UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE
(First session)

Paris, 27 June - 1 July 1977

Issues arising in connection with the implementation of the World Heritage Convention

INTRODUCTION

1. This document sets out the main issues of a substantive and procedural nature on which the Committee may wish to take decisions at its first session in connection with the implementation of the Convention. These issues are presented following the order in which the items to which they relate appear in the Provisional Agenda. This document does not deal with the issues of a procedural nature which are already covered in the Provisional Rules of Procedure.

2. This document was prepared by the Director General in accordance with the terms of Article 14 (2) of the Convention. The International Centre for the Study of the Preservation and the Restoration of Cultural Property (Rome Centre), the International Council of Monuments and Sites (ICOMOS) and the International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources (IUCN) have been consulted on the technical issues arising in connection with the implementation of the Convention. For this purpose two meetings were held, the first in May 1976, the second in March 1977, between the Secretariats of these organizations and Unesco. The second meeting was also attended by a small number of experts from different regions of the world.

3. The conclusions of the first meeting were given wide distribution by Unesco which made it available to well over 100 experts throughout the world. Unesco invited their comments in particular, on the criteria proposed for the inclusion of properties in the World Heritage List. In addition, ICOMOS invited its 55 National Committees to comment on these conclusions. The comments received by ICOMOS and Unesco - which were relatively few in number - have been taken into account in preparing the proposals which are brought to the Committee's attention in the present document.

(CC-77/CONF.001/COL.4)
II. ESTABLISHMENT OF THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST
(Item 7 of the Provisional Agenda)

4. In accordance with the terms of Article 11 of the Convention, it is on the basis of the inventories submitted by States Parties to the Convention, that the Committee shall establish, keep up to date and publish, under the title of "World Heritage List", a list of properties forming part of the cultural and natural heritage, which it considers as having "outstanding universal value in terms of such criteria as it shall have established.

A. Format and content of the inventories

5. The inventories to be submitted by the States Parties to the Convention must include all the information and supporting documentation which the Committee requires to decide on the eligibility of properties for inclusion in the World Heritage List. It is therefore necessary to provide States Parties to the Convention with guidance on the appropriate form and content of the nominations to the List.

6. In this connection, the following proposals are submitted as a result of the two consultative meetings mentioned in paragraph 2 above:

a) Nominations by States for inclusion of cultural and natural properties in the World Heritage List should be presented in the form of a closely argued case, supported by full documentation and bibliography. The same printed form could be used for the cultural and natural heritage. Such a form should request the following type of information and documentation:

i) Localisation
   - Country
   - State, Province or Region
   - Name of property (local and eventually other names)
   - Exact localisation on map

ii) Juridical Status
   - Owner
   - Legal situation
   - Responsible administration

iii) Identification
   (scientific monography of the subject containing):
   - Description
   - Maps and/or plans
   - Photographical and/or cinematographical documentation
   - History
   - Bibliography
iv) State of preservation/or conservation
- Diagnosis
- Responsible administration
- History of preservation/or conservation
- Eventual projects for preservation/or conservation

v) Means for preservation/or conservation
- Legal
- Technical and administrative
- Financial

iv) Justification for inclusion in the World Heritage List
- for cultural property:
  - Unique artistic achievement
  - Outstanding importance in terms of influence on subsequent developments
  - Significant example of a type of structure
  - Rarity
  - Historic significance
- for natural property:
  - Geological importance
  - Evolutionary significance
  - Exceptional beauty or rarity
  - Habitat for endangered species of plants and animals
  - Global significance of combinations of the above criteria

(at least one of the above criteria should apply to the cultural or natural property proposed)

b) Model files for each category of cultural and natural property should be established by the Secretariat with the cooperation of the Rome Centre, ICOMOS and IUCN. These model files could serve as examples for the national agencies responsible for constituting the files to be submitted in support of nominations to the World Heritage List. The Committee may wish to decide on the form and content of the information, and documentation to be submitted with nominations to the World Heritage List and whether model files should be established by the Secretariat in cooperation with the Rome Centre, the ICOMOS and the IUCN.

7. On the basis of the Committee's decision, the Secretariat will prepare a complete nomination form. It is considered that States Parties to the Convention will need some guidance for completion of the form. Should the Committee agree,
brief explanations on the information to be provided could be included in the form. These explanations could be set out opposite each page to be completed.

9. If the Committee agrees, the nomination form prepared by the Secretariat will be used for a trial period of two years starting early in 1978.

10. If the Committee so decides, model files will be prepared under contracts with the Rome Centre, ICOMOS and the IUCN.

B. Submission of inventories

11. With respect to the procedure and calendar to be followed until the second session of the Committee for the submission of inventories, the following is proposed:

a) November 1977:

All States Parties to the Convention will be invited by the Director General of Unesco on behalf of the Committee to submit nominations to the World Heritage List in conformity with the decisions taken by the Committee with respect to the form and content of nominations to the World Heritage List and to the criteria in terms of which the inclusion of properties in the World Heritage List will be determined. States Parties will be informed that all nominations to be considered by the World Heritage Committee at its second session should reach the Secretariat by 1 April 1978. Copies of the nomination form will be attached to the letter. The Committee may decide that the model files mentioned in para. 6 (b) above are to be forwarded with the letter. If the organizations concerned cannot meet this deadline, the model files will be despatched separately so as not to delay initial action.

b) April-May 1978:

The Secretariat on behalf of the Committee will be responsible for:

- contacting, if necessary, the States Parties concerned with a view to completing the information and documentation requested by the World Heritage Convention,
- translating and reproducing the nominations and supporting documentation into the working languages of the World Heritage Committee, (as proposed in the draft Rules of Procedure),
- submitting the nominations to the members of the Committee before its 1978 session.
12. The Committee may wish to consider the possibility of granting technical cooperation, at the request of States Parties for the preparation of their submission. This technical cooperation could take the form of short-term experts and, if required, the necessary equipment for their mission. The Committee may wish to decide on the procedure to be followed for the granting of such assistance.

13. The calendar referred to in paragraph 11 may have to be modified if submissions are made in languages other than the working languages of the Committee (as proposed in the draft Rules of Procedure). A standard calendar for the submission and examination of nominations to the World Heritage List should be examined by the Committee at its second session on the basis of the experience acquired.

14. The "World Heritage List" is to be a list of properties forming part of the cultural and natural heritage, as defined in Articles 1 and 2 of the Convention which the World Heritage Committee considers as having outstanding universal value in terms of such criteria as it shall have established. The recommendations and suggestions made below are the result of the two meetings referred to in paragraph 2 of this document.

a) General Considerations

15. The Committee may wish to examine the following general recommendations relating to the inclusion of properties in the World Heritage List:

i) The World Heritage List, in view of its importance not only for the work related to the Convention, but also for educational and public information purposes, should be considered as a separate entity. Criteria for the inclusion of properties in the List, therefore, should enable the World Heritage Committee to evaluate solely the intrinsic merit of a property and not its suitability for assistance by the World Heritage Fund; 

ii) The outstanding universal value of cultural and natural properties should be determined according to two sets of criteria:

- one set of criteria for cultural property,
- one set of criteria for natural property;
iii) Cultural and natural properties should be included in the World Heritage List according to a gradual process as the proposed criteria are tested and become more clearly defined; this does not imply, however, that any formal limit should be imposed either on the total number of properties included in the List or on the number of properties any individual State can submit for inclusion in the World Heritage List.

iv) A special effort should be made to include in the World Heritage List properties which combine in a significant way cultural and natural features demonstrating the interaction, between man and nature. At the stage of nomination, where possible, natural areas should be extended so as to include cultural monuments or sites, derived from and influenced by the natural environment; similarly, areas containing cultural monuments or sites should be sufficiently extended to cover the natural landscapes or man-modified landscapes which formed their original setting.

v) The World Heritage Committee should have the right to remove from the World Heritage List property having been destroyed or having suffered a loss of integrity. In this connection, it is hoped that the reports to be submitted by States Parties under the terms of Article 29 of the Convention will provide sufficient information for the Committee to decide on the continuing eligibility of properties in the List.

General criteria for inclusion of areas or property in the World Heritage List

16. The Convention provides a vehicle for the protection of those cultural or natural properties or areas deemed to be of universal or wide-ranging importance and of outstanding interest and value to the peoples of the world. It is not intended to provide for the protection of all properties and areas of great interest, importance, or value, but only for a select list of the most outstanding of these from a world viewpoint. The criteria presented below are intended to provide guidance according to the spirit of the Convention for the World Heritage Committee and for the experts whom the Committee may consult.

17. The definition of "Universal" in the phrase "outstanding universal value" requires comment. Some properties may not be recognised by all people, everywhere, to be of great importance and significance. Different peoples and cultures may have differing views, and the term "universal" must therefore be interpreted as referring to a large or significant segment of humanity.
18. In addition to specific criteria for evaluating the inherent characteristics of a property, special attention must be given to the "integrity" of natural areas and to the "authenticity" of cultural properties. These terms are defined in paragraphs 21 and 23 (a) below but are referred to here to emphasize their importance.

19. On the question of delimitation of properties, the use of a double boundary system may be applied whereby nominations would provide as precise a definition as possible of the surface area of the property itself, and would indicate a "zone of influence" (i.e. the natural or man-made surrounding that influence the physical state of the property or the way in which the property is perceived) around the property to be determined in each case through technical studies, and to be provided with adequate protection.

b) Criteria for the inclusion of cultural properties in the World Heritage List

20. The Committee may wish to examine the following proposed criteria, of which one or more should be satisfied before a cultural property is included in the World Heritage List:

i) the property should represent unique artistic achievements, masterpieces of the human creative spirit; for example, a monument such as Borobudur, a group of buildings such as Angkor Wat, or a site such as the Valley of the Kings,

ii) the property should be of outstanding importance owing to its influence, over a span of time or within a cultural area of the world, on subsequent developments in architecture, monumental sculpture, gardens and landscape design, related arts, or human settlements; for example, the Pantheon in Rome, a group such as the Plaza of Puebla in Mexico, or a site such as the château and gardens at Vaux-le-Vicomte,

iii) the property should be the most characteristic or the most significant example of a type of structure, the type representing an important cultural, intellectual, social, artistic, technological or industrial development; for example, a monument such as a Mayan pyramid, a group such as the central city of Leningrad or a site such as the walled city of Avila,

iv) the property should be unique, or extremely rare or of great antiquity including characteristic examples of traditional styles of architecture, methods of construction, or human settlements, particularly when they are by nature fragile and likely to disappear as a result of
irreversible socio-cultural or economic change; for example, an Indonesian long-house, the Dogon villages in Mali, or a site such as Yachu-Picchu.

v) the property should be most importantly associated with persons, events, philosophies or religions of outstanding historical significance; for example, monuments such as the Church of the Nativity at Bethlehem, a group of buildings such as the Holy Places of Mecca and Medina or a site such as Cape Kennedy, the launching pad for man's first voyage to the moon.

21. In addition, the property should meet the test of authenticity in design, materials, workmanship, and setting; authenticity does not limit considerations to original form and function, but includes all subsequent modifications and additions, over the course of time, which in themselves possess artistic or historical values. Consideration should also be given to the state of preservation of the proposed property and to the opportunities afforded for scientific investigations and training in problems of preservation.

c) Criteria for the inclusion of natural properties in the World Heritage List

22. The Committee may wish to examine the following proposed criteria of which one or more must be satisfied before a natural property is included in the World Heritage List:

i) the property should contain outstanding examples of the major stages of earth's evolutionary history; this would include sites which represent the major "eras" of geologic history such as "the age of reptiles" where the development of the planet's natural wealth and diversity can best be demonstrated; other stages might include the "ice age" where early man as well as his contemporary plants and animals underwent major adaptations and transformations; for example, Olduvai Gorge in Tanzania where the natural and cultural heritage come together to illustrate the emergence of pre-man within the context of the plants, animals, climate and other factors influencing evolution.

ii) the property should contain outstanding examples of present geological processes and biological and cultural evolution; as distinct from the periods of the earth's development this focuses upon on-going processes in the development of communities of plants, animals, landforms and marine forms and fresh water bodies; such processes are characterized by natural communities of high species diversity, or by relatively high rates of speciation, very complex or simple ecosystems, and by areas currently undergoing major changes through
Publication of the World Heritage List

24. Article 11 of the Convention stipulates that the Committee shall establish, keep up to date and publish the World Heritage List and that an updated list shall be distributed at least every two years. The Committee may wish to discuss the form and the periodicity of the publication of the World Heritage List and its relationship to the other lists to be published by the Committee namely "the List of World Heritage in Danger" and the "List of the properties for which international assistance is granted". (See paragraphs 47 to 50 below).

25. The value of the World Heritage List for education and public information purposes has been stressed on several occasions. If these purposes are to be achieved, wide distribution of the List should be foreseen. On the basis of the views expressed by the Committee, the Secretariat will prepare, for the second session of the Committee, details on cost and time factors involved in publishing the List in the form desired by the Committee.

26. On the question of public information in general, one of the national committees of ICOMOS has suggested that "a very small percentage of the (World Heritage) Fund available each year be set aside both to publicize its operation, thus perhaps encouraging contributions to the Fund or to individual Fund projects from the private sector and even additional contributions from governments", and "to educate the public everywhere on the importance of heritage conservation. The Committee may wish to discuss this suggestion.

27. At both meetings mentioned in paragraph 2 above, the participants were of the opinion that the World Heritage Convention should be receiving much more attention on a world-wide scale and that the Committee and Unesco should make a genuine effort to give wider publicity to the Convention.

28. The terms of Article 11 (7) of the Convention which stipulates that the Committee shall, with the agreement of the States concerned, co-ordinate and encourage the studies and research needed for the drawing up of the World Heritage List, are brought to the attention of the Committee which may wish to discuss the implications thereof.
III. ESTABLISHMENT OF THE LIST OF WORLD HERITAGE IN DANGER AND GRANTING OF INTERNATIONAL ASSISTANCE FROM THE WORLD HERITAGE FUND (Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda)

A) Format and content of the requests for international assistance

29. As provided for by Article 21 (1) of the Convention, the Committee shall specify the content of requests for international assistance which should define the operation contemplated (a) the work that is necessary, the anticipated cost thereof, the degree of urgency and the reasons why the resources of the State requesting assistance do not allow it to meet the expenses. Such requests must be supported by experts' reports whenever possible.

30. In this connection, States Parties to the Convention may require short-term expert assistance for the drawing up of requests for international assistance. The Committee may therefore wish to decide whether such "preparatory assistance" should be provided under the World Heritage Fund and what would be the conditions thereof.

31. In order to provide States Parties to the Convention with the necessary guidance on the information to be provided in requests for international assistance, it is proposed to establish a separate standard format for such requests, the contents of which could include the following:

a) country,
b) date of submission,
c) name of property,
d) date of inscription on World Heritage List (if applicable),
e) date of inscription on list of World Heritage in Danger (if applicable),
f) brief description of property,
g) detailed description of danger to property (if possible supported by documentary evidence, drawings, maps, etc.),
h) legal status of the property including the protective, legal and administrative measures already taken for conservation of the property,
i) objectives of proposed project (in terms of scientific or cultural interest, educational value, social and economic benefits, etc.),
j) proposed activities to be undertaken - with national financing - with assistance under the Convention (breakdown according to categories listed in Article 22 of the Convention),
k) approximate cost of these activities - paid nationally - requested under the Convention,
l) national body responsible for the project, and details of project administration.
32. On the basis of the decisions taken by the Committee, the Secretariat will prepare and distribute by November 1977 a standard format comprising brief explanations on each item of information which States Parties to the Convention should provide in their requests for international assistance.

33. With respect to the item 1) of the proposed form, it is highly desirable in order to ensure efficient execution of the project that a single body — whether national, regional, local, public or private — be entrusted with the responsibility of executing the project in the State Party concerned.

34. In a number of cases, when the data provided in the request are considered as sufficient by the Committee, the latter will be able to decide forthwith on the assistance to be furnished under the Convention within the limit of its possibilities; the Secretariat will of course assist in the preparation or completion of the requests of States Parties.

35. In other cases, especially for the large projects referred to in Article 24 of the Convention, the Committee may consider it necessary to have, in addition, a more detailed project document prepared. The Committee may wish to examine the detailed information which should be included in this "project document". The following is suggested:

a) detailed scientific and technical data concerning the work to be undertaken;
b) a detailed analysis of the requirements in equipment, expendable and non-expendable supplies, specialist services, skilled and unskilled labour as well as administrative personnel, etc.,
c) the training component (in-service training as well as Fellowships for training abroad);
d) a presentation of the cost of all items required broken down to reflect local inputs and those which must come from external sources;
e) schedule showing the desirable starting date; flow of funds, equipment supplies and personnel; and, the overall flow of activities of the programme,
f) a statement and supporting analysis where appropriate of the social and environmental impact of the project.

36. In accordance with Article 26 of the Convention, an agreement will be concluded between the Committee and the State Party receiving assistance under the Convention, as mentioned in paragraph 52 below. Under this agreement, the recipient State will undertake "to continue to protect, conserve and present the property" safeguarded with the assistance provided under the Convention.
B. Procedure for consideration of requests for international assistance

37. The Committee may wish to adopt the following procedure:

a) the Secretariat on behalf of the Committee, shall inform States Parties that they may submit requests for international assistance under the Convention concerning:

i) properties included in the World Heritage List or nominated for inclusion therein,

ii) the establishment of inventories which, according to Article 12 (2) may be submitted "when preliminary investigations have shown that further inquiries would be justified",

iii) the training of staff and specialists at all levels in the field of identification, protection, conservation, presentation and rehabilitation of the cultural and natural heritage; and

iv) support for national or regional centers for the training of staff and specialists referred to in Article 23 of the Convention.

States Parties shall also be informed that requests to be considered by the Committee at its second session should reach the Secretariat by 1 April 1978.

b) The Secretariat on behalf of the Committee, shall be responsible for:

- registering each request,
- assisting in completing the requests (if necessary),
- translating and reproducing the requests,
- submitting the requests to the members of the Committee before its 1978 session.

38. In order to enable the Committee to dispose at its second session of a number of requests upon which decisions of assistance could be taken forthwith, the Committee may wish to consider the possibility of authorizing the Director General of Unesco to use funds from the World Heritage Fund, up to a limit to be determined by the Committee, for "preparatory assistance" as referred to in paragraph 30 above and for the preparation of project documents as mentioned in paragraph 35 above.

39. As foreseen in Article 13 (3), the Committee will "decide on the action to be taken with regard to these requests, determine where appropriate, the nature and extent of its assistance."
In this connection, Article 25 of the Convention provides that, as general rule, only part of the work necessary shall be borne by the international community and that a substantial share shall be contributed by the beneficiary State, unless its resources do not permit this. Experience in UNESCO has shown that the share contributed by the recipient State may vary widely according to the circumstances. The Committee may wish to consider for each request the share to be contributed by the beneficiary State.

C. Order of priorities for the granting of international assistance

41. Article 13, paragraph 4, of the Convention provides that "the Committee shall determine an order of priorities for its operations" and that "it shall in so doing bear in mind the respective importance for the world cultural and natural heritage of the property requiring protection, the need to give international assistance to the property most representative of a natural environment or of the genius and the history of the peoples of the world, the urgency of the work to be done, the resources available to the States on whose territory the threatened property is situated and in particular the extent to which they are able to safeguard such property by their own means".

42. Without prejudice to the provisions of the Convention, which shall always prevail, the Committee may wish to expand on the priorities established by the Convention by determining, as requested by the Convention, a more detailed order of priorities. In the light of the consultative meetings referred to in paragraph 2, the Secretariat submits in the following paragraphs a number of suggestions.

43. Without respect to the type of activities to be assisted under the Convention, the Committee may wish to consider the following order of priorities:

- emergency measures to save property which is in immediate danger of total destruction or disappearance;
- preparatory assistance, i.e. preparation of projects to safeguard property which is in danger;
- preparation of inventories for the World Heritage List;
- projects which are likely to have a multiplier effect ("seed money") because they:
  - stimulate general interest in conservation
  - contribute to the advancement of scientific research
  - contribute to the training of specialised personnel
  - generate contributions from other sources

44. The Committee may also wish to consider whether the following factors - presented in no special hierarchical order - should in principle govern its decisions with respect to assistance under the Convention:
i) the urgency of the work to be undertaken,

ii) the legislative, administrative and financial commitment of the recipient State to preserve and manage the property,

iii) the interest and demonstration value of the project in respect of scientific research and the development of economical conservation techniques,

iv) the improved educational value,

v) the economic socio-cultural and environment benefits accruing from the project,

vi) the cost of the project.

45. Properties included in the World Heritage List should be considered as being of equal value. For this reason, the criteria proposed above make no reference to the relative value of properties. The criteria relating to scientific interest covers, inter alia, the proposed use on the project of new methods and techniques in conservation, i.e. "pilot projects" carried out with the most economical means which would have an exemplary value. By "improved educational value" is meant the impact which the project would have on the awareness and appreciation of the general public, not only in the country in which the property is located, but on a world-wide scale.

46. The Committee may also wish to determine the priorities according to which assistance to national or regional centres for training of staff and specialists may be granted as provided for in Article 23 of the Convention.

3. Establishment and publication of a) a List of World Heritage in Danger and b) a List of Properties for which international assistance is granted

47. Under the terms of Article 11 (6), "the Committee shall establish, keep up to date and publish, whenever circumstances shall so require, under the title of "List of World Heritage in Danger", a list of property appearing in the World Heritage List for the conservation of which major operations are necessary and for which assistance has been requested under the Convention. On the other hand, Article 13 (5) stipulates that "the Committee shall draw up, keep up to date and publicize a list of property for which international assistance has been granted".

48. Since the two lists mentioned above are closely related, the Secretariat suggests that the second list could contain a short description of (a) all the properties for which international assistance has been granted and (b) the kind of assistance given and the result thereof, while the first list would only refer to those properties which, although they might have received some assistance from the Committee, nevertheless remain in danger and still require assistance, which could possibly be financed, either wholly or in part, from other sources.
49. The attention of the Committee is drawn to Article 11 (4) of the Convention which states that the Committee may at any time, in case of urgent need, make a new entry in the List of World Heritage in Danger and publicize such entry immediately.

50. With respect to the form and periodicity of publication of these two lists, the Secretariat will prepare more definite proposals for the Committee to consider at its second session.

E. Emergency assistance

51. According to Article 21 (2) requests based upon disasters or natural calamities should, by reason of the urgent work which they may involve, be given immediate priority consideration by the Committee, which should have a reserve fund at its disposal against such contingencies.

52. The Committee may wish to decide on: a) procedure to be followed for the consideration of requests for emergency assistance and the granting of such assistance and b) the amount of the reserve fund.

F. Standard agreement to be concluded with States receiving international assistance

53. Article 26 of the Convention refers to the "agreement" to be concluded between the Committee and States receiving international assistance. The Secretariat will prepare a draft standard agreement for consideration by the Committee at its second session. Every effort will be made to avoid unnecessary formalities which cause delays and additional expenses. In this connection, the possibility of referring to the standard agreement governing technical assistance furnished by the United Nations family will be carefully studied.

G. Financial Regulations for the World Heritage Fund

54. Article 15 (2) of the Convention stipulates that the World Heritage Fund shall constitute a trust fund, in conformity with the provisions of the Financial Regulations of Unesco. Consequently, the Director General, in order to open the Fund and thereby enable States Parties to make their contributions, prepared special financial regulations to govern the operations of the Fund. These financial regulations were submitted, in draft form, to the first General Assembly of States Parties (26 November 1976, Nairobi, Kenya) which made no comments thereon. In conformity with Financial Regulation 6.7, the Director General reported on these financial regulations to the Executive Board at its 102nd session; the Executive Board took note thereof. The financial regulations for the Fund appear in Document GS-77/CONF.001/3, and are submitted to the Committee for its information.
IV Invitations to the second session of the Committee (Item 10 of the Provisional Agenda)

55. In addition to those organizations and individuals that the Committee may decide to invite, the Director General proposes that the following organizations be invited to send observers to future sessions of the Committee:

United Nations

United Nations Environmental Programme (UNEP)

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO)

World Food Programme

International Bank for Reconstruction and Development

Inter-American Development Bank

Aesco

Council of American States

South East Asian Ministers of Education Organization

The Director General also proposes that the Chairman of the International Fund for the Culture be invited to attend as an observer.