the Holy Sepulchre. The Town Hall that had been built against the west side of the church was demolished in 1984, and the wall was restored, opening the windows that had remained blocked earlier.

Management and Protection

Legal status

There are two basic legal instruments that concern cultural heritage in the province of Aragón: the national law of 25 June, 1985, on *Patrimonio Histórico Español*, and the regional law no. 3-99 of 10 March, 1999, on Patrimonio Cultural Aragonés. The latter law identifies three different categories of properties for protection: the *Bienes de Interés Cultural* (BIC), the *Bienes Catalogados* (CAT), and the *Bienes Inventariados*. The properties proposed to the List are fully protected under the first category (BIC).

The *Departamento de Cultura y Turismo*, instituted in 1999, includes in its responsibilities issues related to the protection and conservation of cultural heritage.

Management

After negotiations with ICOMOS, the State Party has made an effort to reformulate the nomination in terms of the selection of sites. This new formulation includes a commitment for the finalization and implementation of a management plan, involving the establishment of a global vision of Mudéjar art in Aragon, the introduction of mechanisms for the protection of the heritage, the development of systems of presentation and interpretation, as well as the development of a sustainable plan for tourism. The institutions involved in the management of this heritage will include the Department of Culture and Tourism of Aragon, the General Directorate of Cultural Heritage, the Mudéjar Art in Aragon Foundation, the World Heritage Management Unit, as well as the relevant municipalities, bishoprics, ICOMOS Spain, and representatives of civic institutions of the areas concerned. Furthermore, the information will be introduced into a GIS system as a means for improved management.

On the basis of the law no. 3-1999 'Patrimonio Cultural Aragonés', the article 78 requests the preparation of '*Plan de Promoción y Conservación del Patrimonio Cultural*', and the article 83 asks for '*Planes Territoriales del Patrimonio Cultural Aragonés*'. Fundamentally, the responsibility for the management of the properties is with the respective municipal authorities and the owners. The Department of Culture and Tourism has formed a group of civil servants with the specific responsibility for World Heritage sites. The proposed Aragones Mudéjar Art Foundation is expected to act as a coordinating unit for the institutions and groups to be involved in the management. Finances can come from different sources, including the yearly budgets of the responsible authorities, but also from private sources, and in some cases from the European Union. There exist different promotional activities for cultural tourism, such as the organization of selected itineraries to improve the knowledge and diffusion of information of the Mudéjar culture.

Each of the six sites being proposed consist of the entire building (monument) concerned. A small buffer zone is mostly limited to the open area surrounding the building. It is appreciated that the monuments are all placed within areas

that are subject to conservation policies. There is thus expected to be no immediate risk. Nevertheless, ICOMOS wishes to draw the attention of the authorities to the need to guarantee the overall protection of each site within its urban context. It is important that this issue be given due consideration in the Management Plan.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Generally speaking, Mudéjar architecture is particularly vulnerable to various causes of deterioration, including climatic factors, earthquakes, floods, but also damages caused by man and animals. In the past, these have included, eg., the Civil War of 1936-39, which destroyed several properties. The continuity of use has favoured their maintenance, but also caused problems related to uncontrolled changes and alterations. The exposed brick decorations and ceramics are fragile in terms of wind erosion, temperature changes, and frost. Many roofs and ceilings have been lost due to fires and other disasters. Nevertheless, all the six nominated properties are reported to be in a good state of conservation.

Authenticity and integrity

Mudéjar architecture was created in a specific period in time, ranging from the moment when the Mudéjars were allowed to stay in Aragón, in the 12th century until their final expulsion at the beginning of the 17th century. This art drew its inspiration from two sources: Islamic connections in North Africa and European Gothic as this evolved in the same period. The question up to what point such traditions can be seen as having continued beyond those limits can be raised, but it would be logical to limit the consideration to the preservation of the historic monuments that have survived. In terms of restoration, therefore, the question is to guarantee that the historic authenticity of the material be guaranteed, and that any restoration and changes be carried out respecting internationally accepted principles. The monuments included in the current proposal are considered to pass the test of authenticity, and ICOMOS is satisfied with the outcome of the nomination proposal in this regard.

Concerning the question of integrity, the nomination makes practically no reference to the built environment of which the monument is part. Even the buffer zone is mostly limited to the open area around the monument, and does not include any of the historic fabric of the town. Considering the prominent role of the Mudéjar towers and buildings in their historic setting, it will certainly be of great interest to maintain this relationship intact and to keep any changes in the setting under strict control.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

Four Mudéjar sites situated in the town of Teruel were inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1986 on the basis of criterion iv. The area of the present extension was visited by an ICOMOS expert in January–February 2001. Following the mission and further discussions with ICOMOS, the State Party has reviewed the initial nomination dossier, selecting

six of the most representative sites. Together with already inscribed sites in Teruel, the total would therefore be ten monuments.

Qualities

The development of Mudéjar art was the result of particular political, social, and cultural conditions in Spain after the Reconquest, a coexistence of Islamic and Christian societies. This art contains influences from the Islamic world as well as from European Gothic and is characterized by the extremely refined and inventive use of brick and glazed ceramics in architecture, particularly marked in the bell towers. Other elements include painted coffered ceilings made in wood. The outstanding universal value of Mudéjar art has already been recognized by the World Heritage Committee at the time of the first nomination of the monuments of Teruel in 1986.

A characteristic feature of Mudéjar buildings is that they are often built on an existing building site. The same buildings have generally also been subject to later changes and additions. While the principal attention of the present nomination is the Mudéjar phase of construction, it is noted that such features should be seen as an integral part of the historic context where they belong. The nominated sites are considered a fair representation of the different qualities of Mudéjar art and architecture, both in terms of types of structures and the historical development.

Comparative analysis

Mudéjar art developed mainly in Spain, though it was also diffused into a broader context, including even Latin America. In this context, the region of Aragón has been recognized as the area where this art reached its most outstanding achievements. The initial proposal of the current nomination was to identify everything that exists in Aragón as World Heritage. This proposal has been subsequently redefined selecting six of the most representative examples, and assuring the necessary management plans and strategies for the whole. Together with the already inscribed sites in Teruel, the monuments now give a fair coverage of the different types of structures and historical periods of Mudéjar art and architecture. The nomination thus includes different types of churches with bell towers, and decorative features as well as a castle. The nomination covers the periods from the 12th and 13th centuries, through the full development of the style in the 14th and 15th centuries, to the later interventions in the 16th century. The sites represent different situations, including constructions built over earlier Islamic buildings, or where the Mudéjar construction has been integrated with later interventions.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

Recognizing the serious effort made by the State Party to meet the requirements of the World Heritage nomination, ICOMOS wishes to express its satisfaction with the current proposal. Taking note of the commitment of the State Party to prepare a comprehensive management plan, including a GIS documentation system, ICOMOS recommends that the World Heritage Committee be duly informed about progress and the results. ICOMOS further recommends that, in the management plan, particular attention be given to the urban

context of the monuments and that appropriate measures be taken to guarantee that the relationship with the urban setting be maintained as sympathetic.

Brief description

The development of Mudéjar art in Aragón was the result of particular political, social, and cultural conditions in Spain after the Reconquest, a coexistence of Islamic and Christian societies from the 12th to 17th centuries. This art contains influences from the Islamic world and reflects the various European trends that developed in parallel, particularly Gothic. It is characterized by an extremely refined and inventive use of brick and glazed ceramics in architecture, particularly marked in the bell towers.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That the proposed sites be accepted as an extension to the existing World Heritage site, Mudéjar Architecture of Teruel, inscribed in 1986, and that the extension should be referred to criterion iv, the same as the original. The State Party is urged to complete and implement the required management plan as soon as possible, and to take the necessary measures to guarantee that the relationship of the monuments with their historic setting be maintained.

It is further recommended that the name of the nomination be revised as "Mudéjar Architecture of Aragon."

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be referred back to allow ICOMOS an opportunity to examine the revised version of the nomination recently submitted by the State Party. Assuming that the ICOMOS review panel gives a favourable opinion on the nomination, the Bureau would recommend to the Committee that the extension be approved under the existing criterion iv. It is further recommended that, with the agreement of the State Party, the name of the site be revised as *Mudéjar of Aragón*.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Bolgar (Russian Federation)

No 981

Identification

Nomination	The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex
Location	Republic of Tatarstan, Spasski Raion (District), Town of Bolgar
State Party	Russian Federation
Date	29 June 1999

Justification by State Party

The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex is the world's most northerly monument of medieval Islamic architecture and a unique example of the Bulgarian-Tatar architecture of the 13th-14th centuries. It is unrivalled as an historical monument, testifying to vanished states (Volga Bulgaria, the Golden Horde) and a lost culture and way of life. It exerted considerable influence on the development of culture and architecture in the 10th to 15th centuries.

The complex provides archaeological evidence of the past, which suggests human occupation since the middle of the 1st millennium BCE. It is an outstanding example of building design, and the architectural and landscape ensemble illustrates several important periods in the history of humankind. The earliest monuments date back to the Mesolithic period. A series of Neolithic and Bronze Age monuments have been recorded in the Aga-Bazar area and the former Lake Stepnoe. There are several finds from the Early Iron Age and late Roman coins have been found in the town of Bolgar.

Bolgar is where the Volga Bulgarians, ancestors of the Kazan Tatars, officially embraced Islam in 922, and it has been a place of Muslim religion and pilgrimage since the 16th century. It was the seat in the 13th century of the first capital of the Golden Horde (the headquarters of Batu-Khan and Ulus Djuchi), where the earliest Golden Horde coinage was minted in the reign of Berke in the 1250s.

The complex has been visited by many eminent poets and writers, scholars, and artists from the 13th century onwards. It was also one of the first localities in the Russian Empire in which government was made aware of the need for the preservation and restoration of monuments.

The cultural landscape has remained intact for a thousand years. The Ierusalemskii ravine has existed since pre-Mongol times. The boundaries and fortifications (moat and rampart) of the Bolgar archaeological site have remained unchanged

up to the present day, as has the boundary of the village founded in the 18th century.

[Note The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List. However, it may be inferred that it wishes the property to be considered for inscription under **criteria i, ii, iii, iv, and vi.**]

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

History and Description

History

Because of its military and commercial strategic location at the confluence of the Volga and Kama rivers, the town of Bolgar played an important role in the history of the peoples of the Volga area in the medieval period. In the 10th-11th centuries the small, strongly fortified town was the capital of Volga Bulgaria, one of the largest early medieval states in eastern Europe. In the 12th century it was replaced as the capital by Bilyar, but it continued to grow, because of its flourishing trade with Rus and central Asia. New defensive walls were built, and its area grew from 9ha to 12ha, and then to 24ha by the early 13th century.

The Mongols seized and burned Bolgar in 1236, and dismantled its fortifications. It became one of the *uluses* subject to the Djuchids, part of the Golden Horde. It was the first capital of the Golden Horde and the centre of the Bulgarian *Ulus Djuchi* in the 13th-14th centuries. It was under the Mongol ruler Berke that the cathedral-mosque was built.

Although the political centres of the Golden Horde had by now moved further north, Bolgar grew into a strongly defended, prosperous town in the 14th century, eventually covering some 360ha. Trade expanded and specialized crafts and trades developed, including the production of cast iron, two centuries before western Europe. Many monuments were built - palaces, caravanserais, mosques, *madrasahs*, baths, mausolea, etc - and effective systems of water distribution and drainage were installed.

Internal feuding within the Golden Horde at the end of the 14th century led to unrest and campaigns by Mongol and Russian expeditions. By the mid 15th century it had declined sadly, even its name being transferred to another town (probably Kazan). In the 16th century the lands of the former Bulgarian state were annexed by Russia, and an Orthodox monastery was established for a short period in the 18th century. The Bulgarian mausolea were used as quarries for monastic structures.

When the monastery closed down in the 1770s the small village settlement that replaced it was named Uspenskoe, and later Bolgary. Like the monks the villagers used the ruined buildings as sources of construction material for their houses and church. By 1870 little remained save scanty ruins represented by nothing more than their foundations.

Description

The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex is situated in the edge of the Volga river terrace, to the east of the town of Bolgar. The earth rampart around the site is up to 5m high in places and is surrounded by a moat 2m deep; it encloses an area of 380ha. The site is roughly triangular, with its apex facing south. The north-eastern part of the site is occupied by two ravines, the Large and Small Ierusalemskii, which form three promontories; it was on the most westerly of these, formed by the Large Ierusalemskii ravine and the edge of the 30m high river terrace, that the site of the earliest occupation of Bolgar is to be found.

Archaeological excavations have identified seven horizons:

- I. Modern period (20th century);
- II. Russian historical period (late 16th to 19th centuries);
- III. Kazan Khanate (mid 15th to 16th centuries);
- IV. Golden Horde period (late 13th to early 15th centuries);
- V. 2nd Pre-Mongol period (11th to 13th centuries);
- VI. 1st Pre-Mongol period (9th to 10th centuries);
- VII. Pre-Bolgar settlements (from mid-1st millennium BCE).

The following are the main structures on the site.

- The Cathedral Mosque (Tetragon)

Situated in the northern part of the complex, the Cathedral Mosque (so called because of its successive uses) was built in the mid 13th century and rebuilt for the first time at the end of that century and for the second time in the early 14th century. It is almost square in plan (45m by 46m) and constructed in limestone. The walls, four corner towers, the base of the portal and minaret, the floor, and some ornamental details survive. Stylistically it is the oriental tradition, but translated to a northern environment.

- The North Mausoleum (Monastery Cellar)

This mausoleum was built in front of the Cathedral Mosque in the 1330s and re-used by monks of the Dormition Monastery in the early 18th century. The structure is in white limestone, with facings of tufa blocks. It measures 13m by 18m, and what remains consists of the foundations, the walls cores, pointed door and window openings, and corner chamfers passing from the rectangular base of the main chamber to the octahedron and the circular base of the cupola.

- The East Mausoleum (Church of St Nicholas)

Located close to the eastern facade of the Cathedral Mosque, this was also built in the 1330s, and is similar in form and construction to the North Mausoleum. It was converted into a Russian Orthodox church in the early 18th century.

- The Church of the Dormition

The Church of the Dormition of the Theotokos is situated in the centre of the site. The verticals of its main building and bell-tower dominate the site and can be seen for a long distance around. It was built in 1732–34 with money donated by a Kazan merchant, in provincial Baroque style. Elements of earlier buildings were used for its foundations, and the walls plinths are Bolgar gravestones with Arabic and Armenian inscriptions.

- The White Chamber

Built in the 1440s, the White Chamber takes its name from the white limestone blocks used in its construction and the lime plastering of the interior. The northern part (which was the antechamber of the bath-house) is built in brick. It is made up of several rectangular spaces of different sizes: overall it measures 33m by 17m. It is an excellent example of 14th century Bulgarian architecture, and its form is modelled on the bath-houses to be found in central Asia, the Crimea, and Transcaucasia.

- The Red Chamber

This ruined 14th century building is on the banks of the Volga, below the Cathedral Mosque. It is what remains of a bath-house, its name deriving from the colour of the internal paintwork. The foundations and lower parts of the walls survive, along with the under-floor heating channels, water supply system, drainage, etc.

- The East Chamber (Khan's Palace or Bath-House)

This mid 13th to early 14th century public bath-house has been severely slighted for building materials. Its layout resembles that of the Red and White Chambers, but it is larger than either.

- The Black Chamber

This structure lies 400m to the south of the Cathedral Mosque. It was built of white limestone in the mid 14th century. It is plastered inside and decorated with alabaster mouldings. It was the khan's courthouse and is the lone surviving civil building from this period.

- The Lesser Minaret

The survivor of two minarets (the larger collapsed in 1841), it lies some 500m south of the central complex of the Cathedral Mosque. It was built in the early 14th century of dressed tufa and limestone blocks, on the pattern of the now disappeared Great Minaret. Its base in the form of a cube passes smoothly via flat triangular bevels to an octahedral intermediate tier. In plan its greatest extent is 4m by 4m and, without the tent top, it is c 10m high. It is the only monument of the Bolgar complex that has survived intact to the present day.

- The Khans' Shrine

Some 15m north of the Lesser Minaret, in a former cemetery, is the early 14th century Khans' Shrine, which was reconstructed for multiple use a quarter of a century later. It is a small structure, portal-less, measuring 8.5m square, and domed. Eight graves in *tabut* boxes, some under brick gravestones, have been revealed.

- Other mausolea

Nine more mausolea surviving to foundation level and four dug into the hillsides are also known from the Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex. All are in limestone and were built between the mid 14th and the early 15th century.

- The Small Town

This area is situated to the south of the Black Chamber. It is a small area surrounded by a low rampart and shallow moat. Within it there is another area defined by rampart and ditch and enclosing stone buildings. There is a fort on the most

exposed side of the ensemble. The architecture is similar to that elsewhere in the Complex, though the monumental entrance gate is unusual in that its construction involves both stone and timber-framing, a technique probably derived from pre-Mongol Rus (eg Kiev, Vladimir).

- The Greek Chamber

This is a Christian church situated on the Volga terrace west of the fortifications. It was built in the 14th century using carefully dressed stone blocks. Only the foundations and the two or three lower courses of masonry survive.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex was included on the Federal (All-Russia) Historical and Cultural Heritage List by Decree of the Council of Ministers of the RSFSR No 1327 of 30 August 1960. It was created by Decree of the Council of Ministers of the TASSR No 222 of 14 April 1969. These two measures ensure its protection from all forms of intervention without authorization, as laid down in the 1978 RSFSR Law on the Protection and Utilization of Historical and Cultural Monuments and the 1996 Law of the Republic of Tatarstan on the Protection and Utilization of Cultural and Historical Values.

The protected zone of the Complex is delimited by the area of the archaeological site itself with a zone round the ramparts 50m wide, plus the ruins of the Small Town and the Greek Church. The total area is 415ha.

Management

The entire area of the Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex is the property of the Republic of Tatarstan. Responsibility for the individual protected monuments is vested in the Main Office for State Control of the Protection and Utilization of Historical and Cultural Monuments, which is part of the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Tatarstan.

The Bolgar Public Historical and Architectural Reserve administration is responsible for the management of the exhibition building, the administrative office, the collections building, the excursion centre, the Museum of the History of the Town of Spassk/Kuibyshev/Bolgar, the museum artefact repair office, and other technical installations.

There is a series of plans relating to cultural heritage at federal and republic level. The most recent and relevant are decisions of the Kuibyshev District Soviet of People's Deputies of the TASSR of 1978 and 1984, dealing with the management and improvement of the Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex.

There are programmes relating to the management of the Complex within the plans and decisions referred to above. Reference is made in the nomination dossier to a management plan. The main areas of work are listed as:

- Archaeological study, protective and rescuing work;
- Acquisition, control, and storage of collections, stock-taking, and cataloguing of museum holdings;
- Restoration, conservation, reconstruction, engineering protection, and organization of museum displays;

- Development of the territory of the preserve and organization of museum displays;
- Development of the material base and engineering updating of the preserve.

However, no details of this plan were provided with the nomination dossier.

Funding for work on the Complex is contributed from the federal and Republic of Tatarstan budgets and that of the Spasski *raion*. There is also a contribution from visitor fees of various kinds. These totalled US\$ 189,367 in 1998 and US\$ 59,433 for the first five months of 1999.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

One of the earliest campaigns for the preservation of the surviving stone buildings was launched by Peter I in 1722, when he visited the site. However, it is apparent that this had little real impact on their continued preservation. It is worthy of comment, however, that the foundation of the monastery in 1712 had a positive influence on the conservation of the earlier remains, since a number of these were incorporated into the new structures and thus preserved.

When the 4th Archaeological Congress was held in Kazan in 1877 the need for protection was recognized, and the Society for Archaeology, History, and Ethnography carried out repair and maintenance work in the decades that followed.

After the 1917 Revolution, protection of the monuments was assigned to the Department for Museums and Protection of Monuments of the Past, Art, and Nature under the Academic Centre of the Tatar People's Commissariat of Education. A renovation plan was drawn up in 1923 and executed in 1926, work being carried out on many of the major monuments.

Systematic archaeological study of the remains has been in progress, with some interruptions, since the late 1930s, and continuously since 1954. Large-scale archaeological investigations of the entire site began in 1969. Systematic restoration work began in 1960s and is still in progress.

Authenticity

There is a substantial archive of written and graphic material relating to Bolgar that goes back to the 14th century. The records from the first half of the 19th century_in particular are especially valuable in this respect. This has made it possible to evaluate the extent to which there have been interventions that affect the authenticity of the remains that are extant today. It is evident that none of the surviving buildings looks significantly different from how it appeared 100, or even 200, years ago. It has also permitted restoration and renovation projects to be carried out which respect the authenticity. These projects have been restricted to structural reinforcement and anastylosis, and so it may be asserted with confidence that the level of authenticity is high.

However, it is necessary to enter a caveat here in respect of the reconstruction of the Great Minaret. No information was supplied about the extent or nature of this reconstruction. It is also not known whether it is proposed to reconstruct the mosque itself. This would not be desirable, since it would give an inaccurate impression of Bolgar: at no time in history did the minaret and the church stand side by side as functioning buildings.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex in February 2000.

Qualities

The importance of the Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex lies in the fact that the medieval remains present a comprehensive picture of Islamic architecture at the north end of its range, intermingling with the existing Bulgarian culture and that of the Mongol Great Horde.

Comparative analysis

There is a number of sites in the region which contains relics of Volga Bulgaria and the Great Horde, such as Bilyar, Suvar, Djuketau, Kashan, Valyn, Chertovo, Tigashevskii, Solotarevskoe, Yurlovskoe, Tsarevskoe, and Vodyanskoe. However, the remains at Bolgar are more extensive and contain a better illustration of the fusion of cultures in the Middle Ages. The Seljukist oriental architecture coming from further south was adopted by Bolgar master-craftsmen, but they adapted it to the long-established techniques of the pre-Mongol period.

ICOMOS has reservations, however, about the validity of the comparanda included in the nomination dossier. It is of the opinion that the comparative study should be broadened so as to take into account settlements outside Tatarstan, such as the empire of the Il-Khans, where Seljuk art and architecture also had a profound influence.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

ICOMOS is concerned about the reconstruction of the large minaret (see "Authenticity" above). It also has reservations about the planned industrial zone on the banks of the Volga. The expert mission was given to understand that this had been halted, but it was not clear whether the project had been abandoned permanently. This would be eminently desirable, because it would have a serious adverse impact on the setting of the monument, which is at present irreproachable.

No reference is made in the nomination dossier to the farmhouses, largely 19th century, that are located within the nominated area. Consideration should be given to purchasing some of these and making use of them for tourism purposes.

The interior of the Black Chamber, the best preserved of the historic buildings on the site, gives an unfinished impression. Consideration should be given to a more unified surface treatment and utilization of the building to house part of the museum collection.

Slight modifications should be made to the boundaries of the protected area: to the south, where part of the suburb (Small Town) appears to have been excluded, and the traces of settlement on the long island which disappeared when the dam caused a rise in the water level but which should be given protection.

Response by State Party

In August 2001 the State Party supplied detailed supplementary documentation relating to the points raised above.

A section is devoted to the comparative evaluation of the Bolgar complex in relation to sites in the region that are

similar in date. Special attention is paid to the Khanega complex in Azerbaijan, which is shown to be similar in content but significantly different in form. Comparative data are provided on specific categories of monument (mosque, mausolea, bath-houses, etc) in other regions of Transcaucasia and Central Asia.

There is a detailed treatment of the proposal for reconstruction of the Great Minaret. This is based on the substantial graphic evidence from the 18th and early 19th centuries, before it collapsed in 1841. Of particular importance is an architectural record carried out in 1827. The materials used in the reconstruction are the same as those used in the original structure.

There is no intention to reconstruct the Cathedral Mosque. The only interventions planned are limited to conservation of what remains of the portal, consolidation of the north-east tower, some excavation, and cleaning and conservation of the floor.

A coordinated overall restoration policy is in effect which will ensure that the interior of the Black Chamber is satisfactorily conserved.

Assurances are given about the permanent abandonment of the industrial project. There has been some confusion over names: the settlement where it had been understood that this had been planned is not that with a very similar name where the construction of a nuclear plant had been proposed, which is sited in another region of Tatarstan.

The boundaries of the nominated area have been adjusted as proposed by ICOMOS.

Brief description

The Bolgar Historical and Architectural Complex is a large archaeological site, defined by a massive rampart and moat. The ruined buildings that it contains date from the 12th to 14th centuries and illustrate the adaptation of oriental Islamic art to the building traditions of the region.

Statement of Significance

The extensive and impressive medieval ruins that make up the Bolgar complex lie at the extreme northern edge of Islamic culture, where it fused and blended with the existing Bulgarian culture and that of the Mongol Great Horde. It provides important evidence of vanished societies, such as Volga Bulgaria and the Golden Horde, and of a lost culture. Bolgar played an influential role in the development of culture and architecture in the region from the 10th to the 15th centuries.

Bureau Recommendation

At the meeting of the Bureau in June 2000 this nomination was *referred back* to the State Party, requesting more detailed information about the reconstruction of the Great Minaret and any plans for reconstruction of the mosque, confirmation that the industrial project has been definitively abandoned, and a more detailed comparative analysis.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criterion iii*:

Criterion iii Bolgar represents unique testimony to the history and culture of the Volga Bulgars and their ancestors, the Tatars, and to the lost medieval states of eastern Europe – Volga Bulgaria and the empire of the Golden Horde (Ulus Djuchi).

ICOMOS, September 2001

Zollverein (Germany)

No 975

Identification

Nomination	The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine
Location	Land Nord-Rhein-Westfalen
State Party	Federal Republic of Germany
Date	4 November 1999 (revised text)

Justification by State Party

When the Zollverein Mine XII was completed in 1932, it was considered to be the most modern and beautiful coal mine in the world, the daily output of which, 12,000 tonnes of hard coal, was four times higher than the normal figure. The same year saw the end of the Bauhaus, the most noble objective of which had been to work towards the “new building of the future” by fusing craft and art. In the opinion of the founder of the Bauhaus, Walter Gropius, the goal of architecture was to create objects and spaces for the purpose of which a new development of form had to proceed, in particular, from the works of engineering and industry. At the Zollverein mine the Bauhaus maxim that form must be oriented towards function is perfectly translated into reality.

Zollverein XII was created at the end of a phase of political and economic upheaval and change in Germany, which was represented aesthetically in the transition from Expressionism to Cubism and Functionalism. At the same time, Zollverein XII embodies this short economic boom between the two World Wars, which has gone down in history as the “Roaring Twenties.” However, Zollverein is also, and by no means least, a monument of industrial history reflecting an area in which, for the first time, globalization and the worldwide interdependence of economic factors played a vital part.

The architects Fritz Schupp and Martin Kemmer developed Zollverein XII in the graphic language of the Bauhaus as a group of buildings which combined form and function in a masterly way.

Criterion i

The cultural landscape of the Zollverein Mine bears unique witness to the complex interrelationships of living and working, dominated by large-scale industry, in the midst of one of the largest cultural landscapes in the world.

Criterion ii

Zollverein XII is an individual monument of outstanding significance in the landscape. During the phase, never to be

repeated, of concentration of groups of heavy industries, it was built as an investment provided with all the visionary ambitions of industrial rationalism. Thus it embodies one of the most fundamental ideas of industrial activity in a globally unique manner.

Criterion iii

With a daily output of 12,000 tonnes of usable coal, Zollverein XII was the most efficient mine in the world. Under the difficult geological conditions of the region, the achievement of this level of output was an outstanding technological feat.

Criterion vi

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

Consolidation of the mining claim area was completed in December 1847: the area concerned covered 13.2km². At that time it was the northernmost mine in the region. It belongs to the Gelsenkirchen anticline, in which the coal seams, averaging 1.17m thick, are deeply stratified. Mining began in the mid 19th century at a depth of c 120m and finished at the fourteenth level (1200m). By the end of mining the underground roadways extended over 120km; they were accessed by twelve shafts, opened up progressively between 1847 and 1932. When Zollverein XII was opened, the earlier shafts were used solely for the movement of men and supplies; all the extracted coal was handled by the new shaft until the mine closed in 1986. The methods of mining evolved as technology developed from hand picks to mechanized coal cutting.

The coals being extracted at Zollverein were especially suitable for coking. Consequently, the first stack-type coke-ovens were built there in 1857. The coking plant expanded considerably over the decades that followed. However, when the Zollverein mine was taken over by the steel company, Vereinigte Stahlwerke AG, in 1926, a new coking plant (the Nordstern plant) was built to process all the coal from its pits in the region. Coke production returned to Zollverein in the late 1950s, when the then holding company for the mines in the region, Gelsenkirchen Bergwerks AG, decided to build a new coking plant to supplement the Nordstern plant. It began production in 1961 from eight batteries, each of 24 ovens, producing 8600t per day; there were also facilities for processing by-products such as tar, sulphuric acid, benzene, ammonium compounds, and gas. This plant closed down in 1993 because of the fall in the demand for coke.

The construction of the stretch of the Cologne-Minden railway between Oberhausen and Hamm in 1847 was decisive for the location of the early Zollverein shafts, which were sunk 500m from the new line so as to facilitate transport of the coal and coke produced. The first passenger station did not open until forty years later. There were also links with the Emscher Valley line, also opened in 1847, which cut the north-western corner of the Zollverein concession. There followed a series of internal link lines during the next eighty years. It was connected with that of

the neighbouring Bonifacius mine after Zollverein was taken over by Vereinigte Stahlwerke in 1926.

Coal mining produces enormous quantities of waste material, which is deposited in the characteristic pit heaps. The earliest of these, to the east of shaft 1/2, was planted with trees in 1895 and used as a recreational area for the mine officials. A second grew to the west of shaft 1/2 from that time, and in 1932 was used for pond management, to dry out the boiler-ash and coal slurries from Zollverein XII. A heap begun in 1880 was partially cleared in 1958 to provide land for miners' housing. Other heaps were used for filling areas where coal had been removed from a steeply dipping seam and on an abandoned airfield.

Intensive mining resulted in a number of subsidences, in some places as deep as 25m. This necessitated clearance of irretrievably damaged housing and other facilities. Subsidence exacerbated the water problems in the so-called Emscher Zone, where mining adversely affected the gravitational flow and created large areas of swamp. Local industries and municipalities created the Emscher Association, which carried out a number of projects using pumping stations and creating polders.

The workforce steadily increased to c 5000 by the end of the 19th century. During the 20th century it fluctuated between 5000 and 8000. Because there were no alternative property developers when work began in 1847, Zollverein began to construct housing for its workers. Building projects were integrated with the mine operating programmes.

Large building sites were purchased and by 1860 146 flats were ready for occupancy; at that time the mine employed 710 workers. This "Hegemannshof Colony" expanded steadily (by the turn of the century it covered around 90ha), and subsequently two more colonies, "Ottekampshof" and "Beisen," were added. By World War I the property owned by the mine had grown to over 720ha. However, this was by no means adequate for a workforce that numbered some 5000 at that time. Between the two World Wars new workers' housing developed, notably the housing estate built by the Trust Agency for Miners' Housing. In the late 1920s the mine could provide each of its salaried employees and officials with an apartment, but only some 3000 were available for the 8000 workers. After World War II new estates consisting of apartment blocks were built by the housing association established by Vereinigte Stahlwerke AG, such as the Kaldekirche, Westerbruch, and Kapitlacker estates from the 1950s. The Glückauf estate was built by the miners themselves working in collaboration. The houses were owned by private individuals. Two Pestalozzi villages were also built for apprentices. In 1958 there were 7061 dwellings available for a workforce of 8000.

From the start the mine provided consumer services for its employees, selling food and manufactured goods at low prices. They began on a "cooperative" basis, profits being returned to consumers in the form of an annual dividend. This scheme, with its six outlets, was taken over as a company enterprise by Vereinigte Stahlwerke. The system gradually declined after World War II because of competition from commercial stores, and the remaining outlets were bought out in the 1970s.

From the mid 1920s the mine provided welfare services for its employees. The first welfare centre was set up in 1928 (it was rehoused in 1938) and the second in 1934. A large modern welfare centre designed by Fritz Schupp was built in

1953. However, Zollverein closed its welfare facilities in the early 1960s, in line with the current trend in the Ruhr.

Description

- The pits

Only the foundations of the Malakow towers of the original pit survive; they are built over by the present headgear (Pit 1, 1956-58; Pit 2, constructed at the Friedlicher Nachbar mine 1950, transferred to Zollverein 1965), both designed by Fritz Schupp. The brick winding-engine building dates from 1903, with an extension by Schupp of 1958. The 1922 main store has a reinforced concrete frame. The pithead baths are in the form of a brick hall, capable of providing facilities for 3000 miners. The ensemble is completed by the imposing administrative building (1906), the director's villa (1898), and the mine officials' residence (1878). Less survives of the buildings of Pits 3/7/10, 4/11, and 6/9, apart from the 33m high headgear of Pit 10 (1913).

At Pit XII the central hoisting unit (Schupp, 1932) is preserved almost in its entirety. The building axis, which runs parallel to the tracks of the mine railway station, is defined by the central energy-supply plants. These comprise the compressed-air plant (boiler house and upstream compressor houses) in the north and the control station in the south. The stack on the axis of symmetry behind the boiler house, the main feature of the ensemble, was demolished in 1979 for safety reasons.

At right-angles to this group are the buildings of the tub turntable, raised so as to permit passage for wagons. The buildings of the screening plant, the electrostatic precipitator, and the refuse hopper are annexed to this group. The belt-conveyor bridge establishes a functional connection between the refuse hopper, the picking-belt hall, and the coal-washing plant.

With the change from tub to skip extraction at the pit large parts of the tub turntable became redundant, but it was necessary to build an additional conveyor-belt bridge and a connecting building. The facade on the right of the pithead building was closed because of appearance of the "court of honour" was impaired by the new structures.

This entire ensemble was the work of Fritz Schupp, apart from the roof superstructure, which had to be raised in 1982 to accommodate large new dust-extraction plant.

- The coking plants

The coking plants at the individual Zollverein pits have all been demolished, but the central plant has been conserved since it closed down in 1993. The ovens extend over a distance of nearly 1km, parallel to the former Cologne-Minden railway line. Their equipment – pushers, quenching station, screening plant, and loading stations – are all intact, as are the gas-treatment and by-products installations, and ancillary buildings. The result is a unique example of a large-scale industrial complex, which is open to the public and had more than 200,000 visitors in 1999.

- The railway lines

The original main railway lines (Cologne–Minden and the Bergische–Märkische line) are still in use, as part of the Bahn AG network. The railway connection between the Cologne–Minden line via the mine to the Rhein–Herne Canal is also preserved. The route from Zollverein to Bonifacius no longer has its tracks; it is now used as a bicycle path.

- The pit heaps

Most of the mine-refuse heaps are still visible, several having been planted with trees and used as local recreational areas. Subsidence have created small valleys which would be waterlogged had corrective measures not been taken. The pumping stations built in the 1960s and 1970s to relieve problems associated with gravitational water flow are standard functional structures.

- Miners' housing

In the former Hegemannshof and Ottekampshof colonies a considerable number of houses survive almost in their original state, but in a bad state of repair. These are for the most part four-dwelling buildings on a cross-shaped ground plan. They are built in brick, with large gardens attached. Large sections of both estates were, however, demolished in the 1960s as part of large-scale redevelopment projects and replaced by multi-storey apartment blocks.

The early private development in the centre of Katernberg and around the Roman Catholic church is virtually untouched. The facades of the upper floors retain their elaborate decorative details. The buildings around the market place such as the post office and the former town hall, built on land donated to the community by the mine, have preserved their original appearance to a considerable degree.

The Glückauf houses still survive, as do the Pestalozzi villages, with their characteristic single-storey houses with pitched gabled roofs in quiet winding streets. The multi-storey apartments blocks built by the housing associations are undistinguished in style; they are set apart from the earlier housing by the fact that they do not have individual gardens but are sited with extensive green areas around them. The Kapitalecker estate has survived essentially in its original form, though it is greatly in need of repair. Of greater interest are the Westernbruch and Kaldekirche estates with their decorative clinker brick facades.

The successive groups of houses constitute a remarkable sequence of approaches to workers' housing over a period of 140 years, during which profound social and economic changes took place.

- Consumer and welfare facilities

Two of the consumer facilities survive, although one had to be undergo extensive rebuilding after wartime damage. One is a three-storey brick-built structure and the other is two-storey with a decorated plaster facade. Both are now in use as retail shops.

The former welfare centre 1 in Viktoriastrasse still fills a similar function, as offices for medical and law practices. Modifications to the brick building designed by Fritz Schupp in 1938 to adapt it for its present use respected the original design and detailing. His 1953 centre, now in use as accommodation for asylum seekers, has been conserved but is not in a good state of repair.

Management and Protection

Legal status

When coal extraction ceased at Zollverein, the boundaries of the legally defined mining concession covering 13km² were no longer of relevance. The larger part, situated within the town of Essen, is within the Düsseldorf

administrative district of the Province of North-Rhine Westphalia (*Land Nordrhein-Westfalen*). The north-eastern corner is in the town of Gelsenkirchen.

The area nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List is protected under the Law Governing the Protection and Conservation in the Federal State of North-Rhine Westphalia of 11 March 1980.

Management

Different parts of the nominated area are owned by both public and private bodies: Landsentwicklungsgesellschaft Nordrhein-Westfalen, Ruhrkohle AG, Kommunalverband Ruhrgebiet KVR, and VEBA Immobilien.

Application of the legislation is supervised by the provincial Ministry of Employment, Social and Urban Development, Culture and Sport, working with the municipal authorities of Düsseldorf and Essen. Direct management is the responsibility of two non-profit-making foundations, Stiftung Industriedenkmalpflege und Geschichtskultur and Stiftung Zollverein.

A "Craftsmen's Guild," analogous to those at the great cathedrals, has been set up by the town of Essen and the Regional Development Company to carry out regular maintenance and provide training in conservation practices and techniques.

A National Park of Industrial Culture is being established, which will operate in accordance with a management plan covering the entire area of industrial sites making up the Zollverein. New uses have been devised for most of the main industrial features – a theatrical rehearsal stage, the municipal meeting centre, the North-Rhine Westphalia design office, a private art gallery, workshops for retraining the long-term unemployed, etc.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

A large-scale rehabilitation programme to preserve the external appearance of the mine complex was carried out in 1990–98. The steel frames of the buildings have been secured and conserved.

The interrelationship of the different industrial components has been secured by retaining at least one major item of plant in each building. In the case of the main boiler house, the vast items of equipment are still *in situ*, but the interior has been adapted for use as an exhibition centre in accordance with plans drawn up by the UK architectural office of Sir Norman Foster and Partners.

Maintenance is assured with the willing help of former workers of the Zollverein mine. There are also training programmes connected with maintenance and presentation of the complex.

Future projects include a major restoration project for the coke-oven plant and further conservation work on the pit heaps.

There is, however, no overall management plan for the historic industrial plant, with a clear management philosophy and objectives. Especially serious is the lack of any conservation programme for the many large items of equipment, the coking plant, or the "white side" of the coke ovens, the chemical processing plant. This is essential, and

should begin with a complete inventory of every item of plant on the site.

Authenticity

As an industrial landscape, the Zollverein mine has a high level of authenticity. It comprises all the components of intensive 19th and 20th century industrial exploitation – the complete complex of buildings and equipment necessary for the extraction and treatment of coal and the production of coke, the requisite transportation network (in this case of railways), and the dwellings and communal buildings of the large community of workers, as well as the vast heaps of pit waste.

The individual industrial components have of necessity lost their functional authenticity. However, a policy of sensitive and imaginative adaptive reuse has ensured that their forms survive intact, with significant items of industrial plant preserved, and that their interrelationships remain clearly and logically visible. In particular, the authenticity of the important group of industrial buildings designed for Zollverein XII by Fritz Schupp has been carefully conserved

Social and economic changes have meant that the authenticity of the surviving workers' houses is somewhat variable. However, efforts have been made to ensure that part at least of their group value and authenticity has been retained, so that the corpus illustrates the development of attitudes to workers' housing over an economically and socially significant period of 150 years.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the property in February 2000.

Qualities

Coal was essential to the rapid development of industry worldwide in the 19th and 20th centuries. The Zollverein mine constitutes outstanding material evidence of the evolution and decline of this key industry over the past 150 years. The picture that it presents is a comprehensive one, covering the industrial, economic, and social aspects in a remarkably comprehensive manner. The buildings of Pit XII are exceptional examples of the successful application and adaptation of the principles of the Modern Movement to the requirements of heavy industry.

Comparative analysis

The number of coal-mining complexes that operated from the 19th century through to the latter part of the 20th century has never been large, since mines closed down once their coal deposits were exhausted and mining moved elsewhere. The use of alternative sources of energy has seen the role of coal diminish greatly in the past half-century, and in consequence mines have closed down at an accelerating rate. In most cases, this has been accompanied by the demolition of the coal and coke treatment and handling installations. The Zollverein is a rare survival and no comparable site can be identified.

ICOMOS comments

The original nomination was of an area based on the previous extent of underground coal-mining concessions at the Zollverein mine. This bears no relationship to surface

features, frequently intersecting streets or districts, and does not include all the historic settlements, of which there are at least nine on the map provided with the original nomination. ICOMOS proposed that the nominated area be confined to the Zollverein XII and Zollverein I and II mines, with the adjoining coking plant. This would provide a clear site boundary, bordered by suitable roads and for the most part enclosed by a high wall.

It was accepted that the surrounding area is a cultural landscape with many important workers' housing complexes, villas, public buildings, churches, etc, but these would be better treated as the buffer zone to the main industrial complex. The zone should be extended to include the suburbs of Katernberg, Schonnebeck, and Stoppenberg. Consideration should also be given to the inclusion of other important mining sites in the area as part of the nominated area.

ICOMOS was very impressed by the meticulous and sensitive conservation and adaptive reuse of the 1930s buildings. It was, however, concerned about the interventions in the coking plant, now managed by an arts organization, and also by a proposal to build a five-storey glass block on top of the washing plant, to house a postgraduate institute of art and design.

At its 24th session in Paris in June 2000 the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee deferred further consideration of this nomination, requesting the State Party to reconsider the boundaries of the nominated area and the buffer zone, to abandon the plans to build a new structure on top of the washing plant, and to prepare a comprehensive management plan for the industrial site, with a conservation plan based on the preparation of a detailed inventory.

The State Party subsequently provided a new plan which took into account the revised boundaries proposed by ICOMOS and gave assurances about the future management of the coking plant and washing plant. In November 2000 a document was submitted to ICOMOS entitled *Regulatory regime for the conservation of "The Cultural Industrial Landscape of the Zollverein Mine"*. This document was studied by ICOMOS and TICCIH, who were of the opinion that it did not fully comply with the requirements of the Committee.

The State Party provided a management plan to ICOMOS two days before the 25th Session of the Bureau. Supplementary information was also supplied by the State Party regarding the structure and responsibilities of the Zollverein Development Company (*Entwicklungsgesellschaft Zollverein mbH*). This documentation has been studied by ICOMOS and TICCIH, who consider that it complies with the Committee's requirements regarding management.

The State Party had indicated that it wished to change the name of the nominated property to "The Zollverein Coal Mine Industrial Complex," a proposal with which ICOMOS is in agreement.

Brief description

The Zollverein industrial landscape consists of the complete installations of an historical coal-mining site, with some 20th century buildings of outstanding architectural merit.

Statement of significance

The Zollverein XII Coal Mine Industrial Complex is an important example of a European primary industry of great economic significance in the 19th and 20th centuries. The mine is especially noteworthy for the high architectural quality of its buildings of the Modern Movement.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iii*:

Criterion ii The Zollverein XII Coal Mine Industrial Complex is an exceptional industrial monument by virtue of the fact that its buildings are outstanding examples of the application of the design concepts of the Modern Movement in architecture in a wholly industrial context.

Criterion iii The technological and other structures of Zollverein XII is representative of a crucial period in the development of traditional heavy industries in Europe, when sympathetic and positive use was made of architectural designs of outstanding quality.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back*, to allow ICOMOS time to review the requested management plan received only recently from the State Party.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Falun (Sweden)

No 1027

Identification

Nomination	The historic cultural landscape of the Great Copper Mountain in Falun
Location	Dalarna
State Party	Sweden
Date	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Great Copper Mountain in Falun and its cultural landscape are an outstanding example of a technological ensemble with an historical industrial landscape and unique type of buildings and settlements.

The Falun Copper Mine, otherwise known as the Great Copper Mountain (*Stora Kopparberget*) is the oldest and most important mine working in Sweden and the world, and of great international significance. It is one of the world's most remarkable industrial monuments. The manmade landscape surrounding the mine is very remarkable and unique by Swedish and international standards. The Falun mine has developed and influenced international mining technology and played a very important part in the world economy.

Criterion iv

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

The oldest surviving document relating to the Great Copper Mountain was issued in 1288, but scientific studies suggest that its origins date back to the 8th or 9th century. This was a period when there was considerable trade between Germany and Sweden and Germans settled in Sweden, and so it is likely that the Swedish industry was upgraded at this time under German influence. There is considerable evidence of this in the form of the technology being applied, such as fire-setting and mine drainage, the origins of which can be traced to continental sources such as the Harz Mountains.

A charter of 1347 led to the creation of a distinctive manmade landscape. Miners were granted the right to establish new settlements in the forests without paying any compensation to the landowners. At the same time they were exempted from land or forest taxes and their properties could pass to their children.

The 15th century was a period of unrest and armed conflict. The "free miners" of the Great Copper Mountain played their full part in this, protesting against trade restrictions and taxation. This culminated in a major rising in 1531–34, as a result of which several distinguished citizens of Falun were executed on the orders of Gustavus Vasa.

During the 16th and 17th centuries the Great Copper Mountain was the mainstay of Sweden's economy, enabling it to become one of the leading European powers. By the mid 17th century Falun was producing 70% of the world's output of copper. It was exported all over the world – for the roofs of the Palace of Versailles or for Spanish coinage, for example. The revenue from copper financed the disastrous involvement of Sweden in the Thirty Years' War (1618–48).

The Great Copper Mountain was organized as a corporate operation, with free miners (*bergsmän*) owning shares (*fjärdeparter*) proportional to their interests in copper smelters. The 1347 charter covered, *inter alia*, ore extraction, settlement, and trade within the region. It may justifiably be considered to be the precursor of the later joint stock companies, and it is often referred to as "the oldest company in the world."

A cultural region known as Kopparbergslagen developed around Falun which is unique to Sweden. There were no fewer than 140 copper smelting furnaces in the region at this time, and the free miners had their estates and manor-houses close to the furnaces. The agrarian landscape was dominated by grazing land and wooded pastures. A crop-rotation system with a five-year cycle, known as *lindbruk* or the Falun method, was developed here in the 17th and 18th centuries.

Despite the high level of technology developed and applied in and around the Great Copper Mountain, there were inevitably accidents, and especially in the 17th century, when production was at its most intensive. The most dramatic was that in 1687, when a massive landslip led to the creation of the Great Pit (*Stora Stöten*) there.

The town of Falun was founded in the 17th century: its population of some six thousand people made it the second largest city in Sweden at that time. The formal 1646 layout survives in the three districts of Gamla Herrgården, Östanfors, and Elsborg.

The copper furnaces were water-powered from as early as the 13th century, and the earliest water-powered hoisting gear was built in 1555 at Blankstöten, one of the open-cast mines. Ponds, dikes, and canals were constructed to supply the furnaces and the mines; the oldest surviving dam dates from the 14th century.

Many foreign scientists and businessmen visited Falun in the 17th, 18th, and 19th centuries, and all were very impressed by the enormous size of the mine, the smoke from the furnaces, and the remarkable structures related to the copper industry. The Great Copper Mountain became Sweden's first tourist attraction: the first recorded use of the word "tourist" is from 1824.

This was a leading centre of technological progress from the 16th century onwards. Among those who worked there and developed their research were the mechanical engineer Christopher Polhem and the chemist Jöns Jacob Berzelius.

As the demand for copper receded in the 18th and 19th centuries, production was extended to other mineral resources of the Great Copper Mountain, including sulphur, lead, zinc, silver, and gold. In 1888 the old company was reconstituted as a modern limited company, Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB. The old copper furnaces were abandoned and large new factories built. Outside Falun itself the company had been acquiring iron mines and setting up iron and steelworks, and it became one of the major Swedish enterprises in this field. Another area was that of forestry, producing paper and sawn timber.

The company celebrated its seventh centenary in 1988. However, by 1992 all the viable ore deposits had been extracted and so mining ceased: the last round of shots was fired on 8 December 1998. The only industrial activity remaining is the production of the traditional and very distinctive Falun (Swedish) red paint, used for the protection of the wooden buildings of Sweden and other parts of Scandinavia.

Description

The property proposed for inscription consists of the Great Copper Mountain and several areas around it which make up Kopparbergslagen. The core area is the historic mine at Falun with associated facilities above and below ground. The other areas contain many furnace sites, waterways, ponds, canals, and ancient mining settlements. There is a specific landscape of slagheaps and furnace remains to the north of the mine. To this should be added the town of Falun with its 1646 gridiron street plan and the three districts of wooden houses (Gamla Herrgården, Östanfors, and Elsborg). Four of the areas are free miner landscapes: the area north of Lake Varpan between Österå and Bergsgården, the area surrounding Lake Hosjö, the Sundbornsån valley, and the Knivaån valley from Staberg to Marieberg. Also included is Linnévägen, the well preserved ancient bridle path and cart track leading to the mining town of Röros in Norway and named after the famous Swedish naturalist Carl von Linné (Linnaeus), who travelled along it in 1734.

- The Great Copper Mountain

This consists of the underground mine itself, where operations ceased in 1992, and the enormous pit (Stora Stöten), measuring 300m x 350m by c 90m deep, resulting from a colossal cave-in in 1687. There is visitor access to some of the older parts of the mine, notably the impressive Creutz's Shaft, which is 208m deep and partitioned by what is often called "the highest timber structure in the world." A vast open chamber known as *Allmänna Freden* (Universal Peace) houses a display of historic working equipment.

Above ground the historic mining landscape comprises mine spoilheaps and heaps of "Swedish red," together with historic buildings from the 17th–19th centuries. As mining operations expanded a number of these wooden buildings were moved around.

They include mining installations such as headframes, wheelhouses, powder magazines, tally chambers, administrative offices, workshops, stores, mills, and living quarters. They date from the late 17th century

(Bergmästaregården) to the 20th century. Several have been adapted for alternative use: thus the former administrative building (*Stora Gruvstugan*), built in the 1770s, has been the Mining Museum since 1922. The 20th century Paint Factory is still in use, producing "Swedish red" paint. The most recent building is the Berget Auditorium, designed by Bo Wederfors and awarded the prize for timber architecture of the National Association of Swedish Architects in 1988.

- The furnace landscape

This consists of three large slag heaps lying to the north of the core area: Ingavshyttan, Syrfabriksägen, and Hyttberget. Between them are to be found the remains of historic industrial installations such as furnaces, roasting houses and early tracks. Archaeological excavations have been carried out on several of these sites.

- The town of Falun

The oldest surviving building in this planned town, laid out in 1646, is Stora Kopparberg Church, part of which dates from the 14th century. The main square (Stora Torget) is the site of the Kristine Church (1642–60), the Town Courthouse (1647–53), and the head office of the Stora Kopparberg Bergslag Company (1766). Following a major fire in 1761 there was considerable rebuilding, and there is some particularly fine late 17th century buildings along Åsgatan.

Falun also has a number of well preserved old workers' houses at Elsborg, Gamla Herrgården, and Östanfors. The Villastaden district, as its name implies, has some fine early 20th century villa architecture.

- The free miner landscapes

Bergsmanslandskapet, the first of these landscapes, lies to the west of the core area. It consists of spoilheaps, furnace sites, and well preserved early settlements. There is a network of waterways, canals, dikes, ponds, and dam buildings stretching from Igeltjärn in the north-west to the Crown Dikes and the mine in the south-east.

The Österå-Bergsgården landscape to the north-west of the mine, on the western and northern sides of Lake Varpan, contains these two free miner settlements, each of which had some ten copper-smelting furnaces and more than 25 ore-roasting furnaces in the 17th century. This heyday is represented today by enormous slagheaps, furnace chambers, workers' houses, and manor houses. There are some particularly well preserved free miners' homesteads in this area.

Copper furnaces were first recorded (in 1357) in the third area, that of Hosjö. There are many well preserved miners' homesteads, and Linnaeus was married in 1739 at one of these (Sveden), the home of the famous bishop and author Jesper Swedberg and his world-renowned son, the philosopher Emmanuel Swedenborg.

The Sundbornsån valley, running along the waterways joining Lakes Runn and Toftan to the north of the Hosjö area, is a manmade landscape containing many archaeological remains from the Neolithic period and the Iron Age. There were many copper furnaces here from medieval times until the early 19th century. Once again, there are many fine miners' homesteads of the 18th and 19th centuries.

The fourth area is the Knivaån Valley, on the eastern side of Lake Runn. There is abundant evidence of its mining past. Staberg is particularly noteworthy for its slagheaps and smelting remains. Of particular importance is Gamla Staberg, a free miner's homestead from around 1700 with a fine Baroque garden that is currently being restored.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The monuments, sites, and landscapes that make up this nominated area are all protected under the comprehensive and interlocking Swedish legislation for cultural and environmental protection. The relevant measures are the following:

- The Cultural Monuments (etc) Act (1988: 950) with Amendments up to and including SFS (1996:529)

All archaeological sites and monuments are given full legal protection. Listed historic buildings are given similar protection, as are ecclesiastical buildings of the established Church of Sweden. Any interventions must receive authorization from the National Heritage Board (*Riksantikvarieämbetet*) in the case of archaeological monuments or the relevant County Administration in the case of built heritage.

- The Environmental Code (1997)

The Code lays down general rules relating to the protection and conservation of the environment. There are two provisions relating to cultural values. First, it specifies fundamental requirements for the use of land and water areas, designed to maintain their cultural values. These are applicable to public authorities as well as private individuals or enterprises. Secondly, it introduces the concept of the cultural reserve. There are considerable restrictions over use and construction in these areas. The Code is regulated by County Administrations. It interacts with the Building and Planning Act 1987 and the associated Ordinance.

- The Planning and Building Act (1987: 10)

This Act (supported by the Planning and Building Ordinance, last updated in February 1997) gives local authorities considerable autonomy in regulating planning and developments within their respective districts. However, the State is given powers to intervene in matters considered to be of national importance where it is adjudged that the Environmental Code has not been properly implemented. So far as cultural heritage is concerned, general requirements are laid down for buildings, sites, and public open spaces. Alterations to existing buildings must take account of structural, historical, environmental, and architectural values. The special characteristics of buildings of historical and architectural importance must be preserved. Local authorities are required to produce and implement comprehensive plans, which are made binding through detailed development plans and/or area regulations.

The entire area covered by the nomination was classified as a series of areas of national interest in 1987 under the provisions of Chapter 3 of the Environmental Code. The Great Pit was protected under the Cultural Monuments Act

as a heritage site in 1995 under a resolution of the County Administrative Board. There are currently thirteen archaeological sites and monuments and historic buildings in the nominated area which are also protected as heritage sites under this Act and four more are being considered for this level of protection. In addition, substantial areas are also protected under the Planning and Building Act. All the areas in the nomination are covered by local authority development plans and area regulations.

Relevant authorities are Dalarna County Administration (*Länsstyrelsen Dalarna*), Falun Municipality, and the Church of Sweden, through the Falun Ecclesiastical Congregation (*Falu Kyrkliga Samfällighet*). Overall supervision of all cultural property is exercised by the National Heritage Board (*Riksantikvarieämbetet*).

Management

Ownership of properties included in the nomination and their management is distributed between Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB (the Falun mine, managed by the Dalarnas Museum located in Falun), the Falun Municipality, and individuals (homesteads, town buildings).

Under the terms of the Environmental Code and the Planning and Building Ordinance, a comprehensive plan for the centre of Falun was adopted in 1998, and this is supported by detailed development plans in the other areas, with specific provisions for the protection of buildings and settlements of historical interest. Detailed development plans are also in force for substantial areas outside the nominated area. These are covered by a cultural environment plan for the entire municipality, also dating from 1998. Since 1998 work has been in progress to develop the Falun Mine and Kopparbergslagen as an ecomuseum. This is a joint enterprise of the Municipality of Falun, the Dalarnas Museum, and Stora Kopparbergs Bergslags AB (hereafter referred to as Stora), working with voluntary bodies.

Although mining ceased at Falun in 1992, Stora has respected its obligations vis-à-vis the industrial heritage by maintaining the buildings and the mining environment adjoining the Great Pit, as well as the giant timber wall in Creutz's Shaft. The company has a long-term management plan for all its heritage sites in Sweden, of which Falun is unquestionably the most important.

Although the development plans and those of Stora cover virtually every aspect of the future maintenance and development requirements of the entire area covered in the nomination, there is no overall management plan *sensu stricto*.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Swedish industrial companies have long been conscious of the importance of their industrial heritage, and the country probably possesses the largest number of industrial monuments and museums anywhere in the world, covering mining, metallurgy, paper and board production, and engineering. Since 1973 there has been a series of surveys and inventories of cultural properties of all kinds in the area covered by the nomination. The most comprehensive of these was probably the total inventory and documentation of the mine itself and the associated buildings carried out by the

company before mining operations ceased. Other important survey and inventory projects have been carried out by the National Heritage Board and the Dalarnas Museum.

In exercising their statutory functions the relevant national and local authorities have ensured that the heritage sites and monuments have maintained a high level of conservation. Stora has ensured that all the properties in its ownership have conformed with statutory requirements in this respect.

Authenticity and integrity

The authenticity of individual buildings and monuments within the nominated area is high. This is the result of the stringent conditions laid down in the relevant legislation regarding maintenance and the selection of materials for restoration and implemented by the national, county, and municipal agencies involved.

The integrity of both the Great Pit and its associated buildings and the urban fabric of the old part of Falun has been sedulously maintained by the application of statutory regulations, reinforced by a strong resolution on the part of the residents to ensure the survival of the evidence of Falun's great industrial heritage.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited Falun in January 2001. ICOMOS consulted TICCIH experts on the cultural significance of this property.

Qualities

The Great Copper Mountain and its cultural landscape at Falun is one of the most outstanding industrial monuments in the world. Copper was mined there from at least the 13th century, and probably much earlier, until the end of the 20th century. It claims, with some justification, to be the oldest joint-stock company in the world. Many important developments in the extraction of copper ores and their refining took place at this site, and the cultural landscape bears abundant witness to its long and distinguished technological history. The dominance of Sweden as the major producer of copper in the 17th century had a profound impact on that country's economic and political development, and hence of that of the whole of Europe.

The landscape is noteworthy not only for its technological heritage but also for the abundant evidence of the social structure of the mining community over time. It contains many small mining settlements and miners' dwellings, as well as a planned town of the 17th century, which graphically illustrate the special socio-economic framework of much of European mining up to the late 19th century.

Comparative analysis

There are several World Heritage sites associated with mining: Kutna Hora (Czech Republic), the Rammelsberg/Goslar site (Germany), Roros (Norway), Banska Stiavnica (Slovakia), and Blaenavon (United Kingdom) in Europe, and Guanajuato (Mexico), Potosí (Bolivia), and Zacatecas (Mexico).

Of the European sites, the nomination of Kutna Hora extends only to the historic centre, omitting the early mines. The

significance of Banska Stiavnica also lies in its historic town centre, together with its significance in mining research and education: the industrial remains do not compare with those of Falun. The cultural landscape of Blaenavon developed around coal and iron-ore mining and iron production, but it is significantly different in many respects from Falun. Röros is a very well preserved wooden town that developed around its copper mining activities in the 17th century. Whilst it is comparable with Falun, it lacks the extensive industrial heritage of Falun. The Rammelsberg silver mining area and the fine associated medieval and Baroque town of Goslar is comparable in time-scale with Falun, but its visible industrial heritage is considerably less prominent than that of Falun.

Of the three Latin American sites, only Guanajuato possesses significant industrial monuments, but this are different in scale, nature, and period of exploitation from those of Falun.

It is justifiable to assert, therefore, that the Great Copper Mountain and its associated cultural landscape around Falun is exceptional as being one of the most enduring and complete monuments of the world's industrial heritage.

ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The properties covered by the nomination are protected by a number of statutory instruments and regulations. They are also included in land-use plans at several levels. There is also a general plan for the improvement and management of all the Stora industrial heritage sites. There is, however, no overall coordinating management mechanism. ICOMOS and TICCIH consider that it is essential for these diverse measures to be coordinated by means of a comprehensive management plan (to include a special plan relating to tourism).

Brief description

The enormous mining excavation known as the Great Pit at Falun is the most striking feature of a landscape that illustrates the survival of copper production in this region since at least the 13th century. The 17th century planned town of Falun with its many fine historic buildings and the industrial and domestic remains at a number of settlements spread over a wide area of Dalarna provide a vivid picture of what was for centuries one of the world's most important mining areas.

Statement of Significance

The Great Copper Mountain and its cultural landscape at Falun graphically illustrate one of the most significant areas of mining and metals production. Mining ceased at the end of the 20th century, but over many centuries it had exerted a strong influence on the technological, economic, social, and political development of Sweden and Europe. The history of the mining industry can be seen in the abundant industrial and domestic remains characteristic of this industry that still survive in the natural landscape around Falun which has been moulded and transformed by human ingenuity and resourcefulness.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the provision of a coordinating management plan.

In the event of this request being complied with and found to be satisfactory, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and v*:

Criterion ii Copper mining at Falun was influenced by German technology, but this was to become the major producer of copper in the 17th century and exercised a profound influence on mining technology in all parts of the world for two centuries.

Criterion iii The entire Falun landscape is dominated by the remains of copper mining and production, which began as early as the 9th century and came to an end in the closing years of the 20th century.

Criterion v The successive stages in the economic and social evolution of the copper industry in the Falun region, from a form of “cottage industry” to full industrial production, can be seen in the abundant industrial, urban, and domestic remains characteristic of this industry that still survive.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the provision of a coordinating management plan.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Middle Adda (Italy)

No 730bis

Identification

Nomination	The Middle Adda Valley [extension to Crespi d'Adda, inscribed 1995]
Location	Provinces of Lecco, Milan, and Bergamo, Region of Lombardy
State Party	Italy
Date	26 June 2000

Justification by State Party

This study makes it possible to confirm without any hesitation that the sites being considered possess in every respect the characteristics of outstanding universal value, discernible in the attitudes adopted unanimously by all experts. The middle Adda valley is an outstanding site, although it might be fairer to describe it as a group of incomparable natural, technological, artistic, and social sites. The loss of this system would deprive the entire world of a group of powerful symbols that are exemplary because of their unique and meaningful character. History, art, nature, and technology here live alongside one another in the short space of some dozen kilometres.

The adjoining areas which enrich this system – the Brivio marshes (Isola della Torre, Isolone del Serraglio), the Paderno ravine, the great sweep of Trezzo sull'Adda, the arch of Cassano – do not detract from the system. Quite the opposite: they enrich it by furnishing additional depths and treasures.

It is possible to leave the isolated river system and to reach adjoining areas to follow a specific thematic itinerary - historic towns, historic industrial installations, religious architecture, or rural farming architecture, as well as natural areas, natural areas, or human landscapes, historic trackways, and so on in a crescendo of legitimate, plausible, defensible implications and derivations.

Note The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph

39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

Water management underlies the history and development of this region - for transport, for irrigation, for drainage. This began during the Roman period, as early as the 2nd century AD, when the first efforts were made to make the minor rivers crossing the often difficult terrain navigable so as to facilitate trade between the Western and Eastern Empires.

In the medieval period there was intense political and commercial rivalry between the city states of Lombardy. Towards the end of the 12th century Milan began the construction of the first of numerous canals, the Naviglio Grande, on which a busy trade in all kinds of goods developed. An important component of this system of waterways was the Martesana Canal, built between 1457 and 1463 to the plans of the engineer Bertoli de Novate in the Adda valley. By the end of the 15th century 90km of canals made trade possible from the Adriatic to Milan.

However, some physical obstacles remained to be circumvented. Notable among these were the Paderno rapids, between Paderno d'Adda and Trezzo d'Adda, where the Martesana Canal began. In the early 16th century Francis I of France financed a commission to carry out a study for a new navigable canal, which recommended the opening-up of the water routes between Lake Como and Milan. In 1518 the Milanese Senate approved a project for improving navigation in the middle Adda between Brivio and Trezzo by constructing a canal to bypass the most difficult parts of this stretch of the river.

Work began on the Paderno Canal immediately under the control of the architect and painter Giuseppe Meda. It was abandoned in 1599 on the death of Meda, and did not start up again until 1773, when Lombardy was under Austrian rule. The Canal was formally opened in 1777, but a technical problem delayed its coming into full operation for a further two years.

The coming of the railways (the first was built in Lombardy in 1840) saw a decline in the use of canals, as was the case everywhere in Europe. There was a rally at the end of the century, when the canals of Lombardy were used to bring coal into Italy for electric power generation. However, the potential for producing electricity of water was recognized around this time. In 1898 the Italian Edison Company began using the Paderno Canal for its Bertini hydroelectric power station, followed between 1901 and 1920 by others (Taccani, Esterle, and Semenza). The electric power produced in the Adda valley played a very important role in the economic expansion of Italy in the years leading up to the outbreak of World War I.

The 20th century saw a steady decline in the use of the canals for navigation. Maintenance became so expensive that in 1953 the Martesana Canal had been removed from the navigable system. They supplied water for irrigation and to drive some industrial plants such as mills and presses. This had been a factor in the installation of the Crespi textile mill and workers' village in 1878.

Description

The area proposed for inscription follows the course of the river Adda from the Olginate dam (and just slightly further north, into Lake Garlate, to include the Silk Museum there) down to Cassano d'Adda, where the Muzza irrigation canal joins the river. It covers 1874.2ha and is surrounded by a buffer zone (the Northern Adda Park) of 7115ha.

From Lake Olginate (77ha) the Adda follows a winding course through a marshy area that constitutes the Isola della Torre (Tower Island) and the Isolone del Serraglio (Menagerie Island). This area is uncontaminated and supports a rich biota.

On the left bank lies the Sonna valley with a now abandoned system of water mills. A plan is currently being studied for a footpath between Volpino, on the slopes of Mount Canto, and Crespi d'Adda.

The main town on this stretch of the river is Brivio, at a point where a major Roman road from Milan to Bergamo and Aquileia crossed the Adda (hence its name, which derives from the Celtic word for "bridge"). It became an important trading centre and also a border strongpoint.

The water management system hinges on the Paderno ravine, between Robbiate and Cornate. This is an exceptional natural environment of steep eroded rocks; it comes as no surprise to learn that it was selected by Leonardo da Vinci as the background for one of his most famous paintings, *The Virgin of the Rocks*. The Canal itself is an outstanding example of a stepped canal. It is a monument to the hydrological genius of Leonardo combined with the expertise of the architect Giuseppe Meda and the mathematician Paolo Frisi. Safe navigation at the Paderno rapids is ensured by a system of basins on the da Vinci principle. There is also a series of hydroelectric power stations along the canal.

The river then follows a less violent course around the large meander at Trezzo sull'Adda, where the dam for the Taccani power station has created a dramatic landscape, dominated by the power station and by the 14th century Visconti castle.

Below Trezzo the river is joined by the Brembo, to form the Capriate San Gervasio peninsula, where the World Heritage site of Crespi d'Adda is located. Further downstream is the picturesque landscape of Vaprio d'Adda, with its villas, small towns, and proto-industrial works.

The Little Martesana Canal runs alongside this stretch of the river, from the hamlet of Concesa just south of Trezzo to La Volta (Cassano d'Adda), where it makes an abrupt right-angled turn to the west, on its way to Milan. On the opposite (eastern) bank, between Vaprio and Cassano, is the industrial settlement of Fara Gera d'Adda, built alongside a short industrial canal.

Cassano is the last town in the nominated area, which is notable for a complex system of irrigation canals. The oldest of these, the Muzza Canal, was constructed in 1220; its confluence with the Adda marks the southernmost boundary of the nominated area.

There is a number of protected historic buildings along the Adda and within the nominated area or the buffer zone. These include castles, churches, abbeys, domestic buildings, farms, and industrial sites.

Management and Protection

Legal status

More than forty buildings and monuments along the course of the Adda in the nominated area are protected as historic monuments under the provisions of the basic Italian monuments protection law, No 1089 of 1 June 1939. Nineteen landscapes are similarly protected under the complementary nature-protection law, No 1497 of 29 June 1939. Under both statutes any changes to the appearance or ownership of the designated properties may only be carried out with the permission of the relevant national authority.

At regional level, the statutory Territorial Coordination and Control Plan for the North Adda Park, adopted by the Regional Council for Lombardy on 8 January 1993, imposes strict constraints on activities that may adversely impact settlements, buildings, and landscapes within the Park.

Management

Ownership of individual properties within the nominated area is diverse, including national agencies, regional and local authorities, the Roman Catholic Church, private business and industry, and private landowners.

Overall management is the responsibility of the regional autonomous agency, the North Adda Park authority (Parco Adda Nord), which was set up (as the North Adda Natural Park) in 1983. The broad lines of its management policies are defined in a series of land-use planning regulations with statutory force at different administrative levels. These include the Regional Plan for Protected Areas (30 November 1983) and the Territorial Plan of January 1983 (see above).

As part of its basic structure the Park has an overall strategy for environmental protection and cultural promotion. The document supplied with the nomination lists several international projects with which the Park is collaborating, including a joint project with national parks in Catalonia and France on energy conservation in nature reserves and the European "Historic Canals" project. Several internal research projects are also in progress, studying *inter alia* aspects of the ecosystem of the Brivio marshes and the rehabilitation of traditional trackways.

There is a number of programmed ongoing activities within this strategy. They include a policy of acquisition of properties of high natural value, the rehabilitation of degraded areas and environmental restoration, and water quality control. The Park has a policy of working closely with agricultural and forestry enterprises to develop a sense of stewardship. It also has a programme aimed at the development of a new approach and way of thinking, with the traditional industrial base being superseded by the use of the area's cultural and natural resources for tourism.

Whilst the document referred to is not a management plan *sensu stricto*, it is in keeping with the Italian concept of a national park. It is not prescriptive, since the necessary sanctions against transgression are provided under the national and regional legislation. Instead, it concentrates on the study and recording of the cultural values, on education, and on economic and social rehabilitation and development.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation of the area covered by the nomination has only become a living issue since the creation of the Park in 1983. Even at that time, the emphasis was largely on the natural values. The protected buildings were subject to monitoring by the relevant agencies at national and regional level, and the planning legislation, including the plans at the lowest administrative level (*Piani Regolatori Generali*) ensured some measure of control over urban and sub-urban development. The coordination resulting from the creation of the Park and its strategic programme represents a more systematic approach to the conservation of a somewhat complex and diversified landscape.

Authenticity and integrity

Because of its heterogeneous nature it is difficult to apply the test of authenticity to this landscape, much of which has been subject to change as technology has developed over the past centuries. It is probably more valid to look at its integrity, as is the case with most cultural landscapes.

The unifying feature of the landscape is, of course, the river Adda and its waters. The landscape that is visible today provides excellent testimony to its political and technical significance and the way in which this has changed since the 13th century. The commercial importance of the waterborne trade route across northern Italy is well illustrated by the hydrological works inspired by Leonardo da Vinci. The importance of water to industry and hence to economic development, first providing direct mechanical power by means of water-wheels and then indirectly by harnessing the river to generate electricity, is equally well demonstrated. Its role in the improvement of agricultural yields through irrigation is also demonstrated.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the property in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted TICCIH on the cultural importance of this property.

Qualities

The central stretch of the river Adda provides an interesting insight into human exploitation of water, first for commercial traffic and later for the direct benefit of industry by providing mechanical power by means of water-wheels and then generating electricity in hydroelectric power stations.

Comparative analysis

The very diverse qualities of the middle Adda valley make it difficult to find precise *comparanda*. The canal design and construction are of value in that they utilize the designs of Leonardo da Vinci. However, as navigations (simple canals running alongside rivers) they are not outstanding: there are better examples in Europe – and, indeed, elsewhere in Italy (eg the Naviglio Grande).

Similarly, the concentration of industry along a river is interesting, but hardly unique. The Adda complex does not stand comparison in terms of historical significance with the Derwent Valley in England (nominated for the World Heritage List in 2001), which is notable for the pioneer work

of Richard Arkwright and the birthplace of the modern factory. In any case, the most significant industrial site in the valley, Crespi d'Adda, is already on the World Heritage List.

When the overall valley is considered as a cultural landscape, it is once again possible to point to numerous other river valleys that show similar characteristics and have similar historical trajectories.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this extension should not be approved.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination should be *referred back* to the State Party to allow it time to supply additional information, so that the extension may be reviewed at the Extraordinary Bureau of the World Heritage Committee in Helsinki.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Alto Douro (Portugal)

No 1046

Identification

Nomination Alto Douro Wine Region

Location Douro Region, Trás-os-Montes e Alto Douro

State Party Portugal

Date 30 June 2000

Alto Douro exhibits an important interchange of human values over a span of time within a specific cultural area. The property is a continuing, organically evolved cultural landscape, truly representative of the Demarcated Douro Region. It reflects specific techniques of sustainable land-use, those of both the past and the present, alongside a set of significant natural habitats typical of a Mediterranean environment.

Criterion ii

Alto Douro is an outstanding example of a technological landscape that illustrates several significant stages in human history. Here, in spite of nature's hostility to human settlement, man adapted Mediterranean crops, particularly vines and olive and almond trees, and planted them on terraces fashioned from the steep rocky slopes. Changes in the several methods employed over the centuries are evident in the landscape.

Criterion iv

Alto Douro is an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement and land-use that has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change. Although its geomorphological nature and its climate do not invite human settlement, the vine – as well as the olive, the almond, other fruits and cereals – has sustained a dynamic economic activity.

Criterion v

Justification by State Party

The Alto Douro represents a unique example of people's relationship with the natural environment: it is a monumental combined work of nature and man. First, the river dug deeply into the mountains to form its bed. Then people adapted the steep hillsides for the cultivation of the vine. Using methods and means acquired over the ages, they scarified the land and built terraces supported by hundreds of kilometres of drystone walls. With great acumen and creative genius they mastered the physical constraints of the natural environment and exploited the opportunities presented by the climate and the nature of the soil. Thus was born one of the most ancient winemaking regions in the world, one that produces a universally acclaimed wine designated "Porto."

The justifications for the inscription that we feel are most relevant, are:

Natural elements: the narrow valleys, the steep slopes; the paucity of water, the scant rainfall; the diversity of natural habitats, the transition from the Atlantic to the Mediterranean; select Mediterranean crops: grapes, olives, and almonds; the ephemeral: light and colour, sound and silence and smells

Cultural elements: land-use: the structure of the landscape, the dominant vineyards, the human settlements and the fabricated soil, or anthroposoil; access (the river Douro and the railway); cultural landmarks (the *quintas* and the *casais*); religious structures; and the walls.

The boundaries of the nominated property define the exact territory that is simultaneously 1. truly representative of the nature of the Demarcated Douro Region and its three sub-regions, from the most Atlantic to the most Mediterranean, 2. most consistently enclosed the majority of the most significant assets, and 3. best preserved overall.

The Alto Douro's claim of outstanding international value is further supported by three of the six cultural criteria:

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. In terms of the definition in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, para. 39, it is also a *cultural landscape*.

History and Description

History

Recent archaeological discoveries have revealed the presence of very ancient human settlements in the more sheltered valleys of the Douro and its tributaries and in neighbouring mountains. The great many Palaeolithic rock carvings found in the extreme eastern area of the Demarcated Douro Region between the valleys of the rivers Côa and Águeda and Douro represent a cultural aggregate that itself is of outstanding universal value.

Seeds of *Vitis vinifera* have recently been found at the 3–4 thousand year old Buraco da Pala Chalcolithic archaeological site near Mirandela. However, the more significant relics of viticulture and winemaking that have been uncovered date to the Roman occupation and particularly to the end of the Western Empire (3rd and 4th centuries AD). At the beginning of the Christian era, the Romans redefined all the land-use and restructured the economic activities in the entire valley of the Douro. From the 1st century onwards, they either introduced or promoted cultivation of vines, olive trees and cereals (the "cultural trilogy of Mediterranean agriculture"), exploited the numerous sources of mineral water, mined minerals and ore, and built roads and bridges. One of the most important rural sanctuaries in Europe (Panóias, near Vila Real) shows traces of native, Roman, and oriental religious cults.

From the beginning of the Middle Ages, until just before the birth of Portugal as a nation in the 12th century, the valley of the Douro was ruled in turn by the Suevi (5th

century), the Visigoths (6th century), and the Moors (8th–11th centuries). This opening of the region to a communion of assorted, continuously overlapping, cultures is reflected in the traditional collective imagination. The victory of the Christians over the Moors in Iberia does not appear to have interrupted the Douro valley's long-standing tradition of interracial cross-breeding and cultural acceptance.

The valley continued to be occupied. Viticulture increased during a period of the establishment and growth of several religious communities whose importance to the economy was especially noteworthy from the mid-12th century onwards, namely the Cistercian monasteries of Salzedas, São João de Tarouca, and São Pedro das Águias. They invested in extensive vineyards in the best areas and created many notable *quintas*. The end of the Middle Ages saw an increase in population, agriculture, and commercial exchange as towns and cities grew, particularly walled towns such as Miranda and Porto. Long-distance trade flourished, namely the shipping of products from the region down river to the city of Porto, linked with the major European trading routes. The rising demand for strong wine to supply the armadas led to a new expansion of the regional vineyards, particularly in those areas that were rapidly becoming famous for the quality of their wine.

From the 16th century onwards, the making of quality wines for commercial purposes assumed an increasing importance. Viticulture continued to expand throughout the 17th century, accompanied by advances in the techniques for producing wines and increased involvement in European markets for wine. The first reference to "Port Wine," in a shipping document of wine for Holland, dates to 1675. This period marked the onset of a great volume of trade with England that benefited greatly from the wars between Britain and France. Port rapidly dominated the British market for wine, overtaking those from France, Spain, and Italy. The 1703 Treaty of Methuen between Portugal and England set the diplomatic seal of approval on this trade and granted preferential rights to Portuguese wines. Throughout the 18th century, the fact that the sale of fortified wines from the Douro depended on the British market was reflected by adapting the product to the taste of this market and, at the same time, by a rapid increase in the number of British wine merchants. The British Factory House was founded in Porto in 1727.

Conflicts arose between these commercial interests and the Douro farmers. The latter were forced to accept continuously lower prices, together with the demand for darker, stronger, sweeter wines with a higher alcohol content. The State therefore regulated the production and trade of this vital economic product, initially with the creation, by Royal Charter on 10 September 1756, of the *Companhia Geral da Agricultura das Vinhas do Alto Douro*. The productive region was formally marked out. Its entire perimeter around the vineyards was carefully demarcated by 335 large rectangular, flat, or semi-circular granite markers. The word *FEITORIA* and the date on which each was placed *in situ* (usually 1758, occasionally 1761), was carved on the side facing the road.

This first demarcation represents an early manifestation of unmistakably contemporary practices. It included making an inventory and classifying the vineyards and their respective wines according to the complexity of the region. It created institutional mechanisms for controlling and

certifying the product, supported by a vast legislative framework.

The first demarcation enveloped the traditional wine-growing area, mainly in the Lower Corgo. Not until 1788–92 did the vineyards expand to the Upper Douro. The surge of commercial vineyards eastwards of the gorge, however, only occurred following epidemics of diseases of the vines (especially oidium in 1852 and phylloxera in 1863) that devastated the vines in the traditional wine-growing areas. The regime that relaxed control over production and trade (1865–1907) and the construction of the Douro railway line (1873–87) encouraged this expansion. When in 1907 the State undertook a profound revision of the legislation regulating the winemaking sector, the new demarcation covered the entire area under vines, including the Upper Douro, as far as the Spanish border.

Concurrently, in 1876, Douro farmers began to recover the vineyards that had been damaged by phylloxera. As throughout Europe, the definitive solution only appeared with the introduction of American rootstock on which domestic varieties of vines were grafted. Recovery of Douro viticulture and the introduction of new techniques for planting and training the vines has had a significant impact on the landscape due to the construction of wider *socalcos* with taller and more geometric walls that are distinctly different from the narrow pre-phylloxera terraces and their lower, tortuous walls.

Throughout the 20th century the Demarcated Douro Region has been subject to several regulatory models. The Interprofessional Committee for the Demarcated Douro Region (CIRDD) was instituted in 1995. The principal regulatory mechanism for production continues to be the system for distributing the *benefício*, according to which the amount of must that is authorized for making port wine is allocated according to the characteristics and quality of the respective vines. Mechanization was introduced, somewhat hesitantly, in the 1970s to help with some of the more arduous tasks in the vineyard such as the scarifying of the land and bringing with it new wide, earth-banked vineyards and "vertical planting" along steeper hillsides that no longer require building walls to shore up the terraces. The aesthetic impact of these new vineyards on the landscape varies, yet the mountain viticulture of the Douro continues to be carried out almost totally by hand. The rocky nature of the soil, the steep hillsides, and the existing terraces themselves are extremely difficult to adapt to the use of machines, though the product, port wine, is today mostly made in modern, totally mechanized wineries.

Description

Protected from the harsh Atlantic winds by the Marão and Montemuro mountains, the nominated property is located in the north-east of Portugal, between Barqueiros and Mazouco, on the Spanish border. The Mediterranean climate in this landscape of schist and steep hills far from the sea, adds a unique flavour to the feeling of *genius loci*. The popular saying about it is: "Nine months of winter and three months of hell."

The terraces, by blending into infinity with the curves of the countryside, endow this property with its unique character. Seen from above, the vineyards look like a series of Aztec pyramids.

The Douro and its principal tributaries, the Varosa, Corgo, Távora, Torto, and Pinhão, form the backbone of the nominated property, itself defined by a succession of watersheds. The Douro itself is dammed, so its valley through the property now contains a long reservoir 100–200m wide. However, although this change is important from the ecological and visual points of view, the flooded part of the valley was neither occupied nor cultivated. The boundaries correspond to identifiable natural features of the landscape – watercourses, mountain ridges, roads, and paths.

The area of nominated property is:

Alto Douro Wine Region	24,600ha
Buffer zone	225,400ha
Demarcated Douro Region	250,000ha

The landscape in the Demarcated Region of the Douro is formed by steep hills and boxed-in valleys that flatten out into plateaux above 400m. The Douro valley is now water-filled behind dams. Valley sides slope at over 15%, particularly in the Lower and the Upper Corgo. Soil is almost non-existent, which is why walls were built to retain the manufactured soil on the steep hillsides. It has been created literally by breaking up rocks and is known as “anthroposoil.”

The most dominant feature of the landscape is the terraced vineyards that blanket the countryside. Throughout the centuries, row upon row of terraces have been built according to different techniques. The earliest, employed during the pre-phylloxera era (pre-1860), was that of the *socalcos*, narrow and irregular terraces buttressed by walls of schistous stone that were regularly taken down and rebuilt, on which only one or two rows of vines could be planted.

The long lines of continuous, regularly shaped terraces date mainly from the end of the 19th century when the Douro vineyards were rebuilt, following the phylloxera attack. The new terraces altered the landscape, not only because of the monumental walls that were built but also owing to the fact that they were wider and slightly sloping to ensure that the vines would be better exposed to the sun. Furthermore, these terraces were planted with a greater number of rows of vines, set more widely apart, in order to favour the use of more technical equipment such as mule-drawn ploughs. The great majority of the hundreds of kilometres of walls that cover the riverbanks today date from that late 19th/early 20th century stage in the evolution of the Douro landscape. In the Lower and Upper Corgo a great many post-phylloxera terraced vineyards represent up to 50% of all the area under vine in each parish. Transforming the natural environment, clearing the land, and restructuring the hillsides required a great of labour that was brought in from outside.

The more recent terracing techniques, the *patamares*, and the vertical planting that began in the 1970s have greatly altered the appearance of this built landscape. Large plots of slightly sloping earth-banked land, usually planted with two rows of vines, were laid out to facilitate mechanization of the vineyard. Trials of other systems are continuing with a view to finding alternatives to the *patamares* and to minimize the impact of the new methods on the landscape. Among the expanse of vineyards remain areas, nevertheless, which have survived untouched since the days of the phylloxera, abandoned *socalcos* known as

mortórios. These have become overrun with native scrub or olive trees. More continuous, regular olive groves have been planted on either side of the land under vine. In the Upper Douro, olive and almond trees represent the dominant crops, although these are slowly being replaced by vines. Along the lower banks of the Douro or on the edges of watercourses on the hillsides are groves of orange trees, sometimes walled. On the heights, beyond that altitude at which vines can grow, the land is covered with brushwood and scrub and, here and there, a coppice of trees. Woods are still to be found in places on the ridges and amongst the crags.

During the long, hot, dry summers that afflict the region, water used to be collected in underground catchments located on the hills or even within a vineyard. From there it was channelled along stone gutters to storage tanks, usually made of granite, scattered throughout the *quinta*. In contrast, the winter rain gushes down the hills in torrents, so underground conduits and drainpipes attached to the top of retaining walls try to prevent it destroying the *socalcos*.

Grain-mills stood next to the watercourses but there are few settlements in such a disease-ridden location. Above, characteristically white-walled villages, medieval in origin, and *casais* are usually located midway up the valley sides. Around an often imposing 18th century parish church, rows of houses opening directly on to the street to form a web of narrow, twisty roads with notable examples of vernacular architecture, now occasionally tarnished by inappropriate recent building. The Douro *quintas* are major landmarks, easily identified by the groups of farm buildings and wineries that crowd around the main house. Although notably present throughout the region, they are particularly evident in the Upper Corgo and the Upper Douro.

No churches or shrines of any significant value lie in the nominated property, although the landscape is dotted with small chapels located high on the hills or next to manor houses. Some chapels and shrines were erected on the site of ancient settlements, usually hillforts. Furthermore, Douro folklore is a compendium of tales and legends that associate elements of Celtic, Arab, and Christian culture.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The cultural landscape of the Alto Douro is community property. The various elements that make up this landscape, however, are generally privately owned by a great many individuals, mostly local residents. Today, 48,000ha of vines are distributed over more than 100,000 plots, as well as many tens of thousands of hectares of olive groves and other crops.

The region does not enjoy a specific juridical protective statute, as Portuguese jurisprudence makes no mention of cultural landscapes. The instruments governing the land-use and protection of the landscape are the Municipal Master Plans, created under the terms of Decree-Law No 69 of 1990. All such Plans for all the townships in the municipalities in the Demarcated Douro Region are fully in force. These plans consist of three essential sections: the general cartographic map, the updated map of restrictions, and the regulations. It is now up to the Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region to integrate the various plans.

Management

Management interventions in the Demarcated Douro Region have rapidly increased over the past few years as it has come to be realized that increasing pressures require active management to preserve and safeguard the landscape over and above its function of producing wine. The regime currently regulating the region, as fine-tuned over the centuries, is centred on regulating, licensing, and controlling planting and cultivation of the vineyards. The process of progressively regulating local supervision and management of the land has culminated with the approval, during the 1990s, of the Municipal Master Plans. These are centralized and uniform instruments for regulating and managing the use and occupation of the land, at the county level.

Key elements are:

- The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region (PIOT), directed at conserving and improving the living, evolving cultural landscape;
- Alto Douro Bureau, consisting of a technical management assistance staff, who will act in close co-operation with an Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage;
- The Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage, an entity devoted to encouraging private and public entities interested and/or involved in the ownership of assets, in preserving, safeguarding, improving, and promoting the Alto Douro.

Responsibility for the management of the territory and the management and protection of its territorial assets and local infrastructures rests with the municipalities. The proposed property covers thirteen municipalities, plus an additional eight that are part of the buffer zone. Responsibility for the management of the vineyards and all agricultural and forestry land, as well as private buildings, rests with their owners.

When it is created, the Alto Douro Bureau will undertake to safeguard and protect the cultural landscape of the Alto Douro by co-ordinating the technical management assistance that is given at a local level, in direct collaboration with the municipalities and the Association to Promote the Alto Douro World Heritage.

Several EU-based plans currently in force directly address the Alto Douro landscape. Municipal Master Plans exist for each of the eight municipalities in the buffer zone and several Urban Plans, namely for the county seats. Furthermore, three major Plans are currently in the final stages of their preparation: the Plans for the Carrapatelo Reservoir, the Bagaúste Reservoir, and the River Douro River Basin. The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region is expected to be concluded by the end of 2001.

Finance, and the resources funding makes available, come from a mixture of European, state, and local sources. It is anticipated that current programmes will be completed and similar funding will enable similar programmes to continue in future. The PRODouro Programme (1996–99), for example, will continue from 2000 to 2006 through the Third Community Support Framework. Similarly, the Operational Economic Programme will undoubtedly, as part of the section for tourism, aim to strengthen the Douro's position as an alternative tourist destination.

The process involved in nominating the Alto Douro for the List of World Properties has itself stimulated interest in developing facilities for tourism. This will most probably result in the creation of an Integrated Structural Programme for Regional Tourism in the Alto Douro that will supply a structure for the many private and public projects for tourism to be developed in the region over the next few years. In effect, some of these projects have already been put into practice, such as the Port Wine Route, Medieval Routes, and the Route of the Romanesque, Tourist and Historic Trains of the Douro, among others. The flow of visitors to the region, although significant, is attenuated by the size of the property and, according to the nomination, has so far not created any major problems (though four are incidentally explicit and others well known elsewhere are implicit), but there is no serious discussion of the likely nature of an expanded tourism or of its long-term impact on the character of the area and on management requirements.

The Alto Douro already offers some facilities for visitors, such as Municipal Tourist Bureaux. It is, however, essential that the Alto Douro Wine Region Landscape Management Programme address the creation of an integrated network of all these services. From the viewpoint of the tourist market, the Douro has gradually acquired a degree of national and international fame as a new destination, and the number of visitors is consistently rising at 10–20 % per annum. Cruises to the Douro Valley, for example, are attracting 100,000 users annually; Mateus Palace is attracting 40,000 visitors/year; the Festival of Our Lady of Remedy, Lamego, attracts 10,000 visitors. Local promoters have substantially increased the local hotel facilities, especially at the top of the range. Existing structures can, however, support a sustained growth in tourism if all-year-round use is promoted.

The principal objectives of the Alto Douro Wine Region Landscape Management Programme are to improve the landscape and its patrimonial assets, minimize all interference with the landscape, and raise the quality of the environment and the standard of living in the area. It includes schemes, for example, to improve features of the landscape such as walls and terraces, to survey the heritage, to stimulate rural activities such as crafts, to facilitate the reception of visitors, to organize festivals and country fairs, and, under "Research and Development, Education, Training and Support," to provide local courses on how to interpret the landscape. The Plan also entails the Alto Douro Bureau's implementation of more specific management and conservation tasks, including monitoring. The Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region will reveal and formulate a series of relevant steps to monitor the state of conservation of the landscape. Amongst the principal indicators, the physical ones are the most noteworthy: the walls and their state of conservation, the methods for creating vineyards, the associated planning of other crops, the trees that are used to edge properties with vertical vines, the elimination or reduction of intrusions on the landscape, and the registration and conservation of the vernacular heritage.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Conservation as a "heritage concept" has scarcely been carried out in this area until recently. With everything

subordinate to wine-growing, functional need has driven maintenance. As a result, the state of conservation of the Alto Douro, in particular of the majority of supporting walls, is remarkably good, and clearly superior to that of the buffer zone. There, although a considerable amount of land under vine in *quintas* and *casais* and considerable vernacular heritage exist, the settlements in particular have suffered the loss of much of their original character.

Authenticity and integrity

The cultural landscape of the Alto Douro is an outstanding example of humankind's unique relationship with the natural environment. Its nature is determined by wise management of limited land and water resources on extremely steep slopes. It is the outcome of permanent and intense observation, of local testing, and of the profound knowledge of how to adapt the culture of the vine to such extremely unfavourable conditions. The landscape is an expression of people's courage and determination, of their acumen and creative genius in understanding the cycle of the water and the materials, and of their intense, and almost passionate, attachment to the vine. The setting, in the landscape of several forms of training the vines, is an outstanding example of human ability to master physical constraints, here actually creating the soil and building an immense and extensive construct of buttressed *socalcos*. It is this acumen that enabled a multitude of anonymous artists to create a collective work of land art.

This landscape, however, is a whole and it is in constant evolution, now with new terrace-forms reflecting the availability of new technology. It is a diverse mosaic of crops, groves, watercourses, settlements, and agricultural buildings, arranged as *quintas* (large estates) or *casais* (small landholdings). Today they maintain the landscape's active social role in perpetuating a prosperous and sustainable economy. Popular identification with the Region is reinforced by the congruence between its area now and that of the original demarcation.

The Alto Douro Wine Region has, and undoubtedly always had, a different meaning according to the perspective of each interest group. It is not looked at in the same manner by the parishioner who lives in the middle of the vineyard that has shaped his horizon since birth and which provides his sole source of income, or by the man from the mountain who remembers the days when the *roga* joyfully descended the hills to the *Terra Quente* to spend a few weeks working for the vintage. The Douro equally belongs to the small shopkeepers and middlemen in the region, to the owners of the *quintas* – both Portuguese and foreign – who stay there at different times in the year, to the shippers in the Douro and in Vila Nova de Gaia who are engaged in the wine trade, and to all those people in Portugal and the world over who have learnt to celebrate each great moment in their lives or in the destiny of nations with a glass of port wine.

Yet the man-made landscape of so many significances is visibly there, a series of impressive views but also a seriously complex machine, still working. The Alto Douro is of outstanding universal value both as a monumental construct in a demanding environment and as the unique setting for an exceptional product. The general state of preservation of this historic landscape is good. Alterations do exist, but they do not seem of sufficient importance to impair its integrity. Some terraces suffered badly during torrential rain in the later part of January 2001, and a

special effort will be needed to restore parts of vineyards to working order.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Alto Douro in February 2001. ICOMOS also consulted the ICOMOS-IFLA International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Landscapes.

Qualities

The landscape is visually dramatic, a very unnatural creation. It is witness to the huge efforts of many generations of almost entirely anonymous farmers and winemakers to master the physical constraints of a natural environment in order to create conditions favourable to the production of wines (and other crops) whose quality and distinctive characteristics have enjoyed worldwide acclaim since the 17th century. Specialization in the making of quality wines and the early assimilation of Douro wines by international circuits exposed, early on, the Douro valley to a cosmopolitan system of relations.

Wine from the Douro, especially port wine, represents a collective cultural creation. For countless generations, the inhabitants of the Alto Douro developed specific techniques for cultivating the vine and making wine, many of which were introduced in Roman times and had been perfected by the Middle Ages by religious communities. From the Middle Ages onwards the Douro valley has attracted huge numbers of outside workers, and it is in part very much their monument. The role of the Douro valley as both destination and corridor of peoples and cultures endures to this day, not least in the traditional visual and oral manner of expression of its people.

Comparative analysis

The Demarcated Douro Region is one of the oldest of all the historic winemaking regions in the world. It was the very first institutional model for organizing and controlling a winemaking region. Contrary to that which occurred following earlier demarcations of other winemaking regions (Chianti 1716, Tokay 1737), demarcation of the Alto Douro was accompanied by mechanisms for controlling the quality of the product supported by a legislative framework and a system for classifying and qualifying the wines. In many ways, the winemaking legislation of this region led the way for the modern legislation adopted by many wine-producing countries.

All the major mountain winemaking regions of the world, including the Demarcated Douro Region, are members of the *Centre de Recherches pour la Viticulture de Montagne et/ou en Forte Pente* (CERVIM). In comparison with them, Alto Douro is the most extensive, the most historical, and the one with the greatest continuity and the greatest biological variety in terms of the vines that have been perfected there.

Of all the historic mountain vineyards in Europe, the Alto Douro with its 36,000ha of steeply sloping vineyards is the most significant example of this type of viticulture. It represents about 18% of all European mountain vineyards registered with CERVIM.

Other winemaking regions already inscribed on the World Heritage List are Cinque Terre (Italy), Saint-Émilion (France), and the Wachau in Austria, all cultural landscapes. Future likely nominations are the Pico Wine Region in the Azores (Portugal) and Le Vignoble Champenois (France).

The Alto Douro demonstrates, particularly as regards the *socalcos*, its original formula for terracing to create vineyards. Motivation was functional but, particularly in this case, the resultant landscape, as at Cinque Terre, can be seen as the expression of a centuries-old toil transforming an inhospitable land of rock and shrubs into a fertile winemaking region.

All the CERVIM vineyard areas share – Alto Douro dramatically – the guideline for quality winemaking rooted in Roman viticulture and best-expressed in the saying "Bacchus loves rugged hillsides." The Douro valley is in fact universally acclaimed as the source of one of the finest fortified wines on earth, port wine.

Yet, while wine-production has contributed significantly to the national and regional economy, paradoxically the locality only benefits from one-fourth of the added value generated by this product. This, as compared to the majority of other winemaking regions, explains the marked dissimilarity between the opulence of the landscape and the humble buildings in the settlements.

As an agricultural landscape, Alto Douro demonstrates its own unique process for optimizing the ecological conditions under which water resources are very carefully controlled to produce a crop. In that sense, it is comparable to another World Heritage cultural landscape, the rice-growing terraces of Banaue in the Philippines, a masterpiece of simple montane hydrology producing a dramatic landscape.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

ICOMOS considers that the Alto Douro does not particularly exhibit "an important interchange of human values" (criterion ii). Much more appropriate is criterion iii, for it very much provides an exceptional testimony to a living cultural tradition. While undoubtedly an outstanding example of a type of landscape, it does not, however, illustrate particularly well "significant stages in human history" (criterion iv) because, despite the length of history which has passed in this area, much of the visible physical landscape is of late 19th/20th century date. On the other hand, it could still qualify under criterion iv if the phrase 'technological landscape' is allowed from the wording of the criterion, for that is exactly what it is, a landscape reflecting responses to changing technology in the context of an evolving relationship between man and the natural elements. ICOMOS therefore recommends that this nomination should be considered, as was that of the closely comparable St Emilion, under criteria iii, iv, and v.

ICOMOS appreciates the attractions of promoting tourism as a relatively new phenomenon in the area, and would encourage the authorities to be proactive as well as well informed and as sensitive as possible about the range of possible consequences arising from such promotion. Critical are such concepts as, for example, Planning Control and "appropriateness" in terms of scale, design, and materials for the various new facilities like hotels and visitor centres envisaged as necessary in the visually dramatic and sensitive landscape of this nomination.

However, as many other areas have experienced, tourism can bring far more than ugliness to a landscape; it can also erode the social fabric, something of great concern when a cultural landscape such as this needs large numbers of local residents, together with their skills and dedication, to keep the landscape working. Without a firm grasp of such consequences of tourism in a poor, deeply rural area, and a well informed management sensitivity about, in effect, sociology and the aesthetics of landscape development, experience suggests that this area might well be seriously compromised in 25 years' time. That the process, of both degradation and management reaction has started is acknowledged in the nomination, and it is crucial that, should this nomination be approved, local awareness and resources are ready to deal with the extra pressures.

No management plan specific to the nominated area accompanied the nomination nor was one proposed in the nomination but the ICOMOS mission found that one was in active preparation. ICOMOS recommends that this address the issues of controlling development in the buffer zone and maintaining the characteristic features of the infrastructure of the landscape, notably the narrow, stone-paved local roads, the vernacular architecture, and, above all, the ability to maintain and rebuild the stone revetments of the terraces. So far the changes in viticultural practice, including making fields up and down rather than always along the contours, have not affected the landscape adversely; indeed, they have added to its time-depth and visual variety. It is crucial that the further development of this "continuing landscape," for example in response to technical change, occurs in the same mode.

Following completion of the Intermunicipal Plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region, the Alto Douro Bureau should prepare a management plan specific to the area and status of the World Heritage Site, taking into account existing management plans for comparable properties.

Brief description

The Alto Douro wine region produces a world commodity, port, a wine of a quality defined and regulated since 1756. Centred on the valley of the River Douro, now flooded, the region is characterized topographically by sloping vineyards arranged in various terraced configurations. Most date from after the phylloxera disease of the mid-19th century, but some are earlier – wine-growing here goes back at least to Roman times – and the 20th century added to the range of types of vineyard and terrace in response to changing technology and the constant needs to control water and prevent erosion. The result is a visually dramatic landscape still profitably farmed in traditional ways by traditional landholders.

Statement of Significance

Wine has been produced in the Alto Douro for some two thousand years, and since the 18th century its main product, port wine, has been famous for its quality throughout the world. This long tradition has produced a cultural landscape of outstanding beauty that is at the same time a reflection of its technological, social, and economic evolution.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party so that it may complete and implement a management plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region. In the event of this being submitted in time for the December 2001 meeting of the World Heritage Committee and found to meet its requirements, ICOMOS recommends that this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii, iv, and v*:

Criterion iii The Alto Douro Region has been producing wine for nearly two thousand years and its landscape has been moulded by human activities.

Criterion iv The components of the Alto Douro landscape are representative of the full range of activities association with winemaking – terraces, *quintas* (wine-producing farm complexes), villages, chapels, and roads.

Criterion v The cultural landscape of the Alto Douro is an outstanding example of a traditional European wine-producing region, reflecting the evolution of this human activity over time.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, to allow ICOMOS an opportunity to review the recently received integrated management plan for the Alto Douro Wine Region.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Aranjuez (Spain)

No 1044

Identification

Nomination The Aranjuez Cultural Landscape
Location Aranjuez, Madrid
State Party Spain
Date 30 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Aranjuez has been witness to various cultural exchanges over a span of time, in a specific cultural area, that have had a tremendous influence in the development of its landmarks and the creation of its landscape. **Criterion ii**

Aranjuez offers a splendid example of diverse architectural styles and varied landscapes that depict key periods throughout the history of mankind. **Criterion iv**

Aranjuez represents a model for a given culture's use of its territory. However, the city has become increasingly vulnerable since the disappearance at the turn of the century of the Royal Court that had so much influence on its development. **Criterion v**

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in para. 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description*

History

The Aranjuez area enjoyed a long history of human settlement before becoming a strategic stronghold during Roman times. Then its position at a river crossing and cross-

roads – a factor to be repeatedly influential – gave it a significance in the political geography of the time. It lay in a sparsely populated region thereafter and was eventually granted by the Crown to the military order of St James of Santiago in the medieval period. Towards the end of the 14th century, the knights built a palace in the middle of the woods, then replete with game.

Aranjuez became a Royal site in the 15th century, but it was Philip II in the 16th century who created the first period of splendour. He built a new palace and large ornamental and vegetable gardens laid out according to geometric principles, attempting to symbolize his world-wide imperial sovereignty based on a centralized state while at the same time celebrating a return to nature, its structure, and man's supremacy according to the canons of Humanism. It was also a private and personal retreat. Phillip meanwhile pursued botanical experimentation, acclimatizing plant species from all over the world, and introduced hydraulic engineering based on best practice in central Europe and Italy. During the 17th century Aranjuez prospered as the annual abode of royalty, a place of pageantry and hunting, and a source of inspiration for and patronage of some of the greatest Spanish poets of the Golden Age.

The continuing splendour of the 18th century culminated in the building of a new town close to the palace. During the reign of Charles III, the city and its surrounding area became an experimental ground for physiocratic, agricultural, scientific, and social ideas lying at the heart of the Enlightenment. The King sought to provide exemplars both for horticultural practice and in the design of model farms. Such cultural grandeur effectively died when, under external pressure from French Revolutionary ideas and Napoleon's ambitions, the Aranjuez Riot at the end of the century signalled the end of Spain's *Ancien Régime*.

After a brief revival which added a new element of modernism and eclecticism to the Royal Site during the first half of the 19th century, the end of the reign of Isabella II marked the close of the Crown's exclusive role in the history of this riverside complex and community. A City Council was established independent of Royal command (1836) and the Royal family's use of Aranjuez decreased. At the Revolution in 1868, all Crown property passed to the State and, although large parts of Aranjuez were initially excepted, all that was left in Royal hands by the early 1870s were fragments of their former estate. Meanwhile, the population increased and a railway line (1851) stimulated vigorous economic activity at the price of cutting the Palace's eastern vistas and bisecting the Picotajo garden. During the 20th century Aranjuez became a densely populated satellite city of Madrid, an industrial and cultural centre in which memory and maintenance of the Royal Site deteriorated. Nevertheless, the Site overall kept its integrity, and by the end of that century new assessments, policies, and programmes of works reflected new attitudes of respect for the Royal Site.

Description

The nominated property lies at the junction of the Rivers Tajo (Tagus) and Jarama, south of Madrid and north-east of Toledo. The buffer zone embraces parts of the valleys of both rivers upstream of Aranjuez itself and the south side of the valley downstream towards Toledo. The whole area "floats," as it were, beside and above hundreds of water-channels ranging in scale from waterways to narrow irrigation ditches. As a result, it appears as a green oasis in a

* Aranjuez and its history were elegantly synthesized by Carmen Añón Feliú in her contribution to von Droste B., Plachter H. and Rössler M., *Cultural Landscapes of Universal Value – Components of a Global Strategy* (Fischer Verlag, Jena, Stuttgart and New York, 1995), pp 295–306. The nomination elaborates on but closely follows her work, in particular using her categorization of the types of landscape present at Aranjuez (as does the Guidebook submitted with the nomination). The present "Description" therefore uses the same structure.

landscape otherwise of sierra type, dry, brown and fairly barren of vegetation as a result of climate, geomorphology, and over-exploitive land-use. This "natural effect" is based on the genuinely natural resources of the place but is actually artificial, the result of a conscientious effort to create a place of enjoyment and well-being, a sort of Eden for its inhabitants and visitors.

The site incorporates a planned town, large gardens, vegetable gardens and orchards, lagoons, rivers and waterworks, woods, and moors. The main elements are:

1. *The Palace and Island Garden* The Palace lies along the south bank of the Tajo, arranged around a plaza with, on the east, the King's Garden of irregular plan with fountains and, on the west, avenues and vistas eventually cut by the railway. Across a canal to the north, entirely within a sharp bend of the river beyond the Garden of the Statues and a fountain, is the geometric Island Garden full of fountains and other structures. Beyond that are kitchen gardens, with woodland occupying the end and sides of the peninsular.

2. *The Great Historic Garden (Huertas Históricas)* This consists of a series of gardens which together comprise the bulk of the area of the nominated property. On the west, at the junction of the rivers, is Legamarejo Garden, essentially a large number of small irrigated plots with boundaries connecting to the feeder channels following the river banks on either side and only in part related to a south-westerly axial line from the Garden of the Twelve Roads (*see below*). North-east of that is the Picotajo Garden with some irrigation channels but generally larger plots and much more closely related in its main subdivisions to the geometry of the axial line already mentioned. It is bisected by the main railway line to Madrid. North-east of that again is the Garden of the Twelve Roads, a roughly triangular area with a near-central point from which radiate twelve alignments marked by roads and tracks. The longest is that to the southwest through the two gardens already described. Four others link westwards to the adjacent Rebollo Garden, the whole of its southern edge along the north bank of the Tajo. Like the Legamarejo Garden, it is characterized by irrigation channels, most striking in plan being an extensive area of regular, rectilinear plots either side of a channel through its centre and parallel to the river.

3. *The urban area* For the purposes of the nomination, this is subdivided into two: an industrial area west of the Palace, incorporating the railway station and the gardens west of the Palace (*see 1. above*); and the 18th century town which is now the historic core of modern Aranjuez. The original town plan is intact, incorporating in particular, across its northern, riverside end, two broad avenues radiating from the east end of the Palace and earlier than, though apparently cutting, the urban geometric grid plan. In the town's north-western corner, adjacent to the Palace, is a complex of official buildings around the Plaza de San Antonio, with other major civic, religious, and private buildings, including five nobles' palaces, occurring throughout the measured symmetry of the urban fabric. The southern edge of the grid is marked by the Bull Ring.

4. *The Prince's Garden* This late 18th/early 19th century garden stretches along the south bank of the Tajo, north-east of the town. Its ruler-straight southern edge is along the *Calle de la Reina*, the third, and most northerly, of the easterly lines radiating from the Palace (*see 3. above*). It contains two distinct areas, each with further subdivisions

in terms of separate units of designed garden. The westerly half is subdivided into eight gardens, all essentially geometric to a greater or less extent except for one half of the *Jardín Séptimo* which is arranged around an irregular water feature with an island hermitage. Outstanding in the magnificent botanical collection are eighteen monumental trees. The eastern half, the *Parque de Miraflores* (1848), was a park in the English style, effectively an irrigated horticultural/nursery area where functionalism took precedence over ornamental geometry. Now decayed, it is not open to the public. Overall, the network of ditches in the Prince's Garden is more than 6000m in length, from which the entire garden is naturally watered.

These elements are subsumed in a series of intermeshed landscapes as perceived by the nomination, all combining conceptually to create a cultural landscape:

- The water landscape: rivers, leets, dams, ditches, fountains

In medieval times and earlier the valley was filled with marshy areas, mud slides, water courses, forests, and wetlands. Archaeology shows early attempts to control this natural situation in Roman and Visigothic times. The documented history of Aranjuez began as an attempt to control its rivers by restraining, crossing, and steering them. The riverbanks were filled with dams, jetties, feeders, and bridges, and came to represent a pioneer system of hydraulic engineering. The rivers both demanded and gave the opportunity for the development of a complex system of irrigation which enriched Arabic and medieval traditions with Renaissance engineering. Phillip II built leets in particular as part of an irrigation system for the area's fertile soils as he attempted to create in central Spain a little bit of landscape like those he had seen in Flanders and knew about from Italy. The ubiquitous water is both symbolic and functional. It tells on the one hand of life and happiness and provides the stage for metaphorical shipyards, naval fleets, and iconographic statues and fountains. On the other, it releases the fertility of the soil for edible crops while providing a moving dimension in the static formal geometry of the ornamental gardens.

- The agricultural landscape: vegetable gardens, orchards, nurseries and stock-breeding

The growing of edible crops at Aranjuez depends on the soil's fertility and the success of irrigation not only in providing water but in controlling flooding. Royalty banished "common" vegetables and encouraged the cultivation of "worthy and regal" varieties. Aranjuez gave its name to exquisite fruits: in particular strawberries, asparagus, plums, and water pears. Agricultural experiments were based on models in Flanders, Switzerland, and Valencia. The grounds contain a fowl house, a cattle house, and, in particular, the Royal Stud House, which greatly contributed to the breeding of Spanish horses.

- The gardens, a delectable landscape

The gardens along the Tajo are representative of the Spanish experience in this field: Renaissance gardens with a slight Arab touch; Baroque and French Classicism-style gardens; "Anglo-Chinese" gardens; and 19th century bourgeois gardens. Trees and shrubs from all over the Spanish Empire were brought to be acclimatized and cross-cultivated, often then being returned to their place of origin.

- Landscape and geometry

There is no single geometric axis or grid for the whole site, but the whole of the site is affected by geometric design ranging from the grand alignments of Phillip II and the "Great Historic Garden" to detailed arrangements in nursery gardens. If there is one main axis, it is the *Calle de la Reina* laid out by Phillip II with that intention. If there is one main control point, it is the node in the Garden of the Twelve Roads, for its axial influence extends right across the whole property north of the River Tajo and, indeed, across the river to the lines radiating from the Palace and the geometry of the new town. Particularly outstanding is the way in which the apparently asymmetrical, rectilinear grid of the new town, a late addition to an already geometrically complex landscape, was "mortised" into existing axial lines emanating both from the Royal Palace and from the gardens. Geometry also influenced parts of the hydraulic system, though clearly other factors were at play there; conversely, the hydrology fed the fountains and ponds, which were usually placed at particular points determined by geometry, albeit serving an aesthetic purpose (eg in the Island Garden and the western parts of the Prince's Garden).

- The constructed landscape: roads, architecture, town

The "New City" was built in the 18th century fronting on to the Tajo. It was designed in the form of a new garden, but with buildings where there would have been flowerbeds. A pattern of radial and lattice lines is superimposed on the geometric plan. The *Canal de las Aves* zigzags its way through the town centre; straight, tree-lined streets overlie channels of running water. The architecture and the urban spaces are contrived to seem like decoration for the abundant vegetation in and visible from the streetscape. The whole is linked visually, in plan, hydrologically, and botanically to the surrounding landscape, yet the city is part of that landscape in a unique composition.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Two legal instruments are specific to Aranjuez. The whole area was declared an Historical Complex in 1983 under the Spanish Heritage Law. This sets basic guidelines to ensure the preservation and upkeep of the city's historic area as well as the landmarks, palaces, orchards, avenues and groves. The Urban Development Plan sets objectives for and analyses the city's status and preservation, establishing what sort of activities should be encouraged and discouraged. In addition, the nominated area is covered by a wide range of regulations from other government bodies (eg the Madrid Community and Aranjuez City Council).

Management

National, regional, and local agencies are all involved separately, but it now seems that a series of specialized agencies are likely to exert control over the preservation of the historical complex. They are: the National Heritage, in charge of Crown properties such as palaces and gardens; the Local Heritage Commission, consisting of representatives of regional and local government; the Technological Institute for Agricultural Development, Ministry of the Environment, which manages the orchards and historical avenues; and the Tajo Hydrographic Confederation, which is in charge of the management of the water and its associated structures.

The nomination dossier is descriptive of these and other management matters, but no analysis is provided of effectiveness, nor proposals for prioritization, co-ordination, review, or revision. ICOMOS would stress the need for the ready availability of high-quality management information, based here above all on well researched historical data implemented by management sympathetic to the priority of historicity throughout the work of maintaining and improving the site.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

Essentially the well-being of Aranjuez was sustained and promoted under continuous Royal care until the 1868 Revolution. Ownership then became fragmented and the site became both prey to neglect and vulnerable to pressures of industrial, commercial, and demographic growth. Despite a railway and National Highway through it, and despite being surrounded by economic development, it survived this phase remarkably well, however, and was undergoing restorative programmes and enjoying better-informed conservation management by the end of the 20th century. The Ayuntamiento has, for example, embarked on a programme of renewing and repairing the avenues and their associated roads in the former Royal estate where they are such a key element in the historical layout. The ICOMOS mission noted, however, that many components of the site need repairing, renewing, improving, and even, in some cases, recreating in order to improve the historical integrity and the understanding of it for the present-day visitor.

Authenticity and integrity

Both the natural and geometric bases of the site as a whole survive remarkably well, with relatively little loss and effectively (modern communication routes apart) no inappropriate intrusion. Major buildings as well as the city's layout and its gardens and tree-lined avenues have been preserved as the characteristic of an urban community among orchards and groves living on a ground plan mimicking those of ornamental gardens across the river. Though some of the garden areas require restoration, overall the state of preservation is such that the site is able to demonstrate clearly, not its state at any one moment in history but the stages of its development from the mid-16th to the mid-19th century.

The most important general factor which makes Aranjuez and its landscape distinctive and a strong candidate for World Heritage status is the way in which it has been shaped and developed by the interests of the Kings and Queens of Spain and their Courts between the early 16th and mid-19th centuries. Both Charles V and Phillip II were leading figures in Europe and the world in their time, and therefore in the history of Europe and the world. They were extremely well informed, immensely influential, and wealthy. The present site still recognizably represents the Golden Age of Aranjuez, not only as the creation of Spanish Royalty but as a place and a period when ideas and materials from much of the known world came to Aranjuez and ideas and influence emanated from it for long after the 16th century.

A detail, but an important one, is that the Palace was originally approached from the west and not the east, ie from both Toledo and Madrid. This is now impossible because both bridges across the Rio Tajo are missing.

The ICOMOS mission noted the omission from the nomination, without explanation, of several structures and features which appear to be integral parts of the whole: eg the Royal stable near the Rio Tajo east of the Jardín del Príncipe, the Casa de la Monta, and the late 18th century model farm, the Real Cortijo de San Isidro.

Another question concerns the wider landscape: the views out from the proposed area, and the way in which the proposed area sits within the wider landscape, are significant aspects of the nature of the site and its integrity. In particular, the boundary on the north-west should be across, not along, the Rio Jarama.

A daily loss of integrity is produced by the large amount of traffic, affecting not just the town but also the Palace, the gardens, and their landscape setting. Improvements need to continue to be made and to be kept under review.

The site is in general of high integrity and retains its authenticity to a considerable degree, authenticity of place and in design, architecture, and hydrology, and to a surprising extent, in function too, though it has, of course, lost its role as a royal residence.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 2001. It also consulted the ICOMOS-IFLA International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Landscapes.

Qualities

Aranjuez the town, as distinct from the whole landscape, is an integral part of the cultural landscape. In this context, its relationship with the design of both the water management and with the geometric dimension of the planned landscape is outstanding. As a town in its own right, its salient characteristics are covered by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 27, where it falls into category (ii), and by paragraph 29 where it meets criteria about "spatial organization, structure, materials, forms and ... functions" which "essentially reflect the civilization which [has] prompted the nomination," and falls into category (iii), "Historic centres that cover exactly the same area as ancient towns and are now enclosed within modern cities." Aranjuez the town is, in other words, a distinctive and distinguished urban ensemble which might well have been considered for World Heritage status in its own right. However, it is properly presented in its landscape context, thereby adding to understanding of its own nature and becoming a key element in the cultural landscape nominated for World Heritage status.

Stages of that landscape's development from the mid-16th to mid-19th century are clear on the ground and in plan. This is particularly important because several of the stages capture significant phases in the development of European thought, scientific enquiry, and landscape design.

The combination of natural situation with running water, managed hydrology, fertile soils, scientific horticulture, great garden design, royal palatial context, and planned urban development makes for an outstanding cultural landscape, well within the Western tradition in thought and physical realization but expressing values of global interest about matters such as man/nature relationships, technology, and

aesthetics, and how rulers can best use their power and resources.

Comparative analysis

The nomination offers no comparative analysis. A guidebook submitted with it contains, however, a map of "European Royal Sites" which presumably provides the context within which Aranjuez would wish to be seen. These include: within Spain, the Escorial (World Heritage Site – WHS) and La Granja clustered with Aranjuez around Madrid; Sintra (WHS) and Queluz near Lisbon; Caserta (WHS) near Naples; Schönbrunn (WHS) outside Vienna; Potsdam (WHS), Berlin; Compiègne, Versailles (WHS) and Fontainebleau (WHS) around Paris; Greenwich (WHS), Hampton Court, and Windsor near London; and Mariefred outside Stockholm

The constant references in the nomination's text to the sources of inspiration underlying the development of Aranjuez also imply comparisons. Phillip II in particular was much influenced in terms of waterscape by his travels in Flanders. A completely different example of external influence is the Petit Trianon at Versailles, which was the immediate reference for the artificial streams and ponds arranged irregularly as the context for classical pavilions and "eye-catchers" of Chinese and Turkish inspiration, obelisks, false ruins, and artificial prospect mounds in the Prince's Garden.

Though design and cultural context are completely different, at global level this nomination seems as a cultural landscape conceptually close to that of Vat Phou, Laos, among current nominations.

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

The nomination documentation was exemplary in many respects but it made ICOMOS's task a little more difficult than need have been the case by containing no comparative analysis and omitting a scale from all maps.

No management plan was submitted with the nomination. All the elements required in a management plan are actually present in, though dispersed throughout, the documentation. The missing elements are a statement of objectives on a short- and long-term basis (five and twenty years?) and a formal mechanism for reviewing implementation of the plan and making consequential revisions.

ICOMOS also recommends that such revision should include reconsideration of the boundaries of the nominated property. Some buildings are inexplicably omitted. More generally, the outer boundaries of the buffer zone across the river on the north-west and west of the site need rethinking.. Although the river itself is clearly a convenient line, ICOMOS is anxious to see some protection in place of views out of the core zone into the surrounding countryside.

Further consideration also needs to be given to an exposition of the policies, both general and more specific, that will apply to the proposed site and buffer zone, in connection with their conservation, care, and use. It would also help if more explanation could be offered in respect of the management structure for the implementation of these policies. Mechanisms for co-ordination, monitoring, and review are needed.

With regard to executive capacity, ICOMOS notes the familiar organizational complexity and overlapping fields of responsibilities and expertises that exist in the management

of the whole site It therefore recommends that the authorities concerned give serious consideration to the establishment, under democratic control, of a dedicated executive agency solely concerned with promoting, sustaining, and, where necessary, defending the interests of the nominated property. This might well prove to be appropriate in so large and multi-dimensional a cultural landscape which can only be given part of the attention of institutions with many other responsibilities. It would follow such a step in the case of the Loire Valley and run with a similar proposal being implemented in the case of Alto Douro, Portugal (currently being evaluated).

ICOMOS reiterates its appreciation of both this site and the quality of the work on the nomination already achieved. Its unusually detailed response here recognizes those facts, and is motivated by the thought that here is a splendid opportunity to produce an exemplary World Heritage site if all concerned will dedicate time and effort to achieving a correct nomination.

Whether or not Aranjuez be inscribed on the World Heritage List, the fact that eight royal palace/park/garden complexes in Europe are already inscribed might suggest that, in a world perspective, the List is now reasonably representative in this respect (particularly as it also includes other, non-royal, European designed parks/gardens).

Brief description

The Aranjuez cultural landscape is an entity of complex relationships between man and nature, between horticulture and ornamental garden, between fixed structures and flowing water, between sinuous water courses and straight lines of geometric landscape design, between the rural and the urban, between carefully regulated treescapes and as carefully modulated architecture in palatial buildings, garden furniture, and streetscape. Three hundred years of Royal attention to the development and care of this landscape have seen it variously express concepts such as humanism and political centralization and enshrine values such as those in the 18th century of the French-style Baroque garden and, a little later, urban living side by side with the scientific practice of plant acclimatization and stock-breeding in the Age of Enlightenment.

Supplementary documentation, including a management plan, was submitted by the State Party in May 2001, after the meeting of the ICOMOS World Heritage Panel. The detailed management plan has been studied by ICOMOS, which considers that it conforms with the requirements of the Committee. The points raised by ICOMOS relating to conservation policies, management structure, and coordination mechanisms are dealt with in a satisfactory manner and the boundaries of the nominated property have been modified.

Statement of Significance

Aranjuez represents the coming together of diverse cultural influences to create a cultural landscape that had a formative influence on further developments in this field. Its components illustrate seminal advances in landscape design.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

Criterion ii Aranjuez represents the coming together of diverse cultural influences to create a cultural landscape that had a formative influence on further developments in this field.

Criterion iv The complex designed cultural landscape of Aranjuez, derived from a variety of sources, mark a seminal stage in the development of landscape design.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred*, to allow ICOMOS an opportunity to review the recently received integrated management plan for the Aranjuez Cultural Landscape.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Fertö-Neusiedler Lake (Austria/Hungary)

No 772rev

Identification

Nomination	Natural Site and Cultural Landscape of Fertö-Neusiedler Lake
Location	Burgenland, Austria Györ-Moson-Sopron County, Hungary
State Party	Republic of Austria and Republic of Hungary
Date	7 June 2000

Justification by State Party

The Fertö-Neusiedler Lake and its surroundings are an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement and land-use representative of a culture. The present character of the landscape is the result of millennia-old land-use forms based on stock-raising and viticulture to an extent not found in other European lake areas. The historic centre of the medieval free town of Rust constitutes an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement representative of the area. The town exhibits the special building mode of a society and culture within which the lifestyles of townspeople and farmers form a united whole.

Criterion v

Notes

- i. Other elements under criterion v were advanced by the States Parties but are excluded here because they lie outside the nominated area.
- ii. This property is nominated as a *mixed* site; the natural significance has been assessed by IUCN, whose recommendation that it should not be inscribed under the natural criteria was accepted by the Bureau at its 25th Session in June 2001.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. Under paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, it is also a *cultural landscape*.

History and Description

History

Two broad periods can be discerned: from c 6000 BC until the establishment of the Hungarian state in the 11th century AD and from the 11th century until the present. The

nomination lies in a region that was Hungarian territory from the 10th century until World War I.

The landscape began to be developed from at least the 6th millennium BC. Then, early Neolithic communities lived in large permanent villages: a row of such settlements follows the southern shore of the Lake. Cultural and trading connections with neighbouring areas are characteristics of a later Neolithic phase. Distinct cultural attributes distinguish a phase at the beginning of the 4th millennium when settlements were on different sites and cattle-raising was the basis of the economy. Metallurgy was introduced around 2000 BC, and thereafter this area shared in what appears to be a general European prosperity in the 2nd millennium BC. One of its manifestations was the dispersal of amber: the Amber Route connecting the Baltic and the Adriatic passed near the Lake.

From the 7th century BC onwards the shore of the Lake was densely populated, initially by people of the Early Iron Age Hallstatt culture and on through late prehistoric and Roman times. In the fields of almost every village around the Lake there are remains of Roman villas. Two in Fertörákos are accompanied by a 3rd century AD Mithraic temple which is open to visitors. The Roman hegemony was ended in the late 4th century AD, however, by the first of numerous invasions, beginning a phase of continual change and bewildering replacement of one people by another until the Avar Empire in the 9th century. Hungarians occupied the Carpathian Basin and became the overlords of the Lake area around AD 900.

A new state and public administration system was established in the 11th century. Sopron, a place with prehistoric and Roman origins, became the seat of the bailiff and centre of the county named after it. The basis of the current network of towns and villages was formed in the 12th and 13th centuries, their markets flourishing from 1277 onwards, when they were effectively relieved of many fiscal duties. A migration of German settlers started in the 13th century and continued throughout the Middle Ages. The mid-13th century Tatar invasion left this area unharmed, and it enjoyed uninterrupted development throughout medieval times until the Turkish conquest in the late 16th century. The economic basis throughout was the export of animals and wine.

Rust in particular prospered on the wine trade. Its refortification in the early 16th century as a response to the then emerging Ottoman threat marked the beginning of a phase of construction in the area, first with fortifications and then, during the 17th–19th centuries, with the erection and adaptation of domestic buildings. The liberation of the peasants after 1848 and the political situation after 1867 promoted development and building activity was renewed. The most important events locally in the second half of the 19th century were the construction of railways and the completion of the water management facilities.

In the 20th century, the Austro-Hungarian frontier created after World War I divided the area into two, but true isolation started only with the establishment of the Iron Curtain between the Communist world and the rest of Europe after World War II. It was at Fertörákos, "the place where the first brick was knocked out of the Berlin wall," that participants at a Pan-European Picnic tore down the barbed wire and re-opened the frontier which still crosses the Lake.

Description

The site lies between the Alps, 70km distant, and the lowlands in the territory of two states, Austria and Hungary. The Lake itself is in an advanced state of sedimentation, with extensive reed stands. It has existed for 500 years within an active water management regime. In the 19th century canalization of Hanság shut the Lake off from its freshwater marshland. Since 1912 completion of a circular dam ending at Hegykő to the south has prevented flooding.

The Lake is surrounded by an inner ring of sixteen settlements and an outer ring of twenty other settlements. However, only three – Podersdorf, Illmitz, and Apetlon – are entirely within the nominated area, with parts of Rust and Fertörákos also included. The Palace of the township of Nagycenk is included as a detached part of the core zone; Fertöd Palace is also included, though in a detached area of core zone outside the buffer zone.

Among the three dozen or so settlements within the buffer zone, several are picked out by the nomination as being particularly noteworthy: Rust above all, but also Mörbisch, with its typical narrow lanes, Donnerkirschen, with its homogeneous settlement structure, walled Purbach, Breitenbrunn with its peel tower, and Fertörákos, formerly a lakeside settlement but now left high and dry as the Lake has shrunk. It must be stressed, however, that, except for parts of the first and last in that list, none are within the nominated area, and so they are not further described here.

Two palaces are both within detached portions of core area. Széchenyi Palace, Nagycenk, lies at the southern end of the Lake, associated above all with one of the greatest personalities in modern Hungarian history, Earl Széchenyi István (1791–1860). The settlement itself was created by merging several smaller medieval villages. The Palace is a detached ensemble of buildings in the centre of a large park, initially built in the mid-18th century on the site of a former manor house. It acquired some of its present form and appearance around 1800. An addition in the 1830s, based on English models, was accompanied by sanitary novelties, while on the east were the stables for some twenty stallions and sixty mares bought by Earl Széchenyi in England as a basis for renewed horse-breeding in Hungary. The Baroque Palace garden originated in the 17th century. Its main avenue runs for 2.6km to the lake-shore. In the late 18th century an English-style landscape garden was laid out. Following fashion, major trees were added in the 1860s. They and other plants survived World War II but the building was much damaged.

Between 1769 and 1790 Josef Haydn's compositions were first heard in the Fertöd Esterházy Palace. It was the most important 18th century palace of Hungary, built after the model of Versailles. The plan of the palace, garden, and park was on geometrical lines which extended to the new village of Esterháza. There, outside the palace settlement, were public buildings, industrial premises, and residential quarters. The Palace itself is laid out around a square with rounded internal corners. To the south is an enormous French Baroque garden; the main avenue is more than 1km long. The garden itself has been changed several times, the present layout being essentially that of 1762. The garden was reconstructed in 1904 after a long period of disuse and the Baroque composition, though many of its elements require restoration, remains almost intact.

Management and Protection

Legal status

Ownership is complex: in the Austrian part of the nomination less than 1% lies with the State, the bulk of the 41,590ha belonging to private owners and communities. In the Hungarian part, within the Fertö-Hanság National Park the State owns 10,790ha (86%), with other owners there and elsewhere in the nominated areas being local government, the Church, and private individuals.

Cultural property, including outstanding monuments, groups of buildings, and objects, is protected by the Austrian Monument Protection Act 1923, subsequently amended several times. The entire historic centre of the free town of Rust is under a preservation order. In Hungary, the legal situation continues to evolve. The Fertö-Hanság National Park was created in 1994, and now the nationalization of National Park land formerly owned by co-operatives should soon be completed. New laws replacing the object-and-monument-centred approach are in train. Law No 65 of 1990 made the protection of the built environment a task of both the communities and county-level local government. Law No 54 of 1997 endeavours to promote the interests of monument preservation within a holistic concept of protecting the built environment with due consideration to numerous other factors, including the promotion of public awareness of the cultural heritage. The Széchenyi Palace, Nagycenk, and the whole assembly of historic monuments come under this Law; the same applies to the Fertöd Esterházy Palace as well as the former Bishop's Palace and its garden in the protected area of Fertörákos. Law No 78 of 1997 defines as an objective the protection of village-scapes and landscapes.

The Hungarian part of the nomination is covered by the National Land Use Plan, which recognizes the Fertö-Hanság National Park as a priority area and extremely sensitive in terms of cultural heritage. The Park has recently been successful in attracting significant foreign funding for infrastructural development. Overall, the objective is to preserve the entire heritage as a single entity.

Management

For conserving the existing cultural properties on both sides of the frontier, responsibilities are distributed between Federal, provincial, and local levels. In Austria the combined effects of the Monument Protection Act and village renewal regulation within a tourist context encourage sustainable tourism. In practice, work and resources are in the hands of the cultural office of the provincial government, the Burgenland tourist association, provincial museums, and village renewal advisory boards. The last produce binding village renewal plans which provide the framework for management and development.

Management is designed to supervise and monitor the state of preservation. A complete inventory of monuments and sites compiled at State level is available for conservation and management. Arrangements are similar on the Hungarian side.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

The whole area has been a nature and landscape protection area since 1965, and the protection area has been classified as a reserve under the Ramsar Convention since 1983. The Fertö-Neusiedler Lake is a MAB Biosphere Reserve. In Austria, Neusiedler See-Seewinkel National Park (1993) is within the Ramsar area. The southern (Hungarian) end of the proposed site has been a landscape protection area since 1977 and the Fertö-Hanság National Park since 1992.

The traditional architectural monuments within the property and buffer zone are well preserved as regards the original fabric, appearance, and artistic effect. The continuing preservation and maintenance of the historic building material is guaranteed. Rust was declared a "model town" as a fully preserved vintners' town by the Council of Europe in 1975.

The provincial government of Burgenland recognizes the principle of sustainable tourism and the special needs of a region characterized by comprehensive landscape, nature, and monument conservation programmes. Since 1976 it has tried to reduce mass tourism in favour of individual travellers. Policies and programmes designed to present and promote the area are in place in a number of towns and villages and throughout the National Park. Nevertheless, especially in the Austrian part of the buffer zone, changes to the fabric of several settlements and in the appearance of numerous buildings, both as a result of unsympathetic modernization over the last decades of the 20th century, have cumulatively detracted from the historicity of an important element in the landscape. Tourism grew during the same period and the authorities nevertheless recognize that properly preserved houses and townscapes are among the area's main tourist attractions. The Hungarian National Park maintains a separate department responsible for "soft" or sustainable tourism in an area visited by c 500,000 people per year.

Authenticity and integrity

- Authenticity

The landscape overall and the scale as well as the internal structure and characteristically rural architecture of the towns and villages bear witness to an agricultural land-use and way of life uninterrupted since medieval times. The nomination dossier claims that "Both the area proposed for inscription and the buffer zone are characterized by a continuing settlement history dating back to the Middle Ages"; the settlement pattern, and indeed the occupation, of several present-day village sites actually go back to Roman times and earlier. Buildings, walls, and vistas have been preserved in such places as Donnerskirchen and Purbach, both nevertheless carefully excluded from the core zone of the nomination.

A varied ownership pattern is exemplified by the remarkable rural architecture of the very small villages situated in the buffer zone and by the Fertöd Esterhazy and Nagycenk Széchenyi Palaces, outstanding examples of the nobility's architecture of the 18th and 19th centuries.

- Integrity

The landscape of the Fertö-Neusiedler Lake area has advantageous natural and climatic conditions which have made it suitable for agricultural cultivation and stock-raising

for thousands of years. The water, the reed-beds with their labyrinth of channels, the saline fields once flooded by salt water, the row of hills enclosing the lake from the west with forests and vineyards on top represent not only the natural-geographical component features but also hundreds of years of identical land-use, making the area a unique example of humans living in harmony with nature. The Leitha limestone, west of the Lake and quarried from Roman times until the mid-20th century, provided building stone to Sopron and Vienna as well as local settlements.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

A joint ICOMOS-IUCN expert mission visited the site in March 2001

Qualities

The area in general is of considerable cultural interest, though much of the landscape containing and expressing that interest lies in the buffer zone. The nominated area is primarily concerned with the Lake itself and its shores, and does not of itself constitute a cultural landscape. The Lake is changing and affecting its environs, yet much of the cultural value of the area lies in its genuinely unchanging qualities of way of life and landscape based upon a traditional and sustainable exploitation of a limited range of resources – particular habitats for reed-production, cattle-raising, fishing, and viticulture. Though tourism is both a change and a bringer of change, as a phenomenon it was recognized early and has been quite successfully controlled and modified to suit the area. As a result, and largely concerning the buffer zone, the insertion of the intrusively modern has been largely confined to some of the main settlements and is not generally apparent in either the wider landscape or individual farms. Much of the vernacular architecture is well preserved and is considered by many to be outstandingly attractive. One of the great palaces of Europe, with a smaller one of great national interest, stand in the core zone at the Lake's southern edge, both related, like everything else here, to the Lake itself.

Comparative analysis

The area is characterized by a long tradition of viticulture – strong red wines on the low-level lime-based rock and light white wines on the eastern river bank since Roman times. A similar viticultural area occurs on the Balaton hills, Hungary, but they are on slopes and open straight on to the water without the intervention of reed beds. The cattle-raised beside the Lake, on the Aföld meadows, were driven to the Austrian and German markets. That they were raised here at all, however, results from the creation by natural forces of excellent pastures, which has permitted a particular type of economic activity otherwise more characteristic of Eastern Europe and Asian grassy biospheres, unknown to the west of Fertö-Neusiedler Lake.

Under "Comparative analysis" the nomination dossier asserts that "The geographical position of the Lake has contributed to an uninterrupted evolutionary process involving diverse civilizations across two thousand years. Such an organic evolution, interaction and close association between the Lake and the local population cannot be found in any of the comparable lakes." However, no further comparative analysis of cultural matters is offered there, though elsewhere it is stated that "The

organic, historical and diverse associations of humans with the ecological environment in the Fertö-Neusiedler Lake area is unique among the salty, saline lakes of the world." However, the comparative analysis of cultural matters offered by the States Parties is weak: two assertions do not constitute a compelling argument. On a comparative basis, the nominated area of the Fertö-Neusiedler Lake and its immediate surroundings are not presented as at all exceptional in terms of cultural quality or history.

In fact, lakeside settlement by humans involving fishing and stock-raising is common throughout Europe and has been since the advent of people with domesticated animals c 6000 BC. It flourished in particular around, for example, Swiss lakes in the 2nd millennium BC, the Somerset marshes in England in the 1st millennium BC, and Scottish and Irish lakes in the 1st millennium AD. A combination of stock-raising and fishing with viticulture beside a lake, as distinct from other crops and watersides, is, however, less common and obviously confined to the wine-growing zone. Analogues should therefore probably be sought in the Mediterranean region or, for example, in the Rhône or Rhine/Moselle drainage basins. A further qualification is added in this case, however, because the Lake is saline, which makes the combination of qualities rare. This is perhaps emphasized by the obviously comparable saline lakes in, for example, Israel whose shores support neither viticulture nor cattle-breeding. IUCN has prepared from the point of view of natural interest a comparative analysis of saline lakes in the world for its report.

In comparable terms, a strong argument for a rare combination of factors occurring at Fertö-Neusiedler Lake can probably be advanced, including interactions between people and nature. However, more thought needs to be given to the expression of that cultural and cultural/natural dimension in the landscape, both on the ground in terms of what exactly needs to be nominated, and why, and on paper to develop whatever line of argument proves most appropriate for World Heritage cultural landscape purposes..

ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action

i The documentation specifies only one *cultural criterion* (v) to justify this nomination. The whole area does indeed clearly constitute an "example of a traditional human settlement and land-use," and one criterion may well be sufficient; but most of the human settlement is excluded from the nominated area and discussion of land-use is conducted by simplistic reiteration. ICOMOS strongly advises that it is essential to demonstrate by the production of good cultural evidence (for example from documentary research) and by cogent argument, that an area is a cultural landscape in World Heritage terms.

ii ICOMOS notes in particular that the nomination is over-reliant on its reiteration throughout of the importance of the string of lake-side settlements which are – judging by the care with which the boundary of the core zone avoids them – nevertheless deliberately excluded from the nominated area. This discordance between perception and text/graphics is nowhere explained. Furthermore, not one settlement is illustrated with a plan, nor are either of the two palaces which are within the nomination. The section on "Cultural property," which is mainly about the villages excluded from the core zone, is therefore in a sense largely irrelevant, unnecessarily long, and difficult to follow.

iii The absence of plans is a serious impediment to understanding the detail and nuances of this nomination. It also suggests an absence of realization that settlement-form and settlement pattern are "cultural." There is no serious spatial/historical analysis of the settlements, though clearly this could contribute much to the interest of the nomination, especially if at least some settlements, carefully selected by clearly stated criteria, were included in the nomination. They are an integral part of the cultural landscape physically and should also be integral both conceptually and, in practice, in the way the nomination is defined and presented. ICOMOS advises that it regards this matter as central to a successful nomination in this case and would encourage the nominees to address it.

iv In addition to the major query about the line of the boundary of the core zone, there are several queries about detail of boundaries as they stand at present.

v ICOMOS notes that this property is nominated as a mixed site, the cultural aspect being defined as a cultural landscape. It recommends that, if the Fertö-Neusiedler Lake area is to be considered as such, the nomination requires significant reconsideration of the boundaries of the core area and of the concepts within which they are redefined. In particular, the States Parties should be invited to clarify their thinking about and presentation of the lakeside villages and about fields and field systems, preferably in conjunction with their villages.

Statement of Significance

The Fertö-Neusiedler Lake area is the meeting place of peoples arriving as migrants or conquerors. The dynamism of the Lake itself has presented people with both challenges to face and a resource to exploit since their arrival here some eight thousand years ago. The diverse cultural landscape of which it is the core has been created by an organic process of evolution, by the work of man living in symbiosis with the natural environment.

ICOMOS Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the two State Parties, requesting them to revise it as proposed in "ICOMOS recommendations and comments" above, paragraph v. In the event that the revised text is submitted in time and found to be satisfactory, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criterion v*:

Criterion v The Fertö-Neusiedler Lake has been the meeting place of different cultures for eight millennia, and this is graphically demonstrated by its varied landscape, the result of an evolutionary and symbiotic process of human interaction with the physical environment.

Bureau Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the two States Parties, requesting them to revise it as proposed in the ICOMOS recommendations.

ICOMOS, September 2001

Sikhote-Alin (Russian Federation)

No 766rev

Identification

Nomination	Natural complex «Central Sikhote-Alin»
Location	Ternejski, Krasnoarmejski, Dalnegorski, and Pozharski Districts, Primorski Region
State Party	Russian Federation
Date	27 June 2000

Justification by State Party

Archaeological monuments include late Palaeolithic sites with material analogues on Hokkaido Island (Japan), a reminder that, as with the natural history, the property occupies a key location in the study of the interface between Eurasia and further east including, ultimately, North America. Bronze Age and medieval sites also exist on the property.

The traditions, language, and material culture of the present-day Udege and their ancestors have been preserved and are respected. Special words are in use for various types of building: for example, *kumirni* used as both birthing huts and mortuaries. Traditional clothes are retained for ceremonies, festivals, and ritual occasions.

Notes

i The dossier specifies no criteria under which this nomination is proposed: the most appropriate cultural criteria, should the nomination be approved, would appear to be iii and v (and only those two on present evidence).

ii This property is nominated as a *mixed site* under both natural and cultural criteria. IUCN will provide a complementary evaluation of the natural qualities.

iii In 1996 a nomination of this property for World Heritage status was deferred by the Bureau on the grounds that the boundary of the nomination was not justified, that a legal basis was provided for only 14% of the nominated area, and that the Regional Government wished to be involved in a revised nomination. The last of those conditions has been met and the second one may have been, but the nomination contains no statement specifically on this matter.

Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this

is a *site*. It should also be considered a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

History and Description

History

People were active in the area in prehistoric times. In the 7th century AD arrivals from Zabaikalie created a new Tungus-language society, the Mukri, who developed under Mongol and Turkish influence. In the mid-19th century, the Ussuri region became part of Russia, and thereafter various "Western" influences affected local culture to some degree. Despite the remoteness, traditional clothing materials, for example, were replaced by woven cloths in the 19th century for everyday use. About 1900 Chinese migrants brought with them naive Taoism to mix with Udege paganism. A further addition was given to local culture by the arrival of Russian Old Believers, devout ultra-orthodox Christians fleeing persecution and seeking refuge in the remote valleys and mountains that were the hunting and collecting territories of the indigenous peoples.

The process of collectivization reached even as far east as Central Sikhote-Alin. In the later 1930s the population in the nominated area was brought together in just two settlements, one of which, Krasny Yar, continues as the main settlement today. In 1993, the Sikhote-Alin Ethnic territory was formalized around the concept of man in relation to the taiga (pine forest) environment, itself representative of the principle, admirably expressed by the nomination, of "the reasonable and sparing use of the nature resources," so characteristic of the indigenous peoples of this area in former times as well as the present. The continuance of the indigenous way of life is now, however, under severe threat, both because of the small size of the population (*c* 2000) and from external influence.

Description

The nominated property lies on the eastern coast of Asia between extreme north-eastern China and the Sea of Japan. The total area of the nomination is 1,549,179ha, made up of five blocks of land. Only 2000 people live within it, a low number even by Siberian standards of population density. It is a unique region with locally dominant woodland such as virgin, broad-leaved Korean pine forests on either side of the Bikim valley to the north-west and, to the south in the Sikhote-Alin Nature Reserve and along the coast, discrete areas of larch and Japanese oak. Overall, the environment is remarkably stable and unpolluted.

Reference is made in the nomination dossier to the existence of Bronze Age and medieval sites on the property, but it does not enlarge on their number or significance.

The territory is home to the remaining indigenous Udege people, 700 of whom live in one village, Krasny Yar, in the Bikim valley immediately west of one of the nominated areas. Hunting and fishing are their traditional and basic activities, combined with collecting fern, berries, mushrooms, and seeds. Their ability to manage the game animals and the habitat by the effective use of non-wood resources is critical to the survival of the Udege. A particular habitat of

outstanding importance and fragility is in the middle and upper reaches of the Iman River, where the species range from ginseng to the Amur tiger in association with 122 people of the Udege.

Management and Protection

Legal status

The whole of the nominated area is the property of the Russian Federation.

The nominated property area consists of four discrete statutorily designated areas (here numbered to accord with the map, Figure 2, not as in the text of the nomination):

1. Sikhote-Alin State Biosphere Nature Reserve;
2. Goralij Zoological Reserve;
3. Verkhnebikinski Landscape Reserve;
4. The territory of traditional land-use by the indigenous peoples of the Pozharski District on both sides of (but divided by) the Bikin River.

Management

Management is delegated from the Federation to various agencies, notably the Nature Reserve. Funding of the Nature Reserve is currently self-generated, Federal, and international, with nothing from the Region. In 1999, international sources provided more than twice the Federal budget and 65% of the total (\$72,237). Of the 154 employees, six work for the Department of Ecological Enlightenment. Eleven field research stations inside the Reserve carry out monitoring. Economic activity in the Nature Reserve is nil, and its scale on adjoining territories extremely limited. Only poaching causes some anxiety. Fire is the main threat.

Figure 1 in the nomination dossier purports to show a buffer zone around Sikhote-Alin State Biosphere Nature Reserve (1. above) but it seems, at least at the scale of the map (not stated), to be coterminous with the boundary of the Nature Reserve. None of the other territories in the nomination claims a buffer zone.

Essentially, though supported by different regulations, all four territories are collectively seeking to protect the environment, conserve habitat, and maintain the indigenous human population as a viable society. Only No 4 is of direct concern to ICOMOS, and its detail in the nomination shows a growing concern throughout the 1990s, as expressed in statutory documents, for the well-being of the small Udege community.

In response to a request from the World Heritage Centre, a management plan was added to the nomination dossier (4 September 2000). The document concerned is entitled *A Biodiversity Conservation Strategy for the Sikhote-Alin* (2000), its primary purpose being "as a pre-planning document that limits the kinds and conditions of land-use, determines a system of ecological, economic and social goals and potential ways of achieving them." It is not a management plan in a form familiar to ICOMOS and so judgement must await the joint mission report;

moreover, its main thrust is concerned with the natural aspects of the nomination.

The Strategy nevertheless contains in its Chapter 7 discussion of a system of protected territories and territories having special resource-use restrictions, with various proposals for extending the protected areas and reducing modern-style activities such as logging. Part of the purpose of these proposals is to provide for indigenous peoples. A major proposal concerning the headwaters of the Bikin, for example, is to exclude commercial timber harvesting altogether, a proposal which, if implemented, would have implications for the inhabitants. The Strategy specifically acknowledges that this is so, seeking a merging of the boundaries of areas identified as important for nature conservation with those of "Ethnic Territories."

The traditional way of life in the area is now under considerable threat of collapse. Its reinforcement presents a task probably more important than simply ensuring the physical protection of the nominated territory. Faced by all the negative influences from man and nature, the existence, even rebirth, of a strong ethnic-cultural complex is a more reliable mechanism for integrated management of people and nature than all the laws that government can provide.

Conservation and Authenticity

Conservation history

No direct information is provided on this score (eg early efforts at protection, dates of founding National Parks, etc).

Fire, natural and man-made, is the principal agent of change and is a regular feature of the nominated area. Its effects are not necessarily either disastrous or long-term.

Currently a considerable effort, backed by international funds, is being made to promote nature conservation and tourism, especially in the upper and middle Bikin River area, with an emphasis on aspects of the traditional culture of the indigenous people. Programmes of reviving traditional crafts and ecological tourism are in hand. During 1999, the Nature Reserve was visited by 85 people on the one-day excursion, while 10–200 visitors per day bathed from the tourist base on the coast. Tourism is more developed, though numbers are still low, in the Bikin region. Currently ten to twelve groups of foreign tourists visit the whole territory per year.

Authenticity

The remoteness of and difficulty of access to the area mean that cultural contact is difficult and of limited influence. Despite superficial changes, for example in clothing, culturally the most significant point is that the small indigenous population continues to live within a sustainable hunter-gatherer economy which, as well as keeping people alive, maintains the natural diversity of flora and fauna. Authenticity and integrity are, in cultural terms, respectively relatively undiminished and reasonably intact, but both could well succumb to the early 21st century.

Evaluation

Action by ICOMOS

For climatic and logistic reasons the joint ICOMOS-IUCN mission will not be able to visit the property until July 2001.

Qualities

The heritage qualities of this property derive from its remoteness, unpolluted environment, nature/people sustainability, and small remnant population in danger of disappearing.

Comparative analysis

No comparative cultural data are supplied in the nomination dossier. The earliest archaeology on the property finds its material analogues in Japan rather than mainland Asia.

ICOMOS comments

This property is nominated as a mixed site, under both natural and cultural criteria. However, there is a very close relationship between the natural environment and the cultural element. This is in fact a cultural landscape, in which part of the natural environment has been, and continues to be, subtly modified by the small Udege hunter-gatherer society.

This raises an important issue: that of the need for consideration in a global perspective of "preserving" small, essentially non-Westernized indigenous populations in their "natural" habitats, as exemplified by peoples like the Udege characteristically living in a non-agricultural, or non-mechanized agricultural, economy within a significantly non-monumental lifestyle with minimal material culture. ICOMOS therefore recommends that such a study be initiated.

Brief description

The Natural complex "Central Sikhote-Alin" nomination is of a huge and very important area in terms of natural history, consisting of several separate blocks of largely forested landscape. It contains a small population of hunter-gatherer people whose activities exploit the natural environment in a sustainable way and simultaneously have a significant effect upon flora and fauna.

ICOMOS Comments

ICOMOS was informed unofficially after the joint mission had taken place that the State Party was withdrawing its nomination of this property under the cultural criteria. Official confirmation had not been received when this evaluation was sent for printing.

ICOMOS, August 2001