

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

> Organisation des Nations Unies pour l'éducation, la science et la culture

# **World Heritage**

**41 COM** 

WHC/17/41.COM/8E Paris, 19 May 2017

Original: English

# UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

# CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

# **WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE**

**Forty-first session** 

Krakow, Poland 2-12 July 2017

<u>Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda</u>: Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

8E: Adoption of retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value

## **SUMMARY**

This document presents a Draft Decision concerning the adoption of 25 retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value submitted by 11 States Parties for properties which had no Statement of Outstanding Universal Value adopted at the time of their inscription on the World Heritage List.

The Annex contains the full text of the retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value in the original language, as submitted to the Secretariat.

Draft Decision: 41 COM 8E, see Point II

#### I. BACKGROUND

- 1. The Statement of Outstanding Universal Value was introduced in the *Operational Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention* in 2005 as an essential requirement for the inscription of a property on the World Heritage List. All properties inscribed since 2007 present such a Statement.
- 2. In 2007, the World Heritage Committee, in its Decision **31 COM 11D.1**, requested that Statements of Outstanding Universal Value be drafted and adopted retrospectively for all World Heritage properties inscribed between 1978 and 2006.
- 3. As a consequence, States Parties draft retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties located within their territories. These are then reviewed by the Secretariat and the relevant Advisory Body(ies).
- 4. This document presents 25 draft retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for which the review process has been finalized since the 40th session of the World Heritage Committee (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) for adoption by the World Heritage Committee.
- 5. The Draft Decision presents a list of 25 properties by region and by State Party in alphabetical order. They are distributed as follows: Arab States (1), Europe and North America (23) and Latin America and the Caribbean (1). The Annex of this document contains all the draft retrospective Statements and includes a table of contents presenting all properties concerned.
- 6. The 25 draft retrospective Statements are presented in the language in which they were submitted to the Secretariat. Once adopted, they will be translated into the other official language of the *Convention* and uploaded progressively on the World Heritage Centre's website, subject to availability of funds.
- 7. In compliance with paragraph 155 of the *Operational Guidelines*, the protection and management part of the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value may be updated by the World Heritage Committee, in consultation with the State Party and further to a review by the Advisory Bodies.
- 8. Furthermore, in compliance with paragraph 155 of the *Operational Guidelines*, the World Heritage Centre automatically updates the Statements further to subsequent decisions taken by the Committee concerning a change of name of the property and change of surface further to minor boundary modifications. The Centre also corrects any factual errors as agreed with the relevant Advisory Bodies.

## II. DRAFT DECISION

# **Draft Decision: 41 COM 8E**

The World Heritage Committee,

- 1. Having examined Document WHC/17/41.COM/8E,
- Congratulates the States Parties for the excellent work accomplished in the elaboration of retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties located within their territories;

 Adopts the retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value, as presented in the Annex of Document WHC/17/41.COM/8E, for the following World Heritage properties:

#### ARAB STATES

Egypt, Memphis and its Necropolis – the Pyramid Fields from Giza to Dahshur

# EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

- Armenia, Cathedral and Churches of Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots
- Armenia, Monasteries of Haghpat and Sanahin
- Canada, L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site
- Czech Republic, Litomyšl Castle
- France, Bourges Cathedral
- France, Chartres Cathedral
- France, Cistercian Abbey of Fontenay
- France, Historic Centre of Avignon: Papal Palace, Episcopal Ensemble and Avignon Bridge
- France, Historic Site of Lyon
- France, Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion
- France, Palace and Park of Fontainebleau
- France, Paris, Banks of the Seine
- France, Place Stanislas, Place de la Carrière and Place d'Alliance in Nancy
- France, Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France
- Ireland, Sceilg Mhichíl
- Italy, Portovenere, Cinque Terre, and the Islands (Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto)
- Portugal, Cultural Landscape of Sintra
- Russian Federation, Citadel, Ancient City and Fortress Buildings of Derbent
- Russian Federation, Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands
- Russian Federation, Historic and Architectural Complex of the Kazan Kremlin
- Russian Federation, White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal
- Sweden, Hanseatic Town of Visby
- Sweden, Rock Carvings in Tanum

# LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARRIBBEAN

- Dominica, Morne Trois Pitons National Park;
- <u>Decides</u> that retrospective Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for World Heritage properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger will be reviewed in priority by the Advisory Bodies;
- 5. <u>Requests</u> the States Parties to provide support to the World Heritage Centre for translation of the adopted Statements of Outstanding Universal Value into English or

French respectively, anguage versions or	n its website.	40.000	v ona	. remage	0011110	to aproad	

ARAB STATES / ETATS ARABES	5
Egypt	5
Memphis and its Necropolis – the Pyramid Fields from Giza to Dahshur	5
	_
EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA / EUROPE ET AMÉRIQUE DU NORD	_
Armenia	6
Cathedral and Churches of Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots	
Monasteries of Haghpat and Sanahin	
Canada	10
L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site	
Czech Republic	11
Litomyši Castle	
France	12
Bourges Cathedral	
Chartres Cathedral	
Cistercian Abbey of Fontenay  Historic Centre of Avignon: Papal Palace, Episcopal Ensemble and Avignon Bridge	
Historic Site of LyonHistoric Site of Lyon	۱۵ 16
Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion	
Palace and Park of Fontainebleau	
Paris, Banks of the Seine	
Place Stanislas, Place de la Carrière and Place d'Alliance in Nancy	
Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France	
Ireland	23
Sceilg Mhichíl	23
Italy	25
Portovenere, Cinque Terre, and the Islands (Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto)	25
Portugal	28
Cultural Landscape of Sintra	28
Russian Federation	30
Citadel, Ancient City and Fortress Buildings of Derbent	
Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands	
Historic and Architectural Complex of the Kazan Kremlin	
White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal	
Sweden	37
Hanseatic Town of Visby	
Rock Carvings in Tanum	39
LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARRIBBEAN / AMÉRIQUE LATINE ET CARAÏBES	40
Dominica	40
Marna Traia Ditana National Dark	40

# ARAB STATES / ÉTATS ARABES

# Egypt

Memphis and its Necropolis – the Pyramid Fields from Giza to Dahshur

#### **Brief Synthesis**

Memphis is located in the center of the floodplain of the western side of the Nile. Its fame comes from its being the first Capital of Ancient Egypt. The unrivaled geographic location of Memphis, both commanding the entrance to the Delta while being at the confluence of important trade routes, means that there was no possible alternative capital for any ruler with serious ambition to govern both Upper and Lower Egypt. Traditionally believed to have been founded in 3000 BC as the capital of a politically unified Egypt, Memphis served as the effective administrative capital of the country during the Old Kingdom, then during at least part of the Middle and New Kingdoms (besides Itjtawy and Thebes), the Late Period and again in the Ptolemaic Period (along with the city of Alexandria), until it was eclipsed by the foundation of the Islamic garrison city of Fustat on the Nile and its later development, Al Qahira. As well as the home of kings, and the centre of state administration, Memphis was considered to be a site sacred to the gods.

The site contains many archaeological remains, reflecting what life was like in the ancient Egyptian city, which include temples, of which the most important is the Temple of Ptah in Mit Rahina. Ptah was the local god of Memphis, the god of creation and the patron of craftsmanship. Other major religious buildings included the sun temples in Abu Ghurab and Abusir, the temple of the god Apis in Memphis, the Serapeum and the Heb-Sed temple in Saqqara. Being the seat of royal power for over eight dynasties, the city also contained palaces and ruins survive of the palace of Apries overlooking the city. The palaces and temples were surrounded by craftsmen's workshops, dockyards and arsenals, as well as residential neighbourhoods, traces of which survive.

The Necropolis of Memphis, to the north and south of the capital, extends southwards from the Giza plateau, through Zawyet Elarian, Abu Ghurab, Abusir, Mit Rahina and Saqqara, and northwards as far as Dahshur. It contains the first complex monumental stone buildings in Egyptian history, as well as evidence of the development of the royal tombs from the early shape called "mastaba" until it reaches the pyramid shape. More than thirty-eight pyramids include the three pyramids of Giza, of which the Great Pyramid of Khufu is the only surviving wonder of the ancient world and one of the most important monuments in the history of humankind, the pyramids of Abusir, Saqqara and Dahshur and the Great Sphinx. Besides these monumental creations, there are more than nine thousand rock-cut tombs, from different historic periods, ranging from the First to the Thirtieth Dynasty, and extending to the Graeco-Roman Period.

The property also includes the remains of many smaller temples and settlements, which are invaluable for understanding ancient Egyptian life in this area.

**Criterion (i):** In Memphis was founded one of the most important monuments of the world, and the only surviving wonder of the ancient world, namely, the Great Pyramid of Giza. Its architectural design remains unparalleled and scientists continue to conduct research on how it was constructed. The Pyramid Complex of Saqqara is also a great masterpiece of architectural design, for it contains the first monumental stone building ever constructed and the first pyramid ever built (the Pyramid of Djoser, or the Step Pyramid). The great statue of Rameses II at Mit Rahina and the pyramids of Dahshur are also outstanding structures.

**Criterion (iii):** The ensemble of structures and associated archaeological remains at Memphis, including the archaic necropolis at Saqqara, dating back to formation of Pharaonic civilization, the limestone step pyramid of Djoser, the oldest pyramid to be constructed, the tombs and pyramids that reflect the development of funerary monuments, and the remains of the city, together form an exceptional testimony to the power and organization of the ancient capital of Egypt.

**Criterion (vi):** Memphis is associated with the religious beliefs related to the God of the Necropolis "Ptah" who was sanctified by the kings, as well as with outstanding ideas, artistic works and technologies of the capital of one of the most brilliant and long-standing civilizations of this planet.

#### Integrity

The Necropolis of Memphis contains within its boundaries all key attributes that convey the property's Outstanding Universal Value. The perfection of ancient building techniques has ensured the structural resistance of the main monuments to natural forces through time. They still display their beauty and convey their inestimable artistic and historic value, preserving all the main features that directly and tangibly associate them with the events, religious ideas and the development of methods of burial through different periods. The vicissitudes of history from 2200 BC until contemporary times have caused extensive damage that make them vulnerable in terms of surface details.

The extensive number of smaller monuments and underground remains in the five main archaeological sites, as well as the sensitivities of the whole Giza Plateau, mean that the scope and extent of the remains as an ensemble also has considerable vulnerabilities, as a result of development and infrastructure pressures.

#### **Authenticity**

The form and material of the main monuments of the property from pyramids, tombs and settlements characterize it as one of the most authentic among the known monuments of the ancient world. The property preserves almost 80% of its ancient form and material.

In terms of setting, the monuments and the site of the capital are vulnerable to development, as well as to the indirect impacts of urban growth, both of which have the potential to erode their context between the Nile River and the desert and their ability to convey their sacred, spiritual and other associations in a powerful way.

#### **Protection and management requirements**

A comprehensive system of statutory control operates under the provisions of the Protection of Antiquities Law No. 117 of 1983 as amended by the Law No. 3 of 2010, for the protection of monuments. It also established the rules for preserving archaeological sites.

Despite the efforts for protection and requirements to retain its World Heritage status, a comprehensive management plan for the overall property has not been formulated. The major challenge is that the property contains five major archaeological sites and the conservation, forward planning, visitor management and capacity development for each of these needs to be brought together in one Management Plan that sets out an overall governance structure. Such a plan is urgently needed.

The Ministry of Antiquities has conducted a number of conservation projects on the property. More recent initiatives in Saqqara and Dahshur (2012) are being carried out with the involvement of all major stakeholders as well as the local community in the management of the site. There are also ongoing projects for the development and rehabilitation of the Giza Plateau in collaboration with all government bodies in Egypt (Giza Plateau Master Plan). The interventions in some of the most significant structures have been made in accordance with the international principles of restoration, with respect to the legibility of the edifices and to the principle of reversibility. The Sanctuary's location and setting has been almost entirely preserved, so that visitors are still able to experience the spiritual character of the archaeological site.

There is currently no buffer zone although work is ongoing by the Ministry of Antiquities to delineate one and ensure its protection in response to development pressures. This needs to be submitted to the World Heritage Committee.

# EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA / EUROPE ET AMÉRIQUE DU NORD

#### **Armenia**

Cathedral and Churches of Echmiatsin and the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots

# **Brief synthesis**

The city of Echmiatsin is located in the Armavir Marz region of Armenia. The settlement has existed since ancient times, as evidenced by Stone, Bronze, and Iron Age archaeological sites located in and near the city. The oldest written information about Echmiatsin refers to the period of the Urartian King Rusa II (685-645 BC). The settlement was mentioned in the Urartian cuneiform inscription by the name of Kuarlini. Life in this Armenian settlement has continued uninterrupted. The town has been called, successively, Artimed, during the rule of Yervandunis (as evidenced by Armenian historian Movses Khorenatsi (5th century AD)), Vardgesavan, and afterwards Vagharshapat, during the age of development under the rule of King Vagharsh I Arshakuni (AD 117-140). The name Echmiatsin was used along with that of Vagharshapat after the adoption of Christianity (AD 301).

The inscribed property is divided into three separate areas: the first area includes the Mother Cathedral of Echmiatsin and St Gayane Church. The area is about 30.2 ha. 18.8 ha belongs to the Mother See of Echmiatsin (the Mother Cathedral and surrounding constructions covering 16.4 ha, the St Gayane Church and surrounding buildings covering 2.0 ha, and the cemetery of the congregation covering 0.4 ha) and 11.4 ha belongs to the community of Echmiatsin City. The second area includes St Hripsime Church and St Shoghakat Church. This area is about 25.3 ha, with 6.2 ha being the territory of St Hripsimeh Church, belonging to the Mother See. The remaining 19.2 ha belongs to the community of Echmiatsin City.

The third area consists of the archaeological site of Zvartnots, with the ruins of the temple, Catholicos Palace and other constructions, and occupies about 18.8 ha.

The first and the second areas together are surrounded with one common buffer zone of approximately 93 ha. The buffer zone of the third area is 24 ha.

The religious buildings of Echmiatsin and the archaeological remains at Zvartnots bear witness to the implantation of Christianity in Armenia and to the evolution of a unique Armenian ecclesiastical architecture, which exerted a profound influence on architectural and artistic development in the region. They graphically illustrate the evolution and flowering of the Armenian central-domed cross-hall type of church.

The earliest domed church is the Cathedral of Echmiatsin, which was built in AD 301-303 by King Trdat III (Tiridates) and St Gregory the Illuminator. Its cruciform plan with four apses and a central dome carried on four pillars is the outstanding contribution of Armenian ecclesiastical architecture to Christian architecture as a whole. This inventive discovery of Armenian architects spread beyond the country to Byzantium, and then to Central and Western Europe. Apart from its architectural qualities, the cathedral is distinguished from other Armenian churches by its original paintings of interior frescoes. From 1712 to 1721 Naghash Hovnatan worked there (the paintings on the upper part of the dome and the Holy Mother of God painted on the internal marble of the main apse are preserved). Hakob and Harutyun Hovnatanyans (first half of the 18th century) and Hovnatan Hovnatanyan (second half of the 18th century) have periodically created paintings for the Echmiatsin Cathedral. Mkrtum and Hakob Hovnatanyans also made paintings for the cathedral in the 19th century.

St Gayane Church (AD 630) is the earliest example in Early Christian and Armenian architecture to combine a three-aisle basilica with a central dome, a form which became widespread in both Armenia and Western Asia. It is a four-column domed basilica with harmonious proportions, a central nave and two sacristies built of well-processed tuff (a stone of volcanic origin). It is considered to be the best example of this type of church. The vaulted sepulcher of St Gayane the Virgin is located under the main apse, which is entered from the southeastern sacristy. The roof and walls of the church were renovated in 1652. A narthex-hall with three bays was built along the western façade of the church in 1683 with chapels at its north and south ends, dedicated to the Apostles Peter and Paul. The narthex-hall also served as a burial place for the Catholicoses.

The rampart of the monastery was added later. From 1866 to 1882, Abbot Vahan Bastamyan renovated the monastery, its arched gate, residential buildings for abbot and congregants, and school, and established a printing house.

Different types of central-domed churches developed in the Early Middle Ages and became widespread in Armenia during the 7th century. Among these, St Hripsime Church is the perfect example of the four-apse church with intermediate niches and corner rooms (AD 618). In the 1970s, archaeological excavations were conducted in the adjacent areas of the church, discovering pre-Christian and early-Christian burials and a one-nave church. Due to the brilliant combination of its construction system to maintain seismic stability, its decoration and its architectural style, St Hripsime Church has crystal lucidity. The structural system is the main expression of its artistic appearance.

- St Shoghakat Church was built in 1694 on the place of the 4th-century chapel where the "ray of light was dropped" upon Christian Hripsime's martyrs. The present-day church was built of brown well-processed tuff and is distinguished by its unique architecture.
- St. Mariam Astvatsatsin Church was built in 1767 during the rule of Simeon Yerevantsi Catholicos. It is a three-aisled and span-roof basilica with three pairs of pilasters.

The initiative to develop new central domed and cross-shaped plans for churches resulted in Zvartnots Church which was built in the middle of the 7th century. It is considered to be a masterpiece, where the four-apse interior is contained within a three-storey circular structure with a polyhedral exterior. It was ruined in the 10th century, probably by an earthquake.

According to the proposed reconstruction (based on an 11th-century stone model of Gagkashen Church found during the excavations in Ani), the height of the church was about 45 m, which is unusually high for 7th-century construction techniques. Zvartnots has rich bas-reliefs. The bas-reliefs and high-reliefs that illustrate fragments from ecclesiastical and secular life are implemented very skillfully. These decorative elements were widespread in Armenian architecture from the second half of the 7th century. Zvartnots church is truly the apogee of all the achievements of Armenian architecture's Golden Age (Early Middle Ages) in the spheres of construction, sculptural and decorative arts.

**Criterion (ii):** The developments in ecclesiastical architecture represented in an outstanding manner by the churches at Echmiatsin and the archaeological site of Zvartnots had a profound influence on church design over a wide region.

**Criterion (iii):** The churches at Echmiatsin and the archaeological site of Zvartnots vividly depict both the spirituality and the innovatory artistic achievement of the Armenian Church from its foundation.

#### Integrity

The churches within the property clearly bear witness to the implantation of Christianity in Armenia and to the evolution of a unique Armenian ecclesiastical architecture. The property contains sufficient structures to demonstrate the developments of ecclesiastical architecture. All these buildings, as well as the landscape, are sufficiently intact and have not been changed since the time of their inscription on the World Heritage List.

The main threats to the integrity of the site are its location in an active seismic zone, pollution of the surrounding environment, and the pressures of being on an active tourism route.

#### Authenticity

The authenticity of the ecclesiastical monuments is reasonable, given that they have been in religious use for many centuries, have been subject to changes in liturgy and fashion over that period, and have undergone periodic restoration. The archaeological site is fully authentic, since it consists solely of excavated remains of 31

vanished structures. However, some of the past restoration work is not fully in conformity with the principles of the Venice Charter.

#### Protection and management requirements

Only the Archaeological Site of Zvartnots is under State ownership and is situated on the territory of the Zvartnots historical and cultural museum-reservation, while the rest of the monuments are the property of the Armenian Apostolic Holy Church as well as being protected by the Law "On protection and usage of the historical and cultural immovable monuments and historical environment" of the Republic of Armenia, and by the regulation "On State registration, study, protection, fortification, restoration, reconstruction and usage of the historical and cultural immovable monuments". Additional articles exist in the Civil, Administrative, Land, and Criminal Codes of the Republic of Armenia for the protection of the monuments.

The Ministry of Culture of Armenia with its specialized unit as the authorized state body and the Armenian Apostolic Holy Church with its specialized units and dioceses as owner, as well as non-governmental, nature protection units and people interested in Armenian heritage conservation, are engaged in the protection of the monastery complex. A consistent policy is carried out in order to present comprehensively the monuments included in the nomination. The permanent exhibitions of the museums at the Mother See and Zvartnots are updated over the course of time.

Issues concerning conservation, rehabilitation and use of the sites inscribed on the World Heritage List are discussed at the specialized councils formed by the Ministry of Culture of Armenia (methodological, architectural councils) and the Mother See of Holy Echmiatsin, where the representatives and professionals of both sides are equally represented. To meet the challenges facing the property over time within the boundaries of the site and in its main buildings, scientific research, renovation, reinforcement, design and preventive measures have been undertaken in order to ensure its authenticity. The lead was removed from the dome of the cathedral in 2000 and replaced by stone slabs.

The budget of the property is formed of the allocations from the State budget, entrepreneur activity, and private donations.

# Monasteries of Haghpat and Sanahin

## **Brief synthesis**

The two monastic complexes of Haghpat and Sanahin are a serial property situated in the Lori Marz (region) of Armenia. Dating to the 10th to 13th centuries, the functional role, location and stylistic characteristics were taken into consideration during the construction of each new building. As a result, an asymmetrical but volumetrically balanced, harmonious and integrated complex was built, one which is in harmony with the picturesque landscape. The two monasteries represent the highest flowering of Armenian religious architecture between the 10th and 13th centuries. This unique style developed from a blending of elements of Byzantine ecclesiastical architecture and the traditional vernacular architecture of the Caucasus.

The monastery of Haghpat, founded by Queen Khosrovanush (wife of the Armenian King Ashot III the Merciful) in AD 976, consists of one narthex, two corridor-sepulchers, a refectory, a scriptorium, the Chapel of Hamazasp, a belfry, several chapel-tombs and cross-stones (*khachkars*), all surrounded by a towered rampart. The approaches to it were observed from the Kayanberd Fortress, which was built in the 13th century especially for that purpose.

St Nshan Church is the oldest monument in the complex and was built between AD 976 and 991 (architect Trdat). The church is a rectangular domed construction, slightly elongated from east to west, with an internal cross-shaped plan. The central dome rests on four massive pillars in the side walls. Distinguished by its integrated interior and vast dominating dome, the church is a complete and brilliant example of new stylistic trend of Armenian architecture in the 10th and 11th centuries. The earliest layer of the frescos in the main apse has survived, with its main composition of Jesus enthroned. Scenes of the annunciation, birth and baptism were painted on the lower part.

The bas-reliefs of the kings Smbat and Gourgen, standing in front of each other and holding a model of the church and located on the upper part of the eastern façade, are brilliant examples of sculpture.

The church is abutted to the west by the narthex, with an interesting internal composition, added in the second decade of the 13th century by the Princess Mariam. The narthex is an exceptional example of Armenian medieval architecture. The crossing arches supported by two columns carry the roof-vault, illuminating the interior of the building.

Built in AD 1257, to the north of the main church, Abbot Hamazasp's building has a square plan and a vaulted roof supported by four central columns, with a hole in the roof to allow smoke to escape and light to enter. It is the largest example of this building type in the complex. A small vaulted church adjoins the narthex on the east, while the scriptorium (11th century AD) is attached to the southern part of the eastern wall and was fundamentally reconstructed in the 13th century.

The space between St Nshan Church, Abbot Hamazasp's building and the scriptorium was vaulted over when it was transformed into a burial vault in the 13th century. It is continued by a second corridor-shaped sepulcher along the eastern side of the church.

The belfry, built in AD 1245 in the eastern part of the complex, is the earliest example of such constructions and is singled out by its unprecedented volumetric-spatial solutions with its cross-shaped ground-floor plan supporting an octahedral second floor, surmounted by a seven-columned bell-tower.

The refectory (13th century) has its own exceptional place amongst Armenian medieval secular constructions – the rectangular space is divided into two identical halls, with a system of intersecting arches and octagonal roof for illumination and evacuating smoke.

Numerous monuments of memorial and monumental art are preserved in the monastery. The Amenaprkich (Redeemer) *khachkar* (cross-stone) (AD 1273) is located at the northern entrance of St Nshan Church.

Sanahin used to be the administrative centre and family burial place of the Kyurikyan Bagratids (10th and 11th centuries), as well as the Episcopal residence for the diocese (until the 11th century).

The Sanahin monastery contains St Astvatsatsin (Holy Mother of God), St Amenaprkich (Redeemer) and St Grigor Churches, narthexes, fore-church, scriptorium, belfry and academy. St Astvatsatsin Church (AD 928-944) is a central-domed, cross-shaped example of Armenian medieval classical architecture that reached to its perfection in the main building of the complex – St Amenaprkich Church. It was built between AD 957 and 966 under the patronage of Queen Khosrovanush (wife of King Ashot III the Merciful). The focus of the interior is on the central nucleus and the harmony between its square base and round dome. The main apse is surrounded by four two-storey sacristies. The church is approached through a narthex, built in AD 1181 in a cross-in-square plan with the roof supported by four columns (the earliest known example of this plan). The ornamentation of the capitals of the columns with symbolic sculptures in the shape of animal heads adds distinctive expression to this narthex.

The narthex of St Astvatsatsin Church (built in AD 1211) is unique in its plan of a three-nave rectangular hall.

The scriptorium (also called relic house) is located on the northeastern side of the group of buildings. It was built in AD 1063; it is square in plan and vaulted, with niches in which codices and books were stored.

St Grigor Church dates to AD 1061. Its façades are notable for their smooth decorative arcatures and triangular niches.

The belfry (one of the oldest in Armenia) was built between AD 1211 and 1235 next to the forechurch from the northern wall. The three-storey construction is crowned with columns and a rotunda. Its roof is supported by two pairs of intersecting arches. Its western façade is distinguished by its decorative ornamentation.

St Harutyun Church (first quarter of the 13th century) and the ruins of St Hakob Church (second half of the 10th century) lie outside the monastery's boundaries. There are two springs in Sanahin: the first one is located in the former centre of the village (with a well-house from the end of the 12th century – beginning of the 13th century, in the form of a vaulted hall with a double-arched opening), and the second one is adjacent to the northern defensive wall with a well-house built in 1831, with one arched opening.

More than 50 *khachkars* (cross-stones) are preserved in Sanahin, amongst which the most valuable are the *khachkars* of Grigor Tuteordi (on the northern wall of St Harutyun Church, by Mkhitar Kazmich) and Sargis (on the western wall of St Astvatsatsin Church). These *khachkars* are considered among the best examples of medieval Armenian sculpture.

St Karapet Church (end of the 10th century – beginning of the 11th century) stands on the eastern part of the complex, while the chapel of Sargis (end of the 10th century – beginning of the 11th century) stands on the western side (on a hill) of Sanahin. Also part of the inscribed property is the monumental single-span stone bridge across the Debet gorge, a bridge that has been preserved in its original form from the 13th century.

**Criterion (ii):** The monasteries of Sanahin and Haghpat are unique by virtue of their blending of elements of both Byzantine church architecture and traditional vernacular building styles of this region.

**Criterion (iv):** The monasteries of Sanahin and Haghpat are outstanding examples of the ecclesiastical architecture that developed in Armenia from the 10th to the 13th century.

#### Integrity

The property contains the whole of each of the two monasteries which are its constituent parts. Its buildings and other attributes are sufficiently intact to convey its Outstanding Universal Value.

Its location in an active seismic and industrial zone, the pollution of the surrounding environment, as well as being on an active tourism route, are the main threats to the integrity of the site.

#### Authenticity

The constructions included in this property, as well as its landscape, have not been modified since inscription on the World Heritage List. Their authenticity has not been threatened in spite of damage and restorations carried out over time.

The monasteries illustrate, in their structure and current state, the organic growth of monastic establishments over many centuries, with successive additions and reconstructions necessitated by destruction and deterioration.

#### Protection and management requirements

The property is under the ownership of Armenian Apostolic Holy Church as well as being protected by the Law "On protection and usage of the historical and cultural immovable monuments and historical environment" of the Republic of Armenia, and by the regulation "On State registration, study, protection, fortification, restoration, reconstruction and usage of the historical and cultural immovable monuments". Additional articles exist in the Civil, Administrative, Land, and Criminal Codes of the Republic of Armenia for the protection of the monuments.

The Ministry of Culture of Armenia, with its specialized units as authorized republican bodies, and the Armenian Apostolic Holy Church with its specialized units and diocese as owner, as well as non-governmental, nature protection units and people interested in Armenian heritage conservation, are engaged in the protection of monastery complex.

The issues concerning conservation, rehabilitation and use of the sites are discussed at the specialized councils formed by the Ministry of Culture of Armenia (methodological, architectural councils) and Mother See of Holy Echmiatsin, where the representatives of both sides are equally represented.

The Government of the Republic of Armenia enforces a consistent policy to study comprehensively the technical condition of the component parts of the property. The Agency for the Protection of the Historical and Cultural Monuments of the Republic of Armenia is responsible for the maintenance and protection of the buffer zone on behalf of the national government. The budget of the property is formed of the allocations from the State budget, entrepreneur activities and private donations.

To meet threats such as seismic activity, industrial pollution, development outside the property, the pressures of tourism, and decay, over time scientific-research, renovation, fortification, design and preventive measures have been undertaken in order to maintain the authenticity. In 2012, the rehabilitation process of Sanahin monastery was launched and preparatory measures initiated in order to meet the necessary requirements.

#### Canada

L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site

#### **Brief synthesis**

L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site contains the excavated remains of a complete 11th-century Viking settlement, the earliest evidence of Europeans in North America. Situated at the tip of the Great Northern Peninsula of the island of Newfoundland, this exceptional archaeological site consists of eight timber-framed turf structures built in the same style as those found in Norse Greenland and Iceland from the same period. The buildings include three dwellings, one forge and four workshops, on a narrow terrace overlooking a peat bog and small brook near the shore of Epaves Bay in the Straight of Belle Isle.

Artifacts found at the site show evidence of activities including iron production and woodworking, likely used for ship repair, as well as indications that those who used the camp voyaged further south. The remnants correspond with the stories told in the Vinland Sagas, which document the voyages of Leif Erikson and other Norse explorers who ventured westward across the Atlantic Ocean from Iceland and Greenland to find and explore new territory, a significant achievement in the history of human migration and discovery.

**Criterion (vi):** L'Anse aux Meadows is the first and only known site established by Vikings in North America and the earliest evidence of European settlement in the New World. As such, it is a unique milestone in the history of human migration and discovery.

### Integrity

Measuring 8056 ha, L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site is of sufficient size to ensure that the property is protected, remains intact, and takes in the full extent of the known Norse remains in the region. Its boundaries extend far beyond the areas that contain Norse archaeological remains, thus providing ample protection of the complete representation of the features and processes that convey the property's Outstanding Universal Value.

L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site is in stable condition. The archaeological site has been reburied in such a way as to protect the remnants from deterioration. There are no known or anticipated threats to the property, it is not at risk of degradation and does not suffer from adverse effects of development or neglect, the totality being managed as a National Historic Site by Parks Canada Agency.

#### Authenticity

L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site is authentic in location and setting, forms and designs, and materials and substances. Ample archival evidence shows the property to correspond with the journeys described in the Norse sagas.

Extensive archaeological research after the site's discovery in 1960 revealed that the timber-framed structures were constructed with a particular type of gabled roof and covered with turf taken from the surrounding peat bog. The layout of the rooms, fireplaces and openings followed the characteristics of Norse design. Excavation uncovered evidence of iron production at the site, as well as approximately 800 wooden, bronze, bone, and stone artefacts that confirm the Norse origins of the property and provide important information on the work and lifestyle of the site's occupants.

### Protection and management requirements

L'Anse aux Meadows was established as a National Historic Site in 1975 under a Federal-Provincial agreement between Canada and the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador. The property is legally protected under the *Parks Canada Agency Act* (1998) and the *Canada National Parks Act* (2000), and the site has a management plan in place, which is reviewed and renewed at regular intervals. The management plan requires that the resources directly related to the reasons for designation as a national historic site are not impaired or under threat; that the reasons for designation are effectively communicated to the public; and that heritage values, including Outstanding Universal Value, are respected in all decisions and actions affecting the property.

The agreement that established L'Anse aux Meadows National Historic Site states that the Government of Canada and the Government of the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador shall consult together to ensure that the future development of the communities and areas adjacent to the property is planned jointly and is in keeping with their proximity to this internationally significant property.

Parks Canada manages visitation and conservation at the site, and the artefact collection associated with the Viking base camp is stable and is displayed and/or stored under appropriate conditions. Special attention shall be given over the long term to monitoring for issues that could impact the state of conservation in the future and taking appropriate actions to protect the site.

# **Czech Republic**

## Litomyšl Castle

#### **Brief Synthesis**

The Litomyšl Castle is an outstanding example of an arcaded Renaissance country residence, a type of structure first invented in Italy and then developed in the Czech Lands to create a mature form with special architectural value. Situated at an important communications junction on the main route between Bohemia and Moravia, in the Pardubice region, Litomyšl was a fortified centre on the hill where the castle now stands.

The work on the Renaissance building began in 1568 under the supervision of Jan Baptista Avostalis (Giovanni Battista Avostalli), who was soon joined by his brother Oldřich (Ulrico). Most of the work had been completed by 1580. The castle interior underwent alterations between 1792 and 1796, based on the designs of Jan Kryštof Habich, but he was careful to preserve the fine building's Renaissance appearance with impressive gables.

The castle is a four-winged, three-storeyed structure with an asymmetrical disposition. The western wing is the largest, whereas the southern wing is a two-storeyed arcaded gallery, closing the second square courtyard (a feature that is unique to Litomyšl). The groin-vaulted arcading continues around the western and eastern sides of the courtyard. The south-eastern corner of the eastern wing contains the castle chapel. One of the most striking features in the interior of the castle consists in the fine neoclassical theatre from 1796-97 in the western wing. The original painted decoration of the auditorium, stage decorations and stage machinery have survived intact. The house has richly decorated interiors, basically Renaissance in form and with lavish late Baroque or neoclassical ornamentation in the form of elaborate plasterwork and wall and ceiling paintings.

The buildings associated with the castle were all built or rebuilt during the course of the modifications that the castle itself underwent over time, and this is reflected in their architectural styles. Among the ancillary buildings, the most interesting is the Brewery, the birthplace of Bedřich Smetana, one of the greatest Czech composers of all time. It lies to the south of the first courtyard. Originally constructed to complement the castle, with Renaissance *sgraffito* decoration, it was remodelled by the well-known architect František Maximilián Kaňka after the 1728 fire and received what is its present appearance. The ensemble also includes the former French formal garden with its *saletta* (pavilion) in the Baroque style and an 18th-century English-style park.

**Criterion (ii):** Litomyšl Castle is an outstanding and immaculately preserved example of the arcaded castle, a type of building first developed in Italy and modified in the Czech Lands to create an evolved form of special architectural quality.

**Criterion (iv):** Litomyšl Castle illustrates in an exceptional way the aristocratic residences of central Europe in the Renaissance and their subsequent development under the influence of new artistic movements.

#### Integrity

All the key elements which the outstanding universal value of the property is based upon, e.g. the former aristocratic residence, the garden, the entrance courtyard and the outbuildings, are located within its boundaries.

Its delimitation and size are appropriate. None of the physical attributes of the property are under threat. The castle has retained all of its original features (the integrity of the ensemble and the ground plan of the main building), its high artistic quality (the formal logic of the three-storeyed arcaded galleries, the scenic *sgraffiti*, the "Late Baroque Classical" interior decoration) and the relation of the ensemble to its urban setting. The vistas have also been preserved. The buffer zone is delimited; it consists of a declared urban heritage reservation and its protective zone, which both have stabilized urban structures.

#### Authenticity

The authenticity of the property is high. The individual components remain physically integrated with one another in their original state, whilst the complex retains its spatial relationship with its historic urban setting. The successive modifications and conservation works that have taken place over several hundred years have been respected. No attempt has been made to select a particular period to display, but instead the organic evolution is presented in its entirety. The current form and appearance, including the floors with open Renaissance arcades in the courtyard and *sgraffito* decorations on the facades and on the gables, are defined by the original design. Restoration works have been performed using the materials and historical techniques that complied with international standards for heritage conservation.

#### Protection and management requirements

The property is protected under Act No. 20/1987 Coll. on State Heritage Preservation as amended as a designated national cultural heritage site. It thus enjoys the highest degree of legal protection. The buffer zone of the property consists of the historic centre of the town, which is designated as an urban heritage reservation and has a protective zone itself. On the territory of the property and of its buffer zone, no change in the urban area is planned.

Sustainable use of ancillary buildings is the main goal of the completed Castle Hill Revitalization project, which also includes some contemporary, however reversible, architectural interventions within the property. Key long-term issues of the main castle building (inadequate use or incipient deterioration of particular parts) are being addressed by newly drafted project reflecting also Castle Hill Revitalization experience.

The responsibility for the property management is shared by the state through National Heritage Institute and the City of Litomyšl, which are responsible for the maintenance, protection and promotion of the property. The management plan of the property is under preparation. Financial instruments for the conservation of the property include grant schemes and funding through the programme of the Ministry of Culture of the Czech Republic allocated to the maintenance and conservation of the immovable cultural heritage, as well as financial resources allocated from other public budgets. Maintenance of the property is carried out in accordance with a planned schedule.

Since 2000, annual monitoring reports have been prepared at the national level to serve the World Heritage site manager, the Ministry of Culture, the National Heritage Institute and other agencies involved.

#### **France**

# **Bourges Cathedral**

## Brève synthèse

Située en région Centre-Val-de-Loire, Bourges, ancienne ville romaine d'Avaricum, fut une des premières communautés chrétiennes de Gaule. La cathédrale, dédiée au premier martyr chrétien saint Étienne occupe le site d'un lieu de culte depuis le IIIe siècle. Construite entre la fin du XIIe et la fin du XIIIe siècle, admirable par ses proportions et l'unité de sa conception, c'est l'un des grands chefs-d'œuvre de l'art gothique. Son tympan, ses sculptures et ses vitraux sont particulièrement remarquables. Par-delà sa beauté architecturale, elle témoigne de la puissance du christianisme dans la France médiévale.

Le plan de la cathédrale est simple et harmonieux. Il s'agit d'une basilique à cinq nefs avec des chapelles qui entourent le chœur. Des arcs-boutants à double volée permettent l'absence de tribunes et une lumière égale dans toute la nef y compris les collatéraux.

Les caractéristiques les plus remarquables de la cathédrale sont la perspective des murs latéraux et l'unité de l'espace intérieur. Les sculptures aux portes nord et sud, au tympan du portail du Jugement dernier (au centre de la façade ouest), comme les restes sculptés du jubé, constituent des exemples exceptionnels de l'art gothique. Les siècles suivants ont apporté leurs marques à la cathédrale : les vitraux constituent ainsi une véritable encyclopédie de cet art pour les XIVe, XVe et XVIe siècles.

**Critère (i) :** La cathédrale de Bourges revêt une très grande importance dans le développement de l'architecture gothique et constitue un symbole de la puissance de la religion chrétienne dans la France du Moyen Âge. Cependant, de ses qualités fondamentales restent sa beauté frappante résultant d'une gestion magistrale d'un espace aux proportions harmonieuses et d'une décoration de la plus haute qualité.

**Critère (iv):** Bien que la cathédrale de Bourges se situe en marge du gothique français représenté par Saint-Denis, Paris, Chartres ou Amiens, elle porte très haut les valeurs architecturales des cathédrales de ce style. Par l'unité de sa conception, la savante articulation de ses espaces et le traitement de la lumière, elle représente une expression exceptionnelle de ce style appliqué à ce type d'édifice.

#### Intégrité

La conception de la cathédrale de Bourges a été respectée et n'a pas été altérée au cours des siècles. Elle conserve l'intégrité de son plan et de sa conception et tous ses attributs ont été préservés intacts. Situé dans un environnement urbain protégé, le bien n'a subi aucune menace.

#### Authenticité

La forme et les matériaux de l'édifice sont tels qu'ils étaient lorsqu'il fut achevé à la fin du XIIIe siècle, bien que son entretien et l'évolution du culte aient nécessité le remplacement de nombreux éléments comme cela est advenu pour toutes les cathédrales gothiques. Tous les travaux de restauration ont respecté les techniques et matériaux de construction originaux.

# Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Propriété de l'État, partiellement gérée par le Centre des Monuments nationaux, la cathédrale de Bourges est classée au titre des monuments historiques depuis 1862. Elle bénéficie à ce titre des moyens de conservation définis et mis en œuvre directement par le ministère de la Culture et de la communication.

Légalement affectée au culte catholique, la cathédrale ne peut être détournée de cet usage. La crypte et la terrasse de la tour nord accueillent chaque année environ 30 000 visiteurs.

La zone tampon du bien adoptée en 2013 est constituée de deux protections réglementaires : d'une part, la protection de ses abords au titre de son classement aux monuments historiques, d'autre part, le site patrimonial remarquable correspondant à l'emprise de la ville médiévale, dont le plan de sauvegarde et de mise en valeur a été approuvé en 1994. Les marais situés au nord-est de l'édifice, fruit du travail des religieux pour assainir et cultiver ce vaste territoire, ont été classés au titre des sites.

#### Chartres Cathedral

#### Brève synthèse

La cathédrale Notre-Dame de Chartres, située en région Centre-Val-de-Loire, est l'une des œuvres les plus authentiques et les plus achevées de l'architecture religieuse du début du XIIIe siècle. Elle fut le but d'un pèlerinage dédié à la Vierge, parmi les plus populaires de tout l'Occident médiéval. Par l'unité de son architecture et de sa décoration, fruit des recherches du premier âge gothique, par son influence considérable sur l'art du Moyen Âge chrétien, la cathédrale de Chartres apparaît comme un jalon essentiel de l'histoire de l'architecture médiévale. Le remarquable ensemble de vitraux, la statuaire monumentale des XIIe et XIIIe siècles et le décor peint miraculeusement préservé des ravages des hommes et du temps font de Chartres l'un des exemples les plus admirables et les mieux conservés de l'art gothique.

La façade ouest élevée vers le milieu du XIIe siècle, avec ses trois portes aux ébrasements garnis de statuescolonnes (Portail Royal), ses deux tours, sa flèche méridionale et ses trois grandes verrières aux vitraux inestimables, constitue un exemple authentique et complet qui nous reste de cet art créé à Saint-Denis, et qui marqua l'avènement d'une expression plastique originale, connue sous le nom de style gothique.

Un peu plus tard, la nef et le chœur, reconstruits à partir de 1194, réalisaient pour la première fois une formule architecturale qui devait être largement utilisée tout au long du XIIIe siècle.

La sculpture monumentale de la cathédrale de Chartres vaut à la fois par son abondance et par sa qualité : les grands ensembles, reliefs et statues, du Portail Royal à l'entrée de la nef, des six portes et des deux porches construits à partir de 1210 aux entrées nord et sud du transept, offrent un panorama complet de la sculpture gothique depuis le moment où elle se dégage des traditions romanes jusqu'à celui où elle parvient à cet équilibre subtil d'idéalisme et de réalisme qui caractérise le style à son apogée. Dans cette cathédrale, siège d'une école renommée, la maîtrise technique et artistique était au service d'une haute science iconographique.

Enfin, la cathédrale de Chartres a conservé, dans sa presque totalité, son décor homogène de vitraux exécutés entre 1210 et 1250 environ. Il faut y ajouter les trois verrières du XIIe siècle au-dessus du Portail Royal et les grandes roses du XIIIe siècle aux trois façades : à l'ouest, le Jugement Dernier ; au nord, la Glorification de la Vierge ; au sud, la Glorification du Christ.

**Critère (i) :** Construite assez rapidement et presque d'un seul jet, la cathédrale de Chartres constitue, par l'unité de son architecture et de son décor vitré, sculpté et peint, l'expression totale et achevée d'un des aspects les plus caractéristiques de l'art du Moyen Âge.

Critère (ii): La cathédrale de Chartres a exercé une influence considérable sur le développement de l'art gothique en France et hors de France. Les architectes des cathédrales de Reims, d'Amiens et de Beauvais n'ont fait qu'enrichir le schéma fondamental de Chartres, qui a été imité jusqu'à Cologne en Allemagne, à Westminster

en Angleterre et à León en Espagne. Dans le domaine du vitrail, l'atelier de Chartres a rayonné largement jusqu'à Bourges, Sens, Le Mans, Tours, Poitiers, Rouen, Canterbury, par essaimage ou diffusion des œuvres.

Critère (iv): La cathédrale de Chartres est à la fois un symbole et un édifice-type. C'est l'exemple le plus éclairant que l'on puisse choisir pour élucider la réalité culturelle, sociale et esthétique de la cathédrale gothique.

#### Intégrité

La cathédrale de Chartres a été considérée comme un modèle dès l'époque de sa construction, en raison de la nouveauté et de la perfection des partis techniques et esthétiques qui y furent adoptés. Tous les éléments qui en ont fait une référence architecturale, en particulier sa nef et son chœur, demeurent intacts.

Le décor sculpté (portails et éléments du jubé) offre un panorama complet du style gothique. La cathédrale a également conservé de remarquables vitraux du milieu du XIIe siècle ainsi que la presque totalité de son décor homogène de verrières qui constitue le plus grand ensemble de vitraux de la première moitié du XIIIe siècle. Enfin, les restaurations intérieures ont révélé le décor peint du XIIIe siècle, constitué d'un faux appareil de pierre presque intégralement conservé.

Des adjonctions tardives de la fin de l'époque gothique (chapelle Vendôme, flèche nord-ouest, pavillon de l'horloge), de la Renaissance (clôture du chœur), de l'époque classique (aménagement du chœur de Victor Louis), de l'époque industrielle (charpente métallique d'Émile Martin) et contemporaine (création de vitraux) n'ont pas altéré la pureté de l'ensemble.

La cathédrale de Chartres occupe une position remarquable dans la plaine de la Beauce. Sa silhouette, observable à plus de 25 km aux alentours, constitue un signal particulièrement marquant dans le paysage. Véritable point de convergence affirmant de manière emblématique la relation exceptionnelle qu'entretient l'œuvre architecturale avec le site qui l'entoure, cette perception de la cathédrale « entre ciel et terre » a été évoquée par de nombreux artistes et écrivains illustres.

#### Authenticité

La cathédrale de Chartres présente une authenticité exceptionnelle, tant par sa structure que par son décor. En particulier, les portails et leur décoration sculptée sont peu altérés, et l'ensemble exceptionnel de vitraux du XIIIe siècle, qui fait l'objet de mesures constantes de conservation, nous est parvenu dans un état remarquable. Les seules altérations importantes subies par l'édifice sont la démolition du jubé au XVIIe siècle et l'incendie de la toiture en 1836. Une charpente métallique, élevée en 1837 pour la remplacer, est un élément remarquable du XIXe siècle qui participe pleinement des valeurs de l'édifice.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Propriété de l'État, la cathédrale de Chartres est classée en totalité au titre des monuments historiques depuis 1862. Elle bénéficie, à ce titre, des mesures de conservation financées et directement mis en œuvre par le ministère de la Culture et de la Communication. Elle est incluse dans le site patrimonial remarquable de la ville de Chartres, dont le plan de sauvegarde et de mise en valeur est en vigueur. Légalement affectée au culte catholique, elle ne peut être détournée de cet usage.

La gestion du bien est assurée par l'État, les autorités religieuses, le Centre des monuments nationaux et la ville de Chartres. La coordination efficace entre tous ces acteurs permet notamment que la fréquentation touristique importante dans cet environnement urbain dense ne porte pas atteinte à l'intégrité et à l'authenticité du bien. Toutefois, la relation entre la cathédrale et son cadre paysager est maintenant rendue vulnérable face aux pressions de l'aménagement.

Une fois mis en place, le plan de gestion prendra soin d'inscrire la dimension paysagère de la cathédrale dans les outils de planification territoriale.

# Cistercian Abbey of Fontenay

# Brève synthèse

Située en région Bourgogne Franche-Comté dans le département de la Côte-d'or sur la commune de Marmagne, l'abbaye cistercienne de Fontenay a été fondée en 1119 par saint Bernard dans un vallon marécageux de Bourgogne. Avec son architecture dépouillée, son église, son cloître, son réfectoire, son dortoir, sa boulangerie et sa forge, elle illustre l'idéal d'autarcie des premières communautés de moines cisterciens.

L'abbaye de Fontenay, bâtie entre 1139 et 1147 par l'abbé Guillaume, grâce aux libéralités d'Ebrard, évêque de Norwich, a été consacrée par le pape Eugène III, un cistercien ancien disciple de saint Bernard. Ce modèle d'église cistercienne romane est d'une grande simplicité et d'un extrême dépouillement, avec son plan basilical en croix latine, sa nef aux murs aveugles, et son transept que ne surmonte aucune tour. La perfection des proportions, la rigueur des percements, la science du voûtement, la beauté de l'appareil où voisinent d'impeccables assises de pierre de taille et un rude moellonnage font tout le prix de cette architecture.

Le cloître et la salle capitulaire sont restés intacts et s'inspirent des mêmes principes. L'abbaye conserve encore dans son enceinte d'autres bâtiments communautaires : salle et dortoir des moines, chauffoir, réfectoire,

infirmerie, hôtellerie, boulangerie, et forge. Ce dernier bâtiment, datable de la fin du XIIe siècle, rappelle la part prise par les Cisterciens aux progrès technologiques du Moyen Âge et est l'un des plus anciens bâtiments industriels de France.

Critère (iv): L'architecture dépouillée des moines cisterciens représente la forme achevée d'un idéal moral et esthétique qui affleure à diverses reprises dans l'histoire des communautés religieuses chrétiennes d'Occident. En ce sens, l'abbaye cistercienne de Fontenay, centre d'exploitation agricole et industrielle, lieu de travail et de prière d'un petit groupe vivant en autarcie, illustre une situation historique significative ayant une valeur universelle.

#### Intégrité

L'abbaye de Fontenay et son site illustrent de façon exemplaire les établissements cisterciens. Construits en des lieux écartés, mais à proximité d'une source d'eau et d'espaces cultivables, bannissant tout décor mais utilisant une architecture savante à l'échelle monumentale, présentant des espaces austères adaptés aux rigueurs de la vie selon la règle monastique, mais aussi des espaces fonctionnels spécialisés d'un grand raffinement technique, les abbayes cisterciennes forment une famille à part dans l'architecture monastique occidentale. Fontenay, dans son site intact et préservant son unité, en est l'un des exemples les plus complets et sans doute le mieux conservé de tous.

#### Authenticité

L'abbaye de Fontenay a connu, au long de son histoire, des modernisations, des constructions nouvelles (en particulier le palais abbatial au XVIIe siècle) et aussi des destructions (le réfectoire au XVIIIe siècle). Transformée en établissement industriel après la Révolution et la vente des biens nationaux, elle a été restaurée à partir de 1906.

En dépit des transformations subies aux XIIIe, XVe et XVIe siècles, malgré les ruines accumulées aux XVIIIe et XIXe siècles, l'abbaye cistercienne de Fontenay, restaurée après 1906, se présente aujourd'hui comme un ensemble largement authentique et bien conservé.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Propriété privée ouverte à la visite, l'abbaye de Fontenay est classée au titre des monuments historiques depuis 1862. Elle est entourée d'un vaste site classé en 1989. Sa protection est donc assurée, tant au titre du Code du patrimoine que du Code de l'environnement.

Sa conservation et sa gestion incombent à son propriétaire, sous le contrôle scientifique et technique de l'État qui, avec les collectivités territoriales, participe, le cas échéant, au financement des travaux de conservation.

La gestion de la majeure partie de la zone tampon repose sur le Document de gestion des forêts de Fontenay (forêt domaniale) et de Marmagne (forêt communale), qui comprend des études paysagères. La zone tampon pourrait être révisée afin de permettre une meilleure prise en compte du cadre physique plus large.

Historic Centre of Avignon: Papal Palace, Episcopal Ensemble and Avignon Bridge

#### Brève synthèse

Située sur les rives du Rhône en région Provence-Alpes-Côte-d'Azur, Avignon est surnommée la Cité des papes. Son centre historique, qui réunit le Palais des papes, l'ensemble épiscopal et le Pont d'Avignon est un exemple exceptionnel d'architecture médiévale. Fruit d'un épisode exceptionnel de l'Histoire qui a vu le siège de l'Eglise quitter Rome durant un siècle, il a joué un rôle capital dans le développement et la diffusion d'une forme particulière de culture à travers une vaste région d'Europe, à une époque de première importance pour la mise en place de relations durables entre la papauté et les pouvoirs civils.

La masse formidable du Palais des papes, « la plus forte maison du monde » comme l'écrivit Froissart, forme avec la ville et le Rocher des Doms un ensemble homogène et un paysage exceptionnel. A l'intérieur du Palais, la délicatesse des décors peints du XIVe siècle traduit l'éclat de la cour pontificale et ses ambitions artistiques.

Il est l'un des plus magnifiques édifices de l'architecture gothique du XIVe siècle. Au nord, on retrouve le Palais Vieux, bâti sous le règne de Benoît XII; au sud se situe le Palais Neuf élevé par son successeur Clément VI et qui abrite la chapelle pontificale.

Les éléments les plus caractéristiques du Palais Vieux sont la vaste salle du Consistoire qui donne sur la chapelle Saint-Jean décorée par Giovannetti, et au-dessus le Tinel, ou salle des Festins, décorée par le même artiste. Deux tours s'élèvent au nord de cette aile du palais, dont la tour de Trouillas (haute de 52 mètres), l'une des plus hautes tours médiévales. Le palais abrite également les appartements privés des pontifes. La salle de séjour de Clément VI, la chambre du Cerf, est ornée de très importantes fresques représentant des scènes rustiques. Elle permet d'accéder à la Grande Chapelle du Palais Neuf, dont la lourde voûte est soutenue par un arc-boutant qui enjambe la rue mitoyenne. L'aile ouest du Palais, dite des Grands Dignitaires, est occupée par la Grande Audience ou salle de Justice.

La cathédrale Notre-Dame des Doms, située au nord du Palais des Papes, date de 1150. Les chapelles gothiques furent ajoutées entre le XIVe et le XVIIe siècle; l'abside fut démolie et reconstruite puis agrandie en 1671-72, travaux qui eurent pour résultat la démolition du cloître médiéval.

Le Petit Palais, commencé en 1317, fut à l'origine la résidence des évêques d'Avignon. Il fut ensuite agrandi aux XIVe et XVe siècles.

Au pied nord du rocher des Doms, les remparts, la tour des Chiens et le Châtelet constituent les défenses de la ville.

Seules quatre des vingt-deux arches qui composaient le Pont Saint-Bénézet au moment de sa construction ont survécu. La chapelle Saint-Nicolas, construite en partie pendant la période romane et en partie au XVe siècle, occupe partiellement la seconde pile.

Critère (i): L'ensemble des monuments du Centre historique d'Avignon offre un exemple exceptionnel d'architecture médiévale religieuse, administrative et militaire.

**Critère (ii) :** Le centre historique d'Avignon témoigne d'un échange considérable d'influences qui s'est fait sentir à travers une vaste région d'Europe au cours des XIVe et XVe siècles, en particulier dans le domaine des arts et de l'architecture.

**Critère (iv):** Le Centre historique d'Avignon réunit un ensemble exceptionnel de bâtiments de la fin du Moyen Âge associés à un épisode important de l'histoire de la papauté.

#### Intégrité

L'ensemble monumental urbain, situé en plein cœur de la ville historique, a su conserver son intégrité malgré les vicissitudes historiques. Le Palais des papes, devenu Palais des légats et vice-légats puis transformé en caserne après la Révolution, a retrouvé dès le début du XXe siècle un usage conforme à sa dignité et capable d'exprimer son histoire. La cathédrale Notre-Dame des Doms a conservé sa fonction et son intégrité. Le pont Saint-Bénézet, dont l'histoire est liée étroitement à la fougue du fleuve, présente encore son châtelet d'accès et quatre arches suffisamment bien conservées pour témoigner de sa réalité passée et de son importance.

#### Authenticité

Dans l'ensemble, malgré les accidents de l'histoire, les édifices qui composent le centre historique d'Avignon ont gardé une authenticité suffisante pour permettre d'en apprécier la cohérence architecturale et exprimer la valeur universelle exceptionnelle qu'ils représentent.

Le Palais des papes, malgré bien des altérations, a pu retrouver une certaine authenticité grâce à diverses campagnes de restauration qui ont permis, entre autres, la sauvegarde des inestimables décors peints des appartements pontificaux et de la chapelle Saint-Martial. Le Palais épiscopal a connu un destin identique, tandis que la cathédrale, malgré les transformations de l'époque baroque, a préservé son intégrité architecturale.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

La place du Palais, le Petit Palais, les remparts, le pont Saint-Bénézet, le jardin et la promenade des Doms appartiennent à la commune ; le Palais des Papes est également propriété municipale, à l'exception de la partie nord-ouest comprenant la chapelle de Benoît XII et la tour de Trouillas, qui appartient au département du Vaucluse. La cathédrale Notre-Dame des Doms appartient à l'État.

Tous les édifices du bien sont protégés au titre du code du Patrimoine, certains portés sur la liste des Monuments historiques dès 1840.

Le jardin du Rocher des Doms est un site classé depuis 1933. L'intra-muros avignonnais est un site patrimonial remarquable, dont le plan de sauvegarde et de mise en valeur a été approuvé en 2007. Le palais pontifical, l'ensemble épiscopal et le pont Saint-Bénezet sont classés au titre des monuments historiques

Le système de gestion du bien fait appel à de nombreux acteurs, l'Etat et la Ville étant les principaux gestionnaires en fonction de leurs compétences. La municipalité coordonne cette gestion, en s'appuyant sur le comité de gestion du bien, composé de ces différents acteurs.

Un projet de zone tampon et de plan de gestion est en cours d'étude.

# Historic Site of Lyon

#### Brève synthèse

Située en région Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes, au confluent de la Saône et du Rhône, la ville de Lyon est dominée par deux collines : Fourvière, à l'ouest, la Croix-Rousse, à l'est.

La longue histoire de Lyon, dotée d'une agglomération proto-urbaine dès l'époque celte, avant même qu'y soit fondée par les Romains la capitale des Trois Gaules au ler siècle av. J.-C., et qui n'a cessé de jouer un rôle majeur dans le développement politique, culturel et économique de l'Europe depuis cette époque, est illustrée de

manière extrêmement vivante par son tissu urbain et par de nombreux bâtiments historiques de toutes les époques.

Sur ce site voué à l'urbanisation, les hommes se sont installés depuis plus de deux mille ans et ont bâti une ville dont toutes les étapes de développement sont encore visibles aujourd'hui : des vestiges romains de l'antique Lugdunum aux ruelles médiévales des pentes de Fourvière et aux habitations Renaissance du Vieux-Lyon, de la presqu'île riche de son architecture classique jusqu'aux pentes de la Croix-rousse avec son habitat canut si particulier, témoin d'une page essentielle de l'histoire ouvrière du XIXe siècle.

Parmi les exemples remarquables figurent la maison Thomassin, sur la place du Change (fin du XIIIe siècle, agrandie au XVe siècle), la maison Claude de Bourg (1516), la maison du poète Maurice Scève (1493, étage supplémentaire ajouté au XVIIe), l'hôtel particulier Chamberlain (1495-1516), qui illustre la transition du style gothique à la Renaissance française, la maison maniériste des Lions (1647), le bâtiment classique sur le quai Lassagne (1760), ainsi que l'immeuble aux « 365 fenêtres » et la Cour des Voraces, exemples frappants des logements construits pour les canuts pendant la première moitié du XIXe siècle.

Parmi les édifices publics, il convient de mentionner la Manécanterie (*schola cantorum*), de la fin du XIe siècle ; l'église abbatiale d'Ainay (1107), de pur style roman ; la cathédrale Saint-Jean-Baptiste (1160-1481), qui conserve un remarquable degré d'homogénéité stylistique, en dépit de la longue période sur laquelle s'étendit sa construction ; l'église Saint-Nizier, commencée au XIVe siècle mais qui ne fut achevée qu'au XIXe siècle, avec sa nef de style gothique flamboyant, sa façade typique de la Renaissance et sa flèche néogothique ; l'imposant Hôtel de Ville (1646-1703) ; l'Hôtel-Dieu, du XVIIe-XVIIIe siècles, construit sur un original médiéval ; la Loge du Change (1745-1780), actuellement devenue un temple protestant ; la Basilique de Fourvière (1872-1896), l'un des traits les plus importants du paysage de la ville ; et l'École de tissage, œuvre de l'architecte moderniste Tony Garnier (1927-1933).

La particularité de Lyon est de s'être étendue progressivement vers l'Est en préservant, à chaque étape de sa croissance, la richesse de l'habitat antérieur. À la différence de beaucoup d'autres villes où le centre a été détruit pour être reconstruit au même endroit avec une architecture nouvelle, le déplacement du centre de gravité de Lyon a permis la sauvegarde de quartiers entiers dont la permanence rend visible, sur les bâtiments eux-mêmes, l'histoire de la ville.

**Critère (ii) :** Lyon représente un témoignage exceptionnel de la continuité de l'installation urbaine sur plus de deux millénaires, sur un site d'une grande importance stratégique, où des traditions culturelles en provenance de diverses régions de l'Europe ont fusionné pour donner naissance à une communauté homogène et vigoureuse.

**Critère (iv):** De par la manière particulière dont elle s'est développée dans l'espace, Lyon illustre de manière exceptionnelle les progrès et l'évolution de la conception architecturale et de l'urbanisme au fil des siècles.

## Intégrité

Sur cette trame urbaine exceptionnelle, inscrite dans l'enceinte médiévale qui a perduré jusqu'au début du XIXe siècle, l'essentiel du bâti conservé représente une large période de son développement. Le patrimoine architectural de Lyon est représentatif de toutes les périodes, du Moyen Âge à aujourd'hui, avec des éléments gallo-romains signifiants. Les atteintes à l'intégrité sont dues essentiellement à des percements et réaménagements depuis le XIXe siècle, ainsi qu'à des modifications d'immeubles (rehaussement principalement), dues à l'occupation humaine continue et dynamique de ce centre urbain de première importance.

#### Authenticité

Le site de Lyon présente une authenticité forte à travers la permanence de trois principaux caractères qui définissent son urbanisme dont le développement est unique : la confluence, la cohérence du modèle urbain et l'urbanité.

À partir d'un site géographique et géomorphologique bien particulier (le confluent d'un fleuve et d'une rivière, et trois collines), la ville s'est imposée au croisement des voies de circulation, véritable carrefour entre les influences du Nord et du Sud de l'Europe.

Par ailleurs, Lyon présente, à travers une construction urbaine de plus de 2000 ans, un développement de son urbanisme unique : au lieu de se reconstruire sur elle-même, la ville s'est déplacée progressivement vers l'Est, conservant ainsi toutes les formes urbaines des différentes époques les unes à côté des autres. De plus, le mode d'urbanisation et les styles architecturaux se sont développés et enrichis au cours des siècles, en évoluant sans rupture.

Avec ce développement urbain hors du commun, la ville a toujours été caractérisée par une forte occupation humaine encore marquée aujourd'hui. La ville est imprégnée typologiquement et architecturalement par ses usages (commerce, artisanat, industrie, enseignement, cultes, ...) et l'expression de pouvoirs (civil, religieux, hospitalier, marchand, bourgeois, canut, industriel, ...).

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Les dispositifs de gestion architecturale et urbaine intègrent les outils réglementaires du code du patrimoine (archéologie préventive, Monuments historiques et leurs abords, sites patrimoniaux remarquables du Vieux Lyon, doté d'un plan de sauvegarde et de mise en valeur, et des Pentes de la Croix-Rousse), du code de

l'Environnement (site inscrit), ainsi que le plan local d'urbanisme. S'y ajoutent des outils opérationnels (Conventions patrimoine État-Ville, Charte qualité architecturale et urbaine, Charte ravalement, Plan lumière, Plan restauration des traboules, Charte du domaine public du Vieux-Lyon, ...) ou de coordination (Ateliers du patrimoine).

Le plan de gestion fait par ailleurs appel à une multiplicité de normes, d'outils et d'acteurs aux savoir-faire et compétences reconnus. La ville de Lyon coordonne des programmes d'action qui portent sur toute la chaîne du patrimoine, en lien étroit avec les services de la métropole du Grand-Lyon, de la région, et de l'État. Il a pour principal objectif l'intégration de la gestion patrimoniale au projet urbain et la sensibilisation aux valeurs du patrimoine et au projet culturel.

La zone tampon, définie tout autour du périmètre du site historique, invite à considérer une lecture culturelle et patrimoniale du territoire de la ville contemporaine au-delà du site historique.

#### Jurisdiction of Saint-Emilion

#### Brève synthèse

Le territoire de la Juridiction de Saint-Emilion se situe en région Nouvelle Aquitaine, dans le département de la Gironde. Il couvre 7 847 hectares. Délimité au sud par la Dordogne et au nord par le ruisseau de la Barbanne, il est composé d'un plateau (en partie boisé), de coteaux, de combes et d'une plaine. Huit communes constituent la juridiction qui fut établie au XIIe siècle par le roi d'Angleterre Jean sans Terre, duc d'Aquitaine.

Le paysage de la Juridiction de Saint-Émilion est celui d'une monoculture, des vignobles exclusivement qui nous sont parvenus intacts et sont demeurés en activité jusqu'à nos jours. La viticulture a été introduite dans cette région fertile d'Aquitaine par les Romains et s'est intensifiée au Moyen Âge. Le territoire de Saint-Émilion a bénéficié de sa situation sur la route de pèlerinage vers Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle et plusieurs églises, monastères et hospices y ont été construits à partir du XIe siècle.

Cette longue histoire viticole a marqué de manière caractéristique les monuments, l'architecture et les paysages de la Juridiction. Cette alliance du bâti et du non bâti, de la pierre, de la vigne, des bois et de l'eau en fait un éminent paysage culturel.

Avant que la viticulture ne s'impose au Moyen Âge et à la Renaissance, des châteaux furent construits sur les sites dominants pour servir de résidences seigneuriales. En revanche, les « châteaux » des vignobles se trouvent au centre de leurs domaines. Ils datent du milieu du XVIIIe et jusqu'au début du suivant.

Les villages sont caractérisés par de modestes maisons de pierre datant de la première moitié du XIXe siècle. Destinées aux viticulteurs, elles n'ont jamais compté plus de deux niveaux, et sont rassemblées par petits hameaux. Les chais sont de grandes structures rectangulaires et fonctionnelles construites en pierre ou en pierre et brique, avec des toits de tuiles à double pente.

À Saint-Emilion, les monuments religieux les plus importants sont l'ermitage ou grotte de Saint-Emilion, l'église monolithe surmontée de son clocher, les catacombes monastiques du Moyen Âge et l'église collégiale avec son cloître. Cet ensemble, essentiellement roman à l'origine, se regroupe autour du centre de pèlerinage du saint ermite. Il y a également un groupe de monuments séculiers, notamment le donjon massif du Château du Roi et les ruines du Palais Cardinal. Des églises romanes se trouvent dans chacun des sept autres villages. L'énorme menhir de Pierrefitte est situé sur la commune de Saint-Sulpice-de-Faleyrens.

**Critère (iii):** La Juridiction de Saint-Emilion est un exemple remarquable d'un paysage viticole historique qui a survécu intact et est en activité jusqu'à nos jours.

**Critère (iv) :** La Juridiction historique de Saint-Emilion illustre de manière exceptionnelle la culture intensive de la vigne à vin dans une région délimitée avec précision.

#### Intéarité

L'intégrité du paysage et l'harmonie qui se dégagent de l'ensemble du site sont dues à la permanence de la culture de la vigne et à l'organisation productive du territoire. Les constructions ou ensembles villageois ne correspondent pas à un unique courant architectural mais sont, comme en témoigne le cœur historique de Saint-Emilion, le résultat d'une évolution longue de plusieurs siècles, depuis le VIIe jusqu'aux XIXe et XXIe siècles.

Sans le détruire, les communautés humaines ont tiré le meilleur parti des caractéristiques du territoire pour développer leurs activités et leur manière de vivre. La culture des terres, l'exploitation des carrières, l'établissement et le développement urbain, la construction des édifices religieux et des maisons d'habitation, tout cela a créé un paysage en parfaite harmonie avec la topographie et les ressources du lieu.

#### Authenticité

Même si la Juridiction est confrontée aujourd'hui à une diminution de la population et à la fragilisation du sous-sol due aux carrières, elle reste un territoire dynamique, vivant, conservant intégralement sa vocation viticole, tourné vers l'avenir.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

En 1986, un secteur sauvegardé a été créé au titre de la Loi « Malraux » de 1962.

Au-delà des mesures individuelles de protection de bâtiments prises en application du code du patrimoine (Monuments historiques), des mesures de protection et des documents d'urbanisme et de mise en valeur assurant le développement du territoire ont été mis en place afin de préserver le site et de le gérer dans la continuité de son inscription sur la Liste du patrimoine mondial : une charte patrimoniale volontaire en 2001, un projet de territoire en 2004, un plan local d'urbanisme sur chaque commune en 2007, intéressant 8 communes dont 6 dans la limite du bien et 2 dans la zone tampon, ainsi qu'une zone de protection du patrimoine architectural, urbain et paysager intercommunale en 2007.

Le plan de sauvegarde et de mise en valeur (PSMV) du site patrimonial remarquable du bourg de Saint-Emilion a été approuvé en 2010. Un plan de prévention des risques d'inondation (PPRI) et un plan de prévention des risques des mouvements de terrain (PPRMT) sur les communes concernées ont également été élaborés. Un plan de gestion du bien a été rédigé en 2013. Il aborde notamment les questions liées à la baisse de la population, due aux problèmes de logement et à la faible réserve foncière. Il précise les conditions de développement du bien, afin de le rendre compatible avec la préservation de sa valeur universelle exceptionnelle. En lien avec les services de l'État, des solutions sont préconisées afin de permettre une meilleure intégration paysagère des chais de construction récente.

Sept Zones naturelles d'intérêt écologique, floristique et faunistique (ZNIEFF) concernent le territoire. Il s'agit de secteurs particuliers caractérisés par leur intérêt biologique. Les ZNIEFF des communes de Saint-Christophe des Bardes et de Saint-Laurent des Combes protègent l'intérêt faunistique et floristique de la « ceinture méditerranéenne » boisée de la Juridiction. La Dordogne est à la fois concernée par une ZNIEFF et par une zone Natura 2000.

#### Palace and Park of Fontainebleau

## Brève synthèse

Utilisée par les rois de France dès le XIIe siècle, la résidence de chasse de Fontainebleau, située au cœur d'une grande forêt de l'Île-de-France en Seine-et-Marne, fut transformée, agrandie et embellie au XVIe siècle par le roi François Ier, qui voulait en faire une « nouvelle Rome ». Entouré d'un vaste parc, le château, auquel contribuèrent de notables artistes italiens, fut un lieu de rencontre entre l'art de la Renaissance et les traditions françaises. Le besoin d'agrandir et de décorer cet immense palais créa les conditions de l'existence d'un véritable milieu artistique.

La construction du palais commença en 1528. Différentes modifications ultérieures entreprises par ses successeurs et menées à des échelles diverses jusqu'au XIXe siècle ont forgé la physionomie actuelle du complexe, qui se compose aujourd'hui de cinq cours disposées de manière irrégulière et entourées de corps de bâtiment et de jardins.

Le premier bâtiment a été construit entre 1528 et 1540 sous la direction de Gilles Le Breton, l'auteur de la cour Ovale dans la partie orientale du château. De 1533 à 1540, Rosso travailla sur le décor peint et les stucs de la galerie de François ler, et réalisa un ambitieux programme iconographique dans lequel les thèmes de l'illustration de la monarchie étaient véhiculés par les fables et les mythes du monde gréco-romain. Francesco Primaticcio, « Le Primatice », moula les plus célèbres bronzes de la Rome antique pour le décor. Il consacra la phase la plus féconde de sa carrière à Fontainebleau où il travailla aux fresques de la salle de bal, à la chambre de la duchesse d'Étampes et à la galerie d'Ulysse. Très peu des salles qu'il a décorées ont survécu, mais on conserve le souvenir de ses créations grâce aux dessins et aux gravures qui ont exercé une influence considérable sur son temps. Nicolo dell'Abbate collabora avec lui. Fontainebleau est associé au souvenir d'autres artistes : un Hercule de Michel-Ange se dressait dans la cour de la Fontaine ; Benvenuto Cellini conçut sa nymphe de Fontainebleau pour la porte Dorée ; Serlio dessina les plans de différentes parties du palais, et conçut l'entrée de la fontaine Belle-Eau avec sa grotte rustique reposant sur des télamons.

Ce contact avec des architectes, peintres et sculpteurs italiens poussa les artistes français à transformer leur propre pratique. Si Gilles Le Breton, au début des travaux, paraît avoir échappé à leur influence, Fontainebleau fut une révélation pour Philibert de l'Orme, puis pour Androuet du Cerceau. La leçon des peintres italiens inspira encore une autre génération d'artistes, celle de la seconde école de Fontainebleau, avec Toussaint Dubreuilh, Ambroise Dubois et Martin Fréminet. Le besoin d'agrandir et de décorer cet immense palais créa les conditions nécessaires pour l'existence d'un milieu artistique actif dans le courant du XVIIe siècle. Les artistes italiens appelés par le roi, peintres, sculpteurs et architectes, ont orienté de façon décisive et durable l'art de la Renaissance française, à laquelle ils ont donné ses plus précieux et prestigieux modèles.

Les jardins de Fontainebleau ont également connu des transformations importantes au fil des siècles. À l'est, le Grand Jardin, composé à l'origine d'une série de parterres de fleurs carrés séparés par un canal, fut redessiné par Le Nôtre et peu à peu simplifié avant de prendre sa physionomie actuelle, avec ses quatre parterres de pelouse délimités par des fleurs.

Résidence jusqu'au XIXe siècle des souverains français, qui l'ont constamment entretenue et enrichie d'apports artistiques, le château de Fontainebleau est en outre associé à l'Histoire, par des évènements marquants qui s'y sont déroulés tel que la révocation de l'édit de Nantes, en 1685, et l'abdication de Napoléon Ier, en 1814.

**Critère (ii):** L'architecture et le décor du château de Fontainebleau ont exercé une influence considérable sur l'évolution des arts en France et en Europe. Les artistes italiens appelés par le roi, peintres, sculpteurs et architectes, ont orienté de façon décisive et durable l'art de la Renaissance française, à laquelle ils ont donné ses plus précieux et prestigieux modèles.

**Critère (vi):** Le palais et le parc de Fontainebleau, résidence royale majeure pendant quatre siècles, sont associés à des événements de l'histoire de France ayant une importance universelle exceptionnelle, tels que la révocation de l'édit de Nantes par Louis XIV en 1685 et l'abdication de l'empereur Napoléon Ier en 1814.

#### Intégrité

Le palais et le parc de Fontainebleau furent, jusqu'au XIXe siècle, la résidence des souverains français qui les ont constamment entretenus et enrichis d'apports artistiques.

Fontainebleau a conservé la marque de chaque règne et de chaque style : François Ier, Henri IV, Louis XIII, Louis XV et Louis XVI, souverains qui n'ont pas épargné leurs efforts pour embellir ce palais royal, que Napoléon Ier préférait à tout autre.

#### Authenticité

Constamment entretenu et occupé, demeuré résidence royale ou impériale jusqu'à la fin du Second Empire, le palais de Fontainebleau a connu de nombreuses modifications et modernisations au cours des siècles, qui n'ont pas altéré son authenticité. Au XXe siècle, de nombreuses interventions ont visé à dégager ou restaurer les parties les plus significatives du palais de la Renaissance et leurs décors.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Propriété de l'Etat, le bien Palais et parc de Fontainebleau est intégralement protégé au titre du code du Patrimoine. Classé au titre des monuments historiques, il génère un périmètre de protection de 500 m. Un projet de zone tampon est en cours d'élaboration.

Un établissement public, placé sous la tutelle du ministère de la culture et de la communication, assure sa gestion, sa conservation et sa valorisation auprès du public. Un schéma directeur, approuvé par le ministère de la Culture et de la communication en 2014, est mis en œuvre pour la période 2015-2026. Il prévoit notamment un programme de conservation, restauration et restructuration, une rénovation des jardins, du parc et des ouvrages hydrauliques, une amélioration de l'accueil des visiteurs et des conditions de travail du personnel, ainsi que de la sécurité des personnes et des biens.

#### Paris, Banks of the Seine

#### Brève synthèse

La ville de Paris est construite dans un méandre de la Seine entre la confluence de la Marne et celle de l'Oise. Le bien comprend les ponts, les quais et les berges de la Seine dans la partie proprement historique de son cours (entre le pont de Sully et le pont d'Iéna) et les îles de la Cité et Saint-Louis. La maîtrise architecturale et urbaine du fleuve peut se lire dans l'articulation de l'île de la Cité et de l'île Saint-Louis avec le rivage, l'adaptation du passage Nord-Sud, les cheminements riverains à l'intérieur du méandre, la construction des quais et la canalisation du fleuve. L'ensemble, appréhendé comme une entité géographique et historique, forme un exemple exceptionnel et unique d'architecture urbaine en bordure d'un fleuve, où les strates successives de l'histoire de Paris, ville capitale de l'un des premiers grands États-nations d'Europe, se sont harmonieusement superposées.

De l'île Saint-Louis au Pont-Neuf, du Louvre jusqu'à la tour Eiffel, ou de la place de la Concorde au Grand Palais et au Petit Palais, on peut voir l'évolution de Paris et son histoire depuis la Seine. Un grand nombre des principaux monuments de la capitale française sont édifiés au bord du fleuve, ou sur des perspectives donnant sur celui-ci. La cathédrale Notre-Dame et la Sainte-Chapelle sont des chefs-d'œuvre d'architecture du Moyen Âge ; le Pont-Neuf illustre l'esprit de la Renaissance en France ; la cohérence des quartiers du Marais et de l'île Saint-Louis témoigne de l'urbanisme parisien des XVIII et XVIII es siècles ; enfin, les abords du fleuve portent les compositions les plus magistrales du classicisme français, avec le palais du Louvre, les Invalides, l'École militaire ou la Monnaie. Les édifices conservés des Expositions universelles parisiennes des XIXe et XXe siècles sont nombreux le long de la Seine, avec à leur tête la tour Eiffel, icône parisienne et universelle de l'architecture métallique. L'île Saint-Louis, le quai Malaquais et le quai Voltaire offrent des ensembles architecturaux et urbains cohérents, avec des exemples très significatifs de la construction parisienne des XVIII et XVIII esiècles. Quant aux larges places et avenues construites par Haussmann à l'époque de Napoléon III, elles ont influencé l'urbanisme dans le monde entier.

**Critère (i) :** Les quais de la Seine sont jalonnés d'une succession de chefs-d'œuvre architecturaux et urbains édifiés du Moyen-Âge au XXe siècle, dont la cathédrale Notre-Dame et la Sainte-Chapelle, le palais du Louvre, le palais de l'Institut, l'Hôtel des Invalides, la place de la Concorde, l'École militaire, l'Hôtel de la Monnaie, le Grand Palais des Champs-Élysées, la Tour Eiffel et le palais de Chaillot.

Critère (ii): Certains édifices des bords de Seine, comme Notre-Dame et la Sainte-Chapelle, ont constitué une référence certaine dans la diffusion de l'architecture gothique, cependant que la place de la Concorde ou la perspective des Invalides ont influencé l'urbanisme des capitales européennes. L'urbanisme haussmannien qui marque la partie ouest de la ville a inspiré la construction de grandes villes du Nouveau Monde, en particulier en Amérique Latine. Enfin la tour Eiffel, le Grand et le Petit Palais, le Pont Alexandre III et le Palais de Chaillot sont des témoignages insignes des expositions universelles dont l'importance a été si grande au XIXe et au XXe siècle.

**Critère (iv):** Réunis par un paysage fluvial des plus majestueux, les monuments, les ouvrages d'art et les édifices de représentation des rives de la Seine à Paris illustrent tour à tour avec perfection la plupart des styles, des arts décoratifs et des manières de bâtir utilisés pendant près de huit siècles.

#### Intégrité

Paris est une ville fluviale. Dès l'installation des premiers hommes, de l'époque préhistorique au peuple des Parisii, la Seine a joué un rôle à la fois défensif et économique. La ville historique actuelle, telle qu'elle s'est développée entre le XVIe et le XXe siècle, traduit l'évolution des relations entre la rivière et la ville. La zone bien déterminée entre le pont de Sully et le pont d'Iéna se fonde sur une très ancienne distinction entre amont et aval. En amont, le port et la ville du transport fluvial ; en aval, le Paris royal et aristocratique. C'est cette partie riveraine de la Seine, le long de laquelle se sont développées les fonctions de ville capitale qui a été retenue. L'emprise de l'État à travers ses réalisations et sa législation y est extrêmement forte, ce qui permet de préserver le bien dans toute son intégrité.

#### Authenticité

L'achèvement et la consolidation des grandes perspectives fluviales, urbaines et monumentales de Paris datent de la première moitié du XXe siècle, avec les palais de Tokyo et de Chaillot. L'intégrité urbaine et visuelle du site (grandes perspectives depuis les rives) est vulnérable aux pressions du développement immobilier, à la circulation automobile et à la fréquentation touristique, et nécessite un contrôle rigoureux pour maintenir intacte sa valeur universelle exceptionnelle.

## Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

L'ensemble du bien jouit de protections légales du plus haut niveau (code du patrimoine, code de l'urbanisme, code de l'environnement). Le bien est dans un site inscrit, et comprend en outre six sites classés, notamment l'Esplanade des Invalides ainsi que le Champ de Mars et les jardins du Trocadéro. Au titre des Monuments historiques, tous les grands monuments sont classés en totalité.

L'État est propriétaire, directement ou par le biais de ses établissements publics, des quais de la Seine (domaine public fluvial), de l'essentiel des monuments et de leurs espaces associés. La ville de Paris est propriétaire des espaces publics, de l'Hôtel de Ville, des églises paroissiales et de nombreux autres terrains et bâtiments.

Il n'existe pas de plan de gestion ni d'autorité de gestion spécifiquement dédiée au bien du Patrimoine mondial. Toutefois, en raison des protections légales et réglementaires, la gestion des propriétaires ou affectataires est réalisée sous le contrôle scientifique et technique de l'État.

Le « Cahier des prescriptions urbaines et paysagères pour la mise en valeur des Berges de la Seine dans Paris », élaboré en 1999 conjointement par la ville, l'État et le Port autonome, constitue le document de référence pour toute l'activité et les installations sur les berges. Le « cahier de prescription des installations saisonnières », approuvé en 2015, vise à encadrer les usages et occupations de temporaires de la voirie sur l'ensemble des quais bas des berges de la Seine dans Paris. La suppression définitive de la circulation automobile sur les quais bas dans la quasi-totalité des limites du bien, depuis 2014 sur la rive gauche et 2016 sur la rive droite, dans le cadre de l'aménagement des berges de la Seine, contribue à préserver son authenticité et son intégrité.

Place Stanislas, Place de la Carrière and Place d'Alliance in Nancy

#### Brève synthèse

Situées en région Alsace-Lorraine-Champagne-Ardenne, les places Stanislas, de la Carrière et d'Alliance à Nancy constituent un des paysages urbains les plus harmonieux de l'époque des Lumières, illustrant de façon exemplaire et magistrale l'idée de la place royale, espace urbain central et monumental. Prétendant malheureux au trône de Pologne, Stanislas Leszczynski, beau-père du roi de France Louis XV, reçut pour prix de son abdication les duchés lorrains à titre viager. Il y régna de 1737 à 1766. Les travaux d'urbanisme de Nancy sont les plus belles réalisations du mécénat de ce prince.

Construites de 1752 à 1756, les places de Nancy composent un espace urbain monumental dont la valeur réside dans l'exemplarité et la variété de son programme, dans la subtilité de sa scénographie, dans la richesse de son architecture et de son ornementation.

Les façades ordonnancées dues à Emmanuel Héré, inspirées d'une première réalisation de Germain Boffrand, les grilles somptueuses qui ornent les angles ouverts dues à Jean Lamour, les fontaines de Neptune et d'Amphitrite du sculpteur Guibal, la fontaine de la place d'Alliance par Paul-Louis Cyfflé, font de cet ensemble un indéniable chef-d'œuvre.

Les places Stanislas, de la Carrière et d'Alliance constituent l'exemple le plus ancien et le plus typique d'une capitale moderne, où un monarque éclairé s'est montré soucieux d'utilité publique. À côté d'une architecture de prestige, exaltant le souverain, avec ses arcs de triomphe, ses statues, ses fontaines, le projet procurait à la population trois places qui donnaient accès à l'hôtel de ville, au palais de justice et au palais des Fermes, ainsi qu'à d'autres édifices publics.

Critère (i): Les trois places de Nancy constituent une réalisation artistique unique, véritable chef-d'œuvre de génie créatif.

**Critère (iv)**: Les places de Nancy offrent le témoignage le plus ancien et le plus typique de l'urbanisme du Siècle des Lumières, dans une ville moderne où un monarque éclairé réalisa un exceptionnel programme d'espaces et de bâtiments publics, démontrant qu'il était sensible aux besoins de la population.

#### Intégrité

L'ensemble des places a conservé son intégrité d'ordonnancement, d'architecture et d'ornementation. Seules ont varié les destinations ou usages de certains édifices qui les bordent, tout en conservant des fonctions urbaines de nature publique. Les places ont gardé leur unité, leur urbanité et leur centralité.

#### Authenticité

Plusieurs restaurations ont été entreprises, depuis plus d'un siècle, afin de préserver ce bien et l'embellir en prenant le parti de conserver son authenticité, comme la restauration complète du sol et des façades de la Place Stanislas, ou la restauration du Tribunal et du pavillon Héré sur la Place de la Carrière.

Ces interventions d'entretien et de restauration, fondées sur des études scientifiques et techniques préalables, menées sous le contrôle de l'État, ont permis d'améliorer son état de conservation. La place Stanislas a retrouvé sa splendeur.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Les trois places composant le bien bénéficient d'un ensemble de mesures de protection au titre du code du Patrimoine, qui se sont progressivement déployées et étendues du début du XXe siècle à 2003. Un secteur sauvegardé a été approuvé en 1996, incluant l'ensemble du bien. Une zone tampon de 159 hectares a été proposée sur la base des limites du site patrimonial remarquable étendu. A ce titre, tous les travaux sur les éléments du bien sont soumis à autorisation des services du ministère de la Culture et de la communication et sont réalisés sous son contrôle.

La mise en œuvre du système de gestion et le contrôle de son efficacité incombent à la Communauté urbaine du Grand Nancy et au Ministère de la Culture et de la Communication.

L'ensemble des institutions locales, en concertation avec les services déconcentrés de l'État, contribue à une gestion efficace du bien, qui s'inscrit dans une démarche globale de protection et de mise en valeur du patrimoine.

## Routes of Santiago de Compostela in France

# Brève synthèse

Tout au long du Moyen Âge, Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle fut une destination majeure pour d'innombrables pèlerins de toute l'Europe. Pour atteindre l'Espagne, les pèlerins traversaient la France. Quatre voies symboliques partant de Paris, de Vézelay, du Puy et d'Arles et menant à la traversée des Pyrénées résument les itinéraires innombrables empruntés par les voyageurs. Églises de pèlerinage ou simples sanctuaires, hôpitaux, ponts, croix de chemin jalonnent ces voies et témoignent des aspects spirituels et matériels du pèlerinage. Exercice spirituel et manifestation de la foi, le pèlerinage a aussi touché le monde profane en jouant un rôle décisif dans la naissance et la circulation des idées et des arts.

De grands sanctuaires cités dans le Codex Calixtinus, tels que l'église Saint-Sernin à Toulouse ou la cathédrale d'Amiens, et d'autres biens illustrent matériellement les voies et conditions du pèlerinage pendant des siècles. Soixante et onze éléments associés au pèlerinage ont été retenus pour illustrer leur diversité géographique, le développement chronologique du pèlerinage entre le XIe et XVe siècle, et les fonctions essentielles de l'architecture, comme l'ancien hôpital des pèlerins à Pons, ou le pont « des pèlerins » sur la Boralde. En outre, sept tronçons du Chemin du Puy sont inclus couvrant près de 160 km de route.

**Critère (ii) :** La route de pèlerinage de Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle a joué un rôle essentiel dans les échanges et le développement religieux et culturels au cours du Bas Moyen Âge, comme l'illustrent admirablement les monuments soigneusement sélectionnés sur les chemins suivis par les pèlerins en France.

**Critère (iv)**: Les besoins spirituels et physiques des pèlerins se rendant à Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle furent satisfaits grâce à la création d'un certain nombre d'édifices spécialisés, dont beaucoup furent créés ou ultérieurement développés sur les sections françaises.

**Critère (vi) :** La route de pèlerinage de Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle est un témoignage exceptionnel du pouvoir et de l'influence de la foi chrétienne dans toutes les classes sociales et dans tous les pays d'Europe au Moyen Âge.

## Intégrité

Les édifices et ensembles proposés représentent, dans leur diversité, une évocation fidèle du contexte du pèlerinage vers Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle. Il en est de même des tronçons de chemins proposés qui ne sont que des exemples de l'ensemble des routes empruntées par les pèlerins. Les ouvrages rencontrés sur les chemins ont en commun d'être les témoignages directs, conservés et transmis jusqu'à nous, de la pratique du pèlerinage tel qu'elle s'est déroulée en France durant le Moyen Âge. Cette puissance d'évocation intacte a permis de revitaliser l'approche culturelle du pèlerinage vers Compostelle. Les chemins de Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle en France font l'objet, depuis les années 1990, d'une fréquentation sans cesse croissante, qui doit être conciliée avec les aménagements routiers.

#### Authenticité

Les établissements d'accueil et de soins présentés sont indubitablement voués au pèlerinage par les textes historiques et les éléments architecturaux ou de décor conservés. Les biens présentés illustrent de la façon la plus véridique et crédible l'ensemble des rituels et des pratiques liés au pèlerinage vers Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle. Ceux-ci incluent des routes, églises de pèlerinage ou simples sanctuaires, hôpitaux et ponts. Le parcours spirituel du pèlerinage était rythmé par la vénération des reliques des saints qui jalonnaient l'itinéraire. Les édifices les plus riches, points de passage privilégiés du parcours, sont reconnaissables à leurs dispositions architecturales spécifiques, propres à organiser la circulation des pèlerins. Les églises plus modestes, haltes de recueillement ou de repos situées sur les voies principales ou secondaires, sont attestées par leurs décors sculptés ou peints représentant des scènes religieuses ou des légendes liées à la dévotion à saint Jacques.

#### Éléments requis en matière de protection et de gestion

Les 71 édifices ou ensembles de bâtiments sont majoritairement propriété des communes, et dans quelques cas, propriété du Conseil départemental et de personnes privées. Les édifices religieux sont pour la plupart affectés au culte catholique. Leur conservation incombe à leurs propriétaires, avec l'aide financière et sous le contrôle technique et scientifique des services de l'État.

Ils font l'objet de mesures de protection prises en application du code du patrimoine (classement ou inscription au titre des monuments historiques), du code de l'environnement, ainsi qu'au titre des plans locaux d'urbanisme (PLU). Ces édifices génèrent également des périmètres de protection de 500 mètres. Certains de ces périmètres ont vocation à être modifiés afin de rendre le rayon de protection plus pertinent.

En outre, les espaces dans lesquels ils sont situés bénéficient également de protection soit au titre du code du patrimoine (sites patrimoniaux remarquables), soit au titre du code de l'environnement (site classé ou inscrit). Dans tous les cas, ces périmètres de protection rendent obligatoire l'avis des services territoriaux de l'architecture et du patrimoine pour toute autorisation de travaux.

Les sections de sentier faisant partie du bien inscrit sont des sentiers de grande randonnée (GR65) qui bénéficient, dans leur majeure partie, d'une protection au titre du plan départemental des itinéraires de promenade et de randonnée (PDIPR).

Ils bénéficient également de la protection au titre des abords des monuments historiques qui les jalonnent.

La gestion du bien est coordonnée au niveau national par le préfet de région Occitanie, qui a été nommé préfet coordonnateur. Celui-ci préside le comité de coordination interrégionale, qui réunit tous les ans l'ensemble des propriétaires des éléments du bien. Il s'appuie également sur l'Agence de coopération interrégionale et réseau des Chemins de Saint-Jacques-de-Compostelle (ACIR), gestionnaire du bien inscrit.

#### Ireland

# Sceilg Mhichíl

# **Brief synthesis**

Sceilg Mhichíl, also known as Skellig Michael, was inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1996. The island of Sceilg Mhichíl lies at the extreme north-western edge of Europe, rising from the Atlantic Ocean almost 12 km west of the Iveragh Peninsula in County Kerry. It is the most spectacularly situated of all Early Medieval island monastic sites, particularly the isolated hermitage perched on narrow, human-made terraces just below the South

Faulting of Devonian sandstone has created a U-shaped depression known today as "Christ's Valley" or "Christ's Saddle" 130 m above sea level in the centre of the island, and this is flanked by two peaks, that to the north-east rising to 185 m and that to the west-south-west, 218 m. The rock is deeply eroded and weathered, owing to its exposed position, but it is almost frost-free.

The three island landing points communicate by flights of steps with the principal monastic remains, which are situated on a sloping shelf on the ridge running north-south on the north-eastern side of the island; the hermitage is on the steeper South Peak.

The monastery, its cells and oratories and the even more precipitous structures of the South Peak Hermitage symbolise both the arrival and spread of Christianity and emerging literacy of lands so remote that they were beyond the frontiers of the Roman Empire and the ultimate reach of organised monasticism which spread from Egypt by land and sea through Italy and Gaul to Britain and Ireland in a mere two centuries (the 5th and 6th). The date of the foundation of the monastery on this island is not known. It was dedicated to St Michael somewhere between 950 and 1050.

All the physical components of the ideal small monastery exist on Skellig: isolation, difficulty in accessing the site, living spaces, buildings for worship and plots for food production. Here, amongst dramatic and unique settings, the indigenous stone architecture of a past millennium is intact and in a relatively stable condition. A clear evolution of dry stone masonry techniques is evident so this site offers a unique documentation of the development of this type of architecture and construction.

Sceilg Mhichíl is also one of Ireland's most important sites for breeding seabirds, both for the diversity of the species and the size of the colonies it supports.

**Criterion (iii):** Sceilg Mhichíl illustrates, as no other property can, the extremes of a Christian monasticism characterizing much of North Africa, the Near East and Europe.

**Criterion (iv):** Sceilg Mhichíl is an outstanding and in many respects a unique example of an early religious settlement deliberately sited on a pyramidal rock in the ocean, preserved because of a remarkable environment.

#### Integrity

In the case of Sceilg Mhichíl, there are two types of integrity: structural-historical integrity, in that the structures have evolved over time; and visual-aesthetic integrity, in other words, the iconic image that has been retained.

The Monastery and Hermitage on Sceilg Mhichíl represent a unique artistic achievement. They provide an outstanding example of a perfectly preserved Early Medieval monastic settlement, and the architectural ensemble is unique because of its level of preservation. It illustrates a significant stage in building history. The dramatic topography of the island and the integration of the various monastic elements within the landscape reinforce the uniqueness of the property. The presence of the monks on the island for such a long period has imbued the place with a strong sense of spirituality.

The sense of remoteness is reinforced by the island's distance from the mainland and its frequent inaccessibility particularly between the months of October and May.

Sceilg Mhichíl is approximately 21.9 ha in size. This area encapsulates the attributes for which the property was inscribed on the World Heritage List. The World Heritage property boundary is drawn tightly to the island, with a buffer zone formed naturally by the Atlantic Ocean.

#### Authenticity

The level of authenticity is very high. Sceilg Mhichíl, because of its isolation, has been protected from alterations and adaptations, other than those of the 19th century lighthouse builders. Most of the structures within the monastery are almost complete, as are the stepped terraces and the paved areas. In addition to individual features, the overall layout is almost fully intact.

The island's isolation has helped preserve and protect it from agents of destruction that have adversely affected most other sites of the period. Alterations were made during the lighthouse builders' occupation in the 1820s, but it has been possible to document these through research and on-site investigation. Due to the vicissitudes of time, the extreme environment and increased visitor pressure, a programme of conservation works, structural consolidation and repair has been in train since the late 1970s. The philosophy underpinning this work is that all original features are retained and conserved in situ.

Conservation work began in the 1880s when the monuments came into State guardianship; these included the rebuilding of part of the upper retaining wall along St Michael's Church and some minor repairs to the enclosure walls, where collapse had occurred. Other minor works were carried out in the 1930s. The current programme of preservation and conservation began in 1978 with an objective of the stabilization of the steps, retaining walls and individual structures. All this work was carefully recorded by survey and photography, and revealed a surprising amount of evidence about the monastic structures and layout.

Major conservation works began in 1986 which concentrated on the repair and consolidation of the terraces and their retaining walls. This work was carried out in tandem with archaeological investigations.

#### Protection and management requirements

The protection and conservation of Sceilg Mhichíl is provided by a range of national legislation, international guidelines, statutory and non-statutory guidance. These provisions include the National Monuments Acts 1930-2004, the Wildlife Act 1976 and 2000, Planning and Development Acts, various EU directives and international charters.

Skellig Michael is a national monument in full State ownership. The National Monuments legislative code makes provisions for the protection and preservation of national monuments and for the preservation of archaeological objects in the State. The Planning and Development Acts provide a framework to protect against undesirable development.

The management of Sceilg Mhichíl is in the hands of the Office of Public Works. This State Office has on its staff qualified conservation architects and engineers; skilled craftspeople are employed to carry out consolidation and conservation works. The State Exchequer provides the funding needed for maintenance, management and conservation. Archaeological input to the conservation and presentation of the property is provided by the National Monuments Service of the Department of Arts, Heritage, Regional, Rural and Gaeltacht Affairs, while management is carried out under a service level agreement between the Department and the Office of Public Works.

The Office of Public Works has had a full-time presence on the island during the visitor season since the current preservation programme began in 1978. At that time the lighthouse was still staffed, but it is now an unoccupied station. An official guide service was introduced in 1987 with a view to regulating the numbers of visitors to the site during peak visiting hours and preserving the monuments. Since 2007 the Office of Public Works has set out, on an annual basis, the period during which, weather permitting, a guide service is available on the island. This is also the period of the 'season' referred to in the permits issued annually to boatmen and boatwomen to land visitors on the island. In the interest of the continued protection of the island and to prevent damage to the monuments and particularly for reasons of health and safety of visitors, access to the island outside of the defined period is not permitted. Access to the island by private craft is discouraged by the Office of Public Works.

## Italy

Portovenere, Cinque Terre, and the Islands (Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto)

#### **Brief synthesis**

Stretching 15 km along the eastern Ligurian coast between Levanto and La Spezia, the jagged, steep coastal landscape has over centuries been intensively developed with stone walled terraces for the growing of vines and olive trees. The area was almost inaccessible, except by sea, until the Genoa-La Spezia railway was built in the 1870s.

The property, extending from the Punta Mesco in the west and to the Punta Persico in the east, encompasses the territory of Porto Venere, the three islands of its archipelago (Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto), and the Cinque Terre, the collective name of the five villages of Monterosso, Vernazza, Corniglia, Manarola and Riomaggiore.

Some of the cultivation terraces extend to as much as 2 km in length. Terraces extended along the steep slopes from a few meters above sea level to up 400 m a.s.l., the highest altitude suitable for cultivation. They were mostly built in the 12th century, when Saracen raids from the sea had come to an end. The drystone walls are most often carefully constructed of sandstone rough blocks, bonded together with pebbles removed from the ground.

The maintenance of the terraces and the cultivation of vines and olive trees on the terraces reflect a communal approach to farming and the collaboration and cooperation of the communities without which such cultivation would not have been possible.

The natural *garrigue* and *maquis* vegetation survives intact in the higher parts of the steep ridge. The nature of the terrain and the vegetation provides food and shelter for a wide range of insect and animal species.

The local communities have adapted themselves to this seemingly rough and inhospitable environment by living in compact settlements on the coast or in small hamlets on the hillsides (e.g. Volastra, Groppo, Drignana, San Bernardino or Campiglia), erected directly on the rock with winding streets. The general use of natural stone for roofing gives these settlements a characteristic appearance. They are generally grouped around religious buildings or medieval castles. The terraces are also dotted by innumerable tiny stone huts isolated or grouped together (e.g. at Fossola, Tramonti, Monestiroli or Schiara) used for temporary shelter during the harvest.

The main five villages of Cinque Terre date back to the later Middle Ages. Starting from the north-west, the first is the fortified centre of Monterosso al Mare, that is a coastal town grown along two short valleys and facing one of the few beaches that exist in the area. Vernazza has developed along the Vernazzola water-stream on the slopes of the rocky spur protecting the village from the sea. Corniglia is the only village which has not been built on the coast itself but on a high promontory projecting to the sea. Manarola is a small hamlet in which the houses are ranged in part on a rocky spur running down towards the sea and partly along the Grappa stream. The most eastern – southerly village is Riomaggiore; its houses line the narrow valley of the Rio Maggiore water-stream, today covered to be used as main street.

Portovenere was an important commercial and cultural centre dating back to the Roman period, from which archaeological remains survive in its vicinity. It is compact in form, the houses aligned along the coastline

culminating in the Doria Castle, which dominates the settlement and is a historical palimpsest, with many traces of its medieval predecessor.

Off the coast at Portovenere, the three islands of Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto, noteworthy not only for their natural beauty but also for the many remains of early monastic establishments that they contain.

The rugged and visually dramatic coastal landscape, with its tall compact settlements and visually spectacular terraces that were shaped over almost a millennium, is an exceptional testimony to the way traditional communities interacted and still interact with their difficult and isolated environment to produce a sustainable livelihood.

**Criterion (ii):** The eastern Ligurian Riviera between Cinque Terre and Portovenere is a cultural site of outstanding value that illustrates a traditional way of life that has existed for a thousand years and continues to play an important socio-economic role in the life of the community.

**Criterion (iv):** The Ligurian coastal region from Cinque Terre to Portovenere is an outstanding example of landscape where the layout and disposition of small towns, historically stratified, in relation to the sea, and the shaping of the surrounding terraces that overcame the disadvantages of a steep, uneven terrain, encapsulates the continuous history of human settlement in this region over the past millennium.

**Criterion (v):** Portovenere, Cinque Terre, and the Islands (Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto) is a remarkable cultural landscape created by human endeavour over a millennium in a rugged and dramatic natural environment. It represents the harmonious interaction between people and nature to produce a landscape of exceptional scenic quality.

#### Integrity

The landscape and settlements as we know them today have come down to us thanks to the assiduity and perseverance over the years with which humans have constantly repaired the stone walls surrounding the cultivated fields in order to allow agriculture to flourish. The traditional communal and collaborative viti-cultural and agricultural systems are an essential attribute for the outstanding universal value of the property.

At the time of inscription, it was estimated that 130 m of walls per hectare of vineyard and 30-300 m per hectare of olive grove were in need of urgent reconstruction. Since then, mechanisms for linking tourism activity and landscape maintenance have been activated and programmes for the reclamation of the terraced landscape have allowed recovery of some tens of hectares to vines and olive cultivation. Also communal activities for marketing wine have been strengthened.

Some abandoned terraces are now highly vulnerable to landslides, and there is a need for these to be mapped and recorded.

Re-afforestation also is becoming a threat to the terraces, and its impact needs to be addressed.

Monumental constructions have been subject to restoration, so that on the one hand the additions of several periods have been handed down to us and on the other the oldest parts of them have been retained, so that we can now consider this area of territory as a particular portrait of the history, the economy, and the life of the communities of Liguria.

Despite damages suffered from floods to some of the villages and to the watercourses leading down the terraced slopes, the effects of the floods have been limited to specific areas, and the major landscape and settlement features have not been substantially and permanently altered. Although damage was restricted to certain areas, the affected areas have not been yet restored completely. Mitigation measures need to be assessed for their impact on the outstanding universal value of the property in advance of work being carried out.

The floods have highlighted the vulnerability of the property to natural disasters and the need for risk preparedness measures to be developed.

The visual setting of the property is vulnerable to anticipated and unanticipated changes and needs to be adequately protected.

## Authenticity

The property is an example of a "cultural, evolved organic landscape". Its authenticity relates to sustaining the traditional farming and viti-cultural systems and their integrated settlements. These have been maintained in spite of the pressures caused by the modern social-economic development. Nevertheless the terraced agricultural system, including the maintenance of the terraces and the water management systems, remains highly vulnerable and will need much support to allow farmers to add value to their produce in order to sustain their livelihoods and the landscape.

The authenticity of the settlements relates to sustaining the traditional methods and materials and the use of traditional craftsmanship.

# Protection and management requirements

Individual buildings, urban ensembles and archaeological remains within the nominated area are protected under the provisions of the basic Italian cultural property protection, the Decreto Legislativo 42/2004, Codice dei Beni

Culturali e del Paesaggio (legislative Decree 42/2004 Cultural Properties and Landscape Code): a provision of law which establishes that any activity within the site must be authorized by the relevant Soprintendenza (peripheral office of the Ministry for Cultural Heritage and Activities).

In addition, the entire area of the municipalities of Cinque Terre and Portovenere falls under the provisions of the Cultural Heritage and Landscape Code as protected landscape. As a result, all interventions require the approval of the relevant authorities responsible for landscape and heritage protection and planning (Municipalities, Provinces, Regions and the Soprintendenze). Additionally, a Regional Coordination Landscape Plan is in force since 1990 for the entire region, operating at the territorial, local, and detailed level, defining levels of possible interventions related to the landscape features of each identified area. Finally, each of the municipal administrations has its own master plan which, according to the regional urban law (L.R. 36/1997), must contain measures that consider the landscape qualities.

The property enjoys the existence of several other provisions of law dedicated to its protection implemented by ad hoc authorities:

The Regional Law No. 12/1995 designated the area as part of the Regional Natural Park of Cinque Terre (Parco Regionale Naturale delle Cinque Terre); this brought with it compliance with the provisions of the national Law No. 394/1991 on protected areas, which imposes stringent controls over all forms of activity within the designated park.

Following the inscription in the World Heritage List, in December 1997 the Protected Marine Area was established and, in 1999, the Regional Natural Park was transformed into a National Park (President of the Republic's Decree 6.10.1999).

The territory of the Islands of Palmaria, Tino and Tinetto, the marine area in the southwest direction of these isles (marine protected area) and a significant section of the land surface which includes the medieval village of Porto Venere, have been included in the Regional Park of Porto Venere.

The town of Porto Venere is subject to the detailed plan of the historic centre approved in 1992, which foresees some particular recovering strategies.

Currently, a number of plans and safeguard regulations concur to ensure the management of the property, particularly the two park plans elaborated according to the existing provision of law for the National Park of Cinque Terre and the Regional Park of Porto Venere (I.r. 30/2001). A first Plan for the Cinque Terre Park was adopted in 2002 and introduced some specific restrictive regulations to protect the site. The Plan must be regularly reviewed and updated.

The introduction of the Regulation of the Cinque Terre Marine Protected Area in 2005 aims at the protection the sea area.

The Plan for Porto Venere Regional Park defines different restricting regimes for use according to the features of the territory so as to ensure the retention of the values of property. The property includes some "Sites of EC Interest" that have been designed to guarantee the maintenance of the conservation of the landscape and the local flora and fauna.

Protected buildings such as the churches of St Peter in Portovenere and St Venerius (Tine) and the Castle in Portovenere are the subject of systematic restoration campaigns by the peripheral offices of the Ministry of Culture. There are also regular maintenance programmes for all the protected monuments.

There are strict limitations on the establishment of tourist facilities. Measures have been envisaged to support the maintenance of the terraces and of the landscape as well as farming activities, however these apply on a voluntary basis. Maintaining the terraces remains the responsibility of individual farmers and landowners.

The territory of the property is under the responsibility of two different bodies the National Park of Cinque Terre and Regional Park of Porto Venere, the latter coinciding with the Municipality of Porto Venere. Additional management responsibilities are charged on the Municipalities, the Provinces and the Ligurian Region. Within the new management plan, submitted in 2016, a new management protocol has been signed by all relevant stakeholders. It establishes a structured management system, which includes a Coordination Committee, with steering and control tasks, the Community of the Municipalities of the future buffer zone, to ensure their participation in decision making and promotion activities, a permanent technical-administrative working group, tasked with the implementation of the actions of the management plan, the "Office for the UNESCO site", which supports the permanent working group and is responsible for monitoring and periodic reporting. The role of site manager is occupied on rotation by the President of the National Park of the Cinque Terre and the Mayor of the Municipality of Porto Venere. A consultative committee is also envisaged to provide advice on research and other management matters.

In consideration of the multiple levels of protective and planning tools in place, the management system/plan for the property must ensure that the OUV of the property is respected by all these instruments and that coordination and harmonization mechanisms among their provisions are established and implemented.

# **Portugal**

#### Cultural Landscape of Sintra

#### **Brief Synthesis**

The Cultural Landscape of Sintra is located in Portugal's central region, at the extreme west of the Iberian Peninsula and a few kilometres away from the Atlantic Ocean. This Cultural Landscape is an exceptional mixture of natural and cultural sites within a distinct framework. Seen from a distance, it gives the impression of an essentially natural landscape that is distinct from its surroundings: a small chain of forested granite mountains rising over the hilly rural landscape. When seen from closer at hand, the Serra reveals a surprisingly rich cultural evidence spanning over several centuries of Portugal's history.

Around 1840, Ferdinand II turned a ruined monastery into a castle in which Gothic, Egyptian, Moorish and Renaissance elements were displayed. He surrounded the palace with a vast Romantic park, unparalleled elsewhere planted with rare and exotic trees, decorated with fountains, watercourses and series of ponds, cottages, chapels and mock ruins, and traversed by magical paths. He also restored the forests of the Serra, where thousands of trees were planted to supplement the oaks and umbrella pines which made a perfect contribution to the romantic character of the Cultural Landscape of Sintra.

The Royal Palace is undoubtedly the dominant architectural feature of Sintra, situated in the town centre. Probably constructed on the site of the Moorish *alcazar* of Sintra, the palace's buildings date from the early 15th and early 16th centuries. One of the most important features of the Palace is the facing with tiles (*azulejos*), the finest example of this Mudéjar technique on the Iberian Peninsula. The interior contains painted and tiled decoration and other features characteristic of the Mudéjar and late Gothic Manueline styles.

The Pena Palace, high on a peak in the Serra, is a work of pure Romanticism, designed by the Portuguese architect Possidónio da Silva. Ferdinand II conversion of the medieval monastery, which was abandoned after the 1755 earthquake reduced it to ruins, is eclectic in its use of Egyptian, Moorish, Gothic and Renaissance elements to produce an ensemble that is a pure expression of the Romantic Movement. Within the 19th century Palace are the church, cloister, and refectory of the 16th century monastery, richly decorated with *azulejos*.

The Palace of Monserrate was designed for Sir Francis Cook by the distinguished British architect James Knowles Junior. Again, it is an example of mid-19th century eclecticism, adapted to the remains of the earlier building, also ruined in the 1755 earthquake. It combines neo-Gothicism with substantial elements derived from the architecture of India. Monserrate is renowned for its gardens, largely the work of Thomas Gargill: careful analysis of the microclimatic zones of the land made it possible to plant over 3000 exotic species, collected from all parts of the world.

The earliest structure on the site of Quinta da Penha Verde was built by the 16th century Portuguese captain and viceroy João de Castro and enlarged by his heirs and successors. The ensemble is somewhat austere but has a harmony of its own, with a series of chapels dating from the 16th-18th centuries.

The Palace of Ribafrias, with its chapel, is in the centre of the town and was built in 1514 by the Royal Great Chamberlain, Gaspar Gonçalves. Its original rather severe lines have been softened by subsequent alterations, such as the insertion of Manueline and Pombaline windows into the facade.

The Moorish Castle, high on a peak of the Serra, might be of Visigothic origin; it was certainly used in the 9th century, during the Moorish occupation. It was finally abandoned with the successful *Reconquista* of Portugal from the Moors. Now in ruins, the remains of its barbican, keep and walls vividly illustrate the problems of constructing a fortress on a rocky outcrop of this kind.

Other buildings in this group are the Palace of Seteais (late 18th/early 19th century), the Quinta de Regaleira (late 17th century), and the Town Hall (early 20th century).

The Trinity Convent of the Arrabalde was founded by a group of monks from the Trinity Convent in Lisbon in 1374 in a quiet valley of the Serra. Their primitive hermitage was replaced by the first monastery in 1400 and reconstructed a century later. Following severe damage in the 1755 earthquake, much of it had to be rebuilt. The present small cloister dates from 1570 and the church largely from the late 18th century. It has retained the tranquillity that attracted the first monastic community to this site.

The Church of Santa Maria, with its three naves, represents the transition between Romanesque and Gothic of the mid-12th century. The facade and tower are from 1757.

Other churches in the town are the Sao Martinho and Sao Miguel parish churches (mainly post-1755), the former Sao Pedro de Canaferrim parish church inside the Moorish castle (12th century) and the Church of Nossa Senhora da Misericórdia (17th-18th centuries).

Work on the Parque de Pena was begun by Ferdinand II around 1840. Many species were brought from North America, Asia and New Zealand. The whole park covers 210 ha, including the Tapada do Mocho and the Moorish castle and is enclosed by a stone wall. The higher ground is covered with oak, cypress, and pine woodland, but nearer the castle there are more classical gardens, with parterres and some remarkable specimens of *Taxus baccata* and *Sequoia sempervirens*. Among the most notable features of these gardens are the Garden of the

Camellias and the "English Garden" with its unique specimens of cycas, and the Garden of the Feitoria da Condessa with its remarkable dendrological variety.

The Parque de Monserrate covers 50 ha on the northern slopes of the Serra. William Beckford's remodelling of the existing palace in the late 18th century involved the creation of a landscape garden. When he took over, Sir Francis Cook employed James Burt to design various sites for exotic gardens. The planned gardens are surrounded by a semi-natural oak forest.

Other prestigious homes were built along the same lines in the surrounding Serra de Sintra (also known as Monte da Lua, the Mountain of the Moon).

Major landmarks such as the Pena Castle, the Moorish Castle, the Church of São Pedro, Penha Verde, the Cruz Alta, and Palace of Seteais interact with one another and with the landscape; they have been restored earlier and have an authentic *raison d'être* with surprising views which differ from every angle.

Even though magnificent royal residences in the Romantic style are often to be found in 19th and 20th century Europe, Sintra is a pioneer work of European romanticism, bringing together its incredible botanical richness and a diversity of monuments and buildings from a long period of history. Sintra became the first centre of European Romantic architecture.

This cultural landscape is an extraordinary and unique complex of parks, gardens, palaces, country houses, monasteries and castles, which create an architecture that harmonizes with the exotic and overgrown vegetation, creating micro-landscapes of exotic and luxuriant beauty, such as Mexican cypress, Australian acacias and eucalyptus as well as pine trees. This amalgamation of exotic styles changes the landscape into an abundant world which offers surprises at every turn in the path, leading the visitor from a discovery to another. Its uniqueness and botanical richness presented to the visitor with great accuracy, and its charming environment make it unique among landscapes. This syncretism between nature and ancient monuments, villas and *quintas* with monasteries and chalets influenced the development of landscape architecture throughout Europe.

The World Heritage property has 946 ha and is surrounded by a buffer zone of 3,641 ha.

**Criterion (ii)**: In the 19th century, Sintra became the first centre of European Romantic architecture where this new sensitivity was displayed in the use of Gothic, Egyptian, Moorish and Renaissance elements and in the creation of parks, blending local and exotic species of trees. Ferdinand II (1836-1885) thereby developed romanticism in a splendid form that was unique in the Mediterranean region.

**Criterion (iv)**: The landscape is a unique example of European Romanticism with the cultural occupation of the northern slope of the Serra that has maintained its essential integrity as the representation of diverse successive cultures, as well as the associated flora and fauna. The romantic atmosphere, strengthened over time, and the reminders of the Victorian period as well as the exotic allusions are still potent and can be easily recognized throughout the landscape. The villas and quintas with their gardens and parks that cover the major area of the property correspond to a clearly defined landscape designed and created intentionally by people through landscape design.

**Criterion (v):** The cultural landscape, with its local and exotic vegetation - such as Mexican cypress, Australian acacias and eucalyptus, and pine trees -, its crests and piles of granite rocks covering the archaeological remains, palaces and parks, as well as the historic centre of Sintra and other fine dwellings, built along the same lines in the surrounding Serra, forms a continuing and organically evolved landscape, which has been sustained by painstaking restoration and preservation projects. This unique combination of parks and gardens turned the landscape into an abundant world, which offers surprises at every turn in the paths, leading the visitor from a discovery to another, and influenced the development of landscape architecture throughout Europe.

# Integrity

The state of conservation of historic buildings that are open to the public is excellent thanks to the appropriate maintenance and rehabilitation actions they have undergone, and the architectural surveys that have been conducted.

In cultural terms, the uniqueness of Sintra resides in the fact that, even though magnificent royal residences in the Romantic style are often to be found in 19th and 20th century Europe, the property is a pioneer work of European romanticism, bringing together its botanical richness and a diversity of monuments and buildings from a long time span in history. Within the boundaries of the 946 ha property are located all the elements necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of the Cultural Landscape of Sintra.

## Authenticity

Despite the transformations the landscape of Sintra went through in the 20th century, most of its buildings have preserved their structural authenticity, and so have its gardens and parks. Adaptation to modern times has not jeopardized the authenticity of the cultural landscape. The original design can still be traced in the most important parks such as Pena and Monserrate and in some of the small gardens included in this ensemble. The major landmarks such as the Palace of Pena, the Moorish Castle, the Palace of Sintra, the church of São Pedro, Penha Verde, the Cruz Alta, the Estate of Regaleira and the Palace of Seteais, that interact with one another and with the landscape, have been restored and retain their authenticity. Likewise, agricultural buildings that have preserved their activity show a satisfactory condition, as the small changes they went through are insignificant,

not jeopardizing the authenticity of the whole group of buildings. The romantic atmosphere, strengthened over time, and the reminders of the Victorian period, as well as the exotic references, are still strong and can be easily recognized in the landscape.

# **Protection and management requirements**

The Cultural Landscape of Sintra is part of the National Natural Park of Sintra - Cascais and has been protected by national legislation since 1994. Within its perimeter, there are numerous buildings classified as National Monuments - the highest level of legal protection - or Buildings with Public Interest, all of which are protected by specific Portuguese legislation introduced by the Ministry of Culture. The whole World Heritage property is classified as a National Monument as well. Parques de Sintra Monte da Lua S.A (PSML) is the manager responsible for the World Heritage property and parts of the buffer zone. It represents a number of stakeholders such as the Directorate General for Cultural Heritage, Portugal's Public Tourism Agency, the Municipality of Sintra and the Institute for the Conservation of Nature. Its technical experts are responsible for heritage rehabilitation. In the past 5 years, this consortium created new cultural facilities such as the Museum of Science, and rehabilitated more than 100 buildings in the Historic Centre of Sintra. Its latest restoration works took place in the Monserrate Palace and the Chalet da Condessa d'Edla. Professionally qualified staff ensures the preservation of existing species. Forest areas are cleaned every year in order to prevent fire during the hot season. PSML is in charge of the periodical control and cleaning of the forest, wall reconstruction, fire monitoring, enhancement of gardens and parks and promotional activities for local populations. The consortium promotes educational activities and registers an increase in the number of visitors, income and risk control, and minimizes negative impacts from urban speculation.

#### **Russian Federation**

Citadel, Ancient City and Fortress Buildings of Derbent

#### **Brief synthesis**

Derbent is located in Russia's Dagestan region, on the western coast of the Caspian Sea. It owes its rich history to its strategic position, along the travel route between Europe and the Middle East, on the border of Europe and Asia, where the mountains of the Caucasus almost arrive at the coast leaving a narrow 3-km strip of plain.

Physical evidence of Derbent's defensive role dates from the 7th or 8th century BCE, and, since the 1st millennium BC, control of the north-south passage on the western side of the Caspian Sea has been linked to this location. Archaeological excavations since the late 1970s have confirmed Derbent's nearly 2,000 years of continuous history as urban settlement, the oldest in Russia and one of the most ancient in the region. Evidence was found of a fortified settlement in the region of the citadel during the 3rd century BCE and 4th century CE, which was confirmed by historical documents; Greek-Roman authors knew this settlement by the name of Albanian gate and meanwhile the ancient Armenian authors called it the Chol/Chor.

The modern name of Derbent (from Persian *dar*, "gate", and *band*, "red, communication, barrier") is associated with a great fortification constructed in the 5th century by the Sasanian Empire. Two walls were constructed 300 to 400 m apart, extending approximately 3.6 km from the Caspian Sea up to the citadel situated on the mountain. The walls extend 500 m into the Caspian Sea to protect the harbour and the mountain wall continues 40 km west, over the mountains, defending the northern borders from warlike nomads by completely blocking the pass between the sea and the mountains. Seventy-three defence towers were constructed, 46 of which were in the north wall. Nine of the original 14 gates survive. During the 6th century, wall construction, for both the city walls and citadel, was characterized by dry armor-clad brickwork (poke and spoons) made of big rectangular blocks with ragged stone on lime mortar in its internal backfilling.

The citadel is surrounded on three sides by steep slopes and has massive stone walls between 2.5 m and 3.2 m thick, over 700 m in length and 10 to 15 m in height. Within the citadel, the ruins and archaeological remains of a number of buildings are found, including the Khan's Palace, a bath, several underground water tanks, a 5th-century Christian church, and an 8th-century mosque, one of the earliest in the former Soviet Union.

Between the parallel defence walls, the city was built with the commercial sector close to the waterfront and the residential buildings near the citadel. In the late 19th century, the southern wall was demolished, and a modern city developed along the seafront and beyond the remaining wall. Within the historic town, many buildings survive including courtyard houses, public buildings, mosques, baths, madrasahs, and the remains of a caravanserai.

Fortifications combined with the medieval buildings of the old part of the city, the so-called Magalims, form a unique cultural landscape. Derbent has largely maintained its original form and provides impressive evidence of the city's greatness and power in different historic periods over 15 centuries – Arab, Seljuk, Mongol, Timurid and Safavid periods until the 19th century when it became part of the Russian Empire. The property that is inscribed as the Citadel, Ancient City and Fortress Buildings of Derbent covers 9.7 ha and is surrounded by a 200-ha buffer zone.

**Criterion (iii):** The site of the ancient city of Derbent has been crucial for the control of the north-south passage on the west side of the Caspian Sea since the 1st millennium BCE. The defence structures that were built by the Sasanians in the 5th century CE were in continuous use by the succeeding Persian, Arabic, Mongol, and Timurid governments for some fifteen centuries.

**Criterion (iv):** The ancient city of Derbent and its defence structures are the most significant section of the strategic defence systems designed and built in the Sasanian Empire along their northern limes, and maintained during the successive governments until the Russian occupation in the 19th century.

#### Integrity

The World Heritage property "The Citadel, Ancient City and Fortress Buildings of Derbent" includes all necessary attributes demonstrating its Outstanding Universal Value, which are located inside the protected boundaries of its territory. Despite some loss to original fabric, including the 19th-century demolition of the south wall, much of the site has been preserved. The historic core of the town with its winding narrow streets survives, although a new main street was inserted.

Taking into consideration the location of monuments in vast territory, the integrity and conservation of each individual component of the World Heritage property is ensured by the approved boundaries and protected territories. Derbent's status as a World Heritage property and a monument of federal importance under State protection allows the conservation of all architectural objects and the archaeological and cultural layers that reflect city's evolution.

Identified threats to the site are landslides, particularly along the citadel's steep slopes, uncontrolled development in the area near the sea, and the looting of stones by residents for personal use. In addition, the walls are at risk by the growth of vegetation.

#### Authenticity

The level of authenticity of the complex is high. Its position between the mountains and the sea illustrates the importance of its original defensive setting. Although the defensive use of the citadel is no longer required, authenticity of form and design is evident in the old buildings between the fortress walls. Moreover, the city's historic layout has been preserved with the relationship of the citadel, remaining north wall, and winding street pattern in the medieval town which continues to have a residential population. Stone, the primary building material for the walls and historic buildings, is visible throughout the site. Recent conservation and partial restoration of architectural monuments have used traditional building techniques, materials and substances that correspond to the appropriate historical period. Its current historic layout, street patterns, and building use are supported by historical and archaeological evidence, such as artefacts, ancient writings, old maps and plans. Archaeological research is ongoing for non-excavated parts that conserve the authentic remains of the original buildings.

# Protection and management requirements

Management for the World Heritage property is the responsibility of the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation with the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Dagestan, which is considered the territorial authorized executive body. Derbent Historical-Architectural and Art Museum-Reserve has the responsibility for the management of the buildings within the property that have been identified as monuments of historical and cultural heritage. These buildings are owned by the state and protected under RSFSR Supreme Soviet Decree of 27.12.1991. The museum-reserve also takes care of the conservation of its historical and cultural heritage, regularly monitors the technical condition of the monuments and the whole territory, and provides access to the cultural interests and their participation in cultural life.

The museum, together with the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Dagestan, effectively protects the sites of cultural heritage located on the territory of Derbent, using legal, financial and organizational measures. All work to ensure conservation and protection of monuments within operational management is carried out in strict compliance with norms of federal and republican legislation. A management plan is currently being developed.

Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands

## **Brief Synthesis**

The Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands comprises six islands of the Solovetsky Archipelago situated in the western part of the White Sea, 290 km from Arkhangelsk, the centre of Arkhangelsky region.

Founded in the 1430s, the Solovetsky complex is an outstanding example of the tenacity, courage and diligence of monks of the Russian Orthodox Church in the inhospitable environment of Northern Europe. The complex is unique in its integrity and safeguarding of its religious, residential, domestic, defence and waterside constructions, its road network and irrigation systems of the Middle Ages harmoniously blended with the surrounding natural and cultural landscapes as well as archeological sites that reflect the ancient and medieval culture of the islands for six thousand years. The Solovetsky complex represents all periods of the history of the archipelago and the Russian North in general.

The Cultural and Historic Ensemble of the Solovetsky Archipelago comprises a monastery-fortress of 15th to the early 20th centuries, a former monastic village of 16th to the early 20th centuries, cells and hermitages of 16th to

the early 20th centuries, insular hydraulic and irrigation systems, sacred sites and dozens of settlements of 6 to the first millennia BC, groups of memorial constructions of the Solovetsky Special Prison Camp of 1923-1939 and the surrounding natural and cultural landscapes throughout the archipelago.

The heart of the historic and cultural complex of the archipelago is the architectural ensemble of the Solovetsky Monastery, which is a holistic unique architectural complex. Its constructions are characterized by their monumentality, individuality and integrity of all components resulting from the centuries-old tradition of building.

The Solovetsky historic and cultural complex is the only large set of monuments in northern latitudes, built from local boulders in combination with rare brick and forge iron produced on Solovki. The peculiar linear design of the facade and high density of buildings on small areas contribute to the integrity and architectural expression of the ensemble. The fortress is the only Russian fortification complex built with the use of large boulders, which adds greatly to its individuality.

The vast variety and uniqueness of the Solovetsky monuments together with the northern wilderness create a rare cultural and natural synthesis. Archeological studies over the last 20 years have identified some interesting new materials that expand the cultural context of the property.

The Solovki is often recognized by the public as one of the first and best known Soviet special purpose camps of the GULAG. The islands have been used as a place of exile since the 17th century.

**Criterion (iv):** The Solovetsky complex is an outstanding example of a monastic settlement in the inhospitable environment of northern Europe, which admirably illustrates the faith, tenacity and courage of late medieval religious communities. The subsequent history of the monastery is graphically illustrated by the wealth of remains of all types that have survived.

#### Integrity

All the identified attributes are within the property boundaries, which include the whole territory of the archipelago.

A number of the site's elements (buildings and structures) have been rehabilitated in the process of restoration and other works for the conservation of the cultural heritage, works which have revealed its values as a whole. However, these large-scale works, under certain conditions, can have a negative impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the site, and so can active development of the archipelago area, especially in the vicinity of the protected historical and cultural monuments.

The site is exposed to the severe subpolar climate. The specific ground conditions together with the abundance of water (lakes and swamps) and high humidity create difficult conditions for the site's preservation, which is why programs for current monitoring of buildings and constructions have been developed. Special engineering maintenance of the structures as well as mandatory archaeological research are provided by restoration projects.

# **Authenticity**

The elements of the site fully represent the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. The level of authenticity of the preserved buildings is high. Archaeological research is a mandatory step in implementation of preservation activities on cultural heritage sites.

Restoration and research activities carried out on the archipelago have had a positive effect on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

Sacred service has been brought back to the cathedrals and this fact has contributed to better perception of the heritage site by visitors.

The possession of most of the buildings is delivered to the Solovetsky Saviour Transfiguration Monastery, and they are used according to their original purpose. Some buildings are used by the Solovetsky historical, architectural and natural museum-reserve.

# Protection and management requirements

At present, the World Heritage Site is managed under the following documents at the level of the Russian Federation:

- Article 44 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation adopted by national vote on December 12, 1993;
- Federal Law No. 73-FZ dd. June 25, 2002 "On Cultural Heritage Sites (historical and cultural monuments) of the Peoples of the Russian Federation" the fundamental law of the Russian Federation for preservation, use, promotion and state protection of all cultural heritage sites in Russia;
- Resolution of the Council of Ministers of the RSFSR No.1327 dd. August 30, 1960 "On Further Improvement of Cultural Monuments Protection in the RSFSR". Under this normative legal act, the objects forming an integral part of the Solovetsky Monastery Architectural Ensemble are recognized as Cultural Heritage Sites;
- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1662-r dd. September 27, 2011 changed the name of the site to "The Ensemble of the Solovetsky Monastery and separate structures of the Solovetsky Archipelago Islands, the XVI century first half of the XX century" (Arkhangelsk region, Primorsky district). By this document all cultural heritage sites included in the Architectural Ensemble of the Solovetsky Monastery from 1960 were revised, their dating and names were made more specific;

- Order of the Ministry of Culture of Russia No. 1467 dd. November 27, 2012 on registration of the Solovetsky Monastery Ensemble and separate structures of the Solovetsky Archipelago Islands in the Unified State Register of Cultural Heritage Sites (historical and cultural monuments) of the Peoples of the Russian Federation;
- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 759-r dd. June 1, 2009, through which all the state protection powers in relation to the World Heritage property are exercised by the Ministry of Culture of Russia. This document grants the state protection powers to the Federal Authority of Cultural Heritage Sites Protection that ensures the most effective protection in the Russian Federation;
- Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 1939-r dd. October 1, 2014 "On approval of the set of organizational measures on the Solovetsky Archipelago preservation and development". These measures will be implemented by responsible federal executive authorities within the limits of the federal funds;
- Order of the Ministry of Culture of Russia No. 2333 dd. December 24, 2013 "On approval of the protection zones boundaries of the Cultural Heritage Sites of federal significance forming part of the Cultural Heritage Site of federal significance "The Ensemble of the Solovetsky Monastery and separate structures of the Solovetsky Archipelago Islands, the XVI century first half of the XX century" added to the World Heritage List (Solovetsky settlement, Primorsky district, Arkhangelsk region), as well as requirements to lands use policies and urban planning regulations within the boundaries of these zones";
- Order of the Ministry of Culture of Russia No. 946 dd. June 3, 2014 "On approval of the protection zones boundaries of the Cultural Heritage Sites of federal significance forming a part of the Cultural Heritage Site of federal significance "The Ensemble of the Solovetsky Monastery and separate structures of the Solovetsky Archipelago Islands, the 16th century first half of the 20th century" added to the World Heritage List (Arkhangelsk region, Primorsky district, Bolshoy Solovetsky island, Bolshaya Muksalma island, Anzer island and Bolshoy Zayatsky island), as well as requirements for lands use policies and urban planning regulations within the boundaries of these zones":
- Concept of preserving the Cultural Heritage of the Solovetsky Archipelago developed by the federal state unitary enterprise "Central Scientific-Restoration and Design Workshops" in 2013-2014 (on request of the Ministry of Culture of Russia) and approved by the resolution of the Board of the Russian Ministry of Culture on June 25, 2014 (Minutes No. 14). This includes status analysis and main issues in regard to the preservation of cultural heritage sites situated in the territory of the Solovetsky Archipelago and proposals on the order, terms and procedures of restoration activities.

In addition, a number of fundamental documents have been adopted at the level of the subject of the Russian Federation – Arkhangelsk region:

- State Program of Arkhangelsk region "Development of the Solovetsky Archipelago Infrastructure (2014-2019)" approved by the Resolution of the Government of Arkhangelsk region No. 314-pp dd. July 16, 2013;
- Development Strategy of the Solovetsky Archipelago as a unique site of historical, cultural and natural heritage approved by the Resolution of the Government of Arkhangelsk Region No. 310-rp dd. July 16, 2013. Requirements of the UNESCO World Heritage Committee for the preservation of the World Heritage Site "Historical and Cultural Ensemble of the Solovetsky Islands" were taken into account by making corresponding supplements to the above-mentioned strategy, which were approved by the Decree of the Government of Arkhangelsk Region No. 190-rp dd. July 21, 2015.

State institutions, the Russian Orthodox Church and the public of Russia work together to preserve and restore the Solovetsky Monastery Architectural Ensemble as a whole.

Proper coordination of all actions of the branches of government and the Russian Orthodox Church for the purpose of preservation and up-to-date development of the Archipelago as an integral site of the historical, cultural, natural and spiritual heritage is achieved through the application of the program-target method. Targeted programs (federal, regional, municipal) in accordance with the competence and established sphere of jurisdiction allow the development and reconciliation of the priorities of the federal, regional and local levels as well as relations between the state and the church; the accumulation and best use of resources to address the problems of the Solovetsky Archipelago development; and the evaluation of the effectiveness of the program measures through use of indicators and indices.

The choice of the program-target method as a basic approach to carry out the actions aimed at providing state support to the Government of the Arkhangelsk region to solve the issues of sustainable social and economic development of the Solovetsky Archipelago was recommended by the President of the Russian Federation to the Government of the Russian Federation in the Instruction No. Pr-1625 dd. June 25, 2012.

The Government of the Russian Federation through the Ministry of Culture of Russia provides long-term federal financing of the restoration works to the World Heritage property within the framework of the Federal Target Program "Culture of Russia (2012-2018)" (approved by the Resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation No. 186 dd. March 3, 2012) in accordance with the annual list of sites proposed by the Russian Orthodox Church for financing after its approval by the Patriarch of Moscow and All Russia. Restoration activities on the Solovetsky Islands are arranged and carried out in accordance with the Concept of preserving the Cultural Heritage of the Solovetsky Archipelago and the Action Plan up to 2018.

All the works being undertaken are aimed at scientific restoration with the recovery of the Cultural Heritage Sites' historical functions.

Historic and Architectural Complex of the Kazan Kremlin

# **Brief synthesis**

Built on a site inhabited since very ancient times, the Kazan Kremlin dates back to the Islamic period in the history of Volga Bulgaria, the Golden Horde and the Kazan Khanate. In the 10th-13th centuries, Kazan was a pre-Mongol Bulgar city with fortified trading settlement, surrounded by moats, ramparts and stockade. In the 12th century, a white stone fortress was constructed, and the city became an outpost on the northern border of Volga Bulgaria. In the 13th-16th centuries, the city developed in the framework of the Golden Horde and Kazan Khanate. In the first half of the 15th century, it became a capital of the state and an active political, military, administrative, commercial and cultural centre. It was conquered in 1552 by Ivan the Terrible and became the Christian See of the Volga Land and the East. The Kremlin, which in many respects kept the planning of an ancient Tatar fortress and which became an important centre of pilgrimage, consists of an outstanding group of historic buildings dating from the 16th to the 19th centuries, integrating remains of earlier structures of the 10th to the 16th centuries.

At present, the Kremlin includes several historical, architectural, and archaeological complexes, including: the fortifications, the Governor's Palace and Syuyumbeki's Tower, the Annunciation Cathedral, the Public Offices, the Saviour-Transfiguration Monastery, the Cadets' School, and the Cannon Foundry. The archaeological layers range from 3 m to 8 m in depth.

The citadel is an exceptional testimony of historical continuity and cultural diversity. Apart from its remarkable aesthetic qualities, the site has retained traces of its foundations in the 10th century, as well as from the Khanate period (15th to 16th centuries). The Kazan Kremlin is the last extant Tatar fortress with traces of its original town-planning conception in Russia. This historical citadel is a result from the interaction of various cultures – Bulgar, Golden Horde, medieval Kazan-Tatar, Italian, Russian, and modern Tatar. It is the northwestern limit of the spread of Islam, and the southern extremity of the Pskov-Novgorod style. The unique synthesis of Tatar and Russian architectural styles is reflected in its key monuments (Syuyumbeki's Tower, the Annunciation Cathedral, and the Saviour Tower). The ensemble is inseparable from its surroundings and the entire city, where the historic quarters form the buffer zone. The new mosque that was built within the complex can be understood as a new construction in a historic context. However, it should be noted that the construction reunites the ensemble of the Kremlin, enriches the architecture of the city and symbolizes the peaceful coexistence of different cultures, Islam and Christianity, which makes the mosque an exceptional monument.

**Criterion (ii):** The Kazan Kremlin complex represents exceptional testimony of historical continuity and cultural diversity over a long period of time, resulting in an important interchange of values generated by the different cultures.

**Criterion (iii):** The historic citadel represents an exceptional testimony of the Khanate period and is the only surviving Tartar fortress with traces of the original town-planning conception.

**Criterion (iv):** The Kazan Kremlin and its key monuments represent an outstanding example of a synthesis of Tatar and Russian influences in architecture, integrating different cultures (Bulgar, the Golden Horde, Tatar, Italian, and Russian), as well as showing the impact of Islam and Christianity.

# Integrity

The integrity of the complex is assured by the approved boundaries of the property, which includes all its attributes, and the buffer zone. It is an integrated complex enjoying its documentarily and archeologically proved centuries-old history, its urban fabric, centuries of continuity of functional planning development and the natural landscape.

The urban fabric of the Kazan Kremlin has formed the basis of the continuous development of the central part of Kazan city where the citadel is the centerpiece of composition. The unique integrity of the Kremlin is proved by a number of attributes within the property allowing the tracing of the process and results of its development.

The essential visual links between the property and the water landscape could be at risk from inappropriate development around the Kremlin. New construction within the property could damage its integrity and should be wholly exceptional.

#### Authenticity

Kazan Kremlin dates back to the 10th century, and its authenticity has been attested by a number of historical chronicles and historical writings (the Nikon Chronicle, the Rogozhsky Chronicler, the Novgorod chronicles, Story of the Tsardom of Kazan, Prince Kurbsky's Legendry about the Conquest of Kazan), abundant archaeological material, documents, and archival records, as well as by the urban structure itself. The original urban layout of the Kazan Kremlin has remained essentially unchanged from Bulgar times, and

has provided the basis for the continuous development of the town in all subsequent periods. In all their stylistic variety, the architectural monuments are perceived as an ensemble, and the Kremlin has remained a major compositional point of the city of Kazan.

In its history, the Kremlin area has gone through many changes, involving demolition and reconstruction. Some of the losses in the Stalinist period are regrettable and have subsequently required important interventions in terms of restoration and reconstruction. However, such changes can now be considered as part of its historical layers. In recent decades, there have been a large number of restorations in the different parts of the complex. The documentary evidence of the restoration has been preserved.

A special case in the Kremlin complex is the mosque of Koul Charif. There is no exact information about the original mosque, destroyed when the city was captured by Ivan the Terrible in 1552. The mosque can therefore be seen as a new building. The project for construction of a mosque was chosen at the architectural competition founded by the government. The approved project adheres to traditional vision of the spatial concept and decor; however, modern materials and structural systems are applied. This impressive construction can be seen as a sign of the continuity of a spiritual dialogue and balance between different cultures.

#### Protection and management requirements

Legislative and institutional frameworks for effective conservation and management support of the Outstanding Universal Value of the Historic and Architectural Complex of the Kazan Kremlin have been established by laws and regulations of the Russian Federation and the Republic of Tatarstan.

The status of a national listed monument under state protection has allowed conservation of all the architectural items and archeological cultural layers in good condition.

The site is managed and functions in accordance with the concept of museumification and development of the State Historical, Architectural and Art Museum-Preserve Kazan Kremlin of 2006-2020.

The key management issues include study, conservation and scientific restoration of the monuments, the museum affairs institution and the creation of new museums, as well as organization of the heavy flow of visitors and excursions for them in order to preserve all the characteristics intact.

In order to achieve statutory goals, to accumulate extra budgetary resources and to use them for conservation and development of the Complex there has been established the Guardian Council of the Museum-Reserve of Kazan Kremlin.

A long-term strategy defines the means of protection and management focused on the prevention of serious threats to the property, on the reduction of vulnerability and negative changes of the authenticity and integrity of the complex. These include an effective integrated legal system of management and cooperation of stakeholders, including municipal, republican, federal, non-governmental and religious organizations, funds, academic and educational institutions and the local population; resources management, an innovative combination of conservation, restoration, museumification and sustainable development of the complex territory and establishing of an integrated system of a new type of museums united by a common idea; creation of educational programs, a rapid introduction of cultural, scientific and pilgrimage tourism, as well as the combination of traditional and innovative methods of conservation and promotion of the Outstanding Universal Value of the Kazan Kremlin.

For the preservation of visual connections between monuments and a seascape, the assessment of potential influence of any new projects on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is made.

#### White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal

#### **Brief synthesis**

The ancient towns of Vladimir and Suzdal, the main towns of the ancient Russian principality in the 12th-13th centuries, are located in the centre of the European part of Russia, some 200 km east of Moscow, 30 km from each other. At this time, the towns developed their individual architecture and art school. These white-stone monuments are unique architectural creations, and part of the Russian treasure-house of culture.

The World Heritage property "White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal" is a serial property, made up monuments in Vladimir, Suzdal and Kideksha, five km to the east of Suzdal. In Vladimir are found the Cathedral of the Assumption, the Golden Gate, the Cathedral of the Nativity of the Virgin and the Staircase Tower of the Palace of Andrei Bogulyubsky in the Prince Castle in Bogulyubuvo, and the Church of the Intercession on River Nerl; the Kremlin and Cathedral of the Nativity and the Monastery of Our Saviour and St Euthymius are in Suzdal; and the Church of St Boris and St Gleb stands in Kideksha.

In Vladimir, the Cathedral of the Assumption (1158) was intended to be the religious centre of all Russia. It was built in the town Kremlin with three naves surmounted by a delicate drum and a helmet dome. Divided into five sections by embedded columns, the facade is notable for its carved reliefs. Most of the 12th-century frescoes were destroyed by Mongols in 1238, but new mural paintings were added in 1408 by the master painters Andrei Rublev and Daniil Chernii, in particular the famous "Last Judgment." The iconostasis is a fine Baroque example of 1774.

The Golden Gate (1164) forms part of the 12th-century defences, now demolished. It is a cubic tower with a church dedicated to the Deposition of the Holy Robe on top. The Princely Castle at Bogolyubovo (1165) contains the remains of the 12th-century Royal Palace, in the form of the Cathedral of the Nativity of the Virgin and the Staircase Tower of Andrei Bogolyubskii. The cathedral is a 17th-century building on the site of the original structure. The Church of the Intercession (1165) on the Nerl River is located opposite the original river gate of Vladimir. It has a single dome at the crossing and reliefs on the upper part of the exterior walls.

The Cathedral of St Demetrius (1194-97) is a royal church, cubic in form, with three internal naves and a helmet dome. The exterior has over a thousand stone carvings on the general theme of King David. 12th-century frescoes survive in the western part of the interior.

In Suzdal, the Kremlin (fortress) is surrounded by earthen ramparts. Within, dominating the whole town, stands the Cathedral of the Nativity, built in the 13th century and reconstructed in the 16th century, with its five-domed roof and 13th-century Golden Doors. Important monuments in the *posad* (civil settlement) include several cubic churches of the 16th and 17th centuries, such as the Convent of the Deposition of the Holy Robe and the Refectory Church of the Assumption, and several monasteries. The most important of the latter is the Monastery of Our Saviour and St Euthymius, founded in 1352, with its 16th-century Cathedral of the Transfiguration built in the 12th-century tradition of Vladimir.

On the right bank of the Nerl River, at Kideksha, is the Church of St Boris and St Gleb. It is of great architectural importance, since it was the first church in Russia to be built in white limestone, the style that came to characterize above all else the 12th-century architecture of Vladimir. It is small (15.5 m x 15.5 m) with three apses on its eastern side. It is plain, with little decoration, though remains of medieval frescoes were revealed in 1947.

The architecture of Vladimir-Suzdal is characterized by stonework faced in regular blocks of white limestone, refined proportions, fine stone carving, apparent lightness of buildings, and the skill of the ancient church architects in harmonizing their buildings with the surrounding natural landscape. The monuments are unique in view of their age, authenticity of architectural form, and historic links with the founders of the Russian statehood, such as Yuriy Dolgorukiy (Yuriy Long Hands), Andrey Bogolubskiy (Andrey of Bogolubovo), Vsevolod Bolshoe Gnezdo (Vsevolod the Large Nest) and Georgiy Vsevolodovich.

**Criterion (i)**: The White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal are outstanding examples of ancient Russian architecture. These white-stone structures are a unique phenomenon, incorporating the best work of creative master-minds and presenting an amazing synthesis of architecture and monumental art.

**Criterion (ii)**: The white-stone architecture of Vladimir and Suzdal is an outstanding example of the development and perfection of architectural shapes and white-stone building techniques which formed a unique school of architecture. This influential style began and achieved its greatest expression here and illustrates a most important stage of human history and culture in the North-East Rus. Widely used as an example for subsequent construction throughout Russian history, they set a standard as a benchmark of architectural beauty and expressiveness of Russian ecclesiastical architecture.

**Criterion (iv)**:The white-stone monuments and ensembles of the Vladimir and Suzdal school of architecture are outstanding examples of architectural art and perfect models of technical and construction skill, fully harmonized with the surrounding landscape. They exemplify the beginnings and the peak of the white-stone building style of the 12th-13th centuries, and are remarkable for a prominent harmony and perfection of architectural shapes.

#### Integrity

The White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal incorporates all required attributes to reflect its Outstanding Universal Value. Taking into account the dispersion of monuments across the Vladimir Region, the integrity of each particular component of the World Heritage property is ensured by the established boundaries and protection zones. The status of the cultural heritage of the peoples of the Russian Federation of special interest guarantees the highest level of state protection of the sites and ensures their continued conservation and protection. The monuments are at risk from atmospheric and vehicle pollution which can affect their white stone facades, and of high rise developments in their immediate vicinity which can disrupt the historic townscape.

#### Authenticity

For several decades, the buildings of Vladimir and Suzdal were the object of considerable efforts to develop cultural tourism, with consequent restoration works to them, carried out with proper respect for traditional techniques and materials. The monastery monuments maintain the ancient Russian traditions and authentic architectural decoration techniques. All restoration works carried out on the monuments in various periods were intended to conserve the authentic structures, through the use of the old construction methods, techniques and construction materials such as white stone, white lime, oversized bricks, wood and metal. The monasteries conserved their historic plans and ensured the replacement of traditional planting.

#### Protection and management requirements

Since 1958, the White Monuments of Vladimir and Suzdal have been part of the Vladimir-Suzdal historical, art and architectural reserve museum. In 1960 the monuments were taken under protection by decision of the Council of Ministers of the Russian Soviet Federative Socialist Republic (RSFSR). Since 1995, the monuments have been designated as cultural heritage sites at federal level, and in 1998 they were included, by Decree of the

Russian Federation President, on the State List of the cultural heritage of the peoples of the Russian Federation of special interest. The reserve museum, jointly with the state protection authorities, maintains an efficient protection of the sites using legal, financial and organizational mechanisms on the basis of the Federal laws of 25.06.2002 On Cultural Heritage Properties (Monuments of History and Culture) of the Peoples of the Russian Federation, Regulations on the Protection Zones of Cultural Heritage Sites (Monuments of History and Culture) of the Nations of the Russian Federation (enacted by Decree of the Government of the Russian Federation 2008), and the Law on Transfer to Religious Organisations of Assets Having a Religious Intended Purpose and Representing State or Municipal Property (2010).

Today, the monuments are in good condition. The museum manages the sites to ensure their conservation, monitors the conditions of the monuments and territories, and regulates the tourist services. The Uspenskiy (Assumption) cathedral is being used by the museum jointly with the Russian Orthodox Church, and the Church of the Intercession on the River Nerl in Vladimir is managed by the Russian Orthodox Church. The use of the monuments as the museum exhibits for ensuring their accessibility, coupled with their use by the church, enhances the authenticity and historic character of the buildings. As a result of recent restoration work, the whitestone walls and the white-stone carving of cathedrals are protected against atmospheric impacts. In order to preserve the wall paintings, climate control systems have been installed inside the cathedral. All works on the monuments for conservation and protection of white-stone structures, white-stone carving on the front walls, and monumental painting in the cathedral interior are accomplished according to the procedures approved by the Ministry of Culture of the Russian Federation.

A Management Plan is being developed. Buffer zones need to be developed for all the components of the property.

#### Sweden

Hanseatic Town of Visby

# **Brief Synthesis**

The Hanseatic Town of Visby is a unique example of a northern European medieval walled trading town with a preserved and notably complete townscape and assemblage of high-quality historic structures. Together these elements graphically illustrate the form and function of this type of significant human settlement, which still prevails as a living town.

Visby lies on the Island of Gotland, about 100 km east of the mainland in the Baltic Sea. The settlement, dating from the Viking Age, was formed on a shore with a natural harbour, sheltered by steep cliff formations. Gotlandic merchants utilized it as a strategic point in trade within the Baltic Sea. They allied for the protection of their trading posts which developed into a federation or Hansa. By the 12th century Visby had come to dominate this trade, and all the commercial routes of the Baltic were channelled through the town. After the foundation of Lübeck in 1143, German merchants began to expand their sphere of interest into the Baltic Sea and settled in Visby. It became the only trading place on the island with the privilege of trading with German towns and hence the main centre of the Hanseatic League. During the 13th century, Visby changed from a seasonal trading place into an impressive metropolis, enclosed by a strong defensive wall and increasingly divorced from its rural hinterland. The wall imposed new restrictions on the Gotlandic traders creating tensions that led to civil war in 1288. German, Russian and Danish traders built stone warehouses in parallel rows from the harbour and the community expanded with guild houses, churches and residences. In the 14th century, Visby began to lose its leading position in the Hanseatic League due to plague around 1350 and invasion by the Danish army under King Valdemar Atterdag in 1361. Warfare and piracy in the 15th century and changed trading routes bypassing Visby severely affected trade on Gotland and the economy of Visby deteriorated. The end of Visby's greatness came in 1525, when it was stormed by an army from Lübeck and the northern parts were partially burnt. In the 18th century Visby experienced a revival of trade and industry. Many warehouses were refurbished as housing and new buildings were added both on the ruins of earlier ones and on vegetable plots. The 19th century saw the construction of schools, a hospital, and a prison and the growth of a small shopping area on one of the main streets. The town began to expand beyond the medieval wall.

The 'inhabited historic town' includes the walled town and its immediate surroundings constituting an area of 105 ha. The urban fabric and overall townscape of Visby are its most important qualities. The well-preserved town wall, with its towers and gates, extends 3.4 km and is surrounded by dry moats and open spaces that together form a defensive network. Some of the limestone used as building material was quarried from here. Roads into the town through gates to the north, east and south, leading from the cliff to the harbour, date to the Viking era. The medieval street plan survives both above and below ground. Urban archaeology gives evidence to widespread building structures, streets paved with large limestone slabs and a sophisticated water and sewage system. The remains of over 200 warehouses and merchants' dwellings are predominantly in Romanesque style. Medieval Visby had more churches than any other town in Sweden: 15 within the walls and two outside. These buildings reflect several building phases with Romanesque and Gothic features, and they served various functions – parish, guild, monastic and hospital churches. Many fell into decay after they were abandoned during

the Reformation in the 1530s. Only St Mary's Cathedral survives and is still in ecclesiastical use. A large amount of small vernacular wooden houses from the 18th and 19th centuries featuring horizontal plank construction used since the Viking period remain intact. They are found mainly in the eastern parts of the town and on the site of the former Visborg Castle.

**Criterion (iv):** The Hanseatic Town of Visby is an outstanding example of a North European medieval walled town which reflects with remarkable completeness its essentially late 13th-century form and function as one of the most important trading towns of the Hanseatic League between 1161 and 1360. This is reflected in the well-preserved town wall, street pattern, church ruins, medieval buildings and townscape.

**Criterion (v):** Visby is a characteristic example of a traditional human settlement that has evolved over time through continuous adaptation to the medieval form and function. The inhabited historic town has prevailed under the influence of socio-economic and cultural change. This has resulted in a townscape in which the medieval walled trading town has been retained with distinctive layers over time until the present day. Functional continuity is reflected in its structure as a county, diocesan, commercial and residential town.

#### Integrity

The property includes the walled medieval town and the surrounding dry moats and open spaces. A significant proportion of the attributes are in good condition. The medieval urban plan is largely intact. The town wall has been subject to partial collapses over the years. The collapse of a section of the wall in 2012 led to a successful restoration and new knowledge about its state of conservation. The increasing use of the church ruins for events and activities requires the development of impact assessment and guidelines. On a building level, incremental change through alterations that disregard conservation principles results in a cumulative negative impact on heritage values. The visual integrity of the walled town and historic skyline is vulnerable as the town expands and develops. The functional continuity and structure of the town is vulnerable to the loss of functional diversity and traditional building skills. Certain key attributes are located outside of the property, e.g. the ruins of St George and Solberga monastery, the medieval gallows hill, limestone quarries and entry roads into the medieval town.

#### Authenticity

Visby is the best preserved North European walled town and example of a fortified commercial centre. It is the most complete of the early Hanseatic towns. The original form of Visby, displayed in its urban fabric and overall townscape, is its most important quality. The irregular street pattern and entry roads run from the cliff to the harbour, some with origins in the Viking era settlement. From its heyday as a Hanseatic trading centre, the limestone warehouses have maintained their dominance along three main streets parallel to the shoreline. The authenticity of the medieval building elements is demonstrated in shape and size, rectangular plan, and height and fabric. Subsequent layers of development have conformed to the medieval scale and town layout. The Gotlandic traditional lime production and use for stone, plaster and mortars have remained intact and play a crucial role in conservation and craftsmanship.

The town wall remains largely intact, and its high level of authenticity is exceptional. The well-preserved dry moats and open spaces surrounding the walled town form a fringe belt that accentuates and distinguishes the compact medieval town. Three parallel trenches in the northern parts of the wall are particularly distinctive. Twentieth-century urban planning took a Garden City approach to development beyond the wall, preserving considerable areas of open space with lower densities and strict control over building heights. While the medieval churches fell into decay, and lost their original function, the ruins are iconic carriers of architectural and historical significances that have remained more or less intact since the 19th century.

While Visby lost its function as a commercial metropolis during the 14th century, its urban continuity is still reflected in a living town with retail, business, residential, educational, cultural and tourist uses. The relocation of public authorities beyond the walled town has transformed its spirit of place as a vibrant office-based core into a largely seasonal residential area. Gotland and Visby are an attractive holiday destination and economically strong property owners are both an asset and a threat to the preservation of this environment.

# Protection and management requirements

The property ownership is mixed with public and private owners. The church ruins are owned and managed by the State, while St Mary's Cathedral is owned by the parish. The town wall and its towers are primarily owned by the local authority and have traditionally been managed by the state. A small number of landmark buildings remain in local authority ownership although several have been sold due to privatization processes. The majority of the domestic houses and commercial properties are in private ownership. The statutory 'detailed plan' for the walled town of Visby together with the associated building code regulates preservation of the built environment and new development within the walls under the Planning and Building Act, for which the municipality is responsible. In addition, 257 building monuments are designated by the state under the Cultural Heritage Act, which also protects the archaeological remains of the entire property. The property is recognized by the state as an 'area of national interest' under the Environmental Code.

In February 2010, the municipal council approved a statutory detailed conservation plan for the whole World Heritage property. This plan includes regulations concerning preservation. It also includes statutory building guidance, primarily for property owners, but also for municipal public areas.

Management of the property rests with several organizations. Gotland Municipality is the coordinating organization, with a site manager, carrying the overall responsibility through the City/Regional Council. A World Heritage Studio brings together different functions and departments within the municipality concerning conservation and development. The state manages the town wall and the church ruins. The County Administrative Board is responsible for implementing the Cultural Heritage Act and has a supervisory role in conservation on behalf of the state. The World Heritage Advisory Council consists of a steering committee of three key organizations; Gotland Municipality, the County Administrative Board and Gotland Museum, as well as other stakeholders such as representatives of residents, businesses, tourism, property owners, research and education. A World Heritage Forum is held annually to facilitate public engagement and dialogue on specific issues. The management plan from 2003 is under review. Its objectives are integrated with the Development Plan for Visby 2025. Management of the town wall is presently being reconsidered. Negotiations are underway between the Swedish National Heritage Board, having traditionally been responsible for its maintenance, and the owner, Gotland Municipality. Successful future management of the town wall requires both long-term funding and a clear agreement between the authorities. A buffer zone needs to be demarcated to address development pressure in the vicinity of the property. The building of a new harbour for larger cruise ships requires a sustainable tourism framework. Processes of privatization, gentrification and increased tourism threaten the functional diversity and social balance of the town. A strategy for risk management needs to be developed, including a fire protection system.

# Rock Carvings in Tanum

#### **Brief Synthesis**

The Rock Carvings in Tanum, located in the northern part of Bohuslän province in western Sweden (Västra Götaland County), are a unique artistic achievement for their rich and varied motifs (depictions of humans and animals, weapons, boats, and other symbols) and for the cultural and chronological unity they express. They reveal the life and beliefs of people living in the Nordic region of Bronze Age Europe, and are remarkable for their large numbers and outstanding quality. A cultural landscape with a continuity in settlement and consistency in land use that spans more than eight millennia, the area is rendered outstanding by its assemblage of Bronze Age rock art.

Northern Bohuslän is a land of granite bedrock, parts of which were scraped clean about 14,000 years ago as the Scandinavian Ice Sheet slowly moved northward, leaving gently curved rock faces exposed. These were the "canvases" selected by Bronze Age artists. There are at least 1,500 known rock carving sites in northern Bohuslän concentrated in certain areas, including the parish of Tanum. The carvings were executed by pecking and grinding the rock using stone hammers and points. The panels of rock art, skilfully created with simple tools, show a rich diversity of compositions of the highest quality, even when regarded simply as works of art or design. Compared to other similar contexts, these motifs and scenes are even more outstanding in their ability to convey reflections of life and cosmology during the Nordic Bronze Age (c. 1700 BC – 500 BC). It is obvious that the intention of these panels, which are often situated in commanding positions in the landscape, is to convey messages, thereby confirming their role as primary contemporary centres for worship and cult.

The Rock Carvings in Tanum represent a unique artistic achievement through their skilful and detailed depictions of animals, humans, ships, weapons, and symbols of the Bronze Age. These sometimes include lively scenes and complex compositions of elaborate motifs from travel, status, power, warfare, and cult. Some panels, or rather parts of them, were obviously planned in advance. Probably the most evident example of this is the panel at Fossum. In many cases, these motifs, techniques, and compositions create an exceptional testimony to the culture of the European Bronze Age.

**Criterion (i):** The rock carvings of the Tanum region constitute an outstanding example of Bronze Age art of the highest quality.

**Criterion (iii):** The range of motifs on the Tanum rock carvings provides exceptional evidence of many aspects of life in the European Bronze Age.

**Criterion (iv):** The continuity of settlement and the ongoing practice of agriculture, as illustrated by the Tanum region's rock carvings, archaeological vestiges, and modern landscape features, combine to demonstrate a remarkable permanence during eight thousand years of human history.

#### Integrity

Within the boundaries of the 4,137.609 ha property are located all the elements necessary to express the Outstanding Universal Value of Rock Carvings in Tanum, including over 600 known rock carving sites, which is the highest density of such panels in northern Europe. The integrity and completeness of this area is illustrated in the centrally situated Tanum plain, where rock carving sites occur in zones in the plain's western and northeastern peripheries. The great majority of known settlements and prehistoric cemeteries are located at the northern and eastern edges of this plain. The boundaries thus adequately ensure the complete representation of the features and processes that convey the property's significance. No buffer zone has been defined.

The property in general does not suffer from adverse effects of development and/or neglect. A significant proportion of the carvings are well preserved, although a few vulnerable sites are in the process of ongoing degradation. An upgrading of the E6 highway, which crosses parts of this property, was planned at the time of its inscription. Swedish authorities worked jointly with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS and reached a satisfactory solution in 2009 to protect the attributes that sustain the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. Eleven wind turbines located about 5 km northeast of the World Heritage property were approved according to Swedish legislation and completed in 2014. Studies indicate that the impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is negligible. One wind farm approximately 10 km north of the World Heritage property is planned.

#### Authenticity

Rock Carvings in Tanum is entirely authentic in location and setting, forms and designs, materials and substances, and spirit and feeling, as substantiated by scientific studies of the carvings themselves and by comparative typological studies of dated Bronze Age art on other archaeological artefacts. The authenticity is expressed not only in the panels themselves, but also in the adjacent terrain, which may contain evidence of rituals and other practices connected to them. This authenticity has been maintained. The consistency in land use with its ongoing practice of agriculture makes it possible to understand the location of the panels close to the Bronze Age sea level. This also reinforces the authenticity of the property. In Tanum, as in the rest of Scandinavia, figures at selected rock carving sites have been repeatedly painted over the past five or six decades, since their granitic environment can make them difficult to distinguish. Today, only a few carefully selected exposed panels are painted with a non-destructive paint by trained specialists. Future structural changes in farming and agriculture may threaten the qualities of the open cultivated landscape.

#### Protection and management requirements

Rock Carvings in Tanum is designated as an Area of National Interest, and as such is protected under the Environmental Code (2010) and the Planning and Building Act (1987). A major part of this property includes about 1,000 individual monuments or groups of monuments that are protected under the Cultural Heritage Act (1998). All the rock carvings in the property are located on privately owned land except for part of those on Vitlycke Farm, which are owned by the Museum of Rock Carvings at Vitlycke. In 2012 the Management Council adopted a management plan that includes a vision and objectives for protecting and managing the property. The plan has a yearly revised plan of action focusing on organization, increased engagement of the local population, monitoring, sustainable tourism, and a full documentation of all panels (due to be finished in 2020). Three international research and development projects as well as comprehensive programs for recording damage have created vital basic knowledge for the implementation of future protection programs.

Sustaining the Outstanding Universal Value of the property over time will require ensuring the municipal master plan: continues to address wind energy issues, including impeding wind turbines within the World Heritage property; continues to identify areas outside the property with respect to the cultural and natural values of the landscape as a whole; and continues to examine the question of how increased sustainable tourism may contribute to the economic development of the region. Important steps in the latter include the creation of a rest stop in conjunction with the new E6 highway, as a gateway to the World Heritage property and with information about the area, and an increase in the visitor capacity of Vitlycke Museum. The museum, including the re-creation of a Bronze Age farm, plays an important role in helping visitors to decipher the rock carvings and the landscape. Its capacity as a visitor and management centre will be strengthened in coming years. The vulnerable sites in the process of ongoing degradation should continue to be closely monitored, and any degradation counteracted according to accepted international practices.

# LATIN AMERICA AND THE CARRIBBEAN / AMÉRIQUE LATINE ET CARAÏBES

## **Dominica**

Morne Trois Pitons National Park

#### **Brief Synthesis**

A rugged mountain range featuring steep volcanoes and deep canyons forms the natural spine of Dominica, a volcanic island of the Lesser Antilles. Morne Trois Pitons National Park (MTPNP) protects a scenically striking part in the central and southern highlands with an extension of 6,857 hectares, roughly 9 percent of the country's land area. The centerpiece is Morne Trois Pitons, one of five live volcanic centers within the park. Above 1,300 m.a.s.l., this spectacular dome complex is the highest peak within the property. The park's landscape is dominated by the extreme relief covered by various types of tropical forest against the dramatic backdrop of diverse volcanic topography and features. The scenic beauty is further complemented by numerous natural lakes and pools, including Boeri Lake and Freshwater Lake, the country's largest lakes. Countless rivers and creeks originate in MTPNP, often forming magnificent waterfalls on their way towards the ocean.

Within MTPNP there are massive volcanic piles surrounded by precipitous glacis slopes and soufrieres, in particular the Grand Soufriere or Valley of Desolation. In this large amphitheater-like area surrounded by mountains, the volcanic activity is displayed in the form of streams of various colors interspersed with fumaroles and hot springs, bubbling mud ponds and the aptly named Boiling Lake. The latter is a massive hot spring with a water temperature of about 95°C. Surrounded by steep cliffs, the lake is one of the largest of its kind in the world. It constantly bubbles and churns, with steam emitting an almost surreal sound. Water level and coloration vary greatly.

The barren vegetation in the Valley of Desolation contrasts sharply with the lush vegetation dominating the landscape elsewhere. The rugged and abrupt relief results in a highly varied mosaic of vegetation and habitats. At least five forest types can be distinguished, including rare Elfin or cloud forest at the highest elevations. Overall, the forests are in a remarkably good conservation state within a region that has otherwise lost most of its historic forest cover. MTPNP is known for its rich, partially endemic flora and remarkable fauna. The property boasts major freshwater resources, including the headwaters of the streams and rivers in the southern half of the island.

**Criterion (viii):** The property encompasses extraordinary and intact examples and arrays of geomorphologic features as a result of a series of volcanic eruptions. The distinctive geology and landforms of Morne Trois Pitons National Park are comprised of three major types of geological formations: volcanic piles, glacis slopes and soufrieres. The property displays a magnificent spectrum of volcanic activity in the form of streams of various colors interspersed with fumaroles, mud ponds and hot springs, including the massive Boiling Lake. Ongoing geomorphological processes of reduction are taking place in a largely undisturbed setting of stunning scenic value and major scientific interest.

**Criterion (x):** Morne Trois Pitons National Park is home to one of the very rare largely intact forest areas remaining in the Insular Caribbean, a region recognized through various priority-setting exercises as a highly threatened biodiversity region and center of endemism of global importance. Along extreme altitudinal and microclimatic gradients an impressive variety of forest types has evolved featuring a highly diverse flora with many endemic vascular plant species. There are also endemic reptiles and amphibians and a noteworthy number of bird species, including the Imperial Parrot and the vulnerable Red-Necked Parrot, which are endemic to Dominica. Much of the biological wealth remains to be documented and research is likely to reveal further biodiversity secrets.

#### Integrity

While the property is not very large in absolute terms, it covers a significant area of the relatively small island of Dominica. The boundaries adequately cover the geological and volcanic features and phenomena, and include representative areas of the various tropical forest types. The forests harbor a microcosm of Dominica's biological diversity and species endemism, and provide intact and protected habitat for a wide diversity of flora and fauna, including a range of endemic species across several taxonomic groups.

Most of the property is in a good state of conservation. There is a high degree of natural protection as a function of the harsh terrain and the lack of road infrastructure in most of the property. While historic land and resource use is poorly documented, there are no human settlements within MTPNP's boundaries today and there are no major population centers in the immediate vicinity. Minor impacts have included a small quarry, agricultural encroachment in the south of the property and the legally permitted water and power rights granted to Dominica's Electric Utility Company which have so far been used in a responsible way.

As long as the legal requirements are maintained and de facto enforced, the park's essential attributes and natural heritage values are not under any immediate threat.

## Protection and management requirements

Some historic accounts suggest that the conservation of Dominica's interior forests may be in part related to the original inhabitants' fierce resistance to settlements. The formal conservation history of Morne Trois Pitons National Park dates back to the 1950s when the area was first proposed as a forest reserve. MTPNP was designated in 1975 as the country's first national park under the provisions of the National Parks and Protected Areas Act. The responsibility for the protection and management rests with the Division of Forestry, Wildlife and National Parks of the Ministry of Agriculture and Fisheries. Day to day responsibilities for the MTPNP resides in the National Parks Unit of the Division, headquartered in the nearby capital of Roseau. The development and management of the Morne Trois Pitons National Park is guided by management plans covering periods of several years.

While the property is in a good state of conservation, it is not immune from the many threats and challenges well known in Caribbean island settings. There are a number of invasive alien species, such as opossum and agouti, as well as feral cats, pigs and rats. The impacts are poorly monitored and understood. Consequently, a better understanding is needed. More decisively, MTPNP's importance for hydropower, geothermal energy and drinking water is reflected in conservation legislation. Corresponding rights have been granted to the governmental electric power provider. Possible further energy development and transmission, as well as use of geothermal energy, are permitted and require a careful balancing between conservation requirements and competing societal demands.

Dominica is susceptible to heavy tropical storms. Major hurricane events occurred for example in 1979 and 1980 resulting in major damage to the forests. Another issue is tourism, which remains localized due to the poor

infrastructure. A cable car construction project through the centre of the property was not approved, yet serves as a reminder of the delicate balance between benefits and risks associated with tourism development in protected areas.

In terms of both species conservation and awareness-raising, the Imperial Parrot or Sisserou, the island's national bird featured on the national flag, is of high symbolical value. Some of its key habitat is known to be outside of the park suggesting room for further optimization of the boundaries.

From the very beginning MTPNP has been suffering from funding and staffing shortages and a heavy reliance on external support. Future management will have to ensure that the above described threats can be responded to through the allocation of adequate funding and the consolidation of capacities.