

**UNESCO**

**WORLD HERITAGE CONVENTION  
BUREAU OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

*23rd session*  
(5 - 10 July 1999)  
Paris (France)

**EVALUATIONS OF CULTURAL PROPERTIES**

Prepared by the  
International Council on Monuments and Sites  
(ICOMOS)

The IUCN and ICOMOS evaluations are made available to members of the Bureau and the World Heritage Committee. A small number of additional copies are also available from the secretariat.  
Thank you.



**1999**

## Greater Blue Mountains (Australia)

No 917

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Greater Blue Mountains Area
<i>Location</i>	State of New South Wales
<i>State Party</i>	Australia
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

**Note** This property is nominated under both natural and cultural criteria as a mixed site. In this evaluation only that information from the dossier relating to nomination under the cultural criteria are taken into account.

### Justification by State Party

The Greater Blue Mountains nominated area represents an extraordinary story of natural antiquity, diversity, beauty, and human attachment.

Within a continent settled over millennia by indigenous peoples, this protected area is rich in evidence of the cultural continuity of its Aboriginal occupants and their artistic and spiritual expression. The landscape is scattered with dreaming sites and rock art. For 18th and 19th century British colonists, the Blue Mountains were simultaneously a challenging barrier to the inland and a spectacular wild country. Explorers crossed the mountains with difficulty and convict labour followed, constructing a road to western pastoral lands. This ridge-line route, and subsequent railway line, formed the spine for a series of townships, with economic reliance on mining, health promotion, and recreation for Sydney dwellers, associated with access to the surrounding wild scenery.

The rugged upland country of the Greater Blue Mountains is not only of exceptional natural diversity, and of spectacular and ephemeral beauty, but is also closely tied to the lives of people who have occupied, visited, thought about, and cared for it over thousands of years. The property represents, in fact, *the combined works of man and nature*.

The *direct and tangible* association with the million hectares of wild country is expressed in two physical forms. First are the widespread Aboriginal occupation sites, rock-shelter paintings, and rock-platform engravings. Second is the narrower network of historic walking tracks, staircases, and lookouts, festooned from the edges of the ridge crossing the

Mountains and down to the valley floors. Both rock art and tracks are intact and authentic.

The exceptional circumstances of the Greater Blue Mountains are the scale, intensity, and longevity of the cultural association. It is a place where ancient custodianship over the million hectares of dissected plateaux has been replaced by another, more recent, form of custodianship, significant nonetheless.

The intense inter-relationship of nature and people over tens of thousands of years make the Greater Blue Mountains a classic example of the nature-culture continuum, which has exercised the minds of the World Heritage Committee over recent years and was given expression in its Global Strategy meeting of March 1998. **Cultural criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

Aboriginal people have occupied this region for at least 14,000, and possibly 22,000, years, leaving traces of their presence in occupation sites and rock paintings and engravings. They have exploited and at the same time cared for its natural resources, from which they have also drawn spiritual sustenance.

Bands from the three language groups (Gundungarra, Daruk, and Darkinjung) were attached to defined territories within the region. Their frequent social and ceremonial gatherings are recorded in the rock art. Accounts by colonists of early encounters with these people emphasize their powerful physique, adapted to the rugged terrain in which they lived.

British colonization began on the coast near what is now Sydney in 1788 and numerous attempts were made to cross this formidable natural barrier. In 1814 a route was set up along the Aboriginal pathway on the ridge between the Grose and Cox's rivers, through the centre of the area now being nominated. European settlers quickly began to move across it and appropriated for grazing their stock fertile areas that had been kept clear by the Aboriginal people to encourage wallabies and kangaroos. This disrupted a key element of Aboriginal food supply and led to tensions between the two communities.

These tensions led to a state of war in the eastern part of the Blue Mountains, and a punitive expedition sent from Sydney in 1816 resulted in the massacre of a number of Aborigines. As a consequence they adopted new strategies for survival utilizing resources from the settlers' economy while maintaining their own economy as far as possible.

European settlement grew steadily, especially after the 1861 Crown Lands Alienation Act. Small holdings became widespread in the valley lands and the settlers established good relationships with the Aboriginal communities. Certain lands were excluded from the provisions of the Act and those that followed for public recreation, catchment protection, or forest reserves.

In the 1850s a railway line was built, on the same ridge route as the road, and this attracted a new form of settlement: the country estates of professional men who did not need to make a living from the land. Tourism became common and townships encouraged the building of guesthouses for visitors who made use of the many walking tracks that were developed. The region has been the most significant centre for tourists from the Sydney region ever since that time.

Mining also began in the Blue Mountains. Many small mines were set up in the 1860s to exploit coal, shale, and other minerals, but the deposits were not extensive and the rough settlements that grew up round the mines were quickly abandoned.

Farming and urban development continued throughout the early 20th century, but at the same time efforts were made to preserve the natural environment of the Mountains. In the early 1950s the smaller reserves created by local authorities were amalgamated to form the Blue Mountains National Park. Since that time more National Parks and protected areas have been created in the region.

Recently the Gundungarra and Daruk people have set up local Tribal Councils to reunite the Aboriginal people of the region.

#### *Description*

[The ICOMOS evaluation does not include a general description of the entire region proposed for inscription, since this is covered by the IUCN evaluation. The section that follows concentrates on the rock art of the Great Blue Mountains.]

Nearly 700 Aboriginal sites have been recorded in the Greater Blue Mountains area, and 40% of these have an art component

The rock art of the region occurred in two distinct social contexts. Through stylistic behaviour the people of the region, who were not in continuous verbal contact with one another, were able to communicate important social messages and demonstrate both broad group cohesion and intra-group distinctiveness. It has been studied since the beginning of the present century and it was the subject of the first quantitative archaeological analysis of any corpus of Aboriginal art in Australia in 1965.

The rock art occurs in rock shelters and on open sandstone platforms; paintings and engravings are found together on the shelters, but the platforms have only engravings.

The Blue Mountains rock art is dominated by tracks or figurative motifs. They generally consist of simple outlines, with varying degrees of infilling, especially on the painted art. The subjects include anthropomorphic figures, terrestrial and marine animals, birds, items of material culture, and tracks of humans, birds, and kangaroos. Many of them are life-sized, and a few are either very large (up to 7m) or very small (15cm kangaroos).

Stencilling is a common feature in the rock shelters. The outlines are mostly of hands, but cultural artefacts such as hafted axes or boomerangs are also found.

Analysis of the pigmented shelter art by indirect (associated excavated sites) or direct (accelerator mass spectrometry) dating techniques suggests that most of the material is from the last 4000 years, with the most intensive production

between 3000 and 1000 years ago. It was still being produced at the time of European contact after 1788. No technique is available for dating the rock platform engravings, but on stylistic grounds they are considered to be contemporary with the paintings.

The engravings sites are to be found on relatively horizontal stone platforms. More than half of them are on ridgelines; they are rare in valley bottoms. The average number of engravings is ten, but there are four sites with over a hundred, at Burragurra and Frying Pan Rock.

By contrast, the rock shelters are more profusely decorated: the average number of motifs is 25, whilst the largest (Swinton's) has more than 850 and eight contain over 200. The shelters are mostly on hill slopes, the remainder being equally divided between ridges and valley bottoms. Most of the designs are either drawn or painted directly on the surface of the back wall, and less commonly on the ceilings or inside lips of the overhang. The paintings are predominantly monochrome; black predominates, followed by white, red, and yellow. The choice of colour varies significantly between different areas.

Many of the decorated shelters have produced evidence of human occupation. It is likely that most of the sites were occupied, but the evidence is below the surface and can only be revealed by excavation.

#### **Management and Protection**

[This aspect of the nominated property will be covered in detail in the IUCN evaluation.]

All the land within the nominated area is public land, vested in the State of New South Wales (NSW). With the exception of the Jenolan Caves Reserve, which is a karst conservation reserve, the entire area is protected as national parks established under the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974. They are under the control and management of the Director-General of the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Service.

Management plans are in force or in preparation for all the parks, consistent with the NSW National Parks and Wildlife Service's *Field Management Policies*. Among their objectives are the preservation of Aboriginal sites and historic features, for which detailed guidelines are laid down in the *Field Management Policies*. There is a policy laid down for consulting Aboriginal communities on all matters that relate to their heritage and way of life.

#### **Conservation and Authenticity**

##### *Conservation history*

Conservation began with the establishment of the first reserve in 1867, and more were added in the following decades; they were consolidated in 1917 and incorporated into the Blue Mountains National Park in 1987. However, the impetus in creating these reserves was directed towards the maintenance of their natural and scenic qualities. Concern for the Aboriginal rock art is a more recent phenomenon, resulting from post-World War II archaeological studies and a revaluation of the status of the Aboriginal people in contemporary Australian society.

Intensive survey, inventory, and selective excavation of Aboriginal sites has been proceeding steadily in recent decades. However, the potential exists for discovering many more sites, but work is hampered by the difficulty of access to many high mountain areas. Conservation and protection interventions have been made on some of the more accessible and spectacular sites.

#### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of Australian Aboriginal rock art has been the subject of considerable discussion among professionals. Repainting under the control of elders with traditional knowledge is essential to cultural practice, and to treat these as untouchable prehistoric art, comparable with that of Europe, is inappropriate, since the Aboriginal culture survives to the present day. Repainting and re-grooving of engravings also have a positive social value as a means of cultural revival for the Aboriginals.

It may be argued that the rock art of the Greater Blue Mountains area is authentic in terms of design, function, and setting. However, paradoxically, the absence of a consistent policy of repainting by the Aboriginal people might at the same time be considered to produce a lower level of material authenticity.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Greater Blue Mountains area in February 1999. Part of that mission was joint with the IUCN expert mission.

##### *Qualities*

The Greater Blue Mountains area is one of great natural beauty where humans have lived for many millennia. The Aboriginal people have left striking evidence of their beliefs and way of life in the form of rock art of high quality.

##### *Comparative analysis*

Rock art is the most durable and impressive evidence that has survived of early human societies. Only in Australia, however, has that art continued up to the present day. In judging rock-art sites, therefore, comparisons can only logically be made with similar sites in that continent.

Two Aboriginal sites containing painted rock art are already on the World Heritage List – Uluru-Kata Tjuta and Kakadu. These, however, are inscribed as cultural landscapes rather than on the basis of their rock art alone. Because of its proximity to Sydney, the Blue Mountains area has attracted settlers and visitors in large numbers since the beginning of the 19th century. In the Greater Blue Mountains area (especially Yengo National Park) there remains a significant assemblage of engraved rock art and some painted art. Nevertheless, many traces of the impact of Aboriginal groups over many millennia have been almost completely obliterated. A partial network of tracks is still extant, but most of these date from the European settlement rather than the earlier period. The most enduring remains of the early Aboriginal occupants of the area are their rock art.

In a comparative study carried out in 1998, the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Rock Art identified six criteria for evaluating rock-art sites: aesthetic qualities;

ethnological qualities; archaeological and chronological qualities; environmental qualities; number of images in a prescribed area (sacred sites); and degree of protection. In applying these criteria, the study identified only two collections of Aboriginal painted rock art that it considered to merit special consideration for the World Heritage List – the Laura area of Cape York (Queensland) and the Bradshaw site at Kimberley (Western Australia). It does not include any engraved art sites.

##### *ICOMOS comments*

ICOMOS is concerned about the priority given to conservation planning for rock-art sites in the management plans seen by its expert mission. Their vulnerability would, in the opinion, justify the development of an overall strategy and the assignment of high priority to conservation planning and active management of selected sites. The former should include the adoption of guidelines for repainting and re-grooving in consultation with Aboriginal elders.

Some of the more easily accessible sites are in need of greater protection and conservation. The engraving sites at Burragarra and Finchley are at risk from bulldozers during fire management and from four-wheel-drive traffic. Some vandalism combined with weathering make the Smith's Pass painting site in special need of urgent conservation.

The State Party cites only criterion vi for inscription as a cultural property, justifying it in terms of "the intense inter-relationship of nature and people over tens of thousands of years." Whilst this is incontestable, there is a serious discontinuity in that inter-relationship. The long-lived Aboriginal culture achieved a perfect symbiotic relationship with the entire landscape from the mountains to the valley bottoms, on which its physical impact was minimal. The European relationship, by contrast, virtually destroyed the Aboriginal system. It imposed a new and intrusive system on the more fertile and accessible sections, while leaving vast areas of inaccessible land untouched. These areas are now regarded as needed for conserving the natural beauty for aesthetic and recreational reasons. The role of the Blue Mountains as a source of recreation, art, and nature conservation is acknowledged, but this cannot be interpreted as being of outstanding universal value.

ICOMOS finds it difficult to accept this as a justification for use of cultural criterion vi. It has also considered the application of cultural criteria ii and iii, but it feels that the case to be made out under these criteria is weak, especially for the natural area that has been nominated.

ICOMOS wishes to draw the attention of the State Party to the need to reconcile the fire-management practices on open sandstone surfaces with policies for the long-term protection of the cultural values of such sites.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of cultural criteria.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Mount Wuyi (China)

No 911

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Mount Wuyi
<i>Location</i>	Wuyishan City, Fujian Province
<i>State Party</i>	People's Republic of China
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

**Note** This property is nominated under both natural and cultural criteria as a mixed site. In this evaluation only that information from the dossier relating to nomination under the cultural criteria are taken into account.

### Justification by State Party

Archaeological remains show that there were people living in Mount Wuyi as early as 4000 years ago. They gradually developed the Gumin culture and later the Minye culture, both of which are unique, in this remote corner of China.

The boat coffins, in which the earliest cotton fabrics in China were found, the Hongqiao boards, and the 48ha Han Dynasty city of the ancient king of Yue, one of the best preserved ancient city sites in China, are evidence of the ancient civilization and traditional customs that vanished more than 3000 years ago.

Mount Wuyi was the cradle of Neo-Confucianism. This began with Cheng Yi (1033-1107) and Cheng Hao (1032-85) and attained its peak with Zhu Xi (1130-1200) It was to become the dominant intellectual theory from the Song to the Qing Dynasties (10th to 19th centuries), representing the universal traditional national spirit. Its influence spread to the countries of eastern and south-eastern Asia, and beyond to Europe and the Americas.

Zhu Xi, the second most influential figure in Chinese culture after Confucius himself, injected new vitality into the traditional Confucianism, and today scholars from many countries in the world still study this school of thought. Zhu Xi wrote and lectured at Mount Wuyi for more than fifty years, with only a short break of nine years. It was to become the centre of Neo-Confucian studies in the 10th to 17th centuries and many Neo-Confucian sites survive there.

### Cultural criterion iii

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The earliest human occupation in the Mount Wuyi region antedates the Xia Dynasty (late 3rd millennium BC). During the Shang and Zhou Dynasties (16th to 3rd centuries BC) it came within the region of minority aboriginal tribes. During the Qin Dynasty (late 3rd century BC) there was considerable migration of tribal groups into the region.

With the consolidation of the Chinese Empire by the Han Dynasty (late 3rd century BC to early 3rd century AD) Wuyi was fully incorporated into the state system, its ruler becoming a vassal of the Han Emperor. A large town was built nearby in the 1st century BC, which served as the capital and administrative centre of the region.

It was at this time that Mount Wuyi (Wuyishan) acquired its status as a sacred mountain. In the centuries that followed many holy men and scholars were attracted to it, and monasteries and academies were established in beautiful natural surroundings conducive to study and contemplation. To ensure that the beauty of the environment was not degraded, Tang Emperor Xuan Zong issued a decree in AD 748 forbidding fishing and the felling of trees, a sanction that survives to the present day.

Mount Wuyi was first a centre of Taoism, when many temples and study centres were established, but Buddhism also developed alongside, and by the 17th century had largely superseded Taoism. It was in the Song Dynasty that Zhu Xi evolved the doctrines of Neo-Confucianism, from his famous Wuyi Jingshe Academy, work on which began in 1183. The intellectual renown of Mount Wuyi has continued to attract scholars, sages, artists, and writers throughout subsequent ages.

#### Description

The cultural elements are concentrated in two areas in the extreme east of the nominated property.

In the lower stretches of the Nine Bend River and the mountainous area to the north, the eighteen wooden *boat coffins* in rock shelters high on the steep cliffs, supported on so-called Hongqiao boards, which have been dated to the 2nd millennium BC, are extraordinarily well preserved. Investigation of them produced a remarkable assemblage of organic materials - bamboo, silk, cotton, hemp, etc.

This area contains the remains of no fewer than 35 ancient *academies* dating from the Northern Song to Qing Dynasties (10th to 19th centuries). Closely integrated into the natural landscape, little remains of most of them. All that remains of Zhu Xi's extensive Ziyang Academy, founded in the 12th century, for example, are two rooms added several centuries later.

Similarly, few of the Taoist *temples* and *monasteries*, more than 60 of which have been located, survive to any degree of completeness. Among the exceptions are the Taoyuan Temple, the Wannian Palace, the Sanqing Hall, the Tiancheng Temple, the Baiyun temple, and the Tianxin temple, all of which have survived to varying degrees of authenticity. There is also a number of *tombs*, the oldest

dating back to the Shang Dynasty (late 2nd millennium BC), and *inscriptions* in this area.

Also of interest is the evidence of the *tea culture*. In the 11th to 16th centuries there was an Imperial tea farm here, producing tea for the Imperial Court. Certain original elements survive, but the remainder of the structures visible today are recent reconstructions. In addition, the remains of ancient tea factories, from the 17th century onwards, also survive, mostly in fragmentary form.

The second area, detached from the main scenic area and lying some 10km to the south-east, is the archaeological site of the *Han city of Chengcun*. Discovered in 1958, this is a walled city enclosing some 48ha of uneven land. The circuit of walls survives intact, and in places the walls measure 8m high by 4m wide. There are four land gates and three water gates, spanning the river which passes through the site.

The layout of the town is in accordance with the principle of urban design characteristic of southern China at this period. Four large building complexes have been located in the interior, tentatively identified as palaces or administrative centres. Other structures, such as houses, industrial buildings, kilns, and a water-supply system, have been found inside and outside the perimeter walls.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The entire area proposed for inscription is protected by a series of overlapping laws of the People's Republic of China (PRC), including the following: Forestry Law (1982), Law on the Protection of Wildlife (1988), Law on Environmental Protection (1989), Law on Management of Scenic and Historic Interest Areas (1985), Regulations on Nature Reserves (1994), and Law on the Protection of Cultural Relics (1982).

Regulations and other legal instruments relating specifically to Mount Wuyi were promulgated by the Fujian Provincial People's Government in 1982, 1988, 1990, 1995, and 1996.

### *Management*

The entire area covered by the nomination - 63,575ha of core zone, 36,400ha of inner protection zone, and 27,999ha of buffer zone - is owned by the People's Republic of China.

Two of the four zones into which the nominated property is divided have cultural values: the eastern natural and cultural landscape protection zone (7000ha) and the Chengcun Han Dynasty ancient town (48ha). Each of these, according to Chinese practice, consists of a core area, an inner protection zone, and a buffer zone. No development may take place in the core area, whilst that in the two surrounding zones is strictly controlled.

The *Master Plan of the Wuyi Scenic and Historic Interest Areas* was completed by the State Bureau of Cultural Relics (now the National Administration for Cultural Heritage) and the Ministry of Urban and Rural Construction and Environmental Protection in 1986. This ordinance, in association with the *Rules on the Management of Scenic and Historic Interest Areas in Fujian Province*, promulgated by the Provincial People's Government in 1996, provides an overall management and protection programme. It involves the installation and maintenance of facilities for fire

prevention, internal communications, viewing facilities and other facilities for tourists, the investigation and conservation of cultural properties, the creation and maintenance of scientific documentation and archives, and the training of scientific, technical, and other personnel.

A number of cultural structures are individually designated as protected properties at State or provincial level.

The *Plan for the Protection of the Chengcun Site of Han Dynasty Town* was formulated in 1995. It provides for systematic scientific excavation and survey as the basis for the preparation of a master management plan. It was designated a key site under State protection in 1986.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Systematic conservation may be considered to have begun as early as the 8th century AD, when Tang Emperor Xuan Zong declared Wuyishan to be a celebrated mountain and issued an edict controlling forestry operations, thereby protecting the landscape as a whole. The first supervisor of the area was appointed by the Imperial court in 1121. Further protection and development control resulted from the establishment of the Imperial tea plantation in 1302.

Many of the religious and academic structures were progressively abandoned and left to collapse into ruins. Others survived, though were rebuilt on more than one occasion following landslides or fires. After 1949 several underwent changes of use from Taoist temples to secular purposes (meeting halls, tea factories, residential buildings) but have subsequently been restored and opened to the public.

Three major surveys of the cultural heritage have been carried out in 1973, 1982, and 1987 respectively.

### *Authenticity*

The cultural landscape in the eastern zone, along the Nine Bend River, has conserved a remarkable degree of authenticity, largely owing to the strict application over more than a millennium of the 8th century ban on fishing and forestry operations. However, the intact cultural properties in this region have to a considerable extent lost their authenticity in design, materials, and function as a result of numerous changes of use and reconstructions.

By contrast, the archaeological sites - the Chengcun ancient town site, the boat coffins, and the remains of demolished or collapsed temples, academies, and monasteries - possess full authenticity.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Mount Wuyi in September 1998.

### *Qualities*

It is necessary to distinguish between two separate cultural elements in this nomination.

The cultural landscape along the Nine Bend River and on the mountain is one of great beauty, and it contains a group of religious and academic buildings, many in ruins, attracted there because of the beauty and tranquillity of the natural landscape. Its qualities were recognized as early as the 8th century AD, when measures were introduced to ensure their continuance.

The Chengcun ancient town site is one of considerable archaeological and historical significance. It was, however, not recognized until 1958 and its scientific excavation and exploration are still in their initial stages.

#### *Comparative analysis*

Comparison must be made with other sacred mountains in China, notably Taishan, Huangshan, and Emeishan, all of which are on the World Heritage List. In terms of religious significance, Wuyishan must be considered to be of less importance, despite its association with Neo-Confucianism.

Chengcun ancient town is exceptional, in that there is no other Han Dynasty city site that has not been overlaid, at least in part, by later urban development.

#### *ICOMOS comments and recommendations*

It is necessary to treat the main Wuyishan site and the Chengcun ancient town separately, since the cultural links between them are tenuous.

The landscape in the eastern zone is of considerable cultural interest, not least because of its conscious protection since the 8th century. However, its significance lies principally in its undeniable natural beauty, and as such it is better covered by natural criterion iii.

The cultural significance of the Chengcun ancient city site is indisputable, representing as it does the undisturbed remains of a complete capital city laid out and built two millennia ago. Its exploration is, however, still in its early stages, and little, if anything, has been done by the responsible authorities in relation to its long-term investigation, conservation, management, and presentation.

Since this site has no recognizable qualities that would conform with the natural criteria, ICOMOS considers therefore that this section of the nomination should be withdrawn. The State Party should be invited to consider the possibility of nominating it again at some time in the future, under the cultural criteria alone, when plans for its eventual management are considerably more advanced than they are at the present time.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property, as defined in the nomination dossier, should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of cultural criteria.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Aeolian Islands (Italy)

No 908

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Aeolian Islands
<i>Location</i>	Mediterranean Sea - Southern Tyrrhenian Sea
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	24 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Aeolian Islands are situated in the southern Tyrrhenian Sea, off the Sicilian coast. They are of outstanding value because of a combination of cultural properties concentrated in a geographical area of scientific and humanist interest and in particular of natural interest - geodynamic, vulcanological, archaeological, natural, and ethno-anthropological - which has shaped a system of considerable value in the structural landscape.

The archaeological value results from:

- The existence of remarkable evidence of uninterrupted life on the Aeolian Islands from the Middle Neolithic period to the present day, with an earlier exceptional role in the whole ancient world during the obsidian period.
- The perfect state of preservation of stratigraphic layers dating partly to the prehistory, protohistory, and antiquity of the Mediterranean, and the fact that, after the desertion or destruction of the settlements, vestiges of all the cultures were preserved almost intact, trapped in a layer of volcanic dust carried by the wind and generated by the pyroclastic flow produced by volcanic activity.
- The extraordinary wealth and state of preservation of the cemeteries, including the theatre masks of the Dionysiac cult which provide precious information on the history of the theatre.
- The acropolis of Lipari with its uninterrupted life, its character as a "defended town," its architecture, its open spaces, and its thematic and multidisciplinary museums in constant development. Its transformation from a prison into an important centre of civilization for the transmission of knowledge, culture, and the history of science and the humanities. It has become the site for the Regional Museum of Aeolian Archaeology, one of the most important in the world because of its complementary sections on vulcanology and the paleontology of the Quaternary period.

Its ethnoanthropological value is of great interest because of the manmade cultural landscape, which was formed

over the centuries and has reached us as an almost intact testimony of the millennial activity of humankind, with specific settlements and cultural features relating to:

- the defence and survival of the inhabitants because of the isolation of the islands, the first settlement being characterized by a productive autarchic system;
- the use of obsidian as an excellent material for making domestic and hunting tools;
- the inclined form of the land and hence the special nature of the steep volcanic cones and the construction of stone embankments which shape the land;
- the soil characteristics which influence different types of cultivation;
- the layouts and architecture of the settlement pattern which have created an urban typology, the evolved matrix of which can be recognized in all the villages of rural origin, and especially in the towns of Alicudi, Filicudi, and Ginostra.

All these manmade landscape values are to be found in this region, now characterized by a steppe-like vegetation, by a native flora, by a cover composed of old cultivations such as olive trees and vines, associated with species of the Mediterranean *maquis*, particularly broom, lentisk, arbutus, dwarf fan-palms, medicinal plants, and capers. In the Aeolian Islands, nature dominates the inhabited areas. Cultivation is carried out on stone terraces, and the houses are set in areas shaped by the vegetation. Everything is linked in such a way that the human settlements and natural landscape give the islands an important ecological interest.

[**Note:** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List. Furthermore, this text is an abbreviated version of the one in the nomination dossier in that it only takes the cultural aspects into consideration.]

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the World Heritage Convention of 1972, the nominated property is *a site*. It is also *a cultural landscape* as defined in the *Guidelines for the Establishment of the World Heritage Convention* (1998), paragraph 39.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The first known settlements go back to the Middle Neolithic period on the island of Lipari. Trading in obsidian brought prosperity to the islands for about 2000 years, until the last third of the 2nd millennium BC. The spread of the use of metal and its techniques in the Mediterranean led to a period of economic decline and depopulation until the 2nd millennium BC. Activity revived during the Bronze Age.

The islands experienced different fortunes until the arrival of the Greeks around 580 BC. During this period, the archipelago was very sparsely populated. A cyclopean wall

discovered during excavations at the acropolis of Lipari probably belongs to this period.

Lipari remained a Greek colony until 252 BC. It then fell into the hands of the Romans during the first Punic War. This occupation caused a strong recession, which ended with the defeat of Carthage.

Very little is recorded about the period covering the Roman Empire and the early Middle Ages. Christianity was established very early, centred on veneration of the relics of St Bartholomew.

In 836, the Arabs destroyed Lipari and deported its inhabitants. The islands remained deserted until the Norman Conquest. With the creation in 1083 of the first Benedictine monastery on the acropolis of Lipari, activity revived and agriculture was reintroduced.

Between the 13th and 14th centuries, Lipari was the object of struggles to control the Tyrrhenian Sea. The unification of the Kingdoms of Naples and Sicily resulted in a period of great prosperity.

In 1544, incursions by Barbary pirates destroyed the town of Lipari. It was rebuilt and encircled by ramparts. Its expansion was limited by these fortifications until the 18th century. Intensified naval and agricultural activities resulted in the population leaving the acropolis to settle in the fertile areas. The island of Salina was divided into three districts at the beginning of the present century.

From 1926 to 1950, the acropolis of Lipari and the old episcopal palace were used as a political prison, which contributed to the economic isolation of Lipari during the first half of this century. Furthermore, in the 19th century the vine monoculture was hit by an outbreak of phylloxera, which badly damaged the vines and generated an economic situation from which the islands did not recover. A long crisis preceded a revival of activity, based mainly on tourism, which emerged after the 1950s.

Although tourism helped to revive the country, it also led to the destruction of its culture. Many traditional houses and buildings linked to agricultural activities were transformed into holiday homes inspired by models foreign to the local culture.

Political action, backed by the scientific and cultural sector, is trying to reverse this tendency by developing forms of protection for the most significant monuments and by diversifying activities.

#### *Description*

The archipelago is composed of seven islands, the principal one being Lipari; two of the islands, Stromboli and Vulcano, are marked by considerable volcanic activity.

The entire archipelago is an inexhaustible subject of vulcanological studies, as well as being an important area for archaeology. The accumulation of volcanic ash has protected numerous ancient Greek and Roman remains from the wear and tear of time and from plundering.

The present morphology of the villages is characteristic of Mediterranean insular settlement and can be compared with that of the Greek islands. The dominant feature of the landscape is its volcanic stratification, which is particularly visible on cliffs.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The Aeolian archipelago is part of the Sicilian Region and the Province of Messina. It is organized into four districts : Leni, Malfa, and Santa Marina Salina (all on the Island of Salina), and Lipari. There is one single municipality composed of the islands of Lipari, Vulcano, Filicudi, Alicudi, Stromboli, and Panarea.

Protection of the landscape and architectural heritage of the archipelago, provided for by Law No 1497 of 29.6.1939, is implemented by the Department of Landscape, Architecture and Town Planning Properties of the *Soprintendenza per i Beni Culturali ed Ambientali di Messina*.

### *Management*

There is a mixed system of land and property belonging to the State, Region, and town council, and above all, private property.

Given the scale of the region, it is impossible to mention all the properties registered and parcelled out by the cadastral survey.

In addition to common land, there are areas for public use, such as those where pumice can be quarried on Mount Pelato in Lipari, other areas of the Monte della Fossa delle Felci in Salina, and many others.

The acropolis of Lipari is owned by the *Demanio Regionale Assessorato dei Beni Culturali ed Ambientali* and comes under the authority of the *Soprintendenza per i Beni Culturali ed Ambientali di Messina* (Department of Archaeological Property).

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation History*

Until recently, the Lipari islands had not undergone profound alterations. However, the development of tourism and the conversion of traditional buildings into holiday homes pose a serious threat to conservation.

### *Authenticity*

The main guarantee of authenticity and integrity comes from the fact that 90% of the publications on vulcanology are about the Aeolian Islands.

The headquarters of the GVN for the permanent monitoring of volcanic activity, managed by the CNR and by the Ministry of Civil Protection, is on the island of Vulcano. Lipari Castle is the home of the Aeolian Museum, which contains items collected from 1946 to the present. Together with the adjoining archaeological site, it is one of the most important historical and archaeological museums of the Mediterranean.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An expert mission visited Lipari in February/March 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Aeolian Islands form a volcanic archipelago in the area of influence of ancient Greece.

### *Comparative analysis*

The Aeolian Islands belong to the family of insular arcs with which they can be compared in terms of geometry, morphology, and development of products. However, as already pointed out, the Aeolian Islands have specific features within this family (curvature, incline, energy, flow area, constant activity on Stromboli, etc). With respect to the type of explosive activity, eruptions, etc, the Aeolian Islands can be compared with the Aegean archipelago (Kos, Nysidos, Yali, Santorini, Mylos, Methana).

Certain volcanic shapes typical of the Aeolian Islands (eg the large Fossa crater on Vulcano and Pollara on Salina) show similarities with certain volcanoes of the celebrated Galapagos Islands of Darwin, whilst Stromboli has morphological similarities with the Piton de la Fournaise in the Indian Ocean.

From the archaeological point of view, the Aeolian Islands can be considered as a continuous "Pompeii," with magma eruptions that do not have the same dramatic nature.

For the three millennia in question, this stratigraphy is the most complete, precise, and detailed in the central and western Mediterranean, and it provides a key to understanding other civilizations of the Mediterranean.

This phenomenon has preserved intact the Greek and Roman cemetery (with about 3000 tombs excavated to date), which is almost unique among those of Sicily, Greece, and Etruria.

Nearly twenty shipwrecks, from the early Bronze Age to the 17th century, have been found.

### *Observations by ICOMOS*

The upheavals of history and the relative aridity of the Aeolian Islands, remarkable for their volcanic geology, are at the origin of frequent population movements since prehistoric times. The result is a heritage of great archaeological diversity.

Nevertheless, ICOMOS does not consider that the Aeolian Islands possess the outstanding universal value required to justify inscription on the World Heritage List. There are other volcanic islands that have greater archaeological and historical importance and landscapes that have been less adversely impacted by modern intrusions linked with the growth of tourism.

### **Recommendation**

That this cultural property should not be included in the World Heritage List according to cultural criteria.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Ibiza (Spain)

No 417 rev

### Identification

*Nomination* Ibiza, Biodiversity and Culture

*Location* Ibiza - Balearic Islands

*State Party* Spain

*Date* 30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

In view of the decision taken by the World Heritage Committee at its 11th session in Paris in 1987 not to accept a proposal for inscription restricted to the Upper Town of Ibiza, the State Party intends to submit a different proposal which incorporates new areas and archaeological sites of great value, adds new scientific interpretations to the value of the Properties, and demonstrates the relationship between the cultural and natural elements.

The fortifications of Ibiza, dating back to the 16th century, are a unique illustration of the architecture, military engineering and aesthetics of the Renaissance. This Italo-Spanish model exerted a very great influence, especially on the construction of fortified towns in the New World.

#### Criterion ii

The Phoenician ruins of Sa Caleta and the Phoenician-Punic necropolis of Puig des Molins are an outstanding reflection of the urbanization and social life of Phoenician colonies in the western Mediterranean. They are a unique source, both in quantity and in quality, of finds from Phoenician and Carthaginian burial places.

#### Criterion iii

The Upper Town of Ibiza is an excellent example of a fortified acropolis with defensive walls and an urban fabric which still show, in an exceptionally clear way, the stratification of the first Phoenician settlements, followed by the Arab and Catalan periods and up to the Renaissance bastions. The latter phase, a long process of erecting defensive walls, did not destroy but incorporated the previous construction phases and urban fabric.

#### Criterion iv

### Category of Property

With reference to Article 1 of the World Heritage Convention, the cultural properties nominated for inscription are in part, a *group of buildings*, and in part a *site*. Las Salinas (the Salt-Pans) are also a *cultural landscape*, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (1998).

### History and Description

*Property nominated for inscription*

- The Upper Town (Alta Vila) of Ibiza and its 16th Century Fortifications.

The Upper Town of Ibiza is the oldest area. It emerges like an acropolis standing on a headland facing the sea. Its architecture and physiognomy have not been changed since the fortifications were built in the 16th century, based on the military precepts of the Renaissance. The defensive walls and bastions have incorporated, in a much larger area, those which existed before, thus making it possible to study the stratigraphy of successive fortifications.

*Ebysos* (the town of Bes, an Egyptian god) was founded by the Carthaginians in 654 BC. Punic water tanks can still be seen, particularly in the area of El Soto. For 2000 years, the town and its fortified harbour were the centre of Mediterranean navigation. The local economy was based on the collection of salt from the pans, wool, and figs.

After a period of alliance with Rome, the island came under the control of the Arabs in 902. The excavated ruins of a strong earthen wall, as well as the urban plan of the medina, an Arab town spread over a surface of 4ha *intra muros*, date to this period. The medina consists of narrow streets lined by dwelling houses with windows looking over an inner courtyard, and surrounded by walls on three sides.

In 1235, the town was dominated by Christians, who built the Catalan castle, visible from the inside of the present building, the medieval fortifications, and the 13th century Gothic cathedral which can still be admired.

From 1530 to 1540, Philip II drew up a strategic plan to defend communications between Spain and Italy. In 1584-85, new fortifications were erected with the help of two specialized Italian architects, Giovanni Battista Calvi and Jacobo Paleazzo Fratin. These fortifications were to serve as models for the harbour towns of the Caribbean.

- The Phoenician-Punic cemetery of Puig des Molins

This large cemetery is situated in the south west of the Upper Town and covers a fully protected surface of several hectares. At the beginning of the 6th century BC, the ashes of the dead were placed in a natural grotto after cremation. Later, shafts and funerary chambers were dug, over a surface of 5ha and then 7ha. Monolithic sarcophagi were lowered through shafts into hypogea, family sepulchres. This cemetery was in use until the end of the Roman period.

The Phoenician Punic cemetery is the oldest to have been preserved, thus making it possible to study a wide variety of tombs, statues, and cult objects. It has been included in the urban perimeter and has added to the beauty of the site, with its terraces planted with olive trees to take advantage of the humidity of the underground chambers.

Compared to the 1986 request for inscription, the perimeter of the cemetery has been added to that of the Upper Town in the 1998 request.

- The Phoenician-Punic Archaeological Site of Sa Caleta

This is the site of the first Phoenician occupation, near the salt-pans. It was abandoned around 590 BC in favour of

the site of Ibiza. This settlement covered the 5ha of the peninsula before it was eroded by the sea.

Excavations have unearthed walls of a thickness of 45-60cm. Scattered square-shaped buildings were linked by an irregular system of streets and triangular public areas, revealing an archaic form of urbanization. In the southern district, the sub-structures of a dwelling house can be visited; it is composed of a large rectangular room and seven other rooms, probably shops and kitchens. Bread was baked in 2m diameter ovens. The site was inhabited by a community of about 800 people, it had an egalitarian social structure, and an economy based on agriculture, metallurgy, salt, and fishing.

#### *Properties located in the buffer zone*

##### - Es Soto

Punic water tanks, tombs that extend the cemetery of Puig des Molins, as well as an old Moslem cemetery and the ruins of a Christian chapel, were unearthed in this southern part of the headland, between the defensive walls of Dalt Vila and the sea.

The inclusion of this zone of archaeological interest, which is fortunately in a good state of preservation, makes it possible to maintain a green space between the fortifications and the sea.

##### - Ses Feixes

This area stretches along the coast, over a flat surface situated on the other side of the harbour, opposite the Upper Town. It displays a form of cultivation based on an ingenious irrigation system: the fields are divided into long, narrow rectangles by a network of canals which have a dual function of collecting water and irrigating the fields. This system permits an intensive but well balanced cultivation of arid and marshy soils.

The proposal for inscription includes this site in the buffer zone as evidence of an agricultural organization that has both a technical and an aesthetic value.

##### - Las Salinas

Situated in the southern tip of the island, opposite the island of Formentera, this site is put forward as a cultural landscape. An age-old human activity has created a natural setting favourable to the maintenance of biodiversity. The collection of salt has always played a key role here. The area was laid out with a system of canals, dams, and dikes which formed wetland areas of great beauty and ecological interest, with a specific flora and fauna.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

All the cultural properties in question are placed under the protection of various laws and regulations concerning monuments, historic centres, archaeological sites, and the natural environment.

National Decree No 309/1969 gives Dalt Vila and Es Soto the status of Historic Complex. The salt-pans of Ibiza and Formentera are natural reserves protected by Law No 26/95. The archaeological ruins are protected by national, regional, and local measures. In 1997, the Autonomous Community of the Balearic Islands adopted a *Partial Regional Plan for Ibiza and Formentera* with a view to

protecting the salt-pans. There is also a *Special Protection Plan* and an *Urban Development Plan*.

### *Perimeter and buffer zone*

The perimeter is precise and logical. The Upper Town is clearly demarcated by its walls. The Puig des Molins cemetery and the ruins of Sa Caleta have been demarcated just as precisely as an archaeological area.

An extensive buffer zone includes the headland of the Upper Town and the cemetery, and it stretches along the coast, thus protecting the other headland and the area of Ses Feixes on the other side of the bay. The protective measures for Es Soto and the cemetery prevent any kind of alteration from being made to the environment of the fortified town. To the north, the buffer zone protects the urban districts situated beyond the walls, as they are important sources of information. In this way, the popular districts, with an Arab-style town plan and architecture, are preserved. The protective measures of the area of Ses Feixes and the headland which dominates the town prevent speculative development.

### *Management*

In the last ten years, the public authorities of Ibiza have implemented a programme of major works which have had a decisive impact on the cultural management of the island and have also enhanced the monuments of Dalt Vila.

The perimeter of the bastions has been freed of ancillary buildings which used to mask them. Water tanks and other additions which disfigured the top of the fortifications have been removed to restore the beauty of the landscape. The dwelling houses located within the walls have been equipped with modern facilities (water supply, sewerage). Electric wires have been buried. Many buildings have been restored using historic documents as a guide, and respecting the requirements of authenticity.

The curators and experts are highly qualified and well supported by the administrative authorities. The town council is determined to resist the pressure of speculation, which could affect the area of Ses Feixes.

### *Training*

The town council has organized a training workshop where young people, supervised by experienced architects and archaeologists, can learn about restoration. They are encouraged to start small maintenance firms.

### *Authenticity*

Archaeological excavations have not affected the authenticity of the Phoenician and Punic cemeteries. The monuments were not reconstructed and the structures are the original ones. Admittedly, certain openings were made in the hypogea to enable visitors to enter them one after the other. However, this alteration was made a long time ago and can be considered as being part of the history of the site.

The authenticity of the Upper Town is a more complex issue. Changes were made regularly in order to meet the social needs of its residents, an important factor for preserving the living character of the town. In this respect, the height and size of certain walls are a determining factor to safeguard the physiognomy of the town. On the whole, it maybe considered that the urban structure is intact, and that the determination to improve living conditions is positive.

The materials and the forms of the 16th century walls are authentic. Reproductions of the original plans can be consulted in the archives.

The harmony of the ensemble is spoilt by the construction of steps in reinforced concrete and a communications trench near the entrance. This unattractive intervention does not comply with professional conservation standards. It would be appropriate to stress that this type of intervention is unacceptable in order to avoid a repetition in the future and to recommend the restoration of the place to its original state.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS mission visited the nominated property in February 1999.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The fortified town and the Phoenician and Punic ruins have an exceptional character. The expertise of Calvi and Fratin in the construction of fortifications with bastions has always been recognized. The archaeological sites are of great interest.

The organization of the fields of Ses Feixes is unique in the Mediterranean and reveals an Arab-Berber origin. The Nabataeans used a similar capillary system in the Negev desert. The use of such an irrigation system implies a well planned use of the soil and control of water resources, a careful study of the differences in levels, and the erection of dams and retaining walls. An extensive social organization would have been necessary, and this was continued by the Christian parishes.

The features of the cultural landscape described are not limited to the sites nominated for inscription but can also be found in the agricultural environment of Ibiza and Formentera, despite the development of tourism, mainly confined to the coastal areas, and thanks to the deep attachment of the population to its traditions. This attachment is also reflected in local dances, popular beliefs, and forms of spirituality. This close relationship between the land and cultural traditions should be taken into account when evaluating the sites, for it is the foundation for their conservation.

#### *Comments by ICOMOS*

ICOMOS considers that the cultural properties and cultural landscape in question are of great interest, and they have fortunately come to light in the remarkable and very detailed file submitted by the State Party. The historic importance of the fortifications of the Upper Town and their influence on the architecture of harbour towns in the Caribbean should be underlined, as well as the great wealth of the Phoenician and Punic cemetery which is included in the request for inscription. Nevertheless, these historical and cultural values were already known in 1986 at the time of the first request for inscription, when ICOMOS had made a negative evaluation, and again in 1987 when the World Heritage Committee had decided to turn down this request.

In the course of the last few years, the public authorities, especially at regional level, have pursued an active policy to preserve and rehabilitate the site, which deserves praise.

However, there is no new revelation to permit a possible revision of previous evaluations.

Stress is laid on the cultural value of the irrigated landscape of Ses Feixes and the ancient salt-pans of Las Salinas. It is difficult to understand, therefore, why these are included in the buffer zone if the object of the nomination is to emphasize the cultural diversity of Ibiza.

ICOMOS is not convinced that the State Party has made a persuasive case for the resubmission of this property, the central feature of which was rejected by the Committee in 1987. Although new elements have been added, some of them are in the designated buffer zone. If this nomination is to be considered further, it is essential that the State Party should revise its presentation so as to submit all these elements in an integrated way and thereby justify the title that appears on the cover of the volumes making up the nomination (but not in the formal nomination form), "Ibiza - Biodiversity and Culture."

### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be **referred back** to the State Party requesting a revised justification for inscription to treat the various elements in the nomination as components of an integrated whole. In the event that this is made available in an acceptable form, ICOMOS will recommend inscription on the basis of *criteria ii, iii and iv*:

*Criterion ii* The intact 16th century fortifications of Ibiza bear unique witness to the military architecture and engineering and the aesthetics of the Renaissance. This Italian-Spanish model was very influential, especially in the construction and fortification of towns in the New World.

*Criterion iii* The Phoenician ruins of Sa Caleta and the Phoenician-Punic cemetery of Puig des Molins are exceptional evidence of urbanization and social life in the Phoenician colonies of the western Mediterranean. They constitute a unique resource, in terms of volume and importance, of material from the Phoenician and Carthaginian tombs.

*Criterion iv* The Upper Town of Ibiza is an excellent example of a fortified acropolis which preserves in an exceptional way in its walls and in its urban fabric successive imprints of the earliest Phoenicians settlements and the Arab and Catalan periods through to the Renaissance bastions. The long process of building the defensive walls has not destroyed the earlier phases or the street pattern, but has incorporated them in the ultimate phase.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Uvs Nuur (Mongolia/Russian Federation)

No 769rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Uvs Nuur Basin
<i>Location</i>	Uvs Aimag, Zavhan Aimag, Huvsgul Aimag (Mongolia); Mongun-Taiga Kojuun, Ovr Kojuun, Tes-Khem Kojuun, Ersin Kojuun (Tuva)
<i>State Party</i>	Mongolia and Russian Federation (Tuva)
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

**Note** This property is nominated under both natural and cultural criteria as a mixed site. In this evaluation only that information from the dossier relating to nomination under the cultural criteria are taken into account.

### Justification by State Party

The combination of cultural and natural landscapes, including thousands of artefacts, is unique and of global significance.

There are many historic sites on both the Mongolian and Tuvan sides which show signs of man's interaction with his natural environment. Two sites date to the Middle Stone Age (40,000 BP): Mesolithic petroglyphs were found in Sagil Soum and a wall painted with red pigments in Zuunhangai Soum, both depicting bovids and Siberian ibex.

In Zuungov and Omnoguv Soums (Mongolia) stone tools, preserved grain, and fish have been found from the Neolithic period, showing that these people fished and engaged in arable farming.

Research on Bronze Age sites has revealed forty rock paintings and carvings of deer, petroglyphs of animals and abstract designs, and bronze agricultural implements and other tools. These have been dated to 2000-1000 BC.

The transition from the Bronze Age to the Iron Age is illustrated by finds from the Red Mountain, outside the town of Ulaangom. Many different cultures were in the region at this time. Excavated graves, dated to c 700 BC, contained wheat, demonstrating the importance of agriculture at this period; iron tools and farming implements have also been found. All the mountain valleys contain *kurgans* (burial mounds), creating a unique historic and cultural landscape.

Among the many monuments in the Yamaalig Uul (Mountain) protected area in Tuva are more than four hundred *kurgans* and grave markers (*stelae*).

[**Note** The States Parties make no proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the cultural criteria under which they consider the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It may also be considered as a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

Human settlement in this region dates back at least to the Mesolithic period, when people with a hunter-gatherer culture and an emphasis on fishing migrated here, probably from further east. With the advent of the Neolithic period, agriculture was introduced in settled human communities. The beginning of the Bronze Age saw stock-raising becoming part of the economy of the region, and this gradually superseded arable farming in the later 1st millennium BC. Since stock-raising in this terrain requires large grazing areas, the sedentary way of life was replaced by pastoral nomadism, which has survived to the present day.

During the later history of the region structures such as Buddhist monasteries and military fortifications were built by successive ruling powers.

#### Description

The nominated area of the Uvs Nuur Basin is vast, covering more than 37,000km<sup>2</sup>, over 8000km<sup>2</sup> of which consists of protected areas.

It is a region defined by high mountain ranges that enclose a wide diversity of natural landscapes - high mountains and glaciers, snow-covered mountain tundra and alpine zones, mountain *taiga*, forested steppes, bare steppes, semi-desert, and arid deserts of shifting sand dunes. The rivers that flow through the basin have created other types of habitat such as marshes and wetlands.

The impact of humankind on the natural landscape has not been great. Almost every mountain has *kurgans* and grave markers on it, but these are the only significant traces of the nomadic peoples who have lived there for millennia. It is only since the socialist collectivization of the present century that herds and human groups have become enlarged to such an extent that grazing has created problems for the regeneration of the natural vegetation.

### Management and Protection

[This aspect will be covered in the complementary IUCN evaluation.]

### Conservation and Authenticity

#### Conservation history

The history of the conservation of the natural site will be covered in the IUCN evaluation.

The only reference in the nomination dossier to the conservation of cultural elements relates to natural features such as Uvs Nuur and Tore-Holl lakes, which are sacred to the indigenous peoples, who are responsible for their protection.

#### *Authenticity*

It is difficult to evaluate the authenticity of the cultural aspects of this large region from the data provided in the dossier. However, since it has been inhabited only by pastoral nomads for many centuries it is certain that the authenticity of the landscape will be high.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

After discussions between the two Advisory Bodies, it was decided that IUCN would undertake the evaluation mission on behalf of both bodies. For climatic reasons this mission cannot take place before May 1999.

#### *Qualities*

There can be no doubt that part at least of the Uvs Nuur Basin is a cultural landscape on which pastoral nomads have lived and grazed their herds for many millennia. Because of this continuity and the remoteness of the region it preserves its integrity to a high degree.

#### *Comparative analysis*

In the nomination dossier stress is laid on the special qualities of the Uvs Nuur Basin as compared with those of other Central Asian natural landscapes, such as the Altai Mountains, Lake Baikal (both in the Russian Federation), and Lake Hovsgol (Mongolia). Only passing reference is made to the early prehistoric sites and the *kurgans*. It should be recognized that this type of culture is very common over vast tracts of central Asia and Siberia.

#### *ICOMOS comments*

In evaluating this nomination under the cultural criteria alone, ICOMOS finds it difficult to recommend inscription. This is principally due to the fact that the data on the cultural properties are inadequate for ICOMOS to make a judgement. The archaeological remains, whilst significant from a scientific point of view, would appear not to be unique to this property. They are also widely distributed over a vast landscape and do not constitute a clearly defined and compact group. Their outstanding value resides in the evidence that they provide of a millennial pastoralism, not in their intrinsic importance. As such they need to be judged against the background of prehistoric and historic pastoral nomadism over a much wider region. No information is provided about the remains from historic periods (Buddhist monasteries, military fortifications) beyond a single sentence.

The similar culture of northern Europe is already represented on the World Heritage List by the Laponian area of northern Sweden (inscribed 1996), which was adjudged to be representative of Arctic and sub-Arctic transhumance pastoralism. A study is required to determine the most representative example of a central Asian/Siberian cultural

landscape that illustrates nomadic pastoralism for eventual inscription on the World Heritage List.

### **Recommendation**

ICOMOS recommends that further consideration of this nomination on the basis of cultural criteria should be *deferred* to await the provision of detailed information on the region's cultural properties. The States Parties should also provide comparative data on other traditional nomadic pastoral landscapes in central Asia.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Río Pinturas (Argentina)

No 936

### Identification

*Nomination* Area Arqueológica y Natural Alto Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz

*Location* Patagonia Region, Santa Cruz Province

*State Party* Argentina

*Date* 30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz, which includes the archaeological site of the Cueva de los Manos (Cave of the Hands) with its cave, rock shelters, and rock walls decorated with magnificent paintings, is an outstanding area because it contains the oldest artistic representations belonging to the first hunter-gatherer groups who inhabited what is now the territory of Argentina.

The artistic sequence, which includes three main stylistic groups, began as early as the 10th millennium BP [Before Present]. It is one of the few rock-art sites from the Early Holocene Period in Patagonia that is still well preserved. The sequence is a long one: archaeological investigations have shown that the site was last inhabited around AD 700 by the possible ancestors of the first Tehuelche people of Patagonia. The Cueva de los Manos is considered by the international scientific community to be one of the most important sites of the earliest hunter-gatherer groups in South America.

The Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz is an outstanding example of a prehistoric human habitat. Archaeological sites found on both sides of the Río Pinturas Canyon are evidence of occupation by pre-Hispanic hunters who made use of the resources of the canyon and its environment.

The paintings on the rock shelters and cave are located in an outstanding landscape, with the river running through a deep canyon, and provide an incomparable aesthetic experience for the visitor. The hunting scenes depict animals and human figures interacting in a dynamic and naturalistic manner. Different hunting strategies are shown, with animals being surrounded, trapped in ambushes, or attacked by hunters using their throwing weapons, round stones known as *bolos*. Some scenes show individual hunters and others groups of ten or more men.

There is no doubt that the Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz has high symbolic value. The inhabitants of Argentina are hardly aware of their pre-Hispanic past, since the links with that period were broken by the Spanish conquest and in the subsequent colonization

of the territory. The Cueva de los Manos is one of the most important testimonies to that past, and it is the archaeological site best known to the Argentinian people.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

The progress of human penetration into South America is the subject of intensive scientific debate at the present time. Some early radiocarbon dates from the north-eastern region of Brazil have challenged the hitherto generally accepted view that this began around 12,000 BP.

However, this does not affect the dating of the occupation of the Río Pinturas rock shelter, which has been established by excavation and radiocarbon analysis to *c* 9300 BP. The first human group (whose art is classified as Stylistic Group A) were long-distance hunters whose main prey was the guanaco.

Around 7000 BP a second cultural level can be identified, distinguished by Stylistic Group B. Hunting scenes are no longer found, and the rock art is dominated by hand stencils. There are also some examples of stencils of the feet of the American ostrich (*ñandú*). This culture lasted until *c* 3300 BP, when the art became more schematic and included highly stylized zoomorphic and anthropomorphic figures.

The final cultural phase at Río Pinturas began around 1300 BP. Its art (Stylistic Group C), executed in bright red pigments, concentrated on abstract geometric figures and highly schematic representations of animals and humans. It is believed to have been the work of the historic Tehuelche hunter-gatherers who were inhabiting the vast area of Patagonia when the first Spanish traders and settlers arrived. It was the creation of vast cattle ranches (*estancias*) that brought their way of life to an end.

The Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz is located in the *pampas* section of the Pinturas River region. Low plateaux at an altitude of 800-1000m are cut by deep canyons bordered by steep cliffs, the main one being that of the Pinturas itself. There are many natural rock shelters in these cliffs. The soil is rocky and poor, but the region supports a diverse natural fauna, in which the guanaco (*Lama guanicoe*) figures prominently.

The climate of the canyons is temperate, since they are protected from the winds that sweep the *pampas*. The mild winter temperatures and the high humidity as compared with the *pampas* make this region appropriate for seasonal grazing of the cattle from the *estancias*. Palaeoclimatic studies based on the sediments of the Cueva de los Manos suggest that the present conditions had been established by 11,000 BP.

The entrance to the Cueva de los Manos is screened by a rock wall that is covered by many hand stencils. Within the rock shelter itself there are five concentrations of rock art. Later figures and motifs are frequently superimposed upon those from earlier periods.

The paintings were executed with natural mineral pigments that were ground and mixed with some form of binder, the nature of which is unknown. Traces of the pigments were found in the archaeological excavations carried out in the entrance to the cave, thus establishing a contextual link between the paintings and the stratified cultural material. X-ray diffraction analysis has shown that the most common minerals used were iron oxides (hematite and maghemite) for red and purple, kaolin for white, natrojarosite for yellow, and manganese oxide for black; gypsum was sometimes added to the mixture.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The National Congress of the Argentine Republic declared the Cueva de los Manos an Historic National Monument by Law No 24.225 of 20 July 1993. This was in accordance with powers accorded by Law No 12.665 of 1940 to the National Commission of Museums, Monuments, and Historic Places.

At provincial level, the Government of the Province of Santa Cruz declared the City of Perito Moreno as the Archaeological Capital of Santa Cruz, because of the importance of the archaeological site of the Cueva de los Manos, by Decree No 133 of 13 May 1981. The promulgation of a provincial bill on the Protection of the Cultural Heritage is currently in progress.

### *Management*

The 1993 National Law assigns responsibility for all actions relating to the Cueva de los Manos to the National Commission for Museums, Monuments, and Historic Places and the Culture Secretariat of the Presidency of the Nation.

An Agreement for the Protection, Security, and Expansion of Infrastructure in the National Historic Monument "Cueva de los Manos" was signed in December 1998 between the Municipality of Perito Moreno, the local Departments of Culture and Tourism, the Southern Directorate of Architecture (an agency of the national Secretariat of Public Works), and the National Institute of Anthropology and Latin-American Thought (*Instituto Nacional de Antropología y Pensamiento Latinoamericano* – INAPL), which reports to the Culture Secretariat of the Presidency. This agreement assigned responsibilities to each of these bodies for specific activities within the framework of the Agreement.

INAPL began work on a management plan for the site in 1995. The first phase, which was completed in 1997, involved comprehensive recording, survey, and documentation of the entire site, inventarization of the state of conservation of the paintings, analysis of the reasons for deterioration and sampling for analysis, and the creation of a database. This was accompanied by programmes of education and public information, training of specialists, and dissemination of scientific results.

The second stage is under way. Activities in 1998 covered the preparation of bilingual interpretive material and signage and monitoring of the state of conservation of the paintings (including vandalism). A comprehensive site management proposal that is being presented to the responsible authorities covers precise delimitation of the site and the erection of a secure barrier round it, the installation of two alternating guardians permanently on the site, tighter control of tourist visits, the training of local guides and the provision of facilities for them, setting up regular opening and closing hours for visits, imposition of a charge for visits, provision of adequate on-site signage, creation of an interpretation centre, and replacing the barrier with a boardwalk.

The area proposed for inscription covers 600ha: this is shown on the map accompanying the nomination dossier as a rectangle surrounding the Cueva de los Manos. The buffer zone, however, which is not shown on the map, is only 2.331ha. Both the site and the buffer zone are within the property of a private individual, who has signed an agreement consenting to the declaration of her land as a World Heritage site.

There is a guardian living on the site, which is remote from any settlement, during the four summer months; he is assisted by his son and daughter. They are responsible for supervision, security, and visitor management. Visitors register at a cabin on the site and must be accompanied by a guide. Organized tours from Perito Moreno are accompanied by a national tourist guide who is a specialist in the Cueva de los Manos. Private visits are also organized by local *estancia* owners as part of horse-riding or backpacking tours.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Travellers have been visiting the Cueva de los Manos since the mid 19th century and recording their impressions of the paintings. They were first mentioned in the scientific literature during the present century, but it was not until the 1960s that they became the subject of serious study by Carlos J Gradin and his co-workers. Their work on recording and excavation established the importance of the Cueva de los Manos as a prehistoric rock-art site of international scientific importance.

The favourable conditions (very low humidity, no water infiltration, stable rock strata) at the rock shelter have ensured that the state of conservation of all but the most exposed paintings is excellent.

However, the increase of tourism to Patagonia in recent years has resulted in damage from human vandalism. This has included graffiti, removal of fragments of painted rock, touching of painted surfaces, accumulation of dust and refuse, etc. Visitor numbers to the Cueva de los Manos have risen from 123 in 1991/92 to 3027 in 1997/98. The presence of a guardian on the site during the summer months, when almost all visits take place, and the installation of a protective barrier in front of the paintings, which stretch along some 680m, have helped to reduce damage of this kind, but the need for better protection remains.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the rock art of the Cueva de los Manos is unquestionable. It has survived several millennia untouched

and no restoration has been carried out since it became widely known to the scientific community in the second half of the 20th century. The archaeological excavations have been very restricted, so as to obtain the maximum cultural information for dating the art with the minimum disturbance to archaeological layers or to the appearance of the rock shelter.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz in January/February 1999. ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Rock Art.

### *Qualities*

The rock art of the Cueva de los Manos in the Area Arqueológica y Natural Río Pinturas-Santa Cruz is exceptional, both for the range of its subject matter and execution and its remarkable state of conservation after several millennia.

### *Comparative analysis*

The nomination dossier refers to several comparable rock-art sites in Patagonia, but concludes that they do not approach the significance of the Cueva de los Manos.

In a comparative study carried out in 1998, the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Rock Art identified six criteria for evaluating rock-art sites: aesthetic qualities; ethnological qualities; archaeological and chronological qualities; environmental qualities; number of images in a prescribed area (sacred sites); and degree of protection. In applying these criteria, the study identified the Cueva de los Manos as conforming in an exceptional manner with these criteria.

### *ICOMOS recommendations*

There is considerable ambiguity about what is being proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List. The area shown on the map supplied seems to be a somewhat arbitrarily drawn rectangular area of 600ha. However, the nomination dossier concentrates entirely on the Cueva de los Manos and its rock art. Reference is made to the surrounding landscape, but only to establish the environment of the archaeological site. The delimited area is not proposed as a cultural landscape, nor is the nomination a mixed one, under both cultural and natural criteria. ICOMOS recommends that only the rock-shelter site itself, with a small security and facilities area around it, should be delineated and proposed for inscription. The 600ha area shown in the nomination dossier could be retained as an appropriate buffer zone, since its role has already been acknowledged by the owner of the land.

There is a case to be made for associating the landscape of Alto Río Pinturas with the rock art, since the faunal species that it depicts still flourish in the area. This point has been made both by the representative of IUCN who accompanied the ICOMOS expert mission and by the President of the ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Rock Art, who has recently visited the site. However, ICOMOS does not feel that the cultural criteria, as currently drafted, allow it to recommend inscription of the entire area. It suggests that

the State Party should be encouraged to resubmit the property under the natural criteria.

ICOMOS is concerned about the management of the site, in the light of the remarkable growth of visitor numbers over the present decade and the continued increase likely to result from eventual World Heritage inscription. The proposals made for the second phase of the INAPL programme are excellent. There is also a need for a phased continuing maintenance and conservation programme, with costings and assurances that the necessary funding will be forthcoming. This should be formalized as an official management plan, supported by the responsible institutions and implemented without delay.

## Recommendation

That further consideration of this nomination should be *deferred* to enable the State Party to prepare and implement a management plan as proposed by ICOMOS. It should also redefine the nominated property so as to cover only the archaeological site of the Cueva de los Manos. This will entail a change to the title of the nominated property, which would be best described as "The Cueva de los Manos, Río Pinturas." It should also be invited to consider the possibility of submitting the entire area for consideration under the natural criteria.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Graz (Austria)

No 931

### Identification

*Nomination* City of Graz – historic centre

*Location* Province of Styria

*State Party* Austria

*Date* 18 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The historic centre of Graz, with its group of well preserved buildings dating back to several periods, is an outstanding example of an historic Central European city. Its authenticity has not been affected by the wars or the subsequent periods of economic expansion. An "urban organism," between the river and the Schlossberg, emerged from the Middle Ages, and was to play an important role in Europe as a princely court and as a bastion of the Empire against the Ottomans.

The various stages of urban development can be clearly identified. Each epoch is represented by typical architectural styles which form a harmonious whole. Even now, the city is a melting pot for an unusual mixture of Mediterranean and Nordic influences, evidence of the vast expansion of the Austro-Hungarian monarchy, reflected in its urban structure, in the atmosphere of its streets and squares, and in the elaborate architecture of its churches, monasteries, palaces and big houses.

When the city spread in the 19th and 20th centuries it left behind a green zone all round the historic centre on the site of the old fortifications. The social structure of the historic centre has been preserved to a high degree by adapting areas of traditional life within the walls of old buildings.

The Middle Ages bequeathed churches with vast naves, as well as an urban system and large houses clustered around the foot of the Schlossberg and on the two banks of the river Mur. The Renaissance and Baroque periods are represented by numerous religious buildings, imposing aristocratic residences, courtyards enclosed by elegant arches, and splendid facades. Finally, the Classical period left numerous buildings of interest in the south and east of the historic centre. The heart of Graz therefore has exceptional value as an urban structure and as an example of remarkably well preserved traditional architecture.

### Criterion iv

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the World Heritage List of 1972, the historic centre of Graz is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

The first traces of continuous human settlement of the site goes back to the Neolithic period. The site was not used as a Roman settlement, even though a few roads crossed it. After the fall of the Roman Empire, it was invaded, first by Alpine Slavs, the Avars, a horse-riding nomadic people subjugated by Charlemagne; then by the Hungarians, who were defeated at the battle of Lechfeld in 955; and finally by German settlers. Graz was thus included in the march of Carinthia. A small fortress (*gradec* in Slavic, hence the name of Graz) was erected on the Schlossberg hill, while a few houses and a church were constructed around it. Graz was mentioned for the first time in an official deed of 1128/29.

It was around this time that an open market began to thrive, leading to the first urban development with the immigration of Bavarian settlers. Besides the local nobility, the population consisted of traders and artisans, as well as a Jewish community which remained there until the 15th century. Graz was governed by the Houses of Traungau and Babenberg, and was given the status of a city.

After the Treaty of Neuberg in 1379 and the first division of the Habsburg heritage, the city came under the rule of the line established by Leopold III. Graz became the capital of Inner Austria, composed of Styria, Carinthia, Carniola, Istria, and Trieste. Graz also became a favourite royal place of residence, particularly for Frederick III (1453-93), who granted it many privileges, had many buildings erected, and rebuilt the Church of St Aegidius, now the cathedral.

The city and region then became involved in serious armed conflicts with Hungarian and Turkish invaders. In 1480, the Turks even arrived the gates of the city: this episode is portrayed in a fresco in the cathedral entitled "The Scourges of God," a Gothic masterpiece by Master Thomas von Villach. The 16th century was marked by constant threats from the Turks, as well as religious turmoil. To confront these threats, the medieval fortifications were completely reorganized and modernized according to the rules in force during the Renaissance. In 1559, the Clock Tower, the symbolic monument of Graz, was given its characteristic appearance, which has remained unchanged to these days.

In 1564, as a result of a new partition of the Habsburg lands, Graz became the capital of Inner Austria, despite the danger of Turkish invasions and the advances made by the Reformation. Three-quarters of the inhabitants were Protestants, active in the burgeoning Protestant Foundation where Kepler, the famous astronomer and mathematician, taught.

However, the city was soon to undergo the most important phase of its development with the arrival of the Jesuits in 1572. Archduke Charles II supported the Counter-Reformation, established the Jesuit University and went to great lengths to undermine the Protestant Foundation, which disappeared in 1600. His son Ferdinand had a monumental mausoleum built by the artist Pietro de Pomis. However, on his election as Emperor in 1618, he transferred his court to Vienna and Graz underwent a relative economic recession.

During the 17th century, several mansions were built in the Renaissance or early Baroque styles: the Kollonitsch Palace, the Effans von Avernas Palace, and the Stubenberg palace, the last-named passing on to the Welserheim family. Facades were remodelled in these styles and courtyards enclosed by arches were added to existing buildings. In the western part of the city, the Governor of Inner Austria, Hans Ulrich von Eggenberg, built a ducal palace of great artistic interest; it is the most important Baroque palace in Styria. The great architect Johann Bernhard Fisher von Erlach, was born in Graz in 1656. When the danger from the Turks was finally averted thanks to two decisive victories, Saint Gotthard in 1664 and Vienna in 1683, the economy boomed once again. Aristocrats and bourgeoisie competed with each other in their aspirations for honours and culture.

Graz subsequently expanded towards the south and south-west. Factories and banks were set up and started to thrive. However, the movement to centralize Austrian power, ending in the abolition of Inner Austria, weakened the institutions of Graz. At the same time, pilgrimage centres, such as Maria Hilf and Maria Trost, became monumental sanctuaries. The suppression of convents undertaken by Joseph II led to the closing of nine out of sixteen monasteries, whilst the University Library was enriched with works from forty monasteries in Styria and Carinthia. In 1786, the Bishop of Seckau transferred his residence to Graz and turned the Church of St Aegidius into a cathedral. The Jesuit Order was dissolved in 1773 and their university turned into a State university.

The economic growth of the city was severely affected by the wars between the Coalition and France. French troops occupied Graz on several occasions, in 1797, 1805, and 1809, imposing heavy war levies. They besieged the Schlossberg, which put up a brave resistance; however, under the terms of the Treaty of Schönbrunn, the fortifications had to be demolished. In 1839, a public park was laid out over the Schlossberg, giving it its present aspect.

The 1848 Revolution was a fairly moderate one. The pro-German middle class governed the city until 1918. It was a flourishing period for modern town planning. The city acquired military land to create green areas for the public and declared them as *non aedificandi* zones. Urban expansion was channelled outside this green belt and influenced by the *Biedermeier* style and then the *Jugendstil*, whilst the historic centre continued to be the social and commercial hub of the town.

The assassination of the heir to the throne, Archduke Franz-Ferdinand, who was born in Graz in the Khuenburg Palace, triggered off the hostilities of World War I in 1914. When the new frontiers were drawn up in 1918-19, Graz lost its hinterland and to a certain extent was relegated to the fringe from the geographical and economic points of view. In 1938, the seventeen surrounding municipalities formed a town incorporated into Greater Graz. World War II was followed by a slow return to normal, and Graz once again became a modern garden city, a cultural and industrial centre, and a university town.

#### *Description*

The inscription of the city of Graz on the World Heritage List is justified, above all, by the exceptional character of the urban complex as such and by the harmonious example of town planning and architectural styles reflecting

successive periods in the history of the city and its development.

Among the hundreds of buildings of great historic and architectural interest, a few particularly remarkable edifices are worthy of note.

- The Castle

Of the original castle where Emperor Frederick III resided, all that remains is a Gothic hall, a Late Gothic chapel, and a double spiral staircase going back to 1499. The wing constructed by Archduke Charles in 1570 has remained largely intact. A monumental Early Renaissance portal leading to the inner courtyard is the work of Domenico dell'Aglio, and shows the influence of Sebastiano Serlio which had spread all over Europe.

- The Seminary (former Jesuit College)

Unlike other colleges, this impressive complex, started in 1572, was not remodelled in the Baroque style and is therefore an important illustration of the severe Renaissance architecture adopted by the Order when it was first established in the German Province.

- The Old Jesuit University

After the dissolution of the Order in 1773, the University came under public control. In order to safeguard its collection, the library was installed in the old *magna aula* and in the theatre, on the orders of Empress Maria Theresa. Its decoration and furnishings make it a significant manifestation of the transition from the Rococo to the Classic style, and it now serves as a show case for the Styrian Archives.

- The Cathedral

Frederick III built the present cathedral in the Late Gothic style (1438-64) alongside a Romanesque church dedicated to St Aegidius. It contains admirable frescoes such as the "Scourges of God" (the Plague of Locusts, the Turkish Invasion, and the Black Death) attributed to Thomas von Villach (1480). Following the transfer of the bishopric from Seckau to Graz, the church of St Aegidius, used for 200 years as a centre for the Counter-Reformation, became the cathedral of the new diocese in 1786.

- The Mausoleum of Emperor Ferdinand II

Started in 1614 by Giovanni de Ponis, the mausoleum was only consecrated in 1714 when the interior decoration, entrusted to Johann Bernhard Fischer von Erlach, was completed. The facade, in particular, reflects the transition from the Renaissance to the Baroque style and is an original synthesis between a powerful architecture topped by light domes.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The area proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List covers 72ha and includes 450 buildings. Most of them are privately owned and are regularly maintained. Many buildings of major importance belong to the Austrian Federal Government, the Province of Styria, and to several churches and other public institutions.

The area is subject to legal and statutory protection at federal, regional, and local levels. Very strict directives are

based, in particular, on the Act on the Protection of Monuments (*Denkmalschutzgesetz*) of 1923, amended in 1978 and 1990, as well as the Act for the Conservation of the Historic Centre of Graz (*Grazer Altstadtterhaltungsgesetz*) of 1980.

#### *Management*

The above-mentioned directives are supervised by the Bundesdenkmalamt, which is also responsible for the direct management of public buildings. Any transfer of property or changes made to the buildings must be authorized by this government service, through the Landeskonservatorat of Styria, which has its seat in Graz. In compensation, subsidies are granted for restoration works.

The Act for the Conservation of the Historic Centre defines four zones of protection of various degrees. The first zone covers the perimeter proposed for inscription and is subject to the highest degree of protection, whilst the three others serve as a buffer zone. The Government of Styria took complementary steps in 1986 to protect the "roofscape" and traditional windows. Special subsidies have been granted for conservation and restoration work in the protected zones, the expenses being borne by the Fund for the Conservation of the Historic Centre.

Two specialized services are responsible for safeguarding the historic centre. The first permanently monitors the works undertaken and the changes of attribution. The other one oversees major rehabilitation projects and manages a Programme of Urban Renovation.

Among the urban protection measures, the following should be mentioned:

- overall control of traffic and parking of cars, and definition of the areas reserved for pedestrians;
- monitoring of the flow of the river Mur to prevent flooding;
- efficient handling of tourism to make it compatible with the aspirations of the inhabitants.

Complementary arrangements will be added to protect the natural heritage, such as the Schlossberg and the City Park.

The construction of modern buildings is authorized with elaborate precaution. In this respect, the Graz School of Architecture enjoys an international reputation. Such operations are usually the outcome of a competition.

Several protection associations are involved in the conservation of the city of Graz, the most important being the *Internationales Städteforum Graz*.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

For decades respect for the original urban plans and traditional architecture has been common practice; this has been institutionalized by protective laws and regulations. A comprehensive documentation has been compiled showing the care paid to maintenance and conservation works with a view to preserving both the configuration and the social functions of the historic centre, especially after the wars of this century.

In the course of the last ten years, the controlling bodies have supervised works in over half of the historic monuments and most of the public areas, on the basis of preliminary historical and architectural studies.

#### *Authenticity*

The historic centre of the city of Graz has a high degree of authenticity, given normal urban dynamics. The city has not suffered much from war damage, and changes have usually been limited and harmonized with the existing constructed environment.

The historic centre has retained its morphology and traditional structures. The boundaries of the districts and old fortifications are still very visible. The two urban focal points, the old market and the ducal residence, still have their original character. The detailed survey has been fully preserved, and the same applies to the boundaries of the glacis, transformed into a green area.

The major historic monuments have kept their architectural and decorative authenticity - for instance, the Armoury with its original weapons, or the vast Stadtkrone complex of the Palace, University, Cathedral and Mausoleum.

The authenticity of the 19th century districts is of a different nature, but just as genuine. The houses of the *Gründerzeit* offer greater flexibility for changes of attribution over time.

There is a problem of authenticity over the transformations of ground-floor windows which contrast with the historic architectural environment. Nevertheless, the urban integrity is not compromised and, moreover, corrective measures are being implemented within the framework of the rigorous management procedures described above.

### **Evaluation**

#### *ICOMOS action*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Graz in January 1999.

#### *Qualities*

The historic centre of the city of Graz is an exceptional example of town planning over the centuries, with a harmonious integration of buildings constructed in successive architectural styles. The centre therefore has a value as a historic monument while continuing to lead a contemporary and dynamic social life. Surrounded by green areas, the old city has kept its urban configuration and urban scale, as well as an atmosphere marked by the fruitful encounter between different cultural and artistic movements.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The city of Graz is part of a fairly diversified network of central European cities in the south-west. Its origins are medieval. It is distinguished by architectural expressions of an age-old emulation between the high aristocracy and a very active merchant middle class. It also clearly illustrates the episodes of resistance to invasions from the east, the historic tensions between religions, and the synthesis of cultural influences from the Danube, the Balkans, and the Adriatic.

### **Brief description**

The historic heart of the city of Graz is a central European urban centre marked by the centuries-old presence of the Habsburgs. The old city forged an unusual image through a harmonious integration of architectural styles and artistic movements which have succeeded each other since the Middle Ages, as well as the different cultural influences of the neighbouring regions.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*.

*Criterion ii* The historic centre of the city of Graz reflects artistic and architectural movements originating from the Germanic region, the Balkans, and the Mediterranean, for which it served as a crossroads for centuries. The greatest architects and artists of these different regions expressed themselves forcefully here and thus created brilliant syntheses.

*Criterion iv* The urban complex forming the historic centre of the city of Graz is an exceptional example of a harmonious integration of architectural styles from successive periods. Each age is represented by typical buildings, which are often masterpieces. The urban physiognomy faithfully tells the story of its historic development.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Flemish belfries (Belgium)

No 943

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Flemish belfries
<i>Location</i>	Flanders
<i>State Party</i>	Belgium
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

Belfries are - along with market halls - noteworthy and primordial representatives of civic and public architecture. At this level of meaning, the shift from the form of the "seigneurial keep" to that of the "communal keep" is highly significant. Church belfries, in regions such as historic Brabant, also bear witness to the relations between the civil and religious powers within the community. In the variety that exists with all its "functional" range of forms, and the relative changes that these have undergone, the belfries - and the complexes of which they usually form part - therefore represent a vital aspect of civil architecture from the 13th century onwards. **Criterion ii**

The Flemish belfries are part of a group of unique constructions reflecting the origin and the development of civic independence which marked the history of Flanders from the Middle Ages onwards. These belfries are a unique incarnation of the desire for emancipation which led to a degree of local democracy of great significance in the history of humankind. The evolution of the belfries is revealing in itself in that it is intimately linked to the ebb and flow of the history of a region that lies at the heart of Europe. **Criterion iv**

[**Note** This text is an abbreviated version of the text appearing in the nomination dossier.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The definition of the term "belfry" was somewhat vague at the outset. Referring originally to the mobile wooden towers used in siege warfare, the term is later applied by Viollet-le-Duc in the *Dictionnaire raisonné de*

*l'architecture française* to the wooden watchtowers mounted on the palisades surrounding the *portus* or pre-urban centres. It was to be applied occasionally to towers of all sorts, but particularly to those housing bells or standing next to the bell-tower.

Palisades, bells, and the right to possess bells are all closely associated with the development of urban life which took place in these regions following the Viking raids of the 9th century. A favourable geographic situation at the heart of Europe, the re-establishment of major trade routes such as Bruges/Brugge-Cologne, and the improvement of navigable waterways at regional and national level made this region the ideal site for contact, trade, and the meeting of cultures. Travelling merchants re-appeared and perhaps began to organize and establish permanent warehouses near the *castra* of the feudal lords. These pre-urban groupings, which often grew up along river valleys, are the origin of towns like Tournai and Gent, along the Escaut. Locations where roads met navigable waterways were particularly propitious for the organization of markets, first temporary but later becoming permanent fairs, encouraging merchants to settle in one spot. In addition, the cloth-weaving industry seems to have developed from the 11th century onwards, in small centres such as Lille, Ypres (Ieper), Bruges (Brugge), Ghent (Gent), etc. Trade and cloth-weaving became key factors for the development of the pre-urban centre, which began to make its presence felt as an organized body through the influence of the professional bodies (guilds, corporations) and to mark out its physical bounds by building ramparts or palisades with belfries to provide safety against marauders. From the 12th century onwards, such ramparts were often rebuilt in stone and subsequently extended.

Such centres expanded under the protection provided - for a fee - by the *castra*, whose importance and role gradually diminished to such an extent that in some cases, such as Ghent and Antwerp (Antwerpen), the abandoned castles were taken over by the local burghers. This development illustrates the insoluble conflicts between *châtelain* and burghers keen to organize as a "commune" with their own administration. Again from the 12th century onwards, successive Counts of Flanders favoured the burghers which led to the flowering, from Arras to Bruges, of thriving towns demanding written proof of their rights and privileges in the form of charters. These charters, issued from the 12th century onwards, are extremely diverse and fragmentary, and extremely practical in nature, often in the form of a step by step approach setting a legal seal on gradually acquired rights.

The commune was in fact made up of all the burghers living in the city who had given their oath of allegiance. At their head were the elected magistrates, the aldermen or *scabini* responsible for carrying out administrative functions, and the *mayeur*, who had no specific powers. The chief alderman held an important position, since he presided over the court and council meetings, kept the seals of the town and the keys to its gates, and commanded the town militia which owed the *ban* (feudal service) to the overlord. As feudal lord, the commune had other obligations to the *seigneur*, such as the payment of aid in the four following cases: departure on crusade; knighting of the eldest son; dowry of the eldest daughter; ransom of the overlord if taken prisoner. In return, the *seigneur* swore to protect the commune and respect its rights.

Many of the belfries now in existence are successors to wooden constructions, often destroyed by fire and known only through archives, which give no descriptions. The multi-purpose belfry soon came to be built of stone to prevent the risk of future fires. Its imposing volume formed either an isolated feature or a central or lateral element of the market halls, themselves often rebuilt in stone at an early date.

#### *Description*

The early belfries of the 13th and early 14th centuries are strongly reminiscent of the seigneurial keep, from which they take their massive square form, elevations showing sparing use of openings, and rising storeys built on or designed for vaulting. The main shaft is topped by a wall-walk and parapet running between bartizans: the central spire features a slate campanile roof and variations on a number of forms. The finials of the corner and central turrets are decorated with animals or symbolic characters protecting the commune.

The 13th century belfry of Ieper is a fine example of this type, although it forms part of the market hall complex later to include the town hall, construction of which continued down to the 17th century. Most of the examples concerned cover the periods of the 14th-15th centuries and the 16th-17th centuries, thereby offering an illustration of the transition in style from Norman Gothic to later Gothic, which then mingles with Renaissance and Baroque forms.

The 14th century belfry in Gent represents a transitional style on a rectangular plan, already taller and slimmer in outline.

In the 14th-15th centuries, the belfries abandoned the model of the keep in favour of finer, taller towers such as those of Dendermonde, Lier, and Aalst. The subsequent addition to the top of the shaft of a narrower, different shape to serve as the base for the campanile would give the desired monumental effect, and the roof itself would take on more bulbous, sometimes extended lines, as in the case of Veurne (17th century). As already mentioned, these crowning features underwent repairs and even frequent transformation, the chronology of which differs markedly from that of the shaft itself, which remained a constant feature.

When the market halls and belfries grew too small to function as a meeting-place for the aldermen, a new type of building was required, the *Hôtel de Ville* or town hall, clearly designed in accordance with the administrative organization and, from the 15th and 16th centuries onwards, assuming an obvious representative role achieved by incorporating the symbolic belfry, as in the examples of Brussels and Oudenaarde.

The *Hôtel de Ville* in Antwerpen (1564) is an excellent example of the transposition of Renaissance principles in the central risalith with superposed diminishing registers flanked by obelisks and scrollwork and finished with a pediment, reiterating the theme of the central belfry.

The 20th century was faced with the problem of reconstruction after two World Wars. The rebuilding of the belfry and market hall of Ieper after the First World War provoked international controversy, finally resolved by an identical reconstruction based on the surveys which had preceded the restoration under way when war broke out.

The same type of "archaeological" reconstruction was applied in Nieuwpoort. The period between the wars also saw the construction of new town halls featuring belfries, demonstrating variations on the theme of regionalism at Dijksmuide and Eeklo, or blended with modernist tendencies at Roeselare. All three possess an obvious symbolic value, with a slightly different emphasis according to location: the belfry at Roeselare was destined to celebrate the town's rebirth after the destruction of 1914-18, and a return to the tradition of the belfry abandoned in the 18th century. In Eeklo, which had hitherto possessed only a church belfry, the much-needed expansion of the *Hôtel de Ville* served as the starting point for the construction of a belfry destined also as a monument to the fallen. Post- World War II reconstruction led in Oostende to the re-siting of the badly damaged *Hôtel de Ville*, complete with belfry, in the outskirts of the town. On the former town-centre site was built a *Palais des Fêtes*, reiterating on one corner the theme of the belfry in a sober and highly stylized profile strongly reminiscent of the traditional image.

Existing belfries are very varied in type, but fall into one of two basic categories:

1. civic (market hall) belfries;
2. church belfries.

The belfries in the following twenty-four towns are proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List :

Aalst (Alost)  
Antwerpen (Anvers)  
Brugge (Bruges)  
Dendermonde (Termonde)  
Dijksmuide (Dixmude)  
Eeklo  
Gent (Gand)  
Herentals  
Ieper (Ypres)  
Kortrijk (Courtrai)  
Lier (Lierre)  
Leuven (Louvain)  
Lo-Reninge  
Mechelen (Malines)  
Menen (Menin)  
Nieuwpoort (Nieuport)  
Oudenaarde (Audenaarde)  
Roeselare (Rosiers)  
Sint-Truiden (Saint-Trond)  
Tielt  
Tienen (Tirlemont)  
Tongeren (Tongres)  
Veurne (Furnes)  
Zoutleeuw (Léau)

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

Market hall and church belfries form part of a complex or edifice which is listed as a historic monument in its entirety and, indeed, often forms part of a listed urban site, thereby reinforcing the role of the protection agency, the Monuments and Sites Division (*Division des Monuments et Sites*).

The legal protection orders all date from the initial period of application of the first preservation act (*Conservation des Monuments et Sites*) of 1931, which proves that the belfries met the required criteria in terms of their artistic, historic, and architectural value.

The protection orders apply to the entire edifices and complexes, except in the case of Menen where an additional order was made approximately a year later, covering the *Hôtel de Ville* adjoining the belfry. The protection orders apply equally to damaged market halls and belfries, some barely reconstructed as in Nieuwpoort or in the course of reconstruction as in Ieper, confirming the value placed on such operations.

Protection orders for the surrounding urban site, made possible by the decree of 3 March 1976, are still the exception and cover variable areas ranging from the market-square, as in the case of Mechelen (1985) or Dendermonde (1996), to the historic centre of Lo or to Veurne(1995). The site surrounding the belfry complex in Gent contains a concentration of monuments, each individually protected by successive orders.

Without mentioning each specifically, "movable" fittings which are in fact immovable are also included in the protection orders: in the case of the belfries, this means key distinguishing features such as the clock, bells and carillons, etc.

Protection orders are under consideration for Dijksmuide and Roeselare, part of the "modern heritage." These orders have been deferred until now because the overall inventory of architectural heritage, which forms the basis for all comparison and appraisal, had not yet begun in the region.

It is to be noted that the two public buildings, neither of which is under threat, lie within the perimeter of the area of habitat designated as of cultural, historic, and/aesthetic value (CHE zone), which already ensures them a measure of protection. They also stand in close proximity to one or more listed monuments.

For Roeselare, the inventory begun in November 1997 has already identified the importance and the impact of the "new *Hôtel de Ville* and belfry" on its immediate environment, the Grand'Place. The protection order is now based on reports and research by the team which intends to recommend protection of the urban site and of the town hall as a specific monument forming part of the Grand'Place ensemble.

In the case of Dijksmuide, a request for listing made by the town council has not been followed up, in part because the problem did not appear to be urgent since neither the belfry nor the town hall is under any threat. In the context of its nomination as part of the "Flemish belfries phenomenon," this matter is clearly being given priority.

#### *Management*

At the level of the Flemish community, the Monuments and Sites Division and *ad hoc* units are involved in the overall management of the sites, since the belfries and the complexes of which they form part are listed monuments. They are involved in matters of maintenance, in the drawing up of conservation/restoration plans, in the execution of work, and in examining the required annual reports.

The Monuments and Sites Division handles financing for maintenance and restoration work and is responsible for timely proposal of the sums which must be included in the annual budget of the ministry responsible.

At the local level, the town council, represented by its college of burgomaster and aldermen, is responsible for the management of the belfries. The town council then allocates responsibility for day-to-day management of the belfry to the appropriate departments(s), depending on the use currently made of the belfry.

The departments most often concerned are the Culture Departments for the "functional" oversight and Technical Departments for the "physical" oversight of the building and its "day-to-day" maintenance. Naturally, in those towns which have their own monuments department, such as Antwerpen, Gent, and Mechelen, these departments are involved in management and work closely with *ad hoc* units of the Monuments and Sites Division on the preparation and follow-up of the various dossiers.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

The Flemish belfries are both civic buildings and symbols. As such, they have been the object of constant maintenance. Their construction often took place in several stages, but they have always been maintained in good overall order. Some, damaged by war, have been rebuilt, generally in identical form. All are listed as historic monuments, either in isolation or as part of an edifice, a square, or an urban site.

#### *Authenticity*

In view of the number of buildings under consideration (24), it is not proposed to analyse the degree of material authenticity of each in this document. It might be argued that the authenticity of these monuments is not to be measured in these material terms, but rather by considering their symbolic value and the permanence of their existence. The oldest have been in existence since the 13th century, and construction has continued right down to modern times.

Most of these belfries were built in several stages which, in certain cases, reflect the economic fortunes of the town throughout its history. War, and World War I in particular, destroyed many which have since been rebuilt, generally in identical form, demonstrating their importance as a symbol of the permanence of the commune. The authenticity of the market hall and belfry of Ieper can no more be contested than the authenticity of the city centre of Warsaw, entirely rebuilt after the last war.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Flanders in March 1999.

#### *Qualities*

There is no doubt of the distinctive nature of the Flemish belfries. Their location in the ancient County of Flanders is

unique to this region. The borders of the ancient county spill over into parts of what are now the Netherlands, France, and the Walloon Province of Belgium. Belfries are to be found in each of these different regions, testifying that these are indeed a tradition specific to Flanders.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The belfries constitute an ensemble which has no equivalent. The most that can be done is to mention some of the elements they have inspired. In the past, contacts with the Hanseatic League were not merely commercial: the towns of Flanders inspired the building of belfries in Poland. The construction of the Tour Perret in Amiens just after World War II, or the tower of the *Hôtel de Ville* in Le Havre designed by the same architect, are directly inspired by the Flemish belfries, even though their role is not that of a bell-tower.

#### *Comments by ICOMOS*

Whilst ICOMOS has no reservations about the value of the Flemish belfries, it is conscious that they represent a phenomenon that was characteristic of the ancient County of Flanders and not merely the modern Belgian Provinces of Oost- and West-Vlaanderen. As pointed out above, fine examples are to be found in neighbouring regions and countries, such as the Walloon Province of Belgium, France, and The Netherlands. It feels therefore that it would be more in keeping with the spirit of the World Heritage Convention for this to become a trans-frontier serial nomination, including outstanding belfries on the territories of other States Parties as well as Belgium.

#### **Brief description**

This nomination consists of a series of twenty-four belfries of medieval origin, generally attached to the town hall and occasionally to a church. They are invariably found in urban settings.

#### **Recommendation**

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*, to enable the State Party to explore with neighbouring States Parties the possibility of extending this serial nomination to include important examples of Flemish belfries on all the territories of the ancient County of Flanders.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Sarajevo (Bosnia/Herzegovina)

No 851rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Sarajevo – unique symbol of universal multiculturalism and continual open city
<i>Location</i>	Canton of Sarajevo
<i>State Party</i>	Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina
<i>Date</i>	15 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

The beauty of a city can be assessed not only on the basis of its many architectural monuments but also from its living harmony and its great variety. Sarajevo is such a city – a unique, inimitable, and united open city – the world city.

The cosmopolitan inhabitants of the Sarajevo valley have learned through millennia of experience of the importance of mutual tolerance by using five different scripts and seven languages. They provided the meeting place and created the possibility for relationships between people and architecture, people and art, to be harmonized and unified. The valley and the river created a linear framework for the continuous interaction of man and space in a region where the cultures of Europe, Asia, and the Mediterranean come together. As a result a special multi-cultural civilization developed there.

The superimposed architectural styles of the city, coupled with the determination of the inhabitants to meet their cultural aspirations, created a special unity of cultures and a mutually supportive way of life.

The “pulse” of the valley was formed in Sarajevo, which became an open forum for four religions and seven civilizations. Here centripetal forces brought together the philosophy of the ancient world and the concept of democracy to create a tolerant and wise society, encouraged by the *genius loci*. The spatial evolution of the city reflected this social and cultural background. It is apparent in its layout and the juxtaposition of buildings, open spaces, and the river.

No city exists in which this richly multi-ethnic society with a variety of religions and cultural identities interacts with the geographical setting in so powerful a way. It shares many characteristics with Jerusalem, Rome, and Istanbul, and many other cities of central Europe and the Mediterranean, to which it supplies a purity and simplicity all of its own.

Sarajevo is the guardian and the symbol of the multi-cultural way of life of Bosnia and Herzegovina. The presence in the city of national museums, galleries, universities, and academies ensures the continued survival of this national culture.

As an open city, Sarajevo is also a symbol of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which over the centuries has succeeded in holding together seemingly incompatible elements. It has been closed in protecting its rich heritage whilst at the same time being open to anything that might enrich that heritage, and as a result has preserved its identity intact for many centuries, from prehistory through various forms of external control up to the independent country of the present day.

### Notes

- 1 The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.
- 2 The above text is a slightly abridged and modified version of the text in the nomination dossier.

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

The suitability of the Golden Valley for human occupation can be seen from the fact that there have been settlements there since at least the Neolithic period. Proto-urban hillforts (*oppida*) survived from the Bronze Age through to the 6th century AD, whilst classical towns, with their characteristic checkerboard layout, grew up when the region was settled by the Greeks in the 8th century BC and then came under Roman control in the 2nd and 1st centuries BC.

The region preserved its cultural identity after the collapse of the Roman Empire, and survived the migrations of barbarian tribes such as the Avars and Slavs and the commercial penetration of the Venetian Republic. In this way the multi-cultural nature of modern Bosnia and Herzegovina, which has endured to the present day, became firmly established in the Middle Ages.

The Kingdom of Bosnia was conquered by the Ottoman Turks in the mid 15th century and the administrative centre known as *Sarai Ovasi* was designated to fulfil the same function for the new Vilayet of Hodidjed. This began to develop into a town in the 1640s, bringing about a successful fusion of the oriental and Mediterranean cultures and ways of life, with mosques and churches and those who worshipped in them existing peacefully side by side.

This untroubled symbiotic existence continued, with separate quarters for Orthodox and Roman Catholic Christians, Muslims, and Jews, in the centuries that followed, disturbed only briefly in the 17th century by the soldiers of Prince Eugène of Savoy. In 1878, however, a large part of the town was destroyed by fire by the occupying Austro-Hungarian army.

This provided the opportunity for the erection of many new buildings, using a Bosnian style that synthesized elements of central European architecture with those of Islamic architecture. Later, architecture of the Viennese Secession style was introduced into Sarajevo.

Sarajevo languished economically and culturally in the post-World War I period. After 1945 a mass culture replaced the Bosnian culture which had evolved over centuries, but this has revived following the gaining of independence by Bosnia and Herzegovina following the hostilities of 1992-95.

#### *Description*

The city of Sarajevo is located in the eastern part of the Sarajevo Valley (formerly known as the Golden Valley). The town is mainly on the north side of the river, and it is dominated by high hills to north and south.

The street plan is rectilinear, with a network of small streets opening into small squares or, in some cases, more spacious ones used for Muslims taking part in Friday prayers. In this respect it is reminiscent of classic Islamic towns such as Cairo or Damascus. The original town spreads gracefully along the river, and did not lose its urban fabric when "European" additions were made during the Austro-Hungarian period. The street plan of the small Roman town in the valley can be seen in the western part of the old city.

Sarajevo contains over two hundred protected historic buildings. In what follows an impression is given of their range and quality.

#### *- Religious buildings*

Among the Islamic places of worship, mention should be made of the monumental and splendidly ornamented Mosque of Gazi Husref-Beg (1530-31); the Mosque of Suleyman the Magnificent (1566), erected on the site of the first mosque to be built in the city and with fine mural decorations; the 16th century Mosque of • ekre• i Muslihudin, a fine example of the Early Ottoman style; and the barrel-vaulted Magribija Mosque (1538-65). In addition to its mosques, Sarajevo has many other buildings associated with Islam, such as the halls of dervishes (*tekkié, khanqa*), religious schools (*mekteb*), and mausolea (*tourbets*).

The late 16th century Synagogue (restored at the beginning of the 19th century) has three aisles and a two-storey gallery; it is now the Jewish Museum. The Ashkenaze Temple was built in 1902 in pseudo-Moorish style.

The Churches of St Cyril and St Methodius (1896) and of St Anthony of Padua (1914), both designed by Josip Vancaš, are in Neo-Renaissance and Neo-Gothic style respectively. He also designed the Neo-Romanesque Cathedral of the Sacred Heart (1899). Of especial note are the Old Serbian Orthodox Church and School, known from as early as the early 16th century; the church has an important 17th century iconostasis. The Evangelical Church, which combines Byzantine and Gothic elements, is the work of Karl Par• ik (1899-1909).

#### *- Public buildings*

The high rectangular Clock Tower dates from at least as early as the 17th century. It has, however, undergone a number of restorations and remodellings, the most recent in 1875. There are many early public water fountains (*sebilj*) and a number of small structures with public functions, such as the checking of weights and measures.

Sarajevo has a number of interesting inns and guesthouses. Gazi Husrev-Beg's *Musafirhana* (guesthouse) was built in 1531 to provide free accommodation for three nights to travellers. The oldest caravanserai is the 16th century

Kolobara inn, only the walls of which survive. However, a number of others, such as the Mori• s Inn (16h-17th century), are still in use for tourist-related activities.

Public baths (*hammams*) are a feature of Ottoman towns, and that of Gazi Husref-Beg (1537-65) was in use in Sarajevo until 1916; it is now a restaurant. The *hammam* of Gazi Isa-Beg was completely rebuilt in pseudo-Moorish style in 1890 by Vancaš.

#### *- Educational and cultural buildings*

The Kuršumljia Madrasah (1537-38) is a relatively plain but well proportioned structure with a fine decorated portal. The Boys' Primary School (1890), the High School (1893), and the Boys' Primary School and Teachers' College (1905) are the work of Carl Panek and Karl Par• ik, in Neo-Renaissance style. They became the models for school buildings over most of Bosnia and Herzegovina.

The Theatre (1898), also by Par• ik, combines sober Renaissance elements in its main structure with a Palladian façade.

#### *- Domestic architecture*

Many fine residential buildings are preserved in Sarajevo from the Ottoman and Austro-Hungarian periods. Outstanding among the former are Svrzo's House (17th and 18th centuries) in the developed Ottoman-Islamic style built round two internal courtyards with separate suites of rooms for men and women (it is now part of the National Museum, but part of it is still occupied by a descendant of the original owner); the three-storey • ati• a House from the 18th century, built for the use of the commander of the garrison; and the House of • erzelez, the oldest in Sarajevo (early 17th century) and a fine example of this type of modest structure.

With the Austro-Hungarian annexation in 1878 a number of luxurious urban villas and buildings serving twin residential and commercial functions were built in the new quarters of the city. They were greatly influenced by the prevailing Historicism in central Europe and later by the Viennese Secession style.

#### *- Bridges*

There was a single bridge across the river here for many centuries. The stone Latin's Bridge was constructed in the mid 16th century, but was swept away by flood waters in 1791. In the late 19th century it was faithfully reconstructed in stone. The older Czar's Bridge suffered the same fate, but the location of its replacement (1896) was slightly altered from the original; this was one of the earliest concrete bridges in the Austro-Hungarian Empire.

#### *- Commercial buildings*

The *bezistan* is a characteristic Oriental commercial complex, consisting of small shops disposed round an open courtyard. Gazi Husref-Beg's Bezistan (1537-55) and the Bruza Bezistan (1551) still survive and are in use for retail purposes. They are located in the old bazaar area (Baš• aršija). In addition, a number of early small shops and warehouses constructed in wood are also still extant. The Covered Market was built in the Austro-Hungarian period (1895) and, like other contemporary buildings, it combines architectural styles, in this case Renaissance and Classical; it is one of the most prominent landmarks of the city.

This period also saw the erection of a number of banks. Noteworthy are the Austro-Hungarian Bank (1912) and Slavia Bank buildings (1913), which admirably illustrate progressive steps in the movement away from Historicism to Expressionism.

#### - *Fortifications*

The existing fortifications owe their present form to the work carried out in the first half of the 18th century under the supervision of Hesim Oglu Alia Paša. The walls extend for 2280m and enclose an area of 4.5ha. Faced with dressed stone covering a rubble core, they are equipped with artillery platforms (*tabija*) and three gates.

The Širokac, Višegrad, and Ploča gates have cubic lower structures with circular upper sections. The Filipovič Barracks were constructed in the Austro-Hungarian period and show strong Secession-style influences.

#### - *Cemeteries*

Sarajevo has several beautiful old cemeteries – the Cemetery and *Turbe* of Hadži Sinan, the Alifakovac Cemetery, and the Nad Kovačević Cemetery, all of which contain tombstones that date back to the 15th century. The (Sephardic) Jewish Cemetery is of comparable antiquity.

### **Management and Protection**

#### *Legal status*

The designated historic buildings are protected under the 1985 Law on the Protection and Use of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina. The Parliament for the City and Canton of Sarajevo began the procedure for the statutory definition and protection of the historic city centre in 1996.

#### *Management*

Ownership of properties within the nominated area is varied – government bodies, religious communities, and private individuals and institutions.

At national level, overall supervision is exercised by the Centre for the Cultural-Historical and Natural Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina, based in Sarajevo. This body collaborates with the Institute for the Protection of the Cultural-Historical and Natural Heritage of the City of Sarajevo, the Parliament of the City and Canton, the City Urban Institute, and the City Development Institute.

The revised General Urban Plan for Sarajevo City and Sarajevo Region-Canton and the Regional Land-Use (Spatial) Plan have special provisions for the protection and management of the historic centre. They prescribe measures to regulate new building and reconstruction, urban infrastructural works, development of tourism, and other activities of potential adverse impact on the historic environment.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

In 1872 the Grand Vizier issued a decree “prohibiting the export of antiquities and the destruction of old buildings.” In 1892 the Austro-Hungarian authorities issued an order for

the preservation of antiquities and cultural-historical properties which paid special attention to part of the historic centre of Sarajevo.

After World War II laws were passed for the conservation, investigation, and presentation of monuments. The Old Bazaar (Bašaršija) area has been the subject of special planning controls since 1975.

Sarajevo has been a centre for the conservation and restoration of mural art and icons for many years. Experts trained there have transmitted their skills to many other European cities.

#### *Authenticity*

Certain reservations arise when applying the test of authenticity, as defined in paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, to Sarajevo. It can be accepted in terms of design and setting, since the urban fabric that evolved during the Ottoman and Austro-Hungarian periods is still clearly visible.

There has, however, been considerable restoration and reconstruction as the bombardment during the recent war, some of which has been of dubious authenticity in respect of both materials and workmanship. Nevertheless, the proportion of reconstructed buildings is relatively low when compared with Mostar, and control is now being exercised firmly over future interventions.

On balance, therefore, it may be asserted that the historic centre of Sarajevo, as defined in the nomination dossier, passes the test of authenticity as required by the *Operational Guidelines*.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Sarajevo in February 1999.

#### *Qualities*

Sarajevo is an historic town which represents the encounter between the Ottoman Turkish cultures of the east and the European tradition brought in by the Austro-Hungarian Empire in a short-lived but very influential annexation.

#### *Comparative analysis*

Sarajevo must inevitably be compared with Mostar (also nominated in 1999), since both are 15th century Ottoman towns which reached an economic peak in the 16th century and have retained significant traces of their Islamic past, as well as of the cultural impact of the Austro-Hungarian occupation. Both also suffered from heavy bombardment between 1992 and 1995.

There are two main differences between the two towns: the spectacular location of Mostar and its sympathetic relationship with its natural setting when compared with that of Sarajevo, and the larger size and influence of the latter from the Ottoman period to the present day, which has resulted in a more impressive townscape and buildings, both public and domestic.

*ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action*

The *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* make it a condition for inscription on the World Heritage List that every property should have an appropriate management plan in force. Sarajevo has no such plan, and one should be prepared and put into operation without delay. This plan should contain a detailed description of the proposed projects, the timetable for its implementation, and the resources (including funding) available and approved.

The similarities between Sarajevo and Mostar are very great, and ICOMOS does not feel that it would be appropriate for both to be inscribed on the World Heritage List. In its professional judgement the relationship of Mostar with its spectacular natural setting and the symbolic value of its historic bridge give it a superior claim to inscription.

### **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Mostar (Bosnia/Herzegovina)

No 946

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Old Mostar – a bridge of the worlds
<i>Location</i>	Herzegovina-Neretva Canton
<i>State Party</i>	Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina
<i>Date</i>	15 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

Mostar is the result of interaction between natural phenomena and human creativity over a long historical period. The universal qualities of the cultural landscapes of south-eastern Europe represent a universal phenomenon that is the common property of all humankind. The cultural and historical value of Old Mostar resides in the urban agglomeration that was created in the 16th century during the height of the Ottoman Empire around the Old Bridge, the technological wonder of its age, in which complete harmony was achieved between the built structures and the natural environment of the Neretva River.

The Old Town has been embellished for centuries with the visual artistic expressions of succeeding generations, particularly towards the end of the 19th century and the beginning of the 20th century under the influence of the Austro-Hungarian Empire and central European architecture.

The sustainable development of the area has been endangered by human destruction and devastation by war. This ensemble has attracted the continuous interest of both the local and the international public from the outset, as witnessed by many historical documents, up to the present day, when that interest has been renewed. Enduring interest has been shown in exploring the origins of the different styles and the way in which they have been expressed, in spatial harmony, and their preservation.

Protection, maintenance, regulation, and revitalization of the historic centre is a long-term process. Earlier minimal studies have only been known through preliminary reports, scattered references in the literature, or lectures at meetings. For all these reasons and because principles relating to the importance of preserving the material remains of the past, including the architectural heritage, and in particular because of the false impression that this part of the town has become outdated and is in the process of disappearing from the historical landscape, UNESCO and the international community must accept the justification for this nomination, the more so since the preserved remains of the earliest town are themselves urban in character. They became incorporated over time into the urban fabric of the entire town of Mostar as an integral part of European culture. The historic core,

with the surrounding areas, has become a symbol of civilized living. This almost automatically justifies the existence of the town as one of the earliest sources for the identity and history of Bosnia and Herzegovina as a whole.

Destruction of the town deprived cosmopolitan travellers of opportunities for resting both their bodies and their souls and for understanding their own past. The living townscape of Mostar constitutes, a vast class-room for the young and the enquiring in appreciating their own destiny.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

There has been human settlement on the Neretva between the Hum Hill and the Vele mountain since prehistory, as witnessed by discoveries of fortified enceintes and cemeteries. Evidence of Roman occupation comes from beneath the present town.

Little is known of Mostar in the medieval period, though the Christian basilicas of late antiquity continued in use. The name of Mostar is first mentioned in a document of 1474, taking its name from the bridge-keepers (*mostari*): this refers to the existence of a wooden bridge from the market town on the left bank of the river which was used by soldiers, traders, and other travellers. At this time it was the seat of a *kadiluk* (district with a regional judge). Because it was on the trade route between the Adriatic and the mineral-rich regions of central Bosnia, the settlement spread to the right bank of the river. It became the leading town in the Sanjak of Herzegovina and, with the arrival of the Ottoman Turks from the east, the centre of Turkish rule.

The town was fortified between 1520 and 1566 and the bridge was rebuilt in stone. The second half of the 16th century and the early decades of the 17th century were the most important period in the development of Mostar. Religious and public buildings were constructed, such as mosques, a *madrasah* (Islamic school), and a *hammam* (public bath); these were concentrated on the left bank of the river, in a religious complex (*kullia*). At the same time many private and commercial buildings, organized in distinct quarters, known as *mahalas* (residential) and the bazaar, were erected.

Bosnia-Herzegovina was first occupied (1878) and then annexed (1908) by the Austro-Hungarian Empire, and it was in this period that a number of administrative, military, cultural, and Christian religious buildings were established. These were mainly on the right bank of the river, where a new quarter was developed according to a strict "Rondo" plan. This provides a strong contrast with the left bank, where there was a more organic growth on the steeper slopes, with winding narrow streets and public open spaces for

trading (*pazar*), recreation (*mejdán*), and prayer (*musallah*). The town was also connected at this time by rail and new roads to Sarajevo and the Adriatic.

#### *Description*

The area nominated for inscription spans the Neretva River, with the bridge at its centre.

Of special significance is the Radobolja stream, which enters the Neretva on its right bank. This provided a source of water for the growing settlement, and from it spring a number of small canals used for irrigation and for driving the wheels of water-mills.

The centre of the settlement was the bazaar, which extended on both banks of the river, the two parts being articulated by the bridge. From them began the network of streets forming the *mahalas*. This system was altered to a considerable extent during the Austro-Hungarian period, when the new quarters were laid out on European planning principles and other bridges were built across the river.

The nominated area contains many important historic buildings. Of the thirteen original *mosques* dating from the 16th and 17th centuries, seven have been destroyed during the present century for ideological reasons or by bombardment. One of the two 19th century Orthodox *churches* has also disappeared, and the early 20th century *synagogue*, after undergoing severe damage in World War II, has been converted for use as a theatre.

Several Ottoman-period *inns* survive also survive, along with other buildings from this period of Mostar's history such as *fountains* and *schools*.

The *administrative buildings* are all from the Austro-Hungarian period and exhibit Neo-Classical and Secessionist features.

There is a number of *houses* surviving from the late Ottoman period (18th and early 19th centuries) which demonstrate the component features of this form of domestic architecture – hall, upper storey for residential use, paved courtyard, verandah on one or two storeys. The later 19th century residential houses are all in Neo-Classical style.

Some early *trading and craft buildings* are also still extant, notably some low shops in wood or stone, stone storehouses, and a group of former tanneries round an open courtyard. Once again, the 19th century commercial buildings are predominantly Neo-Classical in style.

A number of elements of the early *fortifications* are visible. The Herceguša Tower dates from the medieval period, whilst the Ottoman defences are represented by the Halebinovka and Tara Towers, the watch-towers over the ends of the Old Bridge, and a stretch of the ramparts.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

Historic Mostar is protected by the 1985 Law on the Protection and Use of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina, the 1996 Interim Statutes of the Town of Mostar, and the 1998 Law on Waters. In 1998 the Mostar Municipal Council promulgated a series of decisions relating to the rehabilitation and

conservation of buildings in the protected zone of the town and the prohibition of any non-authorized interventions.

##### *Management*

Ownership of properties within the nominated area is varied – government bodies, religious communities, and private individuals and institutions.

At national level, overall supervision is exercised by the Centre for the Heritage of Bosnia and Herzegovina, based in Sarajevo. Direct responsibility at regional level is the responsibility of the Institute for the Protection of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage, located in Mostar. This body collaborates with the Mostar-based Institute for Urbanism and Spatial Planning and the Municipality of Stari Grad, and also works closely with the Old Mostar Foundation and the Research Centre for Islamic History, Art, and Culture in Istanbul (Turkey).

All applications for authorization of projects coming within the provisions of the municipal decisions must be submitted to the Municipality of Stari Grad. These are then evaluated by the Institute for the Protection of the Cultural, Historical, and Natural Heritage, which submits recommendations to the Municipality, which in turn is responsible for final decision-making.

A UNESCO Rehabilitation Plan was prepared in 1997 and the Aga Khan Foundation has also produced a master plan, as well as undertaking detailed studies for the rehabilitation of some important monuments and districts on either side of the river. However, there is no comprehensive management plan at present in force for the historic centre of Mostar.

#### **Conservation and Authenticity**

##### *Conservation history*

The first steps in the conservation history of Mostar date from 1878, when the Ottoman Grand Vizier issued a decree “prohibiting the export of antiquities and the destruction of old buildings.”

The Old Town suffered grievous damage during World War II. Legal instruments enacted between 1945 and 1965 provided the basis for the conservation of historic buildings and their scientific study, and several relevant institutions were established in Mostar. A number of major restoration projects were undertaken during this period, including the reconstruction of Koski Mehmed Pasha's *Madrasah* and the Old Bridge.

The hostilities that broke out in the early 1990s saw systematic destruction of much of the Old Town by bombardment and fire in 1992-95, with resulting structural destabilization and deterioration from natural forces as a result of neglect. Among the structures that were wholly or partially destroyed were the Old Bridge, with its towers, the old warehouses and shops close to the bridge, all the domed mosques, many other Islamic buildings, and a number of the Austro-Hungarian administrative buildings.

Some of the repair work carried out after this destruction, particularly by certain religious institutions and foreign humanitarian foundations, is frankly described by the State

Party in the nomination dossier as being in contravention of recognized conservation principles. In addition, many new buildings were erected that were not compatible with the requirements of an historic town centre.

#### *Authenticity*

On the basis of the test of authenticity, as defined in paragraph 24.b.i of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, there must be considerable reservations about the authenticity of Mostar. In terms of authenticity of design and setting, the Old Town may be deemed to be acceptable, since the site of the medieval settlement is still occupied and the urban fabric that developed through the Ottoman and Austro-Hungarian can still be discerned relatively clearly.

However, as the preceding section shows, there has been a very substantial degree of reconstruction in Mostar, principally as a result of war, and the State Party itself comments adversely on the authenticity of both materials and workmanship in much of this work. The proportion of reconstructed buildings is also very high; this comment applies to many of the most important Islamic buildings and to the celebrated Old Bridge.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Mostar in February 1999.

##### *Qualities*

Mostar is an historic town of great importance, which represents the encounter between the cultures of the east, in the form of its Ottoman Turkish heritage, and of Europe, as witnessed by the monuments of the Austro-Hungarian period. Its natural setting is a dramatic one, in a river gorge, and the human settlement has adapted itself harmoniously to its natural environment.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The obvious comparison to be made is with Sarajevo (also nominated in 1999). Both are basically 15th century Ottoman frontier towns on major communication and trade routes which reached an economic peak in the 16th century and have retained significant traces of their Islamic past, despite the process of "Europeanization" that resulted from the short but influential Austro-Hungarian occupation. Finally, both suffered enormous damage between 1992 and 1995 during a period of savage hostilities.

However, there is a significant difference between the two resulting from the spectacular site of Mostar and the symbiotic relationship between the human settlement and its natural setting.

##### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The lack of a management plan for Mostar is disturbing, especially in the light of some of the comments made by the State Party in the nomination dossier about the quality and nature of some of the restoration and reconstruction projects that have been carried out since 1995. ICOMOS is unable to

make any recommendations concerning this nomination until a management plan has been prepared and it has had the opportunity to study the plan and evaluate its implementation. This plan should contain a detailed description of the proposed projects, the timetable for its implementation, and the resources (including funding) available and approved. ICOMOS understands that such a plan is being prepared, but no details were provided in the nomination dossier.

The ICOMOS expert experienced some embarrassment during the mission. When he met the Mayor of Mostar he was told that the nomination had been prepared without consulting the Croat administration. Whilst it is convinced that the bicultural nature of Mostar is fully and fairly presented in the nomination desirable, ICOMOS feels that it might be desirable for the State Party to initiate discussions that will lead to the nomination having the full support of both communities.

#### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting further information about the management plan for the Old Town. In the event of this information being supplied and found to conform with the requirements of the Committee, ICOMOS recommends that the Old Town of Mostar be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iv and vi*:

**Criterion iv** The Old Town of Mostar is an outstanding example of a multicultural European urban settlement.

**Criterion vi** Mostar is an exceptional symbol of the human potential for successfully integrating groups with differing ethnic, cultural, and religious backgrounds into a homogeneous civilized community.

It is suggested that the title of the nominated property be amended to "The Old City of Mostar," in keeping with the titles of the other properties inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Diamantina (Brazil)

No 890

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Historic centre of the town of Diamantina
<i>Location</i>	State of Minas Gerais
<i>State Party</i>	Brazil
<i>Date</i>	18 September 1998

### Justification by State Party

Diamantina is one of the six Brazilian towns which were listed as historic monuments in 1938. In addition, Diamantina is the capital of one of the three main diamond-producing regions, the others being India until the 18th century and South Africa since the 19th century.

Since the production of diamonds coincided with the 18th century and early 19th century, the town has conserved an architectural and urban ensemble that is all the more remarkable in that the decline of mining activities saved it from the urban renovations of the 19th century. When "modernity" arrived in Diamantina, it was due to the political success of a son of the region, Juscelino Kubitschek, Governor of Minas Gerais (1950-55) and President of the Republic (1956-60). He had the wisdom to call upon the talents of Oscar Niemeyer, who designed four outstanding buildings.

Diamantina blends so perfectly with its site that it is one with the Serra dos Cristais. The historic centre nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List forms, with the Serra dos Cristais, a veritable cultural landscape which is complemented in the immediate vicinity by the Gruta do Salitre (the Saltpetre Grotto), an attractive geological curiosity, and Biri Biri, a tiny workers' housing estate (1873-90), a utopia set in a landscape of severe beauty.

Diamantina illustrates how the explorers of Brazil, adventurers in search of diamonds, and representatives of the Crown were able to adapt European models to an American context in the 18th century, thus creating a culture that was faithful to its roots yet completely original.

#### Criterion ii

The urban and architectural group of Diamantina, which blends so perfectly with the wild landscape, is a fine example of an adventurous spirit combined with a quest for refinement, a significant characteristic of the history of mankind.

#### Criterion iv

Diamantina is one of the last examples of the way in which Brazil tamed its territory and elaborated its culture. It is particularly exceptional in that it is linked to a mode of mining as rare as its object, that of diamonds. **Criterion v**

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the historic centre of Diamantina is a *group of buildings*. Taking into account the environment in which it is set, it can also be considered as a *living cultural landscape*.

### History and Description

#### History

The town of Diamantina is like an oasis lying in the heart of the arid and rocky mountains of East-Central Brazil. It is in the State of Minas Gerais, 350km from Belo Horizonte and 710km from Brasilia, on the slope of a hill, spread over a difference of height of 150m. It developed in the 18th century in the southern Espinhaço Chain, at an altitude of 1200m, surrounded by the Serra dos Cristais in the valley of the Jequitinhonha river. The land of the Diamantina region is composed almost exclusively of quartzite rocks and schist, which give this region its mountainous and colourful aspect, but it also has a poor, permeable soil with a rupestrine vegetation. Its geological formations have shaped both the beauty of its landscape and its economic development.

One of the expeditions undertaken from São Paulo in 1713 to explore the interior of the Brazilian territory led to the establishment of one of the settlements of the *Arraial do Tijuco*, which was later to become Diamantina. Large quantities of diamonds were found on the mountain slopes and along the rivers of the region. As the best deposits were concentrated in the valley of the Tijuco stream, a small tributary of the Rio Grande, its banks were chosen as the site for a small hamlet called Burgalhau. However, unlike what happened in other Portuguese-speaking towns on the continent, such as Ouro Preto, the growth and consolidation of the *Arraial* led to the discovery in 1720 of an unsuspected source of wealth, diamonds. In this respect, the history of Diamantina is different from that of other mining towns in Brazil.

When the Portuguese Crown discovered the existence of this source of wealth in 1731, it set up a new body to administer the region, the *Demarcação Diamantina*, which encompassed the former *Arraial do Tijuco* and other mining hamlets in the neighbourhood. In 1734, it created the Diamond Intendancy which moved to Tijuco, already the biggest settlement in the region. The Intendancy was responsible for controlling the extraction and sale of diamonds. Initially, there was the so-called "period of the contracts," established in 1739, when mining rights were granted to private monopolies. In 1771, the Crown took back the ownership of this resource and entrusted the management of its mining to the *Real Extração do Diamante* which continued to operate until 1845. The royal monopoly was then handled by the *Regimento Diamantino* which, it was claimed, was manned by more administrators than soldiers.

As it was governed by the State, Tijuco did not become a *vila*, that is to say, an entity bigger than a hamlet but smaller than a town, until 1832, ten years after the creation of Brazil. It then had the right to have its own local government. It was only in 1838, in recognition of its importance at regional level, that Tijuco was elevated to the rank of town. In 1845, the *Real Extração* was

dissolved, and the mining leases signed under the supervision of the *Inspetoria dos Terrenos Diamantinos* were cancelled in 1906 with the dissolution of the *Inspetoria* itself. In the meantime, the first mechanical mining companies, diamond-cutting workshops, and silversmiths and goldsmiths were set up in the region. Unfortunately, the discovery of richer and better-quality deposits in South Africa caused the dramatic collapse of mining activities in Diamantina.

At the end of the 19th century, the utopian project of a textile industry in Diamantina led to the creation of Biri Biri, an idyllic industrial establishment built in close harmony with the very scenic landscape, about 12km from the town. Created out of nothing to make this dream come true, like the spontaneous villages set up by diamond hunters near the mining sites, the Biri Biri complex played an important role in the local economy, at least for a while. The industry did not survive but the village site has lost nothing of its atmosphere or charm. In 1914, the railway ran up to Diamantina, thus confirming its role as an economic centre and crossroads of the region. The railway closed down in 1973.

As the town suffered from so few disruptions since the decline of mining in the 19th century, its old fabric has been well protected and has survived almost intact.

#### *Description*

Two sets of 18th century plans show a layout of winding and uneven streets which have changed little since that time. The morphology of the town, inspired by the model of a Portuguese medieval town, has developed while respecting the continuity of the first settlement. The 18th century built-up area has become denser without losing its original character. The layout of roads, lanes, alleys, and public squares is the result of a natural occupation of the site, given the demanding topography, and it reflects the traffic which grew between the mining hamlets over the years. The centre of the old town has a greater density, and it is situated on ground that is slightly flatter than the outskirts. The neo-Baroque cathedral, built in the main square in 1938 and of a controversial size, stands out as a landmark in the peaceful panorama of the town.

The architecture of Diamantina is of Baroque inspiration, sober and pure like most other mining villages in Brazil. However, it has a number of specific features which distinguish it from the traditional Portuguese colonial model. Its geometry and certain details confirm that the people who were entrusted by the Portuguese Crown to rule over the destinies of this colony within the Colony were cultivated, and that they sought to transpose on a modest scale some of the features of the architecture of their home country to their adopted land, as was equally the case for music and the arts.

The streets of the town are paved with large, flat, grey flagstones laid in such a way as to form a type of paving known as *capistranas*, named after President João Capistrano Bandeira de Melo, who introduced it in 1877. This picturesque paving creates a contrast between the road and the *casario*, a regular alignment of 18th and 19th century semi-detached houses, with one or two floors. Their facades, in bright colours on a white ground, are borrowed systematically from the same typology, and they display certain affiliations with the Portuguese Mannerist architecture. The plan is narrow and deep, the living rooms are placed in the front, followed by the bedrooms

and then the outbuildings connected by a central, or more often, side corridor. The outer walls are made of a frame of interwoven wood, filled with cob or adobe of earth beaten and worked by hand, to which is added other materials such as stone or gravel. The architecture of Diamantina differs from that of other Brazilian colonial towns because cut stone is not used except for the foundations. Wood is used for the decorative elements in both civil and religious architecture.

Most of the churches and religious buildings in Diamantina have been incorporated, here and there, inside the regular and homogeneous complex of the *casario*, usually standing back only slightly from the alignment. This reveals that the spiritual power was closely related with the population, which distinguished it from, and no doubt subjugated it to, temporal power, given the very few church squares and areas set aside for social intercourse and public events.

The construction of the churches is similar to that of civil buildings, and they also have the same colours and textures. A distinct feature of most of the churches in Diamantina is that they have only one bell tower, usually erected on the side of the building. The pediment is in sculpted wood. Some of them are richly decorated with remarkable works by well known artists, in particular, the master of perspective painting, José Soares de Araujo.

The town has a few architectural curiosities of interest, especially the Old Market Hall constructed in 1835 and recently restored, the *Passadiço*, a covered footbridge in blue and white wood spanning the Rua da Glória to join the two buildings of the Eschwege Geology Centre, the *muxarabi* of the Antônio Torres Library, a kind of balcony completely enclosed by a wooden lattice, and finally the *chafariz* of the Rua Direita, near the Cathedral, a sculpted fountain which guarantees that whoever drinks from it will return to Diamantina.

Over and above the physical heritage, legends and traditions abound in this town. Rumours about the liaison between the black slave, Chica da Silva, and the Portuguese purchaser of diamonds, João Fernandes de Oliveira, are still very much alive. The scent of his mistress still pervades the huge rooms of the magnificent house he built for her around 1770. When night falls, the streets resound with the sad song of the *serestas*, sometimes the orchestral music of the *vesperatas*, or even the boisterous rhythms of group of young percussion players and dancers who freely roam through the town at all hours.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The site nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List is part of the protected area designated as a national historic monument by Action No 64-T-38, inscription No 66 in the Book of Fine Arts, as adopted on 16 May 1938 by the Brazilian government, in conformity with Statutory Order No 25 of 30 November 1937. As its perimeter is much smaller than that of the historic site that was created by this legislation, the part of the protected area which is not included in the nominated site is considered as a buffer zone.

## Management

Since 1938, the land has been under the authority of the National Institute of Historic and Artistic Heritage which, in conformity with the legislation governing it, is responsible for protecting the integrity and authenticity of listed cultural property and national historic monuments. In the context of a historic group, its jurisdiction also extends to buildings and structures situated in the vicinity of this group in order to safeguard its clarity and coherence.

The activities of the National Institute of Historic and Artistic Heritage in Diamantina are coordinated by its Regional Coordination Office for Minas Gerais, with the fieldwork being carried out by a Technical Office housed in the Casa Chica da Silva. The task of the Institute is to ensure that the work undertaken on buildings and structures inside the protected area complies with the principles and rules established for this purpose. The documentation, analysis, and follow-up of all restoration operations fall under its responsibility. The Institute itself carries out or coordinates work on the major monuments of the town.

In accordance with Article 182 of the Federal Constitution of 1988, the town council of Diamantina must prepare a master plan. This plan is in the process of being drawn up and should be adopted by mid-1999. In particular, the Plan proposes the adoption of measures to control the height of buildings and the areas for extension of the town in order to protect its form and urban integrity. It recommends the adoption of legislation and administrative measures to guarantee the participative and dynamic management of the conservation process and the development of the town, including its historic centre.

Within the framework of the implementation of this Plan, the National Institute of Historic and Artistic Heritage has drawn up a list of all the structures of a historical character in the region of Diamantina, including an inventory of available documents and a survey on the socio-economic profile of its inhabitants. This work was undertaken in compliance with the rules and procedures established to draw up a National Inventory of Property. The data collected are in the process of being computerized.

The Institute views the historic town as a living, dynamic, and constantly changing organism, whose survival is linked to its development, that is to say, to the active expansion of social and economic activities and to the conservation of the values which make it precious.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

The historic centre of the town has been under the authority of the National Institute of Historic and Artistic Heritage since its classification in 1938. The Institute rigorously monitors and follows up all the works carried out within the perimeter of the classified area or which could have an effect on the preservation of its integrity. The Technical Service of Diamantina is responsible for supervising projects in the field, but these must all be approved by regional coordination experts whose offices are located in Belo Horizonte.

## Authenticity

The decline in mining exploration activities in the 19th century protected the town from the frequently disastrous upheavals inflicted in recent times on a large number of towns. The layout of the streets and the arrangement of elements of the built-up area have basically remained the same as shown in 18th century plans.

The old built-up area became denser during the 19th century but followed local traditional rules on the art of building. Until the 1950s, the buildings of the town were maintained by using the original materials and techniques. Nowadays, hollow bricks sometimes replace the cob or adobe in major reinforcement or reconstruction projects. When it comes to details, finishing touches, and colours, however, the architecture of Diamantina, whether it is civil, institutional, or religious, has not lost any of its character or originality.

Obviously, the modern town emerges as the visitor moves further away from the historic centre. Recent constructions of a high standard, such as those by Niemeyer, have been introduced into the townscape and usually blend harmoniously with it.

Age-old traditions, such as the *serestas* and the *vesperatas*, are still very much alive. An interesting aspect is that the quest for fortune and happiness, which used to motivate people in Diamantina to hunt for gold and diamonds, is still in vogue even though its intensity cannot be compared to what it was like in the past. It is sufficient to go outside the town, barely a few kilometres away, to see the work of the diamond hunters.

## Evaluation

### Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Diamantina in February 1999. ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages.

### Qualities

Diamantina is an authentic and concrete example of the incredible efforts made by humankind to seek its fortune, improve its condition, and fulfil itself. From the top of the mountains nearby, the region looks arid and barren as far as the eye can see. The landscape is lunar, a natural habitat for snakes and coyotes. Then in the distance a town appears, like an oasis lying in the heart of a tangle of rocky hills and unfertile valleys, an indissociable feature of its setting.

Crazy adventurers, hunters of dreams, built this town to fulfil their ambitions and hopes. Thanks to their strong determination, they built it to last both physically and spiritually. The town is attractive, with a simple but refined beauty. Traces of the past, which enriched a lucky few but left most of the population poor, are inscribed deeply in the stone and the legends which give this town its unique character.

### Comparative analysis

In several respects, Diamantina is a faithful mirror of the model of colonial towns in Portuguese-speaking America. It illustrates a similar development with that of Ouro Preto, following the discovery of gold, or of Potosí in Bolivia, where a vein of silver was found. It also stands out,

however, because of its exceptionally spectacular landscape, its history (having been subject to special types of governments which "enclosed" it to take greater advantage of the abundance of diamonds on the beds of its streams and rivers), and finally by its architecture, admittedly more sober than other mining towns of Brazil, the towns of gold, but just as refined.

It is distinguished by its paved roads, the *capistranas*, its houses organized into a *casario*, and its churches built without the decorative freestones typical of Baroque architecture but with pediments covered in a rich and colourful profusion of wooden sculpture. From the other side of the narrow Rio Grande valley, from the top of the Serra dos Cristais, Diamantina appears to be comfortably settled on a land with height variations of 150m. This hilly relief has produced an intermingling of winding streets with openings over staggering views. In the middle of this scene, the recently built Cathedral marks the heart of the historic centre.

In the ICOMOS comparative study on the Urban Architectural Heritage of South America, Diamantina is included in the list of cultural properties which should be given priority.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

ICOMOS has noted and supports the intention of the town council to become more involved, in partnership with the National Institute of Historic and Artistic Heritage and other institutions concerned, in the management of its heritage through the implementation of the Master Plan. The old town is exposed to the danger of changes which need to be controlled. ICOMOS recommends that the Master Plan be adopted before formal inscription on the World Heritage List and that the municipal authorities be endowed with effective and adequate resources, as well as the legal and technical instruments necessary to enable them to take over the relevant responsibilities.

Furthermore, ICOMOS is of the opinion that an appreciation of the values which distinguish Diamantina from other colonial towns in Portuguese-speaking America gives it a universal character, with the implication that the conservation and development project takes into account not only the landscape of the Serra dos Cristais but also the villages of Extração, Mendanha, Sopa, and others nearby which are an integral part of its history. These villages are under the jurisdiction of the Diamantina authorities.

#### **Brief Description**

Diamantina is a colonial village inserted like a jewel in a necklace of inhospitable rocky mountains. It illustrates the human adventure of diamond prospectors in the 18th century and testifies to human cultural and artistic ascendancy over the living environment.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

*Criterion ii* Diamantina shows how explorers of the Brazilian territory, diamond prospectors, and representatives of the Crown were able to adapt European models to an American context in the 18th

century, thus creating a culture that was faithful to its roots yet completely original.

*Criterion iv* The urban and architectural group of Diamantina, perfectly integrated into a wild landscape, is a fine example of an adventurous spirit combined with a quest for refinement so typical of human nature.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Dazu Rock Carvings (China)

No 912

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Dazu Rock Carvings - the cliffside carvings at Beishan, Baodingshan, Nanshan, Shizhuanshan, and Shimensan
<i>Location</i>	Dazu County, Chongqing Municipality
<i>State Party</i>	The People's Republic of China
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

[**Note** This is an abridged and edited version of the long text in the nomination dossier.]

The Dazu carvings form an important constituent part of the rock art of China. The five sites nominated are made up of 75 protected sites containing some 50,000 statues and over 100,000 Chinese characters forming inscriptions and epigraphs. Extensive in scale, high in artistic achievement, and rich in content, they constitute a masterpiece of art.

They are the most outstanding manifestations of the latest period in Chinese rock art. The earliest date from around AD 650, but the main artistic flowering was between the 9th and 13th centuries; after this, Chinese rock art virtually came to an end. The Dazu carvings differ from earlier examples in that they provide a synthesis of the sculptural art of Buddhism, Taoism, and Confucianism, at the same time presenting a vivid display of spiritual and domestic life. The wealth of carvings and inscriptions reflect the artistic and religious developments in the period concerned, and they also express historic, artistic, and scientific values not to be found in earlier-rock art groups.

The Dazu carvings demonstrate that Tantric Buddhism (Vajrayana), which had originated in India and was in decline in China around the 9th century, experienced a revival. This branch of Buddhism is characterized by the transition from speculative thought to the application of Buddhist ideals in daily life. The Dazu carvings introduce a spectacular new page into Chinese spiritual history, reflecting the beliefs of the common people and their unsophisticated way of life. They developed a style of their own, raising the representation of life in this medium to an unprecedentedly high level. In both the selection of subjects and their representation, they seek to come as closely as possible to everyday life and to the common aesthetic taste of the people at large. The scenes at Baodingshan in particular constitute a gallery of the folklore of the Song Dynasty (12th-13th centuries). Whether they are princes, officials, or

common people, the characters come vividly to life, depicting Chinese society from different angles and in miniature.

The Dazu rock carvings have made a significant contribution to artistic expression in China, taking into account a new realism and exaggeration in depicting the contrasts between good and evil, beauty and ugliness. In their contents the carved scenes reflect the moral and rationalistic call for the punishment of evildoers, while encouraging people to do good, to control their desires, and the regulate their behaviour. Their layouts demonstrate an ingenious integration of art, religion, science, and nature. Aesthetically they are mysterious, natural, and elegant, fully reflecting traditional Chinese culture, which emphasizes learning from the past.

In spiritual terms the Dazu carvings represent the major change that took place in China between the 10th and 13th centuries, marked by belief in a single god instead of a diversity of beliefs. They show how the three main religions, Buddhism, Taoism, and Confucianism, came together and found forms of artistic expression that coincided in such a way as to make it difficult to identify clear boundaries between them. The gods originating from Indian Buddhism and the immortals of Taoism were integrated with the deities of the common people of China at the time. These major changes in the religious beliefs of the Chinese laid the basis for those of later generations and profoundly influenced them.

**Criteria i, ii, iii, iv, and vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a group of *sites*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The earliest rock carvings in Dazu County date back to AD 650, in the early years of the Tang Dynasty, but the main period began in the late 9th century. In 892 Wei Junjing, Prefect of Changzhou, pioneered the carvings at Beishan, and his example was followed after the collapse of the Tang Dynasty by prefectural and county officials, local gentry, monks and nuns, and ordinary people in 907-65 (the Period of Five Dynasties and Ten States).

The creation of rock carvings ceased during the early years of the Song Dynasty, and was not to resume until 1078, in the reign of Emperor Yuan Feng of the Northern Song Dynasty; work began again at Beishan, continuing until 1146, and the groups at Nanshan and Shimenshan were carved. Between 1174 and 1252 the monk Zhao Zhifeng promoted Tantric Buddhism at Baodingshan and created the only large stone ritual site for this belief, attracting master craftsmen from all over the country.

Widespread warfare caused work to cease again at the end of the 13th century, and was not to begin again until the late 15th century, during the Ming Dynasty. It was to continue, albeit at a much reduced scale, until the late Qing Dynasty (end of the 19th century).

### Description

#### - Beishan

Beishan (known as Longgangshan in ancient times) is located 1.5km from Longgang Town, the seat of Dazu County. The cliff that houses the carvings is c 545m above sea-level, in a region of wooded mountain peaks; it is c 300m long and 7-10m high. It is divided into two sections: the north, with 100 groups of carvings and the south with 190. There are 264 niches with statues, one intaglio painting, and eight inscribed pillars; in all there are over 10,000 carvings at Beishan.

More than half the carvings represent Tantric Buddhism and the remainder relate to the concepts of the Trinity and Sukhavati, all popular beliefs in the period between 897 and 1162 when they were created. Especially noteworthy is niche 254, with 539 carved figures depicting the Amitabha Sutra.

Over one-third of the Beishan carvings date from the mid 10th century (the Five Dynasties Period) and focus on 18 different subjects, including the Sutra of the Master of Healing. The carvings from this period are characterized by their small and pretty figures, varied postures, natural and unrestrained features, and delicate dress ornamentation.

Statues from the Song Dynasty (late 10th to mid 12th centuries), which represent 21 themes, are more vivid and with clearly differentiated personalities, graceful postures, well proportioned figures, and splendid apparel. The Cave of the Prayer Wheel (niche 136), from 1142-46, is the most characteristic example of this period; other fine figures are Avalokitesvara with Rosary (Niche 125) and Mani Pearl Avalokitesvara (niche 136). The seven inscriptions that survive are important for the study of history, religious beliefs, dating, and the identification of historical figures. Wei Junjin's inscription, dated to 895, contains unique historical data relating to the history of the Tang Dynasty. The Stele of Zhao Yijian, made between 1163 and 1189, is in the handwriting of Cai Jing, one of the greatest calligraphers of the Song Dynasty.

#### - Baodingshan

This is a very impressive site 15km to the north-east of Longgang Town, on the sides of a U-shaped gorge over 500m above sea level, which both protects the carvings and gives it an almost architectural character. The carvings, which are laid out on an overall plan under the supervision of Zhao Zhifeng, form a series. There are two groups of carvings. The first and smaller group, known as Xiaofowan, is on top of the mountain and closely linked with the Holy Longevity Monastery, built at the same time but later destroyed by fire and rebuilt during the Ming and Qing Dynasties; it covers 1.6ha. The second (Daifowan), covering an area c 500m long by 8-25m high, lies to the west of the monastery.

The statues form 31 groups, with themes such as Thousand-Armed Avalokitesvara, the Buddhist Wheel of Life, Suffering from Birth, Ageing, Sickness, and Death, the 31m long Sakyamuni Buddha Entering Nirvana, the Three Saints of the Huayan School (which projects out from the cliff face), and the Nine Dragons Bathing, along with many lifelike scenes - buffaloes grazing under the care of herdsmen and drunkards failing to recognize their relatives. The statues represent the integration of the basic doctrines of Buddhism,

the ethics of Confucianism, the tenets of rationalism, and Taoism. In many ways the Baodingshan carvings may be considered to represent the acme of Chinese rock sculpture.

#### - Nanshan

The Nanshan carvings extend over a length of 86m. For the most part they depict Taoist subjects; they are adjudged to be the best preserved of the five major Taoist groups in China. By the 12th century when these carvings were executed, Taoism had evolved from worship of the Supreme Master and the Three Officials into belief in the Pure Trinity and the Four Emperors.

#### - Shizhuanshan

These late 11th century carvings extend over 130m, and offer a rare example of a tripartite arrangement of Buddhist, Taoist, and Confucian images.

#### - Shimenshan

These carvings, from the first half of the 12th century, cover 72m. They demonstrate the integration of Buddhist and Taoist subjects, the latter being the most characteristic. For example, the God of Farsightedness, to the left of the entrance to niche 2, has enormous eyes "as if they could see as far as a thousand *li*." The 92 statues in the Cave of the Gods and Goddess of Mount Tai [Taishan] reflect the important role of the Taishan Family among the Taoist divinities between the 10th and 13th centuries.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

In 1961 the State Council of the People's Republic of China (PRC) designated the carvings at Beishan and Baodingshan in the first group of cultural properties to be protected under the provisions of Article 4 of the Law on the Protection of Relics as "sites of ancient culture, ancient tombs, and cave temples." In 1966, when the fourth group was declared, the Nanshan, Shizhuanshan, and Shimenshan carvings were similarly designated.

In addition to this basic protection, the sites are also covered by other statutes: the PRC Laws on the Protection of the Environment and on Urban Planning and on the PRC Criminal Law.

### Management

The sites are owned by the People's Republic of China.

Under the terms of the Law on the Protection of Relics, each protected site is a "key protective zone" and around these there is a "general protective zone," which is in turn surrounded by a "zone where construction is controlled." These constitute an adequate buffer zone, as required by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

Until the 1950s the Dazu Rock Carvings were mainly managed by Buddhist monks and Taoists, financed by the alms that they collected. With the establishment of the People's Republic of China in 1949 the maintenance of sites became the responsibility of central and local administrations. In 1952 Dazu County established the County Office for the Protection of Cultural Relics and in 1984 Sichuan

Province approved the creation of the Dazu Rock Carvings Museum (in Chongqing since 1990).

At the present time management of the protected sites is based on consecutive five-year plans approved by the Chongqing Municipal Bureau of Culture, under the overall supervision of the National Administration of Cultural Heritage (formerly the State Bureau of Cultural Relics) in Beijing.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Between 1952 and 1966 efforts were concentrated on two aspects of conservation: investigation of the natural environment, history, current state, and specific problems. A full survey and inventory was carried out and protective zones were defined. More than 20 rescue projects were carried out, involving consolidation of rock bases, restoration of collapsed groups, and creation of access corridors and cover structures. At the same time work began to control water permeation, and this has continued without interruption to the present day.

This phase lasted until the Cultural Revolution began in 1966. With the end of that period in 1977, planned maintenance and protection programmes were instituted. The then State Bureau of Cultural Relics allocated substantial funds for a number of major restoration projects, in addition to the planned maintenance and conservation programmes that were initiated. A number of scientific studies have been carried out, with special attention being given to the control of water permeation (by means of new sealing compounds and the cutting of tunnels behind the statues) and damage from weathering.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the Dazu rock art is high. The carvings have maintained their original form and materials and conservation interventions have been sensitively carried out. The natural environment has also been well preserved, so the authenticity of setting of the rock art is high.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in September 1998.

### *Qualities and comparative analysis*

The Dazu carvings are outstanding examples of the latest phase of rock art in China. They are of high artistic significance and introduced a major phase in Chinese artistic evolution. They illustrate the transition from speculative thought to the implementation of Buddhist ideas in daily life as represented by Tantric Buddhism, but with an identity specific to this region.

### *ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action*

The overall condition of the sites is good and there appear not to be any serious problems. The carvings here are in fact much better preserved than those in other parts of China, where cultural sites have suffered from armed conflicts, the Cultural Revolution, or development pressures.

There are, however, some specific conservation problems, notably water permeation, weathering damage, and possible seismic impacts. The authorities are carrying out scientific tests to determine appropriate conservation and protection programmes. It is essential that these incorporate adequate long-term monitoring procedures.

Special attention needs to be paid to the provision of proper access to the sites and the construction of visitor facilities. Care must be taken in siting these, so as to avoid adverse visual impacts.

It is understood that the Dazu area is included in a large World Bank planning scheme, in which specialized Italian firms are being consulted with regard to projects for the conservation and management of cultural sites. The World Heritage Committee and ICOMOS should be kept fully informed of the nature and progress of projects of this kind which might have an adverse impact on the Dazu rock carvings and their setting.

## Brief description

The steep hillsides in the Dazu area contain an exceptional series of rock carvings dating from the 9th to 13th centuries. They are outstanding for their high aesthetic qualities, for their rich diversity of subject matter, both secular and religious, for the light that they shed on everyday life in China during this period, and for the evidence that they provide of the coming together of Buddhism, Taoism, and Confucianism in an harmonious synthesis.

## Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, and iii*:

*Criterion i* The Dazu carvings represent the pinnacle of Chinese rock art for their high aesthetic quality and their diversity of style and subject matter.

*Criterion ii* Tantric Buddhism from India and the Chinese Taoist and Confucian beliefs came together at Dazu to create a highly original and influential manifestation of spiritual harmony .

*Criterion iii* The eclectic nature of religious belief in later Imperial China is given material expression in the exceptional artistic heritage of the Dazu rock art.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Viñales (Cuba)

No 840rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Viñales Valley
<i>Location</i>	Province of Pinar del Rio
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Cuba
<i>Date</i>	22 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The proposal for inscription on the World Heritage List is based on the definition of "cultural landscape" in Articles 36, 37, 38, and 39ii of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* as a "living landscape."

The Viñales Valley is a mixture of natural landscapes (small hills) and human activities (the cultivation of tobacco, fodder, and food crops). It has an exceptional aesthetic and socio-cultural value. The variations in the relief and the colour contrasts between the ochre soil, the green hues of the plants, and the dark limestone outcrops make this landscape an admirable sight, the beauty of which is due to the combination of the natural features of the site and the transformations made by human activities.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the Viñales Valley is a *site*. Taking into account the surroundings of the property, the Viñales Valley may also be considered to be a *cultural landscape*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The numerous caves scattered on the slopes of the hillocks in the Viñales Valley were inhabited for many centuries before the arrival of the Spanish conquerors.

The fertile soil and favourable climate were conducive to the development of stock-raising and the cultivation of fodder and food crops, using slaves from Africa. The *cimarrones*, or escaped slaves, often found refuge in the caves of the Valley. The Pan de Azucar site contains the

ruins of the biggest hacienda, where slaves were taught different trades.

Following the emergence and considerable expansion of tobacco cultivation, the village of Viñales was founded in 1875, along the road leading from Pinar del Rio, the capital of the province, to Puerto Esperanza, the main outlet to the sea. The Western Railroad (*Ferrocarril del Oeste*), of which only a few vestiges are left, was built in 1882.

The Viñales Valley was the scene of several military operations during the War of Independence, and also during the Cuban Revolution.

At present, the Valley is devoted to agriculture; its population of some 8000 people are engaged mainly in growing tobacco, a crop which gives the best yields.

#### *Description*

The Valley is surrounded by mountains. It is a plain of arable land, dotted by spectacular limestone outcrops rising to a height of up to 300m (*mogotes*). It has a series of very large caves containing ammonite fossils. The vegetation on the hills is characterized by local endemic species, particularly *Microcycas calocoma*, a living fossil of the Cretaceous phanerogamic flora. It is home to an interesting avian and molluscan fauna.

The entire plain is devoted to traditional agriculture. Recent experiments have revealed that mechanical methods lower the quality of tobacco, and this explains why old methods, such as animal traction, are still being used. The Valley changes as the seasons pass and the crops grow, and these variations are accentuated by its east-west orientation. As the sun moves across the sky, a unique spectacle is to be seen, with grey and green rock formations, red soil, white and grey houses, and cultivated plants in a wide palette of greens.

Most of the buildings scattered over the plain are simple; they are built using local and natural materials, and are used as homes or family farms. The village of Viñales, strung out along its main street, has retained its original layout, and there are many interesting examples of colonial architecture.

The Valley is home to an original culture, a synthesis of contributions from indigenous peoples, Spanish conquerors, and black slaves. An excellent illustration is the musical expression of the field worker (*veguero*), of which Benito Hernandez Cabrera (known as the Viñalero) was the main interpreter. Traditional crafts also flourish here.

Cubans identify themselves strongly with the Viñales Valley because of the beauty of the site and its historical and cultural importance. In the visual arts, the Viñales Valley has been transformed into a symbol of the Caribbean landscape by artists such as Domingo Ramos and Tiburcio Lorenzo.

### Management and Protection

#### *Legal status*

Some 92% of the area proposed for inscription is in the hands of private owners, with 30% owned by individual farmers and the rest by the National Association of Small Farmers.

The Viñales Valley is protected by provisions in the Constitution of the Republic of Cuba of February 1976 and by the Declaration of 27 March 1979 designating it as a National Monument, in application of two Laws of 4 August 1977, one on the protection of cultural property, and the other on national and local monuments.

#### *Management*

The high authority responsible for management is the National Council of Cultural and Natural Heritage of the State. Local supervision is ensured by the Provincial Centre for Cultural Heritage of Pinar del Rio, the Provincial Branch of the Ministry of Science, Technology and the Environment, and the Provincial Branch of the Ministry of Agriculture.

The conservation of the natural and cultural values of the site is considered to be vital, and all the requisite statutory and administrative steps have been taken to this end. At the same time, the social needs of the local population and the imperatives to promote economic activities and improve living standards are also taken into account. Awareness campaigns directed at both the local population and visitors are designed to highlight the natural and cultural values of the site.

The first national tourist plan, based on environment-friendly principles, was launched in 1959 in the Viñales Valley. It was during this period that the first hotel, *Los Jazmines*, was built, and it still has its original features. According to information from the State Party, in 1997 the site was visited by over 30,000 foreign tourists. These visits are expected to increase. The authorities, therefore, plan to build the necessary infrastructure, roads, and new hotels, and to implement projects to develop ecotourism.

The authorities are at present working towards the creation of a National Park spread over 13,200ha, which would include the Viñales Valley, thus giving added protection to its environment.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

The site has always been managed on traditional lines, whilst its regular maintenance is linked to agricultural practices. The importance of the site for Cubans led to conservation based on customary practices, until the legal and statutory measures of 1979 came into force.

#### *Authenticity*

The site proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List is a "living landscape" with a high degree of authenticity. It has been able to preserve its specific character, while adapting to modern conditions of life and receiving flows of visitors.

#### *Risk prevention*

The area is not in danger from natural catastrophes. The general measures for protection and management should make it possible to prevent anthropogenic damage.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 1999.

#### *Qualities*

The Viñales Valley is an outstanding example of the interaction between human activities and a natural setting of great beauty. Despite its active economic and social life, it has preserved the harmony and equilibrium created by generations of farmers, thus forming a melting pot for different cultural influences.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The impressive scenery of hills rising from the ground is unique in Cuba. Similar karstic formations can be seen in other regions of the world - the Dominican Republic, Thailand, Madagascar, Vietnam, and China. Ha Long Bay has the same geological composition and is included in the World Heritage List.

The unusual character of the Viñales Valley results from its sizeable settlement and the fact that it is a hub of human activity, particularly agriculture and the cultivation of tobacco based on traditional methods. This cultural aspect gives the site an exceptional value.

However, ICOMOS does not feel that this property does not possess the outstanding universal value that would justify its inscription on the World Heritage List.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

Although tourism is at present under control, its development is expected to threaten the integrity of the site. It is recommended that even greater attention should be paid to such developments in the relevant management plans. A programme to collect oral traditions and "intangible heritage" would be timely in order to preserve the memory of this remarkable human settlement, in the areas of music, crafts, and other forms of popular culture.

It would be appropriate to provide signposting that blends better with the site, and to lay out marked paths to encourage the development of ecotourism.

Cultural itineraries could be identified, based on different types of traditional agricultural products, such as sugar, tobacco, or coffee, so as to establish links with other Caribbean islands.

### **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Litomyšl (Czech Republic)

No 901

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Litomyšl Castle
<i>Location</i>	Province of Bohemia, East Bohemian Region
<i>State Party</i>	Czech Republic
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The castle at Litomyšl is one of the foremost representatives of the Bohemian and Moravian arcade castles built in the 16th century, which developed this architectural idea of Italian origin and brought it to an incomparable grandeur. It was an architectonic analysis of Litomyšl Castle which led to the new and convincing knowledge that the arcade castles in the Czech lands are an independent genre within the European Renaissance style and that these arcade castles are rooted deeply in the Italian Renaissance, but conceived independently and with great creative originality. Litomyšl Castle has an important place in the large group of these castles not only because of its high artistic level but also because of the considerable extent to which the original Renaissance architecture has been preserved. An almost intact appearance of the exterior with richly articulated gables and both ornamental and figural *sgraffiti* is not to be found in any other building whose style approaches that of Litomyšl Castle. The exceptional level of its plastic arts and architecture, together with the authenticity and originality of the whole and the details is the reason for the leading position of this castle within central European – or, indeed, all European – architecture. **Criterion i**

A comparison between Renaissance arcade castles in central Europe, Germany, the Alpine countries, the Danube basin, and Poland is especially important.

Germany, whose arcade castles have an architectonic structure different from that in the Czech lands, is excluded from this group of countries for that reason. Austria, however, remains in the group because it has several valuable examples that came into being in parallel with the development in the Czech lands, but only rarely attained the high level of the key buildings in the Czech lands. Polish examples are rare. In central Europe the Czech Republic has undoubted re-eminence as to the great number, the great variety, the architectonic wealth, and the high level of the works of plastic arts.

The most complicated problem remains, namely a comparison between the arcade castles in the Czech lands and architectonic examples in their country of origin, Italy. It

would seem at first glance that the quantitative superiority, great variety, and the highest architectonic level of the Italian arcade palaces is unique beyond any doubt and cannot be questioned as regards certain priorities of style. This was the problem on which intensive interest focused and extensive comparative study was carried out. It has become evident that, owing to their wonderful purity of style, the Moravian and Bohemian castles link directly to Italian examples, yet without their relationship being that of provincial epigons. They represent architectural works directly linking with older Italian examples and developing them. The arcade castles of the Czech lands represent the complete architectonic culmination of Italian examples. The development of the motifs of vaulted arcades to embrace two storeys, which is rare in Italy, is very impressive.

Litomyšl is not unique among the Bohemian and Moravian castles with arcaded courtyards: many of them have splendid architectonic features and excellent purity of form. However, among them only Litomyšl Castle has preserved its unimpaired appearance with admirable gables, whose silhouettes are complicated and which also have distant Italian roots, but which were given new dynamism and endless variety of form in their Czech home.

From these points of view, Litomyšl Castle has to be considered a unique masterpiece within European Renaissance architecture and one with a full inalienable claim to being put on the World Heritage List. This masterpiece excels in itself, but also represents a monumental ending to the all-European development of a certain kind of Renaissance palace and castle. **Criterion ii**

Litomyšl Castle represents a monumental key link in the all-European development of a certain kind of Renaissance palace and castle. The castle does not stand alone, but is surrounded by all the facilities needed to accomplish the prestigious as well as the economic mission of the whole complex. A garden and a park are contiguous with the castle, and a brewery, a riding-school, stables, and a coach-house are in the first courtyard, all of them compactly laid out. The whole is testimony to the life of the aristocracy from the 16th to the 19th century. **Criterion iv**

Litomyšl played an important role in the cultural development of the Czech state, especially in the Middle Ages and in more recent times. Jan of Streda, an eminent personality at the court of the King-Emperor Charles IV in the third quarter of the 14th century, was Bishop of Litomyšl and the initiator of the creation of works of art of European importance. In 1567 the Litomyšl domain was acquired by the Pernštejns, one of the most prominent aristocratic families in the Czech state. Litomyšl was also the castle where the last member of this family, Lady Frebonie, died in 1646. Bedrich Smetana, one of the best Czech composers of all time, was born in the Litomyšl castle brewery in 1824; his compositions are still played in the concert halls of cultural countries throughout the world. **Criterion vi**

[**Note** The “Justification” section in the dossier goes on to detail the qualities of the first courtyard of the castle and its buildings, but these will be treated as integral with the castle itself in this evaluation.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

## History and Description

### History

There has been a settlement since at least the 10th century at Litomyšl, which is located at an important communications junction on the main road between Bohemia and Moravia, with its fortified core on the hill where the castle now stands.

There is known to have been a small church dedicated to St Clement on this site, and a Premonstratensian monastery was founded in the town in the first half of the 12th century. The monastery was closed when the bishopric was created in 1344, its buildings being shared out between the bishop and the chapter. The document of 1398 relating to this partition contains the first reference to an “old palace” and castle at Litomyšl. Archaeological and historical investigations have revealed remnants of the medieval structure beneath and within the Renaissance castle.

In 1425 the town was conquered after a siege by the Hussites, who razed all the ecclesiastical buildings to the ground. Restoration was undertaken at the end of the Hussite Wars by the new owners of Litomyšl, the Kostka family of Postupice, and details of this building have also been shown by recent investigations. It was damaged by fire in 1460 and again in 1546; after the second fire, the castle was confiscated by the king, but it was almost completely gutted after a third fire, in 1560.

The ruined structure was granted in 1567 to the Vratislav family of Pernštejn, who received a royal grant to reconstruct it. Work began in 1568 under the supervision of Jan Baptista Avostalis (Giovanni Battista Avostalli), who was joined by his brother Oldrich (Ulrico). Most of the work had been completed by 1580.

A fire in 1635 caused only slight damage to the upper storey of the castle and this was quickly repaired. The architect František Maximilián Kanka was responsible for considerable modifications from 1719 onwards in the High Baroque style. Fire struck yet again in 1775, and the repairs involved some remodelling. Major alterations took place in the interior in 1792-96, to the designs of Jan Kryštof Habich, but he was careful to preserve the fine Renaissance gables. Since that time there have been no changes of any consequence in the structure, design, or decoration of the castle.

The first courtyard formed part of the original fortified settlement. The buildings associated with it were all built or rebuilt during the course of the modifications that the castle underwent over time, and this is reflected in their architectural styles.

### Description

The castle is a four-winged, three-storeyed structure with an asymmetrical disposition. The western wing is the largest, whilst the southern wing is no more than a two-storeyed arcaded gallery to close the square second courtyard (a feature that is unique to Litomyšl). This groin-vaulted arcading continues round the western and eastern sides of the courtyard. The south-eastern corner of the eastern wing contains the castle chapel. A smaller oblong courtyard is

enclosed within the northern wing, which has a slender polygonal tower in its north-eastern corner.

All the external facades have Renaissance articulation. They are mainly uniform and so only generalized descriptions are given here. Biforate windows with reveals and stone lintels are located above the plinth on the ground floor.

The main portal is situated off-centre on the south façade. It has a semicircular arch and is flanked by double rusticated embedded columns. The flat lintel over the entrance is surmounted by the coats of arms of the Pernštejn and Manriques de Lara families.

The first and second floors also have biforate windows with decorated stone reveals and hood mouldings retained by volute brackets. On the southern wing the second-floor windows are replaced by an open arcaded gallery. The polygonal end of the chapel, which protrudes on the east façade, has twin triforate lancet windows. A low fragment of a polygonal turret with a pyramidal roof has been preserved alongside the chapel. All the facades are covered with *sgraffiti*, imitating diamond and rusticated ashlar, in varying states of conservation

A lunette cornice has been restored on the southern facades of the eastern and western wings and on the western façade; traces can also be discerned on the other facades. Above the cornice is an attic gable articulated by pilasters with small windows; this is interrupted only over the arcaded gallery on the southern wing. Highly decorated broken gables articulated by embossed pillars are set into an attic gable. The finials are set on squat bases, short pillars, and in the vertices of small attachments.

The second (interior) courtyard is lined on the eastern, southern, and western sides with semicircular arcades. On the ground floor they rest on rusticated square pillars and the arches and spandrels are also rusticated. The first and second floors have column arcades: columns with *entasis* are set on feet, plinths, and block socles, the capitals on the first floor being Tuscan and those on the second volute (Ionic). Parapet walls articulated by central pilaster strips run between the plinths. The northern façade is covered with sets of monumental *sgraffiti* in four bands between the window sill of the first floor and the cornice. They depict scenes from the Old Testament, from classical history, Roman and Renaissance virtues, and hunting scenes. Busts of warriors and heroes are shown in scrollwork cartouches in the lunettes.

Of the features in the interior of the castle one of the most striking is the fine Neo-Classical theatre from 1796-97 in the western wing. Constructed entirely of wood, it can seat 150 spectators in nine loggias and its lower floor. The original painted decoration of the auditorium, stage decorations, and stage machinery have survived intact. The Renaissance main staircase of the castle is located in this wing, which houses some finely proportioned Renaissance rooms decorated for the most part in Neo-Classical style in the 18th century.

The other two wings have comparable interiors, basically Renaissance in form and with lavish late Baroque or Neo-Classical ornamentation in the form of elaborate plasterwork and wall and ceiling paintings. The paintings simulate three-dimensional compositions with ornamental mouldings from Roman antiquity. The paintings are coordinated from one room to the next. The entire interior is in a homogeneous style, a short-lived transition between Baroque and

Classicism at the end of the 18th century, to which the name "Late Baroque Classicism" has been given.

Access to the chapel from the eastern wing is through an elegant portal. The interior, with its barrel-vaulted nave, retains most of its original Renaissance features. It is now relatively plain, painted in *grisaille*, but traces of earlier paintings have been found on the walls.

Among the ancillary buildings, the most interesting is the Brewery, which lies to the south of the first courtyard. Originally constructed as a counterpart to the castle, with *sgraffito* decoration, it was substantially reconstructed after the 1728 fire and received what is its present appearance, which blends elements of High Baroque and Neo-Classicism, after the 1775 fire. However, analysis of the structure itself reveals component parts from the Gothic period onwards.

The riding stable is contiguous with the brewery and forms part of the Renaissance counterpart of the castle. It has undergone various vicissitudes as a result of the fires to which the castle was prone, and now complements the brewery in external appearance.

The stable closes the first courtyard on its eastern side. It is a single-storey building, originally in High Baroque style but transformed, like the other buildings around the first courtyard, in the 18th century. The regular façade has nine sections, with the main portal in the centre, flanked on either side by windows and lateral entrances. There are four dormers evenly disposed along the gambrel roof.

Other elements of the ensemble are the Lord's House on the western side of the park, the coach-house, the former stable, a small house or cottage, the formal garden in the French style with its Baroque *saletta* (pavilion), and the park (in the English style, from the late 18th century).

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

Individual properties in the Litomyšl Castle ensemble are protected under Law No 20 on state conservation of the cultural heritage (1987). The whole ensemble is registered as national cultural heritage by Government Resolution No 251/1962. The ensemble forms part of the urban conservation area of Litomyšl, which covers the historic centre of the town (including the castle), as defined in Ministry of Culture Decree No 16417/97-VI/1.

All of these measures ensure that all interventions must be authorized by the competent institutions at central and local government level.

### *Management*

The castle is in public ownership. It was state property until 1995, when part of the ensemble was transferred to the municipality of Litomyšl. At the present time, therefore, ownership of the castle, Lord's House, coach-house, *saletta*, second and third courtyards, garden, and park is vested in the Conservation Institute at Pardubice, whilst the brewery, the riding school, the stable, the small house, and the first courtyard are owned by the municipality.

Management of their respective properties is in the hands of these two bodies. Overall supervision of conservation is

exercised by the Conservation Department of the Ministry of Culture of the Czech Republic and by the State Institute for the Care of Historical Monuments.

Intensive studies on different aspects of the castle complex, in order to prepare programmes for conservation and management, have been carried out during the 1990s at both local and national level. Programmes for the regeneration of the urban conservation area, the preservation of the architectural heritage, dilapidated parts of the complex (roofs), and the restoration of movable cultural heritage objects have been financed by the Ministry of Culture.

The management plan is based on two studies carried out in 1995. Its objectives are presentation of the castle, demonstrating its European and international significance, improving the presentation with the installation of a cultural and social centre and an art gallery, completing the reconstruction of the brewery and the installation of a museum of ancient sculpture and architecture, and improving technical standards generally.

The nominated property covers an area of 4.4ha, and the surrounding conservation area 209ha. The conservation area, which is strictly controlled, constitutes an effective buffer zone, as required by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*. However, in 1987 the District Administration Council of Svitavy proclaimed a buffer zone of a further 94.9ha around the Litomyšl conservation area, in accordance with Law No 20/1987. The setting of the nominated property is therefore endowed with very complete protection in this way.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

The castle was owned by the Thurn und Taxis family until 1945, when it came into state ownership. Litomyšl was one of 130 comparable properties that were chosen for preservation in their original state because of their special architectural quality and artistic contents. The whole ensemble was managed by the Pardubice Institute until 1995 according to internationally accepted conservation standards.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the ensemble is high. The individual components remain physically integrated with one another in their original state, whilst the complex retains its spatial relationship with its historic urban setting. The successive modifications and reconstructions that have taken place over several hundred years have been respected. No attempt has been made to select a particular period to display, but instead the organic evolution is presented in its entirety. Care has been taken to ensure that authentic materials and techniques have been used in all conservation and restoration interventions.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Litomyšl in January 1999.

### *Qualities*

Litomyšl Castle is an exceptional work of central European Renaissance architecture derived from Italian models which

has preserved its original historic fabric intact, along with the high-quality and historically significant additions and modifications made in the 17th and 18th centuries, most notably in its interior.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The justification by the State Party rightly points to possible comparisons between Litomyšl and other castle complexes, both in Italy, where the arcade castle originated, and elsewhere in central Europe.

A comparison with Italian examples is not considered to be appropriate in this case, since the form was taken over by Czech architects, in whose hands it evolved considerably.

In central Europe there is a number of castles of this type in the Czech lands (the Belvedere summer palace in Prague, Kacerov, Moravský Krumlov, Bucovice, Opatowitz), and Austria (Spital). However, none of these preserves the full range of original features that distinguishes Litomyšl (the completeness of the ensemble, the intact plan of the main building), its high artistic quality (the formal logic of the three-storey arcaded galleries, the scenic *sgraffiti*, the “Late Baroque Classical” interior decoration), and the integral relationship with its urban setting.

#### **Brief description**

Litomyšl Castle is in origin a Renaissance structure, an arcade castle of the type developed originally in Italy and adopted and greatly developed in central Europe in the 16th century. Its design and decoration are of high quality, including the later High Baroque features added in the 18th century, and it preserves intact the range of ancillary buildings associated with an aristocratic residence of this type.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

**Criterion ii** Litomyšl Castle is an outstanding and immaculately preserved example of the arcade castle, a type of building first developed in Italy and modified in the Czech lands to create an evolved form of special architectural quality.

**Criterion iv** Litomyšl Castle illustrates in an exceptional way the aristocratic residences of central Europe in the Renaissance and their subsequent development under the influence of new artistic movements.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Cuenca (Ecuador)

No 863

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Historic Centre of Santa Ana of the Cuenca Rivers
<i>Location</i>	Province of Azuay
<i>State Party</i>	Ecuador
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Cuenca is an outstanding example of an *entroterra* city built on an open space in the rough terrain of the Andes, away from an Inca settlement. It is based on town-planning precepts laid down by Charles the Fifth in 1526.

#### Criterion ii

It is the embodiment of the ideal urban model of a colonial town "in the interior," built as an administrative centre for the large Indian communities and intended for agriculture.

#### Criterion iii

Its exceptional value is due not so much to the monumental concept of the constructions but to its capacity to absorb the different architectural styles of the past while retaining its basic character as a colonial town. The town has many adobe buildings, the result of adapting traditional European architecture to local conditions.

#### Criterion iv

The city, founded by the Spanish, has produced a synthesis in the layout of its space and in the social relations between the Indians and newly arrived Spaniards.

#### Criterion v

[**Note:** This text is an abbreviated version of that in the nomination dossier.]

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the historic centre of Santa Ana of the Rivers of Cuenca is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

The town was founded in 1557, on the orders of the Viceroy Andrés Hurtado de Mendoza, on a site next to Pumpapungo. The purpose was to turn it into an agricultural centre, since the conditions of the surrounding

plains were favourable for farming and stock raising. The aim was also to establish an administrative centre for the numerous Indian populations in this Andean region.

The town of Cuenca developed slowly, because it was hampered for a long time by its initial layout, and remained a centre for agricultural production. It incorporated a succession of architectural contributions, in keeping with its urban fabric and character as a colonial town. This situation continued until political independence from the Spanish Crown in 1820. At the same time, the various populations and cultures intermingled.

During the second half of the 19th century, the town went through a manufacturing phase, particularly the production of quinine and straw hats. This development enabled it to become relatively richer, and it was accompanied by the construction of some more important buildings, including the University of Cuenca in 1867.

Owing to its geographical isolation, Cuenca had a coherent urban profile until 1950. However, this was followed by the threats of urban expansion and transformations resulting from pressure exerted by real-estate promotion and new social requirements. An *Urban Development Plan for the Metropolitan Area of Cuenca* was adopted in 1982 to safeguard the image of the town and to restore several buildings.

#### Description

The town of Cuenca is situated in a valley surrounded by Andean mountains chains, which have enabled it to maintain close contact with its natural environment over a long period.

The town is laid out on a strict grid of perpendicular streets stretching from the Main Square, the Abdón Calderón Park, to form a total of 200 blocks. The seat of the Town Council, the Office of the Governor, two cathedrals, and the Law Courts are ranged around the Main Square. The paved streets are wide and sunlit. The urban fabric is noteworthy for the presence of parks, squares, church cloisters, and other public areas.

Many of the simple colonial houses have been converted into more important residences, especially during the period of relative expansion due to the production of quinine and hats. The result is an unusual architecture incorporating various influences, both local and European.

A few important edifices are worthy of mention, such as the New Cathedral, begun in 1880, the Old Cathedral, the Carmelite Monastery, and the Church of Santo Domingo.

### Management and Protection

#### Legal status

Most of the buildings are private property, although a few of the larger ones are in public or church ownership. At national level, the 1979 Law on Cultural Heritage and its application regulations of 1984, as well as the 1988 legislation on the creation of an Emergency Fund for Cultural Heritage, are in force.

At regional level, there are several statutory measures:

- the 1982 Act on the Designation of the Historic Centre of the Town of Cuenca;

- the 1983 Edict on the Control and Administration of the Historic Centre;
- the 1989 Edict on the Establishment of a Directorate for the Historic Centre;
- the 1992 Edict on Signs and Publicity;
- the Edict on the Exemption from Property Tax for Owners of Property declared to be part of the National Cultural Heritage.

These statutory regulations apply to the perimeter of the historic centre but make no similar provisions for the buffer zone, which is very narrow.

#### *Management*

The Commission for the Historic Centre is responsible for its supervision and management. The Commission is assisted in technical matters by the General Secretariat for Town Planning, which comes under the Municipal Government of Cuenca.

The municipal authorities are also responsible for actions relating to the management of the historic centre, in particular the Town Council and the Mayor of Cuenca.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

Concern for conservation issues intensified in the 1970s, leading to effective protective measures starting in 1982.

Inventories have been drawn up and a study has been undertaken on the areas forming the historic centre.

The buildings in the historic centre are very fragile as they are not made of very durable materials, especially when built of mud brick. The authorities consider that regular maintenance by owners should be a priority protective measure, and they are encouraging this approach in different ways.

In 1995, the completion of the Master Plan for drinking water and sewers ensured the provision of an essential drainage system for the old dwelling houses.

A few blocks of houses in the historic centre have undergone major alterations which do not fit into the form and typology of the historic fabric.

#### *Authenticity*

The town of Cuenca has been able to retain its image as a colonial town and most of its original character. Its historic centre is inhabited and continues to have a traditional and active social life, although in living conditions which have sometimes deteriorated. Given this continuous occupation, the town has a high degree of authenticity.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Cuenca in February 1999. It observed that the buffer zone needed to be reconsidered in terms of its regulations or its extension, for it permits building at a scale which could disrupt the perspectives of the historic centre. ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages.

#### *Qualities*

The special value of Cuenca relates to the history, town planning, architecture, and landscape of the ensemble. Its historical evolution is reflected in the different phases of its urban development. Each phase is like a chapter in an open book which can be consulted to analyse, research, and acquire knowledge of the region's successive civilizations - the Cañari period, Inca rule, and the Spanish conquest and colonization.

#### *Comparative analysis*

In contrast with the many colonial harbour towns, Cuenca is a historic town of the interior. It also differs from Quito or Cusco in that it was established on a green-field site and not built on top of an existing settlement.

In a comparative study carried out by ICOMOS, Cuenca appears on the list of cultural property which should be given priority.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The buffer zone should be re-examined in relation to its extension and to town-planning regulations which should be applied to it, especially with respect to the scale of constructions.

To be able to exercise its control more effectively, the authorities should carry out a full inventory of the buildings of the historic centre, especially the more vulnerable areas, such as those engaged in distribution and commercial activities.

### **Brief Description**

The historic centre of Cuenca is typical of a colonial town of the interior, set in a valley surrounded by Andean chains. Dedicated to agriculture, it became a melting pot for local and immigrant populations.

### **Recommendation**

That this cultural property be **deferred** for the State Party to re-examine the regulations applicable to the buffer zone and extend it, and to supply details about the progress of the inventory of buildings within the perimeter proposed for inscription.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Sammallahdenmäki (Finland)

No 579rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Bronze Age Burial Site of Sammallahdenmäki
<i>Location</i>	Lappi Tl., Province of Satakunta
<i>State Party</i>	Finland
<i>Date</i>	26 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The prehistoric site of Sammallahdenmäki forms the largest, most varied, and most complete monument from the Scandinavian Bronze Age to be found on the coast of the Gulf of Bothnia. Situated in a rugged, rocky landscape, the cairns of Sammallahdenmäki represent the monumental architecture of the period at its best. The ancient coastline is still present on the cliffs of Sammallahdenmäki.

Similar cairns are known from the western coast of the Gulf of Bothnia (Ångermanland, Uppland, and Medelpad in Sweden). However, the stone cairns known from these coastal regions generally occur only in small groups rather than forming extensive cairn areas like Sammallahdenmäki. Together, the 33 cairns of Sammallahdenmäki form a monumental array unique to the area of the Scandinavian Bronze Age culture in terms of the number and variety of its graves and its preserved natural surroundings. The Sammallahdenmäki cairns are also unique examples of Bronze Age religious practices and the monumental architecture related with them. The graves have clearly also functioned as landmarks, being located in highly visible places on the coastal cliffs.

The degree of authenticity of the site area is very high, in relation to both the individual graves and the surrounding natural landscape. Owing to its remote location and the appreciation of the local inhabitants, the site has been preserved almost untouched in its pristine natural surroundings. The ancient site is surrounded by a mainly natural landscape devoid of later structures such as houses, highways, and power lines.

#### Criteria iii and iv

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and description

#### History

The Scandinavian Bronze Age culture, from 1500 BC to 500 BC, included the coastal zone of continental Finland and the land archipelago. Bronze is extensively represented in its material culture, although neither copper nor tin is to be found in the area, the metals being largely acquired through trade and exchange. The value of the objects is enhanced by their association with burials and religious sites, such as cairns and other types of grave.

Stone burial cairns constructed of boulders, without earth fill, over cists of stone or wood, were erected on cliffs with a view on the sea all along the coast of Finland; more than 3000 have been identified. They contained both cremation and inhumation burials of members of the community with all the associated funerary objects (grave goods)..

The site of Sammallahdenmäki is associated with sun worship rituals, a cult which spread from Scandinavia over the entire region. It is also a manifestation of land ownership by kinship groups, a practice introduced with agriculture. At the time the hill of Sammallahdenmäki was completely bare of trees and was probably chosen for its unimpeded view of the sea and its openness to the sun in all directions.

Four cairns were excavated in 1891, leading to a better understanding of their contents and of their use. The number of known cairns is greater than the number of known settlements from this period. Thus, the spread of human population can be better observed through the distribution of graves. Many cairns are directly associated with settlements, most probably those of their builders, but the settlement of the people buried at Sammallahdenmäki has not yet been identified

#### Description

The Sammallahdenmäki cemetery includes 33 burial cairns and is the largest and best cairn site in all Finland; of the cairns, 28 can be securely dated to the Early Bronze Age. They lie along the crest and upper slopes of a 700m long ridge, and are disposed in several distinct clusters.

The structures were built using granite boulders that were quarried from the cliff face below the crest of the ridge or collected from the site itself. Some are also built in drystone masonry. They can be classified into several different groups according to their shapes and sizes: small low round cairns, large mound-like cairns, and round walled cairns. They enclose cists made from stone slabs.

The site also contains two unusual structures. One is oval and elongated (24m by 7.5-8m), and seems to have been enlarged in three successive stages. It contains only charcoal, no bones of any sort having ever been found. The other is a large quadrangular cairn, known as the "Church Floor" (*Kirkonlaatia*), which is unique in Finland and extremely rare in Scandinavia. Its surface is flat, it has no outer wall,

and the layer of stones are thinner towards the centre. Excavations revealed an internal structure in the centre made of stone flags. It is still difficult to determine whether this structure is linked with religious ceremonies or whether it is a tomb.

None of the Sammallahdenmäki cairns have produced any bronze implements. Their layout and location indicates that these cairns most probably belong to the Early Bronze Age.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The cairn area nominated for inscription, which covers 35ha, is protected under the provisions of the Finnish Antiquities Act (295/63), which makes it an offence to dig, cover, change, harm, or remove an ancient monument without prior authorization of the National Board of Antiquities (Museovirasto). The boundaries of the site and of its buffer zone (55ha) were defined in 1993 by the provincial government in agreement with the National Board.

The site and its surroundings are also protected by means of the Finnish regional planning system. Regional plans, which must be approved by the Ministry of the Environment, constitute the most stringent form of legislative protection in Finland. In the successive Regional Plans for Satakunta from 1985 to the present, the buffer zone is listed as a "cultural-historically important environment as defined on the basis of landscape, historical, architectural-historical or architectural-artistic criteria."

### *Management*

The site is in private ownership.

The National Board of Antiquities is responsible for the management of the site. There is no permanent staff specifically charged with the promotion or the maintenance of the site.

Agriculture is the only form of development allowed in the area. No type of construction or clear felling is permitted without prior authorization from the responsible agency. The buffer zone consists mostly of outcrops, fields, and forested areas. It is adjacent to the Saarnijärvi Natural Preserve, a protected natural area.

The management plan for the site drawn up by the National Board of Antiquities aims at keeping it in an untouched state. Maintenance is limited to clearing fallen branches and trees from the site and its paths, and the removal of deciduous saplings from the cairns themselves. No more than a few days are considered to be needed each year for this purpose. Visitor access is directed by means of marked paths. The natural aspect of the site is considered to be of significant value in understanding and presenting it.

Some 100 people visit the area annually, mainly local schoolchildren. The area is accessible to tourists by marked routes from major highways. An interpretation board displays information on the site and guided

tours can be organized through the National Board of Antiquities.

The site is part of the "Footsteps of the Forefathers" touring route developed by a local tourist society. This initiative is included in a larger project of Site Register for Prehistory Touring.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

The site was first mentioned in 1878 in an inventory of ancient sites in the region. Some excavation is said to have been carried out on some of the cairns but no account of the results is known to exist. The first scientific excavation took place in 1891, revealing the presence of 17 cairns. A survey in 1961 noted the presence of 26 cairns, and a regional mapping project in 1990 registered a total of 33 cairns.

Little restoration or reconstruction has been thought necessary. The cairns excavated in 1891 and in recent years have been restored to their original state. Some cairns that were plundered in the 19th century have been left in the state that they were in after these illegal interventions since no information is available on their original shape and size.

### *Authenticity*

The degree of authenticity of the site is very high. The cairns are built of granite, which does not erode easily. The surroundings have remained untouched and the cairns themselves have been subject to very little disturbance, apart from the handful that were plundered in the 19th century and those that have been excavated. The remote location of the site has protected it from development, and the local population has taken pride in protecting it.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in May 1999 (an earlier visit was precluded because of the climatic conditions in the region).

### *Qualities*

The site of Sammallahdenmäki offers a valuable perspective on the Bronze Age in the area. The completeness and the integrity of the site make it an invaluable resource for future research on the social behaviour of societies of the time.

### *Comparative analysis*

ICOMOS consulted Professor John Coles (formerly University of Cambridge, UK), who is recognized as the leading expert on the Bronze Age of northern Europe, on the comparative cultural significance of the Sammallahdenmäki cemetery. In his report he stressed that "the cairns are ... spectacular in the setting, ... they are mostly unexamined, and are remote," and as a result "they present a quite unrivalled picture of the Bronze Age landscape untrammelled by modern

rubbish such as traffic and power lines ... [the site] is well worthy of very serious consideration for listing.”

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The decision to leave the environment of the monuments untouched is welcomed, since it increases the opportunity to study their environmental context.

However, the State Party should be encouraged to make provision for the impact of eventual inscription on the World Heritage List, which would inevitably result in greatly increased visitor numbers. There is a need for promotion at a national and international level so as to raise public awareness of the scientific and symbolic value of this site.

The ICOMOS expert mission was provided with details of the management plan currently being prepared (in conformity with the ICCROM-UNESCO-ICOMOS *Management Guidelines for World Heritage Sites*). These have four levels of priority: Priority A deals with the recording and physical protection of the cairns, Priority B with interpretation (signage, leaflets, etc) and consultation with the local community, Priority C with improvement of the setting of the cairns (including management of the tree cover), disabled access, and contingency plans for a limited increase in visitor numbers, and Priority D with contingency plans for substantially increased numbers.

ICOMOS commends the State Party for the action that it is taking. It feels, however, that higher priority should be given to planning to cope with the anticipated increase in visitor numbers.

#### **Brief description**

The more than thirty granite burial cairns of the Bronze Age cemetery at Sammallahdenmäki bear exceptional witness to the social and religious structures of northern Europe more than three millennia ago.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and iv*:

**Criterion iii** The Sammallahdenmäki cairn cemetery bears exceptional witness to the society of the Bronze Age of Scandinavia.

**Criterion iv** The Sammallahdenmäki cemetery is an outstanding example of Bronze Age funerary practices in Scandinavia.

## Saint-Emilion (France)

No 932

### Identification

*Nomination* The ancient jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion (including the communes of Saint-Christophe-des-Bardes, Saint-Emilion, Saint-Etienne-de-Lisse, Saint-Hippolyte, Saint-Laurent-des-Combes, Saint-Pey-d'Armens, Saint-Sulpice-de-Faleyrons, and Vignonet)

*Location* Aquitaine Région, Gironde Département

*State Party* France

*Date* 30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The site of the ancient jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion bears exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition and a living civilization, that of winemaking. **Criterion iii**

It provides an outstanding example of both a high-quality architectural ensemble, in particular the religious and civil buildings of the commune of Saint-Emilion, and also of a landscape that illustrates several important periods of human history, such as the occupation of natural caves in prehistory and the use of geographical and climatic resources in order to create a special form of land use. **Criterion iv**

It is a striking example of settlement that is representative of a culture and unique testimony to perfect symbiosis between land, human beings, and production. **Criterion v**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

The first traces of human settlement in the Saint-Emilion region date back at least to the Upper Palaeolithic (35,000-10,000 BC). The Pierrefitte menhir confirms human presence in the 5th-4th millennia BC. The region was heavily populated during the Celtic-Gaulish period, as testified by an *oppidum* (defended hillfort) on the plateau overlooking modern Saint-Emilion.

The Roman occupation began when Augustus created the province of *Aquitania* in 27 BC. With the prosperity of *Burdigala* (Bordeaux), Valerius Probus used his legions to fell the *Cumbris* forest in AD 275 BC and created the first vineyards by grafting new varieties of grape on the *Vitis biturica* that grew naturally in the region. There are considerable traces of Roman occupation, especially rich villas, and it was here that the Latin poet Ausonius retired when he withdrew from public affairs in the 4th century.

The first Christian monasteries appear at the beginning of the 7th century. Legend has it that in the mid 8th century a Breton monk, Emilian, sought asylum here from the Benedictine community and led an eremitic life in a cave. His numerous miracles attracted many companions, who lived according to the rule of St Benedict. It was they who began to build the great monolithic church, which was not to be completed for another three centuries. Since the region was on the Pilgrimage Route to Santiago de Compostela, from the 11th century onwards it experienced great prosperity and many monasteries, churches, and other religious buildings were founded. To construct the many large stone buildings that this entailed, the excellent limestone of the region was quarried extensively, an industry that continued until well into the 18th century.

When Eleanor of Aquitaine married Henry Plantagenet (later Henry II of England), the town of Saint-Emilion, by then fortified, became part of the English kingdom, along with all Guyenne. King John granted the town full liberties in 1199.

In 1224, when this part of Guyenne had been recovered for France, Louis VIII began work on the Royal Castle, not to be completed until 1237, by Henry III of England. In 1298 Edward I signed a decree defining the limits of the jurisdiction. Five years later it became once again part of France under Philippe Le Bel, though it was to change hands repeatedly in the course of the Hundred Years' War.

In 1453 it became French permanently, and three years later Charles VII confirmed all the privileges granted by the English to the town to help it re-establish itself. It was to suffer again during the Wars of Religion in the later 16th century and, despite the efforts of Louis XIV, it lost its leading position to Libourne. As a result the town retained its medieval appearance until the 18th century, when its fortifications were dismantled. Profound social changes were introduced during the Revolution which destroyed the old order, dating from the Middle Ages, and many of the ancient buildings were demolished or fell into ruins.

These had an adverse effect on the vineyards, and it was not until 1853 that Saint-Emilion started to recover, thanks to its vineyards. During the 12th and 13th centuries these had produced what were known as *vins honorifiques* (known in English as "Royal wines") because they were presented as gifts to kings and important people, which gives an indication of their quality. A regulatory body known as *La Jurade* monitored the quality of the wine of Saint-Emilion and granted this appellation to a limited number of wines.

The demands of Flemish consumers in the 18th century led to an increase in viticulture, since the quality of the Saint-Emilion wines enabled them to be transported by sea without the wine turning into vinegar. That century saw the

quality of the wines from the region becoming recognized as exceptional, as witnessed by countless records of the period. During the Second Empire production of red wines in the region became generalized, replacing the white wines that had been most common in the medieval period. Their distribution was greatly facilitated by the opening in 1853 of the railway line between Paris and Bordeaux.

In 1867 the Saint-Emilion wines were awarded the Gold Medal of the Universal Exhibition, followed by the highest award, the *Grand Prix Collectif*, of the 1889 Universal Exhibition. *La Jurade*, which had been suppressed during the Revolution, was restored in 1948, and continues to ensure the quality of the Saint-Emilion wines.

The first classification of the Saint-Emilion wines by the Institut National des Appellations d'Origine (AOC) was in 1954, when four grades were defined. These were reduced to two - *Saint-Emilion* and *Saint-Emilion Grand Cru* - in 1984. By comparison with other vineyard regions of the Bordelais, Saint-Emilion has been noteworthy for its innovations, such as the establishment of the first wine syndicate in 1884 and the first cooperative cellars in the Gironde in 1932.

At the present time the Saint-Emilion vineyards produce an average of 230,00 hectolitres of wine (all red) annually, representing 10% of the AOC wines of the Gironde.

#### *Description*

The 7846ha that are the subject of this nomination cover eight communes, corresponding with the jurisdiction established in the 12th century by John (Lackland), King of England. It is bounded on the north by the Barbanne, a tributary of the Isle, on the south by the Dordogne, on the west by the territory of Libourne, and on the east by that of Castillon-la-Bataille.

The relief is characterized by a stratum of limestone defined by shelves that crisscross the landscape. This disappears to the north, along with the soft sandstone that it overlies, and is replaced by a heterogeneous mixture of clayey sands and gravels, dipping towards the south. Two slopes are clearly distinguishable: the northern one is gentle and cut by valleys, the southern steeply plunging into the Dordogne valley and forming concave valleys (*combes*), in one of which the town of Saint-Emilion is situated.

The climate is admirably suited to viticulture - mild wet winters that begin late in the year, equally late, hot summers, and sunny autumns that encourage the ripening of the grapes. As a result, the landscape presents a monoculture, that of vineyards exclusively, and occupying some 5400ha, ie more than 67.5% of the total area. Apart from the human settlements, the only other traces of exploitation are the abandoned underground quarries, which supplied limestone for the religious and public buildings of Bordeaux and its hinterland until the 18th century.

The long history of winemaking had produced its own characteristic monuments and architecture. However, before viticulture predominated, medieval and Renaissance castles were built on dominant sites as seigneurial residences. Examples are the 13th century Château Laroque (Saint-Christophe-des-Bardes), the 14th century

Château de Preyssac (Saint-Etienne-de-Lisse), and the 16th century Château Ferrand (Saint-Hippolyte).

By contrast, the "vineyard" castles are located at the centre of their respective domains. They range in date from the mid 18th century (Château Ausone, Château Canon) through the early 19th century (Château Cheval-Blanc, Château Mondot) to the late 19th and early 20th centuries (Château Laroze, Château La Gaffalière). The earlier buildings are in a relatively sober classical style, but the later ones are more extravagant.

Settlements are characterized by modest stone houses, most dating from the first half of the 19th century. They never have more than two storeys, and are found in small groups, for the use of vineyard workers. The *chais* (wine storehouses) are large functional rectangular structures built in stone or a mixture of brick and stone, with tiled double-pitched roofs. They began to be built in the 1930s, either as new constructions or as adaptations of earlier structures.

The towns and villages in the region have a number of historic monuments. At Saint-Emilion the most significant religious monuments are *L'Hermitage* or *La Grotte de Saint-Emilion*, the "Monolithic Church" (*Eglise Monolithique*), with its bell-tower, the medieval monastic catacombs, and the Collegiate Church (*Eglise Collégiale*) with its cloister. This ensemble, mostly Romanesque in origin, clusters around the pilgrimage centre of the hermit-saint. There is also a group of secular monuments, including the massive keep of the *Château du Roi* and the elegant ruins of the *Palais Cardinal*. There are fine churches of Romanesque origin at all the other seven villages. The enormous Pierrefitte menhir is in the commune of Saint-Sulpice-de-Faleyrens.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

Since June 1968 Saint-Emilion has been a Protected Site; the designation includes all the medieval city. In 1986 a Protected Zone (*Secteur Sauvegardé*) was created under the provisions of the 1962 "Loi Malraux." Many individual monuments and sites in all eight communes are also protected by law.

Saint-Emilion, Saint-Christophe-des Bardes, and Saint-Sulpice-de-Faleyrens have statutory Land Use Plans (*Plans d'Occupation des Sols - POS*), which regulate all forms of development within their boundaries.

The wine-producing areas are protected by means of a 1980 decree from the Ministry of Agriculture which designates the group of communes producing AOC wines to be of public interest. Further statutory instruments from 1990 and 1998 regulate any interventions on the land that might be prejudicial to its integrity.

In 1991 the forest areas at the summit of the plateau on the territories of five of the communes were inscribed as a "natural zone of ecological, faunal, and floral interest" in the ZNIEFF inventory. This has no statutory force, but it is a factor in drawing up TPOs, and they already figure in those of Saint-Christophe-des-Bardes and Saint-Emilion.

##### *Management*

Ownership of the individual properties that make up this nomination is vested in a range of private citizens and institutions and public bodies at different levels of government.

There is no overall management plan for the entire region, but three communes have POS. However, in 1966 the *Syndicat Intercommunal à Vocation Multiple* (SIVOM) of the Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion, covering the eight communes, was set up to coordinate "works and services of common interest for all the communes." Among the subjects that it has addressed is the protection and preservation of the historic monuments within the Jurisdiction. It has been used by Saint-Emilion to remove all television antennas from the town.

The Saint-Emilion SIVOM is currently preparing an integral conservation plan for the entire architectural and landscape heritage protection area, with the support of the Regional Council for Aquitaine and the Gironde Natural Council.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

There is a long tradition of systematic conservation of the main religious and secular buildings in the region, and especially of those which are protected under French monuments legislation. As a result the ensemble has an overall high level of conservation. Consolidation is in progress on the protected buildings, and the Saint-Emilion POS is being implemented to ensure that the streetscape of the town is properly maintained, with no new constructions in the vicinity of historic monuments.

### *Authenticity*

The level of authenticity is high in the urban areas; this can be confirmed by reference to historic plans and photographs.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the nominated area in January 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Saint-Emilion Jurisdiction and its eight communes constitute an outstanding ensemble of indisputable monumental and landscape value. The many individual monuments in the region, some of them of exceptional value, such as the Pierrefitte menhir or the church of Saint-Emilion, admirably symbolize the course of history in the region and the richness of the different cultures that have left their imprint there, creating a priceless monumental heritage. They derive a special character from the way in which they have been adapted to the needs of human existence. However, the most significant quality is the way in which all these activities have been adapted to conform with the characteristics of the landscape. Without destroying it, human communities have made the most of these characteristics in landscape's conditionings to develop their work and way of life. Exploitation of material resources by quarrying, the establishment and

development of urban settlement, the building of churches, monasteries, and dwelling houses - all have come together to create a brotherhood in perfect harmony with the topography. The search for quality, respect for the soil, and development of production techniques have both ensured the survival and consolidated the beauty of the ensemble.

For this reason the Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion conforms completely with the second category of the organically evolved landscape (*Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 39) - the continuing landscape which retains an active social role in contemporary society closely associated with the traditional way of life in which the evolutionary process is still in progress and at the same time exhibits significant material evidence of its evolution over time.

### *Comparative analysis*

ICOMOS is of the opinion that Saint-Emilion is exceptional, uniting as it does monuments of outstanding quality which have survived intact over time with a landscape of great beauty and stability such as to justify its inclusion in the World Heritage List. *ICOMOS comments*

Although all the area proposed for inscription is protected by various laws, it lacks an integrated plan which defines and evaluates the components of the landscape and establishes general provisions for the formulation of more precisely defined management plans.

This lack was pointed out during the ICOMOS expert mission to the competent authorities, which are prepared to start work on such a plan with the minimum delay. ICOMOS does not believe that further consideration of this nomination should be deferred to await the completion and implementation of this plan, but it is of the opinion that there must be serious commitment on the part of the State Party to urgent action.

In the light of the fact that further nominations of vineyard landscapes may be anticipated in future years, a comparative study of similar properties at European level will be initiated by ICOMOS.

## Recommendation

That this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and iv*:

**Criterion iii** The Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion is an outstanding example of an historic vineyard landscape that has survived intact and in activity to the present day.

**Criterion iv** The intensive cultivation of grapes for wine production in a precisely defined region and the resulting landscape is illustrated in an exceptional way by the historic Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion.

It is suggested that the title of the property should be shortened by the omission of the *commune* names.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Loire Valley (France)

No 933

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Loire Valley between Maine and Sully-sur-Loire
<i>Location</i>	Départements of Loiret, Loir-et-Cher, Indre-et-Loire, and Maine-et-Loire, Régions of Centre and Pays de la Loire
<i>State Party</i>	France
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

During the Renaissance the Loire Valley between Sully-sur-Loire and Maine was an important cultural area for meetings and influences between Mediterranean Italy, *la douce France*, and Flanders. This cultural area witnessed the emergence of a landscape civilization, first French, then European, which produced some of the most perfect models for modern landscapes.

The inhabitants of the Valley certainly cultivated, cared for, and loved to contemplate their land before the Renaissance, managing it according to the classic sequence *domus-hortus-ager-saltus* between the two great natural environments of the river and the surrounding forest. However, it was from the Renaissance, alongside the appearance of the word “landscape” in Europe, that original development of this spatial organization began to be represented in the form of writings, paintings, and gardens created as the aesthetic, and more specifically landscape, models needed to be able to speak of cultural landscapes.

Before the Renaissance the earliest literary accounts of these landscapes were those of Charles d’Orléans and then, in a different way, of Rabelais, whose Abbey of Thélème is still today a symbolic model. With the arrival of the Renaissance the main writers on landscape were Pierre de Ronsard, Honorat de Racan, and Joachim du Bellay. Their works described and celebrated the beauties of these landscapes, at times comparing them favourably with other famous examples, such as that of Rome, where Du Bellay spent time.

In parallel with these celebrations of the land, representations in the form of gardens that were laid out according to aesthetic principles, and which were more than simple subsistence gardens decorated with flowers, accompanied the transformation of the great medieval castles into country houses (*châteaux*) for pleasure and diversion. In these very numerous gardens, *l’aquosité*, a typical Renaissance term meaning enjoyment of water in all its forms, whether still, running, or gushing forth, which has nowadays fallen into disuse, took its place alongside the love of plants and

animals in the designs, considerably expanding the dimensions and the aspirations of medieval gardens.

This emergence of new models, celebrated by poets and laid out by architects, was not a passing fashion. The movement born out of Humanism on the banks of the Loire evolved and expanded over the centuries to become modern. The Loire landscapes were to establish themselves and contribute smoothly to the development of the modern landscape.

In the 17th century the Loire landscapes were celebrated by Jean de la Fontaine and the Marquise de Sévigné. The art of the garden led to the great classic masterpieces in which *l’aquosité* developed such a high profile that gardens became in a sense laboratories of the “hydraulic architecture” that was to reach its climax in the great canals of the Age of Enlightenment.

The Loire landscapes were celebrated in the writings of, among others, Alfred de Vigny, Gustave Flaubert, Honoré de Balzac, Charles Baudelaire, and even Victor Hugo, whose romantic sensibility was in full agreement with that of Turner, the most important painter of the Loire. The Loire Valley was also studied and celebrated by a glittering array of geographers. Some of them, the two Reclus for example, went so far as to talk of “the most beautiful realm under the heavens” and to assert that the middle reaches of the Loire had “more than any other province contributed to the birth and development of the nation.” The great pioneers of modern tourism – the Joannes, Abel Hugo, and Ardouin-Dumazet – joined their voices to those of these scholars to make the Valley one of the main tourist destinations of Europe and then of the world, a role that it continues to occupy. The 19th century witnessed the growth of pictorial and photographic depictions of the river, which played a part in the spread of its fame and in strengthening the will to protect the treasures of its heritage, a phenomenon that began in the mid 19th century and persists to the present day.

In fact, pictorial representations of the Loire landscapes were later than those in literature and in gardens. René Bazin attributed this timelag to the difficulty of painting the Loire because of the vast dimensions of the valley and its “delicate and hazy light which gives no deep shadows, no contrast.” It is true that in the Seine Valley painters could find viewpoints that would allow them to take in the river in its totality, from one line of hills to the other, so as to be able produce a framed view of the river. The size of the Loire is such that this type of framing is almost impossible, with the exception of those elements that painters and engravers generally took advantage of – the bridges, the quays, and the urban facades of its towns, all of which were often depicted from early on. This was the case in the 19th century with Joseph Mallord William Turner; however, he was able to create other viewpoints and, in addition, to use the transparency of watercolours to suggest the delicacy of the light of the Loire Valley. The series of paintings that he made during his journey between Nantes and Orléans in 1826 is both a monument and a dedication.

It is a source of regret that Delacroix, who painted the Loire with a sensibility that foreshadowed modern works of art, did not devote himself more to subjects that were so worthy of his visions of grandeur. It must finally be regretted that Stendhal appears not to have known the main work, because his romantic genius would doubtless have discovered a dimension in these landscapes that he appears to have known nothing about.

There have been many painters of the Loire in the modern period, such as Debré, Boller, Kolsek, and Verdenet, but there have been many more photographers. In the Loire Valley, as in many of the natural mountain landscapes discovered in the last century, photography has been able to go beyond the limitations of painting in order to express the monumental and grandiose character of the river. Nevertheless, these graphic representations have not replaced those of writers and poets. In this long list, the name of Maurice Genevoix first comes to mind, but the many others who have found their sources of inspiration in the Loire, such as Charles Péguy, René Bazin, René Boylesve, Julien Gracq, Francis Ponge, and those who made up the Loire School at the end of the last century around Hubert-Fillay.

The celebration over the years of artists, not only those from the region but also from elsewhere in France and abroad, have all contributed to the growth of the Loire myth. They have all described at length and often addressed the Loire with the admiration mixed with respect and fear appropriate for a very high personage, in fact to a royal personage. One very recent work, which summarizes the unanimous opinion, celebrates the Loire as a queen, with the middle reaches as the crown. As such she is worthy of admiration, of respect, and of fear, for which monarch, although subject to the demands of the etiquette and rituals of his role, would not preserve a royal freedom to be moved to rages that are sometimes devastating? This is how it is with the Loire in her kingdom. Conscious of the requirements of rank, she submits to the constraints from the knowledge and needs of her subjects and allows her course to be managed in order to shower them better with her benefits, yet remaining royally free. Is the Loire “the last untamed river in Europe?” It is rather “the last free river in Europe.”

#### **Criterion ii**

The landscape models developed during the Renaissance in the Loire Valley were based on the spatial distribution system *domus-hortus-ager-saltus*. The contribution of the Renaissance can be measured by the impact that it had on three of these elements.

The major contribution was the metamorphosis of the *hortus* into a pleasure garden attached to a grand house and then, over time, to other residences and finally becoming a very large part of the space separating the two *saltus* from the river on one side and the forest on the other. It was not because this space was explicitly designed as a pleasure garden, but because types of cultivation connected specifically with gardens, in particular orchards and vineyards, where pruning and especial care play a major role, gradually took over most of the space, often replacing the arable fields of the *ager*. This extension of the garden and its techniques to the Loire Valley lands between the river and the forest found its most pronounced expression in Touraine, early celebrated as the Garden of France and itself often put forward as the representative model for the whole national territory: is France not first, for many people, a country whose most striking quality is that of being a garden?

The other models in the Valley during the Renaissance relate to buildings, in the form of the famous *châteaux* but also its towns and villages. The towns are all ports, laid out on a simple and effective plan which picks up the Roman *cardo* and *decumanus*. Thus the main elements are the quay flanked by the esplanade and the built-up river front; at right-angles are the river, which is extended by the main street on or near which is the main square, surrounded by public

buildings. These are the features most depicted and disseminated by designers and engravers. The villages are divided into those built at the foot of the hills on the highest flood terrace and those on the slopes themselves along the main communication routes, such as the Paris-Tours road. Today these models seem so complete in their design and function that they form an integral part of the image of the Loire and benefit from careful protection and restoration activities. Thus, the Loire bridges destroyed during World War II were rebuilt to their original design.

As for the two *saltus*, the river itself on one side and the forest on the other, they also bear the imprint of the creators of the Renaissance and in their turn served as examples in the organization of other landscapes, as, for example, in the transformation of the large forests into royal hunting parks. Elements that can still be discerned in the Loire forests, like that of Chambord, such as straight alleys several kilometres long, clearings, and crossroads, are to be found later in all the forests of the Ile-de-France, and gave rise to the famous series of maps known as the *Cartes des Chasses*, one of the most famous manifestations of which is the water-colour series of the Abbé Lagrive.

#### **Criterion iv**

#### **Category of property**

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a cultural landscape, as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

#### **History and Description**

##### *History*

The Loire Valley was important over much of pre- and protohistory. The Roman impact on the landscape was massive, and it today still strongly influences settlement location and form (especially urban) and road communications. The Loire was one of the most important arteries for communications and trade in Gaul.

In the late Roman period St Martin, Bishop of Tours, founded an abbey at Marmoutier around 372, and this was to serve as the model for many other monastic settlements in the Loire Valley in the centuries that followed. The sanctuary at Tours was one of the most important pilgrimage centres in Europe until it was superseded by Santiago de Compostela. The many monasteries served as focal points for settlement in the Middle Ages.

Seigneurial power developed in the 10th century and made a profound impression on the landscape. Land allotment followed the patterns of feudal society and strongly fortified residences were built by the overlords. These, too, acted as focal points for settlement. The Loire Valley was a frontier zone during the Hundred Years' War and the scene of many confrontations between French and English. The castles were rebuilt and extended to become massive fortresses, the forerunners of the *châteaux* of today.

The ever-present danger to Paris from the English during the War resulted in the Royal court spending long periods at Tours. With the end of the War in the mid 15th century the Valley was an ideal place for Humanism and the Renaissance

to take root in France. This involved *inter alia* the dismantling of the massive medieval fortresses and their reconstruction as palaces for pleasure and recreation.

The 17th-18th centuries saw the development of a secular commercial economy based on industry, crafts, trade, shipping, the river, and the towns alongside the feudal survival of the *Ancien Régime*. The late 18th century also saw the first water-management controls introduced in the Valley; these were intensified throughout the 19th century.

The romantic representation of the Valley in the 19th century by writers and painters led to the Loire becoming a magnet for tourists, first from France, then Europe, and then in the 20th century the rest of the world. This interest in the scenic qualities of the Valley and its monuments encouraged efforts to preserve the heritage of the landscape, in the form of its monuments, its towns, and its rural structure.

#### *Description*

The basin of the River Loire occupies a huge area in central and western France, stretching from the southern part of the Massif Central to an estuary on the Atlantic coast. Some 200km of the central part of the main river valley are the subject of this proposal, stretching from Sully east of Orleans to the junction of the Loire and the Maine near Angers in the west. Essentially this is the “new” Loire, for the river originally drained north-eastwards into the Paris basin. This length now lies in two Régions, Centre and Pays de la Loire, and four Départements.

The valley runs almost exclusively from west-south-west to east-north-east along the length of the proposed World Heritage cultural landscape and is much affected by the prevailing south-westerly wind. The Loire itself is fed direct by two long tributaries running off the Massif Central some 350km to the south. In the length nominated for inscription there are numerous other tributaries, all coming in from the south and including three important ones, the Cher, the Indre, and the Vienne. They substantially drain areas of limestone, clays, and sands, producing significant deposits in the valleys.

Along the Loire between Orléans and Angers, the valley is characterized by low cliffs of tufa and limestone and, often below one or more river terraces, there is a flood plain dissected by old channels. The river itself contains many islands and gravel and sand banks; it also fluctuates significantly in depth and width from season to season and year to year. Some of the flood plain is regularly under water in winter, a phenomenon welcomed as refreshment for the soil rather than a hazard. The valley has, however, a long history of periodic catastrophic flooding, carefully recorded as stone-cut water levels at numerous places along it, and even today its inhabitants live perennially under threat of severe inundation. Much contemporary river management is concerned to minimize that risk.

For most of its length in the proposed area the Loire is confined within dykes. Its banks are also punctuated at intervals of only a few kilometres by a series of villages, small towns, and cities. Notable among the urban settlements are (from north-east to south-west) Sully, Orleans, Blois, Amboise, Tours, Saumur, and Angers. Land-use is extremely varied, from urban density through intense horticulture to vineyards (some reliant on flooding) to hunting forest. In general, the economy of the region is buoyant, only in part based on a tourist industry primarily concerned to extol a

quality of life associated with the heritage in general and the *chateaux* in particular.

The area selected for nomination is characterized by an integrity of heritage values. Many of the individual monuments and urban settlements are in themselves of great heritage value; they are to be seen, in the words of the nomination dossiers, as “precious stones in a diadem.” It is the overall landscape that has evolved over time that is considered to be of outstanding universal value, and so the nomination concentrates on the Loire Valley as a cultural landscape (as does this evaluation).

#### **Management and Protection**

The nominated area covers 745km<sup>2</sup> and is surrounded by a buffer zone of 400km<sup>2</sup>.

Ownership of the myriad individual properties that make up the nominated area is varied, ranging through descending levels of government body to private individuals. The river itself and its banks are public property.

Protection is similarly very diverse in nature. Different natural areas may be listed under the 1930 Law on the Protection of Sites, designated as natural reserves, biotopes, natural zones of ecological, floral, and faunal interest (ZNIEFF), or important bird-conservation zones (ZICO), or included within a regional natural park. All these forms of legal designation involve varying measures of control over human interventions.

Cultural monuments may be protected under the 1931 Law on Historic Monuments, they may be protected areas (*Secteurs sauvegardés*) or zones for the protection of the architectural, urban, and landscape heritage (ZPPAUP).

The French Government decided in 1994 to implement a ten-year master plan for the coherent planning and management of the Loire Valley (*Plan Loire Grandeur Nature*). This covers the protection of the environment and the economic development of the area. It is operated in close collaboration with the relevant organizations and institutions – territorial collectivities, economic agencies, and associations. The following are the main objectives: protection of the inhabitants against flooding; specific planning measures for the Middle and Lower Loire; measures to ensure that water demands can be met; and restoration of the ecological diversity. In 1997 a “landscape” section was added to this plan; among other features, it envisages increasing the number of protected historic monuments in the nominated area.

Overall supervision of the nominated landscape at national level is exercised by the Ministry of Land Use Planning and the Environment (Directorate of Nature and Landscapes, Sub-Directorate of Sites and Landscapes) and by the Ministry of Culture and Communication (Directorate of the Heritage, Sub-Directorate of Historic Monuments). The Centre and Pays de la Loire Régions each have Regional Directorates of the Environment and of Cultural Affairs, and the Départements of Loiret, Maine-et-Loire, Loir-et-Cher, Loire-Atlantique, and Indre-et-Loire have Departmental Services of Architecture and Heritage.

On the perimeter of the nominated area is to be found the Loire-Anjou-Touraine Regional Natural Park whose management is covered by its charter.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Conservation of the different and diverse elements that make up the nominated area has been in progress at varying rates over a long period. Most of the *châteaux* and many other historic buildings have been protected as historic monuments or sites for many years, a number of them since the beginning of the present century at least. With the enactment of the 1962 Law, a number of urban centres were protected as *Secteurs sauvegardés*, and ZPAUPP were declared in several villages following the promulgation of the 1983 Law.

All of these actions of designation and protection have brought in their train systematic programmes of conservation.

### *Authenticity*

When assessed as a cultural landscape, the Loire Valley exhibits a high degree of authenticity. Its historical trajectory can plainly be seen in the present-day landscape. There are some obtrusive modern features, such as recent mineral extraction, a concentration of overhead electric lines, and some low-quality modern housing, including mobile homes, at certain points. However, regulation of this type of intrusion is covered in the master plan.

Since this nomination is of a cultural landscape, it would not be appropriate to consider the authenticity of every natural or cultural component. However, it may be relevant to note that the ICOMOS expert mission report commented favourably on the overall authenticity of materials and design at the numerous cultural monuments that it visited.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Loire Valley in March 1999.

### *Qualities*

The dynamic relationship between the river and the landscape that has grown up along its valley over two millennia is a powerful one. The diversity of settlement reflects both the physical characteristics of different sections of the river and their historical evolution. The settlement pattern ranges from isolated farms through villages to small and important provincial towns. The social and political history of France and of western Europe in the Middle Ages and the Renaissance is illustrated by the series of magnificent great houses (*châteaux*) for which the Loire Valley is famous. The land-use patterns are also richly indicative of social and economic change over the past millennium.

### *Comparative analysis*

Great rivers have played a fundamental role in the evolution and spread of culture: the great Old World civilizations can clearly be seen to have evolved along waterways such as the Tigris/Euphrates, the Nile, the Indus, the Mekong, and the Yangtze. In Europe the Danube, the Rhine, and the Rhône

have all been cultural and economic vectors of great significance.

The special character of the Loire is the coherence of its relationship with its natural environment. All rivers and their valleys exhibit abundant traces of the course of their use and settlement over time. However, this is more clearly evident and better preserved in its historical integrity in the valley of the Loire, which is a paradigm of human interaction within a riverine cultural landscape.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The ICOMOS mission report contains a number of recommendations:

- Boundaries
- At the important junction of the Vienne the boundary should encompass a triangular excursion from Montsoreau to take in Fontevraud Abbey. Fontevraud was the large and important aristocratic religious centre dominating the Loire valley in its day and, with its Plantagenet connections, now claims a role as “Cultural Centre of the West.” It should also be included as an exemplar of the standard of care and style of presentation the proposed World Heritage site needs.
- More of the valley around Rochecorbon should be included to embrace at least a sample of the caves, dwellings, and fine viticulture-related architecture in its vicinity: together they form a characteristic type of landscape within the larger proposal with elements which are perhaps under-represented.
- A deviation should be made in the boundary at Amboise to allow for the inclusion of the Pagode de Chanteloup and its allée, still visible in the fields and suburbs running as a straight line from the town to the site of the former chateau. Some carefully defined small area around the pagoda might therefore be included in the cultural landscape, if only to give the striking vertical structure a presence in the horizontal dimension.
- Further consideration should be given to the inclusion of the Château de Cheverny, celebrated for its classical architectural style and its interior decoration and furnishings, in the nominated area.
- The status of the Château de Chambord, already on the World Heritage List, should be changed so that it becomes an integral part of the cultural landscape after inscription. The present proposal includes not only the château but also its large park to the south, making a large southwards extension to the proposed cultural landscape.
- An initial portion of the Loiret river should be included within the nominated area because of the water architecture of mills and the wine landscape and houses.
- The boundaries might well be conceived as including a World Heritage landscape with Angers and Orléans as the two portals. The natural beginning of the site would then be Orléans; an introductory centre for the World Heritage Site could be there, placed perhaps in its environs to the east nearer the *Autoroute* rather than in an already crowded city centre.
- Structural and action recommendations

- The area proposed for World Heritage status has a logic and coherence as a cultural landscape. For the appropriate and overall management of this area as a single site, it is strongly recommended an office dedicated to the Loire Valley should be established, led by a full-time director at an appropriate level of seniority. The proposed office would serve as a focus point for thought and action about the Loire Valley as a World Heritage Site cultural landscape.
  - The Plan Loire Grandeur Nature for the period 2000-2006 sets out a very suitable strategy and agenda. However, there is an urgent need for a management plan devoted to the proposed World Heritage site and its specific needs. The Parc Naturel Régional Loire-Anjou-Touraine can serve as an especially helpful model.
- Interpretation
- A natural concomitant to the proposal for the appointment of a director, the creation of an office and centre, and the preparation of a management plan is that consideration should be given to the provision of adequate interpretation, both to the local community and to outsiders, about the culture of the Loire Valley. The existing Maisons de Loire at Montlouis and elsewhere and the Museum de la Marine de Loire at Châteauneuf could serve as a basis and could form part of the network designed to interpret the Valley and its World Heritage dimension as a whole.
- Consultation

The ICOMOS expert mission was given the impression that the local communities have not been fully informed about or been given the opportunity to be participate in discussion about the World Heritage nomination and the cultural landscape concept. A programme of consultation and (mutual) education should be undertaken without delay, as required by paragraph 41 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### **Brief description**

The Loire Valley is an outstanding cultural landscape of great beauty, containing historic towns and villages, great architectural monuments (the *châteaux*), and cultivated lands that has been formed as a result of many centuries of interaction between human beings and their physical environment, and primarily the river Loire itself.

### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting adjustment of the boundaries of the nominated property, as recommended by ICOMOS, and assurances that action will be taken without delay to prepare an overall management plan for the proposed World Heritage site. In the event of this information being supplied in time for the meeting of the World Heritage Committee, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

*Criterion ii* The Loire Valley is an outstanding cultural landscape along a major river which bears witness to an interchange of human values and to a harmonious

development of interactions between human beings and their environment over two millennia.

*Criterion iv* The landscape of the Loire Valley, and more particularly its many cultural monuments, illustrate to an exceptional degree the ideals of the Renaissance and the Age of the Enlightenment on western European thought and design.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Magdeburg (Germany)

No 536

### Identification

*Nomination* Cathedral of St Maurice and St Catherine, Magdeburg

*Location* Land (State) of Sachsen-Anhalt

*State Party* Germany

*Date* 25 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Magdeburg Cathedral is a unique work of architecture and sculpture. This criterion is fulfilled by the unique status of the cathedral in the history of art, building, and architecture. Brilliant architects succeeded in merging various ideas and inspirations (from Burgundy and northern France, for example) with local traditions, thereby creating the first cathedral on German soil to a homogeneous design which, when compared with French Gothic, constituted a completely autonomous German Gothic cathedral.

#### Criterion i

Magdeburg Cathedral had an exceptionally strong influence on the development of architecture, monumental sculpture, and architectural sculpture and their impact reached far beyond the area of central Germany.

#### Criterion ii

Magdeburg Cathedral is graphic testimony to ideas and events which attained global significance. This is proved by the cathedral's outstanding role and position within medieval European history as an imperial palace church, a cathedral, and the tomb of Emperor Otto I. In this sense the cathedral is a symbol of the *renovatio* of the *Imperium Romanum* under the Saxon emperors of the 10th and 11th centuries.

Moreover, the role played by the Cathedral in Church history, as a springboard for converting the Slavs to Christianity, as the mother church of the archdiocese of Magdeburg established in 968, and as the base of St Norbert, founder of the Premonstratensian Order, should not be underestimated.

For these reasons, Magdeburg Cathedral is one of the outstanding examples of medieval culture. In textbook fashion, it reflects state politics and imperial aspirations to power, as well as theology and the history of ideas, which should also be regarded as the background for the outstanding quality of the architecture. As the burial place of the emperor and a bishop's cathedral, the building is a record of the Ottonian Age, while at the same time representing early German Gothic. It exerted a well attested political, cultural, and artistic influence over a

period of several centuries and across a large area.

Criterion vi

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

### History and Description

#### History

The importance of the cathedral as a symbol of the Ottonian period is difficult to overstate. A visit to the site gives a clearer understanding of the close *rapport* which developed between the work of the founder of the Holy Roman Empire and the site of Magdeburg. The rocky promontory on which the cathedral was built was once, in ancient times, a prominent landmark when set against the uncertain course of the Elbe, meandering around a string of marshy islands. The river marked a frontier with the Slav peoples whose lands stretched away to the east, and was thus firmly established, both in geographical reality and in the mind of the founder of the Empire, as a stronghold of the Holy Roman Empire gazing out at heathen peoples to be evangelized. The creation of the see of Magdeburg in 968 confirms this intention.

Like Charlemagne, Otto I wished to establish between Rome and his capital the same relations which had once existed between Rome and Aachen. Excavations in the northern area of the cathedral square have brought to light the foundations of the imperial palace. The profusion of classical antiquities brought back from Italy, which are known to have featured in the first cathedral and which are still numerous today, were intended to help establish the temporal and spiritual authority of the head of Western Christianity - a Christianity which, by means of military victories and conversion, eventually extended its sway as far as Poland.

The Ottonian cathedral in which the emperor was interred in 973, and which replaced the original abbey of Saint Maurice, was destroyed by fire in 1207. Construction of the cathedral in its present form began in 1209: Otto's sarcophagus occupies the centre of the choir, a material and spiritual testimony to the founding of the Holy Roman Empire.

#### Description

##### - Approaches

Although some of the approaches to the cathedral suffered less than the rest of the city from the 1945 bombing raids, the vast open spaces which surround it leave the cathedral in a splendid isolation which only serves to accentuate its size and impact. An examination of old drawings reveals that these vast expanses owe less to the effects of war than to history: the organisation of the city in the 17th, 18th, and even 19th centuries was such as to isolate the cathedral and its cloister within a setting of baroque buildings, squares, and parks.

##### - Exterior view

The nave appears perfectly symmetrical, punctuated by powerful buttresses, whilst the absence of flying buttresses, virtually blind western towers, the use of a fine

sandstone whose rectangular cut accentuates the vertical lines, and the dark tones of the decoration in stark contrast with the light facades of neighbouring buildings combine to give the cathedral an austerity of line that is particularly noticeable from the west and north sides, though attenuated on the south side by the presence of a cloister and on the east by the choir chapels.

Winter brings the disappearance of the greenery that is so much a feature of the south-east side and the cathedral square to the north, which is planted with walks of trees.

#### - Interior view and contrast

Access is normally via the last but one half-bay to the west of the north front. The atmosphere of the interior contrasts sharply in the quality of light and the generosity of its volumes, in the nave in particular, with the density of the exterior.

The width of the side aisles in relation to the central nave increases the overall sense of space. Walls and arches are lightly whitewashed to underscore the effect of vast spaces into which light falls through plain glass leaded windows.

The architectural simplicity of the nave highlights the far more elaborate design of the choir, which stands out at first sight in a darker tone, over the closing of the rood screen.

#### - The choir

The choir is Gothic in its conception, consisting of two bays at right-angles and a circle of five bays. Five side-chapels open on the ambulatory, which is on two levels. The upper level is a gallery used by the Bishop and which once led directly to the Episcopal Palace. A third level corresponds to the high windows. The upper ambulatory reserved for the Bishop's use is found only in the choir, and is identical to the tribune found in the earliest Gothic cathedrals in the west, but treated in a very different spirit. The quadrangular pillars which make up the load-bearing structure on each of the two levels are lightened opposite the altar by a composition of superimposed elements, laid out on display, obviously to focus on the refinement of the precious columns brought back from Italy by Otto, which had already been used in the earlier cathedral. A group of slim columns rises from the floor, backed by the pillars of the lower level and supporting a series of antique columns in polychrome marble whose capitals forms the base for a series of monumental statues which mark the level of the Bishop's ambulatory. In its turn, the dais of statues forms the base for the fine ringed columns which rise to carry the ribs of the upper vaults.

#### - The transept and nave

The vault of the transept and nave is higher than that of the choir.

The transept is barely marked and, viewed from above, consists of three squares corresponding to the crossing, and the north and south arms. The northern arm is topped by a six-leafed vault, the southern arm by two rectangular vaults, and the crossing by a four-leafed vault. The north and south end-walls are each pierced by a large window. Under the southern window is a door giving access to the cloister centred on the lavabo, and the north gives access to the Paradise Door.

The transept is contained to the north, south, and east by two massive blocks, towers of a sort which are connected to the Bishop's gallery.

The nave is on two levels, with five bays on the lower level and ten half-bays, each with a window, on the upper. This structure gives rise to an alternation in the load-bearing structures and abutments which suggests that six-leafed vaults were initially intended. In fact, each half-bay is covered by a rectangular vault.

To the west the nave is terminated by the bulk of the two western towers. These towers, with virtually no openings in their lower sections, are simply provided with barely noticeable buttresses on the lower register, decorated on the second register with blind networks which continue on the north and south facades (and at the same level) the rhythm and design of the upper nave windows. The next two registers are simply walls opening into bays up to a balustrade which marks the level at which the barrel of the spires begins, changing from a square to an octagonal form.

#### - The cloister

The cloister occupies the south side of the cathedral and is reached from the southern arm of the transept facing the lavabo area with its concentrically-ribbed vaulting. The galleries are rib-vaulted. The trapezoidal ground-plan is a reminder of the former cathedral: the south gallery of the cloister was spared by the fire of 1207, and hence lies slightly out of true with the new cathedral, which is not in perfect alignment with its predecessor. The discrepancy has been confirmed by archaeological excavation and by the position of the former choir, the south-eastern part of which is still to be seen in an archaeological crypt outside the current edifice, reached from the cloister. The crypt reveals the base of the walls of the former cathedral and traces of the original floor. The most remarkable feature of the cloister is to be found near the top of the outer wall of the east gallery, and consists of a series of drawings made in the early part of the 13th century using a stylus on fresh plaster. The largest section still in existence shows the Emperor Otto and his queen, Edith; fragments of other sections are also visible. The rarity of such drawings surviving to the present day in such a fragile and ephemeral medium as the plaster on an outside wall makes the drawings particularly valuable, quite apart from the fact that the quality of the drawings is on a par with that of some of the most remarkable examples of the painters' and the goldsmiths' art of the period.

Behind this east gallery of the cloister lies a huge room as long as the cloister itself, featuring crossed ogival vaulting resting in the centre on nine pillars consisting of antique polychrome marble columns whose bases are formed from upturned marble capitals also of Italian origin.

Opening on this room from the north-east is the tiny chapel of St Mary, roofed with ivy-leaf vaulting whose ribs descend onto antique columns built into the walls.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The Cathedral is given statutory protection by being registered in the official List of Monuments of the *Land* (State) of Sachsen-Anhalt.

#### *Management*

All the authorities concerned in the management and administration of the cathedral are under the control of the *Land* of Sachsen-Anhalt. The *Land*, as the original owner of the cathedral, has set up the Foundation for the Preservation and Use of Cathedrals, Churches and Monasteries in the State of Sachsen-Anhalt, more commonly known in Magdeburg as the Cathedral Foundation.

Ownership of the cathedral has been ceded to the Foundation, which draws up the maintenance and restoration programmes. The parish handles religious matters (the cathedral follows the rite of the Reformed Church). These two authorities are jointly responsible for the cultural activities which also take place in the cathedral.

Programmes of works are decided in committee by managers and technicians, and the cathedral's annual maintenance budget is of the order of US\$1 million.

#### **Conservation and Authenticity**

##### *Conservation history*

The cathedral was restored over the period from 1826 to 1834. The restoration was carried out in accordance with strict principles and formed a part of the great 19th century movement to restore Europe's medieval monuments. According to a practice current at the time, the interior was stripped of the Baroque ornamentation which concealed its structure. No documents have as yet come to light representing this ornamentation (probably based on plaster of Paris) prior to its removal. All that can be discerned are certain repairs to the stones of the pillars in the nave, which may indicate where decorative elements were once attached.

A second restoration campaign took place from 1927 to 1930. Early drawings show that no major alterations have been made to the cathedral, however. Great attention has been paid to preserving as much of the original stonework as possible. The cathedral architect himself embarked on an inventory of the journeymen's marks found in every corner of the building, which authenticate all the decoration.

##### *Authenticity*

Magdeburg Cathedral offers a high degree of authenticity, and the care with which it is treated can only perpetuate the value of its historic legacy.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Magdeburg in February 1999.

##### *Qualities*

Magdeburg Cathedral is an extensive Gothic construction strongly marked by the persistence of Norman influences.

##### *Comparative analysis*

Magdeburg is reputed to have had considerable influence on other buildings, making the cathedral a model for certain determining aspects of Norman-Gothic art.

It is difficult to analyse all the buildings reflecting its influence.

- The church at *Naumburg* features a double apse with no ambulatory, as at Magdeburg the transept is contained to the east by two blocks, but here topped by towers. The two choirs are Gothic, the interior of the west choir being arranged on a similar - albeit more modest - pattern to the Magdeburg choir. The nave is organized along the same lines, but the vaults with their integrated ribbing are closer to ribbed vaults.
- the church at *Halberstadt*, wholly Gothic in inspiration, shares a similar interior plan, although again more modest, to Magdeburg. Also noteworthy are the spires of *Meissen* church, which are a smaller but faithful copy of Magdeburg's west spires.
- the exterior of *Mainz* Cathedral is very similar at its lower levels to Magdeburg.

All the above are of a later construction than Magdeburg.

##### *Remarks by ICOMOS*

It is fruitless to seek a faithful imitation of a Western model in a building such as Magdeburg Cathedral. At most it is possible to discern an interpretation of a remote influence which should, nevertheless, not be underestimated. Magdeburg Cathedral is a powerful and unique construction whose builders adapted to their native culture the current of ideas making its way through the Europe of their time.

Another obvious factor demands recognition: the memory of the founder of the Holy Roman Empire. The existence of precious architectural remnants saved from the fire of 1207 and directly associated with the memory of his reign have prompted a search for architectural solutions to incorporate these elements into the fabric of the cathedral. The sacred enclosure which the choir forms around the sarcophagus is certainly not the work of chance: the careful assemblies incorporating the antique columns seem to have held as much or more significance for this particular part of the cathedral as any questions of construction.

Nevertheless, whilst appreciating the role of Magdeburg Cathedral in the development of Gothic architecture and its extension into central Europe, and also its historical significance in relation to the foundation of the Holy Roman Empire, ICOMOS does not consider that this property possesses the degree of outstanding universal value that would justify its inscription on the World Heritage List.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Museumsinsel (Germany)

No 896

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Museumsinsel (Museum Island)
<i>Location</i>	Land Berlin
<i>State Party</i>	German Federal Republic
<i>Date</i>	25 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Berlin Museumsinsel is a complex of buildings composed of individual museums of outstanding historical and artistic importance located in the heart of the city, and as such meets the World Heritage Convention's criteria for a cultural property.

The individual buildings erected in the course of the 19th century by the most renowned German architects form a unique complex that serves purely museological purposes and constitutes a town-planning highlight in the fabric of the city in the shape of a kind of city crown.

The Museumsinsel visibly documents the changing human values mentioned in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* because it bears outstanding architectural testimony to the new institution of the art museum that began to emerge in Europe following the French Revolution as an important institution of middle-class self-perception. The Museumsinsel illustrates in addition – as seen from the chronological order of its individual museums – the change that the institution of the art museum underwent from the beginning of the 19th century up to the 20th century, being first the central place of middle-class educational aspirations, then becoming a place of national identity, and ultimately allying itself with the gesture of imperial power. **Criterion ii**

At the same time the Museumsinsel is an outstanding architectural example of a type of building that testifies to an important stage in the development of human history. The different designs of the Museumsinsel's individual museum buildings illustrate in a confined space the typological development of the European art museum from a middle-class temple of education (Altes Museum, Nationalgalerie) and from there to the exhibit building of plain design which gives pride of place to the work of art exhibited (interior of the Pergamonmuseum). Furthermore, the individual museum buildings harmonize so well with each other in design terms that the Museumsinsel presents the art museum as a building type in a unique architectural and urban design manner. **Criterion iv**

The Museumsinsel with its collections of works of art of world renown and its prominent buildings is a place of outstanding artistic significance. **Criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Development of the part of the Spreeinsel now known as the Museumsinsel began when the pleasure garden (Lustgarten) for the Stadtschloß (palace) in the 16th century. However, its present importance began when the Altes Museum was built to the designs of Karl Friedrich Schinkel in 1824-28.

A plan to develop the part of the island behind this museum, hitherto used for commercial purposes as a "sanctuary for the arts and sciences," was drawn up in 1841 by the court architect, Friedrich August Stüler, on the orders of Friedrich Wilhelm IV. The first element of this plan to be built was the Neues Museum (1843-47). The next step did not take place until 1866, when the Nationalgalerie, the work of Johann Heinrich Strack, was built.

Another two decades passed before the Kaiser-Friedrich-Museum (now the Bodemuseum) was built in 1897-1904 to the designs of Ernst von Ihne, and Stüler's plan was completed in 1909-30 with the construction of Alfred Messel's Pergamonmuseum.

#### Description

The complex of the Museumsinsel consists of five museum buildings.

#### - The Altes Museum

This is a two-storey structure with a rectangular ground plan on a high base with its exhibition rooms ranged round two inner courts and a central two-storey domed rotunda with skylight. The side and rear elevations are relatively plain, but that facing the site of the former Schloß is a high portico supported on eighteen sandstone Ionic columns and two corner pilasters. Access is by means of a seven-bay wide stairway with broad stringers.

#### - The Neues Museum

The layout of the Neues Museum is comparable with that of the Altes Museum, but the rotunda of the latter is replaced by the monumental main staircase. Unlike the Altes Museum, to which it was originally linked by a passageway, it is a relatively plain structure, more in the style of the Schinkel school. Its articulation comes from a high profile parapet with corner sculptures, plain window frames with the mullions decorated with figures of children, cornices, and corner pilasters. Much of the decorative sculpture was destroyed by wartime bombardment, but some elements have been restored and replaced.

The richly decorated interior contrasts with the plain exterior. Much of the original ornamentation was destroyed, but the furnishings around the second inner courtyard (the "Greek Courtyard"), including the monumental frieze depicting the destruction of Pompeii, have survived virtually intact.

There is an interesting innovative structural feature. The traditional low-vaulted ceilings of timber beams and masonry are replaced on the third floor by an arch-cord construction using cast-iron arches and pairs of wrought-iron chords. This lightweight form of construction was necessitated by the poor foundation parameters.

#### - The Nationalgalerie

A high ashlar block-like base with rectangular windows is surmounted by a Corinthian pseudo-dipteral temple of *in antis* type with an open portico. There are also high rectangular windows in the exterior wall set back behind the columns. The rear is in the form of a semi-circular conch. A double-winged open staircase with five flights of steps leads up to the pedimented portico with its Corinthian columns. The building is clad throughout with Nebra sandstone.

The four-storey building has a rectangular ground plan with apse-like terminal features. There is a cellar and an exhibition floor in the basement section and two exhibition halls in the superstructure. It is lavishly decorated with symbolic imagery in the form of sculptures, reliefs, and paintings. The upper exhibition floor was originally laid out as a vast banqueting hall, but is now converted for displays.

#### - The Gardens

The gardens overlooked by the Nationalgalerie fill the space defined by the Neues Museum, the Bodestraße, and the embankment of the Spree. They are laid out in a simple formal design, replacing the original elaborate layout with colonnades and pavilions.

#### - The Bodemuseum

This Neo-Baroque structure is in a commanding position on the north-western tip of the island. Clad in sandstone and with a low stone base, it rises to two storeys, linked by Corinthian pilasters and crowned with a balustrade. The longitudinal elevations have two pedimented side projections with double Corinthian three-quarter columns. The rounded entrance frontage is decorated with the same columns and with rounded open arches.

The entrance with its impressive staircase is beneath the smaller of the two domes. It gives on to two lateral wings and a centre section which are linked by transverse sections so as to form five inner courtyards. The main room of the museum, the so-called Basilica, is modelled on the domed church of San Salvatore al Monte in Florence, and is embellished with works of art that give it the appearance of a Renaissance church interior.

#### - The Pergamonmuseum

This three-winged museum was built to exhibit the greatly expanded collections of antiquities resulting from German excavations at Pergamon and other Greek sites in Asia Minor as well as those from Mesopotamia formerly housed in the Vorderasiatisches Museum.

In style it is restrained, in the Schinkel tradition but in a modern idiom and also suggestive of classical architecture. It rises directly from the Spree, like the Bodemuseum, with which it is harmonized in scale and proportions. The centre block and the side wings are windowless, given structure by flat giant pilasters and steep pediments; there are archaic features such as the Doric half-columns and the stepped central superstructure. Some changes to elements of the

exterior design were imposed upon the architect, Alfred Messel, but the overall block-like modernity of his conception overcomes the increase in the eaves height, the flattening of the pediments, and the addition of a metope and triglyph frieze.

#### - The Bridges

The nominated area also includes the Montbijou Bridge, in front of the Bodemuseum, a two-arch structure in Baroque style, and the Iron Bridge at the end of the Bodestraße.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The nominated area has been protected since the beginning of this century (laws of 1907, 1909, and 1923). In 1977 the Museumsinsel was inscribed on the Central List of Monuments of the GDR as an exceptional group of monuments of national and international importance. The 1995 Law on the Protection of Monuments and Sites in Berlin makes provision for three levels of protection for the Museumsinsel: protection as a Listed Historic Monument-Group, covering the entire area, including buildings, the open spaces between them, and the bridges; protection as individual Listed Monuments (the buildings, the viaduct, the Iron Bridge, and the Montbijou Bridge as architectural monuments and the gardens as landscape monuments); and protection of a defined buffer zone around each individual monument.

The adjacent areas to the west, north, and east (partially) of the Museumsinsel are also statutorily protected as a Listed Historic Monument-Group. Part of this area is included in the nomination dossier as the buffer zone around the Museumsinsel.

The urban plans currently in force – the Land-Use Plan and the Management Plan – contain provisions relating to the protection of the urban fabric of protected groups in the Mitte district. Statutory measures in force allow the competent authorities of the *Land* (State) to act in all matters relating to the urban plans and to make use of building permits.

(For the buffer zone, see “ICOMOS recommendations” below for future actions.)

### *Management*

Management of the Museumsinsel group, its buildings, and its collections is carried out by the Prussian Cultural Foundation (*Stiftung Preußischer Kulturbesitz* – SPK), which ensures that its qualities are maintained and cooperates with other partners to whom it delegates specialized preservation activities. As responsible bodies at governmental level, the Federal Government and all the *Länder* participate in the work of the SPK, which is the source of substantial potential funding, of strength, and of flexible management.

The Federal Ministry of Regional Policy, Construction and Town Planning is responsible for professional control of building works, whilst the Federal Office of Public Works and Planning (*Bundesamt für Bauwesen und Raumordnung* – BBR) deals with aspects of planning, conservation work, expert advice, design, technical proposals, etc, which the SDK must submit to it. At *Land* level, the Department of Planning, Environment, and Technology of the Senate of

Berlin oversees planning and works on the Museumsinsel, whilst the Berlin Monuments Office (*Landesdenkmalamt Berlin* – LDA) specifies all protection and conservation measures. In the Mitte District the local conservation authorities are concerned with the protected area outside the island.

As a result of the continuous interaction between the main partners (SPK, BBR, and LDA), and also the participation of the other bodies involved, effective management is assured.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

During World War II the buildings on the Museumsinsel, and in particular the Altes Museum, the Neues Museum, and the Nationalgalerie, suffered damage, in places partial destruction. A series of conservation projects were undertaken after the war, in 1950, 1960, 1980, and 1990, with the object of making good the results of this damage. Interventions carried out to date cover conservation, restoration, reconstruction (to restore sections and features of buildings using old materials or new materials with surviving elements integrated into them, in accordance with precise documentation), consolidation of structural elements, maintenance, repair of deteriorated surfaces, and, to a limited extent, the addition of new elements (eg the windows between the colonnade of the Altes Museum, which it is planned to remove). Some conservation carried out soon after the war which showed the use of poor materials or workmanship of inferior quality has now come to the end of its life and is at the present time the subject of corrective actions.

A large-scale overall conservation strategy is currently being implemented, with guaranteed funding, professional expertise, and level of management. This has been developed as a result of detailed knowhow derived from each of the works that have been carried out. It provides the framework for designs, proposals, and plans at different levels for the future preservation and improvement both of the whole group and of its individual elements, in relation to the priorities, authenticity criteria, requirements for museum displays, etc.

### *Authenticity*

Despite the wartime damage and the long series of conservation interventions that followed, the Museumsinsel has retained a high degree of authenticity in its historic buildings, in their functions, in their design, and in their context. Even the authenticity of the historical characteristics and of the development of the museum role has survived: the character, the style and thematic content of the collections on display, the organic link between the collections and the architectural spaces, etc. Conservation interventions at present being carried out respect the imperatives of authenticity to a high degree.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Museumsinsel in February 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Museumsinsel of Berlin is a remarkable example of the urban and architectural realization of an urban public forum which has the symbolic value of the Acropolis for the city. It is appropriate to emphasize its rare planning and architectural continuity and the consistency with which for more than a century a concept has been realized, ensuring its integrity and its urban and architectural coherence at each stage in the creation of the ensemble.

The cultural value of the Museumsinsel is linked with its historic role in the conception and development of a certain type of building and ensemble, that of the art museum. In this respect the Berlin Museumsinsel is one of the significant and most impressive ensembles in the world.

Finally, the urban and architectural values of the Museumsinsel are inseparable from the important museum collections that they house, which bear witness to the evolution of civilization. The connection is a direct one, since the architectural spaces in each museum were designed in an organic relationship with the collections on display.

### *Comparative analysis*

Comparisons between the Berlin Museumsinsel and other museum complexes around the world highlight here for the first time the urban and architectural identity of the museum as an institution that makes a claim for equality with the symbols of religion and monarchy. This characteristic of the Museumsinsel becomes apparent when it is compared with the many European museums installed in former royal palaces (the Louvre in Paris) or which do not have this compactness (the museums in London) or central position in the urban fabric.

The Museumsinsel is in itself unique urban and architectural testimony to the changes in the functions, types, style, and importance of museums in the 19th and 20th centuries as an extension of the ideas that appeared after the French Revolution, proclaiming the right of all people to free access to art.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The ICOMOS mission studied the boundaries of the buffer zone put forward in the nomination dossier with care. As a result, it recommends that the zone should be extended to the west and the north so as to include the associated areas which are already protected as Historic Monument-Groups. Proposals were also made for modification of the boundaries on the east and south. These proposals were accepted by the competent authorities of the *Land* of Berlin and a revised plan was provided which was completely in accordance with the ICOMOS proposals.

## **Brief description**

The five museums on the Museumsinsel in Berlin, built between 1824 and 1930, represent the realization of a visionary project and the evolution of the approaches to museum design over this seminal century.

## **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

**Criterion ii** The Berlin Museumsinsel is a unique ensemble of museum buildings which illustrates the evolution of modern museum design over more than a century.

**Criterion iv** The art museum is a social phenomenon that owes its origins to the Age of Enlightenment and its extension to all people to the French Revolution. The Museumsinsel is the most outstanding example of this concept given material form and a symbolic central urban setting.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Wartburg (Germany)

No 897

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Wartburg Castle
<i>Location</i>	Eisenach, Free State of Thuringia
<i>State Party</i>	Germany
<i>Date</i>	25 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

There is hardly a castle in all Germany as famous as Wartburg. Its situation, perched on a height of some 400m above delightful countryside south of the city of Eisenach in Thuringia, its varied aspect, and the sense of harmony it evokes are only two of its attractions for visitors. What makes Wartburg Castle such a magnet for memory, tradition, and pilgrimage is that it stands as a monument to the cultural history of Germany, Europe and beyond.

Lutherans the world over know of the castle as the very place where Martin Luther made his translation of the Bible. The veneration of Saint Elizabeth, which extends far beyond the frontiers of Germany, includes Wartburg Castle where she lived and worked.

The patronage of Hermann I, Landgrave of Thuringia, occupies an extraordinary place in the creation of a national literary tradition. In poetry as in legends, Wartburg Castle, the medieval Court of the Muses, bears an undying reputation through the names of Walther von der Vogelweide or Wolfram von Eschenbach.

While these represented the first steps in German literature, and Martin Luther's translation of the New Testament marked the creation of a written German language, unified and accessible to all, Wartburg Castle is also associated with the beginnings of a bourgeois and democratic nation, through the content and effects of the Wartburg festival of German students' associations.

From the very earliest days of its existence, this fortress of the Landgraves of Thuringia has repeatedly acted as a venue for and witness of historic events and more than deserves its renown as a monument of national and world history.

The artistic and architectural importance of the palace, built in the second half of the 12th century, is no less. In execution and ornamentation, it is unrivalled and represents one of the best-preserved secular constructions from the late Norman period to be found on German soil. Thanks to this broad range of religious content and historic data, and because of its significance in the history of the arts, Wartburg Castle attracts around half a million visitors every year, from all over the world..

[**Note:** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier as regards the criteria under which it considers the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Commission, this is a *monument*.

### History and Description

#### History

The legendary creation of Wartburg Castle is attributed to Count Ludwig der Springer. The first steps in its construction were taken in 1067, following the troubles caused by the Investiture Contest, troubles which encouraged the birth of feudalism. The castle is mentioned for the first time in 1080 as a strategic base, one of the key points in the early years of Ludovician sovereignty. This sovereignty grew more firmly established during the first half of the 12th century. Raised to the dignity of landgraves, the Ludovicians supported the policies of the Stauffen emperors. The building of the palace in the second half of the 12th century illustrates their status as Princes of the Empire.

Towards the end of the 12th century, a literary court developed at Wartburg castle, attracted by Landgrave Hermann I, who surrounded himself with poets and musicians. The poetry of Walther von der Vogelweide describes the brilliant society life which gave rise to the episode of the singers' tourney at Wartburg Castle, a romanticized version of which inspired Richard Wagner's opera, *Tannhäuser*.

In 1221 Landgrave Ludwig IV, the son of Hermann, married Elizabeth of Hungary. Widowed in 1227, Elizabeth devoted herself to charitable works to which the Landgrave's family took exception. Driven out of Wartburg Castle with her three children, she founded a hospital in Marburg and lived her life by Franciscan principles. She was canonized in 1235, four years after her death.

Heinrich Raspe IV, the brother of Ludwig IV, succeeded him and, espousing the Pope's cause, was appointed King of Germany on the initiative of Innocent IV. His death in 1247 ended the Ludovician dynasty.

The Margrave of Wettin, Heinrich von Meissen, took possession of Wartburg Castle. Over the next century, the site was to receive a series of new buildings. The transfer of the seat of power to Gotha and subsequently to Weimar at the beginning of the 15th century marked the beginning of the castle's decline.

Under the protection of the Prince Elector of Saxony, Martin Luther stayed at Wartburg Castle in secret. Here he devoted himself to literature, producing a considerable body of work attested by his correspondence, from which many letters have survived. It was at Wartburg Castle that he made his translation of the New Testament into German. His exile came to an end in March 1522 and by the end of the 16th century, the memory of Luther was already attracting large numbers of pilgrims.

From the 16th century onwards, the castle was kept more or less in a state of repair: though abandoned as a seat of power, its strategic importance was nonetheless highlighted several times. The events that had taken place there, and in particular the memory of St Elizabeth and of Luther, were also arguments for its preservation, but neglect gradually led to inevitable dilapidation, which was almost total by the end of the 18th century.

Goethe paid a visit in 1777 and made a drawing of the ruin which shows only the palace remaining partially intact. The poet suggested the creation of a museum, justified by the ever-growing numbers of pilgrims. After the Napoleonic wars, a national sentiment emerged which revelled in the image of ancient Germany as symbolized by Wartburg Castle.

In 1817, the students' associations organized an event which set the seal on this tendency, further confirmed by the revolution of March 1848. Wartburg Castle was to remain the headquarters of students' associations for the whole of Germany.

In the first half of the 19th century, on the initiative of the Grand Duke of Saxony, the entire site was completely renovated: the remains of the palace were raised from their ruins, the curtain wall restored, and the remainder of the buildings reconstructed under the supervision of architect Hugo von Ritgen. The large part necessarily played by assumptions in the reconstruction have rather more to do with the romantic imagination than with historical reality. The involvement of renowned artists such as Moritz von Schwind, particularly in his illustration of the life of St Elizabeth, underlines the symbolic nature of the site.

This allegorical monument was for a short time the object of attention from the Nazi regime, but no event of importance was held there over the period, apart from the subjection of the students' associations to the principles of the regime.

In 1945, the bombing of Eisenach spared Wartburg, although the castle was later pillaged by Soviet troops.

The German Democratic Republic made Wartburg Castle a national monument, major restoration work was carried out, and numerous commemorative ceremonies were held in connection with the religious connotations and symbolic value of the monument.

Since the reunification of Germany, restoration work has concentrated primarily on the interiors and on the problems of preserving the stonework on the palace facades.

#### *Description*

The castle occupies a rocky spur looking north and south, in the midst of the forest that looks down over the city of Eisenach. On the same site as the castle stands a hostelry built in the late 19th century by architect Bodo Ebhardt, but this does not form part of the nomination.

In archaeological terms, the layout of Wartburg Castle corresponds in essence to that of the original fortress, particularly the Palace, the ramparts, the South Tower, and the outworks which are now partially buried or in ruins.

In architectural terms, Wartburg Castle is essentially a romantic reconstruction subjected to many different

projects before arriving at its current state. The rocky spur is reached from the northern end, occupied by a tower with drawbridge, followed by a number of outbuildings which form a sort of outer courtyard.

Next follows the lower courtyard, the main features of which (on the eastern side) are the keep and the Palace, on which the Knights' Baths back.

The South Tower marks the farther end of the spur. The centre of the lower courtyard is occupied by a cistern.

The fortress is made up of the following constructions:

- The *outworks* (redoubt, foundations of the *Fischerturm* (Fishermen's Tower), wall-walk, St Elizabeth's spring, etc)

The outworks have not been preserved as constructions. All that remain are archaeological traces, outlines of the foundations and ditch of the *Fischerturm*, the escarpments of the access ramp and the road, carved from the living rock, leading up to the fortress, as well as the spring of fresh water which flows halfway up the embankment on which the fortress stands.

- The *outer defences*, consisting of:

the postern gate and drawbridge; the knights' lodging and the commissary buildings; the Marguerite and St Elizabeth wall-walks, also containing exterior constructions, including a small cistern, the coping of the Wartburg Castle well, worked stone balustrades, stairs also of dressed stone, paved floors, and the surface of the courtyards of the outer wards (cut from the rock and sometimes levelled using crushed rock).

- The *castle (Hofburg)*, comprising the following buildings:

*Bergfried* (belfry); *Neue Kemenate* (new apartments with fireplace); *Neues Treppenhaus* (new monumental staircase); the Palace; *Ritterbad* (knights' baths); *Südturm* (South Tower); *Gadem*; *Dirnitz* and *Torhalle* with *Dirnitzlaube* (entrance to the commons, with arcade); west and south curtain walls; cistern; lower castle courtyard; commandant's garden.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The Wartburg is covered by protective legislation at *Land* and municipal level. The listed monument encompasses the whole hill on which the castle is built.

The protected area of the Wartburg falls within the "blue line" of the planning zone of Eisenach, which restricts all forms of development around the monument. Much of the wooded hillside below the castle is designated as a natural protected area (NSG).

### *Management*

The property is owned by the Wartburg Foundation of Eisenach, founded in 1992. The Foundation is a legal entity under civil law, with its headquarters in Eisenach.

The property is administered by the *Stiftungsrat der Wartburg-Stiftung* (Board of Directors of the Wartburg

Foundation) in conjunction with the Thuringian Ministry of Science, Research and Culture (Office for the Protection of Historic Monuments of the State of Thuringia).

Funding is provided by the following sources: *Bundesministerium des Inneren* (Ministry of the Interior), *Thüringer Ministerium für Wissenschaft, Forschung und Kultur* (Thuringian Ministry of Science, Research and Culture), *Thüringisches Landesamt für Denkmalpflege* (Office of the State of Thuringia for the preservation of historic monuments), and the Foundation's own funds.

The above bodies are also responsible for the maintenance and preservation of the property, in conjunction with the *Bauhütte der Wartburg* team.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Apart from the outworks, which are still no more than archaeological remains, major restoration-reconstruction programmes were carried out throughout the 19th century.

Research is under way to remedy the problem of flaking affecting the stones of the palace.

In 1978, work began on the restoration of the historic decorative paintings of the Singers' and the Landgraves' halls, and the restoration of the Palace great hall, which was also equipped with underfloor heating and a woodblock floor.

In addition, between 1979 and 1981 a layer of reinforced concrete was inserted between the first and second floors. The weakened beams and joists, which dendrochronology dates at around 1160-1170, have been preserved and left in place, although other structures now perform their former load-bearing function. The knights' room and the dining hall have been returned to their medieval appearance, based on archaeological evidence, with grooved pointing and painted frames. The canopies of the fireplaces have also been reconstructed.

In 1989, the neo-Roman knights' baths were restored and opened to the public. During the 1990s, maintenance work has been carried out on the belfry, the wall-walk, the defensive passages, and the drawbridge.

Ongoing efforts to preserve the frescoes by Moritz von Schwindt have been intensified since 1990, thanks to an exhaustive and generous project funded by the German foundation for the preservation of historic monuments, and work was temporarily completed in 1995.

The main preservation project currently under way is to preserve the stonework of the palace's medieval facades, much of which is still in the original sandstone. The main tasks involved here are the demineralization of the dressed stone, the careful replacement of surfaces worn away by the elements, and the restoration of the original appearance of the pointing. Just as the methods used and the results achieved on the programme to preserve the Moritz von Schwindt frescoes will prove invaluable for other, similar projects, the preservation of the stonework is a pilot scheme which, once it is realized, will find applications in the preservation of other buildings.

### *Authenticity*

The stone-built Palace is, in its lower sections at least, an important example of civilian architecture of the Norman period. The same can be said of the masonry sections of the rampart, and of the South Tower.

The remainder of the site is a reconstruction undertaken under the influence of romantic ideas coupled, in this particular case, with an attempt to resurrect forms which might bear witness to the presence of the great historical personages who once inhabited this place (St Elizabeth, Luther, etc) and offer an illustration of a political idea in search of national unity.

The criterion of authenticity may be defined here in the light of two principles:

1. archaeological authenticity, which is not predominant here except for, in the main, the Palace and the fortifications;
2. symbolic authenticity, where the form matters less than the idea it represents. This is not a setting but an architecture, and one of great quality, expressive of a true ideal.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in January 1999. A distinguished British specialist in medieval fortifications was consulted about the cultural significance of the property.

### *Qualities*

The property is a castle occupying a crest which was once a strategic stronghold.

Having lost its military significance, the castle gradually fell into ruin until a major programme of restoration was launched early in the 19th century. This renewal of interest was justified by the symbolic nature of the German people and today continues to be a symbol of the nation's past and present.

### *Comparative analysis*

The romantic reconstitution, although remarkable, is not an exceptional case: there are several other examples in Europe of civilian buildings thus restored. The palace, however, is an exceptional building, since few civilian residences of this period have survived. It is comparable to the palaces of Goslar and Gelnhausen, but the greater scope of the restoration-reconstitution work carried out on Wartburg Castle gives a more complete reading, however archaeologically confused, of the palace of a great prince in the Norman period.

### *Remarks by ICOMOS*

The state of repair of the castle buildings varies from acceptable to mediocre. The great age of the site is to some extent responsible for a certain tardiness in maintenance.

The archaeological interest of the property is not its strongest feature, but is compensated for by a fervent historical reconstitution which, while it may have

invented some forms, was scrupulous in respecting authentic vestiges of the past.

From the standpoint of history and the spread of ideas, Wartburg Castle is without doubt one of the great centres of world history.

### **Brief description**

Wartburg Castle blends superbly into its forest surroundings and is, in many ways "the ideal castle." Although it contains some sections of great antiquity, the outline it acquired in the course of 19th century reconstructions is a splendid evocation of what this fortress might have been at the peak of its military and seigneurial power.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and vi* :

*Criterion iii* The Castle of Wartburg is an outstanding monument of the feudal period in central Europe.

*Criterion vi* The Castle of Wartburg is rich in cultural associations, most notably its role as the place of exile of Martin Luther, who composed his German translation of the New Testament there. It is also a powerful symbol of German integration and unity.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Mycenae and Tiryns (Greece)

No 941

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Archaeological Sites of Mycenae and Tiryns
<i>Location</i>	Region of the Peloponnese, Province of Argolid
<i>State Party</i>	Greece
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

[*Note by ICOMOS* Although the two sites form a single nomination, separate dossiers have been supplied by the State Party. The justifications for each are given below, preceded by a section relating to the joint nomination, in which no proposals are given for criteria.]

It is proposed that the archaeological sites of Mycenae and Tiryns be included on the World Heritage List as a unity which represents the most characteristic examples of Mycenaean citadels. Both Mycenae and Tiryns represent masterpieces of human creative genius. They have similarities and differences, and constitute a continuous entity since they complement one another.

#### *Mycenae*

The site of Mycenae represents a masterpiece of human creative genius as it shelters outstanding works of monumental architecture and sculpture that are unique in the world: the massive citadel walls with the Lion Gate and the relief of the Lions, the Treasury of Atreus, Grave Circle A, and the underground reservoir. **Criterion i**

Mycenae, the most famous centre of the Mycenaean world, has been described by Homer in his legendary epic poem, the *Iliad*, bequeathing the spirit of the Mycenaean civilization from antiquity to the world of today. Since Homer's time, a continuous interchange of human values within an increasingly worldwide cultural area has exerted a significant influence on the evolution of civilizations.

The religion, the writing, and the architecture of the Greeks in classical times have fundamental roots in the Mycenaean culture. Furthermore, the *megaron* anticipates the plan adopted for the Greek temples, whilst the relief of the Lions is the first example of a monumental sculpture that was to have a great future. **Criterion ii**

Mycenae is not only the main archaeological site of the Mycenaean civilization which flourished in the Aegean and spread around the Mediterranean between 1600 and 1100 BC, but it also represents an exceptional testimony to the

achievements of this civilization in art and technology as well as in the advanced level of economy and social organization achieved at the time.

Significant stages in monumental architecture were achieved with the construction of the massive defensive walls of Mycenae and the beehive-shaped *tholos* tombs. Outstanding artefacts (metal objects, gems) were found in the tombs of Grave Circles A and B.

The site of Mycenae also displays some characteristic elements of the unique Mycenaean economic and social organization, with its elaborate exchange network, based on centres ruled by a *wanax* around whom everything revolves - palace, workshops, store-rooms, and cult centre. It also includes the unique Access Ramp, built to enhance the power of the Palace and Grave Circle A, built for ancestor worship. **Criteria iii and iv**

With the discovery of Mycenae by Heinrich Schliemann in 1876, the legendary centre of Homer and the home of Agamemnon, one of the most popular heroes of the Homeric epics, became history. Its legendary rulers, the Atreides, were considered by the Greeks of antiquity as their ancestors. They also inspired many artistic and literary works of outstanding significance through the centuries in different parts of the world. **Criterion vi**

#### *Tiryns*

Tiryns represents a major stage in the earth's history, since it dates from the Mycenaean civilization, the first palace civilization with urban characteristics and a centralized administrative system in Europe.

Its architecture represents a masterpiece of human creative genius. The walls can be described as a creation that goes beyond the limits of the human mind, as shown by the use of the word "cyclopean" attributed to them in the Homeric poems, derived from the Cyclopes, legendary giants from Lycia, who were thought to have been their builders. The architectural ensemble of the cyclopean walls and the palace complex is an outstanding testimony to the most important prehistoric period of the Greek civilization. **Criterion i**

The Mycenaean palace administrative system with its centralized structure operated for five centuries. At the peak period of prosperity (1300-1200 BC) the Mycenaean areas had a homogenous society known as the Mycenaean Koine. This wide homogeneity is evident in religion, language, and art. In addition, the idea of a common ethnic consciousness reached its apogee. **Criterion ii**

The city outside the citadel of Tiryns was very extensive and fully organized. The palace administrative system controlled agricultural production, stock-raising, and trade. This complicated political, social, and economic system, which evolved in Mycenaean times, bears exceptional testimony to an early stage of Greek civilization. **Criterion iii**

The Mycenaean citadels are unique examples of fortification. The cyclopean walls enclose public buildings, workshops, store-rooms, and cult centres. The realization of this massive construction work demanded precise architectural planning and supervision by highly qualified architects. The architecture of the fortified citadels, which have been well preserved up to the present day, represents an outstanding example of a unique form of architectural expression. **Criterion iv**

The Mycenaean civilization is a highlight of human history. The strongly centralized administrative system, the monumental architecture, the art objects, and the earliest indications of the Greek language preserved on the Linear B tablets inspired Homer, who described the impressive Mycenaean world in his poems, especially the *Odyssey*. The spirit of the Mycenaean civilization has survived to the present day through the Homeric epics, which were orally transferred and taught in schools up to the end of the classical world. The Homeric tradition led Schliemann to search for and to reveal the most important centres of this civilization. Thousands of visitors influenced by this written tradition continue to visit Mycenae and Tiryns in search of the traces of the legendary kingdoms of Agamemnon and Priamos. Overall, the Mycenaean civilization, and especially the two important centres of Mycenae and Tiryns, have outstanding universal significance as highlights of human civilization.

#### Criterion vi

#### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, Mycenae and Tiryns are *sites*.

#### History and Description

##### History

The Mycenaean civilization developed on the Greek mainland in the Late Bronze Age (16th century BC). It was essentially a continuation of the Middle Helladic culture, transformed by Minoan influences from Crete.

Knowledge of its two earlier periods I (c 1580-1500 BC) and II (c 1500-1400 BC) comes mainly from burials, notably the shaft graves at Mycenae. Towards the end of Period II more elaborate tomb types developed - large chamber tombs for families and beehive-shaped (*tholos*) tombs for royalty.

The apogee of the Mycenaean civilization came in Period III (c 1400-1120 BC), when strong citadels and elaborate palaces were built. Towards the end of this period a script, known as Linear B, came into use; the language used has been shown to be an early form of Greek, confirming that the Mycenaean were Greek speakers of Indo-European origin.

The political structure was that of an autocratic monarchy, the ruler of which was known as the *wanax*, who administered his territory by means of an hierarchical structure of officials. There was a special class of priests and priestesses. The people were organized in an elaborate class system, and slavery was widely practised.

The site of *Mycenae* is known from excavations to have been occupied from the Neolithic period (c 4000 BC). During the Middle Helladic Period a cemetery was established on the southern slopes of the natural hill which included Grave Circle B (dated to the 17th century BC) and Grave Circle A (16th century BC). The Palace was constructed on the summit of the hill and surrounded by massive cyclopean walls in three stages (c 1350, 1250, and 1225 BC respectively). In the final stage the underground reservoir was also fortified.

A series of *tholos* tombs were built on the southern and south-western slopes of the hill during the Mycenaean Period

- the so-called Tomb of Aegisthos (c 1500 BC), the Lion Tholos Tomb (c 1350 BC), the Tomb of Clytemnestra (c 1220 BC), culminating in the Treasury of Atreus, at some distance from the others. Four large buildings, believed to have been royal workshops, were built in the 13th century BC in the vicinity of Grave Circle B.

The Palace was abandoned at the end of the 12th century BC and a number of buildings were damaged by fire. However, the site continued to be occupied until 498 BC, when it was conquered by Argos and its inhabitants were expelled. The top of the hill was levelled at this time for the construction of an Archaic temple. The site was re-occupied briefly in the Hellenistic period, when another temple was built and a theatre constructed over the Tomb of Clytemnestra. By the time the Greek traveller Pausanias visited Mycenae in the 2nd century AD it had been completely abandoned for many years.

As at Mycenae, the earliest human occupation known at *Tiryns* is from the Neolithic period. The oldest architectural remains, on the Upper Citadel, are from the early Bronze Age (c 3000 BC). The level of this area was built up in the Middle Bronze Age (1900-1600 BC) to accommodate new buildings.

Tiryns flourished during the Mycenaean period. A new fortified palace complex was constructed in the 14th century BC. The defences were extended in the early 13th century BC, and the Lower Citadel was also fortified. Following earthquake and fire damage, the site was reconstructed, the new defences enclosing an area of 20ha; the extra-mural settlement covered more than 25ha.

The fate of Tiryns with the decline of the Mycenaean civilization paralleled that of Mycenae. It was not finally abandoned until the deportation of the 5th century BC, by which time it had lost its power and influence.

##### Description - Mycenae

The site is located on a small hill on the lower slopes of Mount Euboea, at the crossing of the road from the Argolid Gulf to Corinth and Athens.

The area of the *Citadel* or *Acropolis* is surrounded by massive walls 6-8m thick, which probably originally stood to a height of 18m. Three stages of construction can be identified, the first two from the Mycenaean period (Using massive blocks of limestone, first undressed, latter hammer-dressed) and the third Hellenistic (dressed small blocks).

The walls are pierced by two gates. The *Lion Gate* is made from four large blocks, a lintel, and two side posts; the relieving triangle over the lintel is a block of limestone with the famous Relief of the Lions. The *North Gate* is a slightly smaller version of the Lion Gate, with a plain relieving triangle.

The *Granary*, built up against the inner side of the wall, was a brick two-storeyed structure.

Following the line of the Lion Gate is the *Great Ramp*, a steep massive construction in cyclopean stone blocks flanked by low walls which leads to the top of the hill and the Palace.

The *Palace*, covering c 170m by 50-80m, is built at several levels on an area of levelled ground revetted by cyclopean walls. Its present form is that of the late Mycenaean period. Features include the rectangular *Propylon*, consisting of two

monostyle porticoes, the *Main Court*, and the *Megaron*, the main palace building, which was a complex of rooms, porticoes, stairways, and corridors built on several levels created by terracing.

The *Underground Reservoir* was constructed in the 12th century BC in a deep cutting in the rock. A staircase leads down to a cyclopean portal and thence to the cistern proper, the walls of which are clad in hydraulic mortar.

The area on the south-east of the Acropolis is known as the *Cult Centre*, since the buildings excavated there produced numerous altars, shrines, and frescoes depicting religious rituals.

*Grave Circle A* was created in the 16th century BC, when a low circular wall was built round a group of large royal shaft tombs (as well as a number of lesser tombs, destroyed by Schliemann's excavations). The tombs originally had low rubble walls supporting the horizontal beams of the slate or reed roofs. In the 13th century BC larger walls were built to bring the cemetery up to the level of the entrance to the citadel.

A group of 13th century BC *buildings*, the purpose of which is not known, lie outside the walls. Also outside the defences is *Grave Circle B*, which contained fourteen royal shaft graves and some smaller ones. Like *Grave Circle A*, it was enclosed by a low wall.

The *Tomb of Aegisthos* (all such attributions to historical characters are fanciful and not supported by evidence) has a long narrow *dromos* (entrance) leading to a *tholos* (beehive-shaped chamber), the upper part of which has collapsed. It is the oldest of this group (c 1500 BC). The slightly later *Tomb of the Lions* is comparable in form and size, as is the 13<sup>th</sup> century *Tomb of Clytemnestra*.

The most splendid monumental structure at Mycenae is the *Treasury of Atreus* (also known as the *Tomb of Agamemnon*). Built around 1250 BC, it was cut into the hillside. The *dromos* and *tholos* are lined with carefully cut blocks. It has a monumental facade 10.50m high, originally elaborately decorated, with a doorway in the middle. The *tholos* is 14.60m in diameter and 13.50m high.

#### *Description - Tiryns*

Tiryns is situated 20km north-east of Mycenae on an isolated rocky hill that rises 26m above the fertile Argolid plain. Its strategic position commands the roads to Argos, Mycenae, Nauplion, and Epidaurous.

The cyclopean *walls*, built of stones even larger than those of Mycenae, are in places up to 8m thick and 13m high. They enclose an area of c 20ha. The entrance, on the eastern side, is approached by a large ramp. The *outer gate*, which is similar in size to the Lion gate at Mycenae, opens out into the space between the outer and inner walls through a second gate.

To the north there is an open defended area, thought to have served as a place of refuge in troubled times for the population of the surrounding area. Concealed stairways give access to underground *spring*s, as at Mycenae.

The main part of the *Upper Citadel* is reached through a forecourt, with a colonnade on one side, and the *Great Propylon*, consisting of two porches with columns. The colonnade is in front of a series of galleries (there are others

to the south) built in a remarkable style, with walls corbelled inwards and terminating in an acute angle at the top.

Next comes the *Outer Palace Courtyard*, which leads in turn through another defended gateway (a smaller version of the Great Propylon) into the *Central Courtyard*. Opening out of this colonnaded open space, with an altar in its centre, is the *Megaron*, the walls of which must have been lavishly decorated, to judge from surviving fragments. Other parts of the Palace cluster around the courtyard; of especial interest is the *Bathroom*, the floor of which is a single limestone slab weighing more than 20t.

The entire complex opens out to the west, the direction of the sea. This was accessible by means of an impressive flight of steps approached through a small postern gate.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

Both sites are protected under the provisions of the 1932 Greek Antiquities Law No 5351, as amended in 1981 (Laws Nos 1126 and 1127), which declares all cultural property to be the property of the State. Permits are required from the competent authority for any form of intervention on protected sites.

The boundaries of the archaeological site of Mycenae and its buffer zone were established by Ministerial Decree No 2160 of 1964. Protection extends to the Citadel (Acropolis), the areas outside the walls, and the wider surrounding area, including the natural environment of the site. Those for Tiryns by Decrees 241 of 1956 and 379 of 1991.

### *Management*

Both sites are the property of the Greek State. The protected area (buffer zone) around Mycenae has either been expropriated by the State or belongs to the Municipality of Mycenae or private individuals. In the latter case, there are strict controls over the use of the land. Similar considerations apply at Tiryns.

Overall management is vested in the Ministry of Culture and delegated to the Directorate of Prehistoric and Classical Antiquities. Direct management (including maintenance, administration, investigation, restoration, and conservation) of the sites is the responsibility of the 4th Ephorate of Prehistoric and Classical Antiquities, based in Nauplion.

Each site has its own curator, who is an archaeologist from the 4th Ephorate. Daily site inspections are carried out by the curators and their site guards (ten at Tiryns and twelve at Mycenae). Professional and technical backup services are provided by the 4th Ephorate in Nauplion, which is close to both sites.

### - Mycenae

The Programme for the Restoration and Conservation of Mycenae, which began in 1997, has been combined since March 1998 with the that of the Work Team for the Conservation of the Monuments of the Asclepion of Epidaurous. Restoration work has been completed on a number of sections of the site. A five-year extension of the programme will include a study of the environment and architectural documentation. Financing for this Programme is assured from the Ministry of Culture, the Credits for the

Execution of Archaeological Works Distribution Fund, and the EU Delors II credits.

A detailed 1½-year Master Plan has been developed, important aspects of which include the creation of a new entrance system and an extensive network of paths leading to platforms for viewing the site. Information signs in Greek and English, hitherto completely lacking, are being installed. Work has been completed on the new Site Museum, which will house interpretative material and finds from the site, as well as storage and laboratory facilities. Its siting near the North Gate will help to reduce visitor pressure on the Lion Gate.

Current visitor numbers are 500,000-700,000 annually. A new and much larger parking area, with a shuttle service to the site, is to be constructed in the nearby modern town.

- Tiryns

A programme of restoration and conservation has been in progress under the direction of the 4th Ephorate for several years, concentrating on restoration of the walls and the area around the Acropolis. These had been in a poor state of repair for some years, as a result of which access to the site was restricted.

A detailed study of future requirements in the Acropolis itself has been carried out by the German Archaeological Institute and is currently being implemented.

A further programme relates to the visitor management and facilities on the site. It covers the creation of pathways, increased parking, installation of restaurant and other facilities, and the rehabilitation of an old building on the site as an information centre.

Current visitor numbers are 20,000-50,000 annually.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Mycenae was excavated by Heinrich Schliemann in 1874-76. Subsequently, a number of limited excavations have been carried out by Greek and British archaeologists. During recent years a topographical survey has been carried out on the buildings (by the British School of Archaeology in Athens), two aerial surveys have been made of the entire site and its surroundings, and the entire Acropolis and the structures outside the walls have been recorded.

Schliemann also excavated at Tiryns (in 1884), and his work was carried on by his assistant, Wilhelm Dörpfeld. Latterly, more intensive work has been carried out on the Acropolis by the German Institute of Archaeology. The most recent architectural and topographical survey took place in 1980.

Considerable restoration and conservation work has been carried out at Mycenae, but this has only begun recently at Tiryns, where there have been serious problems associated with the stability of the walls.

All work at the two sites has been carried out in conformity with strict Greek practice. Only at Tiryns have interventions been more drastic, but these were occasioned by the need to stabilize the walls, which were dangerous in places.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of both sites is very high. Neither site has been subject to interventions of any kind since they were forcibly evacuated in the 5th century BC. Indeed, both were lost until rediscovered in the 19th century.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Mycenae and Tiryns in 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Mycenaean civilization marked a major step forward in European cultural development. The two great archaeological sites of Mycenae and Tiryns together demonstrate the spirit and the achievements of that civilization more than three millennia ago.

### *Comparative analysis*

The role of the Mycenaean civilization in the evolution of European culture is unique in its significance and influence. Mycenae and Tiryns are the most outstanding sites of that culture, and complement one another in the material evidence that they provide of the Mycenaean civilization. For these reasons, therefore, it is impossible to look for comparative sites.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

For *Mycenae* it is important that the new management plan should be implemented with the minimum delay. This plan should be complemented by a plan for regular inspection and maintenance. It would be desirable if greater attention could be given in presentation to the post-Mycenaean levels on the site.

At *Tiryns*, as at Mycenae, it is recommended that the well formulated management plan should be complemented by a regular inspection and maintenance plan.

The area of ancient Tiryns proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List is restricted to that in State ownership. Whilst that part in private ownership is protected by law, ICOMOS feels that it would be more logical if the entire area of the ancient city could be included in the nominated area.

ICOMOS does not wish to make the implementation of these recommendations a condition of inscription, since the cultural importance of the two sites is undeniable and they are currently well managed. So far as the extension of the site proposed for inscription at Tiryns is concerned, it is recognized that this may well present legal problems that will require considerable time for negotiation. The State Party is encouraged to initiate this process straight away, with the objective of proposing an extension at some time in the future.

## **Brief description**

Mycenae and Tiryns are the imposing ruins of the two greatest cities of the Mycenaean civilization which dominated the eastern Mediterranean world in the 15th to

12th centuries BC and which played a vital role in the development of the culture of classical Greece.

### **Recommendation**

That these properties be inscribed, as a single site, on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, iii, iv, and vi*:

*Criterion i* The architecture and design of Mycenae and Tiryns, such as the Lion Gate and the Treasury of Atreus and the walls of Tiryns, are outstanding examples of human creative genius.

*Criterion ii* The Mycenaean civilization, as exemplified by Mycenae and Tiryns, had a profound effect on the development of classical Greek architecture and urban design, and consequently also on contemporary cultural forms.

*Criteria iii and iv* Mycenae and Tiryns represent the apogee of the Mycenaean civilization, which laid the foundations for the evolution of later European cultures.

*Criterion vi* Mycenae and Tiryns are indissolubly linked with the Homeric epics, the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey*, the influence of which upon European literature and the arts for more than three millennia.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Pátmos (Greece)

No 942

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Historic Centre (Chorá) with the Monastery of Saint John the Theologian and the Cave of the Apocalypse on the Island of Pátmos
<i>Location</i>	Prefecture of Dodecanese, Province of Kálymnos, Municipality of Pátmos Island
<i>State Party</i>	Greece
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

#### - *The Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos*

The Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos offers a wealth of scientific interests and aesthetic pleasures both to the scholar and to the ordinary visitor. The monastery, a castle in itself, is one of the best preserved fortified monastic ensembles of the Middle Ages. Its most impressive characteristic, besides its harmonious relation to the natural and built environment, is its uninterrupted continuity and close connection with history: in the nine centuries of its life the monastery obtained its unique architectural physiognomy through the erection, modification, and restoration of buildings or the changes of land use, which were realized in order to cover everyday or artistic needs. The extensive building programmes, covering the period from the foundation of the monastery by Hosios Christodoulos in 1088-99 to the mid 18th century, reveal a variety of architectural expression. Only a few monuments in Greece can exhibit the morphological, stylistic, and artistic wealth as well as the completeness and continuity of life of the Monastery of Theologos. Housing, however, an amazing treasure of movable works of art and literature, the monastery complex has a special functional value, apart from its obvious artistic and historical ones. All the aforementioned data, and also its great spiritual radiance, lend to the Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos a unique significance. A major centre of worship in the Aegean archipelago, it is an ark of the Byzantine and Neo-Hellenic Orthodox tradition, which continues to be in its prime, even today.

#### - *The Ritual of the Washing of the Feet*

The services and rituals of Holy Week are held on Pátmos with the grandeur of Byzantine ceremony, according to the rules of the ancient monastic *typikon*, which the Monastery of Theologos has strictly preserved. The dramatic events of the Passion of Christ are revived through the gospel passages

and the relevant hymns that the monks recite or chant with deep emotion and devoutness.

The most impressive and soul-stirring mystagogy is the Ritual of the Washing of the Feet, which was established in Byzantium and is performed up to the present day on the Wednesday of Holy Week at noon. This ritual is a live re-enactment of the washing of the Apostles' feet by the Lord, one of the dramatic episodes of the cycle of Christ's Passion, and is performed by the abbot and monks of the monastery in front of a large public in the central square of the settlement of Chorá.

#### - *The Apocalypse*

In AD 95 St John the Evangelist was exiled to Pátmos for "bearing witness to Jesus." During his long sojourn on the island he wrote the Apocalypse (the Book of Revelation), the final book of the New Testament. This text offered the persecuted ancient churches of Asia Minor a message of hope and encouragement, gave the eschatological literature its pivotal work, and was an inexhaustible source of artistic inspiration. As the French scholar Guérin points out, "The Apocalypse of John the Evangelist, this masterpiece of poetry, is the supreme work of Christian literature."

The Apocalypse, which has been translated into every spoken language, has inspired not only the greater artists of Byzantium and the Renaissance to create magnificent works of painting, sculpture, and decorative arts, but also the most celebrated composers of ecclesiastical music, who tried to surpass "the chorus of angels" in order to express the ecstatic vision of St John the Divine, and thus endowed humanity with superb religious oratorios.

The nominated property is endowed with obvious archaeological, artistic, and aesthetic values and therefore justifies the criteria for inclusion on the World Heritage List. The ensemble formed by the Monastery of Theologos, the Cave of the Apocalypse, and the settlement of Chorá, harmoniously incorporated into an environment which, in addition, characterized as a landscape of special natural beauty, automatically acquires the value and importance of its uniqueness. The age-long relation of a major centre of Orthodox worship in its prime (the Monastery of Theologos and the Cave of the Apocalypse) with a perfectly preserved historic settlement (Chorá) serves perfectly as a point of creative reference for those seeking records and values of a life beyond the narrow confines of rationalism.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals as regards to the criteria under which it considers the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

Pátmos was colonized first by Dorian and then Ionian Greeks. When it was absorbed into the Roman Empire it was used, like other Aegean islands, as a place of exile for

political prisoners. Among them was the Evangelist St John the Theologian (also known as St John the Divine), who was brought to the island in AD 95 during the reign of Domitian, and it was during his long sojourn on Pátmos that he wrote both the Apocalypse and his Gospel.

Like so many of the Aegean islands Pátmos was devastated by Saracen raiders in the 7th century, and it was virtually uninhabited for the next two centuries. In 1088 Hosios Christodoulos, a Bithynian abbot who had already founded monasteries on Léros and Kos, obtained permission from the Byzantine Emperor Alexis I Comnenus to found a monastery on the island dedicated to St John. This was at a time when the Imperial state was encouraging the resettlement on the islands and shores of the Aegean, a policy which included the establishment of fortified monasteries (eg Néa Moni on the island of Chios and the monasteries of Mount Áthos).

The island was captured by the Venetians in 1208. It is around this period that the oldest settlement on Pátmos was founded, that of Chorá, when married lay brothers and other people working for the monastic community settled around the monastery. After the fall of Constantinople in 1453 about a hundred families were resettled in Chorá, to the west of the monastery, where they established the wealthy area known as Alloteina. At this time the appearance of the settlement was that of dispersed houses essentially rural in nature.

Pátmos came under Turkish control in the early 16th century. Paradoxically, this marked the beginning of a period of prosperity for the islanders, who were granted certain tax privileges in exchange for their submission. The inhabitants of Chorá took advantage of these to engage in shipping and trade, and this is reflected in the fine houses built by wealthy merchants in the late 16th and early 17th centuries, a number of which survive to the present day.

This period of prosperity ended when the island was sacked by the Venetians under Francesco Morosini in 1659. Following the fall of Candia to the Turks in 1669, Venetian refugees were settled on the island. They created a new residential area, known as Kretika, the main square of which was named Agialesvia, dedicated to a female Cretan saint. The urban tissue began to change, the new properties being much smaller and densely packed. It was slowly to recover its former mercantile role, but in the later 18th century and throughout the 19th century Pátmos was once again a major trading centre. In the mid 18th century the Aporthiana quarters were formed as the town expanded. Many of the old houses were rehabilitated and new mansions were built.

#### Description

Pátmos is the northernmost island of the Dodecanese group; its area is *c* 34 km<sup>2</sup> and its present population is *c* 2500. It is largely a barren island, formed of three volcanic masses connected by narrow isthmuses. There are three settlements - the medieval Chorá, the 19th century harbour of Skála, and the small rural Kampos.

The site selected by Christodoulos for his *Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos (St John the Divine)* dominates the whole island. The present complex has been built up progressively over the centuries since the foundation of the monastery in 1088, using the volcanic stone of which the island is composed. It has the external appearance of a polygonal castle, with towers and crenellations, and it is indeed one of the finest surviving examples of a fortified

medieval monastic complex. There is a magnificent view of the entire island from its battlements.

The complex has evolved in an unplanned manner around a central courtyard over several centuries. The earliest elements, belonging to the 11th century, are the *Katholikón* (main church) of the monastery, the Chapel of Panagía, and the refectory. The north and west sides of the courtyard are lined with the white walls of monastic cells and the south side is formed by the *tzafara*, a two-storeyed arcade of 1698 built in dressed stone, whilst the outer narthex of the *Katholikón* forms the east side.

The *Katholikón*, which was completed around 1090, is in the domed cross-in-square style supported on four ancient columns that is typical of the period. The elaborate floor, of white and grey marble in *opus sectile*, is original, as are the carved wooden beams of the nave of the Byzantine church. The original wall paintings have been overlaid by frescoes painted around 1600, but parts of them have been revealed during recent restoration work on the later frescoes. The carved wooden *iconostasis* was the donation of the Patmian Metropolitan in 1820, but the icons that adorn it date from several periods. The tomb of the founder, Hosios Christodoulos, formed part of a Russian endowment in 1796, which also included lamps, candlesticks, and choir stalls.

Adjoining the *Katholikón* on the south side is the *Chapel of Panagía*, which was added in the mid 12th century. This is a small single-aisled structure, roofed with barrel vaults and a groined vault. It contains frescoes painted in 1176-80 which were revealed during restoration work in 1958. They depict the Mother of God (*Theotokos*), the Archangels Michael and Gabriel, and other Biblical scenes. The carved wooden *iconostasis* (1607) is decorated with icons in the contemporary Cretan style.

The *refectory*, which is reached via the inner courtyard, also dates from 1080; it contains frescoes from three periods - 1176-80, the late 12th century, and the third quarter of the 13th century. They depict the Passion and various Church Councils. The marble tables and benches are original.

Steps lead from the refectory to the *Library*, containing some two thousand printed books and over a thousand manuscripts, many of them of great antiquity and beauty. Its foundations were laid by Christodoulos, who brought with him from the monastery that he founded at Miletus many manuscripts that he had saved from the Turks. It was this collection which enabled Pátmos to become a major spiritual and intellectual centre for the region for many centuries. The comprehensive archives of the monastery provide priceless continuous information on its evolution from the 11th century onwards.

The *Sacristy* of the monastery contains a wealth of religious treasures. These include holy relics and fragments from the True Cross, portable icons, richly embroidered vestments, and fine examples of gold and silver work.

Other areas of the monastery vividly illustrate monastic daily life, and also provide valuable information on the domestic architecture of monastic establishments. They include the *kitchen*, built before 1091, the *oreton* (granary), the *pithones* in which oil was stored in large earthenware jars (*pithoi*), and the *magiperon* (bakery).

Midway along the road that winds steeply up from Skála to Chorá is the *Cave of the Apocalypse (Spilaion Apokalyp-*

seos), where according to tradition St John dictated the Book of Revelation and his Gospel to his disciple Prochoros. This holy place attracted a number of small churches, chapels, and monastic cells, creating an interesting architectural ensemble.

The focal building is the Church of Hagia Anna and Hagios Ioannis Theologos: the north aisle is dedicated to the former and the south aisle, in which the Cave of the Apocalypse itself is located, is dedicated to the latter. Only a fraction of the mural paintings that originally covered the walls of the Cave survive, but one showing the saint dictating to his disciple and dated to the 12th century is still intact. It also contains an outstanding carved *iconostasis* (1600) and two exceptional Cretan icons (1596).

Two more chapels were added at the beginning of the 17th century, and in 1713 the number of cells was increased, as part of the now ruined complex of the Patmian School.

The town of *Chorá* contains a number of fine small churches. Among these are Hagioi Apostoloi (1609), Hagia Lesvia, the twin-domed church of Agioi Vaileios and Thalaleos, Hagios Spyridon, Hagios Dimitrios, and Eleimontra. Dating mostly from the 17th and 18th centuries, they contain important mural paintings, icons, and other church furnishings.

The town itself has a number of fine residential houses ("Captains' Houses"), most of them at some distance from the monastery and built during the prosperous period at the end of the 16th and early 17th centuries. Among these are the houses of Sopholis and Natalis (1599), Pagostas (1606), Moussoudakis (1625), Simirantis (1625), Syphantos (1636), and Skrinis (1640).

The main construction material was stone, dressed or undressed. This was either a granitoid grey rock from the Manolakas quarry or limestone from the Megalo quarry. A characteristic feature of Patmian buildings is the *mantoma*, an opening formed by beams support by pillars. Roofs are generally flat and made of long trunks of cypress wood (*fites*), covered with reeds or seaweed and clay. From the architectural point of view, the living and bed rooms are the most interested. The former are usually decorated with ancestral portraits, embroideries, icons, and *objets d'art* brought from abroad by voyaging family members.

There is a small group of neo-classical houses dating from the 19th century. The houses of the Kalligas, Themelis, Konsolis, and Leousis families are the most representative of this period.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

Legal protection is afforded to the nominated site by a number of complementary legal instruments at national level.

The entire town of *Chorá*, including the Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos, is a designated "historic landmark community"; no changes to structures or spaces within the area are permitted without the approval of the Ministry of Culture's 4th Ephorate of Byzantine Antiquities, under legislation established in 1960. The Cave of the Apocalypse is a recognized monument under the 1932 legislation to protect listed monuments of architectural and archaeological value. The Cave of the Apocalypse and the immediate environment of *Chorá* (essentially an adjacent buffer zone)

are a fully protected non-development zone, again under the authority of the 4th Ephorate, in accordance with the 1995 legislation. The "mountain slope of *Pátmos*, defined by the present end of *Skála* and the settlement of *Chorá*," is recognized as being of "special natural beauty" under the authority of the 4th Ephorate, in 1968 legislation. Any changes or developments proposed for the "mountain slope of *Pátmos*" require authorization by the 4th Ephorate.

The entire island of *Pátmos* was recognized as a "historic landmark and landscape" under the full protection of the Ministry of the Environment, Physical Planning and Public Works in legislation enacted in 1971; the parallel designation of the island as a "historic landmark and as a place of special natural beauty" under the authority of the 4th Ephorate in 1972 has ensured timely provision of advice concerning cultural heritage issues by the Ministry of Culture to the former Ministry, whose review concerns primarily land use, density, general building forms and massing, and environmental impacts. In addition, the presumption in favour of continuing agriculture on designated agricultural lands on *Pátmos* limits the possibilities of development for approximately two-thirds of the island's land area.

Approval of repair projects within the nominated zone must also be obtained from the Ministry of the Environment, Physical Planning and Public Works and the Municipality of *Pátmos* to ensure that proposals respect public security, safety, hygiene, and general environmental objectives at both national and municipal levels. In the case of conflicts in the nominated zone, the Ministry's objectives prevail.

Significant protection is also provided through the mechanism of "public" ownership. In addition to the monastic complex itself and the Cave, the Monastery owns two convents (*Zoodochos Pegi*, *Evangelismos*), and many churches and houses within *Chorá*. The Government of Greece and the Municipality of *Pátmos* are also owners of significant numbers of properties within *Chorá*. Many individual large houses belong to rich absentee owners. Their presence is often seasonal, but they ensure high continuing standards of care and maintenance.

### Management

Given the complexity of jurisdictions and ownership patterns within *Chorá* and its religious complexes, there is no single management plan governing decision-making. However, effective site management is achieved through a complementary set of coordination mechanisms and initiatives, many having their origins in traditional patterns of cooperation on the island. The Committee for the Sacredness of the Island of *Pátmos*, established in 1980, which reflects the historical interdependence of the religious community and the adjacent settlement from whose families the monks were drawn, provides a forum in which the Monastery and the Municipality discuss together development proposals from a public amenity perspective. Its efforts have ensured that many of the tourism abuses found in other parts of the Aegean have been avoided, preserving in large measure the tranquillity appropriate to the sacred values of *Pátmos*, and building open and positive communication between secular and ecclesiastical authorities in all areas of common concern. *Pátmos* also has many community service clubs and public institutions whose objectives are closely aligned with the preservation of the island's cultural heritage.

Many of the key partners in the preservation efforts are taking an increasingly proactive approach to long-term management and development needs within the community. The Monastery has recently installed a high-grade materials conservation centre within its walls to allow it to undertake restoration and repair work *in situ*. At present the Monastery is also exploring means to develop a small seminar and conference centre within or in relation to Chorá, and a regional training centre for painting restoration. The Municipality is exploring projects to enhance the quality of life in the community and strengthen commitment to its heritage and values. These include reinstatement, at least symbolically, of the former Patmian school adjacent to the Cave of the Apocalypse, to strengthen the place of the Patmiada School. Priority is being given to significant environmental and social issues within the context of the Plan for Regional Development 2000-2006 (SANTER) of the European Union (EU). The 4th Ephorate has undertaken a number of projects with EU funding, including restoration of the Zoodochos Pigi convent. Further restoration projects for the Monastery, the Cave, and the Nikolaidi Archontiki (mansion) are proposed for the immediate future.

These initiatives and approaches reflect the high quality of personal leadership brought to conservation issues and questions within the Monastery and the Municipality. The special commitment brought to the treatment and management of conservation issues in Pátmos by the 4th Ephorate is also worth noting. Periodic visits of the Ephorate's professionals are effectively supported by the presence of a staff inspector resident on the island, a position continuously maintained on Pátmos for over 34 years now.

The combination of responsible ownership, protective legislation, continuous monitoring of construction activity, and evolving traditional coordination mechanisms and relationships is working effectively to assure the survival of the special qualities of the nominated site. In and around Chorá, however, there are some minor examples of abuse of the system: unauthorized constructions, unresolved conflicts between the Ephorate and local owners, and a few unsympathetic and badly sited developments within the buffer zone surrounding the nominated site (where the Ephorate's advice has been overruled by higher authorities). However, these problems do not threaten in any substantial way the character of the nominated site.

An exception is the relatively uncontrolled growth of Skála (the port for Chorá) over the last 20 years which has diminished the quality and integrity of the Pátmos experience and which, if permitted to continue, could impair the values of the nominated site. Control over development in Skála was transferred from the Ministry of Culture to the Ministry of the Environment in 1982. Since then the town has tripled in size; many of the changes introduced have destroyed or trivialized much of its intrinsic architectural character. This is unfortunate since undoubtedly Skála, as the port for Chorá and the Monastery, has contributed substantially to their development over time.

Another potential threat to the sacred values of Pátmos may lie in the dated tourism strategies. Tourism today is guided by the 1979 *Pátmos: Study of the Effects of Tourism in the Environment*, which established guidelines for appropriate development of the industry on the island. However, since the statistical basis of this study is now obsolete, and the Ministry no longer appears to play the strong supporting role

in development of tourism within traditional settlements that it did in the 1980s, the authorities should review the adequacy of the current provisions to manage tourist flows. The Monastery has carefully thought-out mechanisms and procedures for controlling the numbers and movement of visitors through the sites that it owns.

Much of the effectiveness of current management mechanisms on Pátmos relates to the commitment and vision of a small number of key individuals. It would be useful, in taking advantage of the current positive climate for conservation, to consider building a permanent institutional basis for integrated management of the island's heritage resources. Development of a management plan, building on past and current management strengths and integrating concern for conservation within development plans, including updated approaches to tourism and to risk preparedness (Pátmos lies within a zone of high earthquake risk) would provide a permanent mechanism for maintaining the island's sacred values irrespective of future changes in personnel.

## **Conservation and authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

The Monastery, the Chorá, and the Cave of the Apocalypse have evolved continuously over time, in response to wars, occupation, and migration patterns in the Aegean. Accompanying changes to layout and building forms have been introduced in ways which do not obliterate the origins of the settlement and which allow the significant chapters of the history of the site to be clearly read today. Much of the survival of the features and values of the religious/secular settlement relate to the inherently conservative and respectful land-management practices of those occupying the site over centuries.

Modern conservation on Pátmos closely parallels the growth of capacity within the government service for conservation in Greece. During the Italian occupation of the Dodecanese (1912-48), conservation was strongly supported and considerable attention given to the care of traditional settlements, including the Chorá of Pátmos and its monastery. When Greece assumed responsibility for the Dodecanese, the 1932 Greek monuments legislation was immediately applied and urgent efforts were directed to inventory and stock-taking to document the depredations of war and to up-date the list of monuments. The Greek Government has continuously built and strengthened its ability to control and assist in the conservation process. In the 1960s, the protective provisions of Greek archaeological law were first applied to settlements, providing benefits for communities like Pátmos. In 1977, an Ephorate for Byzantine Antiquities under the Ministry of Culture was established in Rhodes with responsibility for pre-1830 settlements; this gave an increased focus to conservation needs on Pátmos. The Ephorate has grown continuously, in terms of resources, professional capacity (its staff now numbers over 100, including approximately 20 professionals), and in the sophistication of its approaches to conservation.

Today, the Ephorate ensures that major restoration works are carried out to high standards, sound models of conservation practice are provided locally, continuing support is given to developing and maintaining specialist craft skills and

producing traditional materials, and guidance and direction is given to work carried out privately. The Ephorate maintains and promotes the highest standards of contemporary conservation practice, using consensus models to involve all its partners in decision-making and ensuring that comprehensive research, investigation, and documentation underlie all work.

All the major monuments receive regular conservation attention. Some have been the subject of major restoration projects, some are currently receiving assistance, while major projects are being developed for others. Among major monuments, only the Palia Patmiada lies in ruins, and even here competing concepts for its eventual restoration are being debated locally.

Some conservation work of the Ephorate has recently been described as “excessive” (eg at the Zoodochos Pigi Convent) but a consistent consultation process is scrupulously adhered to. Improvements in the Ephorate’s effectiveness might be obtained by balancing traditional “inspection and control” models of protection with greater use of “support” models: giving greater emphasis to development of educational mechanisms for property owners (eg use of design guidelines), the provision of design advice to owners at an early stage in their projects, and use of awards to owners who carry out sensitive conservation work. These could reduce the conflicts inherent in the inspection model, and in the long term bring about greater public support for, understanding of, and interest in quality conservation work.

#### *Authenticity*

The Monastery, the Chorá, and the Cave of the Apocalypse offer a highly authentic reflection of the site’s significant values, at many levels.

The material fabric and design features of the significant elements and their organizational patterns have been well maintained and provide an authentic and credible expression of the site’s stylistic and typological models (eg the fortified monastery within a concentric Aegean *chorá*); the various neighbourhoods of the Chorá, including that built by refugees from Constantinople (Alloteina), using 15th century Byzantine forms and construction technologies; the Kretika, built by immigrants from Crete in 1669 following the fall of Candia (modern-day Iraklion) which introduced new styles of *archontika* (mansions); and the agrarian style adopted for the Zoodochos Pigi, etc.

Authenticity of setting and craftsmanship have been compromised but not significantly. The setting for the Monastery, the Chorá, and the Cave must be understood to extend into the surrounding Aegean, and the rapid and insensitive growth for tourism of the port of Skála undermines the authenticity of the experience of arrival of the island’s pilgrims, maintained with high integrity over many centuries until very recently. Although a modern automobile road links Skála to the Cave and ultimately Chorá, the footpath system and the associated traditional landscape remain key elements within a highly authentic setting. While much of the traditional craftsmanship has been lost to modernization of the construction industry, efforts to revive these crafts and to train and support practising artisans are now a part of every conservation project. Considerable effort is being directed to re-establish sources of supply for traditional local materials, such as the ceramic tile *patiniotiko*

*plakai* used to cover outdoor terraces and ground-floor surfaces.

Authenticity with respect to continuity of traditions and use is extraordinary. There are many remarkable examples: the retention of many early Christian traditions such as the Ceremony of the Washing of the Feet in Easter Week, the modern-day Patmiada school, a continuation of the 1713 institution, through which, almost uniquely in Greece during the Ottoman period, the continuity of the teachings of the Greek orthodox church was assured, and the recognition, in the establishment of the 1980 Committee of the Sacredness of the Island of Pátmos, of the efforts of the *koino* to establish a secular community institution as early as 1659 to assist the Monastery to fulfil its special mission within the Orthodox church.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Pátmos in March 1999.

##### *Qualities*

The monastery of St John the Theologian is a unique creation, integrating monastic values within a fortified enclosure, which has continuously and harmoniously evolved in response to changing political and economic circumstances for over 900 years. The Monastery is also home to a remarkable collection of manuscripts, icons, and liturgical artwork and objects.

The Palia Patmiada school, through which Greek orthodox culture was maintained through two centuries of Ottoman rule, linked students from Asia Minor, Russia, the Balkans, North Africa, and Ethiopia with the teachings of the school.

Pátmos may said to be the last living home of the Byzantine civilization which left Constantinople in 1453. Alloteina was built by refugees from the city after its fall; many of those families and the structures they built are still in place today.

Chorá itself is one of the best preserved and oldest of the Aegean *chorá*, its origins going back over 900 years. Unlike most Aegean *chorá*, created to support agrarian activity in the 17th century, here the Monastery supported an agrarian settlement shortly after its beginning in 1132. The Monastery is the only fortified monastic complex in the Greek Orthodox world. The *archontiki* of the Chorá exhibit a unique combination of mainland bourgeois and island agrarian features and typological characteristics.

The Monastery is one of the most important pilgrimage centres in the Christian world. The importance of the shrine of St John stimulated the Monastery to generate strong educational programmes which have fostered both the survival and the extension of the teachings of the Orthodox church and have led to the creation of an incomparable library and archives of the Christian Orthodox faith, to support academic and philosophical inquiry.

##### *Comparative analysis*

While there are many monastic complexes in Greece and the Orthodox world of great quality and importance, the elements of the nominated site are unique in several ways, considered both as an ensemble and individually.

Pátmos is the only example of an Orthodox monastery integrating from its origins a supporting community, the Chorá, built around the hill-top fortifications. While fortified monasteries may be found in other parts of the Orthodox world, the Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos is the only example of a fortified monastery in Greece.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

Consideration should be given to a number of measures that would increase management control over various components of the nominated site and adjacent territory:

- inclusion of Skála within the buffer zone, while ensuring that appropriate means of control over development in Skála be re-established to prevent further erosion of its character.
- strengthening measures for protection of the island's natural environment, to limit further and decisively the possibility of building activity and scale within the landscape, including airport and communication tower development and deployment.
- development of an integrated management plan for the entire island establishing the place of conservation among all interests on the island, giving particular attention to appropriate tourism development and risk preparedness measures.

#### **Brief description**

The small island of Pátmos in the Dodecanese is reputed to be where St John the Theologian wrote both his Gospel and the Apocalypse. A monastery dedicated to the "Beloved Disciple" was founded there in the late 10th century, and it has been a place of pilgrimage and of Greek Orthodox learning continuously since that time. The fine monastic complex dominates the island, and the old settlement of Chorá associated with it, which contains many fine religious and secular buildings.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iv and vi*:

*Criterion iv* The Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos (Saint John the Theologian) and the Cave of the Apocalypse on the island of Pátmos, together with the associated ancient settlement of Chorá, constitute an exceptional example of a traditional Greek Orthodox pilgrimage centre of outstanding architectural interest.

*Criterion vi* The Monastery of Hagios Ioannis Theologos and the Cave of the Apocalypse commemorate the site where St John the Theologian (Divine), the "Beloved Disciple," composed two of the most sacred Christian works, his Gospel and the Apocalypse.

## Hortobágy (Hungary)

No 474rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Hortobágy National Park
<i>Location</i>	Hajdú-Bihar, Jász-Nagyun-Szolnok, Heves, and Borsod-Abaúj-Zemplén Counties
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Hungary
<i>Date</i>	25 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Hortobágy is an outstanding example of a harmonious interaction between people and nature, based upon sustainable land-use practices, thereby maintaining a diversity of species and biotopes. The *Puszta* represents the highest scenic quality, with pleasing or dramatic patterns and combinations of landscape features, together with important aesthetic and intangible qualities. The area is completely unspoiled by large-scale, visually intrusive or polluting industrial and urban development, with associated infrastructure. It has a distinctive and common character, including topographic and visual unity. At the same time, the integrity of the landscape is maintained with monuments, buildings, and other structures of great historical and architectural interest. There is consensus among professionals and public opinion as to the world importance of the site, reflected, for example, through associations with internationally renowned writings and paintings about the landscape and its inhabitants. This landscape is undoubtedly a resource of world importance in terms of both rarity and representativeness.

Hortobágy National Park, which extends over a vast territory, represents the continuous existence of traditional land-use forms over several thousand years, maintaining the highest level of biodiversity.

-----

The Hortobágy National Park bears unique witness to the cultural traditions of 18th and 19th century animal keepers.

The Park is surrounded by settlements on three sides, and the man-made environment to be seen today is characterized by a rich historical diversity. It encompasses relics of various nations and cultures who have left traces behind during their migrations. There are monuments ranging from *kurgans* (burial mounds) from as early as the 2nd millennium BC through the devastated settlements of medieval Hungary to

the numerous 18th and 19th century buildings that are still in use today and are of exceptional architectural value.

Although the man-made environment of today is diversified and stratified, the feature that makes this region unusual in Hungary and unique in Europe results mainly from herding, which was of great importance in the 18th and 19th centuries. The process of depopulation began in the 14th century and the region had become deserted by the end of the 17th century following the series of wars with the Ottoman Empire.

### Criteria iii and iv

The Hortobágy National Park is an exceptional surviving example of the sustainable land-use by grazing of natural grasslands.

Animal husbandry on extensive grasslands was the basic activity and way of life of the nomadic people who inhabited this region in the 5th and 4th millennia BC, and also of the Hungarian conquerors at the end of the 1st millennium AD. This way of life was maintained throughout the Middle Ages (a late 16th century map shows this region as being used for grazing cattle) and the later period of prosperity set a final imprint on the man-made environment of the region. Herding is a form of land-use which does not alter the natural landscape but instead makes use of the natural resources without causing any damage to them. It requires only extensive pastures and few, if any, solid structures. It is therefore not by accident that the nominated area contains very few buildings. These include wells for the use of stock, thatched wooden shelters for use in winter, bridges over rivers, and *csárdas* (provincial inns) scattered along the roads at intervals of half or one *jordana*. These are not only the invaluable records of the former pastoral life but also living proof of the harmonious co-existence of man and nature.

### Criterion v

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

Numerous peoples migrated from the east into the Carpathian Basin in prehistory. The nomadic group who arrived around 2000 BC at the end of the Bronze Age were the first to leave their imprint on the natural landscape in the form of many burial mounds (*kurgans*). The region lay outside the Roman Empire, and at this time it was settled by the Sarmatians, an equestrian group of oriental origin. The Avars came to the region in the mid 6th century AD, and they were followed by Slavic settlers.

The Hungarians arrived in what is now Hungary at the end of the 9th century under their leader, Arpád. Since the area was ideal for animal husbandry they occupied the lands around the Tisza river in the 10th and 11th centuries, and by the early 13th century there was a dense network of settlements, whose economic base was pastoralism, in the Hortobágy, the main axis of which was the trading route from Buda through

Tiszafüred and Debrecen into Transylvania. A Cuman group from southern Russia settled peacefully around Nagykurság in the south-west of the Hortobágy in the early 13th century.

However, the whole region was devastated by the Mongol horde that swept through this part of Europe in 1241-42 and many settlements were never rebuilt after the sudden withdrawal of the Mongols following the death of their Great Khan. Numerous villages were depopulated and abandoned during the Black Death in the mid 14th century, whilst the growth of Debrecen attracted the inhabitants of other villages to the new urban centre.

The region fell into the hands of the Ottoman Turks when Debrecen was captured in 1543. Yet more villages were abandoned in the course of the wars that swept the region between 1593 and 1608 and as a result of the Crimean Tartar incursion in 1594, and the Fifteen Years War which saw the Turks driven out of Hungary in 1711.

The 150 years of Turkish rule consolidated the pastoral economy that was to dominate the Hortobágy henceforth. Great herds of cattle and sheep were kept on the open pastures from early spring to late autumn, being driven to winter shelters near water sources for the winter. This system broke down, however, in the early 19th century as a result of the poor economic state of Europe at the end of the Napoleonic wars and changes in dietary habits. At the same time, water regulation systems were set up, notably control over flooding of the Tisza river: this resulted in the draining of former wetlands, which were converted to arable farming. Reduction of the water available for the natural pastures decreased their fertility, which was the cause of serious overgrazing in the early part of the 20th century.

Efforts were made to diversify the land use of the Hortobágy, the most successful of which was the creation of artificial fishponds between 1914 and 1918 and again in the 1950s, as a result of which they now cover 65km<sup>2</sup>. An attempt to introduce rice cultivation in the 1950s was not successful, nor were forestation projects on alkaline grasslands resulting from the water regulation schemes.

#### *Description*

The Hortobágy National Park is part of the Tisza plain of eastern Hungary. It is surrounded by settlements to the south, east, and west. The two main settlements are Tiszafüred on the Tisza river and the city of Debrecen. The two are linked by the main historic communication ridge route.

The oldest man-made elements of the landscape are the Early Bronze Age burial mounds (*kurgans*). Their dimensions are variable – 5-10m high and 20-50m in diameter – and they are generally conical or hemispherical. They are always to be found on dry land, but located near a source of water. They were often used for secondary burials by later peoples, and in some cases Christian churches were built on them by the Hungarians. Also to be found in the Park are the low mounds (*tells*) that mark the sites of ancient settlements, now disappeared.

Settlement in the Middle Ages followed the Debrecen-Tiszafüred route. The main group was in the area defined by the existing settlement of Hortobágy, Naghegyes, Náduvdar, and Nagyiván. Documentary records have shown that many of these had churches. With the progressive depopulation of the region from the 14th century onwards, the settlements disappeared. The only man-made features in the wide plains

of the Puszta were light temporary structures made of reeds and branches, used to provide winter shelter for animals and men.

The sole surviving structures from this time, which were public buildings constructed built in stone, are the bridges and the *csárdas*. The Nine Arch Bridge at Hortobágy is the longest stone bridge in Hungary. A wooden bridge known to have been in existence as early as the 14th century was replaced in 1827-33 by the existing structure in classical style. The Zádor bridge in the southern part of the National Park was built in 1809 with nine arches, but the two side piers were swept away by a flood on the Zádor river in 1830 and never replaced.

The *csárdas* were provincial inns built in the 18th and 19th centuries to provide food and lodging for travellers. The typical *csárda* consists of two buildings facing one another, both singled-storeyed and thatched or, occasionally, roofed with shingles or tiles. A tavern was normally set up on the side of the road with a railed-off counter in a room that had access to the wine cellar. A few also had one or two guest rooms. On the opposite side of the road from the *csárda* was provision for horses and carriages. The best known of the *csárdas* are those at Balmazújváros (18th century), Hortobágy (first built in 1699 and reconstructed on several occasions), Nagyhegyes (early 19th century), Nagyiván (mid 18th century), and Tiszafüred (c 1770).

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The Hortobágy National Park was established in 1972 by Presidential Decree of the National Authority for Nature Conservation No 1850. The original 52,000ha was extended by a further 11,422ha in 1993 and it reached its present extent in 1996.

It is regulated by Articles 31-41 of the 1996 Law No LIII on Nature Conservation. These impose severe limitations on any activities that may have adverse impact on the character and qualities of protected areas, including land clearance, building or other form of construction or earth moving, and unauthorized vehicle use.

##### *Management*

Of the total area of the Park (74,820ha), 68,196ha are in State ownership (principally the National Park Directorate, with other areas owned by the water management authorities, the Hungarian army, and other State institutions). Of the rest, 5069ha are owned by collective farms, 1263ha by private individuals, 254ha by municipalities, and 38ha by non-governmental organizations.

Article 36 of the 1996 Law on Nature Conservation requires there to be a management plan for each protected natural area, to be revised every ten years. That currently in force for the Hortobágy National Park, prepared in 1997, covers the following items:

- Purchase of remaining areas owned by collective farms;
- Supporting the establishment of stock-rearing companies in the surrounding settlements, so as to avoid fragmented land management;

- Obtaining rights for nature conservation in areas specified for extension of the Park;
- Enforcement of regulations dealing with the use of chemicals, hunting, etc in the buffer zone;
- Systematization and better dissemination of research data;
- Continuation and extension of new species surveys;
- Designation of natural values discovered by research as protected;
- Development of an overall research strategy.

Article 30 of the 1996 Law on Nature Conservation requires protected natural areas to be protected, "in case of necessity," by buffer zones. The buffer zone for the Hortobágy National Park has been defined; it covers an area of 199,380ha.

The National Park Directorate has a staff of 42, of whom twenty are administrators/professionals, thirteen are rangers, six technical staff, and three drivers. The Directorate is under the overall control of the Ministry of Environment and Regional Policy. It is the authority of first instance in relation to non-State-owned properties within the Park.

The *kurgans*, *csárdas*, and other historic properties within the Park are protected as historic monuments under the provisions of the 1997 Law No LIV on Ancient Monuments. The regional offices of the National Office of Ancient Monuments in Debrecen, Eger, and Szolnok are responsible for monitoring their state of conservation and taking necessary action.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Conservation of the natural values of the nominated area has been continuous since the Hortobágy National Park was established in 1972. A series of laws enacted since 1995 have increased statutory controls over the designated area, providing protection for the preservation of man-made environments and assigning responsibilities for protection to community councils, local municipalities, and county administrations.

The entire nominated property is a Biosphere Reserve under the UNESCO Man and the Biosphere (MAB) programme. More than 23,000ha are protected under the RAMSAR Convention as wetlands of international importance.

### *Authenticity*

The historic trajectory of the *Puszta* has been such that its cultural growth and decline are recorded indelibly in its landscape. The landscape of today is a palimpsest of its long history which has not been overlaid by more recent technological or social developments. Its authenticity as a cultural landscape is therefore absolute.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An expert nominated by ICOMOS after discussion with IUCN visited the property at the end of April 1999.

### *Qualities*

The landscape of the Hungarian *Puszta* as exemplified by the Hortobágy National Park bears exceptional testimony to its evolution over time. The natural resource of vast expanses of grass and other animal foods attracted settlers there from earliest times to practise a nomadic or semi-nomadic pastoral way of life. Abundant traces of their presence from prehistory to the recent past survive intact or as vestiges, and the subsequent economic decline of the region has ensured that they have not been obliterated by more recent development.

### *Comparative analysis*

The *Puszta* is a flat floodplain that is periodically inundated, lying on an alluvial fan that has been eroding continuously since the end of the last Ice Age. Morphologically it is partly flood plain and partly loess ridges, and the characteristics of both can be clearly seen in the Hortobágy National Park. In Europe this type of landscape is only to be found in the Carpathian Basin. The only other similar landscapes that are comparable in size are to be found to the east of the Urals.

### *ICOMOS comments and recommendations*

This property was first nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List in 1988, under the natural criteria. On the recommendation of IUCN it was not accepted for inscription, but its natural qualities as a Biosphere Reserve and Ramsar site were acknowledged. Since that time the Committee has developed its categorization of cultural landscapes, and the present resubmission is made under the cultural criteria, implicitly as a cultural landscape.

The nomination dossier contains considerable information about the natural qualities of the nominated area, with almost equal space in the "Description of Property" section devoted to natural habitats, biotopes, and the avifauna as to the cultural heritage. The important links between the natural characteristics of the region and its cultural development are not clearly stated, although diligent search through several sections reveals the essential facts.

In the description of the cultural heritage, details are supplied of the most important *csárdas* and the two historic bridges. However, there is only a general account of the prehistoric burial mounds (*kurgans*) and a passing reference to settlement mounds. Similarly, there is no information about specific abandoned medieval village sites.

The mission report commented favourably on the degree of protection afforded to the cultural elements located in the property, but proposed that the State Party should be requested to provide a comprehensive list of the cultural heritage of the Hortobágy National Park, with details of any programmes of inventarization, research, and excavation currently in operation. If no such programmes exist, the State Party is strongly urged to formulate and implement them without delay.

The report also drew attention to the lack of information in the nomination dossier concerning the interaction and coordination between state agencies responsible for the protection of the natural and cultural heritage respectively. Details relating to this point should be supplied by the State Party. However, neither this request, nor that in the preceding paragraph, is considered by ICOMOS to warrant

delay in the inscription of this outstanding cultural landscape.

The information on the natural values of the Hortobágy National Park in the nomination dossier was very comprehensive. On the basis of the mission report, ICOMOS feels that IUCN might be requested to reconsider its 1988 recommendation, with the possibility of inscription under natural criterion iii.

#### **Brief description**

The Hortobágy is a vast area of plains and wetlands that have been used by humans for grazing their domestic animals for more than two millennia.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *cultural criteria iv and v*:

*Criterion iv* The Hungarian *Puszta* is an outstanding example of a cultural landscape shaped by a pastoral human society.

*Criterion v* The landscape of the Hortobágy National Park preserves intact and visible the evidence of its traditional use over more than two millennia and represents the harmonious interaction between human beings and nature.

ICOMOS further recommends a. that the expert mission report be formally submitted to the State Party, requesting action on the points made above, and b. that the Bureau consider requesting IUCN to reconsider its 1988 recommendation that this property should not be inscribed under the natural criteria.

ICOMOS, June 1999

## Darjeeling Railway (India)

No 944

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Darjeeling Himalayan Railway
<i>Location</i>	Darjeeling District, State of West Bengal
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of India
<i>Date</i>	3 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Darjeeling Himalayan Railway is a unique example of construction genius employed by railway engineers in the latter part of the 19th century. The manner in which height is gained in this railway by utilizing various loops and zigzag reversing stations is remarkable. This line also has the distinction of passing through the second highest railway station in the world.

#### Criterion i

This railway also exhibits an important interchange of human values, as it brought about a change in the life-style of the people living in the area. The concept of time changed, as the earlier journey time of five to six days between Calcutta and Darjeeling was compressed into less than 24 hours following the introduction of this railway.

#### Criterion ii

The railway bears a unique testimony to the cultural tradition of tea plantation, which is still the main source of livelihood of the inhabitants of this region, whether landowners, labourers, or traders.

#### Criterion iii

Various facets of the line, such as the innovative measures used to gain height and to overcome obstacles, the workshop at Tindharia, which is still using many original machines, the use of the original steam locomotives and original coaches, such as the *Everest* built in 1914, and the 19th century station buildings, which have preserved their original form, all bear witness to the technological skills of the bygone era and are an outstanding demonstration of their function, illustrating a significant stage in human history.

#### Criterion iv

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The Darjeeling Himalayan Railway is intimately linked with the development of Darjeeling as the queen of hill stations and one of the main tea-growing areas in India, in the early 19th century.

The densely wooded mountain spur on which Darjeeling now stands was formerly part of the Kingdom of Sikkim. It was adopted by the British East India Company as a rest and recovery station for its soldiers in 1835, when the area was leased from Sikkim and building of the hill station began, linked to the plains by road. The region was annexed by the British Indian Empire in 1858.

Calcutta had been linked by rail in 1878 to Siliguri, in the foothills of the Himalaya. By this time the tea industry had become of great importance for the Darjeeling region, and the existing road transport system was inadequate to cope with the increased traffic. Franklin Prestage, Agent of the Eastern Bengal Railway, submitted a detailed proposal for a steam railway from Siliguri to Darjeeling. This received official approval and construction work began immediately. By 1881 it had been completed in three stages.

The privately owned Darjeeling Himalayan Railway (hereafter referred to as the DHR) was purchased by the Government of India in October 1948. Since 1958 it has been managed by the State-owned Northeast Frontier Railway.

#### Description

The DHR consists of 88.48km of 2ft (0.610m) gauge track that connects New Jalpaiguri with Darjeeling, passing through eleven stations between the two termini. One of these, Ghoom, is the second highest railway station in the world, at an altitude of 2258m.

Because it passes through a mountainous region, 73% of the total length of the line consists of curves, the sharpest of which is that between Sukna and Rongtong, where the track passes through 120°. There are six reverses and three loops on the line, the most famous of these being the Batasia Loop between Ghoom and Darjeeling. The steepest gradient is 1 in 18 (in zigzag reverses).

The nominated property consists of the permanent way itself, which varies in width between 3m and 50m, and all the associated buildings - stations, goods sheds ("godowns"), workshops, locomotive and rolling stock sheds, and railway residences. It repeatedly crosses the Hill Cart Road, necessitating the provision of 170 level crossings. During the monsoon months (July and August) land-slips make it necessary for many of these to be reconstructed.

The "Toy Train," as it is affectionately known, affords breathtaking views of high waterfalls, green valleys that are often hidden by cloud, and at its end the splendid panorama of the snow-capped Kanchenjunga range. There are several distinct sections: the 10km plains section between Siliguri and Sukna (partly urban and partly agricultural), the 11km densely forested section from Sukna to beyond Rongtong, the 38km largely deforested open hill section with its many tea gardens to Kurseong, and finally the 30km alpine section

to Darjeeling, dominated by stands of Himalayan pine and tea gardens.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The only protection to the Railway applies to the permanent way, which is in principle controlled under the general measures relating to Central Government property and the specific provisions of the 1989 Railway Act.

### *Management*

The DHR is the property of the Government of India, vested in the Ministry of Railways. Administration of the Railway is the responsibility of the Northeast Frontier Railway, the headquarters of which is located at Guwahati, the capital of the State of Assam.

The fixed and moveable assets of the line are documented by the Northeast Frontier Railway and the buildings are included in a comprehensive register.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

This is a working railway and as a result is maintained according to regular programmes. The funding for these is variable, being dependent upon current needs and the level of traffic generated.

Investment plans have been prepared for the rehabilitation of the station buildings at Darjeeling, Ghoom, Kurseong, and Tindharia. There is a programme of stabilization in progress for the stretch between Sukna and Mahanadi, which is most susceptible to land slips in the monsoon season.

Development of tourism in Darjeeling is heavily dependent upon the efficient working of the Himalayan Railway. Plans are therefore being developed to improve its services. These include track improvement and the purchase of new locomotives and rolling stock. Concurrently the Ministry of Railways has sponsored a comprehensive study of the line by professional transportation consultants.

There is regular interaction with the UK-based Darjeeling Himalayan Railway Heritage Foundation. Studies are in progress on comparable railway systems elsewhere in the world, such as the Festiniog Railway in Wales (UK), the design of which inspired the Darjeeling Railway.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the route as originally commissioned in 1881 has been preserved in a remarkably intact condition, with only minor modifications of an evolutionary nature. All the main station buildings (with the exception of Siliguri Junction and Darjeeling, both which have been rebuilt after being destroyed by fire) have been preserved in their original form.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the property in January 1999. ICOMOS also benefited from the comparative study of historic railways coordinated by the National Railway Museum in York (UK) in 1998 (see below).

### *Qualities*

The DHR represents an exceptional feat of civil engineering that has survived virtually intact up to the present day. It is notable also for the quality of many of its associated buildings, especially the intermediate stations, the railway residences and rest-houses, and the Tindharia workshops

### *Comparative analysis*

The 1998 comparative study of *Railways as World Heritage Sites* defines specific criteria for evaluating historic railways. To be considered for inscription on the World Heritage List they should conform with one or more of the following:

- be a creative work indicative of genius;
- demonstrate the influence of, and on, innovative technology;
- be an outstanding or typical example;
- be illustrative of economic or social developments.

The DHR was selected as a case-study. It was adjudged to be "an outstanding line on several counts, but ... particularly significant with regard to [its] social, economic, and political effects and the route's relationship with the landscape."

The report stresses the fact that the DHR does not possess any grand structures; on the contrary, its design was based on minimal capital expenditure. However, the engineering solutions adopted to cope with the steep gradients and relatively short distances were exceptional.

It also emphasizes the social and economic importance of the line. The narrow gauge adopted, which was admirably suited to the terrain, permitted the transportation of passengers and goods in a way that had a profound impact on the social and economic development of the Darjeeling area.

Finally, the report describes the intimate relationship of the Railway with the varied terrain through which it passes as outstanding

In the light of these comments, there can be little doubt that the DHR is of outstanding quality. The combination of narrow gauge and zigzag reverses was the first in the world, and as such it is of exceptional technological interest. It was the first hill railway anywhere in the world and as such served as the prototype for numerous subsequent railways of this type, adopted in India, in Vietnam, in Burma, in Sumatra, in Java, and elsewhere.

One other point should not be overlooked. The DHR links not only the plains with the high Himalaya, but also two distinct cultural traditions - the Hindu culture of Bengal and the Buddhist culture of the mountain region. As a result Darjeeling, which lies at an important nodal point, reflects a cultural fusion between these two cultures (not forgetting, also, the British influence).

### *ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action*

ICOMOS is impressed by the quality of the DHR, and also by the commitment of those responsible for its management and maintenance to its conservation as part of the railway heritage, both of India and more widely. It is concerned, however, that there is no specific heritage expertise within the Northeast Frontier Railway staff. It proposes that Indian Railways should give special consideration to the possibility of transferring responsibility for conservation of the DHR to a special unit with expertise in heritage matters as well as formal railway management skills. Such a unit would have conservation of heritage values as a high priority in its management and operation. This would appear to be consonant with the development of the line as part of the overall tourism plan for the Darjeeling region.

There is no buffer zone along the length of the DHR. Given the complexities of planning in India, ICOMOS urges the State Party to prepare an environmental management plan in association with all the relevant authorities responsible for the protection of the landscape along its route.

ICOMOS is conscious that both proposals will require a lengthy period before they can be developed and implemented. It is conscious of the significance of the DHR, of the current level of conservation, and of the existing commitment of all concerned to its continued existence. It does not therefore propose that inscription on the World Heritage List should be conditional upon their application. It suggests that the Committee consider asking the State Party to provide regular progress reports, with the objective of having appropriate structures in force within the next five years.

The significance of this property lies in its continuing use as a working railway. Its abandonment would necessarily call its continuing World Heritage value into question.

### **Brief description**

The Darjeeling Himalayan Railway is the first, and still the most outstanding, example of a hill passenger railway. Opened in 1881, it applied bold and ingenious engineering solutions to the problem of establishing an effective rail link across a mountainous terrain of great landscape beauty. It is still fully operational and retains most of its original features intact.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

*Criterion ii* The Darjeeling Himalayan Railway is an outstanding example of the influence of an innovative transportation system on the social and economic development of a multi-cultural region, which was to serve as a model for similar developments in many parts of the world.

*Criterion iv* The development of railways in the 19th century had a profound influence on social and economic developments in many parts of the world. This process is illustrated in an exceptional and seminal fashion by the Darjeeling Himalayan Railway

## Victoria Terminus (India)

No 945

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Victoria Terminus (Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus)
<i>Location</i>	City of Mumbai, Maharashtra State
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of India
<i>Date</i>	3 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

This magnificent and imposing structure built in medieval Italian Gothic architecture is definitely the most imposing station building in the world and one of the most magnificent buildings in the entire Indian sub-continent. Finally completed in 1888, it represents a masterpiece of human creative genius exhibited in the latter part of the 19th century, which is even now recognized as unparalleled.

#### Criterion i

This railway station exhibits an important interchange of human values, by way of development of architecture, monumental art, and town planning, with the railway station being at the centre of the city.

#### Criterion ii

This building is a testimony to a tradition of railway transport in the history of India, since railways were first started in India at Bombay.

#### Criterion iii

Various facets of this 19th century medieval Italian Gothic structure, such as the high central dome, the large bas-reliefs, the entrance gate columns, the ornamental friezes, etc, are all representative of an outstanding architecture in building design and construction which illustrates a significant stage in the art and architecture of human history.

#### Criterion iv

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

### History and Description

#### History

The site which this property is situated, Bori Bunder, is of great historical importance and is associated with the origins of Bombay (now Mumbai) as a city. The city derives its name from the goddess Mumba Devi, and the earliest temple dedicated to her is believed to have stood at the site of the Victoria Terminus. The original shrine was demolished in

1317 by Mubarak Shah and reconstructed. This was demolished by the Portuguese in 1760.

Before 1852, when the first pier was built, Bori Bunder was no more than a landing stage for small boats, and its railway station was a modest wooden structure. The Victoria Terminus that replaced it was named after Queen Victoria, Empress of India, on whose Silver Jubilee it was formally opened in 1887. Originally intended only to house the main station and the administrative offices of the Great Indian Peninsula Railway, a number of ancillary buildings have been added subsequently, all designed so as to harmonize with the main structure, which was completed in 1888. A new station to handle main line traffic was erected in 1929.

The original building is still in use to handle suburban traffic and is used by over two million commuters daily. It is also the administrative headquarters of the Central Railway.

#### Description

The Victoria Terminus was built to the designs of the consulting architect, F W Stevens. Work began in 1878 and was completed ten years later. It is in High Victorian Gothic style based on late medieval Italian models. This style was acceptable to both European and Indian taste, since it is compatible in its use of colour and ornamentation with the Mughal and Hindu architecture of the sub-continent. The skyline, turrets, pointed arches, and eccentric ground plan are close to traditional Indian palace architecture.

The interior was conceived as a series of large rooms with high ceilings. It has been profoundly altered since it was built, to meet changed requirements for use. Mezzanine floors have been introduced and service facilities (water, electricity, sanitation, lifts) have been installed, often in an unsympathetic manner.

This utilitarian building, C-shaped in plan, is symmetrical on an east-west axis. All the sides of the building are given equal value in the design. It is crowned by a high central dome, which acts as the focal point. The dome is a octagonal ribbed structure with a colossal female figure symbolizing Progress, holding a torch pointing upwards in her right hand and a spoked wheel in her left hand.

The side wings enclose the courtyard, which opens on to the street. The wings are anchored by monumental turrets at each of their four corners, which balance and frame the central dome.

The facades present the appearance of well proportioned rows of windows and arches. The ornamentation in the form of statuary, bas-reliefs, and friezes is exuberant yet well controlled. The columns of the entrance gates are crowned by figures of a lion (representing Great Britain) and a tiger (representing India).

The constructional materials were selected with care. The main structure is built from a judicious blend of Indian sandstone and limestone, whilst high-quality Italian marble was used for the key decorative elements. The main interiors are also lavishly decorated: the ground floor of the North Wing, now as the Star Chamber, which is still the booking office, is embellished with Italian marble, polished Indian blue stone, and stone arches covered with carved foliage and grotesques.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

No information is given in the nomination dossier relating to any form of statutory protection of the property.

### *Management*

Victoria Terminus is owned by Central Railways, which is an agency of the Ministry of Railways of the Government of India.

Management of the property, including day-to-day maintenance and protection, is the direct responsibility of the Divisional Railways Manager, Mumbai Division, Central Railway. Major investment proposals and planning are handled by the Chief Engineer of the Central Railway. Both are based in the Victoria Terminus itself.

There is a small depot at the Terminus dealing with maintenance and conservation. The programme of this group includes regular painting of internal woodwork, stone-cleaning on a cycle of three to four years, and monitoring of waterproofing measures before the start of each monsoon season.

General management and professional technical training are provided by the Railway Staff College at Vadodara and the Pune Indian Railway Institute of Civil Engineering. Personnel responsible for the Victoria Terminus regular attend training and refresher courses at these institutions.

Training and advice relating to specialized conservation activities is provided for Indian Railways by the Architectural Conservation Cell, Research and Consultancy Directorate, of the Associated Cement Companies Limited. A systematic training programme will be initiated in the near future.

This organization has carried out a detailed survey, leading to the preparation of an overall plan for repairs and conservation of the entire property. This proposes the total revitalization of the Terminus and radical reorganization of the services. If implemented, this plan will be completed in five years.

The nomination dossier contains a map showing the proposed buffer zone. This consists of no more than the open spaces on the island site occupied by the Terminus building, and is wholly inadequate. It should extend to include the blocks surrounding the Terminus, especially to the north and east, where development and traffic pressure is greatest. Serious consideration should be given to the pedestrianization of a considerable portion of the extended buffer zone. It should be noted that a large subway is in course of construction in front of the building, the impact of which cannot yet be judged.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Having been in continuous use since it was completed in 1888, the Victoria Terminus has been subject to routine maintenance and repair for more than a century. It is at risk from atmospheric and saline pollution, which had had an adverse effect on the stonework, especially where repairs

have involved the use of steel dowels; these have corroded, resulting in spalling of stone surfaces. A row of trees has been planted partially to mitigate this threat.

At the present time an Assistant Engineer, with the requisite technical staff, is monitoring structural cracks, weathering of stonework, degradation of mortar, and water infiltration.

### *Authenticity*

In terms of function, the authenticity of the building is high, since it has always been used as a railway terminus. The alterations made to its exterior have ensured that the overall appearance of the Terminus has been retained to a high degree. However, when examined in detail, many of the repairs and alterations to the exterior prove to have been handled in an insensitive way so far as materials and techniques are concerned.

However, changes over the past half-century to the interior have radically changed its original form. This applies in particular to the inserted mezzanine floors, where the false ceilings are made from acoustic tiles and asbestos sheeting, incongruous materials when combined with the materials used in the main structure. The main halls are still mostly in use for their original purposes, though there has been some unsympathetic choice of materials for flooring.

There is a group of later additions on the eastern side, described on the map supplied with the nomination dossier as "Incongruous additions," which detract from the authenticity of the visual appearance of this part of the building.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Mumbai in January 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Victoria Terminus is an impressive example of late 19th century monumental railway architecture in Italian Gothic style, with references to the traditional architecture of the Indian sub-continent

### *Comparative analysis*

The nomination dossier compares the Victoria Terminus favourably with other contemporary railway termini in India. However, no reference is made to comparable structures elsewhere in the world.

Railways were a global phenomenon, not confined to the Indian sub-continent, in the 19th century. In view of the fact that the second half of the 19th century was a period when monumental railway termini were being built in many parts of the world, it is essential that this property should be evaluated as an example of a type of building to be found worldwide before any recommendation can be made regarding inscription on the World Heritage List.

The historic railways survey carried out for ICOMOS was confined to railway lines, termini and stations being treated only as components of complete lines. ICOMOS is prepared to commission a further study, to take account of historic railway stations. (It must be borne in mind in this study that main-line termini have a special symbolic significance in

many ex-colonial and Third World countries.) It may therefore be necessary to broaden this study, looking at railway stations as one category of 19th century public buildings.

The Terminus is presented as an outstanding example of the felicitous blending of European and Indian architectural styles during the colonial period. There are, however, many other fine buildings in India that reflect this harmonization. The State Party should also consider a critical study of this aspect of its built heritage, within which to evaluate the role and significance of the Terminus.

*ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

ICOMOS is concerned that the railway authorities have not yet decided whether to implement the excellent conservation programme proposed by the Associated Cement Companies. Nor is it clear whether, in the event of this being adopted, it will be contracted out to that organization or implemented using railway personnel. However, the Central Railway has no specialized conservation expertise within its own personnel with which to implement the programme, which might seriously jeopardize the effectiveness of the programme.

**Recommendation**

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*. The State Party should undertake a properly formulated conservation programme, to be implemented under the direction of properly qualified professionals in this specialized field. A relevant comparative study of historic railway termini on a worldwide basis should also be carried out.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Villa Adriana (Italy)

No 907

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Villa Adriana
<i>Location</i>	Province of Lazio
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Villa Adriana possesses a universal, exceptional value. It is unique for the type of conception, it is endowed with great intrinsic value, and it conserves the most complete examples of Roman architecture. **Criterion i**

The Villa Adriana cannot be compared directly with any of the other large aristocratic residences of the Roman Emperors because it is not a villa in the literal sense of the term. It is conceived as an “ideal city,” planned for this purpose by the Emperor Hadrian.

The Villa exerted a considerable influence on Renaissance architecture (Giuliano and Antonio San Gallo, Pirro Ligorio, Dosio, and many others), but above all on Baroque architecture. Bernini, Borromini, Le Brun, and Hildebrand were inspired by the alternation of concave and convex spaces of the Golden Square and Small Thermae for the interiors of many churches and civic buildings. The relationship between the Villa Adriana and modern architecture appears to be fundamental. Architects such as John Ruskin, Frank Lloyd Wright, Le Corbusier, Louis Kahn, and John Johansen have reinterpreted the layout of the open organisms of Hadrian’s Tiburtine villa for architectural structures of various types. For example, the points of resemblance between Wright’s Florida Southern College and Johansen’s Mummens’ Theatre on the one hand and the Villa Adriana on the other are extraordinary - in the circular distributing links between the various “bodies” inspired by the Maritime Theatre and the Three Exedrae and in general in the overall, fairly free distribution of the parts over the building area which intellectually and conceptually recalls the architectural composition of the Villa Adriana.

The Villa Adriana is an exceptional example of Roman civilization. In particular, the multi-ethnic and universal nature of Roman culture should be stressed, and the Villa Adriana represents a synthesis of its most pregnant values. The Emperor Hadrian, of Roman/Iberian origin, Greek in his culture, lover of the Orient, philosopher, poet, and traveller, is a prototype of the European intellectual who is equally aware of the values of tradition and those of local cultures.

**Criterion ii**

The Villa Adriana is the most complete and best conserved architectural complex of the Roman world, illustrating the most significant period of Roman history in an incomparable natural setting. Since it is a “city/villa” it is made up of a complex of public and private buildings, of pavilions, pathways, and underground passages, and of pools of water which together make up the most innovative solutions of Roman architecture. **Criterion iii**

The Villa Adriana is a typical and original example of the architectural and engineering genius of the Romans and carries enormous historical importance. **Criterion iv**

The Villa Adriana is an inimitable example of an ancient human settlement inserted from the 18th century onwards into certain empty spaces alongside buildings that were typical of the Roman countryside and which have now disappeared. The buildings dating from the 18th century are farmhouses, barns, cisterns, wash-houses, and stables, all built to equip the area for an agricultural activity which lasted until 1870. **Criterion v**

This type of landscape has survived intact from the 18th century, offering the visitor the same fascinating vistas that enchanted travellers on the Grand Tour. In this sense the Villa Adriana still provides an example of that typical “landscape with ruins” which inspired artists and painters (particularly *vedutisti* or painters of views) the world over. For these reasons the Villa Adriana continues to be a source of inspiration for men of letters and artists in the present century, from Marguerite Yourcenar to contemporary painters. **Criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The area was originally occupied by a Late Republican villa, presumed to have been the property of Hadrian’s wife, Vibia Sabina. The Imperial residence was built over it in two stages, 118-25 and 125-38. It was a symbol of a power that was gradually becoming absolute and which distanced itself from the capital; for this reason it has been compared to the Versailles of Louis XIV.

After Hadrian’s death in 138 his successors preferred to make the city of Rome their permanent residence, but it continued to be enlarged and further embellished. Constantine the Great is alleged to have removed some of its finer pieces to his new capital, Byzantium.

The Villa was sacked and plundered by successive barbarian invaders, and it fell into neglect. It was used as a quarry by builders and lime-burners in the centuries that followed.

Interest in the ruins was rekindled in the 15th century by Pope Pius II (Aeneas Silvius). Excavations to recover its glories were ordered by Alexander VI at the beginning of the 16th century. When Cardinal Ippolito II d’Este began to construct his nearby Villa d’Este he continued the excavations, supervised by his architect Pirro Ligorio, to

obtain works of art to adorn it. Thereafter excavations were carried out sporadically until the Villa Adriana became the property of the newly created Italian State in 1870.

#### *Description*

The complex known as the Villa Adriana covers an area of more than 120ha on the slopes of the Tiburtine Hills.

The many structures are arranged without any overall plan within this area. They fall into four specific groups.

#### 1 *The Greek Theatre and the Temple of Aphrodite Cnidia.*

The theatre, which is in a good state of conservation, although only fragmentary, is of conventional design. Its *cavea* is cut into the hillside and is *c* 36m in diameter. The small circular temple is situated in a large semi-circular *exedra*. This area was marshy until it was drained in the 16th century.

#### 2 *The Maritime Theatre, the Court of the Libraries, the Latin and Greek Libraries, the Imperial Palace, and the Golden Square.*

This is the core of the complex, aligned with the Vale of Tempe. The various elements are grouped round four peristyles. The Maritime (or Naval) Theatre is a circular structure 43m in diameter; the Ionic marble peristyle encloses a circular moat surrounding a central island on which there is a miniature villa. The so-called Court of the Libraries, the oldest part of the ensemble, is a colonnaded portico with a nymphaeum on its northern side. The two "libraries" are reached by passages on either side of the nymphaeum.

The Palace consists of a complex of rooms around a spacious courtyard. The Golden Square is one of the most impressive buildings in the entire complex. The vast peristyle is surrounded by a two-aisled portico with alternate columns in cipollino marble and Egyptian granite. There is a large pool in the centre, with a garden around it.

#### 3 *The Pecile, the Stadium and its associated buildings, the Small and Large Thermae, the Canopus, the Serapeum, and the Cento Camerelle.*

The Pecile (or Poikile) is a reproduction of an imposing structure in Athens famous for its paintings and its associations with the Stoic philosophers. It consists of a rectangular peristyle, 232m by 97m. Part of its massive walls survive; they had colonnades on either side. In the middle of the enclosure there was a rectangular pool, enclosed by a free space that may have been used as a race-track.

The two sets of baths are conventional in form. The smaller is considered to have been used exclusively by women.

The Canopus is an elongated canal imitating the famous sanctuary of Serapis near Alexandria. The semi-circular *exedra* of the Serapeum is located at its southern end.

#### 4 *The Lily Pond, the Roccabruna Tower, and the Academy.*

The Roccabruna Tower, which is a belvedere or *pharos*, is thought to be a copy of the Tower of Timon in Athens. The Academy is a complex of buildings, the purpose of which is not clearly established.

In addition to these structures, there is a complex of underground elements, including cryptoportici and

underground galleries, used for internal communications and storage.

A number of the ancient structures are overlaid by a series of farmhouses and other buildings, mostly from the 18th century. They were built directly on the earlier foundations and it is difficult to dissociate them from the ancient structures.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

The entire property is protected under the provisions of the basic Italian Law No 1089 of 1939, which prohibits the carrying out of any works that may affect the monument without authorization.

The entire area (including the buffer zone) is covered by the environmental control regulations set out in Law No 431 of 1985.

### *Management*

The Villa Adriana covers *c* 120ha; an area of 80ha is the property of the Italian Government and the remaining 40ha are in private ownership. Both areas are protected under the 1939 Law. However, those in private ownership are excluded from the nominated area (although they fall within the buffer zone).

Management of the Villa Adriana falls within the responsibility of the Ministry of Cultural Property (*Ministerio per i Beni Culturali*). The Archaeological Superintendence for Latium (*Soprintendenza Archeologica per il Lazio*) is responsible for management at the regional level. The current staff consists of three archaeologists (one of them Director of the Villa), one architect, three restorers, four skilled craftsmen, and 43 guardians.

The Villa is the subject of a great deal of scientific archaeological research in various fields of study. Projects are currently being carried out by specialists from Italian and foreign universities.

The monument receives some 350,000 visitors annually, making it one of the ten most visited sites in Italy. Until recently management has been relatively low-keyed, covering regular maintenance programmes and selected restoration projects.

However, since 1996 it has benefited from major sources of funding, from the European Community, the National Lottery, and elsewhere, which has permitted the preparation and implementation of a major programme of investigation, restoration, conservation, recuperation of green open spaces, rehabilitation of later structures on ancient foundations, and, in particular, the upgrading of visitor-handling facilities (reception centre, additional car parking, and extension of the site existing museums). A new entrance and reception area is being prepared at a site more closely linked with the modern community of Tivoli. The boundary fence has recently been reconstructed, and is now illuminated at night.

Since 1997 a management plan has been in force relating to infrastructural aspects of the site – drainage, water and electricity supply and distribution, hygienic services, emergency exits, etc.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Scientific conservation work has been carried out at the Villa Adriana since the second half of the 19th century, in conformity with the prevailing techniques and philosophies. These began with the building of buttresses for the consolidation of several of the ancient structures, using the approach prescribed by the Papal Camerlingo Commissions and applied successfully to other ancient structures such as the Colosseum in Rome. Data from scientific excavations around the turn of the century were used for some limited restoration projects.

Consolidation and partial reconstruction measures using clearly differentiated new materials were put into effect from 1913 onwards. This technique was refined from the mid 20th century onwards. At the same time careful analysis made it possible to carry out partial anastylosis on a number of the structures, including the Serapeum, the Maritime Theatre, and the Room of the Doric Columns. This work received international acclaim.

Major conservation projects have been completed recently on the Cento Camerelle complex and the Roccabruna nymphaeum. Currently work is being carried out not only on a number of the structures themselves but also on the decorative elements (stuccoes, mural paintings, mosaics).

### *Authenticity*

The overall authenticity of the Villa Adriana is high. The original layout of the component structures is perfectly preserved, as is their relationship with the surrounding landscape. Despite centuries of plundering and destruction, the monumental quality has been retained to a very high degree. Restoration and conservation projects over the past century and a half have been sensitive and always fully in accordance with the highest contemporary standards.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Villa Adriana in February 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Villa Adriana is an exceptional survival from the Early Roman Empire. The collection of buildings and other structures that it comprises illustrate the taste and erudition of one of the greatest Roman Emperors. Hadrian was a man of immense culture, who travelled the lands of his Empire ceaselessly, bringing back to his palatial complex the best of the varied cultures that it embraced.

### *Comparative analysis*

It can be stated without any fear of contradiction that the Villa Adriana is unique. It is not a villa in the strict Roman sense, as, for example, represented by the Villa Romana di Casale at Piazza Armerina (Sicily). Nor is it a single integrated palace, like that of Diocletian at Split (Croatia). It is an epitome of the Mediterranean cultures in their highest material form, and as such it is *sui generis*.

### *ICOMOS comments*

The ICOMOS expert mission gained the impression that there was little, if any, contact between the state agency responsible for the management of the Villa (the Soprintendenza) and the municipal authorities in Tivoli. It is to be hoped that better links will be established when the new entrance and reception centre is in operation and the present interim local government situation in the town comes to an end.

ICOMOS also feels that there is a need for an overall management plan which integrates and coordinates the existing planned maintenance and the numerous restoration and rehabilitation projects.

## Brief description

The Villa Adriana is an exceptional complex of classical buildings, created in the 2nd century AD by the Roman Emperor Hadrian, which reproduces the best elements of the material cultures of Egypt, Greece, and Rome in the form of an "ideal city."

## Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, and iii*:

***Criteria i and iii*** The Villa Adriana is a masterpiece that uniquely brings together the highest expressions of the material cultures of the ancient Mediterranean world.

***Criterion ii*** Study of the monuments that make up the Villa Adriana played a crucial role in the rediscovery of the elements of classical architecture by the architects of the Renaissance and the Baroque period. It also profoundly influenced many 19th and 20th century architects and designers.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Nikko (Japan)

No 913

### Identification

*Nomination* Shrines and Temples of Nikko

*Location* Tochigi Prefecture

*State Party* Japan

*Date* 30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Each building included in the nominated property represents outstanding artistic value as a masterpiece created by some of the earliest architectural geniuses in Japan.

#### Criterion i

The two mausoleums included in the nominated property - Tōshōgū and the Taiyū-in Reibyō - embody complete forms of the architectural style known as Gonzen-zukuri, the most advanced style of religious architecture in Japan at that time. Indeed, this style had great influence upon the architects of shrine buildings and mausolea in succeeding generations. The buildings vividly illustrate the collective ingenuity and creativity of the architects involved in the production of this architectural landscape; the extent of decoration introduced here had never been thus far in the history of Japan and buildings were arranged and coloured deliberately and effectively to produce an impression of integration. At the same time, they best represent the Japanese architectural style of Shinto shrines and Buddhist temples in the Edo period, the style characterized by mausolea. In particular, the buildings of Tōshōgū are an important, eloquent source of abundant information on this early architectural style used in Japan. The nominated property illustrates a significant stage in the history of architecture in Japan.

#### Criterion iv

At the same time, the nominated property, including the surrounding setting as well as the group of religious buildings, is a typical example of traditionally observed religious space in Japan, directly associated with Shintoist attitudes toward nature, ie the Japanese indigenous religious belief, in which specific mountains or forests are deified as subjects of reverence.

In addition, Nikko is still an active religious place where rituals and other traditional events are so frequently held as to be a living tradition rooted in the daily lives of people at their spiritual level.

#### Criterion vi

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the World Heritage Convention, the Nikko shrines and temples are a *group* of buildings in a natural

setting laid out by man to form a *site*, with the value of a *cultural and associative landscape*, as described in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (1998).

### History and Description

#### History

The cultural property proposed for inscription is linked to a cult that goes back to the end of the 18th century, when a Buddhist monk, Shodo, erected the first buildings on the slopes of the Nikko, which had been worshipped as a sacred mountain since time immemorial. Certain buildings in the Futarasan-jinja and Rinnō-ji groups belong to this period.

At the end of the 12th century, the Kamakura Shogunate established itself in the region of Kanto. This enabled Nikko to strengthen its position further as a major sacred site in Kanto, not only because of its mountainous situation but also because of its religious edifices. However, the site was more or less abandoned owing to the upheavals of the Muromachi period, in the 16th century.

The temples were rehabilitated at the beginning of the 17th century. Nikko was chosen as the site for the Tōshōgū, a sanctuary composed of several buildings erected to house the mausoleum of Tokugawa Ieyasu, the founder of the Tokugawa Shogunate. This regime was in power for over 250 years in the history of Japan. Since this period, Nikko has played a very important role as a symbol of national sovereignty, not only in the eyes of local authorities but also those of leaders of neighbouring countries who sent their emissaries to pay tribute to Ieyasu, a deified personage.

In 1871, the Meiji government decided to divide the site and its religious buildings, which came under one religious authority, into three groups entrusted to three separate religious organizations: Futarasan-jinja and Tōshōgū for the Shinto cult, and Rinnō-ji for Buddhism. This reorganization entailed moving and restoring certain buildings. The sacred and prestigious character of the site made it possible to guarantee the preservation of Nikko which was placed under legal protection as of 1897, a measure subsequently reinforced on several occasions.

#### Description

- The Futarasan-jinja

Devoted to the three divinities of Mount Nantai, it forms a complex of buildings, 23 of which are listed as Important Cultural Properties under the Law Protecting Cultural Properties. Most of them were restored or built in the 17th century, following old traditions, and they exerted a general influence in the layout of shrines throughout Japan.

Among the most remarkable buildings, mention should be made of the Honden and the Haiden, the heart of the shrine, the Betsugū Takino-o-jinja Honden, with a construction plan dating back to the year 825, and the Shin-yosha, the oldest example of an architectural style which was to inspire the first construction phases of the Tōshōgū.

The Shinkyō is also part of the Futarasan-jinja. This sacred bridge, straddling the river Daiya, appears to belong to the

Muromachi period. Its present configuration, a vermilion lacquer bridge resting on massive stone pillars, goes back to 1636. The roadway of the Shinkyô was swept away by a disastrous flood in 1902, but it was faithfully restored in 1904 and is undergoing major restoration work which is expected to finish in the year 2001.

- The Tôshôgu

This shrine, founded in the first half of the 17th century, comprises a large number of buildings, including 37 which are listed as Important Cultural Properties, the others being listed as National Treasures.

A suite of three sacred chambers is a perfect illustration of the H-shaped architectural layout known as Gongen-zukuri, in which the Honden, the principal chamber, is linked to the Haiden, the oratory, by a stone-paved corridor called the Ishinoma.

The Shômen Karamon and the Haimen Karamon, a masterpiece of craftsmanship and decoration, is inspired by a foreign style, hence the common name of "Chinese door."

The Yômeimon, erected in 1636, is probably the most well known example of the architectural style of Nikko. It is covered in a profusion and infinite variety of decoration.

The Tôzai Sukibe, also dating to 1636, is a wall about 160m long, surrounding the Honden, Ishinoma, and Haiden group.

The Tôzai Kairo, a corridor 220m long, with a southern section formed of 25 sculpted panels, surrounds three sides of the same Honden, Ishinoma, and Haiden group.

- The Rinnô-ji

The origin of this Buddhist temple goes back to the 8th century, and it has always remained a place of worship. Major constructions were added at the beginning of the Edo period, especially in 1653 for the mausoleum of the third shogun, Togukawa Iemitsu. It is composed of many buildings, including 37 listed as Important Cultural Properties.

The group, in the Gongen-zukuri shape and style and composed of the Taiyû-in Reibyô Honden, Ainoma, and Haiden, is listed as a National Treasure. It is a pure masterpiece of architecture and decoration.

- The site

Thanks to centuries of landscaping, the temples and shrines blend harmoniously in their natural setting. The buildings are arranged on the mountain slopes in such a way as to create different visual effects. The perception of the views and scale of the edifices is conditioned by the carefully studied proportion of the stairs, the supporting walls, and the walls enclosing the area. The result is a striking impression of harmony and contemplation.

Thousands of Japanese cedars were planted during the Tôshôgu construction period in the early 17th century. They are at present at the peak of their growth. This cryptomeria forest provides an exceptional natural bower for the shrines and temples, adding considerably to the beauty and sacred character of the site.

## Management and protection

### *Legal status*

The buildings inscribed as National Treasures (9) or as Important Cultural Properties (94) by virtue of Article 27 of the Convention on the Protection of Cultural Heritage come under legal protection as well as strict management and conservation measures.

In view of its value as natural heritage, the entire site falls under different protection systems. Some of them were introduced a long time ago, as far back as the 17th century through statutory measures, and before that time through customary arrangements. Special schemes cover the various areas, sometimes in a concomitant manner. In addition to the 1950 Law on the Protection of Cultural Properties, which protects both the buildings and the area around them, mention should also be made of the Law on Forests, the Law on Rivers, the Law on Sand Control, the 1957 Law on Natural Parks (which identifies four categories with their own level of protection), as well as the different municipal directives on the specially assigned areas. Together, they form a comprehensive set of protective measures, and serve as the foundation for a carefully developed management plan.

### *Management*

The perimeter round the site proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List corresponds to the boundaries of the property owned by the monks in charge of its daily management. It is controlled by special regulations which, depending on the specific areas, are combined with the different protective measures mentioned above. The perimeter has an irregular shape, mainly due to the narrow excrescence in the south-east, near the sacred bridge (Shinkyô). A tiny separate plot of land, on which a very old religious building stands, has also been added to the perimeter. The reasoning behind the definition of the perimeter is based on the religious character of the site as well as a concern for clarity in the everyday management tasks carried out by the religious authorities.

The buffer zone also contains several areas which come under specific protection plans. Its demarcation follows the ridges of the hills surrounding the historic site, except in the south-west, where it follows the boundaries of cadastral plots of land and areas protected by the Law on Natural Parks.

The preservation of the entire site, including the buffer zone, is subject to a precise definition of responsibilities, from the religious authorities in charge of the everyday management and regular maintenance of the site to the National Bureau of Cultural Affairs responsible for the general supervision and financing of the most expensive operations, based on a plan covering several years. At intermediate levels, special responsibilities are carried out by the Nikko City Council in the areas of town planning, traffic and control of the buffer zone, and by the Tochigi Prefecture in the areas of education and public awareness, particularly the handling of tourists.

A large number of visitors frequent the shrines and temples of Nikko. In 1996, out of a total of about 1.7 million visitors, 550,000 were students on educational trips and 20,000 were foreign tourists. Strict measures are being applied, especially with regard to the parking of cars and coaches. Given the large crowds on national public holidays or at the beginning of autumn, the religious

authorities take action to control the flow of visitors; these measures can even go as far as fixing quotas in order to preserve not only the physical integrity of the buildings and the natural site but also the sacred character of the place.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation History*

The conservation of the Nikko shrines and temples is the outcome of a respect for age-old traditions of conservation and restoration as well as the preservation of religious practices linked to a site considered as sacred.

A methodical approach was adopted at a very early stage. A remarkable manuscript written in 1753 contains many comments on the works undertaken during the 17th century, which the monks concerned recorded in writing. The very precise descriptions of the architectural structures and the decorative works contained in this manuscript make it a very precious reference work, which is frequently consulted even now. The manuscript, for example, sets out the traditional directions for the use of colours, with accurate references to the pigments and their place of origin.

This practice of keeping meticulous records has been respected up to the present time.

The Decree of 1871 relating to the separation of the Shinto and Buddhist cults was adopted under the Meiji Restoration. In Nikko, two Shinto shrines and a Buddhist temple were entrusted to three distinct religious organizations. Within this framework, a few buildings, fortunately few in number, were demolished, transformed, or moved elsewhere. These breaches to the integrity of the historic site came to an end with the setting up in 1879 of the Association for the Conservation of the Shrines and Temples of Nikko, called Hokokai, which is still active today, and by the adoption in 1897 of a Law on the Preservation of Shrines and Temples.

### *Authenticity*

There is no doubt that this historic site has suffered from difficulties over the centuries. Buildings were burnt down or damaged by falling trees or earthquakes. Each time, the damaged building was restored faithfully, following rigorously the original plans and techniques, using the original materials whenever possible, and keeping detailed documents about these operations.

This fidelity to the initial model and the significance of the religious buildings reveals a determination to respect their authenticity. In general, the management of the site aims at preserving the rich harmony of the cultural landscape which unites natural features and buildings.

### *Risk prevention*

Right from the start, preventive measures and emergency plans were adopted to cope with the dangers of fires and earthquakes. This has always been a constant preoccupation. In the course of this century, in particular, every new prevention technique has been adopted immediately. Thus, a sophisticated system of water jets, fed by huge underground reservoirs, was installed in the fifties. The latest teledetection techniques have been incorporated unobtrusively to monitor any sign of possible danger from a central observatory.

The forest of cryptomeria is also controlled regularly and the trees are strengthened to prevent them from falling over the buildings.

### *Training*

General maintenance and restoration projects are looked upon as a "school of application" enabling artists and craftsmen to teach themselves. High-level proficiency courses are organized in Nikko, in the form of residential seminars lasting several months, for about fifteen craftsmen selected from all over the country. The most frequently practised specializations are the ones using decorative techniques (colours, lacquers, and varnishes) which have received the highest degree of application in Nikko. These training programmes are supervised by Master Hokusai Yoshihara, one of the two most famous artists in this discipline who are recognized as Living Cultural Treasures.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert commission visited Nikko in December 1998.

### *Qualities*

The Nikko shrines and temples form a group of religious buildings, in an outstanding natural setting, testifying to a centuries-old tradition. It has been a sacred place for centuries, and it still continues to be a centre of religious practice. The site also evokes the glorious chapters of Japanese history, especially those relating to the symbolic figure of the great Shogun, Tokugawa Ieyasu.

### *Comparative analysis*

The unusual character of the Nikko shrines and temples is due to a combination of very strong values: a long tradition of worship, a very high level of artistic achievement, a striking alliance between architecture and the development of a natural setting, and a repository of national memories. Other sites can reflect one or another of these values, but it is this particular combination which makes Nikko such an outstanding cultural property.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

- Despite protective measures and a management system of the historic site which are exemplary in many respects, three suggestions can be put forward:
- With respect to Tōshōgu, the documents supporting the request for inscription should fill in the lack of information on two buildings: on the one hand, the Kyozo, with its revolving library containing thousands of volumes of sutras, some of which date back to the early 17th century, and on the other, the Honkido, well known for its Weeping Dragon, a remarkable ceiling painting. These two buildings come under the responsibility of the Association for the Conservation of the Shrines and Temples of Nikko.
- Signs should be improved so as to be in line with the cultural importance of the site. The signs should be made in more unobtrusive materials and have clearer graphics for the directions (in one or more foreign languages) and the information panels should be

better positioned. The provisions of the Management Plan for the Nikko National Park, adopted in 1996, point the way.

- Controlling the buffer zone requires special attention for two reasons. First, the south-west border does not follow the ridge-line and crosses an area which could give in to pressure from real-estate promoters. Secondly, the capacity to handle the growing numbers of visitors will continue to be a permanent challenge.

### **Brief Description**

The Nikko shrines and temples, together with their natural surroundings, have for centuries been a sacred site and the home of architectural and decorative masterpieces. They are closely associated with the history of the Tokugawa Shoguns.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, iv, and vi*:

*Criterion i* The Nikko shrines and temples are a reflection of architectural and artistic genius; this aspect is reinforced by the harmonious integration of the buildings in a forest and a natural site laid out by man.

*Criterion iv* Nikko is a perfect illustration of the architectural style of the Edo period as applied to Shinto shrines and Buddhist temples. The Gongenzukuri style of the two mausoleums, the Tōshōgu and the Taiyū-in Reibyō, reached the peak of its expression in Nikko, and was later to exert a decisive influence. The ingenuity and creativity of its architects and decorators are revealed in an outstanding and distinguished manner.

*Criterion vi* The Nikko shrines and temples, together with their environment, are an outstanding example of a traditional Japanese religious centre, associated with the Shinto perception of the relationship of man with nature, in which mountains and forests have a sacred meaning and are objects of veneration, in a religious practice that is still very much alive today.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Harbour fortifications (Malta)

No 891

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The harbour fortifications of Malta
<i>Location</i>	Valletta
<i>State Party</i>	Malta
<i>Date</i>	19 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The harbour fortifications of Malta are a unique example of a vast, complex network of Renaissance and Baroque permanent gunpowder fortifications designed by some of Europe's leading military engineers and, consequently, constitute an important example of contemporary European military architecture at its best. The uniqueness of the harbour fortifications of Malta stems not only from their sheer scale but also from the concentration of so many fortifications in a small area – in all, three fortresses, four sets of fortified lines, and five forts, totalling in length some 25km of bastioned walls and ramparts – the fortified city of Valletta serving as the keep of the whole system. Thus was a fortress system built incrementally over two and a half centuries and consequently its special character of composition, consisting of various component parts built to different styles of military architecture.

Individually, the harbour fortifications are also significant architecturally and historically for other specific reasons. The 16th century fortress of *Valletta* is considered to be one of the earliest and finest remaining examples of a newly built bastioned fortified city built on a peninsula. The *Cottonera Lines* constitute the longest fortified bastioned enceinte built *all'Olandese* (in the Dutch manner) during the last quarter of the 17th century to be found in the southern Mediterranean. *Fort Manoel* is a classic 17th century square fort with four corner bastions, designed in the manner of Vauban's first system of fortifications, built by the French engineers of the Order of St John of Jerusalem. *Fort Tigne* is one of the first 18th century forts built to the conventions of the polygonal system of fortifications, inspired by the theories of Montalambert.

#### Criterion i

Since the harbour fortifications of Malta were designed by some of Europe's leading military engineers they present a unique combination of the various major styles of European military architecture blended into one large fortress system. The list of all the military engineers who were commissioned to serve the Order is a long one. The Catholic courts of Europe were regularly petitioned to lend their engineers to the Order, and the princes generally obliged.

In the 16th century and the first half of the 17th century the Order followed the common practice of employing Italian engineers. From the second half of the 17th century onwards it was generally French engineers who were employed. The employment of leading military engineers meant that the design of the fortifications of Malta, although it was only a small state, remained within the mainstream of European development.

#### Criterion ii

The harbour fortifications of Malta form a unique ensemble of a vast bastioned network of Renaissance and Baroque fortifications, composed of a number of defensive works erected over a span of some three hundred years and built in various styles influenced by Italian, Dutch, and French schools of military architecture. The sheer concentration and volume of the defences, together with the relative completeness, make the fortifications of the harbours of Malta immensely impressive.

The fortifications themselves are a unique combination of European designs and the local building materials, methods, and techniques. The most notable characteristic feature is that they were constructed in local limestone and frequently carved into virgin rock, making them the most formidable bomb-proof gunpowder fortifications ever to be constructed before the introduction of concrete and the application of iron to defensive works.

Historically, these fortifications have a unique significance in that they were built by the renowned Hospitaller Knights of St John, the last of the Military Orders to retain Crusader ideals, to serve as the southernmost bulwark of Christendom in an age when Europe was threatened by Turkish power.

#### Criterion iii

[**Note by ICOMOS** Although this has been treated as a new nomination, the Introduction in the dossier ends with the following: "... it is considered that the designation of Valletta as a World Heritage Site needs to be extended to cover the whole system of fortifications around the harbours of Malta."]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

The fortification of the Harbour area began when the Knights of the Order of St John of Jerusalem came to Malta in 1530 after they had been driven out of Rhodes. There was a medieval castle (Fort St Angelo) there already, and this became the first headquarters of the Order, but the Hospitallers needed to create a secure urban settlement and harbour, to serve as a naval base, since their principal striking force was their fleet of galleys.

Work concentrated at first on the south-east part of the Grand Harbour. The existing castle was strengthened, walls with bastions were erected across the narrow Pircu (*Città Vittoriosa* after 1565) and Senglea (*Città Invicta*) peninsulas (where urban settlements quickly developed), and a small fortress was built to guard the entrance to the harbour. In

1565 the Turkish Sultan Suleiman II attacked Malta with a fleet of 180 ships and a force of 30,000 troops. The Hospitallers defended Valletta for nearly four months, losing 240 Knights and more than six thousand soldiers, until the arrival of a Spanish force made the Turks abandon what became known as the Great Siege. Soon afterwards a new fortress was built on the tip of the Sciberras peninsula which separated the two harbours and on which Valletta was built.

From that time onwards the city of Valletta became the focal point of the harbour defences. Subsequent fortifications were intended to consolidate the area around the city and deny the approaches to an enemy. The Floriana Lines (begun in 1635) formed the outer landward works of Valletta and the Santa Margherita (1638) and Cottonera (1670) Lines covered the south-west approaches to the Grand Harbour.

The mouth of the Grand Harbour was protected by two forts, St Elmo (1552), which was later to be incorporated into the defensive enceinte of Valletta, and Ricasoli (1680) on the opposite promontory, working together with the artillery fort of St Angelo (1680s) to provide a formidable defensive screen.

Marsamxett Harbour, on the west of Valletta, was protected by two forts: Manoel, a star-shaped fort (late 1720s), and Tigne (1793), which was more of a redoubt than a fort, with flanking counterscarp galleries and a tower keep.

After 1680 French influence grew and in the 18th century Malta was a major centre of French Mediterranean trade. The Knights were expelled from the island in 1798 by Napoleon Bonaparte, on his way to Egypt. It was then besieged and finally taken by the British after a two-year siege. Despite the Treaty of Amiens, they refused to hand it back to the Knights and Malta remained in British hands, as an important naval base and commercial port, until it won its independence in 1974. During the British period, the Corradino Lines were built to command the southern inland extremity of the Grand Harbour. The Lascaris Bastion, a large casemated battery to the east of Valletta, was also constructed by the British in the mid 19th century.

#### *Description*

The Grand and Marsamxett Harbours, with the creeks opening into them, are separated by the narrow peninsula of Sciberras, occupied by the fortified city of Valletta and its suburb, Floriana. The fortifications consist of a range of defensive works in a rough semi-circle round the two harbours to protect them from attack by land or sea. The main concentration is round the Grand Harbour, consisting of a number of works varying in size from large fortified enceintes such as the Cottonera Lines to coastal batteries such as the Lascaris Bastion.

The inner core of *Fort St Angelo* is the medieval castle with the complex of the Master's Palace, a church, and the remains of an early wall. Outside this is the gunpowder fort built in the 16th century, with the arrowhead D'Homedes Bastion, a stretch of curtain wall, an elevated cavalier, and ramparts incorporating three tiers of batteries.

*Città Vittoriosa* was the name given to the Birgu fortifications after they had successfully withstood the Great Siege of 1565. There are two main sections of the defences that span this narrow peninsula – a bastioned land front and a sea-wall. The original outer works have now disappeared, apart from the counterguard known as the Couvre Porte.

The Senglea peninsula was also fortified by the Knights in the 16th century and it was given the name *Città Invicta* after the Great Siege. Fort St Michael was demolished in the 1920s, and other elements were also removed by the British in the 1850s to accommodate a new dockyard, but the casemated land-front defences survive intact. The tip of the peninsula is also strongly fortified by a bastioned rampart known as the Spur.

The *Santa Margherita Lines* were begun by Italian engineers in the early 17th century and completed by French engineers a century later. They originally consisted of a semi-circular enceinte of five bastions and two semi-bastions linked at each end to the Birgu and Senglea land-fronts. One of the bastions and one of the semi-bastions have been demolished and two of the central bastions were converted in the 1840s into a fort.

The most impressive defensive works built by the Knights were the *Cottonera Lines*. They survive today almost intact, forming a wide semi-circular enceinte with eight bastions and one semi-bastion. The bastions are hollow, in the Dutch style of fortifications, and linked by short stretches of curtain wall pierced by decorated Baroque gateways.

The first of the forts built in the later 17th centuries to protect the entrance to the Grand Harbour is the *Ricasoli Fort*, in the Dutch style. The land-front, on the neck of the peninsula, is in the form of a crownwork, consisting of a central bastion linked by short curtain walls to two demi-bastions and protected on the outside by a *fausse-braye*, two ravelins, a demi-counterguard, and a ditch. The rest of the promontory defences fall into two parts. The sea-front is a line of bastions and artillery platforms with short curtain walls, whilst the harbour-front is a tenaille trace. Many additions and alterations were made to the fort by the British in the 19th and 20th centuries, but these did not modify the overall appearance and layout of the fort.

The *Corradino Lines* were built by the British in the 19th century to cover the strategically important high ground overlooking the southern inland extremity of the Grand Harbour. They consisted of a continuous wall with earthen parapet and a rock-cut ditch, in the polygonal fortification style. Some sections have disappeared as a result of modern road and industrial development. Only one of the four counterscarp galleries has survived.

*Fort St Elmo* was built to control the entrance to both harbours from the tip of the Valletta peninsula. The inner fort, first constructed in 1552 but rebuilt after the Great Siege, has undergone many subsequent modifications because of its vital defensive position. It retains its original star shape to a considerable extent, but with the addition of barrack blocks in its courtyard and the demolition of the northern ramparts to provide a link with the Cavalier in the 18th century. The triangular Cavalier has also undergone many modifications; its present appearance is largely that created by British alterations and additions in the 19th and early 20th centuries. The third element of St Elmo Fort is the outer ring of Carafa bastions, which form a crownwork projecting out towards the sea from the Valletta enceinte. The line of the fortifications has not changed but, as with the Cavalier, the present appearance results mainly from modifications and additions made during the British period.

The fortifications of *Valletta* consist of a bastioned front sited on the highest part of the plateau. The land-front is

made up of two central bastions, each with a high cavalier, flanked by two demi-bastions and with a deep rock-cut ditch in front. It is further protected by four counterguards. High lateral walls with rectangular platforms provide a link to Fort St Elmo. [Note These fortifications are already inscribed on the World Heritage List as part of the 1980 inscription of the City of Valletta.]

The *Lascharis Bastion* is a large casemated battery on the east side of the Valletta defences. It is boot-shaped in plan, with four faces pierced by embrasures and a firing platform along the entire length of the parapet on the roof.

The *Floriana Lines* were built in the 17th century to provide additional protection to the landward side of Valletta. The land-front consists of two parallel enceintes, the outer of which, consisting of the *fausse-braye* and the outerworks, was added in the 18th century. The *fausse-braye* continues along both the Grand Harbour and the Marsamxett sides, which have additional protection by means of strategically sited hornworks, lunettes, and musketry galleries, as well as outerworks.

The French military engineering of Vauban's first plan is to be seen in the 18th century *Fort Manoel*. This is a classic square fort, with four corner bastions, a ravelin, tenaille, covertway, and countermined glacis. It is surrounded on three sides by a deep rock-cut ditch in which are located a ravelin and rock-cut tenaille. The internal parade ground is now partly occupied by 19th century barracks, a chapel, and administrative buildings.

The last defensive ensemble to be built by the Knights at the end of the 18th century is *Fort Tigne*. In plan this small fort, which is perhaps better described as a redoubt, consists of a diamond-shaped casemated work with a strong circular bombproof keep in the rear salient. The core is the circular tower keep. The fort is surrounded by a rock-cut ditch. It has undergone many modifications in the British period, though the general outline and plan have survived intact.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

Most the properties that make up this nomination are on the statutory list created under the provisions of the Antiquities (Protection) Act 1925; since 1932 this has included all fortifications, gateways, old inscriptions, and coats-of-arms in the Maltese islands. Listed monuments are protected from demolition and alteration without written authorization from the Minister responsible for culture.

Lands adjoining the fortifications come within the provisions of the Special Development Areas Act 1956. This statute makes it illegal to carry out works on land earmarked for special development by the Government without written authorization.

Part 7 of the Environment Protection Act 1991 deals with protection of the historic heritage. The Minister responsible for the environment has the power to declare buildings or sites as being significant and therefore protected. A list of such properties is published in the Government Gazette and is reviewed every three years.

### *Management*

The nominated properties are in state ownership.

There is a Structure Plan of 1990 which sets out policies "for the retention and enhancement of all buildings, structures, and spaces of architectural or historical interest." This requires the preparation of Local Plans for Urban Conservation Areas, and the Valletta area is specifically identified. Plans that have been developed cover the Grand Harbour, Fort St Elmo and its environs, Manoel Island/Tigne, and Fort Ricasoli. The Structure Plan contains the following statement relating to the Harbour fortifications: "This unique inclusion of several epochs and cultures, concentrated within a relatively small area, constitutes a national heritage of great value not only to Malta but to European and world culture generally."

The Planning Authority, established by the 1992 Development Planning Act, is responsible for the listing of protected properties and the preparation of Local Plans, including those listed in the preceding paragraph.

The Ministry of Public Works and Construction is responsible for the maintenance of all public buildings and areas. Two committees within this department are directly involved in the maintenance, restoration, and rehabilitation of the fortifications within the harbour area. The Valletta and the Cottonera Rehabilitation Projects were set up in the 1980s to promote work in these areas.

The Museums Department of the Ministry of Education and National Culture is directly responsible for the conservation and restoration of the fortifications.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

The fortifications of Valletta served their original defensive purpose for more than four centuries, from the arrival of the Hospitallers until the departure of the British in the late 20th century. For that reason they have been continuously maintained, albeit with modifications resulting from developments in military engineering and new demands resulting from the changing nature of 19th and 20th century warfare. They suffered grievous damage from aerial bombardment during World War II, but sensitive restoration work was carried out on a number of the components of the fortifications at the end of the British period (1950-75).

In 1980 UNESCO launched an international campaign for the restoration of some of the major Maltese historic monuments, and work was carried out at Fort St Elmo. However, little else was done in the 1980s, and it was not until the two Rehabilitation Projects were set up that the present conservation effort began.

A number of the elements of the fortifications are in a relatively poor state of conservation or contain inappropriate modern buildings. For example, the ornamentation of the soft stone on the gateways of the Cottonera Lines is suffering from heavy degradation from atmospheric pollution; the interior of Fort Ricasoli is completely derelict and the site is disfigured by large industrial storage tanks; the interior of Fort Manoel is similarly derelict and the ditch is strewn with rubbish; and half of the ditch of Fort Tigne is occupied by a water desalination plant, the corrugated-iron roof of which rises above the walls of the fort itself.

### *Authenticity*

As mentioned in the preceding section, the fortifications of Valletta have had an active role until the latter part of the 20th century and have evolved continuously over a period of more than four centuries. The authenticity of this complex and its organic history over time is unquestionable.

### **Recommendation**

That further consideration of this proposed extension be *deferred*, to enable the State Party to put forward a master plan for the fortifications as recommended by ICOMOS.

### **Evaluation**

ICOMOS, March 1999

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Malta in February 1999.

#### *Qualities*

The harbour defences of Valletta constitute one of the largest and most complete works of military architecture in the world, demonstrating the evolution of the principles and practice of fortification in Italy, France, and Britain over more than four centuries.

#### *Comparative analysis*

There is a number of fortified harbours in the Mediterranean that should be considered by comparison with Valletta. These include Corfu, Candia (Iraklion), Rhodes, and Gibraltar. Corfu is most closely comparable with Valletta, since it was fortified over a long period by Venetians, French, and British, all of whom left defensive works characteristic of their respective traditions of military architecture. However, the Corfu fortifications were to a considerable extent destroyed, either completely or partially, in the 19th century and only a few elements survive intact.

The 17th century Venetian fortifications of Iraklion enclose a much smaller area and are representative of only one period of military architecture, as are the medieval fortifications of Rhodes. Gibraltar is the only site with such intensive fortifications, but these are almost entirely British, from the 18th to 20th centuries.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

This nomination can only be treated as an extension of the existing inscription of the City of Valletta, inscribed on the World Heritage List under criteria i and vi. ICOMOS has no doubts about the cultural significance of the fortifications, which it considers to form a single unity with the historic city. In the event of this extension being approved by the World Heritage Committee, criteria ii and iii should be added.

At the present time, all the elements nominated are not protected formally as listed monuments under the Antiquities (Protection) Act 1925. This omission should be rectified.

Whilst there is a number of land-use plans in force that cover most of the fortifications, there is a need for a master conservation plan for the totality. This should include a comprehensive survey of the fortifications, in terms of their architectural detail, their historical and physical relationship with one another, and their geomorphological setting, together with a synthetic study of their evolution. The plan should set up a costed and phased programme for conservation and restoration, with a scientific programme of regular monitoring.

## Campeche (Mexico)

No 895

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Area of historical monuments in the town of Campeche and its system of fortifications
<i>Location</i>	State of Campeche
<i>State Party</i>	Mexico
<i>Date</i>	23 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The town of Campeche is an urbanization model of a Baroque city (1686-1704), with a grid layout, surrounded by an irregular hexagon corresponding to the defensive belt which encircled the town and protected it from pirate attacks. For this reason, its system of fortifications is part of an overall defence plan, an architectural expression of its history, which still exists in certain town planning features.

#### Criterion ii

The area of historic monuments in the town of Campeche, with its walled section, is an example of a colonial harbour town which has played an important economic and strategic role over time. It still has traces of its urban plan and its historic buildings, which are silent witnesses to the high degree of conservation and integrity of the town.

The fortifications of Campeche provide an outstanding illustration of the military architecture of the 17th and 18th centuries, forming part of a integrated defence system for the ports established by Spain in the Caribbean to defend itself against pirate invasions. Campeche is one of two fortified towns on the Caribbean coast of Mexico, and the only one to have largely conserved this important cultural heritage.

#### Criterion iv

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the area of historic monuments of the town of Campeche and its system of fortifications are a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Campeche was founded in 1540 by Francisco Montejo El Mozo in the south-west of the Maya region of Ah Kin Pech, which had been explored and occupied by Spanish conquerors from 1517 onwards. From the start, the port played a major role as a starting point for expeditions to the Yucatan peninsula and the Petén region in Guatemala.

Its commercial and military importance made it the second biggest town in the Gulf of Mexico, after Mérida.

During the second half of the 16th century, Campeche, like other Caribbean towns, was systematically attacked by pirates and corsairs in the pay of enemies of Spain; this is why a large-scale defensive system was installed. At the beginning of the 18th century, the town was surrounded by an impressive hexagonal wall with a perimeter of 2536m, 6-8m high, and 2.50m thick. An urban checkerboard plan was chosen, with a *Plaza Mayor* facing the sea and surrounded by government and religious edifices.

In the 19th century, the town endowed itself with a fine theatre, harmonized with the urban fabric. A section of the wall was pulled down in 1893 to open up a space with a view of the sea, and the main square was turned into a public garden.

In the 20th century, the traditional areas of the town centre were little affected by the modernization movement owing to a relative slackening of the economy.

#### Description

The area of historic monuments is in the shape of an uneven polygon spread over 181ha, including 45ha surrounded by walls, with the town stretching out on each side, following the configuration of the coast and the relief. The protected group consists of two sub-groups: area A with a high density of buildings of great heritage value, and area B, which is not so dense or valuable but which forms a transitional and protective zone. Among the c 1000 buildings of historic value are the Cathedral of the Immaculate Conception, several churches, the Toro theatre, and the municipal archives.

The system of fortifications, with the redoubts of San José and San Miguel, and the batteries of San Lucas, San Matias, and San Luís, is mainly in the area of historic monuments, at both ends and facing the sea.

### Management and Protection

#### Legal status

Most of the buildings in the area of historic monuments are privately owned, with a few being publicly owned.

Legal protection is ensured by the 1972 federal legislation on Monuments and Archaeological Areas and by its application regulations of 1975 under which all modifications to buildings must receive prior authorization. A Federal Decree of 1986 lists the area of historic monuments of Campeche and places it under the authority of the National Institute of Anthropology and History (INAH).

At municipal level, a number of prescriptions regulate the conditions for carrying out work on monuments, and ensure respect for the urban image and various protective measures. An important legal instrument is the *Partial Programme for the Conservation and Improvement of the Area of Historic Monuments* which has recently been adopted. This management plan is intended to be a dynamic instrument for the protection and re-allocation of buildings for new economic and cultural purposes.

## Management

The main responsibility for management is held by the State Office for the Coordination of Monuments and Sites and the Municipal Department of Town Planning. These two offices are run by competent and motivated professionals, under the direct authority of the Governor or the President of the Town Council.

The Partial Conservation Programme mentioned above was drawn up by the Department of Urban Planning. It covers 42ha surrounded by walls, and lays down guidelines for conservation, for the allocation of land, and for the promotion of tourist, commercial, and social activities. It also aims at improving housing and living conditions in the historic centre.

At federal level, overall supervision of the conservation conditions of the cultural heritage is exercised by the National Institute of Anthropology and History.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

The conservation conditions are excellent. Even before the adoption of legal protective measures, the residents of the town carefully watched over the conservation of the historic centre and this public conscience is still very much alive.

A large-scale programme to restore facades has been implemented. It is not just a question of a facelift, since most of the buildings are still in a good state of preservation. Whenever necessary, work is also carried out inside the buildings. Several buildings of quality are in the process of being rehabilitated: No 6 on the main square will house a social and cultural institution and the *Renacimiento Circus* of 1910, which still has its original metal structure, will become a multi-purpose hall.

The works undertaken on several sections of the fortifications are exemplary. The green areas are well kept and the town is clean and peaceful.

### Authenticity

The area of historic monuments and the system of fortifications have a high degree of authenticity because of the small number of transformations and interventions. Restoration works make use of traditional techniques and materials.

The authenticity of the historical centre is, to a large extent, due to the continuity of a traditional family lifestyle, with manifestations of a rich intangible heritage, illustrated by local music, dances, cooking, crafts, and clothes.

## Evaluation

### Action by ICOMOS

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the historic centre of Campeche and the system of fortifications in February 1999. In addition, ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages.

## Qualities

The area of historic monuments is a coherent reflection of colonial architecture. The very well conserved system of fortifications is an illustration of military engineering during the period of Spanish colonialism in the Caribbean.

### Comparative analysis

The historic centre of Campeche, surrounded by a defensive wall, and its fortifications are of an exceptionally high standard, comparable with Cartagena de Indias and San Juan in Puerto Rico. The harbour town is part of a defensive system and transport routes covering all the Caribbean, as demonstrated by experts who met in Cartagena de Indias in 1996 under the auspices of UNESCO.

### ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The buffer zone is coherently defined but should be extended to cover a larger area, so as to preserve the heritage values of the perimeter of the historic centre, and it should also include the fortresses.

There is good reason to pursue with determination the present policy to improve the living conditions of the inhabitants of the historic centre and to make investments for an endogenous tourist development - accommodation in the home of an inhabitant, local crafts, and cultural events.

In addition to the historic centre and the buffer zone, it would be appropriate to take into consideration all the land of the municipality of Campeche, considered as a vast complex of architectural, archaeological, natural and cultural values.

### Brief Description

The historic centre of Campeche is a harbour town typical of the Spanish colonial period in the New World which has kept its outer walls and its global system of fortifications.

### Recommendation

That this cultural property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

**Criterion ii:** The harbour town of Campeche is an urbanization model of a Baroque colonial town, with its checkerboard street plan; the defensive walls surrounding its historic centre reflect the influence of the military architecture in the Caribbean.

**Criterion iv:** The fortifications system of Campeche, an eminent example of the military architecture of the 17th and 18th centuries, is part of an overall defensive system set up by the Spanish to protect the ports on the Caribbean Sea from pirate attacks.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Xochicalco (Mexico)

No 939

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The archaeological monuments zone of Xochicalco
<i>Location</i>	Municipalities of Temixco and Miacatlan, Morelos State
<i>State Party</i>	Mexico
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Epiclassic Period in Mesoamerica (c AD 650-900) is characterized by the waning and ultimate fall of the large dominant Classic centres such as Teotihuacan. The Epiclassic is a transitional period with high population mobility which allowed other regional centres to rise and prosper. These new cities represent more militaristic societies and were usually located in elevated defensive positions. Xochicalco is the most important manifestation of this new type of fortified Mesoamerican city. **Criterion ii**

Xochicalco shows exceptional city planning features. The hill was artificially modified by cutting and filling in order to create platforms at different levels on which were placed the main structures, allocating a specific function to each part of the city. **Criterion iii**

The presence of sculptural work of extraordinary quality on the walls of the Plumed Serpent Pyramid, with complex iconography and a rich combination of stylistic influences, indicates wide contacts with diverse cultures from other Mesoamerican regions. **Criteria ii and iii**

An innovation in Mesoamerican architecture is the exceptional use of a complex system of accesses through porticoes to large plazas, as well as bastions at the entrances to the city. The site is unique because of the presence of porticoes as independent buildings, exclusively in order to control access and circulation inside the urban centre. **Criterion iv**

Other extraordinary features are an underground observatory where on certain specific dates sunlight falls on the floor with spectacular luminosity; an interesting ramp paved with flagstones engraved with animal figures; one of the most magnificent *temazcal* (steam baths), located near the ball-court and used for purification in the ball-game ritual; and the marvellous integration with the natural environment and surrounding landscape resulting for the location. **Criterion iv**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The decline of the political and economic primacy of the Teotihuacan cities in the 7th and 8th centuries AD marked the end of the Mesoamerican Classic period and the beginning of an age of some two centuries that saw the fall of other large Classic capitals, such as Monte Alban, Palenque, La Quemada, and Tikal, which had dominated large territories. The result was reduction of urban populations or even complete abandonment.

There was considerable movement of peoples and new relationships were established between different regions such as the Central Highlands, the coast of the Gulf of Mexico, Yucatan, Chiapas, and Guatemala. This period, from c 650 to 900, is known as the Epiclassic Period. New expansionist societies developed, though none achieved the dominance and magnitude of Teotihuacan, Monte Alban, or Tikal. There was a low level of integration between them, confederations being formed and dissolved. Their survival depended upon their success in controlling scarce resources, development of specialized productions, and dominance of commercial routes.

In a period of political instability and commercial competition such as this, the military infrastructure became crucial, and new settlements grew up at easily defensible sites, equipped with ramparts, moats, palisades, bastions, and citadels. Xochicalco is the supreme example of this type of Epiclassic fortified city. It appears to have been the creation of a confederation of settlements in the large region which is now constituted of the States of Guerrero, México, and western Morelos.

A large number of impressive public and religious structures were erected in a very short time, and these show cultural influences from both the Central Highlands, the Gulf coast, and the Mayan region. It was founded in the second half of the 7th century and was abruptly abandoned after having been sacked in the late 9th century.

#### Description

Xochicalco was built on a series of natural hills. The highest of these was the core of the settlement, with many public buildings, but evidence of occupation has been found on six of the lower hills surrounding it. Substantial engineering work in the form of terracing and the construction of massive retaining walls in order to create a series of open spaces defined by platforms and pyramidal structures. They are linked by a complex system of staircases, terraces, and ramps, so as to create a main north-south communication axis.

There are three distinct levels of organization to be recognized in material terms at Xochicalco - social, political, and religious. The lower part is encircled by moated walls, pierced by defended entrances; it contains largely residential buildings. Next comes the intermediate level, the so-called

“Market Ensemble,” with the Plaza of the Stele of the Two Glyphs, a ball-court, and more residential structures. The highest level consists of a group of temples and other monumental buildings for the use of the ruling class around the main plaza. The crest of the hill is the so-called “Acropolis.”

- The lower level

The access way begins at the base of the southern hill and enters the city through the main entrance, which is flanked by two bastions. The causeway is paved with irregular flagstones and flanked with low walls giving on to residential areas.

- The intermediate level

The *Market Ensemble* is a plaza measuring 40m by 70m which appears from archaeological evidence to have been used as a market.

Beyond it is another plaza on a platform from which a broad staircase more than 30m wide ascends to the *Plaza of the Stele of the Two Glyphs*. This 40m square plaza is closed on its east and west sides by two buildings that are similar in form and size, and to the north by the *Great Pyramid*, the largest structure on the site. It consists of seven steps, with the remains of a temple at the apex. The stele from which the plaza takes its name is located on a square podium in its centre. Its form and location suggest that this was the centre of civic and ceremonial life for the community, not least because it is easily accessible.

The *southern ball-court*, the largest at Xochicalco, is reached by a wide causeway. Beyond it is a group of structures known as the *Palace*; residential rooms, kitchens, workshops, and storerooms, along with a *temazcal* (steam-bath) are ranged around a series of patios. There is a series of 21 calendar altars lining the causeway, recording the months (and in one case days) of the ceremonial year. Below there is a mound measuring 70m by 45m, known as *La Malinche* (so far unexplored), access to which was made possible by filling a gorge 15m deep.

- The upper level

A large platform was built around the northern, southern, and west sides of the upper level. To the east there is a complex of three structures. The first of these is rectangular in plan and opens out into a 15m by 8m patio sunk 3.7m below the external level; it is accessible only from the roofs of the rooms.

The second unit is a large (35m by 25m) patio closed on three sides by narrow galleries and delimited on the fourth by three pyramidal platforms. Alongside it is the third element, the east ball-court, separated by a 15m by 6m monumental ramp paved with stone slabs engraved with images of birds, reptiles, insects, and mammals, known as the *Ramp of the Animals*.

To the north there is a series of large structures, supported by a 15m high retaining wall. They include imposing structures of uncertain use and a *temazcal* formed by four rectangular pillars supporting a flat roof; this is one of the finest examples of this type of structure in Mesoamerica. The 90m long northern ball-court is exceptional in that one of its sides has the normal slope whilst the other consists of a massive wall 9m high which acts as the retaining wall for the platform above.

This sector also includes a large rainwater cistern that formed part of a complex water system covering the whole settlement. Beneath this platform is to be found the entrance to the caves that were used in the early phases of occupation for quarrying building materials. Later it was modified as an observatory for studying the heavens and for ceremonies.

The *Main Plaza* is on an enormous artificial mound, accessible only through the two defended porticoes, 100m above the main entrance, some 600m away. It is dominated by two architectural complexes. That to the north consists of four very large rooms round a patio. The eastern one is more complicated in plan, round four patios; access is strictly controlled.

In the south-eastern corner of the Main Plaza is to be found the *Pyramid of the Stele of the Two Glyphs*, a stepped pyramidal base with a structure at its apex consisting of a patio defined by two lateral rooms and a temple at the far end.

Two pyramidal structures are located in the middle of the plaza. One is the remarkable *Pyramid of the Plumed Serpents*. The excellent proportions of its sloping base and the projecting panel with a flared cornice give this structure a distinctive appearance. The four facades are sculpted in high relief with representations of enormous plumed serpents, the Quetzalcoatl of Teotihuacan. Their bodies frame seated figures with Mayan characteristics, interpreted as priests, rulers, and astronomers. On the projecting panel there are similar seated figures, but less elaborately attired, along with calendar symbols. The cornice is decorated with a ridge of shells. The upper walls of the temple bear figures that have been interpreted as warriors.

The so-called *Twin Pyramid* is similar in form and size, but it lacks the relief decoration. However, there is evidence that its walls were originally ornamented with mural paintings.

The *Acropolis* is built on a 6m high platform to the west of the Main Plaza. It is formed of a series of buildings laid out on variations of a central patio with lateral rooms.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The property is protected under the provisions of the 1972 Federal Law for Archaeological, Artistic and Historical Monuments and Zones, which lays down strict regulations for the protection and conservation of designated archaeological sites. Xochicalco was designated an Archaeological Monuments Zone by Federal Decree on 18 February 1994.

### *Management*

Most of the Archaeological Zone is National Property, There are strict controls over any form of development within the Zone or in the substantial protected area (which constitutes an adequate buffer zone as defined in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*).

Management of the site is the responsibility of the National Institute for Anthropology and History (*Instituto Nacional de Antropología e Historia* - INAH), through its Regional Centre in Morelos. INAH is an agency of the National Council for Culture and Arts (CNCA) and of the Ministry of

Public Education (SEP). In the case of Xochicalco it works in collaboration with the State of Morelos and the Municipalities of Miacatlan and Temixco.

The Xochicalco site is located on hilltops in a wild region that is difficult of access. There is only one route to it, which crosses 8km from Federal Highway 55 and goes on to the Municipalities of Xochitepec and Miacatlan, both 24km further on. This isolation has contributed greatly to its excellent state of conservation and assisted in its effective management until now, but this situation may change in the future (see "ICOMOS recommendations" below).

INAH has been developing protection and management criteria in collaboration with other authorities for Xochicalco since 1978. The 1980 Miacatlan Urban Development Plan defined the buffer zone within which urban use was prohibited; this prevented incursion into the setting of the site for the construction of a tourist facility, proposed by State and Federal agencies in the early 1980s.

In 1982 the Ministry of Public Works (SAHOP) and the General Directorate for Organization and Works at National Parks for Public Recreation prepared the Park Protection Plan for the Xochicalco Archaeological Zone, which prescribed development proposals relating to the protection and operation of the Zone and criteria for its management.

The 1995 Morelos State and Municipal Urban Development Programme established regulations to control unauthorized settlement in ecological protection areas, of which the Xochicalco Archaeological Zone is one.

The INAH Morelos Regional Centre has a general management plan for the efficient protection and management of the site.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

The first archaeological excavation took place at Xochicalco in 1909, when restoration work was carried out on the Pyramid of the Plumed Serpents. The central zone was surveyed in 1923 and registered in the National Archaeological Inventory in 1927.

Excavations were subsequently carried out in 1934-39, 1941-51, 1960-70, and 1984-86, in each case conservation and consolidation work being performed on the excavated and associated structures.

In 1992-94 a major campaign, the Xochicalco Archaeological Special Project, was financed by INAH. This was one of twelve such projects dedicated to archaeological sites that were actual or potential World Heritage sites. This work has been continuing as part of the regular management programme.

The Special Project involved the conservation and consolidation of both structures excavated earlier and those revealed by current work. A considerable amount of scientific research was carried out in search of appropriate conservation materials and techniques and better drainage of the site. A forestry rehabilitation programme resulted in the planting of much of the site with authentic native flora.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of Xochicalco may be adjudged to very high. There has been a policy of anastylosis consistent with the precepts of the 1965 Venice Charter in operation for many years. Some of the earlier reconstruction work, notably that of the Pyramid of the Plumed Serpents in the early years of the present century, is somewhat questionable in contemporary terms, but it may be considered to have a historicity of its own.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Xochicalco in August 1998.

### *Qualities*

Xochicalco is the best preserved and most complete example of a fortified urban settlement from the troubled Late Classic and Epiclassic periods of the archaeology of Mesoamerica.

### *Comparative analysis*

Contemporary settlements include El Tajín, Uxmal (both on the World Heritage List), and Cacaxtla. However, Xochicalco differs significantly from these sites because of the exceptional way in which diverse cultural elements from the Central Highlands, the Gulf Coast, and Yucatán are brought together and fuse to create a new and distinctive style.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

Inscription on the World Heritage List would inevitably result in a considerable increase in visitor numbers, not least because Xochicalco is within reach of Mexico City by road. INAH should take steps to ensure that adequate provisions are made for the reception of these increased numbers. The existing facilities are acceptable for the present level of visitors but would be overstrained if these were to increase significantly.

## Brief description

Xochicalco is an exceptionally intact and well preserved example of a fortified political, religious, and commercial centre from the troubled period of AD 650-900 that followed the breakdown of the great Mesoamerican states such as Teotihuacan, Monte Alban, Palenque, and Tikal.

## Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and iv*:

*Criterion iii* Xochicalco is an exceptionally well preserved and complete example of a fortified settlement from the Epiclassic Period of Mesoamerica.

*Criterion iv* The architecture and art of Xochicalco represent the fusion of cultural elements from different parts of Mesoamerica, at a period when the breakdown of earlier political structures resulted in intensive cultural regrouping.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Beemster Polder (The Netherlands)

No 899

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Droogmakerij de Beemster (The Beemster Polder)
<i>Location</i>	Province of Noord-Holland
<i>State Party</i>	The Netherlands
<i>Date</i>	26 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

De Beemster, a clearly defined, systematically laid out reclaimed land, a complex designed and created as a cultural landscape by man, is a site of outstanding universal value from the point of view of history, art, (landscape) architecture, science, and learning, as well as being a monument in its own right, representing a unique masterpiece of human creative genius. **Criterion i**

It is also an outstanding example of an architectural ensemble and physical environment that illustrates a significant stage in the history of land colonization in The Netherlands and elsewhere since the 17th century. The historic physical environment of The Netherlands has been brought to life and developed through ever-improved developments in civil water-management techniques. It is a man-made landscape that constitutes a site in a river delta with large areas consisting of fenlands. **Criterion ii**

De Beemster was drained, cultivated, and colonized - a deliberate intervention in this undeveloped region - at the same time as the city of Amsterdam first expanded during the 17th century. This expansion was supported by the *nouveaux riches*, the merchants and regents of Amsterdam, and was carried out by surveyors, city architects, and administrators. They were involved in the expansion of Amsterdam in 1613 as well as in De Beemster polder. At the time, town-planning and architectural principles were applied that even today show a close relationship to the classical and Italian theories and treatises of Vitruvius, Palladio, and others concerning radial cities, about the *città ideale*, about checkerboard patterns, and about laying out straight, safe, paved, and planted roads. **Criterion iv**

There were two main reasons for creating De Beemster: to control recurrent flooding and reclaim new agricultural land, and also to find a safe way to invest funds. It had been determined as early as 1611 that the region should also realize the pastoral classical nature and agriculture model, because of its spatial design with lanes, green compartments ('chambers'), pleasure gardens for the wealthy merchants of Amsterdam, and plantations.

De Beemster with its rational geometric layout was designed as an architectural landscape. The theory of 17th century urban development and agricultural engineering for reclaiming land was based on the 'ideal of the straight line', and in addition fell back on old-fashioned principles such as (geometric) structure, planning and linear monumentality, symmetry, harmony, and order - a landscape in which the square, the basic pattern from analogy of the theories of Scamozzi, induces balance and diffusion. **Criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

Lagoons and deltas take up the greater part of the Dutch land. Over the centuries this land was made habitable by means of land reclamation and protection against the water. Of the 3.4 million ha which now constitute The Netherlands, a third is below sea level. If no dikes had been constructed and if there were no drainage of excess water, 65% of The Netherlands of today would be under water.

The northern coastal area of the Kop van Noord-Holland and along the Wadden Sea was once a virtually interconnected series of mud-flats that extended to south-western Denmark. The earliest habitation was on knolls, which offered protection from the water before sea walls and dikes had been constructed. The need to 'create' new land arose from the damage caused by the continual flooding, with the added bonus of obtaining excellent agricultural land.

Five factors influenced on the process of land reclamation: the availability of capital for investment, stable political and economic relationships, and the availability of technical means, entrepreneurial spirit, and good prices for farmland.

The battle against the water began in the northern part of Noord-Holland, in the area situated above the former open waters of the IJ, by keeping out the sea-water. From the 16th century onward efforts were geared toward draining lakes and ponds situated further inland. Land reclamation took place by draining the big lakes, particularly in the northern part of Holland. This process was made possible by the drastic improvement in pumping and draining technology using windmills driving waterwheels. From the end of the Middle Ages the entire north of the IJ (*Hollands Noorderkwartier*) was enclosed within a ring of dikes; however, considerable areas of water survived within the individual polders and the centre of the region was still occupied by the large Schermer, Purmer, and Beemster lakes. More and more land could be reclaimed when the technique of building dikes with discharging structures (sluices) was developed. These developments are

sometimes called the delta-works of the 17th and 18th century.

Wind power was used to drain the polders as early as the 15th century, through the use of wind-driven water-pumping mills. The 16th century development of the revolving cap on windmills made it possible to drain the larger lakes. From the beginning of the 17th century onward it became possible to drain large bodies of water, such as the Beemster, by using networks of three or four windmills. The invention of this process is attributed to Simon Stevin (1548-1620).

The initiative to drain the water of the Beemster was taken by a number of wealthy regents and merchants from Amsterdam and a number of high-ranking civil servants in The Hague. In 1607 a patent was granted by the States of Holland to sixteen people who founded the *Beemstercompagnie* to provide the requisite capital. The patent speaks of "work such, that it is possible to make Water into Land." In total there were 123 investors, who received a return of 17% on their investment upon completion of the polder in 1612.

As a preliminary to the work, a map of the Beemster and its environs was made by the surveyor Pieter Cornelisz. Cort of Alkmaar, to determine the possible consequences of diking and to establish how to drain the Beemster itself. After Cort's death in 1608, he was succeeded by Lucas Jansz. Sinck, land surveyor in Amsterdam, who laid out the first dike section for the Beemster polder. In 1608 the dike section between Purmerend and Neck was sub-contracted, as was the drainage canal to the Zuiderzee.

It was decided in 1611 that Sinck would draw in the roads and canals. In that same year a start was made on laying out the canals and roads to prepare for the allotment of land. Within the allotments the owners would be allowed to dig as many canals and ditches as they saw fit. The blocks between the roads were to have a surface area of 400 *morgen*, divided by canals into four blocks of 100 *morgen* (1 *morgen* = c 0.85ha). It was finally decided to divide the land into five allotments. The allotments were made in "packages"; the value of each package compared to the others would be the same, as poor soil was compensated by good.

Shovels and pickaxes were used in the basic engineering works; the foundations for sluices and windmills were sunk using manual pile-driving installations operated by 30-40 people. Reclamation was effected by means of windmills. The reclamation of the Beemster ultimately took place with the construction of fifteen windmill networks.

The polder finally became a reality on 19 May 1612, and in August 1612 the plots of land were allotted. The by-law of 1616 includes conditions on "plants and trees." This created an "ideal" landscape from 1620 onward with the planting of the lanes with trees. First only the northern and western side of the roads were planted, so that the sun could dry the roads, which were still waterlogged.

After the conversion from drainage by wind to steam power in the late 1800s, the water was discharged into the belt canal by three pumping stations. In the 20th century these were converted to diesel power. De Beemster is now drained by the fully automated electric pumping station Wouter Sluis along the Westdijk (Middensloot) and by the

diesel pumping station Jacobus Bouman along the Oostdijk (Oosthuizenloot).

### *Description*

The Beemster polder is situated to the north of Amsterdam and to the west of Purmerend. De Beemster was formerly a chain of peat bogs diked in by means of ring-dikes and protected against the sea on the western side by the dunes of Kennemerland. The Zeevang to the east of De Beemster and the Waterlant and Zaanstreek to the south were encircled by ring-dikes. In between there were stretches of water, such as the Beemster and the Schermer and the wide inlet, the Ye.

At high tide the water of the Zuiderzee flowed freely into the Beemster via the Korsloot. The Beemster in turn flowed into the Purmer via the Weere, and into the Schermer through the Zwet at Schermerhoorn and into the Starmeer via the Spijkerboor. At some time in the early 14th century the Beemster was closed off on the north-eastern side and no longer had an opening to the Zuiderzee at that point.

The former Beemstermeer, which was once the largest open water of the Noorderkwartier of The Netherlands, was created by the gradual overflow and by low-lying peat land crumbling away after the Zuiderzee had found a way through to this area. This process was completed by around 1100. The current size of the Beemster Polder indicates the size of this body of water at the time.

The land was allocated in oblong lots of 180m by 900m. The short sides of the lots are connected by a drainage canal and an access road. Five such lots formed a unit, a module of 900m square, and four of these units in turn formed a large square of 400 *morgen*. The direction of the squares corresponded as much as possible with the original direction of the former shorelines of the lake so as to avoid creating unusable lots along the shoreline.

### - *Buildings in De Beemster*

The "bell-jar" farm (*stolpboederij*) with its typical square base fits in particularly well in the geometric pattern of the polder. The farm in itself can be considered a geometric modular unit with barns, hay and seed stores, stables, and other outbuildings.

There is also a number of country homes with their formal gardens, intended as pleasure farms (*lusthoven*) and out-of-town houses which served as summer residences for urban proprietors, mainly from Amsterdam. Decoration and practical use interchanged in the design of orchards, arbours, kitchen gardens, and footpaths. However, most of these were demolished in the 18th century, and all that remains is a number of monumental entry gates to farms built at later dates.

### - *Agriculture in De Beemster*

The drained land was originally used for cereal production, but as time went by it was gradually turned into pasture land for cattle because the high water table and soil conditions were not suitable for arable farming. Until the 1880s, De Beemster was primarily used for cattle breeding. With the introduction of steam-driven pumping stations it

was possible to drain more deeply and to remove more water, and this resulted in an enormous expansion into horticulture.

The current picture is a mixed one of arable land, pastures for dairy farming, greenhouse horticulture, and fruit farming, whilst around 200ha are used for bulb-growing.

#### - Villages and roads in De Beemster

Of the five residential centres originally projected for De Beemster in the 17th century, only Midden-, West-, and Noordbeemster were actually developed as such; Zuid- and Oostbeemster became Zuidoostbeemster. In addition, a number of other neighbourhoods developed.

The main watercourses from north to south are the Schermerhornersloot, Oosthuizenersloot, Middensloot, Draaioordersloot, and Zuidersloot, which run parallel to each other. From east to west are the Oostersloot, Beetstersloot, Jispersloot, and Vrouwsloot, which also run parallel to one another.

The road layout is rigidly linear, conforming with the geometric layout of the polder. In the middle there is the Middenweg, which runs north-east to south-west. Parallel to this are the Purmerenderweg, the Nekkerweg, and the Jisperweg. At Middenbeemster, the Middenweg intersects the Rijperweg, which runs north-west to south-east. Parallel to the Rijperweg are the Mijzerweg (the most northerly road), the Vrouwenweg (formerly the Westmyserpad), the Oosthuizenersweg, the Hobrederweg, the Rijperweg, and the Zuiderweg (the most southerly road).

Of the polder roads, the Wormerweg has retained its old profile. The trees along the Vrouwenweg create a particularly impressive picture. There are no trees on the verges of the dikes along the canal and belt-canal alongside the Beemsterringvaart because of their damming function. After the Second World War, poplars were planted on the dike. They form a prominent screen, distinctively demarcating the polder in the open landscape of the Noorderkwartier.

*Middenbeemster*, situated at the intersection of the Middenweg and the Rijperweg, is the principal town of De Beemster. An open rectangular space, the former cattle market, can be seen at the four arms of these cross-roads. The Reformed Church, built after 1621, is located in the south-eastern corner. A former smithy, a school, and the Heerenhuis (manor house) are also placed around this square. The monumental bell-jar farms along the Middenweg (the Lepelaar, the Eenhoorn, and the Volgerweg) are unique elements outside the historic village centre.

*Westbeemster* was originally planned at the intersection of the Jisperweg and the Hobrederweg as an agrarian hamlet. The church and the cemetery were placed to the north of the intersection. The buildings are mainly residential housing, forming a ribbon development along the Jisperweg. The Roman-Catholic community of De Beemster established itself here and a large Neo-Gothic church, a convent, and a few Roman-Catholic schools were built in the 19th and 20th centuries.

*Noordbeemster*, also conceived as an agrarian hamlet, lies to the north of Middenbeemster, along the Middenweg.

The labourers' homes are single-storey buildings with pitched or mansard roofs.

*Zuidoostbeemster* has always been a horticultural area primarily geared toward Amsterdam, and has expanded considerably. The village is situated at the intersection of the Purmerenderweg and the Zuiderweg. From the middle of the 19th century retired farmers from De Beemster settled here, and their single-storey homes (*rentenierswoningen*) along the Purmerenderweg and the Zuiderweg are testimony to this.

*Klaterbuurt* was originally a working-class area. The homes of the farmhands are sometimes called "kitchens." A few historic bell-jar farms and the stables of a former country estate which has been converted into a farm, Rijperweg 17, are the noteworthy features in this area.

*Halfweg*, located along the Volgerweg and the intersecting Nekkerweg, is also an old working-class area. The labourers' homes consist of two houses under a single pitched roof, built parallel to the road.

Five forts, an inundation sluice, and two dam sluices belonging to the *Stelling van Amsterdam* (Defence Line of Amsterdam) are located in the southern part of De Beemster.

#### - Water management of De Beemster polder

A surface area of 7220ha of De Beemster produces water. There are height differences within the polder. A band runs from east to west in the middle of the polder, which is 50cm lower than the adjacent areas. The average height of the low area is 3.80m below Mean Sea Level, with large areas up to 4.00m below; the higher areas are 3.00 metres below. The polder is surrounded by the dike, which in turn is situated higher than the dikes on the other side of the belt canal. This construction was deliberately chosen to safeguard the large financial investment in the polder in the event that the Zuiderzeedijk gave way.

The current Beemsterringvaart (Beemster Belt Canal) and part of the Groot Noordhollandsch Kanaal (1819-24) are part of the Schermerboezem (Schermer Reservoir). The reservoir discharges through both natural and manmade watercourses into the Wadden Sea (near Den Helder), the IJsselmeer (via the Naamsloot and at Lutje Schardam), and the Noordzeekanaal (the Channel). Water is supplied mainly from the IJsselmeer.

De Beemster is divided into three departments, each with its own water level: the Bovenpolder, the Middenpolder, and the Arenbergerpolder. There are two lower-lying areas in the Middenpolder - the Hoge Kilpolder and the Lage Kilpolder. Summer and winter water levels vary between 10cm and 30cm. The main watercourses of the various sections are connected by means of culverts, enabling the water of the higher-lying sections to flow to the lower, directly drained sections.

Six inlet sluices in the 45km long ring-dike let in water in the summer. The canals around the forts are fed by four inlet sluices, in addition to the inundation sluice. There is a separate inlet sluice for Kruisoord or Hoogland in the north-eastern section.

### Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

At State level, the 1988 Monuments Act defines as State Monuments "everything constructed over at least fifty years ago that is of public importance because of its beauty, its importance to science, or its cultural-historical value." The State Monument Register extends to townscapes, for which there must be zoning plans drawn up by local authorities under the provisions of the 1985 Rural Development Act. Currently 60 monuments in the Municipality of Beemster, which corresponds exactly with the polder, are protected monuments, and a further list of seventeen has been submitted for consideration.

There is provision at regional, provincial, and municipal level for the preparation and implementation of comprehensive land-use and zoning plans, which are regularly updated. Cultural heritage protection forms an integral part of these plans. The Beemster Polder forms part of the National Central Landscape of Noord-Holland, as defined in the 1991 Waterland Regional Plan.

The 1996 Monument Decree of the Province of Noord-Holland covers monuments, buildings, and townscapes and is directly applied to the Beemster Polder. In 1991 the Municipality of Beemster adopted its own Monument Decree; this was updated in 1994.

### *Management*

Management at different levels, in accordance with zoning and land-use plans, is shared by the Municipality of Beemster, the Provincial Administration of Noord-Holland, and the Waterschap De Waterlanden.

The last-named is a water board of a type that is unique to The Netherlands. It was created in 1981 following a merger of a number of water boards, and is in charge of water management in an area of c 35,000ha, including De Beemster. One of its special duties is to manage the planting of trees along the public roads of De Beemster.

State protected monuments are the concern of the Netherlands Department for Conservation (*Rijksdienst voor de Monumentenzorg*), an agency of the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science. The Association for the Conservation of Nature Monuments in The Netherlands (*Vereniging tot Behoud van Natuurmonumenten in Nederland*) manages the forts of the Stelling van Amsterdam.

All these bodies have programmes of regular and systematic monitoring of conservation and protection measures within their respective competences.

The boundaries of the nominated area are clear-cut and logical, being based on the functional dikes and canals created in the early 17th century when the Beemster project was completed and never changed. There is a logical and adequate buffer zone, comprising the North Holland Canal and other polders (including the historic town of Rijkp), in which protection is provided under the Dutch legislation listed above.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

The Beemster Polder is a living organic landscape that has evolved over nearly four centuries and continues to play an important role in the economic life of The Netherlands. With changing social and economic conditions certain elements,

such as the pleasure farms and windmills, have disappeared, whilst others have changed their functions. There has been a shift from primarily arable farming to a mixed economy, with emphasis on dairy farming and horticulture, which has changed certain aspects of the landscape.

However, the basic structure of dikes, canals, roads, and human settlements laid down in the early 17th century remains intact and authentic, since any fundamental disturbance would put the physical integrity of the entire region in jeopardy.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the Beemster Polder in January 1999. ICOMOS also benefited from the expertise of its International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Sites.

#### *Qualities*

The Beemster Polder represents a very important event in the history of land reclamation. It combines the genius of the Dutch water engineers, who were to carry out similar reclamation projects in many parts of the world, with an intellectual concept, that of the fully planned architectonic landscape, that stems from the classical and Renaissance ideal of the "ideal city," imposing both spatial and social order upon the landscape and fusing natural and manmade elements into an integrated and ordered whole. As such it had a profound influence on subsequent reclamation and landscaping projects throughout Europe and beyond.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The example of the Beemster Polder was followed rapidly by other projects in The Netherlands in the 17th century, occasioned by the pressures created by a rapidly expanding population. It was to be adopted as a model for the ambitious 20th century reclamation project for draining the Zuiderzee/IJsselmeer. None of these, however, can be considered to compare with the Beemster Polder because of the latter's intellectual and technological creativity, advanced approach.

### **Brief description**

The Beemster Polder is the oldest area of reclaimed land in The Netherlands, dating from the early 17th century. It has preserved intact its regular landscape of fields, roads, canals, dikes, and settlements, laid out in accordance with the principles of classical and Renaissance planning.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, and iv*:

*Criterion i* The Beemster Polder is a masterpiece of creative planning, in which the ideals of antiquity and the Renaissance were applied to the design of a reclaimed landscape.

*Criterion ii* The innovative and intellectually imaginative landscape of the Beemster Polder had a profound and lasting impact on reclamation projects in Europe and beyond.

*Criterion iv* The creation of the Beemster Polder marks a major step forward in the interrelationship between humankind and water at a crucial period of social and economic expansion.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Sukur (Nigeria)

No 938

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Sukur Cultural Landscape
<i>Location</i>	Madagali Local Government Area, Adamawa State
<i>State Party</i>	Nigeria
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Sukur cultural landscape presents an immense potential for research which has a bearing on other African sites. The unsolved mystery of the Nyanga terraces in Mozambique and Zimbabwe as well as questions related to Kenyan terraces may have answers in further research at Sukur. Sukur's domesticated landscape, which is characterized by agricultural terracing, compares favourably with the Philippines rice-terraces. Her unique architecture and stone walls are reminiscent of the Ziea stone walls of Zimbabwe, which have pit structures, like Sukur. All these represent a living heritage as well as a unique effort of indigenous innovation and engineering unequalled in West Africa.

#### Criterion i

The Sukur cultural landscape is also unique in its inbuilt cultural components, which do not exist in the Philippines terraces nor in such complexity in the Kofyar of the Jos Plateau. The components include graves, furnaces, shrines, stone walls, and paved ways. These features make the Sukur landscape an unusual symbiotic interaction between nature and culture, the dead and the living, the past and the present, charging the whole landscape that is lacking in the silent but scenic Philippines environment. **Criteria ii and iii**

The threshing floors, unique stone-built conical walk-in wells, and the iron-smelting furnaces are ingeniously adapted to a seemingly impossible ecological niche and exemplify the African's unique spiritual and physical resilience and adaptive skills, asserting his/her identity on the surface of the earth, thus contributing in a unique way in fostering the ongoing process of local development within the context of globalism. **Criteria v and vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39

of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

The evidence for Neolithic occupation of Sukur is slight, but a pre-Sukur Iron Age phase is shown by finds of furnaces, ore, and grindstones.

The present Dur dynasty of chiefs was established in the 17th century. It saw Sukur becoming a major iron-producing region, supplying north-eastern Nigeria with a vital raw material. This phase continued until the first decade of the 20th century. However, between 1912 and 1922 Sukur was subjected to raids and devastation at the hands of Hamman Yaje, the Fulbe Lamido (chief) of nearby Madagali.

Iron smelting continued to decline in the colonial and independence period, ending around 1960. As a result there were substantial migrations of Sukur people from the plateau to the plains lying to north and south.

#### Description

The Sukur cultural landscape is situated on a plateau in north-eastern Nigeria, close to the frontier with Cameroon. It is an area that has been occupied for many centuries, and its inhabitants have left abundant traces on the present-day landscape. The nominated area covers 764.40ha.

The *Hidi's Palace* or house complex of the *Hidi* (chief), the harem section of which is now in ruins, is of considerable political and religious significance for the Sukur people. Covering just under 1ha, its layout and siting on the hillside high above the settlements of the ordinary people are symbolic of the authority and power of the ruler. The buildings that make up the circular enclosure are relatively simple in design, and constructed of the local granite. Some of the large stones, such as the monoliths that flank one of the gates, are very large and were brought to the site over long distances.

Leading up to the Palace complex from the north and east there are *paved walkways*, 5-7m wide and made from slabs of the same granite that was used within the Palace itself. Within and around complex there are also paved paths, but composed of much larger slabs.

The *domesticated landscape* of the Sukur plateau is characterized by the extensive terracing, of a type known elsewhere in Nigeria (eg the lands of the Koma of the Atlantica Mountains in the Nigeria-Cameroon frontier zone and the Kofyar hill farmers of the Jos Plateau). However, the Sukur terraces have a sacred quality that is lacking in these purely functional terraced landscapes. The Sukur terraces are said to be the product of social organizations whose working parties maintained and progressively extended them. Whilst primarily intended to provide level areas for agriculture, they are invested with a spiritual significance, as shown by the many sacred trees, entrances, and ritual sites within them.

The villages in the Sukur cultural landscape, situated on low-lying ground below the Hidi Palace, have their own characteristic *domestic architecture*. Among its features are drystone walls, used as social markers and defensive enclosures, sunken animal (principally bull) pens, granaries, and threshing floors. Again, the local granite is the main source of constructional materials. The living huts are simple

circular structures made out of clay with roofs of thatch and woven mats. Integrated groups are surrounded by low drystone walls.

The traditional *cemeteries* are to be found in the hills. The tombs are simple stone structures, and different clans and social had their own cemeteries. The only exceptions were for the *Hidi*, whose bodies were buried within their own palace complexes, and children, who were buried close to the settlement.

Of considerable social and economic importance are the *wells*. These are below-ground structures surmounted by conical stone structures and surrounded by an enclosure wall. Within these domestic animals such as cattle and sheep were fattened, either for consumption by the family or for use as prestige and status symbols used in gift and marriage exchanges.

The remains of many disused *iron-smelting furnaces* can still be found. These shaft-type furnaces, blown with bellows, were usually sited close to the houses of their owners. However, it is clear that iron production involved complex socio-economic relationships and that there was a considerable ritual associated with it.

There is a number of *shrines* and altars in the Sukur cultural landscape. Many of these are ceramic and there is a concentration of them in and around the Hidi Palace.

The landscape as a whole is an integrated one, which symbolizes the political and economic structure of the Sukur people. Authority, in the form of the Hidi, is located in an elevated position overlooking the mass of the people in their low-lying villages. Complex social relationships can be observed in the disposition of the cemeteries, whilst the relationships between iron furnaces and settlements and within the agricultural terraces illustrate an elaborate economic pattern of production and distribution.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

Local agreements have been reached with the Hidi-in-Council to the effect that the entire nominated property of the Sukur cultural landscape should be declared a State Monument, and this has now been gazetted by the Adamawa State Government.

This has the effect of automatically empowering the National Commission for Monuments and Museums (NCMM), under the provisions of Decree No 77 of 1979, to protect it as part of the National Patrimony and to participate in its management.

### *Management*

Ownership in the Sukur cultural landscape is vested in the Hidi-in-Council and District Head of Sukur, under the aegis of the Madagali Local Government of Adamawa State.

By virtue of the powers conferred upon it by Decree No 77 of 1979, the NCMM has overall responsibility for management, together with the World Heritage Committee of the Nigerian National Commission for UNESCO. The NCMM maintains a resident archaeologist on-site, with relevant support staff. It collaborates closely with the Adamawa State Council for Arts and Culture, the Madagali

Local Government Council, and the Sukur Development Association.

The NCMM is about to set up a Sites and Monuments Department, which will be responsible for the management of Sukur. This department will implement the interim management plan now in force, which concentrates on the development and conservation of the site, measures against erosion, an inventory of the cultural heritage, restoration of those buildings most at risk, and identification of signage needs. The local community is closely involved in all these activities through the Sukur Development Association.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

The practice of plastering parts of the Hidi's Palace was discontinued half-a-century ago. As a result there has been some disintegration of the structure, which is in need of limited conservation using traditional techniques. However, the occupied section is in a good state of repair.

The traditional prison and the former execution site, neither of which is still in use, are partly ruined and in need of conservation and possible reconstruction. Maintenance of the paved ways is carried out annually by local people, but some stretches are in need of more radical repairs.

One iron-smelting furnace has been reconstructed and used for experimental firings. The local Sukur community, with some support from the Adamawa State Arts Council, has established a small on-site museum.

Declaration of the Sukur cultural landscape as part of the National Patrimony means that there is now supervision of conservation and protection measures by the NCMM. However, these will continue to be provided primarily by the traditional owners and users of the property.

### *Authenticity*

The key features of this cultural landscape have not been significantly modified since they were laid down. The way in which they have been maintained since that time has been in traditional form using traditional materials and techniques. It may therefore be asserted that the Sukur cultural landscape has an exceptionally high degree of authenticity and integrity.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

For administrative reasons, the ICOMOS expert mission to the Sukur cultural landscape did not take place until the beginning of May 1999.

### *Qualities*

The Sukur cultural landscape is an organically evolved landscape (as defined in paragraph 39.ii of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*) that faithfully reflects the social structure, religious beliefs, and economic base of the society that created it centuries ago and continues to live within it. The settlement and landscape of Sukur are representative of the traditional societies of this region of West Africa. Sukur has been exposed to no adverse external influences since its

foundation and its continuance should be assured by the continuation of traditional practices combined with statutory protection.

The two ICOMOS proposals should be commended to the State Party for immediate action.

ICOMOS, June 1999

#### *Comparative analysis*

The terraced landscape at Sukur with its hierarchical structure and combination of intensive and extensive farming is not unique. It exists elsewhere in Nigeria, practised by the Kofyar hill farmers of the Jos Plateau, and comparable systems are to be found in the Nuba lands of the Sudan and, further afield, among Amerindian peoples of the Americas. However, it has certain exceptional features that are not to be found elsewhere, notably the use of paved tracks and the spiritual content of the terraces, with their ritual features.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The ICOMOS mission was carried out by an expert from a neighbouring sub-Saharan African country, who stressed the importance and effectiveness of the protection afforded to this cultural landscape by the long-established traditional customs of the local community.

The mission report makes specific proposals:

- The organization of a round table on the future development of Sukur in which government agencies, the local community, tourist bodies, and other potential partners should participate;
- Adoption of a cultural and tourist management plan involving the creation of a body responsible for its implementation, the production of authentic tourist material, the integration of reception and accommodation facilities with the environment, and the development of means of transport appropriate to the landscape and its environment. Part of the revenues from such activities should be committed to the management of the cultural and natural resources of Sukur.

#### **Brief description**

The historic terraced landscape of Sukur, with the palace of its ruler on a hill dominating the villages below, its terraced fields and their sacred symbols, and the extensive remains of a former flourishing iron industry, is a remarkably intact physical expression of a society and its spiritual and material culture.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and v*:

*Criterion iii* Sukur is an exceptional landscape which graphically illustrates a form of land-use that marks a critical stage in human settlement and its relationship with its environment.

*Criterion v* The cultural landscape of Sukur has survived unchanged for many centuries, and continues to do so at a period when this form of traditional human settlement is under threat in many parts of the world.

## Pachacamac (Peru)

No 952

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Pachacamac Archaeological Sanctuary
<i>Location</i>	Lima Department, Lima Province
<i>State Party</i>	Peru
<i>Date</i>	5 August 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Pachacamac Sanctuary represents creative genius, owing to its strategic location and the magnificence of its constructions. It successfully fulfilled religious and socio-economic purposes. Its construction was dedicated to a single deity, the “creator of the universe,” and it became the most important oracle on the coast of Peru, attracting pilgrims from all four regions of the Inca Empire. **Criterion i**

As a place of religious pilgrimage for diverse peoples on the coast and in the central Andes, the Pachacamac Sanctuary acted as a meeting place of different cultures, which were able to share knowledge and technologies that were applied in the development of this city. It thus served to transmit knowledge throughout its area of influence, uniting it through the worship of the god Pachacamac and becoming a centre of interchange of values on developments in the monumental arts.

Thousands of man-hours went into the construction of palaces, temples, walls, streets, squares, and residential quarters, constructed from millions of adobe bricks prepared with great care and attention, reflecting a desire to please and thank the deity, thereby exhibiting one of the greatest of human values, faith in their god. This devotion is also reflected in the monumental architectural approach and planning applied in the construction of the different monuments in the city, such as the Old Temple, the Painted Temple, and the Temple of the Sun, which occupy dominant positions in the landscape and urban layout. **Criterion ii**

Pachacamac bears unique and exceptional testimony to the occupation of this valley by Andean peoples from 200 BC up to the arrival of the Spaniards in 1532. The city-sanctuary saw the rise and fall of the Lima (200 BC-AD 500), Wari (500-1000), Ichma (1000-1450), and Inca (1450-1532) civilizations. Throughout that long period of cultural development Pachacamac retained its religious importance and was the object of respect and adoration. It took the Spaniards forty years of occupation before they were able to evict the inhabitants of the Pachacamac Sanctuary forcibly. However, worship of the god continued for several generations afterwards. Today a ceremony is held each year

of 21 June in recognition of this ancestral legacy.

### Criterion iii

Pachacamac was one of the most venerated deities of the Andean Mount Olympus. He was the god of earthquakes. The Sanctuary was sacked and abandoned not long after the arrival of the Spaniards.

The Spaniards brought African slaves with them, and the cult of Pachacamac, which was deeply rooted in the Peruvian coastal environment, spread to them. A form of religious symbiosis over nearly a century led to an African slave painting a crude image of a black Christ on the wall of the church at Pachacamilla, in a demonstration of Christian faith imposed by the Spaniards. This image was believed to control earthquakes, a power derived from the indigenous god Pachacamac. Worship of the Andean deity survives to the present day, since the cult of the Christ of Pachacamilla, or the Lord of the Miracles, is the occasion for a massive display of Roman Catholic faith every October in Peru, and this cult is extending to other parts of the globe.

### Criterion vi

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The Pachacamac area was first settled in the Formative Period (1800-200 BC), when a theocratic society built many pyramidal temples with a distinctive U-shaped floor plan. Around 200 BC distinctive regional cultures with rigidly hierarchical societies emerged; they were accompanied by sophisticated and complex political-religious structures in which warfare became generalized and high levels of technological development were attained.

One of these, the Lima civilization (200 BC-AD 650), was responsible for the creation of large ceremonial centres, such as Pachacamac. The nucleus of these centres was a group of large terraced pyramids built in small adobe bricks and surrounded by many smaller structures that made up extensive urban areas. Little is known of the cults of this period.

Around 650 the Wari civilization brought the ideology and iconography of Nazca and Tiwanaku to the central coastal region, whose material and ideological cultures changed radically. The ceremonial centres were replaced by large urban settlements. Pachacamac, which had previously been of secondary importance, now became a regional political and religious capital and began to interact with other regions to the north and south. By the Middle Horizon period (600-900) the Pachacamac cult probably covered most of the central Andes.

A new process of cultural and political regionalization took place in the period that followed (1000-1450). Complex political entities developed, known as kingdoms or *señorios*, such as that of Ychma, the capital of which was Pachacamac. Its religious and ideological influence grew greatly after the Inca conquest. Increase in the production of trade goods and

a rise in the prestige and quantity of tribute, as illustrated in the archaeological record, demonstrate how the cult of Pachacamac spread throughout the Inca Empire.

With the arrival of the Spanish *conquistadores* in 1532, the Pachacamac Sanctuary was sacked, though the site was to remain inhabited for another forty years.

#### *Description*

The city-sanctuary of Pachacamac is situated on a desert plateau known as the Tablazo near the northern rim and entrance to the Lurin valley. To the west there was a series of lakes and swamps and the southern approach is barred by rocky outcrops. These natural defences were supplemented by man-made walls and a large canal.

The interior was divided into a number of quarters with specific functions. The nucleus, known today as *Sector I*, is roughly trapezoidal, covering an area of *c* 400m by 500m, delimited by a wide wall in stone and adobe dating from around AD 1100. It contains the main temples:

- The *Old Temple* This is roughly cubic in shape, sited in the centre of the enceinte. It consists of two structures: a terraced stone mound on top of a natural rocky hill is surmounted by the Old Temple proper, constructed of small adobe bricks. The overall dimensions are 150m by 100m, and its highest point is over 26m. It has several construction sequences from the early 1st to the 8th centuries, when it was replaced as the main cult centre by the Painted Temple.
- The *Painted Temple* consists of a rectangular raised platform with terraced sloping sides built entirely of adobe bricks. It is smaller than the Old Temple - 120m by 60m by 15m high. It was constructed on top of an earlier building known as the Red Temple because of the colour of its painted walls. The Painted Temple served as the centre of the Pachacamac cult until the arrival of the Spaniards in 1532.
- The *Temple of the Sun*, lying to the south of the Painted Temple on a hill at the edge of the Sanctuary, was built during the Inca period, after 1450, on the remains of an older structure from the Lima period. It is a massive building (150m square by 25m high) consisting of four terraced platforms, partly in cut stone and partly in adobe bricks. There is a number of small rectangular buildings on the wide terraces, probably the living quarters of the priests of the Inca sun cult and their servants.
- The *Mausoleum* is a large rectangular enclosure to the north of the Old Temple defined by walls built of large adobe bricks. The interior is divided up into small cells by transverse walls. Archaeological evidence indicates that this was used as a mausoleum during the Ichma and Inca periods (1100-1532). There are also many tombs within the enclosure around the principal buildings from these and earlier periods.

*Sector II* is located between the later walls and those of the inner sanctuary. This is a heavily built-up area containing the Lesser Temples (Ramped Pyramids), groups of plazas, and other important buildings dating from after AD 1100. There is a street system based on major north-south and east-west arteries that cross approximately at right-angles, dividing the sector into four zones. Among the more important structures are the following:

- The *Plaza and Lodgings of the Pilgrims* is a partly enclosed square 320m long by 60m wide, which dates to the Inca period (1450-1532). Two parallel double lines of adobe brick columns originally supported light roofs of branches. The small rectangular rooms on the north side of the square are thought to have been used to house pilgrims. Its close relationship with the main temples of Sector I indicates that the square was used for religious functions.
- The *Temple of Urpihuachac* on the west of the Plaza of the Pilgrims is a small artificial adobe brick mound, the sole survivor of a group of temples from the Lima period.
- There are fifteen *Ramped Pyramids*, varying in size and orientation but sharing a similar configuration. They are terraced mounds, the different levels being linked by central ramps, which start from large rectangular courtyards that are only indirectly accessible from the street. Smaller structures and square or rectangular rooms are associated with the pyramids. They are constructed of adobe bricks on stone foundations. Construction of the pyramids, believed to have been provincial or family temples, began around 800, but in the Inca period they lost their religious function and were used as residences.
- The *Palace of Taurichumbi* is a large architectural complex from the Inca period comprising two large courtyards surrounded by rooms and corridors in classic Inca style.

*Sector III* lies to the north of the Sanctuary area, between the second and third walls. It contains the remains of relatively modest buildings that formed the living quarters of the temple servants and lodgings for pilgrims.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The *Pachacamac Archaeological Zone* is protected under the terms of the Peruvian General National Cultural Heritage Protection Law No 24047. It was delimited and declared a protected site in 1983, by Resolution No 740-83-ED of the Ministry of Education. It is inscribed as No 81836 in the Property Registry of the National Public Records Office.

This protection is reinforced by a number of measures approved by the Municipality of Metropolitan Lima, notably Agreement No 113 of September 1997, which declared the conservation and promotion of tourism at Pachacamac to be a priority and in the public interest. The Development Plan of the Metropolitan Municipality of Lima makes provision for the protection and conservation of archaeological sites and zones within its territory.

##### *Management*

Pachacamac is the property of the Peruvian State, operating through the National Institute of Culture, which is responsible for the protection of the national cultural heritage. It works in collaboration with the Metropolitan Municipality of Lima and other local administrative bodies, and also with the Ministry of Industry, Tourism and Integration.

The area proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List covers 492.95ha and consists of the Sanctuary area, which

has been largely excavated, and a large area to the west, known to contain significant archaeological remains.

Day-to-day management and conservation is carried out by the staff of the site museum, which is under the control of the National Institute of Culture, an agency of the Ministry of Education.

*General Guidelines and Profiles for the Pachacamac Sanctuary Management Plan* were drawn up in June 1998 as part of the preparation of the World Heritage nomination dossier. These have been approved by the Archaeology Technical Commission of the National Institute of Culture.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

The Sanctuary was abandoned in 1570 when the indigenous population was expelled by the Spanish Viceroy. It was then looted by the *Conquistadores* in search of treasures. The site was gradually encroached upon by local farmers in the centuries that followed.

In the late 19th century foreign visitors came to Pachacamac to dig for archaeological specimens for museums or for their own collections. When archaeological investigations began at the beginning of the present century, illicit excavations (*huaqueos*) increased, encouraged by the trade in ancient artefacts.

It was not until the 1960s that serious efforts were made to protect the site. A site museum was set up and a service of guardians created. At the same time work began on the general cleaning of the main structures on the site, associated with a programme of excavation. It was also opened formally to the general public.

At the present time a Belgian archaeological team is carrying out excavations on the site and plans are being made for a joint Peruvian-Japanese archaeological and ethnological project.

### *Authenticity*

There are two distinct buildings techniques to be observed at Pachacamac: unfired brick (adobe) in varying sizes and dressed stone blocks. Both have been degraded considerably, not least because of the proximity of the site to the sea and the severe impact of saline atmospheric attack.

As a result, a number of different conservation techniques have been applied in the past. A very radical reconstruction was carried out in the 1940s by Julio C Tello, creating a roofed replica two storeys high using modern materials, in which the authenticity of materials and techniques is very low. However, over most of the site the interventions have been less drastic, involving limited replacement of adobe bricks by new ones made using traditional techniques or merely capping them with sacrificial layers of adobe.

So far as the overall authenticity of the site is concerned, therefore, the level may be considered to be high and fully conforming to the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Pachacamac in February 1999.

### *Qualities*

The cultural and historical importance of Pachacamac is very high. It played a very important role in the religious life of the pre-Hispanic peoples of a large region and a special form of architecture developed there which is not to be found elsewhere in such a concentration in the Andean region. It was a major pilgrimage destination in the pre-Hispanic period and has retained that role to a considerable extent to the present day.

### *Comparative analysis*

The special qualities of Pachacamac are described in the preceding section. The only archaeological site with which it may be compared in terms of its location on the coast, its extent, and the constructional materials used is Chan Chan (Peru), which is already on the World Heritage List. However, that was an urban centre and in its layout and its architecture is complementary to Pachacamac rather directly comparable.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The ICOMOS mission was of the opinion that the management plan for the site (see "Management" above) is inadequate for the proper management of the site, since it does not set out specific tasks and a timetable for their accomplishment.

The mission report also commented adversely on unauthorized encroachments upon the archaeological site, over which it appears difficult to exercise proper control.

The ICOMOS recommendations are as follows:

- A comprehensive plan for the management and conservation of the site must be prepared, involving multidisciplinary expertise – archaeologists, conservators, social anthropologists, architects, planners, administrators, environmentalists, and biologists.
- Solutions must be found to the problem of unauthorized encroachment.
- Urgent attention must be given to the investigation of new techniques for the conservation of unfired brick. No further structures should be opened up or explored until satisfactory solutions have been discovered.
- Conservation efforts must be concentrated on structures that have already been uncovered.
- UNESCO technical assistance should be sought with respect to the conservation and presentation of the site.
- The interpretation and presentation of the site should be improved, so as to make it better understood by visitors of all levels.
- Heavy vehicles must be banned from the site.
- Visitor routes should be designed and signposted.
- The Laguna should be rehabilitated.

- Trees should be planted to screen the ancient site from modern buildings and roads.
- The site must be cleared of rubble and sand and generally cleaned.
- The Museum must be updated and re-equipped as a matter of urgency.
- The security must be increased and improved.

ICOMOS wishes to add that it has no reservations about the cultural significance of Pachacamac, which is worthy of inscription on the World Heritage List. However, in accordance with the instructions of the World Heritage Committee regarding the conservation and management of sites, it is obliged to make the recommendation given below.

### **Recommendation**

That further consideration of the nomination be *deferred* to await the preparation and implementation of a new management plan and the improvement of existing services (visitor handling, security, etc) as proposed by ICOMOS.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Vigan (Philippines)

No 502rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Historic Town of Vigan
<i>Location</i>	Province of Ilocos Sur
<i>State Party</i>	Philippines
<i>Date</i>	30 April 1998

### Justification by State Party

Vigan, part of the 18th and 19th century network of Asian trading cities, demonstrates a unique architecture that effortlessly fuses Ilocano, Filipino, Chinese, and Spanish styles. It also demonstrates, in a tropical Asian setting rather than in the New World, the typical Spanish colonial urban layout as specified by the *Ley de las Indias*, thus linking Vigan to another network of colonial cities in Latin America.

#### Criterion ii

Vigan is testimony to the Filipino cultural traditions and lifestyle of the 18th, 19th, and 20th centuries. Its domestic architecture, allowing business to be conducted on the ground floor and the family to reside above, reflects deep kinship with its Asian neighbours, where entrepreneurs preferred to live and work in their houses. The lifestyle gave rise to streets lined with shop-houses, similar to the rows of Vigan houses that stand next to one another along the narrow streets. The urban ensemble of Vigan is a group of buildings which, because of its architecture, its homogeneity, and its place in and relationship with the landscape, is truly of outstanding universal value from the point of view of history and art.

#### Criterion iii

The architecture of Vigan is truly reflective of its roots. It is built from the wood, stone, shells (*kapis*), and terra cotta derived from its surroundings. The houses are in the traditional *bahay na bato* style, where the ground floor is enclosed by stone walls and the upper level is constructed entirely of wood. A variant to this style exists in Vigan in which both storeys of some houses are built entirely in stone or brick.

#### Criterion iv

Vigan is well known in the Philippines as the last urban area that has maintained the architecture and urban planning established during the Spanish colonial period. Modernization and progress are creating pressure for the transformation of many structures in the historic core zone as well as the buffer zone. However, Vigan is determined to maintain its authenticity.

#### Criterion v

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Before the arrival of the Spanish, there was a small indigenous settlement on what was at that time an island, consisting wooden or bamboo houses on stilts. In 1572 the *conquistador* Juan de Salcedo founded a new town, which he named Villa Ferdinandina, on this site, and made it his capital when he was appointed Lieutenant Governor (*Encomendero*) of the entire Ilocos region. Intended as a trading centre rather than a fortress, it was the northernmost city established in the Philippines by the Spanish.

At the end of the 17th century a new form of architecture evolved, which combined the traditional construction with the techniques of building in stone and wood introduced by the Spanish. Brick was introduced by the Augustinian friars for their churches and other buildings.

The seat of the Archdiocese of Nueva Segovia was transferred there in 1758, making it the centre of religious activity in the region. In 1778, as a result of its expansion, it was renamed Ciudad Ferdinandina.

The Mestizo river was central to the development of the town in the 16th-19th centuries: large sea-going vessels could berth in the delta and small craft communicated with the interior. However, it is now no longer navigable owing to silting, as a result of which the town is no longer an island.

As the major commercial centre for the region, Vigan traded directly with China. As a stage in the Manila-Acapulco galleon trade that lasted throughout the Spanish colonial period, it supplied goods that were shipped across the Pacific to Mexico, and thence onwards across the Atlantic to Europe. These trading links resulted in constant exchanges of peoples and cultures between the Ilocanos, Filipinos, Chinese, Spanish, and (in the 20th century) North Americans.

#### Description

Vigan is located in the delta of the Abra river, off the coastal plain of the China Sea, close to the north-east tip of the island of Luzon.

The present-day municipality covers some 27km<sup>2</sup>, divided into nine urban districts (*poblaciones*) and thirty rural villages (*barangays*). Nearly half the total area is still in use for agriculture. The Historic Core Zone, which is proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List, covers an area of 17.25ha defined on two sides by the Govantes and Mestizo rivers.

The traditional Spanish checkerboard street plan opens up into a main plaza, in two parts. The Plaza Salcedo is the longer arm of an L-shaped open space, with the Plaza Burgos as the shorter. The former is dominated by the Municipal Hall and the Provincial Capitol and the latter by the Cathedral.

The urban plan of the town closely conforms with the Renaissance grid plan specified in the *Ley de la Indias* for all new towns in the Spanish Empire. There is, however, a noticeable difference between Vigan and contemporary Spanish colonial towns in Latin America in the Historic Core

(known as the Mestizo district), where the Latin tradition is tempered by strong Chinese, Ilocano, and Filipino influences. As its name implies, this district was settled by affluent families of mixed Chinese-Ilocano origin.

The building materials used in Vigan are terra cotta, wood, shells (*kapis*), stone, and lime, all obtained from the surrounding area. The architecture of the typical Vigan house is derived from the traditional Filipino dwelling, the *bahay kubo*, which is a small one-room hut built of light woven materials (wood, bamboo, and thatch), raised off the ground on stilts for ventilation and as protection against monsoon flooding.

Such structures are no longer to be found in Vigan, but their influence is discernible in the much larger *bahay na bato* (stone house). This is a much more solid structure, with a stone-built lower storey surmounted by a timber-framed upper storey, and with a steeply pitched tiled roof (reminiscent of traditional Chinese architecture). The exterior walls of the upper storey are enclosed by window panels of *kapis* shells framed in wood which can be slid back for better ventilation. Most of the existing buildings were probably built in the mid 18th to late 19th centuries. Few have escaped internal reorganization to adapt them for alternative use with the decline of the town's prosperity.

The Chinese merchants and traders conducted their business from offices and warehouses on the ground floors of their houses, with the living quarters above. This is characteristic of Chinese society, to be observed in other Asian cities such as Penang, Singapore, and the older sections of Bangkok.

The resulting townscape has a special quality not to be found elsewhere. It is a unique manifestation of the multi-cultural nature of Filipino society, which harmoniously blends Ilocano, Filipino, Chinese, and North American elements to produce a homogeneous whole.

In addition to the domestic and commercial architecture, Vigan possesses a number of significant public buildings, which also show multi-cultural influences. These include the Cathedral of St Paul (1790-1800), the Archbishop's Palace (1783), St Paul's College (1892), the Catholic Cemetery Chapel (1852), and the neo-classical early 20th century Provincial Capitol.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

Vigan is currently protected by the following legal instruments at national level:

- Presidential Decree No 374, 1974 "Amending certain sections of ... the Cultural Properties Preservation and Protection Act;
- Presidential Decree No 756, 1975 "Amending Presidential Decree No 260 to include the Mestizo Section, the houses of Padre José Burgos and Leona Florentino in its scope";
- Presidential Decree No 1505, 1978 "Amending Presidential Decree No 260, as amended, by prohibiting the unauthorized modification, alteration, repair, and destruction of original features of all national shrines, monuments, landmarks, and other important edifices";
- Executive Order No 358, 1996 "Creating a Presidential Commission for the Restoration, Conservation and Preservation of Vigan Heritage Village."

A new "Act providing for the Protection and Preservation of Philippine Cultural Heritage ..." is shortly to come into effect.

At local level, the Ordinance No 05 "Providing for the preservation and protection of ancestral houses and other properties in Vigan, Ilocos Sur, particularly in the Mestizo Section" was promulgated in 1990 by the Municipality of Vigan. Following the 2nd International Conference on Vigan in March 1997, the following Municipal Ordinances were approved by the Sangguniang Bayan (Municipal Council):

- Ordinance No 12 "Defining the Core and Buffer Zones of the Historic Town of Vigan and the historical, educational, aesthetic, and economic parameters of its preservation and development";
- Ordinance No 14 "Providing the guidelines for the conservation of the Historic Town of Vigan."

The Council is still considering the proposed Ordinance "Creating the Conservation Authority of Vigan."

### Management

Ownership of the buildings and open spaces included in the nomination is mixed. The public buildings are owned variously by the Provincial Government of Ilocos Sur, the Municipal Government of Vigan, and the Roman Catholic Diocese of Nueva Segovia, and most of these are accessible to the public. All the houses in the Core and Buffer Zones are privately owned, but none is open to the public.

The Core and Buffer Zones are carefully defined so as to preserve the urban fabric and townscape. This action was taken following the deferral of the nomination in 1987, when the zones were not adequately delineated.

Formal responsibility for the preservation of the Historic Core rests with the Vigan Heritage Commission, created by Executive Order No 358, 1996, in collaboration with the Municipality of Vigan. In addition, the Commission has links with the Department of Tourism, the National Historical Institute, the National Museum, the Intramuros Administration (Manila), the National Commission for Culture and the Arts, and the non-governmental organizations involved in the conservation of the town. Church property is administered through the Archdiocesan Commission for the Conservation of the Cultural Heritage of the Church.

Awaiting the establishment of the proposed specialist Conservation Authority, day-to-day management remains the province of the Municipality of Vigan.

A number of land-use and other plans take account of the special needs of Vigan to varying degrees. These include:

- National Tourist Master Plan for the Philippines 1991-2010;
- Conservation Plan for the Historical Center of Vigan, 1995 (Tourconsult/International for the Commission of the European Union);
- Tourism Development Master Plan for Region I, 1992; Vigan, 1995 (Department of Tourism);

- Northwestern Luzon Growth Quadrangle Development Plan, 1995 (USAid Project);
- Investment Promotion Package for the Northwestern Luzon Growth Quadrangle, 1997 (USAid Project);
- Implementing Rules and Regulations: Action Plan, 1996 (Vigan Heritage Commission).

The Second International Conference for the Conservation and Development of Vigan, held in 1997, prepared a number of draft policies and ordinances for the development and preservation of the historic town.

Negotiations are in progress at the present time with the Agencia Española de la Cooperación Internacional for the preparation of a "Comprehensive Conservation and Development Plan of Vigan."

All funding for conservation projects at the present time comes from the limited budget of the Municipality of Vigan. Local non-governmental organizations are studying mechanisms for fund-raising, and private donations have been received for specific projects. When it is fully operational the work of the Vigan Heritage Commission, which is mandated to coordinate conservation programmes in the town, will be funded by the national government.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

The first attempt to sensitize proprietors of historic properties and administrators in Vigan to the need for adequate conservation was in 1975, when the National Museum organized a seminar at which the town's heritage and the need to preserve it were emphasized. Subsequently a team of architects and engineers was sent by the Museum to carry out documentation work and advise property owners on necessary conservation measures. However, shortage of funds meant that this had little lasting impact.

The 1995 Conservation Plan for the Historical Centre of Vigan (see above) surveyed the existing buildings (56 properties with wooden upper storeys, 130 entirely in masonry or brick), and concluded that 86 structures were in a good state of conservation and 84 in a mediocre to poor state of conservation.

A detailed inventory of 120 houses was carried out in 1996, funded by the Toyota Foundation, and this serves as the basis for future conservation planning.

#### *Authenticity*

The street pattern is entirely authentic, conforming completely with that laid down by the Spanish in the 16th century. The authenticity of the overall townscape and the open spaces is also high.

So far as the buildings are concerned, lack of conservation control has resulted in the use of modern materials such as galvanized iron on roofs instead of tiles.

An awareness of the need to preserve authenticity has only developed recently in relation to Vigan. Restoration and conservation practices that respect the authenticity of this town that has developed organically over several centuries are now being introduced, making use of the considerable reserve of traditional crafts that survives in the Philippines.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Vigan in January 1999.

#### *Qualities*

Vigan is unique among the towns of the Philippines by virtue of the fact that it is the only one to preserve much of its Spanish colonial character intact. It is also significant because of the way in which distinct architectural traditions - European, Ilocano, Filipino, and Chinese - have fused to create a homogeneous townscape of great cultural importance.

#### *Comparative analysis*

Vigan belongs to a group of important South-East Asian trading cities in which Asian and European elements blend together, such as Malacca, Macau, Singapore, and Hoi An. Closest to it is probably Hoi An, where the same pattern of shop-houses influenced strongly from China can be observed.

Vigan is, however, unique in that it is the only town in this group in which the rigid Spanish colonial checkerboard street pattern survives intact. The only surviving parallels in this respect are to be found in Latin America, but these do not exhibit the multi-cultural fusion that Vigan demonstrates.

#### *ICOMOS comments and recommendations for future action*

The nomination of Vigan to the World Heritage List was first considered by the Committee at its 13th Session in Paris in December 1989. The Committee recommended that it should not be inscribed on the List, but exceptionally "suggested that the Philippine authorities contact ICOMOS and the Secretariat so as to study the possibility of elaborating a new nomination made up of particularly significant elements of the very special heritage of the Philippines" (Committee Report, XIV.46.C).

ICOMOS had recommended rejection in 1989 on the grounds that "this cultural property has not been shown to have sufficient exemplarity, and the urban and architectural quality of Vigan is in no way comparable to that of Spanish cities in the Caribbean such as Cartagena de Indias (Colombia) or Trinidad (Cuba)." ICOMOS now acknowledges that comparison with Spanish colonial towns in Latin America and the Caribbean is not a valid one: historic towns should be evaluated in a regional context rather than globally.

The expert mission that visited Vigan in January 1999 made a number of observations that should be referred to the State Party:

- Minor modifications are suggested to the delineation of the Core Zone. The Divine Word of Vigan College in the north-eastern part of the Core Zone, which is a modern four-storey structure, should be excluded, as should certain buildings used for inappropriate purposes (soft drinks store, petrol station).
- Similarly, the limits of the Buffer Zone should be modified so as to exclude the former Vigan Central School, now used as an extension of the bus terminal complex.

- The mission was concerned that the Vigan Heritage Commission created in 1996 is not fully operational, apparently for lack of professional personnel. There is also a duplication of responsibilities between the Commission and the National Museum, which is the agency to which all requests relating to protected historic buildings must be referred.
- The Municipal Ordinance to establish the Conservation Authority was close to being approved when the mission took place. Since it provides for the creation of a team of conservation professionals, a further source of duplication seems likely to be introduced shortly.

ICOMOS recommends that the State Party should be a. requested to modify the boundaries of the Core and Buffer Zones slightly, so as to make them more appropriate for World Heritage inscription, and b. establish clear lines of responsibility and authority for the existing and proposed agencies involved with the preservation of the historic town, so as to avoid potential duplication and conflict.

### **Brief description**

Vigan is the most intact example in Asia of a planned Spanish colonial town, established in the 16th century. Its architecture reflects the coming together of cultural elements from elsewhere in the Philippines and from China with those of Europe to create a unique culture and townscape without parallels anywhere in East and South-East Asia.

### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting modifications to the boundaries of the nominated area and its buffer zone, as suggested by ICOMOS, and an unambiguous statement of the proposed conservation structure. In the event of this information being supplied and found acceptable, ICOMOS recommends that the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

*Criterion ii* Vigan represents a unique fusion of Asian building design and construction with European colonial architecture and planning.

*Criterion iv* Vigan is an exceptionally intact and well preserved example of a European trading town in East and South-East Asia.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Kalwaria Zebrzydowska (Poland)

No 905

### Identification

*Nomination* Kalwaria Zebrzydowska: the Mannerist architectural and park landscape complex and pilgrimage park

*Location* Vojevodship of Bielsko-Biala, Kalwaria Zebrzydowska District

*State Party* Republic of Poland

*Date* 29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

In general terms, the cultural property of the Mannerist Calvary Park in Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is a unique and exceptional example of a group of 44 buildings located in an extensive and attractive area, situated according to a carefully determined system in terms of its content, function, and form. This system dominated the natural environment, creating the unrepeatably historical designed landscape (**criteria ii**). Representative of its type, it is also the most superb example in the rich range of Calvary landscapes (**criteria iv**). It contains symbolic messages concerning important ideas and content, translated into the language of traditional religious theatre, set in the scenery of the landscape. The complex embodies a combination of formal effects and architectural values with the symbolism and ideological content (**criteria vi**).

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It is also a *cultural landscape* as defined in paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

Work on building the Calvary was begun in 1600 by Mikolaj Zebrzydowski, the Vojevode of Cracow, who built the Chapel of the Crucifixion on the slopes of the Holy Mountain. Together with a small hermitage, this was used by him for personal meditation.

However, Zebrzydowski was persuaded by the Bernardine (Cistercian) monks Tomasz Bucki and Ludwig Boguski to

enlarge his original concept to cover an extensive landscape complex with many chapels, linked in form and theme to those in Jerusalem. It was conceived as being for the use not only of the local inhabitants but also of believers from elsewhere in Poland and in neighbouring countries.

The layout was the work of the distinguished mathematician, astronomer, and surveyor Feliks Szebrowski. He based it on the landscape of Jerusalem at the time of Christ, using a system of measurement that he developed to enable the urban landscape of Jerusalem to be reproduced symbolically on the natural landscape. This makes use of the natural topography, the Lackarska Mountain representing the Mount of Olives and the Holy Mountain Golgotha, for example.

The sites chosen for the chapels that represented the stages in the taking of Christ and the Stations of the Cross were linked by tracks cut through the natural woodland and were marked first by a simple cross. These were replaced by chapels, nearly all of which were built between 1605 and 1632. The architect of the chapels was a Belgian, Paul Baudarth, and the influence of the Mannerist architecture of The Netherlands is very marked. In 1632 a wall was built (now no longer extant) which symbolized the urban limits of the Holy City, and also a system of routes that linked ten chapels associated with the life of the Blessed Virgin Mary.

Only four further chapels were added – those dedicated to the Third Fall of Christ (1754), the Weeping Women (1782), St John Nepomucen (1824), and the Angel (1836). The original Bridge of the Angels was replaced by a new structure in 1907.

The Church of the Our Lady of the Angels and the Bernardine monastery were designed by the Italian architect Giovanni Maria Bernardoni. However, he did not complete the project, which was finished by Baudarth in 1609. The monastery was considerably enlarged in 1654-56, and took on the appearance of a Baroque castle. A pilgrim chapel in developed Baroque style was added to the church in 1658-67, to house a miraculous picture of the Virgin. The church achieved its present form at the end of the 17th century, whilst the monastery was enlarged once again at the beginning of the 19th century.

When the monastery was founded in 1617 the inhabitants of the town of Kalwaria Zebrzydowska that had sprung up were allowed to rent part of its lands within the Calvary park. They began to clear the woodland for pastures, and in the mid 18th century they were allowed to build houses on their plots. A process of reforestation began at the beginning of the 19th century.

At the beginning of the 18th century the Czartoryski family, the owners of the park, built a palatial residence near the pilgrim church, but this was largely destroyed in the 19th century. At the end of World War II the plot on which the palace had stood, together with some surviving outbuildings, passed into the ownership of the state, which used it for the construction of a theological college.

Historical archives show that Kalwaria Zebrzydowska had many distinguished royal and noble visitors as well as countless pious pilgrims. Many were attracted by religious performances and ritual that were staged there. As early as 1613 Mikolaj Zebrzydowski had received permission to found a religious fraternity to organize religious ceremonies of this kind. Local people joined the

Bernardine monks at Easter to take part in dramatic enactments of Christ's Passion. These religious performances were discouraged during the Austrian occupation of this region, but they were revived after 1947. In addition to the Passion procession at Easter, there is a similar event at the Feast of the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary in August.

#### *Description*

Kalwaria Zebrzydowska lies between the valleys of the Skawa and Raba tributaries of the Vistula, and is defined by the massifs of the Łysy and Lanckoroński mountains. The area is now largely forested, the result of 18th century planting. The ruins of two medieval castles are located at either end of the landscape, on the slopes of the two mountains.

The landscape makes skilful use of natural features to complement and set off man-made structures. The disposition of buildings in the landscape makes this an outstanding example of a Mannerist park: characteristics of Italian Renaissance and French Baroque garden and park design are blended with Mannerist freedom and irregularity. The overall layout is in the form of an ellipse, covering some 400ha. The main structures are around the perimeter of this area, and are linked by paths and roads that symbolize the routes within ancient Jerusalem and which were used by pilgrims in their passage from one episode in the Passion to the next.

A characteristic Mannerist feature is the many visual axes between the different structural features. There is also a series of magnificent panoramas, not only over the Park itself, but also towards the Tatra Mountains, for example, and the city of Cracow.

The chapels and churches complete the composition of the Park. They are seen to emerge unexpectedly from dense woodland cover or as dramatic features at the end of long avenues. The chapels exhibit a high degree of originality of form and composition, along with scrupulous attention to detail. However, their most striking feature is their diversity, arising in some cases from their symbolic purpose (as, for example, the Chapel of the Heart of the Virgin Mary, which is heart-shaped in plan). Ground plans range from simple ellipses (the House of Caiphas) or triangle (the House of Annas) to more complex forms such as a triangle linked with semi-circles (the House of Our Lady), a Greek cross (the House of Pilate), a rectangle with semi-circular apses (the Holy Sepulchre), an octagon containing a square (the Ascension), an elongated rectangle (the Last Supper), and a square with corner pilasters (the East Gate of Jerusalem).

The elevations are equally varied and imaginative. A variety of materials and techniques have been used – unrendered stone and brick, dressed stone, and rendered and plastered brick; roofs of copper or zinc sheets or ceramic tiles. The way in which details are applied to the elevations clearly derives from The Netherlands. Dadoes and wide entablatures are used for horizontal division, and half-columns or pilasters for vertical divisions. Elements of Tuscan, Ionic, and Composite orders are used, enlivened by rusticated faces and surrounds to windows and doors. The small windows take various forms, often circular or oval. Among other features are strapwork ornament, blind arcades, and corn or acorn pendants. A number of the chapels have pulpits in stone, brick, or wood protruding from their facades. There is

also skilful use of colour resulting from the variety of materials used and tinted rendering. Several of them have domes with rich stucco decoration.

The interiors are, by contrast, plain in their furnishings and decorations. Many of them contain blocks with the inscription *Terra Santa*, indicating that they contain soil from Jerusalem.

There are two large churches in Kalwaria Zebrzydowska. The Church of the Grave of the Virgin, which has strong Baroque affinities, is in broken stone with stone blocks for detailing and the strong podium on which it is built. It is rectangular in plan with an apsidal east end and an entrance porch or narthex at the west. It is built on two levels, the lower part representing the Grave itself and the upper the Ascension. It has a saddleback roof with a slender central spire.

The Church of the Crucifixion has an elongated rectangular plan with a bipartite interior with compound vaulting and a saddleback roof with a spire. The tripartite façade has three entrances and four projections; double Tuscan pilasters support a wide entablature decorated with friezes depicting symbolic subjects.

The dominant feature of the landscape is the Church of Our Lady of the Angels and the Bernardine Monastery, located high on the slopes of the Łysy Mountain. The church has an unaisled nave with an elongated presbytery closed by the main altar. There are three separate chapels with domed roofs on the south side. The two-storey façade is surmounted by two towers with Baroque roofs, separated by a triangular pediment. The richly decorated interior is in Baroque style, with some outstanding carved choir stalls.

The monastic complex, built round two internal cloisters, is on the north side of the church. It has a three-storey façade with five projections and crowned by lunette cornices.

There is a number of secular residential buildings within the Park. They are detached houses and are mostly to be found lining the avenues. The earlier ones, from the 18th and 19th centuries, are wooden structures in a distinct local style. They are usually single-storey, with an attic and verandahs in front; the roofs are saddleback in a variety of materials.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The entire complex is a protected monument since it is on the register of scheduled monuments of the Vojevodship of Bielsko-Biala. The protection afforded in this way is laid down in the Polish Act of the Protection of Cultural Property of 1962, as subsequently amended, and the Code of Administrative Procedure.

It is the subject of special policies in the Local General Plan of Spatial Development of the Town and District of Kalwaria Zebrzydowska, approved in 1982. Part of it is covered in the corresponding plan for the District of Lanckorońska.

##### *Management*

The cultural landscape of Kalwaria Zebrzydowska with the routes of the avenues in the Park, the chapels, and the meadows and woods in the north-eastern part are owned by the Bernardine monastery. The woods on the Łysy Mountain

are owned partly by the monastery and partly by the state, whilst the forest of Lanckorona is in multiple private ownership. There is also a number of small residential and agricultural lots within the area that are in private ownership.

As a national historical monument, Kalwaria Zebrzydowska comes within the purview of the State Service for the Protection of Monuments, and funds are made available for conservation from the Ministry of Culture and Arts through the offices of the General Coordinator of Monuments and the Regional Conservator of Monuments.

Local management is coordinated by the owner, the Bernardine Monastery, working with the State Service, which is represented by the District Conservator. The latter specialist is employed by the Council of the Town and District of Kalwaria Zebrzydowska and works in collaboration with the Town Architect. The Monastery has a scientific advisory council which includes distinguished architects, landscape architects, monument conservators, historic garden specialists, art historians, etc. This body is responsible for overseeing the work of the officials directly involved and advising them on policies for conservation and management.

There is no overall management plan for the Park. However, there is a rolling programme of conservation and restoration projects agreed between those responsible for its management and approved by the scientific council. Currently, projects are in progress or planned for major renovation and consolidation of the churches and chapels, conservation of their internal fittings, assessment and resurfacing of the routes within the Park, management of the vegetation, and control over development of houses within the boundaries.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Since it was established, the Calvary has been under the control and management of the Bernardine Monastery. Several campaigns of restoration have been initiated and carried out by successive Guardians (Superiors) of the Kalwaria Zebrzydowska community. These took place in the mid 18th century, on three occasions during the 19th century, and in the early decades of the 20th century. Most of the work, which involved consolidation of the foundations of the chapels, replacement of roof coverings and structures, and conservation of the interiors, was carried out by the monks themselves, though specialists were brought in for tasks such as paintings conservation and restoration.

At the end of World War II the land was nationalized and became part of state forests and state-owned farms. Efforts were also made to curb the use of the area for pilgrimage. Registration of the Calvary as a protected monument in 1981 placed it on a different footing, but this coincided with an increase in new private housing in the area and the creation of new access roads. This gave rise to a series of legal interventions by the Regional Conservator of Monuments. In 1986 the post of Park Architect was created, to be replaced in 1992 by the post of Conservator of Monuments by the Council of the Town and District of Kalwaria Zebrzydowska.

Work began on a study for the restitution of the system of routes and avenues, which resulted in regulations for the movement of motor vehicles, rehabilitation of the vegetation, and the design and location of new buildings. A large part of the area of the avenues was subsequently returned by the state to the Bernardine Monastery. The 1994 development plan put the avenues under strict control as a conservation zone of the landscape park and at the same time buffer zones were established for the entire complex.

Currently the construction of new housing within the protected area is prohibited and there are controls over building in the buffer zone. There is still intensive exploitation of the woodland cover for the local carpentry industry, but this is now being controlled.

### *Authenticity*

Kalwaria Zebrzydowska has retained its overall authenticity as a designed cultural landscape: the 1604 plan survives almost completely intact, with the topographical and symbolic relationship between its man-made structures and its natural environment fully preserved.

So far as individual structures are concerned, they have been conserved solicitously by the Bernardine community over the centuries and preserve their form and setting unchanged. Conservation interventions have been made with care and with respect for the authenticity of materials and techniques.

The authenticity of functions also survives untouched, since the Calvary is still a centre for pilgrims to see this landscape that symbolizes the Passion of Christ and the Life of the Blessed Virgin Mary.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Kalwaria Zebrzydowska in January 1999. The views of its International Scientific Committee on Historic Gardens and Sites were also made available.

### *Qualities*

Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is an outstanding implantation in a natural landscape of central Europe of a symbolic representation of those elements of the urban landscape of Jerusalem at the time of the Passion of Jesus Christ which has survived intact as a centre of pilgrimage for four centuries.

### *Comparative analysis*

The concept of the Calvary, a group of chapels arranged in a layout that symbolizes the stages that led up to Christ's crucifixion in an urban or open landscape (*Sacri Monti*), has a long ancestry. However, it intensified at the time of the Counter-Reformation at the end of the 16th century, and was aided by the publication of a re-creation by Androchomius in 1584 of an accurate plan of Jerusalem at the time of Christ.

Many were constructed, in Italy, the Iberian peninsula, the Low Countries, and central Europe in particular, in the 17th century, and they took many varied forms. Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is among the small group of so-called "Great Calvaries," which were vast projects that spread over large areas of open countryside with significant topographical features and adopted an approach derived from Baroque park

design. Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is of especial significance because of the way in which the routes and avenues between the chapels were laid out, giving an added dimension to their symbolic significance.

In Italy a number of these have been preserved as components of national natural parks; several *Sacri Monti* of this type are now preserved and protected in Piedmont, for example. The basis of their preservation is conceived almost entirely in terms of their historical value; the religious element is subordinated and pilgrimage is not seen as central to their management and presentation. Kalwaria Zebrzydowska, by contrast, still has a predominant spiritual role in the life of the Polish people and is still in the care of the monastic community that have been its guardians since the beginning of the 17th century.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

ICOMOS is concerned about the project to create a Neo-Baroque garden in the new seminary building on the site of the Czartoryski palace. This would be highly inappropriate in what will be a modern structure. Consideration should be given to replacing this with a simpler design that makes use of the remaining fruit trees at this place in creating a garden more in keeping with the buildings that surround it.

The modern metal masts that surround the pilgrimage area are surmounted during the tourist season by loudspeakers, flags, and other appurtenances. These are wholly incongruous in this context and should be replaced by more discreet equipment.

There is a group of picturesque old residential buildings close to the basilica. They are not owned by the Bernardine Monastery and so their development has not been controlled, and as a result some have been “modernized” using inappropriate materials and techniques; some also have large parabolic television aerials on their facades. Action should be taken to improve their appearance and to prevent further disfigurements of this kind.

In view of the above, the State Party might wish to give serious consideration to restoring full property rights over the entire nominated area to the Bernardine Monastery, which has shown itself to be suited in every way to its management and conservation.

There is no management plan in the sense required by the World Heritage Committee (*Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 24.b.i) for the Kalwaria Zebrzydowska Park, although there is clearly a number of elements of such a plan already in place. The State Party should without delay work with the different institutions involved to prepare such a plan and submit it to the Committee for assessment.

#### **Brief description**

The Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is a virtually unchanged example of the natural landscape in which a linked series of symbolic places of worship relating to the Passion of Jesus Christ and the Life of the Virgin Mary was laid out at the beginning of the 17th century. It is still today a place of pilgrimage.

#### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting that a draft management plan for the property be prepared for evaluation before the December 1999 meeting of the World Heritage Committee. In the event that this is supplied and favourably evaluated, ICOMOS recommends that the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*

*Criterion ii* Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is an exceptional cultural monument in which the natural landscape was used as the setting for a symbolic representation in the form of chapels and avenues of the events of the Passion of Christ. The result is a cultural landscape of great beauty and spiritual quality in which natural and man-made elements combine in a harmonious manner.

*Criterion iv* The Counter Reformation in the late 16th century led to a flowering in the creation of Calvaries in Europe. Kalwaria Zebrzydowska is an outstanding example of this type of large-scale landscape design, which incorporates natural beauty with spiritual objectives and the principles of Baroque park design.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Sighi• oara (Romania)

No 902

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Historical Centre of Sighi• oara
<i>Location</i>	Region of Mure•
<i>State Party</i>	Romania
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The old town of Sighi• oara is a site which reflects the German civilization of Saxon settlers in Transylvania. It reveals a way of building which exerted a considerable influence throughout the Middle Ages on the subsequent development of towns in Transylvania, the type of dwelling houses as well as traditional architecture. **Criterion ii**

The urban fabric, with its geometric and spatial structure, and the numerous monuments of indisputable interest, developed in organic symbiosis with the landscape, give this group of buildings, the value of an outstanding achievement. **Criterion iii**

The town is a very typical example of the specific medieval structure of a small-sized urban site, with a homogenous architecture and unique geographic position. **Criterion iv**

It is the best preserved town in Transylvania, a testimony to all that is characteristic of the building tradition of Saxons who settled here in the Middle Ages, a tradition expressed by the conservation of architectural styles, construction methods, and forms of urban housing which have survived until present days.

All these factors prove that Sighi• oara is a site typical of both the medieval and the modern German civilization in Transylvania, threatened by social and cultural changes which have occurred in the last decades following the massive exile of the German minority. **Criterion v**

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the historic centre of Sighi• oara is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Sighi• oara, which lies in the heart of Transylvania, developed on a plateau, dominated by a hill overlooking a bend in the river Tirmava.

In the 13th century, German craftsmen and merchants, known as Saxons, were ordered by the Hungarian sovereigns to colonize Transylvania and protect the border of the Carpathians against the steppe peoples. They settled on a hill, called the City Hill, which has revealed traces of occupation going back to the Palaeolithic period.

Following incursions by the Tatars in 1241, the fortified settlement on City Hill was reinforced with walls, guarded by towers, which were extended to surround the entire plateau at the end of the 14th century. The town, which was known in 1280 as *Castrum Sex*, developed commercial activities thanks to the powerful guilds of craftsmen. Each guild was responsible for the construction of a tower and its defence. The importance of the town was recognized in 1367 when it obtained the title of *Civitas* and became the second national political entity of Transylvania (the *scaun* of Schässburg, the original Germanic name for Sighi• oara).

Under pressure from the Turks between 1421 and 1526, the fortified city raised its walls. At the same time, a settlement grew around the Church of the Saint Anthony hospital (existence attested by documents in 1461), situated at the foot of the plateau. The core of the Lower Town, protected by walls with defensive gates, gradually expanded to the east and west, and now stretches to both banks of the Tirmava.

During the XVIIth century, the town of Sighi• oara suffered from a succession of tragic events. The population was reduced by almost half as a result of two plague epidemics. In 1676, a fire destroyed three-quarters of the town (although the buildings on City Hill survived), but it was rebuilt over the old foundations. The Lower Town was also damaged by two fires (1736 and 1788) and floods (1771), and the entire town was shaken by an earthquake in 1838.

In 1840, the merchant guilds lost the monopoly granted to them in the 13th century, and they disappeared. Although Sighi• oara remained somewhat on the fringe of economic development in the 19th century, it was able to safeguard its historic centre from extensive transformations. However, occasional interventions led to the loss of a few towers and a section of the wall. In 1866, when Hungary transferred the constitution of the *Komitat* (district) to Transylvania, Sighi• oara/Schässburg became the capital of the TIRGU MARES/Neumarkt district, and the Dominican monastery was pulled down to make way for the new town hall.

In the 19th century, the upper part of Sighi• oara continued to function as an administrative and cultural centre. The commercial and craft activities were moved to the Lower Town which lost its fortifications in a subsequent expansion phase.

#### Description

The historic centre of Sighișoara, proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List, is composed of a fortified site spread over a steeply sloping plateau and dominated by City Hill, and the Lower Town with its woody slopes lying below. These two sectors form an indissociable group corresponding to the historic boundaries of the medieval town.

Apart from 19th century settlements, the historic centre of Sighișoara has kept its original medieval urban fabric with its detailed allotment of buildings plots, with some variations depending on the successive development phases of the site, as well as its network of narrow streets lined with closely aligned rows of houses.

The Citadel is composed of three roads running lengthways, cut by passages at right-angles. The main axis (School Street) links City Square, laid out over the site of a group of houses in 1894, to the two main gates erected in the north, under the Tailors' Tower, and in the south, under the Clock Tower. The latter makes it possible to enter the Lower Town, which stretches along the slope around Hermann Oberth Square (the former Market Square), an intersection for roads crossing the major axis at right angles (Ilari Chendi Street and 1st of December Street).

Archaeological excavations carried out in the Citadel have disclosed remains of wooden houses dating to the 13th-14th centuries. Their foundations were incorporated in the stone houses of the 15th-16th centuries, most of which were rebuilt after the 1676 fire.

The houses, most of them the simple homes of craftsmen of two or three storeys, were built in stone or brick, covered in a coloured roughcast, and topped by a high tiled roof. They have a distinctive plan, with a narrow facade along the street, an L- or U-shaped layout, dwelling tower, linked rooms, etc.

The houses with compact layouts, probably the oldest ones, are characterized by a lateral vaulted entrance gallery. This entrance gallery is sometimes shared by two adjoining houses because of the small plots of land. Many of the houses still have a barrel-vaulted basement, workshops on the ground floor with a wooden ceiling or brick vault, and the living rooms on the upper floors. A few facades (City Square, for instance) have a more aristocratic architectural style of Baroque inspiration (17th-18th centuries).

A group of houses between Citadel Lane and Hermann Oberth Square stand out because of the way the storeys have been arranged to fit the configuration of the sloping ground.

A wall, 93m long and with interval towers, encloses the Citadel plateau. The different phases of construction from the 12th century to the 16th century can be clearly identified. It rises to a height of 8-10m between the Ropemakers' Tower and the Butchers' Tower, the best preserved section. Nine towers out of the original fourteen still stand and can be distinguished by their shapes. The imposing Clock Tower plays a special role as the symbol of the town, for it was placed under the responsibility of the city council, which held its assemblies there until 1556. Situated in the middle of the southern fortification

wall, it dominates the three squares of the historic centre and protects the stairway connecting the upper town and the lower town. It now houses a museum.

Among the monuments in the historic centre of Sighișoara, it is worth mentioning the Church of Saint Nicholas, an edifice typical of the Gothic architecture of Transylvania. It is perched on the hill, and can be reached by a ramp staircase of 175 steps, called the Staircase of the Schoolchildren. It has been protected by a wooden roof since 1642. The Church was constructed in different stages between the 14th and 15th centuries over the remains of a Roman building. It has a hall-type plan with a polygonal apse. The decorative sculpture on the facade reflects Central European influences.

The Church of Saint Mary belonging to the Dominican monastery, demolished in 1886, is a 13th century Gothic monument of the hall type with bare facades. Inside is a Baroque altar dating to 1680.

The Dominican monastery and the Coopers' Tower in the south-west of the Citadel, and the Locksmiths' Tower and Church of the Franciscan convent in the north, made way respectively for the huge neo-Renaissance style City Hall (1886-88) and the Roman Catholic Church (1894).

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

A new preservation law has been under discussion for several years; the draft bill has been altered no less than fifteen times. Particularly difficult is the question of to what extent denationalization should be allowed for historic buildings that up to now have belonged to the state or to communal governments (eg the houses of the Saxons who emigrated to Germany before 1990). A division into two categories is planned. Historic buildings of national significance (category A) are to remain in public ownership, all others may be denationalized. To date there has only been a differentiation between listed historic buildings and buildings that are of significance for the townscape. Thus in the future there will be a third category.

On the map of the Sighișoara conservation district, which constitutes an adequate buffer zone, almost every building in the upper town is recorded under one of the two designations that are currently in use. Two-thirds of the houses are historic buildings, one-third is designated as significant to the townscape. In the lower town the ratio is reversed. The new law would make it necessary to filter out the buildings which are of national significance and thus cannot be denationalized. Basically this category would probably encompass the two churches, the cemetery, the city hall, the town fortifications, and the Staircase of the Schoolchildren

A special problem with denationalization is the fact that many houses are occupied by several families, all of whom should have the right to purchase the part in which they are living. Additional regulations will have to be developed to ensure mutual responsibility by all parties for the preservation and uniform

treatment of common building elements (roof, staircase, facade).

The national significance of the upper and lower town as a conservation district was already established in 1996, when they were united in a "Zone for the protection of the architectural and urban design heritage"; this conservation district encompasses the entire upper town and the former market square (Hermann Oberth Square) with its surroundings as well as the buildings on the hill side of Mill Lane and Hospital Lane. The city gates (the hospital gate, the mill gate, and the Baier Lane gate), documented on older maps and city views, were used for determining the borders of the conservation district.

These borders become uncertain in those areas where suburbs arose early on outside the fortifications. This is especially relevant for the settlement around the Baier Lane gate (now Street of 1 December). The homogeneous historic development in this area (buildings mostly dating from the 19th century on the exterior, but often with an older core) makes it seem advisable to add this to the conservation district, thus also including it in the zone that is proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List. The same is true for the short transverse lane that branches off to the south from Hospital Lane, directly west of the former hospital gate, with its two historic buildings from the 19th century (notary's office and former boarding school).

#### *Management*

Compliance with the provisions regulating the conservation district is supervised by the municipal building office, which is directly responsible to the mayor. A permit is required for any construction work within the conservation area. In principle demolition is not allowed, with the exception of recent outbuildings at the rear of property lots. The approval of the Historic Preservation Administration in the Ministry of Culture must be ascertained for construction work on historic buildings. Illegally undertaken actions must be undone, and a penalty paid. Since the buildings within the conservation district have all been surveyed and the survey results have been published, no one can claim ignorance of the situation.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

Apparently no major preservation work was carried out before 1990 - at least there are no reports about such work. The largest project in the last ten years was the restoration of the hilltop church, in close collaboration between the Romanian preservation office and the Munich-based Messerschmitt Foundation. The latter has set itself the task of preserving the cultural heritage of the Germans in eastern and south-eastern Europe, even after their expulsion or emigration to their ancient homeland. The church was closed and under construction for several years. It has a new roof of small clay tiles and a new floor of sandstone slabs; the building was plastered and painted. Remnants of the ashlar-painted

plaster were conserved, as were the Late Gothic wall paintings that survived at several places. Used by the congregation only on holidays, the hilltop church is to house a museum for Late Gothic wall and easel paintings; ownerless altarpieces from churches that are no longer in use are to find a new home here.

Practically no public funds are available for preservation work on dwelling houses or for the urgently necessary renewal of the infrastructure. Since there is no chance that this situation will change soon, planning work is also limited to the formulation of general goals such as the improvement of the living standard in apartments, renewal and burial of electric, gas, and telephone lines, and street paving.

A particularly large problem is presented by the city fortifications. In discussions of Sighi• oara as a possible World Cultural Heritage site, the fortifications are one of the most significant features. Other cities in Transylvania, such as Sibiu, had more extensive fortifications which were associated with more important historical events (sieges, bombardments), but none is anywhere nearly as well preserved as that of Sighi• oara. However, the wall retains its original height at only a few points. The longest section of the wall surviving to its original height, the part between the Ropemakers' Tower and the Butchers' Tower (at the cemetery gate below the hilltop church), collapsed over almost half its length in the summer of 1998. The remaining part is also in danger of collapse. Quick and decisive action is needed here if the total loss of this section of the wall is not to be risked.

#### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of Sighi• oara can be characterized as very high, in terms of both its monuments and its urban fabric, as long as the situation created in the 19th century is taken as the point of departure. If, however, the loss of the Dominican monastery and its replacement by the city hall in 1886-88 is not accepted as a legitimate development in the urban form, then a different, less positive conclusion is drawn. The same applies to the Franciscan convent and the Baroque German School, both of which fell to new buildings in historic revival styles.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Sighi• oara in January 1999. ICOMOS also consulted its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages.

### Qualities

Sighi• oara is a small city at the intersection of trade routes that come from western and northern Transylvania, continue to Brasov, and from there lead over the Carpathians to Wallachia. For centuries these routes served the exchange of goods and ideas between the Christian countries of central Europe and the Ottoman Empire.

### Comparative analysis

Because of its exposed location in the arc of the Carpathians, which always formed an endangered border between the Mongols and the Tatars (in the east) and the Turks (in the south), Transylvania was a country in which not only cities but also market towns and villages could only survive if their defences (city walls, castles, fortified churches) were constantly renewed and extended. In contrast to the fortified churches, of which numerous examples have survived, the fortifications of the cities have been lost, except for fragments, as a result of growth in the 19th and 20th centuries -- with the exception of Sighi• oara.

Placing Sighi• oara in the larger context of all the cities that were founded in the 12th and 13th centuries in what was then the kingdom of Hungary by German merchants and artisans (the so-called Saxons), one also encounters two towns in present-day Slovakia which were inscribed in the World Heritage List several years ago: Banská Štiavnica (Schemnitz) and Spišský Hrad (Zipser Burg). Both are comparable to Sighi• oara in size and age, and in both the most important monuments are fortified buildings, but that is all they have in common. Banská Štiavnica grew because of mining; Spišský Hrad is a bishopric: the city fortifications have not survived. In the cultural heritage of the Saxons who settled Transylvania and Spiš (Zips), making an imprint on the cities and villages of these regions from about 1150 until 1990, Sighi• oara represents the urban type of an artisans' and merchants' fortified town. It is the best preserved example of this type.

### ICOMOS recommendations for future action

The issue of ownership must be newly regulated. Together with the possibility of acquiring ownership of the houses they are living in, an incentive must be created for owners to invest private capital in the preservation of historic buildings. The towers of the city fortifications should remain the property of the city, but contracts for private use could be drawn up.

Endangered parts of the city wall, in particular the stretch between the Ropemakers' and Butchers' Towers, must be provisionally secured to prevent further loss. Detailed investigations must ascertain the cause of the danger and of the recent collapse. Finally, plans for long-term protection of the wall must be developed and discussed with international experts recommended by UNESCO.

The borders of the conservation district (Zone for the protection of the architectural and urban design heritage) should be revised, with consideration being given to the possibility of including lower Baier Lane (Street of 1 December) in this district. The goal

would be to prevent large-scale demolition, as has occurred on lower Mill Lane.

An urban design plan should be worked out for the levelled area on lower Mill Lane; this should define where future development can take place (including construction lines, density, height limits, etc). When investors have been found a competition should be held to develop ideas for the future design of the area.

Before a decision is made regarding the application it is recommended that the Government of Romania be asked for the following additional information:

- When can passage of the historic building protection law be expected? The guidelines for implementation of the World Heritage Convention stipulate categorically that a cultural property proposed for the World Heritage List must be protected by law, by contractual agreements, or by tradition (*Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 24 b ii). None of these options is valid for Sighi• oara.
- A complete version of the local ordinance for the conservation district (the Zone for the protection of the architectural and urban design heritage of Sighi• oara) is requested.
- A statement is required concerning the precautionary measures being taken to prevent further loss of the city wall. If there are plans for reconstruction of the collapsed sections of the wall between the Butchers' and Ropemakers' Towers, these should be submitted.
- A request is made for review of whether lower Baier Lane (Street of 1 December) could be included in the conservation district.

### Brief description

Founded by German craftsmen and merchants, known as the Saxons of Transylvania, the historic centre of Sighi• oara has preserved in an exemplary way the features of a small, fortified, medieval town which played an important strategic and commercial role at the edges of central Europe for several centuries.

### Recommendation

That this nomination be *referred back* to the state party to provide supplementary information as requested by ICOMOS. In the event of this information being provided and found acceptable, ICOMOS recommends that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and v* :

*Criterion iii* Sighi• oara is an outstanding testimony to the culture of the Transylvanian Saxons, a culture that is coming to a close after 850 years and will continue to exist only through its architectural and urban monuments.

*Criterion v* Sighișoara is an outstanding example of a small fortified city in the border region between the Latin-oriented culture of central Europe and the Byzantine-Orthodox culture of south-eastern Europe. The apparently unstoppable process of emigration by the Saxons, the social stratum which had formed and upheld the cultural traditions of the region, threatens the survival of their architectural heritage as well.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Monastery of Neam• (Romania)

No 903

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Monastery of Neam• - The Church of the Ascension of Jesus
<i>Location</i>	Department of Neam•
<i>State Party</i>	Romania
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

[**Note:** This text is an abbreviated version of the one included in the nomination dossier.]

A comparative analysis of the work represented by the Church of the Ascension of Jesus of the Monastery of Neam•, in the context of the Romanian and universal history of art and architecture, has made it possible to establish its value as a monument perfectly integrated into the whole and the monastery site in accordance with the criteria for inscription on the World Heritage List.

As an example of Byzantine and post-Byzantine Orthodox art, the Church of the Ascension of Jesus demonstrates the great capacity of the Romanian Moldavian architecture of the 15th century to assimilate, shape, and adapt valuable elements of certain cultural styles from the surrounding regions, in this case, some features of Western Gothic art (a dominating spatiality, decoration of door and window frames, the rough-hewn aspect of a certain technique of working stone), and Armenian art (a construction system of whole or pierced domes).

Its achievements are:

- In terms of architecture, it has enriched the classic functions of the Orthodox church (pronaos, naos, and altar) with new areas, one oriented towards the exterior (the exonarthex) and the other, an intermediary one, with a funerary function (the chamber of tombs known as *gropni• a*). The inner volumetry is based on a vertical plan and highlights the essentially Byzantine spatiality created by the domes and the piercing of the roof for a lantern. The artistic expression of the exterior is distinguished by a clear view of the suite of inner spaces, thanks to the interplay of roofs (referred to as the "Moldavian type").
- In terms of techniques, it introduced a new system of constructing domes to give greater

stability to the vault by using diagonal arches typical of "Moldavian vaults" in order to diminish their openings progressively towards the top.

- In terms of monumental art, it made maximum use of enamelled ceramic (in the form of bricks, disks, triangles, and "studs") combined with stone masonry for the outer facing.

Expert studies have revealed that the murals inside the church represent a "prototype of monastic painting," probably the most significant of Moldavia in the 15th century and "a model of the theological and mystical programme of Moldavian monasticism during this period."

### Criterion ii

The Church of the Ascension is considered to have reached the peak of 15th Moldavian architecture, the most beautiful and important building erected during the reign of Stephen the Great, as it encapsulates all the previous solutions to construction problems. The Moldavian architectural style of this period reflects the strong influence of post-Byzantine architecture which, for historical reasons, flourished only in the northern region of Orthodox Christianity.

At the same time, it should be stressed that, in addition to its function as the main seat of Christian faith, the monastery of Neam•, with the strong support of the rulers, was one of the main cultural hubs of the time, both for the country and the Orthodox world, its centre of gravity being established north of the Danube after the fall of Constantinople in 1453. Among the numerous manuscripts created or copied at Neam•, the icons, and the ecclesiastical objects produced in the monastery, mention should be made of what is perhaps the most famous item, the *Book of the Four Gospels*, decorated with illuminations and copied on parchment in 1429 by Gavriil Uric, founder of the Moldavian school of illuminated books; it is now in the Bodleian Library in Oxford.

A rich library containing manuscripts and printed works, an embroidery workshop with, for example, the Epitaph of 1437, a masterpiece of this genre, and a wood sculpture studio function, and have always functioned, near the monastery.

The life of the monastic community was guided by principles formulated into a theory by the famous spiritual fathers of the Moldavian Orthodox religion, such as Pahomie of Pocrov and the Father Superior of Neam•, Paisie Velcicovski, in the 18th century.

Also active around the monastery were a hospital-asylum (attested before 1735, then rebuilt several times on other sites in 1791, 1802, 1843, and in 1846 on the site of the present building), a pharmacy (attested in 1760, and since 1843 located in the hospital), and a number of schools (the oldest were founded on the grounds of the monastery and were moved outside after the 19th century), including the denominational school (1843, 1848), the theological seminary (1855, 1901, reorganized in 1925, 1929, modernized in 1840). Near the seminary, there is now a new church dedicated to Saint John Jacob of Neam• (1996) and a school of cantors (set up in 1901 and incorporated into the national education system since 1940).

### Criterion iii

The church is an "outstanding example" of a type of architecture belonging to a significant period in the history of mankind, the strong opposition of the Christian world to the powerful expansion of the Ottomans in Europe (after the conquest of the Balkans and the fall of Constantinople). This period is marked by the personality of the voivode Stephen the Great, described by the Pope in his time as an "athlete of Christianity," not only because of his qualities as a soldier but also as a founder of churches.

In this way, during a period when the Church was becoming a political argument of the greatest importance, all architectural and artistic knowledge was concentrated perfectly in the Church of the Ascension. In turn, it became an archetype "that seems to imitate the splendid churches (of Moldavia) of the 16th century which reached the height of their development at the end of the century in Sucevi• a."

In comparison with 16th century churches which were inspired by the model of Neam• , with the exception of Sucevita, Saint George of Suceva, and Probota, all three already inscribed on the World Heritage List (particularly because of their painted exteriors), the value of the church at Neam• is exceptional in its own right in the context of Moldavian architecture.

#### **Criterion iv**

The Church of the Ascension of Jesus should be considered with the complex in which it was built, the monastery of Neam• (a complex developed, and inevitably restructured, in the following centuries), which polarized a real settlement, the monastic village, and a series of consecrated satellite hermitages (Vovidenia, Pocrov, and Icoana).

The monastery of Neam• as a whole was designated as far back as the beginning of the 15th century (in 1407 jointly with another monastery situated in the same region of Neam• ) by the first "national" metropolitan of Moldavia, Joseph I, a close relative of the voivode Alexander I the Good, as *Prima Laura* of the Moldavian Orthodox Church. It consequently became the leading centre of monasticism in the country. It kept this title throughout the 15th century and during the following centuries, even after Stephen the Great founded the powerful monastery of Putna.

Being a strong and rich establishment, it drew a lay population to the vicinity, and sometimes had such a strong power of attraction that on several occasions it was necessary to remove the population in order to preserve the ecclesiastical character of the monastery (in 1780, for instance, a new village was founded in the parish of Neam• to house a few dozen families).

The example of a monastic establishment built outside a precinct was followed later by other monasteries, especially in the 19th century. The monastery of Neam• is still the most complex monastic village in Moldavia.

#### **Criterion v**

### **Category of Property**

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### **History and Description**

#### *History*

Situated about 15km from the village of Tirgu Neam• , the Orthodox monastery of Neam• , founded in the 14th century, is one of the oldest monastic establishments still surviving in Moldavia. According to certain documents, the monastery received donations from Count Petru Musat (1375-91).

Excavations carried out at the monastery have confirmed the traditional belief that a first church in wood was erected during the second half of the 14th century on the site of the Church of Saint George (1826). This first wooden church would have been the work of Sophronius, Pimenus, and Sylvanus, disciples of the Serbian monk Nicodemus, founder of several monasteries in Wallachia. Between the end of the 14th century and the beginning of the 15th century, it was replaced by a church in stonework dedicated to the Ascension.

During the first half of the 15th century, a period during which the political organization of the Principality of Moldavia (independent since 1359) was consolidated and the seat of the metropolitan, under the authority of the Patriarch of Constantinople, was established in Suceava, the monastery of Neam• was designated as *Prima Laura* of Moldavia (1407).

The monastery of Neam• became the heart of monasticism in Moldavia and also, thanks to the support of the Moldavian princes, an important cultural centre. It was renowned for its scriptorium which produced the famous Gospel Book illuminated by the monk Gavriil Uric (1429), its embroidery workshop which in 1437 produced a rectangular veil depicting the Entombment of Christ (*epitaphioi*) commissioned by Abbot Sylvanus, and its wood sculpture workshop.

The monastery of Neam• continued to enjoy the favourable benefits of these artistic and cultural activities, which intensified under the long reign of Prince Stephen III the Great (1457-1504). In 1497, the Prince decided to rebuild the Church of the Ascension, which had been destroyed by an earthquake in 1472.

In the 17th and 18th centuries, a village grew up around the monastery to accommodate part of the religious community and its institutions.

In the 18th century, many monks joined the hermits who had settled in small communities in a wooded area a few kilometres from the monastery of Neam• . Thus in 1706, the monk Pahomie, originally from Transylvania and who had spent two years in the *Laura* of Kiev, founded the hermitage of Pocrov. This hermitage, like that of Vovidenia (17th century) was independent when first created but was subsequently attached to the monastery.

Personalities such as the monk Pahomie and, in particular, Abbot Paisie Velicicovski (died 1794), who was known throughout the Orthodox East for his precepts on monastic life which were put into

practice by the community of Neam• , turned the monastery into the heart of an intense spiritual life.

Today, the monastery of Neam• , with its village and hermitages, perpetuates a tradition that goes back to many centuries.

#### *Description*

The cultural property proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List consists of the monastery of Neam• , the monastery village built outside the precinct and the two hermitages, Vovidenia and Pocrov, located 1.5km and 4km from the monastery respectively.

The precinct of the monastery, as it stands today, is the result of several construction phases. It is punctuated to the west by the bell tower at the entrance (early 15th century and modified in the 19th century) and to the east by the guard tower, the *Prig*, the oldest parts of the monastery precinct. The walls of the entrance gallery of the monastery, on the ground floor of the bell tower, are decorated with murals (late 15th century or mid 16th century), illustrating three iconographic cycles, including scenes from the medieval story of Barlaam and Joasaph, the only mural representation of this theme known to this day.

The cells of the monks and the annexes (Chapel of the Dormition of the Virgin, refectory, kitchens, library, and museum) are built on two levels against the wall of the precinct and date to the late 18th-early 19th century. On the ground floor a row of stone arcades is interrupted by stairs leading to the wooden balcony on the first floor. The neo-classical Church of Saint George, which stood to the south of the Church of the Ascension in the 19th century, was dismantled in 1959-60, and then rebuilt between the cells of the monk on the east side of the precinct in order to clear space around the main monument.

The Church of the Ascension, slightly off-centre in relation to the axis of the monastic precinct, is built according to a triple-apse plan of Byzantine tradition, adopted in Moldavia in the second half of the 14th century.

In this case, however, the plan follows the more developed form of Moldavian monastic architecture with, in the addition to the three traditional areas (sanctuary, naos, and pronaos), a tomb chamber reserved for the church founders (between the naos and the pronaos), and an exonarthex to the west. These areas form compartments, each separated from the other by walls pierced with doors, with the exception of the sanctuary, which is isolated from the naos by an iconostasis. In 1930, the wall separating the naos from the funeral chamber was pulled down, resulting in the loss of a votive painting dating to the end of the 15th century. A vestiary was added to the diaconicum on the south side of the Church in 1549.

The length of the building echoes its vertical development. The distribution of the load is ensured by a special vaulting system known as the "Moldavian vault." A dome supported by a set of superposed oblique arches resting on pendentives covers each of the areas of the church except for the sanctuary. Outside, the domes disappear under a high

steeply pitched roof. The roof of the naos serves as the base for the lantern. Independent roofs cover the various parts of the church, around the lantern which has a double octagonal base and pointed roof.

The craftsmen from Transylvania and Poland who worked on the Church of the Ascension adapted a Gothic repertory of forms (high base, buttresses, door and window frames) to the Moldavian architecture. The decoration of the external facades reflects the Byzantine heritage, with stone walls punctuated by alcoves and decorated with brick courses and multi-coloured motifs in enamelled ceramic.

The Church contains an important series of murals, the value of which will be appreciated even more once the current restoration work is completed. Already, the present status of the work makes it possible to give an approximate date for two different phases, the late 15th-early 16th century, and for the pronaos and exonarthex 1554-57. Most of these paintings appear to be the work of a school of painting active during the reign of Stephen III the Great which gave a creative interpretation to the art of the Palaeologus.

Annex buildings (hospital and printing press, baptistery with font, theological seminary and Church of Saint John Jacob of Neam• , prior's residence, etc), most of them built in the 19th century on the site of older constructions, are spread around the monastery precinct. Along with the houses of the monks, renovated in the 19th century, and their outbuildings (barns, stables, etc), they form the village of the monastery. Among these buildings, the small cemetery church devoted to Saint John the Theologian (built in 1835 on the site of a 15th century wooden church) follows a triple-apse plan and has a lantern topped by an onion dome.

The hermitage dedicated to the Presentation of the Virgin and Saint Spiridon (Vovidenia) was established near the picturesque church of the same name. It was built in 1849 on the site of a late 18th century wooden church. Wooden single-storey houses (18th century) are scattered around this building. They stand on elevated foundations and are covered by a roof with four slopes, the front one sheltering a wooden terrace. The house where the novelist Mihail Sadoveanu (1880-1961) lived has been turned into a museum in his memory.

A few kilometres to the south, there is a hermitage dedicated to the Virgin (Pocrov) in a glade. The size of the church, built in 1714, is unusual for Romanian wooden architecture of the 18th century. It is very likely that its founder, the monk Pahomie, was inspired by the proportions of models he saw when he travelled to Kiev.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The buildings and precinct of the monastery of Neam• , the Church of Saint John the Theologian (Bogoslov) and bell tower, the Church of Saint John the New, the house of Nicodim, the stoup, the Vovidenia hermitage (Church of the Presentation of the Virgin and Saint Spiridon, and monastic buildings), and the Pocrov hermitage (Church of the

Virgin Mary and bell tower) have the status of historic monuments under the terms of the Law on the Protection of National Cultural Heritage No 11/1994, which was subsequently completed by several other laws and edicts.

The Ministry of Culture has drawn up a draft law on historic monuments which has been submitted for approval. The purpose of this draft law is to unify all the legal measures in force and to distinguish the problems relating specifically to historic monuments from those concerning national cultural heritage as a whole.

In accordance with Law No 41/1995, owners of historic monuments are responsible for their daily maintenance. Plans for the conservation and restoration of historic monuments must be submitted for the approval of the specialized bodies of the Ministry of Culture, which are also responsible for supervising such works. Anyone who infringes these ministerial decisions is subject to sanctions.

Furthermore, the Ministry of Public Works and National Planning and the Ministry of Culture cooperate on the establishment of protected constructed areas (Edict No 134/1998).

#### *Management*

The property proposed for inscription belongs to the monastery of Neam•, which comes under the authority of the metropolitan of Moldavia and Bucovina. The theological seminary and the Church of Saint Jacob of Neam• belong to the metropolitan, while the Mihail Sadoveanu museum is part of the Museum of Romanian Literature.

The Ministry of Culture is responsible for protecting historic monuments. It exercises these functions through the Department of Historic Monuments, which advises the National Commission of Historic Monuments on anything concerning research, accounts, inventory, evaluation, restoration, conservation, and enhancing the value of historic monuments.

The Ministry of Public Works and National Planning (Department of Protected Areas and Commission on Protected Constructed Areas), the Ministry of Tourism (Department of Development, Strategy and Management), and the Junior Minister's Office for Religious Worship are also involved in the management of historic monuments. Each institution is represented at the regional level of Neam•.

A National and Regional Planning Programme, defining the protected areas for the monuments in the region of Neam•, was drawn up by the Ministry of Public Works and National Planning. It was submitted to Parliament for approval and will lead to legislative measures.

In addition, the same Ministry approved (Note No 315/1995) a *Pilot Study for the demarcation and conservation of protected natural and constructed areas in the region of Neam•* (Project No 27/1995) defining the four degrees of protection to be applied to the cultural property proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List, as well as a buffer zone. The Regional Council of Neam• will be approving a

legal framework for this study, in conformity with Romanian legislation.

The edifices of the monastery itself, the main buildings of the village, and the two hermitages (listed as historic monuments) form the core of a protected area, and they are also incorporated into an area with a protection of several degrees.

The four degrees of protection cover the extensive buffer zone, which consists of constructions attached to the monastery, an archaeological site, a natural reserve for oaks and aurochs, fields, and forests. The competent authorities have also ensured that the agricultural land, orchards, and pastures, which used to belong to the monastery and may be returned to it (the Romanian Parliament is currently examining a law on the retrocession of this land), are included in the buffer zone. This hierarchy establishes the present function and future use of each area, with the aim of preserving the attractive landscape of the site from new buildings which could have a negative visual impact. It also provides guidelines for developing future tourist facilities (car parks are already planned) which the monastery of Neam•, already visited by numerous pilgrims and tourists, may need.

Furthermore, the region of Neam• has been the subject of a study on the development of tourist areas with monuments of historical and architectural interest.

The spiritual and socio-economic responsibilities of the monastery of Neam• is also a very important factor for the protection of the cultural property proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

Although the monastery and the Church of the Ascension were subject to interventions during the first half of the 19th century, these were rectified during the restoration programme undertaken between 1953 and 1961 (restoration of the original shape of the roof, windows and southern facade of the Church, etc).

In the last few years, work to consolidate, conserve, and improve the monastery of Neam• and the village buildings has been undertaken (murals in the Church of the Ascension, baptistery, etc), while another project is planned for the precinct wall of the monastery.

Only interventions that are absolutely necessary are permitted. The experts who undertook these repairs to the structure of the buildings (for the parts in wood, for example) have emphasized the need to safeguard the original structure rather than to replace certain sections with a view to renovation. The renovation work undertaken in several places in the monastic complex were part of previous restoration projects, in particular those carried out between 1953 and 1961. Nevertheless, certain conservation practices, the demolition and reconstruction of the Church of Saint George (1959-60), and the replacement of the wooden roofing over the monastic

precinct by one in copper (1997) may be called into question.

The first conservation and restoration campaign of the series of murals in the Church of the Ascension of Jesus was launched in 1992. This delicate task to bring to life the medieval paintings concealed by several layers of paint applied in past restoration work (in particular, during the first half of the 19th century) is nearly finished in the sanctuary.

Similar interventions are planned for the murals in the entry gallery to the monastery, situated on the ground floor of the bell tower.

The fact that the monastery of Neam•, the village, and the two hermitages of Vovidenia and Pocrov are still active is a determining factor which has greatly contributed to their good state of conservation.

#### *Authenticity*

Despite the repairs and modifications made over time to the buildings proposed for inscription, they still have a high degree of authenticity.

The buildings have retained their original function, an important factor in the authentic and historical nature of the site. They display a repertory of the different phases of an architectural development which started in the Middle Ages and has continued to the present day.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Neam• in February 1999.

##### *Qualities*

Romania was one of the last regions in Europe to fall under the cultural influence of Byzantium, and it was also in contact with Western architecture. These influences (and perhaps that of Armenia in the case of the domes) were synthesized and interpreted during the second half of the 14th century to create a religious architecture specific to Moldavia. The Church of the Ascension of the monastery of Neam• expresses the principles typical of this style of architecture.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The five-section plan, the vaulting system, and the decorative part of the facades of the Church of the Ascension of the monastery of Neam• form a synthesis of previous architectural experiments, although some of them were used partially, in particular for Putna (1466-1469) and the old Church of Probota (before 1469), two buildings founded by Prince Stephen III the Great which no longer exist. It served as a model for the 15th century churches of the monasteries of Suceava and Probota which are included in the World Heritage List (under the title of "Churches of Moldavia"), mainly because of their external mural paintings.

Orthodox monasteries are already represented on the World Heritage List by Mount Athos (Greece), the monastery of Rila (Bulgaria), the monastery of

Studenica (Yugoslavia), and other monasteries on the indicative list of several State Parties, such as that of Decani (Federative Republic of Yugoslavia).

#### **Recommendation**

While recognizing the importance of the cultural property proposed for inscription in the context of Moldavia, it is not recommended that this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Maramures wooden churches (Romania)

No 904

### Identification

*Nomination* The Wooden Churches of Maramures

*Location* Region of Maramures

District: Bârsana; Village: Bârsana  
District: Bude• ti; Village: Bude• ti  
District: Dese• ti; Village: Dese• ti  
District: Ieud; Village: Ieud  
District: Sise• ti; Village: Plopi•  
District: Poienile Izei Village:  
Poienile Izei  
Town: Târgu Lapus; Village: Rogoz  
District: Sise• ti Village: • urde• ti

*State Party* Romania

*Date* 29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Certain researchers stress the exceptional character of the wooden churches of Maramures owing to their shape, construction, authenticity, equilibrium, dynamism, and atmosphere. The superlatives everyone is tempted to use at the sight of these churches are certainly not empty of meaning but express the feelings aroused by anything that is a work of art. These churches are the result of the expertise of successive generations of brilliant craftsmen and their capacity for working with an innate artistic sense. The skills of the stone cutters of Maramures have earned them a well deserved reputation, still recognized nowadays thanks to their contemporary creations. **Criterion i**

The wooden churches of Maramures, nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List, are an example of the type of construction based on a *Blockbau* system. They are also an interpretation of the Gothic style, but using wood only, based on traditional techniques which crystallized in the 18th century and survived in this form until the present day, thus creating a model, and even a style, described as the "Maramures manner." **Criterion iv**

### Category of Property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, these properties constitute a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

The region of Maramures, situated in the north of Transylvania, was formed over time by the fusion of very old geographic and socio-political entities called "countries," including those of Maramures, Chioar, and Lapus where the churches nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List are located. These "countries" are united by their geographic environment, composed of mountains once covered by forests and numerous rivers, but also by their history and spiritual life.

In the Middle Ages, the rural social structures were founded on community-type villages grouped in each valley, under the general leadership of the voivode of Maramures. The churches of the region were placed under the jurisdiction of the Orthodox monastery of Peri. The region of Maramures, known by the name of *terra Maramoroisiensi* (1324) and *districtus Maramoroisiensi* (1326), enjoyed a certain degree of political autonomy before coming under the authority of the Hungarian sovereigns.

It became a *comitat* (county) in 1385 and was then incorporated into the Principality of Transylvania (1538), which was annexed by the Hapsburgs in 1711. The period between the end of the 17th century and that of the 18th century was particularly rich in political and cultural events for Maramures, where Byzantine traditions intermingled with Western contributions (Uniate Church, Reformation, and Counter-Reformation). Most of the wooden churches of the region were rebuilt after the destruction caused by the last great Tatar invasions in 1717.

#### Description

The eight churches of Maramures that are proposed for inscription on the World Heritage List are monuments based on traditional timber architecture.

They were built in the 18th and 19th centuries and have retained their traditional plan, composed of a naos and pronaos in the shape of a rectangle, and a pentagonal recessed sanctuary. A portico was added to the western facade of the churches in Bârsana, Poienile Izei, Ieud Deal, • urde• ti, and Plopi• . They are covered by a high, steep, double-pitched roof from which soars a tall bell tower with a gallery similar to stone Gothic churches, giving the churches their characteristic silhouette.

The churches stand on a base made of stone blocks and pebble fillings. The wooden beams (in oak or pine) are arranged according to the *Blockbau* system and assembled by joints in the shape of a V, U, or T, to make the construction stable and flexible. The beams of the upper part of the walls extend beyond the junction points to form supporting consoles for the framework. The outer walls are usually embellished with a torsade motif, while structural components (consoles, door and window frames, balustrade, bell tower gallery, etc) have a sculpted decoration.

The three inner areas are covered by ceilings or vaults of different forms. A gallery was installed later (late 19th – early 20th century) in the naos to accommodate the growing congregation. The inner

walls were completely covered with paintings during the second half of the 18th century and first half of the 19th century by travelling painters whose names are known. These painters belong to post-Byzantine traditions, but their iconography also reflects the ideas conveyed by the Reformation and Counter-Reformation. The canons of Byzantine art are reinterpreted in a graphic and decorative manner to create a more naive and refreshing style of painting. At the beginning of the 19th century, Baroque and Rococo paintings made their appearance in the wooden churches of Maramures, probably through the intermediary of neighbouring countries.

- The Church of the Presentation of the Virgin at the Temple (Bârsana)

The old church of the Bârsana monastery, built in 1720, became a parish church in 1806 when it was moved to the present site. On this occasion, a two-level portico, connected by a staircase, was added to the western facade. Because of its plan, the church belongs to the tradition of churches of the Maramures region, but differs by its smaller size. The painter Hodor Toader did the painted decoration in 1806, using an iconography and style which confirms the influences of Baroque and Rococo painting, especially in the naos and sanctuary.

- The Church of Saint Nicholas (Budești)

The church of Saint Nicholas was built in 1643 on the site of a 15th century church. It is an outstanding example of the wooden churches of Maramures which served as a model for many other churches. It is also distinguished by its size and the four pinnacles at the base of the spire, which indicates a link with the neighbouring region of Lăpuș. The paintings inside come from two different periods: those of the narthex and naos are the work of Alexandru Ponehalski (1762) who also painted several icons, while those in the sanctuary are by Ioan Opris (1832).

- The Church of the Holy Paraskeva (Desești)

The church, which was built in 1770, reflects the artistic maturity of its builders. The external architectural elements are highlighted by decorative motifs (serrations, leaves, etc) incised or cut in the wood to create a homogeneous and valuable ensemble. The painter Radu Munteanu, known as the leader of an 18th century school of religious painting, was responsible for the interior decoration (1780), assisted by the painter Gheorghe.

- The Church of the Nativity of the Virgin (Ieud Deal)

The present church, built in the middle of the 18th century, replaced the one destroyed by the Tatars in 1717. The structure of the inner space, especially the vaults over the naos and narthex, reveals the ingenuity of the builders. The painter Alexandru Ponehalski, who was already active in the region, did the interior decoration, which has a particularly rich iconography (1782). The wooden churches of Maramures usually formed a complex with a cemetery, but in Ieud it is also completed by a bell tower standing on its own and a Way of the Cross with stations built in masonry.

- The Church of the Holy Archangels (Plopiști)

Situated in the "country" of Chioar, the church of the Holy Archangels (1796-1798) shows certain analogies with the church in Urdești, such as the flat roof slightly lowered over the sanctuary, the slender bell tower with four corner pinnacles, and certain elements of the sculpted decor outside (torsades in the middle of the walls, motifs on the base and the balustrade of the belvedere). The decoration, painted in 1811 by Stefan, a native of the village, is preserved on the vaults and the iconostasis with, in particular, a Descent from the Cross.

- The Church of the Holy Parasceve (Poienile Izei)

The church of Saint Paraskeva, one of the oldest of the wooden churches of Maramures (1604), reveals two phases in the development of such buildings. The first phase can be seen in the lower part of the walls with a sanctuary based on a square plan, a typical feature of the oldest wooden buildings. In the 18th century, the walls were raised, the naos was covered by a semi-circular vault, and the interior was decorated with paintings (1794). The portico protecting the entrance was added during the first half of the 19th century.

- The Church of the Holy Archangels (Rogoz)

The church built in 1663 was moved from Suciul Sus to Rogoz in 1883. It is characterized by a recessed heptagonal sanctuary, a polygonal pronaos, a southern entrance, and a large asymmetrical roof. It is also distinctive for its profusion of decorative sculpture ("horsehead" consoles, old traditional Romanian motifs, an accolade frame for the entrance, torsades, rosettes, crosses, etc). The partly preserved murals were painted in 1785 by two painters from the country, Radu Munteanu and Nicolae Man.

- The Church of the Holy Archangels (Urdești)

Built in 1767, the church of the Holy Archangels of Urdești synthesises all the features of the wooden churches of Maramures at the height of their development with, in particular, a double canopy and superposed windows. The two-level portico and its tall bell tower date to the 19th century. In 1783, three painters, including Stefan (iconostasis and sanctuary), shared the task of decorating the inside of the church.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The eight wooden churches included in the nomination are designated as historical monuments of national importance with the status of National Treasures (List of Monuments, category A) under the terms of Article 1 and 2 of the 1994 Law No 11 for the Protection of Historic Monuments. Article 1 of the same statute defines the surrounding conservation areas as being "part of the historic monument." For each of the eight wooden churches a surrounding conservation area and a buffer zone have been defined in 1993, including the necessary regulations. Having been approved by the Commission for Conservation Areas within the Ministry of Public

Works and Territorial Planning under the terms of the Building Act, Law No 50 from 1991 for Building Regulations and Territorial Planning, they have a legal status.

It should be mentioned that the existing legislation for the Protection of Historic Monuments, Law No 11 of 1994, has very strict provisions relating to the protection, preservation, and management of designated properties and sites. Nevertheless, it is only a provisional one, without providing efficient control and management at the county or local level. There is no professional body or institution (since the dissolution of the National Office in November 1994), the Direction for Historical Monuments being included in the administration of the Ministry of Culture. A draft of the new Conservation Law prepared in recent years, including a National Board and decentralized structures at the county level, will be submitted to the Parliament end of March 1999.

#### *Management*

As places of worship, the wooden churches are in the ownership of their religious Orthodox communities.

It is the responsibility of owners of designated buildings and areas to manage and repair them and open them to the public. Any alterations require the permission of the Ministry of Culture and the National Commission for Historic Monuments.

There are clearly defined and adequate conservation areas and also adequate buffer zones around the nominated properties. They have been designated already in 1993 on the initiative of the Ministry of Culture in collaboration with the Ministry of Public Works and Territorial Planning and the County administration. The conservation areas and buffer zones are provided for in Law No 11 (1994) for the Protection of Historic Monuments, the Building Law No 50 from 1991 on Building Regulations and Territorial Planning, and the regulations for each conservation area related to urban planning in conformity with the Order of the Minister of Public Works and Territorial Planning concerning conservation areas.

Overall supervision of the nominated properties is the responsibility of the Ministry of Culture. It carries out this work in collaboration with the National Commission for Historic Monuments, the National Office for Heritage Protection, the State Secretariat for Church Affairs, and, where appropriate, with the Ministry of Public Works and Territorial Planning, the Ministry of Education, the Maramures County Inspectorate for Culture, the County Office for Cultural Heritage, the Maramures Orthodox Archbishopric, and the local parish.

Substantial financial aid is available for non-governmental owners - especially the religious communities - from the Ministry of Culture for conservation and restoration projects. Financial aid is available also from the State Secretariat for Church Affairs and the Orthodox Archbishopric. Between 1992 and 1997, the Ministry of Culture contributed to a conservation programme for 17 wooden churches in Maramures County, and since 1997 a pilot conservation project for seven wooden churches (including the nominated properties), the

“Maramures Project,” has been under implementation. Other initiatives to be mentioned are applications for financial support from the European Commission for mural painting conservation works for • urde• ti and the Getty Grant Program for wood conservation works at Bârsana, Ieud, and Rogoz.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

Respect for tradition and for sacred places resulted in the continuity of maintenance and restoration work, even in the communist period. Between 1958 and 1977, the National Office for the Protection of Historic Monuments managed to train several specialists for conservation, specifically for the Maramures timber architecture, and to coordinate conservation interventions on almost all the nominated churches. At Bârsana in 1963-65 during conservation works some inadequate additions from 1929 were eliminated. At Bude• ti in 1970, the stone foundation was renewed and the vault of the naos replaced partially. At Ieud-Deal in 1957-59 and 1960-62 structural consolidation work was carried out on the clock tower and the shingle roofing was replaced. At Plopi• repair and consolidation works took place in 1961 (foundations and base in stone), and in 1973 structural consolidation of the tower. At Poienile Izei complete restoration work was carried out in 1961-62 (enlargement of the gallery in 1970). At Rogoz in 1960-61 a new foundation and base in stone were inserted, some logs were replaced; the roof timbering was repaired and in 1968 treatment was carried out against biological attack (*Merulius lacrimans*). At • urde• ti structural consolidation works took place in 1960-62.

All these conservation works were executed to a high professional level, respecting and using only traditional materials, methods, and technology.

After the dissolution of the National Office in 1977 some of the trained craftsmen had the chance to continue their work within the open-air museums and so the traditional skills survived.

Since 1990 all the authorities responsible for the protection and conservation of the wooden churches on the national and regional level have started different initiatives and projects for training specialists, both in traditional timber conservation work and in biological treatment (professionals have had specialized training in Norway, the United Kingdom, and elsewhere). Special attention has been paid to the conservation problems of the mural paintings; some restorers have become specialists and international courses are organized (at Rogoz in 1998). At the moment, there are four high-level specialized companies in the Maramures County for conservation, maintenance, and repair work on the churches. Maintenance and conservation work on the nominated properties continued after 1990: at Bârsana in 1997 structural consolidation works for the clock tower and the roofing (protection of the painted vault); at Budesti restoration currently in progress (replacing of the roofing and parts of the clock tower); at Dese• ti repair of works from the beginning of this century (foundation base replaced

in concrete, the roofing material changed) in 1996-97 (including the conservation of the mural paintings); at Poienile Izei in 1996-97 restoration of the gallery to its original dimensions and the roofing renewed; at Rogoz in 1997-98, treatment against biological attack and conservation of the mural paintings, now completed; conservation of the mural painting at • urde• ti since 1997.

#### *Authenticity*

The level of authenticity of the various properties included in the nomination is very high. The traditional maintenance and repair work on the wooden churches and the conservation principles of the Maramures craftsmen have ensured that replacement of damaged or degraded architectural elements has respected the materials and techniques used by the original builders.

The well preserved interior layout and decoration of the churches with their mural paintings are masterpieces of art and authentic vernacular documents for the traditional religious life of the orthodox communities over the centuries.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An expert ICOMOS mission visited the wooden churches of Maramures in February 1999. The ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Vernacular Architecture was also consulted.

##### *Qualities*

The properties that make up the nomination of the Maramures wooden churches provide a vivid picture of the traditional timber architecture in the northern part of Romania from the 17th century to the present day as a result of the log house tradition responding to the requirements of Orthodox liturgical space, combined with a specific interpretation of Gothic architecture materialized in timber. The nominated churches with their mural paintings and the surrounding churchyards and cemeteries are representative examples for the geographically and historically different areas of these vernacular traditions in the mountainous regions of the northern Carpathians.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The special value of the Maramures wooden churches lies in the fact that they are outstanding examples of a specific type of religious timber architecture resulting from the combination of Orthodox religious traditions and the interpretation of the Gothic spirit in wood, the architectural expression, design, and proportions being very different from the wooden religious architecture of the adjacent Carpathian regions to the north and north-west.

##### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* make it a condition for inscription on the World Heritage List that every property should have an appropriate management plan in force. None of the eight

nominated churches has such a plan, and one should be prepared and put into operation without delay.

#### **Brief description**

The nominated Maramures wooden churches - a selection of outstanding examples of different architectural solutions from different periods and areas - provide a vivid picture of the variety of design and craftsman skill expressed by the small but nevertheless lofty timber constructions with their characteristic tall and slim clock towers at the western end of the building, single or double roofed and covered by shingles, which are a particular vernacular expression of the cultural landscape of that mountainous area of northern Romania.

#### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party requesting the preparation of management plans for the nominated properties. In the event of this information being supplied and found acceptable, ICOMOS recommends that the property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *critterion iv* :

*Criterion iv* The Maramures wooden churches are outstanding examples of vernacular religious wooden architecture resulting from the interchange of Orthodox religious traditions with Gothic influences in a specific vernacular interpretation of timber construction traditions, showing a high level of artistic maturity and craft skills.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Dacian Fortresses (Romania)

No 906

### Identification

*Nomination* The Dacian fortresses of the Oraş• ie Mountains

- Location*
- 1 Sarmizegetusa: Gr• di• tea de Munte Village, Or• • tioara de Sus Commune, Hunedoara Department
  - 2 Coste• ti-Cetatuie: Coste• ti Village, Orastioara de Sus Commune, Hunedoara Department
  - 3 Coste• ti -Blidaru: Coste• ti Village, Or• • tioara Commune, Hunedoara Department
  - 4 Luncani-Piatra Ro• ie: Luncani Village, Bosorod Commune, Hunedoara Department
  - 5 B• ni• a: B• ni• a Village, B• ni• a Commune, Petrosane Municipality, Hunedoara Department
  - 6 C• pâlna: C• pâlna Village, Sasciori Commune, Alba Department

*State Party* Romania

*Date* 29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The defensive system of the Dacian fortresses of the Oraş• ie Mountains represent a masterpiece of human creative genius by virtue of the uniqueness and exemplary nature of the phenomenon beyond the Greco-Roman world, the concept of the fortified mountain, the planned structure of the group, the architectural vision on the scale of a vast territory, and the ingenious use of the natural environment. The entire site of Gr• di• tea de Munte- Sarmizegetusa, and in particular the sacred area, is one of the most impressive human achievements for the remarkable suggestion of the place of the gods that is sacred and impenetrable and by the proportions and the spiritual area that is set aside.

#### Criterion i

The defensive system of the Dacian fortresses of the Oraş• ie Mountains bears unique and exceptional witness to the now disappeared Geto-Dacian civilization, one of the last peoples to be incorporated into the Roman world. The texture and the planned structures of the group, the special technical

solutions adopted for each element, and the perfect integration into the natural environment endow the sites around the capital, Sarmizegetusa Regia, with outstanding value.

#### Criterion iii

The group of Dacian fortresses in the Mountain region of Oraş• ie is the best example of the coherent architectural programme of a political and religious power, capable of breaking up ancient tribal structures and unifying its *ethnos* around the concept of a state, which was unique for its time.

#### Criterion iv

The Dacian fortresses of the Oraş• ie Mountains are an example that is nowhere else preserved testifying to an original settlement concept based on site planning with objectives that are precise, traditional, and specific to this civilization.

#### Criterion v

The Dacian ensemble of the Oraş• ie Mountains is an exceptional landmark in the collective imagination related to the Roman and later Latin history of the Romanian people. For Romanians the past described in the scenes depicted on Trajan's Column is the symbol of their European history.

#### Criterion vi

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a group of *sites*.

### History and Description

#### History

The civilization of the Getes (*Getae*) and Dacians can be distinguished in the Thracian world long before Herodotus first referred to them in the 7th century BC. The Getes inhabited the Danube plain and the Dacians the central and western part of the region between the Carpathians and the Danube. Their close cultural and linguistic links are emphasized by several ancient authors.

There was a typical Iron Age culture, practising agriculture, stock-raising, fishing, and metal-working, as well as trade with the Greco-Roman world, shown by finds of luxury goods and coinage. When Greek colonies such as Histria, Tomis, Odessos, etc were established along the northern shores of the Black Sea in the 7th century BC, the Geto-Dacian rulers established close links with them and extended their protection. This cultural interchange had a profound effect on societies in the region. The other major cultural influence, adopted by the warrior aristocracy, came from the Scythians who inhabited the regions to the north and east.

During their expansion that began in the 4th century Celtic peoples settled in modern Transylvania and established a hegemony over the region because of their superior weaponry. However, their influence waned from the mid 3rd century BC onwards. A new Geto-Dacian form of territorial organization appeared in the early 2nd century BC, at the same time as important technological developments (wheel-made pottery, iron ploughshares, use of stone for building). It was based on the *dava*, the central place of a tribal territory; these contained many sacred sites (*temenoi*) and other forms of cult centre.

The process whereby the earlier fragmented tribal structure became centralized is not understood, but there is abundant evidence that the Geto-Dacian civilization flourished from the 1st century BC onwards, thanks to the intelligence and pragmatism of its rulers and of its priests. A Hellenistic form of kingdom was evolved by Burebi• ta (82-44 BC), supported by a warrior aristocracy and with its heart in the Oraš• ie Mountains around the sacred mountain *Kogaionon* where the sacred city was built, *Sarmizegetusa Regia*. It became master of the entire Black Sea coast, absorbing the Greek colonies.

After the death of Burebi• ta his kingdom was divided up into smaller territories, but Sarmizegetusa retained its primacy; it became in effect the first (and only) true town in Dacia. The Dacian rulers became increasingly involved in the internal politics of the Roman Empire, and suffered accordingly from punitive expeditions. The lower Danube frontier (*limes*) was constantly the scene of cross-border raids and minor campaigns. This entered a new phase in AD 86, which marked the beginning of a series of Roman-Dacian wars.

In the spring of 101 the Roman Emperor Trajan, having secured his Rhine frontier, took the offensive against the Dacians. Decebalus unified the Dacian kingdoms and concentrated his forces in the Oraš• ie Mountains, where he submitted to Trajan. An uneasy distribution of territory ensued, broken in 105 when Decebalus seized the Roman governor Longinus. This time he could not hold the Dacians together against the powerful Roman army. His capital and his fortresses were overwhelmed and Decebalus himself committed suicide to avoid capture. This campaign is graphically depicted in the reliefs running round Trajan's Column in Rome.

Dacia became a Roman Imperial province, and its fortresses were slighted. New Roman towns were created, but none of them on the site of the Dacian settlements, with the exception of Sarmizegetusa, which was given the resounding Roman name *Colonia Ulpia Traiana Augusta Dacica Sarmizegetusa*. Dacia was to remain part of the Roman Empire until 274, when the Emperor Aurelian abandoned it in the face of irresistible pressure from the Goths.

#### *Description*

The system developed by the Dacians to defend their capital, Sarmizegetusa Regia, was composed of three distinct fortified elements. All of them were strategically placed, to control important military and/or communication arteries, such as mountain passes and river or land trade routes.

The oldest is represented by *fortified sites* on dominant physical features (peaks or promontories). The defences consisted of palisaded banks and ditches, in a style to be found elsewhere in antiquity (eg the Celtic *oppida*). Most of them were important economic and commercial centres, with flourishing settlements both within and outside.

The second group is that of *fortresses*. These were military complexes, invariably on hilltop sites and occupied only by garrisons. They sometimes had small extra-mural civil settlements. Many had a serious drawback, in that they lacked sources of water and so could not withstand a protracted siege.

The final category is that of *linear defences*, which blocked access from certain routes and linked two or more fortresses.

#### - *Sarmizegetusa*

There are three components of this site, the capital of Dacia, which covers an area of 17.83ha: the fortress, the sacred area, and the civilian quarter.

The Gr• di• tea plateau was terraced to accommodate the settlement. It is dominated by the fortress, which was the centre of secular and spiritual government. An area of little more than 1ha was enclosed by a substantial wall built in stone and timber using the technique of the *murus dacicus*. Little remains of the internal divisions, which were demolished when Sarmizegetusa was captured by the Romans.

The sacred area is situated to the east of the fortress. Access is by means of a paved path on the west and a monumental stone stairway on the east. The remains of a number of round or rectangular shrines survive in the centre of the area. The former, built of volcanic andesite with wooden columns, had central sacrificial hearths. The latter were built in andesite or limestone and had stone or wooden columns.

The civilian settlement spread over more than a hundred artificial terraces, only a handful of which have so far been excavated. The houses were both round and circular in plan, built in stone and wood. A number of craft workshops (metal working, pottery, glass, coining, etc) have been found. A Roman bath-house was found along one of the access roads to the settlement, which had three sources of water which supplied cisterns and water channels.

Included in this nominated property is the nearby Dacian settlement site of *Fetele Albe*, which was associated with the main site. It is a terraced site where excavations have revealed a number of stone-built habitations and sanctuaries. The ceramic and metal material found during the excavations was of high quality, some of it imported from the Roman Empire, testifying to the advanced cultural and economic level achieved by Dacia in the 1st centuries BC and AD.

#### - *Coste• ti -Cet• • uie*

A small ellipsoidal plateau on a hill overlooking the left bank of the river Apa Ora• ului was terraced to form a strong fortress. Its fortifications were laid out in three concentric bands, erected in successive stages of the fortress's life. The ramparts are constructed of stone, wood, and rammed earth, a different technique being used for each enceinte.

The strongly defended entrance was on the south. A number of towers survive: some of these were bastions, the others used as dwellings. Religious architecture is represented by four rectangular sanctuaries on limestone plinths with wooden columns. Two cisterns have also been discovered.

#### - *Coste• ti -Blidaru*

Blidaru is the strongest and most spectacular of the fortresses erected to defend the capital at Sarmizegetusa. It is rectilinear in plan and is located on the levelled summit of a small hill.

There are two enclosures, covering 0.5ha. The first, on the highest point, is trapezoidal. The walls (in *murus dacicus* style) have corner bastions, through one of which access is gained to the interior, where there are the remains of a square building that would have housed the garrison.

A second enclosure was added later, extending the fortress to the entire summit of the hill. It is also rectangular in plan, and the walls were reinforced by a series of buttresses; on

two of the walls these were subsequently converted into a series of casemates, with upper storeys, probably used for storage.

- *Luncani Piatra Roșie*

This fortress consists of two fortified enclosures on the eastern slope of a rocky massif, covering 1.2ha. The earlier and smaller of the two has, which is rectangular in plan, has corner bastions, with a fifth covering the less steep approach from the east. In the interior there is an apsidal timber-framed barrack block with two rooms. To the north and outside the defences there were two buildings on the site of an earlier sanctuary.

The second enceinte dates from the late 1st century AD. Its defences were constructed of crushed stone and rammed earth and enclose a much larger area. There are two large semi-circular bastions at the corners and three others outside the enceinte.

- *Băniștea*

This fortress was constructed on a steep conical hill in the Jiu valley. The only side on which the summit was accessible was on the north, and this was defended by a strong stone wall in *murus dacicus* style. The fortress itself was entered through a gate leading to a monumental limestone stairway with andesite balustrades.

The plateau above has three terraces at different levels. The second of these, in the centre of the plateau, was the site of the timber-framed military barrack. The third is trapezoidal in plan and bounded by a strong stone wall.

- *Căpâlna*

The Căpâlna fortress was constructed at the summit of a steep hill which was terraced and surrounded by ramparts following the natural contours. There is an imposing square structure built using the *murus dacicus* technique, which was occupied by the garrison; it was originally equipped with an upper storey. This is flanked by several smaller structures. Excavations have revealed traces of several timber-framed barrack buildings within the enceinte.

The defensive wall originates from the military building. It served also as the revetment for the terraces. The enceinte was entered by a fortified gateway on the south-east, close to the military building. There was originally another entrance in the north-east, but this was blocked between the construction of the fortress and the Roman conquest in AD 106.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

The properties nominated for inscription form part of the Prehistoric and Historic Reserve of the Orașul ie Mountains, established under the provisions of the basic heritage protection Law No 41/1994, as extended and supplemented by subsequent laws and decrees. This requires any interventions on protected sites and monuments to be submitted to the competent authorities for approval. There are two levels of protection zone around each property. No construction is allowed in the inner zones, and there is control over work in the outer zones.

### Management

The sites nominated for inscription are all the property of the State. Properties in the buffer zones are partly State-owned and partly private.

Overall responsibility for protected monuments is vested in the Ministry of Culture, which operates through its Directorate of Historic Monuments. This is advised by the National Commission on Historic Monuments on research survey and inventory, evaluation, restoration, conservation, and other aspects of its work.

The Directorate has inspectors with regional responsibilities, and at Department level there are professionally staffed National Cultural Heritage Offices.

The National Land Use Plan (PATN) recognizes the importance of the Dacian fortresses of the Orașul ie Mountains. A plan specific to the region was approved in 1997-98. It provides for the investigation and presentation of the archaeological sites, preparation and implementation of measures to ensure their protection in socio-economic planning, re-evaluation of the legal status of the protection zones, continued scientific research, the development of regional tourism policies, greater involvement of lower-tier administrations and local populations, and better access and signage.

There are currently management plans in force for each of the properties that make up the nomination. These relate to investigation, conservation, and presentation, and also take account of potential modifications to ownership and/or land-use in the buffer zones.

Each of the sites has an inner and an outer protection zone, as prescribed in the heritage legislation. These conform adequately with the buffer zones required in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

The sites are all relatively remote and difficult of access. Only at Sarmizegetusa, Cetățuie, and Blidaru are there permanent guardians on site; they are responsible for general maintenance work.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

There has been considerable conservation work preceded by limited archaeological excavation at *Sarmizegetusa* in recent years. In addition to consolidation and limited anastylosis on walls, new floors have been inserted in one of the large sanctuaries, drainage has been introduced, badly degraded architectural elements have been replaced by copies in modern materials, and wooden uprights have been inserted in the large limestone sanctuary in the postholes discovered during excavations.

*Căpâlna* has been the object of systematic scientific excavation, in 1965-67 and 1982-83; the results were published in a monograph in 1989. This formed the basis for a restoration programme initiated in 1998.

Campaigns at *Băniștea* in 1960-61 and at *Luncani* in 1950-52 were not followed up with restoration work, and as a result there was some damage from earth slippage. Excavation projects in advance of restoration have recently begun at both sites.

There were extensive conservation and restoration programmes at *Blidaru* in 1981-85 and at *Cet••uie* in 1981-86, involving consolidation of walls and insertion of drainage in lower-lying parts of the site, but much remains to be done at *Blidaru* to prevent further degradation.

#### *Authenticity*

The fortresses were destroyed by the Romans in AD 106 and the sites were never reoccupied. As a result the authenticity of the remains is total. There has been a certain amount of modern intervention, in the form of the replacement of architectural elements that had deteriorated and the insertion of modern wooden uprights to indicate where ancient columns had decayed. However, the overall authenticity of the ensemble of sites is very high.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission is to visit all the properties that comprise this nomination in May 1999.

#### *Qualities*

The Geto-Dacian civilization that developed outside the Greco-Roman world in the later 1st millennium BC achieved a remarkably high cultural and economic level that made its eventual conquest by the Romans inevitable at the beginning of the 2nd century AD. The strength and structure of this civilization is admirably illustrated by this series of fortresses, and in particular by the capital proto-city, *Sarmizegetusa*.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The only comparable Late Iron Age civilizations are those of the Celtic peoples of Central Europe and Gaul. However, none of these exhibits so well planned and executed a defensive ensemble as that of the Dacian fortresses that are the subject of this nomination.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

[To await mission report]

### **Brief description**

The Dacian fortresses are a remarkable group of Iron Age defensive works created in the 1st centuries BC and AD as protection against Roman conquest. The extensive and well preserved remains on spectacular natural sites present a dramatic picture of a vigorous and innovative Iron Age civilization.

### **Recommendation**

That (subject to a favourable mission report) this group of properties be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii, iii, and iv*:

*Criterion ii* The Dacian fortresses represent the fusion of techniques and concepts of military architecture from inside and outside the classical world to create a unique style.

*Criterion iii* The Geto-Dacian kingdoms of the late 1st millennium BC attained an exceptionally high cultural and socio-economic level, and this is symbolized by this group of fortresses.

*Criterion iv* The hill-fort and its evolved successor, the *oppidum*, were characteristic of the Late Iron Age in Europe, and the Dacian fortresses are outstanding examples of this type of defended site.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Brimstone Hill (St Kitts/Nevis)

No 910

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Brimstone Hill Fortress National Park
<i>Location</i>	Parish of St Thomas, St Christopher (St Kitts)
<i>State Party</i>	Saint Christopher and Nevis
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Brimstone Hill Fortress is of historical, cultural, and architectural significance - a monument to the ingenuity of the British military engineers who designed it and supervised its construction and to the skill, strength, and endurance of the African slaves who built and maintained it.

The Brimstone Hill Fortress National Park is worthy of inscription on the World Heritage List for the following reasons:

- Adapting classical 17th and 18th century European fortification design to the construction of an extensive and self-contained military complex on the steep slopes and the top of a jagged arid hill some 230m high is a marvellous feat of engineering.
- In some of its architectural features, notably the Citadel, are expressed elements of different stages of fortress design.
- It is an embodiment of European imperialism, the enslavement of Africans, and the emergence of a distinctive Caribbean culture.
- It is indicative of the competition for power and wealth at a crucial stage in world history.
- It provides a medium by and through which the geology, ecology, and history of the Caribbean can be understood.
- As managed, in accordance with established criteria, by a competent local organization on behalf of the people of a young nation, the majority of whose citizens are descended from former slaves, it is a symbol of the endurance of a colonized African people and of the integrity of Caribbean culture, and as such it can be an inspiration to other young nations in a post-colonial era.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

Known as Liamuiga (Fertile Island) to the native Amerindians, St Kitts was the first Caribbean island to be permanently settled by both the English (in 1623) and the French (1625), who shared it between 1627 and 1713, when it came under sole English control through the Treaty of Utrecht, at the end of the War of the Spanish Succession. Known as the "Mother Island," it provided the model and the springboard for English and French colonization in the Caribbean.

African slaves were brought in from the earliest years of European settlement, and it was on St Kitts and the other early colonies that the plantation system, based on sugar production and slavery, had its roots. Some syncretic forms that combine elements of the cultures of Europe, Africa, and - to a lesser extent - Native America, can be traced to St Kitts.

The military use of Brimstone Hill began in 1690, when the British mounted cannon on the north-west side to drive the French from Fort Charles, just below the hill. It became a place of refuge in the event of invasion, as, for example, when the French invaded in 1706.

In 1782 the Fortress was besieged by the French, to whom it was surrendered after holding out for a month. However, in the same year the British won a resounding naval victory over the French at the Battle of the Saints, thereby establishing British naval superiority. The Treaty of Versailles in 1783 (which granted independence to the thirteen colonies in North America) restored the island to the British and a period of intensive reconstruction and investment began. Because of its reconstructed and very formidable defences, St Kitts became known as the "Gibraltar of the Caribbean." It successfully drove off an attack by the French navy in 1806. From this time onwards the British navy was able to ensure the security of its island colonies in the Caribbean.

The fortress was abandoned as a result of British defence cuts in 1853. The wooden buildings were auctioned and dismantled and masonry buildings were plundered for their cut stone; natural vegetation progressively took over.

#### *Description*

Brimstone Hill is an twin-peaked upthrust of volcanic rock 230m high, clad with limestone over much of its surface. It is covered with scrub, with patches of bare rock in places; the more sheltered areas and ravines are covered with large trees and dense undergrowth.

Unlike the Spanish Caribbean fortresses, Brimstone Hill was not constructed to protect a harbour or important town. Its role was to protect that part of the coast of the island settled by the English against attack from the sea, and also to provide a place of refuge in case of invasion, until the Royal Navy could secure the surrounding waters and force the

surrender of the invading land army. As such it is strategically distinct from the Spanish fortresses.

The structures are on different levels on the upper third of the hill. They consist of a series of discontinuous masonry walls, four defensive bastions, a citadel on the northern of the twin summits, and a series of barracks, magazines, water catchments, cisterns, and other military buildings, now in a ruinous state. The various components are linked by branches of the military road, which enters the complex from the north.

The principal structural material was dressed stone (basalt) blocks, with a rubble core. Unlike the Spanish forts, those built by the British were not faced with stucco. However, the local limestone was used as a decorative element for quoining and facing round doorways and embrasures.

On entering the Fortress, the first structure is the *Barrier Redoubt*, with defensive walls and a small casemate that served as a guardroom and powder magazine. Next comes the *North-West Work*, which incorporates the stout Magazine Bastion with its associated water catchment and cistern.

This is linked by a curtain wall to the *South-East Work*, the main feature of which is the Orillon Bastion, the counterpart to the Magazine Bastion. A prominent feature here is the bombproof Ordnance Storehouse. The hospital was located within this bastion, but only its foundations survive. Outside the wall there is a small cemetery with tombstones.

Behind the defensive line formed by the North-West and South-East Works and at a higher level is the massive *Prince of Wales Bastion*. Within its walls are situated a cistern, a magazine, and a guardroom (now adapted for use as a small conference centre) with underground storeroom. This has been restored with great care and accuracy.

There is an impressive row of colonnaded basements of the *Infantry Officers' Quarters* nearby. The wooden upper storeys were destroyed by a hurricane in 1844 and replaced by smaller stone structures, only one of which survives, in reconstructed form. These face the *Grand Water Catchment System*, consisting of a paved catchment area covering more than 150m<sup>2</sup>, three underground water cisterns, and an open tank, capable of storing over 400,000 litres of water.

No more than some ruined walls of the *Artillery Officers' Quarters* survive, but the kitchen has been restored. In the Commissariat Yard the *Warrant Officers' Quarters* and the *Commissariat Storehouse* have been reconstructed and are now used as an interpretation centre and gift shop.

The system of walls known as the *North-East Work* has several barrack blocks behind it, but they are still unrestored. Archaeological excavations have taken place with a view to eventual reconstruction.

The heart of the Fortress is *Fort George*, the massive masonry structure on one of the twin peaks that dominate the complex, still in an excellent state of repair. It is the earliest surviving British example of the type of fortification known as the "Polygonal System," and one of the finest examples known anywhere in the world. Together with two associated parade grounds, this is usually known as the Citadel. A series of rooms is grouped around a central courtyard; seven of these have been restored and now house the museum. There is a large cistern below the floor of one of the rooms which is still in use as the main source of water for the National Park.

There are many other ruined structures within the walls and on the slopes outside.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

The 15.37ha of the Brimstone Hill Fortress is a National Park as defined in the National Conservation and Environment Act 1987.

### Management

The property is owned by the Federation of St Christopher and Nevis.

It is covered by the 1998 draft National Physical Development and Planning Act for St Kitts, undertaken with technical assistance from the United Nations Centre for Human Settlements and the United Nations Development Programme. The Act specifies the following conditions regarding the Park:

- Provision of protection and enhancement of the National Park in order to ensure that it continues to make an invaluable contribution to the aesthetic qualities of the landscape;
- Establishment of a 1-mile (1.6km) buffer zone around Brimstone Hill;
- Preparation and implementation of a detailed National Park management plan;
- Ensuring by design and development control that land-use development on the adjoining areas is compatible with the Park development objectives.

The 1987 Act assigns to the Brimstone Hill National Park Society "the power to make and enforce regulations for [its] management and administration." The Society is a voluntary organization, registered as a non-profit-making company. Policy decisions are taken by its Council of Management, which is composed of representatives elected by its members with two Government nominees.

In the 1960s, after its foundation as the Society for the Restoration of Brimstone Hill, the Society's income was derived from membership subscriptions, private donations, and government subventions. In the two succeeding decades it received grants from the Canadian Development Agency, the Organization of American States, and in particular from the British Development Division. In the mid 1990s assistance was also obtained from the UNDP, the Mukti Fund, and the French Mission, and since that time most project funds have been generated by admission fees (which were doubled in 1994). The Government continues to provide free electricity, duty concessions on imported materials and supplies, and maintenance of the road to the Fortress.

The headquarters of the Society is in Basseterre, where the President and General Manager are located. Technical assistance comes from the Government, local professionals, and experts from overseas (North America, Venezuela, and the United Kingdom). There is a Park Manager on site, with a staff of fourteen. Senior Park staff carry out periodic monitoring, assisted by two full-time security personnel.

A draft Management Plan for 1997-99 includes a phased programme of restoration and stabilization, ground clearance, reconstruction and new construction, infrastructural development, interpretation, archaeological investigation, museum development, furnishing, promotion, operations, entertainment, personnel, revision of membership structure, and approaches to Government. This is accompanied by a detailed budget.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

There was a programme of selective brush cutting by the Government between 1900 and 1929, but the rehabilitation of the monument began in 1965, when the Society for the Restoration of Brimstone Hill was set up and leased the site from the Government. Work concentrated first on the clearance of vegetation from selected walls and the stabilization of some of the main structures. With technical assistance from the UK and the USA, reconstruction projects were initiated when these were needed for the provision of visitor and staff facilities.

### *Authenticity*

As an historic military defensive ensemble the Fortress possesses a high level of authenticity. Stabilization, restoration, and reconstruction projects carried out since 1965 have involved the discreet use of modern materials, usually in combination with traditional materials. Portland cement has been used for the preparation of mortars, but mixed with lime in recommended proportions. New stone has been used in reconstructions, but worked using traditional techniques. Where wood has been used for reconstructions, it has not always proved possible to obtain the original timbers, but care has been taken to apply authentic dimensions and wood-working techniques.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Brimstone Hill in February 1999.

### *Qualities*

Brimstone Hill Fortress is an outstanding example of 17th and 18th century European military engineering in a Caribbean context and on a commanding natural site.

### *Comparative analysis*

Brimstone Hill was among the fortified sites in the Caribbean region studied by the Expert Meeting on this subject organized by Colcultura and UNESCO and held at Cartagena de Indias (Colombia) in July/August 1996. Its special multi-ethnic background (Amerindian, English, French, African) was identified as an outstanding quality, along with the fact that it was the first English colony established in the Caribbean. It was one of five major fortresses that were singled out for special mention: the others were Shirley Heights (Antigua, 1786-93), The Garrison, Bridgetown (Barbados, 1650-1750), The Cabrits (Dominica, 1770-1815), and Fort Rodney, Pigeon Island (St Lucia, 1778-1824). All were built by the British, but all except The Garrison (which is less completely preserved than Brimstone Hill) are significantly later in date than Brimstone

Hill. The Cabrits and Fort Rodney served a strategic purpose analogous with that of Brimstone Hill, serving as both fortresses and refuge points.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

As visitor numbers grow, two problems will have to be faced by the Park management. First, there will inevitably be greater wear-and-tear on the monuments themselves, which will increase the level of maintenance required. Secondly, it will become necessary to make alternative provision for access and parking. At the present time cars are parked on the Parade Ground. This necessitates passing through the narrow gateway and driving up the equally narrow roadway, neither of which can be widened without an adverse impact on the authenticity of the property. Consideration must be given to the eventual provision of a shuttle service for visitors, thereby reducing the threat to the site.

These provisions should be incorporated into the draft Management Plan for the National Park. It is essential also that the National Development and Planning Act should be approved and implemented without further delay, so as to provide the legislative framework for all future activities at Brimstone Hill.

According to the land-use plan accompanying the nomination, land to the east of and behind Brimstone Hill, at present forested and used for pasture, is zoned for low-density tourist facilities (restaurants, small houses, etc). ICOMOS feels that this proposal should be reconsidered, since its present condition contributes significantly to the picturesque background of the monument.

## Brief description

Brimstone Hill is an outstanding example of the application of the principles of 17th and 18th century military architecture in a Caribbean context. It is of especial interest since it represents an exclusively British solution, the choice of prominent natural features as the sites of fortresses that served both as defensive works and places of refuge.

## Recommendation

That this nomination should be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting information on the progress of the draft National Development and Planning Act. In the event that assurances are received that it will be enacted and implemented by the end of 1999, ICOMOS recommends that this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and iv*:

**Criterion iii** Brimstone Hill is an outstanding British fortress, built by slave labour to exact standards during a peak period of European colonial expansion in the Caribbean.

**Criterion iv** Because of its strategic layout and construction, Brimstone Hill Fortress is an exceptional and well preserved example of 17th and 18th century British military architecture.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Sterkfontein (South Africa)

No 915

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Fossil Hominid Sites of Sterkfontein, Swartkrans, Kromdraai and Environs
<i>Location</i>	Gauteng, North West Province
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of South Africa
<i>Date</i>	16 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Sterkfontein Valley landscape comprises a number of fossil-bearing cave deposits which are considered to be of outstanding universal value, because they encapsulate a superbly preserved record of the fauna, including an invaluable record of the stages in the emergence and evolution of humanity, over the past 3.5 million years. This makes it, without doubt, one of the world's most important sites for human evolutionary studies and researches.

For over sixty years the sites in the Sterkfontein area (of which there are twelve main and many subsidiary sites) have played a most important role in the establishment of Africa as the cradle of mankind. The juvenile status of the Taung child skull and some other factors militated against the acceptance by anthropologists that the species represented had any relevance to the origin and evolution of mankind. It was not until adult specimens started to emerge from Sterkfontein from 1936 onwards, and especially after World War II with the resumption of excavation at Sterkfontein by R Broom and J T Robinson, and the initiation of a new phase of excavation by P V Tobias with A R Hughes and R J Clarke, that the crucial clinching evidence was presented to the world of science. Above all, historically, it was the skulls and teeth and postcranial bones from Sterkfontein that established the truth of Dart's (1925) claim that these upright, small-brained creatures with small canine teeth were primates which were knocking upon the door of humanity.

It was the Sterkfontein adult specimens that finally converted the opponents of this view and permitted the conclusion to be drawn that *Australopithecus* could legitimately be regarded as a member of the Hominidae (the family of humans). Moreover, it was these southern African fossils (which were discovered earlier than the finds in East Africa) that helped to establish Africa rather than Asia as the cradle of mankind, as Charles Darwin had predicted in his 1871 work, *The Descent of Man*.

Hence, from both an historical and an heuristic point of view, the Sterkfontein discoveries gave rise to major advances, factually and conceptually, in the understanding

of the time, place, and mode of evolution of the human family. This seminal role continued to the present with the excavation and analysis of more specimens, representing not only the skull, endocranial casts, and teeth, but also the bones of the vertebral column, the shoulder girdle and upper limb, and the pelvic girdle and lower limb. The Sterkfontein assemblage of fossils has made it possible for palaeoanthropologists to study not merely individual and isolated specimens, but populations of early hominids, from the points of view of their demography, variability, growth and development, functioning and behaviour, ecology, taphonomy, and palaeopathology.

The cave sites of the Sterkfontein Valley represent the combined works of nature and of man, in that they contain an exceptional record of early stages of hominid evolution, of mammalian evolution, and of hominid cultural evolution. They include in the deposits from 2.0 million years onwards *in situ* archaeological remains which are of outstanding universal value from especially the anthropological point of view.

If the Sterkfontein Valley landscape is considered as a cultural property, under the definitions of the World Heritage Guidelines, it is submitted that these cave sites are of outstanding universal value from the point of view of science, archaeology, and anthropology. They contain exceptional testimony to significant stages in human prehistory and to the development of cultural traditions. Further, they fulfil the criteria and test of authenticity under Section 24(a) (iv) of the *Operational Guidelines* as "an outstanding example of a landscape which illustrates significant stages in human history."

As a cultural property, the distinctive character and components reside in:

- i the concentration of a number of different sites in a relatively small area, sites that differ in their geological ages, hominid contents, and palaeoecology;
- ii the duration of the evolutionary stages represented in this one small area and even within a single cave formation (Sterkfontein);
- iii the historical significance of the finds made before and after World War II (in the case of Sterkfontein) and since 1948 (in the case of Swartkrans), finds which provided the worlds of science with fossil evidence that convinced scientists that archaic hominids who lived in Africa marked the first emergence on the planet of the hominid family;
- iv the revelation that some of the early hominids (the robust australopithecines from Kromdraai and Swartkrans) had developed specialized features which seemingly removed them from being on the lineage of later forms of man - a concept which, although commonplace for other mammals, had not up until the time of Robert Broom's discovery of the Kromdraai robust form in 1938 and of the Swartkrans robust form from 1948 onwards been applied validly to hominid evolution.

For these reasons, the Sterkfontein Valley Sites meet the criteria for a cultural property.

[Note The State Party does not make any proposals as regards to the criteria under which it considers the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List. However, criteria **iii** and **vi** are implied in the justification.]

## Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

## History and Description

### History

The fossils of the Sterkfontein Valley caves depict South Africa's landscape and fauna 3.5 million years ago. Some of the most important specimens of australopithecines (*Australopithecus (Paranthropus) robustus* and *Australopithecus (Plesianthropus) africanus*), collateral ancestors of modern man, have been discovered in this area. Sterkfontein geologically revealed the earliest record of hominid in southern Africa (close to 3.5 million years ago). It is also historically the earliest discovery of an adult australopithecine in 1936, by Robert Broom, the richest source of fossils of this species and the oldest stone tools recovered (2 to 1.5 million years BP). Specimens of *Homo habilis* have also been found in the breccias of Sterkfontein caves. They are key elements in determining the origin and the evolution of mankind. Their belonging to the lineage that gave birth to *Homo sapiens sapiens* (modern man) was demonstrated by proving that their cranial capacity, their diet, and their upright posture were all indicative of a kinship to modern man. Stone and bone tools, dating to around 2 to 1.5 million years BP, have been brought to light at Sterkfontein, Kromdraai, and Swartkrans which support this hypothesis.

Evidence for the controlled use of fire has been observed in the Swartkrans cave (1.8 to 1 million years BP), another specific trait of human behaviour. The antiquity of these fossils and their relative position as primates with indisputable hominid traits proclaimed Africa as the cradle of humanity.

### Description

The site proposed is located 45km west of Johannesburg and 5km north of the closest urban centre. A band of dolomites and their associated breccias run through the entire area, creating a hilly terrain. The area is covered mainly by grass, with more dense vegetation along the rivers.

The total area proposed for inscription is c 25,000ha (with a buffer zone of c 28,000ha). The area selected for nomination was determined by the topography, both so as to include potential additional fossil-bearing sites and also to ensure that the visual quality of the landscape as a whole is preserved against incompatible or undesirable intrusions.

The palaeontological and palaeoanthropological sites are a series of caves found in the dolomite band and its associated breccias. Some of them were discovered as a result of lime-mining activities, new discontinued.

Sterkfontein is located on a hill to the south of the Rietspuit river valley, midway in a straight line between Swartkrans (1.2km to the WSW) and Kromdraai (1.6 km to the ENE). These three main cave sites are surrounded by a string of fossil-bearing caves from which, of the nine included in the proposed area, only three (Drimolen, Coopers B, and Gondolin) have so far revealed hominid

remains. Wonder Cave, Gladysvale, Bolt's Farm, Minnaar's Caves, Plover's Lake, and Haasgat have only produced faunal remains but they possess a strong potential for revealing hominid remains.

Sterkfontein has produced some 500 catalogued specimens, most being representative of the *Australopithecus africanus* species (found in Member 4) and some, from more recent deposits, belonging to the species *Australopithecus robustus* and *Homo habilis*. Thousands of stone tools, of the Oldowan (2 million years BP) and Acheulean (1.5 million years BP) industries have been recovered. There are thousands of faunal remains and hundreds of fragments of fossilized wood testifying to the past environment. Very recently the first ever complete *Australopithecus* skeleton has been discovered; this is of great scientific interest, since preliminary tests suggest that it may be of a species other than *A. africanus* or *A. robustus*.

Swartkrans is the greatest source of *Paranthropus crassidens* (robust apeman), and a second species has been found in the same members as *Paranthropus*, thus assumed to be contemporary, which is regarded as *Homo erectus*. It contains the largest collection of *A. robustus* remains. The site also holds an important number of stone and bone tools (nearly 900 dating to 1.8 to 1 million years BP) and the evidence for the controlled use of fire (assumed from the discovery of charred bones). Thousands of faunal remains have been collected.

Kromdraai is the site of the first recognized *A. (Paranthropus) robustus* specimen in 1938. Kromdraai A brought to light essentially tools and fossil fauna, whilst Kromdraai B revealed more specimens of *A. robustus*.

Close by Kromdraai, the excavations in 1938 and 1939 in the breccias of Cooper's Caves revealed the presence of australopithecine remains and of non-hominid remains.

Just south of Swartkrans, the Bolt's Farm site has so far only yielded faunal remains. Of the four sites forming the second cluster (Minaars, Plover's Lake, Wonder Cave, and Drimolen) north of the main cluster (Bolt's Farm, Swartkrans, Sterkfontein, Coopers, and Kromdraai), only one (Drimolen) has yielded hominid remains. The latter is the most recently excavated site (1992) with Gondolin. It brought to light the remains of the two youngest *A. robustus*, aged respectively 8 and 12 months, and dating to 2 million years BP.

Three sites are isolated from the main groups of sites (in order from south to north): Gladysvale, Haasgat, and Gondolin. Gladysvale, known to be a rich fossil-bearing site since 1936, revealed hominid remains for the first time in 1992 in the form of teeth and finger bones. Haasgat and Gondolin, two sites found in the North West Province, yielded both faunal remains. In 1997, the site of Gondolin revealed robust australopithecine remains.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

The legal status is not uniform throughout the site. A number of legislative mechanisms control land use, land development, and environment impacts on the area. The present legislation aims at protecting the site and not

managing or developing it. However, the present National Monuments Act (No 28, 1969) is shortly to be replaced by a new National Heritage Act, the objective of which is “to present an integrated holistic heritage structure which will coordinate the expressions of the living heritage of all who belong to South Africa”; this statute will take account of management and presentation as well as protection. The site also comes within the provisions of the National Environmental Management Act (No 107, 1999), which requires the formulation of management plans and their approval by the governmental Committee of Environmental Coordination.

Swartkrans, Sterkfontein, and Kromdraai and the palaeoanthropological material associated with them are protected by the National Monuments Act. Any interventions to be undertaken in the area, particularly mining activities, are subject to the Minerals Act (No 50, 1991) and the Environment Conservation Act (No 73, 1989), which stipulate that environmental impact assessments must be carried out before any major construction work is started.

The local provincial authorities are strengthening their control on local planning and development strategies, through Land Development Objectives, as provided for in the Development Facilitation Act (No 67, 1995) which would supplement the already existing national acts on development. These objectives encourage agricultural, recreational, and tourism-related activities. They also preserve and protect the site from any urban spread and harmful land use. The Draft Gauteng Development Planning Bill incorporates Land Development Objectives in the form of “local development plans” (see below).

In addition to these legislative controls, many landowners in the area implement their own management and conservation plans. The commitment of local landowners to conservation is also demonstrated by the many Natural Heritage Sites registered in the area. In this situation, private landowners apply to the Department of Environment and Tourism for their land to be registered. This status is conditional upon the owner agreeing that no destruction or degrading will be done by him and that he will report any infractions to the relevant authorities.

The Gauteng Draft Development Bill, in the process of being drawn up, aims at providing the Province with a single system of development planning. The nominated area would be specifically dealt with as a World Heritage Site, giving it a defined management strategy, a unique overall protection, and an administrative body responsible for its promotion, protection, and management.

#### *Management*

Some 98% of the land is in private ownership. Of the remaining 2%, the State owns 8ha and the rest, essentially the Nature Reserve on which the Sterkfontein Caves are located and the farm where Swartkrans is situated, are owned by the University of the Witwatersrand.

Until the administrative body provided by the new Gauteng Draft Development Planning Bill is established, the Gauteng Province Departments of Agriculture, Conservation and Environment, of Sports, Recreation, Arts and Culture, of Finance and Economic Affairs are responsible for the management mechanisms and day-to-day management of the site. Following approval of the

Planning Bill, the Gauteng Province will then continue to coordinate the activities of the Board.

An interim management plan has been drawn up and became effective in December 1998, concurrent with the draft legislation. The plan will focus on protecting known and future sites, on ensuring that the present uses of the land will continue without threatening the site in its landscape or its intrinsic nature, and on increasing public access. A programme for the continuous monitoring of the state of conservation of the site will be an essential component of the overall management plan. This will involve the staff unit that is to be appointed, and institutions such as the University of the Witwatersrand and Transvaal Museum will provide scientific inputs.

There are currently no staff responsible solely for the maintenance and management of the site. A Staff Unit is planned to be set up in the Planning Bill. The university and museum will continue managing all scientific aspects.

Tourism is an essential aspect of the development of the site. Already some 75,000 visitors annually visit Sterkfontein on horseback or on nature trails, for its gold mines, the oldest in the region, its game reserve, and its unique scenery. Public access is a subject of considerable debate at the present time.

The site is not easily accessible. There are few major highways, and mainly dirt roads lead to the area. Road improvements are thus considered a priority for the development of tourism and for the proper management of the site.

Agriculture and reserve-related activities are predominant on the site, accompanied by some light industrial and commercial activities. These are small in scale and are not considered to threaten the integrity of the park.

The main threat to the site comes from urban development, with Krugersdorp expanding northwards and approaching to less than 5km and Randburg expanding to the northwest to 15km from the boundaries of the site. This threat is considered to be very serious by the authorities and plans to regulate urban development and zoning are in preparation.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

It is inappropriate to examine this group of fossil hominid sites in conventional conservation terms, since their significance results essentially from investigations leading to the removal of scientific specimens. Instead, the history of excavation at each will be summarized briefly.

At *Sterkfontein* the fossil-bearing breccias were first discovered during quarrying for lime in the 1890s. It was not until the late 1930s that the search began in earnest for faunal and hominid fossils. Work ceased during World War II and was resumed in 1947-49. Following a short phase of work in 1956-58, P V Tobias began his present long-term investigation in 1966.

It seems likely that the potential of the *Swartkrans* site was first recognized in 1936, but no work was carried out there until 1948. This continued until 1953, and there was a

further phase of investigations between 1965 and 1992, headed by C K Brain.

Specimens were collected from the breccias at *Kromdaai* and sent to London for examination, but the bones were not extracted from them for over sixty years, when they were “rediscovered” by L S B Leakey. However, work was carried out there intermittently from 1938 until the 1990s.

The first significant fossil was discovered at *Coopers B* in lime-working dumps in the late 1930s. However, despite several campaigns of excavation, the second hominid fossil was not identified until 1989. Plans are in hand for a further excavation campaign.

The important *Drimolen* site, which is especially rich in hominid fossils, was not discovered until 1992, by A W Keyser, who has been excavating it since that time.

The first discoveries were made at *Gladysvale* in the late 1940s. Systematic studies have been in progress since 1993, by a joint South African-Swiss university team.

Sporadic investigations at *Bolt's Farm* since World War II have produced considerable mammalian fossils but so far no hominid remains. There has so far been no systematic excavation there. Similarly, *Haasgat* and *Plover's Lake*, which were intensively excavated in the late 1980s and early 1990s, have so far failed to yield any hominid fossils.

*Gondolin* produced a substantial mammalian fauna during excavations in 1979, but it was not until the present excavations, begun in 1997, that australopithecine fossils came to light

#### *Authenticity*

Authenticity is similarly a concept that is not applicable to fossil sites of this kind. It might be more appropriate to evaluate them in terms of their integrity, as in the case of properties considered under the natural criteria. The breccias from which this wealth of fossils derive are intact and undisturbed. They are no longer being exploited for their minerals and the livestock farming and game ranching that are still being carried out there have no impact on the fossil-bearing deposits. The integrity of the nominated sites may therefore be deemed to be total. The entire landscape also has a high level of authenticity and/or integrity, for the same reasons: indeed, the landscape supports a domestic fauna in the same way that wild beasts grazed it in prehistoric times.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the sites in January 1999.

##### *Qualities*

This group of sites is one of the most important in the world for an understanding of the evolution of modern man (*Homo sapiens sapiens*) from his ancestors. They have produced a wealth of hominid fossils, the oldest dated to some 3.5 million years ago, along with their tools and with fossils of the contemporary fauna. Investigations over the past sixty years have played a crucial role in establishing Africa as the cradle of mankind. The potential for further significant discoveries is enormous.

#### *Comparative analysis*

The comparative study of *Potential fossil hominid sites for inscription on the World Heritage List* prepared by two leading human palaeontologists for ICOMOS in 1997 establishes six criteria for evaluating such sites: good chronologies; number of fossils; antiquity of finds; potential for further finds; groups of closely related sites; and discovery and demonstration of human evolution. It divides human evolution into four periods, the earliest of which is from 5 million to 1 million years BP.

The authors of the study consider that the Sterkfontein Valley scores very highly under all of these criteria and that it is worthy of inscription on the World Heritage List.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The size of the nominated area and its associated buffer zone is a challenge to manage. The situation is made more complex because of the multiple and diverse number of stakeholders involved – landowners, local, provincial, and national administrations, scientific institutions, etc.

The State Party has addressed the major problems the site will face in the near and distant future in the eventuality of its nomination on the World Heritage List. The urban expansion of the neighbouring settlements constitute the major threat to the integrity of the site. Since most of the lots that make up the nominated area and buffer zone are privately owned, it is essential for the State Party to ensure that there is strict control on land-use, on zoning, and on visitor control and management. The fragility of the fossil hominid sites requires there to be special controls over access to them, so as to avoid destruction to important scientific data as a result of over-visiting.

Associated with this aspect of the site is the current appearance of several of the fossil sites. Bolt's Farm, Drimolen, and Gladysvale are in a sorry state. ICOMOS does not advocate backfilling, but suggests that the condition of the sites should be improved, so as to prevent further erosion of the breccias.

The nomination refers specifically to the fossil hominid sites. However, ICOMOS feels that the nominated property has another important quality. Archaeological investigations have shown that the area was continuously occupied by *Homo sapiens sapiens* until around 20,000 BP, that is, from the Lower Palaeolithic to the Neolithic. Much of the contemporary landscape has remained unchanged since that time, and ICOMOS feels that this should be given prominence in the public presentation of the site.

The ICOMOS mission was concerned about the proposed buffer zone. Whilst it is suitably large, attention needs to be given to the extension of its boundaries at several vulnerable points, so as to prevent encroachments, such as that of the so far unauthorized Letarno housing project and that for a casino.

All these comments relate to one specific recommendation. It is imperative that a definitive management and conservation plan for the entire site should be produced with the minimum of delay.

**Brief description**

The many caves in the Sterkfontein Valley have produced abundant scientific information on the evolution of modern man over the past 3.5 million years, on his way of life, and on the animals with and upon which he lived. The contemporary landscape also preserves many features of that of prehistoric man.

**Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria iii and vi*:

The Sterkfontein area contains an exceptionally large and scientifically significant group of sites which throw light on the earliest ancestors of humankind. They constitute a vast reserve of scientific information, the potential of which is enormous.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Robben Island (South Africa)

No 916

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Robben Island
<i>Location</i>	Western Cape Province
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of South Africa
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

*Robben Island – from incarceration to liberation, from the punishment of the body to the freedom of the spirit.*

Robben Island has a well documented history that dates back to 1488 according to written sources, although occupancy by early Stone Age inhabitants may well be possible, owing to the early link with the South African mainland. This is to be confirmed by archaeological excavation.

The physical remains of the long history of banishment, imprisonment, and human suffering are well documented and are visible through the memories of both residents who are still living as well as in written and graphic sources. The structures on Robben Island date from the earliest occupation by the Dutch colonists, the English occupation with its churches and institutions built to house lepers and the mentally ill, as well as the military installations of World War II, and finally the structures associated with the more recent occupancy by the prison. These structures represent a period of unbroken human habitation from the second half of the 17th century to the present day.

These buildings and structures represent evidence of a society that played a significant role in the development of the southern African region and its links to the “civilized” worlds of Europe and the east. This society has long since disappeared and the remnants on Robben Island, being typical examples of their time, are the only remaining examples still in existence. The more recent buildings are unique in that they represent a time in history that has gained universal symbolism while the residents (the former political prisoners) are still alive. The closeness of this history makes Robben Island and its associated prison structures unique in this international context.

### Criterion iii

Robben Island is of universal value for the following reasons. “Robben Island is a vital part of South Africa’s collective heritage. How do we reflect the fact that the people of South Africa as a whole, together with the international community, turned one of the world’s most notorious symbols of the resistance of oppression into a world-wide icon of the universality of human rights, of hope, peace, and

reconciliation?” (President Nelson Mandela, Heritage Day, 24 September 1997, Robben Island).

Robben Island has come to represent an outstanding example of a symbol representing the physical embodiment of the triumph of the human spirit over enormous adversity and hardship. The role of Robben Island in the transformation of an oppressed society has come to symbolize the rebirth of democracy in South Africa, a country which has come to be viewed as a unique example of transformation in a world troubled by political uncertainty. **Criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

It is possible that Robben Island (often known simply as “The Island”) was occupied by humans before the arrival of the Europeans, since it is the summit of a submerged mountain, linked by an undersea saddle to the coast of Table Bay.

The Cape Peninsula, with Robben Island, fell halfway on sea voyages between Europe and the Orient. The first Europeans to land there were probably members of Vasco de Gama’s fleet, who stopped there in 1498 in search of shelter and supplies. They were followed by a growing number of European ships in the next two centuries, since it offered food, drinkable water, and security from attack by the indigenous people of the Cape.

The Dutch East India Company (VOC) first became aware of the potential of the Cape of Good Hope in the mid 17th century, and in 1657 Jan van Riebeeck set up a colony there, formed of VOC officials and free burghers. They were joined in 1688 by French Huguenots following the revocation of the Edict of Nantes by Louis XIV. The colonists began a vigorous policy of enslavement of the indigenous peoples and brought them there from other parts of Africa; the population was also augmented with Muslims deported from the East Indies and elsewhere in the Orient.

The potential of Robben Island as a prison was quickly realized by van Riebeeck. First, slaves and prisoners of war were sent there, to cut stone and burn seashells for lime for building the settlement of Cape Town, and they were joined later by others – convicted VOC soldiers and sailors, disaffected Khoisan indigenous people from the mainland, and political and religious (Moslem) leaders from the East Indies.

When the Cape was captured by the British from the Dutch in 1795 and again in 1806, they continued to use the Island as a prison, for military prisoners (mostly white), political prisoners, and criminals (mostly black). A tenth of the prisoners were women, but they were transferred in 1835 to a Cape Town prison. The Island prison was closed in 1846 and a General Infirmary was established, to receive chronically sick, insane, and lepers and relieve pressure on mainland hospitals. (However, the Island was still used on occasion by the British as a secure place of exile for important political

prisoners.) The management of the General Infirmary and the care it provided for its patients (who were racially segregated from the 1860s) were of a low order, and the establishment on the mainland of specialized hospitals for the mentally disturbed and the chronically sick, catering for middle-class patients, resulted in Robben Island becoming the main leper colony in the Cape, with over a thousand inmates. This was finally to close in 1931.

Plans to turn the Island into a holiday resort foundered with the approach of World War II, and it was declared to be "reserved for military purposes" in 1936. It became the first point of defence against an attack on Table Bay, equipped with harbour facilities and heavy coastal artillery. After the war it continued in use for training, and in 1951 was taken over by the South African Marine Corps and then the South African Navy.

In 1959 the Island was claimed by the Prisons Department as a maximum security prison for political prisoners sentenced by the Apartheid regime, as well as ordinary criminals, all of them black. The first criminals landed there in 1961, and in the next year they were followed by the first political prisoners. Many were to be sent there in the years that followed, mostly leaders of the African National Congress and Pan African Congress; the most celebrated of the prisoners on Robben Island was Nelson Mandela, who was incarcerated there for some twenty years. During the 1960s and early 1970s the isolation of the Island and the notoriously cruel regime of its staff made it the most feared prison in South Africa. The last political prisoners left the island in 1991 and the prison closed down finally in 1996, and since that time it has been developed as a museum.

#### *Description*

Robben Island is a low-lying rocky outcrop covering 475ha and situated 9.3km north of the mainland. It has a Mediterranean climate, and is exposed to violent winter gales and tides that make its northern and western sides virtually uninhabitable. There is, not surprisingly, a number of historic shipwrecks along this un hospitable coast.

Settlement has concentrated on the southern and eastern coasts of the island. It is characterized by discontinuity, resulting from its episodic history. A determining factor has been the lack of drinking water; that from boreholes is brackish and so rainwater has been collected for drinking.

The earliest features of human occupation are the abandoned quarries for slate (on the south of the island) and limestone (in the centre), which date from the mid 17th century. Limestone is still quarried occasionally for road metalling on the island. No remains survive of the groups of buildings erected in the late 1600s at the northern end of the island, known only from contemporary drawings.

In 1806-8 a new settlement was built at the southern end of the island to accommodate the British prison. This is the nucleus of the existing administrative area, known as "The Village," which houses the Museum with offices, meeting rooms, community facilities, shop, etc. Some of the buildings, such as the clubhouse (formerly the Medical Superintendent's House) of 1840 and the former Anglican parsonage (1846), have retained some good contemporary detailing inside and outside. The Anglican Church, built with convict labour in 1841, is an early example of Cape Gothic style, plastered and painted white on the exterior. It has a

plain interior with a balcony of teak, which was also used for the altar, pulpit, pews, and roof structure.

The small lighthouse on Minto's Hill in the southern part of the island was built in 1864. It is an 18m high round-section masonry tower with a fine cast-iron circular staircase linking the internal floors and the lantern.

Between the village and the harbour slightly to the north known as Murray's Bay there is the small Church of the Good Shepherd (generally known as the Lepers Church), built by the lepers themselves in 1895 to the designs of the distinguished architect Sir Herbert Baker. It is all that remains of the male leper hospital demolished in 1931. It is at present not in use but there are plans to carry out urgent repair work and reconsecrate it for services. Surrounding it are leper graves, now half hidden in the grass.

The present harbour at Murray's Bay was built during World War II, along with extensive fortifications and other military structures, including gun emplacements, underground magazines, observation towers, barracks, and coastal batteries. The military structures here, like those in other parts of the island, are now derelict, as is the airstrip in the centre of the island.

Just to the north of the maximum security prison is the Kramat, a monument built in 1967 on the site where Hadjie Mattarm, a Muslim holy man exiled by the VOC from the East Indies to Robben Island in 1744, was buried. He died in 1755 and his tomb became a place of pilgrimage for the Muslim community of the Cape. It is a simple domed building built in slate from the island.

Construction of the maximum security prison of the Apartheid period began in the 1960s. The buildings are stark and functional, constructed of stone from the island. Outside the main enclosure there are service, storage, and reception buildings.

### **Management and Protection**

#### *Legal status*

The Island is a national monument as defined in the National Monuments Act (No 28 of 1969). Interventions of any kind on national monuments require authorization by the National Monuments Council.

The Cultural Institutions Act (No 29 of 1969) establishes the criteria by which such institutions are created and managed. Robben Island is a declared cultural institution under this statute.

Under the terms of the Environmental Conservation Act (No 73 of 1989), certain infrastructural activities and changes in land use on the island require environmental impact assessments to be carried out.

#### *Management*

The entire Island and all the properties on it are state property, with the exception of the Church of the Good Shepherd and a small area round it, which belongs to the Church of the Province of South Africa. The state also owns a buffer zone consisting of the waters 1 nautical mile around the Island.

The Robben Island Council, established under the provisions of the Cultural Institutions Act, consists of eighteen people

appointed by the Minister of Arts, Culture, Science and Technology; half the members are former political prisoners and half specialists with relevant expertise. It is responsible for policy development and financial issues.

On-site management and conservation are delegated to the Director of the Robben Island Museum. The future development of the Island will be in accordance with the development framework laid out in the Cabinet recommendations of 4 September 1996. This provided for the Island to be “run as a site museum, where the total environment is preserved in an integrated way, in line with modern international conservation approaches ... and the ex-political prison be converted into a Museum of the Freedom Struggle in South Africa.” The Council was required “to initiate a systematic and broadly participative planning process, facilitated by a suitably qualified agency, for the long-term development and multi-purpose use of Robben Island.”

The Island is managed according to a Property Management Agreement between the Museum, the National Monuments Council, and the Department of Public Works. It sets out detailed maintenance schedules relating to the man-made heritage and the natural environment.

An integrated environmental management approach, including an environmental policy, environmental management plan, and environmental management systems, is currently being developed, with the aid of a grant from the Government of Norway. It is to be developed in a series of phases; the first phase, completion of the draft system, is now in place and the entire process will be completed by the end of 2000.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Systematic conservation of the Island as an element of cultural heritage has only begun during the present decade. Before that time, structures were dismantled or allowed to decay into ruins as successive phases in the use of the Island came to an end. Now that it has become a museum, systematic conservation will be implemented under the agreements and plans listed in the preceding section.

### *Authenticity*

Precisely because it has followed a historical trajectory that has involved several changes of use without conscious conservation efforts directed at preservation, the authenticity of the Island is total.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Robben Island in February 1999.

### *Qualities*

The symbolic value of Robben Island lies in its sombre history, as a prison and a hospital for unfortunates who were sequestered as being socially undesirable. This came to an end in the 1990s when the inhumane Apartheid regime was rejected by the South African people and the political

prisoners who had been incarcerated on the Island received their freedom after many years.

### *Comparative analysis*

It is difficult to find an exact parallel for Robben Island among the penitentiary islands of the period of European colonization. Norfolk Island off the coast of Australia was used for criminals transported from Britain in the 19th century, and Devil’s Island off the coast of French Guyana served a similar purpose, whilst the island of Alcatraz in San Francisco Bay is the archetypal convict island, but none of these filled the political role of Robben Island under Dutch and British colonial rule, and in particular in the later 20th century (the imprisonment of Alfred Dreyfus on Devil’s Island was an isolated political act). The early history of St Helena as a stop-off point for ships travelling between Europe and the Orient paralleled that of the Island, but it was only once used to house a political prisoner, albeit one of the most illustrious.

### *ICOMOS comments*

The ICOMOS mission report commented on the state of conservation of certain structures that were referred to only summarily in the nomination dossier.

The Old Jail, which is one of the most important landmarks in the recent history of Robben Island, known to the prisoners as the “hell hole,” is scarcely mentioned in the dossier. It appears to have been completely neglected and is in a dilapidated state.

In the New Jail, the A and C Sections are both in a very bad state of repair, with badly cracked walls, collapsing ceilings, and corroded metalwork. This is in accordance with the stated policy of maintaining “the exact state as it was found when transfer from the Department of Correctional Services to the newly established Robben Island Museum took place.” The intended “air of abandonment and hopelessness” has without doubt been achieved, but without some conservation interventions the decay can only continue, with the result that the entire structures will eventually collapse.

So far as the B Section, where the leading political prisoners were confined, is concerned, it is stated that it “should be presented as it was during the height of its occupation by South Africa’s most famous political prisoners.” It is arguable that this is in fact not the case, since certain changes made after the departure of the political prisoners, such as repainting in colour of walls originally in “prison grey.” It is understood that this section was originally U-shaped in plan, but sections of the walls have been blocked, giving a different appearance.

ICOMOS is most concerned about the criteria proposed for inscription. There can be no reservations about the application of criterion vi: the associative and symbolic significance of Robben Island is comparable with that of the Auschwitz concentration camp (Poland) or the Ile de Gorée (Sénégal), both of which were inscribed on the World Heritage List under this criterion alone. However, since the 20th Session of the World Heritage Committee in Mérida (Mexico) in December 1996, criterion vi “should justify inclusion on the List only in exceptional circumstances and in conjunction with other criteria cultural or natural” (*Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*, paragraph 24.a).

In its justification, the State Party also proposes inscription under criterion iii, claiming that “The structures on Robben Island ... represent a period of unbroken human occupation from the second half of the 17th century until the present day.” Whilst ICOMOS does not dispute this statement, it is not confident that the properties in question wholly conform with the underlying basic criterion in the Convention of “outstanding universal value” in this instance.

In order to ensure that Robben Island is inscribed on the World Heritage List, ICOMOS would reluctantly agree to formulate a somewhat “cosmetic” citation under criterion iii. However, it feels that this may be a case that should be given earnest consideration as part of the study currently under way of the definition and application of criteria i and vi.

#### **Brief description**

Robben Island was used at various times between the 17th century and the 20th century as a prison, a hospital for socially unacceptable groups, and a military base. Its buildings, and in particular those of the late 20th century maximum security prison for political prisoners, testify to the way in which democracy and freedom triumphed over oppression and racialism.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *critterion vi*:

*Criterion vi* Robben Island and its prison buildings symbolize the triumph of the human spirit, of freedom, and of democracy over oppression.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## San Cristóbal de la Laguna (Spain)

No 929

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	San Cristóbal de la Laguna
<i>Location</i>	District of Santa Cruz de Tenerife, Autonomous Community of the Canaries
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The historic ensemble of San Cristóbal de la Laguna has outstanding universal value as an urban design. It is an historic ensemble which represents the concept of the “town-territory” as the first example of an unfortified town laid out and built according to a complete plan based on navigation, the science of the time, and as the organized space of a new peaceful social order inspired by the millenary religious concepts of the year 1500.

According to this, verifications of measurements and processes used are fundamental elements, together with the meanings implicit in the selected dimensions and in the formal relationships established between the urban spaces and elements.

The formal image of this structure corresponds with a constellation of points which marks the special positions of the urban plan and the relationships between certain of them and the whole so as to produce a symbolic structure which should be interpreted in a manner similar to that of the marine charts of the period or the celestial constellations.

**Note by ICOMOS** The nomination dossier follows this “Statement of Significance” with 27 pages of “Justification.” For reasons of economy, it is not proposed to set these out in full in this evaluation. The sixteen headings under which the justification is set out are as follows:

1. A town of the time of the Catholic Monarchs (*Los Reyes Católicos*), 1500.
2. The town of a single overlord, the Captain General Alonso Fernandez de Lugo.
3. A colonial town representative of the mission of colonists in a city-republic in a new land.
4. An administrative town which illustrates urban thinking, where the civil powers and the decisions of the Town Council (*Cabildo*) are elements in the process of building the town.
5. The first town of “peace” – an unfortified town.

6. The first example of a city-territory: the predecessor of the American towns.
7. The town as project.
8. Two towns and two times of foundation: the Upper and Lower towns.
9. Form derived from navigation: a circular sphere of impact and a square layout based on axes.
10. A town completely controlled by regulatory measures.
11. The street layout as the basis for the social structure: balanced distribution of all the social classes within the urban fabric.
12. The millenary religious ideas of 1500: reform of the clergy and its expression through the urban fabric.
13. Measurements as symbols: the resurrection and the end of time.
14. A religious axis linking the parish churches.
15. The meaning of San Cristóbal and of La Laguna.
16. The image of the town: the constellation of the points of a navigation chart as the constellation of the heavens.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

San Cristóbal de la Laguna was founded in 1497 by Alonso Fernandez de Lugo. The last town to be established in the Canary Islands (which was the first Spanish overseas territory) takes its name from a shallow lake or marshy area (La Laguna), which was not drained until 1837.

The original settlers, who were almost all soldiers, were not allocated building plots; the non-fortified urban area that was defined was considered to be a public space where anyone could build. As a result small houses were erected around the church of La Concepción in a haphazard fashion, without any overall plan, in the Upper Town (*Villa de Arriba*). However, this situation was regularized in 1502, when a regular town plan based on Leonardo da Vinci’s model for Imola was drawn up by the Captain General (*Adelantado*) for the area between his official residence and the church. Wide major streets (*calles reales*) linked the public open spaces and formed the grid on which smaller streets were superimposed.

The resulting Lower Town (*Villa de Abajo*) expanded rapidly, attracting the island’s ruling classes, and by 1515 had more than a thousand inhabitants. Monastic communities began building early in the 16th century – the Church of Nuestra Señora de los Remedios (1511), the

Hermitage of San Miguel (1506), and the Hospitals of San Sebastián (1506) and Los Dolores (1515).

A piped water supply was installed at the expense of the Town Council (*Cabildo*) in 1521, and the first public buildings were constructed in 1525. The town began to seek official urban status as early as 1514, but this was not granted until 1531. In 1554 the Town Council ordained that any buildings in straw were to be demolished, to lessen the risk of fire, an important precaution, because by that time the population had risen to six thousand, making it the largest town in the Canaries.

San Cristóbal retained this pre-eminent position as the main political, religious, and commercial centre throughout the 17th and 18th centuries, and the prosperity that this brought is to be seen in the buildings from that period. However, the political and economic centre was progressively transferred to Santa Cruz during the 18th century, and as a result San Cristóbal declined, only retaining a significant role in religious and cultural life. A brief political revival following the establishment of the Supreme Council (*Junta Suprema*) of the Canary Islands with its seat in San Cristóbal in 1808 came to an abrupt end when that body fell foul of the Provincial Council (*Diputación Provincial*) based in Santa Cruz de Tenerife five years later and was disbanded.

The 20th century has seen San Cristóbal recovering something of its former role, thanks notably to the prestige of its university.

#### *Description*

San Cristóbal de la Laguna consists of two distinct parts – the Upper Town (*Villa de Arriba*) of 1497 and the Lower Town (*Villa de Abajo*) of 1502. The main street (Calle de la Carrera) forms the axis of the planned town, linking the first parish church with the Plaza del Adelantado. Parallel with it runs the Calle de San Agustín, which forms the geometric centre of the town; it is lined with large houses built by the early merchants in the town. A number of squares open out of it in the regular form derived from Mudéjar models.

The first church, dedicated to the *Conception*, was completely demolished and rebuilt, starting in 1511. It underwent a series of modifications and additions in the succeeding centuries, and its present form reflects that long history in its mixture of styles and uncoordinated structures – tower, baptistery, nave with two side-aisles, chapels, etc. Nearby is what remains of the *Monastery of San Agustín*, founded at the beginning of the 16th century. It has a fine two-storey cloister.

Construction of the new parish church for the Upper Town proceeded slowly, since the Captain General was concentrating on the development of the Lower Town, where work began in 1515 on building its parish church, dedicated to *Los Remedios*. A single-aisled building in Mudéjar style, with a tower added in the 17th century, it later became the cathedral of the new bishopric of Tenerife, established in 1813. The original façade had collapsed and was replaced in Neo-Classical form; extensive remodelling took place in the early 20th century. In its present form it has three aisles with a number of side chapels.

The Dominican *Convent of Santa Catalina de Siena* was inaugurated in 1611 and became so influential that it

absorbed a number of adjoining buildings. The exteriors of the church and other buildings are plain and severe, but the internal decoration is sumptuous.

The small *Ermita de San Miguel* declined sadly after its foundation by the first Adelantado, and was used as a store until in the 1970s the Tenerife Island Council restored it for use as a cultural centre. What remains of the once prosperous mid 16th century *Convent of Santa Clara*, largely destroyed by fire in 1697, is used for a similar purpose.

There is a number of fine former *private residences* in San Cristóbal de la Laguna. Oldest is the Casa del Corregidor (although only the façade in dressed red stone is original), from 1545. It is now used as municipal offices. From the end of the 16th century comes the Casa de Lercaro, with an especially fine Mannerist façade, now the Tenerife historical museum.

The Casa de Alvarado Bracamonte, also known as the House of the Captains General, was built in 1624-31 and was used by successive governors as an office and residence until the 19th century. It has a red stone portal with pilasters, a wrought-iron balcony, and a broken pediment. It now houses the municipal historical and artistic heritage section.

The 17th century Casa de Salazar is very well preserved. Built in 1682, it has a handsome portal in eclectic style, principally Baroque but with some Mannerist and Neo-Classical elements. It now belongs to the bishopric of Tenerife. The Casa de Ossuna is contemporary with the Casa de Salazar; its most striking feature is the long balcony on the first floor of the façade. It is used for the enormous archival collection of San Cristóbal.

Among the fine 18th century buildings are the elegant Casa de Montañés, built as a private residence and now the seat of the Consultative Council of the Autonomous Government of the Canaries, and the L-plan Casa de los Jesuitas, occupied by the Society of Jesus until its expulsion from the Canaries in 1767, when it was taken over by the Royal Society of the Friends of Tenerife (*Sociedad Real Económica de Amigos del País de Tenerife*), which still occupies the premises. The Casa de la Alhóndiga was built at the beginning of the 18th century as a corn market. In the early 19th century it was a French military barracks and it became a district court in the 19th century; it is now used for municipal offices. Of special interest is its monumental portal.

San Cristóbal also has some good 20th century architecture, such as the Palace of Rodríguez de Azero and the Leal Theatre, both fine examples of Eclecticism (the former is now the Casino).

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The Historical Ensemble of San Cristóbal de la Laguna was declared by the Province (*Comunidad Autónoma*) of the Canaries on 28 December 1985 to be a Site of Cultural Interest (*Bien de Interés Cultural*), as defined in the 1985 Law of the Spanish Historical Heritage.

The town has had an Urban Plan (*Plan de Ordenación Urbana* – POU) since 1947, and this was further defined by the General Plan of 1965. A Special Plan for the Internal Reform of the Historic District (*Plan Spécial de Reforma Interior del Casco Histórico* – PERI) was adopted in 1977. However, these were only partially implemented, and so they have been replaced by two recent measures, the Special Plan for Protection and Internal Reform (*Plan Spécial de Protección y Reforma Interior* – PEPRI) and the General Urban Plan (*Plan General de Ordenación Urbana* – PGOU), both of which came into force in 1996. The former deals specifically with the historic core, which is the subject of this nomination, and the latter covers the remainder of the municipality.

The effect of this national, regional, and local legislation is to exercise strict control on all forms of development within the historic core and its buffer zone.

#### *Management*

Responsibility for the protection, control, and inspection of the historic district is shared by the General Directorate of Historic Heritage of the Government of the Canaries (*Dirección General de Patrimonio Histórico del Gobierno de Canarias*) and the Island Council of Tenerife (*Excmo Cabildo Insular de Tenerife*), whilst at the local level this function is exercised by the Town Hall of San Cristóbal de la Laguna (*Excmo Ayuntamiento de San Cristóbal de la Laguna*).

There are management plans in force for three aspects of the work – conservation, restoration and rehabilitation, and promotion. These have resulted in twenty-five projects on major historic buildings in recent years. There is an active promotional programme aimed at heightening community awareness and involvement and improvement of tourist facilities, as part of the celebrations of the town's quincentenary.

#### **Conservation and Authenticity**

##### *Conservation history*

During the early decades of the 20th century many of the traditional buildings underwent significant morphological transformations, especially to roofs and facades. In the 1960s a number of buildings were demolished and replaced by higher modern structures. However, this process was brought to an end by the strict enforcement of the regulations, which had hitherto been largely disregarded. More difficult has been reversal of the degradation of buildings due to neglect on the part of their owners, though the municipality is making vigorous efforts to reverse this trend. It currently has a catalogue of protected monuments and buildings, according to which 71.4% of the buildings are classified as being in a “good” state of repair and preservation.

The regulations and plans currently in force are now being applied rigorously. This policy is greatly assisted by two island-wide programmes. One is a complete survey and inventory of all real estate on Tenerife, which provides data on the desiderata for restoration and rehabilitation. The second is a set of practical recommendations relating to the preservation of movable heritage. Both programmes are being carried out with the support of local non-governmental organizations.

#### *Authenticity*

A living town has a dynamic which results in a continuing process of modification, and this dynamic is in itself an aspect of authenticity. This is well illustrated in San Cristóbal de la Laguna, which has evolved continuously since its foundation five hundred years ago. This can be “read” in its street pattern, its open spaces, and its monuments, which preserve a visible continuity. This results, somewhat paradoxically, from its relative economic backwardness over the past two hundred years, which has prevented the wholesale destruction of much of its designed and built urban fabric. The town therefore has an unassailable authenticity in this respect.

In terms of detail, the authenticity is high. Original facades survive in large numbers, providing an authentic historic streetscape which demonstrates the diverse origins of the town's architecture. Its “transmitted architecture,” combining Islamic and European elements, is original and authentic; it also played a very significant role in the development of architecture in the Spanish New World.

Finally, San Cristóbal de la Laguna has conserved to an unusual degree the authenticity of function of some of its traditional craft quarters. There are concentrations of blacksmiths, shoemakers, braziers, and barbers, for example, to be found in quarters that these trades have occupied since the earliest years of the town.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited San Cristóbal de la Laguna in March 1999.

##### *Qualities*

The historic district of San Cristóbal de la Laguna is an example of innovative urban planning. It is universal testimony to the concept of a “city-territory” and of the design of a city as a project, preserved in its two components, the Upper and Lower Towns.

It is also directly related to a cultural tradition, the surviving tangible and intangible components of which are being preserved by the use of relevant planning and management instruments.

The significance of San Cristóbal de la Laguna in the later development of Spanish colonial towns in Central and South America and their planning is of great cultural significance.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The concept of the “ideal city” developed in Spain in the Middle Ages. It took as its starting point the checkerboard layout attributed to Hippodamos of Miletus, which dominated urban design in the Hellenistic and Roman periods and was extensively described by Vitruvius. This was refined and extended, to include the place of the church in the social and political structure of the late medieval period and the elaborate class structures that developed with feudalism and feudal law.

This concept was formalized and codified from the 14th century onwards. The first opportunity for it to be applied to an entirely new foundation came with the beginning of the Spanish colonial empire, in the 15th century. Because of the

military situation, the first towns to be established on the Canaries were strongly, and it was only with the pacification of the islands that it became possible to realize the ideal unfortified town.

In view of the innovative and unique nature of San Cristóbal de la Laguna, it would seem to be inappropriate to view this nomination in a comparative context.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The ICOMOS mission report made proposals for the slight modification of the boundaries of the nominated property, which have been accepted by the competent authorities. Other proposals that have been accepted relate to the creation of an integrated system for handling infrastructural services (eg electricity cables), pedestrianization of some of the main streets (accompanied by the provision of parking facilities), and investigation of earlier paving systems, now covered, with the object of restoring them.

#### **Brief description**

San Cristóbal de la Laguna has two nuclei, the original unplanned Upper Town and the Lower Town, the first ideal “city-territory,” laid out according to philosophical principles. Its wide streets and open spaces contain a number of fine churches and public and private buildings from the 16th to 18th centuries.

#### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iv*:

*Criteria ii and iv* San Cristóbal de la Laguna was the first non-fortified Spanish colonial town, and its layout provided the model for many colonial towns in the Americas.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Elche (Spain)

No 930

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Palm Grove of Elche and its traditions (the Mystery Play)
<i>Location</i>	Autonomous Community of Valencia
<i>State Party</i>	Spain
<i>Date</i>	30 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

This is the only palm grove of its type anywhere on the European continent, which makes it an exceptional landscape in this geographical context. Arab geographers and European travellers have testified to this exceptional quality throughout history.

In addition to the authentic wild forest, many palm trees are cultivated in gardens, the remains of Arab agriculture established over eight centuries ago on the Iberian peninsula. Archaeological data from the Iberian and Roman periods indicate that these plantations are in fact much older than the Arab palm grove.

There is also what survives of a settlement or an urban plan, which can be seen from the cartography of the region. The central core of the town is surrounded by a series of palm gardens before reaching the rural area proper, where these are more widely scattered, even appearing to be natural woods, without human involvement.

Palms also form an essential component of the culture of Elche, manifesting itself in many ways – the processions on Palm Sunday, the Night of the Kings (Twelfth Night), even the town's coat of arms.

The Elche Mystery Play is the only medieval religious dramatic performance that has taken place without interruption within a Christian church from its origins to the present day, which makes it of special significance in the study of this type of drama.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier concerning the criteria under which it considers this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. The Palm Grove may also be considered to conform with the continuing organic cultural landscape defined in

paragraph 39 of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### History and Description

#### History

The origins of the Elche palm grove are traditionally attributed to the Phoenicians and Carthaginians in the 1st millennium BC, since dates formed part of their traditional diet. It was with the Arab invasion in the 8th century AD that they began to be cultivated; a network of irrigation canals enabled the brackish waters of the Vinalopó river to be used. The town was moved northwards to a new location and surrounded by many palm groves, so as to recreate a landscape reminiscent of that of North Africa, from whence the new settlers came.

Elche was recaptured in 1265 during the reign of Jaime I and its lands were redistributed. The fertile lands on the left bank, irrigated by the main canal (*Sequia Major*) were granted to those who assisted in the reconquest; this area contained many groves of date palms, some of which survive to the present day. There were no groves on the right bank (the *Magram*), where the lands were assigned to Moslem vassals (*moriscos*); however, despite the lower fertility of this area, its farmers achieved a high degree of productivity, which was to degenerate sadly when the *moriscos* were expelled in 1606.

The area of palm groves went on producing large crops of dates, but these diminished as the town spread in this direction during the second half of the 17th century and the palm trees were cut down. This process was exacerbated with industrialization and the arrival of the railway in the 19th century. It was not until the 1920s that the danger to the palm groves was recognized, and in the 1930s legislative measures were put in place to ensure the continuance of what remained, a process that was completed with the passage of the Law on the Protection of the Elche Palm Grove by the Regional Parliament of Valencia in 1986.

Traditions differ regarding the origins of the Elche Mystery Play, but modern research suggests that it originated in its present form in the second half of the 15th century, as part of a Europe-wide movement associated with the Assumption of the Virgin. A Confraternity of Our Lady of the Assumption was in existence in the early 16th century, with its headquarters in the Chapel of St Sebastián, close to the Church of Santa Maria, where the statue of the Virgin used in the Mystery is venerated.

Organization of the Mystery Play was taken over in 1609 by the town council of Elche, which financed it from taxes on grain milling and cooked meat production. The Bishop of Orihuela tried in the early 17th century to prevent the Mystery being performed outside a church building, in conformity with the decisions of the Council of Trent, which launched the Counter Reformation, but this was resisted by the town council, which obtained a special dispensation to continue in the traditional way from Pope Urban VIII in 1632. After the Civil War of 1936-39, the National Foundation for the Elche Mystery Play was established, and this is the body that is now responsible for its organization.

#### Description

The date palm trees of Elche are *Phoenix dactylifera* L., a dioecious species which is native to western Asia and North Africa. They can grow to a height of more than 30m and live for over 300 years.

The palm groves that are the subject of this nomination form a compact group in the eastern part of the town of Elche. The boundaries of the plots (*huertos*) are rectilinear, so that they are mostly square or rectangular, but some triangular, in plan. They are bounded by *cascabots* (fences made of plaited dried palm leaves) or plastered walls of undressed stone 1-2m high. The plots contain the houses of the tenants or owners of the land, though these are mostly in a ruinous condition in the plots nearest to the centre of the town. The palm trees are planted in single or double rows, following the lines of the irrigation canals. They produce both dates for human consumption and the "White Palm" leaves, which are widely exported for use all over the Iberian peninsula for decoration and processional use on Palm Sunday.

The performance of the Mystery Play takes place in the Church of Santa Maria and in the streets of the town over two days, 14 and 15 August (the eve and day of the Feast of the Assumption of the Blessed Virgin Mary). The first day is devoted to the death of the Virgin and the second to the interment and assumption into heaven.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The palm groves in public and private ownership that make up this nomination are protected by the 1986 Regional Law on the Protection of the Palm Grove of Elche. Any actions, such as felling of trees, change of agricultural practice, deliberate neglect, or removal of boundaries, which may adversely affect the quality or appearance of the groves require authorization, and the groves are subject to a systematic monitoring procedure.

### *Management*

A total of 282 individual palm groves make up the nomination, 102 of them within the urban area and 180 in the surrounding rural areas. Of the urban groves, 50 are owned by the Municipality and the remainder by private individuals; only one of the rural groves is municipally owned.

A foundation to oversee the Elche palm groves was first set up in 1933, and this role is confirmed in the 1986 provincial law. It is composed of representatives of departments of the Provincial Government (*Generalitat Valenciana*) responsible for culture, planning, and agricultural development, two municipal councillors, and one representative of those who run the groves. This body, which is presided over by the Cultural Counsellor of the Province with the Mayor of Elche as his deputy, is responsible for policy and delegates its administrative functions, in accordance with the 1986 Law, to the local management committee (*Junta Local Gestora*).

The 1997 Urban Plan for Elche has a number of provisions relating to the groves within the municipal boundaries. Among its policies are the acquisition by the Municipality of further properties, restocking of groves with new trees, which the Municipality has been growing, and increasing productivity.

The management of the Mystery Play is in the hands of its own Foundation (see above).

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Conservation of the palm landscape of Elche has been in progress since the 1920s, but only with the promulgation of the 1986 Provincial Law can it be deemed to be effective.

### *Authenticity*

The plots in which the groves are planted conform with the original land-allotment system, which is integral with the ancient irrigation system installed during the Arab period.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Elche in February 1999. ICOMOS also benefited from the advice of its International Committee on Historic Gardens and Sites and of the International Federation of Landscape Architects (IFLA).

### *Qualities*

The landscape of palm groves in and around Elche is a remarkable example of the deliberate implantation of a form of agriculture and a single economic species from one region to another, which also reflects a significant episode in history.

The Elche mystery play is exceptional in that it has continued to be performed without interruption from the late medieval period to the present day.

### *Comparative analysis*

There are, of course, countless palm groves in North Africa and the Near East. However, the exceptional character of Elche stems from the fact that this was a deliberate implantation by an invading culture of a form of agriculture imported from its homeland in another continent, and which has preserved its original form to the present day. ICOMOS is unaware of any comparable concentration of an economic crop species transported from one region to another that has survived unchanged in its techniques and distribution at a single site over so many centuries.

Many important food crops, such as rice and olives, are known to have been transferred from one region to another in prehistory and classical antiquity, but it is impossible to point to a single example of continuity of place and technique comparable with Elche. Similarly, economic crops have been imported into Europe from other continents (eg tobacco, potatoes, maize), but this took place much later than the introduction of the palm into the Iberian peninsula. Once again, no specific locations can be identified with certainty.

The mystery play is not unique as such, but others that are currently being performed are either more recent (the Oberammergau Passion Play originated in the 17th century) or are 20th century revivals (eg the York Cycle).

### *ICOMOS comments*

The total area proposed for inscription covers nearly 300 palm groves – 102 within the town's boundaries, 180 in the surrounding rural area. They cover over 440ha and contain more than 11,000 individual trees. The dossier goes on to report that there are 1046 properties in seven out of 34 neighbouring communes that contain isolated palm trees or small groups or lines of them, which suggests that there must be some 20,000 properties of this kind in total.

These figures are confirmed the information given in supplementary documentation supplied by the Municipality of Elche. This shows additionally that the area of palm groves within ten rural communes to the south of the town is 9362ha. Reference is made in the same document to a buffer zone for the groves in the town covering 810ha.

The cartographic material supplied with the nomination, some of which is repeated in the supplementary submission, contains a series of maps resulting from the revision of the 1992 General Urban Plan. The general map, drawn to a scale of 1:100,000, shows groups of palm groves widely scattered over the territory, with a concentration in the eastern part of the town. The latter are shown in greater detail in another plan. However, there is no map which specifies the area or areas nominated for inscription; it is assumed that this is the small-scale map mentioned above.

Whilst there is apparently a buffer zone around the urban groves, as required by the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (paragraph 24.b), this is not shown on any of the maps studied by ICOMOS. Such zones apparently exist for the scattered groves in the rural areas, according to the supplementary documentation, but cartographic information is once again lacking.

It should be drawn to the attention of the State Party that the Convention cannot be used to give recognition to intangible property. It is impossible to interpret Article 1 of the Convention so as to permit consideration being given to the Elche Mystery Play. It is perhaps also relevant to add that the only link between the palm groves and the Mystery Play is the fact that both are connected with the town of Elche. The association of the two in a single nomination is not logical, and would be so only in the context of a nomination of the entire urban area of Elche.

Having studied this nomination carefully, ICOMOS is of the opinion that the Palm Groves of Elche are an interesting historical phenomenon, but it does not consider them to possess outstanding universal value, as required by the World Heritage Convention.

### **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Paramaribo (Suriname)

No 940

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Historic Inner City of Paramaribo
<i>Location</i>	District of Paramaribo
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Suriname
<i>Date</i>	1 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

The nominated cultural property represents a former Dutch colonial town from the 17th and 18th centuries with an original street plan. It is composed of wooden buildings with a plain and symmetrical architectural style, the interaction of different European and North American influences, and the craftsmanship of the Creole people (descendants of African slaves). The historic urban structure is the setting for over 250 monuments, authentic in design, material, and craftsmanship. A recently developed integrated conservation and development scheme (*Plan for the Inner City of Paramaribo*) is part of the overall planning legislation of Paramaribo. This scheme creates favourable conditions for the development of the historic urban centre and the conservation and reuse of the protected monuments.

**Criteria ii, iii, and iv**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*

### History and Description

#### History

The first voyages of discovery to the so-called "Wild Coast" of South America were made in 1499 by the Spaniards Alonso and Juan de la Cosa, accompanied by Amerigo Vespucci. Rumours soon circulated about an Inca "City of Gold" (*El Dorado*) at Lake Parima in the interior of modern Guyana, and many adventurers were attracted to this coast, but Eldorado remained a legend.

From the beginning of the 17th century colonization of the Wild Coast was directed towards the cultivation of sugarcane and tobacco. European governments encouraged settlers to establish plantations in order to exploit the region to meet the increasing demand for tropical products in Europe. English planters from Barbados arrived in the mid 17th century. The Dutch, who had a trading patent, also came to the coast

around this time in search of tobacco and hardwoods; Dutch trading posts existed as early as 1614 on the Corantijn river and near the Indian village of *Parmarbo* or *Parmurbo* on the banks of the Suriname river. The English were driven out by a Dutch fleet commanded by Abraham Crijnssen during the Second Anglo-Dutch War (1665-67), and Suriname remained a Dutch possession for the next three centuries.

By the end of the 18th century there were some six hundred plantations in operation. In the second half of the century the owners, who had hitherto lived on their plantations, began to migrate to Paramaribo, leaving the running of the plantations to managers. As a result, the plantations began to decline, but the town grew, with many fine houses built along tree-lined streets.

The economic situation of Suriname worsened as the plantations declined, with beet being replaced as the source of sugar, and the situation deteriorated further when slavery was abolished in 1863. Fewer than a hundred plantations survived, and their owners and the freed slaves moved to Paramaribo, which expanded rapidly.

To replace the slaves, the government brought in labourers to work the remaining plantations, first from China and the West Indies and later from India and Java. Between 1873 and 1939 34,000 Indians and 33,000 Javanese immigrated to Suriname, increasing its cultural and ethnic diversity and this is reflected in the present-day appearance of Paramaribo, which developed from an administrative centre and port into a city with multifarious activities existing side by side.

Paramaribo began when Fort Zeelandia was built in 1667 on a promontory on the left bank of the Suriname river, but early civil development was low-quality and random. When Van Sommelsdijck, the first governor and joint owner of the colony, took over in 1683 he laid out a planned town. It began on the shell ridges to the west, which offered a naturally drained hard base for building. In the mid 18th century it expanded southwards to the sandy land along the river, and finally at the end of the century to the north, where Dutch civil engineers used their skills to drain the area.

In addition to Fort Zeelandia, Paramaribo was also protected by the Nieuw-Amsterdam Fortress at the confluence of the Suriname and Commewijne rivers, near the coast. Because of these strong defensive works, it was not necessary for the town to be fortified, which allowed it to be laid out in spacious lots along wide streets.

There were disastrous fires in 1821 and again in 1832, when much of the existing town was destroyed.

#### Description

The layout of the Inner City, which is nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List, consists of a main axis stretching north-west from the Onafhankelijkheidsplein behind Fort Zeelandia (the group of public buildings here is the central ensemble in the town plan), with streets crossing at right-angles. It is defined by the Sommelsdijkse Kreek to the north and the Viottekreek to the south. To the north of Fort Zeelandia is the large public park known as the Garden of Palms (*Palmentuin*). The nominated property covers an area of 60ha. The wide streets and the public open spaces are tree-lined, giving a serene and spacious townscape.

The larger public buildings in Paramaribo, such as Fort Zeelandia (1667), the Presidential Palace (1730), the

Ministry of Finance (1841), the Reformed Church (1837), and the Roman Catholic Cathedral (1885) were built in stone and brick in traditional Dutch style but increasingly incorporating native elements. Thus, the ground floor of the Presidential Palace is built in stone but its upper storeys are in wood. The Ministry of Finance, by contrast, is a monumental brick structure with a classical portico and a clock tower which dominates the Onafhankelijkheidsplein, the main open space of the city, situated behind Fort Zeelandia. Interestingly, the Neo-Classical Reformed Church is built in brick but the Neo-Gothic Roman Catholic Cathedral is entirely of wood.

Most of the buildings in Paramaribo, both commercial and residential, are built entirely in wood, the majority of them following the 1821 and 1832 fires, in which some 450 houses were destroyed. The work was carried out by local craftsmen. They all conform with a general layout: they are rectangular and symmetrical in plan with steep roofs (mostly of corrugated iron sheets) and brick substructures. Both these and the public buildings are generally painted white, the brick elements being highlighted in red. Doors and window shutters are in dark green.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The protected and listed monuments in Paramaribo are covered by the 1963 Monuments Act (*Verordening Historische Monumenten*). However, for technical reasons this has not been fully implemented, since Monuments List No 1 for Paramaribo was not properly promulgated by means of the Official Gazette. A new 1998 Monuments Bill is currently awaiting final approval. This will have provision for the designation of protected historic quarters; however, it does not appear that the whole of the Inner City of Paramaribo will be so designated when it comes into force. Under this legislation there are controls over interventions that may affect the state of buildings and townscapes as recorded during the process of designation. There is provision for low-interest loans to owners for essential conservation and restoration works. The state also has powers of compulsory purchase of monuments in certain circumstances and priority rights when such properties are offered for sale.

The 1973 Planning Act (*Planwet*) assigns the responsibility for a comprehensive and sustainable policy for spatial, ecological, and socio-economic in the whole country to the Ministry of Planning and Development Cooperation. Regional and local plans are covered by the Regional Bodies Act (*Wet Regionale Organen*), administered by the Ministry of Regional Development, whilst the Ministry of Public Works covers the Town Planning Act (*Stedebouwkundige Wet*). The two latter Acts and the responsible ministries operate in a collaborative fashion in the formulation of Structure and Land Use Plans.

Finally, the Building Act (*Bouwwet*) and the Building Resolution (*Bouwebesluit*) control the issue of licences for new constructions and residential areas.

### *Management*

About one-fifth of the buildings and open spaces within the nominated area are owned by the national government or

government agencies and institutions. The remainder are in private ownership.

In 1997 the Suriname Urban Heritage Foundation (*Stichting Gebouwd Erfgoed Suriname*) was set up as an interim measure for one year, pending the establishment of the Paramaribo Conservation Company Limited (*NV Stadsbeheer Paramaribo*). A feasibility study is currently in progress of this proposed body, which will be a commercially based non-governmental organization to control development in the city and function as an intermediary between the various planning bodies and other institutions listed above. It will also have powers to acquire and manage sites and monuments in order to restore and renovate them and to oversee the maintenance and restoration of properties on a contractual basis. In the meantime the Urban Heritage Foundation is designing an integrated urban conservation and development Plan for the Inner City of Paramaribo and developing a management plan.

This Plan consists of a development scheme and land-use plan for the historic inner city, together with a detailed conservation plan. It is based on an analysis of the historical development of the city and an up-to-date inventory of the architectural and technical condition of the existing building stock. After it has been approved by the Government, the Foundation will hand over responsibility for its implementation to the Paramaribo Conservation Company.

A sum of US\$ 500,000 has been allocated for the conservation of Paramaribo as part of the agreement between the Dutch and Surinamese Governments. In addition, a trust fund has been set up, financed by the Dutch Ministry of External Affairs and Development Coordination (for the so-called mutual heritage), the European Commission, the Getty Fund, and additional levies on commercially profitable projects within the city. This will be used primarily for making low-interest loans.

The dossier does not include a buffer zone for the nominated property.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

Conservation has been largely unsystematic until recent years in Paramaribo, although the major public buildings have been maintained on a regular basis. However, appreciation of and support for their heritage is strong among the citizens and there is a long tradition of conservation of individual buildings using traditional techniques and materials. The foundations have now been laid for a systematic and comprehensive programme.

However, the ICOMOS expert mission observed a number of buildings in a ruinous condition or urgently in need of conservation.

The mission also commented on the high proportion of reconstructed buildings, and in particular of those in the traditional style, but built of concrete simulating wood.

### *Authenticity*

The overall urban fabric of Paramaribo dating from 1680-1800 still survives virtually intact. Over 250 listed buildings of historic interest are also still extant in the historic city, and

many of the buildings exhibit high authenticity because of the use of traditional techniques and materials in repair and rehabilitation works.

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred* so that the State Party may initiate the recommendations of ICOMOS.

## **Evaluation**

ICOMOS, March 1999

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Paramaribo in February 1999. ICOMOS was also advised on the cultural significance of the city by its International Scientific Committee on Historic Towns and Villages.

### *Qualities*

Paramaribo is a unique example of a Dutch town planted on the coast of tropical South America. It has retained its original street plan untouched, and there is a range of buildings which demonstrate the gradual fusion of Dutch architectural design with traditional local techniques and materials.

### *Comparative analysis*

Although situated in South America, Paramaribo is historically and culturally more closely linked with the Caribbean. Comparison should therefore be made with European colonial towns in that region.

All of those already on the World Heritage List, with the exception of Willemstad (Netherlands Antilles), are Spanish in origin, and they conform rigidly to the checkerboard town plan that was developed at Alcalá de Henares and imposed upon the New World by its Spanish rulers.

Willemstad was also a Dutch foundation. It differs significantly from Paramaribo, however, in two respects. First, its situation and subsequent growth are radically different from those of Paramaribo, and secondly in its architecture and townscape it shows marked Spanish influence.

### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

Whilst accepting the cultural value of Paramaribo, ICOMOS recommends the following action on the part of the State Party:

1. Creation of a central governmental body responsible for the protection and presentation of the historic heritage;
2. Extension of the legislation so as to include guidelines for interventions in town centres and on monuments;
3. Provide legislative protection for the entire centre of Paramaribo, as defined in the nomination dossier;
4. Define the area of 18th century expansion, plus the area to the north of Van Roosenvaldkade, as the buffer zone for the proposed World Heritage site;
5. Organize, with the assistance of ICOMOS and the World Heritage Centre, an International Workshop on the Conservation and Protection of Historic Towns;
6. Encourage architects and engineers to specialize in architectural conservation and restoration.

## **Recommendation**

## Bellinzone (Switzerland)

No 884

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Three castles, defensive wall and ramparts of the market-town of Bellinzone
<i>Location</i>	Bellinzone - Canton of Ticino
<i>State Party</i>	Switzerland
<i>Date</i>	9 September 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Bellinzone ensemble is the sole remaining example in the entire Alpine region of medieval military architecture, comprising three castles, a wall which once closed off the whole Ticino valley, and the ramparts which surrounded the town for the protection of its citizens.

It is perfectly legitimate to rank the Bellinzone fortifications as a unique monument of European architecture erected in defence of feudal culture.

[**Note** The State Party does not make any proposals in the nomination dossier as regards the criteria under which it considers the property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List.]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Bellinzone owes its origins to its strategic position controlling access, via the Ticino valley, to the main Alpine passes into the *Milanese*, ie the whole north of Italy and on into other northern regions up to the Danube and beyond.

Recent excavations have shown that the site was inhabited as early as the Neolithic period. It was a Roman outpost until the frontiers of the Empire were pushed further north to the Danube. Under pressure from barbarian inroads from the north, Bellinzone once again became a defensive stronghold against the peoples streaming down from the plains of central Europe. In the troubled days of the declining Roman Empire, the site fell into the hands of the Ostrogoths, the Byzantines, and finally the Lombards.

The excavations also showed that the fortress suffered a fire around the year 800. In the 10th century, Bellinzone formed part of the possessions of Otto I, founder of the Holy Roman Empire. The earliest constructions still extant probably date from around this period.

Around the year 1000 the castle and the county were granted by the emperor to the Bishop of Como. It was at this period that the interior of the castle of Castelgrande was divided up to accommodate houses, turning it into a small fortified town.

In the 12th century, Frederick Barbarossa took possession of the fortress. The town grew up gradually around the citadel and the fortifications were improved.

Between the 13th and 15th centuries, the town expanded around the castle. The castle of Montebello was built around 1300, and soon incorporated into the system of fortifications. The castle of Sasso Corbaro, built in 1480 to the south-east of Castelgrande, also forms part of the system of defences, but was destined to remain separate from the network of fortifications.

Bellinzone became part of the state of Milan under the rule of the Visconti. From the early 15th century onwards, Bellinzone came under attack from the Swiss confederates who sought to capture it. The Visconti strengthened its defences considerably and began the construction of a wall running from Castelgrande to block the Ticino valley: the wall was known as the Murata. More work was launched on Castelgrande, the hub of the system of defences, in order to rationalize the scheme of fortifications. The tripartite division of the courtyard was finalized and the courtyard cleared of the houses which still encumbered it, while the constructions on the south flank were connected to the castle. From this stronghold stretched a series of ramparts to protect the city and make it possible to control the movement of travellers through the valley.

At the beginning of the 16th century, Bellinzone fell to the confederates, and the fortifications lost much of their importance but were not destroyed. In 1515 the Ticino flooded and swept away a large part of the Murata.

From the 16th century onwards, history began to pass the stronghold by. In 1803, Castelgrande was used as prison and an arsenal. The modern town developed at the expense of the ramparts. In 1882, the arsenal was extended.

The 20th century brought belated recognition of the historical value of the site and major restoration work began.

#### Description

The ensemble consists of three castles and a network of fortifications, including towers and defence works, looking down over the Ticino valley and the town centre.

The three castles are:

- Castelgrande (Château d'Uri, Château Saint Michel);
- Château de Montebello (Château de Schwyz, Château Saint Martin);
- Château de Sasso Corbaro (Château d'Unterwald, Château Sainte Barbara).

The *Castelgrande* is the largest of the three fortresses and dominates the town from its rocky eminence. The most outstanding features are its two towers, known as the White and Black Towers respectively. The spacious interior is divided by internal walls radiating out from the Black Tower into three courtyards. The White Tower, to the east, is surrounded by its own set of fortifications, known as the Redoubt. The arsenal consists of a series of massive buildings on the western side of the south courtyard. The enceinte has two chapels, but only their foundations still survive.

*Montebello Castle* lies on a rocky spur to the east of Castelgrande, with which it is linked by the town walls. In plan it is lozenge-shaped and, unlike Castelgrande, it is surrounded by deep moats. Its core is the central keep, from the end of the 13th century, which was given additional protection in the form of new defensive walls in the mid 14th and late 15th centuries.

Unlike Castelgrande and Montebello, *Sasso Corbaro Castle* does not form part of the defensive perimeter of Bellinzone. It is built on a rocky outcrop some 600m to the south-east of the town, covering a vulnerable approach route. The entire castle, consisting of a main keep and a strongly fortified bailey, with outworks, was built in the last quarter of the 15th century. It is square in plan, the keep jutting out on the north-eastern corner and rising slightly above the level of the crenellated walls.

Some two-thirds of the original line of the *Town Ramparts* still survive, with interval towers, but the gates have disappeared. To the west of the town, starting at Castelgrande, there is what remains of the impressive defensive wall known as *La Murata*, which originally extended across the Ticino river. First constructed in the early 15th century, its present form dates from the 1480s.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The three castles, the Murata, and the buffer zone are protected by a decree of 18 May 1926 amended by a later decree of 23 October 1962, both issued by the Council of State of the Canton of Ticino. All the fortifications are shown in the land development plan of the Commune of Bellinzone (*Plan d'aménagement du territoire de la Commune de Bellinzone*) as cantonal and national monuments, thereby granting them the full protection of all the instruments provided in both federal and cantonal legislation, avoiding any risk of abuse.

### *Management*

The three castles and the fortifications are owned by the State Council of the Canton of Ticino.

The bodies responsible for the management and maintenance of the monuments are the Canton Finance and Economics Department (*Département Cantonal des Finances et de l'Economie*) and the Lands Department (*Département du Territoire*). Discussions are under way on the possible transfer of responsibility for the management of the three castles to the Bellinzone Tourist Board.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

As excavations went ahead in the mid 20th century, a number of restoration projects were put forward for consideration. The first restoration, under the control of Max Alioth, took place in 1953: some buildings were demolished, the ramparts were rebuilt up to their presumed original height, and crenellations were added. In the years that followed, differences of opinion over the restoration led to certain parts being removed. In 1967 Professor Werner Meyer was put in charge of archaeological excavations designed to produce results on which restoration work could be based.

A twofold objective now seems to have been realized: saving the ruined remains of the three castles and the network of fortifications, and improving visitor facilities by developing access to the site and improving the appearance of the interior areas.

The castle of Castelgrande underwent restoration and development at the hands of architect Aurelio Galfetti in 1981. The project gave the public easier access to the castle from the foot of the rock to the level of the fortress by cutting a vertical shaft and installing a lift and stairs up to the platform. The development is of very high quality, as is the interior aspect of the conference and museum rooms. It would be preferable, however, for no further developments to be added beyond what has already been done. The lift is an acceptable concession to the visitor's requirements, but an excessive attention to appearance could risk adulterating the emotional impact usually aroused by medieval fortresses, an emotion which is always attenuated by the pursuit of too great a perfection in the restoration.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the property is clearly attested by the many documents referring to its past history, but it has been somewhat attenuated by excessive reconstruction, particularly of the upper sections of the walls, reconstruction which is probably documented but the scale of which cannot be evaluated from the elements in the nomination submission.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Bellinzone in February 1999.

### *Comparative analysis*

In the 15th century, many seigneurs and feudal lords sought to protect their frontiers by means of grandiose fortifications (Helsingborg/Helsingör, Viborg, Peschiera, Höhentwiel). Others transformed their cities into fortresses for their garrisons (Dubrovnik/Ragusa, Graz, Novara, Luxembourg). Bellinzone stands apart from all these ensembles of historical significance in both the scale of its architecture, dictated by the site, and in the excellent state of preservation of the whole.

When power passed to the Swiss confederation, the fortifications of Bellinzone, built to defend against that very enemy, lost their military *raison d'être* and were never subsequently extended. For this reason, they have retained in untouched form the typical aspect of the low Middle Ages, apart from the substantial dilapidation of the wall and the ramparts.

In the rest of Europe, unlike in Bellinzone, the most important fortifications have either been destroyed by war or political turmoil, or have over the years been so far altered in the wake of new knowledge of the art of defensive construction that only fragments of the originals now remain, such as the walls of Wenzel in Luxembourg.

#### *Comments by ICOMOS*

The ensemble is authentic in terms of its layout, but it has undergone hypothetical restorations which have privileged the picturesque to the detriment of the authenticity of the elevations and the crowning of the walls.

#### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The nomination submission does not contain an overall plan setting out the precise limits of the property. It simply states that the surface area of the nomination covers 5ha, with no buffer zone.

The wisdom of this choice is questionable. A fortress is, by its very nature, designed for the surveillance of a particular area, in this case a pass, but in any event the surrounding countryside is an integral part of the function of the fortress. In consideration of the role of this construction since its creation, it is necessary to create a considerable buffer zone to limit urban development in the approaches to the monument.

#### **Brief description**

The Bellinzone site consists of a group of fortifications centring on the castle of Castelgrande, which stands on the summit of a rocky peak looking out over the entire Ticino valley. Running from the castle, a series of fortified walls protect the ancient town and block the passage through the valley. The second castle forms an integral part of the fortifications; a third but separate castle (Sasso Corbaro) was built on an isolated rocky promontory south-east of the other fortifications.

#### **Recommendation**

That further consideration of this nomination be **deferred**, with the State Party being requested to provide further details of the nature of the restoration work affecting the monument (independent of any development work) and of the limits to the property proposed for inscription, together with an adequate buffer zone.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Merv (Turkmenistan)

No 886

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	State Historical and Cultural Park “Ancient Merv”
<i>Location</i>	Mary Vilayet
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Turkmenistan
<i>Date</i>	7 November 1996

### Justification by State Party

The Mausoleum of Sultan Sanjar is a masterpiece of human creative genius and is itself worthy of World Heritage Status. It is preserved in the centre of its city, with outstanding fortifications, street layout, citadel and other monuments.

#### Criterion i

The cities of the Merv oasis have exerted considerable influence over the civilizations of Central Asia and Iran for four millennia. Located in an oasis on a major east-west trade route, known popularly as the Silk Road, they have facilitated the exchange of goods and ideas. The Seljuk city in particular influenced architecture and architectural decoration and scientific and cultural development.

#### Criterion ii

The sequence of separate major cities, the series of fortifications, the ability to study different street lay-outs across the cities, and the Mausoleum of Sultan Sanjar are unique.

#### Criterion iii

The corrugated monuments, built of mud brick, are characteristic examples of Central Asian buildings, the preservation of which is rare. The majority survive in the Merv oasis, with two outstanding examples to the west of the Seljuk city. Recent discoveries of advanced early Islamic steel furnaces indicate Merv was a major technological centre.

#### Criterion iv

The mud brick monuments of Merv, such as the corrugated buildings, pavilions, and icehouses, are characteristic traditional structures of the area, fragile by nature and vulnerable under the impact of irreversible environmental and socio-economic change.

#### Criterion v

Numerous major events and personalities of historic importance have been associated with Merv. These include Abu Muslim, who initiated the Abbasid revolution, the Seljuk sultans, and scholars attracted to the libraries and observatory of Merv, such as the geographer, Yaqut al Hamavi, and the poet/astronomer, Omar Khayyam.

#### Criterion vi

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The oasis of Merv in the Karakum Desert has supported a series of urban centres since the 3rd millennium BC. The earliest Bronze Age centres (c 2500-1200 BC) were located in the north of the oasis, where the Murghab river came to the surface and could easily be utilized. With the development of more advanced irrigation techniques, the centres moved further south, and there is a series of important Early Iron Age sites.

The historic urban centre developed around 500 BC to the east of the oasis, where it was well sited to take advantage of routes to the east. It consisted of a series of adjacent walled cities, occupying an area of more than 1200ha. The oldest of these, Erk Kala, is attested in written sources from the Achaemenian period (519-331 BC), most notably on the famous trilingual inscription of Darius the Great at Bisitun in western Iran

The oasis formed part of the empire of Alexander the Great, and Pliny the Elder suggested in his *Natural History* (VI, 16-17) that the Hellenistic city was founded by Alexander himself. The Seleucid king Antiochus I Soter (281-261 BC) rebuilt it and named it *Margiana Antiochia*; it is identified with Erk Kala and Gyaur Kala. It was occupied for some 1500 years, throughout the Parthian and Sasanian periods and into the early Islamic period. It has been suggested that Greek and Roman soldiers, survivors of the crushing Parthian defeat of the Romans at Carrhae in 53 BC, may have been settled at Margiana. Islam became dominant with the death of the last Sasanian king, Yazdigird III in 651. However, Merv was little more than an industrial zone in the 8th-10th centuries, although the central mosque continued in use as late as the 11th-12th centuries.

The medieval city of the Seljuks developed to the west of Gyaur Kala, replacing it as the urban centre as the latter declined. It was walled by Sultan Malikshah (1072-92), and further suburban developments to the north and south were later also walled by Sultan Sanjar (1118-57).

The city, extending over more than 600ha, was the capital of the Great Seljuk Empire (11th-13th centuries), and was one of the principal cities of its period. Its famous libraries attracted scholars from all over the Islamic world, including the astronomer-poet Omar Khayyam and the geographer Yaqut al Hamavi.

This brilliant flowering came to a violent end in 1221-22, when it was sacked by the Mongols, who slew many of its inhabitants and destroyed the complex water system. It survived in a much diminished form, as part of the empire of Timur (1370-1405) The new and much smaller city, known today as Abdullah Khan Kala was built on another site to the south by Timur's successor, Shah Rukh (1408-47).

In the 16th century Merv came under the domination of the Uzbek Turks, who ruled from Bukhara, and a century later it

was incorporated into the Persian empire. An increase in population in the 18th century led to the creation of a fortified extension, known as Bairam Ala Khan Kala, now mostly ruined.

#### *Description*

The oasis of Merv currently occupies an area of 85km by 74km in the Karakum Desert at the crossing point of the Amu Darya on the main east-west route to Bukhara and Samarkand. It was formed by the silt brought down by the Murghab river which created an alluvial fan. The landscape is flat, except where it is disturbed by irrigation works, and it is interspersed by a dense pattern of ancient sites dating from the Bronze Age to the post-medieval period.

#### *- The Bronze Age centres (2500-1200 BC)*

The earliest settlements were in the northern part of the oasis. Five of these are to be included in a protection programme - Kelleli, Adji Kui, Taip, Gonur, and Toguluk.

Kelleli is an area of settlement with two major sites. Kelleli 3 (4ha) has a double external wall with towers flanking four symmetrical entrances.; an area of houses has been cleared in the south-western sector. Kelleli 4 (3ha) also has a double outer wall with towers. Both sites are poorly preserved, but they contain important evidence of Middle Bronze Age *Margiana*. From the same period is Adji Kui 8 (8.5ha).

The transition from Middle to Late Bronze Age, and from one form of settlement pattern to another, is illustrated by Taip. Two close but distinct mounds consist of a walled square area of 3.5ha with a large courtyard building in the south.

The largest Bronze Age site in the Murghab delta is Gonur Depe (55ha). The enormous northern mound survives to a height of 4m above its surroundings. Excavations have revealed the existence of a huge palace and a probable fire temple, both from the Middle Bronze Age. There is a large contemporary necropolis lying to the west of it.

The much smaller southern mound (3ha) had a village erected on it in the Late Bronze Age. It is enclosed by a massive square wall with circular corner towers and semicircular towers along each side. This site is well preserved.

The Toguluk area was densely occupied during the Bronze Age. Excavations have revealed the remains of several large fortified buildings.

#### *- The Iron Age centres (1200-300 BC)*

Two Iron Age centres are to be included in the overall protection scheme - Yaz/Gobekli Depes and Takhirbaj Depe.

Iron Age settlement was also in the northern part of the oasis. Takhirbaj Depe is the most prominent site in the whole area. Excavations have revealed that settlement began in the Late Bronze Age with the construction of a walled and moated citadel and subsequently extended considerably. It was the most important Iron Age centre of the region and it continued in occupation through to the Achaemenid period.

Yaz Depe is of special importance less for its archaeological remains as for the fact that it has produced abundant ceramic finds that provide the basic typology for the period. Nearby is the well preserved Partho-Sasanian rectangular fortress of Gobekli.

#### *- The historic urban centre*

This consists of three principal elements - Erk Kala, Gyaur Kala, and the medieval city of Sultan Kala or Marv al-Shahijan.

Erk Kala (20ha) is a walled and moated polygonal site with walls surviving to c 30m and an internal citadel.

Gyaur Kala is roughly square in plan, with walls c 2km long. In the interior there are the remains of a number of important structures. The central Beni Makhan mosque is partly obscured by excavated dumps, but its cistern demonstrates how water was distributed by means of underground canals. The Buddhist *stupa* and monastery in the south-east corner is the westernmost excavated structure of this kind known to date. The "Oval Building" in the north-west quarter consists of a series of rooms around a courtyard on an elevated platform.

Medieval Sultan Kala, which lies to the west of Gyaur Kala, began as a suburban development and was not walled until the 11th century. It is about the same size (4km<sup>2</sup>), but another walled area of 2-3km<sup>2</sup> was later added to it. The Mausoleum of Sultan Sanjar (1118-57) was constructed in the centre of the Seljuk city. The cube-like structure that survives originally formed part of a large religious complex. Its fine detail, such as the elegant brickwork, the carved stucco, and the surviving mural paintings, make it one of the most outstanding architectural achievements of the Seljuk period.

The walls of the medieval city and of the citadel (Shahriyar Ark) are unique. They represent two consecutive periods of 11th-13th century military architecture. The 12km circuit of the walls includes towers, posterns, stairways, galleries, and in places crenellations; the earlier work is preserved by being encased in the later structures.

In addition to these main urban features, there is a number of important medieval monuments in their immediate vicinity. The Mausoleum of Muhammad ibn Zayd was built in 1112 for a descendant of the Prophet. Its domed chamber has a fine Kufic inscription, and part of the original decorated brick facade is still visible in the prayer hall.

One of the most characteristic architectural features of the oasis are the monuments known as *köshks*. These are isolated square or rectangular structures, usually of two storeys. The walls above glacis level are divided into corrugations, giving them a characteristic appearance. Two of the most impressive are the Greater and Lesser Kiz Kala, in which the principal rooms are arranged around a courtyard on the first floor; the rooms on the ground floor are dimly lit through slit windows.

#### *- The post-medieval city, Abdullah Khan Kala*

Apart from the walls and moat of the 15th century, only a few walls of the palace survive in the citadel. However, the walls are of exceptional interest, since they continue the remarkable continuous record of the evolution of military architecture from the 5th century BC to the 15th-16th centuries AD.

There are many major monuments from the historical period in the oasis. The imposing fortresses at Gobekli, Uly Kishman, and Garry Kishman formed part of the 30km of

earthen ramparts built for protection against threats from the northern steppes.

There are many fine mosques and mausolea from this period in the oasis. Among them are the three mausolea from the Timurid period at Geok Gumbaz, the magnificent 12th century Seljuk Talkhattan Baba Mosque, and the extensively restored mausolea of Imam Bakr and Imam Shafi in the Talkhattan cemetery. There are also several well preserved *köshks* and defensive towers (*dings*) from the 18th and 19th centuries.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

Merv is covered by the provisions of the 1992 Law on the Protection of Turkmenistan Historical and Cultural Monuments. The State Historical and Cultural Park "Ancient Merv" was created by decree in 1997. All interventions, including archaeological excavations, within the Park require official permits from the Ministry of Culture.

### Management

The Park is the property of the Republic of Turkmenistan. It comes, along with the seven other State Parks, under the aegis of the National Department for the Protection, Study, and Restoration of Monuments, an agency of the Ministry of Culture. Management and conservation of the sites and monuments within the Park and of all standing monuments within the oasis is the responsibility of the Office of the Park, which comes under the National Department.

The staff of the Office, the headquarters of which is situated close to Sultan Sanjar, consists of a Director, an Assistant Director, an archaeologist, office clerical staff, and wardens. There are two subsidiary offices in Mary Vilayet responsible for monitoring of outlying monuments.

A draft Five-Year Management Plan has been drawn up by Dr Georgina Herrmann (Director of the International Merv Project - see "Conservation history" below) for the UNESCO Office in Tashkent. This makes a number of specific proposals for urgent work to be carried out at vulnerable monuments. General recommendations concern the provision of interpretation facilities and recommended routes for visitors and infrastructural improvements (enlarged parking facilities, upgrading of roads, the relocation of power and telephone poles and pylons in the vicinity of monuments). There are very detailed specific proposals for individual monuments concerning conservation needs, access and safety facilities for visitors, clearance of debris, drainage, structural surveys, removal of unsightly modern structures and scaffolding, and the provision of effective buffer zones around individual monuments.

A three-stage implementation programme is put forward for the improvement of tourist facilities. In the first stage this will be confined to improvement of interpretation and reception provisions. The second stage concerns upgrading of hotel facilities in Mary, the construction of visitor and study centres, restaurants, and offices at Merv, and a major staff and guide training programme. The third stage, dependent upon a substantial increase in visitor numbers and tourist revenue, considers the possibility of the creation of an hotel complex at Merv itself.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

There has been no systematic conservation of the Merv monuments and sites, which were neglected during the Soviet period. They have only been treated as a group since the State Park came into being, and since that time most of the work has been *ad hoc*, in reaction to urgent threats. The Islamic monuments, particularly those built in baked brick, have been subject to emergency conservation actions since the early 20th century. However, no further work is being undertaken on major monuments, to avoid the potential for degradation following their uncovering.

All conservation work is carried out by the staff of the Park under the supervision of the Scientific Methodological Council on the Study and Restoration of Historic Monuments, chaired by the Deputy Minister of Culture and composed of experts from the Monuments Protection Department, the Academy of Sciences, the State University, and the Ministry of Culture.

There has been no vandalism or intrusion since the Park was established, and unauthorized construction in the neighbourhood has been halted permanently. The only modern intrusions are the roads in Sultan and Gyaur Kalas, which are used for the access of visitors.

The International Merv project is a joint Turkmen-British archaeological collaboration between YuTAKE, the South Turkmenistan Multidisciplinary Archaeological Expedition, Department of History, Academy of Sciences (Ashgabat) and the Institute of Archaeology, University College London. It is supported by a variety of official bodies and private foundations, from the United Kingdom, the USA, and elsewhere. It has a wide-ranging programme, covering survey, mapping, inventarization, excavation, conservation, and analysis.

Records of all work carried out since the creation of the Park are maintained at the Park Headquarters. A photographic dossier of all changes in the sites and monuments since the late 19th century has been prepared by the International Merv Project and is due to be published, that on secular buildings in 1999 and that on religious buildings in 2000.

### Authenticity

It is difficult to generalize about the authenticity of so vast and complex a property as the State Historical and Cultural Park "Ancient Merv," which is the subject of this nomination.

The archaeological sites have been relatively untouched and so their authenticity is irreproachable. Restoration and conservation interventions at some of the Islamic religious structures during the present century have not been carried out according to current conservation principles, though they may be defended as essential to stabilize and ensure the continuity of these "living" monuments. They have been well documented and it is possible to reverse them if required. In any case, they represent only a minute proportion of the totality of this ancient landscape and its monuments.

exceptional testimony to the civilizations of Central Asia over several millennia.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Merv in December 1998. ICOMOS has also benefited from discussions with the Director of the International Merv project.

### *Qualities*

The long history of human occupation of the Merv oasis is preserved to a remarkable degree in its sites, monuments, and landscape. It is a unique material record, largely untouched, of this culturally significant but relatively unknown region over a period of more than four millennia.

### *Comparative analysis*

There is a number of prehistoric and historic settlements in Central Asia along the Silk Road. None, however, is comparable with Merv in terms of the special nature of the wealth of material evidence over so long a period, and none exhibits the special pattern of shifting urban settlement to so high a degree.

### *ICOMOS recommendations*

The draft Five-Year Management Plan (see "Management" above) is admirable and well suited to the current requirements of this property. ICOMOS recommends the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee to seek assurances that the Plan will be approved and fully implemented with the minimum delay.

ICOMOS wishes in particular to draw the attention of the State Party to the need to increase the security staff available for this enormous property and provide it with the necessary equipment (vehicles, communications).

## Brief description

Merv is the oldest and most completely preserved of the oasis cities along the Silk Route in Central Asia. The remains in this wide oasis span some four thousand years of human history, and a number of monuments are visible, particularly from the last two millennia.

## Recommendation

That this nomination should be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting assurances that the Five-Year Management Plan should be approved and fully implemented before the end of 1999. In the event of such assurances being provided, ICOMOS recommends that this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iii*

*Criterion ii* The cities of the Merv oasis have exerted considerable influence over the cultures of Central Asia and Iran for four millennia. The Seljuk city in particular influenced architecture and architectural decoration and scientific and cultural development.

*Criterion iii* The sequence of the cities of the Merv oasis, their fortifications, and their urban lay-outs bear

## Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan)

No 885

### Identification

*Nomination* Historic centre of Shakhrisyabz

*Location* Kashkadarya Region

*State Party* Uzbekistan

*Date* 27 April 1998

### Justification by State Party

The town of Shakhrisyabz is over 2000 years old. It contains not only outstanding monuments dating from the period of the Timurids, but also mosques, mausoleums, and entire quarters of ancient houses. Despite the inroads of time, the vestiges remaining are still impressive in the harmony and strength of styles, an enriching addition to the architectural heritage of Central Asia and the Islamic world.

Although Samarkand may boast a great many Timurid monuments, not one can rival the Ak-Sarai Palace in Shakhrisyabz. The foundations of its immense gate have been preserved: this architectural masterpiece is astounding in its dimensions and bold design. The Dorus Saodat complex, the tomb of Timur covered in white stone, is also one of the finest memorials to be found in Central Asia.

Building has continued in Shakhrisyabz down the ages, and the succession of different architectural styles is fundamental to its unique character. The historic centre has retained its original appearance, thereby representing considerable historic, scientific, and cultural value.

**Criteria i, ii, iii, and iv**

### Category of property

In terms of Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the historic centre of Shakhrisyabz is a *group of buildings*.

### History and description

#### *History*

Archaeological excavations have revealed traces of occupation by farming communities dating from the first millennium BC. In later periods, Hellenistic cities arose. The town of Shakhrisyabz was constructed according to a model typical of the High Middle Ages, with a central structure similar to that of Samarkand and Bukhara. The town continued to develop throughout the 9th and 10th

centuries, despite the incessant conflicts between the Samanid dynasties and then between Turkish tribes.

In the mid-15th century, a great empire was built up by Timur, who lavished constant attention on the town of his birth. Until his death in 1405, he ordered the construction of encircling walls, the grandiose Ak-Sarai palace, mosques, baths, and caravanserais, deporting the finest architects and artisans, captured during his military campaigns, to Shakhrisyabz.

After the fall of the Timurid dynasty, the town was relegated to a position of secondary importance, dependent on the Khanate of Bukhara.

#### *Description*

The nominated site consists of a number of monuments, including:

- The Ak-Sarai Palace

Construction of the "White Palace," as it was known, began in 1380, the year following Timur's conquest of Khorezm, whose artisans were deported to work on the palace and provide its rich decoration. The dimensions of this magnificent edifice can be deduced from the size of the gate-towers, traces of which still survive: two towers each 50m in height, and an arch with a span of 22m.

- The Dorus Saodat complex

This vast complex was destined as a place of burial for the ruling family and contained, in addition to the tombs themselves, a prayer hall, a mosque, and accommodation for the religious community and pilgrims. The main façade was faced with white marble. The tomb of Timur, also of white marble, is a masterpiece of the architecture of this period.

- The Chor-su bazaar and the baths

In the town centre, the covered Chor-su bazaar was built at the cross-roads of two main streets, in the form of an octagon with a central cupola, with no particular decoration but with an eye to the exterior effect of bold architecture. This construction dates from the 18th century, as do the baths, rebuilt on the site of the 15th century baths and still in use today. The baths are heated by an elaborate network of underground conduits.

In addition to its monuments, the town also offers a variety of interesting constructions of a more modern period, including the Mirhamid, Chubin, Kunduzar, and Kunchibar mosques. Period houses reflect a more popular architectural style, with rooms typically laid out around a courtyard with veranda.

### Management and protection

#### *Legal status*

The town of Shakhrisyabz was entered on the List of Historic Towns under Resolution No. 339 of the Council of Ministers of Uzbekistan in 1973.

The town was also designated "Monument of Significance for the Republic" by an earlier Resolution of 1973.

### *Management*

The major buildings and architectural ensembles are the property of the state, while the houses and other more modest buildings are privately owned.

The principal monuments are listed and protected by the decrees mentioned above. A plan for the protection of this historic town centre is currently in preparation.

The site as a whole is managed under the national responsibility of the Ministry of Culture's General Office for the Scientific Protection of Cultural Monuments, and under the municipal responsibility of the Mayor and of the Inspectorate for the Protection and Use of Cultural and Historic Monuments.

A programme known as MEROS, designed to promote tourism, is currently being implemented in association with the national tourist agency, Uzbektourism. In 1996, 23,000 domestic and 4200 foreign tourists visited the site, and numbers are increasing.

### **Conservation and authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

Proper archives have been kept since the early 1970s, listing the programmes of work carried out:

Ak-Sarai : 1973-75, 1994-95

Dorus Saodat : 1973-75, 1981-85, 1994-95

Chor-Su : 1976-85

Baths : 1986-90.

Conservation and restoration work is currently being carried out as part of the MEROS programme. An initial phase (1993-96) concentrated on consolidation of the architectural structures and the restoration of decorative elements. A second phase is planned, to restrict new construction in the protected zone and to rebuild period houses using traditional techniques while installing modern utilities.

#### *Training*

Management staff are recruited from graduates of the schools of architecture of Tashkent and Samarkand.

Training in restoration work is funded by a special department, and through the Usto-Shogird workshops for master's degree students who work on the sites.

#### *Authenticity*

The historic urban fabric of the town is intact, despite some insensitive insertions in the Soviet period. Care is being taken in current restoration works to ensure the use of traditional materials and techniques.

### **Evaluation**

#### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 1999.

### *Comparative analysis*

The town of Shakhriyabz, with its monuments and traditional period houses, may be compared, although on a lesser scale, to the other capitals of the Timurid empire, Samarkand and Herat.

### **Brief description**

The historic centre of Shakhriyabz contains a collection of exceptional monuments and ancient quarters which bear witness to the centuries of its history, and particularly to the period of its apogee, under the empire of Timur, in the 15th century.

### **Recommendation**

That further consideration of this nomination be *deferred*, the State Party being requested to furnish precise details of the area proposed for inscription, the limits of the buffer zone and the regulations governing its use, and further material relating to the merits of Shakhriyabz in comparison with other central Asian cities (Samarkand, Bukhara, Herat, etc).

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Hoi An (Vietnam)

No 948

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Hoi An Ancient Town
<i>Location</i>	Hoi An Town, Quang Nam Province
<i>State Party</i>	Socialist Republic of Vietnam
<i>Date</i>	28 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

Hoi An ancient town is a special example of a traditional trading port in South-East Asia which has been completely and assiduously preserved: it is the only town in Vietnam that has survived intact in this way. Most of the buildings in Hoi An are in the traditional architectural style of the 18th to 20th centuries. They are aligned along narrow lanes of traditional type. They include many religious buildings, such as pagodas, temples, meeting houses, etc, which relate to the development of the development of a port community. The traditional life-style, religion, customs, and cooking have been preserved and many festivals still take place annually.

**Criteria ii, iii, v, and vi**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *group of buildings*.

### History and Description

#### History

Archaeological finds and excavations have shown that there was a port and trading centre of the local Sa Huynh people along the Thu Bon river as early as the 2nd century BC. This continued to expand, and by the 15th century Hoi An (known in Vietnam and abroad under various names - Fayfo, Haifo, Kaifo, Faifoo, Faicfo, Hoai Pho) was already the most important port of the powerful Champa Kingdom. It continued after the Vietnamese absorption of the Champa Kingdom in the same capacity, becoming one of the most important centres of mercantile, and hence cultural, exchange in South-East Asia, attracting ships and traders from elsewhere in Asia and from Europe, especially during its most flourishing period from the late 16th century to the early 18th century. It was through Hoi An that Christianity penetrated Vietnam in the 17th century.

It retained its role as the main port of the central region throughout the 19th century, when the Nguyen dynasty kings

operated a "closed trade policy." By the end of the century, the rise of other ports on the coast of Vietnam, in particular Da Nang, and silting of its harbour, led to the final eclipse of Hoi An. As a result of this economic stagnation, it has preserved its early appearance in a remarkably intact state.

#### Description

The ancient town, nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List, is situated on the north bank of the Thu Bon river and covers an area of 0.3km<sup>2</sup> (300m by 1000m). There is a street running east-west along the river's edge and three further streets parallel to the river. They are intersected at right-angles by streets and alleys. Within this area there are houses (often combined with shops), religious monuments such as pagodas, temples, communal houses, and family cult houses, a ferry quay, and an open market.

The architecture of Hoi An, which is entirely of wood, is of considerable interest. It combines traditional Vietnamese designs and techniques with those from other countries, whose citizens settled there to trade and built houses and community centres to their own designs. These influences came principally from China, but Japanese styles can also be discerned in certain details.

The typical house conforms with a corridor plan, the following elements occurring in sequence: house, yard, house. They are of timber-framed construction with brick or wooden walls. There are several forms of roof timbering, showing influences from various regions. The houses are tiled and the wooden components are carved with traditional motifs.

Family cult houses, dedicated to the worship of ancestors, consist of two parts, one behind the other coming from the street. They are distinguished from one another by the roof support system adopted. Between them two small side buildings form a small courtyard.

The community houses, used for worship of ancient sages, founders of settlements, or the legendary founders of crafts, are single rectangular timber-framed structures. Those that survive are mostly from the 19th century.

Like the community houses, the pagodas are almost all from the 19th century, though inscriptions show them to have been founded in the 17th and 18th centuries. They conform with a square layout and decoration is largely confined to the elaborate roofs. In the case of the larger examples, they constituted nuclei of associated buildings with religious and secular functions. For example, some of the larger pagodas also served as meeting halls. These are located along the main street (Tran Phu). Small wooden buildings with structures similar to those of the cult houses were used as ancestral and community shrines. Two of them are associated with pagodas.

There is a fine wooden bridge, reminiscent of Japanese examples, with a pagoda on it. It has existed from at least the early 18th century, as an inscription indicates, but it has been reconstructed many times.

There is a number of ancient tombs within the buffer zone. These are in Vietnamese, Japanese, and Chinese style, reflecting the wide trading connections and ethnic origins of the inhabitants of Hoi An.

The survey of important historic buildings carried out in 1993-95 shows that there are eighteen community houses,

fourteen pagodas and shrines, five meeting (or office) halls, nineteen cult houses, and fifteen large tombs. In their present form most of these date to the 19th century, but a considerable proportion have earlier features going back to the 17th and 18th centuries. In addition to these exceptional buildings, the majority of the domestic architecture is in traditional form - wooden structures with tiled roofs.

## **Management and Protection**

### *Legal status*

State Council Decree No 14 for "Protecting and using cultural-historical relics and landscapes" was promulgated in 1984. In the following year Hoi An ancient town was designated a National Cultural-Historical Site by Resolution 506/VH-QD of the Ministry of Culture and Information.. This was followed successively by Statute 1796/QD-UB of the People's Committee of Quang Nam-Da Nang Province (1987) and Statute 161/QD-UB of the People's Committee of Hoi An Town (1997).

These legislative instruments imposed strict controls over all actions that might have adverse impacts on the cultural and historical qualities of Hoi An.

### *Management*

The entire town is State property. There is a succession of agencies with increasingly detailed responsibilities for the protection and preservation of the National Cultural-Historical Site of Hoi An - the Ministry of Culture and Information (Office of Conservation and Museology), the People's Committee of Quang Nam Province (Department of Culture, Information and Sport), and the People's Committee of Hoi An Town.

The 1997 Hoi An Town Statute defines regulations that are implemented by the Hoi An Monuments Conservation and Management Centre, which was established as the responsible agency of the People's Committee of the town. These are very detailed, relating, for example, to the materials approved for use in rehabilitation and restoration projects, permissible colours for facades, and tree planting. There are separate provisions for the ancient town proper, the subject of the nomination, the buffer zone, and the later town development beyond the buffer zone (in which there are constraints on the height of new constructions).

There is a Master Plan for the centre of Hoi An up to 2010, approved in 1994. Associated with this are separate plans for transportation, tourism, public lighting, water supply, new residential areas, and improvement of the environment. The promulgation of the 1997 Town Statute was associated with the approval of the management plan for "The investigation, conservation, restoration, and exploitation of the ancient town for the period 1997-2005," which is implemented by the Monuments Conservation and Management Centre.

The Centre has a permanent staff of 25 professional and support staff. It is intended to increase this level of manning progressively in the coming years. It works in collaboration with specialized technical agencies at state and central government level.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Survey, recording, conservation, and restoration of Hoi An began in 1982, when the initial survey was carried out by a Polish architect from PKZ. A conservation and research group was set up by the Town Council in the following year to continue this work, which continued over subsequent years. Scientific seminars were held in 1985 and 1990 to study the problems of Hoi An and the necessary solutions to be applied.

A series of research projects was set up, dealing with different periods of the archaeology and history of the town, resulting in the creation of three museums dealing with various aspects of its history.

Currently the management plan is being implemented, with phased and prioritized conservation and restoration projects on the most significant buildings and those in most urgent need of attention.

### *Authenticity*

The aspect of authenticity that is most significant in the case of an historic town is that of the overall townscape rather than that of individual buildings. The historic street pattern which was formed as the commercial port developed survives intact.

The building plots on the streets are also for the most part preserved, and the buildings on them retain the traditional types of facade and roof line. Because most of the buildings were constructed in wood it was necessary for them to be renewed at intervals, and so many buildings with basic structures from the 17th and 18th centuries were reconstructed in the 19th century. The economic decline of the town in the later 19th century meant, however, that there has been no pressure to replace older buildings with new ones in modern materials such as concrete and corrugated iron.

As a result the traditional streetscape has been preserved to a remarkable degree, enhancing the overall authenticity of this historic town.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Hoi An in January 1999.

### *Qualities*

Hoi An is an exceptionally well preserved example of a Far Eastern port which traded widely, both with the countries of South-East and East Asia and with the rest of the world. Its decline in the later 19th century ensured that it has retained its traditional urban tissue to a remarkable degree. It is very unusual for this region, since it is constructed almost entirely of wood.

### *Comparative analysis*

Intensive trading activities between South-East Asia and other countries, first in East and South Asia and then with Europe from the 16th century onwards, led to the creation of many flourishing commercial ports, such as Malacca and Penang. However, almost all of these either decayed totally or became large modern international ports. In both cases the

original townscape was lost through neglect or demolition respectively.

The only South-East Asian trading port with which Hoi An can be compared is Vigan in The Philippines (which is by coincidence also nominated for the World Heritage List in 1999). It is difficult to differentiate between the two in terms of either architecture, which represent a blend of indigenous and imported styles, or level of intactness. There is, however, one significant difference between the two. The street plan of Vigan was laid down by the Spanish conquerors of The Philippines and is indistinguishable from that of the many Spanish colonial towns in the Americas. By contrast, the street plan of Hoi An is one that evolved organically as the town itself developed economically and socially. Hoi An is also exceptional in the predominance of wood as a building material.

### **Brief description**

Hoi An is an exceptionally well preserved example of a South-East Asian trading port from the 15th to 19th centuries. Its buildings and its street pattern reflect the influences, both indigenous and foreign, that combined to produce this unique survival.

### **Recommendation**

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and v*:

*Criterion ii* Hoi An is an outstanding material manifestation of the fusion of cultures over time in an international commercial port.

*Criterion v* Hoi An is an exceptionally well preserved example of a traditional Asian trading port.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## My Son (Vietnam)

No 949

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	My Son Sanctuary
<i>Location</i>	Duy Phu Commune, Duy Xuyen District, Quang Nam Province
<i>State Party</i>	Socialist Republic of Vietnam
<i>Date</i>	28 July 1998

### Justification by State Party

My Son, a valley surrounded by mountains, was chosen as the site for a religious centre for the capital of the Champa Kingdom. The My Son sanctuary area is one of the most famous Champa architectural and sculptural monuments in Vietnam. The material remains contribute to the understanding of the evolution of Cham thought.

The majority of the My Son towers were built in the 10th century AD. Many were damaged during the recent war; they are being preserved to await decisions on future repair work.

#### Criteria ii and v

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### History

The Champa Kingdom began in AD 192 when the people of the Tuong Lam area rose up against their Chinese overlords and founded an independent state in the narrow strip of land along the coast of central Vietnam. This state is known from sporadic Chinese records, in which it appeared successively as Lam Ap, Hoan Vuong, and then Chiem Thanh, a transcription of *Champapura*, meaning "the city of the Cham people." The Cham economy was based on farming (wet-rice agriculture), fishing, and seaborne trade.

The Cham came under the influence of the Hindu religion of the Indian sub-continent early in their development, though the exact date is not known. Many temples were built to the Hindu divinities, such as Krishna and Vishnu, but above all Shiva. Mahayana Buddhism must have penetrated the Cham culture later, probably in the 4th century, and became strongly established in the north of the Champa Kingdom, but Shiva Hinduism remained the state religion.

There were two sacred cities in the Champa Kingdom, each belonging to a large clan. My Son (the name in Vietnamese means "Beautiful Mountain") was sacred to the Dua clan (*Narikelavansa* in Sanskrit), who worshipped the mythical king Srisanabhadresvara and governed Amaravati, the northern part of the kingdom; it was also the capital of the whole Champa Kingdom. Whilst the religious significance of My Son was important, its location, in a small valley surrounded by high mountains gave it strategic significance as an easily defensible stronghold.

Successive kings in the 6th to 8th centuries favoured My Son and endowed it with fine temples. Between 749 and 875 the Cau clan were in power, and for a time the capital was moved to Vivapura in the south of the territory. Nevertheless, My Son retained its religious importance, and resumed its paramountcy in the early 9th century during the reign of Naravarman I, who won many battles against the Chinese and Khmer armies.

From the beginning of the 10th century the influence of Buddhism began to wane, to the advantage of My Son, where Hinduism had always been strong. By the reign of Giaya Simhavaram in the later 10th century it had achieved parity with Buddhism in the Cham Kingdom. It was at this time that most of the finest surviving architectural monuments were built there.

Most of the 11th century was a period of continuous warfare and My Son, along with other sacred sites in the Champa Kingdom, suffered grievously. It was Harivarman IV who brought peace to the kingdom. He had moved his capital to Do Ban towards the end of the century but he undertook the restoration of My Son. Warfare broke out again in the 12th century, when Jaya Indravarman IV attacked the Khmer Empire and sacked its capital. This resulted in an immediate reprisal, and the Champa Kingdom was occupied by the Khmers from 1190 to 1220.

From the 13th century the Champa Kingdom slowly declined and was absorbed by the growing power of Vietnam. It ceased to exist as an entity in the later 15th century, when worship ceased at My Son.

#### Description

Within the nominated site, which represents the ancient settlement and sanctuary area, eight groups of tower temples have been singled out, denominated A-H in accordance with the classification of the French architect and archaeologist Henry Parmentier, who studied My Son in the earlier 20th century and recorded nearly seventy monuments.

In date they cover the period from the 10th to the 13th century, and this long date range is reflected in different architectural styles. All are constructed in fired brick with stone pillars and decorated with sandstone bas-reliefs depicting scenes from Hindu mythology.

The basic layout of a tower-temple, which mirrors the Hindu cosmogony, centres around the main tower (*kalan*), symbolizing the sacred mountain (*meru*) at the centre of the universe. The square or rectangular base (*bhurloka*), representing the human world, is built in brick or stone blocks and decorated with reliefs. Above this rises the main tower (*bhuvakola*), constructed entirely in brick, with applied columns and a false door facing east, also lavishly ornamented. The interiors are plain, with small niches for lamps; the *Shivalingam* was situated on a plinth in the centre.

It symbolized the spirit world. The towers were separated from their roofs (*suarloka*) by a decorated frieze. They consisted of three storeys forming a stepped pyramid, and represented Kailasa, the mountain sacred to Shiva. It is known that many of these roofs were originally covered with gold or silver leaf.

In front of the *kalan* there was a smaller gate-tower (*gopura*), built in brick with stone pillars. Most of the temple complexes had long buildings (*mandapa*) with tiled roofs adjacent to the gate-towers, for religious ceremonies. In many cases there were smaller two-roomed temples (*kasagraha*) for the worship of lesser deities around the *kalan*. Each complex was surrounded by a thick wall of brick, but these have almost entirely disappeared over the centuries since My Son ceased to be a sacred centre.

The predominant style of the architecture and sculptural decoration of the My Son temples derives directly from India. There are, however, some elements of Vietnamese art, from the north, to be observed, most significantly the boat-shaped roofs of one or two of the buildings that are characteristic of Dong Son architecture.

There are thirteen temples within the enclosure designated *Group A*, the main one of which, A1, is the highest in My Son (24m). Close by is the subsidiary *Group A'*, with four temples. Most were built in the 10th century, apart from A10, from before 875.

*Group B*, with the associated *Groups C and D*, is the largest concentration of temples at My Son, 27 in all. They range in date from the 10th to the 12th century. Temple B1 was built in 1275 and was the largest at My Son; it has, however, been largely destroyed by bombing. Of especial beauty is temple B5, an auxiliary structure used for housing offerings.

There are two main temples in *Group E*, one from the 7th century and the other from the 11th century. The earlier of these, E1, can be seen to have contained a great deal of wood in its original construction. It is noteworthy for the sophistication and variety of its carved decoration.

*Group F* has only two temples. Temple F2 has some decorative features which, together with its overall architectural style in the Hoa Lai style, suggest an early 9th century date.

Jaya Harivarman I built the five temples that comprise *Group G* on a hill between Groups A and E in the 12th century. One was used for the worship of the monarch's parents and the other was dedicated to his guardian angel. There is extensive use of terra cotta, characteristic of Cham art in the 12th and 13th centuries.

*Group H*, to the west of the others, consists of four temples from the late 12th and early 13th centuries, among the latest to be built at My Son. Only the main temple H1 has survived wartime bombing.

In addition to these groups, there are three small isolated tower temples (K, L, and M), but all have deteriorated to a considerable extent.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

The My Son sanctuary, covering an area of 310ha, was registered as a National Monument in 1979. In 1989 the People's Committee of the former Province of Quang Nam - Da Nang issued Decision No 1484/QD-UB "Regarding the prohibited enclosure for protecting the Hon Den - My Son cultural and historical monuments zone." This defines an area of 1062ha within which settlement, grazing, logging, and other activities deleterious to the preservation of the site and its monuments are prohibited. It also assigns responsibilities for the enforcement of this decree.

### Management

Overall responsibility for the protection of the property rests with the Ministry of Culture and Information, operating through its Department of Preservation and Museology. This is devolved to the Quang Nam Provincial Department of Culture and Information, which collaborates closely with the People's Committee and the Division of Culture and Information of Duy Xuyen District, which has established a Committee of Management of the My Son Monuments.

Account is taken of the special needs of the historic heritage in the National Plan for the Development of Tourism in Vietnam and in the General Plan for the Socio-Economic Development of Duy Xuyen District.

A Master Plan for the Strengthening, Preservation, and Exploitation of the My Son Monuments Zone has been completed by the Quang Nam Provincial Department of Culture and Information. Following an evaluation of the current state of conservation of the monuments, it defines and prioritizes objectives for infrastructure development, conservation, and promotion and tourism development. There are two implementation phases (1999-2005 and 2005-2010), for which detailed budgets have been prepared. Responsibility for preservation and conservation is allocated to the Department of Preservation and Museology of the Ministry of Culture, whilst the Province and District authorities will be responsible for maintenance, presentation, and tourist promotion. At the time of the ICOMOS expert mission (see below), this was awaiting official approval.

There is no human settlement in the nominated area or the buffer zone, and none is permissible under the protective legislation. The Quang Nam Socio-Economic Master Plan provides for rehabilitation of the forested area surrounding the site in order to improve the ecological environment and local climatic conditions.

The staffing of the property consists at the present time of six graduate conservators and administrators, two conservation and museology students, one graduate accountant, and eight guards. Maintenance workers are provided by the District.

Annual visitor numbers have risen steadily from 3570 in 1990 to 12,500 in 1997. The national tourism plan foresees very substantial increases in visitor numbers in the coming decade.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

Following the survey and inventory work of Parmentier in the earlier 20th century, restoration work was carried out at My Son by the École Française de l'Extrême-Orient (EFEO) in 1938-44. This included the construction in 1939-41 of a

dam on the stream which passes through the site, following a disastrous flood, but this was swept away by further flooding in 1946.

With the start of hostilities in 1965 My Son became a guerrilla base and the whole region was the target for American bombing and minelaying. In August 1969 the sanctuary itself was heavily bombed, causing great destruction. After the war the area was progressively cleared of mines and unexploded bombs and shells.

In 1980 a Polish expert delegation from PKZ worked with specialists from the Vietnamese Ministry of Culture and Information to study Champa remains in central Vietnam. A joint Committee for the Restoration of Champa Remains was set up and work was carried out on the documentation and consolidation of temples in Groups A-D and general clearance of the site. Between 1990 and 1996 work was concentrated on the removal of vegetation from the structures and on the consolidation of the bases of temples in Groups E-H.

Current conservation work is restricted to further removal of vegetation and soil from structures. There is a regular monitoring system for the My Son monuments, for which the Management Board and the Quang Nam Provincial Museum are responsible. Reports are submitted to the Provincial Department of Culture and Information and the Department of Preservation and Museology of the Ministry of Culture and Information.

The Italian Fondazione Lerici prepared a project for a computer-based archaeological map of the My Son area in 1998. This would involve photo-interpretation using satellite imaging and aerial photography, archaeological and topographical reconnaissance, geomorphological and hydrogeological reconnaissance, geophysical exploration, a survey of the state of degradation of the monuments, trial excavations, the creation of a Geographic Information System (GIS) database, and training courses. It would last three years. (No reference is made to this project in the nomination dossier, although the project document is included in the annex to the nomination, and so its current status is uncertain.)

#### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of My Son in terms of design, materials, workmanship, and setting is high. Conservation interventions under French and Polish expert guidance have been relatively minor and do not affect the overall level of authenticity, although some are not in conformity with contemporary conservation principles.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited My Son in January 1999.

##### *Qualities*

The My Son Sanctuary is a remarkable architectural ensemble that developed over a period of ten centuries. It presents a vivid picture of spiritual and political life in an important phase of the history of South-East Asia.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The Champa Kingdom exhibits a number of qualities that make it unique among the major historic kingdoms of South-East Asia. Of especial importance is the association with the Hindu religion, imported from India, which stubbornly persisted here in the face of Buddhist competition for many centuries. Comparisons may be made with more spectacular sites, such as Angkor (Cambodia), Pagan (Myanmar), or Sukhothai (Thailand), but these represent cultures that are complementary to that of My Son rather than competitive in cultural and spiritual terms.

##### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

It is essential that the management plan should be implemented without delay. Despite the wholly admirable efforts of the State Party, the state of conservation of many of the individual monuments is very poor, and there is a need for urgent action.

The proposed Italian project is commendable, since it is designed to increased understanding of the entire complex, and also includes an important training element. It is hoped that funding can be secured for the implementation of this project as soon as possible.

#### **Brief description**

During the 4th to 13th centuries there was a unique culture on the coast of contemporary Vietnam, owing its spiritual origins to the Hinduism of India. This is graphically illustrated by the remains of a series of impressive tower temples in a dramatic site that was the religious and political capital of the Champa Kingdom for most of its existence.

#### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *deferred*. The State Party should be requested to supply information on the implementation of the management plan for the property and assurances that the necessary funding will be forthcoming. If this information is available before the 23rd Session of the World Heritage Committee in December 1999, ICOMOS recommends that this property should be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria ii and iii*:

*Criterion ii* The My Son Sanctuary is an exceptional example of cultural interchange, with the introduction the Hindu architecture of the Indian sub-continent into South-East Asia.

*Criterion iii* The Champa Kingdom was an important phenomenon in the political and cultural history of South-East Asia, vividly illustrated by the ruins of My Son.

However, in the case that it is not available by that meeting, ICOMOS suggests that the procedure last used in 1991, whereby the procedure for inscription is deemed to have begun, should be applied.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Mir Castle (Belarus)

No 625

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Mir Castle (The Radzivils Castle)
<i>Location</i>	Grodno Region, Korelichi District
<i>State Party</i>	Republic of Belarus
<i>Date</i>	1 October 1991

### Justification by State Party

The subtly nuanced plastic composition of the Mir Castle, carried out with due consideration for the environment, its dimensions, artistic design, and colours, as well as the harmonious combination of the original design and later developments allow the Mir Castle to be considered a unique masterpiece and an outstanding creation of many generations.

The same factors, together with the originality of the fortifications design, make it a remarkable specimen of a late medieval fortified feudal residence, at least for the Slav territories and the Baltic region.

The original elements of the Castle reflect some characteristics of the late Belorussian Gothic, which developed on the basis of popular arts during the Renaissance period in eastern Europe and was influenced by both the locally prevailing Orthodox faith and, latently, some pagan traditions. Each of these factors contributed to shaping the special characteristics of the Belorussian Gothic, which show in the proportions and dimensions of the construction, adjusted to man and the environment, in the refinement of decoration of the Castle's various elements depending on their functions and significance (which reflects some pagan ideas about the magic of symbols), and in the use in façade decoration of an original combination of light-and-shade effects with confrontation of the textures of various materials and the use of toned colours. These architectural and artistic features make the Castle a unique defence construction of its kind. This original trend in architecture was later supplanted by western schools, whose influence grew with the expansion of Roman Catholicism. In the Mir Castle some later developments according to the principles of the Italian Renaissance were, nevertheless, adapted to the original design with the use of local artistic methods and traditions.

On the other hand, the Mir Castle had undergone hardly any stylization or imitative reconstruction. All the extraneous features are clearly authentic. The project currently under way envisages preservation, conservation, selective scientifically based restoration of various original elements and later developments, and opening the site for visitors.

**Criteria i, iii, and iv**

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *monument*.

### History and Description

#### *History*

The castle was built in the late 15th or early 16th century (the first reference to it dates from 1531) by the Ilyinichi family. The initial work consisted of building the walls and towers, but work came to an end for some unknown reason. Building had been completed by the beginning of the 17th century with the addition of palatial accommodation, with some Renaissance features (including an Italian-style garden), after it had passed to the Radzivil family in 1569. This work was probably supervised by the Italian architect Gian Maria Bernardoni.

Following sieges in 1655 and 1706 reconstruction work involved the addition of some Baroque features. It was badly damaged during the Napoleonic period, in 1794 and again in 1812, and it remained in a state of ruinous abandon until the 1920s some restoration work took place, as a result of which some Secession elements were added. During World War II it served as a prison camp and a ghetto. Restoration did not start in earnest again until 1982.

#### *Description*

The Mir Castle is situated on the bank of a small lake at the confluence of the river Mirianka and a small tributary.

Its fortified walls form an irregular quadrilateral; there are four exterior corner towers with hipped roofs rising to five storeys and a six-storey external gate tower on the western side. All the towers have basements with vaulted ceilings; the basements and lower storeys are four-sided and the upper storeys octagonal. The upper storeys originally had wooden ceilings, but these were later replaced by brick vaulting.

The facades are in brick, with recessed plasterwork. Stone elements were added in the later 16th century. The window and door frames and the balconies are made of sandstone. The roofs are tiled, some of the tiling being glazed.

Some traces of the original ramparts survive to the west, north, and east. The total area of the Castle, as nominated for inscription, is 18,750m<sup>2</sup>, and the entire complex, including the castle and its park, covers 27ha.

### Management and Protection

#### *Legal status*

The property is registered on the State List of Monuments of Town Planning and Architecture of the Republic of Belarus.

#### *Management*

The Mir Castle is owned and administered by the State Arts Museum of the Republic of Belarus. It is managed by the Minsk Regional Agency.

### **Evaluation**

ICOMOS has commissioned a comparative study, which will be ready shortly. An expert evaluation mission is to be sent to the property as soon as possible.

However, it is anticipated that neither the comparative study nor the mission report will be ready in time for ICOMOS to present a recommendation to the meeting of the Bureau of the World Heritage Committee in July 1999.

Moreover, the nomination dossier currently held by ICOMOS was submitted in late 1991. At that time a major restoration project was in progress. ICOMOS wishes to have an up-to-date report on the property, covering current legal status, ownership, management, and conservation history, with appropriate plans, photographs, and slides. If this is available by the end of September 1999, ICOMOS will present an evaluation and recommendation to the Extraordinary Meeting of the Bureau in November 1999.

### **Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting the provision of updated information, as specified above.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Kysuce-Orava Railroad (Slovakia)

No 756

### Identification

*Nomination* The Kysuce-Orava Switchback Railroad

*Location* Central Slovakia

*State Party* Slovak Republic

*Date* 18 October 1995

### Justification by State Party

The narrow-gauge Kysuce-Orava Switchback Railroad is the technical masterpiece of a creative author. In a short section of track it utilizes the switchback system to overcome the extreme differences in height of the terrain and sensitively blends into the surrounding natural environment.

#### Criterion i

The railroad, with its rare switchback system, is exceptional for the whole European continent.

#### Criterion iii

It is unique in respect of its technical solution to the problem of elevation and is an example of technical progress in the fields of transportation and forestry.

#### Criterion iv

The railroad is currently threatened by rapid social, economic, and technological changes. It is necessary to preserve it for the future as an historical and technical monument and a unique document of technological progress.

#### Criterion v

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*. It may also be considered as a linear *cultural landscape*, as defined in the *Operational Guidelines* (1998), paragraphs 35-39.

### History and Description

#### History

The geomorphological character of this picturesque region of north-western Slovakia determined its settlement. It is characterized by *kopanice* villages with scattered farms gradually moving outwards on newly cleared land. In the 15th to 17th centuries these settlement slowly spread from

the Kysuce and Orava river valleys to the higher ground of the Beskyd and Tatra Mountains. Newcomers were granted land free under the "Wallach" law if they settled uninhabited areas with less favourable climatic and geographical environments, and so the area was gradually deforested. Most of the inhabitants earned their living from agriculture and forestry. The switchback railroad passes through the villages of Nová Bystrica, Oravská Lesná, and Zakamenné.

Forest railroads proliferated in the early 20th century and represented a significant technological development in forestry. The Kysuce-Orava railroad began in 1926, when the Kysuce line between Oš• adnica and Chmúra and the Orava line between Lokce and Erdútky were joined. These had been built (to a 760mm gauge) in 1915-18 for the transportation of timber. The Kysuce line was linked at Oš• adnica by a branch line to the main Košice-Bohumín line, but the Orava line had no comparable link: timber had to be floated down the Biela Orava river and thence carted over a long and difficult road. To solve this problem, the Orava Forest Administration decided to build a 10.5km branch line connecting Erdútky and Chmúra.

Work began in 1925 in two sections. The first, from Gontkuly (Erdútky) to the saddle of the Beskyd Mountains was straightforward, but the second, from Chmúra to the saddle, presented considerable technical problems, since it had to climb 217.69m in a distance of no more than 1500m. The complicated terrain did not permit the use of the conventional serpentine track, and so the engineering company (Dipl.Ing. L. and E. Gál of Ru• omberok) opted for the construction of three dead-ends or switchbacks, with further switchback stations at Chmúra and the saddle. Work was completed in 1926 and the full Kysuce-Orava railroad came into operation over 61km of line, with several spurs, eventually totalling 110km.

The line was in continuous use, using steam locomotives and special open timber cars, until the beginning of the 1970s, when the decision was taken to dismantle it since it was a more expensive method of timber transportation than the use of road vehicles. It was scheduled for total dismantling by the end of 1971, but a resolute campaign by "friends" of switchback railroads, supported by the Institute of Monuments, succeeded in saving the switchback section, which was placed under the cultural commission of the District National Office in • adca, with the Kysuce Museum responsible for its administration.

#### Description

The preserved section of the switchback railroad runs between Chmúra and Tane• ník; in addition, the short section between Chmúra and Kubátkovia was entirely reconstructed on the original bed. The total length of the preserved section proposed for inclusion on the World Heritage List covers a distance of 11km.

There are three dead-ends or switchbacks, with points, and one stretch of serpentine track in this length. The buildings associated with the line which are preserved include the railway depot at Chmúra and the locomotive shed and the forest workers dormitory near Tane• ník. There are twenty bridges along the route, three of them with sluices.

### Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The property that is the subject of this nomination is situated in the villages of Nová Bystrica, Oravská, Lesná, and Zakamenné. Nová Bystrica is in the Kysuce Landscape Protected Area and the other three villages are in the Upper Orava Landscape Protected Area. The Kubátkovia-Beskyd section (in Nová Bystrica) forms part of the Kysuce Open-Air Museum of Folk Architecture and is protected under Slovakian Law No 109/1961 on "Museums and Galleries."

The Switchback Railroad was declared a cultural monument in 1972 by the District Administration Offices in adca and Dolný Kubín in accordance with Law No 7/1958. It also comes under the provisions of Law No 27/1987 on "The State Preservation of Monuments" as part of the cultural heritage of the Slovak Republic (Nos 2713 and 2714 of the Central List of Cultural Monuments of the Slovak Republic).

Other statutory instruments that apply to all or part of the railroad are Law No 50/1976 on "Territorial Planning and Building Codes," Law No 43/1990 on "Design Preparation for Buildings," Law No 61/1977 on "Protection of Forests," and Law No 100/1977 (amended under Law No 15/1994) on "State Administration of Forest Management."

### *Management*

The Railroad is owned by the Slovak Republic. When the property was saved from dismantling there were lengthy discussions about the best means of managing it. It was eventually decided that the best solution would be to incorporate the Kubátkovia-Beskyd section of it within the Kysuce Open-Air Museum of Folk Architecture, construction of which began in 1974. Part of the railroad is now functioning again and is used for transporting visitors to the Museum. The Beskyd-Taneník section is managed by the Orava Museum in Oravský Podzámok.

## **Conservation and Authenticity**

### *Conservation history*

Systematic restoration and conservation date from 1972, when the railroad was declared a cultural monument, and it has been intensified since the establishment of the Open-Air Museum. In 1993-94 the damaged rail bed, all the bridges, and some sluices were renovated in the Kubátkovia-Beskyd section. The rails were also renovated, faulty sleepers replaced, and a new rail bed of compacted gravel laid. The roof of the forestry workers' hostel near Taneník was renewed.

### *Authenticity*

The authenticity of the Switchback Railroad over most of its route is irrefutable: it preserves in every detail its form and condition when it was in full operation. Great pains were taken to ensure the use of appropriate materials and techniques when the Kubátkovia-Beskyd section was restored, on its original alignment.

## **Evaluation**

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS-TICCIH expert mission visited the Kysuce-Orava Switchback Railroad in May 1996.

### *Qualities*

The Kysuce-Orava Switchback Railroad is an important and very well preserved example of a type of railway developed for dealing with very steep gradients in difficult mountainous terrain. These were not uncommon earlier in the present century, but most have been dismantled in recent decades.

### *Comparative analysis*

The only comparable properties of this type, once very common but now reduced to a handful, that have been identified by the State Party in the nomination dossier are the Ferrocarril Central (Perú), still in use for freight and passenger service between Callao and Oroya, and then in two branches to Heancayo and Cerro de Pasco, the line from Antofagasta (Chile) to Salto (Argentina), now used only for freight, and the Darjeeling Himalayan Railway (India), still in use for both passengers and freight.

### *ICOMOS comments*

The 1998 international comparative study of *Railways as World Heritage Sites* coordinated by the National Railway Museum, York (United Kingdom) at the request of ICOMOS defines specific criteria for evaluating historic railways. To be considered for inscription on the World Heritage List they should conform with one or more of the following:

- be a creative work indicative of genius;
- demonstrate the influence of, and on, innovative technology;
- be an outstanding or typical example;
- be illustrative of economic or social developments.

ICOMOS recognizes the technological interest of the Kysuce-Orava Switchback Railroad. It specially commends the State Party for the efforts that it has made to prevent this important technological monument from being dismantled. However it is of the opinion that the historical and technological significance of this railway is limited, and that it does not qualify for inscription under the special criteria defined in the 1998 comparative study.

## **Recommendation**

That this property should not be inscribed on the World Heritage List.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Neolithic Orkney (United Kingdom)

No 514rev

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Heart of Neolithic Orkney
<i>Location</i>	Scotland
<i>State Party</i>	United Kingdom
<i>Date</i>	26 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

Maes Howe, Stenness, Brogar, and Skara Brae proclaim the triumphs of the human spirit away from the traditionally recognized early centres of civilisation, during the half-millennium which saw the first mastabas of the archaic period of Egypt, the brick temples of Sumeria, and the first cities of the Harappa culture in India.

Maes Howe is a masterpiece of Neolithic peoples. It is an exceptionally early architectural accomplishment. With its almost classical strength and simplicity it is a unique survival from 5000 years ago. It is an expression of genius within a group of people whose other tombs were claustrophobic chambers in smaller mounds. Stenness is a unique and early expression of the ritual customs of the people who buried their dead in tombs like Maes Howe and lived in settlements like Skara Brae. They bear witness, with an extraordinary degree of richness, to a vanished culture which gave rise to the World Heritage sites at Avebury and Stonehenge in England. The Ring of Brogar is the finest known truly circular Late Neolithic or Early Bronze Age stone ring and a later expression of the spirit which gave rise to Maes Howe, Stenness, and Skara Brae.

Skara Brae has particularly rich surviving remains. It displays remarkable preservation of stone-built furniture and a fine range of ritual and domestic artefacts. Its preservation allows a level of interpretation which is unmatched on other excavated settlement sites of this period in Europe. Together, Skara Brae, Stenness, and Maes Howe and the monuments associated with them demonstrate the domestic, ritual, and burial practices of a now vanished 5000-year-old culture with exceptional completeness.

The monuments represent masterpieces of human creative genius (**criterion i**), in that they exhibit an important interchange of human values during the development of the architecture of major ceremonial complexes in Britain (**criterion ii**), in that they bear unique or exceptional

testimony to an important indigenous cultural tradition which flourished over a period of between a millennium and half a millennium but disappeared by about 2000 BC (**criterion iii**), and as an outstanding example of a type of architectural ensemble and archaeological landscape which illustrates that significant stage of human history during which the first large ceremonial monuments were built (**criterion iv**).

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the Neolithic Heart of Orkney is a group of *sites*.

### History and Description

#### History

The Neolithic period in the British Isles is mostly characterized by monumental architecture and a strong development of ritual. Collective burials and ceremonial enclosures appear, revealing a more complex social structure and a mobilization of the efforts of a large number of individuals towards a common goal.

Passage graves such as Maes Howe, built around 3000 BC, were large structures, made of stones ordered to form a passage leading from the outer edge of the mound to the chamber containing the remains of the dead. Whether these graves were meant for the elite or for all the people of the community is still not proven by the specialists, but the large amount of human and animal bones, pottery and other objects discovered in these mounds testify that they were important social and religious centres. The general orientation of these structures also demonstrate the knowledge of the builders in respect to seasonal movements. The passage of Maes Howe, for example, points close to midwinter sunset and the setting sun of winter solstice shines on its chamber.

The Ring of Brogar, a true circle formed by sixty tall standing stones with an outer ditch in circular form, also seems to have served the purpose of observing solar and lunar events, although conclusive evidence has not yet been brought forth by scientists.

In the same area, a Neolithic village of stone-built houses connected by passages was discovered and excavated. The earliest settlement started around 3100 BC. The site was then occupied for some 600 years. The buildings visible today are dated between 2900 and 2600 BC. The house styles vary according to the different periods of occupation, but the basic components of the interior remain the same: beds to either side and built into the walls, central hearth, and dresser, also in stone, in the back. Activities include cattle and sheep herding, fishing, and cereal farming, all characteristic of Neolithic communities. This site also has evidence for ritual activity, closely interlinked with domestic activities, which is demonstrated by the presence of scratched shapes close to doors and divisions in the passages connecting the houses, caches of beads and pendants, and buried individuals inside some houses.

The structures of Orkney were built during the period extending from 3000 BC to 2000 BC. There is evidence for

ritual re-use of the religious sites in the Early Iron Age, suggested by the presence of pottery in pits. The settlements, however, had a fairly short life span of about 600 years.

In the mid 12th century AD, Norsemen and Viking crusaders set foot on the islands. Carved runes on the stones of the main chamber of Maes Howe testify to their presence at that time. The site, quite isolated, is at the present time sited within what is essentially a pastoral landscape.

#### *Description*

The Orkney Islands lie 15km north of the coast of Scotland. The archipelago is composed of some 40 islands and numerous islets, of which only 17 are now inhabited. Tall cliffs and wide open grasslands form today's landscape.

The two areas selected are about 6.6km apart on the island of Mainland, the largest in the archipelago. The Brodgar Rural Conservation Area lies around an isthmus dividing the Loch of Harray to the east and the Loch of Stenness to the west; it includes the sites of Maes Howe, the Stones of Stenness, and the Ring of Brogar. The Neolithic settlement of Skara Brae is on the west coast of Mainland on the southern edge of the Bay of Skaill, the size and shape of which have been altered considerably by erosion over the centuries. It was covered by an immense sand dune until 1850. Taking into account the substantial buffer zones, the nominated area covers close to 161km<sup>2</sup>.

*Maes Howe* is a mound, 35m across and still 7m high, built partly on an artificial platform and surrounded by a ditch. Inside the mound are a passage and chambers made of large stone slabs; it was originally closed by a blocking slab. The main chamber is 4.6m square; the flanking side chambers held the remains of the dead and were probably the site of religious ceremonies. Excavations were carried out in the middle 1950s and again in 1973 and 1974, revealing the full extent of the structure.

The *Stones of Stenness* were set up around 3000 BC. Twelve large standing stones, the tallest over 5.7m high, were erected in the form of an ellipse pointing a little west of north and enclosed by a ditch 6m wide and 2.3m deep and an outer bank, both pierced by a causeway.

The Watch Stone is a monolith 5.5m tall at the south end of the causeway between the Lochs of Harray and Stenness. There is evidence that there were other monoliths in this area.

The *Ring of Brogar*, which is located 1.5km from the Stones of Stenness, is a series of sixty tall stones forming a true circle of 104m diameter surrounded by a ditch 5-6m wide and 3m deep. An area of some 10ha containing thirteen burial mounds and a stone setting surround the ring and form part of the same monument. The three most important, Salt Knowe, Plumcake Mound, and South Mound, were built and used between 2500 and 1500 BC.

The buffer zone also contains a number of funerary, ritual, and domestic sites that are contemporary with the nominated sites or have the potential to explain the rituals carried on these sites. The Barnhouse settlement, started before 3000 BC, is a crucial element of comparison for an understanding of the nominated monuments in their

context. The settlement proves to have been a highly organized one, as demonstrated by its basic layout, which persisted over time, and by the existence of specialized areas for each industrial activity. Each house, built out of stone and turf, has the same interior arrangement as the one found in Skara Brae: a stone dresser in the back, a central hearth, and stone box beds on either side. Furthermore, a stone bearing carvings similar to those in Skara Brae and Maes Howe was found in Barnhouse.

When it was built 5000 years ago, the settlement of *Skara Brae* was further from the sea than it is at the present time, since the sea level was much higher then. The settlement is composed of stone-built houses which are free-standing. They have beds recessed in the walls, central hearths, and stone dressers in the back of the main room. Over time the house styles evolved, becoming larger and the beds being built out into the living space. One of the houses, built on an oval plan with a porch, was isolated beyond an open space at one of end the settlement; it is interpreted as a workshop because of the flint debris that it contained. The settlement was abandoned some 600 years after it was built, and most of the houses were emptied of their contents. The site was then covered by wind-blown sand.

#### **Management and Protection**

##### *Legal status*

The monuments in the nominated area and those included in the buffer zones are all protected by the United Kingdom Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979, Section 28 of which states that altering or destroying protected ("scheduled") ancient monuments is punishable by law.

All the monuments except Skara Brae are within a Conservation Area designated under the provisions of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. The 1994 National Planning Policy Guideline *Archaeology and Planning* (NPPG 5) and its associated Planning Advice Note *Archaeology - the Planning Process and Scheduled Monument Procedures* (PAN 42) provide advice to planning authorities on how to deal with protected ancient monuments under the stringent development planning and control systems.

The Structure Plan prepared by Orkney Islands Council and approved by the Secretary of State for Scotland in 1979 is a strategic document. It formally acknowledges the uniqueness of Orkney's archaeological monuments and provides for strict control to be exercised to safeguard the archaeological heritage from injurious development.

Several of the adjacent areas and the buffer zones are protected under other legislative instruments. The Lochs of Stenness and Harray are designated under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981 as Sites of Special Scientific Interest, and the Loch of Stenness is a candidate Special Area of Conservation of Natural Habitats and of Wild Flora and Fauna under the European Union Habitats Directive. The outer buffer zone in the Brodgar Rural Conservation Area was designated in 1980 as a National Scenic Area.

##### *Management*

The ownership of these monuments is shared by the State (Ring of Brogar) and private individuals (Maes Howe, Stenness, and Skara Brae). However, management of the nominated monuments, which are scheduled or in the process of being rescheduled under the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979, is the sole responsibility of Historic Scotland, an executive agency within the Scottish Office responsible for administering the laws concerning the protection and the management of ancient monuments.

The Inspectors of Ancient Monuments of Historic Scotland are graduates with archaeological, historical, and cultural resource management expertise. They are centrally based in Edinburgh. The professional staff of Historic Scotland also includes fully trained architects with appropriate conservation expertise, who work at Regional and District level. Qualified conservators work from the Stenhouse Conservation Centre. The Technical Conservation, Research and Education Division commissions research and publishes technical reports on conservation topics. Its Superintendents of Works are fully qualified technical staff and in-house and external training is provided for its masons and other staff.

The Historic Scotland officials work closely with the local authorities, and in particular with the Island Archaeologist, who is a member of the staff of the Orkney Council Planning Department. There is also excellent cooperation with local voluntary bodies, such as the Orkney Heritage Society and the Orkney Archaeological Trust, and with the local inhabitants, who are strongly committed to the protection of the island's prehistoric heritage.

An overall management plan for the Heart of Neolithic Orkney and management plans specific to the major monuments of the nominated area (Skara Brae, Maes Howe, and the Stones of Stenness) are in course of completion. The aims of these plans are to ensure proper management of the site through public consultation and co-operation of all partners with interests in that site. Major issues regarding the presentation of the site, the spreading of information, the environment, community life, and tourism are outlined and discussed, and there is provision for annual work plans.

The properties are inspected annually by the Regional Architect and the Principal Inspector. A Technical Officer visits each site every month. Day to day monitoring is by stewarding staff and the Monument Conservation Unit.

Tourism is a major issue, considering that some 91,000 visitors visit Skara Brae and Maes Howe every year. These arrive mostly by boat and buses. Guided tours are available and interpretation centres and interpretative boards provide background information for visitors. There are visitor centres at Maes Howe and Skara Brae, the former in a well preserved historic building.

Current management plans focus on the development of high-quality cultural tourism which makes use of basic information on site without impinging on the monuments themselves, and on controlling the flow of visitors by spreading them out over the sites by means of various activities.

### **Conservation and Authenticity**

#### *Conservation history*

The Norse runic inscriptions at *Maes Howe* were first recorded in 1862, following the clearance of the fallen roof structure the previous year. Scientific excavations, followed by consolidation, were carried out at Maes Howe in 1954-55 and again in 1973-74.

The *Stones of Stenness* were first recorded in 1700. In 1760, four of the original twelve stones were still standing and one was recumbent. By 1851 only three stones remained, one of them recumbent (this was re-erected in 1906). In 1908 a number of the stones were set up in the interior as a "dolmen." By 1973 the ditch surrounding the stones had been almost completely obliterated by centuries of ploughing and so a full scientific excavation was carried out, as a result of which it was possible to restore the stones to their original settings (but in a form that is completely reversible if further research shows this to have been erroneous) and to clear the ditch.

The first written reference to the *Ring of Brogar* dates from 1529. In 1792, eighteen of the stones were still erect and eight recumbent and by 1815, only sixteen were left standing, with seventeen fragments less than 1m high. The first accurate survey was carried out in 1854, when the record shows that, of the sixty original stones, thirteen were still erect, ten were prostrate, and thirteen survived as no more than stumps. When the monument was taken into State guardianship in 1906, most of the fallen stones were re-erected in their original sockets (but with the same safeguards as at Stenness); at the present time, 36 of the original sixty are now upright. The interior of the circle has never been excavated, but a section cut across the encircling ditch in 1973 showed it to have been about 6m wide by 3m deep.. All the neighbouring mounds were excavated unscientifically in the 19th century.

In the mid 19th century the remains of *Skara Brae* were revealed when the overlying sand was swept away by a violent storm, and some clearance work took place in 1913. In 1924 it came into State guardianship and, following another storm shortly afterwards, a protective breakwater was built, when the opportunity was taken for limited excavation. Major scientific excavations were carried out in 1972-73. Further occupation sites have been revealed nearby by more recent storms and further excavations began in 1998.

A number of prehistoric settlements have been discovered in the buffer zone around Maes Howe, the Stones of Stenness, and the Ring of Brogar created by the Brodgar Rural Community Conservation Area. Some of these have been excavated in the 19th and later 20th centuries.

The overall state of preservation of all the monuments is good. Problems connected with dampness in the chamber at Maes Howe were solved by stabilization work carried out in the 1930s.

#### *Authenticity*

There is a high level of authenticity on all the sites that make up this nomination. Maintenance work began in the later 19th century on all of them, and it has been carried out systematically for much of the present century. In the late 19th century and early 20th centuries, some restoration work was carried out, respecting the principles of anastylosis as later defined by the Venice Charter (1964),

at the Ring of Brogar and the Stones of Stenness. In both cases only original materials or, to a very limited extent, materials that were identical in character and origin were used, and care was taken to ensure that restored sections were clearly distinguishable from original structures.

## Evaluation

### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Orkney in January 1999.

### *Qualities*

The four monuments that make up the Neolithic Heart of Orkney are unquestionably among the most important Neolithic sites in western Europe. They provide exceptional evidence of the material and spiritual standards and beliefs and the social structures of this dynamic period of prehistory.

### *Comparative analysis*

The obvious comparison are with the two groups of Neolithic monuments in the British Isles that are already on the World Heritage List: Stonehenge and Avebury (England) and the monuments of the Bend of the Boyne (Ireland).

The two great English henge monuments, with their surrounding landscapes, are unquestionably paramount. They represent, however, the flowering of the megalithic culture of the Neolithic period in a benign physical environment, where human settlement persisted for several millennia.

The chambered tombs of the Bend of the Boyne – Newgrange, Knowth, and Dowth – are exceptional examples of this type of funerary monument, both in size and in design. By comparison Maes Howe is a relatively modest structure.

The special qualities of the Orkney group which make it eligible for inscription on the World Heritage List alongside those mentioned above relate to its location and its nature. The physical environment of the Orcadian archipelago was a harsh one by comparison with that of the chalk uplands of southern England or the fertile Boyne valley, yet a society rich in culture established itself here and flourished for more than a millennium.

The cultural diversity of Neolithic Orkney is admirably represented by the four nominated monuments – two ceremonial sites, a large chambered tomb, and a sophisticated dwelling. The wealth of unexcavated contemporary burial and occupation sites in the buffer zone constitute an exceptional relict cultural landscape. As a group they serve as a compact paradigm of the megalithic culture of western Europe that is without parallel.

### *ICOMOS comments*

In 1988 the State Party nominated Maes Howe, Stenness, and Brogar for inscription. In its evaluation, ICOMOS expressed its support in principle for this nomination. However, it regretted the fact that other Neolithic monuments on Orkney, and in particular Skara Brae, had not been included in the nomination. It also intimated that consideration might be given to “a proposal that would take into account the natural features of the Orkney Islands archipelago.” The ICOMOS recommendation that the

nomination be deferred to enable the State Party “to draft a less restrictive proposal” was adopted by the Bureau at its 1988 meeting.

During the preparation of the revised nomination which is the subject of the present evaluation, consideration was given by the State Party to the possibility of nominating a large area of the island of Mainland as a cultural landscape. It was felt, however, that the Neolithic landscape had been obliterated to such an extent by post-medieval land allocation and use that Mainland could no longer be considered as a relict landscape of World Heritage quality. ICOMOS concurs in this decision, but applauds the decision of the State Party to include Skara Brae in the nominated property.

## Brief description

The group of Neolithic monuments on Orkney consist of a large chambered tomb (Maes Howe), two ceremonial stone circles (the Stones of Stenness and the Ring of Brodgar), and a settlement (Skara Brae), together with a number of unexcavated burial, ceremonial, and living sites. The group constitutes a major relict cultural landscape depicting graphically life five thousand years ago in this remote archipelago.

## Recommendation

That this property be inscribed on the World Heritage List on the basis of *criteria i, ii, iii, and iv*:

The monuments of Orkney, dating back to 3000-2000 BC, are outstanding testimony to the cultural achievements of the Neolithic peoples of northern Europe.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Potsdam (Germany)

No 532ter

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Palaces and Parks of Potsdam and Berlin (extension)
<i>Location</i>	State of Brandenburg
<i>State Party</i>	Germany
<i>Date</i>	3 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The Baroque residential town of Potsdam with its royal palaces and gardens has been systematically expanded and designed by Prussian kings as an extraordinary man-made landscape. Peter Joseph Lenné's comprehensive plan for the embellishment of the "Potsdam Island," located in the Havel river, served as the basis for this. Accordingly the town and the adjacent royal park ensembles have been designed as a unique comprehensive composition, using the special topography. The extensions proposed to the World Heritage site consist of central elements of this development of remarkable single creations of architecture and gardening into a man-made landscape. The latter has been preserved and can be enjoyed to a large extent despite the development of the town in the 20th century. From the European angle the Potsdam man-made landscape is a unique example of landscape design against the background of monarchic ideas of the state and common efforts for emancipation.

[The existing World Heritage site is inscribed under *criteria i, ii, and iv.*]

### Category of property

In terms of the categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, this is a *site*.

### History and Description

#### - *The Lindenallee*

The first alley lined with lime trees, c 700m long, intended to continue the main axis from Sans Souci to the area of Golmer Luch, outside the boundaries of the park, was opened in 1769, after the New Palace had been completed. Just over a century later Friedrich III ordered it to be extended and an stretch 2km long was prepared by the Royal gardener, Emil Sello.

#### - *The former Gardeners' School*

A tree nursery and school, intended for the raising of plants, the training of young gardeners, and teaching the art of gardening, was set up by Lenné in 1823. When the nursery was transferred to Alt Geltow the Gardeners' School moved into the main building, in the street alongside the New Palace. It was given the name of the Royal Gardeners' School Potsdam, Wildpark in 1854. It was expanded in the Classical style in 1869, and additional farm buildings and greenhouse were added in 1880-82, covering an area of over 4ha. The School transferred to Dahlem in 1902, since when the building has been used as a residence.

When the Berlin-Potsdam railway was extended to Magdeburg in 1846, a new station was built on the access road from Wildpark to the New Palace, principally for the use of the Royal family and their guests, but also for the general public. A new Imperial station was built at the command of Wilhelm II and opened in 1909.

#### - *The Palace and Park of Linstedt*

An existing palace was bought in 1828 by the Crown Prince for his own use. He sketched out plans for its conversion in the style of a rural villa, and the work was carried out in the mid 19th century. The garden was planned by Lenné, but not completed until 1860.

#### - *Bornstedt*

The village of Bornstedt, founded in the later 12th century, came into the possession of the Grand Elector in 1664 and was given to the Potsdam military orphanage by Friedrich Wilhelm I in 1722. It was reacquired in 1841 by Friedrich Wilhelm IV, who assigned it to the Kronfidei Army manors.

Lenné became responsible for laying out the village anew. He changed the orientation of the streets and lanes and carried out extensive landscaping of its surroundings in an Italianate style. The Baroque manor house burned down in 1846, and was replaced by a new structure designed by Johann Heinrich Häberlin, who was responsible for the church with its campanile, also strongly reminiscent of Italy.

#### - *The Seekoppel*

The landscaped area known as the Seekoppel, between the Bornstedt Lake and the Ruinenberg, was laid out by Lenné in 1842.

#### - *Voltaireweg*

The "green belt" of Voltaireweg was first laid out in the late 18th century as a Royal riding circuit and later elaborated by Lenné, with trees, meadows, and gardens. Later buildings have reduced the impact of the original landscape, but it still preserves the character of a narrow green belt.

#### - *The Allee nach Sans Souci*

Before the Sans Souci Park was laid out this was the entrance to Friedrich Wilhelm I's kitchen garden. This area expanded with the addition of a hothouse and solid gardeners' houses. After the creation of Sans Souci as a summer residence for the Prussian monarchs the street attracted court officials, who built villas there. Ludwig Persius converted two existing residences into an administrative building for their use at the command of Friedrich Wilhelm IV in 1842-43, and its Italianate style was followed in later constructions.

#### - *Alexandrovka*

Tsar Alexander I of Russia died in 1825, and Friedrich Wilhelm III, who was interested in Russian culture, as well as having dynastic ties with the Russian Royal family, ordered the creation of a "Russian Colony" in his memory. The overall planning was entrusted to Lenné, and the buildings were in the charge of Captain Sneathlage, commander of the Guards Engineer Unit. The plan included a hippodrome, which symbolized the concept of freedom; it was Friedrich Wilhelm himself who added the Cross of St Andrew, patron saint of Russia.

The colony itself consisted of twelve small log houses and a larger one for the commander, plus a church and house for the priest.

- *The Pfingstberg*

The Allée to the Pheasant Garden laid out by the Great Elector in the 17th century led directly to the Pfingstberg. Friedrich Wilhelm II planned to build a Neo-Gothic belvedere palace on top of the hill, with its fine vistas, but the project had to be abandoned for lack of money. A small pavilion there was rebuilt as a "Greek" garden Temple of Pomona in 1800-01 by Karl Friedrich Schinkel as his very first architectural project.

The panoramic view over Potsdam island inspired another project of Friedrich Wilhelm IV. The hill was to be surmounted by a colonnaded casino with towers and surrounded by water cascades, like an Italian villa. However, only the colonnades and cascades were ever built, in the period between 1847 and 1863.

- *Between the Pfingstberg and the New Garden*

The narrow strip connecting Lenné's parks on the Pfingstberg and the New Garden was laid out as a park in 1862.

- *The southern shore of the Jungfernsee*

A coffee-house with its own vineyard and a restaurant existed on the path along the lake-shore at the end of the 18th century. The former was rebuilt as a tower villa by Persius, and established a model for future villa building in Potsdam. No construction has been permitted on this stretch, now known as Berninistraße, so as not to interfere with Lenné's landscaping of Potsdam Island.

- *The Royal Forest*

The area around the village of Sacrow was owned by several aristocratic families in the 19th century. It was purchased by Friedrich Wilhelm IV and converted into a Royal forest and park by Lenné. The village itself became an integral part of the designed landscape.

- *The approaches to Babelsberg Park*

The landscape of Babelsberg Park is another masterpiece of Lenné, extended from 1842 onwards by Prince Herman von Pückler-Muskau. The approaches, including the wetlands along the Nuthe river, form part of the overall landscape.

- *Babelsberg Observatory*

The Berlin Observatory was obliged to move from the southern outskirts of the fast-growing city, where it had been since 1877. Neubabelsberg was selected as the area for the new location, and part of a neglected Royal estate was identified in 1911. In 1928 this was extended to the west.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The nomination states that "The entire territory of the expansion has been classified as a monumental area according to the Brandenburg State Law about the Protection of Monuments, dated 22.07.91, and is protected by the Statutes for the Protection of the Monumental District of the Berlin-Potsdam man-made landscape according to the UNESCO World Heritage List, administrative district of Potsdam Monumental Districts Statutes dated 30.10.96."

It is also covered by the "Constructional guiding plans of the City of Potsdam" and the "State Treaty about the establishment of the Berlin-Brandenburg Prussian Palaces and Garden Foundation [*Stiftung Preußische Schlösser und Gärten Berlin-Brandenburg*], dated 23 August 1994 .

The ICOMOS expert mission discovered that the buildings and historic gardens and parks are protected individually as monuments. However, no monument list/register was attached to the nomination.

The "Town Planning Situation/Planning Intentions" paragraphs of the nomination lay considerable emphasis on the plans for Potsdam's environmental planning which are to be drawn up. The final environmental planning plans were not yet available at the time of the mission. A number of issues are expected to be finalised in February/March 1999. These issues will then be discussed in the *Stadtparlament*, after which Potsdam can make the plans official.

The proposal to expand the site is based on sections which belong to the core zone or which can be considered as buffer zones. Mention is also made of planned/possible new developments in some areas.

### *Management*

The nomination does not provide precise information on the management of the property. The *Stiftung Preußische Schlösser und Gärten Berlin-Brandenburg* has detailed documentation (photographs, measurements/surveys, maps) on all park components. Each park has been assigned its own engineer. The *Stiftung* has a staff of four garden historians. Five-year plans are being drawn up for each park.

The *Stiftung* has a *Denkmalkommission* (Monuments Committee) to consider fundamental measures concerning such matters as restoration issues.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### *Conservation history*

The *Stiftung Preußische Schlösser und Gärten Berlin-Brandenburg* owns and manages parks and historic buildings in these parks and is extremely active in restoring them or having them restored in an exemplary fashion. Examples include the Roman Bench (*Römische Bank*), which has been brought back to its original site on the western slope of the Ruinenberg, the restoration of the Temple of Pomona on the Pfingstberg and the eight re-opened vistas from the Pfingstberg, the restoration of the original course of the paths

there, and the forthcoming restoration of the left tower of the Belvedere with its Roman Cabinet (Pfungstberg). The spatial relationship between the Pfungstberg and the New Garden, linked by the so-called *Mirbachwäldchen*, has been reinstated, including the restoration of the course of the original paths. Part of the path structure in the New Garden near the Cecilienhof is currently being reconstructed.

The restoration and revitalization of the park layout on the Pfungstberg and of Babelsberg Park have received funding from the *Landesarbeitsamt Berlin-Brandenburg* and the *Internationaler Bund für Sozialarbeit eV*.

During the past few years, the *Stiftung* has restored the Gothic Library in the New Garden (largely financed by the *Land of Berlin*, which contributed 1.6 million DM on the occasion of the 1000th anniversary of Potsdam in 1993).

The *Stiftung* has undertaken various conservation measures for buildings that are waiting for restoration, among them the Belvedere on the Pfungstberg and the Villa Quandt at its foot.

Potsdam has an active policy on monuments, redevelopment, and renovation, the results of which are clearly, and increasingly, visible.

The nomination reports only in general terms on restoration and renovation activities that have taken place at each of the component properties.

#### *Authenticity*

The history of the past fifty years has left its mark on Potsdam property through neglect, collective re-use of buildings, and the construction of military facilities.

The underlying concept is Peter Joseph Lenné's plans, which he designed after the mid 1800s to transform the Havel landscape into the cultural landscape. These designs still determine the layout of Potsdam's cultural landscape.

The policies of the Federal state of Brandenburg, of Potsdam, and of the *Stiftung* are aimed at restoring or emphasizing the historical structure and layout of this planned landscape plan are necessary, while forming the framework for new environmental and urban developments.

The layout of the Alexandrovka has remained virtually unchanged. Regarding the other proposed sections the integrity of the spatial environment seems to have been somewhat disrupted near the Voltaireweg, the southern shore of the Jungferensee, the approaches to Babelsberg Park, and the Babelsberg Observatory.

Extensive historical research (archives, archaeology, architectural history) precedes and supports the *Stiftung's* restoration activities. It guarantees conscientious and responsible restoration and renovation. Partial reconstruction does occur, but this is also based on intensive preliminary studies or research.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited Potsdam in January 1999. Prior to this mission, ICOMOS had been consulted on aspects of planning in Potsdam in 1997 and 1998.

##### *Qualities*

The nomination is a logical supplement to and completion of the existing World Heritage site, first inscribed in 1990 and extended in 1992, because of the historic unity of landscape, composition, architecture, structure, and culture with the existing inscribed property.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The exceptional significance of this site has already been recognized by the World Heritage Committee. The extension now proposed completes the historic cultural ensemble.

##### *ICOMOS recommendations and comments*

ICOMOS recommends that the World Heritage Committee should congratulate the Federal State of Brandenburg, the *Stiftung Preußische Schlösser und Gärten Berlin-Brandenburg*, and the City of Potsdam on the exemplary quality of the many restoration, renovation, and redevelopment projects carried out over the past ten years.

The Committee should propose that a communal board should be set up to coordinate plans for the site composed of members of this Board from Berlin and Potsdam.

All possible means should be sought to stop the *Projekt Quartier Am Bahnhof* and to draw up an urban development plan and a plan for the landscape architecture which will provide an organic link between the City, the Alter Markt, and the Quartier Am Bahnhof to achieve a spatially logical walking route between the city and current entrance to the Potsdam-Stadt station.

To date, no detailed plans for the German Unity Transport Project No 17 have been submitted to the World Heritage Committee. The plans will have an immediate and dramatic visual and technical impact on the heart of the World Heritage site in view of the size of the ships concerned (185m in length) and the desired volume of the shipping traffic.

It must be assumed that there will be far-reaching consequences for the intrinsic quality and significance of the site, greater than those of the Quartier Am Bahnhof which lies outside the boundaries of the site. The World Heritage Committee should request the State Party to provide full information in the 5th Report on the state of conservation, which should be submitted before 15 September 1999.

The environmental and architectural development of and on the Berliner Vorstadt, on both sides of the Berliner Straße (a small peninsula situated between the Heiliger See and the Tiefer See/Havel, which are part of the site) should be included in future reports by the Federal State of Brandenburg on the state of conservation. Changes to scale and size of the buildings there will have a major visual and spatial impact looking from the New Garden, Klein-Glienicke, and Babelsberg Park seen from the Havel. In effect, the Berliner Vorstadt should be taken into consideration as a buffer zone.

During the ICOMOS mission it was agreed that the Federal State of Brandenburg would submit a map with a revised spatial layout of the proposed areas

Biotopes are being itemized by the City in those sections already on the World Heritage List as well as in the sections proposed as extensions. The responsible officials have

recognized that nature conservation in such circumstances can enhance the cultural value.

**Recommendation**

It is recommended that this extension to the World Heritage site of the Palaces and Parks of Potsdam and Berlin should be *approved*, subject to the provision of maps showing revised boundaries, as agreed with the ICOMOS expert mission.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Residences of the Dukes of Este (Italy)

No 733b

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	Residences of the Dukes of Este in the Po delta – an extension to “Ferrara: city of the Renaissance”
<i>Location</i>	Province of Emilia-Romagna
<i>State Party</i>	Italy
<i>Date</i>	29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

[**Note** This text is an abbreviated version of the text appearing in the nomination dossier.]

The residences of the Dukes of Este in the Po delta have for centuries exerted great influence over the development of land-use strategies and landscape in the Mediterranean region.

The shifting landscape of the Ferrara region, sometimes under water, sometimes dry land, which has seen great changes not only in its hydrogeology, but also in its ability to support human populations, is a unique illustration of man's struggle to occupy the land and master the conditions of his environment.

Men have built this environment over the millennia, and have succeeded in marrying their presence, along with the construction of works of immense value, with a profound respect for the natural beauty of the area. The marriage of architecture and nature witnessed here is outstanding, and marks out this cultural landscape, harmonious in its equilibrium, from all other similar examples. **Criterion ii**

The nomination may be considered as a unique, or at least an essential testimony to vanished civilizations (Spina, Pomposa, Este, etc). **Criterion iii**

The nomination constitutes an outstanding example of a type of structure illustrating a significant stage in history (land-reclamation projects and the network of villas in the area). **Criterion iv**

The residences of the Dukes of Este offer a fine example of the introduction of a culture subsequently rendered vulnerable by indirect and irreversible damage. **Criterion v**

This heritage has, however, direct and perceptible associations, both negative and positive, with events and ideas of extraordinary universal importance. **Criterion vi**

### Category of property

In terms of categories of property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the residences of the Dukes of Este in the Po delta are a *group of buildings*. In addition, however, they constitute a cultural landscape as defined in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* (1998), paragraph 39.

### History and Description

#### History

At the dawn of the Iron Age, two main arms of the river dominated the delta: the northern arm which later became the "Po d'Adria", and a more southerly arm occupying a number of different beds around the town of Bondeno. Towards the 8th century BC, hydrological changes created new courses of the river, and on one of these grew up, around the 7th century BC, the Etruscan city of Spina, from whose remains important archaeological finds have been unearthed in excavations.

Spina used its privileged position to become a major trading centre into the hinterland and was also linked to the sea by a canal built in classical antiquity. Excavations have also uncovered Etruscan objects, Greek vases, and all manner of items produced around the Mediterranean, testimony to the wealth and diversity of the city's trade. The rapid silting up of the delta led to the city's decline, however, and by the reign of Augustus it had sunk to the status of no more than a village.

During the Roman period, the coastline had already extended some way out to sea and certain areas on the banks of the delta began to develop. The Romans continued the pattern of earlier occupations, but settlements shifted in response to the alluvial variations of the river.

Aerial photography and archaeology have identified the sites of buildings, brickworks, villages, and some traces of a shipping industry, as witnessed by the discovery of wrecks such as the famous *Fortuna Maris*, found near Comacchio.

By the early Middle Ages, Adria, Classe, and Voghenza (elevated to a diocese in the 6th century) had become centres of population in the delta. Gradually an extensive coastal belt formed, followed by an influx of population and the creation of religious foundations such as Pomposa. Once again, however, the waters shifted, submerging inhabited land and wiping out much evidence of this period.

Comacchio was founded in the 5th century, a dating made possible by archaeological excavations. It became an episcopal see in the 8th century and developed rapidly as a trading centre, enjoying similar geographical advantages to Spina in classical times. Comacchio was a major salt producer, but its expansion was halted by the depredations of the Venetians. Forced to reconstruct its economy, it invented fishing equipment, the *lavorieri*, and developed a significant fishing industry, especially in for eels.

At the same time as Comacchio was growing, the monastery of Pomposa was founded. The monastery

contributed considerably to the work of land reclamation and good land management, as well as to the cultural repute of the region, through a devotion to study which made the Benedictine abbey famous.

Ferrara had based its commercial activity on the river. Venice reigned over seaborne trade with the East, while Ferrara traded with northern Italy, Tuscany, and even into France. After long drawn-out struggles between conflicting families, the Este arrived in Ferrara in the 13th century.

The Este created a state which they were to govern for three centuries. Local agriculture was encouraged and developed. They undertook vast irrigation and reclamation projects to increase the amount of land available for farming, using the most advanced techniques of the period, as expressed in the work of Galileo Galilei and Leonardo da Vinci. Tracts of land were thus reclaimed from the waters to become rich farm land.

All the waterways were kept under supervision and managed by the construction of attractive villas, known as *delizie*, at key points in the network, often associated with hydraulic equipment or a farm building. The hydrological balance of the delta was finally improved by diverting the mountain streams descending from the Apennines.

When the Church took over the former Duchy at the end of the 16th century, it continued the programme of improvements with the invention, most notably, of crop rotation. Modifications insisted on by the Venetians at this period to prevent the possible silting up of the entrances to the lagoon altered the geography of the delta and made further hydraulic work necessary. This work continued up to the end of the 18th century.

The French occupation and new administrative demarcations imposed in the early 19th century had a negative effect on local development. The restoration of the Papal State in 1815 marked the beginning of mechanized drainage and reclamation work.

Improvements to the land led to the creation of vast tracts of cereal crops. The policy of land reclamation combined with respect for the history of the region and the ancient hydraulic system was to continue through to the mid-20th century and has shaped the face of the landscape as it is today.

#### *Description*

A vast alluvial plan, a fragile balance between land and water, a predominantly agricultural landscape criss-crossed by the many arms of the river and the geometric lines of the canals: the Diamante area nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List epitomizes nature shaped by mankind since the early prehistoric period. Every epoch in the history of civilization has left its mark here. Channelling and controlling water plays, now as ever, a dominant role.

The site that is being proposed as a World Heritage nomination can be articulated in four parts:

1. the area connected with the estate of the Diamantina to the west of Ferrara;
2. an area extending to the north, and including the estate of Fossadalbero;
3. the old river of Po di Volano extending from Ferrara to the sea, including the monastery of Pomposa, the

castle of Mesola, and the related Boschetto, as well as the estate of La Mensa;

4. the old waterways extending from Ferrara, first to the south, including the estates of Belriguardo, Venvignante, and Verginese, and then continuing to the east to Comacchio.

All the territory connecting the above areas and extending to the present-day course of the Po in the north is defined as the buffer zone. The proposed areas together with the buffer zone characterize the area well. The main emphasis in the nomination is on the territorial infrastructure, with the waterways and land connections. The architectural features, the *delizie*, and other historic buildings and settlements express the visible part of the nomination, as well as reflecting the historical stratigraphy of the place.

The most remarkable monuments, apart from the historic centres and military constructions, are the hydraulic works but, first and foremost, the *delizie* which shaped the landscape in the time of the Este. This disposition of dwellings combining pleasure with utility reshaped the landscape in a definitive manner which even now illustrates the golden age of the Ferrara region.

Subsequent development was really only a continuation of this task of reclaiming agricultural land, in such a way that the contemporary techniques used to maintain the delicate balance served only to enrich a land under threat from the sea, without diminishing the value of its historic heritage, which still predominates.

Today just over half of the Este *delizie* (ten in total) still exist, built between the 14th and 16th centuries. Added to these are the hunting lodges, numerous villas, farm estates and gardens, hydraulic works, towers and fortifications, and, in the region of Comacchio, fishing lodges. There are also the many churches and oratories, in particular the monastery of Pomposa, famed early in its existence throughout the Italian peninsula, whose Santa Maria basilica was constructed in the 8th century.

Perhaps the best known of the *delizie* is the *Schifanoia Palace* inside Ferrara, built in the late 14th and early 15th centuries, when that part of the town was still being reclaimed.

Many of the *delizie* outside were real castles, such as *Mesola*, which still dominates the landscape on the coast. The Este seem to have intended to build an entire city around the castle, but gave up owing to conflicts with the Venetians. The castle has been restored in the 1980s, and now houses various cultural functions. Not far from the castle, there is a tower that was used for the control of waters; currently, this is used as a museum and exhibition place.

Another large 15th century *delizia* has been *Belriguardo* (Commune of Voghiera), which used to have some 300 rooms and large formal gardens, all arranged along a magnificent axis extending to the Diamante landscape. After the departure of the Este, the castle had several owners, and was gradually ruined. Today, with the help of the Province, the Commune has acquired part of the property, and has undertaken small interventions to restore it and to provide it with some socially and culturally useful

functions. These include an archaeological museum displaying the finds of the nearby ancient Roman cemetery. Although a part of the site is still in private hands, there seems to be good collaboration with the owners. The buildings themselves are in a ruined state, although magnificent Gothic windows and some elegant arches still testify to its past glory. A large hall contains remains of beautiful wall paintings from the 16th century by distinguished masters.

The best preserved of all the *delizie* is the estate of *Zenzalino*. It is still normally used as an agricultural estate by a private family as in the past. The estate used to have some 2000ha of land, but is now only about 850ha. The place is not open for visitors, but it contains beautiful interiors with valuable historic furniture, paintings, and objects. The main building is linked with a splendid landscape garden with rare plants. The place is well taken care of.

Another Este estate still in use is the *Diamantina*, to the west of Ferrara. It has some 500ha of land, and includes three churches. The main building is partly used as a museum, and the owners come here occasionally. In fact, a general characteristic of the agricultural activity nowadays is that the owners tend to live in urban areas, and only come to the farm land when required to do so for specific activities. The *Diamantina* estate is in good condition, and well taken care of by the owner. To the west of *Diamantina* there is the fort of *Stellata*, which has been restored and is currently used as a centre for cultural activities.

The *Fossadalbero* is a country club for members only. It includes sports facilities and is regularly used all the year round. The estate of *Benvignante* (Commune of Argenta) is in a poor state; some structural repairs are being done, but there is no decision about its use in the future.

The estate of *Verginese* (Commune of Portomaggiore) is a relatively small place, representing a typical structure with corner towers. The main building has been recently restored, and is now used for social events and exhibitions, but the commune is looking for a more substantial use in the future.

*La Mensa*, a relatively modest place, is in a poor state, and the owner seems to be waiting for an opportunity to sell it. The former *delizia* of *Copparo* has been integrated into the present town hall; the central tower is still standing, and is used for scholastic purposes. Inside the town hall, current repairs have brought to light the remains of another tower embedded in the modern structures.

An important issue in the landscape is the presence of religion. The most important of these is the *Monastery of Pomposa*, one of the most visited sites in Italy. The buildings form an interesting ensemble, and represent features that are typical of this particular region of Italy, including rich fresco decoration, and Cosmati-type mosaic floors. Pomposa was significant in extending Christianity to the interior, and there are a number of smaller Romanesque chapels and churches scattered in the countryside.

Finally, the delta area is characterized by numerous small country towns and villages that have grown out of the historic context, many of them with ancient origins. The most important is *Comacchio*, a former rival of Venice and

later integrated into the Este state. While much smaller in scale, Comacchio is characterized by a system of canals and bridges on the pattern of Venice, but it has its own distinctive character and has a number of important historic buildings, palaces, and churches, including the famous Renaissance bridge of Tre Ponti. Comacchio is still cultivating eels in the traditional manner, although now this is also presented as part of the tourist attractions of the place.

## Management and Protection

### Legal status

The Ferrara area is currently under the protection of 58 decrees affecting the privately owned property (under National Law No 1089/1939), seven decrees protecting the landscape (under National Law No 1497/1939), and 36,399ha of regional park (Regional Law No 27/1988).

In addition, under the terms of National Law No 142/1990 and Regional Law No 6/1995, the current plan for provincial co-ordination of land use classifies 27 historic sites, nine historic roads, 2079ha of land designated as of special landscape value, 4140ha of archaeological sites and 1728ha of areas of special historic importance.

Adding together the areas already covered by these different laws (assuming that these areas can be added in this way) gives a total surface area roughly equivalent to the area covered by the nomination.

### Management

Ownership of the properties that make up this proposed extension is diverse, including public and private bodies, private individuals, and ecclesiastical institutions.

The provincial government has responsibility for the area, managing its roads and secondary education system and being involved in the restoration of local heritage and historic monuments. Municipal administrations are responsible for enforcing the laws on protection and urban development within their own communes.

The Superintendence of Architectural Heritage for the Provinces of Ferrara, Ravenna, and Forlì is responsible for historic monuments and for the supervision of listed public or private property.

The Superintendence of Archaeological Heritage for Emilia-Romagna is involved in archaeological excavations and sites.

The Superintendence for the Archival Heritage is responsible for public and private archives and libraries.

These Superintendences (*Soprintendenze*) are state institutions under the control of the Ministry of Culture. The University and the Archiepiscopal Curia also play a part in restoration work, under the supervision of the agencies responsible.

## Conservation and Authenticity

### Conservation history

In common with other areas of reclaimed land and other deltas (Holland, the Danube, the Rhone, the Guadalquivir,

etc, to name only sites in Europe), the Po delta still retains many traces of vanished ancient civilizations, but most of all of the organization imposed by the Dukes of Este.

Certain natural features, such as the woods of Ponfilia and Mesola or the lagoons of Comacchio, are a unique and outstanding testimony of a natural environment which man has succeeded in maintaining virtually intact since prehistoric times.

The cultural landscape of the Po delta has been formed over several centuries as a result of the activities of different settlers and landowners. The various historic phases are expressed in the constructions and changes that have become part of the historic landscape. It is still possible to read the pattern of the various historic strata as reflected in the land ownership and in the construction of waterways and roads.

Some of the historic buildings have continued in their original function, whilst others have been less successful. In fact, some of the Renaissance properties have been lost over time, and some others have been preserved only in a ruined state. The modern interest in the protection and restoration of some of these buildings goes back to the 19th century, as in the case of Pomposa, and to the early 20th century, when the association of *Ferrariae Decus* was established (in 1906), and raised public interest in historic places not only in the city of Ferrara but also in its territory.

More recently, in the past decades, the public authorities have been making efforts to safeguard places that earlier would have been abandoned, in danger of demolition. Several of the important buildings have been restored by the *Soprintendenze*, while some more modest ones are taken care of by the local administrations. *Ferrariae Decus* is active in raising funds for the conservation and maintenance of small churches and other historic buildings.

#### *Authenticity*

The infrastructure and the architectural highlights of the Po delta conserve today important testimonies of the planning efforts of the Este family in the 15th and 16th centuries. Furthermore, the stratigraphy of the area reflects the previous historical phases of over two millennia. The introduction of mechanized technology in working the land has so far taken account of the historical strata, and modern interventions have been reasonably well integrated.

Today, this cultural landscape forms an historic whole, with an integrity that needs to be respected. Considering that technology continues to progress and that the economic priorities of today do not necessarily favour the traditional methods of cultivation, the current integrity of the site may be at risk in the future.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the site in February 1999.

##### *Qualities*

As a result of the various phases of land reclamation and construction, the Po delta has become an important cultural landscape with stratification extending over a period of

three millennia. Even though there have been changes in the area, caused both by man and by nature, the different historic strata are visible in the patterns of the landscape. The infrastructure created by the Este family is still the dominating feature of the area, but it is possible to see that such visibility goes back further - to the Middle Ages and to classical antiquity. At the same time, the landscape of the delta, as developed by the Este family, is closely related to the city of Ferrara, with which it forms a single whole, with its own specific character and integrity.

##### *Comparative analysis*

In the whole of the Po delta, the Ferrara region stands out by virtue of its extremely long history of human occupation and the constant association of man and nature. The result is a wealth of reminders of past epochs, whether archaeological or architectural.

Most other major river deltas around the world are dominated by nature, with man's presence only a secondary feature. The Ferrara region, however, has seen the successive emergence of civilizations whose actions have been complementary and which rapidly developed hydraulic techniques and architectural styles to cope with the lagoon environment with which they were faced. The wealth created by these civilizations encouraged the development of the arts, and the art of ceramics in particular, as well as the growth of civil and religious ideas.

##### *ICOMOS comments*

This nomination follows on from the inscription of the city of Ferrara, of which it is a logical extension.

The means available for the protection of an urban site are very different from those applicable to a rural environment: whatever the legal arsenal available, it is often difficult to exercise control over a landscape whose infrastructure changes in response to changes in techniques and markets.

The region of Ferrara received its first territorial master plan about 30 years ago. The principles then expressed are still the basis for planning of the delta area. However, there are also problems of a more general nature connected with the migration of farmers to urban centres. Whilst it is desirable to continue the traditional types of activity whenever this is feasible, it will be necessary to make efforts to rehabilitate some historic properties that have lost their function in order to avoid their further decay. Cultural activities, representation, and even tourism may well be acceptable to some of these places, considering that they were created for the purpose of representing the ducal power.

In the event of this extension to the existing inscription of "Ferrara: City of the Renaissance" being approved by the World Heritage Committee, careful consideration needs to be given to the name of the inscribed site. ICOMOS suggests "Ferrara and the Residences of the Dukes of Este in the Po Delta."

##### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

In order to continue and improve territorial policies in the management of historic properties, it is recommended that the collaboration between the individual municipal administrations, the provincial authority, and the central government should be strengthened and co-ordinated by the provincial administration. ICOMOS believes that it is

essential that there should be an overall management plan for the nominated landscape which establishes the mechanisms for the co-ordination of existing planning and management provisions and assigns responsibilities for these.

The State Party should also lose no time in setting up a wide-ranging information campaign aimed at creating an awareness among land owners and users of the universal value of the property.

#### **Brief description**

The alluvial delta of the Po valley has been settled for millennia. From the 14th to the 16th century the Dukes of Este carried out extensive land reclamation and building projects, which give this area a unique character and link it intimately with the city of Ferrara, seat of the Este family.

#### **Recommendation**

That this nomination should be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting that a draft co-ordinating management plan be prepared, as proposed by ICOMOS. A revised name should be devised which takes into account the fact that this is an extension of the existing inscription of the city of Ferrara. In the event that the response to this request is received and assessed favourably by ICOMOS and the Bureau, the extension should be approved, with the addition of *criteria iii and v* to the existing criteria ii, iv, and vi.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Villages in Transylvania (Romania)

No 596bis

### Identification

*Nomination* The Villages with Fortified Churches in Transylvania (extension of Biertan and its Fortified Church)

*Location*

- Department of Alba, district of Călnic, village of Călnic
- Department of Brașov, district of Prejmer, village of Prejmer
- Department of Brașov, district of Bunești, village of Viscri
- Department of Harghita, district of Dârjiu, village of Dârjiu
- Department of Mureș, district of Saschiz, village of Saschiz
- Department of Sibiu, district of Biertan, village of Biertan
- Department of Sibiu, district of Valea Viilor, village of Valea Viilor

*State Party* Romania

*Date* 29 June 1998

### Justification by State Party

The fortified churches should be considered as a group. Nowhere else can such a large number of fortified churches be found in such a restricted area, proof that this phenomenon was widespread within a geographical and cultural (ethnic) area. They are an outstanding architectural achievement, thanks to the variety and use of the repertory of defensive architectural forms of the Late Middle Ages in Europe. In western and northern Europe certain types of defences applied to churches are typical of a few regions or countries (eg fortified churches in France and in northern countries, or churches with a fortified enceinte in Germany and Austria).

In Transylvania, however, there are three types of church fortifications in the restricted area mentioned above: the church with an enceinte (eg Prejmer), the fortified church (eg Saschiz) and the church-fortress (eg the Valea Viilor complex). The way these fortifications have continued and adapted the special conditions of previous monuments is interesting to note. Most of them display a transformation, for defensive purposes, of the entire repertory of forms and plans of short Romanesque basilicas, with or without a western tower, and single-nave churches belonging to the late Gothic period. In certain cases,

these fortifications have created monuments with a dual function - sacred and defensive - which are perfectly balanced from the point of view of form and function (eg Saschiz, Cloasterf, etc).

To this successful defensive architecture should be added the intrinsic value of churches reflecting the spread of certain architectural styles, from the Romanesque to Late Gothic art. The churches still have precious elements of decoration and furniture: altars in Prejmer (around 1450), fragments of murals (Dârjiu), 16th century furniture (Prejmer, Saschiz, and Valea Viilor). The fortified dwelling place of nobles is also authentic and invaluable from the architectural point of view.

### Criterion iv

The sites nominated for inscription all have the features of villages built by Saxon settlers on former "royal lands," sites which have been preserved in most of the 250 Saxon colonies in Transylvania:

- The regular network of streets, even if they are sometimes affected by the relief, is exemplary in the nominated sites; most of them have developed along a street or a vast central area, sometimes doubled by secondary streets (examples can be found in Călnic, Valea Viilor, Biertan, and Viscri). Other rarer examples of villages grew around a square, created after the fortification of a church (Prejmer).

- The protected area (the historic core) still has deep and narrow plots of land attested by documents and research, as well as the method for organizing it: houses with a gabled wall overlooking the street, and a succession of outbuildings. It is also possible to reconstitute historically the layout of the cultivated plots of land (eg at Viscri) since the place names designating the old properties are still used in oral tradition.

The enclosed character, typical of these villages, has also been preserved: a continuous row of houses with a half-buried cellar and a raised ground floor, few windows, gables, and boundary walls of the same height as the facade, sometimes repeating the decoration of the latter.

The position of the buildings for public use has also remained the same. Some of these buildings, arranged around the fortified church, still function: the presbytery or dwelling of the parish preacher, the school and teacher's house placed either within the walls of the school or nearby, the municipal centre and village hall, the barns for storing grain. The number of buildings and their architectural value is significant in all the nominated sites.

In the Saxon villages built on former "royal lands" and, above all, in the nominated villages, there are two types of dwelling house which have remained unchanged. Nevertheless, the variety of ornamental solutions and certain major modifications in the repertory indicate how they have evolved over time. Until the 1980s, the sites retained their character as multi-ethnic villages, with different ethnic neighbourhoods, as can still be seen today.

### Criterion v

The nominated sites, typical villages of the Saxon colonization in Transylvania, form "a coherent whole, an entity of historical value, having its own equilibrium and character, while at the same time including a specific system for organizing space, buildings, and signs of human activities which shape the environment." They represent a construction method reflecting the historic, legal, religious, and social conditions of their creators. They are also an integral part of a culture and a civilization weakened by the emigration of the Saxons to Germany which started in the 1970s and intensified in the 1990s.

#### **Criterion iii**

The buildings and defences erected by the Saxons of Transylvania had a cultural influence on the surrounding region, starting with the subjugated Saxon villages which tried to imitate the defensive and organizational structures of the free communities as much as possible. This influence spread to the Szeklers (churches with an enceinte and other simple defensive structures, the most eloquent example being Dârjiu), as well as the Romanians. It modified not only the appearance of the Romanian districts in Saxon villages but also the Romanian villages of the Saxon colonization, which copied the house fronts, the ornamental vocabulary, and the system of dividing the land into plots (eg Ra•inari).

#### **Criterion ii**

### **Category of Property**

In terms of categories of cultural property set out in Article 1 of the 1972 World Heritage Convention, the property nominated for inscription is a *group of buildings*.

### **History and Description**

#### *History*

The property nominated for inscription on the World Heritage List is situated in the south of Transylvania, a hilly region bordered by the arc of the Carpathians.

In the course of the gradual occupation of Transylvania by Hungarian sovereigns, King Geza (1141-1161) established the first colonies of Germans, known as Saxons. As free settlers enjoying certain privileges, they set up associations of colonies in the region of Sibiu-Hermannstadt, governed by Counts. In 1224, King Andreas II signed a letter of franchise called the *Andreanum* which confirmed the liberties granted to Saxons in the province of Hermannstadt. Most of the existing districts were colonized by around 1330, following the emergence of new settlements encouraged by the Counts and Teutonic Knights.

In the 14th and 15th centuries, the legal status granted by the *Andreanum* was extended to cover the last colonized regions. This legally acquired unity took the name of *Universitas Saxonum*, and was recognized by the King of Hungary in 1486. It kept this status within the Principality of Transylvania until the second half of the 19th century.

The origin and development of church fortifications derive from the turbulent history of Transylvania, starting from the Mongol invasions in 1241-42, then the repeated Turkish incursions as of 1395, followed by wars waged by the sovereigns of neighbouring countries up to the beginning of the 18th century. These fortifications should also be considered as a phenomenon specifically linked to the history of their builders, the Saxons of Transylvania.

The Saxon settlers introduced into Transylvania a type of colony adapted to the position of the villages, most of which stood on hills that were easy to reach and protect. The arable land was divided according to a Flemish system and the compact villages, with a church in the centre, were composed of houses with gardens closely aligned in rows along the streets. Defending this type of village, which had certain advantages, was a constant preoccupation of the communities, and they were supported by the Hungarian sovereigns and the Church from the second half of the 13th century. It was also the basis for the development of church fortifications.

Up to the recent past, the church-fortresses as place of worship were the centre of life for village communities. The buildings set against the defensive walls housed the school and village hall.

#### *Description*

Despite subsequent transformations and thanks to archaeological discoveries, it is possible to have an idea of what the first church fortifications looked like during the second half of the 13th century. The churches going back to the colonization period still have a massive western tower with covered ways and loopholes. They were protected by a defensive wall, an entrance tower, and a ditch. These features were inspired by strongholds, and probably also by the fortified dwelling places of the Transylvanian Counts. The one in Câlnic-Kelling is the only example to have survived to present times.

The principles of fortification, which had already been highly developed in towns (Sibiu-Hermannstadt, Sighi•oara-Schässburg, Bra•ov-Kronstadt, etc), were transposed to church-fortresses in the 15th century. The oldest of them stands on a plain in the Tara Bar•ei region, where the defensive wall of the churches was raised and fitted with a covered way and towers, as in Prejmer.

In other colonized regions where the landscape is cut by valleys, new defences were put up around the churches and the enceintes, thus offering a wide variety of forms (eg Biertan, Valea Viilor, and Viscri). The end of the 15th century was the last important phase for fortified churches. In some villages, such as Saschiz, the churches were demolished and replaced by a building with defensive storeys, loopholes, and bartizans resting on consoles or flying buttresses. A bell tower was incorporated into the defensive wall.

The fortified churches have conserved the structures needed for the daily life of the villagers (mills, fountains, bread ovens, and granaries) as well as traditional institutions, such as a school, presbytery, and priest's house grouped near the church.

The village houses are closely aligned along one or two streets or else clustered around a square. They were originally built of wood and had a thatched roof, but were replaced at the end of the 18th century and early 19th century by buildings in stone and brick with shingled roofs.

The shape of the original plots and the layout of the outbuildings in rows (stables, barns, etc) have been retained. The houses, most of them gabled and with a half-hipped roof, were joined on the street facade by a high wall with a carriage entrance and small doorway. The decoration of the facades was usually restricted to the window frames, a cornice and niches, or medallions on the pediment. Some facades were more elaborately decorated with thyrsi, garlands, or even, in the 19th century, with pillars topped by capitals. The village is still divided into separate districts for the different communities (Saxon, Romanian, or Hungarian) which lived together for several centuries.

The six Transylvanian village sites with their fortified churches, proposed as an extension of the village of Biertan, already included in the World Heritage List in 1993, are the following:

- Village of Călnic

The fortified residence built around 1260 by Count Chyl de Kelling, consists of a three-storey dwelling tower, a chapel, and an oval enceinte. In 1430, it was offered to the village community, which raised the walls fitted with two towers and transformed the dwelling tower into one for defensive purposes. In the 16th century, it erected a second enceinte with a covered way and a bastion, and strengthened the inner wall so that it could hold the supply stores.

- Village of Prejmer

The church-fortress is set in the centre of the village square. The Early Gothic Church of the Holy Cross is in the shape of a cross. In the 15th century, it was surrounded by a wall 12m high, forming a quadrilateral with rounded corners reinforced by four horseshoe towers (two have disappeared). The entrance, a vaulted gallery, is protected by a barbican and flanked by a lateral wall. The covered way has a parapet. The complex is strengthened by loopholes and a few bartizans. The granaries and rooms to accommodate the inhabitants are arranged on four levels above the cellars.

- Village of Viscri

During the first quarter of the 16th century, the old Romanesque chapel was enlarged to form a single-nave church, with a fortified storey resting on semi-circular arches supported by massive buttresses. The conical roof of the bell tower is raised and has a hoarding. The first enceinte of the 16th century was strengthened in the 17th century by two towers with a wooden gallery, and a century later its covered way was transformed so that it could hold outhouses while a second and lower enceinte was erected.

- Village of Dârjiu

The fortified group of Dârjiu mirrors the influence of Transylvanian constructions in the neighbouring Szekler region. The Late Gothic church was fortified

towards 1520 and was decorated with a series of murals paintings going back to 1419. The rectangular enceinte was restructured in the 17th century in order to add a bastion in each corner; a fifth one was erected in the west and a bell tower in the south. The walls and bastions were pierced by loopholes and canon slits. Lean-to sheds for storing grain replaced the covered way.

- Village of Saschiz

Since the old village stronghold standing on top of the hill was probably abandoned because it could no longer protect the inhabitants, it was decided to replace the Romanesque church and its enceinte by a new and more accessible church in the Late Gothic style (1493-1525). The defensive storey gives the Church of Saint Stephen the appearance of a high bastion, with a projecting, quadrangular sacristy tower. The bell tower of the old enceinte, demolished in the 19th century, reproduces the shape of the clock tower in the neighbouring and rival town of Sighi•oara.

- Village of Valea Viilor

The Church of Saint Peter was transformed into a Late Gothic style and fortified at the beginning of the 16th century. One or several defensive storeys were built above the choir, nave, and tower, all communicating with each other. The porches of the northern and southern entrances are protected by small towers with portcullises. The oval enceinte was also reorganized. The 6-7m high wall supporting the covered way and a sloping shingled roof leads to the loopholes, machicolations, and gun slits. Access is from the vaulted gallery of the western bastion, which juts out from the line of the defensive wall.

The inscription file also proposes to extend the boundaries of the *Village of Biertan with its fortified church*, already inscribed on the World Heritage List, and its buffer zone.

## Management and Protection

### *Legal status*

The seven fortified churches included in the extended nomination – Călnic, Valea Viilor, Biertan, Saschiz, Viscri, Prejmer, and Dârjiu – were included in the first Romanian National List of Monuments in 1959. They are designated as historical monuments of national importance with the status of National Treasures under the terms of Articles 1 and 2 of the 1994 Law No 11 for the Protection of Historic Monuments. Article 1 defines the surrounding conservation areas as being “part of the historic monument.” For each of the seven villages the nomination area has been defined as a conservation area including the necessary regulations. Having been approved by the Commission for Conservation Areas within the Ministry of Public Works and Territorial Planning under the terms of the Building Act, Law No 50 of 1991 for Building Regulations and Land Planning, they have a legal status.

It should be mentioned that the existing legislation for the Protection of Historical Monuments, the 1994 Law No 11, has very strict provisions relating to the protection, preservation, and management of

designated properties and sites. Nevertheless it is only a provisional one and does not provide efficient control and management at the County or local level. There is no professional body or institution (since the dissolution of the National Office in November 1994), the Directorate for Historic Monuments being included in the administration of the Ministry of Culture. A draft of the new Conservation Law, prepared in recent years, which provides for a National Board and decentralized structures at the County level, was submitted to the Parliament at the end of March 1999.

#### *Management*

Ownership of the various properties is diverse. The fortified churches, like the other places of worship in the villages (the Orthodox, Catholic, Greek Catholic, or Uniate Churches), are the property of their respective religious communities. Where the community no longer exists because of emigration to Germany, ownership is taken over by the Superior Council of the Lutheran Church in Sibiu. This is the case of the fortifications of Călnic, given by the Superior Council in custody to the Foundation *Ars Transilvaniae* in Cluj-Napoca to create a Transylvanian Documentation Centre for Historic Monuments. The public buildings in the villages, including administration, education, commercial facilities (schools, the village council, inns, shops) are still in the propriety of the State (in the administration of the local authorities); most of the farmsteads are in private ownership. Some of the Saxons who emigrated to Germany after 1990 are still the owners of their farmsteads.

It is the responsibility of owners of designated buildings and areas to manage and repair them and open them to the public. Any alterations require the permission of the Ministry of Culture and the National Commission for Historic Monuments.

There are clearly defined and adequate conservation areas for the village sites, and also adequate buffer zones including parts of the typical Transylvanian cultural landscape around all the nominated properties. As a result of the ICOMOS evaluation mission revised delimitation maps have been provided for Călnic and Dârjiu, and those for Biertan have also been redrawn. These are provided for in the 1994 Law No 11 for the Protection of Historic Monuments, the 1991 Building Law No 50 on Building Regulations and Land Planning, and the regulations for each conservation area related to urban planning in conformity with the Order of the Minister of Public Works and Land Planning concerning conservation areas.

Overall supervision of nominated properties is the responsibility of the Ministry of Culture. It carries out this work in collaboration with the National Commission for Historic Monuments, the National Office for Heritage Protection, and, where appropriate, with the Ministry of Public Works and Land Planning, the Ministry of Education, or the County Inspectorates for Culture, the County Offices for Heritage, and the local authorities.

The management of the nominated area in the villages is in the responsibility of the local authorities. There is no overall management plan for

the whole body of properties included within the nomination. Based on the completed scientific recording as the result of the German-Romanian documentation project, two of the nominated villages (Biertan and Viscri) are the subjects of feasibility studies for a revitalization programme, initiated and financed by the World Bank. It is the intention of the World Bank to offer financial aid also for the conservation projects of the two fortified churches in the villages, the planning being covered by the National Office for Heritage Protection as part of the Ministry of Culture.

Substantial financial aid is available for non-governmental owners (especially the religious communities and the Lutheran Superior Council) from the Ministry of Culture for conservation and restoration projects. Financial aid is also available from the Transylvanian Saxon Foundation in Munich, which sponsors the fortified churches of Prejmer and Viscri, the Foundation for German Heritage in Romania in Stuttgart, and, for maintenance and repairs works within the conservation areas of the villages in particular, the former Saxon communities organized in Germany through the Cultural Council of the Transylvanian Saxons.

#### **Conservation and Authenticity**

##### *Conservation history*

Respect for tradition and sacred places resulted in the continuity of maintenance and restoration works even in the communist period. In the early 1960s the fortified church of Prejmer was restored by the National Office for the Protection of Historic Monuments. At the Călnic castle, at that time in state ownership, that office in the early 1970s carried out structural consolidation work on the main family tower and the outer curtain wall, inserting an inadequate concrete skeleton, though without altering the monument. In the late 1950s the Lutheran Superior Council created a department for architecture and historic monuments within its central administration, coordinating minor repair and maintenance work on the fortified churches.

Maintenance work has, however, been carried out continuously because the fortified churches have been in use as the centres of the daily public life of the communities up to the present time. Most of the interventions are of good professional quality, without reconstructions, additions, or the use of inadequate materials. The care for maintenance and repair is also reflected in the interior layouts of the churches with their traditional furniture, pews, galleries, altarpieces, organs, and mural paintings, some of them Late Gothic masterpieces, in this way reflecting continuity in use of the liturgical space by the communities since the Reformation up to the present day. The famous altarpieces of Biertan and Prejmer were restored in the 1980s by the Conservation Workshop of the Superior Lutheran Council set up in the 1970s in Braşov.

At Valea Viilor and Viscri maintenance and repair work on the church fortifications have been in progress since 1990. For the fortified church of

Saschiz, which was in a poor state of conservation owing to lack of maintenance (emigration of the community) and being in a seismic area (there have been several earthquakes in the last two centuries), a structural consolidation and a conservation project have been initiated by the Ministry of Culture, to be carried out in 1999. Conservation work at Dârjiu (including restoration of the mural paintings) took place in 1981, at Prejmer in 1994-98 and at Biertan in 1989-92. The Foundation Arts Transylvaniae has worked out a conservation plan for the fortifications of Câlnic in cooperation with the National Office for Heritage Protection, parts of which have already been implemented.

As a result of the introduction of the socialist system into agriculture after 1945, most of the ancillary working buildings within the farmsteads, especially the stables and barns, went out of use and so most of them are in a poor condition; some of the typical barns have already been lost. Maintenance work has been carried out on the houses in most cases, the main problem nowadays being the abandoned or empty houses of the emigrated Saxons. A conservation and revitalization programme for the farmsteads should also form part of the management plan for the nominated areas.

#### *Authenticity*

The level of authenticity of the various properties included in the nomination is very high. Traditional maintenance and repair work on the fortified churches and the conservation principles of the 1990s have ensured that replacement of damaged or degraded architectural elements has respected the materials and techniques used by the original builders. The well preserved interior layouts and furnishings of the churches with their artistic masterpieces are authentic documents for the traditional religious life of the Reformed communities over the centuries.

The villages are authentic documents for a specific vernacular tradition, and they preserve the original layout of the settlement. The church is placed in the centre of the village, so as to be accessible very quickly in times of danger from all parts of the village, and the rows of very narrow and deep plots are aligned on both sides along one or two main streets (Câlnic, Valea Viilor, Saschiz, Viscri) or grouped around a rectangular village square (Biertan, Prejmer). This type of land-use system is characteristic of the early settlements of German colonists in Eastern Europe, and it was maintained even when the former timber architecture (log-house constructions, timber framing) was replaced by masonry buildings at the end of the 18th century and in the first half of the 19th century everywhere in the Saxon settlements. The rows of gabled houses, boundary walls with arched entrances (the so-called Franconian row) facing the streets or squares, the adjacent working buildings of the farmsteads added in a row to the front house along the narrow and deep plot closed by the transversely located barn, the plot continuing with the orchard outside the barn and limited by a fence or a small wall – all these are typical elements of the Saxon vernacular tradition, which have been preserved up to the present day. This type of vernacular architecture has also had a

very strong influence on the architecture of the Romanian and Hungarian peoples settled in Transylvania, not only by the Romanian peasants in the Saxon villages adapting their farmsteads to that architectural tradition, but also in the Szeklers settlements, like the village of Dârjiu, where the type of settlement and the architecture of the farmsteads was similar.

As a consequence of the socialist system, the farmsteads and hence the villages did not suffer any damage from the industrial revolution in agriculture: the buildings of the collective or state farms were located outside the villages, which are therefore authentic documents. This not the case at the village of Dârjiu, where the former socialist systemization activity and the economic development of recent decades has resulted in several modifications; the conservation area is restricted to a small area surrounding the fortified church.

#### **Evaluation**

##### *Action by ICOMOS*

An ICOMOS expert mission visited the nominated properties in February 1999. The ICOMOS International Scientific Committee on Vernacular Architecture was also consulted.

##### *Qualities*

The properties that make up the nomination of the Transylvanian village sites with fortified churches provide a vivid picture of the vernacular traditions preserved over the centuries in the settlements of southern Transylvania, based on the characteristic land-use system, settlement pattern, and organization of the farmstead units and their architecture of the German colonists, which exerted a strong influence on the vernacular architecture and traditions of the other ethnic groups in the area. The variety of building types and defensive solutions, preserved over the centuries and documented by the church fortifications, should also be considered as a unique vernacular expression of the cultural traditions of those communities.

##### *Comparative analysis*

The special value of the Transylvanian village sites with fortified churches lies in the fact that they are outstanding examples of a specific vernacular tradition in south-eastern Europe, the well preserved homogenous settlements of the Transylvanian Saxons and Szeklers, which form a compact unit around their fortified church. They are representative of a group of more than 200 preserved settlements with church fortifications that are unique in the world.

##### *ICOMOS recommendations for future action*

The *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* make it a condition of inscription on the World Heritage List that every property should have an appropriate management plan in force. None of the seven nominated villages has such a plan, and one should be prepared and put into operation without delay.

**Brief description**

The Transylvanian villages with fortified churches provide a vivid picture of the cultural landscape of southern Transylvania. They are characterized by the specific land-use system, settlement pattern, and organization of the family farmstead units preserved since the late Middle Ages, dominated by their fortified churches, which illustrate building periods from the 13th to 16th centuries.

**Recommendation**

That this nomination be *referred back* to the State Party, requesting that management plans be prepared for each of the nominated properties. In the event of this information being supplied and found acceptable, ICOMOS recommends that the extension of the property be *approved*.

ICOMOS, March 1999

## Routes of Santiago de Compostela (France)

No 868bis

### Identification

<i>Nomination</i>	The Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France
<i>Location</i>	Regions of Aquitaine, Auvergne, Basse-Normandie, Bourgogne, Centre, Champagne-Ardenne, Ile-de-France, Languedoc-Roussillon, Limousin, Midi-Pyrénées, Picardie, Poitou-Charentes, and Provence-Alpes-Côte d'Azur
<i>State Party</i>	France
<i>Date</i>	27 June 1997

### Introduction

This property was inscribed on the World Heritage List at the 22nd Session of the World Heritage Committee in Kyoto (Japan) in December 1998. Since that time, three omissions from the list of individual properties that make up this serial inscription have come to light. One was omitted inadvertently from the list of 69 given in the ICOMOS evaluation; the other two had been overlooked when the French authorities were preparing the elaborate and detailed documentation that accompanied the nomination, although they had been included in the original list of 71 properties that emerged from the intensive study carried out in preparing this nomination.

### Additional properties

#### *Property omitted from ICOMOS evaluation*

The *Cathedral Church of Sainte-Marie, Oloron Sainte-Marie* (Pyrénées-Atlantiques), is at the foot of the Pyrenees on the route that crosses into Spain by the Col de Somport. The first church was built here in the 12th century, but it has undergone many vicissitudes since that time from war and natural disasters. In its present form it demonstrates the development of architectural styles from the Romanesque to Flamboyant Gothic. Its 12th century portal is especially noteworthy.

#### *Properties omitted from the nomination dossier*

The *Abbey of Le-Buisson-de-Cadouin* (Aquitaine) was a Cistercian foundation in 1119. It is especially associated with worship of the Holy Shroud. The fine Romanesque church with its severe façade has a richly decorated interior. The cloister presents an exceptional synthesis of diverse styles of

Gothic on the eve of the Renaissance. The conventual buildings have undergone a number of changes, notably in the 17th and 19th centuries, but preserve their authentic ensemble, and now house a youth hostel, a use in keeping with the role of the Abbey on the pilgrimage route.

The *Church of Saint-Avit-Sénieur* (Aquitaine) is dedicated to a Gallo-Roman convert to Christianity in the 6th century who adopted the monastic life. The imposing church, the largest in the Dordogne, was built in the early 12th century and has preserved much of its original form, despite the turbulent history of the region in the later Middle Ages. The interior repeats the impression of strength given by the exterior. The walls and vaults are covered with painted geometric designs, and the fittings are in the popular Baroque style of the 18th and early 19th centuries. After having been closed for twenty years for stabilization works to be carried out, the church reopened for worship at Christmas 1998.

### Action by ICOMOS

The Cathedral Church of Oloron had been visited by the ICOMOS expert mission in February 1998. No visits have been paid to either of the other properties, but ICOMOS is satisfied, as a result of studying the documentation provided by the French authorities, that both conform fully with the requirements of the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention*.

### Recommendation

That the inscribed property of the Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France be *extended* to cover the Cathedral Church of Oloron, the Abbey of Le Buisson-de-Cadouin, and the Church of Saint-Avit-Sénieur.

ICOMOS, March 1999