

2012

UNESCO

World Heritage Centre



*Permanent Delegation of the Islamic Republic of
Afghanistan to UNESCO and ISESCO*



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization



3rd Expert Working Group Meeting for the Old City of Herat and The Archaeological Remains of Jam World Heritage property

**4-6 September 2012
Museo di Art Orientale
Turin, Italy**

Table of the Contents

■ Background	1
■ Provisional Programme	2
■ List of Participants	7

Annex

Annex I. Decision - 31COM 7A.20 - Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) (C 211 rev)

Annex II. RECOMMENDATIONS: UNESCO Expert Working Group on the Preservation Jam and Herat ICCROM, Italy (Rome), 9-10 June 2008

Background

During more than two decades of civil conflict in Afghanistan, the monuments in Jam, Herat and Bamiyan, as well as the country's museums, were seriously damaged or looted. Following the fall of the Taliban regime in 2001, and the subsequent establishment of the Interim Government of Afghanistan, UNESCO immediately organized assessment missions to the sites with a view to safeguarding and preserving them. Damage-assessment reports were drawn up, as were short- and long-term plans for the monuments and sites' conservation and safeguarding.

The Governments of Italy and Switzerland expressed their support for the safeguarding of the endangered monuments and sites in Herat and the archaeological site of Jam and its Minaret. Other countries engaged to help safeguard other endangered sites, such as the damaged niches that once housed the giant statues of the Buddha in the Bamiyan Valley. The UNESCO/Italy Funds-in-Trust project *Emergency Consolidation of the Endangered Monuments in Herat and Jam* (844,901US\$) and the UNESCO/Swiss Funds-in-Trust project *Emergency Consolidation of the Endangered Monuments in Jam* (137,973US\$) were set up in 2002 and 2003, respectively.

Since then, UNESCO, in close collaboration with the Afghan national authorities and the international community, has been carrying out operational activities aimed at safeguarding Afghan monuments and sites that have been in immediate danger and at reinforcing national capacity. Such activities have been carried out particularly in Herat and Jam within the framework of the UNESCO/Italy and UNESCO/Swiss Funds-in-Trust projects.

In 2007, UNESCO/Norway Funds-in-Trust *Emergency Campaign and Capacity Building for Safeguarding Gawhar Shad Mausoleum in Herat, Afghanistan* (361,600 US\$) was established with the aims to rehabilitate of the Gawhar Shad Mausoleum and to raise public awareness throughout Afghanistan on the value of its cultural heritage. The Project has been terminated since 2011.

The UNESCO/Italy and UNESCO/Swiss Funds-in-Trust projects for Herat and Jam will also come to an end in 2012. In the light of this, UNESCO, together with the Museo di Arte Orientale of Turin, Italy, and in close co-operation with the UNESCO Office in Kabul and the Permanent Delegation of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan to UNESCO, is organizing the 3rd Expert Working Group Meeting for the Preservation of the Herat and Jam World Heritage property from 5 to 6 September, 2012 in Turin, Italy.

The Expert Working Group Meeting aims to assess progress made on the state of conservation of these monuments and sites, thanks to the operational activities carried out in Jam and Herat. It will also serve as an international platform to help define future strategies for ensuring the sustainability of actions carried out thus far. The meeting will also formulate comprehensive recommendations for future safeguarding actions.

Over the past decade, the Expert Working Group Meetings for Afghanistan, in the absence of the International Coordinating Committee Meetings, have been playing a crucial role in providing advice and expertise on issues related to the conservation and management of Afghan sites and monuments, notably Bamiyan, Herat and Jam.

The present Expert Working Group Meeting has been made possible thanks to generous funding from the UNESCO/Italy Funds-in-Trust project for the *Emergency Consolidation of the Endangered Monuments in Herat and Jam*.

Provisional Programme

Tuesday 4 September 2012

Arrival of participants

- 13:00-15:30 Lunch hosted by Prof. Andrea Bruno at *Studio Bruno*, to be followed by a visit to the archives on Bamiyan, Ghazni, Jam, Herat and other sites in Afghanistan
- 16:00-17:30 Visit at the Museo di Arte Orientale, organized by MAO, Turin
- 17:30-18:30 Registration at the Museo di Arte Orientale, Turin
- 18:30- Opening of the Photographic Exhibition '*UNESCO's Activities in Afghanistan - Jam and Herat in the pictures of Andrea Bruno*', in the Museo di Arte Orientale, Turin, Italy

After the opening of the Photographic Exhibition, a short preparatory meeting for moderators is planned.

Wednesday 5 September 2012

Opening session

Master of Ceremony	Mrs Elisabetta Valtz
--------------------	----------------------

- 09:30-10:10 Welcoming address by Prof. Franco Ricca, Director of the Museo di Arte Orientale, Turin
- Address by H.E. Mr Mossadeq Khalili
Deputy Minister of Information and Culture, Afghanistan
- Address by H.E. Mr Fazelly, Ambassador and Permanent Delegate of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan to UNESCO & ISESCO
- Address by Dr. Davoud Shah Saba, Governor of Herat Province, Afghanistan
- Greetings from Mr Filippo Alessi, Representative of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Italy
- Welcoming address and Introduction of the Meeting, by Ms. Junhi Han, World Heritage Centre
- 10:10-10:30 **COFFEE BREAK**

Session I	Minaret and Archaeological remains of Jam
Moderator	Mr Brendan Cassar

10:30-10:50	Activities carried out for the safeguarding of the Minaret of Jam and recommendations for future action, by Prof. Andrea Bruno , Advisor on Afghanistan to the Assistant Director-General for Culture, UNESCO
10:50 -11:10	Geological engineering problems and recommendations for a longer-term conservation strategy, by Dr. Claudio Margottini
11:10-11:30	Topographic and archaeological surface surveys and re-defining boundary of the World Heritage property, by Prof. Michael Jansen
11:30-11:50	River defense project carried out by the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture (2006-2008), by Mr. Abdul Ahad Abassy and Mr. Sayed Maiel Mutahar
11:50-12:10	Study of hydrology for the river bank protection on the basis of the satellite images carried out in 2011, by Prof. Holger Schüttrumpf
12:10-12:30	Measures taken by the Government of Afghanistan to implement the corrective measures identified by the World Heritage Committee, by H.E. Mr. Mossadeq Khalili , in particular: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of an adequate training programme in conservation and management for reinforcing the capacity of staff at the Ministry of Information and Culture; • Enhanced site security including site looting problem.
12:30-14:00	LUNCH BREAK

<i>Continuation of the Session I</i>	
Moderator	Ms Junhi Han

14:00-15:00	Q&A, Discussion and presentation of recommendations for the Minaret and Archaeological remains of Jam.
-------------	--

Session II	The City of Herat - Preservation of the Historic City of Herat
Moderator	Dr Claudio Margottini

- 15:00-15:20 Presentation of the Areia Antiqua I and II project, a survey of the sites and historic monuments of Herat and the ancient city excavations at Qala-e-Iktyaruddin and Kohandaz, **by Dr. Ute Franke**
- 15:20-15:40 Concrete safeguarding actions on historical monuments undertaken by the Government in line with the National Law on the Preservation of the Historical and Cultural Heritage, **by Mr. Abdul Ahad Abassy**
- 15:40-16:00 Safeguarding of the Old City of Herat programme undertaken by the Aga Khan Trust for Culture, **by Mr. Ajmal Maiwandi**
- 16:00-16:40 Presentation of the Evaluation on potential nomination of the Old City of Herat, **by Prof. Michael Jansen and Dr. Simone Ricca**
- 16:40-17:00 **COFFEE BREAK**
- 17:00-18:00 Q&A, Discussions and presentation of recommendations for the preservation of the historic city of Herat, as well as for the future nomination of the Old City of Herat on the World Heritage List
- 19:30 **DINNER**

Thursday 6 September 2012

Session III The City of Herat- The Fifth Minaret in Herat	1) Survey and Analysis for the Fifth Minaret
Moderator	Prof Holger Schüttrumpf

- 9:30 -9:50 Emergency stabilization operation undertaken and further interventions made since 2010, **by Eng. Alberto Lodigiani**
- 9:50-10:10 Excavation on the lost minaret on the north side of the Fifth Minaret in view of understanding the foundations of the Fifth Minaret, **by Mr. Khair Muhammad Khairzada**
- 10:10-10:30 Geo-physical investigation and structural assessment of the Fifth Minaret in Herat and reasons for its leaning, **by Dr. Claudio Margottini and Eng. Alberto Lodigiani**
- 10:30-10:50 Analysis of studies carried out on the stabilization of the Fifth Minaret, **by Dr.-Ing Christof Ziegert and Dipl.-Ing. Uwe Seiler**
- 10:50-11:10 **COFFEE BREAK**

Session III The City of Herat- The Fifth Minaret in Herat	2) Long term conservation for the Fifth Minaret
Moderator	Mr Philippe Marquis

- 11:10-11:30 Proposal by **Eng. Alberto Lodigiani, Dr. Claudio Margottini, and Prof. Andrea Bruno**
- 11:30-11:50 Proposal by **Dr.-Ing Christof Ziegert and Dipl.-Ing Uwe Seiler**
- 11:50-13:00 Q&A, Discussion and presentation of recommendations on future activities for the **Presentation of long-term conservation proposals**
- 13:00-14:30 **LUNCH BREAK**

Session IV	The City of Herat- the Gawhar Shad Mausoleum
Moderator	Dr Simone Ricca

- 14:30-14:50 Presentation on activities to rehabilitate the Gawhar Shad Mausoleum, by **Mr. Tarcis Stevens**
- 14:50-15:30 Q&A, Discussion and Recommendations

Session V	The Historic City of Herat- Sustainable Development and Other related Issues
Moderator	Mr Ajmal Maiwandi

- 15:30-15:50 Future project for the monitoring of the historic city of Herat in order to develop an urban archaeology programme, by **Mr. Phillippe Marquis**
- 15:50-16:10 Presentation of the Project “Strategic Master plan for Herat for sustainable urban management”, a survey on social and demographical situation in Herat as well as on Herati cultural heritage and sites, to elaborate a master plan for sustainable development of the city of Herat, which also allows preservation and use of historical sites in Herat, by **Prof. Mirella Loda and Prof. Manfred Hinz**
- 16:10-16:30 **COFFEE BREAK**

Session VI	Wrap-up Session
Moderator	Prof Michael Jansen

16:30-18:00 Presentation of summary of each session and Adoption of the
Recommendations formulated during the meeting

Closing session	
Master of Ceremony	Mr Brendan Cassar

18:00-18:15 **Closing remarks by:**
Government of Afghanistan
Director of Museo di Arte Orientale
UNESCO

19:30 **FAREWELL DINNER**

List of Participants

Afghan experts and officials

H.E. Mr. Mossadeq Khalili, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Information and Culture of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

H.E. Mr. Mohammad Kacem Fazelly, Ambassador & Permanent Delegate of Afghanistan to UNESCO & ISESCO

Dr. Davoud Shah Saba, Governor of Herat Province, Afghanistan

Mr. Abdul Ahad Abassy, Director, Historical Monuments Department, Ministry of Information and Culture, Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

Mr. Khair Muhammad Khairzada, Director of the Institute of Archaeology, Ministry of Information and Culture, Islamic Republic of Afghanistan

Mr. Sayed Maiel Mutahar, Engineer, Department of the Preservation of Historical Monuments in the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture

Representative of the Donor country

Mr Filippo Alessi, Representative from the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Bilateral Donors

Mr. Stetson A. Sanders, Alternate Permanent Representative (Political Officer), United States Mission to the UN Agencies in Rome

International experts

Prof. Andrea Bruno, Architect, Advisor on Afghanistan to UNESCO Assistant Director-General for Culture, Turin, Italy

Dr. Ute Franke, State Museums of Berlin, Germany

Prof. Manfred Hinz, Romance Literatures and Cultural Studies, University of Passau, Germany

Prof. Michael Jansen, Director of the Department of Urban History, RWTH Aachen University, Germany

Prof. Mirella Loda, Department of Historical and Geographical Studies of the University of Florence, Italy

Eng. Alberto Lodigiani, Structural Engineer, ALGA. S.p.A, Milan, Italy

Mr. Ajmal Maiwandi, CEO, Aga Khan Trust for Culture-Afghanistan

Dr. Geol. Claudio Margottini, Geophysical Engineer, ISPRA-Dept. Geological Survey of Italy

Mr. Philippe Marquis, Director, French Archaeological Mission to Afghanistan (DAFA), France

Prof. Arch. Massimo Preite, Department of Historical and Geographical Studies of the University of Florence, Italy

Dr. Simone Ricca, Architect, RC Heritage, Italy

Prof. Dr. Holger Schüttrumpf, Institute of Hydraulic Engineering and Water Resources Management, RWTH Aachen University, Germany

Mr. Tarcis Stevens, Architect conservator, T.AR.S. Architects Partners Ltd, Antwerpen, Belgium

Dipl.-Ing. Uwe Seiler, Ziegert Seiler Ingenieure GmbH, Berlin, Germany

Dipl.-Ing. Georgios Toubekis, RWTH Aachen University - Faculty of Architecture LFG, Aachen Center for Documentation and Conservation, Germany

Dr.-Ing Christof Ziegert, Ziegert | Seiler Ingenieure GmbH, Berlin, Germany

Museo di Arte Orientale, Turin Italy

Prof. Franco Ricca, Director

Ms. Angela Benetto

Mrs. Elisabetta Valtz

UNESCO

World Heritage Centre

Ms. Junhi Han

Ms. Hye-seung Shim

UNESCO Kabul Office

Mr. Brendan Cassar

Others: UNESCO Category 2 International research and training Centre on the Economics of Culture and World Heritage studies (Turin, Italy)

Arch. Alessio Re

Mr. Walter Santagata

Annex I

Decision - 31COM 7A.20 - Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) (C 211 rev)

The World Heritage Committee,

1. **Having examined** Document WHC-07/31.COM/7A,
2. **Recalling** its Decision 30 COM 7A.22, adopted at its 30th session (Vilnius, 2006),
3. **Notes** the efforts made by the State Party and the international community for the safeguarding of this property and the important progress achieved in the consolidation of the Minaret of Jam in 2006;
4. **Reiterates** its strong encouragement to the State Party to construct a footbridge and a ford across the Hari River, in order to facilitate villagers' access from the Bedam Valley to the Jam Valley, as well as allowing a limited number of vehicles to cross the river, as set out in the recommendations of the UNESCO mission in February 2004;
5. **Adopts** the following as the desired state of conservation for the property in view of its future removal from the List of World Heritage in Danger:
 - a) Increased capacity of the staff of the Afghan Ministry of Culture and Information in charge of the preservation of the property ensured;
 - b) Precisely identified World Heritage property and clearly marked boundaries and buffer zones;
 - c) Long-term stability and conservation of the Minaret of Jam ensured;
 - d) Site security ensured;
 - e) A comprehensive management system including a long-term conservation policy developed and implemented.
6. **Encourages** the State Party to implement the following corrective measures for:
 - a) Development of adequate capacity of the staff of the Afghan Ministry of Culture and Information in charge of the preservation of the property by developing and implementing an adequate training programme in conservation and management;
 - b) Precise identification of the World Heritage property and clearly marked boundaries and buffer zones by:

- (i) Undertaking topographic and archaeological surface surveys and re-defining core and buffer zones, as well as identifying zones affected by illicit excavations;
- (ii) Marking of the core zone as "World Heritage protected area";
- (iii) Officially revising the boundaries of the World Heritage property according to the results of the relevant surveys in order to complement the already identified Outstanding Universal Value.

c) Long-term consolidation and conservation of the Minaret of Jam and the archaeological remains by:

- (i) Completing the documentation and recording of the Minaret and the archaeological remains;
- (ii) Undertaking soil investigation in the vicinity of the monument in order to obtain information on the cause of the inclination of the Minaret and to define the long-term consolidation measures;
- (iii) Regular and systematic monitoring of the Minaret's inclination;
- (iv) Establishing a full inventory of decoration including digitalisation and reference system for all eight sides of the base of the Minaret;
- (v) Implementing emergency restoration of the surface decoration of the Minaret.

(d) Ensured site security by:

- (i) Exerting strict control of illicit excavations and protecting the site against looting, notably through hiring of adequate number of trained site guards;
- (ii) Implementing measures enforcing the 2004 Preservation Law for Cultural and Historical Monuments ensured.
- (iii) Development and implementation of management system by undertaking appropriate training for the staff of the Ministry of Information and Culture in charge of the property;

7. **Invites** the international community, in co-operation with the World Heritage Centre, to continue its technical and financial support, in particular to achieve the above indicated desired state of conservation;

8. **Requests** the State Party, in consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS, to develop a draft Statement of Outstanding Universal Value including the conditions of integrity and authenticity, for examination by the Committee at its 32nd session in 2008;

9. **Also requests** the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre by 1 February 2008 a progress report on the implementation of corrective measures, for examination by the Committee at its 32nd session in 2008; and

10. **Decides** to retain the Minaret and Archaeological Remains of Jam (Afghanistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

UNESCO Expert Working Group on

the Preservation of Jam and Herat

ICCROM, Italy (Rome)

9-10 June 2008

RECOMMENDATIONS

Introductory Remarks:

The participants in the Second Expert Working Group note the importance of the participation of the Afghan Government representatives and congratulate UNESCO and the Afghan authorities for facilitating their presence at the current Working Group Meeting. The participants would also like to sincerely thank ICCROM for hosting the participants and providing all the necessary logistical support to realize a successful meeting.

Overall Issues:

The Participants of the Working Group;

1. Acknowledge efforts made by the Afghan authorities in recent years as well as the progress made by the international experts in their cooperation and technical assistance to the Afghan authorities for various sites in Herat and the World Heritage Site of Jam, and also thank the donor institutions and implementing agencies including UNESCO and the Agha Khan trust for Culture, and especially

- the Governments of Italy, Switzerland, Norway and others who have contributed to the implementation of the activities;
2. Recognize that all activities implemented at the Jam World Heritage site are to be officially approved by the Government of Afghanistan, in compliance with the World Heritage Convention;
 3. Encourage the Afghan authorities to continue inter-ministerial coordination as well as discussion and information-sharing between provincial and national authorities for the benefit of all tangible heritage in Afghanistan;
 4. Underline that the various ongoing projects in Herat are all inter-related and the need to ensure coordinated action among international experts, agencies and the relevant Afghan authorities at all levels;
 5. Underline the importance of the involvement of local people in any on-site activities, especially at the isolated site of Jam, in order to enhance employment and capacity development in the region;
 6. Recommend that documentation of all scientific activities undertaken on-site be made available to the Afghan authorities and UNESCO (Kabul office and WHC) for utilization in future activities; furthermore that selected important documentation be summarized and translated into Afghan languages;
 7. Thank all the donors that have contributed to conservation activities for the Jam site and for various sites in Herat and request UNESCO to make further efforts to raise and coordinate funds from existing and potential donors in order to continue the international technical cooperation for the activities prioritized by the Expert Working Group;

8. Acknowledge the proposed 2008/09 activities and programs by Afghan national institutions as well as the international experts. Certain proposed activities in either Herat or Ghor (Jam) could be subject to the prevailing security conditions and the approval/advice of designated security authorities;
9. Note that the recommended activities at the World Heritage property of Jam will be carried out compatibly with the available resources under the Italian and Swiss Funds-in-Trust to the UNESCO World Heritage Centre, as well as under the budget of the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture (MoIC), and **in the order of priority assigned to them by the experts during the meeting. The most urgent activities should begin as soon as possible;**
10. Acknowledge the intention of the Afghan Government to pursue a nomination dossier for sites and areas yet to be determined in the city of Herat;

SITE OF JAM

I. River Defence Project

a) Monitoring of the hydrological situation of the site

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that monitoring of hydrometry, rainfall and snow fall, as well as gradient observations should be carried out regularly in order to gain precise information which would allow elaborating a risk-management proposal in the future, notably a system to forecast the potentially dangerous floods for the Minaret;

Underline that due to the difficulties (absence of energy supply, cost of the automatic instruments with solar supply, etc.) monitoring should be done through

the installation of a low tech system/cost-effective solution (simple instrument for hydrometric measurements with manual recording): that data should be collected regularly (daily or weekly) by hand by an expert from the MoIC/a technician who will be trained on the appropriate method. The few information obtained through this instrument could be increased once verified the presence of the other monitoring instruments in the basin area (Herat, Kabul, Bamiyan, and other) and, in the positive case, it would be desirable to acquire the available data so as to be able to define in the future a more detailed monitoring system. Furthermore a monitoring plan should be prepared by the hydrology engineer in order to start providing training on the basic monitoring to be carried out;

2. Note that high-tech systems through satellite telephone or with local data logger could be used in the future but are for the time being difficult to realize;

b) Completion of the emergency works carried out in winter 2007

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that a diaphragm be constructed under the retaining wall along the river(s) in order to prevent the erosion of the soil underneath the Minaret resulting from underwater currents. The typology of diaphragm (e.g. trench excavation or grouting the void between big blocks) and technical feasibility of this work (availability of equipment and safety concerns) must be investigated as soon as possible by a civil engineer from the Ministry of Public Works with the technical backstopping of Prof. Margottini (as necessary and required). This work should start as soon as possible, beginning with the smaller section downstream with respect to the monument and completed in manageable phases over the coming years; Furthermore, the works should always be carried out with the presence of archaeologists;

2. Consider that the 'river defence wall' could also be extended further up the Hari Rud in the future, pending archaeological monitoring/survey/excavation results;
3. Note that in case of deep erosion of the river defence wall, the stabilization of the river bed itself could be considered in the future;

II. Structure of the Minaret

a) Static and dynamic monitoring of the structure

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of the measurement as soon as possible of the Minaret's inclination to determine if any movement has taken place since 2006. This should be done by means of the EDM equipment provided through the project, under the supervision of an expert such as Mr. Tarcis Stevens. Additional measurements should be made through other methods/non-destructive installation, such as a pendulum and/or the GPS, to validate the results of the EDM equipment;

b) Geotechnical investigation and foundation investigation

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Recommend that a trench be excavated next to the Minaret to investigate the depth and conditions of the foundations, as well as of the soil. This should be dug on one of the sides of the Minaret with respect to the axis of inclination of the structure, under close archaeological supervision;
2. Endorse 6 geotechnical drillings to be carried out as a technique to investigate the nature and conditions of stress of the soils in the area adjacent to the Minaret - to

this aim, the potential interest of companies located in nearby countries (e.g. Iran) shall be explored;

3. Note that 4 more inclined drillings should be done to inspect the foundations. The latter work is to be performed under close supervision by an expert and is to be avoided if the monitoring of the Minaret has shown a progress of the leaning since 2006;
4. Recommend that in case monitoring of the Minaret indicates a progress in inclination since 2006, the situation should be reassessed as soon as possible by the Expert Group, (possibly through email consultation) in light of the information obtained through the above-mentioned inspection trench and geotechnical drillings;

c) Re-establishment of the wooden elements of the Minaret

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Endorse, under the condition of security, the re-installation of the wooden elements which existed in the structure of the Minaret, (e.g. to protect the steps), and which have been removed by looters;

d) Mechanical tests of the masonry

The participants of the Working Group;

2. Recommend further mechanical tests of the masonry conducted by means of flat-jacks (single and double) to find out the actual stress in the masonry and its constitutive relationship; these should be inserted at the level of the basement (where the stress is higher), on the internal side of the external wall which is under the most stress (i.e. towards the leaning of the Minaret). Another possibility

for testing the mechanical characteristics of the masonry would be on the facade which has not been restored, always at the basement level;

III - Documentation of the site

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Stress that priority should be given to a full documentation of the property inscribed on the WH list and its buffer zone, as well as on the Minaret;

a) Mapping

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Note the importance of proper mapping of the site and that the map available in the World Heritage nomination file should be improved by new and more precise topographic data, including the archaeological zones;

b) Assessment of the conservation situation of the Minaret

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of complete documentation of the site, as well as exact conservation assessment of the Minaret; a complete decay and damage assessment should therefore be undertaken by an architect as soon as possible for:
 - a. recording present different types and degrees of damages
 - b. monitoring ongoing processes of decay
 - c. documenting by an extended nomenclature as presented at this expert meeting
 - d. providing precise and complete working documents for future interventions

IV - General recommendations for the site of Jam

a) Site security

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the necessity of enhanced site protection by hiring more security guards trained on the preservation of historical sites to protect them against illicit excavations. In this regard, international cultural police institutions, such as for instance the Italian *Carabinieri per la tutela del patrimonio artistico*, could assist in the training activities for the Afghan police's activities aimed at the safeguarding of cultural properties in Jam and throughout the country;

b) On-the-job training and development of monitoring protocols

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Note that all activities implemented should provide an opportunity for 'on the job' training of technical staff from the Afghan Ministry of Information and Culture, as well as workers from the Jam area. In addition to carrying out monitoring of the Minaret and training, the concerned international experts should also systematically develop protocols which would provide guidance to the Afghan team in charge of the property on the regular and long-term monitoring of the site. These protocols, part of the eventual Management Plan for the property requested by the World Heritage Committee, will identify the purpose of the monitoring, its methodology, the relevant indicators to be measured as well as the benchmark values of these measurements warranting specific remedial measures, which should also be described;
2. Recommend the development of a more comprehensive strategy for institutional capacity building in close cooperation with the Afghan authorities and institutions

such as ICCROM. This should be done as soon as possible using some of the resources available under the Italian FiT with UNESCO, by entrusting ICCROM to conduct a mission to Afghanistan and develop the Strategy in close consultation with the Afghan authorities, based on a preliminary assessment of their needs prepared by the MoIC in cooperation with the UNESCO Office in Kabul. The strategy will include detailed descriptions of specific capacity-building activities to be carried out, together with the corresponding budget estimates. These will be used by UNESCO and the Afghan MoIC to raise funds, possibly through a donor meeting. In drawing up the Capacity-Building Strategy, ICCROM will take into account the need to develop at first a basic institutional capacity within the MoIC so as to identify the core staff whom will receive, over the following years, more specific training on heritage management and conservation techniques.

3. Strongly endorse the participation of Afghan experts in international training courses as part of a long-term plan for institutional capacity building, such as those offered by ICCROM in Rome or in the Asia region (eg the Course being offered in Shanghai in collaboration with the World Heritage Institute for Training and Research for Asia and the Pacific, WHITR-AP).

SITE OF HERAT

I. General Issues

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Welcome and congratulate the Herat Governor on the declaration made during the meeting that the road through the Musallah complex had been closed with a view to its complete and definitive removal, and his further announcement that a national meeting in Herat would be scheduled for the near future so as to make

- concrete recommendations and to take necessary decisions and actions for the long-term preservation of the Old City and monuments of Herat;
2. Consider that this very important decision, together with the commitments made by the Governor in the Declaration he made at the Meeting as regard the strict and effective protection of the historic urban fabric of the Old City of Herat, shall provide a promising basis to develop a nomination for the inscription on the World Heritage List of a site to be identified in Herat.
 3. Request UNESCO to advise and assist on a possible World Heritage nomination dossier for the Old City and/or specific monuments of Herat. In this regard, the participants in the meeting encouraged the Afghan authorities to give consideration to the various options available to them for a World Heritage Nomination, ranging from a large sector of the historic city, encompassing monuments and residential/commercial buildings, to a reduced property concentrating on the complex of the Musallah and the Fifth Minaret;
 4. Acknowledge the necessity, in view of the current deteriorating situation of the historic character of the city, that international community assistance for preserving the Old City of Herat, including capacity building of national experts and public awareness raising activities, is crucial and should be actively pursued through existing UNESCO projects (Gawhar Shad and 5th Minaret) and further fundraising activities to be undertaken as soon as possible;

II. Musalla Complex and Gawhar Shad Mausoleum:

The participants of the Working Group;

1. Underline the importance of the permanent closure of the road through the Sultan Hussain Baiqara Madrasa as a positive step towards the re-integration of the

Gawhar Shad mausoleum within the Musalla Complex as a single, integrated site with a buffer zone;

2. Underline the importance of the permanent closure of the road as a measure to safeguard the archaeological remains of the Sultan Hussein Baiqara Madrasa;
3. Underline the importance of the road closure as a preventative conservation measure to protect the five standing Minarets (each with varying degrees of inclination) from the potentially damaging vibrations caused by heavy traffic in and around the area;
4. Stress the importance of the permanent closure and destruction of the road through the Sultan Hussein Baiqara Madrasa and in the vicinity of the Minarets and for an alternate route that protects the Minarets as a long-term solution to be designed and implemented by the Afghan authorities;
5. Recommend that the wall enclosing the area of the Minarets be reconstructed permanently so that the ban on traffic instituted by the Governor of Herat is respected and that both human and vehicular traffic is regulated in the area in order to protect the site;
6. Recommend that an expert be appointed by UNESCO to prepare a document for a long-term project, respecting the link between the Minarets and the Mausoleum, and taking therefore into account the whole archaeological area for the preservation of the site in a wider context, with a view to fund raising for its possible future implementation;
7. Request UNESCO to re-align specific activities within its ongoing project for the Gawhar Shad Mausoleum to take advantage of the permanent road closure and to support the Governor in his initiative to pursue reintegrating the site within a single Complex (this may mean re-establishing a boundary wall of the site,

extended archaeological survey or preparation of the project mentioned above, etc.);

8. Note the importance for the Gawhar Shad of conducting priority activities including re-roofing the cube to protect against water infiltration, cleaning of cupola and drum interior to eliminate redundant load on arches and vaults and to improve the documentation, scientific sampling of the cupola for a long-term intervention method, archaeological survey to establish the relationship between the mausoleum and the fifth minaret, replacing doors and windows and installing screens to enhance preservation, security and authenticity, cleaning of the interior to assess the conservation of stucco and mural-paintings, site interpretation/signage and awareness raising;
9. Underline the importance of including in all activities in the Gawhar Shad, Musalla Complex and in Herat in general of training and capacity building initiatives with the relevant Government Departments and Ministries;

III. Fifth Minaret:

1. Recommend the installation of anti-vandalism measures around the steel cables supporting the Minaret to reduce the risk of collapse from human interference;
2. Recommend that the hole in the structure of the Minaret be repaired;
3. Recommend the development of a project that addresses a long-term solution for the inclination of the Minaret, preceded by geotechnical and foundation investigations to verify potential aspects leading to the leaning of the structure;
4. Recommend the full documentation of the minaret, more specifically its architectural elements and decorations, in addition to the basically structural documentation achieved yet.

