STATE OF CONSERVATION REPORT 2020
Historic Centre of Bukhara (Uzbekistan) (Nomination 602 bis)

In 1993, the “Historic City of Bukhara” has been inscribed on the World Heritage List, according to criteria (ii), (iv) and (vi). The Retrospective Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the property has been adopted in 2012.

The State of Conservation report was required by World Heritage Committee, Decision 43 COM 7B.78, point 12, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

The administration of Bukhara city, together with the Department of Cultural Heritage of the Bukhara Region, having studied and prepared the necessary information required by the Decision No. 43 COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee, reports the following:

1. Executive Summary

The city of Bukhara, like many other cities in Uzbekistan, is undergoing rapid urban transformation. In this process, the urban heritage of the Historic Centre of Bukhara is considered an important social, cultural and economic asset for the development of the city as a whole, mainly through sustainable tourism.

In order to reflect this approach, the legal and institutional frameworks have been amended and supplemented. The State Party adopted, in the last two years, important legal and institutional measures to protect cultural heritage and control development:

- On 24 August 2019, Senators approved a law “On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the republic of Uzbekistan concerning the enhanced protection of objects of the material cultural heritage”. The Criminal Code, the Code of Administrative Responsibility, the Tax Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, as well as the List of activities for which licenses are required, have been amended and supplemented. These amendments and addendums introduced an increased responsibility and liability for the destruction or damage to objects of tangible cultural heritage, not only for the intentional destruction, but also for negligence that caused significant damage. Liability for violation of the rules for the protection and use of cultural heritage applies to protected cultural properties situated within protected historical and cultural territories, including those inscribed on the World Heritage List, as well as to buildings, structures and other objects, which are not considered objects of cultural heritage, but are located in the above-mentioned protected territories.

- Regarding the moratorium on all construction works and upgrades, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019 No. UP-5781 “About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan” was issued. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the prevention of landscaping and construction work on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, included the UNESCO World Heritage properties.

- In Bukhara, the moratorium has been extended to the buffer zone, following the recommendation of the World Heritage Committee. The moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue to be so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have
been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place. The implementation of the moratorium is closely monitored.

- The Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 435 dated June 9, 2018 was adopted, according to which the construction on the territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara was halted and the property was given the status of ‘territory of special protection’. Also, with the aim of organizing the implementation of this resolution, a decision was made by the Hokim of the region No. 362 of June 16, 2018.

- Also in order to preserve the objects of cultural heritage in Bukhara, according to the order of the Hokim (Governor) of Bukhara Region dated January 30, 2018 No. 26-f., a Public Advisory Council was created to control the construction activity in the protected territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara. According to this order, the implementation of any construction works on existing buildings such as modification of street façades, modernization, repair, rehabilitation and restauration of cultural heritage, as well as construction of new buildings - enterprises, private houses, markets, from commercial and real estate sectors - located on the territory of the “Historic Centre of Bukhara”, require the authorization of the Public Advisory Council.

Furthermore, most of the planning tools had to be revised and updated, while new tools had to be prepared to ensure the effective protection of the World Heritage property for present and future generations:

- A new Master Plan has been developed and the Project of Detailed Planning (PDP) of 2017 is being revised, taking into account the conclusions and recommendations of the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory Mission. The draft of the revised PDP has been discussed with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara, 16-19 December 2019. The 2017 PDP has been invalidated and its application is suspended.

- A Management Plan for the Historic Centre of Bukhara World Heritage Property has been prepared using inclusive and participatory planning and stakeholder consultation processes. The reviewed draft of this document has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies. The Management Plan will be integrated to the Master Plan according to the 2011 Recommendation on Historic Urban Landscape, once both plans have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies.

The Hokim of the city of Bukhara created a specialized body - the Steering Committee. This council consists of specialists in the field of cultural heritage - architects, archaeologists, historians, art historians, as well as representatives of the community living in the territory of the property. The functions of this committee include monitoring the implementation of requirements for the preservation of cultural heritage, monitoring the implementation of the management plan, evaluating the implementation of the management plan, collecting, integrating, storing, analyzing and disseminating information about the property, monitoring of damaged, abandoned buildings and open spaces in the territory of the property.

The cultural heritage objects damaged through the implementation of the PDP of 2017 have been stabilized and protective measures have been taken – propping, shoring, installation of temporary supports, scaffolding, temporary protective roofs, safety nets, erection of fences around the damaged buildings, etc. Also, preventive measures have been taken to prevent their further damage and to eliminate threats to the property’s OUV.
Draft guidelines for restoration methods and materials have been developed and sent to the World Heritage Centre for review by Advisory bodies.

On September 23, 2019, the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan approved a Road Map for the implementation of Decision 43COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee. Several actions included in this road map have already been implemented. Among them, the expansion of the existing Interagency Task Force to include national and international experts reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Center for a period of at least five years, and provide it with a national level of mandate, to implement the tasks described in the Decision.

Finally, several major restoration projects and new constructions are planned in the property, including the restoration of Abdullaziz Khan Madrassah and the Reconstruction of the Shakhristan Market of Bukhara, among others. Documentation, drawings and Heritage Impact Assessments for all projects have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies.

2. Response to the Decision 43 COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee

In response to paragraph 3:

Welcomes the reported moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property and urges the State Party to adopt urgent legal and institutional measures to control development;

The Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 435 dated June 9, 2018 was adopted, according to which the construction on the territory of the Historic Center of Bukhara was halted and the property was given the status of ‘territory of special protection’. Also, with the aim of organizing the implementation of this resolution, a decision was made by the Hokim of the region No. 362 of June 16, 2018.

The Resolution was adopted in order to ensure the effective protection of the cultural heritage of Uzbekistan, including the territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara, to establish effective mechanisms of public control, including the work of the Public Councils and the UNESCO National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan, and to take into account the recommendations of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee regarding the Historic Centre of Bukhara. The moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property has been extended to the territory of the buffer zone, as recommended by the World Heritage Committee. This moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by ICOMOS. Its implementation is closely monitored.

Also in order to preserve the objects of cultural heritage in Bukhara, according to the order of the Hokim (Governor) of Bukhara Region dated January 30, 2018 No. 26-f., a Public Advisory Council was created to organize the construction activity in the protected territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara. According to this order, the implementation of any construction works on existing buildings such as modification of street façades, modernization, repair, rehabilitation and restauration of cultural heritage, as well as construction of new buildings - enterprises, private houses, markets, from commercial and real estate sectors - located on the territory of the “Historic Centre of Bukhara”, require the authorization of the City Council.
In response to paragraph 4:

Also welcomes the establishment of the World Heritage Property Steering Committee and the establishment of an Interagency Task Force to address emerging issues at the property, but requests that more details be provided on the scale, scope and mandate of the Task Force;

According to the Decision of the 41st session of the World Heritage Committee, by the initiative of the Bukhara State Regional Inspectorate for the Preservation of Cultural Heritage, a decision was made by the Hokim of the city of Bukhara to create a specialized body - the Steering Committee. This council consists of specialists in the field of cultural heritage, in particular architects, archaeologists, historians, art historians, as well as representatives of the local people living in the territory of the Historical Center of Bukhara. The functions of this committee include monitoring the implementation of requirements for the preservation of cultural heritage, monitoring the implementation of the management plan, evaluating the implementation of the management plan, collecting, integrating, storing, analyzing and disseminating information about the Historic Centre of Bukhara, monitoring damaged, abandoned buildings and empty spaces in the territory of Bukhara historical center, monitoring the preservation of the attributes of the Historic Centre of Bukhara from potential threats.

In response to paragraph 5:

Notes with grave concern the conclusions and recommendations of the April 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property, including the reported destruction of attributes of the property’s Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) as a result of the implementation of the Project of Detailed Planning of Historical Centre of Bukhara Development (PDP), which is based on a national decree to stimulate tourism development in the property and its region;

The implementation of the 2017 Project of Detailed Planning (PDP) based on a national decree to stimulate tourism development in the property and its region, and which caused damage to some attributes of the property’s OUV, has been suspended. A new PDP is being prepared for the Historic Centre of Bukhara, which addresses the conclusions and recommendations of the ICOMOS Advisory Mission of April 2018. The draft PDP has been discussed with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara, 16-19 January 2020.

In response to paragraph 6:

Takes note of the reported completion of the Integrated Management Plan and the Master Plan for the property, along with a system of protective zones for the property and its buffer zone, but expresses its concern that the Integrated Management Plan has not yet been submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies, despite earlier requests; that the Master Plan, although reportedly revised and updated, has been adopted without being submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies; and that the system of protective zones needs to be improved with regard to both its terminology and application;

The revised draft of the Integrated Management Plan has been sent to the World Heritage Center for review by the Advisory Bodies.

In response to paragraph 7:

Also requests that:
The moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property be extended to include the buffer zone of the property,
The Integrated Management Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its legal adoption,

The Master Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as possible and before any further decision is made that would be difficult to reverse;

Once both the Management Plan and the Master Plan have been reviewed, the Management Plan be integrated with the Master Plan, in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape;

The moratorium be enforced until both the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies, and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place and pilot projects have proven their effectiveness,

Prior to holding architectural design competitions for new projects, commissioning, or commencing any new development project or major restoration works, detailed proposals should be sent to the World Heritage Centre, for review in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;

Regarding the moratorium on all construction works and upgrades, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019 No. UP-5781 “About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan” was signed. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the prevention of landscaping and construction work on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, included the UNESCO World Heritage properties. This moratorium has been strictly enforced and it will continue so until the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place and pilot projects have proven their effectiveness. The implementation of the moratorium is closely monitored.

The draft of the Management Plan has been sent to the World Heritage Center for review by Advisory bodies (see point 6 above). The Management Plan will be integrated to the Master Plan according to the 2011 Recommendation on Historic Urban Landscape, once both the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies.

In response to paragraph 8:

Further requests the State Party to stabilize the valuable structures damaged through the implementation of the PDP and to take protective measures until a set of appropriate protocols on restoration methods and materials have been developed and reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;

The cultural heritage objects damaged through the implementation of the PDP of 2017 have been stabilized and protective measures have been taken – propping, shoring, installation of temporary supports, scaffolding, temporary protective roofs, safety netting, erection of fences around the damaged buildings, etc. Draft Guidelines for restoration methods and materials have been developed and sent to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory bodies.
In response to paragraph 9:

Also notes with grave concern the management weaknesses, damages to the property and threats to its OUV reported in the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission report, which echo the Committee’s earlier concerns;

The management deficiencies highlighted in the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory Mission Report have been addressed, and the damaged cultural objects have been stabilized. In addition, preventive measures have been taken to prevent their further damage (see point 8 above) and to eliminate threats to the OUV of the World Heritage property.

In response to paragraph 10:

Requests furthermore the State Party to expand its Interagency Task Force to include national and international expert advisors reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Centre for a defined period of minimum five years, and grant it a national-level mandate to:

1. Fully assess the legal protection and management systems already in place for the property and its buffer zones and make recommendations for improvements,
2. Assess and improve the roadmap to address the conservation of the property and oversee the implementation thereof after it is reviewed by the Advisory Bodies,
3. Carry out an annual assessment of the state of conservation of the property,
4. Monitor engagement with local and community stakeholders on the future of the property,
5. Oversee the development and guidelines for conservation and development which aim to preserve the property’s OUV,
6. Assess and recommend improvements to Impact Assessment processes, the reassessment of the Integrated Management Plan, Master Plan and other development plans and decrees, as well as reporting to the World Heritage Centre in the framework of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
7. Oversee the development and review of an appropriate and sustainable tourism development strategy and plan,
8. Select and monitor the implementation of pilot projects to access the efficiency of the developed, assessed and reviewed plans, guidelines and policies,
9. Monitor the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property and its buffer zone and annually assess whether the moratorium could be lifted, provided that the management system and the various management, conservation and development plans have been proven to be efficient,
10. Recommend the lifting of the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades in the property as well as its own dissolution once it is satisfied that the legal and management systems effectively protect the OUV of the property and its setting;

On September 23, 2019, a meeting of the Presidium of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan was held, and a Road Map was approved. The road map includes the expansion of the existing Interagency Task Force to include national and international expert advisors reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Center for a period of at least five years, and provide it with a national level of mandate, to implement the tasks described in the 10 points above. This action, and several other actions included in the road map have already been implemented.
In response to paragraph 11:

Requests moreover the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to assess the full scope of the impacts already caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property;

The State Party invited a joint World Heritage /ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission to visit the property in order to assess the impacts caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property.

The Mission visited the Historic City of Bukhara between 16-19 January 2020 and met with local and regional authorities, members of the Interagency Task Force, mahalla leaders and residents.

3. Other current conservation issues identified by the State Party which may have an impact on the property’s Outstanding Universal Value;

An important law, which will greatly contribute to the preservation of the OUV of the property, has been approved recently:

On 24 August 2019, Senators approved a law “On amendments and additions to some legislative acts of the republic of Uzbekistan concerning the enhanced protection of objects of the material cultural heritage”. The Criminal Code, the Code of Administrative Responsibility, the Tax Code of the Republic of Uzbekistan, as well as the List of activities for which licenses are required, have been amended and supplemented. These amendments and addendums introduced an increased responsibility and liability for the destruction or damage to objects of tangible cultural heritage, through the intentional destruction, but also through negligence that caused significant damage. Liability applies to protected cultural properties situated within protected historical and cultural territories, including those inscribed on the World Heritage List, as well as to buildings, structures and other objects which are not considered objects of cultural heritage, but are located in the above-mentioned protected territories.

4. Potential major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) intended within the property, the buffer zone(s) and/or corridors or other areas, that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including authenticity and integrity.

Several major restoration projects and new constructions are planned in the Historic Centre of Bukhara. Among them, the restoration of Abdullaziz Khan Madrassah and the Reconstruction of the Shakhristan Market of Bukhara. Heritage Impact Assessments have been prepared for each of them and sent, together with the detailed drawings, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies.

5. Public access to the state of conservation report

The full report can be uploaded for public access.
6. Signature of the Authority

Mrs. Kamola Akylova
Deputy Minister
Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Uzbekistan
THE HISTORIC CENTRE OF BUKHARA
WORLD HERITAGE PROPERTY

STATE OF CONSERVATION REPORT
(2020)

Bukhara-Tashkent, 9 January 2021
CONTENTS

Identification

1. Executive Summary of the report
2. Response to the Decision of the World Heritage Committee (43 COM 7B.44)
3. Other current conservation issues identified by the State Party which may have an impact on the property’s Outstanding Universal Value
4. Intended major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) within the property, the buffer zone and/or corridors or other areas
5. Public access to the state of conservation report
6. Signature of the Authority
Historic Centre of Bukhara (Uzbekistan) (602 bis)

Identification

**Geographic coordinates**: 39°46'39.2"N 64°24'33.2"E

**Date of Inscription**: 1993

**Criteria**: (ii), (iv) and (vi).

**Minor boundary modification inscribed year**: 2016

**Property**: 216 ha

**Buffer zone**: 339 ha

**Ref**: 602bis

**Reporting period**: 2020

**Responsible organizations for the preparation of the state of conservation report**:

- Department of Cultural Heritage under the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Uzbekistan;
- Khokimiyat of Bukhara region;
- Bukhara Regional Department of Cultural Heritage.

The State of Conservation report was required by World Heritage Committee, Decision 43 COM 7B.78 (see Annex 1), for examination at its 44th session.

1. Executive Summary of the report

The Historic Centre of Bukhara is one of the few urban centres in Central Asia that retained their original appearance, thanks to the sustained collective efforts to protect, conserve and enhance this World Heritage property. Many measures have recently been taken to address the concerns raised by the World Heritage Committee (Decision No. 43 COM 7B.78), including the following:

- On September 23, 2019, the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan approved a Road Map for the implementation of Decision 43COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee. Several actions included in this road map have already been implemented. Among them, the expansion of the existing Interagency Task Force to include national and international experts reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Center for a period of five years. This task force has now a national-level mandate.

- Regarding the moratorium on construction works and upgrades, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019 No. UP-5781 “About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan” was issued. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the prevention of landscaping and construction work on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, included the UNESCO World Heritage properties. The moratorium, which applied initially to the property, has been expanded to the buffer zone, following the recommendation of the World Heritage Committee. The implementation of the expanded moratorium is closely monitored by a Regional Working Group established for this purpose.

- In order to preserve the urban heritage of Bukhara, a Public Advisory Council was created upon the order of the Hokim of Bukhara Region dated January 30, 2018 to control the construction activity in the protected territory of the Historic Centre of Bukhara. According to this order, the implementation of any construction works on existing buildings such as the modification of street façades, modernization, repair, rehabilitation and restauuration of cultural heritage, as well as construction of new buildings located in the territory of the “Historic Centre of Bukhara”, require the authorization of the Public Advisory Council.
- A new Master Plan is being developed and the Project for Detailed Planning (PDP) of 2017 is being revised, taking into account the recommendations of the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory Mission, and the recommendations of the joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission (17-21 January 2020). Both draft plans have been discussed with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara.

- A Management Plan for the Historic Centre of Bukhara World Heritage Property has been prepared using participatory planning and stakeholder consultation processes. The reviewed draft of this document has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review. Upon recommendation of the Reactive Monitoring Mission report of 2020 and following the UNESCO Recommendation on HUL, the Management Plan will be integrated to the Master Plan for Bukhara city and the PDP once all these plans have been reviewed and agreed by ICOMOS.

- The Hokim of Bukhara city created a Steering Committee, including specialists in the field of cultural heritage as well as representatives of the community to monitor the implementation of heritage preservation international standards, monitor and evaluate the implementation of the management plan, monitor the condition of buildings and open spaces within the property.

- Several major restoration, repair and maintenance works and new constructions are planned within the property. Project documentation and Heritage Impact Assessments for all projects (restoration of Abdulaziz Khan, Ulugbek, Mini Arab, Amir Alimkhan Madrassahs, Kalon minaret, Kalon mosque, Ark complex (Kushbegi, Sayskhona, Salomkhona and Takhtkhana courtyards, as well as redevelopment of Shakhristan Bazaar) have been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS. The implementation of those projects that have been validated by ICOMOS has already started. For those that have been rejected, new conservation plans have been prepared, following the recommendations of ICOMOS Technical reviews and those of the Reactive Monitoring Mission, together with HIAs. The project documents have been sent to the Ministry of Culture, to be further submitted to the World Heritage Centre. The revision of the Shakhristan Bazaar redevelopment project and a new HIA report are under preparation.

- Also, preliminary projects for emergency interventions on buildings in a critical structural condition have been developed and submitted to the UNESCO World Heritage Center for review. Project documents for Abdulazizkhan madrasah and Khoja Kalon Hauz, located within the property, have been developed and sent to the World Heritage Center with the letter of the Ministry of Culture No. 01-12-12-5771, dated December 29, 2020.

- The quality of several roads leading to key monuments has been improved for the benefit of residents and tourists. Also, different tourist facilities have been created for visitors along these tourist routes.

- The people's awareness on the protection and conservation of the historic center has increased thanks to the community outreach and awareness-raising activities that are continuously carried out through a range of different means or tools.

2. Response to the Decision of the World Heritage Committee (43 COM 7B.44)

During the 43rd session of the World Heritage Committee, from June 30 to July 10, 2019 in Baku, the Decision No. 43 COM 7B.78 on the "Historic Centre of Bukhara" was adopted.

In accordance with the requirements of this decision, the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan approved the Statement No.132 and the “Road Map” on September 23, 2019 to accelerate the work on protection and conservation in the Historic Centre of Bukhara, and ensure the implementation of the Decision No. 43 COM 7B.78 of the World Heritage Committee.

Concerning the implementation of the decision of the World Heritage Center No. 43 COM 7B.78, the State Party reports the following:
In response to paragraph 3:

According to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 435 dated June 9, 2018, all the construction works on the territory of the "Historic Centre of Bukhara" and its buffer zone were halted and this area was designated as a "special protected area".

Regarding the moratorium on all construction works, a Presidential Decree of the Republic of Uzbekistan of August 13, 2019, No. UP-5781 "About measures for further development in the sphere of tourism in the Republic of Uzbekistan" was issued. According to paragraph No. 22 of the decree, the General Prosecutor’s Office of the Republic of Uzbekistan is obliged to ensure strict control over the landscaping and construction works on the territory of the cultural heritage sites, including the UNESCO World Heritage properties.

Also, a Law the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 560 was adopted on August 30, 2019, which strictly specifies the measures to be taken in the event of the construction or demolition of buildings, structures and other objects included in the World Heritage List and their buffer zones without proper permission, in accordance to the legal procedure.

In response to paragraph 4:

A World Heritage Property Steering Committee and an Interagency Task Force reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of Uzbekistan and the World Heritage Center have been established to address emerging issues at the property. The Interagency Task Force has been expanded to include local and international experts elected for five years and was provided a national-level mandate.

Also, in accordance with the statement of the Governor of Bukhara Region No. 1/151 dated June 30, 2020, a Regional Working Group has been created to oversee the implementation of the expanded moratorium on all construction works in the "Historic Centre of Bukhara" and its buffer zone (the composition of the Regional Working Group is attached in Annex 2). The main tasks of this group are:

- organization of regular monitoring of the implementation of the moratorium in the Historic Centre of Bukhara and its buffer zone; in case of violation of the moratorium, punitive measures are taken in accordance with the Law.
- coordination of the activities of specialized organizations and departments to conduct relevant community outreach and communication activities on the implementation of the moratorium;
- ensuring joint work of different organizations to extend the moratorium, solve problems and provide practical assistance;
- discussion of the activities of the Public Advisory Council on the use of tangible cultural heritage objects and their setting and the responsibilities for their improvement and maintenance;
- at the end of each month to receive information from the relevant organizations and agencies on the work carried out in this area.

Photos from the ongoing public awareness and outreach activities
Furthermore, regular public awareness and outreach activities targeting the residents and the entrepreneurs in the region are carried out to prevent unauthorized construction and demolition in the Historic Centre of Bukhara and its buffer zone.

In response to paragraph 5: In accordance with the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers No. 435 dated June 9, 2018 and the Statement of the Presidium of the Cabinet of Ministers No. 132 dated September 23, 2019, and in accordance with the recommendations of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee on Historic Centre of Bukhara, the "Uzshaharsozlik LITI" state unitary enterprise is preparing a new Master Plan of Bukhara city in cooperation with the Khokimiyat of Bukhara region, the Ministry of Construction and the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

Also, in accordance with the recommendations of the 43rd session of the World Heritage Committee on the Historic Centre of Bukhara, the Directorate for construction, reconstruction and overhaul of important social, cultural and historical objects under the Cabinet of Ministers of Uzbekistan, the Ministry of Culture and Bukhara regional administration in cooperation with the private company "Madaniy Meros LITI" LLC is developing a Project for Detailed Planning (PDP) for the Historic Centre of Bukhara, as part of the Master Plan of Bukhara city. The recommendations of the joint World Heritage Center/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission to Bukhara (January 17-19, 2020) conducted by Mr. Feng Jing (Chief of Asia and the Pacific Unit, World Heritage Centre, UNESCO) and Richard Mackay (ICOMOS Expert), have been taken into account in the development of the PDP of the Historic Centre of Bukhara.

Photos from the meeting of the representatives of the Reactive Monitoring Mission with the governor of Bukhara region and other officials.

During the preparation of the PDP, a list of objects to be repaired or developed in priority was compiled and project proposals and heritage impact assessment reports have been prepared and submitted to the WHC for review by ICOMOS. They include the restoration of the Ark fortress, and of Abdullakhan, Modarikhan, Abdullazizkhan, Ulugbek, Amir Olimkhan madrasahs, Poyi Kalon Ensemble (Kalon minaret, Kalon mosque, Mir Arab madrasah) as well as the redevelopment of the Shahristan Bazaar. All these projects and plans were discussed with the members of the Joint UNESCO-WHC/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission.

In response to paragraph 6: Based on the recommendations of the 43rd session of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee concerning the Historic Centre of Bukhara, a draft Management Plan for the Historic Centre of Bukhara was prepared in cooperation with the International Institute for Central Asian Studies (IICAS).

Following the usual procedure, the draft Management Plan for the Historic Centre of Bukhara was first submitted to the National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan for UNESCO in accordance with the letter of the Bukhara regional administration dated August 6, 2019 No.5/3696, in order to be further submitted to the UNESCO World Heritage Center.
In response to paragraph 7.a: The moratorium on all construction works and upgrades to the property has been extended to include the buffer zone of the property. The Bukhara Regional Department of Cultural Heritage, the Regional Department of Architecture and the Regional Construction Inspection sent warning letters to citizens living in the historic centre and the buffer zone explaining that construction works and upgrades are halted temporarily in these areas. In addition, social networks, mass media and regional TV channels are carrying out community outreach programs targeting the population living in the historic center of Bukhara and its buffer zone to prevent unauthorized construction and demolition. You can watch promotional videos via this link: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GAKN5maTecQ

In response to paragraph 7.b: The draft Management Plan has been sent to the National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan for UNESCO in accordance with the letter of the Bukhara regional administration No. 5/3696 dated August 6, 2019 for submission to the UNESCO World Heritage Center following the established procedure.

In response to paragraph 7.c: The new Master Plan for Bukhara city is currently under preparation and will be submitted for review by ICOMOS once completed.

In response to paragraph 7.d: After review of Management Plan, Master Plan of Bukhara city and PDP, the Management Plan will be integrated and harmonized with the Master Plan of Bukhara city and the PDP, in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape. Currently, the two urban planning documents are under preparation.

In response to paragraph 7.e: Until the Master Plan of Bukhara city and the Management Plan of the Historic Centre of Bukhara are approved by the World Heritage Center upon review by ICOMOS, and adequate management systems, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place no construction or upgrade works will be carried out within the Historic Centre of Bukhara and its buffer zone, according to the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan No. 265 dated March 30, 2019. The implementation of the moratorium is monitored by the Regional Working Group and its enforcement is ensured by the Bukhara City Prosecutor's Office.

In response to paragraph 7.f: In accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, detailed proposals are sent to the World Heritage Centre for review, prior to holding architectural design competitions for new projects, commissioning, or commencing any new development project or major restoration works. This became a usual procedure in Bukhara.

In response to paragraph 8: During the preparation of a new PDP for the Historic Centre of Bukhara, a list of objects damaged as the result of the implementation of the PDP of 2017 was compiled. For these objects (Abdulazizkhan, Ulugbek, Miri Arab, Amir Alimkhan madrassahs, Kalon minaret, Kalon mosque and Kushbegi, Sayskhona, Salomkhona and Takhtkhana courtyards of the Ark complex), preliminary conservation proposals have been prepared and submitted to the National Commission of the Republic of Uzbekistan for UNESCO and the Ministry of Culture,
according to the letter No. 5/3696 dated August 6, 2019. The proposals consist of emergency protective measures to stabilize the damaged structures and prevent further damage until comprehensive restoration plans are developed and reviewed by ICOMOS.

The World Heritage Center has given positive feedback on some of the above projects. The projects which were rejected by the World Heritage Center and ICOMOS experts have been re-considered taking into account their suggestions and recommendations, and sent to the Ministry of Culture for submission to the UNESCO World Heritage Center, in accordance with the letter of the Bukhara regional administration No. 3/4178 dated November 11, 2020.

**In response to paragraph 9:** In April 2018, an ICOMOS Advisory Mission visited Bukhara and reported about management weaknesses, damages to the property and threats to its OUV. As informed in the previous paragraphs, most management deficiencies have been addressed, and we keep working to improve the management of the property. Also, corrective measures have been taken to contain the damage to the property, following the recommendations included in the ICOMOS Advisory Mission Report of 2018.

**In response to paragraph 10:** In accordance with the statement No. 132 of the Presidium of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan on September 23rd, 2019, the Interagency Task Force has been expanded to include national and international experts reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Centre for a defined period of five years. This Interagency Task Force was granted a national-level mandate, thereby fully addressing the tasks listed in paragraph 10 of the Decision 43 COM 7B.78.

**In response to paragraph 11:** At the invitation of the State Party, a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring Mission visited Bukhara in January 17-19, 2020 in order to assess the full scope of the impacts already caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property. The Mission met and discussed these issues with regional government officials, members of the Interagency Task Force, community activists, and community representatives. Also during this visit, the draft Master Plan of Bukhara city, the Management Plan Historic Centre of Bukhara, the redevelopment of the "Shahristan" Bazaar and other projects for cultural heritage objects have been presented to the Mission. Heritage impact assessments have been prepared for the “Shakhristan” Bazaar proposal and for a series of restoration projects mentioned above in response to paragraph 5, and submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by ICOMOS. Some of these projects received negative feedback from ICOMOS and had to be reviewed taking into account the recommendations of the ICOMOS Technical Reviews and the recommendations of the Reactive Monitoring Mission Report (received in September 2020). Then, part of them have been submitted to the Ministry of Culture to be further sent to the UNESCO World Heritage Center.

The review of the Shakhristan Bazaar redevelopment project, according to the recommendations of the ICOMOS Technical Review and those of the Reactive Monitoring Mission report of September 2020, is still under preparation.

Meanwhile, archaeological investigations on the project site continued. The site of the Shakhristan Bazaar project is believed to be archaeologically sensitive, and therefore preventive archaeological research was conducted before the commencement of planning and building activity, to detect and undertake the scientific study of archaeological remains that might otherwise be destroyed by land development work. According to the agreement No. 10 signed on August 20, 2018 between the Institute of Archaeological Research of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan and the Single Customer Service Engineering Company under the Hokimiyat of Bukhara region, archeological investigation started under the direction of archaeologist J.K.Mirzaakhmedov.

In 2018 – 2019, upon the recommendations of ICOMOS and the Khokimiyat of Bukhara region, excavation work was carried out on the territory of the ancient Shahristan to determine the historical stratigraphy in this part of the ancient city. The international experts R. Rante, archaeologist of the Louvre Museum in France and head of the Bukhara archaeological mission,
and A. Targoev, a leading specialist of the Russian State Hermitage Museum, were involved in the archeological research of the area of the former Shahristan Bazaar and the Ark Fortress. The excavation revealed the archaeological remains of early twentieth century buildings and structures, fragments of building materials and tiles, as well as fragments of household items.

Also, in November-December 2020, a group of specialists led by J.K.Mirzaakhmedov from the National Archaeological Center of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Uzbekistan, conducted archeological research in the area of the former Shahristan bazaar. The final results of this research will be integrated to the project documents to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre.

In response to paragraph 12: A detailed report on the implementation of the Decision 43 COM 7B.78 adopted by the World Heritage Committee during its 43rd session (Baku, 2019) was prepared and submitted to the World Heritage Center by 1st of February 2020.

3. Other current conservation issues identified by the State Party which may have an impact on the property’s Outstanding Universal Value

Other issues that may affect the OUV of the property have been identified. The changes in groundwater depth and salinity in the last decennia, accelerated in the late 1990s, put the tangible cultural heritage of Bukhara under threat: the high salinity levels in Bukhara, led to the degradation of cultural heritage objects, including erosion. When the groundwater table is less than 2 meters from the surface it entails the dissolution of salts contained in the upper part of the soil. Consequently, rising damp and salt affect the foundations and walls of historic buildings. In order to address this problem, the national government authorities established a network of wells in Bukhara for lifting and draining groundwater that resulted in maintaining the water table around 2 meters below the surface. Other treatments are under study. Also, large amounts of water accumulate on the ground during the rainy seasons. Greening, tree preservation and tree planting as well as rehabilitation of the water channels (ariks) and hauzes (pools), contribute to recovering the water balance in Bukhara and thereby preserving the historic city’s heritage.

4. Intended major restorations, alterations and/or new construction(s) within the property, the buffer zone and/or corridors or other areas

Several restoration, repair and maintenance works on listed buildings - Abdullaziz Khan, Ulugbek, Mili Arab, Amir Alimkhun Madrassah, Kalon minaret, Kalon mosque, Ark complex (Kushbegi, Sayskhona, Salomkhona and Takhtkhana courtyards) - are planned in the Historic Centre of Bukhara. Also, a major redevelopment project, the Shakhristan Bazaar of Bukhara, has been developed. Heritage impact assessments have been prepared for each of them and sent, together with the project documentation, to the World Heritage Centre for review. As mentioned in the response to paragraph 8, ICOMOS has given positive feedback on some of the above projects. The projects which were rejected by the World Heritage Center and ICOMOS have been reviewed (except the Shakhristan Bazaar project which is still under preparation), taking into account the recommendations of the ICOMOS Technical Review and the Reactive Monitoring Mission report.

In addition, preliminary project documentation for emergency measures have been developed and submitted to the UNESCO World Heritage Center for review. These include the preliminary projects for the Abdulazizkhan madrasah and Khoja Kalon Hauz, located within the property, which are in a critical state of conservation posing a risk to public safety and the surrounding areas. These projects have been sent to the World Heritage Center by the letter of Ministry of Culture No. 01-12-12-5771, on December 29, 2020.

In the framework of the ongoing program for the rehabilitation of the ancient water system in Bukhara - channels and hauzes – the remaining stone hauzes which are part of important urban ensembles, such as Gaukushon Ensemble, are planned to be rehabilitated. The public space around hauzes will be enhanced through landscaping, tree planting, paving and urban furniture. These projects will benefit both residents and visitors by providing a more attractive setting to the surrounding monuments and houses. These projects also address climate change by improving the
environmental quality of public spaces, to enjoy in the hotter summers of Bukhara. A HIA for Gaukushon Hauz project is under preparation and will be submitted soon to the World Heritage Centre.

5. **Public access to the state of conservation report**
   The full report can be uploaded for public access.

6. **Signature of the Authority**
   Mrs. Kamola Akylova  
   Deputy Minister of Culture, Republic of Uzbekistan

.................................................................
ANNEX 1

Decision: 43 COM 7B.78 The World Heritage Committee (Baku, 2019)

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7B.Add,
2. Recalling Decision 41 COM 7B.99, adopted at its 41st session (Krakow, 2017),
3.Welcomes the reported moratorium on all construction work and on upgrades to the property and urges the State Party to adopt urgent legal and institutional measures to control development;
4. Also welcomes the establishment of the World Heritage Property Steering Committee and the establishment of an Interagency Task Force to address emerging issues at the property, but requests that more details be provided on the scale, scope and mandate of the Task Force;
5. Notes with grave concern the conclusions and recommendations of the April 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission to the property, including the reported destruction of attributes of the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) as a result of the implementation of the Project for Detailed Planning of Historical Centre of Bukhara Development (PDP), which is based on a national decree to stimulate tourism development in the property and its region;
6. Takes note of the reported completion of the Integrated Management Plan and the Master Plan for the property, along with a system of protective zones for the property and its buffer zone, but expresses its concern that the Integrated Management Plan has not yet been submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies, despite earlier requests; that the Master Plan, although reportedly revised and updated, has been adopted without being submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies; and that the system of protective zones needs to be improved with regard to both its terminology and application;
7. Also requests that:
   a) The moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property be extended to include the buffer zone of the property,
   b) The Integrated Management Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies prior to its legal adoption,
   c) The Master Plan be submitted for review by the Advisory Bodies as soon as possible and before any further decision is made that would be difficult to reverse;
   d) Once both the Management Plan and the Master Plan have been reviewed, the Management Plan be integrated with the Master Plan, in line with the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape;
   e) The moratorium be enforced until both the Master Plan and the Management Plan have been reviewed by the Advisory Bodies, and adequate management systems, conservation, Heritage Impact Assessments and development policies and protocols are in place and pilot projects have proven their effectiveness,
   f) Prior to holding architectural design competitions for new projects, commissioning, or commencing any new development project or major restoration works, detailed proposals should be sent to the World Heritage Centre, for review in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
8. Further requests the State Party to stabilize the valuable structures damaged through the implementation of the PDP and to take protective measures until a set of appropriate protocols on restoration methods and materials have been developed and reviewed by the Advisory Bodies;
9. Also notes with grave concern the management weaknesses, damages to the property and threats to its OUV reported in the 2018 ICOMOS Advisory mission report, which echo the Committee’s earlier concerns;
10. Requests furthermore the State Party to expand its Interagency Task Force to include national and international expert advisors reporting directly to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic
of Uzbekistan and to the World Heritage Centre for a defined period of minimum five years, and grant it a national-level mandate to:

a) Fully assess the legal protection and management systems already in place for the property and its buffer zones and make recommendations for improvements,
b) Assess and improve the roadmap to address the conservation of the property and oversee the implementation thereof after it is reviewed by the Advisory Bodies,
c) Carry out an annual assessment of the state of conservation of the property,
d) Monitor engagement with local and community stakeholders on the future of the property,
e) Oversee the development of policies and guidelines for conservation and development which aim to preserve the property’s OUV,
f) Assess and recommend improvements to Impact Assessment processes, the reassessment of the Integrated Management Plan, Master Plan and other development plans and decrees, as well as reporting to the World Heritage Centre in the framework of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines,
g) Oversee the development and review of an appropriate and sustainable tourism development strategy and plan,
h) Select and monitor the implementation of pilot projects to access the efficiency of the developed, assessed and reviewed plans, guidelines and policies,
i) Monitor the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades to the property and its buffer zone and annually assess whether the moratorium could be lifted, provided that the management system and the various management, conservation and development plans have been proven to be efficient,
j) Recommend the lifting of the moratorium on all construction work and upgrades in the property as well as its own dissolution once it is satisfied that the legal and management systems effectively protect the OUV of the property and its setting;

11. Requests moreover the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property in order to assess the full scope of the impacts already caused to the property and its OUV, the efficacy of the Interagency Task Force and other management systems, to review the overall state of conservation of the property and the factors that constitute a threat to the property and to consider whether there is an ascertained or potential danger to the OUV of the property;

12. Finally requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by 1 February 2020, a report on the state of conservation of the property and on the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.
## ANNEX 2

**Members of the Regional Working Group (RWG) in charge of the implementation of the moratorium on all construction works in the Historic Centre of Bukhara and its buffer zone**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shakhriyorov B.</td>
<td>Deputy Governor of the Bukhara region, <em>Chair of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hamdamov N.</td>
<td>Deputy Governor of the Bukhara region, <em>Co-chair of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jumayev Y.</td>
<td>Deputy Governor of the Bukhara region, <em>Co-chair of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jumayev U.</td>
<td>Mayor of Bukhara city, <em>Vice-chair of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mahmudov Sh.</td>
<td>Head of the Bukhara Regional Department of Cultural Heritage, <em>Vice-chair of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aliyev Sh.</td>
<td>Head of the Bukhara Regional Department of Internal Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safarov E.</td>
<td>Deputy head of the Bukhara Regional Department of Internal Affairs, Head of the Department for Sustainable Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adilov B.</td>
<td>Head of the Main Department of Finance of the regional administration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmedov J.</td>
<td>Head of the Bukhara regional branch of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Davlatov H.</td>
<td>Head of the regional construction department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bobokalonov S.</td>
<td>Director of the Bukhara Regional Department for Tourism Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Klichev Z.</td>
<td>Private Architect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharofiddinov Sh.</td>
<td>Main specialist of the Bukhara Regional Department of Cultural Heritage, <em>Secretary of the RWG</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>