

Minutes of the first Meeting of the Scientific Committee on Integrity and Authenticity in an African Context

W W W W W W

1. The meeting was organised by the World Heritage Centre at UNESCO Headquarters and was held from 10 am to 1 pm **on 28 January 2000**. It was chaired by the Director of the World Heritage Centre. Two members were unable to attend : M. Adjanohoun, (Benin) and M. Sheppard, (IUCN). The list of participants is attached in Annex 1. The purpose of the meeting was to prepare an expert meeting that will be held at Great Zimbabwe during the last week of May 2000 on **Integrity and Authenticity in an African Context**.

2. The provisional agenda was adopted without modifications. Items 1 to 3(i) were discussed thoroughly ; while time constraints allowed only a preliminary brainstorming on items 3(ii) to 6 of the Agenda. The meeting closed at 1 pm, but participants met again from 2.30 to 3. 30 to draw practical conclusions.

3. Item 1 of the agenda :

"Objectives of the meeting to be held in Great Zimbabwe (26 – 30 May 2000)".

The purpose of the May meeting, its objectives and outputs were defined as follows :

Purpose : to provide a forum of discussions to European and African experts on the notions of Authenticity and Integrity for potential World Heritage properties in "traditional societies" (i.e. non-industrial and non urban societies).

A synthetic report and, if possible, recommendations to be submitted to the 24th session of the Bureau (26 – 30 June 2000).

Objectives :

Æ to highlight the "universality" of several aspects of African heritage : namely the importance of the links between nature and culture, tangible and intangible heritage, the interactions between human beings and the land (settlements, modes of subsistence, technological evolution), human beings in society (spirituality and creative expressions), expressing the diversity and richness of living or past cultures ;

Æ to define the implications of the applicability of the notions of authenticity and integrity to this kind of societies ;

Æ to propose applicable operational parameters.

Outputs :

Æ to present definitions for integration into the Operational Guidelines ;

Æ to prepare and disseminate a publication on the proceedings of the meeting.

4. Item 2 of the agenda :

"Review of List of background documents"

The list of background documents prepared by the Centre which now available at:

<http://www.unesco.org/whc/events/africa-authenticity.htm>

was deemed to reflect adequately the existing bibliography and the debates which have taken place since the Nara Conference in 1994 and the adoption the same year of the Global Strategy by the World Heritage Committee. The position papers will be made available in two languages at the same address.

The discussion emphasised the large number of meetings organised at the request of the Committee with a view to define, on the one hand, the above-mentioned notions, as well as the linking of natural and cultural heritage, and on the other, the number of meetings held in Africa to identify the categories of African heritage. All the participants expressed the view that the Zimbabwe meeting should be the last milestone of this important process and that the Bureau and the Committee should at long last be able to take clear decisions on this basis. African heritage has much to offer to the world at large because its heritage is not limited to the monumental. This highlights the conceptual limits of an approach that does not take into account the anthropological dimension.

5. Item 3 of the Agenda :

"Identification of topics and authors for the preparation of the Working documents"

(i) by members of the Scientific Committee,

(ii) by African participants

A) Position papers :

It was decided that a limited number of position papers not exceeding 10 pages should be made available in French and English before the May meeting.

It was also decided that the two following preliminary papers needed to be prepared **by 15 February** and sent to **all** participants:

- i. The notions of Integrity and Authenticity in the framework of the World Heritage Convention and since the Nara conference (J. Jokilehto & J. King -- ICCROM). This paper would illustrate the prevailing theories and concepts.
- ii. The notions of Integrity and Authenticity in non-industrial and non urban societies, illustrated by examples drawn from the implementation of the Global Strategy in Africa (M. Munjeri).

Subsequently, the following papers would also need to be prepared **by 15 March** and translated.

- iii. The notion of Integrity applied to natural properties and cultural landscapes of extended dimensions belonging to agro-pastoral societies by an African IUCN expert: (E. Edroma).
- iv. The reconciliation of African societies with their heritage (L. Pressouyre).
- v. A proposal to integrate the findings of international and African experts meetings on the notions of integrity and authenticity in non industrial and non urban societies. (L. Lévi-Strauss and G. Saouma-Forero).
- vi. M. Adjonohoun, member of the Scientific Committee, will also be requested to prepare a conceptual paper on the importance of cultural components and the definition of cultural values in natural properties in Africa.

In addition:

- i. J.L. Luxen (ICOMOS) will provide the name of an African expert who would prepare a paper on the links between the tangible and the intangible dimensions in cultural and natural African properties.
- ii. M. Oyai, Bénin's Permanent delegate to UNESCO, a specialist of African languages could be requested to prepare a paper which would clarify concepts equivalent to Authenticity and Integrity in African societies.

B) Case studies:

It was agreed that the following case studies would be prepared:

- i. Great Zimbabwe National Monument
 - ii) Victoria Falls which is a natural property taking into account the notion of integrity in a transboundary World Heritage site (Zambia / Zimbabwe).
- i. The Cliffs of Bandiagara which are a mixed site.
- ii. Sukur Cultural landscape and Benin City walls
- iii. The Kayas Sacred Forests (a cultural landscape without built structure)
- iv. Colline Royale d'Ambolhimbanga (a cultural landscape with built structure)
- v. It was also agreed that the Centre could request additional case studies taking into account the categories of African Heritage defined at Global Strategy meetings and provide methodological guidelines for their preparation. The members of the Scientific Committee are encouraged to send inputs for such guidelines to the Centre, before **15 March**.

6. Item 4 of the agenda :

"Establishment of a List of participants"

The final list of participants for the May meeting will therefore be established by the Centre. It was understood , however, that in addition to the writers of the position papers, the Secretary General of ICOMOS and the Director of the Nordic World Heritage Office will be invited. The Centre shall ensure that staff in charge of implementing the natural and cultural components of the Convention will attend as well. In addition, National Monuments and Museums of Zimbabwe (NMMZ) will invite national experts who will be preparing the case studies on Great Zimbabwe and Victoria Falls.

7. Items 5 and 6 of the agenda :

"Examination of the Tentative Budget for the meeting"

"Logistical arrangements in Great Zimbabwe"

The Committee has approved 40,000.00 \$ and in addition the Nordic World Heritage office has made a contribution of 30,000.00 \$ to cover the expenses of 2 Scientific

Committee meetings in Paris, and the publication and dissemination of the bilingual Proceedings of the May meeting.

Since the National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe did not submit a preliminary budget, the Centre will request UNESCO Office ,in Harare, in co-operation with NMMZ to present as soon as possible a budget for a **4 day** bilingual meeting in Great Zimbabwe. This budget should clearly identify all items of expenditure such as the translation of papers, their distribution by DHL in Africa, secretarial services, Internet connection for the dissemination of the daily discussions during the May meeting, photocopies, and the travel of participants (except the representatives of the Advisory Bodies) from their places of residence to Great Zimbabwe. In this regard, provision should be made for those who will have to spend a night or two in Harare upon arrival or departure.

M Munjeri stated that all the participants should leave from Harare to Great Zimbabwe on 25 May at 1 pm, and return to Harare on 30 May before 3 pm.

8. Item 7 of the agenda :

"Other business"

It was decided that Ms Saouma Forero, who is in charge of the meeting at the Centre, will prepare and circulate the minutes of the first Scientific Committee meeting. The agenda and dates of the second meeting which should take place in early June, will be discussed in Zimbabwe. However, if the Scientific Committee could not meet at least three weeks before the Bureau meeting to finalise the recommendations, these would have to be submitted to the 24th session of the World Heritage Committee.

W W W W W W

Annex I

(cf.169)

Scientific Committee on the subject:

"Meeting on Integrity/Authenticity in an African Context"

UNESCO Headquarters, 28 January 2000, Room VII, from 10am to 5pm

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

- Mr. D. Munjeri Director of the National Museums and Monument of Zimbabwe,
member of the World Heritage Committee.
- Mr. L. Pressouyre Member of the Scientific Committees
of the two Global Strategy meetings in Harare and Addis Ababa (1995-
1996).
- Mr. J. Jokilehto Former Assistant to the Director-General of ICCROM,
ICCROM's Representative to the Nara Conference and Amsterdam Meeting.
- Ms. Kris Endersen Director of the Nordic World Heritage Office
- Mr. J.L. Luxen Secretary-General – ICOMOS
- Mr. J. King Co-ordinator Africa 2009 – ICCROM
- Mr. L. Levi-Strauss Deputy Director - Division of Cultural Heritage
- Mr. M. Bouchenaki Director – UNESCO World Heritage Centre
- Mme Galia Saouma–Forero World Heritage Centre
- Dr Mechtild Rössler World Heritage Centre
- Mme Silvia Gasparetto Associate Expert, World Heritage Centre