



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

36 COM

WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add
Paris, 1 June 2012
Original: English/French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thirty-sixth session

Saint Petersburg, Russian Federation
24 June – 6 July 2012

Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List

Summary

This Addendum is divided into four sections:

- I. Examination of nominations to be processed on an emergency basis;
- II. Examination of nominations referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee;
- III. Examination of minor boundary modifications of natural, mixed and cultural properties to the World Heritage List;
- IV. Statements of Outstanding Universal Value of the twelve properties inscribed at the 35th session (UNESCO, 2011) and not adopted by the World Heritage Committee;

Decisions required:

The Committee is requested to examine the Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraphs 153, 161 and 162 of the *Operational Guidelines*, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) properties which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) properties which it **decides not to inscribe** on the World Heritage List;
- (c) properties whose consideration is **referred**;
- (d) properties whose consideration is **deferred**.

In the presentation below, **ICOMOS Recommendations** and **IUCN Recommendations** are both presented in the form of **Draft Decisions** and are abstracted from documents *WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add*, *WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add2* (ICOMOS) and *WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B2* (IUCN).

Though Draft Decisions were taken from IUCN and ICOMOS evaluation books, in some cases, a few modifications were required to adapt them to this Document.

I. Examination of nominations to be processed on an emergency basis

[paragraphs 161 and 162 of the *Operational Guidelines*]

III.H Nominations to be processed on an emergency basis

161. The normal timetable and definition of completeness for the submission and processing of nominations will not apply in the case of properties which, in the opinion of the relevant Advisory Bodies, would **unquestionably** meet the criteria for inscription on the World Heritage List and which have suffered damage or face serious and specific dangers from natural events or human activities. Such nominations will be processed on an emergency basis and may be inscribed simultaneously on the World Heritage List and on the List of World Heritage in Danger (see paragraphs 177-191).

162. The procedure for nominations to be processed on an emergency basis is as follows:

- a) A State Party presents a nomination with the request for processing on an emergency basis. The State Party shall have already included, or immediately include, the property on its Tentative List.
- b) The nomination shall:
 - i) describe and identify the property;
 - ii) justify its outstanding universal value according to the criteria;
 - iii) justify its integrity and/or authenticity;
 - iv) describe its protection and management system;
 - v) describe the nature of the emergency, including the nature and extent of the damage or danger and showing that immediate action by the Committee is necessary for the survival of the property.
- c) The Secretariat immediately transmits the nomination to the relevant Advisory Bodies, requesting an assessment of its outstanding universal value, and of the nature of the emergency, damage and/or danger. A field visit may be necessary if the relevant Advisory Bodies consider it appropriate;
- d) If the relevant Advisory Bodies determine that the property **unquestionably** meets the criteria for inscription, and that the requirements (see a) above) are satisfied, the examination of the nomination will be added to the agenda of the next session of the Committee;

e) When reviewing the nomination the Committee will also consider:

- i) inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
- ii) allocation of International Assistance to complete the nomination; and
- iii) follow-up missions as necessary by the Secretariat and the relevant Advisory Bodies as soon as possible after inscription.

A.1 ARAB STATES

Property	Birthplace of Jesus: Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem
Id. N°	1433
State Party	Palestine
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iv)(vi)

See ICOMOS Evaluation Book, Additional 2, May 2012, page 1.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.5

The World Heritage Committee,

1. **Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add2,**
2. **Does not consider** that the conditions required by paragraph 161 of the Operational Guidelines are fully met, concerning damage or serious and specific dangers to the Church of the Nativity that make its condition an emergency that needs to be addressed by the World Heritage Committee with immediate action necessary for the survival of the property;
3. **Decides not to inscribe the Birthplace of Jesus: the Church of the Nativity and the Pilgrimage Route, Bethlehem, Palestine, on the World Heritage List on an emergency basis;**
4. **Encourages** the State Party to resubmit the nomination in accordance with normal procedures for nomination, to allow a proper assessment of integrity, authenticity, and conservation, and proper consideration of management arrangements and of the appropriate boundaries for the property, in relation to its links with the surrounding town;
5. **Recommends** that the international community be encouraged to facilitate the conservation of the property;
6. **Also recommends,** on the basis of the information so far provided, that this nomination should not be considered as being the first nomination of a serial property of sites that reflect the birth and life of Jesus and encourages the State Party re-consider this approach;
7. **Further recommends** that ICOMOS provide support to the State Party as may be appropriate, in the spirit of the "Upstream" support.

A.2 EUROPE AND NORTH AMERICA

Property	The Chauvet - Pont d'Arc decorated cave
Id. N°	1426
State Party	France
Criteria proposed by State Party	(i)(iii)

See ICOMOS Evaluation Book, Additional 2, May 2012, page 12.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.6

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add2,
2. Does not consider that the conditions required by paragraph 161 of the Operational Guidelines are fully met, as no severe damage or serious and specific dangers to the Grotte Chauvet have been demonstrated;
3. Decides not to inscribe the **Chauvet – Pont d'Arc decorated cave, France**, on the World Heritage List on an emergency basis;
4. Encourages the State Party to resubmit the nomination in accordance with the normal procedures for World Heritage nomination.

II. Examination of nominations referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

B.1 AFRICA

Property	Historic Town of Grand-Bassam
Id. N°	1322 Rev
State Party	Côte d'Ivoire
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(iv)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 5.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.17

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the nomination of the **Historic Town of Grand-Bassam, Côte d'Ivoire**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Specify the contour of the property on the basis of cadastral boundaries at several points (western boundary of the historic town, beach, lighthouse) and indicate the number of inhabitants inside the property;
 - b) Enlarge the property's buffer zone by reverting to the initially planned boundaries near the Quai du Petit Paris and the lighthouse, while retaining the current extension which unifies the buffer zone;
 - c) Inscribe all the "buildings of heritage interest" in the local inventory on the National Cultural Heritage List;
 - d) Clarify the land ownership situation, as the number of land lots announced is the same as in the initial dossier (of 2008), even though the property has been extended to include the N'zima village, and in relation to land lots for which there is no property deed;
 - e) Define operational monitoring indicators (in addition to the current indicators) which correspond to precise, periodic and quantified monitoring actions, by considering international standards in this area;
 - f) Strengthen and give details of the permanent human resources of the Local Committee and/or of the Cultural Heritage Centre for the property conservation monitoring actions; the presence of an architect and of conservation specialists is necessary.
3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Providing a progress report on the setting up and functioning of the Building Permits Commission;

- b) Carrying out the detailed heritage inventory of the built structure of the property and complete the existing data base;
- c) Continuing the efforts undertaken to reinforce the practical and operational dimension of the Plan for the Conservation and Management of the property;
- d) Confirming the measures to provide encouragement for the restoration and conservation of the privately owned buildings.

B.2 ARAB STATES

Property	Pearling, testimony of an island economy
Id. N°	1364 Rev
State Party	Bahrain
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(v)

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 18.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.20

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Inscribes **Pearling, testimony of an island economy, Bahrain**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteria (iii)**;
3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The traditional sea-use of harvesting pearls from oyster beds in the Persian Gulf shaped the island of Bahrain's economy for millennia. As the best-known source of pearls since ancient times, the Gulf industry reached the apex of its prosperity at the end of the 19th and beginning of the 20th centuries. The wealth of what had become a global trade is reflected in the development of the merchant quarters of Muharraq city. A few distinctive commercial and residential buildings remain as a testimony to this proud but dangerous and demanding economic activity which suffered a sudden and catastrophic demise in the 1930s as a result of the development in Japan of cultured pearls from freshwater mussels. The property includes seventeen buildings embedded in the urban fabric of Muharraq city, three off shore oyster beds, and a part of the seashore at the southern tip of Muharraq Island, from where the boats set off for the oyster beds. The architectural testimony comprises residential and commercial structures that are tangible manifestations of the major social and economic roles and institutions associated with the pearling society. Most of the structures have survived relatively unaltered since the collapse of the pearl industry in the early 20th century and bear witness to distinctive building traditions that the industry fostered, and particularly their high standard of craftsmanship in timber and plaster. These buildings evoke memories of that industry, its supporting social and economic structures, and of the cultural identity it produced.

Criterion (iii): The ensemble of urban properties, fort, seashore and oyster beds is an exceptional testimony to

the final flourishing of the cultural tradition of pearling which dominated the Persian Gulf between the 2nd and early 20th centuries. Although the pearling industry has died, these sites carry the memory of its prosperity and the building traditions that it fostered.

Integrity

The property reflects the buildings created as a result of the great prosperity of the pearl industry in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, and its economic structures. It also reflects the oyster beds upon which the prosperity was based and the seashore link between land and sea. The choice of urban sites was limited by the neglect of the pearl industry's heritage since the industry's demise in the 1930s almost until the new millennium. As a result many buildings were demolished and those that remain have suffered from neglect and the adverse effects of new development around them. The urban sites chosen reflect extensive architectural, anthropological and historical surveys and are seen as those that carry the memory of the pearling industry for the local community. They variously reflect the key activities of merchants associated with the pearl industry as well as its building traditions. The nominated urban sites are thus islands within the city. They are still extremely vulnerable with many of the buildings needing extensive work to give them satisfactory stability. The oyster beds are not under threat and neither is the sea shore or fort. To maintain integrity, great care will be needed in stabilising and conserving the structures so that the optimum amount of original fabric can be kept and traditional materials and processes are used. It will also be necessary to ensure that the nominated sites can be seen to relate sympathetically to the wider urban structures within which they are embedded.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the property is related to its ability to convey the Outstanding Universal Value in terms of transmitting information about the social and economic process of the pearl industry. In terms of the buildings this relates to their ability to manifest their status, use, architectural form, local materials and techniques and their craftsmanship – particularly the exceptionally high quality of some of the craftsmanship deployed in timber and plaster work. Many of the urban buildings are highly vulnerable in terms of their fabric and decoration as a result of lack of use and maintenance. Any work will need to ensure minimum intervention in order that as much as possible of the original material is conserved so that the buildings may still provide tangible links to the decades of their former glory while being robust enough for use and a degree of access. For the fort there is a need to reverse some of the restoration of the last few decades and to re-introduce traditional materials. The underwater oyster beds are still thriving, although there is nothing to convey their sea-harvesting traditions; the sea shore, although a fraction of what used to exist and now much compromised by later development nevertheless adds an important attribute, and is a focal point for important intangible cultural associations that relate to pearling. The fragility of the urban fabric presents a potential threat to authenticity as conservation, if overdone, could erase the memory that the buildings currently evoke.

Protection and Management requirements

The Bū Māhir Seashore and the individual sites in Muharraq all have national protection as designated national monuments under Decree Law No (11) of 1995

Concerning the Protection of Antiquities on 10 January 2010, and their future management resides under the Ministry of Culture. The three oyster beds and their marine buffer zone are currently generally protected at a national level in terms of Decree (2) 1995 with respect to the Protection of Wildlife; Legislative Decree No. 21 of 1996 in respect with the Environment (Amiri Decree); and Decree (20) 2002 with respect to the Regulation of Fishing and Exploitation of Marine Resources. A legislative decree that specifically designates the marine sites and buffer zone as a national marine protected area was approved in 2011. In November 2011, the Ministry of Culture drew up a Vision for the development of old Muharraq – both the sites being nominated and the entire area of old Muharraq that surrounds them, which includes the buffer zone. This sets out a holistic approach for preserving the historic character of Muharraq under two key 'perspectives', legal and societal. The new laws to limit the increase in unplanned construction or population, prevent the deterioration of the special character of the urban fabric, and protect sites, urban settlements and antiquities should be in place at the end of 2013. The Societal framework will aim to assert the identity of the Old Muharraq area, through upgrading living standards; specific restoration projects and design guidance. This approach will allow for the buffer zone to be managed as the urban context for the nominated sites and for them to be part of a living dynamic city. A dedicated Site Administration Unit has been established within the Ministry of Culture to co-ordinate the implementation of the management system. The Unit, which reports to the Undersecretary for Culture, consists of an interdisciplinary team including researchers, conservation architects, an urban planner and rehabilitation specialist, a marine biologist and environmental specialist, a site manager for the urban properties and a GIS specialist, all supported by an administrative team which deals with finances, marketing, etc. A Steering Committee has been established as the governing body of the management and administrative system for the nominated properties. The Committee brings together at ministerial level, members of the 12 governmental agencies representing the full range of partners and stakeholders in the project, as well as representatives of the private owners of the Muharraq properties and the businesses in the urban buffer zone. The Steering Committee is chaired by the Minister of Culture. A Management Plan is in place for the property. In order to address the challenges of restoring the fragile buildings within Muharraq, and maintaining them on an ongoing basis, there is a need for training in traditional skills, particularly in woodwork and fine plaster techniques, and for the development of knowledge in traditional materials. The State Party has indicated its commitment to this training, at a practical site level and as part of university education. There will also be a need to ensure that the context of the nominated sites is respected within urban Muharraq.

Disclaimer concerning the text of the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the site 'Pearling, testimony of an island economy', Kingdom of Bahrain

With reference to the text of the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the site 'Pearling, testimony of an island economy', Kingdom of Bahrain, it should be noted that, according to the United Nations directives of 15 May 1999 (ref.ST/CS/SER.A/29/Rev.1) the term 'Persian Gulf', 'Gulf' and 'Shatt-al-Arab' shall be referred to and used in all documents, publications and statements emanating from the Secretariat as the standard geographical designation of the sea area between the Arabian Peninsula and the Islamic Republic of Iran.

III. Examination of minor boundary modifications of natural, mixed and cultural properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Alphabetical Summary Table and Index of Recommendations by IUCN and ICOMOS to the 36th session of the World Heritage Committee (24 June – 6 July 2012)

State Party	World Heritage nomination	ID No.		Recomm.	Pp
NATURAL PROPERTIES					
India	Manas Wildlife Sanctuary	338	Bis	NA	6
United Republic of Tanzania	Selous Game Reserve	199	Bis	NA	6
MIXED NATURAL AND CULTURAL PROPERTIES					
Australia	Tasmanian Wilderness	181	Quater	OK/OK	6
China	Mount Huangshan	547	Bis	OK/OK	7
CULTURAL PROPERTIES					
China	Old Town of Lijiang	811	Bis	OK	7
Colombia	Historic Centre of Santa Cruz de Mompox	742	Bis	R/OK	10
Cyprus	Choirokoitia	848	Bis	OK	9
Czech Republic	Historic Centre of Prague	616	Bis	OK	9
Finland	Fortress of Suomenlinna	583	Bis	NA	10
India	Group of Monuments at Mahabalipuram	249	Bis	R	7
India	Khajuraho Group of Monuments	240	Bis	R	7
India	Group of Monuments at Hampi	241	Bis	OK	8
India	Sun Temple, Konârak	246	Bis	R	8
India	Agra Fort	251	Bis	R	8
India	Fatehpur Sikri	255	Bis	R	8
India	Buddhist Monuments at Sanchi	524	Bis	R	9
India	Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus (formerly Victoria Terminus)	945	Bis	NA	9
Lithuania	Vilnius Historic Centre	541	Bis	OK	10
Montenegro	Natural and Culturo-Historical Region of Kotor	125	Bis	R/OK	9
Spain	Old Town of Segovia and its Aqueduct	311	Bis	R	10
Tunisia	Archaeological Site of Carthage	37	Bis	R	7
United Kingdom	Studley Royal Park including the Ruins of Fountains Abbey	372	Bis	OK	10

KEY

R Recommended for referral
 OK Approval Recommended of a modification
 NA Not approved modification

C.1 NATURAL PROPERTIES

C.1.1 AFRICA

Property	Selous Game Reserve
Id. N°	199 Bis
State Party	United Republic of Tanzania

See IUCN Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 67.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.43

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B2,
2. Recalling Decisions **33 COM 7B.8, 34 COM 7B.3, 35 COM 7B.6 and 35 COM 8B.46**;
3. Decides not to approve the proposed minor boundary modification of the **Selous Game Reserve, United Republic of Tanzania**, as it considers that the excision of an area of c.40,000 ha to facilitate mining inside the present boundary of the property clearly has some impact on Outstanding Universal Value, and thus does not conform to the requirements set out in the Operational Guidelines for a minor modification;
4. Takes note of the progress in considering the potential environmental and social impacts of the proposed modification, and also takes note that the actions requested in its 35COM decision have not yet been completed;
5. Requests the State Party to consider, at its own discretion, resubmitting any proposal to amend the boundaries of the property through the established process for consideration of significant modification of boundaries, taking account of the need to:
 - a) complete the independent review of the revised Environmental Impact Statement for the proposal, and the associated proposal for mining development, prior to further assessment by IUCN;
 - b) develop firm plans to address the impacts of any amendment to the boundaries of the property, to assure the Outstanding Universal Value of the property is maintained and effectively protected;
 - c) ensure that the Environmental Impact Statement has been fully consulted and agreed on with the involvement of all relevant stakeholders;
 - d) ensure that any revision to the boundaries of the property is in line with the previous decisions of the Committee, including the commitments of the State Party, welcomed by the 35th Session of the Committee, to enhance the continued effectiveness of the Selous-Niassa corridor as a key feature to maintaining the long-term integrity of the property, and also to make proposals for the inclusion into the property of additional land to the effect of further maintaining and enhancing the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

C.1.2 ASIA / PACIFIC

Property	Manas Wildlife Sanctuary
Id. N°	338 Bis
State Party	India

See IUCN Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 75.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.44

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B2,
2. Recalling Decision **35 COM 7A.13**;
3. Decides not to approve the proposed minor boundary modification of the **Manas Wildlife Sanctuary, India**, as it considers that it is sufficiently significant as to constitute a significant boundary modification of the property;
4. Welcomes the proposal put forward by the State Party to include new areas within the **Manas Wildlife Sanctuary, India**, to coincide with the full extent of the Manas National Park, noting that the proposal was included within the report on the property considered under item 7B of the 36th session of the Committee;
5. Recommends the State Party to resubmit its proposal via the process established for significant boundary modifications, including the presentation of the necessary new nomination document, and the provision of adequate maps to the required standards established in the Operational Guidelines;
6. Requests the State Party to also consider the other proposals to extend the property, which were contained in Decision **35 COM 7A.13**;
7. Decides not to approve the proposed name change to Manas Wildlife Sanctuary as proposed by the Indian authorities.

C.2 MIXED NATURAL AND CULTURAL PROPERTIES

C.2.1 ASIA / PACIFIC

Property	Tasmanian Wilderness
Id. N°	181 Quater
State Party	Australia

See IUCN Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 129.

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 1.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.45

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add, WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B2,
2. Recalling Decision **34 COM 8B.46**;
3. Approves the minor modification of the boundaries of the property **Tasmanian Wilderness, Australia**, in line with the proposals of the State Party, and as previously

considered by the World Heritage Committee;

4. *Reiterates* its recommendation that the State Party consider further minor modifications to the boundaries of the property, considering the past decisions of the World Heritage Committee on boundaries in relation to the natural and cultural values.

Property	Mount Huangshan
Id. N°	547 Bis
State Party	China

See IUCN Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 133.
See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 3.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.46

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined* Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add, WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B2,
2. *Approves* the minor modification of **Mount Huangshan, China**, to extend the buffer zone to the property, in line with the proposals of the State Party;
3. *Requests* the State Party to provide descriptive information on the proposed buffer zone extension in relation to cultural values and to provide information regarding the controls applicable to development in the Special Plan for Huangshan Buffer Zone.

C.3 CULTURAL PROPERTIES

C.3.1 ARAB STATES

Property	Archaeological Site of Carthage
Id. N°	37 Bis
State Party	Tunisia

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 33.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.47

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined* Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. *Refers* the examination of the proposed buffer zone for the **Archaeological Site of Carthage, Tunisia**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to provide more information about the criteria used to define the buffer zone, about the existing regulations and measures which govern it and which will enable the protection of the property, and about the measures taken for buffer zone management.

C.3.2 ASIA / PACIFIC

Property	Old Town of Lijiang
Id. N°	811 Bis
State Party	China

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 34.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.48

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined* Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. *Approves* the proposed minor modification to the boundaries and the proposed buffer zones of the **Old Town of Lijiang, China**.

Property	Group of Monuments at Mahabalipuram
Id. N°	249 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 36.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.49

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined* Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. *Refers* the examination of the proposed minor modification to the boundary and the proposed reduction of buffer zone of the **Group of Monuments at Mahabalipuram, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) *Enlarge* the buffer zone so as to include all the nominated areas in one unified zone and safeguard the property from environmental hazards, tourism and urban pressures and ensure its boundaries respect the landscape features; thus allowing the Chennai Circle office and part of the road to be part of the buffer zone and not of the nominated areas;
 - b) *Provide* an adequate map showing the precise boundaries of the property and buffer zone either topographic or cadastral, presented at a scale which is appropriate to the size in hectares of the property, and bearing a labelled coordinate grid.

Property	Khajuraho Group of Monuments
Id. N°	240 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 38.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.50

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined* Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. *Refers* the examination of the proposed buffer zone for **Khajuraho Group of Monuments, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:

- a) *Enlarge the buffer zone so as to include the entire area once occupied by the ancient city of Khajuraho and ensure its boundaries respect the landscape features;*
- b) *Provide an adequate map showing the precise boundaries of the property and buffer zone and mapping the inscribed monuments, their prohibited and regulated areas as well as the demarcated mounds and other detected or potential archaeological areas either topographic or cadastral, presented at a scale which is appropriate to the size in hectares of the property, and bearing a labelled coordinate grid;*
- c) *Include the boundaries of the buffer zone within the existing planning instruments and develop safeguard and conservation measures to be incorporated into these plans;*
- d) *Protect formally the 18 demarcated mounds and extend to them the measures envisaged by the Notification n.1764 Dt.06/06/1992.*

Property	Group of Monuments at Hampi
Id. N°	241 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 40.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.51

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Approves the proposed extension to the buffer zone for the **Group of Monuments at Hampi, India**;*
3. *Recommends that the State Party continues for the future extension of the property and buffer zone towards the envisaged property boundaries presented in the integrated management plan.*

Property	Sun Temple, Konârak
Id. N°	246 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 42.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.52

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for **Sun Temple, Konârak, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:*
 - a) *Reconsider the boundaries of the buffer zone in order to put in place a buffer zone that is large enough to have an impact on development pressures, deforestation and pollution linked to stone erosion, and in particular consider extending the buffer zone to and along the coast to allow for*

an area where trees can be managed to control saline wind and blown sand;

- b) *Provide information on the protection and management arrangements for the proposed buffer zone and how these relate to acknowledged threats and to the approved plans for the property.*

Property	Agra Fort
Id. N°	251 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 44.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.53

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for **Agra Fort, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to reconsider the scope of the buffer zone to:*
 - a) *Reflect the recommendation of the World Heritage Committee at the time of inscription of the property to "create a buffer zone of protection between the Fort and the Taj Mahal so as to safeguard the landscape and the environment between these two quite different monuments";*
 - b) *Ensure its boundaries respect the landscape features.*

Property	Fatehpur Sikri
Id. N°	255 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 46.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.54

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,*
2. *Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for **Fatehpur Sikri, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:*
 - a) *Enlarge the proposed buffer zone in order to comply with the 'Revenue Map' as confirmed in 2011;*
 - b) *Provide an adequate map showing the precise boundaries of the property and buffer zone either topographic or cadastral, presented at a scale which is appropriate to the size in hectares of the property, and bearing a labelled coordinate grid;*
 - c) *Explain how the buffer zone will be legally protected and how it will protect the property from encroaching development.*

Property	Buddhist Monuments at Sanchi
Id. N°	524 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 48.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.55

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for **Buddhist Monuments at Sanchi, India**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Enlarge the proposed buffer zone to include the village to the north of Sanchi and the area named Khanakera Kalan and ensure its boundaries respect the landscape features;
 - b) Provide an adequate map showing the precise boundaries of the property and buffer zone either topographic or cadastral, presented at a scale which is appropriate to the size in hectares of the property, and bearing a labelled coordinate grid;
 - c) Include the boundaries of the buffer zone within the existing planning instruments and develop safeguard and conservation measures to be incorporated into these plans.

Property	Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus (formerly Victoria Terminus)
Id. N°	945 Bis
State Party	India

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 50.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.56

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Decides not to approve the proposed reduction of the buffer zone of **Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus (formerly Victoria Terminus), India**;
3. Recommends that Heritage Impact Assessments are carried out for the large conservation project of the CST building and the proposed development project within the buffer zone in order to ensure that these do not impact adversely on the Outstanding Universal Value of the property;
4. Urges the State Party to provide detailed information on these projects to the World Heritage Centre in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines.

C.3.3 EUROPE / NORTH AMERICA

Property	Choïrokoitia
Id. N°	848 Bis
State Party	Cyprus

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 52.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.57

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed minor modifications to the boundary and to the buffer zone of **Choïrokoitia, Cyprus**.

Property	Natural and Culturo-Historical Region of Kotor
Id. N°	125 Bis
State Party	Montenegro

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 54.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.58

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the examination of the proposed minor modification to the boundary of the **Natural and Culturo-Historical Region of Kotor, Montenegro**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to provide justification and detailed information on the proposed variations to the original 1979 property boundary;
3. Approves the proposed buffer zone for the **Natural and Culturo-Historical Region of Kotor, Montenegro**;
4. Recommends that the State Party establish as soon as possible a coordination of the Management Plan with the municipal urban planning documents to include controls applicable to development and infrastructure within the buffer zone. Such controls on development and infrastructure need to recognise the components necessary to the visual integrity of the property, including vistas and visual accents, horizontal and vertical relationships, materials and form of new construction, and must be integrated with the individual municipal plans in order to ensure the protection of the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

Property	Historic Centre of Prague
Id. N°	616 Bis
State Party	Czech Republic

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 56.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.59

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed buffer zones for the **Historic Centre of Prague, Czech Republic**.

Property	Fortress of Suomenlinna
Id. N°	583 Bis
State Party	Finland

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 58.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.60

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Decides not to approve the proposed reduction of the buffer zone for the **Fortress of Suomenlinna, Finland**;
3. Requests the State Party to put in place for the existing buffer zone zoning that reflects different planning needs, and which could be recognised by land-use and development plans.

Property	Vilnius Historic Centre
Id. N°	541 Bis
State Party	Lithuania

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 60.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.61

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed buffer zone for **Vilnius Historic Centre, Lithuania**;
3. Encourages the State Party to complete the Special Area Protection Plan: "design documentation of heritage management" currently being prepared to set or amend heritage protection requirements and the system of specific management measures in the Vilnius Old Town and its Buffer Zone and submit it to the World Heritage Committee for review.

Property	Old Town of Segovia and its Aqueduct
Id. N°	311 Bis
State Party	Spain

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 62.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.62

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the examination of the proposed buffer zone for the **Old Town of Segovia and its Aqueduct, Spain**, back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Provide a textual description and justification of the buffer zone boundary. This should consider views to and from the property and include an appropriate analysis;

- b) Provide detailed information regarding the protection afforded the buffer zone by the Special Plans for the Historical Areas of Segovia (PEAHIS), and on how the loop of aqueduct and buffer zone outside the Special Plan area (Plano UNESCO 8) will be protected.

Property	Studley Royal Park including the Ruins of Fountains Abbey
Id. N°	372 Bis
State Party	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 64.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.63

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Approves the proposed buffer zone for **Studley Royal Park including the Ruins of Fountains Abbey, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland**;
3. Recommends that the State Party give consideration to the following:
 - a) Redefining the boundary of the property as intended in the 2014 review of the Management Plan;
 - b) Considering and redefining or confirming the buffer zone boundary in the light of any proposed amendments to the property boundaries;
 - c) Finalising planning protection policies for the vista to Ripon Cathedral.

C.3.4 LATIN AMERICA / CARIBBEAN

Property	Historic Centre of Santa Cruz de Mompox
Id. N°	742 Bis
State Party	Colombia

See ICOMOS Additional Evaluation Book, May 2012, page 66.

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.64

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add and WHC-12/36.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Refers the examination of the proposed minor modification to the boundary of **Historic Centre of Santa Cruz de Mompox, Colombia** back to the State Party in order to allow it to:
 - a) Extend the property boundary only to the east to include the river and east bank to the extent of the original width of the river opposite the currently inscribed property and for the length of the currently inscribed property;

- b) Provide an adequate map of the property and buffer zone indicating their precise boundaries either topographic or cadastral, presented at a scale which is appropriate to the size in hectares of the property, including title and legend in English and bearing a labelled coordinate grid.*
3. Approves the proposed buffer zone for **Historic Centre of Santa Cruz de Mompox, Colombia**.

IV. Statements of Outstanding Universal Value of the twelve properties inscribed at the 35th session (UNESCO, 2011) and not adopted by the World Heritage Committee

Draft Decision: 36 COM 8B.65

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC-12/36.COM/8B.Add,
2. Adopts the following Statements of Outstanding Universal Value for the following World Heritage properties inscribed at the 35th session of the World Heritage Committee (UNESCO, 2011):
 - Ethiopia: Konso Cultural Landscape;
 - Kenya: Fort Jesus, Mombasa;
 - Jordan: Wadi Rum Protected Area;
 - Sudan: Archaeological Sites of the Island of Meroe;
 - United Arab Emirates: Cultural Sites of Al Ain (Hafit, Hili, Bidaa Bint Saud and Oases Areas);
 - Mongolia: Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai;
 - Viet Nam: Citadel of the Ho Dynasty;
 - Germany / Slovakia / Ukraine: Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and the Ancient Beech Forests of Germany;
 - Spain: Cultural Landscape of the Serra de Tramuntana;
 - Ukraine: Residence of Bukovinian and Dalmatian Metropolitans;
 - Barbados: Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison;
 - Colombia: Coffee Cultural Landscape of Colombia;

The traditional forests are used as burial places for ritual leaders and for medicinal purposes. Wooden anthropomorphic statues (*waka*), carved out of a hard wood and mimicking the deceased, are erected as grave markers. Water reservoirs (*harda*) located in or near these forests, are communally built and are, like the terraces, maintained by very specific communal social and cultural practices.

Criterion (iii): The Konso Cultural Landscape integrates spectacularly executed dry stone terrace works, which are still actively used by the Konso people, who created them. They bear testimony to the enormous efforts required to use the otherwise hostile environment in an area that covers over 230 square km, an effort which stands as an example of major human achievement. The association between these stone terraces and the fortified towns in their midst are features of an exceptional cultural landscape, which also bears testimony to a living tradition of stele erection. The Konso erect stone steles to commemorate and mark the transfer of responsibility from the older generation to the younger. Konso are among the last stele-erecting people and thus their continuous practice presents an exceptional testimony to an ongoing cultural tradition.

Criterion (v): The relation of the stone terraces and the fortified towns of Konso Cultural Landscape, and its highly organized social system, illustrates an outstanding example of a traditional human settlement and land-use, based on common values that have resulted in the creation of the Konso cultural and socio-economic fabric. The dry stone terraces show a sophisticated adaptive strategy to the environment and the labor needed to construct these terraces necessitated a strong cohesion and unified bond among the clans. This interaction with the environment is based on indigenous engineering knowledge and requires traditional work divisions, which are still utilized to consistently perform maintenance and conservation works.

D.1 AFRICA

Property	Konso Cultural Landscape
State Party	Ethiopia
Id. N°	1333 Rev
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief Synthesis

The Konso Cultural Landscape is characterized by extensive dry stone terraces bearing witness to the persistent human struggle to use and harness the hard, dry and rocky environment. The terraces retain the soil from erosion, collect a maximum of water, discharge the excess, and create terraced fields that are used for agriculture. The terraces are the main features of the Konso landscape and the hills are contoured with the dry stone walls, which at places reach up to 5 meters in height.

The walled towns and settlements (*paletas*) of the Konso Cultural Landscape are located on high plains or hill summits selected for their strategic and defensive advantage. These towns are circled by between one and six rounds of dry stone defensive walls, built of locally available rock. The cultural spaces inside the walled towns, called *moras*, retain an important and central role in the life of the Konso. Some walled towns have as many as 17 *moras*. The tradition of erecting generation marking stones called *daga-hela*, quarried, transported and erected through a ritual process, makes the Konso one of the last megalithic people.

Integrity

The boundaries of the Konso Cultural Landscape coincide with natural features, like rivers or edges of densely terraced landscape, and are demarcated by the cultural and socio-economic history of the Konso people. All components relevant to the understanding of the traditional system have been included, such as the key tangible attributes of terraces, walled settlements, sacred forests, shrines and burial sites. The clear distinctive character of the landscape is vulnerable to dispersal of the fortified settlements, in case houses are built outside the town walls.

Authenticity

The Konso Cultural Landscape still largely retains its original form and design. The materials used for the construction of the terraces and the town walls are original and their conservation continues following traditional practices, executed by the community members. The terraces continue in their original arrangements, use and function. The walled towns are still inhabited by the communities and remain organized following the traditional system. The traditionally protected forests are still protected and used for ritual and burial and the water reservoirs remain in use and are periodically conserved. Associated traditions, which continue shaping the landscape, such as the ritual erection of generation and man-hood stones and generation trees continues to be actively practiced. The same applies for the

use of the moras and the erection of wakas on the graves. The communities nurture the traditional code of respect to the culture and adherence to the age group (hela) and the ward (kanta), which is responsible for the protection and conservation of the attributes and continues the traditional guardianship.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected by traditional, regional and federal laws. The regional 'Proclamation to provide for the protection of Konso Cultural Landscape Heritage' (2010) gives protection to the nominated area including the 12 walled towns and endorses the traditional management system. The traditional code of management is practiced side by side with the modern administrative system and elected community members and elders ensure the protection and management of the cultural properties. In addition, management committees are formed at different levels – community and district – and a Konso Cultural Landscape Management Office with governmental personnel has been established on-site, to address primarily planning, funding, supervision and conservation tasks. Development is strictly regulated in the 2010 proclamation and no development may occur within 50 meters of the outermost walls of the fortified towns.

A management plan sets out in detail the current management structures and explains how the Konso community, through its recognized village committees and the district management committee, will endeavour to ensure the necessary standards of conservation. Presentation and visitor management strategies could yet be better addressed by the community to be of more benefit to the community itself. Supportive funds, including through international cooperation, could contribute to the long-term viability of the traditional management system.

Property	Fort Jesus, Mombasa
State Party	Kenya
Id. N°	1295 Rev
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

Built by the Portuguese at the end of the 16th century at the southern edge of the town of Mombasa, over a spur of coral rock, and kept under their control for one century, Fort Jesus, Mombasa, bears testimony to the first successful attempt by Western civilization to rule the Indian ocean trade routes, which, until then had remained under Eastern influence. The design of the fort, with its proportions, its imposing walls and five bastions, reflects the military architectural theory of the Renaissance. Fort Jesus, Mombasa, bears physical witness, in its structures and subsequent transformations, also to the interchange of cultural values and influences between and among peoples of African, Arab, Turkish, Persian and European origin that fought to gain and maintain their control over this strategic port.

Criterion (ii): Built in a period and in a region, which were at the centre of the emerging political, commercial, and cultural globalisation, Fort Jesus, with its imposing structure, and the various traces of subsequent modifications, bears significant witness to the interchange of cultural values among peoples of African, Arab, Turkish, Persian and European origin. Built and occupied first by the Portuguese, Fort Jesus, Mombasa, changed hands many times throughout its history, coming under Arab, Swahili and English control. Its important role in

the control of trade also saw it host many of the peoples of the Indian Ocean basin.

Criterion (iv): Fort Jesus, Mombasa, eminently exemplifies a new type of fortification that resulted from the innovations in military and weapons technology that occurred between the 15th and 16th centuries. In its layout and form, the Fort reflects the Renaissance ideal whose architectural proportions and geometric harmony are to be found in the proportions of the human body, while at the same time meeting the functional needs of a modern and well-defended fortification. The original layout of the Fort, despite several changes, has survived almost unchanged over centuries of continued occupations and reoccupations.

Integrity

The boundaries of the property have been delineated to include the underwater archaeological remains in the expanse of sea in front of Fort Jesus as well as the moat area adjacent to Mombasa Old Town. Minor changes inside the Fort bear witness to its history and do not threaten its integrity. The property is in good conditions and there is no urban or development encroachment in its immediate vicinity. Mombasa Old Town, which is integral to Fort Jesus' historic context, acts as the buffer zone of the Fort.

Authenticity

In regard to authenticity, Fort Jesus, Mombasa, has retained its form, design and materials, with coral stone and lime mortar still being used in the traditional way, where necessary, for repair and conservation work. It has also retained its authenticity of setting, located on an otherwise unbuilt property along the coast of Mombasa Island adjacent to the Mombasa Old Town with which it shares a common history.

Protection and management requirements

The legal protection system for the property is adequate: Fort Jesus, Mombasa, was originally designated a National Park in 1958, the protected area included the Fort itself and a 100-meter strip around it; today it falls under the National Museums and Heritage Act, 2006. The buffer zone has been formally declared a Conservation Area, however, a discrepancy between the size of the designated Conservation Area and the size of the Buffer Zone has not been amended yet.

A satisfactory management plan has been put in place for the property with the National Museums of Kenya acting as the key stakeholder in its conservation and safeguarding. Long-term conservation and management issues include the protection of the Fort from urban encroachment and inappropriate design in the areas adjacent to the Fort and in the surrounding Mombasa Old Town, which require the reinforcement of dedicated management structures and staff, control of erosion of the rocks along the sea coast, and the ongoing maintenance and conservation of the Fort itself.

D.2 ARAB STATES

Property	Wadi Rum Protected Area
State Party	Jordan
Id. N°	1377
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

Wadi Rum Protected Area (WRPA) is located in the southern part of Jordan, east of the Rift Valley and south of the steep

escarpment of the central Jordanian plateau. It comprises an area of 74,200 hectares. WRPA's natural values include desert landforms developed within continental sandstones. These landforms have been developed under the influence of a combination of various controlling factors, such as lithology, tectonic activities (including rapid uplift, numerous faults and joints) and surface processes (including various types of weathering and erosion associated with desert climate as well as humid climates in the past), representing million years of ongoing landscape evolution.

Widespread petroglyphs, inscriptions and archaeological remains testify to 12,000 years of human occupation and interaction with the natural environment, illustrating the evolution of pastoral, agricultural and urban human activity in the Arabian Peninsula and the environmental history of the region.

Criterion (iii): The rock art, inscriptions and archaeological evidence in WRPA can be considered an exceptional testimony of the cultural traditions of its early inhabitants. The combination of 25,000 petroglyphs, 20,000 inscriptions, and 154 archaeological sites provides evidence to continuity of habitation and land-use over a period of at least 12,000 years. The petroglyphs, representing human and animal figures, are engraved on boulders, stones, and cliff faces. They provide evidence of long-term patterns of pastoral, agricultural and urban human activity in the property. Engravings indicate an elaborate sense of aesthetics in a pictorial culture, and the archaeological findings span all eras from the Neolithic to the Nabataean. Thamudic, Nabataean and numerous Arabic inscriptions in four different scripts testify to the widespread literacy among its pastoral societies.

Criterion (v): The variety of landforms at WRPA has played an essential role in fostering human settlement. The rock art, inscriptions and water catchment systems document the settlements of successive communities, which developed in areas of mobile animal husbandry and agriculture and form part of a wider context of human interaction with the semi-arid eastern desert environment of the Arabian Peninsula. WRPA assists the understanding of the continuum of settled and mobile lifestyles in a desert landscape illustrating the adaptability and ingenuity of human communities who have made the most of scarce resources to sustain continuous presence after the climate became dryer in the Bronze Age (3rd millennium BC).

Criterion (vii): WRPA is recognised globally as an iconic desert landscape, renowned for its spectacular series of sandstone mountains and valleys, natural arches, and the range of narrow gorges, towering cliffs, massive landslides, and dramatic cavernous weathering forms displayed. Key attributes of the aesthetic values of the property include the diversity and sheer size of its landforms, together with the mosaic of colours, vistas into both narrow canyons and very large wadis, and the scale of the cliffs. The property displays, in a protected setting, an exceptional combination of landforms resulting from drainage incision, severe weathering by salt, biological and other processes, and the undermining of steep sandstone cliffs by these weathering processes, together with the world's most spectacular networks of honeycomb weathering features. Its associations with the writings of T.E. Lawrence, stressed strongly in the nomination, have ensured a high profile for the property and have reinforced its reputation of the area as a classic desert landscape both globally and within the Arab States.

Integrity

Since the identification of Wadi Rum as a potential nature reserve in 1978 the various landforms and cultural resources have been managed in a shared framework, which prevented extensive development impacts and maintained the landscape character of the property. The buffer zone of Rum Village contains significant cultural property values and the cultural landscape character of the property reaches even beyond the mostly 5 kilometers perimeter of the buffer zone.

Authenticity

The rock art remains in its original setting, largely unaltered except for the effects of weathering, which has led to its fading as result of rain and wind erosion, leaving some petroglyphs hard to distinguish. In addition modern graffiti has a negative impact on several of the original drawings and inscriptions. However, the fact that so many petroglyphs and inscriptions have been documented means that their ability to convey the cultural traditions of the people who made them continues and that they qualify as an important resource for research.

Protection and management requirements

WRPA was established in 1997 following cabinet decision no. 27/11/3226 (1997) and extended in 2002, following decision 224/11/1/986 (2002). It is further recognized as an archaeological site under the Law of the Department of Antiquities no. 21 (1988) and constitutes a Special Regulation Area under the Administration of the Aqaba Special Economic Zone. In addition to the existing protection for the property, special consideration may need to be given to archaeological artefacts to prevent their removal from the property.

The primary plan guiding the management and development program of WRPA is the Aqaba Special Economic Zone land use plan, which covers the whole governorate of Aqaba and is administrated by the Aqaba Special Economic Zone Authority. The property has an up to date management plan and an effective management unit, including rangers and other staff is dedicated to the management of the property. The management plan should provide emphasis to the management of the natural and cultural values of the property. A comprehensive survey and inventory of the natural and cultural resources, conservation and interpretation programme of the values of the property, and cooperation with antiquity authorities as management partners are all required. The WRPA requires continuous monitoring, preventive conservation of natural and cultural resources, and periodic updating of the management plan. A number of threats that have been identified require careful attention. In this context priority should be given to the impacts of visitor pressure, in particular car tracks and tourism infrastructure, but also the potential encroachment of the village of Rum, groundwater exploitation and firewood collection by local people. The wider tourism and planning policies for the property, its buffer zone and wider setting also should prioritise the protection of its Outstanding Universal Value.

Property	Archaeological Sites of the Island of Meroe
State Party	Sudan
Id. N°	1336
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The Island of Meroe is the heartland of the Kingdom of Kush, a major power in the ancient world from the 8th century BCE to the 4th century CE. Meroe became the principal residence of the rulers, and from the 3rd century BCE onwards it was the site of most royal burials.

The property consists of three separate site components, Meroe, the capital, which includes the town and cemetery site, and Musawwarat es-Sufra and Naqa, two associated settlements and religious centres. The Meroe cemetery, Musawwarat es-Sufra, and Naqa are located in a semi-desert, set against reddish-brown hills and contrasting with the green bushes that cover them, whilst the Meroe town site is part of a riverine landscape.

These three sites comprise the best preserved relics of the Kingdom of Kush, encompassing a wide range of architectural forms, including pyramids, temples, palaces, and industrial areas that shaped the political, religious, social, artistic and technological scene of the Middle and Northern Nile Valley for more than 1000 years (8th century BC-4th century AD). These architectural structures, the applied iconography and evidence of production and trade, including ceramics and iron-works, testify to the wealth and power of the Kushite State. The water reservoirs in addition contribute to the understanding of the palaeoclimate and hydrological regime in the area in the later centuries BCE and the first few centuries CE.

Criterion (ii): *The Archaeological Sites of the Island of Meroe reflect the interchange of ideas and contact between Sub-Saharan Africa and the Mediterranean and Middle Eastern worlds, along a major trade corridor over a very long period of time. The interaction of local and foreign influences is demonstrated by the preserved architectural remains and their iconography.*

Criterion (iii): *The property with its wide range of monument types, well preserved buildings, and potential for future excavation and research, contributes an exceptional testimony to the wealth and power of the former Kushite state and its extensive contacts with African, Mediterranean and Middle Eastern societies. The Kushite civilization was largely expunged by the arrival of Christianity on the Middle Nile in the 6th century CE.*

Criterion (iv): *The pyramids at Meroe are outstanding examples of Kushite funerary monuments, which illustrate the association with the well preserved remains of the urban centre of the Kushite capital city, Meroe. The architectural remains at the three site components illustrate the juxtaposition of structural and decorative elements from Pharaonic Egypt, Greece, and Rome as well as from Kush itself, and through this represent a significant reference of early exchange and diffusion of styles and technologies.*

Criterion (v): *The major centres of human activity far from the Nile at Musawwarat and Naqa raise questions as to their viability in what is today an arid zone devoid of permanent human settlement. They offer the possibility, through a detailed study of the palaeoclimate, flora, and fauna, of*

understanding the interaction of the Kushites with their desert hinterland.

Integrity

The three site components selected represent the capital city of the Kushite kingdom, Meroe, with its associated extensive burial grounds of pyramid tombs, and the kingdom's two largest hinterland centres, Musawwarat es-Sufra and Naqa. Together they provide evidence of the size, and influence of the Kushite civilization at the height of power.

Although many features of the site have deteriorated over the course of time, including the collapse of several pyramid tombs, inappropriate interventions which reduced the integrity of the site have not occurred since the treasure hunting of Ferlini in the 1830s, which was very deleterious to some of the pyramids in the Meroe cemeteries. The main north-south highway linking Khartoum and Port Sudan, which separated the two parts of the Meroe site has negative visual and auditory impact on the integrity of the property, as does the line of high voltage power transmission along its route.

Authenticity

Although at large the authenticity in terms of the attributes of material, design and substance is acceptable, conservation works at several temples and pyramids were based on large-scale reconstructions, including introduction of new materials, or anastylosis, which affected the authenticity of these features. However, considering the overall number of significant features on-site, the percentage of reconstructed or reassembled structures is comparatively small and does not impact on a general conception of authenticity.

At the site component of Meroe, archaeological research activities, primarily by foreign scholars since the late 19th century, have left large spoil heaps, which impact adversely on the authenticity of the setting.

Protection and management requirements

The property is protected under the provisions of article 13 (5) of the Interim Constitution of the Republic of Sudan of 2005, and under the Antiquities Protection Ordinance of 1905, amended in 1952 and most recently in 1999, which confers it the status of national monument. It is also protected by Presidential Decree (no. 162 of 2003) which established a natural reserve around the site and established the management committee. The reserve declared under this Decree encompasses the three site components and their complete buffer zones.

Although formally managed by a Committee involving a variety of stakeholders, the property is factually managed by the National Corporation of Antiquities and Museums (NCAM), which involves a field work section responsible for site supervision and coordination of the foreign archaeological missions. A technical office for supervision is located at Shendi, about 40km from Meroe and 60 km from Musawwarat es-Sufra and Naqa, where a resident site manager has been appointed. Security guards and police men supervise the property on a daily basis.

To ensure the requirement of a shared overarching management authority for serial properties, a management committee has been established and a chairperson appointed. Following the management plan drafted and approved in 2009, this management committee shall be supported by an executive World Heritage Site management team, which will oversee the implementation of the management plan strategies and actions. Financial provisions and staff are essential for the establishment of this team and the implementation of the management plan. As part of the future implementation of the management plan, it is necessary to develop conservation approaches

based on best practice to avoid repeating some of the less fortunate techniques and methods used in the past.

Property	Cultural Sites of Al Ain (Hafit, Hili, Bidaa Bint Saud and Oases Areas)
State Party	United Arab Emirates
Id. N°	1343
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief Synthesis

The serial property of The Cultural Sites of Al Ain, with its various component parts and the regional context in which it is situated, provides testimony to ancient sedentary human occupation in a desert region. Occupied continuously since the Neolithic, the region presents vestiges of numerous prehistoric cultures, notably from the Bronze Age and the Iron Age. Al Ain is situated at the crossroads of the ancient land routes between Oman, the Arabian Peninsula, the Persian Gulf and Mesopotamia. Very diverse in nature, the tangible elements of the property include remains of circular stone tombs and settlements from the Hafit and Hili periods, wells and partially underground aflaj irrigation systems, oases and mud brick constructions assigned to a wide range of defensive, domestic and economic purposes. This expertise in construction and water management enabled the early development of agriculture for five millennia, up until the present day.

Criterion (iii): The Cultural Sites of Al Ain provide exceptional testimony to the development of successive prehistoric cultures in a desert region, from the Neolithic to the Iron Age. They establish the existence of sustainable human development, bearing testimony to the transition from hunter and nomad societies to the sedentary human occupation of the oasis, and the sustainability of this culture up until the present day.

Criterion (iv): The tombs and architectural remains of the Hafit, Hili and Umm an-Nar cultures provide an exceptional illustration of human development in the Bronze Age and the Iron Age on the Arabian Peninsula. The aflaj system, introduced as early as the 1st millennium BC, is testimony to the management of water in desert regions.

Criterion (v): The remains and landscapes of the oases of Al Ain appear to testify, over a very long period of history, to the capacity of the civilizations in the northeast of the Arabian Peninsula, notably in the protohistoric periods, to develop a sustainable and positive relationship with the desert environment. They knew how to establish the sustainable exploitation of water resources to create a green and fertile environment.

Integrity

Constituted by 17 satisfactorily identified components, the Cultural Sites of Al Ain form a serial property of sufficient integrity to express exceptional values of prehistoric and protohistoric cultures in relation to the development of the oasis landscape. The proposed sites cover sufficiently extensive areas, and include many diverse archaeological vestiges, which are generally well preserved and adequately protected. Integrity would however be reinforced by a systematic inventory, and a deeper knowledge of the nominated ensembles and their environment. The history of the oases from the protohistoric period until the 19th century remains very fragmentary and must be scientifically studied. The environment close to the ensembles forms landscapes

which are associated with the desert, mountains and existing oases, and this also applies to their urban dimension, but in some cases their urban setting features anachronistic elements nearby, resulting from contemporary development (leisure park, modern buildings, road and hotel infrastructures, etc.). Environmental integrity must be carefully monitored to ensure these developments do not proliferate to adversely affect their setting.

Authenticity

The prehistoric sites of Al Ain, and particularly the Hafit and Hili ensembles, and the associated moveable artefacts, have high levels of authenticity. Several of the archaeological sites recently excavated present built vestiges which are fully authentic. Since their discovery in the second half of the 20th century however, there has been a tendency to reconstruct certain circular tombs in an effort to make them emblematic, which necessarily limits their authenticity. The presence of aflaj systems dating from the Iron Age has been authenticated, most notably in the case of Hili 15 falaj, which presents intact all units of the system (cut and cover section, shari'a and the open channels) and where there has been no intervention except sandbag barriers for protection and draining rainwater. The aflaj of Al Ain do not all date from the Iron Age, but include new additions to the system throughout later centuries. Recent studies have filled some gaps in the continuity of the system. Further efforts toward more systematic documentation will aid the evaluation of their authenticity as a system forming the basis of today's oases.

The restoration work on buildings and mud brick constructions in the oases, which took place from the 1980s onwards, was dominated by reconstruction taking precedence over conservation of the physical fabric. This tendency has been corrected over recent years, to ensure greater respect for authenticity (in forms, structures and materials), as considerations of authenticity have been at the core of conservation activities by ADACH. The conditions of authenticity of the oases in terms of utilization seem essentially in place, as the efforts of the national and local authorities and the farm owners. Together, they aim to ensure the continued flourishing of oases. However, threats posed to their authenticity due to the impact of the changing economy on the sustenance of agricultural activities, the changing water supply and the pressures of urban proximity need to be monitored closely.

Protection and Management Requirements

The property has been protected legally by the Abu Dhabi Authority for Culture and Heritage (ADACH) Establishment Law of 2005 and the Oasis protection laws of 2004 and 2005, as well as the Law of Archaeology and Excavations of 1970. Building regulations of Al Ain Municipality's Town Planning Department forbids the construction of new buildings of more than four storeys and a maximum height of 20 metres. The sites within the property and its buffer zones are registered on the inventory managed by ADACH, which also administers the Preliminary Cultural Review, the cultural heritage component of the emirate's Environmental Impact Assessment process. Two draft laws, the emirate-level Law for the Protection, Conservation and Management of Cultural Properties, and the Federal Archaeological Resources Protection Act, are both in the final stage of review by government agencies. These laws will improve the existing protective framework for the sites.

The property's protection is provided by numerous sectorial arrangements reflecting the complexity of the property's definition. The Abu Dhabi Cultural Heritage Management

Strategy provides the overarching management framework for the Cultural Sites of Al Ain. It has an implementation plan consisting of 19 action plans, some of which have been completed already, and which have informed the Entity Strategic Plan of the ADACH. The ADACH Entity Strategic Plan has been a live document reissued on a rolling basis, and its 2010-14 cycle is completed. The Heritage Management Strategy is currently being reviewed and updated, to incorporate specific management plans and other projects for specific sites. ADACH has been merged with the Abu Dhabi Tourism Authority in February 2012 to create the Abu Dhabi Tourism & Culture Authority (ADTCA). Work has been ongoing since then to ensure continuity of strategic policies and achieved milestones for the management of heritage resources within the institutional restructuring process.

Disclaimer concerning the text of the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the site 'Cultural Sites of Al Ain' (Hafit, Hili, Bidaa Bint Saud and Oases Areas), United Arab Emirates

With reference to the text of the Statement of Outstanding Universal Value of the site 'Cultural Sites of Al Ain' (Hafit, Hili, Bidaa Bint Saud and Oases Areas), United Arab Emirates, it should be noted that, according to the United Nations directives of 15 May 1999 (ref.ST/CS/SER.A/29/Rev.1) the term 'Persian Gulf', 'Gulf' and 'Shatt-al-Arab' shall be referred to and used in all documents, publications and statements emanating from the Secretariat as the standard geographical designation of the sea area between the Arabian Peninsula and the Islamic Republic of Iran.

D.3 ASIA / PACIFIC

Property	Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai
State Party	Mongolia
Id. N°	1382
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai include three rock art sites in Bayan-Ulgii aimag: Tsagaan Salaa-Baga Oigor of Ulaankhus soum, and Upper Tsagaan Gol (Shiveet Khairkhan) and Aral Tolgoi, both of Tsengel soum. All three are located in high mountain valleys carved out by Pleistocene glaciers. These three property components include large concentrations of petroglyphs and funerary and ritual monuments reflecting the development of human culture over a period of 12,000 years. The persistent relationships between rock art, surface monuments and the larger physical context of rivers, ridges and cardinal directions create a vivid sense of the integration of human communities with the land they inhabited.

The earliest images reflect a period beginning in the Late Pleistocene and lasting through the Early Holocene (ca. 11,000 – 6,000 years BP), when the paleoenvironment shifted from dry to forested steppe and the valleys provided an ideal habitat for hunters of large wild game. Later images from the middle Holocene (ca. 6,000 – 4,000 years BP) reflect the gradual reassertion of steppe vegetation in this part of the the Altai and the early emergence of herding as the economic basis of communities. Imagery from the succeeding, Late Holocene Period, reflects the transition to horse-dependent nomadism during the Early Nomadic and Scythian periods (1st millennium BCE) and the subsequent

spread of steppe empires in the later Turkic Period (7th-9th c. CE).

The Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai represent the most complete and best preserved visual record of human prehistory and early history of a region at the intersection of Central and North Asia.

Criterion (iii): The Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai Mountain provide an exceptional documentation of the pre-historic and early historic communities in the northwestern Altai Mountains, at the intersection of Central and North Asia. The petroglyphic imagery includes animals such as mammoths, rhinoceros, and ostriches, executed in static profile contours. These animals inhabited North Asia when the region was significantly colder, drier and covered by rough grasses and forbs rather than forests. By the end of the Late Pleistocene (ca. 11,000 BP), the dry steppe was gradually being replaced by the forested environment of the Early Holocene (ca. 11,000 – 6,000 BP). This period is reflected in majestic images of elk, aurochs, and ibex, executed in profile silhouettes. There are very few sites in North Asia that include pre-Bronze Age petroglyphs in such number, variety, and quality.

Integrity

The two largest sites, Tsagaan Salaa-Baga Oigor and Upper Tsagaan Gol, include a unique array of material relating to the Bronze and Iron Ages. Together with Aral Tolgoi, the three sites include an undiminished record of human culture in this region over a period of more than 12,000 years. To preserve the integrity of the property, the potential impact of humans and their grazing animals on the petroglyphs requires strict control.

Authenticity

The authenticity of the property is demonstrated by its physical condition, which aside from the wear of time and the elements is essentially pristine. There is some modern damage on rock surfaces (writing, graffiti) located close to roads; but, in general, the rock art and monuments are relatively unimpacted by human or animal activities. The authenticity of the sites is protected by their relative inaccessibility due to both terrain and weather.

Protection and management requirements

The three sites of Tsagaan Salaa-Baga Oigor, Upper Tsagaan Gol, and Aral Tolgoi are registered as historical and cultural properties under state protection since 2008 following the provisions of the 2001 Law on Protecting the Cultural Heritage of Mongolia. The whole of Aral Tolgoi and part of the Upper Tsagaan Gol Complex are also included within the Altai Tavan Bogd National Park, listed since 1994 under the Mongolian Law for Special Protected Areas; this law offers additional protection to the natural environment including water sources and restricts urban and rural development. Ideally this environmental protection should be granted to all three property components. The Mongolian Parliament in 2012 considers amendments to the Law on Protecting the Cultural Heritage of Mongolia in order to include specific articles concerning management of cultural and natural heritage inscribed on the World Heritage List and the National Tentative List; once these additional articles have been adopted, the protection for the property will be further strengthened.

The traditional protection by local inhabitants of this region is a key factor in the management of the Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai. Herders who have already been engaged in heritage protection in some soum (departments), need to be engaged as crucial partners for sustainable management. In this context, the role of the

national authorities is important in the provision of incentives for traditional community management as well as for supporting strict control with regard to development proposals for purposes such as mining, road works or tourism infrastructure. This control must apply not only in the nominated areas but also in their upstream hinterland, where development could have detrimental effects to the Outstanding Universal Value of the property. Local and national management approaches could be more effectively integrated through a local site manager; who could ensure regular communication and exchange between the two levels. Management could also be better targeted if based on the results of a comprehensive survey and inventory of the petroglyphs in all three components of the property for their continued protection.

Property	Citadel of the Ho Dynasty
State Party	Viet Nam
Id. N°	1358
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The Citadel of Ho Dynasty built in 1397, composed of the Inner Citadel, La Thanh Outer Wall and the Nam Giao Altar covers 155.5 ha, surrounded by a buffer zone of 5078.5 ha. It is located in accordance with geomantic principles in a landscape of great scenic beauty between the Ma and Buoi rivers in Vinh Loc district, Thanh Hoa province of Viet Nam. The Inner Citadel constructed of large limestone blocks represents a new development of architectural technology and adaptation of geomantic city planning in an East Asian and South-east Asian context. It demonstrates the use of architectural elements in terms of space management and decoration designed for a centralized imperial city in order to show a concept of royal power, based on the adoption of the Confucian philosophy within a predominantly Buddhist culture. Being the capital of Viet Nam from 1398 to 1407 and also the political, economic and cultural centre of North Central Viet Nam from the 16th to the 18th century, it bears exceptional testimony to a critical period in Vietnamese and South-east Asian history when traditional kingship and Buddhist values were giving way to new trends in technology, commerce and centralized administration.

Criterion (ii): The property exhibits Chinese Confucianism influence on a symbol of regal centralized power in the late 14th – early 15th century. It represents new developments in architectural style with respect to technology and, in adapting pre-existing geomantic city planning principles in an East Asian and South-east Asian context, makes full use of the natural surroundings and incorporated distinctly Vietnamese and East and Southeast Asian elements in its monuments and landscape.

Criterion (iv): The Ho Citadel is an outstanding example of an architectural ensemble in a landscape setting which illustrates a flowering of pragmatic Neo-Confucianism in late 14th century Viet Nam, at a time when it was spreading throughout East Asia to become a major philosophical influence on government in the region. The use of large blocks of stone testifies to the organizational power of the Neo-Confucian state, and the shift in the main axis distinguishes the Citadel layout from the Chinese norm.

Integrity

The integrity of the property is guaranteed by the areas of the three major components which represent the

characteristics of the Ho Dynasty: the Inner Citadel, the Nam Giao altar and part of La Thanh Outer Wall. These elements reflect the presence of a citadel that has remained almost intact, with massive stone walls within a landscape setting that is easily recognizable. Excavations have also demonstrated a rich source of archaeological evidence preserved underground below the present rice and other crops within the boundaries of the three components. The buffer zone includes all cultural elements that were part of a large imperial city during the late 14th – early 15th century, including religious monuments, traditional villages, common houses, ancient roads, markets, landing places and scenic beauty spots, which are a direct tangible expression of the cultural values of the property.

Authenticity

The conditions of authenticity in terms of the geo-cultural location and landscape setting of the property are almost unchanged; the layout and architectural design and materials of the Inner Citadel's walls, four gates, sections of moat, and section of La Thanh Outer Wall and archaeological remains of Nam Giao Altar are well preserved. The archaeological excavations in the property reveal well-preserved structures contemporaneous with the Ho Dynasty.

Protection and management requirements

The Inner Citadel and Nam Giao Altar were designated in 1962 as national heritage by Decision of the Ministry of Culture of the Democratic Republic of Vietnam and are protected under the Law on Cultural Heritage of 29/06/2001. The nominated section of La Thanh Outer Wall is in the process of being similarly protected. The buffer zone is protected by the Law on Environmental Protection of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam, number 52/2005/QH11, Chapter 4, Article 31 of 2005. The property is directly managed by the People's Committees of the relevant communes for the particular component sites, under the Management Board of the Citadel of the Ho Dynasty established by Decision 2264/QĐ-UBND (30 July 2007).

A comprehensive five-year Management Plan for the property was submitted in November 2010. The control of urban development near the Inner Citadel, in Vinh Loc town particularly along the axis between the Inner Citadel and Mount Don Son, and in the buffer zone generally should receive specific attention so as to protect all view lines along the axes between topographical features, and views within the area enclosed by the line of the outer wall and the Ma and Buoi rivers. Special attention is needed for the development of a risk-preparedness and management strategy and a strategy for involving local people in the protection and management of the property. The local authority and people are working closely for the preservation and protection of the property through a training and public-awareness raising programme.

D.4 EUROPE / NORTH AMERICA

Property	Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and the Ancient Beech Forests of Germany
State Party	Germany / Slovakia / Ukraine
Id. N°	1133 Bis
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and the Ancient Beech Forests of Germany are a serial property comprising fifteen components. They represent an outstanding example of undisturbed, complex temperate forests and exhibit the most complete and comprehensive ecological patterns and processes of pure stands of European beech across a variety of environmental conditions. They contain an invaluable genetic reservoir of beech and many species associated and dependent on these forest habitats.

Criterion (ix): The Primeval Beech Forests of the Carpathians and the Ancient Beech Forests of Germany are indispensable to understanding the history and evolution of the genus *Fagus*, which, given its wide distribution in the Northern Hemisphere and its ecological importance, is globally significant. These undisturbed, complex temperate forests exhibit the most complete and comprehensive ecological patterns and processes of pure stands of European beech across a variety of environmental conditions and represent all altitudinal zones from seashore up to the forest line in the mountains. Beech is one of the most important elements of forests in the Temperate Broad-leaf Forest Biome and represents an outstanding example of the re-colonization and development of terrestrial ecosystems and communities after the last ice age, a process which is still ongoing. They represent key aspects of processes essential for the long term conservation of natural beech forests and illustrate how one single tree species came to absolute dominance across a variety of environmental parameters.

Integrity

The individual components of this serial property are of sufficient size to maintain the natural processes necessary for the long-term ecological viability of the property's habitats and ecosystems. Buffer zones including surrounding protected areas (national parks, nature parks, protected landscape areas, biosphere reserves) will be managed to protect the property and enhance integrity.

Protection and management requirements

Long-term protection and management is ensured through national legal protection as territories which belong to national parks or biosphere reserves. Effective implementation of the trilateral integrated management system is required to guide the planning and management of this serial property. A strict non-intervention management applies to all component parts of the serial property. In the framework of the general management objectives the key issues of the practical management include fostering coordination and communication between the individual component parts, risk management, conservation and management of mountain meadows, river corridors and freshwater ecosystems, tourism management, research and monitoring. The component parts are engaged in international activities of capacity building to share best practices from countries included in the series, and other

countries with significant primeval and ancient beech forests. In order to provide for local support to be available in the long run, specific public relations and educational work are crucial aspects of the management. Cooperative management agreements with local groups and tourism agencies are supposed to enhance the achievement of management goals and ensure local community engagement in the component parts.

Property	Cultural Landscape of the Serra de Tramuntana
State Party	Spain
Id. N°	1371
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The cultural landscape of the Serra de Tramuntana constitutes a significant example of the Mediterranean agricultural landscape, which, after centuries of transformations of the steep terrain morphology to exploit the scarce available resources and thanks to the specific orogenic, climatic and vegetation conditions, has been made productive and well-adapted to human settlement. The system of terraces and cobbled road network, common to many Mediterranean landscapes, is here combined with an articulated network of devices for the management of water, revolving around farming units of feudal origins. Several villages, churches, sanctuaries, towers, lighthouses and small dry-stone structures punctuate the terraced landscape and contribute to its actual character.

Criterion (ii): The landscape of the Serra de Tramuntana eminently exemplifies the interchange between the Muslim and Christian cultures, which is representative of the Mediterranean area, in the combination of the Arabic water harvesting and management technology with the agricultural know-how and the territorial control system introduced by the Christian conquerors, who took over the island of Mallorca in 13th century AD. By this cultural interaction, a terraced agricultural landscape was created, featured by an articulated waterworks network, orchards, vegetable gardens and olive groves, which were earlier organised around small farm holdings, and later in large estates (posesiones) and which nowadays make up the physical and functional features of the Serra de Tramuntana.

Criterion (iv): The cultural landscape of the Serra de Tramuntana represents a spectacular, peculiar example of a terraced, farmed landscape which combines an interconnected and highly specialised system of waterworks for collecting and storing water, featuring qanats, that are underground channels to harvest and transport water, canals, ditches, storage basins, with a system of terraces supported by dry-stone walls so as to make possible the cultivation of vegetables as well as fruit and olive trees in the terraced plots and including a sophisticated drainage system to avoid soil erosion.

Criterion (v): The settlement pattern of the Tramuntana area bears significant witness to human adaptation to difficult environmental conditions, which has ingeniously made a region with scarce resources, both in term of land and water, suitable for farming and living. The feudal land subdivision system, applied to extreme orographic conditions, combined with the sophisticated waterworks technology of Arabic origins has resulted in complex farming units. Their land distribution and use pattern, comprising rocky areas on the tops of mountains, strips of woodland, slopes with terraces,

extensive grazing land, fields for reaping, vineyards or fruit crops on flatter land, ensured over time the full exploitation of the existing resources. The Tramuntana area thus pays testimony to the continuous evolution of human settlement in a rugged and steep area of the island.

Integrity

The property is characterized by a high level of uniformity, in which the defining elements - the terraced land arrangements, the olive groves, the spatial organization in rural estates and the water supply network – retain their visual integrity to a considerable extent. The functional and socio-economical integrity, however, is today fragile due to the progressive increase of tourism and the possibly related development pressures. The entire Tramuntana district, witness to the same historical and development processes, acts as the buffer zone of the property. Today, the property does not seem to suffer from immediate development pressure, although the highly populated buffer zone may pose threats to the nominated property and these should be carefully monitored over time.

Authenticity

The property bears credible witness to the historical, cultural and socio- economical processes that have taken place in the Tramuntana area, gradually modifying the landscape to make it productive, and have shaped its actual aspect, although these traditional dynamic processes are declining in favour of tourism activities. The setting still exhibits a strong continuity with past layouts and the aesthetic qualities of this landscape have been appreciated by well-known artists and intellectuals who have contributed to amplify its evocative value. Traditional skills for the building and repair of the dry-stone structures have been consciously maintained through the establishment of a school of dry-stone masonry, to counter the changes brought by social and economic change.

Protection and management requirements

The property has been declared a "Picturesque Setting" and formally protected via a decree since 1972 (Decree 984/1972). Following the approval of the Spanish Historic Heritage Act (1985) and of the Balearic Historic Heritage Act (1998), the property has been further protected by designating a number of "Items of Cultural Interest" (Bien de Interes Cultural, BIC) according to the national and regional legislations. Further BIC declarations for Biniraix, Ullarò and Galilea have been initiated and should be concluded. The Balearic Act (1991) governing natural spaces and urban planning regulations provides for the identification of areas to be protected for their ecological, geological and landscape values. The pivotal instrument for spatial planning is the Mallorca Spatial Plan (2004), which acknowledges the cultural and natural values of the Tramuntana Area and regulates the human settlement and land-use, taking into account heritage features, values and vocations of different areas, existing activities and the protection of the environment. Further plans related to specific areas in force are, i.e., the Plan for the Regulation of the Tramuntana Area's Natural Resources (2007) and the Special Plans for the Protection of the Historic Site of Archduke Ludwig Salvator's Estate (2002), of the Dry-Stone Route (2008), of Artà-Lluc Route (2008), of the Historic Artistic Architectural, Ecological and Scenic Value of the Municipality of Deià, of the Villages of Lluc, Escorca and of the Historic Centre of Pollença. Completion and enforcement of the other special plans for the protection of places with cultural values, especially of the water management systems and devices, should be envisaged.

The Consortium 'Serra de Tramuntana Paisatge Cultural' is the body established in 2010 for the management of the site and its buffer zone; it should be made fully operational. It is currently composed of the regional government of the Balearic Islands and the Council of Mallorca, and aims at coordinating all the different cultural and natural policies, which are being implemented in the Serra de Tramuntana. It also includes a coordinating institution for the involvement of local stakeholders.

The Management Plan for the property stems from the Mallorca Spatial Plan and has been conceived as a comprehensive instrument alternative to other plans for the area by which to establish strategies and coordinate all activities within. It should be approved by the Consortium "Serra de Tramuntana Patrimoni Mundial", responsible for the implementation of the Plan. Strategies to sustain the agricultural activities within the property and its buffer zone and to control the impact of the development of tourism activity should be envisaged to strengthen traditional agricultural activities, thus ensuring the sustainability of this landscape. Clarifications of responsibilities in monitoring are also advisable.

Property	Residence of Bukovinian and Dalmatian Metropolitans
State Party	Ukraine
Id. N°	1330
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

Situated within the boundaries of the town of Chernivtsi, on the river promontory, named Mount Dominic, the architectural ensemble comprises the former Residence of the Metropolitans with its St. Ivan of Suceava Chapel; the former seminary and Seminary Church, and the former monastery with its clock tower within a garden and landscaped park. The Residence, with a dramatic fusion of architectural references, expresses the 19th century cultural identity of the Orthodox Church within the Austro-Hungarian Empire during a period of religious and cultural toleration. In the 19th century, historicist architecture could convey messages about its purpose and the Residence of Bukovinian and Dalmatian Metropolitans is an excellent example.

Criterion (ii): Chernivtsi architectural ensemble of the Residence of the Bukovinian and Dalmatian Metropolitans reflects social, economical and cultural influences on the development of architecture and urban planning since ancient times, the Middle Ages, absolutism and the Gruender period. The complex represents a version of 19th century historicist architecture and planning.

Criterion (iii): The Residence bears exceptional testimony to the cultural tradition of the Orthodox Church which is signified by the use of Byzantine forms for the domed cruciform church, while the decorative patterns, incorporated in the tiled roofs of the complex signify the folk culture of the people. The prosperous Bukovinian Metropolitanate with episcopacies on territories of Southern and Central Europe ceased to exist in 1940.

Criterion (iv): The ensemble of the Residence, combining elements of national, Byzantine, Gothic and Baroque architecture, is an outstanding example of 19th century historicist architecture, design and planning, expressing the cultural identity of the Orthodox Church within the Austro-Hungarian Empire.

Integrity

The condition of integrity is satisfactory. The property includes within its boundary all elements necessary to express its cultural value and all of the components are adequately preserved.

Authenticity

The conditions of authenticity are generally adequate. The original shaped wooden ceiling of the Synod Hall was lost to fire in 1942 and was replaced in the 1950s. The roof has been gradually replaced using quality colour-glazed roof tiles manufactured according to the original patterns and imported from Austria. The change of function of the ensemble, initially being the Residence of Metropolitans and becoming a university did not unduly affect its authenticity.

Protection and management requirements

The Residence of the Bukovinian and Dalmatian Metropolitans was declared a National Park in 1945. The property on its 8 ha site was transferred to Yuriy Fedkovich Chernivtsi National University under the Ministry of Education of Ukraine in 1955. The nominated property and its buffer zone are protected at both regional and national level by regulations and laws. A protection contract is signed annually with the Chernivtsi City Council, covering the responsibilities of the University to the property in terms of use and maintenance. The State funding "Comprehensive program on Preservation of historical architecture in Chernivtsi for 2009-2015" provides a basis for the systematic conservation and management of the property and for implementing protection measures in compliance with national standards for the protection of World Heritage sites. The General Development Plan for Chernivtsi gives main outlines for proper management of the property with special attention to the growth of tourist infrastructure as one of the major branches of the municipal economy. The outline Management Plan prepared in 1998 is to be reviewed every five years. A separate Tourism management plan is to be developed for the property to tackle the long-term consequences of the tourism pressure. A conservation plan will be developed for the gardens and park behind the Residence.

D.5 LATIN AMERICA / CARIBBEAN

Property	Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison
State Party	Barbados
Id. N°	1376
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief Synthesis

As one of the earliest established towns with a fortified port in the Caribbean network of military and maritime-mercantile outposts of the British Atlantic, Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison was the focus of trade-based English expansion in the Americas. By the 17th century, the fortified port town was able to establish its importance in the British Atlantic trade and became an entrepôt for goods, especially sugar, and enslaved persons destined for Barbados and the rest of the Americas.

Historic Bridgetown's irregular settlement patterns and 17th Century street layout of an English medieval type, in particular the organic serpentine streets, supported the development and transformation of creolized forms of architecture, including Caribbean Georgian.

Historic Bridgetown's fortified port spaces were linked along the Bay Street corridor from the historic town's centre to St. Ann's Garrison. The property's natural harbour, Carlisle Bay, was the first port of call on the trans-Atlantic crossing and was perfectly positioned as the launching point for the projection of British imperial power, to defend and expand Britain's trade interests in the region and the Atlantic World. Used as a base for amphibious command and control, the garrison housed the Eastern Caribbean headquarters of the British Army and Navy. Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison participated not only in the international trade of goods and enslaved persons but also in the transmission of ideas and cultures that characterized the developing colonial enterprise in the Atlantic World.

Criterion (ii): Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison had a pivotal role in the development of the English colonies in the Atlantic World and was a centre for transmission of ideas concerning administration, trade, communications, science, culture and technology in the British Empire. While the Garrison can be said to have absorbed military ideas from Europe and transmitted them to other areas of the Caribbean, the social stratification of Bridgetown illustrates the interchange of several occupational, religious, ethnic, free and enslaved groups; a meeting of cultures, which created a hybridized Creole culture in the Anglophone Caribbean. This hybridized culture, which did not wholly abandon either European or African ways, lives on in the ways in which the urban space functions today.

Criterion (iii): Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison is an exceptional testimony of British colonial trade and defence in the Caribbean and the Americas. The historic town has retained its original footprint, based on its English medieval serpentine street layout, for almost 400 years, which bears exceptional testimony to British town layouts in foreign soil. St. Ann's Garrison and its fortifications, which protected the town and its port, constitute the most complete complex of a 18th-19th century British garrison ensemble in the Atlantic World. As an integrated semi-planned urban landscape, with a strong brick architectural testimony, and a collection of colonial warehouses and dock facilities, it has remained essentially unchanged for 200 years, and provides an outstanding glimpse into a pivotal period of British imperial rule and culture.

Criterion (iv): St Ann's Garrison is the earliest type of British navy and army base in the Caribbean and in its architectural layout and urban composition influenced later British presence in the region. The relation between the Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison is characterized by urban and architectural elements, which illustrate the continuous interaction between the commercial and military interests that dominated the evolution of functions in the colonial and post-colonial space. This is most evident in the tension between military order and economic resourcefulness, expressed among other by the Screw Dock, an outstanding but highly vulnerable structure, and the 18th and 19th century warehouses, built to withstand hurricanes and other threats in the tropical environment.

Integrity

The property covers the area that reflects the layout of the early town and port in Bridgetown and the overall Garrison, with all its historic components. These two elements are linked by a narrow strip along Bay Street, which creates the urban relation between the garrison, the city and the port. Within Bridgetown, the early 17th century path and road network still forms the basis of the organic street layout. The port area has been altered but provides traces to its historic

use. The Garrison has retained a high percentage of its physical attributes, with exception of the naval dockyard, representing a significant era of British colonial military heritage. The basic road network of the garrison has not changed and also its boundary wall remains largely intact, with entrances to the site remaining in their original locations.

Authenticity

Bridgetown's early serpentine street and alley configuration and also the roads in the Garrison retain their authentic networks. Both layouts continue in spite of the town's transformation from a maritime-mercantile fortified port town to a contemporary cosmopolitan tropical city which has remained the island's capital and national centre. Although several historic houses in Bridgetown have been replaced or restored, a significant number of remaining historic houses, some rapidly decaying, significantly contribute to the atmosphere of a historic city and should be conserved.

Within the Garrison, the main individual barracks and administrative buildings retain a high degree of authenticity and continue to provide similar functions as they did during the colonial era. Yet, the degree to which the overall garrison can convey its meaning in terms of former function is vulnerable and requires constant protection.

Protection and management requirements

Legal protection is provided by the Town and Country Planning Act, supported by the Physical Development Plan Amended (2003). The Physical Development Plan makes provision for five conservation areas covering different parts of Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison. While at present these planning provisions are technically adequate, legal protection of those parts of the property not covered by the conservation areas could be strengthened.

The highest level of policy decision-making for Historic Bridgetown and its Garrison is public sector-led through the Cabinet of the Government of Barbados, which holds ultimate responsibility for the management of the property. Management authority has been formally conferred on the Barbados World Heritage Committee. Through a coordinative function of this Committee, the management is shared among the respective responsible government agencies and also involves the collaborative effort of several non-governmental organizations and civil society, including a number of property owners.

The management plan, which was formally adopted by the Barbados Cabinet in 2011, defines that the Barbados World Heritage Committee forms the central plank in the administration of the property and oversees adherence to the principles of the Convention. It advises on policies and programmes for the conservation and management of the property, evaluates and monitors all matters relating to the protection and management of the property and, most importantly, continues to ensure that the management systems maintain and preserve the Outstanding Universal Value of the property.

The Chief Town Planner has been identified as the Site Manager for day-to-day management concerns in the framework of the urban development plan and planning permission procedures. He also chairs the Barbados World Heritage Committee which meets on a two-monthly basis. Thematic subcommittees meeting at shorter intervals are dedicated to specific areas of management, including education and capacity building, conservation of architectural heritage, interpretation and tourism management. Further work, as defined in the action plan, is required to strengthen the protection of the substance of remaining historic buildings and the property's overall spatial layout, and also to

mitigate landscape changes that have already occurred in order to protect and strengthen the property's integrity and authenticity.

Property	Coffee Cultural Landscape of Colombia
State Party	Colombia
Id. N°	1121
Dates of inscription	2011

Brief synthesis

The Coffee Cultural Landscape of Colombia (CCLC) is a continuing productive landscape consisting of a series of six sites, which integrate eighteen urban settlements. The property illustrates natural, economic and cultural features, combined in a mountainous area with collaboratively farmed coffee plantations, some of these in clearings of high forest.

The CCLC is the result of the adaptation process of Antioquian settlers, who arrived in the 19th century, a process which persists to this day and has created an economy and culture deeply rooted in the coffee production tradition. Coffee farms are located on steep mountainous ranges with vertiginous slopes of over 25% (55 degrees), characteristic to the challenging coffee terrain. These unusual geographic features also affect the small orthogonal plot layouts, and influence the architectural typology, lifestyle and land-use techniques of the cafeteros (coffee farmers). The distinctive way of life of the cafeteros is based on legacies that have been passed down from generation to generation, and is linked to their traditional landownership and the distinctive small farm production system.

The typical architecture in the urban settlements is a fusion between the Spanish cultural patterns and the indigenous culture of the region adapted as well to the coffee growing process, through for example their sliding roofs. Houses function as both dwelling units and centers of economic activity, with walls built in the traditional, more flexible and dynamic 'bahareque' constructive system, and covered by a layer of bamboo well known for its resistance and malleability. Over fifty percent of the walls are still built using this traditional method.

Criterion (v): The CCLC is an outstanding example of continuing land-use, in which the collective effort of several generations of campesino families generated innovative management practices of natural resources in extraordinarily challenging geographical conditions. The strong community focus on coffee production in all aspects of life produced an unparalleled cultural identity, which finds its physical expression in the cultural patterns and materials used for coffee farming as well as the urban settlements.

Criterion (vi): The coffee tradition is the most representative symbol of national culture in Colombia, for which Colombia has gained worldwide recognition. In the CCLC this coffee culture has led to rich tangible and intangible manifestations in the territory, with a unique legacy, included in, but not limited to, the harmonious integration of the productive process in the social organization and housing typology, and communicated through associated local traditions and costumes, such as the sombrero aguadeño – a traditional type of hat – and the raw hide shoulder bag, still used by the coffee producers.

Integrity

The six site components of the CCLC are located in what is known as the Eje Cafetero, or coffee growing axis, a region that is characterized by the social and cultural characteristics

of the coffee landscape and production. The site components of the property provide localized glimpses into production activities and landscape features, which equally dominate the wider setting and region. To facilitate the understanding of this exceptional landscape, the property's elements of social adaptation to a unique use of land, and the development of highly specific cultural and social traditions in both agricultural practices and arrangement of settlements, contribute to the complete image of a continuing, productive and living landscape. The continuity of traditional small plot coffee farming, often run in family units, and the strong linkages to the associated cultural traditions contribute to the integrity, but are vulnerable to fluctuations in the international coffee market prices and resulting economic pressures. The integrity of the property would also be negatively affected by gold mining activities.

Authenticity

The Coffee Cultural Landscape of Colombia is an authentic reflection of a centenary process of man's adaptation to challenging geographical and climatic conditions of this area, known as the Eje Cafetero. The CCLC contains very few contemporary incongruous additions to its traditional architectural and landscape patterns, and no substantial modifications to the small towns located in the property as well as in the buffer zone. Aspects such as traditions, language and other forms of intangible heritage, have been preserved, mostly by owners and the local community, who have a high sense of social appropriation of their cultural heritage.

Protection and management requirements

While the traditional land-use patterns of the CCLC are legally protected, the legal protection of the property area is provided through the land-use plans. Further legal protection of the six component sites as cultural heritage sites may be desirable. An additional basis for some of the protection mechanisms is customary law and governance integrating customary management. The property would benefit from a better integration of these customary practices with the formal protection and management provisions.

The management of the CCLC is coordinated by a management committee, which was established by the Ministry of Culture, the Colombian Coffee Growers Federation (FNC), the Governors of Caldas, Quindío, Risaralda and Valle or their delegates, representatives of the Coffee Growers and universities. An Executive Director was appointed to oversee the implementation of the management system, which is guided by a management plan, developed with the support of the Centre for Regional, Coffee and Business Studies (CRECE).

Within the management framework, strong emphasis is given to the economic and social well-being of the inhabitants and coffee farmers, their appropriation of the cultural heritage, and environmental sustainability of the coffee production in the living cultural landscape. Although the management plan does address some of the predominant pressures, including inappropriate development, gold mining, changes to local farming traditions through inappropriate use of pesticides, fertilizers, waste-water processing and soil erosion, the respective land use plans yet need to be integrated with and adjusted to the management plan objectives and additional legislation is required for the semi-urban and rural area traditional buildings, which contribute to the significance of the CCLC.