UNIVERSAL EDUCATIONAL
SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE
WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Twenty-second session
Kyoto, Japan
30 November - 5 December 1998

Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Information on Tentative Lists and Examination of
nominations of cultural and natural properties to the List of World Heritage in Danger
and the World Heritage List

SUMMARY

This document contains recommendations made by the Bureau at its twenty-second session
(June 1998) regarding the nominations of properties for inscription on the World Heritage
List. The Bureau's recommendations regarding referred and pending nominations (properties
listed in sections A.2, A.3, B.1, C.4, C.5 and C.6 of this document) as well as earlier
deferred/referred nominations for which additional information has been received, will be
transmitted to the Committee during its session under working document WHC-
98/CONF.203/10Rev.

Decision required: In accordance with paragraph 65 of the Operational Guidelines, the
Committee is requested to examine the nominations for inscription on the World Heritage List
on the basis of the Bureau's recommendations and take its decisions in the following four
categories:

(a) properties which it inscribes on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
(b) properties which it inscribes on the World Heritage List;
(c) properties which it decides not to inscribe on the List;
(d) properties whose consideration is deferred.
a) Information on Tentative Lists

In accordance with paragraphs 7 and 8 of the Guidelines, which require that States Parties submit a tentative nomination list of cultural properties, the Secretariat has verified that all the nominations submitted for examination in 1998 are listed on the tentative lists of the States concerned.

The tentative lists of all States Parties can be found in Working Document WHC-98/CONF.203/9.

b) Examination of nominations of cultural and natural properties to the World Heritage List and List of World Heritage in Danger

A. NATURAL PROPERTIES

A.1 Property which the Bureau recommended for inscription on the World Heritage List

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Property</th>
<th>Identification number</th>
<th>State Party having submitted the nomination in accordance with Article 11 of the Convention</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand Sub-Antarctic Islands</td>
<td>877</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>N (ii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The site consists of five island groups (the Snares, Bounty Islands, Antipodes Islands, Auckland Islands, and Campbell Island) in the Southern Ocean south-east of New Zealand. The islands, lying between the Antarctic and Sub-tropical Convergences, and the seas have a high level of productivity, bio-diversity, wildlife population densities, and endemism among birds, plants and invertebrates. The bird and plant life, especially endemic albatrosses, cormorants, land birds and "megaherbs" are unique to these islands and are clearly of outstanding universal value under criterion (iv). Under criterion (ii) the islands display a pattern of immigration of species, diversifications and emergent endemism. Several evolutionary processes such as the development of loss of flight in both birds and invertebrates offer particularly good opportunities for research into the dynamics of island ecology. Human impacts are confined to the effects of introduced species at Auckland and Campbell islands but their ongoing eradication is leading to a recovery of native vegetation allowing evolutionary processes to continue.

The Bureau recommended that the Committee inscribe the New Zealand Sub-Antarctic Islands nomination under criteria (ii) and (iv). The Bureau commended the State Party for submitting a model nomination but at the same time expressed its concern over the integrity of the marine area and the conservation of the marine resources. The Bureau
noted the need for co-operation with the Secretariat of the Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources (CCAMLR) in elaborating strategies for strengthening the protection of the marine environment (especially regarding fishery by-catch). It recalled that the Committee at its twenty-first session had encouraged the Australian authorities to consider for the future a re-nomination of Macquarie Island with the Sub-Antarctic Islands of New Zealand as one single Sub-Antarctic site. It invited both States Parties to continue to liaise on this possibility.

### A.2 Properties for which the nomination was referred back to the State Party

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Property</th>
<th>Identification number</th>
<th>State Party having submitted the nomination in accordance with Article 11 of the Convention</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Ravines of the Slovak Paradis and Dobsinska Ice Cave</td>
<td>858</td>
<td>Slovak Republic</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Bureau noted that the Ravines of the Slovak Paradis and the Dobsinska Ice Cave are part of an extensive karst plateau with numerous deep ravines, waterfalls, surface karst phenomena and caves containing speleothems and ice. The natural values of the Ravines of the Slovak Paradis and the Dobsinska Ice Cave are considered to be of national and regional significance. The current nomination thus does not meet World Heritage criteria.

The Bureau decided to refer the nomination back to the State Party and asked the Slovak authorities to consider incorporating the Dobsinska Ice Cave portion into the nearby site of the Caves of Aggtelek Karst and Slovak Karst, already recognised as a World Heritage site, shared by the Slovak Republic and Hungary.

At the time of the preparation of this document, no further information had been received from the State Party.

**East Rennell** 854 Solomon Islands N(ii)

East Rennell is part of Rennell Island, the southernmost of the Solomon Islands group. Rennell, the largest raised coral atoll in the world, is 86km long and 15 km wide and covers an area of 87,500ha. A major feature is Lake Tegano which was the former lagoon on the atoll and is the largest lake in the insular Pacific (15,500ha). Rennell is mostly covered with dense forest with a canopy averaging 20m in height.

East Rennell is of outstanding universal value under natural criterion (ii), demonstrating significant on-going ecological and biological processes and is an important site for the science of island bio-geography. These processes relate to the role of East Rennell as a stepping-stone in the migration and evolution of species in the western Pacific and for speciation processes underway, especially with respect to the avifauna. Combined with
the strong climatic effects of frequent cyclones, the site is a true natural laboratory for scientific study. IUCN informed the Bureau that the protection and the management of the site are based on customary land tenure and community consensus and objectives and practices do not yet exist in written form. However, a draft national World Heritage Protection Bill exists and the national Government could take steps to introduce it for adoption and implementation. At the site level the local Management and Conservation Committee (MCC) has started a consultative process intended to produce written management principles and practices.

The Bureau took note of the draft national World Heritage Protection Bill and that customary ownership patterns are in place. Several Bureau members stated that well-established contractual or traditional protection and adequate management regimes have been acceptable for cultural sites (Operational Guidelines 24 (ii)b including cultural landscape categories), but that these do not apply to natural heritage.

The Bureau noted that the East Rennell nomination breaks new ground in terms of nominating a natural site under customary land ownership. The site meets natural criterion (ii), but does not meet the current Conditions of Integrity for natural heritage. The Bureau invited the State Party to also consider cultural values of the site for a possible nomination under the cultural landscape categories (para. 39 of the Operational Guidelines). The Bureau decided to refer the nomination back to the State Party and requested it to submit a report on the process of the local Management and Conservation Committee (MCC) to prepare a resources management plan for the site and for further information on actions on the proposed national World Heritage Protection Bill in time for the twenty-second extraordinary session of the Bureau.

Via letter of 1 September 1998 the Ministry of Commerce, Employment and Tourism of the Solomon Islands transmitted (a) further information on the resource management plan and its implementation and (b) information on the current status of the World Heritage Protection Bill. The Ministry noted that the application of cultural criteria will be further investigated. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS and IUCN for evaluation.

A.3   Properties for which the evaluation by IUCN was still pending at the twenty-second Session of the Bureau (June 1998)

IUCN informed the Bureau at its twenty-second session (June 1998) that for climatic reasons access to three nominated sites in the Russian Federation was not possible prior to the Bureau session. IUCN informed the Bureau that the following properties would be presented to the twenty-second extraordinary session of the Bureau in November 1998:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bashkirian Ural</td>
<td>879</td>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vodlozero National Park</td>
<td>767</td>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden Mountains of Altai</td>
<td>768 Rev.</td>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. MIXED PROPERTY

B. 1 Property for which the nomination was referred back to the State Party

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Property</th>
<th>Identification number</th>
<th>State Party having submitted the nomination in accordance with Article 11 of the Convention</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Cilento and Vallo di Diano National Park</td>
<td>842</td>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>C(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Bureau noted that the site is characterised by mountains, valleys and coast with a succession of cliffs, promontories, valleys and beaches. Karst features include over 400 caves in the limestone mountains and caves and natural arches along the coast. The site is heavily populated and environmentally modified. The natural values of the National Park of Cilento are considered to be of national and regional significance but are not of outstanding universal value.

Concerning cultural values, the Bureau decided that this nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting further information on the draft management plan and a revised delineation of the area proposed for inscription, to include the Certosa di Padula and Teggiano. In the event of this information being supplied and found acceptable, ICOMOS recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii) and (iv):

**Criterion (iii):** During the prehistoric period, and again in the Middle Ages, the Cilento region served as a key route for cultural, political, and commercial communications in an exceptional manner, utilizing the crests of the mountain chains running east-west and thereby creating a cultural landscape of outstanding significance and quality.

**Criterion (iv):** In two key episodes in the development of human societies in the Mediterranean region, the Cilento area provided the only viable means of communication between the Adriatic and the Tyrrenian Seas, in the central Mediterranean region, and this is vividly illustrated by the relict cultural landscape of today.

ICOMOS reported that the additional information requested had been received during twenty-second session of the Bureau and that a report would be presented at the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November.
C. CULTURAL HERITAGE

The Bureau took note of the letter sent by the Czech Republic informing that the State Party has withdrawn the nomination of The Honorary Holy Trinity Column and the Complex of Baroque Fountains in the Historic Core of the City of Olomouc.

C.1 Deletion of one property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Old City of Dubrovnik (Croatia)

C.2 Properties which the Bureau recommended for inscription on the World Heritage List

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Property</th>
<th>Identification Number</th>
<th>State Party having submitted the nomination in accordance with Article 11 of the Convention</th>
<th>Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Flemish Béguinages</td>
<td>855</td>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>C (ii)(iii)(iv)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iii) and (iv):

Criterion (ii): The Flemish béguinages demonstrate outstanding physical characteristics of urban and rural planning and a combination of religious and traditional architecture in styles specific to the Flemish cultural region.

Criterion (iii): The béguinages bear exceptional witness to the cultural tradition of independent religious women in north-western Europe in the Middle Ages.

Criterion (iv): The béguinages constitute an outstanding example of an architectural ensemble associated with a religious movement characteristic of the Middle Ages associating both secular and conventual values.

| The Four Lifts on the Canal du Centre and their Environs, La Louvière and Le Roeulx (Hainault) | 856 | Belgium | C (iii)(iv) |

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii) and (iv):

Criterion (iii): The boat-lifts of the Canal du Centre bear remarkable testimony to the hydraulic engineering developments of 19th-century Europe.

Criterion (iv): These boat-lifts represent the apogee of the application of engineering technology to the construction of canals.
Choirokoitia 848 Cyprus C (iii)(iv)

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii) and (iv):

Criterion (iii): Choirokoitia is an exceptionally well preserved archaeological site that has provided, and will continue to provide, scientific data of great importance relating to the spread of civilisation from Asia to the Mediterranean world.

Criterion (iv): Both the excavated remains and the untouched part of Choirokoitia demonstrate clearly the origins of proto-urban settlement in the Mediterranean region and beyond.

The Gardens and Castle at 860 Czech Republic C (ii)(iv)
Kromeríz

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):

Criterion (ii): The ensemble at Kromeríz, and in particular the Pleasure Garden, played a significant role in the development of Baroque garden and palace design in central Europe.

Criterion (iv): The Gardens and Castle at Kromeríz are an exceptionally complete and well preserved example of a princely residence and its associated landscape of the 17th and 18th centuries.

The Routes of Santiago de 868 France C(ii)(iv)(vi)
Compostela in France

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iv), and (vi):

Criterion (ii): The Pilgrimage Route of Santiago de Compostela played a key role in religious and cultural exchange and development during the later Middle Ages, and this is admirably illustrated by the carefully selected monuments on the routes followed by pilgrims in France.

Criterion (iv): The spiritual and physical needs of pilgrims travelling to Santiago de Compostela were met by the development of a number of specialised types of edifice, many of which originated or were further developed on the French sections.

Criterion (vi): The Pilgrimage Route of Santiago de Compostela bears exceptional witness to the power and influence of Christian faith among people of all classes and countries in Europe during the Middle Ages.
The Historic Site of Lyon 872 France C (ii)(iv)

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):

Criterion (ii): Lyon bears exceptional testimony to the continuity of urban settlement over more than two millennia on a site of great commercial and strategic significance, where cultural traditions from many parts of Europe have come together to create a coherent and vigorous continuing community.

Criterion (iv): By virtue of the special way in which it has developed spatially, Lyon illustrates in an exceptional way the progress and evolution of architectural design and town planning over many centuries.

The Archaeological Area and the Patriarchal Basilica of Aquileia 825 Italy C (iii)(iv)(vi)

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii), (iv), and (vi):

Criterion (iii): Aquileia was one of the largest and most wealthy cities of the Early Roman Empire.

Criterion (iv): By virtue of the fact that most of ancient Aquileia survives intact and unexcavated, it is the most complete example of an Early Roman city in the Mediterranean world.

Criterion (vi): The Patriarchal Basilican Complex in Aquileia played a decisive role in the spread of Christianity into central Europe in the early Middle Ages.

Historic Monuments of Ancient Nara 870 Japan C(ii)(iii)(iv)

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the property on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii), (iii) and (iv):

Criterion (ii): The historic monuments of ancient Nara bear exceptional witness to the evolution of Japanese architecture and art as a result of cultural links with China and Korea which were to have a profound influence on future developments.

Criterion (iii): The Nara Palace archaeological site bears exceptional testimony to the high level of culture of Japan at a critical period in its history.

Criterion (iv): The 8th century Nara Period was a crucial one in Japanese history and culture, when it took a significantly new direction, and this is reflected in the historic monuments of Nara.
The Archaeological Zone of Paquimé, Casas Grande

The Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (iii) and (iv):

Criterion (iii): Paquimé Casas Grandes bears eloquent and abundant testimony to an important element in the cultural evolution of North America, and in particular to prehispanic commercial and cultural links.

Criterion (iv): The extensive remains of the archaeological site of Paquimé Casas Grandes provide exceptional evidence of the development of adobe architecture in North America, and in particular of the blending of this with the more advanced techniques of Mesoamerica.

Ir.D.F. Woudagemaal (D.F. Wouda Steam Pumping Station)

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (i), (ii), and (iv):

Criterion (i): The advent of steam as a source of energy provided the Dutch engineers with a powerful tool in their millennial task of water management, and the Wouda installation is the largest of its type ever built.

Criterion (ii): The Wouda Pumping Station represents the apogee of Dutch hydraulic engineering, which has provided the models and set the standards for the whole world for centuries.

Criterion (iv): The Wouda pumping installations bear exceptional witness to the power of steam in controlling the forces of nature, especially as applied to water handling by Dutch engineers.

Prehistoric Rock Art Sites in the Côa Valley

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List, subject to the State Party agreeing to the proposed renaming of the nominated property, on the basis of criteria (i) and (iii):

Criterion (i): The Upper Palaeolithic rock-art of the Côa valley is an outstanding example of the sudden flowering of creative genius at the dawn of human cultural development.

Criterion (iii): The Côa Valley rock art throws light on the social, economic, and spiritual life on the life of the early ancestor of humankind in a wholly exceptional manner.
The Bureau took note of the additional information provided by ICOMOS, notably that the comparative study on the rock art sites had been completed and the site in question, one of the most renowned, was very favourably evaluated. The Bureau considered that an inscription of a part of the property rather than the ensemble would have a negative impact on its qualities and recommended that the Committee inscribe it on the basis of criterion (iii).

Criterion (iii): The corpus of late prehistoric mural paintings in the Mediterranean basin of eastern Spain is the largest group of rock-art sites anywhere in Europe and provides an exceptional picture of human life in a seminal period of human cultural evolution.

The University and Historic Precinct of Alcalá de Henares

The Bureau recommended to the Committee the inscription of this property on the basis of criteria (ii), (iv) and (vi), recalling in particular that one of the giants of world literature, Miguel de Cervantes, author of the immortal Don Quixote, was born in Alcalá de Henares.

Criterion (ii): Alcalá de Henares was the first city to be designed and built solely as the seat of a university, and was to serve as the model for other centres of learning in Europe and the Americas.

Criterion (iv): The concept of the ideal city, the City of God (Civitas Dei), was first given material expression in Alcalá de Henares, from where it was widely diffused throughout the world.

Criterion (vi): The contribution of Alcalá de Henares to the intellectual development of humankind finds expression in its materialization of the Civitas Dei, in the advances in linguistics that took place there, not least in the definition of the Spanish language, and through the work of its great son, Miguel de Cervantes Saavedra and his masterpiece, Don Quixote.

The Naval Port of Karlskrona

The Bureau recommended the Committee to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):

Criterion (ii): Karlskrona is an exceptionally well preserved example of a European planned naval town, which incorporates elements derived from earlier establishments in
other countries and which was in its turn to serve as the model for subsequent towns with similar functions.

*Criterion (iv)*: Naval bases played an important role in the centuries during which naval power was a determining factor in European *Realpolitik*, and Karlskrona is the best preserved and most complete of those that survive.

**C.3. Property which the Bureau did not recommend for inscription**

**The Medieval Town of Provins**

873 France

The Bureau recommended the Committee not to inscribe the site on the World Heritage List.

The Bureau noted that the site is not of outstanding universal value, but it does, however, possess European significance.

**C.4 Properties for which the nominations were referred back to the State Party**

**La Grand-Place, Brussels**

857 Belgium

C(ii)(iv)

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting the redefinition of the buffer zone as proposed by ICOMOS. In the event of the revised buffer zone being submitted by 1 October 1998 and positively evaluated by ICOMOS, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):

*Criterion (ii)*: The Grand-Place is an outstanding example of the eclectic and highly successful blending of architectural and artistic styles that characterizes the culture and society of the Low Countries.

*Criterion (iv)*: Through the nature and quality of its architecture and of its outstanding quality as a public open space, the Grand-Place illustrates in an exceptional way the evolution and achievements of a highly successful mercantile city of northern Europe at the height of its prosperity.

By letter of 31 July 1998, the requested information on the buffer zone was received by the World Heritage Centre and transmitted to ICOMOS.

**The imperial capital of Tiwanaku**

567rev Bolivia

The Bureau decided to refer the nomination back to the State Party to enable it to provide additional information relating to the protection and management of the site. If this information would be provided before 1 October 1998, ICOMOS would be able to present a
revised evaluation and recommendation to the twenty-second extraordinary session of the Bureau.

The Permanent Delegation submitted through letters dated 26 August and 24 September 1998 additional information on the legal protection and definition of the area. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS for evaluation.

El Fuerte de Samaipata 883 Bolivia C(ii)(iii)

The Bureau decided to refer the nomination back to the State Party, requesting a redefinition of the buffer zone by 1 October 1998 as proposed in the ICOMOS evaluation. In the event of this modification being implemented and positively evaluated by ICOMOS, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iii):

Criterion (ii): The sculptured rock at Samaipata is the dominant ceremonial feature of an urban settlement that represents the apogee of this form of prehispanic religious and political centre.

Criterion (iii): Samaipata bears outstanding witness to the existence in this Andean region of a culture with highly developed religious traditions, illustrated dramatically in the form of immense rock sculptures.

The Observer of Bolivia informed the Bureau that an extension of the protected area has been undertaken and will be confirmed in due time with the submission of the relevant documentation.

The Permanent Delegation submitted through letters dated 26 August and 24 September 1998 a map with an indication of the nominated area and its buffer zone. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS for evaluation.

The Summer Palace, an Imperial Garden in Beijing 880 China C(i)(ii)(iii)

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting information on the extension of the buffer zone proposed by ICOMOS, to be provided by 1 October 1998. In the event that the information is provided and judged satisfactory, the Bureau recommended the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (i), (ii), (iii).

Criterion (i): The Summer Palace in Beijing is an outstanding expression of the creative art of Chinese landscape garden design, incorporating the works of humankind and nature in a harmonious whole.

Criterion (ii): The Summer Palace epitomises the philosophy and practice of Chinese garden design, which played a key role in the development of this cultural form throughout the east.
**Criterion (iii):** The imperial Chinese garden, illustrated by the Summer Palace, is a potent symbol of one of the major world civilisations.

Via letter of 21 September 1998 the World Heritage Centre received further information from the State Party on the extension of the buffer zone. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS.

**The Temple of Heaven: an Imperial Sacrificial Altar in Beijing**

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting information on the extension of the buffer zone proposed by ICOMOS, to be provided by 1 October 1998. In the event that the information is provided and judged satisfactory, the Bureau recommended the inscription of the property on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (i), (ii), (iii)**.

**Criterion (i):** The Temple of Heaven is a masterpiece of architecture and landscape design which simply and graphically illustrates a cosmogony of great importance for the evolution of one of the world’s great civilisations.

**Criterion (ii):** The symbolic layout and design of the Temple of Heaven had a profound influence on architecture and planning in the Far East over many centuries.

**Criterion (iii):** For more than two thousand years China was ruled by a series of feudal dynasties, the legitimacy of which is symbolised by the design and layout of the Temple of Heaven.

Via letter of 21 September 1998 the World Heritage Centre received further information from the State Party on the extension of the buffer zone. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS.

**Holasovicé Historical Village Reservation**

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting additional information on the authenticity and current usage of the site by 1 October 1998. By letter received by the Centre on 29 September 1998, the State Party provided additional information as requested. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS.

**The Historic Centre of Urbino**

The Bureau recommended that this nomination be **referred back** to the State Party, requesting: (a) information on any urban plan(s) that may be in force; (b) further
information on conservation and restoration projects since the end of World War II, and (c) a redefinition of the buffer zone, as proposed by ICOMOS. In the event of this information being made available by 1 October 1998 and found acceptable under the terms of the Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):

**Criterion (ii):** During its short cultural pre-eminence, Urbino attracted some of the most outstanding humanist scholars and artists of the Renaissance, who created there an exceptional urban complex of remarkable homogeneity, the influence of which carried far into the rest of Europe.

**Criterion (iv):** Urbino represents a pinnacle of Renaissance art and architecture, harmoniously adapted to its physical site and to its medieval precursor in an exceptional manner.

ICOMOS reported that the additional information requested had been received during the 22nd session of the Bureau and that it would therefore present a report at the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November.

**Ouadi Qadisha (the Holy Valley) and the Forest of the Cedars of God (Horsh Arz el-Rab)**

The Bureau noted that the Qadisha Valley and the remnant Cedar Forest on the western flank of Mount Lebanon form a cultural landscape of outstanding universal value. Several Bureau members noted the need for a management and conservation plan for the site.

The Bureau decided that further consideration of this nomination be referred to await the submission of an overall management and conservation plan for the monastic sites and monuments of the Qadisha Valley and for the Cedar Forest (including the establishment of a commission to coordinate the activities of the different owners and agencies involved and the definition of an effective buffer zone). The Bureau furthermore noted that a comparative study of early Christian monastic settlements in the Near East would be useful.

The Centre has received the Management Plan for the site on 16 September 1998. The plan was transmitted to IUCN and ICOMOS for evaluation.

**The Historic Monuments Zone of Tlacotalpan**

The Bureau decided to refer this nomination back to the State Party for adjustment of the buffer zone as proposed by ICOMOS. In the event of a new delimitation being received by 1 October 1998, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of criteria (ii) and (iv):
Criterion (ii): The urban layout and architecture of Tlacotalpan represent a fusion of Spanish and Caribbean traditions of exceptional importance and quality.

Criterion (iv): Tlacotalpan is a Spanish colonial river port on the Gulf coast of Mexico which has preserved its original urban fabric to an exceptional degree. Its outstanding character lies in its townscape of wide streets, modest houses in an exuberant variety of styles and colours, and many mature trees in public and private open spaces.

A map with a new delimitation was submitted by Government of Mexico to ICOMOS and the Secretariat.

The Early Medieval Architectural Complex and Town of Panauti
869 Nepal

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, and that the documentation requested in the letter of 21 July 1997 from the World Heritage Centre be provided by 1 October 1998: information on the gazetting of the Monument Zone to protect the core area of Panauti under the Ancient Monuments Preservation Act, the legal document defining the buffer zone as a Conservation Area under the Municipalities Act, and the site management plan.

At the time of the preparation of this document, no further information had been received.

Historical Part of the City of Oviedo (Extension of the Churches of the Kingdom of the Asturias)
312 bis Spain

The Bureau took note of the evaluation of this property by ICOMOS and of its recommendation. Following interventions by members of the Bureau, it was decided to refer back this nomination to the State Party and requested that it be revised and renamed “The Churches of Oviedo and of the Kingdom of the Asturias”. This property would include the Camara Santa, the San Julian de los Prados Basilica as well as the Foncalada. The Observer of Spain thanked the Bureau and ICOMOS for their recommendation and insisted on the importance, as a public building, of the Foncalada, church and hydraulic structure dating from the Middle Ages.

By letter of 30 September 1998 the State Party communicated its official acceptance of the name "The Churches of Oviedo and of the Kingdom of the Asturias."

Truva/Troia/Troy
849 Turkey C(ii)(iii)(vi)

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be referred back to the State Party, requesting precise cartographic information regarding the area proposed for inscription and that proposed as a buffer zone. It was also decided to consider the possibility of applying
**criterion (i)** as pointed out by the Observer of Greece. In the event of this information being provided by 1 October 1998 and found acceptable, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (ii), (iii), and (vi)** and possibly (i):

The archaeological site of Troy is of immense significance in the understanding of the development of European civilisation at a critical stage in its early development. It is, moreover, of exceptional cultural importance because of the profound influence of Homer’s *Iliad* on the creative arts over more than two millennia.

By letter dated 28 September 1998 the Turkish authorities provided additional information to the Centre as requested. The information has been forwarded to ICOMOS for evaluation.

**L’viv - The Ensemble of the Historic Centre**

The Bureau recommended that the nomination be **referred back** to the State Party, requesting confirmation that the conservation programme had been approved and that the redundant mast and antenna were to be removed, and also that the modifications to the area proposed for inscription by ICOMOS had been accepted. In the event of this information being received by 1 October 1998, the Bureau recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criterion (ii) and (v)**:

- **Criterion (ii):** In its urban fabric and its architecture, L’viv is an outstanding example of the fusion of the architectural and artistic traditions of Eastern Europe with those of Italy and Germany.

- **Criterion (v):** The political and commercial role of L’viv attracted to it a number of ethnic groups with different cultural and religious traditions, who established separate yet interdependent communities within the city, evidence for which is still discernible in the modern townscape.

By letter received by the Centre on 31 August 1998, the State Party provided additional information as requested. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS for evaluation.

**C.5. Property for which the nomination has been deferred and for which complementary information has been received**

**The Semmering Railway** 785 Austria

At its twentieth session, the Bureau decided to defer the examination of this nomination in order to enable the completion of a comparative study carried out by TICCIH, and also for the State Party to supply more detailed maps and information regarding the cultural landscape protection legislation in Lower Austria and Styra relating to the protection of the cultural landscape.

A comparative study has been conducted by ICOMOS, which will present its evaluation report to the twenty-second extraordinary session of the Bureau.
C.6. Nominations to be considered by the twenty-second extraordinary session of the Bureau

**Classical Weimar** 846 Germany

ICOMOS had recommended that this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The State Party requested in writing the Chairperson to postpone the discussion on this site until the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November 1998.

By letter of 19 August 1998 a revised nomination text and extension was received by the World Heritage Centre. The information was transmitted to ICOMOS.

**Cultural Stratification in the Historic Centre of the City of Pecs** 853 Hungary

ICOMOS had recommended that this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The State Party requested in writing the Chairperson to postpone the discussion on this site until the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November 1998.

**Gdansk : The Main Town, the Motlava Side Channel, and the Vistula Mouth Fortress** 882 Poland

ICOMOS had recommended that this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The State Party requested in writing the Chairperson to postpone the discussion on this site until the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November 1998.

By letter received by the Centre on 11 July 1998, the State Party provided additional information on this nomination. It submitted the same information directly to ICOMOS for its evaluation.

**The Archaeological Ensemble of Tárraco** 875 Spain

ICOMOS had recommended that this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

The State Party requested in writing the Chairperson to postpone the discussion on this site until the extraordinary session of the Bureau in November 1998.