



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

34 COM

Distribution Limited

WHC-10/34.COM/8B.Add
Paris, 25 June 2010
Original: English/French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Thirty-fourth Session

Brasilia, Brazil
25 July – 3 August 2010

Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: Establishment of the World Heritage List and of the List of World Heritage in Danger

8B. Nominations to the World Heritage List

Summary

This Addendum presents the Draft Decisions concerning 2 nominations of properties which were not included in Document *WHC-10/34.COM/8B*.

Decisions required:

The Committee is requested to examine the Draft Decisions presented in this Document, and, in accordance with paragraph 153 of the *Operational Guidelines*, take its Decisions concerning inscription on the World Heritage List in the following four categories:

- (a) properties which it **inscribes** on the World Heritage List;
- (b) properties which it **decides not to inscribe** on the World Heritage List;
- (c) properties whose consideration is **referred**;
- (d) properties whose consideration is **deferred**.

I. Examination of nominations of natural, mixed and cultural properties to the World Heritage List

In the presentation below, **IUCN Recommendations** and **ICOMOS Recommendations** are both presented in the form of **Draft Decisions** and are abstracted from *WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1* and *WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add* (ICOMOS) and *WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B2* (IUCN).

Though Draft Decisions were taken from IUCN and ICOMOS evaluation books, in some cases, a few modifications were required to adapt them to this Document.

A. Renomination under additional criteria of properties already inscribed on the World Heritage List

Property	Ngorongoro Conservation Area (renomination under additional criteria)
Id. N°	39 bis
State Party	United Republic of Tanzania
Criteria proposed by State Party	(iii)(iv) + CL

See IUCN Evaluation Book, May 2010, page 187.

See ICOMOS Evaluation Book, May 2010, page 62.

Draft Decision: 34 COM 8B.13

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-10/34.COM/8B.Add and WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Recalling that Ngorongoro Conservation Area, United Republic of Tanzania, is already inscribed on the World Heritage List under criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x);
3. Inscribes **Ngorongoro Conservation Area, United Republic of Tanzania**, on the World Heritage List under **criterion (iv)**;
4. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Ngorongoro Conservation Area (809,440ha) spans vast expanses of highland plains, savanna, savanna woodlands and forests, from the plains of the Serengeti National Park in the north-west, to the eastern arm of the Great Rift Valley. The area was established in 1959 as a multiple land use area, with wildlife coexisting with semi-nomadic Maasai pastoralists practising traditional livestock grazing. It includes the spectacular Ngorongoro Crater, the world's largest caldera, and Olduvai Gorge, a 14km long deep ravine. The property has global importance for biodiversity conservation in view of the presence of globally threatened species such as the black Rhino, the density of wildlife inhabiting the Ngorongoro Crater and surrounding areas throughout the year, and the annual migration of wildebeest, zebra, Thompson's and Grant's gazelles and other ungulates into the northern plains.

The area has been subject to extensive archaeological research for over 80 years and has yielded a long sequence of evidence of human evolution and human-environment dynamics, collectively extending over a span of almost four million years to the early modern era. This evidence includes fossilised footprints at Laetoli, associated with the development of human bipedalism, a sequence of diverse, evolving hominin species within Olduvai gorge, which range from Australopiths such as *Zinjanthropus boisei* to the Homo lineage that includes *Homo habilis*, *Homo erectus* and *Homo sapiens*; an early form of *Homo sapiens* at Lake Ndutu; and, in the Ngorongoro crater, remains that document the development of stone technology and the transition to the use of iron. The overall landscape of the area is seen to have the potential to reveal much more evidence concerning the rise of anatomically modern humans, modern behaviour and human ecology.

Criterion (iv): Ngorongoro Conservation Area has yielded an exceptionally long sequence of crucial evidence related to human evolution and human-environment dynamics, collectively extending from four million years ago to the beginning of this era, including physical evidence of the most important benchmarks in human evolutionary development. Although the interpretation of many of the assemblages of Olduvai Gorge is still debatable, their extent and density are remarkable. Several of the type fossils in the hominin lineage come from this site. Furthermore, future research in the property is likely to reveal much more evidence concerning the rise of anatomically modern humans, modern behaviour and human ecology.

Criterion (vii): The stunning landscape of Ngorongoro Crater combined with its spectacular concentration of wildlife is one of the greatest natural wonders of the planet. Spectacular wildebeest numbers (well over 1 million animals) pass through the property as part of the annual migration of wildebeest across the Serengeti ecosystem and calve in the short grass plains which straddle the Ngorongoro Conservation Area/Serengeti National Park boundary. This constitutes a truly superb natural phenomenon.

Criterion (viii): Ngorongoro crater is the largest unbroken caldera in the world. The crater, together with the Olmoti and Empakaai craters are part of the eastern Rift Valley, whose volcanism dates back to the late Mesozoic / early Tertiary periods and is famous for its geology. The property also includes Laetoli and Olduvai Gorge, which contain an important palaeontological record related to human evolution.

Criterion (ix): The variations in climate, landforms and altitude have resulted in several overlapping ecosystems and distinct habitats, with short grass plains, highland catchment forests, savanna woodlands, montane long grass plains and high open moorlands. The property is part of the Serengeti ecosystem, one of the last intact ecosystems in the world which harbours large and spectacular animal migrations.

Criterion (x): Ngorongoro Conservation Area is home to a population of some 25,000 large animals, mostly ungulates, alongside the highest density of mammalian predators in Africa including the densest

known population of lion (estimated 68 in 1987). The property harbours a range of endangered species, such as the Black Rhino, Wild hunting dog and Golden Cat and 500 species of birds. It also supports one of the largest animal migrations on earth, including over 1 million wildebeest, 72,000 zebras and c.350,000 Thompson and Grant gazelles.

Integrity

The property was inscribed under natural criteria (vii), (viii), (ix) and (x) in 1979 and under cultural criterion (iv) in 2010. Thus, the statement of integrity reflects integrity for natural values at the date of inscription of 1979, and for the cultural value in 2010.

In relation to natural values, the grasslands and woodlands of the property support very large animal populations, largely undisturbed by cultivation at the time of inscription. The wide-ranging landscapes of the property were not impacted by development or permanent agriculture at the time of inscription. The integrity of the property is also enhanced by being part of Serengeti - Mara ecosystem. The property adjoins Serengeti National Park (1,476,300 ha), which is also included on the World Heritage List as a natural property. Connectivity within and between these properties and adjoining landscapes, through functioning wildlife corridors is essential to protect the integrity of animal migrations. No hunting is permitted in Ngorongoro Conservation Area (NCA), but poaching of wildlife is a continuing threat, requiring effective patrolling and enforcement capacity. Invasive species are a source of ongoing concern, requiring continued monitoring and effective action if detected. Tourism pressure is also of concern, including in relation to the potential impacts from increased visitation, new infrastructure, traffic, waste management, disturbance to wildlife and the potential for introduction of invasive species.

The property provides grazing land for semi-nomadic Maasai pastoralists. At the time of inscription an estimated 20,000 Maasai were living in the property, with some 275,000 head of livestock, which was considered within the capacity of the reserve. No permanent agriculture is officially allowed in the property. Further growth of the Maasai population and the number of cattle should remain within the capacity of the property, and increasing sedentarisation, local overgrazing and agricultural encroachment are threats to both the natural and cultural values of the property. There were no inhabitants in Ngorongoro and Empaakai Craters or the forest at the time of inscription in 1979.

The property encompasses not only the known archaeological remains but also areas of high paleo-anthropological potential where related finds might be made. However the integrity of specific paleo-anthropological attributes and the overall sensitive landscape are to an extent under threat and thus vulnerable due to the lack of enforcement of protection arrangements related to grazing regimes, and from proposed access and tourist related developments at Laetoli and Olduvai Gorge.

Authenticity

In general, the authenticity of the fossil localities is unquestionable, however given the nature of fossil sites, the context for the fossil deposits need to remain undisturbed (except by natural geological processes). As the nomination dossier does not contain sufficient detailed information on most of the sites to delineate their extended

areas or the areas of archaeological sensitivity, or sufficient guarantees in terms of management arrangements to ensure that the sites will remain undisturbed and not threatened by visitor access, construction or grazing cattle, their authenticity is vulnerable.

Protection and management requirements

The primary legislation protecting the property is the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Ordinance of 1959. The property is under the management of the Ngorongoro Conservation Area Authority (NCAA). The Division of Antiquities is responsible for the management and protection of the paleo-anthropological resources within the Ngorongoro Conservation Area. A memorandum of understanding should be established and maintained to formally establish the relations between the two entities.

Property management is guided by a General Management Plan. Currently, the primary management objectives are to conserve the natural resources of the property, protect the interests of the Maasai pastoralists, and to promote tourism. The management system and the Management Plan need to be widened to encompass an integrated cultural and natural approach, bringing together ecosystem needs with cultural objectives in order to achieve a sustainable approach to conserving the Outstanding Universal Value of the property, including the management of grasslands and the archaeological resource, and to promote environmental and cultural awareness. The Plan needs to extend the management of cultural attributes beyond social issues and the resolution of human-wildlife conflicts to the documentation, conservation and management of the cultural resources and the investigation of the potential of the wider landscape in archaeological terms.

It is particularly important that NCAA has the capacity and specialist skills to ensure the effectiveness of its multiple-use regime, including knowledge of management of pastoral use in partnership with the Maasai community and other relevant stakeholders. There is also a need for NCAA to ensure staff have skills in natural and cultural heritage to achieve well designed, integrated and effective conservation strategies, including effective planning of tourism, access and infrastructure.

A thorough understanding of the capacity of the property to accommodate human use and livestock grazing is required, based on the needs of the Maasai population and the assessment of the impact of the human populations on the ecosystems and archaeology of the property. An agreed joint strategy between the NCAA, Maasai community leaders as well as other stakeholders, is required to ensure human population levels, and levels of resource use are in balance with the protection of its natural and cultural attributes, including in relation to grazing and grassland management, and the avoidance of human-wildlife conflict. The active participation of resident communities in decision-making processes is essential, including the development of benefit-sharing mechanisms to encourage a sense of ownership of, and responsibility for, the conservation and sustainable use of the property's natural and cultural resources.

An overall tourism strategy for the property is a long term requirement, to both guide the public use of the property and ways of presenting the property, and to prioritize the quality of the tourism experience, rather than the quantity of visitors and tourism facilities. Vehicle access to the crater and other popular areas of the property requires clear limits to protect the quality of experience of the property and to ensure natural and cultural attributes are not unduly disturbed. Developments and infrastructure for tourism or management of the property that impinge on its natural and cultural attributes should not be permitted.

Considering the important relationship, in natural terms of the property to adjoining reserves, it is important to establish effective and continuing collaboration between the property, Serengeti National Park, and other areas of the Serengeti-Mara ecosystem to assure connectivity for wildlife migrations, and harmonise management objectives regarding tourism use, landscape management and sustainable development.

5. Considering the Order made by the President of Tanzania in 2007 to re-excavate the Laetoli footprints and leave them open for public viewing, the proposal for a museum building at the Laetoli site and the August 2009 proposal for a monument at the FLK-Zinjanthropus archaeological site, and the serious and specific threats arising from these proposals, urges the State Party, in relation to the newly adopted cultural criterion, to:
 - a) Abandon the proposals for the presentation of the Laetoli footprints and the proposed new museum building so that the footprints are not exposed to public view and no construction takes place near the site;
 - b) Abandon the proposals for a monument at the Zinjanthropus site at Olduvai Gorge, so that no construction takes place on or near the archaeological sites, in order to protect their scientific evidence and their potential for future research;
6. Recommends that the State Party explore alternative ways to improve the presentation of the Laetoli and Zinjanthropus sites and keep the World Heritage Committee informed on any proposals for construction at these two sites before any commitments are made, in accordance with paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;
7. Also recommends that, in order to set out a clear basis for the value of the cultural resource, and its conservation and management needs, the State Party provide to the World Heritage Centre:
 - a) Details on the specific area and location of the palaeo-anthropological resources, including specific boundaries for Laetoli, Lake Ndutu, Nasera, and the Ngorongoro Burial Mounds, and for their sensitive settings, to ensure their protection;
 - b) Details of sensitive archaeological landscapes throughout the property;
 - c) Details of the location of finds from all palaeo-anthropological sites;
 - d) Conservation plans for all palaeo-anthropological localities.

8. Further recommends the State Party to develop a revised management plan that gives a higher profile to the management of cultural resources, sets out how regulations will be enforced and includes a pastoralism strategy that respects both natural and cultural resources, involves the Maasai and defines a sustainable approach to managing the grasslands within the property.
9. Requests the State Party to take note of the recommendations made in relation to the State of Conservation of the property under item 7B.

Draft Decision: 34 COM 8B.14

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Documents WHC-10/34.COM/8B.Add and WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Considering the Order made by the President of Tanzania in 2007 to re-excavate the Laetoli footprints and leave them open for public viewing, the proposals for a museum building at the Laetoli site and a monument on the site of the discovery of the Zinjanthropus cranium, all of which constitute an ascertained threat to the property, in line with paragraph 179 of the Operational Guidelines;
3. Inscribes **Ngorongoro Conservation Area, United Republic of Tanzania**, on the List of World Heritage in Danger;
4. Requests the State Party to reverse the decision to open the Laetoli footprints, and to abandon plans for a new museum near the site and for a monument at the Zinjanthropus site at Olduvai Gorge, and to ensure that no construction takes place on or near the archaeological sites, in order to protect their setting, their scientific evidence and their potential for future research;
5. Requests the State Party to invite a joint World Heritage Centre/Advisory Body mission to the property to develop a desired State of Conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, based on the cultural attributes of Outstanding Universal Value and make proposals for a revision of the Management System and Plan to ensure adequate protection, conservation and management of the cultural attributes, as well as addressing the conservation issues regarding the natural attributes addressed in document 7B;
6. Recalls its request to the State Party, considered under item 7B of the present session, to provide to the World Heritage Centre, by 1st February 2011, a report on the State of Conservation of the property for consideration at the 35th Session of the Committee, and requests the State Party to include in this report information on progress in meeting the Desired State of Conservation for removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger, and progress in relation to the recommendations of the ICOMOS evaluation in relation to the cultural value of the property, including those matters noted in Decision **34COM 8.13**.

B. Properties deferred or referred back by previous sessions of the World Heritage Committee

Property	The Triple-arch Gate at Dan
Id. N°	1105 rev
State Party	Israel
Criteria proposed by State Party	(i)(ii)(iv)

See ICOMOS Evaluation Book Addendum, May 2010, page 47.

Technical Note

Following additional information submitted by the State Party of Israel, ICOMOS presented a revised evaluation as contained in document *WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add*. In this regard, the World Heritage Committee, in Decision **33 COM 8B.33**, requested “the World Heritage Centre to facilitate the provision of the information which would enable the formal inscription of the property by the Committee at its 34th session”. Accordingly, a letter was sent by the World Heritage Centre to the UN Department of Political Affairs to provide additional information. A meeting took place on 7 June 2010 at the UN Secretariat in New York between the Director of the Asia and the Pacific Division of the UN Department of Political Affairs, and staff members of the World Heritage Centre and the UNESCO New York Office to discuss this and other issues. As agreed during the meeting, further information has been sought from the UN Secretariat and a reply is expected before the 34th session of the World Heritage Committee. Pending this information, the Secretariat proposes the two options below:

OPTION I

Draft Decision: 34 COM 8B.38

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined documents WHC-10/34.COM/8B.Add and WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add, recognizes that the nomination entitled “Triple Arch Gate at Dan” (Israel) has Outstanding Universal Value;
2. Takes note of information provided concerning legal and technical data;
3. Postpones consideration of this nomination until additional information is received.

OPTION II

Draft Decision: 34 COM 8B.38

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined documents WHC-10/34.COM/8B.Add and WHC-10/34.COM/INF.8B1.Add,
2. Inscribes the **Triple-arch Gate at Dan, Israel**, on the World Heritage List on the basis of **criteron (ii)**;
3. Adopts the following Statement of Outstanding Universal Value:

Brief synthesis

The Triple-arch Gate at Dan has Outstanding Universal Value as it bears witness to great mastery of the technique of building a true arch with a significant span (2.5 metres)

during the Middle Bronze Age or slightly later. It was built using sun-dried mud bricks, with the arch bricks making partial but unquestionable use of the innovative voussoir system. In the current state of archaeological knowledge, the Triple-arch Gate at Dan constitutes a unique example of a gate with three complete arches, each with three successive arcs of brick, both for its early date and its state of conservation. Through its integration in massive fortifications, it bears witness to the importance of the move towards urbanisation in the Middle Bronze Age and to its technical advances.

Criterion (ii): *The Triple-arch Gate at Dan bears witness to the early diffusion of the architectonic principle of the true radial arch, in the Middle East during the Middle and Late Bronze Ages, particularly in its most complete version, including voussoir bricks, for wide spans.*

Integrity and authenticity

The authenticity of the Triple-arch Gate at Dan is proven. However, the integrity of its sun-dried mudbrick structure raises considerable conservation problems with regard to the presentation of its outstanding universal value in a long-term perspective. A substantial conservation effort has been planned and begun by the State Party to achieve this aim. It must be continued with great determination, in view of the still imperfect state of expertise in the conservation of such constructions.

Protection and management requirements

The legal protection in place is adequate. The site is managed by the authority of the Natural reserve of the Tel Dan Park, which is attached to the governmental organisation for nature and parks (INPA). Conservation management is conducted under the authority of the governmental antiquities organisation (IAA). The set of measures presented forms a satisfactory management plan for the expression of the property's Outstanding Universal Value.

4. Recommends that the State Party make sure that an exacting conservation management plan, in accordance with the best international standards for the preservation of sun-dried mudbrick architecture, is implemented;
5. Also recommends that the continuing education of the non-scientific INPA personnel working on the nominated property should be stepped up on the conservation and preservation matters with which they are specifically concerned.