

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

> Organisation des Nations Unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

## World Heritage

AMENDMENT

Item of the Agenda	7B
Amended Draft Decision	42COM7B.14
	Fort and Shalamar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan)
Amendment submitted by the Delegation of	Drafting group (Azerbaijan, Spain, Norway, China, Indonesia)
Date	28 June 2018

## TEXT

## Draft Decision: 42 COM 7B.14

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. <u>Having examined Document WHC/18/42.COM/7B.Add.2</u>,
- 2. <u>Recalling</u> Decisions **40 COM 7B. 43** and **41 COM 7B.96**, adopted at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, Poland) sessions respectively,
- 3. <u>Acknowledges</u> the efforts made by the State Party to address the Committee's recommendations with regard to the conservation of the property;
- 4. Takes further note of the decision of the Honourable Supreme Court of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan that has given 31 directions with regard to protection, preservation and conservation of the property;
- 4.5. <u>Regrets however</u> <u>Expresses concern</u> that the State Party did not inform the World Heritage Committee of the Orange Line Metro project before any irreversible decision was taken, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, especially in view of the impacts of the metro line, and notably its route and construction process, on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property; [China] Reiterates the importance of Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
- <u>5.6.</u> <u>Deeply regrets that, Also expresses concern</u> that, despite the Committee's previous decisions, the Orange Line Metro in Lahore has been almost completed without a satisfactory, comprehensive Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) for the project, and also regrets that the assessment conducted by the State Party in

2016, which was not realized in accordance with the 2011 ICOMOS Guidance on Heritage Impact Assessments for Cultural World Heritage Properties, significantly downplays the very serious environmental impacts of the new Orange Line Metro project and does not in any way reflect the reality on site;

- 6. Further regrets that alternative routes for the Orange Line Metro, which could have avoided adverse impacts on the property, were not pursued;
- 7. Reiterates its deep regrets that the State Party did not invite the Reactive Monitoring mission in either 2016 or 2017, as requested in Decision **40 COM 7B.43**, to examine the Orange Line Metro
- 8.7. Notes that the property suffers from the visual impacts of the newly-constructed Orange Line Metro on main perspectives to and from the property, and on its appearance from both outside and inside the garden, and also notes that the heavy noise pollution to be generated by the metro line will add to the already substantial noise and air pollution impacts of the Grand Trunk Road (GT Road); <u>Notes</u> the efforts of the State Party in implementing all mitigation measures during the construction phase of Orange Line Metro Train Project (OLMTP) and <u>requests</u> that close monitoring and implementation of vibration control, noise, air pollution and visual mitigation measures directed in the order of the Honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan and suggested in various studies will be ensured during the operation phase of Orange Line;
- 9.8. Considers <u>Notes</u> that this the impact on greatly diminishes the integrity and authenticity of this masterpiece of Mughal creativity, and removes it even further from the oasis of peace and tranquillity that it was intended to be; the property;
- 10. Also considers that the construction of the Orange Line Metro has irreversible impacts on the attributes relating to the artistic and aesthetic accomplishments exemplified by the property at the time of inscription, and that the Orange Line Metro represents a threat to the OUV of the property, notably its authenticity and integrity, in accordance with Paragraph 179 of the Operational Guidelines;
- *11.* Decides, therefore, to inscribe the Fort and Shalamar Gardens in Lahore (Pakistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- <u>12.9. Takes note</u> of the outcomes of the April 2018 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, including the evaluation of the current condition of the property, and <u>also requests</u> the State Party to implement all of the mission's recommendations;
- 13. Acknowledging that full mitigation of the adverse impacts is not possible, urges nonetheless the State Party to implement the mitigation measures proposed by the 2018 mission regarding the impacts of the Orange Line Metro on the Shalamar Gardens, and especially to:
  - a) Redirect vehicular traffic of the GT Road behind the existing Orange Line Metro viaduct, using the lanes of only one direction of the dual motorway, and construct an additional motorway further to the south of the property for traffic in the opposite direction,
  - b) Combine the construction of the additional motorway with the creation of an intermediate green belt to create a separation between the property and the motorways, and develop a more extended green area with tall trees, giving a possibility of creating a natural "mask" for the newlyconstructed Orange Metro Line,
    - c) Move vehicular traffic to the surrounding streets, introducing a Noise-

Sensitive Zone around the component site,

- d) Revise the protective Buffer Zone of the Shalamar Gardens to include the three remaining hydraulic tanks, reveal the historical GT Road at its original lower level and create a pedestrian area alongside the south façade. This pedestrian road could easily be connected with a future pedestrian road around the other sides of the Gardens and could also include the adjacent Mughal pavilion, which is possibly related to the Shalamar Gardens' hydraulic system,
- e) Immediately restore the external waterway along the outside façade of the Perimeter Wall, which was part of the Mughal hydraulic system of the Gardens,
- f) Between the Shalamar Garden and the Pakistan Mint stations, construct a tube of soundproofing triplex transparent glass along the tracks, which could also help mitigate the visual impact on the component site, and affix glass curtains on the road side and on the piers along the viaduct bridge to combat noise and air pollution;
- 10. Further requests the State Party, in line with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to submit, in relation to future projects, detailed project studies to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies and to ensure that implementation only start after positive feedback has been received from the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
- 11. Finally requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by <u>1 February 2019, a report on the state of conservation of the property and</u> <u>the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage</u> <u>Committee at its 43rd session in 2019.</u>