REPORT OF THE REACTIVE MONITORING MISSION

to the

RICE TERRACES OF THE PHILIPPINE CORDILLERAS WORLD HERITAGE SITE IN DANGER

Ifugao Province, Philippines 29 May - 5 June 2005

by

Richard Engelhardt

Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific

Mauro Greppi

Professor in Hydraulics Engineering, University of Milan

Ricardo L. Favis

Consultant for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Office

Contents	
Section	Page
Reactive Monitoring Mission to Ifugao Province	
Background to the Mission	2
Observations	4
Recommendations	8
National Workshop on the Conservation of Philippine World Heritage Sites	
Background and Proceedings	9
Observations and Recommendations	11
Action Plan	12
Annexes	
List of Parties Consulted during the Mission	13
Programme of the Reactive Monitoring Mission	14
Reports on River Control by Prof. Mauro Greppi	15
Reports on the Philippine World Heritage Sites	26

REACTIVE MONITORING MISSION TO IFUGAO PROVINCE

Background

The Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras was inscribed in the World Heritage List in 1995. World Heritage status was applied to five rice terrace clusters within four municipalities, which are as follows:

- Banaue Municipality: Battad cluster and Bangaan cluster
- Hungduan Municipality: Inmilog-Abatan cluster
- Kiangan Municipality: Nagacadan cluster
- Mayoyao Municipality: Central Mayoyao cluster

As a result of a decision of the World Heritage Committee during its 24th Session in Cairns, Australia (December 2000), a joint ICOMOS-IUCN reactive monitoring mission visited the site in September 2001. Upon submission of the report of the State of Conservation Monitoring Mission of ICOMOS and IUCN to the World Heritage Center, the World Heritage Committee during its 35th session in December 2001 decided to place the Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras in the list of World Heritage Sites in Danger. At the same time, the World Heritage Committee approved an Emergency Technical Request for the Enhancement of Conservation and Management of the site. This assistance amounting to US\$ 75,000 was implemented under the authority of the Director of UNESCO World Heritage Centre, and under the supervision by the UNESCO Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific. The Emergency Technical Assistance Programme was implemented during the period from March 2003 to June 2004.

The World Heritage Site was managed in succession by: The Ifugao Rice Terrace Commission (ITC) – from 1994 to 1999 The Banaue Rice Terraces Task Force (BRTTF) – from 1999 to February 2002 Provincial Government of Ifugao – from February 2002 to the present

In early 2004, the Japan Bank for International Cooperation (JBIC) commissioned the Tokyo Electric Power Services Co., Ltd (TEPSCO) to conduct a pilot study within the Rice Terraces of the Philippines World Heritage Site in Danger in order to identify and formulate a project to support the future conservation of the site. More specifically, the study aims at formulating a project which will generate/secure funds for conservation activity for the Terraces by developing locally available resources, such as agricultural, forestry, fisheries and natural energy. The selected project would then be submitted for direct assistance under a Japanese Overseas Development Assistance (ODA) low-interest loan.

From March to May 2004, TEPSCO conducted Phase I of the study, during which the development of a mini-hydropower plant was singled out as the only viable project that could be undertaken, with a viable rate of return on the host province and community for long-term conservation of the rice terraces. The proposed site of the mini-hydro plant is the same site where the river control project has been constructed in the village of Hapao, Municipality of Hungduan, Ifugao Province. The cost of the project was estimated at Philippine Peso 821 million (US\$ 16.3 million).

Mr. Favis was invited by TEPSCO to take part and act as advisor during a Workshop and Project Steering Committee Meeting in Banaue from 15-17 July 2004, during which the findings of Phase I were presented to the local stakeholders. In attendance during the Workshop and Project Steering Committee Meeting were the representative of the Japan Bank for International Cooperation, representatives from TEPSCO and the National Power Corporation (national agency responsible for electric power generation), as well as government officials.

After reviewing the project report prepared by TEPSCO, inspecting the proposed site in the village of Hapao, and participating in a consultation meeting with the local villagers, Mr. Favis observed the following:

- that it was also feasible to build the mini-hydro plant in other sites outside the World Heritage Site but within the Province of Ifugao;
- that the project will have some negative impact on the environment, as stipulated in the project report of TEPSCO
- that the economic benefit to the local inhabitants living within the World Heritage Site will be minimal, if existent, considering that the project is under a loan package
- that the massive infrastructure project would have a negative impact on the integrity, authenticity and aesthetic value of the landscape

With his findings, Mr. Favis discouraged building the infrastructure project in the proposed site in the village of Hapao. Instead, he encouraged the project proponents to build the mini-hydro plant elsewhere in one of the alternative sites identified by TEPSCO outside the World Heritage Site. The other party to the Steering Committee Meeting, the representative of the JBIC Manila Office would not also endorse the construction of a mini-hydroplant within the World Heritage Site, considering that JBIC has signed a Cooperation Agreement on the Protection of World Heritage with UNESCO World Heritage Center. Considering that the representatives from UNESCO and JBIC-Manila Office have voiced their objections over the siting of the mini-hydro plant in the area selected by TEPSCO (which was located within the World Heritage Site), the project did not progress. Apparently, the project proponents have selected an alternative site for the mini-hydro plant outside the World Heritage Site.

In 1 December 2004, the Embassy of Japan to the Philippines approved for funding a project proposal entitled "Construction of Flood Controls in the Three Barangays (villages) of Hungduan for the Preservation of the Rice Terraces", which was submitted by the Mayor of Hungduan. (The proposed flood control project is to be located at exactly the same spot where the mini-hydro plant was supposed to have been built). On 20 December 2004, the Office of the Urban Asset Reform – Program Management Office of the Office of the President of the Philippines referred the project to the UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines for clearance. On 6 January 2005, the UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines referred the matter to the Office of the UNESCO Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific suggested to the UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines to refer the matter to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, considering that the UNESCO Bangkok Office does not have the technical expertise

to evaluate any physical intervention proposed at any World Heritage Site. Against this background, the Permanent Delegation of the Philippines referred the matter directly to the World Heritage Centre.

In his letter to the Permanent Delegation of the Philippines to UNESCO dated 12 April 2005, the Director of the World Heritage Centre proposed to arrange for a Reactive Monitoring Mission to the site, which took place from 20 May to 5 June 2005. Those invited to participate in the Mission were:

- Mr. Richard Engelhardt, UNESCO Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific
- Mr. Mauro Greppi, a Professor of Hydraulics Engineering at the University of Milan
- Mr. Ricardo Favis, a Consultant for Culture of the Office of the UNESCO Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific

To dovetail with the Reactive Monitoring Mission to the Philippines, the UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines organized a National Workshop on the Conservation of Philippine World Heritage Sites, which was held from 3-4 June in Manila.

Unfortunately, Mr. Engelhardt was not able to join the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Ifugao Province which took place from 29 May – 2 June 2005, due to unforeseen circumstances that prevented him from leaving Bangkok on the 29 May. Only Professor Mauro Greppi and Mr. Ricardo Favis were able to undertake the mission to Ifugao Province. Mr. Engelhardt was able to leave Bangkok on 2 June 2005 and participated during the National Workshop on the Conservation of Philippine World Heritage Sites which was held from 3-4 June 2005 in Manila.

Mr. Alessandro Balsamo also participated during the National Workshop on the Conservation of the Philippine World Heritage Sites, prior to his mission to the Batanes Archipelago and Archaeological Landscape during which he discussed with local stakeholders on how the nomination dossier of their site should be re-written.

Observations of the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Ifugao Province

On 31 May 2005, the mission conducted a field visit to the river control project located at the villages of Baang, Nangulunan and Hapao in the Municipality of Hungduan. The mission observed the following:

- 1. At the time of the mission, the river control project was already about 90 percent completed. As such, the infrastructure can no longer be removed nor reconstructed to conform with more appropriate designs, from the points of view of engineering design and aesthetics.
- 2. The river control project, located at a river bend, consists of one kilometer (1,004 LM) of continuous stone masonry walls on both banks of the river. The walls are free-standing, without any foundation and without reinforcement. On the average, the concrete walls are one meter thick on the base, tapering to a width of 60 centimeters on top, and their heights from 3 to 4 meters. From the engineering point of view, the structures are very unstable and would easily topple down

during times of flash floods and/or when the river water level rises up to a precarious level. The weight of the river water, the water friction on the walls and the mechanics of torque are factors which should have been considered in the design of the walls, but were not. Moreover, there is a wide gap of space between the walls and the river bank, which should be filled up with boulders and earth, and planted over with shrubs to help stabilize the inadequately designed stone masonry walls and to help camouflage the distastefully-designed concrete structure. Furthermore, the stone masonry walls were built in sections, and each section has a different height from the adjoining ones. This difference in height of each section is very visible and adds to the unpleasant appearance of the massive walls. Another feature of the constructed walls is the lack of reinforcing bars required to enhance the strength of the stone masonry walls. According to Mr. Greppi, the un-reinforced wall would easily break up during severe flooding and accelerated river flows. (For more detailed report on the design and structure of the river and pictures of the river control project, please refer to the Annex 1: Technical Report of Mr. Mauro Greppi).

- 3. At the site where the one-kilometer river control walls are constructed, the rice fields cover up to the edge of the river bank, which is elevated from one to three meters above the level of the river (and the base of the river control walls) during the time of the mission. When one considers the sloping topography of the rice fields located along the banks of the river within the area in question, only a minimal portion of the rice fields, within that 1-kilometer long strip, would be inundated during flooding, even if the river water level rises up to four meters. Based on this analysis, the construction of the river control walls may not even be necessary. According to the attached report of Mr. Greppi, the soil erosion along the affected river bank could have been addressed by simply moving the boulders and stones strewn along the river bed and utilizing them, with soil and vegetation, to reinforce the river banks, using bio-engineering techniques.
- 4. The project was constructed under the supervision of the Municipal Engineer of Hungduan, who designed the river control walls like those of previous stone and masonry walls constructed in Hungduan. Apparently, the Municipal Engineer did not conduct a hydrological study of the river basin, research on the rise in water level during rainy/flooding season, river flow velocity, frequency of discharge and other technical aspects which are required before an effective river control strategy can be formulated.
- 5. The landscape of the Inmilog-Abatan rice terrace cluster (which is a part of the World Heritage Site), within which the river control project is located, has an outstanding aesthetic value. Considering that the river flows through the catchment area of the basin of the valley where the Inmilog-Abatan rice terrace cluster is located, the river control project is very visible from many vantage points along the road which runs parallel to the river. The visual impact of the infrastructure project can be best seen from the viewing deck which is located along the road at the village of Hapao. The mission has observed that the one-kilometer river control walls on both banks of the river have a negative impact on the aesthetic value of the landscape.

Following the site inspection of the river control project, the mission proceeded to the Municipal Hall of Hungduan where a meeting with government officials from the national, provincial, municipal and village levels was conducted after lunch. The highlights of meeting are as follows:

- Mr. Mauro Greppi gave his initial comments regarding the river control project, particularly the construction of the stone masonry walls. He pointed out that the free-standing, un-reinforced stone masonry walls constructed at the site in question are very unstable and would easily break or topple down during flooding. He also gave a powerpoint presentation on case studies of river control projects which are environment-friendly and inexpensive, using modern bio-engineering techniques utilizing stones, earth and shrubs. Mr. Greppi recommended that the responsible parties backfill the gap between the river control walls and the river bank a corrective measure which may help stabilize the walls.
- Director Espinosa of the Office of Urban Asset Reform Program Management Office of the Office of the President of the Philippines, which facilitated the approval of the Philippine Peso 5.5 million (approximately US\$ 100,000) Japanese grant to construct the river control project, explained the background of the project. As explained, the river control walls were originally designed with reinforcing steel bars. At a later stage, the Municipal Mayor of Hungduan requested the concerned party at the Japanese Embassy to the Philippines to extend the length of the walls up to 1 kilometer in length at both banks of the river by utilizing savings obtained from removing the reinforcing steel bars from the walls a request which was approved by the Embassy. (This is quite surprising, considering that the Japanese Embassy has got a lot of expertise within its existing network, in assessing the structural integrity of the walls of a simple river control project).
- The Congressman of the Lone District of Ifugao Province, the Mayor and the Vice Mayor of the Municipality of Hungduan took turns in justifying the project, as follows:
 - that the infrastructure project has been approved by all concerned government agencies, including the Department of Public Works and Highways, and as such, they are forced to implement the project within the timeframe approved by the Japanese Embassy;
 - that the design of the river control project is similar to other stonewalls constructed in the province;
 - that infrastructure projects, such as roads and bridges are required to enhance the standard of living of the people in Ifugao Province, which is one of the poorest provinces in the Philippines;
 - that infrastructure projects are required to conform with the design standards, policies and guidelines set of the Department of Public Works and Highways design standards which have proven to be appropriate for infrastructure projects within World Heritage Sites.
- The government officials, particularly the Congressman of Ifugao, were highly critical of UNESCO's intervention over proposed infrastructure project within

the World Heritage Site. According to the officials, they exert so much effort on having their infrastructure projects get funded by the government or external sources, and that after some of their infrastructure projects get approved and funded, UNESCO would then intervene and disapprove such projects, causing those projects to be derailed. The Congressman made reference to the earlier project proposal for the construction of a mini-hydro plant which was supposed to be built at the <u>same spot where the river control</u> <u>project has been constructed</u>. One can only wonder why something has to be built on that same spot in the same village which is included in the World Heritage Site

- Considering that infrastructure projects, wherever they are located in the Philippines, are required to conform with national standards, policies and guidelines set by the Department of Public Works and Highways, and subject to standard auditing procedures of the Philippine Commission on Audits, the local officials mentioned that it is extremely difficult, if not impossible, for them to implement infrastructure projects (i.e. road, bridges. Etc.) which are designed differently from the standards set by the national agencies. As such, they would like to arrange for a high official of UNESCO to appear before a Congressional or Senate Hearing to justify the need to modify certain design standards for infrastructure projects proposed to be built within Philippine World Heritage Sites.
- The government officials expressed their hopes that, in the future, UNESCO would be more understanding of the needs of the Province, and would endorse, rather than disapprove, infrastructure projects that would benefit the province. It was pointed out that major road projects funded under Overseas Development Assistance Programmes (ODA) are about to be started within the province. These infrastructure projects include, but not limited to, a road which will link the municipalities of Hungduan and Tinoc in Ifugao with the Benguet Province and the road which will link the municipalities of Banaue and Mayoyao of Ifugao Province to Bontoc Province. It should be noted that rice terraces located in the municipalities of Hungduan, Banaue and Mayoyao are included in the World Heritage Site.
- The local officials requested for UNESCO guidelines which they can use in planning for future infrastructure projects. (A copy of the Operating Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention was given to the Provincial Board Member responsible for tourism during the National Workshop for the Conservation of Philippine World Heritage Sites which was held 2 days later in Manila).
- In closing, the mission expressed its concern over infrastructure projects which further degrade the value of the site, considering that the site is already endangered. The mission explained that World Heritage Sites requires special protection, effective management systems and appropriate infrastructure projects to preserve the values for which they are inscribed. When the universal value of a World Heritage Site has significantly deteriorated due to both natural and man-made causes, the site is placed in the List of World Heritage Sites in Danger, as in the case of the Rice Terraces of the Philippine

World Heritage Site. If the site suffers further degradation, as in the case of infrastructure projects which have a negative impact on environment and site integrity, then the site may be removed from the World Heritage List. The mission reminded the officials that UNESCO cannot impose its will on a State Party; and that UNESCO can only suggest what is good for a World Heritage Site. The mission promised to bring the sentiments of the local government officials to UNESCO.

Recommendations of the Reactive Monitoring Mission to Ifugao Province

- 1. Considering that the river control project is almost complete, and that the stone and masonry walls can no longer be destroyed and cleared from the site, the concerned local parties should follow the suggestions of Mr. Greppi in his report (see attachment), using biotechnology. In simple terms, the first step is to increase the width of the bottom of the existing wall with reinforced concrete of adequate thickness and anchored to the base of the existing wall with reinforcing bars. Secondly, the existing gap between the wall and the river embankment should be filled up with stones, gravel and earth. The final step would be to plant vegetations on top of the backfill, to strengthen the surface and improve the appearance of the project site. It should be noted that this corrective measure is only to prevent the wall from toppling down during flooding and fast river current flows. However, the measure does not correct the degradation of the site.
- 2. The problem could have been averted if there is a site management authority with qualified staff, a significant degree of independence, and transparency in its operations. At present, all engineers in the provincial and municipal level only know about the technology of concrete, which is detrimental to the site integrity, particularly in a cultural landscape such as the Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras. It is therefore essential that the Philippine Government establish a permanent and effective body to co-ordinate and lead efforts to restore and protect the site.
- 3. To prevent future infrastructure projects from degrading the fragile World Heritage Site, the Philippine Government and its agencies responsible for infrastructure projects (the Department of Public Work and Highways, the Commission on Audit and other concerned agencies), should be encouraged to: (a) be flexible in imposing national design standards on infrastructure projects within Philippine World Heritage Sites; and (b) to ascertain that the negative impact of infrastructure projects within Philippine World Heritage Sites are mitigated or minimized.
- 4. In the absence of a site management authority with qualified staff, the Philippine Government and its agencies are encouraged to consult with the World Heritage Centre regarding major infrastructure projects within the Endangered Site, particularly major road networks that are planned to link or to pass through the World Heritage Site in Danger, before their construction begins.

NATIONAL WORKSHOP FOR THE CONSERVATION OF PHILIPPINE WORLD HERITAGE SITES

Background and Proceedings

The National Workshop on the Conservation of Philippine World Heritage Sites took place from 3-4 June. During the workshop, the representatives of the following Philippines World Heritage Sites made presentations on the state of conservation of their respective sites.

- The Tubbataha Reef Marine Park
- Puerto Princesa Subterranean River National Park
- The Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras
- The Baroque Churches of the Philippines
 - La Asuncion de Nuestra Senora Church in Sta. Maria, Province of Ilocos Sur
 - San Agustin Church in Intramuros, Manila
 - Sto. Thomas de Villanueva Church in Miag-ao, Province of Iloilo
 - San Agustin Church in Paoay, Province of Ilocos Norte
- The Historic City of Vigan

Notes:

- All of the above World Heritage Sites in the Philippines were represented during the workshop, except for the Parish Priest of San Agustin Church in Paoay, Ilocos Norte, who declined the invitation.
- The reports of the sites are annexed to this report

The Park Manager of the Tabbataha Reef Marine Park made a very good presentation on the site. From her report, it appears that the site is very well managed, and that the local park managers are succeeding in their campaign to minimize the problems of illegal fishing and poaching by commercial fishing vessels. The good news is that the park managers, in collaboration with local inhabitants of the islands, have identified 'no-take zones' where it is illegal to fish or remove marine products like corrals.

The representative of the Puerto Princesa Subterranean River National Park also made a good presentation. Threats to the site include the problem in the conservation of habitats, the non-sustainable use of natural resources, hunting of wildlife, and pollution. Indirect threats include overlapping of jurisdiction, different perspectives on conservation, poverty and increase in population. However, the local park managers have formulated a management strategy on habitat and ecosystem management, protection and law enforcement, research and monitoring, information and public awareness campaigns, regional integration, and tourism and visitors management. The RACAP suggested that site managers from the nominated site of Batanes Archipelago and Archaeological Landscape go to Palawan to learn from the lessons of the Tubbataha Reef and the Puerto Princesa Subterranean Parks. The Parish Priest of the Asuncion de Nuestra Senora Church of Sta. Maria mentioned several seminars, workshops and training conducted by national government agencies responsible for heritage conservation. Current problems at the site includes the deterioration of the ceiling and roofing of the church, the leaning belfry, termite infestation on the newly restored convent and the need to rewire the church and convent. He also mentioned the plan to conserve the ancient cemetery located within the church property and to reuse the ancient cemetery as a ossuary. A management committee of Sta. Maria, comprising of stakeholders from both public and private sectors, have been formed to conserve the church.

The Director of the Museum of the San Agustin Church in Intramuros, Manila described the state of conservation of the church. He also discussed their proposal to reconstruct the Second Monastery of the church, which was destroyed during the World War II. Only the ruined walls of the Second Monastery survived to this date. The Museum Director assured that the reconstruction plans are based on documentary evidence, and not on conjecture. The RACAP mentioned that the World Heritage Centre will have to evaluate the reconstruction plan, before any reconstruction takes place.

Note:

• The RACAP sent a communication ref. 143.41(CH-PHI)/CA/594/04 dated 8 September 2004 to the Director of the World Heritage Centre, forwarding a copy of the project proposal for evaluation and comment. The World Heritage Centre has not responded.

From the presentation of the representative of the Sto. Thomas de Villanueva Church in Miag-ao, the mission noted that several major interventions on the structure of the church have been undertaken in the past. Since the RACAP and the Consultant have not yet visited the site, it was difficult to assess the impact of such interventions on the historic structure.

Regarding the San Agustin Church in Paoay, Province of Ilocos Norte, several participants mentioned that the church parish priest, who declined the invitation to attend the workshop, would prefer that this church be removed from the World Heritage List.

The Mayor of Vigan made an impressive presentation on the conservation programme of Vigan. Their programme seems to be succeeding, considering that conservation has been adopted as a political platform among all the policy makers and political leaders in Vigan. In fact, the city's "Vigan Heritage Conservation Programme: A Tool for Development" was adjudged as one of the top ten best practices in local governance, in a nationwide competition. The City Government of Vigan also organized a workshop on skills competency on traditional building crafts such as tinsmithing, carpentry, masonry, metal works, painting and woodcarving. The trained participants will eventually participate in the restoration of not only the historic structures in Vigan, but also in other historic sites in the Philippines. Another worthy project is the introduction of a Geographic Information System funded by the Spanish Agency for International Cooperation, initially to be used for tax-mapping purposes, but eventually will be developed as a tool for heritage site management. The representative from the Rice Terraces of the Philippine Cordilleras mentioned about the revised masterplan of the site. He identified several problems affecting the site, including poverty due to increasing population, out-migration of younger generation, calamities (both man-made and natural), modernization, and tourism which does not benefit the rice farmers. He also mentioned about the low price of the indigenous rice, which is forcing farmers to shift to the planting of hybrid rice breeds.

On 4 June, the workshop started with short presentations on three sites (Batanes, Tabon Caves and Bohol) which are included in the Tentative List of Philippine World Heritage Sites tentatively listed and on one site which is being considered for inclusion in the Tentative List (the colonial light houses scattered all over the Philippine archipelago). This was followed by a presentation of an overview of the operating guidelines for the implementation of the World Heritage Convention (by Richard Engelhardt), a presentation on river control projects (by Mr. Mauro Greppi) and clarifications on the World Heritage Convention, and the nomination process by Mr. Stefano Balsamo. Copies of the Operating Guidelines for the Implementation of the World Heritage Convention of the World Heritage Convention of the World Heritage Convention of the Implementation of Implementation of Implementation of Implementation of Implementation of Implementati

Observations and recommendations :

- Concerned stakeholders in each of the four baroque churches should be encouraged to formulate a comprehensive conservation plan for their church.
- Considering that most of the Philippine World Heritage Sites are not appropriately managed, there is an urgent need for capacity building among the heritage site managers in World Heritage Site management, preventive maintenance and conservation techniques.
- All Philippine World Heritage Sites should address the crucial issue of new constructions within their protected zones
- The Philippine Government and concerned national agencies should be made to realize that national building codes and similar standard setting documents may not be applicable in World Heritage Sites, and that local government units managing World Heritage Sites should be encouraged to legislate their own building codes which are needed to preserve site integrity and authenticity
- As for the Rice Terraces of the Philippine World Heritage Site, the following were observed:
 - there are only five cluster groups of rice terraces included in the List. Given this, the provincial government of Ifugao can always locate infrastructure projects outside the World Heritage Site boundaries
 - considering that the site is already an endangered site, projects within the World Heritage Site should start focusing on the regeneration and restoration of the significant values of the site, not on further degradation of the site
 - There are only two options open to the decision makers in Ifugao Province: either give up the site as a World Heritage Site and do what they wish to do with the site; or try to reverse the degradation in order to maintain the site in the World Heritage List
- Lessons that can be learnt from the experience of the World Heritage Site of Vigan are:

- preservation can be compatible with development
- the snow-balling effect of active community participation in heritage conservation
- that win-win situation can be achieved in heritage conservation

Action Plan

The last agenda of the workshop is the preparation of an Action Plan and resolutions endorsing issues raised in the Action Plan to responsible/concerned agencies and institutions. The Action Plan includes.

- the integration of heritage education into the basic curriculum in elementary and high school to be endorsed to the department of Education
- the organization of a series of training workshops for conservation and restoration to be endorsed to the Spanish Government through the Instituto Cervantes
- the integration of heritage conservation into the curriculum of some universities to be endorsed to the Commission on Higher Education
- local government units managing historic places to develop local protective legislation in collaboration with other concerned government agencies
- the training, re-tooling, continuing education of public officials and policy makers on heritage conservation issues to be endorsed to the Department of Interior and Local Government
- the development and training in sustainable tourism activities in heritage sites - to be endorsed to the Department of Tourism
- the integration of people's organizations (POs) and non-government organizations (NGOs) into heritage conservation activities
- Advocacy for the continued conservation of the San Agustin Church in Paoay – endorsed to the Parish Priest and local government officials of Paoay
- Awareness campaign and training of officials and concerned personnel of the Commission on Audit and the Department of Public Works and Highways regarding appropriate infrastructure projects located in heritage sites

Annex 1

List of Parties Consulted during the Mission

In Ifugao Province:

- Mr. Solomon Chungaolao, Congressman of the Lone District of Ifugao Province
- Ms. Gondelina Amata, Undersecretary for Urban Asset Reform Program
 - Management Office of the Office of the President
- Mr. Glenn Potenciano, Vice Governor of Ifugao Province
- Mr. Hilario Bumangabang, Municipal Mayor of Hungduan
- Mr. Jerry Dalipog, Municipal Mayor of Banaue
- Mr. Aldrin Gungayan, Member of the Provincial Board and Chairperson of the Committee on Tourism
- Other government officials from the national, provincial, municipal and village levels

In Manila:

- Ambassador Preciosa Soliven, Secretary-General of the National Commission of the Philippines
- Ms. Carmen D. Padilla, Commissioner and Chair of the Committee on Culture UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines
- Ms. Josefina Alimurung, Member of the Committee on Culture, UNESCO National Commission of the Philippines
- Ms. Angelique Songco, Park Manager of the World Heritage Site of Tubbataha Reef Marine Park
- Mr. James Albert Mendoza, Representative from the World Heritage Site of the Puerto Princesa Subterranean River National Park
- Mr. Aldrin Gungayan, Member of the Provincial Board of Ifugao Province and Representative of the Rice Terraces of the Philippines World Heritage Site in Danger
- Msgr. Roque Reyes, Parish Priest of the World Heritage Site of Sta. Maria Church in the Province of Ilocos Sur
- Mr. Edison Molanida, Administrative Officer of the Municipality of Miagao, representing the World Heritage Site of Miag-ao Church in the Province of Iloilo
- Fr. Pedro Galende, Director of San Agustin Museum, representing the World Heritage Site of San Agustin Church in Intramuros, Manila
- Mr. Ferdinand Medina, Mayor of the World Heritage Site of Vigan
- Mrs. Eva Marie S. Medina, former Mayor of the World Heritage Site of Vigan
- Mr. Reynaldo Inovero, Chief of the Historic Preservation Division of the National Historical Institute of the Philippines
- Mr. Richard Bautista, representative of the National Commission for Culture and the Arts
- Mr. Ryan Sebastian, representative of the Department of Tourism
- Mrs. Maria Cristina Turalba, Head of the Committee on Architecture and Allied Arts, National Commission for Culture and the Arts
- Mr. Angel Bautista, Curator of the Cultural Properties Division of the National Museum
- Mr. Javier Galvan, Director of the Instituto Cervantes
- Mr. Butch Abad, Secretary of the Department of Education of the Philippines and

former Congressman of the Lone District of Batanes Province Ms. Celerina Navarro, Office of the Congresswoman Abad of Batanes Province Ms. Joy Mananghaya, Dean, College of Architecture of Feati University, Manila

UNESCO

Mr. Richard Engelhardt, Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific

Mr. Mauro Greppi, Hydraulic Engineer, Italian expert in river control projects

Mr. Alesandro Balsamo, Nominations and Tentative Lists Managing Policy and

Statutory Implementation Unit of the UNESCO World Heritage Centre

Mr. Ricardo Favis, Consultant for Culture, Office of the Regional Advisor for Culture in Asia and the Pacific, UNESCO Bangkok Office

Annex 2

Programme of the Mission

29 May 2005	Arrival in Manila
	Dinner meeting with the Secretary General of the
20 M 2005	National Commission of the Philippines and party
30 May 2005	Early morning departure, by land transportation, from Manila to Banaue, Ifugao Province
	Late afternoon meeting with the Vice Governor Glenn
	Prudenciano and Provincial Board Member Aldrin
	Gungayan in Lagawe
31 May 2005	Morning visit to assess the river control project at the rice
	terrace clusters in the village of Hapao, Municipality of
	Hungduan, Ifugao Province
	Afternoon meeting in Hungduan Municipal Hall with national, provincial and local officials
1 June 2005	Visit to the rice terrace clusters in Kiangan, Ifugao Province
	Afternoon departure from Ifugao Province for Manila
3-4 June 2005	National Workshop on the Conservation of Philippine World
	Heritage Sites
3 June 2005	Dinner meeting with Mr. Butch Abad, Secretary of the
	Department of Education of the Philippines and other
	key players in the nomination of the Batanes
	Archipelago and Archaeological Landscape to the
	World Heritage List
5 June 2005	Departure from Manila
5 June 2005	Departure from Manila