

des Nations Unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

# Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

# **World Heritage**

**44 COM** 

# **AMENDMENT**

Item of the Agenda	8B
Amended Draft Decision	44 COM 8B.48
Amendment submitted by the Delegation of	BRAZIL AND GUATEMALA
Date of submission	22.7.2021

### **TEXT**

#### Draft Decision: 44 COM 8B.48

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Documents WHC/21/44.COM/ 8B.Add and WHC/21/44.COM/INF.8B1.Add.
- 2. Refers the nomination of Inscribes the Settlement and Artificial Mummification of the Chinchorro Culture in the Arica and Parinacota Region, Chile, on the World Heritage List, on the basis of criteria (iii) and (v). back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
- a) Provide a more complete and detailed understanding of how the settlement and adaptation aspects of the Chinchorro culture are expressed through the attributes of the nominated serial property, in support of criterion (v),
- b) Ensure that the highest available level of legal protection is in place for each of the nominated component parts,
- c) Confirm that the new Regulatory Plan of the city of Arica provides protection to the archaeological remains that might be discovered in the urban area, and that the land uses permitted in the zones within the nominated property and its buffer zones are compatible with the proposed Outstanding Universal Value of the nominated property,
- d) Provide more information on the foreseen changes to the current cultural heritage legislation (Law No. 17,288 of National Monuments),
- e) Finalize an agreement and timetable to relocate the illegal settlement in the Desembocadura de Camarones component part outside the buffer zone,
- f) Further address the integrity of the nominated serial property by providing more information on the extent, distribution, and interrelationships of the different types of archaeological sites (settlements, burials, shell middens, etc.), finds, and areas of archaeological potential, particularly by means of topographical maps of the nominated property, buffer zones, and surrounding areas,
- g) Extend the boundary of the Faldeo Norte del Morro de Arica component part to include all of what is now designated as "Zone 5 Damping",

Email Rapporteur: wh-rapporteur@unesco.org

- h) Extend the boundary of the Desembocadura de Camarones component part in order to include all of the Archaeological Restriction Zones,
- i) Extend the buffer zone of the Desembocadura de Camarones component part to include the entire extent of the Restriction Area due to glissade hazard (ARRD) zone, and resolve the problem of the lack of a buffer zone between the nominated property and the industrial poultry farm. This is especially important in view of the proposed relocation of the illegal settlement now located in an area adjacent to the agro-industrial complex,
- j) Finalize, approve, and make operational the Management Plan and management system;

# 2. Takes note of the provisional Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

#### **Brief Synthesis**

The northern coast of the Atacama Desert, an arid and hostile habitat in northernmost Chile, was home to the Chinchorro, a society of marine hunter-gatherers who lived here from approximately 7,400 BP to 2,840 BP (5,450 BCE to 890 BCE). They successfully adapted to the extreme environmental conditions of a hyper-arid coastal desert in the rugged Coastal Cordillera by exploiting the nearby rich marine resources. Archaeological sites associated with the Chinchorro culture are best known for having the oldest known artificially mummified human bodies.

The nominated serial property is comprised of three components that contain natural and cultural evidence of the places along the Atacama Desert's coastline where, for about four millennia, the Chinchorro people lived and thrived. These components – Faldeo Norte del Morro de Arica, and Colón 10 (both located in an urban setting), and Desembocadura de Camarones (located in a rural setting) – include the archaeological remains of settlements, cemeteries, and dense shell middens. They provide evidence of sea harvesting activities and land occupation that illustrate the technological and spiritual complexity of this society from its coastal beginnings to its disappearance.

In this environment of contrasts, the Chinchorro people managed to prosper and develop a complex social structure. Of particular interest and scientific importance are the cultural remains and mummification techniques of the Chinchorro. Their long-practiced mortuary techniques created artificial mummies that presumably reflected the fundamental role of the dead in their society.

It constitutes an exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition and a civilization that, over a span of about four millennia, succeeded to live in an extremely arid environment, developing a complex relationship between people, both living and dead, and the environment. The cultural remains left behind by the Chinchorro people stand as a testimony to their belief system and ideas about the afterlife. Their cemeteries reveal artificially mummified bodies that are unique because of their complexity, age, and aesthetics. The Chinchorro innovated continuously in their mummification practices to create artificial mummies that possessed extraordinary material, sculptural, and aesthetic qualities that reflected the fundamental social role of the dead in human society.

It also constitutes an exceptional testimony to land and sea use in extremely arid conditions, representative of a specific culture's interaction with the environment. These Archaic populations who lived on the fringe of one the driest place in the world, the Atacama Desert, adapted to a harsh environment with minimal fresh water and plant resources, relying heavily on simple and efficient technologies to harvest coastal and marine resources. The environmental context of desert, seacoast, ravines, and wetlands, the archaeological deposits, and the in situ stratigraphy reveal space occupation dynamics over time. It bears a unique testimony to the complex spirituality of the Chinchorro culture, expressed through the cemeteries in which are found artificially mummified bodies. Furthermore, the archaeological finds suggest that the nominated property is an outstanding example of the interaction of a marine hunter-gatherer group with one of the world's driest environments.

Criterion (iii), The cultural remains left behind by the Chinchorro people, including their artefacts, mummies, and cemeteries, stand as a testimony to their belief system and ideas about the afterlife bear a unique or at least exceptional testimony to a cultural tradition or to a civilization which is living or which has disappeared. The Chinchorro cemeteries reveal

artificially as well as naturally mummified bodies, both in exceptionally good states of conservation due to the very dry environment. The Chinchorro innovated continuously in their artificial mummification practices, revealing technical ability by dismembering and reassembling bodies to create artificial mummies possessing extraordinary material, sculptural, and aesthetic qualities that reflected the fundamental social role of the dead in human society. Chinchorro mummification is considered to be the oldest in human history, and remarkably complex for an early group of marine hunter-gatherers.

Criterion (v). The Chinchorro culture occupied one of the most arid places in the world, the coastal areas of the Atacama Desert and bear an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement, land-use, or sea-use which is representative of a culture (or cultures) or human interaction with the environment, especially when it has become vulnerable under the impact of irreversible change. These populations lived on the desert fringe and relied heavily on coastal and marine resources. They adapted to a harsh environment that had minimal fresh water and plant resources, yet developed simple and efficient technologies to harvest from the ocean. Culturally, they flourished for thousands of years in a vast, hyper-dry territory, thus being an extraordinary example of early adaptation to desert and marine environments. The archaeological evidence of their sea harvesting and land occupation can be found in settlements, cemeteries, and shell middens located over an extensive area. Moreover, the Property is an outstanding example of the interaction of a marine hunter-gatherer group with one of the world's driest environments.

#### **Authenticity**

The condition of authenticity of the whole series and of the individual component parts has been met. The authenticity of the nominated property is based on the locations and (to a degree) the settings of the component parts, and to the materials and substances, uses and functions, traditions, and spirit of the attributes that support the proposed Outstanding Universal Value. Analysis from studies of their archaeological sites has been endorsed by a number of national and international scientific conferences and publications, and that more than one hundred of the latter validate the authenticity of the sites and the elements they contain. In general terms, it can be said that archaeological sites where no reconstructions have been undertaken retain a high degree of authenticity.

### **Integrity**

The integrity of the nominated property is based on the cultural remains left behind by the Chinchorro people, particularly artificially mummified remains, and on this people's adaptation to one of the most arid places in the world, where they flourished for thousands of years. The serial components were selected as the most representative and best preserved of all the Chinchorro sites in northern Chile and southern Peru, for their complementary nature, and for their tangible attributes that provide a comprehensive view of the Chinchorro culture.

#### Protection and management

#### **Documentation**

The University of Tarapacá's Department of Anthropology has undertaken a number of important studies related to the Chinchorro culture. Many of the archaeological finds in the nominated property, buffer zones, and beyond were discovered during construction activities related to the development of the city of Arica. The proposed Management Plan therefore projects a sub-programme of archaeological investigation focused in large part on producing baseline data for the archaeological information observable in the field as well as in the format of textual and graphic documentation.

# Legal protection

The current and proposed legal protection of the serial property is based at the national level under the Law No. 17,288 of National Monuments (1970, substantially modified in 2005 and

currently under additional review). It establishes five categories of National Monuments, including Archaeological Monuments and Historical Monuments. The Faldeo Norte del Morro de Arica component is included in the area of a larger Historical Monument, the Morro de Arica. The adjacent Colón 10 component is protected as an Archaeological Monument. The surveyed archaeological sites in the third component, Desembocadura de Camarones, are protected as Archaeological Monuments under Law No. 17,288.

At the regional level, Decree No. 4867 (1967) of the Ministry of Education declares all archaeological and palaeontological sites in the Arica and Parinacota Region to be Historical Monuments. The protection established by this Decree reaches the archaeological sites in all three components of the serial nomination.

The common buffer zone for the Faldeo Norte del Morro de Arica and Colón 10 components is, in part, protected by the Regulatory Plan of the city of Arica, in force since 2009, which establishes norms related to urban limits, zoning, land use, conditions of property subdivision, building, and roads. This plan is currently being renewed.

The Desembocadura de Camarones component and its buffer zone will be protected in the future under the Nature Sanctuary category of Law No. 17,288 of National Monuments; this declaration was expected to be adopted during the second half of 2020. There is also a Sectional Plan that controls urban measures applicable to the part of that component located in the Municipality of Camarones. This Sectional Plan is currently under revision. Furthermore, the Desembocadura de Camarones component is protected by Decree No. 240 (2014) of the Ministry of National Defence and the Armed Forces Under secretariat, which regulates the use of the seashore by non-industrial fishers.

In terms of ownership, the Faldeo Norte del Morro de Arica component is owned by the Government of Chile (some areas have been granted to the University of Tarapacá, an independent public corporation); the Colón 10 component belongs to the University of Tarapacá; and part of the Desembocadura de Camarones component is owned by the Government of Chile and part by the private Agrícola Lluta S.A. company. The two buffer zones have a combination of public and private ownership.

#### Management system

The nominated property's Management Plan (2020 – 2026) is a work in progress. It will be based on two previous instruments: the Caleta de Camarones Archaeological Reserves Management Plan (2012) from the University of Tarapacá's Department of Anthropology and the Municipality of Camarones; and the Basic Diagnosis and Management Plan for the Chinchorro Archaeological Reserves in Arica (2012) from the Regional Government of Arica and Parinacota and the University of Tarapacá. The two existing plans and their operational sub-programmes are being unified under a joint governance model for the nominated serial property, maintaining each of its component's unique characteristics.

The governance system combines the actions of national and regional stakeholders with a shared understanding of the nominated serial property and its requirements if inscribed on the World Heritage List. The State Party mentions delays due to the pandemic (finalization by mid-2021 instead of 2020), but highlights that important advances have been made, such as in the conservation and zoning section of the document – though no documentation of these advances has been provided.

The management system that will be used to implement the Management Plan is still in development, but was being adopted progressively during the preparation of the nomination dossier.

At the national level, the Ministry of Culture, the Arts and Heritage is officially in charge of Chile's cultural heritage. The Cultural Heritage Under secretariat is in charge of developing cultural policies, including those associated with World Heritage properties, The National Monuments Council, which is part of the Ministry of Culture, the Arts and Heritage.

Evaluation of the effectiveness of the protection and management of the nominated property

<u>Legal protection of the nominated serial property at the national and local levels is adequate</u> and will improve once Nature Sanctuary status is declared for the Desembocadura de <u>Camarones components.</u>

The Management Plan and management system is comprehensive, well structured, and generally inclusive in terms of stakeholder participation, but they are still works in progress. Priority should be given to finalizing, approving, and making operational the Management Plan and system.

Community outreach activities are key to the success of future management of the nominated property. It will be important to continue these efforts and include in the decision-making processes local stakeholders as well as any living indigenous communities that may have an interest in and connection with the nominated property.

- 3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
- a) Completing basic installations such as fences to further assure the safety of visitors and the protection of the nominated property,
- b) Resolving the legal disputes in the Desembocadura de Camarones component part and its buffer zone,
- c) Undertaking the systematic documentation and inventorying of the archaeological information already collected, as well as the documentation of the areas of potential interest for future investigation through systematic surface surveys, geophysical investigation, etc.,
- d) Completing and making operational the projected monitoring system, including for the mummified bodies and artefacts preserved in the different museums, and identifying indicators that are linked to all the attributes that support the proposed Outstanding Universal Value as well as to the identified threats,
- e) Undertaking at the earliest possible opportunity conservation measures focused on general maintenance and on the identification and rescue of unprotected archaeological remains on the surface,
- f) Addressing the ethical issues regarding the excavation, curation, and exhibition of human remains,
- g) Adhering to the principles of good governance by maintaining an open mind concerning the inclusion of stakeholders not yet participating in the protection and management of the nominated property, in line with paragraphs 40 and 117 of the Operational Guidelines,
- h) Developing a Heritage Impact Assessment process within the frameworks for legal protection and management of the nominated property,
- i) Assessing and mitigating any impacts the industrial poultry farm located in the Camarones River valley may have on the proposed Outstanding Universal Value and integrity of the nominated property.
- 4. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 December 2022 an updated report on the above-mentioned recommendations for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 46th session.