

Distribution limited

WHC-94/CONF.001/6
27 May 1994
Original: English

**UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL,
SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION**

**CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION
OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE**

BUREAU OF THE WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Eighteenth session

UNESCO Headquarters, Paris, Room X (Fontenoy)

4 to 9 July 1994

Item 8 of the Provisional Agenda: International assistance provided under the World Heritage Fund for training: review, evaluation and strategy

1. **Introduction:** The World Heritage Committee at its seventeenth session requested the World Heritage Centre to make a proposal to the World Heritage Bureau on an evaluation of international assistance projects supported by the World Heritage Fund. In complying with the wish of the Committee, the World Heritage Centre started preparatory work for the evaluation of training activities for the five-year period (1988 to 1992) for which support was given by the World Heritage Fund. Preliminary findings are set out below in separate sections for the training of specialists and technicians for natural and cultural heritage site protection and management.

1.1 The World Heritage Convention and the Operational Guidelines are explicit on training. Article 5 outlines the obligations of the States Parties "to foster the establishment or development of national or regional centres for training in the protection, conservation and presentation of the cultural and natural heritage and to encourage scientific research in this field". Articles 22 and 23 clearly indicate the use of international assistance from the World Heritage Fund for "training of staff and specialists at all levels in the field of identification, protection, conservation, presentation and rehabilitation of cultural and natural heritage". Paragraphs 87 to 91 of the Operational Guidelines stipulate how this is put into practice and give more specific directions to States Parties and the World Heritage Centre for the support of training activities under the World Heritage Fund.

1.2 It should be underlined that in conformity with Article 5, training is first and foremost the obligation of the States

Parties. There is no information available in UNESCO upon which an analysis could be based as to what extent States Parties have complied with this requirement. However, site visits by many specialists clearly reveal major shortcomings in the institutional and infrastructural investment for preservation and conservation of World Heritage properties, including the necessary commitment to training. The World Heritage Convention and the Operational Guidelines clearly make provision for using the World Heritage Fund to train specialists for World Heritage site protection and management. Recognizing that States Parties do their utmost with their own resources, there remains a need for international assistance for training in many developing countries.

2. Review and assessment of training activities under the natural part of the Convention (1988-1992)

2.1 Natural Heritage part of the Convention

2.1.1 Executive summary

A brief overall exercise conducted by the World Heritage Centre last month showed that during the period from 1988 to 1992 support from the World Heritage Fund has been given for a total of US\$ 1,067,890 for training courses (group training). In addition, 37 fellowships permitting postgraduate studies, were given to students for a total of US\$ 205,969. The total investment from 1988 to 1992 was US\$ 1,273,859 US\$ with an average of US\$ 254,771.8 per year.

These figures give only a limited indication of the effectiveness of the training exercise and the impact it may have had on natural World Heritage site protection and management. This crucial question cannot be answered with existing statistics and data. Some data is based on self-evaluation by the course participants (for example, University of Peace/Costa Rica, Ecole nationale du Génie rurale des Eaux et des Forêts, (ENGREF)/France). Most World Heritage Fund support was directed to training centres, field training was carried out in principle in World Heritage sites. The training centres and schools have been requested to provide further data on the impact of their training for the protection and management of World Heritage sites. It is recommended that the evaluation component should be strengthened.

2.1.2 Training concepts and types of training

Training concepts, in particular the training of protected area managers, have undergone major changes over the last 20 years. Objectives, principles and practices of protected area management as well as definitions of national parks and similar reserves, have

changed considerably. This had an impact on the training of specialists in these fields. Management of people-park interactions have shifted from a conflictive to a more conciliatory approach. Protected area management is becoming integrated with the development of rural and marginal areas adjacent to parks and reserves. Furthermore, training in wildlife management, parks and recreation, as well as regional and natural resource planning, focused more on an interdisciplinary approach rather than on traditional natural sciences. Managers have emphasized the need to design training courses focusing on conceptual and methodological approaches of management, biodiversity status of protected areas, monitoring of their state of conservation, as well as introducing new techniques such as GIS.

Two types of training activities have been supported: **Group Training** and **Individual Training** through fellowships.

Group Training : Ninety group training courses for natural heritage took place between 1981 and 1991 and were supported with a total of US \$ 1,220,709 from of the World Heritage Fund. They range from in situ training at World Heritage sites (such as Simen National Park in Ethiopia, La Amistad World Heritage site in Costa Rica, etc.), to regional and sub-regional workshops on natural resource conservation and management (workshop on natural heritage protection in the Arab States in Qatar, subregional workshop on natural heritage for anglophone Africa in Tanzania etc.). A training course on Control and Management of Forest Fires was organized in Costa Rica. In organizing these training courses, cooperation with several training-institutes, i.e. CATIE (Centro Agronomico Tropical de Investigacion y Ensenanza/Costa Rica), ENGREF/France, Colorado State University (Fort Collins/USA), Smithsonian Institution (USA), has been established.

Thematically, three different categories can be distinguished:

- (1) courses on **wildlands, wildlife and game management;**
- (2) courses focusing on **biology, ecology and conservation;**
- (3) courses on **protected areas management.**

Protected area management courses include a large majority of the short courses within the last five years.

Individual training : Ninety-four individual training fellowships for a total of US \$804,305 have been provided under the World Heritage Fund from 1981 to 1991. In the beginning, this allocation was used for wildlife or park management, travel grants or environmental education etc. In the late 1980s and beginning 1990s, financial support was more and more provided to student support in specialized training institutions.

The following schools and institutions are the main partners for training under the natural part of the Convention providing long-term training courses of 12 to 24 months for selected students

- School for the Training of Wildlife Specialists, Garoua/Cameroon;
- College of African Wildlife Management, Mweka/Tanzania.

The above Schools focus mostly on category (1), wildlife and game management as well as on protected area management.

Training tables:

**Training under the World Heritage Convention (natural part)
Amount spent per year in US \$**

	Individual Training	Group Training	Total \$
1988	39,765	183,600	223,365
1989	36,000	171,800	207,800
1990	47,700	248,000	295,700
1991	51,570	216,995	268,565
1992	30,934	247,495	278,429

US\$1,273,859

**Training under the World Heritage Convention (natural part)
number of training courses and fellowships per year**

	Individual Training	Group Training
1988	11	10
1989	6	11
1990	6	15
1991	7	12
1992	7	13

3. Review and assessment of training activities under the cultural part of the Convention (1988-1992)

3.1.1 Training activities funded by the World Heritage Convention during that period amounted to US\$ 1,043,814 and covered:

- i) recurring training courses organized by ICCROM, ICOMOS, and the Brazilian Institute for Cultural Heritage in Bahia (Brazil) (IBPC);
- ii) *in situ* training courses organized by one of the above-mentioned partners and/or local authorities;
- iii) individual fellowships.

3.1.2 These activities have been funded within:

- i) an overall budget line for training authorized by the World Heritage Committee for approximately US\$ 250,000 per year which on occasions included:
- ii) budgetary allocations approved by the World Heritage Committee for specific training activities (**Annex I** provides the decisions adopted by the Committee since its Eleventh session in 1987).

3.1.3 During the period (1988-1992), two training centres have benefited from the World Heritage Fund allocations. They have received contributions to their training courses which amount, approximately, to:

ICCROM	US\$ 441,900
IBPC (Bahia)	US\$ 136,750
Total	US\$ <u>578,650</u>

i.e. respectively, 35.2 % and 14.7 % of the total funds spent for training. **Annexes II and III** provide the details, on an annual basis, of the training activities of the above-mentioned institutions.

3.1.4 During the period (1988-1992), 56 individual fellowships were granted. Out of these: 42 were awarded at the requests of States Parties to the Convention to the following group training:

Years	<u>Trondheim</u> <u>Wood, ICOMOS</u> <u>(Norway)</u>	<u>IBPC</u> <u>(Bahia)</u>	<u>ICCROM</u>	<u>Earth</u> <u>Construction</u>
1988	7	8	-	-
1989	-	-	4	3
1990	4	4	-	1
1991	-	-	-	-
1992	3	6	-	2
Total: 42	14	18	4	6

The costs for individual fellowships amounted to **US\$276,539** of the total costs for training for the period 1988 to 1993.

Annex IV provides detailed information on individual fellowships; **Annex V** presents the number of fellowships granted in each region.

3.1.5 From 1988 to 1992, 10 courses were organized *in situ*, at the request of States Parties to the Convention (**Annex VI**). The sum disbursed amounted to **US\$194,625** of the total expenditures for training of cultural experts for the period 1988 to 1992. It should be noted that not a single "in situ" course was organized in Africa.

3.1.6 In conclusion, it is clear that, during that period:

- i) no innovation has taken place in terms of the kinds/modalities of training offered;
- ii) most expenditures were allocated for group training in courses organized by IBPC, ICCROM and ICOMOS/Norway;
- iii) the greatest number of trainees were from Latin America (see Annex V);
- iv) 70.8 % of the funds were obligated for group training;
- v) all regional needs are far from being covered; and

3.2 Content of the courses

3.2.1 The International Course on Wood Conservation Technology is organized under the auspices of UNESCO by ICCROM,

ICOM, and the Central Office of Historic Monuments (Norway) and the Norwegian Institute of Technology. The course combines lectures and laboratory and field exercises. Its scope is to widen the perspectives of the participants and enable them to update their techniques. It is also an interdisciplinary course, which encourages an active participation through the presentation by each participant of a case study drawn up from his/her work experience. Each course is evaluated by its participants and the input is used to update the curricula and improve teaching techniques.

- 3.2.2 The Inter-regional Course on the Conservation of Monuments and the Rehabilitation of Historical Cities has been created by the UNDP/UNESCO Regional Project for the Cultural, Urban and Environmental Projects. It is a postgraduate multidisciplinary course which covers three training areas: architectural restoration, restoration technology and town planning. It aims at providing overall training for professionals in the field of conservation (architects, engineers and town planners) concerned with improving living conditions for those who visit, work and/or live in historic centres. Each course is usually attended by twenty to twenty-five Brazilian students and ten students from other countries in the region or lusophone countries with historic urban centres on their territories. Students select and work on projects appropriate for cities in their own countries and thus are able to return home with ready-made action plans.
- 3.2.3 The International Course on Preservation and Conservation of Stone in Venice is organized by UNESCO and ICCROM with the collaboration of the Superintendancy of Galleries in Venice, for a duration of three weeks. It covers a variety of research fields closely related to stone conservation. Different processes and forms of deterioration of stone are studied and, in spite of its theoretical purpose, participants have a chance to experiment with practical work such as cleaning techniques and filling and glueing techniques. The course also enables participants to update their technical knowledge and understand the importance of interdisciplinary cooperation between restorers and scientists, work-sites and laboratories. Different approaches in conservation work between specialists can be compared, and the importance of the case-by-case approach underlined.
- 3.2.4 Although there has been no overall evaluation of the training activities financed by the World Heritage Fund,

major courses funded by the World Heritage Fund have an inbuilt evaluation system which allows organizers to receive a feedback at the end of each course from the trainees and adapt the curricula. However, a global evaluation exercise of the course on Conservation and the Restoration of Historic Areas in Brazil is scheduled in 1994.

3.3 Emerging needs

- 3.3.1** Greater diversity in courses is required to respond sub-regional needs, for example in the new states with economies in transition. A meeting is also being planned in Tunis next November by ICCROM, which would bring together cultural heritage decision-makers and managers of World Heritage sites in the North African sub-region (possibly extended to the whole Arab region); and as well as the ICCROM meeting in Helsinki (2-8 June 1995) for Nordic and Baltic countries and new States emerging from the former Soviet Union, on ethical problems and philosophy of conservation.
- 3.3.2** The World Heritage Centre now needs to define new objectives for its training activities. Training packages need to be renewed and strengthened in order to meet the training needs of specialized staff at all levels in the fields of "identification, protection, conservation, presentation and rehabilitation of cultural heritage". While there is no doubt that the Bahia Centre, as well as ICCROM, have achieved a great deal in the field of conservation by giving special attention to stone, wood, and the rehabilitation of historic cities, it would seem that there is a need to focus on the conservation of other materials such as "adobe".
- 3.3.3** In particular, there is no training package which addresses the specific conservation cum management issues posed by the World Heritage sites. In recent years, the Committee has emphasized the responsibilities of site managers who are increasingly faced not only with conservation problems but also with the site management issues such as: presentation, flow of a great number of visitors. The Committee has also emphasized a new training need for monitoring. It is proposed to develop suitable training packages to this end with ICCROM.

3.4 Proposed action by the World Heritage Bureau

A programme for an in-depth evaluation of World Heritage training activities by the Centre will include the following steps:

- in-house and in-depth review of training activities by the World Heritage Centre;
- detailed analysis of data gathered by the World Heritage Centre;
- review of courses run by a selected number of institutions (Mweka, Garoua, CATIE) from the point of view of content and its relevance to the curriculum to World Heritage and management objectives;
- evaluation of medium- to long-term benefits for participants in relation to World Heritage site management;
- submission of evaluation findings and recommendations to the World Heritage Committee with proposals for future training and the preparation and implementation of a site focused programme;

To move forward with a proactive training programme for both the cultural and natural heritage, two workshops are proposed. In contrast to the Monitoring Workshop, the requirements for training are very different for the cultural and natural aspects of the Convention.

On the cultural side we have specialized requirements for the preservation of artifacts and buildings. This requires specialists in wood, stone and mortar conservation. Training is highly specialized and will be carried out in cooperation with ICCROM and ICOMOS. A workshop to bring together the key individuals will be carried out in 1994-1995 at an estimated cost of US\$25,000 to US\$30,000.

On the natural side the training schools which exist in East and West Africa play a critical role. Also, specialized courses in ecology and protected area management in Costa Rica, India and the United States play specific regional roles. A review of the curricula of these institutions will be carried out in cooperation with the training facilities of one of the States Parties to the Convention. This review is proposed for early in 1995.

The Bureau is requested to approve a maximum of US\$30,000 for each of these workshops. The funds are required primarily for the travel, board and lodging of participants from the developing countries.

ANNEX I

**BUDGETARY ALLOCATIONS APPROVED BY THE WORLD HERITAGE
COMMITTEE FOR SPECIFIC TRAINING ACTIVITIES**

US\$325,000

16th session (1992)

- Architectural Conservation and Scientific Principles (ICCROM)	30,000
- International course on Technology of Stone Conservation	44,000
Sub-total	<u>74,000</u>

15th session (1991)

- Cours international sur la conservation et la restauration des monuments et sites historiques (Université de Bahia, Brésil) IBPC	60,000
---	--------

14th session (1990)

- International course on Stone Conservation Technology (ICCROM/UNESCO)	40,000
- Regional training course for the Conservation of Mural Paintings (ICCROM)	40,000
Sub-total	<u>80,000</u>

13th session (1989)

12th session (1988)

- Training for the Cultural Triangle (Sri Lanka)	33,500
- ICCROM Stone Conservation Course	37,500
Sub-total	<u>71,000</u>

11th session (1987)

- Training in the Conservation and the Restoration of Historic Areas (Bahia, Brazil)	40,000
--	--------

Total

US\$ 325,000

ANNEX II

FUNDS DISBURSED TO ICCROM

From 1988 to 1992

US\$ 441,900

		\$
1988	Training Stone Course	22,000
	Fellowships Architectural Cons.	20,000
	Contrib. to ICCROM Reg. course	20,000
	Fellowships	20,000
	Contrib. to Arch. Cons. course	20,000
		<hr/>
	Sub-total 1988	102,000
1989	Financial contrib. fellowships	20,000
	Financial contrib. fellowships	20,000
	Financial contrib. fellowships	20,000
	Mosaics	19,000
	Admin. by Bureau UNESCO (Venice)	37,000
		<hr/>
	Sub-total 1989	116,000
1990	Financial contri. fellowships	14,000
	(Amount returned to WHF)	(7,000)
		7,000
	Fellowships	22,000
	(Amount returned to WHF)	(6,000)
		16,000
	Financial contrib. fellowships	20,000
	Financial contrib. fellowships	17,600
	Financial contrib. C. Némlioglu	1,000
	Organize Wood Cons. course	24,800
		<hr/>
	Sub-total 1990	86,400
1991	Fin. contrib. fellow. Arch. course	20,000
	Amount transferred to 92 fellow.	(7,500)
		12,500
	Mural painting course (Lucknow)	40,000
	Conserv. Stone (admin. UNESCO-Venice)	36,000
		<hr/>
	Sub-total 1991	88,500
1992	Arch. Cons. course	20,000
	Finan. contrib. Scient. Principles	5,500
	Residue fellow. 1991	7,500
	Finan. contrib. Mural painting	16,000
		<hr/>
	Sub-total 1992	49,000
		<hr/>
TOTAL :		US\$ 441,900

ANNEX III

**FUNDS DISBURSED TO IBPC
From 1988 TO 1992**

**IBPC : Regional courses on the rehabilitation of Historic
centres within urban development**

			\$
1988	Intl. Fellowships	(8)	40,000
	Intl. Professors		14,000
		Sub-total	<hr/> 54,000
1990	Intl. Fellowships	(8)	62,000
	Intl. Professors		19,500
		Sub-total	<hr/> 81,500
	TOTAL		US\$136,500

ANNEX IV

**56 INDIVIDUAL FELLOWSHIPS
FROM 1988-1992**

US\$270,539 : TOTAL AMOUNT

\$

1988	BOLIVIA	1	Bahia	4,444
1988	COLOMBIA	1	Bahia	4,444
1988	COSTA RICA	1	Bahia	4,445
1988	CUBA	1	Bahia	4,445
1988	EGYPT	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	ECUADOR	1	general conservation	7,000
1988	ECUADOR	2	Bahia	8,888
1988	HAITI	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	NICARAGUA	1	Bahia	4,445
1988	PHILIPPINES	1	wood conserv. Trondhei	2,857
1988	PORTUGAL	1	Bahia	4,445
1988	SRI LANKA	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	THAILAND	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	TUNISIA	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	TURKEY	1	wood conserv. Trondheim	2,857
1988	YEMEN	3	fellowships (specialists Shibam)	19,550
	SUB-TOTAL	<hr/>	19	<hr/> 466,674

1989	ALBANIA	1	training course architecture	15,000
1989	BULGARIA	1	architect. conservation	5,000
1989	COLOMBIA	1	conservation earth construc.	1,634
1989	EGYPT	1	Louvain	5,273
1989	ECUADOR	1	conservation earth construc.	2,803
1989	PERU	1	conservation earth construc.	2,909
1989	PEROU	1	architect. conservation	15,000
1989	SRI LANKA	1	conservation wall paintings	9,171

1989	TANZANA	1 conservation wall paintings	8,531
1989	TURKEY	1 architect. conservation	5,000
1989	TURQUIE	1 conservation mural paintings	1,000
1989	YUGOSLAVIA	1 architect. conservation	5,000
SUB-TOTAL		12	76,321
			\$
1990	ARGENTINA	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	BOLIVIA	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	CHILI	1 conservation earth construc.	4,000
1990	COLOMBIA	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	CUBA	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	ECUADOR	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	INTERNATIONAL	4 wood conservation Trondheim (China, Philippines, Sri Lanka and Argentina)	17,697
1990	NICARAGUA	1 Bahia	7,762
1990	PERU	1 Bahia	7,763
1990	PORTUGAL	1 Bahia	7,763
SUB-TOTAL		13	83,801
1991		---	---
1992	MALI	2 training course CRATER	6,000
1992	MOZAMBIQUE	Participation Urban Congress (SPA)	2,500
1992	REGIONAL	AmLatCa training course Bahia (6 fellowships)	51,250
1992	INTERNATIONAL	3 wood conservation Trondheim (Chile, Sudan, Zambia)	10,000
SUB-TOTAL		12	US\$ 69,750

ANNEX VGEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES PER YEAR

	AFRICA	ARAB STATES	ASIA	EUROPE	L. AMERICA & CARIBBEAN	TOTAL
1988	-	4	3	2	10	19
1989	1	1	1	5	4	12
1990	-	-	3	-	10	13
1991	-	-	-	-	-	-
1992	6	-	-	-	6	12
TOTAL	7	5	7	7	30	56

**10 COURSES IN SITU FROM 1988 TO 1992
US\$ 194625 - TOTAL COST**

			\$
1988	China	Management Course Mt Taishan	17,000
1988	Haïti	Training course personnel Historic Parks	24,800
1988	Mexico	Site Managers course	42,000
1988	Oman	Training course Ancient Cities	5,500
1989	Sri Lanka	Cultural Triangle course	33,500
1990	Algeria	Para-seismic course	7,500
1990	China	Mural Painting course Taishan	20,000
1992	Argentina	Training workshop	15,000
1992	Cambodia	Angkor training course	10,000
1992	Peru	Machu Picchu Workshop	19,325
TOTAL			194,625