



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

35 COM

Distribution Limited

WHC-11/35.COM/7B.Add.2

Paris, 6 June 2011

Original: English / French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC
AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF
THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thirty-fifth session

Paris, UNESCO Headquarters
19-29 June 2011

**Item 7B of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of World Heritage
properties inscribed on the World Heritage List**

SUMMARY

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the World Heritage List. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. In certain cases, the World Heritage Committee may wish to decide to discuss in detail the state of conservation reports which are submitted for adoption without discussion.

Decision required: The World Heritage Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

The full reports of reactive monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language:
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/35COM/>

Table of content

REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST	2
CULTURAL PROPERTIES	2
AFRICA	2
42. Island of Gorée (Senegal) (C 26).....	2
ASIA-PACIFIC.....	6
62. Temple of Preah Vihear (Cambodia) (C 1224rev)	6
EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA	8
110. Cathedral, Alcázar and Archivo de Indias in Seville (Spain) (C 383 rev).....	8

REPORTS ON THE STATE OF CONSERVATION OF PROPERTIES INSCRIBED ON THE WORLD HERITAGE LIST

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

AFRICA

42. Island of Gorée (Senegal) (C 26)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List
1978

Criteria
(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger
N/A

Previous Committee Decisions
30 COM 7B.43, 31 COM 7B.52; 33 COM 7B.48

International Assistance
Total amount provided to the property: USD 33,071 in 1981 – Emergency Assistance to strengthen the threatened western fortifications; USD 19,529 in 1981 – Training of technicians responsible for the rehabilitation of the Island.

UNESCO extra-budgetary funds
USD 132,570 in 1981, safeguarding campaign for the Island of Gorée

Previous monitoring missions
2004: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Mission; 2006: World Heritage Centre Mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports
a) Delay in the appointment of a site manager;
b) Risk of collapse of historic buildings;
c) Marine erosion;
d) Illegal occupation of historic buildings.

Illustrative material
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/26>

Current conservation issues

At the 33rd session (Seville, 2009), the World Heritage Committee expressed its strong concern regarding the lack of progress in the conservation of the architectural heritage and in developing adequate measures to resolve the problem of illegal occupation and squatting in the areas around the Castle. The World Heritage Committee was also concerned about the continued marine erosion, in particular in the western part of the Island where the most significant historic monuments are located. At the same session, it reiterated its request to the State Party to appoint a site manager to ensure the implementation of the necessary management and conservation activities.

On 29 January 2011, the State Party submitted a succinct report on the state of conservation of the property. From 19 to 22 April 2011, a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM mission visited the Island of Gorée, to examine progress achieved in the resolution of the threats to the architectural heritage, the danger due to coastal erosion and the general

management issues for the Island. The mission report is available on the link: <http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/35COM/>

a) *Deterioration of the architectural heritage*

In its report, the State Party notes that architectural heritage conservation is a major component in the safeguarding plan for the Island of Gorée. Therefore, several buildings, including Admiral House, have been the subject of studies and request for financing from development partners for their rehabilitation. Furthermore, and under the supervision of the Cultural Heritage Direction and the Bureau of Architecture and Historic Monuments (BAHM), the Gorée town authorities, in collaboration with the Spanish Government, have completed the rehabilitation of a building as a of accommodation centre in the Adanson Garden. The old harbor master's office has been transformed into a bank, while the development of the town market is almost complete. Nevertheless, the mission noted that an important number of buildings was seriously degraded and pointed out the lack of regular preventive maintenance in most of the historic buildings, which form part of the property. The mission noted in particular that these efforts on the part of the State Party did not concern the western part of the Island where other buildings of significant historic value continue to deteriorate rapidly (William Ponty School, former Governor's palace, former hospital, Sisters' Building). The mission recommended that priority be given most urgently to the consolidation of all the buildings currently under threat, the issue of their complete rehabilitation could be treated at a later date, in a second stage. Further, the mission recommended considering that the squatters moved out of the most threatened buildings in order to make them available for consolidation works. These works could be the opportunity for the State Party to put in place a system of continued training for qualified personnel in works related to restoration and consolidation of technical structures.

b) *Coastal erosion*

The State Party continues to seek potential partners to resolve this problem, which it recognizes as very worrisome. Nevertheless, it recalls that activities to shore up and halt this erosion were carried out especially around the House of Slaves with support from the Ford Foundation. With regard to the issue of coastal erosion, the mission noted that the different works (buildings, supporting walls, military works, etc.) are even more badly damaged than previously. In addition to the area of the Governor's Palace, those around the Mariam Bâ School and the Mosque render the situation critical. Although efforts to reduce coastal erosion have been made at the Slave House by means of the construction of a low concrete wall, the mission considers that this wall occults the symbolic image of the "Corridor of no return", and that it makes the interpretation of this art of the house difficult. However, the mission therefore recommended that urgent consolidation activities continue to be carried out, otherwise the collapse of some of the buildings was at risk in the short-term.

c) *Illegal occupation of the buildings and lands*

In its report, the State Party recognized that squatting is a genuine problem that increases insecurity in the dilapidated historic buildings and in the areas around the Castle. The report also notes that the solution to this matter must be resolved by the Mayor of Gorée who has responsibility for this because of the policy for the decentralization of competences to the local communities. The State Party also wishes that the World Heritage Committee takes a decision in respect of this situation, as this would assist the actors in the field. The mission noted that this issue of illegal occupation in the Island, even although it has existed for nearly thirty years, must be urgently treated, otherwise some of the degraded buildings may collapse on the occupants. The mission noted the contradictory views concerning illegal occupation and the way this phenomenon has even been justified and tolerated in the island. It recommends that independent studies on the actual need for dwellings and the stability of the occupied buildings be conducted, and that the results will assist in the final decision to be taken by the Mayor and the Ministry of Culture.

d) *Management issues*

The State Party report announced the appointment of the current conservator of the House of Slaves as the manager of the World Heritage property. The report indicated the creation of a heritage information office on the Island in the near future. The mission noted that the lack of an operational management structure constitutes today a punctual and recognized threat. Even though the National Commission for the safeguarding of Gorée is an efficient institution at the national level, at the local level the commission's impact still remains limited in the daily management of the property's safeguarding and conservation issues. The mission noted with satisfaction that the conservator of the House of Slaves had begun his work as manager but it regretted that the administrative decision confirming him in his position had not yet been signed. The mission further recommended that arrangements be made to provide the position of manager with a management structure and appropriate human resources (administration, restoration technicians) and adequate financial resources (operating budget). These arrangements should also include the preparation of a management and conservation plan, as it had already been requested by Decision **28 COM 15B.42**, which should be prepared in cooperation with the Mayor of Gorée and all the main stakeholders. This plan should constitute regulations, an appropriate and participatory management system, and a short-, medium, and long-term action plan. The mission specified that the safeguarding plan and the local investment plan themselves could not substitute the property's management plan. These documents could however be integrated as components of this management plan, depending on their compatibility with its objectives and actions.

Conclusions

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies note with satisfaction the interventions made by the State Party to improve the state of conservation of the architectural heritage of the Island. Nevertheless, they recommend that priority be given to structural consolidation work of all the buildings threatened with collapse. As to concerns of the issue of coastal erosion that endangers the Island, they recommend that urgent consolidation work also be undertaken while awaiting the provision of more substantial funding. They encourage the State Party to request international assistance from the World Heritage Fund. They highlight the urgent need to elaborate an integrated management and conservation plan in order to implement measures systematically and in accordance with a conservation policy and guidelines assuring the protection of the property's outstanding universal value.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies further consider that the illegal and anarchic occupation of the buildings and lands of the Island, require a global and concerted approach, involving the Mayor of Gorée and the Cultural Heritage Direction. The management and conservation plan should provide the opportunity to examine this issue and take the necessary decisions.

Draft Decision: 35 COM 7B.42

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC-11/35.COM/7B.Add.2,
2. Recalling Decision **33 COM 7B.48**, adopted at its 33rd session (Seville, 2009),

3. Takes note of the results of the reactive monitoring mission to the property and the recommendations made for improvement of the state of conservation of the architectural heritage, management issues, the illegal occupation of the buildings and lands, and the problems of coastal erosion;
4. Welcomes with satisfaction the appointment of a manager for the site, but requests that an administrative note for the appointment be signed, and that a management structure with adequate human and financial resources be created and established in Gorée;
5. Also requests the State Party to implement the following recommendations resulting from the 2011 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS/ICCROM mission:
 - a) Begin urgent structural consolidation of the historic buildings currently threatened, in particular the Governor's Palace, the former Hospital and the William Ponty School,
 - b) Consolidate the technical works that are near collapse due to major coastal erosion, in particular those in the area of the former Hospital, the Mosque and the Mariam Bâ School,
 - c) Commence studies on the actual need for dwellings and on the stability of the occupied buildings so that a definitive decision may be made with regard to the issue of illegal occupation of the Island,
 - d) Establish a management structure with appropriate human and financial resources to enable the manager of the site to implement the necessary conservation and management activities, in particular to initiate the preparation of a management and conservation plan for the property;
6. Encourages the State Party to request international assistance from the World Heritage Fund to implement some of the consolidation activities recommended by the 2011 mission;
7. Further requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2013**, a state of conservation report on the property for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 37th session in 2013.

ASIA-PACIFIC

62. Temple of Preah Vihear (Cambodia) (C 1224rev)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List
2008

Criteria
(i)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger
N/A

Previous Committee Decisions
31 COM 8B.24; 32 COM 8B.102; 33 COM 7B.65; 34 COM 7B.66

International Assistance
Total amount provided to the property: USD 30,000 for Conservation and Management in 2009.

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
Total amount provided to the property: 30,500 Euro from the 'France-UNESCO Convention' for preparation of the nomination file and the management plan.

Previous monitoring missions
March/April 2009, joint UNESCO-ICOMOS reinforced monitoring mission

Main threats identified in previous reports
N/A

Illustrative material
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1224>

Current conservation issues

At its 34th session (Brasilia, 2010), the Committee took note that the State Party of Cambodia had submitted documents and, decided "*to consider the documents submitted by the State Party at its 35th session in 2011*" (Decision **34 COM 7B.66**). The Committee did not request any State Party report on the state of conservation of this property.

Upon request by the Minister of Natural Resources and Environment of Thailand, and with the consent of Cambodia, a copy of the documents, the Management Plan for the property of the Temple of Preah Vihear, including the revised map was handed over to the Thai Delegation to UNESCO by the Assistant Director-General for Culture of UNESCO on 9 September 2010. These documents were also shared with ICOMOS during the 34th session of the Committee (Brasilia, 2010).

The Management Plan was prepared by the State Party of Cambodia during 2009 and benefitted from several technical missions to the property by a team of international experts. It was submitted to the World Heritage Centre on 1 February 2010.

On 6 December 2010, the State Party of Cambodia submitted to the World Heritage Centre an international assistance request to organize a technical seminar on the conservation, preservation and management of the Temple of Preah Vihear. The request was favourably reviewed by the Advisory Bodies (ICOMOS and ICCROM) and the World Heritage Centre in January 2011 and was recommended to the Chairperson for approval of the requested amount of USD 30,000 on the condition that experts/participants from Thailand would be also invited for this activity. Due to the subsequent developments in and around the property, the request is pending approval by the Chairperson.

In early February 2011, the tense situation along the Cambodian – Thai border led to the increased tensions and confrontations between the two countries since their recent confrontation began in 2008. As reported by both sides, armed forces exchanged fire, from 4 to 7 February, causing a number of civilian and military deaths, displacement of civilian populations and physical destruction.

UNESCO does not have first-hand reports of the situation on the ground. Both sides have provided their accounts of the events in several letters that have been communicated to the Director-General of UNESCO, Chairperson of the Committee or the Chairperson of the Executive Board.

UNESCO followed the situation closely and repeatedly urged both States Parties to resolve the dispute peacefully and to defuse tension around the property. With a view to better assessing the situation and moving towards a dialogue between the two sides, the Director-General of UNESCO decided to dispatch, a Special Envoy mission by the former Director-General, Mr Koichiro Matsuura from 24 February to 1 March 2011. Mr Matsuura met with the two heads of Government in their respective capitals to encourage them to pursue dialogue and cooperation. As a result of this mission, it was agreed that a bilateral meeting between Cambodia and Thailand, facilitated by the UNESCO Director-General, take place on 25 May 2011 at UNESCO Headquarters in Paris, before the Information Meeting of the World Heritage Committee, scheduled for 26 May 2011.

On 26 April 2011, further escalations occurred in an area west of the property between the two military troops in the border area between Cambodia and Thailand.

The fighting in February and April 2011 was more sustained, and reportedly included the use of heavy weapons. Prior to the clashes, both countries had reportedly reinforced their military deployment in the region after a disagreement over the presence of national flags in the disputed zone. As a result of the fighting, several thousand of civilians were reported to have been displaced in both countries.

An Emergency Assistance request for an amount of USD 74,422 from the World Heritage Fund was submitted by the Secretary-General of the Cambodian National Commission for UNESCO to the World Heritage Centre on 13 April 2011. The project aims to undertake emergency cleaning and conservation interventions at the property. At the time of preparing this report, the request has been evaluated positively by the Advisory Bodies (ICOMOS and ICCROM) after several clarifications were sought from the State Party of Cambodia. The request requires the approval of the Chairperson of the World Heritage Committee.

The Director-General of UNESCO facilitated individual and bilateral meetings between the delegations of the Kingdoms of Cambodia and Thailand on 25, 26 and 27 May at the UNESCO Headquarters in Paris. The two parties reaffirmed their commitment to ensuring the protection and conservation of the property and preventing future damage. The need to implement urgent repair and restoration measures was also recognised, as was the need to continue dialogue and consultations leading up to the 35th session of the World Heritage Committee.

Conclusions:

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies consider it is important to re-establish a dialogue between the parties at the earliest possible time in order to prevent damage to the World Heritage property.

Draft Decision: 35 COM 7B.62

The draft Decision will be presented to the World Heritage Committee during the session.

EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

110. Cathedral, Alcázar and Archivo de Indias in Seville (Spain) (C 383 rev)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List
1987

Criteria
(i) (ii) (iii) (vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger
N/A

Previous Committee Decisions
33 COM 7B.123; 34 COM 8B.61; 34 COM 7B.100

International Assistance
N/A

UNESCO extra-budgetary funds
N/A

Previous monitoring missions
N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports
High-rise development in the vicinity of the property.

Illustrative material
<http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/383>

Current conservation issues

Further to the World Heritage Committee's discussion at its 34th session (Brasilia, 2010) and Decision **34 COM 7B.1 00**, the State Party invited an ICOMOS advisory mission to the property, by letter dated 10 December 2010, in order to assess the state of the construction work on the Torre Pelli - Cajasol project, prior to the 35th session of the Committee. At the time of the preparation of this working document, the advisory mission had not taken place.

In accordance with Decision **34 COM 7B.100**, the State Party's report was received on 31 May 2011. This report provides information on the profile of the buffer zone and setting of the property but does not provide information on the status of the Torre Pelli-Cajasol project nor address the request of the Committee to "reconsider the current project in order to avoid any possible adverse impact on the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property" or its request to submit information on the "steps taken in order to avoid any possible adverse impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property".

The State Party sets out views on the way perceptions of the city have changed over the centuries, but affirms that despite the natural growth of population and the expansion of neighbourhoods during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, "Seville city has retained the urban profile of the historic city. The Arsenal, the Giralda and city towers as backdrop maintain the profile by which the city was universally known during five centuries".

However it maintains that the growth and development of the city has created new forms and new urban landscapes with new landmarks and visual references which bring the need for new conceptions of the concept of monument and historic landscape. It goes on to say that

now is the time to “face and extend the policies of protection and reappraisal of the urban landscape which is the site of monuments declared and the measures to recuperate the Columbine imprint in the Buffer Zone, as resolved in Decision **34 COM 8E**”.

It states that it is in general essential to “guarantee the iconographic archetype and the already consolidated image of the Seville represented during the sixteenth to the nineteenth centuries so that the vision from the calle Betis does not suffer any visual contamination which alters it” and to incorporate visual analysis of views and routes in the Buffer Zone Special Plans. Furthermore it stresses the need to accelerate Special Protection Plans to ensure that the attributes of OUV can be taken into account in the planning process.

The report makes only one mention of Torre Pelli-Cajasol and refers to “its irreversible nature”. What is not made clear is the status of the project nor how the analysis of the urban landscape and the Special Protection Plans will relate to the Tower and to other similar proposals.

In October 2010, the World Heritage Centre received information from local NGOs on the on-going construction works of the Torre Pelli. The World Heritage Centre also continues to receive complaints from a local NGO, as part of its mailing campaign against the construction of the tower.

Conclusions

At the time of drafting this report, the advisory mission requested by the State Party had not been undertaken; therefore no information is available on the status of the Torre Pelli-Cajasol project nor of any specific measures to mitigate its adverse impact on Outstanding Universal Value.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies recommend that the World Heritage Committee express its concern at the potential adverse impact of this project on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property and at the way this project appears to run quite counter to the detailed work being undertaken to characterise and protect the urban landscape of the property and its setting.

Draft Decision: 35 COM 7B.110

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC-11/35.COM/7B.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **34 COM 7B.100**, adopted at its 34th session (Brasilia, 2010),*
3. *Notes that an ICOMOS advisory mission was invited by the State Party;*
4. *Expresses its concern at the potential adverse impact of the Torre Pelli-Cajasol project on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;*
5. *Reiterates its request to the State Party to halt the construction works and reconsider the current high-rise project in order to avoid any possible adverse impact on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;*
6. *Requests the State Party to inform as soon as possible the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS about any new developments related to the Torre Pelli-Cajasol project and*

any other development projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;

7. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2012**, a report on the state of conservation of the property, including a progress report on the Torre Pelli-Cajasol project, for review by the World Heritage Committee at its 36th session in 2012.*